



Ana Bermúdez
Commissioner

33 Beaver Street
23rd Floor
New York, NY 10004

212-510-3710 tel

Statement to the New York City Council Committee on Civil Service & Labor

By Ana Bermúdez

June 25th, 2019 – 2pm

Good afternoon Chair Miller and members of the Civil Service and Labor Committee. I am Ana Bermúdez, Commissioner of the New York City Department of Probation (DOP). Joining me today is my Cabinet: Deputy Commissioners Sharun Goodwin, Gineen Gray, Michael Forte, and General Counsel Wayne McKenzie. I am here today to testify about the critical role probation plays across the criminal justice system, and, in particular, the incredible work of DOP's Probation Officers in creating a safer city for all New Yorkers.

Introduction

As we have not previously appeared before this committee, I want to briefly describe Probation's unique role in the community safety continuum. Probation is preventive: an alternative to incarceration, where a judge has determined that a person convicted of a crime can redress their actions while safely remaining in the community under our supervision. Probation is often confused with Parole, a state agency, which supervises people finishing the remainder of their prison sentence. Too often, public safety is narrowly defined as the absence of crime. However, true safety is much more than that – it is about trust and having a strong connection to the fellow human beings in your community.

Often when people come onto probation, that trust and connection has been eroded. Probation Officers work to restore that trust by helping people change their behavior and connect to opportunities, at roughly one-tenth of the cost of incarceration. We do this for more than 27,000 people each year – more than three times the City's average daily jail population - by leveraging *both* risk management: the supervision or monitoring intensity, and risk reduction: the supportive elements that help people to

change. To accomplish this, Probation Officers work together with our government and community partners to support people on probation through the behavior change necessary to create what we refer to as their “New Now” - getting out and staying out of the justice system.

Impact of Probation in New York City and Beyond

Nationwide, the role of probation is sometimes overlooked and often misunderstood, but always a crucial part of the criminal justice system. Here in New York City, Probation Officers perform a wide variety of important job functions in three main categories: pre-sentence investigations, the intake process, and the direct supervision of those sentenced to probation. In addition to the technical training and skills required of all peace officers, such as performing fieldwork, executing warrants, and carrying a firearm for certain assignments; NYC Probation Officers need a capacity for creative problem solving, conflict resolution, violence prevention, strong communication skills, and the ability to think and act strategically to help people change their high-risk behaviors. It is a demanding job in an increasingly complex world. As the field evolves towards further de-carceration, it is imperative that our focus is on working “smarter.” NYC Probation Officers are doing just that, and the results are extremely compelling.

I do not think anyone can, or wants to, put a “price” on how much it costs to help transform someone’s life. The countless success stories of people creating a “New Now” for themselves, in partnership with their Probation Officer, are truly priceless. However, through independent evaluations of our programs, we have begun to establish a base of local evidence, of what we have known for some time: the work of Probation Officers provide enormous cost savings and benefit to New York City by helping people to thrive safely in their communities. I will briefly summarize the evaluations of three of our signature initiatives: Arches, AIM, and NeON Arts.

Our **Arches Transformative Mentoring** program for 16-24-year olds relies on Probation Officers working in partnership with credible messenger mentors. A February 2018 independent evaluation of Arches, conducted by the Urban Institute, found that one year after beginning probation, Arches participants’ felony reconviction rates are *69 percent lower*, and two years after, **remain 57 percent lower**. Any expert will tell you – those findings are unprecedented. As the positive impact was *especially high* among 16 and 17-year-old Arches participants, we recently launched a similar program targeted to



our Family Court population to ensure that we prevent as many young people as possible from further justice system involvement.

Last fall we released the findings of another independent evaluation, also conducted by the Urban Institute for **Advocate, Intervene, Mentor**, or AIM - our individualized Alternative to Placement (ATP) program for high-risk youth ages 13 to 18. Over 90 percent of AIM participants avoided felony re-arrest within one year, and completed the program without incarceration (placement), creating a cost-avoidance for the City of more than \$29 million - roughly one-third of our entire agency budget. From both a policy and fiscal perspective, this further exemplifies the critical role of community supervision, performed by the Probation Officers of this Department, in helping to make New York City the least incarcerative and safest big city in the nation.

Lastly, **NeON Arts**, our public-private partnership with the uniquely qualified Carnegie Hall Weill Music Institute, has redefined innovative criminal justice programs, by bringing together probation officers, people on probation, stakeholders, and local arts organizations to provide arts and cultural opportunities. The NeON Arts evaluation builds on the 2017 Social Impact of the Arts study by the University of Pennsylvania, which examined the impacts that access to arts and cultural opportunities had on “underserved neighborhoods of NYC.” It found that communities with access experienced an **18% lower serious crime rate** compared to communities that did not. The collaborative work of Probation Officers within NeON Arts is so transformative that the Department received national recognition by winning the **Excellence in Community Crime Prevention Award** from the American Probation and Parole Association for the cutting-edge use of arts in community corrections. And, as part of the recently adopted FY2020 City Budget, the Council recognized and provided additional funding for NeON Arts as part of the Speaker’s Innovations in Criminal Justice Initiative. Thank you for your support.

The impact and reach of our innovative work goes beyond the five boroughs. Beginning tomorrow, we are hosting a national conference attended by a variety of jurisdictions including Los Angeles County Probation; Lewiston, Maine Department of Corrections; Jackson, Mississippi Mayor’s Office; New York State Division of Criminal Justice, and the Illinois Department of Juvenile Justice, who will participate in a 3-day immersion experience in order to replicate our groundbreaking credible messenger partnerships.

These evaluations and national recognition are evidence of both the critical and cutting-edge role NYC probation officers play in creating real community safety, as well as the long-term cost savings gained by preventing incarceration and instead working to one's change behavior in their community.

NYC Probation Officer: Longevity, Attrition, and Compensation

Despite our Department's incredible progress and great successes, the work of probation remains extremely challenging, complex, and dangerous. For those who choose this work, having a real "Probation Family" is something we value very highly. In my first few months as Commissioner, I went to a retirement party for a Probation Officer who had served the Department for 44 years! That is remarkable, but not unusual: the current average number years of service in the Probation Officer Title Series is nearly 30 years, even when factoring in an unprecedented wave of new hiring done in preparation for Raise the Age. DOP is lucky to have such dedicated and loyal staff - for the deep institutional memory and experience they bring to the agency, the continuity this creates for those on probation supervision during their sentence, as well as for those who stay in touch with their probation officer for on-going support long after their cases have closed. With the lowest national unemployment rate in 50 years and a thriving job market right here in New York City, our attrition rate of less than ten percent is nothing short of remarkable, and ensures the Department has a very stable, diverse, and experienced cadre of nearly 700 officers committed to doing this important, life-changing work.

The starting salary for a New York City Probation Officer, the qualification requirements for which include a baccalaureate degree and prior work experience, is currently \$45,931. At the 5-year mark, an officer's compensation is \$56,657 and on the current salary scale reaches \$64,858 at the final 20-year increment. However, with more than 20 years of service, an officer's compensation can, and does, exceed \$70,000. Our new contract with the United Probation Officer's Association (UPOA,) which was overwhelmingly ratified last month, included general wage increases of 2%, 3% and 3.25%, as well as created for the first time a maintenance allowance and annuity fund.

The makeup of our Department's leadership reflects the composition of our officers and is evidence of how DOP values experience and my personal commitment to the development of staff and maximizing

agency level promotional opportunities. Half of my Cabinet, and almost all of my Senior Leadership team, was appointed from within the agency. Deputy Commissioners Gineen Gray and Sharun Goodwin, the incredible women that lead the Department's Operations Divisions, both started their careers with the agency as line Probation officers. *DC Goodwin actually started with the agency as an intern!* 30 out of 33 staff on our Senior Leadership team, which is 60% female, were internal promotions or reappointments. Among the ranks of our Borough Assistant Commissioners and Family Court Directors – which are the equivalent of County-level appointed Probation Commissioner/Directorships - all nine positions were appointed from within the agency. One hundred percent of these discretionary appointments were filled by candidates who began their careers at the New York City Department of Probation as **line Probation Officers**.

My tenure as Commissioner has been laser focused on ensuring our staff is the best-equipped and trained Probation Department in the country – in order to both help elevate the status and work done by the phenomenal people at this agency, as well as the important role of probation in the criminal justice continuum nationwide. One of our five Agency Drivers is Staff Development, to which I have personally dedicated countless hours of training and ensuring that staff have access to a wide range of growth opportunities.

In addition to our commitment to staff development, career growth, and maximizing promotional opportunities, we have also worked hard to raise the visibility of Probation and the incredible work done each day by Probation Officers in New York City. We have launched several media campaigns in advance of each of the four Probation Officer Civil Service exams we have held over the past year. This includes social media, bus shelter advertising, and print ads in publications such as Metro NY, Amsterdam News, Caribbean Life, Chinese World Journal, and El Diario. You can spot our latest media campaign: **A Safer City for All**, right now at LinkNYC locations through the city. And it has paid off - since 2018, in anticipation for Raise the Age, we recruited and trained *nine* new **Probation Academy** classes, resulting in just under 300 new Probation Officers.

However, despite our great success in recruiting new officers, and despite our laudable overall attrition rate, 71 percent of our attrition takes place during the first two years on the job. Addressing this was the

agency's number one priority during the recently completed contract negotiation. While we were able to insure that the salaries for new hires were not frozen and that their number of workdays did not increase as was being proposed, we believe there is more to be done, and plan to continue to prioritize this issue moving forward.

