

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

December 11, 2020
Start: 10:15 a.m.
Recess: 12:24 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: Inez Barron
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Laurie Cumbo
Alan Maisel
Ydanis Rodriguez
Eric Ulrich

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Patricia Cimino Boyce, University Dean for the
Health and Human Services
CUNY

Margaret Riley, Academic Director of Nursing
Programs

Annmarie Menendez, Professor and Nursing Chair
Queensborough Community College

Juwanie Piquant, Chair
University Student Senate

Sumana Ali, Vice Chair of Legislative Affairs
CUNY University Senate

Student Government Member
Lehman College

Anne Bove, Assistant Professor
BMCC

Board of Directors
NYCNA

Marina Aminova, Student
Lehman College

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Are you ready with the recording?

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: PC recording is going.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Jamaya?

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The cloud is going.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Backup is rolling.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Keith, are you ready with the opening?

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Yes. Thank you.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Welcome to the remote hearing on higher education. While Council members and staff please turn on their videos at this time? Thank you. To minimize disruption, please place all cell phones and electronics to vibrate. You may send your testimony at testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is testimony@council.nyc.gov. Chair Barron, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning and thank you. Well, thank you for joining today's virtual committee hearing from the Higher Education on the status of nursing programs at the City University. I am Council member Inez Barron, Chair

of the Committee on Higher Education, and a proud CUNY alumna. Thank you to everyone that I see here today who is ready to testify on that is incredibly important event and timely topic. Healthcare is one of the most rapidly expanding industries in the country and, within it, registered nurses, RNs, comprised the largest population profession. In New York City, CUNY is a major source of both new nurses to the local healthcare industry, as well as career ladder opportunities for eventually practicing registered nurses, RNs. 14 CUNY schools offer nursing degree programs with certificates and degrees ranging from the Associate of Applied Science, AAS, in nursing to the Doctorate in Nursing Practice, DNP. At the committee's last hearing on this topic which was more than four years ago in 2016, the committee was interested in learning about CUNY's efforts to increase the number of nursing graduates to meet projected demands. Between the aging baby boomer generation, high rates of retirement among nurses, dramatic increase in the number of people accessing healthcare over the passage of the Affordable Care Act, and an increasing reliance on nurses in the healthcare delivery system, healthcare industry

experts are sounding the alarm of a looming nursing shortage crisis. At that hearing in 2016, CUNY testified about its efforts to increase Associates in Nursing degrees, AND, Bachelors, BS, degrees, and master's degree program graduates with a trend towards a more highly educated nursing workforce and a goal to have 80 percent of all undergraduate nursing degrees be a Bachelor of Science degree by 2020. Related matters were discussed at a subsequent hearing on pursuing healthcare careers at CUNY in January 2019. Over the most recent seven year reporting period, CUNY graduated approximately 1700 nurses and all degree levels annually.

Unfortunately, this represents an overall drop with the peak of 2025 degrees awarded in the 2013 to 2014 academic year. Part of the American Association of College of Nursing, we need to understand that, while applications to the nursing degree programs have been steady, a lack of faculty, clinical sites, classroom space, clinical preceptors and budget constraints have limited enrollment in nursing programs nationally. Today, as the city anticipates a second wave of the coronavirus, it must understand the full scope of CUNY's consortium of nursing programs and

the challenges they face. I think it's safe to say that we all remember the sound of incessant sirens from ambulances carrying infected patients during the first wave when New York-- Queens to be more exact-- was identified as a national epicenter of the coronavirus. On March 7th, Governor Andrew Cuomo issued an Executive Order declaring a state disaster emergency for the entire state of New York. By March 11th, the Governor announced that CUNY would implement distance learning effective March 19th. Not even three weeks after the state of emergency was declared, about half of the more than 74,000 known cases in the country were in New York, which was almost 10 times more than any other state. Meanwhile, American medical experts were scrambling to study the virus, learning new indicators, and better understanding its contagion factor every day. And hospitals were ill-prepared to battle the influx of highly contagious patients. In a video published by the New York Times on March 25th, an emergency room doctor exposed the overcrowded conditions and lack of PPE at Health and Hospitals Elmhurst Hospital, the so-called epicenter of the epicenter. In her video, Dr. Colleen Smith makes a plea for help

saying that the emergency department is seeing 400+ patients a day, nearly twice the normal complement, while supplies dwindled and an increasing number of people wait for medical assessments. Doctors, nurses, and other workers at hospitals and clinics were overworked and stretched thin. Many got sick, risk to their health and safety of their families and loved ones, and some died. By mid-April, for nearly a week straight, between 700 and 800 people were dying in the city every day. To meet that dire need for healthcare workers, the Governor issued additional executive orders. One that allowed students in programs to become licensed in the state to practice as healthcare professionals and to volunteer at a healthcare facility for educational credit as if the students had secured a placemat under a [inaudible 00:07:02] agreement without entering into any such clinical affiliation agreement. And another Executive Order permitted graduates of registered professional nurses and licensed practical nurses' licensure to qualify for educational programs registered by the state education employment to be employed to practice nursing under the supervision of a registered

professional nurse and with the endorsement of the employing hospital or nursing home for 180 days immediately following graduation. Even so, during this time, most clinical training for students in healthcare fields effectively came to a halt. In mid-May, an accelerated Bachelor of Nursing Student at CUNY's Lehman College emailed Speaker Cory Johnson lamenting the lack of an alternative to completing a clinical experience in their program. The student was eager to complete their education and apply their knowledge to join the front lines amid the pandemic. More recently, Lehman College announced that, in June 2020, the National Commission of Collegiate Nursing Education, CCNE, withdrew accreditation of its nursing family nurse practitioner Master of Science program. That's the MSNP. That was because the Commission of Collegiate Nursing Education requires a certificate-- a certification pass rate of 80 percent or higher in order for institutions to continue their accreditation and, with a 78 percent pass rate for calendar year 2019, Lehman College's program was two percentage points short. The school appealed that decision, but the CCNE's board denied the appeal leaving more than 200 registered nurses

enrolled in the program unable to sit for their certification exam. As a change.org petition started by MSSNP student, JD Vasquez, who I believe is here today, put it, quote, in the year of the nurse [inaudible 00:09:26] is an injustice. Nurses risk their lives working tirelessly during the coronavirus pandemic and subsequently provided over 500 hours of additional patient care during their clinical rotations, overcoming unthinkable obstacles, and making unparalleled sacrifices only to learn, four weeks before graduation, that it was all for a profession that they would never get to practice in. during that first wave, more than 4000 so-called traveling nurses from all over the country came to New York City and hospitals are planning to, once again, utilize traveling nurses. But as Covid cases spike in other cities, New York will have to compete with high demand during what healthcare experts are saying will be a very deadly winter. But from what I can tell, we have hundreds of nursing students on the brink of graduation ready to step up and join the front lines of the pandemic in New York City. As the former epicenter of the epidemic, we don't know what the near future holds for our city, so we must first

prioritize graduating our nursing students, especially when it comes to administering advanced nursing degrees. For those students who worked hard to gain new skills, expand their knowledge, and improve their financial standing. And we need to figure out how to get even more nurses into the pipeline. Increasing the number of nurses in New York City, especially nurses of color, increases [inaudible 00:10:59] care and, just to give a little footnote historically, you may not now, so I'll share with you the fact that. Tubman starved as a nurse during the Civil War cases. We now know that the virus kills black and Latino people in New York City at twice the rate that it killed white people, and incredible disparity of discrimination that reflects long-standing and persistent economic inequalities and differences in healthcare and general systemic discrimination. We must do what we can to not let that happen again and, particularly in my community, there was a ZIP Code that was designated as having the highest mortality rate in all of New York City. At today's hearing, the committee is interested in examining the full impact of the pandemic for the CUNY consortium of nursing programs. This includes

learning how the programs continue to operate with a distance-learning model, especially with regard to clinicals and how schools are identifying and implementing best practices. Additionally, the committee is interested in learning how CUNY is supporting nursing students and faculty at this time. Lastly, I would like to know how CUNY continues its efforts to increase nursing graduates and nursing graduates of color, in particular. Before I conclude my opening statement, I would like to highlight a couple of CUNY students. The first being Irena Butcher who graduated with her Associates and Applied Science, her AAS degree, and nursing from BMCC in January 2020. After rescheduling her appointment to take the NCLEX three times and contracting a severe case of Covid at the beginning of March, Ms. Butcher took and passed the NCLEX on April the 10th. She plan to eventually enroll in the online bachelor's degree in nursing at the School of Professional Studies. And the second highlight is Dante Crellid [sp?], a 16 year old from Flatbush, Brooklyn. Kingsborough Community College. The youngest graduate for the class of 2020. With a 70,000 dollar scholarship, Mr. Crellid-- and if I'm mispronouncing

your name, please forgive me-- Mr. Crellid is on track to becoming a nurse practitioner and plans on majoring in nursing at a Delphi University in the fall. In preparing for this hearing, I would like to thank Joyce Simmons, my Chief of Staff, Ms. Indigo Washington, my director of legislation, Chloe Rivera, the committee's senior policy analyst, Michelle Peregrine, the committee's financial analyst, and Frank Perez, the committee's new community engagement representative. I don't know who all of the committee members, Council members are who are here, but I will announce them at another time. And I will now turn it over to senior policy analyst, Chloe Rivera, who will review some procedural items relating to today's hearing and call the first panel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair Barron. My name is Chloe Rivera and I am the senior policy analyst for the Committee on Higher Education at the New York City Council. I will be moderating today's hearing and calling panelists to testify. Before we begin, please remember that everyone will be on mute until I call on you to testify. After you are called on, you will be on muted by a member of our staff. Note that there will be a few second

delay before you are on muted and we can hear you. For public testimony, I will call up individuals in panels. Please listen for your name. I will periodically announce the next few panelist. Once I call your name, a member of your staff will unmute you. The sergeant-at-arms will set a clock and give you the go-ahead to begin your testimony. All public testimony will be limited to three minutes. After I call your name, please wait for the sergeant-at-arms to announce that you may begin before starting your testimony.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Just to interject quickly, want to acknowledge that we do have Council members Alan Maisel and Council member Rodriguez. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair Barron. For today's hearing, the first panel will include representatives from the City University of New York followed by Council member questions, then public testimony. In order of speaking, we will have Patricia Cimino Boyce, University Dean for Health and Human Services, Margaret Riley, academic director of nursing programs at the School of Professional Studies and Annmarie Menendez, professor and nursing

chair at Queensborough Community College. I will now administer the oath to the administration. When you hear your name, please respond once a member of our staff unmutes you. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this committee and respond honestly to Council member questions? Dean Boyce?

