

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

March 26, 2018
Start: 10:20 A.M.
Recess: 12:33 P.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Mark Treyger, Chair
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin L. Brannan
Andrew Cohen
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Barry S. Grodenchik
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Eric A. Ulrich
Vanessa Gibson
Helen Rosenthal

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Council Members Continued

2 Mark Ghonaj

3
4 Lorraine Grillo, President and CEO of
School Construction Authority

5 Aloysee Jarmoszuk, Chief of Staff
6 Division of Operations at the New York
City Department of Education

7
8 Peter Quinn, Department of Education,
Chief Information Officer

9
10 Thomas Taratko, Chief Executive Space
Management Group

11 Paul Kahn

12 Maggie Moroff, Special Education Policy
13 Coordinator at Advocates for Children,
Coordinator for ARISE Coalition

14
15 Rebecca Costachinko

16 Jacqueline O'Kinvarne

17 Mia Emanuel

18 Paul Garity

19
20 Christine Dennen

21

22

23

24

25

2 (Hi, test 1-2, 1-2,1-2. Today's date is
3 March 26, 2018. Today's hearing is the Preliminary
4 Budget Hearing on Education. Is being recorded by
5 Dean Hope.)

6 MARK TREYGER: Good morning and welcome
7 to the second part of the City's Councils Education
8 Committee Hearing on the Fiscal Year 2019 Preliminary
9 Capital Budget and Capital Commitment Plan for the
10 Department of Education and the Fiscal 2018
11 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report for the DOE and
12 School Construction Authority. Uhm, today's hearing
13 is focused on the February 2018 proposed amendment to
14 the DOE Fiscal 2015-2019 five-year Capital Plan.
15 According to a Memorandum of Understanding between
16 the City Council and the Administration, the DOE and
17 SEA are required to submit an updated proposed
18 amendment to the Council by March 1. I want to thank
19 the DOE and SEA for fulfilling this commitment. The
20 Proposed Amendment includes an additional \$972
21 million in new funding for capacity, capital
22 improvements, and mandated programs. This brings the
23 DOE's total five year Capital Plan to \$16.5 billion.
24 The Proposed Amendment allocates \$6.4 billion for
25 capacity including \$4.8 billion for over 44,000 K to

2 12 seats. This is a significant investment but falls
3 over 38,000 seats short of meeting the projected K-12
4 seat need. The Mayor announced last year that the
5 Preliminary Ten-year Capital Strategy includes
6 funding in Fiscal 2020-2025 years that will fully
7 fund this remaining capacity need. I appreciate the
8 Administrations efforts to address school capacity
9 needs and the commitment of funding for the DOEs next
10 five-year Capital Plan. However, I am concerned that
11 this funding will not truly meet our school systems
12 new capacity needs given the timeline of new capacity
13 construction and the likelihood of even greater need
14 as enrollment continues to grow. Earlier this week,
15 as a matter of face, last week the Council released
16 Planning to Learn, the School Building Challenge. A
17 report on the current state of school planning and
18 citing including recommendations for both improving
19 or seat need assessment and expediting the school
20 citing and building process. I thanked speaker Corey
21 Johnson and Finance Chair, and Former Education Chair
22 Daniel Dromm for their leadership on this issue and I
23 hope to begin a discussion with SEA and DOE about
24 these recommendations today; however, we also
25 anticipate holding a hearing specifically on this

2 topic and relegated Legislation next month at which
3 time we can dig further into the details on School
4 Planning and Citing and that is just a hint, hint for
5 my colleagues. The Capital Investment Category total
6 \$6.6 billion. These funds are for Capital
7 Improvements to existing school facilities. This
8 includes \$395 million for TCU removal, \$128 million
9 for accessibility and \$100 million for bathroom
10 upgrades, all of which have been priorities for this
11 Council. In addition, this category includes funding
12 for two initiatives announced last year, \$50 million
13 to begin electrical upgrades that support air
14 conditioners in classrooms. I am very happy about
15 that and \$105 million in new funding for a University
16 Physical Education Initiative to ensure that all
17 students have access to adequate physical education
18 space. That is also very important. I appreciate
19 these investments by the Administration and
20 anticipate discussing them further today. The
21 Capital Investment Category also includes \$654
22 million in funding for Technology. Many of our
23 Public Schools have severely outdate technology
24 infrastructure and I share that from personal
25 experience. Lifting the ban on cellphones in schools

2 created an additional demand for broadband as does
3 the move to computer-based testing. More importantly
4 updated technology infrastructure is critical to
5 support not only computer science for all but
6 instructional technology in all subject areas. I
7 hope to hear more from DOE and SEA on how Capital
8 Planning Investments will support a 21st Century
9 learning environment that prepares students for 21st
10 Century jobs and careers. The final category of
11 funding in the five-year Capital Plan is Mandated
12 Programs which includes \$3.4 billion for projects
13 such as boiler conversions, code compliance, prior
14 planned completion costs and wrap up insurance. You
15 may have heard a recent interview with the US
16 Secretary of Education in which she said we shouldn't
17 be investing in school buildings. I could not
18 disagree more strongly. School buildings are the
19 literal cornerstone of the city's public education
20 system. Ideally providing enriching environments in
21 which our children's can thrive. I look forward to
22 the discussion with the SEA and DOE on the
23 significant and necessary investments in school
24 buildings that serve our students. Some
25 housekeeping, I would like to remind Council Members

2 that this is the Capital Hearing so please keep your
3 questions related to the Capital Budget. We had the
4 Expense Budget Hearing this past Friday. Council
5 Members will be limited to three minutes for their
6 first round of questions and two minutes for the
7 second round if necessary. Public testimony on the
8 Education Capital Budget will begin at approximately
9 12:00 p.m. If you are here to testify please fill
10 out a witness slip with the Sargeant at Arms. Public
11 testimony, yeah, Sargeant of Arms over there. I
12 would like to thank my dedicated committee staff,
13 Kaitlyn O'Hagan, Elizabeth Hoffman, Dohney Sompura
14 (SP?), Smita Deshmukh, Jan Atwell, Joan Povolny,
15 Kalima Johnson and Mili Bonilli. I would also like
16 to thank my own staff who supported preparation for
17 this hearing, Anna Scaife, Vanessa Ogle and Eric
18 Fineberg (SP?). I would now like to uhm just welcome
19 my colleagues who are here in attendance: Council
20 Members Chaim Deutsch, Alicka Ampry-Samuel, Berry
21 Grodenchik, Council Member Joe Borelli, Council
22 Member Ben Kallos, Council Member Debbie Rose,
23 Council Member Andy King and Council Member Brad
24 Lander and Council Member Cornegy was here earlier.
25 Uhm, additionally I would like to thank Lorraine

2 Grillo, the President and CEO at School Construction
3 Authority and I understand that Deputy Chancellor
4 Rose could not be here today so we have in her place
5 I think her Chief of Staff who is here, which I have
6 the name, Aloysee and they will testify for our
7 committee today and I will just make sure that we
8 have everyone sworn in. Do you swear or affirm to
9 the tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but
10 the truth and to answer the Council Member questions
11 honestly. You, you may begin, thank you.

12 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you. Good
13 morning Chair Treyger and members of the Education
14 Committee here today. My name is Lorraine Grillo and
15 I am President and CEO of the New York City School
16 Construction Authority. I am joined today by Aloysee
17 Jarmoszuk, Chief of Staff for the Division of
18 Operations at the New York City Department of
19 Education and Peter Quinn, DOE's Chief Information
20 Officer. We are pleased to be here today to discuss
21 the proposed February 2018 Amendment to the FY2015-
22 2019 five-year Capital Plan. Since the last time we
23 appeared before this Committee to discuss this Plan
24 we have opened 25 locations, creating almost 8,400
25 new seats for our students and we on track to open 14

2 locations next September for an increase of over
3 5,650 seats in the 2018-19 school year including new
4 pre-K sites. We are very grateful to the City
5 Council for its strong support and generous funding
6 for our schools. The Proposed Amendment will allow
7 us to site and create new capacity in districts with
8 persistent and projected overcrowding and also
9 continue to fund the key administration priorities to
10 create additional high quality full day pre-
11 kindergarten seats, remove all transportable
12 classrooms from the system and reduce class sizes.
13 Additionally the plan targets much needed improvement
14 for our aging infrastructure. The proposed \$16.5
15 billion Capital Plan contains \$940 million in new
16 funding from the spring 2017 Adopted Amendment. The
17 main program increases include funding for new
18 capacity and pre-K for all seats, replacement seats
19 and a new Administration Priority, Universal Physical
20 Education. The proposed 2015-2019 Capital Plan is
21 funded by state and city tax levy and \$783 million in
22 proceeds from the New York State Smart Schools Bond
23 Act. The DOEs proposed allocation of Smart Schools
24 Bond Act proceeds known as Smart Schools Investment
25 Plan allocates funding to technology, pre-K for all

2 capacity and removal of TCUs and is available on the
3 DOEs website. This Plan was submitted to the state
4 for approval and we look forward to hearing back from
5 Smart Schools Bond Act Review Board. The proposed
6 2018 amendment includes \$6.5 billion for Capacity
7 Program an increase of over \$500 million over the
8 2017 Adopted Budget. The Proposed Plan Amendment
9 creates over 44,600 seats that will address
10 overcrowding as well as pre-K for all expansion,
11 class size reduction and facility replacement. Of
12 the \$6.5 billion allocated to capacity, \$4.8 is
13 dedicated to creating more than 44,600 new seats
14 through an estimated 88 projects within school
15 districts experiencing the most critical and existing
16 and projected overcrowding. 18 projects have been
17 identified since the last Adopted Amendment including
18 PS340 Annex in District 10, a new Primary School on
19 5th Avenue in District 15 and a large high school on
20 Northern Boulevard in Queens. The Proposed 2018
21 Amendment continues to identify a seat need of
22 approximately 83,000 seats which is partially
23 attributable to the recommendations of our community
24 partners on the Blue Book Working Group who voiced a
25 long-standing concern regarding the way school space

2 is used and how capacity is measured and reflected.
3 The Amendment also includes \$872 million for pre-K
4 for all seats, an increase of approximately \$70
5 million from the 2017 adopted budget which will
6 create almost 8,800 new seats across the city. In
7 addition \$287 million has been allocated to the
8 replacement program. This represents an increase of
9 \$145 million. Two new projects were identified since
10 the last adopted Amendment, ISHS at 715 Ocean Terrace
11 on Staton Island and PS2 Mini-School in District 30.
12 Finally, \$490 million is allocated in our class size
13 reduction program to build additions or new buildings
14 near school buildings that would significantly
15 benefit from additional capacity. This program
16 recognizes the need for targeted investments in areas
17 of the city that may be geographically isolated and
18 have unfunded seat needs. Schools in these areas may
19 also have a high rate of utilization and TCUs. Under
20 this program, three projects are currently in design
21 of construction, one each in District 11 in the
22 Bronx, District 19 in Brooklyn and District 29 in
23 Queens. The Planned Amendment directs \$6.6 billion
24 for Capital Investment, 75% or \$4.1 billion Capital
25 Investment Allocation which includes RESOA Projects

2 will address the buildings identified in our Annual
3 Building Condition Survey as in most need of repair
4 such as roof and structural repairs, safeguarding our
5 buildings against water infiltration and other
6 facility projects. The Capital Investment Category
7 also includes funding for upgrades to fire alarms,
8 public address systems and removal of TCUs. More
9 specifically \$395 million has been allocated to
10 remove TCUs and redevelop the yard space where the
11 TCU has been located. To date, we have removed 171
12 TCUs and have developed plans to remove 63 more
13 leaving a balance of 120 TCUs not yet slated for
14 removal. It is important to note that the removal
15 schedule is contingent upon capacity constraints
16 within the area and the input of local school
17 communities. The remaining 25% or \$1.6 billion will
18 go toward school enhancement projects. The two main
19 programs in this category are facility enhancements
20 and technology. The Proposed 2018 Amendment includes
21 approximately \$974 million for facility enhancements.
22 Some of the highlights of this program are bathroom
23 upgrades, accessibility upgrades, upgrades to
24 instructional spaces and existing buildings such s
25 the restructuring of classrooms, the creation of

