

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND  
FRANCHISES

----- X

March 12, 2024  
Start: 11:14 a.m.  
Recess: 3:02 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - COMMITTEE ROOM, 14TH  
FLOOR

B E F O R E: Kevin C. Riley, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu  
David M. Carr  
Kamillah Hanks  
Francisco P. Moya  
Yusef Salaam  
Lynn C. Schulman

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Francisco P. Moya  
Alexa Avilés  
Tiffany Cabán

A P P E A R A N C E S

Ricard Lobel, Sheldon Lobel PC

Michael Bivas, applicant and architect

Noah Bernstein, AKRF, environmental consultant

Kevin Williams, GZA Environmental

Paul Healy, Marvel

Benjamin Rubenstein, Stellar Management

Karen Hernandez, Stellar Management

Barrett Sloan

Michelle de la Uz

Alex Lieber

Yuk-Ling Chin

Carrie Bloss, Executive Director of Heights and Hills

Robert Hon

Vieka Bonilla

Rhoda Ramon Reyes

Hector Vail

Carmen Lopez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Aaron Crawford

Mary Salas

Hunter Walker

Ravi Sharma

Kristina Juzaitis

Andrew St. Laurent

Ira Robbins

Elly Spicer

Amanda Trautmann

Neil Weisbard

Melissa Roman Burch, Chief Operating Office of  
the New York City Economic Development  
Corporation

Ethan Goodman, Fox Rothschild, LLP

Frank Monterisi, Executive Vice President from  
Related Midwest

Jennifer O'Sullivan, Chief Operating Officer of  
the New York City Football Club

Daniel White

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Brad Sims

Bailee Englin

Nelson Jarrin

Oscar Garcia

Patrick Shields

Brian Hunt

Jeanette Abbott

Edith King

Ramon Reyes

Carlos Torres

Mildred Santana

Chris Batres

Jenny Lando

Washington Torres

Sergio Munoz

Chelsea Quito

David Vazquez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jennifer Quezada, founder and CEO of Digital Moda

Xan Cambiero

Jennifer Rodriguez

Ingrid Oscal

Jenny Salinas

Evan Hooks

Sameer Mullick

Jason Osborn

Oswaldo Guzman

Aretha Wareham

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone  
3 check for the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises.  
4 Recorded on the 14th Floor Hearing Room on March 12,  
5 2024, by Nazly Paytuvi.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and  
7 welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for  
8 the Committee on Zoning and Franchises.

9 At this time, we ask that you please  
10 silence all cell phones and electronic devices to  
11 minimize disruption throughout the hearing.

12 If you have testimony you wish to submit  
13 for the record, you may do so via email at  
14 [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov). Once again, that is  
15 [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

16 At any time throughout the hearing, we  
17 ask please do approach the dais.

18 We thank you for your cooperation.

19 Chair, we are ready to begin.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: [GAVEL] All right,  
21 thank you. Good morning, everyone, and welcome to a  
22 meeting of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises.  
23 I am Council Member Riley, Chair of this  
24 Subcommittee. This afternoon I'm joined by Council  
25 Members Moya, Schulman, Carr, and remotely by Council

2 Member Cabán. Today, we are scheduled to hold four  
3 votes and then five hearings so we have a full  
4 agenda.

5 The first vote concerns LU 18 which seeks  
6 to terminate the Restricted Declaration recorded  
7 against the property at 88-08 Justice Avenue.

8 The second vote concerns LUs 24 and 25  
9 involving the expansion of Jennings Hall in Brooklyn.

10 The third vote concerns LU 26 which  
11 consists of the 21-17 37th Avenue Rezoning Proposal.

12 The fourth and final vote concerns LUs 27  
13 and 28 which consists of the East 94th Street  
14 Rezoning Proposal.

15 We're going to switch to the hearings  
16 first before we continue on the votes so I'm going to  
17 pass it over to Committee Counsel.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Thank you,  
19 Chair. I am William Vidal, Counsel to this  
20 Subcommittee.

21 This meeting is being held in hybrid  
22 format. Members of the public who wish to testify may  
23 testify in person or via Zoom.

24 Members of the public wishing to testify  
25 remotely may register by visiting the New York City

2 Council website at [www.council.nyc.gov/landuse](http://www.council.nyc.gov/landuse) to  
3 sign up.

4 For those of you here in Chambers, please  
5 see the Sergeant-at-Arms to prepare and submit a  
6 speaker card. When you do submit your speaker card,  
7 please make sure to indicate the project that you're  
8 speaking about.

9 Members of the public may also view a  
10 livestream broadcast of this meeting at the Council's  
11 website.

12 When you are called to testify before the  
13 Subcommittee, if you are joining us remotely, you  
14 will remain muted until recognized by the Chair or  
15 myself to speak. When you are recognized, your  
16 microphone will be unmuted. Please take a moment to  
17 check your device and confirm that your mic is on  
18 before you begin speaking.

19 We will limit public testimony to two  
20 minutes per witness. If you have additional testimony  
21 you would like the Subcommittee to consider or if you  
22 have written testimony you would like to submit  
23 instead of appearing before the Subcommittee in  
24 person, please e-mail it to  
25 [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov). Please indicate the

2 LU number and/or project name in the subject line of  
3 your e-mail.

4 We request that witnesses joining us  
5 remotely remain in the meeting until excused by the  
6 Chair as Council Members may have questions for you.

7 Chair Riley will now continue with  
8 today's agenda items.

9 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Counsel.  
10 The first two hearings will be about the residential  
11 development at Astoria, Queens. We will then hold a  
12 hearing on the 341 10th Street development proposal  
13 in Park Slope, Brooklyn. The fourth hearing concerns  
14 a proposal for a multifamily residential development  
15 in Gravesend, Brooklyn. The fifth and final hearing  
16 concerns a large mixed-use development in Willets  
17 Point, Queens, involving a new soccer stadium,  
18 affordable housing, and hotel.

19 I will now open up the first public  
20 hearing on pre-considered LUs relating to the 30-11  
21 12th Street Rezoning Proposal in Council Member  
22 Cabán's District in Astoria, Queens. This proposal  
23 seeks a rezoning that would involve the mapping of a  
24 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing to develop a mixed-use  
25 residential development.

2 For anyone wishing to testify on these  
3 items remotely, if you have not already done so, you  
4 must register online, and you may do that now by  
5 visiting the council's website at  
6 council.nyc.gov/landuse.

7 Once again, for anyone with us in person,  
8 please see one of the Sergeants to prepare and submit  
9 a speaker's card.

10 If you prefer to submit a written  
11 testimony, you can always do so by emailing it to  
12 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

13 Council Member Cabán, do you want to give  
14 any remarks regarding this item?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: No, I'm just  
16 prepared for some questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council  
18 Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: We've been joined by  
21 Council Member Hanks and Council Member Avilés.

22 Counsel, can you please call the first  
23 panel for this item?

24

25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Yes, Chair. The  
3 first panel consists of Richard Lobel and Michael  
4 Bivas.

5 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Counsel, please  
6 administer the affirmation.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Please raise  
8 your right hand and state your name for the record.

9 RICHARD LOBEL: Richard Lobel.

10 MICHAEL BIVAS: Michael Bivas.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Mr. Bivas, you  
12 need to turn on your microphone.

13 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the  
14 whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your  
15 testimony before the Subcommittee and in your answers  
16 to all Council Member questions?

17 RICHARD LOBEL: I do.

18 MICHAEL BIVAS: I do.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. For the  
20 viewing public, if you need an accessible version of  
21 this presentation, please send an email request to  
22 [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

23 Now the applicant team may begin.  
24 Panelists, as you begin, please just restate your  
25 name and organization for the record. You may begin.

2 RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you, Chair Riley,  
3 Council Members, Richard Lobel of Sheldon Lobel PC  
4 for the applicant. I'm joined by Michael Bivas, who  
5 is the project applicant as well as architect and, on  
6 the phone, we have Noah Bernstein from AKRF, our  
7 environmental consultant. The rezoning today concerns  
8 30-11 12th Street. Next slide please.

9 By way of a summary, we are seeking two  
10 actions. One is a rezoning to allow for the rezoning  
11 of existing R6B, R5B, and R4-1 zoning districts to  
12 allow for R6A and R6A/C23. This is along 30th Avenue,  
13 between 14th Street and 30th Road, as we will detail  
14 when we show the maps, and the second action, of  
15 course, as with all such rezonings, would be an  
16 amendment to Appendix F to allow for affordability in  
17 the form of Mandatory Inclusionary Housing. We would  
18 seek mapping Options 1 and 2. In addition to the  
19 development site, there are roughly portions or  
20 entirety of additional lots which would be included,  
21 which, again, we will show on the maps located on  
22 Block 515 as well as Block 506. These actions  
23 together would allow for the development of a new  
24 eight-story, roughly 62,000-square-foot mixed  
25 residential and commercial building. The upper floors

2 would have roughly 58,000 square feet of residential  
3 floor area with 80 dwelling units, of which roughly  
4 24, under Option 2, would be permanently affordable.  
5 There would be roughly 4,600 square feet of retail on  
6 the ground floor and 3,200 square feet of retail  
7 storage in the cellar, and the building would contain  
8 41 parking spaces, 30 for residential and 11 for  
9 commercial.

10           The next slide basically just summarizes  
11 where we are in terms of the ULURP timeframe. In  
12 November 2023, Community Board 1, after a full  
13 discussion, voted in favor of the project 24 to 7  
14 finding that R6A density was entirely appropriate on  
15 the site. In November of 2023, the Queens Borough  
16 President also held a public hearing and issued a  
17 conditional approval and, on March 6th, the CPC voted  
18 to approve the application. I'll now just briefly go  
19 over some of the site maps as well as photos, and  
20 then Michael will just detail some of the project  
21 architecture.

22           The next slide is the zoning map which as  
23 you can see in terms of the subject site, currently  
24 it is divided between R6B and R5B districts. There  
25 are a plethora of varied zoning districts in the

1 area. To note though, there is an R6A district  
2 immediately to the northwest of the site, and the  
3 proposed rezoning would allow the lots along this  
4 intersection to join up with that existing R6A to  
5 give an R6A context to the entirety of this area.  
6 There are also, as you can see, commercial overlays  
7 along 30th Avenue, which would also tie in well to  
8 the project site as we would continue the commercial  
9 corridor in front of the development.  
10

11           The next slide is a tax map which shows  
12 in red the development site as well as the adjacent  
13 lots, which would be covered now by a commercial  
14 overlay, again, lending to the commercial character  
15 of 30th Avenue.

16           The next slide is also a tax map, which  
17 shows the terminus of the rezoning area to the west,  
18 Again, allowing for an R6A district on these several  
19 lots to meet up with the R6A district already  
20 existing to the north. We would note that several of  
21 the sites including the ones to the west are already  
22 noncomplying and so would become complying  
23 residential uses pursuant to this rezoning.

24           The next slide is the area map, which  
25 really well demonstrates why this rezoning is

entirely appropriate. Notice again, 30th Avenue in the site in front of the site at 80 feet wide and a wide street as per zoning, easily able to accommodate the additional density between the R6B and the R6A. In addition to which, you can see commercial uses and overlays along 30th Avenue in front of the site. Finally, the 12th Street and 30th Avenue intersection creates somewhat of an extra wide area. Again, the site access is excellent to the site from both 12th Street and 30th Avenue. We also note the transportation options in the area including the Astoria Ferry Terminal, which is roughly within a block and a half to the west of the site.

The next several slides are photographs of both the immediate site as well as the surrounding area. Please page through those. You can see the general development in the area ranging between two to six stories. Again, the proposed building here would be within the context of that development.

I would now hand the presentation over to Michael, who can discuss some architectural aspects and then the entire applicant team is happy to answer questions. Michael.

MICHAEL BIVAS: Yes, starting with the site plan. It's a T-shaped lot of approximately 17,000 square feet. A footprint 50 feet of frontage along 30th Avenue turning down 12th Street for 100 feet and then it's 150 feet of depth behind the adjacent lots. So again, an eight-story building of approximately 62,000 square feet, 80 units. over 40 percent of which are family-sized units. Next slide.

The cellar plan consists of commercial storage and residential back-of-house spaces. The foundation will be wet and dry flood-proofed with no critical mechanicals being located at the cellar. First floor consists of a corner commercial use group 6 of approximately 4,600 square feet, a mid-block residential lobby off 12th Street, an accessory parking garage to both the residential and commercial uses utilizing existing curb cut along 12th Street. The upper six floors, two to eight, consists of all the residential units. Floors two to three, thirteen units, mostly ones and twos. Next slide, four to six, consists of twelve units, some studios, and a mix of ones and twos, and then the upper two floors consist of nine units, and then the last slide, a rooftop

2 residential terrace amenity, which will be landscaped  
3 and include critical mechanicals.

4           You can just forward to the last slide,  
5 which shows the last, that one. Again, just to  
6 summarize, we would have a site here composed of  
7 17,000 square feet of lot area currently vacant and  
8 historically underutilized and home to one- to two-  
9 story manufacturing buildings. Given the residential  
10 uses in the area, it would be entirely appropriate  
11 here to allow for the proposed building and allow for  
12 both ground floor commercial use as well as  
13 residential above, and we hope that the Council will  
14 join with the overwhelming vote of Queens Community  
15 Board 1, the Queens Borough President, and the City  
16 Planning Commission and approve the subject  
17 application. With that, we're happy to answer any  
18 questions.

19           CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much.  
20 Just to go back, is this currently in the flood zone  
21 area?

22           RICHARD LOBEL: I believe it's in the 100-  
23 year flood zone, yes.

24           CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay, can you just go  
25 into depth about how you're going to have

2 sustainability? I know you said that cellar is going  
3 to be flood proof, but can you just go into depth  
4 how?

5           MICHAEL BIVAS: Yeah, so all the critical  
6 mechanicals will be located above the design-flood  
7 elevation at the roof, not in the cellar. There's  
8 potential for resiliency in the form of emergency  
9 backup power. All the flood-proofing measures such as  
10 flood doors and deployable flood barriers will be  
11 provided, as needed, and then we plan to install a  
12 green landscape roof to help with stormwater  
13 mitigation and detention.

14           CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Thank you. Could  
15 you please explain a bit more why you're requesting  
16 the R6A within the C2-3 commercial overlay opposed to  
17 another zoning district?

18           RICHARD LOBEL: Sure, Chair. I think maybe  
19 if you want to put up the area map, if that's  
20 possible, the colored map to better demonstrate. The  
21 existing site conditions are such that there's R6B  
22 and R5 districts within the development site in this  
23 running area. When you have an 80-foot-wide street,  
24 which is a wide street as per zoning, and  
25 particularly one as central to local transportation

2 as this site, the R6A is seen to be an appropriate  
3 site and we've rezoned many parcels within Queens  
4 along wide streets and even streets that were not as  
5 wide as this to R6A districts. That, coupled with the  
6 fact that there is an existing R6A you can see to the  
7 triangular portion to the northwest of the site,  
8 really demonstrates that not only is the R6A already  
9 within the district, but allows for an extension of  
10 that existing context. In addition, importantly, the  
11 prior R6A within the area was not developed during  
12 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing since 2016 so this R6A  
13 would carry with it an inclusionary requirement  
14 allowing for creation, not merely of units, but also  
15 of permanently affordable units, which is why we  
16 think it's entirely appropriate.

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Does the development  
18 company plan to expand the site with acquiring  
19 another adjacent property?

20 MICHAEL BIVAS: No.

21 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: No, okay. What type of  
22 businesses do you intend to target for the proposed  
23 commercial space in the building?

24 MICHAEL BIVAS: We're looking for a local  
25 fresh food grocer.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Council  
3 Member Cabán, I would like to give the floor to you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yes, thank you.  
5 Thank you for the presentation. Obviously, we've met  
6 on this project of a couple of times at this point. A  
7 few questions. None of them should really be a  
8 surprise. The application before the committee  
9 proposes both MIH Option 1 and 2, and so my question  
10 for you is, are you prepared to develop under MIH  
11 Option 1 if the Council modifies the proposal to  
12 remove Option 2 and ensure deeper affordability?

