

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE  
COMMITTEE ON SANITATION & SOLID WASTE  
MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON  
SMALL BUSINESS

----- X

May 14, 2021

Start: 10:04 a.m.

Recess: 3:12 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 2)

B E F O R E: Daniel Dromm,  
Chairperson for Finance  
  
Robert Cornegy,  
Chairperson for Committee on  
Housing & Buildings  
  
Antonio Reynoso,  
Chairperson for Committee on  
Sanitation & Solid Waste  
Management  
  
Mark Gjonaj,  
Chairperson for Committee on Small  
Business

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne E. Adams  
Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Diana Ayala

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS

COUNCIL MEMBERS (CONT.):

- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
- Laurie A. Cumbo
- Darma V. Diaz
- Vanessa L. Gibson
- Barry S. Grodenchik
- Karen Koslowitz
- Farah N. Louis
- Steven Matteo
- Francisco P. Moya
- Keith Powers
- Helen K. Rosenthal
- James G. Van Bramer
- Margaret Chin
- Mark Gjonaj
- Fernando Cabrera
- Carlina Rivera
- Brad S. Lander
- Antonio Reynoso
- Justin L. Brannan
- Menchaca Riley
- Eric Dinowitz
- James F. Gennaro
- Peter Koo

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
2 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 3

2 A P P E A R A N C E S

3 Louise Carroll  
4 Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
Housing Preservation and Development

5 Baaba Halm  
6 Executive Deputy Commissioner

7 Rich Johns  
Associate Commissioner for Financial Management

8 Anne-Marie Hendrickson  
9 Deputy Commissioner of Housing Preservation and  
Development

10 Elizabeth Oakley  
11 Deputy Commissioner for Development at NYC  
Department of Housing, Preservation and  
Development

12 Ahmed Tigani  
13 Deputy Commissioner, Office of Neighborhood  
Strategies

14 Ann Marie Santiago  
15 Deputy Commissioner for Enforcement and  
Neighborhood Services

16 Kim Darga  
17 Associate Commissioner at NYC Department of  
Housing, Preservation and Development

18 Edward Grayson  
19 Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
Sanitation

20 Salvatore Ceraulo  
21 First Deputy Commissioner

22 Gregory Anderson  
23 Deputy Commissioner for Policy and External  
Affairs

24 Jonnel Doris  
25 Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
Small Business Services

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 4

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

3 Jackie Mallon  
First Deputy Commissioner SBS

4 Dynishal Gross  
5 Deputy Commissioner for the Division of Economic  
and Financial Opportunity

6 Lucinda Glover  
7 Deputy Commissioner, Workforce Development at NYC  
Department of Small Business Services

8 Blaise Backer  
9 Deputy Commissioner, Neighborhood Development  
10 Division at NYC Department of Small Business  
Services

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 5

2 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Computer recording is  
3 started.

4 SERGEANT LEONARDO: Cloud is ready.

5 SERGEANT PEREZ: Backup is rolling.

6 SERGEANT LEONARDO: Sergeant Lugo?

7 SERGEANT LUGO: Good morning everyone. Welcome  
8 to today's remote New York City Council hearing of  
9 the Committee's on Finance, jointly with Housing and  
10 Buildings, Sanitation and Solid Waste Management and  
11 Small Business.

12 At this time would all panelists please turn on  
13 your video. TO minimize disruption, please place  
14 electronic devices to vibrate or silent. If you wish  
15 to submit testimony you may do so at  
16 [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). Again, that's  
17 [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). Thank you for your  
18 cooperation. Chairs, we are ready to begin.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Dromm, you are muted.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Sergeant  
21 Lugo. Good morning and welcome to the City Council's  
22 fifth day of hearings on the Mayor's Executive Budget  
23 for Fiscal 2022. My name is Daniel Dromm and I Chair  
24 the Finance Committee. We are joined by the  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 6

2 Committee on Housing and Buildings and soon we will  
3 be joined by Council Member Robert Cornegy.

4 At this time, I would like to announce that we  
5 are joined by Council Members Adams, Darma Diaz,  
6 Grodenchik, Koslowitz, Ampry-Samuel, Chin, Cabrera,  
7 Gjonaj, Powers and Rivera and I am sure others will  
8 be joining us shortly.

9 The Executive Budget for the Department of  
10 Housing and Preservation and Development totals \$1.1  
11 billion, up less than five percent or \$53 million  
12 from its Preliminary Budget three months ago. Of  
13 which, \$50 million comes from new federal funding.  
14 Consistent with such flat budget growth, the  
15 Executive Budget adds extremely modest new needs.  
16 These include \$1.1 million in Fiscal 2021 and '22 to  
17 cover an emergency shelter cost. \$874,000 in Fiscal  
18 '22 for maintenance on Housing Connect 2.0 portal.  
19 \$365,000 in Fiscal '21 and \$444,000 in Fiscal '22 to  
20 supplement federally funded CBO Housing Contracts and  
21 \$700,000 in Fiscal '22 for emergency repair work on  
22 buildings located in the 100 year flood planning.

23 In contrast, HPD's Fiscal '22 Executive Capital  
24 Commitment Plan for '21 to '25 increases HPD's five  
25 year capital commitments by \$1.6 billion or 27

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 7

percent when compared with its Preliminary Fiscal '21  
to '25 capital commitment plan.

The majority of that growth is largely in  
programs associated with HPD's commitment to  
expanding low income housing. These include the ELLA  
or Extremely Low and Low Income Affordability  
Program, which grants financing for new construction  
housing projects that provide low income rents up to  
80 percent of area median income.

Low and mixed income rental subsidies, low  
interest loans to multifamily building owners to  
facilitate rehabilitation of rental housing for low  
to moderate income households and funding for  
supportive housing. The Council is strongly  
supportive of HPD's efforts to preserve and expand  
affordable housing including shifting subsidies to  
make more housing additionally affordable.

We appreciate how far the administration has come  
on this. Although we hope we can partner with them  
to accomplish even more. Thank you to Luke Zangerle  
and to Chima Obichere from the Finance Division for  
the preparations for today's hearings. I will now  
turn it over to our Counsel; I believe it is Noah  
Brick today. Before we hear testimony from

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
2 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 8

3 Commissioner Carroll, who is joined by several  
4 colleagues. So, Counsel, would you swear in the  
panel?

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Dromm. My  
6 name is Noah Brick and I am Counsel to the New York  
7 City Council Committee on Finance. Before we begin,  
8 I want to remind everyone that you will be on mute  
9 until you are recognized to speak. At which time,  
10 you will be unmuted by the Zoom host. If you mute  
11 yourself after you have been unmuted, you will need  
12 to be unmuted again by the host. Please be aware  
13 that there could be a delay in muting and unmuting,  
14 so please be patient.

15 During this portion of today's hearing, we will  
16 hear testimony from the Department of Housing,  
17 Preservation and Development. During the hearing, if  
18 Council Members would like to ask questions, please  
19 use the Zoom raise hand function and you will be  
20 called on to speak. We will be limiting Council  
21 Member questions to five minutes including responses.

22 I will now administer the affirmation to the  
23 Administration witnesses one time and the we will ask  
24 each witness to so affirm.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
2 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 9

3 Do you affirm that your testimony will be  
4 truthful to the best of your knowledge, information  
and belief? Commissioner Carroll?

5 LOUISE CARROLL: I affirm.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Halm?

7 BAABA HALM: I affirm.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Hendrickson?

9 ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: I affirm.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Oakley?

11 ELIZABETH OAKLEY: I affirm.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Johns?

13 RICH JOHNS: I affirm.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. McLaughlin?

15 BRENDON MCLAUGHLIN: I affirm. Mr. McLaughlin.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Oh, I am sorry, Mr.  
17 McLaughlin. Mr. Tigani? Do we know if Mr. Tigani is  
18 joining us today?

19 LOUISE CARROLL: I don't think Mr. Tigani is  
20 joining us today.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, thank you Commissioner.  
22 Ms. Santiago?

23 ANN MARIE SANTIAGO: I affirm.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Darga? Ms. Reynolds?

25 BAABA HALM: I affirm.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 10

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you all. Commissioner  
3 Carroll, you may begin when ready.

4 LOUISE CARROLL: I am sorry Mr. Brick; I am being  
5 told that Mr. Tigani is supposed to join us. He may  
6 be having trouble logging in.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, uhm, let me put our IT  
8 team in touch with your city ledger affairs person  
9 and we can hope to resolve that.

10 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you.

11 KIM DARGA: And this is Ms. Darga. I was muted.  
12 I affirm.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

14 LOUISE CARROLL: May I proceed?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may, thank you.

16 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you. Good morning, Chair  
17 Cornegy, Chair Dromm and members of the New York City  
18 Council Committees on Housing and Buildings and on  
19 Finance. I am Louise Carroll, Commissioner of the  
20 New York City Department of Housing Preservation and  
21 Development and today, I am joined by Executive  
22 Deputy Commissioner Baaba Halm, Associate  
23 Commissioner for Financial Management Rich Johns and  
24 members of HPD's senior leadership team.

25

1 As you know, on May 3rd, the remainder of our  
2 agency workforce began their return to the office.  
3 While many of our frontline staff, like our  
4 enforcement team, were out in the field and in our  
5 offices every day to make sure that our essential  
6 services never let up through the pandemic,  
7 teleworking HPD staff continued to carry out our  
8 mission to provide safe, quality, affordable housing  
9 while sheltering at home.  
10

11 Now that rigorous safety and social distancing  
12 measures are in place in our offices, we are thrilled  
13 to begin safely working together again. And, thanks  
14 to a strong Executive Budget, our agency received  
15 critical funding to help us achieve our goals and to  
16 work towards an equitable recovery for all New  
17 Yorkers. Thank you for the opportunity to testify  
18 today on HPD's Fiscal Year 2022 Executive Budget.

19 I will first provide a brief overview of our  
20 budget before describing some of the agency's key  
21 priorities in the coming year. I am then happy to  
22 answer any questions you may have. HPD's budget  
23 relies on significant investment from the City and  
24 federal governments. HPD's Fiscal Year 2022  
25 Executive Budget is just under \$1.1 billion.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 12

1  
2 However, this includes about \$275 million in pass-  
3 through funding for NYCHA. Setting aside this pass-  
4 through funding, HPD's budget for programs and  
5 operations is about \$811 million for FY2022.

6 Of this \$811 million total, \$132 million comes  
7 from city funds and about \$673 million comes from  
8 federal funds. That means 83 percent of HPD's  
9 expense budget is federally funded. A big city like  
10 New York has dynamic and diverse housing needs on a  
11 scale that requires a deeply invested federal  
12 partner.

13 We are excited about The American Rescue Plan,  
14 signed by President Biden in March, as it will help  
15 with the shortage of resources for certain subsets of  
16 our affordable housing work, homeownership, senior  
17 housing, Section 8, tax incentives and supportive  
18 housing, to name a few. However, as you know from  
19 previous testimony, this huge proportion of federal  
20 versus city funding in the agency's budget means many  
21 of our programs are restricted by federal  
22 requirements. City funding, especially the City's  
23 Tax Levy, is critical for flexibility and for  
24 strengthening areas not otherwise eligible for  
25 federal grant funds.

Back in 2014, at the start of this administration, HPD inherited an impressive public-private partnership capable of building and protecting 15,000 affordable homes per year. Over the next few years, with new funding and new tools, the city increased that capacity, the production capacity, to 20,000 affordable homes per year.

Finally, since 2018, HPD has met and exceeded our most ambitious goal of creating 25,000 affordable homes per year. A rate the city has never achieved before in order to fulfil the Mayor's YOUR Home NYC promise of 300,000 affordable homes by 2026. We are thrilled that the FY22 Executive Budget has added \$1.9 billion to fully fund the remainder of our housing plan, ensuring that we can continue to generate much needed affordable housing over the next five years.

We are also acutely aware of how critical our investments are for the most vulnerable New Yorkers in this time of recovery. New Yorkers at the lowest income levels have been a priority since the outset of the Mayor's housing plan, and last year, we changed our term sheets to ensure that at least 50 percent of all of our newly financed units would be

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 14

available for families of three earning less than  
\$52,000.

At the start of the pandemic, the city urgently  
sought out new solutions to support New Yorkers  
experiencing homelessness, appealing to our  
affordable housing partners to dedicate a portion of  
new apartments to homeless families in addition to  
meeting the existing set asides. As a result, in  
addition to the more than 2,000 affordable apartments  
we set aside for homeless New Yorkers last year, we  
have identified another 1,900 apartments currently in  
the lease up process that can be used to place a  
homeless family. We are grateful that this Executive  
Budget allows us to hire more staff and expand the  
capacity of our homeless placements division to meet  
this increased volume and provides us with critical  
funds to maintain our revamped Housing Connect  
system, which makes it easier for New Yorkers to find  
and apply for affordable housing.

NYC 15/15 Rental Assistance program is also  
aligned in this budget to ensure that Mayor de  
Blasio's commitment to creating 15,000 units of  
supportive housing by 2030 stays on track. We know  
that supportive housing is one of the best tools for

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 15

1  
2 meaningfully addressing the needs of people in  
3 shelter who suffer from mental illness, substance use  
4 disorder, HIV/AIDs and many other illnesses. So we  
5 look forward to continuing our work with our sister  
6 agency, the Human Resources Administration to create  
7 more affordable housing with supportive services to  
8 make sure that New Yorkers have the support they  
9 need.

10 HPD is also working closely with HRA on the  
11 rollout of plans for emergency rent relief. Both the  
12 City and State of New York received direct  
13 allocations through the Emergency Rental Assistance  
14 Program created by Congress and much thanks goes to  
15 the Council for your advocacy on this front.

16 In New York State, the Office of Temporary and  
17 Disability Assistance OTDA, will oversee the  
18 administration and in the city, the DSS/HRA will  
19 oversee implementation in coordination with OTDA.  
20 HPD is consulting with our partners across agencies  
21 to support these efforts to make sure struggling New  
22 Yorkers receive the \$2.4 billion available Statewide  
23 for emergency rental relief.

24 Both renters and homeowners are experiencing the  
25 financial burden caused by the COVID-19 pandemic.

1 Most renters should be protected by the eviction  
2 moratorium now in place through August. And we are  
3 wasting no time reaching out to struggling  
4 homeowners, especially in communities of color which  
5 have been disproportionately affected by the  
6 pandemic. This month, we completed repairs on the  
7 first HomeFix project, helping a low-income senior  
8 homeowner in Canarsie complete critical improvements  
9 to her roof, the stoop and windows with nearly  
10 \$50,000 in no-interest, forgivable loan.  
11

12 The HomeFix program is expected to support more  
13 than 100 homeowners every year and several more  
14 projects have already closed this month, providing  
15 small homeowners with not only financial assistance  
16 but also counseling, technical assistance and other  
17 forms of individualized assistance to help them  
18 achieve long-term stability. This effort goes hand in  
19 hand with our recently expanded Homeowner Help Desk,  
20 which kicks off tomorrow in the Bed-Stuy neighborhood  
21 of Council Member Cornegy's district.

22 Volunteers, community groups, city workers and  
23 leaders will fan out across the neighborhood to post  
24 flyers and speak with residents to raise awareness of  
25 deed theft, scams and the help available for

1 struggling homeowners. Homeowners across the city  
2 can contact the Help Desk for one-on-one housing  
3 counseling, financial assistance, legal services and  
4 more. But the Help Desk will be focusing its  
5 outreach on priority neighborhoods identified in the  
6 Mayor's Taskforce on Racial Inclusion and Equity  
7 according to equity burdens and the impact of COVID-  
8 19 over the past year.

9  
10 The pandemic has exacerbated long-standing  
11 housing, economic and racial disparities in New York  
12 City and across the country. This unprecedented  
13 crisis emphasizes the need to explore new tools to  
14 address these disparities. One way we're doing that  
15 is by using what we learned in developing our Where  
16 We Live New York City fair housing plan to make  
17 equitable investments that address the neighborhood-  
18 based legacy of discrimination, segregation and  
19 concentrated poverty.

20 In March, we released our Shared Equity Request  
21 For Information to help our agency explore shared  
22 equity models that enable low- to moderate-income  
23 households and households of color build wealth  
24 through collective ownership of neighborhoods assets,  
25 such as, homes, businesses, land and others. While

1 keeping these assets affordable for their communities  
2 in the long-term. With the information we gather  
3 from the RFI, we expect to release a subsequent  
4 Request for Proposals or Expressions of Interest  
5 soon.  
6

7 HPD strives to advance and incorporate racial  
8 inclusion and equity in every aspect of our work  
9 because we know that it is central to our mission to  
10 promote the quality and affordability of the city's  
11 housing and the strength and diversity of its many  
12 neighborhoods. Last month, we released our second  
13 RFP issued exclusively for M/WBE developers as part  
14 of this administration's commitment to creating  
15 opportunities and addressing disparities for minority  
16 and women-owned developers.

17 This RFP will create nearly 180 affordable homes  
18 on two city- owned sites, including one dedicated to  
19 seniors in Prospect Heights, Brooklyn. Making sure  
20 M/WBE firms can participate and benefit from the  
21 city's work to build affordable, inclusive and  
22 integrated neighborhoods is critical to ensuring an  
23 equitable recovery for all New Yorkers.

24 In conclusion, the important work that I have  
25 outlined reflects the urgency of the needs on the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 19

ground and a vision for the kind of city we want to  
be. I want to thank the Council for the leadership  
and collaboration that has allowed us to achieve the  
far-reaching policies and progress that we've secured  
to date. More can and must be done and I look  
forward to continuing to work together.

Thank you again for the opportunity to discuss  
HPD's budget and our priorities in the coming year.  
This concludes my testimony and I am happy to answer  
any questions you may have. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much  
Commissioner. Let me start off by asking you a few  
questions about the federal stimulus funding. I  
wanted to just mention also that we have been joined  
by Majority Leader Cumbo, Council Members Louis,  
Lander, Gibson and Ayala.

The American Rescue Plan provided approximately  
\$5 billion to HUD for community development and  
housing programs. In the Fiscal '22 Executive  
Budget, HPD expects to recognize almost 50 million  
more in federal funding in Fiscal '22 than it did in  
'21.

So, is that an accurate figure of how much  
federal stimulus money HPD expects to receive and can

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 20

you describe for us which programs is being received  
or how much money is going to each program and how is  
it being utilized?

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
that question. HPD will receive \$269 million in home  
funding through the American Rescue Plan. We are  
waiting for guidance from HUD as to how we can spend  
this money. What rules are attached to the funding  
and we expect to get that guidance soon. Typically,  
home funds, as you know is used to provide senior  
housing, rental assistance, social services but we  
expect that the home rules would be expanded, so that  
we may be able to use those funds more in furtherance  
of our support of homeless families but we are  
waiting for HUD to give us appropriate guidance.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Would you know at this point  
if there is a certain date by which funding would  
have to be spent?

LOUISE CARROLL: Uhm, I will turn to our  
Assistant Commissioner for Budget in Fiscal Rich  
Johns to respond to that question.

RICH JOHNS: Hi, yes, thank you. So, the  
stimulus funding will be through the American Rescue  
Plan will be available through '23.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 21

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: '23 okay, thank you.

RICH JOHNS: And just to be clear, 2030.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 2030 okay, I am sorry. Thank  
you. Commissioner, you had mentioned that \$262  
million figure I think in terms of federal money  
coming in. So, is that inclusive of the money from  
the Cares Act and the new money that's coming in or  
that's separate? Can you just explain that to me  
because our figure was different.

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
that question. It give me an opportunity to clarify.  
So, it's \$269 million in home funding that we  
received under the American Rescue Plan. Under the  
Cares Act, we received \$15.8 million in funds for our  
Section 8 rental assistance program. And so, these  
funds will be used to help automize for the automize  
Section 8 program. As we've seen through the  
pandemic, the days of crowds of folks coming to the  
first floor of Section 8 in our building of 100 Gold  
Street is not viable for the future. And so, we  
would like to have a contact less fully optimize  
system for Section 8. So, we are going to use some  
of the money for that. We are going to use some of  
that \$15.8 million for administrative costs as well.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 22

And so, this \$15.8 plus the \$269 million is what  
we received so far from the combined rescue funds  
from the federal government.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And Commissioner, I think I  
read somewhere because you mentioned also the Section  
8 vouchers. Is there going to be a new opening for  
applications for Section 8 coming up next week?

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
that question. We are always receiving applications  
for Section 8. While we expect an influx in Section  
8 vouchers, we don't have them yet but HPD is always  
receiving applications for Section 8 and we are  
always issuing applications for Section 8.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay because I received a  
notice from I believe it was the Stonewall Senior  
Foundation saying that there would be a new  
application period starting on the 17<sup>th</sup>.

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
that question. I think I would like to call on Ahmed  
Tigani who has joined us to further clarify the issue  
concerning this application.

AHMED TIGANI: Hi, thank you for the question  
Council Member. I am not particularly familiar with  
notices that have gone out or notices that would go

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 23

1  
2 out to that organization. As the Commissioner said,  
3 we are constantly working with our partners in  
4 development and we are working both in asset property  
5 management here at HPD and the development team to  
6 make sure that project based projects, other projects  
7 that receive housing vouchers are constantly being  
8 reviewed and we are trying to meet that need.

9 I am happy to follow up with your office  
10 specifically to get more details and get a specific  
11 answer to you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay good and I will forward  
13 the email that I got to you as well.

14 AHMED TIGANI: Thank you sir.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, let's talk a little bit  
16 - I'm sorry Commissioner.

17 LOUISE CARROLL: Council Member, I believe that  
18 this notice went out from ACR, which is why maybe  
19 Ahmed and I are not familiar with it. But we will  
20 verify that for you.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, alright, thank you.  
22 The Executive Budget adds \$700,000 in city funds in  
23 Fiscal 2022 and the outyears for emergency repair  
24 work on properties that in their 100<sup>th</sup> year flood  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 24

plain and are not eligible for CDBG funded repair  
work. So, how will these funds be used?

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
that question. So, a lot of the – while CDBG does  
cover ERP and AEP work, they require that the funding  
be used on properties that have insurance. A lot of  
the properties in the flood plain are single and two  
family structures and they often do not have  
insurance. So, it's really necessary for us to find  
a different source in order to help these families  
and that's why we are using tax levy here instead of  
CDBG.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, how will HPD determine  
which properties to allocate the funding toward?

LOUISE CARROLL: So, we have about – there are  
estimates of 71,500 residential buildings in the 100  
year flood plain, representing about 183,000 units.  
And so, we know, we have identified these properties  
and we are not including NYCHA by the way, in those  
numbers.

So, according to our data, there are about 385  
buildings in the flood plain that have been financed  
by HPD through 2014, from 2014 to December 2020. And  
in order to further clarify how we pick these

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 25

properties, we will turn to Deputy Commissioner Anne-  
Marie Hendrickson to further explain how they come  
through her – sorry, Ann Marie Santiago to further  
explain how we pick these properties.

ANN MARIE SANTIAGO: Good morning Council Member.  
As you probably know, we do emergency repairs in  
buildings as they come up. So, we would go to  
anywhere in the city where there is an emergency  
condition where we have issued a violation. The  
owner has not complied and the emergency repair  
program is going to restore heat or address lead  
issues. AEP buildings are selected on an annual  
basis and they are selected according to the criteria  
in the law in the AEP law and for those buildings  
that happen to be selected and happen to be in the  
flood plains, they require this funding source.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you just breakdown a  
little bit for me what's required by law in terms of  
determining who gets the funding?

ANN MARIE SANTIAGO: Again, if the building is  
physically located in the flood plain and that is the  
location where we have to do the emergency repair or  
where the emergency alternative enforcement building  
is located, that's how it is determined.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 26

1  
2 If the buildings is not physically in the flood  
3 plain, then we are able to use the CDBG funds to  
4 cover those repairs.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I am following you.  
6 Thank you. Okay, can you get us a breakdown on how  
7 much of this funding is allocated to specific  
8 neighborhoods?

9 ANN MARIE SANTIAGO: So, the funding isn't  
10 allocated by neighborhood. It's a general funding  
11 and we use it as the building, the specific buildings  
12 come up into our work load.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But do you have data on the  
14 neighborhoods that you allocated it to?

15 ANN MARIE SANTIAGO: We have data on the  
16 neighborhoods we've spent it in so far, right.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, can you get that data?

18 ANN MARIE SANTIAGO: Absolutely sir.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you.

20 ANN MARIE SANTIAGO: You are welcome.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, Commissioner, I want  
22 to talk a little bit about emergency shelters with  
23 you. As you know, I had a terrible fire in my  
24 district about a month or so ago. Over 100 and  
25 something families were displaced, 100 something

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 27

units were burned or folks couldn't return to them.

Over 500 people displaced. I know that it's been an  
issue in the community about getting folks to  
register basically because of lack of documentation  
but much of that documentation was left in their  
apartments when they had to escape the fire.

So, has that issue been resolved and in the long  
term, is there a way that folks can get around that  
issue of documentation so that we don't face that in  
the future incidents of fires? And then on top of  
that, many of the folks were also undocumented.  
Probably the majority were undocumented. So, getting  
documentation to them was even that much harder  
because of their immigration status. Can you address  
that issue for me a little bit please?

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you so much Council Member  
for that question.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And by the way Commissioner,  
I want to thank you also for your flexibility in  
terms of extending their stays in the hotel. And I  
am really glad that we were able to work together on  
that.

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member, so am  
I and it is heartbreaking when there are fires in the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 28

2 city because not only do people lose every, all of  
3 their personal possessions but during the school  
4 year, we understand that children need to be near  
5 their school and uhm, parents need to be able to go  
6 to work and the challenge for us in finding places  
7 for people to stay near where their lives are is one  
8 that concerns us very much.

9 So, we are happy to work with you and the tenants  
10 in order to help them stabilize their lives,  
11 especially in a pandemic. So, in terms of  
12 registration, you know, one of the – we understood  
13 the challenges that the tenants were facing, which is  
14 why we worked with MOYA, we worked with DOB, OEM,  
15 SAU, all of us together with HPD and Ann Marie  
16 Santiago's team have been meeting – and Hendrickson  
17 actually have been meeting regularly to try to  
18 address the tenants issues. Immigration status is  
19 not a factor in terms of registering with HPD. We  
20 have tried to make sure that any language barriers  
21 were resolved by having MOIA be involved and able to  
22 do translation and flyers. What we are really  
23 looking for in terms of information from the tenants  
24 is their household income in composition. That's  
25 really what we are focused on because from the moment

1 we had the fire, I asked my team to locate housing  
2 within Queens and our marketing folks have been  
3 locating housing within Queens. In order to be able  
4 to match the tenants appropriately with the housing  
5 that we find both in marketing and through re-  
6 rentals, we have contact CHIP in order to get lists  
7 of apartments from them that's available as well in  
8 Queens. But we cannot match the tenants to either  
9 rental assistance, which they most likely will need  
10 or to the apartments that we are finding unless they  
11 give us that information.  
12

13 And so, it's been quite the stressing. I think  
14 that we have only gotten about 30 registrations out  
15 of the 89 folks that we are working with. I know  
16 that Ann Marie Santiago is in constant touch with  
17 DOB. About 20 units in the B section of the  
18 apartments complex maybe available for those families  
19 to move back into soon but they A-line is going to be  
20 offline for about 12 months.

21 So, it's whatever help we can get to impress upon  
22 them that the immigration status doesn't matter and  
23 that all we are trying to do is figure out how many  
24 people and what their income is, so we can get them  
25 stable housing.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 30

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, when I  
mentioned immigration status, I know that to you it  
doesn't matter. The problem with the immigrant  
community is often times, they don't have access to  
documentation or identification as others would. So,  
when they lose it, it's almost impossible for them to  
you know secure that. And I think you do require  
some documentation in terms of identification. Am I  
correct about that?

LOUISE CARROLL: You know, thank you Council  
Member for that question. So, my Deputy Commissioner  
Anne Marie Hendrickson has been working very, very  
closely with the tenants. So, I would like to call  
her to give a little bit more color of what the  
interactions have been and what the issues have been.  
We are waiting for Anne Marie Hendrickson to be  
unmuted. We have to Anne Marie's I can see them side  
by side on my screen.

ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: Thank you. Good morning  
Commissioner and thank you. Good morning Chair  
Dromm. Just to add to what Commissioner was  
explaining about in the emergency housing services,  
registration service kind of procedures.

What we are looking for in terms of identification sir, we are very flexible in terms of the paperwork. We would take a school letter, okay, the children of the school. We would take a letter from a doctor's office. Anything of that nature that associates the family with the address at the building is all we are really seeking.

So, I do think that what we are willing to do and what we have offered to do and will continue to offer is working individually with each family to get that information to help them get to the resources that could provide them with that information and again, just to reiterate the Commissioners point. There are about 90 families in the hotels but there are really about 133 families that were displaced from the building.

