

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
2 SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1
CITY COUNCIL
3 CITY OF NEW YORK

4 ----- X

5 TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

6 Of the

7 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY,
8 COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE
9 MANAGEMENT

10 ----- X

11 May 14, 2020
Start: 10:09 a.m.
12 Recess: 5:01 p.m.

13 HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING

14 B E F O R E: Daniel Dromm,
Chairperson for the Committee on
15 Finance

16 Donovan Richards and Public
Advocate Jumaane Williams,
17 Chairpersons for the Committee on
Public Safety

18 Margaret Chin
19 Chairperson for the Committee on
Aging

20 Antonio Reynoso, Chairperson of
21 the Committee on Sanitation and
Solid Waste

22
23 COUNCIL MEMBERS:

24 Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
25 Diana Ayala
Joseph Borelli
Justin Brannan

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 2

COUNCIL MEMBERS (CONT.) :

Fernando Cabrera
Andrew Cohen
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry S. Grodenchik
Robert Holden
Karen Koslowitz
Brad Lander
Rory I. Lancman
Farah N. Louis
Carlos Menchaca
Steven Matteo
Daneek Miller
Francisco P. Moya
Keith Powers
Helen K. Rosenthal
Paul Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 3

2 A P P E A R A N C E S

3 Dermot Shea
4 New York City Police Commissioner

5 Kristine Ryan
6 Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget

7 Ben Tucker
8 First Deputy Commissioner

9 Edward Delatorre
10 NYPD, Chief of Transit

11 Rodney Harrison
12 NYPD Detectives

13 Fausto Pichardo
14 NYPD Chief Patrol

15 Martin Morales
16 Chief of Personnel

17 Terry Monahan
18 Chief of Department

19 Lorraine Cortes-Vasquez
20 Commissioner of the New York City Department of
the Aging

21 Jose Mercado
22 Chief Financial Officer for NYCHA

23 Kathryn Garcia
24 DSNY Commissioner

25 Steven Costas
First Deputy Commissioner

Gregory Anderson
Assistant Commissioner

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 4

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

3 Bridget Anderson

4 Deputy Commissioner Bridget Anderson

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 5

2 SERGEANT BIONDO: Chairs, are we ready to begin?

3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We are ready to begin. Chair
4 Richards?

5 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Ready to begin.

6 SERGEANT BIONDO: Alright, Sergeant Kotowski, can
7 you please begin with your opening statement.

8 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Good morning. I ask that you
9 please turn your devices to vibrate. Please mute
10 your microphones on Zoom. Please ensure that you
11 have named yourself correctly in Zoom or you may be
12 either renamed by the Zoom host or removed from the
13 hearing. We will begin the meeting of the Committee
14 on Finance.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much [GAVEL].
16 Good morning and welcome to the City Council's third
17 day of hearings on the Mayor's Executive Budget for
18 Fiscal 2021. My name is Daniel Dromm and I Chair the
19 Finance Committee. We are joined by the Committee on
20 Public Safety, Chaired by my colleague Council Member
21 Donovan Richards and the Public Advocate Jumaane
22 Williams. We are also joined by a number of Council
23 Members. Council Member Borelli, Lancman,
24 Grodenchik, Gibson, Adams, Lander, Cohen, Ampry-
25 Samuel, Menchaca, Ayala, Louis, Cabrera, Rosenthal,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 6

2 Powers, Holden, Matteo, our Minority Leader and
3 Deutsch.

4 I am going to turn it over to Committee Counsel
5 now to go over some procedural items.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. My name is Noah
7 Brick and I am Counsel to the New York City Council
8 Committee on Finance. Before we begin, I want to
9 remind everyone that you will be on mute until you
10 are recognized to speak, at which time you will be
11 unmuted by the Zoom host. If Council Members would
12 like to ask a question, please use the Zoom raise
13 hand function and you will be added to the queue.

14 I will now hand it back to Chair Dromm.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. In these
16 Executive Budget hearings, we've heard much about how
17 the COVID-19 pandemic is changing everything and
18 today, we will learn how it is changing reality of
19 policing our city.

20 The Police Department's steady headcount and
21 relatively small PEG beg the question of whether its
22 budget is aligned with our new quarantined reality of
23 less crime to patrol.

24 In the first two months of the pandemic, felony
25 arrests were down 39 percent and misdemeanor arrests

1 were down 52 percent. I would be remiss however, if
2 I didn't acknowledge two troubling indicators heading
3 in the opposite direction. Radio runs related to
4 domestic violence are increasing, as are the number
5 of reported hate crimes against Asians and people of
6 Asian descent.
7

8 Similarly, the Department's \$3.2 billion ten year
9 capital plan is also more or less unchanged.
10 Although some spending has been shifted into the
11 second five years.

12 We should reassess if all the plan capital
13 spending is necessary for executing the Police
14 Department's mission. I am most curious to know
15 about the Department's plan for personnel who are not
16 able to be utilized in their typical functions such
17 as school safety agents without active school zones
18 to keep safe and traffic enforcement agents without
19 alternative side of the street parking rules to
20 enforce.

21 Does the Department have the flexibility to move
22 existing underutilized personnel around to new needs?
23 We would also like to know whether the NYPD has
24 sufficient protocols in place to contain the spread
25 of COVID-19 within its Department.

1
2 We know about the tragic loss of both uniform and
3 civilian employees and also, that many NYPD personnel
4 have been out sick. It is incumbent on all of us to
5 ensure that there is consistent use of PPE, both in
6 higher density desk jobs, such as for the Police
7 Communication Technicians taking 911 calls and also,
8 out in the field.

9 I'd like to thank Commissioner Shea for being
10 here today and for bringing so many members of his
11 senior leadership team to answer our questions. I
12 will now turn it over to Chair Richards and then to
13 Public Advocate Jumaane Williams for their opening
14 statements.

15 Chair Richards?

16 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you Chair Dromm and
17 good morning and welcome to the Public Safety
18 Committee Fiscal 2021 Executive Budget hearing.
19 Before I begin, I want to thank my staff and the
20 Committee staff for all their hard work. I want to
21 thank Nevin Singh and Eisha Wright, Daniel Ades, Josh
22 Kingsley, Matthew Thompson, and Tiffany Easton.

23 Just two months ago, we heard from you on the
24 Departments plan for the upcoming year. Since then,
25 everything has changed. Over the course of one year,

1
2 the city has projected to lose half a million jobs
3 and as a result, the impact from the budget is
4 severe.

5 OMB testified that the city's budget will decline
6 by nearly \$9 billion over Fiscal years 2020 and
7 Fiscal years 2021. To help close the budget gap, the
8 administration has implemented a PEG program across
9 city agencies that reduces spending by \$1.5 billion
10 in Fiscal 2021.

11 Let's look at the NYPD's PEG, only \$16 million in
12 Fiscal 2021 despite the Department accounting for
13 over 6 percent of the city budget. The PEG is only 1
14 percent of the city's PEG. The total number of
15 uniform officers is over \$36,000 and one of the PEG's
16 was simply to delay an academy class until July, two
17 months from now.

18 If this class is cancelled outright, it would
19 save \$25 million every year. We have already shown
20 that neighborhood policing is an effective shift in
21 police strategy. Crime has been declining for years
22 and during the pandemic, crime is at historically low
23 levels and is likely to stay that way for months.

1
2 Even if you don't cut this class permanently, it
3 could save \$25 million in Fiscal 2021 if you delayed
4 it one year.

5 Now, let's talk about the human impact of COVID-
6 19. Over 40 NYPD Officers, Civilian Personnel, and
7 Auxiliary Police have lost their lives and I just
8 wonder Danny if it's okay to have one minute of
9 silence for those officers we lost during this time.

10 Thank you.

11 Many NYPD members of service have contracted the
12 virus or been out sick and they continue to come to
13 work despite the fact that it could potentially
14 expose them to the virus. I want to make sure the
15 Department has enough resources to protect its
16 personnel. I want to make sure officers are wearing
17 masks through their entire shifts, so they don't get
18 sick and I want to make sure interactions with the
19 public do not spread the virus.

20 Now, I know we're here to discuss the budget but
21 I want to comment on your statements yesterday
22 Commissioner. I find it incomprehensible that you
23 respond to every criticism of the NYPD with an
24 accusation that it puts officers lives on the line
25 but you refuse to look back at what decisions that

1 the department has made that cause many people to
2 hold a negative view of the NYPD. And you refuse to
3 consider what the Department could do to acknowledge
4 the mistakes it's made for so long in order to
5 reassure people that things are going to change.

6
7 I know you are just trying to defend your
8 officers but in truth, you are doing the opposite and
9 causing people to distrust you and your officers even
10 more. I think you would do a lot more for your
11 officers and for the department if you would step
12 back and try to understand the criticism. And
13 publicly acknowledge that the wounds caused by
14 decades upon decades of systematic racism inherent in
15 certain enforcement tactics have not healed and will
16 not heal until people like you take an entirely
17 different attitude towards these criticisms and to
18 towards the despaired impact that your decisions have
19 had on Black and Brown folks.

20 I don't think you are a racist. I don't think
21 your predecessor was a racist. I don't think the
22 overwhelming majority of officers are racist. I
23 think you all do what you do because you believe it
24 will keep people safe but I think the department has
25 historically engaged in and has recently engaged in

1
2 and currently engages in policies that have a racist
3 impact, even when there is no effect on public
4 safety.

5 Less than ten years ago, the department was
6 systematically oppressing the Black and Brown
7 community by digging through every set of pockets
8 your officers could fit their hands in even though it
9 was utterly ineffective at stopping violent crime.
10 Three years ago, you were arresting almost
11 exclusively Black and Brown folk for marijuana when
12 everyone smokes marijuana. You personally claimed it
13 was because of 911 and 311 calls, but when we looked
14 at the data, that turned out to not be true.

15 Do I think that's because you are a racist?
16 Absolutely not. Do I think the department engaged in
17 systematic racism by refusing to look at your own
18 numbers to say how is this affecting the Black and
19 Brown community. By refusing to do something to
20 identify the structural problems in how you enforce
21 marijuana laws. By trying to pin those problems on
22 community members calling you instead of
23 acknowledging there was a problem in how you were
24 enforcing the law.

1
2 Do I think that amounts to a policy choice that
3 result in systematic racism? Yes, I do and today, we
4 have a social distancing enforcement numbers that
5 really raise concerns about what's going on and did
6 you come out and say, you know what, this is really
7 not what the department intended and we're going to
8 take a look to see how this happened and what we do
9 to change this.

10 When you saw the video of officer Garcia slapping
11 and beating a man to humiliate him, did you say, this
12 is the last thing we want our cops doing? Did you
13 say this doesn't represent the standards the
14 department has set for its officers? No, you come
15 out in your version of a fighting stance saying,
16 don't criticize the NYPD or cops will get killed.
17 And by the way, look at who homicide victims are.
18 People criticize in your low level enforcement or
19 your disciplinary system or your COVID enforcement.
20 We're not asking you to stop preventing homicides in
21 our communities. How you police COVID has nothing to
22 do with how you police homicide.

23 So, I honestly have no idea why you chose to
24 point that out. It is just not productive. You are
25 side stepping. The point is not helping you achieve

1
2 your goal in keeping officers safe and improving your
3 relationship with Black and Brown communities. Until
4 you start to do things in a way that address the
5 potential for racially disparate impacts of your
6 policy decisions and acknowledges that there are
7 costs of policing that should not be paid entirely by
8 Black and Brown folks. You need to learn to take the
9 heat without claiming cops are being put in danger.
10 Because Black and Brown communities are sick of being
11 policed with unnecessary violence and aren't going to
12 be quite about it ever again.

13 And us criticizing you doesn't put your cops in
14 danger. It is pleading with you to change the way
15 you teach officers to treat us. So, instead of
16 getting defensive about it, how about you just listen
17 to the criticism and take a look at what you can do
18 better.

19 Thank you Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and we
21 will now hear remarks from Public Advocate Jumaane
22 Williams.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much
24 Chair Dromm, Chair Richards and the Speaker. I
25 continue to thank frontline workers who are offering

1
2 tremendous support. Who we have to continue to offer
3 tremendous support during these difficult times. I
4 also send my thoughts and prayers to those who have
5 lost their lives, including many members of the New
6 York Police Department.

7 Commissioner, I want to thank you for being here,
8 as well as many of your leadership who is here today.
9 Commissioner, we've had some productive conversations
10 which I was very pleased about, so I was surprised to
11 read that your suggestion that the enforcement by the
12 Department was not racially discriminatory.

13 My job as Public Advocate is to speak the truth
14 and here is the blunt truth about race and the
15 departments recent enforcement practices, spanning
16 several Mayors and Commissioners.

17 The department's approach to stop, question and
18 frisk was racially discriminatory. The Department
19 stock up with a 700,000 innocent Blacks and Latino's
20 every year. That's not agent history, that was
21 recently six years ago. The Departments approach to
22 marijuana enforcement continues to be racially
23 discriminatory in the first quarter of this year. Out
24 of 132 possessions arrests, 93 percent were Black and
25 Latino while only 5 percent were white. The Blacks,

1
2 Latinos and Whites use marijuana at approximately the
3 same rates. The departments COVID-19 response is
4 racially discriminatory. I spent the last few weeks
5 urging the department to release data that reveals
6 what we are all tired of seeing, that New York is a
7 more color all yet again being disproportionately
8 enforced against.

9 All of us saw the images of mostly White New
10 Yorkers being spoken to if anything handed out masks
11 city parks while in some Black and Hispanic
12 communities, punches in the face were thrown, our
13 folks were thrown to the ground.

14 Over 80 percent of all social distance summons
15 were issued to Black and Hispanic New Yorkers in
16 Brooklyn out of 40 arrests, 35 were Black and 4 were
17 Latinx.

18 I also want to add to the fact that folks are
19 tired of being told they are not feeling what they
20 are feeling. I would add to that, in different
21 systems, Black mothers are tired of being told that
22 they are not dying at disproportionate rates. They
23 are tired of being told that their children being
24 taken from them has nothing to do with racism.

1
2 And in the words of late Staten Islander who will
3 [inaudible 15:25] for me, this ends today. We have
4 to stop telling people that they are not experiencing
5 what they are experiencing. We have to stop
6 conflating frequency with normalcy. We will all
7 agree that the vast majority of interactions with
8 police officers end well, which I am so happy about
9 but it is normal that the ones that don't too
10 frequently, to normally in the Black and Brown
11 communities. That is a fact that we have to
12 acknowledge instead of pushing back on.

13 We also have to acknowledge that there doesn't
14 have to be any one person who is a racist for
15 practices to be discriminatory. And so, I don't know
16 if anyone in the police department is a racist. I
17 don't know if they are or not, that's not the point.

18 The practices that we're speaking of are racial
19 discriminatory and until we admit that anything we
20 do, it is problematic and to revert to the talking
21 points of prior ministrations are not helpful to ask
22 about the disparity of murder victims as if we don't
23 know more than anyone who is being murdered was
24 insulting and was important.

1
2 These New Yorkers want their Mayor and their
3 Commissioner to hear them, to see them, to protect
4 them and to end the disparities right now. We must
5 acknowledge the problem and then discuss how and when
6 these disparities will end. That is the best way for
7 us to do this for police and for the communities they
8 serve. Police Officers want to go out and do their
9 job. It gets harder when they hear some of the
10 rhetoric that was heard yesterday by you and sadly
11 defended by our Mayor.

12 That is also why we can't balance at the expense
13 of New Yorkers in need you know, in the fiscal
14 climate the way we're balancing now.

15 Through proposed executive budget cuts summer
16 youth employment. Although we hope to see a new
17 model, it also cuts about \$1.3 billion from the
18 Department of Youth and Community Development over 40
19 almost 50 percent, yet the NYPD's nearly \$5.64
20 billion budget is mostly left intact. There is also
21 cuttings of the Administration for Children's
22 Services. Why not reduce overtime costs for this
23 Fiscal year as intended for the subsequent one. Why
24 not as Chair Richards suggested cancel the incoming
25 academy class? Why not freeze or even reduce the

1 budget for patrol as crime rates continue to fall.

2 Why not publish a full system, full itemized list of
3 the budget to identify areas to cut?
4

5 As the city continues to respond to this
6 pandemic, we need to be intentional about what we
7 found. From the beginning, this pandemic though it
8 was not a clear message from our Governor or the
9 Mayor on social distancing. As we start to get one
10 now, we've also seen troubling disparity when it
11 comes to COVID-19 related fatalities. The last thing
12 we need now is the NYPD enforcing guidelines that
13 continue disproportionately affect communities of
14 more color. These incidents add to a growing
15 distrust in these communities which I know the NYPD
16 has been working to improve for not only the
17 community but also for the officers who I know are
18 concerned about their families and their wellbeing as
19 well.

20 I urge the city to include crisis management
21 system, providers, community members, local leaders
22 and others with deep labored ties including other
23 agencies to ensure an efficient and clear message to
24 our communities. Finally, I'm concerned about the
25

1 continuation of what appears to be sweeps against
2 people who are homeless.
3

4 The proposed budget reduces the Department of
5 Homeless Services budget by approximately \$35
6 million. Notably, over the same Fiscal year, the
7 budget for DHS's rental assistance and housing
8 placement program would decline by 30 percent or
9 nearly \$5 million. These sweeps are ill advised and
10 I don't believe it follows CDC guidelines.

11 I strongly suggest a serious review of this
12 practice and an immediate solution for the
13 administration.

14 As Public Advocate, I urge a solution to our
15 youth in communities in light of cuts of SYEP and
16 social services and echo the call by several Council
17 Members of the City Council and Advocates that divest
18 on criminal justice responses and invest more in
19 direct support for vulnerable communities.

20 I look forward to the Commissioners testimony
21 today and what I hope would be a genuine discussion
22 on the NYPD's budget. I do want to say that we have
23 been moving toward a better conversation of what
24 public safety is and what public safety isn't. We
25

1
2 can't continue to say that public safety is equated
3 to over policing.

4 Commissioner, what I would say, no one of us is
5 responsible for the discriminatory practices and
6 systems that we receive when we were born but I ask
7 you to join me saying all of us are responsible for
8 the system we give to the next generation.

9 Thank you very much.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Mr.
11 Public Advocate. Before we begin with testimony from
12 the administration, I'd like to remind the public
13 that this committee, the Subcommittee on Capital
14 Budget will be holding a remote hearing for public
15 testimony on the Executive Budget on May 21 at 11:30
16 a.m.

17 If you would like to testify at that hearing,
18 please register at www.council.nyc.gov/testify and
19 information about how to access the Zoom meeting will
20 be emailed to you. You may testify at that hearing
21 via web or via telephone. You may also submit
22 written testimony through that registration website
23 or by emailing Finance Testimony.

24 I now want to announce other Council Members who
25 have joined us and they are Council Member Yeger,

1 Moya, Van Bramer, Miller, Brannan, Vallone, Koslowitz
2 and Gjonaj.

3
4 And Commissioner, I'm going to ask you to also
5 uh, you have a very long statement, a good statement
6 but I'm going to ask you to summarize it if you can
7 and I'm going to call now on members of the New York
8 Police Department to testify. We will hear testimony
9 first from you Commissioner Dermot Shea who is joined
10 by members of his senior leadership team.

11 Counsel, please administer the affirmation.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Commissioner
13 Shea, do you affirm that your testimony will be
14 truthful to the best of your knowledge, information,
15 and belief?

16 DERMOT SHEA: Yes, I do.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Alright, thank you. Can the
18 other witnesses from the Police Department who may be
19 called upon today to testify please so affirm.

20 PANEL: I do.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you all. Commissioner
22 Shea, you may begin when ready.

23 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you very much and I will
24 summarize, I know that you have an advanced copy of
25 my speech but to the opening statements, I think it's

1 appropriate to make a statement to Public Advocate

2 Jumaane Williams, I want to say to you, thank you for

3 helping dialogue. I think you speak from the heart.

4 I think you know; words resonate with me; they truly

5 do and I think there is much that everyone should pay

6 attention to the words that you spoke.

7 I will say that very relevant to today, we are in

8 the middle of unprecedented times. We are about to

9 enter as we all know [INAUDIBLE 22:45] meeting with

10 the budget crisis, more difficult times to come and

11 the last thing that we need is a third crisis. A

12 crisis of the people of New York City talking about

13 racism. Talking about the realities of what we know

14 is the truth and the history of New York City. I

15 think it's real. I think we all recognize that. I

16 think we have already many positive discussions about

17 that and I think it's going to take all of us. It's

18 going to take you Jumaane, it's going to take every

19 member of the Council. It's going to take every

20 member of our Executive staff here that I represent

21 to work together, to make sure that we don't take a

22 step back which is all responsible but we can't let

23 it happen.

1
2 I'm committed to doing it. I think we need more
3 talk, more action, more collaboration, and less
4 finger pointing. I truly do appreciate your words
5 and I thank you for them and I'm committed to working
6 towards them.

7 Good morning Chair Richards, Chair Dromm, and
8 members of the Council and I will cut out most of
9 this speech for expediency. But thank you for the
10 opportunity to discuss the Mayor's Executive Budget
11 for the 2021 Fiscal Year.

12 Before highlighting some key budget items, I want
13 us all to remember and to truly try to get our minds
14 around the fact that we have now lost 42 members of
15 the NYPD family since March 26th. That's 42 people
16 in less than two months, 42 servants of our city who
17 dedicated themselves in one way or another to our
18 core public safety mission to keeping New Yorkers
19 safe, and to keeping those who protect New York City
20 safe.

21 The most recent was just this morning that we
22 learned about a School Safety Agent, it's a familiar
23 story in the last two months and it doesn't get any
24 easier to here. An individual who was fighting for
25 his life over the last month in the hospital served

1 the people of Southeast Queens, School Safety Agent
2 assigned to the area of the 105th Precinct who
3 tragically almost 15 years into his service with the
4 NYPD lost his battle. So, thank you for that moment
5 of silence earlier.
6

7 I'll just speak very briefly about where we are
8 right now and I know the budget discussions is coming
9 but it's hard to separate the public safety and the
10 crime from the budget angle of this.

11 On March 12th of this year, New York City was up
12 nearly 23 percent in crime. It seems like eons ago
13 but I have not forgotten about it. A lot has changed
14 since March 12th on the crime side. We've had this
15 new reality and how it plays out, I don't think any
16 of us fully knows but it will impact on crime in some
17 way shape or form. We've had changes to the bail
18 laws that were made and hopefully those are going to
19 go a long way to improving our public safety and
20 thank you for everyone that worked on that at the
21 Governor's level, at the State level with City Hall
22 and certainly members of the Council.

23 Between those two things and we also can't forget
24 we have had to make some difficult decisions
25 regarding inmate population on Rikers Island, tough

1
2 decisions. Decisions that no doubt will have impacts
3 on public safety but that were made with the best of
4 intentions to save lives and how will that play out
5 in time.

6 From March 12th we were up 23 percent in crime.
7 Where we stand right now is essentially in the index
8 crime slightly up nearly flat but there are some
9 troubling statistics. Specifically, year-to-date to
10 last night, murder is up nearly 7 percent. Robbery
11 has been plummeting since this pandemic started but
12 it is still up for the year 9 percent. It was up
13 over 30 percent on March 12th. Burglary is now up 32
14 percent. Grand Larceny Auto 63 percent. Felony
15 Assault is down. There is no disputing that this
16 pandemic has significantly altered the shape and the
17 face of New York City and certainly the crime picture
18 as well.

19 A particular concern to me is a 13 percent as we
20 sit here, increase in shooting incidents here today.
21 Right now, in the borough of Brooklyn, we are facing
22 some struggles in redeploying personnel to try to
23 tamp down on that violence.

1 So far in 2020, we have seen 250 shooting
2 incidents versus 221. That's an increase of 29
3 incidents and again, that's a 13 percent increase.

4 We know how far we have come on pushing crime
5 down correctively. Not just the NYPD but working
6 with many partners across this city and we will
7 continue to do that to make sure that we continue to
8 push that crime down.

9 Chairman Dromm, Chairman Richards, I think I will
10 forego. I think you have my statement and I think
11 for expediency purposes, we'll get right in to your
12 questions regarding the budget.

13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
15 Commissioner and before I move onto my questions, I
16 just want to state that I am supportive of my
17 colleagues in terms of their concerns around certain
18 incidents and I'm glad that you have addressed that
19 and going to look into it further. I agree that it
20 will be an effort on the part of all of us to ensure
21 public safety and particularly in these incidents. I
22 worked very hard along with Public Advocate Jumaane
23 Williams on the questions of stop and frisk way back
24 over ten years ago when we were first elected and of
25

1 course also with Chair Richards as well. So, I look
2 forward to continuing to work with you on those
3 issues.

4
5 I'm going to be doing some budget questions here
6 Commissioner. As my job as Finance Chair to try to
7 get to the bottom of some of the questions that we
8 have in terms of the budget for the NYPD.

9 So, as a result of state criminal justice
10 reforms, in November, there was a budget allocation
11 of \$20 million per year to hire 250 new civilian
12 positions to implement the new discovery
13 requirements. Since courts have suspended many cases
14 as a result of the pandemic, have plans to hire these
15 250 positions been delayed? And if they have already
16 been hired, what work are they assigned during the
17 pandemic?

18 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah I'm going to have — if you
19 could unmute to Kristine Ryan our Budget Director,
20 but I would just point out to that has seriously
21 offered the landscape as I said of fighting crime in
22 New York City. But tragically, when you look at some
23 of the statistics of crime that has been of recent
24 note rising; the crime picture has not stopped and
25 the enforcement and the fighting crime and building

1 case certainly has not stopped either. Whether you
2 are talking domestic violence, sexual assaults,
3 violent crime including the use of gun play.
4

5 We have made strategic decisions in terms of
6 summonses and arrests that have plummeted since the
7 start of that. Some made strategically, some a fact
8 of life. When schools are closed and shops are
9 closed and most of the normal foot traffic is closed
10 but in terms of the intimate details, Kristine, can
11 you address the question?

12 KRISTINE RYAN: Yes, so we have hired 225 of the
13 250 positions which were allocated for discovery
14 reform, so, about 90 percent. As the Commissioner
15 said, there continues to still be a tremendous amount
16 of work tied to complying with these laws, so the
17 individuals who are responsible for making sure all
18 of the information regard to lab reports, everything
19 that's happening in the crime lab, media service type
20 missions that need to review countless hours of body
21 worn camera footage and everything that needs to
22 happen both administratively, technically and
23 operationally to ensure that we're complying for laws
24 is still happening and that's what those individuals
25 are working on.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The Criminal Justice Reform including \$4 million added in November for the police lab, \$11 million for legal documents software project and \$28 million for a discovery lab. Can you tell us what the status of those projects are?

KRISTINE RYAN: Alright, yes, actually we've committed the vast majority of that capital funding for those projects. It is also a priority to make sure that the equipment and systems were up and running.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, you are going to continue to move forward on those?

KRISTINE RYAN: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, in terms of headcount, how are you estimating headcount in attrition now in light of the pandemic? Do you estimate more personnel will be leaving or more will be staying on compared to a normal year?

KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, I mean, I think at this point, it's very difficult to know what's going to happen economically for anyone and for the city, so I think that's hard to look at and we looked at historical situations and while it fluctuates in different years depending on when we've had large

1 classes 20 years before, people hitting their 20 and
2 we really haven't made significant adjustments to our
3 attrition assumptions at this point and time because
4 there is so much uncertainty.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is overtime up at this point?

7 KRISTINE RYAN: At this time, we are seeing a lot
8 of areas where there are reductions in overtime,
9 particularly tied to events that haven't been
10 happening as was reflected in the budget. We did
11 take a reduction tied to overtime and arrest overtime
12 is up and down in other areas.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. We have an
14 unfortunately - many NYPD personnel have been out
15 sick. Has this led to any staffing issues for you?

16 DERMOT SHEA: I'll jump in on that and at the
17 peak, I think it was April 9th, if my memory serves
18 me correctly, we were up to at one point 19.8 percent
19 out sick. Thankfully, the vast majority have
20 returned. I think the latest number is well over 90
21 percent, I think it was over 95 percent of the
22 members that have tested positive for COVID are
23 actually back at work.

24 So, we have been able to you know, members of the
25 Executive team, many of whom there, whether it's

1 Rodney Harrison in the Detectives, Fausto Pichardo,
2 Terry Monahan, Ben Tucker, myself, literally daily
3 meetings over the last two months on moving resources
4 around and responding to the conditions that were on
5 the street. We were able to bend significantly but
6 not great during this pandemic and I think I would
7 echo everything that Kristine said in terms of some
8 of the unintended consequences of the good nature was
9 the streets of New York for the first — we're
10 starting to see some life come back but the first six
11 weeks or so, New York City did not resemble the New
12 York City that I grew up in and know and love. And
13 it was a ghost town and one of the positive things
14 was it has a good impact on our overtime.
15

16 So, whether it was arrests that weren't being
17 made, unfortunately events that we all know and love
18 that were cancelled, that conditionally have had some
19 overtime levels that we were able to significantly
20 save some funds on the overtime side over the last
21 six weeks or so.

22 In terms of staffing, I think Kristine hit it.
23 We have not seen significant attrition yet. I think
24 there is many unknowns. I think there is an economic
25 unknown, not just for the police department but

1 society as well. It is tough times as you all know
2 that people are being laid off and you know, it is
3 something that we are very closely monitoring. The
4 most significant change to the personnel side since
5 this started was that we had to push off and forego
6 an April Academy class that we are concerned about,
7 quite frankly.
8

9 But we had to make that decision and that was
10 made as much from a public health standpoint more
11 than a budget, a little of both.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, thank you Commissioner.
13 You know, I was on 55th Street and Madison just
14 around the end of March for a doctor's appointment
15 and it was amazing to see nobody on the streets
16 there. As you said, it was very much like a ghost
17 town.

18 Another concern of ours is regarding the
19 auxiliary police officers who are sick. Do you know
20 how many APO's have fallen ill or whether they have
21 contracted the virus while doing auxiliary work?

22 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you for your question. We
23 have had six auxiliary members pass away. Every
24 story tragic; some that have been auxiliary members
25 over 30 years. I'm just, you know, I don't think - I

1 know everyone on this Zoom conference understands
2 this but I don't think people really across the
3 country realize.
4

5 These are individuals, some that put as many
6 hours in of their own time with no pay helping the
7 people in New York City. Working second jobs
8 essentially.

9 From the moment this pandemic hit, we suspended
10 auxiliary operations in New York City, so I could
11 tell you that the auxiliary members since the
12 pandemic hit have not been at work. There is a
13 number of reasons for that, despite being stretched
14 very thin on personnel and it's certainly entered
15 into conversations as a resource that we could use
16 but I could not justify bringing in people that are
17 volunteers and getting them sick in my conscience.

18 That together with a significant portion of the
19 auxiliary population, many of them are a little bit
20 older, you know officers, for obvious reasons. A lot
21 of them have been auxiliary officers for 30 years and
22 putting them in that age category and additional
23 risks that I was not willing to deal with.

24 I will tell you though, six passed away. I don't
25 think it will be possible to say how they contracted

1 it. It could be they contracted it at work very
2 early on before we suspended operations and everyone
3 knew about this. It's just another tragedy within a
4 tragedy.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, okay, thank you
7 Commissioner. Let me just go back to something you
8 were talking a little bit about before which is the
9 delay of the academy class. By delaying the April
10 Police Academy class until July, NYPD will save \$6.4
11 million in training and salary costs in Fiscal 2020.
12 How large is this expected class?

13 DERMOT SHEA: So, I know I have Ben Tucker on the
14 call, if you can unmute Ben Tucker. I just want to
15 say to Ben Tucker and Terry Shortell over at the
16 Academy that have - forget about thinking outside the
17 box, they've thought outside the academy and managed
18 to, we pushed one academy class out a little early.
19 We had to cancel one that was going in and we've
20 managed to keep one going on that was in the middle
21 and taking extraordinary measures separating people,
22 temperature screenings, protective equipment and we
23 closely monitored on a daily basis that rate of sick
24 on that ongoing class and I'm happy to say actually
25 lesser than the overall rate of the NYPD.

1
2 So, they have really done a great job and Ben are
3 you on?

4 BEN TUCKER: Yes, I am on Commissioner.

5 DERMOT SHEA: Okay, Ben, just the size of the
6 class that was delayed and how many people that were
7 looking at the July class. If you could just
8 summarize.

9 BEN TUCKER: Sure, the January class, the one
10 that's going to graduate, just to remind folks, they
11 will graduate on July 1st and we put those into the
12 street.

13 The April class is 503 individuals, recruits and
14 we pushed them back to join what is now the plan that
15 1163 officers will include that group as well. And
16 so, that's the size of the class. They are ready to
17 go and so, if we can bring them in, I think we can
18 move forward.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Deputy Commissioner, so did
20 any of those recruits express concern over the change
21 of the date from April to July?

22 BEN TUCKER: I don't know. I can't answer that
23 question Mr. Chair but I can find out for you and
24 speak with Chief Shortell but changes are I'm sure
25 they were disappointed. People sometimes they quit

1 their jobs and their get up to come in and begin.

2 So, I'm sure they are disappointed and now that they
3 know they won't be starting when they thought they
4 would. That's I think a normal reaction.

5
6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are you seeing any changes in
7 the number of applications to the Police Academy?

8 BEN TUCKER: No, actually, you know, unlike other
9 parts of the country, I think over the past few years
10 in deed I mean, many of the other departments have
11 the pool of perspective candidates for policing and
12 law enforcement in the country generally has shrunk,
13 but that's not been the case with us. We've been
14 recruiting really robust recruitment platform in
15 place over the last recent years but also just I
16 think generally, we've always had thousands of people
17 on the list.

18 When I came back in 2014, we had close to 50,000
19 people waiting who had taken the exam, waiting for
20 their list to come forward. So, we have dropped off
21 a bit but we continue to have candidates who we
22 believe are qualified to join the department.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay Commissioner, this will
24 be my last one and it's regarding the Police Cadet
25 Training program. That's also delayed; however, the

1 Mayor has said some cadets will be working to answer
2 311 calls. Can you tell us more about that?

3
4 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, one of the significant
5 changes early on from this, what we went through was
6 I mentioned earlier that the crime really dropped off
7 initially. Something else that dropped off was the
8 calls for service on the 911 side, which you know, we
9 all wish we weren't here but that was one good thing
10 that we weren't complaining about.

11 That's how we really got through as we did with
12 the 20 percent reduction in force because a lot of
13 that wasn't going on. What did change though in a
14 direction that caused us to move resources was, we
15 started to get a lot of 311 calls specifically about
16 people standing together, people waiting in line for
17 stores.

18 So, probably some uncertainty as earlier
19 discussions have alluded to in terms of you know, the
20 stages as we progress through this pandemic of what
21 stores were going to be open, what was allowed to be
22 closed.

23 So, the 311 calls really significant with crimes.
24 Working with City Hall and other agencies, we were
25 able to at one point lend some of our expertise in

1 terms of you know former NYPD Commissioner Jesse
2 Tisch whose a friend and an ally over at – when she
3 took over at DoITT and we lent some resources over
4 there. Part of that resource was cadets. I think
5 the number was, Ben could probably correct me. I
6 think it was in the neighborhood of about 150 cadets
7 that we called in and had answering calls after they
8 were trained up on that.
9

10 I think that is scheduled to be phased out at
11 some point moving forward now, but the cadets, which
12 is one other part of the NYPD that had to throw a
13 different hat on during this pandemic and really try
14 to help the city out as we got out of this.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you Commissioner.
16 I want to turn it over in a minute to Chair Richards
17 but I want to say that we have been joined by Council
18 Member, excuse me, Rodriguez and Barron have joined
19 us and I'm now going to turn it over to Chair
20 Richards.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you Chair and thank
22 you Commissioner and let me just also start by
23 thanking many of your precincts who have certainly
24 been helpful. Of course, I want to shout out the
25 100th precinct, especially out in the Rockaways who

1
2 have been part of a food distribution that we're
3 delivering about 15,000 pounds of food a week.

4 So, you know, we just want to point out there, we
5 will always speak and give credit where credit is due
6 and always be fair in where we come from. So, I just
7 wanted to acknowledge them and all the other
8 precincts who are helping out.

9 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you for that.

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Yeah, no problem. I want
11 to go into uniform overtime savings quick. So, we
12 recognize, I think you've recognized in 2020, \$10
13 million in savings for uniform overtime to account
14 for cancelled events such as parades and festivals.
15 However, there are no saving for Fiscal 2021 despite
16 the COVID-19 pandemic likely causing further
17 cancellations and reduce the event sizes.

18 Just to give you numbers from last year where we
19 are at. Last year from July through September, there
20 was over \$50 million in overtime for security detail
21 in events. So, I'll just give you some quick, quick
22 examples, for example the overtime just for July 4th
23 fireworks last year was \$2.5 million.

24 So, why were the saving taken for only \$10
25 million when the number of events has already been

1 drastically reduced and why is there no overtime
2 savings for Fiscal 2021 given that many events
3 already cancelled and will continue to be cancelled.
4 So, what is your justification around just \$10
5 million?
6

7 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, and I will push it to
8 Kristine that can walk you through. I think, I agree
9 Council Member with the \$10 million number that was
10 for Fiscal Year 2020 regarding events. I think
11 certainly it's not lost on any of us that this is
12 unprecedented times. I think the NYPD and other city
13 agencies are all inwardly looking on how we can do
14 things differently and I can tell you and commit to
15 you that we certainly have been doing that the last
16 two months looking ahead at what possibly could come
17 in these dire circumstances. And Kristine and I and
18 many others of the executive staff, Terry Monahan,
19 Chief Lipetri, when we speak about overtime and
20 trying to keep down violence. This is that timeline
21 that we are trying to work at all times. We are not
22 compromising public safety but how do we do it more
23 efficiently? How do we do it better? How do we save
24 the city money and this is something that we talk
25 about every day.

