

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON AGING JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

DECEMBER 5, 2018  
Start: 10:17 A.M.  
Recess: 1:32 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: MARGARET S. CHIN, CHAIR ON AGING

COUNCIL MEMBERS: DIANA AYALA  
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH  
RUBEN DIAZ, SR.  
DANIEL DROMM  
MATHIEU EUGENE  
DEBORAH L. ROSE  
MARK TREYGER  
PAUL A. VALLONE  
ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL, CHAIR ON  
PUBLIC HOUSING  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
MARK GJONAJ  
CARLOS MENCHACA  
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS  
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.  
RITCHIE J. TORRES  
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

LATISHA MILLER NATHEA (SP?), Senior  
Housing Director of Residential Services  
at SAGE

GREGORY MORRIS, From the Stanley Isaac  
Neighborhood Center

LILLIAN WOO, Director Hamilton Madison  
House Senior Center Program

PAKHI KANE, Deputy Executive Director of  
the Stanley M. Isaacs Neighborhood Center

DAVID PRISTIN, Executive Vice-President  
for External Affairs at NYCHA

CARYN RESNICK, Acting Commissioner at the  
New York City Department for the Aging

UKA BUSKIS (SP?), Senior Director for  
NYCHA Family Partnership Department

CAROLYN JASPER, Vice-President of  
Operations with New York Housing  
Authority

KAREN TAYLOR, Assistant Commissioner  
Bureau of Community Services at DFTA

DEBORAH GODDARD, Executive Vice-President  
for Capital Project

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

LOIS GREEN, Brownsville Senior Center  
Brooklyn, New York

BEATRICE HALEY, Harlem River

EMILY BATISTA, resides at Brosnick Houses

BETTY MENA

KATELYN HOOSIE (SP?), Live On New York

TARA KLINE, Policy Analyst with United  
Neighborhood Houses

ALEXANDER RILEY, Director of the Elder  
Law Practice for Legal Aid

MYER WAXMAN, Managing Director of Senior  
Center at Self-Help Community Services

MICHAEL HIGGINS, JR., Gowanus  
Neighborhood Coalition for Justice

3 SARGEANT AT ARMS: This is a sound check  
4 for the Committees, joint Committee hearing of Aging  
5 and Public Housing being recorded by Israel Martinez  
6 and McKinley Joseph but you will only hear that one  
7 if you are speaking from there. Go back. The date  
8 is December 6<sup>th</sup>, 5<sup>th</sup>, 2018. This hearing is scheduled  
9 for 10:00.

10 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Good morning, I'm  
11 Council Member Margaret Chin, Chair of the Committee  
12 on Aging and thank you for joining us today for a  
13 joint oversight hearing with the Committee on Public  
14 Housing, on Senior Services and Centers in New York  
15 City Housing Authority also known as NYCHA. I want  
16 to thank Chair Alicka Ampry-Samuel for co-Chairing  
17 this hearing today. Research shows that our City's  
18 older adult population is increasing rapidly. New  
19 York City's older adult population increased from  
20 950,000 in 2005 to more than 1.1 million today.  
21 Representing about 13% of New York City's total  
22 population. With the growing number of seniors in  
23 our City it is vital that we provide the necessary  
24 resources and services to help them safely age in  
25 place. While older adults lived in various places  
throughout the City, many of them live in NYCHA

1  
2 Housing Developments. In fact, about 20% of NYCHA  
3 residents are 62 or older. There are many services  
4 available to seniors in NYCHA provided largely  
5 through NYCHA collaboration with the Department for  
6 the Aging (DIFTA). For example, Senior Center and  
7 Social Clubs uhm, there is 249 Senior Centers, 74 of  
8 them are in NYCHA. There are also 14 social clubs in  
9 NYCHA which offer smaller programs than general  
10 Senior Centers. Both Senior Centers and Social Clubs  
11 offer older adults the opportunity to participate in  
12 events such as health promotion and cultural  
13 activities. Unlike the majority of social clubs;  
14 however, Senior Centers provide congregate meals as  
15 more robust programming. Both are an important way  
16 to address senior isolation by giving older adults a  
17 place to socialize with each other. Additionally,  
18 there are naturally occurring retirement communities  
19 or NORC in 11 NYCHA developments. NORCs provide  
20 supportive services to many older adults aging in  
21 place including case management, healthcare  
22 assistance, information and referral services and  
23 financial management. Despite the collaboration by  
24 DFTA and NYCHA to serve our City's aging population  
25 seniors in NYCHA Housing, Senior Center, NORCs and

1  
2 Senior Social Club have faced and continue facing a  
3 variety of severe conditions that these Agencies have  
4 failed to address. We have heard about NYCHA Senior  
5 Residents who live in apartments with leak, mold and  
6 pests. Many of them live in high-rise buildings in  
7 which elevators have been broken for extensive period  
8 of time. When some of these residents, there are  
9 Senior Centers in their development, they are exposed  
10 to dangerous conditions including moldy ceiling,  
11 peeling paint and sometimes even rats crawling out of  
12 homes. Some of these Centers even lack heat during  
13 the freezing cold winter months and air conditioning  
14 during the scorching hot summer. Many of these  
15 Senior Centers are not even wheelchair accessible.  
16 This is not just unbelievable, it is unacceptable.  
17 While these conditions are concerning, what I find  
18 more alarming is the ineffectiveness interagency  
19 coordination between NYCHA and DFTA when it comes to  
20 addressing such conditions. According to a 2017  
21 audit report by controller Scott Stringer, some NYCHA  
22 Senior Center providers have indicated that it often  
23 takes months and sometimes even years before NYCHA  
24 makes repairs in their facilities. One Senior Center  
25 reported that it has had the same broken window for

1  
2 five years despite submitting multiple repair tickets  
3 to NYCHA. Who is helping our seniors stay safe in  
4 the Senior Center and Social Club? At an October  
5 2017 Council Aging Committee Oversight Hearing on  
6 Senior Center repairs and upgrades DFTA testified  
7 that NYCHA is responsible for addressing repairs and  
8 maintenance to the facilities, envelope and building  
9 system, including roof leaks, sewage backup and  
10 hidden issues. The Senior Center providers; however,  
11 is responsible for repairs inside of the program  
12 space in Senior Centers. The Administration also  
13 testified that Senior Center providers submit tickets  
14 to NYCHA for repair work and that both Agencies work  
15 closely together to complete repairs. Well, if these  
16 Agencies are working together so slowly then why are  
17 there so many Senior Centers that have had the same  
18 deficiencies for months and even years. I want to  
19 know what is preventing such repairs from getting  
20 resolved in a timely fashion. Further, I understand  
21 that DFTA is transitioning away from serving as a  
22 direct service provider, transitioning to becoming a  
23 service coordinator. NYCHA has as a result created  
24 the geographical zones that allow residents to  
25 receive access to services offered by community-based

1  
2 organization in their neighborhood. However, this  
3 creates a burden on seniors who might not be able,  
4 who might be mobile and who might not be able to get  
5 where ever their zone office is located. Seniors  
6 should get the help that they need where they live  
7 and not be referred somewhere else. I hope to hear  
8 more about NYCHA Zone Models and its impact on senior  
9 living in NORCs. NYCHA and DFTAs lack of urgency on  
10 the living conditions on seniors is not only causing  
11 many of them stress but is also hazardous to their  
12 health. At this hearing, I hope to hear more from  
13 the Agencies about how they plan to improve their  
14 coordination in order to help improve the lives of  
15 NYCHA senior residents. I would like to thank the  
16 Committee Staff for helping in putting together this  
17 hearing. Our Council Nusak Chadori (SP?), our Policy  
18 Analyst Kaleema Johnson (SP?) and Finance Analysis  
19 Daniel Koo and I would like to thank the other  
20 members of the Aging Committee who have joined us  
21 here today and we have joined by Council Member Dromm  
22 and Council Member Rose. Uhm now I would like to  
23 turn the floor over to my uhm co-Chair Council Member  
24 Ampry-Samuel for some opening remarks. Thank you.

1  
2 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Good morning  
3 and thank you Council Member Chin and thank you all  
4 for coming to today's joint hearing on the Committee  
5 on Aging and the Committee on Public Housing. I am  
6 Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel and I Chair the  
7 Public Housing Committee. Today, we will have the  
8 opportunity to discuss Senior Services and Centers  
9 throughout NYCHA developments. Seniors are a core  
10 part of our City and a major part of the NYCHA  
11 community. One in five NYCHA residents are seniors  
12 and almost 40% of NYCHA households are headed by age  
13 62 and older. In my District alone, I am proud to  
14 represent the seniors who I see in the audience, are  
15 a lot from my District just this morning for Van Dyke  
16 II, Brown, Reed Houses, Marcus Garvey, King Borough  
17 Extension, Saratoga Square which are all senior only  
18 buildings and I visit the seniors often at 11 Senior  
19 Centers and Senior Clubs in my District at Van Dyke  
20 II, Brown, Reed, Marcus Garvey, Kings Borough, Seth  
21 Low, Langston Hughes, Brownsville, Tilden, Saratoga  
22 and Bre Voy (SP?) and that list does not include the  
23 six other senior only housing buildings in my  
24 District that are not on NYCHA grounds and are not  
25 contracted with DFTA and one we were recently about

1  
2 secure NORC funding for. Because older adults have  
3 unique needs, it is clear that NYCHA and DFTA must  
4 work together to allow seniors to live with the  
5 dignity they deserve but how, NYCHA and DFTA work  
6 together is unfortunately today not so clear.  
7 Community advocates have told us that Senior Centers,  
8 Social Clubs, NORCs are not immune from the  
9 overarching issues that plague NYCHA, namely  
10 disorganization and disrepair. Residents who utilize  
11 the Senior Centers have complained of roaches, leaks,  
12 mold, inadequate heating in the winter, inadequate  
13 cooling in the summer and a host of other issues.  
14 Worse instilled in the presence of some problems is  
15 the failure to address them. Just this past summer,  
16 Bre Voy (SP?) Social Club and Tilden Senior Center  
17 were without working ACs and the cost to repair Bre  
18 Voy (SP?) was only \$1,500 and Tilden had to close on  
19 some days although it is listed as a cooling center.  
20 It defies reason that it should take NYCHA years to  
21 complete basic repairs but that is what was reported  
22 in the Controller's 2017 Audit of Senior Centers.  
23 What we need to hear from NYCHA and DFTA today is  
24 exactly how responsibilities are divided to ensure  
25 that repairs are completed in a timely fashion and

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

how communication occurs between the Agencies?  
Seniors need more than the left hand not knowing what  
the right hand is doing and they definitely need more  
than neither hand performing at 100% at times.  
Additionally, the Committees would like to hear more  
from the Agencies about how fines are apportioned  
when there is an issue or a violation of a building  
code. Advocates have spoken out about community-  
based organizations being forced to raise money to  
pay for fines. I visited a Senior Center that had a  
fine of \$5,000 and was forced to hold fundraisers and  
bake sales to pay for debt caused by issues that they  
had no control over. It does not make sense for a  
nonprofit to suffer shoddy building conditions when  
NYCHA has dollars, millions of dollars dedicated to  
renovations and repairs at Community and Senior  
Centers. We need to know when and how NYCHA and DFTA  
steps in, in these cases. NYCHA and DFTA must work  
together and work with us the Council in order to  
effectively serve our senior population. I look  
forward to today's testimony and discussions with the  
Agencies on how we can all do just that together.  
And now, I will turn it back to uhm co-Chair Council  
Member Chin. Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Uhm thank you, uhm we have also been joined by Council Member Menchaca earlier and he is on the Public Housing Committee, right and uhm Council Member Van Bramer. Now, we are going to have uhm our Counsel swear in the first panel, from DFTA. Okay, so we are going to do the public panel first. And we are going to call up, Latisha Miller Nathea (SP?) from SAGE Senior Housing, okay, Gregory Morris from the Stanley Isaac Neighborhood Center and Lillian Woo uhm from the Hamilton Madison House, Senior Center. Uhm please begin. Okay we uhm, we have a five-minute time clock so please try to summarize and also some of the important points and we want to make sure that representative from DFTA and NYCHA will be able to hear some of your concern and hopefully they can address some of them. Okay.

LATISHA MILLER NATHEA (SP?): Thank you Council Members, on behalf of SAGE thank you for holding this hearing on senior services in NYCHA developments. My name is Latisha Miller Nathea (SP?) and I am the Sage's Director of Residential, uhm Resident Services. SAGE is the country's first and largest organization dedicated to improving the lives

1  
2 of LGBT older adults. Founded in New York City in  
3 1978, we have provided comprehensive social services  
4 and programs to LGBT older people for 40 years,  
5 including the nation's first full time Senior Center,  
6 the Eddie Windsor Safe Center, located in Chelsea and  
7 launched with generous support from the Council.  
8 Building on the positive strides that the Safe Center  
9 has made in reducing isolation faced by LGBT older  
10 adults. In June 2014, the New York City Council  
11 awarded SAGE Funding to open Safe Center standalone  
12 sites in Brooklyn, the Bronx and Staten Island and to  
13 expand our SAGE Harlem program into a full-service  
14 Safe Center Site. And for that we are enormously  
15 grateful. LGBT older people are a significant part  
16 of our City's rapidly growing elder population and  
17 are often severely isolated and disconnected from  
18 services. Extreme isolation and experienced  
19 discrimination are a lethal combination for LGBT  
20 Elders. A recent study found that the impact that  
21 isolation has on one's health, physical health is the  
22 equivalent of smoking 15 cigarettes a day. More  
23 needs to be done to ensure our City's most isolated  
24 elders can find meaningful connection. In fact, LGBT  
25 elders are severely isolated. They are twice as

1  
2 likely to live alone, half as likely to be partnered  
3 and four times less likely to have kids. Many LGBT  
4 elders were shunned by their families and as a result  
5 are half as likely to be close to have, to have close  
6 relatives to call for help. Roughly  $\frac{1}{4}$  of LGBT elders  
7 have no one to call in the case of an emergency.

8 Because of their thin supports, LGBT elders often  
9 need to turn to Service Providers for care as they  
10 age. Yet, they are often distrustful of mainstream  
11 providers and for good reason. LGBT older adults are  
12 more likely to face discrimination around their  
13 sexual orientation and gender identify when accessing  
14 care, Social Services and other programs.

15 Discrimination has lasting effects on LGBT older  
16 adult's financial security. More than 4/10, 42% in  
17 fact of LGBT Americans over the age of 65 cite  
18 financial problems as a major concern. Roughly 47%  
19 report having less than \$10,000 in savings and assets  
20 and 30% are concerned about their housing stability.  
21 51% of LGBT older people report that they are very,  
22 that they are very or extremely concerned about  
23 having enough money to live on, compared to 36% of  
24 straight couples. The fact that so many LGBT elders  
25 are low-income and struggle with financial security

1  
2 coupled with our City's rapidly rising older LGBT  
3 demographic will mean that more Senior Centers will  
4 likely need to be located near NYCHA Housing  
5 Campuses. Recognizing the acute need among our  
6 City's LGBT older adults and LGBT welcoming, LGBT  
7 welcoming elder housing, SAGE and our partners help  
8 USA and BFC Partners are developing New York City's  
9 first LGBT Welcoming Senior Housing in Brooklyn and  
10 the Bronx. The marquis of each develop will be a  
11 full service, ground floor safe center built on our,  
12 built on our success, built on our successful which  
13 will support building residents and elders, and  
14 elders in larger community in which each building is  
15 located. Both of these buildings are 100% affordable  
16 and each have a set aside for formerly homeless  
17 elders. The largest of these two buildings,  
18 Ingersoll Senior Residence, Residences is part of the  
19 NextGen NYCHA initiative and is being built on  
20 NYCHA's Ingersoll Public Housing Campus. The  
21 services and programming offer through the co-located  
22 ground floor, the safe center will draw from our 40  
23 years of experience of service provision to LGBT  
24 elders. Ingersoll Senior Housing house senior  
25 residences and is co-located safe center will serve

1  
2 low-income building tenants as well as elders in the  
3 Fort Green and surrounding neighborhoods and for... is  
4 that my time.

5 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Yeah why don't you  
6 continue. Uhm can you maybe sum up with maybe a  
7 couple of maybe the repair issues?

8 LATISHA MILLER NATHEA (SP?): Okay.

9 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: That you can  
10 highlight so that we can uhm try to get them  
11 addressed later.

12 LATISHA MILLER NATHEA (SP?): Uhm in  
13 addition, in our experience in operating the uhm  
14 network of five Senior Centers across the City also  
15 means that providers assume much of the  
16 responsibility for the upkeep and maintenance of  
17 these sites. Further stretches SAGE's budget. Our  
18 Harlem SAGE Center located in the Drew Hamilton  
19 Community Center on which SAGE leases from NYCHA.  
20 SAGE experienced challenges this past summer when the  
21 ceiling at the site partially collapsed, directly  
22 over the serving table from which we serve daily  
23 meals. It took a week for NYCHA to address the  
24 issue, which was likely due to SAGE's outreach to the  
25 Mayor's office. For over a week, there was a wet,

1  
2 there was wet ceiling debris on the floor of our  
3 largest program space. Unfortunately, this is not an  
4 isolated incident. So many of the City's Senior  
5 Centers are in disrepair especially those located in  
6 NYCHA Developments. With the rapidly growing  
7 increasing in our City's older population, the City  
8 will need to improve the current condition,  
9 conditions in these centers, invest in infrastructure  
10 and support more culturally competent aging services  
11 to reflect the diverse identities and needs of our  
12 City's, of our City's older population. Your support  
13 continues to be greatly valued and appreciated, thank  
14 you.

15 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Next.

16 LILLIAM WOO: Good morning everyone. I  
17 would like to thank the Council for the opportunity  
18 to speak and also for organizing this hearing. My  
19 name is Lillian and I am the Program Director at  
20 Hamilton Madison House, Senior Services NORC, a  
21 naturally occurring retirement community. We are  
22 located in NYCHAs upper-east houses of the lower  
23 Manhattan. We serve the older adult residents of  
24 Smith Houses and we are also open to seniors residing  
25 throughout the five boroughs of New York City. To

1  
2 provide some background, the Smith Houses was built  
3 by NYCHA in 1951 to 1953 and is home to over 4,000  
4 residents. More than 30% is seniors over the age of  
5 60. Many of these seniors visit Smith NORC for  
6 services and activities. Not just because of the  
7 close proximity but also because they rely on our  
8 services for their livelihood. With over 1,600  
9 members Smith NORC provides social services in  
10 Chinese, Spanish, English, health-care management  
11 services and partnership with visiting nurse  
12 services, daily hot nutritious lunch, health  
13 promotion and recreational activities to help seniors  
14 age in place. As a NORC program we would not exist  
15 without NYCHA so I have to express my gratitude for  
16 that; however, I am here to share a light on some of  
17 the facility issues that impact the quality of our  
18 work and these are very real issues that put the  
19 safety and health of our seniors and staff at risk.  
20 I have selected four of the most pressing issues that  
21 we have been dealing with in the past year. 1)  
22 Sewage backflow in our lunch room. There is a sewer  
23 connected to the developments main line. During  
24 heavy rain, when the mainline is clogged, our  
25 lunchroom becomes flooded by the backflow. This

1 happens at least twice a year and when this happens  
2 there is no clear channel of communication to  
3 expedite service from NYCHA. Instead, we are left  
4 with the time-consuming process of calling the  
5 central number, placing the ticket, making panic  
6 calls to our management office and finally we are  
7 left with no choice but to pull up our sleeves and  
8 address the matter ourselves. And even aftermath of  
9 these events we are told by NYCHA maintenance workers  
10 that it is difficult for them to fix the issue. They  
11 will simply have to order a new cap for the sewer to  
12 put a lid on the problem. So far, we are still  
13 waiting and the most recent incident was in  
14 September. 2) Excess heat. It has been a daily  
15 occurrence that the heat in some of our office is so  
16 strong that the temperature measures 90 degrees.  
17 Sure, it is better than having no heat but we often  
18 hear reports from our seniors that they too  
19 experience the same problem in their apartments and  
20 NYCHA fails to adjust the heat to the proper  
21 temperature. As many of our seniors are frail, it is  
22 difficult for them to physically open the window for  
23 cooler air and we fear that overheating may be a real  
24 danger to them. 3) Pest control. We have seen mice  
25

1  
2 and water bugs become a regular occurrence at our  
3 center. NYCHAs extermination services are not  
4 sufficient and we believe this problem is a  
5 development-wide issue. Our only resort has been to  
6 hire a private exterminator who has been more  
7 diligent in inspecting and treating each area of our  
8 facility; however, we need NYCHA to also treat this  
9 issue with more attention and resources. 4) Leaks.  
10 Leaks are a regular occurrence because our facility  
11 and its pipes are old. Often it takes NYCHA several  
12 hours to respond and sometimes the responding  
13 personnel does not have the expertise to address the  
14 problem. They call in the referral to another  
15 maintenance worker and this is a time-consuming  
16 process which takes away our time, which should be  
17 better allocated toward serving clients. So, with  
18 the issues that I have highlighted I appeal tonight  
19 to do the following: 1) Expedite services during  
20 emergencies. 2) Have more qualified personnel and  
21 maintenance workers readily available. 3) Create a  
22 more efficient system, create a more efficient  
23 service request system so that maintenance issues can  
24 be communicated more quickly and effectively and  
25

1  
2 lastly allocate more resources to capital  
3 improvement. Thank you for your attention.

