CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

March 23, 2021 Start: 2:12 p.m. Recess: 3:12 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing, Virtual Room 1

B E F O R E: Ydanis Rodriguez

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ydanis Rodriguez

Fernando Cabrera Chaim Deutsch R. Diaz, Sr. Robert F. Holden

Peter A. Koo Stephen T. Levin

Mark Levine

Carlos Menchacha I. Daneek Miller Antonio Reynoso Deborah L. Rose

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jaibala Patel Chief Financial Officer New York City Transit

David Keller MTA Acting Director of Management and Budget New York City Transit

Steve Berrang

MTA Director of Capital Program Management
New York City Transit

Eric Loegel

Arthur Schwartz

HP Schroer

Kevin Jones

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Recording to the PC 3 has started.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Recording to the cloud is up.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: And Sergeant Bradley, with your opening statement, please.

SERGEANT AT ARMS BRADLEY: OK. Good afternoon, and welcome to today's New York City preliminary budget hearing on Transportation. At this time will all panelists please turn on your cameras. To minimize disruptions please place all electronic devices to vibrate or on silent mode. If you do wish to submit a testimony you may do so at testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that is testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your cooperation. You may begin, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, eh, to all of you sergeants and every men and women behind the, the technology to be sure that all New Yorkers are connected to this and many other budget hearing led by Speaker Corey Johnson and the rest of my colleague. Good afternoon and welcome to the City Council Transportation Committee hearing on the MTA calendar year and [inaudible] budget in the calendar

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that's because I am in front of a great playground here in the great borough of the Bronx. My name is Ydanis Rodriguez and I have the privilege of chairing the committee, this committee. Two weeks ago this committee heard testimony from the Department of Transportation and the Taxi and Limousine Commission. Today we will continue the budget process and we will hear this morning from the MTA. Tragically, nearly 30,000 New Yorkers have died due to the coronavirus. I don't want any single one to die regardless of the social and economic background. But the reality is that most people who died they were black, they were Asian, they're Latino. They were working class. Again, I don't want any single one of the 8.6 million residents and all visitor to die in our city, but most people who die they die because of pre-health condition and because they live in ZIP code that already they've been dealing with a lot of issue that together with the coronavirus took the lives of so many great New Yorkers. One year out it is clear how the pandemic has [inaudible] our society, as we painfully continue to be separated from [inaudible] Economic toll of the virus is unprecedented. ones.

year 2024 capital project. If you hear any sound,

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Local businesses have been forced to shut down, resulting in job losses and high unemployment. [inaudible] of this community corner stores have closed permanently, changing the fabric of the city we love, a city built by New Yorkers that have come to this great city from all over the world. With a campaign to vaccinate New Yorkers on the way, COVID-19 cases have been declining and we can begin looking forward to transitioning back to a more open society. However, as we reopen we must remain vigilant to ensure that long-standing societal inequity do not We must also acknowledge that as we began seeing an increase in the subway ridership across the city we must also begin seeing a return of our subways regularly, regular schedule. That include the restoration of the services for the C and F train as well as a return of our overnight train services. I would like to thank the city essential workers, many of whom are from underserved minority community. Without their hard work our city would not be able to function. Thanks to their dedication and sacrifice, our trains and buses have continued to run. Our cabs are able to drive medical staff to hospital and deliver food, food to the needy. Our society, our

2	grocery store remain in stock and our nurses and our			
3	doctors have been able to save lives. However, far			
4	too many workers has passed away, including more than			
5	140 transit workers. I would like to take a moment			
6	of silence to recognize and honor the sacrifices of			
7	these workers as well as the 30,000 New Yorkers who			
8	have fallen to this virus. The MTA calendar year			
9	2021 adopted operating budget is 17.6 billion and			
10	include more than 1 billion in city subsidy. Over			
11	all the MTA requests, over 16 billion in federal			
12	recovery-related funding, to date it is projected to			
13	receive approximately 15 billion, over three similar			
14	plan for COVID-related aid. This is in addition to			
15	nearly 3 billion borough-funded federal reserve			
16	municipal, municipal [inaudible] facility. The MTA			
17	has been mandated to have a balanced budget and in			
18	the [inaudible] of such it may consider an acting			
19	service reduction permanently [inaudible] freeze and			
20	fare increase beyond the scheduled 4% increase. If			
21	enacted, this proposal, proposed reduction for			
22	calendar year 2020 could impact 9400 MTA workers and			
23	could include service reduction of 40%. This			
24	doomsday scenario is one that we cannot allow and I			
25	will be working with my colleague on the state and			

