

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

----- X

April 22, 2020
Start: 2:08 PM
Recess: 2:59 PM

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Robert Holden

Corey Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy King
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jimmy Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1
2 PARLIAMENTARIAN: You can now begin the
3 Committee of the Whole meeting.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. The
5 Committee of the Whole is now called to order,
6 pursuant to rule 2.30 of the Rules of the City
7 Council. In the Committee of the Whole a simple
8 majority is required to pass any item. Today the
9 Committee of the Whole will consider and vote on the
10 following items. Intro 1854 would make changes to
11 the existing downtown Flushing transit hub BID in
12 Council Member Peter Koo's district. The BID is
13 requesting that the council approve the following
14 changes to the district plan. First, extending
15 existing BID boundaries; second, expanding services
16 to include beautification as well as traffic
17 management and pedestrian safety, and authorizing
18 streetscape improvements to complement these
19 services. And third, increasing the BID annual
20 assessment from \$380,000 to 1 million dollars, funded
21 by the expansion to new properties and by changes in
22 the method of assessment authorized to be calculated
23 on a formula applicable to the class of the property.
24 The City Council has provided all required process
25 under the administrative code. This included a

1 public hearing with testimony from the administration
2 and the BID's district management association and
3 waiting the 30-day period for property owners
4 affected by the proposed changes to formally object.
5 Small business services attested that no property
6 owners filed a valid objection with the city clerk.
7 Council members may now vote in favor of Intro 1854
8 if they can answer the following four questions in
9 the affirmative. First, for all notices of hearing,
10 for all hearings required to be held, published, and
11 mailed as so required by law and otherwise
12 sufficient. Second, does all the real property
13 within the district's boundaries benefit from the
14 establishment or expansion of the district except as
15 otherwise provided by law. Third, is all real
16 property benefitted by the district included within
17 the district. And lastly, is the establishment or
18 expansion of the district in the best interest of the
19 public. All council members have been sent a
20 committee report with details about the proposed bid
21 changes and the process that has taken place thus
22 far. Based on the testimony we heard in support of
23 this action, the written testimony we have received
24 for today's hearing, and the support of Council
25

1 Member Peter Koo, in whose district the BID, the
2 council may proceed with a vote on Introduction 1854.
3 In addition, the council will be voting on the
4 following land use items and Article 11 property tax
5 exemptions. 1898 Harrison Avenue in Council Member
6 Cabrera's district would receive a full 40-year
7 Article 11 exemption to preserve 54 units of
8 affordable rental housing. Gray Senior Housing in
9 Council Member Lancman's district would receive a
10 full 40-year Article 11 exemption to preserve 80
11 units of affordable senior rental housing. HP
12 Morningside Heights portfolio in the districts of
13 Council Members Levin and Perkins would receive a
14 partial 40-year Article 11 property tax exemption to
15 preserve 502 units of affordable rental housing.
16 Turin House in Council Member Rosenthal's district
17 would receive a full 40-year Article 11 property tax
18 exemption to preserve 189 units of affordable home
19 ownership. Schreiber in Council Member Perkins's
20 district would receive a partial 40-year Article 11
21 property tax exemption to preserve 182 units of
22 affordable rental housing. 757 East 169th Street in
23 Chair Salamanca's district would receive a full 40-
24 year Article 11 property tax exemption to preserve 24
25

1 units of affordable home ownership. Howard Anron
2 House in Council Member Kallos's district would
3 receive a partial 40-year Article 11 property tax
4 exemption to preserve 11 units of affordable rental
5 housing. Belmont Daniel in Council Member Rose's
6 district would receive a partial 40-year Article 11
7 property tax exemption to preserve 112 units of
8 affordable rental housing. And the Manhattan Avenue
9 Apartments in Council Member Levine's district would
10 receive a partial 40-year Article 11 property tax
11 exemption to preserve 81 units of affordable rental
12 housing. Now on land use actions. 90 Sand Street, a
13 project which would deliver 500 units of housing,
14 many of those units for formerly homeless individuals
15 in Council Member Levin's district. A rezoning at
16 364 Avenue of the Americas in Council Member Chin's
17 district to legalize a gym. Rochester Suddam in
18 Council Member Cornegy and Ampry-Samuel's districts,
19 a project which includes 78 affordable homeownership
20 units. An Article 11 tax exemption at 272 East 7th
21 Street in Council Member Rivera's district for the
22 preservation of 19 units. An extension of a ground
23 lease at River Crossing Complex in Council Member
24 Ayala's district to preserve 147 units of affordable
25