13 RICHARD LOBEL: Council Member, I'll start  
14 and Michael can add if he chooses. Obviously, this  
15 has been a topic of conversation throughout our ULURP  
16 discussions. We were very forthright with Community  
17 Board 1, in allowing us to map both Options with the  
18 understanding in good faith that there's a  
19 significant chance we would choose Option 2, and the  
20 Community Board, knowing that, approved this  
21 application overwhelmingly at CB1. I think that the  
22 discussion in terms of our analysis is looking at the  
23 surrounding area and understanding that Astoria  
24 Houses, being NYCHA housing, has an 80 percent AMI  
25 cap in addition to which other recent rezonings such

1 as Hallet's North were projected under Option 1 and  
2 would create an overage of Option 1 options within  
3 the area, and the idea for the project site, again,  
4 we're merely asking for the opportunity to map option  
5 one and two, but the truth is that if we want to have  
6 an area where there is the full range of  
7 affordability options available including for people  
8 who potentially would not be able to live within  
9 NYCHA housing for being above that 80 percent cap, we  
10 thought that given the modest number of units being  
11 created here in terms of 80 units, with potentially  
12 24 affordable, that it would be appropriate for our  
13 site to allow for Option 2. Again, we're very  
14 cognizant of the Council and the fact that the  
15 Council has a goal of creating affordability and deep  
16 affordability but, here, we looked at the surrounding  
17 area, at the range of options available, and for this  
18 limited application, that's why we felt strongly and  
19 we're asking for Option 2.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I appreciate the  
22 information you're providing around the Community  
23 Board and all those things, but very specifically, my  
24 question is, are you prepared to develop under MIH  
25 Option 1 if we modify the proposal?

2           MICHAEL BIVAS: Yeah, we're prepared, but,  
3 there's a desire to leave both options on the table.  
4 The ownership group did meet with the Astoria Houses  
5 Tenant Association President back in December, Ms.  
6 Vanessa Jones Hall, who supports Option 2. She  
7 expressed the housing demand in the community for  
8 higher earning individuals and families so there is a  
9 desire in the community for Option 2.

10           COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I will tell you  
11 there's certainly a desire in the community for  
12 making sure that projects, whether big or small, are  
13 prioritizing MIH Option 1.

14           The proposed development includes a  
15 relatively large, it's a 41-space parking garage so I  
16 have a few questions pertaining to that but, just to  
17 provide a little bit of context, you mentioned that  
18 the ferry is a couple blocks away, also want to  
19 mention that the 21st Street Express Bus is a couple  
20 of blocks away. That bus obviously goes down to  
21 Queensbridge, where you can catch the F. There's the  
22 Crosstown bus. It's a five-minute bus ride down to  
23 the NW so certainly the transit is not limited to  
24 just the ferry over there that takes you either  
25 further downtown into Brooklyn or across the river

2 into to Manhattan so you have these 41 spaces that  
3 are allocated here. Here are my questions. Are these  
4 parking spaces all required by the proposed zoning,  
5 did you consider applying for a special permit to  
6 remove the parking requirements, and then finally, if  
7 the Administration's City of Yes proposals are  
8 adopted, there would be no residential parking  
9 requirements at this site, and so if that occurs  
10 before you begin development would you consider  
11 reducing the amount of parking?

12 MICHAEL BIVAS: Yeah, there's definitely a  
13 desire to reduce the amount of parking and even  
14 provide no parking, but what we're showing is the  
15 required zoning requirement minimum. The spaces  
16 accessory to the R2 are the minimum amount required  
17 for the remaining market rate units, and the 11  
18 accessories is the minimum for the commercial use. In  
19 terms of special permit application, the desires to  
20 start entitlements this year, construction starting  
21 in 2025 and wrapping up at the end of 2026. Time,  
22 unfortunately, doesn't permit a special permit to  
23 reduce or eliminate parking, even though that would  
24 be the desired development plan from the ownership  
25 group.

2 RICHARD LOBEL: I guess the other factor  
3 that we looked at is also pursuant to the City of Yes  
4 proposals, there, as we've discussed together, there  
5 is a likelihood that there would be parking reduction  
6 at the site given the current state of the  
7 amendments. Although we don't have the final text to  
8 the extent that, that did allow for a waiver of  
9 parking, or elimination of parking, we would be able  
10 to repurpose that space for other accessory uses.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. I want to ask  
12 you a little bit just about the immediately  
13 surrounding area and some of the street curb  
14 infrastructure. The site is at this like really weird  
15 five-way intersection so I want to know if you're  
16 willing to work with DOT to design the Builders  
17 Pavement Plan for the site with as many pedestrian  
18 safety features as possible. Features that could  
19 include, for example, like a bulb out curb extension  
20 at the corner as you see there at the corner of 12th  
21 and 30th.

22 MICHAEL BIVAS: Yes, absolutely. The  
23 development already plans to engage DOT for the BPP  
24 in the design of the streetscape and sidewalk. The  
25 community expressed the desire to help mitigate

2 traffic by creating a loading area off 30th Avenue  
3 because 12th Street is a one-way street so the plan  
4 was to engage and work with DOT on this project.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Great. My final two  
6 questions for you. The Welling Court area, it's  
7 struggled with street maintenance, sanitation issues  
8 so have you considered ways to address the conditions  
9 in the area, and is that something you could follow  
10 up with our office on?

11 MICHAEL BIVAS: Yes, yes, certainly.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: My final question  
13 for you is the Welling Court mural project, which is  
14 just like a really rich point of pride in the Astoria  
15 community. It facilitates street art on a lot of the  
16 building façades in the area, and so would you be  
17 willing to commit to allowing street art murals on a  
18 portion of your development's façade?

19 MICHAEL BIVAS: Yeah, no, we understand  
20 that this particular site and the surrounding context  
21 has been part of the rotating art mural gallery, and  
22 this redevelopment site is intended to incorporate  
23 and maintain the same community involvement.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Great. Thank you.

3 Chair, thank you for the time. Those are my questions  
4 for this project.

5 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council  
6 Member Cabán. There being no other further questions,  
7 this applicant panel is excused.

8 Counsel, are there any members of the  
9 public who wish to testify on 30-11 12th Street  
10 Rezoning Proposal remotely or in person?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: No, Chair, there  
12 is presently no one signed up to testify in person or  
13 online, and we can go ahead with closing this  
14 hearing.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. There being  
16 no members of the public who wish to testify on the  
17 pre-considered LUs relating to 30-11 12th Street  
18 Rezoning Proposal, the public hearing is now closed  
19 and the item is laid over.

20 I will now open the second public hearing  
21 on pre-considered LUs relating to the 23-01 Steinway  
22 Street Rezoning, also in Council Member Cabán's  
23 District, and similarly located in Astoria.

24 The proposal seeks a rezoning that would  
25 involve the mapping of a Mandatory Inclusionary

2 Housing to develop another mixed-use residential  
3 development.

4 For anyone wishing to testify on these  
5 items remotely, if you have not already done so, you  
6 must register online, and you may do that now by  
7 visiting the Council's website at  
8 council.nyc.gov/landuse.

9 Once again, with anyone with us in  
10 person, please see one of the Sergeants to prepare  
11 and submit a speaker's card.

12 If you would prefer to submit written  
13 testimony, you can always do so by emailing it to  
14 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

15 I just want to state for the record we've  
16 been joined remotely by Council Member Salaam.

17 Counsel, can you please call the first  
18 panel for this item?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Yes, Chair, the  
20 first panel consists of Richard Lobel and, excuse me,  
21 gentleman, could you please state your name for the  
22 record?

23 KEVIN WILLIAMS: Kevin Williams.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: And Kevin  
25 Williams. Could you please raise your right hand?

2 Do you swear to tell the truth and  
3 nothing but the truth in your testimony and in  
4 response to Member questions?

5 RICHARD LOBEL: I do.

6 KEVIN WILLIAMS: I do.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. For the  
8 viewing public, if you need an accessible version of  
9 this presentation, please send an email request to  
10 [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

11 Now, the applicant team may begin.  
12 Panelists, as you begin, please just restate your  
13 name and organization for the record. You may begin.

14 RICHARD LOBEL: Chair Riley, Council  
15 Members. Good morning once again. Richard Lobel of  
16 Sheldon Lobel PC for the applicant in the 23-01  
17 Steinway Street Rezoning. I am joined by Kevin  
18 Williams of GZA Environmental. We will be giving a  
19 brief presentation with regards to the land use items  
20 as well as environmental discussion and then we're  
21 happy to take any Council Member questions. The  
22 rezoning before us is 23-01 Steinway Street. Next  
23 slide.

24 This is a rezoning to rezone corners of  
25 four intersections within Queens Community Board 1

1 from existing R5D zoning districts to R6A with a C2-4  
2 commercial overlay so we would basically seek to add  
3 a C2-4 overlay for a depth of 100 by 100 on all four  
4 corners of Steinway Street and 23rd Avenue. This  
5 would facilitate the development here of an  
6 approximately 27,000-square-foot building, 3.6 FAR  
7 with roughly 22 dwelling units and six affordable  
8 units, permanently affordable at Option 1. In line  
9 with that, we were also seeking, as with all such  
10 rezonings, an MIH text amendment to allow for  
11 mandatory affordability to apply to the site.  
12

13           Next slide has the numbers behind the  
14 proposed development. Again, this would be a six-  
15 story building with 27,000 square feet. The base  
16 height would be 65 feet. As a corner lot, we're able  
17 to take advantage of greater lot coverage and reduced  
18 yards in order to reduce the massing of the proposed  
19 building to 65 feet. There would be typical setbacks  
20 in compliance with the R6A. There would be nine  
21 vehicular parking spaces as well as 11 bike parking  
22 spaces for 22 units with six affordable units.

23           The next several slides, including the  
24 next slide, show maps of the area. This is an  
25 existing R5D. There are both commercial overlays

2 along portions of the site, but this would allow for  
3 commercial overlay over the entirety of the  
4 intersection which would conform with the surrounding  
5 character along both Steinway as well as 23rd Avenue.

6           The next slide is the tax map, which  
7 shows with more specificity the area that proposed  
8 rezoning, again, the four corners of this  
9 intersection, and I think the next slide, which is  
10 the area map, really well demonstrates why this is  
11 entirely appropriate. We've got Steinway Street here  
12 at 80 feet, a wide street per zoning, as well as 23rd  
13 Avenue, which is a wide street, so really the  
14 confluence of two wide streets in this area not  
15 entirely common, but definitely allows for the  
16 moderate step-up in density as requested at the site.  
17 In addition, there are prior rezonings within the  
18 area of the site that resulted in R6A and even R7A  
19 within several blocks of the site. Additionally, we  
20 are one block south of Ditmars Street along with 23rd  
21 Avenue are both major corridors within the area. In  
22 addition, the commercial uses that are already along  
23 this intersection will become complying and  
24 conforming with regards to the proposed commercial  
25 overlay. We would note that the existing property

1 right now has a one-story auto body repair shop as  
2 well as a restaurant within that area. The auto body  
3 repair shop is an existing legal use and a non-  
4 conforming use so the rezoning would allow for the  
5 redevelopment of the site with a mixed-use  
6 residential and commercial building, which is far  
7 more consistent with the local character. We are  
8 surrounded by residential properties as well as  
9 commercial uses so this would allow us to do away  
10 with an existing non-conforming auto repair use.

12 The next slide shows with specificity the  
13 zoning change map. Again, taking this existing R5D,  
14 and allowing not only for R6A within the entirety of  
15 the rezoning area, but also for commercial overlays,  
16 as already exists to the west of the site.

17 You can see on the next several slides  
18 there are site maps showing both the ground floor  
19 commercial as well as the auto body on the second  
20 slide to the bottom left and, again, the building  
21 typology in the area existing three- to four-, five-  
22 story buildings within the area of the premises. The  
23 proposed six-story being entirely contextual.

24 The remainder of the slides demonstrate  
25 an illustrative site plan showing the varied heights

2 of the building at six stories as well as a one- and  
3 four-story portion towards the lower density  
4 district, and the remaining slides show the property  
5 in section as well as typical floor layouts allowing  
6 for parking in the lower level and a mix of one- and  
7 two-bedrooms as well as three-bedrooms on the floors  
8 above.

9 With that, the applicant team is happy to  
10 answer any questions.

11 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Richard.

12 This site was rezoned not too long ago in 2010 as an  
13 R5D, which allows 2 FAR and up to four stories. Did  
14 you consider developing as-of-right under the current  
15 RFD district?

16 RICHARD LOBEL: The R5D would indeed allow  
17 for four stories for residential. I think  
18 particularly on this site there were two factors  
19 which really contributed to the request for the R6A.  
20 The first is that you've got an existing auto body  
21 repair shop and the opportunity to both eliminate the  
22 non-conforming use and redevelop is something which  
23 is desirable, but we do have to remediate the site  
24 and remove any environmental contaminants and so the  
25 additional costs which that engendered, really the

2 additional bulk allowed for the R6A would really make  
3 it more feasible.

4           The second thing, of course, is that the  
5 R5D did not create any affordability and,  
6 potentially, the applicant here would be able to take  
7 advantage of tax abatements, which although not  
8 currently existing, may be proposed and would allow  
9 the local area to benefit both in terms of creating  
10 residential units generally and also in terms of  
11 affordability. We would note that Queen's Community  
12 Board 1 is overwhelmingly in favor of this  
13 application, looked at the applicant who is a local  
14 business owner and has been a long-time resident of  
15 the area and really was excited about the prospect of  
16 them remaining in the area and allowing them to  
17 redevelop the site.

18           CHAIRPERSON RILEY: What type of business  
19 do you propose at the commercial level for this  
20 building?

21           RICHARD LOBEL: So the discussion was  
22 around local retail, perhaps a local fresh food store  
23 or eating establishment, something in that nature,  
24 but the square footage involved is relatively low so  
25

2 they did want to do something that would contribute  
3 to the local commercial activity.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Council  
5 Member Cabán.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yes, thank you.  
7 Some of my questions are going to be very, very  
8 similar. Starting with the first, again, the  
9 application being proposed is both MIH option 1 and 2  
10 and, despite the other conversations you have had or  
11 what you've heard from some other folks, my question  
12 is just simply are you prepared to develop under MIH  
13 option 1 if the Council modifies the proposal to  
14 remove option 2 and ensure that deeper affordability?

15 RICHARD LOBEL: Council Member, the  
16 applicant is so prepared.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay, great. Maybe  
18 I misheard this when we last met. I thought the  
19 proposed development that you presented initially  
20 included a six-space parking garage as opposed to the  
21 nine but, either way, the questions are the same that  
22 I asked of the previous project, whether those spaces  
23 are required by the proposed zoning. An additional  
24 question is is this site small enough to waive out of  
25 parking requirements all together? Did you consider

2 applying for that special permit, which I imagine the  
3 thought process would be similar to the last project.  
4 Finally, if the City of Yes proposals are adopted,  
5 those text amendments, there would be no residential  
6 requirements at the site so, if that occurs before  
7 you begin development, would you consider eliminating  
8 the parking altogether?

9 RICHARD LOBEL: Yes, Council Member. It's  
10 my understanding that as currently proposed, the City  
11 of Yes housing opportunity proposal would allow for a  
12 waiver of parking here, and so that is something that  
13 the applicant would definitely consider. There are  
14 Different considerations which apply here. It's  
15 really a very small number of spaces given the size  
16 of the lot, but we would be happy to explore that in  
17 the event that the text is favorably inclined towards  
18 such waiver.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Great. This is my  
20 final question, according to the application, the  
21 development site is, and you spoke about this, it's  
22 currently occupied by the auto repair business, a  
23 restaurant, and two residential units. Are all of  
24 those spaces still occupied, and are the businesses

2 and tenants aware that they're going to have to  
3 relocate for the construction?

4 RICHARD LOBEL: The owner owns and  
5 operates the auto body shop so they are aware. My  
6 understanding is that the restaurant is currently not  
7 tenanted and so that space is available.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: What about those  
9 two residential units?