2 the federal level, Speaker Corey Johnson, and all my colleagues to ensure that the MTA is receiving the 3 4 support that, is receiving the support, the support 5 that we must see more, to see more transparency in the return of our train and buses services from the 6 7 The authority adopted 2024, 2020 24, copy of program total 54 point billion and remainder in 8 change from last year. However, congestion pricing 9 revenue was estimated was to cover 27% of this plan, 10 which was adopted prior to COVID-19 pandemic. Today 11 the infrastructure requested to start congestion 12 pricing it, it is not yet in place and federal 13 14 approval system needed. Moreover, the state has 15 authorized the MTA to diverge congestion pricing 16 revenue to fill budget gap in the MTA expenses It us unclear how this will affect the 17 budget. 18 authority's capital plan, including former NYC 19 Transit Authority president Andy Byford transformation plan. Overall, we look forward to 20 hearing the MTA update the committee on the state and 21 22 the transit system and how we will navigate its 23 ongoing fiscal crisis. We also expect the MTA to 24 discuss its plan to reinstate over nine subway services which has been suspended since May 16, 2020. 25

2	The subway system is the lifeblood of the city and			
3	ensuring overnight services return is essential to			
4	transitional out, transitioning out of the pandemic			
5	and allow for more equitable transit system to all			
6	New Yorkers. Before we hear the MTA, from MTA, I			
7	would now have the committee counsel to recognize th			
8	members in attendance and swear in the representativ			
9	of the MTA. But before passing to the counsel			
10	[inaudible] I would like also to thank Brooklyn			
11	borough president, eh, Public Advocate Jumaane			
12	Williams, eh, Speaker Corey Johnson, all of them			
13	together, Eric Adams, Corey Johnson, Jumaane			
14	Williams, Gale Brewer, eh, Brad Lander, and many			
15	other who went today together with those [inaudible]			
16	members of TWU we were there at the press conference			
17	at noon at West 4 calling for the MTA to restore the			
18	services, especially the C and the F that is so			
19	important for resident that we have in New York City			
20	who rely on them. So with that I go back now to			
21	Elliot.			

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.

Ah, I'm Elliot Lynn, counsel to the Transportation

Committee of the New York City Council. Um, we have been joined by Council Members R. Diaz, Koo, Holden,

2	Menchaca, Cabrera, Rose, Miller, Levine, Reynoso, and
3	Lander. Um, I want to remind everyone that you will
4	be on mute until you are called on to testify, when
5	you will then be unmuted by the host. Please listen
6	for your name to be called, and I will periodically
7	announce who the next panelist will be. During the
8	hearing if council members would like to ask a
9	question please use the Zoom raise hand function and
LO	I will call on you in order. Unless indicated by the
L1	chair, we will be limiting council member questions
L2	to five minutes, including answers. I will now call
L3	on our panelists from the MTA. Ah, chief financial
L 4	officer for New York City Transit, Jaibala Patel, MTA
L5	acting director of management and budget, David
L 6	Keller, and MTA director of capital program
L7	management Steven Berrang. I will now read the
L8	affirmation and then I will call on each of you to
L 9	confirm your response aloud for the record. Please
20	raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the
21	truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
22	before this committee and to respond honestly to
23	council member questions? Jaibala Patel?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: David Keller?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: I do.

24

25

2 ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: I do.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Steven Berrang?

DIRECTOR BERRANG: I do. Complained

5 thank you. You may being your testimony when ready.

6 ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: Um, thank you

7 very much. Hello and thank you for having us today.

8 My name is David Keller. I am the MTA's acting

9 director of management and budget. I'm joined

10 | virtually by Jaibala Patel, chief financial officer

11 | for New York City Transit, and Steve Berrang,

12 director of capital program management. Before I

13 | begin, I would like to thank Chair Rodriguez, um,

14 | Speaker Corey Johnson, and the rest of the council

15 | for the direct aid provided to the MTA in the adopted

16 | budget for 2021 and for its continued contributions

17 \parallel to the 2016 to 19 and 2020 to 24 capital programs.

18 | Your support is very much appreciated as the MTA

19 | looks forward to the 21st century transit system that

20 | New Yorkers need and deserve. Before I go on, I'd

21 | like to thank, um, Chair Rodriguez for the kind words

22 | that he has said for the New Yorkers who have lost

23 \parallel their lives as well as the MTA employees who have

24 lost their lives. We mourn the more than 150

employees at the MTA who have lost their lives, and

25

combined emergency COVID funding has been a critical

25

the city begins to reopen. We recently announced our

25

2 subway ridership hid a pandemic high of 1.9 million 3 trips and our bus ridership is also showing signs of rebounding and we are frequently topping 50% of pre-4 5 pandemic levels. While both are still significantly below our pre-pandemic levels, they are headed in the 6 7 right direction. We look forward to welcoming back more and more customers in the months ahead. 8 please wear a mask and take a ride with us. 9 10 still the quickest and safest way to get around. Meanwhile, beyond just helping us fight to keep the 11 lights on, the latest round of federal aid brings new 12 possibilities for our historic 2020 to 24 capital 13 14 program, which has been on pause because of the 15 pandemic. Important projects like modernized new 16 signals on our subway lines, making more [inaudible] accessible, bringing Long Island Railroad service to 17 18 Grand Central Terminal, expanding Metro North service to Penn Station with four new stations in the Bronx, 19 and extending the Second Avenue subway to East and 20 Central Harlem are again under funding consideration 21 22 and discussion. The MTA goal is to award at least 23 6.2 billion dollars in total work to third-party contractors or in-house team in 2021. Our goal for 24

