CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----- X

January 14, 2020 Start: 10:24 a.m. Recess: 11:20 a.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Francis P. Moya

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Francis P. Moya

Barry Grodenchik Rory I. Lancman Steve Levin Antonio Reynoso Donovan J. Richards

Carlina Rivera

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jay Goldstein

Jacqueline Skarinchy

Emmanuel Kokanakis

Paola Duran

Constantinos Yanudis

Panos Adamopoulos

Frank Scivetta

Brandon Levy

Mark Espinoza

Richard Kuzami

Afrocini Sukas

Krina Dermanis

Effie Antonio

Peter (speaking for Eddie Masterson)

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

1516

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

25

SAKEEM BRADLEY: Test, test, test. Today is the Committee on Zoning and Franchises. Today's date is January 14, 2020. This is being recorded by Sakeem Bradley.

4

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Good morning. morning, and welcome to the meeting of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I'm Council Member Francisco Moya, the chairperson of the subcommittee, and today we are joined by Council Members Grodenchik, Richards, and Rivera. If you are here to testify, please fill out a speaker's slip with the Sergeant at Arms, indicating your full name, the application name or LU number, and whether you are in favor or against the proposal. We will begin this meeting with our hearing, starting with a preconsidered LU item C-19 0029 ZMQ for the 14740 15th Avenue rezoning proposal relating to property in Council Member Vallone's district in Queens. applicant seeks approval for a zoning map amendment to map a C12 commercial overlay district within an existing R3-A district along the south side of 15th Avenue between 147th Street and 149th Street in Whitestone, Queens, in which would bring an existing building, which would bring an existing building to

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You may begin.

3 JAY GOLDSTEIN: Good morning. Happy New 4 Year, everybody, and thank you for having us today. My name is Jay Goldstein. I'm here on behalf of 8850 5 Management, LLC, ah, Anthony and Bill, who are the 6 7 owners of 147-40 15th Avenue in Queens. We're here 8 before you today to ask for a zoning map amendment to create a C12 commercial overlay in an R3-A zoning district. As you can see from the map, the proposed 10 11 district will be 100 feet from 149th Street along 12 15th Road, and 150 feet from 149th along 15th Avenue. 13 The proposal before you is necessitated by the fact 14 that my clients unfortunately in 2015 bought a 15 property under the information that it was a 16 commercial property. Subsequent to that they found 17 out that they could not in fact use it for their 18 desired use. They are the end users. It's not a 19 It's not a rental property. development. In seeking 20 ways to handle this issue, we spoke to the city and 21 they have advised us that we should pursue this 2.2 rezoning, which would serve to legalize our building, 2.3 as well as the properties along 149th. So the proposal before you includes four tax lots. The tax 24 25 lots include our property, a Mobile station, a two-

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

story residential, as well as a eating and drinking establishment. The Mobile station would not be legalized. They're existing under a BSA application. However, our use as well as the eating and drinking establishment would be legalizing the use and bringing it into more in line with what the current land use is for this area. The area surrounding us has commercial use and mixed use along the thoroughfare and as well as along the Cross Island Parkway. The remainder of the area is community facilities as well as residential buildings. mentioned before, we have our property which is the development site. There is the Mobile station, which would not be impacted, the two-family residential, which is a new building, so we don't anticipate any change to that occupancy or use, and Jager House Restaurant, which has existed in this location for many, many years. So the application before you seeks to legalize that. We don't anticipate development under this application. Rather, it's just a method of which to help these individuals maintain their office in that building and put the property to productive use. If there are any

questions I'm happy to answer them.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just two quick questions, and just once again, can you provide an overview of the previous use on the site and how they relate to the proposed commercial overlay?

JAY GOLDSTEIN: OK, so historically the building was built as a daycare, which is a community facility use. When the C of O was issued, it indicated that there were offices there. When this was, you know, since that time it's been used as a paint storage and paint facility. It was used as a kitchen design firm, and there were other commercial uses. My clients operate a building services company, which sends out service workers to buildings all over the country, and they operate the call center, if you will, or the main office, from this building. So they've been operating there since about 2015. It's a very small operation within the building. The majority of their people don't actually work from the building, but they've been using this as their home base, or their headquarters, for their use. And we seek to retain that use at this location.

3

1

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: OK[clears throat], excuse me. And the community board had a split vote...

4

JAY GOLDSTEIN: Right.

6

7

8

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: ...on this application.

Can you identify what were their concerns and how you've been addressing them?

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

JAY GOLDSTEIN: So the initial, we actually presented to the community board a number of times. The only time that they had the split vote was at the very end, the last vote. Um, in the first two hearings there were no issues. At the last vote one of the neighbors from a surrounding house, which is not a part of the rezoning application, came and addressed, and raised concerns about over-development and overuse of the street. Um, as a matter of fact, we, from the initial iteration of this rezoning we reduced the, the, ah, scale of the rezoning to address community board concerns, and that's why the community board was supportive. Subsequent to the hearing, while we were standing in the room, we spoke to that neighbor. We addressed his concerns, explained the actually project. That neighbor had no more comments, no more complaints, and actually left

neighbor's concerns.

