CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK -----Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES ----- Х September 18, 2019 Start: 1:40 p.m. Recess: 2:31 p.m. HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Room 16th Floor B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams CHAIRPERSON COUNCIL MEMBERS: Peter Koo I. Daneek Miller Inez Barron Mark Treyger Carlos Menchaca World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 Phone: 914-964-8500 \* 800-442-5993 \* Fax: 914-964-8470

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED) Lacey Talbert [sp?], HPD Andrew Murray Impact Brooklyn

Kate Lemos McHale, Director of Research Landmark Preservation Commission

Anthony Fabre

Yvette Acquire [sp?], New York Resident

Jan Jimenez, New York Resident

Nina Malkin, New York Resident

Lynn Massimo, New York Resident

Maria Roca, New York Resident

Cynthia Felix, New York Resident

Jason Stutz, New York Resident

Linda Acini [sp?], New York Resident

Susan Brown, New York Resident

Simeon Bankoff, Executive Director, Historic Districts Council

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 [background comments] SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a sound check 3 4 for the Committee on-- Subcommittee on Landmarks 5 taking place September 18th, 2019. 16th Floor 250 6 Broadway scheduled for 1 p.m. and being recorded by 7 Israel Martinez. 8 UNIDENTIFIED: Turn it on an get to 9 When you do the -- get to the end of all the work. 10 landmarks--11 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. 12 UNIDENTIFIED: Just not cross--13 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay. We are going to 14 start. Yeah. 15 [gavel] 16 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Good morning. Welcome 17 to the meeting of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, 18 Public Siting, and Maritime Uses. I am Council 19 member Peter Koo. I will be chairing today's hearing for Chair Adams, who is unable to be here today. 20 Ι 21 am joined by Council member Treyger and Council 22 member Miller. Oh, no. Council member Barron. 23 Miller is not here. Today we will begin by voting on 24 15 historic landmark designations and to HPD 25 applications that we heard at our September 4th

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	meeting. The historic landmark designations that
3	include seven historic landmark designations related
4	to the history of the LGBT movement. LU 490, the gay
5	activist alliance firehouse. Former Engine Company
6	Number 13 in Council member Chin's district in
7	Manhattan. LU 491, Café Chino. LU 492, the Women's
8	Liberation Center. And LU 493, the historic landmark
9	designation of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and
10	Transgender Community Center. All of these in the
11	Speaker's district in Manhattan. LU 494, the James
12	Baldwin residents located in Council member
13	Rosenthal's district in Manhattan. And LU 495, the
14	Audrey Law residence in Council member Rose's
15	district in Staten Island.
16	From 1972 to 1987, my district No.
17	Not my district. This is a statement from Council
18	member Rose. And she asked me to read it into the
19	records. From 1972 to 1987, my district was the home
20	of Audre Lorde, who lived that 207 Saint Pauls Avenue
21	with her children and her partner, Francis Craden
22	(sp?). While living there, she wrote some of her
23	most groundbreaking work, including the [inaudible
24	00:04:13] where other people live. She served as
25	poet of New York State and made lasting contributions
Į	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 through her speeches and her writings. I am proud to say this was followed by a vote from the Landmarks 3 Preservation Commission to designate Ms. Lorde's 4 residence as a landmark of LGBT history. 5 That designation is before this committee today and I 6 7 encourage my colleagues to vote I as this is a fitting celebration of Ms. Lorde's contributions and 8 ongoing struggle for LGBT equality. 9 Seven historic landmark designations 10 located in on Broadway below 14th Street in Council 11 12 member Rivera's district in Manhattan. LU 481, the 13 817 Broadway building. LU 482, the 826 Broadway 14 building, now the Stram (sp?) Building. LU 483, the 15 830 Broadway building. LU 484, the 832-834 Broadway 16 building. LU 485, the 836 Broadway building. LU 486, the 840 Broadway building. And LU 487 the 17 18 Roosevelt building. And to additional historic landmark designations. LU 488, the National Society 19 20 of Colonial Danes in the state of New York headquarters located in Council member Power's 21 2.2 district in Manhattan. And LU 489, the first 23 Hungarian Reform Church located in Council member Kallos' district in Manhattan. 24

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES We will also vote to approve pre-
3	considered LU 510, the Bronx Point NCPF [inaudible
4	00:06:51] submitted by HPD pursuant to article 16 of
5	the Journal Municipal Law of New York State for
6	approval of the designation of an urban development
7	action area for property located at 2356 Lot two and
8	72. Block 2539 lot one and parts of lots two and
9	three. And a [inaudible 00:07:31] portion of East
10	150 Street in the Bronx. An approval of an urban
11	development action area project for such area. The
12	proposed action would facilitate new property
13	accessible open space along the Harlem River
14	waterfront as part of a new mixed use development
15	that would include approximately 1044 units of
16	affordable housing. Commercial and community
17	facility space. The project is located in Council
18	member Ayala's district. We will also vote to
19	approve preconsidered LU 511 for the Brownsville
20	South project in Council member submitted HPD
21	pursuant to article 16 of the Journal Municipal law
22	and section 197 C of the New York City Charter for
23	the destination of property located on 47 New Locks
24	Avenue, block 3855, lot 40. 609 dash 615 [inaudible
25	00:09:04] street, block 3628, lot nine and 120 dash
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	122 Liberty Avenue block 3693, lots 22 and 23. In
3	the borough of [inaudible 00:09:23] as an urban
4	development action area. Approval of an urban
5	development area project for such an area and
6	approval sorry. An approval of the disposition of
7	such properties to a developer selected by HPD.
8	Okay. That one here? The project is located in
9	districts represented by Council member Barron and
10	Council member Espinal. All items are supported by
11	their affected Council members. In accordance with
12	the wishes of the affected Council members, I will
13	now call for a vote to approve LU numbers 481, 482,
14	483, 484, 485, 486, 487, 488, 489, 490, 491, 492,
15	493, 494, and 495. And preconsidered LU number 510
16	and 511. Counsel please call the role.
17	LEGAL COUNSEL: Treyger?
18	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.
19	LEGAL COUNSEL: Barron?
20	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be excused to
21	explain my vote?
22	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yes. Please.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.
24	Chair. Just speaking briefly on LU 511, which is the
25	Brownsville South cluster. Part of this development

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING. AND MARITIME USES is located inside of my district and these are small
3	projects and we had some challenges to make sure
4	that, in the end, all of the units that would be
5	built would, in fact, be affordable at the income
6	levels of those who presently live there. so, we are
7	very pleased that, through some negotiations, I want
8	to thank the staff that work with the HPD to come to
9	another adjustment in setting the AMI's for those
10	that would be qualified to apply and I'm very pleased
11	that we're able to say that 56 percent of the units
12	that are going to be built in the district that I
13	represent will be at 50 percent of AMI or below. And
14	that there will be no units at 80 percent and there
15	will be some at 60 and 70 percent of AMI. So I'm
16	very pleased on the work that was done and I want to
17	commend the staff for the work that they did and I
18	vote aye on all.
19	LEGAL COUNSEL: Koo?
20	CHAIRPERSON KOO: I vote aye.
21	LEGAL COUNSEL: By a vote of three in
22	the affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero
23	abstentions, the items are recommended for referral
24	to the Public Land Use Committee and the vote is held
25	open.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay. We will now
3	continue to move on onto another subject. We now
4	move on to public hearings for today. Beginning with
5	LU 527, the [inaudible 00:12:46] designation project
6	approval and deposition approval for 7766 dash 780
7	Mai Tai Avenue to facilitate an affordable housing
8	development containing approximately 59 units in
9	Council member Cornegy's district in Brooklyn. We
10	are joined today by representatives of HPD and the
11	developer. Mrs. Tobar and Andrew Murray. Yeah. You
12	may begin after you identify your No. You have to
13	c
14	LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
15	hands and identify yourselves.
16	LACEY TALBERT: Lacey Talbert, HPD.
17	ANDREW MURRAY: Andrew Murray, Impact
18	Brooklyn.
19	LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
20	the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
21	in your testimony before the subcommittee and in
22	response to all Council member questions?
23	LACEY TALBERT: Yes.
24	ANDREW MURRAY: Yes.
25	CHAIRPERSON KOO: You may start. Yeah.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES LACEY TALBERT: I just want to make sure
3	you all have copies of the presentation and the
4	testimony. We can give to the Sergeant. Okay. Land
5	Use item number 527 is related to a ULRP application
6	regarding the development of three city of and vacant
7	lots at block 1754, lot 19, 20, and 22 in Brooklyn
8	Council District 36 for a project known as 776 780
9	Myrtle Avenue. The application seeks UDAP (sp?)
10	Designation and project approval for the three lots
11	as well as disposition and approval for two of the
12	lots, lot 20 and 22. One of the three lots, lot 19,
13	previously received approval for unrestricted
14	disposition by the Board of estimate and 1981, but
15	was never sold and remained city-owned. 776 to 780
16	Myrtle Avenue is slated for development under HPD's
17	supportive housing loan program or SHLP which funds
18	the rehabilitation and new construction of supportive
19	housing for the home was, people with special needs,
20	and other persons of low income. The development
21	team, Impact Brooklyn, formerly known as the Pratt
22	Area Community Council was selected through a
23	competitive process in 2013, our supportive housing
24	request for qualification. They will provide
25	property management services, as well as act as the