2 health centers in our renewal schools and schools
3 with the highest concentration of students in
4 temporary housing, safety and security upgrades and a
5 program to renovate existing school cafeterias to
6 better align with our existing facilities with school
7 foods mission of promoting healthy and attractive
8 food choices to our students. We are also tacking two
9 issues that we know are important to many of you, air
10 conditioning and physical Ed facility. Last year the
11 City dedicated funding to purchase and install air
12 conditioning units in all classrooms by 2022
13 providing thousands of students with a more
14 comfortable learning environment. The first cohort
15 of schools has already been completed and we have
16 installed 2,250 air conditioning units. The February
17 2018 Amendment supports this initiative by allocating
18 an initial \$50 million for electrical upgrades. This
19 allocation included in the Amendment will support
20 electrical upgrades in some buildings that required
21 additional electrical capacity to facility the
22 installation of air conditioners. Work is already
23 underway to assess these buildings for electrical
24 upgrades and we hope to continue supporting this
25 important initiative in the future. As part of the

2 Administration's Equity and Excellence for All
3 Agenda, the planned amendment allocates \$105 million
4 to ensure that all students have access to indoor
5 space for physical education by 2021. In this first
6 phase of the initiative, we are exploring options to
7 construct new gymnasiums, renovate school yards or
8 convert existing space for schools that do not
9 currently have sufficient access to indoor physical
10 Ed space. We have identified three schools that will
11 receive a new stand-alone gym annex, PS81 in Queens,
12 PS18 in Brooklyn and PS6 in the Bronx. This
13 Amendment will allow more students to have fast
14 access to essential science, technology, engineering
15 and math and computer science materials online and
16 serve as an effective conduit for teachers to access
17 professional and/or curricular related resources. In
18 addition, approximately \$134 million is also being
19 invested to upgrade and modernize essential business
20 operation systems such as the Student Enrollment
21 System and Security System for Enterprise Network
22 Sign-Ins. MANDATED PROGRAMS: The total cost to
23 support City's effort to remove and replace all PCB
24 containing light fixtures throughout the entire
25 school system was approximately \$800 million, over

2 half of which was covered by the previous five-year
3 Capital Plan. I am particularly pleased to say that
4 this long-term program was completed in December
5 2016, five years ahead of the original schedule. We
6 are grateful to the Council for its support in this
7 effort. The Mandated Programs Category also includes
8 approximately \$750 million for boiler conversions
9 in approximately 110 buildings currently using #4
10 oil. The remaining funds are assigned to cover other
11 required costs including insurance and completion of
12 projects from the prior plan. We understand that the
13 public school system as well as a whole continues to
14 experience pockets of overcrowding and we are working
15 to address these concerns through new school
16 construction, remain focused on remedying these
17 issues and will continue to rely on your feedback and
18 support as we do. Our Annual Capital Planning
19 process has already benefited significantly from your
20 input and our students have benefited from your
21 generous support of Capital Projects. With continued
22 collaboration and tens of thousands of seats slated
23 to come online over the next five to seven years, we
24 remain confident the expansion and enhancement of
25 school buildings across the five boroughs will

2 improve the educational experience for this city's
3 1.1 million school children as well as the teachers
4 and staff who serve them. Thank you again for
5 allowing us to testify and we would be happy to
6 answer any questions.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you very much,
8 President Grillo. I just want to just take a moment
9 to thank you and your staff for being incredibly
10 responsive to my office and to this committee. I do,
11 I do appreciate that. We, the Council appreciates
12 that. Uhm, I just want to discuss, get right in to
13 it in regards to class size reduction.

14 LORRAINE GRILLO: Sure.

15 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uhm, the Proposed
16 Amendment includes \$490 million for the creation of
17 4900 seats through class size reduction projects, uhm
18 but only three projects representing 1,354 seats have
19 been identified.

20 LORRAINE GRILLO: Uh-huh.

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: It has been two
22 years since class sized reduction projects have been
23 identified, what is the timeline for the
24 identification of additional class size reduction
25 projects.

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Right uhm, yes, uhm,
3 the ac... class size reduction program. We come to
4 the conclusions as to what schools will be included
5 or what areas will be included through a Committee
6 that includes uhm the SCA, Space Planning as well as
7 Space Management and others at the DOE. The SCA has
8 recently researched this and come up with three
9 additional schools that we want to add to the list.
10 We are scheduling a Committee meeting and we will get
11 input from the other Committee members as well, we
12 hope to spend every dollar of the \$490 million.

13 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Alright, one of, one
14 of the frustrations, of, of my colleagues and myself
15 has been, they have gone out of their way to search
16 for spaces in their districts to identify additional
17 space with the SCA and a question that I know is on
18 the mind of many of my colleagues including myself
19 is, how, how many, how many dedicated staff, staffers
20 due you have SCA that deal strictly with real estate
21 and finding spaces in our communities to acquire for
22 schools?

23 LORRAINE GRILLO: Okay, the SCA staff
24 itself has a five folks who manage our Real Estate
25 Brokers. We have a number of real estate brokers

2 under contract who are constantly and consistently
3 out in the field in those areas of overcrowding
4 looking for appropriate space.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Do you feel that
6 that is sufficient?

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: We could also use more
8 staff.

9 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: This is something
10 that we, we do need to work on.

11 LORRAINE GRILLO: Sure.

12 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Because many members
13 have really gone out of their way to uhm search
14 literally every block, every corner of this district
15 to identify space and at times they have found space
16 and it is challenging when you have a very uhm
17 intense real estate market.

18 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yep.

19 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Because time is of
20 the essence. Getting back to people, following up on
21 things and so I, I am concerned that five people,
22 are, it is not sufficient when there are other
23 interests looking to acquire the same space, mainly
24 for you know probably luxury condos or some other
25 types, types of development. Uhm, we need more

2 schools, we don't need more luxury condo apartments
3 in New York. So, this is something that we uhm, I
4 think we need to work on together. I know that I, I
5 have met with you before about some time I think
6 before my tenure there was a space in Southern
7 Brooklyn, a school that was transferred from DOE to
8 the MTA, the old PS248 school, uhm that sits in an
9 area that I'm sure my colleagues represent school
10 district 20 including myself would agree that we need
11 that school back. Uhm, is that something that the
12 SCA DOE is working on to.

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely.

14 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Any update on.

15 LORRAINE GRILLO: We are in conversation
16 with the MTA. I don't have the update, I'm sorry
17 today but I certain will get back to you.

18 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Yes, that is
19 something that, we, we want our school back. That is
20 something that is very, very important to us. Uhm I
21 wanted to, I'm sure there will be more questions on
22 that I just want to turn to a couple of more topics
23 then turn to my colleagues. To technology, 60% of
24 technology funding in the Capital Plan, almost \$400
25 million is allocated for improving school buildings,

2 technology infrastructure so the DOE can meet the new
3 state and FCC standards of 100 megabytes per second
4 per 1000 students. DOE is in the process of, for
5 switching from Verizon's network to light towers
6 network and has said that all schools will be on
7 light towers network by the end of Fiscal year 2019;
8 however, many of the schools that have been already
9 switched to light towers network still have broadband
10 provision below 100 mbps. Can you describe the
11 infrastructure upgrades required to bring all schools
12 up to a broadband provision of at least 100 megabytes
13 per second?

14 PETER QUINN: Good morning Councilman.
15 So it's a three part program.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Sir can you just
17 state your name for the, for the record.

18 PETER QUINN: I'm sorry, I'm sorry, Peter
19 Quinn and I am the Chief Information Officer for the
20 Department of Education.

21 MARK TREYGER: Thank you so much.

22 PETER QUINN: You are welcome. So
23 there's a three part program to, at the end of the
24 day to meet that guideline. So as you have spoken
25 correctly, we will have the capability of 100

2 megabytes to every school building by June of '19.
3 That will allow us to connect to what a backbone
4 network or what we are calling the next generation
5 network. When you think about the next generation
6 network it is how you actually route traffic from
7 every individual school to the internet itself. The
8 challenge you have today is that the network up until
9 30 days ago was totally saturated. The last big
10 investment that was made was made in 2005, it was
11 upgraded from 9 gigabytes to 24 gigabytes in
12 September of 2016. At that point, it was also
13 saturated. If you want to think about saturation, if
14 you think about roads and rails on New York 1, you
15 can look at this and it is totally red and so we have
16 at the end of this past school year, we got it up to
17 30 and then we just made a number of adjustments that
18 were not in the plan to get it to 60 gig and that has
19 been in place just about 30 days now. That has given
20 relief to a number of schools, the vast majority that
21 have 100 mega, megabyte capability. The largest
22 schools, though, the campus facilities it is now
23 apparent that they have their own challenges around
24 bandwidth so we are now looking for creating
25 solutions to deal with the larger schools and larger

2 campus type schools. We have four in particular that
3 actually funded their own internet connection back a
4 while ago because they realized given the size of
5 their population in the ability to be able to get
6 both Capital Funds and regular for the lack of a
7 better term, money to pay for the recurring fees for
8 a direct internet connection that was actually put in
9 place. The third part of this; however, is that once
10 you bring the fiber to school you have to be able to
11 consume it in the school building so there is
12 infrastructural upgrades that need to happen. We are
13 committed on that June 19 date to have upgraded 386
14 components in 386 school buildings to make sure that
15 we can consume the band width when it is delivered to
16 those school buildings; however, we will over the
17 next several months have to go and deal with the
18 larger campus schools and figure out exactly what we
19 are going to do to accommodate their much larger
20 needs. It is now not a challenge on the network to
21 deliver the internet band width. It is the amount of
22 bandwidth they need inside the schools and the
23 connection to the internet that we have to work with.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: That is correct,
25 which leads me to my next question, does the DOE

2 believe that the, that the standard of 100 megabytes
3 for second is adequate for all schools.

4 PETER QUINN: So the FCC has actually
5 been raising that to 1 gig or 10 times that and I
6 don't know what the time table is, do you know the
7 date? Okay, that is coming. I would suggest to you
8 that we are probably going to outrun that and that is
9 going to be for a couple of reasons. One is the, the
10 more prevalent use of instructional software but it
11 is also what is happening in the marketplace. You
12 are seeing the internet and you tube is now becoming
13 one of the big instructional vehicles but the second,
14 when they are delivering you tube or any of the rest
15 of it is high quality video which consumes more
16 bandwidth as we go. So we are in a marathon if you
17 will and a sprint to get even, to get deliver that
18 first part of equity for the school buildings to hit
19 that 100 meg but right after that we have to go and
20 start thinking about the next generation both from a
21 backbone and what we need to do inside schools to be
22 able to consume that bandwidth effectively and
23 deliver equity both for our students and teachers so
24 students can learn and teachers can teach.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So, I, I would just
3 flag that time is, is of the essence here because uhm
4 first of all, as we speak I'm, I'm pretty sure that
5 the state is working on plans to one day mandate
6 computer based testing on state assessments.

7 PETER QUINN: Uh-huh.

8 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And as a former
9 teacher that had to participate in a pilot project of
10 grading regions that was scanned over computers that
11 was a major problem because we didn't have the
12 infrastructure in place to do that so the following
13 year, the DOE returned back to regular ways of
14 grading. In my visits to many of the schools so far,
15 this is a common problem that they cannot utilize
16 technology in their building. One school, you know I
17 learned that the mayor has allowed the use you know
18 of the students to have cellphones in schools and one
19 of the school leaders, you know painted a picture for
20 me that during the early afternoon there can be over
21 26,000 devices turned on in that school. And they
22 literally cannot send an email.

23 PETER QUINN: Right.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And I just cannot
25 believe this is happening in the year 2018 in New

2 York City that a school building has difficulty
3 sending out an email. And and so I don't believe
4 that 100 megabytes per second is sufficient. I think
5 we are playing a game of catchup with technology.
6 Uhm, I have also learned and I appreciate you, we
7 have met with the Council as well and explaining the
8 structure, you have an outside provider. You have a
9 connecting piece between the outside and the school
10 and then you have the internal infrastructure of the
11 school. My concern is that when a teacher or a
12 student turns on a computer and the internet is not
13 working, it doesn't say on the computer where the
14 problem is it just says it's not working so how can a
15 school follow up on that to get a clear answer of who
16 is accountable and who is responsible? Is it the
17 provider? Is it a faulty connector? Or is it the
18 internal infrastructure that is not sufficient to
19 meet the needs of the school building? Uhm, we need
20 clarity on that because that is how we can hold
21 people accountable. If it is the provider that is
22 outside then we have the power of the person, the
23 contract to say you are not fulfilling your
24 obligations to our kids. But if it is an internal
25 problem within the school building, that is our

2 obligations to better meet the needs. So how can we,
3 how can the DOE and the SCA provide more clarity to
4 schools about accountability about why things are not
5 working?

