CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----- X

September 18, 2019 Start: 10:17 a.m. Recess: 11:29 a.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room, City Hall

B E F O R E: FRANCISCO MOYA

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Barry Grodenchik Rory Lancman Stephen Levin Antonio Reynoso Carlina Rivera

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Eric Palatnik

Frank St. Jacque Ackerman LLP Appearing for Property Owner, Cipico Construction

Yeni Hernandez SIU Local 32BJ

Richard Lobel
Sheldon, Lobel, P.C.

Rafaella Dunham Washington Square Partners

Scott LaRue Presidency of ArchCare Diocese of New York

David Karnovsky, Esq.

Real Estate Department

Fried, Frank, Harris, Shriver & Jacobson LLP

Joanne Lawson
TA President of Lakeview

Eudora Ortiz Lifetime Resident of East Harlem

Carol Wills 1199 Member Nichola Rodney 1199 Member

Teran James
1199 Union Delegate

Jeremy Kozin, Esq. Fried, Frank, Harris, Shriver & Jacobson LLP

George Fontas
On behalf of LSS Leasing Limited Liability
Company

Seth Wright
On behalf of LSS Leasing Limited Liability
Company

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 Mike Check - Today's date is September 18 3 of 2019 on the Committee of Zoning & Franchises

4 recorded by Stephen Sadowski [phonetic].

CHAIR MOYA: [gavel] Good morning, good morning and welcome to the meeting of the Subcommittee on Zoning & Franchises. I'm Council Member Francisco Moya, the chairperson of the Subcommittee and today we're joined by Council Members Grodenchik, Lancman, and Levin. If you are here to testify, please fill out a speaker slip with the Sergeant-at-Arms indicating your full name, the application name or LU number and whether you are in favor or against the proposal. Today we are holding a hearing on LU 530, an application for the E & R U. S. Ventures LLC, Hummus Kitchen for a renewal application requesting a four year term approval for the continued operation of an unenclosed sidewalk café located at 444 3rd Avenue in Manhattan in Council Member Rivera's district. I now open the public hearing on this application. Are there any members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application, and we will move to our votes. Today we will vote to approve LU 530, the Hummus Kitchen

Member Espinal is in support of this application.

map amendment to rezone an M11 district to an R6A

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 7 2 district including a partial C12 overlay district as well as a zoning text amendment to establish a 3 mandatory inclusionary housing area within the 4 rezoning area utilizing Option 2. As originally 5 proposed, these actions would facilitate the 6 7 redevelopment of the development site with a new seven-story mixed use building containing 8 approximately 56,000 square feet of zoning floor area 9 and 52 dwelling units in total, including 19 10 affordable units and 43 market rate units, 11 12 approximately 80 parking spaces would be provided which would be accessed via a curb cut on 38th 13 14 Street. During the public review process, the 15 applicant received the proposed development to 16 include a total of 57 dwelling units of which 18 17 would be affordable and 39 would be market rate. 18 now open the public hearing on this application, and I would like to call up the first panel Eric Palatnik 19 20 [phonetic]. Good morning. ERIC: Good morning, Councilman and 21 members of the Council and staff. 2.2 Thank you for 23 hearing this application on a beautiful day.

CHAIR MOYA: Before you start, let me

just get Counsel to please swear you in.

24

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNSEL: Please state your name and as

part of your response, do you swear or affirm that

the testimony you are about to give will be the

truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth and

6 you will answer all questions truthfully?

ERIC: I do, and I shall.

COUNSEL: Thank you.

Thank you very much. ERIC: excited to be here in front of your Committee which has I think the greatest job in the City, determining how we shape it and we've got a great project here that came to it's start 11 years ago if you can believe that and when the City was entirely different and the process we followed was different and they've been the beneficiary of a refined, streamlined land use that's taken effect the last few years and the project has kicked out and the application that we have in front of you is to take a manufacturing zoning district in Astoria, which I'm gonna click through here and give you the aerial here so you can see where you are. You're right next to Steinway Studios, we've got Steinway Street right there, excuse me, Kaufman Astoria Studios is right behind us, you're basically right in the heart of Astoria.