DEAN BOYCE: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

Director Riley?

DIRECTOR RILEY: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Chair Menendez? Chair Menendez, a little box should pop up saying to accept the unmute.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: It looks like she is on muted now.

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: Oh. I do. I apologize. I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No problem. Thank you. I will now call on Dean Boyce.

DEAN BOYCE: Thank you. Good morning, Chair Barron, and members of the Higher Education Committee. My name is Patricia Cimino Boyce and I the CUNY University Dean for Helping Human Services.

In this role, I provide strategic direction across CUNY's portfolio of Helping Human Service programs and collaborate with academic leadership, industry partners, and key stakeholders to ensure distinction in communities health professions programs and optimize clinical and field training experiences to drive career success for our students. And I am joined today by two colleagues, Dr. Margaret Riley, academic director of nursing programs for the School for Professional Studies, and Ms. Annmarie Menendez, professor and nursing chair at Queensborough community College. Dr. Riley and Ms. Menendez will address the excellent nursing programs at their colleges and share information on the response to Covid 19. I will begin with an overview of nursing programs across CUNY and provide a brief summary of the University wide strategies to address clinical training during the Covid 19 crisis. 14 CUNY colleges offer nursing programs. Nine colleges offer an associate degree and seven offer a bachelor's degree in nursing. Four colleges offer a total of 12 master's degrees in addition to nine advanced certificates in nursing. Three colleges offer a doctorate in nursing practice in the graduate Center

offers PhD program in nursing. CUNY graduates approximately 1800 nurses annually from more than 50 individual degree and advanced certificate programs. On average, 700 associate degrees, along with 800 baccalaureate degrees that are awarded each year. In addition to approximately 300 graduate degrees and advanced certificates. CUNY nursing programs graduated a record number of 1879 students in spring 2020, the highest number in recent years. A specific point of reference is a 60 percent increase in nurse practitioner graduation from spring 2019 to spring 2020. This reflects the commitment of CUNY students to persevere, along with innovative solutions by faculty to support student progression in our programs during the height of Covid 19 in New York City. Applications to CUNY's nursing programs remain strong. In fact, enrollment is up in her bachelors and master's degree programs for fall 2020. Our programs conduct a blinded demographic admissions process relying on the academic qualifications of candidates to fill a limited number of available spots in each program. Similar to other nursing education nationally, CUNY experiences increasing demand for our nursing program with limitations to

admissions and student sufficient numbers of nursing faculty, clinical sites, clinical preceptors, and budget constraints. CUNY nursing graduates come from diverse cultural, ethnic, linguistic backgrounds. Approximately 70 percent of our nursing degree students are people of color. 27 percent Asian or Pacific Islander, 29 percent black non-Hispanic, and 13 percent Hispanic brother. This is in stark contrast to national norms where the percentage of underrepresented students enrolled in pre-licensure programs is reported at 31 percent. CUNY nurse practitioner graduates also represent higher than average diversity in the profession where approximately 60 percent of CUNY nurse practitioner students are people of color compared with New York City and New York State nurse practitioners reported average of 26 percent. CUNY is also proud of our diverse, talented, and highly experienced nursing faculty representing a broad spectrum of clinical and research expertise. 56 percent of CUNY's nursing faculty is represented by people of color which is three and a half times greater than the national average of 16 percent. The National Council Licensure Examination, or NCLEX, is the national

licensing exam for nurses. CUNY's average NCLEX pass rate for first time candidates have been consistently higher at 90 percent live in city, state, and national average NCLEX first time pass rate of 84 percent 86 percent, and 88 percent respectively. Similar to CUNY's ongoing programmatic changes to address external circumstances, CUNY immediately pivoted to distance learning at the onset of Covid 19 and sought approvals from the New York State Education Department to transition to alternative trading models to support students' progression in our clinical programs. CUNY's nursing programs swiftly implemented a series of innovative training models, including simulated clinical learning experiences and assessment skills training, tele-practice, and other virtually integrated solutions. CUNY's nursing programs work collaboratively to identifying [inaudible 00:21:46] access to virtual simulation platforms and other online resources. Complemented by the rapid adoption of innovative methods of student engagement and assessment to ensure the quality and integrity of our successful nursing programs throughout the crisis. As a result, CUNY's nursing program sustained operations and

maintain student progression except in rare instances such as the accelerated nursing or nurse practitioner programs where the required on-site clinical hours could not be substituted due to the programmatic state licensing and our national accreditation requirements. In addition, CUNY was able to offer virtually simulated learning experiences through expertise available at NYCIM, the CUNY NYU state of the art, high fidelity, clinical simulation center at Bellevue Hospital. The capital funds to create NYCIM were allocated by the city of New York in the wake of September 11th so that the city and its healthcare workforce would be better prepared. And clearly this investment has paid off. On April 3rd, 2020, at the beginning of our transition to fully online learning, CUNY hosted a university-wide simulation summit for our health and human service programs where more than 125 faculty across campuses shared experiences on simulated learning and showcased resources and expertise available across CUNY and at NYCIM. The summit was particularly important, given that the majority of our health professions, programs needed to transition to simulated learning experiences to substitute for clinical placements that healthcare

facilities. Subsequently, CUNY Health and Human Service programs launched a university wide effort to integrate virtually simulated interprofessional education, or IPE, into our professional healthcare programs using three Covid 19 case scenarios developed by multidisciplinary faculty across campuses and leveraging simulation expertise from NYCIM. These IPE learning experiences across skills training in the virtual world and prepare students for the evolving practice of healthcare and increasing use of tele-practice in response to Covid-19. In addition, these virtual IPE experiences are being used by several programs to replace and/or complement limited access to clinical practice settings during the pandemic and provide meaningful clinical experiences to students while demonstrating the importance of teamwork and collaboration. We recognize the extraordinary efforts our faculty have undertaken to ensure the quality of educational clinical training experiences to prepare health profession students during the Covid-19 crisis. CUNY is proudly maintaining the integrity of our health professions programs through innovative training models to prepare highly trained and imminently

qualified professionals for an evolving healthcare landscape. In summary, CUNY nursing programs provide aspiring students with a road to the middle class through employment and a highly respected profession along with opportunities for continued lifelong learning for professional success. The high value of CUNY nursing programs is expressed by local healthcare partners who seek out CUNY nursing graduates due to the quality of our programs and the successful, professional practice networks of CUNY nursing graduates across New York City. Thank you for the opportunity to present to the committee.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Now, Director Riley, you may begin once a member of our staff unmutes you and the sergeant gives you the cue.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.

DIRECTOR RILEY: Chair Barron and Council members, thank you for this opportunity to present an example of CUNY's approach to nursing, specifically the CUNY School of Professional Studies. The CUNY School of Professional Studies provides online, classroom-based, and customized programs of study that are responsive to the needs of our students and our city, focusing on forms of teaching, learning,

and scholarship that highlight innovation, personal and social progress, and opportunities for careers in service. CUNY SPS, grounded in CUNY's tradition of access and academic excellence, is dedicated to serving as the university's premiere school for adult learners. Adapting to the needs of our students across a growing range of fields and sectors, we expand CUNY's ability to address the demands of evolving workplaces and disciplines. CUNY SPS holds to the core values of responsiveness and quality and, as the university's leader in online learning, it is ranked in the top five percent in the US News and World Reports Best Online Bachelor's Degree Programs for 2020, marking the sixth year in a row that the school has been highly ranked by the publisher. The school's growth has been remarkable with 23 degrees launched since 2006, enrollment has risen by more than 30 percent in the last four years to over 4000 students in the credit bearing programs, and thousands more who are enrolled in non-degree and grant-funded workforce development programs. Earlier this fall, CUNY SPS was selected to receive the 2020 Online Learning Consortium Effective Practice Award. The honor was granted for our entry, a three-pronged

approach to online orientation for adult learners which described how the three CUNY SPS online orientation programs effectively helped adult online learners be successful in their courses which are based on the model of deliberately and mindfully building a community. As the premiere CUNY school of online learning, SPS was asked to develop and provide online teaching essentials workshops this summer and fall to help faculty across the CUNY system learn about best practices in online instruction and to convert their summer and fall courses to fully online courses in the wake of the Covid pandemic. This initiative aimed to ensure that tens of thousands of students across CUNY, whose lives may have otherwise been disrupted by the Covid-19 pandemic could continue to receive high quality academic instruction and, in recognition of this service, SPS received the 2020 University Association for Professional Continuing, and Online Education Mid-Atlantic Region Award for faculty development. The CUNY SPS online nursing program was launched in 2014 in response to the need to expand opportunities for associate degree nurses to progress to the BS in nursing. This is critically important now more than ever with the BS

in 10 legislative requirements for registered nurses in New York State to complete their bachelor's degree in nursing within 10 years of licensure. Our programs help nurses advance within their careers while continuing their education in a timely, flexible, and affordable way. From our first cohort of 45 undergraduate students, the SPS undergraduate nursing program is currently the largest RN to BS nursing program in CUNY, comprised of over 600 undergraduate students. In addition, our nearly 200 graduate students include those enrolled in the only nursing informatics graduate program in CUNY. The nursing informatics program is a masters and credit-bearing certificate program that focuses on integrating and analyzing health information and technology to inform healthcare practice, advance health outcomes, and facilitate research and education. Just over 70 percent of our students are graduates of CUNY community college programs and 95 percent reside in New York State. As per our 2019-2020 data, our diversity is reflective of the New York City community. Asian or Pacific Islander 25 percent, black non-Hispanic 29 percent, Hispanic other 17 percent, white/Caucasian 28 percent. Our

