

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

January 14, 2021

Start: 10:09 a.m.

Recess: 12:31 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: Inez D. Barron,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Laurie A. Cumbo

Alan N. Maisel

Ydanis A. Rodriguez

Eric A. Ulrich

Farah N. Louis

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

A P P E A R A N C E S

- Patricia Simino Boyce
University Dean for Health and Human Service
- Margaret Riley
Academic Director of Nursing Programs at the
School of Professional Studies
- Anne Marie Menendez
Professor and Nursing Chair at Queensborough
Community College
- Juwanie Piquant
Chair of the University Student Senate
- Sumana Ali
Vice President for Academic and Legislative
Affairs at the University Student Senate
- Anne Bove
Assistant Professor of Nursing at BMCC
- Marina Aminova
One of the 45 Students at Lehman College as
Graduate Family Nurse Practitioner Program

SERGEANT AT ARM: Thank you. Welcome to the remote hearing on Higher Education. Will Council Members and staff please turn on their video at this time. Thank you.

To minimize disruption, please place all cellphones, electronics to vibrate. You may send your testimony at testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again that's testimony@council.nyc.gov.

Chair Barron, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning and thank you. [GAVEL]. I want to thank you for joining today's virtual Committee hearing from the Higher Education on the Status of Nursing Programs at the City University.

I am Council Member Inez Barron, Chair of the Committee on Higher Education and a proud CUNY alumna. Thank you to everyone that I see here today who is ready to testify on this incredibly important and timely topic. Healthcare is one of the most rapidly expanding industries in the country and within it, registered nurses, RN's comprise of the largest population profession.

In New York City, CUNY is a major source of both new nurses to the local healthcare industry, as well

as career ladder opportunities for eventually practicing registered nurses, RN's.

Fourteen CUNY schools offer nursing degree programs with certificates and degrees, ranging from the Associate of Applied Science AAS, in nursing to the Doctorate in Nursing Practice DNP.

At the Committee's last hearing on this topic, which was more than four years ago in 2016, the Committee was interested in learning about CUNY's efforts to increase the number of nursing graduates to meet projected demand. Between the aging baby boomer generation, high rates of retirement among nurses, a dramatic increase in the number of people accessing healthcare for the passage of the Affordable Care Act and in increasing the alliance on nurses in the healthcare delivery system. Healthcare industry experts are sounding the alarm of illuming nursing shortage prices.

At that hearing in 2016, CUNY testified about its efforts to increase the number of Associates in Nursing Degrees AND, Bachelors VS3's and Masters

degree program graduates with a trend toward a more highly educated nursing workforce and a goal of

80 percent of all undergraduate nursing degrees being a Bachelor of Science degree by 2020.

Related matters were discussed at a subsequent hearing on Pursuing healthcare careers at CUNY in January 2019. Over the most recent seven year reporting period, CUNY graduated approximately 1,700 nurses in all degree levels annually. Unfortunately, this represents an overall drop with a peak of 2,025 degrees awarded in the 2013 to 2014 academic year.

Per the American Association of College of Nursing, we do understand that while applications to nursing degree programs have been steady, a lack of faculty, clinical sites, classroom space, clinical preceptors and budget constraints have limited enrollment in nursing programs nationally.

Today, as the city anticipates its second wave of the coronavirus, it must understand the full scope of CUNY's consortium nursing programs and the challenges they face.

I think it is safe to say that we all remember the sound of incessant sirens from ambulances carrying infected patients during the first wave. When New York Queens to be more exact, was identified as a national epicenter of the coronavirus. On March

7th, Governor Andrew Cuomo issued an executive order declaring a state disaster emergency for the entire state of New York.

By March 11th, the Governor announced that CUNY would implement distance learning effective March 19th. Not even three weeks after the state of emergency was declared, about half of the more than 74,000 known cases in the country were in New York which is almost ten times more than any other state. Meanwhile, American medical experts were scrambling to study the virus, learning new indicators and better understanding its contagion factor every day. And hospitals were ill prepared to battle the influx of highly contagious patients. In a video published by the New York Times on March 25th, an emergency room doctor exposed the overcrowded conditions and lack of PPE at Health + Hospitals, Elmhurst Hospital, the so-called epicenter of the epicenter.

In her video, Dr. Colleen Smith makes a plea for help, saying that emergency department is seeing 400 plus patients a day, nearly twice the normal complement while supplies dwindle and an increasing number of people wait for medical assessment.

Doctors, nurses and other workers at hospitals and clinics were overworked and stretched thin. Many got sick, risked the health and safety of their families and loved ones and some died. By mid-April for nearly a week straight between 700 and 800 people were dying in the city every day.

To meet the dire need for healthcare workers, the Governor issued additional executive orders, one that allowed students in programs to become licensed in the state to practice as healthcare professionals and to volunteer at a healthcare facility for educational credit. As if the student had secured a placement under an agreement. Without entering into any such clinical affiliation agreement and another executive order permitted graduates of registered professional nurse and license practical nursing licensure to qualify for educational programs registered by the State Education Employment to be employed to practice nursing under the supervision of a registered professional nurse and with the endorsement of the employing hospital or nursing home for 180 days immediately following graduation.

Even so, during this time, most clinical training for students in healthcare fields effectively came to

a halt. In mid-May, in an accelerated Bachelor nursing student at CUNY's Lehman College emailed Speaker Corey Johnson lamenting the lack of an alternative to completing a clinical experience in their program. The student was eager to complete their education and apply that knowledge to join the frontlines amid the pandemic.

More recently, Lehman College announced that in June 2020, the national commission of Collegiate Nursing Education CCNE withdrew a credit of its nursing Family Nurse Practitioner Master of Science Program. That's the MSFNP. That was because the Commission on Collegiate Nursing Education requires a certification pass rate of 80 percent or higher in order for institutions to continue their accreditation and with a 78 percent pass rate for calendar year 2019, Lehman College's program was 2 percentage points short.

The school appealed that decision but the CCNE's Board denied the appeal leaving more than 200 registered nurses enrolled in the program unable to sit through the Certification Exam. As a change.org petition started by an FNP student, JD Vasquez who I

believe is here today put it, as she put it "In the year of the nurse that is an injustice. Nurses risk their lives working tirelessly during the coronavirus pandemic and subsequently provided over 500 hours of additional patient care during their clinical rotations. Overcoming unthinkable obstacles and making unparalleled sacrifices only to learn four weeks before graduation that it was all for a profession that they would never get to practice in.

During that first wave, more than 4,000 so-called traveling nurses from all over the country came to New York City and hospitals are planning to once again utilize traveling nurses but as COVID cases spike in other cities, New York will have to compete with high demand during what healthcare experts are saying will be a very deadly winter.

But from what I can tell we have hundreds of nursing students on the brink of graduation ready to step up and join the frontlines of the pandemic in New York City. As the former epicenter of the epidemic, we don't know what the near future holds for our city, so we must first prioritize, graduating our nursing students especially when it comes to

administering advanced nursing degrees for those students who worked hard to gain new skills, expand their knowledge and improve their financial standing. And we need to figure out how to get even more nurses into the pipeline.

Increasing the number of nurses in New York City, especially nurses of color, increases equitable care and just to give a little footnote, historically, you may not know so I will share with you the fact that Harriett Tubman served as a nurse during the Civil War cases.

We now know that the virus killed Black and Latino people in New York City at twice the rate that it killed White people, an incredible disparity of discrimination that reflects longstanding and persist economic inequalities and differences in healthcare and general systemic discrimination. We must do what we can to not let that happen again and particularly in my community, there was a zip code that was designed as having the highest mortality rate in all of New York City.

At today's hearing, the Committee is interested in examining the full impact of the pandemic on the

CUNY Consortium of Nursing Programs. This includes learning how the programs continue to operate with a distance learning model, especially with regard to clinicals and how schools are identifying and implementing best practices. Additionally, the Committee is interested in learning how CUNY is supporting nursing students and faculty at this time.

Lastly, I would like to know how CUNY continues its efforts to increase nursing graduates and nursing graduates of color in particular. Before I conclude my opening statement I would like to highlight a couple of CUNY students, the first being Irena Butcher who graduated with her associates in Applied Science for AAS Degree in Nursing from BMCC in January 2020. After rescheduling her appointments to take the NCLEX three times and contracting a severe case of COVID at the beginning of March, Ms. Butcher took a class NCLEX on April the 10th. She plans to eventually enroll in the online bachelor's degree in Nursing at the School of Professional Studies.

And the second highlight is Dante Cyrild a 16-year-old from Flatbush Brooklyn Community,

Queensborough Community College. The youngest graduate for the class of 2020 with a \$70,000 scholarship, Mr. Cyrild and if I am mispronouncing your name, please forgive me. Mr. Cyrild is on track to becoming a nurse practitioner and plans on majoring in nursing at Adelphi University in the fall.

In preparing for this hearing, I would like to thank Joy Simmons my Chief of Staff, Ms. M. Ndigo Washington my Director of Legislation, Chloe Rivera the Committee's Senior Policy Analyst, Michele Peregrin, the Committee's Financial Analyst and Frank Perez the Committee's new Community Engagement Representative.

I don't know who all of the Committee Members, Council Members who are here but I will announce them at another time. And I will now turn it over to Senior Policy Analyst Chloe Rivera who will review some procedural items relating to today's hearing and call the first panel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Barron. My name is Chloe Rivera and I am the Senior Policy Analyst to the Committee on Higher Education at the New York City Council. I will be moderating today's

hearing and calling panelists to testify. Before we begin, please remember that everyone will be on mute until I call on you to testify. After you are called on, you will be unmuted by a member of our staff. Note that there will be a few second delay before you are unmuted and we can hear you.

