

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

June 25, 2020
Start: 1:44 p.m.
Recess: 5:00 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING

B E F O R E: Corey D. Johnson,
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Adrienne E. Adams
- Alicka Ampry-Samuel
- Diana Ayala
- Inez D. Barron
- Joseph C. Borelli
- Justin L. Brannan
- Fernando Cabrera
- Margaret S. Chin
- Andrew Cohen
- Costa G. Constantinides
- Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
- Laurie A. Cumbo
- Chaim M. Deutsch
- Ruben Diaz, Sr.
- Daniel Dromm
- Mathieu Eugene

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON STATED MEETING

2

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONT.)

- Vanessa L. Gibson
- Mark Gjonaj
- Barry S. Grodenchik
- Robert F. Holden
- Ben Kallos
- Andy L. King
- Peter A. Koo
- Karen Koslowitz
- Rory I. Lancman
- Brad S. Lander
- Stephen T. Levin
- Mark Levine
- Farah N. Louis
- Alan N. Maisel
- Steven Matteo
- Carlos Menchaca
- I. Daneek Miller
- Francisco P. Moya
- Bill Perkins
- Keith Powers
- Antonio Reynoso
- Donovan J. Richards
- Carlina Rivera
- Ydanis A. Rodriguez
- Deborah L. Rose
- Helen K. Rosenthal
- Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
- Ritchie J. Torres
- Mark Treyger
- Eric A. Ulrich
- Paul A. Vallone
- James G. Van Bramer
- Kalman Yeger

1
2 DIRECTOR OF SECURITY: Okay, can I have your
3 attention everybody. At this time, I am asking that
4 everyone please place all electronic devices to
5 vibrate. All electronic devices to vibrate.

6 Council Members remember that you will have the
7 ability to mute yourself. Thank you very much Mr.
8 Public Advocate.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [GAVEL] Thank you.
10 Good afternoon and welcome to the Stated Meeting of
11 June 25, 2020. My name is Jumaane Williams, Public
12 Advocate of the City of New York. It is my pleasure
13 to welcome you to the virtual meeting of the City
14 Council. If you would like to follow along, the
15 agenda for today's meeting is posted on our website.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Please join us for the Pledge of
17 Allegiance. I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the
18 United States of America, and to the Republic for
19 which it stands, one Nation under God, indivisible,
20 with liberty and justice for all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. We will
22 now have today's invocation delivered by Bishop R.C.

23 -

24 COUNCIL CLERK: I'm sorry Mr. Advocate, we have
25 to do the roll call.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yeah, that's right.

COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala? Barron? Borelli?

Brannan?

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present, present.

Borelli present, I had a mute problem.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you Council Member.

Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Present.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm sorry, Council Member

Barron also blessed and present. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you Council Member Barron.

Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN? Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I'm in my kitchen but I'm

here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides? Cornegy?

Deutsch? Diaz?

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene? Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin? Levine?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

COMMITTEE ON STATED MEETING

6

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?
4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller? Moya?
6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?
8 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?
10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?
12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?
14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera? Rodriguez? Rose?
16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Present.
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?
18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Present.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?
20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?
22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?
24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yeah, I'm in BJ's, if
3 anybody needs anything let me know, I'm here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone? Van Bramer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo? Cumbo?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Mr. Public Advocate, we have a
13 quorum.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much.
15 We will now have today's vocation which invocation
16 which will lead and delivered by Bishop R.C. Hugh
17 Nelson, the Lead Pastor and District Administrative
18 Bishop of the church of God of East Flatbush located
19 at 409 East 95th Street in Brooklyn New York.

20 BISHOP R.C. HUGH NELSON: Thank you so very much
21 for this opportunity and pour blessings over you
22 today. Would you bow your heads with me?

23 Heavenly Father we humbly approach your thorn of
24 mercy and grace acknowledging you as creator of this
25 world and our lives. You instructed us in the words

1
2 of Saint Paul, I urge first of all, that petitions,
3 prayers, intercession, and thanksgiving be made for
4 all people. For kings and for all those in authority
5 that we may live peaceful and quiet lives in our
6 godliness and holiness. We thank you for each
7 individual seated in this Council today and prayer
8 your blessings up on them and also for those who are
9 not able to attend. I thank you for the rich
10 diversity of New York City and what it represents
11 around this world, even though we were forced to
12 battle the viral pandemic of COVID-19 and witness the
13 massive loss of lives. Still, we celebrate the
14 resilience of the city and the courage of our
15 essential workers.

16 I pray that you'll direct all officials in how to
17 deal with the racial unrest that plagues our country
18 and give us wisdom to correct the wrongs of the past
19 as we celebrate your image in each individual. Help
20 us oh Lord to live as brothers and sisters that we
21 may walk in fellowship and compassion and to love one
22 another.

23 I pray that you will use the gifts and abilities
24 within each of us to accomplish the tasks set before
25 us. Help us to maintain a hopeful expectation in the

1
2 deliberations of the day and to always remember that
3 when our agenda stay focused on the wealth of all
4 constituents. We can always depend on your presence
5 and grace.

6 We pray as we carry out your work of justice and
7 mercy, you will guide our hearts and direct our
8 steps. We pray these things in the precious name of
9 Jesus Christ our Lord. Amen.

10 God Bless You and have a wonderful day.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much
12 Bishop Nelson and I will now call on Council Member
13 Ampry-Samuel to spread the invocation on the record.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm elated to speak
15 on behalf of the Bishop, Dr. R.C. Nelson, Senior
16 Pastor of the Church of God of East Flatbush. I've
17 come to know and work very closely with Bishop Nelson
18 and his family. It is an honor to have him here for
19 today's invocation. A very popular scripture in the
20 Bible found in the book of Esther for such a time is
21 this and if you are a believer in a higher being and
22 faith, then we accept that some things are designed
23 with such a time as this.

24 Bishop Nelson's work before and with the Church
25 of God of East Flatbush had been community focused

1
2 and progressive. Considering the tone of the city,
3 we are certainly privileged to have him to be our
4 Speaker today and he practices what he preaches. He
5 has been on the ground with crisis management
6 experience and has stood at the gap between community
7 and police and has developed affordable housing and
8 many experiences that we in the New York City Council
9 value and hold in high regard.

10 Bishop Nelson was born on a beautiful island of
11 Jamaica and migrated to London England as a young
12 adult and pursued undergraduate studies in theology
13 at the European Bible Seminary in Germany and
14 biblical archeology studies in Jerusalem Israel. He
15 has a master's in divinity and a doctorate in
16 ministry.

17 Prior to pursuing full time ministry, Bishop
18 Nelson was employed as a psychotherapist at the
19 Hiwassee Mental Health Center program focused solely
20 on suicidal patients. After being a pastor in
21 Canada, he moved to New York with his family as a
22 trustee of the Brookdale Hospital and Medical Center
23 and a member of the 67th Precinct Council Member and
24 the Brooklyn NYPD taskforce.
25

1
2 Bishop Nelson is a true visionary. So, I just
3 want to say thank you, thank you, thank you Bishop
4 Nelson for all that you do on behalf of the community
5 and the great City of New York and it is my pleasure
6 and honor to make the motion to spread the invocation
7 in full upon the record today.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Council
9 Member Ampry-Samuel. I just want to second
10 everything you said having worked with Bishop Nelson
11 and myself. Those are very true words, so thank you
12 for that. I will now ask Council Member Koslowitz
13 for the adoption of minutes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I make a motion that
15 the minutes of the Stated Meeting of May 28, 2020 be
16 adopted as granted.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Messages
18 and Papers from the Mayor?

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Communications from
21 City, County, and Borough Offices?

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: None.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Petitions and
24 Communications?

25 SPEAKER JOHNSON: None.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Land use call ups?

SPEAKER JOHNSON: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. We will now have communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you Mr. Public Advocate. Good afternoon everyone, happy Thursday. I hope you and your families are safe and well and I want to thank you for joining us for another virtual stated meeting.

This week our city moved into the second phase of reopening and I am really proud of the work that New Yorkers all did together to flatten the curve and to get us to this point. The numbers have been showing progress but we have to keep that up. So, I want to remind everyone that we must stay vigilant. We must continue to practice social distancing and we must wear a mask. Those are two of the most vital tools to prevent the spread of COVID-19. So, let's keep up that good work. As of yesterday, we lost our city has lost - our city and state has lost 22,365 of our fellow New Yorkers. 22,365 New Yorkers have died from COVID-19. That number includes probable deaths.

I always like to remember that these aren't just numbers but actual New Yorkers who are loved and will

1
2 be forever missed. To those who have lost a loved on
3 to this devastating disease, you are in our thoughts
4 and prayers today.

5 As we do during each stated, I also want to
6 acknowledge those who died from 911 related illnesses
7 since our last meeting. The FDNY lost retired
8 Firefighter Blaise DelBianco who was 66 years old.
9 Let's have a moment of silence for Firefighter
10 DelBianco and the tens of thousands of New Yorkers
11 who we have lost to COVID-19.

12 Thank you. This Friday marks two years since the
13 supreme court upheld the Presidents Muslim ban. We
14 said it then and we say it now, Trump's Muslim ban is
15 racist. It goes against everything we stand for and
16 we will never stop fighting any and every racist
17 policy this White House tried to enact.

18 Hold on one second, I apologize, I think I'm
19 having a technical problem. I apologize. We
20 continue to fight for equal rights for everyone
21 regardless of race, gender, sexual orientation, and
22 this Sunday marks the 50th anniversary of our city's
23 pride parade. Celebrating the many achievements of a
24 community which I am proud to be a part of. One,
25 encouraging love and acceptance and as we celebrate

1
2 pride this month, it is important that we continue to
3 recognize the intersectionality of Black lives and
4 queer lives. Our struggles are not always the same
5 but we all continue to fight today for fair treatment
6 under the law. This years march will look very
7 different from prior years but pride march is on, as
8 it always has.

9 Now, let's dive into today's agenda. The Council
10 will vote on one Article 11 property tax exemption
11 for 3415 Knox Place in Council Member Cohen's
12 district in the Bronx to preserve 25 units of
13 affordable housing.

14 Moving on to the rest of our legislative agenda,
15 the Council will also be voting on legislation to
16 amend reporting requirements by short-term rental
17 platforms. Introduction 1976 sponsored by Council
18 Member sponsored by Carlina Rivera will amend a law
19 passed by the Council in 2018 that required online
20 short-term rental platforms such as Airbnb to provide
21 more information the Mayor's office of special
22 enforcement. These amendments would tailor those
23 reporting requirements to cover listings for short-
24 term rentals on the entire dwelling unit or housing
25 accommodation and rentals for three or more persons

1
2 at the same time and I want thank from the staff,
3 Audrey Saun[SP?] and Austin Branford for their help
4 on this bill.

5 Our next bill is one that I worked very closely
6 on with Council Member Antonio Reynoso and countless
7 small business owners. Our restaurants are part of
8 the fabric and sole of our city. Many people know
9 our city for its restaurant industry and the culinary
10 experience here is unmatched. The shutdown has
11 devastated so many of these restaurants and we can't
12 allow them to fail. This is the time to get creative
13 and reimagine our outdoor spaces. Proposed
14 Introduction Number 1957-A, sponsored by Council
15 Member Antonio Reynoso, will codify the city's
16 outdoor dining program. Allowing restaurants and
17 bars to temporarily use outdoor spaces like
18 sidewalks, curbs, and streets. These businesses
19 would be allowed to self-certify that they are using
20 sidewalk and curb space directly in front of their
21 business.

22 Currently, more than 4,000, sorry, almost 5,000
23 businesses have utilized the self-certifying process
24 through the City of New York and from the staff, I
25 want to thank Falckies Myrig[SP?] and Leah Skrzypiec.

1
2 Although this bill address the recovery of our
3 restaurant industry, we need to ensure a healthy
4 recovery for our entire city. This next bill
5 requires the city to start planning for the reopening
6 of agency offices. When the virus hit in March,
7 there was no plan for protecting our workers. It was
8 confusing and frankly scary for a lot of city
9 employees. When they go back, city workers need to
10 know what to expect and that we're prepared to keep
11 them safe.

12 Proposed Introduction Number 1950-A sponsored by
13 Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo will require senior
14 staff from the Mayor's Office to work with the
15 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene and the
16 Department for Citywide administrative services to
17 create policies and protocols to facilitate the safe
18 reopening and operation of individual city agencies.

19 I want to thank the staff who worked on this, CJ
20 Murry, Elizabeth Kronk and Emily Forgione. The
21 Council will also vote on a bill out of the Finance
22 Committee designed to increase transparency around
23 COVID-19 related spending. All too often, a crisis
24 can lead to unchecked spending but the Council is
25

1
2 committed to making sure there is always
3 accountability over city spending.

4 Proposed Introduction Number 1952-A sponsored by
5 Council Member Vanessa Gibson would require the City
6 of New York to create an online public data base that
7 would track expenditures of federal, state, and local
8 funds for addressing COVID-19. And I want to thank
9 the staff who worked on this Rebecca Chasan,
10 Stephanie Ruiz, and Nell Beeka[SP?]. Also, from the
11 Finance Committee are two bills and five Resolutions
12 that relate to the interest rates for late and early
13 payments of property taxes.

14 First, are three annual resolutions that will
15 adopt the rates that were recommended to the Council
16 by the city's Banking Commission. This year's rate
17 include the lowest historical interest rates for
18 quarterly taxpayers, which include over 90 percent of
19 our homeowners. Those rates will be 3.25 percent for
20 the first quarter of Fiscal 2021 and 5 percent for
21 the remainder of the year. That is down from 7
22 percent in the current fiscal year.

23 The other recommended late payment is 18 percent
24 for semiannual payers, which is mostly investor
25 oriented properties and luxury homes. And the early

1 discount rate of 0.05 percent remains unchanged from
2 Fiscal 2020. However, recognizing that so many of
3 our property owners are struggling financially, the
4 Council is voting on two bills and companion
5 resolutions to adopt targeted lower interest rates
6 for COVID impacted property owners who are unable to
7 pay their July 1st property tax bill on time.

9 Proposed Introduction Number 1964-A sponsored by
10 Council Member Margaret Chin, would authorize a 7.5
11 percent late payment interest rate available to small
12 rent regulated apartment and commercial buildings
13 that pay their taxes on a semiannual basis and have
14 been adversely impacted by COVID-19. The lowered
15 interest rate would be available between July 1st and
16 October 15th.

17 The next Proposed Introduction Number 1974-A
18 sponsored by our Public Advocate Jumaane Williams,
19 would authorize a zero percent late payment interest
20 rate for COVID-19 impacted homeowners who use their
21 properties as their primary residence and pay who
22 either have incomes below \$150,000 who are already in
23 a hardship payment plan. The lowered interest rate
24 would be available between July 1st and September
25 30th.

1
2 I want to thank the staff who worked on this
3 Rebecca Chasan, Emery Adev[SP?], Ray Magesski[SP?],
4 Andrew Wilber, and Noah Brick.

5 This past April, the state legislature voted to
6 legalize electric bikes and scooters, but the use of
7 e-bikes and e-scooters was still prohibited by local
8 law in New York City.

