CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----- X

October 16, 2019 Start: 1:08 p.m. Recess: 2:07 p.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Francis P. Moya

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Antonio Reynoso

Barry S. Grodenchik

Carlina Rivera

Donovan J. Richards Rory I. Lancman

Stephen T. Levin Laurie A. Cumbo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Raymond Levin Fleet Center Inc.

Benny Benaker Lesser Group

Ed Brown
Team Brown Consulting

Bruce Jacobs Coalition of the Rockaways

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

STEVEN SIDOWSKI: This is a test.

Today's date is October 16 of 2019 on the Committee on Zoning and Franchises, recorded by Steven

Sidowski.

CHAIRPERSON: [gavel]

UNIDENTIFIED: Quiet, please.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Good morning and welcome to the meeting of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I'm Council Member Francisco Moya, the chairperson of this subcommittee, and today we are joined by Council Members Grodenchik, Levin, Richards, Reynoso, and Lancman. If you are here to testify please fill out a speaker's slip with Sergeant at Arms, indicating your full name, the application name or the LU number, and whether you are in favor or against the proposal. Regarding the 25 Central Park West proposal on today's agenda, I note that the council is in receipt of a letter, ah, of a written statement from the applicant that the application has been withdrawn pursuant to Council Rule 11.60-B, the preconsidered LU number C19039ZMM for the 25 Central Park West proposal is hereby withdrawn. I now call a vote to file the preconsidered LU items number C190390ZMM for the 25

downtown Brooklyn district as well as a related

25

Center Inc. You are a panel unto yourself.

25

RAYMOND LEVIN: All right, and then I've got to figure out how this works, too. OK. Good afternoon.

COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand. State your name for the record. Please state your name for the record.

RAYMOND LEVIN: Raymond Levin.

COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, and you will answer all questions truthfully?

RAYMOND LEVIN: Yes, sir. Good

afternoon. I'm Raymond Level, special senior counsel

at the law firm of Herrick Feinstein. We represent

the Lesser Group, which is doing business as Fleet

Center Inc., the applicant for a zoning map amendment

to allow development of a 14-story office building on

Fleet Place in downtown Brooklyn. Our appearance

here today was preceded by multiple meetings with

local stakeholders, including our neighborhoods at

University Towers and Ingersoll Houses, the Service

Workers Union, the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership,

Community Board 2's land use committee, among others.

We believe this outreach was part of the reason that

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

there was no objection of any of the three ULURP public hearings, community board borough president and City Planning Commission, although there was someone from Rockaway, Queens who testified against us at the City Planning Commission. Nevertheless, the planning commission adopted a zoning map amendment that differed from our proposal, our proposed building of 14 stories, reducing it to nine stories. Ah, where are we. And from approximately 200,000 square feet to approximately 130,000 square feet. We are taking the opportunity of this hearing to outline the effects of this cutback. The black line on the rendering that's up on the screen shows the impact of the City Planning's action. The part of the building above the black line is no longer viable under the C6-1 zoning. Our site is surrounded by large buildings. On this slide you can see outlined in blue the location of the site of our proposed building and the surrounding development. Our proposed building had, our proposed 14-story building, which had fewer stories than those buildings surrounding it, was further shortened to nine, as you can see on this slide, the height of our building versus the buildings surrounding us and

1

24

25

AND FRANCHISES 2 their relative number of floors. Rezoning also reduced the floor space that we could build by some 3 70,000 square feet. This slide shows the floors that 4 5 can no longer be constructed. So why does this 6 matter? The Lesser Group owns approximately 40 7 buildings in New York City and 20 of those are in Brooklyn. Nearly all house commercial and community 8 facility uses. You can see that from this list, a 9 selected list of some of their tenants in their other 10 buildings in Brooklyn. The kind of uses that are in 11 12 their buildings enhance communities. Less space means less opportunity for union jobs, less support 13 14 for not-for-profit tenants, less opportunity for uses 15 desired by the local community, fewer construction 16 jobs and opportunities for M/WBE and less potential for preferential rents. We respectfully request that 17 18 the City Council's Zoning and Franchises Subcommittee of the Land Use Committee recommend reinstatement of 19 the originally requested C6-4 zoning map amendment 20 which we contend benefits the community, does not 21 2.2 overwhelm Fleet Place, and provides space for 280 23 additional jobs. Thank you very much. I also have a

