

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION AND COMMITTEE ON STATE AND  
FEDERAL LEGISLATION

----- X

October 29, 2019  
Start: 1:01 P.M.  
Recess: 4:09 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: FERNANDO CABRERA  
CHAIRPERSON

CARLOS MENCHACA  
CHAIRPERSON

ANDREW COHEN  
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: BEN KALLOS  
ALAN N. MAISEL  
BILL PERKINS  
KEITH POWERS  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
KALMAN YEGER  
MARGARET S. CHIN  
DANIEL DROMM  
MATHIEU EUGENE  
MARK GJONAJ  
I. DANEEK MILLER

FRANCISCO P. MOYA  
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.  
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.  
ANDY KING  
KAREN KOSLOWITZ  
CARLINA RIVERA, CO-CHAIR,  
CENSUS TASK FORCE

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Julie Menin, Director of the Census for New York City and Executive Assistant Corporation Counsel, NYC City Law Department

Bitta Mostofi, Commissioner, Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, MOIA

Peter Lobo, Director, Population Division Department of City Planning, DCP

Amit Bagga, Deputy Director, New York City Office for the Census

Steven Romalewski CUNY Graduate Center and Center for Urban Research at the CUNY Graduate Center

John Mellonkopf, Professor CUNY Graduate Center and Center for Urban Research at the CUNY Graduate Center

Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Brian Bannon, Merryl & James Tisch Director, New York Public Library

Nick Byrne, Chief Librarian Queens Public Library

ick Higgins, Chief Librarian, Brooklyn Public Library

Melva Miller, Executive Vice President, Association for a Better New York, ABNY

Greta Byrum ,Co-Director, Digital Equity  
Laboratory at the New School

Anita Anand, Census 2020 Senior Fellow, New York  
Immigration Coalition

Kelly Percival, Counsel, Democracy Program  
Brennan Center for Justice

George Shay, Senior Consultant, Community  
Resources Exchange

Christine Boodi, Associate Consultant, Community  
Resource Exchange

Ben Weinberg, Policy and Program Manager,  
Citizen's Union

Marin Ruth, Asian Americans Federation

Esmeralda Simmons, Center for Law and Social  
Justice, Medgar Evers College

Lurie Daniel Favors, General Counsel Center for  
Law and Social Justice

Ariel Savransky, Advocacy and Policy Advisor, JA  
Federation

Chanel Samurai Government Relations Specialist,  
Arab-American Family Support Center

Jillian Free, Census Coordinator, YMCA Greater New  
York

Antonio Lacon, Census Coordinator, Make the Road  
New York

Amy Torres, Director of Policy. Chinese American  
Planning Council, CPC

Aniqa Nawabi, Executive Director, Muslim Community  
Network

Sabrina Hargrave, Program Officer Brooklyn  
Community Foundation, and Steering Committee of  
the New York State Census Equity Fund

Pharein Griffith Harlem Resident for Co-Chair for  
Outreach and Organizing, New York Counts 2020

Juan Ignacio Rosa, Northeast Director of Civic  
Engagement NALEO Educational Fund

Greg Waltman, G-1 Quantum Clean Energy Company



[sound check] [pause] [background  
comments/pause] [gavel]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Buenos tardes,  
everyone. My name is Carlos Menchaca, and I am the  
Chair of the Immigration Committee. Today, we are  
meeting jointly with the Committees on Government  
Operations and State and Federal Legislation chaired  
by my colleagues Council Members Fernando Cabrera and  
Andrew Cohen respectively. I have been looking  
forward to today's hearing for months. I hope to have  
a fruitful and engaging conversation with our  
partners in the Mayor's Office and the leaders across  
the city who see this work as critical for wellbeing—  
the wellbeing of all our New Yorkers. If our city's  
population is under-counted, if we are under-counted  
in the decimal census, political representation and  
millions of dollars in federal funds could be lost.  
Important New York City is especially at risk of an  
under-count because of high concentrations of  
historically hard to count populations, and areas  
considered hard to count when the self-response rate  
in the past census was below 73%. Researchers have  
found that the populations that are most likely to  
have low response rates have common characteristics.

1 They are often immigrants, and people of color, non-  
2 English speakers, renters, certain religious  
3 minorities and very young children. In New York City  
4 we have large populations of historically hard to  
5 count populations. While each population has unique  
6 reason for failing to complete the census, I look  
7 forward to hearing today from the Mayoral  
8 Administration leaders and the members of the public  
9 about how collaboration with government, community  
10 based organizations and the private sector will  
11 bolster our efforts to ensure a complete count for  
12 New York City. As Chair of the Immigration Committee  
13 I have been particularly interested in fallout from  
14 the White House's failed attempt to include a  
15 citizenship question on the 2020 census. The question  
16 was on an attack. The quest that came from the White  
17 was an attack on localities such as ours that are  
18 stronger because we have a divers population here,  
19 and we know that he was targeting cities like ours.  
20 While we won that fight in the courts, and the is no  
21 citizenship question on the census, we believe much  
22 damage has been already been done. Fear is tangible  
23 throughout our immigrant communities, and  
24 citizenship, the citizenship question or not people  
25

1  
2 are terrified of one more government agency knocking  
3 on their door and asking for personal information. I  
4 cannot stress this enough. An undercount is one of  
5 or hard to count communities, and will be terrible  
6 for the entire city. An inaccurate census of just a  
7 percentage point or two represents millions of people  
8 not counted in this powerful and inspiring city where  
9 local laws have made it impos--or is should say where  
10 local laws have made it possible that immigration  
11 status is not a barrier to accessing city services.  
12 We need our immigrant communities, and really all are  
13 hard to count communities to complete the census. We  
14 need to how the federal government that we're here,  
15 and that we do exist, and that we are entitled to the  
16 political representation and funding that is our due.  
17 It is with this in mind that the Speaker created the  
18 Council's Census Task Force, which is mobilizing  
19 Council Members to ensure a complete throughout the  
20 city as well as working with community based partners  
21 in the Mayoral Administration to reach out to the  
22 hardest to count communities. In the most recent  
23 budget, the Task Force Co-Chair Council Member Rivera  
24 and I fought for and gratefully the City Council the  
25 BNT specifically was able to secure the \$40 million

1 towards a multi-pronged effort to ensure complete  
2 count in the 2020 Census. I want to thank Julie  
3 Menin and her staff at the NYC Census 2020 who have  
4 been working alongside our task force throughout the  
5 entire summer to ensure that this funding is invested  
6 in hard to count communities to guarantee a complete  
7 census count. We are so grateful to the-to be  
8 partnering on this project with such a dedicated team  
9 of civil servants. Today's hearing is just one of  
10 several ways in which the task force is conducting  
11 oversight on census efforts across the entire city.  
12 It is critical that we get the planning right so that  
13 come spring 2020, our networks are activated to  
14 respond to this questionnaire. I would like to thank  
15 the committee staff for their work on this hearing,  
16 committee Counsel Harbani Ahuja; Policy Analyst  
17 Elizabeth Cronk, and my staff for their work on this  
18 including my staff, Chief of Staff Lorena Lucero, and  
19 my Director of Communications Tony Charito. I will  
20 now turn this over to Chair Cabrera.

22 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you. Thank  
23 you so much, Chair Menchaca. Good afternoon. I am  
24 the Chair of the Committee on Governmental  
25 Operations, Council Member Fernando Cabrera, and

1 before I read my statement, I want to thank my co-  
2 chair and Council Member Rivera for your dedication.  
3 I know what it is to be in a task force. I was in the  
4 Gun Violence Task Force and it takes a tremendous  
5 amount of time and commitment, and I know you already  
6 have very busy lives as it is. So thank you. Thank  
7 you for your leadership. Beginning in March 2020 the  
8 U.S. Census Bureau will launch its Constitutionally  
9 mandated effort to count every person living in the  
10 United States. However, as this hearing will make  
11 clear, efforts to ensure a complete and accurate  
12 count of every New Yorker is already well under the  
13 way. The consequences of an under-count in New York  
14 could not be more serious. Now, all the important  
15 uses census data determines New York's representation  
16 in Congress and determines how hundreds of billions  
17 of dollars of federal dollars will be allocated to  
18 states. However, the 2020 Census represents several  
19 unique challenges for New York. The Census will be  
20 the first to be administered online, meaning most  
21 households would need access to a computer with  
22 Internet to compete-complete the Census  
23 questionnaire. While there are more than 200  
24 languages spoken across the state, the Census Bureau  
25

1 provides language support for only a fraction of  
2 these languages leaving it to local government and  
3 community based organizations to pick up the slack,  
4 and local—and local census efforts will need to  
5 overcome negative and uninformed attitudes about the  
6 Census. In addition to certain communities fears of  
7 interacting with the government polling reveals  
8 notable differences in knowledge of the Census among  
9 differing income, economic and age group. The phaso  
10 D's (sic) and many other challenges of the  
11 Administration and the City Council have for actively  
12 invested in an ambitious get out the count efforts.  
13 As Council Member Menchaca said, the Council secured  
14 a total of \$40 million in the Fiscal Year 2020  
15 Budget. The Mayor created the NYC Census 2020 office  
16 to lead the city's census engagement strategy. It is  
17 vital that trusted local voices are the ones  
18 encouraging census participation. That is why of that  
19 \$40 million secured in this year's budget, the  
20 Council set aside \$14 million to go directly to  
21 community-based organizations, \$4 million of which  
22 has already been allocated to selected CBOs to  
23 develop planning and capacity building resources for  
24 the city's coordinated census strategy. The  
25

1 remaining \$10 million was joined with \$9 million from  
2 the Mayor to create the New York City Complete Count  
3 Fund, a competitive grant to fund additional CBO  
4 census outreach. The city also allocated \$1.4  
5 million to libraries to help bridge the digital  
6 divide created by the first-by this first online  
7 Census. Today's hearing will explore how these or  
8 the city agents-agency resources in relationship with  
9 CBOs, the private sector and philanthropy. Nine  
10 others are being leveraged to ensure that all New  
11 Yorkers get counted. I would like to thank  
12 additional staff whose work made this hearing  
13 possible, Committee Counsel Danny Collins; Policy  
14 Analyst, Emily Forgione, and Finance Analyst Nasus  
15 Sarkensia (sp?) and Sebastian Bacchi as well as my  
16 own Legislative and Communications Director Claire  
17 McLeveighn. I will now recognize Chair Cohen.

19 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: That is me. Okay.  
20 Thank you, Chairs Cabrera and Menchaca. Good morning.  
21 I'm Council Member Andrew Cohen, Chair of the  
22 Committee on State and Federal Legislation. As my  
23 colleagues just outlined, mistakes could not be  
24 higher for New York City in the 2020 Census, and I am  
25 eager to hear what the Administration the state and

1 stakeholders on the ground are doing to ensure we get  
2 a complete count. I want to come back to the  
3 importance of the Census for political  
4 representation. The Census determines how many  
5 Congressional representatives each state gets in  
6 Congress and informs how states draw—draw localities—  
7 and localities draw district lines. New York State  
8 has been losing population and Congressional  
9 representation for decades. Many predict we could  
10 lose up two Congressional seats after the 2020  
11 Census. New York cannot afford to lose  
12 representation in Congress. The city's  
13 representation in Albany could also be affected and  
14 we want to make sure the city is fully represented at  
15 the state level. As the chair of the State and  
16 Federal Legislation Committee, I also want to  
17 highlight an important player in 2020 Census  
18 preparations, New York State. To date, the state has  
19 been behind the city and other large states like  
20 Illinois and California, which appropriated 80 and  
21 100 million to their census efforts respectively. By  
22 contrast, New York State--New York State's budget  
23 included \$20 million statewide to census efforts, but  
24 we have no idea how those funds will make their way  
25

1 into communities get out the count effort. The  
2 state's complete Count Commission recently released a  
3 report in which it identified several challenges to  
4 achieving an accurate 2020 Census in New York.  
5 However, the report makes no specific recommendations  
6 for how the \$20 million should be spent. This  
7 effectively punted the question to Governor. We  
8 cannot afford to wait. New York cannot afford a  
9 number count. I'd like to thank my colleagues,  
10 Council Members Menchaca and Rivera for their  
11 leadership on the 2020 Census Task Force as well as  
12 Council Member Cabrera for his leadership in chairing  
13 this important oversight hearing with us. I'd also  
14 like to thank my Policy and Budget Director Patty  
15 Intrator for her work in this hearing, and the rest  
16 of the staff in getting us ready for today. I will  
17 now turn the mic over to Council Member Rivera for an  
18 opening statement.  
19

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Good afternoon  
21 everyone. Thank you so much for being here. I am  
22 Council Member Carlina Rivera, Co-Chair of the  
23 Council's 2020 Census Task Force, and I want to thank  
24 the Chairs of the respective committees, Chairs  
25 Cabrera, Cohen and Menchaca for holding this long

1 awaited hearing today and for giving me the  
2 opportunity to speak briefly. As Co-Chair of the  
3 Council's 2020 Census Task Force, one of the most  
4 critical roles we play is providing oversight over  
5 our city's multi-layered preparations for the 2020  
6 Census and ensuring involved city agencies are  
7 operating at peak performance and our city is ready  
8 for a complete count. Our city is certainly  
9 stepping up to tackle the ambitious task that lies  
10 before us all. It is not an exaggeration to say that  
11 the future of countless state and city programs,  
12 political representation and even our democracy rely  
13 on a complete and accurate census count. To achieve  
14 this complete count, our city has forged deep  
15 partnership between the Mayor's Office, the Council,  
16 CUNY, the public libraries and community based  
17 organizations across the five boroughs, but a  
18 campaign of this scale requires more than just  
19 committed partners. That is why following the  
20 Speaker's creation, the Council Census Task Force  
21 myself and my Task Force co-chair, Council Member  
22 Menchaca went to work and fought to secure \$40  
23 million in funding for our complete count efforts in  
24 the 2020 Census. In the months ahead our Task Force  
25

1 will work with Council Members to help educate and  
2 mobilize individuals in their communities as well as  
3 work with CBOS and Mayoral Administration to ensure  
4 we are reaching our hardest to count communities.  
5 More than half of the New Yorkers in the Bronx,  
6 Queens, and Brooklyn live in these hard to count  
7 neighborhoods in addition to specific neighborhoods  
8 in Manhattan and State Island. These areas may be  
9 hard to count based on large populations of young  
10 children, people of color, foreign born, low-income  
11 households, limited English proficient communities or  
12 frequent movers or other factors. While ne changes  
13 to the census process such as the form being online  
14 will present new obstacles for counting New Yorkers.  
15 It's the same challenges we faced before that may  
16 make reaching hard to count New Yorkers the most  
17 difficult, fear and mistrust of government, which was  
18 stoked by our Federal Administration, and its failed  
19 attempt to add a census citizenship question has only  
20 grown in hard to count populations. Today's hearing  
21 is an opportunity to relay that trust and hear about  
22 the proactive steps the city is taking to ensure  
23 every New Yorker is counted. I am excited to hear  
24 about the best practices in community based outreach.  
25

1 The NYC Census' 2020 plans for getting out the count  
2 and much more. The answers we receive will also help  
3 ensure our City Council appropriated funds are being  
4 used for maximum impact. I want to thank Julie Menin  
5 and he staff and New York City Census 2020 for their  
6 work and partnership with our Task Force since the  
7 beginning of the year particularly for the funding of  
8 an agreement that we reached to support our census  
9 outreach efforts, and I am also looking forward to  
10 how we can really include the diverse student body of  
11 New York City and at the City University of New York.  
12 Their presence here today shows a continued  
13 willingness to engage and be open about this very  
14 important process, and I look forward to hearing  
15 their answers to our questions and from everyone else  
16 that will testify before us today. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Co-  
19 Chair Rivera, and we've been joined today by Council  
20 Member Ben Kallos and Council Member Karen Koslowitz  
21 from Queens. We-let's just get started. Welcome to  
22 the Administration. We will have a swearing in before  
23 you speak.

24 LEGAL COUNSEL: If you could raise your  
25 hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole

1 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony  
2 before this Committee and to respond to honestly to  
3 Council Member questions?  
4

5 JULIE MENIN: Yes, I do.

6 MALE SPEAKER: Yes.

7 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please introduce yourself  
8 before you speak.

9 JULIE MENIN: Thank so much. As I'll  
10 introduce our team here. So, Good afternoon Chairs,  
11 Menchaca, Cabrera and Cohen and Co-Chair o the Census  
12 Task Force Rivera. I am Julie Menin. I'm Director of  
13 the Census for New York City and I'm also Executive  
14 Assistant Corporation Counsel at the City Law  
15 Department, and I'm thrilled to be joined here today  
16 by Amit Bagga our Deputy Director as well as several  
17 members of our team including Kathleen Daniels, our  
18 Field Director, and Cavitet Polly (sp?) Sanchez from  
19 the New York City Census Office. So, first of all, I  
20 want to thank the Council's Census Task Force and the  
21 three committees for providing us the opportunity to  
22 submit testimony today on such an important issue  
23 facing the future of New York City. I also want to  
24 recognize as was stated before the historic and  
25 unprecedented partnership between the de Blasio

1 Administration and the New York City Council with  
2 respect to the development in particular of the New  
3 York City Complete Count Fund, which is s a first of  
4 its kind \$19 million grants program that will  
5 resource community-based organizations across the  
6 city to engage in census related education outreach  
7 and organizing. In particular we really want to  
8 express our deep thanks to Council Members Menchaca  
9 and Rivera for co-chairing this Task Force. It's been  
10 an incredible partnership, and I really want to thank  
11 them for their outstanding efforts as well as the  
12 staff of the Council's Finance Division, Government  
13 Operations Committee, Legal Division, and many others  
14 for their dedication to this effort and we really  
15 hope that this model if partnership will serve as a  
16 paradigm for many, many years to come on other issues  
17 as well. So, as we can all agree, the 2020 Census is  
18 arguably one of the most important civil rights  
19 issues facing New York City. Our fair share of over  
20 \$650 billion in federal funds that are distributed  
21 annually nationwide for public schools, public  
22 housing, infrastructure, Medicaid, senior centers,  
23 and so many vital programs that New Yorkers rely on  
24 are at stake as well as potentially the loss of up to  
25

1  
2 two Congressional seats statewide. Such a loss would  
3 not only deprive us of our rightful representation in  
4 the House of Representatives, but also, of course,  
5 have repercussions of the electoral college as well.  
6 Given all that is at stake and give New York City's  
7 historically low self-response rates, it's imperative  
8 that we achieve a complete and accurate count in the  
9 2020 Census. We must surpass our 2010 initial self-  
10 response rate, which hovered at 61.9% That is  
11 obviously significantly lower than the national  
12 average of 76%. The self-response rate for many  
13 communities including the African-American, Afro-  
14 Caribbean as well as the Orthodox Jewish communities  
15 in particular hovered at 50% and often times  
16 significantly lower than that with some neighborhoods  
17 having self-response rates in 35 to 40% range. Areas  
18 with low self response are much more likely to  
19 experience an undercount and be denied critical  
20 resources as well as political representation at the  
21 city, at the state and at the federal level. This is  
22 precisely why Mayor de Blasio announced the creation  
23 of NYC Census back in January. Our goal is to ensure  
24 that in partnership with community leaders,  
25 grassroots advocates, elected officials, the media,

1 libraries, hospitals, and others and New York City is  
2 able to able to fight for our rightful share of both  
3 resources and representation. With a focus on census  
4 related education, organizing and messaging, NYC  
5 Census is the first such initiative of its kind in  
6 New York City. Our budget of \$40 million represents  
7 the largest such investment by any city in the  
8 country and stands in stark contrast to 2010 when the  
9 city did not allocate resources for outreach and  
10 messaging in this regard. So, the de Blasio  
11 Administration committed \$26 million of the total  
12 with the remaining \$14 million being contributed by  
13 Speaker Corey Johnson and the New York City Council.  
14 We are deeply grateful to the Speaker, the Council  
15 and the Census Task Force Chairs Menchaca and Rivera  
16 for their supporting commitment and we are so proud  
17 to be leading this unprecedented partnership between  
18 the Council and the Administration. I'm now going to  
19 provide a brief overview of the importance of this  
20 census with the stake and why the 2020...2020 Census  
21 has such a unique landscape. So, as we all know, the  
22 Census is mandated by the U.S. Constitution  
23 requiring, of course, that there is a census  
24 conducted every ten years. Such a count has been  
25

1  
2 happening since 1790. Since its earliest days, the  
3 census has determined the number of seats that each  
4 state is allocated in the House of Representatives  
5 and, therefore, of course the Electoral College as  
6 well. Additionally, census data is often times used  
7 to determine shapes and relative size or  
8 congressional districts within each state. Given that  
9 there is significant overlap between these  
10 populations and those that have been historically  
11 under-counted, and populations that have been forced  
12 to live in the political or socio-economic margins of  
13 society achieving a complete and accurate count in  
14 every census is critical to ensure that every person  
15 has full access to the representation that hey  
16 deserve. In addition to determining relevant  
17 political representation the Census, of course, is  
18 used to determine how over \$650 billion in federal  
19 funds are allocated for critical programming  
20 including those who support public education, housing  
21 and, infrastructure and more. Turning specifically  
22 to the 2020 Census, it is worth noting that next  
23 year's census differs from past censuses in two key  
24 ways. It will be accessible first of all online, and  
25 via the phone I might add because that is often times

