

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

April 9, 2019
Start: 1:35 p.m.
Recess: 2:58 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LAURIE A. CUMBO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: BEN KALLOS
I. DANEEK MILLER
COREY JOHNSON
ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
DIANA AYALA
INEZ D. BARRON
MARGARET S. CHIN
ANDREW COHEN
COSTA CONSTANTINIDES
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
RUBEN DIAZ, SR.
DANIEL DROMM
VANESSA L. GIBSON
MARK GJONAJ
BARRY GRODENCHIK
ROBERT HOLDEN
BEN KALLOS
ANDY KING
PETER KOO
KAREN KOSLOWITZ

RORY I. LANCMAN
MARK LEVINE
CARLOS MENCHACA
BILL PERKINS
KEITH POWERS
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
CARLINA RIVERA
YDANIS RODRIGUEZ
DEBORAH ROSE
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
FRANCISCO MOYA
MARK TREYGER
PAUL VALLONE
JIMMY VAN BRAMER
KALMAN YEGER
COREY JOHNSON

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check] Today is April 9, 2019,
3 today's Stated Meeting, being record by Charise
4 Torres. [pause]

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Hello and welcome to
6 the New York City Council. We are about to begin our
7 proclamation ceremony. Council Member Ben Kallos is
8 joining us and Council Member Daneek Miller. I am
9 Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. So happy to have you
10 all here today on April 9, 2019. If the NAACP New
11 York City Metropolitan Council New York State
12 Conference could please come down and join us for
13 this very auspicious occasion and for the members
14 that are present we would love for you to stand
15 beside this incredible historical organization. Wow,
16 you all roll deep. People coming out of the walls.
17 From all over the city and the state. Oh, wonderful.
18 Oh wow, we have a future council member with us
19 today, yes.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Hold it up. Hand it to me
21 [inaudible] style. Have a seat.

22 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Good afternoon. The
23 New York City Council is proud to honor the NAACP New
24 York City Metropolitan Council [applause] of the New
25 York State Conference for all of their outstanding

1
2 achievements, especially their commitment and
3 contributions to the fight for civil rights. For
4 over a century the NAACP has worked towards advancing
5 freedom and equality of all people. This year is the
6 110th anniversary of the NAACP and at this great
7 milestone we are proud to celebrate the NAACP and
8 reaffirm our support for its success in the years
9 ahead. The council will continue to stand alongside
10 all of you in the fight for criminal justice reform,
11 for election reform, and for your ongoing efforts to
12 champion equality and education, healthcare, housing,
13 wages, and much more. The NAACP New York City
14 Metropolitan Council of the New York State Conference
15 is marking its 83rd year. [applause] All of you have
16 now led the way in fighting for justice and doing
17 away with racial discrimination for over eight
18 decades. So this mark this great milestone I ask my
19 colleagues and members of the NAACP New York City
20 Metropolitan Council of the New York State Conference
21 and join me, as you already have, and this incredible
22 proclamation and I'm so glad that we're doing this at
23 this time because we are extending Black History
24 Month to Black History Year [applause] by making sure
25 that we continue to celebrate all year round

1
2 [applause] and I also want to lift up and to honor
3 and to recognize, she is not present here today
4 because she is at a funeral, but our icon, our
5 leader, we're continuing to Women Outside of Women's
6 Herstory Month because it's Women's Year as well and
7 Dr. Hazel Dukes, the president of the NAACP
8 [applause]. She is truly our queen and accepting
9 today will be Kenneth Cohen, the regional director of
10 the Metropolitan Council of Branches. [applause] And
11 I want to turn this over now to the clerk, who is
12 going to read the proclamation and then we are going
13 to hear from our speaker, Corey Johnson, as well as
14 the two members here, Council Member Ben Kallos as
15 well as Council Member I. Daneek Miller.

16 CLERK: Council of the City of New York
17 Proclamation. The National Association for the
18 Advancement of Colored People, the NAACP, founded
19 February 12, 1909, is the oldest and boldest civil
20 rights organization in the United States. It is also
21 the largest, more than half a million diverse members
22 united by their commitment to activism and advocacy
23 for the last 110 years. They have worked tirelessly
24 to ensure the political, educational, social, and
25 economic equality of rights of all persons and to

1
2 eliminate racial hatred and racial discrimination.
3 And whereas the NAACP New York City Metropolitan
4 Council of the New York State Conference has played a
5 pivotal role in moving the agenda for freedom and
6 equality forward for almost 85 years, thanks to its
7 dynamic past and present presidents, each of whom
8 addressed critical issues during their tenure. Under
9 the leadership of state conference president, Dr.
10 Hazel N. Dukes, regional director Kenneth Cohen, and
11 the first executive director of the Metropolitan
12 Council attorney, David Bryant, it has grown to
13 include 15 adult units with youth and college
14 chapters from Brooklyn, Bronx, Manhattan, Queens, and
15 Staten Island. And whereas at this great milestone,
16 the 110th anniversary of the NAACP, we are proud to
17 celebrate the New York City Metropolitan Council of
18 Branches for its outstanding achievements and
19 reaffirm our support for its success in the years
20 ahead and it advocate for criminal justice reform and
21 election reform while continuing to champion equality
22 in education, health care, wages, and more, now
23 therefore be it known that the New York City Council
24 is proud to honor the members of the NAACP New York
25 City Metropolitan Council of the New York State

1
2 Conference for their extraordinary commitment and
3 contributions to civil rights in New York City and
4 around the world. Corey Johnson, speaker for the
5 entire council, Ben Kallos, co-chair Progressive
6 Caucus, Diana Ayala, cochair, Progressive Caucus,
7 Ydanis Rodriguez, cochair Black, Latino, and Asian
8 Caucus, Daneek Miller, cochair Black, Latino, and
9 Asian Caucus, Francisco Moya, vice cochair Black,
10 Latino, and Asian Caucus, Adrienne E. Adams, vice
11 cochair Black, Latino, and Asian Caucus, Keith
12 Powers, vice cochair Progressive Caucus, Carlos
13 Menchaca, vice cochair Progressive Caucus, Laurie A.
14 Cumbo, City Council Majority Leader, and all members
15 of the New York City Council's Progressive Caucus and
16 New York City Council's Black, Latino, and Asian
17 Caucus.

18 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Wow. You got some
19 names on that proclamation [applause]. All right.
20 And I'm so proud you brought a young person, a new
21 young leader with us today, as we say people pay
22 attention to people who participate, right Andy King?
23 That's right. So I'm going to turn it over now to
24 our speaker, Corey Johnson.