6 PETER QUINN: So it is a, a multi-part
7 answers. Alright so first is getting the backbone at
8 work, the network that actually aggregates or takes
9 all of the traffic from the various schools to get it
10 up to a speed that can in fact accommodate all that
11 traffic, so we are now at a point that we can
12 accommodate the traffic and we know that. Having
13 done that, now you can see in individual schools, do
14 they, are they outrunning the capacity of the circuit
15 that runs to their school and that can be Verizon or
16 that can be light tower and the Verizon circuits
17 getting to light tower again is going to take the
18 next 14 to 15 months to get all of those. And that
19 is just right or wrong or otherwise, there is no
20 other way to say this, we are behind the 8-ball and
21 to run fiber to every school going through the
22 conduits, running it on poles is just a time, it is
23 just a time factor. There is no getting around it
24 until you.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So I will, and I
3 will just ask to clarify is there a time factor that
4 we are talking years, is that correct?

5 PETER QUINN: We are talking basically 15
6 months to get all the rest of the school buildings
7 will have fiber so that they will have 100 megabytes
8 to those schools.

9 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And the Mayor has an
10 ambitious plan to have computer science for all by
11 when?

12 PETER QUINN: I don't know the exact date
13 of that, I will have to come back to you on that.

14 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And this what I,
15 this is what I mean when our pledges and our promises
16 are not aligned with the current reality because I
17 support computer science for all. Quite frankly,
18 frankly this should be happening already years, years
19 before. Uhm, but we don't have an infrastructure to
20 have computer science for all and I would just add
21 that, that again the State of New York is in the
22 process of one day mandating these assessments on
23 computers and our infrastructure is woefully
24 inadequate. Uhm, I also know that when state
25 visitors visit schools and even DOE folks visit

2 schools, one of the questions they keep asking
3 educators is how do you use technology to improve or
4 supplement your instruction knowing that the
5 technology is inadequate and that is not fair to put
6 the onus (sp?) on educators and kids, fix it and
7 then ask them how they are using technology to fix,
8 to improve their, their instructions. I want to
9 turn, one last time then turn to my colleagues uhm
10 for their questions. With regards to air
11 conditioning, air ventilation, which I appreciate
12 that there is finally a push to have all classrooms
13 you know fitted with air conditions. I know that is
14 coupled with an investment to fix the wiring, is that
15 correct?

16 PETER QUINN: That is correct sir.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Okay but I am also
18 aware that this is limited to just classrooms and
19 this does not include cafeterias and auditoriums, is
20 that correct?

21 PETER QUINN: For air conditioning that
22 is correct.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So I wanted just to
24 express my concern, I know some of my colleagues will
25 ask further questions about cafeterias but we have

2 heard a lot about cafeterias lately, uhm about the
3 conditions, of, of school food in there and uhm and
4 in my conversation with cafeteria workers and my own,
5 my personal experience working in a school, it is
6 very hot in those cafeterias and it is a workplace
7 issue, it is a public safety issue and are there any
8 plans to revisit that decision to include cafeterias
9 for better air ventilation?

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: Council Member we are
11 looking at air conditioning right now for 16,720
12 classrooms. Uhm, we have adequate funding we believe
13 for that uhm the cafeterias and large spaces, large
14 public assembly spaces are much more expensive to
15 outfit with air conditioning. At this point, we have
16 not begun the discussion about those spaces.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right and I would
18 just add that you know those are the public large
19 spaces that parents have you know PTA meetings, where
20 there is graduations, where there are performances,
21 student assemblies. The cafeteria is used every day
22 for a variety of reasons, obviously for breakfast,
23 for lunch for sometimes conferences and meetings and
24 it is stifling hot in there and I, I appreciate the
25 acknowledgement and the recognition of classroom air

2 conditioning as that is also, it is critical but kids
3 move to those spaces too and our staff works there
4 every day and I feel for those cafeteria workers that
5 are working in those conditions literally all day and
6 it is very, very hot and if they open the window and
7 a fly flies in and then someone says why is there a
8 fly in the cafeteria that will explain why, what's
9 going on so I just think that this is an issue that
10 we do need to revisit and I believe that we need
11 better air ventilation, air conditioning for all
12 parts of our schools but I just want me more input of
13 my colleagues so I'll, I'll acknowledge we have been
14 joined by Council Member Brannon, Council Member
15 Cohen and Council Member Levin and the first member
16 to ask question today and I remind them of the clock
17 is Council Member Kallos.

18 BEN KALLOS: Thank you Chair Treyger. I
19 love all of your questions and may try to follow up
20 on your spot on uhm the pre-K deadline is March 30
21 for children born in 2014. If you are watching with
22 an eligible child, please apply. I appreciate the
23 234 seats opening this September and 180 seats set to
24 open in 2019 to bring my District to I believe around
25 900 seats for four year olds. However, in Community

2 District 8 for the Upper Eastside, the DOHMH,
3 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene natality by
4 Community District of Residents, New York City
5 reports 2,577 live births in 2015. Does SCA see new
6 need for pre-K and 3K seats in the District which
7 would need to start now working on them. I'm going
8 to ask a bunch of questions and if you can just take
9 the notes on that, so that's the first question. In
10 2016, in my School District 2, Gifted and Talented
11 Exam had 615 eligible students that applied but only
12 346 received offers turning away nearly half of
13 applicants for a total of 306 preschoolers. Will SCA
14 build or add more GNT Capacity? In 2017, Mayor de
15 Blasio announced University Physical Education
16 Initiative to provide all schools with designated PE
17 space by 2021 with a whopping \$491 million in
18 funding, sadly schools in my District were omitted
19 from the list and I brought this to the Mayor's
20 office and SCA after the announcement to no
21 available. When the Mayor sought a gym to hold his
22 Town Hall he learned firsthand that we don't have
23 many gyms in the district and eventually settled for
24 one of the small gyms in the District with an
25 overflow room. I brought private schools, building

2 field houses in the District to DOE and SCA to make
3 space available to students. Does DOE and SCA agree
4 that we need, that we have a need for gyms in the
5 District and will DOE and SCA build a fieldhouse for
6 schools as well as lease existing spaces. Uhm, the
7 next question is, it is public school auction season
8 and wherever I go parents are fearful about the next
9 act of school violence and they are asking for
10 security cameras and access control for every school.
11 SCA provided IPDBS Security Cameras for 1,123 schools
12 and 710 buildings as only funding an additional 17
13 schools this coming year. How are schools
14 prioritized? Why have my schools been omitted and
15 how much to all security cameras in every school
16 building and then just to follow along with what the
17 chair brought to light, 100 megabytes to school
18 buildings is embarrassing. I have 400 megabytes at
19 home and I am a single user paying much less than the
20 City is paying. A gigabyte came out in 1998, 20
21 years ago, I personally wired Suny-Albany for fiber
22 in 2002. Will DOE sit down with the Chair, myself,
23 Spectrum and Verizon to see if they can't do better
24 because businesses can get it for \$159 a month at 300
25 megabytes through Spectrum right now?

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you Council
3 Member. There are a few questions in there so let me
4 try and, and go through what I can. Yes, we were
5 very pleased to be able to provide those pre-K sites
6 very recently in your District. Uhm, and we are
7 continually working with the Early Learning Group at
8 DOE to see where the needs are for pre-K. Let's talk
9 for a moment about 3-K. 3-K as you mentioned uhm is
10 rolling out a lot more slowly than the UPK did, uhm
11 and so the Districts that are currently being
12 expanded for 3-K have existing seats. Over time, I
13 am sure we will be getting to District 2 and at that
14 point in time we will make an assessment and where in
15 fact we need to find space. Uhm, we don't build
16 space specifically for Gifted and Talented. We build
17 for those Districts that have a need for additional
18 seats and we are monitoring your District very, very
19 closely. Uhm as far as PhysEd. We are aware of the
20 issues having to do with your particular District,
21 particularly on the Upper East Side. Actually
22 working very, very closely with the students from
23 Eleanor Roosevelt High School who are trying very
24 hard to identify the space. I know that you have
25 been involved working with private schools to see if

2 we can do some kind of a joint project with them. We
3 are happy to take on any idea that you have and
4 explore it because it is very important to us as
5 well. Uhm did I miss something? Yes, okay IPDBS, oh
6 I see.

7 ALOYSEE JARMOSZUK: Aloysee Jarmoszuk,
8 DOE, so during the Fiscal year 2015-2019, uhm Capital
9 Plan the DOE plans to continue the implementation of
10 the Internet Protocol Digital Video Surveillance.
11 These are cameras that allow authorized personnel to
12 view digital images of what is happening in the
13 schools from their computers. As of February 2018,
14 we have 710 buildings serving 1,123 schools with this
15 equipment so that is over 28,998 cameras city-wide.
16 There were updated standards that came out in July of
17 2015 so we are continuing on those upgrades and that
18 is what it looks like currently.

19 BEN KALLOS: When will my District get
20 the cameras?

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: That is the final
22 question for first round.

23 LORRAINE GRILLO: We will have to come
24 back to you on that, I'm not sure.

25 BEN KALLOS: Okay. Uhm.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Next we have Council
3 Member Lander.

4 BRAD LANDER: Thank you Mr. Chair, uhm,
5 thank you guys for being here, uhm, I think that you
6 know that one of the next re-zoning areas is the
7 Gowanus area, District 15 is the third highest seat
8 need in the District. I just want to confirm that
9 you guys are talking to City Planning and talking to
10 City Hall and look forward to be talking to us as we
11 make sure that we have the seat needed in that area
12 as we move forward.

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely Council
14 Member. We are sitting, we have a seat at the table
15 with City Planning as we move forward with the whole
16 Gowanus Project.

17 BRAD LANDER: So and I'll just, I don't
18 want to go too long about that, obviously we are just
19 at the beginning of that process, but you know you
20 have seen it, communities are not enthusiastic about
21 growth and uhm in our District actually, while there
22 are some people that don't want to see any there are
23 a reasonable number of people who recognize it is
24 appropriate in a neighborhood like Gowanus to see
25 some additional residential. They like that it is

2 inclusive, that it will have affordable housing but
3 we can't possibly do it in a District that is already
4 overcrowded if we don't have a real ambitious plan
5 for a seat for every kid so I just want to make sure
6 that we are on the, on the same.

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: We agree.

8 BRAD LANDER: Very good. Thank you.
9 Uhm, lots more to come on that in the coming months.
10 Uhm, uhm, real good to see you know we are obviously
11 on air conditioning, a long way from where we were a
12 year ago at the Preliminary Budget Hearing and so the
13 commitment that was made after last, last years
14 Preliminary Budget Hearing and before, you know in
15 the Executive Budget to you know move us forward on a
16 five-year plan is a big deal and I'm grateful and of
17 course we are going to start pushing right away from
18 cafeterias and auditoriums because our constituents
19 want us, need us to.

20 LORRAINE GRILLO: That's right.

21 BRAD LANDER: But I also want to honor
22 that that is a sizeable commitment that you guys are
23 moving forward on it. There was great enthusiasm
24 when the Mayor announced that at our Town Hall that
25 some of the schools in District 15. Uhm, you guys

2 gave us the first report on progress and the second
3 one is due next week I think or you will be giving us
4 the update status on that.

5 LORRAINE GRILLO: Uh-huh, yes we will.
6 Most, most of the current work is being managed
7 through Division of School Facilities uhm and I know
8 that they have been very responsive so.

9 BRAD LANDER: Great. And I mean
10 obviously they understandably prioritize putting
11 units in those schools and classrooms that are
12 already with the electrical capacity in place.

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Correct.

14 BRAD LANDER: And started building out
15 the plan to do the electrical upgrades. I will just
16 alert my colleagues, so that report which is provided
17 by a Term and Condition in last year's Budget, goes
18 through every school building. So if you have
19 questions, if your constituents have questions about
20 where there School is in the plan, next week we
21 should receive that report from DOE and we can go in
22 detail and if we have questions about it we will come
23 back and ask them in the Executive Budget. Uhm, is
24 there some attention to make sure, maybe you were
25 asked this by the Chair or by Council Member Kallos

2 that those schools where an electrical upgrade is
3 needed for air conditioning capacity and where also
4 an electrical upgrade will be needed for broadband
5 capacity that we know.

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: Right.

7 BRAD LANDER: What those schools are and
8 are making sure that we make the upgrade in a way
9 that is adequate for both of those needs.

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: You are absolutely
11 correct and we, we recognize that and as we do
12 electrical upgrades it will be inclusive of these
13 other needs that, the school may have. We work very
14 closely with DIIT on these things.

15 BRAD LANDER: So I don't know whether, it
16 sounds like you guys have got a big, done a lot of
17 planning, have a lot of information because on ACs we
18 asked for it all in you know report form. We have
19 seen some of it. It might be worth us working this
20 year toward a Term and Condition that helps us know,
21 get that same level of information, understand where
22 you are building by building so that we can be
23 working with our constituents so they know where they
24 are, at least first to get up to the 100 megabytes

2 per second and then ultimately obviously to where we
3 really need to be.