For public testimony, I will call up individuals in panels, please listen for your name. I will periodically announce the next few panelists. Once I call your name, a member of our staff will unmute you. The Sergeant at Arms will set a clock and give you the go ahead to begin your testimony. All public testimony will be limited to three minutes. After I call your name, please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to announce that you may begin before starting your testimony.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Just to interject quickly, I want to acknowledge that we do have Council Members Alan Maisel and Council Member Rodriguez. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Barron. For today's hearing, the first panel will include representatives from the City University of New York

followed by Council Member questions then public testimony.

In order of speaking, we will have Patricia Simino Boyce University Dean for Health and Human Service, Margaret Riley Academic Director of Nursing Programs at the School of Professional Studies and Anne Marie Menendez Professor and Nursing Chair at Queensborough Community College. I will now administer the oath to the Administration. When you hear your name, please respond once a member of our staff unmutes you.

Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth before this Committee and respond honestly to Council Member questions? Dean Boyce?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Director Riley?

MARGARET RILEY: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Chair Menendez? Chair Menendez, a little box should pop up saying to accept the unmute.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: It looks like she is unmuted now.

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: Oh, I do. I apologize, I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No problem. Thank you, I will now call on Dean Boyce.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Thank you. Good morning Chair Barron and member of the Higher Education Committee. My name is Patricia Simino Boyce and I am the CUNY University Dean for Health and Human Services.

In this role, I provide strategic direction across CUNY's portfolio of health and human service programs and collaborate with academic leadership industry partners and key stakeholders to ensure distinction in CUNY's health professions programs and optimize clinical and field training experiences to drive career success for our students.

I am joined today by two colleges, Dr. Margaret Riley Academic Director of Nursing Programs at the School of Professional Studies and Ms. Anne Marie Menendez, Professor and Nursing Chair at Queensborough Community College. Dr. Riley and Ms. Menendez will address the excellent programs at their colleges and share information on the response to

COVID-19. I will begin with an overview of nursing programs across CUNY and provide a brief summary of university-wide strategies to address clinical training during the COVID-19 crisis.

Fourteen CUNY colleges offer nursing programs. Nine colleges offer an Associate degree and seven offer a bachelor's degree in nursing. Four colleges offer a total of twelve master's degrees in addition to nine advanced certificates in nursing. Three colleges offer a doctorate in nursing practice in the graduate center office, the PhD Program in Nursing.

CUNY graduates approximately 1,800 nurses annually for more than 50 individual degree and advanced certificate programs. On average, 700 associate degrees along with 800 baccalaureate degrees are awarded each year, in addition to approximately 300 graduate degrees and advanced certificates.

CUNY nursing programs graduated a record number of 1879 students in spring 2020, the highest number in recent years. A specific point of reference is a 60 percent increase in nurse practitioner graduations from spring 2019 to spring 2020. This reflects the

commitment of CUNY students to persevere along with innovative solutions by faculty to support student progression in our programs during the height of COVID-19 in New York City.

Applications to CUNY's nursing programs remain strong. In fact, enrollment is up in our bachelor's and master's degree programs for fall 2020. Our program conduct a blinded demographic admissions process, relying on the academic qualifications of candidates to fill a limited number of available slots in each program. Similar to other nursing education programs nationally, CUNY experiences increasing demand for our nursing programs with limitations due to admissions due to insufficient numbers of nursing faculty, clinical science, clinical preceptors and budget constraints.

CUNY nursing graduates come from diverse cultural ethnic linguistic backgrounds, approximately 70 percent of our nursing degree students are people of color, 27 percent Asian or Pacific Islander, 29 percent Black non-Hispanic and 13 percent Hispanic or other.

This is in stark contrast to national norms with a percentage of underrepresented students enrolled in pre-licensure programs as reported at 31 percent. CUNY nurse practitioner graduates also represent higher than average diversity in the profession or approximately 60 percent of CUNY nurse practitioner students are people of color compared with New York City and New York State Nurse Practitioners reported average of 26 percent.

CUNY is also proud of our diverse talented and highly experienced nursing faculty representing a broad spectrum of clinical and research expertise. 56 percent of CUNY's nursing faculty is represented by people of color which is three and a half times greater than the national average of 16 percent.

The National Council Licensure Examination or NCLEX, is the National Licensing Exam for nurses. CUNY's average NCLEX pass rate for first time candidates has been consistently higher at 90 percent than city, state and national average NCLEX first time pass rates of 84 percent, 86 percent and 88 percent respectively.

Similar to CUNY's ongoing programmatic changes to address external circumstances, CUNY immediately pivoted to distance learning at the onset of COVID-19 and sought approvals from the New York State Education Department to transition to alternative training models to support students progression in our clinical programs.

CUNY's nursing programs quickly implemented a series of innovative training models, including simulated clinical learning experiences and assessment skills training, tele-practice and other virtually integrated solutions. CUNY's nursing programs worked collaboratively to identify and share access to virtual stimulation platforms and other online resources. Complimented by the rapid adoption of innovative methods of student engagement and assessment to ensure the quality and integrity of our successful nursing programs throughout the crisis.

As a result, CUNY's nursing programs sustained operations and maintained student progression except in rare instances, such as the accelerated nursing or nurse practitioner programs where the required onsite clinical hours could not be substituted due to

programmatic state licensing and our national accreditation requirements.

In addition, CUNY was able to offer virtually simulated learning experiences through expertise available at NYSIM, the CUNY NYU State Of the Art High Fidelity Clinical Simulation Center at Bellevue Hospital. The capital funds to create NYSIM were allocated by the City of New York in the wake of September 11th. So, that the city and its health workforce would be better prepared and clearly this investment has paid off.

On April 3, 2020, at the beginning of our transition to fully online learning, CUNY hosted a university-wide simulation summit for our health and human service programs where more than 125 faculty across campuses shared experiences on simulated learning and showcased resources and expertise available across CUNY and at NYSIM.

The summit was particularly important given that the majority of our health professions, program needed to transition to simulated learning experiences, to substitute for clinical placements at healthcare facilities.

Subsequently, CUNY's health and human service programs launched a university-wide effort to integrate virtually simulated interprofessional education or IPE into our professional healthcare programs. Using three COVID-19 case scenarios developed by disciplinary faculty across campuses and leveraging simulation expertise from NYSIM.

These IPE learning experiences, skills training in the virtual world and prepared students through the evolving practice of healthcare and increasing use of tele-practice and response to COVID-19.

In addition, these virtual IPE experiences are being used by several programs to replace and/or compliment limited access to clinical practice settings during the pandemic and provide meaningful clinical experiences to students while demonstrating the importance of team work and collaboration.

We recognize the extraordinary efforts out faculty have undertaken to ensure the quality of educational and clinical training experiences to prepare health profession in students during the COVID-19 crisis. CUNY is proudly maintaining the integrity of our health profession students during

the COVID-19 crisis. CUNY is proudly maintaining the integrity of our health professions programs through innovative training models to prepare highly trained and eminently qualified professionals for an evolving healthcare landscape.

In summary, CUNY nursing programs provide aspiring students with the road to the middle class through employment in a highly respected profession along with opportunities for continued lifelong learning for professional success.

The high value of CUNY nursing programs is expressed by local healthcare partners who seek out CUNY nursing graduates due to the quality of our programs and the successful professional practice networks of CUNY nursing graduates across New York City.

Thank you for the opportunity to present to the Committee.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Now, Director Riley, you may begin once a member of our staff unmutes you and the Sergeant gives you the queue.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

MARGARET RILEY: Chair Barron and Council

Members, thank you for this opportunity to present an example of CUNY's approach to nursing, specifically the CUNY School of Professional Studies. The CUNY School of Professional Studies provides online classroom based and customized programs of study that are responsive to the needs of our students and our city. Focusing on forms of teaching, learning and scholarship that highlight innovation, personal and social progress and opportunities for careers and service.

CUNY SPS grounded in CUNY's tradition of access in academic excellence is dedicated to serving as the universities premier school for adult learners. Adapting to the needs of our students across a growing range of fields and sectors, we expand CUNY's ability to address the demands of evolving workplaces and disciplines. CUNY SPS holds to the core values of responsiveness and quality and as the universities leader in online learning, it is ranked in the top five percent in the U.S. news and world reports best online bachelor's degree programs for 2020, marking the sixth year in a row that the school has been highly ranked by the publisher. The schools growth

highly ranked by the publisher. The schools growth has been remarkable with 23 degrees launched since 2006. Enrollment has risen by more than 30 percent in the last four years to over 4,000 students in the credit bearing programs and thousands more who are enrolled in nondegree and grant funded workforce development programs.

Earlier this fall, CUNY SPS was selected to receive the 2020 online learning consortium effective practice award. The honor was granted for our entry, a three pronged approach to online orientation for adult learners which described how the three CUNY SPS online orientation programs effectively helped adult online learners be successful in their courses which are based on the model of deliberately and mindfully building a community.

As the premier CUNY School of Online Learning SPS was asked to develop and provide online teaching essentials workshops this summer and fall to help faculty across the CUNY system learn about best practices in online instruction and to convert their summer and fall courses to fully online courses in the wake of the COVID pandemic. This initiative

aimed to ensure that tens of thousands of students across CUNY whose lives may have otherwise been disrupted by the COVID-19 pandemic could continue to receive high quality academic instruction and in recognition of this service SPS received the 2020 University Association for Professional Continuing and Online Education mid-Atlantic Region Award for faculty development.

The CUNY SBS Online Nursing program was launched in 2014 in response to the need to expand opportunities for associate degree nurses to progress to the BS in nursing. This is critically important now more than ever with the BS and ten legislative requirement for registered nurses in New York State to complete their bachelor's degree in nursing within then years of licensure.