We only have about 30 registrations and again, we really want to work individually with each family to get that information and that household composition information. Because we would really like to assist those families that are going to be displaced long term with making housing referrals. But without having that information, we don't have the type of information needed to be able to match them to

1 apartments that they can afford and that's really  
2 important in our minds. We don't want to put someone  
3 into an apartment that they can't afford.  
4

5 So, we are seeking to maybe do a tenant meeting  
6 on Tuesday evening with all the residents and as the  
7 Commissioner said, all of the city agencies that have  
8 been helping us will be there. MOIA, OEM, who has  
9 been great and such a great partner on this, my  
10 colleague Ann Marie Santiago will be there to talk to  
11 them about the building and kind of the stages of  
12 return.

13 So, we do encourage all residents to come to that  
14 meeting. It's an opportunity for everyone to hear  
15 the same messaging and kind of get the same  
16 information and ask questions and enable us to assist  
17 them, which is really what we would like to do. We  
18 know this has been extremely traumatic for them and  
19 we want to be there to help them and guide them  
20 through transitioning to get back to their building  
21 or to another affordable apartment in the interim.  
22 We want to work with your office in anyway we can.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Please, please do continue to  
24 reach out to us on that and we will follow up with  
25 you. And I am glad to hear that you recognize that

1 there is a difference between the lease holders and  
2 families that live there because many of the families  
3 were not the lease holders. They were doubled up  
4 with other families. Not supposed to happen but that  
5 in fact is the case, so that is the difference  
6 between the 90 and 133 I think that you mentioned.

8 ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: Yes and we will work  
9 with each household because again, while we know that  
10 they may not have been the lease holder, as long as  
11 they can prove that they were at that address and  
12 they can prove their identity, we will provide them  
13 with the services that they need.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much and  
15 then even more generally in this regard. I think in  
16 the Executive Budget it adds \$1.1 million in Fiscal  
17 '21, '22 and the outyears for community consult in  
18 contracts to cover the cost of services for  
19 individuals and families who are not eligible for the  
20 CDBG funded emergency shelters.

21 So, what is the purpose of these funds and which  
22 organizations are funded by HPD for these services?

23 ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: That particular money  
24 that was added to the budget, those are monies, our  
25 shelter system, our emergency housing services is

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 34

funded with CD money and under the CD regulations,  
under the HUD regulations, we do need to ask about  
immigration and citizenship status, while it has no  
bearing on whether we provide services, it's a  
question we have to ask. And for those families who  
cannot answer or choose not to answer, we needed this  
alternative funding to be able to continue to provide  
them with the services that they need.

In our emergency housing services, we work with  
several organization. Red Cross is kind of our  
frontline and they are our first kind of opportunity  
to assist the families in the first few days.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And John Waldman by the way  
has been great. He has been wonderful.

ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: Yes, yes, Red Cross is a  
true partner and has been with us for many years.  
And then we also then work after Red Cross, which is  
kind of the first few days, we work with several not-  
for-profit organizations. One in each borough in  
Harlem, in the Bronx and in Brooklyn and these are  
family centers and these were after the first initial  
days that Red Cross has them in hotels. We then  
transition them to our family centers and we also  
work and have kind of an individual relationships

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 35

with SRO providers for those with both households  
families, for those households that do not have  
children. So, those are the kind of the  
organizations that kind of compliment the Emergency  
Housing Services program.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you tell me the overall  
budget for the emergency shelters? I know you are  
adding a million but what is the overall budget?

ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: If I can, Rich, may I  
just ask you, to turn to you for that - to my budget  
person. I don't know number off the top of my head.

RICH JOHNS: Of course, no problem. It  
fluctuates but it's about \$27 million, \$28 million.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and just  
finally, before I turn it over to my colleagues for  
questions, what is the current population of these  
shelters?

ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: Currently we have about  
1,300 families I believe and that's split between the  
family centers and between the SRO's. Let me give  
you specific numbers. Give me one second sir.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

LOUISE CARROLL: I can provide that.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 36

1  
2 ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: You have that Louise,  
3 thank you.

4 LOUISE CARROLL: There are about 157 households  
5 living in family shelters, 333 adults, 340 children.  
6 There in the SRO's, there are 575 households, which  
7 really translates to 752 adults. And so, the total  
8 headcount all totaled is 732 households for a total  
9 of 1,434 total headcount.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. And I  
11 jumped the gun by saying it was my last question I  
12 have. Just one last follow up.

13 LOUISE CARROLL: Sure.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You mentioned schools and  
15 being close to schools. Do these families when they  
16 move to the temporary shelters to the hotels, are  
17 they eligible for school bus service to take the  
18 children to their home school where they were  
19 previously registered prior to the fire?

20 ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: What we do - at all of  
21 our family centers, we have a Department of Education  
22 liaison on site and what we do is try to arrange to  
23 make sure that they have appropriate transportation  
24 to their schools.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 37

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, does the DOE, they  
3 provide that?

4 ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: I think again, depending  
5 on the age of the children I know sometimes when  
6 children were taking trainings who are high school  
7 new metro cards and I think they do try to arrange  
8 for more of the younger children to have some sort of  
9 busing services. I just need to follow up just to  
10 confirm those details but the DOE liaison is very  
11 helpful in assisting the families and making sure the  
12 children get to school properly.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I would love to get  
14 those numbers and I will ask the DOE that question  
15 also when we get to our oversight hearing with the  
16 DOE but thank you.

17 ANNE-MARIE HENDRICKSON: You are welcome.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, let me turn it over to  
19 Counsel, who is going to call on Council Members for  
20 questions.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Dromm. We  
22 have been joined by your Co-Chair Council Member  
23 Cornegy. Perhaps you would like to, if he is ready,  
24 I am finding him on my screen. If he would like to  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 38

1  
2 give his opening statement and go to his own  
3 questions.

4 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: No, in the interest of time  
5 I will let me colleagues begin their round of  
6 questioning and I will come back. Thank you so much.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. We have question  
8 please from Council Member Lander followed by Council  
9 Member Chin. As a reminder, Council Members, please  
10 use the Zoom raise hand function to be added to the  
11 queue and you will have five minutes when prompted by  
12 the Sergeant. So, Council Member Lander followed by  
13 Council Member Chin.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much to  
16 our Counsel and the Chairs and the Commissioner.  
17 Commissioner, I want to start with a word of praise.  
18 Last night we had a meeting with tenants from 11  
19 buildings owned by Greenbrook Partners, this  
20 predatory equity firm that has brought up 60  
21 buildings in Brooklyn and is evicting tenants right  
22 and left and engaging in construction as harassment  
23 and Lois Winters from your team and also Sarah  
24 Desmond from DOB were on that call and I just can't  
25 tell you how helpful they were. They have been

1 working with tenants in some of those buildings  
2 already for a couple of years and have just stepped  
3 right up to really recognize just what a disaster  
4 this is.  
5

6 So, I want to thank you for the work that the  
7 Administration has been doing to strengthen its  
8 capacity to fight harassment. At least my first  
9 question though, I know that you have had some  
10 limited headcount and there has been attrition and  
11 that these are a couple of divisions that we have  
12 been trying to staff up and grow over recent years.  
13 And I think it's possible that the pandemic is  
14 impinging on that growth. So, do you have what you  
15 need to keep growing these very strong anti-  
16 harassment units in your - at HPD so that it could  
17 support these tenants in the 60 Greenbrook buildings  
18 and of course many, many, many more all around the  
19 city?

20 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
21 first recognizing the hard work of our HPD staff. I  
22 will let Lois know that you mentioned her  
23 specifically. I am so proud of the team and what we  
24 have done. As you recall in the pandemic, there was  
25 a time when we were all making calls to allow the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 40

city to borrow funds to keep all of our services  
going and there was a threat of layoffs. And I am so  
proud of this administrations work and OMB and our  
excellent team in preventing layoffs.

And so, during the pandemic, we went to Three to  
One Hiring program, Three to One Attrition hiring in  
order to reduce the need for laying off our excellent  
staff. I am pleased to say that now that stimulus  
funds have been coming from the federal government,  
OMB has released or relaxed that three for one hiring  
rule to a two for one. They are allowing promotions  
and raises as well to begin again so that we can  
reward staff that have been working and going above  
and beyond throughout the pandemic.

So, we always get the job done Council Member.  
This is an amazing team.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Commissioner, I  
appreciate that answer but I am just going to note  
for the record, I think in a few of these divisions  
where you were building up strength to do more, that  
we have to go beyond going from three to one to two  
to one. I think there is plenty of place where  
that's fine but in strengthening these new anti-  
harassment units that you were just buildings up; I

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 41

1 think it is appropriate for us to look as a Council  
2 at pushing to make sure we use especially some of  
3 those one time funds to really go at these problems.  
4 So, that may be an area colleagues that we want to  
5 drill down on a little more. I know some of that was  
6 in the Council's budget response.  
7

8 My second question is, I looked because last  
9 night we were talking about the possibility of  
10 applying the certificate of no harassment rule. That  
11 that legislation is set to sunset toward the end of  
12 this year. And HPD is supposed to prepare for the  
13 Council a report on that program, so that we can use  
14 it in deciding whether to extend or expand the  
15 program. Can you just confirm for me that you are  
16 aware that that report is due and will have it for us  
17 soon?

18 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you so much Council Member  
19 for that question. Yes, we are, I have reviewed the  
20 report. It is going through one more level of review  
21 and it will be to the Council shortly. We apologize  
22 for the delay and we will get that to you as soon as  
23 possible.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's great. We still  
25 have - you know, it expires I think September 30<sup>th</sup>,

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 42

1 so you know with that report, you know I think we  
2 made it due six months ahead of the expiration, so we  
3 would have time to review it and then work with the  
4 administration on in what form it should be extended  
5 or expanded or renewed or you know whatever. What  
6 decision we will make.  
7

8 Okay and then my last question speaks to this  
9 issue of supportive housing and the possibility of  
10 acquiring vacant hotels or other properties that  
11 Chair Dromm referred to and that we talked about in  
12 the past.

13 I just continue to have the concern that without  
14 some model like a landbank or some way for the city  
15 to do bulk acquisition, that if we seek to finance  
16 each individual deal in the normal way, where it's  
17 fully designed and we work out all the rehab and we  
18 figure out all the service money and we let a  
19 provider do the whole deal in that way. That we will  
20 at best do a very small number of units and miss the  
21 opportunity to significantly scale up our supportive  
22 housing at this moment.

23 So, is HPD, I hear you that you need to wait to  
24 know what ARP funds can be used in that way and  
25 obviously we hope to get infrastructure money but is

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 43

HPD, is the city doing something that might enable us  
to really scale up at this moment and a significant  
acquisition that could actually broadly expand our  
supportive housing.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
that question. You know, we have done a lot. I am  
just going to take a little bit of time to tout the  
supportive housing production that we've done so far.  
So, we have created more than 7,000 units of  
supportive housing so far and we continue to produce  
record numbers of supportive housing. We have a  
program under which we have been purchasing  
properties in just the way that you describe.

In order to buy properties that are strategically  
placed in the market and that are efficient and cost  
effective in order to do just that. We continue to  
review hotel proposals on a rolling basis. I know  
that our team has been working with DHS on one and  
there is another that's eminent with HDC. So, it's  
not that we are not poised to just buy properties.  
For example, we bought [INAUDIBLE 51:24] you know as  
is and didn't wait for it to be rehabbed. That you

1 know, we just closed on the rehab I think in December  
2 but we had purchased that property a couple of years  
3 before. And then to get through ULURP in order to  
4 make it - turn it into residential and then do the  
5 rehab.  
6

7 So, we are not, for properties that we buy  
8 strategically, we buy them outright. We use  
9 neighborhood restore as a not-for-profit to buy or we  
10 actually give the money to a different not-for-profit  
11 to do the acquisition. And then we sort of let it  
12 sit in our pipeline. We do emergency repairs if need  
13 be but otherwise we let it sit in our regular  
14 pipelines. What we are really missing is the pricing  
15 to be a place where it is rational. For example,  
16 even with the Clusters program, where we are working  
17 with HRA and DHS to end the Clusters program, we want  
18 fees one and two. We are currently working to buy  
19 phases three and four and again, we are buying these  
20 properties as is. We are giving it to neighborhood  
21 restore, then to a not-for-profit and putting it in  
22 our pipeline. So, we are doing that work constantly  
23 and we are constantly reviewing hotel proposals from  
24 both for-profits and not-for-profits.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 45

2 Unfortunately, well fortunately or unfortunately,  
3 people are banking on New York City's recovery. And  
4 that's a good thing and so, they are holding onto  
5 their properties and they are not reducing pricing in  
6 a way that makes it cost effective. But we will be  
7 there to grab them as they come.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much.

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Can I jump in before we go  
10 forward?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may Chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you Commissioner and  
13 I definitely want to thank Council Member Margaret  
14 Chin for pinch hitting for me and obviously Chair  
15 Dromm.

16 Good morning and thank you for attending today's  
17 Fiscal Year 2020 Executive Budget hearing. I am  
18 Council Member Robert Cornegy and I am the Chair of  
19 the Council's Committee on Housing and Buildings. I  
20 would first like to thank Council Member Danny Dromm,  
21 Chair of the Committee on Finance for his tireless  
22 work throughout the budget cycle.

23 Second, I would like to thank my colleagues in  
24 attendance for taking part into this hearing as well

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 46

2 as the representatives from the Department of  
3 Housing, Preservation and Development.

4 Under Housing New York, HPD has financed  
5 approximately 178,000 affordable housing units over  
6 the life of the plan. There is much to celebrate  
7 about this level of production which has exceeded  
8 projected targets and production goals. However,  
9 consistently overlooked in administrations housing  
10 and priorities are adequate pathways to homeownership  
11 and sufficient services for at risk homeowners. You  
12 have heard me say this a gazillion times.

13 Homeownership represents real equity for our  
14 communities and now there are serious looming  
15 questions over the threats to housing sector in the  
16 immediate post-COVID world, the tenants and  
17 homeowners alike. Throughout my time as Chair of  
18 this Committee, I have continued to see in this  
19 administration an unwillingness to adequately provide  
20 resources that focus on homeownership and mitigating  
21 the challenges and barriers funded by those  
22 attempting to secure affordable home ownership in  
23 this housing market.

24 As we enter the waning months of the current  
25 administration and legislative session, I'd like to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 47

1 discuss how we can cement a lasting impact that leads  
2 to security for tenants as well as homeowners in New  
3 York City. I look forward to a productive dialogue  
4 with you Commissioner as always. Thank you for being  
5 here. Thank you for allowing me to begin there. I  
6 have certain questions that are obviously centered  
7 around that premise and I will begin those questions  
8 right now, as soon as I pull them up. Just give me  
9 one second please.  
10

11 I want to start with the Open Door Homeownership  
12 Program and I know that much has been talked about in  
13 terms of tenant tenancy and the affordable housing  
14 market but I want to talk about the executive capital  
15 commitment plan for Fiscal '21-'25 includes \$83.5  
16 billion for the Open Door Program.

17 Can you please provide the number of units built  
18 utilizing a program over the course of the current  
19 administration? Can this be disaggregated by borough  
20 and Council District?

21 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
22 that excellent question. I know we have discussed  
23 this issue a number of times. I just want to start  
24 by saying that homeownership is something that is  
25 really very, very important to this administration

1 and to HPD. We recognize that homeownership among  
2 people of color has been declining at the scary rate  
3 and that especially now in the economic crisis that's  
4 part of the pandemic, the ability for folks who even  
5 have homes to keep them and to hold on to them is a  
6 challenge.  
7

8 I would like to tout homeownership numbers to  
9 date. So, to date on the Housing New York, we  
10 financed over 43,000 units of homeownership. In  
11 addition, as part of that financing, we financed in  
12 CP homes. We financed Mitchell Lama homeownership.  
13 We have financed homeownership on CLT's. We are  
14 currently working to increase our down payment  
15 assistance from \$40,000 per a potential homeowner to  
16 much, much more than that and we hope to be able to  
17 announce that very soon. Because we believe that in  
18 addition to financing homeownership, there is a lot  
19 of naturally occurring homeownership on the market.  
20 But if we can give people the money in hand to cover  
21 that down payment and reduce their costs. We can  
22 also make a dent there.

23 There is a federal bill to help create tax  
24 credits to support the cost of providing  
25 homeownership, which is where our issues arise with

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 49

the Open Door program. That in order to close on  
these units, the cost of production is exceeding the  
term sheet levels that we have.

So, we have only closed - to answer your  
question, we have only closed two projects under the  
Open Door Term Sheet and it is because of the real  
cost of that program. So, we are hoping that if we  
can get federal tax credits to work on the  
homeownership side, in the way that it works on the  
rental side in order to bring inequity and reduce  
cost. That is one way, so our federal team is  
working on that bill right now. And we are  
continuing to try to refine the cost and the AMI  
levels to make that Open Door Term Sheet Work.

But I assure you Council Member, Open Door is not  
the only way that we are working to help homeowners  
who are expanding the homeowner help desk with the  
center for New York City neighborhoods. We are in  
South East Queens, in the Bronx, in Central Brooklyn.  
We are going to be out there tomorrow. I will be  
there with my team handing out flyers, talking to  
folks, directing them to the Center for New York City  
Neighborhoods. Enterprise and the AG's office just  
gave us, I think it was \$800,000 for that program.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 50

In order to really, really help homeowners with  
counseling, refinancing, legal fees, etc., in order  
to make sure that home ownership is something that is  
not a stress and a burden.

We are also closed on our first home fix  
property, where we helped with a homeowner with  
basically a grant, a zero interest loan of over  
\$50,000 in order to stabilize the property. So, we  
have a lot of tools that we are using. The Open Door  
Term Sheet continues to be something that we are  
working on to refine.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, I respect and  
appreciate that but it seems as though the  
administration – and it is not a shout at you because  
it has happened way before you. It seems as though  
the administration commitment to this aggressive  
300,000 units of affordable housing in most  
instances, deep affordability, which I do respect is  
actually in some degree coming at the expense of home  
ownership and I believe that we can walk and chew gum  
at the same time.

So, I've said this I think from the first time  
that I took over that we had to have the same  
resources and commitment to creating affordability in

1 homeownership that we have had to creating it and the  
2 Administration has made no bones about it and I  
3 respect that they made this commitment. So, a very  
4 aggressive role of 300,000 units of affordable  
5 housing. The same commitment clearly has not been  
6 made to home ownership. And now, as a result of  
7 that, we find ourselves post pandemic and the numbers  
8 like you said in communities of color and  
9 marginalized communities, we have less homeownership  
10 than we did in 1970 in the Black community which is a  
11 travesty and we have to take some responsibility for  
12 it. Now there are mitigating circumstances that have  
13 led to that but largely some of the city's programs  
14 which have not supported that contribute to it. So,  
15 I never wanted to leave a legacy of leaving the  
16 council worse than what I found it but in this  
17 instance, in terms of pathways to affordable home  
18 ownership in an increasingly unaffordable city.

19  
20 If we look at unaffordability as it relates to  
21 tenancy, just opposed to home ownership, it's night  
22 and day. The homes have escalated to in my district,  
23 we just saw this very public discussion, the mayoral  
24 discussion around what the median household price is.  
25 I don't want to touch that but I knew, if they would

1 have asked me, I would have said \$900,000 because  
2  
3 everywhere I look within my district a shell is  
4 \$900,000, quite frankly. So, the same commitment has  
5 not been made. I want to point that out. I want to  
6 at least still; you and I still have the opportunity  
7 to work several months together. I know it is budget  
8 season but really laying a pathway, a foundation for  
9 in my absence at least you maybe staying through  
10 several administrations, I only get to stay through  
11 two or one but really a pathway to make sure that the  
12 hardworking New Yorkers don't have a legacy of paying  
13 rent solely for the rest of their lives. And they  
14 have an absolute opportunity to buy into the American  
15 dream.

16 In our communities, we know that the labor  
17 movement has created a pathway to the middle class  
18 and that pathway has also been brought by  
19 homeownership and home purchases, which has allowed  
20 us to build equity and increase wealth and transfer  
21 wealth and the fact that we are leaving this  
22 administration worse and with less ability to do that  
23 than before. It has to be looked at and we still  
24 have a chance to right the ship, so I would like to  
25 work with you in that regard going forward.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 53

1  
2 LOUISE CARROLL: So, thank you Council Member. I  
3 want to say that the two Open Door projects we  
4 financed created 129 homeownership, units of  
5 homeownership.

6 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Well, that's way better  
7 context than two.

8 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you. I just wanted to  
9 stress that. You know, when we do developments, we  
10 tend to finance as many units as we can in one  
11 development. So, there were 129 units of home  
12 ownership created and our ANCP program, which you  
13 know is the tenants, rent tenants that renting to  
14 become homeowners, there were 128 units financed  
15 under Housing New York.

16 So, when we talk about over 43,000 units of  
17 homeownership finance, there is a lot to unpack in  
18 the number. So, I apologize for leading with two  
19 developments, rather than the number of units of  
20 homeownership housing that we created as part of that  
21 financing. But we recognize that we have done a lot  
22 for homeowners but we recognize that we can and want  
23 to and should do more and it is why we are constantly  
24 redefining and retuning.

25

1           So, we really believe that that increase down  
2  
3       payment assistance, putting that cash in a families  
4  
5       hands to be able to go out and say, I can afford that  
6  
7       unit now because I can make that down payment, is one  
8  
9       of the tools. The other two is making sure that  
10  
11       there are more sources in homeownership financing.  
12  
13       The same way these sources exist for rental housing  
14  
15       and we are working on that on the federal level. And  
16  
17       you know, I would love to have Associate Commissioner  
18  
19       Kim Darga from Preservation Finance just elaborate on  
20  
21       all the homeownership work that we do in her  
22  
23       division. Kim?

24           KIM DARGA: Good morning Council Member.

25           CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Hey good morning  
26  
27       Commissioner, I mean Associate Commissioner. Good  
28  
29       morning.

30           KIM DARGA: It's nice to see you again.

31           CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Always.

32           KIM DARGA: So, I have to say I am really excited  
33  
34       about the work that we have done the last few years  
35  
36       and I think with a lot of encouragement from you and  
37  
38       other Council Members across the city, in addition to  
39  
40       really re- you know building the ANCP pipeline and  
41  
42       making sure that those buildings move forward and

1 exploring new programs like Open Door. We did launch  
2 Home Fix. I think with a lot of encouragement for  
3 you to really help homeowners across the city that  
4 are struggling to make repairs and maintain their  
5 financial stability. And we are really excited, the  
6 first one completed but we do have over 150  
7 applicants that are moving through the scoping  
8 process now and we do expect that that will actually  
9 be a huge unmet demand in New York City to help  
10 existing lower income homeowner stabilize their  
11 properties.  
12

13 We also launched, it doesn't get a lot of  
14 discussion but the Community Restoration Fund, which  
15 is a program to help basically homeowners that have  
16 distressed mortgages. Where they maybe insured by  
17 Fannie Mae or FHA and they are delinquent and rather  
18 than have those delinquent mortgages sold to uhm, the  
19 highest bidder, we work with partners including  
20 neighborhood restore and the center for New York  
21 State Neighborhoods. Many are to acquire those  
22 distressed mortgages and then work with the homeowner  
23 to afford a mortgage modification. That program has  
24 slowed down because of the restrictions around moving  
25 foreclosures forward, which I think we all understand

1 the importance of right now. But we do – are really  
2 watching what happens when those restrictions are  
3 lifted to make sure that we are prepared to be able  
4 to step in to help stabilize those homes and keep  
5 homeowners in them. We also, with a lot of support  
6 again from Council, we are this year with \$500,000 in  
7 the budget this year and another \$500,000 in the  
8 budget next year working with a range of community  
9 based organizations to do more proactive and targeted  
10 outreach to homeowners that have municipal  
11 delinquencies. And that may be at risk of the tax  
12 lien sale in addition to the help desk that our  
13 Commissioner mentioned.

14  
15 And then finally, I think I can't I guess, leave  
16 this conversation without expressing how excited I am  
17 to see that there may actually be true relief coming  
18 from federal resources to help homeowners that are  
19 struggling given what has happened for the last year  
20 especially and more historically with mortgage  
21 relief, with relief from municipal charges and other  
22 payables including utilities and insurance costs.

23 And so, I think we are watching what happens with  
24 that funding really closely to see how it is going to  
25 be utilized in New York City and also, figure out how

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 57

2 we could potentially help compliment or supplement  
3 that funding to further support homeowners.

4 So, thank you for the opportunity to talk about  
5 all of the programming and I certainly would look  
6 forward to talking more about what you think the gaps  
7 are and how we can be helpful. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I want to point out a  
9 couple of things. One is the administration or HPD's  
10 willingness in the person of both the Commissioner  
11 and the Associate Commissioner to work in this area.  
12 I just wish we could have gotten more done. I am not  
13 citing that you haven't attempted and we haven't had  
14 this conversation at nauseum and you haven't  
15 attempted to address it. I just want as this is my  
16 last budget to really make a resounding statement for  
17 what I would have preferred to see in terms of  
18 commitment from the Administration. That is not  
19 again a direct shot at either you or Commissioner  
20 Carroll. I just thought we could have gotten way  
21 more done and now we are coming out of a pandemic in  
22 a worse situation for homeowners than we have ever  
23 been in this city or at least since the depression  
24 and it's a sobering thought that so many people can  
25

1 be displaced not only from their residences and in  
2 terms of tenancy but also in terms of homeownership.

3  
4 A couple of things I do want to remind you that I  
5 did ask if we could have the numbers that you  
6 mentioned Commissioner disaggregated by district and  
7 by community. If you don't have that present now, if  
8 you could get that to me, I would greatly appreciate  
9 it.

10 And then lastly, the part of the problem that we  
11 have seen is being able to close out these projects.  
12 So, while you cited two developments that are 100  
13 plus units. There are several of these projects that  
14 are sitting on my desk right now unable to close. I  
15 would just like for your to cite for me what the  
16 barriers to closing the lion share of these projects  
17 that are affordable housing, I am sorry, affordable  
18 homeownership projects that still remain.

19 If you could just cite for me and for the record,  
20 what the barriers for closing those are at this  
21 point, I would greatly appreciate that.

22 LOUISE CARROLL: Absolutely. Thank you so much  
23 Council Member for your question and for your support  
24 of our continued efforts to provide homeownership in  
25 the city.

1  
2 A lot of the Open Door developments are scattered  
3 sites and on small lumps and so, that has contributed  
4 to the complexity of trying to close these  
5 developments. The size of the lots and the fact that  
6 there are so many of them, it has really been one of  
7 the key factors in addition to the cost of bringing  
8 all of that together.

9 So, my team is working diligently with OMB as  
10 well as the developers who have these developments.  
11 I can tell you I am often included in their emails  
12 back and forth because we are really all, all hands  
13 on deck in trying to make sure we can move these  
14 projects forward. But again, I say that we look  
15 forward to working with you in the future. I am  
16 excited about the federal bills that we are pushing,  
17 that we are working on. I am excited of the teams  
18 work to use the home funding to increase that down  
19 payment assistance. We think that down payment  
20 assistance should be available nationally to people  
21 of a certain AMI level, at a much higher level that  
22 it is right now. So, we are going to lead in New  
23 York City with where we think it should be and then  
24 we will advocate on the federal level to make this  
25 more nationally available.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 60

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, I am going to allow my  
colleagues to ask questions but thank you so much  
Chair Dromm in particular for indulging me to let me  
come in and ask my questions at this time. Council  
Member Dromm is a true gentleman and a scholar.  
Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Thank you Council  
Member Cornegy, I will take care of you later and you  
know in rewards or something. You are very kind.  
Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you Council Member  
Dromm, Chair Dromm.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let's go to our next Council  
Member please.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Dromm.  
Before we move on, I want to recognize that we were  
joined by Council Member Van Bramer and leader Matteo  
and Council Member Rosenthal.

We will next hear from Council Member Chin  
followed by Council Member Darma Diaz.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Thank you to  
both Chair and it's been a pleasure you know working  
with Chair Dromm of course and Chair Cornegy. I mean

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 61

1 your advocacy for homeownership is tremendous and I  
2 wanted to follow up on that question. Is that I know  
3 that it's not easy because one of the, the  
4 development in my district, there were supposed to be  
5 a certain number of units for the homeownership and  
6 it didn't happen because of financing. But luckily  
7 it was turned into senior housing. So, I am not  
8 totally sad about that. But it's been great working  
9 with your staff Commissioner at HPD. We have done  
10 some wonderful you know programs together and I just  
11 want to make sure that in your neighborhood program.  
12 I mean, I still have two projects in my district that  
13 I wanted to make sure that it happens and we are  
14 still in discussion because we talk about supportive  
15 housing, we need that in my district, especially  
16 supportive housing for seniors. I mean not every  
17 senior is lucky enough to get into a senior housing  
18 and the waiting list is tremendous.