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES supportive services provider. Impact Brooklyn
3	proposes to construct a nine story building with a
4	total of approximately 15 nine affordable rental
5	units, plus the superintendent's unit and ground-
6	floor retail space. Upon completion, the building
7	will contain approximately 45 Studios, a one bedroom
8	units, six two-bedroom units, and one two-bedroom
9	unit for a superintendent. Under the SHLP
10	guidelines, 60 percent or approximately 36 of the
11	units will be affordable for homeless households
12	referred from social service agencies such as
13	Department of Homeless Services, or DHS, and the
14	remaining approximately 23 units will be affordable
15	rental units to be filled through HPD's marketing
16	guidelines. The target incomes for this project will
17	be up to 60 percent of the area median income, or
18	AMI. Supportive housing tenants will pay up to 30
19	percent of their income and rent. Affordable
20	households earning up to 60 percent of AMI or
21	approximately 44,820 dollars for one person to 57,660
22	dollars for a three person household, will pay rents
23	ranging from 843 dollars for a studio till 1290
24	dollars for a two-bedroom. In response to community
25	feedback, and, averaging is being contemplated for
l	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES this project, which would make households between 40 2 percent and 80 percent of AMI eligible or households 3 earning approximately 29,880 dollars to 59,760 four 4 one person to 38,440 dollars to 57,660 dollars for a 5 6 three person household. If income averaging is 7 used, rents will range from 522 dollars for a 40 percent AMIs studio till 1843 dollars for an 80 8 percent AMI two-bedroom. Amenities to be included in 9 the project include supportive services space open to 10 all residents and the building and a shared rear 11 12 courtyard, community room, green roofs, laundry room, and enclosed by a sickles storage, as well as 13 14 approximately 3000 square feet of ground-floor 15 commercial space. In order to facilitate the 16 development of this project, HPD is before the 17 landmark subcommittee seeking approval of Land Use 18 item number 527. And I will turn it over to Andrew from Impact to talk you through the project. 19 20 ANDREW MURRAY: Hello. My name is Andrew Murray. I am a project manager at impact 21 2.2 Brooklyn. Not to delve too far into the details 23 over rupee what Lacey had just mentioned, but, again, 24 this is a project. Three vacant lots on Myrtle 25 Avenue across from the Marcy houses in northern Bed-

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 Stuy. And the project-- Where the developer. We are Impact Brooklyn, formerly the Pratt Area 3 Community Council. For over 15 years, we have been 4 serving the communities, and neighborhoods of Central 5 Brooklyn. We are a community development corporation 6 7 dedicated to fair, affordable, equitable housing. We develop-- offer a myriad of services, some of which 8 are behind me. So, to the project, specifically, as 9 10 Lacey said, it is a proposed nine story building on Myrtle Avenue. It's mixed to use with ground-floor 11 12 commercial. We will be offering on-site social services in the basement. 60 percent will be devoted 13 14 to supportive housing. That will be 36 studio 15 efficiency units. The remainder, minus one 16 superintendent will be lottery appointed units. Again, Lacey had mentioned the estimated rents and 17 18 income. We are considering income averaging, so that would mean, on average, 60 percent AMI, but there 19 20 will be 40 and 80 percent units, as well. Again, I can go into greater detail of the unit distribution. 21 2.2 We have 45 Studios, 81 bedroom units, six two-bedroom 23 units, plus the on-site superintendent. The ground floor commercial space, which is, proximately, 3000 24 25 square feet we are considering a nonprofit social

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
	SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	enterprise tenant. Namely, they will be a café slash
3	comm kitchen space and they are also a workforce
4	development provider, so they will be working for
5	with members of the community ages 16 to 24 who are
6	both out of school and without work. And that tenant
7	currently is Grand Lo Café. They have a space down
8	by Essex Crossing. We will be utilizing several
9	passive house principles, not the least of which is
10	the VRF. Excuse me. My acronyms to get mixed up
11	sometimes. That is the variable refrigerant flow.
12	Also a tightly insulated envelope, you know, to cut
13	down energy costs, create efficiencies. We will also
14	be utilizing several other green components. We have
15	a green roof, white roof, blue roof. We are
16	considering rain gardens in the front of the
17	building. We have a the green roof will be
18	accessible to residents. We have a sunken courtyard,
19	rear yard. We are also considering 35 to 45
20	kilowatts of solar paneling to be placed on top of
21	the roof and we also, of course, as in the on-site
22	social services which will be placed in the basement
23	of the property. We are planning on six to eight
24	staff, but that does not include on-site security,
25	which will be 24/7. We would be offering an
l	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 amenity-- many services, including case management, harm reduction, substance use counseling, and many 3 4 things to help gear the population in a more helpful direction. This is a design-- the site plan, you're 5 6 looking from the top from the Birdseye view of the 7 building. As you can see, there was a green roof. We are currently, again, proposing the roof solar 8 paneling on top of the ninth floor. In the rear you 9 10 have the sunken courtyard and yard, as well. This will be, again, nine stories. It is on three lots, 11 12 75 by 100 square feet total. Here you have images of the seller and ground-floor. As I mentioned, you 13 14 will-- we will be putting the social services in the 15 basement. They will have community rooms. Able to 16 utilize the back courtyard, and as well as the ground-floor which will also be housing the 17 18 commercial tenant which we are proposing, again, will be a café slash commercial kitchen. Lastly, this is 19 20 our project timeline. We were certified in April. We have gone through the processes since we last met 21 2.2 with the city planning commission in late July. We 23 are anticipating ULRP approvals sometime within the next few months and, finally, we hope to close after 24 25 submitting a state tax credit application to the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 housing committee renewal for fall of 2020 and ultimately finishing construction within two years 3 leasing up by fall 2022. And any questions, please 4 do not hesitate. 5 6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much. 7 I'm sorry. I had to go across the street to vote for-- so, I am asking Council member Barron to take 8 over the chair. Thank you. 9 10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Thank you much for your presentation. I just have a few 11 12 questions. I believe you said that 36 units are Studios? 13 14 ANDREW MURRAY: Yes. 15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, the 16 question that I have is to you have the dimensions of 17 the studio apartments? 18 ANDREW MURRAY: Yes. I do. On average, the studios will run 360 square-- net square feet. 19 20 360 for all--CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 360. Okay. 21 2.2 ANDREW MURRAY: And that's of the 45 23 studios total on average. 24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So there are 45 studios? 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 ANDREW MURRAY: 45 in the building, but 3 36--CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 36 are reserved 4 for--5 ANDREW MURRAY: for the supported 6 7 residents. 8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And the other question that I have, then, is which of those units 9 are-- that are one and two family-- two bedroom 10 apartments will be eligible for those who are in 11 12 supportive, as well? ANDREW MURRAY: Uh--13 14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Because there 15 weren't that many that you indicated were a part of 16 the program. 17 ANDREW MURRAY: Yeah. The one and two 18 bedroom units are designated currently for the lottery for the 40 to 80 percent AMI. 19 The 36 dwelling units, with respect to the supportive 20 residents are all studios. 21 2.2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: All of those--23 Okay. So all of the supportive personnel-- or all of the supportive residents will be in studio 24 25 apartments.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 ANDREW MURRAY: Yes. And these 3 specifically are going to be residents aged 55 and older. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh. 6 ANDREW MURRAY: Yeah. 7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's important to know. 8 9 ANDREW MURRAY: Yes. 10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's good. And the solar panels that you are planning on having, 11 12 what will they provide? What energy will they 13 provide? 14 ANDREW MURRAY: As it is currently drawn 15 up and, of course, this can change, but we are 16 planning, as proposed -- again, it's the early 17 stages. About 35 to 45 kilowatt of energy and that 18 will most likely provide energy electricity for the common area. 19 20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Common areas. 21 Okay. Okay. Great. 2.2 ANDREW MURRAY: Which is pretty 23 extensive, of course, in a nine story building. 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. Are there any 3 other questions from any other panels? Okay. Thank 4 you so much. 5 ANDREW MURRAY: Thank you. 6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We're not doing 7 that. [background comments] 8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 9 Thank you. Are there any members of the public who wish to testify 10 on these items? Seeing none, I close today's public 11 12 hearing and these items are laid over. Next, we will 13 hear designations in the Sunset Park neighborhood of 14 Brooklyn represented by Council member Menchaca. LU 15 496 is the Sunset Park South historic District. LU 16 497 is the Sunset Park North Historic District. LU 17 498 is the Sunset Park 50th Street Historic District, 18 and LU 499 is the Central Sunset Park 50th Street Historic District. We will also hold a public 19 20 hearing on LU 528, the LPC designation of the Bay Ridge Parkway, Doctors Row Historic District in 21 2.2 Council member Brannan's district, also in Brooklyn. 23 I will now recognize Council member Menchaca to offer 24 up remarks.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
3	Chair Barron, for giving me this opportunity to say
4	hello and welcome. [Speaking foreign language] This
5	application that we are seeing before us has an
6	incredible story that is rooted in the power of
7	Sunset Park and the voices of the people who live in
8	there, who work there, and care for Sunset Park. The
9	application before you also has an incredible story
10	about the landmarks team at the city, listening and
11	really understanding the needs of Sunset Park. And
12	the beautiful thing about it was that, like many
13	stories that start without seeing eye to eye,
14	discussion and dialogue, productive dialogue happened
15	and both pressures be getting into understand that
16	there was a common ground and research was done and
17	petitions were signed, photographs were taken,
18	stories were told, and what you see is the result of
19	that an incredible work and residents in Sunset Park
20	did not stop and nor should have they. And the
21	government did not stop and nor should have they.
22	And we didn't stop until we got to a point where we
23	are today. In these designations that really, and a
24	lot of ways, they are historic for historic
25	districts, but they also are unprecedented in a way