1
2 But Kristine if you could just walk through some
3 of the numbers?

4 KRISTINE RYAN: Sure. So, Council Member, with
5 regard to taking the \$10 out of the Executive Budget,
6 yeah, as the Commissioner said, we are constantly
7 looking at overtime. This is obviously a very unique
8 situation that we are in. The Executive Budget was
9 released on April 16th, so the work that we did to
10 that was done was still, while it feels like a very
11 long time ago, relatively early in this pandemic and
12 not knowing how far this would extend. What that
13 would mean in terms of ongoing cancellations,
14 obviously we knew in the coming weeks at that point
15 that there would be savings tied to cancellations.

16 We are continuing to look at that right now to
17 you know, understanding that the world is not going
18 to open up in the way I think we all would have hoped
19 as quickly as we would have hoped, so we are looking
20 to see if there are additional savings in those areas
21 for overtime.

22 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And what would be your
23 projection of how much more, assuming that we don't
24 reopen because I don't see any scenario where we
25 reopen and get back to doing what you know, we

1 normally would do every summer. I can't see block
2 parties happening while we have hundreds of people
3 dying every day.

4 So, can you just dove into that a little bit
5 more.

6 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, I mean -

7 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: You know, so, right now,
8 last year you spent \$50 million between July and
9 September. Uhm, and I know it's premature to have
10 these conversations but just based on what we're
11 hearing from the Mayor and Governor, there is really
12 not going to be any large scale events. There is no
13 pride happening this year. I can't see, I don't know
14 if baseball opens up eventually, so where are we at?

15 KRISTINE RYAN: So, I think it very much does
16 depend on and I think we'll know more you know,
17 within the next week or two as we know more from the
18 Governor and more from the Mayor on things and so,
19 you know, I think it will be potentially millions of
20 dollars. I think you know we probably are just going
21 to take the next few weeks and sort of assess what we
22 think would make sense because we also want to
23 balance that as the Commissioner said against
24 potentially other areas where we may need resources.
25

1
2 So, we're looking at the whole picture, but I
3 think we will be able to find savings in the events
4 for right now.

5 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you. I look forward
6 and you will report that back to the Committee?

7 KRISTINE RYAN: Of course.

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay. I want to head
9 into, just dove in a little bit to what Chair Dromm
10 went into and that was the incoming police class,
11 which if we cancel would certainly save us \$25
12 million and just to compare, I just want to compare
13 the NYPD to other agencies. So, when I compare the
14 FDNY to the NYPD class, NYPD's FY21 PEG would still
15 only be equal to the FDNY's roughly \$40 million if
16 you cancelled the class.

17 My question for the Commissioner is that funding
18 could go back to DYCD for summer programming for
19 youth for example. Two months ago, Commissioner, you
20 spoke about the importance of the city's youth and
21 here is a way the NYPD can absolutely help in this
22 situation right now. I mean, we speak of the crime
23 numbers and certainly there still are some areas that
24 we need to address. I mean, the shootings, which are
25 slightly up. Murders that are slightly up but we are

1 using officers every night. I think I see about
2 1,000, I think I read that the Mayor puts 1,000
3 police officers in our subway systems. Is that a
4 wise use of resources if we're talking about hiring
5 another class of nearly 587 people, are we using what
6 we have right now efficiently and effectively being
7 that in light of a lot of events not happening as
8 well.
9

10 So, I'm just interested in hearing a little bit
11 more about how you are thinking about redeploying
12 officers and also, how are we looking at groups like
13 the Crisis Management System to be on the ground
14 doing some of this work as well?

15 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, uhm, Chair, we could probably
16 talk for hours on that and I know, I think you and I
17 would probably like that but most people wouldn't.
18 You bring up a lot of good points. I mean,
19 specifically on the youth point, I said what I meant.
20 I think it's the most important thing that we have in
21 front of us to renewing our commitment and doing
22 everything possible.

23 One of the most frustrating things with this
24 pandemic was, we had transferred 200-300 youth
25 coordination officers, brand new position. Ready to

1
2 get them in, almost close to three weeks to a month I
3 think it was, a brand new trainee and we had to
4 cancel it, I think it was on day two or three and it
5 was right at the heart of when this hit.

6 They've been called on to do pitching and do
7 patrol and do a lot of assignments. We are now
8 getting them back to Deputy Commissioner Chauncey
9 Parker in my office yesterday. I've been talking to
10 Nilda Hofmann on the Community Affairs side planning
11 out what can we do for kids not next year, now.

12 So, I remain committed to that and really more
13 than anything else, I think it's so, so important.
14 Everything you just described in terms of budgetary
15 issues and making hard decisions is what we're
16 thinking about every day. You mentioned 1,000
17 officers in transit, I am looking at Eddie Delatorre
18 on my screen here, so he can jump in in a second if
19 you unmute Eddie. We're called on to do a lot of
20 things and one of the things that we were called on -
21 everyone saw what was going on with you know, the
22 terrible situation with homeless people that were
23 probably scared for their life at times. I mean,
24 everyone was scared in New York City and it continues
25 and if you got people moving from, in some cases

1 shelters because they didn't want to, at least this
2 is what I heard them say, some of them.

3
4 They didn't want to be at risk in a shelter and
5 thought it was safer riding trains underground. So,
6 we were called to try to come up with a solution
7 working with our partners in the MTA on that. The
8 initial plan which went into effect last week, I
9 think it's a work in progress. I think a lot of good
10 strides have been made. We've been able to get a lot
11 of people help. I mean, and that's what this is
12 about with the homeless. They are not committing
13 crimes, they need help. There is a mental illness
14 capacity to this and we also had to make sure that
15 when the city gets back to normal, that lifeline,
16 that force that drives people around was clean and
17 serviced.

18 You mention 1,000 number, that's a lot of cops.
19 That was the number that was used the first couple
20 nights and Eddie join in. We've scaled that back
21 already significantly and as you know, Eddie can you
22 talk to where we are at now with that?

23 EDWARD DELATORRE: Yes. We started off the first
24 few nights with about 1,000 officers. That included

1 all the officers that are normally patrolling at
2 night, even the Transit Borough as well.

3
4 We found that you know, the first few nights
5 would be the biggest challenge. We didn't know
6 exactly what to expect. We were going to be helping
7 the MTA workers. Ask a whole lot of people to leave
8 the subway system, who had never been asked to do
9 that before at night. It turned out to be very
10 successful. We also had to support our MTA brothers
11 and sisters in the MTA that were still working. We
12 had station agents now left in a station that was
13 going to be closed for four hours and they had
14 concerns as well.

15 Though we did start of strong to make sure it
16 went smoothly and smoothly it did go. It went very
17 well. After about three days in, we started to
18 transfer the responsibility. So, we scaled down from
19 1,000, over 1,000 to approximately 600 officers.
20 About 350 of those come from our normal staffing
21 level as it is. The additional responsibilities that
22 was shared by the other 400 or so we then spread out
23 to patrol.

24 So, now patrol precincts who made visits you know
25 throughout the hours between 1:00 a.m. and 5:00 a.m.

1 We didn't see that we needed officers there for the
2 eight hour period to handle those visits. So, it's
3 still going very well. You know if I can draw just a
4 little bit more on this Commissioner.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: I'm going to ask you to
7 try to be as brief as possible.

8 EDWARD DELATORRE: You don't want to hear about -

9 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: We know how this goes.
10 So, be as brief as possible because I got colleagues
11 who I want to get - okay, alright.

12 EDWARD DELATORRE: Just to give everybody a sense
13 of what's going on. You know, we did that six month
14 program with - I spoke about last time, the
15 diversion. In our diversion, we had 1,800 people
16 qualify. We had 651 that were meaningfully engaged
17 and 422 that went to a shelter. That was a six month
18 period.

19 Now, that was considered a huge success compared
20 to normal asks. When you ask somebody who needs
21 services, they could say no 50-100 times. In this
22 program, we're nine days into it. We are nine days
23 into it. We have 1,675 people that receive services,
24 228 that have gone to the hospital. People that
25 otherwise might have gotten more sick or had more

1 serious problems. 228 have gone to the hospital,
2
3 1,447 have accepted resources and gone to a shelter.
4 That's an amazing outcome for nine days.

5 So, I think the resources we put into it were
6 well thought out and you know, along with counselors
7 from various groups like DRC and the others are under
8 the DHS contract. I think it's a well thought out
9 plan and we've been refining it to make it more and
10 more efficient as the days go on and we're going to
11 continue to make it more efficient but right now, the
12 results speak for themselves.

13 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay.

14 EDWARD DELATORRE: A lot of people in New York
15 are getting help.

16 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Well, you know, I still
17 don't think this should be the job of the Police
18 Department to do and I will agree with the Police
19 Commissioner on this, a lot of things land on your
20 lap that should certainly not land on your lap and we
21 should be using social service providers to really
22 deal with this issue. This should not be a Police
23 Department issue.

24 EDWARD DELATORRE: They are -
25

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: I get it. I get it,
society has failed them. This certainly should not
be a PD issue though. I disagree with the use of PD
and really addressing these issues.

Commissioner, I want to go back to you once
again. So, your cut is only \$16 million right now.
That's what you are showing, which is roughly about
0.3 percent of your budget. Would you agree that the
cancellation of this class during a time when we're
seeing crime decrease, when there's a pandemic, would
you agree saving \$25 million at the very least from
this class, this money could be used wisely in other
areas?

DERMOT SHEA: Well, certainly the reality, I
think you are right. You have the reality if the
class were cancelled, it would free up money to be
used in other areas. There is no doubt about that
from the logistical point of view. The question that
I would have though is, is that where number one, are
we talking cuts? How many? How large and depending
on the answers to those first questions that where
should the first cuts come from and would that be the
best choice? And that's the discussions that we're
all thinking about.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay.

DERMOT SHEA: I will tell you that what worries me about the Academy class you know, when you compare it to example for overtime, overtime is something that we can be very nimble on and we can reappportion and move it around and we can make tough decisions literally on a daily basis depending on the conditions in front of us as well as a little risk reward and make intelligent decisions or try to and how we portion overtime.

When you talk about those academy classes, now you are locking yourself into 6-9 months out and once those get cancelled, we can assume a normal rate of attrition. Sometimes there are catastrophic events. 911 comes to mind where the normal rate of attrition is sped up. I can't tell you as I sit here today whether the pandemic will have a similar affect, but we can assume certain things and move off of those assumptions as things change.

Assuming how we're going to lose officers through normal rates of attrition and assuming crime rates that are a little unknown. When we cancel on academy class, we are now locked into that for six to nine months with the unknown in front of us in rising

1 crime or rising demands of our services. That's why
2 I am at times and I am now, to be frank, a little
3 hesitant on that one. It is clearly a cost savings.
4 The question for me would be, is it the smartest cost
5 savings or could we do it in different ways. But I
6 think it's a fair question you asked.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you and I would just
9 add lastly, because I want to get to my colleagues.
10 I just have two other areas I want to touch on
11 briefly. You know, I think it would be fair to
12 assume until there is a vaccine for COVID, that we're
13 going to be where were we are at. Whether we see
14 minimal reopening's or not, I think we're going to be
15 where we're at.

16 So, I would hope that we continue to think about
17 that strong. I'm very happy to hear at least it is
18 on the table but I think this can be an immediate
19 savings which would make sense as crime continues to
20 reduce.

21 I want to jump into PPE Commissioner because you
22 did testify two months ago, I believe to the
23 Committee that the NYPD had enough sufficient PPE, so
24 I was a little disturbed to read I believe in the
25 Post, the remarks around PPE and the Health

1 Commissioner and I wanted to know one, I hope you
2 would denounce the words that the SBA put out there
3 in the middle of a pandemic. There is no reason for
4 anyone to call a Commissioner or woman out of her
5 name, so I would hope you would denounce that sort of
6 activity.
7

8 And then secondly, I would also add, so I see you
9 budgeted for \$14.5 million in Fiscal 2020, most of
10 which is \$11 million for masks. My question, first
11 question is, are your officers mandated to wear
12 masks? Let's just start there before we start
13 speaking about spending more money on masks and I
14 want them to have masks obviously. I mean,
15 absolutely but is there a mandate right now for
16 officers to wear masks?

17 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, when someone can't socially
18 distance, they are supposed to have masks on, yeah.

19 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: when someone can't social
20 distance?

21 DERMOT SHEA: Right, so, there's occasions where
22 you are by yourself, it's similar to the public
23 citizens actually. If somebody is outside going for
24 a jog, they would not be according to the Executive
25 Order to be wearing a mask. There are certainly

1 recommendations but it wouldn't be mandated. I
2 pulled in today and everyone is getting very in tuned
3 to this. You know, the Major has made comments and
4 he is so right on this. You know, people are
5 policing themselves in New York City. So, I pulled
6 in today and I saw the person at the gate, didn't
7 have a mask on but he is sitting in a Pell box
8 essentially by himself all day. He is not wrong on
9 that front. It's a choice but the vast majority of
10 people should have masks on absolutely. It's for
11 their own protection. Let me just say because I know
12 you have other questions to.

14 You mentioned that the - and I'm sure that we'll
15 go back to it but I don't want to miss this one, with
16 the Twitter. Not only do I denounce that the
17 statement, I denounce 90 percent of what I read on
18 Twitter, quite frankly. I think the people should
19 less Twitter time and let's get things done but there
20 is no place, there should be no place for that foul
21 language. It's completely inappropriate.

22 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you. Uhm, let me
23 ask you, so just going back to masks now. So, you
24 said it's not a mandate currently because I'm finding
25 too many officers - I literally, and I think you

1
2 might have saw this on Twitter or somebody in your
3 department.

4 DERMOT SHEA: Now, stop with the Twitter.

5 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: 15 officers last week in
6 my neighborhood and I don't know what the situation
7 was without masks on. Do you think the department
8 has an obligation to lead by example on this?

9 DERMOT SHEA: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And what perception does
11 that send when we're seeing videos of officers
12 without masks? And then, at the end of the day,
13 going back to enforce it on other people. I'm sure
14 you saw the video last night of a young lady who was
15 getting on a train with a partial mask. While I had
16 not seen the body camera footage in full, I seen that
17 she was accosted for not having her mask on fully but
18 yet -

19 DERMOT SHEA: Hey Donovan, I agree, I agree with
20 you, we should lead by example. We absolutely should
21 and first and foremost, because it could save
22 somebody's life and 100 percent. I mean, listen, we
23 have - I wrote down a note here, somebody mentioned
24 in earlier inconsistencies, I think the NYPD has been
25

1 very consistent from the beginning on this one. Just
2 hear me out for a second please.
3

4 From the start of this pandemic, we have publicly
5 said on live streams and many other things. Terry
6 Monahan is here and he said it a 100 times, that our
7 intention has always been to correct conditions,
8 educate. The last thing we wanted to do was have to
9 resort to writing summonses. This is on individuals
10 that are going through enough in their lives.

11 So, we've been pretty consistent on that.
12 Sometimes its pumped to summonses. That unfortunate
13 reality is true. Let me just say, the video last
14 night, the officers did not accost her. They
15 approached her, they approached her professionally
16 and asked her to put a mask on and they listen, I
17 think the whole incident is horrendous. I feel bad
18 for the child, I feel bad for the woman, I feel bad
19 for the cops. I think the whole thing is just so you
20 know, shocking and disheartening and let me, I don't
21 know if you know this, but I have the body camera
22 footage. The officers were actually in the station
23 at the time with a box of masks, handing them out to
24 people, but it's just - I'll tell you, it is
25 frustrating that like that first interaction, please

1 put a mask on and it turned into statements made,
2 terrible profanity, yelling and then I'm going to
3 cough on everyone. And that goes to what you started
4 with, with your discussion today and Jumaane spoke to
5 it. I'm not naive and I know there is a long history
6 here and that is the challenge in front of all of us.

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Should you be in social
9 distancing business?

10 DERMOT SHEA: What's that?

11 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Should you be in social
12 distancing enforcement business?

13 DERMOT SHEA: Listen, the enforcement, I don't
14 like that word. I think that we are all about
15 helping people, trying to save lives. Is it terrible
16 that we are called upon to remind people to do this?
17 I don't think it's the end of the world. Where it is
18 though, I think everyone on this call would agree,
19 it's really, really, you know, something that we all
20 need to work. This is what I believe in my heart.
21 Shame on us all if we allow this to go backwards. We
22 have enough things to worry about between people.
23 Loved ones dying, the financial hit that's coming,
24 this is our city and it's incumbent upon all of us to
25 recognize all of our problems, all of our internal

1 biases. The police officers have biases, I have
2 biases and I assure everyone on this but we are
3 human, we must get past this.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alright, I'm going to end
6 my question and obviously we have a hearing on this
7 and I'm hoping you will come back to that hearing on
8 this specific issue next week.

9 How much PPE do you have currently stocked. Is
10 there enough sufficient PPE?

11 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, you mentioned, Donovan, you
12 mentioned that the article yesterday right and both
13 things are true in what you said earlier, we never
14 run out but we've been damn worried at times. Really
15 worried you know, and myself, Terry Monahan, Kristine
16 Ryan, who is here Vinney Grippo, whether it's hand
17 sanitizer, or N95 masks, surgical masks, Tyvek suits,
18 weekly calls with civilian and uniform unions on
19 this, we were very worried and very concerned and we
20 didn't know how fast we were going to run out. And
21 the problem is, this is not, I don't think, I'll
22 speak for my agency. This wasn't the NYPD not
23 prepared, we had significant amounts but when you get
24 into realities of how many can you have on hand
25 without wasting money because if you have too many on

1 hand and there is expiration dates, where is that
2 fine line? We never got to a point where we ran out
3 but we were really worried. How long is this going
4 to go? How many people need to wear masks? Is it
5 the civilian members job titles, uniform officers on
6 the frontline? How often should they change them?
7 Yeah, I mean, thankfully, they got to a position
8 where the supply chain increased significantly but it
9 wasn't without the help of police foundation, people
10 sending us masks, private donors, and many other
11 things.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alrighty, I'm going to go
14 to my colleagues for questions now but I will just
15 add that you know, obviously the events that we've
16 seen are certainly unacceptable and I know they will
17 have a lot to say about this and we still have a lot
18 of work to do Mr. Commissioner.

19 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you, thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alright, I'll go to my
21 colleagues for questions.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And Eugene and I'm going to
23 pass it to Counsel who is going to make an
24 announcement. Counsel?
25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. If any Council
3 Members have questions for the administration, please
4 use the Zoom raise hand function and you will be
5 added to the queue.

6 Council Members, please keep your questions to
7 five minutes including answers. Please wait for the
8 Sergeant at Arms to tell you when your time begins.
9 The Sergeant will then let you know when your time is
10 up. We will now hear from Council Member Lancman
11 followed by Council Member Borelli.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time
13 starts now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you Commissioner.
15 Good morning. Back in 2018, Chair Richards and I
16 held a hearing examining the vast racial disparities
17 in marijuana policing, something like 90 percent
18 people of color. You testified at that hearing as
19 Chief of Crime Control Strategies and vigorously
20 defended those disparities. Three months later, The
21 Times published a front page story, Surest Way to
22 Face Marijuana Charges in New York, Black or
23 Hispanic. And almost immediately, the Major publicly
24 committed to radically reforming marijuana policing.

1
2 So, my question to you is, what have you learned
3 from getting it so wrong two years ago on racial
4 disparities in marijuana enforcement that you might
5 apply to the vast racial disparities that we are
6 seeing in social distancing enforcement?

7 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, thank you for the question.
8 This is what I'll say, you have publicly said now
9 today Councilman Richards have said, it's not the
10 first time that this has come up. We have a
11 difference of opinion on the 311 and 911 data. There
12 is no doubt; I think we should publicly acknowledge
13 one set of numbers that both sides are looking at
14 here and have differences of opinion.

15 In terms of the racial disparities, I'm not sure
16 what you are mentioning regarding I was wrong, but I
17 said publicly yesterday and I stand behind it and
18 I'll say it again now, there is no doubt Councilman
19 that there are disparities regarding enforcement, not
20 just here in many areas and there is disparities well
21 beyond New York City Police Department. That's a
22 fact of life and I didn't need to see print outs at
23 that hearing a couple years ago to know that there is
24 disparities in the enforcement of marijuana. Because
25

1 I think it was widely recognized. I think you knew
2 it as well but I don't want to speak for you.
3

4 Is it right? No. Do I like it? No. Does it
5 cause us to think how to change and be more fair as
6 we police this city? Yeah and if we're not moving
7 fast enough or doing enough, that's why I don't mind
8 when the Public Advocate spoke out from the heart
9 today in how he feels because I agree with a lot of
10 what he says and I think that's the challenge in
11 front of us. We've gone from maybe six or eight
12 years ago, ten years ago, to where we are today and I
13 don't think we are at the finish line, I think it's a
14 journey. We got to move fast. We got to continue to
15 make efforts to fairly police.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here is my question
17 though.

18 DERMOT SHEA: And we have done that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: But here is the question
20 though. The numbers for marijuana policing were
21 about 90 percent communities of color. The numbers
22 for social distancing policing are about 90 percent
23 communities of color.

24 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, that's correct.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: When you use the
3 metaphor of a race, I don't feel like we've gotten
4 off to a starting line.

5 DERMOT SHEA: So, when you look at, I mean, and
6 this has been discussed many times. I can't quote
7 you the numbers now. I know that you know them as
8 well as I do with this. We used to make such a large
9 number of arrests for marijuana. We've made
10 intentional changes in the NYPD. We've made changes
11 working with you and at your behest and when I say
12 you, the Council. We've made policy changes. Now
13 the laws have actually changed in New York State,
14 which is another change.

15 So, all of this has happened and we have gone
16 from making a large amount of arrests to where we are
17 today, which is extremely small number of arrests.
18 But the problem is, the amount that is made, the
19 disparity still exists. It's something we have to
20 continue to work on. We also have to balance it out
21 with everything else that we deal with in public
22 safety. I'm not saying disparity exists in the small
23 number of summonses that are issued for social
24 distancing.

Now, to equate that to, we are going out there.

The last thing we want and I've said this twice already today and I've said it publicly to my offices in live streams and to their face in roll calls, is to have to resort to summonses for social distancing. But we will because ultimately it falls on the police.

So, we've tried across the city with educating people with asking people to comply. We've handed out masks. Not in one section of the city, we've handed out masks all over the city but you are 100 percent right -

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

DERMOT SHEA: That there is a disparity in those summonses and that disparity exists in many other things that we see and do. It does and you know, what we do about it and how we get - but it's not going to be an NYPD solution, a policy change that removes all of the disparities in New York City. I don't believe that's accurate.

We're going to be a part of the solution but we need a lot more.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and we're
3 going to move to our next Council Member. I just
4 want to remind folks that there will be a social
5 distancing hearing next week and this of course is
6 our budget hearing, so we'll now move to our next
7 Council Member.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: May we please hear from
9 Council Member Borelli followed by Council Member
10 Holden.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time
12 starts now.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you. First of
14 all, I just want to say, I don't believe there is any
15 need for your agency to apologize for seeking masks
16 for your employees. You know, I think you guys did a
17 great job preparing probably could not foresee the
18 burn rate in which you are going through rates you
19 know, giving the pandemic. I don't think asking for
20 eight or nine per employee masks was so outlandish to
21 warrant that response but nevertheless, Commissioner,
22 how much on average does the Department of Budget go
23 to cover overtime for officers?

24 DERMOT SHEA: Kristine, you want to jump in?
25

1
2 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, so, annually, it's about 10
3 percent for overtime. 10 percent of the overall
4 budget.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: And that's with a full
6 force of 36,000 uniformed headcount?

7 KRISTINE RYAN: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Okay and if the number
9 stays fairly close to 36,000 due to the academy
10 graduating, does that number stay constant?

11 KRISTINE RYAN: The overtime, that's generally
12 the amount is every year. It fluctuates sometimes
13 with grants and things like that but yes, as long as
14 we're maintaining the headcount, we don't have to
15 rely more on overtime to make us for shortfalls.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: The grants come from the
17 federal government, usually terrorism related and
18 that's outside of what we're talking about?

19 KRISTINE RYAN: Correct.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: So, if the budget were
21 cut and the Department put through fewer academy
22 classes, what would the impact on overtime have to
23 be?

24 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, I mean I think the concern
25 would be that in order to maintain core public

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 68

1 services, like responding to 911 calls, 311 calls,
2
3 being able to continue to investigate crimes and
4 provide the services that we're providing now, that
5 we would have to make sure that we have the resources
6 out in the community that we need and we're not
7 getting those resources from people coming out of the
8 academy classes that we would have to look to
9 overtime to make up for that.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Now, let me ask you a
11 question about that 36,000 number. Per capita,
12 police officers versus population, do you know if you
13 are the highest per capita cops per civilian in the
14 country?

15 KRISTINE RYAN: I believe we are the largest
16 police force in the country.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: You are certainly the
18 largest, you have more people in the royal navy in
19 uniforms and with guns. I'm not debating that but if
20 you look at Philadelphia or Boston or Chicago, the
21 one's I just pulled up, you actually have a much less
22 per capita police officer versus the general
23 population.

24 So, I mean, how can we possibly ask you if other
25 large cities are doing with more cops per person.

1
2 What do you think the inevitability would have on the
3 general city if there was a major decrease in
4 headcount?

5 DERMOT SHEA: The use of the word, sorry Kristine
6 but the use of the word Councilman major reduction,
7 you just scared me. I mean, I think that you know,
8 that is something that would have potentially
9 catastrophic results.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Okay, so what about 4
11 percent reduction or 3 percent or 5 percent?

12 DERMOT SHEA: Listen, I think the reality is you
13 are dealing with a less than optimal situation here
14 because you don't have all the facts but assuming the
15 normal rates and to Councilman Richards earlier,
16 there is no normal right now but there is still crime
17 occurring and there is a reduced headcount in Rikers
18 Island and the long term impact of that and it's a
19 lot of unknowns here but when you talk about what we
20 worry about, it's providing services to the residents
21 in New York City. Being there when they call us,
22 preventing crime, working with the youth, working
23 with domestic violence, response times to jobs where
24 it really seconds could mean a life and death. This
25 is what we worry about.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: So, there will be a
3 societal cost to the city if we drop below the
4 standard or the now standard 36,000 officers in the
5 city.

6 What about the actual monetary cost? Given the
7 amount of money we spend on overtime and that will
8 have to increase if we have less people, how much
9 will the city actually save?

10 DERMOT SHEA: Back to you Kristine. I mean, this
11 is something that we think about all the time.

12 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, I mean clearly you know,
13 looking at you know there are salary savings from not
14 having to go into the academy which as indicated from
15 the delay. We have \$6.4 million that we saved from
16 that delay but overtime hour for hour is
17 significantly more costly than straight time, so
18 again, you know, we would be looking at how do we
19 maintain those response times. How do we maintain
20 services and so, you can't just look at you know a
21 straight salary reduction. You have to look at what
22 the costs are both in terms of dollars and you know,
23 impact on the city of the other side and then look
24 further where you might actually have to spend more.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: So, if the city lost say
3 you know 3 or 4 percent of police officers and we
4 went down to 35,000. How long would it take if we
5 made this bad idea. How long would it take to get
6 the number back up to 36,000? Can we do it in one
7 Fiscal Year or will it take multiple academy's?

8 KRISTINE RYAN: You can vary the size of the
9 academy's but as the Commissioner said earlier, you
10 can't adjust a year on a dime. You can't decide that
11 you are just going to change it quickly, individuals
12 are in the academy for 6 months, so it would take you
13 know, our plan now is to include the April class in
14 the July class. So, you would be shifting classes
15 and increasing class sizes but it would take you
16 know, several class sizes to make up for something of
17 that size.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Had it been your
19 experience -

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We need to stop.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Sorry, thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much. I
23 think one of the things that we are trying to do here
24 is to balance our priorities and uhm, while the NYPD
25 is taking basically a 0 percent cut, we see a cut of

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 72

1
2 about 32.7 percent to DYCD. There are many people
3 who believe that investing more in programs that
4 prevent crime and working with youth is a priority
5 for the city as well. So, I think one of the things
6 we are trying to do is to find that balance.

7 Thank you and let's have the next Council Member
8 ask questions please.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can we have questions please
10 from Council Member Holden followed by Council Member
11 Adams.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
13 start now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you Commissioner
15 for your testimony. Council Member Borelli -

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Holden, we
17 can't hear you.

18 DERMOT SHEA: I think he's muted.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Holden, you
20 are muted. Oh, you're still muted.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, you are good.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, I'm sorry. So,
23 Council Member Borelli touched upon some of my
24 questions. So, I'll just talk about the future, but
25 you know bail reform. It's my understanding and you

1 mentioned this Commissioner that at the beginning of
2 the year crime was up. What are the recidivism
3 numbers of individuals leaving Rikers or benefiting
4 from the new bail laws and how does this recidivism
5 impact our budget or the NYPD budget?
6

7 DERMOT SHEA: We'd be happy to get back to in a
8 separate discussion. You know, we didn't have
9 recidivism numbers for a budget hearing but we'd be
10 happy to set up an appointment. Chief Lipetri is on
11 here and he can give you essentially any numbers you
12 are looking for.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But essentially, if we
14 are letting people out and they are committing crime
15 over and over again, we're seeing that. We see a
16 number of cases that that's going to increase the
17 budget because more cops are needed. When a cop
18 makes an arrest, he's offline and so forth and so on
19 and just a revolving door can affect the budget very
20 easily.

21 DERMOT SHEA: It absolutely can and you know,
22 there's a lot of — you have to parse out a lot here,
23 so the impact one crime has. I spoke to somebody
24 this week and it resonated with me. He was the
25 victim of a crime recently and he doesn't walk down

1
2 the street anymore without it impacting his life. He
3 is looking at who is around him. He doesn't walk a
4 certain way. He wants to avoid darkly lit streets
5 and that's the real story of crime and when you have
6 a crime spike, again, you are talking, we have the
7 lowest incarceration rates really of any major city
8 and it's something to be proud of everyone. But
9 there is a tipping point too and when you start to
10 tinker tough decisions but when you tinker a little
11 too much and it goes off, when one person gets out,
12 when you have such few people in jail and they all
13 have lengthy records and that doesn't mean they are
14 bad people but that does mean they have a track
15 record and a resume.

16 You are dealing with career criminals and one
17 person getting out committing multiple crimes also
18 costs us money until we figure out who it is and its
19 hitting the news and people are scared because there
20 is either burglaries in their building or there is
21 robberies on the street. It costs us money to deploy
22 to make people feel safe as well. So, there is a
23 ripple effect where it does have a financial impact,
24 there is no question.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you Commissioner.

3 We also live in a new world and it looks like
4 policing will change in many ways. We still don't
5 realize and I think we'll likely need more officers
6 to enforce a myriad of situations and that's why I
7 think cancelling the academy or postponing it is a
8 mistake.

9 We are entering a new phase here and we don't
10 know if the pandemic will come back and if it does it
11 will affect the police force maybe more than 20
12 percent that we've seen.

13 So, are you calculating like different scenarios
14 in the budget to deal with the possibility of the
15 pandemic coming back and canceling the academy?

16 DERMOT SHEA: We are preparing internally with
17 multiple use options of what could happen. I think
18 there is a lot of unknowns, but we certainly are
19 preparing for that and what the future looks like. I
20 do think you are right in terms of it will impact
21 policing as it does other segments of society, other
22 businesses. Certainly, the meeting that we're
23 holding right now is an example of that. Whether
24 that results in a need for more officers, I honestly
25 don't know that but we certainly are preparing for

1 multiple eventualities regarding budget, regarding
2 personnel, cuts that could possibly be needed in this
3 terrible, terrible time as well as losses because of
4 health spreading. So, it's an uncomfortable
5 situation but it's our job to plan for it.

6
7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And just one other point,
8 we met before the pandemic with Chauncey Parker, who
9 has got some great ideas. This is before the
10 pandemic hit. Great ideas, we're going to need him.
11 We're going to need some of those ideas to be
12 implemented not only now but certainly in the summer
13 months, especially if the youth are not employed.

14 So, he's a terrific asset in the Police
15 Department. I want to congratulate you for bringing
16 him in but again, this is - it's very, very important
17 to come up with a strategy how to work with our youth
18 during the summer months especially.

19 So, I want to thank you Commissioner. I think my
20 time is up. Thank you Chair.

21 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. And
23 Commissioner, I have to ask you, what numbers do you
24 have to back up your claim about bail reform?

DERMOT SHEA: Again, we've been down this road.
I'll go back to what we saw January 1st.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We just need the numbers.

DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, well, if I could answer. On
January 1st, we saw a catastrophic crime increase
that we hadn't seen in 20 years in New York City and
it was immediate.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [INAUDIBLE 1:29:07], give me
the numbers.

DERMOT SHEA: A 20 percent -

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It seems to me that you are
doing a lot of [INAUDIBLE 1:29:16] in terms of not
being able to produce those numbers and in terms of
your unwillingness to confront that issue and also in
terms of your statement prior to this, that any
reduction in the Police Department would have
catastrophic effects, catastrophic? I don't see it
as possible. I don't see it as possible.

If you can't give us numbers Commissioner, then I
can't believe what it is that you are saying.

DERMOT SHEA: So, I absolutely can give you
numbers and we have provided numbers in the past and
we can certainly do it again. We had a 20 percent
reduction in the Rikers Island population, roughly in

1
2 the 1 month proceeding, January 1st that resulted in
3 an almost immediate 20 plus percent increase in index
4 crime in New York City. Those two events are not
5 unrelated.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But you can't tell me that
7 those same people Commissioner -

8 DERMOT SHEA: If I could finish please.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No, I'm in charge here.

10 DERMOT SHEA: Okay. Then can I -

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Excuse me Commissioner.

12 DERMOT SHEA: Yes, sir.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, you have not said that
14 those people were the same people who got out. You
15 do not have numbers on that. Okay, and we want to
16 hold you accountable on that.

17 DERMOT SHEA: I understand.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, and I'm sorry that I
19 have to be this way but we have never gotten those
20 numbers. Let's move onto the next Council Member.
21 Let's move on to the next Council Member.

22 DERMOT SHEA: I'd like to address that we have
23 provided in the past recidivism numbers from people
24 that were arrested that have a direct impact from the
25 Bail Reform Law. If you would like, the numbers have

1 changed because time has passed but we could
2 certainly provide it again.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let's go to the next Council
5 Member.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can we please have Council
7 Member Adams followed by Council Member Ampry-Samuel.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
9 start now.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much and good
11 morning Commissioner.

12 DERMOT SHEA: Good morning.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Good morning to your team
14 as well. I thought I saw Chief Barrere. I want to
15 give him a shout out as well this morning. You know,
16 Commissioner, a lot of what's going on is just so
17 troubling to me. My colleague, Council Member Holden
18 just mentioned how to work with our youth during the
19 summer months and I agree with that sentiment
20 wholeheartedly but I think that my perspective comes
21 off more on how we can save our youth through this
22 budget. NYPD about a 1 percent budget cut, meanwhile
23 Youth Services are exponentially cut in their budget.
24 I read your testimony and your testimony Commissioner
25 is extremely youth centric.

DERMOT SHEA: Yes, it is.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I was very pleased to see that. It is extremely youth centric. So, what I am looking for are your thoughts on our youth. The thoughts on a disparity in the budgets across the board with this Executive Budget. I mentioned yesterday in a press conference that COVID is killing us all around and what we cannot have is the killing of our youth via the elimination of programs across the City of New York. We cannot do that. So, I really need your thoughts on how the NYPD is going to look at equality in the budget. We, right now, are looking at cuts of millions of dollars for our youth, while we're sitting here looking at the budget for the NYPD, not freezing hiring that could possibly free up an upwards of \$100 million.

We are looking at the NYPD increasing in social service expansion and the NYPD in practice. We are looking at social distancing enforcement. I mean, I just need your thoughts on this lack of balance between the NYPD budget and largely across our youth service perspective, especially given your youth centric testimony.

1
2 DERMOT SHEA: Yes, so thank you for acknowledging
3 that. I can't think of anything that is more
4 deserving and important than the future of this city
5 of the kids. I think we all in city government have
6 to make sure that we're doing everything possible.
7 They are the future. Shame on us if we don't support
8 them in every way possible. That's what's behind our
9 whole youth strategy in terms of doing everything
10 possible to work with kids, to guide kids, to keep
11 them from every getting into trouble.

12 You asked some very pointed questions and some
13 important questions. Some of them go beyond frankly
14 the Police Department in terms of you know, different
15 agency budgets. I think that you do though have to
16 balance you know, do we want to give more for kids?
17 Absolutely. Where does the money come from? That's
18 a tough question but what I would say is when these
19 tough decisions are made from the Police Departments
20 point of view, you just have to be very careful and I
21 know you know this, that we're not robbing Peter to
22 pay Paul and we're cutting let's say, I don't think
23 it's necessarily tied to a future academy class
24 because what is the detrimental effect on that?

1
2 I mean, I think we all agree that there is
3 nothing more important than the kids to the future of
4 this city. It is crime fighting; supplying kids with
5 things to do, with resources. That's why we put such
6 an investment of police officers behind it. That's
7 why Nilda Hoffman and Chauncey Parker and I are
8 talking constantly about how do we plan or how do we
9 keeps kids occupied during this pandemic? We have
10 things planned for online. It's just very difficult.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I appreciate that. I
12 appreciate that very much Commissioner, thank you. I
13 just got a couple more seconds left here and I
14 appreciate your thoughts. I would just really,
15 really appreciate more if the Department would take a
16 serious look at balancing your budget and really
17 considering as you say the concerns of the youth.