25

1
2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, thank you.
3 Thank you, Madam Majority Leader. I think Laurie
4 said it best and the clerk read the proclamation.
5 I'll just say that 110 years old the NAACP is still
6 looking young and youthful in their spirit and vigor
7 of what they do every single day. I am so sorry that
8 Dr. Hazel Dukes is not with us here today. But as
9 Laurie said, she is a living legend, icon, activist,
10 advocate, trail blazer, glass ceiling breaker. She
11 has done it all. And we are so proud of her
12 leadership of NAACP, and I'm really proud of all the
13 chapters who are represented here today and all five
14 boroughs for the work that you all do in your
15 communities every single day. We had the
16 opportunity, I see my good friend, Jeff Eaton here.
17 I, ah, we had the opportunity to meet about a month
18 ago at the Red Room with all the chapter leaders and
19 it was a very wonderful conversation about the work
20 that the NAACP is currently doing, not what they've
21 done in the past, what they're currently working on,
22 which is a lot. So I am tremendously grateful for
23 this organization from Thurgood Marshall to Brown v.
24 Board of Education, to all of the work that's done on
25 voting rights and criminal justice reform, and for

1
2 the NAACP personally to me, personally to me being
3 probably the most important advocate and ally on
4 marriage equality, the NAACP took that position
5 [applause] in their history, to help LGBT Americans,
6 so I am deeply grateful for all of your leadership
7 and I look forward to continuing the fight and the
8 work with all of you. Thank you very much.

9 [applause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon.

11 I'm cochair of the Progressive Caucus, Council Member
12 Ben Kallos, with Diana Ayala. The NAACP is a legend.
13 I remember as a student in law school and as a
14 practicing attorney just how much of the Supreme
15 Court cases came because of the NAACP. Brown v.
16 Board of Education, Briggs v. Duke Power, Smith v.
17 Allwright, Browder v. Gayle, just to name a few of
18 the history changes cases. Thurgood Marshall, ah,
19 actually quite a lot of them before he himself
20 because a part of the Supreme Court. I wanted to
21 thank and honor Hazel Dukes for all her great work.
22 I also wanted to thank the leader of my local chapter
23 where I am a member at the Mid Manhattan branch, our
24 president and the vice, the first vice chair for the
25 Metropolitan, for the New York State Conference, Jeff

1
2 Eaton. We love Jeff [applause] and just all of you
3 who are here today, all the great work you do every
4 day, as the speaker mentioned. Thank you. We owe
5 you so very much and this is just a token of our
6 appreciation and our recognition. [applause]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Council
8 Member Kallos. I'm Council Member I. Daneek Miller.
9 I'm the cochair of the Black, Latino, and Asian
10 Caucus who are here to support the NAACP. So I want
11 to take a point of privilege. I want to call my
12 chief of staff over here. Come on up here, Candace.
13 [applause]. Candace Prince is the newly elected
14 president of the Jamaica branch [applause] of the
15 NAACP and that is what this organization has done,
16 aside from all the great work, the absolute great
17 work that has gone on for over a century and that
18 continues to happen, and as the speaker said, this is
19 the things that are happening now but this proves
20 here that this work goes on in perpetuity, that we
21 have great leadership and that above everything else
22 that they are developing and cultivating leadership
23 for tomorrow, and I am so absolutely excited about
24 that and the work that is being done, and really
25 excited for the partnership. I was looking at your

1
2 agenda that's coming up and I said, man, this is
3 council agenda here. This is a lot of work that's
4 going on here. And you know we're passing on
5 constituent services and social justice issue and all
6 these things. It is a lot of work that is happening
7 with you because of you and because of this
8 organization throughout the borough and throughout
9 the State of New York, for 110 years and specifically
10 the 83 years that the Metropolitan chapter has been
11 in effect. I am so excited and humbled to be a part
12 of it, to be a member of it, and just look forward to
13 continuing the work, and this is the absolute
14 appropriate place for you, for this organization to
15 be honored in the people's house. So thank you so
16 very much for coming out and accepting this honor.
17 [applause]

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Up front.

19 KENNETH COHEN: As has been said, NAACP is
20 proud to be, to receive this honor and the fact that
21 we've been around for 110 years. We are the biggest,
22 the baddest, the boldest, the oldest, the most
23 feared, the most revered civil rights organization in
24 the world. We do have a very intergenerational
25 group, as you can see from the two young ladies I

1
2 brought up. We, I have three young ladies that are
3 up front [laughs]. We will continue for more than
4 another 110 years. For those that don't know,
5 February 12, 1909, just up the road on 39th Street
6 and Fifth Avenue the NAACP was formally created. If
7 you don't know that part, about five years before
8 that at the Niagara Movement the thought was put in
9 the minds of like people to bring together to change
10 the course of history for people of color and people
11 of many different religions. It has been a wonderful
12 task to be a part of this movement, and I would just
13 like to mention that we have, as the Metropolitan
14 Council, branches in every borough in New York City,
15 which includes Long Island City, that's Marion
16 Jeffries, Bronx Branch, that's Biony Burke, Brooklyn,
17 L. Joy Williams, Co-op City, Mr. Jerome Rice
18 [applause], Corona East Elmhurst, George Dixon, Far
19 Rockaway, Elaine Shore, Jamaica branch, Candace
20 Prince, Mid Manhattan branch, Jeffrey, New York
21 branch, Anthony Harmon, Northeast Queens branch,
22 Flushing, Ken Cohen, Parkchester, Julia Harrison,
23 Staten Island, Edward Josey [applause],
24 Williamsbridge, Julia McDavid, [applause], and I left
25 out one, but she's not forgotten, Lynn Spivey,

1
2 president of the NYCHA branch. [applause] An issue
3 that we will be here on and on until we all get it
4 right. We believe in working together. We are the
5 pit bulls of civil rights. Once we grab on we don't
6 let go until we're finished, one way or the other.
7 So we are proud to be here today. As you see, we're
8 a large group, we're an ever-changing group. I'm
9 quite sure our president, Dr. Hazel N. Dukes, is
10 proud wherever she is at today, and she knows that
11 she is well represented here. So, once again, we
12 thank the City Council for this honor.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: We thank you. [applause]

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you very much.

15 [pause]

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Sergeant at Arms, would you
17 please clear the main floor of the chambers? Please
18 clear the main floor of the chambers. We're about to
19 begin. Please clear the main floor of the chambers.
20 Thank you. [pause]

21 UNIDENTIFIED: At this time I would have
22 to ask the honorees to please leave the main floor of
23 the chambers, please. Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Folks, please clear the
25 floor. Clear the floor. [pause]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Ladies and gentlemen, can I have your attention please? Can I please have your attention? At this time please place all electronic devices, all electronic devices, to vibrate. At this time I ask that all non-council employees, non-council employees, please leave the main floor of the chambers. There is additional seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you. [pause]

UNIDENTIFIED: Good afternoon. The Stated Meeting for April 9, 2019, of the New York City Council will come to order. Please stand for the Pledge of Allegiance.

UNIDENTIFIED: Roll call.

UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel. Ayala.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Borelli. Brannan. Cabrera.
Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Constantinides.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.
4 UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy. Deutsch.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Here.
7 UNIDENTIFIED: Dromm.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
9 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal. Eugene. Gibson.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I'm here.
11 UNIDENTIFIED: Gjonaj.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.
13 UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.
15 UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.
17 UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
19 UNIDENTIFIED: King.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
21 UNIDENTIFIED: Koo.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
23 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I'm here.
25 UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Lander. Levin. Levine.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel. Menchaca.
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Moya. Perkins.
COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: POWERS.
COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso. Richards.
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.
COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Torres. Moya.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Trager.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich. Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo. Cumbo.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yo.

