Committee on Economic Development Staff

Alex R. Paulenoff, *Counsel*

Emily Forgione, *Policy Analyst*

Aliya Ali, *Finance Analyst*

Committee on Governmental Operations Staff

Daniel Collins, *Counsel*

Elizabeth Kronk, *Policy Analyst*

Emily Forgione, *Policy Analyst*

Zachary Harris, *Finance Analyst*

Committee on Transportation Staff

James DiGiovanni, *Counsel*

Elliott Lynn, *Counsel*

Rick Arbelo, *Policy Analyst*

Emily Rooney, *Policy Analyst*

John Basile, *Finance Analyst*



# THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Jeff Baker, Legislative Director

# COMMITTEE REPORT OF THE GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS DIVISION & INFRASTRUCTURE DIVISION

Rachel Cordero, Deputy Director for Governmental Affairs

Terzah Nasser, Deputy Director for Infrastructure

### COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

Hon. Fernando Cabrera, Chair

### COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Hon. Paul A. Vallone, Chair

### COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

Hon. Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair

# April 17, 2019

**Int No. 982-2018:** By Council Members Rose, Brannan, Levine, Reynoso, Constantinides, Chin, Richards, Powers, Vallone, Kallos, Adams, Rosenthal, Ayala, Grodenchik, Barron, Gibson, Gjonaj, Maisel, Cornegy, Jr., Rivera, Holden, Koo, The Public Advocate (Mr. Williams), Rodriguez, Dromm, Cabrera, Torres, Lancman, Van Bramer, Cohen, Moya, Koslowitz, Deutsch, Treyger, Perkins, Espinal, Jr., Lander, Ampry-Samuel, Eugene, Levin, Menchaca, King, Miller, Cumbo, Salamanca, Jr., Ulrich

**Title:** A Local Law to amend the New York city charter, in relation to establishing an office of the waterfront

**Charter:** Adds City Charter § 20-f

**Int. No. 1512-2019** By Council Members Vallone and Rodriguez

**Title:** A Local Law to amend the New York city charter and the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to the establishment of a director of ferry operations

**Charter:** Amends City Charter § 2903(c)

Adds City Charter § 2903(c-1)

**Administrative Code:** Amends Administrative Code §§ 19-301 – 19-307

1. **Introduction**

On April 17, 2019, the Committee on Governmental Operations, chaired by Council Member Fernando Cabrera, the Committee on Economic Development, chaired by Council Member Paul Vallone, and the Committee on Transportation, chaired by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez will hold a joint first hearing on two bills: Int. 982-2018, sponsored by Council Member Rose, in relation to establishing an office of the waterfront; and Int. 1512-2019, sponsored by Council Member Vallone, in relation to the establishment of a director of ferry operations. Those expected to testify include representatives of the New York City Economic Development Corporation (“NYCEDC”), the Department of Transportation (“DOT”), the Department of City Planning (“DCP”), and interested members of the public.

1. **Background**

*Waterfront Vision & Enhancement Strategy (“WAVES”)*

New York City has approximately 520 miles of waterfront, a geographic asset that helped make it a major commercial and industrial center. In the decades after World War II, heavy industrial use of the waterfront declined. For example, the Brooklyn Navy Yard went from a major shipbuilding facility employing 70,000 people at its peak in 1945 to employing only 9,000 people when it was decommissioned and sold to the City in 1966.[[1]](#footnote-1) Thereafter, it continued to lose industry and jobs through the 1970s and 80s.[[2]](#footnote-2) In 1992, recognizing that the City should develop a comprehensive plan for the stewardship of its waterfront, left to deteriorate in many areas in the wake of industry loss, DCP issued the *New York City Comprehensive Waterfront Plan*.[[3]](#footnote-3) The plan was the first long-range plan ever developed for the entire shoreline, and put forth a vision for the waterfront as a place to live and play, not merely a place for commerce and industry.[[4]](#footnote-4) It proposed ways to open up the waterfront to the public and encourage its use for other productive purposes, and subsequently, the City opened parks and greenways, built housing, restored natural habitats, and enabled recreational uses.[[5]](#footnote-5) However, problems still remained, such as uneven development, crumbling infrastructure, water contamination in some areas, and continued lack of public access in others.[[6]](#footnote-6) In 2008, the City Council passed Local Law 49 of 2008, which added Section 205 of the City Charter, requiring DCP to publish a comprehensive waterfront plan every ten years.[[7]](#footnote-7) As a result, the City began a citywide, multiagency initiative to create a new, sustainable waterfront plan, called the Waterfront Vision and Enhancement Strategy (“WAVES”).[[8]](#footnote-8)