18 I also want to get in here also and just note
19 that our communities of color are hurting and the
20 perception and the optics right now as it pertains to
21 enforcement and policing, in communities versus other
22 communities.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: So, I wanted to get that
3 said as well. Thank you very much for your testimony
4 Commissioner.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Next Council
6 Member please.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I have Council Member Ampry-
8 Samuel followed by Council Member Yeger.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
10 start now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Good morning
12 everyone. Recognizing that we only have five
13 minutes, I want to get all of my questions asked on
14 the record and I will ask all three of my questions
15 before asking for responses.

16 I first want to say that I will 100 percent stand
17 with Chair Dromm, Richards and Public Advocate
18 Williams's words during their opening statements, as
19 well as regarding the bail reform.

20 Commissioner, you already know where I'm coming
21 from in my statements and my questions because we've
22 talked about this considerably.

23 So, as the Chair of the Public Housing Committee
24 and the Representative of the 41st Council District,
25 which includes the 67th Precinct, the 71st, the 73rd

1 Precinct, 77th to 81 PSA2, PSA3 and as a Council
2
3 Member that has become also familiar with the
4 critical role a Federal Monitor can play when the
5 rights of the people have been deemed violated by a
6 government agency. I sit here and I go through the
7 Executive Budget reminded of the cost burden some
8 NYPD officers have placed on this city and like the
9 cost for legal fees and associated fees for the Floyd
10 v City of New York case, that led to the NYPD having
11 the Monitor was some \$11 million. And reading of
12 every recent article of the Gothamist from February
13 of 2020, the article gives an update on the status
14 the Monitor, saying the Monitor has not deemed the
15 NYPD stop and frisk practices to be in compliance
16 with the constitution and the Police Department is
17 likely to be under the Monitor's watch for years to
18 come.

19 The NYPD spokesperson Al Baker responded by
20 stating, the NYPD understands that constitutional
21 bias repolicing is found foundational to building
22 community trust and keeping New York City even safer.
23 And that every stop that is made in the city is not
24 only done constitutionally but in both recorded and
25 documented as required.

1
2 So, now fast forward three months. We have
3 witnessed officers enforcing yet another highly
4 subjective policy, which led to some real community
5 concerns. And as we are discussing the Executive
6 Budget and the fiduciary responsibility of our agency
7 leaders, do you think the actions that we have
8 witnessed can lead to more law suits and legal fees
9 as a result of reported constitutional violations and
10 should your officers as of today continue to enforce
11 social distancing as a policy?

12 Now, I know you answered Chair Richards and there
13 is a hearing next week, but my question is really
14 about fiduciary responsibility. Is the enforcement
15 of a policy doing more harm than good to our city
16 financially?

17 And then I have a next question. The meaning –
18 you mentioned the number of school safety agents in
19 your opening and I want to acknowledge school safety
20 agent Charlotte Davis from Brooklyn North. With that
21 being said, yesterday, I received a report that two
22 school safety agents were attacked in Manhattan as a
23 result of serving in their new mandated roles outside
24 of the school building. Can you speak to the work
25 that you are doing with the school safety agents and

1 the trainings that they have received and did the
2 training add any costs to the department?
3

4 And my last question, you mentioned in your
5 opening statement that another crime that was up is
6 murders. I had clearly another murder in my district
7 last night. Have you identified any drivers behind
8 the increase and what are you doing to prevent this
9 particular case, in particular working with the
10 Crisis Management teams? And again, we're in the
11 middle of a budget, and so we're looking to see how
12 do we adequately utilize our funding if funding
13 should be going towards the Crisis Management teams
14 as opposed to NYPD patrolling the streets.

15 So, thank you.

16 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you very much and I'm writing
17 notes here and I'm going to hit them quick and Rodney
18 Harrison is on. I'm going to unmute Rodney and he
19 can finish up in talking just briefly about what
20 transpired in Brooklyn last night.

21 The fiduciary responsibility you mentioned
22 regarding the cost in social distancing and
23 Councilman Richards is asking for a hearing on this.
24 Do I believe there is a possibility that events
25 surrounding social distancing could lead to law

1 suits. I think it's absolutely possible based on
2 what we saw in the last week. I do and I don't like
3 it and I think we all agree that it shouldn't happen
4 in terms of incidents that may result in law suits.
5

6 The word enforcement there is tricky. I would
7 say again that the last thing we want is any
8 summonses or enforcement tied to this.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

10 DERMOT SHEA: I don't have the best answer for -
11 if we walk away, I think there is a cost to that to
12 where people, it could lead to people getting sick
13 that didn't have to get sick and that's what makes
14 this a very difficult situation.

15 We've tried to in recent days, you mentioned
16 school safety. We have school safety agents; they do
17 a phenomenal job across this city. They are some of
18 the most dedicated people. They are great. They
19 know the communities. The schools are closed, except
20 for the food drop off sites essentially. What we've
21 done recently is transition a number of school safety
22 officers to the parks. They are not writing
23 summonses; they are high visibility. They make
24 people feel safe and they are exercising community
25 policing. They are staying in the parks and

1 reminding people there is masks, there is an
2 opportunity to social distance.
3

4 I think that's a win, win and I also think it's a
5 good use of resources and I think it's the same thing
6 we were doing with our uniform patrol officers but
7 it's going to free up uniform patrol officers. They
8 received training. I don't have the cost in dollar
9 amounts of that training, I wouldn't necessarily put
10 a cost because they were at work earning money
11 already and we just educated them on the executive
12 orders and what we want it set to people in parks.

13 There was a terrible incident within the last day
14 or two. One with two school safety agents, one with
15 school crossing guards in different parts of the city
16 where they were assaulted literally for no reason by
17 somebody emotionally disturbed. Arrests were made
18 and thankfully they weren't seriously injured but
19 it's just - it's an example of sometimes what's
20 happening in this city and it's unfortunate but the
21 school safety agents really have done a phenomenal
22 job and continue to be out there serving the people
23 of this city.

24 I have a crisis management regarding Cure
25 Violence. We've been in touch, members of the

1
2 Executive staff; Terry Monahan, Fausto Pichardo was
3 on a Zoom conference with them in the last week. I
4 think I either scheduled or I'm scheduling one. I
5 think it's on the schedule already for upcoming to
6 touch base with them. They are a tremendous asset
7 for this city that could be tapped on for probably a
8 host and variety of issues.

9 I will remind people that back in March when this
10 whole social distancing phenomenon started, I
11 recognized that there could be problems and I called
12 many elected officials and said, and clergy members,
13 stand with us and be the frontline with us as we just
14 try to, everyone's stressed out. Everyone is losing
15 family members. You can't think of a worse situation
16 and I didn't want a confrontational situation, I
17 wanted to work with community and come together.

18 So, we've thought this way for months. Not
19 summonses, working with people. There have been
20 [INAUDIBLE 1:44:40]. Some terrible incidents in the
21 last week that were captured for a variety of reasons
22 and I think again, to repeat myself, it's going to
23 take all of us to come together to make sure that we
24 get through this as one suit.

1
2 I really believe that. I don't want to step on
3 Rodney Harrison, our Chief of Detectives. I am very
4 much aware of what happened in Brooklyn last night.
5 We had a series of shootings. In the last couple
6 days, we lost a couple young men. We've had other
7 incidents of shots being fired when no one was hit.
8 We believe we have a good grasp of what it's about
9 and what's behind it but Rodney are you on?

10 RODNEY HARRISON: Good morning. I don't know if
11 I am coming over clear.

12 DERMOT SHEA: Yes.

13 RODNEY HARRISON: Okay, so, if I could just real
14 quickly talk about some of the violence that we're
15 seeing in your district Councilwoman. If we just
16 take a look at the 71st Precinct in Crown Heights,
17 we've seen two shooting incidents that have been
18 troubling. One of them being a young inspiring hip
19 hop artist and that shooting seemed to have been
20 stemmed from the young man Pop Smoke, that was killed
21 out in California.

22 What we're seeing is a lot of these hip hop
23 inspiring artists beefing amongst each other and now
24 it's turning to violence. It's very troubling.

1 So, we had the two shootings in 71, we had a
2
3 homicide in the 67, we had shots fired in the 69, we
4 had another shooting incident yesterday in the 70.
5 We had a retaliation shooting in the 77 that stemmed
6 from a young woman that was jumped and robbed by a
7 group of boys over by the Albany developments. And
8 all of this is stemming from crew on crew, gang on
9 gang violence.

10 So, to answer your question, what are we going to
11 do about it? We were able to get our violent crime
12 squads back to their regular way of doing business,
13 which is investigating these shooting incidents,
14 trying to cultivate witnesses, and trying to close
15 out these shooting incidents.

16 As well as we're going to be giving them certain
17 zones on those problematic areas and make sure we
18 have a suppression plan in place. Working with
19 patrol, working with the different units in Intel
20 that provide us information, so we could somewhat
21 interdict the violence before it occurs.

22 So, it's a team effort. It's not just going to
23 be from my bureau. It's going to be from patrol,
24 it's going to be from Intel, it's going to also be
25 from the public. A lot of these shooting incidents,

1
2 we need the public to help us, to come forward and be
3 able to help us identify individuals that are
4 committing these crimes but what we see is a lot of
5 these incidents are really young inspiring hip hop
6 artists, chastising one another and then cultivating
7 to them doing whatever they are there to do to commit
8 some type of violence against their rival gang.

9 So, a lot of work needs to be done. I am very,
10 very optimistic with the personnel that I have to
11 make sure we continue to keep that part of Brooklyn
12 as safe as possible.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. We're going
14 to move on to our next Council Member's question.

15 DERMOT SHEA: Thanks Rodney.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Committee Counsel Brick?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I'm so sorry. I was on mute.
18 Can we have Council Member Yeger followed by Council
19 Member Lander?

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
21 start now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very much. Good
23 morning Commissioner, good morning Chief and good
24 morning Mr. Chair.

1 Commissioner, I want to speak briefly because
2
3 we've heard a lot this morning and you know, if one
4 jumped here from outer space and landed at this
5 hearing today, you would think that New York City's
6 cops are literally the worst defenders in the world.
7 The most hard people, terrible human beings who want
8 to do nothing but destroy the city that they are
9 sworn to serve.

10 That's not what I believe in, that's not what you
11 believe and I want to clear also that there are a lot
12 things that I don't agree with on policing. I agree
13 with a lot of my colleagues who don't think that the
14 Police Department and Police Officers should be
15 enforcing social distancing. I think we've seen the
16 results of that here and there and some hard videos
17 that New Yorkers have seen.

18 But on balance, every single day 365 days a year,
19 our cops are putting their lives on the line to
20 defend New Yorkers and that's not what we're hearing
21 here today at this hearing and I'm a little
22 disappointed in that by the hypocrisy I think that
23 I'm hearing from some of my colleagues. I want to
24 address the academy class and specifically your use
25 of or the use of the word catastrophic.

1 I agree with the notion that allowing the
2 headcount in the Police Department would be
3 catastrophic if it were to drop. The idea that
4 because today, we're seeing a little less crime
5 because people are locked in doors and we also saw a
6 little less crime in April because people are locked
7 in doors and therefore, we ought to plan a budget
8 that assumes that nobody's ever coming out of their
9 houses again and crime is going to be low, if not
10 disappear completely. It's ludicrously, it's lunacy,
11 it's insane. We ought not wait for a crime wave
12 before we decide to increase the headcount in the
13 city to a place to make sure that it's not
14 diminishing in nature.

16 If we allow the headcount to drop, to diminish,
17 we will end up in a place I believe like what we saw
18 in the early, in the late 80's and especially in the
19 early 90's, a crime wave of epic proportions. A
20 crime wave that kills people, that destroys lives,
21 increasing in homicides which we've already begun to
22 see that needle shift in a bad direction. Shootings,
23 we've seen that needle shift in a very bad direction
24 and I know you've been attacked for this because
25 apparently you didn't come here with a spreadsheet or

1
2 some kind of a pie chart. But it is not a secret
3 that crime shot up in January.

4 It's demonstrable, it's been reported. It's been
5 reported by you sir. You have told New Yorkers what
6 you are seeing. I don't agree with you all the time
7 but I believe you to be a truthful person and I don't
8 expect you to agree with me all the time but I try to
9 be as truthful as I can.

10 The idea that somehow we should just simply stop
11 policing in the city because we're having a tough
12 budget time is insane. The City Council raised its
13 own operating budget in the last two years by \$30
14 million, \$30 million.

15 We are not proposing to cut one penny of that but
16 let's make sure that New Yorkers don't have cops on
17 the street.

18 I'm not necessarily going to ask you a question
19 today because my clock is ticking away and the number
20 of people who get a chance to speak the truth about
21 what we're actually seeing instead of playing what I
22 would deem I think, petty politics with policing in
23 this city is disgusting and I'm not going to do it.
24 I want you to continue to remain safe.

1
2 I am going to briefly address something else. I
3 don't know why you feel forced to apologize for
4 Tweets. We've seen that here in this Council before.
5 Tweets are Tweets, and unless it's your Tweet, it
6 ought not be your job to apologize for it. So, you
7 can stand down on that as far as I'm concerned. You
8 don't have an obligation to do that in any way.

9 I would also say that the interaction that I saw
10 reported between you and the Commissioner of Health,
11 regarding the police officers who serve the people of
12 this city. I'm disgusted by it. I'm not asking you
13 to comment on it, that's not your job. She is a
14 colleague of yours and you both work for the Mayor
15 but I am disgusted about it and I don't work for
16 either of you or the Mayor. I think that her
17 reaction to protecting our cops was so disgusting, so
18 hideous that I am glad that a light has been shined
19 on it and when the Council meets tomorrow to discuss
20 why the Mayor may have lost faith in the Department
21 of Health and shifting operations to HAC for purposes
22 of pandemic tracing and the like -

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Where in a place when we
25 do that. Mr. Chair, I thank you for your time.

1
2 Commissioner, I'm not going to ask you to answer any
3 of that, if you want to you may but my time is up as
4 it often is earlier than I wish it to be.

5 Thank you very much sir.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. I must
7 say that I disagree with the mischaracterization of
8 the way in which I have conducted the hearing and I
9 don't feel that we were prejudice in any way or
10 thought we have given everybody the opportunity to
11 say their words. So, including yourself.

12 Let's go now back to Council Member Ampry-Samuel,
13 who I am going to give a couple more minutes because
14 her questions were not really answered. Council
15 Member Ampry-Samuel?

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
17 start now.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you. I just
19 wanted to say that I didn't need to hear of the
20 report out of the violence in my district on this
21 call or on this Zoom. I actually wanted to just
22 highlight three budget issues.

23 So, all three of my questions were related to the
24 budget and I just wanted that to be clear and
25 sometimes it gets lost when we hear a lot of other

1 stuff and I'm not calling a stall tactic at all.

2
3 Even though I do appreciate the report Harrison, but
4 I just wanted to make it known and clear that all
5 three of my questions were budget related and that we
6 can have a separate brief about the violence in my
7 community and what we can do together.

8 So, thank you so much Chair Dromm and that's all
9 I wanted to say. I just wanted to clear the record
10 on that one.

11 DERMOT SHEA: Can I just clarify something Chair?

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, of course.

13 DERMOT SHEA: With Councilman Ampry-Samuel, was
14 there something I didn't address though? The
15 fiduciary responsibility I took a note on, I think
16 that that's - I mentioned that. I think there's an
17 absolute possibility that those videos could result
18 in law suits which I absolutely don't like but I
19 think that's a real possibility.

20 The school safety, I think I answered it in that,
21 you know, I was complimentary to them. I love them
22 and I don't think that there was any additional costs
23 associated with the training. I think it was one day
24 and then the crisis management piece, was there
25 something that I missed?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 99

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: No, you didn't.
3 It's just that it got a little bit in Harrison's
4 reporting.

5 DERMOT SHEA: I gotcha. I know Harrison talks
6 too much; I know.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Because I got a ton
8 of text messages about it. So, thank you so much
9 Chair Dromm for the opportunity.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we all like to talk.
11 Next Council Member please.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can we please have Council
13 Member Lander followed by Council Member Gibson.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
15 start now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Chair and
17 Commissioner, thank you for being here. I think the
18 last time you and I had the chance to talk one on one
19 was at SOMOS in Puerto Rico in November.

20 DERMOT SHEA: It seems like ten years ago.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I know we could roll the
22 clock back to that time for sure. This crisis has
23 obviously been enormously challenging and I really
24 want to acknowledge and honor the sacrifices that the
25 NYPD and its families have made.

1
2 None of us feel safe right now. We desperately
3 want to feel safe and none of us feel safe. So, I
4 understand the impulse to think the NYPD is our
5 public safety agency and so, the way to make us feel
6 safe is to have more policing. Like, that makes
7 sense to me but this crisis is not like that. You
8 know, policing is designed to protect public safety
9 from a small number of individuals who break the law
10 and put others at risk and you know, guns and arrests
11 and jail cells will not slow the spread of this
12 deadly virus. The thing that's most jeopardizing our
13 safety. More policing can't keep us safe from COVID
14 and meanwhile as you've heard and talked honestly
15 about today, which I appreciate, targeting policing
16 to address the COVID crisis has these real harmful
17 impacts.

18 Systemic racism exists in all our public system
19 in healthcare, housing, the economy, politics, it's
20 sure not unique to policing. But since policing
21 involves the use of force and incarceration, the
22 consequences are especially visible and problematic
23 and it divides us when we so need to be united. And
24 at the same time, we're facing this devastating
25 budget crisis that's forcing us to cut our summer

1 youth programs, our school funding and so much else
2 and put a hiring freeze on teachers, school social
3 workers, youth workers. You know, I think that's why
4 many of my colleagues and I believe we have to adjust
5 our budget in a way that's mindful of the challenges.
6 If we can't afford to hire new teachers or social
7 workers or youth workers, then maybe we can't afford
8 to hire new police officers.
9

10 We got to support our existing officers with PPE
11 and support and training and gratitude with line of
12 duty benefits for the family and every officer who
13 loses their life.

14 But we have to look at whether we can afford to
15 hire those new officers and I think it's important to
16 note here that the dramatic decreases in index crimes
17 from 2000 to 2016, went along with a decrease in NYPD
18 headcount from 40,000 to 35,000. It was dictated by
19 harsh budget reality, not because people wanted to
20 but because we couldn't afford it.

21 And you didn't stop policing. The department
22 strategy evolved; crime declined even as the force
23 shrunk. I mean, as the citizens budget commission
24 shows, police officer hiring has a greater budget
25 impact in most other city employees. Initial salary

1 is comparable but that salary goes up as it should
2 and it requires a higher pension contribution, as
3 we've decided is appropriate, but you know, that's
4 why as we look to restore cuts to summer youth and
5 education programs, I believe we have to extend the
6 hiring freeze to the NYPD.
7

8 Now, I know you don't share that perspective as
9 you've said here, but I guess I'd like to ask you, do
10 you agree that the COVID crisis reveals the limits of
11 policing as a strategy for public safety at this
12 moment? And if so, you know, do you think those
13 limits should be reflected in our budgeting as we
14 grapple with these really impossible times? Not of
15 our making but requiring our attention.

16 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, that's a great question,
17 thank you. I think this crisis has caused us as a
18 society and certainly me as an individual to
19 reevaluate many, many parts of what we do every day
20 in our professional lives and our private lives.
21 That's the human side. You know, we quickly learn to
22 think back in March when you couldn't get supplies in
23 a store. There was a day there or a day in a half
24 where we and the PD worried about who are we
25 deploying to stores, because we don't want to run on

1 stores. Because people quickly, unfortunately
2
3 reverted to panic and what could go wrong and I can't
4 get supplies and it's very interesting to me and it's
5 not lost on me how quickly we revert to basic
6 instincts at a terrible time like this.

7 What's the best way to keep people safe? It's
8 not just about the Police Department, certainly there
9 is many things beyond that. I think I'm answering
10 that and agreeing with you on that.

11 Public health is first and foremost. It's the
12 hospitals, it's the doctors, it's the nurses. But I
13 also, I wouldn't get away too much from the Police
14 Department. I think you would agree with that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And I agree with that as
16 well. You know, a hiring freeze is not a cut you
17 know, I mean, it cuts money and headcount over time
18 but we're not coming after existing officers. We
19 want to support them but I do just want to ask one
20 specific question and my time is up. I try to want
21 to squeeze it in. At the March preliminary budget
22 hearing, just as we're looking at every little budget
23 line to find all the savings we can, we asked if you
24 could tell us what the NYPD budget for media and
25 public relations cost was. That seems like something

1 we might have to really reevaluate at that moment. I
2 don't think we got that information, so I just wonder
3 if you have it today or if not if you can provide it.
4 You know, what the budget line is for you know,
5 things that make sense in normal times but maybe
6 don't make as much sense right now and you know, that
7 might not be huge but maybe it saves some youth
8 programs.
9

10 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, and let me just say, do I
11 have a second Chair? Can I expand a little bit?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I'm done, so.

13 DERMOT SHEA: Alright, so I mean, Kristine will
14 answer the question if she has it in a second on the
15 budget. And much of what we've talked about here is
16 building trust and I think it's important. I respect
17 it; I think there is a lot of different healthy
18 opinions on this case. We don't always agree on
19 everything. I think what we have to do is maintain
20 professional and I think we have.

21 The last thing I want to do internally here is
22 surround myself with people that have the exact same
23 opinion as me. I think it's the quickest way to
24 fail. I think you want to surround yourself with the
25 diversity of opinions and I think we have that here.

1
2 And I think we'll take what works and move
3 forward but I worry about, there is plenty of times
4 that the NYPD does things wrong. There is plenty of
5 times that what we do is just, it doesn't look good
6 but we're not wrong and in all of that and sorting
7 that out and dealing with trust and trying to keep
8 the trust of neighborhoods, a couple people have
9 talked about it today in the context of race and I
10 agree. Councilwoman Adams, I agree. I've had
11 personal friends of mine call me up that are friends
12 of the police in the last two weeks and they are
13 deeply troubled by what they saw on TV.

14 And we have taken a hit to our credibility and to
15 everything that we've worked towards in the last
16 couple years. That's what - I mentioned that here
17 because I think it is - I know what you are saying in
18 cutting a budget of DCPI for example, but there is a
19 lot that goes into that too and we have to tell our
20 story and we have to make sure that that story
21 sometimes is, we screwed up and own it but it's also
22 telling the story of well, the tabloid headline isn't
23 quite true.

24 So, Kristine will give you the numbers though.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

1
2 KRISTINE RYAN: The budget for public information
3 in Fiscal Year '21 is \$3.2 million.

4 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, let's go to our next
7 Council Member please.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Gibson
9 followed by Council Member Cohen.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your clock
11 starts now.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay great. Thank you so
13 much. Good afternoon to each and every one of you.
14 Thank you to Chair Danny Dromm and Chair Donovan
15 Richards. Commissioner, to you and the Executive
16 team. I join with all of my colleagues in certainly
17 expressing our condolences and prayers of comfort to
18 all the members of the NYPD who we have lost to the
19 COVID-19 and certainly those who are on the road to
20 recovery. We continue to pray.

21 I think we all acknowledge that COVID-19 has had
22 a profound impact on this city. It is not
23 discriminated from neighborhood to neighborhood, zip
24 code to zip code. But we also acknowledge the
25 disproportionate impact that has been felt in

1 communities of color. This pandemic is a public
2 health crisis and really requires a public health
3 response. It's sad sometimes that with many
4 instances whether it's taking homeless off of our
5 subways or responding with social distance
6 enforcement, healthy spacing. That it always falls
7 on the NYPD.
8

9 So that is why many of us have asked for a
10 collaboration with other agencies like the Department
11 of Health, H&H, like potentially Crisis Management
12 System, anti-gun violence groups. Because we always
13 want to make sure that everything does not have a
14 police laser focus. I think for many of us in our
15 communities, we've been troubled as you have by some
16 of the videos we've seen. I am one of the co-chairs
17 of the woman's caucus, so certainly the video I saw
18 last night, as a woman to see a woman on the ground
19 with her child a few feet away was very disturbing
20 and I know a majority of the interactions over the
21 last few weeks during this pandemic with police have
22 been positive. I've been involved in distributing
23 food and face masks and other things, so I know that
24 we've done a great job and I commend the department
25 for that but I think we all have to denounce when we

1 see these incidents that always ends up with Black
2 and Brown New Yorkers on the ground. It is
3 unacceptable and I certainly ask as you continue to
4 do to denounce it, investigate it because if our
5 people are on the ground in May, I am concerned at
6 what will happen in the summer time. And again, it
7 is not a majority but it is a small population that
8 sometimes come into communities of color with a
9 different mindset and a different approach and that
10 has been problematic of the years.

12 So, this is a budget hearing so I certainly want
13 to echo the sentiments of Chair Donovan Richards
14 because we as a city have to all face the burden of
15 this Fiscal crisis.

16 The NYPD's proposed budget cuts are a mere 1
17 percent compared to an agency like DYCD that's 48
18 percent. The complete elimination of summer youth
19 employment, Summer SONYC, Summer Compass and Summer
20 Camp. We cannot accept a budget where young people
21 have nothing to do this summer, idle on our streets,
22 we are asking the department to work with us as we do
23 other agencies to absorb more savings and more cuts.
24 The civilianization that we always talk about, I want
25 to understand where we are on those numbers. As my

1 first question to see – can we achieve more
2 civilianization with uniform members of the service?
3 Then overtime savings in the past, we've had a goal
4 of \$50 million that we've achieved. Can we take that
5 another step and achieve even more? As my second
6 question on overtime savings and then thirdly, I know
7 it has been talked about, the April Academy class.
8 Is it necessary? Are we going to send a message to
9 young people this summer that the budget that we will
10 pass is reflective of our values but we don't concern
11 ourselves with their summer activities.
12

13 We can't say that policing is more important than
14 young people and their families. There has to be a
15 balance and it cannot be on the backs of families,
16 children, and seniors. And so, we appeal to you as
17 our leader, that we have to have a different
18 conversation. Something has to shift in this city as
19 we prepare for a very long summer. We want
20 interactions with cops to be positive but we in the
21 community of color, we want to be treated just like
22 everyone else is, giving us face masks and talking to
23 us and not these interactions were seeing that
24 sometimes spiral out of control.
25

1
2 So, this public health crisis that we respond to
3 is really going to demonstrate our overall commitment
4 as a city. We want the NYPD like other agencies to
5 step up and say, we care about young people. The
6 Youth Strategies Initiative that you rolled out with
7 the Youth Coordination Officers, we should be working
8 with them during the summer with youth, so they have
9 summer youth employment.

10 So, we want the department to take a larger,
11 savings so that we can save young people and give
12 them the future they need and also our overall
13 priority to breakdown -

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Youth to prison pipeline.
16 So, if you could answer those questions, I'd
17 appreciate it and thank you so much for your work.
18 Thank you.

19 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you Councilwoman Gibson.
20 We've known each other a long time. I appreciate all
21 of your remarks and to the youth question, I think
22 we've touched on it a number of times. I will have
23 Nilda Hofmann and Chauncey follow up. We are
24 thinking the exact same things regarding finding
25 activities. Where can we find outlets if you will

1
2 for the kids this summer. We do have some pretty
3 concrete ideas and I'd love to follow up with you off
4 line on that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.

6 DERMOT SHEA: Regarding – Kristine, if you could
7 jump in a second on civilianization and just where we
8 are regarding the civilianization.

9 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, so Council Member, as you
10 are aware, we have identified 368 positions that if
11 we were to receive civilian headcount, we could
12 civilianize those positions. At this point and time,
13 it has been an ongoing dialogue with OMB but given
14 the difficult situation, in terms of actually getting
15 those resources on the civilian side and additions to
16 our budget on that end, that is – it's temporarily
17 solved right now because of the situation and we want
18 to continue to have those conversations. But we
19 haven't changed in terms of what we think we can do
20 there with the civilian headcount and to bring that
21 onboard.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay great and overtime
23 savings?

24 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, so on overtime, as Chair
25 Richards said in the beginning, it is something that

1 we're continuing to look at and now that we're
2 getting a better sense of what the landscapes going
3 to look like in the coming months, particularly with
4 regard to events. We are looking at that to see if
5 we can identify additional savings there.
6

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay great. Thank you,
8 thank you Chairs.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and
10 before we move to our next Council Member, I just
11 want to say I take umbrage at being labeled as anti-
12 cop. I come from a cop family. My uncle was a
13 Sergeant in the Department. My grandfather was a
14 Lieutenant in the Department and guess where they
15 came from Commissioner? Sunnyside.

16 So, thank you. Alright, let's go to our next
17 Council Member please.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can we please have Council
19 Member Cohen followed by Council Member Louis.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time
21 starts now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Alright, thank you. Thank
23 you Chairs Dromm and Richards. It's good to see you
24 Commissioner.

25 DERMOT SHEA: Good to see you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I do want to just report
3 to you that I have spoken with some regularity to
4 Captain Melendez, Deputy Alps as well as Inspector
5 Hernandez and Chief Blair. So, there has been good
6 communications, so I am grateful for that.

7 I am wondering though, I assume you were advised
8 to bring your crystal ball with you to this hearing
9 because I am concerned as the weather gets better in
10 July and August and September, you know, what you
11 think crime levels are going to be like. What is
12 compliance with social - you know you are in the
13 social distancing business, whether you should be or
14 not, I guess we'll discuss at the next hearing. But
15 you know, we're talking about reduced special events
16 but that doesn't mean that your people are going to
17 go along with the social distancing as the weather
18 gets better.

19 Are you concerned at all about crime levels going
20 up forward and do you think that you know, the
21 staffing levels are appropriate to deal with that?

22 DERMOT SHEA: I never say that we can't get the
23 job done without the resources that we have. We will
24 make do and I have full confidence in the men and
25 women of this Department, I really do.

1
2 So, we will adapt to any situation and get the
3 job done for New Yorkers and New Yorkers should feel
4 confident about that.

5 In terms of crime trends, it is impossible to
6 predict. I mean, for many on this call, I as a 29
7 year professional in the Police Department, I would
8 throw out almost every statistic from March 12th to
9 now. I think that that's how you have to approach
10 this recent events and I don't know to the crystal
11 ball comment exactly what is going to happen. I have
12 concerns; I am paid to have concerns and hopefully,
13 and I do not for the record, fearmonger. I tell it
14 like it is and I tell you what I think and that's my
15 job as well but there is a lot of unknowns. We had a
16 significant crime spike at the beginning of the year.

17 We worked with a lot of people and some people
18 didn't like what I said and I own my words but we
19 worked collaboratively. We sat around a table, we
20 said different opinions from different sides and I
21 think that was helping and there were some changes to
22 the bail law.

23 I don't know how that's going to really play out
24 in the end. I wanted it to go further. I could tell
25 you the people on the defense side didn't want it to

1 go as far. When both sides aren't happy, maybe
2 that's a good thing and maybe it was a good
3 compromise. I don't know but you know, somethings
4 definitely changed and how that changes as we go
5 forward if nothing else changed but the reality is a
6 lot has changed, so we have different Rikers
7 population now, hard decisions have to be made.

9 We have a pandemic where we may not have the
10 exact amount of people on the street. So, we know
11 though that historically starting in May through
12 September, we have higher levels of certainly street
13 violence as people come outdoors in the good weather.

14 I think it's reasonable to expect that. Is it
15 going to go to the normal levels? Part of that is
16 our job to do a good job of keeping crime down safely
17 and not infringing on people's rights. Is it going
18 to go to the normal levels, I don't really know.

19 Right now, it's hard to imagine business as normal.
20 There is no schools open, there is no restaurants
21 open. The trains aren't running to full capacity.

22 But I will also tell you, that there are areas of
23 the city where on a particular night if you went
24 night if you went down it, it's not always on TV or

1 on Twitter but you wouldn't know that there is a
2 pandemic going on.

3
4 We've encountered block parties with a lot of
5 people doing a lot of things that they shouldn't be
6 doing. You didn't hear about it because the NYPD
7 cops of handled it well and diffused it and didn't
8 have to arrest and summons people and we managed it,
9 if you will.

10 But I think that the reality is and I've said
11 this publicly, 8.6 million people in this great city
12 of ours, it's hard to imagine that you know, you are
13 not going to see more people on the streets. We're
14 going to have to manage it and we're going to have to
15 have the realization that we're all going to have to
16 have a little more patience, a little more humanity
17 and empathy. We're dealing with people. The problem
18 is you can train so far, you can deescalate so far,
19 it's not always as easy as it's said and I can't put
20 it any other similar than that but I did a livestream
21 today with my officers reminding them, we have to get
22 through this together. We're made empathetic, we
23 have to deescalate but I think that everyone on this
24 call would agree, it's sometimes not as easy -

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 117

2 DERMOT SHEA: Than it's said.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Commissioner, I appreciate
4 your testimony. Thank you Chairs.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and I just want to
6 remind Council Members that the five minutes includes
7 the questions and the answer because we need to move
8 along here, so thank you. Let's go to our next
9 Council Member please.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Louis followed
11 by Council Member Rosenthal.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
13 start now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Good afternoon everyone.
15 I just want to thank Chairs Dromm and Richards for
16 your leadership today.

17 I echo the sentiments of all of my colleagues.
18 Most of my questions were already answered but it
19 just goes to show and say, we're witnessing the same
20 issues and the same aggressive behavior from police
21 officers even before the pandemic. Now it's just
22 exacerbated. It's blatant and in my opinion, it's
23 criminal, especially with the footage we saw last
24 night with the young lady that was aggressively
25 mishandled and assaulted in a Brooklyn precinct.

1
2 So, we will be responding to that by the way, the
3 woman's caucus. But I have three quick questions
4 because most of my questions are already answered.
5 The first one, we hear this litotic narrative about
6 trainings. I heard the major mention it again this
7 morning but I just wanted to know who exactly are
8 training these officers and have you considered MWBE
9 vendors to train officers and could that be included
10 in the next budget. Have you thought about it in the
11 current budget?

12 My second question is in regards to Safe Horizon
13 and case reps that you may have at your local
14 precincts. How has that been going? Have you funded
15 enough intake reps during COVID and what is that
16 going to look like for the FY21 Budget and what is
17 the increase of funds you are asking for in regards
18 to DV services and organizations. Those are my three
19 basic questions, thank you.

20 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you Councilwoman Louis. I'm
21 going to turn it to Ben Tucker in a minute on the
22 training. I'll address the middle one really quick.
23 I think you mentioned Safe Horizons. The reality of
24 what we faced in the last two months, it wasn't, I'm
25 not mentioning Safe Horizon but we had some

1 situations where vendors just did not want to come
2 into precincts during the pandemic. That's the
3 reality of what we faced for fear of contracting
4 diseases and things of that nature. That's a reality
5 that I think was replicated all over the city and we
6 were not immune to it, so we did have some situations
7 to overcome like that but we remain committed to
8 working with domestic violence victims, sexual
9 assault victims and all victims of crime. That is
10 who we work for every day.
11

12 The last question, you are going to have to
13 remind me about if you could Councilwoman Louis. The
14 training was the first one, then Safe Horizons, what
15 was the last one?

16 Well, who is training your officers and would you
17 consider MWBE vendors?

18 DERMOT SHEA: Okay, I think you had a last point
19 too but Ben, if you could talk about the training
20 that we currently conduct.

21 BEN TUCKER: Sure. Good afternoon again
22 everyone. So, yeah, so about training, we're talking
23 about we have a huge cadre of trainers obviously at
24 the Police Academy. It's a very diverse group but
25 the academy staff is roughly, you know, is very large

1
2 and as you could imagine, we're trying to train both,
3 not just recruits but all of our 19,000 civilians as
4 well as the Department and ongoing services. We've
5 increased the number of training days. As I think
6 you may remember by three, a net increase of three
7 days, so it's up to five days and by the way, we've
8 exceeded that number, tripled that number almost at
9 least 13 days the last time I last count for in
10 service training across the Department.

11 So, a lot of that training happens that way but
12 we bring vendors in and when we do we do follow those
13 MWBE rules and we also reach out to community groups.
14 I mean, part of the training when we're talking
15 about, particularly about trust and particularly
16 about this idea of de-escalation and you know
17 policing community with respect. We bring in for
18 example, officers action alliance group. It helps
19 develop and has developed curriculum for us to use.

20 So, we bring a diverse group to the table. The
21 fair and impartial policing training that we
22 conducted is a minority owned women's firm as well.

23 So, yeah, we do think along those lines in pretty
24 much everything we do with respect to procurement but
25 a lot of our training, if the alliance share is done

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 121

1
2 in house, with the exception of the more formal – the
3 training that takes place when we send our people to
4 – they get scholarships to go back to school either
5 for their masters degrees and others.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I know my time is expired
8 but I still didn't get information about the upcoming
9 budget. How much will be allocated towards DV
10 services? Thank you.

11 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you. Kristine?

12 KRISTINE RYAN: So, for victim services, the
13 existing budget for the convict and advocate contract
14 is \$14 million.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: And will that be through
16 Safe Horizon?

17 KRISTINE RYAN: That is the contract, yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Alright, thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.
20 Let's go to our next Council Member.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Rosenthal
22 followed by Council Member Deutsch.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
24 start now.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, thank you. I
3 want to start by thanking Council Member Richards and
4 Dromm for holding this hearing and for their opening
5 statements as well as from the Public Advocate.