UNIDENTIFIED: We'll now have today's invocation, which will be delivered by Reverend Pastor Frederick Crawford of Union Grove Missionary Baptist Church, which is located at 1488 Hoe Avenue in the Bronx.

UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

REVEREND PASTOR FREDERICK CRAWFORD:

Would you bow your head as we pray? Father, I thank you for all who have gathered here today. I thank you for our elected officials who have come to handle the business of our city. I pray that you will bless

1
2 the agenda that is set before them, that it will be
3 fruitful for all mankind and womankind. Help us to
4 make the best of our time here today. Bless each and
5 every council member as they continue to serve us.

6 Thank you for our public advocate and all who gather.

7 Let this meeting be conducted in harmony, even where
8 there is disharmony. Thank you for your many and
9 wonderful blessings. In the name we pray.

10 Amendment.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you, Pastor
12 Crawford. I ask Council Member Salamanca to spread
13 the invocation on the record.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr.
15 Public Advocate. I would like to welcome Reverend
16 Frederick Crawford to the City Council. Reverend
17 Crawford is a native of the Bronx. He is the oldest
18 of four children, born to Reverend Dr. Fletcher and
19 Mother Crawford. Having served for 12 years, he is
20 the third generation of pastors of Union Grove
21 Missionary Baptist Church. His father, Dr. Fletcher
22 Crawford, served for 50 years, and his grandfather,
23 Reverend Jeremiah Crawford, was the organizer of
24 Union Grove Missionary Baptist Church. Prior to his
25 leadership at Union Grove, Reverend Frederick

1
2 Crawford pastored the First Calvary Baptist Church in
3 Harlem for 20 years. Upon Dr. Fletcher Crawford's
4 retirement, Reverend Crawford was installed at pastor
5 at Union Grove on August 20, 2006. Pastor Crawford
6 is happily married to First Lady Crawford and they
7 share four children together. Thank you again for
8 being here.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you, Council
10 Member. Adoption of minutes?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I motion that the
12 Minutes of Stated Meeting of February 28, 2019, be
13 adopted as printed.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you, Council
15 Member Miller. Messages and papers from the mayor?

16 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Communication from
18 city, county, and borough offices?

19 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Petitions and
21 communications?

22 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Land use call-ups?

24 UNIDENTIFIED: None.
25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: We will now have
3 communication from the Speaker.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Public
5 Advocate. Great to see you again up in that great
6 chair. Good afternoon and thank you all for being
7 here with us on this Tuesday. We have a busy agenda
8 ahead of us. Before we begin, I would like to
9 remember some of those who have passed in the weeks
10 since our last Stated Meeting. Last week three
11 retired FDNY members who had 911-related illnesses
12 died within 48 hours of each other. Timothy O'Neil,
13 a retired FDNY lieutenant, Kevin Lennon, a
14 firefighter, and Michael Andrechi, a fire marshall.
15 Our thoughts and prayers are with these brave New
16 Yorker's families, friends, and the entire fire
17 department. The FDNY suffered another loss this week
18 when Christopher Slutman, a 15-year veteran of the
19 department, was among four Americans killed by a
20 roadside Building on My Block near a US base in
21 Afghanistan. Our hearts are with Christopher's
22 spouse, his children, and the entire FDNY. And
23 finally yesterday in midtown Manhattan Nelson
24 Salinas, a construction worker, succumbed to injuries
25 following a scaffolding collapse. Our prayers and

1
2 thoughts are with him and his family during this
3 horrible time. Now I ask that we all rise and take a
4 moment of silence in honor of those that we lost.
5 [moment of silence] I also want to acknowledge today
6 is Council Member Donovan Richards' birthday
7 [applause] so happy birthday, Donovan. As a present,
8 I'm voting aye on your bill today. Let's dive deep
9 into our agenda. The council will vote on the
10 following land use items: An application to rezone
11 the former Parkway Hospital in Council Member Karen
12 Koslowitz's district. This rezoning will facilitate
13 the rehabilitation of the vacant hospital building
14 with 135 units of housing, 100% which will be senior-
15 affordable housing, and it will facilitate the
16 construction of a new 216-unit residential building
17 on the same property. I know this piece of property
18 has been vacant for a long time and I know that
19 Council Member Koslowitz has been pushing hard for a
20 long time to build senior-affordable housing there,
21 so I want to congratulate her on this big day. We're
22 going to be voting on the approval of 809 Atlantic
23 Avenue in Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo's district for
24 rezoning and for special permits to facilitate a 29-
25 story mixed-use building with 286 housing units,

1
2 including permanently affordable housing. We're
3 going to vote on 103 North 13th Street in Council
4 Member Steve Levin's district, a proposed seven-story
5 mixed building with retail office and required light
6 industrial space. We're going to vote at 245 East
7 53rd Street in Council Member Keith Powers's district
8 to add a commercial overlay to allow for a new six-
9 story with a ground floor commercial use. And
10 finally we're going to vote on the designation of the
11 Park Terrace West, West 217th Street historic
12 district in Inwood, in Council Member Ydanis
13 Rodriguez's district. I know he's worked on this for
14 a long time and it wasn't easy. I want to
15 congratulate him as well. And today I want to thank
16 the staff who worked on this: John Douglas, Jeff
17 Campagna, Brian Paul, Jeff Ewen, and our land use
18 director, Raja Lan. The council will vote on a
19 resolution that amends the rules of the Land Use
20 Committee to clarify and reorganize language that has
21 remained largely unchanged since the Land Use
22 Committee was established in 1990 and to make certain
23 substantive changes to improve the committee's
24 functioning, and we'll also be voting on changing
25 committee assignments and creating new committees and

1
2 eliminating committee. We're going to be voting on
3 that. Moving on, the council will vote on the
4 following pieces of legislation. The council will
5 vote on a few bills concerning water tank inspection
6 and safety. New York City has the best drinking
7 water in the country and that is in no small part due
8 to the strong measures we've taken in the past to
9 regulate the 8,000 to 10,000 water tank structures in
10 our city. While our existing laws are strong, the
11 council's committed to ensuring that there are no
12 loopholes or any opportunities to tamper with
13 inspection results when it comes to our drinking
14 water. The bills we're voting on today will further
15 ensure compliance, allowing New Yorkers to continue
16 to feel confident that their water is always safe,
17 clean, and protected. The first bill we're going to
18 vote is Introduction 1053A, which I sponsored, which
19 would require building owners to ensure that water
20 tank inspection companies submit annual inspection
21 reports directly to the Department of Health and
22 Mental Hygiene. Introduction 1056B, sponsored by
23 Council Member Costa Constantinides, would require
24 that the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to
25 conduct periodic audits of buildings' annual water

1
2 tank inspection documentation, and it will require
3 DOHMH to conduct 125 inspections of water tanks
4 selected at random to help ensure the accuracy of the
5 annual inspection reports it receives and requires
6 the health department to post the results of such
7 periodic audits and inspections online. Next, we're
8 going to vote on Introduction 1138A, sponsored by
9 Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel, and it will
10 require the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene
11 to conduct additional reviews of documentation of
12 water tank inspections without providing prior
13 notice to building owners, where harmful bacteria are
14 found or where certain violations are identified by
15 the health department. This bill would require.
16 This bill would require the department to post the
17 results of these reviews online. Introduction 1050A,
18 sponsored by Council Member Ben Kallos, would allow
19 the health department to require that water tank
20 inspection results be submitted electronically to the
21 department. Introduction 1057B, sponsored by our
22 health committee chair, Mark Levine, would require
23 that water tank inspectors be either licensed master
24 plumbers, work under the direct and continuing
25 supervision of such licensed master plumber, or be a