Our programs help nurses advance within their careers while continuing their education in a timely, flexible and affordable way. From our first cohort of 45 undergraduate students, the SPS undergraduate nursing program is currently the largest RN to BS nursing program in CUNY comprised of over 600 undergraduate students.

In addition, our nearly 200 graduate students include those enrolled in the only nursing informatics graduate program in CUNY. The nursing informatics program is a master's and credit bearing certificate program that focuses on integrating and analyzing health information and technology to inform healthcare practice, advance health outcomes and facilitate research and education. Just over 70 percent of our students are graduates of CUNY community college programs and 95 percent reside in New York State.

As per our 2019-2020 data, our diversity is reflective of the New York City community. Asian or Pacific Islander 25 percent, Black non-Hispanic 29 percent, Hispanic other 17 percent, White Caucasian 28 percent.

Our faculty is also reflective of diversity and inclusivity in race, ethnicity and are representative of the LGBTQ and disabilities populations. As a testament to the quality of the education, our programs were reaccruited by the national body of the Collegiate Commission on Nursing Education last September. Unique to our school, we offer full

tuition scholarships after one semester at SPS to graduates of CUNY Community College Nursing programs funded by the Petrie Foundation. And most recently, we secured funding from the Robin Hood Foundation to offer a career ladder scholarship for minority men in nursing and healthcare services.

We have created innovative dual joint degree programs with four CUNY community college nursing programs including borough of Manhattan, Bronx, LaGuardia and Queensborough Community Colleges with a mission to streamline and seamlessly advance associate degree nurses to a bachelor's degree to meet the institute of medicine goal of 80 percent of RN's with a BS. In the six short years that SBS nursing programs have been an existence, we have graduated over 500 RN to BS students contributing to the local healthcare workforce and enhancing quality care for diverse populations.

Our students are the backbone of New York City Health + Hospitals and other healthcare systems and are poised to engage and accel in leadership and education, population health, data driven decision making and advocacy for quality care. Our students have heroically served in hurricane and earthquake

ravaged communities, the COVID-19 epicenters of New York City. And most recently, one of our students will use her advocacy skills as a newly elected member of the New York State Assembly.

In early March, in response to the COVID-19 pandemic, all student clinical experiences at healthcare sites were abruptly canceled by the facilities due to the COVID-19 pandemic. SPS nursing partnered with over 22 community partners across New York City and engaged our students with community dwelling seniors to provide telehealth wellness services.

In addition, we collaborated with an effort from the office of the CUNY Dean of Health and Human Services to participate in interprofessional education simulation experiences with 14 other disciplines in health and human service in CUNY.

These and other innovative responses ensure that our students acquired the skills needed to advance and contribute to their professional practice. CUNY SBS will continue to be flexible and responsive to the needs of our community of nurses by introducing new opportunities that expand the possibility and

promise of public education and position our students to grow personally, accel in the workplace and enrich their communities. Thank you for this opportunity to present to the Committee.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Chair Menendez, you may begin once you are unmuted. Chair Menendez, sorry, I think reclicked mute. Try one more time.

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: How is that. Okay, good morning everyone. Good morning Chair Barron and Council Members. Queensborough Community College is one of the best two year colleges in the nation with one of the most diverse student bodies in the United States, Queensborough has declaimed by higher education including the chronical of higher education as a top degree producer and one that provides its students with many opportunities for [LOST AUDIO 34:46] into the middle class.

Established in 1967, the nursing program at Queensborough continues its outstanding reputation for highly skilled pairing nurses. Our nursing graduates continue their studies at four year colleges and many enter the workforce while pursuing

their bachelor's degree in nursing. Because our standards are high, our students accomplish [INAUDIBLE 35:17]. With the national passing rate for the NCLEX RN Associate Degree Exam at 84 percent, we are especially proud that Queensborough's passing rate for 2T is 95 percent. Approximately 80 percent of Queensborough graduates secure employment in their first year giving back to their public, private or university hospitals and other facilities often within the five boroughs. In fact, nine out of ten graduates live in New York and contribute to the national and local economies. Graduates earn a median income of \$70,000. [INAUDIBLE 35:56] earners to the middle class.

Queensborough nursing students are twice as diverse in terms of gender and ethnicity the nurses patients nationwide. 20 percent of Queensborough nursing students identify as male compared to a national proportion of just 10 percent. 60 percent of our nursing students are first generation college students.

In the healthcare industry, diversity is critical for patient health and wellness. Communication for

example is more effective when healthcare providers are able to build trust, manage language barriers, bridge cultural gaps, disparate value systems and respond to the needs of different patient populations.

It is also important that our students see themselves in their faculty. Queensborough's 26 fulltime nursing faculty members are Black or African American, 3 are Asian or Pacific Islander and 3 are male. Our faculties wide scope of professional and teaching [LOST AUDIO 37:00-37:03] advance environment enhancing each students ability to prepare for a career in nursing.

The colleges strong mentorship program provides support, advisement, encouragement and strategies for success via workshops and peer mentoring and senior students are presented with opportunities to enhance their leadership and communication skills.

Queensborough offers three dual joint programs with Hunter Bellevue School of Nursing, CUNY School of Professional Study and York College. These programs full and part-time students to progress seamlessly to a bachelor's degree at local CUNY

senior colleges. Queensborough students apply for these programs enrolled in their first clinical course at Queensborough.

Early this year, in consideration of our high standards and accomplishment, the accreditation education in nursing ACEN, granted Queensborough eight years of reaccreditation.

In mid-March, due to safety concerns, we received from the New York State Department of Education Office of Profession to transition students and faculty from the clinical and classroom settings to an online modal. Within days, CUNY's Dean for Health and Human Services Dr. Boyce, provided monetary and pedagogical support to pivot to an online forum for both the clinical and classroom component. Faculty worked tirelessly to share best practices to ensure that students continue to receive the best education under these challenging circumstances.

The nursing program recruits the majority of its students, faculty and staff from Queens and the New York City area. The program of study posted on our website is continuously updated to provide access to all perspective applicants. We regularly place

cultural and foreign language publications to highlight our nursing students and alumni's ability to excel in the nursing profession.

Admission is offering spring and fall semesters with an evening session available to accommodate working students. Nurses represent some of the most trusted and admired in our community, honesty, responsibility and the pursuit of new knowledge. It demands a lifelong commitment to learning and a passion and ability to pursue this calling. Queensborough Community College is privileged to champion these values and respond to the challenging healthcare needs of patients of all ages.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Before I turn to Chair Barron for questions, I would like to remind Council Members to use the raise hand function in Zoom to indicate that they have a question for this panel. Chair Barron? Chair Barron, you are on mute.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Am I unmuted now?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes and also, please watch out for your papers on the microphone.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. I haven't yet mastered how to have my text on the screen and be able to look at myself and make sure everything is right and hear everything but I am working on that. But I do have the testimony on my screen now and I just wanted to first of all thank you all for your testimony. And I am particularly -- I am proud of CUNY and the work that they have done overall. But I am particularly focused in this hearing on how we are going to help students graduate and I am particularly concerned that the Lehman program has lost its accreditation.

So, in your testimony you say that normally CUNY's average and NCLEX pass rate for first time candidates has been consistently higher at 90 percent than city, state and national average NCLEX first time passing rates of 84, 86 and 88 respectively. What happened at Lehman? How is that impacting the students, particularly in light of your testimony about BS and 10 and for those students who might in fact be restricted by that?

So, I am really going to focus -- I appreciate all your testimony. I am really focusing on what we need

to do and whether or not students or schools have submitted plans to SED that are alternatives to the requirements that work in hospitals.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Thank you Chair Barron. In response to your question the NCLEX rates cited in the testimony refer to pre-license programs. Just to clarify that the Lehman program is a master's program, so that's different and the Lehman Certification Exam is to practice as a nurse practitioner which is an advanced practice license and scope of practice.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, the Lehman program is an advanced program?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Hmm, hmm, yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what do students get at the end of that completion?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: They get a master's degree in family nurse practitioner and if they sit for the National Certify Exam, then they are certified to serve as a nurse practitioner and they are license with New York State is amended to reflect their scope of practice or practitioner as a nurse practitioner.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, for those students – the notice came at some point during this school year, that Lehman had lost its accreditation in that field. And students had already been engaged in preparation for the exam thinking that they would take it I believe in June?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Right, the exam is given at multiple points during the year, so students schedule the exam prior to graduation and typically align the exam date with the fulfillment of their graduation requirements.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, now that that accreditation has been lost at Lehman, I don't know uh – my question is, what happens to those students who now cannot take it? Can they transfer to another school and do it through another school? What options are there for them to be able to get this degree? Can't take the exam and get the certification and the license amended?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Sure, so what we are doing right now is we appeal to CCNE to ask for an extension for the withdrawal decision. At least to complete the pending graduates qualifications to sit

for the exam and we understand that that request has gone to the executive committee of the Board of Commissioners for CCNE and we are hoping to receive a response to that request within the next week.

Secondly, we have also submitted a request to the second certifying body that allows nurses to sit for the certifying exam and that is the American Academy of Nurse Practitioners Certification Board AANPCB and the are now reviewing our request to use our other certification which is the New York State Education Department Certification.

New York State, if you are not aware, is a national certifier for nursing programs around the state, so we do have national certification through the New York State Education Department. So, we requested the opportunity to use that certification to sit and qualify for the second certifying exam. So, we understand that both of those groups are weighing our decision and we are hoping to hear very shortly.

If that's the case, then our students will be permitted to sit for the exam and proceed with graduation as planned.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And there would not be any distinction between this process and the regular NCLEX process? There would be no distinction? You know, it not —

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Yes, absolutely just so you know NCLEX is the prelicensure, that's for RN's. This is for the certification for nurse practitioners, which is different, its advance practice and we are talking about two different certifying course. I know there is a lot of acronyms in here and different things.

