CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK ----- Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS ----- X July 27, 2020 Start: 12:37 P.M. Recess: 12:59 P.M. HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING B E F O R E: FERNANDO CABRERA, CHAIRPERSON COUNCIL MEMBERS: BEN KALLOS ALAN N. MAISEL BILL PERKINS KEITH POWERS YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ KALMAN YEGER PETER KOO LAURIE CUMBO, MAJORITY LEADER COREY JOHNSON, HOUSE SPEAKER World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

C.J. MURRAY, COMMITTEE COUNSEL

SUSAN LERNER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR COMMON CAUSE NEW YORK

PETER GROSSMAN, SUPPORTER OF INTRO PROPOSED 1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Sargeant please begin your recordings. Uhm, and hold on here. One moment please. Mr. Lugo you may begin with your opening statement.

6 Good morning everyone and MR. LUGO: 7 welcome to today's remote New York City Council 8 Hearing on the Committee of Governmental Operations. 9 At this time, will all panelists please surround 10 their video. To minimize disruption, please place 11 electronic devices to vibrate or silent. If you wish 12 to submit testimony you may do so at 13 testimony@counsel.nyc.gov. Again, that is 14 testimony@counsel.nyc.gov. Thank you for your 15 cooperation, we are ready to begin. CHAIRPERSON FERNANDO CABRERA: 16 Let me 17 gavel in. Good afternoon, I am Council Member 18 Fernando Cabrera, chair to the Committee on 19 Governmental Operation. I want to start off by 20 thanking the members of the committee joining us

21 today: Council Members Powers, Kallos, Koo, Perkins, 22 myself and Yeger. Today, the Committee will be 23 hearing a very important resolution on voting rights. 24 The resolution is sponsored by Majority Leader Laurie 25 Cumbo who posed upon Congress to pass and the