1
2 registered design professional. This bill would also
3 require that the cleaning, painting, and coating of
4 water tanks be conducted by an individual qualified
5 to conduct water tank inspections or by a person who
6 holds a commercial pesticide applicator
7 certification. Introduction 1167A, sponsored by
8 Council Member Rafael Salamanca, would require
9 building owners to repair damage to water tanks or
10 their supporting structures. It would impose a civil
11 penalty for the failure to do so. And Introduction
12 1169A, sponsored by Council Member Ritchie Torres,
13 would require visual evidence of water tanks, such as
14 photographs or videos, to be submitted with
15 inspection results to the Department of Health and
16 Mental Hygiene. I want to thank the staff who worked
17 on this: Sarah List, Zemanuel Halu, Emily Balkan,
18 and Andre Vasquez. Next, we're going to vote on a
19 series of bills aimed at protecting individuals on
20 probation and incarcerated individuals. Those next
21 bills, these next bills, will provide protections for
22 individuals on probation and folks who are
23 incarcerated. We're at time where we are trying to
24 remove a lot of barriers to people who are on
25 probation or incarcerated and they face a difficult

1
2 time being reintegrated into society, so these bills
3 are a very important step. Introduction 1427,
4 sponsored by a real leader on this is and the chair
5 of our Public Safety Committee, Council Member
6 Donovan Richards, will prohibit the Department of
7 Probation from requiring marijuana testing unless
8 abstinence from marijuana has been determined to be
9 necessary to lead an otherwise law-abiding life.
10 Introduction 944A, sponsored by Council Member Rory
11 Lancman, he is the chair of our Justice Committee.
12 It will ensure the Department of Corrections is
13 properly notifying incarcerated individuals and their
14 attorneys when they are detained solely due to bail
15 set in the amount of less than ten dollars and allow
16 them to post it and get released. And Introduction
17 1199A, sponsored by the chair of our Criminal Justice
18 Committee, Keith Powers, would remove the 2% fee on
19 credit card payments made online and the 8% fee
20 charged on credit card payments when paying in person
21 at correctional facilities and improve access to bail
22 payment for individuals and families of limited
23 financial means. I want to thank the staff who
24 worked on this: Brian Crow, Alana Civen, Keshorn
25 Denny, Daniel Adis, and I want to thank them all for

1
2 their work on this. Finally, the council will vote
3 on a ground-breaking bill which would prohibit drug
4 testing for marijuana as a condition for hiring. It
5 is introduction 1445, sponsored by our Public
6 Advocate, Jumaane Williams, who worked on this when
7 he was a member of this body and it prohibits New
8 York City employers from requiring a prospective
9 employee to be tested for marijuana. Marijuana is
10 now legal in several states and cities across the
11 country. Medical marijuana is legal in our state and
12 recreational marijuana may soon be legal. New York
13 City employers should not disqualify candidates
14 because of their legal use of marijuana prior to
15 their employment. Drug testing for marijuana is
16 imprecise. False positives can occur up to a month
17 after use and do not necessarily indicate that a
18 person is impaired at the moment of testing. For all
19 these reasons I am very happy we are moving this bill
20 today and I support it. I want to thank the staff
21 who worked on this package: Rachel Cordero, Balkes
22 Mirag, Malcolm Buttehorn, and Leah Skirpiak. That
23 concludes our agenda for today's Stated Meeting, and
24 I look forward to proceeding with today's votes.
25 Thank you, Mr. Public Advocate.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. We will now move into discussion of General Orders. First we have Council Member Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Ah, thank you Mr. Public Advocate. With permission, I'd like to vote on all orders on the General Order calendar today.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And Council Member Constantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye. Mr. Public Advocate, with permission I'd like to vote on all items coupled on the general order and resolution calendar today.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And Council Member Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: New York City water is the best in the world straight from the tap and we aim to keep it that way. In school we learned to drink eight glasses of water a day, and as a New

1
2 Yorker it is a point of pride that my eight glasses
3 come straight from the tap. Thanks to ground-
4 breaking reporting by *City and State*, we learned
5 about the lax oversight of water towers throughout
6 our city. This legislative package will reform that
7 oversight, requiring real inspections and regular
8 cleaning. Introduction 1150A requires electronic
9 reporting of these water tower inspections and
10 cleanings so New Yorkers can see for themselves that
11 the water coming out of their tap is clean. Thank
12 you to Speaker Corey Johnson and health chair Mark
13 Levine for getting this done. I urge you to vote aye
14 on 1150A and the entire package so we're going to
15 restore faith in our city's amazing water supply.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I thank you, and just
17 briefly on my bill 1445A I just thank all of the
18 council for putting this up, and I encourage everyone
19 to vote. This is to take away an artificial barrier
20 to employment. This testing isn't a deterrent to
21 using marijuana. It's an impediment to opportunity.
22 A Vox report reported as many as 70% of large
23 employers utilize pre-employment drug screenings
24 encompassing as many as 40% of jobs. If you ingest
25 weed in whatever manner a month ago, I'm not sure how

1
2 that prevents you from doing your job now. Most
3 employers do not test for alcohol and we believe that
4 marijuana should at least be at the same level as
5 alcohol. This should not be confused or conflated
6 with saying that you should be allowed to go to work
7 high or otherwise impaired. This does not do that.
8 You should not be going to work drunk and you should
9 not be going to work high. This does not make any of
10 those things legal or prevent employers from firing
11 them. There are some exemptions I will put here in
12 terms of moving this forward. We always have
13 negotiations. I'd like to revisit some of those as
14 well because I believe no employer should be this
15 because it is not a matter of safety. It has
16 specifically been a barrier for employment. But I
17 thank everyone who worked on this bill and I'm
18 looking forward and hoping everyone will vote aye on
19 it. Now at last we have Council Member Yeger.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
21 President. It's good to see you up there. Welcome
22 again. I realize this hasn't been spoken yet on this
23 floor today. I don't know if these comments will
24 encourage response. They're not intended to, but I
25 feel that I think we should have this conversation in

1
2 public, not in private. When we took our oaths of
3 office, before promising to faithfully execute the
4 duties of council member, we promised to support the
5 Constitution of the United States. That includes our
6 commitment to the right to free speech. Whether one
7 agrees with the speech or disagrees, the right to
8 free speech is fundamental to our democratic society.
9 Like many, and I have spoken about this before in
10 this chamber, I, too, am the child and grandchild of
11 immigrants. And with the background I have never
12 engaged in disparaging immigrants of any kind, from
13 wherever they have come, for whatever reason. It's
14 true I said on Twitter that Palestine does not exist.
15 It's also true that I repeatedly explained that it
16 was never my point or intent to disparage people or
17 the existence of people, notwithstanding the
18 contrary being disingenuously said about me. But
19 what I said remains a fact. Of course there are
20 Palestinian people. But there is no state of
21 Palestine. That's not merely my opinion, though even
22 if it weren't it would still be my right to say so.
23 That's the official position of the United States
24 government. In every administration, from both
25 parties, since the beginning of time. In 15 hearings

