

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

May 11, 2021
Start: 10:12 a.m.
Recess: 1:32 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 2)

B E F O R E: Daniel Dromm,
Chairperson for Finance

Adrienne E. Adams,
Chairperson for Committee on
Public Safety

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Alicka Ampry-Samuel
- Diana Ayala
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
- Laurie A. Cumbo
- Darma V. Diaz
- Oswald Feliz
- Vanessa L. Gibson
- Barry S. Grodenchik
- Karen Koslowitz
- Farah N. Louis
- Steven Matteo
- Francisco P. Moya

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Keith Powers
- Helen K. Rosenthal
- James G. Van Bramer
- Bill Perkins
- Kevin C. Riley
- Carlos Menchaca
- I. Daneek Miller
- Stephen Levin
- Mark Treyger
- Robert F. Holden
- Brad S. Lander
- Ydanis A. Rodriguez
- Inez D. Barron
- Justin L. Brannan
- Fernando Cabrera

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3

A P P E A R A N C E S

Dermot Shea
New York City Police Commissioner

Benjamin Tucker
First Deputy New York City Police Commissioner

Rodney Harrison
NYPD Chief of Department

Kristine Ryan
Deputy Assistant Director at **NYC** Office of
Management and Budget

Ernest Hart
Deputy Police Commissioner, Legal Matters and
General Counsel

David Barrere
Chief of Housing at New York City Police
Department

Kim Royster
Chief of Transportation at New York City Police
Department

Raymond Spinella
Chief of Operations at New York City Police
Department

Terri Tobin
Chief of Interagency Operations at New York City
Police Department

John Miller
Deputy Commissioner of Intelligence &
Counterterrorism of the NYPD

Amy Litwin
Bureau Chief, Bronx District Attorney's Office

Tanya Meisenholder
Deputy Commissioner for Equity and Inclusion

Robert Martinez
Deputy Commissioner of the Support Services
Bureau

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

4

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Chauncey Parker
Deputy Commissioner for Community Partnerships

Danielle Grillo Pemberton
Deputy Commissioner

Oleg Chernyarsky
Assistant Deputy Commissioner of Legal Matters
for the New York City

James Essig
Chief of Detectives NYPD

Juanita Holmes
Chief of Patrol NYPD

Thomas Galati
Chief of Intelligence Bureau NYPD

Michael Li Petri
Chief of Crime Control Strategies

Martin Morales
Chief of Personnel NYPD

Kenneth Corey
Chief of Training NYPD

Matthew Pontillo
Assistant Chief NYPD

Jeffrey Maddrey
Chief of Community Affairs

Kathleen O'Reilly
Chief of Transit

Matthew Fraser
Deputy Commissioner New York City Metropolitan
Area

Olufunmilola Obe
Commanding Officer, School Safety Division at New
York City Police Department

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 5

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Thomas Galati
Chief of Intelligence Bureau for New York City
Police Department

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 6

2 SERGEANT LUGO: PC recording good.

3 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Cloud recording started.

4 SERGEANT PEREZ: Backup is rolling.

5 SERGEANT LEONARDO: Sergeant Martinez.

6 SERGEANT MARTINEZ: Good morning and welcome to
7 today's remote New York City Council Fiscal Year 2022
8 Executive Budget Hearing of the Committee on Finance,
9 jointly with the Committee on Public Safety.

10 At this time, would all panelists please turn on
11 their video for verification purposes. To minimize
12 disruption, please silence your electronic devices
13 and if you wish to submit testimony, you may do so at
14 the following address, testimony@council.nyc.gov.
15 Thank you for your cooperation, we are ready to
16 begin.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Good
18 morning and again, welcome to the City Council's
19 fourth day of hearings. Excuse me, I am sorry.
20 Fourth day of hearings on the Mayor's Executive
21 Budget for Fiscal 2022. My name is Daniel Dromm and
22 I Chair the Finance Committee. We are joined by the
23 Committee on Public Safety Chaired by my colleague
24 Council Member Adrienne Adams. We are also joined by
25 the following Council Members, bear with me one

3 moment, Adams, Ampry-Samuel, Louis, Matteo, Perkins,
4 Menchaca, Riley, Holden, Public Advocate Jumaane
5 Williams, Council Members Lander, Diaz, Feliz,
6 Koslowitz, Rodriguez, Powers and Cornegy.

7 The NYPD's Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget is \$5.4
8 billion representing 5.5 percent of the city's total
9 proposed budget for next year. Of this \$5 billion or
10 92 percent is personnel services spending to support
11 a workforce of over 52,000 people. The Executive
12 Budget is \$211 million more than in Fiscal 2021 and
13 the Fiscal 2021 Adopted Budget. In many ways, this
14 budget feels like déjà vu all over again because in
15 this budget, the Mayor's Office either reversed or
16 simply did not implement many parts of the budget
17 field that were reached for the Fiscal 2021 Adopted
18 Budget.

19 I will mention two specific areas by way of
20 example. The first is the NYPD's overtime budget.
21 Last year, we agreed to reduce the uniformed overtime
22 budget by \$295 million. The current Fiscal Year '21
23 budget for uniformed overtime is \$240 million. But
24 with two months still left in the Fiscal Year, the
25 NYPD has completely blown past this amount and
already spent \$307 million. Moreover, this \$67

3 million in overspending is not even reflected in the
4 Executive Budget, leaving us to wonder where the
5 administration thinks this extra money will come
6 from.

7 For next year Fiscal 2022, the uniformed overtime
8 budget is higher at \$354 million, meaning that the
9 administration has rolled back the overtime cuts that
10 we agreed to last year. In addition, no civilian
11 overtime cuts were extended beyond this fiscal year.
12 It seems clear that the Administration has no plan in
13 place or maybe even no desire to control runaway
14 overtime spending.

15 Second, is the transfer of school safety agents
16 out of the NYPD. While we all understood that this
17 would be a process that would take time and therefore
18 would not be reflected in the Fiscal 2021 budget, the
19 administration is not showing any progress towards
20 this effort in the Fiscal 2022 budget or outyears
21 either. The financial plan provides spending plans
22 up to Fiscal '25, so it is possible to show the
23 transfer of school safety, even if the transfer is
24 not immediate.

25 However, the budget does show increases in
budgeted civilian headcount for Fiscal 2022. There

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

9

3 is a new need for 188 additional civilian positions
4 to serve as community assistance and at best. The
5 Council is informed that these new roles are intended
6 to facilitate a link between the police and the
7 communities they serve.

8 But we do not have any information about the
9 experience that will be required to be qualified for
10 these positions. Like, whether they will need a
11 social work background and given all the
12 conversations that have been had about police reform
13 over this past year, we really need to ask, is the
14 police department the agency that should be in charge
15 of community relations? Wouldn't this investment be
16 better made elsewhere?

17 We look forward to engaging in that conversation
18 as well as learning more details about the NYPD's
19 Proposed Budget during today's hearing.

20 I will now turn it over to Council Member Adams
21 for her opening remarks. Council Member Adams.

22 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much Chair
23 Dromm and good morning to everyone that is joining us
24 for this hearing this morning. I am Council Member
25 Adrienne Adams, Chair of the Public Safety Committee
of the New York City Council. The New York City

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

10

2 Police Departments Fiscal 2022 budget at \$5.44
3 billion dollars. This is up from the current fiscal
4 2021 budget which is \$5.41 billion. The NYPD budget
5 focuses on the council's reforms to policing. These
6 reforms led to last year's cuts to the budget which
7 allowed the city to fund social service and
8 educational programs during a once in a lifetime
9 pandemic. We also passed several pieces of
10 legislation and a wide ranging reform plan.

11 Among the issues we have tackled is the
12 disciplinary system at NYPD. Which until recently
13 was not transparent. Not just and did not have
14 proper oversight. We've expanded the portfolio of
15 violations that the CCRB investigates, passed a
16 disciplinary matrix that standardizes punishments and
17 this budget also adds 15 new positions to monitor an
18 early intervention system which would identify
19 problematic officers before they commit any crimes,
20 misdeeds or violations.

21 While we want to ensure the internal system at
22 the NYPD has the proper checks and balances, we also
23 want to ensure its effectiveness in the city. This
24 year, murders are up 18 percent versus the same
25 period last year. Shootings are up 83 percent. In

1 just the first four months of this year, there were
2 over 400 shootings. This is a part of a larger trend
3 across the country that we need to get a hold of. We
4 need to identify the roots behind these problems to
5 make long-term solutions and also ensure day to day
6 safety in the short-term.
7

8 To be clear, we know that a lack of resources at
9 the NYPD is surely not a problem. NYPD staffing
10 levels are at the same average they have been at over
11 the last 20 years when we saw dramatic declines in
12 violence. Overtime this year is lower but all the
13 canceled events this year allowed NYPD to easily save
14 on overtime expenditures.

15 We should look at how to improve the relationship
16 between police officers and local communities. Where
17 relationships should not be antagonistic. They
18 should be restoratives. We need to look at how to
19 improve the service in the moto protect and serve.

20 I'd like to hear more about the new positions of
21 community assistants and community ambassadors. I'd
22 also like to make sure that we are not just paying
23 lip service to reform but ensuring that we fix the
24 power imbalance and work to build a system that is
25

3 more of a partnership between police and all New
4 Yorkers.

5 I am going to move quickly because we have a lot
6 to discuss today. I know my colleagues have a lot to
7 talk about today but before we get started, I do want
8 to thank our Public Safety Committee Staff Nevin
9 Singh, Dan Ades and Matthew Thompson. I'd also like
10 to thank from my staff my Legislative Director
11 Benjamin Fang for his work on today's hearing. We
12 will now turn it back over to Chair Dromm.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Chair
14 Adams and let me say we have been joined; I think we
15 left off with Karen Koslowitz being here. Council
16 Members Rodriguez, Powers, Cornegy, also Council
17 Members Rosenthal and Miller and Gibson and Brannan
18 have joined us.

19 Now, we will hear testimony from the Police
20 Department. We are joined by the police by Police
21 Commissioner Dermot Shea and the Senior Staff of the
22 NYPD. Before the NYPD begins their testimony, I am
23 going to turn it over to our Committee Counsel to go
24 over some procedural items and to swear in the
25 witnesses.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Dromm. My
4 name is Rebecca Chasen and I am Counsel to the New
5 York City Council's Committee on Finance.

6 Before we begin, I want to remind everyone that
7 you will be on mute until you are recognized to
8 speak. At which time you will be unmuted by the Zoom
9 host. If you mute yourself after you have been
10 unmuted, you will need to be unmuted again by the
11 host. So, please be aware that there could be a
12 delay in that process and bear with us and be
13 patient.

14 Today, we will hear testimony from the New York
15 Police Department. During the hearing, if Council
16 Members would like to ask questions, please use the
17 Zoom raise hand function and you will be called on to
18 speak. We will be limiting Council Member questions
19 to five minutes including responses. I will now
20 administer the affirmation to the administration
21 witnesses and call on each of you to so affirm.

22 Do you affirm that your testimony will be truthful
23 to the best of your knowledge, information and
24 belief? Police Commissioner Shea?

25 DERMOT SHEA: Yes, I do.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: First Deputy Commissioner
3 Tucker?

4 BENJAMIN TUCKER: Yes, I do.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Harrison?

6 RODNEY HARRISON: Yes, I do.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Ryan?

8 KRISTINE RYAN: Yes, I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Hart?

10 ERNEST HART: Yes, I do.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Assistant Deputy Commissioner
12 Chernyavsky?

13 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yes, I do.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Essig?

15 JAMES ESSIG: Yes, I do.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Holmes?

17 DERMOT SHEA: She is in a different room.

18 JUANITA HOLMES: Yes, I do. I do.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Galati? I will come
20 back to Chief Galati. Chief Lipetri?

21 MICHAEL LIPETRI: Yes, I do.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Morales?

23 MARTIN MORALES: Yes, I do.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Corey?

25 KENNETH COREY: Yes, I do.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

15

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Pontillo?

4 MATTHEW PONTILLO: Yes, I do.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Maddrey?

6 JEFFRY MADDREY: Yes, I do.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief O'Reilly?

8 KATHLEEN O'REILLY: Yes, I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Barrere?

10 DAVID BARRERE: Yes, I do.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Royster?

12 KIM ROYSTER: Yes, I do.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Spinella?

14 RAYMOND SPINELLA: Yes, I do.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Tobin?

16 TERRI TOBIN: Yes, I do.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Miller?

18 JOHN MILLER: Yes, I do.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Litwin.

20 AMY LITWIN: Yes, I do.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner

22 Meisenholder?

23 TANYA MEISENHOLDER: Yes, I do.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Martinez?

25 ROBERT MARTINEZ: Yes, I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Parker?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 16

3 CHAUNCEY PARKER: Yes, I do.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner
5 Pemberton?

6 DANIELLE PEMBERTON: Yes, I do.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Fraser?

8 MATTHEW FRASER: Yes, I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Chief Obe?

10 OLUFUNMILOLA OBE: Yes, I do. Yes, I do.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you and Chief Galati?

12 DERMOT SHEA: I think Chief Miller is going to
13 basically cover Chief Galati.

14 THOMAS GALATI: I don't know if I am unmuted now.

15 I was unable to unmute myself.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we hear you sir.

17 THOMAS GALATI: Okay, yes, yes, I do.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great, thank you so much
19 everybody and Police Commissioner Shea, you may begin
20 when ready.

21 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you. Good morning, everyone.

22 Chair Adams, Chair Dromm and members of the City

23 Council, thank you for the opportunity to discuss the

24 Mayor's Executive Budget for the 2022 Fiscal Year.

25 Before highlighting some key budget items, I'd like

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

17

3 to discuss the challenges we are facing as we attempt
4 to rebound and recover from the COVID-19 pandemic.

5 First and foremost among these challenges is the
6 increase in shootings that plague our streets. Just
7 several of the hundreds of victims last year include:
8 a seven-year-old girl shot in East Harlem in June; a
9 one-year-old boy shot and killed in Bedford
10 Stuyvesant in July; a seven-year-old boy shot in
11 Crown Heights in September and an eight-month-old
12 girl shot in Mott Haven later that month; also a
13 nine-year-old girl shot in Central Harlem on
14 Halloween trick or treating. And in addition to a
15 five-year-old girl shot in East New York last month,
16 this past weekend's violence saw two adult tourists
17 and a four-year-old Brooklyn girl shopping for toys
18 with her family, shot in Times Square on the eve of
19 Mother's Day.

20 In any of the shooting incidents we have seen so
21 far in 2021, which are at a nearly 20-year high, up
22 86-and-a-half percent since this time last year, it
23 could have been any one of us, or our children, or
24 our parents, or our friends, who could have been
25 struck. Bullets do not discriminate. And we, the
NYPD, this City Council, our state and federal

1
2 legislators and all of our law enforcement and
3 community partners need to do much, much more to stem
4 the violence.

5 Members of the NYPD have made record numbers of
6 gun arrests this year, with fewer resources. But
7 without meaningful consequences, existing laws are
8 nothing more than an illusion. This pandemic has
9 taken a toll on literally, everyone across our city,
10 our nation and the world. At the NYPD, the
11 coronavirus claimed the lives of ten uniformed
12 members, 38 civilian members and seven volunteer
13 Auxiliary members.

14 Regardless of their rank, title, or role in the
15 police department, those 55 family members of ours
16 whom we vow to never forget, died in service to New
17 Yorkers. We at the NYPD, see partners in those who
18 control the budget. You share our responsibility to
19 keep New York City safe and we are thankful for it.
20 Our collective efforts are for all the people we
21 serve. Eight million-plus New Yorkers and millions
22 more who are increasingly coming back to their office
23 spaces and the millions more tourists who will be
24 returning to experience all our great city has to
25 offer.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

19

3 I know that our cultural institutions, our
4 restaurants, our vibrant nightlife and much more,
5 will roar back in time. But make no mistake, all of
6 what makes New York City great is built on the
7 foundation of public safety that all of us provide.
8 I am heartened by the fact that, at the end of last
9 week, we graduated our first class of new police
10 officers in nearly a year. That will certainly help.
11 Every little bit does. But, as you know, we lost
12 nearly 1,200 cops in last year's budget, as well as
13 significant funding for overtime that the police
14 department has relied on for well over a decade to
15 supplement staffing in locations where we see upticks
16 in violence.

17 Overtime is a critical tool in maintaining public
18 safety because it affords us additional deployments
19 in neighborhoods with increased levels of shootings
20 and other violence, including in the transit system
21 and in our many housing developments. While it
22 enables detectives to fast-track many cases that can
23 lead to convictions, other investigations are very
24 intensive and can continue for months, often with
25 uncooperative victims or witnesses. Such cases need
a lot of resources, too, because great police work

1 means relentless follow-up and not stopping until an
2 arrest is made and justice is served.
3

4 And I can also report that in the past year, the
5 NYPD has spent less on overtime costs than at any
6 time in at least the past 15 years. The bottom line
7 is less overtime equals less cops doing police work.
8 It's really that simple. This fiscal year continues
9 to be unique and challenging. Uniformed overtime
10 spending is down almost 40 percent and the budget for
11 next year's fiscal year has been cut to bring the
12 police department down to our current fiscal year
13 spend.

14 I must note that we have been without hundreds of
15 New York City events, big and small, that we would
16 normally see from the West Indian American Day
17 Carnival and Parade to the National Puerto Rican Day
18 Parade, to all of the other events that celebrate the
19 rich cultural, ethnic and religious heritages that
20 make New York the greatest city in the world. As we
21 see these events return, the need for additional
22 police officers will mean additional overtime
23 expenditures. And our current overtime budget for
24 next fiscal year, which is already underfunded based
25 purely on our need to deploy officers to fight back

3 the rise in violence, will even further potentially
4 be insufficient to allow for adequate coverage at
5 these events.

6 In totality, the NYPD's Fiscal 2022 Expense
7 Budget is \$5.4 billion, the vast majority of which 92
8 percent is allocated for personnel costs. The
9 remaining eight percent is dedicated to non-personnel
10 costs, including technology that provides officers
11 with immediate access to critical safety equipment,
12 tools and applications. As I mentioned earlier, last
13 year's Adopted Budget saw significant operating
14 reductions of \$417 million, including: a recruit
15 class cancellation that diminished our uniformed
16 workforce by 1,163 officers; a uniformed overtime
17 decrease; a civilian overtime decrease; the cutting
18 of 100 civilian positions; a delay in Police Cadet
19 hiring; and other non-personnel reductions.

20 As part of the \$536.9 million reduction to the
21 NYPD's Capital Budget taken at adoption, funding was
22 eliminated for a new 116th Precinct and its station
23 house, as well as for construction of a much needed,
24 consolidated Property Clerk warehouse that would
25 improve evidence and property storage. As part of
this most recent budget, \$92 million in capital

1 funding was restored for the construction of a new
2 116th precinct station house. This will be the
3 second facility after the new 40th precinct station
4 house currently under construction, that will have a
5 dedicated community space, in which residents and
6 workers from neighborhoods can engage directly with
7 the police officers who serve them.
8

9 In summary, our Neighborhood Policing philosophy,
10 a proven crime fighting model of policing, works when
11 we have the necessary tools and resources. That is
12 how we balance public safety. When tools are taken
13 away, there are real-world consequences on the
14 streets, in the form of increasing crime and
15 victimization. Of course, that extends underground
16 into our subway system too, where quality-of-life
17 conditions and whether riders feel safe are of
18 paramount concern. And that's an important
19 distinction. People need to be safe but they also
20 absolutely must feel safe too.

