

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

November 14, 2018
Start: 1:42 p.m.
Recess: 3:17 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Laurie Cumbo
Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Inez Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie Cumbo
Daniel Dromm
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Robert Holden
Corey E. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy King

Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
I. Daneek Miller
Keith Powers
Donovan J. Richards
Deborah Rose
Helen Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jumaane Williams
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Norris McDonald

Pastor Bishop Earl W. McKay
Church of God of Prophecy

@

1
2 JESSICA PELLEGRINI: Mic check, mic
3 check, 1, 2, 3. Today is the Stated Meeting.
4 Today's date is November 14, 2018, being record by
5 Jessica Pellegrino. [pause]

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Hello.

7 [MULTIPLE PEOPLE]: Hello.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Hello!

9 MULTIPLE PEOPLE]: Hello!

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Good afternoon! I
11 am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, and I'm so pleased
12 today to be presenting today's proclamation with
13 Council Member Inez Barron! Yay! I'm happy to be
14 joined by Council Member Jumaane Williams, Andy King,
15 Adrienne Adams, Robert Cornegy, Margaret Chin, yes
16 that was [laughter]. There are many different ways
17 to get something accomplished. Today the New York
18 City Council is proud to honor Norris McDonald. Yay!
19 [background cheers] Can everyone who is here to be
20 part of this prestigious ceremony please join us. He
21 travels deep. We should all be so blessed to have
22 such wonderful people surrounding us and loving us on
23 this particular occasion. Today the New York City
24 Council is proud to honor Norris McDonald, who has
25 been a champion and a staunch advocate for

1
2 environmental causes and has served as an advisor to
3 his community on these issues for 39 years.
4 [background cheers]. Woo! How many of us can say
5 we've done something for 39 years! Our generation is
6 the microwave generation. So we really appreciate
7 that. He was the founder and president of the Center
8 for Environment, Commerce, and Energy, as well as the
9 founder of the African American Environment
10 Association. His career is nothing short of
11 impressive. In the early 1980s Norman led the fight
12 in Congress to maintain corporate average fuel
13 economy standards, as well as playing a critical role
14 in the drafting and passage of several environmental
15 bills, including the Federal Shared Energy Savings
16 Act, the No Fear Act, which is the first civil rights
17 legislation of the twenty-first century, all right!,
18 and the New York City Environmental Justice Law. He
19 also authored the first comprehensive studies of
20 pollution in Washington, D.C. And I will go on.
21 Along with his extensive work nationally, his passion
22 and advocacy for environmental issues also extends
23 here locally to the New York City Council. He
24 presented the first idea for the Environmental
25 Justice Bill to then former Council Member Charles

1
2 Barron, which eventually became a model for the rest
3 of the nation, promoting greater public engagement,
4 transparency, and participation. So I am so pleased
5 to have my colleagues to join us here today to gather
6 around you to present this proclamation to Norris
7 McDonald for his service and contributions to the
8 community and to the environment. Congratulations on
9 this prestigious honor [background cheering] and for
10 representing us so well [applause]. I am going to
11 transition this to the clerk and then Council Member
12 Barron will give remarks, and we are so anxious to
13 hear remarks from you as well. Thank you so much.
14 So we will turn it over to the clerk.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Council City of New York
16 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
17 proud to honor Norris McDonald for his outstanding
18 service and contributions to the community and the
19 environment, and whereas Mr. McDonald has worked as
20 an environmentalist for 39 years, he is the founder
21 and president of the Center for Environment,
22 Commerce, and Energy, the Center, and its outreach on
23 the African American Environmentalist Association,
24 the AAEA. Throughout his prolific career he has
25 served as an advisor to industry and local

1
2 neighborhood community groups, and whereas Mr.
3 McDonald's previous roles included serving as
4 director of the Energy Conservation and
5 Transplantation Project for the Environmental Policy
6 Center, now called the Friends of the Earth, and
7 president of the Washington, D.C. chapter of the
8 American Association of Blacks in Energy, he also
9 organized the first energy brain trust for the late
10 Congressman Mickey Leland, authored and successfully
11 advocated for the passage of national energy
12 legislation before the United States Congress,
13 presented testimony before federal, state, and local
14 regulatory agencies, and the United States House and
15 Senate Energy and Environmental Committees and
16 participated in initial meetings with the US
17 Environmental Protection Agency to advocate for the
18 adoption of environmental justice policies. And
19 whereas in the early 1980s Mr. McDonald led the fight
20 in Congress to maintain corporate average fuel
21 economy standards and presented testimony before the
22 US Senate Energy and Natural Resources Committee at
23 the confirmation hearing of John Harrington as the US
24 Secretary of Energy in 1985. He also played an
25 integral role in drafting and passage of multiple

1
2 bills, including the Federal Shared Energy Savings
3 Act, the No Fear Act, the first civil rights
4 legislation of the twenty-first century, and the New
5 York City Environmental Justice Law. He also served
6 as a national environmental policy act instructor in
7 1997 for the US Department of Agriculture graduate
8 school, and whereas Mr. McDonald authored the first
9 comprehensive studies of pollution in Washington,
10 D.C. He is a recognized national speaker on energy
11 and environmental issues and has appeared in numerous
12 print and electronic media. He has received special
13 recognition from the US Congress, the US
14 Environmental Protection Agency, and the US
15 Department of Interior, and has served on several
16 federal, state, and local environmental advisory
17 committees. He was a consultant on the East Bay
18 Conversion and Reinvestment Commission, Base
19 Realignment, and Closure Pilot Project Report from
20 the Alameda Naval Air Station in Oakland, California
21 in 1996. Additionally, Mr. McDonald was the first
22 environmentalist and AAEA Center was the first
23 environmental organization in the US to publicly and
24 actively support nuclear power. The AAEA Center was
25 also the only environmental group in the nation to

1
2 support the National Harbor Project and the Woodrow
3 Wilson Bridge Replacement. And whereas Mr. McDonald
4 brought to then New York City Council Member Charles
5 Barron the idea for the bill that became the
6 signature environmental justice EJ legislation, a
7 model to be replicated around the nation. This EJ
8 bill addresses how citywide agencies will develop a
9 proactive plan for communities to share equitably
10 both the benefits and burdens of environmental
11 concerns. The law establishes an interagency working
12 group and an advisory board to promote greater public
13 engagement, transparency, and participation. And
14 whereas Mr. McDonald graduated from Wake Forest
15 University in 1977 [background cheers] and raised a
16 son as a single parent. In his free time he enjoys
17 boating, golf, tennis, fishing, skiing, swimming
18 [laughter], chess, helicopters, guitar, and website
19 design. Now therefore be it known that the Council
20 of the City of New York gratefully honors Norris
21 McDonald for his service and contributions to the
22 community and to the environment. Corey Johnson,
23 speaker for the entire council, Laurie Cumbo,
24 majority leader, Inez D. Barron, council member 42nd
25 District, Brooklyn. [cheers and applause]

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Wow! What an honor! I feel there should be a stamp, a street, a statue, and you should be in every history book in America and beyond! Thank you for the honor and thank you for bringing such an incredible icon before the City Council. What a history lesson right here. Thank you so much for bringing a legend, a living legend, here to the City Council for us to be able to celebrate all that you have done. Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Majority Leader Cumbo. I just want to say I met Mr. McDonald through Charles being here and introducing the legislation that Mr. McDonald brought in terms of making sure that we have justice, that we don't get dumped on with all of those health hazards and those conditions and situations that they like to dump in our community. We need a fair share policy, and so that's what this legislation does. I also want to thank my colleague, Costa Constantinides, he's not here, but we worked together to make sure that that got passed. And you see these other people standing here, this is his posse [laughter]. Mr. McDonald came all the way from California to receive this

1
2 proclamation. All the way from California. That's
3 where he lives. And his posse has come from North
4 Carolina, South Carolina, and other parts of the
5 country because they understand that we've got to
6 make sure we take time to acknowledge our own. We've
7 got to make sure that we tell our story. We can't
8 depend on other people to tell our story because it
9 doesn't always get told in its entirety, and this is
10 not the entirety, this is just a portion of it. But
11 we certainly want to thank God that you're here,
12 thank God that you're still with us and doing the
13 work that you do, and that you're continuing to do
14 it, and he said he's training his son. His son is
15 going to be coming right behind him following and
16 carrying the legacy and the torch that he has, and we
17 just want to thank you and at this time we're going
18 to have remarks from Mr. McDonald.

