

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

November 27, 2018

Start: 1:08 p.m.

Recess: 2:28 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 14<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: I. DANEEK MILLER  
Chairperson

FERNANDO CABRERA  
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

BEN KALLOS  
ALAN N. MAISEL  
BILL PERKINS  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
KALMAN YEGER  
ADRIENNE E. ADAMS  
KEITH POWERS  
DANIEL DROMM  
ANDY L. KING  
ERIC A. ULRICH  
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dawn Pinnock

Executive Deputy Commissioner at the New York  
City Department of Citywide Administrative  
Services, DCAS

Barbara Dabbeberg

Deputy Commissioner for Human Capital at the New  
York City Department of Citywide Administrative  
Services, DCAS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

3

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Good afternoon

everyone and for the record we are not tardy, we were here, we, we watched everyone come in and, and kind of the minutiae of, of, of the council, we were voting across the hall and upstairs simultaneously and, and, and now we're back to address this important topic. So, good afternoon, I'm Council Member I. Daneek Miller and the Chair of the Committee on Civil and Labor. I'm glad to be joined by my colleague, Fernando Cabrera, the Chair of the Committee on Governmental Operations. Today we are holding an oversight hearing examining the civil service system with a particular focus on provisional employee reduction plan. In addition to the reduction plan we will examine the length of time it takes for eligible lists to be generated as a, a civil service exam is taken, the ability of DCAS who holds civil service examinations generate eligibility lists and place people into jobs directly related to reducing the number of provisional employees employed by the city of New York. It is also directly related to the city's legal obligation to achieve sustain,

1  
2 sustainable compliance with the length of provisional  
3 appointments permitted by law. The last hearing that  
4 we held on this topic was March of, of '16 with  
5 previous hearings being held in February of '15 and,  
6 and November '14. New York City's civil service  
7 system is highly complex and marred with numerous  
8 issues specifically regarding provisional employees  
9 in general. New York City works like many other  
10 municipalities across the country filling its  
11 positions through civil service process. To be  
12 permanently appointed to one of these positions an  
13 applicant must take the test and pass a competitive  
14 civil service examination administered by DCAS. If  
15 there is no list of potential candidates who have  
16 passed the exam, then provisional employees are  
17 appointed provisionally fill such vacancies. State  
18 law dictates that no provisional employee may serve  
19 for a period in excess of nine months. Unfortunately,  
20 this has not been the case in New York City or other  
21 municipalities across the state and thousands of  
22 provisional employees have served for years in these  
23 jobs well beyond the nine months envisioned by the  
24 state. A court case in 2007 emphasized the importance  
25 of municipalities to abide by time limitations

1 imposed by the state and the state legislature  
2 subsequently passed a law that required all New York  
3 State municipalities including New York City to  
4 reduce the number of provisional employees employed,  
5 first New York City issued in 2008 provisional  
6 reduction five year plan, since then the city has  
7 received state extensions on its plan to  
8 substantially comply with the state law in respect to  
9 provisional employees and the Long Beach decision.  
10 Although provisional employee reduction plan was to  
11 have reduced all provisional employees down by at  
12 least five percent by 2013. Still existing by august  
13 of 31... August 31<sup>st</sup> of '18, 17,455 provisional  
14 employees within the city's workforce. This marks a  
15 substantial reduction of 18... of, of 1,898 within one  
16 quarter thus DCAS has made real progress in  
17 attempting to reduce the number of provisional  
18 employees on the city's payroll and should be  
19 commended for the numerous steps it has taken to  
20 achieve such a decline but it's not jsut start  
21 kissing each other just yet. However, DCAS must  
22 continue to... DCAS must continue to work and, and, and  
23 more is needed to be done as the city is still not on  
24 target to meet its state-imposed deadline.  
25

1  
2 Recognizing this and, and wanting to provide the city  
3 and other municipalities the opportunity to continue  
4 to implement their reduction plan while ensuring the  
5 continued quality of effect, effectiveness of  
6 governmental operations, the state legislature has  
7 passed in an assembly bill 11241 and 8837... I'm sorry,  
8 11241 is senate and assembly 8837. This bill still  
9 awaiting the signature and the governor would allow  
10 the city to update the continued implement its  
11 provisional plan, permit DCAS to administer an  
12 examination to provisional employees in certain  
13 titles with specific qualifications and experience  
14 and authorize DCAS to submit to the state a revised  
15 reduction plan to be implemented by December 31<sup>st</sup> of  
16 2021 to further reduce the number of provisional  
17 employees. In addition, D... if DCAS is not in  
18 substantial compliance with the new time period  
19 granted by the bill and the bill mandate the  
20 establishment of an advisory work group for  
21 provisional appointments. The city will comprise of  
22 members appointed by the government, the Governor,  
23 the Mayor which would prepare a recommended plan for  
24 compliance to be adopted by... pursuant of state law.  
25 Legislation I sponsored and that will be heard at

1  
2 this hearing, 1235 would require that DCAS submit to  
3 the council a copy of its new revised reduction plan  
4 to achieve substantial compliance by 2021 that is...  
5 must be submitted to the state of New York. At this  
6 hearing I would like to hear about what is being done  
7 by DCAS in terms of keeping our true provisional  
8 reduction plan as well as ways in which they are  
9 effectively reducing the number of provisional  
10 employees within the city's workforce. Any new and  
11 innovative approaches the city is taking to continue  
12 to reduce the number of provisional appointments  
13 should be also discussed. In addition, I want to  
14 receive an update about any new things occurring in  
15 the city civil service system such as the new civil  
16 service exams, how exams are being administered, how  
17 they're being tracked, eligibility lists, length of  
18 time that they are taking to post, etcetera. I look  
19 forward to hearing this information and hope that we  
20 can continue to work together to ensure that the, the  
21 plan deadlines are met adequately while we are also  
22 working towards the future of the civil service  
23 system. I'd like to thank Mr. Joe Goldbloom and  
24 Brandon Clark from my office and certainly our  
25 Committee Counsel along with Kevin Kendall and the

1 rest of the team and with that I give you my Co-Chair  
2 for the day, Council Member Fernando Cabrera.

3  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
5 much and good afternoon. Welcome to this joint  
6 oversight hearing of the Committee on Governmental  
7 Operations and Civil Service and Labor that will  
8 examine the civil service system and focus on the  
9 provisional employee reduction plan. I want to give a  
10 special thanks to my Co-Chair, Council Member Miller  
11 for his firm commitment on this issue and for your  
12 leadership. The provisional employee category exists  
13 for a reason, it allows a local government to create  
14 new programs and hire quickly to meet immediate staff  
15 needs. This ensures that essential agency functions  
16 are not disrupted. Ultimately, provisional service  
17 titles should be used to add flexibility to the city  
18 employee system and maintain agency stability.  
19 Unfortunately, for decades the city of New York has  
20 relied too heavily on provisional appointments to  
21 serve their aforementioned purpose at the expense of  
22 transitioning to civil service, service title. As of  
23 the last quarterly report the city.. the city still  
24 has over 17,000 provisional employees. We have met  
25 many times with DCAS Commissioner Camilo and staff to

1 discuss the, the work DCAS is doing to provide more  
2 civil service exam, update their civil service lists  
3 and improve test taking and result posting timelines.  
4 And I am encouraged that while DCAS has not yet  
5 reached the level of provisional employees considered  
6 to be substantially compliant by the state I have  
7 seen their concerted effort to decrease provisional  
8 employees and transition provisional employees to  
9 civil service titles through offering more testing  
10 and improving test taking and test result delivery.  
11 As an agency you have demonstrated that you share our  
12 commitment to reduce the number of provisional  
13 employees for the sake of a robust city workforce and  
14 I look forward to hearing through our discussion  
15 today how you will continue your good work in an  
16 equitable way keeping in mind the various timelines  
17 set forth by the state. Thank you to the committee  
18 staff for their work on this issue, civil service and  
19 labor counsel Malcolm Butehorn; Policy Anylist,  
20 Analyst Kevin Katowski; my own Committee Senior  
21 Staff, Senior Counsel Brad Reid; Policy Analyst  
22 Elizabeth Kronk; Emily Forgione and my Legislative  
23 and Communications Direct, Director Claire McLeveighn  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 and Michael Vane. And with that we will be swearing  
3 in the administration.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: If you could both raise  
5 your right hand please. Do you affirm to tell the  
6 truth, the whole truth and nothing but truth in your  
7 testimony before these Committees and to respond  
8 honestly to Council Member questions?

9 DAWN PINNOCK: Yes, I do.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: I would just ask to  
11 make sure the red light is going on the microphone  
12 and if you could just state your names and agency for  
13 the record? Thank you.

14 DAWN PINNOCK: My name is Dawn Pinnock  
15 and I serve as the Executive Deputy Commissioner at  
16 the Department for Citywide Administrative Services.