statement from the head of the Downtown Brooklyn

Partnership. Unfortunately, she could not remain

University Towers complex, which given that that

complex has sold its development rights is not going

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

to be redeveloped and therefore that light and air which is between our building and the first building in University Towers isn't going anyplace. The other, I can also mention that One Willoughby Place, I think is the name of the building, on Albee Square, is 36 stories on a 50-story street, and there are a number of others that, that we can talk about. So we believe that this building, which is going to have small office space, which is needed in downtown Brooklyn, if Regina had been here she would talk about that extensively, that it fulfills a need and would not overburden Fleet Place. At one point in the history of this area in 2004 there was a zoning change which, ah, had a 475-spot parking garage with its entrance and exit on Fleet Place and that change passed muster from an environmental review point of view. So for a number of reasons we do disagree with City Planning and those are the reasons why.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: The C6-1 zoning would permit a 6-FAR commercial development instead of a 10-FAR commercial development. Would you still intend to build an office building under C6-1?

RAYMOND LEVIN: Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

1415

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And your original development proposal also included a school. Can you explain why the school was dropped out of the proposal?

RAYMOND LEVIN: There were a number of At the time, City Planning, which seems to continue to believe that this building is too dense, said it was too dense. So one of the reasons why the school, which would occupy six stories, was of concern, with City Planning being concerned about density. The second reason City Planning was concerned that if we had the school we couldn't do a loading dock. They were concerned about school buses parking on that street. There were a number of issues that were of concern, and that certainly isn't the only reason. Between the School Construction Authority and our client the school was sort of shoehorned into the space and at the end of the day they just couldn't, couldn't come to an agreement. So there were a number of issues where the school couldn't be done. And by not having the school we were able to put in the loading dock that was required. We were able to reduce the density of the site from 21 stories to 14. So I guess at that point

2.2

we felt that we had addressed some of the concerns,
obviously not all.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: All right. I'll turn it over to the Majority Leader.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so much, Chair Levin, and Mr. Levin. I wanted to dignity deeper into the conversation around the daycare. This is a conversation that we've had at length and a back-and-forth and a lot of work to try to resolve this issue. So while many of these questions have happened in meetings, I'll be asking you some of the same questions because we need the answers on the record publicly. So to the best of your knowledge the BCS Daycare Center services the community in the area. Are you aware of other daycares in that immediate areas that specifically service Walt Whitman, Ingersoll, and Farragut?

RAYMOND LEVIN: I'm unaware, but I have not investigated as to whether there are or aren't, so.

 $\label{eq:majority leader cumbo: ok, well, we have.} \\$

RAYMOND LEVIN: I'm sure you have.

2.2

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So the reason why
I ask that question because this is a very serious
issue in our community because the Walt Whitman,
Ingersoll, and Farragut Houses primarily use that
specific daycare center for their daycare needs. So
let's do a little bit of the history. How long has
the BCS Daycare Center occupied the building?

RAYMOND LEVIN: Ah, I think our client acquired the building in the '90s. I believe they have been there for at least 20 years, yes.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And are you committed to making sure that the daycare center can return to the new building when it is completed?

RAYMOND LEVIN: Yes, we've indicated at all of those hearings I mentioned and today that we will accommodate them back into the new building should they desire to come back, you know, if they haven't found a long-term home and desire to come back they can come back.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Let me ask you this question in another way. How much is the daycare center paying currently for square footage in the building at this time?

2.2

RAYMOND LEVIN: I believe that their, their current rent, ah, is what I was told is \$15 a foot.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: When the building completed what is the offer that you have made for their ability to return to a similar size space?

RAYMOND LEVIN: As, as far as I, as far as I understand it, one, they're not looking for a similar-size space. The current space is over 20,000 feet. Ah, they're looking for about 12,000 feet, and I don't believe that there has been a discussion of what the rent would be at that point.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So that question that you don't have the answer to, therein lies as some would say the devil in the details. While they might be welcomed back, the square footage in terms of how much they would have to pay for rent costs could preclude them from actually returning and being able to come back into the building once it is completed.