1 overlooked, but via the phone as well. Um, and then  
2 secondly, the fear and disinformation tied to the  
3 nearly two-year long conversation about the  
4 citizenship question has created enormous challenges  
5 to participation, and, if course, it bears noting  
6 that we are thrilled that we won the citizenship case  
7 and New York City Law Department was as plaintiff on  
8 the case along with the Attorney General's Office but  
9 we have a lot of work to undo the damage that was  
10 wrought by the mere scepter of asking the question.  
11 Additionally, here in New York City we face some  
12 specific challenges that exacerbate some of the  
13 issues created by the 2020 Census. These include  
14 historical barriers to census participation are  
15 immense demographic, cultural, and linguistic  
16 diversity. The unique and complex nature of our  
17 built environment and, of course, the digital divide  
18 that has prevented many New Yorkers from having easy  
19 access to broadband. So before I provide an more  
20 detailed overview of our specific plan, I just want  
21 to take a moment to outline the process that U.S.  
22 Census Bureau has shared that they will engage next  
23 year in conducting the census. So, first of all, the  
24 first phase of the 2020 Census will take place from  
25

1 mid-March through mid-May of next year, and that's in  
2 which households across the United States will have  
3 the opportunity to self-respond to the Census either  
4 online or via phone. According to the Bureau, no  
5 door-to-door enumeration will take place during this  
6 time. In March approximately 80% of households will  
7 receive a mailing with a personalized code inviting  
8 them to participate in the Census online. The  
9 remaining 20% will receive the traditional paper  
10 form. Several reminders will be sent to households  
11 to complete the form between March and May and  
12 households that have not responded online will then  
13 receive a visit from a federal enumerator starting in  
14 early to mid-May. Because self-responding  
15 significantly decreases the likelihood that a  
16 household will get a knock on the door, and because  
17 self-response data is vastly more accurate, our  
18 citywide plan is focused on ensuring that as many New  
19 Yorkers as possible participate during the self-  
20 response rate period. I should note that households  
21 can continue to self-respond through the end of the  
22 census period, which is currently slated to end in  
23 late July or early August. Now, I'm going to go into  
24 our plan. We have four pillars for our plan. So, we  
25

1 have build and are continuing to build an approach  
2 that we believe in partnership with hundreds of  
3 organizations, community leaders, elected officials,  
4 business leaders, libraries, hospitals and thousands  
5 of New Yorkers will enable us to successfully address  
6 key issues facing New York City. Our program is  
7 built on the following four pillars: First of its  
8 kind grants program to community-based organizations  
9 to engage in census related education outreach,  
10 organizing and messaging. That is our New York city  
11 complete count fund. Secondly, a sophisticated Get  
12 Out the Count and neighborhood organization field  
13 program that seeks to directly engage and organize  
14 tens of thousands for everyday New Yorkers on the  
15 importance of the Census. Third, a multi-faceted  
16 partnership with government business and major  
17 community institutions including the library systems  
18 to leverage their vast and existing reaches to ensure  
19 that the value of Census participation can be  
20 communicated to New Yorkers at scale, and then  
21 lastly, fourth, an innovative multi-lingual, multi-  
22 media advertising and marketing campaign that seeks  
23 to convey the importance of obtaining our rightful  
24

1  
2 share of representation and resources. So, I'm going  
3 to now talk about Pillar One, the Fund.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: So, let's pause.  
5 Let's just pause--

6 JULIE MENIN: Alright.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --right, right  
8 there.

9 JULIE MENIN: Sure.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: So, there's a  
11 couple of things that are going to be important to  
12 talk about here. One is just that we don't have a lot  
13 of time in these chambers, and so I want to make sure  
14 that we can get--

15 JULIE MENIN: Sure.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --through all the  
17 testimony, and then the questions from the Council  
18 Members as well.

19 JULIE MENIN: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Um, you've laid  
21 out the Four Pillars--

22 JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --and--and is there  
24 a way that we can just have you talk--

25 JULIE MENIN: Summarize them quickly?

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Summarize them  
quickly--

JULIE MENIN: Yep

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --the four pillars.  
We want to hear from the Mayor's Office of Immigrant  
Affairs--

JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --and, um, yes, and  
so just summarize those.

JULIE MENIN: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: We'll got to  
Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs.

JULIE MENIN: Okay, very quickly.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

JULIE MENIN: So, the first pillar is the  
community grants and \$19 million that we are jointly  
disseminating between the Council and the  
Administration to community-based organizations. I'm  
thrilled to announce that, um, based on an RFP that  
released, we now have close to 500 groups that have  
applied for funding, which is really fantastic, and  
so, we're very delighted about that. We have, as you  
know, what we've worked out very closely with the  
City Council a, um, Selection Committee and criteria

1 of which these will be based on, and then, of course,  
2 we really want to thank CUNY who's our partner, and  
3 as the administrator of the fund in terms of the  
4 great work that they are going to be doing in this  
5 regard. Then moving forward to our Field Program, we  
6 announced earlier we divided New York City into 245  
7 neighborhoods. We're calling them Neighborhood  
8 Organizing Committees or we're using the term NOCS.  
9 Knock on the door, and there as well we've had a  
10 fantastic response to that. We have over 500 people  
11 who have signed up just on the website since the  
12 announcement to be volunteers on that. We are  
13 conducting teach-ins. We're training people to  
14 conduct their own teach-ins, and that's really been a  
15 great model for people to be locally involved in  
16 their neighborhood. People can volunteer for an  
17 hour, 10 hours, 20 hours as much or as little they-as  
18 they like, but they can volunteer in their own  
19 neighborhood and really affect the future of their  
20 neighborhood. So, we think that is incredibly  
21 important. Then in terms of our third pillar, which  
22 is our partnership with other agencies, we have  
23 reached out to every city agency. We are working  
24 really closely with all or them. The Department of  
25

1 Education in particular is a key partner to us and  
2 helping us to spread the word to parents and children  
3 about the importance of the Census. Certainly NYCHA,  
4 which traditionally has been largely and under-  
5 counted community we are working very closely in  
6 conjunction with NYCHA, with DSS, with the Mayor's  
7 office of People with Disabilities, Department of  
8 Aging. I mean really there's no agency that we're  
9 not working with because of the various touchpoints  
10 that each agency has. So, that's something we're  
11 very focused on, and then the fourth pillar is our  
12 media campaign. We are really focused on community  
13 and ethnic publications, and—and we're also very  
14 focused on digital. We have a historic opportunity  
15 with digital ads because we can have a specific call  
16 to action with a click through where you can  
17 immediately see the ad, and then answer the census  
18 like that. So, that's something we're very excited  
19 about utilizing. We'll be making an announcement  
20 later on about our advertising and media campaign and  
21 all the ads will hit in 2020 so that we're  
22 judiciously utilizing our resources. So, I'll stop  
23 and see if there are any questions.  
24  
25

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Awesome. Thank  
you, and we're going to come back to some of those  
pieces of the field programs, and really thinking  
about that through our district office approach.  
Next, we'd like to hear from Commissioner Mostofi.

COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: Hello. Thank  
you to Chair Cabrera, Cohen and Menchaca and members  
of the Committee. My name is Bitta Mostofi. I'm the  
Commissioner of the Mayor's Office of Immigrant  
Affairs, and I appreciate the opportunity to testify  
today alongside my colleagues from across the  
Administration as we work together to ensure that  
every New Yorker is counted during the 2020 Census.  
In this testimony I'm going to briefly touch on the  
context of the Census work in this federal climate  
highlight the partnership we have with Director Menin  
and the team to reach New Yorkers with the message  
about the importance of the count particularly, of  
course, immigrants being our expertise. The Census  
has an enumeration enshrined in our Constitution. It  
is the instrument used to effectively denote  
resources and representations, the states and  
localities and for our communities. Through it,  
every person has a chance to be counted as a New

1 Yorker regardless of their immigration status or  
2 language or any other demographic characteristic.  
3 Ultimately, this count will be used to plan for the  
4 future of our city and we heard as share of our  
5 resources, representation and more. As such, we  
6 recognize the power we wield as individuals as  
7 members of the biggest city in the nation. For that  
8 reason, the Trump Administration's attempt to  
9 undermine the accuracy of the Census count is  
10 extremely concerning. Over the past few years, the  
11 federal government has deliberately attempted to  
12 instill fear and confusing in our immigrant  
13 communities. The Administration, if the President  
14 attempted to add a question on the citizenship that  
15 thankfully we won to not have included, but this  
16 could chill participation by immigrant communities,  
17 and is reflective of a broader anti-democratic effort  
18 to silence immigrant communities and push immigrants  
19 into the shadows. In a city like New York City the  
20 ultimate city of immigrants, excluding immigrants and  
21 their households from the Census count would be  
22 devastating. Almost 40% of our residents are  
23 immigrants. 60% of city residents are either  
24 immigrants or the children of immigrants. That  
25

1 includes nearly 500,000 undocumented New Yorkers.

2 Looking at households we know that one million New  
3 Yorkers live in a mixed status household where at  
4 least one member is undocumented. This includes

5 270,000 children a majority of whom 77.8% are U.S.

6 born citizens. To attempt to erase these New Yorkers  
7 from the official count is a naked attack on the city  
8 as a whole, but we will not be pushed down and

9 ignored. We know that an undercount of immigrants is

10 not inevitable. To the contrary, in 2010 some  
11 immigrant dense neighborhoods including Washington

12 Heights and Jackson Heights had self-response rates

13 that were significantly higher than the average

14 response rates of the city as a whole. We know that

15 this because of the work done in the community, and

16 with community organizations to do outreach. For our

17 work with New York City Census 2020 we can improve on

18 the work of 2010 and collaborate with the community

19 to ensure that everyone is counted. Moving to our

20 partnership with the Census 2020 Office, the creation

21 of that campaign and the appointment of Director

22 Menin shows that the city is well on its way for

23 preparation. We recognize that the federal

24 government's efforts to sew fear and confusion must

25

1 be countered with easy to understand information and  
2 outreach including language access for our immigrant  
3 communities. With that in mind, MOIA is partnering  
4 with New York City Census and other leaders in a few  
5 different ways, on community engagement, in inclusive  
6 and accessible funding strategies, and in  
7 communications and national advocacy. I've spoken at  
8 numerous community events about the Census starting  
9 as early as the spring of 2018. For example, in  
10 April of 2018, I participated in a community and  
11 ethnic media roundtable with Deputy Mayors Thompson  
12 and Director Lago of the Department for City Planning  
13 about the Census, and how the media could help ease  
14 fears about the citizenship question. Thanks to the  
15 state and to the city among other partners, that  
16 question as we know will not be on the census. MOIA  
17 has participated in many other events since then with  
18 partners across the Administration in order to  
19 provide the most up to date information about census.  
20 We've also shared best practices and strategies with  
21 cities across the nation through our coalition Cities  
22 for Action. This is particularly useful because many  
23 of our sister offices in different cities are tasked  
24 with the implementation of census outreach  
25

1 themselves. In May of 2018, for example we met in  
2 Boston for a best practice convening where my  
3 colleague Jess Allwell (sp?) from the Department of  
4 City Planning spoke about the importance of an  
5 accurate count creating a city outreach office and  
6 how to contextualize the importance of census for  
7 individuals. Since then we've provided an overview  
8 of the work of the Census 2020 Office including the  
9 outreach campaign, the Four Pillars Director Menin  
10 spoke about and sharing of key findings from focus  
11 groups around marketing. We know that a complete  
12 count depends on activation of all stakeholders, and  
13 that in particular we must work with community-based  
14 organizations in order to reach each and every New  
15 Yorker. Given the special vulnerability of  
16 immigrant New Yorkers in this political climate, MOIA  
17 has consulted on Census 2020's RFP process to ensure  
18 that groups with deep ties to immigrant communities  
19 including hard to reach immigrants can navigate the  
20 process and apply for funding. Finally, we will be  
21 supporting the Census Office with communications  
22 around the Census. Part of that work involved  
23 engaging with community and ethnic media outlets, and  
24 they are the main source of information for many  
25

1 immigrant populations. We will ensure that we are  
2 communicating with hard to count immigrant  
3 communities through the best medians and in the most  
4 effective way. I want to thank Director Menin,  
5 Deputy Director Baga and the entire Census 2020 Team  
6 as well as the Department of City Planning for the  
7 work that they're doing to ensure every New Yorker is  
8 counted. I will end with this: The central goal of  
9 the Trump Administration has been to marginalize  
10 immigrant families and to silence their voices by  
11 attempting to deny them the resources and  
12 representation they're entitled to. A make-up of  
13 America that is at once dishonest and insidious in  
14 nature. We know that the census provides some of the  
15 strongest legal confidentiality protections available  
16 under the country's laws, and further we know and  
17 have demonstrated as city that we're committed to  
18 ensuring those laws are upheld. If we have a census  
19 that results in our communities' undercount and a  
20 pervasive chilling of immigrants and other voices,  
21 the Trump Administration has achieved its goal.  
22 While the Trump Administration continues to push for  
23 the exclusion of immigrant New Yorkers and other  
24 vulnerable populations from our civic life, we  
25

1  
2 alongside many others are working to connect our  
3 communities to information about their rights and  
4 service and we look forward to continuing to do this  
5 work with the Census Office and the Council. Thank  
6 you for the chance to testify about this important  
7 topic today and look forward to taking your  
8 questions.

9 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: We have a four  
10 director level. I just want note that my colleagues  
11 Council Cabrera and Menchaca had to run across the  
12 street for a quick vote. They'll be back shortly,  
13 and I wanted to acknowledge that we have been joined  
14 by Council Members Chin, Dromm, Yeger, Eugene,  
15 Koslowitz and Kallos. Please.

16 PETER LOBO: Thank you Chairs Cabrera,  
17 Cohen and Menchaca and Co-Chair Rivera and members of  
18 the Committee. My name is Peter Lobo and I'm the  
19 Director of the Population Division of the Department  
20 of City Planning. The Population Division serves as  
21 the city's in-house demographic—

22 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Could you please get  
23 a little closer. That would be helpful or the mic can  
24 come closer to you.

1  
2 PETER LOBO: [laughs] The Population  
3 Division serves as the city's in-house demographic  
4 consultant. It is responsible for the compilation,  
5 analysis and dissemination of census and related  
6 federal, state and local data for city agencies,  
7 which enable them to address needs assessment,  
8 program planning, targeting and policy formulation.  
9 The division works closely with long-time  
10 professionals at the U.S. Census Bureau on all  
11 technical matters related to the inventory of the  
12 city's housing stock and population, and with local  
13 evaluation of national service. My testimony this  
14 afternoon will deal primarily with the Population  
15 Division's role in preparing for the 2020 Census. The  
16 Population Division's most important division's  
17 Census is to ensure the Census Bureau has a complete  
18 housing-complete list of housing units in New York  
19 City. This list called the Master Address File or  
20 MAF, needs to contain a record for every housing unit  
21 in the country. To be counted in the Census, every  
22 person must have an address that acknowledged by the  
23 Census Bureau. If a person's address is not on the  
24 MAF, that person cannot be counted in the Census.  
25 The primary purpose of the Census is to reapportion

1 Congress, which requires that respondents be tied to  
2 an address. This information is also crucial to draw  
3 various electoral districts. Essentially, for most  
4 of the population the Census is a count of people in  
5 housing units. Since an accurate MAF is fundamental  
6 for a complete enumeration, Congress created the  
7 local updated Census Addresses Program in 1994. This  
8 law gives local governments an opportunity to review,  
9 comment on and ultimately update the MAF. Several  
10 months before Census Day, which is April 1, local  
11 governments also have a short window to update the  
12 MAF wit any new construction built or project to be  
13 completed in time for the Census. Since the start of  
14 this program, DCP has been the city's technical lead  
15 on the MAF, and has updated the MAF to ensure that  
16 every housing unit in the city is included. In the  
17 regard, we have had a longstanding and corporative  
18 relationship with the professional staff of the  
19 Census Bureau both in Washington and in in New York  
20 City Regional Office. For the 2000 Census, the first  
21 time local governments were allowed to update the  
22 MAF, DCP identified over 400,000 housing units that  
23 were missing in the MAF. Partly as a result of this  
24 work, the city's population topped 8 million for the  
25

1 first time in 2000. For the 2010 Census, DCP added  
2 nearly 200,000 addresses to the MAF. New Yorkers in  
3 these households would not have been counted  
4 otherwise. DCP's preparation for the 2020 Census  
5 started in 2016 and enrolled two years of field work  
6 and in-office research to come up with the complete  
7 count of housing units in the city. We have submitted  
8 123,000 missing addresses to the Census Bureau, and  
9 the Bureau has actually accepted 99.9% of these  
10 addresses indicative of high quality of the  
11 submission. Over the past few months, DCP has worked  
12 in conjunction with field staff from the Mayor's  
13 Public Engagement Unit and the Queens Borough  
14 President's office as well as with private partners  
15 Street Easy and Rebny to finalize the list of new  
16 apartments at risk of being left off the MAF. DCP's  
17 forthcoming submission of newly constructed housing  
18 units that are missing from the MAF looked up 100,000  
19 units. Given our role as the technical experts on  
20 the Census, we've been advising the New York City  
21 2020 Census Office on a regular basis since the  
22 appointment of Director Mein earlier this year. This  
23 includes periodic briefings on census operations  
24 especially those aimed at obtaining information from  
25

1 persons who fail to respond, and weekly phone calls  
2 to address technical issues that arise, DCP has  
3 trained staff at the New York City 2020 Census Office  
4 on census operations and procedures, and on the  
5 changing demographic characteristics of the city's  
6 neighborhoods. DCP also have NYC Census Office  
7 identifying neighborhoods that have had low response  
8 rate in the past and that are likely to need more  
9 outreach in 2020. For each of the Census Bureau  
10 offices in the city, and for neighborhoods within  
11 these jurisdictions, DCP has produced detailed  
12 information on the characteristics of the population  
13 including languages spoken in these neighborhoods.  
14 In addition to assisting the U.S. Census Bureau's  
15 Regional office here in the city by providing  
16 comments on their field worker training manuals and  
17 doing workshops to train their supervisors and  
18 manages so that they can better train their field in  
19 the matters. (sic) I look forward to answering your  
20 questions, and thank you for the opportunity to  
21 testify before this committee.  
22

23 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Thank you all very,  
24 very much. I'm going to start sort of my area of  
25 interest until Chairs Menchaca and Cabrera get back.

1 So, I'll—Commissioner Mostofi, I am very concerned  
2 about the sort of, um, you know, what the state is  
3 going to do with the \$20 million. Do you have any—  
4 any information that you could maybe share with us  
5 about what—what you think the state's contribution is  
6 going to be to the city and how we're going to work  
7 together to try to make sure that we get the best  
8 count?  
9

10 COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: So, I can  
11 certainly speak briefly to what I know and then would  
12 refer to the state for additional answers. Um, so,  
13 um, a report that was created and submitted, um, by a  
14 poor recommendation on how the state should approach  
15 census engagement includes a few key recommendations  
16 including ones that are similar in part to what we're  
17 doing here in the city. They include ensuring full  
18 activation of city—state agencies. I have some  
19 awareness that that's already underway with state  
20 agencies developing their plans, and working closely  
21 withy the Budget Office around looking at  
22 implementation and what the needs are. Um, it  
23 includes engagement strategies that, um, are  
24 inclusive of community engagement with particular  
25 support and focus for organizations and leaders that

1 work with some of the larger under-counted  
2 populations, and strategies to deploy that include  
3 communications and marketing, language access among  
4 others. So, those are some of the recommendations  
5 that have been put forward to the state and the State  
6 Budget's Office of which I have awareness that the  
7 agencies are already activated and the Budget Office  
8 is reviewing the recommendations for implementation.  
9 There was a request made by the State Commission that  
10 the Office move with a sense of urgency to the task  
11 at hand. I don't have a sense of how that is being  
12 received and followed through on.

14 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Do you have any sense  
15 of sort of the proportionality of how these dollars  
16 are going to be spent in the city, outside the city,  
17 or any of the direct grants to the city for us to  
18 use?

19 COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: Um, I don't  
20 know. I think it is important to notice, of course  
21 that, um, part of the assessment is looking at cities  
22 across the state, um, the very needs and challenges  
23 faced. They're not dissimilar, of course, but the  
24 importance in making sure that there's a shared sort  
25

1 of infrastructure as well as resources devoted across  
2 the state.  
3

4 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: And I'm not picking  
5 on Buffalo, but I don't know if Buffalo has  
6 historically such a low self-reporting rate as we do.  
7 Like I mean it probably makes sense to allocate the  
8 dollars where the challenges are. I don't know. Do  
9 you—I mean again maybe it's—maybe Buffalo has a worse  
10 rate than us. I don't really know, but do we have  
11 any sense of like where the need is in the state?

12 COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: I don't have  
13 a sense specifically on individual cities. I would  
14 say through the work that we do with other cities,  
15 which is inclusive of Albany, Buffalo amongst others.  
16 From an Immigrant Affairs lens there are certainly  
17 refugees and other immigrant populations that are  
18 across the state that from sort of our point of view  
19 have similar challenges to ones that we're facing  
20 here.

21 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Okay. You know, even  
22 though it was number one, I didn't do it, but I  
23 really wanted to acknowledge that Julie Menin you've  
24 been everywhere. You know, we've done events  
25 together. I've seen you at other events. So, I

1 really, you know, your commitment here and more than  
2 just—it's not talk, it's you're really out in the  
3 field. So, I appreciate that and--

4 JULIE MENIN: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: --we've worked closely  
6 together so far. So, um, I do have some, you know,  
7 some technical questions for City Planning, but maybe  
8 even taking a step back, um, I...I am concerned like  
9 how we, like how do we know if we're doing a good job  
10 or doing a bad job in terms of count?