17 BARBARA DANNENBERG: My name is Barbara  
18 Dannenberg and I am the Deputy Commissioner for Human  
19 Capital for the Department of Citywide Administrative  
20 Services.

21 DAWN PINNOCK: Thank you. Good afternoon  
22 Chair Miller, Chair Cabrera and members of the  
23 Committee on Civil Service and Labor and the  
24 Committee on Governmental Operations. I am Dawn  
25 Pinnock and I proudly serve as the Executive Deputy

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 Commissioner of the Department of Citywide  
3 Administrative Services, commonly known as DCAS and  
4 I'm joined today by Barbara Dannenberg, Deputy  
5 Commissioner for Human Capital. Thank you for this  
6 opportunity to discuss DCAS's role as it relates to  
7 provisional reduction for the City of New York. As a  
8 proud civil servant and the daughter of civil  
9 servants, I know firsthand the importance that civil  
10 service careers have on the lives of New Yorkers.  
11 Civil service, a system based on merit and fitness,  
12 serves as the foundation on which this city  
13 functions. Through the city civil service system,  
14 applicants are afforded opportunities to prove their  
15 merit and fitness based on an objective assessment of  
16 their skills and abilities. It also serves as a  
17 pathway to the middle class for underserved and  
18 underrepresented communities. It is therefore  
19 critical that we operate the civil service system  
20 competently, fairly and expeditiously. DCAS will  
21 continue to work diligently to introduce system  
22 improvements, strengthen collaborative partnerships  
23 and reduce the provisional workforce as required, all  
24 while keeping New York City running. To that end, I  
25 would now like to highlight the successes of our

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 provisional reduction plan, which we refer to as RP2,  
3 which highlights DCAS's commitment to address the  
4 city's provisional count. In May of 2008, after  
5 decades of neglect, the city's provisional count rose  
6 to its highest point, which was 37,797. Nearly ten  
7 years later in January of 2017, we launched RP2.  
8 Through RP2 we had an aggressive goal of reducing the  
9 city's provisional count from 23,296 to 17,311. I am  
10 pleased to report that as of November 22<sup>nd</sup>, of 2018,  
11 the city's provisional count has... is now 17,380,  
12 which is just 69 actions away from the goal of RP2.  
13 Over the next five weeks we will moving forward on  
14 various fronts to close the final gap to reach our  
15 RP2 goal. This represent the first time in the city's  
16 history since it started its provisional reduction  
17 work that DCAS has come within striking distance of  
18 its provisional reduction goal and substantial  
19 compliance with the Civil Service Law by having five  
20 percent of our competitive workforce serve  
21 provisionally. Since our last meeting in 2016, we  
22 received state approval to address the city's  
23 longstanding provisional issue from January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2017  
24 through December 31<sup>st</sup>, of 2018. Over the course of  
25 the last two years, DCAS, with the support of its

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 client agencies and labor partners has made  
3 significant progress in improving the city's  
4 compliance with civil service law. Through RP2 we  
5 focused on four key areas; exam administration,  
6 enhanced compliance, automation and staff  
7 augmentation. With respect to exam administration, I  
8 just want to first start off by providing a  
9 definition of a provisional employee. A provisional  
10 employee is an employee who has met the minimum  
11 qualifications for the title and may be serving  
12 satisfactorily in that title. Unfortunately, for some  
13 provisional employees, an examination for their  
14 respective title may simply not have been offered  
15 during their tenure. To that end, the cornerstone of  
16 any provisional reduction plan has and will always be  
17 competitive examination. Over the last three fiscal  
18 years, DCAS has administered a total of 562 exams. In  
19 fiscal year '16, we administered 105 exams, fiscal  
20 year '17, 183 exams and in fiscal year '18, we  
21 administered a record high of 274 exams. Our number  
22 of test takers has increased tremendously over these  
23 fiscal years as well. Another important examination  
24 related component of RP2 was the introduction of a  
25 new testing format for the city of New York; the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 Qualified Incumbent Examination. On November 28<sup>th</sup>,  
3 2016, New York State passed law to amend Civil  
4 Service Law Section 65(5), which authorized DCAS to  
5 administer the QIE exams to provisional employees  
6 with at least two years of service in specific  
7 titles. As of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 2018, DCAS has  
8 administered 187 QIE exams and established eligible  
9 lists for 174 titles and has made over 4,200  
10 appointments to transition... to transition  
11 Provisionals into permanent status. With respect to  
12 enhanced compliance; DCAS has conducted a series of  
13 compliance meetings since April of 2017 directly with  
14 agencies to discuss various civil service issues. To  
15 date, we have held over 100 meetings with 73 agencies  
16 regarding plans to resolve Provisionals serving in  
17 the face of lists, discussing opportunities to roll  
18 back individuals to their permanent titles,  
19 highlighting the importance of citywide hiring pools  
20 and upcoming hiring needs. In conjunction with our  
21 compliance meetings, provisional increases are  
22 monitored and considered for inclusion in all of our  
23 future exam schedules. This allows DCAS the  
24 flexibility in responding to the changing demands of  
25 the city's workforce while affording every

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 provisional employee an opportunity to gain permanent  
3 status. A recent example is with our partners at the  
4 Administration for Children Services. We were  
5 informed to their need to appoint a large number of  
6 youth development specialists. As a result, we were  
7 able to plan with them on a hiring effort as well as  
8 add that particular exam to our exam schedule. To add  
9 to this, we also monitor Provisionals through the  
10 creation of dashboards that we publish weekly... bi-  
11 weekly, excuse me, which allows agencies to monitor  
12 important provisional metrics such as citywide  
13 provisional counts, provisional count by agency and  
14 provisional count by title. Another successful tool  
15 that we have utilized has been citywide hiring pools.  
16 A citywide hiring pool allows an eligible candidate  
17 exposure to multiple agencies and multiple job  
18 opportunities at one time and it allows us to make  
19 permanent appointments more expeditiously. Over the  
20 course of RP2, we have conducted 16 citywide hiring  
21 pools, we've also involved our labor partners in this  
22 endeavor. In addition, we have developed and deployed  
23 functionality utilizing the city's automated  
24 personnel system to centralize any provisional title  
25 changes and to stop agencies from hiring

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 provisionally in the face of civil service lists.  
3 Last and certainly but not least, we've also  
4 increased our civil service footprint through  
5 training. DCAS has developed and regularly provides  
6 what we call civil service 101 information sessions  
7 to inform Provisionals of their status but also to  
8 highlight the importance of public sector to careers  
9 to prospective city workers. Over the last two years,  
10 we have conducted 395 civil service 101 sessions for  
11 a total of 13,351 attendees. Automation, auto... the  
12 automation of the Qualified Incumbent Exam process is  
13 really the only fully end to end automation exam of  
14 its type today for the city of New York. Through this  
15 new and innovative approach, we have been able to  
16 establish eligible lists for QIE titles in a record  
17 time of three months compared to up to a year for  
18 other types of competitive exams. In our continued  
19 efforts to improve service delivery to our current  
20 and prospective employees and to reduce the cycle  
21 time associated with list establishment, DCAS is  
22 currently developing new systems working on other  
23 test formats that will be unveiled in 2019 and 2020.  
24 We are also proud to share that in January of 2019,  
25 we will be rolling out an improved online application

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 system. This new system will provide transparency to  
3 applicants for exams and it takes a user-friendly  
4 approach to allowing our customers to self-manage  
5 their account profiles and sharing applicant  
6 dashboard information including exam application  
7 history, test results and notifications concerning  
8 scores for exams and admission notices. Future  
9 upgrades are also planned for 2020 which will enable  
10 DCAS to deploy the new Education and Experience Exam  
11 via an automated format. To further our shared  
12 commitment to transparency and enhanced customer  
13 service, DCAS has also opened a Queens Computerized  
14 Testing Center in June of 2017. We are grateful for  
15 the support that this Committee and Council Member  
16 Miller in particular provided as it related to the  
17 promotion and opening of this center. In addition, we  
18 opened another CTAC in December of 2017 in Staten  
19 Island. Finally, we will complete this footprint as  
20 it relates to testing in the Bronx when we open a  
21 testing center on 1932 Arthur Avenue this winter,  
22 which provides us additional seating for computerized  
23 testing. As it relates to soft... staffing and staffing  
24 augmentation, in December of 2016, the Bureau of  
25 Exams received approval for 15 additional positions

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 to increase our testing capacity. The additional  
3 staff who serve as test and measurement specialists,  
4 handle all exam related functions which helps to  
5 expedite and augment our ability to maintain an  
6 aggressive examination schedule. As a result of  
7 having the additional staff, we were able to  
8 administer a record high of 274 exams in fiscal year  
9 '18. It has also allowed DCAS to increase our  
10 reliance on in house exams and to limit the use of  
11 consultants to provide testing services. In  
12 conclusion, I would like to thank the Council for the  
13 opportunity to testify today and for their support  
14 over these last few years. Our successes would not  
15 have been achieved without the council and  
16 particularly Council Member Miller's continued  
17 support and guidance. We look forward to continuing  
18 to work with you as partners and to the new state  
19 legislation, Intro A11241 and S8837A, that will allow  
20 DCAS to continue its work towards provisional  
21 reduction. Finally, we are looking forward to working  
22 with the Committee as it relates to Intro 1235, which  
23 would allow for greater transparency in requiring  
24 DCAS to post publicly its provisional reduction plans  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 on its website and sharing it with the Council. We're  
3 now more than happy to respond to your questions.