19 NORRIS MCDONALD: Thank you very much. I
20 really do want to thank Councilwoman Inez Barron.
21 She is the one who made this possible. [applause]
22 And of course, her husband Charles Barron. The
23 Environmental Justice Law that was passed here was
24 fourteen years in the making. Nobody thought this
25 thing was going to get through. I know I didn't.

1
2 And through their determination they made it happen.
3 And there are other people, Samara Swanston [cheers].
4 Samara Swanston shepherded this through. Indigo
5 Washington was instrumental in this as well. So the
6 Environmental Justice Law is the real reason I'm
7 standing here. And I've worked on environmental
8 issues for decades and from the national, regional,
9 state, and local levels, and it has been very
10 fulfilling in my life. I appreciate it. We have
11 been controversial and we've supported things like
12 Indian Point for nuclear power, as a clean air
13 source, because they don't emit smog-forming gasses
14 or greenhouse gasses. We've worked on environmental
15 justice at the local level to protect minority
16 populations from pollution, disproportionate
17 pollution in those communities. So I really
18 appreciate this recognition from the New York City
19 Council. We're gonna, the posse, posse [laughter],
20 we're gonna celebrate this proclamation today and
21 thank you so much, thank you Councilwoman Barron.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

23 [applause] [pause]

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel.
COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Ayala. Barron.
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Borrelli. Brannan.
COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera.
COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Chin.
COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Constantinides.
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy.
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch. Diaz. Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal. Eugene. Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Gjonaj.
COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.
COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.
UNIDENTIFIED: He's not here.
UNIDENTIFIED: King.
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Koo.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Borelli.
COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.
COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca. Miller.
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Moya. Perkins. Powers.
COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso. Richards.
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera. Rodriguez. Rose.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Torres. Treyger. Ulrich.
COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I'm here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.
COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer. Williams.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.
COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.
COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Cumbo.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All quiet in the chambers. Please rise for the invocation.

UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The invocation will be delivered by Pastor Bishop Earl W. McKay from the Church of God of Prophecy, located at 85 East 165th Street in the great borough of the Bronx. Quiet in the chambers.

PASTOR BISHOP MCKAY: Great, thank you, great and gracious God we come before you today with grateful heart sounds, saying thank you for your loving kindness, thank you for preserving us through the night, for waking us up this morning to see another day. Out of gratitude we desire to do your will today and so we ask that you grant guidance to all who by providence are assembled here today. Guide this illustrious council that you have selected, elected, and called out from among the

1
2 populace to serve this great city of New York. Grant
3 each council person discernment and discretion in all
4 their discussions and deliberations and decisions.
5 Grant that in these difficult times discussions and
6 deliberations will be done with utmost dignity and
7 reciprocal respect. Grant each wisdom as they seek
8 to serve with equity the interests of each citizen,
9 rich or poor, housed or homeless, powerful or
10 powerless. And oh Lord do attend to their deepest
11 personal needs and the needs of their families as
12 they selflessly and sometimes thanklessly serve the
13 needs of others. These favors we solicit of you with
14 hopeful and grateful hearts. Amen.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Motion to spread
16 the invocation in full upon the record.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
18 much, Madam Public Advocate, and I first and foremost
19 want to...

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhhhh.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: ...congratulate
22 you on your historic win. You have been elected to
23 serve in a higher capacity for such a time as this
24 and we want to congratulate you and wish you well in
25 your new role. God bless you. Good afternoon to all

1
2 of my colleagues and guests today. I am so honored
3 and privileged to have one of my pastors from my
4 district, Bishop Earl McKay, who serves as the senior
5 pastor of the Church of God of Prophecy, also known
6 as the Bronx Church, located at 85 East 165th Street
7 in our Claremont community. He recently celebrated
8 his thirtieth year as pastor of this Bronx
9 congregation after serving in a variety of other
10 ministry roles throughout the State of New York, and
11 I also want to recognize he is the pastor of the
12 Church of God of Prophecy in Bermuda and we thank you
13 for your role in that, Bishop. Throughout his
14 ministry and various outreaches the Bronx Church has
15 truly grown on every level and made a positive impact
16 throughout our community. Every event that is hosted
17 is purposefully designed around outreach, with the
18 goal of touching and elevating the lives of all of
19 God's people and spreading the good news of the
20 gospel, whether it is through our annual tent
21 crusade, Easter celebrations, voter registration
22 drives, working the 2010 census, and now the 2020
23 census, conducting a summer day camp, administering a
24 scholarship fund for our college-bound children in
25 the church, the weekly food pantry, which serves

1
2 lunch and dinner, serving over 1200 residents per
3 month, the partnership with the Department of Health
4 and Mental Hygiene to distribute health books and
5 supporting mental health awareness, the partnership
6 with the 161st Street Merchants' Association. During
7 the holidays we feed homeless families, as well as
8 our back-to-school fare. In addition, the church has
9 on-site HIV testing programs in partnership with the
10 Momentum Project. Every program served at this
11 church is designed to touch and transform lives. As
12 a strong community advocate, Bishop McKay has also
13 been appointed by the Bronx borough president to
14 serve as a community board member of Bronx Community
15 Board Four. He served as 15 years as chair of the
16 Housing and Land Use Committee. He served as an
17 executive committee member as well. His other
18 community involvements include clergy liaison to the
19 NYPD. He is a partner with Bronx Health Reach,
20 executive board member of Bronx HIV Network. He is a
21 board member of Highbridge Community Development
22 Corporation, and he served as the past president of
23 the 44th Precinct Clergy Counsel. The bishop has
24 many different roles, many different titles, but he
25 is truly a man of God, a man of commitment, a man of

1
2 conviction, a leader, teacher, and a preacher. And
3 through his leadership the Bronx Church promotes a
4 strong emphasis on its overseas mission work by
5 facilitating trips to Bermuda, to Dominica, to Haiti,
6 and to Sierra Leone. Bishop McKay just came back
7 from Bermuda just yesterday and we are so grateful
8 for Traveling Mercies to bring you here with us
9 today. All of the partnerships with local
10 organizations in the Caribbean Island, the work
11 around Hurricane Maria and the relief efforts that
12 affected the Caribbean Islands, as well as work in
13 Africa. Bishop McKay holds a professional
14 certificate in economic education for clergy from
15 Russell Sage College in Albany, an associate degree
16 with concentration in biblical studies from Berkshire
17 Christian College, a bachelor's degree in theology
18 from Malloy College, as well as he minored in
19 sociology and history, and he holds a master's degree
20 in urban ministry from Alliance Theological Seminary
21 in Nyack, New York. And, in addition, most
22 importantly, he has been married to his beloved first
23 lady, Ella Aurora, who is our minister, Ella McKay,
24 for forty-four years. To God be the glory. And they
25 are the proud parents of Christopher and Eleanor, who

1
2 both, along with their daughter-in-law, Angela, label
3 them in the ministry in the church. And he is the
4 proud grandfather of Andre, Christopher, and Micah.
5 That is his biography in a short snippet, but truly
6 Bishop McKay represents so much more than his
7 biography. He has made a difference. He has
8 personally helped me on the Jerome neighborhood
9 rezoning plan, which affected our district for years
10 to come, and I am grateful that Bishop McKay is here
11 and has provided us with our opening prayer to begin
12 our proceedings today. Thank you, Madam Public
13 Advocate. Thank you, Bishop McKay. May God bless
14 you and continue your great work in ministry, and
15 with that I am proud to spread the invocation in full
16 upon the record for today's proceedings. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
18 Council Member, and thank you, Bishop, for all the
19 work that you have done. God bless you. Adoption of
20 minutes.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and
23 papers from the mayor.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication from city, county, and borough offices.