6 You know, I do support the elimination of academy
7 classes from the New York City budget. Not because
8 the image of the NYPD has been tarnished by some
9 officers but because the NYPD is now being asked to
10 do a job that it is not trained or equipped to do.

11 COVID-19 is a brand new thing and unless your
12 officers were around in 1918, how could they or
13 anyone know how to handle this situation? The image
14 of an NYPD on this issue is the one of 40 arrests, 35
15 of whom are Black for not wearing a mask. Wrestling
16 a Black woman from her child in order to fix her
17 mask. Mask enforcement is not going away any time
18 soon.

19 Commissioner, you've been given a task that is
20 more appropriately placed with the Department of
21 Health. What is required when it comes to mask
22 enforcement is a public health education campaign.
23 The Department of Health could easily set up an
24 education corp. Plenty of people are out of work and
25

1 would be happy to do this job and I'm sure there are
2 folks who would volunteer.

3
4 The Department of Health would train them to
5 focus on mask distribution and public health
6 education. The outreach orientation would be very
7 different from what the training is that an NYPD
8 officer gets.

9 This education corp. could distribute
10 information, additional information about where to
11 get food in their community. About mental health
12 services that are available. Their only job would be
13 public health education.

14 Commissioner, do you disagree with me?

15 DERMOT SHEA: I think you raised a lot of very
16 logical points Council Member. I don't disagree with
17 anything that you said. I think everyone is doing
18 the best they can during this time of the pandemic
19 but there are certainly other options available and
20 we'll work with all our parts of the city government
21 to pitch in where we can.

22 I think that your statement was very well thought
23 out. I think that I would have a hard time
24 disagreeing with anything that you said.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Would you be willing
3 to give up this responsibility to let the Mayor know
4 that you are willing and interested in giving up this
5 responsibility to another agency?

6 DERMOT SHEA: We are going to do Councilwoman,
7 anything that we are called upon to do to keep people
8 safe.

9 We're not arresting people for not wearing masks
10 but I do understand there has been a couple bad
11 incidents. Yesterday's evenings incident deeply,
12 deeply troubled me. It really bothered me.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Only the incidents
14 that happened to be caught on video right. So,
15 another thing is given the predicament today and
16 given the fact that summer is coming along and given
17 the experience to date and the current image of the
18 NYPD, would you be willing to pick up the phone, call
19 the Mayor and say, my agency is not equipped to do
20 this work?

21 DERMOT SHEA: I think that's going a little too
22 far on that one.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Why?

24 DERMOT SHEA: Well, I would just say that we are
25 asked to -

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: What about education
3 corps?

4 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, I mean, we are certainly
5 willing to work with many other agencies and we do on
6 a daily basis. You look at what we're doing and what
7 we're asked to do in the transit system in the last
8 couple weeks.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, I'm glad you
10 brought that up. The ratio of five officers to one
11 homeless outreach worker. From my both experience
12 being out on the streets with homeless outreach
13 workers and having talked to them was 180 degrees
14 off.

15 There was no intent of violence from the vast
16 majority of the homeless people. Why wouldn't you as
17 a Commissioner say my officers are not homeless
18 outreach workers.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Why don't we split the
21 ratio to five homeless outreach workers to one PD.
22 And that is why I'm comfortable as a member of the
23 Budget negotiating team to argue for fewer academy
24 classes for the upcoming year.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 126

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We're going to have to move
3 on. Thank you. Okay, we're going to go to our next
4 Council Member for questions.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Deutsch
6 followed by Council Member Barron.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
8 start now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you very much.
10 Good afternoon, good morning. So, first of all, I
11 just want to say you know, we need to be fiscally
12 responsible and I trust your leadership Commissioner
13 and keeping us safe and if you feel that a July class
14 is crucial, I will support you on that.

15 But we must also prepare for our future and do
16 everything possible to utilize all the resources that
17 we currently have and I want to in particular speak
18 about our NYPD auxiliary program who are volunteers
19 and we need to use every resource that we have, that
20 we currently have in order to better understand on
21 what resources we are still missing and it cost the
22 City of New York a \$425 allowance per auxiliary
23 officer, a bullet proof vest and a NYPD and a
24 portable. And during this pandemic, I have seen that
25 the auxiliary officers have been taken off of our

1 streets and I understand why we need to keep them
2 safe. They are volunteers but I also don't
3 understand why we can't utilize them to be proactive
4 and to make phone calls. We have about 40 - I
5 believe 4,300 auxiliary officers in the city and if
6 each volunteer makes five phone calls and the
7 governor called this order on I think it was about
8 50-54 days ago and if a future auxiliary made five
9 phone calls, we would have reached over a million New
10 York City residents.
11

12 And opposed to Police Officers who have to live
13 within the confines of where they live except if you
14 work in Staten Island, they are community people,
15 they are residents of the areas that they patrol.
16 So, they have a better understanding of those areas.
17 I just wanted to make a recommendation if we can
18 utilize the auxiliary officers to do outreach, those
19 volunteers which is not costing our city much money,
20 almost nothing and utilize them to do outreach to the
21 community and be trained by CDC and Department of
22 Health of what they need to tell individuals, who to
23 make phone calls to or they visit later on once this
24 pandemic makes it safe for them.
25

1
2 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you, thank you Councilman,
3 I'm going to ask in a second Chief of Patrol Fausto
4 Pichardo to just talk about the auxiliaries. If
5 Fausto, you could unmute. I spoke about it earlier
6 in decisions I made personally regarding auxiliary
7 force Councilman Deutsch. We've also though, we
8 don't make a decision and forget about it, we're
9 constantly reevaluating. Just this week, we're
10 looking again at the auxiliaries. Is it safe? Is
11 there ways that we could use them? It's a little
12 different than what you were mentioning and I will
13 take that up under consideration but we are, you
14 know, it's a volunteer force that we're now going to
15 reach out to and really ask if any are willing to
16 come in and does that make sense based on the age and
17 preexisting medical conditions and things of that
18 nature. But maybe they are to work within parks or
19 things of that nature.

20 So, Fausto, if you could jump in. I know it's a
21 little early.

22 FAUSTO PICHARDO: Sure Commissioner, Council
23 Member, listen, thank you. I don't think anyone in
24 this Police Department besides the Police

1
2 Commissioner perhaps really has a deep appreciation
3 for the auxiliaries.

4 Being a former auxiliary police officer myself
5 from 1995 to 1997 in the lower east side. So, to the
6 over 4,000 auxiliary members that we currently have
7 and to those that we have tragically lost during this
8 time period, we all know the amount of work and the
9 dedication that they have as volunteers is clearly,
10 clearly unmatched as the largest municipal volunteer
11 program across the nation.

12 And if you look at the auxiliary Twitter account,
13 they are on the frontlines every single day during
14 this pandemic. They are our city bus drivers, they
15 are our doctors, our nurses and I would encourage
16 everyone both near and far to look at that Twitter
17 site, just to see that these folks are such special
18 people. That they come and they commit their time
19 here in the police department, volunteering for a
20 very, very low fee and then they are our frontline
21 first responders in their every day jobs. Teachers,
22 doctors, lawyers, so I can't thank them enough and we
23 had them out because it was critical that we looked
24 in line with the CDC guidelines, looked at our work

1 force, our volunteer workforce and we're certainly
2 exploring more ways to get them back on the street.
3

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

5 FAUSTO PICHARDO: I know first-hand how dedicated
6 they are and they've been asking since this started,
7 what they can do to come back to work and help us
8 out.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I just want to make one
10 last recommendation. So, in addition, I understand
11 that they cannot be outside as of now but if they can
12 make phone calls and given a script and be trained by
13 CDC and DOH, if they could reach out and make phone
14 calls, it's not difficult to get people's phone
15 numbers. Any person running for office could get
16 almost every single phone number out there number
17 one.

18 And number two, is that my colleagues are
19 mentioning about the youth during the summer months.
20 So, in order to be an auxiliary, you have to be 17-
21 years-old. If we could lower that to 16 and use
22 those young adults to be part of the auxiliary
23 program and recruit them, you know, we have you know,
24 the auxiliary program here in New York City is really
25 amazing but we need to use them now more than ever.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 131

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Deutsch, we
3 have to move on. We need to move on, so finish up
4 please.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, I'm trying. So, I
6 think this is important. One is to help our young
7 leaders and number two, we will use their resources
8 to reach out and educate people and to be more
9 proactive and to having the officers go in and try to
10 deescalate situations when, if we could do education
11 and be proactive.

12 But thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you Council
14 Member. Alright, next Council Member please.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Barron
16 followed by Council Member Vallone.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
18 start now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Chairs Dromm
20 and Richards, I want to thank you and I want to
21 support your statements that you have made and
22 presumptively, support Public Advocate Williams
23 statements, which I believe he would have made and
24 Ampry-Samuel for the comments that she made.

1
2 I want to thank the Commissioner and his staff
3 for being here and appearing before us, so that we
4 can have this opportunity to present questions.

5 Earlier in his remarks, the Commissioner said
6 that the NYPD has been consistent. And I agree, they
7 have been consistent in demonstrating the racial
8 disparity that results in the unequal enforcement as
9 it pertains to Black and Brown communities and the
10 negative impact that it has.

11 I also want to associate myself with those who
12 have said that we need to eliminate the academy class
13 that's coming up. I don't think that the training
14 that's going on there in that academy has seen any
15 significant change in how officers interact in our
16 communities.

17 In 2018, it was earlier said, one of my
18 colleagues pointed out that the Commissioner who was
19 at that time the Chief of Crime Control came before
20 the hearing and it was at that time that he said that
21 he did not believe that NYPD treats Black and Brown
22 communities any differently than they treat White
23 communities and in subsequent hearings when I asked
24 him about that, he has never said that he has had a
25 change in that understanding.

1
2 I want to say that we are looking at Stop and
3 Frisk 2.0. We're looking at again, Black and Brown
4 people being denied their constitutional rights and
5 being the targets of police summonsing's and arrests.

6 At the funeral for the [INAUDIBLE 2:37:19] two
7 weeks ago, large numbers of people gathered and were
8 accommodated and deferred to by the police. This
9 week, in Williamsburg again, large numbers of people
10 gathered and were not arrested, even though they were
11 not obeying the rules for social distancing.

12 Two weeks ago, there was a person that we all saw
13 via video that was accosted by the police and a
14 chokehold put basically on his neck by the officers
15 knee and the outcry was tremendous but yet still
16 later we still see more incidences of police
17 particularly in my - and an incident last week at the
18 75 when an officer attacked a young man, put him to
19 the ground and antagonized, not only did not try to
20 deescalate but antagonized other people who were
21 there watching what was going on.

22 So, we see that there has not been a significant
23 change, even though officers are wearing cameras,
24 they continue to engage in negative ways in our
25 communities that are Black and Brown and I think that

1 they do it because there are no appropriate
2 consequences for their actions. They get a slap on
3 the wrist, they lose vacation days, but there is no
4 clear message that says hey, don't do this.
5

6 Yes, the Mayor said, that the videos do not
7 reflect the values but in actuality, they reflect the
8 practices that are in place.

9 So, to my colleagues, I just want to say, we're
10 asking the Police Department to tell us how they can
11 reduce their budget and their talking about all of
12 the reasons that they need, the amounts that they
13 need for their programming and I say to my
14 colleagues, we have the ability to make the changes
15 and to make sure that the budget reflects how we want
16 to see the money that is split. How we want to make
17 sure that our children are given opportunities during
18 the summer. We have that ability and one more
19 incident that I want to site was the most recent
20 incident where the woman in the train station was
21 arrested because she wasn't wearing her mask
22 properly. In front of her child, similarly what
23 happened to Jazmine Headley.

24 So, to my colleagues I say, we have the ability
25 to make sure that what we want to see that reflects

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 135

the values in our community reflected in the budget.

Thank you Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council Member,
next Council Member please.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Counsel Member Vallone
followed by Council Member Miller please.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
start now.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you very much and
Chair Danny Dromm, make sure you know that no one
will ever question your leadership in these times and
how you handle every finance budget hearing. So,
cheers to you and everything you do. If anyone comes
after you, I got your back any time.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Thank you very
much.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So, Chair the NYPD and
every officer and every first line member that is
keeping us safe, I don't think I've heard it too much
today but let me say thank you, thank you, thank you.

We are in a pandemic crisis that we have never
seen before and hopefully never see again. There are
no guidelines, there are no rules, there is nothing
but you. We stay at home safe trying to do our part

1 but you are called to go out on the streets and be
2 criticized by everyone who thinks they can do it
3 better. When a president and a governor and a Mayor
4 are all requiring every person to abide by social
5 distancing and take care of themselves. And again,
6 we put the task on you to try to do that. It wasn't
7 even where I want to go on this hearing because we're
8 talking about budget and how to plan for the safety
9 of the city through a budget in these financial times
10 who led a public health announcement on the subway
11 and the radio make due and see how that happens and
12 let the NYPD go back to keeping us safe.

14 And when the governor and the Mayor have screens
15 that social distancing is not being kept in line,
16 let's stay out of it because everyone else is asking
17 you to, so let's stay on the focus of keeping us
18 safe.

19 To the Commissioner, would you say the NYPD is
20 facing more challenges today or less?

21 DERMOT SHEA: There is rarely a dull day, is that
22 an answer? Listen, this pandemic is — with the
23 pandemic, it's certainly more you know, but again,
24 you've had the opportunity to talk to Ben Tucker
25 today, Eddie Delatorre, Fausto, Rodney Harrison,

1
2 Terry Monahan's there somewhere, Kristine Ryan, many
3 others. I mean, they are the finest that New York
4 City has to offer and they represent an incredible
5 executive team -

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [INAUDIBLE 2:42:28]

7 questions and me just saying, do you think that more
8 demands on the NYPD shouldn't be one you have to
9 struggle with? I'll answer that one for you and say
10 yes. I do believe there are more demands.

11 Do you think that the mental, the health and the
12 physical stress of the officers today are higher than
13 they were before the pandemic?

14 DERMOT SHEA: Absolutely.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: You know, that's what's
16 being lost here today and if we're talking about
17 numbers and budget and the demands are higher and
18 dealing with the risks of their lives being addressed
19 every day without having the proper equipment and
20 yet, we're trying to stay safe. I believe that if we
21 put that great a demand on our officers and to
22 attrition and retirement and those officers who go
23 out on disability, if we do not have an academy
24 class, we are going to put this city at risk at not
25

1 being at the ability to go through unknown times
2 together.

3
4 If we think public health announcements are what
5 the city and I guess, my constituents are asking me
6 for, then let me put it on the record, we're dead
7 wrong. That is not what my district and anyone who
8 has ever called me has asked for. They are asking,
9 I'm scared and is the NYPD there and they are.

10 So, we need to assist you in going forward
11 through this crisis and then maybe after some months
12 go by, not two months, some time goes by to figure an
13 analysis on where we are with recidivism and crime
14 stats that Danny Dromm would like to have. We'd all
15 like to have and what the impact of emptying our
16 jails has been on our system and are they the same
17 people or is it different people? Who is committing
18 these crimes? How do we best deal with homeless and
19 the trains? How do we best deal with social
20 distancing? That will have to be dealt with but
21 right now, in the middle of a crisis, the NYPD and
22 our first responders need to be there.

23 So, can you - and my last point will be, on an
24 average year, how many officers do we lose. So, when
25 our Chairs Donovan Richards and Danny Dromm, how many

1 officers do we lose through attrition and retirement
2 to disability every year on an average? Not the
3 exact number but is it 10,000 20,000?
4

5 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, on the average I'm going to
6 say it's about 2,000 but Marty Morales, our Chief of
7 Personnel. Marty are you there on mute? Is that
8 about right Marty about 2,000?

9 MARTIN MORALES: So, right now this year we have
10 827 year-to-date. Last year, yes, it was about
11 2,200. The year before that was about 1,800.

12 It's about 5 to 6 percent of our workforce that
13 we lose through attrition.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And did the academy
15 class size reflect the replacement of that number or
16 does it shift year to year?

17 MARTIN MORALES: The academy class hires do -

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

19 MARTIN MORALES: Catch up with the attrition.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Okay, so if we were to
21 cancel - if we were to cancel a delay, this academy
22 class, what would that do to our numbers of officers?

23 DERMOT SHEA: That is exactly is the fear. It's
24 going to drop our numbers and I think it's you know,
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 140

1
2 about 1,200 cops less and it's going to force us to
3 make decisions on where those cops come from.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you Commissioner.

5 DERMOT SHEA: We'll get pulled from something
6 else.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Council Member
8 Vallone and we'll go to our next Council Member.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Miller
10 followed by Council Member Grodenchik.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
12 start now.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank you so much
14 Chair Dromm for your leadership, Chair Richards. I
15 very much appreciate it. Good afternoon Commissioner
16 to you and your team.

17 I want to in sync in the messaging because there
18 has been a lot of things said but ask the Co-Chair of
19 the Black Latino and Asian caucus, I want to echo the
20 sentiments of the members that have come before and
21 the conversations that we have been having about
22 unilaterally opposing any budget that continues with
23 the current one percent cut from the Police
24 Department, which continues to perpetuate the
25

1 inequities that we are seeing throughout the city and
2 that's been an issue.

3
4 Let me just say that also about the policies and
5 procedures that have been advocated – spoken about
6 this morning by the Public Advocate. The Chair of
7 Public Safety and others and some of the disparities
8 that we have seen while they are not specific budget
9 items, certainly, it is not mutually exclusive to the
10 budget because if you look at policies and you look
11 at budget, it will tell you about individuals. It
12 will tell you about agencies and it will tell you
13 about institutions and therein lays the conversation
14 that we have been having today that we think that by
15 virtue of COVID, what we've seen has been certain
16 disparities within communities of color and that
17 remains relevant.

18 But I do want to talk about the budget as we move
19 forward. There has been a lot of talk about the
20 workforce. There has been a lot of talk about the
21 next class and attrition and so forth. I think that
22 unless we are seeing from the Police Department as we
23 have seen in other agencies, really line by line
24 budget items and more transparency about the services
25

1 that are getting delivered and potentially services
2 that are being cut.

3
4 The conversation is disingenuous at best. When
5 we start talking about how many officers are being
6 needed and that we will see a catastrophic difference
7 in services and how did it get delivered and how the
8 city would suffer, we don't know that because we
9 don't know if each and every one of these members
10 under the budget of the Police Department, what are
11 the tasks are they performing or their
12 civilianization. Other things that could be done,
13 because certainly from an HR perspective, I know that
14 the citywide administrative services and every agency
15 within its scope are now assessing and evaluating
16 based on COVID-19 the work from home mode. Not just
17 the human capital but the brick and mortar's as well.

18 So, as the city changes on how they deliver
19 services, does the Police Department intend to remain
20 the same and are they continuing to evaluate how
21 services get delivered.

22 And as I said, if we could talk about line by
23 line because when we start talking about what the
24 actual costs of overtime and what the actual cost of
25 the next class would be, we're out saying whether or

1 not it is specific to the postponement of some of the
2 large activities that are happening. And/or is it
3 attributed to Police Officers doing work outside of
4 their prescribed task and title? And/or what does
5 that look like and the actual cost of having a class.
6 We have to do this to mitigate the overtime but then
7 we have to balance that with the actual cost of the
8 training, the fringe benefits, and all the things
9 that go along with that.
10

11 And so, we need to see more transparency and not
12 to say that there has to be a replacement through
13 attrition number by number. As was mentioned earlier
14 as well, as we've seen the reduction in the number of
15 inmates in Rikers Island and crime and agencies just
16 in general. It appears that the Police Department
17 has maintained this philosophy in its numbers in that
18 way. And I'm simply saying that I would like to see
19 transparency in a line by line fashion that addresses
20 the need to have this.

21 But right now, we are unilaterally opposed to a
22 one percent cut because this is COVID-19. It is
23 certainly a public safety issue that we cannot police
24 our way out of. As in the youth services that are in
25

1 the budget that can be delivered by DYCD, other
2 agencies that have historically provided those –

3
4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Those services. Do you
6 want to speak specifically about those budget items
7 line by line?

8 DERMOT SHEA: Are we going over the five minutes?
9 I'm getting confronting reports here.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, this is Chair
11 Dromm. I know that you have a hard – you have to
12 leave at about 1:00, so would somebody be able to
13 stay? Are you able to go over a little bit or let me
14 know.

15 DERMOT SHEA: Yeah, Kristine can do the best she
16 can. I mean that's a pretty detailed task.
17 Kristine, can you got on?

18 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, so I mean, I think with
19 regard to the transparency within the budget, I think
20 I just want to remind everyone that [INAUDIBLE
21 2:51:43]. We have the budget function analysis which
22 provides information on how resources are distributed
23 among different plans and areas. And from a budget
24 perspective and I know that documents get maybe a
25 little to budgety but there is over 1,000 budget

1
2 codes that provide different information on funding
3 for different programs and areas.

4 So, in terms of what's lined out in the budget,
5 there is a significant amount of detail. I think
6 with regard to the broader programmatic questions,
7 that's a broader conversation but the line item, the
8 detailing of the specific items, you know, we can
9 work with you on those but there's a lot of
10 granularity actually in the budget.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. Thank you
12 Council Member. Commissioner, do you need to leave?
13 If not, can somebody - I mean, if you do, can
14 somebody stay?

15 DERMOT SHEA: Let's go five minutes and I was
16 budgeted to 12, I pushed off a couple things but
17 let's get, if there is one or two, that you will
18 finish up with and I'll keep some of my staff here.

19 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Come Commissioner, you can
20 stay an extra half an hour. Where you got to go?
21 No, you didn't, you budgeted to one. Half an hour.

22 DERMOT SHEA: It's budgeted for money and not
23 time.

24 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: A half an hour, where do
25 you got to go?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 146

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, let's move quickly
3 and let me remind Council Members to please ask
4 questions and hold the statements. Let's move on.
5 Let's Council Member please.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Grodenchik
7 followed by Council Member Cabrera please.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time will
9 start now.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: And for all the work
11 that your department does. I just want to ask this
12 question. You know, how much money do you spend to
13 prepare a class? I know that you do extensive
14 background and all that kind of stuff. What does
15 that cost the city before these young people even
16 enter the department?

17 DERMOT SHEA: Hey Marty or Kristine, if you would
18 like to - that's a good a question. Marty, can you
19 just detail some of the applicant investigation and
20 steps and Kristine, you can -

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I just need a quick
22 answer. Is it a million, is it five, is it, I know -

23 MARTIN MORALES: I could go through the process
24 but I don't have a dollar amount of what it costs.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: If you could get back
3 to me Chief Morales, I would appreciate that. Good
4 to see you as always. Good to see you from the hood.

5 Secondly, with relation to the class that is set
6 to go forward, at least right now. You know, my wife
7 is upstairs teaching. My son is allegedly studying
8 to graduate Queens College in his room and I am here
9 and none of us are going out really.

10 So, the question is and most, you know, many
11 universities have announced that they're not going to
12 be doing in class work. They are going to be doing
13 remote. Are you planning on training the next class
14 of Police Officers remotely or how are you going to
15 do that safely?

16 DERMOT SHEA: We've certainly talked about it. I
17 see Ben Tucker jumping up there.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: No one else has asked
19 that question.

20 DERMOT SHEA: But there are pieces of it where
21 logistically, it is simply, you know, as part of our
22 academy class, you are talking about firearms
23 instruction.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yeah, I understand
25 that, yeah.

DERMOT SHEA: You got [INAUDIBLE 2:55:17]
driving. There is a lot of hands on but we're
certainly exploring it. Ben, can you talk about it
for a sec?

BEN TUCKER: Sure, I mean I've been having this
conversation with Chief Shortell and her team and
it's a heavy lift but there absolutely does - it's
going to be a challenge to be cognizant of the social
distancing. No question about that but we worked out
a plan. If we get the full \$1,163 recruits coming
in, that will amount to somewhere around 30 companies
with about roughly 30 to 31 students per class.

And then we've got some large classrooms where we
would have - they see 111 students but we have only
roughly 9 or 10 of those. So, we'll have some
challenges but the truth is, I think when we think
about the class, you know, we're talking about
hiring, we are bringing new people in who have passed
the physical exam and are healthy. We will be
certainly strictly adhering to wearing gloves and
masks throughout the training.

We clean the classrooms frequently. We will be
doing that. Doing all the things that we know are

1 important to minimize the spread to the extent that
2 there are problem.
3

4 We had only about four people in the last class
5 that went out sick. One tested positive but the
6 numbers weren't very high and of course, we were
7 still conducting training.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you
9 Commissioner. I just want to say one last thing. I
10 appreciate that answer and I know how hard you are
11 going to work to keep people safe. I just want to
12 thank Commissioner Shea for speaking up for crime
13 victims. My first boss had worked at the Crime
14 Victims Board, Nettie Mayersohn and I don't think
15 that we as a society put enough on talking about
16 that.

17 Probably many of us who are on this conversation
18 have been crime victims. I have, I have burglarized,
19 I lost a car many years ago and I want to thank the
20 NYPD for their work and many times, they are
21 necessary because we collectively as a society have
22 not come to grips with issues that we really need to
23 come to grips with. And so, I thank them and I wish
24 you all well and look forward to working with my
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 150

1 local Commanders every day. Thank you, thank you
2
3 Chairs.

4 BEN TUCKER: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and we'll go to our
6 next Council Member.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Cabrera
8 followed by Council Member Ayala. Thank you.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time
10 starts now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you to the Chair
12 and Commissioner. Thank you for foregoing your
13 intro. I know we didn't get to the questions of the
14 Council Members for an hour and a half, so if it
15 wasn't for that, you wouldn't get to some of us here.
16 I find it - first of all, I appreciate Council Member
17 Dromm's question for the data. If you could get that
18 data regarding to forum to see any correlation
19 regarding bail reform and the spike that came in
20 January.

21 But let me just say this, the fact is regardless
22 of the reason, we saw a spike. I would love to find
23 out what was the spike but there was definitely a
24 spike that took place. We see three of the four
25 categories of the highest crimes that went up. That

1 concerns me and the only category that didn't go up
2 is because people are really not in the streets and
3 they are not being assaulted as much for \$1,000 or
4 more.
5

6 And so, I am very concerned that just a few years
7 ago, everyone who is in the Council right now, plus
8 the Mayor. The Mayor give us some resistance to add
9 1,200 police officer and it just, it seems odd to me
10 that now we're saying let's get rid of police
11 officers. Why was it necessary then and not
12 necessary now?

13 And let me just get — let me just present
14 something here with a question. And that is, summer
15 is coming. People are not going to wear their masks.
16 As it is right now, it is very hot. Even in
17 countries where they went down the curve, it was
18 during the winter time.

19 I am just concerned about the dynamics that
20 aren't going to be in place. Have you thought about
21 what will be the next step and even for police
22 officers wearing a mask. What is it going to entail?
23 I mean, somebody is super-hot and dealing with heat
24 stroke versus wearing a mask and same thing with
25 Police Officers who have to walk to be in the sun,

1
2 what is it going to look like? So, I appreciate if
3 you could help me with that.

4 I'm all for the Cure Violence myself and Public
5 Advocate Jumaane Williams we got it through so many
6 years ago. It is my hope that we keep funding it but
7 the thing that strikes me is that there are other
8 agency, other departments who have no cuts whatsoever
9 but we are talking about balancing the back of the
10 NYPD. Yes, there should be cuts but you are not all
11 we know and at the end of the day to be honest with
12 you, you are not the Mayor.

13 It is really a negotiation that's taking place
14 between the Council and the Mayor but I'm very
15 concerned in my district. We just got a report this
16 morning. People are breaking in, into stores because
17 the owners are not inside. Their breaking into many
18 stores, they know they are vacant. No one is manning
19 the house and the last thing, let me just say this,
20 and that is that you should have never even been put
21 in a position to have to even ask for masks.

22 This should have been already in the plan given
23 to you. I saw Police Officers early on that told me,
24 I can't get a hold of a mask. And so, can you answer
25 that question regarding this summer and also the

1 attrition which we are in part to be – it looks like
2 2,000 of them. What can a direct impact that would
3 have upon crime reduction?
4

5 DERMOT SHEA: So, I think I've said it a bunch of
6 different ways. Thank you for the statement and the
7 question. I think clearly that I'm concerned about
8 that academy class and the impact it would have and
9 you have a finite number of resources. Everyone has
10 different opinions of how the money should be spent
11 or where the resources should go but we have a finite
12 budget and any impact on it, the bottom line is, it
13 will have to come from somewhere else if those cuts
14 are made.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, that 1,200 officers
16 that you receive, do you believe that that made a
17 significant difference?

18 DERMOT SHEA: Yes, I absolutely do and I thank
19 you for that effort, the whole Council, and the
20 Mayor. I mean, that was a decision a couple years
21 ago, that it really gave us a shot in the arm. More
22 money, more resources and we've had some of the best
23 crime years that we've ever seen in New York City
24 with the lowest arrests [INAUDIBLE 3:03:38].

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

1
2 DERMOT SHEA: And let me just say, you know, you
3 look at the last couple years in New York City and
4 what has been put on the NYPD and we're not asking
5 for it but we're certainly rising to take the
6 challenge and whether it's opiates and overdoses,
7 whether it's homelessness, whether it's working with
8 the mentally ill. And people have made the argument,
9 maybe it shouldn't be the police and maybe it
10 shouldn't but we are here to do what we can for New
11 Yorkers and whether it's Fausto's people, Terry
12 Monahan's people, Rodney's people, I think there's a
13 reason why eventually and it falls to the police
14 because people have confidence in the police. Maybe
15 we're not the best agency to deal with it all but we
16 certainly give it the best effort.

17 Terry Monahan, are you unmuted? Do you want to
18 just talk about what you think this summer is
19 bringing and wearing masks and some of the obstacles?

20 TERRY MONAHAN: I'm on now. I just got unmuted.

21 And again, let me go back to those 1,200 Police
22 Officers Councilman Cabrera. Remember, that was
23 neighborhood policing. That was given so that we can
24 give our cops more time out on the streets to get to
25 know the people. Time away from 911.

1
2 If we step back and lose that opportunity for our
3 cop to get out of their radio car and interact with
4 the community, that sets us right back to where we
5 were pre-2014 when we introduced neighborhood
6 policing and I don't think any of us, I know I don't
7 and I guarantee every Councilman doesn't want to go
8 back to what we saw in 2014.

9 As we go forward to this summer, listen, it's
10 going to be a hot summer, it always is. We have more
11 responsibilities on us going into this summer than
12 we've ever had before in my 39 years of policing that
13 we are facing whatever is going to happen out on the
14 beaches. Whether they are going to be open, whether
15 they are going to be closed. Whether the parks are
16 going to be open or closed. How long are the subways
17 going to be closed?

18 The responsibilities that are on the Police
19 Department as crime starts to tick up, going into the
20 summer and all you have to do is take a look at the
21 violence because I feel that's truly the bellwether
22 of all crime in this city, is the amount of people
23 getting shot. That hasn't gone down during the
24 pandemic and it's going up right now.

1
2 It's going up extremely problematic as we look at
3 different gangs that are out there shooting one
4 another. This is something that we are going to be
5 facing going forward as the summer comes and if we
6 don't have cops to preplace it and we start going
7 back into that slide, especially if there is an
8 economic downturn, you know, we know if any one's
9 been around.

10 I've been around a long time. What it was like
11 in the 70's during an economic downturn. The
12 violence that started to come out, you need the
13 police out there to keep it tampered down.
14 Otherwise, we could really have this city going in
15 the wrong direction.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much.
17 Thank you to the Chairs.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Council
19 Member Barron did want to me to clarify for the
20 record that she did not vote for the additional
21 police officers.

22 We will move to our next Council Member.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, time starts -
24
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 157

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I apologize, can we please
3 have Council Member Ayala followed by Council Member
4 Menchaca.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. Thank you
7 Commissioner. Thank you Mr. Chair. I just want to
8 reiterate what my colleagues have said and I just
9 want to be on record as saying that I also do not
10 condone the unnecessary use of force in recent
11 arrests that we have seen play out on social media,
12 but I wanted to recognize the hard work of our local
13 police precincts.

14 I have actually been working hand and hand with
15 my precincts and I have seen how diligently you know,
16 they work to address food insecurity in our community
17 that had police officers you know, serving meals to
18 our most vulnerable citizens and I am you know,
19 eternally grateful to them for that and I want to
20 recognize that.

21 I also - well, actually, in the interest of time
22 because I know we have a lot of members, I did want
23 to go straight into questioning. Obviously, I am
24 really concerned about mental health issues and the
25 mental health uniform civilian personnel who may be

1 working overtime in these trying circumstances. So,
2 can you provide us a total budget for the mental
3 health at NYPD and explain whether it has changed
4 over the few months or the last year and secondly, on
5 opioid enforcement, can you tell us if the department
6 has seen an increase or a decrease in overdose deaths
7 and is there more activity related to opioids
8 occurring in parks now?
9

10 And third and last question, approximately 30
11 million was added last year AVA renovations at select
12 precincts. Will those renovations be moving forward?

13 DERMOT SHEA: So, I'll start at the end with the
14 overdose deaths. The Department of Health is the
15 agency that releases the final counts. It's usually
16 released you know, several times a year in terms of
17 the confirmed unintended overdoses. I think some of
18 the sad news is that you know, we've seen that spike
19 in recent years with the introduction of fentanyl. I
20 don't know that there has been a negligible decrease.
21 It may have fluctuated a little bit but I think
22 unfortunately that that level but the Department of
23 Health would probably be better to answer that
24 question.
25

1 I believe it's unfortunately still at all too
2 high of levels on the unintentional overdose deaths.
3 Are we seeing an increase in usage in parks?
4

5 I don't know that we - well, actually, I have
6 received a number of complaints but it's more
7 anecdotal. I've received a number from different
8 parts of the city about drug use. This is another
9 one of those categories that I certainly don't have
10 the answer for.

11 I know that myself, Mike Lipetri, I've had this
12 conversation with Terry Monahan, Ben Tucker, and many
13 others, Rodney Harrison. You know, everyone agrees
14 that we don't want to send people low level, to jail
15 for the low levels of drugs and we're balancing
16 public safety and we're trying to balance a low
17 prison population, which I think in this regard is a
18 good thing. But policing on this one, low level
19 drugs, arresting people, putting them in jail is not
20 going to be the answer. I don't believe but nobody
21 has really outside of the treatment which sometimes
22 takes long periods of time and it's kind of like the
23 homeless, all free service, all free treatment
24 offering and hopefully people get stuck on the
25 treatment and get their way out of that terrible,

1
2 terrible situation. But in terms of public use, I
3 have heard a lot of complaints. I don't have data in
4 front of me in terms of - I think we're pretty
5 consistent on the level of complaints about selling
6 that we get. I don't think there is huge
7 fluctuations in the usage of drugs. It discriminates
8 against no one. It hits every facet of life and
9 sometimes it goes behind closed doors a little more,
10 sometimes it comes out in the open but I think that
11 drugs is just a terrible discouragement that still we
12 have to as a society push back on.

13 Kristine, on the issue of mental health, I think
14 that you are referring to how much money we spend on
15 mental health for our employees, is that right?

16 So, Kristine, can you touch on that in terms of
17 counselors and things of that nature?

18 KRISTINE RYAN: Yeah, so, I'll have to get back
19 to you on the exact funding for the resources but
20 there are 37 uniform personnel and 6 civilians in the
21 health and wellness section of the department. We
22 also have the new, working with New York Presbyterian
23 for finest care and the cost for that is about a
24 million and two and we have also been working to
25 bring on some more psychologists within the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 161

1
2 department. But we can get you the exact budget
3 breakdown after this.

4 DERMOT SHEA: I don't know if Ben Tucker -

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we have a few more
7 Council Members, let's try to be synced in our
8 questions and in our answers and we'll go to the next
9 Council Member please.

10 We're going to go to three minute for each
11 Council Member because I have another hearing
12 starting at 1:30. Thank you.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can we please have Council
14 Members Menchaca followed by Gjonaj and Cumbo.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chairs.
16 Commissioner, how many officers are currently on
17 modified duty and/or have pending disciplinary
18 charges.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time started.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Based on allegations of
21 police abuse, brutality abuse or of authority or
22 killing of a civilian and how much does this
23 represent in personnel costs for the FY21 Budget?
24
25

1
2 DERMOT SHEA: So, either Ben or Marty, if you
3 could touch different aspect of that and we'll finish
4 with Kristine in terms of cost.

5 BEN TUCKER: Okay.

6 DERMOT SHEA: Ben, you can give an overview on
7 the discipline piece if you have it.

8 BEN TUCKER: Alright.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And as you're getting
10 that -

11 BEN TUCKER: So -

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, go ahead.

13 BEN TUCKER: So, in terms of discipline, as you
14 know, we took a hard look at this with the blue
15 ribbon battle some time ago and so, we've moved into
16 a whole different space now with respect to the way
17 in which the system operates. We tried to make it
18 more efficient. The panel made 13 separate
19 recommendations touching on discipline broadly -

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Because my time is
21 limited, a simple answer about numbers. Can you give
22 us a number?

23 BEN TUCKER: Number for?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, how many people
25 are on modified duty.

1
2 BEN TUCKER: Give me a second, yeah.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, so let's wait for
4 that. There are two questions that are coming from
5 youth in the neighborhood. One of them is, what
6 should citizens in rent neighbors do if they see an
7 officer without masks? What are the consequences and
8 can our neighborhood document that and bring it to
9 you?

10 And Chair, I want to make sure we get the answer
11 to the first question because you are cutting time
12 already for us. So, I just want to make sure we get
13 that.