4 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank you so much.  
5 We've been joined by Council Members Adams, Yeger,  
6 Dromm and, and Maisel has his roller skates on today  
7 so I... he went past me in the parking lot and he's now  
8 back. So, as usual your testimony was, was, was quite  
9 thorough and anticipating... and in anticipation of  
10 what we might ask here but we've doing this now  
11 together for about five years so I, I really don't...  
12 there's a lot of questions here and, and for some of  
13 the members who may not have been a part of the, the  
14 last hearing in 2016 that really, you know to a  
15 certain degree I, I want to be able to indulge them  
16 in a little more detail about this... about the  
17 provisional employee and, and kind of the need based  
18 on the... not just based on the, the Long Beach  
19 decision but, but based on its impact on the  
20 workforce and, and what that means and so why we have  
21 such a charge to get it right and make sure that we  
22 have permanent civil service employees as opposed to  
23 these provisional employees and so we want to be able  
24 to drill down on that but I, I also want to kind of  
25 do it chronologically and, and not drop... jump back

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 and forth but I do want to talk about at, at the  
3 current time... the current timeline for the  
4 provisional reduction in order to achieve compliance  
5 with the state law and obviously with 11241 and 8837  
6 which requires a revised plan so what would you be  
7 doing differently obviously... you know would you look  
8 to enhance some of the things that, that you've  
9 already done and or are you looking to do some things  
10 that are totally different from what we've seen in  
11 order to achieve compliance?

12           DAWN PINNOCK: Well as you mentioned our  
13 current provisional reduction plan is scheduled to  
14 sunset on December 1<sup>st</sup>... excuse me, December 31<sup>st</sup> of  
15 2018 and we've actually begun, I'm drafting our new  
16 pre-provisional reduction plan in hopes that we will  
17 receive additional time and so we intend to follow a  
18 hybrid approach. We certainly look to capitalize on  
19 the successes that we've had specifically relating to  
20 the Qualified Incumbent Exam because as mentioned it  
21 is the one fully automated end to end automated  
22 system that we currently have around testing and so  
23 to see a civil service list be able to be promulgated  
24 in a matter of three months compared to the 12 months  
25 that we historically have contended with is certainly

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 a win for the city. And in anticipation of that we've  
3 worked directly with our labor partners to have them  
4 take a look at all of the titles that we believe were  
5 appropriate for this kind of testing and we've  
6 received their feedback. Additionally, we've created  
7 our examination schedule, we've also projected hiring  
8 needs that have been shared with us by the agencies  
9 to ensure that we're tapping into the right titles,  
10 but we are also continuing to push as it relates to  
11 automation. So, while we satisfied the requirement of  
12 creating a system for the QIE exam, our next step is  
13 to focus on the education and experience exams, which  
14 is another manual exam that we have. So, we've been  
15 actively working with our IT group in order to  
16 automate that as well. So, so we really intend to  
17 capitalize on our successes following, you know  
18 aggressive examinations but also continue along the  
19 path of making sure that we're addressing titles that  
20 the city has not historically handled for many years.

21 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: What makes the, the  
22 QI exam aside from the automation different from the  
23 other exams that had been traditionally administered  
24 and has that made a real difference, contributed to  
25 the difference that we've seen aside from the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 automation in, in reducing the number of, of  
3 Provisionals?

4 DAWN PINNOCK: I would say the primary  
5 difference is that we first needed legal  
6 authorization to administer these exams and the  
7 reason why we did was because the exams are only made  
8 eligible to individuals who've already served the  
9 city for at least two years in a specified title. The  
10 reason why we wanted to focus on those long-standing  
11 Provisionals was first supposed to come into greater  
12 compliance with civil service law but generally  
13 someone's probation period would not extend beyond a  
14 two-year period, so we wanted to ensure that we  
15 targeted Provisionals who had already served the city  
16 satisfactorily. So, based on that we needed law...  
17 legal authorization to not open up these particular  
18 exams to the public so we were dealing with a smaller  
19 group and so I would say that those are more the  
20 distinct differences and where we actually see the  
21 gains relating to going from provisional to  
22 permanent.

23 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, so, so you're  
24 saying to, to a certain degree that those individuals

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 were in danger if there was more of an open  
3 competitive exam, they'd be in... [cross-talk]

4 DAWN PINNOCK: Exactly... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...danger of losing  
6 their jobs?

7 DAWN PINNOCK: Yes, we wanted to make  
8 sure that the, the competition pool so to speak was  
9 restricted to individuals who were actually  
10 performing the work. We certainly saw that as a way  
11 to strengthen our current workforce and also to  
12 acknowledge the fact that the only reason why these  
13 individuals had not received permanent status is  
14 because we had not had the capacity to test for their  
15 particular titles.

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, that is only in  
17 titles where tests were never given or had not been  
18 given during the, the time that the, the reduction  
19 plan had been implemented?

20 DAWN PINNOCK: A combination. So, titles  
21 for which there were no lists in existence, no exams  
22 in progress or titles where they had initially been  
23 created to just have very few incumbents which means  
24 that if you have... we always use the example of  
25 puppeteer so we have these wonderful folks who serve

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 as puppeteers who work for the Department of Parks,  
3 it is not likely that we're going to have hundreds of  
4 puppeteers working for the city of New York however,  
5 however it is a competitive exam and so in light of  
6 that, you know these folks have provided viable and  
7 valuable services to the city it's just we had not  
8 had the capacity to test for the three to five  
9 individuals serving so all of that contributed to the  
10 list of titles that we identified for the Qualified  
11 Incumbent Exam.

12 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And you did mention  
13 that you worked with some of the labor partners in,  
14 in terms of that, working with them, partnering with  
15 them and working collaboratively with which, which  
16 one was it, did you... [cross-talk]

17 DAWN PINNOCK: All of the above, they  
18 actually conducted a line by line review of every  
19 title that we included in the legislation. There was  
20 not a title that they had not agreed to including and  
21 we followed the same process as it relates to the new  
22 plan that we're drafting.

23 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Great, so what,  
24 what, what is the number of provisional employees  
25 serving in excess of the authorized time frames?

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

DAWN PINNOCK: The nine-month time frame?

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Yeah.

DAWN PINNOCK: 13,000.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: What is our realistic number in, in... for 2021?

DAWN PINNOCK: For 2021, we'll we're certainly going to meet the goal for December 31<sup>st</sup> of 2018 which will bring us to 17,311. We are actively trying to calculate what we think is a realistic number because based on the last two years we've been able to transition approximately 3,000 Provisionals each year so we'd follow along the same path, we're hopeful that we will achieve similar gains which would potentially be another 6,000, 6,000 Provisionals transitioned over a two year period, hopefully if we get more time than two years it allows us to make greater gains.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, if, if, if we continue along the path that would bring us to 6,000 over the next two then we would need a... another, another extension in order to meet our goal?

DAWN PINNOCK: Yes... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Could you explain  
3 for those that... is, is the goal zero, is the goal  
4 five percent, is the goal... is there a target number?

5 DAWN PINNOCK: So, none of these  
6 questions are ever easy so the goal is not zero for a  
7 few reasons and I think that, that Chair, Chair  
8 Cabrera really frames it well because there is a need  
9 given a city of this size and scale, there is a need  
10 for provisional employment and so civil service law  
11 does provide for potentially a small percentage of  
12 Provisionals to serve the city of New York. With that  
13 being said our goal is to reduce the number of  
14 Provisionals serving so we are in substantial  
15 compliance with the... with the law and to decrease the  
16 duration of the time in which they are serving.

17 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Is, is, is there a...  
18 is it a... is there a timeline from the date of  
19 appointment in a provisional title to... for, for a  
20 person to be... for exam to be administered, for a  
21 person to, to take an exam and or if there... is there  
22 a time frame for an exam for a title... provisional  
23 title that has been created? I know it was a lot.

