

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 19, 2019
Start: 1:43 p.m.
Recess: 3:35 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andy Cohen
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Chaim Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson
Barry S. Grodenchik
Robert F. Holden

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah N. Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie Torres
Mark S. Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jimmy Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger
Steven Matteo
Laurie A. Cumbo

Rabbi Yossi Blesofsky
Chabad Lubavitch of Northeast Queens

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Hello. Hello and
2 welcome to the New York City Council. I am Majority
3 Leader Laurie Cumbo, and we are excited to have all
4 of you here today as we close out our last Stated
5 Meeting for the year 2019. I have the privilege and
6 the honor of presenting today's proclamation. Will
7 everyone that is here today to observe the 143rd
8 anniversary of the birth of Muhammad Ali Jinnah
9 please come forward. Yes, I see a lot of members
10 here, particularly from the borough of Queens and
11 Manhattan and Brooklyn, and then there's Harlem
12 world. I tried mentioning the boroughs for the first
13 time. It was a bad mistake. Wow, Queens rolls deep
14 today, wow. Woah. I'm feeling a lot of energy here
15 today. This is really why I love this particular
16 City Council because we are recognizing today a
17 Pakistani culture and shortly after that, today's
18 prayer will also be delivered by a Rabbi from Queens
19 as well. So we represent all cultures here in the
20 City Council. In observance of the 143rd anniversary
21 of the birth of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the founder of
22 Pakistan, we the undersigned members of the New York
23 City Council are proud to honor the American
24 Pakistani advocacy group for its outstanding work.
25

2 They foster awareness of Pakistan's rich culture, and
3 we recognize that New York is home to 194,000
4 American Pakistanis all throughout the five boroughs.
5 And so we are so very proud to have Council Member
6 Daneek Miller to bring this importance observance and
7 organization before us here today. We recognize the
8 incredible work that the Pakistani community
9 contributes to the vibrancy and the excellency of New
10 York City. New York would not be what it is today
11 without your contribution and your talents and your
12 creativity, and I'm going to turn it over now to the
13 Clerk, Mr. Sweeney [sp?] who will read the
14 invocation-- excuse me, who will read the
15 proclamation in, and then we're going to hear from
16 our incredible member Council Member I. Daneek Miller
17 who is a strong advocate for this organization and
18 worked very hard to bring everyone here today. Thank
19 you so much.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council City of New
21 York Proclamation: Council of the City of New York is
22 proud to honor the American Pakistani Advocacy Group
23 for its outstanding work fostering awareness of
24 Pakistan's rich culture, and whereas, New York City
25 is the home to 194,000 American Pakistanis, people

2 who come to New York from Pakistan or who have
3 ancestral ties to the homeland. They share their
4 culture and traditions with Americans of all
5 backgrounds while upholding the principles of freedom
6 and democracy that are fundamental to life in our
7 great country. Members of the Pakistani American
8 community demonstrate a strong work ethic that has
9 enabled them to succeed in the city, state and
10 nation. They excel in wide range of professions from
11 education, medicine, and science to technology and
12 business. And whereas, the American Pakistani
13 Advocacy Group based in Fresh Meadows, Queens is
14 dedicated to cultivating and enhancing Pakistani
15 culture through the development, creation, and
16 sponsorship of numerous initiatives and programs that
17 helps Pakistani Americans to adjust to and thrive in
18 United States while enabling them to hold on to their
19 Pakistani identity and culture. It also promotes
20 Pakistani American entrepreneurship and shares
21 Pakistani culture with all New Yorkers, and whereas,
22 the 143rd anniversary of the birth of Muhammad Ali
23 Jinnah, the founder of independent Pakistan provides
24 a special opportunity for all New Yorkers to learn
25 more about the nation's rich heritage, Pakistan

2 became independent following the end of British rule
3 in 1947, and the enactment of the Indian Independence
4 Act of 1947 which gave independence to the dominion
5 of Pakistan. It came into existence through the
6 efforts of the Pakistan movement to create an
7 independent Muslim state. The movement was led by
8 the All-India Muslim League, a political party under
9 the leadership of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, and whereas,
10 Mohammad Ali Jinnah is known in Pakistan as Quaid-i-
11 Azam, or Great Leader, born on December 25th, 1876 in
12 Karachi. Then in India, he came to the see partition
13 of India as necessary to safeguard the rights of
14 Muslims. Negotiations with the British resulted in
15 the partition of India and the formation of the state
16 of Pakistan in 1947. December 25th is a national
17 holiday in Pakistan commemorating the life and legacy
18 of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, its first Governor General.
19 And whereas, we commend the American Pakistani
20 Advocacy Group for fostering a greater awareness and
21 appreciation for the contributions Pakistani
22 Americans in New York City, and we wish them
23 continued success, and now therefore be it known that
24 we this Council of the City of New York honors the
25 American Pakistani Advocacy Group for its outstanding

2 service and enduring contributions to our City and
3 the Pakistani American community.

4 [applause]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,
6 and now we will hear from our Council Member I.
7 Daneek Miller.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
9 Majority Leader. So, after the proclamation and
10 after the brilliant words from our Majority Leader,
11 there is little to be left to be said about this
12 organization that does so much, not just for
13 Pakistani community, but for the Queens community,
14 and their contributions to the City of New York
15 overall. I've had the privilege and pleasure of
16 working with many of their leadership in the past few
17 years and their contributions to the Queens
18 communities, particularly the southeast Queens
19 community, has been immeasurable, and we're excited
20 about having them here today, along with the
21 assistant-- we are joined by the Counsel General to
22 the Consulate to Pakistan, Naeem Iqbal Cheema, right
23 here. Absolutely. And so we are now going to hear a
24 word from the leadership and my good friend brother
25 Ali Rashid [sp?], and so would you please tell us a

2 little bit about your organization, and once again,
3 thank you. It is a joy to have you here in the
4 Peoples' House.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Good afternoon, everybody.
6 Respected, our Council Member, especially thank
7 Daneek Miller. It's an honor for American Pakistani
8 Advocacy Group to receive a proclamation in honor of
9 Pakistan independence, and it's very memorable
10 because it's marking the 143rd birthday of Muhammad
11 Ali Jinnah, which is December 25th, who is considered
12 the founder-- who is the founder of Pakistan. We
13 have over 194,000 Pakistan Americans living in New
14 York City. All of them, they work hard, live
15 peacefully, and obey the law-- abiding citizen.
16 American advocacy-- American Pakistani Advocacy Group
17 goal is to engage, empower, and elevate our
18 community. We work with-- we build bridges with our
19 other communities and make sure that we cherish our
20 heritage. As a Pakistani American growing up in New
21 York City, I always cherish where I came from and
22 always remember the hard work that our forefather has
23 done to make us proud. There's a famous quote by
24 Muhammad Ali Jinnah which I strive to live every day.
25 It goes by this, "With faith, discipline, and

2 selfless devotion to duty, there is nothing
3 worthwhile that you cannot achieve." So as myself
4 and a representative of Pakistani American community,
5 we want to make sure that we have a seat in the
6 table, our voices are heard, and our words are taken
7 into action. So, that's the main thing for our
8 organization. We do a lot of community work, and we
9 thanks the whole council, we make sure that they are,
10 you know, honoring Muhammad Ali Jinnah in this
11 Council. It's a great occasion. Thank you
12 everybody, especially Daneek Miller and all the
13 Council Members and Majority House Leader. Thank you
14 everybody, and God bless America. Thank you.

15 [applause]

16 UNIDENTIFIED: I would like to thank on
17 behalf of the Government of Pakistan the esteemed
18 City Council and honorable Council Members including
19 the-- especially the House Majority Leader and
20 Council Member Miller for honoring [inaudible]
21 Muhammad Ali Jinnah, who was one of the greatest
22 statesmen of his time. So I would also like to
23 congratulate and commend the excellent work the
24 Pakistani community, especially the Pakistani
25 American Advocacy Group under the able leadership of

2 my friend [inaudible] is doing for the betterment of
3 all of the communities and Pakistani community, and I
4 wish you all the best, and so very happy and proud
5 favor of all of us. Thank you very much for honoring
6 the [inaudible] of Muhammad Ali Jinnah [inaudible].

7 [applause]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you so
9 much. Isn't this beautiful? That we really have an
10 opportunity to do that. So on behalf of the Black,
11 Latino and Asian Caucus, we make this preselection of
12 the proclamation, but as I see my Queens-- I saw
13 brother Vallone standing back there. This is a
14 microcosm of what Queens is, right? This is-- we say
15 it all the time, 180 different countries, and as
16 equally as many languages spoken in the county of
17 Queens, and this is what really makes us special, and
18 this is really a microcosm of who we are. so thank
19 you so much for coming out this afternoon, and we're
20 about to engage in the people's work, so excited
21 about that. Majority Leader, take it away.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, and we
23 are now going to gather for a wonderful photo, but I
24 want to thank all of you for being here today during
25 these particularly challenging political times. We

2 are so happy for the work that you continue to do to
3 raise your voices and to demonstrate that our
4 immigrant community is really what makes this country
5 what it is today, and the contributions that you have
6 made to this country have to be highlighted, and I'm
7 so proud to be a part of a council that does just
8 that. Thank you so much. [off mic comments] You
9 gave me a promotion and title, and I appreciate it.
10 So, they were all like, oh, you're moving up.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic] You're
13 exactly right, but my-- it's-- oh, okay.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet on the floor,
15 please. Quiet on the floor. Council Members, please
16 take your seats please. At this time, please place
17 all electronic devices, all electronic devices to
18 vibrate. Will all non-council employees please leave
19 the main floor of the chambers? We have additional
20 seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you. Madam
21 Majority Leader?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [gavel] Good
23 afternoon and welcome to the State Meeting of
24 December 19th, 2019. I am Majority Leader Laurie
25 Cumbo. Please rise for the pledge of allegiance. I

2 pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of
3 America and to the Republic for which it stands, one
4 nation, under God, indivisible, with liberty and
5 justice for all. Roll call.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Chin?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

23 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy? Deutsch? Diaz?