21 Cause-and-effect applies to our highways,
22 parkways and surface roads, as well. I know I do not
23 need to remind anyone that amid a spike in traffic-
24 related deaths and injuries this year, Detective
25 Anastasios Tsakos, two weeks ago today, was struck

1
2 and killed by a drunk driver with a suspended
3 license, as he helped secure the scene of an earlier,
4 fatal collision and investigation on the LIE in
5 Queens.

6 In all instances, it is imperative that the
7 people who commit crimes take responsibility for
8 their poor decisions. And it is vital that the
9 criminal justice system, as a whole, ensures
10 accountability. When I was sworn in by the Mayor
11 nearly a year-and-a-half ago, I said that our renewed
12 focus on our city's young people was part of our
13 evolution as a police department and a city. Despite
14 the headwinds over the past year, we are staying the
15 course. And the NYPD, with the entire city's
16 support, pledges again to redouble its efforts in
17 this area.

18 Just last week, I joined the Mayor and elected
19 officials at the Wagner Houses in East Harlem, to
20 open new basketball courts where young New Yorkers
21 and residents alike, can exercise and play. The work
22 we do must always be about sharing the responsibility
23 for public safety, working together to reduce crime
24 and violence. When these things happen together, we
25

1
2 are building the bridge between the public's safety
3 and the public's trust.

4 Post-pandemic, as we take Neighborhood Policing
5 again to the next level by way of our reinvigorated
6 youth strategy, I want to thank you for your ongoing
7 partnership. More than ever, New Yorkers needs even
8 more of all of our ideas, and all of our actions.

9 And that goes for the entire public safety spectrum.
10 From traditional crime to terrorism, to the seedbed-
11 activities that can draw young people down a path of
12 criminality in the first place. This is our mission
13 and we owe every New Yorker nothing but our best
14 efforts.

15 Thank you again so much for the opportunity to
16 testify this morning and I welcome your questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
18 Commissioner. Before we get started with questions,
19 let me announce that we have been joined by Council
20 Members Levin, Cabrera, Ayala, Moya, Grodenchik and
21 Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo.

22 Just bear with me one moment.

23 DERMOT SHEA: Sure.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, Commissioner in your
25 testimony, uhm, you mentioned, you spoke a lot about

1
2 the overtime and I have a lot of questions about the
3 overtime but do you think that the cut to overtime
4 and headcount last year was wrong?

5 DERMOT SHEA: I think and I will turn it to
6 Kristine our Budget Director in a second. I think in
7 tough times you have to make tough decisions but you
8 also have to have eyes wide open that they have
9 consequences. So, we share the burden as all city
10 agencies do at a time of incredible difficulty with
11 what we all went through last year. Kristine, do you
12 have anything to add to that or no?

13 KRISTINE RYAN: I would just second what you are
14 saying. I mean in really difficult times we all you
15 know that ever agency has to contribute but you know
16 the size of the cut, you know at 60 percent of our
17 overtime budget was really quite significant. And
18 you know as the landscape has evolved over the year,
19 we have really had to focus on the critical areas
20 where we need as the Commissioner said overtime is
21 used to enable us to have additional deployment. So,
22 as conditions have evolved on the ground, we have had
23 to continue to utilize overtime resources and you
24 know that budget cut brought us to a historic low.

1
2 You know, we haven't seen a level that low in at
3 least 15 years.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Have you ever thought that
5 you might not need as many police to police some of
6 these situations and protests. I mean, last year's
7 protest and the response by the NYPD was a disaster.
8 I mean, all of the beatings and all of the DOI
9 investigation showed us that we may not need as many
10 police at these situations.

11 I mean, I think there is a major disconnect here.
12 You know and when you talk about safety, I think that
13 you know you have to have the public's attitude and
14 mindset as well. I don't feel safe often times
15 around police officers because of what I see, of what
16 I see happen.

17 So, I think we have to take a real good look at
18 what's going on with the overtime. And that's not
19 because of us, that's because of the department. The
20 Departments Fiscal '21 overtime budget is \$272
21 million as of the executive plan. However,
22 expenditures already exceeded the budget by \$75
23 million with two months to go in Fiscal Year. By the
24 end of the Fiscal Year, actual expenditures may
25 exceed the budget by \$100 million, which would be

3 almost 40 percent over the budget. Why has NYPD not
4 been able to stay within its budget?

5 DERMOT SHEA: So, to several points you raised.
6 I mean to the point about the beatings that's just
7 factually inaccurate. To the point about you not -

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, Commissioner -

9 DERMOT SHEA: Yes sir, I am trying to answer your
10 question.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right, I just want to
12 respond. I saw what we saw on TV. I saw people
13 being pushed to the ground. I saw people's heads
14 being cracked open. So, please don't deny that.
15 That's what we saw, okay and you are under oath. You
16 are under oath, so please answer questions honestly.

17 DERMOT SHEA: To your point about you not feeling
18 safe. Clearly we have more work to do then and I
19 feel sorry for that but I will tell you that that is
20 not what I hear in neighborhoods across the city.
21 Uhm, do I hear that at times? Have I heard that
22 before? I have. I have and that's why we are so
23 dedicated across my entire executive staff to
24 policing appropriately, constitutionally and with the
25 community and I think we made great strides in that
but clearly more work to do.

1 But I will tell you that your opinion, which I
2 respect is not the majority opinion that I hear
3 across various neighborhood across New York City.
4 They love their police. They participate in events
5 with their police. They know how much the police is
6 there for them and it heartens me and I am awfully
7 proud of it.
8

9 The questions about the overtime specifically, I
10 think Kristine touched on it and I touched on it in
11 some of the openings to. We share the burden that
12 all city agencies do at a very difficult time.
13 Clearly that has had an impact on our deployment
14 strategies, that's just a fact of life and we
15 understand that.

16 We would point out that while we were overbudget
17 for the budget that was set, we have done significant
18 efforts across the department and Kristine can detail
19 them at length in terms of cutting and streamlining
20 process and I think it bears repeating that we are at
21 a 15-year low at a minimum of how much we have spent
22 in New York City. And what you did not mention is,
23 it is at a time that there are many factors going on
24 at one point. That we are called on to do many, very
25 things and it is at a time when there is also the

1
2 lowest incarceration levels; that has an impact
3 frankly on crime. Which we are seeing play out with
4 100 percent increase in shootings.

5 So, you cannot look at one stagnant fact and
6 ignore all the others but -

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, there are more
8 people on Rikers Island today, 5,700 or so than there
9 were last year at 3,000. Your personnel is at an
10 all-time high or close to an all-time high in terms
11 of the numbers of police in the department but you
12 are not able to control your overtime budget. Why
13 should we believe that you will stick to your
14 overtime budget this time around? You have not given
15 me a clear answer.

16 DERMOT SHEA: Well, I have given you an answer
17 and you -

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, but not a clear
19 commitment.

20 DERMOT SHEA: Sorry, you speak of the Rikers
21 population but you didn't speak of the jail
22 population.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, excuse me.
24 Excuse me Commissioner, excuse me Commissioner.
25 Commissioner?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

30

DERMOT SHEA: Yes, sir.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We are questioning you and we are in charge of oversight over you and your budget. I need you to respond in that fashion and not try to take control. Do you agree to that?

DERMOT SHEA: Yes, I agree that I answer when a question is asked. You are absolutely right.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Commissioner. Thank you. So, you have not been able to stick to your budget Commissioner. Your job is to stick to your budget. What are you going to do this time around to stick to your budget? You agreed to the budget. You blew it. Are you going to blow it again?

DERMOT SHEA: Let me just say Council Member, if my officers spoke to the public this way, I would fire them. I think it's completely disrespectful to have a showmanship. Let's have an honest conversation and a back and forth where we can actually accomplish something, rather than what you are trying to do. The people in New York City deserve better.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, I find it hard to believe a lot of what you say. Okay, you still

3 have not produced any reason or any correlation
4 between the change of laws and I hear you on
5 television all the time about bail reform and the
6 correlation between the increase of crime. It seems
7 to me that you are scapegoating things and that is
8 not acceptable. I'm sorry, it's just not acceptable.
9 I am going to move on here but at this point, uhm,
10 you know, you need to answer these questions honestly
11 Commissioner. It's just not right.

12 DERMOT SHEA: I will answer any question you have
13 sir. I would be glad to.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, Commissioner.

15 DERMOT SHEA: Yes sir.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I am sorry, I have lost - I
17 am going to go to Council Member Adams at this point
18 and allow her to ask questions and I will come back
19 to you.

20 DERMOT SHEA: Great.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you Council Member
22 Dromm and I can appreciate your frustration but it is
23 extreme. We have got a lot to answer for and I am
24 sure Commissioner that you will certainly agree with
25 that fact.

DERMOT SHEA: I do.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

32

3 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Commissioner, do you believe,
4 do you actually believe that increases in crime were
5 a result of either not having enough officers or
6 enough overtime? Is that what we are hearing?

7 DERMOT SHEA: I think it's - Council Member, I
8 think it's one of many factors. I don't think it's
9 easy to put fingers on certainly the level of budget
10 but listen, this is about a budget hearing and this
11 police department of which I am in charge of and it
12 is your job to hold me accountable and I respect
13 that. And we got to do a good job on our end of
14 utilizing our resources to the best ability to keep
15 New Yorkers safe and that's what New Yorkers demand
16 and expect and I agree with all of that.

17 Certainly there has been challenges this last
18 year with some of the crime issues, protest issues
19 and other things that have had an impact on overtime
20 spending. We respect the budget that is issued but
21 certainly in my opinion, it has an impact on how we
22 can deploy resources and where.

23 And then there are unforeseen circumstances that
24 come up throughout the year as well. And we manage
25 all that. I am proud of the fact that we have come
in you know as I have said now a couple times, at

1 least a 15 year low. We have cut significant amounts
2 of overtime. Not as much as we would have liked to
3 but that's a fact. We have cut significant amounts
4 of overtime and it remains a challenge and we are
5 going to look to do more where we can to impact
6 public safety with the least negative impact.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay.

9 DERMOT SHEA: Kristine, do you have do you have
10 anything to add?

11 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, I mean, I would just add
12 that you know while we are spending above the reduced
13 budget level, it is still a 30 percent decrease. The
14 spending we are projecting for the full year is
15 projected to be 30 percent lower than the budget
16 before the cuts and with regard to the headcount, we
17 are not at our highest headcount level. We took a
18 headcount reduction at adoption of 1163 and that
19 overtime reduction translates into on average having
20 1500 fewer officers available than we otherwise would
21 have with that overtime and that overtime is where we
22 have had to spend is focused on investigations,
23 focused on our operational overtime, where we are
24 ensuring uninterrupted provision of emergency
25 services, maintaining minimum staffing at our

1
2 precincts in transit and housing areas and as the
3 Commissioner said, focusing on crime reduction.

4 So, while it is true that we are over the budget,
5 this is a significant reduction in spending from what
6 we have seen historically.

7 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, okay, let's stay there.

8 Now, let's look at this; we are talking about the
9 budget. We're talking about where the budget lands.

10 There are 375 positions that you have identified as
11 potential for civilianization. That means 375

12 uniformed officers are performing civilian duties and
13 unable to fill their uniformed duty.

14 So, your civilian headcount is at about 16,000 I
15 believe and you should be able to use your civilian
16 staff efficiently, so you can get those uniformed
17 officers back to uniformed duties. Can you explain
18 why those uniformed officers are still performing
19 civilian duties when the responsibility should be
20 handled by nonuniformed police administrative aids?

21 DERMOT SHEA: I'll start it. I think the peak
22 civilian headcount at one point was 20,000. We are
23 down to; I think you are right Councilwoman Adams,
24 16,000 or 17,000 right now. Civilianization has been
25 a goal, not only of the City Council but of me

1
2 personally for many years. We have done a lot of
3 work toward civilianization, moving full duty police
4 officers out of administrative positions. We are
5 doing it again this summer on a temporary basis for
6 all out to put them in neighborhoods that are asking
7 for more police officers to fight some of the crime.
8 I agree with what you said in terms of you know
9 challenges, Kristine can go into what we have already
10 done to move some of those officers out on to the
11 street.

12 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, so the civilianization that
13 has been done to date and we have made every effort
14 to identify where with additional civilian resources,
15 we can deploy officers back out into the field. I
16 just - while our civilian headcount is with our part-
17 time over 17,000. Almost 11,000 of those are safety
18 titles. So they're civilians, like our 911 call
19 takers and supervisors, our traffic enforcement
20 agents, our criminalists, our crime analysts and our
21 school crossing guards.

22 So, once you remove that, it's really; the focus
23 was to identify again, you are also operating a 24/7
24 operation. So, with every position you have that you
25 have identified that can be civilianized, you really

1
2 have to look at whether or not you have a civilian
3 who can cover that on three tours a day.

4 So, it's not sort of a one for one situation. So
5 we continue to look at this and it is something we
6 have continued to have conversations with, with the
7 Office of Management and Budget about future
8 civilianization opportunities but with the fiscal
9 condition as it's been, it's been a little difficult.
10 So, we do prioritize where we can within our existing
11 headcount but a large portion of our existing
12 headcount are actually civilian safety titles, which
13 cannot be redeployed to cover these positions.

14 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I just think that those
15 efforts need to be significantly ramped up. A lot of
16 money that we are looking at that can be brought
17 over. And I really, really think that we need to get
18 more serious about uniformed officers. Their
19 responsibilities in uniform and placing police
20 administrative aids in their rightful positions where
21 they belong.

22 I don't know the extreme difficulty in doing that
23 but I appreciate your response. Let's take a look at
24 the protest for a minute. The NYPD spent \$170
25 million responding to the George Floyd protest and

1
2 that's just here we are on overtime again. What
3 other expenses did the NYPD incur as a result of the
4 protest?

5 KRISTINE RYAN: So, I mean, there were other very
6 small amounts in uhm, other than personal services to
7 make sure that we had officers had you know fire
8 extinguishers that they needed in the vehicles.
9 Also, addressing any other equipment that was needed
10 and ultimately some vehicles were damaged and needed
11 to be fixed. So, resources for that but that was
12 just \$1 million or \$2 million overall. The primary
13 expenditures were the overtime.

14 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, uhm, in staying with
15 the protest situation, Commissioner, I found it
16 interesting that you just said to our Chair that you
17 would fire your officers for speaking
18 disrespectfully. How many officers were fired for
19 their behavior during those protests? And how many
20 orders has been given on banning the unacceptable
21 practice known as kettling?

22 DERMOT SHEA: Well, let me just start and I am
23 going to turn to Ben Tucker, our First Deputy
24 Commissioner. Councilwoman Adams, I appreciate
25 greatly your opening remarks about the discipline,

1
2 about the work of the Council, about the work of all
3 that we have together done to kind of move the city
4 and department forward in these areas. I am seeing a
5 lot of positive news already. Ben and I were
6 speaking earlier today in anticipation for these
7 Council hearings on the subject of divergence of CCRB
8 on the subject of the discipline matrix and how is it
9 having an impact on how we meet out punishment. When
10 you look at the first four plus months of this year,
11 I am very happy to report that we have had four
12 occurrences, four. Where we have had a different
13 penalty needed out than the one prescribed by CCRB
14 coming to my office.

15 In one of those four occurrences, I looked at the
16 penalty that was recommended and upped the penalty.
17 Meaning out more than was requested by CCRB.

18 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Was anyone fired?

19 DERMOT SHEA: No, they were not. In the other
20 three of the four circumstances, the person was found
21 either partially or fully not guilty after a trial
22 and that was the reason four.

23 So, we have done a lot of work and it is in
24 partnership with the Council and other stakeholders.
25 We heard this through the reform initiative and we

1 think we are seeing a lot of positives on this.

2 Where everyone has the playing field. It's a level
3 playing field. Whether it's the police, whether it's
4 the victims of these complaints or the entire process
5 and that's a positive that I think everyone should be
6 proud of. Ben, anything?

7
8 BENJAMIN TUCKER: Yeah, I would add that uh, when
9 it comes to terminations this year, we have at least
10 three that I can point to where either these officers
11 were scheduled for trial and knows the presumptive
12 penalty at the end of those trials with a good
13 termination but in fact, the officers stepped out,
14 retired before, decided to leave the department.
15 Prior to in one case, just one day before the trial
16 was scheduled to take place and so, even though we
17 talk about terminations, very often we will have
18 officers leave under a different circumstance where
19 we have them vest. Because as a matter of course, it
20 makes more sense. It's more practical and they will
21 negotiate and take the vest and leave because the
22 goal is to get that particular officer out of the
23 department as quickly as possible.

24 But we are not bashful about terminating officers
25 and you can see that in the matrix and even before

1
2 but now, when you look at the matrix and you examine
3 the number of cases and presumptive penalties that
4 begin with termination, you can I think understand
5 that when it comes to transparency and what the
6 intent of the panel, the disciplinary panel that we
7 convened several years back and had 13
8 recommendations. One of which was specifically
9 focused on this notion of being more transparent but
10 also getting to a point where a precedent doesn't
11 drive what we do but rather the facts drive what we
12 do and the punishment fitting the crime, so to speak.

13 And so, we are there now and as we have begun to
14 use the matrix, we will see as this plays out over
15 the next several months as we get used to using it in
16 both here and the department but also there is an
17 expectation that CCRB will get better at using the
18 Matrix as a tool as it is intended to be.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Adams, may I
20 interject for a moment?

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Sure.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are you actually saying that
23 you fired one person out of 36,000 people?

24 BENJAMIN TUCKER: I'm sorry?
25

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are you saying that you fired
3 one person, one police officer out of 36,000 police
4 officers?

5 BENJAMIN TUCKER: I said we terminated at least
6 three officers.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Three, okay three, three out
8 of 36,000 and that's acceptable to you?

9 BENJAMIN TUCKER: Yeah, out of 36,000.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. I just
11 wanted to know if it was acceptable. Thank you.
12 Okay, I don't find that to be acceptable and we still
13 haven't gotten an answer about the officers that were
14 involved in the incidents with the George Floyd
15 protests. Have any of them been fired?

16 BENJAMIN TUCKER: The disciplinary process is
17 ongoing.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Have they been removed from
19 duty?

20 BENJAMIN TUCKER: Some have, some have.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How many?

22 BENJAMIN TUCKER: I don't have the number in
23 front of me.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Of course you don't. Okay,
25 thank you Council Member Adams. You may resume.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: You actually asked the
3 question; you just pulled it right out of my brain.
4 I was looking for numbers, so I was actually going
5 there Chair Dromm. So, we're on the same wave link
6 with that and I guess for both of us, the response
7 was not particularly acceptable when it comes to the
8 protest, when it comes to egregious behavior that was
9 displayed and that we all saw and yet we see no
10 punishment for this. It's almost a year later now.
11 We are going into a year where these instances have
12 happened and we are hearing that the process is still
13 ongoing and that's extremely disturbing.

14 BENJAMIN TUCKER: Well, let me just say that the
15 process is ongoing for lots of reasons. A number of
16 these cases will come through CCRB and then as they
17 reach our department advocates office, then they will
18 be dealt with at that point. I could ask Amy to step
19 in and just speak a bit about what the status is.

20 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I would love to hear a
21 timeline. I would really love to hear a timeline.