faculty is also reflective of diversity and inclusivity in race, ethnicity, are representative of the LGBTQ and disabilities populations. As a testament to the quality of the education, our programs were re-accredited by the national body of the Collegiate Commission on Nursing Education last September. Unique to our school, we offer full tuition scholarships after one semester at SPS to graduates of CUNY community college nursing programs, funded by the Petri Foundation. And most recently, we secured funding from the Robin Hood Foundation to offer a career ladder scholarship for minority men in nursing and healthcare services. We have created innovative dual joint degree programs with four CUNY community college nursing programs, including borough of Manhattan, Bronx, LaGuardia, and Queens Borough Community Colleges with the mission to streamline and seamlessly advance associate degree nurses to a bachelor's degree to meet the Institute of medicine goal of 80 percent of RNs with a BS. In the six short years that SPS nursing programs have been in existence, we have graduated over 500 RN to BS students, contributing to the local healthcare workforce and enhancing quality care for diverse

populations. Our students are the backbone of New York City Health and Hospitals and other healthcare systems and are poised to engage and excel and leadership in education, population health, data-driven decision-making, and advocacy for quality care. Our students have heroically served in hurricane and earthquake ravaged communities, the Covid 19 epicenters of New York City, and, most recently, one of our students will use her advocacy skills of the newly elected member of the New York State Assembly. In early March, in response to the Covid-19 pandemic, all student clinical experiences in healthcare sites due to the Covid 19 pandemic. SPS nursing partnered with over 22 community partners across New York City and engage our students with community dwelling seniors to provide telehealth wellness services. In addition, we collaborated with an effort from the Office of the CUNY Dean of Health and Human Services to participate in interprofessional education simulation experiences with 14 other disciplines in Health and Human Services in CUNY. These and other innovative responses ensure that our students acquire the skills needed to advance and contribute to their

professional practice. CUNY SPS will continue to be flexible and responsive to the needs of our community of nurses by introducing new opportunities that expand the possibility and promise of public education and position our students to grow personally, excel in the workplace, and enrich their communities. Thank you for this opportunity to present to the committee.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Chair Menendez, you may begin once you are unmuted. Chair Menendez, sorry. I think you really clicked mute. Sorry. Try one more time.

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: How is that? I'm having-- Okay. Good morning, everyone. Good morning, Chair Barron, and Council members. Queensborough Community College is one of the best to your colleges in the nation. With one of the most diverse student bodies in the United States, Queensborough has been acclaimed by higher education public officials, including the Chronicle of Higher Education as a top degree producer and one that provides its students with many opportunities for [inaudible 00:34:48] into the middle class. Established in 1967, the nursing program at

Queensborough continues its outstanding reputation for highly skilled, caring nurses. Our nurses graduating-- in order nursing graduates continue their studies at four-year colleges [inaudible 00:35:14] and many enter the workforce while pursuing their bachelor's degree in nursing. Because our standards are high, our students' accomplishments are impressive. With the national passing rate for the NCLEX RN associate degree exam at 84 percent, we are especially proud that Queensborough's passing rate for 2019 is 95 percent. Approximately 80 percent of Greensboro graduate secure employment in their first year, getting back to their [inaudible 00:35:44] public, private, or University hospitals and other facilities, often within the five boroughs. In fact, nine out of 10 graduates live in New York and contribute to the national and local economies. Graduates earn a median income of 70,000, propelling them [inaudible 00:36:06] to the middle class. Queensborough nursing students are twice as diverse in terms of gender and ethnicity the nursing station's net nationwide. 20 percent of Queensborough nursing the students identify as male compared to a national proportion of just 10 percent.

60 percent of our nursing students are first generation college students. In the healthcare industry, diversity is critical for patient health and wellness. Communication, for example, it is more effective when healthcare providers are able to build trust, manage language barriers, bridge cultural gaps, [inaudible 00:36:45] value systems, and respond to the needs of different patient populations. It is also important that our students see themselves in their faculty. Queensborough's 26 full-time nursing faculty members are black or African-American, three are Asian or Pacific Islander, and three are male. Our faculty's wide scope of professional and teaching experience [inaudible 00:37:11] environment enhancing each student's ability to prepare for a career in nursing. The college's strong mentorship program provides support, advisement, encouragement, and strategies for workshops and peer mentoring senior students are presented with opportunities to enhance their leadership and communication skills. Queensborough offers three dual joint programs with Hunter Bellevue School of Nursing, CUNY School of Professional Study, and York College. These programs' full and part-time students to progress

seamlessly to a bachelor's degree at local cuties senior colleges. Queensborough students apply for these programs enrolled in their first clinical course at Queensborough. Earlier this year, in consideration of our high standards and accomplishment, the accreditation of education in nursing, AEN, granted Queensborough eight euros of reaccreditation. In mid-March, due to safety concerns, we received, from the New York State Department of Education Office of Profession, to transition students and faculty from the clinical and classroom settings, to an online modality. Within days, cuties Dean for Helping Human Services, Dr. Boyce, provided monetary and pedagogical support to pivot to an online forum for both the clinical and classroom component. Faculty worked tirelessly to share best practices to ensure that students continued to receive the best education under these challenging circumstances. The nursing program recruits the majority of its students, faculty, and staff from Queens in the New York City area. The program of study posted on our website is continuously updated to provide access to all prospective applicants. We regularly place

[inaudible 00:39:05] cultural our nursing students and alumni's ability to excel in the nursing profession. Admission is our spring and fall semesters with an evening session available to accommodate working students. Nurses represent some of the most trusted and admired in our community. Honesty, responsibility, and the pursuit of new knowledge. It demands a lifelong commitment to learning and a passion and ability to pursue this calling. Queensborough community College is privilege to champion these values and respond to the challenging healthcare needs of patients of all ages.

MODERATOR: Thank you for your testimony. Before I turned the Chair Barron for questions, I would like to remind Council member is to use the raise hand function in Zoom to indicate that they have a question for this panel. Chair Barron? Chair Barron, you are on mute.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Am I on muted now?

MODERATOR: Yes. And also, please watch out for your papers on the microphone.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you. I haven't yet mastered how to have my text on the screen and be able to look at myself and make sure

everything is right in here everything, but I am working on that. But I do you have the testimony on my screen now and I just wanted to, first of all, thank you will for your testimony. And I am particularly-- I am proud of CUNY and the work that they have done overall, but I am particularly focused in this hearing on how we are going to help students graduate and I am particularly concerned that the Lehman program has lost its accreditation. So, in your testimony, you say that normally cuties average NCLEX pass rate for first time candidates has consistently-- has been consistently higher, at 90 percent, then city, state, national average NCLEX first time passing rates of 84, 86, and 88, respectively. What happened at Lehman? How is that impacting the students particularly in light of your testimony about BS on 10? And for those students who might, in fact, be restricted by that? So, I'm really going to focus-- I appreciate all your testimony, but I'm really focusing on what we need to do and whether or not students or schools have submitted plans to SED that are alternatives to the requirements to work in hospitals.

DEAN BOYCE: Thank you, Chair Barron. In response to your question, the net NCLEX rates cited in the testimony referred to our pre-license programs. Just to clarify, that the Lehman program is the master's program, so that is different in the Lehman certification exam is to practice as a nurse practitioner, which is an advanced practice license in the scope of practice.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, the Lehman program is an advanced program?

DEAN BOYCE: Uh-hm. Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what do students get at the end of that completion?

DEAN BOYCE: They get a master's degree in family nurse practitioner and, if they say it for the national certifying exam, and they are certified to serve as a nurse practitioner and their license with New York State is amended to reflect their scope of practice or practitioner as a nurse practitioner.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, for those students-- the notice came at some point during the school year that Lehman had lost its accreditation in that field and students had already been engaged in

preparation for the exam thinking that they would take it, I believe, in June?

DEAN BOYCE: The exam is given at multiple points during the year, so students schedule the exam prior to graduation and, typically, line the exam date when they fulfill-- with the fulfillment of their graduation requirements.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, now that that accreditation has been lost at Lehman, I don't know-- my question is what happens to those students who now cannot take it? Can they transfer to another school and do it through another school? What options are there for them to be able to get this degree? Take the exam and get the certification and the license amended?

DEAN BOYCE: Sure. So, what we are doing right now is we appeal to CCNE to ask for a question-- I'm sorry. An extension for the withdrawal decision at least to complete the pending graduates' qualifications to sit for the exam and we understand that that request has gone to the executive committee of the Board of Commissioners for CCNE and we are hoping to receive a response to that request within the next week. Secondly, we have also

submitted a request to the second certifying body that allows nurses to sit for the certifying exam and that is the American Academy of Nurse Practitioner Certification Board, AANPCB. And they are now reviewing our request to use our other certification, which is the New York State Education Department certification. New York State, if you are not aware, is a national certifier for nursing programs around the state, so we do have national certification through the New York State Education Department. So we requested the opportunity to use that certification to sit and qualify for the second certifying exam. So, we understand that both of those groups are weighing our decision and we are hoping to hear very shortly. If that is the case, then our students will be permitted to sit for the exam and proceed with graduation, as planned.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And there would not be any distinction between this process and the regular NCLEX process? There'd be no distinction? You know, it's not--

DEAN BOYCE: Yes. Absolutely. Just so you know, NCLEX is the pre-licensure. That is for RNs. This is for the certification for nurse

practitioners which is different. It is advanced practice and were talking about two different certifying boards. I know there's a lot of acronyms in here. So, there are two different certifying boards that we are applying to both of them to provide permission to our students to sit for those national certifying exams.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And so, there would be no distinction for using the alternative route?

DEAN BOYCE: No. No. We've already confirmed. No.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. All right. Very good. And do you have any idea about when that would happen?

DEAN BOYCE: Yes. As I mentioned, we are waiting for a response. We expect a response from both of those organizations within the next week.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Great. Dr. Riley, you talked about the School of Professional Studies, having extensive online offerings, as well as the classroom offerings, and that you have used to conduct training for faculty and staff. Are all of your classes available online? Or all of your

offerings that are in person also available online or is there a limited menu of course offerings online?