4 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you very  
5 much, uhm next.

6 PAKHI KANE: Good morning, my name is  
7 Pakhi Kane, I am the Deputy Executive Director of the  
8 Stanley M. Isaacs Neighborhood Center. I am here on  
9 behalf of Gregory J. Morris who is the Executive  
10 Director of our organization. Uhm I want to thank  
11 Chair Ampry-Samuel and Chair Margaret Chin and other  
12 members of the Committee for this important hearing  
13 and for bringing us all together to talk about these  
14 issues. Uhm I'm not going to read my testimony but I  
15 am going to try to highlight some of the pieces in  
16 here and some other things that I think would be  
17 helpful for the Committee to consider. Uhm I am  
18 disheartened to know that some of the things that we  
19 are experiencing obviously there are others, my  
20 colleagues are also experiencing across the City.  
21 With that said, I know the good people that are  
22 sitting to my right who represent the leadership of  
23 NYCHA and DFTA have all the good intentions in mind.  
24 Uhm they certainly don't see any of these issues as  
25 being unimportant and certainly want to address them.

1  
2 The issue is that I don't believe they have the  
3 resources to do it. Uhm with that said, Isaac's  
4 Homes, Homes, particular Homes Development is a site  
5 for an Infill Project that is happening and there is  
6 going to be, there are going to be some private  
7 dollars that come into our site as a result of that  
8 project and we are heartened to know that. Uhm there  
9 are other infill projects that are happening across  
10 the City or will happen across the City through which  
11 we can draw, draw some private dollars. I think  
12 there are certainly opportunities for us to have  
13 conversations with private developers about how they  
14 can make a stronger investment in NYCHA so that they  
15 can do the work that I know that they want to do.  
16 Uhm in addition to that, the, it is clear to us from  
17 our perspective that there are certain pieces of  
18 services to seniors that are critical, right, meals,  
19 case management, all of the things that we have been  
20 talking about for decades that remain underfunded.  
21 Uhm there is great opportunity I think in the coming  
22 months to work with the new leadership at DFTA. On  
23 the things that are coming up and to think about how  
24 we can create uhm not just additional funding which  
25 is what we always talk about but cost efficiencies in

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

the system. I think that there are providers who are willing and ready to sit together at the same table and figure out how we more cost effectively deliver services and eliminate duplication across the system. We want to be at the table with all of you to try and figure some of that out before the RFP comes out and so obviously there is a common period during the concept paper which we will take advantage of but if there are additional conversations needed, we hope that you will consider sitting with us and obviously have leadership from the City at the table at all. The last thing that I want to sort of talk about is investment from the Council. Obviously, there are you know different opportunity on the Council side. There is less money that, that this body necessarily allocates as opposed to the other side and we understand that. With that said, there, there is opportunity I believe for the Council to sit down and look at whether there is, there are discretionary dollars that can be set aside for facilities and maintenance costs for organizations like ours as at the very least as a stop gap measure for now. Uhm so those are some of the suggestions that I have, uhm I

1  
2 am happy to answer any questions that the Committee  
3 may have for me. Thank you.

4 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Uhm thank you for  
5 your testimony and thank you for uhm you know giving  
6 examples of what is going on every day, uhm at the  
7 centers that are inside NYCHA and hopefully during  
8 the Administration's panel they can help address some  
9 of those issues that was raised. Other questions.

10 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: This is for  
11 uhm Stanley Isaac, is there way that you can uhm just  
12 shed some light on the work that you had been doing  
13 with NYCHA with the seniors related to uhm the  
14 repairs that were needed and uhm any ideas about what  
15 we can ask of the Administration for more funding or  
16 uhm or maybe the work that has done with NYCHA during  
17 like the work group meetings related to the repairs  
18 and how much the repairs actually cost if at all, if  
19 you were involved at all in any of those  
20 conversations?

21 PAKHI KANE: So, I personally was not, I  
22 as not at Stanley Isaacs at the time uhm when I  
23 believe it was UNH who was having some of the  
24 conversations with OMB and NYCHA and others. I will  
25 say that uhm General Manager Marsa Chulo (SP?) has

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

been to the Isaac Center. We have had some great conversations with him and his leadership team, his wonderful staff who I think really wants to do the right thing uhm and we are appreciative of that. I, like I said I don't believe that they necessarily have the, the resources to do what needs to get done across the City. I think what would be helpful for us to understand is how repairs get prioritized or how repairs sort of happen across the City. I don't know that there is transparency in that. I think you know that when there are sort of 24 hour Emergency tickets and those types of things put in, uhm there are I would imagine thousands of them across the City so how do you, how do you prioritize and when is it that we sort of know whether someone is going to come, or, or not and I feel like that having at least that transparency would help some of these uhm organizations prepare for what is coming next. Uhm so information, even if it is not resources information, I think is helpful and I think NYCHA has certainly tried uhm to, to provide that when we've asked for it. Although I think you know, it's, it's hard to do and there is a, there is a very long to do

1  
2 list. Uhm not sure if that completely answers your  
3 question?

4 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Okay thank you for  
5 your testimony and we are going to call up the panel  
6 for the Administration, representative from DFTA and  
7 NYCHA. Uhm we've been joined by our majority leader,  
8 Council Member Laurie Cumbo. Oh, and Council Member  
9 Deutsch. Can you uhm, please identify yourself  
10 before the Counsel administer the oath?

11 DAVID PRISTIN: Hi I'm, I'm David  
12 Pristin, I'm Executive Vice-President for External  
13 Affairs at NYCHA.

14 CARYN RESNICK: Good morning I'm Caryn  
15 Resnick I'm Acting Commissioner at the New York City  
16 Department for the Aging.

17 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Good morning, oh,  
18 sorry, good morning everyone I am Unit Director for  
19 NYCHAs Family Partnership Department.

20 CAROLYN JASPER Good morning, good morning  
21 I'm Carolyn Jasper, I'm Vice-President of Operations  
22 with New York's Housing Authority.

23 KAREN TAYLOR: Good morning I'm Karen  
24 Taylor, Assistant Commissioner, Bureau of Community  
25 Services at DFTA.

1  
2 COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand,  
3 do you affirm to tell the truth the whole truth and  
4 nothing but the truth in your testimony before the  
5 Committee and to respond honestly to, to Council  
6 Member questions?

7 DAVID PRISTIN: I do.

8 CARYN RESNICK: I do.

9 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): I do.

10 CAROLYN JASPER: I do.

11 KAREN TAYLOR: I do.

12 DAVID PRISTIN: Chairs Alicka Ampry-  
13 Samuel and Margaret Chin, members of the Committees  
14 of Public Housing and Aging and other distinguished  
15 members of the City Council. Good morning, I am  
16 David Pristin, NYCH's Executive Vice-President for  
17 External Affairs. Joining me today are Deborah  
18 Goddard, Executive Vice-President for Capital  
19 Projects, Uka Buskis (SP?) Senior Director of Family  
20 Partnerships, Carolyn Jasper, Vice-President for  
21 Operations as well as our partners from the City  
22 Department for the Aging (DFTA). Thank you for this  
23 opportunity to discuss the Authorities work to  
24 provide the more than 80,000 seniors living in our  
25 developments across the City with safe supportive

1  
2 communities and access to quality services. We  
3 provide testimony on this topic to the Council on  
4 October 2017 and are happy to provide you with an  
5 update today on Senior Services and Centers at NYCHA.  
6 While NYCHA faces significant challenges, a lot of \$3  
7 million in federal operating and capital funding over  
8 the last 17 years, and a \$32 billion capital need we  
9 are firmly committed to our Seniors and believe that  
10 all New Yorkers deserve to age in place with dignity  
11 in their homes. In recent years, we have  
12 reconsidered how we work, focusing on our core  
13 responsibility to be a better landlord. This has led  
14 to creative new approaches to serving residents,  
15 particularly our seniors who aging in place. As part  
16 of that focus, we have moved away from directly  
17 providing Social Services to connecting residents to  
18 best in class services from the vast network of  
19 Social Service providers throughout the City. NYCHA  
20 helps her seniors thrive in a number of ways, with  
21 initiatives that positively impact seniors living in  
22 our developments as well as programs that serve only  
23 our most vulnerable. If you are a senior at NYCHA  
24 you can benefit from physical improvements to our  
25 buildings, access to onsite and nearby services,

1  
2 connections to services and age friendly reasonable  
3 accommodation policies. As a landlord, NYCHA  
4 continues to focus on improving our buildings, to  
5 enhance resident's quality of life. As mentioned  
6 last year, we updated the architectural design  
7 guidelines for the rehabilitation of our buildings  
8 taking into account age friendly and accessible  
9 designs as well as DFTAs age friendly New York City  
10 report and HBDs guidelines for senior housing.  
11 Whenever the funding is available to upgrade our  
12 buildings, these standards will better support the  
13 safety, health and comfort of residents including  
14 their ability to age in place gracefully. Guided by  
15 the new architectural standards in 2017 and 2018 we  
16 invested over \$8 million to make accessible and age  
17 friendly improvements at 66 developments such as more  
18 comfortable seating areas on the grounds for seniors,  
19 the new LED exterior lighting that we are installing  
20 across the City makes it easier for everyone,  
21 including our seniors to see. We are eager to get  
22 the funding necessary to complete more of these  
23 projects in the future. The 110 Senior Centers at  
24 NYCHA including the 96 Senior Centers and Senior  
25 Social Clubs sponsored by DFTA provide a range of

1  
2 recreational health and cultural activity services  
3 and resources that enhance the lives of NYCHA  
4 residents and other seniors in the community. On any  
5 given day, seniors participate in free exercise  
6 classes, discussion groups, or blood pressure  
7 screenings. At DFTA-funded Senior Centers older New  
8 Yorkers can get free meals, counseling on social  
9 services or assistance with benefits. Regardless of  
10 where they live, most NYCHA seniors have access to a  
11 program onsite or within their community. The 14  
12 Senior Centers that are not run by DFTA are still  
13 operated by NYCHA through funding from the Mayor's  
14 office. The funding that we have received \$3 million  
15 a year, allows us to fully or partially operate  
16 Senior Center Programming and meal services. Since  
17 2015, attendance has increased by 42% at these  
18 centers. This demonstrates how important they are  
19 for our aging population. While we are committed to  
20 our Senior Centers, NYCHAs Capital Needs total \$32  
21 billion including the significant repair needs at our  
22 Senior Centers. Discussions with our partners at OMB  
23 and DFTA about how to best improve our centers are  
24 ongoing. We will continue to work with them to lay  
25 out clear roles and responsibilities for each party

1  
2 and to determine the best strategy for financing  
3 existing repair needs within the context of NYCHAs  
4 larger capital need. These Centers are valuable  
5 assets to our communities that deserve to be  
6 preserved but given NYCHAs dire financial position  
7 and more than \$30 billion in capital needs it is  
8 difficult to accommodate both the repairs needed to  
9 secure our residents homes as well as fix our  
10 centers. We are in discussions with our partners at  
11 OMB and DFTA on a Memorandum of Understand to improve  
12 how we repair our centers. This MOU once finalized  
13 will lay out clear roles and responsibilities for  
14 each party making Senior Center Management more  
15 straightforward. Although this MOU was expected to  
16 be completed earlier this year, thoughtful  
17 discussions are ongoing. NYCHA's community  
18 engagement and partnership department fulfills NYCHAs  
19 goal of engaging residents and connecting them to  
20 best in class services. By engaging key populations  
21 including seniors and connecting them to critical and  
22 social services from community-based organizations  
23 and other City Agencies seniors are supported as they  
24 age in place at NYCHA. We know that we cannot do  
25 this alone which is why we streamlined how we

1  
2 partnered with local providers through our Zone  
3 Model. Partnership is key to serving our seniors.  
4 NYCHA works with dedicated providers across the City  
5 to meet their needs. Here are some examples of  
6 services our partners provide, the HUD-funded Senior  
7 Resident Advisor Program provides onsite assistance  
8 to seniors in need at six sites, helping them live  
9 safely and independently in their homes through home  
10 visits, connections to services and regular visits by  
11 volunteer floor tap and neighbors. Another HUD-  
12 funded initiative, the Elder Safe at Home Program,  
13 provides crime prevention and Social Service  
14 assistance and educational workshops to seniors at  
15 four sites in the south Bronx. Socially isolated or  
16 homebound seniors in all five boroughs receive  
17 regular home visits through Henry Street Settlement  
18 Senior Companion Program. Senior Companions are  
19 healthy, older adults who help their fellow seniors  
20 live independently by helping them to shopping and go  
21 to the doctor's appointments and do errands and by  
22 simply providing companionship. Currently, our  
23 partners Presbyterian Senior Services, Hudson Guild,  
24 Union Settlement and Project Find are serving  
25 residents at specific developments in their service

1  
2 areas. NYCHA is finalizing partnership with 16  
3 additional providers that will also assist seniors  
4 directly and 11 partners will be located at NYCHAs  
5 Family Partnership Department Offices to provide  
6 helpful services to seniors. At our 74 only senior  
7 buildings and 11 NORCs, retirement communities that  
8 are naturally occurring, seniors and their caregivers  
9 are supported with onsite and nearby assistance.  
10 This includes one-on-one counseling as well as  
11 recreational and cultural opportunities from DFTA and  
12 many other providers. At 9 NORC sites, homebound and  
13 nonhome bound seniors are connected to services and  
14 get help with accessing public benefits and improving  
15 their health. NYCHA is applying for six more NYCHA  
16 buildings to be designated at NORCs and we expect to  
17 hear back about their eligibility next year. In just  
18 this last Friday, we activated 82 new senior  
19 champions across our development. These NYCHA  
20 leaders participated in workshops on creating health,  
21 safety and educational activities for seniors in  
22 NYCHA communities. We appreciate Council Member  
23 Diana Ayala's participation in this valuable  
24 initiative. NYCHA provides vital, provides vital  
25 support to seniors in many ways, from Senior Center

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Programming to the dedicated services available at our senior only buildings. From the new housing we are creating exclusively for Seniors to a reasonable accommodation policy that facilitate assistance from caregivers, we are eager to continue engaging with the Council and other partners across the City as we work to transform NYCHA and enhance the level of services offered to our seniors. Thank you for the opportunity to continue the dialog on this important topic. We are happy to answer any questions you ay have.

CARYN RESNICK: Good morning Chair persons Chin, Ampry-Samuel and members of the Aging and Public Housing Committees, I am Caryn Resnick, Acting Commissioner of the New York City Department for the Aging and I am joined this morning by Karen Taylor, Assistant Commissioner for the Bureau of Community Services, as DFTA as well as my partners from the New York City Housing Authority. I would like to thank you for this opportunity to testify on the topic of Senior Services and Centers in NYCHA. DFTA funds a number of senior programs located in NYCHA developments. These programs include Senior Centers and other affiliated sites. In addition,

1  
2 DFTA sponsors nine natural occurring retirement  
3 communities, NORCs, programs at NYCHA locations, also  
4 under the Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood  
5 Safety, the MAP Program, DFTAs Grandparent Resource  
6 Center works with residents at 15 NYCHA developments  
7 as a part of this initiative. DFTA Senior Center  
8 Portfolio includes 71 NYCHA sites. In addition to  
9 the Senior Center Network DFTA funds other affiliated  
10 sites in NYCHA developments which includes social  
11 clubs and satellites. Senior Centers provide meals  
12 at no cost to participants through modest voluntary  
13 contributions. At Senior Centers, older New Yorkers  
14 can participate in a variety of recreational, health,  
15 promotional, and cultural activities as well as  
16 receive counseling on social services and obtain  
17 assistance with benefits. The Social Clubs comprise  
18 the 17 Senior Centers formerly operated by NYCHA  
19 which transition to DFTA sponsorship in FY16. The  
20 satellite programs encompass Senior Centers that were  
21 formerly funded through Council discretionary  
22 allocations as well as the initial four Senior  
23 Centers that transferred from NYCHA to DFTA. The  
24 other affiliated sites provide educational and  
25 recreational programming but are smaller in scope and

1  
2 may not include the range of services available at a  
3 DFTA Senior Center. In FY18, more than 7500 older  
4 New Yorkers participated daily in DFTA-funded Senior  
5 Centers and affiliated sites at NYCHA locations.  
6 These programs also serve nearly 2.1 million  
7 congregate meals in Fiscal Year 18. Additionally,  
8 the technology, education and municipal facilities  
9 initiative by the Mayor's Office of the Chief  
10 Technology Officer seeks to increase older adult  
11 access to broad band services and NYCHA developments.  
12 Technology classes and events are held at Mott Haven  
13 Houses in the Bronx, Jefferson Houses in Manhattan  
14 and Council Member Ayala's District, Red Hook Houses  
15 in Brooklyn in Council Member Menchaca's District,  
16 Queens Bridge Houses in Council Member Van Bramer's  
17 District and Stapleton Houses in Staten Island in  
18 Council Member Rose's District. The City has defined  
19 naturally occurring retirement communities as  
20 residential locations, single buildings, housing  
21 developments or clusters of buildings within a  
22 neighborhood that are neither age restricted or built  
23 specifically for seniors. Over time, as residents  
24 have aged in placed, these housing locations have  
25 become home to significant concentrations of older

1  
2 adults. There are five primary objectives for DFTA-  
3 funded NORC programs. All NORC programs should  
4 provide supportive environments that allow seniors  
5 independence as they age in place, engage residents  
6 and facilitate linkages within the community, assess  
7 the needs of senior residents and offer supportive  
8 services based on assessments and build strong and  
9 meaningful communities that cultivate for new roles  
10 for work community members. Nine NYCHA developments  
11 are served by DFTA funded NORC programs including  
12 Smith Houses in Manhattan, in Chair Chin's District,  
13 Coney Island 1 site 8 in Brooklyn in Council Member  
14 Treyger's District, Raven's Wood Houses in Queens in  
15 Council Member Van Bramer's District and Pellham  
16 Parkway Houses in the Bronx in Council Member  
17 Gjonaj's District. The NORC programs provide  
18 services such as case management to homebound and  
19 non-homebound seniors, assistance with accessing  
20 public benefits and an increased emphasis on  
21 wellness, chronic disease, risk assessments and  
22 healthcare management. The Grandparent Resource  
23 Center, the first of its kind in the nation was  
24 established by DFTA in 1994. The GRC provides a  
25 number of supportive services to those older adults

1 who are raising grandchildren and other young  
2 relatives. Resource specialists at the GRC offer  
3 advocate and case assistance as well as referrals to  
4 appropriate community-based organizations. These  
5 CBOs provide services such as preventative services,  
6 legal services, financial assistance, advocacy,  
7 educational services, tutoring services for children,  
8 family counseling and support groups. In order to  
9 serve some of the neediness kinship caregiver  
10 families, the GRC program expanded under the Mayor's  
11 Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety. As part of the  
12 MAP initiative GRC Community Advocates work with  
13 residents at 15 NYCHA developments and provide  
14 resources and services to grandparent caregivers.  
15 Through the initiative, grandparent and relative  
16 caregivers have received grandparenting education,  
17 community safety trainings, intergenerational program  
18 and peer support on raising children. Thank you  
19 again for this opportunity to provide testimony on  
20 Senior Services and Centers in NYCHA and my  
21 colleagues and I are pleased to answer any questions  
22 that you may have.