22 DERMOT SHEA: Councilwoman Adams, if I could to
23 and I don't know if Amy can jump in but you know we
24 had officers, an officer in Brooklyn that was
25 arrested. We had an officer during that same period

1 of time period in Queens that was arrested. Those
2 cases are ongoing. We had officers that were
3 suspended, we had officers that were modified. All
4 of those were taken off the street and then we have a
5 number of Civilian Complaint Review Board cases that
6 are working its way through the Civilian Complaint
7 Review Board.
8

9 The timeline is not as easily obtained in more
10 detail than that. I apologize for that but there is
11 - depending on what the offenses were in these number
12 of cases, then the timelines are different. And then
13 you know, we had officers that were exonerated as
14 well. Not every incidence of using force was
15 misconduct. So, there was you know, as we all know,
16 there was a lot going on in that period. The
17 important thing again, I apologize for not having a
18 clear answer that you can grasp that is sufficient to
19 you now but please know that we are taking it very
20 seriously and both us, the two prosecutors that I
21 mentioned, as well as the Civilian Complaint Review
22 Board, all those processes are underway. Amy, do you
23 have anything that you could add?

24 AMY LITWIN: Yeah, I would just add a couple of
25 things. I would add something just in terms of

1 terminations and officers that are separated from the
2 department and I will also just add something about
3 the protest related cases that we are waiting on from
4 CCRB. In terms of separations from the department,
5 you know, we looked at some numbers and just under
6 Police Commissioner Shea's tenure, a total of 54
7 officers have been separated from the department.
8 Those are forced separations as a result of a
9 disciplinary matter. Those include terminations.
10 Those include officers dismissed due to misconduct
11 while they were on dismissal probation and the one
12 thing that that number doesn't account for is the
13 number of officers who resign or separate from the
14 department while discipline is pending. It is not
15 uncommon when we have a very serious case or
16 termination type case, than an officer will resign
17 depending on which pension they are in. We can't
18 prevent them from doing so.

19
20 There are circumstances where someone attempts to
21 leave the department and we still can try them with
22 the department trial and we will still terminate them
23 even though they are trying to leave. So, that 54
24 number does not account for 83 additional uniformed
25 members of service who also resigned or separated

1
2 from the department prior to the resolution of their
3 disciplinary matter or their trial or a plea.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And they resign with a full
5 pension right?

6 AMY LITWIN: Uhm, not necessarily, no.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, how many get a pension?

8 AMY LITWIN: If someone resigns, they are
9 forfeiting certain things that they would normal have
10 been entitled to.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How many?

12 AMY LITWIN: So, I know that there were, like I
13 said, there were 83. I don't have a breakdown in
14 terms of tier they were in. As I mentioned, if a
15 police officer is in a tier three, there is nothing
16 that we can do to prevent that officer from putting
17 their papers in and leaving the department. If they
18 are not in tier three, actually I can speak from
19 experience, we will move a case forward. We have 30
20 days before someone's attempt to retire is solidified
21 and we will take that to trial and we have had a
22 number of cases where we have tried those cases and
23 where we have terminated members prior to their
24 ability to obtain their pension within that 30 day
25 period.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

46

3 The other thing that I just wanted to point out
4 because I know there is a lot of discussion about
5 protest related cases and as of yesterday I looked at
6 the numbers in terms our intake from CCRB. We have
7 received so far to date, according to our records, a
8 total of 23 cases, that's 22 respondents that we have
9 categorized as CCRB has categorized as protest
10 related cases. Of those cases, only eight of the
11 cases deal with use of force or unlawful arrest.
12 Actually a majority of the cases approximately 12 of
13 those cases dealt with a particular protest where
14 there was someone at the protest who walked around
15 the protest and filmed officers who had a band
16 covering their name or their shield. So, that fell
17 within the category of what CCRB has sent us so far
18 in terms of protest related cases. So, that was 12
19 cases where it was difficult to identify an officers
20 name or shield.

21 And as I mentioned, there were eight that
22 included excessive force. And this is as of our
23 reporting yesterday. I think we've received
24 approximately three additional cases that have not
25 yet been inputted into our database. I think one of
those also involved use of force.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

47

3 So, there are, you know I know that CCRB has
4 stated that there is a number of cases that they
5 have. Hundreds perhaps related to the protests. I
6 can only tell you that we can only process them as
7 quickly as they send them to us. This is what we
8 have seen from them so far and we are still awaiting
9 any additional cases that are related to the protest
10 that they have to send us.

11 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: So, thank you for that. So,
12 previously NYPD has had settlements of about \$240
13 million in settlements. How much do you expect to
14 pay out?

15 DERMOT SHEA: Ernie or Kristine?

16 ERNIST HART: It's hard to predict what we expect
17 to pay out; however, it has been a decrease from
18 looking at Fiscal Year 2020, a decrease 13.5 percent
19 in the total number of lawsuits and as far as the
20 amount of money paid out as of total payouts for NYPD
21 decreased by seven percent from Fiscal Year '18 and
22 35 percent from Fiscal Year '17. So, it's - don't
23 know what with litigation cases down, it should have
24 a significant positive effect on the amount of money
25 that's paid out.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

48

3 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes but it went down because
4 of the pandemic, that's obvious but the payouts, you
5 don't know or can't predict 2021 and I am really
6 looking at more you know the lawsuits in regard to
7 the protest in particular. I also need to whether or
8 not kettling is a band practice right now.

9 ERNEST HART: Councilwoman but lawsuits have gone
10 down every year including notwithstanding COVID
11 itself.

12 CHAIRPERSON ADAM: Yes, understood.

13 DERMOT SHEA: And I will jump in and I don't know
14 if Ben wants to jump in as well. We take - I think
15 that's a really important question you raised
16 Councilwoman. We take it very seriously. It speaks
17 to the heart of the training that we you know put our
18 offices through. It speaks to the risk management
19 bureau that we stood up a number of years ago. I
20 think the positive here is that as Commissioner Hart
21 said, we have seen an overall declining of lawsuits.
22 Ernie, tell me if I am saying it wrong but of
23 lawsuits against members of the NYPD, not just from
24 the COVID year for a period of years. It's a little
25 difficult to determine how the protests of last year

1 will impact on that but it is something we take very,
2 very seriously.
3

4 BENJAMINE TUCKER: Yeah, I would just add to the
5 Commissioners point and to Ernie's point about the
6 lawsuits going down. We can't underestimate the work
7 that the Risk Management Bureau does. I mean, as you
8 may know, they work with the Monitor that is our
9 principal contact with the Federal Monitor on the
10 stop and frisk litigation but more importantly than
11 that I think or beyond that is the work that we do on
12 early intervention, the work that we do on as we move
13 to increase training around bias and other areas.
14 All of that training gets tested and we do look at
15 individual officers a lot better and a lot more
16 effectively than we have been able to do in the past
17 because we have better data.

18 And so, all of that I think has a cumulative
19 effect of reducing the number of incidents or the
20 nature of the conduct that officers might be engaged
21 in that might result in litigation.

22 So, I think when you look at this, it's not just
23 one particular issue that impacts the decrease in
24 these actions but it has to do with ongoing scrutiny,
25 paying attention to the work that officer is doing on

1 the street, how they are doing it, looking at
2 supervision, focusing on accountability. All of
3 those things are part of the way in which – and also
4 the discipline cases that come up on a regular basis
5 that might ultimately result in litigation.
6

7 Many do not and so, but the fact that they do not
8 suggest to us at least, that some of what we are
9 doing, the work that we do through intervention and
10 the risk management process is effective.

11 ERNEST HART: Can I also say one more thing?

12 Uhm, from Fiscal Year '13 to Fiscal Year '20, the
13 number of filings has gone down 55 percent. 4050 in
14 Fiscal Year '13 and 1820 in Fiscal Year '20. So,
15 again, it's just evidence of the continuous decrease
16 in losses against the department.

17 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. Did I get an – I
18 am going to turn it back over to Chair Dromm. I have
19 to run to a vote real quick on Land Use and then I am
20 going to come right back. Did we get an answer to
21 the kettling question?

22 DERMOT SHEA: There is no kettling. I will let –
23 Juanita, if you are around too, you can or Rodney,
24 you want to talk on this? The kettling has never
25 been something that has been taught or allowed within

1 the New York City Police Department Councilwoman.

2 Rodney, you want to jump in?

3
4 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: What's the penalty for it?
5 Anybody fired for it, uh, nobody is fired for that
6 either than.

7 RODNEY HARRISON: Council Member, one thing I
8 just want to share with you is kettling has never
9 been part of the training that the NYPD has utilized.
10 Had there been mistakes that might have resulted in
11 some type of form or fashion of that, you know we
12 will be very transparent and say yeah, we might have
13 made mistakes. It's a training mechanism that we
14 have in place with either our strategic response
15 group or our mobile field forces that respond to some
16 of these peaceful protests.

17 Unfortunately if it gets to a point where there
18 is a violent demonstration that turns out in it and
19 unfortunately those things do happen. We may have to
20 say surround certain individuals unfortunately, just
21 to make sure that none of our police officers get
22 hurt. But regarding the discipline, I don't have
23 that response in front of me right now. But I will
24 say that that is not a strategy that we do regarding
25 protests throughout the city.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

52

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. I will vehemently object to what you just said and I will let Chair Dromm jump in here.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah and I have to agree with you Chair Adams as well. I have been a victim of it. I have seen it with my own eyes. It happened when they did the Matthew Shepard protest. They kettled us in between 6th and 7th Avenue and they brought horses in and they stampeded the horses all over the people while we were kettled in. So, it's just bazaar that we are even having these types of discussions with the NYPD. And just not acknowledging the reality of what exists. It's bazaar.

JUANITA HOLMES: So, if you allow me to Councilman, I can speak to [LOST AUDIO 59:46].

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Chief Holmes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chief Holmes.

JUANITA HOLMES: Hi, so to say the least, it is not something we are trained to. I am not going to say that people didn't feel a victim of it because if you felt that way and you are aware of it, then obviously at some point it is happening.

1
2 What we have learned from that is this. Uh, when
3 we have danger ahead of certain locations and we are
4 blocking people off from whether it's a fire that was
5 started, whether it's an arrest that's being made, we
6 had to communicate better or should have communicated
7 better. Listen, you are free to take the other route
8 and continue your protest you know, if there was a
9 route available but the reason for us not allowing
10 you to go any further is because danger is ahead.

11 So, I am not making excuses or saying that was
12 the case all the time but I will say is, I have been
13 here 30 something years minus my one year of private
14 sector. Never have I heard that word or never have I
15 seen the department train but it doesn't mean people
16 didn't feel victim to it or that it didn't occur.

17 What I am saying is now, moving forward, protests
18 have gotten a lot better. A lot less arrests have
19 been made. Community affairs is there out front
20 handling that and there is communication. You know,
21 you tell them we have to communicate. Listen, there
22 is a fire, there is an arrest being made for a
23 particular reason but you are free to continue your
24 protest but can you please go this way or at least
25

1 allow us the time to get whatever is ahead under
2 control.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chief Holmes, that wasn't the
5 case in my instance and in many other people's
6 experiences. There was no danger involved but that's
7 what the police department chose to do. Granted, it
8 was many years ago but to deny my lived experience
9 with this is just not right and that is exactly the
10 problem with the police department.

11 I am glad that you are owning up to it somewhat
12 but this is the experiences that people have had with
13 the police department.

14 So, anyway, I want to move on. The point has
15 been made. We are not happy. I am not happy, many
16 people in the city are not happy with the fashion in
17 which the leadership here has led this department.

18 Let me talk about another failure. That's with
19 the School Safety Agents. Another component of last
20 year's budget agreement was the transfer of School
21 Safety to DOE. We understand that the shift will
22 take time but the financial plan details spending for
23 Fiscal 2025. And no money has been added or moved in
24 any year of the plan to reflect this shift. I
25 mentioned this in my opening. When do you expect to

1 transfer this function out of NYPD to be finalized?

2 And how is NYPD working with DOE to transfer these
3 functions?
4

5 DERMOT SHEA: Council Member, Councilman, thank
6 you for the question. It's a really important issue.
7 When we were notified at that last year at the
8 budget, we began as well as our partners,
9 specifically the DOE, members at City Hall an
10 immediate planning for that transfer to happen. I
11 think Chief Holmes was probably assigned to school
12 safety at the time if my memory serves me right and
13 she probably took part in some of that. And
14 currently it's spearheaded. I will turn it to Chief
15 Obe, Lola Obe who is on this call that could tell you
16 where we are right now but I could tell you that the
17 planning and it is going to be a complicated process
18 but we are 100 percent committed to it and it is
19 underway. Lola, are you on?

20 OLUFUNMILOLA OBE: Yes sir, I am on. Good
21 morning everyone. So, we started conversations with
22 the DOE, November of 2020. Right now, we are on
23 pace, we have been advised by the DOE that the
24 transition should happen by June of 2022. There is a
25 lot of progress. We had issues with data transfers.

1 So far we had the legal team from the PD and the DOE
2 get together. Right now we have a data shared
3 agreement in place but also working with the ITB
4 folks from both ends, PD and the DOE to get that
5 going. So, that's where we are with the transition
6 and we also have a number of committees that meet
7 weekly just to give, you know just to get a sense of
8 the progress and where we are.
9

10 So, there is a community engagement team. The
11 data shared a team and so, that's where we are for
12 the most part. It is ongoing, I know that you don't
13 see a part of it but we are talking to the DOE and
14 the transition that's moving forward.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and when can
16 we expect to see the movement of the money?

17 DERMOT SHEA: Kristine?

18 KRISTINE RYAN: Again, this is on a - it has
19 always meant to be a two year process and we want to
20 make sure we can get everything set and right before
21 the transfer happens. The specific timing of which
22 financial plan that will be in, that will ultimately
23 be up to the Office of Management and Budget but as
24 the Chief said, we are actively working on this
25 transition with DOE and various parts of both

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

agencies to move this forward to make sure it happens smoothly on that two year timeline.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, this is the second year of the agreement and we are moving into Fiscal '22. Are you saying that we can expect to see this at adoption?

KRISTINE RYAN: I can't speak to specifically what it will be in but I am sure the Office of Management and Budget can provide more detail on the exact timing.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, who is controlling the decision to make - to change that funding? Isn't that your department?

KRISTINE RYAN: We work in concert with the Office of Management and Budget because this is involving the budgets of two agencies, both ours and the Department of Education.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Have you had discussions with OMB?

KRISTINE RYAN: We have ongoing discussions with OMB. I don't have the exact which financial plan the transition will happen.

3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And what were those
4 discussions within OMB involved? What did they
5 involve?

6 KRISTINE RYAN: They involve all of the details
7 that the Chief just spoke about. They are involved
8 in this process in terms of the operations,
9 identifying the resources that we have in the
10 Department here that will be transferred over and the
11 funding that goes along with that. What the various
12 titles and positions do. What role they play here
13 and I am sure on the other side, conversations in
14 parallel happening on what role to play at the
15 Department of Education.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, this answer is not
17 sufficient. We need to know more about when those
18 funds will be transferred and we hope that you will
19 engage OMB in those discussions as well. It seems
20 like you haven't actually had that discussion with
21 them.

22 Do you have any plans to hire any new School
23 Safety Agents?

24 KRISTINE RYAN: We have also been speaking with
25 OMB and the Mayor's Office about that but no
discussion has been, no final decision has been made

3 on those hires at this time. Any of those hires
4 would be to replace attrition. We are down about 500
5 School Safety Agents at this time.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, will you have an answer
7 for us by adoption?

8 KRISTINE RYAN: We will continue to have those
9 conversation with the Mayor's office and The Mayor's
10 Office of Management and Budget.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Again, you are refusing to
12 answer.

13 KRISTINE RYAN: Yes, we will work with OMB and
14 the Mayor's Office to get you an answer.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: When will you have the
16 answer?

17 KRISTINE RYAN: It will be based on those
18 conversations with those entities.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Will you have the answer by
20 Adoption?

21 KRISTINE RYAN: It involves other parties, so we
22 will all work together, that would be the goal.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I just want to know when you
24 will have the answer.

25 KRISTINE RYAN: The goal will be to have the
answer by Adoption.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

60

3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Listen, you were brought in to
4 answer questions to the oversight body that has
5 oversight over you at the department.

6 KRISTINE RYAN: Chair with all respect, I did just
7 answer the question.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Excuse me, excuse me. When
9 will you have the answer?

10 DERMOT SHEA: As Kristine said, she is working
11 with OMB. There are multiple partners involved.
12 What we are focused on here is if there are
13 additional people that have to be hired for the
14 safety of students, then those decisions will be made
15 in partnership with the DOE, us and OMB. And really,
16 it's irrelevant where the budget money comes from.
17 We are worried about the safety of the kids.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner?

19 DERMOT SHEA: And if it is something normally as
20 planned transfers over to DOE than we will make those
21 decisions at that time as well.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, we don't want
23 to know a week before or two days before or at
24 adoption itself exactly whether you are making a
25 decision to hire 400 or so new School Safety Agents.

1
2 And then we do not have time to discuss that with you
3 and to share our concerns with you about that.

4 So, this is a tactic that we do not appreciate.
5 We need to know well before.

6 DERMOT SHEA: I understand that and I agree with
7 you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you.

9 DERMOT SHEA: And we are working with OMB on
10 that.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Okay, let's go to
12 Council Member questions.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Dromm. So,
14 if any Council Members have questions for the
15 Administration, please use the Zoom raise hand
16 function and you will be added to the queue. Council
17 Members, please keep your questions to five minutes
18 including answers and please wait for the Sergeant at
19 Arms to tell you when your time begins and the
20 Sergeant will also let you know when your time is up.

21 We will first hear questions from Public Advocate
22 Williams followed by Council Member Lander.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can somebody unmute the
25 Public Advocate please.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I think I am good now.
Can everybody hear me?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes sir.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I can.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you everyone.
Thank you Chair Dromm, Chair Adams, Commissioner and
the NYPD. I have family and friends who are in law
enforcement and so, I always remember that with any
comments I make and I always remember that if
something happened right now and there was danger,
most folks would expect that men and women run before
the danger, while we run away.

And so, [INAUDIBLE 1:10:02]. I have
unfortunately been hearing people pushing a binary
discussion between more police and no law enforcement
at all. And unfortunately some of that particularly
the former are specialized in pushing that narrative
instances of gun violence is up. They specialize in
stocking fear. But I also remember that they have
the same line of reasoning, whether the violence is
up or violence is down. In fact, they said the same
things when we were at a historic low.

Even worse I think for me, are those who think
they provide leadership by saying the answer is

1
2 somewhere in the middle. I just want to be
3 emphatically clear that it is not. The answer is not
4 somewhere in the middle. We have been failing to ask
5 the questions and have the right discussion for far
6 too long. An answer is in finally implementing the
7 public safety plan that reflects what after many
8 years people are finally beginning to say, which is
9 police is not synonymous with public sector. The
10 answer is funding and resourcing all of the
11 departments and all of the things that we say
12 actually provide public safety as the departments
13 coordination with law enforcement to have [INAUDIBLE
14 1:11:21].

15 What we have heard is a lot of words around this
16 but not the action unfortunately. Violence is up.
17 We expected and knew that this would happen. When I
18 testified in DYCD, I talked about the young man, the
19 13-year-old who committed suicide a day after the
20 young man, 12-year-old who died from bullying. The
21 day at Time Square, there was a birthday party that
22 was shot up in Colorado. In Miami, there was another
23 shooting. Gun violence is up across the country. So
24 is suicide as I mentioned. It is not because of New
25 York States bail reform. It is not because NYPD has

1
2 been defunded and it pains me to see people who
3 actually know that the NYPD has not been defunded,
4 especially in relation to other departments either by
5 silence or actually spending that it has. It is not
6 helpful to the conversation. We cut 35,000 new jobs
7 last year. The department was only, the one of only
8 to actually get new hires to replenish attrition at
9 every agency head.