11 JULIE MENIN: Sure.

12 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: You know, what--what--  
13 what is the control so to speak in terms of just, you  
14 know, whether, you know, how this is going to work?

15 JULIE MENIN: It's an excellent question,  
16 and thank you for your comments earlier. Um, so, one  
17 of the most exciting things about the 2020 Census is  
18 the fact that we are going to get real time data from  
19 the Federal Census Bureau every single day during the  
20 self-response period. So, what I mean by that is in  
21 mid-March, about a week after the first mailing goes  
22 out we have spoke to the Federal Census Bureau, and  
23 they will be providing us with real time data by  
24 census track on how every neighborhood is responding.  
25

1 We have a whole data team who is working now on how  
2 we're going to be able to display that on our website  
3 in a really, you know, easy to look at very quickly  
4 way. Um, we're going to be using that in our  
5 advertising. So we are going to tell every  
6 neighborhood, a re-elected official every single day  
7 this is how your community is doing. So, we're going  
8 to know for example Bensonson-Bensonhurst they're at  
9 2%; Williamsburg, 3%; Lower East Side 5%. We're  
10 going to know how each community is doing, where  
11 certain communities are under-performing and what we  
12 need to do to so we can then critically bring  
13 resources and attention into those areas.

15 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: I guess this is just  
16 the one question I've had over and over again, and no  
17 one has been able to--like one number is not useful  
18 unless you have a number to compare it to. So, like  
19 how, again like if--if in the census track that comes  
20 back that there is 10 people there--

21 JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: --maybe I should be  
23 alarmed at oh, my God there's--I think there's more  
24 people there or I should say wow, that's more than--  
25 like how do we know--what are we comparing the data

1 that you get back, how do you know if that's good  
2 data or bad data or that there's a high rate or a low  
3 rate?  
4

5 JULIE MENIN: No, it's an excellent  
6 question, and what we're really looking to do and our  
7 number one goal is to beat the 2010 self response  
8 rates from last time for every single neighborhood.  
9 So, in terms of the data itself I'm going to defer to  
10 our colleagues at City Planning to answer that. So,  
11 Peter, I don't know if you want to weigh in on the  
12 Council Member's question.

13 PETER LOBO: We had—we've been getting  
14 response rates for every neighborhood in the city and  
15 basically for every neighborhood in the country. So,  
16 in terms of, you know, what do you compare it to?  
17 You compare it to other neighborhoods? Do you compare  
18 it to the city overall, or do you compare it to the  
19 state or to the country? So, there's a benchmark.  
20 There are plenty of benchmarks that could be used to  
21 actually see how well each neighborhood is doing.

22 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Okay. I'm going to  
23 turn it back to Chair Cabrera and then I'll come back  
24 on this.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much to the co-chair. So, it's good to see everyone here today, and, um, Julie it's good to see you.

JULIE MENIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON COHEN: The first time I literally met you when the Committee of South-what was it? South Manhattan Committee. We used to have a committee meeting like that--

JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --and, um, and we learned--

JULIE MENIN: [interposing] It was like the Lower Manhattan Redevelopment Committee. Yes.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: There you go.

JULIE MENIN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: There you go, and you were the Chair to the community board, and so I appreciate all the work that you have done throughout this year as Commissioner, and I feel very confident of the work that you're doing right now--

JULIE MENIN: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --with our co-chairs.

JULIE MENIN: Thank you.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --in the census.  
3 So, briefly I don't have a lot of questions, and I  
4 know we have a lot of groups here waiting, but I  
5 wanted to ask you in terms of the access because  
6 since this is the first year that we are using online  
7 capabilities--

8 JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --and I wanted to  
10 know about will the city be using public spaces? I'm  
11 going to put four questions into one to be  
12 parsimonious here, um, public spaces would the city  
13 be using their own computers provide CBOs with  
14 tablets or computers? Will the Administration  
15 consider utilizing DCAS, Civil Service, the Sims  
16 Center and which agencies will make, assuming they  
17 will, but that they will make computers available?

18 JULIE MENIN: Sure. That's a great  
19 question. So, I'm going to take the first part of it  
20 and then turn it over Amit Bagga who's the Deputy  
21 Director of the Census. So, in terms of access  
22 online, we are going to be creating hundreds of pop-  
23 up centers all around the city, certainly all 219  
24 public library branches will have computers and staff  
25 trained in the census. That's part of our grand to

1 them, and part of the deliverables that they will be  
2 doing, but we're also starting our pop-up centers and  
3 elected officials office, community boards, civic  
4 organizations, house of worship all over the city.  
5 I'm going to create an interactive map that lists all  
6 of the various centers so people will be able to know  
7 what center is closest to them. I also might add  
8 you're going to be able to fill your census out on  
9 your phone. So, we do hope that the Council for  
10 example during the self-response period at every  
11 meeting at the top will make a 60-second announcement  
12 to the audience have you filled your census out, and  
13 give the site and literally people will be able to  
14 take the two minutes to answer the 10 questions and  
15 fill it out there. So, that's just a very simple way  
16 that we can do it, but now I'm going to turn to Amit  
17 to answer—about your question about whether or not  
18 the city is, um, procuring computers, and how we're  
19 working with community organizations and public  
20 spaces.

21  
22 AMIT BAGGA: Thank you so much Director  
23 Menin. My name is Amit Bagga, Deputy Director of the  
24 New York City Office for the Census. Thank you so  
25 much for your question, Council Member. It's a very

1 good one. It obviously stand to reason that many  
2 different city agencies that have public facing  
3 space, and that have computer terminals that are  
4 available for the public to use might be able to make  
5 them accessible. We are in conversations with  
6 multiple city agencies that have this type of—these  
7 types of computer terminals available to see whether  
8 or not they can make them available to the public  
9 explicitly for the purpose of facilitating census  
10 participation. In addition to that I do want to also  
11 just point out that any of the software that we will  
12 be providing community-based organizations with is  
13 going to comply with the highest standards. The city  
14 has incredibly high standards when it comes to data  
15 privacy and security. We are currently deeply  
16 involved with, um, the Law Department as well as the  
17 Mayor's Chief Privacy Officer, in conversations about  
18 what exactly those standards and protocols need to  
19 look like for community-based organizations, and  
20 we're also in constant contact with the vendors from  
21 whom we're procuring the different pieces of software  
22 to make sure that they meet our standards, which are  
23 very high.  
24  
25

2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: You know, one of  
3 the questions I have was, you know, I...I don't know if  
4 this is ever going to happen to have online voting  
5 and there's some legitimate concerns that we have  
6 right now because of hacking and Internet security,  
7 but isn't this the same kind of—are we not dealing  
8 with the same kind of issues if we had online voting  
9 versus, you know, some security concerns when it  
10 comes to the census people being able to go online  
11 and what kind of security. I just want people to  
12 feel safe one they put it?

13 JULIE MENIN: Sure. So I'm happy to  
14 address that. So, there are really two issues at  
15 play. One is when people fill the census out and  
16 transmit that information to the federal government  
17 it is 100% legally protected by Title 13 of the U.S.  
18 Code Title 13 of the U.S. Code is ironclad. Since  
19 its enactment it has not been broken, and it actually  
20 subjects federal employees to a penalty of up to  
21 \$250,000, five year prison sentence if they are to  
22 share the Census Data. So, they can't share it with  
23 the city. They can't share it with anyone else. So,  
24 that is absolutely iron clad. In terms of the—the  
25 data security I mean Amit refereed to I mean we are

1 taking every single precaution on this. I would add  
2 and this is one of the messaging points that we  
3 really need to focus on. I think that a lot of  
4 people are not clear on what the Census is and what  
5 it isn't. Many people confuse the Census with the  
6 ACS, which is the long form survey that 2 to 3% of  
7 households receive. That is not what we're talking  
8 about here. That long form does have rather intrusive  
9 questions that ask, you know, certain information.  
10 This Census that we're talking about is 10 questions:  
11 Your name, your household. Do you rent or own your  
12 home. Your age, your gender, the number of people  
13 living in the home. It only takes a couple of minutes  
14 to fill out, but yet it is one of the most important  
15 things someone can do to affect the future of the  
16 city.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Beautiful. I'm  
19 going to come back later and ask more detailed  
20 questions regarding that, but I have one last  
21 question so we could get this hearing going. Has-  
22 have libraries ever experienced data breaches in the  
23 past? If so, what lessons were learned and what's  
24 steps are being taken to prevent future ones?

1  
2 AMIT BAGGA: Thank you so much for your  
3 question. It's an important one. I believe the  
4 library systems are here today if I'm not mistaken  
5 and I think thy would be best suited to answer that.

6 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Anybody here from  
7 libraries? [background comments] Okay, we'll be  
8 hearing from them I guess later on. Okay, great.  
9 Alright, let me pass it to (background comment)  
10 Council Member Rivera. [background comments]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: We rewind (sic)  
12 you know. Thank you so much for your testimony. I do  
13 have a few questions. I want to talk a little bit  
14 about the financial agreement that we've reached and  
15 this hub, which I think is so important in utilizing  
16 the City University of New York because it's a public  
17 institution, and I believe that that's important to  
18 always—always support or public institutions but also  
19 because it represents a diverse student body where  
20 many of them live in some of these harder to count  
21 neighborhoods and populations. So, you—could you  
22 describe how CUNY's Census Core students will assist  
23 the Administration, and to Get Out the Count efforts  
24 of some of our partner community-based organizations?

1  
2 AMIT BAGGA: We're actually going to ask  
3 Kathleen Daniels, our Field Director to answer that  
4 question. Before she does, can you please swear her  
5 in?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: She just should  
7 come up, no.

8 AMIT BAGGA: Kathleen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Come up.

10 [background comments/pause]

11 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Great.

12 LEGAL COUNSEL: Kahthy. put your hand up.  
13 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and  
14 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this  
15 committee and to respond honestly to Council Member  
16 questions?

17 KATHLEEN DANIELS: I do.

18 LEGAL COUNSEL: Great. If you could  
19 introduce yourself, please?

20 KATHLEEN DANIELS: Kathleen Daniels,  
21 Field Director NYC Census 2020. So, we are very  
22 excited about our collaboration with the CUNY where  
23 we will have 200 students as part of SUNY-CUNY  
24 Service Corps who will be paid to assist with the  
25 census campaign, and students are currently working

1 on exactly what their descriptions are. They will be  
2 able to choose one of three cohorts where they'll be  
3 working with community-based organizations. They'll  
4 be able to—a small cohort will work on leadership,  
5 and leadership in the NOCS program, the Neighborhood  
6 Organizing Census Committees. They'll be able to  
7 help organize the CUNY campuses, and the catchment  
8 areas as well as a very small cohort will work with  
9 our data group on exactly how data is going to come  
10 in and out and in taking a look, at how we're mapping  
11 each community  
12

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you. I  
14 think the field portion of this is so important as  
15 you know and you mentioned the NOCS, which is the  
16 Neighborhood Organizing Census Committees, and those  
17 being in neighborhoods across the city. What  
18 progress has the Administration made in establishing  
19 NOCS?

20 KATHLEEN DANIELS: So, current we have  
21 over—a little over 500 volunteers signed up to work  
22 with their NOCS and in their NOCS. We've also  
23 conducted three teachings at our Census headquarters  
24 where a little over 100 volunteers attended, and we  
25 have a number that have signed up to learn how to

1  
2 conduct their own teaching and host a teaching in  
3 their communities.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, I've been  
5 trying to get this message out about the Census to  
6 anyone that will listen, and I've been very  
7 intentional in talking to a lot of students and a lot  
8 of college students specifically. I was at BMCC. I  
9 was at Columbia University. How can students get  
10 involved even in the volunteer capacity? Is that  
11 some—is that a program that you'll have set up and  
12 ready to go? Is it ready?

13 KATHLEEN DANIELS: It is going to launch  
14 in the spring, and we're working with CUNY right now  
15 on the beginnings of the advertisement and screening  
16 process for the service corps that will happen at  
17 CUNY, but students can go to our website right now  
18 and visit the map and sign up to volunteer in their  
19 NOCS.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, will NOCS  
21 have access to language interpreters, and are they  
22 going to conduct outreach activities in other  
23 languages?

24 KATHLEEN DANIELS: Absolutely. What is,  
25 um, one of the greatest things about the

1 neighborhood team model the NOCS is based on that the  
2 NOCS are based on is that these are nimble. Each  
3 community will be determining for themselves the best  
4 way for them to reach their neighbors and the  
5 business and houses of worship in their community.  
6 So, NOCS are not necessarily all in English, and one  
7 of the key points of working with the field team with  
8 field associates and the organizers will be for  
9 language access to expand language access to provide  
10 them some resources from tool tips to teachings to  
11 some technology that they can use to expand their  
12 reach within their neighborhood.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, with the  
15 technology, what software will NOCS be using to track  
16 its engagement, and will data and info sharing work  
17 with Council funded CBO partners, with the RFP  
18 awardees, the Federal Census Bureau and the Council.

19 AMIT BAGGA: I'll take that question,  
20 Council Member. Hello. How are you?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Great

22 AMIT BAGGA: Um, thank you for your  
23 question. It's a very important question. So, we're  
24 currently in the process of negotiating contracts  
25 with a couple of different software vendors. We'll

1  
2 be able to share more information about which vendors  
3 they are and what platforms we're using shortly once  
4 those contracts are negotiated. What we can share is  
5 that, um, we are going to be building and as I  
6 mentioned earlier a very privacy—data privacy and  
7 security protections into whatever the software  
8 platform is, and we're going to ensure that the  
9 vendors for the platform are complying with the  
10 city's laws and rules.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Well, we look  
12 forward to that update. I—I want to ask just one more  
13 question if that's okay on this round. Can you tell  
14 me what steps if any the Administration is taking to  
15 ensure that we accurately count our city's homeless  
16 population?

17 JULIE MENIN: Sure, I'm happy to start  
18 with that. so first of all, there are really two  
19 components to that, the Federal Census Bureau has a—  
20 what they call a group quarter operation, which is  
21 any time whether it be the homeless population or  
22 universities are also considered group quarters.  
23 They deal directly with the administrator and take  
24 that data into their group quarters. Then they're  
25 having three days in the spring where they're going

1 to count the homeless population in the streets, and  
2 so we obviously--when they told us that want to work  
3 extremely closely with the Federal Census Bureau to  
4 make sure that this is done correctly, and that  
5 everyone is counted, and so I don't know if you want  
6 to add.  
7

8 AMIT BAGGA: If I could just add to that,  
9 we are actually very soon facilitating a meeting  
10 between the Federal Census Bureau and the Department  
11 of Social Services to ensure that whatever the Census  
12 Bureau's operations are make sense to the Department  
13 of Social Services, and that they are consistent with  
14 DSS's needs as well, and to ensure that DSS is  
15 providing the Census Bureau with whatever information  
16 they need.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, on the  
18 streets and in the shelter system?

19 JULIE MENIN: Correct.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay. Thank you  
21 and--and again, I just want to stress I know that our  
22 community-based organizations are here and with--with  
23 the language piece, but also the volunteering piece.  
24 It's always great to have volunteers right, but you  
25 need a strong infrastructure. So, I want to be

1 helpful to you all in terms of how we're talking to  
2 people about the Census, and make sure that you have  
3 all the support that you need because I believe the  
4 field game is what's going to win this thing. So,  
5 thank you. Thank you for all of your work, and thank  
6 you to the Chairs for your gracious allotment of  
7 time.  
8

9 AMIT BAGGA: Council Member if you could  
10 help us recruit NOC volunteers, that would be great.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Paid jobs?

12 AMIT BAGGA: These are volunteers.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Both. [laughter]  
14 Okay, I'll help.

15 KATHLEEN DANIELS: Well, we'll see you  
16 soon.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I think we're all  
18 going to sign up for that, the recruitment, and maybe  
19 even the help actually. We can maybe all volunteer  
20 our time as well. We have been also joined by  
21 Council Members Perkins, Rodriguez and Powers. My  
22 questions will begin with Commissioner Mostofi at the  
23 Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs. Um, in your  
24 testimony I think a lot of the work that we have been  
25 doing, um, in just kind of addressing the fear that

1 our community is feeling, and the Census is—is full  
2 of that right now. We also know that there's work to  
3 be done to bring people back from the citizenship  
4 question, and the impact that that's had. Is there  
5 anything thing that the city is doing very kind of  
6 specific to counteract those fears and ensure that we  
7 get the complete count?  
8

9 COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: Uh, yeah, I  
10 will start, and then, of course, the Census Team  
11 should jump in. So, a big part of the role of our  
12 office has been sort of as I highlighted, um really  
13 thinking through how best you both work with, but  
14 also empower and get information out to communities  
15 with the recognition of sort of every-all the sort of  
16 other issues, um, in the environment that we're in.  
17 A part of that, of course, is ensuring that that  
18 there are strong community-based organizations and  
19 leadership that are charged with and have the  
20 resources to, um, conduct the outreach and work  
21 directly with communities that they serve. So, that's  
22 certainly a part of the funding allocation that the  
23 Council has made discretionarily, but also, of  
24 course, the upcoming RFP process with CUNY and we  
25 helped both inform the sort of structure of that RFP,

1 but also, um, how best to ensure that immigrant  
2 populations that might be either harder to reach or  
3 where there might be cultural or linguistic needs are  
4 included in—in selection. Additionally, um,  
5 certainly the sort of messaging is important, and I  
6 think we've learned over and over again, and the  
7 Census Team is looking at this very closely, um, as  
8 well as conducting surveys and other things to  
9 inform. The thinking on this is what are the most  
10 effective messages that will help communities  
11 understand and know why the Census is important, but  
12 also address some of the needs or concerns that they  
13 might have about privacy and, of course, that will  
14 inform both how we talk about, um, the Census itself,  
15 but also the larger communications and marketing  
16 work.

18 JULIE MENIN: Sure. So, I'm happy to also  
19 address that. I mean one of the biggest challenges we  
20 have is to combat this misinformation and  
21 disinformation that has been spread, and really in  
22 every form that we do this question, indeed, comes  
23 up, and that is why we feel very strongly that the  
24 \$19 million Grant Program and partnering so closely  
25 with the community-based organizations who are the—

1 literally the trusted voice often times in the  
2 neighborhood will help us to make sure that every New  
3 Yorker knows the citizenship question is, indeed,  
4 off. We also, of course, in advertising and  
5 marketing have the flexibility to be messaging that  
6 out if we feel that that's something that needs to be  
7 further addressed as well.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for  
10 that.

11 AMIT BAGGA: Can I answer that just  
12 briefly. Um, just to add very briefly to what  
13 Director Mein and Commissioner Mostofi have said. We  
14 also know that constructing the right type of  
15 messaging that's going to really resonate with  
16 different communities across the city is incredibly  
17 important, and that's one of the reasons that within  
18 the context of our citywide partner group, we have a  
19 working group that's specifically dated—excuse me—  
20 dedicated towards communications, right and the  
21 members of this working group represent various  
22 communities across the city, and we know that  
23 slightly different messages are going to resonate  
24 slightly different in many different places, right,  
25 and so we need to be prepared for that, and so part

1 of the work that we're doing with our partners such  
2 as United Way and New York Immigration Coalition, and  
3 Make the Road and AFI and others, many others, is to  
4 really think through exactly how to tailor that  
5 messaging for each community.  
6

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Well, let' stay on  
8 messaging for a bit, and talk a little bit about the  
9 media and advertising campaign. I think that's kind  
10 of been our reference to in terms of the kind of  
11 larger conversation that's going to be happening  
12 across the city. When will you announce your media  
13 and advertising campaign plan?

14 JULIE MENIN: Shortly. Well, what we're  
15 doing now is really looking at pricing. We are  
16 looking at making sure that we have the farthest  
17 reach possible looking at TV, radio, digital, print,  
18 but particularly focusing on community and ethnic on  
19 multi-lingual advertising that's rally going to reach  
20 every single New Yorker. So, we expect to make that  
21 announcement soon. The advertising will not hit  
22 until 2020 because again we're trying to most  
23 judiciously utilize our resources. so, we felt that  
24 advertising and this year would not be a judicious  
25 use of our resources.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Do you have a sense of what the ethnic media networks will be?

JULIE MENIN: Do you want to talk about that?

AMIT BAGGA: Sure. So one of the things that we know is that different ethnic groups and, um, linguistic groups consume media in different ways. Um, we know that the way Bonavishus (sp?) consume media in Ozone Park is different than the way West African groups do in the Southwest Bronx let's say. So, right now what we're doing and this is part of what Director Menin mentioned is working very closely with our citywide partners as well as with MOIA to really do a needs assessment of what are all of the different types of media that exist including types of media that some of us in government perhaps might not initially think about. Once we have conducted that full needs assessment, we will then be able to have a clearer picture and understanding of how we're going to invest those dollars, and where. So, this could include different types of social media platforms such as What's Up? Possibly. We're not committing to it necessarily, but it's something that has been raised, and we've also heard for example that certain

1 West African groups really consume news and  
2 information through audio messages. So, that's  
3 something that we need to be thinking about for  
4 example when we're thinking about a particular ethnic  
5 group. So, once we have a more complete picture of  
6 that, we'll be able to share that with you.

8 COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: And the only  
9 other point that I would add is that in 2010 the  
10 messaging was largely done by the federal government,  
11 and was incredibly uniform, the messaging being fill  
12 out the census. It's your civic duty and the  
13 Constitution. It's the law, and it wasn't micro  
14 targeted. We're completely flipping that model. We  
15 want to micro target our messaging to various  
16 communities so that people really understand what's  
17 at stake so when we're talking to parents and we  
18 explain to them Title 1 funds are at risk here, that  
19 is motivating, and that's the kind of messaging that  
20 we need to do that really we feel was lacking before.