24 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you for your  
25 testimony, and we have been joined by Council Member

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Ayala and Council Member Vallone, both on the Committee on Aging. I'm going to start off with a couple of questions and then I will pass it on to my co-Chair and to other Council Members, uhm. For DFTA and NYCHA, my question is that the Social Clubs, uhm the Administration has been funding the transition for the last, what, three years already and there are still 14 Social Clubs that are still under NYCHA so can you give us an update on what's the progress on that? Are they going to be all transfer over to DFTA? Or is this \$3 million is going to continue again in this year's budget?

KAREN TAYLOR: Uhm as we have testified in the past, the 14 Centers that remain operated by NYCHA really fall short of meeting DFTAs criteria to be a full-fledged Senior Center and they are even in some cases smaller than other satellite programs so from DFTAs perspective because of the small number of participants and in many cases, the actual size of the facility uhm they don't really rise to the size of a senior center program so I believe the plan is that NYCHA will continue to operate and run those 14 sites in the coming year.

1  
2           DAVID PRISTIN: So that, that is correct  
3 uhm we, look we recognized this valuable resource to  
4 the residents within these communities and I think  
5 we, uhm I think as a stated within the testimony, six  
6 of these sites are actually in areas where we are  
7 going, where we are in the process of responding to  
8 New York State Office of Aging uhm NYSOFA for NORCs  
9 and with that, the idea would be that we are seeing,  
10 currently seeking partners, providers who would be  
11 partners in that application and that would be a way  
12 to bring funding in to enhance the services that are  
13 provided at those, at those sites so those sites are  
14 High Bridge, Sedgwick, Glenmore Plaza, Sumner, Taft  
15 and Wagner. Uhm and for the, regardless of whether  
16 we receive that designation or not, we are prepared  
17 to continue to run those sites and uhm we have had  
18 expectation that so we are prepared to continue to  
19 run them otherwise.

20           CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: So, are you saying  
21 that if you don't get the funding from the  
22 Administration you are still going to continue the  
23 other Social Clubs?

24           DAVID PRISTIN: That is, that is our,  
25 that is our plan. Uhm you know we were appreciative

1  
2 of when the Council uhm funded these sites and over  
3 the last two years, the Mayor's office has provided  
4 funding and our expectation, or plan is to prepare  
5 for that if we don't get the funding from the, from  
6 the NORC, NYSOFA.

7 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Are there any plans  
8 in the six that you have identified, could qualify as  
9 a NORC within their own building, right? So, what  
10 about the other ones, are there a possibility of  
11 working with DFTA to sort of like create neighborhood  
12 NORCs where the services can be open maybe even to  
13 non-NYCHA residents and to be able to create a  
14 program that can service seniors in that area?

15 CARYN RESNICK: So, I would just like to  
16 offer that our existing services in those  
17 communities, case management, home delivered meals,  
18 adjacent nearby Senior Centers are all in place and  
19 available to NYCHA residents in those facilities. So  
20 that's not a NORC per se but our case management  
21 services are available so in many instances we are  
22 providing services to large numbers of older adults  
23 living in those facilities.

24 DAVID PRISTIN: The only thing that I  
25 will add is we are, we are in regular contact and

1  
2 discussion with DFTA and the City evaluating these  
3 Centers and you know overall services for our Seniors  
4 I mean although we only have current plans because  
5 these are the ones that are actually eligible to be,  
6 to be a NORC we well continue to have conversations  
7 of how to continue to support these seniors.

8 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Okay I mean the  
9 thing about in terms of intergeneration community  
10 center it just seems like all of these years, we  
11 still haven't come up with some solution or some  
12 suggestion in terms of how to maintain service or  
13 even expand services uhm in those developments so  
14 that is something that I think that DFTA and NYCHA  
15 have to continue to work together on that. Now for  
16 the six that you think will qualify for NORC for  
17 state funding, what, if you get the funding, that's  
18 DFTAs role? Is DFTA going to have oversight? On  
19 those NORC programs?

20 KAREN TAYLOR: No, I don't believe we  
21 would. It would be NYCHA as the manager and whatever  
22 social service agency would be in partnership and  
23 they would have responsibility and no we would not  
24 have oversight.

1

2

3

4

5

6

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: So, on that though,  
it's like, DFTA also operates, I mean has oversight  
of NORCs that are in NYCHA now? Right? So, who  
provides funding for those NORCs that DFTA has  
oversight on?

7

8

9

KAREN TAYLOR: I know we have nine  
NYCHA, nine DFTA funded NORCs in NYCHA facilities and  
they are tax level funded.

10

11

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: So, they are funded  
by the state or they are funded by the City?

12

CARYN RESNICK: City.

13

KAREN TAYLOR: City.

14

15

16

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: They are funded by  
the City, so they are funded by the City and DFTA has  
oversight?

17

18

KAREN TAYLOR: And we have oversight,  
correct.

19

20

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: If they are funded  
by the State?

21

22

KAREN TAYLOR: Then the State Office for  
the Aging has oversight.

23

24

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: But then there is  
no connection to DFTA as in.

25

1  
2 KAREN TAYLOR: In some of our NORC  
3 portfolio there are providers that have both State  
4 and City funding so then we work together but if they  
5 were exclusively State funding then we would not have  
6 an oversight role. I mean we did used to convene a  
7 NORC and I'm sure we still do sort of an advisory get  
8 together of all of the NORC programs and Caryn is our  
9 Resident NORC expert so we are always offering  
10 technical assistance so we would welcome them into  
11 the portfolio.

12 CARYN RESNICK: Absolutely.

13 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Okay, I mean just  
14 on that because in the Council we have been working  
15 on creating new laws and the last Budget we just  
16 created one in Council Member Ampry-Samuel's District  
17 and we are going to look to continue to do more of  
18 that in absence of State funding or hopefully that  
19 Administration will pick it up baseline, increase the  
20 funding because NORC is so necessary and that's what  
21 I'm looking at all the, the one that is left over.  
22 The eight that is, you don't know what to do with  
23 them that maybe working with the Council we can  
24 figure out a creative way, either doing a NORC there  
25 or some kind of intergenerational program, we've got

1  
2 to be able to find a solution and not just let them  
3 just hang out there. Uhm Chair Ampry-Samuel has a  
4 followup question on this NORC.

5 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: It is just a  
6 point of clarification. Uhm David, you said that  
7 there were 96 Senior Centers and Social Clubs that  
8 are sponsored by DFTA but then Ms. Resnick said that  
9 DFTA Senior portfolio includes 71 NYCHA sites so I  
10 just wanted to get some clarification around the  
11 numbers first?

12 CARYN RESNICK: I don't think the 71  
13 included the Social Clubs. The 17 Social Clubs.

14 KAREN TAYLOR: Yeah that's correct, we  
15 broke them out by, fully, fully operated centers,  
16 Social Clubs and satellites but the numbers are the  
17 same.

18 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, and uhm  
19 just one other quick just clarification around Senior  
20 Centers versus a Social Club and there was a comment  
21 about the size of it and uhm for, for me, Brownsville  
22 Houses has a Social Club.

23 CARYN RESNICK: Correct.

24 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: And.  
25

1  
2                   CARYN RESNICK: That's a NYCHA operated  
3 Social.

4                   CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: That's a  
5 NYCHA operated Social Club and Kingsboro Extension is  
6 a Senior Center? Correct?

7                   CARYN RESNICK: Yes. It's.

8                   CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: And there are  
9 more people that attend the Brownsville Social Club  
10 than the actual Kingsboro Senior Center but that's a  
11 social club that is listed as part of the 11 or 14  
12 and so I was just trying to get at the actual number  
13 of participation, because when you go into the  
14 Brownsville Social Club its crowded or you can go to  
15 a Senior Center and there is about five people there.  
16 And then also comparing it to, I know Glenmore Plaza  
17 is on the list and there was a mention, uhm I know  
18 that particular is Glenmore Plaza is not a Senior  
19 Center it is a handful of people there but when you  
20 go into Van Dyke which is a Senior Center, Van Dyke  
21 II is extremely small when you compare it to  
22 Glenmore, so, so some, so I'm just trying to get an  
23 understanding because some Social Clubs have more  
24 participation than some Senior Centers and then some  
25 Social Clubs maybe larger than some of the Centers

1  
2 and so can you explain how you came up with the rhyme  
3 or reason around which ones would not receive funding  
4 and which should? Because what you just stated  
5 around the numbers and the size is not really what it  
6 is.

7           CARYN RESNICK: Let me just clarify  
8 something, the term Social Clubs was uhm a term that  
9 DFTA gave to the 17 Centers that had been previously  
10 operated directly by NYCHA when they were transferred  
11 to DFTA. Uhm this was because they were smaller and  
12 the services were kind of a mix of different kinds of  
13 services and not the prescribed Senior Center  
14 Services that had been required in our last Senior  
15 Center RFP. So, we gave them the def, the definition  
16 of Social Clubs.

17           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: But you just  
18 said some are small and so I just wanted to clarify  
19 that smaller.

20           CARYN RESNICK: Yes, some of smaller and  
21 some are not.

22           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: That small,  
23 some are actually larger in size.

24  
25

1  
2 CARYN RENICK: But I think some of the  
3 Centers though that you are referencing are still  
4 NYCHA Senior Centers, is that?

5 KAREN TAYLOR: Yes, so Brownsville and  
6 Glenmore and NYCHA Senior Centers, uhm we call them  
7 Senior Centers not Social Clubs I think that is a  
8 term that DFTA called the 17 that were transferred to  
9 them. I do know that the average daily attendance at  
10 Brownsville is quite large, it is about 50+ seniors  
11 and the one at Glenmore has less attendees but we  
12 call them all Senior Centers, the 14 that we are  
13 operating.

14 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So NYCHA  
15 doesn't use the terminology Social Club?

16 CARYN RESNICK: No. Okay, so when we did  
17 an RFP several years ago, we defined Senior Center as  
18 having 60 participants and 60 meals per day and 75  
19 attendees participating in activities. So, we  
20 continue to monitor and talk to NYCHA about what is  
21 happening in the programs that they run and if  
22 attendance is increasing and if they were ever to  
23 sort of get that kind of attendance then of course we  
24 would consider bringing them into our portfolio.

1  
2 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: We need some data  
3 information. I think we would like you to send to us  
4 all the Centers, Social Club that is operated in  
5 NYCHA in terms of the program that they offer and the  
6 number of daily participants so that we can get a  
7 better sense of how large they are.

8 CARYN RESNICK: Yes, we would be happy to  
9 get that.

10 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: And what we can  
11 help with. Because I think that there is got to be  
12 some solution that we can work on, uhm because even  
13 the six that you identified to the State, I don't  
14 know when the RFP is out or is there a process, how  
15 soon do you think that you can get funding uhm for  
16 those Centers that you think could qualify as a NORC  
17 from the State program?

18 CARYN RESNICK: So, the RFP for the  
19 NYSOFA is out, it is due February 1 and it will fund  
20 those selected centers of five and a half years  
21 starting in July.

22 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Starting in July  
23 of?

24 CARYN RESNICK: 2019.  
25

1  
2 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: 2019. Okay, so we  
3 might not have to pick it up in the Council's  
4 Discretionary Funding, that's good. Uhm we also  
5 wanted to see how the coordination, in this, in this  
6 hearing we want to talk about the repair issue and  
7 you heard from our opening remarks and we have also  
8 been joined by Council Member Salamanca and thank him  
9 for bringing some visual to show some of the Center  
10 in his District. I mean that looks very bad. So how  
11 does NYCHA and DFTA coordinate in terms of these kind  
12 of repairs to expedite and you have heard from some  
13 of the providers earlier, especially uhm from  
14 Hamilton Madison House talking about the issues that  
15 they have and they weren't able to get expedited  
16 repair.

17 DAVID PRISTIN: So, thank you for the  
18 opportunity just to talk about this. So, I think it  
19 was actually mentioned in the last, in the last panel  
20 by one of the providers. We, we do split up how we  
21 do the repairs. So, the provider, when a repair is  
22 within the interior of the four walls of the buil..  
23 of their facility and it is more of a standard  
24 simpler less complex maintenance repair, then they  
25 are responsible for those repairs and they work

1  
2 closely with DFTA on security a vendor uhm to come  
3 and do that work themselves. Uhm to have a vendor  
4 come and do that work and that is usually a faster  
5 way to do the repair than, than uhm having NYCHA come  
6 and do it. NYCHA is responsible for the larger  
7 infrastructure and systems issues that are related to  
8 the, the larger structure of the building, so they  
9 are shared systems. So, we hear about some providers  
10 talking about sewage backup, uhm and you know issues  
11 around heat and to a degree those systems are shared  
12 with the larger development or the, or the building  
13 that it sits within then in those cases NYCHA is  
14 responsible for those repairs. Uhm sometimes where  
15 there are delays is sometimes when we initially  
16 identify something as a simple, as a simple repair  
17 and a vendor comes in to take a look at it.  
18 Sometimes as the vendor goes in and looks at what the  
19 issue is, it is identified that it is actually a  
20 larger, structure, or a structural issue.

21 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Uhm we've been  
22 joined by Council Member Mathieu Eugene. Uhm that  
23 will lead to, I think in terms of this year's Budget  
24 and we had the hearing uhm last month with DFTA about  
25 their Capital needs for Senior Centers. When you

1  
2 look at those pictures, a lot of those issues are  
3 Capital needs. So, NYCHA and DFTA is do you have a  
4 Capital budget need for repair, I mean to really take  
5 care of the Senior Center Social Clubs that are  
6 housed in NYCHA.

7           DAVID PRISTIN: I'm sorry, so are you  
8 asking so does DFTA or does NYCHA have a Capital to  
9 deal with.

10           CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Both of you. And  
11 we want ot know do you take, really pay attention to  
12 what the needs are in these Senior Centers because  
13 the condition in the Senior Centers of NYCHA are not  
14 good compared to other Senior Centers. So, if there  
15 are special attention pages, what, what are the  
16 Capital needs and then maybe we can all help to find  
17 resource to take care of that. I remember last month  
18 in the hearing with NYCHA on Capital, you don't  
19 really have a Capital Budget that provider can come  
20 and say I need to fix the bathroom, I need to fix,  
21 the ceiling, uhm come on. You should have some kind  
22 of budget request to the Administration and we can  
23 help, we can work with you to make sure that our  
24 Seniors have a nice place to go to for their Center.

1  
2 That is unacceptable. Uhm so we want to be helpful,  
3 so let us help.

4 CARYN RESNICK: Thank you and we really  
5 do appreciate that and I want you to understand that  
6 of course it is an extreme priority to make sure that  
7 all of these repairs and maintenance work are done.  
8 We talked at length at our last hearing about Capital  
9 Budget so there are some definition issues, we use  
10 expense dollars in order to make the minor repairs  
11 within the roles of the Senior Center and we, as they  
12 come to us, we prioritize them and we make funds  
13 available to do that and where it gets complicated of  
14 course is when you know it is an apartment above or a  
15 roof leaking problem and then it, you know, becomes  
16 problems of NYCHAs overall Capital Budget need so our  
17 intent is there and I thin the prioritizing and the  
18 funding availability to do so of the major Capital  
19 repairs is part of what makes it complicated.

20 DAVID PRISTIN: Uhm also I think let me  
21 pass it over to our Executive Vice-President Deborah  
22 Goddard who can speak more to, she, she's the  
23 Executive Vice-President for our Capital Program so  
24 she can talk a little more about the Capital needs.

1  
2 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Uhm, she has to be  
3 sworn in first, thank you.

4 COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand.  
5 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and  
6 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this  
7 committee and to respond honestly to Council Member  
8 questions?

9 DEBORAH GODDARD: I do. So, I just want  
10 to pick up where things were left off and, and  
11 revisit some of the stuff that we talked about a  
12 couple of weeks ago. Uhm we can't divorce this from  
13 the \$32 billion need as a number of folks have  
14 mentioned, and particularly the issues, for instance  
15 of Smith Houses on NYCHA for seeing a general pipe  
16 leak here. I'm not real sure what we are looking at  
17 but if we are talking Capital uhm so Smith Houses is  
18 the issue of overheating or the issue of the sewage,  
19 that is not something that can be separated from the  
20 overall Capital need at Smith Houses. And so, uhm  
21 you know the Mayor has put money into our roofs, he  
22 is putting money into our heating plans. Smith  
23 unfortunately is scheduled for State money for its  
24 heating plan, held up in Albany as you know but these  
25 are not items that can be isolated simply to a given

1  
2 Community Center and they do play in to the overall  
3 need when we are talking Capital of a \$32 billion  
4 need. And then I'm not quite sure, on the left we  
5 are looking probably a roof, a leak, a pipe leak that  
6 maybe could be isolated and repaired but if it is an  
7 overall system for the building that it is in or  
8 coming down from other apartments then again it goes  
9 to the fact that we have got issues with our  
10 distribution system in the whole building and that  
11 would be a building Capital Need.

12 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: I just have  
13 a, I have a follow up, when you look at the P&A and  
14 review a \$32 billion needs. Just as an example, when  
15 I looked up Van Dyke II there was a \$14 million need.  
16 Brown had a \$20 million need, Reed had a \$34 million,  
17 uhm, Kingsboro Extension had \$20 million uhm but  
18 there was also a line item uhm that, that uhm  
19 mentioned the Community Centers throughout some of  
20 them.

21 DEBORAH GODDARD: Yes.

22 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Uhm so if  
23 there is a line item that speaks to the, to the  
24 centers under the P&A uhm but not all of the  
25 developments had that. So, can you explain how some

1  
2 Community Centers had a Capital Repair need but  
3 others didn't because when I looked at the P&A just  
4 preparing for this hearing uhm my eyes like focused  
5 directly on looking to see if some of those Centers  
6 would be listed and I was shocked that they were not,  
7 knowing that there were like so many complaints that  
8 are coming from the providers. So, can you explain  
9 how maybe the Centers were not, well some were and  
10 some were not.

11 DEBORAH GODDARD: So, all Centers, all  
12 Centers, all Centers were included in the Fiscal  
13 Needs Assessment. Some are, their needs are imbedded  
14 in the building that houses them or the development  
15 that houses them and some physically that space  
16 stands alone and you can say it needs a roof or it  
17 needs new windows. Uhm so they are all included  
18 somewhere in that P&A but often it is imbedded in  
19 that.

20 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, is there,  
21 uhm like a spreadsheet that you can provide us with  
22 the Capital Repair Needs for each of the Centers?

23 DEBORAH GODDARD: Uhm in terms of the  
24 stuff I'm speaking out, in terms of the needs, the  
25 larger Capital Needs, roofs or boiler systems, that

1  
2 is imbedded in the Developments P&A and I would be  
3 able to figure out the square footage that might  
4 relate, well also some of it is not practical, right  
5 if Smith Houses has six boilers you can't ration one  
6 boiler to the Community Center so it really is  
7 embedded in that need for the overall development.

8 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay I would  
9 like to have a followup on that, because I'm thinking  
10 about certain centers, like when I look at Reed,  
11 there were some, some structural issues at Reed and  
12 that is a standalone building and when I looked at,  
13 that was one of the one that had a Community Center  
14 listed and that Community Center is clearly the  
15 Senior Center and the need was \$3,500. And then when  
16 I looked at Kingsboro Extension, that's a standalone  
17 building and there was no Capital repair need listed  
18 under the Community Center or a Center period but  
19 that is also a standalone and so I was just trying to  
20 fig... so, would that mean that there was no capital  
21 need for that particular center?