DIRECTOR RILEY: From the school perspective, the majority of our programs are fully online. We do have a limited number of programs that were in person and have had to pivot to the online format due to this pandemic. All of our nursing courses, all of our nursing programs, are fully online.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: All nursing programs are fully online. Okay. So, someone can complete this-- they're all online and not have to appear in person for your nursing programs.

DIRECTOR RILEY: That is correct. There are clinical requirements for the program, as there are for all RNs to BS programs. Those clinical requirements did require in person interaction and those could be done at local clinics, local hospitals where the students work. We also assist our students in placement. Due to the nature of what happened with the pandemic, through the offices of the Dean of Health and Human Services, Dr. Patty Boyce, all of the CUNY nursing programs collectively filed an application to the state education department to

request permission to conduct alternate clinical experiences for students to ensure that they met the program in the course objectives in the was approved through the efforts of Dr. Boyce's office so that we were collectively, in one mass, and one group were petitioning the state to be able to do this. All of the programs were granted this permission in the spring and our application-- I'm sorry. We were granted the permission in the spring to run these clinicals in the fall and we are currently have request and to the state education department to ask permission to extend the opportunity for alternate clinical experiences for the spring in anticipation of many facilities closing down once again to student access.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, is it accurate to say, then, that all nursing students who need to have their clinical hours will have an opportunity to do so via these alternative clinical experiences that you are offering where all students have that opportunity to access these alternate methods so that they can satisfy their clinical hours?

DIRECTOR RILEY: Yes. Once they are approved by the State Education Department, they will

be allowed to use these alternate clinical experiences that the nursing program has designed collaboratively with assistance from Dr. Boyce's office, to be able to offer those hours for the students so they can fulfill their requirements and not delay their progression in graduation.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, I'm glad to hear that, but it sort of conflicts with what students had said was actually their experiences during the last five or six months. So, I'm looking forward to hearing the student's testimony so that we can get clarity and make sure that they, themselves, are aware of what the opportunities are because it has been somewhat different from what is being presented here and I remember earlier on-- actually, perhaps it was in June, that I spoke with someone who did not know that there were alternative measures that were being offered for consideration and approval. So, I'm glad to know that and we'll make sure that-- So how is this information relayed to all of the students that are, in fact, in the programs and need to move forward. I can speak for how I conducted it for my program. Being that we are an online program, our primary mode of communication

is through email, through posting in course sites so that students have access to the information. We had a coordinated effort to inform the students, to make them aware, and then we set those processes up. So all the students that were interested in participating in the clinical experience at our program were able to take advantage of this.

DEAN BOYCE: And, Chair Barron, if I may, I just want to clarify one point which is in most cases, the clinical hours are able to be substituted, but it's not in all cases. So, in some cases, the accreditor does not permit a substitution of an alternative. So, for example, the nurse practitioner accreditors do not really allow substitution of clinical hours because they think that's critical to the success preparations of nurse practitioners. In other cases, we have accelerated programs which are much more tight time frames in terms of students completing those clinical experiences and is often not an opportunity to substitute what we consider a very limited, but required number of clinical hours for those students to be proficient and prepared to successfully practice. So, in most cases, the alternatives are very successful and have met most of

our needs. But, in some cases, we are permitted to tell the program accreditation our licensing requirements.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What can we do for those persons who dedicated years, perhaps--

DEAN BOYCE: Yes. Absolutely. We are actually supporting all those students. If the clinical hours, for some reason as I've explained, have been delayed, they are being put into clinical hours immediately when those sites are open and available to them. Our campuses, by and large, have been working very, very hard with all of our clinical partners. We collectively-- I speak with [inaudible 00:52:42] across the city on a regular basis. So, when those health systems allow us to get in authority over clinical placements when they feel it is safe and they can meet the safety of the patients, their staff, and certainly our students, then we take advantage of those opportunities. So, at most, the only suggestion is that we can delay that, but all of the students will get those clinical requirements met at some point.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How many students have been able, as [inaudible 00:53:10] have occurred

and what are the circumstances under which a healthcare facility will say, okay. We can provide these clinical hours?

DEAN BOYCE: It changes based on the nature of the pandemic and the other situations. The operational issues and other constraints by the health system. So, we have been very responsive. Some of our campuses, based on what affiliations and arrangements that they have with their sites, have made some accommodations but it's completely at the will and at the discretion of the clinical site. It's not up to us. When it's allowable, we have permitted our students to go on site. Our primary objective is to maintain operation and progression of our students in these programs and, for the most part, we have done this very successfully. The only problem we have had-- or actually alternative-- is actually just delaying the students' progression when those sites won't let us in, we go immediately and fulfill those students' clinical hours. But it's really not been a matter of not doing everything on our end. It's actually just a matter of the sites allowing us access.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I want to acknowledge that we have been joined by Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. And I know you have a hard stop for your presentation, so I'm trying to--

DEAN BOYCE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: get all of my questions in. I thank you for your presence and your presentation. What can we do? We're creative people. I mean, we have to be able to find a way-- and I ask you the question because you're the professional in the field and you understand what it takes. We're not in any way talking about lowering the standards of what it takes to be a nurse because no one wants to have a healthcare provider responding to them who has not been fully prepared. So we are certainly not talking about cutting corners in that regard. What can we do? What is some of the out of the box thinking that we can propose and perhaps test in a pilot project to see how that works?

DEAN BOYCE: Well, thank you for asking. I think we have already tried and are implementing a number of innovative solutions. As Dr. Riley outlined, we are using simulation. As Ms. Menendez presented, we have introduced a number of alternative

training models. We are working with our clinical partners. If they let us in lesser numbers of students on fewer days, we work with them and we take what we can work with-- we work with that and extend our programming. In almost all cases, our campuses have reengineered our curriculum to make sure that we are allowing for the most valuable clinical experiences in any way that we can offer them. We continue to educate and provide opportunities to support our programs. As Dr. Riley mentioned, we have initiated interprofessional educational opportunities across our campuses, so we have 14 campuses engaged in IPE right now, which is a tremendous learning experience for our students that is all virtually simulated. So, we are implementing things that would've taken many, many years, I think, to get off the ground very quickly, but they are serving as a very suitable, if not optimal, alternatives for our students at this time and we block to be used every national evidence-based resource in terms of virtual simulation, virtual and online programming, and also other case studies that support the clinical experiences. The critical judgment in the clinical learning needs of our

students through this scenario. So, we continue to up all the test and apply every evidence-based an alternative model that we have identified. We remain open and actually appreciate the support of the Council, as well as all of our clinical partners who've worked very closely with us to provide access any and wherever they can and we continue to work with our partners. We work very closely with New York City Health and Hospitals and other partners to provide access or alternatives for replacements that might have been less traditional in the past, but where we are turning to them as very good alternatives. Again, striking the right balance of making sure its use that our students are getting the proper education are prepared for their clinical practice, not cutting any corridors, but being innovative in every way we can.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What would you say is the impact of Covid on the number of students who will be able to-- how does the number of students-- how do you project the number of students will be decreased to be able to complete the requirements and sit for their tests and actually achieve what it is that they had set for their goals?

DEAN BOYCE: So, in most cases, we are able to maintain our progression of students in almost all cases. There are very few instances where students are not graduated on their scheduled graduation date, but may have had to defer their graduation. But, again, that is very few instances. In some cases, we actually had early graduations for some of our programs in the spring of our final year students to advance the Governors initiatives to try to get folks into practice as soon as we can. So, we have met or exceeded all of the expectations in terms of student progression and, at this point, as I mentioned in testimony, the admission, the enrollment in our bachelors and master's program is up and fall 2020, which makes us very happy. As I mentioned also, we had the highest number of graduations in spring 2020 at the height of the pandemic which I think, again, demonstrates the perseverance of our students and our ability to maintain their progression in our programs. I don't know if I can quantitatively project with the impact will be on Covid. I think what Covid is doing to the practice of education and certainly nursing is very quickly evolving it to alternative means of delivery.

Obviously, tele-practice, telehealth, and also challenging us to use these new technologies in a way that it's going to better prepare our students for this evolving landscape.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I have a few other questions I'd like to pose and I'll get them in quickly. I am recognizing your time and you may be the person that may have to answer these questions. What is the number of part-time versus full-time students who are currently enrolled in the nursing programs?

DEAN BOYCE: I don't have a number specifically on that right hand, but I happy to get back to you on that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And if you could, I would like to have that disaggregated by degree type, as well as race, ethnicity, and gender were noted.

DEAN BOYCE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How many students that are currently enrolled as nursing students are also working at the same time is nurses?

DEAN BOYCE: I don't have that data quantitatively, but anecdotally I think it is a very

high number. And just so you are aware, even students in our pre-licensure programs are employed in many aspects of the healthcare system. So they may be working as nursing aides, nursing assistants, unit secretaries, medical assistance. So, many of our students are actually working their way through school in many ancillary jobs in the healthcare industry.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. But if you. Give me all of that data, subsequently.

DEAN BOYCE: I'm not sure how much data we actually collect on how many of our students are also actively employed, but I am happy to share with you what we should collect.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Great. Regarding enrollment, what efforts does CUNY make to recruit a diverse pool of students and their nursing programs? Do you have affiliations with high schools or other entities that would attract-- and I did hear you talk about a program that was funded, I think you said, by the Robin Hood Foundation which is attracting men and often scholarships. I would like to hear about that, as well.

DEAN BOYCE: That is Dr. Riley's program. I'm happy to defer to her for that. But in general, we do have relationships with several high schools and other pipelines for our nursing programs. So, for example, the Hero High School in the Bronx which is, education, and research occupations, we have direct relationship with students who come from there through host to host and then pursue a number of nursing-- excuse me-- and other allied health profession careers. We also programs called College Now which actually engages with many high schools across the city to, again, create pipelines and tracks for healthcare and health education programs and we actually work very closely with our partners at the community level to really create as much awareness building and support and really support a lot of our entry into and were associate, as well as bachelor's degrees programs through those channels.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I would also put in an appeal look to-- I'll talk to them and I would love for them to be able to have the direct connection to that outreach.

