

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING
AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

December 2, 2020
Start: 2:03 P.M.
Recess: 2:56 P.M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
Chairperson

JEFFREY CAMPAGNA
Subcommittee Counsel

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Adams
Peter A. Koo
Daneek Miller
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kate Lemos McHale, Director of Research,
Landmarks Preservation Commission

Anthony Fabre

Christine Flaherty New York City Health and
Hospitals Corporation

Dr. Rosa Gil Testifying, Communo Life

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND
DISPOSITIONS 4

2 MALE SPEAKER: We view the recording good.

3 MALE SPEAKER: Clatter going and you sounded.

4 MALE SPEAKER: Back-up has started.

5 CHRISTINE FLAHERTY: Okay if you can use
6 that with his opening statement.

7 MALE SPEAKER: Good afternoon and welcome to
8 today's remote New York City Council hearing of the
9 Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and
10 Dispositions. At this time would all panelists
11 please turn on their video. To minimize disruption
12 please silence your electronic devices, and if you
13 wish to submit testimony, you may do so via email
14 at Land Use Testimony at Council.nyc.gov. I
15 believe that's Land Use Testimony at
16 Council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your cooperation.
17 We are ready to begin, Chair. Thank you.

18 CHAIR ADAMS: (Gavel) good afternoon. I'm
19 Council Member Adrienne Adams, Chair of the
20 Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and
21 Dispositions. I'm appearing remotely today with
22 Barron, Koo and Miller. Today, we will have two
23 public hearings. The first will be on the landmark
24 designation of Public School 48 in Queens near and
25 dear to my heart. The second will be on the Health

2 and Hospitals Corporation's Proposed 99-year lease
3 of land at Woodhull Hospital with the construction
4 of affordable and supportive housing. Before we
5 begin I recognize (coughs) to review today's
6 hearing procedure.

7 JEFFEREY CAMPAGNA: Thank you Chair Adams
8 Jeffrey Campagna, Counsel to this Subcommittee.
9 Members of the public who wish to testify were
10 asked to register for today's hearing. If you wish
11 to testify and have not registered, please go to
12 www.council.nyc.gov to sign up now. If you are a
13 member of the public who wants to watch this
14 hearing, please watch the hearing on the New York
15 City Council website. All people testifying before
16 the Subcommittee will be on mute until they are
17 recognized by the Chair to testify. When the Chair
18 recognizes you, your mic will be unmuted. Please
19 confirm that your mic is unmuted before you begin
20 speaking. Public testimony will be limited to two
21 minutes per witness. If you have additional
22 testimony you would like the subcommittee to
23 consider or if you have written testimony you would
24 like to submit in lieu of appearing before the
25 subcommittee, you can email it to Land Use

2 Testimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicate the LU
3 number or project name in the subject line of the
4 email and as both items we are hearing today are
5 preconsidered, please note they are preconsidered
6 and state the application number. During the
7 hearing Council Members who would like to ask
8 questions should use the Zoom Raise Hand function.
9 The Raise Hand button should appear at the bottom
10 of the participant panel. I will announce Council
11 Members who have questions in the order that they
12 raise their hands. Chair Adams will then recognize
13 members to speak. Witnesses are reminded to remain
14 in the meeting until they are excused by the Chair.
15 Council Members may have questions. Lastly, there
16 may be extended pauses if we encounter technical
17 problems. We ask that you please be patient as we
18 work through these issues. Chair Adams will now
19 continue with today's agenda items.

20 CHAIR ADAMS: Thank you very much Counselor.
21 I now open the public hearing on Preconsidered
22 Application Number 20215007, the Landmark
23 Preservation Commission's designation of Public
24 School 48 now known as P75Q the Robert E. Peary
25 School as a historic landmark. The landmark site is

2 located on the northwest corner of 156th Street and
3 108th Avenue in the South Jamaica Neighborhood of
4 Queens that I represent. Personally, I have a
5 tremendous thanks to offer to Jeff Gottlieb a
6 relentless Queens Historian who pushed for this
7 designation for well over a decade. Jeff recognized
8 the gem that is the Robert E. Peary School that
9 early on incorporated the use of art deco in the
10 design of an elementary school. This was
11 consciously done by the Board of Education to
12 reliever overcrowding in my South Jamaica School
13 District after World War I. The Jamaica colored
14 school as it was then known, would now house Public
15 School 48, which has served the community under the
16 exemplary leadership of Principal Patricia Mitchell
17 and the educators and staff at PS-48 who continue a
18 legacy of excellence and learning for the scholars
19 at PS-48. This designation will most certainly be
20 a great marker of pride and distinction for
21 generations to come for the graduates and for the
22 greater Southeast Queens community. Queens has so
23 much history to offer, and we have to do much more
24 to ensure that history records our architectural

2 and artistic contributions to the City of New York.
3 Counsel, please call the applicant panel.