closely. They put forth a recommendation to support

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

visible from the street so it will really read as a 6-story building from the street. This gives you the parking. There's a sub cellar, there's two levels of parking, actually three. This level is the ground floor and this shows you the really minimal nature of the commercial uses that we're seeking for the ground floor. Only asking for about 2,000 square feet of commercial space to be utilized. The rest of it will be parking and the commercial uses we're envisioning are artistic, immersive arts and meditation studios. We're looking to build upon the art-based history of Astoria. The Pinto family themselves are very involved. The artwork you see on some of the pictures we show you, is their doing. They're involved in a beautification program in Astoria that includes artwork and murals so all the commercial uses will have some sort of artistic or wellness sort of feel to it, nothing corporate so to speak. move up to give you an idea just of the floor plans which are very hard to read here, this is a section of the building and another elevation which you saw in a picture. That is essentially the application for you. The height of the building will be 75', just to go through that for a second. We believe

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 it's justified if you look, I'm taking you back to an

3 overhead here. You can see just to the left of the

4 rezoning area, you'll see Ice House Sports Complex

5 which stands at a height of about 85' where at 75',

6 two blocks behind us where the blue dot is, Calvin

7 Astoria is building a new complex there that's about

8 85' as well so we're not out of context with what's

9 going on around us. That's our entire presentation.

10 | Thank you for listening to me and hello, Councilman

11 Reynoso. How are you? I didn't see you come in. I'd

12 | be happy to answer any questions that you have.

CHAIR MOYA: Thank you, I just have one quick question here. Can you just, what was the rationale for establishing the commercial overlay on only half of the rezoning area?

twofold, first of all replacing existing
manufacturing district so the idea to keep some
commercial there was the idea that the owner wanted
to do there but from a land use perspective, 38th
Street has a commercial nature to it both across the
street. I can show you some of the imagery if you'd
like. It's all commercial across the street.

There's warehouses, former warehouses that have been

2 turned into art studios and sports stores across the

3 streets so directly across the street is all

4 | commercial and everything to the left of us, if

5 you're looking at the red dots there, and I can show

6 you some imagery, some pictures, that's all

7 commercial as well. There's a Pizzeria Uno over and

8 some other commercial uses so the commercial use we

9 think will be symbiotic with what's going on around

10 us. We're not looking to replace, nothing corporate

11 | like I said to come in to replace what's going on on

12 | Steinway Street and the uses that we've already

13 | actually been speaking to are people that are in like

14 | the second story of buildings around that are looking

15 for this kind of space on the ground floor.

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you very much

17 | for your testimony.

ERIC: Thanks for listening to me.

CHAIR MOYA: Thank you. Are their any

20 other members of the public who wish to testify?

21 | Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this

22 application. Would like to acknowledge that we've

23 | been joined by Council Member Reynoso and Council

Member Rivera and I'd like to open up the votes

25 again.

16

18

19

2.2

2 COUNSEL: Continuing vote of the land use 3 items. Council Member Reynoso?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.

COUNSEL: Council Member Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

CHAIR MOYA: Thank you.

COUNSEL: By a vote of 6 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions, the items are approved and referred to the full Land Use Committee.

CHAIR MOYA: Okay, we will now hear preconsidered LU items C 100421 ZMQ and N 190151 ZRQ and C 190386 ZSQ for the Vernon Boulevard Broadway Rezoning proposal related to property in Council Member Van Bramer's district in Queens. The applicant seeks approval for a zoning map amendment, a zoning text amendment and a special permit for a large scale general development which together would facilitate construction of two residential and community facility buildings, one at 5 stories and one at 9 stories and a 14 story residential, commercial and community facility building. The buildings would contain a total of 351 dwelling units, 113 of which would be affordable to lower

Frank St. Jacque of Ackerman LLP appearing on behalf

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

northwest of the site and then the Gucci Museum directly west of the site. The requested actions including the zoning map amendment, a zoning text amendment and a special permit for a large scale general development will facilitate the development of a new mixed use and mixed income project with a site plan and massing[sic] that will fill the existing void and weave the site into the surrounding community. The rezoning would establish an R7X/C2-4 on the majority of the site, on the northern portion of the site and an R6B on the southern edge of the site. The text amendment establishes a mandatory inclusionary housing area with Options 1 and 2 and the special permit imposes bulk controls over the site as a large-scale general development. large-scale general development restricts development to the proposed site plan and bulk envelope and allows the bulk to be concentrated at the intersection of Vernon Boulevard, Broadway and 11th Street which are all wide streets. The proposed development is 3 mixed use buildings, a 5-story building on the southern portion of the site within the R6B district, a 9-story building at the center of the site within both the R6B and R7X-C2-4 districts