9 Today, the Council is moving to change that and
10 this legislation is timely. As the COVID-19 pandemic
11 hit our city, many New Yorkers turned to alternative
12 forms of transportation for essential travel and
13 relied on food deliveries made by cyclists e-bikes
14 more than ever before.

15 As the city reopens, it is more important than
16 ever that we provide New Yorkers with many options
17 for getting around. It is also important that we
18 focus on justice issues and we need to deliver
19 justice for these food delivery workers. Proposed
20 Introduction Numbers 1250-A and 1254-A, both
21 sponsored by Council Member Fernando Cabrera, would
22 eliminate local prohibitions on the use of certain e-
23 bikes and e-scooters that are now allowed under state
24 law.

1
2 Introduction 1250-A would allow for the use of
3 privately owned e-scooters with top speeds of under
4 20 miles per hour and Introduction 1264-A would allow
5 for the use of three classes of electric bicycles
6 with top speeds under 25 miles per hour. This
7 legislation would also clarify that devices that
8 remain prohibited by Local Law may only be impounded
9 if operated in a manner that endangers the safety of
10 the operator or the safety or property of another and
11 would reduce the previously excessive penalty for
12 operating a prohibited device from \$500 to \$250.

13 Proposed Introduction Number 1266-A, again
14 sponsored by Council Member Fernando Cabrera, would
15 require the Department of Transportation to create a
16 pilot program for the operation of shared electric
17 scooters in New York City. The bill would require
18 that neighborhoods unserved by existing DOT based
19 bike share programs be given priority in determining
20 the geographic boundaries of the pilot program.

21 DOT would be required to issue a solicitation for
22 the pilot by October 15th and would allow for shared
23 electric scooters to be offered to the public no
24 later than March 1st. The bill would also require
25 that the Department of Transportation report to the

1
2 Council on the progress of the program and issue
3 recommendations to the Council regarding the creation
4 of a permanent shared electric scooter program.

5 The pilot also requires participating e-scooter
6 companies to make sure their vehicles don't obstruct
7 sidewalks or ramps. This will benefit all New
8 Yorkers walking on sidewalks and especially people
9 with disabilities or restricted mobility.

10 Shared e-scooter operators would also be required
11 to offer e-scooters that are accessible for use by
12 people with disabilities. I want to thank the staff
13 who worked on these bills Elliot Lynn and Alex
14 Washington.

15 I now turn it back to you Mr. Public Advocate.
16 Thank you for presiding over today's meeting and I
17 look forward to proceeding with today's votes after
18 hearing from our colleagues.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Speaker
20 Johnson. We will now move into discussion of general
21 orders. We will first recognize Council Members who
22 signed up by email and then recognize Council Members
23 who wish to speak by using the raise hand function in
24 Zoom. Please wait as a reminder, please wait before
25 you begin your remarks for the Sergeant at Arms to

1
2 announce that he has begun the count down clock. The
3 Sergeant at Arms will alert you when you time has
4 expired. Can we please begin the list of folks who
5 have signed up?

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate, Majority
7 Leader Cumbo, Council Member Chin and Council Member
8 Rivera are the first three speakers.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much.
10 Majority Leader Cumbo?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I want to
12 thank our Public Advocate Jumaane Williams. You look
13 almost as good as me up there.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Close. Not yet, not
15 yet.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Over the last few days,
17 many states including Arizona, Texas, Arkansas,
18 Tennessee, California, North and South Carolina, have
19 seen a rise in the number of infections of COVID-19.
20 California is now handling roughly 4,732 new cases
21 each day. Texas is at 4,348 cases a day and the
22 Carolina's are seeing roughly 2,400 new cases every
23 day per NPR.

24 Thankfully so far New York City and the states
25 response plan for safety measures and clear lines of

1
2 communication have so far allowed us to continue
3 reopening with only a modest increase in confirmed
4 COVID-19 cases. An exception to the trend of
5 increasing cases in other states across the country.
6 New York City has reported less than 200 new cases a
7 day since last Saturday.

8 My Proposed Intro. 1950-A creates a task force of
9 five - Mayoral Appointees to further coordinate,
10 restart operations across city agencies. The first
11 iteration of this bill designed a restart officer
12 rather than a task force. In our discussions with
13 the Administration, it is clear that they felt the
14 task force would be better equipped to handle the
15 various variables with reopening the entire city
16 workforce.

17 Reopening and recommending policies to roughly
18 320,000 city employees across dozens of agencies,
19 officers, boards, is a monumental task. A single
20 restart officer would not have had the rounded
21 experience and expertise that a task force would
22 have. This task force is not a group of volunteers
23 who work regular 9-5 jobs. [INAUDIBLE 26:36] Provide
24 expertise and opinions on related issues. This would
25 be paid staff that have expertise and managerial

1
2 operations across city agencies. And so, this is
3 going to be where the buck stops. These individuals
4 are going to have everything to do with how we train
5 our work force in order to come back safely. How we
6 make sure that people understand how paid sick days
7 will now operate and how [INAUDIBLE 27:08]
8 experiences in our jobs.

9 Employees deal directly with many people
10 including vulnerable populations. There have been so
11 many of the elderly, those with pre-existing health
12 conditions who are concerned about going back –

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Did we lose the
14 Majority Leader? It looks like it. We can move
15 forward to Council Member Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Oh man I'm still here, can
17 you hear me?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Oh, oh, sorry, go
19 ahead.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, I'll just close by
21 saying I want to thank my colleagues and all of their
22 work in getting to this. It's important that we get
23 this restart correct. We cannot allow a workforce to
24 come back. There were a lot of missteps early on
25 when COVID-19 first hit New York and we have paid the

1
2 price of loss of many lives. We cannot afford to do
3 that moving forward and so, I want to just thank
4 briefly my Senior Legislative Policy Analyst Emily
5 Forgione and Elizabeth Kronk, Senior Council Nicholas
6 Connell, Legislative Counsel Christopher Murray. I
7 want to thank my staff Jason Hur, Alicia Mercedes and
8 I also want to thank Tasha Young for all of their
9 work and dedication and Jason Goldman and especially
10 Speaker Corey Johnson for recognizing the importance
11 of this and making sure that this Council push back
12 to make sure that we have a safe reopening plan.

13 Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Majority
15 Leader and it's an honor to sometimes share the Chair
16 with you and so, thank you and thank you for those
17 words. Council Member Chin?

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Public Advocate.
20 Today, we will be voting on my bill Intro. 1964-A
21 which will reduce the interest rate from 18 percent
22 to 7.5 percent on nonpayment of July 1st property tax
23 for certain small property owners impacted by COVID-
24 19. This legislation aim to offer some hope to a
25 small pool of legacy mom and pop property owners of

1
2 tenement buildings in my district who have too often
3 been neglected and erased by our city and state.

4 They are the owners who have passed on their
5 buildings from family members to family members for
6 generations. Or like in Chinatown, the family
7 association who have shaped and served the community
8 for over a century. They have been victims in an
9 unfair and crippling property tax assessment system,
10 even though they represent centurial tenements with
11 the majority of rent stabilized tenants. Some pay as
12 little as \$50 in rent.

13 Now with commercial tenants, their main source of
14 income, having to shut their door overnight, the
15 lease owner has been desperate in any attempts of
16 intervention. The city and state for too long turn a
17 blind eye to their unique challenges and call for
18 relief. This legislation is by no means a silver
19 bullet to the inequity this constituency face but it
20 is a first step and a sign that we need to start
21 listening.

22 I want to remind the Mayor that this is a tax
23 deferral program, not an exemption. 7.5 interest
24 rate is a start but we know that we can and should do
25

1
2 better to lower it to offer real breathing room for
3 everyone to get back on their feet.

4 This is about neighborhood survival. This is
5 about preserving the deeply affordable housing that
6 we have. This wasn't an easy fight at all, so I want
7 to thank the Finance team including Latonia McKinney

8 -

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Rebecca Chasan, all the
11 staff, Marian Guerra my staff and definitely the
12 Speaker, Jason, and Chair Dromm for your incredible
13 leadership and I urge my colleagues to vote on the
14 bill.

15 Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Council
17 Member Chin. Council Member Rivera?

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so much Mr.
20 Public Advocate for the opportunity to speak on
21 Intro. 1976 which will make amendments to my short-
22 term rentals reporting law, Local Law 146 of 2018. A
23 bill I introduced and passed with the veto proved
24 majority.

1
2 I'm happy to see that after two years of legal
3 battles, this amendment bill will allow New York
4 City's short-term rental reporting law the strong of
5 its kind in the nation to help the countless families
6 we represent access affordable homes.

7 These tools will give enforcement power to
8 effectively crack down on legal hotel operators that
9 have kept thousands of apartments out of our housing
10 stock.

11 I want to thank the City Law Department, the
12 Office of Special Enforcement, Kelly Taylor in our
13 Council Legal team. Jason Goldman in my staff
14 including the tireless Jeremy Unger for their work
15 during the nearly two years we spent working to
16 defend this important and historic housing law. I
17 look forward to seeing my bill, one of my first ever
18 passed in the Council, finally go into effect.

19 Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Can we
21 have the next three Council Members names?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Mr. Public Advocate.
23 The next three are Council Members Cabrera, Gibson,
24 and Menchaca.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
3 Member Cabrera?

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much to my
6 esteemed colleagues. Today, I am proud to share my
7 legislations Intro. 1250-A, 1266-A and 1264-A which
8 will enable New Yorkers to benefit from
9 environmentally aggressive alternative transportation
10 in the form of e-scooters and e-bikes in a safe,
11 affordable, and responsible manner. This is about
12 transportation equity.

13 For two years, environmental and environmental
14 justice advocates have been fighting for the ability
15 to bring clean, electric scooters to New York City.
16 Why? Communities like mine, which are poorly served
17 by public transportation have no share bike programs.
18 We have among the highest level of asthma in the
19 country, are always left in the cold and to be
20 honest, I'm tired of it.

21 I see locals buying \$2,000 [INAUDIBLE 33:37] and
22 using it to avoid the subways and buses during COVID-
23 19 pandemic. My constituents cannot afford such a
24 luxury.

1
2 Share scooters provide working class everyday New
3 Yorkers, particularly in communities of color to
4 share these devices and only use them when they need
5 them. When they are done with the commute to work
6 and another transportation system to ride to doctor
7 or the supermarket, the neighbors can use it and so
8 on and it works.

9 I see my time is expiring here. I know there are
10 concerns regarding how long these scooters last and
11 just let me set the facts straight, they last for 18
12 months which is why an environmental organizations in
13 this city have endorsed it and this is why the New
14 York lead our conservation voters, transportation
15 alternative, environmental advocate, if tri-state
16 can't pay for transportation regional plan
17 association -

18 SERGEANT AT ARM: Time is expired.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Chamber of Commerce and
20 the Waterfront Alliance have all endorsed it and let
21 me thank Elliot Lynn, Alex Washington, and Michael
22 Avelo[SP?] and Jason Goldman and of course, our
23 Speaker for your support.

24 I'll speak more about it during my time. Thank
25 you, Mr. Public Advocate.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much.
3 Council Member Gibson?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so much Mr.
5 Public Advocate and good afternoon Speaker and all of
6 my colleagues and everyone who is watching today.
7 Bless it Thursday to each and every one of you. I am
8 proud to talk briefly about my bill, Introduction
9 1952-A which will require the City of New York to
10 create a public database on its website that would
11 track expenditures of federal, state and local funds
12 for addressing COVID-19 including all agency
13 spending, city procurement contracts, grants and
14 loans. The structure of this legislation was
15 inspired by the Superstorm Sandy tracker that was
16 created as a part of Local Law 1040 of 2013 and the
17 Mayor will create and maintain a public online,
18 searchable interactive database for the City of New
19 York that will include a summary of all management of
20 COVID-19 funds are available in a format that's easy
21 to read for the general public. Looking at all of
22 the agencies that provide funds for the City of New
23 York for the purposes of COVID-19 spending.

24 This bill really will serve as a powerful
25 accountability and transparency tool to ensure that

1
2 resources are reaching the hardest hit communities
3 across our city. We understand that many New Yorkers
4 have lost their battle to COVID-19. Many New Yorkers
5 of color and older New Yorkers and we have to make
6 sure that as we spend COVID-19 dollars, they are
7 equitable and really investments in the communities
8 that are most hardest hit by COVID-19. It is our
9 responsibility to ensure that resources are
10 concentrated in areas of vulnerability where New
11 Yorkers need the most and I want to thank my Co-
12 Sponsor, our colleague Mark Treyger who really did a
13 lot to help move this bill forward. Our Speaker
14 Corey Johnson for his leadership, Chair of Finance
15 Chair Danny Dromm, all the members of the Finance
16 Committee and really all of the sponsors and all of
17 my colleagues and certainly the legislative division
18 and the finance division. Thank you for your hard
19 work. This is a good bill that will really move this
20 city forward in recognizing that we have to track all
21 of our COVID-19 spending as we move forward.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so much and I
24 urge all my colleagues to vote in the affirmative.
25 Thank you, Mr. Public Advocate.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Council
3 Member and we have Council Member Menchaca.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Our forgotten immigrant
6 delivery workers are forgotten no more. For years,
7 immigrant workers who use e-bikes have been harassed,
8 fined, and arrested by the NYPD for keeping New
9 Yorkers fed. It took a global pandemic to teach New
10 Yorkers, especially this Mayor, that these workers
11 are essential and that work should not be
12 criminalized.

13 Now with legislation we are passing today, we are
14 taking a step closer to building a sanctuary city and
15 honor our commitment to protect essential workers as
16 we recover. The workers are working on some far
17 sided agendas and we need to deliver justice.

18 However, the e-scooters and bills connected to
19 these e-scooters is not transformative. They have
20 fed and continue to feed the twin disasters known as
21 climate change and corporate greed. The only reason
22 e-scooters are part of this package is because of the
23 corporate interests, which show us how nakedly they
24 want to exploit an effort to protect essential
25 workers for profit.

1
2 After this vote, there is a lot more that we can
3 do. The state law authorizes all e-bikes to have a
4 sticker identifying it as a legal device starting in
5 2022. For now, all the e-bikes are exempted but we
6 have to force manufacturers to send those stickers.

7 There is still a lot of work to do for the e-
8 bikes and I want you to reconsider for all the
9 reasons that I have said, but all the reasons that
10 you are knowing as you connect to the communities
11 that you represent to vote no on the e-scooter bills.
12 Vote yes on the e-bike bills and let's keep talking
13 about all the transportation alternatives that are in
14 our work as we move for a just transition.

15 That's what I'm asking and I know there is a lot
16 of support but this happened so fast and I'm not
17 ready and someone who has been deeply embedded in
18 this work, I'm asking my colleagues to vote no on the
19 e-scooter bills.

20 Thank you so much.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you and can we
22 have the next three Council Members?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Mr. Public Advocate.
24 The next three are Council Members Gjonaj, Koo, and
25 Yeger.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
3 Member Gjonaj?