4 JEFFEREY CAMPAGNA: Testifying on behalf of the
5 Landmarks Preservation Commission we have Kate
6 Lemos McHale and Anthony Fabre. Could you please
7 raise your right hands and state your names.

8 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Kate Lemos McHale.

9 ANTHONY FABRE: Anthony Fabre.

10 JEFFEREY CAMPAGNA: Do you affirm to tell the
11 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
12 your testimony before this subcommittee and in
13 answer to all Council Member questions?

14 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: I do.

15 JEFFEREY CAMPAGNA: I do.

16 CHAIR ADAMS: Thank you. Your presentation is
17 being loaded into Zoom and will be displayed when
18 you request it. Slides will be advanced at your
19 request. Before you begin, once again state your
20 name and affiliation for the record. You may begin.

21 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Good morning, Chair Adams
22 and Subcommittee members. I'm Kate Lemos McHale,
23 Director of Research at the Landmarks Preservation
24 Commission, and thank you for the opportunity to
25 present P.S. 48 in Queens designated on September

2 22nd as an individual landmark, and thank you in
3 particular Chair Adams for your support for this
4 designation. Whenever ready we could go to our
5 first slide. (pause) and the next, please. Great.
6 First proposed in 1931 and completed in 1936, the
7 Art Deco style Public School 48 in Jamaica
8 represents an extensive construction program
9 undertaken by the New York City Board of Education
10 to reliver overcrowding in extisting school
11 districts and to meet the needs of new growing
12 residential neighborhoods after World Was I. It is
13 a notable design by Architect Walter C. Martin, and
14 an earliest of the art deco style for elementary
15 school buildings demonstrating innovations in
16 school planning and a stylistic shift away from the
17 more traditional revival styles commonly used in
18 the early 20th Century and into the 1940s. At the
19 Landmarks Commission's public hearing on August
20 4th, the Commission received support for the
21 proposed designation from four people including
22 Council Member Adrienne Adams, and representatives
23 from the New York Landmarks Conservancy, Historic
24 Districts Council and the Art Deco Society of New
25 York. No one spoke in opposition, and in addition

2 we received one letter of support from the Jeff
3 Gottlieb. Next, please. The Public School 48 is
4 located at the southeast corner of 108th Avenue and
5 155th Street in South Jamaica, Queens. Next
6 please. These maps from 1891 on the left and 1907
7 on the right show the eventual location of Public
8 School 48 with blue stars. Jamaica one of the five
9 towns that made up Queens County prior to 1898 was
10 a vital link between the farms of Long Island and
11 the markets of New York. The Downtown developed
12 throughout the 18th and 19th centuries as a result
13 of improved roads and public transportation.
14 However, the area known as South Jamaica remained
15 largely rural farm land until the 20th Century, and
16 residential development remained scattered into the
17 1920s. Next, please.

18 MALE SPEAKER: Okay, there it is. I see it.

19 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Plans for a single citywide
20 school system began prior to New York City's
21 consolidation and a reorganized Board of Education
22 was established in 1901 to administer the system.
23 The prior year the State Legislator, Legislature
24 had amended the Consolidation School Law governing
25 the city' schools, abolishing separated segregated

2 schools for African-American children. By 1901
3 P.S. 48 was established in a one-story wood school
4 house which had been built in 1886 as Jamaica's
5 "colored school." P.S. 48 was housed there until
6 the new school was completed in 1936, and that
7 school building is shown here on the right and
8 indicated with the black outline in this map. The
9 population grew in the 20th Century as the former
10 farmland of South Jamaica was developed and a
11 diverse working-class neighborhood grew around the
12 area that would be chosen for the new school shown
13 with a blue star. Next please. Efforts to replace
14 the old school house had begun as early as 1905,
15 but it was not until 1931 that plans to build a new
16 Public School 48 at 108th Avenue and 150th Street
17 were first announced. The following year it was
18 reported that the new school would be the first to
19 be built along the P type plans incorporating an
20 extended auditorium wing with space for more
21 classrooms as shown in this rendering.
22 Superintendent of Buildings Walter C. Martin had
23 originally developed the P type plan in 1930, but
24 it appears to have been put aside until its use for
25 PS48. Next please. Walter C. Martin served as

2 Superintendent of Buildings for the Board of
3 Education from 1928 until 1938 during which time he
4 designed hundreds of new schools or additions to
5 existing schools throughout the five boroughs
6 including 34 new elementary schools and five high
7 schools in Queens alone. The Herman Ridder Junior
8 High School in the Bronx shown here is perhaps his
9 most notable building built in 1929 to '31 and a
10 New York City landmark. Martin's school designs
11 were executed in a variety of styles from
12 Renaissance Revival to Colonial Revival to the art
13 deco seen here displaying a range of stylistic
14 approaches to school design in the interwar period.
15 Martin used the modernistic or art deco style for
16 some large projects such as Herman Bitter, and
17 adapted it for smaller elementary schools like P.S.
18 48 where his use of the style created modern civic
19 monuments for growing communities. Next, please.
20 Constructed between 1932 and 1936 Martin's design
21 for the three-story Public School 48 indeed imparts
22 a sense of monumentality appropriate to a civic
23 structure anchored with strong corner towers and
24 featuring vertical piers with stylized foliate
25 capitals creating the impression of a crenellated