14 And then, while you go through your papers -

15 DERMOT SHEA: And Marty, do you have it, modified
16 numbers?

17 MARTIN MORALES: Yes, we currently have 220
18 members out on modified assignment.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And what's that cost on
20 the 21 budget?

21 MARTIN MORALES: Well, modified assignments are
22 still getting paid. They suspended 15.

23 DERMOT SHEA: So, when you talk about somebody on
24 modified assignment, it could be for a variety of
25 reasons. They will be getting paid but then to

1 naturally assume that was is the cost, while the cost
2 is still put to work. So, they are just
3 repositioned. They could be watching video cameras;
4 they could be answering phones. They could be doing
5 a lot of different things.
6

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, Commissioner, I'm
8 going to pause you there. I'm going to give you one
9 equation from the youth that have come in.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: The NYC minus SYEP in
12 the arts plus more cops, does not equal public safety
13 and if you could comment on how that makes you feel
14 in terms of responding to the youth.

15 DERMOT SHEA: Honestly, I didn't follow what you
16 even said.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, the equation from
18 the youth -

19 DERMOT SHEA: What does it stand for?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: New York City as a
21 whole minus SYEP and the arts, which is what the
22 budget cuts have represented, plus more officers does
23 not equal public safety. And this is what young
24 people are telling us right now as we talked to them
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 165

1 about the budget. How can you respond to them as
2 they understand it through this math equation?
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We're going to have to move
5 to the next Council Member.

6 Commissioner, do you want to just respond to that
7 and then we need to move to the next Council Member.

8 DERMOT SHEA: I think it's a very good debate and
9 I think I love the fact that the youth are involved
10 in this type of engagement and civic responsibility.
11 I think it's a great sign for the future.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can we please have Council
13 Member Gjonaj followed by Council Members Cumbo and
14 Treyger.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you. Thank you
17 Chairs, thank you Commissioner and your entire team.
18 Let me always begin as we should by thanking all of
19 our first responders, our healthcare workers, and our
20 essential employees for all the work that they are
21 doing and for risking themselves to protect and
22 serve.

23 With that, I will go straight to the questions.
24 Headcounts, I've asked this before, citywide by
25 precinct. We use a formula based on the number of

1 crimes that are reported. I have two precincts, the
2 45 and the 49. 45 is the second largest geographic
3 precinct in the city, which is very challenging
4 including Pelham Bay Park which includes Orchard
5 Beach and Co-op City.
6

7 The second problem, the 49 precinct was the
8 hardest hit precinct citywide. They had more COVID
9 cases and law enforcement officers out than any other
10 precinct in the city.

11 I want to make sure that our headcounts have made
12 up for the loss that we had issues with prior to this
13 crisis. I'm still waiting for information on how we
14 decide the number of officers that are assigned to a
15 precinct and specifically those that are out there on
16 the streets. So, aside from the administrative
17 responsibilities, how many patrols and officers.

18 I still have major issues with rampant
19 motorcycles. Popping wheelies, one way streets,
20 taking over intersections, and I know there is a
21 citywide problem. I offered a solution that perhaps
22 we could offer rewards for anyone that releases any
23 information of where these bikes are parked so we
24 could seize these illegal dirt bikes and four
25 wheelers that are all over the place.

1
2 Thirdly, because traffic agents and their budget
3 are being cut. This is going to put more
4 responsibility on NYPD, and that's you Commissioner.
5 In particular, I mention this because of Pelham Bay
6 Park, Orchard Beach and City Island, which is a
7 destination place and eventually will be open is
8 going to need the additional law enforcement for
9 crowd control, for traffic and so on and so forth.

10 Social distancing, I think the success is great
11 what is happening with the trains. I see now though
12 the homeless are moving into our parks. So, they are
13 being shifted from trains and from buses into our
14 parks and if this is to protect the homeless and
15 those that they interact with, we need more
16 enforcement and perhaps taking a same approach as we
17 did with the MTA, where we shut down parks. Anyone
18 that is in there will be escorted out of the park and
19 not turning a blind eye, which means they are going
20 to need more resources.

21 So, with that if you can answer the questions,
22 I'm done. Thank you Chairs, thank you Commissioner
23 and team.

DERMOT SHEA: Thank you. Thank you for the
questions. Fausto, just get ready on the motorcycles
and I'll turn to you in a second.

We're at a budget hearing and we're a budget
hearing and we're answering a lot of tough questions
about how to make fiscally responsible decisions for
the city and we're talking about cutting cops but the
irony is not lost. I mean, here we are and it's the
same thing I hear in every community meeting, even
though it's been two months since I've been in a
community meeting.

The ask is usually the same. We want more cops
in our communities because they are doing a good job.
The 45 is a tough one, any command we look at
citywide, it's a formula of you know, how many calls
per service. What is the traffic, what is the
density? How much crime is there. We look at a
historical look and we have an office of Management,
Analysis, and Planning that makes tough decisions.
You are making tough decisions today and forcing us
to make tough decisions and then internally, we do
the same thing and where do we put our resources.

I can tell you that before this pandemic and
continuing afterwards, I'm going to be continuing to

1
2 make sure that we are as efficient as possible and
3 putting, whether it's detectives or police officers
4 or civilians out into the field where they interact
5 with the public and we get the most bang for the buck
6 in providing services for the great people of this
7 city.

8 But there is challenges and I will take a look at
9 the 45 and the 49. I know that the good news is we
10 are back to where we are in terms close, in terms of
11 sick reports. So, most of those sick members are
12 back to work but I think you are asking a little more
13 about generally how many are assigned to those
14 commands and we'll take a look at it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: What are those commands?
16 And Commissioner, there is no reflection on both of
17 those -

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member, we're going
19 to have to move on.

20 DERMOT SHEA: And just closing up on the
21 motorcycles, I get more complaints about motorcycles.
22 It puts people at risk. Dirt bikes, quads, some of
23 the people on this conference have called me
24 complaining about them in the park.

1
2 Fausto, can you just give a number? How many
3 have we seized in the last month or two?

4 FAUSTO PICHARDO: Sure. In the last two weeks,
5 two and a half weeks, we've seized over 25 dirt bikes
6 and quads throughout the city.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I have 25 roadways -

8 DERMOT SHEA: We are out there. We are trying to
9 do it in a safe manner. I do not want my police
10 officers chasing people around the city but we've put
11 pretty comprehensive plans in place. Terry Monahan,
12 his operations unit, there has been great
13 coordination and we've seized them, we've taken them
14 off the streets and more importantly, we've done it
15 safely.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you Commissioner.
17 We have two more questions, two more Council Members
18 and then we're going to end it.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can we please have Council
20 Member Cumbo followed by Council Member Treyger.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I just wanted
23 to address my colleagues and with all due respect to
24 my colleagues, if you had a woman of the racial or
25 ethnic or religious group that you identify with,

1 pushed down to the ground by a barrage of officers
2 while their child watched, I don't think that you
3 would be so forward in your desire to see another
4 graduating NYPD class. I feel if you saw that woman
5 plus the other videos that we've been forced to see,
6 as well as a generation, as well as centuries of
7 these sorts of incidents, you would not be so
8 forceful in your desire to see another graduating
9 class.
10

11 With that said, Commissioner, we've had a number
12 of meetings, we've had a number of discussions with
13 both you and the Mayor but every day it seems like we
14 just go back to the, we had another tough night, we
15 saw another video, we say another - we're not seeing
16 or hearing anything from you in the way of a dramatic
17 change. It's just, we have another incident and
18 these incidents have continued to add up.

19 What we really need to see in a Council to have
20 confidence and we know we can't have that type of
21 confidence quickly, is that we don't want to see
22 another graduating class come out with the same level
23 of racism or brutality that continues to exist within
24 our communities or we're going to have the same exact
25

1 issues that are going spiral out of control
2 particularly this summer.

3
4 You know, we have over 20,000 people in New York
5 State have died. We would hope that through this we
6 would have that Edmund Pettus Bridge moment in our
7 communities where the NYPD turns this around
8 dramatically. We can't go back to how we were.

9 We need to see you as well as the Mayor to say
10 this level of behavior is not just disturbing but
11 that it's not tolerated. That those officers are
12 going to be swiftly dealt with. Officers like Garcia
13 who have had law suit after law suit because of
14 brutality are going to be eliminated from this
15 department. We have zero tolerance. We want to see
16 a new training program that partners with real
17 organizations in our community, from the Malcolm X
18 Grassroots movement to [INAUDIBLE 3:25:27] to Bedford
19 Stuyvesant Restoration to Billy Holiday, to Caribbean
20 Cultural Center. So that these officers are
21 volunteering and having real time spent in our
22 communities.

23 We're not hearing anything like that. This form
24 of policing is going to spiral out of control and
25 while something that starting, like social

1 distancing, we are going to have chaos in our streets
2 this summer that are going to make social distancing
3 look like a light thing.

4 I'm going to end there because my son and I are
5 here and it's hard for me to stay focused. But to
6 continue to just have meeting after meeting, saying
7 that we're having a tough time but no real solutions
8 and no real change coming from the department or the
9 administration is not going to yield the new result
10 and I stand in favor of not having another graduating
11 class until you and the administration can
12 demonstrate -

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: That you have new policies
15 and new procedures to address these issues.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, did you want to comment
17 Commissioner?

18 DERMOT SHEA: Well, you know, I agree with a lot
19 of what you said Council woman Cumbo. Some of it I
20 disagree with, I'm on the record for saying those
21 things but I do respect your statement. I invite you
22 to come out with us. Come out with us, come out with
23 Fausto, come out with Nilda, and see what our
24 officers are dealing with.
25

1
2 It doesn't sound good when I say it again and
3 I'll say it again, that it bad incidents and it
4 reflects negatively on the entire city but that is
5 not necessarily a reflection of the NYPD officer's
6 actions. I mean, I've said this on the news today
7 and I'm sure some of you have seen it and I'll
8 recount it again today.

9 Last, yesterday's incident, we had NYPD officers
10 in the train station handing out masks. That is what
11 is very frustrating to me. When they see an
12 individual walking into the station with a young
13 child in hand, which is - I'm a parent. The woman
14 has a mask on her neck. The woman is approached
15 respectfully and the officers say and minority
16 officers by the way, say please put the mask on
17 before you come into the system. That is exactly
18 what the public is asking us to do.

19 We didn't do it rudely. We didn't do anything
20 that I would consider out of the norms of public. We
21 asked her to put the mask on her face and they were
22 immediately met with a fusillade of inappropriate
23 language. We have thick skin, that's not the end of
24 the world but it's not the end of the story, but then
25 she goes onto say, I'm going to cough on all of you.

1 The cops are in an extremely difficult situation.

2 They didn't summons her, they didn't arrest her, they
3 didn't put their hands on her but they did say, if
4 you are not putting your mask on and you are telling
5 us you are going to cough on people, you are going to
6 have to leave the system.
7

8 I don't know if you agree with that or not. It's
9 a bad situation. This happened twice. She came back
10 into the system; she was asked to leave again. Still
11 no summons, no arrest. This isn't a racial issue and
12 then on the last time, she finally pushes past the
13 officers and what you saw the end, that's the video.
14 It's terrible.

15 On the way to the station house, we have a
16 apologies all around and we have a statement that I'm
17 sorry I took my frustration out on you. And I'm not
18 going to get into her personal business because I
19 don't think it's appropriate but she is dealing with
20 a lot in her personal life and she apologized for
21 taking frustration out on the cops.

22 Now, the NYPD is wrong again. This is, this is -
23 I don't like it at all. I don't like that it
24 happened. I wish it happened differently. I don't
25 know the exact training but this is what we have to

1
2 get through and that's the latest one. And Laurie,
3 some of them, you know, the [INAUDIBLE 3:29:35],
4 absolutely, I am uncomfortable with and I said that
5 publicly. We took that on the first night and there
6 is a play out [INAUDIBLE 3:29:46].

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Madam Majority Leader, I have
8 to move on.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just wanted to just add
10 one more thing.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No, Majority Leader, we have
12 to move on.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: The only thing I will say
14 about that is that no other race of people are
15 treated in that way. So, while you have the back
16 story and the after story and the during, no other
17 race, we've never seen, I have never seen in my 45
18 years of living a White woman treated that way with
19 her child watching and if it happened to any other
20 race or community or ethnicity, it would have been
21 handled differently and the aftermath of what happens
22 after that would be happening very differently and
23 I'll just close on that.

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 177

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Madam Majority
3 Leader. Last question and then we'll have a close
4 out from our Chair Donovan Richards.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Treyger
6 please.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you to Chair Dromm
9 and to Chair Richards. Thank you to Commissioner and
10 the team for staying for the duration of this
11 hearing. I actually - this is a very contentious
12 issue and I share the frustration of many of my
13 colleagues and I just want to also just note for the
14 record, Commissioner Shea, the governor's pause
15 orders and the Mayor's social distancing and face
16 covering orders, would you agree that these are
17 public health mandates, these are public health
18 orders?

19 DERMOT SHEA: I think that sounds logical to me.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And Commissioner Shea,
21 are NYPD officers licensed health professionals?

22 DERMOT SHEA: We are not.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Is there a specific, any
24 kind of pandemic enforcement per education in police
25 academy training to become an officer?

1
2 DERMOT SHEA: I'm not sure of that question. I
3 mean, certainly we have a variety of training over
4 the course of six months for a number of topics but
5 specific, I don't think anyone has specific training
6 prior to this. You know, to exactly what we're
7 facing at this time but ultimately, what we're tasked
8 with is protecting you know, through the academy and
9 onward on the street is the health, safety, and
10 welfare of the public.

11 So, there is a correlation there.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, to me, I believe
13 that these are public health mandates. These are
14 public health orders. You acknowledge that your
15 members are not licensed health professionals and
16 therefore, it is to me I think the leader of the City
17 of New York, the Mayor has to shift the approach
18 because this is only going to become a more growing
19 and growing issue and concern.

20 I think you, like many of us, before the pandemic
21 would visit a restaurant that would be assigned a
22 health grade. We would trust our families with a
23 grade assigned to that restaurant. And we need to
24 build on the trust that folks had with health
25 inspectors and health departments to be a part of

1 this effort. This cannot just be an NYPD issue. I
2 want to note for the record that yesterday, officers
3 from the 60th precinct, school safety, FDNY, EMT,
4 saved a woman's life that was almost - she almost
5 drowned in the beach of Coney Island and they rushed
6 out. There is no swimming aloud, beaches are closed
7 but they actually rushed out and so, I do want to
8 recognize that Commissioner Shea and I want to really
9 thank them for saving - she was rushed to the
10 hospital and Coney Island Hospital saved her life. I
11 don't know if you were aware what happened yesterday.

12 DERMOT SHEA: I was.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I want to just note
14 that and the last thing I'll say is Coney Island
15 Brighton Beach. I am petrified of what's coming this
16 summer.
17

18 I have not been given any information from City
19 Hall about what the plan is to help deal with
20 education, public safety.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member, please wrap
22 up.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: We are usually given
24 information by now. Commissioner Shea, we're in the
25

1 dark. What can you share with us to protect our
2 costal community this summer?

3
4 DERMOT SHEA: So, I could tell you that we're
5 looking at not just coastal communities, we're
6 looking at areas of the city that have beaches and
7 areas of the city that have parks. Literally the
8 whole city and trying to plan as best as we can in
9 coordination with City Hall and other agencies with
10 the information that we have now.

11 So, in terms of you know, what areas are going to
12 be open, what areas are going to be high density.
13 What steps have to be taken to prevent people from
14 gathering in high numbers and this is what we are
15 doing. We're doing it in conjunction with other
16 agencies and I you know, I agree with you in that
17 these are unchartered times and we are trying to make
18 best case estimations on what lays ahead with
19 unfortunately, not all the facts.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, I'd like to work
21 with you further on the summer plan but thank you
22 Commissioner, thank you Chairs.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Thank you
24 Commissioner, I'm going to go to Chair Donovan
25 Richards to close us out but I also just want to say

1 that Council Member Diana Ayala didn't get an answer
2 on her ADA capita but we will follow up in writing
3 with you on that Commissioner.

4 Chair Richards?

5 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you and let me just
6 first request the Commissioner also if Oleg can send
7 me what the Youth Initiative Budget is that would be
8 helpful right after this hearing.

9 And let me just close by saying certainly there
10 has been a lot of rhetoric today and you know, I just
11 want to be clear, none of us are anti-police, right
12 and I think Council Member Cabrera has certainly
13 pointed out we aren't. But we are anti-police
14 brutality and we are going to continue to speak out
15 against those things. I do also want to add that you
16 said some things that I think you went further today
17 than I have ever heard you go and speaking of where
18 we need to go and I really appreciate your comments
19 today and with saying that, I also hope that - I
20 think it would be a tremendous benefit for you to
21 also be at that hearing next week to discuss this
22 because I think we're going to heal together, I don't
23 think any of us are looking for theatrics. We're
24 looking for a place where every community can be
25

1
2 policed evenly and where we can hear each other and
3 work towards the common goal of reducing crime across
4 the city but we know that this cannot continuously be
5 a police led issue as well.

6 Also, just speak to de-escalation, there needs to
7 be a lot more work around that but technically law
8 enforcement can't be the answer to a public health
9 crisis. That's just the bottom line and we look
10 forward to hearing from the Mayor on how he is going
11 to ensure that that stops.

12 I also just wanted to close on one of your
13 statements and I think you took a step backwards in
14 your response to Laurie Cumbo because there is
15 certainly inequity in the ways that were dealt with
16 and certainly, you go and look at parks where people
17 had no masks right, at all but yet, they were dealt
18 with in a different fashion.

19 So, that's what people are seeing. That's what
20 we are seeing. Our eyes are not deceiving us. And I
21 just want to put that out there. We may see it
22 differently but the point is, this is what we are
23 seeing in communities that have historically had
24 challenges with the Police Department.

1
2 So, I applaud you on the NCO program. I support
3 my precincts. There is not a precinct in my district
4 that won't say that I support them and even outside
5 of my community we have a great relationship but that
6 doesn't mean that we don't have the right to
7 criticize policies when we see them being enacted in
8 an unfair manner.

9 So, I hope to see you next week. I hope you make
10 yourself available and I think we can get to a place
11 of healing by working together. So, I want to thank
12 you for coming today. We have a lot more work to do.
13 I still just want to echo police class has to go. I
14 don't think there is any reason for it momentarily.

15 I think that that money can be better utilized to
16 reduce crimes in different ways. Thank you Mr.
17 Commissioner and thank you to my Chair Danny Dromm
18 and no one has the right to call you anything. We
19 all know that you stand firm with your Police
20 Department. I've worked with you on several issues
21 over there and you've always been fair, so thank you
22 Danny.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and
24 Commissioner, I want to echo the sentiment. We
25 really thank you for extending your time today. I

1 think that your willingness to do that shows an
2
3 openness and willingness to continue the discussion
4 with the City Council. We are most grateful to you.
5 Thank you again.

6 DERMOT SHEA: Thank you everyone.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we're going to close
8 this section out. We will now go to, hold on, I do
9 have a statement to read. Okay, I will now take a
10 break until 1:30 p.m., excuse me, until 2:00 p.m.
11 when we will hear from the Department for Aging. I
12 ask my colleagues who will be joining us for the
13 aging portion of the hearing to remain in the Zoom
14 conference with your microphone muted until we are
15 ready to begin.

16 And with that, [GAVEL] this hearing is ended.
17 [3:38:50-3:55:04].

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon everyone, at
19 this time can everyone please turn all their
20 electronic devices to vibrate or silent. Please mute
21 your microphone on Zoom. Please be sure that you
22 have named yourself correctly in Zoom or you may be
23 either renamed by the Zoom host or removed from the
24 hearing.

25 Thank you. We will begin momentarily.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.

Good afternoon and welcome to the City Council's
third day of hearings on the Mayor's Executive Budget
for Fiscal 2021. [GAVEL]. I just want to gavel us
in.

My name is Daniel Dromm and I Chair the Finance
Committee. We are joined by the Committee on Aging
Chaired by colleague, Councilman Margaret Chin and we
will now hear from the Department of Aging.

I would like to acknowledge my colleagues that
have joined us for this hearing and let me just pull
them up. They are Council Members Vallone, Adams,
Ampry-Samuel, Cohen, Grodenchik, Menchaca, Ayala,
Louis, Barron, Yeger, Koslowitz, Cumbo, Gjonaj and I
think it's Yeger. Excuse me, Gjonaj, Lancman, Diaz,
Matteo, and Gibson.

Okay, thank you all for being here and I would
now like - in the interest of time, I will forego an
opening statement but I am going to turn it over to
our Committee Counsel to go over some procedural
items before we hear from Council Member Chin.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. My name is
Stephanie Ruiz and I am Counsel to the New York City
Council's Committee on Finance.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
2 SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 186

3 Before we begin, I want to remind everyone that
4 you will be on mute until you are recognized to
5 speak, at which time you will be unmuted by the Zoom
6 host.

7 If Council Members would like to ask a question,
8 please use the Zoom raise hand function, you will be
9 added to the queue.

10 Thank you and I will now turn it over to Council
11 Member Chin.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Just before we begin, I'd
13 like to say we've also been joined by Council Member
14 Holden.

15 Chair Chin?

16 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you Chair Dromm. I know
17 it's been a long day for you. Good afternoon. I am
18 Margaret Chin, Chair of the Committee on Aging and
19 welcome to this committee's first ever virtual
20 hearing. We are here today to hear testimony from
21 the Department for the Aging or DFTA on its proposed
22 \$386 million Executive Budget for Fiscal Year 2021.

23 DFTA released its budget at an unprecedented
24 time. The coronavirus crisis has placed most of New
25 York City on lockdown and seniors have been the
hardest hit group of the over 20,000 confirmed and

1
2 probable COVID deaths in the city. 74 percent have
3 been among those aged 55 and older, according to the
4 Office of Emergency Management.

5 I would like to start by honoring those seniors
6 who have died from COVID-19 and recognizing the
7 medical and nursing home staff, home health aides,
8 nonprofit senior service providers.

9 DFTA staff and other emergency personnel who have
10 worked so hard to keep seniors safe, healthy, and
11 connected. Thank you.

12 I will keep my remarks brief, so that we have as
13 much time as possible for Council Member questions.
14 But let me emphasize three key points. First, DFTA's
15 Executive Budget excludes funding's in Fiscal 20 and
16 Fiscal 21 for ongoing COVID-19 response. This
17 includes underbudgeting of at least \$7 million and
18 likely more than \$20 million for emergency direct
19 delivered meal. That program was operated by DFTA
20 for just a few weeks before the Department of
21 Transportation - Sanitation took control of the
22 program, which we will discuss much more during our
23 questions. I hope to hear today what DFTA's real
24 budget looks like and a commitment that the adopted
25 budget will reflect actual expenses and revenues.

1
2 Second, the budget continues to fall \$10 million
3 short on DFTA's commitment to senior center model
4 budgeting. I hope to hear from DFTA that you will
5 tell seniors today that the \$10 million for model
6 budgeting will appear in the adopted budget.

7 Third, the budget fails to improve the home
8 delivered meal program. Over half of the City
9 Council, including the Finance Chair, signed onto my
10 letter requesting \$26.2 million more to meet the
11 growing demand for food and to reimburse provider at
12 a fair rate. I hope DFTA will agree that this \$26.2
13 million across two years is not optional add on but a
14 necessary development to protect vulnerable seniors
15 in this historic crisis.

16 Additionally, I look forward to discussing the
17 home delivered meal RFP, which has been delayed three
18 times during COVID-19 and should be postponed and
19 revisited in the light of the crisis. It is clear
20 there are many important issues that we must discuss
21 today and I look forward to hearing from DFTA's
22 Commissioner and Chief Financial Officer.

23 Before the Committee Counsel is asked to swear in
24 the panel, I'd like to thank the Committee staff for
25 their hard work in preparing for this hearing.

1 Daniel Kroop our Senior Financial Analyst, Dohini
2 Sompura Unit Head, Counsel Nuzhat Chowdury, Policy
3 Analyst Kalima Johnson, and Marian Guerra my Deputy
4 Chief of Staff and Director of Legislation and Budget
5 and now, I will turn it back to Chair Dromm.
6

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. We are
9 also joined by Council Member Deutsch.

10 I will now call on the members of the Department
11 for Aging to testify. We will hear testimony from
12 Commissioner Lorraine Cortes-Vasquez and DFTA's Chief
13 Financial Officer Jose Mercado. Will the Committee
14 Counsel please administer the affirmation.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I will now
16 administer the affirmation one time and you will be
17 called on individually to so affirm at the end.

18 Do you affirm that your testimony will be
19 truthful to the best of your knowledge, information
20 and believe? Commissioner Cortes-Vasquez?

21 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I do.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Mr. Mercado?

23 JOSE MERCADO: I do.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Commissioner, you
25 may begin when ready.

1
2 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you. Good
3 afternoon Chair Chin, Chair Dromm, and members of the
4 Aging and Finance Committee.

5 As has been stated, I am Lorraine Cortes-Vasquez
6 and I'm joined this afternoon by Jose Mercado, our
7 Chief Financial Officer, in what seems to be our new
8 norm via virtual conferencing. I hope during this
9 time that you and your families are doing well and
10 are in good health.

11 I am happy to report that my family is doing
12 well, although facing many challenges.

13 I also want to thank Chair Chin for acknowledging
14 and the death of the many older person who have
15 perished as a result of this crisis and also to the
16 many, many people who have stood up and supported the
17 older adult community during this time. And I thank
18 you for this opportunity to discuss DFTA's Executive
19 Budget for Fiscal Year 2021.

20 I have been asked to cut my testimony to five
21 minutes, so I'm going to go through it as quickly as
22 possible and will leave out some of the statements
23 that were in the original testimony, which I believe
24 it's in your queue for the record.
25

1
2 During this unprecedented crisis, the Department
3 for the Aging continued to boldly carry out its
4 mission to ensure a high quality of life and well-
5 being for older New Yorkers. This has been a
6 tremendous difficult and unprecedented time.

7 Our priorities were clear and even more critical
8 during this public health crisis: One, and it
9 continued to be is combating food insecurity among
10 older New Yorkers and maintaining social engagement
11 for thousands of older adults who regularly attended
12 our senior centers, and to ensure that that have
13 uninterrupted access to case management services and
14 the traditional home delivered meal programs, as well
15 as the myriad of educational and recreational
16 programs.

17 When the senior centers closed, we quickly
18 transitioned our operations to ensure that daily
19 meals continue to get in the hands of our older
20 members. During this pandemic, our congregate meal
21 system had to shift from a congregate meal program,
22 hyper local, serving between 80 to 200 individuals
23 per site to a grab and go model.

24 That was a shift that was challenging but our
25 network of agencies stepped up to that challenge.

1
2 In addition to that, we saw early on that – and
3 the guidance that we were receiving from the
4 department of health, that that was not going to be
5 sustainable and we had to shift to a direct meal
6 delivery system which we will commonly call as DFTA
7 Direct.

8 We went from a 25,000 daily attendance at our
9 senior centers up to 44,000 individuals on March 27th
10 and it was a formidable task. We went from 25,000 to
11 44,000 in a matter of about four days and to address
12 the Food Insecurity Initiative. Fortunately for us
13 GetFoodNYC was transitioned into a direct delivery
14 service and we want to thank the Food Czar Kathryn
15 Garcia, for expanding and enhancing the older adult
16 delivery program DFTA Direct beyond the 44,000 who
17 received more than 1.2 million meals since the March
18 27th day. Mayor de Blasio has asserted that no New
19 Yorker would go hungry and this Administration is
20 working tirelessly to meet this commitment every day.

21 I'm also pleased to report that the Department
22 for the Aging programs, providing educational,
23 recreational, and social services have shifted to
24 virtual programming. Continuing engagement and
25

1 contact with participants through a variety of
2 outlets while they had to stay at home.

3
4 Senior centers are offering exercise classes, art
5 workshops, Zoom chat sessions and other services.

6 The geriatric mental health program continues
7 services via telephone outreach and conversations.

8 DFTA programs that are available telephonically or
9 virtually include caregiver support, case management,
10 the High Cap program, counseling, and assistant
11 programs as well as the Friendly Visiting program.

12 Our goal is to counter the negative effects of
13 social isolation that has effected all New Yorkers
14 but at this point, we are most concerned because
15 older New Yorkers not only have the mental health
16 issues, but also, have a health related, may have
17 health related impacts as a result of that.

18 I'm pleased to say that over 1,500 telephone
19 reassurance calls have been made to senior center
20 participants and many more outside of the senior
21 network because of our partnership with some of our
22 sister agencies such as the Department of Health and
23 Mental Health and New York City service that has
24 increased the bandwidth of each one of our providers.

1
2 All of this brings me to the reason why I am here
3 before you today. The FY21 Executive Budget projects
4 386 million in funding, which include allocations of
5 \$173 million to support senior centers. \$41.8
6 million for home delivered meals, \$38.1 million for
7 case management, \$34.4 million to support home care
8 for home bound. Older adults who are not Medicaid
9 eligible and \$6.2 million for the NORC programs and
10 another \$8.1 million for caregiver services.

11 Given the uncertain long term and short term
12 impacts of COVID, including the economic challenges
13 that we all face as we move towards FY21. The
14 current climate has caused all of us in this
15 administration, all public officials, about
16 rethinking of priorities previously outlined in our
17 Preliminary Budget hearing. For instance, as
18 previously noted, the model budget funding was to
19 commence and start as of Fiscal Year 21. The
20 unexpected public health emergency has compelled us
21 to reassess certain plans and priority.

22 While this particular funding remains a
23 commitment for all of us in this administration, we
24 will continue to closely monitor the still evolving
25

1
2 pandemic and its impact and implication of these
3 priorities, home delivered meals for seniors.

4 Now, I'd like to take this opportunity to talk
5 about that. Our Home Delivered Meals program
6 continues to be administered by DFTA. Not only do
7 home delivered meals provide substance to homebound
8 older adults across the five boroughs, were certain
9 standards are required and applied to all DFTA
10 funding case management programs.

11 Case management agents help older adults with
12 functional impairment and gain access to appropriate
13 services, benefits, and entitlement to age safely in
14 their homes and to maintain a quality of life. Case
15 management begins with identifying the client's needs
16 and the capabilities to intake followed up by more
17 comprehensive strength based in home assessment which
18 right now, we cannot do in home assessment and
19 regular assessment, so they are all telephonic.

20 The program continues to operate remotely for all
21 our clients and are available. Case management is
22 the entre and the entry point for home delivered
23 meals.

24 In addition to home delivered meals, there is
25 also an increased demand for other in home services.

1
2 This year alone, prior to COVID, we provided a close,
3 in fact last year, there was a record totally 4
4 million home delivered meals that were given to
5 individuals.

6 This demonstrates how critical this program is
7 for older adults throughout the city and we know that
8 there will be an increase demand for this and other
9 in home services given COVID.

10 As indicated in my testimony on the FY 21
11 Preliminary Budget, the home delivered meals request
12 for proposal that DFTA issued last January intends to
13 fund providers to address the most critical
14 overarching goals of the program, including increased
15 meal options for [INAUDIBLE 4:11:31] one of the
16 issues that, one of the main issues that older adults
17 ask for choice in the food.

18 We've continued to place emphasis on ensuring
19 that food is procured meeting the Good Food
20 Purchasing Guidelines as set forth by the Mayor's
21 Office of Food Policy and that fosters great
22 collaboration within the network, as well as choice,
23 diversity, religious options, and the quality of food
24 provided.

1
2 This RFP in particular is important as it allows
3 us to improve the quality and the quantity of choice
4 that older adults have expressed as a main goal. The
5 delay in the RFP was offered to bidders more time, so
6 that they can form collaboratives and other
7 innovative approaches that were encouraged by the
8 RFP. We are and have continued to be committed to
9 extending this RFP to meet the needs of the
10 providers, but I just want to remind everyone that
11 this RFP was issued in January and extending it June
12 1st amounts to a total of 13 additional weeks from
13 the original deadline.

14 While we are all a challenging road ahead of us,
15 and the ongoing response to this pandemic require
16 fiscal prudence, it also requires us to refocus some
17 of the issues that have been serviced by this
18 pandemic such as the disparities in communities of
19 color and at risk communities.

20 We need to continue to provide essential services
21 to all older New Yorkers as we face these
22 unprecedented circumstances and we don't know what
23 the future holds and our new normal and our array of
24 services, I believe will be very different. We will
25 keep adapting and employing new technology and other

1
2 modes of communication to accomplish the mission,
3 which is quality of life for older New Yorkers, so
4 that they can live in their home and in their
5 community.

6 DFTA will continue to work eliminating agism and
7 to ensure that older adults and their caregivers
8 continue to receive services, advocacy, and
9 education. We cannot accomplish this alone. We have
10 to do this in partnership with the Council and as
11 well as the effective advocacy of stakeholders and of
12 course, our excellent non-profit providers who are on
13 the frontlines every day.

14 And lastly, most importantly, older adults
15 themselves. And that concludes my testimony and I
16 believe I did it under five, just under five minutes.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, you get an A.

18 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: At least for timing
19 Danny.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, alright. If you were
21 in my class you would, okay.

22 Thank you so much Commissioner for joining us and
23 I just, before I get to my questions, I want to say
24 that we have been joined by Council Member Rose and I
25

1 think I got all the other members. If I didn't, just
2 let staff know.
3

4 Commissioner, I want to talk a little bit with
5 you about the lack of, or the need for senior
6 services that was already existing and in high demand
7 and puts a strain on existing resources. So, does
8 DFTA think that the Fiscal 2021 Budget can support
9 seniors growing need, such as a 20 percent more
10 increase in the need for home delivered meals?

11 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: You know, I've been
12 asked this question before and I always go back to a
13 statement which is, a true value statement that I
14 believe in. The [INAUDIBLE 4:15:35] the fiscal
15 ability of this city and continue to do that.

16 If we could of course, the needs are greater and
17 we find Councilman Dromm that the needs are going to,
18 we have no clue of what we have an insight into how
19 much this COVID situation has impacted the older
20 person and particularly in home services as I said in
21 my testimony.

22 I can't hear you.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sorry. Do you have any
24 idea about investing in either expense or capital
25

1 budget dollars for new technologies for seniors that
2 are isolated at home?

3
4 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: We're primarily - we're
5 looking at that right now. We have been very pleased
6 to see that in the pre-COVID, we have about 29
7 programs who are providing rich, robust, virtual
8 programming and services to older adults. As a
9 result of COVID, the programs have been extremely
10 innovative and capable and now we have 171
11 participating in a variety of virtual programming
12 from fun things like Zumba and belly dancing and
13 magic shows to serious things about wellbeing and how
14 to connect with your family on a more regular basis,
15 financial security and always caregiving services.
16 So, there has been a richness of programming. There
17 is even one program called PSS who has a virtual
18 university, a university without walls and they
19 offered a variety of teaching programs.

20 So, the lack of creativity, we're not lacking
21 that. Our network is quite in depth. So, we're
22 looking, as a matter of fact, we've been talking for
23 the last three weeks, how is it that we build on this
24 robust and rich experience, because we do think that
25 the life in senior centers is going to be very, very

1
2 different Councilman Dromm, Chair Dromm. It's going
3 to - I don't know that we will ever see senior
4 centers as we knew them in the past, especially with
5 the social distancing and the vulnerability of older
6 adults.

7 So, yes, it's one of the things that we're
8 looking at and we are you know, we will get back to
9 you on exactly what those are.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Let me go to
11 emergency food. After the Mayor ordered senior
12 centers to close on March 15th, senior centers were
13 directed to provide grab and go meals. However,
14 within a week, DFTA scrapped that plan and launched
15 through emergency procurements direct delivered meals
16 to food insecure seniors who were sheltering in
17 place. The program had some serious operational
18 deficiencies including a lack of meal production and
19 planning.

20 By April 13th, the City had begun transitioning
21 all senior emergency food operations to the
22 GetFoodNYC program under the management of citywide
23 Food Czar and DSNY Commissioner Kathryn Garcia.

24 So, what makes DSNY as opposed to DFTA a more
25 qualified agency to manage senior meal programs?

1
2 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I don't - with all due
3 respect sir, I don't see it exactly the way you
4 portrayed it. I see a program that was hyper local,
5 249 outlets, in some cases it might be up to 200 and
6 almost 300 outlets if we include all the social
7 clubs. I see a program that served people anywhere
8 between 30, 80, to 200 senior centers to shifting to
9 a centralized operation.

10 So, I see that as a major formidable undertaking,
11 transforming an operation from local to centralized.
12 I don't know that I would say we are working very
13 closely with the food Czar and we applaud their
14 efforts to increase it, but I do not see it as a
15 deficit for DFTA. I saw it as an expansion and
16 regular, these were unprecedented times. We needed
17 to expand programming in a relatively short period of
18 time. To give you the context, it was a matter of
19 six days. We had to go from 25 and it grew to 44. I
20 would rather focus on the 44,000 who received food
21 and the 1.2 million meals that we did then to only
22 focus on the growth issues.

23 So, I don't think it was a deficiency but I do
24 think that the operation was far in excess and the

1 demand was far in excess than anything DFTA had ever
2 done before.

3
4 I know the Food Czar has put together and
5 assembled an entire team to look at food insecurity
6 across the city. We applaud their work; we are
7 working hand and glove with them to ensure that all
8 of the needs of the older population can continue.

9 For example, one of the things that we did was
10 the 44,000 people were transferred over seamlessly,
11 were grandfathered into the program and then, they
12 were able to grow it and Commissioner Garcia will
13 give you - is better equipped to give you what the
14 numbers are to date. That we are working hand and
15 hand to ensure that this program still works.

