

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

May 14, 2019

Start: 1:16 p.m.

Recess: 3:15 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16th Fl.

B E F O R E: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
Chairperson

COMMITTEE CLERKS:
INEZ D. BARRON
PETER A. KOO
I. DANEEK MILLER
MARK TREYGER

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1

MARITIME USES

2

2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

3

Waheera Mardah
Team Member on the Government and Community
Relations Team at New York City's Economic
Development Corporation, EDC

5

Diana Malave
Bartlett Dairy

6

7

Jennifer Cohen
Real Estate Professional at the New York City's
Economic Development Corporation, EDC

8

9

Aileen Gorsuch
Senior Planner of the New York City Economic
Development Corporation, EDC

10

11

Mark McMillan
District Manager of Queens Community Board 13

12

13

Scott Grimm Lyon
Executive Director of the Gateway JFK Industrial
Business Improvement District, IBID

14

15

Lacey Tauber
Development and Planning Director at New York
City's Housing Preservation and Development, HPD

16

17

Debbie Widerkehr
M Lappin and Associates

18

19

Dan Stadt
Director of Housing at Banana Kelly Community
Improvement Association Inc.

20

21

Christine O'Connelly
Director of Affordable Neighborhood Cooperative,
HPD

22

23

Genevieve Michel
Executive Director of Governmental Affairs at
New York City's Department of Housing Reservation
And Development, HPD

24

25

Norman Williams
Representing Hope Community Inc.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Ingrid Gomez-Faria
Director of Real Estate Development for Community
League of the Heights, CLOTH

Yvonne Stennett
Community League of the Heights, CLOTH

Kevin Parris
Senior Planner at New York City's Housing
Preservation and Development Corporation, HPD

Jerry Salema
Principal of the Janus Property Company

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

4

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Good afternoon,
welcome to this meeting of the Subcommittee on
Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses. I'm
Council Member Adrienne Adams the Chair of this
Subcommittee. We're joined today by Council Members
Koo, Richards and Treyger. Today we will be hearing
eight applications submitted by the Department of
Housing Preservation and Development related to
various urban development action area projects and an
acquisition of real property and one application
submitted by the Jughandle Realty and EDC for an
amendment to the city map and disposition of real
property. Our first application today is LU 415, the
JFK North site in Council Member Donovan Richard's
district in Queens. This is an application submitted
by Jughandle Realty LLC and the New York City
Economic Development Corporation pursuant to sections
197-C and 199 of the New York City charter for
approval of an amendment to the city map involving
the elimination, narrowing and realignment of the
Nassau Expressway, the adjustment of grades and block
dimensions necessitated thereby and the authorization
for any acquisition or disposition of real property

1 related thereto. The elimination of the mapped
2 portion of the expressway will create two new tax
3 lots and block 14260 and will require the
4 establishment of a new southwesterly line of Rockaway
5 Boulevard as well as a new northeasterly line of the
6 Nassau Expressway. The proposed amendment and related
7 disposition of a city owned property would facilitate
8 the, the development of a distribution and vehicle
9 repair facility for the Bartlett Dairy, a family
10 owned business in Queens. Jughandle Realty is a
11 wholly owned affiliate of Bartlett Dairy. Before we
12 begin, we invite Council Member Donovan Richards to
13 deliver remarks.

14
15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
16 Chair, and I want to thank EDC and all the partners
17 who worked on this particular plan. First off let me
18 thank Bartlett as well for the work that they've done
19 as well to, to get this, this project moving,
20 Community Board 13 as well as District Manager Mark
21 McMillan and I first off want to start by thanking
22 Bartlett because all the things that are coming into
23 the district, all the products that they will be
24 shipping out are good for the keto diet so I wanted
25 to start there but secondly, I do have some concerns

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

6

1
2 and I think, you know it's in my interest to get
3 through this, I think it's a good project but there
4 still are a lot of outstanding issues around
5 infrastructure, open space, truck impacts, a real
6 plan around the jobs and obviously we have a business
7 improvement district that, that has just started up
8 with... working with many of you. So, I, I do have some
9 outstanding issues that I look forward to working
10 with the city on and the applicant and with that
11 being said let's get this show on the road. Thank you
12 Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you Council
14 Member Richards. We are going to start with our first
15 panel, EDC representatives Waheera Mardah, Diana
16 Malave and Jennifer Cohen. Counsel please swear in
17 the panel.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
19 hands? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
20 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
21 before this Subcommittee in response to all Council
22 Member questions?

23 WAHEERA MARDAH: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, you may begin.

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

7

WAHEERA MARDAH: Is it on? Okay, thank you Chair. Good afternoon everyone, thank you for giving us the opportunity to present the JFK North Bartlett project. My name is Waheera Mardah, I'm on the Government and Community Relations Team at EDC and as mentioned I am joined by my colleague, Jennifer Cohen from the Real Estate Team and Diana Malave from the Bartlett Team. The purpose of this presentation is to provide an overview of the Bartlett Dairy distribution project and garner support from the New York city Council as we move through the ULURP process. So, slide two. So, a few details about the site, the project is located where Nassau Expressway and the Rockaway Boulevard meet just to the north of JFK. The size of the parcel of land is about 8.7 acres of which 6.15 acres would be disposed of to Bartlett Dairy and the remaining 2.6 would remain under city ownership. It is located in an industrial zone just outside of an industrial business improvement, improvement district, an IBID and the closest bordering communities are Springfield Gardens and Jamaica Queens. The site is currently mapped as an unbuilt portion of the Nassau Expressway, in the surrounding area there is very

1

8

2 limited access to public transportation with mainly
3 commercial uses on Rockaway Boulevard and we have
4 kicked off the ULURP process which will allow for the
5 development of a dairy distribution facility and both
6 employee and truck parking on the site. Slide three.
7 Again, just some local context of the site, you can
8 see the odd shape of the parcel and we will give
9 further details about that later on in the
10 presentation. So, slide four. So, the official city
11 map includes this parcel as the part of an unbuilt
12 portion of the Nassau Expressway so the de-mapping
13 action will correct this map to reflect the existing
14 conditions and allow for development. Once approved
15 we will be able to develop on the parcel on the city
16 owned land, so this is just a picture of the city
17 map. And then the next slide. So, a little bit about
18 Bartlett Dairy, as mentioned they are an MWBE family
19 owned dairy and dry goods distribution company and
20 I'll actually let Diana from Bartlett talk a little
21 bit about the company's history in Queens.

22

DIANA MALAVE: So, the company was

23

actually started by my grandfather, he would drive

24

one single truck around by himself delivering glass

25

bottles of... [cross-talk]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1

MARITIME USES

9

2

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Can you please

3

identify yourself for the... [cross-talk]

4

DIANA MALAVE: Sure... [cross-talk]

5

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: ...record... [cross-talk]

6

DIANA MALAVE: Diana Malave.

7

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you.

8

DIANA MALAVE: You're welcome. So, my

9

grandfather would drive his single truck around to

10

different homes and deliver milk. As he got older and

11

as my father got older, my father joined him on his

12

route and in the 80's they saw an opportunity to

13

transition from residential delivery to commercial

14

and from there my father convinced each one of his

15

brothers one by one to join the family and even

16

convinced mom to come along at one point. So, they've

17

grown from this one truck, one-man operation through

18

a lot of hard work not just within the family but

19

within the residents in the community that they hired

20

and today they have almost 500 employees at three

21

different locations.

22

WAHEERA MARDAH: Yep, so they've been

23

located in Queens since 1968 employing approximately

24

500 people as Diana mentioned across three locations;

25

Jamaica, Newark and Rochester, most of those

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

10

employees are at the Newark location but with this project Bartlett will be able to bring those employees back from Bartlett... from Newark, excuse me, back into southeast Queens. They deliver dry and perishable goods to schools, hotels, among their contracts is the New York City Department of Education, the Archdiocese and Starbucks. They were formerly located in Elmhurst Dairy in Jamaica Queens. As we mentioned we are excited to bring them back home and they distribute milk, bread, butter, cheese, all of my favorite things.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: We do know them as a staple in Queens.

WAHEERA MARDAH: So, some of the project goals that we had in mind were to create industrial and or commercial space near the gateway JFK IBID, support job intensive uses, responsibly deliver on a comprehensive hiring and wage program, which we'll talk a little bit more about and contribute to a growing local and regional economy. Slide seven. And how we believe Bartlett aligns with these goals; one is hiring locally. Specifically Bartlett anticipates the Queens facility will have a similar makeup from when they were formerly located in Queens with... and

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

11

1 at that time it was 50 percent of their employees
2 were Queen's residents and 86 percent were New York
3 City residents so we anticipate a very similar makeup
4 and they really do work to strengthen New York City's
5 food economy and connections between upstate and
6 downstate. As we mentioned we have a location in
7 Rochester, and they do have a 25 percent MWBE goal
8 for their design and construction. Slide seven. So,
9 as we mentioned the workforce development and
10 community engagement piece where one... that were
11 really critical as we moved into this project; the
12 Bartlett employees like we said were 50 percent
13 Queens residents, 86 percent New York City residents
14 and we do anticipate a similar makeup. They
15 anticipate retaining 165 jobs approximately with
16 average wages of about 70,000 dollars. They
17 anticipate creating approximately 70 to 90
18 construction jobs and some of those jobs will be
19 union through Local 553 Teamsters. They do provide an
20 extensive training and career ladder for their
21 employee. Diana do you want to speak a little bit
22 about that.

24 DIANA MALAVE: Sure, [clears throat]

25 excuse me, so one of the promotional opportunities

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

12

that they have is to take someone that is working as a driver's helper, so typically this person will meet the driver either along the route or at the warehouse when they first get the truck and help them make the deliveries. It's not a highly skilled job but from there as long as you show that you're dedicated and you take initiative to... and that you want to move up through the company, the company will actually sponsor and pay for you to get your CDL training and partner you with a driver that will help you achieve your... I believe there's a certain number of hours that you have to drive so they work with the employees to help them move forward.

WAHEERA MARDAH: Yep, they will be participating in the Hire NYC program and previous conversations that we had with the Council Member he really wanted to make sure that the community was aware of jobs as they came down the pipeline so we were able to negotiate with Hire NYC a way to tailor their, their outreach and their methods of communication to include a lot of the community civics, the community board as well as the other local workforce development organizations to just really make sure that they are getting information

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

about those jobs as they come down the pipeline. And as we mentioned, you know jobs will be shared with the community. Slide nine. So, this is just a photo of the site and Jennifer Cohen can go into a little more detail about some of the constraints of the site that we want you to be aware of.

JENNIFER COHEN: Sure, Jennifer Cohen, EDC Real Estate. So, as you can see the site is oddly shaped to begin with but on top of that we do have some other site constraints that limit the way that the site can actually be developed and the location on which we can put buildings. The first is along the exterior of the site sort of that northeastern and southern portion there's a dotted black line, that is a state DOT easement. At one point the state had had plans to expand the Nassau Expressway and they were going to build a bigger flyover, they no longer have that plan and they have no intention of expanding the Nassau Expressway but they have been unwilling to relinquish that easement so you cannot construct any permanent facilities on that space. Sort of towards the middle of the site plan, the bottom southern portion you can see there's a little rectangle labeled Con Ed transformer, that is a Con Ed

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1

MARITIME USES

15

2

WAHEERA MARDAH: Yep. Slide ten. This is

3

a rendering of what the site is anticipated to look

4

like and creating the trees and ensuring that there

5

was greenery, greenery on the site was really

6

important and most of the trucks will be making their

7

deliveries during off peak hours so between the hours

8

of three a.m. and six a.m. as to not disturb the

9

community. And then next slide. And then just some of

10

the community engagement that we've done outside of

11

meeting with the community board and, and the Council

12

Member, we met with the, the Gateway JFK IBID, Spring

13

Jam Civic Association as well as the Springfield

14

Gardens Civic Association who are all in full support

15

of the project. And then this is just a timeline, so

16

we anticipate closing hopefully fall, winter 2019 and

17

begin construction winter 2019, completion winter

18

2020. Thank you.

19

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you all very

20

much for your testimony today. Like I said Bartlett

21

has been a staple of Queens and, and various Queens

22

communities forever so for the most part we are

23

really excited about this project coming down

24

through, through JFK in the new redevelopment of, of

25

JFK. Can you just let us know if there are any

1
2 prevailing obstacles at this point within this
3 project rollout? Smooth sailing?