So, there is two different certifying boards and we are applying to both of them to provide permission to our students to sit for those national certifying exam.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and so there would be no distinction if they are using the alternative route?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: No, no, we have already confirmed, no.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, alright very good and do you have any idea about when that would happen?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Yes, as I mentioned, we are waiting for a response. We expect a response from both of those organizations within the next week.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great. Dr. Riley, you talked about the School of Professional Studies having extensive online offerings as well as the classroom offerings and you used to conduct training for other faculty and staff. Are all of your classes available online? Are all of your offerings that are in person also available online or is there a limited menu of course offerings online?

MARGARET RILEY: From the school perspective, the majority of our programs are fully online. We do have a limited number of programs that were in-person and have had to pivot to the online format due to this pandemic. All of our nursing courses, all of our nursing programs are fully online.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: All nursing are fully online, okay. So, someone can complete this all online and not have to appear in person for your nursing programs?

MARGARET RILEY: That is correct. There are clinical requirements for the program as there are for all our N2BS programs. Those clinical requirements did require in person interaction and those could be done at local clinics, local hospitals where the students work. We also assist our students in placement.

Due to the nature of what happened with the pandemic, through the offices of the Dean of Health and Human Services Dr. Patty Boyce, all of the CUNY nursing programs collectively filed an application to the State Education Department to request permission to conduct alternate clinical experiences for our students to ensure that they met the program and the course objectives. And that was approved through the efforts of Dr. Boyce's office, so that we were collectively in one mass, in one group petitioning the state to be able to do this.

All of the programs were granted this permission in the spring and our application - I am sorry, we were granted the permission in the spring to run these clinicals in the fall and we currently have requests into the State Education Department to ask

1 permission to extend the opportunity for alternate
2 clinical experiences for the spring in anticipation
3 of many facilities closing down once again to student
4 access.

5
6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, is it accurate to say
7 then that all nursing students who need to have their
8 clinical hours, will have an opportunity to do so via
9 these alternative clinical experiences that you are
10 offering? Will all students have that opportunity to
11 access these alternate methods, so that they can
12 satisfy their clinical hours?

13 MARGARET RILEY: Yes, once they are approved by
14 the State Education Department, they will be allowed
15 to use these alternate clinical experiences that the
16 nursing programs have designed collaboratively, with
17 assistance from Dr. Boyce's office to be able to
18 offer those hours for those students, so they can
19 fulfill their requirements and not delay their
20 progression in graduation.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, I am glad to hear that
22 but it sort of conflicts with what students had said
23 was actually their experiences during the last five,
24 six months. So, I am looking forward to hearing the
25

1 students testimony, so that we can get clarity and
2 make sure that they themselves are aware of what
3 their because it has been somewhat different from
4 what's being presented here. And I remember earlier
5 on, actually perhaps it was in June, I spoke with
6 someone who did not know there were alternative
7 measures that were being offered for consideration
8 and approval. So I am glad to know that and we will
9 make sure of that.
10

11 So, how is this information relayed to all of the
12 students that they are in fact, in the programs and
13 need to move forward?

14 MARGARET RILEY: I can speak for how I conducted
15 it for my program. Being that we are an online
16 program, our primary mode of communication is through
17 email, through posting in course sites so that
18 students have access to the information. We had a
19 coordinated effort to inform the students to make
20 them aware and then we set those processes up.

21 So, all of the students that were interested in
22 participating in the clinical experience at our
23 program, were able to take advantage of this.

24 PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: And Chair Barron if I
25 may?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yeah.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I just want to clarify one point, which is that in most cases, the clinical hours are able to be substituted but not in all cases.

So, in some cases, the accreditor does not permit a substitution of an alternative. So, for example, the nurse practitioner accreditors do not really allow a substitution of clinical hours because they think that's critical to the successful preparation of nurse practitioners.

In other cases, we have accelerated programs which are much more tight timeframes in terms of students completing those clinical experiences and there is often not an opportunity to substitute what we consider a very limited but required a number of clinical hours for those students to be proficient and prepared to successfully practice.

So, in most cases, the alternatives are very successful and have met most of our needs but in some cases, we are prevented due to either program or accreditation or licensing requirements.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What can we do for those persons who dedicated years perhaps?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Yes, absolutely. We are actually supporting all those students. If their clinical hours for some reason, as I have explained had been delayed, they are being put into clinical hours immediately when those sites are open and available to them. Our campuses by and large have been working very, very hard with all of our clinical partners. We collectively, I speak with health systems across the city on a regular basis.

So, when those health systems allow us to get in for any of our clinical placements when they feel it is safe and they can meet the safety of their patients, their staff and certainly our students then we take advantage of those opportunities.

So, at most, the only suggestion is that we can delay that but all of those students will get those clinical requirements met at some point.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How many students have been able as dissolving's have occurred and what are the circumstances under which a healthcare facility will say, okay, we can provide these clinical hours?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: It changes based on the nature of the pandemic and the other situations, the

operational issues and other constraints by the health system. So, we have been very responsive. Some of our campuses based on what are the solutions and arrangements they have with their sites have made some accommodations but it is completely of the will and at the discretion of the clinical site. It is not up to us. When it is allowable, we have permitted our students to go onsite. Our primary objective is to maintain operation and progression of our students in these programs and for the most part, we have done this very successfully.

The only problem we have had, or actually alternative, is actually just delaying some students progression when those sites won't let us in. But as soon as the sites let us in, we go immediately and fulfill those students clinical hours. So, its really not been a matter of not doing everything on our end. It's actually just a matter of sites allowing us access.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I want to acknowledge we have been joined by Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo and I know you have a hard stop for your presentation, so I am trying to get all of my questions in.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you for your presence and your presentation. What can we do? We are creative people. I mean, we have to be able to find a way and I ask you the question because you are the professional in the field and you understand what it takes. We are not in any way talking about lowering the standards of what it takes to be a nurse because no one wants to have a healthcare provider responding to them who has not been fully prepared.

So, we are certainly not talking about cutting corners in that regard. What can we do? What is some of the out of the box thinking that we can propose and perhaps test in a pilot project to see how that works?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Well, thank you for asking. I think we have already tried and are implementing a number of innovative solutions. As Dr. Riley outlined, we are using simulation as Ms. Menendez presented we have introduced a number of alternative training models. We are working with our clinical partners if they let us in lesser numbers of students on fewer days. We work with them and we

take what we can work with that and extend our programming. In almost all cases, our campuses have reengineered our curriculum to make sure that we are allowing for the most valuable clinical experiences in any way that we can offer them.

We continue to educate and provide opportunities to support our programs. As Dr. Riley mentioned, we have initiated interprofessional at educational opportunities across our campuses. So we have 14 campuses engaged in IPE right now, which is a tremendous learning experience for our students, that's all virtually simulated.

So, we are implementing things that would have taken many, many years I think to get off the ground very quickly but they are serving as very suitable if not optimal alternatives for our students at this time. And we have looked and used every national evidence-based resource in terms of virtual simulation, virtual and online programming and also other case studies that support the clinical experiences, the critical judgement and the clinical learning needs of our students through this scenario.

Again, striking the right balance of making sure that our students are getting the proper education, are prepared for their clinical practice, not cutting any corners but being innovative in every way we can.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What would you say is the impact of COVID on the number of students who will be able to — how has the number of students — how do you project the number of students will be decreased to be able to complete their requirements and sit for their tests and actually achieve what it is that they had set for their goals?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: So, in most cases, we are able to maintain our progression of students in almost all cases. There is very few instances where students are not graduated on their scheduled graduation date but may have had to defer at graduation. Again, that's very few instances.

In some cases, we actually had early graduations for some of our programs in the spring of our final year students to advance the governors initiative to try to get folks into practice as soon as we can.

So we have met or exceeded all of the expectations in terms of student progression and at this point, as I mentioned in testimony, the admission, the enrollment in our bachelor's and masters program is up in fall of 2020, which makes us very happy. As I mentioned also, we had the highest number of graduations in spring 2020 at the height of the pandemic which I think again, demonstrates the perseverance of our students and our ability to maintain their progression in our programs.

I don't know if I can quantitatively project what the impact will be on COVID. I think what COVID is doing to the practice of education and certainly nursing is very quickly evolving it to alternative

means of delivery, obviously telepractice, telehealth and also, challenging us to use these new technologies in a way that's going to better prepare our students for this evolving landscape.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I have a few other questions I would like to pose and I will get them in quickly. I am recognizing your time and you may be the person that would have to answer these questions.

What is the number of part-time versus full-time students who are currently enrolled in the nursing programs?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I don't have a number specifically on that right at hand but I am happy to get back to you on that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and if you could, I would like to have that disaggregated by degree type as well as race, ethnicity and gender where noted.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How many students that are currently enrolled as nursing students are also working at the same time as nurses.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I don't have that data quantitatively but anecdotally, I think it's a very high number and just so you are aware, even students in our prelicensure programs are employed in many aspects of the healthcare system. So, they may be working as nursing aids, nursing assistants, unit secretaries, medical assistants. So, many of our students are actually working their way through school and many ancillary jobs in the healthcare industry.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay but if you could give me all of that data.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I am not sure how much data we actually collect on how many of our students are also actively employed but I am happy to share with you what we were able to collect.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, good. Regarding enrollment, what efforts does CUNY make to recruit a diverse pool of students in their nursing programs? Do you have affiliations with high schools or other entities that would attract? And I did hear you talk about a program that was funded, I think you said by the Robin Hood Foundation which is attracting men and

offering scholarships. I would like to hear about that as well.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: That's Dr. Riley's program. I am happy to defer to her for that but in general, we do have relationships with several high schools and other pipelines for our nursing programs. So, for example, the H.E.R.O. High School in the Bronx, which is Health Education and Research Occupations. We have a direct relationship with students that come from there through Hostos and then pursue a number of nursing, another allied health profession careers. We also have programs called college now, which actually engages with many high schools across the city to again create pipelines and tracks by healthcare and health education programming and we actually work very closely with our partners at the community level to really create as much awareness building and support and really support a lot of our entry into our associate, as well as bachelor's degree programs through those channels.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I would also put in an appeal. I will look to; I will talk to the principal also at one of the campus schools located at Thomas

Jefferson Campus. They also have a health program there and I would love for them to be able to have a direct connection to that outreach.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Thank you. I did hear you talk about the other program and the program which you said offered scholarships. We are always talking about that. We know that student loan debt is crisis levels and we need to address how we can have that but I believe I heard you say that there is a full tuition scholarship after one year and there is another program that has an actual appeal to having minority men participate.