AND FRANCIIISES

2.2

2.3

supportive. When we got to the borough president and City Planning Commission the neighbor did not come.

There was no opposition. So we believe that these split vote was because we didn't have a chance to respond on the record at the community board to that

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it. Thank you. Thank you for your testimony today.

JAY GOLDSTEIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Are there any other members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application. Thank you.

JAY GOLDSTEIN: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We will now hear preconsidered LU item C-19 0267 ZMQ and M1-9 0266 ZRQ for the 22-60th 46th Street rezoning related to the property in Council Member Constantinides' district in Queens. The applicant seeks approval for a zoning map amendment to rezone the block bounded by 23rd Avenue and Ditmars Boulevard and 45th Street and 46th Street by changing the existing R4 and M1 district to R4, R6-A district with a C2-3 commercial overlay along 45th Street in the southern, ah, in the

affirm that the testimony you are about to give will

be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

AND FRANCHISES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

truth, and that you will answer all questions truthfully.

UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

UNIDENTIFIED: Yes.

UNIDENTIFIED: Yes.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

JACQUELINE SKARINCHY: Good morning Chair Moya and council members. My name is Jacqueline Skarinchy of Egerman LLP, on behalf of the coapplicants for this land use application, Mega Realty Holding LLC, and the Pancyprian Association of America. I'm joined here today by Emmanuel Kokanakis of Mega Realty and also Hercules Agrio, as well as Paola Duran from HANAC, the project's affordable housing administering agent. We are here today to present the proposed rezoning of Block 769, which will make the existing residential uses on the block confirming and/or complying and will facilitate the redevelopment of two manufacturing sites that are not currently consistent with the existing the development on the block, with a new mixed use development that includes affordable housing and a new home and theater for a nonprofit community group that has been in the community for decades.

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

orient you to the site, the project area is comprised of Block 769, which is bounded by Ditmars Boulevard to the north, 23rd Avenue to the south, 45th Street to the west, and 46th Street to the east. existing uses, which you can see in this proposed area, in this actual aerial photograph, shows the Pistilli Building, which is a six-story residential condominium building with 201 units, that was converted from the former Steinway Piano factory in 2008. The building is over-built within this existing R4 zoning district. Further south there are also nonconforming uses. There is Lot 39, which is improved with the one-story eating and drinking establishment for Joe's Garage, and the remainder of the block are residential buildings that are located within an M1 zoning district. To provide you with broader neighborhood contacts, west of the site is a retail shopping mall. East of the site you can see is a 45-foot tall that rises about a set-back storage facility, Cube Smart. It was recently developed within the M1 zoning district. And then the, just moving to our development site, which is just immediately adjacent to the Pistilli Manor Building, it's two manufacturing buildings, one of which has

1

been occupied by our client for over 20 years, Mega, 2 3 it's their contracting business, which they will be 4 relocating that business elsewhere, and then on the 45th Street side is a plumbing supply business, which has been vacant. So there are no existing 6 7 manufacturing uses that are being used here today. Just to show you what the existing experience is, you 8 see this residential development is adjacent to this blank wall, a desolate environment for, for anyone, 10 11 any pedestrians walking by. To give you the area 12 context, this M1 zoning district is literally an 13 isolated M1 zoning district with very little, it's surrounded by mostly residential uses within the 14 15 surrounding area. Here's the zoning change map. The 16 map to the left shows the existing zoning today, 17 which is an R4 with an M1-1 on the southern portion 18 of the block. And then we are proposing to rezone the M1-1 and R4 districts to an R4, R4 C2-3 on the 19 southern portion of the block that will bring in the, 20 21 the commercial, existing commercial use into 2.2 conformance, and also bring in the lower density 2.3 residential buildings into conformance, and then over our proposed site we would be mapping an R6A which 24 would also bring the Pistilli Building, which is 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING

AND FRANCHISES

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

currently out of compliance, into compliance. addition to the rezoning actions, we are seeking a mandatory inclusionary housing text amendment. are proposing both options 2 and the workforce The applicant here is proposing the MIH workforce housing option. Workforce option requires 30% of the residential floor area to be provided an average of 115% AMI with 5% of the residential floor area at 70% AMI, and no unit exceeding 135% of AMI. No subsidy is permitted for income-restricted housing under this workforce housing option. Although the median household income in Astoria is approximately \$60,000, the median for the wider Astoria area includes five of the city's largest NYCHA developments. The AMI for Steinway's neighborhood tabulation area from 2013 to 2017 has a median household income of approximately 70% AMI. However, this census track directly affecting the project area is much higher at \$79,700, approximately 80% of AMI. Additionally, 57.5% of the population within this neighborhood make between \$47,000 and \$163,000, which is the broad range of incomes that the project's affordable housing units will serve. The project will have income bands at 70%, 90%, and 135% AMI.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING

1 AND FRANCHISES 2 According to the US Census Bureau, 40.5% of households in Queens Community District 1 are rent 3 4 burdened, spending 35% or more of their income on rent. The affordable housing crisis in New York doesn't just reach the lowest-income residents, which 6 7 have received the bulk of the mayor's housing budget, 8 but also to the middle class. The mayor's housing plan defines work force housing as housing for those who provide essential services for the local economy, 10 11 such as firefighters, teachers, nurses, or police 12 officers, who might otherwise be priced out of the 13 housing market in proximity to their place of employment. Middle income housing is essential to 14 15 support our economy and the middle class, which increasingly cannot afford to live in our city. 16 17 Additionally, the applicant has selected the 18 workforce housing option here because market rents in this area reflect a moderate market condition. 19 20 workforce option was established to address policy 21 concerns about the potential effects of mandatory 2.2 affordability requirements in areas such as Steinway, 2.3 where prevailing rents are sufficient to support construction at moderate rents needed by the middle 24

class, but not the internal cross-subsidy of low, low

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

income affordable rents. Now I'll turn it over to Emmanuel Kokanakis, who will discuss the proposed development and proposed workforce housing in more detail, as well as changes to the project since it was certified into public review.

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Good morning. Jacqueline briefly described, the projects consists of a through lot, so it's two building segments over a common base. The base of the building includes a commercial space that will front on 45th Street, which is complementary to the existing shopping center across the street and the eating and drinking establishment next door. The total unit count will be 88 units. This was after much feedback from the local community board. We initially went in with a proposal of a much more dense building with a heavier studio mix. The community voiced a concern for wanting more family-size units and no studios. went back with a mix of 88 units that are all ones, twos, and threes, with the majority, over 60%, being two-and three-bedroom units. Of the 88 units, 28 will be permanently affordable to middle-income households. The building amenities will include a fitness center, residents' lounge, play room, party

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING

1 AND FRANCHISES 2 room, office center, and a large landscaped terrace 3 in between the two frontages of the building. 4 also signed an agreement with 32BJ to provide the building service employees for the property, ah, 6000 5 of commercial on 45th Street, as previously 6 7 mentioned, and typically in our projects we put, um, 8 complimentary residential uses, daycares, doctors' offices, fitness concepts, something that would fit well into the context of the neighborhood. 10 11 currently contemplating a 70-space garage that was 12 also another major community concern, given the 13 density for the neighborhood of providing ample 14 parking, so this far exceeds the minimum required 15 parking under zoning, and the cultural component to 16 the project is a 250-seat theater that will house the 17 Pancyprian Association of America. It's an 18 organization that's been in Astoria for over 40 19 They currently have their club on 31st Street years. 20 in Astoria and have since outgrown that substantially. This is a rendering from 46th Street. 21 You'll see the building rises six stories and 2.2 2.3 setbacks for an additional two stories. You have the parking garage entrance and the community facility, 24

theater entrance on 46th. This is the view from

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

45th, which has the main residential entrance and also the commercial retail on the base there. is a view of the terrace in between the two building segments. And this is an aerial view showing the two segments of the building. To go into a little bit more detail about the theater, it will be an 11,000 square feet total facility that has a 250-seat theater component to it, as well as can be used for There's a large lobby foyer area many other uses. that could be used for art exhibitions and other cultural events. The Pancyprian Association is a not-for-profit association. The theater would be used exclusively for not-for-profit uses and would be open to other local not-for-profit groups to use on a short-term rental basis. There are a few cultural divisions to the Pancyprian Association. They have a theater division, dance division, choir division. They currently don't have a space to house these groups to practice. Most of the participants are children that live in the neighborhood and most of their constituents do live in the immediate area here, so they would be having practices during the week where the children would come after school hours and leave, and would have roughly six major

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

units.

performances a year that meet the capacity of the theater. This is an outline of the affordability levels that we're targeting for the project. As you'll see, we have bands at 70%, 90%, and 135% AMI. The majority of those units are two- and threebedroom units. I think part of the argument for using the workforce option here is that we do have the ability to target dual-income households, having mostly two- and three-bedroom units. Dual-income households will be able to qualify for these AMI levels. We also have a very wide range of affordability, from \$47,000 a year to \$163,000 a year. So it will be open to a wide range of residents that will be able to qualify. And the affordable units would be administered by HANAC, who has been established in Astoria for a very long time, since 1972, and Paola can talk a little bit about the marketing and ongoing maintenance of the affordable

PAOLA DURAN: Thank you. So, hi, my name is Paola Duran. I'm the director of housing for HANAC, and we will be working with the developer in order to act as the marketing agent the approximately 28 affordable units that are going to be, that are