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Public
6 Advocate. Let me just begin by encouraging all of my
7 colleagues to pay attention to what we're voting on
8 today. 1347, 18 percent interest for nonpayment of
9 taxes for properties valued over 250,000 which
10 includes co-ops, in unjustifiable during good times.
11 During this crisis, it's immoral. The Bank of
12 Commissioners is required to propose a rate of at
13 least 6 percent greater than the prevailing interest
14 rate charge for commercial loans extends to boroughs
15 by commercial banks in the city.

16 The Banking Commission knows that as of 5-13-20,
17 the prime rate is around 3.25 percent. Meaning, we
18 have the current authority to limit the interest to a
19 rate of 9.25 percent and not twice that which is what
20 we're voting on today. 1340-A 3.25 percent for the
21 first quarter Fiscal 2021 and 5 percent for the
22 remainder of the Fiscal Year for properties valued
23 not more than \$250,000 which includes co-ops should
24 have been limited at zero or at least remain at 3.25

1
2 percent during the entire fiscal year or until we
3 recover from the crisis.

4 Intro. 1349 7.5 percent for properties valued
5 between \$250,000 and 750,000 that were adversely
6 effected by COVID-19 is immoral and unjustifiable.
7 The rate should have been left at zero or a minimum
8 3.25 percent until we recover from this crisis.

9 I represent a community with the highest
10 effective tax rate in the entire city. I remind my
11 colleagues that the list of the highest effective tax
12 rates in the city, the first 32 are in the outer
13 boroughs. 32 of the outer borough Council Members
14 have the highest effective tax rate. The most
15 vulnerable, the poorest, those that are in the most
16 need, pay the highest effective tax rate -

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I'm wrapping up. If the
19 Reso. passes in the current form, we should be held
20 accountable by our constituents. I urge all of my
21 colleagues to vote no on 1347, 1348, and 1349 and to
22 do right by our homeowners and small businesses. We
23 need to give them a fighting chance to survive this
24 crisis. We can't allow them to be fatality. It's in
25 our hands and in our power.

1
2 Thank you, Public Advocate.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much.
4 Council Member Koo.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you. Thank you, Mr.
7 Public Advocate. I am very happy to vote in favor of
8 today's e-bikes bills. This will provide such a
9 great relief to many immigrant delivery workers who
10 have been penalized just for doing their jobs for far
11 too long.

12 Congratulations to Council Member Cabrera and all
13 delivery workers in New York City. This is a great
14 moment that we have fought for, for a long time.

15 On the other hand, I have serious reservations
16 about e-scooters sharing program. While I do believe
17 people should be allowed to use them, I think we need
18 to take a step back and – how are city can function
19 by allowing them on our streets before we jump into a
20 sharing program.

21 Finally, I worry about what downtown on my
22 district will look like from a shared e-scooter
23 program competing for space amongst buses, sidewalk
24 renters, diners, and pedestrians.

1
2 Finally, I will be voting in support of the
3 outdoor dining legislation with the expectation that
4 we will not be placing these spaces in areas that
5 must compete with heavy pedestrian traffic and bus
6 stops. So, with this in mind, I will be voting no on
7 Intro.'s 1266-A and yes on the rest.

8 Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Council
10 Member and Council Member Yeger?

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you Mr. President.
13 First, my continued gratitude to Mr. Speaker and the
14 Chief of Staff and the members of the Finance Staff
15 for their continued work to negotiate a fair budget
16 for all New Yorkers. This is perhaps the most
17 important work this body does and I'm grateful to all
18 who are working diligently on this important task.

19 This is the third time since I joined the Council
20 that we are being called on to impose an interest
21 charge on New Yorkers who are unable to pay their
22 property taxes on time. In each of the last two
23 years I've voted no and last year 13 members of the
24 Council joined in opposing these resolutions.

1
2 This year, more than ever, we need to seriously
3 look at what we're doing to New Yorkers. People
4 don't skip their tax payments because they don't feel
5 like paying and now, more than ever we know New
6 Yorkers are having trouble paying their bills.

7 [INAUDIBLE 44:51] and while I congratulate with
8 the Public Advocate and Council Member Chin for
9 advancing legislation to assist New Yorkers who can't
10 pay their taxes on time, I think we should stand up
11 for our New Yorkers and do a little better as Council
12 Member Chin said, we can do better and we should do
13 better.

14 Obviously, we don't want people taking interest
15 free loans from the city if they can afford to make
16 their payments. And Mr. Speaker is right, in one of
17 these resolutions, it is a lower rate than in the
18 past but I do think we can do better.

19 Thus today, I propose amendments to the items on
20 the floor today. Pursuant to Council Rule 9.40, I
21 propose that it be transmitted to the legislative
22 document unit as I began speaking.

23 With permission Mr. President, I would ask that
24 the clock be extended to two minutes pursuant to Rule
25

1
2 9.40 if my time expires, so I may explain the four
3 proposed amendments.

4 By proposed amendment to Reso. 1347 which strike
5 all references to an 18 percent interest rate and
6 replace it with a two percent rate. These are the
7 rates charged to properties with set evaluation of
8 over \$250,000 and as Mr. Speaker indicated, higher
9 valued properties. Still and nonetheless, 18 percent
10 is just wrong, we can do better. 2 percent is fairer
11 and still encourages those who can pay on time.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: My proposed amendment to
14 Reso.'s 1348 and 1349 would strike all references to
15 3.25, 5 percent and 7.5 percent and insert zero
16 instead. As with my proposed amendment to Intro.
17 1964, again, this is one time change to this year
18 alone to allow New Yorkers who are facing difficult
19 times the ability to come out from under their debt.
20 Zero interest to middle class New Yorkers who own
21 their own homes or small properties just makes sense.
22 It's the right thing to do and it enables those who
23 are landlords to extend rent protection and help the
24 tenants who are not able to make payments right now.

1
2 I urge my colleagues to join me please in
3 supporting these proposed amendments today right here
4 on the floor to instill some fairness in our tax
5 collection system to give our neighbors some
6 breathing room during these difficult economic times.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The meeting will stand at
11 ease.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Meeting stand at ease.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Yeger?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Yes sir.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Have you reduced your
16 amendment to writing?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Yes sir, it was emailed to
18 the legislative documents unit at the LDU email
19 address as I began speaking.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you very much
21 Council Member Yeger. The meeting will stand at
22 ease.

23 Mr. Public Advocate?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.
25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We can resume the meeting.

3 Is Jonathan Ettricks from the Legislative Documents
4 Unit on the call?

5 JONATHAN ETTRICKS: Yes sir, thank you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jonathan, can you please read
7 the proposed amendments that you have received in
8 writing into the record?

9 JONATHAN ETTRICKS: Thank you Mr. Parliament and
10 this is from Council Member Yeger. He proposes an
11 amendment to Intro. Number 1964 striking all
12 references to 7.5 percent and inserting zero instead.
13 He proposes an amendment to Resolution 1347 striking
14 all references to 18 percent and inserting 2 percent
15 instead. He proposes an amendment to Resolution 1348
16 striking all references to 3.25 percent and 5 percent
17 and inserting zero instead.

18 And finally, he proposes an amendment to
19 Resolution 1349 where he strikes all references to
20 7.5 percent and inserts zero instead.

21 That concludes -

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Jonathan. Mr.
23 Public Advocate, debate can now begin on these four
24 amendments. The first Council Member to be
25 recognized is the person who has offered the

1
2 amendments. Council Member Yeger, do you wish to
3 speak on your four amendments?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you Mr. Parliament
5 and president. I'll be brief, I don't have much to
6 add. I think if the Council, there are members here
7 like me from all across the city who represent the
8 kind of people who I represent. Middle class New
9 Yorkers who are struggling to make ends meet,
10 struggling and every single day calling our offices
11 and telling us that they just got the July tax bill
12 and they can't pay it, they don't have the money.
13 And the Public Advocate and Council Member Chin have
14 advanced legislation to address them and they've done
15 a great service in my view to the people of New York.

16 But I think we can do better. I think we can
17 stop this interest rate this year and keeping in mind
18 as members have said here, the city will ultimately
19 get its money. The city does not have to rely on New
20 Yorkers fund a loan sharking operation in essence of
21 these high usurious rates. 3.5 percent? What bank
22 in New York City is paying 3.5 percent for money in
23 the bank? Why does the city feel the need to do
24 this? The Banking Commission is not us. We have the
25 right under state law to reject what the Banking

1
2 Commission has done. I think this is in line with
3 what a lot of members want to do, which is why last
4 year, 11 and 13 members joined together to vote no on
5 the bill.

6 This year more than ever, more than ever my
7 friends would have to stand up for our fellow New
8 Yorkers. We have a chance to do it now. Insert
9 zero, we won't delay anything, we won't hurt the
10 city. This is the chance to tell New Yorkers we feel
11 your pain, understand what's going on. We get it and
12 we're going to help you out.

13 Thank you, Mr. President.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
15 Yeger. Mr. Public Advocate, we can now open debate
16 to other Council Members. So far Council Members
17 Dromm, Miller, Rosenthal, and Holden have said that
18 they would like to speak. You can first recognize
19 the Chair of our Finance Committee Council Member
20 Dromm.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAM: Just so I'm clear, its
22 Dromm, Miller, Rosenthal and who else?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Holden.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Holden. Thank you,
25 Mr. Parliamentarian. I recognize Chair Dromm.

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very much. I
4 would like to make a point of information in regard
5 to Intro. 1349 with the 7.5 percent interest rate,
6 which is pursuant to Intro. 1964. We don't have the
7 legal authority to change that. It's either an up or
8 down vote. There is no legal authority by which we
9 can change that.

10 So, I would like to go back and correct the
11 record on this. We can't just change it. We don't
12 have the legal authority to do that. I'd like to ask
13 for Council's opinion and we can't extend the zero
14 rate either.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
16 Dromm. We will see if we can get a legal opinion on
17 whether we can amend the 7.5 percent to zero. As a
18 point of parliamentary order, there is currently no
19 amendment proposed. Oh, there is. There is an
20 amendment proposed to Intro. 1964 and everyone should
21 know that if we were to amend Intro. 1964, we would
22 have to wait until the following Stated to vote on
23 the amended version of Intro. 1964.

24

25

1
2 While we wait for Counsel on Council Member
3 Dromm's point, Mr. Public Advocate, you can call on
4 our next speakers.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member Miller
6 followed by Council Member Rosenthal followed by
7 Council Member Holden.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I have an objection.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I'm sorry?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I have an objection. How
12 can we have a discussion on something that is not
13 legally possible? I would ask that we get the legal
14 recognition first and that if it's okay, then we have
15 a discussion.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Mr. Parliamentarian,
17 can I just ask that the Stated stand at ease one more
18 time?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The meeting will stand at
20 ease.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate?

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We are ready to resume the
25 meeting.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The Finance Chair, Chair Dromm
4 asked for a parliamentary point of order. Whether we
5 could in fact consider an amendment to a resolution
6 that may make the underlying resolution legally
7 invalid. The Council is able to consider any
8 resolution even if perhaps some might say that it
9 would be legally invalid. That's a point for Council
10 Members to consider. It is not something that would
11 prohibit Council Member Yeger from making an
12 amendment to a resolution.

13 With that answered, we can continue debate
14 starting with Council Member Miller.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
16 Member Miller?

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you so much Mr.
19 Public Advocate. As you know, I represent the
20 community the greater Jamaica community of Queens, in
21 Southeast Queens in particular, which is the largest
22 African American homeowners throughout the nation and
23 we have been - also, it's the same community that
24 were gravely impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic.
25

1
2 Those things being considered, we have often been
3 victimized from predatory banking practices. The
4 fact of the matter is over the last ten years, 50
5 percent of the mortgages sold have been predatory
6 mortgages in the greater Jamaica area. For that
7 reason, we are very sensitive. I'd like to speak on
8 behalf of my colleagues in Southeast Queens as well.
9 We are very sensitive to these predatory numbers that
10 the city has been preying on homeowners for so long.

11 Particularly during this moment of COVID, we
12 would hope that this could be addressed. I wrote a
13 dear colleague to the Center Dear Colleague, sign on
14 that we sent to the Administration asking to postpone
15 and to address this and they obviously denied and
16 referred us to this program that is highly - in my
17 mind highly predatory. And so, I commend all of my
18 colleagues who had introduced legislation addressing
19 this. It is my hopes that in many instances it could
20 be zero, is why I don't think the city should be in
21 the business of it either but I do understand that
22 there is some dynamics involved in it, particular in
23 this moment of fiscal crisis that we find ourselves
24 in.

25 Also, that there have been some negotiations -

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That I would like to
4 ensure that whatever we vote on, that it happens
5 expeditiously. So, that is my two cents and I look
6 forward to moving forward with this legislation.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
8 Member Rosenthal?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much.
11 One second. Thank you, Mr. Public Advocate. I have
12 not experienced this type of situation where a member
13 brings up changes during a Stated Meeting. We just
14 had a vote on this issue in Finance Committee and
15 these issues were not raised at that time.

16 To begin with, I think I would need to see what
17 Council Member Yeger is proposing and I'm hoping you
18 could share that with the other Council Members, all
19 of us, so we might even know what we're voting on and
20 you read it into the record but I could not absorb
21 it.

22 So, I would appreciate Council sending that
23 around and I feel not sufficiently - this issue, I
24 have not - as I say not raised in the Finance
25 Committee, so it was not something that has been

1
2 proposed to me before. Perhaps other Council Members
3 had seen this. Not me and I need a lot more
4 information before I could be asked to vote on this.
5 I think Council Member Dromm raises legal concerns.
6 I just don't understand.

7 So, my two cents is, I think if Council Members
8 are going to vote on this, we need to not be blind
9 sighted in this way number one. And -

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Need some
12 consideration to understand what we would be voting
13 on. If I am asked to vote on this, this second, I
14 would vote no for what Council Member Yeger is
15 proposing merely for the reason that I have no idea -

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: What is the status of
17 the meeting?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Sorry Council Member
20 Rodriguez. We are in the meeting now and the next
21 person up is Council Member Holden, Council Member
22 Rosenthal. I will give her a couple extra seconds to
23 finish her thought assuming that she is finished now,
24 we can go to Council Member Holden.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate, before
3 Council Member Holden speaks, as a point of
4 Parliamentary order, the proposed amendments have
5 been distributed to all Council Members.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Mr. Public Advocate, before
8 Council Member Holden speaks, I just want to be clear
9 that I do not support the amendments that are being
10 offered and I just want to reiterate on two of the
11 amendments that are offered. It would legally
12 invalid. We don't have the legal authority to do
13 what two of these amendments are seeking for us to
14 do. Which would be embarrassing for the City Council
15 to do something that we legally do not – two of them
16 we could do but the two Resolutions, we could not do.
17 It is not legal as Chair Dromm said.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I'm sorry, Council
19 Member Rosenthal, did you have – you had like five
20 more seconds if you wanted to finish what you were
21 saying.