21 KATHLEEN DANIELS: Sorry, I'll...can I add  
22 a little briefly to that, too? 'm not sure if this  
23 is part of what you were getting at with your  
24 question, but we—I noted in my testimony as far back  
25 as April 2018 partnered also with CUNY School of

1 Journalism and their—specifically their Community and  
2 Ethnic Media Division, and they are tremendous  
3 partners and a part of that was obviously intentional  
4 starting early and often with community and ethnic  
5 media because part of the game here is the census is  
6 often not intimately understood or known and so, um,  
7 we know that from that work CUNY is actually  
8 establishing fellowships for community and ethnic  
9 media outlet to educate on the Census and ensure that  
10 the outlets both deeply understand it, but can talk  
11 about it in different and nuanced ways to keep it  
12 alive and center to the work that they're doing,  
13 which is going to be very critical going into next  
14 year until the count is completed.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I think part of  
17 what—what we'd like to know and how we can be helpful  
18 is understanding when those gaps become known how to  
19 fill them, and I think that's what we're—because, you  
20 know, we—we at the Council are often asking the same  
21 questions of our work and how we do our work, and  
22 this isn't the only project that has kind of required  
23 us to—to dig deeper about how—how we know what—what  
24 we know. Um, and so really I think there's a few  
25 other questions that I'll skip, but some of the

1 things that we do know is that, um, past successful  
2 city media campaigns, um, might be places that we  
3 start. Are there any that emulate that almost  
4 perfection that you know that's in your study?

6 JULIE MENIN: Yes, so when I was  
7 Commissioner of Consumer Affairs, we launched the  
8 Paid Sick Leave Law, and we opted to have our  
9 advertising in 25 languages. So, we went well above  
10 and beyond the language access requirements and we  
11 felt, um, Amit Bagga was there as well. We felt that  
12 that really was very efficacious. I think it rally  
13 reached communities all across the city, and we had a  
14 tremendous response to that in terms of paid sick  
15 leave. So, we are absolutely looking at that as a  
16 paradigm as one of many successful media and  
17 advertising campaigns that the city has launched.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Something that's  
19 new is LINK NYC. How is that--is that--is that  
20 embedded into the work that you're thinking about  
21 doing for the rollout?

22 JULIE MENIN: Absolutely. We're looking  
23 at activating every single possible place that you  
24 can have for media. I mean our goal honestly is in  
25 2020 that everywhere you go in the city you see some

1 kind of messaging around the Census so that on March  
2 12, when people start to receive the mailers, this is  
3 not a surprise that you're receiving this mailer.  
4

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I like that. It's  
6 part of the expectation, and on that note, do you  
7 have an idea about who your media spokespeople will  
8 be that who will be on the ads, who will be that face  
9 of the—of the message?

10 JULIE MENIN: So, we are working on that  
11 right now. We will make an announcement soon about  
12 that. we're not ready to make an announcement yet.  
13 It's still—we're still working on that.

14 COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: I'll add to  
15 just to say in terms of campaigns that have worked  
16 and why, um, I think we certainly knew in our work  
17 with IDNYC and our campaign that part of what worked  
18 and resonated with people was the diversity of both  
19 faces, but also messages. Not everybody wanted to  
20 participate for the same exact reason or was  
21 interested in the program for the same exact reason.  
22 So, there wasn't a single—single ad as duplicate.  
23 There were a myriad of ads with various messages  
24 targeting different populations and different needs,  
25 and people got to see themselves reflected in

1 different ways, and so that's certainly—we announced  
2 this morning a repeat for what we're doing for  
3 renewal and kind of building on those lessons, and  
4 some are certainly what the team is looking at as  
5 well.  
6

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Yeah, I think  
8 those are—those are good—not only good points, but,  
9 um, back to how we emulate the good stuff that was—  
10 that was pretty strong. Um, maybe my last—my last  
11 point or question a request of the panel really is  
12 committing that we feature everyday New Yorkers from  
13 all different backgrounds, um and communities, and  
14 I'm going to go a little bit further. Part of what  
15 we have done in some other programs like adult  
16 literacy, We Speak New York is a really kind of  
17 fantastic investment that the city has made, and part  
18 of our conversations, and I don't know—I mean it was  
19 made public, but I'll, make it public now. We really  
20 requested that there was a kind of opportunity that  
21 we take to remove any elected officials or  
22 representatives of elected officials on the messaging  
23 now. Now, there should really be people from our  
24 neighborhoods that can be reflected as spokespeople,  
25 and so, I'm asking that as a part of the commitment

1 where you commit that we feature everyday people and  
2 not elected officials, or representatives of elected  
3 officials and—and part of the Administration as you  
4 continue to craft this public campaign.  
5

6 JULIE MENIN: Okay, great. Thank you.

7 No, we appreciate that comment and—and we agree  
8 because one of the things I think that has—has most  
9 struck me in this work around the Census is that when  
10 you explain to people how it affects our everyday  
11 life, it really, really resonates, and one of the  
12 challenges has been that the messaging in 2010 wasn't  
13 about the lack of funding, and so people really  
14 didn't know this funding was at stake, and so that's  
15 the messaging that we really want to get across.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: One of those, the  
17 commitment is that no elected officials or  
18 representatives of the elected officials would be on  
19 any of sponsored campaigns. That's what I'm asking,  
20 and that's the commitment that we're asking of you  
21 today.

22 JULIE MENIN: Oh, so, no elected  
23 officials and no...?

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: No, but it becomes  
25 a back to--

1  
2 JULIE MENIN: We don't, well, we don't  
3 have anything out there yet so that's what I'm  
4 saying.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: That's what I'm  
6 saying we're in a good place right now--

7 JULIE MENIN: Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --but we're--we're--  
9 we're developing--that's something that's being  
10 developed and we're asking that be a commitment that  
11 we can kind of hear from you.

12 JULIE MENIN: Okay, okay.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay.

14 JULIE MENIN: Okay.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for  
16 that.

17 JULIE MENIN: Can I just add one thing  
18 I'll say, which is I think actually what I said  
19 before was just part of what we saw at a visit there  
20 was a diversity of faces and voices, right? It was  
21 seen as sort of a citywide effort. So, there was  
22 they were--they were on everything right, but there  
23 was a PSA that included Speaker Melissa Mark  
24 Viverito, and the Mayor, right? So, that was an  
25 element of a broader intentionality and getting--

1 showing that there was city sort of support and buy-  
2 in and leadership, but that this was about people in  
3 the community representation. So, I know this is a  
4 bigger conversation, but I do want to sort of  
5 footnote or caveat that I do think it's actually  
6 important for there to be a show leadership not on  
7 necessarily leaving all the ads, but an element of  
8 what is looked at as important.  
9

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I guess all I'm  
11 saying is that the strongest part was not elected  
12 officials.

13 JULIE MENIN: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: It was the  
15 people..

16 JULIE MENIN: [laughter]

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And that's why the  
18 emphasis is coming

19 JULIE MENIN: Yeah. No, and we agree  
20 that obviously having diverse New Yorkers from every  
21 single neighborhood is a critical component and  
22 that's what we want to be able to emphasize. It  
23 certainly with the paid sick leave law how we  
24 conducted our advertising and marketing, and  
25 absolutely, but I think to the Commissioner's point

1 it's also going to be important to have, you know,  
2 many, many voices. We really want to bring all  
3 stakeholders to the table.  
4

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And all I'm just--  
6 all I'm saying is that this is the-the focus is on  
7 the paid stuff that goes out. Obviously, we're going  
8 to be on our Twitter and doing our active work, but I  
9 think we-I think we're all in agree-we're in  
10 agreement--

11 JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --on this. We have  
13 some members that have questions. We are going to  
14 put you on a clock. Chin, Perkins and Powers. Um,  
15 Council Member Chin is here? Yes. Okay, but we have  
16 three minutes and you can go.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair. I  
18 am really excited. Thank you for the-the  
19 presentation especially about the, um, you know, the  
20 day-to-day data to see how we're doing, and I heard  
21 that from your testimony Director Menin that you said  
22 that New York City you divided into 245  
23 neighborhoods. So that is much smaller than a City  
24 Council District. So, when it's one of our districts  
25

1 we probably are going to have a couple of  
2 neighborhoods, right?

3  
4 JULIE MENIN: Right.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So, was there any  
6 kind of thinking in terms of how you divided it?

7 JULIE MENIN: Yes, absolutely. Thank you  
8 for the question. So, we really worked very closely  
9 with City Planning to make sure that each of the 245  
10 neighborhoods had a criteria that made sense, um, so  
11 I-if you want to talk about-a little bit about that.

12 AMIT BAGGA: Sure. Thank you, Council  
13 Member. Hi, Council Member Chin. How are you? Nice  
14 to see you. Um, yes. So what we did was that  
15 looking at a list of neighborhoods which DCP has  
16 developed over time, and also just utilizing some of  
17 our knowledge as native New Yorkers as many of us in  
18 the office are, we organized the city into 245  
19 different neighborhoods, and we did that because as  
20 Director Menin has said on other occasions, we really  
21 needed to come up with an apparatus where, um,  
22 individuals could understand how the place they lived  
23 performed in 2010, right. A lot of average New  
24 Yorkers might not know the community board or their  
25 Council District, but everyone knows with

1 neighborhood they live in. So, we organized these  
2 neighborhoods based on this existing list and around  
3 census tracked boundaries. It just so happens that  
4 most census tracked boundaries in New York City  
5 actually when you put them in a group can sort of  
6 easily constitute a neighborhood, and in doing so,  
7 um, what we've now done on our website is that you  
8 can go directly onto our website, and you'll see a  
9 map of the 2010 initial self response rates by  
10 neighborhood, and you can click on the map and get  
11 that information.

12  
13 JULIE MENIN: and then you can click it  
14 on and volunteer directly for that local neighborhood  
15 organizing committee and the idea behind dividing the  
16 city into 245 neighborhood really emanated from sort  
17 of my community board days and other members of our  
18 team who really we felt very strongly that everything  
19 is very hyperlocal and people want to volunteer.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] Well,  
21 then it's going to be some friendly competition here.

22 JULIE MENIN: Yes exactly.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: It's in all the  
24 community boards and all the City Council districts.

25 JULIE MENIN: Yes.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN:

JULIE MENIN: The other thing that I'm concerned about is so City Planning I'm glad that you're adding addresses. One of my concerns is really the non-traditional household. You know the basement apartment, the doubling up, the tripling up. That is still the population that we have to get people. Like it's okay if you live in a basement apartment sign up. You know, get yourself counted, and I guess the city will figure out how to put them all together, and we want to make sure that-because, you know, that's the way it is, lack of affordable housing, and I agree with you that the messages of how [bell] funding is so critical that if we want, you know, better schools, better housing we got to sign up, and there should be some kind of general slogan that really bring all of us together that we're all, you know, New York City. We have to get ourselves counted and I think that with all the agencies that you work with like senior centers everyone who walk into the senior center that day for lunch signed up. So, I think that is something that I'm really looking forward to next year, and I think

1 we'll challenge ourselves with some friendly  
2 competition, right?

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right. Thank you  
5 Council Member Chin. Council Member Perkins.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you. I-I  
7 am concerned about some communities such as what I  
8 even represent don't take the Census at the level of  
9 interest and importance, and might even have fears  
10 about what that census is really about. So, what are  
11 we doing to dispel those kinds of fears and encourage  
12 folks to understand that the Census is about them and  
13 the betterment of their family lives and the  
14 betterment of the community? How are we getting out  
15 to communities that are suspicious of certain types  
16 of public activity that supposedly to their benefit,  
17 but doesn't quite resonate in terms of the language  
18 or in terms of the lifestyle, in terms of what they  
19 tend to believe is appropriate? Do you understand  
20 what I'm trying to say?

21 JULIE MENIN: Yeah, absolutely. So, I'm  
22 happy to answer that question, Council Member. It's  
23 an excellent question, and so one of the challenges  
24 is just what you have identified is explaining to  
25 people why they should take the two minutes to fill

1 out this out, but the good news is, and we have done,  
2 I mean dozens and dozens, hundreds of events since  
3 this office started in January all around the city,  
4 but particularly in communities that had lower self  
5 response rates is when you explain to people the  
6 funding that's at stake for public education, for  
7 public housing, for Medicaid, for Head Start, for  
8 senior centers. The number of people who have said  
9 to us I didn't realize that. I thought the Census was  
10 just some, you know, an intrusive government form.  
11 Why are they asking this information? So, when we  
12 are able to explain it, the response has been  
13 incredible, and that's why we're so focused on our  
14 messaging. Our advertising and media has to be  
15 hyperlocal. It has to speak to communities on issues  
16 that resonate with them.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: In that regard,  
19 you know, for instance, um, there are some  
20 communities particularly one that I represent where  
21 the faith based community is very, very influential.  
22 They don't—I'm not necessarily advocating any  
23 particular faith, but I know in the neighborhood that  
24 I represent the churches are crowded on Sunday.

25 JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: And, um, that  
3 seems to me to be an opportunity for other such  
4 instances that will encourage people to participate  
5 and, in fact, quite the opposite. It will probably do  
6 more than encourage them and it will help them  
7 understand that it's really about them.

8 JULIE MENIN: Absolutely. We've hired a  
9 faith based coordinator in our office who is really  
10 working very hard on faith based outreach.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: What's the name  
12 of that person?

13 JULIE MENIN: Nancy Pascal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Well how do we  
15 reach [bell] Nancy Pascal?

16 JULIE MENIN: Do you want to give her...?

17 AMIT BAGGA: Sure, Council Member, we  
18 will be providing her contact information to you  
19 right after the hearing.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you very  
21 much. I appreciate the.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank Council  
23 Member Perkins and Council Member Powers followed by  
24 Chair Cohen.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I'm  
3 sorry I missed part of your testimony, but it's good  
4 to get here at the end. I just want to start by  
5 welcoming a friend of mine who is guru on all things.  
6 I want to talk about a guy that's my former  
7 professor, John Mollenkopf from the Graduate Center  
8 who is here today, and I know, he'll have a lot to  
9 contribute to this process. When we talk about both  
10 the fears, we talked a little bit about motivation  
11 for folks wanting to participate in it. I think that  
12 is a concern I have with folks in my district is  
13 there are folks who are civically active and then  
14 those who need to be persuaded about why this  
15 actually matters, and I think the skepticism of  
16 processing government and outcomes and voting and  
17 things like that contribute to people not wanting to  
18 participate. Is there any information either from  
19 prior census or things that you've been seeing so far  
20 about what are the primary motivators for somebody to  
21 actually fill it out. Is that—I assume ease of—of  
22 doing it is a big part of it, but whether it's around  
23 the funding or other implications is there incentive?

24 JULIE MENIN: Yeah, no it's—it's a great  
25 question. I mean certainly it will be much easier to

1 fill the Census out now that it is online. The fact  
2 it's, whether it's a community board meeting a  
3 Council meeting when someone makes an announcement  
4 and people kind of take their phone out and fill it  
5 out in two minutes on the spot is going to in our  
6 opinion make a difference, but certainly we do need  
7 to continue to hammer home the messaging about what's  
8 at stake both for the finding and the political  
9 representation piece and I think that's what those of  
10 us now who are doing this work are most struck by the  
11 number of people who are very civically engaged, but  
12 really who didn't have that information largely  
13 because it hadn't been provided about the number of  
14 programs that are at stake here and that affects our  
15 daily life.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And—and not to  
18 undermine some of the work you're doing there but  
19 there is a—I mean there is going to be either. I  
20 mean there is potentially even if we count every  
21 single person in New York City or New York State the  
22 potential that we lose funding based on population  
23 shifts in the country isn't right, too?

1  
2 JULIE MENIN: Correct. I mean I'm going  
3 to defer to DCP on overall population shifts in the  
4 country to answer that.

5 PETER LOBO: New York isn't growing as  
6 fast as Texas and Florida. So, just based on, you  
7 know, population shifts and given the fact that  
8 they're growing at a much faster pace, they're likely  
9 to get into states at the expense of states that  
10 aren't growing fast enough.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you

12 AMIT BAGGA: Council Member, if I—if I  
13 could just add specifically to address your question  
14 about motivations, I think two things that we've seen  
15 in our outreach and through some of the message  
16 testing we've done. Number one, New Yorkers in  
17 general and I think all of you who have had to run  
18 campaigns in New York certainly know this, don't  
19 necessarily love the idea of people knocking on their  
20 door, right, and I think the fact that the Census is  
21 online for the first time next year, it presents us  
22 with a real opportunity. If you complete the Census  
23 online, the likelihood that you get an enumerator  
24 coming to your door significantly decreases. So that  
25 is one motivator. The other motivator that I think

1 is actually very important for all of us to keep in  
2 mind and the Director mentioned, Director Menin  
3 mentioned this earlier is the fact that your  
4 information is protected by Title 13. [bell]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay. Thank you.  
7 I'll—I'll end, actually end my questions there. One  
8 thing that I would note is that I think that I think  
9 many of the Council Members will be doing  
10 participatory budgeting at the same time We were  
11 starting somewhere around March.

12 JULIE MENIN: Uh-hm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: So, I think  
14 there's a potential for some level of coordination  
15 between people doing one-one civic duty of promoting.  
16 That's a likely person that should be filling out the  
17 Census obviously as well. So, you know, I think  
18 there's a potential for our coordination with some  
19 members around their individuals district, um,  
20 voting.

21 JULIE MENIN: Great. Thank you. It's a  
22 great idea.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Thank you, Chair.  
25 I'll be brief because I realize that we have a lot of

1 people who would like to testify but, you know, one  
2 of the things that as a Council Member that I am most  
3 proud of is the tremendous creation of affordable  
4 housing particularly in Bronx County where—where I  
5 come from. Um, so I guess really for City Planning,  
6 these units of housing how do we account for them  
7 just and how do I have confidence that all of this  
8 new housing... You know, I go into neighborhoods and,  
9 you know, Melrose. I don't know where I am any more  
10 because of all these new developments, but really how  
11 do we—how do we have confidence in the Bronx that  
12 those new—new members of the community are being  
13 counted?  
14

15 PETER LOBO: So, historically, the issue  
16 is subdivided housing. How do you get units that are  
17 subdivided? How do you get basement apartments? But  
18 we were actually very successful in actually getting  
19 them using condo data, using phone data. Most of the  
20 new housing coming online is actually new  
21 construction, and you have to file a permit to  
22 actually be able to construct stuff, and when we  
23 actually get a final certificate of occupancy. So,  
24 these are all official data, and as I said, we're  
25 going to be submitting over 100,000 new units, a lot

1 of them in the Bronx. In fact, in terms of  
2  
3 population growth, Bronx is in the fastest population  
4 growth in the city. It accounts to all this new  
5 construction.

6 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Yeah, well that's  
7 great. It's important that I think that the resources  
8 that come with the Census that come to the Bronx.  
9 So, I appreciate that and thank you, Chair.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank you Chair  
11 Cohen, and one of the questions that is coming to us  
12 from some of the new neighbors, they're really  
13 interested in applying for jobs. Is there something  
14 that you've been able to take in a kind of  
15 affirmative—and informative way to encourage New  
16 Yorkers to apply for census jobs and what—what kind  
17 of things has the Mayor's Office done?

18 COMMISSIONER BITTA MOSTOFI: Absolutely.  
19 So, we've been a part of job fairs all over the city  
20 with the Federal Census Bureau. At every single  
21 event that we have, we have always, um, worked to  
22 encourage people to apply for the jobs. We're in  
23 constant contact with the Federal Census Bureau  
24 sending candidates over to them both for partnership  
25

1 jobs, for enumerator jobs and that's been something  
2 that we've been very focused on.  
3

4 AMIT BAGGA: If I could just add to that.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Yes.

6 AMIT BAGGA: Now that the Census Bureau  
7 has been able to obtain its waiver to hire non-  
8 citizens this is particularly important in terms of  
9 our messaging when we were out in the field. We're  
10 also working closely with city agencies that we know  
11 have access to large pools of New Yorkers who need  
12 employment and can benefit from short-term  
13 employment, and that's part and parcel of our  
14 Interagency Engagement Plan.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: CBOs are going to  
16 be a big part of this, and HUB really kind of  
17 represents the—the access they're going to have to  
18 resources. what about the work, um, around language  
19 support specifically partnering in the CBOs to ensure  
20 that materials are translated, but not just  
21 translated, but in a manner that's understandable and  
22 culturally competent. I think we all kind of hit the  
23 general goals of translation, but how are you  
24 measuring your competency?  
25

1  
2 AMIT BAGGA: Uh-hm. It's a great  
3 question. I...

4 JULIE MENIN: Are you good?

5 AMIT BAGGA: I...I can take it. So, as  
6 Director Menin mentioned, um, both she and I have  
7 been part of city agencies where this was a really  
8 high priority for us, and also making sure that the  
9 materials that were translated made sense in context,  
10 right? Um, so one of the things that we're doing is  
11 we're partnering with a translation firm that we know  
12 tends to have much more culturally competent  
13 translations, not just technically correct.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Who-who?

15 AMIT BAGGA: Um, we should probably share  
16 it with you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Later.

18 AMIT BAGGA: Later. I happen to...

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: [interposing] But  
20 there's a--there's an entity?