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING 1 AND FRANCHISES being proposed under this development. I just want 2 3 to say that on behalf of the team and some of the 4 seniors that are present here today we are really happy to be able to collaborate with this project and we want to hear our voice to support the rezoning 6 7 application for this project. We think that the 8 middle-income housing is really needed in Astoria and 9 that's why we are, we really are eager to see this project moving forward. HANAC will be working in two 10 11 different areas, towards the marketing and then the management of the affordable units. Towards the 12 13 marketing of the process, towards the marketing of 14 the MIH units, we've been doing this for a couple of 15 years now. We're working with other developers, ah, 16 by administering the MIH units and we usually do it 17 doing like a large community outreach strategy. 18 We've been in Astoria since 7/19/72, so we have a 19 good range of organizations that we will be reaching 20 out to, just to make sure that everyone is informed 21 about this opportunity for the MIH units, and we will 2.2 be also working with the applicants to put the

applications through Housing Connect and through the

entire lottery process. HANAC is part of the HPD's

Housing Ambassador program since 2017, so we have a

2.3

24

2 w 3 t 4 p 5 a 6 t 7 1 8 M 9 w 10 h h

2.2

2.3

well-established office in Astoria, where we receive the applications and we guide them through the process. So if they want to do either the paper application or the website application, we work with them, and we've been doing that since 2017, so we are 100% sure that we should be able to secure all the MIH units for these project as well. We have been working in Queens for decades and we are aware of the housing need on this area. So I think our role is going to complement the entire project and the other sections of the project, so if you have any questions just let me know.

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Thank you, Paola.

This slide here references the change in the unit distribution. On the right-hand side you'll see our initial proposal to the community board with 135 units, the bulk of them being studios and one-bedroom units, and the revised to the left of 88 units, with the bulk being two- and three-bedroom units. Some additional street views here. We'll have, the buildings will be set back significantly off of the streetscape, roughly 10 feet, allowing for a landscape front yard experience for the local community members so the buildings won't be

2 overbearing on the street. We've done a great deal 3

1

4

of community outreach. In additional to several

meetings with the community board, we received over

1000 petition, ah, petition signatures in support of

the project. 152 of them are within a three- to 6

7 four-block radius of the project. We've received

8 over 10 letters of support from local businesses as

well, who are all in favor of the project. We've had

many local cultural groups express their support of 10

11 the project as well. And we also have some immediate

12 neighbors that are in favor of the project and are

13 here to testify. We've also done some outreach to

14 the local schools, who've expressed some theater

15 programming that they currently don't have a space

16 for, so some collaboration there and making the

17 theater space available to the local schools as well.

JACQUELINE SKARINCHY: That's it, thank

19 you.

18

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just a couple of questions, and if we can just, ah, go back again to, just walk me through again the justification for the MIH workforce option and why it was appropriate for this neighborhood.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Sure. So the, the marketing MI for Astoria roughly run 150% AMI. compared to other neighborhoods where there would be stark difference between, you know, the workforce option to be cross-subsidized with the market rate There isn't a great disparity here that the units. market units are that much more higher than the affordable units, so there's not that much crosssubsidization from the market-rate units here. Also with the income bands that we're targeting and our unit mix being mostly two- and three-bedrooms it gives the ability for dual-income households, middleincome households to apply for the units with family units. Are there any other points?

JACQUELINE SKARINCHY: Sure. I mean, just to give you some examples of the starting salaries, so you could see what the dual-incomes that Manny is referencing, like for a starting MTA employee makes \$43,500 and a starting salary for a schoolteacher is \$56,000. Together they make \$100,000. They would qualify for the units at 90% AMI. Then just even further, a public schoolteacher is making approximately \$56,000, a starting nurse salary is \$75,000. Together they make close to

2.2

2.3

\$135,000. They would be qualifying for the 115% AMI units. So I think, you know, there is a strong need for workforce housing in general that, that supports the middle class. This project is not requesting public subsidy. It's, it's a privately financed project. And in addition to that we're also constructing a community theater that's part of the overall project program and it's a huge benefit to the overall community.

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: And also I want to point out, it's not that large of a building, being 88 units. We're not looking for a very high density here. We're only going for an R6A, given the relatively low density in the immediate area, so it's not, we don't have that many units to bolster crosssubsidization.

PAOLA DURAN: I just want to say something. Because we receive people from, not only from CB1, but for the entire borough, and they're looking for larger units, sometimes when we are renting our projects we have to reject some applicants because they are exceeding the income band, not because they're looking for larger units. So I think this will be a good complement for that.

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. community board had a number of concerns. Can you tell us how you've addressed these concerns through changes to the proposed development? Before that, I just want to acknowledge that we've been joined by

7 Council Member Lancman.

> EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: So I think that the first major concern that was raised in our initial meetings was the unit count and the density. So we went from 135 units with a heavy studio and onebedroom concentration to 88 units with a heavy twoand three-bedroom family concentration of units. There are other concerns related to the bulk of the building and the height of the building. We set back the building 10 feet on both street frontages to not have this, the bulk overbearing. We do have a contextual building immediately next door, the Pistilli Building, which is roughly within the same height range of our building. So we feel that our building is contextual and given the setbacks will not be an overburden on the street experience there. We're also going to landscape the front, both frontages of the building to allow for an additional public amenity in that setback area. Other concerns

building.