16 They have the capacity, they have the reach, they
17 have been able to go from one meal - we used to
18 provide one meal a day, they've had the great
19 opportunity and the reach to do three meals a day
20 alright and have a different delivery system.

21 So, we applaud those efforts. We are working
22 together to those efforts but I would not say that it
23 was a deficit as much as it was an immediate growth
24 within a four to five day period.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: My question has really - my
3 question has more really to do with why is the money
4 in DSNY and not in your agency? We've seen
5 Commissioner Garcia take over the lead paint issue in
6 NYCHA and I don't believe money was put into other
7 agencies but in this case, it was put into DSNY. To
8 us as budgeting people, it seems odd for lack of a
9 better word, that they put the money into DSNY.

10 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: But the \$170 million
11 that was committed to this is a broad, broad, it's
12 across all agencies and it's to direct food
13 insecurity for all agencies and for all populations.
14 So, Commissioner Garcia as the Food Czar is managing
15 that program and it is totally a fair and I believe
16 appropriate that she - because she is overseeing the
17 breath and the depth of this, that involve Department
18 of Education, DFTA and DSS and many other programs,
19 that she would be the one responsible for the
20 distribution of those dollars, so that she could
21 pivot and make sure that we live into the Mayor's
22 commitment that no one will go hungry.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That \$170 million that you
24 mentioned, we in the Council only know of \$75 million
25 so far, so when we have our hearing with the

1 Commissioner, we hope to be able to get an answer to
2 that question.

3
4 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Sure, yes, and I'm sure
5 that you will be able to but I just want to make sure
6 that for this hearing and anything else, we are
7 working very, very closely with Commissioner Garcia
8 towards the same and which is to ensure that older
9 New Yorkers cannot – more older New Yorkers can get
10 through and they can get more food, which we're very,
11 very grateful to them.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Commissioner, let me go
13 to just – some of the related costs that are not
14 included in the Executive Plan for either Fiscal 20
15 or 21. Why were they not reflected and will they be
16 included by the time of adoption? That's DFTA's
17 COVID-19 related costs.

18 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Okay, I'm going to, I'm
19 going to – for COVID related costs, we have about \$37
20 million but I'm going to turn it over to Jose
21 Mercado, our Chief Financial Officer who can give
22 you the details of that. Jose, can you answer the
23 Council Members, the Chairman's question please?

24 JOSE MERCADO: Yeah, so, we are basically are
25 expected to receive close to about \$26.7 million from

1
2 the Stimulus Packages 1 and 2. We are working with
3 OMB currently to mod that money in. You will see it
4 as part of the option.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we look forward to
6 working with you on that as we move toward adoption.
7 And Commissioner, as you know, an issue close to my
8 heart, is support for our immigrant seniors.

9 So, the Council provided \$1.5 million to support
10 senior centers for immigrant populations in Fiscal
11 2020. What outreach and support is DFTA doing to
12 provide immigrant centers with help to make them
13 competitive for baselining in the next DFTA senior
14 center RFP?

15 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Chairman, you know that
16 that issue is as close to my heart as it is to yours
17 and when I became Commissioner, just slightly over a
18 year ago, and can you believe how much we've gone
19 through in a year?

20 Just slightly over a year ago, we have reached
21 out to them, we have provided technical assistance
22 and we continue to be in dialogue, because like you,
23 I agree particularly now after COVID and we see the
24 disparity and the uneven impact that this has had and
25 other communities, that we need to make that we have

1 a robust network that reflects the immigrant
2 community.

3
4 So, that continues and we will continue to work
5 with them as we transition into our new life called
6 post-COVID and as we start thinking about building
7 senior centers that reflect the City of New York.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Has DFTA discussed baselining
9 with OMB? The funding?

10 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: We have not done that
11 at this point but I think that when we get to the
12 RFP, those are conversations, ongoing conversations
13 that we will have with OMB.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so let's just talk a
15 little bit about the home delivered meals RFP. There
16 was a lot of talk, a lot of criticism about that.
17 What went wrong in the home delivered meals RFP and
18 how will DFTA improve the process for future RFP's?

19 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Again, it's all about a
20 perspective, right. Where you sit determines on how
21 you see a situation. I don't think they were
22 involved with a DFTA RFP, with all due respect. We
23 issued an RFP these are programs that have been in
24 place for the last 12 years without any review. I
25 mean, without any renewal. The first time in 12

1 years that we issued an RFP. We know that the older
2 population today is very different than the older
3 population was then and we also know these programs
4 were designed in the 70's. Older populations and the
5 future of older populations, you and I are very
6 different than our grandmothers were at our age.
7

8 And so, what we're looking for is to program for
9 today's older person and the future older person.

10 So, we issued an RFP on January 22nd to be exact. We
11 had a deadline of March 3rd and because we put in so
12 many new and innovation approaches, the network said,
13 can you give us an extension so that we can
14 collaborate and negotiate with each other and we said
15 yes.

16 And as we've gone along, we've extended that
17 deadline and then we heard, you know, Council Member
18 Chin's compelling request to consider extending it
19 and we did one more time to June 1st. But programs
20 have had more than 15 weeks to respond to this RFP.
21 Of which 10 of those were prior to COVID.

22 So, I don't know that we see it in the same
23 possible way but what we do have and I know it's a
24 shared and common commitment but for you, from
25 Chairwoman, is that we need to bring these programs

1 to current state and to the future, so that we could
2 address the future needs of the homebound older
3 adults. We need to keep people in their community,
4 in their homes, that's when they thrive the most and
5 home delivered meals is a big part of that.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, the last time
8 an RFP was issued for the NORC's, three existing
9 NORC's - I'm sorry.

10 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Sorry, for NORC's, go
11 ahead.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, it was maybe back in
13 '13 or so if I'm not mistaken and three NORC's,
14 existing NORC's were cut out of the approval once
15 they were done. One was included in my district, the
16 Southridge, Northridge Brulene NORC. Another was in
17 I believe it was Councilwoman Adrienne Adams District
18 now and another was in Council Member and Former
19 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito's district.

20 I just want to say that I hope that when we go
21 through the RFP process that we don't see the loss of
22 additional ones and the Council actually is picking
23 up a lot of the funding, if not all of the funding
24 for those three centers at this point.
25

I just wanted to highlight that for you and hopefully when the RFP is out, we don't see the same thing happen again.

LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: We're talking about the NORC's RFP, not the Home Delivered RFP. The Home Delivered RFP is to create more collaboration amongst programmers and the NORC RFP, yes, we will look at that very carefully and yes, and we thank you for the support that you give to the NORC's and also to the support that you gave us, so that most of that program is now baselined and for the support that you give us for the NORC's for nursing services.

That was an essential piece that was added last year and has proven to be very, very, very necessary and we thank you because the foresight with COVID-19, having those nursing services in the NORC's was a very, very good thing.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And those NORC's in many ways are a way to look at the future as well, because I know specifically for the Northridge, Southridge, Brulene, they are doing a lot of remote type connections with the seniors that live in that NORC, so.

1
2 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Absolutely. I think
3 you know, I have been and maybe I'm off script here
4 for a little bit, which this is a legislative agenda,
5 not a budget agenda, but I have been a long term and
6 long time supporter of community based services, long
7 term care community based services because as what
8 you just said, the NORC's, aging in place is the
9 right way to go and we have a lot of support for
10 that. So, that's one thing that I hope that together
11 we can continue to advocate for.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm going to now turn it over
13 to Council Member Chin for questions. Thank you
14 Commissioner.

15 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you so much.
16 Stay safe.

17 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you Chair Dromm.
18 Commissioner, I am still looking for that \$10 million
19 that was promised and I hope that it is in the budget
20 by budget adoption because you, in your testimony,
21 you have talked about you know, all the great things
22 that our centers are doing for our seniors being
23 creative, innovative, they need that funding support.
24 So, there is pay equity, they can have more staff on
25

1 hand that could do these creative programs for our
2 older adults.

3
4 So, I really expect that by budget adoption that
5 that \$10 million that was promised back in 2018 has
6 to be there.

7 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I don't think that any
8 one Council Member Chin disagrees with you about the
9 importance of that and it was OMB's commitment, the
10 Department's commitment that this was an essential
11 piece to keep growing and creating the senior center
12 today and for the future.

13 But we are facing unprecedented fiscal challenges
14 and that has to be balanced across all of the new
15 disparities that have been revealed. That the social
16 and health needs and the challenges that we've seen
17 in communities of color and others, and with all,
18 with all due respect as much as you and I want that
19 continued, it is in that context that all of these
20 things are being balanced.

21 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: And the money, and the money
22 is not used, I mean, okay, then you can take it back
23 but it was promised and I remember my conversation
24 with you. It was already planned out, how to give it
25 out to the center.

1 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Yes.

2
3 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Right, come on. So, it was
4 already in preparation.

5 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: All of that is
6 accurate.

7 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: And that should not change,
8 okay because the centers are still critical in the
9 future, no matter what that future is and if we have
10 to continue to grow these centers, so that, there
11 will be equity across the city and I think that is so
12 critical.

13 So, I expect to see that in the budget and we
14 will work with you to make sure OMB and the Mayor
15 listen. I wanted to go back to the home delivered
16 meal that Chair Dromm was asking about. The main
17 issue is that the price point you know, for the
18 provider, you know, it's 20 percent less than the
19 national average and a lot of the providers who has
20 been going home delivered meal have been subsidizing
21 the program and that really should not be the case.

22 That they have to use unrestrictive fund money
23 that they raise they could use to improve their
24 program to do this and during this crisis, the amount
25

1 of senior older adult that are requesting home
2 delivered meals has gone up 20 percent.

3
4 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: And now you know, providers
6 are telling us that well, DFTA is telling that they
7 will enroll more people but this home delivered meal
8 program has been doing so well. They are the ones
9 that are providing the real nutritious meal, not from
10 the GetFoodNYC.

11 Commissioner, look, I know it's a lot of people
12 that they have to service but our older adult seniors
13 that are in the senior centers and in the home
14 delivered meal program has been shortchanged in this
15 crisis. They are not getting the nutritious meals
16 that they used to. They are not getting the
17 culturally sensitive meal that they are used and the
18 provider that were capable that have been doing this,
19 they were not involved.

20 I mean yes, they're talking about centralization.
21 They took it away from DFTA and that is not right
22 because there are so many providers that do have the
23 capacity to double what they've been doing in terms
24 of home delivered meal and if we provided more
25

1 support for them, they could do it but right now,
2 they are left out in the cold.

3
4 I want to make sure that we bring them back
5 because we have, I mean I have centers in my district
6 who is ready and willing to do more but like, they
7 were not – they were not involved. They were not
8 consulted. It was like grab and go and then all of a
9 sudden it's centralized.

10 Commissioner, you, and I know that it wasn't
11 seamless, okay. There were people who got lost in
12 the crack and that's why the Mayor –

13 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Chairwoman, with all –
14 we were growing from 25 to 44. Of course, there were
15 glitches. I would be totally insane if I said there
16 weren't glitches but we –

17 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah, but the glitches is also
18 the kind of food that our older adults – I mean, come
19 on those snack of peanuts, the raisin, that is not a
20 meal. Uh, uh, that is not a meal. It's just now
21 they are talking about they are doing some nutritious
22 meal. So, they are transitioning to do that but
23 going forward, I think it's really critical on this
24 RFP. If you could consider postponing it. If not,
25 at least push it back to the fall and then have a

1 start in 2022, so that the providers can really come
2 together and assess. Because we have asks for 26.2
3 million more because of the demand. There is not
4 enough money in the budget. I mean, the city is
5 paying these private vendors right now who are doing
6 the meal program more than what they are giving the
7 home delivered meal providers.
8

9 That's not fair. I mean, like, and the quality
10 is not the same.

11 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: So, I want to separate
12 the centralized DFTA Direct with Home Delivered
13 Meals. Home Delivered Meals have been remained
14 intact by the 28 providers who have delivered home
15 delivered meals for the Department for the Aging for
16 the last 11 years. Alright, under those contracts.
17 That has not changed. That didn't change as a matter
18 of fact from the very beginning, we were working not
19 only with everyone to make sure, even as we
20 centralized food, to make sure that that home
21 delivered meal program was kept intact.

22 We have total – so those were never put at risk
23 and they were never transferred to anyone. They
24 remained, the 28 agencies that provided map outs.
25

1
2 What I want to also say is that yes, the demand
3 has increased as a result of post-COVID, during
4 COVID. But there is no one now that it is without a
5 home delivered meal because what we've done is if the
6 immediately identify themselves as food insecure, and
7 coverage for home delivered meals, we make sure that
8 GetFood provides that food until we work with the
9 case management agency to transfer them back.

10 If there are traditional home delivered meals
11 client, to try for them back to a home delivered meal
12 provider. So, I want to just make sure that we have
13 that clarity and that distinction between the two
14 programs, alright.

15 The other thing is that you know, I hear you and
16 we have taken every consideration but there is also
17 the programs need to be brought up to date and need
18 to come up with new practices. We have had programs
19 who have been in place now and as I said earlier, the
20 design was done in the 70's. The last time there was
21 an RFP was 11 years ago and it is time to start
22 employing new practices.

23 And also, the new needs of the new older person.
24 And one of the things that I want to say is that one
25 of the things that older adults have told us in these

1 surveys, in one of the surveys I shared with you,
2 that food choice is one of their biggest interests.
3 And with this new RFP, we're going to be able to do
4 that. I do think that there will be a richness and a
5 cross of collaboration amongst providers that would
6 bring us to this new place that we need to be. And
7 I'm going to ask Jose Mercado to please – how much
8 did we increase the home delivered meal cost in this
9 RFP?
10

11 JOSE MERCADO: Current rates that we're paying
12 currently, it's \$8.62. We're basically increasing it
13 to \$9.58.

14 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Okay.

15 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Is that on national average?

16 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: It's slightly below,
17 just slightly below.

18 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: So, why couldn't we get to
19 that? I mean, New York City, no matter what you do
20 things are more expensive. So, that is something
21 that you will have to take into consideration.

22 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: It's one of those
23 things that we will balance. Chairman Chin, we will
24 look at that very carefully, but then what the other
25 issue is you know, there is a number of meals shift

1 and so you have to look at all of that in its
2 totality but we will look at that exactly and
3 negotiate with the providers.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Well, I just wanted to ask
6 you, if you don't want to postpone it, at least push
7 it back to the fall and so the provider, I mean, they
8 are doing a lot of work at the time in this pandemic
9 and I think that they need, you know, they need more
10 support to do this. So, I hope that you will take
11 that into consideration.

12 And my last question is that you know, summer is
13 approaching and all of the senior centers are cooling
14 centers. So, what is DFTA looking at in terms making
15 sure that the seniors are protected during the
16 summer? Are they able to - if they can't go to the
17 cooling center, how do we make sure that they have
18 air conditioning and -

19 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: So, you know, we've
20 been looking at that also for several weeks now. We
21 continue with the - you know, we continue looking at
22 HVAC's at each one of the senior centers and making
23 sure that [INAUDIBLE 4:43:27]. We started in April,
24 the Emergency Management Review of each center and
25 that will be completed at the end of June and so, we

1
2 keep moving in that direction. However, we know that
3 social distancing guidance will remain with older
4 adults long than it will for the rest of the society
5 and that all congregate facilities currently are
6 under executive order to remain closed. And they
7 continue to be that way for the foreseeable future.

8 However, DFTA is currently doing a lot of prep
9 work to prepare for the transition to the heat system
10 and we're doing cooling survey's and we're also
11 working with the Office of Emergency Management to
12 come up with different scenarios and different ways
13 of addressing the individual, the heating crisis.
14 Hopefully, it won't be a crisis like last year but to
15 meeting the heating needs of older adults,
16 individually and collectively.

17 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: The air conditioning.

18 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: What?

19 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Air conditioning.

20 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: It's one of the things
21 we're looking at yes Madam.

22 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Chair Dromm, I'm going to turn
23 it back to you, so that other Council Members have a
24 change to ask question and I can come back later.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 221

CHAIPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and we'll
start with our first Council Member.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now here from Council
Member Vallone followed by Council Member Ayala.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So, it's the Mighty
Margaret and Dynamite Danny team with you
Commissioner. Thank you for all you are doing with
the seniors and always.

We're on chartered waters, so we look to you more
than ever and I know it's impossible to have all the
answers but seniors are scared and they are looking
to us more than ever for answers and relying on
different tools then they may have relied on in the
past. One of the things you mentioned since this is
what Margaret and I have been fighting for for years,
is that very first contact with seniors is usually
with that case management phone call, setting up the
file and doing the assessment.

And you just mentioned and it triggered to me
that now that you can't have that personal approach,
how do you feel we should handle that now? I know
from my own parents in my life, trying to get them on

1 a face time phone call or virtual Zoom is like trying
2 to create a whole new system.

3
4 So, it must be very demanding and challenging
5 because I know in reality a lot of our seniors
6 depending on their age can't do that. So, how are we
7 providing that service?

8 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Well, you are
9 absolutely right, the challenges have been tremendous
10 and trying to – and for us, as you heard me say
11 before, that social connection is essential for a
12 variety of reasons but mostly for older adults is
13 because we don't want to have the long term health
14 issues.

15 So, that first contact now is telephonic and is
16 it ideal? Absolutely not. Is it going to probably
17 be the way of the future? Maybe. Fortunately, for
18 us, all of us, is that even though with all of our
19 limitations, look how long it took me to sign on this
20 Zoom. It took me probably ten minutes longer than
21 the rest of you because I'm in that age group.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [INAUDIBLE 4:47:19].

23 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: But fortunately for all
24 of us, older adults do have cell phones and the
25 access to that cell phone. Now, the issue of us it

1 is one of the issues that Chairman Dromm raised
2 earlier and I think that you are alluding to now, is
3 how is it that we bring that technology in in a way
4 that is useful for older adults? How do we create
5 environments that it is user friendly? And how do we
6 create an environment where it's not impersonal and
7 that it still provides -

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: With that, you know
10 what, I think we probably touched on to something
11 that we can talk about again in the future and I know
12 we have limited time.

13 So, two quick things, one is let's follow up on
14 that. Two is, some of the community based providers
15 we're sending a special meal distribution that their
16 funding was cut very early in the whole COVID crisis
17 and really limited their ability to get Chinese and
18 Korean -

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And ethnic meals out to
21 that. I implore you to look maybe into the
22 partnership there, the funding to get them refunded
23 as quickly as possible and really look at raising the
24 reimbursement rate. Back in 2015, they were asking
25 for over \$11.50 for an undelivered meal. So, if now

1 we're going five years later at just \$9 or \$10, I
2 don't think we're going to meet that need because the
3 home delivered meal program as Margaret has been
4 saying all through the hearing, is so essential right
5 now because seniors are more forcibly homebound than
6 ever that we need to with this RFP, refocus that like
7 you've been doing but get some quick answers out and
8 work with our CDO's to get them the help they need.

10 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Yeah, I agree with you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.

12 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: And the other thing
13 that I want it personal, I just want to thank you for
14 bringing that up and we really have and we are taking
15 very seriously how is it that we're going to connect
16 in a personal same kind of heartfelt commitment, a
17 committed way that we've had in the past and some of
18 it may have to be virtual and how do we do that in a
19 meaningful way, so.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And transportation,
21 which I know Margaret and Danny are going to bring
22 up. Don't forget we have to figure out that too.

23 Thank you Chairs.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.

25 Next Council Member please.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 225

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
3 Member Ayala followed by Council Member Deutsch.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Hi, good afternoon. Good
6 afternoon Commissioner. I'd like to piggyback off of
7 Council Member Vallone's technology question. So,
8 this is Capital Commitment plan for Fiscal Year 2021
9 including \$1.8 million for technology network
10 upgrades and equipment purchases. Does the capital
11 plan include any funding to get tablets and other
12 technology in the hands of unconnected seniors?

13 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: We're looking at all of
14 that Council Member Ayala and unfortunately for us,
15 we had the opportunity to really see how that works
16 because we are part of the 10,000 tablets that are
17 going to NYCHA residents, NYCHA older residents and
18 we're very pleased to be part of that partnership and
19 we will have OATS, our senior planet technology
20 training program that is currently in 22 other
21 programs, designed programming for those 10,000
22 individuals.

23 So, it will inform us a lot on how to do that in
24 a way that brings the one, the greatest utility of
25 that equipment but also the greater connectivity.

1 So, they will be trained in a variety of things. You
2 know, some of the basics on how to use a tablet but
3 they also will be trained on you know, how to have
4 access to services. How to have more connectivity
5 with family and so, that really will inform how we
6 will look at our future and the distribution of
7 tablets.
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I just want to add and I
10 know that there has been a lot of attention to our
11 NYCHA seniors you know and as brightly so, but I
12 wanted just to you know, point out that we have a lot
13 of seniors. I know in my community in Section 202
14 Housing, that haven't really received the same levels
15 of attention from the community in terms of like food
16 distribution and resources because you know, a lot of
17 the attention is going specifically to NYCHA
18 residents and I'm not disputing that you know, that
19 that's necessary but I just want to you know, because
20 we've been getting a lot of complaints from Mitchell
21 Lama seniors and Section 202 older adults who would
22 like to be included in conversations relating to
23 distribution of PPE in the community, technology,
24 meal distribution and they just haven't been.
25

1
2 I don't know what the disconnect is. I will
3 assume that you know, some of them may not be
4 actively involved in a local senior center but they
5 are in the community and they are what we would
6 consider to be disconnected and we would like to
7 figure out a more creative way of engaging with them
8 as well.

9 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Yes, there is no
10 difference. We are totally aligned with that and
11 that this gives us the experience of how to now
12 expand those kinds of services.

13 Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I appreciate it, thank
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Our next Council Member
17 please.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
19 Member Deutsch followed by Council Member Barron.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Hi Commissioner, good
22 afternoon. How are you doing?

23 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Good, how are you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Good, pretty good. So,
25 I have three questions. Number one, what is

1 happening, you mentioned before that, the senior
2 centers, you don't see them going back to the way
3 they were before. So, how much funding went directly
4 to the senior centers and what's happening with the
5 funding for the senior centers? And number two, are
6 you going to utilize the people that ran the senior
7 centers throughout the years who have the experience
8 to continue working with the seniors throughout the
9 year? And number three, and the City Council have
10 been speaking about summer youth, how we can find
11 creative ways through our young adults to work
12 throughout the summer.

14 So, are you open to having young adults make
15 house calls to senior citizens and to get that
16 information back to you? Like if you have a senior
17 who has no family living in this state or maybe some
18 seniors have no family at all, identify those who are
19 most vulnerable and need that extra attention?

20 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I just want to clarify,
21 when I said that it will be different than what we
22 may know them to have been in the past, I was talking
23 not about the elimination of senior centers. Senior
24 Centers are essential. I think it's the way we
25 deliver services there. The social distancing. How

1 are we going to do that? Do we do more virtual
2 programming? If we do, what are the class sizes?
3 How many seating's will we have to do now if we have
4 to take extra precautions. Do we have to give face
5 masks to everyone who comes in? Do we have to take
6 temperatures to ensure the safety of everyone of
7 those seniors. That's what I'm talking about. It's
8 going to be a new normal for us. It is not the
9 elimination of senior centers, we will always have,
10 the only way you can provide these services in
11 community, because we believe in community services,
12 is through a network of providers.

14 So, that is never in question. It is the how,
15 not the where or the whom. Alright, so I want to
16 make that distinction. The funding for our senior
17 centers in the past - well, funding for senior
18 centers is \$173 million of the Executive Budget goes
19 to senior centers.

20 And for your last question about
21 intergenerational programming, it is something that
22 we currently do. It is something that many of the
23 programs currently do and in addition to
24 intergenerational, we also think that older
25 volunteers are an essential part.

1 So, it is something that we constantly look at.
2
3 All of the different ways that we could enhance and
4 enrich services to older adults.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Are you ruling out
6 working with the young adults during the summer?

7 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: We're not ruling
8 anything out. What we have to do is first find out
9 if we will be able to open the senior centers in the
10 summer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No, I'm speaking about
12 having -

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Having young adults
15 making phone calls and reaching out to seniors who
16 are at home, not seniors at seniors centers.

17 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Yes, of course, yes we
18 welcome all of the volunteers. As a matter of fact,
19 there is 1.6 million people that have to be reached
20 out to. We welcome all volunteers, yes, including
21 young adults.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you so much.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Council
24 Member. We will go to our next Council Member
25 please.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 231

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
3 Member Barron followed by Council Member Adams.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Council Member
6 Dromm, Chairman Dromm for holding the hearing and
7 thank you Commissioner.

8 I've heard you say - can you hear me?

9 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I can hear you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay -

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Barron, excuse
12 me. Somebody is not on mute. If they could mute
13 themselves, please. Thank you. Council Member
14 Barron, please continue.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. What did you
16 say was the budget for the Department of the Aging?

17 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: The budget for the
18 Department for the Aging is \$386 million.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what is the portion
20 for the meals?

21 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: It depends, if I add
22 both the home delivered meals and the senior center,
23 the budget is about \$2 million, let me do my math
24 here, \$2 million, \$2 million 12, \$2 million 15,
25 something around there.

1
2 So, the bulk of the budget goes for meals?

3 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Yes, that's the heart
4 of the program.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, so what percentage
6 of seniors are actually captured in a database that
7 the Aging Department has? What percentage of the
8 total number of people who are considered seniors are
9 captured in your database?

10 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Well, I can answer that
11 in a different way, alright. So, there are \$1.6
12 million people over the age of 60 in the City of New
13 York. In our congregate sites, the senior centers as
14 they commonly call, about 21,000 to 25,000 is the
15 average daily attendance and in our home delivered
16 meals program, excuse me, it's about \$18,000. So, in
17 total, it's somewhere around 40,000-43,000
18 individuals.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, so is there any way
20 that you can think of that we can expand a way to
21 find out how many, where other seniors are living,
22 what kinds of needs they may have beyond those who of
23 their own volition are participating in senior
24 programs and home meals?

25

1
2 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I think that that has
3 been an effort that we looked at over the years at
4 the Department for the Aging. It's my understanding
5 because there is a variety of categories and some
6 people do not like going to the senior center.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right.

8 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: That's why we're
9 looking at new ways. You know the NORC's, people who
10 go to the NORC's, don't sometimes go the senior
11 center, so there is a variety of interest and which
12 is why we are trying to bring these programs up to
13 current state, so that we can make them more
14 inclusive and more expansive and look at some of
15 those designs.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think that's important
17 because there are other folks who are 60 and older
18 who have all kinds of needs that we're not
19 necessarily aware of and I do have a bill that talks
20 about trying to capture the data for those who are 60
21 and older who are residents in private developments
22 and who are facing perhaps evictions, which we know
23 is a major issue now that we're talking about this
24 COVID crisis.

1
2 And that would there be a way to give them the
3 support that they need and if they don't have other
4 family members or agencies working with them.

5 So, if we can be really creative and find a way
6 to put — of their own. They would have to do it
7 voluntarily to put themselves in this database. They
8 may have reasons to not want to be in the data but
9 certainly we want to try to offer them that
10 opportunity to at least let me know where they are
11 and we can do that kind of outreach because I think
12 it's great that we have 40,000 out of that 1.6
13 million. There is more than a million people that we
14 don't have any information.

15 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Absolutely, absolutely
16 and that's the average but when we look at people who
17 have been touched by one of the Departments for the
18 Aging services and I want to — whether it's case
19 management and all of the other services, it goes up
20 to 200 and about 40,000 which you are absolutely
21 right, it is a small percentage of the 1.6 million
22 and I think of all of the people who go to the Y.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

24 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: For their activities.
25 Alright, so, yes, you are absolutely right.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 235

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Good, I think my time
3 must be up. I didn't see a clock.

4 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I saw the clock and I
5 stopped.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, it's not on my
7 screen. Thank you so much.

8 CHAIPRERSON DROMM: Thank you again, next Council
9 Member please.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
11 Member Adams followed by Council Member Ampry-Samuel.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much. Thank
14 you Chairs Dromm and Chair Chin for having this
15 hearing today.

16 Commissioner, it's always such a pleasure to see
17 your smiling face.

18 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: It gives me the warms on
20 the inside, so thank you.

21 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Ah thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you for your
23 partnership, particularly with us in Southeast
24 Queens. You know the difficulties that we've been
25 through for just about a year now, so thank you.

1 Thank you Jose as well for your partnership in
2 handling particularly just BOA and now our Alan
3 Senior Center very carefully. So, my deep
4 appreciations for that.
5

6 And going just back to what the Chair, what Chair
7 Dromm spoke about with NORC's. We know that NORC's
8 are very, very significant and important for our
9 seniors for senior living. What analysis has DFTA
10 conducted to determine which areas of the city have a
11 large senior population but no existing NORC or a
12 neighborhood NORC program?

13 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you for that.
14 Part of the research that we're doing right now is to
15 look at one, the definition of what we say, we're on
16 the senior services desert. You know, we've talked
17 about food deserts and we talked about it. And so,
18 we're looking at where they are senior service
19 deserts and where the clusters are and we've noticed
20 and we are looking to address that. We noticed that
21 there is a high concentration of centers but people
22 have moved out of those particular areas and then how
23 can balance that. But you are absolutely right,
24 we've been studying that now for about nine months,
25 since I've been at the Department and coming up with

1
2 a plan hopefully, with the future senior center RFP
3 should get out of this COVID and start looking in
4 that direction. As well as, looking at the expansion
5 of some of the ethnic and cultural programs that the
6 Council has funded. Looking at the inclusion of all
7 of that to address some of these service deserts are
8 the best way I can describe them.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you Commissioner.
10 Also, I'm going to get one more in. You know, I have
11 a new senior housing going up in my district,
12 Northeastern Towers Annex and Northeastern Towers was
13 really not connected to any city senior service
14 program.

15 So, we've got a number of new senior developments
16 going up across through the administration. Which
17 senior residents have lacked senior services and how
18 does DFTA actually monitor this because we know,
19 especially for us, for my district, it took us a hard
20 time to try to figure that out last month in how to
21 get food to them, how to bring food to them. There
22 was just a tremendous disconnect for my seniors that
23 did not have senior services.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.
25

1
2 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: It's one of those
3 areas, can I answer the question? Chairman Dromm,
4 can I answer the question?

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes. I had to unmute myself
6 here.

7 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Yeah, so Council Member
8 Adams, it's one of those areas that we're looking at.
9 We have some examples; we have one in Council Member
10 Diana Ayala's which was does designed without a
11 senior center considered for it and then we looked at
12 moving senior centers to those developments. It's
13 part of the plan that we're looking at in terms of
14 addressing some of those service deserts.

15 You know, one of the new locations sometimes they
16 are much better equipped than some of the other
17 locations and we've done that with Sage in Brooklyn
18 and Sage in the Bronx. So, there is a model for us
19 to look at those kind of things.

20 So, the answer to that is, stay in touch, we will
21 keep working at it and looking at it alright. Thank
22 you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you Commissioner.

24 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 239

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, let's go to our next
3 Council Member.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
5 Member Ampry-Samuel followed by Council Member
6 Gibson.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you Chair
9 Dromm and good afternoon Commissioner. Thank you
10 first of all for being one of the few Commissioners
11 in the city's administration to actually take my
12 calls and a willingness to always reach out to
13 discuss. We can literally help and save the seniors
14 in our district, even on Sundays.

15 So, I thank you for that and I appreciate the
16 time and your commitment to our seniors.

17 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I remember that Sunday
18 very well. It was a painful Sunday for both of us.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: It really was.

20 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: But we came up with
21 very good solutions because we have a good provider,
22 so thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you. I want
24 to add my voice to Council Member Ayala's comments
25 about all of the other seniors in our district that

1 do not live in NYCHA developments and we just have to
2 make sure that we are planning for all seniors. So,
3 I just wanted to say that but as the Chair of the
4 public Housing Committee and as you know I have a
5 considerable number of senior developments and senior
6 centers and social clubs and Chair Chin asked about
7 the \$10 million for the senior centers. My question
8 focus is on the social clubs because you know, I had
9 the three infamous -
10

11 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I remember that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: The Administrations
13 2019 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, the PMMR
14 data showed that NYCHA's social clubs remain very
15 popular with 132 percent utilization in 2018, and
16 then 142 percent utilization the first four months of
17 Fiscal 2019 and 133 percent in the first four months
18 of Fiscal Year 2020. That FY20 data interesting is
19 even as DFTA was preparing to take over management of
20 all formally NYCHA operated clubs.

21 Five of the ten clubs that were part of the PEG
22 restoration in Fiscal 2020 were previously operated
23 by DFTA providers, not NYCHA itself. Are these clubs
24 safe in Fiscal 2021? And five clubs formally
25 operated by NYCA are now operated by DFTA and have

1
2 Fiscal 2020 funding only. Will DFTA promise not to
3 cut these onsite clubs in Fiscal 2021? And do all
4 the social clubs at some point have management? I
5 know that things are different right now at this
6 moment, but have they been assigned managers?

7 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: So, thank you for the
8 question. It's something that we grapple with all
9 the time. I never forget my first hearing were I was
10 so bold and brash and said yes, we need to cut these
11 programs and all of beat me up and I took a step back
12 and said oh, maybe not. And now, we have - we had a
13 great transition, transition process in place.

14 Each one of them has some affiliation with an
15 existing program. So, they are not in isolation
16 anymore, so they are attached to an existing service
17 program and we'll continue to do that.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

19 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I could continue the
20 answer, right. We are looking at that for the future
21 and we are well aware that the funding was given just
22 to July. I mean, to the end of June and we're
23 looking at that very carefully.

1
2 And should anything change, we will make sure
3 that we get back to the respective Council Members
4 immediately, but the goal is to continue those.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Let's go to our
6 next Council Member.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
8 Member Gibson followed by Council Member Rosenthal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so much. Thank
10 you Chair Dromm.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And thank you Chair Chin
13 for always being a champion and advocate for our
14 older New Yorkers.

15 Good afternoon Commissioner to you and the DFTA
16 team. It's great to talk to you today about DFTA's
17 budget. Understanding the challenging times, we're
18 living in, I appreciate a lot of the conversations we
19 have had as we rolled out food services and access
20 for our seniors. It was a bumpy start and we could
21 all acknowledge and there have been a series of
22 changes and amendments and expansions along the way.
23 But I have heard from many seniors that they are
24 receiving the deliveries of food, the quality is
25

1 better, the quantity has also increased and I'm
2 grateful for that.
3

4 I wonder how long we're going to continue with
5 this home delivered option and Commissioner Garcia,
6 on one of her weekly calls with us has expressed that
7 the city is going to now reinstitute it's
8 conversations with our senior center directors.

9 Which I'm grateful for because I was not happy that
10 we kind of pushed them out of the conversation when
11 we left the grab and go process but they are the ones
12 on the ground that know seniors the best and the
13 continuity of services is important. So, I wonder
14 what that looks like moving forward as we are
15 rebounding from COVID?

16 And then the second question I have is about the
17 health and wellness of seniors and what we're doing
18 to focus on mental health, therapeutic services,
19 trauma informed care. A lot of our older New Yorkers
20 are very isolated and we're not always checking on
21 them by a door to door visit. Alicka and I have been
22 doing a lot of work with NYCHA because we have been
23 pushing them to do more on getting access to seniors.
24 Because in our districts alone, some of our seniors
25 were found deceased in their apartments because no

1 one checked on them. And that was very disturbing
2 that we lost seniors because we allowed them to fall
3 through the cracks.
4

5 So, what I want to understand moving forward in
6 this budget, is how we're going to do more beyond the
7 teleconference and health and wellness checks.
8 Reengaging our CBO's on the ground to make sure that
9 there is a relationship and a real dialogue beyond a
10 phone call.

11 I mean, you understand that the human contact is
12 very important and how can the City Council be
13 helpful for you? Someone mentioned air conditioning
14 and I agree. Seniors can't afford it, so we, DFTA,
15 NYCHA, all of the agencies have to find a way to
16 embark on a public private partnership possibly to
17 get air conditioners donated, so we can give them to
18 our seniors.

19 Because I think during a hot summer, when they
20 are in their apartments, not going out, we need to
21 make sure that we can provide as much relief as
22 possible.

23 So, I thank you for your work. Looking forward
24 to our continued work and thank you so much to the
25 Chairs.

1
2 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you. So, let me
3 try to answer those questions to the best of my
4 ability.

5 From the very beginning, we saw this transition -

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

7 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: To direct delivery.
8 It's essential, it's the guidance. Seniors need to
9 stay home and we knew that we had to transition to a
10 direct service because there was a lot of impact on
11 the actual senior center staff.

12 All along in my early conversations with the
13 centers, we've always thought about how we transition
14 it back, so that they could provide the meals
15 directly at the local level.

16 I think the Food Czar and I and all of us are
17 aligned with that for two reasons. One, it provides
18 community support. It builds on that community
19 support. It stimulates the economic strength of that
20 particular community.

21 So, it's something that we're looking at. It is
22 something that she is committed to and we're
23 committed to doing together in a way that continues
24 to ensure the safety of the older adults and the
25 shelter of distancing has required.

1
2 So, we work arm and arm in these kind of arenas
3 and we are comfortable that we will come back with a
4 solution that works best for all. Particularly our
5 older adults in our community providers, right.

6 As far as, you are absolutely right, there is
7 nothing like human touch. There is nothing like a
8 personal contact. However, in this new world that we
9 live in now, we don't know when we can resume that
10 but I am really, really pleased that we have wellness
11 check case management.

12 There are about, the senior centers are calling
13 on an average about 16,000 members a day. Case
14 Management continued, all of the senior centers are
15 offering free virtual and online classes.