21 AMIT BAGGA: Yes, there is an entity.  
22 Um, in addition to that, though, and this is where  
23 our partnership with the citywide partners is once  
24 again very important. We're going to be working  
25 through our Communications Working Group as part of

1  
2 our Citywide Partner Working Group to socialize, and  
3 review all of the translation that we receive back so  
4 that we can actually ensure that the translations  
5 make sense.

6 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: So, that's the  
7 mechanism?

8 AMIT BAGGA: That's the mechanism, and-  
9 and we also know that when we fund particular  
10 community based, small community-based organizations  
11 that represent specific communities that perhaps are  
12 not as large that's part of what we're going to ask  
13 them to do for us.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Okay, thank you.  
15 There's a few other questions, but we're going to put  
16 them in a—in a document and send them over and  
17 continue the conversation. Are there any of our  
18 members who have questions? Okay. Um, thank you to  
19 the members, and thank you to all for your time and  
20 effort, and let's keep marching forward into our next  
21 oversight hearing on this, and, um, upward and  
22 onwards.

23 JULIE MENIN: Thank you so much.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank you, thank  
25 you, and we have a panel.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much.  
3 Steven Romalewski from CUNY Graduate Center, and also  
4 the other professor and John Mellonkopf from the  
5 Center for Urban Research also from CUNY Graduate  
6 Center.

7 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you

8 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: You can begin. No  
10 swearing in. We just—we know you're going to tell us  
11 the truth and nothing but the truth so help you. Go  
12 ahead.

13 Thank you very much. We really  
14 appreciate the opportunity to be here, and talk about  
15 some of our—some of our work.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Yes, and I just  
17 want to remind you you're going be on the clock. So,  
18 we have your testimony as well. So, just hit us with  
19 the top points and really things that would be great  
20 to hear in anticipation of—of not just your work, but  
21 maybe in addressing what was said by the  
22 Administration, and we're going to reset your clock.  
23 Three minutes. Go.

24 STEVEN ROMALESKI: Great. Thank you  
25 very much. My name is Steven Romalewski, and I work

1 at the CUNY Graduate Center, and I'll be talking  
2 briefly about some of the work that we're doing in  
3 terms of mapping and providing data analysis to help  
4 Census stakeholders that ensure a fair and accurate  
5 count in the 2020 Census. We—we, our team at the  
6 Graduate Center was asked by a coalition of civil  
7 rights organizations and funders to map hard to count  
8 communities throughout the country back in 2010, and  
9 then now leading up to the 2020 Census, and you can  
10 see a screen shot of the map that's online. Um, we  
11 launched this application in October of 2017. So,  
12 well in advance of some of the activities we talked  
13 about earlier, and the idea is that it tries to  
14 provide information about these hard to count  
15 communities that has—that's been talked about. So  
16 what does that mean? In the context of the decennial  
17 census, the most important thing as was mentioned  
18 earlier is for people to self respond to the Census.  
19 In 2020 that means they'll be able to do that online,  
20 by phone or by mail, and if you don't that means the  
21 Census has to hire staff to knock on your door and  
22 count you in person. That's challenging, that's  
23 expensive, and that presents the greatest risk that  
24 people will be missed and so what we've done is  
25

1 looked back to the 2010 Census and highlighted areas  
2 on the map that have large shares of households that  
3 did not self respond and, therefor, there had to be a  
4 lot of door-to-door enumeration, which again presents  
5 a risk that people got missed and there was an  
6 undercount. In New York City 58% of the population  
7 lives in these so-called hard to count census tracks.  
8 In Brooklyn it's even higher. 80% of the population  
9 form Queens; 67% of the population lives in these  
10 areas. So, it's a—a visualization of the challenge  
11 that is before the—the city, but we also provide a  
12 wealth of other information through the map that can  
13 be of help to Council Members, stakeholders and  
14 others. Internet access, you can see areas that have  
15 poor Internet access. You can see where the public  
16 library branches are located, and also populations at  
17 risk of being undercounted. All of that information  
18 is available that could be used to inform the  
19 outreach efforts and the Get Out the Count Campaigns  
20 that are being talked about. It's really great that  
21 the Council and the city has decided to invest in  
22 trusted partners. They could use this information to  
23 great effect to get that information out, and I  
24 should point out that we'll be enhancing this  
25

1 information going forward. So, during the 2020  
2 enumeration we'll show the information about their  
3 real time self-response rates. You'll be able to  
4 compare that back to 2010 to see how well your area  
5 is doing compared to then and compared to other areas  
6 now. That—that information by the way will be  
7 available nationwide not just here in New York. This  
8 map is nationwide so you can look to see how this  
9 area compares to other parts [bell] of the country  
10 other parts of the state, and so we hope that this is  
11 a tool that organizations and Council members and  
12 other elected officials and—and groups can use to  
13 help ensure a fair and accurate count in 2020. Thank  
14 you.  
15

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Two pieces of  
17 clarification. One is, is the website also  
18 translated in other languages?

19 STEVEN ROMALEWSKI: It is not.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Okay. Um, I don't  
21 know what that would entail, but let's talk about  
22 that later.

23 STEVEN ROMALEWSKI: Sure.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: And then the  
25 second question is in terms of the real time I—I just

1 want everyone to be clear that the only real time  
2 information we're going to get at the end of the day  
3 is stuff that comes in online, not made up. (sic)

4 STEVEN ROMALESKI: No, the Census--

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: [interposing] Can  
6 you talk a little bit about the lag time, and then,  
7 and then we'll go to Professor John Mellonkopf.

8 STEVEN ROMALESKI: So, starting March  
9 20, well, I should back up. In early March the Census  
10 Bureau will start sending out mailings to every  
11 household in the city, and most households across the  
12 country. On March 20, 2020, the Census Bureau will  
13 start publishing daily data by census tract and also  
14 for other geographies about the share of households  
15 that have self-responded whether that's online, by  
16 phone or if they've sent in a paper questionnaire.  
17 So, I t included all of that information. They'll  
18 separately provide a data point about how many  
19 households have responded online. So, you can gauge  
20 what component is online and what's not. The  
21 Association for a Better New York did respond to the  
22 survey earlier this year, and 45 or so percent of the  
23 respondents in New York City said they were not  
24 planning to fill out the questionnaire online. So,  
25

1 the—not only is a challenge in terms of areas that  
2 don't have Internet access or don't have good  
3 Internet access, but it's also a challenge in terms  
4 of making sure people understand the different ways  
5 that they'll be able to respond. They don't have to  
6 do it online and if they don't do it online how else  
7 they're going to do that.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank you

10 JOHN MELLONKOPF: My name is John  
11 Mellonkopf. I'm a Professor at the CUNY Graduate  
12 Center and also work with Steve in the Center for  
13 Urban Research at the Graduate Center, and I've spent  
14 a lot of time over the years looking at census data  
15 for New York City and also studying patterns of civic  
16 engagement both in terms of voting and also I have  
17 been a consultant for New York City Service and did a  
18 largescale survey of civic engagement in New York  
19 City over the last couple of years, and the main  
20 reason that I'm here today is first of all to  
21 congratulate both the Administration and the Council  
22 for doing such a fantastic job in promoting community  
23 engagement in doing the Census. New York City with  
24 its commitment to the Complete Count Fund has far and  
25 away more resources devoted to this than Los Angeles

1 or Chicago. I'm working with colleagues in L.A. and  
2 Chicago in an effort to understand which types of  
3 activities have the greatest effect to use this as a  
4 learning event as well as a large scale civic  
5 engagement event, and my main take away point here is  
6 that it's important to build into the reporting  
7 system for the grantees some way of capturing the  
8 efforts that are made with some both temporal and  
9 geographical detail of what is happening when and  
10 where so that we can match the—the input effort, if  
11 you will, with the output or the outcome in terms of  
12 this track level progress towards a full count that  
13 we're hoping for so that not only will we have spent  
14 a large amount of money in a really good effort, but  
15 we will have learned from that what aspects of those  
16 efforts—efforts work best, and what aspects work  
17 least and—and that will leave us with a very  
18 important set of lessons about civic engagement in  
19 general in the city for after the census takes place.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I meant to ask, and  
22 I'm going to make it real quick, have you—has there  
23 ever been done a campaign where it addresses—I think  
24 the core issue here is trust, and the greatest  
25 commodity I think society ever had is trust, and

1 basically most either trust or people just don't know  
2 the value of it, but has there ever been a campaign  
3 where you're—you are able to engage TV celebrities,  
4 artists, and as such where people tend to look up to  
5 and admire, and have them, you know, demonstrate  
6 here. I'm doing it, and you could do it as well. Has  
7 there ever been a campaign like that and what do you  
8 see the value of that?  
9

10 JOHN MELLONKOPF: You now, I-I think  
11 there's a vast amount of-of knowledge that's been  
12 accumulated about the effectiveness of marketing  
13 techniques generally on consumer behavior, and—and  
14 certainly important cultural figures endorsing  
15 something is—is one of the ways that messages get  
16 through, but I would compare this more to something  
17 like a political campaign in which we're seeking to  
18 get individual engagement, and there have been a lot  
19 of studies of what effects voter turnout in terms of  
20 diff--different kinds of techniques and there one of  
21 the most effective techniques is to have people  
22 trust—trusted partners people from the neighborhood  
23 who speak to you in some one-on-one capacity whether  
24 it's knocking on doors or—or at meetings. I've also  
25 done an experiment with the New York Immigration

1 Coalition about voter turnout of the immigrant origin  
2 voters focusing both on Chinese surname and Latino  
3 surname voters in the 2017 primary general elections  
4 [bell] in New York City, and there we sent—we sent  
5 letters to these voters talking about their own  
6 voting record, which is a matter of public  
7 information as well as what's going on in the  
8 neighborhood, and those—those letters raised the  
9 turnout for those in the—in the treatment group by  
10 three 5 percentage points on—on a base of about 30  
11 percentage points. So, this is, you know, a targeted  
12 communication to individuals from an organization the  
13 New York Immigration Coalition that was a trusted  
14 organization for many of these groups, and so I—I  
15 think we have hard evidence that a well targeted  
16 effort can have a real impact, and from hearing what  
17 Director Menin was talking about in terms of the  
18 micro targeting that was going on, you know, I would  
19 have a high degree of confidence that the city is—is  
20 thinking as carefully as possible about this.

22 STEVEN ROMALESKI: If I could add to  
23 that just one aspect of how we visualize the  
24 information about what's hard to count and what's  
25 not, if you look on the map then in Washington

1 Heights and Inwood for example, you'll see that most  
2 of those tracks, a large share of households self  
3 responded. They mailed back their forms in 2010 to  
4 ensure that the undercount would be minimized in  
5 those areas. Those are areas that otherwise would be  
6 considered hard to count because of the population  
7 characteristics, but there was a dedicated concerted  
8 grassroots organizing effort in those communities to  
9 make sure that people understood the value of  
10 responding to the Census, and it really worked. So,  
11 you look at those areas compared to some of these  
12 other neighborhoods where a large share of households  
13 just didn't send the form back, and I think also  
14 that's evidence that that type of organizing effort  
15 really works, really pays off.

17 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yes, and the thing,  
18 the only point I wanted to make is-and to the  
19 completion of the idea that cultural trumps  
20 everything. It trumps all the systems, all the  
21 strategies, and so if we have a culture which says  
22 hey this is-this is-this is really good for our  
23 community, it adds value to our community. It  
24 empowers our community. For young people this is a  
25 cool thing to do. You know, all of-all of the above

1 and we see that even in politics, right that the  
2 culture of and ideas that are flowing around. So, I  
3 hope in this campaign there will be some of that to  
4 just foster that level of trust. Let me give it back  
5 to my Co-Chair.  
6

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank you, Chair  
8 Cabrera, Chair Cohen for questions. Chair Cohen for  
9 questions?

10 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Thank you for your  
11 testimony. You know, I guess, you know, I think in  
12 part maybe this is a legal question and I think that  
13 we'll have people to testify maybe, but I guess it's  
14 my understanding that certain—that the law requires—  
15 like in your lab with the computers you could  
16 probably come up with a more accurate analysis and  
17 tell us more accurately a population count than the  
18 methodology we're using.

19 JOHN MELLONKOPF: Well, the Census itself  
20 is relying steadily more on administrative data to  
21 substantiate what it's finding out from its own  
22 survey. So administrative data could be things like  
23 voter registration, information. It could be  
24 participation in federal programs. So, so, you know,  
25 the government has a vast amount of data of who is

1 connecting with what that it can specify at the  
2 address level.  
3

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I guess, but  
5 sampling is not allowed? It's not permitted, right?

6 JOHN MELLONKOPF: No, well, I think the  
7 idea of the Census is to get everyone and not-not  
8 just a sampling.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But not-not use a  
10 sample to extract, but I mean-but will there-but  
11 we're-we have a room full of people testifying about  
12 the challenges--

13 JOHN MELLONKOPF: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --of trying to get-  
15 I think-I think if you were trying for-if you were  
16 publishing a scientific paper you would probably try  
17 to do both. You'd try to supplement your field  
18 findings with sampling to try to-but we don't-I don't  
19 think we do that.

20 JOHN MELLONKOPF: You know, it's-it's  
21 interesting that if you look at the-the 2010 mayoral  
22 response rates, and the other hard to count  
23 indicators, um, it-it correlates with other data sets  
24 that we-we've looked at that are-are very finely  
25 engrained in their geographic detail. In particular,

1 there's a very strong correlation between voter  
2 turnout levels and response to the Census. So, we  
3 can—we can look at that and--

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [interposing] Yeah,  
5 but unfortunate—unfortunately in my business voter  
6 turnout is not that great either so--

7 JOHN MELLONKOPF: It's not that great  
8 absolutely--

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yeah.

10 JOHN MELLONKOPF: --and I think that  
11 suggests that this is going to be a really major  
12 challenge for us to—to get a full count, and so, you  
13 know, it behooves us to, you know, lean on the most  
14 effective techniques possible to get as close to a  
15 full count as we can because, um, I mean there is a  
16 potential that it could be disastrous because it's a  
17 completely new method to—they're counting—the Census  
18 is counting on 60% of the people nationwide going  
19 online and volunteering their information and filling  
20 it out online. So, it—it's a completely novel  
21 experience. It's never been—nothing like this has  
22 ever been tried before. So, and again to go back to  
23 my first point, the fact that the Council and the  
24 Administration have joined together to put this level  
25

1 of resources into promoting a full count is you're  
2 setting a nationwide standard. This is much more  
3 money than Los Angeles or Chicago has—has put into  
4 similar efforts. So, I think the whole country will  
5 be watching New York City to see, you know, what the  
6 effect of this investment that you've made is—is  
7 going to be.

9 STEVEN ROMALESKI: The Census Bureau  
10 will supplement the actual count if you don't self-  
11 respond, and if you don't answer the door for a  
12 census enumerator with statistical methods and  
13 administrative records. That's why it's so important  
14 for households to self-respond so they tell the  
15 Census exactly how many people live there, and if  
16 they don't, that they open the door to a Census  
17 Enumerator so they can give that exact information to  
18 the Enumerator because if they don't, and there are a  
19 number of tracks in Brooklyn and Queens in particular  
20 where there's 20% or more of the population that was  
21 counted statistically because the Census crew was not  
22 able to reach them through the mail and was not able  
23 to reach them through the door-to-door efforts. So,  
24 you don't want that. [laughs]

25 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: No, right.

1  
2 STEVEN ROMALEWSKI: So, you really need  
3 that 100% count done through the way the Census  
4 Bureau is doing it. If you have to, okay, try to rely  
5 on those other things, but that's where the under  
6 count comes in. That's where the miscount comes in.  
7 You want to try to avoid that.

8 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank you, Chair  
10 Cohen for those questions, and thank you both for-for  
11 coming today, and we'll—we'll keep talking to you  
12 about civic engagement, and thinking about the lines  
13 of the community.

14 JOHN MELLONKOPF: Thanks for inviting us  
15 to be here.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: We'll have now  
18 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer. [pause]

19 GALE BREWER: Thank you very much. It's  
20 hard to follow the wonderful CUNY folks. They are  
21 fabulous. Um, my name is Gale Brewer. I'm the  
22 Manhattan Borough President, and I want to thank all  
23 of the Chairs and all the committees for the  
24 opportunity to testify today. We all know that this  
25 count is beyond essential. Pulling off a decennial

1 census in the U.S. requires a Herculean civic effort,  
2 and even more so as you know. We're not living under  
3 normal circumstances. So, I just want to talk about  
4 what we've been doing because you know the rest of  
5 it. So, we have 1.7 million residents in the Borough  
6 of Manhattan. Twenty-eight percent are foreign born.  
7 Believe it or not, we have numerous hard to count  
8 census tracks, obviously in low-income and immigrant  
9 communities, obviously in public housing  
10 developments, but elsewhere. In 2010, in Manhattan  
11 the hardest count areas may be no surprise was Center  
12 Harlem and East Harlem just as hard with Midtown.  
13 Midtown was even harder, and Chinatown was also very  
14 difficult, and we all know that maybe Steve, the  
15 great Steve Romalewski my love, he might have pointed  
16 out that the Financial District since 9/11 2001 has  
17 gone from 20,000 to 70,000. So that's a huge number  
18 and also Hudson Yards has many new residents. So,  
19 those all have to be counted, and we all know that,  
20 you know, what the challenges are losing House seats,  
21 et cetera, and all the funding that is at-a challenge  
22 for all of us. So, I'm not getting into all of that,  
23 and we have to lock in until 2030 perhaps the most  
24 important time of our lives given what we're doing in  
25

1 Washington. So, given all of this above, last year we  
2 looked at the Commerce Department's request for  
3 comments on the citizenship question, and the way we  
4 answered it I thought was quite innovative. We  
5 rented a bus, and we went to Providence, Rhode  
6 Island, which is where the pilot was for the Census  
7 Bureau. It was the only nationally representative dry  
8 run end-to-end rehearsal for the 2020 Census, and we  
9 worked with the mayor there and his wonderful staff,  
10 and we took with us about 50 or 60 people from the  
11 City Council, CUNY, Department of Planning, city and  
12 state governments, community boards, non-profit  
13 organizations, Latino Justice as an example, the  
14 Central Labor Council, Asian-American Foundation,  
15 many, many immigrant rights groups and ABNY and  
16 others, and they all went on this bus. The Mayor  
17 provided a delicious lunch, but more importantly was  
18 we got to see from the Portuguese community's  
19 perspective what worked, and one example was this  
20 amazing woman who had been dean at a community  
21 college, not dissimilar from CUNY's community  
22 colleges and who was head of the Portuguese-American  
23 Academics Dean at the college, and she was also head  
24 of the organization that worked with the Portuguese  
25

1 community in Providence. That was the only way she  
2 got folks counted is because she was trusted and  
3 respected, and that was a clear nothing new for us to  
4 learn, but it was such a clear message. So, I will  
5 be very quick because I know I'm supposed to be, but  
6 I want to just say what we have done here in  
7 Manhattan. Certainly we have a Manhattan Council  
8 Initiative. We funded 12 trusted organizations with  
9 the expense money that we have. One of them is  
10 working with Interfaith Center of New York, and  
11 they're taking with several faith groups like the  
12 Catholic Charities, UJ Federation and many others and  
13 they're doing what I call sermon notes. So, they're  
14 taking all the religious organizations in Manhattan  
15 and working with the sermon notes to talk about  
16 Census, number one. Number two, we're working with  
17 something called Uptown Grand Central, which is like  
18 a Chamber of Commerce, but a little bit more grounded  
19 and very the grassroots on the East 123 Street  
20 working with local businesses, pop-up tents to do the  
21 kind of work to count to get people ready. Third, no  
22 surprise, so I have organizations funded, with the  
23 Muslim, Chinese, Korean, and Latino community, and  
24 more importantly with all of the art groups in the  
25

1 Borough of Manhattan. Edgy Art could make a big  
2 difference for people being involved in the Census  
3 unless we're going to produce. All the individuals  
4 who produce food and deliver it to the homebound are  
5 going to be trained because when you're homebound the  
6 only person you trust is the person who brings your  
7 food, and that person will bring a laptop or iPad and  
8 help you fill it out. That's another example. We've  
9 also been going to the places where there is  
10 opportunity for getting employment. We've been doing  
11 this with the wonderful U.S. Census Group. Despite  
12 what's going on in Washington, the folks are terrific  
13 from the U.S. Census. We're working with Google  
14 Training Center. We've had offices—employment times  
15 in our office, and on November 13<sup>th</sup> in our storefront  
16 at 125<sup>th</sup> Street, and with seven or eight  
17 organizations, it's the Harlem Census Recruitment  
18 Day, and we are doing all across the Harlem  
19 community. We have a Complete Count Committee. The  
20 next meeting is November 18<sup>th</sup> here at the Municipal  
21 Building, and we'll be talking about some of these  
22 issues. Deputy Borough President Alvin Bonilla did  
23 the count for the Borough of Manhattan 20 years ago,  
24 and he came in number one. So, with all due respect  
25

1 to your other boroughs watch out. Thank you very  
2 much.  
3

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Thank you,  
5 Borough President Brewer. I don't know if the members  
6 have questions, but I just have a challenge. I know--

7 GALE BREWER: Brooklyn.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: --Brooklyn has  
9 come in--

10 GALE BREWER: Yeah, I know.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: --well, you-you  
12 know what I'm going to say. You know, Brooklyn had  
13 some challenges and it's on the map right now. The  
14 reason we're not showing yours is because you all did  
15 really great last time--

16 GALE BREWER: Oh, yeah, sure.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: --and-and so  
18 thank you for listing your playbook. I'm going to  
19 borrow those for Brooklyn. That's how we're going to  
20 beat you.