2.2

2.3

were related to the parking, given the theater

component. So we sought to seek, ah, outside parking

availability on nights that we do have, ah, theater

performances where it will be at the maximum

capacity, so we don't overburden the street parking

in the area. We also looked at increasing our

parking size from 70 units to 80 parking spaces to

better accommodate everything within the proposed

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: OK. And why is the Pistilli Building being rezoned here, and is the building fully occupied by residential use?

JACQUELINE SKARINCHY: So the Pistilli Building is part of the rezoning because it's currently a noncomplying building. It's in an R4 district. It was converted from manufacturing to residential by a variance.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Was the, I'm sorry, go ahead.

JACQUELINE SKARINCHY: It was through a BSA variance.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it. So did the rezoning to the R4 not allow enough residential density to fully occupy the building?

the population or the demographics of the people the

PAOLA DURAN: We serve seniors, youth,

24

20

21

2.2

2.3

you serve?

and children.

2.2

2.3

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Seniors, youth, and children. Demographics as in race makeup? Do we know their ethnic backgrounds?

PAOLA DURAN: I think we really cover a little bit of everyone, so.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Oh, OK.

PAOLA DURAN: To give you a very specific, are you looking for something specific so I can give you the answer?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No, no. I just want to know income, like the income of the people that you service mostly. Are they, I guess if you're a not-for-profit are you serving like low-income?

PAOLA DURAN: Yes, mostly low income and some middle-income families as well, for a variety of different social services mainly.

There's a lot of people are wearing green shirts here and I would love to know how many of them you think make \$163,000 a year, that wouldn't even be able to live in this apartment building. 75% of the units are one-bedroom, going for \$2570. Comparing prices

1

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

for a one-bedroom that are comparable to Williamsburg
and Bushwick housing, as opposed to this being, um,
in a different part of the City of New York that has
a housing market that doesn't seem to be as, as
lucrative, let's say, as the waterfront properties in
Long Island City or Williamsburg. Can I ask the
developer, though, what are the prices of the regular

market rate units gonna be in this property?

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Right, so they'll be roughly around 150% AMI. So it's about a 15%, 15% to 20% discount to the rent levels that you see there.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So a one-bedroom would probably go for \$2700, \$2800?

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Roughly, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So \$2800, OK.

Are you guys aware about the fact that the City of

New York is one of the most segregated cities in all

of America?

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Do you, do you know, um, one of the reasons that is, or do you think housing has anything to do with the segregation?

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Absolutely. We build a lot of affordable housing throughout the

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sorry, if, if folks can silence their mobile phones I'd greatly appreciate it. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Subsidies, are you taking any subsidies from the City of New York?

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: No. Not for this project.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Why not? Why not?

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: The scale of the, of the project would not fall within any HPD programs.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So, so you believe that HPD wouldn't have funded any affordable housing, any deeper affordable housing in this project? I mean, did you ask HPD I guess is the question I'm asking.

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: We, we're familiar with the HPD term sheets. It would not fall under any of the categorized HPD term sheets. We have not specifically spoken about this project, no. But for 28 units, um, we're not aware of an HPD program that would work for this type of project.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Right, 28 units, but maybe you could add more units than 28 out of the

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

88 to be affordable, I guess is what I'm saying. I just want to be very clear. I think that this is a project that is not gonna serve a, a crisis that we have in our city. We have over 70,000 people living in homeless shelters, um, that you, the workforce option should have never been an option that should have been included in MIH, um, I believe, from the get. Ah, there's, just as a member of this subcommittee, as a member of the committee on Land Use and as a member of the City Council I will not be voting on any project that uses the work force option. It just doesn't speak to, um, you being a partner in addressing the housing crisis that we have in the City of New York. And the crisis, um, does not fall on people making \$112,000 to \$163,000 a year. The people that are suffering make less than \$58,000 a year, which you would only have five units being constructed for them. So I just don't think that this project is in line with our goals that we're trying to reach when we talk about affordability and affordable housing, um, and the fact that you guys would even, um, have a whole lineup, a whole rationale as to why the workforce option makes sense is very, is concerning, especially

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

for a developer like Mega who has done affordable housing work in the past and understands these dynamics much more intently than other people. so, again, I would advise that you move away from the workforce option. Um, the community board specifically said that they would prefer option 1. So the community board is also telling you that your analysis as to how much affordability that you're putting forth in this project doesn't fall in line with even their wants. So the community is asking for more affordability. So that's just a recommendation that I would give to you, um, and would recommend that you never come in here with a workforce option as one of the options for affordable housing because it just doesn't make any sense.

Thank you for my time, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just for the record, before I turn it over to Council Member Grodenchik, HANAC does wonderful work with communities of all They're actually in Corona, Queens, where I represent. Ah, I actually worked there when I was a kid, over in Astoria. They do wonderful work and they have been good partners, ah, with us. So I just

2.2

2.3

wanted to put that on the record. I just want to
turn it over now to Council Member Grodenchik.

Mr. Chair. And I do want to second, having worked in the borough, ah, for over 30 years in and around government, I do know the great work that HANAC does, um, and continues to do on a daily basis, helping people from all walks of life. So I want to thank you for that work. And, um, I notice you have a theater in this building. Can you tell me how much the cost of the theater is, how much it's pushing up, not that I'm objecting to this, my brother is a working actor, but I'm just curious as to how much that pushed the price up here.