4 JENNIFER COHEN: So, far it's been smooth
5 sailing, we've had great support from all of the
6 community groups that we've met with, the community
7 board and the IBID have been very supportive so we
8 anticipate once we get through ULURP, you know
9 finishing up our remaining approvals and getting
10 Bartlett out to the site to start construction as
11 soon as possible.

12 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Great, I just had one
13 general question then I will turn it over to my
14 colleagues if they have questions. You mentioned that
15 drivers can receive or have received CDL licenses
16 through the company, do you have an, an annual number
17 or a number since, since you've been in Newark, any
18 type of number that you can share?

19 DIANA MALAVE: I don't know off the top
20 of my head but I'm sure we can look up that
21 information.

22 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yeah, I'd, I'd be
23 curious to find out how many drivers either annually
24 or since the move just to get an idea of, you know
25 what your... what your numbers are like as far as the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

17

1
2 program, I think that's really helpful. Okay, thank
3 you, Council Member Richards.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
5 Chair, just got to correct the statement I made
6 earlier, bread can't be in the keto diet, I'm sorry.
7 So, this picture, such a nice design and these roads
8 reflect a smooth road, is there a plan... so, I just
9 wanted to start with existing community issue prior
10 to the site being here. So, as you know this is an
11 area that has sorely needed infrastructure
12 investment, Rockaway Boulevard you're lucky if your,
13 your car could survive driving down it so I'm
14 interested in knowing, you know what investment is
15 the city working with DOT on ensuring that these
16 roads are passable so that the trucks are not stuck?

17 WAHEERA MARDAH: So, we have spoken to
18 city DOT about Rockaway Boulevard, they mentioned
19 that they have paved some parts of it, and we are
20 getting more information on the rest of their plans
21 for Rockaway Boulevard. Regarding Nassau Expressway,
22 that is a state highway and we have had conversations
23 with state DOT and made them aware of your concerns
24 and, and we'll be following up to inquire more about
25 what their plans are for the highway.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

18

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I'm just interested in which part of Rockaway Boulevard, is that what you're talking about?

WAHEERA MARDAH: We... because... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Maybe this is the other Rockaway Boulevard..

WAHEERA MARDAH: We will get more information for you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, so I'm certainly looking for some investment to, to fix this issue and then also as you know this is.. as you know it's an industrial area, so we are already, already dealing with a lot of truck impacts in this area. For instance, on any given day if you go and stand out there you'll see trucks doing a big U-turn on this boulevard which I've witnessed or actually driving over the medians which are sorely damaged now so, I.. so, I think DOT is a critical part of this conversation, I'm just putting it out there very early. Let's just speak about DEP for a second. So, NYC DEP determined.. has NYC DEP determined whether an, an amended drainage plan will be necessary for

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

19

this site to assess the... to assess the existing sewer infrastructure?

WAHEERA MARDAH: Yep, so DEP wrote in the EIS that it is necessary in order for Bartlett to obtain building permits, they need... they do need to address the drainage infrastructure and have plans to do so.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And how will they... has... does Bartlett have an answer on that today how will they... how will storm water be managed on the site?

DIANA MALAVE: I don't have an answer for that today.

WAHEERA MARDAH: I think they're still working through the plans but once those are solidified, we can have that conversation with you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Will there be any street trees planted on the exterior of the site to manage storm water as well?

DIANA MALAVE: Yeah.

JENNIFER COHEN: Yeah, so there will be trees planted along the street per zoning which is 35 trees.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1

MARITIME USES

20

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, 35 trees

3

along the site?

4

JENNIFER COHEN: Along the perimeter of

5

the site...

6

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: The perimeter

7

of the site.

8

JENNIFER COHEN: Yeah.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, I, I would

10

love if you could look at all of Rockaway Boulevard.

11

WAHEERA MARDAH: We can have those

12

conversations with parks.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay.

14

WAHEERA MARDAH: And see what they're

15

able to do in that area.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay. The

17

environmental review documents suggest that all or a

18

portion of the existing median on Rockaway Boulevard

19

would need to be removed to allow for trucks to make

20

a left turn from Rockaway Boulevard into the site,

21

will the removal of this median provide an

22

opportunity once again to repave Rockaway Boulevard

23

in front of the project area?

24

WAHEERA MARDAH: I don't have a direct

25

answer for you, but we can ask.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

21

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, so I'm just stressing a lot of DOT and parks coordination is needed here. Just go through the truck impacts a little bit, so how many trucks are we projecting to be on site?

DIANA MALAVE: I believe it's about 60 trucks.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: 60 trucks and these are 18 wheelers I'm assuming?

DIANA MALAVE: No, these are small box trucks.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Smaller, can you just give me... do you have a breakdown of... [cross-talk]

DIANA MALAVE: We have it some... [cross-talk]

JENNIFER COHEN: Yeah, we, we have it, we can provide that after.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay and tell me about parking.

JENNIFER COHEN: The site has sufficient parking to handle both all of the trucks that would be entering and exiting the site as well as all the employees that will be working from the facility.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

22

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, how many parking spots, sorry, total?

[off mic dialogue]

JENNIFER COHEN: 91 employees base...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Come on up.

JENNIFER COHEN: Yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alrighty...

JENNIFER COHEN: Our planner, Aileen Gorsuch.

AILEEN GORSUCH: Yeah, so... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: State your name for the record.

AILEEN GORSUCH: Aileen Gorsuch, I work in EDC Planning. We have planned for 91 employee parking spaces, there would be 49 spaces for 33-foot box trucks and then... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, 91 and, and an additional 49?

AILEEN GORSUCH: And an additional 49 for the 33-foot trucks as well as 35 spaces for the larger... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Could you get closer to the mic for us please?

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1

MARITIME USES

23

2

AILEEN GORSUCH: Sorry, the larger 53-

3

foot trucks.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, 53... [cross-

5

talk]

6

AILEEN GORSUCH: So, the site... [cross-

7

talk]

8

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: How many 53-

9

foot trucks?

10

AILEEN GORSUCH: 35.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: 35 and do we

12

project growth, does anything disable Bartlett

13

purchasing more trucks on this site?

14

AILEEN GORSUCH: Well they would be

15

limited by the space on site which the parking that I

16

just described maximizes the parking available on

17

this portion of the site...

18

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, you're

19

assuming that... please... yes, please have a seat, yes.

20

AILEEN GORSUCH: Thank you.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, we're

22

making the assumption that there... Bartlett... [cross-

23

talk]

24

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Council Member we're,

25

we're going to have to swear her in.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

24

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oh, sorry.

Swear you on again, sorry.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right hand? Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee in response to all Council Member questions?

AILEEN GORSUCH: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, we're, we're making the assumption that because we have this bullpen and they're going to park in it that they could never expand and park out on the street, is that right or...

AILEEN GORSUCH: They would have sufficient parking for what they would need so they would not be parking on the street.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: At the moment but nothing precludes them from growing eventually five years or ten years from now?

JENNIFER COHEN: Yes, so... I mean Diana can speak to some of their growth plans but the city does have a portion of the site that is remaining in control and we are working closely with Bartlett to give them the opportunity to expand onto that portion

1
2 of the site when they're ready to expand their
3 business operations there.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, let's talk
5 about that 2.6 acres for a second. When you went to
6 the community board did you speak or to community
7 organizations, was this specific 2.6 acres mentioned
8 at any of these meetings and, and was it explained
9 that there would be the possibilities of Bartlett
10 expanding onto these sites?

11 WAHEERA MARDAH: Yes, at every
12 presentation that we gave we mentioned that the city
13 would be retaining ownership in... as we wait to
14 determine, you know Bartlett's expansion plans and
15 we're holding it for them for that purpose.

16 JENNIFER COHEN: Or... yeah or the adjacent
17 property owner.

18 WAHEERA MARDAH: Or the adjacent property
19 owner.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Did you speak
21 to the Council Member's office about this?

22 JENNIFER COHEN: Yes.

23 WAHEERA MARDAH: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Which Council
25 Member?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

WAHEERA MARDAH: We... when we sat down with you, we mentioned the plans that Bartlett had for the 2.6 acres.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I mean recently the two... no, I know that but on the 2.6 acres you made a determination that they could expand without a conversation with us onto the site and we have other ideas because I'm not really seeing outside of the jobs which is good, I'm not seeing a complete community benefit for the Springfield Gardens community right now. I'm seeing more trucks, the jobs are great, I've visited Bartlett in Jersey, 100 percent supportive of a lot of... a lot of our constituents certainly coming back down and being able to work closer to home and I want to give them all the credit of the world... in the world for, for what they're doing in Jersey now in, in bringing that to Queens obviously benefits the economy but there is a sorely... the area is sorely lacking open space and then secondly we have truck congestion problems already and parking issues with trucks and it's one of the number one complaints that southeast Queens, all of our districts share, Council Member Adams abuts my district probably a few blocks in it so her

1
2 residents are complaining about these... the trucks
3 that are out there. So, the question I have is... you
4 know I did bring up a proposal on using some of this
5 2.6 acres for an additional NYPD tow lot, so I wanted
6 to know has there been any progress on this, where
7 are we at with that?

8 WAHEERA MARDAH: Sure, so we've done some
9 internal analysis and Aileen can speak to what some
10 of those limitations are.

11 AILEEN GORSUCH: So, as you can see from
12 the site layout that 2.6 acres is a very odd shape
13 which makes utilizing the space for large trucks very
14 difficult... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
16 talk]

17 AILEEN GORSUCH: ...and this is something
18 that Bartlett had looked at specifically for their
19 larger trucks and found that that portion of the site
20 would not be able to accommodate their 53 foot trucks
21 so, you know they would... if they were interested in
22 that portion of the site in the future it would be
23 utilized for the smaller box truck parking.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: The NYPD does
3 have... how far is the NYPD's tow lot from this site,
4 do we know? Their existing tow pound lot?

5 AILEEN GORSUCH: It's close, I'm not sure
6 exactly.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, have we
8 spoke... so we've had conversations with the NYPD on
9 this or have there not been discussions?

10 WAHEERA MARDAH: Yeah, so we've started..
11 we made contact with the NYPD as we did our internal
12 analysis and like Aileen mentioned it really was
13 determined that it wasn't feasible.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, so I'm
15 going to give the NYPD and EDC a way out, since we
16 have an existing tow pound lot which largely consists
17 of cars that probably don't even come from my
18 district that are being shipped through my district
19 on trucks into Springfield Gardens, how about moving
20 those cars and creating more space for trucks to be
21 towed into that site and then the reason I mention
22 this is because we've heard from local commanders in
23 southeast Queens, the Police Commissioner is well
24 aware of this, we're, we're actually purchasing some
25 additional heavy duty tow trucks this year for the

1
2 police department through the budget, we're working
3 with the PD through their budget to purchase some
4 more but one of the issues we've had in the area is
5 that there's not enough space currently to tow trucks
6 into that lot. So, be... for that reason we have on any
7 given night close to 20 or 30 trucks probably between
8 Council Member Miller's and, and Adams and my
9 district that are on residential streets parked all
10 night and because the NYPD does not have the capacity
11 to store them somewhere because that specific
12 facility is limited because of the cars, you know one
13 thing we're requesting is, is more space to tow the
14 trucks so, is that something we can work with the
15 NYPD on before we say yes on this project?