RAYMOND LEVIN: Well, I think that my client is committed to seeing them come back if they desire to come back. What that rent would be would be something that would be acceptable to both them

2.2

and us. And what that, what that is, I don't know what it is at this point.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Well, as you said you think your client, therein lies another devil in the detail. This is something that we really have to know. Is it a commitment or is not a commitment in terms of their ability to come back, and just the desire to say we want them to come back we have to make sure that they can come back because they can financially afford to. I think you're going to be joined at this time.

BENNY BENAKER: Hi, good afternoon. My name is Benny Benaker and I'm with the Lesser Group. Just to answer the question what Majority Leader Ms. Laurie Cumbo is asking about the future rent when the tenant will eventually come back, we're ready to commit to a number of about 15% lower than the market value.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Can you do the math for me, as what you consider to be the market value? What would be the market value? And then someone do the percentage calculation for me.

BENNY BENAKER: It's hard to say what, what the market value is going to be when we're done

1

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 with the building, but plus or minus, let's say the number is now about, for a brand-new building, let's 3 say \$50. We're ready to do between, let's say, 4 between \$40 and \$42, \$43 a foot.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So then the answer to my original question was are you committed to having the daycare return back to the building and at that cost they would not able to afford to come back to the building, so that they would no longer be able to have a home where they have currently had a home.

BENNY BENAKER: The answer to that is we, we're going to work very closely with BCS to be able to bring them back, and my discussions we had in the last week, being that we're talking about relocating and possibly bringing them back for temporary space, or non-temporary space, I know that in other area, in other addresses that we gave them they are willing to pay between \$40 and \$45. That's why I'm ready to say that we could work with that, with those numbers as well.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Let me just say So I'm a mom and I have a 2-year-old who is in daycare. And so prior to getting elected I never

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

really understood in real terms the importance of location of a daycare center to your work balance personal life. So where that particular daycare is located, everyone from the Walt Whitman and Ingersoll houses can come up the block, drop their child off, and head right to the train station to be able to go to work. And while that might seem like a small nuance that that has the ability to take place, that someone wakes up, drops their child off, and goes to the train, we really can't underestimate the importance of that ability to educating a child, a parent feeling safe, their ability to go to work on time and get there and to come back in a reasonable amount of time, do their grocery shopping, and go So the interruption of that is something that will have a major impact on that particular community if that service is not provided. While I hear the need for office space in downtown Brooklyn and we want to have more office space and we want to be offer all of these different things, an issue like daycare is something that is also needed, and I'm sure individuals that will be coming to work there are also going to need daycare. So this is an issue that is particularly important to me and we have to

2.2

find a solution to this before we head to a vote on
this, because unfortunately you have a mom that has a
2-year-old and is the majority leader in the City
Council of a project that could potentially wipe out
a daycare center and I can't allow that to happen.

BENNY BENAKER: I agree.

RAYMOND LEVIN: OK.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: You both agree, it seems. And you want to say how much you agree at the same time. It's OK.

RAYMOND LEVIN: I think we've said what we can say at this point on, on your concern about the daycare center. The daycare center has been at that location a long time, the last four years on year-to-year leases, which, ah, the Lesser Group has kept them there at obviously below market rents, which if they had let any of those leases run out the daycare center wouldn't be there now. So, um, I think that shows commitment on their part to keeping the daycare center, and they're going to try to do that. They've been working with your office and your staff to try and find a reasonable relocation for the several years between the time that they would leave

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

in July and when this site would be redeveloped with this 14-story office building.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Just in layman's terms what I don't understand is how you are planning to build a 14-story office building that is going to be brand new, larger floor plates, higher floors, that you're going to have all of this space but yet the cost of the daycare has to be at what it's at. The numbers would prevent you from keeping them somewhere in the ballpark of what they're currently paying. Will the loss of your anticipated revenue based off of what they were paying would preclude you from actually doing this building? Would this particular project lose money if the daycare was kept somewhere at the level we're, where they're currently at? I don't understand that.