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

and a 14-story building on the northern portion of the site. The proposed development would now provide approximately 330 units, including 92 permanently income restricted MIH units. Here's several images showing the site plan which again the large-scale general development would mandate that the site is developed in accordance with. There's commercial space that will be provided along Vernon Boulevard to activate this street and serve local residents and visitors to the area. Again, the area lacks local retail and the proposed development is positioned to meet this local need. We anticipate food and beverage tenants. Additionally, we've been in discussion with the Gucci and the Socrates Sculpture Park about ensuring that they will have space within the new development. The top image shows, and you'll see another image in a moment of the approximately 16,545 square foot landscape public open space at the corner of 10th Street and 33rd Road. The smaller building is shown to the right on the upper slide at 5 stories that creates a transition at the southern edge of the site from a mid-density R5 district mapped to the south. The building B at the center of the top image is limited to 4 stories at 10th Street

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

which is directly across from the Gucci Museum and then the bottom image shows the 11th Street frontage of the building with access to a 166-space cellar level parking garage. Two changes were made to the project after it was filed in response to the applicant's initial meeting with the Community Board and ongoing discussion with the Council Member and community. The number of larger units was increased which resulted in a decrease in the total number of units and MIH units and the applicant committed to using Option 1 on buildings A and B, instead of Option 2 across the entire development. This slide shows the unit distribution and MIH breakdown for the project, again resulting in 330 total units, 92 of which would be mandatory inclusionary housing units using both MIH Option 1 and MIH Option 2. you're familiar with the facts of this project, so I'll just run quickly through the next few slides. These here in green, the site plan shows the significant amount of open space that's provided with this project. About an 1,100 square foot public open space at the northern edge of the site, approximately 15,000 square feet at the center of the site for building residents and about 16,000 square feet at

presentation. I'm happy to answer any questions.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

2.2

23

24

2.2

CHAIR MOYA: Great, well I'm glad to hear that you've gotten together with the Service Workers

Union. That's always good to hear when good paying jobs are going to be happening in projects like this so I'm glad to hear that. Just to go back to the public space for a second. How will that space operate on that site?

real property requiring certain maintenance and upkeep and operating hours that are set forth in the restrictive declaration so it will function essentially as a public amenity similar to a park but it's privately owned and will be enforceable under the POPS program.

CHAIR MOYA: So, is the open space required to be open to the public as part of the large-scale special permit?

FRANK ST. JACQUE: It is not. This is an amenity that we worked with the community, the local Council Member to provide as part of this project.

So, the large scale establishes the site plan so as

2.2

part of the site plan we're committed to providing
this open space but providing the open space unlike
in other areas doesn't add to the project's bulk
envelope. There's no zoning bonus attached so this
is just a commitment that the applicant has made in
response to ongoing discussions with the community.
In particular, taking account of the Gucci Museum and
its sculpture garden which is located directly to the
west of this open space.

CHAIR MOYA: And will the property owner maintain the public space?

FRANK ST. JACQUE: Yes, the property owner would be required to and actually any future property owners as this would be a restrictive declaration recorded against the property itself.

CHAIR MOYA: And when will the public have access to the open space?

FRANK ST. JACQUE: When the project is built essentially. This is not, this project isn't contemplated in phases so it's expected to come online essentially all at one time so to answer your question, once the building is complete and once the public open space is complete, it will be accessible to the public.

2.1

2.2

2 CHAIR MOYA: And how will that open space 3 be identified as open to the public?

requirements, there is signage that's required at all entry points, indicating the hours of operation, the rules and identifying it as a POPS space that's open to the public. My understanding is that it will also be included in the public databases as a public POPS open space so that members of the public can research and determine that it's there. That signage is actually part of the approved plans for the large-scale so those landscape plans actually will be, they have been approved by the City Planning Commission and will be part of this approval going forward.

CHAIR MOYA: Last question, since this project is in a flood hazard area, what kind of resiliency measures are included in the site design?