22 You are on mute.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Helen, you are still on mute.
24 Okay, so let's go to Council Member Holden.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay, Council Member
3 Holden?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You know, without the
7 question of the legality. I just want to commend my
8 colleague from Brooklyn for standing up for the
9 middle class with this amendment. I think it's about
10 time. Even before this pandemic crippled our
11 economy, I have every year voted no on these types of
12 Resolutions that are being proposed today in the
13 Council. Which I believe if adopted, the interest
14 rate of a nonpayment of property taxes is too high a
15 rate. The middle class in this city continues to be
16 treated as a cash cow by City Hall and instead of
17 giving relief at this difficult time, for many in our
18 city, of our city residents are solution is to barely
19 lower the rates which is being proposed.

20 So, when it should be zero percent for the first
21 quarter of 2021 and much lower for the following
22 quarter. So, it's no wonder people are fleeing the
23 city. So, I support the amendment. You know, again,
24 if we have established that it's legal.

25 Thank you.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate, we have
3 the following members signed up to speak.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Hold on a second. I just want
5 to reiterate to the Council Member, two of the
6 amendments are not legal. It's not like a question
7 of maybe it's legal, maybe it's not legal. It is
8 clear that two of the amendments that are being
9 offered are not legally valid.

10 So, we as a Council would be voting to do
11 something that is not legally valid.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Just for a point of
13 information as well. Is it one amendment including
14 all of those Mr. Parliamentarian or is it several
15 amendments that we're voting on?

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate, it would
17 be four separate amendments.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Is anyone
19 else signed up to speak?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Council Members Koo,
21 Gjonaj, Yeger, Chin and Lancman.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Sorry, Koo, Gjonaj,
23 Yeger, and Lancman?

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chin.
25

1 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Chin and Lancman.

2 Thank you, Council Member Koo?

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Mr. Public
5 Advocate. I support Council Members amendment
6 because I think for a long time, this administration
7 has taken property owners for granted.
8

9 Property owners of small businesses will lead the
10 city to enforce quality of life issues.

11 Homelessness, we should send homeless people to the
12 shelters, not stay on the streets. We should send
13 those illegal renters to different places to find a
14 job or train them for different jobs because they are
15 competing with legal businesses who are paying
16 employees tax and public tax, all these things.

17 We are tired of seeing people peeing on the
18 streets and nobody paying attention to these. They
19 probably almost pay a lot of money for the services
20 alright but there is no service provided, especially
21 lately. The city has been ignoring property owners.
22 They try to demonize them and when there is alluding,
23 they didn't go out to protect them. They didn't even
24 say sorry for them.

1
2 So, for a long time, I think property owners have
3 to stand together to tell this administration enough
4 is enough. They have to do something for us, for the
5 small property owners, for the small property
6 business owners and property owners because otherwise
7 why would we be the cash cow for the city and they
8 are not feeding us.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
12 Member Gjonaj?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Public
14 Advocate. Before my time begins, I have a question
15 for the Parliamentarian because I'm not sure which
16 two proposals are legal or not legal. I'm not clear
17 on this.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
19 Gjonaj. I will seek Counsel and get back to the body
20 as quickly as possible.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I can tell you. The two that
22 are legally invalid I believe are 1349 and 1350.
23 Those are two that we do not have the authority to
24 change in the way that's being asked.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, 1348 and 1347 we can
3 change? We have the legal right?

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay, great. So, let me
6 begin by first thanking everyone and I want for the
7 record -

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Could I speak now?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you. Just for the
12 record, I hate the fact that Council Member Yeger
13 introduced this and it wasn't me. So, thank you
14 Kalman for being so aggressive and proactive.

15 I want to remind everyone that we have a
16 responsibility to be advocates for all of our
17 constituents and we have respect for one another. We
18 may not always agree but we should hear each other
19 out on the issues that are important to us. And I'm
20 just going to give a run down of the highest
21 effective real estate tax rates for class one
22 properties by Council District.

23 I mentioned in my opening remarks, that the first
24 32 highest effective tax rates on the outer boroughs
25 and you should be aware of what according to the

1
2 2,017 chart that I have, those districts are from
3 highest to lowest, 13th Council District, 51st Council
4 District, 18, 12, 50, 49, 11, 23, 27, 32, 45, 31, 15,
5 46, 28, 17, 24, 48, 42, 19, 30, 41, 25, 20, 21, 29,
6 26, and we finally get to Manhattan, District 14.
7 So, all of the outer boroughs, the poorest and the
8 most neediest pay the highest effective tax rates in
9 the City of New York.

10 I commend Kalman and all my colleagues for
11 sending that message back to City Hall. Enough is
12 enough. We owe it to our homeowners and to our small
13 businesses. We have to support them in their most
14 time of need and this is the crisis that has probably
15 opened up everyone's eyes. Our property owners,
16 whether they be small or large should be standing
17 together and fighting back to make sure that our tax
18 dollars are used wisely and usury rates of 18 percent
19 should be illegal. We wouldn't tolerate it from
20 anyone else.

21 So, I support the measures provided they are
22 legal and if the two proposals that are legal, I
23 fully encourage this body to rethink what interest
24 rate, anyone in charge their own constituency.

25 Thank you so much.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
3 Member Yeger?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Mr. President, might I
5 yield to the next speaker and speak at the end of the
6 list? This way I would be able to respond to any of
7 the concerns that have been raised.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Sure, Council Member
9 Chin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Public Advocate.
13 Look, I understand my colleagues sentiment. I've
14 been fighting on this issue for many years and there
15 is no equality in property tax assessment and how
16 property tax are being collected. A lot of times the
17 small building owners are lumped together with the
18 big building owner and that's why there was a
19 property tax reform commission.

20 This is a larger issue. It's not so simple but
21 what I've been fighting for with the legislation was
22 some breathing room for these property, small
23 property owners and they came to the hearing and they
24 told their story. Okay, we need greater reform and
25 we have to work together on that, but last minute

1
2 coming up with this, this is not fair. This is a
3 bigger issue and it also involves the state.

4 So, I think that we really have to look at this
5 comprehensively and the city needs to collect the
6 property tax. That's how services are being paid.
7 We have a big budget gap right now and we have to
8 encourage everyone who can pay their property tax and
9 if you cannot pay at least get some relief. That's
10 all we're talking about with this bill. It's not you
11 know the panacea. We still got a lot of work to do.

12 So, don't raise things last minute. This is
13 something that we have to work together continuously.
14 So, I ask my colleague if you are really serious
15 about equality in property tax assessment, let's sit
16 down and talk about it, okay. There are so many
17 issues that people don't want to address and let's
18 get those out in the open. But meanwhile I'm urging
19 you to support the legislation that was put forward.
20 That we need some breathing room and some relief.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: For the small property tax
23 owner. Thank you.

24

25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Council
3 Member. Council Member Yeger. I'm sorry Council
4 Member Lancman.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you. I just want
7 to understand has there been any kind of fiscal
8 analysis of what the impact of these resolutions
9 would be and these amendments would be? I don't know
10 if it's an appropriate protocol for me to address
11 that to Council Member Yeger or whether or not the
12 Finance division has an answer but does anyone know
13 what would be the fiscal impact of us adopting these
14 amendments to the resolution.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Let me respond Council Member
16 Lancman. We don't have an exact fiscal impact on
17 this because again it was offered at the last minute.
18 It wasn't discussed at the Finance Committee which
19 took a vote on this today but just to be clear, as we
20 are negotiating the budget, there are issues about
21 cash flow that the City Comptroller has projected and
22 our available cash is a lot less than it has been in
23 years past. We need around one billion dollars a
24 week to make payroll and other payments for the City
25 of New York and reducing the interest rate for late

1
2 payments from 18 percent to 2 percent would likely
3 induce big payers to delay their payments. It could
4 make our cash issues much more difficult and so, what
5 you saw today was a balancing act of us trying to
6 target relief to owner occupied and small homeowners
7 while also understanding the larger cash issues that
8 the city is facing right now with a record deficit.
9 So, we don't have an exact dollar amount but I'll
10 tell you that if this went through as projected, it
11 could create some very significant cash issues for
12 the City of New York.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Yeah, thank you Mr.
14 Speaker. So, I think that it's extremely difficult,
15 almost impossible to really think about these
16 amendments in the time that they've been made. I
17 don't want to be critical of my colleague but I was
18 not made aware of these amendments before this
19 meeting. We have a Finance Committee meeting, I
20 don't believe the issue was raise there, certainly
21 not in any detail and as the Speaker used the phrase
22 balancing act. We are in the middle, not the middle,
23 we are towards the end of trying to negotiate our way
24 out of an \$8 billion, \$9 billion budget hole. The
25 budget negotiating team is meeting constantly. It is

1
2 simply impossible and I'm going to go so far as to
3 say, irresponsible to contemplate voting for these
4 amendments while we're in the middle of all of this
5 without being able to take - put these amendments in
6 that context.

7 So, without in anyway diminishing the importance
8 of this issue, what it means for the homeowners in my
9 district of which there are many, myself included. I
10 don't think this is the appropriate moment, the
11 appropriate forum to vote for these amendments. I'd
12 love to continue this conversation as part of the
13 budget process further but I'm going to vote against
14 the amendments.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: And I urge my colleagues
17 to do likewise.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Point of information.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes, Parliamentary.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The following Council Members
22 wish to speak. Council Members Cabrera, Vallone,
23 Dromm and Yeger. As a point of information, Council
24 Member Dromm, you can ask your question and be
25

1
2 recognized when you are called on after Council
3 Members Cabrera and Vallone.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I'm sorry, just give
5 me the list again. Council Members Cabrera, Vallone
6 and who else?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Dromm and Yeger.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay, thank you.
9 Council Member Cabrera.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you Public
12 Advocate. Mr. Public Advocate I would like ask a
13 question to the sponsor of the bill regarding the
14 hardship position. I would use the rest of my time
15 so she could answer the questions regarding what is
16 the provision for the hardship? What is the hardship
17 provision within the bill?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Point of information
19 again. Can I speak as Chair of the Finance Committee
20 to who's committee the bill went through?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Parliamentarian -

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Public Advocate, there are
23 questions asked about information regarding the bill
24 that have not been answered.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes, Parliamentarian,
3 I'm pretty sure someone can't see their time
4 necessarily to have someone answer a question but
5 there are some very important questions that have
6 been asked. So, to get that answer, Parliamentarian,
7 can you get that information and get it back? You
8 could wait until Chair Dromm's time to speak so he
9 can answer all those questions? Please guide me in
10 the best way to make sure those questions are
11 answered.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate, you can
13 recognize Council Members as you see fit. So, you
14 can recognize Chair Dromm.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Sure, I'd like to
16 certainly recognize Chair Dromm to answer some of
17 those questions.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I would like folks to know
19 and to understand that this legislation actually
20 reduces the penalties on those families who have been
21 affected by COVID. This is a reduction in the
22 penalties, this is not an increase and I just want
23 people to understand that. It is not an increase.
24 If we were to go to zero, the potential for
25 bankruptcy exists and layoffs would be possible.

1
2 Thank you very much.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Mr.
4 Parliamentarian, are you in a position, are you able
5 to just repeat what those amendments were for 49, 50,
6 47, 48, so people can understand?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Mr. Public Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: To repeat, the Proposed
10 Amendments are, to Intro. 1964 to strike all
11 references to 7.5 percent and insert zero instead.
12 To Resolution 13-

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: So, I'm sorry. Just
14 so I'm clear, so 1964, that is after the time when
15 they had zero percent interest and now, we're in
16 October and they haven't been able to pay, is that
17 correct? Sorry, 1964 is - that's Council Member
18 Chin's bill?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: 1964 would authorize the 7.5
20 percent late payment available to small rent
21 regulated apartment and commercial buildings.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. I retract
23 my question; I was talking about a wrong bill. So,
24 1964, okay, please continue.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Resolution 1347 would strike
3 all references to 18 percent and insert 2 percent
4 instead. Resolution 1348 would strike all references
5 to 3.25 percent and 5 percent and insert zero
6 instead. And Resolution 1349, the amendment would
7 strike all references to 7.5 percent and insert zero
8 instead.

9 As a parliamentary order clarifying the
10 discussion earlier about the opinion of council as to
11 which would have legal authority. Of the four
12 proposed amendments, it is the proposed amendment to
13 Resolution 1349, striking all references to 7.5
14 percent, inserting zero instead. That would not have
15 valid legal authority.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: And 1348 as well?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay, thank you. We
19 have Council Member Vallone. If Council Member Dromm
20 would like to speak again and then Council Member
21 Yeger.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Good to go?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member
25 Vallone?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Yes, I was waiting to be
3 recognized. -

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I'm sorry Sergeant, is
5 the time running?

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yeah, starting time.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Alright.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: We've been having this
9 argument without really anyone listening for seven
10 years. So, we're always in favor of getting some
11 relief to the families that pay for everything in the
12 city and basically get nothing back.

13 So, with the real estate taxes that have been
14 used to pay for pretty much everything we could come
15 up with. However, the format, you know, I'm a big
16 part of our Council, our institution. I've always
17 believed that the Vallone's always have stand
18 strongly with our Speaker. It's not proper to do
19 this to our fellow body at a time when our city is
20 struggling. So, I oppose the method that was done
21 today and it should have been clearly brought forth
22 and debated by everyone but I can clearly support the
23 reduction in real estate tax for homeowners on
24 residential homes.

1
2 If you look at where those taxes go, it's not
3 coming back to the homes that are paying. So, I will
4 always support a decrease of taxes if it's done the
5 correct way but I'm not in favor of it at this late
6 moment with the amount of days and the chaos that the
7 city is facing, we need to show leadership and done
8 the right way. And it's time for us to be leaders
9 and not coward down to advocates and folks that are
10 out there telling us what to do. We know what to do.

11 So, it's time for us to step up, do the right
12 thing, balance this budget the right way and not do
13 [INAUDIBLE 1:38:00].

14 Thank you very much Mr. Speaker.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
16 Member Dromm, you are on cue, so do you want to speak
17 again?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Well, yes, I just want to
19 say that if we don't collect our taxes or if we don't
20 have a penalty for those who don't pay, then they are
21 not going to pay. So, how do they recommend that we
22 collect taxes from people? I think that you know,
23 you have to in some way incentivize people and those
24 who are paying early get a benefit and those who are

25

1
2 paying late get less of a penalty, a lot less of a
3 penalty then they would have in the past.

4 So, I am opposed to this Resolution. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you and Council
6 Member Yeger?

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you Mr. President.
9 I appreciate the vibrant debate here. I want to know
10 a number of things. First of all, yesterday
11 afternoon at 3:15, members of the Finance Committee
12 received an email from staff of the Counsel informing
13 them of what items would be voted on this morning in
14 Finance and these interest resolutions were not on
15 that email.

16 It was not included on the email to members of
17 the Finance Committee until 8:03 p.m. last night. I
18 do apologize for the late notice. This is not the
19 first time to correct one of my colleagues who
20 indicated that never in her life has she seen a
21 resolution proposed, an amendment proposed on the
22 floor. It was done just a few months ago from my
23 friend in Queens regarding a very important issue
24 here in the Council.

1
2 And it's been done and it's not onforward to do
3 that. That's why we have a rule that says that it's
4 okay to do it this way. It's specifically
5 anticipated that in the case of an emergency, which
6 is what this is, because this was so last minute.