16 JENNIFER COHEN: So, that would require...
17 [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: If we were to
19 do this... [cross-talk]

20 JENNIFER COHEN: ...additional approvals,
21 REIS only studied Bartlett's use and additional
22 parking, it didn't study the use of the site for any
23 tow truck facility so it would require some
24 additional approvals under the environmental review
25 and Aileen can correct me if I'm wrong and would

1
2 likely require a separate ULURP for site selection
3 for NYPD to utilize this site.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But you just
5 said to me... okay, I'm going to let you finish, go
6 ahead, sorry.

7 JENNIFER COHEN: That's, that's the
8 environmental review issue on top of which they would
9 have to be... they would have to share the exit and
10 entrance point from the site with Bartlett which is
11 something that the deal is designed to do but we
12 would just need to understand with the tractor
13 trailers and what, what's actually coming into the
14 site... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, I get that
16 but as a plan B what I'm saying is there's an
17 existing tow pound lot now... [cross-talk]

18 JENNIFER COHEN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...and perhaps
20 they should move all those cars that are coming from
21 god knows where to another location to be towed and
22 they can free up some space for us to tow some more
23 trucks in there. So, that's a plan B, plan A would be
24 for us to create a facility on this site, a plan B is
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

in the existing tow pound lot now for them to move those cars... [cross-talk]

JENNIFER COHEN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that are bunched up to the... to the heavens and to move those out and create space and prioritize trucks to be towed there, am I... everybody is getting it?

WAHEERA MARDAH: Okay, we can talk to NYPD... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-talk]

WAHEERA MARDAH: ...about that space.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, we have to have more conversations on that. Just a few more questions. On the IBID so you're right outside the scope of the IBID, it's... Bartlett, I guess you can answer this question, do you have any interest in being supportive of the IBID?

DIANA MALAVE: We do, I believe Tommy the CEO of Bartlett and a couple other representatives will be actually attending their next meeting and getting more information and I believe they do plan on trying to join or be supportive in any way that they can.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

32

WAHEERA MARDAH: And I don't think them being a little outside of the BIDs district is an issue at all so they... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-talk]

WAHEERA MARDAH: ...would still be able to... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Great, yeah and I know the FAA building also pays in although they're right outside of the catchment area. Just going to the jobs piece a little bit more, so we spoke of civic associations, workforce partners, can you just go into that scenario, you also spoke of, I think I saw construction jobs that are being created, are those union construction jobs or...

WAHEERA MARDAH: I believe the construction is going to be living wage, I don't believe it's... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Living wage, okay and what's your plan to do outreach to the local community.

WAHEERA MARDAH: So, as we mentioned we've been having extensive conversations with Hire NYC and the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to make sure that they are tailoring some of their newsletters and, and targeting emails to include a lot of the civic organizations that you suggested to us, the community board, and any additional workforce partners that are appropriate in the area.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, I'm going to make a quick recommendation, JFK... what is... JFK... they have a JFK workforce development office, a strong partnership being forged there would be good because they're, they're working on a lot of the airport related stuff already, also working with the IBID closely... [cross-talk]

WAHEERA MARDAH: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...and I also want DHS at the table, Department of Homeless Services at the table on this and I'll give a good reason why. A few blocks from this site there is the Saratoga Family Inn which it's the largest family shelter on the East Coast and I'm sure there are individuals living in that shelter who we should have a strong partnership with not in just sending a flyer but we should think about a real plan on how we're going to do outreach there and provide some opportunities to families in that shelter, upward

1
2 mobility. So, so I look forward to a more thorough,
3 thought out plan on how we're going to map that out
4 to ensure that those families have access to these
5 jobs. Alrighty, I think that is it but I want to
6 thank you all for the work you've done, I do want to
7 credit you on the outreach that you've done to the
8 community, summer you came in so happy, you look so
9 sad now but that's part of negotiating with Donovan
10 Richards, right Aileen? We want to put a smile on
11 everybody's face but the communities is the most
12 important, love you all but, but thank you so much, I
13 look forward to following up shortly on these items
14 and I want to thank you, I'll turn it back over to
15 the Chair, thank you Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you Council
17 Member Richards. I let Council Member Richards run
18 out all that steam, I know he wanted to run out all
19 that... all that steam, I had all those notes written
20 down and he took every last one, already had it... I
21 know... I know... I know, no, it's good, it's all good
22 stuff but the, the main thing that I would too like
23 to emphasize is going to be outreach which of course
24 is, is number one on my list specifically to Saratoga
25 and any other surrounding shelters in that area in

1
2 sorely need of employment opportunities especially to
3 growth and as the Council Member so adequately said,
4 upward mobility is of paramount, paramount importance
5 to us so we would really, really like to see those
6 partnerships developed and built. So, thank you very
7 much for a great presentation this afternoon, we look
8 forward to a great project. We do have members of the
9 public that wish to testify on this matter. Scott...

10 [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Could I get one
12 more thing in?

13 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Go ahead..

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Sorry, and in...
15 on the 2.6 acres, sorry to cut off because I forgot
16 to make this point, since there's going to be a need
17 for green infrastructure on this site there's no park
18 in that community so we should figure out some open
19 space on that site at the very least if we can't do
20 the tow pound lot so I just wanted to put that out,
21 out there as well and it.. also I think it's good for
22 the workers as well to have a place to go and sit and
23 eat their lunch if they want to get some fresh air,
24 look at the, the planes fly over to the airport,
25 endure relentless airport.. airplane noise, it's great

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

36

1
2 for the... for the ears. I would also suggest that... and
3 also the new hotel which is opening as well across
4 the street from there. So, so that should certainly
5 be on the radar as well.

6 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
7 for your time today, thank you.

8 WAHEERA MARDAH: Thank you.

9 DIANA MALAVE: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: We are going to call
11 up our next panel Mark McMillan, Community Board 13
12 Queens District Manager and Scott Grimm Lyon, Gateway
13 JFK IBID. You may begin whenever you are ready.

14 MARK MCMILLAN: Good morning... I'm sorry,
15 good afternoon. First, I want to apologize to Council
16 Member Richards for his name not being the in
17 salutation. I will just read this testimony. Good
18 afternoon Chair Adams, Council Members Koo, Miller,
19 Barron, Treyger and Richards. I am here today to
20 testify in support of the, the... of a dynamic project
21 that is targeted to be built in Springfield Gardens.
22 After all of the letters and numbers cited in the
23 above re: line what Queens community board 13 is
24 supporting is the construction of a Bartlett Dairy
25 warehouse on undeveloped land adjacent to JFK airport

1
2 in a largely industrial area. New York City Economic
3 Development Corporation presented to our board
4 members twice; once at our land use committee meeting
5 and a second time at a public hearing held at our
6 January 2019 general board meeting. The EDC team
7 along with the owners of Bartlett Dairy showed the
8 vision through a powerful... power point presentation
9 and were thoroughly questioned by board members and
10 some members of the public. the community board, once
11 at the land use committee and at the general board
12 meeting, voted unanimously to support this project.
13 The benefits of this warehouse being built at this
14 location are employment opportunities for local
15 residents; economic development for the immediate
16 surrounding areas; new roads and increased city
17 services. This new warehouse will also be, and this
18 is... I thought it was a mistake but near the catchment
19 area of the JFK IBID, the recently created business
20 improvement district and comprised of the many air,
21 air freight businesses in the area. Gateway JFK
22 wholeheartedly supports the Bartlett Dairy warehouse
23 being built at this location. There is a residential
24 community nearby that is organized through the Spring
25 Jam Civic Association, they too are enthusiastic in

1
2 their support for this project. Finally, there were
3 concerns expressed about the truck parking and
4 traffic, this is a huge problem in the community of
5 Springfield Gardens and surrounding areas. EDC and
6 the ownership stated that all trucks could be parked
7 on site and that ingress and egress would be directly
8 on to Nassau Expressway which goes directly to the
9 expressway and truck routes they will be using for
10 deliveries. At no time would they be... would they need
11 to use the local streets. And I, I just want to add
12 that we... I've, I've personally spoken to both Kim
13 Lorton at, at Spring Jam and Lonnie Glover and some
14 more board members from Springfield Gardens and, and
15 they're all supportive of, of this project.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.

17 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: Good afternoon, my
18 name is Scott Grimm Lyon, I'm the Executive Director
19 of the Gateway JFK Industrial Business Improvement
20 District. The, the business improvement district is
21 pleased to express our support in favor of the
22 proposed development of the undeveloped land at the
23 intersection of Nassau Expressway and Rockaway
24 Boulevard by Bartlett Dairy and Food Service. Gateway
25 JFK is an industrial business improvement district

1
2 adjacent to the proposed development site. We are
3 dedicated to making the area a safe and clean space
4 to live in, work in and invest in. We partner with
5 the local business community to provide... to provide
6 effective advocacy and supplemental services in
7 coordination with government agencies and we partner
8 with the residential community to mitigate the
9 impacts of industry on their quality of life. We
10 believe that Bartlett's core business of running a
11 warehouse for the distribution of milk and other
12 products to groceries, schools and hotels fits well
13 within the existing context in the neighborhood which
14 is currently populated with over 600 businesses
15 providing logistical support to the tons of goods
16 that flow through JFK airport and to major ports of
17 call. We believe that the development will have
18 minimal impact on the existing traffic patterns in
19 the neighborhood as the proposed developed includes
20 ample parking on site for employees and trucks and
21 has clear entrances and exits directly onto Nassau
22 Expressway and Rockaway Boulevard. We believe that
23 the design and aesthetics of the development which
24 include a modern facility, ample parking and an
25 attractive fence with landscaping will act as a

1
2 prominent example to inspire future investment and
3 revitalization in the area. And finally, we believe
4 that the jobs provided by this development will help
5 us... will help make... to make sure that Southeast
6 Queens remains, remains a vital employment resource
7 for the surrounding residential community. Southeast
8 Queens is a community in need of both investment and
9 jobs. The Bartlett Dairy project will manage to
10 provide both while fitting within the context of the
11 existing neighborhood and do so in a way that has
12 little impact on existing traffic patterns. We
13 encourage the City Planning Commission to.. I'm sorry,
14 we encourage the City Council to enthusiastically
15 approve this development.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you Scott for
17 sharing your testimony today, thank you very much
18 Mark for sharing your testimony as well, we do
19 appreciate your time, thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: One question.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Oh, Council Member
22 Miller... I'm sorry, Richards.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you. You
24 did a... just, just wanted to get you on the record,

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

41

1
2 the IBID last I checked did a DOT sort of pothole
3 study, right?

4 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Can you speak a
6 little bit about the DOT issues in that area?

7 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: Yeah, so we did a
8 survey in April of the street conditions within the
9 215-acre area that is our business improvement
10 district and we came up with over 400 issues to
11 report to the Department of Transportation largely
12 among them being potholes. We used the DOT portal to
13 get all of those on the record and a number of them
14 have already been addressed so DOT has been reactive
15 to, to our concerns so far.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Is Rockaway
17 Boulevard smooth?

18 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: No, Rockaway Boulevard
19 is not smooth, but it is... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Wait a minute,
21 did you see the picture they showed? Cars driving
22 down this thing..

23 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: Rockaway Boulevard is
24 on the agenda to be.. to be repaved and I believe it's
25 in the fiscal year 2020 budget for DOT to have a full

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

42

1
2 repaving along the whole area from Baisley Pond
3 Boulevard down to the Nassau border.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right but
5 that's with the infrastructure being into which was
6 good that they actually answered as well so...

7 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: Right...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: We still have a
9 ways to go on that but they should come and address
10 many of those outlying issues now... [cross-talk]

11 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: Right... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...before...
13 [cross-talk]

14 SCOTT GRIMM LYON: I agree and, and I
15 support any efforts to have additional tractor
16 trailer areas in the tow pound and I'd be happy to
17 work with your office to, to make, make that happen
18 because they do negatively effect business as well as
19 the residents that we represent at Gateway JFK.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
21 Scott.