FRANK ST. JACQUE: Sure, so essentially the site itself, there's a significant grade change so from the northern end of the site is located, the elevation is lower at the northern edge of the site than it is at the southern portion so rather than dry flood proofing the commercial area, the architects have built the building, have raised the first floor

members, we [Inaudible] development and old neighbors

2.2

seriously. New projects shall come with community benefits like affordable housing and jobs that pay the premium wage. I am happy to report that Cipico Construction, the developer for this project, has made a credible commitment to provide premium wage jobs for the future building service worker at this site. This project will also come with other significant community benefits such as open space available to the public, community festivities space and 92 units of much needed permanent affordable housing on the [Inaudible] waterfront. We see this as an example of responsible development and respectful urge you to approve this project. Thank you.

testimony today. Are there any other members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none I now close the public hearing on this application, and we will now hear the preconsidered LU item C180282ZMQ for the 91-05 Beach Channel Drive rezoning relating to property in Council Member Ulrich's district in Queens. The applicant seeks approval for a zoning map amendment to map a C2-3 commercial overlay within an existing R4-1 district. The proposed amendment

	\triangle	DONITHO	7/ 1/ 1/	DD A MOLLT OD O
SUBCOMMITTEE	() [\	7.() N N(-	A N D	FRANUHISES

2.2

2 | would bring an existing funeral home and its

3 accessory parking lot into conformance with zoning.

4 I now open the public hearing on this application,

5 and I'd like to call up Eric Palatnik.

COUNSEL: Please state your name as part of your response. Do you swear or affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth and that you'll answer all questions truthfully?

ERIC: Eric Palatnik, yes I do.

COUNSEL: Thank you.

ERIC: Thank you, sorry I was outside speaking with some of your colleagues. Eric Palatnik, good morning again to everybody. It's a pleasure to be here again in front of your Committee and this is with another, what I consider to be a good application, to allow for the continuation and the legalization of the Dennis O'Connor Funeral Home which is at the foot of the Cross Bay Bridge as you enter into The Rockaways. You can see it right there. The funeral home is on the left side of the middle of the page. It's the site with the red arrow that says site. You can see on the left side of the top left corner, you can just see that the top, the

Board 14 who's office, meeting place is right around

the corner. They're very familiar with the site.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

They supported it almost unanimously I believe, if not unanimously. It's also received good support from Councilman Ulrich who is in support of it as It is the only funeral home servicing the Rockaways and it is non-denominational so it's open to everybody and nothing is going to be changing. should call out one more thing for you just so you're aware, just at the last minute, which is that the rezoning does facilitate future redevelopment of the site should that take place. Right now it's R4 so when we rezone it, it will become a commercial overlay and somebody could theoretically come in and built another McDonalds or a White Castle or any commercial use on the site so the community was concerned about that when we went through the community level review. Mr. O'Connor of O'Connor Funeral Homes is there himself as well as two young men who are succeeding him in the business. introduced them. They all explained the business plan right now is to the younger generations come into place and there's a business agreement in place and that nobody has any intention of leaving the site for the next 50 to 60 years. The community based upon their relationship and experience with O'Connor

2.2

Funeral Home took them at their word on that and O'Connor Funeral Home is committed to maintaining their location there. They are in no position to be selling and we submitted a letter to this effect as well and we just wanted to let your Committee know that they are committed to the Rockaways, there is not going to be any other commercial use here for the foreseeable future other than the continuing of O'Connor Funeral Home.

CHAIR MOYA: Well, that was gonna go into the question. If the applicant planned to redevelop or enlarge the existing development on the site.

ERIC: I figured as, yeah, that was the logical question only because I've heard it since we've started the application, you know, people say that. There's no intention to build anything larger than what's here. They do free up approximately 8,000 square feet of development rights as a result of this so there could be an enlargement. They're a very forthcoming family that owns the property and that operates there. They're very straight forward. If we had any desire to enlarge, we would have presented it right. We have no reason not to. We

2 came in with an illegal condition asking for this

3 permission so we're once again stating to you on our,

4 | not on my good word only, but only on the good word

of a neighborhood business that's been there for

6 decades that there's no desire to enlarge or change

ownership or to change the property in any way, shape

8 or form.

me.

1

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you very much for testimony today.

ERIC: Thank you. Thank you for hearing

CHAIR MOYA: Are there any other members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application, and we will now hear preconsidered LU item C180291 ZMQ for the 15-33 Clintonville Street Rezoning related to property in Council Member Vallone's district. The applicant seeks approval for a rezoning map amendment to map a C1-3 overlay within an existing R3-1 district. Under the proposal, the existing retail use on the property would be brought into conformance with zoning and the site could also be redeveloped and modernized which would not be permitted under the

2.2

current zoning. I now open the public hearing on
this application and call up Frank St. Jacque.