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: The, the theater, the total cost of the theater will be roughly 4.5 to 5 million dollars.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: That's a pretty expensive build-out. I have to disagree with my esteemed colleague from Brooklyn and Queens, Mr. Reynoso. I do believe that there is a need for work force housing in the city. Ah, we have a lot of people in my district that leave and go to Nassau and Suffolk County simply because they can't find housing

2.2

2.3

is.

and while I certainly agree with him that we need to be doing more, ah, for people who cannot find homes, and that's generally poorer people, we also need to remember that there is a crisis for people such as firefighters and police officers and nurses. So I, you know, I just want to put that on the record, Mr. Chairman. Um, you're, as you, you are not getting any subsidies from the city, or other than the rezoning, which is not technically a subsidy, but it

EMMANUEL KOKANAKIS: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: All right.

All right, thank you very much, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you very much for your testimony today. I'd like to call up the next panel. Constantine Yanudin. Panos

Adamopoulos. Frank Scivetta. Brandon Levy. I just want to remind the panel, you have two minutes for your testimony.

UNIDENTIFIED: OK. Is this on? Do you want me to push anything, or?

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, yeah, just announce, you're going to announce your name and then you...

1

2 CONSTANTINOS YANUDIS: Yeah. 3 Constantinos Yanudis. Ah, I'm the general director 4 of an opera company in, ah, in Astoria, for the past 5 eight years. And I've been a member of the Pancyprian Association for 30 years, since I came to 6 7 America. As a producer, as a conductor, I want to reiterate how, ah, unbelievably important it will be 8 to have a real professional theater in Astoria. if you look at the theaters in Astoria, and I'm 10 11 working every, I dare say, even in event little halls 12 that I've been producing different events in galas 13 and opera companies. I will tell you the only 14 theater that exists in Astoria is a [inaudible] 15 theater. But the [inaudible] theater is a high 16 school and it serves the community, and this is not a 17 criticism, it serves the children, ah, and the 18 students of the high school. And I am forced as a producer and as a general director of a professional 19 20 opera company to go to Manhattan. Same, ah, with the 21 same way, I would like to tell you that most people 2.2 that I know that they want to, ah, go and experience 2.3 a professional production, ah, theater, dance, a concert, pop music, where do they go? They go to 24 Manhattan, ah, most of them, because there's not a 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING 38 1 AND FRANCHISES 2 real, ah, theater that can actually provide, you 3 know, this, this professional productions for the 4 community and Astoria I think needs it very, very 5 much. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. 6 7 PANOS ADAMOPOULOS: Hi, my name is Panos 8 Adamopoulos. 9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: If you can just can speak into the microphone. Yep. 10 11 PANOS ADAMOPOULOS: Oh, thank you, OK. Well, I'm the baritone of the choir, so I might need 12 13 it. 14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [inaudible] 15 PANOS ADAMOPOULOS: My name is Panos 16 Adamopoulos and, ah, I am a business owner in Astoria 17 and long-time supporter of cultural events. For the 18 last six years I've been the president of the 19 Athenian Society of New York, a 501(c)(3) 20 organization that produces a lot of educational and 21 cultural programs. For the last 10 years I have been the vice president and the artistic director of the 2.2 2.3 Athens Square Committee on 30th Avenue and 30th

Street, where every summer we produce programs,

concerts, theatrical plays for, ah, Italian, Greek,

24

25

2.2

2.3

and Spanish community. Next year we'll have also for Arabic community as well. But the thing that is lacking, besides the three months of the summer and that's also due to the weather, if we can have all 12 concerts, we need a place where we can house ourselves during the winter times. Um, as a business owner I'm here to support this project because I also represent other business owners in Astoria who cannot be here today, cannot take the day off, and I believe, as the panel said before, that we need affordable housing in Astoria. We need to people to come, live, flourish, raise their families, and I think that they will be a major economic contributing factor. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA:

FRANK SCIVETTA: Hi. Thank you for allowing me to speak. My name is Frank Scivetta. I was born in Astoria 62 years ago and I live right up the block from the project. I got married 40 years ago and I bought that house when the block was empty factories, abandoned cars, and over the years I've seen a supermarket and a mall be built, and there was a lot of resistance. The neighborhood got better. I saw the Pistilli Building go up. The neighborhood

2.2

2.3

got better. And now I want to see this project go up. I have, through all my windows I look at this project, whatever window you look at in my house. I have four homes within this project that they're building. Two of them butt right up against the property. One which my 86-year-old mother lives in and two doors away my daughter, her husband, and my two beautiful grandchildren. I don't want nothing bad to happen to Astoria, and I feel it would be a great thing to bring the neighborhood alive.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

FRANK SCIVETTA: Thank you.

BRANDON LEVY: Hi, my name is Brandon

Levy. I work with the Queens Chamber of Commerce.