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I will defer to my colleague Dr. Riley for that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, Dr. Riley.

MARGARET RILEY: So, I am happy to respond to that. Those are scholarships and funds that are unique to the CUNY School of Professional Studies. We solicited funding from the Petrie Foundation and over the last three years, we were able to fund a number of nursing students that graduated from our CUNY community college. That was one of the stipulations of the funding. Students who were interested in applying for this submitted an

1 application. We had a review committee evaluate the
2 students that submitted their applications and based
3 on the funds we were allocated; we were able to fund
4 about 30 students for this full tuition scholarship
5 that sustained them through the remainder of their
6 period of time earning their degree at the CUNY
7 School of Professional Studies.

8 The Career Ladders Scholarship is a new
9 initiative. Again, we secured grant funding from the
10 Robin Hood Foundation and it is targeted to recruit
11 minority men into not just nursing but also the other
12 health services administration and Health Information
13 Management program that we have at our school. And
14 we are recruiting and going to our CUNY community
15 colleges to start but we have hired a full-time
16 advisor that will also be developing a recruitment
17 plan to be able to identify students who would be
18 interested and eligible to participate in this
19 initiative.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, this is something that's
21 new and unfolding and what would be the supports that
22 students who qualify would be able to expect from the
23 program?
24
25

MARGARET RILEY: So, the students would get a limited amount of money for applying to their tuition as well as textbooks. They would also have a dedicated advisor that would work with them as they transition through the program. Programs would be alerted as to which students are qualified or receiving this, so that we could also ensure that the academic plan that's developed for them is appropriate to help them move and progress through the program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And how many students do you anticipate will be a part of that program?

MARGARET RILEY: I don't have those numbers for your right now Chair Barron but happy to provide that to Dean Boyce who will also be the funnel for getting information back to you that you are requesting.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. Now, you talked about the BSN10, when was that implemented? How long has that been in place and are students aware of these time restrictions on that program?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Yes, the legislation was signed in December of 2017. It was intended to go into effect 18 months after, which was May of 2019.

Anyone that was enrolled in a program or graduated a program at the time that it was signed into legislation or grandfathered in.

So, as of May 2019, our graduates actually need to complete a bachelor's in nursing within 10 years of graduation and we do have very active and ongoing communications across our campuses on that information. All of our Associate Degree campuses have what we call dual or joint degree pathways with our senior campuses, so that we are able to enroll our students if interested in any of our 7BS, I am sorry RN to be as completion programs.

So, we do take that very seriously at CUNY and create the pathways and bridges to make that possible for our students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, in June 25th of this year, the Chancellor issued a revised guidance for students seeking admission to CUNY's nursing programs. Consistent with the regulations of the New York State Education Department or make professional licensure available, not only to U.S. citizens but to non-citizens as long as they "not unlawfully are present in the United States", including those with DACA arrivals and those who are permanently residing

in the United States under the color of law
PROCU[SP?]. When did the New York State Education
Department institute the regulation? It appears that
it was June 1, 2016. And if so, why did it take CUNY
over four years to revise its guidance as to not to
preclude an otherwise qualified applicant from
obtaining a professional license certificate, limited
permit or registration?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Sure, I arrived at CUNY
at late summer of 2019. My understanding prior to my
arrival is that this particular policy was under
review in quite extensive ways going through a number
of different considerations with the new
administration and different immigration changes and
also doing everything we could to make sure that we
were responsive to both the mission of CUNY and the
intent of the legislation in terms of admitting
students.

Upon my arrival, I worked closely with our
campuses as well as the Office of General Counsel at
CUNY and our other immigration specialists to make
sure that we would be able to put something together
and certainly advance the policy in a way that was
reflective of the state legislation.

So, we were very happy to release this policy. Expand the opportunity for admissions to immigrant students and support what really is CUNY's mission about access.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, in accordance with the revised guidance, new nursing admission eligibility requirements apply to individuals to be admitted or advanced into a nursing program in the fall of 2020 and beyond.

And the "updated policy" does not effect students who have advanced into the clinical component of CUNY's nursing program or others considered for advancement prior to summer 2020. So, why is this program not retroactive and can you estimate how many potential nursing students or graduates missed out over the past four years?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I am sorry, I can't provide any numbers on that but I am happy to go back and see what we have on it. In general, what we were trying to do, the intent of the policy, was to create a starting point for admission. So, that all admissions would be considered using the new policy to be as inclusive as possible.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, how is CUNY making this change known to students? How are you getting the word out there this is happening?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: The expectation and in that policy was the directive to all programs to make sure that this was made clear in nursing handbooks and all admission materials online and in writing. So that every student interested in applying to a nursing program would understand the policy.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, would students perhaps now having an increased number of students perhaps applying for this program and with your testimony that there has been a steady number of students applying for enrollment, how are we going to address this increased population? You indicated that the faculty numbers really don't address or match what we need in terms of addressing the students course offerings. So, what can we do?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Right, so I think what we would most appreciate is that budget support and any funding supports to be able to expand our programs. Our programs are quite highly regarded. The admission rate, certainly the admission interest continues to go up. Again, we are only restrained by

our budget, that limits us around faculty hiring's and also what is a limitation to us, is our clinical placements and preceptor availability.

So, those are the two areas where we are actually always struggling to try to increase our admissions and they remain somewhat fixed. Clinical placement sites continue to be a challenge across all nursing programs within CUNY and outside of CUNY.

So, we do work creatively with our partners. I am working with a number of partners now to extend our clinical placements into new and expanded units at their health facilities. I am also working on creating what we call nurse externships or career readiness opportunities for our students prior to graduation.

So, we continue to explore a number of opportunities but those become relatively fixed external issues that limit our ability to increase admissions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And I see the clock is moving on, so I just wanted to — two more questions. Currently, how many faculty members instruct aspiring nurses in CUNY's nursing program and how many are

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I can get back to you on the number you requested on tenure and adjunct versus part-time full-time faculty but your question about attracting nurses to the field. We have a number of pathways to do that. We have increased our master's programs, so that creates opportunities for additional practice and opportunities for nurses in the field to engage with us on that. We also engage a number of different clinical lectures as well as clinical adjunct faculty and hope to engage them in faculty appointments over time.

So, that creates a pipeline for us as well.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great, you have about two minutes and I do want to recognize that Council Member Rodriguez has his hand raised and that might be a question that he might want to address to you. So, Council Member Rodriguez, you have to be brief and to the point with your question. Thank you.

If the host could acknowledge Council Member Rodriguez.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Rodriguez, do you see the unmute box?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Council Member Rodriguez are you ready for your question? One of our panelists has to leave in about two minutes.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: There we go.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah but we should have enough time to ask a question Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, you can ask your question. Go right ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First question is, having CUNY to establish what used to be [LOST AUDIO 1:14:32-01:42:42]. Now the formal CUNY [LOST AUDIO 1:14:47-1:14:58] including nursing?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: I apologize the sound quality was not very clear on my end. If you could possibly repeat that question.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Having [INAUDIBLE 1:15:13] turning to be the CUNY School of Medicine, does it make sense that CUNY was centralizing programs and be centralized by the new formal CUNY School of Medicine?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Just to clarify, I hear you asking a question about the CUNY School of Medicine. I am not understanding the part of what you are asking about about centralizing something at CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Your transmission is rather spotty Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: LOST AUDIO 1:15:47-1:15:55] What is it Chairman? Can you hear me?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Rodriguez, it seems you have a bad signal.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Can you hear me now? Can you hear me better now?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: It is in and out.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Let me call back. Let me reconnect again.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, he will call back in but just generally, I do want to excuse you from your presentation on this panel. I want to respect your time as well and the other members will be remaining, is that correct?

PATRICIA SIMINO BOYCE: Yes, thank you very much. I appreciate your consideration and we are happy to get back to you with any information you request. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great, thank you. Thank you so much.

So, I do have more questions. How does CUNY work to attract distinguished faculty who are able to make more money working as a nurse than perhaps being on the faculty. How can we address that and it was a question that was partially addressed by Dean Boyce in her presentation.

MARGARET RILEY: I can try to address that Chair Barron. In general, pay in the clinical and healthcare settings is significantly greater than the scale of pay that faculty receive working in an academic setting. There are some initiatives that have been promoted to attract faculty and that is

usually done by appealing to faculty from other academic setting, advertising and recruiting for unique programs and positions that are hosted at particular schools. That is usually done at a point of hire when a faculty line becomes available or a Dean or Director or Chairperson shift becomes available, those efforts are made.

In general, advertising for faculty is done in academic journals as well as in a series of well respected and typical areas where faculty would look for positions.

We also appeal to faculty that are working in clinical roles, at which there are many with whom we engage and many who then chose to pursue further academic degrees and those are also people that we reach out to in an effort to engage with them and have them participate in our academic endeavors with our students.