25 Dromm?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal? Eugene?

4 Gibson?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I am here.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj? Grodenchik?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I can do this all

12 day, here.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman? Lander? Levin?

18 Levine?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Here.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel? Menchaca?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Moya? Perkins?

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez? Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal? Salamanca?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich? Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now have
12 today's invocation which will be delivered by Rabbi
13 Yossi Blesofsky, the spiritual leader of Chabad
14 Lubavitch of Northeast Queens located at 212-12 26th
15 Avenue in Bayside.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

17 RABBI YOSSE BLESOFSKY: Thank you to my
18 dear friend, Councilman Paul Vallone for inviting me
19 here today at the request of Speaker Johnson to
20 deliver the invocation. Today's invocation is
21 especially momentous as it is ushering in 2020. I
22 feel privileged to be here, particularly as a Chabad
23 Lubavitch Rabbi due to the very special connection
24 between Chabad Lubavitch and New York City going back
25 to 1940 when New York was chosen as the headquarters

2 for the movement and the Grand Revi [sic] Rabbi
3 Schnierson [sp?] took up his residence in Brooklyn.
4 Almighty God, master of the universe, the members of
5 this august body, the New York City Council, convene
6 here from across the great City of New York to
7 conduct the people's business in good faith and with
8 selfless dedication. In so doing, they fulfill a
9 fundamental precept, which according to sacred
10 biblical tradition you first issued to Adam at the
11 time of his creation and to Noah after the Great
12 Flood, the Commandment to govern by just laws. We
13 the citizens of this blessed country, the United
14 States of America, proudly proclaim this recognition
15 and affirm our commitment to justice in the pledge of
16 allegiance when we describe our union as one nation
17 under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for
18 all. This coming Sunday evening, Jewish people the
19 world over begin celebrating Chanukah. Chanukah, the
20 Festival of Lights, recalls the victory more than
21 2,000 years ago of the militarily weak, but
22 spiritually strong Jewish people over the mighty
23 forces of a ruthless enemy that had overrun the Holy
24 Land and threatened to engulf the land and its people
25 in darkness. The miraculous victory has been

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

celebrated annually ever since during these eight days of Chanukah especially by lighting the menorah. Light is one of the most powerful creations of God. A little bit of light dispels a lot of darkness. Indeed, while a single candle might seem weak, unable to accomplish much, it has the power to illuminate and overcome the forces of darkness, something so critical in these uncertain times. Almighty God, you have chosen each and every Council Member and granted them power and authority. We ask you to guide them with your light. Let them connect to your illumination to become beacons of light to their communities. May they become sources of inspiration for their constituents, that they too can bring light to their homes, their families and their surroundings. May we all be empowered to remember the potential that you have given us, and may none of us underestimate the power of one light, one mitzvah, one good deed. We beseech you almighty and merciful God to extend your grace to each and every member of this body and bestow upon them the joy of life, good health and prosperity so together they can bring life to this great city. And let us all say amen.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much
3 Rabbi Blesofsky for that beautiful and inspiring
4 prayer. I'd now like to call Council Member Vallone
5 to spread the invocation on the record. please,
6 quiet in the chambers.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Madam
8 Advocate. I'd like to make a motion that the
9 invocation be spread in full upon the record.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Granted.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I also like to
12 say a few words about my dear friend Rabbi Yossi.
13 There's a few times in our lives when we get to meet
14 someone who actually makes an impact on you and
15 everyone around you. For me, it was the day that I
16 met Rabbi Yossi in Bayside in northeast Queens. It's
17 an honor to bring him here to our home since he
18 brings everyone to his home. His center truly is a
19 spiritual connection for all faiths for all people
20 for our community. He stands with us as we lead the
21 children's holiday parade up Bayside on Bell
22 Boulevard. He leads his community in all different
23 groups and faiths. He stands and he lights the
24 largest menorah in Queens. If you want to come this
25 Sunday he'll be there, up there, dangerously lighting

2 the largest menorah in Queens. But more importantly,
3 he is a good man, and he is a man that leads with his
4 heart, and in today's times with that message of
5 light over darkness and all of our faiths we
6 celebrate this month the light over darkness in so
7 many different ways this very special month, and
8 Rabbi Yossi embodies that. His wife, his children,
9 everything about what they do is the reason why I
10 couldn't be more proud that he is here today. Back
11 in 1990 he started in a small apartment in Bayside,
12 and now he has a thriving community center right on
13 bell-- right in Bayside next to Bay Terrace. So many
14 of us gathered there to hear his word and in times of
15 need. Monday at eight o'clock he has a bible study
16 where all are welcome and yes, being the good
17 catholic we'll go into Rabbi's place and we share a
18 beautiful evening on Monday nights at eight o'clock,
19 and I find more comfort and spiritual peace with him
20 and his family then I pretty much find anywhere. And
21 so for him to come and give this blessing today, it's
22 an honor not just for me, but all of us who are here.
23 So, God bless you Rabbi Yossi, and may have a
24 beautiful Chanukah and a happy near year.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much
3 for spreading the invocation so beautifully. I think
4 it's so wonderful that on the eve of the Christmas
5 and Chanukah season. We have had recognition through
6 a proclamation to Muhammad Ali Jinnah and the
7 recognition of Pakistan and its founding 143 years
8 ago as well as having you here today has been such an
9 honor and a privilege and how the diversity of tis
10 City Council and how we're able to recognize all
11 cultures and all faiths. I'd now like to move on to
12 the adoption of minutes by Council Member Alicka
13 Ampry-Samuel.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I motion
15 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November
16 14th, 2019 be adopted as printed.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Messages and
18 papers from the Mayor.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Communication from
21 city, county and borough offices?

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M199
23 through Pre-considered M210, Budget Modifications.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Finance.
25

2 COUNCIL CLERK: M202 Five-Year Capital
3 Plan Amendment.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Finance.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M203 and
6 M204, Youth Board appointments.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Rules, Privileges and
8 Elections.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Partitions and
10 communications?

11 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Land-Use Call-ups?

13 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We'll
15 now have communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Quiet in the
18 Chamber.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Thank
20 you, Majority Leader Cumbo, and thank everyone for
21 being here today on this very important Stated. It's
22 the last of the year and the last of the decade, but
23 before I celebrate our accomplishments, I want to
24 begin by honoring a few notable losses our city has
25 faced. We were all shocked by the horrible anti-

2 Semitic hate crime in Jersey City that occurred last
3 week where Jersey City Detective Joseph Seals was
4 killed. The 40-year-old died protecting the city he
5 cared so much about, and the Council sends our
6 condolences to his family in this time of mourning.
7 I paid a shiva [sic] call on Sunday night with
8 Council Member Levin to the Deutsch family in
9 Williamsburg who lost their wonderful 24-year-old son
10 Moshe Deutsch who was visiting Jersey City and was
11 killed in that kosher supermarket and our hearts and
12 prayers go out to the entire community in
13 Williamsburg, a close-knit community, as well as the
14 Deutsch family who is still mourning. Our thoughts
15 and prayers go out to the family that lost one of the
16 owners of the kosher supermarket, Mindy Ferencz, who
17 was killed and gunned down by these domestic
18 terrorists. And lastly, the story of the man, an
19 Ecuadorian immigrant who was working that day at the
20 kosher supermarket, and really sacrificed his own
21 life to save a young Jewish man by leading him out
22 the back door of the supermarket, and while he was
23 doing that, he was gunned down by these two
24 terrorists. He saved a life, and we honor all four
25 of these individuals and their families. Anti-

2 Semitism is intolerable, and as we know, it is
3 happening too frequently around the world, around the
4 country and even here in New York City in all five
5 boroughs. We must always, always, always speak out
6 against the evils of anti-Semitism. Tomorrow,
7 December 20th, also marks the five-year anniversary
8 of the deaths of Detective Wenjian Liu a seven-year
9 veteran of the NYPD and Detective Rafael Ramos, a
10 two-year veteran of the Department. They were
11 murdered in the line of duty, assassinated and
12 targeted because they were police officers. Our
13 hearts remain with their families as they continue to
14 grieve, even these many years later, and we are
15 forever grateful for the service of detectives Liu
16 and Ramos and for the members of the Department who
17 continue to serve our city every single day. If
18 everyone could please stand for a moment of silence
19 as we remember the four victims in Jersey City and
20 detectives Wenjian Liu and Rafael Ramos.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Rise.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. As we gear
23 up for a new year, I want to acknowledge a few
24 changes that are going to be happening here at the
25 Council. Sadly, very sadly, two of our most valuable