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES and in the way that they came out. And I think that 2 was a big gesture from the landmarks preservation 3 4 commission that said Sunset Park deserves something 5 different and we got that. And so these blocks are 6 beautiful blocks and I hope that, if you are 7 listening and don't know Sunset Park, to calm and see these beautiful blocks to really see the appreciation 8 of the work that our communities have done to keep 9 these blocks in tact being because we are facing some 10 incredible pressures of gentrification and pressures 11 12 of foreign investment that are coming in and buying these buildings, tearing them down, and destroying 13 14 the fabric of our community. And that, we are saying 15 no to today. So I'm really proud to be representing 16 these incredible, incredible families and the incredible organizations that are behind them and the 17 18 nonprofit and the energy. So, I'm just so proud moment-- A proud person. A proud New Yorker today. 19 20 Thank you. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Council 21

22 member. We had joined today by representatives of 23 the Landmark Preservation Commission. We have Kate 24 McHale and Anthony Fabre. Fabre. And before you 25 begin, counsel will swear you in.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole 3 4 truth, and nothing but the truth and your testimony before the subcommittee and in response to all 5 Council member questions? 6 7 ANTHONY FABRE: T do. KATE MCHALE: I do. 8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 9 Thank you. Thank 10 you. You may begin. KATE MCHALE: Okay. Thank you. Good 11 12 afternoon, Council member Barron and subcommittee 13 members. I am Kate Lemos McHale, director of 14 research at the Landmarks Preservation Commission. 15 Thank you for the opportunity to present these four 16 districts in Sunset Park today. 17 The Sunset Park Historic districts, shown 18 here on our map of New York City landmarks and historic districts are the result of an extensive 19 20 study of the Sunset Park neighborhood in response to requests from the Sunset Park Landmark Committee and 21 2.2 with the strong support of Council member Menchaca. 23 We thank you for that. Their designation is aligned with an agency priority under Chair Carol to study 24 communities underrepresented by landmarks. We 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 studied a large area encompassing the blocks between fourth and seventh avenues and 60th and 40th Streets, 3 4 shown here. And such a large study area, we 5 developed a framework for identifying historic district boundaries that should include intact rows 6 7 of buildings that exemplify Sunset Park's historical and architectural development and incorporate blocks 8 with the strongest character, highest integrity, and 9 cohesiveness that, together, create a distinct sense 10 of place. As part of our process of studying and 11 12 proposing has storage districts, we need to extend says owner outreach and we held two public meetings 13 14 in Sunset Park to describe our proposal and speak 15 with homeowners about working with the Landmarks 16 Commission. Chinese and Spanish language interpretation services were offered at both these 17 18 meetings for anyone who needed translation. Following our outreach, the four districts were 19 20 calendared in January 2019. They contain a total of 539 properties and consist of the most cohesive and 21 2.2 intact concentrations of high quality architecture in 23 Sunset Park, representing its primary periods of 24 development. At the public hearing on May 7th, 26 25 people spoke in favor of all four districts,

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 including Carlos Menchaca, Council member Menchaca, and representatives from the Sunset Park, landmarks, 3 4 committee and its business improvement District, the Historic Districts Council, the New York Landmarks 5 6 Conservancy, the Society for the Architecture of the 7 City. Testimony related to specific districts included one person who spoke in favor of Sunset Park 8 50th Street, one in favor of Central Sunset Park, and 9 six who spoke and opposition to Sunset Park South. 10 The Commission also received 42 written submissions 11 12 in favor of all for historic districts including from Assembly member Felix Ortiz in Community Board Seven, 13 as well as two written submissions in favor of Sunset 14 15 Park South, eight in favor of 50th Street, four in 16 favor of the Central Sunset Park, and one in favor of Sunset Park North. The Commission also received five 17 18 written submissions supposed to one or more of the districts. 19 20 Sunset Park's historical development was closely connected to its working waterfront, in 21 2.2 particular the vast complex of Bush terminal and the 23 arrival of public transportation through the area. 24 Long consistent rows of houses were designed by 25 Brooklyn architects for speculative developers, as

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 many as two and three family homes. Early owners and residents of Sunset Park include German, Irish, 3 Italian, Danish, Finnish, and Swedish immigrants and 4 5 today the neighborhood retains lively emigrant 6 communities and character. The neighborhood took its 7 name from the park completed in 1911. This amenity, along with the extension of an elevated railway along 8 Third Avenue and 1893 and the announced man of the 9 planned fourth Avenue subway in 1905 spurred rapid 10 residential development, which was essentially 11 12 completed by World War I. These maps show Sunset Park in 1898 and 1903, vividly illustrating the 13 14 extent of development and just a five year period as 15 an extended eastward from the industrial port. And 16 just a note on the layout of these slides, our maps are rotated and so East is generally down, West is up 17 18 towards the poor, and North is to the right. There are three major phases of development and Sunset 19 20 Park. Late 19th century development as typically characterized by row houses with brown stone and 21 2.2 brick façades with flat fronts or projecting bays 23 such as the row shown on the left here on 58th 24 Street. Early 20th century development between 1901 25 in 1909 we see more two-family row houses and with