It is truly a partnership. We do have full-time faculty working in our settings but we also rely on and require the partnership and collaboration of our many, many clinical faculty who work with us as adjuncts and who bring a skill set practice in the real world in the real clinical setting that is

invaluable. So, we look at it as a partnership as well.

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: In Queensborough, we actually have five of our full-time faculty started out at Queensborough and got their education here and went on and feel very committed to our program and have come back now with faculty.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And so, what type of supports do you offer for students, particularly during this time of the pandemic? What kinds of support, academic support, financial support, mental support? We know that there is a great push on this great stress that they are enduring, so what types of support are you offering to your students at this time?

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: I can speak at Queensborough. Under the new leadership of our new president, Dr. Mangino, we have a large food bank and we moved it to a central location to make it more available and to widely advertise it to our students. I am proud of that.

We have an extensive online counseling department and I have made sure to all of our nursing students

that that link has been sent to them where they can actually have virtual.

We have an extensive mentorship program at Queensborough which is funded by the Petrie Foundation. So, students having get - uhm, Queensborough was very generous in providing a substantial PPE which I started ordering early in May, so we would have it available for our faculty of students that were able to go back into the clinical this fall.

In addition, Queensborough has been very generous because the pause online and the issue that we found with a lot of students, did not have the proper laptops or computers. So, Queensborough was very generous. We actually filled out the statistics and the settings and the programs that they needed specifically to be successful and a number of our nursing students receipts, which we mailed to their homes, so they could succeed or continue in the program.

Our faculty you know, with our online actually meet with the students even though in March we had to go online. Faculty would meet with the students on a

regular day. They didn't just you now, let them go themselves, they actually sat with them. They met with them, they reflected. So, I think we have given a lot of support you know, since the pandemic has hit but we do understand that it has been very, very challenging.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And in terms of students who might have special needs, students that are -

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: Well, we do yeah, at Queensborough, we have -

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [INAUDIBLE 1:22:09]. Yes.

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: We do provide, I am sorry. So, you are asking for students with special needs. We do have a student's uhm, a disabilities office and we do encourage nursing students who might need specifications to seek out the help in that office and we do provide special accommodations for our nursing students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, oh, okay. I believe that Council Member Rodriguez is back on, so I will allow him to pose his questions at this time.

So, if the host would - thank you.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Chair. So, my question was since we have what used to be the Sofie Davis School of Medicine now is the formal CUNY School of Medicine. Does it make sense that the CUNY School of Medicine should centralize everything related to nursing programs let alone the community college, senior college in all comports of CUNY?

MARGARET RILEY: So, with respect Council Member, the discipline of medicine and the discipline of nursing are separate. We are collaborative partners in the healthcare setting.

So, the CUNY School of Medicine is focused on educating future physicians while the CUNY schools of nursing of which there are many, are focused on educating the future nurses who will go into the healthcare world.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, sorry for the purpose of time. It is no intention to cut you off but where do we centralize and since we have the formal School of Medicine, and I get I used to be a teacher for 15 years and I used to be a student when we were trying to preserve the city college and School of Nursing that unfortunately also was eliminated in the past. One of the challenges that

we face about from where do we centralize all the programs on nursing and if we have a School of Medicine at CUNY, does it make sense that all programs of nursing also should be centralized for the school, in that school?

MARGARET RILEY: With respect, the CUNY School of Medicine focuses on the education of decisions. We have a centralized focus through the CUNY Office of the Dean of Health and Human Services, Dr. Patty Boyce who testified here today. We also have a CUNY nursing Discipline Council, which is comprised of the membership of all the Deans, Directors and Chairpersons of all the CUNY nursing programs.

So, we do have a centralized and collaborative process for determining policy for examining best practices and for implementing program changes and others.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Is there a program of nursing at the CUNY School of Medicine where it used to be Sophie Davis?

MARGARET RILEY: There is no school of nursing at the CUNY School of Medicine.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay, how much does it cost at CUNY to graduate a student on the nursing program?

MARGARET RILEY: I could not provide you with those numbers but we are happy to have Dean Boyce collect all of the requests for further information and she will be happy to provide that to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay, we do agree that those feel like right now a student of the School of Engineer is double – it costs CUNY double from what a student as my major of political science is today. Do you know that it costs more or you don't have any idea if it costs more for CUNY to graduate a student of a nursing program?

MARGARET RILEY: I could not provide you with those numbers at this time but we would be happy to identify that information and provide it through Dean Boyce to Chair Barron and to yourself as to the specific information you wish.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay, which hospital are partners of the nursing program of CUNY?

MARGARET RILEY: I am sorry, could you repeat the question sir?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Which hospitals does CUNY have as partners for the nursing program?

MARGARET RILEY: Which hospitals, is that the question?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.

MARGARET RILEY: We have affiliation agreements with multiple facilities throughout New York City and New York State including —

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Can you name a few of those?

MARGARET RILEY: All 11 Health + Hospitals facilities. We also have alignments with New York Presbyterian, Mount Sinai. Anne Marie, do you have any others that you can call?

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: Yeah, we have affiliations with the Northwell system, which has a number of facilities on the Long Island Jewish Northwell Manhasset, Play Stream Franklin. We also have affiliations with NYU Winthrop and of course city Health + Hospital Center, Elmhurst. We have affiliations with Jamaica Hospital and with Flushing Hospital. And connections with the nursing home; however, we have not been able to return to the nursing homes since March of last year.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Is Harlem also part of the hospital that —

MARGARET RILEY: Yes it is.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you guys. Thank you. It's a great program and unfortunately we saw some cuts in the past and I hope again, my question of how much it costs, because I know that we have to do our part from the legislative role to increase the funding especially in the science and engineer that it costs more to CUNY to graduate a student in that field than a student who graduate in liberal art but thank you for that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Council Member Rodriguez for your questions and to the panel. I just have a few more questions before I will move onto the next panel.

So, what is the status of for those 200 students at Lehman who are not able to sit for the exam and which I understand you are in fact appealing that decision and in that process. What's the financial impact on those students if they had thought that they would be finished with their program in June, do they now have to pay tuition, maintenance fee or do they have to enroll to maintain their status as a

student? What's the impact on those 200 students financially in terms of course work as well?

MARGARET RILEY: It is my understanding Chair Barron that the students can proceed to graduate. The certification exam is something that they take on conclusion of graduation. To the best of my knowledge, the students would still be able to proceed with that but I believe that Dean Boyce would probably have the best information for you in regard to the details.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Alright, then I do have a series of questions related to that but we will pose them to her afterwards since she would be the person with the most accurate information on that. Because I also wanted to know, were there any indicators that Lehman's class in 2019 was a little below the mark? Were there any indicators and what's being done now to make sure that for this class, the next class, it does sit for exam, that they meet that minimum standard of 80 percent. Is that also questions that Dean Boyce would have the answer to?

MARGARET RILEY: I think those are very good questions to ask Chair Barron. Again, not being

1
2 privy to the details. I believe that Dean Boyce
3 would be the best one to be able to respond to those
4 specifics.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and then just for the
6 record, I want to put this question on, which
7 probably would also be answered by Dean Boyce and it
8 regards LaGuardia Community College nursing students
9 that had contacted my office previously about an
10 ongoing issue that was first raised during the final
11 term of my predecessor, my husband who was then
12 Council Member Charles Barron. And students were
13 concerned that their final grades in a course while
14 enrolled in a nursing program and we worked with them
15 but we never -- the resolution was that they might
16 have to retake the course.

17 So, I just want the question on the record so
18 that I could have a response. What was the final
19 outcome for those students and did they take the SCR
20 to 90 and if not, were they reimbursed? Did those
21 students graduate and did they pass their Kaplan
22 review class and were they able to take their State
23 Board Exam? So, just to have those questions on the
24 record to have them responded to.
25

MARGARET RILEY: I am not familiar with those details Chair Barron. So, I believe that Dean Boyce would be the best one to be able to gather that information and respond to those questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uhm, I will ask the host, are there any other Council Members who have questions?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: There are no other hands raised at this time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you so much and that concludes the questions that I have for this panel. I want to thank you for coming and for your testimony and you are dismissed. Thank you so much and the host will call the next panel. Thank you.

MARGARET RILEY: Thank you very much for your time.

ANNE MARIE MENENDEZ: Thank you Chair Barron and Committee.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Barron.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Now, that we have concluded CUNY's testimony, we will turn to public testimony.

First, I would like to remind everyone that I will call up individuals in panels. Once your name is called, a member of our staff will unmute you and you may begin your testimony once the Sergeant at Arms sets the clock and gives you the queue.

All testimony will be limited to three minutes. Remember that there is a few second delay when you are unmuted before we can hear you. Please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to announce that you may begin before starting your testimony. The first panel of public testimony in order of speaking will be Juvanie Piquant Chair of the University Student Senate, Sumana Ali Vice President for Academic and Legislative Affairs at the University Student Senate. JD Vasquez Nursing Student and Amina Emmanuel[SP?] also a nursing student. I will now call on Chair Piquant.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

JUVANIE PIQUANT: Good morning Chair Barron and the Committee on Higher Education. My name is Juvanie Piquant and I currently serve as a Chairperson of University Student Senate. I am a Student Trustee at CUNY. At the University Student

Senate, we are the student body voice for all 500,000 students at the City University of New York advocating for the progression of affordability of higher education.