20 I mean, the last count was 200,000. They are  
21 sitting on these waiting lists for senior housing  
22 forever and we are just not building fast enough. I  
23 know that in the SARA Program, I just want to make  
24 sure you know the senior housing are on track but I  
25 just want to look at the Pillars program. The

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 62

2 question is like, how many nonprofit organizations  
3 has been able to benefit from that and how many you  
4 know buildings have you been able to purchase with  
5 the \$275 million in financing that was made  
6 available. So, that's one question.

7 The other question that I wanted to also focus on  
8 is maybe it's relating to your advocacy on the  
9 federal level getting tax credit for homeownership.  
10 You know we have built a lot of affordable housing  
11 but how do we look at the affordable housing pool  
12 that we have and to be able to turn some of that into  
13 affordable home ownership. Because for a family  
14 that's lucky enough to win the lottery and got into  
15 an affordable unit. They got to be in there for a  
16 long, long time. But how do we, how can we help them  
17 become home owners?

18 You know are there buildings that have been you  
19 know there for a long time can we transition those  
20 buildings into affordable homeownership, so that  
21 these families who are lucky enough to get an  
22 affordable unit will be able to build equity for  
23 their family. Because those apartments in some ways  
24 is passed on to the next generation. And so, the  
25 stability, how do we maintain that? How do we give

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 63

1 them the opportunity? Because the housing market is  
2 crazy. I mean, it's so expensive even when you talk  
3 about buying a co-op apartment and then a studio  
4 apartment in Manhattan is more than half a million  
5 dollars.  
6

7 In the old days, there were opportunity where  
8 some of the buildings like in Queens were turned into  
9 co-ops and that's where the you know the affordable  
10 homeownership opportunity came about for a lot of  
11 working families.

12 So, I wanted to look at how do we help you know  
13 these families who are lucky enough to be in an  
14 affordable unit. Other programs that you are  
15 thinking about or maybe the whole idea of the federal  
16 tax credit would that help to transition some of  
17 these buildings who are run by - let's start with the  
18 one that's run by nonprofit. You know, can we start  
19 with them first? And to see how we can help them you  
20 know transition you know those affordable rental  
21 units into affordable homeownership unit. Thank you.

22 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you so much Council Member  
23 Chin for that question and for your continued support  
24 and of our agency and our work and for our  
25 partnership. The, to tackle the first part of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 64

question, which is the Pillars program. We purchased  
12 buildings as part of the Pillars program and of  
that 12, it's about 479 units in these 12 buildings.

Uhm, we have - there is another 35 buildings with  
3,243 units that have closed with pillars as on a  
secondary program where we have just a tax exemption  
to support the acquisition of that property. Of  
those properties -

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

LOUISE CARROLL: So, we have a list of  
prequalified people who can purchase properties as  
part of the Pillars Program. Not-for-profits are  
part of that prequalified list but we don't just send  
anybody to go out and purchase properties. They have  
to be good partners in order to do that.

We have the ENCP program as you know that we  
continue to help renters become homeowners and as  
part of Housing New York, we have transitioned 128 of  
those units into homeownership as part of that  
program and we continue to close on these  
developments until there is not one left, as part of  
our preservation pipeline. We have put out a shared  
equity request for information in order to solicit  
ideas to create not just homeownership but to let low

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 65

and moderate income families have an ownership stake  
in their communities. Partnered through  
Homeownership and through other investment  
opportunities.

So, we are excited to see what comes back  
nationally from that request for expressions of  
interest. We are continuing to – we agree that we  
need to find many different ways and we are doing  
that work. As we are also, I know Council Member  
Rivera is here and I know that she had some ideas  
about purchasing properties through not-for-profits  
and turning them into homeownership. And we look  
forward to working with her on that.

So, we are exploring lots of ideas and we are  
happy to continue to work with you but yes, Council  
Member Chin, as part of our daily work, we are  
transitioning renters into homeowners.

CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah, I know Chill program but  
unfortunately in for example, in my district and a  
lot of districts, we don't have you know city owned  
buildings. People are not selling their building,  
they are not abandoning a building but a lot of  
nonprofit organizations you know have built  
affordable housing and I think those are the ones

1 that HPD can start with to see how to help them  
2 transition some of the families that have been there  
3 along time, who has been renting into homeowner and  
4 to be able to build that equity and that will help  
5 build you know well, in those neighborhoods.  
6

7 And I mean, we are building affordable housing  
8 across the city. So, when you know Chair Cornegy is  
9 talking about you know we're losing you know Black  
10 homeownership, a lot of immigrants who fought so hard  
11 to save money for a down payment just to purchase a  
12 home or are in danger of losing their home. And a  
13 lot of them don't even know that there are these  
14 programs available to them to help them. And I think  
15 that the homeownership part, we have done a lot of  
16 good things helping people with down payment  
17 assistance.

18 So, I think the next phase to really see you know  
19 all of the affordable housing the city has helped to  
20 build. How can we help these families become  
21 homeowners? So, I really look forward to working  
22 with you at least to get that started. Thank you.  
23 Thank you Chair.

24 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you so much. We work  
25 hard. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 67

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member  
3 Chin. We now have questions from Council Member  
4 Darma Diaz.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Good morning. Thank you  
7 Chair Dromm.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You're welcome.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, thank you. It's  
10 definitely an interesting conversation for me. It's  
11 a pleasure to have the other side to have HPD  
12 Commissioner. I want to start by thanking you for  
13 improving the HD housing application for Housing  
14 Connect. It's definitely making it a lot easier for  
15 every day New Yorkers to put in their information and  
16 select units. When applications are based on their  
17 income when their past is a lot more complicated and  
18 led to a lot of sad individuals. And speaking about  
19 that application itself, my understanding is, that  
20 non-New Yorkers can apply.

21 So, say I live in Texas, I can go on Housing  
22 Connect and I can apply. Is that the case?

23 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you so much Council Member  
24 for that question because that's come up recently in  
25 one of our developments that we are currently

1 marketing. So, the constitution prohibits New York  
2 City from preventing outsiders, outside residents  
3 from applying to our housing.  
4

5 However, we have our solution has been that there  
6 is a preference for New York City residents. And so,  
7 until there is no New York City resident that  
8 qualifies for our low income housing, we are not able  
9 to offer it to a non-New York City resident.

10 As you can imagine, there are thousands of New  
11 Yorkers who are applying to our units. So, it is  
12 highly unlikely that we would get through that list  
13 to get to a non-New York City list.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Wonderful, so prior to  
15 coming onto the Council in December, I worked under  
16 homeless services. I would just like to speak a  
17 question about when children are displaced and  
18 families that come into shelter, the transportation.

19 So, from my experience has been until the age of  
20 12, busing is offered but if a parent wants to take  
21 the child to and from school, the parent and child  
22 are offered a metro card. So, I want to thank the  
23 system for putting that into place.

24 So, definitely, thank you for doing that and  
25 pushing that, the conversation, that collaborative.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 69

1 It's working well. It's quite effective to know that  
2 families, not only being displaced due to fire but  
3 that the financial hardship has been taken away from  
4 them.  
5

6 And moving forward in my closing is for  
7 Councilwoman Chin, I want to thank her for your  
8 willingness to take this place, adults into your  
9 community. In one of our hearings, I asked one of my  
10 colleagues to please open their doors, please place  
11 individuals and I was comfortable with selecting that  
12 work for your community.

13 So, just to hear the Councilwoman Chin saying she  
14 welcomes this place individuals and is willing to  
15 work. I just want to say thank you. I turn it back;  
16 I have no more questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and  
18 that's typical Council Member Margaret Chin. Always  
19 open to taking people in and we really appreciate  
20 that about her.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Dromm, we have just  
23 added questions from Council Member Rosenthal.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, very good. Council  
25 Member Rosenthal.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 70

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much.

4 Thank you. It's great to see you Commissioner.

5 Thank you for all your hard work and Council Members

6 Cornegy and Dromm, thank you for this like widely

7 informative hearing. So, thank you for that.

8 I want to ask about uhm, tenant, all forms of

9 tenant harassment, which my district gets to

10 experience lots of different forms of tenant

11 harassment. But one piece I would really love some

12 help from your agency on is, we have a ton of

13 buildings, 421-A buildings that are now coming out of

14 affordability and the units, it's our understanding

15 unless you all can tell me otherwise that the units

16 go into rent regulation as long as it is the same

17 tenant and then follow the rent regulation rules.

18 These tenants are not being told they have that

19 opportunity and the thing that would really make it -

20 I mean, we have already lost dozens of apartments.

21 The help I need from HPD is for each building, a list

22 of the units that are rent regulated because then our

23 tenant organizers can target those buildings. So,

24 that's my first question.

25

1  
2 And my second thing that I just want to bring  
3 publicly to light is that we have a building that  
4 just very recently went up where it is in Riverside  
5 South or Riverside Center. The most recent one and  
6 one of the buildings has - it was I guess one of the  
7 last corridors and the whole building is low income.  
8 And the management there has - we have gone through  
9 at least two management companies but the tenants  
10 regularly talk about broken doors. Mail being  
11 stolen, disrepair already - this building is maybe  
12 five years old. Disrepair in units not being  
13 attended to.

14 You know and because of the broken door, you know  
15 homeless people sleeping in the stairwell, which you  
16 know we need to find shelter for people but not where  
17 it is unexpected etc. And this is a building with  
18 hundreds of - a great building. It could be a very  
19 successful, affordable building but the management  
20 has just fallen down on the job.

21 So, those are my two concerns today. And really  
22 one is informational, the first one and I have been  
23 asking for this information by the way since I  
24 started and in the Council and have been told that  
25 the original documents are in a vault somewhere in

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 72

1 New Jersey. I have been given all sorts of  
2 information but yeah, we are trying to do tenant  
3 organizing to keep that building you know the very  
4 few whatever it is, 15 percent in there. But you  
5 know in my district, we have lost between 300 and 400  
6 units of affordable housing every year. We track  
7 that through the Department of Finance.  
8

9 And you know, it's like this. This is how it  
10 happens in my district, so help. And do you have  
11 enough money in your agency you know to help?

12 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you Council Member for  
13 that question, for those questions. First of all, I  
14 want to take Riverside Center. If there are - I  
15 would like the tenants to call 311 put in complaints  
16 so that we can go out there and see what's happening.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, I am happy to  
18 say that to them but can this be the red flag? Right  
19 now we are in a public hearing, can that be a little  
20 stronger than 311? We have done the 311 route.

21 LOUISE CARROLL: Absolutely, so my Deputy  
22 Commissioner for Code Enforcement is here. We will  
23 talk about Riverside Center after this hearing is  
24 over but generally when tenants are experiencing  
25 those kinds of things -

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 73

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: We're the queen of  
3 311, right. No, we do that all the time.

4 LOUISE CARROLL: Okay and so, we will be out  
5 there and we will take a look for these tenants. I  
6 also want to say before I answer the question of rent  
7 stabilization.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 LOUISE CARROLL: I want to say that there is a  
10 bill in Albany right now to provide better notice to  
11 tenants about when 421-A is expiring in their leases  
12 and so that tenants know what their rights are when  
13 421 expires and ACR and HPD are working with the  
14 Assembly woman who put that bill forward, so that the  
15 tenants know -

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Why can't HPD just do  
17 it. You have a copy of the original documents. Why  
18 don't you just know. I mean, again, if it's a matter  
19 of resources, you need a body, you need ten bodies to  
20 go through those documents and find out. Why does it  
21 take a bill in Albany telling DHCR to do it? I mean,  
22 unless the truth of the matter is and let's just be  
23 honest about this, you don't have the original  
24 documents or the original documents don't have the  
25 apartment numbers.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 74

1  
2 LOUISE CARROLL: Council Member, I am happy to  
3 tell you that we produce the 421-A report. We have  
4 recently released or we will release it soon where we  
5 track every 421-A in rent stabilization and its  
6 status. And so, the issue we have about telling  
7 people exactly which apartment is that we are  
8 prohibited by state law, by ACR for privacy reasons  
9 from revealing the designation of each apartment so  
10 that the tenants in these apartments are protected.  
11 But I assure you -

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And there is no like  
13 mod to that that you could get where you would have a  
14 contracted safe you know tenant advocacy group? Like  
15 housing conservation coordinators? You couldn't get  
16 a modification to the state DHCR to agree to let them  
17 to do this work?

18 LOUISE CARROLL: Council Member, this is an  
19 excellent question. The best we have been able to  
20 get is introducing that report about every single  
21 unit and its rent stabilization status is that we  
22 have been allowed to scramble the identification of  
23 the apartments. That is the most we have been able  
24 to get in terms of relief of that law.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 75

2 But also Council Member, I would like to say as  
3 part of producing these reports and as part of our  
4 compliance and enforcement division, which we created  
5 in 2017, uhm, to come combat noncompliance of 421-A,  
6 we have brought over 72,000 units since 2017 into  
7 compliance with 421-A. So, the combination of doing  
8 that report and the combination of a compliance and  
9 enforcement unit, which I mean, I want to say that  
10 number again, 72,000.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But how are you able  
12 to do that if you didn't know the apartment numbers?

13 LOUISE CARROLL: Well, we know the apartment  
14 numbers. We're able to -

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well why aren't you  
16 all sending letters to all of these units?

17 LOUISE CARROLL: We have brought all of those  
18 units into compliance.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No, no, like on my  
20 upper west side, I've got like 20 buildings. Have  
21 you sent them all letters?

22 LOUISE CARROLL: I do not believe we have sent  
23 the tenant individual letters but we have corrected  
24 the rent stabilization status -

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 76

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I understand. No, no,  
3 no, I understand that's amazing, don't get me wrong.  
4 Chair, I am going to turn it back to you. I would  
5 just leave you with a couple of things. One, if your  
6 staff could follow up with me about 100 freedom  
7 place. It's really miserable over there for the  
8 tenants.

9 Second, the 421-A report, if anyone has that, I  
10 would love to see it. I don't know if other Council  
11 Members already have it but that would be great and  
12 probably help us.

13 And third, I mean it just strikes me Council  
14 Member Dromm, that we should put in money to the  
15 HPD's budget for a unit that explicitly sends these  
16 letters and does follow up work.

17 If HPD can send the letters right, maybe we  
18 can't, maybe a tenant organizing group can't but if  
19 HPD can send the letters, why - I'm just asking a  
20 very common sense question. It sounds to me just  
21 like a funding thing. Let's just add you know, let's  
22 have a ten person staff unit to do it.

23 So, with that, I turn it back to you. Thank you  
24 Chair Dromm.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 77

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Council Member  
Rosenthal and we will work with you together on  
looking further at that issue, definitely yeah.  
Commissioner, I just have a couple of follow ups.  
There are no other questions from Council Members at  
this point. So, let me just start by saying in the  
beginning of the '21 calendar year, the Council  
committed \$500,000 of its discretionary funding to  
create its Community Lien Sale Outreach Initiative in  
order to raise awareness related to the city's  
property tax lien. What resources does HPD allocate  
towards outreach regarding the lien sale?

LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you so much Chair Dromm  
for that question and thank you so much for the  
\$500,000 in discretionary funding that you gave to  
us.

So, we have used this funding to partner with the  
center for New York City neighborhoods to give  
assistance to homeowners who are at risk of getting  
on the tax lien sale list. We have done outreach.  
We have been in technical assistance counseling  
referrals to other programs. We also connected it to  
the homeowner help desk, which we recently expanded.  
And we are, with the help of the AG's office and

enterprise, we are among ten municipalities and  
counties across the state who is implementing anti-  
displacement strategies as part of our anti-  
displacement learning network group.

So, we are working with Enterprise and the AG's  
office on that. We are creating a portal, a  
homeownership portal that with the center for New  
York City neighborhoods and the AG's office to direct  
homeowners for full service of about every question  
and issue that they are facing in terms of  
displacement.

I also want to and at liens. But I also want to  
point out DOS work because they have a program that  
homeowners who have difficulty paying their taxes and  
are on the tax lien sale can enter into a payment  
plan in order to prevent sale of the liens. And so,  
we really, really, part of our resources to  
homeowners is that our planning group has worked with  
our preservation group to help DOF get the word out  
to families, especially during the pandemic, by  
making calls, by putting up flyers, so that they can  
go to DOF and enter into a payment plan.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, we have worked with DOF  
on some of those issues as well regarding the lien

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 79

1 sale, so thank you for that. And finally, let me  
2 just ask you, the Executive Capital Commitment Plan  
3 includes \$650,000 to support the efforts of a Delmont  
4 Community Land Trust in Fiscal 2022. In addition,  
5 this year, the City Council provided about \$635,000  
6 in discretionary funding to support community based  
7 organizations and technical assistance providers to  
8 launch CLT's citywide.  
9

10 Can you provide us with some information on the  
11 specifics of this project and can you share some  
12 details on whether additional sites will be brought  
13 into the CLT's in other areas of the city in Fiscal  
14 '22 and beyond?

15 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you so much for that  
16 question. We are currently working with the Bronx  
17 CLT to combine some private sites that they have with  
18 some city owned sites. Uhm, I, you know, my  
19 Assistant Commissioner for Preservation Finance has  
20 been a champion of this work and so, I am going to  
21 let her speak a little bit and showcase what she has  
22 been doing in that vein but with the Council money  
23 and your support, we have done capacity buildings for  
24 CLT's. We have done community organizing, community  
25 education. The following groups that I will name

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 80

1  
2 have received CLT contracts for FY21 to help us with  
3 that work. So, Banana Kelly, China Town Partnership,  
4 Community Development Project, Cooper Square, Cypress  
5 Hills, just to name a few.

6 So, we have engaged them to help us in our CLT  
7 work. We have preserved the Cooper Square CLT and  
8 the [INAUDIBLE 1:41:06] CLT and we are working with  
9 into the borough for a closing in this pipeline. So,  
10 we are doing a lot of work with the funding that you  
11 have given us but I really want Kim Darga, Assistant  
12 Commissioner Kim Darga to come on because she has  
13 been really, really, really spearheading this work at  
14 HPD.

15 KIM DARGA: Hi, good morning Council Member and  
16 Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good morning.

18 KIM DARGA: Uhm, so in addition to the work  
19 outlined by our Commissioner to support the Bronx CLT  
20 and the work around capacity building with the  
21 funding from City Council, we have been working with  
22 a number of organizations to expand our pipeline and  
23 we have done that in a number of ways.

24 All of our programs that are available to finance  
25 housing are available to CLT's and we have actually

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 81

1 been able to finance a couple CLT's in the last year,  
2 even during the pandemic. So, Cooper Square which  
3 has been an existing CLT and I think is very well  
4 known in New York City. We financed some repairs for  
5 those properties last spring and then even in  
6 November of this year in the height of the pandemic,  
7 we were able to close on financing for East Harlem El  
8 Barrio CLT. Which is in Manhattan and then uhm, we  
9 certainly have a robust pipeline at this point and  
10 time of about 1,000 units that are in predevelopment  
11 and we expect to be able to close in the next few  
12 years with organizations that are trying to create  
13 all types of housing on CLT's.

14 So, including single family homeownership  
15 opportunities, looking at cooperative CLT development  
16 as well as mutual housing associations on CLT's. So,  
17 we are really excited to continue to work with a  
18 range of partners to increase the capacity of  
19 organizations that have really done a lot of work in  
20 the last couple years to establish themselves and  
21 hopefully be able to continue to build the pipeline  
22 in the coming years. So, thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so when you talk about  
24 building capacity, uhm, an organization where I do  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 82

1  
2 have some concerns is Chia[SP], can you explain to me  
3 specifically they are doing? And are they doing  
4 capacity building within their own organization or  
5 are they doing outreach to community members? And if  
6 you don't have that information now, can you get me  
7 some details on it as we move through the budget  
8 process?

9 KIM DARGA: Sure, so I don't have the information  
10 specifically on Chia right now but generally speaking  
11 what's happening is there is organizations often with  
12 some involvement from a community based organization  
13 in a community that are working with community  
14 members to create a community land trust. And so, a  
15 lot of the work so far has been around understanding  
16 how affordable housing runs. How to set up and  
17 establish an organization. You know, how the  
18 affordable housing programs run. Setting up  
19 governance structures and so, there are nine or so  
20 organizations that have gone through a lot of that  
21 process and the new economy project and nicely have  
22 been working with a number of these more grassroots  
23 organizations in order to establish themselves and we  
24 are at the stage now where many of them have

25

1 established those basic governance structures and are  
2 now looking at development opportunities.

3  
4 So, we are happy to follow up on Chia  
5 specifically if that's of interest but that's  
6 generally how it's worked.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, that would be great and  
8 when you talk about development options, are you  
9 talking about looking for land?

10 KIM DARGA: So, it could be acquiring buildings  
11 or acquiring land for the purpose of affordable  
12 housing development and so, the reference I made  
13 earlier to having access to the range of HPD programs  
14 is really important because you know, often times  
15 affordable housing, preservation and creation does  
16 require assistance. And so, you know that's the  
17 example I gave earlier, Cooper Square used alone from  
18 through our Green Housing Preservation program to do  
19 renovations. Then our East Harlem El Barrio CLT  
20 received a tax exemption subsidy from us in order to  
21 facilitate that as well as land.

22 So, this could be on public sites but it could  
23 also be private site development. And so, we would  
24 encourage these organizations to look at both  
25 opportunities. You know, there is not a lot of city

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 84

1 owned sites left. And so, private site opportunities  
2 I think are really the future.

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, I don't see it  
5 happening in my district particularly because my  
6 district I think is the smallest geographically in  
7 the borough but with the highest density of people  
8 and there is just really nowhere to build or to even,  
9 I don't even imagine purchase. But anyway, let's  
10 follow up on that and we will discuss this further as  
11 we move down the road.

12 KIM DARGA: Wonderful.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thanks. And  
14 Commissioner, I want to thank you also. We are going  
15 to let you go now. I just have to read this  
16 statement.

17 This will conclude this portion of today's  
18 hearing. Thank you HPD for being here. We will now  
19 take a little bit of a break until noon. It's noon  
20 yet I don't think is it?

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, we're good.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, about a nine minute  
23 break okay and then we will hear from the Department  
24 of Sanitation. I ask my colleagues who will be  
25 joining us for the DSNY portion of the hearing to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 85

1 remain in the Zoom with your microphone muted until  
2 we are ready to begin. And again, thank you  
3 Commissioner Carroll, it's always a pleasure to see  
4 you and thank you for the work that you are doing. I  
5 look forward to following up with you on a few  
6 things. Thank you very much.

8 LOUISE CARROLL: Thank you all. It's a pleasure  
9 to work with you. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Okay, nine  
11 minutes folks and then we will come back. [BREAK  
12 1:47:55-2:02:12].

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Good afternoon everyone. I  
14 hope everyone is doing well. Chair, you guys are all  
15 muted.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We are waiting for Chair  
17 Dromm to return, which should be quite eminent.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Sounds good, thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I am back.

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Danny. I  
21 apologize.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No, me too, I was on the  
23 phone.

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 86

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, so we are good.  
3 We are the ones that are late, so it is good. No  
4 accountability, no accountability.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No, we're not so bad. We're  
6 seven minutes late, so we're okay.

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I know you are busy, that's  
9 for sure.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, alright, alright.  
11 Sergeant, I guess, whenever you guys are ready, we  
12 are ready to go.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: This is Chief Sergeant at Arms  
14 Rafael Perez. Chairs we are ready to start whenever  
15 you are. You can go right ahead, we are live.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.  
17 Good afternoon and welcome to the City Council's  
18 second day of hearings on the Mayor's Executive  
19 Budget for Fiscal '22. My name is Daniel Dromm and I  
20 Chair the Finance Committee. [COUGHS] Excuse me.

21 We are joined by the Committee on Sanitation and  
22 Solid Waste Chaired by my colleague Council Member  
23 Reynoso. We are also joined by several Council  
24 Members and I will announce them shortly. We just  
25 heard from the Department of Housing Preservation and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
2 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 87

3 Development and we will now hear from the Department  
4 of Sanitation. In the interest of time, I will  
5 forego an opening statement and ask Chair Reynoso to  
6 make his opening statement. Chair Reynoso?

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much Chair  
8 Dromm. I want to just thank you for everything you  
9 are doing. I know it is a grueling marathon and you  
10 are doing a great job. So, I really appreciate the  
11 time that you are taking and your leadership on the  
12 work that's happening here and in the budget  
13 negotiating team. So, thank you so much Chair Dromm.

14 Good afternoon everyone. I am Antonio Reynoso,  
15 the Chair of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid  
16 Waste Management. Today, we will hear from the  
17 Department of Sanitation on its Fiscal 2022 Executive  
18 Budget which totals \$1.83 billion dollars. I do  
19 appreciate that some items the Council called for in  
20 the Fiscal 2022 Budget - sorry, the allergies are  
21 kicking our butts. Response or restored. However,  
22 many items were not, even despite DSNY receiving  
23 federal funding. These restorations should have been  
24 prioritized when DSNY was talking with the City's  
25 Office of Management and Budget. We need to do  
better by New Yorkers, especially as we come out on

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 88

the other side of the pandemic and ensure that this  
city is the cleanest and greenest it could be.

I look forward to having a discussion with you on  
that today Commissioner and thank you and I will turn  
it back to Chair Dromm. And I am sorry, Minority  
Leader Matteo, do you want to speak at the opening?

Okay, sorry, your hand was up. Okay, alright.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: As Chair Dromm is not hear,  
he was about to ask me to swear in DSNY.

Thank you. My name is Noah Brick and I am  
Counsel to the New York City Council Committee on  
Finance. Before we begin, I want to remind everyone  
that you will be on mute until you are recognized to  
speak, at which time you will be unmuted by the Zoom  
host. If you mute yourself after you have been  
unmuted, you will need to be unmuted again by the  
host.

Please be aware that there could be a delay in  
muting and unmuting, so please be patient. During  
this portion of today's hearing, we will hear  
testimony from the Department of Sanitation. During  
the hearing, if Council Members would like to ask  
questions, please follow the example of Minority  
Leader Matteo and use the Zoom raise hand function

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 89

2 and you will be called upon to speak. We will be  
3 limiting Council Member questions to five minutes  
4 including responses.

5 I will now administer the affirmation to the  
6 Administration witnesses one time. I will then ask  
7 each witness to so affirm. Do you affirm that your  
8 testimony will be truthful to the best of your  
9 knowledge, information and belief? Commissioner  
10 Grayson?

11 EDWARD GRAYSON: I do.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Commissioner Ceraulo?

13 SALVATORE CERAULO: I do.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Mr. Anderson?

15 GREGORY ANDERSON: I do.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Commissioner  
17 Grayson, you may begin when ready.

18 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you. Good afternoon  
19 Chairs Dromm, Chair Reynoso and members of the City  
20 Council on Finance and Sanitation and Solid Waste  
21 Management. I am Edward Grayson, Commissioner of the  
22 New York City Department of Sanitation. Thank you  
23 for the opportunity to discuss the Department's  
24 Fiscal Year 2022 Executive Budget.

1 With me this afternoon are First Deputy  
2 Commissioner Salvatore Ceraulo and Gregory Anderson,  
3 the Deputy Commissioner for Policy and External  
4 Affairs. At the Department of Sanitation, our  
5 mission is to keep New York City healthy, safe and  
6 clean by collecting, recycling and disposing of  
7 waste, cleaning streets and vacant lots and clearing  
8 snow and ice. The men and women of this Department  
9 provide critical services to all New Yorkers,  
10 services that help make our city a thriving, vibrant  
11 place to live.  
12

13 The last fourteen months presented challenges to  
14 this city unlike any others that we have encountered  
15 before and I couldn't be prouder of how our  
16 Department employees rose to the occasion and  
17 continue to meet the needs of over 8.5 million city  
18 residents. Throughout the pandemic, COVID-19 did not  
19 stop refuse and recycling from being generated or the  
20 snow from falling. Department employees were out  
21 there collecting material from every household and  
22 plowing snow and salting roads during the winter in  
23 order to keep New York City's wheels turning.

24 We are encouraged by the city's improved fiscal  
25 outlook and we are active partners in the New York

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 91

1 City's Recovery for All. Our agency's proposed  
2 budget stands in a vastly different place today than  
3 it did when I testified before the Council in March.  
4 I am pleased that the Mayor has announced several  
5 service restorations and new programs to help us  
6 advance our mission and I look forward to continuing  
7 to work with the Council, other elected officials and  
8 community leaders, our sister agencies in government  
9 and the residents of our great city to improve the  
10 quality of life in neighborhoods across the five  
11 boroughs.  
12

13 The Department's FY '22 Executive Budget includes  
14 \$1.83 billion in expense funds that will allow us to  
15 deliver services across the city. And these funds  
16 include: \$832 million for the Bureau of Cleaning and  
17 Collection for household refuse, recycling and  
18 organics collection, litter basket collection, street  
19 cleaning and other core operational functions; \$538  
20 million for solid waste management operations,  
21 including waste export contracts, the operation of  
22 city-owned transfer stations and the closure of Fresh  
23 Kills landfill; \$136 million for support services,  
24 including buildings maintenance, engineering and  
25 fleet services; \$89 million for the snow budget to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 92

support snow removal planning and operations; \$70  
million for recycling and zero waste programs,  
including recycling processing costs, education,  
outreach and the operation of non-curbside waste  
diversion programs; \$21 million for enforcement of  
street cleaning and recycling laws; \$141 million for  
administration, centralized purchasing, information  
technology and other programs.