24 DAWN PINNOCK: Yeah, so that's why I  
25 wrote it down to make sure I'm keeping pace. Okay, so

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 in terms of the timeframe, at the time that someone  
3 is appointed I would say it could depend. So, if you  
4 are hired into a title for which there is an exam  
5 that is upcoming and part of that examination  
6 schedule then yes, you were notified of that  
7 timeframe at the time of hire. However, if the title  
8 for which you have been appointed is not on that  
9 fiscal year's exam schedule that notification  
10 regarding your provisional status happens at the time  
11 of hire but notification relating to the availability  
12 of that particular exam might happen later on in  
13 someone's career when that exam is made available  
14 notwithstanding the HR departments across the city  
15 reach out to individuals serving provisionally  
16 routinely to inform them of other exams for which  
17 they may qualify to help them gain permanent status.  
18 And the second part of your question in terms of  
19 provisional titles, so provisional is considered to  
20 be a status whereby someone is hired, and they serve  
21 in a competitive title, so they are essentially just  
22 someone who is awaiting testing. The titles that we  
23 have created have been competitive titles and as a  
24 result we have then placed examinations on the  
25 schedule to address the Provisionals who've been

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 hired. An example would be the Youth Development  
3 Specialists, there was a need at the Administration  
4 for Children Services to provide more support within  
5 their detention facilities, we created that title but  
6 on a parallel track, we also added that particular  
7 exam to the examination schedule. So, we're working  
8 with them to staff up and thank you very much for,  
9 you know getting the word out regarding that  
10 opportunity but we specifically add it to the  
11 schedule to ensure that those Provisionals are not  
12 serving for a significant period of time, we're not...  
13 we're, we're trying to change history, we're, we're  
14 trying to make sure we get ahead of that.

15 [off mic dialogue]

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...in civil service...  
17 okay, so, so one may think that, that there are...  
18 there had been exams and titles in the past that had  
19 been required, that, that had been created to, to  
20 circumvent civil service titles and status, how have  
21 we dealt with that in, in terms of whether or not  
22 there was positions that were created that sort of  
23 duplicated the work that had already been... were being  
24 done by permanent civil servants and created  
25 provisional titles that weren't competitive to do

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 similar work maybe at a higher level and for whatever  
3 reason, how, how, how do we... and, and certainly we  
4 didn't get into that in the introduction on your... in  
5 your, yours nor mine in, in kind of, of the merit of  
6 the civil based... civil service system and, and, and  
7 certainly that would have an impact on that, we had  
8 seen that in the past, it also contributed to the  
9 numbers of, of Provisionals that we see and, and  
10 could you speak specifically to what we are doing to  
11 ensure that that does not happen again in the future?

12 DAWN PINNOCK: And so, I'll start off and  
13 then, you know I will turn it over to Barbara because  
14 she is definitely a title guru. So, specifically as  
15 it relates to our creation of titles there are a few  
16 things that we've done. The first is that we really  
17 took a hard line with agencies as it related to the  
18 justification they needed to provide as it relates to  
19 the creation of titles. So, we proudly sit here today  
20 to say that over the last two years we've created  
21 only five titles of which three we've administered  
22 exams and two on our examination schedule. So, if you  
23 know a little bit about our history that really is  
24 unprecedented for, for DCAS but separate and apart  
25 from that we work actively with our agencies if there

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 is a solid justification for a new title, if they are  
3 seeking not to have this title serve... be part of the  
4 competitive class then they need to follow the path  
5 as it relates to our work with the state civil  
6 service commission.

7 [off mic dialogue]

8 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Sure, so if you  
9 wanted me to talk a little bit about creating titles  
10 outside of the competitive class so DCAS has the  
11 authority to create titles in the competitive class  
12 which is where Provisionals would reside if we didn't  
13 administer an examination. In order to create titles  
14 outside of the competitive class so that would be  
15 titles that don't require a competitive examination,  
16 DCAS would need to hold a public hearing in  
17 conjunction with the agency that would like to use  
18 the title provide a justification for creation of the  
19 title but also provide a justification for why the  
20 title would not reside in the competitive class and  
21 why DCAS would not develop and administer a  
22 competitive examination in order to fill these roles.  
23 So, once we hold that public hearing, we then send  
24 the proposal up to the state civil service commission  
25 who has the ultimate authority to either approve or

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 deny our request for the creation of a new title  
3 outside the competitive class.

4 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And, and how many  
5 such requests and in the hearings or... hearings were  
6 granted over the past three years?

7 BARBARA DANNENBERG: So, we've been  
8 holding public hearings about once a month over the  
9 last... over the course of the plan so I, I don't want  
10 to say it was 24 but definitely something along those  
11 lines and also most of those titles are for executive  
12 level positions with very few position, one position,  
13 two positions or they are positions in titles that  
14 are very specific with very specific skills that are  
15 required to do the work. For example, some very  
16 specific technology titles had been proposed to  
17 reside outside of the competitive class.

18 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, I would like  
19 to hear from my colleague, Council Member Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
21 much to my Co-Chair. I just have a few questions, you  
22 know it would have been nice if you would have gotten  
23 to 69 by today, you know you would of... it's just like  
24 almost... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Yeah, we're right  
3 there...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But that goal is  
5 for the end of the year, right?

6 BARBARA DANNENBERG: It is...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, you're on  
8 track, I, I mean you're going to finish... [cross-talk]

9 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Yes, we're going to  
10 finish strong.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's good,  
12 that'd be good news. So, I, I, I commend you because  
13 you were not given... let me rephrase that, you, you,  
14 you were given... you were put in a position that it  
15 literally carried... that was there for, for many, many  
16 years and to get it to where its at today, I know it  
17 took a lot of work but having said that, don't you  
18 hate those but, you know you did so good but... no,  
19 here's my concern, my concern is that the numbers  
20 that we had was the easy picking fruit, there were...  
21 the, the easiest, I'm assuming and I know assumption  
22 is the form... lowest form of knowledge but let me... let  
23 me start at that level that, that these were the  
24 fastest, the, the... you know the, the exams that you  
25 gave were for the biggest groups I'm assuming so you

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 could get to this point now to keep that momentum,  
3 that traction what are you going to do different  
4 because if you keep going at the speed that you were  
5 going with the same emphasis you were going I don't  
6 see you reaching the same outcome because it's going  
7 to be harder now to bring these numbers down, I... is  
8 my assumption correct?

9 BARBARA DANNENBERG: It, it is correct  
10 and actually these last two years were probably the  
11 most difficult two years but we're very happy to say  
12 that over the ten years that the city has focused on  
13 provisional reduction we've reduced 14,000  
14 provisional appointments and in the last two years  
15 we've, we've reduced almost 6,000 so that's a very  
16 large portion of the total that we've been able to  
17 reduce just recently. So... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, to get those  
19 numbers... you see what I mean? So, now to... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Yes... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...get another  
23 6,000, another... you know 3,000 here... what... like for  
24 example who... where's the biggest group of workers  
25 right now, employees in a provisional title that,

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 that we could give an exam and we'll be... say hey, we  
3 got 500 here and so forth, I don't even know what the  
4 number would be?

5 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right, so there are  
6 very few titles like that but... that exist anymore  
7 with hundreds and hundreds of Provisionals however we  
8 can say that probably the titles that have the most  
9 hiring would be those entry level, entry into the  
10 city titles so... you know certainly a new plan would  
11 focus on giving more examinations targeting those  
12 individual... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Can you give an  
14 example of those because I'm not... [cross-talk]

15 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Sure, so as, as Dawn  
16 said earlier we've been partnering with the agencies  
17 over the last few years which is something else  
18 that's been unique to this plan in talking about  
19 their hiring needs and when they think that they'll  
20 be hiring or if they're going to need... you know if  
21 their mission is shifting so an example of that, that  
22 Dawn already spoke about is the Youth Development  
23 Specialist so we've partnered very closely with the  
24 Administration for Children Services in creating the  
25 new title but also in their recruitment efforts and

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 the timing of the exam in relation to their  
3 recruitment efforts so that employees would be  
4 brought on board, spoken to about the examination,  
5 they would understand the process and then be able to  
6 take that examination... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRARA: But that's a...  
8 [cross-talk]

9 DAWN PINNOCK: ...and become permanent...  
10 [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...new title,  
12 right, that's a brand new... [cross-talk]

13 DAWN PINNOCK: Correct... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...title because...  
15 [cross-talk]

16 DAWN PINNOCK: Correct... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...I know... I used  
18 to be the Chair of Juvenile Justice, I'm very  
19 familiar with... you know this new group of hire but  
20 what's you're your next biggest outside of the  
21 newbies that we have right now, do you have another  
22 group that has 200, 300?