7 Reality is and I appreciate the legal advice
8 that's been sought. This Council has in the past has
9 asked things that some people have thought were legal
10 turned out that it is not legal. Some thought were
11 illegal turned out to be legal.

12 I have been wrong in the past. I am the first to
13 admit that. Other members have been wrong in the
14 past. The item before us on the floor is whether or
15 not we are going to stand with the people of New York
16 and reduce the burden that they have and it's an
17 important question.

18 If it turns out that our vote and it turns out
19 that this is not lawful, all that will happen is that
20 there is not interest rate. Nothing bad will happen
21 and [INAUDIBLE 1:40:33] last year when this was
22 presented to us, we don't really make a lot of the
23 city in the big scheme of things from the interest.

24 I will also note in my remaining time Public
25 Advocate, I ask for indulgence, the Mayor's office is

1
2 circulating a text to members, not to me, that's
3 okay. This common floor amendment -

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Is inadvisable. It will
6 bankrupt the city and we will have no money for
7 services. Please, if you believe the other side of
8 the building, the finances of this city, vote no. Go
9 ahead. If you believe that the other side of the
10 building tells you the truth about the finances of
11 this city go ahead and vote no.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member Yeger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you Mr. President, I
14 appreciate the time and I appreciate all my
15 colleagues for this lively and vibrant debate. Thank
16 you.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: There are three other members
20 who wish to speak on debate on Council Member Yeger's
21 four proposed amendments.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The Council continues to seek
24 legal advice regarding the legality of the four
25 amendments. The three members who wish to debate the

1
2 proposed amendments are Council Members Koslowitz,
3 Gjonaj and Deutsch.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
5 Member Koslowitz.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I'm going to wait
8 until I vote to give remarks.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
10 Member Gjonaj?

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you again Public
13 Advocate and just for the record, we are not looking
14 to reduce the real estate taxes. The amendments that
15 have been put forth by Council Member Yeger, are to
16 lower the interest rates and I want to make that
17 point clear. This morning, I voted. I was not aware
18 and because of technical difficulties I was having, I
19 saw the email from yesterday at 3:15 knowing what we
20 are voting on. I was not aware of the 8 p.m. email
21 that was sent out amending the agenda and I sit on
22 Finance. And this morning, I voted for the motion to
23 approve all of the bills. I only found out
24 thereafter that these bills were added on and I
25

1
2 called to ask to see if I could amend my vote and I
3 was told sorry, that once the vote has been placed.

4 So, you see a few things happened here today that
5 probably could have been avoided and in transparency
6 we should look to solve and prevent from happening in
7 the future. But these motions that are being made
8 are justifiable. I mentioned to you the highest
9 effective tax rates in the City of New York, now
10 paying 18 percent interest and having the highest
11 effective tax rate is hurting our very own
12 constituency and communities.

13 The first 19 with the lowest effective tax rates
14 are in Manhattan. Outside 32 of our Council
15 Districts on the outer boroughs are paying the
16 highest effective tax rate. We may not be able to
17 change that until we bring actual forum to the real
18 estate tax structure. But today, we can send that
19 message clear; that interest rates of 18 percent and
20 7.5 percent and 3.5 percent are way too high for
21 struggling New Yorkers.

22 We are going to be held accountable for the vote
23 that we do today -

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And I commend all of you
3 for bringing this up and fighting alongside of our
4 property owners small and large and I don't think the
5 highest interest rate - the effective tax rates of
6 Manhattan are valid either. I support them as well
7 but I want to point out to all my colleagues that
8 it's your communities that are paying more than their
9 fair share.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member Gjonaj.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Sir.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
13 Member Deutsch?

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Staring time.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you very much and
16 I just want to say that I am very happy that
17 Councilman Yeger brought up this amendment that I
18 just heard for the first time on the floor today.
19 And we are always thinking about equity here in the
20 City of New York and we haven't seen much equity when
21 it comes to my constituents and once the amendment is
22 brought up, how could I say no. I support this
23 amendment because my constituents are nicked and
24 dined every single day. And you know, in regards to
25 the legality of it, you know, we vote on many issues

1
2 here in the Council, that's on a side note, where we
3 don't have the legal authority to vote on and there
4 is a number of bills I can menu and that we have
5 voted on in the past that we had no legal authority
6 but this amendment will show equity to all New
7 Yorkers and all hard working New Yorkers and I
8 support. I support this amendment and I have to
9 fight for my constituents here in the City of New
10 York. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Mr.
12 Parliamentarian, is there anyone else waiting to
13 speak?

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Mr. Public Advocate.
15 Council Member Van Bramer would like to speak.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member Van
17 Bramer.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much.
20 So, I'm going to vote no on these amendments but I do
21 want to say that I appreciate these lively debates
22 and I may disagree with Council Member Yeger but you
23 know, he referenced the fact that this is not the
24 first time we've ever brought up a point of
25 discussion or an amendment later in the process and I

1
2 think that's okay. We are all dually elected
3 officials and we are called on to debate important
4 issues and this is an important one and if Council
5 Member Yeger wants to bring it up, I think that's his
6 right.

7 All of them are dually elected officials and have
8 to make the best decision with the information that
9 we are provided with. So, I am not offended by
10 Kalman bringing this up at all and I think he has
11 every right to do so. Again, I am voting no and I
12 disagree with him but you know, I actually think the
13 Council is at its best when we have debate and we
14 actually have discussion and we talk about the things
15 that we agree with and disagree with and this is part
16 of the process, and I wish we did more of it quite
17 frankly.

18 So, while I am voting no, I just want to say I
19 don't resent Kalman Yeger for introducing this and
20 asking us to take up a contentious issue. That's
21 what we do as legislators. We all fought to be here,
22 we should be able to take votes and own our votes.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Council
24 Member. Mr. Parliamentarian, is anyone else signed
25 up to speak?

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Mr. Public Advocate. No
3 other Council Members wish to speak at this time.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I do actually want to
5 take a personal privilege to speak. I will be
6 speaking obviously as one of the sponsors of the bill
7 and I also want four Council Members who signed on an
8 amicus brief to try to force this Mayor to deal with
9 some of the issues that Council Member Yeger brought
10 up. I also have to acknowledge that I don't have to
11 wait for vote that everyone else will.

12 As Council Member Van Bramer said, I think lively
13 debate is good for any legislature. I think this has
14 been something that's been debated for a very long
15 time. Maybe this will help push folks forward to
16 actually deal with this. So, I want to make sure I
17 say that first but I do have to say I spent a lot of
18 time negotiating this bill. I don't know the things
19 that Council Member Chin went through negotiating
20 here bill. I imagine it was the same or even more
21 and we are facing a time right now, just right now
22 today where a conflux of things are happening.

23 We are about to pass a budget. We are trying to
24 maintain services and we're trying to provide relief
25 for people who need it. And I know for my bill and I

1
2 assume it's the same for Council Member Chin, it was
3 about making sure we can get the taxes for the
4 services that we need primarily focusing on the
5 people who just can't pay. It doesn't matter
6 whatever you say, if you can't pay it, you can't pay
7 it because you've been effected by COVID, we wanted
8 to make sure that there was relief.

9 Both of these bills provide that relief. I
10 understand that at least for Council Member Chin's
11 bill, the recommendations of trying to get it even
12 lower, I think that is noble and stuff that we should
13 discuss but I think it's tough to do just on today
14 without knowing the impact that will happen. We have
15 negotiated the bills knowing the impact that will
16 occur based on - sorry, based on what we presented
17 today.

18 Given where we are on the budget, given the
19 relief that's needed now and given that we're trying
20 to find a sweet spot of getting the tax revenue for
21 the services and providing the relief, my hope is
22 that we will support the bills that they are and vote
23 no on these amendments and I would encourage Council
24 Member Yeger to put these in as LS as soon as
25 possible and hopefully the body can take up those LS

1
2 and really push this debate forward because it is an
3 important one to have.

4 With that, I thank everyone for this lively
5 debate and Mr. Parliamentarian, I know you are going
6 to provide some instruction.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Mr. Public
8 Advocate. There has been a request from a Council
9 Member for a point of parliamentary order. The
10 meeting will stand at ease.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The meeting will resume.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: At this point, we will now
17 take a roll call vote concerning all four amendments.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: We lost you for a
19 second, so can you just repeat that?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: At this point, we will take a
21 roll call vote on Council Member Yeger's four
22 amendments. We will conduct the roll call vote as we
23 do for general orders, in which we will consider all
24 four bills in one roll call vote.

1
2 If members wish to vote differently on any of the
3 four votes, you can say I vote aye, with the
4 exception of the amendment on Resolution 1347 or
5 however you would like to split your vote. But we
6 will now take a roll call vote on just the four
7 amendments that Council Member Yeger has proposed on
8 the floor.

9 At the conclusion of the vote, the clerk will
10 announce the results of the vote and we will give
11 more information to the Council Members on where we
12 stand. As a reminder, at the conclusion of all the
13 voting in the parliamentary procedure regarding these
14 four amendments, we are still in discussion of
15 general orders and there are additional members who
16 wish to speak about general orders before we take a
17 vote on the underlying bills for general orders.

18 So, as a last point of clarification, right now,
19 we are only voting on Council Member Yeger's four
20 proposed amendments. A vote aye means a vote in
21 favor of the amendment. A vote nay is a vote against
22 the four proposed amendments that Council Member
23 Yeger has proposed.

24
25

1
2 With that, Mr. Public Advocate, please call on
3 the clerk to take a roll call vote on the proposed
4 amendments.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Asking the
6 Clerk to take a roll call vote on solely Council
7 Member Yeger's four amendments.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to explain my
10 vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you Mr. Public
13 Advocate. I, of course, have to say to my colleague
14 Council Member Yeger, these amendments are so
15 thoughtful and I appreciate them. I appreciate the
16 debate that we just had with regard to these
17 amendments. You have given me a lot to think about.
18 I took a lot of umbrage with our colleagues who
19 stressed that this has been debated for years and I
20 would have loved to have debated this in Committee
21 and I still want to debate this out even more because
22 I just think that these amendments are so very
23 thoughtful. I'm just not prepared to give an
24 affirmative on them yet. I think that we all have to
25 come back to the table and talk about it, hash it all

1
2 out, see where we would be if we were to say yes to
3 these amendments and the effect that it would have
4 overall on the city in the condition that we are in
5 right now as a city.

6 So, with that said, thank you Council Member
7 Yeger for these amendments. Respectfully, I will
8 vote nay. Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Permission to
11 explain my vote?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Very similar to my
15 colleague Council Member Adams. I do want to say to
16 Council Member Yeger, I 100 percent appreciate the
17 discussion and honestly, as I was sitting here, I
18 haven't had this level of quick research and analysis
19 of the law since law school in all honesty.

20 I have sat here at this computer going back and
21 forth and texting with colleagues and I appreciate
22 that and I appreciate you but because of where we are
23 right now in the middle of COVID and what we are
24 trying to accomplish right now, I look forward to
25

1
2 this debate in conference again but right now, I will
3 have to vote no but thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to explain my
8 vote?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm voting no on the
12 amendment but as my colleagues before have said, this
13 is an issue that we have to stop kicking down the
14 curb. We've talked at it; we've had some
15 presentations with finance about what would be the
16 impact of discussing that but this is a call for us
17 to take action definitively and bring some equity to
18 the inequity that we see. I'm voting no, but we need
19 to address this issue.

20 Thank you.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Permission to explain my
25 vote?

1 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: The first few months of
4 2020, I think is taking some of the most promising
5 steps in decades towards finally fixing our totally
6 unfair property tax system that puts all the burden
7 on the working and middle class in the outer boroughs
8 and then COVID hit and now everything is on hold once
9 again.
10

11 So, I think given that the city's open mechanism
12 for raising revenue is going to be through property
13 taxes, I don't know how much more urgent it could be
14 to ensure that the taxes are done in a way that's
15 fair and truly reflective of people's values. I was
16 not prepared to vote on these amendments. I did not
17 know these amendments were coming up, but now that
18 they've been brought to the floor, I don't see how I
19 could vote against them.

20 So, I'm voting in favor of them. Aye on all.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to explain my
23 vote?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: My comments are very
3 brief. I want to share the same sentiment shared by
4 my colleagues Barron, Adams, and Ampry-Samuel
5 regarding the importance of this level of discussion
6 and I'm looking forward Council Member Yeger - I know
7 it's coming from a really good place regarding this
8 issue that has been plaguing us for years. I think
9 Council Member Chin and Jumaane Williams, it's a step
10 forward but it's not the end.

11 So, with that, I'll be voting no but I would like
12 to up in front with you and my colleagues to making
13 sure that we keep moving to the next step. There is
14 a next step that needs to take place.

15 Thank you so much Public Advocate.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote no and I hope that
19 my colleagues will continue to work on this issue.

20 Thank you.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen? Deutsch?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to explain my
23 vote?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. So, I've
3 been hearing from my colleagues how this have been
4 discussed at a hearing. This should have been
5 discussed this morning at the Finance votes but I
6 have to say and be very honest, I applaud Council
7 Member Yeger for bringing this up at the Stated
8 Meeting and only to prove the fact that now it's
9 getting some attention is that I'm watching all my
10 colleagues during the stated and no one is eating
11 lunch but paying attention. Paying attention to help
12 all New Yorkers and all those that need this type of
13 relief.

14 So, with that, I am voting aye on this amendment
15 and I want to thank all my colleagues for paying
16 attention to this issue.

17 Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to explain my
20 vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Yeah, thank you Mr. Speaker
24 and all of you for this opportunity and I would like
25 to congratulate Council Member Yeger for bringing

1
2 this issue to the floor. Other colleagues say that
3 it's irresponsible for addressing this issue and to
4 bring this to the floor could be irresponsible. I
5 mean when are we – the homeowners, the middle class
6 but we are really, really fighting for them. This is
7 an opportunity; this is the time. Other people say,
8 oh, it's not legal you got to go through the court.

9 I mean, my concern is to send a message to all
10 the homeowners in District 18 and throughout the city
11 that this Council Member is protecting their interest
12 and their finances. And I'm voting yes on all.

13 Thank you.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm:

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote no.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGIENE: I vote no.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Sorry, I was on mute,
21 permission granted.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you. Thank you,
24 now I'll be quick. I appreciate all of my colleagues
25 speaking up, particularly about such an important

1
2 issues where we know that many homeowners and
3 property owners are struggling, have been struggling
4 and will continue to struggle.

5 I think this is a conversation that we must
6 continue to have. Particularly many of us who
7 represent outer boroughs where the burden has always
8 been placed on them. Their properties are valued at
9 a different assessment level and they continue to pay
10 higher taxes and that simply has never been fair.
11 But for the purposes of today's conversation, I want
12 to echo the sentiments expressed by Council Member
13 Adams and Council Member Ampry-Samuel, as we continue
14 to talk about this important issue. I will be voting
15 no on today's amendments.

16 I want to thank Council Member Yeger for bringing
17 the issue up. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to explain my
20 vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Public
24 Advocate. We heard a lot from our members and
25 obviously there is a concern and these are trying

1
2 times spiritually on all of us. We're going to be
3 judged by how we vote on these amendments that have
4 been brought forth by Councilman Yeger and I want to
5 remind everyone that if we don't do this and stand up
6 today, with one voice, the next time we can revisit
7 this will be one year from now.