the first quarter is 865 million dollars and we are

25

2 on track to meet that target. And if the federal government acts to advance to environmental review 3 4 process for our central district [inaudible] program 5 that is even better news for the capital program. We're encouraged that the Biden administration has 6 7 said it would prioritize review of our application which sat dormant for more than 18 months under the 8 previous administration. We are committed to 9 10 advancing progress as much as we can at every level of the MTA in the years ahead. Part of this work 11 includes taking a look at internal operations to rein 12 in costs. We are doing our part to [inaudible] 13 14 consolidation, [inaudible] cutting overtime, and 15 major reductions in using consultants. Regarding 16 overtime specifically, our latest report shows the 17 MTA has achieved 244 million dollars in savings since 18 2018, a decrease in overtime of 18%. This was the first time in a decade that the MTA has achieved two 19 consecutive years of overtime reduction and we are on 20 track to reduce overtime spending by 1 billion 21 22 dollars total between 2020 and 2024. This is great 23 news, but we know our work isn't done yet. To build on this success, we will be moving forward with a 24

range of initiatives to further drive down

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

controllable overtime and address potential abuses as quickly and as efficiently as possible. We are confident that there are better days ahead for the MTA and we look forward to working with the City Council to find the best path forward. A strong MTA is essential to New York and the nation's economic rebound, and we're eager to help get the economy back on track. Thank you, and we're now happy to take your questions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Eh, how, how soon do you feel that we can, and, and first of all before asking the question I also would like, eh, to recognize that eh, eh, a few months ago we had Pat Foye and the other, eh, leadership of the MTA being in front of us. Eh, so the fact that we have also, eh, other members of the leadership, eh, that they are experiencing issue related to financing other, eh, [inaudible] without the participation of the Pat Foye and other members of the whole team is not, eh, any reduction, no, the respect that they have for the work that we doing and the level of collaboration. But this is something that as we plan together we, eh, for this hearing, eh, eh, we, we thought that, eh, we could have this conversation

/

with the great team that they send to us today since we also have the chairman and other members of the team [inaudible] with us a few months ago in another hearing very related to the discussion that we are having right now. Eh, how soon can we have the MTA ready to reopen, eh, those two hours that the trains are closed right now?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: Thank

you. Um, so we are looking at this as our Chairman

Foye has said previously, um, we'll open up our

subways overnight for those two hours when we can do

so safely.

the governor call and say let's opening on Sunday because it's good for him MTA will, eh, [inaudible] open. So I think that, you know, we should have a better plan. I think it's a fair expectation tit we can have a plan or when we got, we are gonna be having the train now, the train open 24/7.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: So, again, as we did for the sort of the 1:00 a.m. to 2:00 a.m. hour and then the, ah, 4:00 to 5:00 a.m. hour, as the city reopened we committed to opening, ah, with the phased opening and we will continue to

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

look at, ah, how the city reopens and we will make decisions based on that as, as we open the city safely. We want to make sure our customers and our employees are safe.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We do and we

appreciate it, but I think, as we know, eh, eh, this is, at this moment this is about, eh, you know, we need to reopen, like all the study, all the numbers saying that, you know, by giving those two hours so that we go back to celebrate that we are not only the largest transparent system in the whole nation and we appreciate your leadership, of you and many other, but this is about working class, working daily, who work in restaurant, eh, eh, who live in underserved community, to be able to have access to 24 hours and those two hours make a big difference. And I, and I, and I believe my colleagues not only to the MTA but my colleagues also to the governor to please use his powers, use his resource. We need to have those, eh, two hours that the train being shutted down, closed, right now, open as yesterday. So I take your word. Eh, I want to keep it positive. But I just think that, you know, no one has been in the, in the battleground more than many of us. We know what it

2	is to be in the city and not going to the home too			
3	much as they help somebody or going to Canada to work			
4	from there. So we can tell you that those two hours			
5	are very important. Please advocate. I know that			
6	it's beside what you and the leadership, the MTA			
7	would like to see happening. A lot has to do with			
8	Albany. And we need to be sure that the governor,			
9	you know, get his support and come on board and work			
10	with MTA so that the train is open 24/7. But what			
11	about on the C and the F train, eh, eh, can we have			
12	any, eh, how are we doing? How are you guys doing			
13	from the MTA? I know that you are in the process of			
14	so a lot conversation going on. Eh, our conversation			
15	moving forward can we, you know, in, do we have some			
16	positive expectation that, you know, that New			
17	Yorkers, especially those who rely on the, on the F			
18	and C train will be getting full services, eh, very			
19	soon?			