COUNSEL: Please state your name as part of your response. Do you swear or affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth and that you will answer all questions truthfully?

FRANK ST. JACQUE: Frank St. Jacque, I do.

COUNSEL: Thank you.

FRANK ST. JACQUE: Good morning again

Chair Moya and subcommittee members. Frank St.

Jacque of Akerman LLP here on behalf of the applicant for this proposed rezoning project. I'll run through this presentation quickly and I'm happy to answer any questions. This application seeks to establish a C1-3 within an existing R3-1 zoning district at 1533 and 1535 Clintonville Street that is comprised of two tax lots on Block 471, lots 6 and 7, in Queens community district 7. The proposed rezoning area has frontage on the Cross Island Parkway, service roads south, to the north and Clintonville Street to the west. It's approximately 6,400 square feet. The site is currently improved with illegal non-conforming

obsolete commercial building and a vacant two-story home. This is another view of the small commercial building at the site which cannot be reconfigured for a new commercial use without structural alterations. Hence this zoning map amendment application. proposed action is a zoning map amendment to add a C1-3 overlay to the existing R3-1 district. proposed overlay would facilitate redevelopment of the site with a new one-story commercial building. This would have a small service parking lot that will be landscaped to screen that new commercial development from surrounding properties and that's shown in the site plan here with the proposed new one-story building on the lower portion of the site plan with the service parking lot and screening landscaping surrounding it. Here's a massing of the development. Again, it's just a one-story commercial building to replace an existing, non-conforming commercial use of the site. Throughout public review, the Community Board and the Queensboro president had asked for several conditions which the applicant as agreed to and we're happy to answer any questions today.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

2.2

CHAIR MOYA: Great, leading with that,

Community Board 7 had several conditions to their

approval related to the site considerations. Is the applicant still willing to meet those conditions?

FRANK ST. JACQUE: The applicant is, yes.

CHAIR MOYA: And how will you memorialize those commitments?

FRANK ST. JACQUE: So the applicant has agreed to record a restrictive declaration against the site with respect to the listed conditions and the Community Board's approval. I believe there's a draft of that that either has been provided to your office and if, I can make sure they do.

CHAIR MOYA: Yeah, if we could get a copy of it, that would be great. Thank you very much for your testimony today.

FRANK ST. JACQUE: Thank you.

CHAIR MOYA: Are there any other members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application and we will now hear a preconsidered LU item C 190422 ZMQ for the 112-06 71st Road Rezoning relating to property in Council Member Koslowitz's district in Queens. The applicant seeks approval for a zoning

2.2

map amendment to rezone a portion of an existing R1-2A district to an R3-2 district. The proposal would bring into conformance two separate existing non-conforming use group for medical offices within the rezoning area and I now open the public hearing on

RICHARD LOBEL: Good morning.

this application. Richard Lobel, good morning.

COUNSEL: Please state you name as part of your response. Do you swear or affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth and that you will answer all questions truthfully?

RICHARD LOBEL: Richard Lobel, I do.

COUNSEL: Thank you.

RICHARD LOBEL: Good morning, Chair Moya, Committee Members, Richard Lobel from Sheldon, Lobel, P.C. and we're here for the 1122-06 71st Road Rezoning in Queens. The rezoning area is indicated in this circled area on the map is currently located within an R1-2A zoning district. This district is notable for several reasons. The first is that it only permits a .5 residential FAR, with a one for community facility and it also only allows for single family home use so the area that's highlighted in the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

dotted line is currently zoned R1-2A and the proposal is to rezone that to a R3-2. This would have the primary effect of allowing for the legalization of a doctor's office which is in the building that's highlighted in red on the map. The rezoning would include these four lots fronting on 112th street in this area. We feel that the land use rationale here is particularly appropriate given the fact that there's an R71 district across to the northwest and southwest of the site as well as several large community facilities located in and around this block. There's a public school on the same block as this site and to the north, across 71st Road, there is both a college, Touro College, as well as a house of worship. Again, from the land use map, you can see that the building stock here is relatively large to the west of the site. There is buildings ranging from six to ten stories in the immediate view of the site so the R3-2 here actually offers a nice transition between the denser R7-1 and the relatively low density R1-2A to the east and northeast. actual change to the zoning map would be as indicated on this map which would include the R3-2. It would run for 100 feet from 112th Street and finally to