8 I have no idea what this new world is going to
9 look like. I don't know what next month is going to
10 look like. I have no idea what this budget is going
11 to look like. I am not ready to throw my homeowners
12 under the bus again in their most time of need and
13 crisis. I'm going to support the motions that were
14 put forth by Yeger with the understanding that these
15 are difficult times on all of us.

16 But we will not be able to revisit this for
17 another year, so I vote aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: No.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to briefly
22 explain my vote?

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: The Mayor's Office texts
3 to the members during this debate confirms that the
4 middle class property tax and the interest penalty,
5 is the cash cow of this city. So, enough is enough.
6 Strike one for the middle class here. I want to
7 thank Councilman Yeger for this amendment and I vote
8 aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to explain my
11 vote?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: This Council is
15 responsible for convening a New York City Advisory
16 Commission on property tax reform that issued a
17 preliminary report back in January with a host of ten
18 different recommendations aimed at trying to level
19 the playing field. In particular why the
20 recommendations would have been particularly helpful
21 to those in co-ops and condo's, many of which live in
22 my district along with many others across the city as
23 well as trying to scale up and level up the taxes for
24 the entire city and trying to create something that
25 was more equitable and sought after.

1
2 The public hearing schedule was about to begin
3 when this pandemic hit and I think that that is the
4 correct process. It is a process that would involve
5 the city and the state and I do support that and I
6 want to see that process move forward and I would
7 encourage all of my colleagues who are talking about
8 trying to support the middle class to fully engage
9 the property tax reform commission and that we demand
10 that this move forward and start taking testimony
11 through online and that being said, I vote no on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to explain my
14 vote briefly?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you very much.

18 While I certainly respect my colleagues right to
19 bring the motion to the floor, I really don't think
20 that this is the appropriate forum in which we could
21 hash this out and have a discussion based on facts
22 and come to a decision based on facts. I would need
23 more information.

24 So, for that reason, I'm going to vote no on the
25 amendment today. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Mr. Public Advocate, may I explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you. So, I think today we have for the first time we can speak on behalf of all the small property owners. Many people in my district own apartments, small or co-ops and condominiums and they always complain to me the tax is too high because they live on fixed income, especially when you retire.

The property tax keeps increasing every year. Today the folks are not talking about – they are not talking about tax; the tax is too high. Today we are talking about the interest rate if you don't pay for the property tax.

So, and this is the first step we show to our middle class property owners and they are not rich people. They are retired teachers right. They are retired workers and they are on limited income. So, at least we show them the first step that we are

1
2 listening. We are trying to help them. This is a
3 first step to lower the interest rate if they don't
4 pay and they are - we have to decrease the property
5 tax rates. We have to find a forum on how to
6 decrease it because this has been increasing every
7 year, every year, year by year. After 20 years you
8 pay almost double and people's salaries are not going
9 double. So, with all that said, I vote to support
10 the amendments.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be excused to
13 explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: While I do not want to
17 throw my constituents or any constituents under the
18 bus by taxes, right now we are going through a \$9
19 billion budget deficit fighting for these services
20 for these people that we are talking about today and
21 I want to get through that. I want to revisit this
22 again and I feel that we have to revisit it and we're
23 going to.

24 I vote no.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Permission to explain my
vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you. I appreciate
you Council Member Yeger for bringing this to my
attention earlier and to your leadership and your
advocacy and just helping us to understand this
process. I agree with the bills as is in regards to
Council Member Chin and Public Advocate William's
bill. Everything else is a bit convoluted but I hope
that we can have a larger discussion and debate about
this. For right now, I'm going to vote no on this
amendment but I hope we can have a larger
conversation later. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: MENCHACA?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to also extend thank you to my colleague from Brooklyn, Council Member Yeger for this lively debate. I think you know; debates happen when they happen and they are happening now and I approve of that.

I also am very curious about how the impact will be or what the full impact will be which means that a yes vote actually gets us to another week into the next Stated when we can actually vote on the new amendment.

And so, because of that I'm going to vote yes on your amendments and in favor of continuing this conversation, so that we can have a more robust discussion and thank you to the Mayor for messaging me and my message to you is defund the NYPD and reallocate those funds to communities of color and communities impacted by COVID.

Thank you.

1 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to explain?

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, we find ourselves
6 advocating on behalf of homeowners and those people
7 who are critical to tax bases. This is a
8 conversation that is not [INAUDIBLE 2:11:46] some
9 that work in the Council when this conversation began
10 of [INAUDIBLE 2:11:50-2:11:52] that is why we have
11 the reform commission that was mentioned by Council
12 Member Kallos and we had continued to address that
13 and we understand that this is certainly
14 disproportionate and that this is a separate issue on
15 penalties but it is certainly time to move forward on
16 this.
17

18 I think I commend all of the thoughtful discourse
19 that has happened today but I want to commend
20 especially the members who introduced this
21 legislation. Who thought it was important enough to
22 in a very responsible way reduce the communities for
23 homeowners. At the same time, ensure that we can
24 provide services in a time of COVID-19. Many of us
25 whose communities have been ravished, who have

1
2 benefited by the essential services that had been
3 provided and the additional services that have been
4 provided. This has been absolutely important.

5 So, with that, I will be voting no.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: No.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Yes.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to briefly
12 explain my vote?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you Mr. Public
16 Advocate. So, I want to thank Council Member Yeger
17 for bringing this to the floor and bringing the
18 conversation to the body today because it's something
19 we've discussed for the last three years while I've
20 been at the Council at least, I'm not sure about
21 before that and I know it's something him and many
22 other members feel deeply about in terms of helping
23 out their constituents and property owners in the
24 outer boroughs in particular.

1
2 I am concerned about the finances of the city
3 right now. I'm concerned about changing without
4 having a fiscal impact, without understanding what it
5 would do in terms of our property tax revenues being
6 collected and how it effects services, so forth and
7 so on. So, I am voting against the amendment but I
8 do appreciate all the debate and hearing a response
9 of it. It was very helpful to me but I do think we
10 in a fiscal crisis have to be careful about how we
11 impact the city's revenues going forward and
12 concerned about the impact on people paying.

13 So, thank you. I'm voting against.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to explain my
16 vote Public Advocate?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you. I just want
21 to put into perspective the fact that this debate
22 that we're having right now is not necessarily one of
23 people that support homeowners and people that don't.
24 The legislation doesn't do either of that.

1
2 I think it's an attempt here to have a larger
3 conversation about property tax reform which I do
4 think is a valid conversation to have. I just don't
5 think that these bills are necessarily contradictory
6 to that work. So, I just don't think this was the
7 appropriate time to have this debate. I think we
8 should have had this debate a long time ago but we do
9 offer Council Members opportunities in subcommittees
10 and committees to really talk about this extensively
11 and if the said Council Member didn't take the time
12 to do that, you know, I feel like this is more of a
13 performance than it is an actual want to help people.

14 So, I'm going to be voting no against this on
15 all.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: RICHARDS?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: No.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so much. I do
20 hope that at some point soon we spend this amount of
21 time talking about tenant relief as well. And with
22 that, I vote no on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I also believe that as
25 we're taking the time to disclose this proposal, we

1
2 also pay other attention to be sure that as we look
3 at consequences. All Council Members and the Speaker
4 and the Administration focus on working on this
5 project, focus on the property initiative, so that we
6 can get prepared to another type of coronavirus and
7 with that, I vote no.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to explain my
10 vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Usually when we
14 talk about property tax bills, I vote with my
15 colleagues Yeger and my fellow Staten Island
16 delegation because I happen to represent a district
17 that is disproportionately taxed and have been
18 negatively impacted by the disparities in the tax
19 laws.

20 And so, this is very difficult for me because my
21 homeowners are being unfairly taxed and the interest
22 rates are unfair but I have to be on the budget
23 and negotiating team, I am keenly aware of the state
24 of our budget. And so, it makes it very difficult to
25 vote in a manner that I think is now fiscally

1
2 irresponsible, that would help all of us, the entire
3 city get through the other side of the COVID
4 pandemic.

5 So, because of that, I am going to vote no but I
6 am going to strongly, and I am going to support
7 Council Member Yeger as vociferously as I can to
8 ensure that this issue does not wind up on the back
9 burner and that we do address it because it is far,
10 far too long that we continue to impact the outer
11 boroughs disproportionately.

12 So, I vote no on all but reluctantly. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: No.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres? Treyger?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to explain my
19 vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public
23 Advocate. I think it goes without question that
24 there is a need and urgency to look at equity and
25 fairness in the property tax system but there is no

1
2 way you can have an honest conversation about
3 property tax if you do not discuss New York State
4 governments role and the Federal governments role.

5 Why is there such a reliance on local taxes?

6 Let's look at the fact that as of this moment,
7 Washington DC has appropriated zero to local and
8 state aid in the middle of a pandemic and fiscal
9 crisis. The last time I checked many homeowners are
10 also teachers, nurses, bus drivers and other critical
11 essential workers whose jobs are on the line right
12 now. And the last time I checked New York State
13 still owes our schools over \$1 billion. New York
14 State is on the verge of cutting an addition \$2
15 billion to New York City.

16 Ask hospitals in my borough Brooklyn if they are
17 getting their fair share from Albany. Ask hospitals
18 in Queens are they getting their fair share from
19 Albany. The answer is no and so, yes, we need
20 fairness and justice in property taxes but lets have
21 an honest conversation how New York State and
22 Washington DC continuously fail the people of our
23 city and that is why I vote no on this amendment.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Just wondering if this is
3 a good time to bring my no confidence vote. I'm just
4 kidding. I am voting yes on the amendments and I
5 think that the debate is great for the body and its
6 great to see everybody's faces. Stay safe, I vote
7 yes.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Permission to explain my
10 vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you. So, when
14 have we had this conversation? For those of us who
15 are a little upset that we've gone off track, I don't
16 know when we had it, so it is time to talk about how
17 we pay for things. It is time to figure out how we
18 do finance the city and where the income come from to
19 create this great city. So, yes, Kalman Yeger's
20 amendments again, should not have been done this way
21 and the only reason why that I'm voting no, but that
22 will never happen again. And the next time we ever
23 have - it has to be on the promise that we have this
24 real conversation because for anyone who doesn't
25 think we need this conversation then you are not

1
2 listening. And everything we do and every program we
3 put forward and everything we initiate has to be
4 funded. They can't always be funded on the backs of
5 the middle class and homeless and today this crisis
6 has just that to - So, yes, these - what we're voting
7 on today, I vote with our Speaker. Against, so I
8 vote no on the Resolutions and the amendments but
9 only on the promise that we have real estate tax
10 reform mentioned and where the funds are coming from,
11 how those are distributed and what communities they
12 are going to.

13 And for that, I say no on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to briefly
16 explain my vote?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So, again, I
20 appreciate Council Member Yeger bringing this up. I
21 actually love when we debate even off the cuff and I
22 actually think that's when the Council is at its best
23 as a legislative body. So, I appreciate Council
24 Member bringing this up and I wish we did more of
25 this debating style legislature but I disagree with

1
2 the amendment and will be voting no but take no
3 exception whatsoever to Kalman Yeger forcing us into
4 debate. That's exactly what a legislature should do.
5 With that I vote no.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Mr. President, may I be
8 excused to explain my vote?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I would first like to
12 express my gratitude to Mr. Speaker and Mr. President
13 for indulging and enabling in many ways this debate
14 and my gratitude of course to Mr. Public Advocate
15 yourself and Council Member Chin for advancing the
16 two bills that are going to pass today with my
17 support, notwithstanding the failure of this
18 amendment, of these four amendments.

19 I know that in this body, notwithstanding the
20 fact that this amendment, these four amendments got a
21 few votes and we know what the tally is and I'm
22 sensing the feeling amongst many members who did not
23 vote yes that this conversation has to happen.

24 So, for those who have somewhat umbrage in the
25 way that it was done, my apologies. I am grateful -

1
2 one member, although some have alluded to this.
3 Council Member Van Bramer said right before me, this
4 is what we should be doing. This is what we should
5 be doing. We are paid to be legislatures. We're not
6 a rubber stamp and we're not a community board, we're
7 not the prompt City Council. We are a legislature
8 and this is what we should be doing. I am so
9 grateful that the Speaker has allowed us to come to
10 the floor and allow this conversation to happen and
11 Mr. President for you leading the debate.

12 My friends, we can continue this conversation.
13 Not today, because it's almost over and again, my
14 apologies to those who plan to exit this meeting a
15 little earlier. We have to do a little bit more for
16 New Yorkers, we do and as Council Member Rivera said,
17 it's not just for one or the other. We have to help
18 the tenants. We've been talking about that for the
19 last several weeks. We have to help the tenants but
20 if the tenants don't pay rent, there is no property
21 tax to pay.

22 These problems are hand and hand and the solution
23 is hand and hand. So, with that Mr. President, I
24 vote aye on all and I am grateful again.

25 Thank you, sir.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to explain my
vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Public Advocate
Jumaane Williams. I just want to say that when we
really care about issues and issues are important to
us, I believe it is important for us to be able to
have the proper debate in the proper setting, such as
the democratic conference, such as hearings, meetings
within our delegations. These are opportunities for
us to speak about issues that we care about with
experts that can help us to answer questions.
Everything is a checks and balance system. If we do
one thing, we need the experts to also tell us how it
impacts every other thing. What is the domino affect
that it will have on our city, so that we are making
the most responsible decisions. Do we really care
about these issues? We need to make sure that we
have these discussions in the proper forums. This
type of forum doesn't give the members an opportunity

1
2 to ask questions, to speak to financial experts, and
3 in essence, time is the most valuable thing that we
4 have right now and we have to utilize it wisely.

5 So, there was an opportunity to bring this up in
6 the hearing with Finance and it was not done so. So,
7 the challenge that I have with this, are we actually
8 trying to get progress? Are we trying to create a
9 change or are we trying to create political
10 favoritism with the people that we represent or
11 others or with colleagues or with the media or the
12 press.

13 It's critical that we make movements to make sure
14 that we are actually achieving our goals but not
15 simply headlining issues that are not going to go
16 anywhere without the proper information, impact,
17 research, question, and debate.

18 I vote no in terms of how these were brought to
19 the floor. This didn't give us adequate time,
20 energy, or resources to make the most informed
21 decision.

22 Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote no on all the
25 amendments. Do we have a tally? Mr. Clerk?

1
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Yes. Council Member Yeger's
3 motion stands at 13 in the affirmative and 34 in the
4 negative.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you Mr. Clerk.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Mr. Clerk.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Are we continuing General
8 Orders now?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Correct. First, Mr. Public
10 Advocate, please note as the presiding officer that
11 the motion has failed.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Yes, the
13 motion has failed based on the numbers that the
14 described.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate, the next
16 two speakers on discussion of General Orders are
17 Council Members Reynoso and Treyger.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: To clarify as a parliamentary
20 point of order before we move forward, because the
21 amendments have failed, we are now in discussion of
22 general orders and when we vote on general orders,
23 all four of the amendments have failed and therefore
24 the Intro. and the Resolutions that you will be
25

1
2 voting on coupled on general orders will be in their
3 original form.