The question of fair and equitable compensation for Probation Officers is a legitimate one. It deserves careful analysis, open-minded discussion, and a collaborative process among all stakeholders to both properly scope the issue and determine a viable path forward. Chair Miller, I want to thank you for the opportunity to publicly address this and set the record straight.

Last week's "The Chief" (*The Chief-Leader*, June 19, 2019), reported on a series of allegations that are personally heartbreaking to me. The City and the Department are being accused of having "suppressed salaries," while boosting responsibilities and workload as the "numbers of women and people of color employed by Probation increased." This does a terrible disservice to those who do and support the important work of Probation. Moreover, we learned of these allegations and related actions when we received media inquiries asking for comment on them.

It is both untrue and irresponsible to claim that female Probation Officers are paid less. Not only are women, and women of color, well represented at the highest levels of management within the Department, but the average salary of a female Probation Officer is actually slightly higher than the current average salary of a male Probation Officer.

Other claims are that the agency has "devalued Probation Officers" by "suppressing" wages at the low ends of the salary scales, frustrated step processes that lead to raises, and eliminated the Senior Probation Officer title. The Probation Officer title historically has, and continues to have, 17 increments, with pay increases for each – no steps or longevity payments have been removed or eliminated. As for the Senior Probation Officer title, it was declassified back in 2004 as part of Civil Service title broad banding. The agency had stopped using the title in 2001 – with only 14 officers ever appointed to that title. Although this preceded my Administration by more than a decade, the continuity of leadership at UPOA going back to 2003 makes the allegation all the more puzzling.

However, I want to reiterate that the question of fair and equitable compensation for Probation Officers is legitimate and deserves careful analysis to determine a viable path forward. Given all that has been accomplished by the officers of this Department, as well as the important work we still have yet to do, I am personally committed to that path forward, which will require collective efforts and unity among our staff, those on probation, and our communities.

CONCLUSION

The entire profession of probation is currently reckoning with its own “**New Now**” – led in no small part by the work of this Department. We now know that the former “trail em, nail em, and jail em” philosophy of community corrections did not work, and in fact did lasting harm and sowed distrust amongst the very people it purported to help. It created an “us” vs. “them” mentality that devalued the profession, and worse, destroyed trust between institutions and their communities. I strongly believe that the path forward in this circumstance requires a New Now as well.

As I said earlier, true safety is about trust. True community safety is a village around each and every one of us made up of family, neighbors, community organizations, and government, who work *together*, creating a “Safer City for All.” And that building and growing a “village” of people, who are all responsible for the well-being of a particular client, place, community, or situation is how we get there. That is the essence of our work: creating a “New Now” for people on probation in a one-size-fits-one approach so that together, we are successful in our mission of *Strengthening Communities and Changing Lives*.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify about the important work of the officers of the New York City Department of Probation. We are pleased to answer any questions you may have.



**Testimony of Michael Greco
Vice President, Local 2507
FDNY EMS Uniformed EMT's, Paramedics, Fire Inspectors**

Good Afternoon Chairman Miller and distinguished members of The Civil Service and Labor Committee. Thank You for allowing me the chance to address you today on the issue of pay inequity in FDNY.

As you know, our union has been struggling with the impacts of pay inequality since becoming part of the FDNY. My President has already testified to the pay disparity. But there are many other ways our members face different treatment on the job. They are over disciplined, they are not given unlimited sick leave, they face life threatening work conditions and illnesses shoulder to shoulder with NYC first responders yet are not given the recognition or even proper resources for this work. We are an integral and co-equal branch of New York City's emergency response system.

While of course each agency is unique, there is a huge crossover of the services that are being provided. New York City's emergency services are comprised of an intricate web of highly trained first responders whose duties often overlap, and who provide equally crucial and inter-related life-saving care to New Yorkers.

To put a face on it, our members respond daily to every emergency that occurs in New York City, standing shoulder to shoulder with every

service that answers a 911 call. We do not know what we are walking into, or what may be on the other side of the door, but that never slows us down. We were on the front lines of the response on 9/11, during Superstorm sandy, and at every catastrophe the city has encountered. We often respond to medical emergencies that escalate into violence and jeopardize our safety. Every three years, we are required to renew our certifications just to maintain our jobs, and we routinely have new responsibilities added to our job titles as technology evolves.

With the recent polarized political climate in our country, and threats against the city, EMS has become part of the City's Counterterrorism Task Force. We are given military grade ballistic gear to wear (aside from our personal issued ballistic gear) and must respond along with the NYPD to active shooter scenarios, while unarmed and vulnerable to harm.

We respond to every emergency in New York City: medical emergencies, rescue jobs, confined space rescue, train derailments, fires, car accidents, emotionally disturbed patients, and hazmat jobs, just to name a few.

Yet it seems like no matter how hard we try to address and remedy inequity among our ranks to recognize and compensate our members for these sacrifices, the City opposes these efforts.

This is perhaps the greatest hurdle to addressing these issues. This administration needs to be a partner in acknowledging and remedying inequity instead of putting its efforts into pretending it is not happening.

When Yadira Arroyo was killed in the line of duty, there was no requirement that her family receive the death benefits that she would have received had she been on the Fire side of the Department. While

the City graciously elected to extend those benefits to her, it took us going to the New York State legislature to pass a law that required EMS workers who die in the line of duty be given the same death benefits. Equally we had to fight this administration when it came to receiving paid sick leave for first responders who are suffering with illnesses related to their work on 911. These should not have to be fights we have with the City. That we need to do this underscores the profound lack of value and disrespect our members face. A sentiment that was recently underscored in a statement by the Mayor that we are underpaid because our work is "different." Our members still do not get unlimited sick leave like all other first responders. And of course it does not go unnoticed that our members are largely female and predominantly of color.

We are told constantly that this is a collective bargaining issue. While it's true that collective bargaining is part of the problem, it only exacerbates what is already biased. To illustrate the unfair nature of pattern bargaining adds to the problem is that for example when one group gets 10%, and everyone else has to follow the same pattern it doesn't take a degree in statistics to figure out 10% of fifty thousand compared to 10% of a hundred thousand only adds to the pay gap.

The problems with discriminatory pay practices will only be fully resolved Citywide when the City is forced to acknowledge there is a problem and begin the process of working collaboratively with the unions and employees who are harmed by these practices.

We hope this committee will continue to be a champion for City workers and help us in our fight to eradicate pay inequity in New York City. Thank you for your time.

Testimony of Oren Barzilay President FDNY EMS Uniformed EMT's Paramedics Local 2507.

Good afternoon Chairman Miller and distinguished members of The Civil Service and Labor Committee.

Thank you for allowing me the chance to address you today with regards to one of the most pressing issues facing the stability of the Emergency Medical Service. The FDNY EMS is in crisis. The ability to promptly and adequately respond to citizens in life threatening situations is diminishing every day due to the personnel crisis created by an inadequate and substandard wage pattern as well as personnel practices that routinely deplete the ranks of EMT's and paramedics.

This pattern and practice is caused by bias which leads to a devaluing of the EMS side of the FDNY. These patterns of bias are so engrained that even some of the efforts to address lack of diversity and equal opportunity end up instead perpetuating the problem.

Our members are consistently paid less for the lifesaving work they do, than the lifesaving work performed by others within the department.

By way of example, the Fire Department routinely "promotes" 900 EMT's and paramedics to the Fire Fighter title on a yearly basis in an effort to address its issues with lack of diversity. It draws on the large female and minority members in EMS to try to do so. Using the term "promotion", underscores the devaluation of the EMS side of the Department.

Moreover, members who choose to avail themselves of this practice often cite the inadequate wages they received in EMS as the reason. Despite their love of providing emergency services as an EMT or Paramedic, they were driven to leave EMS and move to the Fire side. But more egregious is that this practice ignores the devastation it has on the EMS side of the Department, reinforcing a sense that EMS work is lesser than other first responders all while pulling experienced EMTs and Paramedics from the workforce resulting in decreased work morale and retention.

Our members are consistently paid less for the lifesaving work they perform as compared to

other lifesavers within the department. I know there is an image that fire fighters fight fires and EMS workers transport people to the hospital. EMS is much more than a transport service. Our EMTs and Paramedics perform on scene rescue and lifesaving functions actually working up and treating patients on scene and while being transported. We treat sick and injured New Yorkers in the pre-hospital setting every single day of the year. But the work of the FDNY is even more complex, and EMS and fire work together, in an interrelated way that provides much more than emergency transport. This work often overlaps.

For example, both the fire side of the department and the EMS side of the department process emergency calls and dispatch tens of thousands of emergency responses. Yet despite being in the same building, on the same floor, and even though EMS workers process significantly more of these calls, the fire side employees are paid more. The office of recruitment and training literally has an integrated unit in which EMS and fire side employees work together, attend the same trainings, recruitments and complete the same projects yet the EMS employees make significantly less. Obviously, EMS members provide different life saving services in the field but aren't these services just as valuable as the other services the FDNY provides and many of the services the department performs, such as call processing are not in the field.

Furthermore, the FDNY is the only agency that has a different rate of pay for the same titles within its own agency depending on whether the title is on the predominately of color and largely female side of the EMS or the predominately white and male fire side. These issues might just seem like pay inequity issues, but they have devastating effects on the department. The impact this has is one of the most pressing issues facing the stability of the Emergency Medical Service.