2 parapet. Next, please. His use of the art deco
3 style drew inspiration from industrial and
4 commercial buildings reflected in its large window
5 openings originally with awning windows as seen in
6 the 1940 Tech photo on the right, and incorporated
7 distinctive decorative treatment not seen on some
8 of his other schools in the style. Next please.
9 Drawing upon a decorative pallet used in his design
10 for Ridder Junior High School, Martin highlighted
11 the main façade with bi-color bricks spandrels, bi-
12 color terracotta plaques evocative of the
13 importance of education, stylize foliate plaques
14 atop the peters and granite entrance around
15 featuring stylized eagles that bronze stores with
16 bronze enflamed multi-light transoms. These highly
17 distinctive decorative features set P.S. 48 apart
18 from other schools of the period and style. Next,
19 please, and in lieu of carving the name of the
20 school on the façade, Martin applied stylized
21 cartouches with the schools numerical designation
22 balancing them with the New York City Board of
23 Education seals just above the base of the towers.
24 Next please. Prominent within the neighborhood of
25 South Jamaica, Public School 48 has served its

2 community for more than 70 years. Little changed
3 since its opening on May 4th, 1936. It is a highly
4 intact example of Walter C. Martin's use of the art
5 deco style in the 1930s. Its successful brand of
6 art deco design elements and massing was novel for
7 elementary schools at the time it was proposed, and
8 it represents a significant early application of
9 this style for New York City schools. I urge the
10 Subcommittee to uphold LPC's designation of Public
11 School 48, now P-75Q at P.S. 48, the Robert E.
12 Peary School as a New York City Landmark. Thank
13 you very much.

14 CHAIR ADAMS: Thank you very much Kate. I think
15 you all know what this means to me, to the district
16 to the community to the students, the educators to
17 have this landmark finally happen. So, thank you
18 for all your hard work on this particular landmark.
19 Thanks.

20 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you.

21 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay. I'm going to invite my
22 colleagues to ask any questions at this time.
23 Colleagues, if you have questions please click on
24 the Raise Hand button on the participating panel.
25 So, now are there any Council Member questions?

2 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: Council Members if you have
3 questions please use the Raise Hand button. Council
4 Member Miller has a question.

5 CHAIR ADAMS: Council Member Miller?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Again, good afternoon
7 Chair Adams. We thank you for this designation. It
8 is important to the Jamaica community like there
9 because it is so good that you're doing this, and
10 often times, you know, I remember when people were
11 raising this voice, and you kept that light
12 shining. So, it's very important that we're able to
13 do this. So, as you move forward in are there any
14 responsibilities that go along with the maintenance
15 of this facility specific to its designation?

16 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Well, um, if there are any
17 Landmarks' proposed changes to the exterior of the
18 building would come to the Commission. There are a
19 lot of general maintenance that we don't need to
20 see, but things like window replacement or changes
21 to the façade would come to us. Our staff does
22 approve a lot of proposals for work without needing
23 to go to the Commission, and we do have a good
24 working relationship with the Board of Education.
25 So, it was, you know, this is a hard time for

2 schools as we all know and so we do have a lot of
3 experience with the needs of school buildings and
4 approving changes that need to be made.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank you.

6 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: Council Member Barron has a
7 question.

8 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay, Council Member Barron.

9 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: Please unmute Council
10 Member Barron.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank you,
12 Madam Chair and thank you to the panelists. If you
13 could go back to the screen that has the cartouche
14 on it. Just wanted to have a quick comment. Can we
15 do that. Can they see the screen again that had the
16 cartouche? Is the presenter able to scroll back to
17 that?

18 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: On that ma'am. We're
19 working on that.

20 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay, thank you.

21 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Is it this one?

22 CHAIR ADAMS: Yes, this is it, this is it. The
23 middle slide says Cartouche. I just wanted to point
24 out for people who may not know that a cartouche is
25 from the Egyptian culture, and what it is, is it's

2 a framing as you can see by the boundaries of what
3 is the exact center of that presentation, and I
4 just wanted it to be noted that it had origins in
5 Egypt, ancient Egypt I think back to the fourth
6 Dynasty. So, I just wanted to make that comment.

7 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you.

8 CHAIR ADAMS: That was great, and that's our
9 resident (laughter) thank you so much, Council
10 Member Barron...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

12 CHAIR ADAMS:...for bringing the history
13 always. Thank you. I would also like recognize
14 we've been joined Council Member Treyger. Council
15 are there any other question?

16 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: I see no other Council
17 Member questions.

18 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay. There being no further
19 questions for this panel, the panel is excused and
20 thank you again very much.

21 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you.

22 CHAIR ADAMS: Counsel, are there any members
23 of the public who wish to testify on this item?

24 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: There are no members of the
25 public who have signed up to testify on this item.