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: So, as you know, Chair, we are running 80% of our service, right, to, um, ah, our, our customers that is 30% of ridership. Ah, we continue to monitor ridership, um, as the city continues to reopen. Um, we're continually in, in the system monitoring our

ridership. And, um, we've been there many times during the week to make sure that their crowding and, and other issues, um, that are possible to see. Um, so we'll continue to monitor that and, um, hopefully in the future there, there will be, you know, a response from, ah, the MTA on the services. We're continually monitoring. Ah, currently we're in court, right? So I, I can't comment any further on that.

this budget and as you know most of my colleague, myself, Speaker Johnson, being advocating for the city to always increase the contribution to the MTA, eh, eh, but also we want to be engaged and I know that this isn't just about you, those who are in front of us today or even the chairman of the MTA. This is about the city and the state have to make a decision. In the past, Speaker Johnson and us asked for conversation to begin on the possibility for New York City to take over the New York City Transit. How will that bring a different way or how the city transit will be run if New York City take full control?

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: I, um, Mr.

Chairman, I think that's the type of conversation that would be best, um, had with Chairman Foye when he comes back later this month.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK, OK, thank you.

ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: During this process of COVID in, in, as we are going back to our feet when it come to, you know, eh, taking our city back, our economy, hopefully guys, you know, running the train 24/7, restaurant, theater, [inaudible] institution being reopened and, and how is the MTA planning to work with the riders of the train to be sure that it, it, individual riders continue doing their part and I, I gotta say that taking the train very often I, and the buses, I know that most people who use the train they use their mask and they keep their distance. And what is in the budget, the projection that you have, eh, when it come to how much you will need to continue doing the educational part of, eh, riders know what they have to do be, to protect themselves and protect others when it comes to COVID?

ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: Um, well, in 2020 we spent about 250 million dollars to clean and disinfect the MTA system, both subways, buses, um, Metro North, and Long Island Railroad. And so far in 2021 we have spent another 44 million dollars through the first week of March. Um, we anticipate to spend about 300 million dollars more on an annual basis going forward. It's already in our financial plan. The MTA continues with its mask force and we send people out. We also know that our customers have expressed, um, comfort in known that we have been cleaning and disinfecting our system daily and vigorously.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. It, what, what do you think is, what will it take, eh, for, eh, the buses, eh, to enact a systemwide, eh, outdoor boarding in all buses, eh, in New York City?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: So I think that, that conversation, um, ah, Sarah provided an answer last month. But, you know, as we roll out Omni, um, that, that will be possible even more. Um, currently we have readers, um, for all our subway stations as well as our bus, um, ah, fare boxes. Um, so as we roll out Omni and, ah, integrate Omni into

2 our system I think that that would be a good 3 possibility.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do we still have area in New York City where New Yorker has to take three buses to go from where they live to go to work?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL:

sorry, I didn't understand the question, Chair?

when people are, eh, eh, need to make a transfer from one bus to the other, right, eh, eh, we take for granted that all New Yorkers need to have, eh, to take only transfer. But I know in the past there were places in Queens, there was places in Brooklyn, where people had to take three buses, eh, because a second bus doesn't take them to the, the destination. Have you find out if we still has area where in certain, eh, community, eh, the New Yorker had to do like the, eh, two, three transfers, eh, and if that will be the case have you engaged in any conversation with some Council Member to address that situation or a senate or assembly member?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: I don't have that answer in front of me. But we can definitely follow up with you, um, working with our

including

1	COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 24			
2	operations planning team to make sure that, that, ah,			
3	is reviewed.			
4	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. I have othe			
5	question, but I want to go back to my colleague and			
6	eh, so I bring it back to Elliot so that he can then			
7	call those council, eh, eh, on the order that they			
8	raised their hand.			
9	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.			
10	We'll now call on council members in the order that			
11	they've used the Zoom raise hand function. Um,			
12	please keep your questions to five minutes, including			
13	answers. Um, first we will hear from Council Member			
14	Miller. Council Member Miller.			
15	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.			
16	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, you			
17	need to unmute yourself.			
18	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Am I unmuted?			
19	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes, yes you are.			
20	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: OK, good.			
21	Thanks. See, I did that without touching anything.			
22	Um, so, ah, thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you to the			

MTA team for being here. I have a number of questions so I'm gonna kind of just try to get to them and, and, and get your answers. So, ah, prior

23

24

25

25

ah, commuter rails, and, and others and, and getting

2 access, ah, coming out of COVID, ah, what can we see 3 different? What can we expect, and can we expect certainly the expansion of the Atlantic ticket, ah, 4 access to the commuter rails for New York City 5 residents. Um, in the area of health and safety you 6 7 talked about, um, the robust cleaning that occurs, um, having been and, and I know you guys are fairly 8 new to this. I spent 25 years, um, employed at the, 9 at the MTA, ah, the last 10 as president and business 10 agent of the Amalgamated Transit Union, and so we are 11 certainly intimately familiar with, with what that 12 cleaning process looks like. Um, what does future 13 14 investment looks like and the CDC guidelines, ah, 15 suggest that that is the most important, um, aspects 16 of health and safety or investment, or could we address load guidelines? We still getting phone 17 18 calls myself and, and, and many of my, ah, colleagues are getting phone calls of overcrowded buses and, 19 20 particularly overcrowded buses. Um, ah, we have legislation introduced, ah, ah, introducing 21 22 legislation that addresses load guidelines and 23 particularly load guides [inaudible] because we know throughout the city, um, buses in the outer boroughs 24 25 carry more folks than they do in the city. Ah,

responsibility and set aside the dollars that would

24

offer that pattern to the bargaining units that do not now have a contract?

ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: Um, so I, I will start with your last question, um, Council Member.

Um, in terms of pattern bargaining, um, the MTA, the MTA financial plan, um, includes pattern bargaining in its, in its [inaudible]. However, I cannot comment on any negotiations whatsoever, as you noted yourself. Um, so I think that probably addresses to the [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I know that you would say that. I didn't know that you couldn't do it. So you, you're saying that the money is there, it's been set aside to meet the pattern that has already been established?

ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: That's our budget practice, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: OK, great.

ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: OK, and the second item I'll talk about very briefly.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: No, that's, no, that's for me, not for you.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ACTING DIRECTOR KELLER: Oh, OK. I'll, I'll just touch briefly on the Atlantic pilot, ticket pilot. Um, it continues without any plans to discontinue it. Um, the intention was to use the pilot extension to evaluate more data before the next round of fare hearings. So the MTA board could evaluate merits and decide on permanently incorporating the tariff into the Long Island Railroad tariff. Um, but of course with the pandemic we have not been able to do a full analysis and, and go on and talk to customers about their likes and dislikes. Um, the [inaudible] study was intended to be done in 2020. Um, we plan to relaunch the study, the analysis sometime later in 2021 or very early 2022, based on how much ridership rebounds and then we'll have a better idea about the Atlantic ticket. Um, and the other thing I wanted to just point out in terms of other, um, other MTA Transit uses for New York City, um, residents, the, um, outer borough transportation count, which was supposed to fund, um, intercity railroad, um, discounted travel along with several other items, um, the outer borough transportation fund has not been funded because the reviews from the for-hire vehicle surcharge has not

come close to even hitting the first 300 million, which was anticipated for the subway action plan.

Um, forecasts from the state, which is what we base our, um, for-hire vehicle fee surcharge revenues on, because we do not have a long history of it, um, indicate that probably that will start, um, hitting the outer borough transplantation count again in 2022.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: And in regards to the, ah, the bus redesign, it still remains a priority for the MTA. Um, due to the pandemic, you know, there's an impact on our staff resources and the challenges to safely conduct, ah, public outreach with community stakeholders under the prevailing social distancing guidelines. Um, so the projects are currently on hold. Um, you know, ah, the sessions require engagement from our operations planning team, GCR, um, to meet and discuss various routes, bus stops, so it's, it's a very sort of hands-on type of, ah, outreach that we do for bus redesigns. Um, as soon as it's, ah, we're able to do this safely we will open it up and continue to do, ah, progress on the, the redesigns.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And, and I'm 3 sorry, Jamaica Depot.

I'm sure you are aware, Council Member, ah, the, ah, design is underway. We've chosen option A, which is a one-story, ah, depot with on-roof parking and ground level parking that has a 30-foot sound barrier that surrounds it. Ah, we've been coordinating closely with, ah, community interest and stakeholder interests. Ah, we anticipate awarding that contract towards the end of next year, ah, with completion to be approximately 42 months later, which would be towards the end of 2026.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: OK. Thank you. Thank you very much, and, and the load guidelines stuff you can send that, OK? Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And before,

before we calling also the, our next colleague, I

also want to thank the men and women of TWU also for,

you know, being, eh, eh, the voice of the riders and

the voice of the workers. So it was very, eh,

[inaudible] that we were standing together today at

the press conference and I know that there's

conversation going on. There should be conversation

again between TWU and you guys. But I just hope that

everyone, all New Yorkers recognize the work that

they're doing and only representing the interest of

5 the workers by representing the interest of the whole

6 city. Thank you. Back to you, Elliot.

Member Koo. Council Member Koo.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.

Ah, before we move on to the next member I would like to acknowledge that we were also joined by Council Member Levin. Um, next we will hear from Council

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you very much. Ah, thank you, Chair, and thank you, representatives from MTA. Ah, I have a public safety issue question. Like, like today my wife is supposed to go to city, ah, usually she takes the train to go to the city. But right now she, today she decided not to, she wanted to spend the \$30 to use car service because of the, ah, all these, ah, um, hate crime against Asians or hate crime against, or crime against anyone. Ah, today, today I read the news, ah, the [inaudible] they even have a passenger urinating to another passenger, ah, and it's so disgusting. And if you're a passenger you may get slashed or stabbed or, or,

any kind of physical abuse you can encounter on the train. So my question is what steps are you guys doing to alleviate the anxiety and hesitancy, ah, for like people to use the train? Because you always talk about the ridership [inaudible] but if you don't improve, ah, public, ah, safety issues, ah, people are afraid to use the subway or the bus. So are you doing anything? I know you have requested more police. Have you considered to have the MTA public safety agents on the platforms or on, on the trains?

think you, you, hit the sort of nail on the head.
We've called for an additional 1000 cops in our
system, right, to provide mental health services in
our subways and, and our platforms. Um, this is a
call that our Chairman Foye has made as well as, ah,
President Feinberg. And it's very important for us
to have additional NYPD officers to help protect our
customers and employees in these cases. Um, the MTA
also has, you know, a anti-Asian hate crime campaign
going on right now. So we support the community in,
in that fashion.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, but, but I don't see [inaudible] you guys doing, no, because