Other city entities may claim that retention and attrition rates are within what will be described as normal limits. Do not be duped. The fact is 80% of new hires in EMS leave within 4 years. When they leave they take well-honed clinical expertise with them. This, when coupled with a recent and on-going wave of retirements creates a naive, inexperienced and marginally prepared work force.

The contrast between the demographics and corresponding pay on both sides of the Fire Department could not be starker. While the Fire side of the Department struggles with an alarming lack of diversity, the EMS side struggles with an equally alarming lack of compensation for its members work.

Based on 5th year salary an EMT makes 46% and a paramedic makes 30% less than other first responders. Let me remind this body this is in not a complaint against other NYC first responders, who do heroic work and should be fairly compensated, it is a complaint against a department that has refused to accept the reality that there is bias in the way they value and compensate its employees.

Granted there is a vast difference in base hours and contractually guaranteed overtime, however the hourly rate exemplifies the same vast differences. And the fact that we have not had the same opportunities to collectively bargain is not an excuse for discriminatory pay practices.

Some have attempted to deflect by saying that our pay is less because we have not been as effective in collective bargaining. Such a claim ignores the pervasive bias that has created and perpetuates this issue. Again the fact, that we have not had the same opportunities in collectively bargaining is not an excuse for discriminatory pay practices, it is yet another example.

The Uniformed EMT's, Paramedics & Inspectors of Local 2507 have a short history of bargaining and despite laws that require us to be treated as a uniformed service, we are not always treated as so. The current practice of pattern bargaining, by its nature, discriminates against the titles I represent by not letting us be at the table as equals. Although we are, for the purposes of collective bargaining Uniformed members of the FDNY, we are consistently offered lower wage percentages than other Uniformed agencies and when we challenge why, we are told we are civilians.

In the 2016 round of negotiations we addressed the issue of base hours and guaranteed overtime by proposing an alternative work chart of 12 hour shifts. The City agreed to a limited pilot

program. Today, despite our ability to demonstrate massive savings by fully adopting the alternative work chart, the program remains a limited pilot.

Over a year ago we asked the City for pay data so that we could better understand how our members were being harmed by potential discriminatory pay practices. Rather than work with us to get this information and correct these problems, the City denied our FOIL requests. Despite the fact that this committee and the City Council recently passed legislation to require the City to provide pay data that would eliminate discriminatory pay practices, the City has fought us tooth and nail, requiring us to spend time and resources litigating the issue of whether or not we should be allowed to receive the race and gender of our members and their comparators. The City has even refused to provide this information, when we offered that the names be redacted and anonymized.

In closing, let me say that a commitment to non-discrimination in the workforce is a commitment to excellence. The ability of The FDNY to provide the highest level of emergency preparedness for the largest and busiest EMS system does not come cheap. It requires valuing the workers, paying them fairly, ensuring equal employment opportunities and proper recognition of their sacrifices.

--

Oren Barzilay

President

FDNY EMS Local 2507

150-39 14th ave

Whitestone NY 11357

Second Floor

Office:7183710310

Fax: 7183710318



Uniformed Emergency Medical Service Officers Union

FDNY, Local 3621, DC37, AFSCME, NYSPEC, AFL-CIO

Testimony of Vincent Variale President

Uniformed EMS Officers Union, Local 3621, FDNY DC37, AFSCME AFL-CIO

Good afternoon, Chairman Miller and distinguished members of the Civil Service and Labor Committee.

Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to testify on the issue of pay inequity in the City's workforce.

As you will hear from others, the issue with pay inequity is a Citywide problem. Today I will provide you with some insight into the problems and struggle within our department.

Since merging with the Fire Department in the 1990s, EMS has felt the institutional challenges the Department has grappled with, with regards to bias in all aspects of its operations, from the work culture, hiring, promotions, pay and resource allocation within the Department.

As a report put out by the Citizens Budget Commission notes, the merger of EMS into the FDNY was not accompanied by a fundamental transformation of the organization and staffing of the FDNY. As a result, the FDNY has not efficiently addressed the changes in the roles in the Department and perpetuates a decades long culture of discrimination and bias.

One problem our members have had to deal with as a result of this is the lack of unbiased promotional processes that result in the loss of proper diversity and a bleaching of the EMS ranks. While a recent state law was passed requiring that the City put in place a civil service exam for promotions, as of yet they have not done so, and so there is no civil service exam or any proper promotional

process for all titles above Lieutenant including Captain, Deputy Chief and beyond.

To add insult to injury our members' treatment is starkly different from other first responders and uniformed emergency services.

A headline in the Daily News confirmed "record high NYC 911 calls, bulk handled by EMS – the lowest-paid first responders." The report goes on to confirm that "the FDNY handled a record 1.8 million calls last year... [and] of those, EMS handled 1.5 million. And EMS did this with less members than any other emergency service.

Yet EMT base salaries start around \$30,000 a year and cap at \$51,000 after five years. Paramedics, who have even more medical training and certification, start at \$45,000 with Lieutenants and Captains top pay is capped at \$71,000 and \$75,000 respectively.

On their own, these salaries are alarming for trained emergency medical staff in the City of New York, and their supervisors, who literally put themselves in harms' way to save lives. But compare this to other first responders and uniform services who all earn \$40,000 or more annually. It does not go unnoticed that the common difference these other titles share is that they are much more white and much more male.

This stark difference in pay and the demographic relationship underscores the severe problems with the lack of recognition and pay EMS members receive and the reasons this goes unremedied. This is not to say that there are not problems on the other side of the Department or in other agencies.

The impact of the problem with inequity manifests differently in the predominately white and male side of the Department, and the predominately of color and female side of the department, (EMS). But the problem is the same – a fundamental institutional bias

within the Department that allows its non-white and female employees to be undervalued, under-supported, under-employed, underutilized and underpaid. This has a profound negative effect on the lives of these workers, but it also negatively effects the quality of services the public relies on for emergency services in the City of New York. When we do not support those who provide lifesaving service for New Yorkers, we are threatening and diminishing those lifesaving services New Yorkers depend on.

In addition to this, there are numerous ways EMS workers are not recognized or supported. Some of these are small indignities like not getting recognition in ceremonial events. Others are serious impediments like not being entitled to unlimited sick leave that every other first responder and uniform emergency services are entitled to and receive.

We look forward to working in partnership with this committee and this Council to bring New York City as an employer, into the 21st century and to build on the work this body has already done to finally and fully end pay inequity in the New York City workforce.

Vincent Variale

Vincent Variale
President



UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION

118-35 Queens Blvd. Suite 1210
Forest Hills, NY 11375
(212) 274-9950

Testimony at City Counsel

Good Afternoon Chair and Committee members

My name is Dalvanie K. Powell and I am the President of the United Probation Officers Association. I represent over 800 Probation Officers and Supervising Probation Officers and more than 400 retirees. My membership consists 90% of people of color and 78% of them are women. We are honored to have been invited to participate and testify in the discussion pay disparity.

Task

When people think of the Criminal Justice system they tend to think of the courts, Police, Correction, and Parole Officers. Probation is that piece of the antimony of the criminal justice system that is too often forgotten or grossly confused with other law enforcement agencies and even those in the field of social work.

Probation is an alternative to incarceration. It is a sentencing to community corrections and community supervision

The task of a Probation Officer is unique because we are charged with balancing the scales of Justice by enforcing court orders, providing services and guidance to men, women and youth who have been convicted or has a finding of a criminal offense, and holding them accountable for their actions, in hopes to reduce any further involvement in criminal activity and the prevention of victimization. Community safety is our primary concern.

Field visits are made in some of the most dangerous neighborhoods. Probation Officers are in just as much risk as other law enforcement officers. Probation Officers are required to work various shifts including nights, weekends and holidays.

We have an intel unit of Probation Officers who execute warrants within New York and other states. Within this unit we have a cyber unit. These officers work with NYPD, Department of Corrections, US Marshals, homeland security and many other units of law enforcement

In addition to supervision, the Probation Department is also responsible for conducting investigations for Family Court, Criminal and Supreme Courts. Aside from assisting the courts in making the most appropriate dispositions, presentence/predisposition investigations, we also address the concerns of the victims. These investigations are mandated for all offenders sentenced to the Department of Correctional Services (DOCS) and are utilized by the Division of Parole.

For the sake of time I have attached the notice of examination from DCAS which describes in depth what the job involves for a Probation Officer and I have also attached a similar notice of examination for Supervising Probation Officer for your review

Qualifications

To be qualified for a career as a Probation Officer one must have a graduate degree from an accredited college or university or at the least a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university and two years of satisfactory full-time experience in a job related field.

Probation Officers are required to complete eight weeks of training which consist of fundamentals, defensive tactics training and we must satisfy the training requirements established by the State of New York for Peace Officer Certification. Hence, Probation Officers are peace officers who carry firearms and make arrests when necessary in order to enforce public safety.

Salaries

We recently ratified our contract with a total increase of 7.25%. The hiring rate for Probation Offices will be \$45,934 and the maximum salary will be \$76,483. For the promotional position to a Supervising Probation Officer the salary will start at \$61,276 and the maximum rate will be \$91,518.

Since we are here to discuss pay disparities, the above salaries may appear to be impressive to some, but the sad reality is that none of the titles I represent ever reach their top maximum salaries.