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes good idea.

5 PETER QUINN: If I can just say one
6 thing. Just so folks are very clear. It is not just
7 the bandwidth. It is how the bandwidth is manage and
8 consumed in schools. And if you have a school in
9 fact that all the, the mobile phones are consuming
10 the bandwidth it is because it is not bandwidth
11 management if you will that reserves the bandwidth
12 for instruction so I think people need to be careful.
13 We would all love to have like a boatload but it
14 doesn't necessarily mean that you need that much to
15 effectively deliver instructional content.

16 BRAD LANDER: No and you gave a very good
17 breakdown and obviously the electrical upgrades for
18 the AC are just one small thing. It is just if we
19 know a school needs and electrical upgrade and we are
20 doing these two different processes we want to make
21 they are together. My, my last question is I did see
22 from my District not in schools yet but in buildings
23 there is a vendor of broadband who have like a Star
24 Trek you know technology but essentially like a
25 beaming capacity where they deliver broadband level

2 speeds through a microwave, essentially you know
3 network on the roofs of buildings rather than threw
4 wiring and I know Josh Brightbart and his team are
5 aware of it and I don't know whether you have looked
6 at that at all or whether there might be schools that
7 that could give you capacity in a faster way than
8 pulling cable would.

9 PETER QUINN: So uhm two comments. We
10 were very closely with Josh and was actually out for
11 a National Science Foundation Grant to be able to
12 figure out how we can deploy 5G and is a section
13 actually in Harlem that we are actually partnered
14 with them on. I am not aware of specifically what
15 you are talking about but I would just say this and
16 this is unfortunate. You have wireless in a
17 classroom, you still have to drag a wire from a
18 distribution frame to do the thing and we are going
19 to be stuck in that paradigm for another 10 years as
20 much as I hate to say it and it is awful but at the
21 end of the day if you look at the classroom activity
22 30% of that goes to labor to pull cable.

23 BRAD LANDER: Thank you, thank you Mr.
24 Chair.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Sure and you know
3 just to circle back on that, if it is just what is
4 frustrating for educators on the ground is that when
5 their computer screen just shows a turning wheel or
6 the spinning colorful thing, it doesn't explain to
7 them where the problem is and they don't know who to
8 call and it and it takes time to figure out what the
9 problem is and who do you hold accountable and
10 that's, that's, that's and thanks to your
11 presentation we had a better understanding of the
12 outside provider, the connector and the internal
13 infrastructure it just doesn't say that on the
14 computer screen where the problem is and I and I also
15 just note that 100 MBPS, megabytes per second, I'm
16 becoming a tech person now is not sufficient. We, we
17 have a long way to go. Uhm, next I want to turn to
18 Council Member Borelli.

19 JOSEPH BORELLI: Good morning, uhm, just
20 a quick follow up on Council Member Kallos' question
21 on the uhm, the gym program.

22 LORRAINE GRILLO: Uh-huh.

23 JOSEPH BORELLI: What are the criteria
24 that went in to determining which schools would be
25 first on the list, second on the list and I guess the

2 second question would be there is 105 million that I
3 see and there are three schools that are going to get
4 stand-alone gyms. You know just being an amateur on
5 how much money things cost, is there any money left?

6 LORRAINE TREYGER: Oh yes, absolutely.
7 Uhm, thank you Council Member. Yeah those three
8 schools are the first of I believe 21 that we are
9 proceeding with as far as stand-alone gyms are
10 concerned. We have several others that are in
11 overcrowded Districts and sub-Districts where in fact
12 we are building additions as well as the gyms. What,
13 we, the criteria basically is, if the school doesn't
14 have a gym and if there is space we will build stand-
15 alone gyms. If it is in an overcrowded District or
16 sub-District then we certainly will plan an addition
17 with that gym as well. Others, again uhm for example
18 in Council Member Kallos' District where it is very,
19 very congested and there is really no room whatsoever
20 then we have to look at other options perhaps leasing
21 nearby space, working with as he has tried to do
22 private schools to come up with a joint type project,
23 so we are looking at possible way to address this.

24 JOSEPH BORELLI: And, and what's the time
25 line for the initial 21.

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Oh gosh, again we have
3 just put the three out to bid. We have others in
4 design as we speak but if you give me a moment, okay,
5 yeah so the three that are in we will have two
6 completed by 2019, one will be completed by 2020.
7 Obviously we want to get these going as quickly as
8 possible. One of the things that we did to make sure
9 that this would happen very, very quickly is we
10 designed to specific types or prototypes of these
11 buildings so in fact the design process as well as
12 the construction process for the most part is
13 complete so we will be able to move forward as
14 quickly as we possible can.

15 JOSEPH BORELLI: Okay and the last
16 question on a different topic. There was a lot of
17 news reports about health violations in a lot of DOE
18 school cafeterias. Is there any capital dollars
19 going toward renovating some of the more problematic
20 kitchens that was on, that we?

21 LORRAINE GRILLO: Actually uhm at this
22 moment I mean we have uhm, I believe we have some
23 funding but not a whole heck of a lot but I will tell
24 you this, that we have engaged an expert in this
25 field and we are working very closely with food

2 services to determine what exactly are the needs for
3 these kitchens as we come up, whether it is storage,
4 whether it is more equipment, less equipment, all of
5 those details so that when we have something uhm that
6 we can all agree on then perhaps we can do similar as
7 we are doing with the, with the gymnasiums which
8 basically a prototype type situation.

9 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you Council
10 Member. Next, we will have Council Member Rose.

11 DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you. Hi, how are
12 you?

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Good thank you.

14 DEBORAH ROSE: Uhm I will follow up on
15 the safety and security issue uhm as we saw yesterday
16 or Saturday with the March for life that uhm, this is
17 an issue of critical importance to not only our, our
18 families but to the students who have to, to work and
19 go to school in these buildings and so you stated
20 that there is funding for 1,123 school and 710
21 buildings. Now will that bring all of the schools
22 uhm in line so that all of them have this uhm, IPDVS
23 System which is a video camera surveillance system?
24 Will that bring all of our schools online, will all
25 of them have this type of technology?

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: No.

3 DEBORAH ROSE: No? What uhm, what would
4 it take to have all of our schools online with this
5 type of security systems?

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: We are in the process
7 of conducting those analysis and trying to determine
8 which schools would come up next and would have to
9 come back to you with a response on what it would
10 take.

11 DEBORAH ROSE: And uhm do you have a
12 timeline for that to uhm happen?

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: I don't know the
14 timeline right now, no.

15 DEBORAH ROSE: Okay with the uhm capacity
16 K-12 Capacity Schools, four were removed from the uhm
17 Capital, the five-year plan. Uhm why were they
18 removed and uhm was sighting a potential issue.

19 LORRAINE GRILLO: I'm, I'm real...

20 DEBORAH ROSE: There were four K-12
21 Capacity Programs that were removed from the five
22 year plan?

23 LORRAINE GRILLO: I'm not familiar with
24 that, we will have to find out specifically and get
25

2 back to you. I don't, I'm not familiar with schools
3 that were removed.

4 DEBORAH ROSE: Okay could you get back
5 to...

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: I sure will.

7 DEBORAH ROSE: I would really like to
8 uhm, and what schools that they are and uhm with the
9 TCU count, could you tell me what the full count is?

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yeah, we began with 354
11 TCUs, we have removed 171, we have plans to remove 63
12 additional and there is 120 left.

13 DEBORAH ROSE: And so uhm, do, uhm does
14 your count include the high schools and ...

15 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yeah.

16 DEBORAH ROSE: District 75?

17 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes.

18 DEBORAH ROSE: Yes. Okay, well my time
19 is up. Thank you.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: If necessary, there
21 will be a round two Council Member.

22 DEBORAH ROSE: Okay.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Next, we have
24 Council Member Brannan.

2 JUSTIN BRANNAN: Thank you Chair. Uhm I
3 wanted to ask about MWBEs and how, how progress is
4 going with your vendors and contracts or subcontracts
5 going out to MWBEs?

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: We uhm, thank you
7 Council Member, we are particular proud of our MWBE
8 Program I think and I venture to guess that we have
9 the best program in the State of New York. We are
10 always, always looking for ways to improve that. Uhm
11 I just wanted to give you some of the numbers over
12 the last number of years since I have been present in
13 the SCA, uhm, in as far as our regular bidding
14 process, we have delivered \$1.8 billion for regular
15 CIP Projects, Capital Improvement Projects and now
16 there is half a billion dollars in our Mentor Program
17 which I, I think you are familiar with where we take
18 Emergent Contractors and train them to become very
19 successful. We also for the, for the last several
20 years have been working very hard to find companies
21 for the professional services meaning architects,
22 engineers as well and we've, and we've actually
23 provide contracts for over \$425 million in that area
24 as well. So I think we have a, a really, really
25 good, also in our, in our regular construction prime

2 contracts \$2.7 billion, in subcontracts \$1.9 billion
3 so in that area I am very proud to say that we do
4 extraordinary work.

5 JUSTIN BRANNAN: That's, that's very
6 impressive. What do, what do s... what is your secret
7 to success on that?

8 LORRAINE GRILLO: Secret to success.
9 Well, that t...

10 JUSTIN BRANNAN: The rest of city might
11 learn from you.

12 LORRAINE GRILLO: First of all I have
13 great people who manage that project, they are
14 terrific, they are experienced, they are always
15 willing to innovate and work really, really hard but
16 also one of the things that I think has made us so
17 successful is there is a commitment from everyone at
18 the FCA. This is not just one office of business
19 development where in fact they manage this. Every
20 single department within the SCA works towards this
21 goal. So.

22 JUSTIN BRANNAN: Thank you if you could
23 send me all those numbers that would be great.

24 LORRAINE GRILLO: I sure will, happy to
25 do that.

2 JUSTIN BRANNAN: Thank you.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you very much,
4 we have also been joined to note Council Member
5 Rosenthal, Council Council Member Dromm. Next we
6 have Council Member King.

7 ANDY KING: Thank you Mr. Chair and
8 President Grillo and team, as always a delight to
9 talk with you and hear your testimony and all the
10 things you have planned. So in a nutshell, just want
11 to know, you gave us testimony of our plans, what you
12 want to accomplish, understanding that a lot of our
13 infrastructure in our school systems is old. Is
14 there anything that you could say right now that
15 would be an obstacle of completing the plan of
16 whether it is bathrooms or school based health
17 centers or just reducing class sizes. Is there
18 anything that is in the way of completing your plan
19 that we can help with and what that looks like.

20 LORRAINE GRILLO: That's, well thank you
21 for that. Uhm actually we have been very successful
22 completing our plan. We have committed every year
23 upwards of \$2.5 to \$3 billion and when I say
24 committed that is having actual signed contracts of
25 work that is taking place, so we really, you know we

2 can always do more and we can always do better, uhm
3 we have obviously more money, more work. Things like
4 Design Build ability would be helpful as well so
5 those are the kind of things some Legislative
6 obviously funding is the best of, best of all worlds
7 for us.

8 ANDY KING: Uhm I'll keep it short and
9 simple, all I ask, we are working in the best
10 interest of our children and if there is anything or
11 anything in the system on the procurement process or
12 bidding, anything that gets in the way so we can
13 figure out how to minimize those obstacles so you can
14 deliver on your promise. I thank you again Mr.
15 Chair. Thank you.

16 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you sir.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uhm just to follow
18 up on that.

19 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: President Grillo can
21 you walk us through how Design Build Authority could
22 benefit SCA specifically and on what projects would
23 SCA use design build, what would be the cost and time
24 savings from Design Build?

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: I don't have the cost
3 savings but I can tell you the way that Design Build
4 works is you put in RF Pay for an Architect and
5 construction management firm as the Design is
6 progressing, well, typically it is after the 30%
7 Design Period construction can actually begin as
8 design continues through the project so it carves out
9 a great deal of time for that, that, that process.
10 We can't used it on every SCA project. It would have
11 to be a project of a piece of property that doesn't
12 require a negotiation or we would have to also work
13 very closely with the Council on our public review
14 process because that actually gets, takes some time,
15 so we would work very closely with you but we could
16 certainly, probably cut six months to nine months off
17 of the design process doing this.

18 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Which is
19 significant.

20 LORRAINE GRILLO: It sure is.

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: That is, thank you
22 very much, uhm. Next for questions we have Council
23 Member Deutsch.