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 more ornate elements constructed throughout the neighborhood and development between 1910 and 1920, 3 after the subway extended through the neighborhood is 4 5 generally characterized by larger apartment buildings, flats, and tenements, such as the one 6 7 shown on the right, which became a finished co-op. This map of building dates and all four districts 8 represents the general distribution of these primary 9 periods of development throughout the neighborhood. 10 Sunset Park's older 19th century buildings tend to be 11 12 close third of Fourth Avenue at the top of the map. 13 Buildings constructed after the turn of the century are more prevalent in the blocks between fifth and 14 15 seventh avenues and to gather these four districts 16 contain the strongest concentrations of the three periods of development history in Sunset Park. So, 17 18 now, I'll just take you quickly through each one. The Sunset Park South historic District consists of 19 20 approximately 285 residential buildings located between 54th and 59th streets and fourth and fifth 21 2.2 avenues. This historic district has a high level of 23 integrity, as is shown in the dominantly green color on the map. A portion of 57th Street contains 24 25 buildings either with major alterations or of

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 different scales and building dates that did not reflect to the historic character of surrounding 3 streets and this portion of 57th Street was not 4 included in the district. The area includes a strong 5 concentration of Sunset Park's oldest buildings. 6 It 7 was mostly constructed in the 1890s. And it contains a rows of stone and brick fronted houses shown on 8 this map of row house typologies and what the map 9 shows is the different materials that are used in the 10 facades, as well as the different bay shapes, but 11 12 what we found really are very strong rows of consistent style and shape. And in these images we 13 14 see stone and break row houses within the Sunset Park 15 South historic district featuring angled and round 16 days, intact stoops and railings, and carved and 17 molded ornaments. The houses often incorporate 18 decorative elements and alternating patterns to differentiate houses and long rows. These images 19 20 from 56th Street show examples of the rich ornamentation found in the neighborhood in this 21 historic district. Sunset Park 50th Street historic 2.2 district consists of two rows of 25 houses framing 23 50th Street between fourth and fifth avenues. 24 Constructed between 1897 and 1903, this section of 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES 50th Street is one of the neighborhood's finest
3	historic box, notable for its cohesive rows of
4	remarkably well preserved brownstone fronted houses.
5	All of the houses here were designed by just to
6	architects, so it is incredibly consistent. The
7	houses on this blog feature hives stoops, projecting
8	bays, and richly textured brownstone fronts. Their
9	façades combine the rough surfaces and curb linear
10	ornament of the Romanesque revival style with the
11	angular forms and classical details of the
12	Renaissance revival style. With its unified row and
13	high degree of historical integrity, the Sunset Park
14	50th Street historic District remains one of its
15	neighborhoods stand out blocks. The Central Sunset
16	Park historic District consists of approximately 148
17	buildings located on 47th and 48th Street between
18	fifth and sixth avenues and along Sixth Avenue.
19	Constructed between 1897 and 1906, the central area
20	incorporates some of that area has outstanding turn
21	of the century residential architecture and includes
22	intact blocks found along Sixth Avenue that extend
23	the character of the mid-blocks and strengthen the
24	sense of place. The districts consistency and age
25	type and high integrity is shown on these maps. The
l	l

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 districts row houses are clad in bright, limestone, brownstone, or a combination and its streetscapes 3 feature consistent cornice lines, a rid them of 4 5 projecting bays, and high stoops with intact iron 6 railings and elaborate carved ornament. And here you 7 can see some examples of the intricate carved detail and stoops within the Central Park-- Central Sunset 8 Park historic district. And, finally, the Sunset 9 Park North historic District consists of 10 approximately 56 buildings on the south side of 44th 11 Street between fifth and seventh Avenue. 12 The two well-preserved blocks overlooking Sunset Park are 13 notable for their cohesive rows of limestone and 14 15 brick fronted houses and apartment houses all 16 representing the neighborhoods architectural development just following the turn of the 20th 17 18 century. These blocks have a special character along the park. They include a unique row of limestone 19 20 fronted houses, one of the neighborhood's most intact and consistent blocks of brick flat fronted row 21 2.2 houses, and for apartment buildings designed in 1913 23 with an eclectic mix of classical and arts and crafts 24 detailing. Overlooking Sunset Park on a sloping 25 hill, this block has a strong sense of place

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 highlighted by its fine architecture and natural topography. With their geographical distribution 3 throughout the neighborhood, the four historic 4 districts capture the primary periods of development 5 and resulting range of residential building 6 7 typologies in Sunset Park. Together, they tell the story of Sunset Park's development history and 8 capture its most significant architecture and 9 streetscapes. Thank you. And I am happy to answer 10 any questions. 11 12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Are there any questions from the panel or comments? 13 14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah. I just 15 want to ask-- you know, so much of the presentation 16 really was rooted an analysis that your team put so much time and effort in going out into the community. 17 18 How important it was for the community to organize so early and present so much information to this 19 20 process? How important was that work from the community? 21 2.2 KATE MCHALE: Oh, it's very important and 23 we appreciate it very much. We, of course, have 24 taken to our own sanity and our own analysis and we took them five that was provided to us and then, you 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 know, really at the whole neighborhood and area to analyze the request way then that broader area and 3 4 not really allowed us to definitively identify the 5 strongest areas that, together, tell such an 6 important story of the neighborhood's development. 7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And I think 8 that's just an important point to make about the kind of ground swells support. The committee -- not just 9 10 the committee. The community board and all the business is and I think it's just like an important 11 12 part of this story and narrative. And the last question I have is we are looking at for applications 13 14 at once. I remember at one point we thought that was 15 just never going to be possible and that was hard 16 because I think no one wanted to let go of that possibility and here we are with four different 17 18 districts, noncontiguous, never really happened before. Can you talk about the importance of how or 19 20 what makes it so important to look at four districts and one neighborhood together? 21 2.2 KATE MCHALE: Well, it was. And, as you 23 said, I think we came at this in a creative way and a lot of the discussions that we had about how to do 24 25 that and the support that we had from all of you is

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES so important. And this is a district that has these
3	areas, but in between are areas where there have been
4	more changes or the development has led to the, you
5	know, less consistency in the streetscapes. And just
6	in terms of how to really recognize and protect those
7	areas that stand out and that are really retain
8	their historic character, I think it was a wonderful
9	sort of process and the framework that was developed
10	to really to get to this was very important.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I couldn't
12	agree more and that's exactly what we are doing. We
13	are protecting Sunset Park. Thank you.
14	KATE MCHALE: Thank you.
15	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Council
16	member. Now, we will move on to LU 528. Doctor's
17	Row. Yeah. Do you want to give testimony or
18	[background comments]
19	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: There are
21	other ones, I'm sorry.
22	KATE MCHALE: Okay. Good afternoon,
23	Council member Koo and subcommittee members. I am
24	Kate Lemos McHale of the Landmarks Preservation
25	Commission. Thank you for this opportunity to

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 present the Bay Ridge Parkway doctor's Row historic District designated on June 25. The historic 3 4 district is the first in Bay Ridge and as are the Sunset Park districts the first and Sunset Park and 5 6 is a distinguished example of the neighborhood's 7 transformation from a suburban resort community to a middle-class urban neighborhood in the early 20th 8 century. In addition to the high quality of its 9 10 architecture, it has acquired a noteworthy association and as a doctor's Row, thanks to the 11 12 number of medical professionals who have lived and had offices on the block. Both historically and 13 14 currently. The historic district is located between 15 fourth and fifth avenues in the Bay Ridge 16 neighborhood of Brooklyn, as shown on this map. Α 17 request to evaluate the block came from the community 18 with support from Council member Brannan and Community Board 10. At its public hearing on May 14, 19 20 and in written testimony, the commission received support from the 11 organizations and individuals 21 2.2 including State Senator Andrew Gounardes, Council 23 member Justin Brannan, Brooklyn Community Board 10, Historic Districts Council, and the New York 24

 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES
Landmarks Conservancy. There was no opposition to designation.