Please see the attached chart which shows the growth of how our salaries will look after the wage increase is applied. A Probation Officer after 11 years will earn only \$52,824 and for a Supervising Probation Officer, after 16 years, salaries will earn \$ 70,467. These numbers will vary depending on when and how one came into the agency. As you can see we have no guarantee when we will reach our top salary, unlike our brothers and sisters who work in other law enforcement agencies including Probation Officers from Nassau, Suffolk, and Westchester who are required to have the same education, experience and like us have to adhere to the same state mandates.

Over the years and since Raise the Age has been implemented, the department has hired a significant number of new recruits, however we have lost more than over 15% of the seasoned and new Officers because of the low salaries. When this happens, everyone loses, especially the community at large.

Therefore, when we think of criminal justice reform you all should think of Probation Officers as our objective is to help change the mindset of those men, women and youth who come through our doors because of the poor choices they have made, which in turn will reduce recidivism and keep the community safe. When you think of bail reform you should think of Probation Officers as there are thousands of cases where a person remains in the community, receiving services at pre-disposition and not behind bars, thereby saving the city millions of dollars. When you think of the reduction of mass incarceration you should think of Probation Officers because we are saving the city and state billions of dollars while we supervise and monitor those who have been convicted of a criminal act instead of being incarcerated. When you think of community policing you should think of Probation Officers as we are out there in the field risking our lives, while saving lives. When you speak of the low rate of crime in the city you should think of Probation Officers.

In conclusion, we the members of the United Probation Officers Association would like to have someone explain why in 2019 we have to come with cup in hand asking that it be filled so we can live, take care of our families now and in the future? Why are we struggling to get what we worked so hard for and deserve but yet we are being denied because of our gender and the color of our skin. This pay inequity needs to be corrected now in order to recruit and retain the best possible candidates.



BILL DE BLASIO
Mayor

DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
BUREAU OF EXAMINATIONS

LISETTE CAMILO
Commissioner

NOTICE OF EXAMINATION

PROBATION OFFICER

Exam No. 8065

WHEN TO APPLY: From: March 7, 2018

APPLICATION FEE: \$61.00

To: March 27, 2018

If you choose to pay the application fee with a credit/debit/gift card, you will be charged a fee of 2.49% of the payment amount. This fee is nonrefundable.

THE TEST DATE: Multiple-choice testing is expected to begin on Friday, June 29, 2018.

**YOU ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR READING THIS ENTIRE NOTICE
BEFORE YOU SUBMIT YOUR APPLICATION.**

WHAT THE JOB INVOLVES:

Probation Officers, under supervision, with some latitude for independent or unreviewed action or decision, perform difficult and responsible work in the field of probation providing assigned individuals services in intake, investigation, supervision, and enforcement. They make preliminary investigations of defendants' alleged crimes or offenses; obtain information on offenders' legal, economic, and psycho-social history and background; interpret conditions of sentence to persons placed under probation supervision; provide therapeutic counseling to probationers individually or in groups, and supervise their progress; assist Family Court in making appropriate determinations in very complex and sensitive cases; act as liaison between the department and the courts; secure and clarify information, answer questions, prepare and submit written reports and recommendations, including revocation of probation if necessary; keep track of court cases in which the department is involved; refer probationers to social, governmental or community agencies which may assist in probationer's rehabilitation; perform field work, which includes home visits to individuals under investigation or supervision; correspond with and make collateral visits to friends, relatives, community agencies, employers, former employers, places of worship, schools, law enforcement agencies, and others; prepare and maintain case records; provide specialized services in research and demonstration projects; provide intake service to determine the necessity for court intervention or adjust matters without referral to court; operate a motor vehicle; serve as department representative, as may be required; receive instruction in the use of deadly physical force, firearms and other weapons; may operate a computer; may assist in the supervision of volunteers; may perform violation of probation warrant investigations, enforce Violation of Probation warrants, execute warrants, perform "failure to report" investigations and requisite field visits, detain or take into custody probationers wanted by law enforcement agencies, assist the Office of General Counsel in the preparation of cases for the Violation of Probation process, and execute search orders; and perform related work.

Special Working Conditions:

Probation Officers may be required to work various shifts including nights, Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays.

Some of the physical activities performed by Probation Officers and environmental conditions experienced are: walking to and from sites for court and field visits; making field visits in all kinds of weather; making field visits to potentially dangerous areas; making visual observations/ surveillance of locations; reading documents; sitting for extended periods of time; communicating orally; when assigned to Field Services Unit, carrying a weapon and executing warrants and taking into custody probationers wanted by law enforcement agencies. All Probation Officers perform related work.

(This is a brief description of what you might do in this position and does not include all the duties of this position.)

THE SALARY:

The current minimum salary is \$42,759 per annum. This rate is subject to change.

HOW TO QUALIFY:

You may be given the test before we verify your qualifications. You are responsible for determining whether or not you meet the education and experience requirements for this examination prior to submitting your application. If you are found "Not Qualified," your application fee will not be refunded and you may not receive an Admission Notice or score. (For more information see Exam Site Admission section.)

You will **not** receive credit for education which you obtain after June 30, 2018 or experience which you obtain after the end of the Application Period (March 27, 2018).

READ CAREFULLY AND SAVE FOR FUTURE REFERENCE

EDUCATION AND EXPERIENCE REQUIREMENTS:

1. a graduate degree from an accredited college or university, in social work, education, law, sociology, psychology, criminology, rehabilitation counseling, counseling, guidance, or a related field; or
2. a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university, and two years of satisfactory full-time experience in casework or counseling in a recognized social work/counseling setting adhering to acceptable professional standards in the field of probation, parole, social services, psychiatric social work, or a related field; or
3. a Bachelor of Social Work degree from an accredited college or university, and one year of satisfactory full-time experience in casework or counseling as described in "2" above; or
4. a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university, and one year of satisfactory, full-time experience in the field of probation providing services for assigned individuals in intake, investigation, supervision or enforcement; or
5. a satisfactory combination of education and/or experience which is equivalent to "1," "2," "3" or "4" above. **However, all candidates must have at least a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.** Graduate credits in the fields listed in "1" above may be substituted for up to one year of experience as described in "2" above on the basis of 30 graduate semester credits for one year of experience.

In order for experience in casework and/or counseling to be acceptable, at least 50% of your time must be spent performing duties which involve therapeutic interaction used to modify behavior. The experience must include at least one of the following areas: intake and developing and recording a psycho-social history; conducting an evaluative analysis or assessment; providing counseling or supportive supervision; developing and implementing a treatment plan; or providing referral and follow-up services. **Such experience must have been gained after receipt of a baccalaureate degree.** Experience as a tutor, clerical worker, peer counselor, leader/companion, recreational counselor, legal assistant, investigator, camp counselor, eligibility specialist or custodial supervisor is **not** acceptable.

The education requirement must be met by June 30, 2018. The experience requirement must be met by the last day of the Application Period (March 27, 2018).

The college or university must be accredited by regional, national, professional, or specialized agencies recognized as accrediting bodies by the U.S. Secretary of Education and by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA).

The law school must be accredited by the American Bar Association or the California Bar Association.

If you were educated outside the United States, you must have your foreign education evaluated to determine its equivalence to education obtained in the United States. This is required only if you need credit for your foreign education in this examination. For more information see the Foreign Education Evaluation Guide in the Required Information section.

You must clearly specify in detail all of your relevant education and experience on your Education and Experience Test and submit it by the end of the Application Period.

You will **not** receive credit for education which you obtain after June 30, 2018 or experience which you obtain after the end of the Application Period.

Age Requirement:

In accordance with section 257 of the Executive Law, you must have reached your 21st birthday by the time of appointment. There is no minimum age to file for this examination. However, if you are too young for appointment on the date the eligible list is terminated, you will have no further opportunity for appointment from this list.

Peace Officer Training Certification Requirement: You must satisfy the training requirements established by the State of New York for Peace Officer Certification. Once obtained, this certification must be maintained for the duration of your employment.

Character and Background: Proof of good character and satisfactory background will be absolute prerequisites to appointment. The following are among the factors which ordinarily would be cause for disqualification: (a) arrest record or conviction of an offense, the nature of which indicates lack of good moral character or disposition toward violence or disorder; (b) repeated arrests or convictions of an offense, where such convictions indicate a disrespect for the law; (c) discharge from employment, where such discharge indicates poor behavior or inability to adjust to discipline; and (d) dishonorable discharge from the Armed Forces. In accordance with provisions of law, persons convicted of a felony or domestic violence misdemeanor are not eligible for appointment to the title of Probation Officer.

Driver License Requirement: By the time you are appointed to this position, you must have a motor vehicle driver license valid in the State of New York. If you have moving violations, license suspension(s) or an accident record, you may be disqualified. This license must be maintained for the duration of your employment.

Medical and Psychological Requirement: Medical guidelines have been established for the position of Probation Officer. Candidates will be examined to determine whether they can perform the essential functions of the position of Probation Officer. Where appropriate, a reasonable accommodation will be provided for a person with a disability to enable him or her to take the medical examination, and/or to perform the essential functions of the job. Certain assignments in which firearms are used require eligibles to undergo a psychological evaluation.

Drug Screening Requirement: You must pass a drug screening in order to be appointed.

Residency: According to section 255 of the New York State Executive Law, Probation Officers may reside in any county within New York State.

English Requirement:

You must be able to understand and be understood in English.

Citizenship: United States citizenship is required at the time of appointment.