1
2 housing. Two minor amendments to projects previously
3 approved by the council, Cooper Square in Council
4 Member Rivera's district and 461 Alabama Avenue in
5 Council Member Barron's district. A change in a
6 restrictive declaration on Gansevoort Street in the
7 council district that I represent, and finally we
8 will vote to modify two projects and send them to the
9 City Planning Commission for scope determinations,
10 52nd Street in Council Member Van Bramer's district
11 and the Grand and Pacific Street rezoning in Majority
12 Leader Cumbo's district. Will the clerk please call
13 the roll for a vote on all of the items that I just
14 listed to the members of council.

15 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Before the clerk calls
16 the roll a point of parliamentary order, Mr. Speaker.
17 I just wanted all members to know that the materials
18 for all of the items that you've just spoke about
19 were sent by email to the members, so all members
20 have these materials in their email.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr.
22 Parliamentarian. And I ask the clerk to please call
23 the roll in a vote on all of the items just listed.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Adams.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ampry-Samuel.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ayala.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
8 explain my vote?

9 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

10 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Mr. Speaker...

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [inaudible] your time
12 is starting now.

13 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Mr. Speaker, you can
14 approve permission to explain a vote during Committee
15 of the Whole.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The permission is
17 granted, Council Member Barron. It's nice to see
18 you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, thank
20 you.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: And your time is
22 starting now, Council Member Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
24 just way to say I vote aye on all, and as regards the
25 project in my district, 461, this is a technical

1 adjustment. The project had been approved previously
2 and, as you all know, it's designed for people who
3 are living within 30%, 40%, 50%, 60% of the AMI, and
4 I do again vote aye on all. Thank you.
5

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Council
7 Member Barron.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Borelli.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye on
10 all, everyone.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Brannan.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cabrera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cohen.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Constantinides.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
21 all.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cornegy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye on
24 all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Deutsch.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And just if I
3 can make a brief, ah, remark.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you.

7 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Mr. Speaker?

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, Mr.
10 Speaker.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is starting
12 now.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Permission granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. So
15 before I vote I just want to send my condolences to
16 the family and friends of all those who passed away
17 from COVID-19. And my prayers to all those who are
18 still hospitalized and sick, who are still sick at
19 home. And I would like to just finally thank all the
20 first responders and all the healthcare workers who
21 are at there and all the members of the council who
22 have been working 24 hours a day, seven days a week,
23 ah, on addressing issues pertaining to their
24 constituents. So with the that I just want to vote
25 aye on all. Thank you.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Council
3 Member Deutsch.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Diaz.

6 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Council Member Diaz.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Ah, he needs to be
8 unmuted. I see him on the screen. Hold on one
9 second, Council Member Diaz. They need to unmute
10 you.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: There are some technical
12 difficulties with unmuting Council Member Diaz right
13 now.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Oh, there we go, you're
15 unmuted, Council Member Diaz.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [inaudible] before
17 I vote aye...

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Ah, Council Member
19 Diaz, I want to wish you a happy birthday.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you sir,
21 thank you sir. I appreciate that. And I would like
22 to send my, ah, sorrow, I feel bad about the death of
23 my good friend, ex-Council Member Noach Dear. So I
24 would like to join the family and tell them that I
25

2 sorry and that we knew he was a great man. Saying
3 that, I'm voting yes [inaudible].

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Council
5 Member Diaz. Happy birthday, thank you very much.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you sir.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Dromm.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Can I explain my
11 vote?

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes, Council Member
13 Eugene.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
15 much. I just want to express my, my thank and my
16 gratitude to all the first responders, doctors,
17 nurses, and medical professional who are put their
18 life in danger to save life and New York City at this
19 very difficult moment. And I would like also to
20 express my deepest sympathy to all of those who lost
21 their loved and their friends, and may God bless them
22 and may God be with them and give them the comfort
23 that they need. And I want to extend also my deepest
24 sympathy to the families of one of my staff members,
25

1
2 who also passed due to COVID-19. With that I vote
3 yes on all.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Council
5 Member Eugene.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye on
8 all.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gjonaj.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Holden.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Can you hear me?