10 RICHARD LOBEL: Yeah, I think that the  
11 residential tenants were under limited leases, and so  
12 those leases would be up well prior to any proposed  
13 development here. Again, this project would likely  
14 come under a tax abatement application as well so  
15 we've got a long leeway as far as that's concerned,,  
16 but I know that the owner maintains a good  
17 relationship with the tenants and they're aware of  
18 the potential for redevelopment at some point in the  
19 future.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you, and  
21 thank you, Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council  
23 Member Cabán. We've been joined by Council Member  
24 Abreu.

2           There being no other further questions,  
3 this applicant panel is excused.

4           Counsel, are there any members of the  
5 public who wish to testify on 23-01 Steinway Street  
6 Rezoning Proposal remotely or in person?

7           COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: No, Chair, there  
8 is no one signed up remotely or in person to testify  
9 as to this application.

10           CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There being no other  
11 members of the public who wish to testify on pre-  
12 considered LU to the 23-01 Steinway Street Rezoning  
13 Proposal, the public hearing is now closed, and the  
14 item is laid over.

15           I will now open the third public hearing  
16 on pre-considered LUs relating to the 341 10th Street  
17 Rezoning Proposal and Special Permit Proposal located  
18 in Council Member Avilés' District in Park Slope,  
19 Brooklyn. The proposal consists of building two new  
20 residential buildings and rehabilitating an existing  
21 third building. Part of the development site is  
22 located over active subway tracks. This complex  
23 proposal involves multiple actions including the  
24 rezoning and special permit. Today, we are holding a  
25 comprehensive hearing regarding the entirety of their

2 proposal, but an additional public hearing will be  
3 scheduled for the two special permits once they are  
4 formally called up by the City Council for review.

5 For anyone wishing to testify on these  
6 items remotely, if you have not already done so, you  
7 must register online and you may do that now by  
8 visiting the Council's website at  
9 council.nyc.gov/landuse.

10 Once again, for anyone with us in person,  
11 please see one of the Sergeant-at-Arms to prepare and  
12 submit a speaker's card.

13 If you would prefer to submit a written  
14 testimony, you can always do so by emailing it to us  
15 at landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

16 I would now like to give the floor to  
17 Council Member Avilés to give any opening remarks.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you, Chair,  
19 and good afternoon, possibly to everyone. I'm Council  
20 Member Alexa Avilés, and I'm here to discuss 341 10th  
21 Street Project. This application proposes to build,  
22 as the Chair mentioned, two new buildings at 341 10th  
23 Street, a side and park slope with an existing 17-  
24 story building surrounded by a parking lot and an  
25 open structure that spans the F and G subway tracks

1 as they return below ground from the 9th Street  
2 viaduct. As proposed, this project would yield 305  
3 new units, 162 of which would be affordable units,  
4 with 100 being deeply affordable senior housing and  
5 family units proposed to be developed with an HPD  
6 subsidy on the 9th Street side of the site, and a  
7 mixed-income MIH building proposed on the 10th Street  
8 side. The full proposal would also include the  
9 preservation and rehabilitation of an existing  
10 building through an Article 11 tax exemption.  
11

12           With market rate apartment rents well  
13 above 4,000 dollars a month in Park Slope, Park Slope  
14 is a community in desperate need of affordable  
15 housing options. While I greatly appreciate the  
16 proposal of a deeply affordable HPD subsidized  
17 building on 9th Street and the preservation of the  
18 existing building as well as the applicant's ongoing  
19 work to address concerns and the needs of existing  
20 tenants, I continue to be concerned about the  
21 precedent of mapping an MIH workforce option in a  
22 community like Park Slope, where we must maximize  
23 opportunities for families to afford housing. We  
24 should be as a City building more truly affordable  
25 housing in communities like Park Slope that have

2 access to transit, jobs, open space, and so many  
3 other amenities. The applicant, Stellar Management,  
4 is proposing to utilize the MIH workforce option in  
5 the 10th Street building and has proposed that 5  
6 percent of the units be affordable at 70 AMI and 5  
7 percent at 90 AMI and 20 percent at 130 AMI, units  
8 proposed with "affordability" at 130 AMI are priced  
9 almost at market rate, over 4,000 dollars a month for  
10 a two bedroom. 130 AMI, in my opinion, is simply not  
11 affordable, and we want to be sure that all the  
12 options are explored for a viable project, and I  
13 remain concerned about this AMI band that reflects  
14 more of upper middle class rental market of which the  
15 city and Park Slope is completely saturated with. I  
16 believe we must push for deeper affordability to meet  
17 New Yorkers where they actually are without relying  
18 on such an option.

19 I would like to thank the Tenant  
20 Association President, Rose Horton, and the rest of  
21 the Association and tenants of 341, Brooklyn  
22 Community Board 6, the Borough President, City  
23 Planning Commission, Council Member Hanif who I  
24 inherited this project three months ago but has  
25 worked for several years on and my Colleagues on the

2 Zoning Committee and the Council for their thoughtful  
3 evaluation of this proposal. I look forward to  
4 hearing from the development team as we have been  
5 talking and from my constituents at the public  
6 hearing in today's meeting. Thank you so much.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council  
8 Member Avilés.

9 Counsel, can you please call the first  
10 applicant panel?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Yes, Chair. For  
12 a record third appearance straight in a row, no other  
13 than Richard Lobel followed by Paul Healy, Benjamin  
14 Rubenstein, and Karen Hernandez.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Counsel, please  
16 administer the affirmation.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Please raise  
18 your right hand and state your name for the record.

19 RICHARD LOBEL: Richard Lobel of Sheldon  
20 Lobel.

21 PAUL HEALY: Paul Healy of Marvel.

22 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Benjamin Rubenstein,  
23 Stellar Management.

24 KAREN HERNANDEZ: Karen Hernandez, Stellar  
25 Management.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Do you affirm to  
3 tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the  
4 truth in your testimony before this Subcommittee and  
5 in your answers to all Council Member questions?

6 RICHARD LOBEL: I do.

7 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: I do.

8 PAUL HEALY: I do.

9 KAREN HERNANDEZ: I do.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. For the  
11 viewing public, if you need an accessible version of  
12 this presentation, please send an email request to  
13 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

14 Now the applicant team may begin.  
15 Panelists, as you begin, please just restate your  
16 name and organization for the record. You may begin.

17 RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you, Chair. Richard  
18 Lobel of Sheldon Lobel PC for the applicant. Council  
19 Members, Council Member Avilés, good to see everyone  
20 today. We're here today to discuss the 341 10th  
21 Street rezoning and large-scale special permits. I  
22 will be presenting with regards to the zoning and  
23 land use items, Paul will then discuss some of the  
24 architectural aspects of the presentation, Benji will  
25 then discuss some of the site challenges as well as

1 program, and then Karen will discuss some of the  
2 amenities that will now be available to the local  
3 area. Next slide.

4  
5           What are we seeking to do here? There are  
6 four actions that are part of this application. The  
7 first is to change existing R6A zoning districts to  
8 R7-3/C2-4, to change an existing R6A to R73, and an  
9 existing R6B to an R7-3 zoning district. As we go  
10 over the area map, we'll talk about why it's  
11 particularly appropriate on this large site which is  
12 adjacent to multiple transportation options including  
13 on the block itself as well as a street system, which  
14 allows for access by three wide streets on this  
15 block. The second action would be to allow for the  
16 R7-3 district to be mapped within this area of  
17 Community District 6 including an amendment to  
18 Appendix F, which would, of course, require Mandatory  
19 Inclusionary Housing on the site with the options as  
20 was previously discussed by the Council Member. The  
21 third discussion here and the third action would be a  
22 special permit pursuant to 743, which would allow for  
23 the large-scale special permit to alter certain  
24 height and setback requirements. Paul can discuss a  
25 little bit more with regards to his presentation

1 about why it's important on this large site to have  
2 those waivers in order to be able to locate on what  
3 is a very challenging site built over an empty a  
4 tunnel. Finally, there's a special permit with  
5 regards to the reduction of required parking here for  
6 the existing development. The reduction would be from  
7 77 spaces to 39 parking spaces and to waive all  
8 accessory parking spaces for the new market rate  
9 units as would be permitted by the special permit.

11           Next slide is the proposed development.  
12 What would be the sum total in terms of the resulting  
13 development here? We would create two new buildings.  
14 The 9th Street building would be a building with  
15 roughly 76,000 square feet, a 17-story mixed-use  
16 commercial and residential building. This building  
17 would be 100 percent affordable and would provide  
18 approximately 100 dwelling units reserved for seniors  
19 and families. Again, this would cap out with incomes  
20 up to 50 percent adjusted median income and, finally,  
21 the 10th Street building this would be a roughly  
22 168,000-square-foot building at 19 stories with  
23 community facility on the ground floor. This would  
24 provide roughly 205 dwelling units, of which  
25 approximately 62 would be affordable. Again, we have

2 a lot to talk about in terms of the proposed  
3 affordability, which will be on some of the later  
4 slides.

5           The next slide shows the project area.  
6 Just to give context in terms of the surrounding  
7 properties and avenues, we note that 4th Avenue here  
8 and the recent Gowanus rezoning was rezoned to a C4-  
9 4D, including for a portion of our block. C4-4D  
10 currently allows for a floor area ratio greater than  
11 would be permitted under the R8A equivalent up to an  
12 8.5 so there is intended development along 4th Avenue  
13 that would rise to heights and really specifically  
14 bulks much greater than what is allowed at the  
15 existing site. That's why the choice of zoning  
16 district here at an R7-3 works well. Again, we'll  
17 talk about that in terms of the area map, but you can  
18 see just from this picture, this eagle eye view, that  
19 there is development in the area, which creates  
20 context here, not the least of which is an existing  
21 18-story building on our block, which would set the  
22 context for our development.

23           Next slide is the zoning map. Again,  
24 demonstrating the bifurcation of our site between R6A  
25 and R6B districts. One can note again the C4-4D along

2 4th Avenue to the west on our block as well as on a  
3 small sliver of the project site itself as well as  
4 the C4-3A along 5th Avenue here and R6A equivalent.  
5 The site itself, R6A and R6B, although with no  
6 commercial overlay, and the commercial overlay would  
7 allow for commercial uses on the south side of 9th  
8 Street here along the project site as we'll discuss  
9 when we see the area map.

10           The next slide is the tax map which shows  
11 with a little bit more specificity the site itself.  
12 One can see roughly 245 feet of frontage along 9th  
13 Street and roughly a little over 500 feet of frontage  
14 along 10th Street here. A rather large site, which  
15 allows us to apply for the large-scale special  
16 permit.

17           The next slide is the area map which, as  
18 mentioned earlier, really shows why this rezoning  
19 from a land use perspective makes so much sense.  
20 Again, you start with the C4-3A district on the  
21 eastern portion of the block. This allows for R6A at  
22 an FAR with inclusionary or mandatory affordability,  
23 which would have allowed for 3.6 and the C4-4D to the  
24 west, which would allow for an 8.5 as discussed. The  
25 R7-3 here at the site would allow for a moderate FAR

2 of 6, which provides an excellent transition as you  
3 go up the block from 5th Avenue to 4th Avenue. Again,  
4 looking at the street system in the area, 5th Avenue,  
5 a wide street at 80 feet wide, 9th Street, a  
6 commercial corridor here at 110 feet wide, and 4th  
7 Avenue, an extra wide street, at 120 feet wide. This  
8 is a rare opportunity to allow for development on a  
9 site which is currently underutilized, and it's an  
10 appropriate spot to place these additional buildings.  
11 You already have existing context in terms of the 18-  
12 story building. You've got phenomenal transportation  
13 options in the area, two subways existing on the  
14 block, an additional two subways within one block or  
15 three blocks to the east, and bus lines as well so  
16 really it presents a unique opportunity in terms of  
17 what you can bring to a neighborhood on a site which  
18 is underutilized like this.

19 I would now hand the presentation over to  
20 Paul who will discuss historical context as well as  
21 some of the architectural challenges posed by this  
22 difficult site.

23 PAUL HEALY: Thanks Richard. My name is  
24 Paul Healy. I'm with Marvel. We're the architects and  
25 the urban designers for the project.

1                   The first slide highlights the unique  
2 conditions of the project site that were created  
3 after the construction of the Culver Viaduct F and G  
4 subway lines in 1929. The images at the top show the  
5 condition of the site prior to its construction,  
6 which was a full city block with activated streets on  
7 9th and 10th and, at the bottom, after construction,  
8 a large tear in the city fabric with street wall  
9 voids on 9th and 10th. Next slide, please.

11                   The image on the left shows the existing  
12 site divided by the MTA tunnel, which slopes down and  
13 under the existing 18-story building on 10th Street,  
14 which leaves large street voids on both 9th and 10th.  
15 The image on the right shows the two proposed  
16 buildings, restoring the street wall along both  
17 streets, completing the block, and positioning the  
18 taller building elements towards the 4th and 5th  
19 Avenue corridors. The location of both buildings  
20 above the existing MTA tunnel dictates where the main  
21 elevator cores can be located, outside of the MTA  
22 easement lines. Next please.

23                   The Gowanus Neighborhood Plan has rezoned  
24 the 4th Avenue corridor, which now allows a maximum  
25

1 building height of 175 feet, which is just to the  
2 west of the site. Next slide, please.

3  
4 A waiver is proposed for the 10th Street  
5 building to allow structural trusses, which support  
6 the building to be located within the rear yard area,  
7 shown in orange. A waiver is also proposed for  
8 increasing maximum building and base heights and  
9 reduced setback depth, shown in blue. Next, please.

10 A rear yard waiver is also proposed for  
11 the 9th Street building trusses, again in orange, and  
12 for the maximum base height and reduced setback, in  
13 blue. Next, please.

14 A waiver is also proposed to address  
15 existing non-compliance of the MTA cover on the  
16 existing residential building within the required  
17 rear yard area, shown in orange. Next slide, please.

18 The proposed new construction will have a  
19 total floor area of 245,000 square feet, 234,000 of  
20 residential floor area, 6,500 of commercial floor  
21 area, 4,500 of community facility floor area. 305 new  
22 dwelling units are proposed, 162 of which will be  
23 affordable. The 10th Street building will have 205  
24 units. The unit mix will be 20 percent 2 beds, 80  
25 percent 1 beds. The 9th Street building will have 100

2 units. Unit mix will be 50 percent studios, 20  
3 percent 1 beds, 15 percent 2 beds, and 15 percent 3  
4 beds. All unit sizes will meet or exceed HPD and  
5 zoning standards. Next slide, please.

6 This ground floor plan, the existing MTA  
7 tunnel occupies the central portion of the site at  
8 ground floor level. The vertical circulation core is  
9 shown here in orange for the proposed buildings have  
10 to be positioned outside of the existing MTA easement  
11 lines which sets the massing. Next slide, please.

12 There's a large proposed landscaped open  
13 space at second floor level which will be publicly  
14 accessible and accessible from all three buildings,  
15 and an accessible ramp from the street is provided on  
16 the 10th street side at the bottom of the slide.  
17 Next, please.

18 This is a rendering of the second-floor  
19 open space with areas for seating, children's play,  
20 and community gardens. Next, please.

21 This is the existing condition on the 9th  
22 Street side with a large street wall void which is  
23 currently fenced off. Next, please.

24

25

2 This is the proposed building, which  
3 completes the street wall and activates the street  
4 with local retail and residential uses. Next, please.

5 This is the existing condition on the  
6 10th Street side. A large void, again, in the street  
7 wall which is currently fenced off and used for  
8 parking in places. Next, please.

9 The proposed 10th Street building  
10 completes the street wall and mirrors the character  
11 and rhythm of the 10 houses across the street and in  
12 the wider area. Residential and community facility  
13 spaces activate the street at ground floor level.  
14 Next, please.

15 This is a view of all three buildings  
16 looking west from 5th Avenue and 10th Street. Next,  
17 please.

18 A view of the 9th Street building looking  
19 west from 9th Street. Next slide, please.

20 The proposed new construction will employ  
21 a range of sustainable strategies including  
22 stormwater detention tanks and water efficient  
23 plumbing, an all-electric building with high  
24 performance façade, and access to quality public  
25 transport, long-term bike storage, and the

2 aforementioned high-quality open space at second  
3 floor level. Thanks.

4 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Thank you, Paul. We  
5 can go to the next slide.