23 DAWN PINNOCK: So, as part of our current  
24 provisional reduction plan, we did factor that in.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

So, when you mentioned about easy picking fruit, none of its been easy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But it's going to be harder, that's... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...my point... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: Right and so... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...and I'm worried, I'm really... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: ...and that's... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...worried... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: ...and that's in part of our analysis. So, to your point initially... and, and this is certainly in our ongoing relationship with the state, we've had to identify those heavy hitters, right, so a computer systems manager where you have a few hundred individuals serving and so in those cases where we could offer qualified incumbent exams to address long standing Provisionals we would then add a separate exam on our exam schedule for the new entrants so we were trying to figure out ways to tackle some of those larger exams through, through

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 two testing methods but now in looking at what's  
3 left, you know within our portfolio that is one  
4 reason why we've asked for authorization to utilize  
5 the QIE again to tackle some of those exams where we  
6 have a lower number of incumbents, we've already  
7 vetted that list with labor but also we're working  
8 with agencies as it relates to tracking their hires  
9 so we can direct individuals to exams that are either  
10 on our schedule and that's where the automation  
11 becomes really critical in terms of automating  
12 another test type just so we can continue turn out  
13 the exams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Who's been there  
15 the longest without taking an exam? Is there a  
16 particular... [cross-talk]

17 DAWN PINNOCK: I would say don't quote  
18 me but we're going to be on the record so someone's  
19 going to quote me, I would say when we reviewed our  
20 QIE numbers we saw some length of service as high as  
21 maybe 15 years serving provisionally and so while  
22 that's, that's a difficult thing to say I'm also  
23 proud to say that we were able to address that  
24 through a testing method whereby someone who served

25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 the city for a significant period of time was able to  
3 take that exam and now has permanent status.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, for example  
5 which agency was that?

6 DAWN PINNOCK: It wasn't a particular  
7 agency but it, it would be... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABREFA: What title, what  
9 title was it, do you remember?

10 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Might be... maybe  
11 trades titles... [cross-talk]

12 DAWN PINNOCK: Right, it could be...

13 BARBARA DANNENBERG: ...that's probably the  
14 hardest...

15 DAWN PINNOCK: ...right some of the trades  
16 titles where you have few incumbents, I mean I can't  
17 think of a specific title off hand but, but it would  
18 not... it was not restricted to just one.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, this is the  
20 part that, you know... I'm not in his wonderful  
21 committee so I don't have that context on, on that,  
22 I'm going to ask the obvious question, what's the  
23 bottleneck, so if, if we have five centers, right,  
24 well we're going to have five centers not testing..  
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1

DAWN PINNOCK: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...centers and we  
welcome you in the Bronx, we're always the last one  
so I'm going to complain but I'm glad we're having  
it, I'm into solutions but what... why does it take... I  
mean why for example 15 years, 10, 5, why not just  
schedule everyone, you know just, just you know do a...  
can you... can you test everybody in one year, do you  
have the capacity to test everyone in one year and if  
you can't... and if you cannot what's a... what capacity  
level do you have and what... now being intentional  
about just moving forward and scheduling everybody to  
take a test?

14

15

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right, so the city  
has... this, this might be interesting for you, the  
city... [cross-talk]

16

17

18

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay... [cross-  
talk]

19

20

BARBARA DANNENBERG: ...has over 800  
competitive titles for which we need to develop an  
examination for and administer our... [cross-talk]

21

22

23

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, that's the  
problem, we don't have the test? So, why don't we

24

25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

hire more consultants to write up the tests? Who, who writes this test?

BARBARA DANNENBERG: So, the, the tests are actually developed by human capital staff at DCAS so... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, why not hire more staff and lets just get this over with, I mean what, what, what will stop us from hiring a few more staff and developing these exams?

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Over the course of the administration we had received additional lines to help to augment examination services... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, how much more do you need? This is the time of the year we do this. November... we're still in November, yeah we're still in November, how many more do you need, I mean this is... this is simple math, right, if you had this many you could do this many tests because I think I found the bottleneck here and so... and I'm sure the others they knew that but we're at this hearing why, why don't we just hire more people and develop this test and just get everybody to be... not everyone because we're not going to get ultimately there because we're always going to have... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...new ones but I,  
I... you know I commend the agencies, we only have five  
new lines, you know I'm curious to know how many were  
deleted but why don't we just hire more people and  
how many more people would you need to, to accomplish  
this goal?

4

5

6

7

8

9

BARBARA DANNENBERG: So, for example over  
the course of the plan we did receive authorization  
to hire more staff to develop examinations and... for  
15 people and over the, the two years those 15 people  
have assisted us in achieving administering our all-  
time high number of examinations of 274...

10

11

12

13

14

15

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, they  
developed 274 new ones?

16

17

BARBARA DANNENBERG: That's correct.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay... [cross-  
talk]

19

20

BARBARA DANNENBERG: That's correct, so  
not just... [cross-talk]

21

22

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And how many  
more tests do we need? I'm glad I don't know... [cross-  
talk]

23

24

25

BARBARA DANNENBERG: So... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...anything about  
3 this because I get to ask... [cross-talk]

4 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...the simple  
6 questions... [cross-talk]

7 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right, so... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...but the simple  
10 questions are the ones that give us the simple  
11 solutions, A to Z, you know A to B.

12 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right, so there are  
13 many factors that determine how many examinations we  
14 need, or which titles need to be tested for so of the  
15 800 titles they're not... might not be new hires in  
16 every single one of those titles.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But of the ones  
18 that we need...

19 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right, so of the  
20 titles where hiring occurs, again it depends on the,  
21 the amount of hiring so some titles have turnover,  
22 they have... they, they do mass hiring... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: You know give us  
24 a ballpark, what's the... what's the... what, what is it  
25 that we need to, you know to get to... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2           DAWN PINNOCK: Well based on our  
3 projections ideally staying in the range of  
4 approximately 250 to 270 exams actually could  
5 potentially cover us however I do need to introduce  
6 another element, so I hope that I'm not throwing our  
7 conversation off... [cross-talk]

8           COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: No, go ahead,  
9 I'll come back... [cross-talk]

10           DAWN PINNOCK: ...in addition... in addition  
11 to addressing Provisionals we have titles where there  
12 are no Provisionals serving but we still need to  
13 create exams. So, let's for our police officers,  
14 correction officers, these are large scale exams that  
15 we're required to develop and administer to ensure  
16 that we don't have any Provisionals serving. So, the  
17 same resources that are utilized for provisional  
18 reduction through test administration are the same  
19 resources we use for what we call our provisional  
20 avoidance titles so those really are our clerical  
21 titles, a lot of our direct service positions at our  
22 social services agencies and our uniform titles.

23           COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, let me ask  
24 you this question and I'll close with this, I have  
25 more but I'll, I'll come back, is there unintended

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 costs whenever we don't test them and we keep them  
3 in, in a provisional status, does it cost us more and  
4 when I mean cost I don't mean just monetary, what's  
5 the overall cost here and if it is doesn't it... after  
6 another day if we were to hire more regardless at  
7 whatever level for whatever reason, whether they're  
8 there, they're not and so forth just to bring down  
9 these numbers, doesn't it make more sense to hire  
10 more people because it will cost us more... cost us  
11 less hiring them and having this test and, and having  
12 a homeostasis point of, you know labor with, with,  
13 with... you know provisional versus permanent positions  
14 just to... so what are we... are, are we talking about...  
15 is, is there a cost, a savings?

16 BARBARA DANNENBERG: So, so provisional  
17 employees, competitive class employ, employees other  
18 than competitive class employees they're all paid  
19 according to the salary... the city's salary guidelines  
20 so provisional employees don't make either more or  
21 less than a permanent employee, they're... they, they  
22 receive the same benefits and they receive the same  
23 salary. However, it is certainly in the city's best  
24 interest to have a stable workforce working for...  
25 working for the city so what we are trying to do,

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

what we are speaking of is testing people as they  
come into city services so that people don't have to  
wait ten years or, or you know longer in order to  
take an examination and that they feel that they are  
a part of the city's workforce, a stable part and  
that they're eligible to, you know continue their  
career within the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And job security  
is the same?

DAWN PINNOCK: Correct. Well job...  
[cross-talk]

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Oh, sorry... [cross-  
talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: ...security for a  
provisional is not the same and so I just... [cross-  
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay, so that's...  
[cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: ...wanted... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...a big cost, if  
that's the... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's the...  
that's... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 DAWN PINNOCK: Right and, and so... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's the  
5 bottom line right here, that's safety... [cross-talk]  
6 [cross-talk]

7 DAWN PINNOCK: Right, right... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...in job... [cross-  
9 talk]

10 DAWN PINNOCK: ...and I was going to add  
11 to... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay... [cross-  
13 talk]

14 DAWN PINNOCK: ...to what Barbara said just  
15 in terms of the unintended cost I see it, you know  
16 directly tied into just kind of strengthening the  
17 work force so a provisional employee does not have  
18 the same job protections as a permanent employee and  
19 so when you're talking about transitioning in a  
20 provisional potentially there's a loss of talent that  
21 impacts the services we provide to New Yorkers so I  
22 would say although we've not quantified that I view  
23 that as one of the unintended costs of not being able  
24 to address Provisionals quickly.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: A worker is  
3 going to be more vested if they feel secure and  
4 safety, hierarchy of needs is most fundamental here  
5 because my counseling background but please let's  
6 hire more people, I mean to me this is like a no  
7 brainer, hire more people, more tests, more faster,  
8 let's bring more security, our people deserve it.  
9 Thank you so much Mr. Chair, I have more questions  
10 but I'll... I... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank, thank you so  
12 much Co-Chair. Just on the issue of unintended  
13 consequences, consequences that were mentioned there,  
14 could you... could you quantify what the pension  
15 implications are if any?