2 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay. We are going to move on
3 then.

4 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: Alright. Chair Adams, you
5 need to close the public hearing.

6 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay, there being none...there
7 being no other members of the public who wish to
8 testify on this item, the public hearing on
9 Application Number 20214007 HIQ, the landmark
10 designation of P.S.48 is now closed and the item is
11 laid over. Our next public hearing is on
12 Preconsidered Application No. 20215010 HHK.
13 Submitted by the New York City Health and Hospitals
14 Corporation pursuant to Section 7385 of the HHC
15 Enabling Act, this application requests approval to
16 lease a parcel of land on the campus of New York
17 City Health and Hospitals/Woodhull Comunilife,
18 Incorporated for the development of a eight story
19 residential building to provide a affordable and
20 supportive housing. The project site is located in
21 the Council District represented by Council Member
22 Cornegy and I do have Council Member Cornegy's
23 statement, which I will read. I enthusiastically
24 support Phase 2 of the Woodhull Supportive Housing
25 Projects. I was proud to break ground on the first

2 phase, which provided 89 units of supportive and
3 affordable housing. The success is a model of how
4 we should move forward. The new 8-story
5 residential building will work with the staff of
6 Woodhull Hospital to ensure that they residents
7 receive the ongoing medical services they require
8 to remain healthy and out of the homeless system.
9 This is also an effective use of hospital resources
10 and promises to be a stable for people who need it.
11 I'm very pleased it will also provide housing for
12 our seniors. They deserve it and it is a blessing
13 to keep them in the neighborhood. That is the
14 statement by Council Member Robert Cornegy.
15 Counsel, please call the applicant panel.

16 LEGAL COUNSEL: Christine Flaherty will be
17 testifying on behalf of the New York City Health
18 and Hospitals Corporation and Dr. Rosa Gill will be
19 testifying on behalf of Communo, right?

20 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay. Counsel, please administer
21 the affirmation.

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: And please raise your right
23 hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
24 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
25

2 before this subcommittee in answer to all Council
3 Member questions?

4 CHRISTINE FLAHERTY: I do.

5 DR. ROSA GILL: I do.

6 CHAIR ADAMS: Thank you. You're presentation
7 is being loaded into Zoom, and will be displayed
8 when you request it. Slides will be advanced at
9 your request, and before you begin please do state
10 your name once again affiliation for the record.
11 You may begin and welcome.

12 CHRISTINE FLAHERTY: Thank you so much. Good
13 afternoon Madam Chairwoman Adams. My name is
14 Christine Flaherty. I'm senior Vice President of
15 Office of Facilities Development, Health and
16 Hospitals Corporation. I want to thank you and the
17 members of the New York City Council Subcommittee
18 on Landmarks, Public siting and Maritime Uses for
19 your time today. I'm Christine Flaherty, Senior
20 Vice President of the Office of Facilities
21 Development at Health and Hospitals. I'm
22 responsible for real estate, housing, planning,
23 design, construction and facility operations across
24 our health system. I'm joined today by Dr. Rosa
25 Gil, President and CEO of Communal Life. New York

2 City Health and Hospitals is requesting your
3 approval of a proposed 99-year ground lease to
4 Communal Life at the Woodhull Hospital Medical
5 Center in order to facilitate the development of
6 affordable and supportive housing at this site.
7 Before commencing I'd like to thank the leadership
8 and commitment of Dr. Mitch Katz our CEO for fully
9 supporting our Housing and Health initiative being
10 read by my office and our A-B-C of Real Estate and
11 Housing Leora Jontef. Despite the ongoing
12 challenges we face every day with COVID-19, we
13 remain fully committed to advocating for housing
14 for our most vulnerable patient populations. The
15 development of affordable multi-family residential
16 housing on Health and Hospitals' land is a complex
17 and collaborative process with many partners in
18 city government and a non-profit and business
19 community. I want to briefly touch on some of the
20 key participants in this process that have brought
21 us to this important milestone of presenting to the
22 New York City Council Subcommittee on Landmarks,
23 Public Sitings and Maritime Uses. Greg Calliste,
24 our CEO at Woodhull Hospital for his vision and
25 steadfast advocacy for housing on his property has

3 been a key champion and partner of mine as we
4 brought this development to this stage. Our
5 Woodhull Community Advisory Board has provided
6 tremendous commitment to this project and
7 development. Communal Life, our site developer
8 represented here today by CEO Dr. Rosa Gil and
9 finally, of course, our partner in New York City
10 Department of Housing Development and New York City
11 Human Resources Administration providing the Social
12 Service subsidy to provide the robust case
13 management and support services for our homeless
14 tenants. Now, we could advance to the slide show,
15 if that go up and we could go to slide 2, please.
16 Before talking about the ground lease and project
17 in hand, I'd like to take a few minutes to talk
18 about why housing is health at Health and
19 Hospitals. Homelessness in New York City is a
20 growing problem. It requires ongoing urgent action
21 with over 130,000 New Yorkers many of them children
22 spending at least one night in a homeless shelter
23 back in Fiscal Year 2018. As the largest, largest
24 public health system in the nation Health and
25 Hospitals serves more than 53,000 persons
experiencing homelessness each year while ensuring