16 All of that is to make sure that there is some
17 connection. Does it replace 100 percent of human
18 touch? No, but it is the world that we're living in
19 now. But we continue to have our geriatric mental
20 health services. There is always NYC Help that is
21 there for all of us. Elder abuse services, if you
22 notice, we just started an elder abuse campaign
23 because we are concerned that there is the isolation
24 may have an uptick in elder abuse services. So, we
25 started a new campaign letting people know that they

1 should reach us and we continue to provide our
2 caregiver support. Because in this time of social
3 isolation and social distancing, our caregivers find
4 themselves even more at burden than before.
5

6 So, all of those services have continued. They
7 continue virtually, they continue on the phone. I
8 know it will never replace the human touch but it is
9 the new reality in which we live.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, thank you.

11 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: You're welcome.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Next Council Member please.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
14 Member Rosenthal followed by Council Member
15 Grodenchik.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thanks so much. You
17 know Commissioner, had I known that I could reach you
18 by cell over the weekend, you would have heard from
19 me.

20 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: You have my cell
21 number. You have it.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Listen, I want to
23 explain three different things that are confusing,
24 that's going on in my district.
25

1
2 The first is that going back to Council Member
3 Chin's point about rushing the, DFTA rushing the food
4 contract, my local nonprofit which had been providing
5 senior homebound meals, has already been told that
6 they will not get the subcontract again and therefore
7 they are in the process of laying off staff.

8 So, by tightening the amount of money OMB is
9 allowing per meal or by going to a broader contract
10 rather than these individualized programs, we are now
11 adding to the number of jobless and I'm wondering,
12 this is my first question but I'm going to try to get
13 all three out. I'm wondering if you are hearing
14 about those realities.

15 Secondly, the system for feeding our seniors has
16 changed so many times since the beginning of this
17 crisis. And these are older adults as everyone has
18 said, that attend senior centers and can pay \$0.50 or
19 \$1.00 for lunch and then they get a second one they
20 bring it home for dinner. Now, they are homebound
21 and I have a staffer who is now spending all her time
22 trying to understand whatever the new system for food
23 distribution is for this week and then communicate it
24 with the three local senior center program directors
25 who are desperate to get their seniors fed.

1
2 So, last night, my centers were all so confused
3 with this newest roll out of get food for seniors,
4 that I had an emergency food meeting, Zoom call at
5 7:00 p.m. with the Senior Center Provider Director's,
6 Program Staff, their Finance Staff, their Contract
7 Staff as well as someone from City Hall to make sure
8 all of their questions were answered.

9 And I walked away thinking that perhaps I
10 understood the role of the senior centers in this new
11 GetFood Program. But in answer to a question by
12 Council Member Chin, your explanation of the GetFood
13 Program put me in a tailspin. I'm confused again
14 about how we're getting food to these vulnerable
15 seniors. Can I ask you to commit to finding a way to
16 clarify around these programs for senior centers. To
17 clarify to everyone how the program works, so we can
18 get our seniors fed?

19 And the third point, and this came up on the call
20 last night -

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: NYCHA has now asked
23 two of my senior centers to be the staging location
24 for boxes of food that the centers are now
25 responsible for delivering to NYCHA senior buildings.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 250

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member, can you wrap
3 up?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And staff time. Thank
5 you, almost done but there is no indication that they
6 will get reimbursed for these last minute deliveries
7 and meanwhile, in other districts that don't have
8 senior centers, the city is paying for phone meal
9 delivery.

10 All three things are confounding to me. Thank
11 you.

12 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: I want to just first
13 correct - I just wanted to clarify, there is no one
14 who has said that a home delivered meal program is
15 not going to operate. That is not accurate.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It's already been
17 done. Encore has cut the subcontract for Goddard
18 Riverside.

19 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Encore and Goddard
20 Riverside have a relationship -

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's been mended.

22 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: And we will look into
23 that and find out but the senior center program of
24 Encore has not ended and they will continue to
25 provide home delivered meals.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: They are not in the
3 contract anymore but let's take it offline.

4 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Well, no, but I want to
5 be real clear that that is - the home delivered meals
6 contract with Encore continues. If there is a reason
7 why Encore is choosing not to contract with Goddard
8 Riverside, we can look into that number one.

9 Number two, as far as the feeding of seniors has
10 shifted. Yes, it shifted from grab and go and it is
11 now a direct meal delivery and now it's shifted to
12 Food Czar.

13 All of those things were necessary, one, because
14 of scale. Two, because of you know, the guidance
15 that we were given by the -

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No question, no
17 question. All I'm asking for is clarity.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright folks, you know, I
19 think we're going to have to take this offline
20 because I do have other Council Members and I have a
21 hearing that we're already behind on.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you
23 Commissioner.

24 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: So, Councilman Dromm,
25 Chairman Dromm, I just want to put out there, 500

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 252

1 senior center staff have been trained to be trusted
2 under the GetFood program.

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You can say it, it's
5 not true. You can say it.

6 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Alright, let me take
7 that offline but there are 500 people that have been
8 trained to be trusted enrollers under GetFood and
9 that is one of the principle ways of accessing
10 GetFood. And if you want, we can go in detail and
11 show you the correspondence that has been given to
12 all -

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: All of my programs are
14 now going through a retraining.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, thank you both,
16 we're going to move on to our next Council Member.

17 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
19 Member Grodenchik followed by Council Member Treyger.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Chair Dromm
22 and thank you Chair Chin. [INAUDIBLE 5:22:11]

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Grodenchik, we
24 can't hear you. Council Member Grodenchik?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Can you hear me now?

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, now we can.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Chairs. I started off by saying nice things about you both but it's too late now.

I want to first associate myself with Councilman Chair Dromm's remarks about NORC's. They are extremely important in my district Commissioner in eastern Queens. In some way I'd like to think that my entire district is one large NORC and it is not uncommon to find people like my aunt who moved to Bellerose in 1948 and still lives with 72 years in the same house and that is the kind of community that I have in eastern Queens.

I also want to say that we love our virtual senior centers. I have gotten raves from people about them and I've been happy to help fund them to the extent that we can working with SNAP and working with Self Help. So, that is wonderful and I know that a Commonpoint, the Sam Field Center has that as well.

I also have to though talk about in a second what Chair Margaret Chin said. My centers are dealing with like everybody else a catastrophe and my providers run excellent programs but into the breach,

1 they all had to step – at one of my centers alone,
2 they added 300 for the seniors or 2 seniors living
3 together onto the food lists.
4

5 The other center added hundreds as well and I
6 keep in regular touch of course like all my
7 colleagues do with our Senior Center Directors and a
8 lot of that money came out of pocket and I hope that
9 DFTA and the Administration will give some
10 consideration to refunding that.

11 You know, those dollars are so hard to come by.
12 I do not represent a poor community but I do not
13 represent a very, very wealthy community and it is
14 hard for these programs to raise money privately.

15 So, I hope that the city will take into
16 consideration in some way the fact that my senior
17 centers and many around the city did not let people
18 go hungry while we were dealing with a crisis and I
19 know it's not easy to get a bureaucracy to shift from
20 going this way to going that way and I appreciate
21 that. So, I do want to associate myself with Chair
22 Chin's remarks and like my colleague Paul Vallone and
23 others such as I guess it would be Daneek Miller's in
24 Queens and Adrienne Adams and Donovan, you know, it
25 can be a long way to get to food in my district.

1 It's not unusual for me to go - for me to walk to a
2 food store easily a mile round trip. In some cases,
3 depending on which direction they go, it could be two
4 miles.

5
6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Okay, I thank you and
8 I do want to say one last thing. Our seniors, I
9 deliver food, I try to do it at least once a week,
10 they are scared and they don't want to go out and
11 most of them don't want to see me. They say, leave
12 the food outside, I'll come and get it.

13 So, that's what I do but it is terrifying for
14 them. So, thank you for your work Commissioner.
15 Thank you Chairs.

16 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you. I just want
17 to first of all thank you. It is terrifying out
18 there. You know, I belong to that cohort you know
19 and it is terrifying. I have to make choices you
20 know, even with my 90-year-old mother.

21 So, it is terrifying and you have to make those
22 decisions but I want to just address your issue about
23 your concern for the nonprofits and those who
24 continue to provide excellent services and some of
25

1
2 yours do provide excellent services. I concur with
3 you.

4 The Office of, the Mayor's Office of Contracts,
5 issued a memorandum on March 18th, which outlined how
6 programs would be covered during between now and July
7 30th and then they recently issued another guidance
8 on making sure that we continue to provide - or cover
9 the cost for those programs who provided extreme
10 services during this COVID.

11 So, there will - and Jose Mercado has been in
12 contact with all of our programs basically asking
13 them to have a voucher, so that those could be under
14 COVID costs and so, that we could make sure that we
15 cover all of those under the emergency plan.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you
17 Commissioner.

18 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: You are welcome.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I will check back
20 with those agencies. Thank you very much.

21 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Please do, please do
22 and if there is any issue, please call me alright.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Absolutely. Thank
24 you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 257

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Very good. I think we have
3 two Council Members left and then we are going to go
4 directly into the Sanitation Committee hearing.

5 Next Council Member please.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
7 Member Treyger followed by Council Member Louis.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you to Chair's
10 Chin and Dromm. Commissioner, thank you for your
11 time today. I'm interested in knowing just for point
12 of clarification for our knowledge. Whose decision
13 was it in terms of signing up the seniors through the
14 website with four or five pages of questions online
15 in size ten font, that required them to have an email
16 address, when my office literally had to help many
17 immigrant senior citizens in southern Brooklyn enroll
18 individually every single person to get deliveries on
19 a consistent basis. Just for our own knowledge,
20 whose decision was that to require 90-year-old senior
21 citizens who don't have internet access, who don't
22 have email accounts, to set one up in order to
23 receive meal delivery?

24 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Sir, I'm not sure
25 exactly the enrollment process that you are talking

1 about, because the 44,000 individuals that were part
2 of the senior centers, that included many, many – it
3 includes the 300 that Treyger said that his, I mean,
4 that Council Member has said that were added to the
5 rosters. Those individuals were transferred
6 seamlessly to the GetFood program and then those
7 people did not have to reregister.
8

9 If someone were not part of at 44,000, there was
10 a registration process and I can say that we've
11 worked very closely with the GetFood team and the
12 food Czar Kathryn Garcia and 500 senior center staff
13 have been trained to be entrusted enrollers, so that
14 they could enroll individuals in those programs.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, I am referring to
16 those seniors who were not enrolled in any senior
17 center but needed emergency food assistance. It's
18 important to know this because we need to understand
19 that not every senior citizen speak perfect English.
20 Not every senior citizen has an email account or is
21 comfortable with technology and I thought the system
22 really, we literally had to sign up hundreds of
23 people, creating email accounts for them. It was a
24 system that we never really should see again and I do
25 think that some folks who came in from the City Hall

1 team were able to transition many of those and I
2 thank the City Hall team for assisting them but it's
3 important that we note this moving forward.
4

5 Just before my time expires, we will do
6 everything we can to support Chair Chin, Chair Dromm
7 to protect the safety net of seniors. This is the
8 safety net food for our seniors but also, dealing
9 with the issue of social isolation. Making sure that
10 we double down on support for our senior providers
11 that no one is left alone and do it in a culturally
12 responsive way.

13 So, I want to leave on that note and thank you
14 for your time here today.

15 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you. We share
16 that same common commitment. Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
18 Member Louis.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins now.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Good afternoon everyone.
21 Thank you so much Chairs Chin and Dromm for your
22 leadership. Thank you so much Commissioner for your
23 time.

24 I have one quick question, because the majority
25 of my questions were already answered. I'm trying to

1 find out what should organizations do with their
2 remaining accruals that they have left for the rest
3 of Fiscal Year 20? It's not clear from the program
4 managers at DFTA what they should be doing with the
5 remaining funds due to the pandemic.
6

7 So, if we could get some information about what
8 should they do with that remaining amount of money,
9 that would be helpful. Thank you.

10 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Right, we issued, there
11 were two guidance's issued by the Mayor's Office of
12 Contract Services and the Department for the Aging's
13 Fiscal operation through our Chief Fiscal Officer,
14 just issued a new directive for helping people with
15 the close out and how to distinguish emergency COVID
16 dollars from regular operating dollars.

17 So, I hope that that clarifies that and if not,
18 please feel free to reach out to us, so that we can
19 provide you know, some personalized assistance to
20 whomever it is that that's not clear.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you.

22 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Your welcome.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I believe this is our
24 last Council Member, if I'm not mistaken?

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: That's correct Chair.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 261

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Would you like to call him?

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Dromm, no other Council
4 Members have raised their hands.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sorry. I thought there
6 was another one. Okay, thank you and let me just
7 read this conclusion then.

8 This will conclude this portion of today's
9 hearing. Thank you DFTA for being here and
10 Commissioner, thank you for being here, we really
11 appreciate it.

12 We will now go directly into our hearing on the
13 Department of Sanitation and I ask my colleagues who
14 will be joining us for DSNY's portion of the hearing
15 to remain in the Zoom with your microphone muted
16 until we are ready to begin.

17 Thank you again Commissioner.

18 LORRAINE CORTES-VASQUEZ: Thank you so much.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Dromm, it appears that
20 Chair Chin has a question.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Oh, I'm sorry. Chair Chin?

22 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I apologize.

24 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Okay, I cannot let the
25 Commissioner leave without asking a question about

1
2 all those private social adult daycares that were
3 closed down. I know that DFTA started registering
4 them and so, and also in our Preliminary Budget
5 hearing, I remember you were talking about your staff
6 who is going to be visiting 600 congregated
7 facilities and that included some of the – I mean,
8 included the social adult daycare.

9 So, we have to ombudsperson, are they working
10 now? Are they checking on these social adult
11 daycares that shut down? You know, they abandoned
12 all the seniors. That's what we have heard. So, is
13 DFTA checking on them and making sure that the
14 seniors that they've been working with don't get left
15 out? Commissioner?

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, it appears that the
17 Commissioner might have logged off the webinar.

18 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: How about the Finance
19 Director?

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Mr. Mercado, would you like
21 to answer that?

22 JOSE MERCADO: We will get back to you on that.
23 I don't really know the answer right now.

CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yes, please get back to us
because there were over 300 private social adult
daycares and they totally abandoned our seniors.

So, we want to make sure that they are
accountable. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, and this has been a very
big issue for a long period of time. I was on Aging
with Chair Chin and I see the proliferation of the
social adult day centers all over and they are not
DFTA adult day centers.

So, we definitely want a follow up on this
question.

JOSE MERCADO: I will, I will, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Okay, we will go
directly into - I'm sorry, okay, we will go directly
into our DSNY portion.

Thank you Mr. Mercado. Are we ready to begin?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes Chair, we are ready.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, very good. Let me
gavel us in. [GAVEL]

Okay, good afternoon and welcome to the City
Council's third day of hearing's on the Mayor's
Executive Budget for Fiscal 2021.

1 My name is Daniel Dromm and I Chair the Finance
2 Committee. We are joined by the Committee on
3 Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, chaired by my
4 colleague Council Member Antonio Reynoso and we will
5 hear from the Department of Sanitation.
6

7 I would like to acknowledge my colleagues who are
8 here with us in this portion of the hearing. So,
9 they are, Council Members Gibson, Adams, Ampry-
10 Samuel, Rose, Ayala, Barron, Brannan, Yeger,
11 Koslowitz, Powers, Gjonaj, Vallone, Holden, Matteo,
12 Louis, Grodenchik, Treyger, Cohen, Cabrera, and
13 Rosenthal.

14 Okay, in the interest of time, I will forego
15 giving an opening statement but I'm going to turn it
16 over to our Committee Counsel to go over some
17 procedural items before we hear from Council Member
18 Reynoso.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. My name is
20 Stephanie Ruiz and I am Counsel to the New York City
21 Council's Committee on Finance.

22 Before we begin, I want to remind everyone that
23 you will be on mute until you are recognized to
24 speak. At which time, you will be unmuted by the
25 Zoom host. During the hearing, if Council Members

1 would like to ask a question, please use the Zoom
2 raise hand function and you will be added into the
3 queue.
4

5 Thank you and I will now turn it over to Council
6 Member Reynoso.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Reynoso.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, hello everyone. Good
9 afternoon, first, I just want to thank Council Member
10 Danny Dromm. You are hanging in there, thank you for
11 going through all of this grueling you know, marathon
12 version of these hearings. I can only imagine if you
13 ever need to take a break or step back, please do so.
14 Thank you so much. I'm extremely grateful for all
15 your work and everyone should be.

16 I want to thank everyone. I'm Antonio Reynoso,
17 the Chair of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid
18 Waste. Today, we will hear from the Department of
19 Sanitation on its Fiscal Year 2021 Executive Budget,
20 which total \$1.75 billion.

21 I was not pleased to see such a drastic proposed
22 cut to the Departments Executive Budget. There is no
23 question we face a crippling budget shortfall this
24 year and we must achieve budget savings. However, we
25 must not repeat the mistakes that caused the COVID

1
2 crisis to hit our city so hard. We did not prepare
3 for this pandemic – I’m sorry, we did not prepare for
4 this pandemic. Sorry.

5 The city must remain committed to zero waste by
6 2030 and take bold action against climate change
7 while simultaneously battling COVID-19, ensuring the
8 diversion of food waste, hazardous waste and e-waste
9 is essential to reaching the city’s goal.

10 Unfortunately, this budget does not reflect with the
11 Council’s priorities and I’m sure the values of many
12 New Yorkers.

13 I’m looking forward to having the discussion with
14 you on that today Commissioner. Now, I’ll pass it
15 back to Chair Danny Dromm.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we’ve been joined by
17 Council Member Chin as well. Thank you for being
18 with us or for staying with us.

19 I will now call on the members of the Department
20 of Sanitation to testify. We will hear testimony
21 from Commissioner Kathryn Garcia. Commissioner
22 Garcia is joined by First Deputy Commissioner Steven
23 Costas, Assistant Commissioner Gregory Anderson, and
24 Deputy Commissioner Bridget Anderson.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 267

2 Will the Committee Counsel please administer the
3 affirmation.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I will administer
5 the affirmation one time and you will be called on
6 individually to so affirm at the end.

7 Do you affirm that your testimony will be
8 truthful to the best of your knowledge, information,
9 and belief Commissioner Garcia?

10 KATHRYN GARCIA: I do.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: First Deputy Costas?

12 STEVEN COSTAS: I do.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Assistant Commissioner
14 Anderson?

15 GREGORY ANDERSON: I do.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Deputy Commissioner
17 Anderson?

18 BRIDGET ANDERSON: I do.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Commissioner
20 Garcia, you may begin when ready.

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: Good afternoon Chair Dromm,
22 Chair Reynoso, and members of the City Council
23 Committees on Finance and Sanitation and Solid Waste
24 Management.

25

1 We are in unprecedented times here in New York
2 City. This crisis has taken a devastating toll on
3 our families, our communities, and our way of life.
4 I would like to extend my sincere wished for the
5 continued safety of you and your families and staff
6 and my deepest condolences to those of you have lost
7 a family member, friend, or colleague to this
8 terrible disease.
9

10 Sadly, like many of our sister agencies and
11 partners in government, the Department has also been
12 personally affected by COVID-19. Since the beginning
13 of March, we have had 622 employees test positive for
14 this disease and hundreds of others who have had
15 COVID symptoms. We have also lost six employees and
16 had four other DSNY employees pass away during this
17 time whose deaths may have been COVID related. Each
18 of them leave behind friends, family and colleagues
19 and we mourn their loss.

20 While the toll of this epidemic has been
21 unimaginable, there are signs of hope. Of our 622
22 employees who had tested positive, 66 percent have
23 returned to work. And throughout the duration of
24 this crisis, we have continued to provide our
25 essential trash and recycling collection services

1 across the city with only isolated and minor delays.

2 This is really a testament to the dedication, courage
3 and commitment of our Sanitation Workers, uniformed
4 officers, trades men and women, and other essential
5 staff. Without them, our public health emergency
6 would be multiple times worse. I would also like to
7 thank them for their efforts during this time. They
8 are truly New York's strongest.
9

10 New York City has been the epicenter of the
11 COVID-19 outbreak. It has dramatically upended all
12 our lives, and the economic fallout is unprecedented.
13 This Fiscal Year 2021 Executive Budget reflects our
14 new reality. As with all other agencies, the
15 Department has been forced to make some very
16 difficult cuts, including to programs and initiatives
17 that I and many of you have fought for, and programs
18 that are important to many New Yorkers. But these
19 cuts are necessary to continue core government
20 operations and to devote resources to essential
21 safety, health, and shelter, and food security needs.

22 The Fiscal 2021 Executive Budget includes \$1.75
23 billion expense funding for the Department. Between
24 Fiscal 2020 and 2021, this plan includes a total of
25 \$106.5 million in savings, including \$45.2 million in

1 Fiscal 2021. These savings include the following
2 service cuts: \$21.1 million due to the one year
3 suspension of the organics collection program; \$9.3
4 million from the reduction of litter basket service,
5 collection service related to the rat mitigation
6 initiative, syringe collection and other cleaning
7 programs; \$3.5 million for the elimination of the
8 curbside e-waste collection program; \$3.5 million
9 from a one year reduction in funding for our New York
10 City Compost Project partners; \$2.9 million in
11 reduced annual recycling outreach for GrowNYC; and
12 \$2.2 million for a one year suspension of special
13 waste and household hazards waste collection
14 programs.
15

16 These cuts are painful and I do not take them
17 lightly. The suspension of the curbside organics
18 occurred on May 4th. It is particularly difficult
19 for me. I look forward to a day in the future when
20 we can restore this and other programs and continue
21 to make progress toward our zero waste goals.

22 Let me talk a little bit about one of the other
23 hats I'm wearing now. Before this crisis, an
24 estimated \$1.2 million New Yorkers faced food
25 insecurity. As a result of the economic devastation

1 caused by COVID-19, we project that that number may
2 have reached as many as \$2 million. Families are
3 struggling to make ends meet. Many New Yorkers
4 especially our older neighbors and those with
5 existing health conditions are stuck in their homes.
6 They are unable to safely shop at the grocery store
7 or eat meals in group settings.
8

9 On March 21st, Mayor de Blasio appointed me to the
10 role of COVID-19 Food Czar with one singular goal.
11 To ensure no New Yorker goes hungry because of this
12 crisis.

13 We will do everything within the power of city
14 government to keep the crisis of this virus from
15 being followed by a crisis of hunger.

16 In total, the city is investing more than \$170
17 million over the next several months in this
18 unprecedented effort. Through the programs we have
19 established to date, we are now distributing over a
20 million meals each day and we intend to continue to
21 sustain and grow these operations as long as the need
22 persists.

23 My written testimony goes into far greater detail
24 but for the sake of time, I will provide a high level
25 description of the components of this effort. First,

1 all New Yorkers young and old can pick up free meals
2 at one of the more than 500 New York City schools.
3 Every site has vegetarian or Halal options and Kosher
4 meals are available at 18 sites across all five
5 boroughs.
6

7 Those who can not leave their homes and have no
8 one to go out for them, can sign up for emergency
9 home delivery. This is a massive effort that relies
10 on staff from several city agencies and TLC licensed
11 taxi and for-hire drivers.

12 New Yorkers can visit NYC.gov/getfood or call 311
13 and say get food to sign up for reoccurring
14 deliveries. We have also incorporated more than
15 59,000 seniors who were enrolled in the DFTA Direct
16 Meal Delivery program and they are now receiving
17 twice weekly deliveries.

18 We are working with senior centers and other
19 partners to serve as an authorized enrollers for the
20 emergency home delivery program and have trained
21 actually more than 1,000 staff to date. We are
22 working to strengthen the city's food pantries which
23 provide vital support to families before this crisis
24 and are more important than ever. Thanks to the
25 leadership of this Council, we have allocated \$25

1 million in funding to support these organizations and
2 we have stepped up effort to supply them with staff
3 and food and to keep their doors open.
4

5 In particular, we are working with GrowNYC to
6 supply fresh food boxes directly to pantries. While
7 we are not currently facing shortages in food supply,
8 our system is experiencing strains. We are heavily
9 reliant on a national and regional food supply chain
10 that is beyond our control and we are doing what we
11 can to help the supply chain adjust to the new needs
12 of New Yorkers.

13 And to prepare for potential disruptions to the
14 food supply, we are beginning to establish a
15 strategic reserve of 18 shelf stable meals here in
16 the city. I would be happy to go into greater detail
17 on any of these in Q&A.

18 Lastly, I want to turn back to the topic of
19 sanitation. In the face of this pandemic, we must
20 take steps to protect ourselves and each other.
21 Wearing masks and gloves is part of our new normal
22 and as a New Yorkers, I am proud of how quickly my
23 fellow New Yorkers have adopted these practices. But
24 as Sanitation Commissioner, I am personally disgusted
25

1
2 by the number of masks and gloves seen littering our
3 streets and sidewalks.

4 For the safety of our sanitation workers, for the
5 safety of our neighbors, and for the sake of common
6 decency, I ask all New Yorkers to dispose of these
7 products properly. Do not toss them on the ground or
8 leave them on top of trash bags left out for
9 collection. I ask our elected officials, community
10 leaders and the press to join me in this plea.

11 Again, I appreciate the opportunity to testify
12 before you today on these important topics. Thank
13 you for your continuing support for this department
14 and our essential workers as we keep New York City
15 healthy, safe, and clean during this unprecedented
16 crisis.

17 I am now happy to respond to your questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
19 Commissioner and thank you very, very much about the
20 gloves. I see them all over the place and it really
21 is inconsiderate and you know, it just shows a lack
22 of concern for our neighbors and so, thank you for
23 mentioning that.

24 Commissioner Garcia, you are appointed the City's
25 Food Czar and we appreciate all that you are doing

1
2 for New Yorkers but I am confused about the budgeting
3 for the enhanced food program and its connection to
4 DSNY. Other than your role of course as the head of
5 both. So, why is the food program budget in DSNY and
6 if it's not really related to DSNY's core mission.
7 Do you think that's appropriate?

8 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, I think that one of the
9 things that I have been able to leverage as the
10 Sanitation Commissioner is the fact that we needed to
11 put out a lot of contracts and get those negotiated
12 and then be able to pay those and we have a pretty
13 significant infrastructure at the Department to be
14 able to manage that. And so that is why the money is
15 moving through the Department of Sanitation is to
16 make sure that we are effectively standing up these
17 contracts and then making sure that all of the
18 payments get made appropriately.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How is that infrastructure
20 different from other agencies?

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, we run several hundred
22 million dollars' worth of contracts at this
23 organization and have very large amounts of accounts
24 payable that we have to manage every day. So, we
25

1 just have the staff and the expertise to get that
2 done.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Different procurement rules
5 that you don't have to abide by that other agencies
6 might have to?

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: No, no, I abide by all of the
8 rules that everyone else has to abide by. But we
9 have been able to put out something on the order of
10 40 contracts during the last few weeks to bring on
11 vendors, to be able to support the program.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm wondering if there is a
13 lesson to be learned by the other agencies about how
14 you are able to do it and others aren't?

15 KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, I can't speak for other
16 agencies but also, this has been an all hands on
17 deck. The people who are working on the food portion
18 of it are not only Department of Sanitation but we
19 also have people in the field such as the Parks
20 Department, Department of Environmental Protection
21 staff, Department of Transportation staff. I think
22 this is really asking people to fill a need across
23 the city. And so, where we have the ability to do
24 that, we have stepped into assist.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Permanent or how do you view
this happening a little bit further down the road?

KATHRYN GARCIA: So, we definitely started to try
and think even though I think I'm still building out
to meet the need.

We have definitely started to try and grapple
with what does this look like going forward. You
know, I think in the long run, this will transition
out of the Department of Sanitation but exactly where
it will fit and what the city's priorities are going
to be about food insecurity going forward, I don't
think we want to go back to a place where 1.2 million
New Yorkers were food insecure on any given day.

And now, we've built this infrastructure to
support people. We want to make sure that it
continues moving forward but in the long run, no, I
do not think it would stay at the Department of
Sanitation but for right now, I think that the city
as a whole is just leveraging any skill set that
might be in any agency to make sure we get the work
done.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay Commissioner, the
Administration announced \$170 million investment to
address food insecurity. But not all of the money is

1 included in the budget. I think we see \$25 million
2 and another \$50 million in the budget. How much is
3 actually in the budget and why is it only partially
4 reflected?
5

6 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, I think that one of the
7 things that happened is, the budget and what the need
8 is going to be is changing over time. And so, we're
9 just working very closely with OMB but I will tell
10 you this, that they are completely supportive and the
11 Mayor has been extraordinarily clear. That our goal
12 is to make sure that nobody goes hungry and that we
13 need to do everything in our power to support that
14 and through whatever means that might be, whether or
15 not that is through the support of food pantries, the
16 support of seniors getting home delivery, the broader
17 support. I mean, we will probably take on, there is
18 likely to be a new challenge of as the testing and
19 tracing gets stood up, what will we need to do to
20 support the people who are asked to isolate at home.

21 So, this is going to be an ongoing challenge for
22 us for awhile but it is clear that the Mayor has been
23 extraordinarily clear. That we will make sure that
24 nobody goes hungry.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, will the
3 funding be added at adoption and do you know if
4 that's going to be federal funding or city funds?
5 What do you think is going to happen there?

6 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, our assumption is that this
7 would be FEMA eligible because it is directly related
8 to the COVID emergency and that that is why you know,
9 we have set it up the way that we did.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And will the extra funding -
11 what will that be? Do you know what that will be
12 used for?

13 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, this will be used to support
14 the Emergency Home Delivery Program.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And how many DSNY staff are
16 working on food coordination or is the agency using
17 staff from other city positions to do this work?

18 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, it's a mix, we probably have
19 50 to 75 staff assisting with this. I mean, my
20 secretary is currently working at a food distribution
21 hub right this second but there are literally staff
22 from all across different agencies, as well as
23 national guard. I mean it's the Office of Emergency
24 Management, National Guard, DOT, I think there is
25

1 some ACS staff, so it was how can we bring them all
2 together to fulfill this particular mission.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Have you had any staffing
5 issues of your own within the Department of
6 Sanitation because they've had shifting roles?

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: No, I mean, primarily the folks
8 who have been contributing to this have been people
9 whose jobs right now are very challenging for them to
10 do. For example, recycling outreach staff because
11 we're not doing things that require physical
12 interactions. So, a lot of those were retasked to
13 this but our core function at the Department of
14 Sanitation in terms of sanitation workers has been
15 focused on our collection of recycling and refuse.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner, will you commit
17 to giving us a daily, a weekly, update and the public
18 on a number - on the number of meals being served or
19 disaggregated by program?

20 KATHRYN GARCIA: Certainly, no we can provide
21 that information. Probably the easiest on a weekly,
22 some of them just make more sense that way but we can
23 certainly provide that and I invite any elected who
24 would like to, to participate on Friday's when I do
25

1 try and make sure that I'm updating either you or
2 your staffs on where we are with the program.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. Let me move
5 to the issue of liter baskets and service cuts. So,
6 the Council fought hard in Fiscal 2020 to increase
7 liter basket service including \$8.6 million in one
8 time funding for additional liter basket service
9 citywide. And New York City Cleanup initiative
10 funding for supplementary cleaning service in each
11 Council Member's district. Unfortunately, the
12 Administration has made drastic cuts to the
13 Departments core liter basket service budget.'

14 Why did you propose cuts to the liter basket
15 service and what impact will it have overall on
16 weekday, Sunday, and holiday service levels?

17 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, service is significantly
18 reduced in this budget and that is just I think the
19 reality of the financial situation that we are in.
20 But across the board if you consider the one time
21 funding from what the Council provided last year, it
22 will be about a 50 percent reduction in the number of
23 shifts that we will run and we will not be running
24 Sunday shifts.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let me just give Roosevelt
3 Avenue as an example. Prior to you coming in,
4 Roosevelt Avenue was a disaster in terms of
5 overflowing trash cans. Are we going back to those
6 conditions?

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, I don't think we have to. I
8 mean, this is the thing that has been come clear
9 during the virus is that the city has stayed very,
10 very clean and granted there are not a lot of
11 pedestrians out but for the few pedestrians who are
12 out, if they were littering, it would become
13 problematic. But you know, we don't have to go back
14 to that but it will take both my department, as well
15 as the public to keep things clean going forward.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The contingency plans in case
17 we do see those types of conditions because once the
18 warmer weather is here, probably more people will be
19 coming out.

20 KATHRYN GARCIA: And I think the challenge I have
21 is just the current funding level for the Department
22 in terms of the resources that we have.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, that's a big issue for
24 us here as for many Council Members as well. I
25

1 certainly don't want to see us go back to those
2 conditions prior to this Administration.
3

4 So, it's a very unfortunate, we'll need to just
5 talk further about that. Alright, I'm going to turn
6 it over to my Chair Antonio Reynoso who has follow up
7 questions for you as well.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Hello Commissioner. I just
9 want to thank you for always wearing many hats and I
10 know the Chair spoke about why DSNY is handling the
11 food program. I would challenge that it has a lot to
12 do with the fact that you are at the head of it and
13 your confidence and your ability to get this work
14 done, you know, the city I guess would be, we're
15 going to make things move to make sure that you are
16 the head of it. So, I just want to thank you again
17 for all the work that you do.

18 I want to follow up on one of the questions that
19 Chair Dromm talked about. Specifically, like going
20 back. I think a lot of folks here when you talk
21 about being a Mayor or the two things you got to
22 worry about is keeping crime down and keeping streets
23 clean, being able to plow the snow. With these cuts,
24 I'm extremely concerned about whether or not we're
25 going to be able to plow the snow or keep the streets

1 clean. We're talking about the basket service pickup
2 being one part of but then we have cuts to other
3 things that are happening in the city. Whether they
4 are highway cleanup cuts, 411 uniform positions are
5 going to be cut and not all of them are part of the
6 organics program, more than half. You know, I would
7 love to get more details from you about who this
8 other half is, if not from the organics program. But
9 just the overall PEG coming and the reduction in
10 headcount by 411 is very concerning to me.

12 We saw what happened at the last snow storm.
13 What could happen in a snow storm without the
14 resources and man power. I'm very concerned we're
15 going to revert back to a city that can be dirty or
16 won't be able to manage a snow storm.

17 I just wanted to get your confidence level when
18 it comes to being able to keep the city clean in a
19 way that we come to expect and also, the work that
20 you are going to do when the snow season comes in.

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: Certainly, and yes, it is a very
22 significant reduction in the number of uniform staff.
23 Though to be quite honest with you, it would have
24 been very difficult for me to hire this summer
25 regardless just because of social distancing and the

1 fact that DMV is not actually functioning, so they
2 couldn't get licenses.
3

4 But you know, that's a reality and we look like
5 we are projected to be at about 60, 100 by November
6 1st, first snow season which is significantly below
7 where we have been since I have been Commissioner but
8 I do have confidence in the fact that we have done a
9 lot with technology since I've been here and a lot
10 about routing to be able to manage it. It may slow
11 us down a little bit but I think that we would be
12 able to manage any storm. We have new pieces of
13 equipment such as the brine equipment to help us stay
14 ahead of storms.

15 So, we feel cautiously optimistic moving into
16 this snow season with this headcount. On the
17 cleaning front, again, it is really going to require
18 that everyone steps up a little bit more than they
19 have because I certainly don't want to see, I'm very
20 proud of how well we've done on a score card which
21 has really been a lot to do with the amount of
22 support we've gotten from the Council and I certainly
23 don't want to see on my watch that revert, but we are
24 just trying to deal with what is a real fiscal cliff.
25 I mean, I want to reiterate, like, anybody who knows

1 anybody in the central government, we need money.

2
3 Otherwise this is going to be an extremely draconian
4 few years and we are going to do everything in our
5 power to keep things from reverting back.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, we have to be
7 careful. While some leaders believe in this level of
8 excellence that come from New Yorkers. What we might
9 see this summer can be very concerning with the
10 amount of trash that can be littered up in our
11 streets and I just hope that we're ready to handle
12 it.

13 When it comes to a snow storm, a possible snow
14 storm, I've talked to the union head and he is very
15 concerned and wants to make sure that he puts me on
16 notice that he does not think that the man power that
17 is going to be left over is going to be sufficient
18 for him to properly clear snow.

19 So, I just want to make sure that we're on the
20 same page that he is kind of putting the onus on the
21 Council and the Mayor's Office to figure it out and
22 make sure that when the finger pointing starts, that
23 I guess that they are far away from it because this
24 headcount concerns them significantly.

I want to talk about the organics program.

Outside of SYEP, I've received the most amount of emails and calls in my office related to organics recycling. There is several parts of this that are very concerning. We believe that climate change is a big problem specifically when it comes to equity and environmental justice. The folks that get impacted the most are neighborhoods that have environmental injustices that traditionally occur. We're trying to fix that and moving forward with Zero Waste plan and with these other initiatives like the organics program that are supposed to help us come out of that.

Also, the organics program is supposed to be one that saves us money, not necessarily costs us money. If we divert, you know and I'm not saying we can get there with the 30 percent of this trash that is organic waste, we should be sending less to landfill and it should cost less to tip and we should be saving money from that point of view and it seems like the first thing that goes in the administrations are these recycling programs.

We saw it happen after 911 with Mayor Bloomberg. We saw ho difficult it was to get to what I consider

1 a very low number of recycling, of metal, glass,
2 plastic and paper right now. It took us what, we're
3 almost 20 years away from that and we're struggling
4 to get to numbers that we would consider good or that
5 I would consider good.