4 Bay Ridge was primarily an agricultural community until the late 19th century when resorts 5 and suburban residences were constructed along the 6 7 shore. Bay Ridge Parkway was originally envisioned as a Boulevard to connect to the Shore Drive along 8 New York Bay and the historic district is a prominent 9 tree-lined block. The plan to construct the fourth 10 Avenue subway line, announced in 1903, was the 11 12 primary catalyst for rapid speculative development in a rage and jubilant Realty man, as you can see in 13 this advertisement. It reached 86th Street in Bay 14 15 Ridge and in 1916. Bay Ridge development company was 16 organized in 1904 and its secretary builder, Arthur Douglas Constant, was charged with constructing row 17 18 houses on both sides of Bay Ridge Parkway between fourth and fifth avenues, shown here and an 19 20 advertisement from 1907 at work, quote, calculated to supply a long felt want for one family houses in Bay 21 2.2 Ridge and will constitute the only complete block of 23 such residences in the section, end quote. The entire block was constructed in segments over seven 24 25 years between 1906 and 1913, primarily between 1906

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES and 1909. A.D. Constant constructed most of the
3	buildings and the rows were designed by just two
4	architects. Benjamin Driesler, a prolific Brooklyn
5	architect and William Flanagan. The block developed
6	was a cohesive appearance over all. In our
7	evaluation and boundary analysis of the potential
8	district, LPC staff studied a broader area and found
9	that this lot, in particular, stands out within the
10	larger neighborhood context due to its high
11	architectural quality and consistency, which, in
12	combination with the Parkways Boulevard feeling,
13	creates a strong sense of place and historic
14	character. Within the historic district, the row
15	houses are set back behind spacious area ways and are
16	primarily characterized by limestone façades, bowed
17	or angled fronts, low stoops, stone window and door
18	surrounds, and embellished cornices typical of the
19	Renaissance revival style. The north side of the
20	block is shown here. It's architecturally very
21	consistent. On the right is a brick building at the
22	eastern end of the block which was constructed to
23	house a doctor's office, a trend that would become
24	ubiquitous in later years. The south side of the
25	street includes brick row houses shown on the left,

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 limestone fronted row houses similar to the north side shown on the right, including eight with 3 colonial revival entrances that were advertised as 4 house colonials and described by the Bay Ridge 5 6 development company as having, quote, and exterior 7 design and that is something entirely new in house building, end quote. As this map illustrates, the 8 historic district has a high level of integrity. 9 10 Alterations are mostly limited to the replacement of doors and windows, changes to area waves, or the 11 12 addition of a basement doctor's office entrance, such as shown on the left. Since this data and telephone 13 directory has provided information regarding medical 14 15 professionals who live door had offices on this block 16 between 1910 and 1960, indicating a rapid increase in medical professionals on the block. Among the first 17 18 reference to it as a doctor's Row appears to be from a Brooklyn Daily Eagle real estate advertisement in 19 20 1949. By 1950 and continuing into the 1960s, as shown on this map, well over half of the buildings 21 2.2 house to doctors and other medical professionals, 23 either with offices or in residence. Other blocks in the city have been referred to as Doctors Row, 24 25 including examples within LPC designated districts in
1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	the South Bronx, Manhattan, and Brooklyn. The term
3	seems to have typically been used for promotional
4	real estate purposes and to emphasize particularly
5	elegant blocks with in a neighborhood. In these two
6	photos taken in 1907 and 2019, 112 years apart, you
7	can see the block still looks very much as it did in
8	the first decade of the 20th century. It strongly
9	reflects the architectural and historical development
10	of this section of Bay Ridge and still houses
11	doctors' offices. Thank you for the opportunity to
12	present his historic district. I am happy to answer
13	any questions.
14	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much.
15	Yeah. There are no questions from Council members.
16	KATE MCHALE: Okay. Thanks.
17	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. You are
18	excused. Now, we are proceeding to public panels.
19	First we have Yvette huh? Asho?
20	[background comments]
21	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Aquire [sp?]?
22	YVETTE AQUIRE: Yeah.
23	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Juan No. Jane
24	Jimenez and Nina Malkin.
25	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 YVETTE AQUIRE: Should all three people-3 4 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah. Three people [inaudible 00:49:56]. 5 [background comments] 6 7 CHAIRPERSON KOO: You may begin after you identify yourself. Yeah. You just take-- Whoever 8 want to go first, go first. 9 10 [background comments] YVETTE AQUIRE: Ah. Okay. Is it on 11 12 now? Okay. I usually could use--13 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Start over. 14 YVETTE AQUIRE: Okay. My name is Yvette 15 [inaudible 00:50:41]. I'm a resident of Sunset Park. I own a brownstone on 47th street since 1974. I've 16 17 been in this community from the time I was a child. 18 We have been working on this process of maintaining our brownstones from the time that I could remember, 19 20 going back at least 30 or 40 years. We have had the support of every Council person for the past 20 21 2.2 years. We've had the support of Carlos Menchaca for 23 the past seven years. We've had the support of Silas Gonzalez for 10 and a half years, almost 11 years. 24 25 We had to support of Alex-- Angel Rodriguez before

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	then, so this is a history of support from our
3	elected officials. We have our Congresswoman who
4	has Anita Velasquez for the last 20 years who has
5	also been very supportive of this movement and the
6	maintenance of these brownstones have been kept by
7	this community. We have all protected them like they
8	were our babies and we have we're very grateful to
9	have gotten to this point and so we really would love
10	to make sure that this supported and that we get
11	through this process. Thank you.
12	JAN JIMENEZ: Thank you, Chair Koo. My
13	name is Jan Hudes [sp?] Jimenez. I live at 554 48th
14	street in Brooklyn in the Central what's being
15	called the Central Sunset Park designated area. I
16	have been a homeowner there with my husband for 20
17	years. So, I'm going to read my statement just
18	because it'll be more efficient, I think. The land
19	marking initiative before you represents a unique
20	opportunity to celebrate the built environment of
21	Sunset Park by protecting blocks that best rest of
22	the neighborhoods historic contribution to Brooklyn
23	and New York City. Of four historic districts
24	designated by the Landmark Preservation Committee
25	instill a sense of place, history, and pride for all

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES who live, work, and simply stroll through our
3	beautiful neighborhood of Sunset Park. This proposal
4	is the culmination of an amazing neighborhood effort
5	to preserve the architectural integrity of a small
6	portion of Sunset Park. I'm very fortunate to live
7	on a block that is still visually cohesive and
8	showcases the architectural form and beauty that
9	creates the type of beautiful streetscapes that we
10	are seeking to preserve. My husband and I were block
11	captains for this effort and, with neighbors who
12	speak the many languages on our block, we had
13	conversations about this initiative with residents
14	and every home on our block. Without exception, we
14	
	heard overwhelming support for preservation efforts
16	as our neighbors expressed dismay over the
17	architectural changes being made on surrounding
18	blocks as loops, cornices, and lentils are replaced,
19	rooftop additions are built, grand parlor floor
20	windows are diminished in size with brick infill and
21	entire stone façade are replaced by brick or tile.
22	In the most disturbing instances, we see an entire
23	house is being demolished from the ground up and
24	replaced with out of context and out of scale new
25	building. When such changes happen to even a single