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes, we can hear.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I had, I had my
17 hand raised, ah, before the vote and I wanted to ask
18 a question on Intro 1854. When were the property
19 owners polled, ah, for their, ah, approval or
20 disapproval?

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I can't give you the
22 date, but I can tell you that Council Member Koo
23 supports it. It went through the entire process and
24 Small Business Services attested to us that it went
25 through the proper protocol and process, ah, on the

1
2 normal timeframe any of these, ah, BID, ah, projects
3 go through when you are looking at furthering the
4 boundaries. So that is what SBS has told us and
5 attested to and again the local council member
6 supports this project. I can't give you the exact
7 dates, I don't have it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I was just
9 concerned that if it was polled before the pandemic,
10 before the emergency, that may be some of them would
11 change their minds, obviously, because they're closed
12 and they're suffering. Ah, so, anyway, OK, I vote
13 aye on all. But I would have like have...

14 JASON: Bob, I [inaudible] know, this is
15 Jason. I just want you to know we heard from the BID
16 this morning, so that's, that's as up to date as the
17 information that we have. So we did hear this
18 morning. They are supportive.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: OK. Aye on all.

20 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Mr. Speaker, before we
21 continue with additional council member votes,
22 Council Member Yeger has raised his hand and would
23 like to speak about the set of bills that we're
24 voting on as the Committee of the Whole before the
25 vote continues.

1
2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Sure, I apologize for
3 not seeing Council Member Holden or Council Member
4 Yeger's hand raised. I call on Council Member Yeger,
5 ah, to make remarks about the bills that we're voting
6 on today.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Yeger,
8 your two minutes is starting now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
10 Speaker. Before my two minute clock begins, I'd, I'd
11 like to rise for, or virtually rise, for a point of
12 parliamentary inquiry if I may, with your permission
13 since you're chairing this committee.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes, sir, go ahead.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
16 Speaker. Mr. Speaker, before the roll was called a
17 question was called and it went straight to a roll
18 call. The matter was not opened for discussion and
19 debate that is required by our rules and by Robert.
20 Um, we went straight to a roll call and I, I
21 appreciate that the hands were not seen, but, ah, in
22 a typical, ah, setting we would be able to speak into
23 the mic and say pardon me, Mr. Chair, I wish to
24 speak, and we were not afforded that opportunity. So
25

1
2 I would add that the, that the roll call be
3 suspended, that the question be opened for debate.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes, I'm happy to do
5 that. We're happy to suspend the roll call and open
6 it up for debate. So if there are members besides
7 you who would like to have a discussion about the
8 bills that we're voting on today people can raise
9 their hands and we can have that debate.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
11 Speaker. And to the extent that members had already
12 voted they should be permitted to rescind their
13 votes, if necessary, or to restart the roll from the
14 beginning. Mr. Speaker, the, the motion that's in
15 front of us, the question to vote on Intro 1854, is,
16 ah, with respect to, ah, hearings that we held in
17 February of this year and hearings that were held by
18 the community board in 2019, ah, as my colleague
19 stated, long before the outbreak. Just to be clear
20 of what it is that we're voting, ah, there are
21 currently 1100 businesses in this BID. This bill
22 would expand the boundaries of that BID, ah, and to
23 encompass an additional 900 new taxpayers.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: 30 seconds.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: All of whom, Mr.
3 Speaker, as, as we discussed this is not explaining a
4 vote, this is, ah, a debate on the original question,
5 so I would ask that the time be extended accordingly.
6 Um, Mr. Speaker, the, the 900 new businesses that are
7 being added into the BID are now going to receive a
8 tax bill. Many of them are closed. They have been
9 closed for the last several weeks. They may never
10 even reopen. Um, my suggestion is instead of voting
11 on this question today...