16 DAWN PINNOCK: To... well a provisional  
17 would have rights to opt into a pension, if you're a  
18 permanent employee you are brought into the pension  
19 system but that is not something that have  
20 quantified.

21 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And, and, and  
22 before... I see Council Member Dromm, he's, he's got  
23 his roller skates on as well, could you... could you...  
24 could you just let us know the agencies that have the  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 highest number of Provisionals, I think he'd be  
3 interested in it?

4 DAWN PINNOCK: The agencies, these are  
5 some of our larger clients so, New York City Transit,  
6 New York City Housing Authority, Department of  
7 Transportation, Department of Parks and Recreation,  
8 Department of Education, DEP, Environmental  
9 Protection and Department of Health and Mental  
10 Hygiene and a recent addition has been Administration  
11 for Children Services primarily because of our recent  
12 hiring... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

14 DAWN PINNOCK: ...of youth development  
15 specialists.

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So... and honestly, I,  
17 I was... it was kind of... trying to engage my colleague  
18 concerning... [cross-talk]

19 DAWN PINNOCK: I tried... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...his thing about...  
21 [cross-talk]

22 DAWN PINNOCK: ...to go quickly... [cross-  
23 talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...the nearly 30  
25 years... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

DAWN PINNOCK: ...tried to go quickly  
before he... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...in... at the DOE...  
[cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: ...he left... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...but you left...  
[cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: Okay... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...it at the bottom  
and that... and, and honestly that he was more familiar  
I know from past hearings that he was able to drill  
down on some of the titles and the concerns that we  
had over at the DOE and, and a lot of that still... you  
know... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: Right, I remember he had...  
[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...that, that culture  
kind of... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: ...interest with the...  
[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...exist... [cross-talk]

DAWN PINNOCK: ...occupational therapist  
and the... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Exactly... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 DAWN PINNOCK: ...physical therapist...  
5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 DAWN PINNOCK: Uh-huh.

8 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And, and the... and,  
9 and so forth. So, what is the current New York City  
10 workforce headcount?

11 DAWN PINNOCK: We're over 390,000.

12 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Where is that  
13 compared to where we were five years ago in a sense?

14 DAWN PINNOCK: We actually did a ten year  
15 look back in anticipation of your question and so ten  
16 years ago I believe we were at 376,000 and we're now  
17 up to 393,000 so... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Where were we five  
19 years ago, do you know?

20 DAWN PINNOCK: Hold on one second, sorry...  
21 one, two, three... we were... I just have to add the  
22 number... 300 and...

23 BARBARA DANNENBERG: 358...

24 DAWN PINNOCK: 358,000 in 2013.  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Uh-huh and now we're  
3 at three...

4 DAWN PINNOCK: We're at 393,000.

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, we're close to  
6 about 45,000 over the new hires over the past five  
7 years?

8 DAWN PINNOCK: Approximately 40,000.

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: For the record  
10 because, you know I... at... some may disagree but I  
11 think that as, as Council Member... my, my Co-Chair has  
12 said here that, that we should hire not just those  
13 who hire but our public sector workforce brings real  
14 value to our city, people who come here and  
15 investigate because it's safe and we have a, a world  
16 class police department and health care, education  
17 and, and... regardless to what say... folks say  
18 transportation as well and so there is an inherent  
19 value to these positions and, and you increase the  
20 value, the economic value as well to, to the city.  
21 When, when... look, we were all there when we had less  
22 employees and there were long lines everywhere, right  
23 and that undermined the value of the city so I, I  
24 think it would behoove us as Council Member Cabrera  
25 said that, that we work with agencies to identify...

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 because look, we're still being... over that last five  
3 to ten year period we were operating at a deficit in  
4 terms of human capital, right, we were asked... every  
5 agency was asked to more with less and that didn't  
6 work and, and there were consequences to that. Aside  
7 from that these, these public employees, these, these  
8 lives that they change by the simplest... the simplest  
9 entry level and, and this is coming from someone who  
10 is a lifelong... 34 years at, at... as a civil servant  
11 now and, and one who represents a community that has  
12 the highest number of, of civil servants in the state  
13 of New York. There is a difference to those  
14 communities particularly communities of color, we  
15 have again and as I often state, the highest number  
16 of, of civil servants but we also have the highest  
17 number of African American homeownership in the  
18 entire country. There's a direct correlation between  
19 the two so as my colleague said that this absolutely  
20 has value why wouldn't we continue to add to that  
21 value, why wouldn't we add to the value of New York  
22 City's... of New York City by adding to its workforce.  
23 There is a difference certainly in, in, in the, the...  
24 not just the status but the value of a permanent  
25 employee and a, a provisional employee not just from

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 the standpoint that the court said that you have to  
3 reduce this number. In fact, the court agreed that it  
4 undermined what that system was and the... and, and the  
5 intent of, of the system. So, I, I certainly agree  
6 with my colleague that we, we should move forward, in  
7 doing so are there specific titles that... and I'm,  
8 I'm... this is... this is oversight so this is going to  
9 jump outside a little bit of, of provisional, are  
10 there specific titles where you see a greater need  
11 and obviously that some of these... some, some of the  
12 Provisionals then have taken a backseat because of  
13 the need to hire some of the essential services as  
14 you talked about corrections and, and, and other  
15 uniform forces and healthcare and education and so  
16 forth, is... are we missing something, is there a  
17 place, an agency or a title where there is a great  
18 need that you're seeing in your conversations with  
19 agencies?

20           DAWN PINNOCK: It really depends as we're  
21 talking to agencies and that's why I believe our  
22 compliance meetings are so important. A standing  
23 agenda item in those meetings is to talk about their  
24 hiring needs and so there were certain things that  
25 have been identified for us that were directly tied

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 to legal mandates so there would... there was a mandate  
3 that DOT had that required an increased number of  
4 engineers to serve so that they could meet a legal  
5 mandate. Through those meetings we were informed of  
6 ACS's need regarding YDS, through those meetings we  
7 were alerted by probation that they actually needed  
8 us to administer probation officer exams more often  
9 because they were going through these lists so  
10 quickly. So, I think that... you know all the agencies,  
11 you know whether they're direct service, public  
12 safety, if they're tackling a new initiative, some of  
13 our agencies handling infrastructure they all have  
14 certain needs that are identified and so we really  
15 impress upon them the importance of sharing that  
16 information with us early and often so we can best  
17 prioritize our exam schedule to meet their  
18 operational needs.

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: How, how much of  
20 that information is being shared with this committee  
21 or the Council or these Committees specifically even  
22 in terms of just some of the, the over 250, 40...  
23 whatever it was exams that had been administered in  
24 that two year period as you said based on the QIE and  
25 other things, how much of that information are you

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 sharing in that... and, and I know that we've been able  
3 to partner on a number of missions... [cross-talk]

4 DAWN PINNOCK: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...but there are some  
6 creative ideas as well as we just saw, how, how do  
7 you engage the Council so that we can further partner  
8 with you and, and, and decreasing these numbers?

9 DAWN PINNOCK: You do mean... and I just  
10 want to clarify the question, do you mean how we  
11 engage with you historically or how we'd like to  
12 engage you going forward?

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Moving forward.

14 DAWN PINNOCK: Okay, from my perspective  
15 we share your view in that there's no reason why you  
16 should not see our provisional reduction plan, I mean  
17 it is a plan that is comprehensive, it's a plan that  
18 speaks to the city's needs and certainly there's some  
19 insight that you will have, you know given the needs  
20 of each of the council Maddox districts that can help  
21 to directly inform our plan and so really any  
22 information that we have is helpful, you know we do  
23 share our provisional reduction plans with our labor  
24 partners because we cannot do this alone and so I'm  
25 certainly having the input, you know of your

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 committee and just the Council in general to flag any  
3 potential operational hiring issues that we're  
4 unaware of, we'd want to have that directly inform  
5 our strategy once we're afforded more time.