22 MARK MCMILLAN: And Council Member I can
23 also make sure that those... that gets to be a priority
24 in our district needs statement in the FY 2020.

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1 MARITIME USES 43

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Awesome, thank
3 you Mark.

4 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.
5 I'd like to note that we have been joined by Council
6 Member Ampry-Samuel. Yes, Brooklyn's in the house.
7 Alright, I now open the hearing on our next HPD
8 application of the day, LU 418, the Brownsville North
9 Ocean Hill neighborhood construction program project
10 in Council Member Ampry-Samuel's district in
11 Brooklyn. HPD requests pursuant to Article XVI of the
12 general, general municipal law approval of the
13 designation of property located at 379 through 383
14 Howard Avenue block 1446, lots 1M3 and 1297 East New
15 York Avenue block 1476, lot four as an urban
16 development action area and pursuant to 197-C of the
17 New York City charter approval of the disposition of
18 such properties to a developer to be selected by HPD.
19 This application will facilitate the construction of
20 two buildings containing a total of approximately 32
21 units of affordable housing. We now call our next
22 panel.

23 [off mic dialogue]

24 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, we see three
25 people on the panel, and we have two slips of paper,

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

44

1
2 so somebody did not fill out a slip of paper. I have
3 Lacey Tauber, HPD and Deborah Widerkehr, Widerkehr.

4 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Yeah.

5 YVONNE STENNETT: Sorry about that.

6 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: That's okay, we'll
7 wait. Now we know who you are, Miss Stennett. Okay,
8 Counsel will swear in the panel.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
10 hands? Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the
11 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
12 testimony before this subcommittee and in answer to
13 all Council Member questions?

14 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Yes.

15 LACEY TAUBER: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Alright, we can begin
17 whenever you're ready. As a reminder please do state
18 your name before you begin each statement, thank you.

19 LACEY TAUBER: Alright, thanks Council
20 Member. My name is Lacey Tauber, I'm from HPD. Land
21 Use Item Number 418 is related to a ULURP application
22 seeking UDAAP designation, project and disposition
23 approval for three city owned vacant lots located at
24 379 to 383 Howard Avenue and 1297 East New York
25 Avenue in Brooklyn council district 41. The project

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

45

1
2 is known as Brownsville North Ocean Hill NCP and is
3 slated for development under HPD's neighborhood
4 construction program, NCP, which funds rental... infill
5 rental housing with up to 45 units affordable to low,
6 moderate- and middle-income households. The
7 development team was chosen through a competitive
8 process and proposes to construct two buildings with
9 a total of 32 affordable rental units plus one unit
10 for a superintendent. The project includes a ten
11 percent homeless set aside which is three units for
12 families referred from social service agencies such
13 as DHS, the Department of Homeless Services. Upon
14 completion, 379 to 393 Howard Avenue will be a four-
15 story building with 23 units including the
16 superintendent's unit. The unit mixture includes five
17 one bedroom and 17 two-bedroom units plus one two-
18 bedroom unit for the super. 1297 East New York Avenue
19 will be a... also be a four-story building. The unit
20 count for this building ten and the unit mixture
21 includes three one bedroom and seven two-bedroom
22 units. The target incomes for this project will be up
23 to 70 percent of the area median income or AMI with
24 rents affordable to families with incomes between 37
25 percent and 67 percent of AMI, which is approximately

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

46

681 dollars for a one bedroom apartment at the lower income tiers to approximately 1,549 for a two bedroom at the higher income tier. The project also includes units rented to formerly homeless families and individuals as I mentioned. This building will be built to meet Enterprise Green Community standards and amenities will include a lounge, laundry room and an outdoor recreational space per building. In order to facilitate this development, HPD is before the Landmarks Subcommittee seeking approval of this Land Use action and I can turn it over to the development team to walk you through the presentation, I think you have the deck, great.

DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Good afternoon, my name is...

LACEY TAUBER: Press, press the button.

DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Oh, here we go. Hello, good afternoon, my name is Debbie Whitaker, I'm with M Lappin and Associates, we're one of the managing members and I'll, I'll also mention Sheila Bennett here who is an administrator with East Brooklyn Congregations and in the audience we also have joining us Matilda Dyer who is on the EBC board and is a Nehemiah homeowner and my partner Mike Lappin.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

47

So, the first slide that you have shows the location of the two sites in Brownsville, the first is at Howard and Bergen, it's two adjacent lots and the second site is on East New York Avenue also just east of Howard Avenue. Turning to the next slide, a little bit more information about the development team. I, I assume some of you are familiar with the, the work of EBC, EBC is... are a managing member, their primary responsibility will be community outreach. EBC is a coalition of 40 plus Brooklyn based congregations, schools, homeowners' associations and has developed over 3,500 homes for first time home buyers under its Nehemiah program and owns almost 300 rental units and has others that are under development now. The next managing member is Mark Calgroup, Mark Caller is the Principal, he's a Brooklyn based contractor, developer and he has a million square feet of development under construction and five million under management, he's completed two affordable projects in Brooklyn with HPD involvement and then M Lappin Associates, you know Mike Lappin and myself we have been consulting in development, doing development for a number of years primarily through... or before we teamed up together we were with the community

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

48

preservation corp., Mike Lappin is the past president
and while there he oversaw the financing of 147,000
homes and eight billion dollars of investment in
affordable housing. The, the last team member I'll
mention is DeLaCour, Ferrara and Church, our
architects they have 31 years of experience do...
designing creative, attractive, energy efficient
buildings for non for profits and community-based
developers. The, the next slide shows the.. an aerial
view of the Howard Avenue building again on the
corner of Howard and Bergen and following that the
next slide shows a, a rendering of the proposed four
story building, 22 affordable rental units plus a
super's unit, almost 18,000 square feet of zoning
development and the building amenities will include a
resident lounge on the ground floor, laundry room and
outdoor recreational rear yard. The, the following
slide will show the site plan and you'll see the, the
entrance to the building is off Howard and then
there's the garden area in the back for a resident
use and there will be of course street trees. The,
the next slide shows the ground floor residential
units as well as utility rooms, the laundry room and,
and the community space. And then flipping to the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

49

1
2 next slide you'll see an aerial view of the East New
3 York building, it's just east of Howard Avenue on, on
4 New... East New York Avenue and near that triangular
5 park in front of the, the Ascend Charter School. So...
6 and then the, the next slide shows a picture.. a
7 rendering of the building, again, it's a four-story
8 residential building, ten rental units, about 8,900
9 zoning square feet and there will be a laundry room
10 and an outdoor recreational yard. So, the, the, the
11 next slide shows the, the site plan again, you'll see
12 the, the entry off East New York Avenue and a garden
13 area in the rear for the resident's use. And on the,
14 the next slides shows the first floor plan and given
15 that East New York Avenue is a busy street, the
16 utility rooms and the laundry room are located toward
17 the, the street level and there's one residential
18 unit in the back and then there's access to the, the
19 rear yard. The next slide will just show you a couple
20 of the sustained building measures that we plan. As
21 HPD requires we'll build to the Enterprise Green
22 Community standard, we'll have highly efficient
23 heating and ventilating systems and energy star
24 appliances, water sense plumbing fixtures, the ground
25 floor units will be universally.. apply a universal

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

50

1
2 design technique so they'll be fully accessible but
3 the, the buildings themselves are walk ups and we're
4 working with Enterprise Community Partners on a
5 community health action plan to be focused on healthy
6 foods and so one of the thoughts that we, we have is
7 gardening and vegetables and, and fruits as a... as a
8 community building project as well as an educational
9 tool and at the suggestion of the Borough President
10 office we're working the landscape architect to
11 install rain gardens and enhanced tree pits in front
12 of the sites. So... and as... flipping to the next slide
13 Lacey's already mentioned the, the unit mix. We have
14 eight one bedrooms, 24 two bedrooms or actually 25
15 including the super's unit and the, the range of
16 incomes goes from 30 percent of AMI up to 70 percent
17 and the incomes that we would serve range from 21,000
18 for the smallest household up to 75,000 and change
19 for the, the highest income tier. The, the rents
20 range from 472 a month for the, the one bedroom up to
21 1,500 and change for a two bedroom and the... again the
22 top of the chart shows how the units are allocated
23 between those income categories and then the, the,
24 the next slide shows some of our economic development
25 plans. EBC and Marcal Group or GC will work with

1

2 local workforce development partners to refer
3 candidates to the GC and subcontractors for hiring,
4 we'll post open positions with NYCHA's resident
5 economic empowerment and sustainability department to
6 recruit local residents and EBC currently hires
7 locally for it's superintendent positions in the
8 rental buildings it does own and that is... you know
9 the... EBC will look to do that here as well certainly
10 and EBC will conduct community outreach during the
11 rent up to meet community board preference for the
12 units and... which are required as part of the HPD
13 marketing program. And MWBE participation, HPD sets a
14 goal for the project and we... I'll mention that Marcal
15 Group has used MWBEs for certain trades in the past
16 and has a plan to solicit bids from other MWBEs for
17 additional trades for this project as well to, to, to
18 meet the goal for framing, plumbing, electric,
19 insulation, sheetrock, painting and so forth. And so,
20 the last slide that... in the presentation shows our
21 proposed schedule. We... assuming the ULURP is approved
22 we... we're hoping for that to happen this summer and
23 then we would start... close on the acquisition and
24 construction financing in the winter and start
25 construction immediately with rent up starting two

1
2 years hence 2021. So, we thank the, the Committee for
3 consideration and we're here for any questions you
4 all... you all might have of us.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
6 for your testimony today. As with any housing going
7 up we are grateful for any and all affordable
8 housing, our concern I'm sure and I'm going to defer
9 all of this over to my colleague but our concern of
10 course is going to be affordable for whom, that's my
11 biggest question always when it comes to new housing
12 in the city of New York. So, I'm really curious to
13 hear, I know that she is going to ask, ask the
14 question so I will defer it to my colleague, Council
15 Member Ampry-Samuel.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you
17 so much Chair and for the opportunity and thank you
18 for the presentation. Both sites, we've been
19 discussing for quite some time and in particular
20 having two different conversations. The site on
21 Howard Avenue has been vacant for quite some time and
22 everyone in the community and surrounding community
23 have been waiting and anticipating for development
24 and East New York Avenue not quite as much and I'll
25 get into that in a second but starting out with the

2 affordable for who. I see that there are some one
3 bedroom apartments and when we think about... in... like
4 especially EBC when we think about the need for
5 senior housing and the affordable housing for certain
6 groups of individuals we look at one bedroom
7 apartments and think oh, that would be appropriate
8 for seniors in our community but then when we look at
9 the levels, the 37 percent to 70 percent that 37
10 percent is a little higher than what the average
11 senior in our community could afford so can you just
12 speak to, are there any opportunities or other
13 funding streams that would be available for seniors
14 in order for them to be able to afford it at a, a
15 lower rate and not the 37 percent, are there any
16 opportunities there and what's the rationale for the
17 mixture of units?

18 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Well we, we're trying
19 to balance a whole series of, of constraints and yes,
20 we, we're eager to build affordable housing at the,
21 the, the most affordable levels and, and certainly
22 that is EBC's mission. What I would say is that...

23 [cross-talk]

24 LACEY TAUBER: Oh, actually I have...

25 [cross-talk]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1 MARITIME USES 54

2 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: ...we're, we're starting
3 at... [cross-talk]

4 LACEY TAUBER: ...I have... actually I wanted
5 to clarify something about... [cross-talk]

6 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: It's 30 percent...
7 [cross-talk]

8 LACEY TAUBER: ...that... well it's actually...
9 so, those units are actually the, the homeless set
10 aside units... [cross-talk]

11 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Yes... [cross-talk]

12 LACEY TAUBER: So, they're a little bit
13 different so that's why we were saying in our
14 presentation that it's actually... [cross-talk]

15 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Yes... [cross-talk]

16 LACEY TAUBER: ...40 to 70 because we
17 wanted to make the distinction... [cross-talk]

18 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Oh, I see.