note, in addition we have pictures, but the zoning calculations comparison table, the bulk for these two zoning district is essentially the same. It's the same maximum bulk. The real critical issue here is, of course, the use. The doctor's office here, Dr. T's Pediatrics office is a local institution that's heavily utilized by the local community. these surrounding dense residential areas, there's many families that use this practice. Indeed, it was submitted into the record that over 8,000 local families use Dr. T's Pediatrics and so we did have the support of the Community Board, the Queensboro president and the City Planning Commission. I would note, just paging through the pictures of this site as well as the surrounding larger residential that the Community Board did request that only the site itself be rezoned so only that 72 square foot lot while the Queensboro president and City Planning Commission all recommended rezoning of the four lots for context so that's really the entirety of the application. I'd be happy to answer any questions.

CHAIR MOYA: Great, well let's stick with the Community Board for a minute. What was the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

discussion like at the public hearing on this
application?

RICHARD LOBEL: So the vote itself was 38 to 4 in favor of this modified zoning district boundary. I think that the discussion was around density and whether or not there would likely be any redevelopment of the other lots. There were only four lots included in this application. I think what was compelling to the City Planning Commission and the Queensboro president is that any development, first of all, would be hampered by the fact that you are still within that .5 residential FAR and so of the four buildings on that block frontage, 2 of those buildings are already built above a .5 FAR and so changing them to an R3-2 would actually bring them closer to being in compliance. There's a attic rule in the R3-2 which would allow them to go to .6 so it just is not a case where, for example, on many applications we come in with a sizeable residential rezoning where you definitely creating soft sites and you're creating an opportunity for development. the prevailing view at the Queensboro president and the City Planning Commission was that's that highly

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

2.2

2 unlikely to happen and that this would merely allow 3 for this use to continue.

CHAIR MOYA: So was that their concern that it was related to the rezoning area into the other lots along $12^{\rm th}$ Street?

RICHARD LOBEL: Correct, that was the sole concern. They were very supportive of the doctor's office but I think that this was the second application that had come before them in about six months with a similar set of factors and so they just, I think, just kind of naturally said well, if we can curb, we'd like to curb it back.

CHAIR MOYA: Right, okay, great. Thank you very much for your testimony today.

RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you, of course.

CHAIR MOYA: Are there any other members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application. We will now hear preconsidered LU items C 190158 ZMM and N 190156 ZRM for the Terence Cardinal Cooke proposal relating to property in Council Member Ayala's district in Manhattan. The applicant seeks approval for a zoning map amendment to change an existing R7-2 district to an R8 district and an R7-2 to C1-5 to an

DAVID KARNOWSKY: Karnowsky, I do.

2 COUNSEL: Thank you.

RAFAELLA DUNHAM: Good morning chairman

4 Moya and

1

3

5

6

7

8

9

21

24

CHAIR MOYA: Is the microphone on?

RAFAELLA DUNHAM: There we go.

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you.

RAFAELLA DUNHAM: Better, sorry. Okay, my name is Rafaella Dunham with a company called

10 Washington Square Partners. We're advisors to

11 | ArchCare and Terence Cardinal Cooke on the rezoning

12 of their property in East Harlem. Just, I have a

13 | little background on ArchCare and Terence Cardinal

14 Cooke. ArchCare is the long-term care division of

15 | the Arch Diocese of New York. Terence Cardinal Cooke

16 operated one of their skilled nursing facilities

17 | that's located on a full block bounded by 5th Avenue,

18 E. 105^{th} Madison and E. 106^{th} . The block operated as

19 a campus, but it was originally, it's located in

20 buildings that were originally constructed for

different uses and eventually we're put together in

22 order to allow the facility to operate as a campus.

23 The facility is a \$559 bed skilled nursing home

together with a 56-bed specialty hospital. Terence

25 Cardinal Cooke is a safety net provider which means

Building which is located on 5th Avenue which was

large enough to allow the consolidation of the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

unencumber the balance of the property so they need

to relocate the boilers and the chillers, the OT/PT

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

lab into that building so that the other real estate can become available. The second step is to build a supportive housing building on the corner of 105th and Madison Avenue. That's the current location of a parking garage which has been closed for a number of years because it had structural problems but that is the first portion of the site that we are ab le to unencumber and then the last phase is to develop a residential building with a 500 member, program for all inclusive care for the elderly on the balance of the property so the land use actions are to rezone the R7-2 and R7-2 C1-5 portions of the property to an R8 and an R8 C1-5 district and to establish a mandatory inclusionary housing area. The effect of the rezoning doesn't increase the amount of floor area that can be developed on the property. shifts 145,000 square feed of that potential development from community facility use to residential use. This is an illustrative massing. Terence Cardinal Cooke is the applicant. There is no development partner for the residential building so this is just illustrative the maximum massing that's possible under the rezoning. As far as context is concerned, we believe the new buildings will be

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you. Let's go back to your MIH, so how much affordable housing is required per MIH and what were the MIH options that you were considering again.