6 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And, and, and  
7 further more as... and, and I know it, it came out kind  
8 of... but the Council Member was, was absolutely  
9 sincere and as we begin to talk about 2019, 2020's  
10 budget, you know this is an, an important element  
11 that in the past that we were able to include funding  
12 in the budget that allowed for the bodies, the  
13 additional bodies that were, were helpful in the  
14 creation of those additional exams. So, that's really  
15 important to us as well as, as being your advocate  
16 and, and, and to a certain degree controlling purse  
17 strings and being able to negotiate purse strings  
18 that's really important and, and we take this plan  
19 and, and the city's workforce very seriously and the  
20 fact that we can't administer examinations for those  
21 small number of reasons that forbid us from hiring at  
22 the level that we should or when we should, you know  
23 if we're working collaboratively we, we could be able  
24 clear some of those hurdles I, I think is what we're  
25 trying to say. While we're on that just titles in

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 general two things, how has contracting services or  
3 contracting out services impacted the, the, the  
4 permanent workforce and, and in particular how has it  
5 impacted provisional... has it had any impact on  
6 provisional employees?

7 DAWN PINNOCK: So, in addition to the  
8 approval of additional lines we were also provided an  
9 opportunity to have a small contract to outsource a  
10 number of exams, a very small portion of our  
11 portfolio, primarily exams that have taken us very  
12 long to, to create and to promulgate those lists we  
13 received funding to assist with that. However, we  
14 have worked really hard to keep the majority of our  
15 examination's development work in house and I, I  
16 don't want to assume that you know but DCAS is part  
17 of a citywide insourcing committee where we work with  
18 our labor partners... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Right... [cross-talk]

20 DAWN PINNOCK: ...to identify opportunities  
21 to continue to insource work within the city and so..  
22 in order to make sure that we are walking the walk  
23 and talking the talk we do limit contracting out of  
24 the work that we are able to perform in house.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, in terms of..  
3 are, are you seeing an increase in permanent titles  
4 or even provisional titles based on the, the  
5 committee that, that you participate in, in terms of  
6 insourcing, are... is there an opportunity... has that  
7 opportunity manifested itself in the creation of new  
8 titles or expansion of traditional titles by not  
9 farming out at the same level?

10 DAWN PINNOCK: It... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Or not farming out  
12 at all in, in some instances?

13 DAWN PINNOCK: Although I don't have the  
14 specific numbers because, because really the process  
15 is led, you know by one of our labor partners however  
16 it has resulted in a decrease in certain consulting  
17 spending and then has resulted in additional  
18 individuals working within the city to perform  
19 similar work so that really is the goal of the, the  
20 insourcing committee looking for those opportunities  
21 to bring certain work within the city that can be  
22 done by city employees in house.

23 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: PAA's, is, is there..  
24 where... is there a current list?

25 DAWN PINNOCK: Yes.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Yes.

2

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Are they calling off  
the list or are they still using light duty offices?

3

4

[off mic dialogue]

5

DAWN PINNOCK: Oh, we're going to... right,  
because we are talking about... [cross-talk]

6

7

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Sorry... [cross-talk]

8

DAWN PINNOCK: ...the title represented by  
CWA because there's a PAA on that side as well so  
you're referring to the title that you... [cross-talk]

9

10

11

12

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Police  
administrative aide... [cross-talk]

13

14

DAWN PINNOCK: Police...

15

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right.

16

17

18

19

20

21

DAWN PINNOCK: I know that we administer  
an exam for that, I don't know if... the list is  
active... yeah, so the list is active. If you're  
referring to any other hiring, we might be unaware of  
any hires and, and that's not been on one of the  
subjects of the... [cross-talk]

22

23

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, there was an  
agreement... [cross-talk]

24

25

DAWN PINNOCK: ...end sort of the  
conversation... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...with the Council  
3 and the police department that the... around  
4 civilianization and so that there was a title so if,  
5 if you are looking at the titles and the movement or  
6 lack thereof, of a specific title in this particular  
7 instance are we... are we seeing a reduction or lack  
8 thereof because those positions are being filled with  
9 permanent employees from another title... [cross-talk]

10 DAWN PINNOCK: So... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...on light duty...

12 DAWN PINNOCK: So, we can certainly take  
13 a look at the number of appointments being made  
14 specifically off of that list... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: How long has the  
16 list been open?

17 [off mic dialogue]

18 DAWN PINNOCK: I think it's fairly new  
19 and so once again we would have to... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay... [cross-talk]

21 DAWN PINNOCK: ...provide that as well.

22 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right...

23 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. Okay, so yeah  
24 I'm, I'm, I'm pretty much going to wrap because we  
25 can do this like forever and ever, I'm, I'm going to

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 allow my, my, my colleague but I, I just wanted..  
3 would you be willing to receive follow up questions  
4 from the... from the committee and, and respond, you  
5 know appropriately?

6 DAWN PINNOCK: Of course and if there are  
7 specific titles where you are asking about movement  
8 or usage of those lists, you know certainly... you know  
9 we want to make sure that we're providing you with  
10 the... as much accurate information as we can so if  
11 that's part of your questioning we're more than happy  
12 to receive that... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Absolutely, we'll,  
14 we'll draft a... the committee will draft a letter and,  
15 and we'll, we'll send it to you and, and expect a  
16 response so... thank you. Council Member Cabrera.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
18 much. Just a quick question regarding the 2018 MMR  
19 report, a significant decrease in the time taken for  
20 DCAS for release testing results from the time of  
21 examination so I think it's plain what factors  
22 contributed to this decrease, it seems reasonable to  
23 expect that the test results can be made available  
24 even faster in 2019 and beyond and how can  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 improvements be made to the examination so that  
3 individuals could retake exams more quickly?

4 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Right, so thank you  
5 that we've definitely have made an effort to reduce  
6 the time that it takes for us to release those exam  
7 results after an exam has been administered so that  
8 city agencies can hire more quickly. So, there are  
9 several factors that actually led to the decrease in  
10 that number one of which of course was the additional  
11 staffing that we received, they definitely assisted  
12 with the processes not just in developing the exam  
13 because we're talking about the time after we give  
14 the exam and that time period consists of a protest  
15 review which I'm not sure if you're familiar with,  
16 okay. So, there are several things that happen after  
17 an examination is administered that are part of the  
18 civil service process and one of those... one of... one  
19 of the things that happens afterwards is that people  
20 who take a multiple choice test are given the  
21 opportunity to protest the questions so they may feel  
22 that... you know DCAS says the answer is B but I feel  
23 like the answer C is a better answer and here's why..  
24 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I didn't get to  
3 do that in high school but go ahead...

4 BARBARA DANNENBERG: This is a process  
5 that is unique to... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I'm just  
7 kidding, I... [cross-talk]

8 BARBARA DANNENBERG: ...New York City...  
9 [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...I'm just, just  
11 kidding.

12 BARBARA DANNENBERG: So, that process  
13 could take several months because after the exam is  
14 administered we give people up to 30 days to submit  
15 those protests and then we have a, a, a committee  
16 that comes in, they're called the test validation  
17 board and that's made up of labor, an agency  
18 permanent representative and also a DCAS  
19 representative and they will review all of those  
20 protests and make a determination. If they make the  
21 determination, they agree with the person who said my  
22 answer is better every candidate will benefit and  
23 DCAS will change the correct answers from not just B  
24 but B and C in the example... [cross-talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 BARBARA DANNENBERG: ...I just gave so all  
3 of that takes some time in the process so having  
4 additional staff to help go through all those  
5 protests, some exams receive thousands so that's one  
6 part of the process. Another part of the process that  
7 happens after an exam administration is that when  
8 individuals receive their score they have the right  
9 to appeal to DCAS so they can say hey I think that my  
10 score should be higher and here's why and so that  
11 follows another process within DCAS and ultimately if  
12 a person... if we agree with you or there was  
13 information that wasn't provided that would have been  
14 helpful to us earlier on and we approve your appeal  
15 that individual will be on the eligible list that  
16 results from that exam. So, all of those things  
17 happen in the months after an exam is administered so  
18 the more people that you have working on those items  
19 the quicker the process goes but also... so, in  
20 addition to the personnel also the automation of  
21 exams. So, during her testimony Dawn mentioned that  
22 the qualifying incumbent exam is the first of its  
23 kind that it is automated from beginning to end that  
24 means that test takers take their examination online,  
25 they receive their score right away, they don't have

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 to wait for DCAS and if they would like to appeal  
3 that score they can do that automatically as well  
4 online... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Uh-huh... [cross-  
6 talk]

7 BARBARA DANNENBERG: ...so that now has cut  
8 down months and months and months of the time that it  
9 takes to establish that eligible list so again, you  
10 know in addition to the personnel the automation of  
11 the processes has definitely helped decrease that  
12 time.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Well, well thank  
14 you for that answer and you, you, you keep confirming  
15 what I mentioned earlier, something happens when you  
16 hire more people you could expedite, you can move  
17 things quicker and that goes to the test takers as  
18 well, we can hire more people, we could move, you  
19 know things along a lot faster so that's very good.  
20 My last question is in regard to the Bronx, you don't  
21 have to ask I'm from the Bronx, for your test center  
22 what's your capacity going to be there, how many  
23 people are going to be able to take tests?