19 LACEY TAUBER: But you know I would just...
20 [cross-talk]

21 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Pardon me... [cross-
22 talk]

23 LACEY TAUBER: ...I would just say to that,
24 I mean you know this is not a senior specific
25 development but we have a couple of other projects,

1
2 you know in our pipeline in your district as you know
3 that are going to be specifically for seniors but
4 yeah, I mean and this one, you know we're looking at
5 a range, if you want to speak to some of, you know
6 EBC's work and the need you see for... [cross-talk]

7 YVONNE STENNETT: I understand your
8 concern about the seniors, one of the things I would
9 say is that we would probably look to see if we can
10 get some supplements for the seniors if we do have
11 seniors applying that meet the qualifications that
12 will supplement their income then we'll be able to
13 have them afford to live there and depending on what
14 income bracket they're at. At our other buildings we
15 do have supplements and we do have some partners who
16 we can partner with to see where that can be
17 something we can explore.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, you
19 were talking about the homeless set aside, could that
20 be something that you can work with, with them
21 because we do see an increase in our homeless
22 population of seniors, we see an increase in the
23 seniors that are going into the drop in center that
24 is not too far from this particular site on Atlantic
25

1 Avenue and I know this is something that I've
2 discussed... [cross-talk]

3
4 LACEY TAUBER: I think we'd have to speak
5 with DHS, I am not familiar with outside of our
6 senior specific buildings the ability to do a senior
7 preference in the set aside, but we can... I can talk
8 to them about that and get back to you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, that
10 would be helpful, and I know that the Dominick's
11 which is a few blocks up the street from this
12 development, I think 50 percent of their units are
13 for homeless seniors and so please...

14 YVONNE STENNETT: You're exactly correct,
15 it is 50 percent...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Uh-huh...
17 [cross-talk]

18 YVONNE STENNETT: ...but they do have some
19 vouchers that will go along with the seniors so we
20 can always explore that to see and looking further
21 into that for you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay,
23 that'll be helpful. Okay, so EBC's relationship with...
24 as a managing partner of a development, can you
25 explain how you will go about the actual rent ups

1
2 themselves, I know that you do an amazing job at
3 community outreach and everything else but can you
4 just take us through your process of making sure and
5 ensuring that all of the units...

6 YVONNE STENNETT: Well we look at the
7 mandates which is given to us by the city, we
8 actually go out to the community, we do informational
9 sessions letting the... letting the community know
10 exactly what's being available before the application
11 process also getting them doing financial workshops,
12 we also... to get them credit ready and financially
13 ready. We also go within our... in our churches to put
14 out the word with... about any advertisements going on
15 as we know we have properties up... going right now
16 that's being rented up, which is 143 units at Gateway
17 and through our outreach and through the housing
18 connect we have over 30,000 applications so far for
19 that. So, it is our pride to make sure that the
20 community is the first to know and everyone else can
21 come secondary, we want to make sure it's fair but we
22 do go extra to make sure that everybody in the
23 community does know about the project beforehand and
24 giving them all the tools that they need to do

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

including the housing ambassadors also to help them fill out applications.

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so along those same lines can you describe your plans for the local hiring piece of it during the construction phase and have you already identified any local partners that you will be working with?

[off mic dialogue]

DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: We... the, the short answer is we haven't identified specific workforce development groups, we'd be happy to receive any referrals of groups. We... EBC and other contractors have worked with some, again if you have a particular recommendation, we'd, we'd be very happy to, to receive it so...

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, okay. Now going through the renderings for East New York Avenue there are a number of concerns about that actual location. In particular, it sits right there at a transportation intersection that has been an absolute nightmare in the community. The intersection of Howard Avenue, Pitkin Avenue, East New York Avenue there are a number of accidents on that corner at any given time, you mentioned in the presentation that

1
2 you have Ascend charter school that's right there
3 across the street but in addition to that you have a
4 senior development that's directly across.. well
5 actually, yeah... directly across the street from this
6 facility and when you go around the corner once you
7 get to Eastern Parkway the next corner are two
8 additional senior residences and so between the
9 children and the seniors we have had a number of
10 conversations with this administration, with DOT
11 about a more safer corridor and where the
12 construction will take place I cannot at all see how
13 you are going to mitigate any of the issues that are
14 taking place already at that junction and the lot is
15 extremely small, it is extremely small, it is very
16 narrow and so I don't even see how you can put a
17 building there and when I read through the comments..
18 well just the description like once sentence, in
19 order to enhance privacy of the first floor
20 residential units no units would have windows facing
21 the street on the first floor and in your renderings
22 you mentioned that and, and you say that on the first
23 floor the apartment it would be facing the back and
24 when you look at the back it's a brick wall, like one
25 side of it is a total brick wall and the other side

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1

MARITIME USES

60

2 of it to the left is a brick wall with a gaping hole
3 that's attached to a garage on the Lincoln side of
4 the street and there are all kinds of rats just
5 running in and out of that space and so have you had
6 any conversation... so, this is just like comment and
7 questions all open to one. I guess what Lacey... what
8 was the rationale for, for developing this actual
9 space?

10 LACEY TAUBER: Well so, I can speak
11 generally to the NCP... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I'm
13 okay with how it... [cross-talk]

14 LACEY TAUBER: ...program... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...we love
16 how it happened for quite some time.

17 LACEY TAUBER: I mean I think; you know
18 in this administration we've been looking at every
19 possible city owned site that we can develop... [cross-
20 talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Every...
22 [cross-talk]

23 LACEY TAUBER: ...you know we're in a
24 housing crisis, we're trying to find places to get as
25 many affordable units as possible where that is the

1
2 easiest for us is where we control the land, this is
3 the situation here. The NCP program is actually
4 tailored specifically to these kind of smaller,
5 harder to develop lots and you know we think that
6 this ten unit building is feasible here although on,
7 on some of those questions about windows and things I
8 would let the architect speak to that but just, you
9 know generally we're looking at everything.

10 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Yeah and well, well... I
11 appreciate your concern about rats which were a
12 problem and I would... you know certainly once the, the
13 building is under construction the construction team
14 can work to control vermin and then certainly the
15 management thereafter so, you know I, I'm sure it's...
16 regrettably it's often the case that for vacant lots
17 they, they attract trash and then vermin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Well not
19 just that so on Lincoln, Lincoln Road around the
20 corner... [cross-talk]

21 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Yeah, yeah... [cross-
22 talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...that's a
24 whole strip of folks that are fixing cars... [cross-
25 talk]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

62

DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and so that gaping whole that's in the back of one of those garages is what... like you see it like whoever... if you are living in this brand-new apartment... [cross-talk]

DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and you're overlooking this outdoor, rare space, you are looking at a hole in a dilapidated like area, it's... so, have you had conversations with the people that own the garages on Lincoln?

YVONNE STENNETT: We have not had conversations but we will have conversations, one of the things we do strive on with any of the buildings is EBC Associated and I'm quite sure with HPD and Lappin Associates that our buildings run exquisitely well, we do not allow rats or rodents to be going into people's apartments or anything like that, we make sure that the staff cares about the building, just not... works at the building but truly cares about the building and also with East Brooklyn Congregation we stay on top of them making sure that the building is maintained and that the residents get all the amenities they deserve plus more so if that was a

1
2 challenge or that was a... we would definitely address
3 that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, there...
5 will there be any windows on the, the... clearly there
6 are no windows on the side of the building, there
7 will only be windows in the front and the back?

8 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: That's right...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Because
10 it's adjacent to the wall and so going back to the
11 location, about, I don't know maybe 100 feet... I don't
12 even know... what is this between the two of us right
13 now? How many feet is that? 25 feet, okay, alright.
14 So, about 25 feet from the front of the building
15 there's a sinkhole that's there every other month,
16 right and when we spoke to... and this is for you
17 Lacey, when we spoke to the city about this we were
18 told from DOT well if it's something that Council
19 wants to fix, the Council can fix it, it's going to
20 be about ten million dollars to fix the street that's
21 directly in front of... [cross-talk]

22 LACEY TAUBER: Is that, that's on East
23 New York Avenue you're saying?

24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

64

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: On, on East New York Avenue but literally like where the, the stripe lines are... [cross-talk]

LACEY TAUBER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...the lines when you walk out of the door, I guess at the back of the car and since the city is looking to build and develop in every space that they can possible build and develop, you already know I don't see when I look at my community and I look at my district I don't just see it as a need for housing and that's it, if you're going to build and develop housing you need to also think about or take into consideration the surrounding area and where Zion Triangle Park is being developed that was a quick win and that was multi moto funds and you know a lot of other folks putting money together and the Pitkin Avenue bid was doing a lot of, you know fundraising and, and outreach work but for many years this... the community has been begging the city to do something about that interest action and so I think that if this administration is looking to increase housing units, affordable housing units then we also need to increase the surrounding areas of where these

1
2 affordable units are being developed because you
3 can't just do one and not think about the other and
4 so have you had conversations at all with DOT and.. or
5 any other folks to discuss that whole little corridor
6 right there that's complicated and..

7 LACEY TAUBER: I have not but now that
8 I'm hearing this from you I'm totally happy to take
9 this back, flag it for the appropriate folks and get
10 that conversation going if it isn't already, I mean
11 we're still a ways out from starting construction so
12 I think we have plenty of time to pick that
13 conversation up.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: So,
15 everyone knows this is coming and I am constantly
16 tagged on social media from advocacy groups that say
17 to me okay, Councilwoman what are you doing about
18 this corridor...

19 LACEY TAUBER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and do not
21 overlook, you know safety needs. We had
22 transportation alternatives come out on that corner,
23 they've done vision zero a few times since I've been
24 in office, it's only been a year and a half and again
25 there's been countless study after study after study

1
2 and there was even discussions about the possibility
3 of a roundabout there and so, you know I would flag
4 and you know cower there and go to community board
5 meetings, this is a constant issue that comes up and
6 so I cannot sit here and not discuss the need for a
7 broader conversation about this particular area in
8 addition to the lot size just being very small.

9 LACEY TAUBER: Yeah.

10 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: It's a small building.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: It's a
12 small building and for me... that's it with my
13 questions.

14 LACEY TAUBER: Thank you.

15 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
17 Council Member Ampry-Samuel, I echo every concern of
18 my colleague needless to say, you know and just
19 echoing number one her concern for affordable
20 housing, when it comes to seniors and housing seniors
21 it is really important that the city relay the
22 message that seniors are important and in our current
23 climate where we're going through right now a number
24 of things where things are being taken away from
25 seniors it's wonderful to see housing coming up

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

67

1
2 whenever we can for seniors and to meet the needs of
3 seniors in particular so to know that where we are
4 bringing them are places that are affordable to them
5 and amenable to their needs is really, really
6 important to this Council so I support everything
7 that Council Member Ampry-Samuel said. In addition I
8 would encourage everyone on this project to take a
9 second look at, at this location for the smaller lot
10 and this proposal for housing on this smaller lot in
11 every facet that she spoke about, aesthetics are very
12 important and we appreciate of course EBC and your
13 concerns and we know that you are going to do the
14 very best that you can for everyone that would
15 possibly be living in this building and hearing my
16 colleague express her concerns, my concern also would
17 be consideration of this particular property for a
18 number of reasons; the, the vermin as well as windows
19 and not being able to place windows in certain places
20 and certainly the safety issues surrounding this
21 particular choice for housing is extremely concerning
22 to myself as well. So, I thank you all very much for
23 your testimony today, I thank my colleague for
24 expounding on this and, and giving me clarification

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

68

1
2 on what we were dealing with, with, with these
3 proposals today so, thank you very much.

