

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

March 3, 2020  
Start: 11:19 A.M.  
Recess: 11:35 A.M.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm,  
16th Fl.

B E F O R E: Rafael Salamanca, Jr.,  
Chairman

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Ruben Diaz, Sr.  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Barry Grodenchik  
Peter Koo  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco Moya  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Carlina Rivera  
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

William Martin  
Committee Clerk

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

3

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Alright, good morning everyone and welcome to the Committee on Land Use. I am Councilman Rafael Salamanca, the Chair of this committee.

I would like to welcome my esteemed colleagues who are mez- (sic), members of the committee and are present today. We have Council Member Rivera, Gibson, Richards, Koo, uh, Diaz, uh, Chair Moya, uh, Ayala, Reynoso and Miller. I wanna (sic) thank, uh, Chair Moya and Chair Adams for their work on our two subcommittees.

Today we will vote to approve (sic) our use 618 through 622, five individual landmark designations (sic) in Speaker Johnson's district. There are five historic row houses located at 47, 49, 51, 53 and 55 West 28th Street in the former Tin Pan Alley neighborhood of Manhattan. We will vote to approve our use (sic) of 6-1-6, an application submitted by the Department of Housing and Preservation and Development to facilitate the disposition and renovation of one city owned six-story building located at 272 East 7th Street in Manhattan, in Councilman Rivera's district.

1                   The application requests the approval of an Urban  
2                   Development Action Area (sic) Project pursuing to  
3                   Article 16 of the general municipal law in an  
4                   exemption from real property tax pursuant to Article  
5                   11 of the Private Housing Finance Law. We will vote  
6                   to approve 1-U-6-1-7, an application by the New York  
7                   City Health and Hospital cooperation requesting  
8                   approval. To at least approximately 24,080 square  
9                   feet of land and 20,000 square foot administration  
10                  building on New York City Housing and Hospital Sea  
11                  View campus and Council Member Matteo's district in  
12                  Staten Island. This approval will facilitate a 30-  
13                  year lease with a 19-year renewal option to Camelot  
14                  of Staten Island Inc. (sic) to operate a woman's  
15                  residential substance use disorder program.  
16

17                 We will vote to approve O-U-6-2-3, an application  
18                 for the rescission of the landmark designation of the  
19                 form P-S-31 building located at 425 Grand Concourse  
20                 in the Bronx in my district. The buildrent (sic), the  
21                 building was demolished in 2013 pursuant to an  
22                 emergency declaration by the department of buildings  
23                 because of structural dam-, problems and damages  
24                 caused by Hurricane Sandy. The rescission will  
25

1  
2 facilitate the construction of a new mixed-use  
3 development.

4 We will also vote to approve O-U-640 related to  
5 the Cooper Square M-H-A phase one for property and  
6 districts of Council Members Carlina (sic) Rivera in  
7 (sic) Manhattan. This application's submitted by the  
8 Department of Housing, Preservation and Development  
9 pursuing to Article 11 of the Private Housing Finance  
10 Law request approval, approval of an amendment to  
11 council resolution number 8-19 approved on March  
12 28th, 2019 to also exempt (sic) the community  
13 facility, space and the exemption area.

14 From our zoning subcommittees, we will vote to  
15 approve O-U-630 for the 8118 13th Avenue rezoning  
16 proposal, to propose zoning, map amendment (sic) will  
17 facilitate the le-, la-, legalization of office, use  
18 at the site by establishing the C-1 dash commercial  
19 overlay in a R-5-B district in the Dyker Heights  
20 neighborhood of Brooklyn in Council Member Brannan's  
21 District. We will vote to approve re-modifications of  
22 O-U-627 for 271 Sea Breeze Avenue in Council Member  
23 Moya's (sic) District. The application's sought  
24 approval for a zoning map amendment to establish a C-  
25 2 dash four overlay district within our sixth (sic)

1 district and the West Riteman (sic; sp?) Neighborhood  
2 of Brooklyn to allow for commercial use in a new  
3 mixed-use development. Our modification will reduce  
4 the area of the opposed overlay district to better  
5 reflect the portions of the zoning area appropriate  
6 for commercial zoning.  
7

8 We will also vote to approve the modifications of  
9 O-U-631 for the Queens Boulevard M-I-A tax (sic)  
10 amendment, relating to property and Council Member  
11 Holden's (sic) district and Van Bramer's (sic)  
12 District in the Math Pass Woodside (sic; sp)  
13 neighborhoods of Queens. The application's (sic) to  
14 approval of a zoning tax amendment to established two  
15 mandatory inclusionary (sic) housing areas along  
16 Queens Boulevard, both utilizing option one and  
17 option two. To propose tax amendment would facilitate  
18 the development of a two new mixed-use building with  
19 approximately 218 dwelling units, including between  
20 56 and 76 affordable units. Our modifications will  
21 remove M-I-H option two and retain option one within  
22 the, a proposed Wellesley M-I area.