10 It is frustrating because we failed and we are
11 now reaping the failure, the violence. Can you
12 imagine other departments, other professions that
13 have access to the type of overtime that police have?
14 Police are not the only ones who need overtime for
15 those type of reasons. I spent in the city, just the
16 other day, the fact that you know, Thrive has spent
17 over \$1 billion and centers are either not built or
18 empty. And we will continue to defend police
19 department to subways abuse, mentally ill people
20 instead of getting those centers up.

21 By the way, crime in the subways is down into
22 over April. We know we have a lot more work to do.
23 The problem is we keep continuing to say that police
24 are the primary reason that we are safe and we have
25 to do everything to make sure they are funded to the

1 max even while other people – even a discussion about
2 changing the way we look at School Safety Agents.
3 Not firing people but just changing the way we talk
4 about it and we look at it. It's all kinds of crazy.
5 We can't go on. We were at unsustainable lows of gun
6 violence and murders just before the pandemic
7 happened. We knew there was going to be an uptick at
8 some point because we weren't sure assist it. The
9 decrease in crime happened while we went from almost
10 20,000 in Rikers to now about 5,000. The police,
11 give or take a thousand up or down have remained
12 primarily the same. In that time, stops went down,
13 arrests went down, the use of force went down. All
14 of those things went down. We know it can be done.
15 It has been done. We did it.

17 The NYPD I hope can focus more on gun
18 trafficking. Just to same way we did on terrorism
19 with a federal issue. Let's give our law enforcement
20 the focus where they need to focus and yes, they
21 have. I don't know of anybody that ever seen a
22 square footage where the police are inundated.
23 That's not the community they want. No one said that
24 they want to live in the community where every square
25

1
2 block we could have is filled with police and police
3 force. It doesn't feel right.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much. I
6 just want to say, we have been asking and answering
7 the wrong questions and we are paying the price for
8 that. We all have partnership to play and I really
9 hope we can get this right in this budget as we are
10 increasing the [INAUDIBLE 1:15:10] but there is no
11 increase in the SBS budget for job training and job
12 center. I really hope we can get it right some time
13 because people are dying. Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. We will now hear
15 from Council Member Lander followed by Council Member
16 Rodriguez.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you to both Chairs
19 and Commissioner, thank you for being here. I want
20 to start by associating myself with the words of the
21 Public Advocate on what we are looking and what we
22 are not looking at and what kind of leadership we
23 need to bring us together to confront real problems.
24 During the preliminary budget hearing, we identified
25 the fact that last year's NYPD budget when we

1
2 accounted for the overtime overspending have been
3 reduced by about \$240 million from the previous year.
4 This year at this point, an increase is proposed of
5 over \$200 million. So, we are basically at the same
6 place we were budget size pre-pandemic, so it is just
7 not helpful to lay the increase in crime on budget
8 cuts that were not made. That we are not seeing.
9 And I guess, I also want to say in response to what
10 Chair Dromm said about kettling, the Public Advocate
11 and I were kettled together on multiple occasions in
12 June on Washington Avenue on one evening, in Grand
13 Army Plaza in another evening where there was no
14 effort to direct people in a safer or different
15 direction. There was a kettling approach to end a
16 protest and that happened, it was on video on
17 multiple occasions but I want to start with a budget
18 question, just because it is something I was trying
19 to find in the budget and could not see.

20 For many years, the police foundation has funded
21 millions of dollars annually toward the NYPD's budget
22 covering expenses ranging from surveillance
23 technologies to public relations initiatives. Not
24 subject to public oversight and the NYPD has resisted
25 transparency related to police foundation donations.

1 So, as a result, last year the Council included a
2 term in condition in the FY21 Adopted budget
3 requiring the NYPD to submit a report on private
4 funding sources and the expenditures from such
5 sources. The report that the NYPD submitted to the
6 Council this year doesn't list any monies from the
7 police foundation, zero. So, is that accurate? Was
8 there actually zero money from the police foundation
9 this year? If not, how much was funded? How much
10 more is expected and why wasn't this listed in the
11 report pursuant to the term and condition?
12

13 KRISTINE RYAN: So, I can speak to that. The
14 foundations funding it's a private entity as you
15 indicated. The funding does not flow through the
16 NYPD's budget. So the term and condition we provided
17 the information in the budget lines related to
18 expenditures that are made by the police department
19 directly using funds from private entities but there
20 are no budget lines related to expenditures from the
21 foundation because the NYPD isn't making those
22 expenditures.

23 You pointed out some of the things the foundation
24 does support the city and the department with. Those
25 things also include rewards paid out for tips for

1
2 Crime Stoppers, Operation Gun Stop. They have
3 assisted -

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Hang on, if you are not
5 going to provide us the report with the information
6 on where the money is coming from and where it is
7 going to, I am not going to let you take credit for
8 it in this hearing. Will you provide us with the
9 information on the sources and uses of that money?
10 It sounds like you are planning to continue to keep
11 it confidential and not provide it to us, which I
12 believe is a violation of the terms and conditions.
13 It was clearly intended to get that information
14 provided but it sounds like you are saying you are
15 going to continue to refuse to do so.

16 KRISTINE RYAN: The foundation provides an annual
17 report as a nonprofit. The expenditures are not made
18 by the police department.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I understand the expenses
20 are not made by the police department. It's an off
21 book effort where you get money and it has been at
22 the direction of the police department. The
23 Commissioner decides how it is going to be spent. It
24 goes alongside NYPD spending. So, I am going to take
25 that as an answer that we are not going to get it,

1
2 which is disappointing because that was the point of
3 the term and condition.

4 The other question that I want to ask here is in
5 three areas where headcount is growing, all areas
6 where the department is saying it is pursuing
7 alternative approaches. So, if there is 23 positions
8 proposed to add to the co-response mental health
9 teams, NYPD uniformed officers in neighborhood
10 policing, there is 216 new civilian positions being
11 added and in School Safety; although we can't get a
12 clear answer, there is \$4 million more added in this
13 year's budget.

14 So, I am going to assume that there is a plan to
15 actually hire new School Safety Agents even though we
16 asked at the Preliminary Budget and we were told that
17 we would know by the Executive Budget and now we are
18 told maybe someone will tell us by the time we are
19 asked to adopt it but in each case, it seems like
20 alternative approaches don't mean less policing, they
21 actually mean more policing. So, that's what the
22 budget says to me. Am I missing something?

23 KRISTINE RYAN: So, on the School Safety piece,
24 the additional resources there, they are not
25 additional resources. That's the Fiscal Year '22

1 Budget, uhm, does not have the same. There was some
2 overtime reduction that we were able to take in the
3 current year because of fewer events and less school
4 safety overtime. And with the schools opening up
5 again, that funding is back in the budget in '22 and
6 out. And the positions that you are speaking about
7 are directly tied to the departments reform efforts.
8

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I understand they are
11 tied to the departments reform efforts. It's just
12 rather than adding mental health professionals so we
13 could have less police response, it looks to me like
14 we are adding more police response.

15 KRISTINE RYAN: I don't think it's mutually
16 exclusive to want to do more in the area of mental
17 health but the efforts of the reform in making sure
18 that we have additional resources that can work with
19 communities, that can work with providing individuals
20 and helping them navigate in the precincts with
21 customer representatives in our precincts is a key
22 part of the reform effort.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, it's not mutually
24 exclusive but it is clear in each of those cases. We
25 are spending more money. We are adding more

3 policing. That seems to be what the de Blasio
4 Administrations reform efforts add up to. So, I
5 guess we have the information that we need, even if
6 it's not information that we're satisfied with.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
8 Member Rodriguez followed by Council Member Holden.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Commissioner
11 for all the work that you have been doing. I wanted
12 to know what is the number that we have today of
13 police transit? Can you share that number? And
14 what, is there a plan to increase the numbers of
15 police officers in our transit system so that we can
16 deal with the level of violence in the train
17 stations.

18 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, so thank you Councilman.
19 Thank you for wearing the seatbelt there too. I
20 appreciate that. Everyone keep safe.

21 I will open it up and Kathy O'Reilly is on this
22 call. You know, we just had our first group coming
23 out of the academy in some time. Transit is getting,
24 I believe the number is roughly 80 officers out of
25 that. It's consistent with what traditionally we are
trying to bump up transit high presence with

1 auxiliary officers as well. When you look at the
2 number and Kathy will give it to you in a second, of
3 what we currently have. You know, we have done some
4 of the things that we have heard already on this call
5 today, trying to move people from inside positions
6 out. But we are in line with what we have
7 traditionally had in the transit system over a number
8 of years now.

10 Sometimes people quote well, pre-merge there was
11 more officers in transit but people need to realize
12 also that that's when you know we have streamlined
13 efficiency post-merge. So, whether it's record
14 keeping or emergency service response or training
15 units, those units don't need to be in the transit
16 bureau anymore. It's kind of one for the whole
17 department and it is more efficient but thank you for
18 the question and Kathy will bring it home here.

19 Kathy?

20 KATHLEEN O'REILLY: Good morning Commissioner.
21 Good morning Council. So, approximately mid-February
22 we surged about 500 additional officers into transit.
23 That surge is still ongoing. It's a combination of
24 resources from Patrol Services Bureau from SRG from
25 our counter terrorism response in addition to our

1
2 auxiliary's, which we start again this week. It's on
3 average, it's 500, some days it can be as much as 600
4 officers have been started into transit. But as the
5 Commissioner said, our numbers have been consistent
6 for the better part of two decades now. Our overall
7 headcount is just a little over 2,500 and members of
8 the service.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: My second question is,
10 and of course like as you know, I have been standing
11 up with the Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams in
12 our call to see an increase of more transit police
13 and also, to see more police officers inside the
14 trains. I feel it is important and I know that you
15 guys you know in the leadership that you have, you
16 have inherited this condition.

17 So, it is no use about blaming you and your
18 Commissioner and the rest of you but this is about,
19 how can we change that approach and understand that
20 we need to see more police officers inside the train
21 and also to deploy more social workers. Working
22 together in partnership with the NYPD, men and women
23 who work in transit inside the train.

24 My second part is about you know what is the
25 future of fighting violence and as we also know, I

1
2 have been partners standing together with Eric Adams
3 in his role as the Brooklyn Borough President in his
4 call for points that he believes that are important
5 to increase and improve safety in our train stations.
6 One is a better coordination between the city and the
7 MTA to address the balance in the train stations.
8 And the second one, also to deploy social workers
9 inside the train station. Have you been looking at
10 those proposals coming from the Borough President
11 Eric Adams and should we expect you know a more
12 aggressive plan with our resources with more
13 deployed, more coordination to address the level of
14 violence in our trains in the train stations?

15 KATHLEEN O'REILLY: So, Councilman, I would just
16 like to respond first and foremost to remind
17 everybody that major crime is down 43 percent this
18 year in the transit system. What we are doing is
19 working with MTA, DHS on mental health partners in
20 dealing with the persons in crisis and that are
21 causing these one or two incidents that occur that
22 have been over sensationalized but we also recognize
23 the perception and the fear that the ridership feels.
24 So, that's why we are surging our officers into
25 transit onto the platforms. They are riding the

3 trains. They are speaking with the conductors, they
4 are speaking with the token booth clerks, so we
5 should be, everybody should be seeing an absolute
6 increased police presence in the transit system.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: My earlier question,
8 of course you know that I wouldn't miss this about
9 diversity in the leadership of NYPD. I appreciate, I
10 know that all of you guys loved Chief Pichardo and it
11 was a big loss that we had. And I also feel that it
12 was a big loss in our community, from the Latino
13 community.

14 And I hope that in the next couple of months,
15 Commissioner and the rest of the team that you can
16 also look -

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: At potential great
19 candidates that we have, that should be promoting
20 inside the NYPD. Is there any plan for that to
21 happen?

22 DERMOT SHEA: Well, we are currently, I share
23 your thoughts on Chief Pichardo. He was a phenomenal
24 man. He was a good person and he was a friend and he
25 was a big loss to this department. We currently, you
know when you look at across the department, we are a

1
2 very verse department at the lower levels and I am
3 proud to say at the top levels as well, but always
4 more work to be done and the answer to your question
5 is yes. I will constantly be looking at diversity in
6 making position appointments. Not only yesterday but
7 tomorrow as well.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: We need more Latino in
9 the top leadership. I am proud. I am represented by
10 my Black, by my Whites who did a great job as a
11 father of two daughters. I just want my street to be
12 safe. I rely on you guys but we also, we need to
13 know as being Latino 29 percent, the second largest
14 group, I need to see more at the top level. So,
15 thank you for your leadership.

16 DERMOT SHEA: Well, I will say that I attended a
17 leadership breakfast about a week ago of the Latino
18 Officers Association, Hispanic Society, excuse me.
19 And it was the executive members there and you are
20 right, the good news is there is an awful lot of
21 talented men and women of Hispanic heritage at some
22 of the high levels. And we will continue to look at
23 them as we make future appointments. I agree with
24 you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
4 Commissioner.

5 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
7 Member Holden followed by Council Member Louis.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you Commissioner
10 Shea for the work that you do and your dedication and
11 to your officers on duty every day. You guys are
12 doing a great job and I appreciate the people and my
13 district appreciate the effort of the NYPD.

14 The question is in my district the NCO is a
15 neighborhood coordination officers have been pulled
16 from their primary responsibility of working with the
17 community to work on – right now they are doing open
18 cases that we see a lot of. So, they are really
19 being pulled away from the community. Does your
20 budget fully fund the NCO program?

21 DERMOT SHEA: I am sorry, can you repeat that
22 Councilman? The last, just the last line?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Does your budget fully
24 fund the NCO program?

25 DERMOT SHEA: Well, listen, thank you for the
earlier comments and when you talk about the NCO's, I

1
2 can go a lot of different directions here but it is
3 an integral part of what we do as a department. It's
4 key to our philosophy in neighborhood policing you
5 know and as Kristine or Rodney will tell you, Rodney
6 is trying to get the mic here. You know, when you
7 look at our overall budget, that is worked into our
8 overall budget and we are staffed regarding our
9 NCO's. Rodney, you want to pick it up?

10 RODNEY HARRISON: So, Council Member you know, I
11 happen to be in a very less position and through my
12 journey up to this rank, I was a big part of creating
13 neighborhood policing and one of the roles of the
14 NCO's in order for them to be successful, they are
15 not supposed to be touched and their only job is to
16 make sure that they have that relationship with the
17 communities that they are assigned to. That was a
18 goal and the infrastructure of neighborhood policing
19 is making sure that they are not being redeployed to
20 do anything else but to be assigned to the
21 neighborhood coordination spot and making sure that
22 they are having the Build a Block meetings, working
23 with the community members, identifying the issues
24 and how do we work together to resolve them.

1
2 I am going to pass it over to Chief Holmes, maybe
3 she knows a little bit more about it but this is an
4 easy fix and we will make sure that we get it
5 back on the appropriate tracks and make sure that
6 they are not being reassigned or redeployed to handle
7 other issues within the precinct.

8 JUANITA HOLMES: So, I am going to agree with the
9 Councilman. It's something we have been looking at.
10 NCO's have been pulled in ten different directions.
11 I know part of the reason why they are there
12 naturally is career. It's career incentivized and
13 that has a lot to do with going to an investigative
14 track but it's something that we have been speaking
15 about here in the department, the administration as
16 far as refocusing them. Because they have been doing
17 a lot of investigative work and their sole function
18 is out there to facilitate, coordinate relationships
19 with the community.

20 So, it is something we are looking at. How can
21 we better uhm, you know get back to basics for a lack
22 of a better term with our Neighborhood Coordinating
23 Officers.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Thank you
25 Chief Holmes. Because yeah, it is - the idea of the

1
2 NCO's was to engage with the community and
3 unfortunately, that's taken you know because of the
4 budget hit, that's taken its toll on their
5 connections with the community.

6 But Commissioner Shea, I have a question on - so
7 I heard today, there were 23 cases of complaints
8 against officers and eight cases that dealt with the
9 use of force during the protest. So, I'd like to
10 know on the other side of that, how many officers
11 were injured during the protest and what was the
12 impacting overtime or staffing levels as a result of
13 those injuries?

14 DERMOT SHEA: Well there was hundreds
15 unfortunately. There was hundreds of officers. I,
16 you know, unfortunately it is still thank God to a
17 much, much lesser degree Councilman. A much less of
18 a problem now. We still do suffer an injury
19 occasionally at some of these ongoing protests now.
20 Nothing like last year, thank God but at the peak
21 last year, I think the number was approximately 500
22 officers injured. Some of them quite seriously.
23 Some of them frankly that will probably cause the end
24 of their careers.

1
2 Uhm, and I don't have a dollar amount of the cost
3 there but obviously there was a significant dollar
4 amount. Not only to the injuries, which is most
5 serious but to the property damage and the amount of
6 vehicles that are damaged is an ongoing problem in
7 New York City.

8 I mean, I could tell you and I don't want to bore
9 you but some really discouraging things like the
10 homeless outreach unit, which we rely on to help
11 homeless people all over the city get services. This
12 is before it was taken away last year. We lost a
13 significant number of those vehicles last year that
14 were I believe burned.

15 So, all of this you know, we never as a city, all
16 of us, the Council, the PD and the city don't want to
17 go back there but it certainly had a both an
18 emotional and fiscal cost.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you Commissioner.
21 Thank you Chairs.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
23 Member Louis followed by Council Member Miller.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You time will begin.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

83

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Good morning and thank you
4 Chairs Dromm and Adams for your leadership. Thank
5 you Commissioner Shea for joining us as well as your
6 team.

7 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I think Council Member
9 Holden asked one of my questions but I will change it
10 a little but just first, my first question is
11 according to the submission for the Executive Budget,
12 there were two rows listed. The Community Assistant
13 and Community Ambassadors roles. I just wanted to
14 know if you could share further details on those
15 roles and how the hiring process will be.

16 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, I am going to turn it
17 Danielle. So, Danielle, is Danielle on? In a moment
18 and I will just queue it up for Danielle and you know
19 coming out of the tough year that we had last year,
20 as everyone on the Council knows and it funneled
21 through the Council, the reform initiative that we
22 went through. We heard from all over the city good
23 and bad about what people thought about the police
24 and the state of public safety in New York City. And
25 it kind of goes hand and hand with something Juanita
and I and others put together last year, customer

1 service. Treating people that come into precincts as
2 if they are a customer and how do we treat crime
3 victims and people that want information etc.
4

5 So, as we were working on that one project, now
6 along comes the reform initiative and we started to
7 hear the same things again. So, Danielle, if you
8 could just describe where we are with the community
9 ambassadors and the other positions that we are
10 looking at moving forward.

11 DANIELLE GRILLO PEMBERTON: Sure, good morning
12 everybody. So, we have two positions that were
13 brought up. The Customer Service Representative is
14 the first one. This is the one that we were granted
15 180 positions. Community Assistant positions in
16 recent budget. So, the goal there is really to
17 assign them to precincts, transit and housing. We
18 will have multiple customer service representatives
19 in our precinct facilities. They will be the first
20 point of contact to welcome visitors in and ensure
21 really that they are able to navigate the precinct,
22 access the services that they need. Whether it is
23 accident reports, whether it is seeing a detective,
24 they will log and track the number of visitors. They
25 will make sure the people aren't leaving and they

1 will really be that front facing, welcoming presence
2 into the precinct facility.
3

4 And the same for transit housing and actually
5 some of the plan is for some of our other services
6 across the department, whether it be property clerk,
7 licensed vision other areas where we see high traffic
8 visitors.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: And Danielle, just a quick
10 question. Will the Community Ambassador and
11 Community Assistance, will they work siloed or
12 together because one is a patrolled borough, the
13 other one is in the precinct. So, how does that
14 work?