UNIDENTIFIED: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and communications.

UNIDENTIFIED: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land use call-ups.

UNIDENTIFIED: M 114 through M 116.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on a call-up vote, and at this time I would ask for a roll call vote on all of today's land use call-ups.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: We are only voting on land use call-ups right now.

UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel.

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Ayala. Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Borrelli.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.
3 UNIDENTIFIED: Brannan.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.
5 UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
7 UNIDENTIFIED: Chin.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
9 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER Cohen: Aye.
11 UNIDENTIFIED: Constantinides.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
13 UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.
15 UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.
17 UNIDENTIFIED: Diaz.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yes.
20 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
22 UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
24 UNIDENTIFIED: Gibson.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Gjonaj.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: With your

permission, I'd like to vote on all land use call-ups
coupled with items on the general order calendar and
all resolutions.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Before I vote, I do
just want to add to the record, I want to urge my
colleagues, we've been in a real struggle in
negotiating to make it sure that we comply with the
law that each borough has an animal shelter. After a
number of conversations with my district, I just want
to let my constituents know that we did the best
effort from the mayor's office to the speaker's
office to make sure that this animal shelter is
delivered, as well as other services that get

1
2 delivered, not only for the 12th District, but the
3 Bronx, and as elected leaders in the council we have
4 a responsibility to educate our constituents, even if
5 they don't understand, and I thank the mayor's office
6 as well as the speaker's office and myself we'll be
7 able to deliver that to our constituents, so I'm
8 thankful again for everyone who helped make this
9 happen, Raju and the whole land use staff, I want to
10 say thank you for your help and your guidance and us
11 being able to deliver and complying with the law that
12 every animal in every borough has an animal shelter.
13 As I said earlier, we all go to hospitals and human
14 beings go to hospitals. Now we have a place for that
15 we can take our best friends, our pets in the borough
16 of the Bronx a full animal center. So with that
17 being all said, I say thank you everyone again today
18 and I vote aye on all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Koo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.
4 UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.
6 UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.
8 UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.
9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Maisel?
10 UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.
12 UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all.
14 UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.
16 UNIDENTIFIED: Perkins.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.
18 UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.
20 UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.
22 UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.
24 UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Treyger. Ulrich. Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [inaudible] I'd

like to vote on all the land use call-ups and a couple items on the general order calender and all resolutions?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, and I vote aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Today's land use call-ups are adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, zero in the negative. Quiet in the chambers.

UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers, as we now hear from the Speaker, Corey Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. Good afternoon. I want to thank you all for being here on this cold Wednesday. We have a busy agenda today. But I want to begin by acknowledging a tragedy that happened in our country last week, something that happens way too often. A gunman opened fire at the Borderline Bar and Grill in Thousand Oaks, California. Most of the victims were

1
2 colleague students with promising futures ahead of
3 them. One of them was a police sergeant responding
4 to the horror that day. Another survived, one of the
5 victims survived the mass shooting in the Las Vegas
6 strip a year earlier, only to lose his life this time
7 to gun violence. Our thoughts and prayers are, of
8 course, with the victims and their friends, but
9 again saying thoughts and prayers is not enough. We
10 need gun control and we need it now. I would like to
11 honor those twelve victims: Sergeant Ron Helus, Noel
12 Sparks, Dan Manrique, Justin Meek, Alaina Housely,
13 Telemachus Orfanos, Cody Coffman, Sean Adler, Mark
14 Meza, Jr., Blake Dingman, Jacob Dunham, and Kristina
15 Morisette. I also want us to acknowledge the
16 wildfires that have been ravaging the State of
17 California. It is still ongoing, but already 48
18 people have been confirmed dead, with many more folks
19 missing. It has been a tough couple of weeks for
20 California, and we want them to know that we are
21 praying for them. We also lost someone here closer
22 to home, Kam Po Lau, a school bus driver, who passed
23 away in recent weeks. For all of these tragedies I
24 would ask everyone here to take a moment of silence
25 and to please rise.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. Now, jumping into our docket for today the council will vote on the following finance items: Three pre-considered resolutions amending the property tax rates for fiscal year 2019, restating and amending the property tax rates that were set in June at budget adoption to implement state legislation lower the class share cap from 5% to 0.5%. I want to thank the staff who worked on this, Dr. Raymond Majesky, Emory Adev, and Davis Winslow from the finance division. Introduction 1144, sponsored by our finance chair, Danny Dromm, at the require of the mayor, authorizing 14 business improvement districts across the city to increase their annual BID assessments. Two pre-considered resolutions setting November 28 at 10:00 a.m. as the date and time for the public hearing to consider a Local Law to establish the Throggs Neck BID in Council Member Mark Gjonaj's district, and a Local Law to expand and increase the annual assessment at the Hudson Square BID in my council district. I want to thank the finance staff who worked on these BID items, Rebecca

1
2 Chasen, Noah Brick, and Stephanie Ruiz. The council
3 will vote on the following land use items.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The council will vote
6 on the following land use items: 2050 Bartow
7 Avenue, approval of a site selection for a full-
8 service adoption center and veterinary medical clinic
9 in Council Member Andy King's district. I really,
10 really am excited about this. Council Member Vallone
11 and I worked and his family worked for many years on
12 getting full-service animal shelters in all five
13 boroughs. Council Member Vallone passed a bill
14 requiring that there be full-service animal shelters
15 in all five boroughs and so today is a step in that
16 process. In getting this Bartow site done it wasn't
17 easy. I know that Council Member King was balancing
18 some local issues with also trying to get this done
19 and I'm really grateful that we did this. It's going
20 to be a state-of-the-art center, which is going to be
21 very important for the borough of the Bronx. 599
22 Courtlandt, it's an application for a small
23 development in our land use chair, Rafael Salamanca's
24 district. St. Michael's Park rezoning, it's a series
25 of applications to facilitate the expansion of a

1
2 cemetery in Council Member Constantinides' district.
3 The second amendment to the Coney Island Amusement
4 Park Special Process Agreement, it's going to add
5 property to the existing interim amusement park area
6 to eventually mapped as parkland in Council Member
7 Treyger's district. Hebrew Home for the Aged, a
8 special permit to facilitate the development of the
9 new continuing care retirement community with 388
10 independent senior living units in Council Member
11 Andy Cohen's district. I know he has spent an
12 enormous amount of time on this for many, many years,
13 and it has been complicated and difficult and it may
14 not be getting a lot of play today, but he has spent
15 literally years working on this, and so I want to
16 congratulate you, Andy, for getting this done. I
17 know it's a big deal. I want to thank our land use
18 staff, Amy Levitan, Julie Lubin, Jeff Campagna, John
19 Douglas, and Jeff Yoon. Moving on, the council will
20 vote on the following pieces of legislation today:
21 Introduction 1137A, sponsored by Council Member
22 Adrienne Adams, would codify into the charter the
23 Mayor's Office of Data Analytics. I want to thank
24 the staff who worked on this, Malcolm Buttehorn,
25 Irene Pirovsky, Patrick Mulderhill, and Sebastian

1
2 Bache. Introduction 376B, sponsored by Council
3 Member Ritchie Torres, will require the Department of
4 Youth and Community Development to conduct outreach,
5 informing as many youth as practicable about the
6 availability of bullying awareness and prevention
7 resource, including those that are providing
8 counseling, mental health resources, mobile texting
9 or internet chat functionality and referrals. The
10 bill would also require the Department of Education
11 to distribute to students information regarding any
12 existing online portal operated by the Department of
13 Education through which students or their parents may
14 report bullying, harassment, intimidation, or
15 discrimination. DYCD would also provide information
16 regarding DOE's portal of youth participating in its
17 program. I want to congratulate you, Council Member
18 Torres, on this important piece of legislation. I
19 want to thank the staff who worked on it - Smeeta
20 Desmuk and Paul Senagal. Next, in recognition of
21 Veterans' Day, the council will vote on several
22 bills, all sponsored by Council Member Eric Ulrich,
23 that would create comprehensive resources and
24 services for our city's veterans. Our veterans have
25 sacrificed so much for our country and they continue

1
2 to do so, and we owe it to them to ensure that they
3 are taken care of and that we as a city are doing
4 everything we can to protect and serve them.