6 As Paul mentioned and Richard mentioned,  
7 the site is quite challenging to build on, even in  
8 as-of-right conditions, and this kind of peels the  
9 skin off the building to show these large structural  
10 trusses that add both cost and complexity to getting  
11 something built here. Next slide.

12 To achieve our goals of building a lot of  
13 housing on-site and providing meaningful  
14 affordability, we had to take a holistic approach to  
15 the site, looking at all three buildings combined to  
16 be able to do so so we have a mixed income 10th  
17 Street building on the left there, the existing  
18 building which will undergo an Article 11, be fully  
19 income-restricted again, and the 9th Street building  
20 which will be 100 percent affordable for very low-  
21 income seniors and families. Next slide.

22 Where we started four years ago was with  
23 MIH Option 1 mirroring what had been previously  
24 approved in the Gowanus Rezoning. That would have  
25 resulted in 25 percent of the new units, or 76 total

1 units, being affordable but, four years later, three  
2 Council Members and many, many community  
3 conversations with stakeholders like 5th Avenue  
4 Committee, existing residents, Heights and Hills and  
5 so forth, we've come up with a proposal inclusive of  
6 new and existing units on the site, 63 percent of  
7 them will be affordable at a blended 68 percent AMI,  
8 162 of them or half of the new units will be  
9 affordable and an additional 125 preserved. Next  
10 slide, please.

12 We also want to highlight the depth of  
13 affordability, the deeper blue, the deeper the  
14 affordability. Again, having 30 units at that deep  
15 affordability level with our starting point with just  
16 mapping MIH Option 1 to having 179 units being in  
17 that very low-income level. Next slide, please.

18 Again, these three buildings work  
19 together to create, inclusive and extensive, a  
20 comprehensive way of utilizing MIH tools and  
21 affordable housing tools to really exceed what would  
22 otherwise be required with just a simple mapping of  
23 MIH Option 1. With that, I'll pass it over to Karen.  
24 Next slide.

2 KAREN HERNANDEZ: Hi. Karen Hernandez from  
3 Stellar Management. In addition to providing  
4 affordability, what this project does is that it  
5 gives us the opportunity to restore the community and  
6 turn it into a vibrant one. We want... Oh, can you hear  
7 me? All right, should I go? Okay. Karen Hernandez,  
8 Stellar Management. Okay, so in addition to providing  
9 affordability, what this project does is that it  
10 gives us the opportunity to restore the community and  
11 turn it into a vibrant one. We want to put our  
12 residents and the community first, and one of the  
13 ways that we're planning to do that is by creating a  
14 15,000-square-foot shared open green space as well as  
15 new amenities for both our existing residents and the  
16 new residents that they can share and enjoy together.  
17 Our vision here is to connect the residents from all  
18 three buildings together via the shared space in  
19 order to provide a sense of togetherness, belonging  
20 within a true community. Next slide, please.

21 What's really nice about this 15,000-  
22 square-foot space, also being referred to as a park,  
23 is that it's accessible from the street via those  
24 stairs and the ADA ramps, meaning that not only do  
25 our residents get to access this space, also our

1 surrounding neighbors, meaning that now children,  
2 parents, high school students, college students, dog  
3 moms and dads can all come together in this space to  
4 form community connection. We have also partnered up  
5 with Heights and Hills, who is a local non-profit  
6 organization that specifies towards senior  
7 programming, all which will also be held on site, and  
8 I say all that to say that we are very committed to  
9 connecting the community together. Next slide,  
10 please.

12 We hope that that results in a diverse,  
13 multi-generational community in Park Slope. In order  
14 for us to make sure that we're providing that, we had  
15 to identify the items that would best benefit the  
16 community's needs, and I have been working very  
17 closely with the Tenant Association and the existing  
18 residents to identify those items. A couple of those  
19 items, very high level, are improved security, equal  
20 access to amenities and open space, building repairs  
21 and upgrades, all of which are currently being worked  
22 on. To ensure that we provide just that, we have also  
23 been working with the Tenant Association and Fifth  
24 Avenue Community to memorialize those items via a  
25 Tenant Association Agreement and a Community Benefits

2 Agreement that we are excited to say we're close to  
3 finalizing.

4 With that, I conclude the presentation  
5 and thank you very much.

6 RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you, Council  
7 Members. We're happy to answer any questions.

8 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Just give me one  
9 second. If anyone is in here for the Willets Point  
10 Project, which is the majority of the room, we're  
11 going to move you guys into the flow room because we  
12 have over 20 people who want to testify on this  
13 project and they're upstairs right now. All right, so  
14 we want to expedite this and get you guys back in  
15 here so if you're for the Willets Point Project, I'm  
16 just going to ask you to follow the Sergeant to the  
17 flow room, and we'll get you right back in here,  
18 okay. Thank you.

19 We're just gonna take recess for one  
20 second, okay

21 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay, before we go  
22 back into the testimony, I'm going to take a pause so  
23 we could do the votes for today.

24 Starting with today's vote, the first  
25 vote is to approve LU 18, which concerns the

1 termination of a restrictive declaration. The  
2 restrictive declaration at issue is recorded against  
3 88-08 Justice Avenue, which is located in Council  
4 Member Krishnan's District in Elmhurst, Queens. The  
5 termination of the restrictive declaration would  
6 facilitate the inclusion of additional commercial and  
7 community facility uses in a recently constructed 18-  
8 story mixed-use building. Council Member Krishnan is  
9 in support of terminating this restrictive  
10 decoration.

11  
12 The second vote is to approve with  
13 modifications LUs 24 and 25 concerning a proposal  
14 known as the Jennings Hall Expansion. The Residential  
15 Development Proposal, which is located in Council  
16 Member Gutiérrez's District in Williamsburg,  
17 Brooklyn, consists of 218 affordable senior housing  
18 units. The first proposed action involves rezoning a  
19 residential area comprised of multiple zoning  
20 districts to a uniform R7X residential district with  
21 a C2-4 commercial overlay. The second proposed action  
22 is to map a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing over the  
23 rezoning area, which will require the applicant to  
24 include affordable housing in the proposed  
25 development. The modification is to remove MIH Option

2 and add the deep affordability option, which is consistent with the other MIH-mapped areas in this part of the city. However, because the proposed development is for senior housing, MIH will not apply to this particular development. Council Member Gutiérrez supports this proposal as modified.

The third vote is to approve LU 26 concerning the proposal known as the 21-17 37th Avenue Rezoning. The proposal seeks to develop a new seven-story mixed-use light industrial and office building in Council Member Won's District in Ravenswood, Queens. The application consists of a rezoning from an M1-1 manufacturing district to a M1-5 manufacturing district. Council Member Won supports this proposal.

The fourth and last vote is to approve with modifications LUs 27 and 28 concerning a proposal known as the East 94th Street Rezoning. The proposal seeks to develop a mixed-use residential development projected to have approximately 486 units, of which approximately 146 will be affordable in Council Member Menin's District in Yorkville neighborhood of Manhattan. The first proposal action consists of a rezoning from an M1-4 manufacturing

1 district to a C4-6 and C2-8 commercial district. The  
2 second proposal action consists of mapping the  
3 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing over the rezoning  
4 area, which would require the applicant to include  
5 affordable housing in the proposed development. The  
6 modification is to limit the MIH option to Option 2,  
7 which will ensure that 30 percent of the development  
8 are affordable units. Council Member Menin supports  
9 this proposal as modified, and I would like to  
10 recognize Council Member Menin to give her remarks.

11  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Thank you so much,  
13 Chair Riley, and thank you so much for your support.

14 After long conversations and discussions  
15 with the applicant, the East 94th Street Rezoning  
16 will be the first, I want to reiterate the first,  
17 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing project for the Upper  
18 East Side of Manhattan. Since the Subcommittee held  
19 their public hearing, a number of vital and important  
20 agreements have been reached as height and  
21 affordability are generally viewed as mutually  
22 exclusive and a trade-off, but we insisted in our  
23 negotiation on both and were able to deliver the  
24 following.

1           The proposed height of the tower has been  
2 reduced from 484 ft to 414 ft, a decrease of 70 ft or  
3 almost 15 percent. Most importantly, the number of  
4 affordable housing units in the development has been  
5 significantly increased. Originally slated to include  
6 113 affordable units, the revised plan we negotiated  
7 now includes 146 permanently affordable units,  
8 representing a 29 percent increase in the number of  
9 affordable units. In addition, as the Chair  
10 mentioned, the total percentage of units that will be  
11 affordable, has been increased from 25 to 30 percent.  
12 In addition, we negotiated the following terms, a  
13 creation of a community construction task force  
14 composed of Community Board 8, the local Council  
15 Member and local residents. The task force will  
16 assist with suggesting appropriate noise mitigation  
17 techniques, address quality-of-life concerns as well  
18 as suggest appropriate hours of construction. In  
19 addition, there will be efforts to enter into a lease  
20 agreement with a daycare or childcare provider to  
21 occupy and operate such a facility in a portion of  
22 the ground floor of the proposed development.  
23 Moreover, the developer agrees to work with City  
24 agencies to pursue housing vouchers in order to  
25

2 increase affordability within the proposed  
3 development. Also, the developer has an executed  
4 agreement with Local 32BJ with respect to building  
5 service workers in the proposed development and,  
6 should Albany bring back 421A or some type of  
7 equivalent to that, the developer shall use  
8 commercially reasonable efforts to negotiate in good  
9 faith with the New York City District Council of  
10 Carpenters. We all know that New York City is in the  
11 midst of an ongoing affordable housing crisis, and  
12 these negotiated changes represent a significant step  
13 towards achieving a more equitable and sustainable  
14 future for our neighborhood that is in dire need of  
15 affordable housing. By working with the applicant, we  
16 are ensuring that this development aligns with the  
17 priorities of the East Side of Manhattan and  
18 Community Board 8.

19 I want to thank the Chair again for his  
20 leadership and having me speak today, and I want to  
21 urge all of the Members of the Subcommittee to vote  
22 aye on this rezoning. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you Council  
24 Member Menin.

2 Members of the Subcommittee who have  
3 questions or remarks about today's item should use  
4 the raise hand button if you're online or just let me  
5 know here if you have any questions.

6 Counsel, are there any Council Members  
7 with questions or remarks at this time?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: No, Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I now call  
10 for a vote to approve LU 18 relating to the  
11 termination of the restrictive declaration recorded  
12 against the property located at the 88-08 Justice  
13 Avenue, to approve with modifications LUs 24 25  
14 relating to the Jennings Hall Expansion Proposal, to  
15 approve LU 26 relating to the 21-17 37th Avenue  
16 Rezoning Proposal, and to approve with modifications  
17 LUs 27 and 28 relating to the East 94th Street  
18 Rezoning Proposal.

19 Counsel, please call the roll.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Chair Riley.

21 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Council Member  
23 Moya.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.  
25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Council Member  
3 Abreu.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Council Member  
6 Hanks.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: I vote aye on all.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Council Member  
9 Schulman.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Council Member  
12 Carr.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: By a vote of six  
15 in the affirmative, no abstentions, and no negative  
16 vote, these resolutions are recommended to a full  
17 Land Use Committee.

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Counsel.

19 We will now go back to the 341 10th  
20 Street rezoning, and thank you so much for your  
21 patience.

22 I just have three questions. Mr.  
23 Rubenstein, I think you were elaborating to this but  
24 if you could just explain a little bit more. Can you  
25 explain how this proposal evolved over time and why

2 did you decide to shift from originally proposing to  
3 MIH Option 1, building one 100 percent affordable  
4 HPD-sponsored building and one building under the MIH  
5 Workforce Option?

6 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Sure. Thank you for  
7 the question. We started off with MIH Option 1  
8 because we were really drafting off of the Gowanus  
9 neighborhood rezoning, and we knew that an area like  
10 Park Slope really has a need for deep affordable  
11 housing. When we presented this option to key  
12 stakeholders we were tasked to do better, and we then  
13 creatively thought if we could develop one building  
14 as 100 percent affordable building with very deep  
15 affordability, that could then exceed the MIH  
16 requirements. At that time, that 9th Street building  
17 was generating the MIH for the entire site and,  
18 through talks with more stakeholders, Council  
19 Members, HPD, we were then tasked to provide  
20 additional affordability on top of that, and that's  
21 when we introduced the Workforce Housing Option to  
22 the 10th Street building so that the 9th Street  
23 building, which would be 100 percent affordable,  
24 would not generate MIH requirements to the 10th  
25 Street building. It's worth noting that the 9th

2 Street building is 30 percent of the floor area that  
3 is going to be of new built floor area on the site  
4 and that we are giving that floor area to HPD at zero  
5 acquisition cost, and one other thing that was  
6 layered on somewhere in the middle was when we were  
7 speaking with residents and other Council Members,  
8 Council Member Hanif, there was a request to do  
9 something for the existing units as well, and that's  
10 when we approached HPD for an Article 11, and that  
11 Article 11 has evolved from being a method 2 option  
12 where there would be some of the fair market units  
13 would remain fair market to being now method 1 where  
14 every single unit in that building is regulated and  
15 income restricted.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: And that's what you're  
17 using the article 11 for?

18 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Correct.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. That was my  
20 second question so you answered that. Thank you. I  
21 appreciate it.

22 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: We started off from  
23 MIH Option 1, nothing on the existing building to  
24 what we've proposed today and, again, we ask that  
25 it's really viewed collectively as one.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Last question  
3 before I turn it over to Council Member Avilés. Did  
4 you discuss with the MTA the potential for  
5 incorporating a new elevator entrance to the subway  
6 station on the site?

7 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Yes, we did, and  
8 they have submitted a letter saying that there's no  
9 use for an easement on the site to put an elevator.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay.

11 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Although we did  
12 approach them saying that we would more than happy to  
13 provide one.

14 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Thank you.  
15 Council Member Avilés.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so much,  
17 Chair. Okay, let's see. The application proposes a  
18 Workforce Option for the 10th Street Building so  
19 let's focus on that. The Borough President has  
20 approved this application with the condition of  
21 removing the option. Has this suggestion been  
22 considered?

23 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Yes, this has been  
24 considered, but this is not something that would then  
25 facilitate the development of the proposal as planned

2 and as proposed with the 100 percent affordable 9th  
3 Street building.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: What are some of  
5 the driving forces of why you were not able to choose  
6 a different option?

7 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: It's really the  
8 challenges of the site. The site, itself, is so  
9 difficult and so costly to build upon, and we've  
10 shared some of this information with your office that  
11 there's really, you need to have some income there to  
12 then facilitate the building of it, and when we then  
13 give away 30 percent of that building for a fully  
14 affordable HPD building, again it's just the trade-  
15 off there, it's too much and it's something that we  
16 would then not pursue and, frankly, no other  
17 developer would come and pursue either.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Do you know if  
19 this option has ever been used in Brooklyn?

20 RICHARD LOBEL: Sure. We actually were  
21 responsible for an application which mapped this  
22 option on Flushing Avenue in Community Ward 3, and it  
23 was used in accordance with other options as well. At  
24 the time, there was an analysis and I think that on  
25 selected sites it's less about the rezoning and more

2 about the actual opportunity to develop a project and  
3 whether or not it's going to work, and I think,  
4 Council Member, that that here, given the history of  
5 the site, the fact that it's so challenging to build  
6 over the MTA tunnel, we've been involved, as you  
7 know, in hundreds of applications, and we've only  
8 come to the Council for the Workforce Option in, I  
9 believe, two, and this is one of the two  
10 applications, and I think they really need it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Can I ask how long  
12 ago that was?

13 RICHARD LOBEL: Sure. That was after the  
14 creation of the program, so it must have been in  
15 2017. It was termed the Rose Castle Rezoning.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm amazed that  
17 you remember that.

18 RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: According to HPD's  
20 public information, rents at 130 AMI range from  
21 approximately 2,800 for a studio to over 4,100 for a  
22 two bedroom. Have you considered that the  
23 "affordable" rents that would be part of the  
24 Workforce Option are actually very similar to the  
25 market rate rents in the area?