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 4 |
|----|---|
| 2 | President to sign the voting rights of Advancement |
| 3 | Act of 2019 of the VRAA which will revise and |
| 4 | modernize portions of the Voting Rights Act of 1965 |
| 5 | struck down in the Supreme Court decision Shelby |
| 6 | County v. Holder. In the 2013, Supreme Court |
| 7 | decision Shelby County v. Holder the court validated |
| 8 | certain portions of the voting rights act. |
| 9 | Importantly, the court struck down the pre-clearance |
| 10 | requirement mechanism that had required Federal |
| 11 | Intervention with jurisdictions with a history of |
| 12 | and unfair voting practices attempted to make |
| 13 | changes to their voting procedures. This ruling |
| 14 | gutted a major component of the Voting Rights Act |
| 15 | even then attempts to suppress minority voting |
| 16 | continue across the nation. Since this unfortunate |
| 17 | decision, at least 20 police states have enacted new |
| 18 | restrictive voting laws including strict ID |
| 19 | requirement and proof of citizenship. In February |
| 20 | 2019, represented Terry Sewell from Alabama's 7th |
| 21 | District, introduced a Voting Rights Amendment Act of |
| 22 | 2019. The Bill will revise and modernize portion of |
| 23 | the Voter's Right Act that was struck down in Shelby |
| 24 | County. Amid other things, the Voting Rights |
| 25 | Advancement Act will establish new criteria for |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 5 |
|----|---|
| 2 | invoking pre-clearance requirements based on a |
| 3 | finding of repeated voting rights violations over the |
| 4 | past 25 years, specified practices that have |
| 5 | historically been used to discriminate against voters |
| 6 | that would require a preclearance and increase |
| 7 | transparency by requiring reasonable notice of any |
| 8 | jurisdictions changes to voting procedures regardless |
| 9 | of whether they require pre-clearance. This |
| 10 | resolution is especially important today because it's |
| 11 | passage will honor= the legacy of a great man, the |
| 12 | late Congressman John Lewis passed away on July 17th. |
| 13 | John Lewis was a Bastian of the Civil Rights Movement |
| 14 | who repeatedly risked his life in his non-violent |
| 15 | fight for civil rights. In particular, voting |
| 16 | rights. It was there on that bridge in Selma on March |
| 17 | 7, 1965 where he was gassed and beaten within an inch |
| 18 | of his life by those who refused to honor the |
| 19 | Fundamental Rights granted to all Americans in the |
| 20 | Constitution. Refused to give up and help secure the |
| 21 | passage of the Voting Rights Act months later only to |
| 22 | see one of these key provisions gutted by the Supreme |
| 23 | Court in 2013. He was a proud co-Sponsor and |
| 24 | supporter of the Voting Rights Advancement Act and |
| 25 | passing it will honor his legacy and ensure voting |
| I | I |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 6 |
|----|---|
| 2 | rights are protected for all Americans. I want to |
| 3 | thank our Majority Leader, Laurie Cumbo for her |
| 4 | leadership on this issue and carrying this |
| 5 | resolution. I want to thank our Committee Staff, Fi |
| 6 | Jatamari (SP?), Emily Forgone (SP?), Elizabeth Crone, |
| 7 | Sebastian Bachi for their work on this and I also |
| 8 | want to thank my own Legislative, Michael Dane (SP?), |
| 9 | Nichon Voni (SP?). Majority Leader Cumbo sponsored a |
| 10 | pre-considered resolution. Please give a statement. |
| 11 | Council Member, Majority Leader. |
| 12 | MAJORITY LEADER LAURIE CUMBO: Thank you |
| 13 | so much Chair Cabrera, thank you so much for your |
| 14 | leadership and for having this hearing at this very |
| 15 | critical time in our nation's history. I thank you |
| 16 | and all of the Committee Members who are here today |
| 17 | to make sure that we continue to make sure that |
| 18 | everyone in our Country has the right to vote. The |
| 19 | future of this entire Country will be shaped |
| 20 | throughout the 2020 election cycle and beyond. As we |
| 21 | observed in this year's Democratic Primary Cycle it |
| 22 | is critical that the right to vote, which our |
| 23 | ancestors labored, blood, sweat and tears for is |
| 24 | respected across Federal, State and Local elections. |
| 25 | The June 2013 Supreme Court decision in Shelby County |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 7 |
|----|---|
| 2 | v. Holder substantially weakened our right to vote at |
| 3 | a time when voter supression is stil prevalent most |
| 4 | especially in black and brown communities. Since |
| 5 | then, approximately 1/2 of our 50 states have tried |
| 6 | to suppress the right to vote through a variety of |
| 7 | mechanisms made available to them via the Shelby |
| 8 | County decision. Some of these include strict voter |
| 9 | ID registration, proof of citizenship, purging voter |
| 10 | roles, reducing polling locations and decreasing |
| 11 | options for early voting. We have seen all across |
| 12 | this nation where people have waited for hours and |
| 13 | hours and hours. Many of them are seniors, those |
| 14 | individuals who find it very difficult to wait on |
| 15 | line for hours at a time only to find out when they |
| 16 | get the opportunity to vote that they have been not |
| 17 | given that opportunity to do so. This resolution |
| 18 | calls upon Congress to pass and the President to sign |
| 19 | the Voting Right Advancement Act of 2019, esteemed |
| 20 | Civil Rights icon the late, great, John R. Lewis was |
| 21 | a co-Sponsor and stanch advocate for this |
| 22 | legislation. It was my honor to be able to have an |
| 23 | opportunity to meet with him, to talk with him, to |
| 24 | learn from him and to understand the atrocities that |
| 25 | our ancestors very clearly experienced on that Edmond |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 8 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Pettis Bridge. It is symbolic of the atrocities that |
| 3 | people of color have faced all across this nation |
| 4 | when attempting to exercise their right to vote and |
| 5 | it is for them that we continue to fight to push |
| 6 | forward this very critical resolution at this time. |
| 7 | We owe it to his memory to carry to torch and codify |
| 8 | Civil Rights Protections for all, not just a |
| 9 | privileged few. Now, more than ever we need the |
| 10 | Federal Government to pass the Voting Rights |
| 11 | Advancement Act. I want to thank our Speaker Corey |
| 12 | Johnson for his leadership, our Committee Chair |
| 13 | Fernando Cabrera, my Legislative Director Jason Hur |
| 14 | (SP?), my communications director Alicia Mercedes and |
| 15 | my entire staff who have worked so incredibly hard to |
| 16 | bring us to this moment and you have already thanked |
| 17 | so many of the people who have worked behind the |
| 18 | scenes, in front of the scenes to make sure that we |
| 19 | pass the Voting Rights Advancement Act today. Thank |
| 20 | you so much, Chair Cabrera. |
| 21 | CHAIRPERSON FERNANDO CABRERA: Thank you |
| 22 | so much Majority Leader Cumbo. Thank you for that |
| 23 | opening statement on your resolution. I appreciate |
| 24 | your leadership. You are always in the forefront of |

issues that really, really matter, especially when it

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 9 2 comes to fairness. That is what we are talking about 3 here, fairness, especially doing one of the sacred 4 things that we have that we need to preserve. Uhm, I will now turn it over to our Moderate, Committee 5 Counsel C.J. Murray to go over some of the procedure 6 7 items. 8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL C.J. MURRY: Thank you