4 DEBBIE WIDERKEHR: Thank you.

5 LACEY TAUBER: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Alright, we are
7 moving on to our next hearing, which is on LU 398,
8 the East Harlem/El Barrio Community Land Trust in
9 Council Member Ayala... Council Members Ayala and
10 Perkin's district in Manhattan. HPD seeks approval of
11 an urban, urban development area project pursuant to
12 Article XVI of the general municipal law, a waiver of
13 the area designation requirements of charter section
14 197-C and 197-D and an exemption from real property
15 taxes pursuant to Article XI of the private housing
16 finance law for properties located at 53 East 110th
17 Street, 304 East 126th Street, 201 East 120th Street
18 and 204 West 121st Street. These actions will
19 facilitate the rehabilitation of 36 units of
20 affordable housing in city owned buildings. We're
21 calling our next panel Christine O'Donald, HPD,
22 O'Connell, I'm sorry; Norman Williams, Pope Community
23 Inc. and Daniel Stadt, Banana Kelly Community
24 Improvement Association. Counsel will now swear in
25 the panel.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1

MARITIME USES

69

2

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right

3

hand... [cross-talk]

4

CHRISTINE O'CONNELLY: Can we make some

5

clarifications, it's, it's actually Christine

6

O'Connell, Lacey Tauber and Dan Stadt from Banana

7

Kelly Community Improvement Association.

8

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: So, Norman is not

9

here?

10

CHRISTINE O'CONNELLY: Norman is for

11

another project which we will hear next... [cross-talk]

12

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Got it.

13

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right

14

hand? Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the

15

whole truth and nothing but the truth in your

16

testimony before the Committee and in answer to all

17

Council Member questions?

18

CHRISTINE O'CONNELLY: Yes.

19

DAN STADT: Yes.

20

LACEY TAUBER: Yes.

21

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, you may

22

begin.

23

LACEY TAUBER: Great, okay. Land Use Item

24

Number 398 consists of the proposed disposition of

25

four city owned multiple dwellings located at 53 East

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

70

1
2 110th Street, 304 East 126th Street, 201 East 120th
3 Street and 204 West 121st Street in Manhattan,
4 council districts eight and nine known as the East
5 Harlem/El Barrio community land trust. The... I'll just
6 say the CLT, was incorporated with a goal of ensuring
7 the development and preservation of permanently
8 affordable housing in the East Harlem community. The
9 individual buildings in the land trust will be
10 jointly managed by a mutual housing association
11 representing the tenants. The designated developers,
12 Banana Kelly Community Improvement Association, Inc.,
13 a non... a not for profit organization that was
14 qualified through the ANCP, TPT and special projects
15 RFQ. As the designated developer, Banana Kelly will
16 be responsible for obtaining rehabilitation
17 financing, developing a scope of work, coordinating
18 temporary relocation of the tenants and overseeing
19 the selection of general contractors and
20 construction. Additionally, the developer will act as
21 property manager during the construction phase and
22 for at least year after conversion. The buildings
23 were taken into city ownership between 1985 and 1988
24 and are currently being managed through HPD's central
25 management division. 201 West 120th Street is a

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

71

1
2 vacant building while the other three buildings are
3 partially occupied. In total there are 36 residential
4 units with a mixture of unit types including 22 two
5 bedrooms, 13 three bedrooms and one five-bedroom
6 apartment. Additionally, there are two commercial
7 units that will be leased based on the best fit for t
8 eh CLT and one community facility space for the
9 general use of the CLT. Some of the existing tenants
10 have already been temporarily relocated due to
11 building conditions and prior to commencing any work,
12 the developer will be responsible for temporarily
13 relocating the remaining tenants. The proposed scope
14 of work calls for the substantial renovation of all
15 four buildings, whereby all major building systems
16 will be replaced, and existing units will be
17 reconfigured if necessary, to comply with DOB code
18 requirements. Upon construction completion, the
19 buildings will become rent stabilized rental units
20 with rents set at 30 percent of AMI for existing
21 tenants which includes all relocated tenants and 65
22 percent of AMI for vacant units. Upon construction
23 loan closing, the properties will be conveyed to the
24 CLT Housing Development Fund Corporation of HDFC for
25 a nominal fee of one dollar per building, at which

1

2 time the CLT will take title to the buildings and
3 provide oversight of the developer during
4 construction. The estimated total development cost is
5 14,790,975 dollars. As part of LU 398, HPD also seeks
6 Article XI benefits for a term of 40 years coinciding
7 with the regulatory agreement. The approximate tax
8 benefit is 7,844,746 dollars with a net present value
9 of 2,191,596 dollars. The tax exemption will help
10 preserve long term affordability of the low-income
11 rental units within the East Harlem El Barrio
12 Communal Land Trust. And I would just add that I
13 know there's a lot of, you know excitement from
14 advocates and in the Council about the CLT model so,
15 you know we as HPD are excited to bring this to
16 Council and you know all... also to have the developer
17 here to kind of talk through how the model works and
18 you know kind of set the tone for hopefully what
19 we'll see more of these projects in the future.

20 DAN STADT: Hello Chair Adams. My name is
21 Dan Stadt, I'm the Director of Housing at Banana
22 Kelly Community Improvement Association Inc. or
23 Banana Kelly, we're the developers of the East
24 Harlem/El Barrio community land trust which we'll
25 call the CLT. My role in this project has been to

2 serve as the project lead and securing financing,
3 coordinating pre-development, and I will be involved
4 in selecting the general contractor and overseeing
5 construction. I'll begin with a brief overview of
6 Banana Kelly followed by a discussion of the East
7 Harlem CLT and community land trust in general.
8 Banana Kelly was founded in 1978, in the midst of
9 abandonment, arson and disinvestment of our Hunts
10 Point Longwood neighborhood of the South Bronx. While
11 the federal government issued a moratorium on
12 housing, New York State Urban Development Corporation
13 retreated from housing production and New York City
14 was narrowly avoiding bankruptcy, a group of
15 residents came together on a block of Kelly Street
16 with the motto of "don't move, improve". Banana
17 Kelly, as the block was known for its curved shape,
18 was founded upon principles of self-help and mutual
19 cooperation, as residents took matters into their own
20 hands to rehabilitate their buildings themselves,
21 investing their sweat equity. Today, Banana Kelly
22 continues to work on the frontlines providing deeply
23 affordable housing to New Yorkers. While our primary
24 catchment area is the Hunts Point Longwood, Longwood
25 neighborhood of the Bronx, we're expanding to be the

2 developer for two projects in the housing the
3 affordable neighborhood cooperative program division
4 of HPD; one is the 311 Pleasant Avenue cluster and
5 this project, the East Harlem/El Barrio CLT. We are
6 currently developing several clusters, clusters of
7 our own buildings in the Bronx and our existing
8 portfolio consists of nearly 60 buildings with over
9 1,500 units. Banana Kelly was selected as the
10 developer of the East Harlem, Harlem/El Barrio CLT
11 after submitting a proposal to HPD's request for
12 expression of interest. This project fits into our
13 mission to provide deeply affordable housing that is
14 governed by the residents you... who occupy the
15 buildings and live in the neighborhood. Community
16 land trusts are an innovative model to preserve
17 affordable housing for the long term and combats
18 speculative real estate development which Harlem has
19 been experiencing dramatically. The East Harlem CLT
20 will serve as a model for the expansion of land
21 trusts in New York City. Community land trusts are
22 nonprofit organizations that serve as stewards for
23 parcels of land that are maintained for a community
24 purpose. The first community land trust in the U.S.
25 was founded in Albany, Georgia, to provide leases for

1 cooperative farms to CLT members during the civil
2 rights movement in 1969. Since, since then, 200 CLTs
3 have bene developed across 38 states in the U.S. CLTs
4 are an exciting model because of this variability and
5 opportunity for democratic control of community
6 institutions, which can adapt to meet local needs. In
7 New York City, the, the Cooper Square Committee
8 developed the city's first CLT in 1991, the Cooper
9 Square Committee CLT has a mutual housing association
10 or an MHA. MHA is governed by two thirds of residents
11 and one third of members appointed by the CLT. The
12 Cooper Square CLT is then governed by two thirds
13 appointed members and one third residents. This
14 governance structure creates additional layers of
15 commitment to providing quality affordable housing
16 and protection against the speculative real estate
17 market as the land trust the MHA entity that owns the
18 building and leases the land, provide a check on one
19 another. This... furthermore, this structure hinders
20 the ability of the nonprofit to sell buildings into
21 the private market which threatens the existing
22 tenants and long-term affordability of the units. The
23 East Harlem CLT will be structured with a tripartite
24 board composed of one third MHA residents, one third
25

1
2 community residents and one third public interest
3 members. The building will be owned by the MHA HDFC,
4 which will have a ground lease with the CLT HDFC.
5 Both entities will be incorporated as HDFCs pursuant
6 to, to Article XI of the private housing finance law,
7 which mandates that the units be rented to persons of
8 low income and gives HPD certain enforcement
9 authorities. This structure will offer protections to
10 preserve affordability and provide community control
11 over this local institution. Community land trusts
12 are critical for their ability to influence policies
13 both within the land trust itself and at a larger
14 scale. Tom Angotti, in his working paper on CLT's
15 asserts that and I quote, "when land trusts are one
16 among... are one among many tools used to stabilize
17 land values including public ownership, rent controls
18 and land, land use controls, their benefits are
19 maximized. It is also necessary that communities
20 consciously exert control over land by using a
21 variety of tools, thereby obtaining a social purpose
22 for the land. Community land is land which local
23 residents and businesses control collectively either
24 via public or nonprofit ownership. It is an issue of
25 political control, not simply one of legal ownership

1
2 of the land", end quote. Banana Kelly has experience
3 with such types of community ownership, having
4 revised our by-laws to become a centralized mutual
5 housing association in the 2000s. residents currently
6 comprise a plurality of our board of directors, and
7 we have a separate resident council which takes up
8 different issues that our resident members deem
9 pertinent and important. We maintain that as a
10 community institution we must be governed by those
11 who, whom we serve. As the CLT's developer, we are
12 carrying this mission to provide local control and
13 resident governance, governance of housing. This
14 project goes beyond the simple preservation of
15 affordable housing units to find a new community
16 institution that will be governed by residents and
17 neighbors and accountable to the East Harlem
18 community.

19 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
20 for your testimony today and as Lacey said this is
21 such a really, really exciting prospect for all of
22 us, CLTs, everybody is buzzing about it, we want
23 everybody to get involved and.. but most importantly
24 we want people to know and really understand what
25 it's all about, the ins and outs of, of this as we

1
2 embark on this wonderful New Jersey... new journey. So,
3 I'm going to ask a question, how does the community
4 land trust structure help ensure long term
5 affordability for the residents?

6 DAN STADT: So, the CLT structure and the
7 MHA structure it preserves long term affordability.
8 So, the way I was talking about it, it takes out a
9 speculative real estate market, what that means is
10 that because the land is owned by the separate trust
11 that is control of the government... governance of, of
12 the building, it really prevents this building from
13 being sold and it also provides an opportunity for
14 advocacy in issues such as housing. The, the, the CLT
15 which owns the land will be separate from the MHA
16 which owns the building so those two institutions
17 because they're separate entities they offer as
18 checks, they, they're sort of system in checks and
19 balances in place and because the land loses a lot of
20 its value in terms of the private market it creates
21 the social good for the people who live there, live
22 in the buildings and who control the land trust.

23 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: That was going to be
24 borderline my next question, which you just answered
25 so thank you for that. It was going to be the

1
2 composition and the difference between the, the MHA
3 and the CLT and, and thank you for incorporating that
4 in that for me. What affordability restrictions will
5 be in the ground lease between CLT, the CLT entity,
6 which owns the, the land and the MHA, which owns the
7 buildings?

8 CHRISTINE O'CONNELLY: So, the ground
9 lease will stipulate that the, the properties are
10 affordable to low- and moderate-income households,
11 the regulatory agreement which HPD will require the
12 property have will stipulate more specific income
13 restrictions. Specifically, for this property it will
14 be an income restriction of 75 percent of area median
15 income and that's really targeted at the vacant
16 apartments because the insiders don't have an income
17 restriction, they are grandfathered in.