2 nearly 17,000 homeless individuals through its
3 subsidy health plan that's supplies 53,000 equates
4 to 5.6% of our entire patient population at Health
5 and Hospitals. Historically and today homeless
6 individuals have limited access to social,
7 political and economic power due to
8 institutionalized and societal discrimination,
9 which leads to negative physical and mental health
10 conditions. At Health and Hospitals the majority of
11 homeless patients are seen in our Acute Care
12 Services, and engage in fewer primary care
13 services. Their inpatient and E.D. visits are three
14 times higher than our general population of
15 patients. Additionally, our Office of Population
16 Health recently updated our High Risk Patient
17 Dashboard that identifies that 31% of our Health
18 and Hospitals high risk patients are going through
19 homelessness. Health and Hospitals has several
20 initiatives underway to enhance the health care for
21 our homeless New Yorkers. Creating housing
22 opportunities for unstably housed patients is a key
23 achievable component on our system's larger and
24 initiative. It will be important for their health
25 outcomes to better utilize our limited public

2 resources, and with the new evolving pressures of
3 COVID 19 and associated economic challenges, this
4 further and only reinforces our need to facilitate
5 housing for Health and Housing. Next slide, please.
6 This project before us is not the first time Health
7 and Hospitals has utilized our land assets to
8 facilitate housing development. Health and
9 Hospitals signed our first ground lease for housing
10 in 2007 and per our governing statute we lease our
11 land for the City of New York and in turn sublease
12 to other entities. Since our core business is
13 healthcare, we have collaborated with the city's
14 real estate center agencies for designating private
15 developers for housing development rather than sole
16 sourcing on our own. Our sister agencies have the
17 capacity and subject matter expertise and housing
18 and real estate to issue RFPs and RFQs and evaluate
19 proposals and qualifications. Since 2013, HPD has
20 been our main partner in this endeavor. They not
21 only have had the housing expertise but the
22 financing tools to facilitate the development of
23 affordable housing to best server low-income New
24 Yorkers. To date there are eight occupied
25 buildings with one (music) 1245 occupied units of

2 housing on our properties and two buildings with
3 349 units in construction. In March of this year,
4 H&H analyzed the unit distribution of the eight
5 occupied buildings and we estimated approximately
6 1,800 residents live there. We then analyzed our
7 electronic medical records and matching housing
8 addresses with patients we calculated that about
9 747 patients are at these addresses or 40% of our
10 residents. 560 Winthrop at King has the largest
11 patient count while the fewer patients live at
12 Seaview on Staten Island. There are a few
13 different types of housing developments on our
14 campuses, senior housing is low-income housing for
15 those ag 62 and older. Low-income housing serves
16 only those earning less than 60% Area Median
17 Income. AMI is the standard set forth by HUD to
18 determine income eligibility for subsidized
19 housing. While mixed-income housing projects
20 include both low and middle income units with a
21 variety of AMIs and affordability tiers. Supportive
22 housing projects are generally considered low-
23 income housing projects. They have no more than 60%
24 of the units set aside for formerly homeless New
25 Yorkers, and include a robust suite of wraparound

2 case management services for the tenants. The
3 remainder of the units in these buildings are
4 typically low-income units. There are currently
5 457 set aside for formerly homeless New Yorkers and
6 designated as supportive housing on our land was
7 notably at Kings County and Woodhull. Upon
8 completion 72 units of the key building in Queens
9 Hospital is being set aside for formerly homeless
10 New Yorkers with serious mental illness. Moving
11 forward, we would like to develop on our land to be
12 supportive housing because having this housing
13 model specifically houses homeless New Yorkers who
14 are our most vulnerable patients in most need of
15 care. Next slide. At this point we will move to
16 the presentation to present the specific
17 development at Woodhull Hospital. I would like to
18 introduce Dr. Rosa Gil our non-profit developer who
19 will walk through and introduce her navy
20 organization, and the development at hand
21 associated with those two processes. Thank you.