DEAN BOYCE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I did hear you talk about the other program which you said offered scholarships. We are always talking about that we know that student loan debt is crisis levels and we need to address how we can have that. But I believe I heard you say that there is a full tuition scholarship after one year and there is another program that has an actual appeal to having minority men participate. Then you, I think you said--

DEAN BOYCE: you will refer to my colleague, Dr. Riley, for that response.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Dr. Riley?

DIRECTOR RILEY: So, I am happy to respond to that. Those are scholarships and funds that are unique to the CUNY School of Professional Studies. We solicited funding from the Peachtree Foundation and, over the last three years, we were able to find a number of nursing students that graduated from our CUNY Community College. That was one of the stipulations of the funding that students who were interested in applying for this submitted an application. We have reviewed committee evaluate the students that submitted their applications, based on the funds we were allocated, we were able to fund

about 30 students for this full tuition scholarship that sustained them through the remainder of their period of time earning their degree at the CUNY School of Professional Studies. The career ladders scholarship is a new initiative. Again, we secured grant funding from the Robin Could Foundation and it is target date to recruit minority men into not just nursing, but also be other health services administration and health information management program that we have at our school and we are recruiting and going to our CUNY Community Colleges to start, but we have a-- we have hired a full-time advisor that will also be developing a recruitment plan to be able to identify students who would be interested in eligible to participate in this initiative.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, this is something that is new and unfolding. And what would be the supports who qualify would be able to expect from the program?

DIRECTOR RILEY: Students get a limited amount of money for applying to their tuition, as well as textbooks. They would also have a dedicated advisor that would work with them as they transition

through the program. Programs would be alerted as to which students are qualified or receiving this so that we could also ensure that the academic plan that is developed for them is appropriate to help them move in progress through the program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And how many students do you anticipate will be a part of that program?

DIRECTOR RILEY: I don't have that number for you right now, Chair Barron, the happy to provide that the Dean Boyce who will also be the funnel for getting information back to you that you are requesting.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you. Now, we talked about the BS in 10. One was that implemented how long has that been in place and are students aware of these time restrictions on their program?

DEAN BOYCE: Yes. The legislation was signed in December 2017. It was intended to go into effect 18 months after which was May 2019. Anyone that was enrolled in the program or graduated a program at the time that it was signed into legislation or grandfathered in. So, as the May 9th,

2019. Our graduates actually need to complete a bachelor's in nursing within 10 years of graduation and we do have very active and ongoing communications across our campuses. On that information, all of our associate degree campuses have what we call dual or joint degree pathways with our senior campuses so that we are able to enroll our students, if interested, in any of our seven BS to RN-- I'm sorry. RN to BS completion programs. So, we do take that very seriously at CUNY and create the pathways and bridges to make that possible for our students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. June 25th of this year, the Chancellor issued a revised guidance for students seeking admissions to CUNY's nursing programs consistent with the regulations of the New York State Education Department that make professional licensure available, and model only to US citizens, but to noncitizens so long as they, quote, not unlawfully present in the United States, including those with DACA arrivals and those that are permanently residing in the United States under the color [inaudible 01:07:23]. When did the state Education Department institute the regulation? It appears that it was June 1st, 2016 and, if so, why

did it take CUNY over four years to revise its guidance as to not preclude an otherwise qualified applicant from obtaining a license, certificate, limited permit, or registration?

DEAN BOYCE: Sure. I arrived at CUNY at late summer of 2019. My understanding, prior to my arrival, is that this particular policy was under review in quite extensive ways going through a number of different considerations with the new administration and different immigration changes and also doing everything we could to make sure that we were responsive to both the mission of CUNY and the intent of the legislation in terms of admitting students. Upon my arrival, I worked closely with our campuses, as well as the Office of General Council at CUNY and our other immigration specialists to make sure that we would be able to put something together and certainly advance the policy in a way that was reflective of the state legislation. So, we are very happy to release this policy, expand the opportunity for admissions to immigrant students, and support what really is CUNY's mission about access.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, in accordance with the revised guidance, do nursing admission

eligibility requirements apply to individuals to be admitted or advanced into the nursing program into the fall of 2020 and beyond and the, quote, updated policy does not affect students who have advanced into the clinical component of CUNY's nursing program or others considered for advancement prior to summer 2020. So, why is this program not retroactive and can you estimate how many nursing students or graduates missed out over the last four years?

DEAN BOYCE: sorry. I can't provide any numbers on that, but I'm happy to go back and see what we have audit. In general, what we were trying to do, the intent of the policy was to create a starting point for admissions so that all admissions would be considered using the new policy to be as inclusive as possible.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, how is CUNY making this change out there that this is happening?

DEAN BOYCE: The expectation and, in that policy was the directive to all programs to make sure that this was made clear in nursing handbooks and all admission materials online and in writing so that every student interested in applying to a nursing program would understand the policy.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, would students, perhaps, the not have an increased number of students perhaps applying to this program and, with your testimony that there is been a steady number of students applying for enrollment, how are we going to address this increased population? You had indicated that the faculty numbers really don't address or match what we need in terms of addressing the students course offerings.

DEAN BOYCE: Right.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, what can we do?

DEAN BOYCE: So, I think what we would most appreciate is budget support and any funding support to be able to expand our programs. Our programs are quite highly regarded. Certainly, admission interest continues to go up. Again, we are only restrained by our budget that limits us around faculty hiring this and also what is a limitation to us is our clinical placements and preceptor availability. So, those are the two areas where we are actually always struggling to try to increase our admissions and they remain somewhat fixed. Clinical placement sites continue to be a challenge across all nursing programs within CUNY and outside of CUNY, so

we do work creatively with our partners. I'm working with a number of partners now to extend our clinical placements and expanded units at their health facilities. I am also working on creating what we call nurse externships or career readiness opportunities for our students prior to graduation. So, we continue to explore a number of opportunities, but those become relatively fixed external issues that limit our ability to increase admissions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And I see the clock is moving on, so just one or two more questions. Currently how many faculty members instruct aspiring nurses-- for them to be attracted to become of faculty person or are they perhaps more attracted to actually being in the field doing the work of a nurse and perhaps getting a larger salary?

DEAN BOYCE: I can get back to you about the number you requested on 10 year and at adjunct versus part-time or full-time faculty. But your question about attracting nurses to the field, we have a number of pathways to do that. We've increased our master's programs, so that creates opportunities for additional practice and opportunities for nurses in the field to engage with

us on that. We also engage a number of different clinical lectures, as well as clinical adjunct faculty and hope to engage them in faculty appointments over time. We have strong relationships between our current nursing faculty and their colleagues at many of our health system partners and that continues to maintain opportunities for us for placements, as well as recruitment of faculty and we do have our PhD program and many of our nursing faculty go through that PhD program and continue to pursue tenured faculty lines, so that creates the pipeline for else, as well.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great. You have about two minutes and I do want to recognize that Council member Rodriguez has his hand raised and that might be a question that you might want to address to you. So, Council member Rodriguez, you have to be brief and to the point with your question. Thank you. If the host could acknowledge Council member Rodriguez?

MODERATOR: Council member Rodriguez, you see the unmute box?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Council member Rodriguez, are you ready for your question? One of our panelists has to leave in about two minutes.

MODERATOR: There we go.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. But we should have enough time to ask a question, Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. You can ask your question. Go right ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yes. My question is in CUNY, to [inaudible 01:14:38] what used to be the [inaudible 1:14:45] including nurses?

DEAN BOYCE: I apologize. The sound quality was not very clear on my end. If you could possibly repeat that question?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible 01:15:22] the CUNY School of Medicine, does it maintain that CUNY was [inaudible 01:15:27] program and be centralized by the new formal CUNY School of Medicine?

DEAN BOYCE: Just to clarify, I hear you asking a question about the CUNY School of Medicine. I'm not understanding the part of what you're asking about centralizing something of CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Your transmission is spotty, Council member.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: now that we have-- What is it, Chairman? Can you hear me?

MODERATOR: Council member Rodriguez--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I said your--

MODERATOR: It seems you have a bad signal. We can't--

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Can you hear me now? Can you hear me better now?

MODERATOR: It's in and out.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Let me come back. Let me reconnect.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. But just generally, I do want to excuse you from your presentation on this panel. I'm going to respect your time, as well. And the other members will be remaining. Is that correct?

DEAN BOYCE: Yes. Thank you very much. I appreciate your consideration and were happy to get back to you with any information you request. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great. Thank you. Thank you so much. So, I do a more questions. How

does CUNY work to attract distinguished faculty were able to make more money working as a nurse than perhaps being on the faculty? How can we address that? And it was the question that was partially addressed by Dean Boyce in her presentation.

DIRECTOR RILEY: I can try to address that, Chair Barron. In general, pay it in the clinical and healthcare settings is significantly greater in the scale of pay that faculty receive working in an academic setting. There are some initiatives that have been promoted to attract faculty and that is usually done by appealing to faculty from other academic settings, advertising and recruiting for unique programs and positions that are hosted at particular schools. That is usually done at a point of higher when a faculty line becomes available or a dean or director or chairperson ship becomes available. Those efforts are made in general. Advertising for faculty is done in academic journals, as well as in a series of well-respected in typical areas where faculty you would look for positions. We also appealed a faculty that are working in clinical roles, of which there are many with whom we engage in many who then choose to pursue

further academic degrees and levels are also people that we reach out to in an effort to engage with them and have them participate in our academic endeavors with our students. It is truly a partnership. We do have full-time faculty working in our society, but we also rely on and required the partnership and collaboration of our many, many clinical faculty who work with us as adjuncts and will bring a skill set of practice in the real world and in the real clinical setting that is invaluable. So, we look at it as a partnership, as well.