1	С
2	ŀ
3	I
4	t
5	-
6	ć
7	C
8	r
9	
10	V

hate crimes still happen every day, not only against Asians, but against everyone. So, so how to resolve this? I mean, you have to do it immediately, not just like, well, last month, ah, Chairman Foye has a, ah, a budget meeting with City Council. Ask him the question. But a month's gone by, I mean, there's nothing being done.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: So, ah,
we're a transit agency, right? We need the
partnership of NYPD and additional mental health
services to continue to help with this issue. Ah, we
have our MTA PD that, ah, you know, ah, currently
patrols, excuse me, um, our, our system but this is
really, ah, more about NYPD officers being in our
system to help us.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I think you have to create a state of urinary, you know, making sure, you know, this is the top issue, ah, for your agency.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER PATEL: We want...

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And asking the mayor, the governor to help. You know, I mean, City Council, we all, we didn't know this, but we don't have, ah, any budget to send to you. The governor

┙	L
Ξ	_

_

_ _

has the National Guards, they have the police, and the NYPD has police. MTA has police. So between all these agencies you can, you can do some [inaudible] and have some agents patrol the platform.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [speaking in Spanish]

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Hmm? Thank you. I' finished my questions.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council Member. Um, are there any other council members at this time that would like to ask a question of the MTA? OK, seeing none at this time, Chair Rodriguez, we can turn it back over to you if you have any follow-up questions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I think that right now if, and I do appreciate, you know, all the thing of the, everyone on the MTA is, especially, you know, we willing and [inaudible] who's been very helpful from the governmental relation side, I, I, and, and I appreciate that you guys, you know, accommodate your time to come back and be in front of us today. I think that for me this is about, you know, prioritizing, you know, being fortune to invest to, eh, restore the services, but also, you know, all

upgrading the signal system?

those question related to upgrading the signal system, you know, if there are part of this conversation so if, if you have any update on, how are we doing when scheduling-wise when it come to, eh, the plan, capital plan to upgrading the signal system, eh, eh, is that, has that plan been delayed as a result of the financial crisis or, eh, what do you anticipate would be the plan to continue

DIRECTOR BERRANG: Ah, Mr. Chairman, ah, as you know, I'm sure we have, ah, three, ah, signal projects, CBD signal projects, under way. CBD West, ah, Queens Boulevard West, ah, and Culver CBDC, and Eight Avenue CBDC. The balance of the CBDC, ah, projects, which in the 20 to 24 program, have currently not yet started, ah, due primarily due to, ah, the financial impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic. But we are, ah, looking to start those and some design is under way and, ah, we look forward to advancing those as financial resources and, ah, possibilities, ah, provide themself, ah, opportunities to do so.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. And when, when it come to, eh, women and WMB, eh, eh, of course

I appreciate also the conversation that I have, have with the Director Keller women and minority, eh, program of the MTA and, and looking to continue having that conversation, bringing other, others in, in New York, and other individuals that already have they own the small businesses so that they, they can connect with you and what do, what do we anticipate in this budget coming would be the percentage of, of projects, eh, resources [inaudible] only for women and minority?

DIRECTOR BERRANG: So, ah, Council

Member, in, in the last, ah, New York State fiscal
year, which is 2019-2020, ah, the MTA, ah, spent

772.5 million dollars on M/WBE, ah, ah, contractors,
ah, that were inclusion in, in our contracts. That's
at a 27.2%, ah, rate. Um, that made us, ah, the
highest-ranked, ah, agency in the State of New York
for, ah, New York State inclusions. Ah, we also, ah,
spent 304 million dollars, ah, last, in that same
time period on federal contracts. Ah, we are fully
committed to, ah, meeting our obligations, ah, for
both, ah, ah, state and federally funded contracts
for M/WBE, and we also have a, ah, small business
mentoring program which we are actively, ah, ah,

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

pursuing and, and, ah, managing and encouraging participation, so, ah, M/WBE contracts can, ah, become prime contractors, and so, ah, but that's the status of our M/WBE program at the time.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, eh, again, eh, looking to continue having this conversation with you guys. I think that, you know, even though the number, you know, look good but when it come to, eh, eh, what percentage of those are New Yorkers who live in the five borough and how we can do better this is something again that I'm looking to continue addressing with you guys. So, eh, you know, looking to continue, eh, to have that conversation with the director WMB, WMBE and, and the other staff of the MTA to connect more local residents of the five borough to that opportunity of an institution that has the value of 1 trillion dollars, where some people make huge amount of money but still there's a lot more that we can do to connect, eh, eh, local women, black, Latino, minority with those opportunity. So with that, eh, I would like to thank you guys and I hope that and as we were hearing members of the public starting to represent the TWU that you will hear their testimony, their testimony,

leave your, your representative to hear the testimony from the TWU and members of the public. Thank you.