2 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: We're more than  
3 happy to provide some additional market research, but  
4 AKRF has sent us some information that just looking  
5 at a swath of buildings in Park Slope, the average  
6 including new and old for one-bed is above that  
7 threshold for a two-bed. The average between ones and  
8 twos are split 50/50 is 4,600. When you take into  
9 account the new builds in the area, for example, the  
10 Deermar, which is right on the corner of the lot  
11 there at 9th Street and 4th Avenue, the average  
12 between one- and two-bed rents are 5,800, which is  
13 extremely high. Exactly. So we do feel that these 130  
14 AMI rents provide a pretty substantial, almost 30  
15 percent, discount to market and provide folks with  
16 rent protections of being able to stay in that unit  
17 and not have to deal with the fair market forces that  
18 could raise rents as we're seeing all over the city.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Given that these  
20 units will need to be leased through the New York  
21 City HPD housing lottery, which is a very time-  
22 consuming process that has a track record in other  
23 parts of New York City of discouraging moderate-  
24 income renters from applying, how confident are you  
25 that you can fill these units?

2 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: 100 percent  
3 confident. We have done so at a similar size,  
4 differently shaped building in Greenpoint. We're  
5 actually, frankly, we think the market rents are even  
6 lower than Park Slope.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Let's switch a  
8 little bit to the Article 11 Regulatory Agreement.  
9 How does the proposed Article 11 Agreement lock in  
10 rehabilitation and preservation of the existing  
11 building?

12 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: The Article 11 puts  
13 it into a 40-year regulatory agreement that then  
14 income-restricts any new resident that would come  
15 into the building so everyone who's currently living  
16 in the building would remain in their unit. However,  
17 upon vacancy, there would be a process through the  
18 HPD lottery system that would income verify according  
19 to the units and there's a whole detail HPD has where  
20 each unit has specific income limits and rent limits  
21 and be filled over time.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Can you further  
23 describe the scope of the rehabilitation and  
24 renovation proposed for the existing building?

2 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Sure. We have  
3 budgeted millions of dollars for the renovation of  
4 the existing building. This includes, is not limited  
5 to, replacing terrace doors to individual apartments,  
6 fully renovating the existing lobby, providing  
7 additional security cameras, updating the community  
8 room and fully renovating that as well as looking at  
9 building systems and ensuring that everything like  
10 elevators, plumbing, roof is all in tiptop shape and  
11 where repairs need to be made, we will make them.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm sure this next  
13 question is a little bit of an overlap, but feel free  
14 to further expand. Can you describe how Stellar is  
15 further addressing the concerns expressed by the  
16 current rent-stabilized tenants?

17 BENJAMIN RUBENSTEIN: Karen.

18 KAREN HERNANDEZ: I have been working very  
19 closely with the existing residents, not just the  
20 rent-stabilized residents, but everyone around the  
21 building, and what I've really been trying to do is  
22 keep an open line of communication with them so that  
23 they feel comfortable enough to tell us what their  
24 needs are, what they feel is missing, the repairs  
25 that need to be made, improvements that need to be

2 made by Stellar and, since I've been involved in  
3 working with them. I feel like we have done a lot of  
4 things to the building to make the residents happy,  
5 such as providing more security, doing walk-throughs  
6 with the local precinct. In this building  
7 specifically, there's a lot of security concerns so  
8 we're trying to do everything we can to make sure  
9 that our residents feel safe. As it pertains to  
10 building repairs, some of the people are here, we  
11 have great staff, the super is great, and we will  
12 continue working with them to make sure that  
13 everything else that they have asked for is given to  
14 them.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I certainly  
16 appreciate that and, just as a general statement, I  
17 would expect that this is the level of engagement  
18 that management would have on a consistent basis with  
19 their tenants devoid of rezoning applications.

20 Are there any shadow impacts on the  
21 existing buildings shown by the environmental  
22 assessment statement?

23 RICHARD LOBEL: We have Alex Lieber here  
24 who can speak to that from AKRF.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: We just have to swear  
3 in Alex for the record.

4 Alex, can you raise your raise hand,  
5 please?

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Thank you. Can  
7 you please state your name for the record?

8 ALEX LIEBER: Alex Lieber with AKRF.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Do you swear to  
10 tell the whole truth, nothing but the truth in  
11 response to the questions today?

12 ALEX LIEBER: I do.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Thank you.

14 ALEX LIEBER: Sorry, so the question was  
15 about the shadows assessment? Just to explain, I'm  
16 with the applicant team, AKRF. We prepared the  
17 environmental assessment statement for this project  
18 in coordination with the Department of City Planning  
19 as a lead agency, and we followed the guidelines of  
20 the CEQR Technical Manual, which is the requirement  
21 for the environmental review. The shadows assessment  
22 looked for what are considered sensitive resources,  
23 which are defined in the Technical Manual as public  
24 open space and historic resources with sunlight-  
25 sensitive features. The assessment did not find any

2 of those sort of qualifying resources in the study  
3 area that would be hit by new shadows from the  
4 project, and so the conclusion was there was no  
5 significant adverse impact.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Can you define  
7 what significant adverse impact means?

8 ALEX LIEBER: The significant adverse  
9 impact is generally considered when a new shadow  
10 would substantially cover a resource for an extended  
11 period of time and/or would completely eliminate  
12 shadow on that resource and, again, those resources  
13 are public open space where a shadow might just make  
14 it less usable, less attractive or a feature of a  
15 historic resource that depends on sunlight. That's  
16 the standard for a significant adverse impact.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: And the study  
18 looked at all angles of the new development,  
19 including where the existing building is.

20 ALEX LIEBER: Correct. It looked for any  
21 resource that would be potentially affected by new  
22 shadow.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Got it. I think  
24 that's it for my questions, Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council  
3 Member Avilés.

4 Are there any Council Members with for  
5 any questions for this applicant panel?

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: No, Chair.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There being no  
8 questions, this panel is excused.

9 Counsel, are there any members of the  
10 public who wish to testify on 341 10th Street  
11 Proposal remotely or in person?

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Yes, indeed, so  
13 we have two people online wishing to testify followed  
14 by a good 12 to 20 people in person who want to  
15 testify.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Members of the  
17 public will be given two minutes to speak and,  
18 members of the public, we are sticking to two  
19 minutes.

20 You're open to submit your written  
21 testimony to the Council, but we have a very long  
22 agenda, and we have a lot of people upstairs, and we  
23 have a lot of people that want to testify today, so  
24 please, if everyone could stick to their two minutes,  
25

2 and I will be cutting you off at two minutes. Thank  
3 you.

4 All right. Please, do not begin until the  
5 Sergeant-at-Arms has started the clock.

6 Counsel, can we please call the first  
7 panel?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Yes. Before we  
9 start with the first panel, let me explain how we are  
10 going to do this since we have people in-person and  
11 online.

12 We're going to start with a panel that is  
13 in opposition in person. We'll then follow it by a  
14 panel in person here present today in favor and go  
15 back and forth until all people in opposition in  
16 person have spoken. We will then switch to the online  
17 testimony and then we will go back to in-person  
18 testimony. I hope that was clear.

19 Starting with the first panel, in person,  
20 in opposition, it consists of, and please excuse me  
21 if I mispronounce your name, Andrew Steldent  
22 (phonetic).

23 ANDREW ST. LAURENT: St. Laurent.  
24  
25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Oh, St. Laurent,  
3 completely missed that one, Kristina Juzaitis, and  
4 Ravi Sharma.

5 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much.  
6 We're going to begin with Mr. Andrew St. Laurent.  
7 Thank you.

8 ANDREW ST. LAURENT: Okay. All right. Good  
9 afternoon. Chair Riley, Subcommittee, Council Member  
10 Avilés, thank you for having us today. I also want to  
11 thank the Sergeant-at-Arms and the Subcommittee Staff  
12 who worked very hard to manage the very large turnout  
13 in connection with this project.

14 I'm just going to confine my remarks to  
15 the difficulties of the site regarding the MTA and  
16 the tunnel that the site would be built over. As the  
17 Chair noted at the beginning of today's meeting, this  
18 is an active subway platform containing the F and the  
19 G train lines that service Brooklyn, Manhattan, and  
20 Queens. The applicant noted the challenges. They  
21 noted that this was a difficult site a number of  
22 times. They talked about having to site the elevator  
23 cores over the streetscape in order to avoid  
24 interfering with the active subway lines. They noted  
25 the positive aspects of the access to the subway that

2 this building would offer. What they did not comment  
3 on, or which I have not heard about, is the need to  
4 move thousands of tons of material and equipment over  
5 this active subway line over the process of  
6 construction. The applicant said during the Community  
7 Board 6 meeting that this would be done by crane. I  
8 have some skepticism about that but, regardless of  
9 the manner in which that material is intended to be  
10 moved, there can be no question but that this is  
11 going to disrupt F and G traffic south of (INAUDIBLE)  
12 9th Street during the course of this construction  
13 project, which I understand will take years, and I  
14 think that is an impact that either this  
15 Subcommittee, this Committee, or the City Council  
16 Committee on Transportation should consider in  
17 deciding whether or not to go forward with this  
18 application. Thank you very much. That is my time.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Kristina.

20 KRISTINA JUZAITIS: Yes. Thank you for  
21 letting me speak. I'm not a professional speaker. I'm  
22 a visual artist so I brought some visual aids. First  
23 of all, a lot of the schematics show these beautiful  
24 renderings. The truth of the matter is that 9th  
25 Street is wide, 4th Avenue is wide, 5th Avenue is

1 wide. This is 10th Street. This is looking up from  
2 4th Avenue. You can't fit two cars, and it's not a  
3 two-lane road. It's a tiny street, and I think  
4 there's barely enough room for an Amazon van or a  
5 delivery truck to get through. I don't understand  
6 what's going to happen during construction but, even  
7 with 300 additional units, it seems an impossible  
8 burden for 10th Street to get that kind of capacity.  
9 While Stellar was submitting their application, I've  
10 been living on 10th Street for 15 years. I'm a  
11 homeowner there. I've been documenting and time-  
12 stamping my iPhone photos. This photograph was taken  
13 on October 13, 2023. Six-foot high garbage dump. You  
14 can see by the car and the scale in front of their  
15 existing building. That stayed there. By the way,  
16 they don't pick up garbage until Mondays. It was  
17 picked up on Monday, three days later. This is  
18 chronic, and I'll submit an email with a lot more  
19 photographs to you to consider what this does to our  
20 neighborhood. We've been complaining about it for 15  
21 years and talking about the vermin and the stacks of  
22 rats that appear on the road and it's been terrible  
23 and, if this is the reputation, I hope that you'll  
24 consider thinking about this and making sure that  
25

2 there's a real binding agreement for responsibility  
3 to the Park Slope neighborhood. We're not Gowanus. We  
4 don't have huge lots. Anyway, I'm finished. Thank  
5 you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I was really enjoying  
7 your presentation though. You had me into it. I was  
8 really into it.

9 RAVI SHARMA: Is this one on?

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yeah, go ahead, Ravi.

11 RAVI SHARMA: Good morning, Chair Riley  
12 and Members of the Subcommittee. My name is Ravi  
13 Sharma, and I'm a 9th Street resident for over a  
14 decade. I strongly oppose the 341 10th Street  
15 rezoning and LSGD special permits applications by  
16 Stellar Management. I urge you to deny these  
17 applications for the following reasons. The  
18 applications represent unprecedented zoning changes,  
19 previously only considered for large-scale projects  
20 on condemned railway and surrounding business  
21 property in Hudson Yards, Manhattan. The applications  
22 represent as close to spot zoning as allows,  
23 overriding well-established zoning regulations  
24 without specifying Stellar's exact plans for the  
25 location. The applications would negatively impact

1 the surrounding historic district, allowing Stellar  
2 to construct an 18-story building towering over  
3 dozens of families, many mere feet away, creating  
4 noise, pollution, congestion, and unreasonable safety  
5 hazards. The applications do not actually address the  
6 need for affordable housing. Stellar has a poor  
7 record of maintaining affordable units at 341 10th  
8 Street, and their details on the number and duration  
9 of affordable units expose a solely profit-driven  
10 plan. Their proposal indicates that only 20 percent  
11 of the units would be affordable, but considering the  
12 suspiciously large amount of proposed studio and one-  
13 bedroom apartments on 9th Street reveals the  
14 affordable units would consist mainly of studio and  
15 one-bedroom apartments, which is contrary to the  
16 policy of creating affordable housing for families  
17 that need larger apartments. At the Brooklyn Borough  
18 President's Meeting, Stellar's representatives  
19 testified that they had not determined how they would  
20 construct a building over the subway station and  
21 residential homes. The lack of planning suggests that  
22 they may be seeking to flip the property for profit  
23 after obtaining a zoning change. The City should not  
24 assist naked profit-based initiatives, but only  
25

2 approve a real plan that can be achieved. While some  
3 building on 9th Street as opposed to the residential  
4 10th Street may make sense, if the City believes that  
5 a zoning change is necessary, it should take a page  
6 from Hudson Yards and solicit bids from the best  
7 developer for the job and take the property away from  
8 its current owner since it's, since it is  
9 demonstrably not up for the job. The Community  
10 Benefit Agreement must not be left to 5th Avenue  
11 Committee, which represents business interests, and  
12 no one here is from the neighborhood for 5th Avenue  
13 Committee, and they do not represent residential  
14 needs of the effective residents or the greater  
15 neighborhood. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Ravi.

17 Do we have any questions for this  
18 applicant panel?

19 No questions. Thank you so much for  
20 testifying here today.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: The next  
22 applicant panel will be called by the Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: All right. The next  
24 applicant panel will be, excuse me if I butcher your  
25

2 name, Alex Lieber, Barrett Sloan, and Michelle de la  
3 Uz.

4 MICHELLE DE LA UZ: De la Uz.

5 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: De la Uz. I'm sorry.

6 Hey, Alex. We'll start with you, Alex.

7 ALEX LIEBER: I introduced myself earlier.  
8 I'm Alex Lieber. I'm with AKRF and on the applicant  
9 team, and I just registered to testify in case there  
10 are any other questions. I already addressed one  
11 during the presentation.

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. We'll come to  
13 you after that. We'll go next to Barrett Sloan.

14 BARRETT SLOAN: Yes. I'm a resident there  
15 for 15 years at 341 10th Street. I was able to raise  
16 a son, get a good education. He has all the means for  
17 the sports and parks that he ever needed, and I'm all  
18 for the building of these new buildings to bring in  
19 more families and make the neighborhood a lot nicer  
20 than just a bunch of parking lots on a block. Thank  
21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. And next,  
23 Michelle.

24 MICHELLE DE LA UZ: Hi. Michelle de la  
25 Luz, Executive Director of the 5th Avenue Committee

1 and, folks, I know many people know the 5th Avenue  
2 Committee, but we've been around for 46 years and our  
3 mission is to advance economic, social, and racial  
4 justice. One of the ways we do that is to build and  
5 manage affordable housing and organize folks, and  
6 we've been involved in a number of land use actions  
7 helping to negotiate the community benefits  
8 agreement. I just wanted to update the Committee and,  
9 of course, thank the Chair and Counsel Member Avilés  
10 and other Members of the Committee, about where  
11 things stand with the Community Benefits Agreement  
12 discussion because that's something that's been  
13 referenced in every step of the process so far in  
14 ULURP, and I just want to say that there's good faith  
15 on both sides, both among the Tenants Association  
16 leadership, and among Stellar, many of the things  
17 that were mentioned in the Stellar presentation, I  
18 think that certainly this applicant team is committed  
19 to addressing a number of concerns of the existing  
20 tenants, and I know many people are here today to  
21 share their own experiences. I think this is an  
22 unprecedented opportunity to preserve existing  
23 affordable housing, and the fact that we're going to  
24 be re-regulating 38 units, which are currently market  
25

2 rate in the existing building in addition to building  
3 100 percent affordable housing in Park Slope is very,  
4 very significant. I know that the Council Member and  
5 in general the Council have some concerns about  
6 mapping the Workforce Option. I too honestly would  
7 have concerns about that if it were that building  
8 alone. I think the reason why I personally have  
9 become more comfortable with it is the fact that  
10 we're preserving existing affordable housing, adding  
11 another 100 units of deeply and permanently  
12 affordable housing, and this is a very difficult and  
13 unique site because of the MTA. I think it's really  
14 because of the uniqueness, and I'll be happy to  
15 answer any questions that anybody has.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I actually  
17 do have some questions. Alex, does Stellar currently  
18 own one of these buildings or they just manage one of  
19 these buildings?