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: In Queens Borough, we actually have five of our full-time faculty started out at Queens Borough and got their education here and went on and feel very committed to our programming and have come back now as faculty.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And so, what type of supports do you offer for students, particularly during this time of the pandemic? What kinds of support, academic support, financial support, mental support. We know that there is a great push on this great stress that they are in Doreen. So, what types of support are you offering to the students that--

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: I can speak it Queens Borough. Under the new leadership of our new president, Dr. Mangino, we have a large food bank and we moved it to a central location to make it more available and to widely advertise it to students. We're proud of that. We have an extensive online counseling department and I've made sure to all our nursing students that that link has been sent to them where they can actually have virtual. We have an extensive mentoring ship-- mentorship program at Queens Borough which is funded by the Petri Foundation, so students have been [inaudible 01:20:44]. Queensborough was very generous in providing a substantial PPE, which I started ordering early in May to have it available for our faculty and students that were able to go back and do clinicals this fall. In addition, Queensborough has been very generous because it was online and the issue that we found was that a lot of students did not have the proper laptops or computers. So, Queensborough was very generous. Actually, the statistics and that settings in the programs that they needed specifically to be successful in a number of our nursing students [inaudible 1:21:24] mailed to their

homes so they could succeed or continue in the program. Our faculty, you know, with our online faculty actually meet with the students even though, in March, we had to go online. Faculty would meet with the students at a regular rate. They didn't just, you know, let them go by themselves. They actually sat with them. They met with them. They reflected. So, I think we have given a lot of support, you know, since the pandemic has hit, but we do understand that it has been very, very challenging.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And in terms of students who might have special needs, students that are some--

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: Yeah. At Queensborough, we do have--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: differently--

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: Yes. We do provide-- I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Go ahead.

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: So you're asking with students with special needs. We do have--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [inaudible

01:22:28]

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: a student's disabilities office and we do encourage nursing students who might need special accommodations to seek out the help from that office. And we provide special accommodations for our nursing students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. I believe that Council member Rodriguez is back on, so I will allow him to pose his questions at this time. So if the host will-- Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Chair.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time begins now.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Chair. So, my question was do we have a-- what used to be [inaudible 01:23:11] School of Medicine now at the formal CUNY School of Medicine. Does it make sense that the CUNY School of Medicine should centralize everything related to nursing programs along the community college, senior college, and all campuses of CUNY?

DIRECTOR RILEY: So, with respect, Council member, the discipline of medicine and discipline of nursing are separate. We are collaborative partners in the healthcare setting.

So, CUNY School of Medicine is focused on educating future physicians while the CUNY School of Nursing, of which there are many, are focused on educating the future nurses that will go into the healthcare world.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I get [inaudible 1:24:02]. Sorry. For the purpose of time. It's no intention to cut you off. But where do we centralize? And since we have the former school of medicine and I get-- I used to be a teacher for 15 years and I used to be a student when we're trying to preserve the City College School of Nursing and unfortunately he also was eliminated in the past. One of the challenges that we face about from where do we centralize all the programs of nursing? And if we have a School of Medicine at CUNY, does that make sense that the old program of nursing also should be centralized for the school? In that school?

DIRECTOR RILEY: With respect, that CUNY School of Medicine focuses on the education of physicians. We have a centralized focus through the CUNY Office of the Dean of Health Human Services, Dr. Patty Boyce, who testified here today. We also have the CUNY nursing discipline council which is

comprised of the membership of all of the deans, directors, and chairpersons of all the CUNY nursing programs. So we do have the centralized and collaborative process for determining policy, for examining best practices, and for implementing program changes and others.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Is there a program of nursing at the CUNY School of Medicine what used to be [inaudible 1:25:32]?

DIRECTOR RILEY: There is no school of nursing at the CUNY School of Medicine.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay. How much does it cost that CUNY graduate a student on the nursing program?

DIRECTOR RILEY: I could not provide you with those numbers, but she will be happy to provide that to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay. We do agree that does feel like right now the students of the School of Engineering is double because CUNY doubled that from when a student is my major, political science, is today. Do you know that it costs more or you don't have any idea if it costs

more for CUNY to graduate a student of-- in nursing program?

DIRECTOR RILEY: I could not provide those numbers at this time, but we would be happy to identify that information and provide it through Dean Boyce to Chair Barron and to yourself as to the specific information you wish.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Which hospital are partnered with the nursing programs at CUNY?

DIRECTOR RILEY: I'm sorry. Could you repeat the question, sir?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Which hospitals does CUNY have his partners for the nursing programs?

DIRECTOR RILEY: Which hospitals? Is that the question?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Uh-hm.

DIRECTOR RILEY: We have affiliation agreements with multiple facilities throughout New York City and New York State, including--

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Can you name a few of those?

DIRECTOR RILEY: All 11 Health and Hospitals facilities. We also have alignments with New York Presbyterian, Mount Sinai-- Annmarie, do you have any others that you could recall?

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: Yes. We have affiliations with the Northwell System which has a number of facilities on the Long Island Jewish Northwell [inaudible 01:27:33] Franklin. We also have affiliations with NYU Winthrop and, of course, City Hospital. City Health and Hospital centers, Elmhurst. We have affiliations with Jamaica Hospital and with Flushing Hospital. And many of the nursing homes, however, we have not been able to return to the nursing home since March of last year.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Is Harlem also part of the hospitals that is part of--

DIRECTOR RILEY: Yes. It is. Yes. It is.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, guys. Thank you. It's a great program and, unfortunately, we saw some [inaudible 01:28:13] in the past and I hope, again, my question of how much it costs is because I know that we have to do our part from the legislative role to increase the

funding, especially in the science and engineer that it costs more to CUNY to graduate a student in that field than a student that graduates in liberal arts. But thank you for your time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Council member Rodriguez, for your questions. And to the panel, I just have a few more questions before I move on to the next panel. So, what is the status of-- for those 200 students at we men who are not able to sit for the exam and which I understand that you are, in fact, appealing that decision and in that process, what is the financial impact on those students? If they had thought that they would be finished with their program in June, do they now have to pay tuition maintenance fee or do they have to enroll to maintain their status as a student? What is the impact on those 200 students financially and in terms of coursework, as well?

DIRECTOR RILEY: It's my understanding, Chair Barron, but the students can proceed to graduate. The certification exam is something that they take on conclusion of graduation. To the best of my knowledge, the students would still be able to proceed with that, but I believe that Dean Boyce

would probably have the best information for you in regard to the details.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: All right. Then I do have a series of questions related to that, so we will pose them to her afterwards since she would be the person with the most accurate information on that because I also wanted to know were there any indicators that Lehman's class of 2019 was a little below the mark with the indicators and what's being done now to ensure that for this class-- the next class that does sit for the exam-- that they do meet that minimum standard of 80 percent. Is that also questions that Dean Boyce would have the answer to?

DIRECTOR RILEY: I think those are very good questions to ask, Chair Barron. Again, not been privy to the details, I believe that Dean Boyce would be the best one to be able to respond to those specifics.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And then, just for the record, I want to put this question on answered by Dean Boyce and it regards LaGuardia community college nursing students that had contacted my office previously about an ongoing issue that was first raised during the final term of my predecessor.

My husband was then Council member, Charles Barron. And students were concerned that their final grades in a course, while enrolled in a nursing program and we worked with them, but we never-- the resolution was that they might have to retake the course, so I just want the question on the record so that I can have a responsive what was the final outcome for those students. Did they take the SCR 290 and, if not, the did the students graduate and did they pass their Kaplan review class and were they able to take their state board exams? So, just have those questions on the record to have them responded to. And--

DIRECTOR RILEY: I'm not familiar with those details, Chair Barron, so I believe that Dean Boyce would be the best one to be able to gather that information and respond to those questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I will ask the host, there any other Council members who have questions?

MODERATOR: There are no other hands raised at this time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you so much and that concludes the question that I had for

this panel. Want to thank you for coming in for your testimony and you are dismissed. Thank you so much and the host will call the next panel. Thank you.

DIRECTOR RILEY: Thank you very much for your time.

ANNMARIE MENENDEZ: Thank you, Chair Barron, and committee.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

MODERATOR: Thank you, Chair Barron. Now that we have concluded CUNY's testimony, we will turn to public testimony. First, I would like to remind everyone that I call up individuals in panel. Once your name is called, a member of our staff will unmute you and you may begin your testimony what's the sergeant-at-arms sets the clock gives you the cue. All testimony will be limited to three minutes. Remember that there is a second-- a few seconds delay when you are on muted before we can hear you. Please wait for the sergeant-at-arms to announce that you may begin before starting your testimony. The first panel of public testimony, in order of speaking, will be Juvanie Piquant, chair of the university student senate, Sumana Ali, vice president for academic and legislative affairs at the

University student Senate, JD Vasquez, nursing student, and Amina Emmanuelle, also a nursing student. I will now call on Chair Picante.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

JUVANIE PIQUANT: Good morning, Chair Barron, and the Committee on Higher Education. My name is Juvanie Piquant and I currently serve as the chairperson of the University student Senate and student trustee at CUNY. At the University student Senate, we are the student body voice for all 500,000 students at the city University of New York advocating for the progression of affordability of higher education. I would like to give Chair Barron I thank you for holding an oversight hearing on nursing programs at CUNY. Being that we know, not nursing programs in general, but standard degrees have a whole have taken a pivot and to change throughout the pandemic. Most of these courses are heavily involved with in person interaction and on-campus learning in these times have drastically changed for our students which have affected their social and academic performance throughout CUNY. The impact on higher education during Covid 19 has greatly affected students throughout their mental

health concerns have created hardships through financial, food, and housing insecurity. A lack of support and advisement, providing in stem degrees across CUNY are greatly paramount to the issues that students face and I heard from our administration. Kind of spoke about the statistics about diversity that we have at CUNY, but I do want to highlight the disparities that are still present, you been in the field of stem. A reporter from the city, Gabriel Sandoval, wrote an article last month discussing the CUNY stem graduates. His findings found that stem graduates nearly doubled in the last decade, but disparities still persist. A study collected from the Center of an Urban Future found that CUNY students were earning stem degrees rose up to 9013 degrees last year, but cuties black and Hispanic students earned 31 percent of computer science degrees last year while representing 55 percent of the student body. In the same year, 19 degrees were awarded to women while women comprised 58 percent of the student population overall. Most underrepresented women were Hispanic and earned seven percent of all stem degrees and four percent of degrees in technology. Hispanic women make up 18

percent of the CUNY student body and I think it is important for us to understand the lack of disparities. And as we segued to what the losing of the accreditation and the Masters of family nurse practitioners at Lehman College, but we have heard from students is a lack of array of things that have also affected their academic journey and they're pursuing another nursing degree at Lehman College. Many students advocated and spoke about the lack of cultural affirmation and the use strenuous and rigorous programs support and mental health concerns and also financial and food insecurity that are happily prevalent to our students that we face. Many students expressed that it was very hard to get through the semester and the lack of support for our students, such as mental health is a huge factor, especially during these times when taking such rigorous courses and clinical hours throughout a virtual pandemic. The undergraduate Masters in family nurse practitioner degree at Lehman College, I believe from my recollection, from my research--

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

JUVANIE PIQUANT: the only degree programs that CUNY has with this accreditation. And I think

that the questions that Chair Barron asked in terms of the disparities in the racial disparities within the program, I think that it would be greatly helpful if we could see that information because I have done my research and I couldn't find the disparities across in terms the degrees that are awarded and also how we are supporting the students. I think the concept of centralized marketing and ensuring that students are supported and communication is going to be seamless and consistent and effective to our students is what we are also calling for. Additional funding for our nursing programs with CUNY and also support services to help students to sustain themselves throughout these programs are some of the demands that the University student Senate has we look forward to working with the current administration to provide a more holistic journey and to the degrees pursuing stem at the University of New York. Thank you.