RAFAELLA DUNHAM: We originally started the application with Option 2 which is 30% of the floor area at an average of 80% AMI. We were asked to expand that to include both options at one point but now we've been asked to focus on 25% of the floor area at an average of 60% AMI. That's approximately 85,000 square feet.

CHAIR MOYA: And will the MIH housing be the supportive housing?

RAFAELLA DUNHAM: Yes.

2.2

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

CHAIR MOYA: Okay, and can you explain the phasing of the different elements of the plan?

RAFAELLA DUNHAM: Yes, the first phase is to consolidate all of the activities into the renovated Flower Hill hospital building which is about three years of construction but has already started because there were improvements to the building that were necessary. The next phase would be to do the supportive housing building on the corner of 105th and Madison and the last phase is to do the residential building with the pay center in the base of it.

CHAIR MOYA: And is T.C.C. committed to staying in the Flower Hill building and staying at this site long term?

RAFAELLA DUNHAM: I can, this, go ahead.

SCOTT LARUE: Yes, good morning, Scott Larue, presidency of ArchCare, which is the health care ministry for the Arch Diocese of New York and we're completely committed to the mission of our programs there on 5th Avenue and that is certainly demonstrated by our recent \$50 million loan that we took out in order to move this project forward.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 47
2	CHAIR MOYA: And can you discuss your
3	efforts around ensuring good wages for operations
4	staff?
5	SCOTT LARUE: The majority of our staff
6	are members of SCIU and represented by collective
7	bargaining. We fully support that and have been
8	excellent partners with labor and it's our intention
9	that that will continue.
10	CHAIR MOYA: Right, and just seeing one
11	of the recommendations that the Community Board had
12	made was that the project team utilize a local non-
13	for-profit developer. Is that something that you're
14	still committing to or?
15	SCOTT LARUE: Yes.
16	CHAIR MOYA: Okay, great. That's it for
17	me. Thank you very much for your testimony today.
18	Appreciate your coming down here. I'd like to call

up the next panel, JoAnne Lawson, Eudora Ortiz, and Carol Wills.

[pause]

19

20

21

24

25

22 CHAIR MOYA: Good morning

ALL ON PANEL: Good morning. 23

> CHAIR MOYA: If you would just state your name and then we can begin, and you can begin your

testimony if you like and just make sure that the button is on so that the microphone. There we go.

JOANNE LAWSON: I'm Joanne Lawson and I'm here to support this project. I am the TA President of Lakeview which is directly across the street from ArchCare. It's a complex of 446 units of affordable housing. We have just got a 40-year deal where we have 40 years, and my tenants use the facilities. This going to be great for my tenants. I have a large population of multi-cultural people that use Terence Cardinal Cooke. They use it as their dialysis center. They use it for short-term care, rehabilitation. It has been in our neighborhood for I would say over 100 years because I also was born there which makes it a

CHAIR MOYA: Of course.

JOANNE LAWSON: Treasure in the community and one that we really have to keep. Again, I say I have thousands of people in my complex that will use the facilities and it's a necessary facility. It's an advantage. We can walk straight across the street when someone is rehabbing. You can do dialysis and still come home in the evening and come straight back

2.2

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

2.2

23

24

25

and it's a very vital organization for the community.

I know many people who love it because it's been servicing them for many, many years and I just want to say that it's very important for East Harlem.

CHAIR MOYA: Thank you.

CAROL WILLS: Good morning. My name is Carol Wills. Morning to you, Chair Moy

CHAIR MOYA: Good morning.

Members. First, I'm an 1199 member and I have worked with T.C.C. for over 25 years. This project would mean a lot to us. It would be for the great expansion to the community because of the residents who reside there. Also, we're going to save jobs and we're also going to have new jobs. We're going to

create new jobs with all the new technology that

would be coming in. Right now, the ambiance of the

place is not so appealing because we are given five

star care but we're in a three star building so that

6 is why we would like this project to go through so

 \parallel I'm in favor of this project.