22 DR. ROSA GIL: Dr. thank you for a nice
23 person and an authority, and many thanks to
24 Chairperson Adams and committee members for giving
25 us the opportunity to present this project at this

2 committee. I am Rosa Gil and the President and CEO
3 of Communilife, Inc. This is a 31-year-old
4 community based non-profit organization. Our
5 mission is to provide for neighbor communities with
6 housing and culturally sensitive and supportive
7 services, and we do believe that no one should be
8 without housing and supporting to live a healthy
9 and meaningful life. We serve all over 3,000 low-
10 income and bring on New Yorkers annually with
11 supportive services, and housing, affordable
12 housing and supportive housing. We own and manage
13 over 2,000 units of affordable housing in eleven
14 buildings in Bronx, Brooklyn and Queens. We have
15 2016 HPD designated Community Life to the IQ to
16 develop the first building on the Woodhull Pathways
17 and that was completed in 2019, and also in 2019
18 HPD designated Community Life through the RFQ
19 process for the second building on the campus of
20 Woodhull. Next slide, please. Just is just the
21 first building that was completed in April of 2019,
22 89 affordable and supportive housing units. Fifty-
23 four were for patients at Woodhull Hospital and H&H
24 and chronically homeless individuals living with
25 serious mental illness. We worked that of leading

2 this agency coordination to rent out to homeless
3 patients, and according to the care management with
4 that was very close to the Department of Psychiatry
5 at Woodhull Hospital and make the plans to ensure
6 the continuity of services. As a matter of fact a
7 recent study that make plans reductions in
8 behavioral health and medical admission for the 29
9 patients in the first year of all psychiatry. Next
10 slide. And in 2019 H&H AND HPD designated
11 community life to develop separate housing through
12 the HPD RFQ that I mentioned before and we engaged
13 to the core of 2019 where we hold the (inaudible)
14 we put them into the Advisory Board, and the
15 elected officials including Councilman Cornegy and
16 others. In January 2020 I received the HRA
17 approval for the Social Service subsidies, in in
18 March '20 we presented the New York City DOB as the
19 review initiated for the plans, and in July '20,
20 the H&H public hearing took place at the warehouse
21 remotely for the proposed cities. Just recently in
22 September we submitted an application for financing
23 to HPD, and in October 2020 the H&H Category on
24 Board Review Land Lease. January 21, we do
25 anticipate HPD tax credit award and we do hope that

2 a construction loan closing, and then lease
3 execution will take place in '21 and we do
4 anticipate the completion of this building by '23.
5 Next slide please. Just to show you what this
6 building is like and to your right is the first
7 building and in the background you have the second
8 building, which is the 8-story house with two
9 residential units 12,150 square feet. They will
10 hold campus and they will be set as the ones to
11 apartments, 21 one-bedrooms. The amenities include
12 24-hour security doorman, the RV connected room,
13 computer room and a back room. We will preserve 51
14 parking spots for hospital use and the landscape
15 along Trip Avenue in the Plaza and your job will be
16 complete, will be done. These two buildings will
17 be connected on the first floor to share to the
18 commercial kitchen. Next slide. Here we have the
19 supportive housing units, 15, 6 units is our for a
20 person to be with mental illness to be with a guy
21 with our hospital or a (inaudible) hospital and the
22 household income units are \$47,000 for age 60 and
23 the 60 AMI. The rent is 1,390. HPD project-based.
24 We think it is on a rental contract value at
25 \$800,000 support these rental payments. We do have

3 21 bedrooms for seniors age 62 and older. The
4 household income they made \$23,880 to \$27,300 and
5 AMI of 30%. Eight units we set on our project
6 based vouchers, \$1,231 and 13 units at \$1,292 rent.
7 Market that's through the Housing Permit. And
8 additional 16 studio apartments for low-income
9 community persons. Household income unit \$47,760
10 plus the AMI, rent of \$900 and it will be
11 advertised and marketed to the housing permit. Next
12 slide, please. As I refereed before and population
13 with 66 units for supportive housing will be
14 eligible patients and legal will make that promise.
15 They can live independently in permanent housing
16 with the promise of Social Service support, and
17 this will... Of course, we will coordinate by word
18 NYC HRA. One of the importance of our mother is a
19 very strong faced management and continuity of care
20 because it is not enough just to provide a person,
21 a homeless person with an apartment, but also it's
22 pre set up for them to receive care at the hospital
23 and therefore, you know, we have a patient center
24 on site, case management services and we will
25 receive a contract of \$900,000 and serving our New
York City HRA. Patient coordination will, of course

2 continue as I mentioned before with the rehaul of
3 outpatient treatment to make sure that these
4 patients continue to do well in the community. At
5 the beginning we will do other activities such as
6 educational activities, social and recreational
7 activities. Next slide please. The design of the
8 project means the HPD so Housing Program design
9 standards, Enterprise Green Communities standards
10 such as Energy Star appliances, water science
11 certified pictures. None of you C Paint such as the
12 roll back the CV panels under a mechanical roof,
13 and we have, of course, our list (sic) and
14 notification regarding the COVID. So we will have
15 hand wash stations and we know the area and treat
16 that COVID area to instruct us and to make the room
17 an apartment and we call out that it is suited for
18 tenants and enhanced to the air around underneath
19 this stuff are considered in the intervening
20 process. Next, and of course we will work with the
21 community to make sure that we can as much as we
22 can permit some new growth in this project. We will
23 hold financing. They say \$7 million for the
24 government cost and \$745 from the New York City
25 low-income housing tax credit and HPD sees the tax

3 credit loan and \$745 on passing the bank loan and
4 \$147 develop the contribution and the project is
5 for a 60-year HPD Operating Equity Loan. The H&H
6 Ground lease is 99 years. H&H on their lease
7 servicing of \$12,000, and after year 15 accept tax
8 for allow for potential unity payment to H&H and
9 that concludes my presentation. Thank you so much.