15 DANIELLE GRILLO PEMBERTON: Yeah, the idea is for
16 really for them to be a network. So, of course they
17 are assigned under each of the boroughs but we plan
18 to have regular communication, sharing best practices
19 and they are also going through departmentwide
20 training as they come onboard but I will educate them
21 on both department policies, practices, how to access
22 certain information but also a customer service
23 training that will be consistent when given across
24 all the boroughs.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

86

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you. Is there more
4 to that?

5 DANIELLE GRILLO PEMBERTON: I was going to switch
6 to the Community Ambassadors.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yes.

8 DANIELLE GRILLO PEMBERTON: So and I can punt
9 this one also to Deputy Commissioner Parker who the
10 Community Ambassadors will fall under but he is our
11 eight positions Community Ambassador title. These
12 are really very external focused. One assigned to
13 each patrol borough. They will be out in the
14 communities. They will be navigating, working with
15 community complainants, victims. They will report
16 directly to the borough commanders and they will
17 really be out in the field serving as a liaison for
18 all problems. Disturbances we'll be linking them
19 into assist with any protest response, large
20 gatherings, community issues and they will be really
21 serving the community any needs and priorities that
22 they have. Chauncey, do you want to add anything to
23 that?

24 CHAUNCEY PARKER: Sure. Hi, Council Member
25 Louis. So, of the, two of the community ambassadors
that have been hired, they started yesterday and a

1
2 third is in the process and should be starting
3 hopefully very, very soon. They come with – we are
4 trying to put together almost like an Oceans Eleven
5 kind of skill set, so there are some – one of them
6 comes from DYCD background. Another comes from HRA,
7 another one comes from a CBO background. Also from
8 different parts of the city but they are as Danielle
9 said, they are all part of a network and really, the
10 police commissioners philosophy of customer service
11 and everything we definitely do. That the police
12 department has done so well on the protect side of
13 keeping people safe in the city and he said as a
14 north star is community service.

15 And through, in particular, which Chief Holmes
16 has said –

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

18 CHAUNCEY PARKER: That's going to be, everybody –
19 look all of these components will be incorporated to
20 make sure that we are providing exceptional service
21 to all New Yorkers.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Alright, thank you for
23 that. I did want to ask some follow up questions in
24 regards to that like, will they be uniformed? Will
25 they have access to CompStat but we can talk about

1 that another time because I don't think I have that
2 much time left and I do have another question
3 regarding the CVAP program, the Victim Assistance
4 Program, that's transferring from NYPD to MOCJ. I
5 wanted to know, what does that look like regarding
6 the employees that will be transferred over? Will
7 there be any layoffs? Is it the same amount of
8 employees transferring over to NYPD to MOCJ?
9

10 DERMOT SHEA: That's Kristine. Kristine, if you
11 have it.

12 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, there won't be any layoffs
13 and the majority of the staff are employed by Safe
14 Horizon. So, the contract is transferring over and
15 so, they will be with that contract. So, no one is
16 going to lose their - the intent is not for anyone to
17 lose their position tied to this.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Awesome and regarding the
19 YCO program. I didn't see any information in there
20 and I know Council Member Holden touched a little bit
21 on NCO's but I wanted to know about the YCO program.
22 I wanted to know; would it be funded in the FY22
23 budget? Is this something that your agency wants to
24 continue to move forward?
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

89

3 DERMOT SHEA: Oh, well, I mean I will take that.
4 Absolutely, it's at the heart of everything that we
5 are doing. Continuing to work with kids and we are
6 funding that through our headcount.

7 So, that's officers that are assigned to every
8 precinct and housing district across the city and
9 working with the specialization to really – you know,
10 that's under Chauncey Parker, under Jeff Maddrey
11 Community Affairs, certainly Juanita Holmes. I mean
12 those are her people more often than not and Dave
13 Barrere and just continuing to work with the kids of
14 this city. I meant what I said on day one that that
15 to me is the greatest crime fighting that we do.
16 Keeping kids out of trouble in the first place.

17 So, incredibly proud, I mean, we would do a
18 separate presentation for you Councilwoman on just
19 some of the good things, great things we are doing
20 with partners across this city to really serve
21 families and kids.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: And Commissioner, I would
23 really appreciate that because I don't get any follow
24 ups regarding the YCO's in my district. So, I would
25 love to see what's been happening in the past year
regarding that. But I will yield back to Chairs

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

90

3 Dromm and Adams. Thank you so much for the
4 opportunity. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Louis, was
6 your question in regard to the Community Ambassadors
7 with the uniforms?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yeah, I wanted to know if
9 they would be considered uniformed ambassadors?

10 DERMOT SHEA: No, those are civilian. They are
11 civilian members. They are not in uniform.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Will they have access to
13 CompStat being that they do have to do some type of
14 reporting?

15 DERMOT SHEA: I am not sure what you mean by
16 that. I mean, the numbers, certainly, we push public
17 online. They will certainly as employees have you
18 know full range of access to you know the department.
19 So, I am going to say yes but we could follow up that
20 discussion if you want.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Alright, thank you so
22 much. I yield back to you Chair Dromm. Thank you so
23 much.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Back to Counsel.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
Member Miller, followed by Council Member Cornegy.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

91

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, good morning Chairs
5 Adams, Dromm. Commissioner, you and your team, good
6 morning to you.

7 DERMOT SHEA: Good morning.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I want to first begin by
9 thanking Chief Harrison for coming out to last nights
10 EFTAR event in Jamaica. It was well received. Your
11 team were received and want to thank you and the
12 department for the overall attention to detail that
13 you paid to the Muslim community during the Ramadan
14 celebration this month and what will occur the next
15 few days.

16 So, I want to ask about civilianization and where
17 we are in the reduction of those numbers. Obviously,
18 it is something that we have been speaking about for
19 the last seven or eight years. Obviously, officers
20 that are doing jobs that are within the titles of
21 civilians. Now, you also mentioned that there was
22 100 civilian jobs that were lost who are filling
23 those responsibilities and does that add to the
24 civilianization of the park. That is my first
25 question and then secondly, I had a bill that was not
introduced but we had a conversation about once we

1 talked about the removal of the school safety
2 officers from the NYPD and the bill would codify uhm,
3 the feasibility of the movement of the Department of
4 Education transfer of the School Agents. And the
5 responsibilities and where those responsibilities
6 would go. What the impact would be on students and
7 families in the school building. That has not
8 happened in terms of the legislation but has the
9 department, are you able to – and along with your DOE
10 partners, are you able to codify and address the
11 feasibility of these actions and the transfer of
12 services detailed based on responsibilities? Of the
13 current responsibility of School Safety Agents?

14 And then furthermore, you know and that would be
15 a DOE portion that you know, what kind of
16 professional development are we looking at in
17 enhancing the skill sets of the current School Safety
18 Agents to whatever title they will transferred into,
19 around you know, professional development and
20 enhancing those skill sets. Obviously, we don't want
21 to throw the baby out with the bath water and the
22 work that they have done over the past 25 years in
23 creating an environment for our young people that is
24 conducive to learning. Considering that they are the
25

1
2 only semblance of community. Black and Brown women
3 when they leave their household that they see for the
4 next eight hours. You know, just sometimes the
5 dialogue that has occurred around this conversation
6 has been unfair at best.

7 So, if we could address the civilianization and
8 then the feasibility of the transfer. I have others
9 but I will just leave it at that. I know there is a
10 ton of other folks waiting to ask questions. Thank
11 you Chairs and I look forward to hearing the answer
12 to those questions.

13 DERMOT SHEA: Councilman Miller, thank you for
14 recognizing the men and women in the school safety.
15 I agree with you that some of the best that New York
16 City has. I will turn it to Kristine in a moment to
17 talk about the civilianization specifically with
18 school safety. You started talking about
19 civilianization. I think in the beginning about
20 under the broader spectrum of what is our philosophy
21 in terms of – and I think we share the same. At
22 every opportunity, we are trying to get uniformed
23 police officers with everything we have heard from
24 every Council Member today and we share it.

1 Getting full duty, able bodied police officers
2
3 back on the street wherever possible. Out from
4 behind desks etc. We probably talk to much about
5 this for years. I think we are doing more than we
6 ever have in trying to free up people and get them
7 onto the street. That's when New Yorkers need it,
8 need the men and women and that's where they have the
9 best impact with neighborhood policing.

10 We are concerned. I personally am concerned as
11 we see the attrition on the civilian side of the
12 department that we are seeing the potential for that
13 in reverse and it's something that we are strongly
14 trying to combat that happening. In other words, as
15 the civilian population of the department shrinks,
16 having to now do reverse. Put the cops back inside
17 to fill some of these positions.

18 That will be the last thing we do but it is
19 something that is a possibility and Kristine, you can
20 give specifics on numbers and school safety.

21 KRISTINE RYAN: Uhm, yeah, so specific to
22 civilianization -

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

24 KRISTINE RYAN: As the Commissioner said, you
25 know it's something we are committed to. We have

1 identified future positions we can civilianize should
2 we receive additional resources. But given the
3 fiscal situation, we, like all agencies, we have lost
4 a lot of positions to attrition. Compared to last
5 year, we are down 850 civilians and so, while we are
6 able to hire on a two for one basis, that for us,
7 like all our agencies, does have an impact on our
8 overall civilian headcount but, as the Commissioner
9 said, we do really try to maintain what we can in
10 terms of having the civilians perform the functions
11 that have been identified and we do look forward to,
12 as hopefully the fiscal condition improves for the
13 city as a whole, continuing to have discussions about
14 further civilianization.
15

16 On the school safety end, I am not entirely sure
17 I am clear on exactly which piece you are getting at
18 Council Member. Could you just repeat the question
19 on that?

20 DERMOT SHEA: Timeline maybe.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Actually, we weren't
22 actually talking about the timeline itself. We were
23 talking about or the actual implementation, we were
24 codifying the feasibility first off because this was
25 earlier on. Whether or not it was necessary to do

1
2 it. What would happen and those individual
3 responsibilities that now lay within the purview of
4 school safety, what happens to them. And, as well as
5 the impact on students and families based upon the
6 services that are being delivered. Law enforcement
7 and law enforcement alike.

8 DERMOT SHEA: Well, I will take that then. So, I
9 think you know there is a lot of different opinions
10 on this Councilman Miller and I respect all the
11 opinions. What we are focused on is, you know, we
12 will take on marching orders and we are going to
13 carry them out. So, the reality is, the process has
14 started. We would be negligent if we didn't start
15 that process. I think Councilman Dromm mentioned
16 that earlier. We have to work on going to assume
17 that this is what's happening.

18 So, Chief Obe and Chief Holmes before her, had
19 been meeting with DOE and we expect this to take
20 place I think it's next year. Is it the right thing
21 to do? I will leave that for others to debate. You
22 know, I am just hopeful that it has no negative
23 impact on kids. It shouldn't. Those people that
24 work for school safety currently that are NYPD
25 employees, if they transition over, they are some of

1
2 the best people I have ever met. They are completely
3 committed to the wellbeing of the students in the New
4 York City public school system.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, at this point, around
6 implementation, has there been any of that such
7 conversation around codifying the actual experiences
8 and responsibilities and of course, has this
9 conversation occurred with the bargaining units of
10 the folks that are involved in terms of you know,
11 ensuring that they maintained a level of compensation
12 whatever, but quite frankly, I think it's even more
13 about how do we serve our young people? How do we
14 keep school buildings safe? How do we keep them
15 dignified and respectable? And so, have we assessed
16 the impact of the removal of these school safety
17 agents in their current position and have we
18 determined what any future position would look like
19 and the impact on that on our 1.2 million young folks
20 and what happens to these 80 percent of the Black and
21 Brown women workforce if they are removed from school
22 safety in the future.

23 So, really looking to see what that process looks
24 like before we move on and the impact it will not
25 just have on the school building, the students but

3 ultimately communities if in fact we do this and do
4 not assess the feasibility of such a move. Not
5 saying that it's even the wrong move at this time but
6 we need to know what we are doing in doing so.

7 DERMOT SHEA: I think you are absolutely right.
8 It's a real interesting discussion. You have
9 parents, you have teachers, you have labor leaders.
10 You have the kids. Let's not forget the kids. You
11 have elected officials. You have community groups.
12 Everyone I think is united that they want what's best
13 for the kids. Everyone has slightly different
14 opinions. I think all of this is being spoken about
15 as this is ongoing. Lola, do you want to comment?
16 You are in those meetings. Lola Obe?

17 OLUFUNMILOLA OBE: I'm sorry, I couldn't unmute
18 for a minute. I was going to jump in. Thank you
19 Councilman. So, just to follow up on the hearing we
20 had in February, I know that there is some concern
21 about not really knowing about the transition as to
22 what's happening. So, in terms of community
23 engagement and this is in Brooklyn. So, CEC16 put
24 together a Zoom meeting about two or three weeks ago
25 and I think it was an eye opener for the NYPD and the
DOE. So, this just speaks to your concern about the

1
2 SSA's themselves. It was apparent to everyone on the
3 panel that the agents themselves were not really
4 engaged. The DOE has spoken to us about that in
5 terms of labor and the union, we have to have labor
6 on the PD end speak to the DOE labor. When they come
7 together and make a decision, we will go ahead and of
8 course, involving the union also. We can't have the
9 agency engage with our labor and the unions.

10 When you speak to the DOE, we have been super
11 supportive. They describe it as a functional
12 transfer, so I know there are some concerns about
13 SSA's you know 5,000 plus. Like Commissioner Ryan
14 mentioned, we have an authorized headcount of 5,063
15 agents. We are currently down 554. So, there is
16 some concern because there hasn't been any classes
17 since January of 2020.

18 If we continue at this pace, we will not have
19 enough agents come September. So, I just wanted to
20 also mention that. So, DOE says functional transfer,
21 I just want to mention that also training. The DOE
22 has done an amazing job. If we could partner it up
23 with very closely with implicit bias training. So a
24 lot of the training, we have thousands of our agents
25 trained by the DOE. Next week, they are going to

3 target the executives in the school safety division.
4 So, we will continue with that.

5 So, CEC 16 meeting, huge eye opener right now.
6 We have to point to where we have to engage the
7 agents. There is a lot of fear. There is concern.
8 72.6 percent of our agents as we mentioned are women,
9 90 percent of our agents are people of color. So, I
10 thank you for your concern and your support
11 Councilman Miller.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. We are going to
14 have to move on at this point to our next Council
15 Member. We have given a lot of extra time Council
16 Member Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Council Member
18 Dromm. Thank you once again for your leadership.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and also, I
20 just want to say that there is concern about whether
21 or not we should actually hire more police for the
22 schools or use those resources differently.

23 With that being said, we will go onto our next
24 Council Member.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
Member Cornegy followed by Council Member Menchaca.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

101

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Can you guys hear me?

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Hey, how are you
7 Commissioner? Thank you Chairs. Both Chairs Adams
8 and also Chair Dromm. I want to start by saying uhm,
9 I am excited about the fact that the NYPD brass is
10 more reflective of the communities that we serve in.
11 Whether it's First Dep Tucker, whether it's Chief
12 Obe, whether it is Chief Royster, whether it's Chief
13 Holmes, whether it's the Chief Harrison's jointly.
14 You know I think that that shows a movement in the
15 right direction for a lot of us who have been around,
16 who have asked for the cadet classes to be more
17 reflective of the communities that they serve in.

18 I also want to state that I don't think it is
19 mutually exclusively to demand reform and
20 accountability while still supporting the men and
21 women who go to work every single day with two
22 mandates. Which is to serve in the communities that
23 they are assigned and return home safely to their
24 families.

25 Having said that, Commissioner, what programs
would you point to that directly lead to building a

1
2 better relationship between the NYPD and the
3 communities that they serve in?

4 DERMOT SHEA: Well, I will mention the one name
5 right off the bat Councilman Cornegy and thank you
6 for -

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Wait, wait, I am sorry
8 Commissioner, I left out Chief Maddrey, sorry.
9 Before you go there, I forgot Chief Maddrey, I am
10 sorry, I am sorry Chief.

11 JEFFREY MADDREY: You are going to pay.

12 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, you are pay for that one. No
13 more community affairs in your district.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Absolutely.

15 DERMOT SHEA: And Kim Royster, who is doing a
16 phenomenal job as Chief of Transportation.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I said Chief Royster.

18 DERMOT SHEA: You probably did. So, I mean, I
19 think you know not to relive last year but we got to
20 relive last year and we got to continue to do it
21 every day. Trust is at the heart of every single
22 thing that we do. And that extends to the community.
23 Trust between law enforcement and elected officials
24 too. And I think that's on me and us, that sometimes
25 we are not trusted in what we say and what we do.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

103

3 Everything that we do you know, when we talk
4 about crime meetings, we also talk about building
5 trust. Whether it's myself and Chief Rodney
6 Harrison, Chief Juanita Holmes, Chief Jeff Maddrey.
7 What are we doing? Are we doing the right thing?
8 How is it being perceived? These are conversations
9 that happen daily. With what are we doing? Lord, we
10 can't put it in five minutes. I am sure of that.

11 The amount of things that we are doing, I will
12 give you a couple off the bat, what we have done this
13 week. You know, look at what we did in Harlem last
14 week with refurbishing basketball courts and it's not
15 about playing basketball. It's about working with
16 elected officials and working with the residents of
17 public housing and giving people hope and giving
18 people something to do with the summer coming.

19 Chauncey Parker, I got give a tremendous amount
20 of credit. NYCHA, I got to give credit.
21 Councilwoman Ayala from East Harlem, I got to give
22 credit. The Mayor, you know, we made it happen and
23 we are going to roll out another 14 and we worked
24 with federal authorities and took money that often is
25 used to fight crime and we put it back into the
community.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

104

3 I think that's a real positive and it was very
4 well received in East Harlem and we have 14 more
5 sites coming before the summer. We are going to
6 rehab a field in Harlem by July 1st. Chauncey if
7 you're listening otherwise your are fired, that that
8 is going to happen. The Colonel Young Field by July
9 1st, that's happening. The work that we do with
10 Council Members and elected officials at 127 Penn,
11 instrumental. It's not just about sports but career
12 building. The work we do at the police foundation in
13 getting kids jobs and training. The work of the
14 youth officers with sports leagues all over New York
15 City and field trips. The recruitment drive
16 Councilman Cornegy that we just did. Hearing the
17 community, listening to hey, we want to be reflective
18 and more diverse. So, we did an extra push this year
19 and we're going to do a press conference next week.
20 I'm probably short circuiting DCPI here but we are
21 going to have really, really good news to report on
22 our recent police test recruitment drive.
23 Outstanding, so I am so proud of some of the members
24 that you mentioned but really, all the members of the
25 department that are working with this philosophy and
it's not one or the other. It's not be tough on

3 crime or be good to the community. It has to be
4 both. So, everything we do is committed to that.
5 Jeff Maddrey, you want to say anything?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Say something nice. I
7 made a mistake, say something nice.

