

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

DECEMBER 15, 2020  
Start: 3:08 P.M.  
Recess: 3:22 P.M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 5)

B E F O R E: MARK TREYGER, CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL  
INEZ D. BARRON  
JOSEPH C. BORELLI  
JUSTIN L. BRANNAN  
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.  
DANIEL DROMM  
BARRY S. GRODENCHIK  
BEN KALLOS  
BRAD S. LANDER  
STEPHEN T. LEVIN  
MARK LEVINE  
FARAH N. LOUIS  
I. DANEEK MILLER  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
DEBORAH L. ROSE  
RAFAEL SALAMANCA  
ERIC A. ULRICH

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

WILLIAM MARTIN, Committee Clerk

MALCOLM BUDAHORN (SP?)

2 JOHANNA M. CASTRO: We're live.

3 SGT. SADOWSKY: Good afternoon. At this  
4 time will Sargeants please start their recordings?  
5 PC recording is started.

6 SGT. PEREZ: Backup is rolling.

7 SGT. SADOWSKY: Thank you. And at this  
8 time will Sargeant Leonardo start with his opening  
9 statement.

10 SGT. LEONARDO: Good afternoon. And  
11 welcome to the New York City Council Remote Hearing  
12 on the Committee on Education. At this time, we al..  
13 we ask that all Council Staff please turn on their  
14 video for verification purposes. To minimize  
15 disruptions, please place cellphones and electronic  
16 devices to silent or vibrate. We thank you for your  
17 cooperation. Chair, we are ready to begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Great. Thank  
19 you and we've been joined Malcolm Budahorn?

20 MALCOLM BUDAHORN: Yes Chair, Clem and  
21 I are here.

22 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: And we are  
23 here voting on Proposed Legislation that we report on  
24 metrics with regard to remote learning and other  
25 important data about the learning experiences for our

2 children uhm and Malcolm is there uhm anything else  
3 uhm we should know about the Bill, items that were in  
4 final negotiations? Any update before we go for a  
5 full vote?

6 MALCOLM BUDAHORN: Uhm, no, we just  
7 expanded the categories of students that will be  
8 reported to include students in temporary housing and  
9 students in shelter and in your Bill, Intro 20...  
10 Proposed Intro 2104A we also added students in foster  
11 care and in both pieces of Legislation we added the  
12 new level of disaggregation so we can manipulate the  
13 data on a more granular level than the way we  
14 typically have written Bills in past so I think it  
15 will give us a lot of more insight into remote  
16 learning attendance and also certain reporting on  
17 COVID metrics.

18 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Right and also  
19 just to share with my colleagues, we will be getting  
20 information about the number of students who were  
21 uhm, referred to summer school, uhm, the number of  
22 our students were given a holding grade called a  
23 course in progress that is worrisome to me. We don't  
24 know where they stand. Many kids have fallen behind,  
25 no fault of their own. We have kids who still have

2 not received the device, still don't have reliable  
3 internet and they have until January to make up work  
4 uhm, no fault of their own that they have fallen  
5 behind on, otherwise, it could be permanent impacts  
6 on their transcripts. Uhm DOE has not given us this  
7 information and a lot of this will be required in  
8 reports to the City Council. So, I do appreciate uhm  
9 Malcolm Budahorn, the entire education policy team,  
10 my staff for helping move this forward and  
11 negotiating this, this language. I also just wanted  
12 to note for attendance purposes, we've been joined by  
13 Council Member Grodenchik, Council Member Ampry-  
14 Samuel, Council Member Borelli, Council Member  
15 Brannan, Council Member Cornegy, Council Member  
16 Louis, Council Member Dromm, Council Member Levine,  
17 Council Member Barron, and if I missed anyb... Council  
18 Member Salamanca, Council Member Lander, and if I  
19 missed anyone forgive me but with that we are, we are  
20 ready to call, to call the vote.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Alright,  
22 good afternoon, William Martin, Committee Clerk, roll  
23 call vote, Committee on Education, Introductions  
24 2058A and 2104A. Items are coupled, Chair Treyger?

25 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: I, I vote aye.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

6

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
3 you. Barron?

4 INEZ BARRON: I vote aye and  
5 congratulations to the Chair, much needed information  
6 via these Bills and I hope that I have already been  
7 added to the list of supporters, thank you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
9 you, and Council Member Barron yes you have. Uhm  
10 Cornegy?

11 ROBERT CORNEGY: Uhm, I vote aye, I would  
12 like to be added to both Bills please.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Sure.  
14 Dromm?

15 DANIEL DROMM: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
17 you. Lander? I will come back to Council Member  
18 Lander. Council Member Levine?

19 MARK LEVINE: Yes, I would like to vote  
20 aye, thank you and congrats Chair on your continuing  
21 outstanding leadership on this.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:  
23 Grodenchik?

24 BARRY GRODENCHIK: Aye.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 7

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Uhm,  
3 Council Member Salamanca?

4 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: I vote aye.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
6 you. Ampry-Samuel?

7 ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
9 you. Brannan?

10 JUSTIN BRANNAN: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Louis?

12 FARAH LOUIS: I vote aye and thank you  
13 Chair Treyger for your sponsor advocacy always, thank  
14 you.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Borelli?

16 JOSEPH BORELLI: I vote aye and please  
17 add me to both Bills.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:  
19 Absolutely. Okay uhm, Council Member Lander?