Proof of Identity:

Under the Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986, you must be able to prove your identity and your right to obtain employment in the United States prior to employment with the City of New York.

HOW TO APPLY:

If you believe you meet the requirements in the "How to Qualify" section, submit an application on the Online Application System (OASys) at www.nyc.gov/examsforjobs. Follow the onscreen application instructions

for electronically submitting your application and payment, and completing any required information. A unique and valid email address is required to file online. Several internet service providers, including but not limited to Google, Yahoo!, AOL, Outlook.com, and Mail.com offer free email addresses. **All new OASys accounts require verification before a candidate can submit an application to ensure the accuracy of candidate information. Verification is instantaneous for most accounts, but some accounts may require up to two (2) business days to be reviewed by a staff member and resolved. Email notification will be sent to those creating accounts that require additional documentation before they can be resolved. Please keep this information and the application period deadline in mind when creating your account.** The following methods of payment are acceptable: major credit card, bank card associated with a bank account, or a prepaid debit card with a credit card logo which you may purchase online or at various retail outlets.

If you are receiving or participating in certain forms of public assistance/benefits/programs, or are a veteran, you may qualify to have the application fee waived. For more information on eligibility for a fee waiver and documentation requirements, visit the Fee Waiver FAQ on the Online Application System at <https://a856-eeexams.nyc.gov/OLEE/oasys/FAQFeeWaiver.aspx>.

You may come to the DCAS Computer-based Testing & Applications Centers to file for this examination online and submit a money order payable to DCAS (Exams) or to submit documentation for a fee waiver. The centers will be open Monday through Saturday from 9:00 AM to 5:00 PM:

<u>Manhattan</u>	<u>Brooklyn</u>	<u>Queens</u>	<u>Staten Island</u>
2 Lafayette Street 17th Floor New York, NY 10007	210 Joralemon Street 4th Floor Brooklyn, NY 11201	118-35 Queens Boulevard 5th Floor Forest Hills, NY 11375	135 Canal Street 3rd Floor Staten Island, NY 10304

Special Circumstances Guide: This guide is located on the DCAS website at www.nyc.gov/html/dcas/downloads/pdf/misc/pdf_c_special_circumstances_guide.pdf and available at the DCAS Computer-based Testing & Applications Centers. This guide gives important information about requesting an alternate test date because of religious observance or a special test accommodation for disability, claiming Veterans' or Legacy credit, and notifying DCAS of a change in your mailing address. Follow all instructions on the Special Circumstances Guide that pertain to you when you complete your "Application for Examination."

REQUIRED INFORMATION:

- 1. Application for Examination:** Follow the online instructions, including those relating to the payment of fee and, if applicable, those found in the Special Circumstances Guide.
- 2. Education and Experience Test:** Fill out **Sections A.4 (Undergraduate Education) and the following sections applicable to you: A.1 (Foreign Education Evaluation), A.5 (Graduate Education), A.6 (Courses), and B (Employment/Work Experience).** This test must be filled out completely and in detail for you to receive your proper rating. Follow the online instructions.
- 3. Foreign Education Evaluation Guide: (Required only if you need credit for your foreign education to meet the education and experience requirements):** If you were educated outside the United States, you must have your foreign education evaluated to determine its equivalence to education obtained in the United States. The services that are approved to make this evaluation are listed on the Foreign Education Evaluation Guide located on the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) website at www.nyc.gov/html/dcas/downloads/pdf/misc/foreigneducation.pdf. When you contact the evaluation service, ask for a "course-by-course" evaluation (which includes a "document-by-document" evaluation) of your foreign education. You must have one of these services submit its evaluation of your foreign education directly to DCAS no later than eight weeks from the last day of the application period.

THE TEST:

The multiple-choice test may be given at a computer terminal or in paper and pencil format. You will be informed of the format on your Admission Notice. Your score on this test will be used to determine your place on an eligible list. You must achieve a score of at least 70% to pass the test.

The multiple-choice test is designed to assess the extent to which candidates have certain knowledge and abilities determined to be important to the performance of the tasks of a **Probation Officer**. Task areas to be tested are as follows: Case Management, Forms and Reports, Field Service Activities, Specialized Duties.

The test may include questions requiring the use of any of the following abilities:

Written Comprehension: understanding written sentences and paragraphs. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when reading a pre-sentence investigation report.

Written Expression: using English words or sentences in writing so that others will understand. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when writing a Violation of Probation report.

Memorization: remembering information, such as words, numbers, pictures and procedures. Pieces of information can be remembered by themselves or with other pieces of information. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when recalling details for an investigation report.

Problem Sensitivity: being able to tell when something is wrong or is likely to go wrong. It includes being able to identify the whole problem as well as elements of the problem. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when making referrals regarding services for individual probationers.

Deductive Reasoning: applying general rules to specific problems and coming up with logical answers. It involves deciding if an answer makes sense. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when making recommendations to the court about a probationer's sentencing.

Inductive Reasoning: combining separate pieces of information, or specific answers to problems, to form general rules or conclusions. It involves the ability to think of possible reasons for why things go together. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when applying and enforcing the conditions of probation.

Information Ordering: following correctly a rule or set of rules or actions in a certain order. The rules or set of rules used must be given. The things or actions to be put in order can include numbers, letters, words, pictures, procedures, sentences, and mathematical or logical operations. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when using the proper steps to complete a pre-sentence investigation report.

Time Sharing: ability to shift back and forth between two or more sources of information. Example: A Probation Officer might use this ability when looking at different sources of information regarding a probationer, such as schools and family members and when writing a pre-sentence investigation report.

Certain questions may need to be answered on the basis of documents or other information supplied to the candidates on the date of the multiple-choice test.

EXAM SITE ADMISSION:

You will be sent an Admission Notice in the mail about 10 days before the date on which testing is expected to begin. If you do not receive an Admission Notice at least 4 days before the date on which testing is expected to begin, you must go to Administration, Customer, and Exam Support, 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, Manhattan, to obtain an Admission Notice. Test site assignments will take your address into consideration, but nearness to your address cannot be guaranteed.

Warning: You are not permitted to enter the test site with cellular phones, smart watches, beepers, pagers, cameras, portable media players, or other electronic devices. Calculators are not permitted. Electronic devices with an alphabetic keyboard or with word processing or data recording capabilities such as planners, organizers, etc. are prohibited. If you use any of these devices in the building at any time before, during, or after the test, you may not receive your test results, your test score may be nullified, your prohibited device(s) may be confiscated and your application fee will not be refunded. You may not have any other people, including children, present with you while you are being processed for or taking the test and no one may wait for you inside of the test site while you are taking the test.

Required Identification: You are required to bring one (1) form of valid (non-expired) signature and photo bearing identification to the test site. The name that was used to apply for the exam must match the first and last name on the photo ID. A list of acceptable identification documents is provided below. If you do not have an acceptable ID, you may be denied testing. Acceptable forms of identification (bring one) are as follows: State issued driver's license, City or State issued identification card, IDNYC, US Government issued Passport, US Government issued Military Identification Card, US Government issued Alien Registration Card, Employer ID with photo, or Student ID with photo.

Leaving: You must leave the test site once you finish the test. If you leave the test site after being fingerprinted but before finishing the test, you will not be permitted to re-enter. If you disregard this instruction and re-enter the test site, you may not receive your test results, your test score may be nullified, and your application fee will not be refunded.

CHANGE OF MAILING AND/OR EMAIL ADDRESS:

It is critical that you promptly notify DCAS of any change to your mailing address and/or email address. If we do not have your correct mailing and/or email address, you will not receive information about your exam(s), consideration for appointment and/or important information that may require a response by a specified deadline. Change of mailing and/or email address requests submitted to any agency other than DCAS, such as to the United States Postal Service, will NOT update your records with DCAS.

To update your mailing and/or email address with DCAS, you must submit the change request by mail or in person. Your request must include your full name, social security number, exam title(s), exam number(s), previous mailing and/or email address, and your new mailing and/or email address. Your request can be mailed to DCAS Records Room, 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, New York, NY 10007 or brought in person to the same address Monday through Friday from 9AM to 5PM. The following link will provide you with the DCAS Data Correction Form: <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dcas/downloads/pdf/misc/dp148a.pdf>.

THE TEST RESULTS:

If you meet the education and experience requirements and pass the multiple-choice test, your name will be placed in final score order on an eligible list, you will be given a list number and you will be notified by mail of your test results. The eligible list determines the order by which candidates will be considered for appointment. If you meet all requirements and conditions, you will be considered for appointment if your name is reached on the eligible list. Once a list has been established, it will typically remain active for four years. To learn more about the civil service system go to: http://www.nyc.gov/html/dcas/html/work/civilservice_1.shtml.

SPECIAL ARRANGEMENTS:

Make-up Test: You may apply for a make-up test if you cannot take the test on the regular test date(s) for any of the following reasons:

1. compulsory attendance before a public body;
2. on-the-job injury or illness caused by municipal employment where you are an officer or employee of the City;
3. absence from the test within one week after the death of a spouse, domestic partner, parent, sibling, child or child of a domestic partner where you are an officer or employee of the City;
4. absence due to ordered military duty;
5. a clear error for which the Department of Citywide Administrative Services or the examining agency is responsible; or
6. a temporary disability, pregnancy-related, or child-birth-related condition preventing you from taking the test.