The FY 2022 Budget also includes restored and  
some new funding items and readjustments in the  
expense budget. These include: \$33.1 million for  
restored and expanded zero waste programs; \$12.4  
million for service restorations and other new  
programs to keep New York City clean; \$4.0 million  
for the implementation of our commercial waste zone  
program; and \$4.0 million to restore a proposed cut  
associated with Sunday security at our facilities.

In addition, the budget also includes \$33 million  
in additional funds for waste export and recycling  
processing in our Fiscal Year 2022 to account for  
changes in the contractual obligations and increases  
in material collected. DSNY also has authorization  
to proceed with the hiring a substantial number of  
new Sanitation Workers to replace the reduction in

1 headcount over the past year due to attrition and the  
2 hiring freeze. This will enable us to provide  
3 necessary staffing for the increased level of service  
4 and new and restored programs. We expect the first  
5 hiring class to begin this July, and we are currently  
6 planning to hire 700 new uniformed employees.  
7

8 The Department's proposed ten-year capital plan  
9 for Fiscal Year 2022 to 2031 is \$3.4 billion and  
10 includes: \$1.9 billion for capital equipment  
11 purchase, including collection trucks, mechanical  
12 brooms, salt spreaders and support equipment; \$1.2  
13 billion for garage rehabilitation and new garage  
14 construction; \$156 million for maintenance and  
15 construction of solid waste management facilities;  
16 and \$50 million for information technology and  
17 communications systems, including hardware.

18 In the four-year plan, the Department is funded  
19 to advance several major facility improvement  
20 projects including: Continuing construction of the  
21 new Brooklyn Three District Garage; Continuing  
22 construction of the new Sanitation District One and  
23 Three Combination Garage; Designing and constructing  
24 a new Queens District 1 Garage; And entirely  
25 reconstructing the Bronx 9, 10 and 11 garage complex;

1 Rehabilitating Queens Districts 11 and 13 Garage, the  
2 Queens Districts 8, 10 and 12 Garage complex, the  
3 Brooklyn District 6 Garage, and the Bronx District 6  
4 Garage; as well as fully renovating a newly-acquired  
5 site for the Manhattan 11 District garage.  
6

7 With New York City getting back on its feet, New  
8 Yorkers deserve to put their best feet forward on  
9 clean streets. And I am thrilled to have joined  
10 Mayor in March to announce the roll-out of three  
11 initiatives aimed at cleaning up streets amid the  
12 COVID 19 pandemic. First, the Department has restored  
13 baseline funding for litter basket collections,  
14 adding more than 100 dedicated litter basket trucks  
15 weekly and restoring Sunday and holiday litter basket  
16 collection. Specifically, the budget includes \$4.5  
17 million for weekday basket service and \$4.6 million  
18 for Sunday and holiday service.

19 With these restorations, litter basket collection  
20 service has increased by 61 percent compared to where  
21 we were last July. As the weather gets warmer and  
22 more people spend their time outdoors in the city as  
23 it reopens, this additional service will contribute  
24 to cleaner streets and improved quality of life for  
25 our communities.

1  
2 The Department of Sanitation has also created the  
3 all-new Precision Cleaning Initiative, with borough-  
4 based teams to conduct targeted cleanings of litter  
5 conditions, illegal dumping and overflowing litter  
6 baskets. These conditions are eyesores that affect  
7 New Yorkers' quality of life and threaten New York  
8 City's recovery. Teams are dispatched based on DSNY  
9 field observations, 311 complaints and referrals from  
10 other city agencies and community groups. The budget  
11 includes \$2.9 million in FY22 to fund this  
12 initiative. We have also restored our dedicated  
13 syringe litter staff within the Environmental Police  
14 Unit to conduct proactive patrols in areas with the  
15 highest concentrations of syringe litter.

16 These six dedicated officers are specially  
17 trained to properly handle syringes and other  
18 hazardous waste. Additionally, the Department has  
19 introduced a Community Clean-Up Van to support  
20 neighborhood cleanups across the city. The  
21 Department provides support for residents and  
22 community-based groups who volunteer to do litter  
23 pick-ups in their neighborhoods. The Department  
24 lends tools, trash bags, masks, brooms and dustpans  
25 to volunteers and can now deliver these tools

1 directly to the volunteers through the new community  
2 clean-up van. We encourage all New Yorkers to chip  
3 in and help us keep New York City clean.

4  
5 Last year's Sanitation budget cuts hit many  
6 communities hard during the pandemic. I am confident  
7 that these initiatives will go a long way toward  
8 improving cleanliness in our neighborhoods and  
9 improving the quality of life for all New Yorkers.

10 Just a few weeks ago, I testified before the  
11 Sanitation Committee and reaffirmed the Department's  
12 commitment to working to achieve zero waste goals.  
13 On Earth Day, I joined Mayor de Blasio to announce  
14 several new and restored zero waste initiatives to  
15 help jumpstart our renewed commitment to those goals.  
16 New York City will restart its residential curbside  
17 composting program, which was temporarily suspended  
18 last year due to the fiscal crisis. This new  
19 iteration of the program will be available to allow  
20 buildings and residents to sign up to receive free  
21 weekly curbside composting service.

22 Enrollment will open in August through an online  
23 form and via 311 and collection service will kick off  
24 in October and expand as more residents opt into this  
25 program. In addition to the re-launch of curbside

1 composting, we will significantly expand our food  
2 scrap drop-off program, from 128 community-based  
3 sites operating today to more than 200 sites this  
4 fall. We are committed to expanding access to these  
5 sites, including having at least one site in each  
6 community district. Growth of this program will be  
7 achieved via a restoration of GrowNYC's Greenmarket  
8 Composting program funding and the expansion of New  
9 York City Compost Project funding to support  
10 community-based drop-offs, composting and education.  
11

12 In addition, it will include first-of-its-kind  
13 pilot of smart bins, in which New Yorkers use an app  
14 to access public food scrap drop-off bins, thus  
15 preventing cross-contamination and misuse. Since the  
16 drop-off sites reopened last September, many food  
17 scrap drop-offs broke participation records and  
18 together they have diverted 1.5 million pounds of  
19 food scraps for composting. Doubling the current  
20 number of the food scrap drop off sites will  
21 significantly divert more food scraps from the trash.

22 New Yorkers can find their closest food scrap  
23 drop off site at [nyc.gov/dropfoodscraps](http://nyc.gov/dropfoodscraps). Potential  
24 partners can also learn more about hosting a drop off  
25 site and helping to spread the word about this

1 important program. School Curbside Composting  
2 service will also return in the 2021-2022 school year  
3 and nearly 1,000 schools that had service prior to  
4 COVID-19 will resume curbside composting. The  
5 Department will also reinstate fall leaf and yard  
6 waste collections later this year. Together, these  
7 programs represent an investment of \$30.5 million in  
8 new funding for composting and organic waste  
9 diversion in the Fiscal Year 2022. Relatedly, next  
10 month the Sanitation Foundation will host its 2021  
11 Food Waste Fair. The Fair, which is held every other  
12 year, is an interactive experience connecting food,  
13 beverage and hospitality professionals with the  
14 resources and education that they need to reach zero  
15 food waste in their businesses. Panels and hands-on  
16 workshops this year will be virtual. To learn more  
17 about the Food Waste Fair, visit: [foodwastefair.nyc](http://foodwastefair.nyc).  
18 Beyond composting, the Department will also restore  
19 or expand other Zero Waste programs. Our SAFE  
20 Disposal Events, which collect Solvents, Automotive,  
21 Flammables and Electronics products, as well as other  
22 household hazardous waste items, will restart this  
23 fall and will expand from ten events to nearly 60  
24 events per year, one in each community district.  
25

DSNY will also reopen our Special Waste Drop-off sites beginning in July. At these five sites, one located in each borough, residents can drop off harmful materials that do not belong in household trash. DSNY will begin offering Reuse Swap Events across the city to keep usable items out of landfills and help them find good new homes. At these events, one person's unwanted household goods can become another person's treasure. The Executive Budget includes an additional \$2.6 million in FY22 to support these special waste and reuse initiatives.

The commercial waste sector also plays an important role in achieving our zero waste goals. Commercial Waste Zones will create a safe and efficient collection system for commercial waste that provides high quality, low cost service to New York City businesses while advancing the city's zero waste and sustainability goals. The new system is expected to nearly double the commercial diversion rate for recyclables and organic waste. Following the delay due to the pandemic, the Department began the competitive procurement process by issuing Part One of a Request for Proposals in November of 2020. Part Two of the RFP, [COUGHS] Pardon me. Part One of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 100

RFP requested information from potential awardees to  
determine their ability to perform in accordance with  
specific business, character, financial and licensing  
requirements. Submissions for Part One were received  
by February 19<sup>th</sup> and are being reviewed.

This spring the Department is also promulgating  
several rules to implement to the program, including  
rules governing customer service, operations, health  
and safety, recycling and organics and other  
administrative requirements. In the next few months,  
the Department will also issue Part Two of the RFP to  
select the zone awardees. We expect the transition  
period to the new zone system to begin in 2022 and  
last up to two years. In FY22's Executive Budget  
provides \$4 million in funding to support the  
implementation of the Commercial Waste Zones. This  
includes funding for 28 new civilian staff in the  
coming year, as well as OTPS funds for implementation  
support, communications, outreach and IT systems. We  
look forward to working with the City Council and all  
stakeholders as we advance this important program to  
bring much-needed reform to the city's commercial  
waste sector.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 101

Keeping all of our neighborhoods healthy, safe  
and clean is critical for New York City's rebirth and  
we are excited to be a part of the citywide efforts  
to ensure a recovery for all of us.

In closing, I wish to thank Chair Dromm, Chair  
Reynoso and all the members of these two committees  
for your continuing support of our essential workers,  
our programs and our services. You are critical  
advocates as we work to keep New York City safe,  
healthy and clean and ensure the long-term  
sustainability of our communities.

We are grateful for your commitment and for your  
partnership. Thank you for this opportunity to  
testify this afternoon and my staff and I are now  
happy to answer the questions. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Commissioner  
Grayson. It's good to see you. On a personal note,  
I think I know your mother. Was she on Community  
Board 24?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, she was on District 24 back  
in the day and an active member of the Community  
Board. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I was a teacher in that  
district many years ago. I mean, while so 20 years

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 102

2 and I have been in the Council for the last 12. So,  
3 tell her I said hello.

4 EDWARD GRAYSON: I surely will, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, uh, the Mayor added  
6 back some funding for weekday and Sunday holiday  
7 litter basket service but it is still not enough. In  
8 the Council's budget response, we identified  
9 significant gaps in funding between Fiscal '20 and  
10 Fiscal '22 litter basket service levels. Even with  
11 the restoration in the Executive Plan, the gap still  
12 stands at about \$10 million. So, including the  
13 restoration in the Executive Plan for litter basket  
14 service, where are we in terms of truck shifts  
15 citywide for Fiscal '20 versus Fiscal '22?

16 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you for your question  
17 Chair. Yes, so both daily and Sunday basket  
18 collections have had increases to the baseline levels  
19 and that is overall a 60 percent increase from where  
20 we were last July. However, on the pre-COVID, we  
21 were running about 736 basket trucks per week and now  
22 we are running 440. So, we are about 300 basket  
23 truck shifts per week away from where we were pre-  
24 COVID, so FY20 levels.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 103

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, for where we are missing  
3 those basket pickups, will you be placing the cleanup  
4 crews in those areas? Is there anyway that that can  
5 be coordinated?

6 EDWARD GRAYSON: Uhm, so, yeah, I just want to be  
7 - the cleanup crews that we are running through our  
8 PCI Program?

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, like one of the things  
10 that we do with ACE and with the Dull fund is that  
11 they come and even though there might not be a basket  
12 pickup, they will remove the baskets and put it on  
13 the side. So, short of a basket pickup, I think it's  
14 still better if we have you know the bags taken out  
15 and tied up and put on the side.

16 So, is there any way that the cleanup initiative,  
17 I am forgetting which - Precision Cleaning  
18 Initiative, I think is what it's called, can be used  
19 in those areas where we are seeing you know fewer  
20 basket pickups.

21 EDWARD GRAYSON: Absolutely, so thankfully with  
22 the PCI teams, in addition to doing drop offs and  
23 strike team responses, as all of those have a  
24 temporal uncertainty. Meaning, if we get calls in  
25 response to a drop off, that drop off may take two

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 104

2 hours. It may take the whole day. We always divert  
3 to the local level to make maximum use of that crew  
4 that gets assigned and we are always looking to  
5 leverage those opportunities to keep the crews  
6 productive.

7       Additionally, we will be coordinating with all of  
8 the community-based organizations that are doing  
9 cleanups as well as try to do a championing of one of  
10 the other things that had dropped off because of the  
11 COVID-19 response and pandemic and just social  
12 interactions was our solicitation of our Adopt a  
13 Basket Partners with the local corner businesses. We  
14 are ramping up those efforts in earnest and that's  
15 not a funding need as we already had the baskets in  
16 supply but it was more of an implementation because  
17 of COVID restrictions and trying to limit the  
18 interactions. However, that is part of our plan to  
19 make sure that we are providing additional access to  
20 have a partner. I couldn't agree with you more, the  
21 more partners we have, the easier it is for us to  
22 work with you know the landscape.

23       CHAIRPERSON DROMM: When you talk about community  
24 organizations, are you talking about organizations

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 105

1 like Wild Cat, ACE, Dull Fund, is that what you are  
2 talking about?  
3

4 EDWARD GRAYSON: Well, yes, we also, we want to  
5 make sure that even as we continue to do at the  
6 planning stages of where the new cleanup corps are  
7 going to be, we intend to know where the local  
8 stakeholder organizations that are doing cleanups and  
9 the other city agencies that are doing cleanups, they  
10 are going to be generating material in some cases.  
11 And our role in that is make sure that we know where  
12 they are so we can coordinate the backend pickup once  
13 they are done with whatever their response operations  
14 are for the day.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, great thank you  
16 Commissioner. What's the average street and sidewalk  
17 cleanliness rating citywide? What was it in 2020 and  
18 what is the rating in the current Fiscal Year?

19 EDWARD GRAYSON: We are down about - this year,  
20 Fiscal Year to date, we are 93.4, 93.5 and we are  
21 about between three and four basis points you know  
22 with every new month that comes on in Delta. I am  
23 hopeful since we restored some of the services that  
24 we were able to do.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 106

1 April, we just got the April ratings for this  
2 current fiscal year. It's back up to a 95 but we  
3 have definitely seen an impact on street cleanliness  
4 ratings and litter in the street and we are very  
5 hopeful that the new programs and the restorations  
6 will help us get that number moving in the right  
7 direction.  
8

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. The  
10 Executive Plan also includes \$2.8 million in Fiscal  
11 '22 for the Precision Cleaning Initiative. Do you  
12 have a staffing breakdown for that by borough of the  
13 dispatch team headcount that will be responding to  
14 litter issues?

15 EDWARD GRAYSON: Well, our headcount assigned for  
16 that— so, we are budgeted to pick up 31 sanitation  
17 workers and six supervisors which is going to account  
18 for about nine crews per day. This is a citywide  
19 team, so we are going to have a dispatch unit for  
20 each borough. We are trying to work with these  
21 assets to be able to respond very quickly to the  
22 popup events. We have definitely seen an increase in  
23 dumping. We have definitely seen an increase in a  
24 few eye sore conditions that came directly related to  
25 behavior changes throughout COVID and the dynamic for

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 107

2 that is to make sure that we can respond quickly  
3 without diverting from these other restored  
4 functions.

5 So, what we don't want to do is take one of these  
6 basket trucks that we have restored and have to cut  
7 them away from dedicated litter basket service. So,  
8 these additional crews, it's going to be about nine  
9 crews per week. They work on a boroughwide basis  
10 responding as needs pop up to these hotspots and  
11 doing interactions with quality of life concerns and  
12 it's going to be about 54 truck shifts per week.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And you mentioned some  
14 behavior changes with COVID. I have seen it also. I  
15 think that's what we can attribute it to. You know,  
16 I don't think that you know places like uptown or  
17 midtown Manhattan got as dirty as some of the  
18 neighborhoods like Jackson Heights Elmhurst, which -  
19 because people were not going into work, you saw more  
20 people out in the neighborhood. And including you  
21 know masks and gloves and things like that that were  
22 being thrown on the ground.

23 So, I am glad that you recognize that as well.  
24 Do you have any estimate on the response times that  
25 you are able to share today if somebody calls

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 108

1 something in or it is reported that you know, there  
2 is a mess here, how long would it take to get  
3 somebody out to take care of it?  
4

5 EDWARD GRAYSON: Usually we do very well with  
6 regard to responding to the critical needs but that  
7 is also a temporal. So, we can, I can circle back  
8 with you and I don't mean to delay the answer. Right  
9 now, we have been running the program for a short  
10 period of time. Again, it depends on what we are  
11 responding to. Sometimes we will get, our key thing  
12 is we get response on all the complaints within 24  
13 hours where we have an estimation of how we can  
14 respond. If we have a crew that can get there and  
15 pick it up quickly, if it is something that is a  
16 minor condition that is only, let's say going to take  
17 an hour or two to resolve, we will be there very  
18 quickly.

19 Some of the conditions as you have seen, you  
20 know, a huge dump out condition or a launched fence  
21 line or an encampment, we may have to wait for a  
22 coordinating agency for a response. Or we may have  
23 to just bring in heavy equipment which may take a day  
24 or two. So, it's varying depending on the need.  
25 It's a little bit of a fluid on the timeline.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 109

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and recently  
3 the Mayor announced the launch of the City Cleanup  
4 Corp, I think you mentioned that in your testimony as  
5 well. Has there been any discussion between your  
6 agency and the agencies overseeing this initiative  
7 regarding cleaning strategy and of those 10,000  
8 workers?

9 EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, we have definitely been on  
10 all the coordinating calls. We look forward to the  
11 relief. So, it is a definite stimulus funded  
12 advancement to try to get as many people out there to  
13 do quality of life concerns, graffiti, light litter,  
14 areas where they can do so some improvement in parks  
15 and other places.

16 So, we have definitely been on the coordinating  
17 calls just to make sure because again, as this ramps  
18 up and gets into full fruition, we have a backend  
19 responsibility to try to also make sure that we are  
20 meeting up with the material that they generate as  
21 they beautify the city.

22 So, we are excited, uhm, that this is going to  
23 happen. Naturally, the quicker we can get boots on  
24 the ground, cleaning up the city, the better in a  
25 place we will all be on this temporary restoration,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 110

2 you know this amazing program. And we are looking  
3 forward to work you know with all the stakeholders.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, will these  
5 10,000 workers, how are you going to hire them and  
6 how will people find out about hiring practices?

7 EDWARD GRAYSON: So, excellent point. They can -  
8 there is a definite outreach plan. We are not  
9 directly hiring, so it isn't like it's a Department  
10 of Sanitation job. It is going to be a between -  
11 that headcount is presumed between partnerships with  
12 organizations like you said. Dull Fund and Wild Cat  
13 and others who we will be bringing in. It's a  
14 collaborative event. It's not just city onboarding  
15 and we are working with those stakeholders to see  
16 where we land in that.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Great, okay, that's really  
18 good to hear, thank you. The Fiscal '22 Executive  
19 Plan includes \$509.1 million in federal funding for  
20 Fiscal '22. That was swapped with city tax levy  
21 funding, which is approximately 28 percent of DSNY's  
22 budget. Have you received any further direction from  
23 the City's Office of Management and Budget as to what  
24 this funding may be used for?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 111

2 EDWARD GRAYSON: We're still working with OMB and  
3 not that we are because we are, we are going to use  
4 our piece of the federal stimulus money to help fund  
5 core functions as they relate. The upside of the  
6 stimulus money is that for now, some of it is going  
7 to our export costs. Some of it is going to other  
8 core functions.

9 The freedom to be able to use the money and OMB's  
10 guidance for every category that it helps offset the  
11 tax levy does free up agency funds to then go do  
12 these service restorations. So, we are still  
13 finalizing every place we can put it for now. It's  
14 going to some core services, a lot of it in export.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I think for the Council, one  
16 of our priorities is for the cleaning restorations as  
17 well. So, I just wanted to let you know that that is  
18 definitely one of our priorities.

19 EDWARD GRAYSON: Understood Chair and we are  
20 continuing our discussions as we advance with OMB.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and how will  
22 the surge of federal money impact the agencies budget  
23 in the long term? Might this negatively impact the  
24 agencies baseline budget.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 112

1  
2 EDWARD GRAYSON: Uhm, I think that in the long  
3 term, this influx, it's going to be able to help us  
4 get back into some severe retrenchment on services  
5 and more importantly behavior as we get to restore  
6 some core functions and as we particularly on our  
7 zero waste goals, I think that now that we are able  
8 to introduce thanks to some of the federal offset,  
9 having funding and having a commitment from Council  
10 and the Administration to move forward, I think that  
11 we are going to be in a better place having had it.  
12 I don't see a long-term negative by us adopting this.  
13 I think we are going to do smart budgeting and  
14 continue to work with Council and Administration and  
15 end in a really good place.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Commissioner again.  
17 I want to turn it over to Chair Reynoso and then I  
18 think there will be some Council Member questions as  
19 well. Chair Reynoso?

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Chair Dromm.  
21 Commissioner, hi by the way. I just wanted to say  
22 hi, I hope you are doing well.

23 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you, thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I wanted to ask uhm,  
25 composting. Like, the investment that's being made

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 113

1 for composting this year is similar to the years  
2 prior to COVID when we had the pilot programs in the  
3 City of New York. Can you talk to me about what the  
4 budget looked like for composting prior to COVID and  
5 what it looks like now and what the differences are?  
6 Because if we are spending the same amount of money,  
7 why not just do a pickup service with rounds in the  
8 padded areas the way we had it before.  
9

10 EDWARD GRAYSON: So, uhm, yes, uh very, very good  
11 points. I want to say that as we work towards  
12 restorations, I am just thrilled that we were able to  
13 get something out there on the curbside composting  
14 side. You know as we originally, we were not talking  
15 about doing anything on the curbside composting and  
16 being back out on the residential pickup schedule  
17 until FY22.

18 For us, it isn't really a question of the money  
19 it cost to reinstitute the program. At this point,  
20 the program that we are able to get out, this opting  
21 program toward the existing districts is really an  
22 implementation reality for us. It's the most  
23 aggressive plan that we could do the most good with  
24 by targeting all of the residents and apartment  
25 owners who are in these community boards who are

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS

114

interested in the program. It gives us an  
opportunity to draw on their expression of interest,  
work to meet the needs of those who are truly  
committed to composting as well as our own zero waste  
goals. And more importantly, be able to run the  
appropriate amount of truck shifts for the most  
outcome.

So, I agree with you, we are putting money in to  
trying to do outreach, trying to expand local  
awareness, expand our network of neighborhood  
composters, expand the drop off sites and even our  
safe events. Having that more awareness out for our  
zero waste goals. And I think that our ability to go  
out under this proposal and do an opt in program  
gives us the best usage so we can continue to work  
with yourself and Council to where we need to be  
leading into an FY23 much more robust curbside  
program, which I know you are well aware of is going  
to be completely vital to us pushing through and  
getting to a zero waste outcome.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And that's actually my  
biggest concern Commissioner is that we know to get  
to zero waste, we need this compost program to be  
mandatory and to be citywide. And it seems like

2 every time we have a conversation about compost, we  
3 are either taking a step back or taking a long time  
4 to push it forward. Eventually, the Department of  
5 Sanitation has to be committed to get to zero waste  
6 and composts you know being 33 percent or about one-  
7 third of the waste that we have in our system, I just  
8 don't feel like in the eight years I have been here  
9 that we have taken it serious.

10 To make the progress that we're making, since the  
11 zero waste announcement that right now we are having  
12 an opt in version only in the piloted areas of  
13 organics does not speak to progress or a commitment  
14 to zero waste. So, it's a big concern for me  
15 Commissioner and I just don't think we are taking it  
16 seriously enough.

17 I wanted to ask about federal funding. The  
18 federal government gave us \$509 million and the  
19 funding was swapped in lieu of city tax levy dollars.  
20 And this is exactly what I am talking about when I  
21 talk about the compost program. The \$509 million is  
22 not what we need for composting citywide. But it's  
23 money that we have right now that the federal  
24 government gave us specifically for sanitation  
25 services. And what the city is doing is taking the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 116

2 money from the federal government that we have,  
3 putting it inside our budget and then removing the  
4 money that we do have already and arguably moving it  
5 somewhere else.

6 So, I want to ask two questions. This \$509  
7 million. Do we have a commitment from the  
8 Administration that all of the money that came from  
9 the federal government for sanitation will be for  
10 sanitation? So, I expect your budget to increase by  
11 \$509 million in Fiscal Year 2022.

12 And two, why not use that money to do the hard  
13 work of the composting program which is the initial  
14 work that is going to be very expensive? Why not do  
15 that with this money in an effort to see results two,  
16 three, four years down the line that make it more  
17 efficient and more affordable?

18 EDWARD GRAYSON: I am absolutely thrilled that we  
19 have the opportunity to be discussing this infusion  
20 of federal money. You know last September when I was  
21 appointed as Acting Commissioner. When we were  
22 talking about – we were talking about laying off city  
23 employees and retrenching even further.

24 So, the fact that we are not at this place where  
25 the city's recovery is in effect and we expect you

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 117

2 know a boost thanks to the stimulus funds that came  
3 in, it's amazing that we are able to you know look to  
4 offset and make the best usage of it.

5 To your exact point sir, we continue to work with  
6 OMB to ensure that we are maximizing the use of  
7 federal funds and to that end, I am thrilled to have  
8 federal stimulus funding but we are working to make  
9 sure that we are using it to their best usage on  
10 where it fits in, where we are going to get, what  
11 qualifies for recovery act money, what qualifies for  
12 FEMA funding.

13 You know we are running a lot of different  
14 programs that have a different bucket that they could  
15 be put in and we are still working with the  
16 administration to make sure that we are getting the  
17 best evaluation for not just our agency but also as  
18 it fits into the overall city's economic outline.

19 So, those discussions are ongoing. I agree with  
20 you. I am thrilled that we can restore a lot of the  
21 functions and I am absolutely thrilled with we are  
22 able to offer the opt in program solely because we  
23 had nothing planned. It's definitely one step in the  
24 right direction and now we can really target organics  
25 collection particularly in the residential areas to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 118

2 the clientele and the constituents that want it and  
3 want to get directly involved so we can start the  
4 diverting as much as possible from the buyer and the  
5 stakeholders who are already bought in while we  
6 continue our outreach plan. I know you're a big  
7 advocate for outreach and making people you know  
8 completely invested in the outcome of the waste  
9 stream and I think we get a chance to do that  
10 thankfully because we have this infusion of the  
11 stimulus funds that gives us some freed up latitude  
12 to you know get back into the street.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah but Commissioner, I am  
14 not satisfied with you know to wait for a 500 record,  
15 right? Like, I want to be clear that just getting  
16 back to 500 is not a victory. We are supposed to be  
17 recovering and this money is supposed to help us  
18 build back better, not build back the same. And what  
19 I see with this \$509 million is an opportunity to get  
20 to the playoffs and instead, we are just satisfied  
21 with getting to 500. It's just not how I think we  
22 should be working and I think what's going to happen  
23 is that you are - they are going to use this \$509  
24 million and move it somewhere else. It is going to  
25 go to other programs, to other agencies and is going

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 119

1 to be moved away from the Department of Sanitation  
2 that has a lot of needs. So, I am going to be very  
3 clear that I am going to and Commissioner, I mean  
4 Chair Dromm, I want you to know I am going to have  
5 huge issues with this budget. If this \$509 million  
6 that we have extra on top of the money that is  
7 supposed to exist in the City of New York already or  
8 city tax levy dollars, I expect it to go all to the  
9 Department of Sanitation.  
10

11 Other agencies got money just the same as the  
12 Department of Sanitation. The housing depart- HPD  
13 got money. The Health & Hospitals got money.  
14 Everyone has their money. Why is it that the money  
15 for the Department of Sanitation gets taken away and  
16 gets sent somewhere else? Do you know where that  
17 money is right now Commissioner Grayson? That \$509  
18 million, where is it right now?

19 EDWARD GRAYSON: Right now it is in a budget line  
20 item. It's sitting safely on a spreadsheet. I wish  
21 I had it, I would love to see it in person too. Just  
22 once I would like to see a brick of money like that  
23 but just so I can see it.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I hear you. I hear you.  
25 So, we are working on that. I just want the rest of

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 120

2 my colleagues to know that I hope that they join me  
3 in the budget negotiating conversations. This is  
4 money that the federal government gave us to do right  
5 by the Department of Sanitation and what's happening  
6 is that the Mayor is literally taking \$509 million  
7 away from the Department of Sanitation, inserting the  
8 federal money and then taking that money that was  
9 city tax levy dollars and using it for something  
10 else. It's just a swap and we end up not gaining  
11 anything and I am really concerned about that. And I  
12 want my colleagues to ask questions, so I am just  
13 going to ask one more and then get back to a second  
14 round, so that they can get to questions.