22 DEBORAH GODDARD: It would probably mean  
23 in the Component Replacement that it doesn't have a  
24 Capital Need, actually I would have to go back and  
25 look at. \$3000 doesn't rise to a Capital Need, that

1  
2 would be indicative of a repair need. So, I would  
3 have to take a look at that.

4 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, uh-huh,  
5 okay.

6 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Uhm we've been  
7 joined by, uhm Council Member Treyger and we are  
8 going to pass the question over to Council Members  
9 and then as co-Chair we can ask more questions later.  
10 But also, before you le... in terms of can you give us  
11 information, I mean you can send it later, but we  
12 want to know how you prioritize? In terms of the  
13 Capital Needs, uhm?

14 DEBORAH GODDARD: So, I will go back to  
15 the conversation on the hearing on Capital Needs, we  
16 look first to the exterior or the building, right,  
17 the roofs, the brick work because if you are not  
18 going to take care of that stuff, you could still  
19 have water infiltrating and damaging anything you do  
20 inside the building. Then we will look at systems,  
21 heating, elevators, life safety, again sort of the  
22 skeleton of a, of a building and then we look inside  
23 to things like tile, paintings, kitchens and baths.

24 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Well, we will, we  
25 will followup with some more of those questions. Uhm

1

2 Council Member Rose, since you are here really early,  
3 you have questions?

4

5 DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you Chair, uhm good  
6 morning, uhm it saddens me when I hear the, the  
7 running list of repairs uhm that our Seniors are  
8 faced to endure and you know the disrepair of our  
9 NYCHA Senior Centers is endemic of the same blatant  
10 and criminal neglect that we have seen with the  
11 overall upkeep of NYCHA housing. Uhm I had a center  
12 where the chronic seepage of raw sewage into the  
13 dedicated space at the Mariner's Harbor Senior Center  
14 led to the closing of that Center rightfully so and  
15 the dislocation of the Seniors to another Senior  
16 Center that had a totally different culture and  
17 climate, was very far from their neighborhood and was  
18 already very crowded and led to their disconnection  
19 from the community. Uhm, the fact that NYCHA has a  
20 \$32 billion deficit in terms of Capital Needs, I  
21 really would like you to tell me like where the  
22 Senior Center repairs sort of falls uhm, in, in your  
23 programming, your ideas to correct some of these  
24 things and then uhm, I have, I would like to know  
25 what the relationship is with DFTA and NYCHA in terms  
of coordination. Uhm, I had allocated funding to New

1  
2 Lane Shores, two years ago for a new air conditioning  
3 system. It has still not been installed and uhm my  
4 seniors are suffering you know greatly because of  
5 that. In addition to that, they have security doors  
6 that are inoperable and we can't seem to figure out  
7 who should, you know, be doing that work and making  
8 those, those repairs happen. Then, I'll ask another  
9 question.

10                   DAVID PRISTIN: So, first of all uhm we,  
11 we have, unfortunately we have the situation you  
12 raised with sewage back up is not the only place we  
13 have had that and it is regrettable and the  
14 inconvenience we, you know, we recognize and we are  
15 tremendously sympathetic to. I think that being  
16 said, this is, this goes to, as Deborah as our EDP  
17 for Capital mentioned this goes to the larger  
18 physical needs, these are, these are not just for the  
19 Senior Centers, these are often shared systems  
20 across, uhm for an entire development. Uhm and these  
21 situations as far as how we prioritize them. These  
22 are top priority, these are uhm there are you know,  
23 these are top priority repairs. So I think we can  
24 go, I'll pass it over to our, our Vice-President for  
25 Operations who can speak a little bit more about

1  
2 maybe some of the specifics of how we address these  
3 things, but uhm, I mean but we, we, we, from a, you  
4 know from a repair perspective these are top  
5 priorities and we address them as quickly as we can  
6 then it gets to a little bit of the how do we address  
7 the root cause to make sure that doesn't happen in  
8 the future.

9           DEBORAH ROSE: And, and don't forget I  
10 really need to understand how you address the fact  
11 that I allocated funding for, for repairs for a new  
12 air conditioning system and it still has not  
13 happened?

14           DAVID PRISTIN: What, yes, so what, we  
15 will, there are a couple of questions that you asked,  
16 so let's first, if it's okay we can get to how we  
17 prioritize uhm you know these sorts of issues.

18           DEBORAH ROSE: Sure, okay.

19           CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Council Member  
20 Rose, can you also your other question. Because we  
21 have a lot of Council Members with questions so we  
22 are trying to?

23           DEBORAH ROSE: Okay, alright. Uhm, so,  
24 uhm in that same vein, uhm the upgrades to interior  
25 spaces like at Cassidy Coals and West Britten Center

1  
2 where uhm they suffer from a lack of space and it  
3 could be just a matter of re, re-allocating space.  
4 Uhm would you be able to do that and you know the  
5 remediation of mold and the leaks? Thank you.

6 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you.

7 CAROLYN JASPER: So, I will respond to  
8 your inquiry regarding how we prioritize work orders.  
9 Uhm, absolutely you are correct regarding stoppages,  
10 the housing authority or the staff, we are  
11 responsible for addressing emergency or health  
12 related or safety issues first. So, those work  
13 orders are prioritized. So, when it comes to a  
14 stoppage, most definitely a stoppage should be  
15 identified and addressed within 24 hours. Which  
16 means when our staff responds, if they are unable to  
17 address that stoppage then they are required to  
18 procure a vendor in order to come out, address the  
19 stoppage, clean and sanitize the area. Uhm, as you  
20 know many of our work orders that we receive for our  
21 Community Centers are also in the pool of work orders  
22 that we need to address for the residents who are  
23 living within our units. So, unless it is a health  
24 and safety related issue, you know, we try to, you  
25 know again we have to address them as you know uhm

1  
2 the, the need arises. Uhm for the most part we do  
3 address our work orders for our Community Centers,  
4 non-emergency related work orders, uhm within an  
5 average of 38 days. As you know, some of the work  
6 that is needed in the Center also is related to  
7 repairs that are needed, perhaps maybe through our  
8 skilled trade staff and our skilled trade staff are  
9 also scheduled to again prepare work within those,  
10 within our apartment units. Some of the conditions  
11 that you uhm express here today, they are not  
12 acceptable but we will work on addressing you know  
13 again any health related issues but I would like to  
14 also mention that some of the issues that are  
15 presented here within the Center and within this  
16 department, we will go back and we will follow up  
17 with staff to make sure that we can work on  
18 addressing you know any issues that prompt the  
19 management staff is required to address within that  
20 Center or within the apartment.

21 DEBORAH ROSE: Ms. Jasper, I'm really  
22 concerned about the fact that I gave them money for  
23 the air conditioning and for me that's a health-  
24 related issue and it's taken 2 years and it is still  
25 not done. And, and I feel that the safety of the

1  
2 inoperable doors is also a safety issues and it just,  
3 you know baffles me why it is taking so long for  
4 these two things that are funded already to happen?

5 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay.

6 DAVID PRISTIN: So, I've, I've been told  
7 that the funding for the air conditioning, we  
8 received in July of 2018 and that work will be  
9 completed in, by June of 2019. So, this coming  
10 summer, this coming summer we will have the air  
11 conditioners in place.

12 DEBORAH ROSE: We started this two years  
13 ago. Now I don't know why you just got that money in  
14 18 but that money was allocated and this project has  
15 been going on two years.

16 DAVID PRISTIN: Okay, so, but I've been  
17 told that as far as that we will have the air  
18 conditioning in place by June of 19. June of 19.

19 DEBORAH ROSE: I am really going to hold  
20 you to it because that will make three summers that  
21 they have been without air conditioning.

22 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you Council  
23 Member Rose, we will all help you make sure that,  
24 that that center gets the air conditioners before the  
25 next summer.

1  
2           DAVID PRISTIN: Well, we, just, I, I hear  
3 your frustration and I hear that you will be on top  
4 of it and we will be on top of it as well. I, I just  
5 want to say that we hear that.

6           DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you.

7           CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: I think that's a  
8 followup that I will, Public Housing Chair, Committee  
9 Chair will work with on because NYCHA gets a lot of  
10 allocation from the Council for Capital Project and  
11 it takes very, very long.

12           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just a point  
13 of clarification. You mentioned 38 days, is it 38  
14 days to address the fix or 38 days to complete the  
15 actual? Repair?

16           CAROLYN JASPER: I apologize, let me  
17 correct my statements, the average days of the, the  
18 work order is open is 38 days. So, to, from the  
19 inception of the work order being completed through  
20 the day that it is closed out it is an average  
21 overall. So, some trades may take a little longer  
22 but it is an average of say for instance a point work  
23 orders, vendor work orders, roofing work orders. It  
24 is an average of those different crafts to complete  
25 the work and close out the work order.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: And uhm just a followup too. You mentioned that those work orders are included in the overall, like work orders like for the whole system, if a Center Director contacts NYCHA about an issue, who do they contact at NYCHA? Do they just use the same CC, they use the same exact process or is there like some liaison between the Senior Directors?

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

CAROLYN JASPER: I believe its different venues but Senior Directors can call CCC in order to place a work order for the needed repair. In addition, we do have a liaison within housing, Carl Walton that they do sometimes reach out to regarding repair related issues and those issues are related to property management staff.

17

18

19

20

CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, there is a bit of a system where the, Senior Centers and the Directors do have a direct contact with someone at NYCHA, well Carl Walton.

21

22

23

24

25

CAROLYN JASPER: And I'm sorry they should also have a report with the property manager and the property maintenance supervisor at the development as well.

1  
2 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, then are  
3 those work orders handled differently than the  
4 overall system? Like can you explain that process?

5 CAROLYN JASPER: Sure, the work order  
6 should be scheduled, because as you know, we have a  
7 limited number of skilled trained staff, right? And  
8 so, what happens is that, you know, based on I guess  
9 when the work order comes in and the type of work  
10 that comes in, we have our staff that may already be  
11 scheduled out for scheduled appointments for specific  
12 types of work. If we determine that there is a need  
13 that needs to be addressed based on the severity, we  
14 can, at times deploy specific staff to locations to  
15 inspect and address conditions based on the severity  
16 of the condition or the repair.

17 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Can I add something, so  
18 uhm all Center staff or all Community-based  
19 organizations know that they have to call the CCC  
20 Center to register a repair need. They are told to  
21 do that first. They can send a ticket. Uhm the  
22 providers can send it to DFTA with the ticket number,  
23 DFTA knows that they can send it to Carl Walton or  
24 myself uhm and we will filter it down to property  
25 management. We do encourage that each provider has a

1  
2 relationship with their property manager, we  
3 encourage them to visit the Centers and address and  
4 build their relationship but there is a process to  
5 escalate it up. To DFTA and then to NYCHA so we can  
6 all work to handle and resolve the issue.

7 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, is it, so  
8 the communication is encouraged but there is no, uhm  
9 like formal policy that says that the Senior  
10 Directors meet with the property manager to discuss  
11 the issues inside of the Centers on a monthly basis  
12 and there is like a tracking system or some kind of  
13 spreadsheet that lists all of the issues within each  
14 senior center that the property managers can address  
15 because clearly there are trends across the City, so  
16 is there anything put in place to as a formal policy?

17 DAVID PRISTIN: So, I mean as Uka said  
18 there is no formal, there is no formal set like they  
19 need to be meeting once a month. It varies from  
20 development to development uhm you know and I think  
21 it is supposed to be do the needs of the provider and  
22 the, and the property manager. We encourage it on  
23 the NYCHA side, we encourage the property management  
24 to do that with their, any of their community  
25 facilities, uhm the you know the Senior Directors on

1  
2 the, on site but it is not a formal process. There  
3 is no, there is no you need to meet once a month.

4 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: We will  
5 followup on that question but I want to give our  
6 colleagues an opportunity to ask questions. Uhm  
7 Council Member Vallone followed by Council Member  
8 Salamanca.

9 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you to both of our  
10 Chairs. Chair Chin just had a hearing last month on  
11 DFTAs ability to handle Capital Repairs and this  
12 hearing is a direct result because a lot of the  
13 questions that we received were well, we have to  
14 speak to NYCHA, we have to speak to NYCHA. David,  
15 I'm looking at your testimony, as I always do. I  
16 look at the testimony, it's the lawyer side of me,  
17 page 3 and there is nothing on that page that gives  
18 me any optimism that either NYCHA or DFTA can handle  
19 the Capital emergency that we are in. Your exact  
20 quotes are on this page, that "discussions with our  
21 partners at OMB and DFTA about how best to improve  
22 our Centers are ongoing. But given NYCHA dire  
23 financial position and more than \$30 billion in  
24 capital needs to it is difficult to accommodate both  
25 the repairs needed to secure our residents home as

1  
2 well as the fixes for our centers. The MOU is  
3 ongoing, it will be completely this year but  
4 thoughtful discussions are ongoing." That is not  
5 acceptable. It is not acceptable for us as elected  
6 officials to go back and say don't worry thoughtful  
7 conversations are ongoing or there is not enough  
8 money in the budget from the Administration to get  
9 this done. There are two major problems with this  
10 entire process, funding and the ability to get the  
11 Capital work done. So, we always want to assist on  
12 getting, we always, Margaret, everyone on Aging  
13 always fights for the Administration to get funding  
14 for DFTA across the board because DFTA gets lost in  
15 this myriad of problems and concerns and operating  
16 expenses and capital expenses and here is another  
17 situation where 14 Senior Centers, not run by DFTA  
18 but operated by NYCHA are running on an annual Budget  
19 of \$3 million but you are saying attendance has  
20 increased by 42% so if attendance is increasing by  
21 42% how is the annual budget of \$3 million staying?  
22 So two things, one I think we need to propose a  
23 separate entity or a separate Capital Improvement  
24 area, that can handle, just like we did with the  
25 schools, that can actually handle the Capital Repairs

1  
2 to Senior Centers and NYCHA because NYCHA has so much  
3 on your plate right now, I don't know how and it  
4 clearly in your own testimony here as you are saying  
5 I don't know how we can handle the emergency repairs  
6 at NYCHA versus the NYCHA Senior Centers. I think  
7 they need help, so maybe we will get outside the box  
8 and say based on the emergency that the City is in,  
9 uhm we need to prioritize these Capital Repairs at  
10 NYCHA facilities as well as NYCHA Senior Centers and  
11 DFTAs run. Has there ever been any thought of having  
12 Capital Repairs handled in a different process?

13                   DAVID PRISTIN: Can I have Deborah  
14 Goddard come up our EVP for Capital to answer this  
15 question.

16                   PAUL VALLONE: Thank you.

17                   DEBORAH GODDARD: So, to speak first to  
18 the larger question of Capital needs in general uhm  
19 and this question was raised two weeks ago at the  
20 Capital Needs uhm hearing. At the start of next Jan  
21 there was a look at moving Capital Construction  
22 Projects out of NYCHA or into a different unit or so  
23 on and so forth and really taking a look at it, uhm  
24 changing the mean or place of the work and the, the  
25 process wouldn't change the rules under which we

1  
2 operate and it wasn't feel that there was anything of  
3 efficacy in that option. In terms of Community  
4 Center work in particular, we are actually working  
5 with DDC to move a number of our Community Center  
6 including Senior Center Projects, the larger ones  
7 over to DDC to pursue so that we can uhm move them,  
8 focus on our residential units.

9           PAUL VALLONE: So, which projects are  
10 being moved over to DDC and how do we determine which  
11 projects move to DDC and stay with NYCHA versus  
12 staying with DFTA.

13           DEBORAH GODDARD: Uhm, I would have to  
14 get you the list, I don't know it off of the top of  
15 my head but it is, we are generally looking at some  
16 of the larger projects to move over to DDC which they  
17 are obviously very well equipped to handle but we can  
18 get you a list of what has gone over to DDC.

19           PAUL VALLONE: Well I would propose to  
20 the two Chairs that that's a place where we can,  
21 continue this conversation as to these, the list that  
22 is being formulated without our input as to where,  
23 which, what triggers a DDC repair, what triggers DFTA  
24 handling it on her own and as we heard, more over the  
25 last month that DFTA has six staff that handle

1  
2 Capital so I don't know how that six staff can handle  
3 all of the Capital Needs of the entire Senior  
4 population in the City. That's what these hearings  
5 are about.

6 DEBORAH GODDARD: I'm sorry, I said DDC  
7 right. Okay.

8 PAUL VALLONE: You said DDC.

9 DEBORAH GODDARD: Okay.

10 PAUL VALLONE: So, the ones that are not  
11 being sent to DDC then are they going to be handled  
12 internally through NYCHA?

13 DEBORAH GODDARD: Yes, they are handled  
14 by NYCHA. Uhm some of the work that we do, some of  
15 the design work we outsource uhm to keep things  
16 moving. I also mentioned that we've been.

17 PAUL VALLONE: Outsourced to who?

18 DEBORAH GODDARD: To a firm, you know we  
19 don't do it all inhouse is what I'm saying. We also,  
20 as I mentioned a couple of weeks ago, we, our  
21 infrastructure is stressed. The number of projects  
22 going out has increased dramatically and so we are  
23 procuring program managers to increase our  
24 infrastructure. They will deliver the projects more  
25 quickly.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PAUL VALLONE: And I think that is a path that we need to go on. I think we all realize the state of emergency that we are in and I think that, we just, we don't to blame. We want to proceed accordingly in whatever we need to do on this. Thank you Chairs for the time.

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you uhm, Council Member Salamanca, your question?

RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Yes, thank you uhm Chair Chin. Good morning everyone, uhm my uhm I represent the South Bronx. Uhm just to give you a little bit about my District. I have the third NYCHA portfolio in the City of New York. I have 15,520 residents that live in my uhm in my NYCHA developments, 6,668 units in total and there is a \$1.2 billion need, a NYCHA Capital need in my uhm in my Council District. Uhm the visuals that I have here are from 372 East 152<sup>nd</sup> Street the Melrose Mount Haven Senior Center. Uhm this Senior Center is uhm this Senior Center is underneath a NYCHA Senior Building which is an annex of the Melrose Houses. Uhm the uhm, the photo to the right is an apartment to one of the seniors here. Uhm the week of September 21<sup>st</sup>, I visited the Senior Center and the

1  
2 senior named Sarah, asked me to come up to her  
3 apartment so that we can take a look at these big  
4 holes that she had in her apartment and we went up  
5 there and this is why NYCHA did, this is what NYCHA  
6 did to remedy the issue. They took brown paper bags  
7 to cover up those big holes in her apartment and this  
8 was like this for over a year. In the Senior Center,  
9 there was a leak which was affecting the Bengal Room  
10 downstairs and that leak was coming from this  
11 apartment right here on this, on this visual that you  
12 see to the right. We visited her on September 21<sup>st</sup>,  
13 we informed NYCHA, we went there you know with the  
14 press and I returned on October 18<sup>th</sup> from that  
15 bathroom, and that leak was addressed. But it  
16 unfortunate that that senior had to live like that  
17 for one year. Uhm the photo to the right to the  
18 left, to your left is the Mount Haven Senior Center  
19 and just to give you some uhm some insight that  
20 Senior Center serves as on a daily basis 150 to 200  
21 seniors in my, in my community and the bag that you  
22 see there is in the dining room area, where they eat,  
23 where they have breakfast, where they have lunch and  
24 where they have programming. Imagine having to sit  
25 underneath a bag full of water while you are eating,

1  
2 avoiding from getting wet when it rains and so that's  
3 not a pipe, that's the roof, that Senior Center the  
4 way that it is built, the roof on the side, there is,  
5 no units on top of it and that roof when it rains  
6 outside it rains inside. You are aware of this  
7 problem. You all are aware of this problem and it is  
8 a shame that my seniors have to live like this on a  
9 daily basis when it rains. Commissioner, uhm I have  
10 a question for you? When was the last time that you  
11 met with the Mayor, Mayor de Blasio, I'm just  
12 curious? Have you ever met with Mayor de Blasio?

13 CARYN RESNICK: Now in this acting role  
14 for my third day, so, uhm no I have not met with the  
15 Mayor in my new capacity.