To request a make-up test, contact Administration, Customer, and Exam Support in person or by mail at 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, New York, NY 10007, as soon as possible and provide documentation of the special circumstances that caused you to miss your test.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

Selective Certification for Foreign Language and/or American Sign Language: If you can speak Albanian, Arabic, Bengali, Bosnian/Serbo-Croatian, Chinese (Cantonese), Chinese (Mandarin), French, Greek, Haitian/Creole, Hindi, Italian, Japanese, Korean, Portuguese, Polish, Russian, Spanish, Tibetan, Urdu, Vietnamese, West African Languages (e.g., Ibo, Swahili, Yoruba), Yiddish and/or you know American Sign Language, you may be considered for appointment to positions requiring this ability through a process called Selective Certification. If you pass a qualifying test, you may be given preferred consideration for positions requiring this ability. Follow the instructions given to you on the day of the multiple-choice test to indicate your interest in such Selective Certification.

Selective Certification For Special Experience:

Selective Certification for Experience in Specialized Programs (ATP and ACE): If you have twelve months of full-time satisfactory experience working with community-based programs and individuals involved in the justice system who have need levels across the spectrum from low to high risks using any of the following: Cognitive Behavioral Therapy Interventions, Motivational Interviewing, Restorative Practices, Trauma Informed Practices, Cultural Competency, Interactive Journaling, Community/Family Engagement, Group Facilitation, Level of Service Inventory-Revised and Youth Level of Service Inventory Risk and Needs Assessment Administration, you may be considered for appointment to positions requiring this experience through a process called Selective Certification. If you qualify for Selective Certification, you may be given preferred consideration for positions requiring this experience. Follow the instructions given to you on the day of the multiple-choice test to indicate your interest in such Selective Certification. Your specialized experience will be checked by the appointing agency at the time of appointment.

Selective Certification for Experience in Specialized Programs with Training (ATP and ACE): If you have six months of full-time satisfactory experience working with community-based programs and individuals involved in the justice system who have need levels across the spectrum from low to high risks using any of the following: Cognitive Behavioral Therapy Interventions, Motivational Interviewing, Restorative Practices, Trauma Informed Practices, Cultural Competency, Interactive Journaling, Community/Family Engagement, Group Facilitation, Level of Service Inventory-Revised and Youth Level of Service Inventory Risk and Needs Assessment Administration, and satisfactory completion of a specialized training program for at least six months, and achievement of a completion certificate for Specialized Programs assignments in any of the following: Motivational Interviewing, Restorative Practices, Group Facilitation, Cognitive Behavioral Therapy Foundations, Carey Gulde/Brief Intervention Tools/Decision Points Training, Level of Service Inventory-Revised (LSI-R) and Youth Level of Service risk and needs assessment administration, Trauma Informed Practices, Cultural Competency, Interactive Journaling, Community/Family Engagement, Motivational Interviewing, Group Facilitation and Caseload Explorer (case management system) systems training, you may be considered for appointment to positions requiring this combination through a process called Selective Certification. If you qualify for Selective Certification, you may be given preferred consideration for positions requiring this experience and training. Training must be administered/certificate issued by a NYS law enforcement agency that employs NYS Municipal Police Training Council approved instructors. Follow the instructions given to you on the day of the multiple-choice test to indicate your interest in such Selective Certification. Your specialized experience and training will be checked by the appointing agency at the time of appointment.

Selective Certification for Experience in Intelligence Unit: If you have twelve months of full-time satisfactory experience in any of the following: law enforcement operations and forensics, field tactics, narcotic identification, warrants, extraditions procedures, and/or arrest processing, you may be considered for appointment to positions requiring this experience through a process called Selective Certification. If you qualify for Selective Certification, you may be given preferred consideration for positions requiring this experience. Follow the instructions given to you on the day of the multiple-choice test to indicate your interest in such Selective Certification. Your specialized experience will be checked by the appointing agency at the time of appointment.

Selective Certification for Experience in Intelligence Unit with Training: If you have six months of full-time satisfactory experience in any of the following: law enforcement operations and forensics, field tactics, narcotic identification, warrants, extraditions procedures, and/or arrest processing, and satisfactory completion of a specialized training program for at least six months, and achievement of a completion certificate for Intelligence Unit assignments in the following areas: Extradition processing, bench warrant procedures, warrant tactics, probation retakes, Interacting/information sharing with other law enforcement agencies, computer forensics/cell phone investigations, fraudulent credit card investigations, narcotics identification, active shooter response, Caseload Explorer (case management system) and NYPD OMNI arrest processing systems training, you may be considered for appointment to positions requiring this combination through a process called Selective Certification. If you qualify for Selective Certification, you may be given preferred consideration for positions requiring this experience and training. Training must be administered/certificate issued by a NYS law enforcement agency that employs NYS Municipal Police Training Council approved instructors. Follow the instructions given to you on the day of the multiple-choice test to indicate your interest in such Selective Certification. Your specialized experience and training will be checked by the appointing agency at the time of appointment.

Selective Certification for Social Media Analyst: If you have twelve months of full-time satisfactory experience working in a law enforcement agency using applications such as: Sytech ADACS, Pen-Link, Thomson Reuters CLEAR, Lexis Nexis Accurant, Ringtail, and I2 Analyst's Notebook, you may be considered for appointment to positions requiring this experience through a process called Selective Certification. If you qualify for Selective Certification, you may be given preferred consideration for positions requiring this experience. Follow the instructions given to you on the day of the multiple-choice test to indicate your interest in such Selective Certification. Your specialized experience will be checked by the appointing agency at the time of appointment.

The above Selective Certification requirements may be met at anytime during the duration of the list. If you meet this requirement at some future date, please submit a request by mail to: DCAS Bureau of Examinations - Exam Development Group, 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, New York, NY 10007. Please include the examination title and number, your social security number, and the Selective Certification you are requesting on your correspondence.

Investigation:

The position is subject to investigation before appointment. At the time of investigation, you will be required to pay a \$75.00 fee for fingerprint screening. At the time of investigation and at the time of appointment, you must present originals or certified copies of all required documents and proof, including but not limited to proof of date and place of birth by transcript of record from a Bureau of Vital Statistics or other satisfactory evidence, naturalization papers if necessary, proof of any military service, and proof of meeting educational requirements, if applicable. You may be disqualified if your statements are found to be false, exaggerated, or misleading or if you fail to provide required documents. Investigation must be completed prior to appointment.

Application Receipt:

You will be emailed a receipt immediately after you have applied for the examination. If you do not receive this receipt, contact this agency at OASys@dcas.nyc.gov. Include your social security number and the examination number and title in your email. You will also be mailed an acknowledgment letter within three months of the last date of the application period. If you do not receive an acknowledgment letter, write to this agency, Attention: Administration, Customer and Exam Support, 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, New

York, NY 10007 to request verification that your application was received. Include your social security number and the examination number and title in your request.

PENALTY FOR MISREPRESENTATION:

Any intentional misrepresentation on the application or examination may result in disqualification, even after appointment, and may result in criminal prosecution.

The General Examination Regulations of the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) apply to this examination and are part of this Notice of Examination. They are posted at nyc.gov/dcas and copies are available at the DCAS Computer-based Testing & Applications Centers.

The City of New York is an Equal Opportunity Employer.
Title Code No. 51810; Probation Occupational Group.

For information about other exams, and your exam or list status, call 212-669-1357.
Internet: nyc.gov/dcas



BILL DE BLASIO
Mayor
STACEY CUMBERBATCH
Commissioner

THE CITY OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE
ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
APPLICATION UNIT
1 CENTRE STREET, 14TH FLOOR
NEW YORK, NY 10007

NOTICE OF EXAMINATION

REQUIRED INFORMATION

APPLICATION

PROMOTION TO SUPERVISING PROBATION OFFICER

Exam No. 5540
Amended Notice - March 11, 2015

WHEN TO APPLY: From: February 4, 2015

To: February 24, 2015

APPLICATION FEE: \$68.00

If you choose to pay the application fee with a credit/debit/gift card, you will be charged a fee of 2.49% of the payment amount. This fee is nonrefundable.

THE TEST DATE: The multiple-choice testing is expected to be held on Saturday, May 30, 2015.

The Notice of Examination is amended to add the Written Test Description.

**YOU ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR READING THIS NOTICE IN ITS ENTIRETY
BEFORE YOU SUBMIT YOUR APPLICATION.**

WHAT THE JOB INVOLVES: Supervising Probation Officers, under general supervision, with latitude for independent or unreviewed action or decision, plan, assign, and supervise the work of a unit of Probation Officers who are responsible for performing intake work or work with family problems, or generate legal and psycho-social summaries for Pre-Pleading or Pre-Sentence Investigations and Investigation and Report (I and R) documents, or provide diversion treatment interventions, supervision and monitoring services for probationers/respondents and/or obtain community resources to address client needs. They may perform independent, specialized and responsible staff work and related work.

(This is a brief description of what you might do in this position and does not include all the duties of this position.)

THE SALARY: The current minimum salary is \$54,030 per annum. This rate is subject to change.