15 We had a great day when we saw the first electric  
16 truck - I believe in all of the world but the first  
17 electric collection truck. Not collection truck,  
18 sweeper, street sweeper but I see that in the budget,  
19 we have a ton of money to add collection trucks and  
20 sweepers that are not electric. I just want to know  
21 that the capacity of these companies that exist  
22 oversees have to build faster and whether or not the  
23 city is investing in infrastructure to be able to  
24 charge these electric vehicles in your garages and  
25 why we are not just buying straight electric? Why

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 121

2 are we even talking about diesel and just want to  
3 have a conversation with you about how fast we can  
4 move to this electricity.

5 EDWARD GRAYSON: Great question and it was  
6 amazing for you to join us from the unveil. The  
7 first of its kind full size, fully electric  
8 mechanical sweeper. We are very excited about the  
9 technology and where it can go and yes, we also have  
10 an all-electric reloading collection truck, which we  
11 are looking to expand. We have one in use right now  
12 and we are looking to have another you know seven  
13 coming to the fleet but you bring up a very good  
14 point. It's not just the ability for manufacturers  
15 to manufacture the equipment, which is still on  
16 production line. That broom that you saw was custom  
17 built to meet our specifications and needs and also,  
18 so clearly it's to get to a place where all these  
19 large scale heavy fleet manufacturers are scalable on  
20 a production line and I think that they are building  
21 towards that.

22 The various stakeholders in the heavy fleet game,  
23 as they build towards electrified fleet it's  
24 everybody, every municipality. Everybody wants to be  
25 there. It's the wave of the future. We are

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 122

2 certainly going to look on and to continue advancing  
3 working with DCAS, working with all the stakeholders  
4 NYSERDA and the various parts to make sure that we  
5 are doing everything we can to cut our greenhouse gas  
6 footprint and also meet the electrification of the  
7 agency by 2040. What our main concern is and I thank  
8 you for the question is, the infrastructure and our  
9 facilities being able to host the load and the  
10 charging stations and the physical plant  
11 modifications that will be needed as we advance.

12 So, I think it's a much larger issue and a much  
13 larger discussion because I can tell you that from  
14 the Departments points of view, we want to be leaders  
15 in electrification. We will clearly need to look at  
16 physical plant and space as well as electrical load  
17 and upgrades throughout our facilities, throughout  
18 our network to be able to host a fully electrified  
19 fleet and we are not there today.

20 So, that is our goal to be ready and we are  
21 working on a small study right now with our partners  
22 at DCAS to look at electrification requirements at a  
23 few of our garages and we expect that to continue on  
24 working with the administration, this Council and  
25 others but it is a two prong thing that has to happen

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 123

2 as we move forward on electrification particularly  
3 only speaking from my department. We need to figure  
4 out how we are going to host all the charting  
5 stations and then begin the procurement lifecycle  
6 change over as those assets become available in mass  
7 or for production lines with vendors that we can have  
8 a good relationship with.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Commissioner. I  
10 got more questions but I will get them in the second  
11 round. I want to allow for my Council Members to ask  
12 questions, so thank you so much for that and uh,  
13 Sergeant, whenever you are ready, we can start  
14 calling on the members.

15 I do have to acknowledge the members, I am sorry.  
16 We have been joined by Council Member Chin, Minority  
17 Leader Matteo, Council Member Adams, Council Member  
18 Rosenthal, Council Member Brannan, Council Member  
19 Cabrera, Council Member Ampry-Samuel, Council Member  
20 Menchaca, Council Member Louis, Council Member Ayala,  
21 Council Member Koslowitz and I think I got everyone,  
22 if not, I am pretty sure Chair Dromm will clean it up  
23 for me but thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I think you did pretty good.  
25 So, let's go back to Counsel.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 124

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I think you did well. Uhm,  
3 we are now up to Council Member questions. If you  
4 have any questions for Department of Sanitation,  
5 please use the Zoom raise hand function and you will  
6 be added to the queue. Council Members, please keep  
7 your questions to five minutes, including answers.  
8 Please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to tell you when  
9 your time begins. The Sergeant will then let you  
10 know when your time is up.

11 We will now hear from the Minority Leader  
12 followed by Council Member Chin.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you.

15 Commissioner, how are you? Hope everyone is well. I  
16 want to talk about E-waste, a very popular program  
17 that I partner with Katherine Garcia and Chair  
18 Reynoso. In October of 2016, we started in Staten  
19 Island. A year later we went to Brooklyn and Western  
20 Queens, we expanded that also to the Bronx. In  
21 Staten Island had 42,000 appointments, 80,000 items  
22 picked up. Citywide 92,000 appointments, 151,000  
23 items collected. I think the cost for the Staten  
24 Island program is \$1 million. I think the cost for  
25 the expansion is \$3.5 million.

2 So, it's an extremely important program for us  
3 here in Staten Island. Actually, my team has picked  
4 it up here in Staten Island and we are picking up any  
5 waste and working with your crew. I just want to  
6 give a good shout out to Dan Stein my Borough Chief  
7 and his crew that are extremely responsive. But the  
8 E-waste program is extremely important to us here in  
9 Staten Island and I believe it should be expanded  
10 citywide and made permanent. So, a little  
11 disappointed that so far it is not in the budget. I  
12 just want to ask you what your thoughts are and how  
13 you know I would really, really like to get this in  
14 the budget. It's extremely important to us here in  
15 Staten Island and citywide.

16 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Councilman and your  
17 partnership and the fact that you were there to help  
18 build this incredible program, I couldn't agree with  
19 your more. The E-waste residential program is a  
20 great service for all New Yorkers and in fairness,  
21 also couldn't agree with you more that, what a  
22 terrible time in history to have to cut it. Meaning  
23 we asked all of New Yorkers to pause and work from  
24 home and more and more of our constituents and  
25 residents created more e-waste by upgrading how many

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 126

2 people had to get a second screen for the house or  
3 onboard some new technology to keep their kids  
4 educated and we had this additional increase in what  
5 the e-waste stream would be, only to have no  
6 residential curbside pickup.

7 So, I agree with you. I do, I agree with you.  
8 It's a program that we advocate for. It was  
9 certainly on our request. I would have liked to have  
10 seen it restored. That's just the truth, that's my  
11 opinion. I am the Sanitation Commissioner and I do  
12 not like the idea of e-waste being out there  
13 uncollected. The only thing I am also happy about  
14 though is with our expansion of the safe events. At  
15 least one of the outcomes to that in addition to the  
16 stewardship programs that the stores are required to  
17 take back e-waste and some e-cycle programs that we  
18 have that you know the big, you know large scale  
19 buildings can be a part of.

20 The upside is that at the safe events that we  
21 expanded, it does provide at least one opportunity,  
22 at least one for having to go in their own community  
23 district to now that will take it as well as the  
24 reopening of our special waste sites. We will give  
25 some extra opportunity for residents but I agree that

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 127

the curbside E-waste program is very valuable and  
again, I thank you for being a leader in that the  
entire time.

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: My pleasure and you  
know, it's not an expensive program. It's honestly a  
no brainer for at least us on the Council side to  
push to restore it. So, I am going to push to  
restore that. You know, we are going around, we're  
picking them up from seniors and working with your  
staff and uhm, they're also dropping it off to us at  
a certain site. So, but extremely popular I  
understand now and it is extremely needed and the way  
we did it with the appointments and everything was  
done within two weeks, a really, really well run  
program that I think it is imperative that we get  
back to Staten Island and the other parts but also  
that we expand and make permanent citywide.

So, I will be pushing for that in the budget and  
I appreciate your support and anything you can do on  
your end that I appreciate.

You know, the budget was extremely tough on  
Sanitation last year. A lot of quality of life  
stuff. Just one other thing I want to mention, I  
allocated money out of you know, out of our funding

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 128

1 for Sunday pickups in my district and I was happy to  
2 do it to pick it up because I think it's necessary.  
3  
4 With that said, you know I am a term limited Council  
5 Member, so I just want to make sure that my district  
6 is under review for sanitation to pick it up when we  
7 have the full restoration and because I have been  
8 funding it out of my discretionary funds. So, I just  
9 want to make sure that it is on the radar that my  
10 district, while it is being funded, it's being funded  
11 through my end, so I just ask that moving forward  
12 that uhm, look to fund it from the budgets priority.

13 EDWARD GRAYSON: Understood, thank you sir.

14 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you and thanks for  
15 everything. Thank you Chairs.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next, we have  
17 Council Member Chin followed by Council Member Adams.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Thank you  
20 Chair. Uhm, thank you Commissioner, it is great to  
21 see you again. It wasn't that long ago the  
22 Preliminary Budget and we are glad to see you know  
23 some of the really good programs got restored like,  
24 you know the Neighborhood Composting and it is great  
25 to hear that more sites will be opened up. And I

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 129

2 think that's really such a you know terrific program.

3 Because I started composting because it was close by  
4 and one of the farmers market, I'm not really a big  
5 farmers market but it was a composting site and we  
6 need more of that throughout different neighborhoods  
7 in the city and people want to participate. Just  
8 that those sites or bin have to be available.

9 In your testimony, you talk about an app. I  
10 think that's great for a lot of the young people who  
11 are tech savvy, that they can participate. So, I am  
12 really looking forward to that. In the budget you  
13 know one of the things that I remember uhm, at a  
14 press conference with the Mayor a couple years back  
15 about you know getting rid of rats and really  
16 concentrating on these rat mitigation zone and there  
17 was no money put in the executive budget.

18 I think that as the city opens back up, you know  
19 we want to make sure that the neighborhood that  
20 benefited from this program, don't get inundated with  
21 rats again. You know, so I think that we need to  
22 really continue with that program. And my question  
23 is that, in the needs that we saw in the Executive  
24 Budget, there was increased money in the waste export  
25 and recycling process.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 130

2 I mean, we do spend a lot of money doing that.

3 The recycling part is good but why are we spending so  
4 much money? \$56.9 million to export our waste to  
5 other areas and I guess, looking at that is we do  
6 more recycling or more composting. Wouldn't that  
7 help decrease the exports of waste you know with our  
8 target of zero waste. Because a lot of the waste is  
9 organic. I mean in different households. That's  
10 really what you know a lot of it is. So, how do we—  
11 what is that money, I mean like in terms of do you do  
12 a breakdown of that amount of money? And then, how  
13 can we you know by expanding programs like organic  
14 pickup and composting, how can we decrease that  
15 budget?

16 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Councilwoman. That's  
17 a great question. Uhm, and the money we saw  
18 throughout COVID-19, so we do, we export our waste  
19 and we have to have long-term contracts with  
20 reputable vendors to be able to take our waste  
21 preferably by rail or barge and reduce truck traffic.  
22 But in essence that time per day is you know at a  
23 fixed cost per ton. That's a variable with  
24 multipliers. So, we had to adjust for the  
25 multipliers that we are in, so it's just the cost per

1 ton increase that is scheduled as well as what COVID-  
2 19 did with us. You know and as we recover, we will  
3 see another fluctuation hopefully back towards  
4 normalcy in our trends but we had increased product.  
5 So, we had an increase - so we took on more tonnage  
6 and we are paying so more than expected. So, we had  
7 to adjust the budget to account for that and the cost  
8 per ton Delta.  
9

10 What you point out though is epically important  
11 and I thank you for shining a light on it.

12 Absolutely, the more waste we can recycle, the better  
13 we will do on the outyears of the costs. Because of  
14 processing and processing cost and handling. And the  
15 more we can do with recycling of metal and paper and  
16 organic material. Everything that gets diverted from  
17 the refuse waste stream can go to a different  
18 processing method that as we get scalable  
19 particularly on the organic side, should be able to  
20 offset the big cost delta through the removal of  
21 refuse.

22 So, the costs of doing business are exactly that.  
23 They are costs. We have an exporting program. We  
24 have to remove the waste. We have cost per ton  
25 analysis for each of the commodities we collect but

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 132

2 ultimately, the zero waste goal and having as much  
3 refuse diverted from the black bag so to speak into  
4 you know the green bin and the blue bin and the clear  
5 bags and the organics, the brown bin. All of those  
6 delineations, the best we can do to keep everything  
7 going from landfill, they are not only benefiting the  
8 environment but overall will totally change the cost  
9 benefit and cost basis per ton for every other  
10 commodity.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, the fact that we  
12 banned the plastic bag, we heard from the Preliminary  
13 Budget, I assume that also saved us money for doing  
14 export and also, we were able to get some more money  
15 you know from the money that was charged for the  
16 paper bag to create more, to buy more reusable bag to  
17 give out in the city and I saw Department of  
18 Sanitation, you were out there doing that in the  
19 neighborhood and I think it's great.

20 I think that my final point with the you know,  
21 the exporting the waste -

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Is that I would you know  
24 the local, you know the composting that we have going  
25 on in the city, with different you know organizations

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 133

1 is doing that. I think we really should look at  
2 expanding also you know with the recycling products  
3 that we collect. How do we create jobs within the  
4 city to do it ourselves, rather than exporting it out?  
5

6 So, that's something that hopefully we can you  
7 know look at creating you know jobs through  
8 collecting composting, through collecting you know  
9 all of the recycle product, especially all the paper  
10 products. Because people are working from home, I  
11 mean all of the delivery, every little thing you  
12 order comes in a big box. And how do we generate  
13 that into resources, money for the neighborhood and  
14 for local residents to be able to you know create  
15 jobs and job opportunities and small businesses in  
16 that area?

17 And, uh, thank you Chair. I hope that we can you  
18 know follow up on those efforts. Thank you  
19 Commissioner and thank you to your team for all the  
20 great work.

21 EDWARD GRAYSON: Pleasure.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. We will now have  
23 Council Member Adams followed by Council Member  
24 Brannan.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much.

Welcome Commissioner, it's great to see you in this hearing and today and the work that you do is absolutely tremendous. The first thing I would like to do is echo every sentiment of Co-Chair Reynoso in this hearing and I applaud him for his remarks. As a member of the budget negotiating team, I will stand with him in assuring the DSNY gets every penny of that \$509 million. The first thing that all New Yorkers saw at the peak of this pandemic, was the demise of cleanliness in the City of New York and I don't know about anyone else but on a lot of levels, on every level, I am not willing to go backwards. So, we need that funding. We need that funding exponentially and the mere fact that it is being floated here in this hearing that it could potentially go some place else, is completely unacceptable to me.

So, fair enough, I stand with you flat footed on that in ensuring that that funding goes where it belongs into DSNY.

EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I also want to give a shout out to my co-helpers in cleanup and that's ACE.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 135

1 That have done a tremendous job in district 28. They  
2 have been phenomenal throughout this pandemic and  
3 even pre-pandemic. So, I really do want to shout  
4 them out also. We have had such an issue over the  
5 past year, a tremendous issue as you said  
6 Commissioner, more with the legal dumping.  
7

8 We have had an e-waste issue that has been very  
9 prevalent also. Particularly in my small business  
10 corridor on Liberty Avenue, DSNY pitched in and you  
11 did what you had to do you know in spite of a cut in  
12 services. So, again, hats off to you.

13 I only have one question and it may seem very,  
14 very trivial, so forgive me. But I have followed  
15 many a mechanical broom throughout District 28 and I  
16 am just curious about the training for the drivers  
17 because were there is no place to get close to the  
18 curb, the drivers tend to drive center street and all  
19 that does is swirl the dust up. And I know this  
20 because I have had to stop my car, pull over so that  
21 it wouldn't slide over but the dust tends to fly on  
22 vehicles, it tends to fly on people. You know it  
23 tends to fly into you know the sidewalk and residence  
24 as well.  
25

1           So, I am just curious basically about the  
2  
3 training. You know of the drivers who are supposed  
4 to be cleaning up but those mechanical brooms seem to  
5 have a mind of their own, especially if they are  
6 drive not alongside the curb because of parked cars  
7 but through the center of the road. So, if you could  
8 just let me know what that's all about?

9           EDWARD GRAYSON: Absolutely.

10           CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Commissioner, I am so sorry  
11 Commissioner. I am sorry. I want to add to Council  
12 Member Adams's question. I hear that they are  
13 supposed to have water and I have not seen a  
14 mechanical broom in my district of water. It just  
15 throws the dirt up in the air and everyone has to  
16 clear out, wait for it to settle before they can come  
17 back out. All the cars are dirty. You know, never  
18 wash your car right before outside street parking.  
19 So, I just want to let you know that you know are  
20 they supposed to have water? Just explain to us the  
21 life of a mechanical broom, so that we know what we  
22 are looking for.

23           Because I agree with Council Member Adams about  
24 just not understanding exactly what the protocol is  
25 there.

1 EDWARD GRAYSON: I thank you both for the  
2 question. It's not a trivial matter and don't  
3 mistake my smile and my little laughs as I am happy  
4 with that. I am not and I will absolutely walk you  
5 through the basics quickly on what's going on there  
6 typically when you see it.  
7

8 You brought up a great point Councilwoman on the  
9 fact that the mechanical broom is not getting to the  
10 curb and then they are traversing the centerline.  
11 Compliance is a key issue to the effectiveness of  
12 broom operation.

13 So, first and foremost, all broom operators are  
14 highly trained. It's one of the most complex pieces  
15 of equipment we actually run on a daily basis and the  
16 men and women that operate those brooms are excellent  
17 operators and what we are asking them to do is very  
18 unique driving skills. Getting as close to the curb  
19 as possible, keeping people as safe as possible and  
20 then pulling in and out of traffic routinely and  
21 constantly as it relates to their ability to get to  
22 the curb.

23 Those brooms on the side, there is a spray bar.  
24 There is the water we fill up from a hydrant. We  
25 fill that with hundreds of gallons of water and then

2 a spray bar is in effect to keep - it's for dust  
3 suppression because we know we are going to run on  
4 the sweeper brooms, which are the two brooms on the  
5 side, they push everything towards the center of the  
6 unit and we're trying to do dust suppression. The  
7 challenge when you may or may not depending, it's all  
8 temporal, is as everyone knows we have 90 minutes to  
9 cover a specified area of streets.

10 So, when you are looking at especially the  
11 alternate side, it's a 90 minute block. Depending on  
12 when the broom operator is not 100 percent in control  
13 of when he or she runs out of water. So, they start  
14 with a full tank of water and then they go and then  
15 at some point and time, they are often required to  
16 have a tank up in the middle of the route.

17 Depending on where they sit inside the tank,  
18 inside the segment time, they may or may not have run  
19 out of water. So, sadly, if you catch a broom that  
20 ran out of water, yeah, you will get a baseline level  
21 of dust because we are now not suppressing the dust  
22 as we sweep.

23 And then we - they have to get to a safe area  
24 where there is a hydrant and load up and that's  
25 hopefully all to try to keep the schedule. One of

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 139

2 the things of late that is definitely a challenge for  
3 our broom operators and the city on its continece,  
4 is the fact that we are only sweeping the alternate  
5 side parking areas one time per week.

6 So, now it is epically important to try to keep  
7 the schedule and take advantage of wherever the open  
8 side is.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 EDWARD GRAYSON: So, I may do messaging to try to  
11 get more compliance with how they can properly tank  
12 up to run less block faces without using water. If  
13 there is water, there is training and when they are  
14 in the center of the road, that's usually for travel.  
15 We keep the brooms down so that when we can snipe  
16 back into the curb, we can do so quickly otherwise we  
17 would lose time trying to redeploy the brooms. So,  
18 we sweep the entire time on the route solely to be  
19 able to cut in and out of curb accessibility as it  
20 avails itself.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I appreciate the response.  
22 It just seems and I'm sure Chair Reynoso will concur;  
23 it seems that sometimes it defeats the purpose. My  
24 thought you know in following behind mechanical  
25 brooms as often as I have, why don't they just turn

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 140

2 them off when they see that obviously things aren't  
3 working? You know and that it is really causing  
4 quite a mess but I appreciate your response and like  
5 I said, I certainly will champion the - continue to  
6 champion DSNY for all the great work that you do in  
7 ensuring that the funding is appropriated into your  
8 agency where it belongs. Thank you Commissioner.

9 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Councilwoman.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. And now Council  
11 Member Brannan followed by Council Member Rosenthal.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you. Thank you  
14 Chairs. Good to see you Commissioner. I always got  
15 to shout out BK10 and BK11 for all the great work  
16 they do out here. I speak to those guys more than I  
17 speak to my wife sometimes but they do a great job.

18 I have two really quick things. Uhm, has there  
19 been any discussion around committing with the -  
20 getting the administration to commit to advancing the  
21 capital improvements to the garages in Brooklyn and  
22 Bronx and Queens?

23 EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, great question. We are  
24 thankfully, we have some rehabilitation projects that  
25 are. We are going to stay in the commitment, so

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 141

Queens 11, 13, Queens 8, 10 and 12. So, in those  
respective areas, we do have some improvements as the  
entire Zerega Avenue which has three garages up in  
the Bronx, 9,10 and 11 as well as Bronx 6. We have  
an additional, it's a leased property but we are also  
still in negotiation on their lease renewal in Bronx  
1,3,4 for some improvements in that facility. So,  
yes, the administration is committed to helping us  
move the ball on some of our facilities but there is  
still a lot of work to be done. These facilities  
definitely can use all the help they can get.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay, but the capital -  
the money is there. The money has not gone anywhere?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, right now the capital plan  
is in place to have those rehabilitations continue.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay and then, uh,  
quickly uhm, what's the status on the restrooms? The  
changing of the women's and men's facilities?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, thank you. Yes, a long  
standing project.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I'm sorry, the changing  
rooms. The bathrooms and the changing rooms.

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, a long standing project to  
get us an adequate number of facilities for both our

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 142

2 male and female members of service and just having  
3 adequate facilities around in the ever changing  
4 culture, you know and providing really good, clean  
5 bathrooms and shower facilities. Our sanitation  
6 workers are afforded the opportunity to naturally  
7 shower at the end of a shift and make themselves you  
8 know they are out there doing a dirty job so to speak  
9 and we want to make sure that they have proper  
10 facilities. We are in a very good place.

11 So, we only have a few, a handful of locations  
12 that are still in the pipeline for this year. The  
13 funding is in place. We had with the construction  
14 pause that happened because of COVID, we had to stop  
15 the rehab of at least nine of those facilities but  
16 the vendors are back in, the construction is ongoing.  
17 So, we look to be in a very good place. As it stands  
18 right now, all of our employees have a place for a  
19 suitable shower and changing. What we are doing  
20 right now is giving a more secular upgraded shower  
21 situations for a lot of areas where there is a  
22 comingle district where we have to have a bunch of  
23 people go to one centralized location and we have got  
24 some pretty smart construction going on but the  
25 funding is in place for that. So, at the end of this

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 143

Fiscal Year, we expect to have that project  
completed. And finally, my predecessor started it  
when she got here and I am very hopeful to finally  
get the ball over and give proper facilities to all  
the locations.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Right on. Thank you  
Commissioner. You guys are great. I mean, you guys  
have been amazing through COVID and uhm, you know I  
like to say sanitation workers are every day heroes  
right? I mean, we don't even notice when you guys  
pick up the garbage but we go nuts when you don't.

So, it's a thankless job and we appreciate that  
and thank you for indulging me. That's all I have  
Chairs, thank you.

EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you sir.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Uhm, Council  
Member Rosenthal.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Council Member Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sorry about that.  
Apologies.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh, sorry, sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm doing double duty.  
I am out doing a site visit at a wonderful NYCHA

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 144

2 development. We are actually just talking about rats  
3 but uhm, I wanted to ask, Commissioner thank you for  
4 being here. Uhm, specifically about putting solar  
5 panels up on your garages and whether or not there is  
6 money in the budget for doing any of that. I noticed  
7 that the garage in my district, right between my  
8 district and south on 59<sup>th</sup> street has a roof that's  
9 solar ready, according to a DCAS report. Is that in  
10 the works at all?

11 EDWARD GRAYSON: Great question. We are our  
12 engineering and construction teams in future  
13 planning. We are always looking to incorporate the  
14 new technologies for our future builds to have them  
15 you know, get the lead certifications and do smart  
16 engineering to leverage solar and other avenues. As  
17 it stands right now, we do not have a direct solar  
18 upgrade. You know to upgrade the roof to solar in  
19 this years budget but it is part of our ongoing  
20 planning to be able to come up with how do we upgrade  
21 our facilities to meet the needs and try to adopt  
22 sustainable you know and new technology that's  
23 available.

24 So, again, to your direct question, we do not  
25 have anything line itemed for this year but it is in

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 145

2 our plans for our future designs and as we have in  
3 our engineering division to try to do everything we  
4 can to leverage it and we look forward to the  
5 partnerships and opportunities that do become  
6 available moving ahead.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, I guess what I am  
8 asking then is, I understand it's not in the budget.  
9 I appreciate that you are looking forward to  
10 partnerships and adding solar where we can. Uhm,  
11 that's great. Would you consider having your  
12 engineers check out this building in particular? The  
13 roof is huge and according to this DCAS report, it  
14 could produce just a tremendous amount of energy.  
15 It's among the highest. It's like four times the  
16 nearest school where we would consider putting solar  
17 panels. Is that something you would be willing to  
18 look at or is that just only - are you thinking solar  
19 only for new buildings?

20 EDWARD GRAYSON: No, I absolutely can - well, I  
21 would love to have my engineering team look at it and  
22 come up with some, what are the estimates on savings  
23 or cost implementation and then we could definitely  
24 discuss that. I would love to work with you and see  
25 where we could go on a myriad of our facilities. For

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 146

1 right now, I would love to look at anything that's  
2 solar ready to have on a listing and know where we  
3 could go if we were you know, had that opportunity.  
4 Some of our facilities need basic upgrades and we  
5 have been trying to get some of the basics done. But  
6 I agree with you. But absolutely, I fully commit  
7 that we can have our engineering team look at that as  
8 well as our you know support services and look at  
9 what the electrical needs would be. Work with our  
10 engineering team and I could definitely follow back  
11 up with you specifically to that location. Because  
12 if it's something that we can do quickly and make a  
13 great outcome, I definitely would be looking to  
14 explore that with you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, I guess yes, I am  
17 very interested and I would like to look at it sooner  
18 than later. I've let DCAS know that it's on my  
19 radar. So, maybe you could work with their solar  
20 folks who do this all the time and are very familiar  
21 with how to do that.

22 And then, my second question is, how many of your  
23 garages have women's bathrooms?

24 EDWARD GRAYSON: Right now, so all of our garages  
25 have a women's bathroom or a single occupant

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 147

bathroom. You know gender neutral bathroom facility.

So, we, in our garages we have a place for every  
human being to go to the bathroom. What we are  
working towards is a site by site garage women's  
locker room with shower facilities.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yes, yes.

EDWARD GRAYSON: But that is what we are working  
towards now.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, exactly. How  
many of how many do you have?

EDWARD GRAYSON: We have - so, we have some of  
our garages are complexes where they are comingled.  
So, site specific, we have 59 districts; we do not  
have 59 buildings with a specific - however, some of  
those buildings are housed three, like our Manhattan  
-

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Of course, of course.  
How many sites.

EDWARD GRAYSON: There is one bathroom for all  
three districts.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right, got it. So,  
how many have the full locker room with showers?

EDWARD GRAYSON: I believe four -

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, it's four?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 148

EDWARD GRAYSON: No, no, no, no, no, not even  
close. Like 50 out of 59.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, okay.

EDWARD GRAYSON: And the other nine are in  
construction. That was to the previous question.  
Where we will either be able to offer a per garage to  
a female sanitation worker allotment. It will be  
secular or a suitable, larger facility for the  
comingled areas. Where have three garages in one  
building. There may be now one that houses all three  
but they won't have to travel far. It will be a  
flight of stairs or something.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Is it -

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Fully funded in the  
budget?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And that's my last  
question. It's fully funded? With the expectation  
that it be finished when?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, we were on pace to have it  
finished for last Fiscal Year, for '21.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, great.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 149

EDWARD GRAYSON: We expect it to be '22. It's  
just a construction delay because of COVID.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, thank you so  
much Commissioner and thank you Chair Reynoso for  
your dedication and all your hard work here. Thank  
you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Council Member  
Rosenthal. Thank you, enjoy.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member -

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Counsel, I think a lot of  
the new Council Members that are joining are here for  
the Small Business meeting but I want to acknowledge  
Council Member Gennaro, Rodriguez, Dinowitz and  
Riley. How are you all doing? Hope you are doing  
well, all of you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We have also been joined by  
Council Member Brooks-Powers.