16 PAUL VALLONE: Interesting, I hope you  
17 get to meet with Mayor de Blasio before his tenure is  
18 over and I really hope that you know in your capacity  
19 as the uhm the you will be the Commissioner of DFTA,  
20 that you can have a true conversation with the Mayor,  
21 let him know how NYCHA is failing it seniors and how  
22 you have to work with NYCHA and you are providing a  
23 Senior Center in a NYCHA facility and my seniors, are  
24 suffering in these senior centers. I have no  
25 questions, I just wanted to make this statement

1  
2 because I am disgusted by the services that NYCHA has  
3 given my community and my seniors in my District.

4 Thank you, Madam Chair.

5 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you, I think I  
6 will do a followup question for you? Is that, does  
7 DFTA monitor all the complaints of the tickets that  
8 the Center call in? And so how do you make sure that  
9 those repairs get done and how do you coordinate with  
10 NYCHA to make sure that the repair happens?

11 CARYN RESNICK: So, our Center Directors  
12 know to put in a ticket request to NYCHA, usually, I  
13 can't say always, we are informed, our program also  
14 serves and we know about what kind of repairs and  
15 maintenance. They come to us to help do advocacy.  
16 We have a very good working relationship; Karen  
17 Taylor and her team will reach out to Uka or Carl uhm  
18 to work on making sure the repairs get done in a  
19 timely way. Since the time of our last hearing, this  
20 issue was raised. We have been in talks with NYCHA  
21 and we have agreed to formalize this system, whereby  
22 we would get monthly reports about all of the ticket  
23 requests that are in from any of our centers. We  
24 think that will be extremely helpful as well as  
25 Capital Projects so we can help keep track of those

1

2

too. So, we are going to put some kind of tracking system in place immediately.

3

4

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Is that part of that MOU that you were talking about uhm?

5

6

CARYN RESNICK: This is independent of that MOU.

7

8

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Okay and what's the progress of that MOU that is supposed to be done in the beginning of the year and this is the end of the year already?

9

10

11

12

CARYN RESNICK: I think uhm we testified that those conversations are still ongoing.

13

14

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: But don't you have a deadline. I mean it was supposed to be the beginning of the year?

15

16

17

DAVID PRISTIN: We, we don't, there's no formal deadline. We had been, we were hoping for an MOU by now, it unfortunately is not complete and we are still working towards finalizing it.

18

19

20

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Who is the one tying it up?

21

22

23

DAVID PRISTIN: There is no, there is no one tying it up. I mean there are three different agencies in conversations, OMB, NYCHA and DFTA.

24

25

1  
2 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: So, OMB is the one  
3 that is tying it up right?

4 DAVID PRISTIN: There are, they are, we  
5 are all finalizing the details.

6 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: We will talk to  
7 OMB. Uhm Council Member Ayala followed by Council  
8 Member Gjonaj.

9 DIANA AYALA: Good afternoon, thank you  
10 Madam Chair. Uhm I am really excited about this  
11 hearing because this is kind of what I live and  
12 breathe for. I have too much experience with both  
13 the DFTA Senior Center part of it and the NYCHA part  
14 of it. I think I wanted to make a couple of comments  
15 because I have to take the opportunity while you are  
16 here but I have several concerns so, one of them is  
17 the Wagner Houses Senior Center which is a smaller  
18 Senior Center that was not transferred over to the  
19 Department for the Aging because it didn't meet the  
20 requirement of the 60+ participants per day. Since  
21 then, we have through initiatives that were created  
22 by our, by our Chair Margaret Chin been able to  
23 supplement some of the funding for that Senior Center  
24 by \$30,000 a year which has allowed them a lot of, an  
25 opportunity to provide more recreational activities

1  
2 and has increased their uhm daily uhm attendance  
3 numbers. However, their space is so small that they  
4 would never, ever, ever, ever be able to meet the 60+  
5 person requirement because there is just not  
6 conducive to that type of programming and I wonder  
7 and I know on the show, of Latoya we had a  
8 conversation about possibly finding them an  
9 alternative space within Wagner Houses that we can  
10 move them to that would allow them the capacity to  
11 grow and then be transferred over to DFTA. So, I  
12 wonder if that is a conversation that ever  
13 transferred over to once the, the Chair transitions  
14 out of NYCHA and it is any intent to move the Senior  
15 Center and allow them the ability to grow.

16 CARYN RESNICK: I do remember that  
17 conversation I remember that meeting, uhm Council  
18 Member Ayala and I think we were looking at the  
19 daycare center to move the Senior Program to but  
20 that's being uhm renovated for management offices at  
21 Wagner's at this point. There, there are no spaces  
22 that we can move the, the Senior Center to unless we  
23 uhm, we can continue discussing it.

24 DIANA AYALA: I, I would appreciate it  
25 because I think as a service to the Senior Center,

1  
2 they are making a reattempt to grow you know their  
3 attendance and they are doing that successfully but  
4 because of capacity issues they are just not able to  
5 do that. Uhm.

6 CARYN RESNICK: I am able to do that. I  
7 can that it is a shared building with the Community  
8 Center and the Center Directors do have the ability  
9 to use the other rooms during in the morning hours,  
10 so you can expand and have an exercise program in the  
11 multi-purpose room or do a computer class in the uhm  
12 it can be shared and they can utilize more of the  
13 space so uhm I could schedule a meeting with SCAN who  
14 is operating that space.

15 DIANA AYALA: That would require a lot of  
16 coordination. I was there last night in the Center  
17 downstairs is used by children most of the time. And  
18 so there is a lot of uhm you know extra uhm furniture  
19 and I just think it's not really the nicest  
20 environment for uhm programming for the elderly. In  
21 regards to the Middlebrook Senior Center. I have  
22 concerns because now that we have, we have an infill  
23 project at Millbrook Houses for 100% affordable  
24 housing that is coming with a new brand-new Senior  
25 Center. I have been fighting for a contract for that

1  
2 Senior Center because it was promised to the  
3 residents of that development when it was proposed  
4 that we develop the Senior building uhm that they  
5 would get a brand-new Senior Center. Right now, they  
6 were, what they have is what was considered a  
7 satellite program uhm that is actually part of the  
8 Botanas (SP?) contract but the only reason that it  
9 has continued ot stay open is because Botanas (SP?)  
10 was displaced because of the Capital repair work that  
11 they needed to be done but that is already finalized  
12 and that center is due to open relatively soon and my  
13 concern is that one Botanas (SP?) opens that the  
14 Millbrook uhm satellite will shut down and leave that  
15 part of the community without uhm those, those  
16 services. Uhm I would implore that there be  
17 conversation about continuing to keep it open until  
18 we find a resolution because that is a really needed  
19 resource for that community, uhm so that's more of a  
20 comment. At Johnson Community Center where I have  
21 seniors, not technically a Senior Center but I have  
22 seniors that go there for an unofficial senior  
23 center. We have had the brand-new community center  
24 seven maybe, eight years old. The roof is leaking  
25 around. There, I believe it is still under warranty

1  
2 but there hasn't been any discussion. My predecessor  
3 Melissa Mark-Viverito put in uhm resources to repair  
4 the roof. The roof work has not been done nor have  
5 we or the provider been notified of when the work  
6 will be done and if that money is going to come from  
7 the warranty, if the warranty is going to cover the  
8 cost of the, of the repair work or if the money is  
9 coming from what Melissa Mark-Viverito allocated, so  
10 I would appreciate if I could get some information on  
11 that as well in terms of a timeline and then that's  
12 when at least I would say at least Coursey Houses. I  
13 think that NYCHA really missed the mark when there  
14 was, when the idea of creating Senior Housing in  
15 NYCHA, it was a great idea, right, I think it was  
16 well-intentioned but you cannot create senior housing  
17 without the additional services being offered in the  
18 building. So, if you have a section II building you  
19 have 24 hours security which is not provided at  
20 NYCHA, you have maybe half split-day security which  
21 is a huge issue in my, for my constituents  
22 specifically, we have had prostitution, we've had  
23 drug arrests, we've had people sleeping in the  
24 hallways. These are vulnerable adults that are not  
25 alone in a building without property security without

1  
2 a social worker, without anybody really paying  
3 attention to what is happening. The, the repairs in  
4 those buildings needs to be a little bit more  
5 expeditious. If you have an older adult who has not  
6 even fat layered in their body, when it's hot they  
7 get really hot. When it's cold they get really,  
8 really cold. These are you know things that we don't  
9 really consider as we are looking at tenant but these  
10 are those that come with specific needs that need to  
11 be considered. So, I think I would love to see there  
12 be a system created that would ensure that when an  
13 elevator breaks in a building where you have older  
14 adults that there is somebody there ASAP. That when  
15 there is a leak in the lobby or I have had seniors  
16 that have had leaks, I've had water coming up from  
17 the sink and they are like trying the best that they  
18 can you know to clean that up. That is a floor  
19 hazard, a floor hazard for an older adult coming in  
20 light of that situation. It is not the same thing as  
21 if I fall and break a leg. I'm sure, I, I have a  
22 faster ability to recuperate. It's not the same  
23 when you are an older adult so I think that there are  
24 a lot of things that we can do better. I don't, I  
25 don't think that the idea of removing social workers

1  
2 from these buildings as a great idea. I understand  
3 that NYCHA is not in the business of parading social  
4 services but there could have been a more concerted  
5 effort to bring in a provider that could have  
6 provided that service because the expectation that  
7 the Senior Centers in some of those buildings is  
8 providing that service is not factual. I worked in  
9 those Senior Centers. It is not happening. We do  
10 not have the resources to really adequately reach to  
11 all of those tenants and invite them to come and join  
12 the Senior Center so that is not happening and there  
13 is no coordination between DFTA, NYCHA or those  
14 residents to ensure that it is. Those are my  
15 comments, thank you.

16 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you Council  
17 Member Ayala, I hope DFTA and NYCHA took notes of all  
18 of your comments. Uhm we have questions by Council  
19 Member Gjonaj followed by Council Member Treyger.

20 MARK GJONAJ: Thank you Chair. We should  
21 be judged as a City by how we treat our seniors,  
22 especially the most vulnerable seniors, those that  
23 live in our NYCHA facilities. During the summer, at  
24 Pellham Housing the Sue Ginsberg Senior Center, it  
25 took nearly a year to determine who was going to be

1  
2 responsible for the repair of an air conditioning  
3 unit. Not a replacement, a repair, a repunt. NYCHA,  
4 DFTA, JOSA, most of the summer, those seniors went  
5 without an air conditioner, so participation was low,  
6 almost nonexistent, a disservice to the Center, the  
7 seniors the complex. Throggs Neck Housing, Senior  
8 Housing, we have some German-made boilers that  
9 require a special mechanic to come out and make the  
10 basic repairs which takes days because of this  
11 particular boiler and the maintenance boiler  
12 mechanics that we currently have contracted are not  
13 up to par to work on this particular boiler.  
14 Meanwhile, my seniors go without heat, hot water,  
15 sporadic heat, sporadic hot water, it is beyond  
16 forgiving or beyond explanations. There are no more  
17 excuses. The seniors have had it, that falls on the  
18 elected officials to make the basic of calls to get  
19 something one. My question is what's the difference  
20 between a repair and a capital improvement, is it a  
21 dollar amount.

22 DAVID PRISTIN: I'm going to bring  
23 Deborah Goddard up to answer that question.

24 DEBORAH GODDARD: Good afternoon, the  
25 dollar amount is one indices but in general it is uhm

1  
2 a Capital improvement is something that is simply not  
3 bringing something back to working order. It is  
4 something that is relates to a system and improves  
5 uhm increase the value of the asset so the dollar  
6 value can mean indices but it is not the totality of  
7 the question.

8 MARK GJONAJ: So, a pump for an air  
9 conditioning unit, I would imagine would be a basic  
10 repair?

11 DEBORAH GODDARD: Correct.

12 MARK GJONAJ: For it to take several  
13 months, from May through August I believe to replace  
14 a pump is that acceptable to anyone on this panel?  
15 Alright, if you are familiar with this issue at Sue  
16 Ginsberg Center, the Pellham Housing, do you want to  
17 elaborate?

18 DAVID PRISTIN: We I mean it's not  
19 acceptable for seniors to be without AC when in the  
20 heat of the summer uhm hold on one second.

21 DEBORAH GODDARD: So, there was a  
22 contractor hired to convert the system from heating  
23 to cooling and they discovered the pump was broken  
24 and there was, uhm the provider reached out to DFTA  
25

1  
2 and I think eventually they decided to fund it. It  
3 was funded by DFTA to repair but it did take a while.

4 MARK GJONAJ: It took the whole summer.

5 DEBORAH GODDARD: Yeah, sorry.

6 MARK GJONAJ: For a basic pump. First it  
7 took several months or to determine who was going to  
8 be responsible is it going to be by NYCHA, DFTA, JASLA,  
9 it became a whole complex debate over responsibility.  
10 That was, that should begin with getting a contractor  
11 there to switch it from heat to AC which took quite a  
12 bit of time.

13 DEBORAH GODDARD: Yes.

14 MARK GJONAJ: Then the pump was removed,  
15 no one could re-locate the pump, I would imagine  
16 because nobody wanted to accept responsibility for  
17 replacement or repair.

18 DEBORAH GODDARD: So, they have to get a  
19 quote and I think it was about \$10,000 and DFTA did  
20 agree to fund it but it did take a while to repair.  
21 They had to order it.

22 MARK GJONAJ: Commissioner, you indicated  
23 that you will be receiving monthly reports, I come  
24 from real estate, monthly reports for repairs or  
25 capital needs is not sufficient. That would mean in

1  
2 essence a month to two months can go by without you  
3 realizing that there is a repair that is needed and  
4 not being addressed. You have to come up with.

5 CARYN RESNICK: We get phone calls and  
6 emails on a daily basis when a repair needs to be  
7 made but I think by having monthly reporting we will  
8 have the full picture because there may be things  
9 that have not come to our attention so it is really  
10 a.

11 MARK GJONAJ: I just want to share a  
12 scenario with you Commissioner?

13 CARYN RESNICK: Okay.

14 MARK GJONAJ: Alright let's so that you  
15 have a report on November 30<sup>th</sup>, December 1<sup>st</sup> we have a  
16 repair. You will not know about that repair in  
17 essence until December 31<sup>st</sup> that it hasn't gotten  
18 addressed which would I would imagine then trigger  
19 some kind of investigation after you have the next  
20 report and you have time to go through it and  
21 followup. In essence, you have months go by on the  
22 basic and simplest of repairs that somehow just fell  
23 through the cracks. I come out of real estate, we  
24 never had monthly reports, it was daily reports. And  
25 you track repairs. And it became the responsibility

1  
2 and the burden of the managers to respond as quickly  
3 as possible.

4           DAVID PRISTIN: So, what I, what I would  
5 say is as the Commissioner said, we, we, communicate  
6 daily, our point person Carl Walton and DFTAs point  
7 people on repairs. The monthly report we think and  
8 we can modify as, as we feel it is helpful, our  
9 staff. You know DFTA is not in the business of  
10 property manager and we are, we are managing those  
11 repairs. We are in daily conversation with our, with  
12 our partners in DFTA. The report is meant to give a  
13 wide view of what is going on to make sure if that if  
14 they were things that are slipping through the  
15 cracks. But the, monthly reports are not a  
16 replacement for those daily conversations.

17           MARK GJONAJ: You bring up something  
18 interesting. You said DFTA is not in the management  
19 business and the repair business but yet you are. If  
20 you are not, then we have real problems. If you are  
21 not in the management business, you are not in the  
22 repair business what business are you in?

23           DAVID PRISTIN: So, what I, what I was  
24 saying is that NYCHA is in the Asset Management and  
25 Repair Business. DFTA is in the Management Business

1  
2 and we work closely with them on monitoring and  
3 communicating as repairs are needed, but what I'm  
4 saying is that we, that the reports do not replace  
5 the daily phone calls.

6           MARK GJONAJ: God help our seniors, God  
7 help NYCHA. I don't know what else we can do for  
8 them. We never get an answer. We see no proactive  
9 approach to the issues and it is unfortunate and  
10 there is nothing on the horizons. I cannot wait  
11 until we privatize the management of NYCHA and get  
12 rid of a whole lot of you.

13           CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Council Member,  
14 thank you for your questions but I, before Council  
15 Member Treyger. Oh, we have been joined by Council  
16 Member Torres. I do want to say something positive,  
17 because yesterday in my District we had a tour with  
18 the general manager of Veto, Mr. Chula and with the  
19 staff and the respond time to heat and hot water has  
20 greatly improved since last year and that took a lot  
21 of work in terms of organizing personnel, putting  
22 more staff on site, working with management and  
23 development and so what I hear and what I see from my  
24 constituent I am happy that there are quicker  
25 results. So, it means that things can be done but

1  
2 you go to focus and you got to put the resources  
3 there and so coordination between NYCHA and DFTA has  
4 to be better, that fixing the Centers has to be  
5 priority and you have to figure a way. How do we  
6 make sure that when repairs are needed that it  
7 doesn't get to the state? So, I am confident that  
8 you can work it out because I have seen it, alright,  
9 uhm so we just hope that it just keeps on going the  
10 right way uhm and we are here to support uhm the  
11 Council. We have been supporting a lot of our  
12 Centers and we want to make sure that our seniors are  
13 taken care of. So, we are, we are willing to be your  
14 partner and let's work together and just make the  
15 lives of our seniors better, where they live, where  
16 they go on a, on a daily, to the Senior Center.  
17 Where they are going to have fun. We want to make  
18 sure that they are in a good place. Uhm so Council  
19 Member Treyger follow with questions.

20 MARK TREYGER: Uhm, thank you to both  
21 Chairs of holding this very important and I think  
22 timely hearing. Uhm I just, uhm I would like to say  
23 that my frustration and my concerns about the pace,  
24 the slow pace of senior recovery is probably well  
25 documented by now but I would like to bring to NYCHAs

1  
2 and DFTAs attention an issue that I think that both  
3 agencies should be aware of already because I have  
4 been in touch with the provider and, and uhm seniors  
5 from the Center. Haber Houses in Coney Island as we  
6 are still undergoing Hurricane Sandy recovery work,  
7 it was brought to my attention that the seniors there  
8 and I would just like to point out my colleagues and  
9 to the public, the seniors there are predominantly,  
10 these are Holocaust survivors, World War II veterans,  
11 these are very, very vulnerable, fragile, seniors who  
12 are just trying to enjoy the golden years of their  
13 lives and spending time with each other, have no heat  
14 whatever in the Center. NYCHA has been called down,  
15 uhm I was told that folks came down and did not make  
16 any repairs and just left. We have then been in the  
17 dark about what is happening. So, they are cold, it  
18 is cold outside today and uhm you know we talk a lot  
19 about making sure that we avoid social isolation, we  
20 avoid which is another issue that the Chair has  
21 talked a lot about and worked on. This Center is  
22 life for these seniors. This is a place for them to  
23 really has extended their life and so I would like to  
24 get some sort of clear picture about when will the  
25 heat be restored to this Center? Secondly, I'm

1  
2 hearing that and NYCHA is doing work here so I'm not  
3 clear why this is happening but there is significant  
4 flooding happening in the building and when it, when  
5 the flood water. When it rains, water from the, from  
6 the roof is leaking down to the Center, causing  
7 flooding and there are security cameras, NYCHAs  
8 cameras have been damaged so there is no, there is  
9 uhm information about whether they are being  
10 repaired, when they are being repaired, so there are  
11 leaks, you got no heat but what gets me is that NYCHA  
12 you know received \$3 billion from FEMA for a lot of  
13 basic repairs and work that should have been done  
14 already. But I, I, I would just like to get an  
15 answer from NYCHA and DFTA, what is the status of  
16 getting heat by Haber Houses and what's the status of  
17 repairing these chronic leaks that they are suffering  
18 from as well?

19                   DAVID PRISTIN: Uhm, hold, hold on one  
20 second. We will, what we are working on it right now  
21 and we will get you an answer in the ne.. you know  
22 right now so let us, let us have our folks reach out  
23 to some folks and we will, we will get back to you?