24 CHAIM DEUTSCH: Thank you Chair. Uhm, so
25 basically my question is, I will get straight to the

2 point, uhm, so we spoke before about uhm finding new
3 space for new schools and we know, we all know it is
4 a difficult task so what is feasibility to use the
5 existing school buildings where it's where we could
6 both go high.

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: Right. You know.

8 CHAIM DEUTSCH: Go higher up.

9 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you, we, we've
10 actually come across that recommendation over time.
11 I will tell you that, uhm, the buildings that were
12 built in you know, decades ago were not structurally
13 built for that kind of building higher, also you
14 would have to vacate the top floors of the building,
15 you wouldn't want children in the building with a
16 building going up above their heads obviously so in
17 those Districts where you want to do stuff like that
18 you really have no place to relocate these children
19 for that period of time and it's a number of years to
20 do that kind of building but when we get a particular
21 suggestion like that, the first thing we do is go
22 visit the building, have our engineers look at the
23 structural capability of the building.

24 CHAIM DEUTSCH: So firstly, why do you
25 need a request? Why can't we do a study of all the

2 school buildings throughout the city and you tell us
3 uhm if there are any sites such as this that we can
4 build up before waiting for a request from a Council
5 Member. Secondly, I just want to say that in my
6 District and I brought this up before they purchased
7 a, there was an agreement in purchasing a property
8 from a developer and at the end of the day the
9 financial uhm whatever FCA offered was not what that
10 property owner wanted and so then they came back and
11 they tried taking away the property through emanate
12 domain.

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Uh-huh.

14 CHAIM DEUTSCH: So this discourages
15 property owners from even coming forward to DOE to
16 say Oh yeah we have a property that we are willing to
17 negotiate because if that deal falls through then
18 they are afraid that the City will come back and say
19 we will take it away whether you like it or not
20 through emanate domain so this discourages people
21 from, from coming forward because of, because of this
22 so uhm, what are your plans like to protect people
23 that make them feel more comfortable.

24 LORRAINE GRILLO: Right.

2 CHAIM DEUTSCH: To coming forward to say
3 yes we have a property that we are looking to sell to
4 DOE.

5 LORRAINE GRILLO: Well a couple of things
6 Council Member, I appreciate and I remember the
7 particular site that we are talking about. We, we,
8 and people notice, we use emanate domain rarely and
9 only when it needs, it absolutely is the only way.
10 Uhm, there are a number of Council Members who thing
11 that emanate domain should be used more often. As a
12 matter of fact in the recent report that was
13 initiated by Council staff, we were told that we
14 should use emanate domain more often. However, we
15 are very careful about the way that we look at it but
16 when we are buying a piece of property. We uhm do an
17 appraisal and if that appraisal is very, very
18 different from what the owner is asking, I have a
19 responsibility to use tax payer money appropriately
20 and I am not going to pay well over market value. In
21 that particular case, in that particular case, the
22 owner was asking for a large number over the market
23 value, uhm unwilling to take that down in any way,
24 shape or form. Uhm but at the time we, we talked
25 about emanate domain. The particular Council Member

2 at the time did not agree with that so we dropped the
3 site.

4 CHAIM DEUTSCH: Okay. Thank you.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you Council
6 Member, next we will hear from Council Member
7 Rosenthal.

8 HELEN ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much Chair
9 Treyger, welcome as always Deputy Chancellor Grillo
10 you are amazing.

11 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you.

12 HELEN ROSENTHAL: Thank you for all the
13 work that you have done in my District. Uhm but I
14 would like to ask some broad questions, a little bit
15 from learning what has happened in my District but
16 broad questions about accessibility in the schools
17 and I know you guys had a head up, heads up that I
18 was going to ask this question because it came up
19 last time but you know, uhm, I understand
20 accessibility runs the gamut. You could have you
21 know people who are hard of hearing, people who are
22 blind, people who are in wheelchairs so I know that
23 when you think about accessibility and making a
24 school accessible you are trying to meet all those
25 different criteria. I am wondering if you have a

2 list of the uhm the schools and maybe categorized by
3 currently how is each school accessible and going
4 forward the schools that are, what are, you know what
5 is the goal with the accessibility and the different
6 ways for each of the schools. I see that you noted
7 that you have \$127 million in the Budget for
8 accessibility but if you could really parse that out
9 as to what that means, how much will be achieved. I
10 think the short answer for you will be how much will
11 be achieved with that \$127? And how much further do
12 you have to go?

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Well I'm going, I'm
14 going to do two things, uhm Council Member, first of
15 all, I'm going to give you and I can do this, I can
16 get you a list right now, there are 22 projects, 22
17 schools where their projects for accessibility
18 whether in construction, bidding, award or completed
19 and we can certainly get that list to you. Uhm in
20 addition, we are joined by Tom Taratko who is in
21 charge of our Space Management Group and he is really
22 leading this charge to have the buildings accessible
23 and increase accessibility throughout the city. Tom
24 I don't know if you want to.

2 THOMAS TARATKO: I have a fairly loud
3 voice.

4 HELEN ROSENTHAL: No you are going to
5 have to, so the transcriber and to be clear I have 23
6 seconds left on my clock uhm and the second question
7 that I am going to be asking is about uhm removal of
8 the TCUs and to be clear every TCU is each school has
9 a different situation but in, in my District for
10 example the TCUs while you know they were there for
11 far too long by removing them it meant that a loss of
12 classroom space in the school and it meant a loss of
13 a cluster room so there is no art room for them now.
14 They have art on a cart. Uhm and I am wondering
15 similarly what your, what your plan of action, if you
16 have a plan of action for each school and if you are
17 aware, I guess turn that around, if you are aware of
18 the impact on each school for removing the TCU and
19 whether or not you have a plan of action for each
20 school?

21 LORRAINE GRILLO: It is funny that you
22 should ask that because the other person who me... who
23 helps manage this is Tom Taratko as well as Space
24 Management. Yes.

2 HELEN ROSENTHAL: I feel a meeting coming
3 on with him.

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes, yes. In fact when
5 we approach this obviously we have to have plans for
6 those students that are in those TCUs or other spaces
7 that might be being used for those TCUs so Tom and
8 his team really work very hard to go in depth on
9 every one of these to make sure that there is
10 adequate space for that so.

11 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I would ask you to
12 identify yourself and I have to just swear you in as
13 well. Do you swear to answer hon, honestly Council
14 Member questions.

15 THOMAS TARATKO: I do.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And your name just
17 for the record.

18 THOMAS TARATKO: My name is Tom Taratko
19 and I am the Chief Executive of Space Management.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you, you may
21 proceed.

22 THOMAS TARATKO: Okay so uhm I guess we
23 can go either TCU Planning, my group manages the
24 Office of District Planning, the Office of Space
25 Planning, the Office of Accessibility Planning and

2 Campus Governance. So District Planning looks very
3 closely at all of the numbers, more so than just the
4 blue book numbers and capacity numbers but what
5 programs do schools offer and things like that so if
6 a TCU, if we have an opportunity to remove that
7 Temporary Classroom Unit that we can make up for that
8 instructional loss of the space so that's where we
9 have hit a roadblock of these 120 in places where the
10 capacity is, is really necessary. We probably took
11 75 out as what we categorize and low hanging fruit
12 when none of this planning was necessary and then
13 there was a secondary group of them where we had to
14 either recreate space within the school out of
15 underutilized space or possibly even move a program
16 or plan that way to maybe shift pre-K or K to a
17 nearby school to allow that to happen. So all of
18 that planning is but the goal is not for that
19 building that uses a TCU not to lose any
20 instructional capabilities so there is a lot of
21 planning behind that.

22 HELEN ROSENTHAL: So actually it is not
23 in my District so don't tell Mark Levine I am saying
24 this but it is PS163 and you lost instructional
25 space.

2 THOMAS TARATKO: Okay so we would, we
3 could take a look at that and see what we can do.

4 HELEN ROSENTHAL: Yeah don't talk to me
5 about it, talk to Mark Levine.

6 THOMAS TARATKO: Okay.

7 HELEN ROSENTHAL: Alright the
8 accessibility?

9 THOMAS TARATKO: Okay so on the
10 accessibility we are very proud of the work that this
11 team has been doing and working with folks around the
12 City and City Hall has been a big advocate for this
13 work. We are currently in the middle of doing what
14 we call Building Accessibility Profiles BAPs, another
15 acronym that you, we will all have to learn but they
16 are detailed surveys of 58 questions done by the
17 Accessibility Team that go in and detail not only all
18 of our accessible assets, classrooms, speciality
19 rooms, science labs, toilets, gymnasiums,
20 auditoriums, whatever it is but it also points out
21 all deficiencies in these buildings and these are
22 more towards the, currently we are surveying all the
23 partially accessibility buildings so what could come
24 out of that is a list of all the things we need to do
25 to meet that, make that more and get a numbered

2 rating from 1 to 10. A one would be partially first
3 floor accessible, a 10 would be fully accessible with
4 everything being accessible.

5 HELEN ROSENTHAL: Okay I'm no, I don't
6 want to eat into my colleagues time. I would love to
7 see that information, the public would love to see
8 the information.

9 THOMAS TARATKO: As the, as the surveys
10 are complete they are posted on line.

11 HELEN ROSENTHAL: Great.

12 THOMAS TARATKO: At the Space Management
13 Website.

14 HELEN ROSENTHAL: Last thing, just to be
15 clear, it does make me nervous when you start the
16 conversation by saying everything is fine and then I
17 point out to a situation where it's not fine. Like
18 in PS163 and the loss of classroom space.

19 THOMAS TARATKO: Uh-huh.

20 HELEN ROSENTHAL: So, I'm, I'm hopeful
21 that your information that you collect at least for
22 you to look at internally makes it clear that
23 everything is not fine and secondly with the
24 accessibility similarly I really hope for your sake
25 that your information that you have is much more

2 detailed. You know the new school that that you
3 pushed along to open very quickly which I am so
4 grateful for, it does have for example a hearing loop
5 in it which is for people who are hard of hearing.
6 It is in the wrong room. It is in the lunchroom.
7 The lunchroom doesn't, there is no, no need for a
8 hearing nor does it help anyone to have a hearing
9 loop in a lunchroom because a hearing loop is
10 something that is used in a room like ours here where
11 you have one person talking on a, with a microphone
12 and you have a loop which would be an area where
13 people are hard of hearing could actually hear what
14 is being said through the microphone. So you missed
15 the boat on the most recent building that went up in
16 my District and I'm just wanting to know that you
17 know that you have somebody who is, who understands
18 the tools that are needed for people with
19 accessibility problems who is double checking all
20 this stuff. Thank you.

21 THOMAS TARATKO: I don't, I don't want to
22 give you the.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: That's the final
24 exchange and then Council Member Cohen has been very
25 patient.

2 THOMAS TARATKO: Okay but we are only 50%
3 in partial and fully accessible buildings, we have a
4 long way to go. I'm just very happy with the
5 movement as an old timer in the Department of Ed, the
6 movement that we have made over the last few years.

7 HELEN ROSENTHAL: So please get back to
8 me with what you are going to do with the loop in the
9 lunchroom at PS191.

10 THOMAS TARATKO: Yes.

11 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Very good. Thank
12 you Council Member Rosenthal. Next Council Member
13 Cohen.

14 ANDREW COHEN: Uhm, thank you Chair and I
15 apologize I've been running in and out but we are
16 having Bronx Delegation Consultations today also.
17 Uhm, I really, but it was important for me to come
18 back because although it is much more fun as a
19 Council Member to beat up an agency, I really have to
20 say very good things about my own experience with
21 SCA. Uhm and there is just a number of examples in
22 my District. Uhm most recently, I PS19 is getting an
23 addition that really seems to be going incredibly
24 fast, expeditious, the impact on the community seems
25 relatively modest and you know that went from

2 discussion to construction and I think you know in
3 incredibly fast amount of time and when I first came
4 into office you know 199 and PS56 that work, I always
5 like to cite as an example. They took the kids out
6 of 56 and moved them into 177 but started populating
7 177 simultaneously. And there was really a risk that
8 if the work at 56 did not get done in a timely
9 fashion there would be no place for the kids in that,
10 and the project was completed as I got into office
11 and it seemed to go very smooth. Uhm, I do have two
12 questions and I am going to lump them together just
13 so that you have time to answer, uhm but one I was
14 watching New York 1 the other day and I saw the Mayor
15 again tout SCA for their ability to execute on
16 Capital Projects and if you could talk a little bit
17 about what is different about SCA versus other
18 agencies and why you think that you are successful
19 and I will offer my, my two cents of criticism and I
20 know that the Chair brought this up, but I do think
21 that there is not enough resources devoted to Real
22 Estate Acquisition. Uhm it has been a challenge in
23 our District. I know that we have worked closely
24 together to try to tackle those challenges but I, I
25 just don't believe that there is enough resources at

2 SCA to that front and I served on Land Use last term
3 and I watched you know Real Estate Developer after
4 Real Estate Developer coming in that they find land
5 to be build housing. We have to you know be able to
6 be aggressive in the market and find land for to uhm
7 to build schools. So if you could talk about the
8 resources for Real Estate Acquisition and the Capital
9 Process I would appreciate it.