10 CHAIR ADAMS: I believe now we're ready to
11 take any questions. Again, thank you for your time
12 and giving us the opportunity to present this
13 important initiative for Health and Hospitals.

14 CHRISTINE FLAHERTY: I believe now we're ready
15 to take any questions. Again, thank you for your
16 time and giving us the opportunity to present this
17 important initiative for Health and Hospitals.

18 CHAIR ADAMS: Thank you both very much for the
19 presentation, and I definitely agree with Council
20 Member Cornegy. I think that this is a model to
21 follow going forward. I think I've mentioned this
22 in the past. I'm particularly impressed with the
23 senior housing aspect and the low affordability for
24 our seniors. The fact that our seniors can remain
25 intact and in their neighborhoods is very, very
impressive to me. So, happy to hear about that. I

2 just have a couple of questions that I'm going to
3 defer to my colleagues. Are the different unit
4 types the supportive senior housing affordable
5 throughout the development integrated or are the
6 residents separate?

7 DR. ROSA GIL: No integrated. (musical signal)
8 Madam Chair, you know we do believe that basically
9 anyone of us lived in an apartment building and we
10 didn't know who our next door neighbor, too. So, we
11 can't want this stigmatized any of the residents in
12 this building. So, it's just like integrated.

13 CHAIR ADAMS: Great answer Dr. Gil. Thank
14 you. How does H&H select development sites for
15 supportive housing particularly and what is your
16 criteria for your selection?

17 CHRISTINE FLAHERTY: Well, I think we are
18 continuing to identify under-utilized locations
19 across all five boroughs, and we—I just arrived in
20 May of 2019. ABP or student housing arrived around
21 this time last year. We are reinvigorating, um, for
22 housing across all of our locations, and we are
23 developing plans across our under-utilized
24 properties and hope to partner with Commissioner,
25 Commissioner Carroll, and HPD to look for more

2 supportive opportunities. It is great to be a
3 fiscal challenge from a capital perspective, but we
4 are absolutely hopefully not the last time we come
5 to this amazing community. We're hoping that we're
6 going to be able to close at least in another year
7 so that we can put ourselves in, and we will
8 continue to advocate for help for housing and
9 alternatives tax credit programs on the federal
10 level that I think would really recognize the fact
11 that there needs to be other opportunities for
12 healthcare driven housing opportunities.

13 CHAIR ADAMS: Thank you, Christine. A Very
14 aggressive outlook that's good. Along those same
15 lines how does the cost of developing supportive
16 housing for this particular population compare with
17 the cost of hospitalization and hospital admission?

18 CHRISTINE FLAHERTY: So that's a great
19 question. I mean if you think about, you know it
20 depends on the type of hospitalization and the length
21 of stay, and a number of things, but from a very
22 basic perspective it can be a tremendously...a better
23 outcome for an individual, which in my mind it's
24 priceless, but also a cost savings. You know a
25 hospital bed depending on the services being provided

2 could be anywhere from \$1,500 to \$2,500 a day. When
3 you're thinking about a monthly rate of housing you
4 can do the math quickly with services. That's a much
5 more stable environment for an individual, and it's
6 as well as home. You know, home is very different
7 than staying in a hospital for ongoing critical care.
8 So, there's definitely, you know, a healthcare
9 savings as well, opportunity for Health and
10 Hospitals.

11 DR. ROSA GIL: Because I have gone to,
12 well as president of the population that we serve,
13 Madam Chair, it is from my... Well, you see what we
14 wrote and there are multiple admissions to hospitals
15 and emergency rooms, which is very costly by the
16 population, and as I mentioned before, the study done
17 by Metro Plus already show the reduction in the
18 number of readmissions to the hospitals and E.R. So,
19 obviously from our perspective it was a great savings
20 to the hospital because of the population that we are
21 serving.

22 CHAIR ADAMS: Thank you and I
23 just...piggybacking on what you both just said, how
24 far is the program supposed to meet the need when it

2 comes to homelessness, and homeless who are at risk
3 once discharged?

4 DR. ROSA GIL: It will help those numbers
5 of units. There's a very large need, and we're going
6 to do everything we can within our stand to... Our
7 long-term goal I think is to try to find a way to add
8 to the pull of numerous homelessness initiatives.
9 Not, not to me. We want to try to be out of this to
10 help address definitely a really challenging urgent
11 need for the city.

12 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I'm
13 going to defer now to my colleagues for questions.

14 CHAIR ADAMS: Colleagues, if you have
15 questions for the panel please do click on the Raise
16 Hand Button on the Participant Counsel. Are there any
17 Council Member questions at this time?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Council Member
19 Koo has a question.