23 Finally, we will vote to disapprove 'L' use 632,  
24 633, 634 and 635 for the Lennox Terrace (sic)  
25 development proposal which includes a zoning map

1 amendment, zoning tax amendment, parking special  
2 permit and large-scale special permit. The scale of  
3 the proposed project, an effective doubling of the  
4 square footage and seventy-five percent increased in  
5 height of the existing Lennox Terrace building is  
6 inappropriate for a surrounding context. Particularly  
7 the low to mid rise residential buildings directly to  
8 the west and south.

10 In addition, the proposed project would introduce  
11 over 1,600 additional dwelling units and generate  
12 unmitigated impacts in the area of shadows, open  
13 space, construction noise, historic resources and for  
14 pedestrians. The environmental impact study, the  
15 environmental impact statement provided no  
16 information about a smaller discretionary project  
17 with fewer impacts because according to the F-E-I-S,  
18 such a project would not align with the applicant's  
19 goals. Instead of project that as Manhattan borough  
20 (sic) president, Gale Brewer, said in her remarks of  
21 February 12th includes a long-term commitment to  
22 housing affordability. Greater investment and  
23 infrastructure, open spaces and schools, the project  
24 before us fails to provide the robust infrastructure  
25 needed and deserved by this community. It includes to

1  
2 mechanisms to protect residents from temporary  
3 burdens such as construction noise or longer-term  
4 increases in rent. Here H-P-D (sic; sp?) was willing  
5 to partner with the applicant for an Article 11 tax  
6 exemption for the existing buildings to remain, which  
7 would have cap rent increases for a period of 40  
8 years.

9       Instead, in contrast with some other proposals,  
10 an application for the, an Article 11 tax exemption  
11 has not been submitted to the council during the ULA  
12 (sic; sp?) process. Even though conversations with  
13 the applications about the importance of having a  
14 preservat-, preservation strategy in place through a  
15 tax exemption and regulatory agreement were held as  
16 early as July of last year. We heard clear and  
17 consistent feedback from residents, neighbors and  
18 community organizations echoing many of these very  
19 same issues and stating the opposition on the basis  
20 of inappropriate height and density, lack of  
21 affordability, un-, unmitigated environmental impacts  
22 and the applicant's poor maintenance of the existing  
23 buildings (sic), yet all of these remain unresolved  
24 today.



1  
2 Additional, stake holders who identify many of  
3 these same of points included the L-T act, Attentive  
4 (sic) Association, Community Board 10, the Borough  
5 President, the Public Advocate, State Senator Brian  
6 Benjamin (sp?), Assembly Member Al Taylor, Assembly  
7 Member Inez Dickens. Projects like this one must  
8 include resources proportional to the density's  
9 proposed in order to help create equitable, in order  
10 to create e-, equality in the city that it inspires  
11 to be. Now, are there are questions or remarks from  
12 members of the committee?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Uh, Council Member Diaz.  
15 Tomar, tomar (sic).

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Mr. Chairman, I just got  
17 this today and I see that the Lennox Terrace Project,  
18 the one you are asking us to vote against, I see a  
19 note here that says lot 65 has been occupied since  
20 1960 by the Metropolitan African Methodist Episcopal  
21 Church. Uh, what is the relationship with the church  
22 (sic) and the project?

23 CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Give me a second, I'll get  
24 back to you on that. So, I've just been informed that  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

the church is an out parcel and is not involved in the project.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So, the church has no part in the project?

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: The church has no part in the project.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Okay. Any other comments or questions? Uh, Council Member Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I just wanna (sic), uh, thank you all for your support on, uh, a couple of applications here. They are for truly affordable housing and Copper (sic) Square Mutual Housing Association, if you look at some of the rents that they're charging, growing families and, um, very, very diverse families in our city, um, they are very low and accessible and I am very proud to put these forward and I ask for your support. Thank you so much.

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Alright. And, uh, I just want to make a correction, uh, for L-U-6.

UNIDENTIFIED: You (sic) don't need to make a correction.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Okay, so, I stand corrected.  
Um, with that I want to also recognize that we've  
been joined by, uh, Council Member Grodenchik (sic).  
Um, I now call for a vote in accordance (sic) with  
the recommendations of the subcommittees and local  
council members and note that a vote 'Aye' on all  
will be to adopt the following: to approve l-u 616,  
617, 618, 619, 620, 621, 622, 623, 630 and 640. To  
approve in modifications I have described L-U 627 and  
631 and to disapprove L-U 632, 633, 634 and 635. Will  
the Clerk please call the role?