I would like to give Chair Barron a thank you for holding an oversight hearing on nursing programs at CUNY. Being that we know just not nursing programs in general but STEM degrees as a whole have taken a pivot and a change throughout the pandemic. Most of these courses are heavily involved with in person interaction and on campus learning and these times have drastically changed for our students which has affected their social and academic performance throughout CUNY. The impact of higher education during COVID-19 has greatly affected students throughout their mental health concerns. Have created hardships through financial food and housing insecurity. A lack of support and advisement providing in STEM degrees across CUNY are greatly paramount to the issues that students face. And I heard from our administration, we kind of spoke about the statistics about diversity that we have at CUNY but I do want to highlight the disparities that are still present even in the field of STEM.

A reporter from this city Gabe L. Sandoval wrote an article last month discussing the CUNY STEM graduates. His founding's found that STEM graduates nearly doubled in the last decade but disparities still persist. A study collected from the center of an urban future found that CUNY students were earning STEM degrees rose up to 9,013 degrees last year. But CUNY's Black and Hispanic students earned 31 percent of computer science degrees last year while representing 55 percent of the student body.

In the same year, 19 percent of computer science degrees were awarded to women while women comprise of 58 percent of the CUNY student population overall.

Most underrepresented women were Hispanic and earned 7 percent of all STEM degrees and 4 percent of degrees in technology. Hispanic women make up 18 percent of the CUNY student body and I think it is important for us to understand the lack of disparities and as we Segway to what the losing of the accreditation and the masters of family practitioner at Lehman College, what we have heard from students is a lack of a ray of things that have also effected their academic journey and their pursuing of the nursing degree at Lehman College.

Many students advocated and spoke about the lack of cultural affirmation and these strenuous and rigorous programs support and mental health concerns and also financial and food insecurity that are heavily prevalent to our students that we face. Many students express that it was very hard to get through the semester and the lack of support for our students such as mental health is a huge factor especially during these times when taking such rigorous courses and clinical hours throughout a virtual pandemic.

The undergraduate masters and family nurse practitioner degree at Lehman College, I believe from my recollection from my research –

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

JUVANIE PIQUANT: It is the only degree program that CUNY has with this accreditation. And I think that the questions that Chair Barron asked in terms of the disparities and the racial disparities within the program. I think that it will be greatly helpful if we can receive that information because I have done my research and I couldn't find the disparities across in terms of the degrees that are awarded and also how are we supporting the students? I think a

concept of centralized marketing and ensuring that students are supported and communication is going to be seamless and consistent and effective to our students is what we are also calling for.

Additional funding for our nursing programs within CUNY and also support services to help students sustain themselves throughout these programs are some of the demands that the university student senate has and we look forward to working with the CUNY administration to provide a more holistic journey into the degrees of pursuing STEM at the Senior University of New York. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Next, we will have Sumana Ali, Vice President of USS.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

SUMANA ALI: Thank you. Good morning City Council Members. My name is Sumana Ali, I am the Vice Chair of Legislative Affairs at CUNY University Senate and I am also a student government member at Lehman College. Thank you for holding this hearing on nursing programs at CUNY.

Lehman College is one of the most diverse community colleges and it serves a diverse group of

minority communities who play a vital role in this city every day.

Approximately 56 percent of Lehman students are Hispanic and 27 percent of Lehman students are African American. Additionally, 67 percent of our students are female. The majority of the Lehman students reside in the Bronx in communities that have been marginalized because of their race and socioeconomic status. COVID-19 and generational injustice have plagued our communities every day.

In the middle of this dire economic and public health crisis, CUNY students face tuition hikes, loss of employment and now loss of accreditation in our programs.

According to the CUNY Lehman statistics, nursing program is one of the most declared majors among undergraduate and graduate students and Lehman produces passionate healthcare workers who support the city and are now needed in the city more than ever before.

There is approximately 220 students in the Lehman nursing program and 44 of the students are now set to complete the program in December 2020 and graduate in

2021 January. In late November last month, Lehman College announced that nursing students will not be certified by the CCNE anymore and uhm, it was decided that the CCNE will withdrawal their accreditation of Lehman nursing program the FNP program. It's a master's program and uhm, because of a mere technicality, now 44 FNP program who are ready to graduate will not be allowed to take their certification exam.

This may look like a small number; however, these students in the FNP program completed over 500 hours of clinical time with direct patient care and many of these students are also working full-time while meeting these rigorous requirements. Family nurse practitioners can see patients of all ages, all illnesses and even prescribe medication. They must get a chance to take their certification exam at the end of this year. They are graduating during a pandemic or the city needs more healthcare workers but they can practice with their degrees as of now.

At the least, the commission on collegiate nursing education should allow these students —

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

SUMANA ALI: To sit on their certification exam. The students in Lehman are only asking for a chance to sit in the exam and serve the city. Our students now need the city's support and because of what's happening in our nursing program and I believe this is a great injustice to minority students. After countless barriers, the students finish their program requirements and they don't even have the chance to now sit in their exam.

They need their college administrators and elected representatives to deliver a result by the end of this month and it is simply unacceptable that even one FNP student at Lehman is denied the right for this exam let alone 44. This is the time for action and if you do say that you care about healthcare workers and minority students, this is the time to prove that you do care about their time and you care about the money and the investment they have made in CUNY. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Unfortunately both J.D. Vasquez and Amina Emmanuel logged out of the Zoom meeting and so, we are next going to call up Anne Bove and Marina Aminova. Anne

Bove Assistant Professor of Nursing at BMCC. You may begin once the Sergeant gives you the queue.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

ANNE BOVE: Okay, my name is Anne Bove, I am actually a product of CUNY times three generic as well as two master's. I am also retired from Bellevue Hospital after 40 years of service and currently in BMCC faculty.

I am here as a member of the Board of Directors from NYSIM and I submitted a very detailed testimony with regards to what I am going to say so I am going to cut to the chase. Basically, nursing education and training move from schools of nursing to the academic setting in the late 60's early 70's. When that transition happened, training was at a loss. And through the years in terms of complimenting the needing for training, hospital settings have picked it up. Who has picked it up in the City of New York primarily is New York City Health + Hospitals. And it takes about three months to orient the average new graduate upon arrival to the hospital setting. Which ends up being in today's world about \$30,000 that the hospitals are picking up.

Subsequent to that, we also don't have the resources in terms of staff education accordingly. So, uhm, the new graduate is coming in and looking for jobs where the private sector actually directs that new graduate and its been my witness to the fact, to the public sector for training accordingly.

Subsequently, what I would like - not just myself but many of us who came from the hospital based training framework is a better bridge between academia and the hospital setting as seen by something known as the Vermont Nurse Internship Program.

Also, in terms of what was holding up transition into you know, going back to the clinical setting, was the idea of face mask fit testing and that's where coordination from a centralized framework is to me vitally important, so that you would have face masks for testing for the N95 and subsequently be done by the schools so that we quick transition into that clinical setting accordingly. And also in terms of supplementing the educational process that needs to be done for training in the hospitals by getting access to graduate medical education money as the medical schools have as well.

So, this has been a problem prior to COVID and it has been totally exponentially increased as a result of COVID. Thank you for this time for testimony.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for testifying.

Next, we have Ms. Aminova.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

MARINA AMINOVA: Good morning everyone. I would like to thank you for allowing me to speak today about the events circling my school. My name is Marina Aminova, I am one of the 45 students at Lehman College as Graduate Family Nurse Practitioner program scheduled to graduate in just two weeks.

I graduated at Adelphi University in 2009 and receive my bachelor's degree in nursing. I have worked as a registered nurse in both the community and the hospital. During this time, I also started a family like many of my other fellow colleagues did as well.

I entered Lehman College in the summer of 2018 in the dream of becoming a family nurse practitioner. Many of my fellow graduate students started at the same time as I did and some even before me. Many took out student loans and other used their life savings to pursue our degree. Even though we all

came from different walks of life, we all became friends. We shared our struggles and supported each other when it was hard to juggle family life, working full time, attending school and at the same time studying hard. This year hit us strong. All of us equally. The coronavirus pandemic was nothing like we had ever expected or imagined. Every where we turned patients were dying in our units. Nurses were needed to work overtime. We were scared, we were exhausted and we were vulnerable however, it did not deter us.

We knew our path in life as nurses. There is no other profession like it. We lost family members. We experienced dark moments, all the while we were still attending school and still completing hundreds upon hundreds of clinical hours needed to graduate in the most impoverished county in the state during the worst pandemic in the century.

Our December graduation was our only light at the end of a very long dark tunnel. On November 20th, our dreams became a living nightmare. We were informed by Lehman that we have lost accreditation. We were weeks prior to our graduation. We do not

know the details about what happened and we were only made aware by chance when our fellow students and May cohort began to apply for their awards only to be rejected over the summer due to a loss of accreditation in June.

Frazzled and confused, we began to email our department heads. We were told everything will be okay and continue to keep studying hard. As the school secured an appeals hearing in November and were confident it was going to go in their favor but on November 20th, we face the horrifying reality these last years, years of hard work sacrificed time away from spouses, parents and our children. Time away from work forgone income, paid tuition, tireless studying has all been for nothing.

The fact that this matter resonates beyond the student body and our families is evidence by the media attention this matter has generated and the significant number of signatures our online petition has approved. Our communities are just as devastated and effected by this horrific news. It is as much of a loss to them as it is to us.

We learned so far that in 2017, CCNE made Lehman aware of a standard that was not met to keep

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

We were notified by the Dean that a letter was sent out CCNE requesting to postpone the 20th – November 20th accreditation to February, so that we can finish a school that was CCNE approved. They are holding a meeting today, the Board of Commissioners at CCNE. However, we were notified by the Dean that CCNE has every right to deny our requests. I would also like to point out that while graduating in New York State, we have a valid degree. Graduating without CCNE accreditation is not an option. We are not allowed to build Medicare and Medicaid. Nobody will hire us without being board certified and the only thing we will have is just a valid degree hanging on our walls. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony and as it seems that we only have one more person logged in to testify, we will go to that person. In the meantime, if I have inadvertently missed anyone, please use the raise hand function in Zoom. So, next we will have Sanai Seo[SP?]. You may begin when the Sergeant gives you the queue.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sanai Seo, are you present? There should be a window popping up on your computer asking you to unmute yourself. Unfortunately, we will move on and Sanai, if you come back, please use the raise hand function in Zoom. I will turn to Chair Barron for questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Ms. Rivera. You are doing a great job juggling and getting everyone on. I want to thank this panel because this is a panel and I am also appreciative to the fact that the CUNY personnel are still here to be able to hear personally what your testimony has been.