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you Council
11 Member. Uhm actually as I said to the Chair earlier,
12 more staff would be wonderful. We would certainly
13 appreciate that. I do think that the staff that we
14 have does an extraordinary job and I am very proud of
15 all of them. Uhm I will say in terms of SCA being
16 successful, a lot of this has to do and I think we
17 have talked about this before the process. Our
18 process is a little bit more streamlined because we
19 are in authority and we were created by the state
20 Legislature back in 1988. Uhm, things like the WICKs
21 law, we are exempt from the WICKs law and those of
22 you who don't know what the WICKs law, really it is
23 breaking up the construction documents in to separate
24 packages from mechanical and architectural and so on
25 so it is bid out in separate entities. In terms of

2 ULURP, we are exempt from ULURP. We have our own
3 public process but it is much, much more streamline
4 so that is one thing. The other thing is, the Design
5 Commission, we do not need to go before the Design
6 Commission to do this although we take input from the
7 local community to see how they feel about a
8 particular design. Uhm let's see, there are, there
9 are a number of things that make it easier for us to
10 conduct business but I will say this, staff at the
11 SCA is extraordinary. That's what makes it work.

12 ANDREW COHEN: Uhm, Ms. Chair would you
13 say that there are probably examples here that maybe
14 have broader application but thank you very much and
15 thank you Mr. Chair.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you very much
17 Council Member Cohen, he is one of the Council
18 Members that work very hard to tour every block of
19 his District to help the SCA find space. He is very
20 dedicated and we thank you for your service Council
21 Member.

22 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uhm next call, we
24 have been joined by Council Member Gibson.

2 VANESSA GIBSON: Thank you so much Chair
3 Treyger and good afternoon. It is good to see you as
4 always, see you and the team at SCA. Uhm first and
5 foremost I have to acknowledge and certainly thank
6 you for the past three years, uhm myself and Council
7 Member Fernando Cabrera have been working extremely
8 hard on the Gerome Neighborhood Plan and I am so
9 grateful last Thursday the City Council unanimously
10 voted on that plan and in it is going to include two
11 brand new schools for school District 9 and school
12 District 10 and certainly I want to commend you. I
13 called you relentlessly because District 9 needs a
14 lot of support, District 10 has a greater challenge
15 with overcrowding but I definitely wanted to say that
16 I appreciate the effort and certainly as we look to
17 the implementation of Gerome we are going to need to
18 meet and talk a lot more so I am looking forward to
19 that because the Bronx as you know has a high
20 concentration of students in temporary housing,
21 students that have IEPs, students with disabilities
22 and immigrant students and if we are going to raise
23 density and achieve more long-term housing for
24 families then we really have to have the seats that
25 go along with it so I know we have an enormous

2 challenge ahead of us in many of the boroughs but
3 certainly on behalf of the Bronx I appreciate the
4 attention and priority that SCA has given so I thank
5 you for that. Uhm I wanted to ask, you know that I
6 served in the State Assembly for four years and one
7 of the projects that I am so passionate about and
8 even to this day, a month ago I had an opportunity to
9 join Montefiore Medical Center and we opened up a
10 brand new school based health facility in District 9
11 and I have a number of them and as you know because
12 of the high concentration of students in temporary
13 housing we really have to use school-based health
14 centers as a critical partner and I do know that
15 there was about almost \$19.5 million that was added
16 to focus on school-based health centers and building
17 that out. And to date there were four projects that
18 we identified about \$9.5 million so I wanted to find
19 out the time line on remaining funds that are left to
20 carry out the full plan and what is the SCA doing to
21 work with our healthcare partners to make sure that
22 we can expand on our school based health centers and
23 our public schools.

24 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes, thank you so much,
25 Council Member and I will say it has been a pleasure

2 working with you on the Gerome issue, we are excited
3 about it and uhm you know for me, for our folks it is
4 job security so we really love to build, so. But uhm
5 as far as the school based health centers are
6 concerned we work very, very closely with Montefiore
7 specifically Dr. Appel who is speaks to me just as
8 much as you did over the Gerome Avenue. You know he
9 is working very hard obviously. Of course, the City,
10 I mean, I, the numbers I am sure my folks can dig up
11 for me as we are talking but I think part of the
12 issues if we have any have to do with uhm finding
13 appropriate providers. In your case, Montefiore has
14 been a good partner, uhm other Districts, other
15 neighborhoods don't often have providers who are able
16 to do this. Uhm let me just look, I want to get you
17 the numbers while I have you. Where are we at?
18 Okay, alright. So we have uhm DOE has 159 school
19 based health centers serving 413 schools. \$72
20 million was allocated in the 2016 Amendments, 12
21 school based health centers were scheduled to open
22 for 2016 to 17, they have all been completed, 9 are
23 open, oftentimes they open after they are completed
24 because they have to go through Department of Health
25 inspections and all of those other things, there may

2 be a tweak or two that has to be done. Four out of
3 the seven school based health centers scheduled to
4 open for 2017 have been completed, four will serve,
5 I'm sorry, alright, students in temporary housing
6 schools X151, 104 in the Bronx, 98 in the Bronx as
7 well as 460 Staten Island. So they are moving, they
8 are all moving along.

9 VANESSA GIBSON: Thank you very much and
10 I look forward to working with you and your team on a
11 number of other Capital Items that my colleagues I'm
12 sure have talked about and I want to thank our Chair
13 for leading his first Budget Hearing. Thank you
14 Chair.

15 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you Council
17 Member Gibson and I just want to note again for the
18 record how hard Council Member Gibson worked with her
19 colleague Council Member Cabrera on the Gerome Avenue
20 Rezoning, I mean it is not every day that you get to
21 announce that you are building new schools and
22 credible investments and parks and we should be
23 looking at Land Use Applications holistically because
24 people live in neighborhoods and you are, you are a
25 champion for your District Council Member Gibson, so

2 congratulations for that. I just want to uhm go back
3 to Accessibility. Uhm, in my previous role in the
4 last term in the Council we will following up on the
5 DOEs Mandated Compliance with regards to making sure
6 that our schools are ADA compliant, particularly
7 those schools that are also used as evacuation
8 centers and sites. I believe that the Court mandated
9 that there were, there should be at least 60, I
10 remember the City asked for an extension to meet the
11 provisions of the mandate, can you give us an update
12 of where we are at with our compliance.

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: On the, Mandated
14 Programs, yeah. Uhm, 124 were mandated to be
15 completed in this Proposed Amendment 80 of the 124
16 have been identified. 60 of the 124 are mandated to
17 be completed by September 2018.

18 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Correct.

19 LORRTAINE GRILLO: Okay, uhm and Division
20 of School Facilities Emergency Management completed
21 30 of these 60 sites as of February 2018. The
22 remaining 30 projects will be completed by September
23 2018.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So the DOE, so you
25 are stating that the City is on track to meet.

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: The 60.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: This deadline?

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: That's correct.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Because just to let
6 you know I, I was not by you but I was told by the
7 Administration at a hearing over a year ago that they
8 were also on track for last year and without telling
9 me I was the Chair of the Recovery Committee they
10 asked the Court for an extension and so are you aware
11 of any plans to ask for an extension this year?

12 LORRAINE GRILLO: No.

13 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So we are on track.

14 LORRAINE GRILLO: We are on track sir.

15 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: To meet. Because
16 this is important for a number of reasons, obviously
17 we want our schools to be ADA compliant, access
18 equity for all but as we have noted that these are
19 also sites that are evacuation sites for the
20 communities in the event of an Emergency and that is
21 an issue that we should be and are taking serious and
22 I would also note that many of these schools are also
23 used as Board of Elections Poll Sites and many Poll
24 Sites were shifted and moved because of ADA concerns
25 which actually impacted thousands and thousands of

2 voters, uhm and so has the SCA been in touch with the
3 DOE about, can you just speak to your communication.

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: With the Board of
6 Elections as well.

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely. They do,
8 we do work closely with the Board of Elections as
9 well, uhm but you are absolutely right about the ADA,
10 uhm required, schools we feel very confident that we
11 are going to meet that. I believe and correct me if
12 I am wrong, that the Board of Elections actually
13 suggests or gives us schools that they would like to
14 see ramps or, or the like in order for ADA
15 compliance. Uhm we don't initiate it, they do.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right.

17 LORRAINE GRILLO: So, yeah, so we, again
18 we work closely with them.

19 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Correct and we,
20 we've heard that the board of elections spends a lot
21 of resources on purchasing, storing, transporting,
22 temporary ramps to make.

23 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yeah.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Poll sites.

25 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yep.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Accessible for all
3 but quite frankly those are temporary fixtures. They
4 are not adequate.

5 LORRAINE GRILLO: Right.

6 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And I think that we
7 have an obligation to make sure that all of our
8 schools are accessible. I have a couple of questions
9 with regards to lead, asbestos and molds in schools.
10 Uhm, what is the, what is the prevalence of lead
11 paint and asbestos in school buildings and does the
12 DOE publicly report this information and if so, how?

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: So we have requirements
14 on an annual basis that we have to meet around lead
15 paint. I'm sure the information is public somewhere
16 on the facility site. We are current and up to date
17 and I'm not sure what percentage of our classrooms or
18 schools have any lead based paint in them but when we
19 test and find any elevations we remediate immediately
20 and we do test on an annual basis, specifically
21 around rooms and buildings that have kindergarten and
22 younger students.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uhm but, is there
24 any type of reporting that the DOE keeps with regards

2 to the presence of lead pain or asbestos in
3 buildings.

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: I'm not familiar with a
5 public report on lead based. We do it for lead and
6 water but I can look into it and come back to you.
7 And in terms of asbestos, there is something called
8 ADHERA report which is done by the Environmental
9 folks at the Division of School Facilities.

10 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And how does the DOE
11 communicate the presence when it does find lead paint
12 or asbestos in the building? How does it, how does
13 it communicate it to the school community?

14 LORRAINE GRILLO: We issue uhm a letter
15 to parents through the school. The same way that we
16 do for our lead and water communications, so if we
17 find any elevations of lead in paint or lead in
18 water, we issue a family letter with the specific
19 information, about what elevation was found, how much
20 it was found, how it will be remediated and we
21 obviously remove students from any of those areas
22 until it is 100% remediated.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And how, is that
24 letter available is it in different languages as
25 well?

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: We issue our letters in
3 the 10 current languages for the DOE so yes.

4 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And how long does
5 that letter go out after the, the presence of lead or
6 asbestos has been identified?

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: So we issue
8 communications to family within 10 school days,
9 usually within 24 to 48 hours.

10 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Okay very good and
11 is there a, how long does it usually take to
12 remediate the presence of the of the lead paint or
13 asbestos.

14 LORRAINE GRILLO: I'm not sure how, how
15 long it takes, I think each situation is, is unique
16 and then I think it can be anywhere from painting
17 over within 72 hours to, to a month if the damage is
18 that extensive.

19 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Okay this will do
20 some more follow up on the reporting side of that. I
21 just want to, I have a question about public
22 announcement systems. Uhm, does the DOE have data of
23 the SCA about how many schools have broken public
24 announcement systems that it is aware of.

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Well, I think, I'm not
3 sure that we have a report that specifically tells
4 you what has broken systems but I will say this, that
5 there are several components to a PA system. So, the
6 main one includes speakers or amplifiers, low voltage
7 wiring or the like. Uhm, we do an annual building
8 condition assessment survey. If we come across a
9 situation, for example, if the amplifier doesn't work
10 but the system is still in, in decent shape, we will
11 immediately report it to Division of School
12 Facilities and they will immediately take care of the
13 problems. Uhm many times simple repair is all you
14 really need. Uhm, obviously we have uhm let's see.

15 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Well I mean I would
16 also just question how the, how the DOE defines a
17 working public announcement system because for
18 example the microphone might be working by the
19 principal's office.

20 LORRAINE GRILLO: Right.

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: But it doesn't mean
22 that every single public announcement box in the
23 classroom is working and it could be working in two
24 classrooms but not working on the third floor if that
25 makes sense but how do we, I mean I have to ask this

2 question but how do we actually define working
3 condition? Is it every P, every single classroom box
4 is working or do you just say if it works in a few
5 classrooms it's working because we have to ask?