20 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay Council Member Koo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chair.
22 Can you hear me? Hello. Yes.

23 CHAIR ADAMS: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay, so I want to
25 thank the Administration for using this kind of

2 affordable housing, using the under-utilized public
3 land and public hospitals. My question is like for
4 this supportive housing they still have to pay rent,
5 right? But if these homeless people they don't have
6 an income, how do they pay rent?

7 FEMALE SPEAKER: They go to the...
8 Councilman Koo, they do contribute 30% of their
9 income for the rent and they...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, they contribute
11 30% of their income?

12 FEMALE SPEAKER: 30% of their income and
13 there is, of course, public assistance or whatever.
14 Yes. So, they...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, they, they
16 need...

17 FEMALE SPEAKER: So, they... I'm sorry

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, if their income
19 is very limited, you still take 30%?

20 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And how do they get
22 medical care? Do you use the same hospital staff or
23 in the hospital or you have your own medical staff
24 like a psychiatrist or nurses? You have your own
25 staff who take care of these supportive residents?

2 FEMALE SPEAKER: Councilman Koo, this is
3 a supportive housing unit. It's not a licensed
4 program per se. So, what we really do is we work
5 very, very closely with the staff, the psychiatric
6 staff, and we know hospitals. In fact, our staff
7 meets with the results staff on a weekly basis, and
8 we go over the challenges that a patient may have.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yes.

10 FEMALE SPEAKER: You know, sometimes
11 being in the house we can see behaviors that the
12 psychiatrist does not know, and so by us sharing this
13 information, we really, really provide a great
14 continuity of care, and to watch out for these
15 patients that are on medication, and it's critical
16 that they do take their medication regularly. So, we
17 monitor that so we can tell the psychiatrist now
18 where we are seeing the effect and effectiveness of
19 the medication, and it can go either way. Sometimes
20 we need to regulate the medication so we are able to
21 take psychiatrists, you know because the way that we
22 are seeing. So, it's a very, very close relationship
23 between the supportive, the case manages in the
24 house, in the building together with the staff and
25 the Department of Psychiatry, and we all are housed

3 with them. But thank you for the questions. They are
4 very important ones.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: That's, that's very
6 good. So, my, my, my...the more I understand
7 compliance and taking medication for psychiatric
8 patients are very important compliance. So, you can
9 monitor it then, and you would cut down on the very
10 bad incidents of these patients. So, I want to thank
11 you in advance for your good work. I have no more
12 questions. Thank you.

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Counsel.

15 LEGAL COUNSEL: Council Member Barron has
16 a question.

17 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay. Council Member Barron.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
19 Chair, and thank you to the panel for their
20 presentation. I just want to commend this project. I
21 think it's an idea that is much, much delayed in
22 coming. We know that we have a healthcare crisis in
23 our community. We know that there are many people who
24 need assistance with their mental healthcare, and
25 need that supervision that can be provided in a
setting that understands who they are, what their

3 issues are, and is supportive and acknowledges them.
4 So, I want to commend the Council Member. I want to
5 commend the developer and the community-based
6 organization for modeling this project, and hope to
7 see many more of them. I particularly like the income
8 levels. Everybody knows that's my pet peeve, you
9 know, and we're supporting people who have needs, and
10 the question was asked about how can the homeless
11 bear those costs. Yes, it's only 30% and we have to
12 realize there are working people who are homeless,
13 and they certainly need a place to stay. So, I want to
14 commend everybody for the project and commend the
15 Council Member Cornegy as well. Thank you.

16 CHAIR ADAMS: thank you Council Member
17 Barron. And so, are there any other members wishing
18 to ask questions at this time?

19 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: If any other members
20 have questions please use the Raise Hand Button now.
21 I see no other Council Member questions.

22 CHAIR ADAMS: Okay, there being no further
23 questions for this panel, this panel is excused and
24 thank you again for an extraordinary project. Thank
25 you.

2 FEMALE SPEAKER: Thank you very much for
3 your time. Take care.

4 CHAIR ADAMS: So, are there any members of
5 the public who wish to testify on this item?

6 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: Actually, no members of
7 the public signed up to testify on this item.

8 CHAIR ADAMS: (coughs) Okay, that's
9 unusual for us. (laughs) Okay, thank you very much.
10 Alright, there being no more questions, um,

11 JEFFREY CAMPAGNA: Page 25.

12 CHAIR ADAMS: Alright, the public hearing
13 on the Application Number 20215010HHK. The HCC
14 Woodhull Lease is now closed, and the item is laid
15 over. That concludes today's business. I remind you
16 that if written testimony on today's items you may
17 submit it to Land Use Testimony @council.nyc.gov.
18 Please indicate the application number or the project
19 name the subject heading. I'd like to thank the
20 applicants, members of the public, my colleagues, of
21 course, subcommittee Counsel, Land Use staff and the
22 Sergeant-at-Arms for participating in today's
23 hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned. (gavel)

24

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND
DISPOSITIONS 42

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 8, 2020