8 JEFFREY MADDREY: Uh, good morning everyone and
9 Commissioner, to the Chairs, to the Council and to my
10 high school classmate.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

12 JEFFREY MADDREY: Councilman Cornegy but he was a
13 head of me in high school. Thank you, thank you sir.

14 So, you know the police commissioner really
15 detailed a lot of things that we are doing to help
16 build trust in the community and for me, building
17 trust starts with building relationships. Making
18 sure we take every opportunity to sit and speak with
19 our communities and that's some of the toughest
20 things but some of the most rewarding things I think
21 we have been doing over the last year when we have
22 been going into communities and sitting with young
23 people. Adults, talking to young students over Zoom
24 about some of the things that transpired last year
25 with law enforcement and the protests and many other
things. And I think that was a tremendous part of

1 building relationships which are going to be the
2 foundation of building trust.
3

4 We are rolling out so many different programs
5 that are going to be fun but at the same time, they
6 are going to really stimulate young people, to help
7 out adults as well. One of the things that we are
8 doing here in community affairs is something you know
9 you may laugh at it but it is going to be amazing
10 when we roll it out is the box cart derby that we are
11 doing with young people. And if you see the work,
12 when you talk about stem principals, science,
13 technology, engineering, math, these young people are
14 building box cars that they are going to race at a
15 certain point during the summer. And it is really
16 incredible to see how these young intelligent
17 children are building these cars from the ground up.

18 And you are talking about building trust and
19 building relationships. The parents are coming out
20 there. It's going to be a big event this summer when
21 we roll it out and when we roll it out, I believe so
22 many people are going to want to get involved because
23 it teaches these principals and it help builds
24 relationships and again, just going through the
25 summer with all the things that we are going to be

1
2 doing. The Options program, that's going to help
3 work with young people and their emotional
4 intelligence. Financial literacy and other academic
5 areas.

6 You know Council Member Cornegy, we partner with
7 AAU. We are running a 500 team basketball tournament
8 that's going to attract teams from the tristate.
9 There is just so many things that we are going to be
10 doing. The YPA, the Youth Police Academy that's
11 going to take young people and really help out
12 parents when we give young people things to do and a
13 lot of parents to go to work to do other things and
14 besides just going into communities. Going into
15 communities that are plagued by violence. Going up
16 to their streets, shutting down streets, working with
17 the community, going into parks creating safe spaces.

18 These are all the things that we will be doing.
19 The precincts, community affairs and I think it is
20 going to go a long way to build the relationships and
21 build the trust throughout this summer.

22 DERMOT SHEA: Hey Jeff, if I could just say one
23 last thing. Council Member, I forgot to mention, I
24 know I will be quick. This week we were in a park in
25 Staten Island working with the community. Just

1 cleaning up and beautifying a park, which I thought
2 was great and I know a lot of people do things like
3 this, which is all positive. The graffiti initiative
4 that we did last month and we still do it. Jeff
5 Maddrey is instrumental in that. It wasn't just
6 about cleaning graffiti; it was about working with
7 people. And this is a budget hearing, so what did it
8 cost us? It didn't cost us a penny. We got paint
9 and supplies donated from businesses. We got
10 community groups and kids to come out and we even had
11 cops coming in on their own time from home with their
12 families, with the community members, painting over
13 graffiti.

14
15 So, it's just another great example and Jeff
16 Maddrey mentioned the box car. I got the scar here.
17 The last time I did a box car, I wound up getting
18 stitches at the hospital, so I am out of that
19 business.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.
21 We're going to move on to our next Council Member.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. We will now hear
23 from Council Member Menchaca followed by Council
24 Member Rosenthal.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. Thank you
3 Chairs for the incredible leadership today in the
4 budget hearing. I want to start with the – this is a
5 quick dollar amount of money that was associated with
6 the press credential department. How much is it in
7 saving for the NYPD?

8 DERMOT SHEA: John Miller, you want to –

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, while they are
10 getting that, let's move over to the federal monies.
11 The federal money, you just referred to them
12 Commissioner and the budget and that the Council
13 proves annually doesn't account for those federal
14 grants that come in that you mentioned. Which gets
15 the NYPD at an added amount. How much does NYPD
16 expect to receive in federal funds for this next
17 fiscal year?

18 DERMOT SHEA: Kristine, yeah.

19 KRISTINE RYAN: So, on average we receive about
20 \$200 million in federal funding per year. We
21 anticipate in the coming fiscal year it may be a
22 little bit lower because in the recent past, we have
23 received money for the protection of the presidents
24 residents. Obviously with the change of the
25 administration, we won't receive some of that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 110
3 funding, so it might be closer to a little below \$200
4 million but \$200 million.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: When does that get
6 finalized? Is that something that happens for the
7 budget, so you will understand it so we can fit it
8 in?

9 KRISTINE RYAN: The grants and the federal grant
10 cycle, depending on the grant, the timing varies,
11 which is actually why you see the budget adjusted
12 throughout the fiscal year. So, unfortunately, we
13 don't have the exact amount of the awards across the
14 entire funding categories at the time of the adopted
15 budget but with each budget update and with each
16 modification, you can see the grant funds go up.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And can you give us a
18 sense of and this is for later for follow up. Which
19 funding streams are you expecting? I know you talked
20 about some changes. Is that something that you can
21 give us a line item with amount?

22 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, we can give you the history
23 of what we have gotten and it remains relatively
24 constant year over year, so we can provide you with
25 that detail.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Beautiful, thank you so
4 much.

5 DERMOT SHEA: That first question we had; John
6 has the answer for you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay.

8 JOHN MILLER: Alright, that, for the issuing of
9 the press cards, that involves three or four staff
10 people. There are thousands of these credentials
11 issued. There is a little background that goes into
12 that to make sure that these are legitimate numbers
13 of the media.

14 Some equipment, laminating machines and -

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, what's that
16 total?

17 JOHN MILLER: Uh, it's probably about \$465
18 million, maybe slightly more.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, \$465 million.

20 JOHN MILLER: I am sorry, I am sorry, not
21 million, \$465,000. You know when I hear Kristine
22 talk, it's all millions but the press card is
23 actually just hardware, supplies and personnel.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And that's what we are
25 talking about here. Okay, next question. \$11
million of federal funding was allocated to support

1
2 NYPD's budget for COVID related costs. It is our
3 understanding that NYPD plans to spend this funding
4 on personnel for overtime. I know there was a
5 conversation earlier today by the Chair at
6 vaccination sites. So, why is overtime necessary for
7 NYPD personnel at vaccination sites?

8 DERMOT SHEA: Kristine, do you have that. I
9 mean, I don't know if that pertains to when we were
10 vaccinated in the public or not.

11 KRISTINE RYAN: Part of it is for personnel
12 assisting at the vaccination sites with the public
13 and there are some of our staff also working, some on
14 overtime to vaccinate our own staff.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I am trying to
16 understand why under overtime are we utilizing that
17 system of overtime for officers in vaccination sites?
18 That's what I am trying to understand here.

19 KRISTINE RYAN: In -

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I guess, if vaccination
21 is a priority with NYPD, why is this an overtime
22 expense versus an expense that is not overtime, which
23 is different and is causing a lot of issues in
24 today's conversation.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

113

3 KRISTINE RYAN: So, let me get the details just
4 on specifically which element of the uniform – sorry,
5 of the overtime budget that \$11 million is going to.
6 Just give me a minute on that and I will come back to
7 you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, next question.
9 The '22 budget proposes adding 216 new civilian
10 positions for the NYPD to increase community
11 engagement, which is about \$15 million. Does the
12 community engagement division collaborate with
13 community based organizations? How are they working
14 together? Can you give us a sense about why it is
15 necessary for 200 civilian positions that to be
16 increased at the NYPD when we really need to be
17 moving dollars to the infrastructure that's on the
18 ground, nonprofits –

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Work that need that
21 kind of money in this budget.

22 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, Councilman, I will start that
23 as Kristine is getting the last answer and Danielle –
24 Councilman, from what I understand of that question,
25 I could be wrong but Danielle will correct me if I am
wrong. I think that's the same question that was

3 answered before and it comes directly out of the
4 reform movement where the intent was to hire
5 positions within the NYPD directly to increase and
6 improve collaboration with those community groups.
7 So, that would be why there was a police angle
8 because that's the whole intent of the mission.
9 Danielle, do I have that right?

10 DANIELLE GRILLO PEMBERTON: That's correct sir.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, I don't know if
12 there was more on the overtime, the vaccination
13 sites?

14 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, so, essentially, it's a mix
15 of funding for nonpersonal costs and also overtime
16 for school safety agents for the public vaccination
17 sites. And some uniformed overtime for our medical
18 division. Just because of the nature of having to do
19 this obviously, this was in addition to other
20 people's functions and duties and while it was a key
21 priority, we needed to have the flexibility to
22 utilize overtime to make sure we could appropriately
23 staff to get the vaccine out to our employees and to
24 the public.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

115

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, again, it doesn't
4 answer the question about why overtime is paying for
5 this but I do see a hand from -

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chief of Personnel Martin
7 Morales.

8 MARTIN MORALES: Good afternoon Council Member.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Good afternoon.

10 MARTIN MORALES: So, the vaccination falls under
11 me. I am the Chief of Personnel on the medical
12 division. The reason we use officers on overtime is
13 our doctors and nurses were the main vaccinators. We
14 also identified police officers and paramedics. In
15 order to vaccinate officers on all three platoons,
16 because they work midnights 4-12 and the day tours.
17 We had them working 12 hours towards the beginning.

18 In addition, we did overtime when we went to the
19 NYCHA locations in Harlem as well as Staten Island
20 where we were able to vaccinate over 1,300 elderly
21 residents of NYCHA. We also were given the ability
22 to vaccinate retirees and elderly family members and
23 I would like to say, you know since January 6th,
24 medical division administered nearly 85,000 first and
25 second doses and that includes 15,000 alone at 127
Penn which is a public site that we have been doing

3 the Johnson & Johnson vaccination for about six,
4 seven weeks now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. Thank you
6 Chairs.

7 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Can I just jump in here Chair
8 Dromm is you don't mind. Do you we know how many
9 NYPD personnel who have been vaccinated?

10 Yeah, so as I said, we started vaccinating NYPD
11 personnel since January 6th. As of this morning, we
12 have a total of 19,391 that we vaccinated. In
13 addition to that, 861 were vaccinated outside of the
14 department for a total of 20,242, which is 38 percent
15 of our department has been fully vaccinated.

16 If we are looking at just one vaccination, the
17 number is 21,620 about 41 percent of the department.

18 DERMOT SHEA: Council, can I just add that it
19 could be higher, although I don't really have any
20 data or think it is. It could be, it probably is a
21 little higher but for HIPAA reasons and things,
22 that's just what we administer. If they are getting
23 it from outside the department, there is no
24 obligation, we can't force them to tell us that.

25 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Are there any incentives in
vaccination for NYPD personnel?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

117

3 MARTIN MORALES: So, everyone, as all city
4 workers, they receive the three hours of Comp time.
5 You know, if they were going on department time to
6 get vaccinated, so that was an incentive. No one had
7 to go to get vaccinated on their own time.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How many are taking advantage
9 of Comp time?

10 MARTIN MORALES: Everyone who is fully vaccinated
11 got the Comp time.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, what are you saying,
13 21,000?

14 MARTIN MORALES: About 19,000.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 19,000. Those numbers seem
16 low.

17 MARTIN MORALES: Well, Council Member if you look
18 at you know, the military, nearly 40 percent of the
19 navy is fully vaccinated. We are at 39 percent. The
20 Marines, it's actually 27 percent. Airforce base
21 force, they are about 36 percent. So, I think you
22 know we did a little better than the military. You
23 look at other police departments throughout the
24 country, some did a little better than us.

25 I think we are sitting right a little above
average from other police departments. Yes, we want

1
2 to see more people vaccinated but I think we are in a
3 good place right now, but we could be better.

4 DERMOT SHEA: I'll second that. I would love to
5 be higher. I would love to be 100 percent. We have
6 done a lot of outreach. We have had doctors, retired
7 doctors, active doctors come and do videos. We have
8 shot the videos to all our employees. We have not
9 mandated it. I don't think too many people have. I
10 agree with you both Councilwoman and Councilman. I
11 would love to be at 100 percent. I don't know where
12 the general public, you know if you told me teachers
13 or fireman or major league baseball players or anyone
14 else, you know where they fall but I would love to be
15 setting the bar high.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: If they are not required to
17 be vaccinated, are they required to wear masks in
18 public?

19 DERMOT SHEA: Yes. They are subject to the same
20 requirements. Obviously, those requirements now are
21 lessening and we follow the CDC guidelines.

22 MARTIN MORALES: I would also like to add you
23 know in addition to the vaccinations, since last
24 March, we have over 11,000 members of the department
25 who were diagnosed with COVID positive that we know

3 of. You know, of that 55 have passed away. Of the
4 11,369 that were COVID positive, over 3,400 received
5 the vaccination. Nearly 8,000 have not. So, when
6 you add the 8,000 that were COVID positive and not
7 vaccinated to the vaccinators, you know combined we
8 are at 54 percent.

9 You know, some data will say, suggest that you
10 know, having had COVID in the past gives you some
11 immunity but not full immunity but I think that's
12 part of it. So, and that should be part of the
13 discussion.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But they still need the shot
15 regardless.

16 DERMOT SHEA: And we have done a video Councilman
17 Dromm, saying exactly what you just said. You know,
18 that's our message to our people and really for the
19 whole public too. That's why we thought it was so
20 important to go out to different parts of the
21 community and we were administering it to ourselves
22 and to the community.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chair Adams, can we move on?

24 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. Let's go to
our next Council Member.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Rosenthal
3 followed by Council Member Brannan.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, thank you so
5 much. Thank you Chairs for the opportunity of this
6 hearing.

7 Two very fast questions about the overtime
8 budget. When you look at the overtime budget, is it
9 just like the total number of hours in overtime and
10 you track whether or not the total numbers go up or
11 down or do you have categories in there of you know
12 groupings? And are those groupings by like uhm, you
13 know, the amount of overtime for parades? The amount
14 of overtime for peaceful protests? The amount of
15 overtime to protect monuments?

16 DERMOT SHEA: We, we track our overtime in many
17 different categories. Not specifically exactly as
18 you detailed them but pretty detailed.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Can you name two?

20 DERMOT SHEA: Arrest, court, investigative
21 details, there is many.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, can you send
23 that over to us for uhm, 20- I guess '18, '19, '20
24 and '21 and unexpected for '22, since you track it so
25 carefully?

2 DERMOT SHEA: We would love to work
3 collaboratively with you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No, that's just a yes
5 or no. If you have it, that's fine. If you don't
6 have -

7 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah -

8 KRISTINE RYAN: That's information that we
9 provide on a quarterly basis to the Council. So, we
10 can make sure that you get a copy of that
11 information.

12 DERMOT SHEA: Do we do so every year?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I can get it from
14 staff, that's fine. And do you ever do the analysis
15 by number of years prior to retirement?

16 DERMOT SHEA: Yes, absolutely we do. I think we
17 do a good job.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Why? Why do you look
19 at it that way? By number of years prior to
20 retirement for overtime?

21 DERMOT SHEA: We look at it any number of ways
22 Councilwoman.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, can you send it
24 over uhm, in the particular one. Analysis by number
25 of years prior to retirement?

2 DERMOT SHEA: Do we normally? Do we have that?
3 I don't even know.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You were so
5 enthusiastic saying yes of course. So, but Kristine,
6 what were you going to say? No, -

7 KRISTINE RYAN: Generally from the fiscal side,
8 we are looking at the hours, we are looking at the
9 categories. I think we did provide -

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But someone is looking
11 at it by number of years prior to retirement. I want
12 to move on, so just yes or no and it sounds like you
13 are enthusiastically yes. Can you just send it over
14 anyone?

15 KRISTINE RYAN: We will work together. I believe
16 we sent some information in the categorization for
17 investigative and operational overtime by ranking
18 years of service.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, great.

20 KRISTINE RYAN: But and we will share that with
21 you and make sure you get a copy of that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much.
23 Appreciate that. I really want to focus on the
24 Special Victims division. Uhm, do you do FETI

3 training anymore? At a previous hearing, you said
4 no.

5 DERMOT SHEA: Jimmy, all yours.

6 JAMES ESSIG: As of right now, we are not doing
7 FETI training. We are working on a contract with the
8 trauma informed sexual assault investigative course
9 to replace the FETI.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Good. So, no one got
11 it in 2019 or 2020?

12 JAMES ESSIG: 2020, no not last year, not in
13 2020. What we have done and we -

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, so according to
15 your report on training, it shows that seven people
16 got the FETI training. So, I'm just trying to
17 understand between the truth and what's in your
18 public reports.

19 Similarly, in your public reports, you show that
20 in 20- I think it's 19, 76 detectives were trained
21 all together and I am wondering how that lines up
22 with your staffing, which shows over 200 detectives.
23 So, does everyone get training, any type of training
24 or not?

25 JOHN ESSIG: Yes. Just last month-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

124

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: According to the
4 report, the answer is no but it's zero but go ahead,
5 you tell me the truth.

6 JOHN ESSIG: Last month, we were able with COVID
7 now, COVID restrictions, we were able to start the
8 Special Victims Investigations course which is a five
9 day training course at the academy and 30 police
10 officers are assigned to the Special Victims had that
11 training.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, given that 80
13 percent of your training is done by power point, why
14 would you stop doing the training when that power
15 point can be done remotely? And I guess, the real
16 question is because the answer is obviously it can
17 continue. But the real question I have is, why are
18 only a 30-year detectives getting any training at
19 all?

20 JOHN ESSIG: Yeah, that doesn't account for the
21 people who are already in special victims.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: They are supposed to
23 get training every year. So, you are saying that
24 it's one and done? People who get trained, it's just
25 one year and that's it? And so, for the questioning
and the FETI together, it's 80 percent. Five days of

1 80 percent power point and that's called training and
2 they get that once and the are done?
3

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Again, I am just
6 looking at your report.

7 JOHN ESSIG: I am saying, the people who are
8 already in special victims, which are 200 FETI people
9 were trained already in the FETI.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I don't think so. Not
11 according to your reports. If you want to send over
12 some sort of documentation of that, great.

13 JOHN ESSIG: This is prior to the FETI contract
14 being canceled. They were trained in FETI. We
15 didn't have a contract last year.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right, so none of that
17 shows in your reports. So, if you can try to make
18 your reports show something that - if you are trying
19 to tell me now that people don't get trained every
20 year. They only get trained once and so we should
21 only expect to see some smaller portion getting
22 trained. It's really helpful to know. I think you
23 should be public about that. And by the way, I think
24 it's wrong. None of the other best practice models
25 throughout the country treat training as one and

3 done. Training is done every year, as is the case
4 with many professions. So, according to and in fact,
5 in 2020, according to your report, eight detectives
6 got training all together. Eight.

7 DERMOT SHEA: Is that in new training
8 Councilwoman?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I am just looking at
10 your training report.

11 DERMOT SHEA: Okay, that's good.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Which shows eight
13 people got trained.

14 DERMOT SHEA: That sounds like what it is to me.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Huh, okay. According
16 to your SVD staffing and this is since the DOI report
17 came out and of course, I am saying huh but what I
18 really mean is wow, that's really distressing and I
19 think we are going to have to look into that a little
20 bit more.

21 So, according to your staffing report, we are
22 looking at grade one detectives and at the end of our
23 hearing in 2018, you said that you would endeavor to
24 have more grade one detectives. So, according to
25 your reports, in 2018, there were 12 grade one

1
2 detectives. In 2019, there were eight and in 2020
3 there are four.