21 GALE BREWER: Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: Um, I am saying  
23 that now on the record, and so I hope you're okay  
24 with-with coming in second because Brooklyn is going  
25 to kick butt.

GALE BREWER: Uh-hm. We'll make it a challenge, Council Member, but I'm glad--

CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: [interposing]  
It's-it's ours.

GALE BREWER: --that we're all working to get the New York City Council, which is most important--

CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: I know.

GALE BREWER: --but I love working with you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: No, and--and we look forward to working with you.

GALE BREWER: Thank you. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHANCA: I don't have anything else.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I think now we take that challenge, too, in the Bronx.

GALE BREWER: And everyone knows

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: It's very, very persona, and so um, we're on.

GALE BREWER: Okay, thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Our next panel we're going to have Nick Higgins from the Brooklyn

1 Public Library; Brian Baynon-Bannon from the New York  
2 Public Library; and Nick Buron from Queens Public  
3 Library. [background comments/pause] Because at this  
4 time we have—we're doing something unusual. We're  
5 going to have nine minutes. That's because you're  
6 going to be collaborating in your testimony together,  
7 and then after that, for everybody I just want to let  
8 you know as soon as this is over, we're going to be  
9 switching over to the next room next door because  
10 they're going to be setting up for an event here. You  
11 may begin. Thank you.

12 [off mic] Okay, thank you. Thanks for the  
13 additional time. We'll--

14 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [interposing] If  
15 you could turn the mic on. Thank you.

16 BRIAN BANNON: Thank you for the  
17 additional time. We'll try not to use all of the  
18 nine minutes. My name is Brian Bannon. I'm the Merry  
19 and James Tisch--

20 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [interposing] It's  
21 actually not on—just I don't want to make them  
22 jealous okay.

23 BRIAN BANNON. Ah-hah.

24  
25

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Not additional  
time. You've got three, three and three--

BRIAN BANNON: Right.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But you're all  
together.

BRIAN BANNON: And we're still going to  
try not to use it all.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Oh, thank you.

BRIAN BANNON: I'm the--the James and  
Merryl or the Merryl and James Tisch--Tisch Director  
of the New York Public Library, and I'm joined today  
on the panel by Nick Byrne from the--thief Librarian  
of Queens Public Library and Nick Higgins the Chief  
Librarian of Brooklyn Public Library. I want to thank  
the Council Speaker Corey Johnson, Chairs Cohen, and  
Cabrera and Menchaca for--and members of the committee  
for holding this important hearing, and for your  
support of our libraries. We'd also like to thank  
the NYC Census Director Julie Menin and the New York  
City Council Members Rivera and Menchaca for their  
leadership and efforts. We'd also as part of our  
testimony today we'll be talking about the role that  
libraries will be playing in the 2020 Census. Our  
three public library systems are essential in

1 providing education information to the more than 200  
2 neighborhoods across our five boroughs. In Fiscal  
3 Year 19, the City's 217 library locations served more  
4 than 35 million in-person visits and other -and  
5 online 46 million visits. We remain one of the most  
6 important civic assets that our city has and enjoy  
7 high levels of trust across our city, and we think  
8 that's an important part of leveraging libraries as  
9 we enter into the 2020 Census. The Brooklyn Public  
10 Library, Queens Public Library and New York Public  
11 Library have worked on very closely together to  
12 develop plans to build upon our strengths as  
13 community conveyors, public computing-computing  
14 centers and, of course, as noted before, trust-  
15 trusted civic spaces in our neighborhoods. Our free  
16 and public computing centers and technology and their  
17 access will be important, more important than ever as  
18 we think about supporting Census as being conducted  
19 primarily online. So, there's a few elements of our  
20 program that-that I'm going to introduce, and my  
21 colleagues will talk about more deeply. The plan for  
22 2020 Census is comprehensive with the primary goals  
23 of connecting the city's most hard to reach  
24 residents, providing technical resources and, of  
25

1 course, helping answer questions. In order to  
2 achieve these goals, our libraries plan to first  
3 provide targeted Census training to over a thousand  
4 public service staff members across our three library  
5 systems. We'll also hold dedicated technology or  
6 have dedicated technology at locations in communities  
7 at risk of being undercounted, which it augments the  
8 existing technology that we already have including  
9 Census kiosks, mobile devices and other technology to  
10 ensure public access to Census online is made easy.  
11 We will also enhance our translation services to  
12 better communicate with hard to count populations,  
13 and finally, we'll work with our partners in  
14 government and communities to provide targeted  
15 outreach in specific neighborhoods. We're grateful  
16 to the City Council. The city has agreed to support  
17 our efforts with a \$1. Million in funding, and we  
18 look forward to working with you, the Mayor's Census  
19 Office and key community stakeholders on this  
20 critical initiative. Thank you.

22 NICK BURON: Good afternoon. My name is  
23 Nick Buron. I'm the Chief Librarian of the Queens  
24 Public Library. Before I speak on the threes systems  
25 plan for IT data and privacy, I would like to thank

1 Speaker Johnson, Chairs Cabrera, Cohen and Menchaca  
2 for giving us the opportunity to testify. The  
3 Administration, especially Julie Menin and her staff  
4 and the 2020 Census Task Force Co-Chairs, Council  
5 Member Rivera and Menchaca for their leadership and  
6 dedication. A complete count is a matter of equity  
7 and inclusion, and as Queens Public Library serves  
8 the most diverse county in the nation, we along with  
9 our colleagues are committed to this collective  
10 effort to ensure that everyone in our city is  
11 represented no matter who they are or where they come  
12 from. As part of this work, Queens Public Library,  
13 New York Public Library and Brooklyn Public Library  
14 are taking immediate steps to serve as safe and  
15 secure digital access points for the 2020 Census  
16 self-response. TRILI will provide dedicated tech  
17 devices to customers for Census completion of  
18 branches particularly in our hardest to count  
19 communities. These devices will be configured to  
20 limit access to only the official Census website,  
21 preventing customers from visiting malicious URLs and  
22 clone sites looking to harvest personally  
23 identifiable information from customers. These  
24 devices will have secure up-to-date web browsers and  
25

1 ports will have been disabled preventing the  
2 installation of malware. Additionally, TRILI has  
3 implemented an automated security solution called  
4 Quad 9 as part of the city's NYC Secure Initiative,  
5 which protects New Yorkers from malicious cyber  
6 attacks by leveraging the domain name system known as  
7 DNS to block known malicious and bad websites when  
8 access on public WiFi. This added layer of security  
9 complements existing spyware, malware and firewall  
10 solutions currently implemented at all of our  
11 branches. No personal information is ever collected  
12 or stored on our public computers. In addition to  
13 enhanced IT infrastructure, the three systems will  
14 conduct trainings and programs for staff and  
15 customers around the threats and opportunities of a  
16 digital Census. We will educate customers in an  
17 array of topics: Why the Census matters? Digital  
18 privacy and security and employment opportunities  
19 with the Census. Based on recommendations from the  
20 Census Bureau, TRILI is aiming to provide a secure  
21 and private Census experience. Staff will receive  
22 training on the privacy safeguards in place to  
23 protect respondents' data, and we will be available  
24 to assist and answer questions as always.  
25

1  
2 NICK HIGGINS: Great. Thank you. My name  
3 is Nick Higgins. I'm the Chief Librarian of Brooklyn  
4 Public Library, and I also want to extend my thanks  
5 to the partners that I see in the room. Thank you so  
6 much for partnering in solidarity with libraries over  
7 the—the Census campaign, but also for other  
8 initiatives. NYC Libraries are acutely aware of  
9 what's at stake in the 2020 Census. Ten years ago  
10 the city's response rate was less than 62% compared  
11 to the national average of 76%. In my home borough  
12 of Brooklyn we have the lowest mailing return rate of  
13 any U.S. county in more than 500 people—500,000  
14 people. The map there shows it. Another under-count  
15 in 2020 would have devastating consequences,  
16 potential losses in political representation and  
17 billions in funding for public education, housing and  
18 health services, Medicaid, senior centers, libraries  
19 and other critical infrastructure would be keenly  
20 felt by every New Yorker particularly in communities  
21 that have historically been under-represented. We are  
22 grateful that the City has recognized the important  
23 role libraries play in the lives of all New Yorkers  
24 by supporting our efforts and achieving a complete  
25 count. Libraries are anchors of educational,

1 cultural and civic life in each and every  
2 neighborhood across this great city. We've developed  
3 trusting and supportive relationships with  
4 generations of New Yorkers. We have developed  
5 trusting—we continue to build connections with our  
6 city's newest residents by offering services,  
7 programs, and collections in a variety of language—a  
8 variety of languages and across all ages. Libraries  
9 have worked hard to earn our place as one of the most  
10 trusted—trusted public institutions in our  
11 communities. Our commitment to our diverse and  
12 changing neighborhoods is never ending. The  
13 commitment is reflected in our services, our  
14 programs, policies and collections. We are  
15 leveraging our staff, our infrastructure both  
16 physical and technological, and our expertise about  
17 each New York City neighborhood to ensure that our  
18 communities come into our branches and complete their  
19 Census forms. Our frontline staff across all NYC  
20 libraries will be trained to support Census—to  
21 support Census takers. They will prepare to answer  
22 questions, and provide assistance, the language  
23 support as needed. Through community partnerships  
24 built over the years we will amplify our message and  
25

1 reach the city's hardest to count residents in  
2 multiple languages. We're mobilizing to educate and  
3 inform our communities by removing barriers, fighting  
4 scams and misinformation and improving access to the  
5 resources they will need to fulfill their civic duty,  
6 and regardless of what our current political climate  
7 may be signaling, inside the library everyone is  
8 welcome. We're committed to be a trusted community  
9 partner that will be available to provide assistance  
10 to all New Yorkers looking to complete the Census.  
11 The substantial support and trust we've received from  
12 our partners at the City's Census Office will only  
13 help to reinforce the library's commitment to  
14 leveraging the full extent of our knowledge, tools  
15 and resources to engage our communities in this  
16 critical count. Thank you for the opportunity to  
17 testify on this important topic. We remain available  
18 to answer any questions you have. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: I just have—I want to  
21 remind the audience that if there is anybody here who  
22 would like to testify, you need to fill out a slip  
23 with the sergeant-at-arms. Um, thank you for coming  
24 today. Thank you for your testimony. One of the  
25 prepared questions I have here is will libraries have

1 space and staff dedicated specifically to people  
2 filling out their Census forms, and I—I just want to  
3 supplement that, though, by I'd like you to talk  
4 about maybe the outreach you've done at the branches  
5 to make sure the branch manager knows and the  
6 librarian knows, the people who actually work there  
7 so that, you know, whoever you encounter from  
8 libraries is going to be able to answer the questions  
9 and direct people to make, you know, give them the  
10 opportunity to fill out the Census.  
11

12 BRIAN BANNON: So, I'll start. Part of  
13 the training that we're putting in place is roughly a  
14 thousand public facing staff across the system. So  
15 these are folks who are interacting with patrons  
16 everyday or getting deep training. We've already the  
17 training process, and we'll continue to do that. In  
18 addition, we're augmenting--

19 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: [interposing] You  
20 will—you're Queens, right?

21 BRIAN BANNON: No, NYPL.

22 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: You're new.

23 BRIAN BANNON: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: You plan to train a  
25 thousand employees specifically on--

1  
2 BRIAN BANNON: Correct. In addition to  
3 that, we're—you know, we're doing big communications,  
4 we're using our internal systems for—for messaging.  
5 So the idea is our Public Services staff is are  
6 already engaging regularly with the—with the public  
7 and so we're looking at ways of helping the  
8 meaningful integrate messaging into programs, you  
9 know, such as Story Hour reminding folks about the  
10 Census. Um, so these are staff who may not  
11 necessarily be assigned to just focus on Census, but  
12 we're integrating Census as key messaging, and  
13 understanding sort of the—the-the important elements  
14 of it as part of—of their core programming across our  
15 portfolio.

16 NICK BYRNE: Well with Queens we are  
17 coordinating our training efforts with our sister  
18 systems following the city and the American Library  
19 Association Census Training Guidelines. We are  
20 coordinating with our Talent Development Group at  
21 Queens Public Library with the goal that all of our  
22 staff, all of the 1,000 people will receive Census  
23 training related, um, related information by the end  
24 of February or 2020.

1  
2           NICK HIGGINS: And similarly, at Brooklyn  
3 we are also incorporating the Census, the messaging  
4 about the Census, which is also very important in  
5 every single large scale meeting that we have at the  
6 library. So, all of our branch managers or  
7 supervisors of the libraries, all hands on deck for  
8 us. We have had trainings. We're coordinating our  
9 trainings with the Regional Census Offices in  
10 Brooklyn. We've already conducted one all of our  
11 adult serving librarians at Brooklyn Public Library,  
12 and we'll continue to. As Brian had mentioned, we're  
13 trying to infuse message of the Census into a broad  
14 range of programming that we offer at the Library. So  
15 there's an opportunity to reach people if they're  
16 taking an English language class or a citizenship  
17 class, or if they're attending a story time for  
18 their--for their families.

19           CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Can you just briefly--  
20 are there differences in terms of policy, in terms of  
21 using the technology at libraries that might be  
22 applicable to people who want to fill out the Census  
23 or particularly people who organize? Because I would  
24 just say, and I realize we're very early in the  
25 process, but my office help--tried to coordinate a

1  
2 Census job fair the other day, and it took a little  
3 bit of, you know, we needed to email from, you know,  
4 from the branch to Central, from Central back to make  
5 sure everybody was on the same page to make sure that  
6 things worked smoothly, and it did all work out in  
7 the end, but I think that there—they need to make  
8 sure that if there's a policy difference, you know,  
9 people are like wait a minute. This is not the  
10 normal policy. We're doing something different. So  
11 making sure that staff knows that.

12           NICK HIGGINS: Uh, yes, we're—and we're  
13 aware of the specific issue that—that came up and—and  
14 I think it was a learning experience for us. I think  
15 on the technology front what we are also really  
16 focused on is, um, the dedicated technology we're  
17 making available is not to require specialized log-  
18 in, et cetera. So, that we can make it freely and  
19 openly available to anyone, essentially anonymously,  
20 and so, but yes, thank you for that reminder.

21           CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Is that different  
22 then than what the normal experience would be?

23           NICK HIGGINS: The—the current, um, way  
24 that you would use dedicated library computers as you  
25 would—you would log in using a library card and PIN

1  
2 number. Um, what the augmented technology is allowing  
3 for patrons to use the computers without signing in  
4 or logging in.

5 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Yes, so I just think  
6 we need to do a good job of making sure that  
7 everybody with this, you know, that things are not as  
8 usual. We're doing something different.

9 NICK HIGGINS: Thank you. I appreciate  
10 that. Thank you, Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much.  
12 I'm going to—we're going to be sending, um, sending  
13 some questions because time is eluding us here, and  
14 so with that, we close this panel. Please don't move  
15 because we cannot use the room next door. So, the  
16 good news is that you get to stay, but so we have  
17 until 4:00. So, I'm going to put the clock to two  
18 minutes because I want to make sure we get everybody  
19 in. Okay? So, please help me. Sometimes I'll have  
20 control of some things. Sometimes I don't. Okay,  
21 that's one of those times. Melva Miller for ABNY;  
22 Kelly Percival, Brennan Center for Justice; Greta  
23 Byrum from New York—from the New School; Anita—Anita  
24 Anand from the New York Immigration Coalition, and  
25

1  
2 Perry Grossman from NC-NYCLU. Alright. [background  
3 comments/pause]

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yeah, if you could—  
5 whoever is ready even as the other ones come if we  
6 could get—we're going to ramp up. You're all experts  
7 in this so I'm fully confident.

8 MELVA MILLER: Sure. I'll start.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you.

10 MELVA MILLER: Let's get it. [laughter]

11 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I like that. I like  
12 that leadership. Come on.

13 MELVA MILLER: Good afternoon. My name  
14 is Melva Miller and I am Executive Vice President for  
15 the Association for a Better New York, and on behalf  
16 to our Organizing and Action Committee for Census  
17 work as well as our membership, I want to thank you  
18 for allowing me to testify this afternoon. I'm here  
19 to represent our commitment to obtaining an accurate  
20 and fair count in 2020, and ABNY's commitment to  
21 that. As many of you have already heard, the Census  
22 is of significant importance and determines the  
23 allocation of more than \$73 billion in federal funds  
24 just for New York State alone. These federal dollars  
25 fund programs that our most vulnerable New Yorkers

1 rely on every day including SNAP, CHIP, Medicare,  
2 Medicaid and Section 8 Vouchers for affordable  
3 housing as much as we hear about the need of that for  
4 New York City. In 2010, New York City's response was  
5 less than 62% while the national average was at 76%.  
6 This undercount includes many of our hard to count  
7 communities including immigrants, communities of  
8 color, single mothers with children age 0 to 5.  
9 Moreover, the upcoming Census poses additional risk  
10 for all the things we heard about today. It being  
11 online, the aftermath of the citizenship question and  
12 also the under-funded Census -U.S. Census Bureau. In  
13 order to make-to ensure that we are able to make each  
14 and every New Yorker count, ABNY has undertaken a  
15 series of actions including setting up an organizing  
16 an Action Committee made up of city leaders. We  
17 understand the challenges and barriers we must  
18 overcome when conducting this count, and we'll be  
19 hosting a conference next month on the strategies and  
20 tactics on how best to get out the count in the  
21 upcoming Census. We talked a lot about messaging  
22 today. What ABNY is doing is leveraging the private  
23 sector to get professionals with expertise in  
24 marketing and outreach to help the city come up with  
25

1 the citywide strategy for communicating. After  
2 conducting a month long needs assessment in 12 focus  
3 groups and engaging a wide variety of wow.

4  
5 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yes.

6 MELVA MILLER: Alright, so basically I  
7 have three asks, right. We want to (1) make sure  
8 that the money that goes to community-based  
9 organizations get those small niched community-based  
10 organizations that have the unique ability to get to  
11 the heart to count communities. Our second ask is to  
12 get the funding out ASAP. We have dealt with many,  
13 many organizations that have had to put staff on  
14 furlough because they've already been doing the work,  
15 but they don't have money to continue, and our third  
16 ask is really to make sure that we have a  
17 comprehensive public awareness strategy and Get Out  
18 the Count Campaign that leverages all city assets and  
19 use all of our resources to make sure that we are  
20 reaching every New Yorker in the way that we need to  
21 reach them.

22 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And what you just  
23 did there at the end is what I'm hoping that  
24 everybody else will do.

25 MELVA MILLER: [laughs]

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Give me the  
3 suggestions. We know that there are challenges. If  
4 we could get that—that was awesome. Thank you.

5 MELVA MILLER: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: We appreciate that.

7 MELVA MILLER: You're welcome.

8 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Next.

9 GRETA BYRUM: Hi. I'm Greta Byrum the  
10 Co-Director of the Digital Equity Laboratory at the  
11 New School and I want to speak about digital equity  
12 because the Census is always an equity issue, but  
13 this time it's a digital issue. So, others have  
14 mentioned that the Census will be online for the  
15 first time. That means that 80%, not 60%, 80% of  
16 households will be asked to participate online or  
17 through the phone response system, and that means  
18 that it's going—the count is going to prioritize well  
19 connected neighborhoods which happen to be mostly  
20 white and affluent. But the barrier or the bar to  
21 digital participation is very high for particular  
22 communities including communities of color, those  
23 with insecure housing and elders, and so we really  
24 need to be thinking about digital inclusion and  
25 digital literacy as a key piece of the puzzle, and

1 I'm so glad that Libraries are on board to address  
2 those issues. Scott Stringer's Office the  
3 Comptroller's office estimates at least a third do a  
4 half of—of some New York City communities do not have  
5 broadband at home. So, this is actually quite a big  
6 problem. So, we also can anticipate that there will  
7 be risks in this Census and we advocate for a  
8 monitoring or a—or a—to—to monitor the count  
9 actually. We know that there are risks with regard  
10 to again to online participation. There are also a  
11 lot of unanswered questions. There's only been one  
12 field test of the Census. There were supposed to be  
13 three. I want to also say that Title 13 while it is  
14 ironclad as a piece of a statute, it is interpreted  
15 and enforced by the U.S. Department of Commerce,  
16 which is part of the Executive Branch, and Congress  
17 has the ability to change Title 13. Additionally,  
18 the Executive Order issued after the defeat of the  
19 citizenship question. After that Trump issued and  
20 executive order which allowed of data collection from  
21 other federal agencies including the Department of  
22 Homeland Security pertaining to citizenship status as  
23 well as data collection from local and state  
24 agencies. So, the data issues are a lot deeper than  
25

1 just the data that will be collected from Census. So,  
2 we advocate for what we've seen already coming from  
3 the libraries, which are the most secure and  
4 trustworthy place for people to participate according  
5 to our research, and we're just publishing right now  
6 an manual that some of the libraries will use to help  
7 prepare, which includes schematics for how to build a  
8 dedicated and safe porta.  
9

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you. Thank  
11 you so much. Yes.