4 Thank you very much Mr. Public Advocate, you can
5 now recognize the remaining two speakers in
6 discussion of general orders.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Mr.
8 Parliamentarian and as I know we have all
9 simultaneously trying to feverishly change our
10 schedules around. We will continue with our general
11 orders and call on Council Member Reynoso and Council
12 Member Treyger.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member
15 Reynoso?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah, I'm so sorry, I
17 didn't know I was going next. I just wanted to say
18 thank you to everyone that is going to be supporting
19 the outdoor dining bill today. There was very
20 important work that was done by the City Council in
21 ensuring that we got to this in a timely fashion and
22 not delayed it for small business. COVID has hit
23 many of our communities very hard and it has also hit
24 small businesses very hard and we finally got an
25 opportunity to really think about street space and

1
2 exactly how we can use it to help vulnerable
3 populations including our restaurants.

4 We're also talking about hundreds; I mean
5 thousands of people getting back to work. There is
6 one block in Manhattan that has over eight businesses
7 that are going rehire 360 people - that have already
8 hired 360 people and that's the conversation we need
9 to be having.

10 I'll end by saying, this legislation also speaks
11 to equity. We're not asking for people to spend a
12 lot of money, hire lobbyists or architects to put
13 forth a sidewalk café type of system. Instead we are
14 allowing for the neighborhoods of Brownsville, the
15 lower east side, the upper west side, and South
16 Bronx, all the exact same opportunity to put
17 something in front of their restaurants and it just
18 speaks to equity and gives everybody an opportunity
19 to have that experience.

20 So, again, I want to thank my colleagues that
21 will vote yes. I am really excited to see this
22 program continue. I've gone out there twice already
23 and it's been a great experience. I hope the rest of
24 my colleagues can be supportive both by supporting
25

1
2 this bill but also going out and supporting your
3 local restaurant.

4 Thank you very much and very quick, I just want
5 to thank Speaker Corey Johnson. I always have a lot
6 of crazy streets ideas and he took this one and ran
7 with it and I really appreciate his support of the
8 work that I'm doing when it comes to rethinking
9 streetscape and for his leadership on this issue.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
11 Member Treyger?

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public
14 Advocate. I wanted to – actually my explanation on
15 my vote recently is relevant to my general order
16 remarks. I want to thank the leadership of my
17 colleague Council Member Vanessa Gibson for
18 spearheading the funding tracker bill on COVID-19. I
19 want to argue that you know, Coney Island is not just
20 a beach and boardwalk. It is not just the wonder
21 wheel.

22 Over 50,000 people call it their neighborhood
23 home and we have the 5th highest death rate per
24 capita in the entire City of New York. And we need
25 to make sure that resources reach the most impacted

1
2 communities like mine and like Council Member Gibson
3 mentioned, there is precedent of this with the Sandy
4 Tracker Bill making sure that resources flow to the
5 hardest hit communities to make sure that our
6 neighborhoods have adequate healthcare access. That
7 every single school is a community school with all
8 the integrated services that our children and
9 families and our seniors need.

10 So, I just want to urge my colleagues to please
11 vote yes on the funding tracker bill.

12 Thank you very much Mr. Public Advocate.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Mr.
14 Parliamentarian, do we have anyone else signed up?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, we do not Mr. Public
16 Advocate.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you and just
18 very briefly, you know, there is a lot of discussion
19 about the bills, I didn't have the opportunity to - I
20 want to discuss mine very quickly and thank people
21 who helped work on it.

22 As I mentioned, there is a delicate balancing
23 act, the need to collect property tax payments which
24 is our biggest source of revenue, while extending
25 economic relief to those who need it the most. These

1
2 were negotiated well into the night. My bill simply
3 defers July property tax payments to October, given
4 New Yorkers time to pay the liability with no
5 interest applied. If property owners still struggle
6 to make their payment by October, they can apply for
7 City Property Tax Aid program, which provides an
8 installment again.

9 The Property Tax deferral is applied to
10 residential properties with an assessed value, not a
11 market value. An assessed value of \$250,000 or less
12 if the property is the owner's primary residence.

13 Property owners with a combined income of up to
14 \$150,000. Property owners who have been adversely
15 effected by COVID including having been diagnosed
16 with a family members diagnosed with COVID-19,
17 experience symptoms of COVID-19 as a medical
18 diagnosis and loss of primary source of income due to
19 COVID-19 between March 7th and June 30th which
20 continued for at least one month.

21 I think this strikes the right balance and I do
22 want to thank the Mayor's Office for helping come up
23 with the necessary agreement, Noah Brick and Rebecca
24 Chasan for the Council's Finance Department. Of
25 course, Speaker Johnson and Chair Dromm and I'd also

1
2 like to thank my staff Director of Legislation Casie
3 Addison, Legislative Associates Anika Michel, Brandon
4 Jordan, plus Deputy Public Advocate Nick Smith, Chief
5 Deputy Public Advocate Veronica Aveis and my entire
6 Policy Division and urge my colleagues to vote yes on
7 this bill.

8 Next, I believe if I'm correct Mr.
9 Parliamentarian, are we doing Report of Special
10 Committee's? Is that correct?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, that is correct.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Reports of
13 Standing Committee's?

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
15 Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, Intro. 1957-
16 A Outdoor Dining?

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
18 Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
20 Finance, Intro. 1952-A COVID-19 Funds Tracker?

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
22 Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro. 1964-A Fiscal Interest
24 Rate?

1
2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
3 Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro. 1974-A Interest Rate for
5 Property Owners Effected by COVID-19?

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
7 Orders with a message of necessity.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso. 1346 through
9 1350 Payment of Real Estate Taxes?

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
11 Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 664 and Reso.
13 1351, 3415 Knox Place?

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
15 Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
17 Governmental Operations Intro. 1950-A COVID-19 Task
18 Force?

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
20 Orders.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
22 Housing and Buildings, Intro. 1976 Short-term Housing
23 Rental Transactions?

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
25 Orders.

1
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Transportation, Intro.'s 1250-A, 1264-A and 1266-A,
4 E-Bikes and E-Scooters?

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and Coupled on General
6 Orders and at this time, I am asking the clerk to
7 please take a roll call vote on all of the items
8 coupled on today's general orders calendar.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye on all except
19 Preconsidered Reso.'s 1347, 1348 and 1349. Thank you
20 very much.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I vote aye on all with
23 the exception of 1347, 1348, and 1349.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I want to congratulate
3 all my colleagues on their bills and I want to thank
4 everyone who will be voting yes on the e-scooter and
5 e-bikes. With that, I vote aye on all.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I am voting no on 1347,
8 1348, 1349. Aye on the rest.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye on all. Thank
11 you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you very much.
14 Permission to explain my vote for a second?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I just want to let
18 everyone know I have an Article 11 Preservation Land
19 Use item and despite COVID, I did go in and check the
20 property and I feel like this is a very good use of a
21 tax expenditure in trying to keep this building
22 affordable and make necessary repairs that will make
23 the lives better for the tenants. So, I urge
24 everyone to vote aye.
25

1
2 I am going to vote no on Intro. 1250-A and 1264-A
3 and aye on everything else. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No on 1250, 1264, 1266,
6 1964 and no on Reso.'s 1347, 1348, 1349 and aye on
7 the rest.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I am voting no on 1347,
10 1348, 1349 and yes on the rest.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yes, on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote yes.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so much. I
20 will be voting aye on today's agenda but I wanted to
21 certainly speak to the package of bills related to
22 the e-scooters and e-bikes and recognizing as we
23 continue to get out of COVID-19 and offering and
24 really embracing other modes of transportation.
25 Certainly, a district like mine in the Bronx could

1
2 always use alternative modes particularly for many
3 residents and youth that need to get around and go to
4 work and certainly providing those transportation
5 alternatives. I would hope that the sponsor as well
6 as my colleagues and I have an opportunity during the
7 pilot for the shared e-scooter legislation, that we
8 work very closely with the New York City Department
9 of Transportation as it relates to this pilot. As it
10 begins, that provides for safety and protection for
11 all users, safety measures and making sure that
12 everyone is safe in terms of protecting not only the
13 user but communities as well.

14 What we don't want to see is a proliferation of
15 e-bikes and e-scooters all across the City of New
16 York. Certainly, we embrace new ideas but I think as
17 this pilot commences, it's important for us to work
18 very close with the DOT to make sure whatever gaps in
19 service and deficiencies that we are seeing, that we
20 recognize it and we work with DOT as well as all
21 stakeholders, transportation groups and
22 environmentalist groups and really make sure that the
23 pilot can be successful. And if we identify any
24 issues, I would hope that amendments could be made as
25 we see fit moving along.

1
2 So, I will be voting aye on today's agenda and I
3 want to thank all of my colleagues for a very
4 spirited debate today on a number of bills on today's
5 agenda and thank you Council Member Cabrera for
6 bringing these bills to the floor and certainly
7 looking forward to the continued work ahead.

8 Thank you so much.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to briefly
11 explain my vote?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I am looking forward to
15 being a part of the conversation with the pilot
16 programs and around 1250 and 1266. Everything that
17 was mentioned by my colleagues earlier including not
18 only safety but proper storage. My concern is that
19 we will have scooters in our corridors and in our
20 residential blocks that will be more of a hurdle and
21 perhaps an obstacle to our pedestrians.

22 But I'm looking forward to helping fix and adjust
23 that to a permanent solution as we do in the future.
24 I'll be voting aye on all except 1347, 1348 and 1349.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Briefly explain my
3 vote Mr. Public Advocate?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you very much.
7 I just want to – I am aye on all but I am looking
8 forward to the scooters because you know, my district
9 perhaps more than any other in the City of New York
10 is transit starved. We don't have Long Island
11 Railroad; we don't have the subway and mass transit
12 in my district is essentially two people in the car.
13 So, I think the scooters should be interesting
14 and I'm looking forward to seeing who that works out.
15 I want to congratulate the sponsor of the legislation
16 and with that, I vote aye on all.

17 Thank you, Mr. Public Advocate.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye on all with
21 the exception of Intro.'s 1250, 1264, 1266, and
22 Reso.'s 1347, 1348, 1349 of which I vote no. Thank
23 you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all except 1347,
1348, 1349, 1250-A and 1266-A.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I am voting no on Intro.
1266-A, Resolution 1347, 1348, 1349 and I vote aye on
the rest of it. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Can I briefly explain my
vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I'm going to vote no on
1250 and 1266 relating to the e-scooters. I'm just
concerned that there are important safety issues for
both riders and pedestrians that haven't been
resolved.

We are reimagining how our streetscape is going
to look and operate and I think we need to do that
deliberately.

So, I would like to - I wish that we were talking
about maybe a modest pilot in terms of the public's

1
2 ability to use e-scooters but going from zero to
3 sixty, if you don't mind the transit metaphor, is a
4 little too much for me.

5 So, no on 1250 and 1266 and yes on everything
6 else. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request permission to
9 explain?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Mr. Public
13 Advocate. I vote aye on all and I'm especially
14 enthusiastic about Council Member Reynoso's bill for
15 open streets. I've also been eating out most every
16 night but I do want to say, I remain disappointed
17 that the deliver workers that worked for those
18 restaurants still don't get a single paid day off
19 when they are sick. And that while we are handing
20 open space, free public space over to restaurants
21 like Chipotle and McDonalds and other fast food
22 restaurants, that we're not protecting their workers
23 from unfair firings for speaking up about COVID
24 conditions. We could do both those things. We have
25 legislation in the essential worker and fast worker

1
2 Bill of Rights and I really hope we will take them
3 up. I wish we were doing those today along with
4 Council Member Reynoso's bill.

5 And then I also want to say, you know, I'm sorry
6 we're not at City Hall today because if we were, we
7 would be hearing right outside us the voices of the
8 people who are out there speaking up loud and clear
9 about what they really want us to be debating in this
10 body. Demanding that we fight to defund the NYPD by
11 at least \$1 billion and repurpose that money to
12 protect education and youth services and social
13 services especially in Black and Brown neighborhoods.

14 I like when this body is used to debate and we
15 want to have robust debate but let's have the debate
16 on the things that the people are calling for, on the
17 things that the people are out in the streets for. I
18 know we're finalizing that budget and we'll have a
19 subsequent meeting to get it done but boy, if we're
20 going to raise up our voices here and spend our time
21 debating, let's do it on the things that are most
22 urgent in our city.

23 I vote aye on all. Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin:
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: With particular gratitude
3 to Council Members Cabrera, Reynoso, Chin, and the
4 Public Advocate, on their very thoughtful and
5 thorough legislation today and thanks to the Speaker
6 and staff for shepherding them through. I want to
7 proudly vote aye on all. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Yes, with congrats to all
10 the sponsors, I will be voting aye on all.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to explain
17 my vote?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I will be voting aye on
21 all except for 1250 and 1266. I already made my
22 comments in the general discussion but I feel like
23 the work that we are doing around immigrant delivery
24 workers are where our energy needs to be placed. And
25 I'm glad that Council Member Lander invoked the

1
2 occupy work that's happening right now or the
3 occupying that's happening right now. It's out of
4 City Hall. They are demanding us that we have these
5 debates happening at the exact same time. Antonio
6 Reynoso and I were at a police free schools rally
7 where the youth are asking us to remove police from
8 schools. That's a debate that I'm ready to have and
9 I hope we can have that as soon as possible.

10 Thank you so much and I vote aye on all except
11 for 1250 and 1266.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye with the
14 exception of 1266-A.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Okay, Council Member, what was
16 the first one that you said?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye with the exception of
18 1266-A.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. My apologies.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye on all with the
23 exception of 1250 and 1266.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Did you hear me?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes, we can.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Perkins?

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you very much.

Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to explain my
vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just wanted to speak
to the concerns we have over the impact that e-
scooters has related to a lifeline or lifetime.
We're concerned that many of them go to landfills and
have a short, a very short lifespan.

I think we should follow up that conversation
with legislation that reports back to us exactly
where these scooters go to die. I think it's
important for our long term climate change
conversation and we shouldn't ignore it. But I think
that that should happen after this vote.

1
2 So, I am voting aye on all and I want to just
3 congratulate Council Member Cabrera and all of the
4 customers that have been pushing for this for a long
5 time, good job. Aye on all.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I am going to vote aye
8 on all and I also just want to add that I know that
9 the Mayor's folks are listening around this
10 conversation on property taxes. I'm hoping that
11 we're going to see them double down in this budget by
12 ensuring that foreclosure assistance funds are there
13 for homeowners as well and that we're seeing more
14 resources certainly pumped into these specific areas
15 as well as we negotiate this budget.

16 So, I do agree with Kalman specifically on the
17 need to have this conversation which we've been
18 having now for six years. I was a part of that
19 amicus brief, so I'm hoping that this budget will
20 reflect the values and prioritize homeowners as well.

21 Thank you. With that, I'm voting aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Congratulations to my
24 colleagues, I vote aye on all.