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	building, the impact reverberates up and down the
3	block. It diminishes the visual glory of our streets
4	and that forever altered a block that stood in
5	harmony for more than a century. Sunset Park is in
6	danger of losing its sense of place and its
7	neighborhood feel. These characteristics that make
8	our wonderful neighborhood special and unique foster
9	a sense of authentic human attachment and longing.
10	They inspire us to care for our built environment
11	and, with their preservation, will contribute to
12	legacy as community history and pride on which future
13	generations will build. I encourage you to accept
14	our application. To approve application. Thank you.
15	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Next. Yeah.
16	NINA MALKIN: Yeah. Hi, everyone. How's
17	that? Better? My name is Nina Malkin. I live on
18	54th street and I'm a relative new, to Sunset Park
19	where my husband and I are there for 15 years. When
20	we were looking for houses, we looked all over
21	Brooklyn, all over Queens, a little bit Jersey.
22	Forgive us. We kept coming back to Sunset Park
23	because it was just so beautiful and we thought how
24	could regular people live in these beautiful homes?
25	But all we saw around us as we walked up and down the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 blocks were regular people and their children playing on the stoops and their dogs being walked and curbed 3 and taken care of and their gardens being small 4 5 little courtyard gardens being maintained. Then we kept coming back and back and, until we found that we 6 7 looked in and our charger opted we were like, this is When we do, we felt like we belonged here 8 home. because it felt like everybody belonged here. 9 Everybody deserves a beautiful place to live in these 10 were the kind of -- I mean, I'm out Brooklyn native 11 12 and these were the kind of two family and three family homes that I, you know, grew up around only--13 14 just not that nice. And when we started to see some 15 of the development that was going on in the 16 neighborhood by people who didn't actually live there, it was very disturbing to us. We thought, 17 18 what's going on? What are they doing to our beautiful place? And started to lose, not just its 19 20 beauty, but it's feel. People didn't look ni-newer people didn't look each other in the eye and 21 2.2 didn't say hello. And when we found out that we 23 could get involved in trying to landmark the 24 neighborhood, that's one hour block and everybody 25 else's block really started to come together and I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	started to meet ladies and gentlemen from other
3	blocks that I didn't know so well. So, I don't
4	really have a prepared statement, but I do want to
5	think the LPC for their efforts, the Sunset Park
6	landmarks committee led by Lynn Massimo [sp?] for
7	getting this off the ground, the Council, and Mr.
8	Menchaca for everything that you all have done.
9	Thanks so much and please do approve our application.
10	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Next panel
11	Maria Roger. Lynn Massimo. Sure. Jason Stutz. You
12	want to do four? Cynthia Phyllis.
13	LEGAL COUNSEL: We've got to take the
14	vote for it.
15	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Oh. Oh.
16	LEGAL COUNSEL: So before they begin.
17	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah. Yeah. Before you
18	guys start, we have to make the We have to take a
19	vote for Council member Miller. Yeah. You want to
20	call [inaudible 00:58:12].
21	LEGAL COUNSEL: On LU number 481, 482,
22	483, 484, 485, 486, 487, 488, 489, 490, 491, 492,
23	493, 494, and 495 and preconsidered LU number 510 and
24	511, Council member Miller, how do you vote?
25	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you. With a vote of four in the affirmative and zero in the negative 3 in zero abstentions, the items are recommended for 4 full Land Use Committee. 5 6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Council 7 member Miller. Now, you guys can start after you identify yourself. Yeah. 8 LYNN MASSIMO: Is this thing on? 9 10 No. CHAIRPERSON KOO: No. Please speak to the 11 12 mic. Yeah. LYNN MASSIMO: Is this thing on? 13 My name is Lynn Massimo. I live at 526 47th Street in 14 15 Brooklyn. Thank you, Council member Koo for chairing 16 today and for the other Council members who are here. 17 And for Council member Menchaca who has been with us 18 at every meeting, thank you. [background comments] 19 20 In 2012, I spearheaded LYNN MASSIMO: the Sunset Park Landmarks Committee, which is a 21 2.2 grassroots organization that has been fighting for a 23 land marking detection for our neighborhood for seven years. But, before the incarnation of this 24 particular effort, in the 1980s, the Sunset Parkers 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 fought for protection and successfully got the neighborhood onto the national register. So, today, 3 you are seeing the culmination of decades of Sunset 4 5 Parkers passionate dedication to preserving our 6 neighborhood. On many of blocks, generations of 7 Sunset Parkers has kept their row houses intact and 8 looking historic, but rampant out of context renovations are erasing that history. I have 9 10 included some photos of the beautiful and then the other two pages are of the rampant out of context 11 12 renovations. That history, which is both the history of architecture and the history of an immigrant 13 14 community, it deserves to honored and preserved. And 15 while preserving the history, we can still embrace 16 the future. On Friday, solar panels were installed on my roof and it sailed through the LPC approval 17 18 process. So, we've got past and future, you know, 19 happy together. So, and when I speak, please here 20 not only my single voice, but the voice of literal 21 thousand that support preserving in Sunset Park. Our 2.2 organization did an enormous amount of outreach. We 23 did more than 16 outreach events in the neighborhood. 24 We gave more than seven and walking tours. We gave 25 trolley tours. We have a trolley. We had trolley

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	tours and we canvassed door-to-door on about 16
3	blocks. So, who supports it? Over six Sorry.
4	Over 3000 Sunset Park residents signed our petition
5	in support. Over 400 homeowners wrote support
6	letters. Our Council member Menchaca, Assembly
7	member Felix Ortiz, Congresswoman Anita Velasquez,
8	former State Senator Jessie Hamilton, Community Board
9	seven, and other community organizations which are
10	Rose and Sunset Park fifth Avenue bid and the Chinese
11	American Planning Council, Greenwood Cemetery, the
12	Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce, the Bethelship
13	Norwegian United Methodist Church. They are all in
14	support. I'm also here is the member of the
15	Community Board seven and I did bring a letter from
16	the board, which reaffirms their unanimous support of
17	all for historic districts. So, thank you very much
18	for your time and please vote yes on all four
19	districts. Thank you.
20	MARIA ROCA: Good afternoon. [speaking
21	foreign language] I am Maria Roca. I am here not
22	only representing myself as a longtime resident of
23	Sunset Park, in 1964 when my family first came to
24	Sunset Park, the also the membership and of the
25	
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	members of Friends of Sunset Park. By the way, we
3	also submitted a letter of support.
4	[background comments]
5	MARIA ROCA: It's okay. Just wanted to go
6	on record. I know. Much of what I would say here
7	has been said about the dedication of this community
8	for generations. For generations that have brought
9	us to this moment and do you use to the right word.
10	Culminated in this day. It is a good day indeed.
11	There are some better memories because certainly it
12	should be a bigger a larger number of homes that
13	are landmarked, but it has been said before. Some of
14	them no longer worthy of land marking because of the
15	greed of some that didn't appreciate it and some to
16	whom what we wanted to honor, what we want to honor,
17	what we want to preserve doesn't really resonate with
18	them. So, for either or. So, let's start here. All
19	I can say is that I hope to be back here for an I
20	don't Relax. For the next round after week, for
21	air to add to this because we know that can happen.
22	So I want to and it should have been because, if
23	we do not stay focused and intends on preserving not
24	only Sunset Park, but many, many other New York
25	communities that face extinction. We see it in the
ļ	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES paper every day. New
3	York well no longer be then New York that we all of
4	and care about. So, I said before, I certainly want
5	to think so many people who, for generations, have
6	worked on this in one way or another, to the two
7	Lynn's, the other Lynn not being here, of the Sunset
8	Park Landmarks Committee, HTC for being a staunch
9	supporter and always there for us. Our Councilman
10	and everybody else and I hope to see you all here in
11	the near future adding to this. So, yes. Without
12	question, please approve because, if not, you're not
13	going to get rid of us. Thank you.
14	CYNTHIA FELIX: Good afternoon. My name
15	is Cynthia Felix and I live on 50th Street between
16	fourth and Fifth Avenue. Hon. Council people and
17	members, I would like to thank you for the
18	opportunity to speak this afternoon. I would want to
19	think the LPC for their support and flexibility with
20	our community and letting us do a very unique
21	proposal with four distinct districts. Especially
22	for the 50th Street proposal, which is a standalone
23	street, and I want to think Council member Menchaca
24	for his vision and dedication to Sunset Park and
25	always saying [speaking foreign language] when we