5 Introduction 391A would require the Department of
6 Veterans Services to provide benefits, counseling
7 services to veterans seeking assistance with federal,
8 state, and city benefits that they may be entitled
9 based on their military service. The department would
10 be required to provide counseling services in at
11 least one location per borough and at each newly
12 created veterans' resource center. Introduction 394A
13 would require the department to create an official
14 veterans' resource center in each borough no later
15 than June 1, 2019, and to provide benefits counseling
16 services. Additionally, the Department of Veterans
17 Services would be required provide a minimum of 20
18 hours of in-field and office service to veterans in
19 each borough per week. And lastly Introduction 396A
20 would require the Department of Veterans Services to
21 create a veterans' resource guide with information on
22 benefits available to veterans and their family
23 members to provide information on laws affording
24 special rights and privileges to veterans,
25 protections and remedies given to veterans under the

1
2 New York City human rights laws, available physical
3 and mental health programs and resources, educational
4 and training opportunities, and available sources of
5 low or no-cost legal assistance. I want to
6 congratulate Council Member Ulrich and I want to
7 thank the staff who worked on this - Nasu Chowdhury,
8 Michael Kurtz, Zach Harris, Smeeta Desmuth, Andrea
9 Vasquez, and Zay Emanuel Halu. Finally, we are going
10 to vote on a series of bills related to the for-hire
11 vehicle industry. Introduction 304A, sponsored by
12 Transportation Chair Ydonis Rodriguez, would
13 establish a taxi medallion task force. Introduction
14 1062A, sponsored by Council Member Barry Grodenchik,
15 which require drivers for high-volume for-hire
16 vehicle services to be paid for trips even when the
17 payment transactions fails, for example because the
18 payment provider does not complete the transaction.
19 Introduction 1068A, sponsored by Council Member Steve
20 Levin, would require the Taxi and Limousine
21 Commission and the Department of Consumer Affairs to
22 engage in financial outreach in education to taxi and
23 for-hire vehicle drivers. Introduction 1079A,
24 sponsored by Council Member Donovan Richards, would
25 create the Office of Inclusion within the Taxi and

1
2 Limousine Commission the office would compile and
3 report statistics relating to driver demographics and
4 discrimination against passengers and address issues
5 relating to racism and discrimination in the taxi and
6 for-hire vehicle industries. I want to thank Council
7 Member Richards. He brought this up as part of our
8 conversation and debate on Uber and for-hire vehicles
9 this past summer. It was an important conversation,
10 it was one that we need to have, and I am grateful
11 we're moving on this bill today that he proposed back
12 then. Introduction 1081A, sponsored by Council
13 Member Rafael Salamanca, would require the Taxi and
14 Limousine Commission to provide assistance to
15 drivers, including mental health counseling,
16 financial counseling, and referrals to outside
17 organizations for additional assistance. And
18 Introduction 1096A, sponsored by our for-hire
19 vehicles committee chair, Reverend Rubin Diaz, Sr.,
20 will require that high-volume for-hire vehicles
21 companies as part of their new licensing requirement
22 they would need to affirm that they will not
23 administer any automatic deductions for vehicle
24 payments from driver pay unless the deduction is
25 optional and chosen by the driver. I want to thank

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

the chair for seeing all these bills through his committee, and I want to thank the staff who worked on these bills - James Digiovanni, Audrey San, Nell Beekman, Malek Nasardeen, Tirza Nassar, Emily Rooney, and Rick Arbello. That concludes our stated agenda for today and I look forward to proceeding with today's votes. Thank you, and stay warm these evening. And it is good to see you up there, Madam Public Advocate.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: We don't have much time left together.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, thank you Mr. Speaker. Discussion of general orders. Seeing none. Report of special committees.

UNIDENTIFIED: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of standing committees.

UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on Finance, Intro 1144, business improvement districts.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general orders.

UNIDENTIFIED: Pre-considered Resos 612 and 613, class shares.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general orders.

UNIDENTIFIED: Pre-considered Resos 614, property taxes.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general orders.

UNIDENTIFIED: Pre-considered Resos 615 and 616, Throggs Neck and Hudson Square BIDs.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general orders.

UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on For-Hire Vehicles, Intros 304A, 1062A, and 1068A, sale prices, risk of loss, and financial education for taxicabs.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on general orders.

UNIDENTIFIED: Intros 1079A, TLC Office of Inclusion.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on general orders.

UNIDENTIFIED: Intros 1081A and 1096A, Driver Assistance Services.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on general orders.

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
3 Land Use LU 231 and Reso 623, Bronx Animal Shelter.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Coupled on
5 general orders.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 241 and Reso 624 through
7 LU 243 and Reso 626, 599 Courtlandt Avenue.

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Coupled on
9 general orders.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 250 and Reso 627 through
11 LU 252 and Reso 629, St. Michael's Park.

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Coupled on
13 general orders.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 253, Hebrew Home.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
16 modifications and referred to the City Planning
17 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70b of the Rules of
18 the Council and Section 197d of the New York City
19 Council.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: [clears throat]Excuse me.
21 LU 254 and Reso 630, Coney Island Amusement Park.

22 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Coupled on
23 general orders.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
25 Technology, Intro 1137A, Office of Data Analytics.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
3 general orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
5 Veterans, Intros 391A, 394A, and 396A, veteran
6 resource centers.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
8 general orders.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
10 Youth Services, Introduce 376B, bullying prevention.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
12 general orders.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: On the general order
14 calendar, Intro 720, site safety training.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 253 and Reso 631, Hebrew
17 Home.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
19 orders.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Resolution appointing
21 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
23 orders, and at this time I would ask for a roll call
24 vote on all of the items on today's general order
25 calendar.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
3 chambers, please.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down please.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you. Madam
10 Public Advocate, congratulations to you...

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: ... on your victory
13 as our historic next Attorney General of New York
14 State. Congratulations to you. I'd like to thank
15 the members of the Technology Committee for
16 unanimously approving my legislation. Intro 1137A,
17 this is a bill that codifies into the New York City
18 Council the Mayor's Office of Data Analytics, which
19 is New York City's Civic Intelligence Center. While
20 the Mayor's Office of Data Analytics was created by
21 Executive Order 306 under Mayor Michael Bloomberg, We
22 must ensure that this office survives successive
23 mayoral administrations for years to come, and I
24 encourage my colleagues to approve this and support
25 this important piece of legislation today.