20 ALEX LIEBER: (INAUDIBLE)

21 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: They own and manage  
22 one of these buildings? So the concern from the  
23 previous applicant was talking about a lot of the  
24 quality-of-life issues over there. Are you prepared  
25

2 to address those issues with the new building that  
3 you're proposing if you are permitted to build there?

4 ALEX LIEBER: I should clarify that I'm  
5 not with Stellar, I'm not with the applicant, I'm on  
6 the applicant team.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: You said you was  
8 coming so I could ask you questions, so that's why  
9 I'm asking you some questions.

10 ALEX LIEBER: I can only speak to the  
11 environmental review aspects of the project. That's  
12 what we prepared, the environmental assessment  
13 statement.

14 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Can you go into that a  
15 little bit more?

16 ALEX LIEBER: Sure. So the environmental  
17 assessment statement followed all the requirements of  
18 CEQR, and it was done in consultation with the  
19 Department of City Planning, they're the lead agency,  
20 and so we did a number of detailed analyses, what was  
21 required as we exceed the CEQR technical manual's  
22 thresholds so we looked at it from historic resources  
23 perspective, land use perspective, urban design  
24 perspective, a detailed pedestrian circulation  
25 analysis. The conclusion of all those analyses is

2 that we did not have any significant adverse impacts  
3 according to the CEQR guidelines.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. There's  
5 something wrong with those guidelines because there's  
6 obviously people there that are complaining about  
7 some issues so I just wanted to state that for the  
8 record, if you guys can address that, I know that you  
9 testified already, but there's obviously some issues  
10 over there still. I have no more questions.

11 Council Member Avilés, do you have any  
12 questions?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: No, I think I'm  
14 good.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: All right. Thank you.  
16 This applicant panel is excused.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: We will now move  
18 to our third in-person panel in opposition.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I will be calling on  
20 Ira Robbins, Amanda Trautmann, and Ellie Spicer.

21 We will begin with Ellie Spicer.

22 ELLIE SPICER: Good afternoon and thank  
23 you for having us. I have recently written to Council  
24 Member Avilés, and so some of these sentiments are  
25 repeated here. I live on 10th Street across from the

2 proposed development at 341 10th Street, owned and  
3 managed by Stellar. Ah, yes, I'm the terrible  
4 homeowner. I have lived there for 35 years, raised my  
5 two sons, going to local schools. I watched 341 leave  
6 the Mitchell-Lama program. I watched them change the  
7 constituents of their buildings. The neighborhood  
8 began to change. We were hard-working folks, making a  
9 living and sharing the community, and that building  
10 was very important since it was so large and, when it  
11 went out of the Mitchell-Lama project, they wanted  
12 high-income clientele. They pushed folks out. They  
13 left the park, which is part of their property, which  
14 they're now touting, to completely disintegrate. They  
15 did not keep promises to their current tenants who  
16 they are continuing to bamboozle into supporting this  
17 upscale project. I want to see greater affordability.  
18 Now you fell over when you saw what the rents were,  
19 but those aren't rents that hard-working New Yorkers.  
20 I worked for the carpenters union for 30 years. I  
21 couldn't have paid those rents, and I had a union  
22 income with benefits. Thankfully, I do have a  
23 retirement income and a pension, so I have that, but  
24 we need real affordability, and I'm asking the  
25 Council to stand up. I know they say they have one

2 building that's 100 percent affordable. That's senior  
3 supportive housing. The other thing about this  
4 organization is everything has to be nailed down with  
5 an agreement. They don't keep their word. That's been  
6 proven for 35 years. They built their portfolio  
7 taking buildings out of affordable housing, Mitchell-  
8 Lama projects, and making money from them. It's gotta  
9 stop.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we're  
11 going to have Ira Robbins.

12 IRA ROBBINS: Thank you. My name is Ira  
13 Robbins. I'm a retired senior citizen who has lived  
14 on 10th Street for nearly 15 years facing the  
15 proposed building. 10th Street is not prepared for  
16 the addition of 200 new units in terms of the water  
17 supply, the sewer capacity, the electric grid, or  
18 traffic nor is it prepared in terms of garbage. The  
19 building that Stellar has at 341 has 154 units. They  
20 leave garbage on the street twice a week in large  
21 piles of construction bags. If they add 200 units to  
22 the block, that's going to increase the amount of  
23 garbage by 130 percent. Where is that going to go? It  
24 blocks the fire hydrant right there, and it's a very  
25 frightening prospect to have more garbage piled on

2 the street facing my house and my neighbor's houses.

3 I also want to talk about parking spaces. I'm not a

4 car owner, so I don't care one way or the other about

5 this, but in terms of logic and common sense, they

6 want to reduce the number of parking spaces from 115

7 to 39 while adding 305 apartments. Now, they're

8 claiming that's within regulations, which is fine,

9 but it doesn't speak to what happens when the 305 new

10 tenants come in with 100 new cars. That's going to be

11 a problem, and I did a little research, I took a

12 Google Earth picture of the parking lots that 341

13 currently has, and my guess is that there's about 60

14 spaces occupied there, and there's also an

15 underground garage that they have in the building,

16 which let's just guess, they have 20 cars parked

17 there so that's 80 cars that have to be parked

18 somewhere, and they're going to reduce those spots to

19 under 40, which is a real problem. I don't know where

20 they think they're going to put these cars. The

21 rezoning requests before you are bizarre and aberrant

22 and should not be allowed. As I understand it, zoning

23 regulations exist to ensure rationality and

24 consistency to development in the city. Stellar is

25 asking you to make an extreme set of exceptions for

2 them to throw up logic and long-held practice out the  
3 window solely for their benefit to build in a space  
4 that really doesn't exist. How will that serve our  
5 city? Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Last,  
7 Amanda Trautmann.

8 AMANDA TRAUTMANN: Hi, I'm Amanda  
9 Trautmann. First, I want to thank Councilwoman  
10 Avilés, who in your short time in office have already  
11 brought stronger accountability and those great  
12 questions. I just want to highlight they squirmed out  
13 of every single one, and there's nothing documented  
14 to commit them to actually addressing any of your  
15 very important points. We own one of the townhouses  
16 on 9th Street, but we also have a tenant who's 82  
17 years old and pays 500 a month for a one bedroom.  
18 There are 14 buildings full of multi-families with  
19 kids and doctors on the block that are not mentioned  
20 enough in terms of the impact. We depend on you to  
21 protect us. I have a packet in front of you that  
22 demonstrates just the tip of the iceberg of the major  
23 safety hazards caused by Stellar over its long  
24 career, horrible career in New York City, publicly  
25 documented negligence, irresponsible management, and

1 cutting corners that has led to countless ongoing  
2 safety issues in buildings they run and even a  
3 construction-related death in a wall collapse at a  
4 Stellar site in Chinatown a year ago. The DOB had  
5 issued five safety violations that were not addressed  
6 in time to save that man's life. Stellar's rating on  
7 the Better Business Bureau site is D-minus. I  
8 encourage you to look at some of the reviews. We are  
9 for building more affordable housing. My husband and  
10 I both work for a non-profit that mentors youth. We  
11 want new folks into Brooklyn, but we want them taken  
12 care of not by this bad actor. I want to finish by a  
13 quote from someone in a Stellar building on the  
14 Better Business Bureau site, "run fast in the other  
15 direction from this company. I have never dealt with  
16 such incompetent management. The building I live in  
17 has so many issues. It seems they manage their other  
18 buildings the same way. Bad plumbing. We can't even  
19 flush paper in our toilets. No hot water. They often  
20 cut the water without warning us. bed bug  
21 infestation. They lose my rent checks and then charge  
22 me late fees for not sending the money. I would give  
23 this company a negative 10 rating if possible. I  
24

2 would definitely not rent again if the company in  
3 charge is Stellar." Thank you so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Do any Council Members  
5 have any questions for this applicant panel?

6 You are now excused. Thank you so much  
7 for your testimony.

8 Now we're going to switch to online. I'm  
9 going to call on Hunter Walker, Carrie Bloss, and  
10 Robert Hon.

11 We can begin with Hunter Walker. If you  
12 can hear me, Hunter, you may begin.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

14 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Hunter Walker, if you  
15 can hear me, you may begin.

16 HUNTER WALKER: Yes, can you hear me?

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you,  
18 Hunter.

19 HUNTER WALKER: Excellent. To the esteemed  
20 Members of the Subcommittee. My name is Hunter  
21 Walker. I'm a lifelong Brooklynite who grew up on  
22 10th Street starting in the '80s and lives there  
23 today. I've come before you to urge you to reject  
24 Stellar Management's application for a zoning  
25 variance on my block. There are so many reasons to

1 say no to Stellar, and they've made so many false  
2 statements, two minutes barely covers it. I'm going  
3 to do my best. Our city is in the midst of an  
4 affordable housing crisis. Stellar has been a major  
5 enemy of affordable housing. Deleted versions of the  
6 company's website boast about the fact that Stellar  
7 "built its track record on repositioning of middle-  
8 income housing." How has that repositioning of  
9 affordable housing played out? In 2019, a housing  
10 court judge found that Stellar falsely inflated  
11 renovation costs to overcharge tenants and  
12 destabilize affordable units. That business model has  
13 involved turning former Mitchell-Lama buildings into  
14 high-priced rentals. That includes 341 10th Street.  
15 Those rents you were all so shocked to see are being  
16 charged by Stellar right now. This business model has  
17 pushed out many friends and neighbors I grew up with.  
18 As they've sought a variance to build two new towers  
19 next to that building, Stellar created a website,  
20 341tenth.com, that purports to dispel "myths" about  
21 this project. In reality, the site is filled with the  
22 kind of false claims that Stellar is known for. I was  
23 gratified Councilwoman Avilés raised questions about  
24 the levels of affordability, but I have questions  
25

2 about the more basic math here. Stellar's site claims  
3 "60 percent of all units on the property will be  
4 affordable." It variously promises both 162 and 277  
5 affordable apartments of which "64 to 90." Oh, the  
6 assessment they actually filed says it's just 64 to  
7 96. The math is simple. 64 to 96 out of 319 is about  
8 20 to 30 percent. Part of the reason that we don't  
9 know how affordable this will actually be is that  
10 Stellar admits in their own writing that they have  
11 not submitted a final plan here. We need a final plan  
12 with guaranteed affordability because this company  
13 has always done what they can to sneak out of  
14 affordable housing requirements. I also just want to  
15 point out that, and I'm going to send this in  
16 writing.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you so much. Your  
18 time has expired.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: You can finish up. Go  
20 ahead, Hunter.

21 HUNTER WALKER: Okay, perfect. They've  
22 highlighted the poor conditions at the site as a  
23 reason for having this new development. They've  
24 described "uninviting walls and underutilized space."  
25 I am, A), upset to see my block disparaged like that

2 but, B), I'm upset that Stellar is claiming that  
3 their own mismanagement is what needs improvement. As  
4 some folks have pointed out this "new park" that  
5 they're going to build...

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: If you can start  
7 wrapping up, Hunter?

8 HUNTER WALKER: That they actually locked  
9 away from the residents and, as the Councilwoman  
10 said, Stellar should have been treating their tenants  
11 well from the beginning. On that note, I just want to  
12 say, it's clear that 5th Avenue Committee is their  
13 preferred partner for a community benefits agreement.  
14 The leadership of 5th Avenue Committee was here today  
15 with Stellar, they've backed this proposal from day  
16 one. This is an organization with millions in  
17 corporate funds...

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Hunter.  
19 Thank you.

20 HUNTER WALKER: Okay, because I have text  
21 from an email showing 5th Avenue Committee  
22 threatening the 341 residents.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Hunter. You  
24 could always submit your written testimony. Okay.  
25 Thank you.

2 We're going to move to Carrie Bloss.

3 Carrie, if you can hear me, you may begin.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

5 CARRIE BLOSS: Thank you very much. I'm  
6 Carrie Bloss. I'm the Executive Director of Heights  
7 and Hills. Our mission is to support older adults in  
8 the Brooklyn community, to help them maintain their  
9 housing and independence through supports to  
10 homebound older adults and supports to family  
11 caregivers. We also operate an older adult center in  
12 Park Slope. I'm also a resident of Park Slope. As  
13 many people have said, there is a deep lack of  
14 affordable housing in New York City. This  
15 particularly affects older adults, most of whom are  
16 on a fixed income. This project will provide  
17 approximately 70 new homes dedicated to older adults,  
18 which is very important to Heights and Hills and the  
19 community as a whole. We are also very excited as  
20 Heights and Hills about the potential for using the  
21 new publicly accessible park for outdoor programming.  
22 Our older adult center is located on 7th Street just  
23 off of 7th Avenue. We do some programming in Prospect  
24 Park, but we would love to be able to do programming  
25 closer to 5th Avenue where many of members reside so

2 we're very excited about the potential for that, for  
3 residents of the new buildings of the existing  
4 buildings and of older adults from the larger  
5 community. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Robert Hon.  
7 You're next. If you can hear me, you may begin.

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

9 ROBERT HON: I can hear you. Thank you  
10 very much. My name is Robert HOn. I'm a resident of  
11 Gowanus, just across 4th Avenue from where the site's  
12 being developed, so I'm very aware of all of the  
13 change that's happening in the neighborhood, at least  
14 in my neighborhood right now, and that change is  
15 really trying to change industrial sites into livable  
16 buildings where there can be an increase in density  
17 in the neighborhood as well as the 40 affordable  
18 housing in Gowanus specifically. I see this site very  
19 similar to some of the things that's happening in my  
20 neighborhood. It's a site with very complex building  
21 limitations on the site and, from what I see, the  
22 proposal is really trying to work around these  
23 limitations and propose something that allows for  
24 affordable housing on the site, but also updates,  
25 modernizes, and improves the street landscape on that

2 street where the bulkhead of the MTA comes down into  
3 the ground. I would just add too, Park Slope,  
4 Gowanus, are very expensive neighborhoods. Having a  
5 site that allows for affordable housing, not just in  
6 the neighborhood in general, but in a location that  
7 allows for a lot of access to transportation is very  
8 important. In Gowanus, much of the affordable housing  
9 in the neighborhood that existed prior to the  
10 rezoning is far from transportation and is a bit of a  
11 transportation desert. This allows those people that  
12 are using that affordable housing much more  
13 opportunity down the line, jobs, otherwise just  
14 getting around and seeing friends, getting to food,  
15 all that sort of stuff. That's it for my testimony.  
16 Thank you very much.

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. There being  
18 no questions, this applicant panel is now excused.

19 I'm going to call the next panel up. That  
20 is Yuk-Ling Chin, Rhonda Beatty, Vieka Bonilla, and  
21 Edith King.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: I will just  
23 clarify that we have an additional two sets of in-  
24 person panels, but no further online panels. If you  
25

2 are in the room and you have not submitted a speaker  
3 card for this project, please do so now.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Ms. Chin, you may  
5 begin.

6 YUK-LING CHIN: Hi, good afternoon. My  
7 name is Yuk-Ling Chin. I'm a long-time resident of  
8 Prospect Towers, 341 10th Street. I acknowledge the  
9 new housing construction on the premise would be  
10 beneficial to the community and to the tenants of 341  
11 10th Street based on the documents presented and the  
12 conversation with Stellar Management. The project  
13 would ensure repairs and benefits for the current  
14 residents of Prospect Towers. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much.  
16 Next, we will hear from Ms. Bonilla.

17 VIEKA BONILLA: I will speak Spanish,  
18 okay?

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, that's fine. I  
20 just need you to speak into the mic.

21 VIEKA BONILLA: Okay. [SPEAKING SPANISH]

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Next, we'll have  
23 Rhonda Beatty.

24 RHODA BEATTY: It's Rhoda.

25 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Rhoda, sorry.