18 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, I think that's
19 a good start and I congratulate you on, on beginning
20 this process for us and unless there's something else
21 that you want to add.

22 LACEY TAUBER: Just clarifying something,
23 I think...

24 CHRISTINE O'CONNELLY: Just a
25 clarification, so the, the rents will be restricted

1
2 to 65 percent of AMI for the vacant apartments and
3 the income restriction will be 75 percent AMI which
4 gives us a little bit of wiggle room in terms of
5 marketing so we're looking for, for families between
6 65 and 75 to occupy those vacant apartments.

7 LACEY TAUBER: I just wanted to clarify
8 the discrepancy between the testimony and everything
9 she just said just to clear it up.

10 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Appreciate that,
11 okay. Thank you very much for your testimony today,
12 thank you. Okay, we're going to move on unless there
13 are any members of the public that wanted to testify.
14 Okay, we're going to move on to our next item. We're
15 opening the public hearing now on LU... I open the
16 public hearing on LU 399, the Lenox Avenue cluster in
17 Council Member Ayala's district in Manhattan. HPD
18 seeks approval of an urban development area project
19 pursuant to Article XVI of the general municipal law,
20 a waiver of the area designation requirements of the
21 charter sections 197-C and 197-D and an exemption
22 from real property taxes pursuant to Article XI of
23 the private housing finance law for properties
24 located at 135 West 132nd Street and 406, 402, 424,
25 426, 428 and 432 Lenox Avenue. These actions will

1
2 facilitate the rehabilitation of seven partially
3 occupied city owned buildings located in Central
4 Harlem. The properties will be rehabbed by a
5 designated developer and converted to cooperative
6 ownership. The cluster contains 53 residential units
7 including 21 occupied units and 32 vacant units,
8 there are also eight commercial spaces. Occupied
9 units will be sold as co-ops for 2,500 dollars per
10 unit, the vacant units will be sold as co-ops at 95
11 percent and 105 percent AMI and the initial
12 maintenance fees will be set at 40 percent AMI. We
13 call on Norman Williams, Hope Community Inc.;
14 Genevieve, hi Genevieve Michel and Christine,
15 Christine, okay, thank you. So, HPD you're staying,
16 okay. You may begin.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: They have to be sworn
18 in.

19 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Oh, you got to be
20 sworn in.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
22 hand? Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the
23 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
24 testimony before the Committee and in answer to all
25 Council Member questions?

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

82

1 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Yes.

2 NOR: Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, thank you, you
4 may begin.

5 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Genevieve Michel. Land
6 Use Number 399 consists of the proposed disposition
7 of seven city owned buildings and the approval of
8 Article XI tax benefits for the buildings located at
9 135 West 132nd Street, block 1917, lot 16; 406 Lenox,
10 block 1728, lot two; 422 Lenox Avenue, block 1729,
11 lot 101; 421 Lenox Avenue, block 1729, lot two; 426
12 Lenox Avenue, block 1729, lot three; 428 Lenox
13 Avenue, block 1729, lot 103 and 432 Lenox Avenue,
14 block 1729, lot 172 in Manhattan council district
15 nine. Known as the Lenox Avenue ANCP cluster, the
16 buildings will be developed through HPD's ANCP
17 program. Under the ANCP program guidelines, city
18 owned multiple dwellings are conveyed to restoring
19 communities HDFC for one dollar per tax lot and then
20 rehabilitated by private developers selected through
21 a competitive process. The developer will sign a site
22 development and management agreement with restoring
23 communities that will be in effect until co-op
24 conversion occurs and title transfers from restoring
25

1
2 communities HDFC to the individual cooperative. From
3 the time of the cooperative conversion, the developer
4 will remain the property manager for at least one
5 year. After the first year, the co-op will have the
6 choice of keeping the developer as property manager
7 or hiring a new company of... as approved by HPD. The
8 buildings in the Lenox Avenue cluster were taken into
9 city ownership between 1978 and 1985. By 2001, all
10 buildings have been participating... since 2001, all of
11 the buildings have been participating in the tenant
12 interim lease program, or TIL, which required the
13 tenants to form tenant associations to self-manage
14 their buildings and collect rents under a net lease
15 agreement with HPD. The cluster has a total of 53
16 residential units of which 21 are currently occupied
17 and 32 are vacant. The cluster also contains five
18 commercial spaces; four at 422 to 432 Lenox Avenue
19 and one at 406 Lenox Avenue. The household incomes
20 for the existing tenants ranges from five percent to
21 60 percent of AMI and the cooperative interest
22 attributable to occupied apartments will be sold to
23 the existing tenants for 2,500 dollars. Additionally,
24 maintenance is anticipated to be approximately 40
25 percent of AMI for existing tenants which, which is

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

84

1
2 roughly 746 dollars for a studio unit, 820 dollars
3 for a one-bedroom unit, 992 dollars for a two-bedroom
4 unit and 1,139 dollars for a three-bedroom unit. The
5 cooperatives interest attributable to a vacant
6 apartment will be sold for a price affordable to
7 families earning approximately 100 percent of area
8 median income. The designated developer for the Lenox
9 Avenue cluster is Hope Community Inc., a not for
10 profit organization, which was selected through a
11 competitive process. The developer will be
12 responsible for managing the temporary relocation of
13 tenants and rehabilitation activities. The work will
14 consist of structural joist replacement work,
15 electrical upgrades and replacement of the building
16 systems including new windows, a new roof, plumbing
17 upgrades and installation of a new boiler. Apartments
18 in all buildings will require layout changes to
19 ensure that layouts conform to the 2014 DOB building
20 code and are handicap accessible. Post
21 rehabilitation, the mixture of unit types will be
22 five studios, seven one bedrooms, 30 two bedrooms,
23 and 11 three-bedroom apartments. The estimated total
24 development cost is 12,356,596 dollars which is
25 subject to change. In addition to seeking disposition

1

2

approval, Land Use Number 399 requests a 40-year

3

Article XI tax exemption in order to help the HDFC

4

maintain affordability. The term of the tax exemption

5

will be coterminous with the regulatory agreement and

6

the total tax benefit is approximately 9,381,501

7

dollars with a net present value of 2,620,922

8

dollars.

9

NORMAN WILLIAMS: Good afternoon, my name

10

is Norman Williams, I'm representing Hope Community,

11

as she stated we're the designated developer. Hope

12

Community has been around since 1968. As most grass

13

root organizations started with local residents' kind

14

of rebuilding and reclaiming their neighborhoods one

15

building at a time. As housing got a little more

16

sophisticated and developed over the years, so has

17

Hope. We currently own about 1,300 units of

18

affordable housing, we develop, we manage, we

19

preserve housing that's our primary business. In

20

addition to that Hope also oversees a lot of cultural

21

awareness and.. you know and community space. For this

22

project our role as described is managing the

23

construction process, financing, lease up and

24

returning these residents back to their homes. We've

25

already engaged in the early predevelopment where we

1 started moving some of the residents already. We've
2 been working with them, the residents know us, you
3 know we're overseeing that process and look forward
4 to facilitating to bring this project in on time and
5 making sure specially the insider purchases are
6 accommodated with their relocation as well as making
7 it a seamless approach for them to move back into
8 their unit.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, thank you very
11 much for your testimony today. I think the only
12 question that I have, I don't think I heard it in
13 your testimony, the number of existing residents
14 involved right now?

15 NORMAN WILLIAMS: Right, so collectively
16 I believe there's 21 existing residents, there's
17 seven that is set up to be relocated before
18 construction, there's another 14 that will be
19 relocated shortly right after the project closes and
20 we're working with all those families currently now.
21 The seven that I'm talking about represent six of the
22 buildings, the last building which is really going to
23 be one of the last buildings that we tackle, it has
24 much larger apartments and larger families and we're
25 going to be mobilizing and probably hitting that

1
2 project last of all the buildings but I would say the
3 seven we actually have targeted move ins for this
4 week and it will be happening before the construction
5 closure.

6 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: And I guess finally,
7 how long will these families be effected before
8 everything is completed and they are settled.. [cross-
9 talk]

10 NORMAN WILLIAMS: Right.. [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: ..resettled.

12 NORMAN WILLIAMS: Right, well
13 construction is estimated at 22 months, there will be
14 some buildings where TLC will probably come online
15 faster than some of the others so upon, you know the
16 TCL being secure we would be putting families back.

17 CHRISTINE O'CONNELLY: We typically
18 expect the construction takes between 18 and 24
19 months, on.. typically construction will take 18
20 months it's just sometimes getting through the
21 approval process, the sign off process takes a little
22 time but as soon as we can bring families back home
23 that's our aim.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Right, okay. Alright,
3 thank you very much for your testimony, appreciate
4 it. Thank you.

5 CHRISTINE O'CONNELLY: Thank you.

6 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Thank you.

7 [off mic dialogue]

8 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. We're next
9 going to have a hearing on three LUs. LU's 400, 402,
10 40... 400, 401, and 402. The MN... MMN 10... 1802 CLOTH
11 through 2185 Amsterdam Avenue in Council Member
12 Rodriguez's district in Manhattan. HPD seeks approval
13 of an urban development project pursuant to Article
14 XVI of the general municipal law, a waiver of the
15 area designation requirements of charter sections
16 197-C and 197-D and an exemption from real property
17 taxes pursuant to Article XI of the private housing
18 finance law for property located at 2185 Amsterdam
19 Avenue. This action will facilitate the
20 rehabilitation and preservation of a six-story city
21 owned mixed use building at 2185 Amsterdam Avenue
22 that currently contains 22 residential units, ten of
23 which are occupied, one superintendent unit and two
24 commercial spaces. HPD owns the property and has
25 designated Community League of the Heights

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

89

1
2 Incorporated Amsterdam TPT HDFC to purchase and
3 rehabilitate the building. In the matter of 2110
4 Amsterdam Avenue, Council Member Levine's district in
5 Manhattan. HPD seeks approval of an urban development
6 area project pursuant to Article XVI of the general
7 municipal law, a waiver of the area designation
8 requirements of charter sections 197-C and 197-D and
9 an exemption from real property taxes pursuant to
10 Article IX for private heart... housing finance law.
11 For property located at 2110 Amsterdam Avenue, the
12 proposed action would facilitate the rehabilitation
13 and preservation of a six story, city owned mixed use
14 building at 2110 Amsterdam Avenue that currently
15 contains 13 residential units and one commercial,
16 commercial space. As with LU 400, HPD owns the
17 property and has designated Community League of the
18 Heights Incorporated Amsterdam TPC HDFC to purchase
19 and rehabilitate the building and finally LU 402. For
20 2488-90 Adam Clayton Powell and 2794 Frederick
21 Douglass Boulevard in Council Member Perkins'
22 district in Manhattan. HPD seeks approval of an urban
23 development project... urban development area project
24 pursuant to Article XVI of the general, general
25 municipal law, a waiver of the area designation

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

90

1 requirements of charter sections 197-C and 197-D and
2 an exemption from real property taxes pursuant to
3 Article IX for private housing finance law for
4 properties located at 2488-90 Adam Clayton Powell
5 Junior Boulevard and 2794 Frederick Douglass
6 Boulevard. The action would facilitate the
7 rehabilitation and preservation of two city owned
8 mixed use building that contained 29 residential
9 units and four commercial spaces. HPD owns the
10 properties and has designated the Community League of
11 the Heights Incorporated or CLOTH Amsterdam TPC HDPC
12 to purchase and rehabilitate the buildings. HPD owns
13 the property and has designated community League of
14 the Heights Incorporated Amsterdam TPT HDPC to
15 purchase and rehabilitate the buildings. We have on
16 our panel of three Nelson Chan from HPD; Genevieve is
17 still here from HPD, Yvonne Stennett, Community
18 League of the Height or CLOTH.

19
20 INGRID GOMEZ-FARIA: Yvonne had to leave.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yvonne had to leave;
22 you are Ingrid?