1
2 over 15 months, totaling 40 hours on the Immigration
3 Committee, there is not a single statement that
4 anyone can point to where I have ever disparaged any
5 person, ethnicity, or group in any way, nor on the
6 floor of this council, nor on the steps of this
7 building, nor anywhere else. On the contrary, I have
8 defended and advocated for New York's immigrants. My
9 record on that is clear. But facts play no role in
10 this debate. That's because what I said has been
11 used by those who want my statement to be inaccurate,
12 even though it's not. And those whose rhetoric was
13 far more irresponsible than mine have through their
14 own words encouraged threats to my life and to the
15 lives of my staff. Yet, to satisfy some bizarre
16 desire for political correctness run amok we are here
17 today having this conversation. Mr. President, I'll
18 wrap in a moment. I appreciate it. Not everyone
19 agrees with everyone. That's what makes democracy so
20 great. Different views can be aired, ought to be
21 aired. We can have the conversation and we can
22 disagree, we can agree. I respect everyone's right
23 to say what they wish. Even when one member of this
24 body just days ago compared the existence of Israel
25 to a biblical plague. I disagree. But I recognize

1
2 the right to say so. I'm grateful to those who have
3 stood up for free speech over the last few days,
4 today in this chamber, anywhere else they have done
5 so, and I ask that my colleagues think deeply about
6 what this means to...

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member, can I
8 ask...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: ...they might say
10 something which others disagree. Thank you, Mr.
11 President.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Council
13 Member Menchaca?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I
15 would like to speak on this topic that my neighbor is
16 talking about. We're voting on some changes, many
17 changes in the committees, including the Immigration
18 Committee and as chair I have some words to, ah, to
19 speak to here. We're doing this in the light and in
20 the ecosystem of the federal government and what it's
21 doing every day to disempower and marginalize,
22 intimidate, dehumanize our immigrant neighbors. The
23 need for empathy, the need for empathy, the need for
24 empathy has never been more obvious and important.
25 This is especially true when we talk with and to and

1
2 for our immigrant neighbors, and even more so when we
3 legislate on their behalf. We must never forget that
4 many immigrants in our city do not have the power to
5 vote, despite being some of the most engaged
6 civically. I know many colleagues in this chamber
7 who are here because of the incredible put in by our
8 immigrant neighbors. What that means for us is that
9 their representation and us as their representatives
10 is that we must exercise the highest levels of
11 empathy to overcome the ways in which their lives are
12 made invisible. Otherwise, we undermine the trust
13 immigrants have in our government to act on their
14 behalf and our whole city falls. The Palestinian
15 people have lived for decades under brutal
16 occupation. No one denies that this occupation is
17 happening or that it has caused immense human
18 suffering. Nor does anyone deny that the Palestinian
19 people have the same right to self-determination as
20 people all over the world. What people disagree
21 about is how we get there, and that of course is not
22 the purview of this city council. What does matter
23 for this city council is that we have many
24 Palestinian and those of Palestinian descent living
25 in our city and they, like every other immigrant

1
2 group need to know that their council and the
3 Committee on Immigration has and is charged with
4 protecting their rights and their interests. And we
5 recognize at a minimum level that they have that
6 power. And that's why we're referring to them, and
7 that's why referring to them as so-called
8 Palestinians is straightforwardly denying them those
9 interests because that phrase denies them their
10 humanity. Palestinians do exist. Palestine does
11 exist. Along with the denials, it's not innocent
12 geopolitical or geographical assertion. These are
13 phrases historically used to justify violence against
14 Palestinians and other Arab people and encourage
15 people to think that Palestinians are not human.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member, can I
17 ask you to wrap, please.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, I'll
19 finish in my vote. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission,
22 with your permission I'd like to vote on all land use
23 call-ups and coupled items in the general order
24 calendar and all resolutions.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I've got to think about it. Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And I believe this is the final, Council Member Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. With permission, I'd like to vote on all land use call-ups and all items on the, and the resolutions and all items on the general order calendar.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on all, with the exception of land use call-up 362 through 365.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: We're going to call reports on special committees?

UNIDENTIFIED: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Reports of standing committees?

UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on Civil and Human Rights, Introduction 1445A, pre-employment hiring.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
3 general orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
5 Criminal Justice, Introductions 944A and 1199A, bail
6 policy.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
8 general orders.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
10 Health, Introductions 1053A through Introductions
11 1169 A, water tanks.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
13 general orders.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: For the Committee on Land
15 Use, Land Use 356 and Reso 830, historic district.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
17 orders.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Land Use 360 and 361,
19 Parkway Hospital.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
21 modifications and referred to the City Planning
22 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70 B of the Rules of
23 the Council and Section 197 D of the New York City
24 Charter.

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Land Use 362 and Reso 830,
3 through Land Use 365 and Reso 834, Atlantic Avenue
4 rezoning.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
6 orders.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Land Use 367 and Resolution
8 835, and Land Use item 368 and Reso 836, 41 Summit
9 Street.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to be filed
11 pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Land Use 370 and Reso 837
13 through land use 372 and Resolution 839, 103 North 13
14 Street.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
16 orders.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Land Use 381 and Reso 840,
18 East 53rd Street rezoning.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
20 orders.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
22 Public Safety, Introduction 1427, drug testing.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
24 orders.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
3 Rules, Privileges, and Elections, preconsidered
4 Resolution 841, amended rules of the council.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
6 orders.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: General order calendar,
8 Introduction 720, site safety training.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Land Use 316, Reso 842, and
11 LU 361 and Reso 843, Parkway Hospital.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
13 orders.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Resolution appointing
15 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
17 orders, and at this time I am asking for a roll call
18 vote on all of the items on today's general order
19 calendar.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you.

25 Council Member Yeger and I began our journey in the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

New York City Council together last year, and I've always admired his confidence and his conviction, and I consider him to be a friend. But as members of this body, we are representatives of not just our constituents, but of all New Yorkers. Our public utterances should reflect care and concern for all New Yorkers. It takes discretion and a bit of restraint to hold this seat. And it is with a heavy heart that I vote aye on all. Words matter. People matter.

UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel. Ayala.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Borelli. Brannan.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 944, 199, 1427, 1445, and preconsidered Reso 841. Aye on the rest.

UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera. Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy. Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. My
3 constituents, I'd like to speak on Reso 841. My
4 constituents did not elect me to police my colleagues
5 about their opinions on foreign policy. They elected
6 me to represent their interest in the City Council.
7 Foreign policy is just not something we are always
8 going to agree upon. We come from different places,
9 different ethnicities, and different belief symptoms.
10 We are truly a diverse body and that diversity must
11 extend to diversity of thoughts. We are all New
12 Yorkers. We all have strong minds and strong wills.
13 But we must as a body learn to be better at agreeing
14 to disagree and without penalizing the minority
15 opinion. We have a lot of work to do in the next few
16 years. We need to maintain the mutual respect that
17 fosters a free and open exchange so that we can work
18 together for the betterment of all New Yorkers.
19 Finally, I just want to remind my colleagues that
20 social media is a casual setting. It's about impact,
21 not substance, and it's certainly not the best medium
22 for an in-depth conversation about complicated
23 issues. With the that understanding, we should read
24 what we see on Twitter with an informal nature in
25

1
2 which it was intended. With the greatest respect for
3 all, I vote no on 841 and vote aye on the rest.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Diaz.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Mr.
9 Chairman. I'm standing up to vote no on Introduction
10 1427, that's the drug testing not permitted for the
11 Department of Probation. When somebody is put on
12 probation, through the probation that person has to
13 prove that they deserve to be, he or she deserves to
14 be given that, granted that position. So I am voting
15 no on that. I believe that's wrong. I believe I
16 vote no on Resolution 1427. Now we are taking away
17 the right of business and business people to test for
18 drugs of those that they have to employee. So that's
19 wrong. And finally Resolution 841, this City Council
20 keeps taking away people's right to speak. This City
21 Council has to stop. This is nonsense. The First
22 Amendment said that people have the right, the
23 freedom of expression, and when our founding fathers
24 put that in there was to allow people to express
25 themselves. Maybe you, we don't have to like what

1
2 people say. We don't, maybe we hate what people say.
3 Maybe we feel horrified what people say, but we have
4 to stop trying to quiet people down. This body, this
5 body, keeps doing that and this is wrong. You are
6 violating people's First Amendment. Now they did to
7 me, now they did it to Yeger, and they keep doing it
8 to people. That is wrong, that is wrong, and that is
9 wrong. We all have the First Amendment. We don't
10 have to like it, we don't have to eat it, we don't
11 have to prove it, but we have something called the
12 First Amendment, the freedom to expression, and this
13 City Council has to stop that. Everyone, I mean, so
14 people have to like, people don't have to like what I
15 say. People don't have to like what [inaudible]
16 said. But they have to respect my First Amendment.
17 But you keep violating that, violating that,
18 violating that, and they will tell me that there's no
19 power in this house? I'm voting no on Introduction
20 445A, 1427A, and 841A. I'm voting yes on the rest.
21 Thank you very much.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Dromm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal. Eugene. Gibson.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Gjonaj.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you. This has probably been one of the most difficult few days for me, as I struggled with a decision that would impact me and this body. I want to make it clear that I do not agree with Council Member Yeger's comments. I don't get into the debate of factual or opinion. But as elected officials we must strive to present our constituents' interests, especially on controversial issues in a way that seeks to bring people together towards a common solution without needlessly inflaming tensions that will only serve to drive them apart. Unfortunately, my friend's recent comments fail that test. But that is my personal opinion. I don't believe that we should be censoring, or censorship should be a tool that this institution can utilize against a First Amendment right. Or, heck, nothing gets me more wound up and I have very strong personal opinions against the American flag being burned, but we don't take actions against though individuals by stripping them of their

1
2 jobs, by taking their children out of public schools.
3 We allow them to do so under that First Amendment
4 right, one of which I truly have strong opinions
5 against. My background is one of a people that have
6 been persecuted for centuries under occupation, under
7 the strictest form of Communism, where censorship was
8 used as a tool to control people. There's a reason
9 why it's the First Amendment, not the second. And
10 I'll be voting aye with deep reservations as we set
11 protocols moving forward that are going to strip our
12 identity, strip away the ability to speak up on
13 matters that many may not feel comfortable with...

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member, can I
15 ask you to wrap up, please.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: It's a right that
17 makes this country so great... Thank you. It makes
18 this country so great and one that I value. I ask
19 Council Member Yeger to resign to save this body.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member, your
21 time is up.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I'll come on a
23 second time if I can.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I appreciate the leadership and work of my dear friend and colleague, Corey Johnson. He is truly one of the most talented elected officials we've seen in the City of New York for generations. I know he has one of the toughest jobs in the country and I have no doubt there is no one more qualified to govern this body than Speaker Johnson. However, we as council members took an oath to protect and defend the Constitution of the United States, which includes free speech. Therefore, I vote aye on all, with the exception of preconsidered Reso 841.

UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all, with the exception of Resolution 841, which I am abstaining on. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: King.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all, except
3 841. I abstain.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Koo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye on all.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
12 permission to explain my vote.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Today's vote is a
15 difficult one. Whatever we do, I fear we will
16 continue a cycle of polarization that does not help
17 us bring about the city or the world that we want. I
18 do not believe that Council Member Yeger is a bigot.
19 I do not believe he has hate in his heart. When we
20 have disagreed in the past I have generally found him
21 to be respectful and open to thoughtful debate.
22 Moreover, the hideous anti-Semitic threats of
23 violence that he and his staff have received in
24 recent days are truly abominable. I condemn without
25 reservation and I hope the NYPD will pursue

1
2 enforcement aggressively. At the same time, I
3 believe it is critical that the council's Immigration
4 Committee be a place where all New Yorkers feel
5 welcome and do not have to worry that their
6 identities will be questioned or erased. In these
7 troubled times we need to be setting a standard for
8 leadership that does not polarize communities against
9 one another. As a proud Jewish New Yorker, I
10 strongly support Israel's right to exist as a Jewish
11 and democratic state, and I believe it is essential
12 to stand up loud and clear against anti-Semitism on
13 the right, on the left, and in the streets. At the
14 same time, I want Palestinian New Yorkers to know
15 that I deeply value your human rights, your self-
16 determination, and your fundamental worth as human
17 beings, equal to mine and that of my family and my
18 people. We must not construct our identities in ways
19 that existentially pit us against each other, and
20 that's why I will be voting in favor of this
21 resolution. I will continue to work and pray for an
22 entity occupation which I believe is the only path to
23 peace and hopefully someday to reconciliation and
24 mutual understanding. Closer to home, I hope we can
25 find a path away from polarization here in this

1
2 council, one that enables us to disagree with each
3 other, even very sharply, but still in ways that
4 include all New Yorkers and build bridges of
5 understanding here in this chamber and here in our
6 city. That will certainly not happen through battles
7 on Twitter and it won't happen through votes that
8 remove people from committees, either. It will only
9 happen, it will require us to do more across sharp
10 lines of difference to find higher ground. Thank
11 you. I vote aye on all.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on all.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes on

18 everything, except no on 841.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So I vote aye

24 on all, and I want to continue with the statement and
25 pick up where I left off, and reiterate that the work

1
2 that we do here as a council is one like a family and
3 we listen to each other, and I'm really happy that
4 people are speaking out and speaking their voice, and
5 speaking their truth to power. Palestinians do exist
6 and their lives matter and Palestine does exist, and
7 the lives of every immigrant group here living in
8 this city will be heard and if we do not hold
9 ourselves to a standard that condemns dehumanizing
10 rhetoric how can we claim to be standing with
11 immigrants against this country's resurgent white
12 nationalism, where the biases and false beliefs about
13 immigrants that underwrite the federal government's
14 deportation machine that we're seeing every day in
15 reports. Our district offices are getting those
16 reports. That's what's happening today. Less
17 urgently, how can we claim to be a committee, an
18 immigration committee or body that Palestinians can
19 trust to consider their interests fairly if we are
20 willing to accept language that denies them the
21 grounds for having said interests, namely their
22 existence. This chamber creates opportunities for
23 people to exercise their empathy when called upon.
24 And when such appeals do not succeed it is on us, it
25 is on us to do the right thing and reassure

1
2 immigrants in our city that the people who represent
3 their interests might disagree about how to do that,
4 but they will never disagree that they are people
5 with interests to protect. So I respect every
6 member's thoughts and ideas in this chamber and
7 everyone is entitled to their opinions. But I also
8 stand with the BLAC and the Progressive Caucus and
9 the LGBT Caucus and the Women's Caucus that signed a
10 letter denouncing the words of my colleague and to
11 move forward, and so I will be voting aye on all and
12 urge my constituents and my colleagues and everyone
13 in the city to continue to come together and build
14 those bridges of understanding so that we can move
15 forward. There's a lot of work to do here, everyone.
16 Let's do it together. Thank you.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: Perkins.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I want to wish my wife a happy anniversary. I was born for her [laughter] and with that being said, I vote aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: I was born for her.