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: No obviously, uhm, it
7 means that every classroom should have the PA
8 announcements, it should be able to hear them. Uhm
9 but again, under the Building Condition Assessment
10 Survey when we do this survey once a year, we, we can
11 identify those that have a broken system and we can
12 put them on the list for, to have a major Capital
13 Repair; on the other side of that, if we find just a
14 component that needs to be replaced then we work with
15 our partners at School Facilities to fix it, also
16 again, we could examine that school today and the
17 system is working, it could happen within a week or a
18 month or another year that the system breaks down.
19 Again if it's a serious deficiency in the system SCA
20 will do it, if in fact it is a minor part or
21 component then we give it to our School Facilities
22 but I think it is really information flow that needs
23 to happen. We need to know what the problem is.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And these are
25 flagged as priorities, is that correct?

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Okay and I again I
4 do appreciate that and I just want to know for the
5 record that each time that I raise it with your
6 office your office does get back to me and I do
7 appreciate that. I just wants to make sure that it
8 happens system wide not just with my office. Uhm
9 lastly we will wrap up just to kind of quickly go
10 back to the impact of sort of the inadequate
11 technology piece and then I want to turn to the
12 public as well. We had a very powerful hearing with
13 regards to Community Schools, Renewal Schools. We
14 have heard in Friday's hearing from students who
15 passionately advocate for more Social Workers,
16 Guidance Counselors, more support staff in schools,
17 uhm rather than the precedence and same proposals to,
18 on teachers. Uhm, what I am, uhm, just concerned
19 about in speaking on behalf of kids and educators and
20 Social Workers and all Support Staff is that when
21 they have to do follow up work in a school to meet
22 their needs of the students, they, they testified on
23 the record here as well that they have a hard time
24 logging in, they have a hard time following up. Many
25 of these Social Workers have to follow up with City

2 Agencies and Agency Partners and they have a hard
3 time doing that. I know that Special Educator,
4 Special Education Teachers have to follow up on their
5 C SIS (SP?) System, which again is a computerized
6 system. We have to get this right and I, I just want
7 us to continue to follow up to make sure that we are
8 clearly holding those responsible accountable. Uhm
9 and so I, I just wanted to note that for the record
10 that we will have more follow up on this, it's an
11 issue of resources, let's, let's get that done. We
12 will support you to get, but we also want to make
13 sure it is being spent wisely, appropriately and we
14 are not just going in circles here because you know
15 as I mentioned before, the State of New York and by
16 the way the State of New York is not an angel here.
17 A lot of their short falls in funding City Schools,
18 this has a direct impact on this issue but they will
19 be one day mandating soon computerized testing. The
20 Mayor has an ambitious plan for Computer Science for
21 all. We're not, we're not there, we are not anywhere
22 close to there. Uhm and to provide social support
23 systems in schools we need access to computers, we
24 need access to the internet and this is a problem
25 that this Committee will be continuing to follow up

2 on. And having said that I just want to close by
3 saying I want to thank all of you for your
4 commitment, your responsiveness and I look forward to
5 our work together. Thank you very much.

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Will Paul Kahn
8 (SP?), Maggie Moroff, Rebecca Costachinko (SP?),
9 Jacqueline O'Kinvarne (SP?). Yes just a reminder did
10 everyone fill out the witness slip with the Sargeant
11 of Arms? I guess we will start this way. That's
12 fine, yeah please, sure.

13 MAGGIE MOROFF: Am I on? Oh yeah. Good
14 afternoon thank you for the chance to talk today. I
15 am the, Maggie Moroff.

16 CHIEF MARK TREYGER: Just one second
17 folks if I might ask, if we could just be respectful
18 to our witnesses, so this is a hearing on Education,
19 so just want us to be respectful to those who are
20 speaking. Thank you very much. That time we will
21 get back for you.

22 MAGGIE MOROFF: Thank you, its very
23 tight. I am Maggie Moroff, I am the Special
24 Education Policy Coordinator at Advocates for
25 Children. I also Coordinate the ARISE Coalition. I

2 am here speaking today on behalf of Advocates for
3 Children, specifically about school accessibility.
4 The City lacks a sufficient number of accessible
5 school options, 3 of 32 community School Districts
6 have no fully accessible Elementary Schools, 4 no
7 fully accessible middle schools and 6 no fully
8 accessible high schools, that leaves family with
9 accessibility needs with profoundly limited options
10 requiring students and families to make considerably
11 compromises in their admissions processes. Instead
12 of providing full accessibility, what the DOE does is
13 they place many students in partially accessible
14 schools where the students can get some but not all
15 of the places they need to get to in the building.
16 At some of those partially accessible schools, for
17 example, students who use wheelchairs may have to
18 enter through a separate entrance. At others, they
19 may not have immediate access to science labs, music
20 rooms, libraries. AFC and ARISE have both been
21 speaking with the City about school accessibility and
22 we have definitely seen some improvement. The DAPs
23 that Mr. Taratko spoke about for example. The
24 current Capital Plan provides \$100 million for
25 improving school accessibility and another \$28

2 million to make sure as you mentioned that schools
3 can serve as accessible emergency shelters.
4 Together, however that comes to less than 1% of the
5 Capital Plan and most of that has already been spent.
6 Last year the Council included increased funding for
7 school accessibility in its response to the Mayors
8 Preliminary Budget and we urge you to do so again
9 this year, adding an additional \$125 to the Capital
10 Plan to make another 15-17 schools fully accessible,
11 to improve accessibility of others through minor
12 renovations and to facilities family's requests for
13 accommodations based on individual needs. I handed
14 in written testimony that goes into much, much more
15 detail so I will stop there but I am happy to answer
16 any questions that you might have.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you for your
18 outstanding excellent work. Thank you very much.

19 MAGGIE MOROFF: Thank you.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Sure.

21 PAUL KAHN (SP?): Hi, is the microphone
22 on. Good morning. I'm, I'm education. We advocate
23 for more for more inclusive opportunities throughout
24 the City. I am here, accessibility as Maggie said.
25 The opportunity for kids with physical needs are not,

2 are not equal in this City and to give you more
3 statistics with the high school, there are only 7% of
4 fully accessible high schools in man, in Manhattan
5 that are fully accessible. There are only 11%
6 enrollment and 20% in Queens and the Bronx, it's not
7 fair. These students do not have the same
8 opportunities at their in a City where, in a City
9 that, that strides to tell, opportunities to choice,
10 to choice to chose the schools that they want to go
11 to so that kids can gain specific skills at home.
12 These kids with physical issues do not have choice.
13 They cannot chose based on their interests or their
14 skill set they have to chose based on, where they can
15 go to the bathroom, get in the front door or be able
16 to get throughout the building and unlike most kids
17 who can chose based on interest these kids cannot. I
18 have a full testimony, I give you, I have a full
19 testimony that is written. I'm not going to, we urge
20 to see to allocate more money to the issue and money,
21 money as you can like the the 100, \$100 million in
22 addition to what already is. I'm going to end my
23 testimony with one extremely ironic thought, which is
24 in Brooklyn, the fam, the fam, the family down the
25 road from the high school, the high school and the

2 high school are all completely inaccessible and I
3 think you understand why that's ironic and extremely
4 unfortunate. I will quit, quit while I'm ahead.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I want to thank you
6 and in your, in your prepared testimony you correctly
7 note that one of the high school, the irony that one
8 of the high schools that is not fully accessible is
9 Franklin Delano Roosevelt High School which happens
10 to be in Brooklyn. I know it very well and it is
11 also a school that the City uses as an emergency, an
12 emergency evacuation center for people who have to
13 evacuate in the event of a hurricane or a natural
14 disaster and that is, that is the gravity of this
15 issue.

16 PAUL KAHN: Yeah.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: First and foremost
18 making sure that our school are accessible and
19 equitable for all of our kids but it is also a site
20 in the event of an emergency of many, many vulnerable
21 residents, seniors, people with certain disabilities
22 had difficulty utilizing the site so I.

23 PAUL KAHN: Absolutely.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I cannot thank you
25 enough for your advocacy and your work.

2 PAUL KAHN: Increasing money issue will
3 obviously assist many citizens throughout the City
4 and many issues throughout the City.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you, thank you
6 so much. I appreciate it.

7 PAUL KAHN: Thank you very much.

8 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Next please.

9 JACQUELINE O'KINVARNE: Good morning,
10 thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony
11 today about the upcoming Capital Budget. The New
12 York City Department has 3,066 sites. There are
13 nearly 1800 schools and about 1300 buildings. We
14 have about 1240 schools which are not fully
15 accessible which translates into about 900 buildings
16 that need to be made accessible. At the current rate
17 of 17 schools every 5 years we will reach full
18 accessibility in 262 year, the year 2280. This is
19 appalling. We need full accessibility to be on the
20 horizon of our lives. We need a plan. I am
21 proposing that we increase the Capital Budget for
22 accessibility 10 fold to \$1 billion every 5 years.
23 At that rate, we will achieve full accessibility in
24 26 years, in time for my grandchildren to go to high
25 school. I have seen the difference in accessibility

2 for our son Avi (SP?) first hand this year. The
3 change from the Henry Viscardi School, a segregated
4 special education school located 19 miles from our
5 home in Albertson Long Island to Bard High School
6 Early College, Queens, a competitive high school two
7 miles from our home has been extraordinary. My son
8 is finally getting the challenging education he has
9 been missing for the last nine years. My son has
10 friends who can come over to our house and his
11 commute has gone from one hour each way to 20 minutes
12 each way. This is what he was entitled to all along.
13 It is easy to focus on the Department of Education
14 when we discuss the lack of accessibility but the
15 money needed to achieve compliance comes from our
16 Legislators. We need you to make the allocations
17 that will support full accessibility for my son Avi
18 to get a job, to vote, to participate in his
19 community and one day to bring my grandchildren to
20 school. Thank you.

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you and
22 agreed. This is, we are in this together and I
23 cannot agree with you more. Alright thank you for
24 your advocacy and leadership and there is clearly
25 more work to do and we will be pushing certainly for

2 an increase in this Capital Budget. There are a lot
3 of areas that we have to work on as you heard in
4 today's, uhm, today's hearing. I just want to thank
5 all of you for your great work and there will be some
6 follow up. Oh I'm sorry, I apologize, yes please.

7 REBECCA COSTACHINKO: Uhm my name is...

8 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Make sure the mic is
9 on.

10 REBECCA COSTACHINKO: Oh.

11 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Yes.

12 REBECCA COSTACHINKO: Uhm my name is
13 Rebecca Costachinko, I am the mother of a 13-year-old
14 who is currently a 7th grader in Brooklyn District
15 15, also attended elementary school there, a member
16 of the Coalition. Uhm because my daughter has a
17 physical disability she is in constant violation of
18 her Civil and Human Rights in this City every day in
19 very many ways. But most importantly to me she and
20 other children like her if every race, every
21 religion, every creed from every neighborhood if they
22 have a disability they are subject to a legal and
23 morale segregation in school. When I attend these
24 hearings I am completely overwhelmed as you can tell
25 by the amount of information and injustice I have to

2 convey to you and there is very little time and I
3 wish I could give you the totality of our educational
4 experience in two minutes and I can't do that. Uhm
5 but I want you to know that in, when she is in school
6 no one every knows how to accommodate and include her
7 and that's because well the entirety of her
8 educational experience is a training course for the
9 people who meet her and if I told you it would be one
10 angering and sad story after another but the root
11 cause of them is the same and it's what we are here
12 about and its because there is not money and there
13 are not accessible schools. So 28 years after ADA
14 they don't know kids with disabilities in our system.
15 They are ghosts in the machine. They are in very few
16 schools and when you fight and you get your kids
17 where they need to be the experience continues to be
18 bad because nobody knows us. The, other people here
19 today with their kids I'm sure they have things to
20 talk about that are important. Their kids don't know
21 my kid. They don't know kids like my kid and we are
22 creating an entirely new City of kids who are going
23 to grow up and sit on City Council and not think to
24 include people with disabilities. As you heard the
25 current rate is 2280, 2280, would anybody else be

2 willing to wait 262 years to end segregation for any
3 other population in the City? Substitute another
4 word, say children of color, say children of
5 immigrants, say children of LGBTQ families should no
6 be able to get into their music room, should not be
7 able to walk in the front door, would we think that
8 that was okay. I think that people don't see
9 discrimination against with people with disabilities
10 as a violence but it is continual violence. Every
11 day my daughter is told that she does not belong.
12 Every day every kid with disabilities in the City is
13 told that this school is not for you. This Transit
14 system is not for you. This playground is not for
15 you. This world is not for you and we think we are a
16 progressive city and we think we are woke, many of
17 us, if you are ablest you are not progressive, you
18 are not woke, you are not for civil rights and you
19 are not a freedom fighter. You are a fraud and your
20 Budget speaks and last year we asked for more money,
21 we asked for enough for many generations beyond our
22 children and this City now to finally be free for
23 people with disabilities to give them an education
24 that they can fight for all the other ways they are
25 being violated, for kids who cannot use their bodies

2 to have a brain they can rely on and the Budget said
3 nope you don't deserve more, we are going to give you
4 what we thought you should have. You asked, and we
5 thought we were going to get it and we didn't get it
6 and it is still not enough and we still didn't even
7 get that much. My daughter is going to go to high
8 school, next year she is going to start the
9 application process and I made my list and the top
10 school that I think would best suit her is not
11 accessible. On my initial list of 12 schools, 5 are
12 not accessible, 7 that are left 5 are 2 I don't know
13 yet but it's not promising because there is no
14 information that I found. Yeah, she only had two.