1
2 Congratulations to all of my colleagues who will pass
3 bills today, especially to Council Member King for
4 enduring a difficult process to pass the vote which
5 is before my committee to create a full-service
6 animal shelter in the great borough of the Bronx.
7 Thank you to my colleagues once again for your
8 support on my legislation. I do vote aye on all.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Barron.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
13 explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
16 rise today for an introduction. I would like to
17 introduce to the body Wanda Popiort. Ms. Popiort has
18 worked for New York City since 1994. She is employed
19 by the New York City Human Resources Administration
20 in their Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program,
21 also known as SNAP. She is a principal
22 administrative associate level one. Her duties
23 include, but are not limited to, training staff when
24 needed, keeping staff updated about changes on
25 policies and procedures within the SNAP program,

1
2 approving time and leave, reviewing, approving, and
3 disapproving cases for benefit and supervising staff.
4 So I have a very capable mature person as an intern.
5 She is in her last semester of the College of New
6 Rochelle. She is completing her master's in public
7 administration and in 2011 she obtained her
8 bachelor's degree from the College of New Rochelle in
9 liberal arts with a concentration in psychiatry, and
10 I vote aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Borelli.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all,
15 except Pre-considered Resos 612, 613, and 614.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Brannan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Chin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
24 explain my vote?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: First of all,
3 congratulations, Madam Public Advocate. I look
4 forward to working with you as our new state attorney
5 general. And I also want to thank the Finance
6 Committee for supporting two of my BIDs, the Chinese
7 Home BID and the Lower East Side BID on their
8 requests for increasing the assessment, and I vote
9 aye on all. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Madam Attorney
13 General-Elect, permission to explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I just really want
16 to express my profound gratitude to the land use
17 division, specifically Raja Mann, Amy Levitan, Julie
18 Lubin, and Jeff Yoon for the tremendous amount of
19 time that they spent holding my hand and walking me
20 through the Hebrew Home expansion, and I will say
21 that this project has gone through a tremendous
22 amount of evolution from its inception to this day,
23 including the preservation of 90% of the developable
24 site will be preserved as open space, so only using
25 10% of the land. And, again, it was an enormous

1
2 amount of work and the land use division really
3 proved its mettle and have my deep appreciation, and
4 thank you to the speaker's office for all their
5 support. And I encourage my colleagues to vote aye.
6 And I vote aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Constantinides.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
10 all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to
17 explain my votes?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: First I'd like
20 to congratulate you, I think it's the first time that
21 we have an attorney general presiding over the City
22 Council. So congratulations on that. And also I
23 want to congratulate my colleague, Eric Ulrich, on
24 the three bills, on the three veteran bills that is
25 being passed today, and I want to thank Eric for all

1
2 the work that he has done and continues to do on
3 behalf of our veterans. Aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 612, 613,
7 614. Aye on the rest. I want to congratulate my
8 colleague, Eric Ulrich, on his passage of veterans'
9 bills. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Diaz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to
13 explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Ladies and
16 gentleman, Madam Chair Lady, and ladies and
17 gentleman, I would like to take this opportunity as a
18 Puerto Rican born by [inaudible] Puerto Rico to thank
19 all of you and the speaker and all of you that went
20 to Puerto Rico to show you support for our island,
21 and the need that we are having in Puerto Rico.
22 Thank you very much, especially to those of you that
23 went to schools, to paint and to help build some
24 buildings and giving help to Puerto Rico. Thank you
25 very much to all of you, and I would like to express

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

my appreciation to the members of the For-Hire Committee for the wonderful job and the support that they are giving and to the speaker for supporting our committee, and to my counsel, Christopher Lean, who has done a wonderful job, and Madam, ladies and gentleman, I vote aye on all, and auf Wiedersehen.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Did you say auf Wiedersehen? [laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Congratulations, colleague. I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Gjonaj.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye on all, except 612, 613, and 614.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
explain?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Tish, we have
been so lucky here in the city to have you as our
advocate, and now we have to share you with the state
as our attorney, and I look forward to having you
represent us. Being our attorney and suing the hell
out of Trump, I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Ditto. [laughs]

UNIDENTIFIED: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I want to vote aye
on all, and to our attorney general-elect, in the
words of my daughter, Francis, go Tish [laughter].

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
Franny.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Congratulations,
Tish. We will miss you here at the City Council. We
wish you all the best and are very proud to see all
the great work that you'll be doing on behalf of all
of New York State. Thank you. Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Steve.

UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: A big ditto on
that, and aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes, definitely.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Madam Public

Advocate, I would like to add my congratulations and just know that you will continue to make us proud in all your future endeavors, and I feel safer already. And we do have a list in southeast Queens that we're know are gonna get done, right, and all that predatory stuff, and we're so excited, and with that I vote aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Perkins.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all, and all the best.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all, and congratulations.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on all, and congratulations.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Ah, congratulations. DJ is still waiting for his pancakes [laughter] but we certainly want to congratulate you on rising to the occasion and for making history in New York State, and with that being said, I also just want to thank the speaker, Jason Goldman, Jordon Gibbons, my legislative director, and counsel James Digiovanni for their work on the Office of Inclusion, and with that I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez. Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm so proud, Tish, much love, and I vote aye on all except for Pre-considered Resolutions 612, 613, and 614.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:
Congratulations, Madam Attorney General.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Helen.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It's pretty cool, and it's great, and it means a lot. You're a role model for a lot of women.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And I really appreciate you wish you much success in your position in serving the public.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. How do you vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No on nothing.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, OK.

[laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I also want to congratulate Council Member Adams on her bill for Office of Data Analytics. You're speaking to my heart. So I think this is great, the transparency

1
2 that will come from this. I really appreciate the
3 work that you've done on this, and Council Member
4 Dromm, you already know, but I'm really ecstatic
5 about the fact that we were able to lower the tax
6 rate cap from 0.5% to 0.05%, if I have that right.
7 So thank you very much for that, and with that I vote
8 aye on all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]

12 something about the bills. So I believe that, again,
13 the bill that with the support of Speaker Johnson, my
14 colleague, we're being able to vote today the one
15 that will create a medallion task force, it will be
16 very important [inaudible] recognize the level of
17 crisis of having taken so many drivers to commit
18 suicide. The Yellow Taxi crisis didn't happen
19 overnight. We promised decades ago that they will be
20 the only one that will have the exclusive right to
21 pick up and drop off in any corners of our city. But
22 the rules changed and many of those six thousand
23 individual medallion owners, many of them who live in
24 Queens, live in Brooklyn, different places, they saw
25 how the medallion value went down. A lot of those

1
2 hard-working commuter class, they used the value of
3 the medallion to get into [inaudible], to buy their
4 houses, to send their kids to colleague. Now those
5 medallion value went down to \$125,000 in average. So
6 we believe, I believe that by voting this independent
7 task force we will have a great opportunity, that
8 after a few months they will come back to us with
9 recommendation on how we can deal with the crisis
10 that is affecting the Yellow medallion industry in
11 our city. So with that I vote aye.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.

18 First I would like to congratulate you, Madam
19 Attorney General-Elect. Today will be voting on
20 Intro 1081, which is a direct response to the recent
21 tragedies of six New York City taxi drivers who
22 committed suicide this past year. For months the
23 City Council debated the merits around the ride-
24 sharing, but one of the unintended consequences was
25 how severe these financial, emotional, and physical

1
2 burdens would be on the drivers themselves. The
3 stigma around mental health illness is very real and
4 it cannot be understated just how important it is to
5 not only bring awareness it, but also encourage
6 people to seek out and receive the help that they
7 need. By requiring the Taxi and Limousine Commission
8 to provide their licensed driver assistance with
9 financial counseling, mental health counseling, and
10 more my hope is that thousands of taxi drivers can
11 finally gain some relief and know that there is hope
12 for them. This bill is for all cab drivers in New
13 York who have been suffering in silence, not knowing
14 how they are going to pay their debt, feed their
15 family, or keep the roof over the head. One life
16 lost to utter despair and hopelessness is too many.
17 Today's passage is our city's way of taking action
18 and doing something positive about it. And with that
19 I vote aye.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: Torres.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Madam
6 Public Advocate. I first want to begin by thanking
7 you for your extraordinary service to the City of New
8 York. The state is going to benefit greatly from
9 your leadership and from your example. Being that
10 we're voting on my veterans' bills today, I just want
11 to remind everybody or share with everybody how
12 difficult the fight was to create the Department of
13 Veterans' Services and how long and hard we fought to
14 bring that bill to fruition and to bring that agency
15 into existence, and I remember early on one of the
16 biggest supporters of the bill was yourself, was you,
17 and you were standing on the steps, literally, in the
18 cold with me and the advocates and just a handful of
19 our colleagues, when a lot of other folks probably
20 thought that it would never happen, and not only did
21 it happen, but we're now passing bills which
22 strengthen the support of services for veterans and
23 expand the services for veterans. So on behalf of
24 the veterans' community and the people who care about
25 veterans, I want to thank you for your advocacy, your