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: [inaudible] Mr.
14 Speaker, we have an opportunity to, ah, continue the
15 question [inaudible] particular bill by simply
16 postponing its question to a date later as allowed by
17 our rules [inaudible], ah, and in that regard I would
18 move right now, ah, to postpone to a date later, ah,
19 specifically, ah, to hear this in the first Stated of
20 November to give us some time to actually see if the
21 atmosphere is correct and right to impose a new tax
22 on businesses in Queens. Um, and under Rule 9.7 of
23 the Council rules, ah, this motion is not debatable.
24 It's not required, but it does superseded the debate

25

1 on the original question and this motion would
2 actually be heard first. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

3
4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I want to call on
5 Council Member Peter Koo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Mr.
7 Speaker.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Koo,
9 your time is starting now.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Mr.
11 Speaker. Ah, the BID was formed in 2003. We still
12 have the original budget of \$384,000. When it was
13 formed the minimum wage was \$7 or less. Now the
14 minimum wage is \$15. So as you can see the current
15 budget is not sustainable. This [inaudible] to
16 expand the BID area to include more businesses in the
17 consideration. After this crisis is over we will
18 need entity like BID to coordinate, ah, how to
19 revitalize the local businesses. Helping private
20 partnership is very important. That's why BID is
21 really, really important and so I ask all my
22 colleagues to support these. They have been doing
23 research for this expansion for the last two years.
24 This is not something just came on now. And the
25 local businesses will understand the importance of

1
2 having a collective leadership by BID, because BID
3 can help the business to do promotions, to apply for
4 grants, to do all the, all the things that
5 individual, individual business owners cannot do. So
6 I want to tell all my colleagues to support this
7 bill. [inaudible] understandable...

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: 30 seconds.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: ...this is a good
10 bill and I want then Council Member Dromm and all my
11 colleagues, this is a very important bill. This is
12 the time to support it, not afterwards. Thank you.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. So we will
14 vote on Council Member, ah, Yeger's motion that this
15 be off. A yes vote would put this off on us being
16 able to on it. A no vote would allow us to vote on
17 the bill today. So I am going to ask the, ah...

18 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Mr. Speaker.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

20 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Before calling the
21 roll, Council Member Yeger has his hand raised.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We already called on
23 Council Member Yeger. Ah, Council Member Yeger, I'm
24 happy to call you on again, but I would like to vote
25 on this motion.

1 COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 21
2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: [inaudible] this
3 motion I'd like to just speak one more time just to
4 clarify something. Ah, I, I did speak with
5 Councilman Koo this morning and I have enormous
6 amount of respect for the work he's done with this
7 BID. I, I, again, I want to clarify that this is not
8 in reference to whether or not we like BIDs. We do,
9 and it's not a reference to whether or not we don't
10 think the BID should, needs more money or resources.
11 However, the things that the bid gets the money to do
12 it is not doing right now.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [inaudible]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: In other words,
15 it's not currently having traffic guards, etcetera,
16 and beautification.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [inaudible] we, we...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: No, no, no, no.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Hold on, hold on, hold
20 on. You made your point before. Peter responded. I
21 am calling a vote on your motion...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
23 Speaker.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: ...which if you vote yes
25 on Council Member Yeger's motion we will put this

1
2 vote off. If you vote no on this motion we will
3 proceed with the vote today. So I'm asking the clerk
4 to, ah, suspend the previous roll call vote that we
5 had and to go to a roll call vote.

6 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Mr. Speaker, you're
7 muted.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Someone muted me. I
9 didn't do it myself. OK. So if you, we're gonna
10 suspend the roll call vote from before and we're
11 gonna go to a roll call vote on Council Member
12 Yeger's motion. So I'm gonna ask the clerk to call
13 the roll on Council Member Yeger's motion.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Adams.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Adams?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I voted no.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You're voting no, OK.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Yes, sir.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you.

20 Ampry-Samuel.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: No.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ayala.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Barron.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: To briefly
3 comment, based on the fact that Jason said as of
4 today, ah, the comments from the BID were sustaining
5 it, I vote no.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Borelli.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye on
8 the motion. Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Brannan.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I vote aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cabrera.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: No.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Chin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote no.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cohen.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Can I just briefly
17 explain my vote?