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	need him. I want to thank the Lynn's for starting
3	the Sunset Park landmark commission and always being
4	there for us. And, most importantly, I want to think
5	my neighbors and the homeowners and the tenants for
6	their tireless efforts to maintain a 100+ year home.
7	It isn't easy, folks. You break a wall and something
8	else pops up that you have to fix. You find a hole
9	and you have to maintain it to integrity and it is
10	not an easy thing to do. But a group of us was
11	dedicated enough to do that and that is why we are
12	here today. It was a collective effort. It's not
13	easy. The Z thing is to make it new and to put
14	things, but we didn't want to do that. We looked
15	around and I was born and raised in the same house
16	that I am living in now and, in the past 15 years,
17	architectural changes have gone all around me. I
18	look around and where I grew up has changed
19	tremendously, but a group of us decided we don't want
20	to change where we live. We want to keep it the
21	same. We want to see things that are old and
22	maintain that piece and why we want to do that is
23	because those changes take away the sense of place in
24	New York City and, while we realize that you can't
25	hold on to everything, we do believe that development

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	must be done with forethought and consideration and
3	the creation of historic districts does just that.
4	It reassures us that our homes will keep the
5	integrity and the original architect will preserve
6	the fabric of the future of Sunset Park, not for our
7	kids, but for our kids kids, too. These blocks
8	instill a sense of place, history, and pride. I grew
9	up on my block playing stupid ball and are block
10	priorities are celebrations of what we have with our
11	families. We look back at our memories and it makes
12	me proud. I look up and down the block. I look at
13	the flowers our families grow and sitting on the
14	stoop and reminiscing about things that are going on
15	and it gives me just a sense of pride in this really
16	big said anywhere sometimes you feel all alone. Then
17	you go back into those blocks and you feel a sense of
18	family and that is really important. And helps us
19	preserve the beauty and celebrate the beauty. So, I
20	humbly ask you to help us preserve the beauty and
21	celebrate the beauty of Sunset Park by preserving
22	these blocks that we've worked so hard to maintain
23	throughout our own families and so that we could pass
24	that on to our own families for years to come. Thank
25	you.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES CHAIRPERSON KOO: Next gentleman. 2 3 JASON STUTZ: My name is Jason Stutz. Ι 4 live at 469 54th Street in Brooklyn with my wife, 5 Nina. We've been there 15 years. We moved to their 6 because of what it already is. I was looking at the 7 picture in Bay Ridge. I said, oh, that's a rage, but we had pictures from the LPC earlier of our 8 neighborhood and what we're talking about is 9 10 something that inspires life and all of us. When you walk down these blocks, they feel good and that goes 11 12 a lot deeper than just this is what we want. It's subconscious. And it's important that we feel that 13 14 way. That we feel like we belong and you had that 15 feeling when you walked down the streets and it's 16 beautiful and we should keep it that way. For life's 17 sake. A lot of the changes that have been made just 18 seemed to be made for some instant gratification of people making money and things like that. 19 That is 20 not all that is important. And so all four of these districts we feel like our important and we think the 21 2.2 LPC. Everybody who has worked on this, I think, 23 would agree. It just feels so good. And when you 24 see things that are-- you just have to be there and 25 I think we all know. That's all we need to say.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 It's a beautiful place and we would like to leave the beauty intact. Thank you for your consideration. 3 We 4 hope you will vote for it. All four. 5 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Yeah. 6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Can I have one 7 question? CHAIRPERSON KOO: Sure. Council member 8 9 Menchaca. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you, Chair, for a quick question. So here's my conundrum. 11 12 Are we going to have four different parties? 13 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes. Of course. 14 JASON STUTZ: Five. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Five. 16 MARIA ROCA: Each group gets-- and then 17 the big one. COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And then the 18 big one. Okay. [speaking foreign language] Thank 19 20 you. MARIA ROCA: [speaking foreign language] 21 2.2 [background comments] CHAIRPERSON KOO: The next panel will be 23 Susan Brown, Linda Acini, and Simon Bankoff. 24 25 [background comment]

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	UNIDENTIFIED: Three of each. Yeah.
3	One of each.
4	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Could you
5	please identify yourselves and then you can start.
6	Yeah.
7	LINDA ACINI: Good afternoon, Council. I
8	am Linda Acini. I live that 441 Bay Ridge Parkway
9	and I would like to thank you for having us here
10	today and we are of course hoping that we will be
11	voted in. Bay Ridge Parkway is, as LPC said,
12	predominantly in an intact street. The street has a
13	real sense of importance in the neighborhood, but,
14	when you branch out into Brooklyn and other parts of
15	New York, people know Doctors Row. They had been
16	calming to physicians there for many years. There
17	are generations of physicians, dentists, attorneys
18	practicing on the street, I know several of them
19	personally. I purchased the house in 1982. I came
20	in with my husband at the time. He was an internist.
21	I am an RN. We purchased from a family practitioner
22	who had purchased from a DO. My daughter is a
23	surgeon. So, we kind of embodied the medical the
24	caring and the medical professions that it lived and
25	thrived on this very beautiful street. The street

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
	SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	also gives the individuals who walk up and down the
3	street and we get a lot of lot of traffic. People
4	get a real sense of stability, strength, sense of
5	place, and are block Association has replanted all
6	the tree wells. We have had more trees planted in
7	conjunction with Forest Street and the block is, once
8	again, beautiful and thriving. We are also deeply
9	concerned, as Sunset Park beautifully brought out,
10	the changes are not and hand saying or surveying the
11	community. The changes that people want to make to
12	these buildings just are not consistent with and
13	don't really enhance the people that live in the
14	buildings and in the neighborhood. I can tell you
15	that, since we have got into this place today, there
16	is a sense of pride in our community that I did not
17	sends before we started. It's a really it is
18	grown. People are like, yeah. We are this place.
19	We are this community and I think it is gray than I
20	think it is I am hopeful and secure that you will
21	vote for us. Thank you.
22	SUSAN BROWN: We have waited for this day
23	for years. Thank you for listening to us. My name
24	is Susan Brown. I have owned a home on Bay Ridge
25	Parkway, Doctors Row, for 50 years. Landmarks

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 preservation is going to be our salvation. Their protection is crucial to our maintaining the 3 4 integrity of our beloved rock for now and in the future. Of the brief. We will be honored to be 5 6 designated landmarks preservation commission first 7 historic district in Bay Ridge and we hope for more 8 telecom. Thank you very much.

SIMEON BANKOFF: Good afternoon, Council 9 members. Simeon Bankoff, executive director of the 10 Historic Districts Council. I'm really happy to be 11 12 here today to testify on all five of these historic districts. They are both long-- Bay Ridge in Sunset 13 14 Park long time projects that we have been working 15 with the communities on. In Bay Ridge, as Lynn had 16 mentioned, the Sunset Park-- sorry. In Sunset Park, as Lynn mentioned, the sunset Park community wanted 17 18 some recognition in the 1980s and protection for their neighborhood, so they hired Anders Scott 19 20 Dolkart who is one of New York's most preeminent architectural historians to write a report getting a 21 2.2 large section of the neighborhood on the national 23 register of historic places. That was in 1988. 24 Please keep in mind that New York State only adopted its own registry of historic places in 1980. 25 This