9 Chair Cabrera, I am C.J. Murray, Counsel to the Governmental Operations Committee of the New York 10 11 City Council. We will now turn to public testimony. 12 I would like to remind everyone that unlike our 13 typical Council Hearings we will be calling on 14 individuals one by one to testify. Please note that 15 you will be on mute until you are called on to testify, at which point you will be unmuted by the 16 17 host. I will be calling on panelists to testify, so 18 please listen for your name to be called. Council 19 Members who have questions for a particular panelist 20 should use the Zoom Raise Hand Function and I will 21 call on you after the panelist has completed their 2.2 testimony. Council Members will be put on a 5-minute 23 timer for their questions. All hearing participants should submit written testimony to 24 25 testimony@council.nyc.gov. I would now like to

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 welcome Susan Lerner to testify followed by Perry3 Grossman. Susan you may begin when ready.

4 Thank you very much C.J. SUSAN LERNER: I am Susan Lerner I am the Executive Director of 5 Common Cause New York. Common Cause is a national 6 7 organization which fights for a vibrant democracy in 8 strengthening all of our rights. Voting rights are 9 one of our primary issues of concern. We have been strong supporters of all of the amendments to the 10 11 Voting Rights Act and of course at the National Level 12 strongly urge Congress to pass the Voting Rights 13 Advancement Act now properly called the John Lewis 14 Advancement Act. I want to thank the Committee Chair 15 for inviting me and for the resolution sponsor for introducing the Resolution. This Resolution I think 16 17 is important because one has to remember that New 18 York City was one of the jurisdictions that was 19 covered by Pre-clearance prior to the Shelby County 20 decision and having New York City raise its voice and 21 add to the chorus calling for the passage of the 2.2 Voting Rights Advancement Act I think is significant 23 and has important positive ramifications both for voting rights here in New York City but for voting 24 rights across the country. As has been mentioned, 25