20 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Council Member  
21 Lander will be with us in one moment, he just  
22 messaged me.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Okay  
24 uhm, by vote of 10 in the affirmative, zero in the

25

2 negative and no abstentions, both items have been  
3 adopted by the Committee.

4 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Thank you I  
5 also want to give a shout out to Council Member Farah  
6 Louis who has been very, very uhm, uhm active and  
7 vocal in the need for technology devices for all of  
8 our children. We have thousands of kids still  
9 without devices, I know that she is advancing both  
10 resolutions and local measures as well so I just want  
11 to acknowledge her great work on that as well and  
12 also thank all of my colleagues for their tremendous  
13 leadership and support during these very challenging  
14 times. Did we hear from Council Member Grodenchik?  
15 Forgive me, if I don't know if I heard his vote?

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Uhm, he  
17 is currently logged off. He was here.

18 BARRY GRODENCHIK: I'm here, I'm here,  
19 I'm here.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Oh  
21 there, he is, Council Member Grodenchik?

22 BARRY GRODENCHIK: Queens is in the  
23 house. I'm here. Very few, I just want to note very  
24 few people Mr. Chair ask for me to speak more. So, I



2 just want to put that on the record. I did vote aye.  
3 I hope that, Clerk, I think you heard me.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Uhm, I  
5 have you now.

6 BARRY GRODENCHIK: Uhm, and I want to  
7 thank you for your work here, it is very important,  
8 uhm, you know when a child doesn't have a device it's  
9 everything, you know it's, it's impossible to do  
10 business. You know, I remember, I come from a time  
11 when chalkboards and uhm Chair Dromm of the finance  
12 committee knows that well, because he was a teacher  
13 with chalk. But uhm, but now I remember at my son's  
14 school when they had one, just one smart board and  
15 uhm now they're, I've cried seeing some of the things  
16 they've done with smartboards in school, especially  
17 working with children with an IEP, uhm and thank you  
18 for your work and I think I have said enough Mr.  
19 Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Council  
22 Member Lander joined us.

23 BRAD LANDER: Thank you so much, Mr.  
24 Chair, I am here. Thank you for your just really  
25 fierce leadership on this stuff which is just so

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 10

2 extraordinarily important, I mean the fact that 75%  
3 of our kids are getting all of their education  
4 remotely and that the other 25% are getting at least  
5 half of it that way and that we haven't paid enough  
6 attention to doing that. Uhm, you know it is just  
7 really one of the unusual things of this crisis. So,  
8 thank you very much for your insisting that we pay  
9 attention to it and I vote aye on all. Thank you.

10 COMMITTEE CHAIR WILLIAM MARTIN: Council  
11 Member Rodriguez?

12 YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, so, first of all  
13 thank you and for the great leaders, Chair, and I  
14 think that I you know, focusing on technology is  
15 something that we need to address. As every knows, it  
16 would take 100 years to close the gap of winning of  
17 people of color and technology and I think I know now  
18 that the actually the working class are completely  
19 different than upper and middle class have in the  
20 City of New York. It doesn't matter how hard we try  
21 but at least we know that we are trying to do the  
22 best. With that I will vote aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
24 you, current vote now on both items is 13 in the  
25 affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

11

2 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: And did we  
3 hear an estimate of time of when we might hear from  
4 Council Member Kallos?

5 BARRY GRODENCHIK: He had mentioned 3:30  
6 before Mr. Chairman when I was here before but uhm  
7 maybe he can duck back in, I don't know.

8 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Okay, uhm so I  
9 don't mind holding the vote open until 3:30 if the  
10 Council folks are okay with that. I'm okay with  
11 holding the vote open until 3:30.

12 JOHANNA CASTRO: We are okay with holding  
13 the vote until 3:30.

14 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Good.

15 SGT. LEONARDO: Chair Treyger?

16 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Yes.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Council  
18 Member Kallos is present.

19 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Great.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Council  
21 Member Kallos, vote on Introduction 2058A and 2104A.

22 BEN KALLOS: I vote aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank you  
24 sir. The vote is currently now at 14 in the

25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

12

2 affirmative, zero negative and no abstentions on  
3 both.

4 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Was there  
5 anyone else that we were waiting for? Because I  
6 know we were waiting for Ben, uhm Council Member  
7 Kallos.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: That was  
9 all.

10 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: Thank you.  
11 Okay great, great, so I think with all we can now  
12 adjourn, adjourn the meeting, adjourn the vote.

13 SGT. LEONARDO: Okay, we opened  
14 Education again.

15 SGT. SADOWSKI: Sargeants please start  
16 your recordings. Audio is going.

17 SGT. PEREZ: Backup is rolling.

18 SGT. LEONARDO: Just one second, I have  
19 to restart the PC I think the cloud was started  
20 first. Pause it now. PC recording is going.

21 SGT. PEREZ: The cloud is good.

22 SGT. SADOWSKI: Thank you. Alright you  
23 are all set Billy.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
25 you uhm again William Martin Committee Clerk, uhm

2 reopening the roll call on the Committee on  
3 Education. Council Member Rose? Introductions 2058A  
4 and 2104A.

5 DEBORAH ROSE: I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
7 you, the vote is currently.

8 DEBORAH ROSE: On both.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: At 15 in  
10 the affirmative, zero in the negative and no  
11 abstentions.

12 DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you Billy. Thank you  
13 all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
15 you.

16 DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MARK TREYGER: We are staying  
18 on here for Housing and Buildings, right?

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

14

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 12, 2021