2 voices here at the Council, Lillian Pascone and
3 Camille Chin Kee Fatt are leaving for new adventures.
4 Lillian has been a steady and trusted advisor in some
5 of our most important work, including the closure of
6 Rikers Island. She put in long, long, long hours and
7 poured over thousands of pages of documents to make
8 sure that we got it right. She is one of my favorite
9 people. I am going to be very sad to not see her
10 when I come into City Hall every single day, and she
11 is leaving us for New Orleans and love, but not in
12 that order, and I am just so grateful for everything
13 that she has done for me and for all of us this past
14 year and a half. This city will be forever grateful
15 for her hard work. And I want to say that Camille
16 Chin Kee Fatt has helped make sure things run
17 smoothly for everyone at the Council. Her work has
18 touched everyone here and we are so, so grateful for
19 her service. She's going on to-- where is she?
20 Where's Camille? She's going on to-- I don't know if
21 I'm allowed to announce it, but she's going-- I'm
22 allowed to announce it? Okay. So she's going on to
23 be the Chief of Staff for the new District Attorney
24 Melinda Katz in the Borough of Queens. And so the
25 people of Queens are lucky to have her and her

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

service, and I really, really just am deeply grateful for everything that Camille has done for the previous Speaker of the Council, for myself. She has been just an invaluable, wonderful member of the senior staff here and we're going to miss her very, very much, but we know that her service continues here in city government. We're also bidding farewell to one of our Transportation Counsels, James DiGiovanni who has done a fabulous, fabulous job in being counsel for the Transportation Committee. He was instrumental and key person in working on the State of the City address and the master street plan, and all the bills that went through the committee he worked on, and he was recently honored as an emerging leader in transportation by the NYU Rudin Center for his work, but it turns out that James is not going too far, as he will be the Assistant General Counsel at the Taxi and Limousine Commission, and so we are happy that his service continues for the City of New York. And my best to James. I want to thank him. Can we get a big rousing round of applause for Lilian, Camille and James and everything they have done for this city?

[applause]

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: As I mentioned, this is
3 our last Stated and the Council has had a year to be
4 proud of together. We are closing Rikers Island and
5 creating a more humane criminal justice system. We
6 created the Office of Hate Crimes which unfortunately
7 has been so sorely needed. We created a streets
8 masterplan to make our streets safer and more
9 pedestrian-friendly. We cracked down on placard
10 [sic] abuse. We passed the Climate Mobilization Act.
11 We overhauled commercial waste zones, and in one of
12 our most important acts for New York families, we
13 significantly toughened our lead laws to protect our
14 children, and held the City accountable for
15 inexcusable lapses in ensuring that apartments are
16 truly free of lead. We have accomplished so much
17 together and I look forward to working alongside all
18 of you next year to do even more for the city we all
19 love. I want to wish everyone a very merry
20 Christmas. Happy Chanukah which is starting up in a
21 few days. Happy Kwanza. It is a special time of year
22 for all of us and for our families and our loved
23 ones. Merry Christmas, Mom. I love you. She watches
24 this. So, Merry Christmas. She goes on that clunky
25 council website and dials in. Now, let's dive into

2 our legislative agenda. We'll be voting on the
3 following Land-Use items: two applications in Council
4 Member Bill Perkins' district, La Hermosa, a rezoning
5 that will facilitate a new residential tower, and MMN
6 1902, 117th Street, which is a tax exemption that
7 will enable much-needed repairs for three buildings
8 in the preservation of 41 units of affordable
9 housing. Lastly, there is a citywide POPS text
10 amendment that would update the existing public
11 symbol and permit moveable tables and chairs replaced
12 in plazas. We'll be voting on the following finance
13 items: an expense budget modification, a revenue
14 budget modification, and a capital budget
15 modification on the expense budget modification. And
16 I want to thank Chair Dromm for his work on all of
17 these. I'm really pleased to see the changes
18 reflected in the modification that will effectuate
19 some of the really important funding that was part of
20 the budget agreement that we all struck back in June.
21 In particular, the budget mod includes 54 million
22 dollars for the indirect rate increase for human
23 service contracts so that our nonprofit partners can
24 better afford to provide the vital services on which
25 our constituents rely every day on. We rely on these

2 nonprofits to help New Yorkers get the services they
3 need to thrive, and they should not have to scramble
4 to pay their bills. This mod also shows the funding
5 for the pay parity agreement for critical public
6 sector workers, including 29 million dollars for
7 Early Childhood Education providers and 7.4 million
8 dollars for legal service providers so that these
9 workers are paid fairly. We'll also be voting on
10 five Article XI property tax exemptions for
11 affordable housing developments including William R.
12 Anderson in Council Member Levine's district, 1632
13 Hutchison River Parkway East in Council Member
14 Gjonaj's district, 1414 Walton Avenue in Council
15 Member Cabrera's district, 254 East 184th Street in
16 Council Member Torres' district, Evergreen and
17 Tiebout Pillars in Council Member Torres' district.
18 And moving on, the Council will be voting on the
19 following piece of legislation: First, the Council
20 will be voting on a street co-naming bill for vote
21 today. Pre-considered introduction would co-name 55
22 thoroughfares in public places based on the requests
23 of Council Members in whose district the street sign
24 is being located. And I want to thank the staff who
25 worked on this: Christopher Sartori [sp?], Patrick

2 Mulvahill [sp?], Cheema Obicheri [sp?], and Monica
3 Bujac [sp?]. Next, we have a civil service and labor
4 package of bills. Resolution Number 40A sponsored by
5 Council Member Robert Cornegy would call on the New
6 York City Employee's Retirement System, NYCERS, to
7 determine that members are disabled for purposes of
8 receiving city disability pensions if first the state
9 Workers' Compensation Board determines that the
10 member has a permanent partial disability, and also
11 second, the US Social Security Administration
12 determines that the member is disabled for
13 substantial work activity and approved for Social
14 Security Disability benefits. And I want to thank
15 the staff that worked on that bill: Nushaad Chowdry
16 [sp?], and Kevin Katowsky [sp?]. Next, Introduction
17 Number 1604B, sponsored by Council Member I. Daneek
18 Miller, our Chair of the Civil Service and Labor
19 Committee, would require the collection of workers'
20 compensation data about occupational diseases to help
21 keep our workers safer and healthier. This bill also
22 requires each agency to develop and implement an
23 annual accident and illness program designed to
24 reduce workplace injuries and illnesses identified in
25 the report, and the Mayor to submit a report on steps

2 the City will take to develop programs to mitigate
3 occupational injury and illnesses. I want to thank
4 the staff again. I want to thank Nushaad Chowdery
5 [sp?], and also Malcolm Butehorn [sp?]. Next, we
6 have two bills: Introduction Number 1786 and
7 Introduction 1810, both sponsored by our Chair, Chair
8 Miller, that would extend health insurance coverage
9 benefits specifically to the surviving spouses,
10 domestic partners and children, of two city employees
11 who were tragically killed while on the job. Matthew
12 Gigabowsky [sp?], who worked at the Department of
13 Sanitation, was killed on September 24th, 2019, and
14 Eduardo Callai Abrille [sp?] who worked at the
15 Department of Transportation was killed on October
16 22nd, 2019, and I want to thank Nushaad Chowdery
17 [sp?] for her work on those two pieces of
18 legislation. Next up we have a package of education
19 bills that are aimed at holding the Department of
20 Education accountable and increasing transparency.
21 There are nearly 200,000 public school students who
22 receive special education services in our city. The
23 Council hears too many stories from frustrated
24 parents that their children are not getting the
25 special education services they are entitle to. It's

2 unacceptable, and it's heartbreaking. These bills
3 will help keep the Department of Education
4 accountable to providing required special education
5 services. These are not options, and the DOE must
6 help these families and students. Proposed
7 Introduction Number 900A, sponsored by Council Member
8 Ben Kallos, would amend Local Law 27 of 2015 to
9 require the Department of Education to report tri-
10 annually rather than annually on its provision of
11 special education services in compliance with a
12 student's IEPs. The bill would also add assistive
13 technology services and special transportation
14 services to the enumerated list of services that
15 students with disabilities are entitled to on which
16 the DOE is required to report. Next, proposed
17 Introduction Number 1406A, sponsored by Council
18 Member Danny Dromm, would require that the New York
19 City Department of Education to annually report on
20 several indicators regarding its evaluation of pre-
21 school aged children for special education services
22 and the provision of such services. The bill also
23 requires the Department of Education, the Department
24 of Health and Mental Hygiene rather, to annually
25 report on the provision of early intervention