23 INGRID GOMEZ-FARIA: Ingrid.

24 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes ma'am, Ingrid
25 Gomez Faria. Alright, you may begin.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

91

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
3 hand? Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the
4 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
5 testimony before this Committee and in all... answer
6 all Council Member questions?

7 INGRID GOMEZ-FARIA: I do...

8 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay.

10 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Land Use Numbers 400,
11 401, and 402 consist of the proposed disposition of
12 city owned property for a project known as MMN 1802
13 CLOTH Amsterdam. The disposition area includes Land
14 Use Number 400, which is located at 2185 Amsterdam
15 Avenue, block 2112, lot 14 in council district 10,
16 Land Use Number 401, which is located at 2110
17 Amsterdam Avenue, block 2121, lot 37 in council
18 district seven and Land Use Number 402, which is
19 located at 2794 Frederick Douglass Boulevard and 2488
20 Adam Clayton Powell Junior Boulevard are both in
21 council district nine. The properties were taken into
22 city ownership in 1978 and are currently managed by
23 HPD central management division. The buildings are
24 proposed for redevelopment through HPD's multifamily
25 preservation loan program MPLP. Under MPLP, qualified

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARITIME USES

92

developers are selected through a competitive process to rehabilitate distressed occupied and vacant multifamily buildings in order to create affordable rental housing units with a range of affordability. The buildings require substantial rehabilitation and major system upgrades are needed. Each building will see... will receive a new gas boiler, complete domestic plumbing upgrade with all new plumbing fixtures, upgraded electrical system to meet or exceed the building current code... or the current building code, new floors, new kitchen appliances and cabinets, roof repair or replacement, new windows, new apartment and public hallway doors, exterior masonry work, and painting of all apartments and public hallways. The scope of work also includes enterprise green community upgrades, which will make the buildings energy efficient and environmentally safe. The cluster currently comprises 74 residential units. However, post rehab, the final unit count will be 58 in, in response to necessary layout changes. The construction will be done in two phases. The first phase will rehabilitate the property at 2110 Amsterdam Avenue which is currently vacated and 2185i Amsterdam Avenue where the tenants will be relocated

2 within the neighborhood. Once the first phase has
3 been complete the second phase will be to move the
4 tenants from the property at 2794 Frederick Douglass
5 Boulevard and at 2488 Adam Clayton Powell Junior
6 Boulevard into the completed units until their
7 current building rehabilitation is finished. The
8 estimated total development cost is 22,430,863
9 dollars which is subject to change. When completed
10 the MN... sorry, the MMN 1802 Amsterdam CLOTH cluster
11 will provide 58 residential units including one
12 superintendent's unit. The unit count will be nine
13 studios, nine one bedrooms, 32 two bedrooms, and
14 seven three-bedroom apartments to include one two-
15 bedroom superintendent unit. The targeted household,
16 household incomes for existing tenants are 50 to 60
17 percent of AMI and ten percent of the units will be
18 set aside for homeless households. The tax credit
19 application limits all units to be no more than 60
20 percent of AMI. In addition to seeking disposition
21 approval, HPD also seeks Article XI tax benefits for
22 the cluster in order to help maintain the long, long
23 term affordability of the rental units. The exemption
24 will be in place for a period of 40 years coinciding
25 with the regulatory agreement. The cumulative value

1
2 of the tax exemption is approximately 8ii,415,472
3 dollars with a net present value of 2,545,497
4 dollars.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay.

6 INGRID GOMEZ-FARIA: Hi, thanks for
7 having us today. my name is Ingrid Gomez-Faria, I...
8 I'm the Director of Real Estate Development for
9 Community League of the Heights, CLOTH. CLOTH has
10 been around for 66 years, we started like all the
11 other nonprofits doing social services and for the
12 past 30 years or so we have started working... we
13 started working with HPD to do development in
14 affordable housing. We now own five... own, own 557
15 units in the general area board... community boards
16 nine, ten, and, and up... and Manhattan... Washington
17 Heights. This project we... as Genevieve mentioned
18 we'll create 58 units for... of affordable housing for
19 our neighborhood specifically we have 32 tenants now
20 living in, in somewhat... what should I... how should I
21 say, not, not very good condition. So, hopefully we
22 can get this started as soon as possible and get them
23 back into decent affordable housing.

24 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, thank you, very
25 well said. The word on my mind was marginal, I, I was

1
2 going to help you out but then I said no, the word is
3 going to come, it's going to come. So, I think that
4 you answered really the only question that I have for
5 this particular application like the, the previous
6 one and that was the number of tenants to be
7 relocated and that is 32?

8 INGRID GOMEZ-FARIA: 32, yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. Alright, that
10 was my only question and I thank you very much for
11 your thoughtful testimony today, thank you so much.

12 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Thank you.

13 NORMAN WILLIAMS: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Our final two. HPD
15 applications are related to the Manhattanville
16 walkway at 437 West 126th Street in Council Member
17 Levine's district in Manhattan. LU 416 is an
18 application submitted by HPD pursuant to section 197-
19 C of the New York City charter for the acquisition of
20 property located at 437 West 126th Street, block
21 1967, lot number five. LU 417 is an application
22 submitted by HPD pursuant to Article XVI of the
23 general municipal law requesting approval of the
24 designation of such property as an urban development
25 action area and approval of an urban development

1

2 action area project for such area and pursuant to
3 section 197-C of the New York City charter for the
4 disposition of such property to a developer to be
5 selected by HPD. HPD has indicated that the project
6 area will in fact be disposed to Janus Property
7 Company. The proposed actions will facilitate the
8 construction of a landscaped walkway that will serve
9 as public open space and offer potential to be used
10 as an outdoor seating area for local restaurant use
11 or for the placement of food stalls or other
12 community services. The proposed project will be
13 gated and closed after certain set hours in the
14 evening to promote safety. As part of the disposition
15 HPD will restrict the use of the project area to open
16 space and recreational activities, any future
17 development would require HPD approval. I'll call up
18 our next panel Kevin Parris from HPD; Lacey Tauber is
19 back from HPD and Jerry, is it Salema, Salema, Janus
20 Property Owners. Counsel please swear in the panel.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
22 hands? Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the
23 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
24 testimony before the Committee and in answer to all
25 Council Member questions?

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

97

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

KEVIN PARRIS: Yes.

LACEY TAUBER: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, you may begin.

LACEY TAUBER: Okay, Land Use Numbers 416 and 417 are related ULURP applications submitted by HPD in order to facilitate the redevelopment of a privately-owned vacant lot now known as Manhattanville Walkway. Land Use Item Number 416 seeks to re-acquire ownership by the city of New York and Land Use Number 417 seeks approval of UDAAP designation project approval and disposition of property which is located at 437 West 126th Street in Manhattan council district seven. Manhattanville Walkway is an underutilized, privately owned lot that is slated for redevelopment. The disposition area is 1,608 square feet... it's a 1,608 square foot lot that HPD sold in 2001 as part of a UDAAP project under HPD's neighborhood redevelopment program known as Zora Neal Hurston Houses Limited Partnership, that was Resolution 2156 in 2011. The original project called for rehabilitation of eight multiple dwellings. The vacant lot is situated between two of the residential buildings that have since undergone

1

2 rehabilitation. The lot has remained underutilized
3 and fenced off for many years, as it... as it is
4 irregularly shaped and is not suitable for new
5 construction. Currently, the owner is interested in
6 conveying the vacant lot to a new owner, the Janus
7 Property Company who has been based in the immediate
8 area for the last 25 years. Janus has spearheaded an
9 economic redevelopment of the neighborhood and is
10 proposing to redevelop the vacant lot by creating a
11 pedestrian pathway that will transform the
12 underutilized lot into a vibrant open space walkway.
13 Although the original project did not include
14 specific plans for the lot, it is still bound by the
15 original... the original project's regulatory
16 agreement. Therefore, in order to facilitate the
17 sale, from the current owner to Janus, HPD is
18 pursuing ULURP actions to acquire the site and convey
19 it simultaneously at closing. As part of the
20 disposition, HPD will be restricting the use of the
21 lot to open space and recreational activities. HPD is
22 in favor of the plan and in order to facilitate the
23 proposal, the agency seeks Council's approval of both
24 land use actions.

25

JERRY SALEMA: Good afternoon Chair

Adams, I am Jerry Salema, Principal of the Janus Property Company and thank you for the opportunity to speak with you. As Lacey mentioned our office is located in West Harlem and we've been developing first affordable housing and now commercial and life science buildings in this community. If you flip to slide four, these are former manufacturing buildings that have been abandoned generally for 40 years. First, we renovated the Mink building on the corner of Amsterdam and 126th then the Sweets building where our office is now located. Now we are constructing the Malt House and the Taystee building which was sponsored by the New York City Economic Development Corporation and the New York State Empire State Development Corporation. Rather than just build a group of buildings in this area we have master planned our lots to have cut throughs that are pedestrian walkways in all of our private buildings. We've just retained a land scape architect named Terrain Work to create an overall vision for these green spaces that would go from 125th to 126th, 126th to 127th and 127th to 128th on our properties. All of our spaces including the one subject to this ULURP

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

MARITIME USES

1
2 would be open to the community. As you'll see on
3 slide five, it shows all the buildings that I
4 discussed of which the 1,600 square foot lot that we
5 are purchasing from ECDO is shown in red, is part of
6 this whole. ECDO owns several buildings all around us
7 and they are very enthusiastic about a proposal, our
8 proposal to improve this vacant lot. As you see on
9 slide six, this is an illustrated pre-concept that
10 Terrain Works started in order to lay out green
11 areas, hard scape walkways, places to sit and
12 plantings. As Lacey mentioned there would be gates on
13 both sides that would be closed at night for security
14 and we would set hours based on the hours for all the
15 other buildings of the green spaces in this
16 community. As you'll see in slide seven the first
17 priority is to refine the landscape design then we
18 will ask our architects, Leven Betts Architects to
19 design signage not just for this little lot but as a
20 signature, beautiful design for all of our green
21 areas. And then our lighting designers, Bliss Fasman
22 would design lighting to be consistent with the
23 lighting throughout all of the walkways. Our goal is
24 to take what is now an abandoned, closed in, chain
25 linked, cyclone fending and open it and have a place

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
1 MARITIME USES

2 for people to sit, eat, drink, eat and hang out in
3 our community and be not foreclosed from this little
4 lot. I'm happy to answer any questions you may have.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: It looks like it will
6 become a truly beautiful space so thank you for that,
7 thank you for your work. I... my only question as far
8 as the term open space, what exactly... can you just
9 completely clarify the term open space, we know it's
10 going to be locked at night and, and how open is this
11 going to be, is this going to be open for vending,
12 open... vendors, open just for public to come and sit
13 and eat and just how open will this open space be?

14 JERRY SALEMA: So, the, the fixed
15 furniture that will be in here will be some kind of
16 seating that anyone can come and sit and eat and
17 work, play. There will be a landscape, hardscape in
18 the middle of it where you could put temporary
19 seating for tables and chairs so that if people
20 wanted to in the summertime obviously be more likely
21 people would come and eat. We are developing with EDC
22 a building across the street that we're trying to
23 attract restaurants to the ground floor with the goal
24 that if people could buy food and come to sit in this
25 area as they would in any of the green spaces that

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

would be in this community that we would be
developing.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, I didn't have
any further questions, this looks pretty, pretty
straightforward, pretty cut and dry and again it
looks like it will be a very beautiful space for the
community to enjoy so I thank you so much for your
testimony today.

JERRY SALEMA: Sure.

LACEY TAUBER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Are there any members
of the public that wish to testify on this matter?
Seeing none, the public hearings on LUs 398, 399,
400, 401, 402, 415, 416, 417, and 418 are now closed
and that concludes today's business. I would like to
thank the members of the public, my colleagues,
council and land use staff for attending today's
hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

June 12, 2019