24                   MARK TREYGER: I mean I would like an  
25 answer today?

1  
2           DAVID PRISTIN: Yeah, no, no, no if we  
3 can get, we will reach out now and if we can get an  
4 answer to you like in the next couple of minutes, we  
5 will get that to you.

6           MARK TREYGER: And I also think that it  
7 is important that you hold your staff accountable in  
8 the sense, if they come down there, because a  
9 complaint was made, folks did come down, didn't do  
10 anything, didn't speak to anybody. It's  
11 unacceptable. So just basic decency, communication,  
12 let the Senior Center Director know, uhm let the, let  
13 the staff know what is going on. So, in addition to  
14 making the repair, we need to talk to staff you know  
15 treating people with some basic respect. It is  
16 unacceptable. So, I would, I am going to follow up  
17 with folks here because I would like an answer today  
18 and the repair should be made immediately. Uhm  
19 anything from DFTA or from the Commissioner on this  
20 issue?

21           CARYN RESNICK: Just, I guess I just  
22 wanted to let you know that we received an email from  
23 the program yesterday about the heat, we reached out  
24 to NYCHA, NYCHA responded right away, uhm with some  
25 questions about ticket numbers and also indicating

1  
2 that they were following up right away. So, I can't  
3 speak to the on-site experience but I just kind of  
4 wanted to give you that an example of the way it does  
5 work. Uhm emails were flying around yesterday about  
6 this, so hopefully that will help.

7 MARK TREYGER: But I just want to, you  
8 know, again the definition on followup is sending  
9 someone out to not do anything?

10 CARYN RESNICK: G... no, understood.

11 MARK TREYGER: So, it's just, it's just  
12 not acceptable. These are people who are still  
13 dealing with a lot of other issues in the community,  
14 this has got, this has to be resolved as soon as  
15 possible and I will be following up with NYCHA today.  
16 Thank you. Thank you Chair.

17 MARK GJONAJ: Thank you Madam Chairwoman  
18 I have a question for NYCHA. I am curious to know  
19 the difference between the repair process and DYCD  
20 overseeing centers versus DFTA overseeing Centers.  
21 My understanding is that DYCD has its own capital  
22 fund is that correct?

23 DAVID PRISTIN: DYCD has about \$2 million  
24 in expense funding to handle uhm basic repairs.

1  
2                   MARK GJONAJ: Is there a comparable  
3 program with DFTA?

4                   CARYN RESNICK: Not at this moment, that  
5 is part of the ongoing conversations about the MOU  
6 but we go ahead and make those repairs uhm and if we  
7 can't pay for them within our budget then we go to  
8 OMB to ask for funding. So, we do it sort of on a  
9 pay as we go sort of basis. And since DFTA is  
10 overseeing the operation of these Centers, NYCHA is  
11 the owner but DFTA is effectively the operator or the  
12 contractors that you hire are operating these  
13 Centers, who is responsible for addressing the  
14 capital needs of these Centers? Is it the City or is  
15 it NYCHA? What is the de Blasio Administration on  
16 that?

17                   CARYN RESNICK: So, we've been discussing  
18 this uhm right now our arrangement with NYCHA is that  
19 when it's a capital building wide kind of out of,  
20 outside the envelope type of situation and NYCHA  
21 makes the repair and if it is something that is more  
22 of a minor repair, within the Senior Center then we  
23 work with the sponsor to make sure that there is  
24 funding to do that. If it's painting or replacing  
25 tiles or.

1  
2 MARK GJONAJ: Need to know the minor  
3 repairs stem from the larger capital needs so as long  
4 as those capital needs persist you are going to be  
5 throwing money into an abyss.

6 CARYN RESNICK: Exactly.

7 MARK GJONAJ: So, the question is, the  
8 position of the de Blasio's Administration is that  
9 it's NYCHA obligation to meet, what's the overall  
10 capital needs of all of your Centers?

11 DAVID PRISTIN: Of all, of all of our  
12 Centers, so the Community ... I'm going to bring  
13 Deborah Goddard up, but the broadly, well, let me  
14 have Deborah explain what the overall need for  
15 Community Centers are.

16 DEBORAH GODDARD: Good afternoon Council  
17 Member, uhm overall the need for our Community  
18 Center's discrete needs just means just relates what  
19 is inside the four walls is about ½ billion dollars,  
20 but as I was saying earlier that's not the entire  
21 need, because again if it is a heating plant issue or  
22 a roof issue, uhm those needs are imbedded in the P&A  
23 inside the, the P&A for the building or the  
24 development, so, it is well beyond a half a billion  
25 dollars.

1  
2 MARK GJONAJ: And you scarcely have  
3 enough funding for the most essential needs of your  
4 portfolio so what, what capital funding can you  
5 allocate to address the ½ billion-dollar worth of  
6 minimal capital needs at our Community Centers?

7 CARYN RESNICK: As you well know we apply  
8 the same order of work, so if it is a roof uhm if it  
9 is a roof in the building it gets attention. If it  
10 is a roof soley for the Senior Center it is not going  
11 to rise to the level of the roof over residential  
12 units. Uhm, we do pay attention then to things like  
13 heating systems, uhm.

14 MARK GJONAJ: But it is fair to say that  
15 you have no capital budget for your Community  
16 Centers?

17 CARYN RESNICK: We have very little  
18 capital available outside of the discretionary  
19 funding that the Council gives us. Thank you.

20 MARK GJONAJ: So, if the position of the  
21 de Blasio's Administration is that it is NYCHA  
22 responsibility and we know that NYCHA has no capital  
23 funding for the needs of the Community Centers then  
24 it seems like everyone here is just content to say,  
25 there is nothing that we can do. That these

1  
2 buildings are going to be an ever-stated deepening  
3 disrepair. There is no funding to take care of them.  
4 Is that, is that a fair characterization of?

5 CARYN RESNICK: I think it is harsh, I  
6 understand why you might articulate it that way but I  
7 think that is harsh. I don't think any of us have  
8 given up on trying to find out how to address the  
9 capital needs but you are right, we simply do not  
10 have the \$32 billion we need right now, we don't have  
11 a solution for it. Uhm.

12 MARK GJONAJ: But even though the City  
13 through DFTA and DYCD routinely operate you Centers  
14 there is no commitment from the City to addressing  
15 the capital needs of those Centers?

16 CARYN RESNICK: I think for the City we  
17 have prioritized the roofs and the boiler work and as  
18 you know there has been significant investment from  
19 the City in those two items.

20 MARK GJONAJ: Well, significant  
21 investment for the general portfolio but not for the  
22 Community Centers, right? The subject of today's  
23 hearing is the Community Centers. There has been no  
24 commitment from the City.

1  
2           CARYN RESNICK: Right, all I'm saying is  
3 we have prioritized roofs and heating systems across  
4 our portfolio.

5           MARK GJONAJ: Now NYCHA made a decision  
6 in 2015 to priori, to privatize the operation of the  
7 Centers, right? To transfer control from the  
8 Authority to DFTA and DYCD, right? Right, that was  
9 about four years ago, or nearly four years ago, maybe  
10 3-1/2 years ago, why only now are you beginning the  
11 process of formulating an MOU? We've known for years  
12 and David Pristin and I have had multiple  
13 conversations that there was a lack of clarity about  
14 who was responsible for what. That not for profits  
15 were constantly receiving violations from the  
16 Department of Health and it was not clear whether  
17 DFTA was responsible for the repairs or NYCHA was  
18 responsible for the repairs, that was four year ago  
19 and now you are beginning the process of delineating  
20 rules and responsibility, what did it take so long?

21           DAVID PRISTIN: So, we have, the MOU is  
22 still in process. That being said..

23           MARK GJONAJ: And it's not even, it's not  
24 even done. You are in only, you are in the midst of

1  
2 creating an MOU but it is not even done, four years  
3 later.

4           DAVID PRISTIN: So, yes, we, the MOU is  
5 not done and we are continuing to work towards it  
6 between us, DFTA and OMB. Uhm, but that doesn't mean  
7 that we have been having ongoing conversations and  
8 have, and have formalized uhm the processes and some  
9 of the standard, you know kind of procedures that we  
10 take when addressing you know the various repair  
11 needs. So, we have now, we now have a better  
12 understanding of at what point does the provider work  
13 with DFTA to secure a vendor. Uhm at what point does  
14 NYCHA is NYCHA responsible for repairs. So, we have,  
15 so we have..

16           MARK GJONAJ: What do you mean by  
17 formalize? Is it in writing?

18           DAVID PRISTIN: We have, I mean we have,  
19 we have, we have let me say, yeah, it's in practice.  
20 So, we don't.

21           MARK GJONAJ: Like known only to the  
22 Agency insiders and not to the rest of us.

23           CARYN RESNICK: No, and to your network  
24 for providers.

1  
2 MARK GJONAJ: Has something in writing  
3 but given, like here are the rules and  
4 responsibilities?

5 CARYN RESNICK: No, it is not  
6 memorialized yet in an MOU but in practice we have a  
7 very effective working relationship and our sponsors  
8 know to reach out to us, they reach out to NYCHA and  
9 we work collaborative to make sure that the repairs  
10 are made.

11 MARK GJONAJ: Okay, I'm sure we have all  
12 heard complaints from not for profits. I think your  
13 perception of what you character as an effective  
14 working relationship is quite different from what  
15 I've heard from not for profit. My time is over but  
16 it baffles me that it has taken so long to even begin  
17 the process of defining who is responsible for what  
18 after, four years after transferring control of these  
19 Centers to DFTA and DYCD.

20 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: I think I wanted to  
21 follow up with that, if that, from our last hearing,  
22 about the capital needs of the Centers, is DFTA  
23 working with the provider? Is there an assessment of  
24 each Center's Capital Need? I mean if we have that  
25 assessment then we can advocate for a Capital Budget.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I mean right now DFTA doesn't have a Capital Budget, right? So, if you have a Capital Budget and if that Capital Budget came from working with providers to, make an assessment. Okay this Center needs to repair X, Y, and Z and they need this much money and then we can go to the Administration and advocate so that repairs get done and the Center can also be upgraded. I mean we start with the repair but a lot of Centers, they really need to get upgraded. Make it nicer for our seniors so we need to know, so does DFTA are you starting that process, in terms of what the real Capital Needs are for the Center? Can you give us uhm that request number so that we have an idea? And that we can help fight for a Capital Budget for DFTA?

KAREN TAYLOR: NYCHA is going to have to answer that question and so from the DFTA side, no we are not, it is not in our purview to do that, this is a NYCHA responsibility.

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: But you are talking for, you are talking about for all the Centers that DFTA operates in NYCHA? Right? Okay but somebody right, you are working together so it would be great if you can come up with the Capital Need for each of these Centers that are operating in NYCHA facilities

1  
2 so then we can work with DFTA because you provide the  
3 oversight to these Centers that you should have a  
4 Capital Budget to take care of these Centers. Is  
5 that part of the MOU?

6 CARYN RESNICK: No, I think at this  
7 point, going back to what I said earlier for the  
8 Capital Needs which is not upgrade as I mentioned  
9 before, just replacing kind our physical needs  
10 assessment is the guiding document but again it has a  
11 couple of complications. One being it is not an  
12 upgrade which is a lot of, a lot of Centers want  
13 upgrades in the kitchens, cooking facilities, uhm  
14 more importantly a lot of the Capital Needs may be a  
15 heating system or the sewer system and that is going  
16 to be part of a mu... that is part of the \$32 billion.

17 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: I know I keep  
18 hearing the \$32 billion but that is, that is the  
19 larger Capital Need but meanwhile for, I think  
20 working with DFTA, there has got to be some also  
21 immediate relief, immediate solution to really  
22 working with the Cen... and we are going to hear from  
23 the Centers.

24 CARYN RESNICK: If I may.  
25

1

2

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: It cannot be like  
it's such a complicated, difficult problem and we  
can't get a handle on it.

5

6

CARYN RESNICK: But if I may, let me go  
back to the concrete example. They mentioned  
overheating in Smith Houses. That is a heating plant  
issue, right? That can't be solved just inside the  
four walls.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: I understand but  
that also in that Center they are also coming to me  
asking for Capital dollars to upgrade their kitchen.  
Now DFTA should have that in your Capital Budget but  
you don't have a Capital Budget. You should have a  
Capital Budget. So, that's what I'm saying with each  
Center to really assess what their needs are and how  
can we all work together to meet that need? That's  
all I'm asking is to really sit down with the Centers  
that you have oversight, let's look at what the  
Capital Needs are, what is that dollar amount? So,  
that we have something to work with, to help fight  
for that Budget that you need.

23

24

25

CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Question,  
have you received a list from some of your partners

1  
2 that work in Senior Centers about the Capital Repair  
3 Needs? Have you received a list?

4 KAREN TAYLOR: Yes, we get ongoing  
5 requests from our providers and we, we do track them  
6 and we have a list and as we have funding, we go  
7 ahead and make put in new kitchens.

8 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, NYCHA  
9 have you received the list?

10 CARYN RESNICK: We don't have any regular  
11 lists no.

12 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

13 CARYN RESNICK: We don't have a list of  
14 requests from providers, no.

15 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Have you ever  
16 sat down with your partners that operate Senior  
17 Centers and come up with a process or language that  
18 would work toward the MOU from each of. Okay let me  
19 just, UNH, just using them for an example, have you  
20 set down with UNH and has UNH provided you with lists  
21 of their Capital Repair Needs for the Senior Centers  
22 that they actually work in? And have you utilized  
23 that list to come up with a process that will work  
24 toward the MOU? Because to my understanding you  
25 have?

1  
2                   DAVID PRISTIN:  So, I feel that you are  
3 ask... the questions that you are asking the two  
4 agencies are slightly different questions?  The  
5 question that you are asking DFTA is do you have the  
6 wish list of the things that you would like to  
7 upgrade to be able to provide adequate, adequate or  
8 upgraded services.

9                   CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL:  So that's  
10 different.

11                   DAVID PRISTIN:  That's different.

12                   CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL:  And that's  
13 why I asked NYCHA.

14                   DAVID PRISTIN:  So, we have not, we have  
15 not received that list.  What we have received and we  
16 sat down with UNH and other providers is whether  
17 there are, if there are violations, if there are you  
18 know things that are related to infrastructure, that  
19 we've gotten, we've gotten that list from them and  
20 we've calculated.  And that's, a lot of that stuff is  
21 included in the P&A and it is good sometimes.

22                   CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL:  And what did  
23 you do with that?

24                   DAVID PRISTIN:  What did we do with that?

25                   CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL:  Yes.

1  
2           DAVID PRISTIN: I mean at the time we had  
3 cal, we had basically, it helped us look at what was  
4 the physical needs of to get to the going back to  
5 what Deborah, uhm our you know Executive Vice-  
6 President Deborah Goddard had explained is what did  
7 it take the get the Centers into a state of good  
8 repair? And in accordance with the P&A. We also  
9 looked at.

10           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, that is  
11 separate, that is P&A, that's separate from a wish  
12 list. Right?

13           DAVID PRISTIN: Right.

14           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, continue  
15 on those lines.

16           DAVID PRISTIN: So, then we had also had  
17 conversations about what, at the time this was part  
18 of our ongoing conversation with DFTA about what does  
19 it take for the ongoing break and fix maintenance of  
20 the, of the Centers and that is what has lead to this  
21 now, this kind of clarifying of understanding of  
22 where the, of where we break out the break and fix  
23 simple repairs within the four walls of the Center,  
24 that is, that is, addressed by the provider with  
25 DFTAs help and identifying a vendor to address the

1  
2 issue and the larger infrastructure issues that are  
3 dealt with by NYCHA.

4 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: And then once  
5 you have that information and that intel, how does  
6 that get incorporated into a draft of the MOU  
7 document that would eventually come to some kind of  
8 a.

9 DAVID PRISTIN: So, the MOU would  
10 memorialize the practice that we have, that we  
11 currently have in place.

12 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, who's at  
13 the table when you have conversations around this  
14 MOU?

15 DAVID PRISTIN: It is, it's NYCHA, DFTA  
16 and OMB.

17 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Who in OMB?

18 DAVID PRISTIN: I mean it's a, it's a  
19 var... there are a number of folks who have eyes on  
20 this. It includes folks who are involved in the  
21 funding of both agencies, it is also, it is also,  
22 there is legal, there is legal teams on both sides  
23 who review this and then there are the program people  
24 who are actually doing the work. So, there is a  
25

1  
2 number of people across all three agencies who all  
3 are contributing to the MOU and the conversations.

4 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, within  
5 NYCHA, who is at the table working on this?

6 DAVID PRISTIN: I mean it's, it's a  
7 combination of real estate, operations and you know  
8 and you know, and, and, Uka's team and our legal  
9 team.

10 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay so since  
11 this started four year ago and we know that there was  
12 some information that was received in Intel and  
13 worked with the Senior Program Operators two years  
14 ago, so where are you now with the actual document.  
15 I understand ongoing, but what does ongoing mean?  
16 Like is there an actual draft that is in place and  
17 the legal teams are reviewing this draft, or is the  
18 draft already completed and it was submitted to the  
19 Administration and Counsel is look over it? So, like  
20 where are you with this actual document, four years  
21 later?

22 DAVID PRISTIN: I mean there are, there  
23 are elements that are more finalized than others, for  
24 instance the practice of the repairs. There are,

1  
2 ele... there are other elements that are much less,  
3 that are not as far along as they need to be.

4 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: That is not  
5 helpful, seriously because it just sounds like a  
6 bunch of talk. And I mean I keep hearing ongoing and  
7 people are talking and discussions and that is saying  
8 absolutely nothing. And so, I'm just simply asking  
9 where are you with the draft? And what does that  
10 actual mean?

11 DAVID PRISTIN: So, we don't, we don't  
12 have a draft that could be shared at this moment.

13 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm not  
14 asking for it, to look at the draft. I'm asking  
15 what, what does it look like? Like what, where are  
16 you in this? Is this just some concepts that are on  
17 a piece of paper and people are thinking, okay we are  
18 still gathering ideas. Is it actual, a document  
19 where the legal teams are looking to see like parts  
20 out responsibilities? Can you explain to us where  
21 you are in the stage of this MOU Agreement four years  
22 later? Because like right now, everything that we  
23 have said it has gone back to the MOU or some concept  
24 of a procedure of responsibilities and, and you even  
25 said in your statement, like it was, it was enough

1  
2 for you to say in your opening remarks that this MOU  
3 is ongoing discussions and so we know that this is a  
4 serious issue. So, where are you in that process?

5           DAVID PRISTIN: We are not at the point  
6 where our legal or City Hall is reviewing the MOU.  
7 We are still working out the elements that need to be  
8 fi... that need to be formalized and we are still  
9 drafting those pieces.

10           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I mean  
11 technically we could be here again next year saying  
12 the same thing? Where is the commitment? Or like  
13 where is the priority bed? You know everything that  
14 is happening, like there should be a formal agreement  
15 and defined and clear responsibilities and roles as  
16 to who does what because the, the issues that we are  
17 seeing is because of all of the confusion as to who  
18 is responsible for what. I mean it is easy to  
19 continue to go back and say well there is a \$32  
20 billion need. Yeah, we know that but we have got to  
21 figure out, parts out, who is responsible for what?  
22 So, that we Administration, so that we can put in and  
23 ask of the Administration or figure out how we can do  
24 this. I mean we just wanted to be helpful right?  
25 Because the Centers are coming to us asking or we are

1 asking them what are you Capital Needs? What could  
2 we be helpful with? I remember one of the Center I  
3 was talking about their bathroom, they have a kiddie  
4 bathroom for seniors. Finally, I think DFTA got some  
5 money uhm and got it done but I have other Centers in  
6 NYCHA and they definitely could use some improvement.  
7 So, we got to find a way to work together and fight  
8 for that money that our seniors deserve. Alright,  
9 when I talked with DFTA about your Capital Needs, hey  
10 you deserve that money. Our seniors deserve that  
11 money. So, come on, we don't want it every year by  
12 year and those Senior Centers that are in DFTA right  
13 now, we don't know what to do with them. Or some of  
14 them you have some idea they could turn into NORCs,  
15 what about the rest of them. We got to make sure  
16 that they are taken care of. Right, if the  
17 Administration don't put in the \$3 million then the  
18 Council, we probably have to fight to put in some  
19 funding because we don't want the seniors to lose the  
20 resources, so here we go ahead. Right? And I just  
21 don't sense that urgency. Like when we look at that  
22 picture that is definitely unacceptable for a site,  
23 you know where seniors have daily activity or they  
24 have lunch or whatever and the ceiling is falling  
25

1  
2 down and you heard from some of the provider earlier  
3 and we are going to hear from more provider. Do you  
4 want to go to a place like that? I don't, that's  
5 unacceptable and we got to find a way to fix it.  
6 Yes, you got to fix a roof and all that but meanwhile  
7 it's got to be some short-term repair that could be  
8 done and so I know that is a big ass.. about \$32  
9 billion but if we can help at least temporary make  
10 the place safe for our senior we got to do that.