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: William Martin, Committee  
Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on Land Use. All  
items are coupled. Chair Salamanca.

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: 'Aye' or no (sic).

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain?

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Council Member Gibson to  
explain... (Cross-Talk)

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Chair. And you,  
thank you colleagues. Uh, first I'm going to be  
voting 'Aye' on all items on today's agenda. I want  
to congratulate my colleagues who have applications  
before this committee that provide real affordable

1 housing in the city of New York and particularly with  
2 the item of Lennox Terrace which we are today voting  
3 to disapprove. Um, I want to thank Manhattan  
4 Committee Board 10 and all the residents.  
5

6 Uh, I actually heard from some people as well,  
7 even though I'm in the Bronx, uh, because a lot of  
8 what happens in the village of Harlem will deeply  
9 impact the Bronx as well. And so, we know that while  
10 today we are taking a vote and this will go before  
11 the full council, I certainly urge, uh, Manhattan,  
12 uh, District 10 and all of my colleagues in Harlem  
13 and really all of the residents to, uh, not give up  
14 or think that you have won the battle. Um, even  
15 though this application has been disapproved, I  
16 certainly urge you to continue to work with all stake  
17 holders on meaningful development that is in the  
18 interest of all the residents.

19 Um, I think a lot of times developers get creative  
20 and they think while they may have lost one battle,  
21 they'll try for another. Um, and, uh, we've seen that  
22 happen across the city of New York and other places  
23 and I certainly would never want that to happen to  
24 all of the good people that live in Lennox terrace.  
25

1  
2 So, um, I thank you for your work, um, I've sought  
3 (sic) a lot of emails and just a lot of social media  
4 around it and I know that this was not easy. Uh, but  
5 this is a testament to what happens when people speak  
6 up. Uh, when you affirm and advocate for you and your  
7 families on issues that you know are important, uh,  
8 we will be victorious.

9 So, while I thank you, I celebrate with you. I  
10 tell you don't celebrate too much because the work is  
11 not over. I vote 'Aye' on all items on today's  
12 agenda. Thank you, Chair.

13 CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Deutsch.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: 'Aye' (sic).

16 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Koo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: 'Aye'.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Miller.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to explain?

20 CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Council Member Miller (sic).

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you. I just want to  
22 thank the committee and the Chair for his leadership,  
23 thoughtful leadership when, uh, today's package (sic)  
24 that we are voting on. Uh, obviously the, the  
25 committee did a lot of work and research around this

2 and it has been very thoughtful, and it reflects the  
3 needs and the values of, uh, New Yorkers throughout  
4 the city. Um, and I also want to echo the sentiments  
5 of my colleague Gibson from the Bronx, that, um, we,  
6 we have great (sic) revalue (sic) to leadership that  
7 the, the members of the, the village of Harlem have  
8 demonstrated on this particular issue and the city is  
9 watching (sic). Thank you. I vote 'Aye' on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Reynoso.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote 'I don't know'  
12 (sic).

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Richards.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: (inaudible)

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: 'Aye'.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ayala.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: 'Aye'.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Diaz.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: permission to, permission to  
21 explain?

22 CHAIRMAIN SALAMANCA: Council Member Diaz, explain  
23 his vote (sic).

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Mr. Chairman, uh, knowing  
25 that the metropolitan African Methodist church,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

Episcopal Church, has no part in this project as I've been informed. Knowing that the member of the church and the pastor are not, um, are integral (sic) part of this project, therefore, based on that information I am voting 'yes' on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Moya.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: 'Aye'.

COMMITTEE CLEARK MARTIN: Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: 'Aye'.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: They (sic) voted 12 in the affirmation, zero in the negative and no extensions. All items have been adopted as indicated on today's Land Use agenda.

CHAIRMAIN SALAMANCA: I would like to thank members of the public, my colleagues, council and land use staff for attending today's hearing. We will leave the roll open for five minutes. Sh! Um, can...

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Continuation roll call committee on land use, Council Member Treyger.

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Before, before our Council Member Treyger votes, just want to make a correction. The, uh, um, L-U 617, we previously stated that the facility would be, uh, 30 year lease but the correction is that it's actually a 50 year lease.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

16

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Okay, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I, I vote 'Aye'.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Final vote Committee on Land Use, all items have been adopted by the committee, 13 in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions.

CHAIRMAN SALAMANCA: Thank you very much. This hearing is now adjourned.



C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date MARCH 31, 2020