12 ANITA ANAND: Good afternoon and thank  
13 you for this opportunity. I'm Anita Anand, Census  
14 2020 Senior Fellow at the New York Immigration  
15 Coalition, which also serves as the convener for New  
16 York Counts 2020, a statewide coalition of over 200  
17 member organizations who work to ensure every New  
18 Yorker is counted. In this role I've had the  
19 opportunity to work with many members of the City  
20 Council and their staff, and with the staff of New  
21 York City Census 2020, as well as many of the  
22 citywide partners in this room, and we are working  
23 with ABNY towards having the Census Summit in  
24 November. In the spirit of further collaboration, I  
25 wish to offer the following recommendations: First,

1 increase overall coordination including with the  
2 libraries. As we've heard, libraries are trusted  
3 resource centers within their communities and will  
4 have strong data access point set-up. New York City  
5 Census 2020 is working with them, but we would like  
6 the CBOs to have increased collaboration with them  
7 and have the libraries particularly working in terms  
8 of community specific mobilization, communications  
9 and data privacy. Secondly, we would like to see a  
10 creation of funding opportunities for smaller  
11 community-based organizations. While we're waiting  
12 the next round of grantees, we want to be able to  
13 partner sooner with smaller CBOs and see grants as  
14 low as \$2,500. As Melba already pointed out, these  
15 local groups are the ones that are able to reach hard  
16 to count communities, and we want to see that those  
17 opportunities are created. Finally, we would like to  
18 call on the Governor to immediately release the \$20  
19 million in Census State funding. It is not just a  
20 question of Upstate versus New York City. If New  
21 York State does not release the funding, it can help  
22 undo the work that we are all doing. It affects the  
23 representation of all of us, and it affects the  
24

1 federal funding that hits the state [bell] overall.

2 Thank you. [laughter]

3  
4 KELLY PERCIVAL: Hi. My name is Kelly  
5 Percival. I'm Counsel with the Democracy Program at  
6 the Brennan Center for Justice. We work to ensure  
7 that American democracy is responsive to the needs  
8 and desires of all people, and that's why we're  
9 interested in promoting a fair and accurate decennial  
10 census. I'd like to focus my remarks today on one  
11 particular threat facing the 2020 Census, which has  
12 been mentioned today, which is the widespread fears  
13 that the federal government intends to use census  
14 date to harm census respondents. I'd also like to  
15 talk about how we can leverage Title 13 to limit that  
16 threat. So, as we all know, concerns about the  
17 confidentiality of data are discouraging people from  
18 standing up to be counted in 2020, and these concerns  
19 are not shared equally. We know that communities of  
20 color are more likely to be concerned about  
21 confidentiality. Many of these fears stem from the  
22 Trump Administration's attempt to add a citizenship  
23 question from-to the Census, and also from the  
24 President subsequent issuance of an executive order  
25 on citizenship data, which exacerbated already

1 existing fears. So the city can play a central role  
2 in counteracting this climate of fear by undertaking  
3 a public-public education campaign assuring effected  
4 populations that the information that provide on the  
5 Census by law cannot be sued against them. Public  
6 passaging should include information about the  
7 ironclad laws that protect the confidentiality of  
8 Census data. The Federal Census Act or Title 13 of  
9 the U.S. Code prohibits the Bureau from disclosing  
10 any personal identifiable information that it  
11 receives. Title 13 also makes it illegal for Census  
12 data to be used for any non-statistical purpose  
13 including immigration enforcement. It's also illegal  
14 for the Bureau to give census responses to other  
15 government agencies like ICE. These prohibitions  
16 apply equally to information that the Bureau collects  
17 using administrative records from other agencies  
18 including any information on citizenship that the  
19 Bureau may collect pursuant to the President's  
20 Executive Order on citizenship data. Title 13 is just  
21 one of the many laws that protect the confidentiality  
22 of census data, and I have included a comprehensive  
23 guide to Census and privacy laws in my written  
24 remarks. Thank you.  
25

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you.

Thank you Chair Cabrera and Chair Cohen.

I'm Perry Grossman. I'm the Senior Staff Attorney in the Voting Rights Project at the New York Civil Liberties Union. I was part of the litigation team that defeated the citizenship question on the Census. We took it from 500 Crow (sic) Street all the way to the Supreme Court, and, um, very glad to have prevailed. That said, there is still a significant climate of fear as others have noted. You've got my written remarks so I'm just going to keep it quick with a few points. Council Member Cohen, you asked a question before about sampling. Sampling is not permitted on the decennial headcount. It is permitted and encouraged for all other census products like the American Community Survey, which is why it's so important that we get this headcount right because the headcount is what matters here. So, just cut to sort of some of the recommendations: (1) Make the cost of participation as low as humanly possible. You know, make sure that everybody has easy access to not only the means of filling out and responding to the Census, but also just constantly reminded about doing so. So, it takes as little effort as possible

1 from them. It's a lot like voting in that respect.  
2  
3 The payoff feels very low and attenuated, so you've  
4 got to reduce the cost as much as possible to get  
5 people to participate. Number 2, rely as much as  
6 possible on trusted messengers. They are the people  
7 who are going to get the hard-to-count populations  
8 able to respond. Obviously we have, you know, as  
9 everyone has discussed, significant low participation  
10 from communities of color, immigrant communities. We  
11 need to focus there. Third, when I go out and talk  
12 about the Census I get asked about privacy and  
13 confidentiality all the time. There's been some  
14 discussion of that. You know, I'll say in addition to  
15 the criminal penalties that are there, you've got  
16 career professionals at the Census Bureau who take  
17 this stuff seriously and aren't about to start  
18 spreading it around. You've also got disclosure  
19 avoidance protocols and Disclosure Review Boards at  
20 the Census Bureau that are protecting privacy.  
21 People need to know their data is safe. And finally,  
22 I'm with Anita. [bell] Encourage the Governor to get  
23 that \$20 million distributed as soon as humanly  
24 possible because April 1<sup>st</sup> is right around the corner  
25 and we need to get moving.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much.  
3 Really appreciate all the work that you're doing, and  
4 with that, I've got to move to the next, um, panel.  
5 We're going to have Christine Boodi, Community  
6 Resource Exchange; George Hirsch or Hsieh from  
7 Community Resource Exchange, and Wori Lamodia. Did I  
8 say that right? Alright. Alowadi from United Way of  
9 New York City, Ben Weinburg from Citizens Union and  
10 Marian Rand from Asian-American-

11 MALE SPEAKER: Federation.

12 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Federation, and  
13 whoever is ready can being.

14 GEORGE SHAY: Okay.

15 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: You look ready. Go  
16 for it, if you would.

17 GEORGE SHAY: Alright, Good afternoon.  
18 My name is George Shay, I'm a Senior Consultant at  
19 Community Resources Exchange

20 CHRISTINE BOODI: And I'm Christine  
21 Boodi. I'm an Associate Consultant at Community  
22 Resource Exchange. On behalf of CRE, we thank the  
23 Committees on Governmental Operations, Immigration  
24 and State and Federal Legislation for holding this  
25 important oversight hearing about our preparations

1 for the 2020 Census. It is clear that collectively  
2 we all want to ensure a smooth, accurate and  
3 responsible count, which will further strengthen our  
4 city, state, and nation. Community Resource Exchange  
5 or CRE is a Manhattan based non-profit that provides  
6 consulting services to the social sector  
7 organizations. We serve more than 500 organizations  
8 annually both here in New York City and across the  
9 country. Last year alone we worked with,  
10 strengthened and advised hundreds of groups leading  
11 the charge on the important issues of today from  
12 immigration rights, racial equity, health and  
13 education to housing, hunger and policy and advocacy.  
14 These groups provide crucial community-based services  
15 that are lifelines to New Yorkers. These  
16 organizations are trusted particularly by individuals  
17 living in communities that are traditionally under-  
18 counted in the Census, high immigrant population,  
19 non-English speaking, vulnerable populations, people  
20 dealing with homelessness and people living in  
21 illegally divided apartments. It has been vital for  
22 New York City and the State to invest significant  
23 resources in 2020 Census effort and to work hand-in-  
24 hand with these non-profits, and we are grateful that  
25

1 \$60 million have been committed by our state and city  
2 including \$40 million for our city alone to outreach  
3 and education efforts.  
4

5           GEORGE SHAY: So, at CRE we are currently  
6 developing training materials including a resource  
7 guide to help CBOs support a complete citywide Census  
8 count. Beginning later this fall, CRE will conduct a  
9 number of Census 101 trainings focusing on why the  
10 Census matters and how organizations can contribute  
11 do building awareness and education, and later we  
12 will also hold a series of Census 201 trainings to  
13 help organizations interested in doing outreach and  
14 activation work. These trainings will be open to any  
15 CBO members of the local Complete Count Committee,  
16 faith-based organizations, local libraries in the  
17 city will be free. To find out more about these  
18 trainings you can go onto our websites and we'll be  
19 emailing the network for more details. In  
20 conclusion, we cannot stress enough the importance of  
21 securing an accurate count. The census will impact—  
22 impact us for the next decade. It will impact all  
23 kinds of funding and resources going to a non-profit  
24 sector, and by investing in the non-profit sector at  
25 this time it's critical um, and—and we are ready to

1 support our partners in that effort. Thank you so  
2 much.  
3

4           BEN WEINBERG: Good afternoon, Chairs  
5 Menchaca, Cabrera, and Cohen, and distinguished  
6 members of the New York City Council. My name is Ben  
7 Weinberg and I am the Policy and Program Manager at  
8 Citizens Union. I tried to make it as short as  
9 possible because the lack of time, and, um, your  
10 great background material that covers many things as  
11 well. Citizens Union also serves and the Steering  
12 Committee of the Statewide Coalition, New York Counts  
13 2020. So, we want thank you for this opportunity to  
14 speak. First of all, I want to thank you for the  
15 unprecedented commitment that the City Council, the  
16 Speaker and the Mayor have made towards the Census  
17 both your pledge of \$40 million as well as your  
18 continued advocacy around the Census most recently to  
19 allow the hiring of non-citizens by standby (sic)  
20 census workers. It's really unparalleled in New York  
21 City history, but we also want to mention that as  
22 much as the city has led on this issue, the state has  
23 failed to follow suit. Appointments were severely  
24 delayed to the State Complete Count Commission. The  
25 process took a month longer than expected, and

1 although the Commission has already released a solid  
2 report, no concrete steps have been made to allocate  
3 the \$20 million we fought to secure. Therefore, our  
4 recommendation are as follows: First of all, urge  
5 Governor Cuomo and the New York State to allocate  
6 funds immediately. A sizeable portion of those funds  
7 should be distributed to CBOs throughout the state,  
8 which are best suited to ensure that hard to count  
9 communities are indeed counted. Other budgeted-  
10 budgeted allocations should be made for census work  
11 by the state including public education and outreach,  
12 media buys, printing, millions, et cetera. So, we  
13 really urge you to put as much pressure as possible  
14 to ensure the Census rises in importance among  
15 leadership in Albany, and number 2, embrace New  
16 York's non-profit community. Already several hundred  
17 organizations have mobilized around the Census, but  
18 to effectively harness the power of these groups we  
19 have to have clear and accurate information about  
20 what the city is planning to do and what resources it  
21 will provide just so the community groups will know  
22 where to fill in. And number 3 I'll do it very  
23 shortly, put out the information as quickly as  
24 possible . We all know that planning a successful  
25

1  
2 outreach campaign takes time to design and produce  
3 materials to recruit volunteers, to establish  
4 connections and the more time we take with it the  
5 harder it will be. So, we request basically to do it  
6 as fast as possible. Thank you for the opportunity  
7 to speak.

8 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you. Thank  
9 you so much.

10 Good afternoon [off mic]

11 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: If you could turn  
12 the mic on, please. Thank you.

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: It's the red light?

14 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: The red light, the  
15 red button.

16 AMIRIA ALGODEGA: So, I saw it.

17 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: There you go.

18 AMIRIA ALDODEGA: My name is Amiria  
19 Algodega. I'm the Associate Vice President of  
20 Strengthen NYC at the United Way of New York City.  
21 We thank the New York City Council for your support  
22 and investment in the city's non-profit sector to  
23 help ensure a complete and accurate count in New York  
24 City during the 2020 Census. For 80 years the United  
25 Way of New York City has worked to support vulnerable

1 New Yorkers throughout the five boroughs. Our  
2 mission is to mobilize communities to break down  
3 barriers and build opportunities that improve the  
4 lives of low-income New Yorkers for the benefit of  
5 all. We partner with community-based organizations,  
6 schools, businesses, government agencies—and  
7 government agencies to address immediate and long-  
8 term needs around education, and financial stability.  
9 We believe that supporting children and families with  
10 the line interventions will accelerate academic  
11 achievement and progress toward self-sufficiency for  
12 those families and entire communities. Unite Way of  
13 New York City's involvement and the planning and  
14 implementation of the Census is to ensure that  
15 there's a fair and accurate count for New Yorkers.  
16 One of our goals is to build the capacity of  
17 community-based organizations to engage hard to count  
18 population across hard to count communities in New  
19 York City. Another goal is to drive alignment across  
20 multiple sectors who play a role in the 2020 Census,  
21 and our third goal is to increase civic engagement  
22 and strengthen local leadership in low-income  
23 communities, and communities of color for the Census  
24 2020 effort and for other future civic engagement  
25

1 efforts. United Way has collaborated with Hester  
2 Street Collaborative and the New York Immigration  
3 Coalition to develop a set of community asset NOCS  
4 for hard to count communities. These maps can be  
5 used as a resource by community-based organizations,  
6 government partners and funders in planning and  
7 implementing their efforts in hard to reach  
8 communities. Several maps for Councilmanic Districts  
9 2, 9, 17, 28, 37, 38 and 49 have been shared with the  
10 Council and others [bell] are in development. In  
11 conclusion, we want to thank the Council for their  
12 investment to ensure a complete and accurate count  
13 emphasizing to count populations across the city. We  
14 believe that investing in organizations that have the  
15 trust of hard to count populations was the right  
16 place—was the right place to start, and we think you  
17 for your continued partnership?

18  
19 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you. I love  
20 that transition.

21 MARIAN RUTH: Good afternoon. I am Marin  
22 Ruth with the Asian Americans Federation. The  
23 Federation is the only officially designated census  
24 information center by the U.S. Census Bureau focused  
25 on the Asian communities here in the Northeast.

1  
2 Asians are the fastest growing population in the  
3 city, growing from 1.17 million to 1.35 million from  
4 2010 to 2018. To receive their fair share of  
5 resources it's important that members of our  
6 community fully participate in the 2020 Census. We  
7 commend the city Council for pay attention to this.  
8 There are few barriers. Actually, most of the  
9 barriers have already been addressed by folks and  
10 colleagues before me. There are a few that I want to  
11 highlight that are very specific to the Asian-  
12 American communities that we're working with.  
13 Perceptions of the Census indicate less than  
14 favorable outcomes. Recent census borough studies  
15 found that Asian-Americans were the least likely race  
16 to say they intend to participate in the Census.  
17 With 55% of Asian surveyed planning to respond. The  
18 remaining 45 either do not plan to or aren't sure  
19 yet. The same survey found that Asians were more  
20 concerned data would be used against them, and were  
21 less likely to say that census data actually mattered  
22 in their communities. This is further exacerbated by  
23 the legal fight around the citizenship questions that  
24 those folks have already talked about, and the  
25 challenges are in addition to linguistic barriers

1 faced by the majority of Asian folks who are limited  
2 English proficient, and that comes to between five  
3 Asians across the state and almost half of Asians in  
4 the city being L-E-P. I'm trying to make this very  
5 short. In 2010, Asian-American response rates in the  
6 city jumped from 63% in 2000 to 71% in 2010. Key  
7 differences between the two Censuses were the  
8 Federation's outreach initiatives increased language  
9 support by the Census Bureau targeted media bias in  
10 the Asian community and the Census Bureau's own paid  
11 media and partnership programs. Their  
12 recommendations are similar to my colleagues ensuring  
13 outreach gaps are addressed, making sure [bell] that  
14 pop-up centers are available, monitoring messaging to  
15 make sure it's consistent. One thing that I want to  
16 point out is directing the city's paid media funding  
17 towards language gaps in the Census Bureau because  
18 even with eight new languages being added to online  
19 translated forms and paid media campaigns, none of  
20 the supported languages include the fastest growing  
21 Asian Communities in New York, which happen to be  
22 South Asian. Specifically Nepali, Burmese, Indian,  
23 Bhutanese, Thai, Indonesian, and Pakistani. Because  
24 of the budget cuts the Census Bureau has elected not  
25

1 to purchase any South Asian media ads and so we  
2 encourage you to put some funding towards that.  
3

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Indeed. Thank you  
5 so much and right on point. I'm going to move onto  
6 the next panel, but we are taking note of everything  
7 that you're mentioning in your testimony. Make sure  
8 that we have it so we could follow through. Our next  
9 panel Esmeralda Simmons and Lori Daniel Favors from  
10 Center-from Center Law for Just-for Social Justice;  
11 Susan Esomari (sp?) from the Arab-American Family  
12 Support; Aerial Solanski from UJA-UJA Federation of  
13 New York; Antonio Alocan from Make the Road New York;  
14 Jillian Free from the YMCA of Greater New York, and  
15 we're going to have six of them so you're going to be  
16 tightly together. Amy Torres from CPC, Chines-  
17 American Planning Council, and you could begin just  
18 as soon as you're ready. Whoever is first.

19 ESMERALDA SIMMONS: I'm ready.

20 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Go for it.

21 ESMERALDA SIMMONS: Esmeralda Simmons,  
22 Center for Law and Social Justice, Medgar Evers  
23 College. So, as an attorney this is my fourth  
24 census, and considered to be an expert in this area.  
25 Our recommendation, and it's a very serious

1 recommendation. If legally possible, we'd like the  
2 City Council to schedule a special budget amendment  
3 date early in in November of 2019 so solely for the  
4 purpose of passing the 2020, the Census 2020  
5 appropriations. This single action will greatly  
6 speed up the appropriation, disbursement process, our  
7 results and effective Census 2020 citywide outreach  
8 beginning in weeks rather than months. Basically, we  
9 have 136 days before the Census begins, and in that  
10 time even though money has been awarded, none of that  
11 money has been disbursed to any of the grantees, and  
12 why is that? Because the money occurred after the  
13 regular budget passed, and it occurred after the  
14 September Budget Amendments. So, now we have to wait  
15 until the December budget amendments in order to get  
16 any of the funding that you have appropriated. We  
17 are grateful for the \$40 million. We love what the  
18 city is trying to do, but this is going to be too  
19 little too late. In essence, I have 41. So, I'm just  
20 going to go to the other recommendations. We all—I'm  
21 not going to repeat what's already been said about  
22 city agencies, but nobody has said anything about  
23 requiring and funding contract agencies for the city  
24 to work directly with their constituents. We urge  
25

1 major private entertainment sites like movie houses,  
2 skating rinks, bowling alleys, concert halls, the  
3 Barclay Center, et cetera, Yankee Stadium to serve  
4 there with staff pop-up centers. We already talked  
5 about media, but let's also talk about engaging New  
6 York's numerous and very diverse celebrities. [bell]  
7 Thank you. We have written testimony to also back  
8 our booking. (sic)

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: We really  
11 appreciate it. Thank you.

12 LURIE DANIEL FAVORS: Thank you. Lurie  
13 Daniel Favors General Counsel at the Center for Law  
14 and Social Justice. I would just like to pick up on  
15 where my Executive Director left off. Our primary  
16 focus has been the means to count African descendent  
17 New Yorkers, New Yorkers who are identified broadly  
18 racially as Black, but who may identify as Gamay  
19 (sp?) and Nigerian, Trinidadian, Puerto Rican,  
20 Dominican, so on and so forth. The reason we are  
21 explicit in this definition is because heretofore  
22 there is typically a brush-over when it comes to  
23 looking at the Black community as it pertains to the  
24 fact that that community is actually the least  
25 counted community throughout the five boroughs

1 particularly in the Borough of Brooklyn. One of our  
2 primary concerns is the fact as the least counted,  
3 equitable distribution of resources needs to be a  
4 commitment that is made both by this body and by all  
5 of the partners who are working to ensure the  
6 distribution of census data particularly as one  
7 example the NOCS, which we think is a phenomenal  
8 idea, but our concern is that if this program, which  
9 is a volunteer program is going to rely on the needs  
10 of the Black and Brown community members who are  
11 often times the most economically strapped members of  
12 our New York City community to actually fill in the  
13 services of a volunteer corp, that that has been a  
14 result in the inequitable distribution and sign-up of  
15 volunteers, and we are hopeful that this body and  
16 that all of our strategic partners will be thinking  
17 about how to meet that gap when it does appear. We  
18 also want to be clear that there needs to be an  
19 intentional focus on Pan African communities not as  
20 an aside, but as a group that is considered  
21 equitable—equitably included at the table. For  
22 example, while we are excited to hear about the  
23 outreach to ethnic media, we know that even as the  
24 announcement the press release announcement and the  
25

1 press conference where this phenomenal funding  
2 opportunity in partnership with the city took place,  
3 there were no black press invited. So, we are asking  
4 that as opposed to business as usual, we're asking  
5 the Black community is sort of included in the people  
6 of color realm that we be explicit and intentional  
7 about targeting those specific needs. We would also  
8 ask that as it pertains to the state distribution of  
9 funds, which we are clear this body is not able to  
10 direct, but we would ask that you would join your  
11 voice in calling upon the Governor by perhaps passing  
12 a resolution or seeking some other formal measure to  
13 encourage the distribution not just of those state  
14 funds, but that they be distributed to the community-  
15 based organizations, which contain the trusted voices  
16 which the communities will actually adhere to. Thank  
17 you.

18  
19 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Impressive.