CHIEF BARRERE: Thank you, Chair

and if you have to step out, as you usually do, to

Rodriguez, ah, on behalf of the entire MTA. Thank you again for hosting us and giving this opportunity today, and there will definitely be representatives listening to the public's, um, comments.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. We will now turn to public testimony. I'd like to remind everyone that unlike our typical council hearings, we'll be calling individuals one by one to testify. Each panelist will be given two minutes to speak, unless otherwise instructed by the chair. Council members who have questions for a particular panelist should use the Zoom raise hand function and I will call on you after the panelist has completed their testimony. For panelists, once your name is called a member of our staff will unmute you. Ah, please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to announce that you may begin before delivering your testimony. Um, our panelists will be Eric Loegel. Eric?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

everyone. Um, thank you, Mr. Chairman, members of the committee, um, everyone who's here. Um, so I'm gonna speak about the C and the F line service reductions. Um, my name, of course, Eric Loegel. Um, I'm vice president of Rapid Transit Operations with the Transport Workers Union, Local 100. represent the more than 7000 subway conductors, train operators, and tower operators through Move New York. I'm testifying today to voice opposition to the MTA service cuts on the C and the F lines. The reduced service is more than just an inconvenience for riders, who have to wait longer in stations to be picked up. It's a health hazard. By running through trains, the MTA is exacerbating crowding conditions on platforms and inside trains. Instead, we should be doing everything we can to give riders and workers as much space as possible as we continue to battle COVID-19. The authority cut service on all subway lines after the pandemic hit last year, as ridership dwindled to about 300,000 a day. Um, it was restored on all subway lines except for the C and the F. F now has 29 fewer train runs and the C now has eight fewer runs. The gaps between trains have increased

ERIC LOEGEL: Hello and good afternoon,

2	by up to 12 minutes compared to before the pandemic.
3	That might have made some sense during early in the
4	pandemic, but ridership has been increasing as more
5	and more people get vaccinated. In recent weeks the
6	number of daily riders has been between 1.7 and 1.9
7	million. The MTA needs to restore service and
8	restore it now. The service reductions have also
9	imposed significant hardships upon our own union
10	members, the operating crews who serve riders on the
11	C and the F lines. In addition to being displaced
12	from their normal job assignments for many months,
13	some members have been put into new job schedules,
14	which severely impact their ability to manage their
15	own lives, including family and childcare
16	responsibilities. The New York State Public
17	Authority requires transit officials hold public
18	hearings before making service cuts like this. The
19	law also says the authority has to give the mayor and
20	City Council 30 days' written notice so the city can
21	hold proper hearings. The MTA never held those
22	hearings. There is no economic justification for
23	these service cuts. The MTA has received many

billions of dollars from the federal government. So

I urge you to call on the MTA to restore full service
on the C and F lines.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your

ERIC LOEGEL: Thank you.

testimony. Are there any council members that have

questions for this panelist? OK. Seeing none, our

next panelist will be Arthur Schwartz. Arthur?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Ah, good afternoon.

Ah, my name is Arthur Schwartz. I am special assistant to the president of the Transport Workers Union and counsel. Um, I just want to add one thing to what Eric said, and that's that this committee should understand, as we showed in court last week, that it has the power to require the MTA and the New York City Transit Authority to come before the City Council, report all cuts in service, and the City Council has the power to request public hearings. I dare say that in the 40 years since that law was put into effect, part of the Public Authorities Law, Sections 1205-4 and 1204-15 that has rarely happened. And probably most current City Council members do not even know that that right on the part of the City

25

2 Council exists. Um, we went to court and said last week to Judge Frank Perry that these cuts in the C 3 and the F train were in fact becoming permanent and 4 Judge Perry, and we said that they had not notified 5 6 the city or given the City Council the opportunity to 7 ask for public hearings and the, the judge agreed with us. He stopped the permanent implementation of 8 the C and F cuts, and then this morning actually 9 extended that injunction until April 7. Ah, this 10 City Council should be demanding, ah, not just the 11 union should be demanding, but the City Council 12 should be demanding its role, not just by having this 13 14 hearing, but by having public hearings demanding that 15 the MTA hold public hearings if it really intends to 16 go through with the C and F train cuts. I also want to talk about another issue that is highlighted this 17 18 morning in the New York Times. The New York City 19 Transit Authority, ah, operating budget is the most 20 rider-funded budget of any transit authority in the United States. Ah, the consumers, the people that 21 22 ride the trains, are the ones that pay a majority, an 23 overwhelming majority of the money that runs the, the Transit Authority. That wasn't always the case. 24

There was a time before the 1970s, 7 and 78...

1	COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 44				
2	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.				
3	ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Can I finish, may I				
4	finish one more sentence?				
5	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, summarize your				
6	testimony.				
7	ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Ah, where New York				
8	City, ah, funded the authority. Ah, I call on the				
9	City Council to take up that responsibility now that				
10	you're doing the budget and to put 1% of the city				
11	budget into the New York City Transit Authority				
12	operating budget, which would allow the authority to				
13	maintain service and lower fares. Thank you very				
14	much.				
15	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your				
16	testimony. Ah, as a reminder, written testimony can				
17	be submitted. Ah, the address is				
18	testimony@council.nyc.gov.				
19	ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: We, I have done that, I				
20	didn't.				
21	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Um, are				
22	there any council members with questions for this				

panelist? OK, seeing none, ah, our next panelist 23 will be HP Schroer. HP. 24

25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HP SCHROER: Can you hear me now?