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start
20 now, Council Member Cohen.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. Ah, I
22 can just not think of anybody better situated under
23 these circumstances, ah, to advise this body on
24 whether or not we should proceed with the BID

2 expansion other than my colleague, Peter Koo. Ah, so
3 for that reason I'm gonna vote no on the motion.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Constantinides.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: No.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cornegy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote no.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I abstain.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Diaz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I vote no.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Dromm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start
17 now, Council Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: This legislation
19 was heard in my committee twice already and people
20 had ample time to come in and to participate in the
21 decision-making process. Therefore, I vote no.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Eugene.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: No.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote no.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gjonaj.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to
4 explain my vote?

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start
7 now, Council Member.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you. I
9 clearly understand the issues. As the Small Business
10 chair I am concerned for the small businesses and
11 what they're, this crisis that they're going through.
12 I also understand what my colleague raises as a point
13 that this crisis was unforeseen and those small
14 businesses could not voice their opinion at this time
15 before this vote is being heard. What I know is that
16 we start planning to reopen New York City back again
17 BIDs are going to be more important than ever to be a
18 voice for those commercial corridors and after
19 speaking to my colleague that represents the area as
20 well as the other stakeholders, um, I vote no.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Ah, brief
23 permission to explain my vote?

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Sure.

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin
3 now, Council Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you. I
5 won't take that long. Ah, I was in on the birth of
6 the original BID, um, in 2002 and 2003. There is no
7 community that needs a BID more desperately than
8 downtown Flushing. Um, over 100,000 people a day are
9 at Roosevelt Avenue and Main Street, ah, and they
10 create a lot of activity. Ah, I understand the
11 points taken by my colleague, Councilman Yeger, but I
12 also want to associate myself with, ah, the remarks
13 by, ah, Council Member Gjonaj, um, in that I believe
14 that the BIDs and the city will help to lead, ah, the
15 small business resurrection when that day, may it
16 come soon, ah, comes that we are able to get out of
17 our houses and our apartments and start to live, ah,
18 as New Yorkers have lived for generations. So with
19 that I vote no on this motion.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Holden.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to
22 explain my vote?

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start
25 now, Council Member Holden.

1 COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 27
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Ah,
3 again, I'm concerned about just the, it's a different
4 world now and, ah, property owners will pay more
5 taxes in the future, it looks like, and with another
6 BID piled on, I just want, I would like them to weigh
7 in, not before the pandemic, I would like to hear
8 from them now because the world is different. Their
9 neighborhood is different, and their businesses are
10 different. So for that reason I vote aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Kallos.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: No.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: King.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Mr...

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start
19 now, Council Member King.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Mr.
21 Speaker. Um, Kalman Yeger, um, Council Member Yeger,
22 brings some valid points to the table. Our world has
23 changed. As the district is trying to establish bids
24 and understand the importance of BIDs in our small
25 businesses. If this piece of legislation moves

1 forward I would recommend also that when this, the
2 small business [inaudible] come down that BIDs are
3 liberally get funded to help those businesses that
4 may disappear, um, after this pandemic. With that
5 all being said I will vote, I will vote aye for this,
6 um, and thank you, Kalman, and thank you, Peter Koo.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Koo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: May I explain my
10 vote, Mr. Speaker?

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your
13 time will start now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, my
15 colleagues. I think this is, the most important
16 thing is now to overcome our anxiety and panic. Ah,
17 once this crisis is over we need more on, really
18 depend more on BID, ah, to support our local
19 businesses. Because BID is an entity that will help
20 promote coordinations between government and private,
21 ah, ah, entities, and also will promote tourism,
22 promote, ah, a lot of things. Ah, individually, all
23 these business owners, because they have no
24 [inaudible] they don't know how to do it. They don't
25 have a PR person. They don't have a, a public

1
2 accountant person to help their [inaudible] brands.
3 So it's important for us to support BID now, because
4 they are operating on a budget, 13, ah, no, 17 years
5 ago. The budget is still the same. Now is more
6 sustainable. Everything, the minimum wage has
7 doubled, ah, other staff has doubled. So they don't
8 have enough, ah, resources to do it. The only thing
9 they can help the business community is to expand and
10 have more in resources. This in turn will help the
11 local businesses. It takes money to make money. So
12 if they contribute a little more money [inaudible] is
13 much greater later. Thank you. I hope all my
14 colleagues will support this...