1
2 friendship, your partnership, and your leadership on
3 this very important issue, so thank you very much.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Eric.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I want to thank
6 Speaker Johnson. Thank you very much for bringing
7 these bills to the floor along with the chair, Chaim
8 Deutsch, who is doing an incredible job, he really is
9 just taking that committee to the next level and
10 passing a lot of important bills, and my good friend
11 and colleague, and my buddy here in the council, I
12 think he sometimes when I talk to him he kind of
13 tries to get away from me, he doesn't want to get in
14 trouble, but Justin Brannan is a prime cosponsor on
15 the bill, but he's fighting very hard for the
16 veterans in New York City. I want to thank him for
17 being a prime cosponsor on the bill. I went to the
18 Veterans' Day Parade in New York City. I was very
19 happy. I just missed Margaret Chin, but she's always
20 there, too, and I want to thank you, Margaret, for
21 going. The veterans really appreciated it. They
22 feel forgotten, so many of them, especially our
23 Vietnam veterans, and so any time we can recognize or
24 honor their service is a great thing. I want to
25 thank the advocates. I thank all of my colleagues,

1
2 all the cosponsors of the bills, it's a good thing
3 what we're doing today. I'm voting aye on all, with
4 the exception of 612, 613, and 614, and aye on the
5 rest. Thank you again.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Attorney
9 General, a moment to explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I first want to
12 thank Speaker Corey Johnson to really helping us get
13 to this point, I mean decades and decades, the city's
14 never had five full-service animal shelters. To see
15 that our Bronx colleagues stood together, got the
16 right sites, is a huge victory today, and now Queens
17 will follow suit, I'm hoping the site will be
18 announced soon and we'll get to the same work there,
19 but that is a legacy we can be proud of, because it
20 was never accomplished before you became the speaker.
21 So thank you for that, and the whole family thanks
22 you for that. And Eric and Chaim and all your work
23 on veterans, very proud to see that day come forward.
24 The work on the veterans, I was proud to cosponsor
25 that, and see that committee grow today to where it

1
2 is. And Alan, your hard work with the Jewish Center,
3 it's never easy when you have zoning and advocates
4 fighting with each other, but year old managed to
5 pull that through and congratulations, everyone. I
6 say aye on all except for Resolutions no 612, 613,
7 and 614.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
11 explain my vote.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: First, I vote
14 aye on all on the bills, and I, too, want to
15 congratulate you personally. But I also want to
16 thank the speaker and all of the members of this body
17 who either attended our rally in Long Island City
18 today or whoever expressed support for what is
19 happening, not just to Long Island City, but to the
20 entire city, and not just my council district, but to
21 the entire City Council. Let's make no mistake, the
22 deal that the governor and the mayor have entered
23 into is a bad deal for New Yorkers and as was loudly
24 and really firmly stated today, we're doing the wrong
25 thing when we as a city are chasing billionaires and

1
2 throwing billions of dollars at the richest men in
3 the world, and then skirting a process that all of us
4 would have had a role to play in just so they could
5 make sure that the deal could not be stopped and
6 evading meaningful review, and the truth is the more
7 we learn of the deal the worse it gets. More and
8 more information coming out every single day. So I
9 just want to thank all the colleagues who stood with
10 me today at the rally and others who couldn't be
11 there, but who have expressed their support for what
12 we are going through. It is not just my struggle, it
13 is our struggle. It is not just Long Island City's
14 struggle. It is all of New York City's struggle.
15 We, those of us who proclaim and call ourselves
16 progressive Democrats, have got to rethink the way
17 that we handle and deal with billionaires and the
18 richest man in the world who now even gets a helo pad
19 and doesn't even have to take the 7 train like the
20 rest of us, is in a position to rake us over the
21 coals. This is a bad deal for the City of New York
22 and I will continue to fight it. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye on all, with
3 the exception of Resolutions 612, 613, and 614.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye and
5 I'd like permission to explain my enthusiasm for our
6 attorney general, Letitia James. This is something
7 that I wrote very briefly following your primary win,
8 and I said you did it, we did it, yes, your victory,
9 our victory demonstrates that hard work, sacrifice,
10 experience, dedication, results do matter and are
11 important. You showed that you can't just show up at
12 churches and street corners come election time with
13 fancy ad campaigns and win. You showed that polls
14 that had you down by one percentage point were so
15 purposefully racist that you beat the identified
16 challenger by over twenty percentage points and they
17 came in third place. You showed that when people who
18 look just like you come out against you in support of
19 challengers that can't hold a candle to your record
20 of accomplishment that you have the power to rise
21 above it. Oh, and those newspapers that didn't
22 endorse you but have been covering your victories for
23 over two decades. Yes, they had to turn around and
24 report in those same papers that despite their
25 efforts to derail God's ordained plan you still won.

1
2 You showed that when people doubt your abilities you
3 can pull out an army of women and enlightened men
4 together that can hold you down, lift you up, and
5 carry you across the victory line. From the time you
6 announced your candidacy I imagined standing to you
7 at your victory party when you declared the next New
8 York Attorney General. I even knew what I would be
9 wearing LOL [laughter]. By the time I visited my
10 last polling site and gave out flyers at Whitman
11 Houses I was too tired. My little body gave way, and
12 so Prince and I watched the numbers come in together
13 and we just cried and cried when your numbers came
14 in. The world is now a different place because of
15 your accomplishment. A new norm has been established
16 and new goals and bigger dreams can now be had in
17 this new world. We love you, Letitia James, for your
18 tireless effort and for your dedication and fight for
19 the people that is honest and true from the heart.
20 Your parents would be so proud. And I dedicate this
21 poem to our next attorney general, Letitia James, but
22 I don't have enough time to read it. But it is Maya
23 Angelou's *Still I Rise*. So we thank you, we're proud
24 of you, we love you. Your accomplishment can't be
25 described in words, but you have changed the world

2 with your tireless dedication and we love you and
3 Prince claims your victory all the way home. Thank
4 you. [laughter]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Love you, thank
6 you. [applause] Thank you. Did she vote? OK.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: OK. Thank you.

9 All items on today's general order calendar are
10 adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, zero
11 negative, and zero abstentions, with the exception of
12 Resolutions 612, 613, and 614, which were adopted by
13 a vote of 42 in the affirmative, 7 negative, and zero
14 abstentions. And the revised land use call-up vote
15 is 49 in the affirmative, zero in the negative.

16 Introduction and reading of bills.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been
18 referred to the committee as indicated on today's
19 agenda.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There is no
21 resolution today and so let's begin with general
22 discussion. Council Member Gibson.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Nice, I'm first.
24 Thank you again, Madam Public Advocate, Madam
25 Attorney General-Elect. I just wanted to share with

1
2 my colleagues a couple of reminders. Tomorrow I am
3 proud to joint with the Committee on Public Housing
4 in hosting a joint hearing, the Subcommittee on
5 Capital Budget. It is going to be focused on NYCHA's
6 2107 physical needs assessment here in the chambers
7 at 10:00 a.m. Many of you know that based on the
8 physical needs assessment NYCHA's value of the amount
9 of money needed to fully restore and invest in NYCHA
10 is at 31.5 billion dollars. So tomorrow's hearing we
11 will be talking to NYCHA and other organizations
12 about how we tackle dealing with NYCHA. I also
13 wanted to share with my colleagues that city and
14 state legislators of color have been working with the
15 MIT CoLab on worker cooperatives. There was a recent
16 trip to Mondragon in Spain to look at many of the
17 worker co-ops there in Spain and how we could
18 replicate a lot of those practices here in New York.
19 And we are hosting the first-ever joint hearing of
20 city and state legislators of color, a hearing on
21 economic democracy for New Yorkers of color next
22 Tuesday, November 20, here in the chambers at 6:00
23 p.m. It's the first-ever. Members, if you are able
24 please join us. It's really going to be a very
25 productive hearing, talking about economic

1
2 development and worker co-ops. And as I close in my
3 last few seconds, Madam Public Advocate, I too want
4 to join with all of my colleagues in really saluting
5 you on this really historic victory. You have
6 transformed the Office of the Public Advocate. And
7 for that we are grateful, not just the number of
8 times you've sued the mayor and the governor, but the
9 fact that you've always stood with us, with children,
10 women, seniors, the LGBT community. You have really
11 stood firm. You have really supported a lot of us in
12 so many ways and we are grateful. The Office of the
13 Public Advocate is an important part of government in
14 holding city agencies accountable and you have really
15 transformed that office in the time you have served.
16 So once again I congratulate you. I look forward to
17 working with you in your new capacity, and thank you
18 for making the Office of the Public Advocate a
19 different environment to work with and work in. God
20 bless you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
22 Council Member Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
24 forgot to ask my intern to stand so that everyone
25 would know who she is. So I want to ask Ms.