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we can.

HP SCHROER: For the record, I'm HP, a World War II veteran, and director of You Me We, a veteran organization representing 12,000 veterans attending colleges in New York City. My sole mission for the last four years was to get the MTA to charge veterans the same price as seniors. Three years ago the council and the mayor approved giving veterans attending college a discount. Unfortunately, after three years of the 12,000 eligible veterans only 700 have received a discount because of restrictions imposed by the mayor. So we decided to do something about it. Three bills were established in the state legislature, which enable all veterans to purchase discounted fares. The bills stipulate the money will be supplied by the state and only be used for veterans' discount. Sadly, although supported by the public and the majority of the legislature, they have languished in committees. Why? A lack of money and a commitment to funding. The American Relief Act is supplying the state and the MTA with billions of dollars. It is estimated it would take two cents from every fare to fund the veterans' discount. Yet,

- 1	,	١		

17

24

25

2 the governor and the MTA have not taken any action to

3 pass the bills. If you want to thank veterans for

4 our service, then give meaning to the words by

5 demanding the mayor keep his promise, demanding the

6 MTA put a veterans' discount in its budget, and

7 demanding the governor pass the bills and announce on

8 Memorial Day a veterans' discount on the MTA.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired.

10 HP SCHROER: I ask you, isn't this

11 service and sacrifice of veterans for the country

12 | worth two cents? I thank you.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your

14 | testimony. Um, do any council members have questions

15 | for this panelist? OK, seeing none, our next

16 panelist will be Kevin Jones. Kevin.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

18 KEVIN JONES: Ah, good afternoon, and

19 | thank you to the members of the committee for

20 allowing me to testify today. My name is Kevin

21 | Jones. I'm the associate state director of advocacy

22 | at AARP New York. We represent 750,000 members of

23 | the 50-plus community in New York City. AARP New

York believes that the MTA's network of subways and

buses remains the life blood of New York City and we

25

deserts.

2 stand committed to ensuring that the system provides safe and reliable transportation for our members and 3 all New Yorkers citywide. Despite the unprecedented 4 5 challenges that the MTA has faced as a result of the 6 pandemic, the MTA system prior to, ah, COVID-19 7 pandemic was far from perfect and plaqued with a host of issues, especially as they relate to the overall 8 accessibility o for transit network. 9 10 overwhelming majority of the New York City subway stations remain inaccessible to people with 11 disabilities and older adults with mobility issues. 12 A 2018 study published by the New York City 13 comptroller's office found that only 24% of the 14 15 subways, um, of the subway's 472 stations were 16 accessible. The comptroller also found that the majority of neighborhoods that lack access to a 17 18 single ADA accessible station are predominantly, ah, 19 communities of color in the outer boroughs of the 20 Bronx, Brooklyn, and Queens. In addition, thousands of residents, um, in the outer boroughs of the Bronx 21 22 and, ah, Queens and Brooklyn also lack access to 23 nearby public transit options entirely, which essentially rendered, ah, renders them in transit 24

These pervasive accessibility issues

2	diminish the quality of life for 50-plus New Yorkers
3	and often limit an individual's access to quality
4	employment and health care opportunities, as well as
5	other critical services offered by the city. The MTA
6	has made notable commitments to address these issues
7	in recent years by prioritizing ADA station
8	accessibility projects in the 20, ah, 2020 to 2024
9	capital plan, as well as undertaken New York City
10	Transit Fast Forward plan. But these project remain
11	suspended, projects remain suspended due to the
12	unprecedented impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. Ah,
13	ah, we commend the work of the Senate Majority Leader
14	Chuck Schumer of the New York Congressional
15	delegation and the Biden administration in passing
16	the American Rescue Plan and are eager to see the
17	MTA's receiving an additional 6.5 billion dollars in
18	emergency aid to offset the financial losses from the
19	pandemic. As the MTA becomes more financially stable
20	and looks to restart

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

KEVIN JONES: ...many of the projects, we urge the agency to begin prioritizing, begin by prioritizing the completion of ADA accessible stations. Um, I will submit the rest of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

2 testimony in writing. Ah, but I'm happy to take any
3 questions.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Ah, are there any council members with questions for this panelist? OK, seeing none, I'll turn it over to Chair Rodriguez.

to, eh, eh, everyone from the MTA for [inaudible] this hearing. Thank you to my colleague. Thank you to the speaker. Eh, working together again with borough president Eric Adams, eh, everyone that joined the hearing today, press conference today, including, eh, eh, Speaker Corey Johnson, Council Member Lander, eh, Jumaane Williams, Gale Brewer. I know that advocating together we will be able to restore the funding. With that this hearing is adjourned.

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date <u>May 15, 2021</u>