2.2

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you all for coming down here and for your testimony today. Thank you so much. I'd like to call up the next panel, Nichola Rodney and Doreen James. Good morning. You can just state your name and then you can begin.

NICHOLA RODNEY: Good morning. My name is Nichola Rodney. I'm an 1199 member. I have worked at Terence Cardinal Cooke for over 25 years. I approve of the project because it will benefit the community. It will benefit the residents and also the staff and I love working there because I wouldn't be working there for over 25 years if I didn't love the mission that ArchCare and the Arch Diocese stands for so I back this project.

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you so much for your testimony.

TEHRAN JAMES: Good morning. My name is Tehran [phonetic] James, Union 1199 Union delegate

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.2

and I'm a young ArchCare workers. I'm here to advocate for this project because I think it would be meaningful to my employees to staff the community and I would like to work another 25 years with them.

[Laughter]

TEHRAN JAMES: I love my job. I love where I work and I'm just looking forward to giving them more of my service for them. Hence, we're here for it.

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you so much both of you for your testimony today. Are their other members of the public who wish to testify?

Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application. We will now hear LU items 534 and 535 for the LeFrak City Parking Garage proposal relating to property in my district in Queens. The applicant seeks approval for a new zoning special permit as well as a zoning text amendment that would establish the new special permit. If approved, the action would facilitate the continued use of an existing three-floor public parking garage located in Corona, Queens and adjacent to the residential portion of the LeFrak City residential complex to the north and east. The existing garage currently includes 356

site has approximately 212,402 square feet of lot

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

There are two office buildings with primarily government tenants located in the buildings. includes DEP, NYPD, IRS and CONED and the DEP has exclusive access to 350 parking spaces on the roof of the parking facility. The remaining spaces in the parking facility are for other tenants and there's a small number of parking spaces for the public. other uses on the zoning lot include a post office and coffee shop which we can see in these pictures. The post office is to the right of the top right of the picture in the top right-hand corner as is the coffee shop and there are two curb cuts that can be, one accessed off of Junction Boulevard and the other off of Horace Harding Expressway. The Horace Harding Expressway curb cut which you can see on all three of these pictures is used exclusively by DEP and the post office, the post office for deliveries and the DEP to access their entry into the parking facility at the end of a 224 foot driveway. The current application is to essentially renew the special permit that was granted by the Board of Estimate in 1968. However, instead of 870 parking spaces, the amount of parking spaces under this application will be 706 and this is to match the existing condition

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

today. It is our understanding that 870 parking spaces was actually never stripped in the garage and that the garage has essentially existed in the current condition which we are seeking to, I guess, include as part of this special permit application. There will be 71 bicycle parking spaces on the ground floor. There are currently 21 there today and there will be additional screening added to comply with the zoning resolution on the roof level. In addition to the special permit, the applicant seeks a zoning text amendment to allow the garage, which has operated successfully for 50+ years, to continue meeting its parking demands without having to provide unnecessary and excessive reservoir spaces. In other to achieve this finding that is the subject of the text amendment, the applicant much show that the continued use will not add to serious traffic congestion or unduly inhibit vehicular traffic and pedestrian flow in the surrounding area and we've included in our application a traffic study that supports this proposition. Because the garage is currently in operation, we were able to observe and determine exactly how many reservoir spaces were needed so in conclusion, this application is for the continued use of a garage in the same manner as operated for

decades. The DEP to have parking spaces on the

parking facilities roof and for the commercial

6 facility and based on the foregoing, we request that

tenants to continue to park in a off-street parking

7 this application is approved. I'll now take any

8 questions.

2.2

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you very much.

Just one quick question, do you know whether the text amendment will only apply to this project site or will it affect the development of, the potential development on other sites?

JEREMY KOZIN: Only this site. The text amendment applies only in Queens Community District 4 in C4-4 districts and this is the only C4-4 district in Community District 4.

CHAIR MOYA: Great, thank you so much for your testimony today. Are their any other members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public hearing on this application. This concludes today's meeting and I would like to thank the members of the public, my colleagues, counsel and land use staff for their hard work and attending.

This meeting is hereby adjourned. [gavel]

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 30, 2019