2 RHODA BEATTY: My name is Rhoda Beatty.

3 Yes, I'm a long-time resident of 341 10th Street as

4 well, and as far as Stellar Management is concerned,

5 I'm talking on a personal level, I've never had any

6 problems with them. Any concerns that I had as far as

7 my apartment is concerned, like repairs or whatever,

8 they always fix it, so I really don't have any

9 problems with them, and that's about it.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much. We

11 have no questions for the applicant panel. You're now

12 excused. Thank you so much for testifying, ladies.

13 Next, I'm going to call up Hector Vail

14 (phonetic), Carmen Lopez, and Aaron Crawford.

15 I just want to remind everyone, if you

16 could speak into the mic. We do have people that are

17 listening online so if you could just speak into the

18 mic. Thank you.

19 We will begin with Hector Vail.

20 HECTOR VAIL: Yeah, my name is Hector

21 Vail. I've been there living for 23 years, and I'm

22 happy if they do affordable house in there because

23 the neighbor needs to change, and we don't expect to

24 have just an empty lot like this. People could come

25 and bring garbage. No way. It should be a building

2 there, and we all need to live in a nice neighborhood  
3 where we could grow our children and our  
4 grandchildren and, Stellar Management, I never had no  
5 problem. When I have a problem with anything, they  
6 come and fix it. They have done a lot of fixing for  
7 me in my house and they do good work, and I believe  
8 that they need to do those housing for people that  
9 don't have places to live. That'll be all. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we'll  
11 have Carmen Lopez.

12 CARMEN LOPEZ: I'm going to speak Spanish.  
13 I'm more fluently in Spanish.

14 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yeah, that's fine. Is  
15 the mic on?

16 HECTOR VAIL: Yes, some.

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay, just need you to  
18 speak into the mic.

19 CARMEN LOPEZ: [SPEAKING SPANISH]

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Thank you.

21 CARMEN LOPEZ: Gracias.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Gracias. Mr. Crawford.

23 AARON CRAWFORD: Yes, my name is Aaron  
24 Crawford. I've been in 341 10th Street for 25 years,  
25 and I have no complaints about Stellar. When it comes

2 to repairs, they take care of the repairs. When it  
3 come to the elevator, they take care of the  
4 elevators, and I really appreciate the work that they  
5 do around here and, for Stellar to grow like this, I  
6 think it's wonderful.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. We have no  
8 questions for the applicant panel. Thank you for  
9 testifying here today.

10 The final panel on this project will be  
11 Ramon Reyes, Mary Salas, and Carlos Torres.

12 We could begin with Ramon Reyes.

13 Is Ramon Reyes here still?

14 RAMON REYES: That's me. I'm sorry.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay.

16 RAMON REYES: Thank you, Chairman Riley  
17 and Members of the Subcommittee.

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Mr. Reyes, can I just  
19 have you just talk into the mic, please?

20 RAMON REYES: Yeah. Can you hear me now?

21 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Yeah.

22 RAMON REYES: Can you hear me?

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes.

24 RAMON REYES: Thank you, Chairman Riley,  
25 Members of the Subcommittee on Zoning and

1 Franchisees. My name is Ramon Reyes. I have been a  
2 member of 32BJ for the last five years. I've been  
3 with RiseBoro Community Partnership, and I'm part of  
4 the Residential Division. SIE and 32BJ is dedicated  
5 to representing the interests of 175,000 members  
6 across 11 states, Washington, D.C. Our union members  
7 are the pillars of the property services sectors here  
8 in New York City performing crucial roles in the  
9 commercial and residential buildings, stadiums,  
10 airports, and multitudes of other locations. Our  
11 diverse membership shares our common goals to elevate  
12 employment standards throughout our industry. 32BJ  
13 members has secured a credible commitment from  
14 Stellar for the creation of good and permanent jobs  
15 within the residential housing aspect of the project.  
16 We estimated that it would be a total of five  
17 residential project jobs on this site. The current  
18 Stellar Management building is a work site for 32BJ  
19 members. When completed, the project will provide  
20 quality jobs that uphold prevailing labor standards  
21 in the industry. There will be also a quick and  
22 peaceful pathway to our unison of the employees to  
23 desire. 32BJ is proud to support the development  
24 project. Thank you for your time.  
25

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we'll  
3 have Mary Salas. Mary?

4 MARY SALAS: Marqueline (PHONETIC) Salas.

5 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I'm sorry.

6 MARY SALAS: Hi, my name is Mary  
7 Marqueline Salas. I speak in Spanish. [SPEAKING  
8 SPANISH]

9 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much, and  
10 is Carlos Torres here? Going once, going twice. Okay,  
11 all right.

12 There being no questions for this  
13 applicant panel, you're now excused.

14 Counsel, are there any more members of  
15 the public who wish to testify on this item?

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: No, there are no  
17 additional people who have signed up online or in  
18 person to testify to this project.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There being no members  
20 of the public who wish to testify on this pre-  
21 considered LUs relating to 341 10th Street proposal,  
22 the public hearing is now closed, and the item is  
23 laid over.

24 Okay. I'm going to ask all of those to  
25 clear the room so we can invite the Willets Point

2 people back in the room so we're just going to take a  
3 quick break.

4 I will now open up the fourth public  
5 hearing on pre-considered LUs relating to the 396-400  
6 Avenue X Rezoning Proposal in Council Member  
7 Brannan's District in Gravesend, Brooklyn. The  
8 proposal seeks a rezoning that would involve the  
9 mapping of a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing to  
10 develop a mixed-use residential development.

11 For anyone wishing to testify on these  
12 items remotely, if you have not already done so, you  
13 must register online and you may do that now by  
14 visiting the Council's website at  
15 [council.nyc.gov/landuse](http://council.nyc.gov/landuse).

16 Once again, for anyone here in person,  
17 you could please see one of the Sergeants to submit a  
18 speaker's card.

19 If you would prefer to submit written  
20 testimony, you can always do so by emailing it to us  
21 at [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

22 Counselor, can we please call the first  
23 panel for this item?

24

25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Yes, Chair. The  
3 first panel consists of Neal Weisbard and Robert  
4 Palermo.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Counsel, can you  
6 please administer the affirmation?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Can you please  
8 raise your right hand and state your name for the  
9 record?

10 NEIL WEISBARD: Neil Weisbard.

11 ROBERT PALERMO: Robert Palermo.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Do you swear to  
13 tell the truth and nothing but the truth in your  
14 testimony in response to Member questions?

15 NEIL WEISBARD: I do.

16 ROBERT PALERMO: I do.

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. For the  
18 viewing public, if you need an accessible version of  
19 this presentation, please send an email request to  
20 [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

21 Now, the applicant team may begin. Please  
22 restate your name and organization for the record.

23 You may begin.

24

25

2 NEIL WEISBARD: Thank you, Chair Riley.

3 Neil Weisbard from Seyfarth Shaw on behalf of the  
4 owners of 396-400 Avenue X. Next slide, please.

5 This is an amendment to Zoning Map 28C  
6 changing an existing R4 residence district underlying  
7 Lots 1, 4, and 6 on Block 7198 to an R7A residence  
8 district within a C2-4 commercial overlay. This will  
9 also include mapping the project area as a Mandatory  
10 Inclusionary Housing area. Next slide, please.

11 The project areas consists of three tax  
12 lots on the south side of Avenue X between East 2nd  
13 and East 3rd Street. The development site, however,  
14 is just lots 1 and 4 on the southeast corner of East  
15 2nd and Avenue X. Next slide, please.

16 The existing Development site is improved  
17 with two, a one-story medical office building and a  
18 two-story mixed-use building with a medical office on  
19 the ground floor and a residence on the second floor.  
20 It's a 10,000-square-foot lot. Next slide, please.

21 This is a picture of the zoning map  
22 change. As I mentioned, it's an existing R4 within  
23 the Special Ocean Parkway District. The rezoning will  
24 rezone the project area to an R7A with a C2-4  
25 commercial overlay. Next slide.

2           The rezoning is appropriate. Just a brief  
3 history, Community Board 15 provided unanimous  
4 approval for this application, Borough President  
5 recommended approval, and City Planning Commission  
6 approved the application. Before we filed for our  
7 rezoning, we met with Community Board 15 and Council  
8 Member Kagan at the time, and we came to the proposal  
9 that I'm going to present shortly, but we believe  
10 this proposal is appropriate. As you can see, there  
11 are numerous six- and seven-story buildings in the  
12 area, and the site is sandwiched in between two six-  
13 and seven-story buildings. Next slide, please.

14           These are just photographs of the  
15 adjacent buildings. Next slide, please.

16           The area is well-served by public  
17 transportation. There are bus lines that cross right  
18 through Avenue X. There is a subway F line  
19 approximately six blocks to the west, and there are B  
20 and Q stops to the east about half to three quarters  
21 of a mile. Next slide, please.

22           The proposal is to construct a 7-story  
23 with mezzanine, 46,000-square-foot mixed-use  
24 building. 41,000 square feet will be residential  
25 floor area. The ground floors will contain

2 professional and medical offices, approximately 5,000  
3 square feet. There will be 45 dwelling units. The  
4 applicant proposes to utilize Option 1, which will  
5 create 12 affordable units. The makeup of the  
6 building will be 21 studios, 19 one bedrooms, and 5  
7 two bedrooms, and in the sub cellar, there will be 45  
8 accessory off-street parking spaces, and this was at  
9 the recommendation of Community Board 15. Next slide,  
10 please.

11 Although the building will be 75 feet in  
12 height within 25 feet of the adjacent R4 district,  
13 the building height may not exceed 55 feet. Next  
14 slide, please.

15 This is just a section of the proposed  
16 development. Next slide, please.

17 The proposed building will contain  
18 numerous resiliency measures including dry  
19 floodproofing areas below grade, including  
20 encapsulating mechanical area and utilizing  
21 (INAUDIBLE) resistant dry floodproofing, utilizing  
22 anchoring of the foundation to the piles to prevent  
23 flotation, utilizing flood damage resilient  
24 materials, and utilizing flood mitigation measures,  
25

2 and Mr. Palermo can answer any questions you may have  
3 about that moving forward. Next slide.

4 It will also contain numerous sustainable  
5 elements, including active solar power, a green roof,  
6 rainwater harvesting, environmentally friendly  
7 materials, and bioswales and a rain garden. Next  
8 slide, please.

9 Just the changes in the zoning from the  
10 existing R4 to an R7A, the area will become a  
11 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing. Permitted as-of-right  
12 commercial uses will include uses Use Group 6 through  
13 9 and Use Group 14, an increase in the residential  
14 floor area ratio from 0.75 to 4.6, increase in  
15 community facility floor area from 2.0 to 4.0, and  
16 increase in residential building height from 35 feet  
17 to 95 feet. Next slide, please.

18 The next slides are just plans of the  
19 proposed development, and we're happy to answer any  
20 questions and our environmental consultant, I  
21 believe, is here in case needed.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I just have  
23 one question for you. Can you please explain a bit  
24 more why you're requesting the R7A zonal district  
25 opposed to another zoning district?

2 NEIL WEISBARD: After meeting with City  
3 Planning, we were pursuing an R7D, which we thought  
4 was appropriate due to the numerous six- and seven-  
5 story buildings in the area. We met with the  
6 Community Board, and they did not want a building  
7 higher than seven stories and, therefore, we chose  
8 the R7A, which accommodates the proposed development  
9 as is.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. There being  
11 no further questions, this applicant panel is  
12 excused.

13 There is one person signed up here to  
14 testify on this, and that is Julia Rada.

15 ROBERT PALERMO: She had to leave.

16 NEIL WEISBARD: Oh, she's from our office.  
17 Yes. From Robert's office.

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: She's not here?

19 ROBERT PALERMO: No.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Is there anyone  
21 else who signed up to testify for 396-400 Avenue X  
22 here or remotely?

23 Okay, there being no other members of the  
24 public who wish to testify on the pre-considered LUs  
25 relating to 396-400 Avenue X rezoning proposal, the

2 public hearing is now closed, and the item is laid  
3 over.

4 Okay, we're here for our last hearing.  
5 We're here y'all, all right?

6 I'm going to call up the Willets Point  
7 Phase 2. Just give me three seconds to take a break  
8 real quick, and I'll be right back to you, but the  
9 applicant team could go up.

10 Thank you, everyone, for your patience. I  
11 will now open up the fifth and last hearing on pre-  
12 considered LUs relating to the Willets Point Phase 2  
13 in Council Member Moya's District located in Willets  
14 Point, Queens. This is an exciting proposal that is  
15 seeking to re-envision Willets Point which, for  
16 decades, was known as the Iron Triangle because of  
17 all the auto body shops that were located in this  
18 area. The proposal is to add approximately 1,400  
19 residential units, a new stadium, and a hotel which  
20 will form an expanded sports complex with the  
21 neighboring Mets Stadium.

22 For anyone wishing to testify on these  
23 items remotely, if you have not already done so, you  
24 must register online and you may do that now by

2 visiting the Council's website at  
3 council.nyc.gov/landuse.

4           Once again, for anyone with us in person,  
5 please see one of the Sergeants to prepare and submit  
6 a speaker's card.

7           If you would prefer to submit written  
8 testimony, you can always do so by emailing it to  
9 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

10           I would now like to give to Council  
11 Member Moya for his remarks.

12           COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you, Chair  
13 Riley, and thank you, everyone, for your patience  
14 today.

15           Good afternoon, I'm Council Member  
16 Francisco Moya, and when I stepped foot in the City  
17 Council, the first thing I did was work to create a  
18 true path towards bringing affordable housing to  
19 Queens at Willets Point, and being here today  
20 reaffirms that commitment and represents a crucial  
21 step in addressing the housing crisis our city is  
22 currently facing but, not only did I keep the promise  
23 I made back in 2018, I worked towards securing  
24 historic AMI levels that will ensure affordability,  
25 with units available for rent from a range below 30

percent of the area median income with a majority of them falling under the 80 percent, including 220 units for low-income seniors and some reserved for formerly homeless people. This project stands as the most significant fully affordable housing initiative in four decades, and it's only the beginning. My dedication during Phase 1 paved the way for what we have before us, a chance to complete what we started, a transformative movement in our shared journey, Phase 2 of Willets Point. This plan brings 1,400 units of affordable housing, bringing the entire Willets Point neighborhood to 2,500 units, 100 percent of which are affordable. It also enhances open and retail space, a 250-room hotel, and the city's first fully electric, privately funded soccer stadium that will be built 100 percent union labor serving as the economic engine that's driving this entire vision. Beyond homes, this project will put money in the pockets of thousands of New Yorkers with over 1,500 permanent jobs and over 14,000 construction jobs. The Willets Point Revitalization Plan is not only initiating the construction of a historical project, it is creating stability and security for a working-class community that is

2 struggling to put a roof over their head and put food  
3 on the table. The swath of land once known as the  
4 Valley of Ashes is projected to generate 1.6 billion  
5 in the economic impact over the next 30 years, and I  
6 want to take this opportunity to thank Mayor Adams  
7 for his partnership and support in this vision as  
8 well as the New York City Football Club, who, like  
9 me, never stopped believing that Queens would be  
10 their home and, of course, to my brothers and sisters  
11 in labor for all that you have done to help this  
12 project come through, the partners at EDC, the Queens  
13 Development Group, and the dedicated community  
14 leaders in the Willets Point Task Force whose support  
15 is essential for the project that has it all.

16 Thank you, again, Chair Riley for giving  
17 me the opportunity to present what I believe is a  
18 gamechanger, not just for Queens, but for New York  
19 City. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council  
21 Member Moya. Thank you for your leadership. This is  
22 an amazing project, so I'm looking forward to hearing  
23 about it.

24 Counsel, can you please call the first  
25 panel for this item?

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Yes, Chair. I  
3 have four of the five panelists, so I'm going to  
4 start with somebody I know, Ethan Goodman. We then  
5 have Jennifer O'Sullivan, Brad Sims, oh, so Brad  
6 Sims, you're not on the panel, so I'll take that  
7 back, Daniel White, and so I'm missing...

8 MELISSA ROMAN BURCH: Melissa Roman Burch  
9 with the New York City Economic Development  
10 Corporation.

11 FRANK MONTERISI: Frank Monterisi from  
12 Related. Okay, and you've submitted, I just want to  
13 make sure you've submitted speaker cards. Okay. Could  
14 you please raise your right hand?