MODERATOR: Thank you for your testimony. Next, we will have Sumana Ali, vice president of USS.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

SUMANA ALI: Good morning, city Council members. My name is Sumana Ali. I am the vice chair

of legislative affairs at CUNY University Senate and I am also student government member at Lehman College. Thank you for holding this hearing on nursing programs at CUNY. Lehman College is one of the most diverse, unique colleges and it serves a diverse group of minority communities who play a vital role in the city every day. Approximately 56 percent of Lehman students are Hispanic and 27 percent of Lehman students are African-American. Additionally, 67 percent of our students are female. The majority of the Lehman students reside in the Bronx in communities that have been marginalized because of their race and socioeconomic status. Covid 19 and generational injustice have plagued our communities every day. In the middle of this dire and economic and public health crisis, cuties students face tuition hikes, loss of employment, and now loss of accreditation in our programs. According to the CUNY Lehman statistics, nursing program is one of the most declared majors among undergraduate and graduate students and Lehman produces passionate healthcare workers who support the city and are now needed in the city more than ever before. There are approximately 220 students in the Lehman nursing

program and 44 of the students are now set to complete the program in December 2020 and graduating in 2021. January. In the late November, last month, Lehman College announced that nursing students will not be certified by the CCNE anymore and it was decided that the CCNE will withdraw their accreditation of Lehman nursing program, the FNP program. It's the master's program. And because of a mere technicality, now 44 FNP program who are ready to graduate will not be allowed to take their certification exam. This may look like a small number, however these students in the FNP program completed over 500 hours of clinical time with direct patient care and many of these students are also working full time while needing these rigorous requirements. Family nurse practitioners can see patients of all ages diagnose illnesses and even prescribe medication. They must get a chance to take their certification exam at the end of this year. There graduating during a pandemic while the city needs more healthcare workers, but they can't practice with their degrees as of now. At the least, the commission on collegiate nursing education--

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

SUMANA ALI: allows the students to sit on their certification exam. The students and Lehman are only asking for a chance to sit in the exam and serve the city. Our students now need the city's support and, because of what is happening in our nursing program-- and I believe it is a great injustice to minority students. After countless barriers, these students finished their program requirements and they don't even have the chance to announce it in their exam. They need their college administrators and elected representatives to deliver a result by the end of this month and it is simply unacceptable that even wanted FNP student at Lehman news tonight the right to support this exam, let alone 44. This is the time for action and, if you do say that you care about healthcare workers and minority students, this is the time to prove that you do care about their time and you care about the money and the investment that is made in CUNY. Thank you.

MODERATOR: Thank you for your testimony. Unfortunately, both JD Vasquez and Amina Emmanuelle logged out of the zoom meeting and so we are next to going to call up Anne Bove and Marina Aminova. Anne

Bove assistant professor at BMCC. You may begin once the sergeant gives you cue.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

ANNE BOVE: Okay. My name is Anne Bove. I am actually a product of CUNY times three. Generic as well as to Masters. I am also retired from Bellevue Hospital after 40 years of service and currently at BMCC faculty. I am here as a member of the Board of Directors at NYCNA and I submitted a very detailed testimony with regards to what I am going to say, so going to cut to the chase. Basically, nursing education and training moved from the schools of nursing to the academic setting in the late 60s and early 70s. When that transition happened, training was at a loss. Through the years, in terms of complementing the needing for training, hospital settings have picked it up. Who is picked it up in the city of New York primarily is New York City Health and Hospitals and it takes about three months to orient the average new graduate upon arrival to the hospital setting which ends up being, in today's world, about 30,000 dollars that the hospitals are picking up. Subsequent to the back, we also don't have the resources in terms of staff

education accordingly. So, the new graduate is coming in and looking for jobs where the private sector actually directs that new graduate and it has been my witness to the fact to the public sector for training, accordingly. Subsequently, which I would like-- not just myself, but what many of us who came from hospital-based training framework is a better bridge between academia and the hospital setting, as seen as something known as the Vermont nurse internship program. Also in terms of what was holding up transition into, you know, going back to the clinical setting was the idea of [inaudible 1:44:32] testing and that is where coordination from a centralized framework is, to me, vitally important so that you would have face mask fit testing for the 95 and, subsequently, be done by the school so that the quick transition into that clinical setting accordingly. And also in terms of supplementing the educational process that needs to be done for training in the hospitals by getting access to the graduate medical education money as the medical schools have, as well. So, this has been a problem prior to Covid and it's been totally and

exponentially increased as a result of Covid. Thank you for this time for testimony.

MODERATOR: Thank you for testifying.

Next, we have Ms. Aminova.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

MARINA AMINOVA: Good morning, everyone.

I would like to thank you for allowing me to speak today about the events circling my school. My name is Marina Aminova. I am one of the 45 students at Lehman College graduate family nurse practitioner program scheduled to graduate in just two weeks. I graduated out of Delphi University in 2009 and received my bachelor's degree in nursing. I have worked as a registered nurse in both the community and hospital. During this time, I also started a family, like many of my other fellow colleagues did, as well. I entered Lehman College in the summer of 2018 in the dream of becoming a family nurse practitioner. Many of my fellow graduate students started at the same time as I did it and somebody been before me. Many took out student loans and others use their life savings to pursue our degree. Even though we all came from different walks of life, we all became friends. We shared our struggles and

supported each other when it was hard to juggle family life, working full-time, attending school, and, at the same time, studying hard. This year hit us strong. All of us equally. The coronavirus pandemic was nothing like we have ever expected or imagined. Everywhere we turned, patients were dying in our units. Nurses were needed to work overtime. We were scared. We were exhausted. We were vulnerable. However, it did not deter us. We knew our path in life as nurses. There is no other profession like it. We lost family members. We experienced dark moments. All the while, we were still attending school and still completing hundreds upon hundreds of clinical hours needed to graduate in the most impoverished County in the state during the worst pandemic in a century. Our December graduation was our only light at the end of a very long, dark tunnel. On November 20th, our dreams became a living nightmare. We were informed by Lehman that we had lost accreditation mere weeks prior to our graduation. We do not know that details about what happened and we were only made aware by chance when our fellow students and make cohort began to apply for their boards only to be rejected over the summer

due to loss of accreditation in June. Frazzled and confused, we began to email our department heads. We were told everything will be okay and continue to keep studying hard as the school secured an appeals hearing in November and were confident it was going to go in their favor. But on November 20th, we face date horrifying reality that these last years, years of hard work, sacrifice, time away from spouses, parents, and our children, time away from work, forgone income, paid tuition, tireless studying has all been for nothing. The fact that this matter resonates beyond the student body and our families is evidenced by the media attention this matter has generated and the significant number of signatures out online petition has accrued. Our communities are just as devastated and affected by this horrific news. It is as much of a loss to them as it is to us. We learned so far that, in 2017, CCNE made Lehman aware of the standard that was not met to keep accreditation. By 2019, Lehman put policies in place to meet the required standard. The 2019 cohort show proof that these policies were working--

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

MARINA AMINOVA: and a 2020 cohort would show the same. However, despite the law passed in July to allow and encourage accrediting bodies to allow more time for programs to come up to par. CCNE still withdrew their accreditation. We were notified by the Dean that a letter was sent out to CCNE requesting to postpone the 20th-- November 20th accreditation to February so that we can finish a school that was CCNE approved. They are holding a meeting today of the Board of Commissioners at CCNE. However, we were notified by the Dean that CCNE has every right to deny our request. I'd also like to point out that, while graduating, in New York State, we have a valid degree, graduating without CCNE accreditation is not an option. We are not allowed to bill Medicare and Medicaid. Nobody will hire us without being board-certified and the only thing we will have is just a valid degree hanging on our walls. Thank you.

MODERATOR: Thank you for your testimony. And as it seems that we only have one more person logged in to testify, we will go to that person. In the meantime, if I have inadvertently missed anyone, please use the raise hand function in Zoom. So, next

we will have Sanai Sio. You may begin when the sergeant gives you the cue.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

MODERATOR: Sanai Sio, are you present? There should be a window popping up on your computer asking you to unmute yourself. Unfortunately, we will move on and, Sanai, if you come back, please use the raise hand function in zoom. I will turn to Chair Barron for questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Ms. Rivera. You are doing a great job juggling and getting everyone on. I want to thank this panel because this is a panel and I'm also appreciative of the fact that the CUNY personnel are still here to be able to hear personally what your testimony has been. Talking about first the underrepresentation of the black and brown communities, glad to hear that CUNY exceeds what is nationally the standard and statewide the standard. That is good news. And I think we are looking to the broad field of science, technology, and math and the underrepresentation in that part. But certainly, as we have heard from Ms. Ali about the percentages-- I think she cited 56 percent Latin and 27 percent African-American and talked about all

of the hikes of tuition and the stress and all of the things that have been adored by the students that are working so hard and certainly Ms. Aminova-- not sure if I got the name properly-- brought it home because she is directly impacted by that. So, I do have a couple questions, as well. Ms. Anne Bove-- I'm not sure the correct pronunciation. Please give it to me. We talked about the Vermont nurse intern program. If you could speak a little about that, I would like information on that.