RAYMOND LEVIN: We will have to work with your staff and them on, on a reasonable solution which may or may not include them coming back to this building. There may be another solution out there for the longer term. If there's a space that meets their needs, ah, that can be fixed up for them and, ah, is within this catchment area. If they're going to come back in three years or so we will have to

2 crunch the

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

crunch the numbers and come up with something that makes sense to both parties.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I have a lot of other questions but I'm not even going to go into those because that's really, that's the breaking point for me in this particular project. So between now and this coming before a vote I would encourage you to turn over every rock in the district to figure out how you will sustain the daycare center during the construction period and how to provide a rent that is affordable to a daycare center that has been in the community for a number of years and to find that sweet spot where all of that can come together, because if, there's no up side as far as I'm concerned in terms of building a 14-story office commercial building with there not being a daycare center component to it. So I respect the information that you've brought forward in terms of the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership, but if we also don't recognize the need for daycare services as a part of that, then this is a flawed plan to me. So I look forward to receiving more information in regards to that and this issue is so important to me that I'm asking you to turn over every rock. But I, too, am turning over

2 every rock to try and discover a solution to this.

This is not something that I customarily do in terms 3

of trying to help a developer figure out a solution 4

5 that is mandatory to me. But it's that important to

6 make sure that the daycare remains. There are

7 additional questions about jobs and local hiring that

I'm going to turn it back to my colleague, Council 8

Member Levin. 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

RAYMOND LEVIN: Let me, let me just say, we have contact every real estate broker in downtown Brooklyn to try and find a space. I know that your staff has been looking and we've spoke to public housing authority projects, ah, one of them it seems has a space but it's too small. I mean, we certainly are looking to do that. The second thing about what a reasonable rent would be that is reasonable to us and reasonable to the Brooklyn Community Services is something that our client will take up with Brooklyn Community Services to come up with what that number is, rather than here without them, without a negotiation with them, ah, to see what that, what that number might be for, ah, a space built exclusively for them for their purposes that would be, um, usable and probably more economical to

1

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Services.

2 operate than their current facility, um, and we will have that discussion and we'll get back to you as to 3 whether we've come to an agreement or what the, where 4 5 we are in terms of that. In terms of other spaces, 6 we have tried. Ah, downtown Brooklyn is a, is a 7 pretty hot market at the moment, um, and 15,000 feet, I mean 12,000 feet, is a significant number. There 8 have been a number of buildings, residential 9 10 buildings, built in downtown Brooklyn, and you know looking at this one as being the one to accommodate 11 12 the daycare center, there have been other opportunities. We understand that it's on our site 13 14 and we will try and accommodate it. But we have to

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All right. I look forward to it. Again, I think I've stated how important this is to me and I will also turn it over now to Chair Levin.

have that discussion with Brooklyn Community

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you,

Majority Leader. Oh, sorry, we need to swear you in.

I'm sorry.

COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand and state your name for the record.

2.2

2 BENNY BENAKER: Benny Benaker.

COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm that the testimony and answers you have provided today have been and will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth and you'll answer all questions truthfully? Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: OK, I want to follow up on another zoning question here. C6-4 is a very flexible zoning district that could allow for a 14-story 10-FAR office building that you have proposed, but could also allow for a 30-story 10-FAR hotel or a 34-story 12-FAR residential building. Why, why should we be confident that this zoning would lead to a proposed office building rather than a much taller alternative that's residential, or a hotel?

RAYMOND LEVIN: Well, there's a couple things. First of all, it would have been a lot easier for us if we wanted to do a residential building to ask for a residential zoning district.

It would have saved us a lot of time and effort in the environmental. We wouldn't have had to look at two things rather than one. So that's, first of all, um, there was no reason to, ah, ask for a commercial

1

- 2 | zone if we wanted to a residential building.
- 3 Secondly, the Lesser Group, if you look at, at their
- 4 portfolio of properties, they're not a residential
- 5 developer. They've been in this business a long
- 6 time. That is not something that they, that they do.
- 7 The residential would come with affordable housing
- 8 components. Not anything that they've, that they've
- 9 ever done. So I think those are the reasons why with
- 10 \parallel confidence you could say that this will be a, what
- 11 | they say it's going to be, which is a commercial
- 12 office building. Those are the reasons.
- 13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: That said, there's
- 14 | nothing that would prevent the Lesser Group from
- 15 selling the property to a residential developer under
- 16 circumstances like that.
- 17 RAYMOND LEVIN: Absolutely not.
- 18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah. OK.
- 19 Presumably the concerns that are raised by City
- 20 Planning would be further, those impacts would be
- 21 | increased if, if the was a 34-story, 12-FAR
- 22 residential tower rather than 14-story 10-FAR office
- 23 | building, right?
- 24 RAYMOND LEVIN: Well, from a, from an
- 25 environmental impact point of view there's a negative

2.2

declaration. So, so the, the comments that City

Planning made were counter to some extent to the

negative declaration that the City Planning

Commission adopted, um, which said there were no

light and air impacts and other things like that.