1
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez? Council Member
3 Rodriguez? I will come back Council Member. Council
4 Member Rose?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to explain
8 my vote quickly?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you. I'm going
12 to vote aye on all but I am very hesitant about 1250-
13 A in particular. Some of my other colleagues have
14 talked about the issues around safety and the issue
15 around climate and frankly other localities have
16 repealed legislation about scooters.

17 So, a legislation allowing scooters, so I'm going
18 to be keeping my eye on the scooter issue and
19 similarly, I think on the upper west side, we see a
20 lot of e-bikes and frankly scooters going the wrong
21 way on bike lanes and in the park. Like along the
22 Ring Way and Riverside Park going the wrong way and
23 have quite a few constituents who have been in
24 crashes with those e-bikes and have gotten seriously
25 injured.

1
2 But for a variety of reasons, I'm still voting
3 yes on them. What I would ask is that we think hard
4 about how we keep people safe with the e-bikes and
5 the scooters and what I'm wanting from the Black
6 Lives Matter Movement, is to look at all of our city
7 systems and think about how they are designed and how
8 they intersect with law enforcement.

9 Environmentally, we want to encourage alternative
10 forms of transportation and I believe DOT could do a
11 lot more in terms of ensuring biking is safe for all
12 bikers, regardless of race or immigration status and
13 understanding that the PD you know, their facial
14 recognition cameras aren't the only transportation
15 enforcement strategy.

16 We need to get creative.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Mr. Clerk?

20 COUNCIL CLERK: My apologies. Salamanca?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres? Rodriguez? Treyger?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to explain my
24 vote?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public
4 Advocate. So, I want to commend Council Member
5 Reynoso, Speaker Johnson also, Council Member Powers,
6 who have been very forceful, passionate in the
7 outdoor dining accommodations for restaurants and
8 businesses.

9 In my district, we don't have any of the open
10 streets but we do have our boardwalk and as the city
11 is waiving fees and certain - making accommodations
12 to businesses in the open streets program, they have
13 made no such accommodations for concessions and
14 businesses on the boardwalk to have outdoor
15 activities and outdoor dining.

16 So, I am insisting that the Administration
17 provide the same accommodations, the same waiving of
18 fees that they've done for businesses and
19 neighborhoods to the businesses in Coney Island and
20 Brighton Beach who are really going through a lot
21 right now as well.

22 And with that, I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Good afternoon. I am
3 voting aye on all with the exception of Intro.'s
4 1347, 1348, 1349 and also 1976 and aye on all others.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: With a great
9 appreciation for Council Member Reynoso's bill which
10 I hope will currently transform the way our streets
11 work; I vote aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Mr. President, may I be
14 excused to explain my vote briefly?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission granted.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I recognize I had the
18 microphone a little bit today. First again, my
19 thanks to the Speaker and the Public Advocate for
20 enabling and facilitating a very lively important
21 debate and again, to those members whose time has
22 been consumed by this, my gratitude for your
23 indulgence. My apologies if I messed up your
24 schedule. It was not my intent at all and which ever
25 way you voted, I know you care about New Yorkers and

1
2 I am very grateful to all of my colleagues for their
3 work or most of you. I will be voting aye on all
4 with the exception of Resolutions 1347, 1348, 1349
5 and Introductions 1250, 1264, 1266, and 1950.

6 Thank you, Mr. President.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member, I apologize,
8 after the Resolutions?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Introductions.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Yes please.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, no on Introductions
12 1250, 1264, 1266 and 1950.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cumbo?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye on all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Torres? Speaker
18 Johnson?

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Okay. The vote on all items for
21 today's general order calendar is 47 in the
22 affirmative, zero in the negative, and no abstentions
23 with the exceptions of the following: Resolutions
24 1347, 1348, and 1349. I have 36 in the affirmative,
25 11 in the negative and no abstentions.

1
2 Introduction 1250-A, 40 in the affirmative,
3 excuse me, 40 in the affirmative, 7 in the negative,
4 no abstentions.

5 Introduction 1264-A with 41 in the affirmative, 6
6 in the negative, zero abstentions. Introduction
7 1266-A with 39 in the affirmative, 8 in the negative
8 and zero abstentions.

9 And Introduction 1964-A with 45 in the
10 affirmative, 2 in the negative and no abstentions.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much.
12 The items on today's general order calendars are
13 adopted. Introduction and Reading of Bills.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been referred to
15 committees as indicated on today's agenda.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. There are
17 no Resolutions on today's calendar, so we will now
18 move into general discussion. As a reminder, please
19 wait until the Sergeant at Arms has begun the
20 countdown clock before you begin your remarks. And
21 I'll ask the Parliamentarian if anyone has signed up
22 for General Order.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes Mr. Public Advocate.
24 Council Member's Koo, Rivera, Menchaca, and Majority
25 Leader Cumbo have signed up for General -

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Koo, Rivera, Menchaca,
3 and Majority Leader Cumbo.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Correct.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
6 Member Koo.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you. Thank you, Mr.
9 Speaker and Mr. Public Advocate. Today marks the
10 70th anniversary of the beginning of the Korean War.
11 I would like to take this moment to offer my thanks
12 to the many Korean War veterans in my district here
13 in New York City.

14 The United States and South Korea continue to
15 remain allies thanks to the many sacrifices of our
16 veterans and we are all eternally grateful for their
17 contributions for peace.

18 I would also like to say that I am very pleased
19 that we are finally beginning the phase two of
20 reopening. I believe we will all see in the coming
21 months how difficult it will be for our local
22 businesses to get back on their feet. Now, is the
23 time for the City Council to focus on how to jump
24 start our economy and help small businesses.

1
2 We need to start looking at how to implement a
3 more moratorium on property tax increase. In order
4 to provide relief with our businesses and our
5 homeowners are being hit hardest. We also must not
6 let quality of life issues be ignored. We need to
7 continue cleaning up our streets. Move the homeless
8 into shelters. Ensure our sidewalks are free from
9 debris and illegal vending and create real solutions
10 to help the small businesses who make up the bricks
11 and mortar of our city.

12 If we can do that, we can restore the people's
13 faith in government. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member Rivera?

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so much
17 everyone. We all know that the social justice
18 movement has always included the belief that housing
19 is a human right and as we continue to debate our
20 next budget, and the need to transfer funding from
21 police to social services and our neighborhood
22 programs, we must ensure that part of that discussion
23 involves community lead development.

24 In the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic, our city is
25 now dealing with two new fronts in the housing

1
2 crisis. A newly unstable real estate market
3 vulnerable to exploitation from predatory interests
4 and the on spot of inspected evictions as online
5 legal proceedings resumed this week. We know these
6 moments of crisis can allow speculators to easily
7 swoop in and increase gentrification in our
8 neighborhoods.

9 We saw this in 2001 and 2008 and we cannot allow
10 that to happen again. That's why this morning I held
11 a rally with the diverse group of housing advocates
12 to call for funding for critical housing initiatives
13 in the city budget, including the citywide CLT
14 initiative and to stabilizing NYC Initiative. We
15 also called for the restoration of the HPD capital
16 budget.

17 Beyond the budget, our rally drew attention to
18 Intro. 1977, a new piece of legislation I'm
19 introducing with Council Member Reynoso and would
20 give affordable housing developers and communities an
21 equal opportunity to compete and purchase new
22 property in the hyper competitive New York City real
23 estate market. Intro. 1977 which we call the
24 Community Opportunity to Purchase Act or COPA, will
25 give nonprofit affordable housing developers

1
2 community land trusts and other organizations a right
3 of first refusal whenever landlords decide to sell
4 apartment buildings or property.

5 COPA provides those seeking to develop or attain
6 affordable housing the opportunity and the time to
7 present property owners with a competitive offer. In
8 a market such as the one we are in today, that can be
9 increasingly difficult. Particularly with private
10 equity firms and real estate vultures ready and
11 waiting to make offers in just a few days.

12 It's important we pass this bill to protect and
13 provide those -

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: An equal shot to improve
16 and continue their community development. I hope my
17 colleagues will join me this week in supporting
18 Intro. 1977 and supporting the pillars of a fair
19 community and affordable housing plan in our budget.

20 Thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. Council
22 Member Menchaca?

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member
25 Menchaca, you still there?

1 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Can you hear me now?

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: We can hear you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay. As the COVID-19
4 pandemic raged across New York City, we saw a spike
5 in deaths across the five boroughs. Families were
6 scrambling to find resources and information to help
7 bury their loved ones and on top of an unprecedented
8 economic and health crisis.

9
10 However, the Mayor's Office was totally
11 unprepared. Council offices were suddenly flooded
12 with calls and requests to help bring dignity to
13 family members who had suddenly passed. But getting
14 information from the Mayor's Office was nearly
15 impossible and turned into a blame game. The Mayor's
16 Office pointed a finger at the state who then pointed
17 a finger federal government, who then pointed it back
18 to the Mayor and as usual, it was immigrant New
19 Yorkers who suffered the most from this incompetence.

20 We have seen the importance of consolidating city
21 services in 311 and we should continue to do that.
22 However, in a pandemic where mass casualties are
23 inevitable, the city must ensure that we are
24 supporting families by communicating immediately that
25 the latest information dealing with – what the

1 information is about the borough services. For
2 example, most New Yorkers had no idea that the Chief
3 Medical Examiner was helping overwhelmed hospitals
4 and funeral homes by operating long term
5 refrigeration to preserve bodies. Most New Yorkers
6 also did not know that a 15 day deadline to claim
7 bodies had been lifted. Had these things been
8 communicated quickly and in multiple languages,
9 hundreds of families particularly immigrant families
10 would have been spared weeks of heart wrenching grief
11 and stress.

12
13 Speaking of which, while 311 has become an
14 indispensable hotline during the pandemic, 311
15 operators are not trained to speak with someone or
16 help them cope when they are experiencing a trauma of
17 losing a loved one.

18 We should create a separate hotline with trained
19 professionals from New York for New Yorkers to get
20 burial assistance. The legislation I am introducing
21 today will do all of this. It will ensure that
22 during an emergency, New Yorkers will never compound
23 their trauma of losing a loved one -

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Failing to take care of
3 them. Considering we could see a spike in cases as
4 we reopen, this bill is critical and must be
5 prioritized.

6 Thank you for your time.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you and Majority
8 Leader Cumbo.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I yield my time.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Majority
12 Leader. Parliamentarian -

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate? The
14 meeting will stand at ease for one minute.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Did you want to say anything
17 before you were going to turn it over to the Speaker?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I'm going to say
19 something but I wanted to know if anyone is signed
20 up.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, no one else is signed up.
22 You are welcome to make your remarks while we check
23 on one issue before we can close the meeting.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay, thank you. I
25 was just going to say April 1st or thereabouts, my

1 office put out a report on how to respond to COVID.

2 They had a few ideas. I'm proud that one of them was
3 passed today 1964. I want to thank my colleagues for
4 that. There are a couple of other pieces of
5 legislation that were put in today and I'm looking
6 forward to working with my colleagues to addressing
7 that as well.
8

9 I also just wanted say congratulations to all
10 folks who have bills today and all the colleagues who
11 were on the ballot this past Tuesday. All of us know
12 the difficulty of putting our names out there and
13 having them fully campaigned. So, congratulations to
14 everyone who tried it and a special shout out to
15 Council Member Richards and Torres who had pretty
16 good nights on Tuesday.

17 Thank you and I guess the meeting will stand at
18 ease Parliamentarian.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes Mr. Public Advocate for
20 just a few more moments.

21 Mr. Public Advocate?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please recognize the Clerk
24 who has an updated vote tally.
25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I'd like to recognize
3 the Clerk.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Quick revision, thank you.
5 Introduction 1976 had a vote of 46 in the affirmative
6 and 1 in the negative and no abstentions.

7 Introduction 1950-A had a vote of 46 in the
8 affirmative, 1 in the negative and no abstentions as
9 well. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Mr.
11 Parliamentarian. Can we move forward now?

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: One moment please Mr. Public
13 Advocate.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Sure.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Public Advocate, we can
16 resume the meeting and you can turn it over to the
17 Speaker.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much.
19 We had spirited meeting, I want to thank the Speaker
20 for helping get us through this as well and you Mr.
21 Parliamentarian.

22 With that, I'll call on Speaker Corey Johnson to
23 close today's Stated Meeting.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The Stated Meeting of June 25th
25 - I think Council Member Barron, did you want to

1
2 speak? Okay, so let's call on Council Member Barron
3 and then we will wrap the meeting up. Go ahead
4 Council Member Barron.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: You are on mute
7 Council Member Barron. Still on mute.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You are on mute.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Can you hear me now?

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay good. Thank you so
13 much and thank you to the staff for helping to try to
14 navigate - help me navigate through all this
15 technology.

16 I just want to use this forum to call to the
17 Mayor's attention the need to continue to fund ASAP,
18 which is a program that has been nationally claimed,
19 that has twice the graduation rate of other programs
20 where students have been able to make positive
21 contributions based on the support that they get
22 through the ASAP program. The Mayor is talking about
23 not having a class this September, so I'm using this
24 forum to let the Mayor know that that's a very
25 critical issue. But I also want to use this time to

1
2 respond to an article that was in today's daily news
3 which said that statue debate is becoming downright
4 dumb and it describes the actions of our Council to
5 have that statue removed as a sudden decision. Well,
6 for the writer to think that this was sudden, it's
7 indicative of how out of touch, how uninformed, and
8 how far removed he is from the grassroots people and
9 what it is that they want.

10 This is not an impulsive response to the massive
11 demonstrations that are called interracial justice,
12 in fact, and an investigative researcher would have
13 found that this issue of the insult of the presence
14 of the statue goes back more than a decade when the
15 issue was raised by my husband Assembly Member
16 Barron, who was then the Council Member and the
17 documents which the writer referenced in this article
18 that he feels are so supportive of Thomas Jefferson
19 being a great person, refers to the Declaration of
20 Independence, which refers to Native Americans as
21 Indian Savages.

22 The Constitution which has a three fifths course
23 as it relates to Black Americans and his writer
24 referencing Jefferson's wall of separation between
25

1
2 the church and state doesn't talk about the life that
3 he lived that demonstrated a wall of denial.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Of the basic human rights
6 of freedom, compensation for labor, and control over
7 their own body. He held hundreds of Africans
8 enslaved in conditions that were horrible throughout
9 his life and had sexual relations with a teenage
10 girl.

11 So, we're calling for the removal of the statue
12 and while the statue is gone, we certainly will be
13 able to have an opportunity to engage in business
14 without in conferences of reminders of people who did
15 not have any regard for African Americans or for
16 Native Americans.

17 So, with that, I thank you and I yield back my
18 time.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you Council
20 Member. Mr. Speaker?

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. The Stated Meeting
22 of June 25, 2020 is hereby adjourned.

23

24

25

REVISED VOTE ON:

INT 1250-A: 39 affirmative, 8 negative, 0
abstentions.

INTRO. 1264-A: 42 affirmative, 5 negative, 0
abstentions.

INTRO. 1266-A: 38 affirmative, 9 negative, 0
abstention.

INTRO. 1964-A: 46 affirmative, 1 negative, 0
abstentions.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 10, 2020