I'm going to read a letter written by Thomas Grech,

the president and CEO of the Queens Chamber into the

record. Ah, good morning, Thomas Grech, CEO of the

Queens Chamber, ah, the Queen Chambers fully supports

this proposed rezoning in Astoria. More than a dozen

local businesses, they're in the direct vicinity of

the proposed development, have expressed support of

the project, from the bar that's located right next

door, to the restaurants, bakery, dry cleaners, and

others. Since many of them cannot be here today as

1

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

small business owners, they cannot take a day off to be here. However, I know they have deep roots in They care deeply about the community that Astoria. they live in and that they've invested in. Ah, and of course they want the best possible outcome. housing for working families will revitalize this section of Astoria, which is desolate at night and prone to vandalism. Each day middle-class families are pushed out of the city, adversely impacting small businesses as well, which of course the small businesses, of course, who we represent at the Chamber, they help contribute to make Astoria, you know, such a desirable neighborhood that it is. Now that we have the opportunity to offer permanently affordable housing, specifically creating, ah, created for dual-income families, where an MTA employee and a nurse may share a home that's well built, near affordable, ah, near transportation, and great schools. So we hope to welcome this proposed development and rezoning there will not only offer housing for working families, but it in turn will help support the small business community in Astoria as well.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you all for your testimony here today. I appreciate your time. I'm going to call up the next panel. Mark Espinoza. Richard Kuzam. Oh boy, Afrocini Sukas.

AFROCINI SUKAS: Yes. Very good.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

AFROCINI SUKAS: Perfect.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: And Karina Duramanas. We're going to begin with you.

MARK ESPINOZA: Hello, good morning. My name is Mark Espinoza. I'm a, I'm a cleaner and I have been a member of 32BJ for about 12 years. I'm here today on behalf of my union to share our support of this project. New York's economy is hard on, hard on working families, and we believe that in order to create a more balanced New York new developments should come with commitments to create prevailing wage building service jobs. We are pleased to tell you that Mega Reality Holding LLC has made a credible commitment to providing prevailing wage jobs to the future property service workers at this site.

Additionally, we know this development to be a special development because it has a significant amount of multiple bedroom units. It is often, it is

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2

not often that a project like this goes through ULURP. Having access to bigger and more spacious units means more space for growing families. 32BJ represents 4500 workers who live and work in the community district. We believe that new development needs to cater to families at a range of affordability levels, including not only the lowestincome families, but also moderate-income people, like many in our membership. We are supportive of a vision for this project that integrates work force housing so that working people like cleaners and porters can continue to have a place in this community and to live near where they work. believe that this development team has a vision to invest in this community and we are happy to support this plan. We respectfully request you approve this project. Thank you.

> CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

RICHARD KUZAMI: Hello, I'm Richard I'm the president of the Old Astoria Neighborhood Association, and I'm also a member of CB1, and I want to begin by clarifying my no vote on the community board. I also am on the land use committee, um, and I want, because of the way the

25

2 vote was structured, some of the no votes were people 3 that were completely against the project and some of 4 the no votes were people that were in favor of the project. So I want people to understand that the negative vote had, was not clarified correctly. And 6 7 I did vote in favor of it. So I'd like you to know 8 that first of all. OK, and in terms of some of their findings, the reasons I did this was, number one, um, the stipulation that the Pistilli Building not be 10 11 considered when assessing context. I think that 12 flies in the face of logic. When combined with the 13 recently completed public storage facility across the street from it, I feel that the proposed building is 14 15 completely within context. You can't ignore the 16 elephant in the room. It makes no sense. Ah, the 17 parking, I think that the parking actually, they're 18 actually providing parking above what's required in 19 the zoning. So, and also I know that they're going 20 out and trying to, ah, find additional parking on 21 performance nights. So I think this is a big 2.2 positive. Um, the M1 use, this is something that 2.3 really needs to be considered, I think. If for some reason, ah, Mega was to sell the property, there's so 24

much that could be built there as-of-right. It would

1

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

be much more onerous to the neighborhood. I mean,
they could have hotels, homeless shelters, public
storage, warehouses, manufacturing, offices, and it

5 would not be within, go within the ULURP process.

The community would have no say. So I think it's important that that be kept in mind. Um, also, the arts. There is a movement out there of something

9 | they call Artwashing when...

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You can [inaudible]

Artwashing, um, and this is somehow saying that developers are using the arts in order to get their evil, ah, desires. OK, this is, I'm finding this quite a bit out there. And I just think that private investment in the arts is what fueled the Renaissance. It kept, it keeps government from controlling what's accessible, OK. So, that, and also I just think that the workforce option needs to

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

be readdressed in order to [inaudible] fully be

RICHARD KUZAMI: OK.

compliant with the neighborhood needs.