Certainly their concern, which wasn't fully fleshed

out, is, um, I don't know where the resident, whether

the residential development would have more or fewer

cars on the street and things like that, because in

either case, ah, the environmental impact statement,

I should say environmental assessment led to a

negative declaration. So I'm assuming that since

they signed those declarations they stand behind them

and they said that there were no environmental

impacts.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: What kind of office tenants would you envision in this space? Would that include not-for-profit organizations?

RAYMOND LEVIN: Here is, here are the types of users that are in the Lesser Group buildings. This is certainly not by far the full list. But you can see on there there are some notfor-profit medical facilities, um, the FBI I think is

RAYMOND LEVIN: Yes.

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: All right, which, which ones?

RAYMOND LEVIN: All the, all. No, I mean, the borough president raised that, raised that at the hearing. The architect indicated that, that we would be looking at the green roof and, um, to, ah, retain storm water. In terms of the full design and the energy savings through the design of the envelope of the building that will come with the design. It, obviously, will comply with all of the city rules and regulations which, as you know, have increased recently and there are a lot more environmental regulations for development that the city has implemented.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: OK. I'll turn it back over to the Majority Leader.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I have no other questions, and so I thank you for this portion, and I'm sure we're going to call up the next panel.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Also, just one thing I did want to add in support of what our Majority Leader said about the importance of that daycare program. I visited that daycare program very early on in my tenure, you know, it wasn't in my

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

district, but know how important it is to the surrounding community and it has played an important role, and so I support the efforts that she's making.

RAYMOND LEVIN: We, we totally agree the daycare center is important and there should be more than one. There should be a number of them. Some of it has to do with city, with city, ah, you know, contracting, city requirements, you know, what the city contract is willing to allocate to a rental, um, there are a number of things that certainly impact on, on daycare centers and, you know, in this neighborhood there certainly should be more. We don't disagree on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: OK, got you.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I'm, I'm looking at your portfolio and it seems to be about almost 20 institutions here, business, commercial, health, institutional. So as you have such a wide portfolio, some projects are going to be more, ah, financially rewarding than other projects will be. So because you have the breadth of a large portfolio, certain projects, some are going to be a cash cow, some are going to be a little philanthropic. It'll be important for you to see this one more on the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

philanthropic side versus this being a cash cow in your portfolio.

BENNY BENAKER: It's going to be important for us to see this, to serve the community, the need of the community. And the proof is in the pudding. I don't know if there would be another landlord in the last four years would give away something so cheap and almost for free to serve the community.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And I am in full support of that. I think that it's admirable that you kept the rent at the price that you did for so long, and I think that while this particular daycare has serviced the community for over 20 years, um, when you purchased this property and the daycare was there the real estate market for that particular area wasn't so hot and happening as it is now. Still a viable place, but they were there at a time in the community where Brooklyn wasn't the hip hop and happening place and the hottest place on the planet, and now that an organization that has grown with the community, provided services for the community, now that the borough is experiencing growth and development and all of this, it's my role as a City

2.2

Council member to make sure that those original people that were there helping to make the community what it is today are able to thrive and to, and to be a part of the growth and the excitement of Brooklyn, New York. So that's really what it is to me. It's not, you know, it's great that people have been able to be there for as long as they were to take Brooklyn where it is but we need to make sure that we support them in where they're going and I want to support projects that are going to reward people for being there during the difficult times and contributing to the growth of the borough as a whole.

BENNY BENAKER: Thank you.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

much. Next panel. Ed Brown. Team Brown. Jessica Ortiz from 32BJ. Whoever wants to begin.