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: 30 seconds.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And I vote no on
17 Yeger's bill. I hope Council Member Yeger will come
18 visit, ah, Flushing downtown before he makes this
19 decision. Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Koslowitz.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I absolutely
22 vote no.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lancman.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: No.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lander.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote no.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Levin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: No.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote no.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Louis.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: No.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Maisel.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Menchaca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
13 explain?

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start
16 now, Council Member.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. Ah,
18 I think that my, my vote was not going to based on
19 whether or not we need the BID to expand or, or to,
20 to move forward. But I am compelled by the concept
21 that our world has changed and information that is
22 needed to make a decision like this, ah, could be
23 better discussed, ah, in current times. So I'm gonna
24 support this and I vote aye, and it's making me think
25 about some of the other things on the, on the

2 calendar as well. So I hope we continue this healthy
3 debate. Thank you again. I vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Miller.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Negative.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Moya.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote no.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Perkins.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye. No, I'm
10 sorry.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Powers.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: No.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Reynoso.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Richards.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
17 explain my vote?

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin
20 now, Council Member.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Ah, I support
22 Peter Koo wholeheartedly and, and trust his judgment,
23 and now is not the time to pick, to play petty
24 politics. I vote, ah, no.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rivera.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: No.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: No.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: No.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote no.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote no.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: No.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote no.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote no on the
motion.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote no.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I vote aye, and I
would ask that the roll call on the original question

2 be started from the very beginning [inaudible]
3 motion.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Matteo.

5 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cumbo.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote no.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Speaker Johnson.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote no. I ask the
10 clerk for the tally on the vote on the motion.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: A vote of 7 in
12 the affirmative, 42 in the negative, and 1
13 abstention. The motion has been defeated.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. I ask for a
15 restart of the roll call vote on all of the items
16 that I mentioned that we're voting on as the
17 Committee of the Whole today. So if we could start
18 with Council Member Adams again and rebegin the roll
19 call on all of the items on our calendar.

20 PARLIAMENTARIAN: Mr. Speaker, before we
21 begin the vote, as a point of parliamentary order,
22 just as with a vote on general orders, for any
23 member who wishes to vote no on any of the individual
24 items that are being voted on for the Committee of
25

2 the Whole please state which items you wish to vote
3 no on.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. And I ask
5 the clerk for a roll call vote.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Adams.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I still vote aye
8 on all.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ampry-Samuel.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ayala.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye, and
15 as I said before this project is an adjustment for
16 housing that will be designed for people who are 30%,
17 40%, 50%, and 60% of the AMI. Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Borelli.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye on
20 all.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Brannan.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I vote aye on
23 all.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cabrera.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Chin.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cohen.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye on all.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Constantinides.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I am so
8 glad to be here to cast this vote because I have been
9 sick for the last 24 days and my wife has been sick
10 for about the same amount of time with COVID. So I
11 am so glad to be here to be able to cast an aye on
12 all vote.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So glad you're feeling
14 better, Costa.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
16 you, Mr. Speaker.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cornegy.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Ah, I vote aye
19 on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Deutsch.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Diaz.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye on all.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Dromm.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye on
all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gjonaj.
COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik.
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Holden.
COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: King.
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Koo.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Koslowitz.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lancman.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lander.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Levin.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Levine.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye on
5 all.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Louis.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Maisel.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Menchaca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Do I vote? Ah,
12 permission to explain my vote?

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start
16 now, Council Member Menchaca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so
18 much. Ah, before I, I give my vote, I just want to
19 say how, um, how much the council is trying really
20 hard to bring out the Stated Meeting into, into your
21 living room. So I'm, I'm really speaking right now
22 to everyone who's watching us...

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Oh my God.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...do our
25 democracy. And so the work that I want to do here is