2 services to eligible infants and toddlers with
3 disabilities. And proposed Introduction Number
4 1380A, sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal,
5 would require the New York Department of Education to
6 annually report on special education claim by parents
7 for reimbursement for tuition or services for the
8 preceding academic year. The bill will report on the
9 timeframe for that process, from initial submission
10 of the claim by a parent to the DOE paying out that
11 claim. The bill would also require the Department to
12 report on a number of impartial hearing officers
13 certified by the state to cover New York City, how
14 many of those hearing officers had their
15 certifications revoked by the state, and how many
16 cases hearing officers recuse themselves from. Next,
17 proposed Introduction-- we have a proposed
18 introduction and we have a resolution by our
19 Education Chair Mark Treyger who did a magnificent
20 job working on this package of bills, hearing these
21 bills and getting them to the finish line. His first
22 bill would amend Local Law 27 of 2015 to require the
23 Department of Education to disaggregate by school its
24 report on individualized education program compliance
25 rates and provide the number and percentage of

2 students by school that are receiving full services
3 they're entitled to. And his Resolution Number 749A
4 would call upon the Department of Education to create
5 a Chief Compliance Officer position within the
6 Department to ensure they are in compliance with the
7 federal Individuals with Disabilities Education Act.
8 It's the IDEA Act at the federal level. The Chief
9 Compliance Officer would ensure that the DOE is
10 meeting its legal mandate to provide all the special
11 education services a student with disabilities is
12 entitled to under the IDEA Act. I want to thank the
13 staff who worked on this, Malcolm Butehorn [sp?], and
14 Smita Deshmuk [sp?]. Proposed Introduction Number
15 948A, sponsored by Council Member Ritchie Torres,
16 this bill would require the Department of Housing,
17 Preservation and Development to select a list of 50
18 buildings based on factors that indicate the building
19 owner has failed to comply with the heating
20 requirements set forth in the housing maintenance
21 code. This bill would then require these owners to
22 install an internet-capable temperature reporting
23 device in each dwelling unit for up to four years,
24 and this bill would also require HPD to conduct
25 targeted inspections of buildings on that list every

2 two weeks for the duration of the heat season, and I
3 want to thank Audrey Sojn [sp?] for her work on that
4 bill. Proposed Introduction Number 1710A is
5 sponsored by Council Member Donovan Richards, this
6 bill would extend the J51 tax exemption and abatement
7 program through June 30th, 2020 and would also raise
8 the assessed value limitation on the units eligible
9 for this program from \$35,000 to \$40,000. And
10 finally, we are considering a very, very important
11 and timely bill that addresses one of the biggest
12 problems we are facing as a city, and that is the
13 homelessness crisis. Introduction 1211A will require
14 developers who receive city funds to set aside 15
15 percent of the units for those who are experiencing
16 homelessness. This is a revolutionary change in
17 policy that is both necessary, right, and urgent.
18 Close to 80,000 people are experiencing homelessness
19 right now in New York City, including tens of
20 thousands of children. This is not sustainable, and
21 I'm so proud the City Council is taking bold action
22 today to address this existential threat to our city.
23 I really, really, really want to commend Council
24 Member Salamanca who has worked tirelessly on this
25 bill, and he has not just worked on this bill. In

2 his own district he has worked on every project
3 that's gone through ULURP to ensure there was a
4 significant set-aside for homeless families [sic] and
5 individuals, and that in his partnership with the
6 House Our Future New York Coalition led to this bill
7 being drafted and the advocacy that has happened on
8 it over the last year. So, he's going to talk in a
9 few minutes, but I'm really grateful for the
10 Coalition of the Homeless, for Vocal New York, for
11 Giselle from the House Our New York Coalition
12 Campaign. I'm really grateful to Ms. Flowers who I
13 see sitting up there who is a wonderful and great New
14 Yorkers, and everyone who has made this day a
15 reality. Everyone who lives, works, and visits our
16 city knows we are grappling with an unprecedented
17 homelessness crisis, and today, the Council is taking
18 steps to tackle this issue head-on. So, proposed
19 Introduction 1211A, sponsored by Council Member
20 Salamanca, would require developers who receive city
21 financial assistance for new construction of housing
22 development projects to set aside at least 15 percent
23 of dwelling units offered for rent in each housing
24 development project for homeless individuals and
25 their families. The Department of Housing,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Preservation and Development would be required to report annually to the Mayor and the Speaker of the Council the number of units set aside for homeless individuals and families in each city finance housing development project and housing preservation project. And I want to thank the staff who worked tirelessly on this: Michelle Lee, Andrea Vasquez [sp?], Raju Mann [sp?], Jason Goldman, and there were many, many others. I am grateful to everyone's hard work on this important bill, and Madam Majority Leader, before I give it back to you, I want to allow Council Member Salamanca some additional time from Speaker time to speak on this historic occasion on this historic bill, and I want to give him the time necessary, and I also want to make the offer to Chair Treyger if he wants to speak on this package of bills on special education. I want to set aside time for him as well to talk about how important this package of bill is for children who are getting special education in their families and their city. So, first, Madam Majority Leader, I want to turn it over to Council Member Salamanca.

[applause]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.

3 Thank you, Speaker Johnson. Last October, I
4 introduced Intro 1211, which would require
5 residential development projects receiving city
6 subsidies to set aside 50 percent of units for
7 homeless individuals and families. At the time of
8 introduction, the City was on the verge of setting
9 records for all the wrong reasons. Nearly 63,000 New
10 Yorkers facing a combination of changing communities,
11 rising rents, stagnant wages, domestic violence or
12 adversities in their personal life woke up and went
13 to sleep each day in a New York City shelter.
14 Thousands more feeling unsafe in shelters chose a
15 life on the streets. Listening to stories from
16 advocates like Ms. Flowers, a fierce advocate for
17 increased set-asides, and a homeless New Yorker
18 herself resonated for many just how much more we had
19 to do as a city to address this crisis. The numbers
20 were startling. At its peak, 63,839 New Yorkers
21 resided in a city shelter. Most upsetting, as a
22 parent to a five-year-old, over 22,000 children,
23 22,000 children, a majority of them under the age of
24 six spent their formative years bouncing from shelter
25 to shelter. Despite the critical juncture, the

2 city's housing policy has failed to produce a
3 fraction of the new units needed to match the scale
4 of the homeless crisis. Homelessness in New York
5 City per report from the Coalition for the Homeless
6 has reflected a bleak reality that has not been since
7 the Great Depression. Working with partners from the
8 House our Future Campaign, we took our message to
9 City Hall, and across the city to rally the
10 importance of a citywide policy requiring a 15
11 percent set-aside as a project by project basis. The
12 message was clear, until more permanent housing for
13 the homeless was built, the problem will only get
14 worse. To show that this was a policy that could
15 work, I began instituting a 15 percent set-aside in
16 projects in my district. Over the course of a year
17 and a half I am proud to have secured 121 units of
18 housing for homeless individuals and families in
19 eight projects in my district. While a small return
20 in the grand scheme of things, it showed the impact
21 citywide legislation could have if implemented across
22 the five boroughs. Homelessness is not an issue
23 limited just to the South Bronx. Homelessness
24 affects all of us, and it is felt in each one of our
25 council districts. As developments grow taller and

2 rents rise at a frantic pace, the reality is many of
3 our constituents are one paycheck away from being
4 homeless. The homelessness crisis and the affordable
5 housing crisis are a very much a reality, and if
6 we're going to address the two, we need to implement
7 old measures. We have the opportunity to change the
8 landscape of our housing and homelessness policy for
9 the better. Today's vote on Intro 1211 is about
10 giving hope to thousands of men, women, and children
11 who are looking for a place to call home rather than
12 seeking band-aid solutions. Intro 1211 sets us on a
13 path to create what we need most to address the issue
14 at hand, thousands of units of new permanent housing
15 for homeless. At moments like this we will be judged
16 on how we respond to one of the greatest challenges
17 of our times. I urge my colleagues to stand with
18 homeless advocates and the 63,000 people who call a
19 New York City shelter home, and vote in favor of
20 Intro 1211. The push to pass Intro 1211 was far from
21 an individual effort. First and foremost I would
22 like to thank Speaker Johnson for his leadership and
23 commitment to ensuring that the most vulnerable New
24 Yorkers are not forgotten. From the Speaker's Office
25 I would like to thank Jason Goldman, Raju Mann, Jeff

2 Baker [sp?], Andrea Vasquez, Michelle Lee, Andre Son
3 [sp?], and Austin Bradford. I would also like to
4 thank my colleagues in the City Council for their
5 overwhelming support of this bill including co-
6 sponsor Steve Levin for his continued leadership on
7 the issues of homelessness and his role as Chairman
8 of the Committee on General Welfare. I would also
9 like to thank my team, Ryan Hayde [sp?], John Sicarro
10 [sp?], and Lawrence Subollama [sp?]. Last but not
11 least, we would not be here if it weren't for the
12 dedicated groups of advocates who have never missed
13 an opportunity to speak out on the need for more
14 housing and services for the homeless. Whether it
15 was at rallies, marches, teachings, sleep-outs, or on
16 social media, they never wavered in their mission on
17 behalf of the City's most vulnerable. I must thank
18 Giselle and Coalition for the Homeless, Ms. Flowers
19 and Paulette [sp?] from Vocal New York, Urban
20 Pathways, Neighbors together, Interfaith Assembly on
21 Homelessness and Housing, Care for the Homeless,
22 Housing Works, Human.NYC, Homeless Services United,
23 Picture the Homeless, WEN [sic] and the entire House
24 our Future Campaign. On behalf of the 62,000 people
25 who woke up this morning in a New York City shelter

2 and to the countless members-- and to the countless
3 numbers of advocates who have passionately lobbied
4 for more permanent housing, I dedicated to vote-- I
5 dedicate this vote to you, and today, I will proudly
6 vote aye on Intro 1211A. Thank you.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Congratulations Rafael.
8 You have a great day. Congratulations.