UNIDENTIFIED: Good afternoon. I'm speaking for one of our members. Unfortunately, he had to go work so he wasn't able to stay. Good afternoon, Council Member Levin and Majority Leader Cumbo. My name is Federico Hernandez and I have been a member of 32BJ for six years. I am here today on behalf of my union to express our support for the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

proposed development at 101 Fleet Place. know, 32BJ is the largest property service union in the country. We represent over 80,000 members across New York City, including over 3600 who live and work in Community District 2. Members like me clean, maintain, and secure office, residential, and school buildings like the one being discussed today. We are happy report that the applicant for this project, the Lesser Group, has made a credible commitment to pay prevailing wages to the future property service workers at this site. A prevailing wage job like mine allows working families in the city to live with dignity. Before I got that job and getting paid the prevailing wage I struggled to support my family. Raising two kids without health insurance and job security was very stressful. Now I have peace of I never worry if I am going to be able to pay my rent. All working families deserve this. the proposed density we estimate that the project will generate nine building service jobs. We know these jobs will provide an important economic opportunity for members of the surrounding community. We urge you to approve this project. Thank you.

2.2

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very 3 much.

ED BROWN: Let me see. Can you hear me?

How you guys doing? Um, chivalry is not dead. I had
to let the lady go first, OK. So, um, how you guys
doing? Ed Brown, Team Brown Consulting. I'm sorry?

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And lady.

ED BROWN: And lady. I apologize,

Council Member. Um, Ed Brown, Team Brown consulting.

If this project is approved I will be working

directly with them and the Ingersoll Tennis

Association, as well as Whitman and Farragut, to

ensure that residents, local people, will work on

this project, and unlike other projects because this

is not a NYCHA project where there is a lease

requirement the opportunities here are more broad and

are more easily able to funnel residents into the

project, and I just want to add something about the

daycare center. It's important to me as well. My

three older children went to that daycare center. So

it means something to me as well.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So I have followup questions. That was actually going to be one of my questions, because you have lived in Ingersoll for

2.2

a number of years and so you understand, ah, the importance of this particular daycare.

ED BROWN: Yes.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Also wanted to say that while it's important to extend to Whitman, Ingersoll, and Farragut, I always have to encourage you to expand that outreach to both Atlantic Terminal as well as Lafayette Garden because they are part of the 35th District and for me I represent my entire district.

ED BROWN: OK.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So I want there to be a pipeline of outreach there as well. How many jobs do you anticipate the construction for the proposed 14-story building would generate?

anticipate until I see the full scope of the project in reference to, um, you know, when it's approved, what's actually approved, and what it's going to entail, and then also dependent on the skill sets that are needed, so I wouldn't be able to give you a number like that until if the project is approved and I sat down with the owner and we went over the different trades that were available at the project,

2 then I would be able to give you a, you know, a
3 ballpark figure of the amount of, ah, slots we can

4 fill.

2.2

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So let me ask you this question. A project vastly larger than the project we're talking about would be BAM South. And you worked on that project.

ED BROWN: Yup.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: How many jobs were generated out of that particular project through your local hiring effort?

ED BROWN: So [inaudible] speak the exact number and I like to, you know, tout this because this is one of our greatest accomplishments, was 37 jobs.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: OK.

ED BROWN: And they're not 37 working at the same time because different trades move at, move at, um, different times, but throughout the entire project 37 and one of our, um, great accomplishments is we have a young man who has never done construction, who has recently returned from incarceration, he started out as a laborer on BAM South and right now even though the project is over

2.2

for us he's now a superintendent on the job and has a permanent job with Two Trees now. He's making like \$70,000 a year. So this is our goal. This is what we try to do. Each project is not going to be the same. But if we have those ambitious young men who understand work ethic, basic work ethic, we work with them and we work with the developer to try to get them not only to work on one project but stay on for other projects and then move to different projects throughout the city.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Can you cite for me another example of a project that you've worked on within the 35th Council District and what was the employment opportunity?

ED BROWN: Within the 35th, um, ah, of course the Ingersoll project. But that was a little difficult because of the lease requirement, you had, you know, the workers had to be on the NYCHA lease in order to get the jobs.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So with that type of restriction in place how many jobs were you able to fill on the Ingersoll project?