24 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Yeah, so the center  
25 will have just over 50 seats... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: 50 seats...

3

[cross-talk]

4

BARBARA DANNENBERG: ...for test takers.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Are you planning

6

to open more centers after this?

7

BARBARA DANNENBERG: That is our

8

intention to open a larger center in the Bronx, yes.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay and when

10

would that be?

11

BARBARA DANNENBERG: I don't have a date...

12

a timeline or a date for that but... [cross-talk]

13

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: It's just an

14

intention... [cross-talk]

15

BARBARA DANNENBERG: ...in the meantime...

16

[cross-talk]

17

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...at this point

18

or is... [cross-talk]

19

BARBARA DANNENBERG: Yes... [cross-talk]

20

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...there real

21

plans?

22

DAWN PINNOCK: No, this... so, so just to

23

understand a bit of the history, there had been

24

another site identified that is a larger site however

25

in work... we wanted to work on a parallel path to open

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 up a site utilizing existing city space and so that  
3 is the reason why we're utilizing city owned space to  
4 open up this site but plans and work is still ongoing  
5 in order to open up the larger site that, that we had  
6 originally agreed upon opening.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And how many  
8 would that seat, how many chairs would it have?

9 BARBARA DANNENBERG: I believe it was  
10 just over 100... [cross-talk]

11 DAWN PINNOCK: Right, we believe... [cross-  
12 talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: 100... [cross-  
14 talk]

15 DAWN PINNOCK: ...it actually doubles the  
16 capacity...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And how many do  
18 you have in the other boroughs?

19 DAWN PINNOCK: The other boroughs are  
20 larger... [cross-talk]

21 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Yeah, so Brooklyn is  
22 the largest.

23 DAWN PINNOCK: Yes, Brooklyn is the  
24 largest... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay, they're  
3 the largest borough, okay on that... [cross-talk]

4 DAWN PINNOCK: Yeah... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...okay and then?

6 DAWN PINNOCK: ...second largest... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Are we the  
9 smallest?

10 DAWN PINNOCK: Today... [cross-talk]

11 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Today, yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: It seems..  
13 [cross-talk]

14 DAWN PINNOCK: Today.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I'm becoming a  
16 prophet or something...

17 DAWN PINNOCK: But, but, but honestly, we  
18 fast tracked this opening, you know, and we really  
19 need to... you know pump up the... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: You, you know  
21 why you fast... [cross-talk]

22 DAWN PINNOCK: ...space... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...tracked it  
24 because we haven't had any since for years, I mean we  
25 got to do something here, I mean we got to... it's just

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 unbelievable our people in the Bronx, 1,4 million  
3 people always got to be tracking every other place,  
4 we're always last. The only thing we ever got first,  
5 you know what was... what was it frozen meals on wheels  
6 for seniors that's the only thing we ever got first  
7 in the Bronx that I know of, come on... and so... yeah,  
8 let's, let's get that second center going ASAP  
9 because, you know we have a lot of people in the  
10 Bronx and ensure it takes this test if you could send  
11 those, I don't want to take time right now with the  
12 breakdown... [cross-talk]

13 DAWN PINNOCK: Yes, we will... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...how many take  
15 tests from respective boroughs. Having said all that  
16 thank you for all you're doing, you reached a  
17 milestone that since I've been here for nine years, I  
18 have never seen anybody reach so you get a happy  
19 face... [cross-talk]

20 DAWN PINNOCK: Thank you...

21 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Wow...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...today, give my  
23 regards to the Commissioner, good.. [cross-talk]

24 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Thank you so much..  
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...job... good job.

2

3

DAWN PINNOCK: Thank you.

4

[applause]

5

6

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Wow, listen there's really nothing I can say after that, I, I'm sure that you guys would like to leave on that note, right?

7

8

DAWN PINNOCK: But...

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, I'm going to allow that to... so, I'm, I'm, I'm really going to allow that to happen because this has been a, a, a five year relationship that... partnership really that we've been able to accomplish some things in, in spite of the government that we have... and, and no matter what folks have said and, and full disclosure the Deputy Commissioner and I in our past lives worked together on these issues and, and so we came here knowing that it could be done and so I'm not going to accept anything less, right and, and so when, when we kind of get to push back we, we push each other and so I'm, I'm thankful for that and, and proud to say that despite what we go through on a day to day that there are some positive things happening and, and it is a... it is a positive when we're able to reduce this number and know the late person sitting

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 on the outside thinks that a job is a job but we... I  
3 think that we'd identified the difference in the  
4 values of a permanent and a provisional employee and,  
5 and what provisional employees do to kind of  
6 undermine the whole civil service system and how  
7 important that is to, to the city that we love and  
8 that we serve and that serves so many others that we  
9 have to have committed permanent employees in... you  
10 know so we are on our way to doing so, so I thank you  
11 very much for the work that DCAS is doing. While I  
12 have you, the online portal could you talk about  
13 that, we can close with that, we can close with  
14 talking about the portal and its value of the portal  
15 and that... and, and I think I remember that we were  
16 promised a tour Mr. Chair which is upcoming and we  
17 could... [cross-talk]

18 DAWN PINNOCK: December 13<sup>th</sup>... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...close on that.  
20 December... [cross-talk]

21 DAWN PINNOCK: December 13<sup>th</sup>... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: ...13<sup>th</sup>... [cross-talk]

23 DAWN PINNOCK: ...the date that we were  
24 able to schedule with you team.

25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, could you talk  
3 about the portal and the tour?

4 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Sure, so we're  
5 really excited about this portal and again thank you,  
6 its definitely one of the initiatives that were  
7 brought up by Council Member Miller and the  
8 Committee. So, the online portal what it will do for  
9 potential applicants for city jobs but also, you know  
10 current city employees is that they now are able to  
11 go into an account that they can create themselves  
12 online and access any exam information that pertains  
13 to them specifically. So, currently what people do is  
14 they'll either come down to DCAS or go to one of our  
15 customer service centers in one of the boroughs and  
16 ask, you know hey what's my list number, what's... you  
17 know what's happening, did I pass the test, you know  
18 so now... or they can call our interactive voice  
19 recording message and then they can get that  
20 information that way, this way they can log on to  
21 their account and they can see their exam results,  
22 they can see when they have an upcoming exam, they  
23 can see if the list has been established for the test  
24 that they took and what their list number is and how  
25 many people are on the list and they can also.. moving

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 forward they can look at, you know what else is  
3 happening, I explained that there are some things  
4 that happen after you take an exam like the protest  
5 review period and the appeal period and so that  
6 information will also be made available in their  
7 portal.

8 [off mic dialogue]

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Can you... will, will  
10 you be able to see all of the exams that you had  
11 taken... will you be able to see previous exams that  
12 were taken that, that... you're not necessarily looking  
13 at a specific exam but you created your own portfolio  
14 of the exams you've taken, where you are on the list,  
15 if the lists are open and, and, and most importantly  
16 if you move, right? Million times people have said  
17 I've moved, and I moved and I've... and I've never  
18 heard anything, what happens then?

19 BARBARA DANNENBERG: So, absolutely  
20 people will be able to see their exam history going  
21 back a certain number of years, it, it won't go all  
22 the way back, you know until 1980 or something but  
23 they will be able to see exams that they have taken  
24 in the past and thank you for mentioning that, a key  
25 feature will also be that people can update their

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 address and where they receive official city mail  
3 through their portal so they won't have to, again, go  
4 to their agency's human resources and then come to  
5 DCAS because the two systems were never combined now  
6 they can just do that for their examinations in their  
7 own portal. Another thing I failed to mention was  
8 people can now update their own password in their  
9 account which in the past has, has been problematic  
10 for people especially if... I know nobody would do that  
11 but people who apply for exams at the last minute and  
12 don't remember their password and they can't get into  
13 their account and they miss the filing period now  
14 they can change their password, they'll get the... you  
15 know they'll be able to do that themselves and they  
16 don't need to rely on, you know somebody being in the  
17 office in order to do that for them.

18 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, so again I, I  
19 want to thank you for coming out, thank you for your  
20 testimony, I especially want to thank the, the  
21 members of the Committee for being here and  
22 participating, its been a, a very busy day for all  
23 the members around here, to my Co-Chair. I don't want  
24 to play poker or pool with you because he, he, he  
25 played like you go ahead you take the lead I don't

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1  
2 know anything about this stuff here alright and then  
3 he, he's zinging, right, so, so thank you so very  
4 much for your input Council Member and certainly to  
5 committee staff, Council and, and your team, thank  
6 you so very much and to my staff and, and of course  
7 the great Joe Goldbloom who has been residing back  
8 there, thank you for your work on this particular  
9 hearing. With that the hearing is adjourned.

10 DAWN PINNOCK: Thank you so much...

11 BARBARA DANNENBERG: Thank you.

12 [gavel]

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

December 10, 2018