9 [applause]

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Before I turn it over
11 to Chair Treyger, I was remiss because one of the
12 longest-- one of the people who has been here the
13 longest at the Council is sadly leaving, but is going
14 to be continuing his service in city government,
15 Fatim Shaboni [sp?] is also leaving the Council. He
16 has been at the Council for 12 years working in the
17 Finance Division, working in the Administrative
18 Division, and he is going to go work at the Public
19 Advocate's Office. So he's not going far. And we're
20 really grateful for his service over the last 12
21 years and we wish him good luck moving forward, and I
22 really want-- he's standing over here. I really want
23 to congratulate him

24 [applause]

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Now I want to turn it
3 over to Chair Treyger to talk about this important
4 package of bills today.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, Mr.
6 Speaker. In February of this year, the Committee on
7 Education held a hearing, a sobering hearing, on the
8 delivery of special education services to New York
9 City public school students. At that hearing we
10 heard from parents, students, advocates, and special
11 education providers, and we learned what we knew all
12 along. The DOE is deficient in providing the legally
13 mandated services that more than 200,000 students
14 with disabilities are entitled to. We learned about
15 a broken system that lacks needed transparency. We
16 learned about the extraordinary steps parents and
17 guardians must take in order for their children to
18 get the most basic of educational services. Nearly
19 20 percent of students in the school students are
20 students with disabilities or 224,160 students. To
21 put that into better perspective, the Houston
22 Independent School District, which Chancellor Coronza
23 [sp?] used to be superintendent of, has a total
24 student population of 214,175 students. DOE reported
25 in their latest special education report, thanks to

2 Chair Dromm, that only 78.4 percent of school-aged
3 students with IEPs in DOE settings were fully
4 receiving their recommended services. 19.1 percent
5 were receiving partial services, and 2.5 percent
6 didn't receive any services. Further, even more
7 disappointing, in 2018 only roughly 50 percent of
8 students with disabilities graduated from high school
9 within four years. So when we hear the Mayor and the
10 Chancellor talk about graduation rates going up,
11 let's not forget students with IEPs and also our
12 English Language Learners. I acknowledge that DOE
13 has made some attempts of improvements, but as
14 learned at the hearing, so much more work is needed
15 to be done. Today, we begin that additional work.
16 The package of legislation we're voting on today will
17 not only provide more granular data on DOE's
18 compliance with delivering special education
19 services, but also a new level of reporting for
20 preschool students in early intervention services.
21 Together, these bills will provide parents,
22 advocates, and policy makers in this Council with the
23 information necessary to hold the DOE accountable.
24 I'm proud to have two pieces of legislation moving
25 forward at today's Stated. My bill, Introduction

2 559A, will require the DOE to expand its current
3 reporting on IEP compliance rates to include
4 reporting on a school level. This will provide a
5 more holistic picture of what is happening in more
6 than 1,800 schools. Most importantly, this bill
7 highlights what services students are not receiving
8 in that school, which will help ensure more
9 transparency and accountability. Look, we just
10 passed and got a PTA fundraising reporting bill which
11 gives us a clearer picture of the depths of inequity
12 across zip codes in our school system. We deserve to
13 know which neighborhoods, which zip codes are not
14 seeing the resources to meet the needs of our kids.
15 Also, Resolution 749A encourages the DOE to create a
16 Special Education Chief Compliance Officer position
17 to ensure and to proactively ensure that students
18 with IEPs are a priority and that the DOE is in
19 compliance with federal Individuals and Disabilities
20 Education Act, IDEA. Our students deserve the best,
21 and these bills will make sure that there is true
22 accountability. I want to thank the Speaker for his
23 leadership in getting these bills to the finish line.
24 I also want to give a big huge shout out to Jason
25 Goldman, Jeff Baker, Laura Popa [sp?], Smita Deshmuk

2 [sp?], Andrea Vasquez, Malcolm Butehorn [sp?], Klima
3 Johnson [sp?], Jen Attwell [sp?], Anna Scape [sp?],
4 and Vanessa Ogle [sp?] from my staff, and I ask my
5 colleagues to please vote in support. Thank you, Mr.
6 Speaker.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Congratulations Mr.
8 Chair, and I will turn it back to Majority Leader
9 Cumbo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Speaker
11 Johnson, and congratulations to all of my colleagues
12 on this ground-breaking legislation. We will now
13 move into discussion of General Orders. I'll call on
14 Council Member Ben Kallos.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Our education
16 system has been failing one in five children with
17 disabilities by failing to give them the mandated
18 services they need to perform. New York City public
19 schools had 224,160 students with disabilities,
20 nearly 40,000 receiving only partial or none of their
21 mandated services during the 2017/2018 school year.
22 According to Local Law 27 of 2015 Law authored by
23 Council Member Danny Dromm, this led then Public
24 Advocate, now Attorney General Letitia James to sue
25 the DOE over their failure to track and thereby

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

deprive disabled students of necessary assistance.
James introduced Introduction 900 on May 9th, 2018.
I was proud to cosponsor this introduction then, and
I'm now even more proud to carry it over the finish
line. This bill seeks to guarantee that students
with disabilities receive the necessary services by
increasing reporting from annual to three times a
school year and expanding what is reported to include
speech therapy, counseling, occupational therapy,
physical therapy, hearing education services, vision
education services, assisted technology services, and
special transportation services. Vote yes so that
over 224,000 students with disabilities that we will
be able to finally get them the resources they
desperately need. Thank you to Tish James for taking
this issue to court and authoring what will be a
vital law. Thank you to Education Committee Chair
Mark Treyger and the committee staff for your work on
this intro. A special thank you to Speaker Johnson
for making this bill package passing today a
priority. The parents and children needing these
services are very grateful, as are the kids
themselves. Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
3 Member Kallos. We will now go into report of Special
4 Committees.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Reports of
7 Standing Committees?

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
9 on Civil Service and Labor, Intro 1604B, workers'
10 compensation data.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
12 General Orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 1786 and Intro
14 1810, health insurance benefits.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
16 Orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
18 on Education Intro 559A and Intro 900A, student IEPs.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
20 General Orders.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 1380A and Intro
22 1406A, school reporting bills.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
24 General Orders.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
3 on Finance, pre-considered Reso 1190A, transparency
4 resolution.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
6 Orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M199 and
8 Reso 1203 through pre-considered M201 and REso 1205,
9 budget modifications.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
11 Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered LU 592 and
13 Reso 1206 through pre-considered LU596 and Reso 1210,
14 tax exemptions.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
16 Orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
18 on Housing and Buildings, Intro 948A, heat
19 inspections

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
21 General Orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 1211A, HPD set-
23 aside units.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
25 General Orders.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 1710A, J51 program.

3 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
4 General Orders.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
6 on Land Use, LU590 and Reso 1211, LEMLE West 117th
7 Street.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
9 Orders.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
11 on Parks and Recreation and pre-considered Intro
12 1825, street co-namings.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
14 Orders.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
16 on Rules, Privileges and Elections, M196 and Reso
17 1212, approving the reappointment of Kenneth
18 Knuckles, Planning Commission.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Before I say that's
20 coupled on General Orders, I didn't mention earlier,
21 though we had gone through the agenda, that I want to
22 thank the Rules, Privileges and Elections Committee
23 and Chair Koslowitz for the two nominations that we
24 are voting on today, recommendations from the Mayor,
25 and now we see that there are a couple of more from

2 the TLC and from the City Planning Commission and
3 from the Tax Commission and from the Youth Board that
4 are coming to the Rules, Privileges and Elections
5 Committee as well, and so with that, Mr. Clerk,
6 coupled on General Orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Mr. Speaker.
8 M197 and Reso 1213, approving the reappointment of
9 Thomas B. Nichols, Tax Commission.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
11 Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: M198 and Reso 1214,
13 improving the reappointment of Frances Henn, Tax
14 Commission.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
16 Orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M203 and
18 Reso 1215 approving the recommendation of Christopher
19 Bastardi, Youth Board.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
21 Orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M204 and
23 Reso 1216 approving the recommendation of Melanie
24 Kruevelis, Youth Board.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
3 Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: On the General Order
5 Calendar: LU 564 and Reso 1217 through LU 567 and
6 Reso 1220.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
8 Orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 581 and Reso 1221
10 Zoning Amendment.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
12 Orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing
14 various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
16 Orders, and at this time I'm asking for a roll call
17 vote on all of the items on today's General Order
18 Calendar.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Lewis?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEWIS: With permission
21 I'd like to vote on all Land Use Call-ups and coupled
22 items on General Order Calendars and all Resolutions.
23 I vote aye.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
25 granted.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, and
4 with your permission Madam Public Advocate, I too
5 would like to vote on all Land Use call-ups and
6 coupled items on the General Order Calendar and all
7 Resolutions.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you for the
9 promotion, and permission granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Excuse me, Adams?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to
13 explain my vote?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you,
17 Majority Leader. I am so proud today to have
18 sponsored three street co-namings in my district that
19 we're voting on today. Detective Lawrence Cecil
20 Smith, a hero and mentor of the 113th Precinct and
21 the historic Punjab Avenue and Gurdwara Street, two
22 unprecedented recognitions in Richmond Hill,
23 celebrating our Punjabi and Sikh communities. This
24 is unprecedented in our community. In addition, I
25 celebrate the much-deserved street co-naming of