UNIDENTIFIED: That was good, that was good.

UNIDENTIFIED: Nice, nice.

UNIDENTIFIED: And it's on the record.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I believe that [inaudible] including our city had the responsibility to support the two-stage solution. The other solution that we have on the table that has been discussed for a number of years, a solution that we bring peace to the children of Israel and Palestine.

1
2 I believe that our city should not have a space for
3 any message of hate and with that I vote aye.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Torres. Treyger.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I have known
15 Kalman Yeger for many years and consider him to be a
16 friend. He has a long record of public service on
17 behalf of many communities, and I do not believe that
18 he has hateful intentions. While my colleague may
19 have believed that his tweets were glib or idle, we
20 have heard from many Palestinian New Yorkers about
21 the harm and hurt his comments have caused them and
22 their children. In 2019 we need to understand and
23 appreciate that our words on social media constitute
24 official communications and will be weighed with
25 concomitant gravity. As a proud Jew, as someone

1
2 whose parents fled their home in the Soviet Union
3 because they were persecuted because they were
4 Jewish, as someone whose family suffered for their
5 identity, as someone who knows the struggle of my
6 people to find a homeland, I cannot accept comments
7 that disposes thousands of New Yorkers of their
8 identity. There are those who will attempt to frame
9 today's votes as a litmus test of one's commitment to
10 Israel and the Jewish people. There are those who
11 will view my vote as a betrayal. I reject this
12 binary. It is possible to embrace Israel without
13 negating the identities of Palestinians or
14 denigrating their desire for a homeland. It is
15 possible to advocate for Israel without engaging in
16 rancor or enmity. Indeed, our coalition is
17 strengthened when we exercise empathy and resist
18 extremes. Ultimately, as elected officials, our
19 legacies are defined by our impact, not our
20 intentions. Our words hold weight. The impact of my
21 colleague's ill-considered comments has been clear.
22 I respect the deliberations of the speaker's
23 leadership team and I vote aye.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on all, with the exception of Intro 1427, 1445, and I'm voting no on preconsidered Reso 841. My position on that I've already articulated. I believe in civil liberties. I don't agree with what everybody here says all the time, but I do support your right to say it and I don't like to see anybody's free speech censored in any way. I think that that is not what we're supposed to be about, so I vote no on 841, and aye on all others. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all, but even in today's hearings there are comments probably just offended people, so I ask us to be vigilant in comments that we've just said. I just heard that we're surrounded by white resurgent nationalism. I am not that person. I'm tired of being referred to as someone like that, and that's part of the problem with today. You have to be careful with your words. I would not get myself into that situation. That's the way I was brought up. I agree with what we're doing today. We need to be better responsible with our words because they hurt and we have to be careful. So with that I say aye on all. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Mr. President, may I be excused to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, sir.

Today is election day in Israel. As many as a million Palestinians will cast votes. There have been Palestinian members of the Israeli Parliament in every parliament since the foundation of the modern state of Israel. But in Gaza and the West Bank there are no elections, today or any day. And that's because the leadership of the Palestinian Authority is an authoritarian regimen. The president of the Palestinian Authority is now in the 15th of his five-year term to which he was originally elected. Gaza is controlled by Hamas, which wages nearly daily attacks on the citizens of Israel, kills political opponents, persecutes gays, subjugates women, and terrorizes journalists who dare challenge their authority. But the problem, of course, is Israel, isn't it? Or at least that's what those who challenge my statements would have you believe. When I say there is no Palestinian state I am not denying the existence of Palestinian people. I've said that

1
2 before. I'll say it again. Of course there are
3 Palestinian people. But there is no Palestinian
4 state. I'm not speaking of people who wish to live
5 their lives peacefully and in harmony. Whether in
6 the Middle East or whether here in New York City, or
7 in my home town of Brooklyn. But there is no state.
8 And nothing I say nor any vote we take today will
9 change that fact. The votes are cast. I'm not going
10 to be silenced, and no one who truly cares about
11 democracy should want me or anyone else in this body
12 or any legislature in this nation to be silenced. I
13 will continue speaking up against anti-Semitism
14 wherever I see it, whether it is in Washington, D.C.
15 or New York City, or right here on Broadway. I'll
16 speak up about it. I won't be silenced. I vote aye
17 on all with the exception of Intros 1427, 1425, which
18 I believe are silly government overreach. I vote no
19 on Resolution 841. And I vote aye on all. I
20 include Intro 1199. I want to briefly just say, Mr.
21 President, I support this bill, I signed onto this
22 bill early on. I do believe we could have done
23 better. I don't believe the City of New York or any
24 government should profiteer off bail and I think we
25 should have made it effective immediately, not in six

1
2 and 15 months, and with that I thank you very much,
3 Mr. President, for your indulgence. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Cumbo.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Permission granted.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Happy to see you
9 up there.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thanks for allowing me.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Just wanted to
12 recognize there is an African proverb that says until
13 the story of the hunt is told by the lion the tale of
14 the hunt will always glorify the hunter. And as an
15 African American woman what that essentially means to
16 me is that living in the United States, living in New
17 York City, living Brooklyn, there is always some
18 entity or body for people of color that define who we
19 are, if we're minorities, if we're the majority, if
20 we're immigrants, if we're native, if we have a
21 homeland, if we don't, and it's all about who is
22 identifying who is who and where they are from. And
23 for me as an African American woman, even in New York
24 City I have to navigate my space and my existence
25 when I walk down the street on the sidewalk, when I

1
2 get on the train, when I come to work, if I have to
3 go to a doctor's appointment and every day as my
4 community is being gentrified it's important for
5 communities of color in particular to feel that their
6 existence still exists and if we allow this kind of
7 rhetoric and conversation to happen just like we're
8 seen, communities like Harlem, like Bedford-
9 Stuyvesant, will be no more. People will say that
10 those neighborhoods have been replaced by cutesy
11 pronouns or adjectives, SoHo or BoHo, or HaHo, or all
12 of these different types of names to describe our
13 history and our culture and to erase us. And that's
14 why this is really important to me that we speak up
15 about this particular issue. I represent one of the
16 largest Jewish constituents in New York City in Crown
17 Heights, and I have stood with my Jewish brothers and
18 colleagues and sisters continuously to fight against
19 hate speech, and it's important that we be
20 consistent, that we fight against hate speech, speech
21 that divides us, speech that could ultimately turn us
22 into a police state, where we have to fear air
23 strikes. Everyone is talking about freedom of
24 speech, but we have to be very clear that this
25 freedom of speech could lead us into a city where we