ED BROWN: Well, directly probably maybe about seven at the most because, as I said, you know,

2.2

it's not just a lease requirement. NYCHA actually does a background check to make sure that the person who is actually applying for the job is really a lease-holding resident and so, you know, you have a lot of people who say that they're on the lease but once they do the background check and they check and you find out that they're not on the lease, and we, we really don't have any control over that. But Fulton Street, 1081 Fulton Street I believe it was, then the one on Atlantic Avenue that was connected to Cadman, the Cadman Library project with Roy Hudson Companies. We had 16 on Atlantic Avenue. I don't have the exact numbers, but I can get them for you. All you have to do is request them, I'll send them to you.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: OK.

ED BROWN: And, ah, Fulton was a smaller project, so I think we had maybe about, maybe about eight people, maybe nine people at the most on that particular project. It all depends on the size of the project. But another one of our big accomplishments on a larger project was 345 Lafayette [inaudible] we had about 11 people on that project, and, um, to date mainly, mainly most of our workers

2 were placed on

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

were placed on Two Trees projects on Dock Street, we did a lot of workers on Dock Street as well.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So let me just ask. So a project like the Slate project, where you said you were able to have about 11 workers, 11 workers out of what would you estimate would be a total work force?

ED BROWN: On that particular project? Coming and going? Probably maybe about, maybe about 40, maybe 40 to 50. But then, but then, as I said, because we don't provide training as of yet, something we're thinking about doing, a lot of the young men that we work with in the community, sometimes this is their first job. They, you know, they have never worked before, and they really have limited skills. So we'll have, you know, people come in as laborers and if they would pay attention and do what they're supposed to do, you know, they can move and learn another trade. We have one particular young man who came in as a laborer and he became a mason and now he's a master carpenter. So it all depends on the individual and, as I said, there has to be something, we can probably discuss down the road, there has to be some type of training programs

2.2

in place, not just OSHA, so that we can get these guys really prepared before these projects actually come and take place.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So let me ask you this question. I'm going a little bit off topic.

ED BROWN: OK.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: But the individuals that you, it's 37 on this one, it's 11 on this one, it's seven on that one. What happens to the individuals after the project is over and there's not another project just waiting for them that you've got lined up. Where do those workers go?

ED BROWN: Well, what I do if I don't have anything lined up I'll call some people and know and ask them can they do me a favor, do they have anything open right now until I get something, and then I'll, you know, refer people to them that way. But mainly what happens is my telephone blows up on a regular basis. They, if they work more than six months they collect unemployment. If they didn't then my phone is blowing up because they're begging to go back to work. But I'm limited because we really don't have, you know, at the most we maybe have two or three projects going at the same time.

2.2

We're not at the point yet where we have enough projects to fulfill the need right now.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So my final question to you is just as succinctly as you can answer this question because it's a huge question, but as succinctly as possible. With everything that you just described, as far as local hiring and you have made a footprint for your company in the downtown area, what would you need in place to be the local hiring company of the year that's got this thing down to a science...

ED BROWN: [laughs] I like this question.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: That's got local hiring on like down.

ED BROWN: I like that question.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Like you've, you've mastered what it takes to be a local hiring theater in our communities. What essentially would be needed to do that?

ED BROWN: Well, what I would do, what I would need is to sit down with the legislators, present a proposal to show soup to nuts everything from the soft skills to, as I said, entry level training, not advanced training, you know, basic

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

carpentry, bringing instructors, have a location or different locations, and mainly the issue is that when developers come in there are so many, how could you say, um, you heard the word coalitions, so many coalitions that are just grabbing for different There has to be a central situation where sites. when developers come into your district, or any district, sit with this person and this is going to be the person that you're going to in reference to providing the workers, um, I even want to get to the point where I could provide the correct M/WBE contractors as well, 'cause that's also another issue, with getting more M/WBEs involved on these jobs. So basically it's about the legislators and when people come into your districts to say listen, this is what we want, this is who you need to sit down with, and let's come up with a plan and let's make it happen. And then hold me accessible to make sure I'm doing what I'm supposed to be doing and I follow up with you guys so that you guys can see it's effective.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: OK, we'll talk more about it offline.

ED BROWN: OK, I appreciate that.

Because I want to

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I have a lot of questions about that.

> ED BROWN: I appreciate that.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO:

think about this issue as our terms are concluding, of course, not only how it impacts, of course, my district, but how we're able to create the appropriate systems and I guess you could say assembly line, if you will, not the right term, but how do all districts have in place a mechanism or an equation or a rubric for how local hiring is done.