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 11 |
|----|---|
| 2 | the Shelby County decision which we at Common Cause |
| 3 | have recognized as mistaken from the beginning had a |
| 4 | serious and almost immediate impact on voting rights |
| 5 | across the country. It seemed as though it was only |
| 6 | a matter of minutes before jurisdictions picked up |
| 7 | voter suppression measures which had been previously |
| 8 | rejected under Pre-clearance and rammed them through. |
| 9 | As has been previously mentioned by the Resolution |
| 10 | Sponsor, numerous states have taken Voter Suppression |
| 11 | Actions and what we see across the country is not |
| 12 | only voters of color but also elderly voters and |
| 13 | young voters who were significantly impacted by |
| 14 | drupaceous voter suppression efforts that no longer |
| 15 | have to past muster through a pre-clearance process. |
| 16 | The VRAAs proposed pre-clearance satisfies the |
| 17 | concerns of the Supreme Court and does contemporize |
| 18 | the process, unhooking it from a limited number of |
| 19 | jurisdictions that historically prior to 1965 and |
| 20 | prior to the 1980s amendment engaged in voter |
| 21 | suppression. This bill, if passed by Congress and |
| 22 | signed by the President would make preclearance a |
| 23 | national process for any jurisdiction which is |
| 24 | engaged in voter suppression within a 25-year |
| 25 | contemporary look back period. This change would |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 12 |
|----|---|
| | |
| 2 | significantly expand the preclearance and do a lot to |
| 3 | protect voter from the sort of suppression that we |
| 4 | are seeing across the country relentlessly applied. |
| 5 | There are other measures within the Voting Rights |
| 6 | Advancement Act which are also salutary but I think |
| 7 | the primary one is preclearance and we are delighted |
| 8 | to see this resolution and we urge the Committee to |
| 9 | pass it through to the body as a whole and we urge |
| 10 | the Council as a whole to add their very strong and |
| 11 | singular voice to the call to Congress to pass the |
| 12 | John Lewis Voting Rights Advancement Act. Thank you. |
| 13 | COMMITTEE COUNSEL C.J. MURRAY: Thank you |
| 14 | Susan. Unless there are any questions from the |
| 15 | members we will move to the next panelist? Seeing no |
| 16 | hands raised, I would now like to welcome Perry |
| 17 | Grossman to testify. Perry you may begin when ready. |
| 18 | PERRY GROSSMAN: Thank you so much Mr. |
| 19 | Murray. Thank you, Chair Cabrera. Thank you |
| 20 | Majority Leader Cumbo and to the other members of the |
| 21 | Committee it is a pleasure to be here and to be able |
| 22 | to speak with you today. Uhm, the resolution is of |
| 23 | course a good and worthy resolution the VRAA for all |
| 24 | the reasons that my dear friend, Ms. Lerner just |
| 25 | provided is an excellent Bill. It is important to |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 13 |
|----|---|
| 2 | recognize just how important preclearance is. It is |
| 3 | the crown jewel. It is the most effective Civil |
| 4 | Rights Law in the history of the United States with |
| 5 | no close second. What it does, for those of you who |
| 6 | might not be as familiar with it is it flips the |
| 7 | burden of proving discrimination from Plaintiffs, |
| 8 | from voters, from minority voters who are being |
| 9 | suppressed on to the jurisdictions that would engage |
| 10 | in discrimination to have them justify changes to |
| 11 | their election law to show that they would not in |
| 12 | fact make minorities worse off. The preclearance |
| 13 | provision of the Voting Rights Act was designed to |
| 14 | work in tandem to the Voting Rights Act which is the |
| 15 | affirmative provision that allows minority voters to |
| 16 | sue for relief to strike down old practices. So, |
| 17 | section 2 is the sword by which we cut through you |
| 18 | know centuries of discrimination and preclearance is |
| 19 | the shield by which we preserve those gains and make |
| 20 | sure that jurisdictions cannot back slide. So, it is |
| 21 | certainly, after years of fighting to bring down |
| 22 | important and really strict discriminatory laws it |
| 23 | was really disappointing immediately after the Shelby |
| 24 | County decision. When I saw immediately, I'm talking |
| 25 | about hours to see jurisdictions like North Carolina, |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 14 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Texas, Alabama re-institute changes to their election |
| 3 | laws like strict voter ID provisions, like roll backs |
| 4 | of early voting, immediately reinstitute those in a |
| 5 | way obviously intended to discriminate against |
| 6 | minority voters. So, preclearance was really holding |
| 7 | an awful lot at bay. I don't claim to have been very |
| 8 | close to John Lewis, although certainly Congressman |
| 9 | Lewis would make anybody feel like a very good friend |
| 10 | because he was such a warm and pleasant human being. |
| 11 | Someone really committing to making everybody feel |
| 12 | included and welcomed in America to never feeling the |
| 13 | kind of discrimination that he bore in the most awful |
| 14 | physical way. But I did have the privilege of |
| 15 | meeting him on a number of occasions and the most |
| 16 | interesting that I think is that he and I actually |
| 17 | sat near each other at the Shelby County oral |
| 18 | argument. We spoke at the rotunda of the Supreme |
| 19 | Court afterwards and this was moments after the late |
| 20 | Justice Antonin Scalia had declared the Voting Rights |
| 21 | Act a racial entitlement. Few things could infuriate |
| 22 | John Lewis more than calling the Voting Rights Act a |
| 23 | racial entitlement given the fact that nothing was |
| 24 | entitled about the Voting Rights Act. It was the |
| 25 | product of the most hard-fought advocacy known to |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 15 |
|----|---|
| 2 | man. 100 years of discrimination after the 15th |
| 3 | Amendment passed in 1870, a tax on voters, all kind |
| 4 | of discriminatory laws. It was certainly no a racial |
| 5 | entitlement it was absolutely the product of the most |
| 6 | dedicated and sacrificial advocacy I can imagine. So, |
| 7 | restoring the Voting Rights Act is a tribute not only |
| 8 | to Congressman Lewis but Congressman Lewis would be |
| 9 | the first to point to everybody in that struggle with |
| 10 | him and everybody who struggles today and the |
| 11 | importance of making sure that those struggles were |
| 12 | certainly not in vain and were able to produce for |
| 13 | future generations a more inclusive and effective |
| 14 | Democracy, certainly for black Americans but also for |
| 15 | other people of color as well we have a long history |
| 16 | of discrimination in New York not only against black |
| 17 | Americans and voting but Latin-X Americans as well. |
| 18 | And so, certainly I urge passage of the resolution. |
| 19 | I think it is important to show that we here in New |
| 20 | York who are subject to preclearance in three |
| 21 | counties still support it because it is an excellent |
| 22 | measure but above and beyond supporting the |
| 23 | resolution, I urge this body and I urge everybody I |
| 24 | attendance to think about what can we do better to |
| 25 | serve Voting Rights in New York because we don't do a |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 16 |
|----|---|
| 2 | very good job here. We have some of historically the |
| 3 | lowest turnout and lowest registration rates. We |
| 4 | have big gaps in between white registration rates and |
| 5 | white turn out rates and minority rates and |
| 6 | registration rates. There is a lot that we can do to |
| 7 | start to get at that. So, I don't want to go too far |
| 8 | outside the scope of things but I would suggest that |
| 9 | the City Council really dedicates itself to investing |
| 10 | in those ways that New York City can be an active |
| 11 | proponent of a more inclusive Democracy. Certainly, |
| 12 | we have seen efforts in the past to do that but there |
| 13 | is even more than we can do, including for this |
| 14 | upcoming November election and I hope you will take |
| 15 | the opportunity to do it. I thank you all again so |
| 16 | much for the opportunity to be here. It really is a |
| 17 | pleasure. Please pass the Resolution. |
| 18 | COMMITTEE COUNSEL C.J. MURRAY: Thank |
| 19 | you, Mr. Grossman. Unless there are any questions |
| 20 | from the members, we will move on. I see no hands |
| 21 | raised so at this time if your name has not been |
| 22 | called and you wish to testify please raise your hand |
| 23 | using the Zoom Raise Hand Function. Seeing no hands |
| 24 | raised, I will now turn it over to Chair Cabrera for |
| 25 | closing remarks. Oh, excuse me, I see that Council |