11           DAVID PRISTIN: So, I hear, I hear the  
12 frustration and we are committed to and have  
13 prioritized finalizing the MOU and we I think as the  
14 two Agencies definitely see the value in having the,  
15 you know having this formalized. I think that being  
16 said I would like to be clear that we do currently  
17 without an MOU without, without, without uhm a you  
18 know specific baseline amount of funding, we as the  
19 two, as the two Agencies are both committed to  
20 addressing any repairs that we, that are, that are  
21 identified that are called in thru the CCC or brought  
22 to either agency uhm by a Council Member, by Director  
23 or provider, by a participant at a Center and  
24 particularly when it comes to health and safety. We  
25 prioritize those and you know look, are there

1  
2 instances where we, where we don't get it right I'm  
3 sure there are and this might be one of them and we  
4 need to look at this but it is a priority and our  
5 folks take it very seriously and they go, it is a  
6 health and safety regardless of where it is, if it is  
7 an apartment or if it is in a Center it goes to the  
8 top of the chain.

9           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: The one of  
10 the points that my co-Chair made earlier about  
11 providers getting fined you know for violations and  
12 if the have to you know raise money on their own to  
13 take care of it, that, that's not acceptable either.  
14 So, what are you working? I mean are you working  
15 with Departments of the Buildings uhm when they come  
16 in and issue fines to the CEOs, can you help them  
17 resolve those issues? Because it was not, it was not  
18 their fault that the, that those uhm the violation  
19 that exists in the building?

20           CAROLYN JASPER: Yeah so one I want to go  
21 back because I do hear your frustration and I feel  
22 your frustration and we hear from our providers on a  
23 daily basis but I really want to reassure that every  
24 day repairs and upgrades are being made in our NYCHA  
25 Senior Centers. So, you know please don't leave

1  
2 thinking that we are just in a state of disrepair and  
3 that work is not going on all the time. Uhm I've  
4 gotten to visit some of the programs that are, that  
5 have been the result of upgrades. I know that Hudson  
6 Guild is one of that that is being at a beautiful new  
7 site and Center and so there are some great things  
8 that are happening as well. Uhm on the fines, they,  
9 the provider will bring that to our attention. In  
10 many cases, we can step in and because of our  
11 relationship with Buildings and others we can get  
12 that fine relieved or the financial penalty uhm and  
13 the same on the NYCHA side. Sometimes there are  
14 fines that are the responsibility of the provider. I  
15 don't know if you can give me an example of that and  
16 you know if that's the case and we can't justify that  
17 it was you know on, on the part of NYCHA as manager  
18 or DFTA then there might be instances where a fine  
19 would have to be paid by the sponsor.

20 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Let me just,  
21 uhm so, what I would like for you to get back to me  
22 on is Fort Green Senior Council that is one of the  
23 providers in my District and they have a \$5000 fine  
24 that is based on issues around the place of assembly  
25 and things that they actually have no control over.

1  
2 And so, they are the ones that actually had to have  
3 bake sales and fundraising efforts to be able to uhm,  
4 uhm, pay off this debt, so if somebody can speak to  
5 that, because I know that that is an issue and they  
6 were at a panic state.

7 CAROLYN JAMES: Do you know which Center?

8 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: It was  
9 between uhm Bleming Hou... it was between Bleming  
10 Center and Kingsboro Extension.

11 CAROLYN JAMES: It was Reed. It was  
12 Reed.

13 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I will  
14 also say since you mentioned Reed and I know my, uhm  
15 the previous colleagues had issues around sewage when  
16 you walk into Reed Houses, when you walk into Bleming,  
17 there is a strong sewer smell and everyone just kind  
18 of sprays Lysol and burns Incense and candles and uhm  
19 potpourri everywhere and going to the Center and just  
20 act like it's not there because they love going to  
21 the Center but there is a sewage problem and this is  
22 something that they've complained about for some time  
23 and they are also the ones that have this \$5000 fine.  
24 So, you can explain that one. That is an example.

1  
2           DAVID PRISTIN: We will, we will get back  
3 to you on that one.

4           CAROLYN JASPER: I do know that our  
5 design department was working with them to resolve  
6 the public assembly issue. I'm not sure about the  
7 fine but we will get back with you.

8           DAVID PRISTIN: Alright so on this one,  
9 we have, we have to look into what exactly the nature  
10 of this fine is. But, generally in a situation like  
11 this, the, the Agenc... one of these two Agencies we  
12 would take care of the fine so we will touch base  
13 with you, your staff and, and, and the Senior Council  
14 and we will figure out what, if it is something that,  
15 what is going on here.

16           CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Since we are  
17 talking about the providers, uhm there was a mention  
18 of the Zone Model, uhm, new concept and process. So,  
19 can you just give us some information about, around  
20 what is happening with the Zone Model, just some  
21 updates and how many uhm senior providers are part of  
22 this Zone Model Method and how many seniors have they  
23 been able to service?

24           UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Sorry, thank you for  
25 the question and so we've divided the City into 15

1  
2 geographic zones, uhm each Zone is about 11,000 units  
3 and may serve two to three Community Districts.  
4 Currently all of the zones are fully staffed so we  
5 have about four coordinators in each zone. Uhm we  
6 have one from our Resident Economic Empowerment and  
7 Sustainability Department and they focus on economic  
8 asset building for our residents and they are under  
9 our Resident Engagement Department we have Zone  
10 Coordinators assigned to seniors, youth and resident  
11 leaders and so they engage in.

12 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: For purposes  
13 of time and everything else where, can you just talk  
14 to us about the Zone Model with Seniors only.

15 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Sure, so to date we  
16 have touched over 35,000 residents with our Zone  
17 Model. We have 16 Zone partners that are formalized  
18 meaning once we have uhm, they are in the system,  
19 property management can make referrals to these  
20 agencies uhm where seniors have a need, whether it is  
21 for case management, home care services or any other  
22 senior needs. So, we are not in the pro... we are not  
23 a computerized system as of yet but we are working  
24 with IT to have this computerized so a manager I can  
25 say I'm referring this resident for social services

1  
2 that that referral can go directly to the Agency who  
3 is our Zone Partner, they were vetted, that have, we  
4 have an MOU with them. They have the necessary  
5 insurance and residents will have to consent to  
6 receive these services. Uhm right now we are  
7 starting to do it as a manual process but we hope by  
8 late 2019 we have this in the system and it's modeled  
9 over our database system that now adding the function  
10 to track so we are benefiting from that database.

11 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So is it a  
12 whole system that is up and running. This is manual,  
13 it still like in a pilot?

14 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): The Wreath system is  
15 fully up and running and they actually added the  
16 outcome component, ours is not. For the Human  
17 Services.

18 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Actually, I'm  
19 talking about the seniors.

20 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Yes. It is not up and  
21 running completely yet.

22 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, and the  
23 35,000 residents that you have touched uhm under this  
24 model, are the 35,000 out of the 80,000 years?

25

1  
2 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Well, yes. We could  
3 have some seniors that are not just NYCHA residents.  
4 It's not if a senior comes to us for service, we  
5 won't turn them away but we do uhm work with all  
6 seniors. Yes. It is out of the 80,000+ seniors.

7 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: The 35,000,  
8 residents that you've touched.

9 DAVID PRISTIN: I just want to clarify;  
10 the system is up and running. It is not computerized  
11 and obviously it will be more efficient once it is  
12 computerized but the referrals are happening and the  
13 connections are being made so I just want to clarify  
14 that point. Uhm Re... you know we've gotten a, a  
15 significant amount of funding from foundations and  
16 others to support uhm the automiz... the automation of  
17 that referral process so this is something that our,  
18 that our IT Team is doing on its own so that's why  
19 the systems are not necessarily synced up as far as  
20 where they are and they in the automating process.

21 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, the 16  
22 zone partners that you referred to. Are they uhm  
23 organizations that work exclusively with seniors or  
24 are they like organizations that provide different  
25

1  
2 services to other residents like someone that does  
3 uhm IT.?

4 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): So, these 16 partners  
5 that I mentioned are for seniors. They focus on  
6 seniors. They may do it citywide but we do have  
7 additional partners. We accepted 30 partners in our,  
8 but these 16 focus on senior services.

9 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Okay, so on this  
10 Zone Model can you give us some information because  
11 it was like, this was the first time that we have  
12 heard about it. Uhm in terms of the breakdown by  
13 Council District so that we know which non-profit  
14 that you are working with? Are you working with our  
15 developments in our Districts so that we can share  
16 with our other colleagues?

17 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Absolutely. We will  
18 share that too.

19 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: So, we are going to  
20 send you questions that we didn't a chance to ask.  
21 Uhm and we will expect response back because we  
22 wanted to hear from the providers and uhm we thank  
23 you for being here today and I just wanted to stress  
24 we want to be a strong partner with you because we  
25 want to provide the best services to our seniors and

1  
2 so we look forward to work with you and with the MOU.  
3 If you need us to help push with OMB, we will to get  
4 it done because it is taking far to long. Thank you.

5 DAVID PRISTIN: Thank you, we appreciate  
6 your partnership.

7 CARYN RESNICK: Thank you.

8 UKA BUSKIS (SP?): Thank you.

9 KAREN TAYLOR: Thank you.

10 DEBORAH GODDARD: Thank you.

11 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Next we will hear  
12 from Lois Green from Brownsville, Beatrice Haley  
13 Harlem River, Emily Batista and Betty Mena. Okay Ms.  
14 Green, Katelyn from Live On New York, Tara Kline from  
15 United Neighborhood Houses and Alexander Riley, Legal  
16 Aid. You may begin.

17 LOIS GREEN: My name is Lois Green from  
18 the Brownsville Senior Center Brooklyn, New York.  
19 Uhm my issue is at the Brownsville Senior Center we  
20 are trying to have a computer lab. We have an  
21 instructor; the problem is we doesn't have no kind of  
22 computer. So, what we do to learn we have to apply  
23 our own laptop, tablet or phone. We have about 50  
24 students but then we don't have our, our tools so if  
25 we get our tools maybe our class could get uhm

1  
2 bigger. And uhm, the seniors are more concerned  
3 about if we could have more consultants to come in,  
4 which the Director is trying to always have someone  
5 to come in. We have a food, we have a food plan that  
6 comes in five days a week so hopefully next year we  
7 are, we will have a computer lab.

8 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just a quick  
9 question, the computer lab that is attached to the  
10 team center around the back of the Senior Center, did  
11 you ever utilize that space prior to it becoming a  
12 teen center?

13 LOIS GREEN: We tried but it didn't work.

14 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay,  
15 alright.

16 LOIS GREEN: So hopefully maybe, so uhm  
17 hopefully now that the teens doesn't utilize it in  
18 the day, there is a possibility that we could utilize  
19 it while they are not there. Cause normally they  
20 come in the afternoon and the Senior Center is open  
21 from 9 to 5.

22 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay thank  
23 you. This is one of the Social Clubs according to  
24 DFTA but a Senior Center according to NYCHA. It is a  
25 Social Club because it is small but it is not small.

1  
2 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: We will definitely  
3 work with NYCHA because I know seniors love  
4 computers.

5 LOIS GREEN: Right.

6 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: So, we can, in the  
7 City Council we can look at other source of funding  
8 that will be able to help make that happen. But  
9 thank you for being here today.

10 LOIS GREEN: Thank you.

11 EMILY BATISTA: Good morning my name is  
12 Emily Batista and I reside at the Bronsnick Houses  
13 for seniors.

14 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Can you bring the  
15 mic closer to you?

16 EMILY BATISTA: Oh, sorry. I uhm reside  
17 at the Senior Houses in Bronsnick since 2016. Uhm we  
18 have a Family Partnership Program at NYCHA which I  
19 had never utilized the services until recently. That  
20 all changed when I met our family worker, Ms. Ponds.  
21 She made me feel comfortable and showed concern  
22 regarding the issues that as seniors we face in the  
23 community. Ms. Ponds goes above and beyond and is  
24 responsible and devoted to the senior community. It  
25 is a big plus to have her A) she is bilingual and 2)

1  
2 as I said she is very concerned. She is always there  
3 to listen to us even if we just come in to vent about  
4 the weather, anything, she is willing to listen. So,  
5 her being there has had a big impact on only not me  
6 but as well as the other seniors when we discuss our  
7 repairs, our dilemmas with other issues in the  
8 building going on. Currently we have and that's not  
9 on my notes but I figured I would bring it out. We  
10 have asbestos in the building, we have leaks, we have  
11 mold, uhm on my floor alone there is a ceiling in the  
12 hallway community area, it came down. They had to  
13 bring it down because it was cracking and falling and  
14 it leaks so now, they have it covered with a plastic  
15 like that. Uhm, I have uhm breathing condition and  
16 that mold is not going to help so we need that  
17 addressed. So, I've gone to Ms. Ponds office to see  
18 how we can work together to get that done. She has  
19 also made an impact on; my mother was recently  
20 displaced because of Hurricane Maria and I brought  
21 her to live with me and she helped me obtain services  
22 for my mom such as Medicaid Health Services or just a  
23 little talk with her because she is in a place that  
24 after 40 years, she didn't reside in. So, again it  
25 is important that we have these partnerships because

1  
2 we can work together and again Jahira I would like to  
3 thank you personally for all that you do for us. She  
4 is committed and we need programs like this to  
5 continue without, throughout NYCHA.

6 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, is she um  
7 is Ms. Ponds a Social Worker at the Center?

8 EMILY BATISTA: She is a Case Worker,  
9 Case Management. She is here.

10 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do you know  
11 if she works with NYCHA or if she works for the  
12 Senior Center? We can find out.

13 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Oh, you want to  
14 come back on record and answer? That's okay. Okay  
15 it's a part of a program in NYCHA. See, we hear good  
16 things about NYCHA, right? So, with good programs  
17 like that we need to continue to support because it  
18 makes a difference.

19 EMILY BATISTA: Absolutely, and recently  
20 it was in jeopardy of being lost because of contract  
21 issues or whatever with NYCHA so I am making sure  
22 that this continues. I'm not going to let it go.  
23 Uhm I'm also very active and vocal in my building.  
24 And we are going to see how we can work together to  
25 get some of these things addressed.

1

2

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you and thank you for being here, and it is important for us, the Committee to hear from you but also, I would urge you, reach out to your Council Member.

6

EMILY BATISTA: Oh, yeah, I have, Mark Gjonaj and I have been very, have a very positive relationship.

9

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Okay so, make sure Council Member Gjonaj is on the case.

10

11

EMILY BATISTA: Yeah, he is, he is.

12

CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you, thank you for being here. Next.

14

KATELYN HOOSIE (SP?): Thank you Chairs.

15

My name is Katelyn Hoosie (SP?). I am here

16

representing Live On New York. Our members are 90+

17

organizations that operate the more than 96 social

18

services that operate in NYCHA. In New York City,

19

NYCHA represents one of the largest suppliers of

20

affordable housing for low income seniors. Currently

21

about 38% of NYCHA Households are headed by an

22

individual that is age 62 or over and an estimated

23

7700 units are designated specifically for older

24

adults. Just as the buildings are aging, so are the

25

tenants in NYCHA that occupy them making the need for

1  
2 quality, safe services in NYCHA paramount to the  
3 success of the community at large. Unfortunately,  
4 however, providers of services such as Senior Centers  
5 and NORCs that operate in NYCHA, face daily  
6 challenges just to keep the doors open. Much  
7 emphasis has been accurately placed on the need  
8 to improve the living conditions and units within  
9 NYCHA developments. An emphasis that Live On New  
10 York fully supports. However, it is imperative to  
11 recognize that Senior Service Providers have not been  
12 immune to these capital and operational challenges.  
13 A recent Wall Street Journal article noted the  
14 estimated \$500 million capital backlog that has been  
15 articulated today and we know to be much greater than  
16 that number alone. Faulty H backs, leaking roofs,  
17 broken boilers and the occasional rodent are just a  
18 few of the challenges to which providers have limited  
19 control over mitigating. Adding salt to the wound,  
20 providers are often subject to an on slot of fines  
21 and violations for these conditions from the City's  
22 well-intentioned regulatory agencies including the  
23 Department of Health and Mental Health and the Fire  
24 Department. Providers are then often asked to fund  
25 these repairs out of their non-existent bottom lines.

1  
2 The fines and repair needs are exacerbated by the  
3 fact that NYCHA's approval process leaves providers  
4 waiting weeks, months or even years before being able  
5 to move forward with critical repairs, even those for  
6 which capital funds have already been made available  
7 as a point that Debbie Rose made earlier today. The  
8 impacts of these fines and conditions are not only  
9 monetary. Instead of spending crucial time with the  
10 tenants, these individuals who want to become social  
11 workers and then forced to spend time becoming  
12 experts in areas that are wholly outside of their job  
13 description such as how to mitigate these issues that  
14 are wholly inappropriate for them to have to deal  
15 with. The impact cannot be understated. These  
16 providers work tirelessly to provide high quality  
17 services to those who need it most and through these  
18 suboptimal processes are being consistently hamstrung  
19 from meeting their City mandated and personally  
20 motivated obligations. Additionally, Senior Centers  
21 and services operating in NYCHA should be seen as  
22 resources and relaying critical information about  
23 NYCHA NextGen and Rad and they need to be fully  
24 funded in their contracts to be able to meet these  
25 aims. We have recognized that challenges are not

1  
2 specific to Senior Services to run the gamut of  
3 Community Spaces in NYCHA facilities which is why we  
4 are proud to have begun collaborating with the  
5 Daycare Council of New York and United Neighborhood  
6 Houses to recommend reforms across Community Spaces.  
7 Acknowledging the difficult financial position of  
8 NYCHA we respectfully submit the following process-  
9 oriented recommendations each having the potential to  
10 improve the day to day business and viability of  
11 providers operating within NYCHA without adding  
12 additional stress to NYCHAs current financial  
13 situation. Redirecting fines, non-profit human  
14 service providers who lack site control and rely on  
15 NYCHA to make repairs should not be subject to  
16 citations and fines from DOMH, DOHMH or at DNY due to  
17 the failure to make these repairs for which they have  
18 submitted requests. When these violations are found  
19 during inspections and if these have been reported by  
20 NYCHA by the provider, the provider should not be  
21 penalized. Dedicate staff: As is the practice in  
22 other governmental agencies there must be an  
23 individual within the Department for the Aging whose  
24 sole focus is to liaison with NYCHA and to support  
25 and streamline processes for DFTA funded services

1  
2 located in NYCHA development. Increase transparency:  
3 Providers must be given access to an up-to-date NYCHA  
4 approved vendor list in order to expedite the  
5 procurement process. Mandate interagency  
6 cooperation: NYCHA and the Agencies that leverage  
7 their space, including DFTA need a clear division of  
8 responsibilities for the maintenance and upkeep of  
9 NYCHA sites. In order to provide stability to  
10 providers this Division of Responsibility once  
11 established and agreed up should be standardized as  
12 appropriate across all agencies that fund providers  
13 operating out of NYCHA properties. And finally,  
14 design and approve a process for repairs: NYCHA must  
15 work internally and with providers to accelerate the  
16 approval for repairs and renovations and must  
17 expedite processes within the Residential Repair  
18 Division when floods, leaks or other issues originate  
19 in apartments and require a two-prompt repair to  
20 fully address. We thank you for your time and for  
21 listening to our recommendations.