ANNE BOVE: That is a program that was established maybe 20 years ago and what Vermont, as a small state, is it took the state education department as well as the schools in terms of faculty and students, as well as the clinical setting and in terms of the healthcare agencies with administration, clinical educators, and then staff to put together how to make a seamless transition from the academic setting to the clinical setting. As I mentioned to you, it takes about three months for an average orientation for med surge [sic] and, since now, what's considered nursing education and training is in the academic setting, funding does not go to the hospital anymore to provide the appropriate

accoutrements and staffing for that training. So, what this group did is they developed a seamless transitional preceptor type of presentation and New York City Health and Hospitals, about maybe 15 years ago, you know, looked at that and instituted a preceptor program accordingly. But, once again, funding is - you because you have to provide staff and when you are developing a preceptor program, that orientee is not counted in the numbers as a direct care provider, so, basically, that is where about 30,000 comes from, as well as the added professional development through instructors by staff development that needs to be. So, incorrect costs, you are looking at 30,000, but by developing this transitional process, they were able to cut costs accordingly. But I do think that there has to be-- not just myself, but my colleagues from the professional development, staff development framework from which I come before I was on faculty, believe that there needs to be a stronger transitional process and a stronger link-- a stronger bridge between the academic setting and HHC. Or H&H as we know it now. And, you know, the best link is CUNY to H&H and it would also transition more people into--

or more nurses into the positions that are so sorely needed. And just as a subjective framework, you know, I have been subjected to, you know, young nurses coming to me saying, you know, that hospitals have actually told them to go get your two years or year and a city hospital and then come back and we will hire you in terms of the private sector. And, you know, I-- you know, I truly believe H&H is the foundation for healthcare in New York City and I do believe that CUNY is the foundation of education in New York City, as well and I just think that we need to be able to bring those two together more collaboratively in terms of this training and educational process accordingly so that we can deal with the shortage as needed. And there is graduate medical education money that is out there for hospital-based training [inaudible 01:56:02] claim, but since schools are not-- nursing programs are not considered hospital-based. They are not, you know, allocated-- the hospitals are not allocated those funds when, in reality, we are still doing the training. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So this another-- a new aspect for me and I'm trying to get

a better understanding. So, as a person in the field of education, you take your education classes, you get your placement, you get your student teaching, you get your degree. You pass the exam and you are licensed to teach. When you get to the school where you are, you may be assigned a buddy teacher to help, you know, navigate the processes. But are you saying that when these graduates come to you after completing all of those preliminary work that there is a three month period that--

ANNE BOVE: Yes. They cannot [inaudible 01:57:06]. So, they can't be-- it's not like, you know-- I wasn't in that. I went to Hunter. I graduated now 1978, so I did supplementary practice on weekends. Like they had programs where you could supplement your training, about one-- if a new graduate goes through a nursing program, then there somebody by the name of Patricia Benner and she recognized the concept of novice to expert and, when they come out as novices and, you know, as a new graduate, they are not skilled to take care of the full role of a registered nurse at that time. And that is what orientation is all about. You know, their clinical experience is one to two patients and

even if we get nurse-patient ratios passed in New York State, they are not able to, and must more limited now, in terms of coming out and taking that full patient assignment.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. That's new information to me and that is helpful. You say that that process costs the hospital about 30,000 dollars?

ANNE BOVE: That is. Let's including salary and benefits and also the salaries of those people in staff development that are bringing along this orientation process.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you. That is helpful to know. I wanted to ask Ms. Aminova-- and please give me the correct pronunciation-- what is the status now? What can you expect as part of that group of people who were denied the opportunity to even sit for the exam, what is your status? What is your expectation? What are your plans? What can be done to bring pressure to bear what kinds of alternative platforms the systems can be used from your perspective?

MARINA AMINOVA: Well, truth be told, we don't really know what options we have. We are being told that we can go ahead and graduate and receive

our degree, however, when we spoke to CCNE, they told us that, if you do that and Lehman one day in the future receives accreditation again, we will be excluded from sitting for the boards. So if we decide to chose that route, there's really not much we can do and there's only three states in this country where you are legally allowed to practice. New York, California, and, I believe, Arkansas. But, regardless, in New York, we cannot bill. Most, if not all, hospitals and companies want you to be board certified within a year. So, really, that is not an option and when we asked the school what routes are they taking, it's really just letters that they have told us that they sent out for now. They sent out a letter to CCNE asking for an extension-- a good cause extension until February-- and they also sent out a letter to AANP which is the second testing body to show them that we are-- NYCED is nationally accredited. Which, in fact, they showed us a letter that they received from the US Department of Education stating that NYCED is nationally recognized as a school-- as an accrediting body. As an accredited body. However, NYCED is not an accrediting body which means they can't go ahead and

accredit schools outside of New York. They are strictly regional. So I'm not really sure what they are arguing with AANP. Honestly, we don't really know what other choices we have and that is what we are trying to figure out because time is of the essence for us. We are literally 15 days away. We don't know if we should postpone graduation. Is there a point to postpone? If we postpone, and six months, people have student loans that they need to begin to pay. You know, we spent this money on this degree and now we won't have the income to recoup what we invested. We don't really know where we stand and that is why we are trying to reach out to anybody that will listen. We reached out to CCNE we reached out to ANCC, to AANP, to NYCNA, to ANA. I mean, whoever you can think of, we reached out to them for help because we don't know what to do at this point.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Is Lehman the only school that offers this Masters in NFP?

MARINA AMINOVA: The only CUNY school.
Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

MARINA AMINOVA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The only CUNY school system within CUNY as a University wide system, might there be some way to transfer it to another institution campus, but if you are the only one, then that's, apparently, not something that could happen.

MARINA AMINOVA: Well, we also asked the school if they could help us transfer to any school in New York State, even a SUNY school. There's two SUNY schools that have it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Which two were those?

MARINA AMINOVA: Down State and Stoneybrook.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh.

MARINA AMINOVA: And we were told that, if you want to transfer, that is your decision. We will not help you in that. That is what our Dean of Nursing said. So we are on our own with that. And when we looked into SUNY schools and any other private schools, for that matter, the maximum transfer credits they are willing to take is nine credit.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Hm.

MARINA AMINOVA: So that's not an option either. We'd be starting all over.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I would think that, you know, with at SUNY school, had there been one, I would think that that might've been a path that we might pursue. But I think you could understand that another institution outside of CUNY might be reluctant to take someone that they haven't had any affiliation with based on the fact that they are coming from a school that has lost their accreditation. I can understand why they would be hesitant to say, oh, okay. Come on and we will make any kind of transfer arrangement so that you can set - because I think they might be fearful that that might negatively impact their results. So, I can understand.

MARINA AMINOVA: Absolutely. And that's what we thought, as well. And all the more reason. And we were told by ANCC, which is the testing body, that Lehman can secure a deal with CCNE to have a good cause extension. And vice versa. When we spoke to CCNE associate director, they told us that Lehman can secure a deal with ANCC to allow us to be grandfathered in and make an exception for us. And

it seems like the examination body and the accrediting body are pointing fingers at each other and Lehman is in the center that has to secure deals and I don't know what kind of deals they are securing past the letter that they sent.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what would-- do you know what this could cause extension would do?

MARINA AMINOVA: It would postpone the November 20th withdrawal to February 21st. that's the good cause.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I see.

MARINA AMINOVA: Think of our cohort to be--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That your cohort could then take the exam--

MARINA AMINOVA: Yes. And we can graduate from an accredited school. And higher education, if we wanted to pursue other routes, like we were thinking maybe we could pursue our DNP. Maybe we could get our post master's degree. All of the schools that we looked into, both state schools, private schools, and online schools all require you to have a master's degree from a CCNE accredited school. So, we can't even pursue higher education.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The prerequisite for all the other ideas that you are talking about. Okay. Well, we've got to think it deep. As you say, the clock is ticking. The sands are running through our glass and I am sure that we can put our heads together and perhaps need to reach out to assembly members and state senators in their capacity as state legislature to add their voices to this issue which, as you have indicated, is fairly recent in coming to our attention, but we need to put our heads together and come up with something. So I would like to offer some time on Monday for us to brainstorm or whoever is taking the lead on this, how we can be supportive in raising the critical nature of the situation, particularly in this time of Covid, and get some resolution that resolves this-- that brings us a resolution that benefits the students that have, as you so adequately talked about, invested so much into getting to this point. But I just want to thank the panel for their testimony and, again, my office, I'm ready to give whatever assistance I can to get the resolution of this.

MARINA AMINOVA: Can I ask you how I can follow up with either you or anybody else in regards

to what kind of decisions and discussions will take place in the upcoming weeks?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. You can reach out to my staff and you can reach out to the CUNY staff. My staff you can text m Washington-- not text. Email MWashington@Council.NYC.gov. And perhaps Ms. Rivera will be able to offer another contact with the City Council. Okay. Thank you. I'll turn it back now to the moderator, Ms. Rivera.

MODERATOR: Thank you, Chair Barron. I would like to just make one more call for Sanai Sio. A member of our staff is trying to unmute you. If you can accept and present your testimony? All right. Seeing that Sanai Sio is unresponsive, I am going to ask if any Council members have any questions at this time for this panel. Not seeing any Council members logged in, that I would like to remind everyone that, if they would like to submit written testimony, they may do so within 72 hours of this hearing date by emailing testimony@Council.NYC.gov and we have now concluded this hearing. Chair Barron?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very much and, with that, I declare that this hearing is

adjourned thank you so much to all the staff that worked so diligently behind the scenes making this hearing possible. Thank you.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 20, 2021