4 So, what are you doing to try to get more grade
5 one detectives?

6 JOHN ESSIG: Well, first grade detectives is a
7 long process to get to. First, in order to be a
8 detective -

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No, no, I understand
10 the process. You don't have to tell me the process
11 again. I am asking you - I am asking you what you
12 are doing to reverse the downward trend because in
13 2018 at a hearing, you promised the number would go
14 up from 12. So, now it's -

15 JOHN ESSIG: I don't think it's downward -
16 Councilwoman, I don't think it's a downward trend. I
17 think our Special Victim detectives are highly
18 motivated. They are qualified.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, I gotcha.

20 JOHN ESSIG: They are dedicated.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I hope to see a few
22 more grade one's -

23 JOHN ESSIG: They do the job because they love
24 it. I believe since last April in the Special
25 Victims division, the Commissioner, Chief Harrison,

1
2 myself take promotions very seriously in the Special
3 Victims Division.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Not reflective in the
5 number of grade one detectives at the Special Victims
6 division.

7 JOHN ESSIG: If you let me finish. They have had
8 nine promotions.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I want you to really -

10 JOHN ESSIG: Nine promotions in April within the
11 Special Victims division, which is -

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: How many promotions
13 were there in other divisions? You can't just say a
14 number without proportionality to other divisions.
15 But I am not going down this rabbit hole with you.
16 The point stands. The number of grade one detectives
17 has gone down by four every year since 2018. The
18 numbers are the numbers.

19 Let me ask you, the law that created the SVD
20 training report required an analysis of best
21 practices for training the SVD detectives. Did you
22 ever do an analysis of best practices? And the
23 second part of that is, did you ever do an analysis
24 of why you have the number of staff that you have in
25 each division of Special Victims division?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 129

JOHN ESSIG: Yeah, Councilwoman -

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Can't quite hear you.

JOHN ESSIG: I have been there five weeks in the detective bureau. We do look at how we assign our people. If you look back, we look at caseloads for the Special Victims Detectives. Last year, it was about 47 per investigator. Taken that, being an unusual year, you look back at 2019, it was at 51 per investigator. This year, we are looking at the caseload per investigator. It's at 52. We look at that on an almost weekly to monthly basis.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I know what the number is. I am not asking you what the number is. I am asking you, why is the number what the number is, right? So, again, if we go back to the 2018 hearing, we learned that best practices would be for the caseload of a detective to be around 14 cases.

So, now you are saying that you just sort of divide the number of detectives you have into the number of cases and that gives you 47 or 50. What I am asking is what is the methodology you use to determine what the right number of hours should be allocated per case, per detective?

3 And obviously it's separated out by the different
4 divisions. Child, cold case, you know the number for
5 each division. Obviously, the number isn't you know
6 just the average.

7 DERMOT SHEA: No, I'll jump in and maybe - there
8 is a number inaccuracies that I have heard here.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Name one?

10 DERMOT SHEA: You are not taking into account
11 retirements for one thing.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm just looking - if
13 there any inaccuracies - Commissioner, if there are
14 any inaccuracies, they are reflected in your report.
15 I am simply describing to you what's in your report.
16 So, if there are accuracies, let's be clear about who
17 is being inaccurate. What I am asking is very simple
18 sir. Do you have a methodology for determining how
19 many hours per case, per detective or do you back
20 into it by the number of people you have divided by
21 into the caseload? Simple question. Methodology or
22 no.

23 The law required you have a methodology. There
24 is not one on your website. I am asking you for it.
25 That's all sir.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

131

3 DERMOT SHEA: What I was referring to when I
4 mentioned inaccuracies as well, the 14 case best
5 practice -

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's an inaccuracy?
7 That's an inaccuracy sir? That has been determined
8 best practices by federal courts across the country.
9 So, you didn't mean to say inaccuracy. What you
10 meant to say sir, was that NYPD is different than
11 other departments because that's what you said in
12 2018. And in 2018, what you assured me was that you
13 would come up with your own methodology that showed
14 the right number of hours for best practices for the
15 New York Police Department. I am asking you what
16 that analysis is.

17 OLEG CHERNYARSKY: Council Member, if I may, that
18 analysis and the factors that we look at in order to
19 do staffing pursuant to the law that you passed is on
20 our website.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No, I am looking at it
22 right now.

23 OLEG CHERNYARSKY: Well, so am I. It's called,
24 it's titled factors that the department -
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 132

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I am actually looking
3 at it right now and what it says is that the factors
4 will show the number of cases -

5 OLEG CHERNYARSKY: The number of SVD cases, the
6 number of cases that are felonies versus
7 misdemeanors.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But the right number
9 of hours should be for each of those cases.

10 OLEG CHERNYARSKY: [INAUDIBLE 2:33:38]. Council
11 member, I am reading what the factors are.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Excuse me sir. Excuse me
13 sir. Please respect the Council Member and answer
14 the Council Member.

15 OLEG CHERNYARSKY: Respectfully Chair, I think
16 the Council Member needs to respect the Executive
17 Staff here. Routinely interrupting the Chief of
18 Detectives -

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Because you are not
20 answering the questions.

21 OLEG CHERNYARSKY: I think we are answering the
22 question.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You are out of order. I am
24 going to have to have your mic - I am asking your mic
25 to be cut sir.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

133

OLEG CHERNYARSKY: The reports are being -

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, would you
please take control of your staff member.

DERMOT SHEA: Oleg, let it go. We know, yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, I am sorry, what
is it that you know sir? And go ahead, try to answer
the question but I would ask that you answer the
question and not filibuster. I am asking a very
simple question.

DERMOT SHEA: What I know is -

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Make sure that you -

DERMOT SHEA: Councilwoman.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, you want to
interrupt me now. Okay, go ahead. Yes sir.

DERMOT SHEA: Well, you were asking your
question. I am trying to answer but I defer to you.
I would much rather hear from you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I am asking you, why
it takes - why it takes the number of hours that you
have allocated for detectives to do their work? Best
practices nationally show it should be 14 cases per
person. What's the number of cases per person in the
NYPD and why?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

134

3 DERMOT SHEA: And you passed a law and I will
4 just direct you to our website, where we post all the
5 information you are asking for.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And I have just read
7 it and had the answer been there respectfully sir, I
8 would not be asking the question. If you want to,
9 although the Chair will not give an opportunity
10 rightly so, I could read the one page report out
11 loud. But let me summarize by saying that it says,
12 however many cases there are, you will divide into
13 the number of cases by the number of detectives.
14 That's math, that's not an analytical approach to why
15 it takes so many more or so many fewer hours.

16 And sir, with all due respect, if the national
17 model is 14 cases per detective as the best practice,
18 why does the NYPD caseload, why is it at 50? 50, sir
19 and why do you think that's good for outcomes of
20 detective case investigations?

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we are going to leave
22 it here and we are going to move on.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Council Member for
25 your questioning and we are going to move to our next
Council Member.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

135

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now have Council
Member Brannan followed by Council Member Brooks-
Powers.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you. Thank you
Chair and thank you Commissioner. I want to give a
shoutout to my home precinct the 68 and Captain
Tolson who is doing a good job. We have crime here
is decreased year to date in every major category and
that's through partnership with the community and
with the cops and everyone is doing everything they
can to look out for each other. So, we certainly
appreciate that out here in the Ozarks in Southern
Brooklyn.

I wanted to get an idea, can you confirm the
budget for the NYPD's, the co-response teams which
partner an officer with a social worker? Can you
confirm the uniform and civilian headcount for those
co-response team?

DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, Kristine and the Terri Tobin
can any specific questions about their functionality.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you.

DERMOT SHEA: Ready Kristine?

3 KRISTINE RYAN: Yep, so in the current year we
4 have 33 uniformed personnel and that actually goes up
5 to – the headcount goes up to 56 in the next fiscal
6 year and beyond.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: And what's the budget
8 for the co-response teams?

9 KRISTINE RYAN: In the current year, it is about
10 3.7 million and it's at 6 million in the baseline.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay, so you mean we
12 spent – how does that work?

13 KRISTINE RYAN: The funding, it's a \$6 million
14 program annually.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay and is there – can
16 you confirm if that is a plan to expand the co-
17 response teams? I know I heard some talk about that.

18 THERESA TOBIN: There currently is not.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: There is not a plan to
20 expand?

21 THERESA TOBIN: Yes, sir.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: And is that for any
23 reason. I mean, not from results or just a change in
24 course or?
25

3 THERESA TOBIN: I think because of just what the
4 budget it and we are allocated the numbers that
5 Commissioner Ryan stated.

6 DERMOT SHEA: I think too if I could and I, you
7 know this is just throwing this out there but it's at
8 a time when we are also discussing and debating
9 across the country and here in New York City. You
10 know, the best use of police responding to people in
11 distress and can it be better served by nonpolice
12 response and we are certainly anticipating a pilot to
13 get kicked off the ground in those regards here as
14 well.

15 So, that's probably— that could be a factor.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay, I appreciate that.
17 That's all I have. I will let my colleagues ask.
18 Thank you Commissioner. Thank you Chair.

19 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you. Thank you for the
20 support.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
22 Member Brooks-Powers followed by Council Member
23 Levin.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Good afternoon. I
had questions centered around the 116th Precinct.

1
2 The 116th Precinct, as I have been very public about
3 has been something that my – community leaders in my
4 district in particular have been advocating for – for
5 about 40 years now. This is an issue where we saw
6 about \$95 million removed from the budget in the last
7 fiscal year and most recently has been reallocated to
8 move forward.

9 I just would like to have some questions answered
10 around the timeline for the construction of the
11 precinct in a real way because I think there is some
12 cautious activism from members of the community not
13 wanting to see this money withdrawn once again. And
14 so, some of the questions that I have is just
15 confirmation that we are moving forward with the same
16 design.

17 The timeline in terms of when the construction
18 will actually begin, as well as how large will the
19 precinct be in terms of how many like resources are
20 being put into it. What does that look like? What
21 is the community spacing going to look like and how
22 it's accessed by the community as well. So, I just
23 want to start with those few questions first and
24 pause and get those responses.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

139

3 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, Councilwoman, I will start
4 it. I have heard the same from members of the
5 community in Southeast Queens, that they are very
6 happy but they don't quite want to claim victory
7 until there is a shovel in the ground. We are
8 ecstatic that the funding has been restored for that
9 because we think as the community does, there is a
10 great need there for that current 105th Precinct,
11 which is a very large geography. Kristine can give
12 you an update, fingers crossed on what this timeline
13 looks like.

14 KRISTINE RYAN: Good afternoon. So, we
15 anticipate and feel very confident that we will have
16 the shovel in the ground. So, construction literally
17 starting before the end of the calendar year and we
18 are actually working to even accelerate that and we
19 anticipate it will take approximately two and a half
20 years to complete the construction. This will
21 include a community space and it is the design that
22 was previously agreed upon and that's part of why we
23 are able to move quickly now. That the funding has
24 been restored because the design is done and we are
25 moving forward with that design. And the design
includes dedicated separate community space with

3 designated community entrance. So, we are moving as
4 quickly as possible and we will continue to update
5 you and the community on the timeline as things move
6 forward.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you.

8 DERMOT SHEA: Council Member Brooks?

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry, I was
11 trying to come off of mute. I call the security on
12 the mute button. So, going back to the timeline, I
13 just wanted to zero in more because obviously the
14 calendar year going to December is quite far out. We
15 know the Mayor's term is coming to a close soon. Do
16 we know if this is going to happen at the end of the
17 summer, September, October? Like what does that look
18 like in terms of shovel in the ground?

19 KRISTINE RYAN: So, the funding was restored last
20 week, so we have been having multiple meetings since
21 then to revisit the timeline, working with the
22 construction contractors, so we can go ahead and
23 register that contract as quickly as possible, which
24 we are hoping to do within a couple of months.

25 The absolute outside date would be the end of the
calendar year for shovel in the ground but we are

1 really working to move that up and do it more
2 quickly. Within the next few weeks, we will have an
3 even tighter timeline for you but we agree with you,
4 we want to move this forward as quickly as possible
5 and make sure that those resources, which were just
6 restored, end up getting committed and moving forward
7 as soon as possible.
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And so, we know
10 \$92 million in one fiscal year is a significant
11 amount. And so, is there any I guess, areas of like
12 a blind spot that we need to be concerned about in
13 terms of the funding in fiscal year '22 for the
14 construction of this precinct?

15 KRISTINE RYAN: No, I think we feel, so the
16 design has already been done, which enables us to
17 access. We already bid out the contract for the
18 construction. So, this is the construction
19 contractor bid. So, we feel very confident that the
20 resources that are in the budget obviously,
21 unforeseen things can happen with construction but we
22 don't anticipate that. So, we feel confident that
23 the resources that we have will enable us to build
24 the precinct and complete it within two and a half
25 years from the point at which we began construction.

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

5 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
7 Member Levin followed by Council Member Diaz.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Hi, can you hear me okay?

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we hear you Council
11 Member.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, thank you. I
13 apologize for being off video here. I am doing
14 parental duties at the moment. So, Commissioner, I
15 want to thank you very much for being here and for
16 your team.

17 So, my first question is I asked, I asked in the
18 Preliminary Budget hearing back in March for a
19 breakdown of overtime in FY21 by overtime category.
20 So, that would be operational overtime, court
21 overtime, etc., broken down by rank. Did you provide
22 that to the Council?

23 KRISTINE RYAN: Yes, we provided that detail to
24 the Council, Council Finance.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, okay. Okay, so I
will follow up with Council Finance.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

143

3 DERMOT SHEA: Did you not receive it?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I don't know because it
5 went to Council Finance. I will follow up with
6 Council Finance but if that's the case then thank
7 you. If not, I am going to be following up with them
8 no that.

9 My second question, Commissioner this is for you.
10 So, you know being that we are about a year now into
11 - a little over a year I think into this increase in
12 serious violent crimes, so shootings, homicides, uhm,
13 what - I am trying to get at what do you think are
14 the reasons for that based on data and analysis by
15 the police department? What can you share with us?

16 DERMOT SHEA: If you can read my lips, I just
17 said you know like oh Lord or oh God because there is
18 so much at this point and that's the honest truth.
19 There are so many factors. It will not be done in
20 five minutes and it will not do it justice.

21 You know, my public comments are on record. Many
22 do not agree with them and I respect that but I think
23 people know what I have said. I haven't been shy. I
24 believe what I said and it's on record.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay but is that based on
then on data and analysis? I am trying to get at - I

1 mean because as a Council Member, uhm, I think about
2 these things as well and I am trying to get a good
3 sense of why is this happening?
4

5 I read a quote by uhm, by John Jay Professor
6 Chris Herman who used to be a data analyst at the
7 NYPD and Professor Herman, Dr. Herman said, you know
8 that he contributed a lot of it to the effects of
9 COVID. So, issues around social isolation,
10 unemployment, loss of income, things like that and
11 not so much bail reform. Do you have a response to
12 that analysis?

13 DERMOT SHEA: Well, I just told you, I think that
14 at this point there are many, many factors and it's
15 going to be studied. It wouldn't shock me if it will
16 be studied and talked about for decades at this
17 point.

18 You know how far do you want to go into this in
19 your last one minute and 15 seconds? You know, this
20 is what I will say. You know, I have 30 years with
21 this police department now. I have had a number of
22 positions. I ran CompStat. I have a somewhat unique
23 insight into the inner workings in all of the crime
24 data in New York City from complaints to 311, to
25 arrests to what happens to arrests. You name it and

1
2 you cannot expect two different people today and I
3 respect everyone's opinion mentioned the Rikers
4 Island population. Nobody mentioned the prison
5 population today. Down dramatically as well. You
6 cannot upend a fragile system of criminal justice
7 dramatically and not expect a reaction and we have
8 seen a reaction.

9 It is now complicated immensely by a lot of other
10 factors including COVID. Until we wrap our hands
11 around this and start addressing that, we have a long
12 road ahead of us I believe.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Council Member
14 Levin. We will go onto our next Council Member.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I am sorry, I was on mute.
16 Sorry, I just had one more question Chair if that's
17 okay.

18 Commissioner, so I have a number of NYCHA
19 developments in my district. I have seven NYCHA
20 developments and I have had at two of the
21 developments, a number of shootings lately. And when
22 I talk to residents there, what they want is a Map
23 program. So, this is the Mayor's action plan program
24 that that 15 development in the city. Is that
25 something that -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

146

DERMOT SHEA: Funding too right? Jobs and
funding?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I'm sorry?

DERMOT SHEA: And that comes with jobs and
funding.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right, right, so is that,
I mean, when we are looking at our budget priorities,
you know, the map, there are you know obviously,
there are many you know, multiple 15 developments in
the city. There is probably a few dozen developments
in the city and you know or 50 developments, 60
developments. You know they are not at the - the
developments in my district that are seeing an uptick
in shootings, are you, is NYPD, are you working with
the head of MOCJ, the Mayor, First Deputy Mayor on
identifying where programs like Map can be expanded?
Because you know there are 15 of these Map programs
across the city but it doesn't do any good if the two
developments in my district that need them.

DERMOT SHEA: Well, I could tell you that the
answer is yes, ongoing. We discuss crime issues. We
discuss criminal justice issues. We discuss
grassroots organizations. We discuss violence
interrupters. We discuss you know school programs

3 and all the interaction of all of these things. I
4 would refer you to MOCJ regarding specific questions
5 about the Map program because I believe it emanated
6 from there.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, but it's certainly
8 something that I would hope that you and the NYPD
9 seeing the value in what it does, would advocate to
10 the Mayor to expand that to additional developments
11 around the city. Again, 15 developments around the
12 city is like nothing. I mean, that's not going to
13 make a real difference.

14 So, I mean, it's gotta be, if it's going to be
15 impactful, it's got to be expanded significantly.
16 So, I would hope that you would lend your support to
17 an expansion of that program.

18 DERMOT SHEA: I think it's a discussion that has
19 to be held and then it has to be weighed. Dave
20 Barrere, if you want to jump in but it has to be
21 weighed against you know what programs are out there.
22 How do you measure their effectiveness? How much
23 money do they cost? Do you believe the metrics that
24 exist if any or maybe they don't exist and then, you
25 know whether it's us, City Hall, yourself on the
Council and everyone has to make these tough

1 decisions in tough times and that's a good thing.

2 Dave?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Understood Commissioner.

4 I just, what I would say and you know with all due
5 respect, you said in the passive voice. You said,
6 discussions must be had. What I am hoping to hear
7 from you is, I, as Commissioner of the NYPD, will
8 advocate for these types of things.

9 DERMOT SHEA: Exactly what I said.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: You said it in a passive
11 voice. You said, they are going to be discussed. I
12 want to hear from you. Yes, I will advocate for
13 these types of programs to be expanded in the FY22
14 budget is what I am looking for you to say.

15 DERMOT SHEA: Well, you are looking for something
16 that I am not saying, perhaps that's the problem. It
17 will be against the backdrop of everything else that,
18 I have many people coming to me advocating for
19 different programs. I think we need to have them
20 all, lay them on the table and then make intelligent,
21 concrete decisions based on facts. And then there is
22 going to be a lot of different opinions too and I
23 think that's a good thing.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

149

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, thank you very much
4 Commissioner. I appreciate your time.

5 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you sir.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
7 Member Diaz followed by Council Member Riley.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Good afternoon. I
10 especially thank both Chairs for this amazing
11 opportunity. I have been in office since December
12 and not once have I had the opportunity to engage
13 with the Commissioner. Thank you sir for
14 highlighting 127 Penn, one of my baby projects before
15 coming on and to Chief Maddrey for also bringing in
16 the [INAUDIBLE 2:55:48] district. I have spent about
17 \$130,000 toward the removal, so thank you for
18 highlighting my work and my efforts. I would have
19 liked for the time to bid in the district for you to
20 take some time to read with me.