22 TARA KLINE: Hi, good afternoon, thank  
23 you Chair Chin and Chair Ampry-Samuel for having  
24 their hearing. My name is Tara Kline and I am a  
25 Policy Analyst with United Neighborhood Houses (UNH)

1  
2 uhm thank you for mentioning us earlier uhm Council  
3 Member Ampry-Samuel. Uhm many of our recommendations  
4 uhm I won't read them all, uhm Katelyn covered them.  
5 We are working in collaboration with Live On and the  
6 Daycare Council of New York to address uhm issues in  
7 Community Centers that are run by NYCHA uhm but I  
8 will skim through some of my testimony today uhm  
9 today, so. First on unfortunately many of the City  
10 Senior Centers located within NYCHA facilities and  
11 operated by DFTA are in need of some very serious  
12 repairs as we have heard today. Reports of leaking  
13 roofs, dilapidated kitchen appliances and broken air  
14 conditions. Many that are also designed as official  
15 New York City Cooling Centers are all too common.  
16 Heating, plumbing and electrical systems often need  
17 major overhauls. Many of these Centers are located  
18 in decades old buildings which tends to make these  
19 challenges even more frequent and extreme. We have  
20 heard that NYCHA needs over \$500 million for repairs  
21 to its Senior and Community Centers and in the  
22 context of NYCHAs \$32 billion need, the upkeep of  
23 Senior Centers in NYCHA facilities are run by  
24 community-based organizations has become a back-  
25 burner priority leaving many Centers in need of basic

1  
2 facilities and maintenance resource. Distressingly,  
3 conditions continue to deteriorate with on clear for  
4 remediation. An unsurprisingly poor building  
5 conditions have a direct negative impact on  
6 attendance at Senior Centers with older adults  
7 preferring not to spend their time in a building that  
8 is in disrepair. So, given NYCHAs Capital Repair  
9 Backlog for its overall building stock providers who  
10 used to rely on the agency to make repairs have been  
11 forced to look for other solutions to their pressing  
12 repair needs. Because funding for repairs and  
13 renovations are generally not included in DFTA Senior  
14 Center Contracts programs must secure funding outside  
15 of the regular contract process. This can be a time  
16 consuming and confusing process, especially as many  
17 projects arise as emergencies. There is not a clear  
18 amount of money in DFTAs Expense Budget for repairs  
19 as we heard earlier and as was reported in the  
20 October Aging Committee Hearing on Senior Center  
21 Repairs. So, this makes it very difficult to assert  
22 whether this funding is sufficient to meet the needs  
23 uhm and to what extent NYCHA Senior Centers can  
24 benefit from this DFTA fund. In practice, many  
25 programs cover their cost through their own limited

1  
2 budgets or private fill in sources or will put off  
3 repairs until the City can produce funding and this  
4 can affect the Center's overall programming. DFTA  
5 can be inconsistent with their criteria for  
6 reimbursing providers for repairs that they pay for  
7 out of their own pocket if DFTA is willing to  
8 reimburse at all. While we have seen that other  
9 agencies like DYCD have procedures in place for  
10 reimbursing for emergency repairs. Next, even when  
11 the Senior Center providers are able to procure the  
12 necessary funding to make needed repair, NYCHAs  
13 approval process and protocol can prevent them from  
14 moving forward with projects for weeks, months and  
15 years in some cases as Katelyn just mentioned.  
16 Requests wind through NYCHAs approval process while  
17 Capital Dollar sit unused and conditions worsened.  
18 To make matters worse, there is a lack of internal  
19 coordination in NYCHA between the Residential Repair  
20 Department and those who are responsible for repairs  
21 at Senior Centers. Consequently, when a leak  
22 originates from a residential apartment, UNHs members  
23 in Senior Centers can spend thousands of dollars,  
24 often their own privately raised funds replacing  
25 ceilings, floors and walls, only to have the same

1  
2 area flood again because the leak in the toilet or  
3 shower upstairs was never actually repaired or was  
4 repaired incorrectly. Ultimately, programs are faced  
5 with a very impossible choice, working with NYCHA,  
6 finding the money elsewhere in their budgets or very  
7 often putting off critical repairs. Uhm, next in  
8 addition to interrupting services for older adults,  
9 waiting for repairs exposes providers to possible  
10 fines from the City's oversight authorities. A  
11 common experience is a Senior Center requesting a  
12 repair for NYCHA and while waiting for the work to  
13 start, receiving a citation or a fine from a  
14 different City Agency such as the Department of  
15 Health or the Fire Department. For example, one  
16 Senior Center uhm operated by Bronx Works, the E.  
17 Robert Moore Center in a NYCHA building, submitted a  
18 ticket to NYCHA to repair a crack in their wall and  
19 while they are waiting for NYCHA for respond and make  
20 their repair, the DFTA program officer issued a  
21 citation for the crack despite seeing the repair  
22 ticket that existed. So, in these types of cases,  
23 the City is in fact fining itself. Uhm, so moving on  
24 to our recommendations, uhm you have them in front of  
25 you and Katelyn just ran through them, we echo those

1  
2 concerns. Uhm in addition UNH is also recommending  
3 increasing the amount of money that the City makes  
4 available for Senior Center repairs and upgrades and  
5 Senior Centers should be eligible for this funding  
6 whether or not they are located in NYCHA buildings.  
7 First, DFTA should establish a dedicate Capital  
8 Repair Fund as many of us have said today uhm for  
9 Senior Center Repairs and renovations, uhm and we  
10 also recommend that the City Council should establish  
11 a discretionary fund to support flexible repair needs  
12 uhm for Senior Centers. So, thank you so much for  
13 your time.

14           ALEXANDER RILEY: Uhm thank you to both  
15 Committees for the opportunity to testify this  
16 afternoon, my name is Alex Riley, I am the Director  
17 of the Elder Law Practice for the Legal Aid Society.  
18 As you may now, the Legal Aid Society has borough  
19 offices throughout the City and we worked recently on  
20 an annual bases, 300,000 individual legal matters for  
21 low income New Yorkers, Civil, Criminal, Juvenile  
22 Rights, areas of practice but I'm strictly in the  
23 Civil Practice. I am based in the Brooklyn Office  
24 for the Aging where for decades we have used a multi-  
25 disciplinary approach with lawyers, social workers,

1  
2 paralegals to try to uhm allow older adults to age  
3 safely at home. The focus of today's hearing clearly  
4 is on physical infrastructure and the physical  
5 condition of the Centers that have been discussed  
6 today. I wanted to make brief comments about  
7 something slightly different because the, the general  
8 subject of the hearing is services in, in for Seniors  
9 in NYCHA so what I wanted to speak about briefly was,  
10 NYCHA rules and regulations that older adults need to  
11 abide by and education about these things and  
12 assistance in compliance with respect to them. I  
13 would just mention that briefly before I, having  
14 spent my career focused on older adults and been out  
15 in the community a lot and spent a lot of time in  
16 Senior Centers I have certainly come into personal  
17 contact with many of the kinds of conditions  
18 described here today. I used to run legal clinics at  
19 a couple of centers in upper Manhattan and every time  
20 I went I was very distressed just to see the physical  
21 condition of some of these facilities and I think it  
22 was Council Member Treyger he used the words decency  
23 and respect and certainly what you see in some of  
24 these locations does not show respect to the people  
25 who, uhm who are using these facilities really as

1  
2 their homes for many hours, five, five days a week.  
3 Anyway, uhm I will be brief, Council Member Chin in  
4 her introductory remarks did a great job of just  
5 discussing this and highlighting the sheer numbers of  
6 older adults who call NYCHA home. There are many  
7 such older adults in NYCHA and the population is  
8 growing. And some of them are there for many, many  
9 years, there are multi-generational families in  
10 these, in these homes and uhm certain family members  
11 come and go while the older adult ages and stays in  
12 place. Many of these older adults have relatively  
13 limited education or limited English skills and yet  
14 they are required to comply with some fairly complex  
15 in certain instances, rules governing their  
16 tendencies and even if they don't comply simply by  
17 failure to dot an I or cross a T this can jeopardize  
18 their tenancies. And we have seen this on many  
19 occasions in our practice and I, uhm, in the  
20 testimony that you have in front of you we have  
21 outlined one particular example, an older man who had  
22 moved in with his girlfriend of many years. They  
23 never got formally married but they lived as husband  
24 and wife and she became ill and at some point, she  
25 requested that he be added to the family composition

1  
2 but she made some sort of error in the paperwork,  
3 NYCHA denied this but never told either her or him,  
4 ultimately, she died NYCHA moved to evict him.  
5 Thankfully we were successful at a hearing in  
6 reversing this but the hearing officer went out of  
7 her way in her decision to point out that NYCHA  
8 really needed to have done more to help the family to  
9 have educated them, so really my point here today is  
10 to, is to emphasize the need for greater education  
11 and assistance for older adults whether that is to be  
12 provided by NYCHA staff in management offices or in  
13 the Centers. I was very pleased to hear I believe it  
14 was Ms. Batista uhm praising somebody in the Center  
15 who has been very helpful and, and we certainly see  
16 that, individual employees who go out of their way to  
17 assist, but you know there, they are seeing people  
18 who come to them for help. The person, that the  
19 partner of our client who filled out the papers  
20 improperly she didn't know that she had filled them  
21 out improperly. I mean you don't know what you don't  
22 know so to speak, so, there really ought to be an  
23 opportunity for everyone on a regular basis to have  
24 education and assistance when they are complying with  
25 rules that determine whether people can continue to

1 live in their homes, in some cases, of many decades.

2 Thank you.

3  
4 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Well thank you very  
5 much for your testimony, and of course Live On and  
6 UNH we have been partnering and thank you for your  
7 recommendation and some of them we will definitely  
8 have to pursue especially in the, the upcoming uhm  
9 Budget negotiation. We agree that DFTA needs to have  
10 a Capital Budget and even with NYCHA they need to  
11 have the resources to do the repairs as necessary and  
12 uhm \$500 million is a big number but we can  
13 prioritize which are the critical one that we can get  
14 some resources to get them fixed and thank you to the  
15 seniors who came today to tell your stories and uhm  
16 it is so great to see you. And I know that you take  
17 advantage of our Senior Center, so we are going to  
18 work very hard to make sure that you have the  
19 resources to keep the programs going and to expand  
20 and we love it when senior wants to learn and  
21 especially wants to be efficient in computers. I  
22 have some seniors in my District that loves their  
23 computer class and they keep asking for its year  
24 after year so we will be fighting for more resources  
25 for you. So, thank you all for being here. Okay,

1  
2 the, the last panel, we have uhm Myer Waxman from  
3 Self-Help and Michael Higgins Jr. from the Gowanus  
4 Neighborhood Coalition for Justice. Anyone else that  
5 wants to testify, uhm please uhm fill out the form  
6 for the Sargent's. Please begin.

7 MYER WAXMAN: My name is Myer Waxman, I  
8 am the Managing Director of Senior Centers at Self-  
9 Help Community Services. Thank you to the Aging  
10 Committee, Chair Margaret Chair and the Public  
11 Housing Chair Alicka Ampry-Samuel and the members of  
12 the committees for the opportunity to testify on  
13 Senior Services and Senior Centers in NYCHA. Uhm  
14 Self-Help operates five Senior Centers throughout  
15 Queens included one located in the Community Center  
16 of NYCHAs Latimar Gardens Complex in Flushing. There  
17 are unique needs within our Latimar Gardens Senior  
18 Center which serves more than 1,700 people each year.  
19 Together our Centers have over 10,000 members and we  
20 serve over 200,000 meals each year. We strongly  
21 believe in the role that Senior Centers play in  
22 providing high quality nutritious meals, engaging  
23 activities and health and wellness programing in  
24 order to provide valuable services to the residents  
25 and to the Community NYCHAs Latimer Gardens has

1  
2 partnered with DFTA as well as with the Department of  
3 Youth and Community Development they are not for  
4 profit contractors to offer Senior Services and Youth  
5 Programs to the community. This partnership provides  
6 immense benefits to the local community. We are  
7 grateful for the Council's long-standing and ongoing  
8 support for Senior Centers and for always emphasizing  
9 the needs of older adults and policy decisions and  
10 Budget allocations. In today's testimony, I will  
11 focus on our experience operating a Senior Center in  
12 NYCHA's Latimer Garden Complex. We are fortunate to  
13 have a collaborative relationship with the local  
14 NYCHA office. Our Senior Center Staff has regularly  
15 scheduled meetings with NYCHA and has found the local  
16 office to be responsive and responsible. This  
17 partnership provides immense benefits to Community  
18 although it does not always provide support for  
19 necessary repairs and upgrades. When a repair is  
20 needed, the Senior and Youth Programs need to report  
21 the repair and obtain a ticket number through NYCHAs  
22 Standard Tenant Repair Structure. The response to  
23 such repair requests is often slow. This slow  
24 response is troubling for the individuals and  
25 families who live in NYCHA housing and is exacerbated

1  
2 when there are hundreds of individuals relying in  
3 Community Centers. Recently, our team needed to file  
4 three NYCHA repair tickets for a bathroom stall door  
5 that fell off the hinges. Our team needed to file  
6 three tickets because the repair system closed the  
7 first two tickets without notice of resolution.  
8 Without notice or resolution. We understand that the  
9 ticketing is meant to ensure accountability and  
10 transparency but the system needs to be updated so  
11 tickets are not closed arbitrary and repairs are able  
12 to be resolved within a timely manner. We also  
13 advocate for the local NYCHA office to be empowered  
14 to resolve small issues in a timely manner such as  
15 bathroom stall doors or broken locks. A challenge  
16 for our team is maintaining our high standards of  
17 service while working within the NYCHA repair and  
18 maintenance system and waiting for each ticket to be  
19 resolved. We are responsible for the care of the  
20 Community Room during our hours of operation, we  
21 continue to be held accountable for issues that are  
22 in the NYCHA ticketing systems and have not yet been  
23 repair, such as the bathroom stall door, or air  
24 ventilation. I add most of the Latimer Gardens also  
25 faces a place of assembly issue that is beyond our

1 control but for which we can be held accountable.  
2  
3 Latimer Gardens Community Center operated without  
4 functional air conditioning, heat or air ventilation  
5 from late August through November 2018, we are deeply  
6 grateful for the assistance from Council Member Koo's  
7 Office in DFTA to resolve this issue this week.  
8 Unfortunately, we had to operate throughout hot  
9 summer days and cold winter weather without adequate  
10 temperature control in the Senior Center. Recently,  
11 20 members of our Chinese group and ping-pong group  
12 had relocated to another space within the Center or  
13 stop coming because of lack of heat. We were  
14 concerned that if we continued to have cold rooms, we  
15 would be unable to meet the needs of the Seniors in  
16 the Latimer Gardens Community. We are grateful the  
17 issue has been resolved and our Center and continue  
18 to provide high-quality programming with adequate  
19 heat. We suggest there be some channel created  
20 between DFTA, NYCHA, DYCD and other partner City  
21 Agencies to more quickly address the communal repair  
22 needs within NYCHA buildings. The community spaces  
23 shared among the Senior Center, DYCD is contracted  
24 after school program and the residence association.  
25 Given the regular use of the space, we have found

1  
2 that the level of custodial care provided by NYCHA is  
3 not sufficient. Recently, the Community Center was  
4 used as a voting site for election days. The Senior  
5 Center was closed. The following day our Senior  
6 Center Staff and Program Maintenance Staff were  
7 responsible for cleaning the Community Center so our  
8 programs could function properly. We advocate for  
9 additional funding to accommodate custodial needs  
10 within the Community Center. Uhm security, in New  
11 York City Security is an important issue, especially  
12 programs serving vulnerable populations. Our Senior  
13 Center is open to all older Community Members and we  
14 strive to create a safe and welcoming environment for  
15 all. Currently, there is very limited access to  
16 funding for additional cameras or security guards  
17 which would allow our Director to have oversight of  
18 who is coming and going. Recently, there was an  
19 attempted break-in in our office door and within our  
20 kitchen. Our team works closely with local police to  
21 report issues as they arise. We are grateful for  
22 Council Member Koo's past investment in security and  
23 the residential areas of Latimer Gardens and advocate  
24 for additional funding to make cameras and security  
25 systems available for the Community Center. Thank

1  
2 you for the opportunity to testify today on behalf of  
3 the 20,000 clients we serve. I am grateful for the  
4 Council support on so many important programs.

5           MICHAEL HIGGINS JR.: Uhm good afternoon,  
6 thank you for providing me the opportunity to  
7 testify. Uhm, get this out for me. Only five  
8 minutes but I appreciate it. Uhm so really quickly I  
9 just want to review uhm our situation down at  
10 Gowanus. So, our situation is a little different, so  
11 Gowanus Houses currently has a Senior Center but  
12 doesn't have a Community Center. Uhm the Community  
13 Center was shuttered upwards of 10 years ago and so  
14 the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for Justice which  
15 was formed about a particular number of issues that  
16 are being advocated for around that is being planned  
17 for next year. We made it a point to try to reopen  
18 the center, A) because we have seen the use of that  
19 space, especially in the impact of Hurricane Sandy  
20 which took a number of our buildings off-line and we  
21 used that space as a, as a HUB to organize resources  
22 for residents and so at this point it has now been  
23 about 5 years where we have tried to engage different  
24 processes through Council Member Levin's office,  
25 through discretionary funding uhm we have

1  
2 participatory budgeting to win money to reopen the  
3 Center. Successfully, we actually run about between  
4 two different cycles close to have half a million  
5 dollars, but we are seeing that uhm there is not only  
6 the issue that NYCHA doesn't have a clear capital  
7 budget for its Centers, that in our particular sense,  
8 a community that is you know literally a few hundred  
9 feet from the Gowanus Canal which is an extremely  
10 polluted body of water, there isn't any clear  
11 emergency preparedness planning protocol for NYCHA in  
12 general, but specifically in our communities that  
13 were impacted by Hurricane Sandy or just at risk for  
14 additional climate disasters and so we are asking not  
15 only for I guess the support in re-opening the  
16 Community Center to be intergenerational, in addition  
17 to the repairs that are necessary at that space which  
18 are approximately \$4 million at this point, we also  
19 want to make sure that you all are aware that the  
20 Mayor actually promised us last year at a town hall  
21 that was hosted by Council Member Levin that he would  
22 re-open the Center. We are just hoping that you can  
23 assist in upholding that promise and that would  
24 create the space, you know a different number of  
25 processes that are happening, so you got the Gowanus

1  
2 Canal Super Fund that is literally a half a block  
3 away from that Center, uhm we have you conversations  
4 about the re-zoning and so we need the space to have  
5 Community Hub to have those very important dialogs.

6 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you for your  
7 testimony and thank you for being here. We will  
8 definitely work together with your Council Member to  
9 make sure that the Mayor keeps his promise. We all  
10 know how wonderful Community Centers are in our  
11 community especially the ones that are serving our  
12 youth and our seniors and we know that they need the  
13 repairs. And the frustration is that once Council  
14 Members allocate funding it just sits there for years  
15 after year and so we need to really expedite that  
16 process and thank you to Self-Help I mean for all the  
17 services that you provide and I am glad that you have  
18 a close working relationship with your Council Member  
19 and that you get the help that you need.

20 MICHAEL HIGGINGS JR.: Thank you Chairs.

21 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: Thank you for being  
22 here today. Anyone else that want to testify that  
23 didn't fill out a form. Well if not, thank you all  
24 for being here today. We have a wonderful hearing  
25 and we have a lot to follow up on and it is such an

1  
2 honor to co-Chair this hearing today with Council  
3 Member Ampry-Samuel and uhm we are going to work  
4 closely together to make sure that our public housing  
5 resident get the best services that they deserve in  
6 our Centers, and especially in our Senior Center so  
7 we will have a lot of followup to do and thank you  
8 again and Happy Holidays.

9 CHAIR ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you  
10 everyone and we are going to look forward to a very  
11 intense and aggressive Budget season I am sure.  
12 Thank you.

13 CHAIR MARGARET CHIN: The hearing is  
14 adjourned. Thank you.

15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date JANUARY 6, 2019