In March 2011, then-Mayor Bloomberg and former City Council Speaker Quinn announced the results of the WAVES initiative: a two-part action plan consisting of 1) *Vision 2020:* New York City’s Comprehensive Waterfront Plan, a framework for development and stewardship of the waterfront over ten years, and 2) the New York City Waterfront Action Agenda, a three-year plan to implement 130 priority waterfront projects.[[9]](#footnote-9) *Vision 2020* outlined eight goals for the waterfront over ten years:

1. Expand public access to the waterfront and waterways on public and private property for all New Yorkers and visitors alike;
2. Enliven the waterfront with a range of attractive uses integrated with adjacent upland communities;
3. Support economic development activity on the working waterfront;
4. Improve water quality through measures that benefit natural habitat, support public recreation, and enhance waterfront and upland communities;
5. Restore degraded natural waterfronts areas, and protect wetlands and shorefront habitats;
6. Enhance the public experience of the waterways that surround New York – our ‘Blue Network;’
7. Improve governmental regulation, coordination, and oversight of the waterfront and waterways; and
8. Identify and pursue strategies to increase the city’s resilience to climate change and sea level rise.[[10]](#footnote-10)

*Waterfront Management Advisory Board (“WMAB”)*

The Waterfront Management Advisory Board (“WMAB”) is a Charter-mandated entity established to advise on waterfront issues, including the drafting of the comprehensive waterfront plan.[[11]](#footnote-11) Reconstituted by Local Law 96 of 2016 after decades of inconsistent activity, the Board is composed of one member from the Mayor’s Office, the commissioners or chairpersons of the Department of Small Business Services, DCP, Department of Environmental Protection, Department of Parks and Recreation, Department of Housing Preservation and Development, two City Council Members appointed by the Speaker, and nine appointees each from the Mayor and Speaker representing stakeholders from various industries and organizations involved in the waterfront across all five boroughs.[[12]](#footnote-12) The Board is required to meet quarterly and issue an annual report.[[13]](#footnote-13) In September 2018, Mayor Bill de Blasio and Speaker Corey Johnson announced that the newly-constituted WMAB held its first meeting and formally launched the start of the planning process for the next Comprehensive Waterfront Plan, due to be published in 2020.[[14]](#footnote-14)

*Progress of WAVES since 2011*

In 2012, the City released a one-year progress report on the Waterfront Action Agenda, which reported that of 125 projects, 34 had been completed (27 percent), 71 were on schedule (57 percent), 14 were proceeding with delays (11 percent), five were being reconsidered (four percent), and one was not yet started (one percent).[[15]](#footnote-15) Completed projects included completion of the Coney Island Ferry Study to determine feasibility of ferry service to Coney Island, establishing an In-Water Permitting Task Force to focus on developing permitting guidance documents, and other resources and training for those seeking permits, rehabilitating the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal to receive ships and barges, and completing the Sherman Creek Waterfront Esplanade Master Plan to revitalize the Harlem River waterfront in Inwood.[[16]](#footnote-16) The City has not released a progress report since 2012, but projects have continued.