15 JACQUELINE O'KINVARNE: I'm sorry, we
16 only had two schools that were appropriate that my
17 school could apply to. Two.

18 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Well I just, I first
19 of all I cannot thank you enough for taking the time
20 and having the courage to come down here and to open
21 up this way and share this very powerful testimony.
22 My, just so you know, I myself am a former high
23 school teacher and my father is a retired educator
24 that worked with kids with Autism, Down Syndrome in
25 District 75 and let's just say he speaks to me very

2 often about the work that we have to do. A lot of
3 work we have to do with regards to this equity and
4 basic justice and fairness issue for all, all of our
5 children and I cannot agree more and when we speak
6 about segregation in schools I made it a point to
7 actually include this conversation as well. It is
8 not just a racial issue. It is about making sure
9 that you have one school that might have a certain
10 number of kids, a lot of kids with an IEP for example
11 and other school with none. As you pointed out, you
12 have some schools, that are, very few that are fully
13 accessible and many that are not. These are the
14 disparities that we must also address and and I agree
15 and so this is a basic, this is a basic human
16 decency, justice, fairness issue and I cannot thank
17 you all enough for your advocacy and there is more
18 work to do.

19 REBECCA COSTACHINKO: Thank you.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you all so
21 much, I appreciate it. I also want to note that we
22 have been joined by Council Member Mark Gjonaj.

23 MARK GJONAJ: Thank you Chairman and
24 thank you for allowing me to participate and ask a
25 question and just emphasize a concern that I have and

2 many of the the families in our great city have and
3 that comes in around the tale of two students where
4 we have students that enjoy the privileges of being
5 in a main building, brick and mortar building, uhm
6 and being able to go from one point of the building
7 to the other without having to leave the building, so
8 my question and my concern here specifically and I
9 hope that, and I know that you are uhm equally
10 concerned and will be fighting for this, the tale of
11 two students, those who have access to the main
12 building and those that are in these school trailers
13 which in many cases are theft traps and creating a
14 class of a student where you have to put on a coat to
15 have lunch or go to the library or in many cases use
16 a restroom. Whether regardless of the weather and
17 that's from cold to heat to rain to snow. It truly
18 is an injustice and I know that you are concentrating
19 on this as much as I am and I will ask that you will
20 continue to focus and put pressure on this
21 Administration to remove all of those temporary
22 school structures that were, that were put in place
23 sooner than later.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you Member,
25 thank you Council Member Gjonaj I could not agree

2 more. The TCU is not the ideal learning environment
3 and is not a good learning environment for kids and I
4 would just note that in addition to making sure that
5 we move away from them that we also make sure that we
6 are building school extensions or adding more space
7 because we don't want to disrupt the school community
8 but just, if they remove the TCU and they displace
9 that will disrupt the school as well so we should be
10 building more extensions, finding more space to build
11 more schools but we cannot agree with you more that
12 that is no way to learn for our kids. Thank you for
13 your leadership Council Member Gjonaj. Uhm, I'd like
14 to. I think this is the final panel. Uhm, Mia
15 Emanuel, I would like to call up Paul Garity and
16 Christine Dennan.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I guess we will
18 start this way and work our way. Make sure the mic
19 is on.

20 MIA EMANUEL: So good afternoon Chairman
21 Mark Treyger and the other members of the Council of
22 the Committee. Thank you for giving me the
23 opportunity to speak today. My name is Mia Emanuel
24 and I am a 16-year-old student born and raised in
25 Washington Heights and I am a current member of the

2 Girls Scouts Advocacy Committee. So New York is one
3 of the most diverse cities in the United States but
4 unfortunately it is the most segregation. New York
5 has the most segregated schools in the country and
6 ranks 49th in school equity. The disparities in
7 public school funding between schools that teach
8 Black and Latino students and schools that teach
9 mostly White students is institutionalized racism.
10 More funding is provided to higher income schools as
11 opposed to schools with need of improvement. Uhm, in
12 schools of low income 68% of students are in poverty
13 whereas only 6% of students in high income schools
14 are in poverty. The underfunding of predominantly
15 Black and Latino Schools can lead to larger class
16 sizes, less teachers, cuts in classes, tutoring and
17 arts and sports programs. Speaking from personal
18 experience I know that this will affect students in
19 low income communities, uhm especially those that are
20 already behind because of the lack of resources.
21 Currently I feel New York has failed to meet its
22 obligation under the Campaign for Physical Equity
23 Settlement which was made to raise the equity of
24 education in low income schools. My fellow
25 minorities are also tomorrow's future of this City

2 and Country and I am asking the Council Committee on
3 Education to carefully consider the stay of
4 educational equity in New York City and commit to
5 finding ways to close the gap between low income and
6 high income schools in our five boroughs.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So I ask, students
8 on Friday.

9 MIA EMANUEL: Yes.

10 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: A question, I would
11 like to ask you. First of all, excellent job.

12 MIA EMANUEL: Oh thank you.

13 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: That is awesome and
14 it is not courageous, not easy for high school kids
15 to, I remember teaching high school, not easy to get
16 them to raise their hands, let alone to come to a
17 City Council Hearing and testify.

18 MIA EMANUEL: Yeah just sweating just a
19 bit.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: You did an excellent
21 job but the question I have for you is which career
22 are you thinking about after school?

23 MIA EMANUEL: Uhm after school I was
24 thinking about Social Worker.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Oh, that is a timely
3 profession and this is something that we believe
4 strongly in that our, our students our educators need
5 more social workers, guidance counselors in schools.
6 This is the type of support that we need, I think you
7 would agree with that and you are right that the
8 State Governments and the City has to do a lot more
9 to meet the needs, particularly in communities that
10 historically have not seen the type of support which
11 they rightfully deserve, so A+.

12 MIA EMANUEL: Thank you.

13 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I am very proud of
14 you, thank you so much. Next.

15 PAUL GARITY: Thank you Chairman Treyger.
16 My name is Paul Garity, I am a parent at the Fiorello
17 LaGuardia High School of Music and Art and Performing
18 Arts in Manhattan. I am also a Principal of a
19 Theatre Planning Firm, Auerbach Pollock Friedlander
20 having working on Carnegie Hall and the Brooklyn
21 Academy of Music and other projects. I have been
22 representing the school as a pro bono theatre
23 consultant in our dealing with the School
24 Construction Authority. LaGuardia moved to its
25 current location in 1984 but the building, though

2 specially designed for dance, music and visual arts
3 was not designed to accommodate a technical theatre
4 studio which was a flaw the RESOA seeks to address.
5 LaGuardia Arts now has the first and only New York
6 State approved Technical Theatre Career and Technical
7 Education or CTE certificate program. At present,
8 the Technical Theatre students are building and
9 assembling sets on the stages of the concert hall in
10 our two theatres which limits their use for
11 rehearsals and performances. SCA studies found that
12 electrical and mechanical services in the basement
13 where the existent technical theatres studio
14 classrooms are located, don't been current demand and
15 that there is insufficient ventilation to allow for
16 optimum safe use of shop equipment or fine
17 particulates from wood cutting, sanding, metal work
18 and painting are common place. We have a defacto
19 technical theatre shop in rooms that are designed for
20 an average academic class. The RESOA Project will
21 resolve their programming constraints by providing
22 4000 square feet of theatre production space to
23 support the performance curriculum of the school,
24 provide adequate electrical, mechanical, and
25 ventilation and allow for larger scale sets to be

2 moved from the shop to the stage, provide storage
3 space so materials can be reused and repurposed and
4 ensure the primary responsibility of the school to
5 protect the health and the safety of the students and
6 faculty is met. As of March 2017, not including
7 furnishings and equipment and an ADA required
8 elevator, the budget was \$4.2 million growing to
9 today's \$7.1 million. The project has seen
10 reductions in square footage during design and the
11 necessary elevator was finally added by the end of
12 2016. By December 2017, we were told that the Budget
13 had climbed to \$6.79 million and in the three months
14 that followed increased to \$7.1 million or about
15 \$100,000 a month. We are concerned that we will
16 never be able to catch up with fundraising, that the
17 SCA is using some of these funds to pay for unrelated
18 items such as repairs and waterproofing to the roof
19 that would have been taken care of whether or not the
20 shop was built. We have never been given a detailed
21 Budget breakdown beyond a single page summary so it
22 is difficult for us to know where the money is being
23 spent. Thank you Chair Treyger and all the members
24 of the Education Committee.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Sure thank you and
3 we will circle back after I hear from the remainder
4 of the panel. Next please.

5 CHRISTINE DENNAN: Good afternoon Chair
6 Treyger, my name is Christine Dennan, I am also with
7 LaGuardia High School for Performing Arts, uhm I am
8 a, my son graduated from LaGuardia in 2015 in the
9 technical theatre program. I was the PA President
10 and I am currently on the Board of Alumni and Friends
11 of LaGuardia. Uhm, we are here today to testify
12 regarding this RESOA Project, I won't reiterate
13 everything that Paul said but our issue is that we
14 started the fundraising for this four years ago.
15 Four years ago, the original estimate was \$4.2
16 million, we raised the money, the next think you
17 know, it's \$5.2, raised that money, next and so we
18 never break ground and this is a very, very important
19 piece that needs to be added to the school. So with
20 our meeting last month, we have been scrambling as to
21 what to do because this summer we thought we would be
22 breaking ground. Now we are told unless we can raise
23 another \$2 million to make up the shortfall it won't
24 even go out for bid. And as Paul said the price is
25 increasing \$100,000 every month that we sit and so we

2 feel that we just cannot continue going along this
3 path. Uhm, and we have submitted as of last week a
4 request for funds to Speaker Corey Johnson and we are
5 asking him and the other Members of the Council to
6 please negotiate with the SCA on our behalf. Uhm,
7 they need to contribute their funds too we believe.
8 We think part of our problem is that in trying to
9 find a solution that we have 2800 students and 5
10 studios. We have dance, drama, music, technical
11 theatre and art. We produce 40 shows a year. Anyone
12 who has seen a LaGuardia show knows the quality of
13 what, what we do and our needs doesn't fit in the
14 boiler plate assessment plans that the SCA has so we
15 constantly get left out. We do our own funding, we
16 replace our own dance floors, we buy our own tools
17 because we never ever get that money and so part of
18 this is asking for help in negotiating to get that
19 money and to ask the other Council members if they
20 will keep us on the priority list so that this
21 project gets done. As you all saw at the Oscars,
22 Timothy Shallomet said that he wouldn't be where he
23 was without LaGuardia, the world heard him, now you
24 need to hear him and we need to fix this.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Oh I cannot agree
3 more that the impact of the Arts and Theatre in our
4 schools. I am very proud that in school that I
5 taught at the high School in Brooklyn that is the
6 stage where if I first got to know Anthony Ramos who
7 became a big star in Hamilton, very hard to get
8 tickets to. Uhm and I cannot agree more. And just
9 to let you know that the frustrations that some of us
10 have with regards to these RESOA projects its, its,
11 certainly I hear you and I and there will be some
12 follow up work on this just to give you some further
13 context in my District I have John Dewey High School
14 where we worked to secure initially over \$2 million
15 for a culinary arts center and now their project has
16 increased by well over \$3 million and then so I, I
17 hear you and I also know how important this is to the
18 school community and I believe that our council
19 finance staff will be following up with the SCA about
20 this particular project.

21 CHRISTINE DENNAN: Great.

22 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I cannot thank you
23 enough for your advocacy here today.

24 CHRISTINE DENNAN: Thank you very much.

2 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you so much as
3 well and with that our hearing is adjourned.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 26, 2018