1
2 [inaudible] to please stand so that you'll know who
3 it is that I describe when I talk about my intern.
4 [applause]. And secondly I just want to share the
5 great news that Charles Barron and I just celebrated
6 our 36th wedding anniversary [cheers and applause],
7 yeah, 36 years. And you can only imagine what great
8 fun we have had in 36 years, knowing Charles
9 [laughter].

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We can imagine!

11 [laughter]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yeah [laughs].

13 But sweetheart, I love you and look forward to
14 another 36 years, God willing. To Madam Attorney
15 General-Elect, I wish you all the best. I look
16 forward to having your voice there and we know that
17 people talk about the first, the first, the first,
18 and it was 50 years ago that Shirley Chisholm was the
19 first black woman to go to Congress. So in that same
20 tradition we're looking forward to you to be a trail-
21 blazer, to go forward, to be bold, to be unbought and
22 unbossed like Shirley Chisholm was, and to be that
23 voice up in Albany. And you know there are already
24 people there that, you know, will be able to bolster
25 you up in that regard. And finally I just want to

1
2 say that I think it was last Thursday, a week ago
3 Thursday, that we found out that there had been
4 vandals who attacked the monument at the African
5 Burial Ground. And I didn't hear about it until four
6 days after it had occurred. But as soon as we heard
7 about it we contacted Reverend Daughtrey and others,
8 December 12, who had been involved in making sure
9 that the remains that were located when they were
10 doing the excavation that those remains were treated
11 with dignity and respect. We stopped the building
12 because they weren't going to stop them, they were
13 just going to take the bones and do whatever with
14 them. But we forced them to stop and we now have
15 that tremendous monument. So as people are
16 demonstrating their lack of love for other people
17 we're going to continue to fight and make sure that
18 we as black people are not marginalized and that our
19 story continues to be told and we want the media to
20 give us the same kind of coverage when we are
21 assaulted in those ways. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so
23 much. Council Member Rosenthal.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Ah, yeah,
25 thank you very much. I rise today actually to talk

1
2 about the Office of the Public Advocate and to
3 acknowledge that there's been a resolution introduced
4 that would abolish the office, and I believe that's
5 very short-sighted. I understand that it would be
6 put to a vote, but as we've seen, call anything puppy
7 dogs and apple pie and people vote yes. I think that
8 the Office of the Public Advocate is the only other
9 citywide office to keep a check on the mayor.
10 There's no doubt in my time in city government when I
11 worked under the Koch, Dinkins, and Giuliani
12 administrations on the mayoral side that until today
13 that the power of the mayor's side is ginormous and,
14 you know, we try so hard in this body to push back
15 and to play a role, but if it weren't for the public
16 advocate, if it weren't for the comptroller, and if
17 it weren't for the Department of Investigation
18 keeping an eye on what the mayor does I think we
19 would be worse off for it. I further believe that
20 depending on who is elected to the position makes all
21 the difference, and the voters play all of that role
22 in deciding who's in there. If they want to choose
23 somebody who's in there just to do a ceremonial job,
24 that's what happens. It's not been my experience
25 with either you, your predecessor, or your

1
2 predecessor's predecessor. Instead, we have
3 important lawsuits against the city, we have a
4 continuously updated list of the hundred worst
5 landlords, which helps all of us in our district, in
6 our anti-eviction work, so I rise to speak against
7 that resolution and will continue to speak against it
8 as it moves through the legislative process. Thank
9 you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 Council Member Yeger.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam
13 President. As many in this chamber have
14 acknowledged, and many in our city and state have
15 acknowledged, congratulations to you, Madam
16 President, on an incredible victory, well-deserved
17 victory, recognition of your life in public service,
18 and it's an honor that you deserve to have, and the
19 people of New York deserve to have it as well...

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. Today
22 I am introducing, as some here may have heard,
23 Introduction 1240, which would not abolish the office
24 of public advocate, we don't have that power to do
25 that, and I wouldn't say that we should if we did.

1
2 It's to ask the voters the question of whether or not
3 the experiment in which we've engaged for the last
4 thirty years creating this office with five occupants
5 who have held it should continue. Five people have
6 held the office, fine New Yorkers, good public
7 servants, some of them are my friends. There are a
8 good number of people who are think about running for
9 this office, future aspirants. A lot of them are my
10 friends. Some of them serve in this body and they're
11 good council members. They are, too, public
12 advocates. It's not a question about whether or not
13 we should abolish the office. It's a question of
14 whether or not we should ask the voters. In an
15 environment where just a week ago we asked the voters
16 three very important questions. I did not support
17 the adoption of either, of any of them, but they
18 passed. That's what we do. We ask voters sometimes
19 when thing are that important. We've created a
20 charter revision commission here in this council
21 together with the borough presidents and the
22 comptroller and Madam President to ask voters a set
23 of questions later next year. That's what we're
24 proposing. I believe that after a 30-year experiment
25 of an office which in many respects has done a lot of

1
2 good work and surely in many respects the people who
3 have held it have been incredible human beings,
4 because I know them all and they're good people. But
5 they've been incredible public servants in the work
6 that they have done. But it doesn't mean we
7 shouldn't ask the question to the voters and let them
8 choose, and if they decide this makes sense we
9 continue. If they decide the office should have more
10 power, continue it. If they decide something
11 different, that's what we should abide by. Madam
12 President, I'm wrapping up and I appreciate the
13 indulgence. It's, again, it's not, and I just want
14 to make sure that I'm saying this on the floor of
15 this body that I have so much respect for, that I
16 walked in here as a 19 year old years ago, it's not
17 about anybody who holds the office. It's not about
18 anybody who seeks the office. It's not about whether
19 I think the office should exist, whether the
20 cosponsors of this legislation think the office
21 should exist, whether anybody in this council thinks
22 the office should exist. It's about whether we
23 should offer the question to the people of New York
24 and let them choose. Madam President, thank you
25 again, and again thank you for your service.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Grodenchik.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,
5 Madam Public Advocate. I just want to take this
6 moment to wish everybody a happy Thanksgiving. We
7 kind of forget about it this month because it's so
8 early, but I certainly haven't forgotten. It's my
9 favorite holiday, and Council Member Barron, when she
10 spoke about her 36 years of marriage, it reminded me
11 that this is the month that my grandparents were
12 married 111 years ago in Councilwoman Chin's district
13 on East Broadway, so Celia and Max, your grandson,
14 who you never met, is in the New York City Council.
15 Thank you all, and congratulations to you, Madam
16 Public Advocate. You're going to make a hell of an
17 AG.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, I
19 appreciate it. Council Member Menchaca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you and I
21 want to point you all to Resolution 608-609,
22 introduced today by the speaker and a whole bunch of
23 our colleagues. Too often with the Trump's
24 administration policies that we're hearing over and
25 over again throughout these last two years we're

1
2 inclined to react with outrage and fear rather than
3 proactively reach for every tool at our disposal here
4 in the city. These resolutions are an important step
5 in that direction.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Right.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: The speaker and
8 Chair Levine and Levin and myself will keep pushing
9 on public charge, which these two resolutions speak
10 on, but I want to leave you with one key message,
11 that submitting a public comment is one critical way
12 we can push back on this really unjust policy. It
13 matters because the federal government is obligated
14 to review every response, and so we're asking every
15 council member to slow these process down by sending
16 your unique comment and bring your communities to
17 send their unique comments. We are trying to hit the
18 goal of 100,000 public comments. We're already
19 reached 50,000 public comments across the federal
20 register throughout the country. Seventeen added
21 last night at a town hall in the Bronx, and I'm
22 calling on each and every one of you to do that work.
23 We'll be in touch with you and your offices. We
24 want to work with the delegations to bring every
25 borough forward to make sure that we can have plans.