AFROCINI SUKAS: My name is Afrocini Sukas, and I am here representing the Greek Cultural

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I am a resident of Astoria since '68 and the Center. center is active in Astoria since 1974. So we have seen the changes that have come in Astoria and, um, one change we have witnessed ourselves is where we begun by being a completely Greek cultural center and our resident theater groups were all Greek. Right now we have a resident theater group that consists of people from 17 different countries, and that's a reflection of what is going on in Astoria. Astoria has, I'm here to speak mainly for the need for the theater. Astoria has two factors that add to the need for the theater. One is that, ah, there are a lot of Greeks in Astoria and to Greeks theater is as opera is to Italians, and we have at least 10 groups, theater groups, in Astoria active at this time and dozens of performances every year, and, um, and no theaters. And the second group is after the Kaufman Studios were built the influx we have of artists in Astoria. And now that the [inaudible] bought the, the, the Steinway building also here, from what I hear he's going to build studios there. imagine that more and more artists will be coming to Astoria because of the proximity perhaps to Manhattan. We see that in our theater, too.

2 a small, um, black box theater of 60 seats and, ah, 3 4

1

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

we have people coming, we are renting it out now to groups, off of Broadway groups, and people are coming from Manhattan to, to see these shows. And the, um, and the, um, the other, um, important thing for the theater is that it is the, right now we have a theater production that we have, in order to get a room for it, our own theater was too small, we either had to go to Manhattan, which is too expensive, because we want to provide affordable theater in Astoria, and we have to go to Corona Park Theater, that's the only other option we had, which has no public transportation going to it. It's a, there is no other theater in Astoria.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

KRINA DERMANIS: Hi, my name is Krina Dermanis. I am a lifelong resident of Astoria, born and raised, in fact. Um, I also have grown my insurance business there. My family had their business there for 30 years, um, still do. And, um, I'm a new mom and my husband and I are temporarily living in Jamaica and looking to relocate back to Astoria and surprisingly our apartment searches have yielded few results that meet our criteria. Um, and

2.2

2.3

I think that this new development at 46 and Ditmars would be amazing for us, to be near transportation, near daycare, near shops, everything I need. Um, parking, which is a great plus, the theater, which is a great plus, um, and I know that a lot of people, you know, will say buy a two-family house in Astoria, because that's what is there currently, and that is just not the case anymore. Um, it's there out of reach, they're not affordable, um, and we're a dual, you know, income family, middle-class family, and we're looking for a great place to live, and I think that this would be a great place to raise my daughter. I want to come back and bring her back and continue my business there.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you.

Thank you all for your testimony today. I want to bring up the last panel. Effie Antonia and Peter Vatsinas.

EFFIE ANTONIO: Good morning. My name is Effice Antonio and I'm the president of the theatrical division and [inaudible] association. I'm going to read this letter on behalf of my daughter, who she is a vice principal in the neighborhood, but she couldn't attend because she has to be in school. As

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

a lifelong resident of Astoria Ditmas and also a teacher serving the same community, I believe that the residential development and Hellenic Culture Center will be a long-term investment for our community. A household moving into a new community generally spends about three-fifths of its income on goods and services sold in the local stores, causing an economic [inaudible] that permanently increases the level of economic activity for local business owners. The list of goods and services affected include groceries, home improvement, beauty salons, clothing, fitness centers, school supplies, and so on. Area business benefits from increased [inaudible], allowing them to increase income, job availability, and most purchase made from local vendors. As an educator that works and lives in the same community the zone schools where this development is being built is under-utilized and has had a decrease in student population. Declines like this cannot [inaudible] lead to school closure and influx of students attending other schools in the area. More families moving into the residential development will increase enrollment, save teaching jobs, and will ultimate benefit an already struggling

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

school. Lastly, the Hellenic Culture Center that will be developed on the ground floor will promote culture and adds to the whole community. Activities of a culture center are necessary for growth and provide unique experience to the community. Hellenic community needs a facility in which to sing, perform, play games, make music and art, develop talent, teach techniques, share ideas, and learn from other [inaudible] and performers way to express life richness. Culture centers allow much of the community that provide a place for education, holiday gatherings, lectures, activities, philanthropic and everyday fun. I hope you consider all these positive factors and reasons why I feel that [inaudible] Hellenic Culture Center will be beneficially for the Astoria community. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

PETER: Hi, my name is Peter. I'll be speaking for Eddie Masterson, who is a neighbor of the project. My name is Eddie Masterson. I live at 2266 46th Street, right next door to the proposed development. I am in full support of the proposal. I have lived on 46th Street for more than 20 years. During this time I witnessed storage facilities,

1

2 warehouses, trucks, and graffiti overwhelm our block.

3 These buildings do not add to our quality of life.

4 | They only take away from it. A new residential

5 building and theater would bring new life, culture,

6 and opportunity for us to live on an actually

7 residential street, one where families can get to

8 know each other and neighbors could make friends,

9 | instead of an industrial zone. My son is a New York

10 \parallel City firefighter who is searching for an apartment.

11 This building would be a perfect place for a young

12 man at his income level. Please support the

13 | rezoning.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

hereby adjourned.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

PETER: Thank you.

Your testimony today. Are there any other members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application. Both applications that we heard today will be laid over. This concludes today's meeting, and I would like to thank the members of the public, my colleagues, and of course the council and land use staff for their hard work in attending here today. This meeting is

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date _____January 20, 2020