Now, we have Council Member Darma Diaz with her  
questions.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Good afternoon. I want to  
say thank you to Chair Reynoso to bringing up the  
conversation of the sweepers. It reminded me to one  
of our issues that I am having in the district and no

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 150

2 matter how hard we work [INAUDIBLE 3:16:45], you know  
3 and staff on the ground. I still see we are having  
4 some issues and I want to know if it was a systemic  
5 issue or if it just pops out to me within my  
6 district.

7 Utility companies leaving behind their  
8 barricades. I've noticed and there is three of my  
9 locations, whether it's the gas company or ConEdison,  
10 there is work permits from last year on the  
11 barricades that are there and I don't see any  
12 activity. All the work seems to have been completed  
13 but they are still there and they are not allowing  
14 for a true sweep of the blocks of the curbs.

15 My question is, is it something that you are  
16 seeing citywide? I want to reach out to the company,  
17 the utility companies and say hey, you know come get  
18 your stuff off my streets.

19 EDWARD GRAYSON: To that, I totally understand  
20 what you mean and to that end, it's not just  
21 exclusive to your district. For places that had -  
22 and a lot of it, you know we are expecting a lot  
23 better compliance overall as we move forward. Two  
24 things I think are in play. There was a lot of pause  
25 on some of the infrastructure work that was going on.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 151

2 So, they kind of occupied a space and they had their  
3 own staffing challenges or whatever and then like you  
4 said, they may have left the barrier areas up to be  
5 able to have an easy access, so that it stays  
6 accessible for when they are going to come back and  
7 complete the job.

8 So, to those ends, we have that, it's around. I  
9 am hoping that as they onboard either new work crews  
10 or also recover with all of us, that some of those  
11 jobs can be completed and then those barriers will be  
12 taken away. We have however, when we know that it  
13 was left erroneously, meaning the job has been  
14 complete but then potentially the clean up crew  
15 didn't come back, we've made those contacts to try to  
16 remove the barriers.

17 So, what we can definitely do is work with you to  
18 look at all the areas and then try to get a follow up  
19 on what's the status of that job? Are you coming  
20 back and can we do better to get access to the curbs?  
21 Because I think you are 100 percent right. It is  
22 weird to have this secular area of a block face  
23 blocked off for potential work and then never seeing  
24 work done and it definitely doesn't help me sweep the  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 152

2 street and it doesn't help residents park and it just  
3 gives the bad impression.

4 So, I appreciate you bringing that up and it's  
5 not just in your district and I would love to work  
6 with you further to do better on that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you Sir. I will be  
8 following with some pictures. I will send them over  
9 with a location. Thank you again.

10 EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes, you got it.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I believe that  
12 our Chairs have additional questions they would like  
13 to ask at this time. Chair Dromm?

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Actually, I am going to go to  
15 Chair Reynoso.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Chair Dromm.  
17 Just outside of the street parking, I know that we  
18 are talking about it. Are we ever bringing it back?  
19 I think at this point, the Mayor uses it more to get  
20 good press than he does care about the data behind  
21 it. Like, what's happening out outside of the street  
22 parking, like in a meaningful way? I live in a two  
23 family home and our streets are, the trees are the  
24 shed and just the pickup is just one day is not  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 153

1  
2 enough and I just want to know where we are with on  
3 the side street parking.

4 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Chair and as it  
5 stands, so as when we entered into the reduced  
6 sweeping, first, when COVID happened, we suspended  
7 all through the side for weeks on end and then when  
8 it was brought back, it was brought back in the  
9 current iteration of one time per week. The last  
10 posted day and our headcount and our operation  
11 expectation leading into FY22 continues with the  
12 single day sweep throughout the city. There are some  
13 areas of the city that have been okay and as we look  
14 at the broader you know ASP and sweeping has always  
15 been a topic. It's a topic that you have the mixed  
16 feelings about, most people. They hate the move for  
17 the broom but then when we can't sweep the street,  
18 you notice it right away. Very similar to what  
19 Council Member Brannan was saying, how you don't  
20 notice it until it's not done.

21 Right now, the accessibility concerns that we  
22 have are only heightened, meaning how many people  
23 moved. The compliance issue that we have, how many  
24 people move with the broom, it really shows its true  
25 impact now that we are down to one day per week. If

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 154

1 you don't move, if you are a Friday sweep, you know  
2 if Friday is your scheduled day and the people on the  
3 block don't move, now we are not coming back for  
4 another seven days, which is only seven more days of  
5 litter. And I think that we might have a bigger  
6 challenge as we see you brought up the canopy and the  
7 treelined areas, as we move forward again, you notice  
8 it even more once the canopy starts to fall in the  
9 fall literally and we see now additional leaves and  
10 litter that we can't get to because the curbs - we  
11 are only coming one time a week.

12  
13 So, at this point, in this budget, while the  
14 original intent of having the reduction was COVID  
15 related, at this point it's part of an evaluation  
16 process as to where the city needs to be.

17 I am the Commissioner of Sanitation. I love  
18 clean streets. I would sweep every street every day,  
19 just because I can always find dirt. However, that  
20 is not realistic. I am an expert; I can tell you  
21 where anything is dirty. But we want to work with  
22 Council. We want to work with the Administration and  
23 we want to figure out where we are going but for  
24 right now, to your point, we are still expecting to  
25 run FY22 on this singular day per week except in the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 155

2 metered areas where we are still running six days.

3 And there are definitely parts of the city that I  
4 agree with you sir, need more than that.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, so, I guess I am  
6 going to get back to the \$509 million. There is no  
7 reason, I mean look, if you guys want to use a  
8 scalpel instead of returning it back to where it was,  
9 then let's talk about that because just in my, on my  
10 block two cars didn't move on Thursday and that means  
11 we got two weeks' worth of trash that are going to  
12 stay there. And it's just, it's part of the  
13 dirtiness and I just want it clean. So, you know and  
14 I am not going to call, a personal call to the garage  
15 to help me out here. I want the City of New York to  
16 be clean.

17 So, this alternate side of the street parking  
18 should be data driven, not politically driven and I  
19 feel like right now the Mayor just likes to tell  
20 people that they don't need to move their cars. And  
21 that the joy of not having to move your car is more  
22 valuable than the clean streets and I don't agree  
23 with that assessment. I am like you Commissioner  
24 Grayson, I see trash, I want it gone.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 156

2 So, I appreciate you like giving me the heads up  
3 on that. And then just one last thing, the Save as  
4 You Throw Study, there is money now. I am going to  
5 keep telling you guys, there is money. Money is not  
6 an issue right now considering the half a billion  
7 dollars which accounts for about 23, 22 percent of  
8 our entire budget for sanitation. There should be -  
9 we should be doing all the studies and starting to  
10 work toward laying down the ground work for what  
11 needs to happen against the zero waste. So, I just  
12 want to know what's going on with the study.

13 And my last question is going to be around  
14 marketing and outreach. You said we have expanded  
15 that, I want to know, I need more details as to like  
16 what does that mean? Is it \$2 million of our  
17 organics or just, just what is the outreach looking  
18 like?

19 EDWARD GRAYSON: I appreciate the questions and I  
20 definitely appreciate the interest in Save as You  
21 Throw and Pay as You Throw and looking at  
22 feasibility. So, internally, we have experts in our  
23 recycling who have looked at this. I would love to  
24 actually, outside of this caucus, share that  
25 information with you. Have a real sit down as to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 157

2 what we know internally. As it stands right now, we  
3 are not – the budget right this second does not have  
4 a funded study in it. However, we would love to talk  
5 about all the expertise that we have had and then  
6 work together on what do you think we need to study.  
7 You know, realistically knowing what our knowledge  
8 base is and really come up with a plan.

9 So, we are open minded to that absolutely and I  
10 definitely hear you know between all of our  
11 conversations since I have taken this role. I  
12 understand where you are on this study and you know  
13 we are definitely committed. We really do believe  
14 that the outreach needs and I am very happy that we  
15 are bringing on boroughs recycling sustainability is  
16 staffed to go out and do outreach and be back out in  
17 the communities. And it restored some funding for  
18 you know the Grow NYC partners and all of this  
19 throughout the money that's going towards or Zero  
20 Waste campaign. And the expanded programs and us  
21 getting back out with boots on the ground to be  
22 literally out there talking to people, giving them  
23 literature, trying to show them the right thing to do  
24 and then providing the opportunity is definitely  
25 there.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 158

For a little bit of secular granularity on what  
is specifically for outreach, I am going to ask my  
Deputy Commissioner Greg Anderson to provide a little  
bit more context on where that exact funding lines  
are going. But I am happy that we are back in the  
business of outreach and more importantly that we  
have been able to hire additional staff to get that  
headcount in to be able to do that good work. And  
naturally messaging and partnerships with you and  
your support are going to be critical to get us even  
further along.

So, Greg Anderson please, weigh in with some  
numbers for the Councilman.

GREGORY ANDERSON: Sure, good afternoon Chair.  
So, in Fiscal Year '22, we are currently budgeted for  
around \$9.7 million in outreach and education funds.  
That includes everything from our partners in the  
Compost Project that do outreach in the master  
composter class and those sorts of activities. As  
well as mailers and advertising and marketing related  
to organics and to our other programs that have a  
sort of marketing and outreach component.

So, that's an increase obviously from where we  
have been over the last two years because we do have

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 159

1 these new programs. There is a lot of communications  
2 that will be happening around the organics expansion.  
3 There is a lot of communications that will be  
4 happening around the reuse events and the safe  
5 events. So, those are all touch points that we have  
6 with the owners.  
7

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you all and I just  
9 want to say really excited about the work with  
10 commercial waste zones. See that there is actual  
11 money and we are going to expand our people from one  
12 person to an actual group of people that are going to  
13 be able to do this work in a meaningful way. So,  
14 thank you for that and I am very proud, I think this  
15 is our last time we are going to meet related to  
16 Executive Budget hearing and I just want to say, that  
17 the time I had with Commissioner Garcia and now with  
18 you Commissioner Grayson, uhm I couldn't be prouder  
19 of an agency and the work that this agency does. And  
20 when we talk about how city and government can work,  
21 the Department of Sanitation is always a central  
22 agency to show like efficiency and just things just  
23 happening because they are supposed to.

24 So, I just want to thank you so much for all the  
25 great work that you guys have done in my time here in

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 160

1 the Executive Budgets and I am going to miss these  
2 meetings and hope that the Department of Sanitation  
3 continues to be the greatest agency in the City of  
4 New York. So, thank you.

5 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Chair. Uhm, your  
6 leadership really, and your partnership the entire  
7 time you know, in my 22 years with the department  
8 prior to becoming the Acting Commissioner and now the  
9 Commissioner. I was the ranking Chief and right  
10 there with your partnership and implementation with  
11 my predecessor and now you and the rest of the  
12 Committee Members. I just want to thank you for your  
13 leadership and partnership.

14 We have truly benefited the people of the city  
15 have benefited from your commitment to zero waste and  
16 environmental justice and thank you so much for  
17 everything you have done.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and Commissioner,  
19 before I let you go, I just want to ask you a couple  
20 of questions about Get Food. So, the budget for the  
21 city's Get Food emergency home delivered meal program  
22 continues to reside within DSNY's budget and be  
23 managed by the Mayor's Office of Food Policy. Can  
24 you walk us through your agencies coordination  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 161

2 efforts with other city agencies working on food  
3 distribution?

4 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you. Great question.

5 Yes, the Get Food program started because with DSNY  
6 and that emergency response in collaboration with OEM  
7 and at the time when it first jumped off, my  
8 predecessor [INAUDIBLE 3:29:40] was named food czar  
9 and we were able to leverage our ability to do  
10 emergency contracts and emergency limitations  
11 quickly. Naturally, the department having a deep  
12 rooted experience base in emergency response. You  
13 know 911, Sandy, the Hurricane Maria, we have a very  
14 good way to operationalize getting in and becoming  
15 very coordinated in a quick amount of time and I  
16 think that that was why we were selected.

17 And the millions of meals that have been  
18 delivered to millions of countless New Yorkers  
19 throughout the pandemic is something that will go  
20 down, I believe in the history books. When you roll  
21 back the tape on the response, it's absolutely  
22 amazing. Uhm, we do not have budgeted resources in  
23 FY22 for the food program. However, we have over  
24 \$200 million budgeted for the remainder of this  
25 Fiscal year and while we are continuing to be in the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 162

1 game on the food delivery on the emergency food side,  
2 we are working with the Mayor's Office of Food Policy  
3 to transition out of the program as the city  
4 recovers. The demand for food through our emergency  
5 program goes down week by week and eventually at some  
6 point, the overall future of that program will reside  
7 in the Mayor's Office of Food Policy. We expect to  
8 be involved throughout the summer and into the fall,  
9 as we do a proper transition and handoff to make sure  
10 that there is no gap in the clientele that we service  
11 as opposed to the others. You know, the DFTA and you  
12 know there are a lot of other places that are doing  
13 food and food should reside with food policy and you  
14 know the senior programs that currently reside and  
15 our ability to you know descale and transition.

17 We are looking forward to that, not because it  
18 wasn't this amazing program that I couldn't be  
19 prouder of for the men and women that were a part of  
20 it and the teams that did all the outreach and all  
21 the deliveries even at the beginning and all of that  
22 was just amazing work and we are looking forward to  
23 where it lives and you know, being a partner and  
24 assistance to all the food for New Yorkers.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 163

1 But the Get Food program, we are not directly  
2 funded for it in FY22 and we are working on a  
3 transition out that we do take – will take this into  
4 FY22 but yeah, it's been one heck of a project.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, is the Get Food  
6 program the same as the senior Get and Go food  
7 program? Is that the same thing?

8 EDWARD GRAYSON: So, our Get Food started out in  
9 relationship to when other programs were shutdown.  
10 We did grab and go meal support that was going on at  
11 some of the DOE locations in the various locations.  
12 So, in the beginning, we were overarching with a lot  
13 of areas but there are still the secular you know  
14 Meals on Wheels programs and other DFTA sponsored  
15 programs that are happening. You know running  
16 parallel to the Get Food.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so Commissioner, we  
18 have some other questions about the breakdown of the  
19 budget and the food and stuff like that but I am  
20 going to leave that for a written response because we  
21 are over time here.

22 Uhm, just one last question. So, do the meals  
23 that you are going to be providing at least through  
24 the end of the year, are they culturally sensitive  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 164

2 meals for the needs of the folks that are still  
3 getting them? And also, I noticed you said that the  
4 demand for food is down. Perhaps the demand for food  
5 is down in some areas but in my area in Jackson  
6 Heights, Elmhurst for example, it still continues to  
7 be a very high need in our communities and I just  
8 don't want us to lose focus that certain communities  
9 are still really relying on this food.

10 EDWARD GRAYSON: Dually noted sir and we are  
11 definitely not looking to run away from the project.  
12 We want a nice smooth transition to make sure that  
13 all of those still in need are getting food. And as  
14 to the accessibility to sensitivity on diet, we have  
15 a good mix of Halal and Kosher and various other  
16 specified dietary needs. We have taken pain staking  
17 steps to try to make sure that they are meeting all  
18 the demands and we have really done a lot of good  
19 work to try to offer all of the options that we need  
20 to be available to make sure that we are giving a  
21 very wide opportunity to meet all the cultures.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay and just down to the  
23 type of lima beans that folks get or the type of rice  
24 that folks want. You know, it comes down to that as  
25 well. So, I am sure you are aware of that though.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 165

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes sir.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright and just please let  
Pat Grayson know that she has done a great job with  
her son and wish her best and Commissioner, it's good  
seeing you. And I am just going to read a statement  
now to close us out for this portion of the hearing.  
Just bear with me a moment.

Okay, this will conclude our portion of today's  
hearing. I want to thank DSNY for being here. We  
will move right into the next portion, no break,  
where we will hear from the Department of Small  
Business Services. I ask my colleagues who will be  
joining us for the SBS portion of the hearing to  
remain in the Zoom with your microphone muted until  
we are ready to begin.

Thank you again Commissioner and thank you to  
everybody at DSNY and thank you to my Co-Chair  
Council Member Chair Reynoso for the great job that  
you have been doing with the Department of  
Sanitation.

I think for the full eight years that you have  
been in the Council if I am not mistaking. So, thank  
you Chair.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 166

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes, party zone. Thank  
you. Thank you Chair Dromm.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Absolutely. Okay, thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: It looks like Chair Gjonaj is  
here and ready to go, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Hi, Chair Gjonaj.

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Hey, Chair Dromm.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We are also joined by SBS.  
So, we can start when you are ready.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, very good. Good  
afternoon and welcome to the City Council second day  
of hearings on the Mayor's Executive Budget for  
Fiscal '22. My name is Daniel Dromm and I Chair the  
Finance Committee. I think we did more than two days  
but anyway.

We are joined by the Committee on Small Business  
Chaired by my colleague Council Member Mark Gjonaj.  
Let me just see if I have a list of the Council  
Members who have joined us. Yes, we have Council,  
the Chair Gjonaj, Council Members Rosenthal, Adams,  
Ampry-Samuel, Ayala, Brooks-Powers, Darma Diaz,  
Koslowitz, Chin, Dinowitz, Koo, Menchaca and Riley  
who are here and uhm, we are joined - Okay, so we  
just heard from the Department of Sanitation and we

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 167

will now hear from the Department of Small Business  
Services. In the interest of time, I will forego an  
opening statement and I ask Chair Gjonaj to make his  
opening statement. Chair Gjonaj?

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Good afternoon everyone and  
welcome to today's remote budget hearing. I first  
want to begin by thanking my dear friend Chair Dromm  
for all of the work that he puts in during these  
budget hearings year in and year out. It truly is a  
pleasure watching you navigate and keep everything  
focused Chair. Thank you for all that you do. The  
city is a much better city because of you and the  
work that you have committed to making this city a  
fairer city.

My name is Mark Gjonaj, I am the Chair of Council  
Committee on Small Business. Today, we will be  
hearing from Department of Small Business Service on  
their Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget, which totals  
\$317.6 million. Departments Fiscal 2022 Executive  
Budget has increased by \$137.3 million across all  
program areas when compared to the Fiscal 2021  
Adopted Budget. The overall increase in the budget  
is driven by a range of factors including funding  
added for commercial lease assistance program, small

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 168

business grant program, small business loan fund, NYC  
and Company Tourism Recovery and Accelerate Small  
Business and Reopening Initiative.

Both federal and city program funds have been  
established to assist small businesses. As such,  
this executive plan introduces an estimate of the  
city's spending related to its responsive recovery  
from COVID-19 pandemic. SBS has previously launched  
four grant programs and two loan programs of its  
first vital direct aid to businesses. Additionally,  
in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget, a new loan fund  
program and grant program have been added.

I would like to learn more about the new programs  
from the agency and how it plans to focus on this  
funding equitably throughout the five boroughs to  
small business that are in low to moderate income  
communities and communities that have been hardest  
hit by the COVID-19 pandemic.

The city has recently launched Fair Share NYC.  
The program that will connect restaurants to federal  
refunds. Prior initiatives including Fair Share NYC  
PPP which launched in January to connect businesses  
to PPP funds and Curtains Up NYC, which launched in  
February to provide assistance to New York City live

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 169

performance businesses and nonprofits applying for  
the Federal Shuttered Venue Operators Grant program.

I would like the agency to provide us with  
updates on how many small businesses have been  
assisted throughout these programs. And the  
Council's budget response who called on the  
Administration to restore \$1.5 million for the  
Commercial Lease Assistance Program.

The program crucial to our businesses during  
economic program. The program eliminated in Fiscal  
2021 as a result of the agencies reduction with  
economic impact of the pandemic. I am very happy to  
see that \$5.2 million has been added to SBS's  
executive budget for the Commercial Lease Assistance  
Program in Fiscal '21 and Fiscal '22 budgets that  
will provide expanded free legal services to help  
businesses negotiate or terminate leases or address  
commercial lease issues.

This funding brought up to expand reach to small  
businesses in the 33 hardest hit neighborhoods  
identified by the Mayor's Taskforce on Racial  
Inclusion and Equity that were disproportionately  
impacted by COVID-19 pandemic.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 170

2 Additionally, the Council urge the Administration  
3 to relax burdensome regulations and fines on business  
4 until they get on their feet again. I am happy to  
5 see funding added to the Executive Budget or  
6 Accelerate Small Businesses Reopening and Opening  
7 initiative, which is a small business recovery one  
8 stop shop service to help businesses meet  
9 requirements for reopening through inspections,  
10 licensing and permitting as the COVID-19 pandemic  
11 subsides.

12 I strongly, like so many of my colleagues, think  
13 small businesses are the backbone of New York's  
14 economy and deserve and need much more assistance to  
15 get back on their feet. I also believe that every  
16 business that we invest in will yield a turn on  
17 investment as a city. We can no longer use the  
18 excuse of Washington who have done their part, we  
19 must do ours. Hence, the Council had called upon the  
20 Administration to expand the small business tax  
21 credit by \$50 million to ensure that they help  
22 stabilize small businesses citywide.

23 I am disappointed to see that this expansion is  
24 not included in the Executive Budget. Given all the  
25 hardships that our small businesses face, it is

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 171

imperative that the city puts measures in place to  
assist in their recovery. It is the Council's  
responsibility to ensure that the city's budget is  
fair, transparent and accountable to New Yorkers.

As the Chair of Small Business Committee, I will  
continue to push for accountability, accuracy and  
ensure that the budget reflects the needs and  
interests of the city. This hearing is a vital part  
of this process and I expect that SBS will be  
responsive to the questions and concerns of the  
Council Members.

I look forward to an active engagement with the  
Administration over the next few months to ensure the  
Fiscal 2022 Adopted Budget meets the goals that  
Council has set out. I would like to thank  
Commissioner Doris for testifying today. I would  
like to thank both my staff and the staff of the  
Finance division for their help in preparing for this  
remote hearing and most of all, I want to thank Chair  
Dromm for all that he does during these budget  
hearings year in, year out. Thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Chair  
Gjonaj for your very kind words. It's really very  
much appreciated and you are a true champion for our

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 172

Small Business community. You have been fighting for  
them for your whole time, your whole tenure in the  
Council and probably even before when you were in the  
New York State Assembly.

So, thank you for all of your work and you can be  
proud of your accomplishments. Let's now go to our  
Committee Counsel who will swear in the Commissioners  
and then we will ask questions after their testimony.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Dromm. My  
name is Noah Brick and I am Counsel to the New York  
City Council Committee on Finance. Before we begin,  
I want to remind everyone that you will be on mute  
until you are recognized to speak. At which time,  
you will be unmuted by the Zoom host. If you mute  
yourself after you have been unmuted, you will need  
to be unmuted again by the host.

Please be aware that there could be a delay in  
muting and unmuting, so please be patients. During  
this portion of today's hearing, we will hear  
testimony from the Department of Small Business  
Services. During the hearing, Council Members who  
would like to ask questions, please use the Zoom  
raise hand function and you will be called on to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 173

1 speak. We will be limiting Council Member questions  
2 to five minutes including responses.  
3

4 I will now administer the affirmation to the  
5 Administration witnesses one time and then ask each  
6 witness to so affirm. Do you affirm that your  
7 testimony will be truthful to the best of your  
8 knowledge, information and belief? Commissioner  
9 Doris?

10 JONNEL DORIS: I do.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Mallon?

12 JACKIE MALLON: I do.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Gross?

14 DYNISHAL GROSS: I do.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Shorts?

16 SHORTS: I do.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Backer?

18 BLAISE BACKER: I do.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Ms. Glover?

20 LUCINDA GLOVER: I do.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you all. Commissioner  
22 Doris, you may begin when ready.

23 JONNEL DORIS: Thank you. Good afternoon Chair  
24 Dromm and Chair Gjonaj and members of the Committees  
25 on Finance and Small Business. As mentioned, my name

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 174

1 is Jonnel Doris and I am the Commissioner of the New  
2 York City Department of Small Business Services.  
3 And I am joined here by First Deputy Commissioner  
4 Jackie Mallon and members of my senior leadership  
5 team.  
6

7 At SBS, we aim to unlock economic potential and  
8 create economic security for all New Yorkers by  
9 connecting them to good jobs, creating stronger  
10 businesses and building thriving neighborhoods across  
11 the five boroughs.

12 SBS's Fiscal Year '22 Executive Budget is \$317.6  
13 million with a headcount of 323 employees. Of the  
14 \$317.6 million, 32 percent or \$101.6 million is a  
15 pass-through funding, which is not spent or managed  
16 by SBS. This includes: \$40.3 million for the New  
17 York City Economic Development Corporation, \$46.2  
18 million for New York City & Company and \$15.1 million  
19 for Governors Island. The remaining \$216 million, or  
20 68 percent of the Fiscal Year '22 Executive Budget,  
21 is allocated for SBS's programs. To meet the  
22 challenges of the pandemic, SBS created a small  
23 business recovery plan designed to jumpstart the  
24 economy in the short-term, while laying the  
25

2 groundwork for sustainable small business recovery in  
3 the long-term.

4 This small business recovery plan, developed in  
5 collaboration with business leaders, industry  
6 associations and government partners, was based on  
7 four strategies to ensure an equitable, city-wide  
8 economic recovery: First, support business  
9 innovation to increase revenue. Two, equip  
10 entrepreneurs to adapt and lower operating costs.  
11 Third, foster close collaboration with businesses to  
12 cut red tape and promote equitable economic growth  
13 and support diverse businesses of the future.

14 During the pandemic SBS launched 28 new small  
15 business initiatives, our staff guided over 60,000  
16 calls through our hotline, hosted nearly 700 webinars  
17 with over 52,000 attendees and connected over 5,000  
18 businesses to more than \$147 million in city, state,  
19 federal and private funding. Through our Fair Share  
20 PPP program, SBS provided technical support to 4,200  
21 businesses as they applied for over \$300 million in  
22 PPP funding. Now there is a new level of optimism  
23 and hope in the City as New York and we are very  
24 excited about this. We are seeing vaccinations up,  
25 COVID-19 cases are falling dramatically and the city

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 176

2 is re-awakening to a new renaissance for business  
3 growth and creativity.

4 Thanks to the Council's support, outdoor dining  
5 and Open Streets broadens the landscape of street  
6 activity, bringing new energy and vibrancy to our  
7 neighborhoods and enlivens the city streets. And  
8 with the subway's return to 24-hour service next  
9 week, New Yorkers will be able to reach out to their  
10 new and unique experiences, enjoying different foods,  
11 shopping at neighborhood stores and connecting with  
12 each other again.

13 At SBS we plan to meet this optimism and growth  
14 with support for businesses and jobseekers so they  
15 are poised to take advantage of the city springing  
16 back to life. To do this, we are dramatically  
17 expanding our services and will infuse \$200 million  
18 dollars directly into the hardest hit small  
19 businesses through direct grants and loans. We are  
20 certain that New York and its small businesses will  
21 come roaring back this summer. But as we've seen  
22 throughout the pandemic, if inequity is not addressed  
23 it can quickly spiral and gaps can broaden. SBS \$100  
24 million grant fund and \$100 million loan fund are  
25 designed to address this inequity and help businesses

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 177

keep pace with the recovery. \$50 million in grants  
will go to the hardest hit sectors like hospitality  
and \$50 million will target small businesses in low  
to moderate income neighborhoods.

The \$100 million in loans will go to underserved  
businesses helping them access capital to invest in  
their business and meet their changing needs.

Expanding our Avenue NYC grant by \$1.2 million will  
give new LMI neighborhoods the opportunity to assess  
and revitalize their commercial corridors and  
streetscapes. This dedicated three year investment  
makes neighborhoods better for those that live there  
and also draws people from other parts of the city.

Returning the newly launched businesses will also  
need help navigating the opening and reopening in  
their businesses. So, SBS is adding \$5 million in  
support services to help them cut red tape as they  
manage requirements, regulations, licenses and  
general questions.

We're also boosting our Commercial Lease  
Assistance program with an additional \$10 million to  
help business owners with free legal services. This  
will provide much needed technical support with  
signing, amending or terminating leases and dealing

with disputes. Businesses also need a supply of  
workers to grow in the recovery and fuel the  
opportunities of tomorrow. Apprentice NYC receives a  
\$1.5 million expansion which gives new workers the  
chance to learn while earning and build careers in  
healthcare, food service, tech or manufacturing. The  
Career Pathways program provides \$2.5 million for  
training underserved and underrepresented populations  
in web development, data analysis and nursing. Hire  
NYC Construction Careers receives \$1.5 million to  
connect NYCHA residents and low-income New Yorkers to  
real family sustaining wages. And the program moves  
trainees through valuable pre-apprenticeship training  
and leverages the city's capital construction  
projects to maximize the numbers entering the trades.

With these boosts to skill-building programs,  
businesses will have more access to the talent they  
need by tapping and elevating the resources we have  
right here at home. And New Yorkers who have  
struggled with unemployment through the pandemic will  
have a real opportunity to build a career in a  
growing industry. SBS will continue to innovate and  
adapt to meet the changing needs of the recovery and  
prepare for the opportunities of the future economy.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 179

2 But let me be clear, the recovery is far from over  
3 and there will be many challenges ahead and more  
4 support will be needed. We stand ready with new  
5 tools at our disposal and with the excitement that  
6 our re-opening city brings to fuel our work.