> ED BROWN: Right.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: The same in every district, but with variations based off of the needs of that district. So that's, that's something we have to really get right because a lot of people say I'm a do local hiring, I'm a do local hiring...

> ED BROWN: Right.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And then at the end of the project everyone in the community is saying there were no jobs provided for us.

ED BROWN: Right, exactly.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So we want to obviously change that dynamic.

2.2

down with you, but the last thing I want to say is traditionally it's just been a freefall, you know, people have come in and developed and whoever showed up they just went along with. So, um, yes, there needs to be a reinvention of the wheel, that when you come into a district this is what has to be done.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: OK, thank you.

ED BROWN: OK, thank you. Any more questions?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: There's one more, ah, no, thanks. Thank you very much.

ED BROWN: How's your son, Council Member?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Doing well, doing well, yes. Almost crawling. Very almost crawling.

Um, which I'm not ready for yet. Next, Bruce Jacobs,

Coalition of Rockaway, is that right?

BRUCE JACOBS: Good afternoon everybody, thank you. My name is Bruce Jacobs, Coalition of the Rockaways, supporter of medical and religious freedom, 9/11 First Responder, US Navy veteran, 30 years with New York City Transit. I commend the county, the City Planning Commission, for what they,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

when they said bring down the size. The size, 14 stories, they wanted 21 originally, it's too, on that small street, too big of a building. I also agree that I don't want to see people from the neighborhood thrown out, like the stake here at, from \$15 to \$42 an hour. That's the displacement that the Coalition of the Rockaways and other districts is against. thing of jobs, I tell ya the truth, my organization cares more about union jobs for people for futures. In the Rockaway we don't want a job that the guy works one year and then he don't have no work after that. To my organization and to me personally it's a very important thing, 'cause to go get a regular job, and as I said, I had problems, just say, and then I worked for one year. That's not going to really help me that much. It's gonna help me for that second. Then I might go back to doing bad things because I might want to do it, you know, little things. There's also a big amount of traffic there already. I've, you did develop the neighborhood, the neighborhood's developed. But I don't want to see everybody thrown out of this neighborhood because of high price developers. Anybody could come in front of a commission with a big lawyer and, you know, they

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING 44 1 AND FRANCHISES 2 get approved for everything. Say I want to knock down my house in my neighborhood. Do I have to go 3 4 get a fancy lawyer to do it or is it going to be a 5 thing of caring about your neighborhood? I care about Queens, Brooklyn, New York City completely. 6 7 like I said, I commend the City Planning Commission for keeping into consideration other stores, other 8 people, the quy's talking, there's no guarantee that 9 he's going to keep it as an [inaudible] office 10 building then they can sell it to somebody else. 11 12 There's no quarantee in writing. And if they do and then they put up the 34-story hotel, then it's all 13 14 like the goodness, 'cause you guys have good hearts 15 and mean well. It's going to fall apart because it's 16 already that you go down there, a regular person could hardly get an apartment down there, you know, 17 18 regular earning, you know the prices are so high it's ridiculous. I like development, but the right 19 20 development. Like you said about other districts implicating for jobs, we, in all districts it's a 21 2.2 very important factor. Because without that, if 23 you're going to say in my neighborhood, yeah, and the

daughter not using union apprenticeship programs to

me you need that 'cause that's a future for the

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

people. If you accept it on one job, not, you know, like that, then what about the other jobs that you guys approve for other districts? Like in Far Rockaway we're going for a big thing over there 'cause we want to see the guys get futures and get a career and get training. You know, I personally work with these, you know, unions and trying to work out something. You know, when you get a commitment you have to make sure that it's really there because anybody could sell something. It sounds good. man who was speaking about jobs. Yeah, that's nice, he's, you know, spoke very nice and, you know, good ideas. But he's not the developer. And then you're talking 11 jobs, you're talking 12 jobs, for 14 stories? There gotta be more jobs than that. And 14 stories for Fleet Street is too big. Nine stories. The daycare must be able to come back at 15, at whatever they're paying now. They were in the neighborhood before, this is displacement. bought property with a daycare in it, they knew that they're there. That's like me buying a house with rent control. Yeah, I want that, I want to charge them more when it's worth more money, but what about when it was worth nothing, because I worked on Nevin

23

24

25

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date ____October 27, 2019