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES was a reasonably new preservation strategy and hours
3	stayed and now was one of the largest historic
4	districts in the state at the time. However, fast-
5	forward 25 years and, while the NR status hadn't had
6	any ill effects, it hadn't really helped preserve the
7	wonderful character of the neighborhood. So, and
8	2012, late 2012, ACC met with Lynn Massimo and Lynn
9	Tondrek [sp?] And their neighbors and began working
10	through our six to celebrate program with them to
11	help shape a picture perfect community campaign to
12	gain the local landmark designation that they spoke
13	about. Based on the NR research, neighbors canvassed
14	their neighbors. They met with a number of
15	generations of elected officials, including Council
16	member Menchaca who has been so very helpful. And
17	created a popular community led movement to help
18	preserve their physical character of the
19	neighborhood. Along the way, they forged ties with
20	other community organizations and even helped rescue
21	the last freestanding mansion in the neighborhood
22	from demolition. They were among the first community
23	groups to meet with this mayors administration to
24	request landmark designation and have been remarkably
25	patient for the last five years it took to get us to
ļ	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES this point. So, thank you all very much for seeing
3	this over the finish line. Particularly, I would
4	like to just say at the last when the Landmarks
5	Commission mentioned that they met with the owner's
6	twice, it was because the first time a number of
7	people in the community wanted and I have it you
8	know, wanted to enlarge the historic district and, in
9	what I saw to be really unprecedented move, Landmarks
10	listened to them. The agency listened to them and
11	came out and came and did and expanded their
12	project, which is fantastic. Now, with regard to our
13	friends in Bay Ridge, back in 2012, we also worked
14	with community members in Bay Ridge and sponsored a
15	survey of that remarkable neighborhood which was
16	funded with by public funds from New York State. We
17	delivered the survey to the local Council member,
18	Vini Gentile at the time, and the Landmarks
19	Commission, but there was not a lot of community
20	support behind it at the moment, so we sort of let
21	the matter go. Imagine our delight years later when
22	neighbors in the area got in touch with us about the
23	possibility of landmark designation. We started
24	working closely with these people. Fortunately, one
25	of our staff lives in the area, so evening meetings
I	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 were somewhat easier. We also found a strong partner in Council member Brannan and leaders at the local 3 4 community board. And let me be very clear that this 5 project would not have happened without the 6 remarkable work of Linda, who was the right person at 7 the right time. We were genuinely thrilled when 8 Landmarks Commission reacted supportively this proposal. In fact, fast track to this project. 9 Then 10 all our years working with the agency and when it says process, I can honestly say this is one of the 11 12 swiftest designations of the local historic district that we have ever seen. The positive agency action 13 14 was made only more important by the current lack of 15 designated properties in this area of Brooklyn and, 16 given the communities support and interest in this project, we have been getting a lot of calls from 17 18 neighbors wanting to know more about it. So, and given the Landmarks Commission's openness and the 19 20 Chairs commitment to spreading the agency's influence and areas that are being underrepresented, we have 21 2.2 hoped that we will see many more landmarks in 23 southern Brooklyn and other areas of the city soon. 24 So, thank you all very, very much. These are two 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 stories that I wish there were more of, but let's really celebrate them. 3 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council member, do you 4 5 have questions? 6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: T think one 7 question that I have -- and this is maybe the Simon. 8 By the way, congrats, Bay Ridge. Congrats. And it is great that we are celebrating in South Brooklyn 9 neighbors. Really to Simon, how important is it that 10 communities organize around this issue and you played 11 12 such an important technical role, but like really how four and is it that communities come out and organize 13 and build this kind of constituency around this kind 14 15 of question? 16 SIMEON BANKOFF: Honestly, this is-- I'm 17 not going to say it's impossible without a strong 18 community organization, but it is very, very more unlikely to happen. Additionally, in addition to--19 20 the whole purpose of historic preservation and not about the regulation of architecture. It's about the 21 2.2 celebration of a special sense of place and a 23 community growing and feeling that it's ca-- that it has a voice in the future of its neighborhood. 24 And 25 without that communal voice, it's a kind of pointless

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 effort. Additionally, because at the end of the day, every government action is reliant on community 3 4 compliance, if you have a situation where no one is 5 going to be compliant, where communities are incredibly, incredibly opposed to this-- the 6 7 Landmarks Commission is one of our least resourced agencies in the city of New York. They've got an 8 enormous amount of work to do and there are enough 9 10 people who want their attention that they are not going to force it down the sort of necks of people 11 12 who are just trying to get by. Instead, what they want are strong community partners who will help 13 further the action so it becomes a success. So I 14 15 think that what the Sunset Park community did which 16 was truly remarkable and was-- when I say picture perfect, was that they went door to door and actually 17 18 analyzed it and, when Chair Shrinivasen [sp?] saw the charts that showed, oh well, we've talked to 85 19 20 percent of people on this block and, of that 85 percent, you know, 76 percent said yes and the other 21 2.2 24 percent were like, sounds okay. Like those are 23 actual numbers that they said, oh, wow. This is a 24 real thing.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: It's people power. I hope you and the LPC are ready for five 3 parties of celebration. And maybe six. We'll get 4 5 invited to Bay Ridge. Thank you. 6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay. No more questions 7 from Council members. 8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Just wait a minute. 9 Is there another--CHAIRPERSON KOO: Panel? 10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: panel coming up? 11 12 CHAIRPERSON KOO: No. 13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Could I make a 14 statement? 15 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Sure. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you. 17 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council member Miller 18 wants to make a statement. COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr. 19 20 Chair. So, as I sit and I read through the pamphlets and I read the community reports and I look up, then 21 2.2 I am reminded of a home that I grew up in, my 23 grandmother's home, in Prospect Heights that looks a 24 lot like that and the blocks itself. And so, I was downstairs and I was just talking-- and I represent 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 Southeast Queens and so, what do we all have in common here? And that is the fact that 76 percent of 3 New Yorkers rent and to have this type of 4 5 conversation that values homeownership, that values communities and integrity of communities is not often 6 7 what happens here at City Council. And it's difficult when it comes to common issues that support 8 homeowners that we can kind of core lasts around 9 those common issues. And, certainly, and Southeast 10 Queens we have a few landmark communities that are 11 12 very, very important, but what I find equally important is that I just appreciate the appreciation 13 14 for communities and the value of this committee and 15 landmarks as communities transition. There are a 16 number of things that happened and was mentioned by one of the other speakers earlier is that that is how 17 18 you preserve the integrity of communities. This is one took of land marking and that is the beauty of 19 20 this mosaic of new York city that, you know, sometimes you want Chinese and you want to go to 21 2.2 Chinatown and do other things and just not that you 23 can't get it on the corner, but you don't get the fullness and the richness of communities or getting 24 [inaudible 01:23:25]. And so I'll leave with this. 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
2	SITING, AND MARITIME USES There was a ti there was an article in one of the
3	major dailies on the weakened section about a month
4	back and it talked about the lack of housing in new
5	York city and that we needed more density and then it
6	went on to say how dare communities such as Southeast
7	Queens and South Brooklyn communities have such low
8	density like we're not doing our part. And, you
9	know, I reject that. It is the quality of life that
10	we work so hard for and not just to obtain, but to
11	preserve that quality of life. And the fact that it
12	is not mutually exclusive. That we cannot create
13	housing and density where necessary where applicable
14	and, at the same time, preserve the integrity of what
15	we have here. So, I thought that this is
16	sometimes you think this a long fight, specific to
17	you or your community, but then you see that there
18	are others throughout the city that are fighting to
19	preserve the integrity of their community, as well.
20	So, I just wanted to add my two cents in that and how
21	I Yeah. Value the work that you are doing and I
22	may have to invite you out to help, although we
23	actually have a pretty strong landmark committee that
24	works within the community to preserve the integrity
25	of Southeast Queens. So, thank you for your work.
ļ	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 [background comments] 3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And thank you, Mr. 4 Chair, for allowing me to say a few words. 5 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Council member Miller. Yeah. So, that's-- You guys are all 6 7 done. Yeah. Are there anymore members of the public who wish to testify on these items? Seeing none, I 8 now close today's public hearing and these items are 9 laid over. On September 1st, the City Council held a 10 10 hour public hearing--11 10 hours? 12 UNIDENTIFIED: 13 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah. On the borough-14 based jails proposal and received feedback on all 15 ULRP applications associated with the project. In order to exercise the Council's discretion over the 16 17 [inaudible 01:26:01] mandatory ULRP applications, the 18 Council adopted a core resolution at last week's Stated Meeting. Those items are on the calendar for 19 20 September 18th. But to be sure, the Council accepted testimony on all ULRP applications on September 5th, 21 2.2 including the [inaudible 01:26:27] mandatory 23 applications. I now open public hearings on LU numbers 518, 519, 520, 521, 522, 523, 524, 525, and 24 526. All witnesses will be limited to one minute. 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	[background comments]
3	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Are there any members of
4	the public who wish to testify on these items?
5	Seeing none, I now close today's public hearing. All
6	items are laid over. I would like to thank the
7	members of the public, my colleagues, counsel, and
8	the land use staff for attending today's hearing.
9	The meeting is now hereby adjourned.
10	[gavel]
11	[background comments]
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
	ll de la constant de

## CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date \_\_\_\_\_ September 24, 2019