7 Of course, none of this is possible without the  
8 incredible staff at SBS. I can't thank them enough  
9 for getting us to where we are today. I also want to  
10 thank the Council and Chairman Gjonaj for your  
11 partnership throughout this difficult year. I look  
12 forward to your continued thoughts and feedback as we  
13 strive to ensure the city comes back stronger, more  
14 vibrant and more equitable than ever.

15 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today  
16 and I am happy to answer any questions you may have.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much  
18 Commissioner and let's talk a little about your  
19 budget and the long term plan. Small businesses will  
20 need assistance beyond 2021 and '22 as a result of  
21 the impact of the pandemic. So, has the agency  
22 forecasted COVID-19 related spending in Fiscal '23  
23 and beyond?

24 JONNEL DORIS: Thank you Mr. Chair. Certainly,  
25 we have added as you see the new programs here and

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 180

2 some programs and opportunities that we will continue  
3 to have. For instance our overall plan and how we  
4 are allocating the resources that we do have existing  
5 within our budget that's already baselined. So,  
6 certainly, we look forward to expanding what we have  
7 but you know the increase that we have for this year  
8 and for next, has been significant in our budget  
9 which is the largest increase that we have ever had  
10 in our budget history.

11 So, certainly, we are looking for long-term  
12 solutions as well as some of the short-term impact  
13 that you see here in the budget.

14 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Chair Dromm, you are muted.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Is it in the '23  
16 and beyond budget or not?

17 JONNEL DORIS: Uhm, we have some of our programs  
18 as you know are in the '23 and beyond. The loan and  
19 grant programs are in the '22 budget.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Commissioner.

21 JONNEL DORIS: Sorry.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's okay.

23 JONNEL DORIS: I apologize, yeah, I was trying to  
24 make sure that I get all that's in the '23 but we

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 181

2 will have the team on just take a quick look. Before  
3 we end, we can come back with it.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Or we will follow up with you  
5 on it. So, does the agency believe its expense  
6 budget is sufficient to support small businesses as  
7 well as provide the city's job seekers with a full  
8 array of employment services, particularly now when  
9 the need is so great?

10 JONNEL DORIS: Well, thank you so much for that  
11 question. Yes, we do. Again, you know with an  
12 infusion of resources, both for small businesses you  
13 know \$100 million for a grant program and \$100  
14 million we're going to build a loan program and  
15 several resources for small businesses and for  
16 workers.

17 An additional \$6 or so million in supporting our  
18 workforce program, which you know is the largest  
19 component of our budget, it makes up 27 percent of  
20 our budget. And so, yeah, we are, I believe we have  
21 sufficient resources. We are also adding headcount,  
22 I believe about 21 or so headcount to SBS. And so,  
23 we are ready to take on the needs that we have right  
24 now.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 182

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, are you concerned about  
3 the city's economy rebounding quickly enough so that  
4 small businesses will be able to satisfy the terms of  
5 their loans and if businesses might struggle to pay  
6 off the additional debt that they are taking on?

7 I think I heard a report yesterday that 20  
8 percent of small businesses within the city closed  
9 due to the pandemic or no longer in business. And  
10 that those who remain are still struggling. So, you  
11 know those debts and those loans are still going to  
12 come due. What are you concerned about there. What  
13 are the concerns there?

14 JONNEL DORIS: Yeah, certainly, Mr. Chair, I  
15 believe that they are ongoing concerns and a few  
16 things that we want to make sure that we do. One,  
17 you know, we've surveyed the businesses to have  
18 received our funding and the majority of them are  
19 open. The majority of them are you know holding up  
20 to their obligations and if they needed additional  
21 support, a very small percentage, we were able to  
22 extend and be very flexible with the funds that we  
23 have allocated and allotted to them. So, we are on  
24 our end understanding that this economy is coming  
25 back. We are seeing signs of it coming back. We are

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 183

1 seeing some of the projected closures not really  
2 living up but we still see the challenge for some of  
3 these businesses.  
4

5 And so, we do hear you on that and that is a  
6 concern but after we've surveyed our businesses who  
7 received support from us and also, I will continue to  
8 look really at the economy as it comes back. We feel  
9 you know, very strong about having a diverse approach  
10 to you know our services that we provide. So, grants  
11 and loans. Some businesses need you know higher  
12 dollars in order to advance, do what they need to do.  
13 Others will you know take the grants as well, even  
14 though they are a bit smaller but that's a really  
15 infusion for them. So, we're trying and coming up  
16 with new ideas. 28 new programs we have launched and  
17 about to head into another series of programs to make  
18 sure that the investments that the city is making in  
19 our small business is being able to be sustainable  
20 after this period and beyond.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Commissioner. One  
22 of the things I liked particularly in my neighborhood  
23 are the Open Streets program. So, the Fiscal '22  
24 Executive Plan includes \$240,000 in Fiscal '21 and  
25 \$2.2 million in Fiscal '22 for the 40 Open Streets

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 184

2 program including two additional headcount. This  
3 program allows some roads to close to traffic,  
4 allowing for more outdoor space for pedestrians and  
5 restaurants.

6 So, how will SBS use the allocated funds to carry  
7 out this program?

8 JONNEL DORIS: Well, thank you so much and so you  
9 know as one of my favorite programs as well, the Open  
10 Streets program, the Open Restaurants program, the  
11 Open Storefronts program. Really a testament to the  
12 innovation right? That the city was able to do  
13 during the pandemic. You know, we have got you know  
14 11 plus thousand restaurants in the Open Restaurants  
15 program. Almost 800 businesses in the Open Store  
16 Fronts program and again, because of that innovation.

17 And so, SBS will support organizations who and  
18 CBO's who will be coordinating the closing of you  
19 know the streets and you know make sure and  
20 monitoring and make sure that the activities are in  
21 accordance with what the community is desiring. And  
22 so, that coordination, we will be able to support  
23 organizations with that funding. And of course, on  
24 our end, the headcount has helped us to manage all of  
25 the activity that goes along with such a broad

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 185

2 program and a broad expansion of a program that we  
3 all love.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, what will be the role of  
5 those additional employees? What will they be doing?

6 JONNEL DORIS: So, they will be supporting the  
7 CBO's who are working with us and coordinating with  
8 DOT, of course our partner here in this program to  
9 make sure that you know those commercial corridors  
10 have the support that the small businesses also on  
11 those corridors have support. Understanding you know  
12 what the rules are. Understanding how they can  
13 maximize this opportunity for them. So, we are doing  
14 direct support also for those particular businesses  
15 on the commercial corridors where the open streets  
16 are.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, can you just  
18 give me a sampling of some of those CBO's that you  
19 are working with?

20 JONNEL DORIS: Sure. I am going to ask Deputy  
21 Commissioner Backer, maybe he can give an idea of  
22 some of the CBO's we are working with.

23 BLAISE BACKER: Sure, of course happy to. Hi  
24 Chair Dromm. Uhm, so I mean, obviously at this point  
25 we have launched the opportunity to get that cash out

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 186

2 the door yet right, so it will be a grant that will  
3 be open both for FY21 and then FY22 but of course we  
4 are talking very closely with DOT's public space  
5 unit. Essentially, every for our pot of funds, every  
6 nonprofit that is hosting sort of an open street that  
7 is on a commercial district that's supporting open  
8 restaurants would be eligible to apply for this  
9 money.

10 So, you know like the Park Slope 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue bid  
11 for example, right on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue is one of the open  
12 boulevards that was just announced as well you know  
13 Belmont in the Bronx. So, you any organization  
14 essentially that is hosting a commercial focus open  
15 street would be eligible for the money.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so a lot of bids I hear  
17 you say.

18 BLAISE BACKER: And non-bids as well.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, okay. Will you share  
20 that information with us before you come to a final  
21 conclusion or is that - is there a way for us to know  
22 also what you intend to do with that funding?

23 BLAISE BACKER: Well, uhm, what I would say is  
24 that our goal is to get the money out as quickly as  
25 possible. Clearly, the FY21 money, these groups have

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 187

2 already been hosting open streets in some cases as  
3 early as mid-March, so we want to get the money out  
4 there and reimburse them as quickly as possible. Our  
5 goal is to model it after sort of our COVID-19  
6 strategic impact grant, so we can essentially, if an  
7 organization is eligible to apply to the money by  
8 hosting open street via DOT's process, they could  
9 then apply for that money in a very simple  
10 application process and we would turn it around you  
11 know as quickly as humanly possible, so we can get  
12 that money to them.

13 So, I don't - I am happy to share whatever the  
14 Council would like. I don't think the evaluation  
15 aspect of it will be highly simplified in order to  
16 get money out the door.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm just concerned about what  
18 you mean about the organizations that have been  
19 working with DOT. Those organizations. Who are  
20 those organizations? Those are the CBO's and I mean  
21 -

22 BLAISE BACKER: Yeah, my understanding is DOT's  
23 open street application process is open to -

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 188

BLAISE BACKER: And any nonprofit as well as a  
group of businesses that could come together to host  
it. So, we will essentially take those groups, any  
entity that has been approved via DOT's process and  
they would be eligible.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I got it. Thank you  
very much for that information. Let me turn it over  
to Chair Gjonaj for questions.

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Thank you Chair Dromm. I  
just want to follow up on Chair Dromm's question  
about the open streets and how we are going to decide  
whether it be these NGO's or commercial corridors,  
who makes the decision? Are we going to have  
community input. Early on when we had these open  
streets, communities were not afforded the  
opportunity in particular community boards and the  
impact was directly to those neighborhoods that have  
been serviced. But will we be assured there would  
more community input, that it won't be some NGO from  
out of the area that decides you know, this street  
looks great for the open street program?  
Commissioner?

JONNEL DORIS: Oh yeah, so, I am sorry, I thought  
Deputy Commissioner Backer was going to respond.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS

189

1  
2 BLAISE BACKER: Sorry, I was needed.

3 JONNEL DORIS: Go ahead. You can go.

4 BLAISE BACKER: I was just going to say, Chair  
5 Gjonaj, SBS is not – does not have a role in deciding  
6 where open streets would be.

7 So, right, that is DOT's role. So, DOT's  
8 application process does that. What I as saying to  
9 Chair Dromm is that once those have been decided by  
10 DOT, we would make those that are on commercial  
11 districts eligible for this additional support, so  
12 they are not having to you know use their existing  
13 funding for supporting open streets. But we are not  
14 involved in the process of selecting the open  
15 streets.

16 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Chair Dromm, I am going to  
17 ask that we stay engaged on this. I love the idea  
18 but we also want to make sure that communities have  
19 input where we have the open streets program. That  
20 stakeholders have a say. We don't want to PEG  
21 residents against commercial corridors and those that  
22 live and reside or commute to those neighborhoods  
23 that are impact by it.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 190

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and I think now as  
3 I understand it better, I will reach out to DOT on it  
4 as well.

5 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Thank you Chair. And like  
6 yourself Chair and as the Commissioner has often  
7 spoken about. I am concerned about our rebound. The  
8 230,000 businesses in New York City that call New  
9 York City home. 20 percent, we've seen reports as  
10 high as 33 – one-third of these businesses will not  
11 survive this pandemic.

12 Opening up these businesses is going to be the  
13 easier part. Making sure that they keep their doors  
14 open is going to be much more difficult. It's going  
15 to require more resources from us. And I can't think  
16 of a better platform or program besides the grant  
17 program to help stabilize our small businesses.

18 Loans are great but loans have to be repaid. And in  
19 this environment, those businesses taking on these  
20 loans and most of these loans require personal  
21 guarantees, meaning that they are bringing in all of  
22 their assets, their private homes are at stake if  
23 those businesses fail.

24 Commissioner, do we have any plan, long term plan  
25 to alleviate the personal guarantees on these loans

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 191

2 that these businesses are taking today with the  
3 intention of reopening and weathering this storm.

4 That they are not going to lose not only their  
5 livelihoods but their homes and other assets.

6 JONNEL DORIS: Thank you Mr. Chair for that and  
7 certainly, you've sort of mentioned and advocated and  
8 we appreciate that advocacy in the past and on these  
9 programs.

10 You know, we are in a process of developing this  
11 particular loan program with an investment from the  
12 city and as you know, a significant component, a  
13 majority of the component of these loan programs is  
14 from the private sector and so, we will certainly be  
15 championing in that calls there and speaking directly  
16 to our private partners about some of those  
17 requirements as much as we can but as much as you can  
18 imagine, we want to make sure that we leverage the  
19 city's dollars and stretch them as far as we possibly  
20 can.

21 And so, again on our existing loan products and  
22 we surveyed our recipients. We have heard from them.  
23 They are being able to meet those obligations and we  
24 certainly want to make sure in the process that that  
25 continues. Because we, like you said, no one wants

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 192

2 them to you know to be a negative impact on them for  
3 receiving a particular loan from the city. That's  
4 why we do have a diversified approach both loans and  
5 grants.

6 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Thank you Commissioner but  
7 these loans come with personal guarantees. They are  
8 risking their entire asset including in many cases  
9 their homes when they accept these loans. Why isn't  
10 the city doing more to perhaps take the  
11 responsibility, the personal guarantee of these loans  
12 on themselves? This should not be brought on by  
13 those businesses. Our city has an obligation in  
14 making sure that we help these businesses survive but  
15 ultimately because of the change in the environment.  
16 Whether it be consumer behavior changes, the internet  
17 ecommerce or other factors such as the pandemic that  
18 has forced them down, shutdown. But we don't allow  
19 them to bury themselves further in a hole and then  
20 risk all of their assets. This is our  
21 responsibility. That's the minimum the city can do.

22 JONNEL DORIS: Certainly Mr. Chair. You know we  
23 agree on making sure that small businesses are  
24 surviving and that are coming back, this infusion of  
25 cash into our budget we are very excited about. And

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 193

1 also, it gives us an opportunity to advocate for some  
2 of these particular requirements as you mentioned  
3 when it come to guarantees or interest as you know.  
4 Most of what we have put out has either been zero -  
5 actually all of it has been zero interest as well.  
6

7 So, you know, we are careful. We are thinking  
8 about that. That is on top of mind as we design  
9 these programs to make sure that small businesses do  
10 have the opportunity to engage but there is not  
11 desperate impact on those businesses going forward.

12 So, we certainly, we take all of this into  
13 consideration and as we build these programs.

14 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Commissioner, thank you for  
15 that answer. They are taking on these loans to  
16 survive.

17 JONNEL DORIS: Absolutely.

18 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: But that loan has to be  
19 repaid. There is no guarantee that their businesses  
20 will bounce back. That they can afford to repay  
21 them. I am afraid that we are spiraling on a  
22 downward turn here with further burying these small  
23 businesses.

24 But with that, I encourage you to continue to  
25 look at options to remove that personal guarantee.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 194

1  
2 Take on the liability – the city should be taking on  
3 that liability, so that we can ensure that they  
4 survive and that they are not forced to lose their  
5 home as well as other assets in the process.

6 And the best way we can do that is by continuing  
7 to market and educate New Yorkers. If you truly care  
8 and love the City of New York, shop local. Support  
9 your mom and pop shops. Stay off of Amazon. If you  
10 are going to purchase supplies and products on the  
11 internet, please do so through a local New York City  
12 store. That tax base is going to be important for  
13 our rebound as a city. Those jobs, the economy, the  
14 tax base that they are need that helping hand and we  
15 need to educate New Yorkers on that important and  
16 that you can tell me more about what you will be  
17 doing as SBS to educate New Yorkers on shopping  
18 locally.

19 JONNEL DORIS: Absolutely. Wow, you know we have  
20 walked many corridors together and knocked on many of  
21 our small businesses doors Mr. Chair and across the  
22 city and I just want to say, you know you know where  
23 our hearts is when it comes to the prioritization of  
24 small businesses in the city.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 195

1 We have launched our Shop Your City Campaign way  
2 back in November encouraging folks even throughout  
3 the holiday season to shop locally. We have done  
4 many variations of that up to now and we will  
5 continue to do that. We invested a marketing  
6 campaign. We have pushed out social media you know  
7 and everything that we can possibly do to let folks  
8 know that we need them to shop at their local stores,  
9 at their local restaurants, retail businesses and  
10 etc. and do stay off of you know the big box stores  
11 and really support our community and that's our small  
12 businesses.  
13

14 So, I do agree with you 100 percent. We have  
15 already invested I believe of over \$1 million in this  
16 campaign. We have additional funding within this  
17 particular '22 budget also for our Shop Your City  
18 Campaign. So, we are geared up to continue to invest  
19 and to let folks know and spread the word that we  
20 ought to shop your city.

21 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Thank you Commissioner.

22 What measures is the agency taking to ensure there is  
23 an equitable distribution to small businesses in all  
24 five boroughs? We have seen early on that the grants  
25 and loans that were being provided through the city

1 either directly or through federal state programs did  
2 not make its way into every neighborhood equally.  
3 What are we going to do to assure that there is real  
4 checks and balances here moving forward? The money  
5 is already too limited. It doesn't go far enough and  
6 that very low, the minimal resources that we do have  
7 out there are not making it into those communities  
8 that need it most.

10 JONNEL DORIS: Well, thank you so much Chair  
11 Gjonaj and I just want to thank you for your work  
12 here as well to make sure that we are focused on  
13 equity and making sure that we sort of infused our  
14 resources in every borough.

15 So, as you know, when I first came back in May,  
16 we started our five borough strategy and it was  
17 really about, how do we get the resources of this  
18 particular agency to every borough and address the  
19 needs that we can as equitably as possible. So we  
20 have been committed to that. Making sure that those  
21 resources and even how we have designed programs.  
22 How we did outreach. How we are doing that even now  
23 also has been a very, very important focus.

24 Our focus on LMI communities. Our focus on the  
25 communities that have been hit the hardest.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 197

2 Following the data, we have done that. When it  
3 pertains to where resources were going from the  
4 federal government and making sure that our programs  
5 are responsive to where the gaps are.

6 So, that's why we launched our program specific  
7 around LMI communities just as an example. 112,000  
8 LMI businesses in the city, only about 66,000 of them  
9 get some federal resources. So, you are looking at  
10 about 40,000, 45,000, 46,000 businesses who did not  
11 get anything. So if you look at our programs now  
12 that we are about to launch and sort of the initial  
13 descriptions and understanding of what we are looking  
14 to do as we design them. They are focused on low to  
15 moderate income communities.

16 And I think that is in response having a data  
17 driven targeted approach to make sure that we are  
18 getting to the folks out there who need it the most.  
19 And it really is at the core of what we are doing  
20 here. It's part of our mission at SBS and certainly  
21 look forward to maximizing that as we go forward.

22 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Thank you Commissioner. I  
23 am going to ask a few more questions and then pass it  
24 back because many of my colleagues I am sure have  
25 questions for you as well.

1 The city announced programs to help small  
2 businesses. Our businesses aren't even aware that  
3 the help exists or existed. Can you give more  
4 details on what outreach efforts SBS is willing to  
5 make sure these loans and programs are - that we  
6 inform those small businesses number one.  
7

8 Number two, the pandemic effected the contracts  
9 the city has with non-for-profit organizations that  
10 you rely on. In particular, I believe in your  
11 opening statement you mentioned Avenue NYC program.  
12 Here we are negotiating and hopefully we will  
13 finalize this years budget next month or so. Those  
14 not-for-profits are still waiting for that funding  
15 from last year.

16 So, if you are going to say your educational  
17 component is through your partnerships with Chambers  
18 and bids and other NGO's, they are still waiting for  
19 the money from last budget. How are we going to  
20 expect them to take on this responsibility now when  
21 they haven't been paid for the work or been given the  
22 resources to do the work last year?

23 JONNEL DORIS: Thank you so much Mr. Chair for  
24 that. On the outreach front, you know we do partner  
25 with our nonprofit partners, our bids, our chambers.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 199

2 We do partner with our NGO's and others in the small  
3 business space and we do partner with them to get the  
4 word out. We have worked with over 100 organizations  
5 during the pandemic to make sure that they receive  
6 information and then carry out our resource. We also  
7 have a business solution centers in every borough who  
8 also works along with those organizations and the  
9 community to make sure everyone is aware of our  
10 resources. And of course, you know we have invested  
11 significant dollars in marketing, so that again,  
12 small businesses are aware of what we are doing. And  
13 certainly on the contracts, look, I think you  
14 certainly are hitting a concern there which I believe  
15 is very, very important. You know, when we first  
16 came you know into the pandemic, we had - there was  
17 delays as you can imagine with some of the programs  
18 itself and then getting the dollars just allocated  
19 due to the fact of where the city was fiscally.

20 So, we have since spoke to and met with some of  
21 those nonprofits. You are mentioning here, talking  
22 about who were having some difficulty navigating the  
23 process. Our team, our neighborhood development team  
24 work with those groups particularly on our NYC  
25 program but we do offer some bridge loans as well.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 200

2 We offer all types of resources to make sure that  
3 they are getting the results that they need. But  
4 certainly, on these contracts, it is you know, it's  
5 been difficult for some of our grantees but this is  
6 top of mind for us. We have already spoken  
7 internally. We met with them. This came up as you  
8 probably heard or know on our weekly bid calls. We  
9 do address these issues and so, this is top of mind  
10 and we want to make sure that if an NGO is  
11 struggling, a community based organization is  
12 struggling, one of our partners are struggling to get  
13 the funding, we are there to support them and make  
14 sure that their contracts are registered. Make sure  
15 that they do get the funding and just to say, like  
16 you know something that we did a bit differently  
17 during the pandemic that I think you know, we sort of  
18 adjusted how we did our contract and did some  
19 contract innovations. And where you know we, in our  
20 SIG grants, our Strategic Impact Grants COVID-19  
21 grants, we would pay \$20,000 up front and not have to  
22 wait for the reimbursement from some of those groups.

23 So, we have tried a few things to make some  
24 adjustments. But we will continue to make sure of  
25 that and certainly, if there are organizations who

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 201

are still having some difficulty, we are happy to  
work with them.

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Commissioner, this is wide  
spread. This is in the pipeline. This is federal  
dollars that have been issued that the City of New  
York has not gotten to the NGO's. As you referred to  
them, to your own partners.

And I know of many cases and I know I am sure you  
are aware of some as well. It is across the board.  
The city, I can't understand why has not streamlined  
that funding. It's 11 months later. We are  
finalizing this budget negotiation and those NGO's  
have not received the funding promised last year.  
Through no fault of their own. They are being told  
to run through you know, run in circles. It's all in  
a pipeline somewhere that no one understands and I  
believe one of the quotes was, it's in some black  
box. We just can't find the box. That was an answer  
an NGO was given.

JONNEL DORIS: Wow, well sir, I would love, that  
has not been the appropriate answer. So, that was  
given from our team and would love to go with the  
[INAUDIBLE 4:21:26], so we can help them. That  
community based organization. Look, we've met again

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 202

1 with our partners across the city on this. As I  
2 mentioned, just recently with our bids, all 76 of  
3 them on a call, we did discuss the process. We are  
4 putting some new procedures in place so that we can  
5 further tackle this upfront but look it's a non - it  
6 is a challenge for come of our community-based  
7 organizations who are helping us as well.  
8

9 So, look, we are working. I am sure there is  
10 more that we can do there but certainly again, we've  
11 done procurement innovations, some different  
12 contracting innovations to speed up the process.

13 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: It's not the process  
14 Commissioner. I apologize, they have slowed it down.  
15 The system was bad before, we made it a lot worse and  
16 it is across the board. I see that there are others  
17 that have questions for you Commissioner. Can you  
18 give us an outline of the loans and grant programs  
19 that have been allocated and how much has already  
20 gone through the system into the hands of our small  
21 businesses? And you mentioned a number of programs,  
22 help us understand the dollar amounts and how much of  
23 those dollars have actually been distributed.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 203

JONNEL DORIS: Sure, by — I mean, so total you  
know this is out of our rent and loan programs you  
are referring to.

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Yes.

JONNEL DORIS: Okay, so, I just want to make sure  
I got the number here. So, you know we've supported  
a total of about \$63 million has been out the door to  
small businesses in those programs, those —

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: How much?

JONNEL DORIS: About, I believe it is about to  
date what I have here is about \$63 million.

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: \$63 million in total has  
gone out the door for 230,000 businesses?

JONNEL DORIS: Yes, so from the four grant  
programs and two loan programs that we have  
administered so far, we still have our interest rate  
reduction grant that is also open and LMI as well  
that we are still processing and getting monies out  
to businesses. But as of right now, I believe the  
total is around \$63 million.

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: That's \$273.91 for every  
business that closed in New York City. That's the  
breakdown on that average. How many — how many —  
what's the hold up Commissioner? It's a year. We

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 204

1 are coming out of a pandemic and if – what's the  
2 total dollar amount? So, if \$63 million has made it  
3 to the small businesses, what's the total dollar  
4 amount?  
5

6 JONNEL DORIS: Yeah, let me, let me, again, so  
7 there is a couple things here. So, there is programs  
8 that we have implemented. There is programs and  
9 services that we provided to small businesses  
10 connected under resources that were available on the  
11 federal level, private level and foundation level.

12 So, let me back up. So, the first thing is, the  
13 first number I am giving you, that number is out of  
14 the four grants and two loan programs that we have  
15 administered directly. That's meaning that the city  
16 has done directly. That's the \$63 million I spoke  
17 about.

18 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: What's the total?

19 JONNEL DORIS: So, there is –

20 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Okay, what's the total of  
21 those loan programs. The total dollar amount that  
22 was budgeted?

23 JONNEL DORIS: For our loan program, I think  
24 we've got another 20 – one second, I apologize, let  
25 me try to get the number here. So, for our LMI

1 storefront program, I believe that the, we have about  
2  
3 I think approximately anyway we think 15 or so  
4 million I believe left in that program.

5 But again, we have applications already and they  
6 are being disbursed, so we are confident that we will  
7 meet the needs of that program. But we wanted to  
8 bring it up a bit to the broader issue of we have  
9 helped over 5,000 businesses connect to 147 million.  
10 That's just in private, state, city, our dollars etc.  
11 So, that's five - actual \$147 million into the hand  
12 of businesses and that's through our work. Then, on  
13 the PPP side, very specifically, over 4,200, 4,200  
14 businesses connecting them and working with them to  
15 get \$300 million in PPP funding.

16 So, I think you know our - from our loan programs  
17 but also working with businesses externally to make  
18 sure that they have resources that are available such  
19 as from the federal PPP program. That's over 4,000  
20 businesses alone that we have helped there and also,  
21 coming back to state, local, philanthropic, private  
22 dollars, \$147 million there and 5,000 businesses we  
23 have helped to date.

24 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Commissioner, maybe we can  
25 have someone look at those numbers, so we can come

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 206

1  
2 back to them one more time. And the work connected,  
3 doesn't mean that the money has made it into the  
4 hands of those small businesses. Because obviously  
5 you are connected with the loan program and that  
6 money has not made it to the small businesses and  
7 that's to your own programs.

8 So, I am hopeful we are going to sit down and  
9 talk a little bit more about these numbers. I want  
10 to turn it over to the Chair or the City Council  
11 Staff so the other Council Members can ask a few  
12 questions and on the second round, I will follow up  
13 with you on that breakdown again. Thank you  
14 Commissioner.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Gjonaj. If  
16 any Council Members have questions for SBS, please  
17 use the Zoom raise hand function and you will be  
18 added to the queue. Council Members, please keep  
19 your questions to five minutes including answers.  
20 Please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to tell you when  
21 your time begins. The Sergeant will then let you  
22 know when your time is up.

23 We will now hear from Council Member Rosenthal.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 207

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, thank you so  
3 much. Thank you Chair Gjonaj and Commissioner.  
4 Welcome, it's always great to see you. I have three  
5 sets of questions.

6 First, in terms of small business assistance.  
7 How are you, how have you been conducting outreach to  
8 immigrant small business owners that are not  
9 connected to organizations like a bid or a chamber of  
10 commerce?

11 JONNEL DORIS: Well, thank you so much for that  
12 question Council Member. So, a few things we  
13 continue to do, one is to be out there in those  
14 communities physically. Walking and speaking to  
15 those businesses. We have done that over 80  
16 corridors across the city. Thousands of businesses  
17 door to door. I have been out to about 45 of them  
18 myself and speaking in those corridors with those  
19 businesses handing out materials, letting them know  
20 about our resources.

21 Secondly, you know from our website, our  
22 materials, all of them are translated as well into  
23 multiple languages to make sure that they know our  
24 hotline also. We have over I believe 100 languages  
25 that they can call and ask and speak to – and get

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 208

2 information on and then our outreach team, our you  
3 know uh, again, 94 I believe the number is actually.  
4 The corridors that we have walked in and several,  
5 this week, we are going back out again you know this  
6 week and next to make sure that we can keep that work  
7 up.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Commissioner, I have  
9 five minutes and I am sorry to interrupt but just, I  
10 don't have a sense of scale when you say 96 corridors  
11 or I visited 24 stores. What do you think the  
12 universe is of stores that where the owner is an  
13 immigrant owner, can't speak English and is not part  
14 of a bid or you know a chamber of commerce. I just  
15 want to get a sense of scale. Do you think you have  
16 hit 10 percent of those stores? 20? 80 percent?