2 Reverend Floyd H. Flake Way in Council Member
3 Miller's district, honoring the architect and builder
4 of senior housing, retail, education, and so much
5 more in our community. He also happens to be my very
6 own pastor. And for that we revere him. We thank
7 him for all that he has done, and we salute our
8 pastor, Reverend Doctor Floyd H. Flake. With that,
9 I vote aye on all, with the exception of 1211A, which
10 I must abstain due to the potential impact on
11 southeast Queens community by which my colleague
12 Council Member Miller will elaborate during his
13 remarks. Thank you Madam Majority Leader.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala? Barron?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
23 wasn't here at the last Stated, but I did want to
24 take some time to acknowledge that 515 Blake Avenue
25 was voted on, and I want to thank the Speaker, and I

2 especially want to thank the members of the Zoning
3 Committee and also Raju Mann who did a fantastic job
4 negotiating that project. And what happened with
5 that project is that it was proposed to have a
6 shelter to replace an existing shelter. They were
7 going to build a brand new shelter and add additional
8 housing, and we were able to get the-- HPD to
9 understand that we don't need shelters, we need
10 permanent housing, and it addresses what my colleague
11 is introducing today as well. And in that project
12 we're going to have 30 percent of the housing
13 apartments there set aside for formerly homeless. I
14 commend my colleague Council Member Salamanca. He's
15 been talking about this for quite some time, and I
16 commend you. Glad to see this bill and to vote on it
17 and support you're in that regard, and I'm voting aye
18 on all with the exception of 564 through 581. No,
19 564 through 567 and the accompanying resolutions.
20 Thank you. I'm abstaining on that one.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
23 except 1211A, which despite my no vote, I commend the
24 sponsor for his very earnest hard work on the
25 measure.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 1211, aye
6 on the rest.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Chin?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Congratulations to
9 all my colleagues on passing important legislation,
10 especially Council Member Salamanca, and I vote aye
11 on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I want to
16 congratulate Council Member Salamanca on his amazing
17 bill today as well as Council Member Treyger for his
18 very important bills, and happy holidays to all my
19 colleagues, and a happy new year as well, and I vote
20 aye on all. Thank you.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy? Deutsch?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz? Dromm?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: With many
3 congratulations to Salamanca and Mark Treyger on
4 their amazing bills and all the rest of my
5 colleagues, I vote aye, and happy holidays.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye, and
8 happy holidays to all my colleagues and all the staff
9 from the Speaker office and also all our staff, all
10 staff regardless of where they're working what
11 they're doing. I want to thank them and congratulate
12 them and wish them a very happy and peaceful holiday.
13 With that, I vote aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
16 explain my vote?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
18 granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
20 Majority Leaders, and good afternoon colleagues. I
21 want to join with all of you in congratulating our
22 Education Chair, Council Member Treyger, on his
23 leadership on issues related to so many of our
24 special education students. I represent many of
25 them, those with disabilities and IEPs, District 75

2 in my school district nine, and I know this
3 legislation will have a positive impact on children
4 and their families. I wanted to speak in favor of
5 another piece of legislation on today's agenda, Intro
6 by Council Member Ritchie Torres that relates to the
7 installation of heating devices and sensors in
8 certain apartments. We know with the winter season
9 upon us, many families are living in homes where they
10 do not receive sufficient heat and hot water, and
11 this legislation will really move HPD forward in
12 identifying those apartments that are the most in
13 need, and these heating sensors will be able to
14 provide HPD with the information on those apartments
15 which are in dire need of heat and hot water. And
16 finally, I wanted to join with all of you in
17 commending our Land Use Chair Council Member Rafael
18 Salamanca and all of the housing advocates and the
19 House Our Future campaign. Honored to be a sponsor
20 of this bill. As someone who represents a tremendous
21 amount of family shelters in my district, it is
22 incumbent upon all of us to make sure that we share
23 in a citywide burden. The same communities that
24 absorb shelter should not also be the same
25 communities that absorb all of the affordable housing

2 across the city. We have to do better. We have to
3 make sure that as a city we lead, and this bill is
4 going to allow us to do that to make sure that we are
5 a part of the solution in bringing much-needed
6 affordable and permanent housing for those who are
7 the most in need, and so I join Council Member
8 Salamanca in congratulating him and all of the
9 members of the campaign, the Coalition for the
10 Homeless and Vocal and Interfaith Assembly, and
11 everyone who was a part of this campaign.

12 Congratulations to you all and thank you, Ms.
13 Flowers, and I vote aye on all, and happy holidays to
14 all my colleagues and your families. God bless you.
15 Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

17 [applause]

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj? Grodenchik?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you.

20 Just briefly, I want to thank my colleague Donovan
21 Richards for shepherding Intro. 1710A which will
22 provide some modest relief for homeowners in eastern
23 Queens bout-- well, 20,000 of my homeowners, mostly
24 people living in middle income co-ops. So, thank
25 you, Donovan. I want to thank the Speaker for

2 getting it to the floor today. I want to thank the
3 people who enabled this legislation in the Assembly
4 in the State Senate, Assemblyman Ed Braunstein and
5 State Senator Toby Ann Stavisky. I also want to
6 thank my colleague Mark Treyger, my Chair, for the
7 package of bills that hopefully will produce better
8 results for children with special needs. I have
9 many, many schools in my district, stand-alone
10 district 75 schools, and I work very closely with
11 those principals, and I think today we're taking a
12 step forward. With that, I wish everybody whatever
13 you may be celebrating, and even if you're not
14 celebrating-- have a merry, merry Christmas, a happy
15 Kwanza, a happy Chanukah, and a happy new year. May
16 it be a good year for us all, and with that I vote
17 aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote no on Land
20 Use 564, 565, 566, 567, and aye on all the rest.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
25 explain my vote quickly?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I just want to
5 congratulate Land Use Chair Salamanca on Introduction
6 1211A. It was a privilege to work with him as a
7 Chair of the Planning, Dispositions, Concessions
8 Subcommittee on 76 individual projects, and project
9 by project getting this 15 percent set-aside. By
10 setting this threshold at 15 percent moving forward,
11 that will make the negotiations moving forward, and I
12 just hear my colleagues about the fact-- where we are
13 siting a lot of this affordable housing, particularly
14 homeless services, and reiterate my desire to bring
15 so to the upper east side. We've been building some
16 supportive housing, but we can always build more, and
17 would love to build shelters, too. Thank you. I
18 vote aye on all.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Happy holidays to
21 all my colleagues. Merry Christmas. Happy Chanukah.
22 Happy Kwanza. Happy New Year. And I also want to
23 congratulate Council Member Salamanca and Council
24 Member Treyger for passing very important bills
25 before the end of the year, and I vote aye on all.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be
5 excused to explain my vote?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes, you may.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I's like to
8 recognize two street namings in my district, Aaron
9 Adler who is known as the Mayor of Cue Gardens, and
10 to Abe Miller who led the Little League for so many
11 years, was loved by all, and I'm proud to name
12 streets after these two wonderful men. I also want to
13 congratulate Council Member Salamanca and Council
14 Member Treyger. And I wish everybody a happy
15 holiday, whatever you celebrate, and I vote aye on
16 all.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander? Levin?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
22 explain my vote?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
25 Majority Leader. I just wanted to also acknowledge

2 Council Member Salamanca and his incredible work on
3 this piece of legislation. This bill will do more to
4 fight homelessness in New York City than any other
5 action that has been taken in the last 10 years, not
6 only by us, but also by the City. This is for the
7 first time saying clearly across the City that
8 homelessness is an issue that we all have to address.
9 It's not just on one community. It's on every
10 community, and that the people that are experiencing
11 homelessness in New York City very often are there
12 for purely economic reasons because they fell behind
13 on their rent, they lost their apartment, and the
14 fact that there are 20,000-plus children in shelter
15 every single night-- that doesn't even count the kids
16 that are doubled-up and unstably housed elsewhere--
17 is something we should all be ashamed of and do
18 everything we can to address. And so I want to thank
19 all the advocates, the House Our Futures Campaign,
20 which has been amazing. There's still a lot of work
21 left to do, but this is a big step. This is a very
22 big step. I want to thank Commissioner Banks as
23 well, but a lot of credit goes to Rafael Salamanca
24 for holding the line here and insisting on finding
25 legislation to move on past the time that we're in

2 office. And just-- so congratulations Council Member
3 Salamanca. And I just want to thank the Speaker for
4 acknowledging Moshe Deutsch, Douglas Miguel
5 Rodriguez, Mindy Ferencz, and police officer Joseph
6 Seals, Detective Joseph Seals in the tragic shooting
7 last week in Jersey City. I'm very close with Moshe
8 Deutsch's father, Abe Deutsch, and my heart goes out
9 to him and his family and to all of the bereaved
10 families, and we need to come together and address
11 the scourge of anti-Semitism and hate every time we
12 see it. Thank you, and happy holidays to all. I
13 vote aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to
20 explain my vote, please?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. I also want
24 to encourage my-- thank and encourage my colleagues
25 to vote yes on the package of bills 1604, 1786, and