6 I'm concerned that that's going to happen with
7 the organics program. Why is it that we go after
8 these very important programs, especially ones like
9 organics recycling that is supposed to save us money.
10 How did we factor in I guess the cost benefit
11 analysis here?

12 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, you know it breaks my heart
13 to be rolling back that program.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

15 KATHRYN GARCIA: And you know, this was really
16 just a function of the fact that the fiscal crisis is
17 so really awful. The savings in the budget is
18 actually a net, so we assume that any of the material
19 that would have gone to a compost facility or to a
20 natural gas facility is now going to landfill. The
21 cost of collection of organics is still higher than
22 it is for refuse.

23 And you know, this is something you and I have
24 talked about a lot, about how to make the program
25

1
2 more efficient and get it up to scale. We have had
3 some real discussions about that but really the only
4 driver here is like, there is nothing that I like
5 that's on the chopping block to be chopped, but it
6 was really just a function of you know, you are going
7 to have to take some big cuts in order to make it so
8 that we can muddle through this financial crisis.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, then what about e-waste
10 by the state law? It's mandated that we don't put,
11 well we're not allowed to put e-waste at the
12 curbside. We cut the marketing budget that's
13 supposed to educate people on how exactly we would do
14 that now right. How do we handle our e-waste? We
15 don't know because the marketing budget for that has
16 also been cut.

17 So, how do we educate you know, our seniors, our
18 most vulnerable. The people that need to be told
19 exactly how we're supposed to handle this e-waste.
20 Are we just assuming there is going to piles of
21 electronic waste in the streets because we no longer
22 have that program. I'm very concerned about it being
23 eliminated at all and what is the alternative and how
24 are we going to educate people on exactly what they
25

1
2 are supposed to do with their e-waste if we have no
3 budget to do it?

4 KATHRYN GARCIA: Right, I mean like you know, it
5 is terribly unfortunate. You are quite correct; you
6 are not allowed to throw it out at the curb because
7 it could contain a lot of toxic metals in it. We
8 will maintain all of the information about places
9 that could take it back on our website going forward
10 and this is going to be true of a lot of materials
11 that we take care of now, we will try and provide the
12 best information to people about how they can safely
13 manage these things but we do not, we will have to do
14 enforcement if people do improper disposal. You are
15 not allowed to put electronics on the curb.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, I want to allow for
17 my colleagues to ask questions because these things
18 run pretty late and hopefully I can go around and
19 speak one more time. I just really want to emphasize
20 this e-waste as an example though Commissioner. If
21 we're going to be significantly changing the way we
22 handle trash in the city, we should be informing
23 people about what options or alternatives they have
24 and if we're cutting the marketing budget for that,
25 then we're kind of putting ourselves in a position

1 where people are going to make decisions on their own
2 as to how they think they should be handling this
3 trash and it's counter to me. I just don't
4 understand how that's supposed to be effective or how
5 that's a plan. I mean, I hope we can figure
6 something out here after this to really get this
7 budget to make sense and not just be cuts across the
8 board, just because that's what the Mayor is asking.
9 I want them to make sense.
10

11 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Commissioner.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, let's go to our Council
14 Member questions now.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If any Council Member have
16 questions for the Administration, please use the
17 raise hand function and you will be added to the
18 queue. Council Members, please keep your questions
19 to three minutes, including answers. Please wait for
20 the Sergeant at Arms to tell you when your time
21 begins. The Sergeant will let you know when your
22 time is up.

23 We will now hear from Council Member Lander
24 followed by Council Member Grodenchik.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Chair Dromm and
3 Chair Reynoso. Chair Dromm, I especially admire you
4 Zoom fortitude for these hearing's. So, we're really
5 grateful to you. We're always grateful to you in
6 budget hearing's but boy this is extra fortitude.
7 So, I see like me, you've taken to wearing classes
8 all the time and we're grateful to you.

9 Commissioner, thank you for everything. Your
10 willingness to step up and help our city in times of
11 crisis and just whatever the task is, is really
12 appreciated and you and I have had the chance to talk
13 some about the food program and I know we will
14 further and I appreciate your willingness to listen.

15 You know, both when things are going well and
16 when we have to say we see things that aren't going
17 well and your willingness to say, I hear that. I'm
18 doing my best, we're going to figure out how to move
19 this program forward in an effective way, so I really
20 do appreciate that.

21 I'm going ask you a couple questions about the
22 sanitation budget really following Chair Reynoso's
23 and you know, I think on two fronts, it's so painful
24 to me at this moment that we were not able to move
25 forward faster. The fact that our work to get rid of

1 those plastic bags did not beat this pandemic and
2 that they are still out there is painful. And then I
3 think to the Chairs point, you know, had we had the
4 courage to move to a mandatory citywide organics
5 program or pay as you throw or some way of making
6 that program genuinely work effectively citywide, it
7 would now be saving us money and not only will we not
8 need to cut it, it would be helping us save money in
9 a time when we need to save money and unfortunately
10 we did not have the courage to move more quickly on
11 those things. And so now, we have to have budget
12 cuts that are really painful but I guess I just want
13 to ask you again, you know, to me what that means,
14 look, you know in parks we love our composting and
15 we're good at it too. But we know that shared
16 sacrifice means that right now, because it's not
17 effective in citywide, it has to be cut or suspended.

19 With that said, we really have to commit
20 ourselves to getting to that zero waste goal. So, I
21 think that means while we suspend the citywide
22 curbside or the not yet really fully citywide
23 curbside program, that we do invest in the community
24 infrastructure. We'll save the \$20 plus million that
25 we saved from cutting curbside but let's keep those

1
2 community groups going. That only takes a couple of
3 million dollars, so we can at least some to hold in
4 organics recycling and then let's use this to move
5 aggressively forward toward mandatory curbside
6 composting. So, that when we come out of this
7 crisis, we're ready to stand it up in a way that is
8 economically effective but also helps us move towards
9 those essential zero ways to sustainability and
10 resiliency goals.

11 And I know you share those long term goals but I
12 really hope even with everything else you are doing;
13 you can help us move from the pain of this budget
14 crisis into that smarter a long term way of
15 operating.

16 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you for that Council
17 Member, like, you and I share the same goal.
18 Actually, I don't want the climate crisis to get lost
19 under the sort of threat of the pandemic crisis.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: That I think is so consuming.
22 And so, I want to work with you to really think
23 through how we come out of this, sort of stronger and
24 more resilient on our climate goals.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 295

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Next Council Member please.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
4 Member Grodenchik followed by Council Member Powers.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you very much.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Okay, very quickly
8 Commissioner, let me thank you for your wearing, as
9 you often seem to do [INAUDIBLE 36:13] and grace and
10 I greatly appreciate that. I do want to add my voice
11 to that of Chair Reynoso and Councilman Lander. Last
12 night, for the first time I think since we started
13 the organics program, which has now ended. I put out
14 garbage on a Wednesday night for a Thursday
15 collection. That is the difference that the organics
16 program made.

17 My wife, who is giving final exams upstairs is
18 wearing black because she is in mourning that the
19 program is over and we probably do backyard
20 composting now, which we've never done but I promised
21 her I would. So, the question I have just to -
22 because I like to add and subtract and multiply. Is
23 it possible that we're going to be losing more money
24 than you imagine because of people like me that
25 weren't putting out garbage, that are now going to be

1
2 putting out garbage? So, your truck that didn't have
3 to stop on Thursday morning at my house at least, is
4 now likely going to have to stop two times a week as
5 opposed to just Monday's where I put out my recycling
6 and everything. It's just a thought I had.

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yeah, we're watching that but at
8 this point, we think the numbers are good in terms of
9 where the saving are. And by the way, I applaud
10 backyard composting.

11 I think that that will, well, on a personal note,
12 my children, my young adult children are in grieving
13 and keep separating and trying to put the brown bin
14 out. I was like, no.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I put the brown bin
16 into mothballs until it comes back out. We do have
17 composting at the Queens Farm, but unfortunately
18 that's closed now because of the COVID crisis. So,
19 I'll probably go there. I'm going to wave the
20 balance of my time. It's good to see you
21 Commissioner. Thank you Chair's as always.

22 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, our next Council
24 Member.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
Member Powers followed by Council Member Cabrera.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you
Commissioner. Thank you for all you are doing, I
know you got a tough multi jobs here during this
crisis, but I know especially on the food side, we've
been hearing very good things about helping get
people things they need. So, thank you for
everything your team is doing.

Just back to composting, we are going to keep
going. You know, Council Member Reynoso and I both
put in bills just yesterday around composting and
community composting. Can you tell us the cost in
your estimate, it's a budget hearing, of continuing
the community composting program or standing up some
version of it?

KATHRYN GARCIA: So, the compost project which
has the nonprofit partners costs us about \$3.5
million a year.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, so if we maintain
some community composting sites under the current
program, I think it's different than our bills,
that's \$3.5 million?

1 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes.

2
3 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, and what about cost
4 of education and outreach? Is there a budget for
5 that?

6 KATHRYN GARCIA: Not within that particular
7 metric. We can get you an estimate of what that
8 would be for - I mean, they do their own outreach
9 because they are 401C3, so they also do their own
10 fundraising.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, and do you know
12 what if the city wanted to fund that, how much that
13 money would be?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, that's the \$3.5 million. I
15 mean, so they do have other funders. I think they
16 are looking for some more private support to continue
17 the community compost project but I don't have a
18 dollar figure beyond of what a marketing budget would
19 be for them.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, and why are those
21 closed right now? Is it because, yeah, why are those
22 closed right now?

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: We closed all food scrap drop-
24 offs. Some of them are run by the Compost Project,
25 some are run by nonprofits where they just host a bin

1 and it has to do with the fact that we are very
2 concerned about social distancing. Particularly at
3 these compost project sites where people are working
4 together, sort of turning composts, there are a lot
5 of volunteers. We felt like that, just at this
6 particular moment in time that was not a great idea.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And I was at a – I was at
9 a GrowNYC Farmers Market yesterday handing out masks
10 to people who were very socially distanced. So, it
11 was actually a fairly decent amount of people out and
12 about. Is there a reason you couldn't have something
13 there for people to be able to drop off?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, GrowNYC, that actually
15 requires a different funding stream. GrowNYC, we
16 work with them to make sure that all of the Farmers
17 Markets became socially distant and they spread out
18 quite a bit.

19 They are working in the food program but we had
20 to close down the ability to pay them to run the Food
21 Scrap Drop Off program.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I mean, just, they are
23 open if the concern was about social distancing and
24 those booths are open.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 300

2 KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, social distancing and then
3 it's what do you do with the material.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay. Right now, do you
5 know from one of the things we were trying to and
6 this will be my last question because of time, was to
7 make sure there is equity around the city when it
8 comes to sites. Can you give us just some of
9 understanding of equity right now around the city in
10 terms of community composting?

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

12 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, right now, everything is
13 shutdown. The sites have been in near Queens Bridge
14 on Governor's Island on the lower east side. The
15 Lower East Side Ecology Center and then, on the
16 Gowanus Canal.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you and I
18 just would say this to everybody, all my colleagues,
19 \$3.5 million to maintain community compost is at
20 least one of the things we should at least consider
21 preserving as part of this years budget. But thank
22 you Commissioner, thank you Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Our
24 next Council Member.

25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
Member Cabrera followed by Council Member Adams.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I want to thank the
Chair's first of all. I always appreciate and enjoy
being in this Committee because you get to us very
quickly. So, thank you so much, it means a lot.

So, I'll be quick myself. Commissioner, thank
you. I know you have a lot, you are hearing a lot.
It's a tremendous amount of work that you are doing
at this moment, so I want to say thank you.

I wanted to ask you a couple of questions. What
if FEMA does not reimburse us when it comes to the
funding regarding food and if we do get reimbursed,
how long do you foresee that they will be able to
fund us for, based on other scenarios that we have
seen such as hurricanes and other tragic events we've
seen throughout the nation?

Third, what challenges do you perceive that we
may have next week when we're going to have a week,
the side of the streets are going to be for cleaning?
We are going to be asked to move our vehicles.

And my last question is in regards to the
sanitation workers who have a - they truly do have a

1
2 backbreaking kind of a job, exert a lot of energy and
3 strength in carrying all those bags. It's going get
4 hot this summer. Are we going to require them to
5 wear masks? And I forgot to mention, last question
6 and this is in regards to snow. More people I
7 foresee are going to be driving than ever. They are
8 going to be afraid to take the subway. What
9 implications would that have in light of the fact
10 that we're inevitable that we're going to have a snow
11 storm. God forbid, not like the one that we had even
12 six inches, as you recall shut us down a couple of
13 winters ago?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you for that question. I
15 think we feel really confident that FEMA will
16 reimburse us for this. It's very difficult to talk
17 about duration because this is completely different
18 from a hurricane that happens in one day and then you
19 recover for a long period of time.

20 This is an ongoing crisis where we haven't gotten
21 to recover yet and we're multiple weeks in. As I
22 recall, it's like, I think I'm one of the few
23 Commissioners that did a budget hearing two months
24 and ten days ago and it was a completely different
25 time.

1
2 So, I think that we feel pretty confident. We
3 have FEMA people here who are looking at what we're
4 doing to make sure that we do it right, so that we
5 can get reimbursement.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: On alternate side of the street
8 parking, the streets have held up really well through
9 most of this but we think that it's time for us to go
10 and there is some places where we're starting to see
11 some litter built up and so, we want to make sure we
12 do a clean sweep and then we will put ASP back in
13 place for the following two weeks. We know that - I
14 have definitely enjoyed having alternate side of the
15 street. My car is actually parked in front of my
16 house which is shocking.

17 But you know, we need to all do our part and so,
18 the streets have held up really, really well. This
19 is almost, almost but not quite the longest
20 suspension of alternate side of the street parking,
21 which occurred in 1977 or 1978 when they had those
22 two horrific back to back snow storms. And on snow,
23 we are as I said before, being very cautious, we're
24 cautiously optimistic giving our headcount that it
25 can be managed. It might be a little bit slower.

1 We're going ask more from people who are driving,
2 particularly if they are new drivers. That driving
3 in snow, if you don't know how to drive in snow, it's
4 not a great idea. And in terms of masks, we ask
5 sanitation workers to wear their masks when they are
6 within six feet of the public.
7

8 So, we understand. They've done some creative,
9 and we give them masks, but they've also done some
10 creative masks out there that they are wearing, so.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much.
12 Thank you so much to the Chairs. You are doing a
13 wonderful job, as always.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you again and let's
15 move onto our next Council Member.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
17 Member Adams followed by Council Member Chin.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much. Good
20 afternoon Commissioner. Again, it's been said many
21 times but I don't know how you get all the hats on
22 your head, I just don't. And for that, we are very,
23 very grateful for your multitasking expertise,
24 especially now during the COVID epidemic.
25

1 I just want to go back to something that I, a lot
2 of questioning that I had for Commissioner
3 Trottenberg yesterday because the duties do overlap
4 and we get a little muddy with the responsibilities
5 quite a bit.
6

7 We've noticed that we've always had a litter
8 problem in New York, we know that. We've always had
9 an illegal dumping problem in New York, we know that.
10 Now, with the onset of COVID, you know, and even the
11 Mayor knows that it's very, very messy out there.
12 Our city has gotten a lot dirtier, a lot messier, so
13 I had asked Commissioner Trottenberg about highway
14 service cleanup, road service cleanup, post COVID,
15 how we are doing, what we're doing? Because what I
16 am seeing in Southeast Queens, it ain't pretty. It's
17 you know, it's a mess.

18 We've always had issues with service road
19 cleanup. Cleanup around Grand Central and Van Wyck
20 Express Way has been you know, very difficult. So,
21 in Fiscal Year 2020, last year, this year, how many
22 ramps have been cleaned and do you know the number of
23 the roadways that have actually been swept and
24 cleaned as well and we've now got the service cut and
25 I would like to know the rational for the cut. It

1 something that seems very, very pertinent, and very
2 much needed in my district and across the city.

3
4 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes, no, I completely understand
5 why sometimes this can be very confusing where the
6 jurisdictional lines are.

7 So, I'm going to answer sort of more broadly and
8 then I'm going to pass it to the First Deputy Costas
9 to really talk you through all of the different
10 highways that are swept and the cycle that they are
11 swept on.

12 So, first of all, we don't do the bed of the
13 highway. We just do the ramps and we don't do the
14 sort of grassy areas that might be around the Van
15 Wyck or any of the other highways. Those are done
16 either usually by DOT, sometimes it can be parks if
17 it's park land. But those are not Sanitation
18 responsibilities and so, you know the rational is -
19 really was what you absolutely need to maintain core
20 services and other than that, it's like, we're going
21 to have to really sort of cut you to the bone and we
22 hope not to have to come back and cut again.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2 KATHRYN GARCIA: Because it is just so difficult.
3 But I am going to ask First Deputy Costas to step in
4 and answer the specifics on the highway sweeping.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you.

6 KATHRYN GARCIA: Steven?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: He is muted.

8 STEVEN COSTAS: If I could come off mute.

9 KATHRYN GARCIA: Nope, you muted again.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: You muted again.

11 STEVEN COSTAS: Thank you. I apologize for the
12 delay there. So, with regard to the highway
13 sweeping, just to be clear, that is actually a DOT
14 responsibility and we supplement them and assist them
15 in helping extend what they can actually cover
16 throughout the city.

17 So, the Department was able to actually in Fiscal
18 Year 2020, address 887 ramps or 162 miles. So, we
19 basically cover, we've extended what we're able to do
20 up to 23 different highways on a rotating basis and
21 what that means is that we average usually about 239
22 ramps or 44 miles weekly.

23 So, that would be - that is what's been
24 temporarily suspended or until the additional funding

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 308

comes in but DOT actually has the lion share of that
work, we were just supplementing them.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: We're in a lot of trouble
with littering and I'll just leave it at that. The
city's a mess but thank you very much for your
testimony today both of you, thank you.

KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. We'll
go to our next Council Member.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
Member Chin followed by Council Member Rosenthal.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes, thank you. Thank you
Chair Dromm and Chair Reynoso and thank you
Commissioner for all you do. I just have a couple of
questions. When we met before, I was very excited
about the pilot project on the container waste,
commercial waste. Because in my district, the
streets are very narrow and the bids are very looking
forward to that, so if you can let me know if we are
going to continue with this pilot project or is it
going to be cut?

The other thing is the rat mitigation zone
cleaning cut that's being proposed. I mean, we were

1 very happy when the Mayor announced the rat
2 mitigation and we were able to get over 108 Big
3 belly's within China Town. And the problem has
4 gotten so much better and I am just concerned that it
5 could go back to the old days again.
6

7 So, is there any contingency plan on that to
8 bring the pickup time back? And lastly, I know that
9 we also met about your capital project in terms of
10 building a new garage on the east side, that can
11 alleviate all the sanitation trucks that's parked in
12 our district and so, I just want to know if that is
13 also going to be going forward or if there is going
14 to be delay?

15 Thank you.

16 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you for your questions.
17 So, I'm going to turn over the question on the timing
18 of the bid for the containers to Assistant
19 Commissioner Anderson but before I do that, all of
20 the ULURP actions are sort of in a holding pattern
21 right now. And so, that includes the ULURP action,
22 getting us to a ULURP action on our hope for
23 Manhattan 68 garage on the east side.

24 We still currently have the funding in our budget
25 but I have to say I am assuming that OMB will ask

1
2 people to stretch their capital budgets and only do
3 the most critical work. Right now, many of our
4 projects are on pause from the Governor's order.

5 So, right this second, it is still there but I
6 don't know if I am overly optimistic that everything
7 will stay in the years that they are supposed to be
8 built in. But long term, we desperately need a
9 garage. We had actually a major issue with Manhattan
10 8 where it's an old incinerator and the caps on the
11 incinerator came off in a big storm and went through
12 the roof and no one was hurt but clearly it's not a
13 facility that we can stay in long term.

14 You know, we know how important the cleaning for
15 rats has been and you know, it is just painful to cut
16 back that program. You know, we're going to stay in
17 close contact with the Department of Health who does
18 sort of those analysis of what the situation is, so
19 that we don't have backsliding but I'm going to turn
20 it over to Assistant Commissioner Anderson, so that
21 he can talk a little bit about the pilot program.

22 GREGORY ANDERSON: Good afternoon Council Member
23 Chin. The program you are referring to is Clean Curb
24 which we announced on March 12th, just before the you
25 know all of this sort of came about and it actually

1 has two components. One is new rules that would
2 require new large residential buildings to install
3 containerized collection for the start.
4

5 Those rules are still moving forward. We have
6 our actual, first ever virtual rule hearing two weeks
7 from today on May 28th. So, if folks are interested
8 in testifying, they can sign up to do so. The other
9 piece that you referred to is the pilot for
10 collection in the parking lane and that's still
11 moving forward. It's on pause right now just because
12 we have been planning to work with some partners and
13 bids and some other organizations to do that and I
14 think we want to give them a chance to take stock of
15 where they stand after this crisis but we're still
16 planning to move forward and we've had a number of
17 encouraging conversations over the last two months
18 with three different organizations who are interested
19 in joining that pilot and we hope that they will join
20 us in the future as we open up.

21 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Great, thank you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
23 Members Ayala followed by Council Member Cohen.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And just before we do, I want
25 to say we were joined obviously by Council Members

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 312

Lander and Deutsch and Council Member Constantinides.

I keep forgetting to mention that. Please proceed.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Good afternoon. My
question and I'm sorry if somebody already asked this
but I have to get another on this that is the syringe
litter collection.

So, in Fiscal Year 2021, the Executive plan
includes a savings of \$265,000 in Fiscal 2021,
growing to 317,000 with the elimination of six
positions for syringe collection. What does that
mean and does this program being eliminated for
Fiscal Year 2021?

KATHRYN GARCIA: So, thank you for that question.
This eliminates the proactive routing of the officers
in areas where there was high volumes of syringes.
We will still respond to 311 complaints but we will
not be as proactive and it is the reduction of the
headcount that was doing this. The reason why it
goes up is their salary has steps in it, so as they
have more years of services, they increase their
salary.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Is this the same program
that we recently announced?

KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: In the South Bronx. So, I
3 mean, I don't understand because I don't know that
4 there has been such a reduction in syringe litter
5 that it merits the elimination of so many you know,
6 personnel. I'm a little confused about that.

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: No, all of these have been
8 extraordinarily difficult cuts and you know, we don't
9 make them lightly but this is just the state of the
10 Fiscal situation.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I get that but I have - my
12 issue with this is that we have a public health
13 situation happening in not only in the South Bronx, I
14 mean, citywide but it's very prominent in the South
15 Bronx and you can't take three steps without running
16 into 10, 15, you know, used needles on the street.
17 These needles are often times in front of schools, in
18 front of churches, in front of residential buildings
19 which is why we fought for and add the additional
20 funding to help alleviate some of that you know, on
21 that community and so, to see a reduction and that be
22 the first thing, one of the first things that's cut
23 is really you know, alarming to me because it sends
24 me a message and I guess the community a message that
25 the public health of you know residents that live in

1 communities of color that have seen an abundance of
2 you know, syringe litter in their communities doesn't
3 matter and that matters to me, right. Because I'm
4 the one that has to deal with that. I mean, we have
5 people that are literally picking up needles you
6 know, on their own and they shouldn't have to bear
7 the brunt of that.
8

9 So, that's really alarming and I would really ask
10 the administration to reconsider because it is a
11 public health crisis. It's not you know, it's not a
12 couple of complaints. We're in the midst of a public
13 health crisis as it relates to you know, your crisis
14 in the South Bronx. And so, if there is any way to
15 reconsider that I would really appreciate it.

16 And finally, I just wanted to get a sense from
17 you about the reusable bags. You know, where are we
18 with that and is that a program that you know, we're
19 going to be even able to continue?

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, I'm going to pass this to
22 Deputy Commissioner Anderson on where exactly we are
23 on our inventory but we are definitely trying to be
24 able to continue to do that because we think that in
25 the not too distant future, DEC will start enforcing

1 the plastic bag ban. Not yet, but I think it will
2 happen, so I'm going to pass it to Deputy
3 Commissioner Anderson.
4

5 BRIDGET ANDERSON: Can you hear me?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes.

7 BRIDGET ANDERSON: Okay, great. Thank you for
8 that question. Yes, we are continuing to distribute
9 reusable bags and anyone can take the zero waste
10 pledge and get a free bag sent to them. The issue
11 about enforcement on the bag ban; enforcement has
12 been delayed until June 15th at this time by the EC.
13 But they are going to reevaluate this summer and the
14 five cent fee on paper bags is in effect and the good
15 news for us is that that five cent fee actually helps
16 to pay for us to do more distributions of reusable
17 bags.

18 So, we're looking forward to expanding that
19 program, making sure that anyone who needs reusable
20 bag has one and is able to secure it easily.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, next Council Members?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
24 Member Cohen followed by Council Member Deutsch.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 316

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. I just want to
3 first note that Council Member Dromm, you are an iron
4 man because I was here with you at 10:00 this morning
5 and then I took some time off in the afternoon but
6 you have been going strong this whole day, so it's
7 really impressive.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I feel more like Vanna White
9 saying next please except I don't turn letters you
10 know.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: You could do that too.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I will also say
14 Commissioner Garcia, I know that every body has
15 commented on your multiple hat wearing but I really
16 just think it is a testament to your track record and
17 the work that you do, so I want to say thank you.
18 I'm going to hop around a little bit to a couple of
19 food things. First, I will say on Monday, I did
20 check out the Kosher Grab and Go in the Northwest
21 Bronx and I was surprised how busy it was. I don't
22 know if you've gotten any feedback yet on utilization
23 but I think they sold out or came very close to it by
24 1:30.

25

1 Two, the \$25 million, have contracts been awarded
2 for the food pantry supplements? And then, I just
3 want to ask about seven day trash. I don't know if
4 I've done it. I don't have it memorized
5 unfortunately but I've supplemented trash pickup in
6 commercial corridors, the city basket for seven day
7 service. Are we going to be able to continue to do
8 that assuming I get discretionary money to do that?
9

10 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, uhm, if you get discretionary
11 money, yes, we will take your money and in terms of -
12 I just lost my train of thought. So, we have seen
13 the grab and go site has been you know, active. So,
14 they have been doing pretty well there and then I
15 just lost the last question.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: \$25 million for food
17 pantry?

18 KATHRYN GARCIA: Oh, they all have their
19 contracts, four have returned them and six have not
20 yet, so they need to sign them.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Okay, I was not aware of
22 that. I want to say I'm concerned about the garage
23 situation. You and I have spoken about that on
24 occasion, so that is of some concern. And I also
25 just want to, you know as a Bronxite, I really want

1
2 to echo Councilwoman Ayala's - the needle situation
3 particularly on 3rd Avenue and Hub is really, it's
4 been horrific and it's one of those things that I
5 think really it's larger than the sum of its pieces.
6 It has just an impact I think on the psychology of
7 the Bronx and people's impression of the Bronx. If
8 there is anyway we can continue to try to fight to
9 clean that up, I think that that would go a long way.

10 And I will just finally add, you know, as my job
11 as a Council Member, I would honestly say that your
12 agency is the agency I get the least complaints
13 about. Where constituents don't, you know, they
14 complain about a lot of things and particularly in
15 the northwest Bronx they know how to complain but I
16 get very few complaints about sanitation, so I just
17 wanted to let you know that. Thank you, thank you
18 Chair.

19 KATHRYN GARCIA: Sanitation work is amazing.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: They do a good job.

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: They do a really good job.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We have two more questions
23 and then Chair Reynoso will close us out.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 319

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
3 Member Deutsch followed by Council Member
4 Constantinides.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you very much.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. Good
8 afternoon Commissioner. I have two questions. One
9 question is about your grab and go sites. Do you
10 have any leftover food at the end of the night at the
11 grab and go sites and if you do, what do they do with
12 the food? That's number one, and number two, is that
13 the Council Member Rodriguez has a bill that wants to
14 sweep the passes of the streets, then people would be
15 allowed to park there even when the restriction
16 doesn't end.

17 So, you mentioned in the past that sometimes the
18 sweeper comes by but with all of these budget cuts, I
19 don't think that we're going to see a second sweeper,
20 maybe not even the first sweeper. But during that
21 hour and a half, my question is are you willing to
22 have that bill passed to allow people to park once
23 the sweeper passes?

24 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you for those questions.

25 So, at the grab and go sites, the way that DOE

1 primarily manages it, is they are making the food.

2 This is not for Kosher, it's different for Kosher
3 because obviously we're purchasing that.

4 They are making the food as needed at the site
5 and they have refrigeration capacity to be able to
6 store food for three days in all of the sites that we
7 are using. And so, we're managing the inventory and
8 if, if we got to a place there was a time where they
9 had too much inventory in Williamsburg, it was
10 donated to a food pantry.

11 So, that is how we have been managing that. I
12 know that many people would like the ability to move
13 back once the sweepers passed, it's just challenging
14 for us not only because there are times when we do
15 send two sweepers but also, primarily in times of
16 heavy material, heavy litter, or heavy leaves. But
17 it also is a technology challenge for us to know
18 whether or not the sweepers past and to know whether
19 or not they can write the ticket. And it would take
20 significant, significant investment to get that done.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Well, we do have GPS on
22 the trucks.

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: No, we don't.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 321

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: You don't have it on
sweepers?

KATHRYN GARCIA: Not on brooms, not on the brooms
but I need that and then I need to be able to
communicate in real time to NYPD and to traffic
enforcement, as well as all of my enforcement agents
and Sanitation supervisor. It's a challenging
technology, it's not impossible but it's a
challenging technology bill.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Do you know what the
cost will be?

KATHRYN GARCIA: I think the last time we looked
at, we thought it would be about \$12 million.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
Member Constantinides followed by Council Member
Rosenthal.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,
Commissioner, it's always great to see you. Thank
you for all of your great work around food and you
know, all of the work that you do at the Sanitation
Department. Thank you.

1 I just wanted to quickly just check in. You
2 know, before all of this began, we were just starting
3 a conversation and the story around the movement of
4 the sanitation garage. I was just wondering if - I'm
5 assuming based on some of the other conversations
6 that I've heard throughout this hearing, that things
7 are being moved. I just want an update on where do
8 you think we are here in Astoria. We know this
9 facility cannot stay where it is. We know that the
10 current facility is falling apart.

12 What's our sort of like ballpark timeline for
13 being able to have this conversation again?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you for that question and
15 you are absolutely right. Queens One Garage is
16 bowing in a very scary way.

17 But we were very close with the landlord that we
18 were talking to about moving and we have done sort of
19 begun the ULURP piece of this. But everything
20 obviously is at a standstill right now. But you
21 know, we are hopeful to get that back on track as
22 soon as possible. One, sort of city planning starts
23 their process again and then, get back into it and
24 figure out how to deal with the underlying landlord
25 of each field to do the build out of the new garage.

1 SO, I am working to keep that on track.

2 Obviously right now, everything is just delayed
3 because City Planning isn't doing any ULURP actions
4 at the moment.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, great.
7 Now, Commissioner, I completely understand, I just
8 wanted to follow back up with you and I wanted to
9 sort of reiterate as my colleagues have spoken to the
10 need for composting and you know, as you talked about
11 earlier, the climate, you know, the climate crisis
12 and the resiliency crisis are not going to be put on
13 hold. They are only going to intensify, So, I
14 definitely want to echo my colleagues here in us
15 trying to find a way forward on composting and moving
16 ourselves and our city into a more resilient you
17 know, sort of metric because I know money is tight.
18 I know things are unprecedented. I think that work
19 has been over used at this point but I recognize that
20 we need to do more in order to make sure we are
21 prepared for any future issues that the city would
22 incur based on climate.

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you. I concur and we need
24 to be able to come out of this in a way that we are
25 resilient.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC SAFETY, COMMITTEE ON AGING, COMMITTEE ON
SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 324

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you. Thank
3 you Chairs.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Council
5 Member Rosenthal.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much.
8 Commissioner, great to see you. Two quick, three
9 quick questions.

10 First of all, have you considered a pay to throw
11 system pilot possibly in large residential buildings?
12 Is that something you could do?

13 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, we've always viewed it as a
14 Save as You Throw Program. So, that you would get
15 some of - you would get some sort of discount. You
16 know, I would need to talk with other folks about
17 what we might be able to think creatively about but
18 maybe this is a moment where if we can get some
19 willing participants, that could show that it could
20 work, maybe this is the time.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, thank you and
22 I'm curious about recycling compliance. If we had -
23 and what would happen if we had a post operation
24 system which some other states have? Where they just
25

1
2 have a company that has the capacity for post
3 separation for the recycling.

4 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, are you talking about if you
5 kept everything in a black bag and then – so what
6 they are called dirty Murph's, dirty Murph's.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: What could be
8 possible.

9 KATHRYN GARCIA: So, I mean, the challenge we've
10 got always is when you are recycling things, you are
11 trying to create a new commodity to go back into the
12 manufacturing process and to the extent that it stays
13 clean and separated. You get more volume. Like for
14 example, our paper does very well because we don't
15 even mix paper with metal, glass, and plastic.

16 Other people have had challenges because the
17 markets went south on them. So, it is an option but
18 it's not – you don't get great value out of it. You
19 lose a lot when you don't separation.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, so it's
21 something you have already explored and thought
22 about?

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yeah, we've thought about the
24 dirty Murph.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMEBR ROSENTHA: Okay, and lastly, I
3 guess my last question is, how many titles do you
4 have now?

5 KATHRYN GARCIA: currently?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Uhm, hmm.

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: Four.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And what are they
9 again?

10 KATHRYN GARCIA: Commissioner of Sanitation,
11 COVID-19 Food Czar, still the Lead Czar and Vice
12 Chair of NYCHA.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You are pretty amazing
14 in New York City, we're lucky to have you. So, thank
15 you and [INAUDIBLE 1:13:57]. I'm highlighting my
16 opportunity to name Sesame Street.

17 KATHRYN GARCIA: We're sympatica[SP?]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you Chairs.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. We will now hear
20 from Chair Reynoso, who will close us out.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I want to thank all the
22 Council Members. I really do want to say that it's a
23 joy when I get to sit here and see your faces on the
24 Zoom call. You, you know, it's a brightening part of
25 the day that we, I hope we all enjoy and

1
2 Commissioner, I want to thank you again for being on
3 this call and all the work that you are doing and
4 just so proud that I could be a Chair, I guess to
5 oversee the agencies by which you are operating.
6 It's a fun job because of how comforting and how
7 great and how smart you are.

8 Again, Chair Dromm, thank you for your marathon
9 runs through these Zoom hearings. I really do
10 appreciate it. I'm just going to close out by saying
11 that I really want us to think about equity in the
12 work that we're doing when we do this resiliency and
13 recovery from the virus. And it seems like the first
14 programs to go are those that are looking to close
15 the gap when it comes to environmental justice and
16 equity.

17 That's why they exist. We are either getting
18 trash cans to neighborhoods that are either dirtier
19 than others or traditionally have not had those
20 resources. We are looking to solve for environmental
21 justice in neighborhoods that have high asthma rates
22 or pollution. This is why we have these initiatives
23 and why we have these programs in place is to start
24 solving for some of those problems. It's sad to see
25 that those are the first to go when we're in a crisis

1 that affects some districts more than others and a
2 lot of these programs are supposed to solve for those
3 problems.
4

5 So, I really am going to be mindful of what we're
6 cutting and how we're cutting it and make sure that
7 the communities that tend to suffer related to trash
8 are not the ones that continue to suffer. Just
9 because we want to make some cuts that I don't think
10 are necessarily smart.

11 While I do see some other cuts like the pilot
12 program. It makes a lot of sense to me that we would
13 postpone that in light of the bigger picture here,
14 understanding how expensive it is and how it might be
15 something we have to do without.

16 The last thing I would say is, revenue
17 generation. We haven't necessarily had a
18 conversation about how we could generate new funding
19 through the Department of Sanitation that might be
20 able to help us through this time. I think the
21 [INAUDIBLE 1:16:45] through a program could be that
22 and we should have a serious conversation about any
23 revenue generation that we can produce out of this
24 department. And I'm not talking about raising fines
25 but actually incentivizing people to recycle better

1 can save us money in landfills and at the backend.

2
3 And if that's was [INAUDIBLE 1:17:03] does than we
4 should be having that conversation more seriously and
5 this time, it shouldn't only be about cuts and again,
6 I want to end by saying thank you to everybody that's
7 been on this call or on this Zoom and I hope you are
8 having a good time and I hope your mental health and
9 your emotional health is as strong as you look
10 because you guys all look great.

11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you Commissioner.
13 You have been doing a tremendous job and New York
14 City is very lucky to have you. We appreciate all
15 that you have done. Thank you very, very much.

16 This concludes today's -

17 KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you Chairs. I just wanted
18 to say that it's actually really nice to see you. I
19 feel like I don't see anybody.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: If you live alone, then you
21 got to get a dog you see. This concludes today's
22 hearing. Before we close, as a reminder to the
23 public, the Committee and Subcommittee will be
24 holding a remote hearing for public testimony on the
25 Executive Budget on May 21st at 11:30 a.m.

1
2 If you would like to testify at that hearing,
3 please register at www.council.nyc.gov/testify and
4 information about how to access the Zoom meeting will
5 be emailed to you. You may testify at that hearing
6 via web or via telephone. You may also submit
7 written testimony through that registration website
8 or by emailing financetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

9 Thank you very much and again Commissioner, thank
10 you for your time. We are so glad you were here with
11 us.

12 Thank you. [GAVEL] This meeting is adjourned.
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date AUGUST 24 , 2020