1
2 really ensure that we as a community engage all these
3 questions. There are 16 land use items and what I
4 want to really do is ensure that everyone has access
5 to this information and so I want to thank anyone
6 who's watching right now. This is important. Um,
7 not only important for the council to keep doing this
8 working, but for you to engage. Our best will only
9 be as best as your engagement on the ground. Ah, and
10 so with that I'm going to say yes and aye to all, ah,
11 of the items on the list of, ah, on the, the roll
12 call today, and thank you.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you.
14 Miller.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [inaudible]
16 affirmative.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Moya.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Perkins.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Affirmative.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Powers.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Reynoso.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Richards.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Ah, proud to,
3 ah, vote aye and let me just say, Queens knows how to
4 lead the way and I trust, ah, my colleague, ah,
5 Council Member Koo and to my colleagues Costa and
6 Barry, ah, thank you for your leadership. You've
7 actually gone through something. So keep the petty
8 politics out of this. Thank you. I vote aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rivera.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: With a thank you
11 to my colleagues for East 7th Street and Cooper
12 Square I vote aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rodriguez.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your
18 time is starting now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I know that
20 for many individuals, eh, many New Yorkers, they will
21 be, you know, looking at us on how we had the
22 determination that we had to move on as a city and
23 that's why we are voting on this package of bill. I
24 also, it is important to recognize that we are voting
25 on this bills before we get into the coronavirus

1
2 packet because we want to move on as a nation. But
3 the same time we recognize that we are living a
4 moment that we had never thought that we're gonna be.
5 That we are living in a time where we are seeing the
6 faces of inequality in our city. The faces where
7 more close to 80% of the people dying. They are the
8 poorest one. The sociology and other people they
9 will be studying the future why, how we got here, and
10 the answer is very clear, because we have not been
11 taking care of the poorest one and this thing
12 happened under our watch. So I want to be sure that
13 as we move on and with the leadership with Speaker
14 Johnson and the other 50 council member we move on,
15 on this package of bills and others. We recognize
16 that we have failing to the poorest New Yorks.
17 [speaking in Spanish]...

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: 30 seconds.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [speaking in
20 Spanish] we are losing a lot of people. The
21 coronavirus doesn't discriminate. Chief Morris is in
22 critical condition, however, most people dying are
23 the poorest one and with that I vote aye.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Ydanis.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rose.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Transformation of a
3 distressed property, um, that had substantial
4 violations and is changing it into a, um, a project
5 that will increase and improve the quality of life
6 for the residents at, um, Belmont Place and
7 [inaudible] Terrace. I vote aye to all.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thanks, Debbie.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Who's next, Billy?
11 Yeah, Bill, the clerk's on mute, or we can't hear
12 him.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Um, I am not
14 muted.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: There ya go, Billy, now
16 we can hear you.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: OK. Council
18 Member Rosenthal. I was not muted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
20 explain my vote?

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'd like to
23 thank, ah...

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Councilwoman, your
25 time will start now.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
3 I'd like to thank the leadership of Turnhouse on
4 their tireless efforts to maintain ownership
5 affordability. Their work began years ago, prior
6 even to my election six years ago. They've endured
7 multiple meetings, ah, and, and unfortunately
8 purposefully misinformation. Ah, there were owners
9 who wanted to allow these apartments to return to the
10 free market, thus depriving our district needed
11 affordable housing ownership. I, I appreciate the
12 tenacity of Turnhouse leadership. This vote is
13 dedicated to them, and I also want to thank my
14 colleagues for their support of affordable housing on
15 the Upper West Side of New York City. With that I
16 proudly vote aye on all.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Helen.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Salamanca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye on
20 all.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Torres.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Treyger.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ulrich.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [inaudible].

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Van Bramer.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yeger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I vote aye on all
9 with the exception of Intro 1854, in which I abstain.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Matteo.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We didn't hear his
12 vote. Ah, Minority Leader Matteo, if you could
13 recast your vote when you're not on mute.

14 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Aye.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you.

17 Cumbo.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Speaker Johnson.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye, and I want
21 to thank all the staff who worked really, really hard
22 to make this possible. Ah, thank you to all of them.
23 I'll say a little bit more about them in a little
24 while. But I really wan to thank them for, ah,
25 getting all this together for us today. I vote aye,

2 and I ask the clerk, ah, to please read the results
3 of the roll call vote of all the items of Committee
4 of the Whole voted on today.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: All items on the
6 agenda for the Committee of the Whole are adopted, 50
7 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no
8 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 1854, which
9 was adopted by the committee 49 in the affirmative, 0
10 in the negative, and 1 abstention. Thank you.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The meeting of the
12 Committee of the Whole is now adjourned. All council
13 members please remain in the Zoom conference as we
14 will reconvene the Stated Meeting shortly. [gavel]

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 26, 2020