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 17 2 Member Koo has his hand raised? Council Member Koo, 3 you may begin. PETER KOO: Hi, everyone, I am Council 4 Member Koo. Today, we are voting on my Legislation 5 Intro 1091-A which will require the City to create a 6 7 stretchable and machine-readable compilation. COMMITTEE COUNSEL C.J. MURRAY: Uhm 8 9 Council Member Koo, Council Member. PETER KOO: Yeah. 10 11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL C.J. MURRAY: Sorry, 12 that's when we get to the vote. Uhm, so right now we 13 are just hearing the Reso. PETER KOO: Oh. 14 15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL C.J. MURRAY: We will 16 be closing and then we will be coming back for the 17 vote. PETER KOO: Oh, okay. Yeah. So. 18 19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL C.J. MURRAY: Thank you 20 so much for your eagerness. I love that when, eager 21 for his Bill. Thank you. 2.2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, Chair 23 Cabrera, please go ahead with your closing remarks. 24 CHAIRPERSON FERNANDO CABRERA: Thank you, 25 thank you so much. I want to thank first of all the

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 18 |
|----|---|
| 2 | panelists, thank you for your insight. Thank you for |
| 3 | your knowledge. And let me just say right up front I |
| 4 | welcome any next steps that we could take forward, |
| 5 | looking forward to meeting with you, if you have next |
| 6 | steps, how we could do this better? How we could |
| 7 | have a higher level of voting engagement in the City |
| 8 | which to be honest with you is very low, even though |
| 9 | we have seen some improvement but we could do so much |
| 10 | better. So, I am looking forward to having that |
| 11 | level of discussion and I want to thank the Majority |
| 12 | Leader Cumbo for, you know we often say for your |
| 13 | leadership but leadership is all about influence and |
| 14 | impact and everything righteous based on leadership. |
| 15 | So, thank you for bringing this up front and in just |
| 16 | the perfect timing with that. So, with that let me |
| 17 | bring it to a close right now. Today's hearing and |
| 18 | then we will be coming back for a vote. |
| 19 | |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |
| | I |

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date August 6, 2020