HOW TO APPLY: If you believe you are eligible to take this examination, submit an application on the Online Application System (OASys) at www.nyc.gov/examsforjobs. Follow the onscreen application instructions for electronically submitting your application and payment, and completing any required information. A unique and valid email address is required to file online. Several internet service providers, including but not limited to Google, Yahoo!, AOL, Outlook.com, and Mail.com offer free email addresses. **All new OASys accounts require verification before a candidate can submit an application to ensure the accuracy of candidate information. Verification is instantaneous for most accounts, but some accounts may require up to 24 hours to be reviewed by a staff member and resolved. Email notification will be sent to those creating accounts that require additional documentation before they can be resolved. Please keep this information and the application period deadline in mind when creating your account.** The following methods of payment are acceptable: major credit card, bank card associated with a bank account, or a prepaid debit card with a credit card logo which you may purchase online or at various retail outlets. You may come to the DCAS Computer-based Testing & Applications Centers to file for this examination online and submit a money order payable to DCAS (Exams).

The centers will be open Monday through Saturday from 9:00 AM to 5:00 PM:

Manhattan
2 Lafayette Street
17th Floor
New York, NY 10007

Brooklyn
210 Joralemon Street
4th Floor
Brooklyn, NY 11201

The DCAS Computer-based Testing & Applications Centers will be closed on Saturday, February 7, 2015; Monday, February 9, 2015; and Monday, February 16, 2015.

Special Circumstances Guide: This guide is located on the DCAS website at www.nyc.gov/html/dcas/downloads/pdf/misc/exam_special_circumstances.pdf and available at the DCAS Computer-based Testing & Applications Centers. This guide gives important information about requesting an alternate test date because of religious observance or a special test accommodation for disability, claiming

READ CAREFULLY AND SAVE FOR FUTURE REFERENCE

Veterans' or Legacy credit, and notifying DCAS of a change in your mailing address. Follow all instructions on the Special Circumstances Guide that pertain to you when you complete your "Application for Examination."

ELIGIBILITY TO TAKE EXAMINATION: This examination is open to each employee of the New York City Department of Probation who on the date of the multiple-choice test:

- (1) holds a permanent (not provisional) competitive appointment or appears on a Preferred List (see Note, below) for the title of Probation Officer; and
- (2) is not otherwise ineligible.

(Note: A "Preferred List" is a civil service list which is only for certain former permanent incumbents of the eligible title who have rehiring rights.)

If you do not know if you are eligible, check with your agency's personnel office. You may be given the test before we verify your eligibility. You are responsible for determining whether or not you meet the eligibility requirements for this examination prior to submitting your application. If it is determined prior to the test date that you are not eligible to participate in this examination, you will not receive an Admission Notice to take the multiple-choice test, you will not be permitted into the test site, and your application fee will not be refunded. If it is determined after the test date that you are not eligible to participate in this examination, your application fee will not be refunded and you will not receive a score.

ELIGIBILITY TO BE PROMOTED: In order to be eligible for promotion, you must have completed your probationary period in the eligible title as indicated in the above "Eligibility To Take Examination" section, and you must be permanently employed in the eligible title or your name must appear on a Preferred List for the eligible title at the time of promotion. Additionally, you must have served permanently in the eligible title for at least one year.

THE TEST: The multiple-choice test may be given at a computer terminal or in a paper and pencil format. You will be informed of the format on your Admission Notice. A score of at least 70% is required to pass this test. Your score on this test will determine 85% of your final score. Your seniority will determine the remaining 15%. You must pass the multiple-choice test to have your seniority credited. Your seniority score will be 70 plus 1/2 point for each three months of completed, permanent, continuous service with an agency under the jurisdiction of the Commissioner, Department of Citywide Administrative Services in competitive class titles. Your service will be credited through the date of the test, up to a maximum of 15 years. Time served prior to a break in service of more than one year will not be credited.

The multiple-choice test is designed to assess the extent to which candidates have certain abilities and technical knowledge determined to be important to the performance of the tasks of a Supervising Probation Officer. Task categories to be tested may include questions on: Case Management, Consultation, Evaluation and Review; Supervision, Monitoring, Feedback and Evaluation of Probation Officers; Scheduling and Assigning Work; Training and Evaluating Training Needs; Administrative Duties; Court Activities; Field Activities; and Interpersonal Duties.

The test may include questions which require mastery of technical knowledge based on such materials as: Executive Policies and Procedures and Directives (EPAPs); Penal Law; Criminal Procedure Law; Vehicle Traffic Law; Field Safety Law; Time and Leave Manual; Code of Conduct; Violation of Probation Manual; Article 35; Reporting Child Abuse Guidelines and Mayor's Executive Order No. 16 of 1978, in effect up to and including April 1, 2015.

The test may include questions which may require the use of any of the following abilities:

Analytical Thinking: Analyzing information and using logic to address specific work-related issues and problems; involves the identification of problems, not implementation of solutions. Example: A Supervising Probation Officer may use this ability when creating an Individual Achievement Plan (IAP).

Judgment & Decision-Making: Reviewing information to develop and evaluate the relative costs and benefits of potential solutions to problems and choosing the most appropriate one; implementing a course of action determined by thinking analytically. While similar to Planning & Organizing, Judgment and Decision-Making are typically applied over a shorter time frame. Example: A Supervising Probation Officer may use this ability when to determine whether or not to proceed with violations.

Management of Personnel Resources: Motivating, developing and directing people as they work, identifying the best people for the job; managing employees needed to accomplish tasks. Example: A Supervising Probation Officer may use this ability when assigning Probation Officers to cover interviewing/cases for other Probation Officers that are in the field.

Written Expression: Appropriately communicating information and ideas in written words and sentences so intended audience will understand. Example: A Supervising Probation Officer may use this ability when writing critical incident reports.

Certain questions may need to be answered on the basis of documents or other information supplied to candidates on the date of the multiple-choice test.

Warning: You are not permitted to enter the test site with cellular phones, beepers, pagers, cameras, portable media players, or other electronic devices. Calculators are permitted; however, they must be hand-held, battery or solar powered, numeric only. Calculators with functions other than addition, subtraction, multiplication and division are prohibited. Electronic devices with an alphabetic keyboard or with word processing or data recording capabilities such as planners, organizers, etc. are prohibited. If you use any of these devices in the building at any time before, during or after the test, you may not receive your test results, your test score may be nullified, and your application fee will not be refunded.

You may not have any other person, including children, present with you while you are being processed for or taking the test, and no one may wait for you inside of the test site while you are taking the test.

Required Identification: You are required to bring one (1) form of valid (non-expired) signature and photo bearing identification to the test site. The name that was used to apply for the exam must match the first and last name on the photo ID. A list of acceptable identification documents is provided below. **If you do not have an acceptable ID, you may be denied testing.** Acceptable forms of identification (bring one) are as follows: State issued driver's license, State issued identification card, US Government issued Passport, US Government issued Military Identification Card, US Government issued Alien Registration Card, Employer ID with photo, or Student ID with photo.

Leaving: You must leave the test site once you finish the test. If you leave the test site after being fingerprinted but before finishing the test, you will not be permitted to re-enter. If you disregard this instruction and re-enter the test site, you may not receive your test results, your test score may be nullified, and your application fee will not be refunded.

ADMISSION NOTICE: You should receive an Admission Notice in the mail about 10 days before the date of the test. If you do not receive an Admission Notice at least 4 days before the date test date, you must go to the Exam Support Group, 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, Manhattan, to obtain a duplicate notice, which you will receive unless there was a determination that you are not eligible to participate in the examination. Test site assignments will take your address into consideration, but proximity cannot be guaranteed.

THE TEST RESULTS: If you pass the multiple-choice test and are marked eligible, your name will be placed in final score order on an eligible list and you will be given a list number. You will be notified by mail of your test results. If you meet all requirements and conditions, you will be considered for promotion when your name is reached on the eligible list.

CHANGE OF MAILING AND/OR EMAIL ADDRESS: It is critical that you promptly notify DCAS of any change to your mailing address and/or email address. You may miss important information about your exam(s) or consideration for appointment, including important information that may require a response by a specified deadline, if we do not have your correct mailing and/or email address. Change of mailing and/or email address requests submitted to any place other than DCAS, such as your Agency or to the United States Postal Service will NOT update your records with DCAS. To update your mailing and/or email address with DCAS, you must submit a change request by mail or in person. Your request must include your full name, social security number, exam title(s), exam number(s), old mailing and/or email address, and your new mailing and/or email address. Your request can be mailed to DCAS Records Room, 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, New York, NY 10007 or brought in person to the same address Monday through Friday from 9AM to 5PM.

SPECIAL ARRANGEMENTS:

Late Filing: Consult your agency's personnel office to determine the procedure for filing a late application if you meet one or more of the following conditions:

- (1) You are absent from work for at least one-half of the application period and cannot apply for reasons such as vacation, sick leave or military duty; or
- (2) You become eligible after the above application period but on or before the date of the multiple-choice test.

Make-up Test: You may apply for a make-up test if you cannot take the test on the regular test date(s) for any of the following reasons:

- (1) compulsory attendance before a public body;
- (2) on-the-job injury or illness caused by municipal employment where you are an officer or employee of the City;
- (3) absence from the test within one week after the death of a spouse, domestic partner, parent, sibling, child or child of a domestic partner where you are an officer or employee of the City;
- (4) absence due to ordered military duty;
- (5) a clear error for which the Department of Citywide Administrative Services or the examining agency is responsible; or
- (6) a temporary disability, pregnancy-related, or child-birth-related condition preventing you from taking the test.

To request a make-up test, contact the Exam Support Group in person or by mail at 1 Centre Street, 14th Floor, New York, NY 10007, as soon as possible and provide documentation of the special circumstances that caused you to miss your test.

PENALTY FOR MISREPRESENTATION: Any intentional misrepresentation on the application or examination may result in disqualification, even after promotion, and may result in criminal prosecution.