17 JONNEL DORIS: Well, I can't put a number on it.  
18 I would say that about 50 percent or so of our small  
19 business owners in the city are immigrant born but  
20 you know obviously some speak English -

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: How many of those  
22 stores do you think your SBS has hit?

23 JONNEL DORIS: Well, we target LMI communities  
24 which overlap with communities that do speak

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 209

different languages and also our immigrant community.

So, that is where we have been.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, so just to be  
clear for the record, you haven't answered my  
question. I hear you target them. I hear you have  
gone out. I was asking and maybe you can give it  
another time, a sense of proportionality, right? So,  
what percentage of those immigrant communities has  
SBS been able to reach?

JONNEL DORIS: Well, I've been -

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, should we move on  
or do you have an answer? Only because I am on a  
clock.

JONNEL DORIS: Well, I believe I answered your  
question. I mean, we have targeted those communities  
that -

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I heard you say you do  
a lot and I appreciate that. I am just going to move  
on, I don't want to sort of wrangle over verbiage but  
I wish you knew the answer. I guess I will just  
leave it there.

What is the - next, I would like to ask about  
commercial lease assistance. Do you have a sense,

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 210

2 what is the demographic and regional breakdown of the  
3 businesses who have been assisted through the CLA?

4 JONNEL DORIS: Sure, the majority of the folks we  
5 have assisted in that program have been either  
6 minority or women owned businesses. Uhm, we will, if  
7 you give me a second we can get additional – all the  
8 demographics for you.

9 Uhm, we can pull it up, just need a minute to –

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Is it on a public  
11 website for me to look at or do you want to send the  
12 spreadsheet over? You can just –

13 JONNEL DORIS: Absolutely, we can get you that  
14 information, absolutely.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, is it public  
16 information?

17 JONNEL DORIS: We have publicized this in press  
18 releases and uhm, and alike, yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Can you send it over  
20 today?

21 JONNEL DORIS: Absolutely.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Where are the  
23 referrals coming from for people to get assistance?

24 JONNEL DORIS: Well through our vendor has a  
25 robust operation where they do partner with community

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 211

groups to do outreach and get referrals. The  
referrals come through our hotline. Referrals come  
from elected officials. Referrals come from  
community partners.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

JONNEL DORIS: It's a multiple source.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Chair, I am about half  
way done. May I continue?

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Absolutely, please Council  
Member Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you Chair  
Gjonaj. The pace will pick up, I promise. Uhm, I am  
wondering why did SBS change the intake process to  
make the business owners go through the SBS portal?  
I ask that because it adds an additional burden to  
those with limited English proficiency. And how does  
intake happen for those who need language assistance?

JONNEL DORIS: Yeah, thank you. So, the portal  
is an opportunity for obviously for us to grab the  
information on the business coming so we can better  
serve them. Again, all of our programs as required,  
if folks need assistance with language, we do grant  
that and they are able to get the resources that they  
need.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 212

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: How would that even  
3 happen, so that they would know? Like, let's say  
4 they somehow know about the portal, go on there. Is  
5 it in already ten different languages that they could  
6 find or I don't know.

7 JONNEL DORIS: Yeah, I mean, if the language is  
8 requested. Say for instance, if you call our  
9 hotline, there is a land in several languages there  
10 once you land and it takes you to where you may need  
11 and someone can help. There are interpreters waiting  
12 to join. So, your call, you request that number on  
13 one of the prompts and it takes you to, to get the  
14 translation that you would need.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Got it. So, for many  
16 of these businesses especially those which where the  
17 owners don't speak proficient English, they have  
18 already been served court papers. And it's my  
19 understanding that if that's the case, uhm, then they  
20 cannot be helped by a CLA attorney. Is that correct?

21 JONNEL DORIS: They have not been serviced?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: In other words, they  
23 have already been served with court papers and they  
24 are being told that they cannot get help through the  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 213

2 commercial lease assistant attorney program because  
3 they have already been served court papers.

4 JONNEL DORIS: Let me, Council Member, let me  
5 check on that and get back to you on that particular  
6 issue.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Uhm, it sounds to me,  
8 I am getting this question from advocates. It sounds  
9 to me like a fairly common. I appreciate your  
10 investigating it more. The follow up question to  
11 that is how many businesses were denied service  
12 because their case already had you know a court index  
13 number, right? So, in other words the larger problem  
14 is that I am sure you know we have this in house all  
15 the time. Those cases take a long time. They are  
16 harder.

17 But especially for you know non-English speaking  
18 businesses, they can land in a place where they have  
19 already been served court papers before they even  
20 know to reach out.

21 So, that's the point of it and I get so you know,  
22 the finale on that is just, can you change your  
23 policy so that people who have already been served  
24 court papers can get the legal assistance they need  
25 for their commercial lease negotiations.

2 Lastly on inspections, Asian American business  
3 owners have complained of unfair and targeted  
4 inspection practices in certain immigrant  
5 neighborhoods. So, I am wondering what SBS, if SBS  
6 is aware of it. If SBS already has a team that works  
7 to do outreach and you know advocate for the  
8 businesses that have been given an unfair inspection  
9 you know by the city.

10 Uhm, and whether or not the SBS has staff and how  
11 much to help business owners navigate through their  
12 responding to that inspection or any follow up to the  
13 violations?

14 JONNEL DORIS: So, certainly thank you for that  
15 question. So, yes, we do have a team. We have  
16 compliance advisors who work with the various  
17 businesses across the city. We actually launched a  
18 virtual compliance program this summer because of all  
19 again, all of what's happening with the virus and all  
20 the challenges that businesses are having coming back  
21 and the fact that we couldn't meet in person. At one  
22 point, we you know something virtual for them. We  
23 felt I believe over 300 businesses there.

24 So, we do have a team of compliance advisors who  
25 do go around and help those businesses resolve the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 215

issues. We also have our hotline again, we call into  
the hotline, we connect -

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I just want to be able  
to let Council Member Adams ask her questions. So,  
uhm, I mean, so let me try at it from this direction.  
Have you heard that there is a problem with city  
inspectors making it harder for Asian immigrant  
businesses? Are you aware of that?

JONNEL DORIS: Well, I wouldn't say that I am  
aware that the city inspectors are targeted Asian  
businesses. I don't believe businesses are being  
targeted into particular groups.

I would say that we have launched the first ever  
Asian American Small Business Taskforce here at SBS  
this year who have met for some time and we have  
addressed challenges from the community that was  
raised and we certainly continue to work with that  
group every day. I mean, we are going out with them  
as well and members of the group with other agencies  
to address those challenges. So, we are on top,  
certainly on top of this issue.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Chair Gjonaj, thank  
you very much. I mean, I guess I would just end by  
saying that the advocates would not - sorry, a little

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 216

fly running around. The advocates would not have  
sent me this question if it wasn't a problem.

So, you know maybe you could check back and do a  
little more investigation on that. Thank you very  
much. Thanks Chair.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member  
Rosenthal. Council Member Adams?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much Chair  
Dromm. Thank you Chair Gjonaj. Thank you  
Commissioner Doris, it's good to see you. I just  
wanted to recognize the work that you have done in  
our district in 28. Work that we haven't seen before  
as far assisting us with our SBS walks. My community  
happens to be one of the most diverse in the city, if  
not the most with more languages than any other in  
the city. And we have seen you assisting in the  
Caribbean Punjab India Bangladeshi along our  
corridors in Southeast Queens. So, I did want to  
acknowledge and thank you for that.

To Council Member Rosenthal's point, I am  
concerned and you before you got to where you are as  
Commissioner, you were the kind of M/WBE for us and  
my concern is still, I know yours as well, with the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS

217

1  
2 M/WBE community, how will we rebound after the  
3 pandemic some of the work that SBS is doing for them  
4 to make sure that they remain alive and afloat? I am  
5 very concerned about the harm that has been done to  
6 them as Council Member Rosenthal alluded to. The  
7 financial harm that continues as we speak when it  
8 comes to state penalties incurred on our small  
9 businesses and I believe also that our small  
10 businesses and M/WBE's are being targeted by the way.  
11 I believe that.

12       So, how is SBS assisting our M/WBE's when it  
13 comes to the penalties inflicted. The cruel  
14 penalties that are being inflicted by them,  
15 particularly during this COVID season. We are  
16 talking sanitation; we could be talking signage.  
17 It's just a myriad of things that they could very  
18 well fix and are not given the opportunity to do so.  
19 They are just slapped with fines.

20       I just wanted to ask that and again, thank you  
21 for all the work that you are doing in Southeast  
22 Queens particularly in District 28.

23       JONNEL DORIS: Thank you Council Member and I do  
24 echo the concern, which I think we alluded to earlier  
25 on around LMI communities, Black, Brown, Asian

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS

218

1 businesses and the struggle that they are having  
2 during this time. I mean, the challenge for  
3 financing. The challenge to get opportunities,  
4 certainly has been even more desperate for those  
5 communities and I think it's been proven throughout  
6 down to even the federal resources and initially  
7 where they were going and how they were being  
8 distributed. And I think that is not something that  
9 is lost on us. And so, what we have done there is to  
10 make sure that we double down on how we present and  
11 design our programs. So, as you alluded to, some of  
12 the direct outreach to those businesses in those  
13 corridors and then also, creating programs such as  
14 the ones we've proposed in \$100 million for grants,  
15 \$100 million for loans. Where the component that's  
16 tied to LMI. So, we know that there is an overlay of  
17 Black and Brown and Asian businesses in those  
18 communities and if we target those communities, we  
19 will certainly reach them and help supplement some of  
20 the challenges that they are seeing. You know  
21 particularly, for instance, Black businesses four  
22 times have likely to decline a loan right now in the  
23 market. Twice as likely to close, so we have to  
24 double down our efforts there. Asian American  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 219

2 businesses as well struggling, even before the  
3 shutdown happened due to xenophobia etc.. We have  
4 our Asian American Small Business Taskforce. Latinx,  
5 we've worked with the consulates for our Latinx  
6 businesses to work with them to connect them and get  
7 more into the community. We have done a tremendous  
8 amount of work there but certainly there is more to  
9 be done.

10 And when it comes to inspections and violations  
11 or summonses, as you know, the Mayor has set a  
12 reduction in fees and fines 50 percent through the  
13 pandemic, about 40 percent and we have added another  
14 73 or so for violations to be cured to the list of  
15 things to bring that down to - bring it up, sorry, to  
16 50 percent to meet the Mayor's mark by the end of the  
17 year.

18 So, we are on target to do that. I believe the  
19 Council has a bill that we were supportive of and are  
20 supportive of to continue with making sure that there  
21 is a cure periods etc. for small businesses. So, we  
22 are in the trenches with them and certainly our  
23 hotline and also our small business advocates in  
24 compliance. Advisors, we work to advocate with them  
25 and for them with other agencies that they may get a

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 220

fine or summons from. So, that work is certainly  
ongoing.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you. Thank you for  
your answer and I will just also reiterate the  
concern when it comes to language and language  
access. Language barriers and that's just not with  
your agency it's with all of the agencies across the  
city, so everybody needs to get a handle on that. It  
is sorely needed in the city and again, I think you  
for your testimony. It's great to see you.

JONNEL DORIS: Thank you Council Member.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you and Council Member  
Koo has a question.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Commissioner, thank you.

JONNEL DORIS: Thank you Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you for your rent tour  
in Flushing. My question to you is about the racial  
inclusion and equity. The administration guidelines  
seem to default [INAUDIBLE 4:47:00] the 33 zip codes  
and neighborhoods identified by the task force on  
racial inclusion and equity.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 221

2 Flushing is still not one of those laborers that  
3 needs to be included. While you can say all those  
4 programs - I know that none of the funding is coming  
5 to my neighborhood because you have not prioritized.

6 So, my first question is, our businesses were  
7 uniquely impacted due to racism and fear. A high  
8 majority of our local businesses, mom and pop stores  
9 who are struggling to keep their doors open, they are  
10 immigrant and M/WBE owned and if you break down our  
11 demographics, 11355 and 11354, are working class  
12 neighborhoods.

13 In addition, for the past ten weeks, our COVID  
14 waste are the highest or second highest continuously  
15 for the last ten weeks. So, when will our community  
16 be included on the list of impacted zip codes?

17 JONNEL DORIS: Well, thank you for that question.  
18 Council Member as you know, we I think I mentioned  
19 when I was out there again, that part of Flushing is  
20 one of the communities I have been out the most  
21 during this pandemic because as the situation as you  
22 stipulated there, we have had a significant number of  
23 grants and loans in that and we visited some of those  
24 businesses as well. But certainly, you know, we will  
25 certainly take that back. I mean, we don't set the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS

222

1 neighborhoods but certainly you have seen the  
2 emphasis we have put on Flushing that our partners at  
3 the Flushing bid is also doing a fantastic and  
4 amazing job. We worked with those businesses and  
5 really a significant portion of SBS resources have  
6 been deployed to that area. I start even Small  
7 Business Saturday out there first stop. Many times  
8 also going and speak back again to businesses who  
9 received our LMI storefront program as well.  
10

11 And so, really across China Town, neighborhoods  
12 across the city, both in Flushing, Sunset Park,  
13 Homecrest, Bensonhurst, China Town Manhattan, Forest  
14 Hills, etc. You know we have given out about 763  
15 loans and grants and awards over \$10 million I  
16 believe to those areas and counting. You know, I  
17 just wanted to make sure we continue to do work  
18 there. I think we also expanded the Flushing bid as  
19 you know and really doubled their assessment as well.  
20 So, we are committed to that community and will  
21 continue to do more.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, but I wanted to  
23 include Flushing as one of the zip codes. You know  
24 because there are 33 areas the city prioritized but  
25 you didn't target Flushing at all. And another

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 223

2 thing, I was told that Flushing sold, which I have  
3 never heard before. It's included. However, the zip  
4 code for Flushing southeast is actually Jamaica. So,  
5 can you fix that on the city's website? There is no  
6 such thing as Flushing is sold, it's Jamaica and they  
7 include that as Flushing now. So, I want you to  
8 prioritize and make sure 11355 and 11354 are in your  
9 areas.

10 And also -

11 JONNEL DORIS: Yeah, oh, I'm sorry. I was just  
12 going to say I will take it back to Flushing.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: This is the first time I  
14 have heard you have an Asian Business Taskforce. Can  
15 you share some information on it?

16 JONNEL DORIS: Oh, yeah, that's the taskforce  
17 that Michael Fong runs for us. So, that's the same  
18 one we are talking about. Yeah, so you - they have  
19 been out there with you as well. And I mean, you  
20 know that's the taskforce. So, they meet, the  
21 taskforce has been meeting I believe since January  
22 every other week. We have members from the  
23 community, I believe elected officials as well,  
24 others are on that and we have done a lot of great  
25 work there. And your staff, I believe is on, that's

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 224

the same - I don't know if the name is mixed up, but  
it's the same one that some of your staff members are  
on as well and we actually did some of the tours  
with.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay, I have other questions  
I need to email to you or I will call you later.

Yeah, thank you.

JONNEL DORIS: Thank you Council Member as  
always.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I am going to ask  
if there are any other Council Member questions to  
please raise your hand at this time. I see no  
further hands Chairs Dromm and Gjonaj.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I know that Chair Gjonaj has  
some follow up questions. Chair Gjonaj?

CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Thank you Chair Dromm.  
Rather than take up the questions regarding the  
dollar amounts that were allocated, how much more  
Commissioner, perhaps I can follow up with you at a  
later date as we go through those numbers together  
and evaluate.

I just see we can get out of our own way. I  
receive phone calls just like you do day in and day

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 225

2 out from small businesses saying please, help me.

3 Where can I get a loan or a grant? When I hear this  
4 money is still stuck in the pipeline, that it's not  
5 making it out to those small businesses, it really  
6 gets to me because I feel their pain and I know that  
7 they really need the help more now than ever before.

8 So, we will talk at a later date on the dollar  
9 amounts that are still in the system that haven't  
10 made their way to those small businesses. But I did  
11 want to follow up with, and Chair Dromm, I will share  
12 you on that as we begin and continue having these  
13 conversations to make sure that every dollar gets out  
14 there. There is no reason for those dollars to  
15 remain in a black box or in the pipeline.

16 You indicated in your opening statement, of the  
17 \$317.6 million or 32 percent of the budget SBS is a  
18 pass through funding which is not spent or managed by  
19 SBS. There is an increase of 21 positions for SBS  
20 reflected in the fiscal 2022 Executive Budget when  
21 compared to the Fiscal 2021 Adopted budget. What are  
22 those 21 additional positions and what programs are  
23 they associated with?

24 JONNEL DORIS: Yes, thank you Council Member.

25 So, yes, certainly so the budgets are - the lines are

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 226

2 associated with the Open Streets Program. The  
3 Accelerate Small Business One Stop Shop program is  
4 ten lines there. Career pathways, so some of our  
5 workforce programs five lines are there. Avenue NYC  
6 program, some additional lines there. The Commercial  
7 Lease Assistance program and then some – we have some  
8 lines there and then lines for the Small Business  
9 Grant program to help us execute that efficiently.

10 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Okay, so all 21 positions  
11 are direct services related to SBS and there was some  
12 faster?

13 JONNEL DORIS: Yes, absolutely correct. Yeah,  
14 that's all our lines.

15 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: And the Fiscal '22 Executive  
16 Plan includes \$1 million in Fiscal '21 to all New  
17 Yorkers on New Rank Choice Voting System ahead of  
18 June's Primary Elections. Why is this – wow, this is  
19 very important and an initiative that we need to  
20 educate New Yorkers on Rank Choice Voting. I'm not  
21 sure how this relates to SBS primary responsibilities  
22 of helping small businesses. Can you clarify how SBS  
23 is a pass through for voting media campaign?

24 JONNEL DORIS: Yeah, this is uh, some dollars are  
25 added to our budget to help spread the word.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 227

2 Marketing, advertisement, investments in language  
3 access, accessibility resources, direct outreach to  
4 community groups, M/WBE's, small businesses etc.,  
5 around Rank Choice Voting.

6 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Commissioner, with the  
7 problems that our small businesses are facing, when  
8 they are calling SBS, they are looking for guidance  
9 from SBS, it's not about rank choice voting. It's  
10 about loans, grants, red tape, violations, tax  
11 burdens, how to reopen, how to stay open. We need to  
12 reprioritize what SBS should be focused on and it  
13 should not be rank choice. That is just mind  
14 boggling to me, that this is your responsibility on  
15 educating New Yorkers on rank choice voting.

16 Commissioner, I think you froze.

17 JONNEL DORIS: Oh sorry. Can you, can you hear  
18 me? Yeah, no, so look, as you know our entire agency  
19 is focused on small businesses. This is what we do  
20 every day. All our resources you know is put there.  
21 And so certainly, we are focused there and everything  
22 we are doing is focused on our small businesses.

23 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: But yet \$1 million Rank  
24 Choice, the limited resources. Chair Dromm, we've  
25 got a lot of work to do. Commissioner, I truly

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 228

2 appreciate you. We have been out there together. We  
3 have seen the pain first hand. You have heard from  
4 those small businesses, those microbusinesses on all  
5 of the issues that they are facing. I just, we will  
6 continue working together and I hope this budget is  
7 going to be more reflective of the needs of our small  
8 businesses and their focus. They deserve it. They  
9 have earned it. We need to be there for them more  
10 than ever before.

11 I am fearful of the city's future. I don't know  
12 what this new world is going to look like but I do  
13 know this much, our small businesses were in trouble  
14 before the pandemic. During the pandemic, through no  
15 fault of their own, they were shuttered close. They  
16 had to reinvent themselves. We know that 20 to 30  
17 percent of our businesses will not reopen. The only  
18 reason some of these businesses currently are open is  
19 because they are not paying rent and the eviction  
20 moratorium. When that rent is due, when those loans  
21 are due and the business is not there, our commercial  
22 corridors will be changed forever. We need to invest  
23 in those businesses today. We need to educate New  
24 Yorkers on shopping local, not rank choice. That's  
25 not your expertise.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 229

2 Chair Dromm, I pass it back to you. And we need  
3 to make sure that every dollar that we have in this  
4 limited loans and grants makes it to those small  
5 businesses sooner than later. Not holding onto it or  
6 finding ways not to get it to them. Thank you.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Dromm, Council Member  
8 Powers Brooks has her hand up. I don't know if she  
9 is currently available. Let's give her a second to  
10 see if she can come back to her computer. There she  
11 is.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry about that  
13 and good afternoon everyone and good afternoon  
14 Commissioner. I just want to echo the sentiments of  
15 my colleague Council Member Adams. I first would  
16 like to say thank you so much for the time and  
17 attention you have paid to the Southeast Queens  
18 community and in fact, we have toured the 31<sup>st</sup>  
19 Council District several times over the course of the  
20 pandemic and it is much appreciated and I am looking  
21 forward to continuing to build on those  
22 conversations. I just wanted to emphasize and  
23 underscore the need for especially communities that  
24 have been hit hardest from the COVID-19 pandemic to  
25 ensure that we are paying special attention in terms

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 230

of the recovery to them. And so, I am interested in  
understanding what grants can be made available to  
the businesses that are located in for example,  
communities that have been most impacted by the  
COVID-19 pandemic.

We know at the beginning, the PPP, 66 percent  
when it's in Manhattan and I know you have been  
intentional in trying to correct that but as we go  
into Fiscal Year '22, especially interested in  
understanding what the course of action is to  
prioritize those communities.

JONNEL DORIS: Hi, Council Member. Thank you for  
that question. Certainly, it's a pleasure to be out  
there in the trenches and walking those corridors  
with you and Council Member Adams and Council Member  
Gjonaj and all the Council Members that I had a  
chance to do that with throughout the pandemic.

Look, we understand the need there and again, as  
I mentioned in the, with \$100 million in grants, we  
are prioritizing small businesses, microbusinesses.  
We are also targeting LMI communities, low to  
moderate income communities, communities also that  
were hardest hit with the loan program. We are going  
to be reaching out to businesses that we know as I

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 231

2 mentioned before 44,000 to 46,000 LMI businesses not  
3 receive any federal funding and support. All of  
4 those, those sort of layered and geographically if I  
5 may in some of your districts and some other Council  
6 Members districts. So, we want to make sure that we  
7 prioritize that. We certainly want to make sure that  
8 they get those resources and that's why we are  
9 designing these programs the way we are.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And thank you for  
11 that. Also, if I can ask that your agency consider  
12 creating processes that will remove some of the red  
13 tape and give preferential treatment to the  
14 communities that have like the hardest or highest  
15 positivity rates in terms of COVID-19. I know that  
16 there have been some businesses in particular for  
17 example in the Rockaway downtown area that as a  
18 result of the pandemic has since closed their doors.  
19 Some are struggling to keep them open but if there  
20 could be like a specific effort around that, that  
21 would be much appreciated.

22 JONNEL DORIS: Thank you Council Member and you  
23 know look, we have through our hotline, through our  
24 outreach, we have heard from businesses. You know I  
25 have walked that corridor many times through this

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 232

2 pandemic as well and I have seen absolute struggle  
3 that those small businesses are having and spoke to  
4 them directly right there in the community. And you  
5 know look, I think we have additional funding in our  
6 budget for our one stop shop cut red tape initiative  
7 that we are going to be building on as we get the  
8 resources in. And certainly, we will make sure that  
9 we do target those communities to make sure to let  
10 them know that these massive changes come and the  
11 resources are going to be there but we will say that  
12 we have a hotline and 60,000 businesses have reached  
13 out to us during the pandemic. We have helped every  
14 single one of them and we want to make sure that  
15 businesses also know that they can reach out to us at  
16 anytime and get that help and that support to make  
17 sure that we are getting through all of the red tape  
18 that they may run into.

19 And so, clarifying the regulatory requirements.  
20 Clarifying you know what they need to do. Our  
21 virtual compliance teams also available to make sure  
22 that those businesses understand the challenges. We  
23 understand the challenges they are facing and also  
24 for us to help resolve those matters. We have done  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 233

that you know over 300,000 businesses at our virtual  
compliance team.

And so, I certainly hear you on that and we are  
going to certainly double down on that, particular  
with this new funding that we are receiving to do  
just that.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. Is that it  
Councilwoman Brooks-Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Yes, thank you so  
much Chair and thank you so much Commissioner.

JONNEL DORIS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and  
Commissioner before we let you go, I just wanted to  
ask you a couple of questions about New York City and  
Company.

So, the Fiscal '22 Executive Plan includes \$5  
million in Fiscal '21 and \$25 million in Fiscal '22  
to New York City and Companies budget for the largest  
tourism recovery campaign in history. What programs  
will be launched to assist with this recovery and  
what will be SBS's role?

JONNEL DORIS: So, uhm, Mr. Chair, you know NYC  
and Company, they, our budget has mentioned, we do,

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 234

1 it's a fast through budget for them. They will be  
2 managing those programs for us. We have worked with  
3 them on several programs such as Restaurant Week and  
4 also you know specific market into different  
5 communities, our neighborhood getaway's etc. We are  
6 partnering consistently with them but when it comes  
7 to management or how it is sort of formulated in the  
8 programs themselves, they will manage that but look,  
9 I am excited that we have an unprecedented amount of  
10 dollars going to telling the world that New York City  
11 is back. And it was a recovery for all of us, so we  
12 are excited for our small business because this means  
13 a lot to them got over 280,000 workers that are  
14 impacted by tourism and as you know as the workforce  
15 agency of the city, we are excited for that.

17 and so, the more we spend and promote and let  
18 folks know New York City is back, I think it is going  
19 to be great for small businesses and be great for our  
20 workers in that particular industry.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good and I hope that you will  
22 work with me or at least agree with me that it should  
23 be a five borough response in terms of the bringing  
24 back of tourism to all different communities, not  
25 just centered in Manhattan.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 235

2 JONNEL DORIS: Absolutely, I am a Queens you know  
3 resident. I grew up in Brooklyn sir. We are very  
4 excited about our outer boroughs and we want to make  
5 sure that that recovery is a five borough strategy.  
6 We have it embedded into our work here. So, thank  
7 you so much for that Chair. I mean, I agree with you  
8 100 percent.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. You know I see  
10 these before COVID, the tour buses used to come out  
11 to Jackson Heights and people get off the bus from  
12 foreign countries and they would say, this is what  
13 diversity looks like. So, we have a lot to teach  
14 them in the outer boroughs as well. So, glad to hear  
15 you are a Queens guy too.

16 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Chair Dromm, can I just add  
17 to that?

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Sure.

19 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Because I want to remind the  
20 Commissioner that in the borough of the Bronx, we  
21 have the New York Yankees, the Botanical Gardens the  
22 Bronx Zoo.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's right.

24 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: It should be on that radar.

25 JONNEL DORIS: No, absolutely.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
1 SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 236

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We got the Mets though Chair  
3 Gjonaj.

4 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Nobody is perfect, it's  
5 okay. I understand but they are not the Yankees.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, did you want to  
7 say something?

8 JONNEL DORIS: Only that no, I don't want to say  
9 as being a Queens resident and a Yankee fan, I am  
10 living in both worlds.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh, oh, well alright  
12 Commissioner. Thank you for coming in. We really  
13 appreciate it and I just got to read this statement,  
14 so that we can close out today's hearings.

15 Thank you to SBS for being here. This will  
16 conclude today's hearings. Before we close, I would  
17 like to remind the Finance Committee members that we  
18 will be meeting remotely again on Wednesday beginning  
19 at 9:00 a.m. and we will hear from the Department of  
20 Education, the School Construction Authority, the  
21 Department of Health and Mental Health and the New  
22 York City Housing Authority. As a reminder to the  
23 public, the Committee will be holding a remote  
24 hearing for public testimony on the Executive Budget  
25 on Tuesday, May 25<sup>th</sup> at 10 a.m. If you would like to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON  
HOUSING & BUILDINGS, THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION &  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT AND THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL  
BUSINESS 237

2 testify at that hearing, please register at  
3 [www.council.nyc.gov/testify](http://www.council.nyc.gov/testify) and information about how  
4 to access the Zoom meeting will be emailed to you.  
5 You may also submit written testimony through that  
6 registration website or by emailing  
7 [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).

8 And with that, I want to say that this meeting is  
9 adjourned at 3:12 p.m. [GAVEL] ONE, TWO, THREE.  
10 Thank you Commissioner and I will be meeting with my  
11 Finance team shortly after this for the briefing for  
12 next week. Thank you. Let's go 3:30 team.

13 CHAIRPERSON GJONAJ: Thank you Chair Dromm, you  
14 are awesome.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Chair Gjonaj. So  
16 are you.

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 30, 2021