21 I am sure Chief Barrere, Maddrey and Li Petri can
22 vogue for who I am and my deliverables. Again, thank
23 you for not meeting with me for highlighting what I
24 brought to the table. My actual question is
25 reference to selection of the Commanders to the
Precincts. I would like to know what the reality

1 process is and then share with you all what my
2 experience was in choosing the officer for the 83rd
3 Precinct.
4

5 DERMOT SHEA: Okay, the timing is perfect on this
6 one. So, I am going to kick it to Rodney who has
7 just undergone the first two selections. I think
8 with you know Juanita and the team this week. So,
9 Rodney, without further ado.

10 RODNEY HARRISON: Council Member, good afternoon.
11 Thank you for your question. So, on May 10th, we
12 started our Community Commander Selection Committee.
13 We had four commands that we have identified that had
14 vacancies or three of them that had a vacancy. One
15 of them where we were looking to find another
16 commanding officer. Those being the 83, the 115, the
17 73 and the 107 Precinct. Unfortunately, due to the
18 loss of Dennis Milani[SP?].

19 So, the way we created this panel is we
20 identified the community board president, the
21 community counsel president and then we went to the
22 borough president and asked that president, depending
23 on the borough that they have coverage or ownership
24 to, to identify one resident as well as one business
25 owner.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

151

3 Then, what we did was we had those four
4 individuals and I am going to talk about how we are
5 expanding on that in a second. We gave the four
6 panel, the four individuals on the panel the
7 opportunity to take an hour and ask four candidates
8 and those names were supplied by my office, pretty
9 much questions regarding what their thoughts are in
10 regarding a police commander in that area. And we
11 came up with some pretty good selections, some pretty
12 good choices.

13 If I could just say in the 115 Precinct Jamaal
14 Arthur Harry was nominated to become the commanding
15 officer of that precinct. Captain Sanabria was
16 selected for the 83rd Precinct and right now, I
17 believe that Rohan Griffith was selected to take over
18 the 75 Precinct. We will get the results of the 107
19 Precinct probably later on this week.

20 Also, I want to share to you that we are going to
21 expand the panel, not just to those four individuals
22 but we are also going to identify the reset of the
23 Community Council team be it the Vice President, the
24 Treasurer or the Secretary, to also be part of the
25 selection committee going forward.

3 And then even after that, there is going to be a
4 couple phases that we may even extend out further to
5 people that attend or residents that attend the
6 community council meetings on a regular basis, to be
7 part of the selection process also.

8 So, once again, it's still in the infantile
9 stages. We have gone through four precincts right
10 now and we are looking to expand to other precincts
11 going to the near future.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I think you for breaking it
13 down to me. What's my understanding is the selection
14 for the 83, Friday afternoon they were given notice
15 that resumes would be coming. An emergency meeting
16 on Sunday and an hour, two hour meeting on Monday
17 where they had to select.

18 This process to me is too serious. It's too
19 impactful to tell anyone on a Friday afternoon, you
20 got to make time to do this. On a Sunday afternoon
21 we are doing this again and Monday, you need to
22 figure it out to make yourself available otherwise
23 although you have been recommended and selected, you
24 are going to be dismissed.

25 I'm not saying [INAUDIBLE 3:00:04] was a bad
choice but the way this was played out was unfair and

3 unfortunate for the people that volunteer and again,
4 our people are volunteering and I think [INADUDIBLE
5 3:00:14] is understanding and understand that
6 seriously. We run members of the community to stand
7 up but you also have to work with us. We don't get
8 paid for what we do and I say us because I put 33
9 years of volunteering for the system.

10 RODNEY HARRISON: So, Council Member, this is the
11 first time I am hearing about this. I apologize if
12 there was any inconvenience. Once again, we are
13 still in the infantile stages of this whole new
14 process but I will make sure under my leadership, I
15 will make sure we tighten up going into the future.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Can I have just 30 more
18 seconds. You know, I need transparency. I am sure
19 Griffith is going to be amazing but two months ago,
20 that was the name on the street. So, what was the
21 point or the purpose of the people getting together
22 if at the end of the day, that was the determination?
23 That's pretty impressive to me.

24 RODNEY HARRISON: Well, if you don't mind, I
25 could politely disagree with you. Even though his
name was in the mix, doesn't mean that he would have

1 been selected. So, once again, there was an
2 interview process and he was chosen fairly by the
3 people on the panel.
4

5 So, I don't think anybody was persuaded to have
6 to pick Captain Griffith but he ended up being the
7 best candidate for the job.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Okay, I'm just asking for
9 transparency and time for volunteers to accept the
10 process and understand what they are doing. Thank
11 you.

12 RODNEY HARRISON: Understood.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We now have questions from
14 Council Member Riley.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you Chair. Thank
16 you Commissioner. Thank you NYPD for your services.
17 We truly appreciate it. I am going to give a special
18 Shoutout to the 47, the 49 and the 45, which are the
19 precincts that I represent. I guess my concerns
20 really come from, I am a new elected Council Member,
21 so I am going around me and all the NCO's, all the
22 commanding officers and the issue within my community
23 has been illegal trucks being left -

24 DERMOT SHEA: I know it.
25

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: And what we're hearing is
4 there was a cut in the budget. That's why NYPD
5 doesn't have the man power to actually pick these
6 trucks up. So, is there any solution to that going
7 with this years budget?

8 DERMOT SHEA: Well, I don't like the answer, so
9 let me start with that. I mean, we got to find a way
10 to be responsive. So, I know you know earlier today
11 Councilman Daneek Miller and probably Councilwoman
12 Adams as well. That's come up, I believe in both of
13 their districts and we find a way in Queens to
14 address it. We got to find a way in the Bronx to
15 address it as well with the resources we have.

16 So, Rodney, if you could follow up with Juanita
17 on that one and I know you know whether it's East
18 Chester or Boston Road up there, that's a historical
19 problem and it's a big problem for the community.
20 So, we will follow up with you and we will do better
21 to address it.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you Commissioner.
23 My next question is the NCO program. We work very
24 closely with the NCO's within our community but we do
25 realize it's about four sectors within each precinct
and about two in the CEO's per sector. Is there any

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

156

plan on expanding how many NCO's we will put in each sector moving forward?

DERMOT SHEA: Well, we certainly have spoken about it. There is nothing imminent. I would love to have more. We are not close. I am looking at Rodney to my right here and Juanita is not in the room but either of them can chime in. What I would say is before I turn it to them, the concept has always been it's not just about the NCO's. It's got to be all the cops.

So, every sector has two NCO's but they also have a number of police officers that are assigned in the same area every day and we got to kind of make sure that they breath and live and treat their members of the community with the same sense of you know responsiveness in customer service.

So, no imminent plan to add officers. Discussions certainly have taken place but nothing imminent and Juanita, maybe I will go to you first and Rodney, you can clean it up.

JUANITA HOLMES: Right, I just think that - first of all, good afternoon.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Good afternoon.

1
2 JUANITA HOLMES: I just think that you know we
3 pushed a concept of NCO when it really should be
4 NCOT. Right, they are – the sectors are there. They
5 work the same area just like the NCO's. They work
6 different tours.

7 So, naturally, they all have cellphones. They
8 are all supposed to be part of the community, the
9 community solutions. The NCO's are communicating
10 with them. Facilitating relationships,
11 introductions, things of that nature. But naturally,
12 there are issues that occur on different platoons.

13 So, I like to refer to them as the NCO team. As
14 the NCO team and I think when it is looked at by the
15 public that way they realize oh, not only my NCO's
16 but I should have the phone number of the other three
17 teams as well.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: And I just have one more
19 question Commissioner. My last question and another
20 thing that's plaguing our district and the entire New
21 York City is gun violence. What is the plan moving
22 forward? There has been issues within my district,
23 especially with the youth.

24 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

158

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: We do realize that they
4 are engaging in a war, I guess on social media. So,
5 is there kind of a plan to engage community, clergy,
6 police officers, within communities, within the
7 district to kind of combat against the gun violence?

8 Just to answer that myself, we are doing a pilot
9 program in East Chester with the 49th Precinct, where
10 we are going to be engaging police officers, clergy
11 and every stakeholder within the community to do an
12 event within the district and kind of a plan to have
13 conversations about gun violence.

14 So, is there an immediate plan throughout New
15 York City to kind of address this?

16 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah and Jeff Maddrey, you can
17 follow up with some of the efforts with community
18 affairs. I think Councilman that you hit it right on
19 and you heard my remarks to open up how important it
20 is to us. The good news is, we, we, you know,
21 everyone knows what the difficulties are, so let's
22 talk about some of the positives.

23 You know, we have done an incredible amount
24 because it starts and ends with trust and we have
25 done an incredible amount of work investing in that.
Whether it's the work with Chauncey Parker, Juanita

1
2 Holmes, Jeff Maddrey and all of the thousands of cops
3 under them, to really have those relationships and
4 have those meetings.

5 We have worked incredibly with the clergy across
6 New York City knowing that we can't do it all alone
7 to how can they help with this? We have partnered
8 with the local district attorney's offices and done
9 gun buybacks. There is a retweeted one today that
10 the New York State -

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

12 DERMOT SHEA: AG is doing that's coming up soon.
13 So, we are going to continue to do them as well. We
14 are also not relying on gun buybacks. We are doing a
15 lot of proactive police enforcement on people with
16 guns. We have recovered more guns in the last 12
17 month period than at any time probably in 25 years,
18 which is good and bad at the same time.

19 We do have a number of officers getting out of
20 the academy last Thursday and Friday. They are going
21 to be hitting their Precincts this week. That's a
22 shot in the arm which is well received and that's
23 going to go a long way but it's going to be a real
24 time to buckle down and continue to work real hard
25 with the detectives that are under Jimmy Essig. The

1
2 Patrol Officers under Dave Barrere and Juanita Holmes
3 and to keep working with our prosecutors on that
4 small number of people that are just you know for
5 whatever reason, unwilling to put guns down and you
6 know risking everyone's public safety.

7 So, it's a lot of different things that are going
8 on. I have well you know, spoken about it at this
9 point and chronicled. I do think that we need some
10 help on some laws and some you know, of that side of
11 the equation. Not to lock people up and throw away
12 the key but we can't have over and over again either
13 because that's some of what fuels this I believe and
14 that people see people caught with guns all the time
15 and they are on the street. And then it becomes a
16 cycle you said, social media beefs, drug turf beefs,
17 other things where they say well, I know they got a
18 gun, I need a gun too and that never ends well.

19 So, all of this we are working on and we're
20 looking to continue to partner with everyone to make
21 New York City safe.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you.

23 DERMOT SHEA: Dave, Jeff Maddrey, anything
24 specific you want to mention?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

161

3 JEFF MADDREY: Just in regards to what the
4 Council Member said. We have already been on the
5 phone with Pastor Jay [INAUDIBLE 3:09:19]. We are
6 fully plugged in. We are bringing resources to that
7 event, which is really based on reducing gun violence
8 and bringing communities together. We are 100
9 percent plugged in with that. We have so many other
10 of these type of events already waiting to go. So,
11 it will be an interesting summer, a very busy summer.

12 DERMOT SHEA: And Councilman, the key here is and
13 I believe this. Like, no kids want to join a gang.
14 So, we got to give them other options and whether
15 that's through the police department, explorers,
16 cadets, just running sports leagues or maybe it's us
17 working with you and other partners you know and
18 helping you in any way that we can. But Chauncey
19 Parker activating spaces and opening up basketball
20 courts. All of this. We got to give them options.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: No, I totally agree with
22 you Commissioner. I am just going to end with this.
23 No kid does want to join a gang but sometimes you are
24 pushed to it.

25 DERMOT SHEA: That's right.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

162

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: I, myself, when I was
4 younger, I went to join a gang at one point because I
5 was getting pushed toward that direction but there
6 was always resources in my community. That's why it
7 is important that we continue to invest in the
8 community.

9 So, I think you Chief Maddrey and I thank you
10 Commissioner and thank you Chairs for your diligent
11 work and I am going to yield my time.

12 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. We are
14 now going to hear from Council Member Ampry-Samuel.
15 That will be our last question and then we will close
16 out after that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Good afternoon
18 everyone. So much has already been said and so, I
19 just have one quick question and I am sure Chief
20 Holmes would be able to answer this one because we
21 have had a lot of discussions about it already.

22 The Brownsville Safety Alliance has been a very
23 important tool when we look at police reform and just
24 public safety in communities that have a high level
25 of crime. And I want to say that the Brownsville
Safety Alliance, the corridor itself was very

1 positive and it was a success and that is NYPD
2 working with community based organizations, cure
3 violence groups as well as city agencies. All of the
4 city agencies were out there.
5

6 I am asking this question during a budget hearing
7 because all of the groups in the city agencies look
8 to see how much it will cost them to be able to be of
9 service along that corridor for the week.

10 And so, because we did come up with a budget,
11 again, NYPD, officers looking at crime and the
12 reporting time with patrol and I know Chief Holmes,
13 you mentioned that this was a great initiative and
14 that it should be scaled up and possibly expanded
15 across the city's, across the boroughs.

16 And so, I am asking you, you know can you just
17 kind of chime in about this new safety alliance
18 initiative from your perspective and because we are
19 in a budget hearing, can you talk to, you know, have
20 you looked at what this looks like? Does it decrease
21 crime and maybe there are some cost savings or you
22 know, like how we may be able to allocate funding to
23 the DA's office or you know other city agencies like
24 HRA and ACS who are also along the corridor during
25 this time.

1 That's my only question and thank you so much.

2
3 JUANITA HOLMES: Thank you. Thank you for the
4 question. So, yeah, so this has been expanded. It's
5 currently in 52 precincts. It's called Many
6 Solutions. I believe that's what Council Member
7 Riley was referring to when he spoke about the 49
8 precinct.

9 A lot of initiatives going on but I think what's
10 more important is that continued conversation,
11 working together, relationships focused on I believe
12 right now we are focused on probably 102 locations
13 that were developed and designed with the community
14 at the table, the district attorney, elected
15 officials in those particular precincts. And with
16 that moving forward, hopefully they is success there
17 and then it can move on.

18 The only thing I can't answer to is the budget
19 aspect of it because it is not something that I took
20 into consideration. However, I do know it takes
21 time. It takes time to shutdown and city street and
22 declare it a play street during the hours that
23 normally shootings are going on. It takes time and
24 Chief Barrere was shot in 101 Precinct over in the 40
25 projects where Inspector Eric Robinson is working

1
2 diligently with community based organizations and
3 district attorney's office to reduce crime there. It
4 takes a lot of resources and a lot of time. So, it's
5 something moving forward now. I will take a hard
6 look at as far as what does it take as far as a
7 budget is concerned to actually keep that up and
8 running. Because that's the most important thing.
9 It's not one and done. It's not play a basketball
10 game and it's over and another one in six weeks.
11 It's constant communication, sitting at the table,
12 devising a plan, developing who is going to be tasked
13 with initiating that plan and following through on a
14 regular basis. And that's where you will get
15 success.

16 So, I hope I answered some of your question minus
17 the budget aspect but I will look into that report.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.
19 Anything further Council Member?

20 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Oh, sorry, Council Member
21 Ampry-Samuel, was that your only question?

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, she may not be able to
23 respond but Council Member or Chair Adams, did you
24 want to close out?

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

166

3 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Just one final question for
4 me Chair Dromm. And I think I would be remiss if I
5 didn't approach this question. Commissioner,
6 [INAUDIBLE 3:14:52] a rise in anti-Asian hate crime
7 that we have seen in the city since the pandemic
8 started. I think it's actually gotten worse. We are
9 actually taking our vote tomorrow on our Stated
10 Meeting but I wanted to ask you where we are in terms
11 of numbers? How we are working with the AAPI
12 community and what we are doing overall to combat
13 this trend?

14 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you Councilwoman Adams and
15 Chief Essig can give you the numbers. That falls
16 under him in terms of where we are specifically. I
17 think that the opportunity here is that we are all
18 New Yorkers and all coming together and supporting
19 whatever group is falling victim to this hate and
20 that's the one good thing that you see here but
21 clearly, an attack on a member of the Asian community
22 here. We still are seeing it with too much frequency
23 and it's troubling.

24 Jimmy, can you go into what the numbers are and
25 what we are doing about it?

3 JAMES ESSIG: Yeah sure. Overall, as of May 9th,
4 185 hate crimes this year versus 108. Of particular
5 is the Asian hate crimes, 81 versus 17. So, the top
6 commands for that is Manhattan South, the 5th, 7th,
7 9th, the 109 precinct.

8 In those 81 incidents, we have made 23 arrests
9 totaling 41 incidents. Of note, in those 23
10 incidents of the 23 arrested persons, 11 of them have
11 very substantial emotionally disturbed history in
12 their backgrounds. So, what are we doing about it?
13 Well, we have upstaffed our hate crime staffing. We
14 are now at 26 members of the service just assigned
15 specifically to the Hate Crimes Unit. We have an
16 anti-Asian Hate Crime taskforce with 33 additional
17 members throughout the city. They assist with
18 community outreach and in the investigation of all
19 hate crimes. They speak multiple dialects of
20 Chinese, Mandarin, Cantonese, there are some Korean
21 members of the service. Every member is represented
22 there. They have great community outreach and assist
23 in the investigation.

24 We also have done operations, anti-Asian
25 deterrence taskforce where we put out Asian
undercovers in various neighborhoods and that has

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

resulted in three pickup arrests where our
undercovers were harassed in this.

So, we continue to look at it. We treat it very
seriously. We monitor it and we will see if we can
take things down.

DERMOT SHEA: We also work Chair Adams; we also
work very closely with you know City Hall's Office to
prevent hate crimes as well.

Obviously, there is an education before, let's
try to correct it before it ever becomes a crime.
So, you know there is a lot of outreach. We work
with our fraternal organizations. I am actually
attending a dinner tonight with one of the Asian
Fraternal Organizations in the NYPD, which also serve
as a bridge to some of the communities in New York
City.

So, it's something that we are very concerned
about as you know likewise when we had a similar
discussion about a year ago, a little over a year ago
when we saw a rise in antisemitic crime. It really
affects all New Yorkers and it's really blight on New
York City, so we take it very seriously.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, thank you for your
response. Thank you for your testimony today. It's

1
2 been a very spirited hearing and with that, I turn it
3 back over to Chair Dromm.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and
5 before I close it out, I want to say we were joined
6 by Council Members Van Bramer, Treyger and Barron and
7 this will conclude today's hearing. Thank you to the
8 NYPD for testifying today.

9 Before we close, I would like to remind the
10 Finance Committee members that we will continue our
11 remote Executive Budget hearings again on Friday May
12 14th, beginning at 10:00 a.m. and we hear from the
13 Department of Housing, Preservation and Development.

14 Excuse, me, the Department of Sanitation and the
15 Department of Small Business Services. [COUGHS]
16 Excuse me. As a reminder to the public, the
17 Committee will be holding a remote hearing to public
18 testimony on the Executive Budget on Tuesday May 25th
19 at 10:00 a.m. If you would like to testify at that
20 hearing, please register at

21 www.council.nyc.gov/testify and information about how
22 to access the Zoom meeting will be emailed to you.

23 You may also submit written testimony through
24 that registration website or by emailing
25 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, thank you

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

170

Commissioner and to all the member of the NYPD who
were here today.

DERMOT SHEA: Council, thank you. Thank you to
all the members of the Council.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you sir.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 27, 2021