The City recently launched several initiatives that advance the goals of WAVES. In October 2018, to expand public access to the waterfront, the City announced that it was investing over $250 million to add 15 acres of greenway to areas in Manhattan that currently have gaps in waterfront access, and thereby create a continuous, accessible greenway around the entire perimeter of Manhattan.[[17]](#footnote-17) One of the gaps is in Inwood along the Harlem River, and, as part of the Inwood neighborhood rezoning plan, NYCEDC and NYC Parks Department released a Request for Proposals (“RFP”) to design two new waterfront parks in that area in February 2019.[[18]](#footnote-18) Other gaps in the greenway are along the East River above 59th Street, and in February 2019, NYC Parks announced $75 million in Mayoral funding for three East River Esplanade reconstruction projects: East Harlem between 114th and 117th Streets, Upper East Side between 90th and 94th Streets, and Midtown East between 62nd and 63rd Streets.[[19]](#footnote-19) In July 2018, to support economic development activity on the working waterfront, which includes improving regional freight movement, Mayor de Blasio and NYCEDC launched Freight NYC, a $100 million plan to modernize New York City’s freight system and shift a significant portion of freight movement from trucking to maritime and rail distribution over ten years.[[20]](#footnote-20) Part of the Freight NYC plan rests on utilizing the City’s waterways for increased barge shipping, and in September, NYCEDC and the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey announced the creation of the North Atlantic Marine Highway Alliance, an advisory body of public and private partners that will help develop a regional barge network, including the Hunts Point and South Brooklyn Marine Terminal barge terminals.[[21]](#footnote-21) Additionally, in March 2019, to identify and pursue strategies to increase the city’s resilience to climate change and sea level rise, Mayor de Blasio announced a $10 billion plan to extend lower Manhattan into the East River,[[22]](#footnote-22) one of the recommendations of the Lower Manhattan Climate Resilience Study.[[23]](#footnote-23)

*NYCEDC’s Waterfront Navigator*

One of the recurring issues for the city’s waterfront has been the sheer number of federal, state, and city agencies involved in the management and operations of various waterfront responsibilities. Most waterfront projects require the approval of one or more of the following agencies: U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, New York State Department of State, New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, and/or the City’s DCP. Others require additional approvals from New York City Small Business Services, New York City Department of Buildings, New York State Office of General Services, and more.[[24]](#footnote-24) *Vision 2020* called for establishing a permitting liaison and a coordinated process, or “one-stop shop,” for obtaining waterfront permits.[[25]](#footnote-25) A City Council Waterfronts Committee hearing in November 2014 also highlighted the need for this type of permitting tool.[[26]](#footnote-26) In 2016, to address this concern and establish a one-stop shop, NYCEDC established the Waterfront Navigator: NYC’s One Stop Waterfront Permit Planner for businesses and real estate developers looking to streamline the process of obtaining waterfront work permits.[[27]](#footnote-27) Funded by a grant from the Empire State Development Corporation and developed in partnership with the major agencies involved in waterfront permitting (listed above), the tool provides a central repository for information and guidance on the jurisdictions of various agencies and how to obtain permits from each of them.[[28]](#footnote-28) NYCEDC has been successful in its implementation thus far.

While NYCEDC’s Waterfront Navigator tool provides one solution for businesses seeking to streamline operations on the waterfront, overall management of the waterfront remains decentralized, and issues remain for ports and barge operations, environmental conservation, and city resident interaction in and around the waterfront areas. Advocates have called for a single entity to oversee waterfront governance and management, including managing and implementing the comprehensive waterfront plan and other coastal resiliency plans, working with the Waterfront Management Advisory Board, serving as an advocate for the waterfront in city government, and other functions.[[29]](#footnote-29)

1. NYC Ferry

In 2015, Mayor de Blasio announced plans to create a citywide ferry system with fares equivalent to those charged to ride the city’s subways and buses. NYCEDC was tasked with developing and managing the new ferry system due to its experience operating the former East River Ferry which operated as a pilot program beginning in 2011.[[30]](#footnote-30)

Since 2017, NYCEDC has expanded ferry operations into twenty landings on six service routes servicing four of the five boroughs as well as summer weekend service to Governor’s Island.[[31]](#footnote-31) An additional route is planned to launch in 2020 from Midtown West to St. George on the north shore of Staten Island, and another route from Wall Street to Coney Island is expected to launch in 2021.[[32]](#footnote-32)

As a practical matter, NYCEDC currently delegates the operation of NYC Ferry to Hornblower Cruises, a private entity awarded a six-year options contract in 2017.[[33]](#footnote-33) Through that contract the City retains the option to purchase the ferries from Hornblower Cruises for municipal operation and management at the expiration of the contract in 2023.[[34]](#footnote-34) In March 2019, New York City Comptroller Scott Stringer returned the contract to NYCEDC in its attempt to purchase Hornblower’s fleet of boats, citing concerns with the integrity of the ferry operator selection process.[[35]](#footnote-35) Aside from the specific concerns over the purchasing of vessels, NYC Ferry has come under general criticism for its cost relative to the number of riders it serves. The Citizens Budget Commission released a report in March 2019 examining the high costs of the ferry system (ferry rides are subsidized at $10.73 per ride, ten times higher than subway or bus rides), and questioning whether the cost was the most effective use of the City’s transportation money.[[36]](#footnote-36) The New York City Comptroller went so far as to call for the Department of Transportation to take over the ferry system to rein in costs.[[37]](#footnote-37)