2 1810 that was in the Committee on Civil Service and
3 Labor which addresses workers' compensation and
4 provides survivors' benefits for two members of the
5 city's municipal workforce that lost their lives in
6 the line of duty. So these bills were intended to
7 protect the quality of life and support families who-
8 - loved ones who'd given their life of our public
9 employees. I want to address-- our community in
10 southeast Queens has support for the housing needs of
11 the City's homeless is unmatched and has served as a
12 reflection of our values in the southeast Queens
13 community. We recognize the fact of improving access
14 to affordable housing is central to rolling back the
15 tide of homelessness, and to support this equitable
16 proposal that would require 15 percent set-aside for
17 total of the city's new development, but also
18 includes-- should include a preservation mandate.
19 Queens Community Board 12 has nearly-- is the highest
20 share of homeless shelters throughout the city and
21 first in the borough of Queens. Given the recent
22 influx of new affordable housing in areas such as
23 mine in Jamaica in the district, that percentage
24 would certainly spike under this legislation. But we
25 must be cautious to not further the trend of forcing

2 less affluent and historically underdeveloped
3 communities to serve as the host for majority of the
4 homeless while more established neighborhoods are
5 spared from doing their fair share to help and combat
6 this crisis. This is certainly about equity.
7 However, if this trend does continue, as always, we
8 are ready, willing, and able to take care of our own.
9 I will be abstaining on 1211 and voting aye on all
10 the rest.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya? Perkins?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you. I'm
13 going to be voting aye on all, and especially want to
14 give a shout out to Council Member Salamanca for
15 Intro 1211 because of what it does for a very
16 critical problem that has been not only in my
17 community, that is the homeless individuals and
18 families' problem, but throughout our city. So this
19 I think is a very, very important piece of
20 legislation that acknowledges that we see what's
21 going on and we care. Thank you very much. I vote
22 aye on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to
25 explain my vote?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Good. First of
5 all, I want to congratulate-- and I proudly will be
6 supporting Council Member Salamanca on his
7 legislation, which is one of the most, I think,
8 significant bills we'll do in these next four-- in
9 these four years here to actually make a meaningful
10 impact on those people who are in need. And I know
11 that he's worked his-- whatever you want to call it,
12 off, and I know that many of us join him proudly in
13 voting for this legislation today which will help so
14 many New Yorkers in their most-- in their biggest
15 time of need. So I'll be proudly voting aye. I also
16 just want to say a very sad but farewell to my friend
17 Lilian Pascone who is off to not greener pastures,
18 but to New Orleans. I've known her since she worked
19 for Council Member Weprin, in particularly on the
20 Rikers Island bill we had this year, worked
21 tirelessly to make sure tha the Council was in a good
22 place to get there and was a very big part of that
23 historic vote. She will be missed. I know the
24 Council and her colleagues will miss her, but we wish
25 her the best of luck. Thank you. I vote aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
4 explain my vote?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you. I
8 just want to-- Rafael Salamanca. Yeah, Rafael
9 Salamanca, the work that you've done related to the
10 15 percent set-aside for homeless families is--
11 didn't go unseen. While you were fighting for this
12 bill to happen, you made sure you led by example in
13 ensuring that every single project in your district
14 has 15 percent. Because of it, I built the Salamanca
15 Rule where I also push for 15 every single time we
16 had affordable housing in my district. You led the
17 way, and I'm extremely grateful that we've gotten to
18 this point, and this victory, it is yours. I think
19 it's very important that we know that this
20 legislation that Council Member Salamanca is pushing
21 is taking politics out of affordable housing, taking
22 politics out of homeless families' lives, and it's
23 about time we did that. We can't allow for Council
24 Members to choose between 15, 10, five percent. We
25 can't do that. We all have to be a part of this. We

2 all have to contribute for the greater good. Fifteen
3 percent across the board is actually a very small
4 number. We could all be doing more. If it wasn't
5 for Salamanca we would be playing politics with the
6 lives of all these people in the supportive housing.
7 So thank you so much for standing up as Land Use
8 Chair, and it's a great day for you and a great day
9 for the City of New York. I vote aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.

12 Permission to explain my vote quickly. I'm happy to
13 speak on Intro 710A to renew the J51 incentive
14 program which provides tax exemptions and abatements
15 for property owners who convert or renovate their
16 buildings, co-ops and condos. With so few
17 opportunities to access affordable homeownership in
18 this city, it is critical that we provide as much
19 incentives as possible to ensure that there's still
20 an affordable path to home ownership for our families
21 in Queens, Brooklyn, the Bronx, and Staten Island.
22 In the outer boroughs, many of these homes are the
23 most affordable you can find in the City outside of
24 subsidized programs allowing thousands of families to
25 gain some true equity by owning something. While we

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

impatiently wait for the recommendations to reform the inequitable property tax system in New York City, we have to do everything in our power to limit the burden on our families across the City which is why I'm so proud this year that we are able to renew this program. I'd like to also point out that there are some improvements that can be made to this program at the state level to provide more protections for rent-controlled tenants that live in some of these properties, which I am supportive of and hope to see Albany take up in this next session. In the meantime, though, it's very important that my colleagues and I that represent many of these homeowners did what we needed to do to not delay this, this very important program. I'd like to thank Speaker Johnson, Council Members Grodenchik and Vallone who were steadfast supporters of this renewal as well as Megan Chin and Audrey Sun [sp?] in the Legislative Division. I'd also like to thank our colleagues in Albany for extending this home rule opportunity for us to take this up. Thank you. I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to
3 briefly explain my vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I just want to
7 say congratulations to Council Member Salamanca.
8 Thank you. This is a great bill, and I think it'll
9 do a lot of good in the City. and to all of the
10 people that are leaving the Council, I've actually
11 learned something from each and every one of you, and
12 I'm so, so grateful, and I know that you're experts
13 in your own lives, and I wish you the best on
14 whatever is next, and I hope I see you soon. Good
15 luck. I vote aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez? Rose?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
18 briefly explain my vote? I just want to say thank
19 you to both of my colleagues, both Salamanca and
20 Treyger, for their ground-breaking legislation that
21 will have an impact on generations of vulnerable New
22 Yorkers, some of which are homelessness and others
23 which were special needs population. I want to thank
24 you for the work that you've done. It's long
25 overdue, and I want to wish all of my colleagues a

2 happy, safe, and restful holiday, and with that I
3 vote aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal? Salamanca?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I
16 just want to note for the record for my colleagues
17 that there is a big difference between what the Mayor
18 has been trying to do in terms of trying to manage a
19 homelessness crisis we have in our city, versus what
20 Chair Salamanca and Speaker Johnson are actually
21 doing in terms of working to solve a homelessness
22 crisis in New York City. There's a difference
23 between managing and solving. There's nothing that
24 takes the place of a permanent home. The impact that
25 it has on our school system where over 114,000

2 children are homeless, over 30,000 living in shelter,
3 what that means, folks, is that a child in a school
4 that grows accustomed to their teacher, to their
5 counselor, to their social worker, as soon as they
6 get accustomed and get into a good routine, they
7 might have to change their school because they're
8 being relocated to a different shelter or a different
9 home setting. The legislation that we're passing
10 today provides the dignity and respect of a home and
11 a sense of stability to our children and to our
12 families. So, Councilman Salamanca, thank you for
13 being a leader, because I in the Land Use Committee
14 hear you every single time with every development
15 project say what are doing to solve the homelessness
16 crisis. You lead by example and by your words. With
17 that, I proudly vote aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: May I briefly be
20 excused to explain my vote, Madam Majority Leader?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes, you may.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. Well,
23 first, I would ask for unanimous consent to also vote
24 on the Land Use items today that are coupled with
25 General Order calendar, and I would like to vote aye

2 on all those Land Use items and also everything
3 that's on today's General Order calendar. I want to
4 thank you, Madam Majority Leader. I saw this
5 beautiful Christmas card with your family, absolutely
6 beautiful, and on the outside it had this beautiful
7 handwriting. I almost-- I almost think you went to
8 Catholic school. The calligraphy is stunning on
9 this. If you did it yourself, I have about 100 cards
10 you could fill out for me, because my handwriting is
11 not nearly as nice as yours, but to you and your
12 family, to all my colleagues, a blessed Christmas.
13 Happy Kwanza. Happy Chanukah and a happy and a
14 healthy new year. I want to end by just commending my
15 friend and colleague Salamanca, Council Member
16 Salamanca from the Bronx. I am a cosponsor of
17 today's bill, and I know that people-- some of my
18 colleagues have concerns about the impacts of the
19 bill. I was very proud to be a supporter of it, to
20 get bipartisan support to the idea that building
21 shelters, more shelters, is not the solution. We
22 need to build more affordable housing and have
23 statutory set-asides for people who have fallen on
24 hard times so that we can transition those families
25 out of the shelter system and into permanent and