1
2 December 10 is the last time that we can submit a
3 comment that will, again, have to be reviewed if they
4 are unique, one by one, by the federal agencies. I
5 want to end with this final remark. The Trump
6 administration's assault on our values and identity
7 as a sanctuary city has taught me and all of you here
8 how critical it is that we adopt a proactive rather
9 than a reactive stance on immigration, and now with
10 this Democratic majority in the state senate I
11 believe that we can have a unique opportunity to
12 reshape that social safety net at the city and the
13 state level to be more comprehensive. That's the
14 work that we're going to do. We're going to have a
15 public hearing on Thursday, and I look forward to
16 working with all of you. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
18 Council Member Holden.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Public Advocate,
20 just quickly. I just want to really highlight what
21 Council Member Menchaca said for the members who are
22 still here. This proposal, and I think it's very
23 important for every single one of us to email our
24 constituents and let them understand this proposal
25 could affect almost half a million immigrants in New

1
2 York City and deny them SNAP benefits and other
3 public benefits which they qualify for. These are
4 folks who are trying to get permanent residency or a
5 green card in New York City who have always been
6 entitled to these benefits and this is very
7 draconian. We have already seen a huge number of
8 people not enrolling in programs they qualify for
9 because of fear, and it's actually going to, besides
10 being immoral it's going to cost the city a
11 tremendous amount of money by folks not being able to
12 participate in these programs. So Council Member
13 Menchaca has been an extraordinarily I believe
14 national leader on talking about immigration in his
15 time as chair following our great chair, Danny Dromm,
16 in that position and I really just want to highlight
17 the work he's done and the importance of this, and I
18 think you want to go to Council Member Holden and he
19 wants to change the vote, so I know he has to ask for
20 unanimous consent.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes, request the
22 unanimous consent of the council. I'd like to change
23 my vote to no on 612, Reso 612, 613, and 614.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
25 Council Member Lander.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
3 Attorney General-Elect. First, both Rosa and Marak
4 asked me to convey their heartfelt and deep
5 congratulations to you, and they remind me of the
6 time that you have been their advocate in so many
7 cases and they feel very luck that the people of New
8 York, all the people of New York State, have you
9 fiercely defending our interests now. We could not
10 be luckier and they wanted me to extend their
11 deepest, deepest wishes to you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I'm proud today
14 that we are together introducing some legislation. I
15 want to call people's attention to Reso 1231, to take
16 some next steps in improving our campaign finance
17 rules and further restricting independent
18 expenditures. So thank you for taking leadership on
19 that. Your leadership as public advocate has indeed
20 been fierce and I think is evidence for why that
21 office is one that we should keep. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 Council Member Koslowitz.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. In
25 1988 I worked for the president of the City Council,

1
2 when we had the Board of Estimates. It's a long time
3 ago. But now that title is the public advocate. And
4 I have to say that the public advocate is a very
5 important position for New York City because there,
6 it goes against, if they don't like what the mayor
7 does it will go against them. The people have,
8 nobody complains about the public advocate. And I
9 know when I worked for the president of the City
10 Council we got thousands of calls from people looking
11 for help. We had a senior hotline that people called
12 and any other, I know that I was the Queens liaison
13 for the president and I used to go out to different
14 communities. I remember going to Long Island City
15 when at that time they didn't let me go by myself
16 because it was dangerous, going out and looking for
17 things that we brought back to the president and he
18 fought the mayor, at that time it was Ed Koch was the
19 mayor, and after Ed Koch it was David Dinkins. And
20 everybody got along fine, and the people vote, they
21 go out to vote. If they didn't want the public
22 advocate they just would leave that blank. So I
23 think the public advocate does a great job. This
24 public advocate did a great job. I hope the next
25 public advocate works just as hard as this public

1
2 advocate and we will know that we have a great public
3 advocate. And I also want to wish you the best. You
4 are great. I've watched you be a council member and
5 then the public advocate, and now the attorney
6 general. I am very proud of you. I'm older than
7 you, so I could say that I am just very, very proud
8 of you. I watched you grow. And let's continue the
9 public advocate.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, thank
11 you so much. In fact, Council Member, if you count
12 up all of the cases that we have handled of the four
13 sponsors of the bill, we've handled over 4589
14 constituents from four of the sponsors, and I've got
15 all of the zip codes and all of the constituents that
16 we've held from their respective districts. Our last
17 speaker is Council Member Cornegy.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: He's our last speaker.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I better be
20 profound, then [laughter]. Thank you, Madam Attorney
21 General-Elect. As many of you know, I measure the
22 progress of this city and my colleagues in the ages
23 and growth of my children, and I can remember as a
24 Councilwoman you holding Nava in your arms and then
25 her holding you around your knees and then around

1
2 your waist, and as the public advocate around your
3 shoulders, and her now looking down on you while
4 simultaneously looking up at you. So I want to thank
5 you for the impact that you've had on my girls as
6 they have watched your ascent to leadership. I did
7 want to just mention my third-party transfer town
8 hall that is being held tomorrow at the Brooklyn Law
9 School. It's important that the town hall event will
10 feature an informational panel from 6:30 to 7:30,
11 including representatives from several stakeholders
12 in the TPT program. They include the City Department
13 of Housing Preservation and Development that oversees
14 the program, three organizations who receive
15 properties through the program Neighborhood Restore,
16 Urban Homesteading Assistance and Impact Brooklyn, as
17 well as Center for New York City Neighborhoods. This
18 is an attempt to have, in addition attendees will be
19 able to receive on-site assistance with everything
20 from outstanding municipal arrears, tax liens, water
21 bills, foreclosure prevention assistance, resolving
22 building violations, and more from the following
23 agencies and organizations in an effort to get those
24 who have found themselves in the TPT process either
25 removed by curing their violations or by entering

1
2 into agreements with the various agencies as a
3 process. So it's a very unique kind of town hall,
4 very short panel, and then the opportunity to break
5 out into rooms and deal with any violations that
6 people may find themselves in to help kind of cure
7 some of what we're seeing in the minority communities
8 primarily across the city with the controversial
9 third-party transfer program. Thank you. That's
10 tomorrow at Brooklyn Law School at 6:30.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And lastly an
12 amended tally, Resolution 612, 613, and 614, which
13 were adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 8 in
14 the negative, and zero abstentions. Mr. Speaker to
15 close.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I want to wish everyone
17 a happy Thanksgiving in advance. We all have a lot
18 to be grateful for as elected officials who get to be
19 of service to the city that we love and the people
20 that we get to serve every single day. I want to
21 remind folks that next week we are going to be having
22 an oversight hearing on the Board of Elections and
23 what happened on Election Day, so folks should come
24 to that hearing. If you heard about issues in your
25 district or saw it, come. We're going to have the

Board of Elections here and we want council members to participate in a meaningful way before the next legislative session starts in Albany to push for voting reforms and hopefully structural changes at the Board of Elections, and with that today's Stated Meeting of November 14, 2018, is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 17, 2018