1. **Legislative analysis of Int. 982-2018**

Int. No. 982-2018 (Rose) would amend the New York City Charter to establish an Office of the Waterfront, as a separate office or to be housed within any other office of the Mayor or within any department headed by a mayoral appointee. “Waterfront” is defined to mean the geographical area adjacent to a body of water at least 800 feet landward from the shoreline.

The Office of the Waterfront would be led by a director to be appointed either by the Mayor or by the head of the department in which the Office is housed. The Office’s director would serve as an advocate for the waterfront within City government. In addition to any other relevant duties the Mayor may assign, the director would have the power to coordinate and collaborate with City agencies responsible for matters, such as issuing permits or distributing information, related to “waterfront use,” defined as an activity on the waterfront that requires direct access or proximity to the water, or an activity whose location on the waterfront would add to public use and enjoyment of the water.

The waterfront director would serve as the primary point of contact for all applicants regarding waterfront use and assist applicants in filing applications. The director would also liaise with state and federal agencies involved in the waterfront permitting process, and provide applicants with information on federal and state permitting requirements.

The Waterfront director would manage and implement the City’s comprehensive waterfront plan. The waterfront director would assist the Waterfront Management Advisory Board. Finally, the waterfront director would annually prepare and post online a report on the activities undertaken in fulfillment of the Office of the Waterfront’s duties, as well as on issues affecting use of the waterfronts and recommendations for addressing such issues.

Int. No. 982 takes effect 60 days after it becomes law.

1. **Legislative analysis of Int. 1512-2019**

Int. No. 1512-2019 would establish a Director of Ferry Operations within the Department of Transportation. The director would be responsible for, among other things, the operation and maintenance of existing ferries; ferry route development and evaluation; identification and assessment of potential sites for expansion of ferry service; and public outreach and community engagement. The Commissioner of Transportation would retain authority over the Staten Island Ferry and any other marine operations not delegated to the Director of Ferry Operations.

Int. No. 982

By Council Members Rose, Brannan, Levine, Reynoso, Constantinides, Chin, Richards, Powers, Vallone, Kallos, Adams, Rosenthal, Ayala, Grodenchik, Barron, Gibson, Gjonaj, Maisel, Cornegy, Rivera, Holden, Koo, the Public Advocate (Mr. Williams), Rodriguez, Dromm, Cabrera, Torres, Lancman, Van Bramer, Cohen, Moya, Koslowitz, Deutsch, Treyger, Perkins, Espinal, Lander, Ampry-Samuel, Eugene, Levin, Menchaca, King, Miller, Cumbo, Salamanca and Ulrich

..Title

A Local Law to amend the New York city charter, in relation to establishing an office of the waterfront

..Body

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Chapter one of the New York city charter is amended by adding a new section 20-f to read as follows:

§ 20-f. Office of the Waterfront. a. Definitions. As used in this section, the following terms have the following meanings:

Applicant. The term “applicant” means a person seeking to engage in a waterfront use that requires a permit from any federal, state or local agency.

Body of water. The term “body of water” means any ocean, estuary, harbor, river, tidal strait, bay, basin, cove, stream, pond or lake sharing a boundary with any part of the city of New York.

Director. The term “director” means the director of the office of the waterfront.

Waterfront. The term “waterfront” means the geographical area adjacent to a body of water at least 800 feet landward from the shoreline.