1
2 have air strikes, where people take out their anger
3 and their frustrations with each other through
4 violent means. This is the situation that we're in
5 right now. We're on the heels on people mourning
6 from Christchurch. We're on the heels of people
7 mourning of a shooting that took place in Orlando
8 that have killed over 40-50 in people in prospective
9 shootings. We have to understand that our words have
10 meaning and people are very volatile right now and
11 it's important that we take responsibility as this
12 body. I feel in conclusion that for me I'm proud of
13 this body because we fight every day so that everyone
14 knows they have an existence, they have space, that
15 there's enough resources, enough food, enough
16 education for all of us and that we don't need to
17 fight for each other's existence. God is perfect and
18 he made a perfect world for us all to live here in
19 peace, and that's what I'm working for and I hope my
20 colleagues are working towards that every single day.
21 We have to be inclusive and we cannot support
22 divisive words. I vote aye.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. And council
24 members, if you can stay in the room until the vote
25 is tallied.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: All items on today's general order calendar are adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and 0 abstentions, with the exception of Land Use items 362 through 365 and accompanying resos, which were adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro 944A, which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and 0 abstentions. And Intro 1199A, which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and 0 abstentions. And Intro 1427, which was adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative, 4 negative, and 0 abstentions. And Intro 1444A, which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 3 in the negative, and 0 abstentions. I have a quick correction. So just to recount actually Intro 1445A was adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 4 in the negative, and 0 abstentions. And Reso 841, which was adopted by a vote of 35 in

1
2 the affirmative, 7 in the negative, and 2
3 abstentions.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Introduction and
5 reading of bills.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are being
7 referred to committees, as indicated on today's
8 agenda.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: There are no
10 resolutions on today's agenda, so we will move into
11 general discussion. We will begin with Council
12 Member Gjonaj. Please, if you can be quiet as folks
13 come around.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Gjonaj
15 does not want to speak.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member King.
17 General discussion?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good evening,
19 everyone. I arise today to ask for your support to
20 sign onto an introduction to amend a Local Law 1505
21 and where we're looking to pursue the landlords in
22 the City of New York over the last summers. We've
23 had trying times with the use of New Yorkers using
24 the drug called K2 synthetic marijuana. Communities
25 have been destroyed, families turned upside down, and

1
2 the Reso, and the amendment that I am asking us all
3 to sign on will hold landlords accountable if they
4 are found that their tenants who are retail or
5 selling K2 or manufacturing retail, um, manufacturing
6 K2 as well as giving the community boards
7 notification that they can also revoke the licenses,
8 alcohol licenses and tobacco licenses, of these said
9 stores. I'm asking you to sign because we're looking
10 to save lives, we're looking to save families. More
11 importantly, we're looking to save communities and
12 this K2 drug has flipped so many communities from
13 Brooklyn to the Bronx, north to south, and Queens.
14 So I ask you all please to sign onto Intro 1505
15 today. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member Kallos.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Nascar is more
18 transparent than politics. You can actually see
19 who's paying for the drivers right on the hood of the
20 car. I've introduced legislation number 1504 that
21 would require people to check off their industry when
22 they give money and that would actually get mailed to
23 voters in the form of a pie chart in the voter guide
24 and online. There's a number of people sitting in
25

1
2 this room, including one very special person who got
3 elected without...

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Hold on, Council
5 Member. If folks can be quiet, we're still in
6 session.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please, sit down.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: There's a number
9 of people in this room, including one special person
10 who got elected without taking any money from one
11 specific industry, and so the idea is voters would
12 get this pie chart and if they saw too big a slice
13 from an industry they didn't like, for instance real
14 estate, they might say you know what, that's not
15 somebody I should vote for. Legislation like this
16 has been around for a little bit. Folks signed a
17 petition with whitehouse.gov to require elected
18 officials to wear Nascar jerseys with those who gave
19 them money. Unfortunately, that wasn't
20 constitutional. This is. I hope to have your
21 support.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I don't see any other
23 council members. I'd like to say a few words on the
24 topic of the day, one I don't envy the speaker on
25 today. In considering the actions to take against

1
2 any public official, it is important to account for
3 the totality of both the individual in question and
4 the underlying issue at hand, as well as the
5 intention of their actions. First, I always start
6 off apologizing because I cannot solve the Middle
7 East crisis and I believe that most of my colleagues
8 here cannot as well, although it seems more and more
9 we are asked to try to do so. I do not believe in
10 making his comments, because I know Council Member
11 Yeger very well, that he is a bigot and I don't
12 believe he had the intention of doing harm, and I say
13 that because as well as my Palestinian friends, who
14 often speak up, I do not believe them to be anti-
15 Semitic. But nor had he considered the unintended
16 and far-reaching consequences of his words, which I
17 do believe discounted an entire group of people who
18 felt attacked and exacerbated the rhetoric around
19 which I call the geopolitical conflict that none of
20 us in New York City government is going to solve.
21 What we do have to make sure, though, is that here in
22 New York City, which I believe has the biggest
23 concentration of Jewish and people who support
24 Israel, as well as Palestinians and people who
25 support Palestine, we have to make sure that both of

1
2 them welcomed in this country and in the city. And I
3 am hopeful that his willingness to engage in
4 inclusivity with respect to all, Council Member Yeger
5 can help heal some of the damage that was caused.
6 However, there should be and has to be consequences
7 for any elected leader on this issue that engages and
8 inflames this rhetoric. We have to set a standard
9 and we have to try to stick to it. To the extent
10 that this crisis involves New York City populations
11 we have to be equitable in the discussions. Up until
12 now I don't believe we have been and I think of Marc
13 Lamont Hill, who was by many asked to be fired from
14 CNN from using the words from the river to the sea,
15 and we should listen to the population that was
16 offended at it. But if Mr. Hill, who was paid to
17 opine, was asked to do that, then someone who is paid
18 to represent to everyone should be asked to listen to
19 a population that says saying that Palestine doesn't
20 exist has an effect on them on well. This body that
21 I was a part of last term voted on something that
22 many also thought was free speech and violated the
23 policy of this body. And so in that consistency I
24 support today's action that were done today in terms
25 of accountability and equitability. But I'm hoping

1
2 as we move forward we realize now we're at a
3 precipice and that if we're not careful there will be
4 none of us left to serve on committees or chair
5 committees. So I'm hoping after we've taken the
6 steps which provides equitability and accountability
7 that we rethink how we move forward, not only on this
8 issue, but on all issues, and so I thank you for that
9 time and I hope we all move forward on equity and
10 standing up against anti-Semitism as well as
11 Islamophobia, and all the other isms and phobias that
12 exist. We will now call on the speaker to close
13 today's meeting.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Today's Stated Meeting
15 of April 9, 2019, is hereby adjourned.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 25, 2019