2 affordable housing, and this is just one of those
3 steps, and I know that all of you agree with me when
4 I say that next year we really need to turn up the
5 heat on Albany to get them to pony up to provide
6 funding for a real and robust rental subsidy program
7 so that we can get more families out of our shelter
8 system and into permanent and affordable housing and
9 also prevent more people from becoming homeless.
10 Homelessness is not a choice for those families that
11 find themselves there, but I want to commend again in
12 a very special way Council Member Salamanca for
13 holding the line for doing a terrific job and for
14 leading the charge to really help people who need the
15 help the most, especially around the holidays. So,
16 God bless you all and thank you very much.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Moment to
19 explain my vote?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you very
23 much. In today's Stated we are renaming John McHugh
24 Way, a Corporal in my district, at 156th Street and
25 14th Avenue. If there ever was a real live veteran

2 who inspired Captain America, this would be Corporal
3 John McHugh. He served and was drafted in the United
4 States Army in the First Infantry Division in World
5 War II. He fought at the Battle of Normandy. He
6 fought at the Battle of the Bulge. He received the
7 silver star for gallantry in action, the bronze star
8 for meritorious service, the European Theater of
9 Operations Ribbon which contains silver arrowhead for
10 the Normandy invasion, four bronze stars which
11 indicate the major battles he fought in, two
12 Presidential Unit Citations for Crucifix Hill and
13 Hurtgen Forest, the Combat Infantry Badge and the
14 Fort [sic] Eager [sic] given by Belgium for action
15 there in the war. In 2014 he was inducted into the
16 State Senate Veterans Hall of Fame, and this past
17 Memorial Day he was the honoree in the Whitestone and
18 Littleneck Douglas [sic] on Memorial Day marching
19 with his family, and he passed this past July. So, I
20 wanted to honor him and the way he served and fought
21 for all of us in this country. He is a true hero,
22 and I thank everyone for including him in today's co-
23 namings. I thank the Speaker for the J51 extension.
24 Critical for all of us that have co-ops and condos
25 and also the extension of the senior transportation

2 program for all of Queens. And with that, I wish to
3 wish everyone a blessed and happy holiday, Christmas,
4 Kwanza, and Chanukah, and a new decade. 2020 is upon
5 us. God bless all of us. Thank you, Madam Majority
6 Leader.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you and
8 happy new year to you as well.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I think I
12 forgot, aye on all, by the way.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye on all with
15 the exception of Intro 1211 on which I vote no, and
16 LU 581 accompanying resolution 1221 in which I
17 abstain.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye, and I
20 want to commend my colleagues, Council Member Treyger
21 for all the work that you continue to do especially
22 for our most vulnerable children, and I want to thank
23 Council Member Salamanca, because I know that so many
24 people told you this was impossible and that it
25 couldn't be done and that it wouldn't work, but I

2 really applaud your perseverance and your dedication
3 for being unrelenting for a community that we all
4 care so very deeply about. Many of the people in our
5 shelters could be any one of our family members,
6 friends, fathers, mothers, children. So we really
7 applaud you for your dedication and your tenacity.
8 This is going to make a huge difference in the city
9 of New York, and hopefully we'll set a trend
10 throughout the nation. Thank you, and I proudly vote
11 aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Happy Holidays. I vote
14 aye on all.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All items on
16 today's General Order Calendar are adopted by a vote
17 of 43 affirmative, 0 negative, and 0 abstentions with
18 the exception of Introduction 1211A which was adopted
19 by a vote of 38 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 2
20 abstentions. LU 564 through 567 and accompanying
21 resolutions which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the
22 affirmative, 1 negative, and 1 abstention. LU 581
23 and Resolution 1221 which was adopted by a vote of 42
24 in the affirmative, 0 negative, and 1 abstention.
25 We'll now do introduction and reading of bills.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are being
3 referred to committees as indicated on today's
4 agenda.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We
6 will now move into the discussions of resolutions.
7 Are there any members who wish to speak on any of
8 today's resolutions? Seeing none. I will now read
9 today's resolutions into the record. Members who
10 wish to vote against or abstain on either of today's
11 resolutions should register your vote with the clerk
12 at the dais. Resolution 40A, an amended resolution
13 calling upon the New York City Employee's retirement
14 system to determine that members are disabled for
15 purposes of disability pensions. If the New York
16 State Workers' Compensation Board determines that a
17 member has a permanent partial disability and the US
18 Social Security Administration determines that a
19 member is disabled for substantial, gainful work
20 activity, and approved for a Social Security
21 Disability benefits. All in favor say aye.

22 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All opposed?
24 Abstentions? The ayes have it. Resolution 749A, an
25 amended resolution calling up on the New York City

2 Department of Education to establish a Chief
3 Compliance Officer position to ensure compliance with
4 individualized education programs and other
5 requirements for students in special education. All
6 in favor say aye.

7 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All opposed?
9 Abstentions? They ayes have it. We will now move
10 into general discussions. We will begin with Council
11 Member Barron.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
13 Public Advocate. I'll be very brief. As the year is
14 coming to an end, I do know that we've had major
15 accomplishments this year, and I want to commend all
16 of my colleagues for the bills that they've
17 introduced, for the positions that they've taught
18 [sic], for the heated discussions that we've had from
19 time to time, and I also want to call everyone's
20 attention to the fact that this year, 2019, is the
21 first year that five of the major beauty talent
22 titles is held simultaneously by black women. Ms.
23 World is Tony Ann Sing [sp?] from Jamaica. Ms.
24 Universe is Zonzadini Tonzi [sp?] from South Africa.
25 Ms. America is Nya Franklin. Ms. USA Teen-- Ms. Teen

2 USA is Katie Guards [sp?], and Ms. USA is Chelsea
3 Christ [sp?]. And the message that Ms. World gave
4 was believe in yourself. Know that you are worthy and
5 capable of achieving your dreams. You have a
6 purpose. And it's pleasing to see that we're moving
7 from the Eurocentric standards of beauty, and we're
8 now affirming that yes, black is beautiful,
9 intelligent and talented. Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
11 Adams followed by Council Member Menchaca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you,
13 Majority Leader. Today, I'm pleased to introduce
14 Intro 1824, which I encourage my colleagues to sign
15 onto. This bill would require the NYPD, FDNY, and
16 Department of Emergency Management to have access to
17 GPS data regarding the real time location of school
18 buses transporting students to or from school. This
19 legislation stems from the events of November 15th,
20 2018 when a snow storm caused havoc in our city
21 leading to a traffic nightmare. As a result of
22 severe congestion, many students traveling home on
23 school buses did not reach their destination until
24 well after midnight. It is unbelievable that in the
25 year 2019 and a city as large as ours, we can track a

2 snow plow, but in the event of an emergency
3 authorities cannot track our children's school buses.
4 This bill will improve tracking and coordination of
5 information between bus companies, drivers, NYPD,
6 FDNY, and the Department of Emergency Management to
7 allow for timely updates especially when there are
8 significant delays. One of our highest priorities
9 should be the safety of our children, and I ask my
10 colleagues to sign on to Intro 1824. With that, I
11 say happy holidays. Happy, healthy holidays to all
12 of my colleagues. See you next year.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

14 Council Member Menchaca, and we will close.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, happy
16 holidays to everyone. I hope you enjoy time with your
17 family and friends to rest and reflect. I am
18 introducing bill 18-- Intro 1835. As the City's data
19 shows nearly 3.2 million immigrants make New York
20 City their home-- this is the largest number in the
21 history of the City. That's roughly 37 percent of
22 the population--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Quiet
24 in the Chamber.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: in the City.
3 Forty-four percent of its workforce. Clearly, the
4 work almost every major city does-- every city agency
5 does touches lives of our immigrant neighbors,
6 whether it's education, social service, health,
7 public safety, mental health, etcetera. This merits
8 greater coordination and dialogue between every
9 agency. So, in 2017 I introduced a bill to create an
10 interagency taskforce on immigrant affairs, which we
11 passed that same year. The idea was to create a
12 space where every major city agency that serves
13 immigrant New Yorkers to come together and share
14 information. This way, agencies can identify common
15 problems and share best practices. And we at the
16 City Council, as the people's representatives and
17 policy makers, would have a clear sense as to what
18 those common issues are and the proposed solutions.
19 Unfortunately, as we have learned over many of the
20 oversight hearings in Immigration Committee, it is
21 our understanding that the taskforce has met
22 irregularly, and the information reported on these
23 meetings is sparse. There's little transparency
24 about what these conversations are like or if the
25 taskforce is upholding its mandate. So we're going

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to make it clear for the Administration. With the introduction of 1835 I am asking for requirement at least one quarterly meeting and allow the Speaker of the City Council to appoint a Co-chair of the taskforce to the taskforce who can call meetings as well. We need every city agency to take seriously the fact that immigrants are not a special subset of the city's population, but a main constituency they serve every single day. And with that, I want to say thank you again. Feliz Navidad. Happy new year, and see you in 2020.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much, Council Member Menchaca. We will now close out today's meeting with Speaker Corey Jonson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: The Stated Meeting of December 19th, 2019 is hereby adjourned. Happy New Year. Thank you all.

[gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 23, 2019