Waterfront use. The term “waterfront use” means an activity on the waterfront that requires direct access or proximity to the water in order to function; or an activity with a primarily recreational, cultural or retail function whose location on the waterfront would add to public use and enjoyment of the water’s edge.

b. The mayor shall establish an office of the waterfront. Such office may be established as a separate office or within any other office of the mayor or within any department the head of which is appointed by the mayor. Such office shall be headed by a director who shall be appointed by the mayor or by the head of such office or department.

c. Powers and duties. The director shall have the power and duty to:

1. Coordinate and collaborate with city agencies responsible for matters related to waterfront use, including, but not limited to, issuing permits and disseminating information about the waterfront to the public;

2. Liaise with state and federal agencies involved in the waterfront permitting process and provide applicants with information on federal and state permitting requirements;

3. Serve as the primary point of contact for all applicants regarding waterfront use and assist applicants in filing applications;

4. Serve as an advocate for the waterfront within city government;

5. Manage and implement the New York city comprehensive waterfront plan published pursuant to section 205;

6. Assist the waterfront management advisory board established pursuant to section 1303 in the implementation of the duties and responsibilities of such advisory board; and

7. Perform other relevant duties as the mayor may assign.

d. Report. Within 18 months of the effective date of the local law that added this section, and annually thereafter, the director shall prepare and post on the city’s website and submit to the mayor and the speaker of the council a report that shall include, but not be limited to, the activities undertaken in fulfillment of the duties specified in subdivision c of this section, issues affecting commercial, recreational or other use of the waterfronts and recommendations for addressing such issues.

§ 2. This local law takes effect 60 days after it becomes law, except that the mayor may take any steps as are necessary for the implementation of this local law before such date.

AS

LS # 6235

5/16/18

Int. No. 1512

By Council Members Vallone and Rodriguez

..Title

A Local Law to amend the New York city charter and the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to the establishment of a director of ferry operations

..Body

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Subdivision c of section 2903 of chapter 71 of the New York city charter is amended to read as follows:

c. Ferries and related facilities. The commissioner shall appoint a director of ferry operations. Such director shall:

(1) maintain and operate the ferries of the city, including such ferry services established pursuant to an agreement between the city and a contracted entity as such term is defined in section 22-821 of the administrative code;

(2) be responsible for constructing, acquiring, operating, maintaining or controlling all ferry boats, ferry houses, ferry terminals and equipment thereof and all wharf property and marginal roads adjacent to such wharves, ferry houses and terminals necessary for the operation of the ferries and related facilities, including parking sites; any ferry and any other such property, including but not limited to, all or part of such wharf property, may be leased in the same manner as other wharf property, provided, however, that from and after the sixtieth day next succeeding the date on which the provisions of this paragraph as hereby amended take effect, no substantial or general change in the level of services furnished upon any such ferry facility under the jurisdiction of the director [commissioner] shall be instituted, allowed or continued except upon not less than thirty days notice to the city planning commission and the council. Provided, further that notice of such change shall be conspicuously posted in a public place at each ferry house and terminal for a continuous period of at least thirty days in advance of any such change taking effect and in addition, such notice shall further be published at least once during such thirty day period in a daily newspaper of general circulation in the city;

(3) have [charge and control of all marine operations within the city and] the power to regulate public and private ferry operations originating or terminating within the city, including evaluation of existing ferry sites and development of sites for expansion of ferry service;

(4) establish tours of ferry facilities and their related operations as well as tours of the New York harbor at fees to be established in coordination with [by] the commissioner, together with the authority to publicize and advertise the same;

(5) issue permits for the control of television and photography activities within or upon ferries and related facilities; and

(6) construct, operate and maintain marinas and public boat launching ramps and related facilities of ferry property and collect fees for the use thereof; such fees to be deposited in a special fund for the continued maintenance, operation or reconstruction of public marine facilities.

§ 2. Section 2903 of the New York city charter is amended by adding a new subdivision c-1 to read as follows:

c-1. Marine operations.

The commissioner shall have charge and control of all marine operations within the city not reserved to the director of ferry operations.

§ 3. Chapter 3 of title 19 of the administrative code of the city of New York is amended to read as follows:

 Chapter 3

Ferry Operations [Ferries].

§ 19-301. Ferry property; acquisition.

The director of ferry operations [commissioner] may acquire by purchase, condemnation or otherwise as provided in section 22-105 of the code, the title to such wharf property and uplands within the city, as he or she shall deem necessary for the equipment, maintenance or operation of a ferry, the terminal facilities therefor and the approaches thereto, whether or not such wharf property or uplands have previously been taken for a public use.

§ 19-302. Ferry property; provisions in leases.