Talking about first the underrepresentation of the Black and Brown communities. We are glad to hear that CUNY exceeds what is nationally the standard and

1 statewide the standard. That's good news and I think
2 we are looking to the broad field of science,
3 technology and math and the underrepresentation in
4 that part. But certainly as we have heard from Ms.
5 Ali about the percentages. I think she cited 56
6 percent Latin and 27 percent African American and
7 talked about all of the hikes in tuition and the
8 stress and all that has been endured by these
9 students that are working so hard and certainly, Ms.
10 Aminova, I am not sure if I got the name properly,
11 brought it home because she is directly impacted by
12 that.
13

14 So, I do have a couple of questions as well. Ms.
15 Anne Bove, I am not sure of the correct
16 pronunciation, please give it to me. You talked
17 about the Vermont Nurse Intern program. If you could
18 speak a little about that, I would like information
19 on that.

20 ANNE BOVE: That is a program that was
21 established maybe 20 years ago and what Vermont did
22 as a small state was it took the State Education
23 Department as well as the schools in terms of faculty
24 and students, as well as the clinical setting in
25

terms of the healthcare agencies with administration, clinical educators and then staff to put together how to make a seamless transition from the academic setting to the clinical setting.

As I mentioned to you, it takes about three months for an average orientation from mid surge and since now what's considered nursing education and training is in the academic setting, funding does not go to the hospital anymore to provide the appropriate and staffing for that training.

So, what this group did is they developed a seamless transitional preceptor type presentation and New York City Health + Hospitals about maybe 15 years ago, you know looked at that and instituted a preceptor program accordingly but once again funding is an issue because you have to provide staff. And when you are developing a preceptor program, that orientee is not counted in the numbers as a direct care provider, so basically that's where the \$30,000 comes as well as the added professional development through instructors by staff development that needs to be.

1
2 ANNE BOVE: Yes. Yes, they cannot [INAUDIBLE
3 1:57:00]. So, they can't be -- it's not like you
4 know, I wasn't in that. I went to Hunter. I
5 graduated now, I will tell you, 1978. So, I did
6 supplementary practice on weekends. Like they had
7 programs where you could supplement your training.
8 But if a new graduate goes through a nursing program,
9 there is somebody by the name of Patricia Benner and
10 she recognized the concept of nova's to expert. And
11 when they come out as nova's you know as a new
12 graduate; they are not skilled to take care of the
13 full role of a registered nurse at that time. And
14 that's that the orientation is all about.

15 You know there clinical experience is one to two
16 patients and even if we get nurse patient ratios
17 passed in New York State, they are able to and much
18 more limited now in terms of coming out and taking
19 that full patient assignment.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, that's new information
21 to me and that's helpful and you say that that
22 process costs the hospital about \$30,000?

23 ANNE BOVE: That is, that's including salary and
24 benefits and uhm, and also the salaries of those
25

people in staff development that are bringing along this orientation process.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you that's helpful to know. Uhm, I wanted to ask Ms. Aminova and please give me the correct pronunciation. What is the status now? What can you expect as a part of that group of people who were denied the opportunity to even sit for the exam. What is your status? What is your expectation? What are your plans? What can be done to bring pressure to there? What kinds of alternative platforms or systems can be used from your perspective?

MARINA AMINOVA: Well, truth be told, we don't really know what options we have. We are being told that we can go ahead and graduate and receive our degree. However, when we spoke with CCNE, they told us that if you do that and Lehman one day in the future receives accreditation again, we will be excluded from sitting for the boards. So, if we decide to chose that route, there is really not much we can do and there is only three states in this country where you are legally allowed to practice. That's New York, California and I believe Arkansas.

So, I am not really sure what they are arguing with AANP. Honestly, we don't really know what other choices we have and that's what we are trying to figure out because time is of the essence for us. We are literally 15 days away. We don't know if we should postpone graduation. Is there a point to

postpone? If we postpone in six months, people have student loans that they need to begin to pay.

You know, we spent this money on this degree and now we won't have the income to recoup what we invested. We don't really know where we stand and that's why we are trying to reach out to anybody that will listen. We reached out to CCNE, we reached out to ANCC, to AANP, to NYSNA, to ANA. I mean, whoever you can think of, we reached out to them for help because we don't know what to do at this point.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, uhm, is Lehman the only school that offers this masters in NFP?

MARINA AMINOVA: The only CUNY school, yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yeah, CUNY school yes.

MARINA AMINOVA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Because I was wondering since we have pathways and since we have this transfer system within CUNY as a university-wide system might there be some way to transfer it to another institution campus but if you are the only one then that's apparently not something that could happen.

MARINA AMINOVA: Well, we also asked the school if they could help us transfer to any school in New York State, even a SUNY School. There are two SUNY schools that have it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, who are those?

MARINA AMINOVA: Downstate and Stonebrook. And we were told that if you want to transfer, that is your decision. We will not help you in that. That is what our Dean of Nursing said. So, we are on our own with that and when we looked into SUNY Schools and any other private school for that matter, the maximum transfer credits there are willing to take is nine credits.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Hmm, hmmm.

MARINA AMINOVA: So, that's not an option either. We would be starting all over.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I would think that you know, with a SUNY School, had there been one, I would think that might have been a path that we might pursue but I think you could understand that another institution outside of CUNY might be reluctant to take someone that they haven't had any affiliation with based on the fact that they are coming from a school that has

lost their accreditation. I could understand why they would be hesitant to say oh, okay come on and we will make any kind of transfer arrangements so that you can sit, because I think they might be fearful that that might negatively impact their results.

MARINA AMINOVA: That's what we thought as well and all the more reason and we were told by ANCC, which is the testing body that Lehman can secure a deal with CCNE to have a good cause extension and vise versa, when we spoke to CCNE Associate Director, they told us that Lehman can secure a deal with ANCC to allow us to be grandfathered in and make an exception for us. And it seems like the examination body and the accrediting body are pointing fingers at each other and Lehman is in the center that has to secure deals. And I don't know what kind of deals they are securing past the letter that they sent.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And do you know what this good cause extension would do?

MARINA AMINOVA: It would postpone the November 20th withdrawal to February 21st.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

MARINA AMINOVA: That's the good cause.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I see.

MARINA AMINOVA: For the sake of our cohort to be

—

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That cohort could then take the exam.

MARINA AMINOVA: Yes, and we can graduate from an accredited school and higher education, if we wanted to pursue other routes, like we were thinking, maybe we can pursue our DNP, maybe we can get a post master's degree. All of those schools that we looked into, both state schools, private schools and online schools all require you to have a master's degree from a CCNE accredited school. So, we can't even pursue higher education.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The prerequisite for all the other ideas that you are talking about. Okay, uhm, well, we have got to think deep as you say, the clock is ticking the sands are running through the hour glass and I am sure that we can put our heads together. Perhaps need to reach out to assembly members and state senators in their capacity as state legislators to add their voices to this issue, which as you have indicated is fairly recent in coming to our attention but we need to put our heads together and come up with something.

So, I would like to offer some time on Monday for us to brainstorm or whoever is taking the lead on this, how we can be supportive in raising the critical nature of this situation, particularly in this time of COVID and get some resolution that resolves this – that brings us a resolution that benefits the students that have as you have so adequately talked about, invested so much, so much into getting to this point.

But I just want to thank the panel for their testimony and again, my office, I am ready to give whatever assistance I can to get the resolution to this.

MARINA AMINOVA: Can I ask you how I can follow up with either you or anybody else in regards to what kind of decisions and discussions will take place in the upcoming weeks?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh, yes, you can reach out my staff. You can reach out to the CUNY Staff or my staff, you can text mwashington, not text, email, I am sorry, mwashington@council.nyc.gov and perhaps Ms. Rivera will be able to offer another contact with the City Council. Okay, thank you. I will turn it back now to the Moderator Ms. Rivera.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Barron. I would just like to make one more call for Sanai Seo. A member of our staff is trying to unmute you, if you can accept and present your testimony.

Alright, seeing that Sanai Seo is unresponsive, I am going to ask if any Council Members have any questions at this time for this panel?

Not seeing any Council Members logged in, I would like to remind everyone that if they would like to submit written testimony, they may do so within 72 hours of this hearing date by emailing testimony@council.nyc.gov and uhm – and we have now concluded this hearing. Chair Barron.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very much and with that, I declare that this hearing is adjourned and thank you so much to all the staff that worked so diligently behind the scenes making this hearing possible. Thank you. [GAVEL].

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Okay, we have ended the live. Thank you so much Chair Barron. Thank you everyone.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I want to thank again the CUNY panel for being here and for staying and hearing for the testimony. I don't know, we have

got to do something to help these students you know, get the ability, the opportunity to at least sit for the exam. I don't know who else we can reach out to and again, the point that she raised was interesting to me. Yes, NY State Education Department - they cannot grant them the accreditation that they need. That's what I understood the last student to say. So, I don't know how we can appeal to the CCNE which it appears as the final body that can make this determination.

But I look forward to working with you and continuing to be able to uh, help solve this issue. Thank you.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you everyone. We are going to close out the Zoom.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Have a great weekend.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 18, 2021