The General Examination Regulations of the Department of Citywide Administrative Services apply to this examination and are part of this Notice of Examination. They are posted and copies are available at nyc.gov/dcas and at DCAS Computer-based Testing & Application Centers.

The City of New York is an Equal Opportunity Employer.
Title Code No. 51860; Probation Occupational Group.

For information about other exams, and your exam or list status, call 212-669-1357.
Internet: nyc.gov/dcas

UPOA TENTATIVE WAGE INCREASES

Title Code	Title	Effective 12/31/17 Minimum			Effective 4/28/17 2%			Effective 4/28/18 2.25%			Effective 5/28/19 3%		
		Hiring Rate	Incumbent Rate	Max	Hiring Rate	Incumbent Rate	Max	Hiring Rate	Incumbent Rate	Max	Hiring Rate	Incumbent Rate	Max
51800	Probation Assistant	\$25,781	\$29,648	\$36,330	\$26,297	\$30,241	\$37,057	\$28,822	\$30,921	\$37,891	\$32,260	\$32,260	\$39,028
51810	Probation Officer	\$42,759	\$49,173	\$71,197	\$43,614	\$50,156	\$72,621	\$44,596	\$51,285	\$74,255	\$45,934	\$52,824	\$76,483
51801	Probation Officer Trainee	\$38,133	\$43,853	\$51,381	\$38,896	\$44,730	\$52,409	\$39,770	\$45,736	\$53,588	\$40,963	\$47,108	\$55,196
51860	Supervising Probation Officer	\$57,042	\$65,598	\$85,193	\$58,183	\$66,910	\$86,897	\$59,491	\$68,415	\$88,852	\$61,276	\$70,467	\$91,518

**UPOA SALARIES IN TITLE AND SERVICE
INCREMENTS WITH PATTERN WAGE INCREASES**

Probation Officer

<u>Year</u>	<u>Current Salary & Salary Increment</u>	<u>4/28/17 + 2% Salary & Salary Increment</u>	<u>4/28/18 + 2.25% Salary & Salary Increment</u>	<u>5/28/19 + 3% Salary & Salary Increment</u>
Year 1	\$42,759	\$43,614	\$44,596	\$45,934
Year 2	\$42,759	\$43,614	\$44,596	\$45,934
Year 3	\$49,765	\$50,760	\$51,903	\$53,461
Year 4	\$50,280	\$51,285	\$52,440	\$54,014
Year 5	\$50,795	\$51,810	\$52,977	\$54,567
Year 6	\$51,310	\$52,335	\$53,514	\$55,120
Year 7	\$51,825	\$52,860	\$54,051	\$55,673
Year 8	\$52,340	\$53,385	\$54,588	\$56,226
Year 9	\$52,855	\$53,910	\$55,125	\$56,779
Year 10	\$53,370	\$54,435	\$55,662	\$57,332
Year 11	\$53,885	\$54,960	\$56,199	\$57,885

**UPOA SALARIES IN TITLE AND SERVICE
INCREMENTS WITH PATTERN WAGE INCREASES**

Supervising Probation Officer

	Current Salary & Salary Increment	4/28/17 + 2% Salary & Salary Increment	4/28/18 + 2.25% Salary & Salary Increment	5/28/19 + 3% Salary & Salary Increment
<u>Year</u>				
Year 1	\$65,598	\$66,910	\$68,415	\$70,467
Year 2	\$66,010	\$67,330	\$68,844	\$70,909
Year 3	\$66,525	\$67,855	\$69,381	\$71,462
Year 4	\$67,040	\$68,380	\$69,918	\$72,015
Year 5	\$67,555	\$68,905	\$70,455	\$72,568
Year 6	\$68,070	\$69,430	\$70,992	\$73,121
Year 7	\$68,585	\$69,955	\$71,529	\$73,674
Year 8	\$69,100	\$70,480	\$72,066	\$74,227
Year 9	\$69,615	\$71,005	\$72,603	\$74,780
Year 10	\$70,130	\$71,530	\$73,140	\$75,333
Year 11	\$70,645	\$72,055	\$73,677	\$75,886
Year 12	\$70,903	\$72,318	\$73,946	\$76,163
Year 13	\$71,161	\$72,581	\$74,215	\$76,440
Year 14	\$71,419	\$72,844	\$74,484	\$76,717
Year 15	\$71,677	\$73,107	\$74,753	\$76,994
Year 16	\$71,960	\$73,396	\$75,049	\$77,299

June 25, 2019
Civil Service and Labor Committee
Pay Disparity - EMS/FDNY and UPOA
Erica T. Kagan, Partner
The Kurland Group

Good Afternoon Chair and members of the Civil Service and Labor Committee,

Thank you for the opportunity to speak to you today about the ongoing challenges New York City civil servants face with regards to pay inequity.

Members and leadership from the various unions that spoke today gave compelling examples of how discriminatory pay practices impact their members employment opportunities, including lack of recognition, hurdles with regards to opportunities for promotion and inadequate and unequal compensation.

As the demographics of the City's workforce have changed, the City's employment practices have failed to keep up and safeguard against discriminatory pay practices. This has resulted in segregated job titles, repressed minimum salaries and crushing hurdles for career advancement and the opportunity to earn a wage to meet today's cost of living. Whether intentional or otherwise, these practices violate this City's own human rights laws.

While the challenges manifests differently with different titles, it is the same Citywide problem.

Unfortunately, however, the City's response to growing calls by municipal unions across the City's workforce to address and ensure equal employment opportunities have prompted more defensiveness and denial than the cooperation we are asking for.

The Federal Equal Employment Opportunity Commission in the landmark case *CWA 1180 v. City of New York*, found in 2015 that the City engages in discriminatory pay practices across all agencies and that it failed to properly maintain records that could have avoided such discrimination.

Last year then Public Advocate, Letitia James, released an in-depth study confirming that the City of New York engages in systemic pay disparity based on race and gender, and that it is one of the worst actors with greater disparity in pay across race and gender than other government and even private employers. The studies also found that women of color in particular are disproportionately hurt by the gender wage gap, and that racial disparity in pay is greater in New York City than across the national average.

It is not enough to simply desire non-discrimination in the workplace or announce a commitment to such non-discrimination. Ensuring non-discrimination is an affirmative responsibility that requires a constant commitment to look at patterns, anticipate problems, and a willingness to acknowledge and adjust to correct those problems when they occur.

That is why it is especially concerning, despite this body's efforts through recent legislation, and our office's affirmative litigation, the City is still fighting against disclosure of pay data that could identify and correct pay disparity. The City's defensiveness to these problems is perhaps the biggest roadblock to progress.

On behalf of our clients who consist of close to ten thousand City employees our office thanks this Committee for your willingness to push forward on this issue.

Bringing public awareness to this issue is the first step. Continuing to work with the unions engaged in this process to share the employment data when it becomes available this year is another important step that will go a long way in identifying and the correcting these problems.

Thank you again for your time.

##

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☒ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Mario Santiago

Address: _____

I represent: FDNY STA-03

Address: 501 Zerega ave.

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Greg Waltman

Address: _____

I represent: G-One - Quantun

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☒ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Pincent Vapalewicz

Address: 125 Barclay St. 11 Suite 743

I represent: Uniformed EMS Officers FDNY Local 3621

Address: 125 Barclay St. 11 Suite 743

THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☒ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Dr. Joseph Wilson

Address: 215 W 91st

I represent: African American Council in

Address: R. M. Wilson Case

THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Deputy Assistant Chief Roberts (Capt, EMT)

Address: 9 Metrotech

I represent: FDNY

Address: 9 Metrotech

THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Laura Kavanaugh - 1st Deputy Commissioner

Address: 9 Metrotech Center

I represent: FDNY

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Terry Brown - Deputy Commissioner

Address: 9 Metrotech Center

I represent: FDNY

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Thomas Richardson, Chief of Fire 435

Address: 9 Metrotech

I represent: FDNY

Address: 9 Metrotech

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Steven Rush, Deputy Commissioner

Address: 9 Metrotech Center

I represent: FDNY

Address: 9 Metrotech

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Wayne McKenzie 21st Fl

Address: 33 Beaver Street - 23rd

I represent: DOP 33rd

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 6/25/19

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Anna Bermudez

Address: 33 Beaver Street - 23rd

I represent: DOP

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Michael Forte

Address: 33 Beaver Street - 18th Fl

I represent: DOP

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: OREN BARZILAY

Address: 150-39 14 AVE WHITESTONE NY 11357

I represent: FDNY LOCAL 2507

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 6/25/19

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Michael Greco

Address: 150-39 14 AVE Whitestone

I represent: FDNY EMS Local 2507

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 6/25/19

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Erica T. Healey-Kagan

Address: 85 Broad St. 28th Floor, NY, NY 10004

I represent: UPOA, Local 3621, and Local 2507

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 6/25/19

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Pelligla Finch

Address: 470 32nd Ave NY, NY 10016

I represent: NYC Dept of Probation

Address: 60 Lafayette Street, NY NY 10016

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☒ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 6/25/19

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Dalvance K Powell

Address: 120 Co-op City Blvd 203

I represent: United Probation Officer Association

Address: 118-35 Queens Blvd Forest NY

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 6/25/19

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: EMMA Stovall

Address: 575 Main St #707, NYC 10014

I represent: NYC Dept of Probation

Address: 127 W. 127th St NYC 10027