Leases of any ferry or any wharf property necessary for the use of a ferry may provide for the character of transportation service to be furnished by the lessee including the character and speed of the boats to be used, frequency of trips, rates of fare and commutation and freight charges, and may provide for forfeiture of the lease in the event of failure to comply with its provisions in relation thereto.

§ 19-303. Ferry fares to be paid over daily.

The director of ferry operations [commissioner] shall pay over daily to the commissioner of finance all moneys collected for ferry fares.

§ 4. Title 19 of the administrative code of the city of New York is amended by adding a new chapter 3-A to read as follows:

Chapter 3-A

Staten Island Ferry Service; Marine Operations

§ 5. Sections 19-304, 19-305, 19-306 and 19-307 of title 19 of the administrative code of the city of New York are moved to chapter 3-A added by this local law.

§ 6. Subdivision a of section 19-304 of chapter 3-A of title 19 of the administrative code of the city of New York is amended to read as follows:

a. There shall be no rate of ferriage charged for foot passengers by any city owned and operated ferry operating between the borough of Manhattan and the borough of Staten Island, unless such ferry service is administered by the director of ferry operations.

§ 3. This local law takes effect 120 days after it becomes law.

ARP

LS # 7827

4/2/19 1:

1. *See* Brooklyn Navy Yard, History of the Yard, *available at* <https://brooklynnavyyard.org/about/history>. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. *Ibid.* [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. *Vision 2020:* New York City Comprehensive Waterfront Plan, NYC Mayor’s Office & Department of City Planning, March 2011, at 6, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/planning/download/pdf/plans-studies/vision-2020-cwp/vision2020/chapter1.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. *Ibid.* [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. *Ibid.* [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. *Ibid.* [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Local Law 49 of 2008; New York City Charter § 205. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. *See* Press Release, NYCEDC, Mayor Bloomberg and Speaker Quinn Launch NYC Waterfront Vision and Enhancement Strategy (Waves) – A Blueprint For New York City’s 578 Miles of Waterfront (April 13, 2010) *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/press-release/mayor-bloomberg-and-speaker-quinn-launch-nyc-waterfront-vision-and-enhancement>. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. *See* Press Release, NYCEDC, Mayor Bloomberg and Speaker Quinn Unveil Comprehensive Plan for Waterfront and Waterways (March 12, 2011) *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/press-release/mayor-bloomberg-and-speaker-quinn-unveil-comprehensive-plan-waterfront-and-waterways>. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *Vision 2020, supra* note 3, at 7. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. New York City Charter § 1303. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Local Law 96 of 2016. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. *Ibid.* [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. *See* Press Release, NYC Mayor’s Office, De Blasio Administration And City Council Convene Waterfront Management Advisory Board (September 20, 2018) *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/479-18/de-blasio-administration-city-council-convene-waterfront-management-advisory-board>. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Waterfront Action Agenda: One-Year Progress Report, New York City Economic Development Corporation, May 2012, *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/sites/default/files/filemanager/Projects/WAVES/Waves_2012.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. *Ibid.* [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. *See* Manhattan Waterfront Greenway: A Vision for Closing the Loop, NYCEDC, NYC Mayor’s Office, DOT, and Department of Parks and Recreation, October 2018, *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/sites/default/files/filemanager/MWG/ManhattanGreenway_book.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. *See* Press Release, NYCEDC, NYCEDC and NYC Parks Release Public Proposal to Design Two New Waterfront Parks Along Harlem River (February 11, 2019) *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/press-release/nycedc-and-nyc-parks-release-public-proposal-design-two-new-waterfront-parks-along>. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. *See* Press Release, NYC Parks, NYC Parks Announces $75 Million in Mayoral Funding for Ongoing Reconstruction of East River Esplanade Projects (February 21, 2019), *available at* <https://www.nycgovparks.org/news/press-releases?id=21640>. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. *See* Freight NYC: Goods for the Good of the City, NYCEDC, July 2018, *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/sites/default/files/filemanager/Programs/FreightNYC_book__DIGITAL.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. *See* Press Releases, NYCEDC, Port Authority and NYCEDC To Create Advisory Group To Implement A Regional Barge Network” (September 28, 2018), *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/press-release/port-authority-and-nycedc-create-advisory-group-implement-regional-barge-network>. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. *See* Amy Plitt and Caroline Splvack, “De Blasio unveils $10B resiliency plan to extend lower Manhattan into East River,” *Cubred New York*, March 14, 2019, *available at* <https://ny.curbed.com/2019/3/14/18265630/de-blasio-10-billion-plan-expand-lower-manhattan-east-river>. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. Lower Manhattan Climate Resiliency Study, NYCEDC and the Mayor’s Office of Recovery and Resiliency, March 2019, *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/sites/default/files/filemanager/Projects/LMCR/Final_Image/Lower_Manhattan_Climate_Resilience_March_2019.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. *See* NYCEDC, “Waterfront Navigator” (Sep 2016) *available at* <https://www.nycedc.com/project/waterfront-navigator>. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. *See Vision 2020, supra,* note 3, at 102. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. *See*  N.Y.C. Council Committee on Waterfronts “Oversight - One-Stop Permitting for Waterfront Projects” (Nov 12, 2014) *available at* <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=1990834&GUID=C88489F4-24AD-49E7-A338-A8CF6CE5731A&Options=&Search=)>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. *See* [*supra*](file:///%5C%5Cnycc-fs%5Cgov%5CEconomic%20Development%5C2018-2021%20Session%5C3-17-19%20%28Waterfronts%29%5Csupra)*,* note 24. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. *See id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. *See* Retooling Waterfront Governance in the New York-New Jersey Harbor, Waterfront Alliance, April 2013, *available at* <https://waterfrontalliance.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/Waterfront_Platform_Leadership_04_2013.pdf>; *see also* Unlocking the potential of NYC’s waterfront: A progressive roadmap for the Sixth Borough, Portside New York, *available at* [https://static1.squarespace.com/static/50dcbaa5e4b00220dc74e81f/t/584f58f437c581235a98d50f/1481595126003/PortSide+NewYork+Waterfront+Policy+Recommendations+150330.pdf](https://static1.squarespace.com/static/50dcbaa5e4b00220dc74e81f/t/584f58f437c581235a98d50f/1481595126003/PortSide%2BNewYork%2BWaterfront%2BPolicy%2BRecommendations%2B150330.pdf) [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. *See* N.Y.C. Economic Development Corporation, “East River Ferry Service,” <http://www.nycedc.com/project/east-river-ferry-service> (last accessed Apr. 10, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. *See* NYC Ferry, “Routes and Schedules,” <https://www.ferry.nyc/routes-and-schedules/> (last accessed Mar. 27, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. *See id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. *See* Josh Dawsey and Andrew Tangel, “New York City Announces a Subsidized Ferry Contract,” The Wall Street Journal (March 16, 2016) *available at* <https://www.wsj.com/articles/new-york-city-announces-a-subsidized-ferry-contract-1458175300>. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. *See* Katie Honan, Nikhita Venugopal and Jeff Mays, “Hornblower to Operate Citywide Ferry Service Launching in 2017, Mayor Says” DnaInfo (March 16, 2016) *available at* <https://www.dnainfo.com/new-york/20160316/rockaway-park/hornblower-operate-five-borough-ferry-service-mayor-says/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. *See* Nolan Hicks, “Comptroller blocks de Blasio’s $84.5M East River ferry buyout” NY Post (March 20, 2019) *available at* <https://nypost.com/2019/03/20/comptroller-blocks-de-blasios-84-5m-east-river-ferry-buyout/>. *See also* Rosa Goldensohn, “Stringer Fires Another Torpedo At EDC’s Embattled Ships” The City (April 9, 2019) *available at* [https://thecity.nyc/2019/04/nyc-comptroller-scott-stringer-fires-back-at-edc-ferries.html](https://thecity.nyc/2019/04/nyc-comptroller-scott-stringer-fires-back-at-edc-ferries.html?utm_campaign=mailchimp&utm_source=daily&utm_medium=newsletter). [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. *See* Swimming in Subsidies: The High Cost of NYC Ferry, Citizens Budget Commission, March 2019, *available at* <https://cbcny.org/sites/default/files/media/files/REPORT_NYCFERRY_03282019_1.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. *See* Nolan Hicks, “Scott Stringer demands DOT take over city’s ferry system” NY Post (April 3, 2019) *available at* <https://nypost.com/2019/04/03/scott-stringer-demands-dot-take-over-citys-ferry-system>. [↑](#footnote-ref-37)