20 ESMERALDA SIMMONS: I'm impressing.  
21 [laughter] Impressive. You got all that in. [laughs]

22 ESMERALDA SIMMONS: I want to say one  
23 last thing. I actually serve in the State Commission.  
24 So, if you have any questions about their operation,  
25 I'll be happy to talk to you.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you, thank  
you. It's so good. Okay.

ARIEL SAVRANSKY: Good afternoon. My  
name Ariel Savransky, and I'm an Advocacy and Policy  
Advisor at UJA Federation. Thank you for the  
opportunity to testify. So, as the Council is aware,  
UJA along with some of our other Faith Partners at  
PWA, Catholic Charities, COPO and the Interfaith  
Center form interfaith Census 2020 Count Coalition.  
Our goal is to bring together faith leaders to raise  
awareness about the importance of the Census and to  
support them in helping their community members  
complete the Census. As Council Member Perkins  
alluded to churches the faith leaders are really an  
important part of their communities, and are going to  
be partners in getting the word out about the Census.  
We have chosen to focus our efforts on 20  
neighborhoods consisting of 32 Census tracts and are  
working on building a toolkit for mobilization, and  
launching an awareness and education campaign about  
the census. As Gale Brewer mentioned, this will  
include seminars. We have gained valuable insights  
from the faith communities who are really immersed in  
their communities and are trusted by their community

1 members and present the following recommendations. A  
2 lot of this has already been mentioned so I'll be  
3 very brief. From the city's testimony it is clear  
4 that the knowledge base of these CBOs and faith  
5 leaders will be taken into account in developing  
6 messaging and deciding which media sources to use to  
7 disseminate information as well as in developing the  
8 NOCS strategy. We would be happy to serve as a  
9 resource in those areas that overlap with the 245  
10 neighborhoods in partnership and separate from the  
11 libraries. Also as Council Member Menchaca  
12 mentioned, there is building widget issue, and it's  
13 really important to translate material in a  
14 culturally competent way as well as in their  
15 appropriate languages. We urge you to communicate  
16 directly with those in hard to count neighborhoods to  
17 expanding—to expand existing translation and ensure  
18 CBOs and faith leaders are involved in this effort.  
19 Lastly, Julie Menin mentioned that the city will be  
20 receiving real time data on the self-response dates  
21 for the Census, and we urge you to think creatively  
22 about ways to open communication between the city  
23 [bell] and faith and CBO partners to help direct  
24  
25

1 resources to those under-counted areas. Thank you  
2 for the opportunity to testify.

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much.

5 CHANEL SAMURAI: Hi. Good evening. My  
6 name Chanel Samurai I'm the Government Relations  
7 Specialist at the Arab-American Family Support  
8 Center. At the Arab-American Family Support Center we  
9 have been strengthening immigrants and refugee  
10 families since 1994. We promote wellbeing, prevent  
11 violence, prepare families to learn, work and  
12 succeed. Our organization serves all who are in need,  
13 but with over 25 years of experience we have gained  
14 cultural and language competency serving New York's  
15 growing Arab, Middle-Eastern. Muslim and South Asian  
16 communities. These communities—communities need  
17 people who know how to communicate to them  
18 linguistically and culturally, and they need people  
19 that they can trust to get out that count. So, we  
20 proposed and we encourage City Council to share a  
21 timely reimbursement plan for those who have received  
22 discretionary funds so that community-based  
23 organizations have the resources they need to do this  
24 critical and timely sensitive matter. We  
25 respectfully request that the city continue to

1 include culturally and linguistically competent  
2 service providers like the Arab-American Family  
3 Support Center in conversations around funding and  
4 resource allocation leading up to the Census so that  
5 we can dedicate appropriate staff and resources for  
6 this critical initiative. We ask that the City  
7 Council advocate to the Census Bureau on behalf of  
8 illiterate community members and those lacking  
9 digital access who will need direct supports from the  
10 trusted organizations who can speak their language  
11 and is actually completing their forms, which they  
12 have indicated that is not allowed. So The Census  
13 Bureau they're saying there's a regulation for  
14 organizations to help constituents fill out the  
15 forms, and we understand that this is around the data  
16 breach, but at the same time our constituents trust  
17 us to be able to help them fill out the forms. So, we  
18 ask that you advocate for that. Thank you so much  
19 for your time and letting us testify.

21 JILLIAN FREE: Good afternoon. Thank you  
22 so much for having us. My name is Jillian Free. I'm  
23 the Census Coordinator for the YMCA Greater New York.  
24 I'm Testifying today to share a little bit about who  
25 we area, what we're doing, and what we need. We are

1 the YMCA of Greater New York, and we serve over 24  
2 YMCA branches in a hundred plus community sites.  
3 Many of our programs and branches directly engage  
4 with the communities often hardest to count such as  
5 young children, immigrants, historically  
6 disenfranchised communities of color and those with  
7 the limited access to broadband Internet. Ensuring  
8 the community members across the city are accurately  
9 counted is a way to safeguard the resources resident  
10 rely upon, and thus we believe it is central to our  
11 wise mission. However, we do—or excuse me. We will  
12 be implementing a citywide strategy, which includes  
13 six targeted branches because we want to be focusing  
14 our limited resources effectively. The six branches  
15 include Bed-Stuy, Flatbush, North Brooklyn, Jamaica,  
16 Flushing and Rockaway. We will also be hosting  
17 community forums and we look forward to partnerships  
18 with many of those in the room. We are also engaging  
19 our New American Welcome Centers, and Early Childhood  
20 Centers as those are place where people already trust  
21 vulnerable populations. We will also be hosting pop-  
22 up sites at our six target branches, and we are in  
23 numerous coalitions an Complete Count Committees  
24 across the city, but why we're here mostly today is  
25

1 to say what we need. We desperately need support  
2 with capacity and funding. May of the CBOs that are  
3 here today and what we have heard from those folks  
4 testifying is that we're looking to CBOs to be  
5 critical in our outreach efforts, but if we look  
6 around the room, I think that we need more attention  
7 to how are CBO's problems being heard, and making  
8 sure that there is resources to capacity expansion.  
9 We need support with communications materials, and we  
10 need to know our agency's strategic plan, and what  
11 the expectations for service can—for providers and  
12 contracts with these agencies [bell] and with that, I  
13 think you sincerely for all of your time and your  
14 commitment to the Census. It is critical.

16 ANTONIO LACON: Hi, Good afternoon  
17 everyone. My name is Antonio Lacon (sic). I am the  
18 Census Coordinator for Make the Road New York, and  
19 just as my colleagues mentioned before there's a lot  
20 of challenges that we have for the 2020 Census, but  
21 in 20—in 2020, we have a chance to make—to make sure  
22 that every New Yorker gets counted, and gets the  
23 funding that they deserve for schools, parks,  
24 hospitals, et cetera. The process won't be easy, as  
25 many will know—many of us representing Make the Road

1 are immigrants from a variety of statuses including a  
2 large population or undocumented folks, and many  
3 would fear after the countless attacks that we had  
4 from the racism administration that we have in  
5 Washington—in Washington, D.C. However, Make the  
6 Road is committed to implementing and organizing  
7 efforts to reach community members particularly in  
8 hard to count areas by providing the necessary  
9 education, and outreach. In conjunction with our  
10 partners in city government and community  
11 organizations across the city we launch a full  
12 fledged outreach effort. We have already begun—began  
13 piloting our outreach in Queen and Staten Island, and  
14 we hope to begin the largescale outreach in this site  
15 and Brooklyn as well. These efforts will include  
16 training and mobilization of our members across all  
17 sites leading organization wide outreach splits and  
18 launching—and launching the door to door and, um, and  
19 canvassing outreach. So, um, and just last year I  
20 think I—we will be mentioning a lot of like language  
21 access, but it's something that we forget I mean even  
22 though we will and Make the Road will be targeting  
23 Latino community. We need to think about also  
24 indigenous languages. So, providing the translation  
25

1 for—for those folks don't particularly speak Spanish  
2 or just the language access across the board, and  
3 again, thank you for the \$40 million we will be  
4 allocating for the Census outreach here in the city.

5  
6 AMY TORRES: Thank you, Chair Cabrera and  
7 members of the City Council. My name is Amy Torres.  
8 I'm the Director of Policy at CPC, the Chinese  
9 American Planning Council. CPC is the nation's  
10 largest social services organization for Asian-  
11 Americans bridging social services to social change  
12 for over 60,000 low-income immigrant and Asian-  
13 American, Pacific Islanders each year. A number of  
14 my colleagues and our partners have already pointed  
15 out the urgency of the Census so I'm just going to  
16 jump quickly to the need with AAPI communities, and  
17 then our recommendations. AAPI is rated the fastest  
18 growing racial group nationally, and in New York  
19 State between 2000 and 2010. New York remains one of  
20 the top states for Asian Americans and Pacific  
21 Islanders second only to California and here in New  
22 York City we heard—we hold 70% of the total statewide  
23 population, and so this fast growth means that many  
24 of the AAPI New Yorkers that live here are least  
25 familiar with the census due to them being new and

1 recent arrivals. Further, we also serve communities  
2 that hold a lot of holdover anxieties from repressive  
3 regimes at home, and then one paired with the anti-  
4 immigrant rhetoric at the federal level, and hate  
5 crimes close-closer to home. We know that AAPIs are  
6 particularly unlikely to fill out the Census,  
7 something that has been validated in the Census  
8 Bureau's own survey of our communities where they  
9 found AAPIs amongst all other immigrant groups were  
10 least likely to be familiar of fill out the Census,  
11 and most likely to think it would be used against  
12 them. So, we sit at several different intersections.  
13 We know children 0 to 5 are least likely to count.  
14 For Asian-American children living in poverty, 96%  
15 live with an immigrant parent. So, we know that  
16 under-count is likely. So, we encourage an equitable  
17 distribution of the CUNY awards that are going out.  
18 We know that over the past few years the amount of  
19 funding for AAPI led organizations has grown, but the  
20 number of those organizations has shrunk. We also  
21 urge that the Council advocates for income waivers  
22 for temporary Census jobs. We know that it's going  
23 to take people [bell] from the communities to drive  
24 the count in the communities, but if people are  
25

1  
2 facing a benefits cliff, we urge the Council to do  
3 something similar as you've done with the SIEP  
4 program where there—that we've would lobby at the  
5 state level for a waiver to remove any temporary  
6 census jobs from counting toward total income  
7 eligibility for programs like SNAP and TANF. Thank  
8 you.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much,  
10 and I think in the ten years that I've been here I  
11 never had a panel this big. So, you—you hold the  
12 trophy. [laughter] Seven. Alright, with that, the  
13 last, but not least. Corrine Griffin, Aniqa Nawabi  
14 from Muslim—from the Muslim Community Network; Avi  
15 Greenstein from Borough Park Jewish Community  
16 Council; Sabrina Hargrave from Brooklyn Community  
17 Foundation; Juan Wilson Ross, NALEO Educational Fund,  
18 and Greg Waterman from G-1 Quantum. [background  
19 comments/pause] If you could begin. If you could  
20 turn the mic on. Thank you. Thank you so much.

21 ANIQA NAWABI: Thank you. Good  
22 afternoon. My name is Aniqa Nawabi. I'm the  
23 Executive Director of the Muslim Community Network a  
24 civic education based, faith-based organization  
25 representing the Muslim community in New York City. I

1 just quickly want to start off with a few facts.

2 Muslims make up around 1.1% of the U.S. population

3 and around 8 to 9% of the New York City population,

4 which is around almost a million members in New York

5 City. Muslims are also extremely diverse. They come

6 from around 75 different countries and they make up

7 every single ethnic group, African-American, Black,

8 White, Asian, and Latino. Muslims in New York City,

9 67% of New York City's food vending services are

10 Muslim, and 40% of taxi drivers in our city are

11 Muslim, and collectively we have a buying power of

12 around \$17 billion contributing to New York City's

13 economy on a yearly basis. By 2040, Muslims will

14 replace Jews as the nation's second largest religious

15 group after Christians. So, so much to say that

16 Muslims are an extremely growing population here in

17 the city, and nationally as well. However, we are

18 also facing a lot of barriers, and in terms of the

19 Census count, we face a particular challenge, which

20 is around two issues: Language barriers as one.

21 Given the breadth of diversity in the Muslim

22 community, we ask City Council to allocate funds and

23 resources to ensure that language access is available

24 in Arabic, South Asian languages, Bangladeshi, Urdu,

25

1 Benjabi that can serve the Muslim community as well  
2 as another challenge that the Muslims community face  
3 is surveillance. Although the Census Bureau  
4 employees are trained and obligated to maintain  
5 respondents' confidentiality, the recent increase in  
6 negative political rhetoric as well as government  
7 surveillance, post 9/11 may impact Muslim response  
8 rates in 2020. So, I want to see-we would like to  
9 recommend and advocate for the City Council to ensure  
10 that surveillance issues, the travel ban, all of  
11 those issues don't impact the Muslim vote, and to  
12 trust community organizations like ours who encompass  
13 a diverse group of Muslims in the city to be the go-  
14 to organizations when it comes to reaching out to the  
15 community. So thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much,  
18 and I-I forgot to mention that Council Member Espinal  
19 is joining us. He was here, and so I want to  
20 recognize him.

21 ANIQA NAWABI: Sure.

22 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yes, thank you.

23 SABRINA HARGRAVE: Hello. I'm Sabrina  
24 Hargrave. I'm here representing two different roles.  
25 I'm Program Officer at the Brooklyn Community

1 Foundation, and I'm also in the Steering Committee of  
2 the New York State Census Equity Fund. So, I am the  
3 philanthropic representative today. So, the Brooklyn  
4 Community Foundation works within the hardest count  
5 county—hardest to count county, and we partnered with  
6 Brooklyn Borough Hall to start the Brooklyn Complete  
7 Count Committee, and have distributed over \$100,000  
8 to local CBOs to increase the count in 2020. As part  
9 of my work at the Census Equity Fund we raised and  
10 are distributing of \$3 million statewide, and before  
11 local grant makers ban together to give away over  
12 \$700,000 to local CBOs here in New York City. So, as  
13 you can tell, our philanthropic efforts are not  
14 enough, and even with additional monies in New York  
15 City funding, critical gaps will remain unless  
16 addressed rather quickly. Smaller CBOs often working  
17 with hardest to count pockets of our city may be  
18 largely left out of the current city granting cycle.  
19 These organizations are the most trusted and  
20 embedded in their communities and grant limitations  
21 including the Three Payment Plan, will exclude many  
22 from applying. Borough halls have also been left out  
23 of funding, and coordinating with, and while census  
24 work has been occurring in Brooklyn, it remains  
25

1  
2 under-staffed, and without the financial resources to  
3 assist it—assist members of the Complete Count  
4 Committee. Lastly, I recognize that the NOCS are  
5 planned, but it's November and we still don't know  
6 many details. We are afraid that there's unnecessary  
7 duplication of efforts that will be happening as a  
8 result, and we need to be aware that it is November  
9 this week and it is getting cold outside, and we need  
10 to start knocking as part of the NOCS effort. So,  
11 things need to be happening ASAP. Thank you for  
12 your time.

13 PHAREIN GRIFFITH: Good afternoon. My  
14 name is Pharein Griffith and I'm here as a resident  
15 for the Harlem Community, and I also serve as Co-  
16 Chair for Outreach and Organizing for New York Counts  
17 2020. Thank you for letting me testify today, Chair  
18 and members of the Council Committee. First, I  
19 wanted to speak about the lack of outreach in the  
20 Harlem community. As we know, Central Harlem is a  
21 hard to count community here in the Borough of  
22 Manhattan, and there seems to not be any outreach  
23 targeting that community. Through the Census Bureau  
24 itself, they have been very visible up in Harlem.  
25 They've been conducting presentations, job

1 recruitments events, which is only right because they  
2 are the administrators of the survey. However, we  
3 have learned to find out that enumerators that worked  
4 in the past with the Census Bureau haven't completed  
5 a Census, they haven't completed the Census for their  
6 own households. Wo, we want to know what internally  
7 is the Census Bureau going to do to make sure that  
8 their staff is also completing the survey. As far as  
9 the elected officials in the Harlem community, they,  
10 too, have been doing job recruitment. However, they  
11 have been doing no public facing messaging on the  
12 importance of residents in Harlem completing the, um,  
13 upcoming 2020 Census given the fact that the data  
14 from the Census will affect--affect them in--as it  
15 pertains to the redistricting process? As to the New  
16 York City Census Office, there's a lack of outreach  
17 in the Harlem community on April 1<sup>st</sup> on Census Day of  
18 Action for the count-off for 2020 on April 24<sup>th</sup>  
19 Census in your neighborhood, there was no train  
20 stations tops from the city that was going to be  
21 targeted for outreach. Out of the 13 train stations  
22 in Central Harlem, which is a hard to count  
23 community, there was--there were not one train station  
24 on their list to outreach into the community with  
25

1 this new program that they're doing, which is totally  
2 unacceptable in the hard to count community. The  
3 CBOs as trusted voices in the Harlem community they  
4 haven't been able to do the public fund—the public  
5 awareness that they need to do due to the lack of  
6 funding, and I just want to just close by saying that  
7 it seems that everybody is waiting to see what the  
8 city is going to do before they make their move, and  
9 I think the city's office is a year behind schedule  
10 when it comes to hard to count communities. Thank  
11 you.

12  
13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much.

14 JUAN IGNACIO ROSA: Thank you. Good  
15 afternoon. Thank you so much to Chairman Cabrera,  
16 Chairman, Cohen, also Chairman Menchaca for calling  
17 this important hearing. My name is Juan Ignacio  
18 Rosa. I am the Northeast Director of Civic Engagement  
19 with NALEO Educational Fund. NALEO, the National  
20 Association of Latino Elected and Appointed Officials  
21 has been having an office in New York for the last 23  
22 years. We have staff here in the city working on  
23 naturalization services, a Census outreach and other  
24 areas of civic engagement. This past year we  
25 launched Hazte Contar, which means Make Yourself

1 Count, and as Haze Contar make me count, which are  
2 our campaigns to drive Latinos to participate in the  
3 2020 Census, and NALEO has vast experience working  
4 the Census from the Year 2000 to early in 2019, our  
5 CEO and other members of our staff have served on  
6 various advisory roles, and various advisory  
7 committees in the U.S. Census Bureau, and through  
8 that we have gained a lot of experience and—and  
9 expertise and what works to get people to regard a  
10 census. Our written testimony contains a lot of  
11 recommendations specifically based on outreach to the  
12 Department of Education. Research that we conduct  
13 the last year, showed that people who speak for the  
14 children of our schools are among the key messengers  
15 on Census, the most trusted messengers for Latinos in  
16 the nation. So, we—our—our testimony will  
17 concentrate on the Department of Education  
18 concretely. The city right now has 247 community  
19 schools, which are paired with community-based  
20 organizations that can be natural champions on  
21 census. So, our testimony is really concentrated on  
22 how do we get schools in the school system to be  
23 prepared for Census outreach in 2020? Thank you.

1  
2                   GREG WALTMAN: Good afternoon. Greg  
3 Waltman G-1 Quantum Clean Energy Company. I'm just  
4 following up with the Council regarding several  
5 proposals obviously Census based issues similar where  
6 you have the state kind of blocking up I guess, what  
7 is it \$40 million so their program can get started.  
8 Similarly, with respect to the border wall, superior  
9 bid was submitted for solar application, which would  
10 more than pay for the wall and itself in its first  
11 year of operation. It's not only that. It's that  
12 energy is then exported to for cheaper, not only  
13 stabilizing energy prices in the United States, but  
14 Mexico as well, and similarly in reapplication  
15 Guatemala, Israel, Palestine, and moving onto Yemen,  
16 Saudi Arabia where you have walls that have been  
17 created out of animosity, and division now having the  
18 opportunity to redirect the narrative and  
19 conversation around that, and as the city still has  
20 Fiscal and budgetary gaps with respect to all sorts  
21 of different types of program, you know, it's-it's  
22 only but appropriate now for the City Council to  
23 address Attorney General James and the type of 28 CFR  
24 5117 legal context essentially advising along the  
25 lines of special election so that Andrew Cuomo can

1 see justice for not only the fraud that has been  
2 executed against my colleagues but myself and the  
3 State Representatives along with him the value based  
4 construct can be held accountable in the proper  
5 judicial context. I just want to reiterate to you  
6 that this is several months going on, the fiscal  
7 budgetary gaps that have been mentioned and discussed  
8 in quite length by the City Council have still  
9 remained, and contracts generated from this solution  
10 is a superior course of action not only for the State  
11 of New York, but [bell] the United States in its  
12 totality. So, as the thirst for social media and  
13 users, the fire inside of that—the advent of that new  
14 innovation of social media as that seeks to unseat  
15 not only the United States hegamonically speaking,  
16 um, these superior courses of action still remain to  
17 reseat the United States as the global hegemon. So, I  
18 just want to end at that, and I really appreciate you  
19 bringing this matter to the Attorney General, his  
20 attention so the matter can be addressed. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you for  
23 everyone joining us today. I want to thank our Co-  
24 Chairs Council Member Menchaca and also as always  
25 Council Member Yeger, the one that always stays to

1 the very end, the one you could always count on, and  
2 I want to say to the CBOs we heard you loud and  
3 clear. You need your funding, you need it right away.  
4 It is to filtrate to the smaller organizations as  
5 well. It has to be as grassroots as possible. Thank  
6 you so much, and thank you for bearing with us today  
7 in the manner-manner that we expedited this, and I  
8 want to thank also the staff for the great and  
9 wonderful work that you made it possible for this  
10 hearing to take place, and as we move forward, and  
11 with that, we conclude today's hearing.  
12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 3, 2019