15 Do you swear to tell the truth and the  
16 whole truth in response to Council Member questions  
17 and in your statements?

18 MELISSA ROMAN BURCH: I do.

19 FRANK MONTERISI: I do.

20 ETHAN GOODMAN: I do.

21 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: I do.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, everyone.

24

25

For the viewing public, if you need an accessible version of this presentation, please send an email request to [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

Now, the applicant team may begin.

Panelists, as you begin, please just restate your name and organization for the record. You may begin.

MELISSA ROMAN BURCH: Thank you, Chair Riley, and thank you to Council Member Moya for your incredible vision and partnership in the transformation of Willets Point. My name is Melissa Roman Burch and, as the Chief Operating Officer for the New York City Economic Development Corporation, I am extremely proud of this generational project, which will bring economic opportunity to a community that has been long underserved. As you know, Willett's Point has suffered for decades from environmental pollution and a lack of critical infrastructure. Well, no more. The City has now committed millions in needed infrastructure that will remediate the site, deliver new streets, sidewalks, sewers, and a brand-new water main that will serve all of Queens. The Adams' Administration is writing a new chapter, and we're thankful for the City Council's partnership in this effort. As you'll see

2 from the presentation today, the zoning actions  
3 before you will support thousands of new affordable  
4 homes, a 650-seat school, neighborhood-serving  
5 retail, new public space, and New York's first ever  
6 soccer stadium, which will be 100 percent privately  
7 financed and union built. This once in a generation  
8 plan responds to the City's housing crisis, will  
9 create thousands of jobs, and generate 6.1 billion in  
10 economic impact over the next 30 years. Thank you,  
11 again, to the Committee, and I look forward to taking  
12 your questions.

13           ETHAN GOODMAN: Good afternoon, Council  
14 Members, Chair Riley, I'm Ethan Goodman with the firm  
15 of Fox Rothschild. We represent the Joint Venture  
16 Development Team at Willets Point comprised of the  
17 Queens Development Group and the New York City  
18 Football Club. Next slide, please.

19           We are tremendously excited to present to  
20 you a project that represents the culmination of over  
21 50 years of efforts to redevelop the Willets Point  
22 Peninsula. What was once a dumping ground for the  
23 City's ash waste has been cleaned up and is ready to  
24 accommodate the City's largest new 100 percent  
25 affordable housing development in over 40 years. In

1 addition to the over 6 billion in economic impact of  
2 this project, it will bring more than 16,000  
3 permanent and construction jobs and will build new  
4 streets and infrastructure to serve both Willets  
5 Point and all of Queens. Next slide, please.

7 Phase one of the redevelopment is already  
8 underway. As Queens Development Group broke ground in  
9 January on the first 880 affordable housing units on  
10 the next slide, I believe that'll take you through  
11 this. This first phase will culminate in the  
12 development of 1,100 affordable units, a 650-seat  
13 public school, and an acre of open space, all built  
14 atop six acres of environmentally remediated land  
15 and, now, we're proud to be before you seeking  
16 approvals to develop an additional 17 acres of  
17 Willets Point on land whose environmental remediation  
18 is nearing completion. This Phase 2 project would  
19 build an additional 1,400 affordable homes, 250-room  
20 hotel, 115,000 more square feet of open space and,  
21 finally, a 25,000-seat soccer specific stadium to  
22 serve as the permanent home of the New York City  
23 Football Club.

24

25

2 I believe our slides are not advancing,  
3 but if we want, there we go. Okay. If we can go to  
4 one more slide.

5 You can see an image on the screen right  
6 here. This image shows the location of the Phase One  
7 development currently under construction, which will  
8 establish a gateway entrance into the new Willets  
9 Point community at the southwest corner.

10 In the next slide, you will see the four  
11 development blocks that comprise the Phase Two  
12 application currently before you. We've termed these  
13 from south to north, the triangle parcel, the stadium  
14 parcel, the T parcel, and the northern parcel.

15 Next slide will show that the triangle  
16 parcel contains the hotel and a 350-unit affordable  
17 residential building, the stadium parcel is just to  
18 the north, centrally located in the district, the T  
19 parcel will contain another 340-unit, 100 percent  
20 affordable housing building, and the northern parcel  
21 is the largest 710-unit, 100 percent affordable  
22 residential building.

23 The next few images will show you two  
24 important elements of the project. On the next slide,  
25 you'll notice in the northeast facing image that you

see here, these two first phases of development will establish a consistent building frontage along the east side of Seaver Way across from Citi Field.

Seaver Way used to be known as the back street of Citi Field. It will now be known as the front entryway to the new Willets Point community. Now, while there still will be almost 35 acres of Willets Point to be developed in future phases, these initial phases will strongly establish a new community fronting on Seaver Way. This will be a community of 2,500 families and individuals, which the Queen's Development Group will speak more about in a moment.

The next slide, you'll see a west-facing image, and you'll see in this image that the stadium has been designed by our architects, HOK Architecture, to integrate into the existing block form at Willets Point and rise to a height concurrent with the adjacent residences. As such, the stadium will not be some object placed on the community, but rather become an integral part of the new community. In addition to the physical form of the stadium, the football club will soon speak about how programming and operations will further integrate the stadium with the community.

1                   On the next slide, you'll see we're  
2  
3 before the Council with five actions to facilitate  
4 the project. We're seeking Zoning Text Amendments to  
5 the Special Willets Point District, which itself was  
6 passed by the Council in 2008 to establish the  
7 framework under which we will be able to apply for  
8 special permit relief, and then we are seeking three  
9 special permits, one for the 25,000-seat stadium, one  
10 for the 250-room hotel, and a third for modifications  
11 to use, bulking, and parking regulations to  
12 facilitate the proposed buildings and design.  
13 Finally, we are seeking changes to the City Map to  
14 formally map the streets around Phase One and to  
15 allow for a future increase in the grades of streets  
16 around Phase Two at such future time as the rest of  
17 the District is acquired and redeveloped.

18                   We've been working with the local  
19 Community Board on this project for over 10 years. We  
20 have met with them dozens upon dozens of times, and I  
21 think largely for this reason, in this established  
22 relationship, this culminated in their recommendation  
23 in December by a vote of 37 to 2 to approve these  
24 actions. In January, the Borough President added his  
25 support, recommending approval of the actions and,

2 just last week, the City Planning Commission voted  
3 unanimously to approve the actions. With that, I'd  
4 like to introduce the first of two members of the  
5 development team, Frank Monterisi with the Queens  
6 Development Group and he'll speak a little bit more  
7 about the team developing the affordable housing and  
8 hotel portions of the project.

9 FRANK MONTERISI: Thank you, Ethan. Good  
10 afternoon, Council Members and Chair Riley. My name  
11 is Frank Monterisi. I'm an Executive Vice President  
12 from Related. I've been working on our Willets Point  
13 project for a very long time, over a decade. I grew  
14 up five minutes from this site in Whitestone. This  
15 site, this project is very close to home for me. The  
16 Queens Development Group is a 50/50 joint venture  
17 between Related and Sterling Equities. Both of our  
18 companies have been the developers of large mixed-use  
19 projects here in New York City. We, at Related, our  
20 company was started in affordable housing more than  
21 50 years ago, and affordable housing is very much a  
22 part of our DNA. Next slide. If we could move one  
23 slide. Thank you.

24 As you see, the pictures of the projects  
25 on the on the screen here, these are projects that I

1 have led here in New York City, Hunters Point South,  
2 925 units, all affordable on the Long Island City  
3 Waterfront, Riverwalk Park 340 units on Roosevelt  
4 Island, the Harriet Tubman Houses, 63 units in in Far  
5 Rockaway. Many of these projects in Queens, all of  
6 them all-affordable projects and, again, affordable  
7 housing is something at Related that we are proud to  
8 do, not something that we are forced to do. Next  
9 slide.

11 To show that, we've just started on  
12 vertical development at the first phase of Willett's  
13 Point that Councilman Moya had talked about  
14 previously. What on the screen here is a 100 percent  
15 affordable project. We closed our construction  
16 financing and ground lease with HPD, HDC, and EDC in  
17 November. This is an 880-unit project. The first part  
18 of Phase One, what you see on the screen here is  
19 1,100 units. The first 880 units is what we started  
20 on. As Council Member Moya referred to before, very,  
21 very deep affordability in this project. The  
22 affordability levels that we came up with are a  
23 result of longstanding conversations that we've had  
24 with the Councilman, the Borough President, all the

2 City agencies involved, HPD, HDC, EDC, and the  
3 Mayor's Office.

4 Our deal for Phase 2, for the next 1,400  
5 units that is the subject of our conversation today,  
6 is that the additional 1,400 units in Phase 2 will be  
7 developed in accordance with the standards with HPD  
8 and HDC through their affordable housing programs.  
9 All of the units, all 1,400 units will be developed  
10 in those programs, and the affordability levels for  
11 the next 1,400 units will be similar to the  
12 affordability that we've just finalized on the 880  
13 units that we just started on. To just throw some of  
14 those stats out there, of those affordability levels,  
15 over 50 percent, it's 52 percent of the 880 units are  
16 reserved for low-income households, 15 percent of the  
17 units are reserved for formerly homeless residents,  
18 and the affordability levels range from less than 30  
19 percent of AMI to 110, 120 percent of AMI, all of  
20 which are below market in this area. Next slide.

21 We are committed to the redevelopment of  
22 Willets Point. As I said before, we were the  
23 designated developer of this District in 2012. We  
24 have been working on this plan for over 10 years.  
25 This is a project that will transform an area that

1 was under-utilized and contaminated and will turn it  
2 into Queens' next great neighborhood. This is an all-  
3 affordable project that will be anchored by a soccer  
4 stadium from New York City Football Club. I'm happy  
5 to turn the microphone over to Jennifer O'Sullivan  
6 from NYCFC.  
7

8 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: Thank you, Frank.

9 Good afternoon, Chair Riley and Councilpersons. I'm  
10 Jennifer O'Sullivan, Chief Operating Officer for New  
11 York City Football Club.

12 On behalf of New York City Football Club,  
13 I want to begin by saying how grateful I am to be  
14 here sharing our vision with you today. This approval  
15 process is so crucial to the club's future and to our  
16 fans, many of whom live in this community and the  
17 borough of Queens. For those who don't know us, we  
18 are New York City's only Major League Soccer team.  
19 Next slide, please. Thank you.

20 We are 80 percent owned by City Football  
21 Group, parent company to Manchester City, and 20  
22 men's and women's clubs worldwide, and 20 percent  
23 owned by the New York Yankees. Announced as the 20th  
24 franchise of MLS in 2013, we played our inaugural  
25 season in 2015, and we have been playing for, and

investing in, the City of New York for the past 10 years. Our season consists of a 34-game season, 17 home games, 17 away, runs from late February to mid-October, culminating in the playoffs in November and December. We were incredibly proud to represent New York City as the 2021 MLS Cup champions and 2022 Campionas Cup champions. Our academy program, consisting of elite players ages U12 to U17, is one of the best in MLS, and is the first in the country to win back-to-back titles at the U19 level. We have produced 12 homegrown players. Those are players in our academy who come up through the ranks who sign professional team contracts with us, and many of those players have come from right here in New York City, Bronx, Brooklyn, and other areas in the New York City metro area. We are incredibly lucky and proud to have such a rich pool of talent here in the New York area. Next slide, please.

This is a rendering of what a match day would look like, and you can see the passion that we know that our fans will bring on game days as they do now. Next slide.

Beyond enhancing our community work in the city, which I will talk about in a moment, this

2 private investment will bring immense economic  
3 benefits to the families and businesses of New York  
4 City and those that call Willets Point home. As you  
5 heard earlier, the larger Willets Point project is  
6 projected to generate more than 6 billion dollars in  
7 economic impact over the next 30 years, and the 800-  
8 million-dollar privately financed stadium will be  
9 entirely union built, creating thousands of new jobs,  
10 including 4,000 construction jobs alone for the  
11 stadium build, resulting in over 300 million in  
12 construction wages, salaries, and benefits that will  
13 be invested directly back into this community. Local  
14 procurement is absolutely critical and essential for  
15 us to this proposed project, and we would make it our  
16 priority to partner with local businesses in Queens  
17 and across the city, not only during the construction  
18 process, but also once the stadium is up and running.  
19 We are also thrilled to be able to relocate our front  
20 office staff of over 100 people to Willets Point,  
21 where they will be headquartered in the stadium. Next  
22 slide.

23 I do want to be clear, however, that this  
24 stadium, if approved, will not simply serve as a  
25 place to play soccer games. It offers a community

1 hub, a home not just for our club and for our fans,  
2 but for the local community while bringing  
3 significant economic benefits into the region. If  
4 this project is approved, New York City Football Club  
5 will provide free space for community groups to hold  
6 meetings and run events on non-event days that will  
7 further enrich this vibrant community. In addition, a  
8 community activation fund will be created by us to  
9 help offset any event-related costs incurred by  
10 community event sponsors, providing a free and  
11 accessible space for all. Next slide, please.

12  
13 As I mentioned, we are incredibly excited  
14 to have the opportunity to move our staff of over 100  
15 people to Willets Point, and that includes the staff  
16 of our award-winning non-profit arm, City in the  
17 Community. Earlier in the ULURP process, community  
18 members in Queens had the chance to hear from some of  
19 those unique New York City Football Club employees  
20 who lead that non-profit work, which positively  
21 impacts thousands of historically underserved youth  
22 across the five boroughs. Those employees, many of  
23 whom were born and raised in New York City, and all  
24 who lived throughout the city and benefited  
25 themselves from soccer programming, genuinely are the

1 club's heartbeat. For them, having a permanent home  
2 in Willets Point will help them to expand that  
3 programming and reach even more children and families  
4 across the five boroughs. That includes our Saturday  
5 Night Lights initiative, which provides free youth  
6 development and violence prevention programs in the  
7 neighborhoods with historically higher crime rates.  
8 To date, CITC has provided over 30,000 young New  
9 Yorkers with free soccer programming across all five  
10 boroughs. We've constructed over 50 mini soccer  
11 pitches for youth- and family-playing communities  
12 across New York City with a goal to build an  
13 additional 26 more before the World Cup comes here in  
14 2026. We currently have a presence in over 78 percent  
15 of neighborhoods in the city, and we plan to continue  
16 to grow and expand our free school-based community  
17 programs in Queens, along with the rest of the other  
18 four boroughs. Next slide, please.

19  
20 We are also vividly aware that Willets  
21 Point has a challenging history of environmental  
22 degradation and, if this project is approved, New  
23 York City Football Club will do its part in  
24 protecting vulnerable communities from the effects of  
25 climate change. That is why we are building the first

2 ever all-electric stadium in New York City, and the  
3 first in Major League Soccer's history, working  
4 towards a zero-waste stadium with a goal of credible  
5 net zero emissions. Next slide, please.

6 I want to thank you again for allowing me  
7 to speak today, represent our organization, which  
8 includes thousands of fans and local community  
9 members who participate in our community programming.  
10 We look forward to answering any questions you have.

11 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much. Can  
12 you provide me with a more specific breakdown, the  
13 proposed affordability levels for the residential  
14 buildings?

15 FRANK MONTERISI: We have the breakdown on  
16 the 880 units that we've just started on. That's the  
17 financing we closed in November. For the future  
18 buildings, we haven't yet set the affordability  
19 levels exact, but what we've basically said in our  
20 deal with EDC is that the affordability levels of the  
21 1,400 units will be similar to the 880, but we want  
22 to be responsive to concerns that come in the future  
23 and sitting down with the Council Member and other  
24 stakeholders when we go into figuring out exactly  
25 what the AMI levels are in each building, because in

2 Phase Two, there's basically three housing sites.  
3 There's the triangle site, the T site, and the  
4 northern site, and so when we go to develop those,  
5 we'll sit down and we'll drill down into the exact  
6 affordability levels just like we did last year when  
7 we when we closed on the financing for Phase One.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Okay. Do you  
9 have the actual AMIs?

10 FRANK MONTERISI: Sure. There you go.  
11 We're happy to send a chart to you, but the formerly  
12 homeless band was 15 percent, 7 percent at 30 percent  
13 of AMI, 11 percent at 40 percent of AMI, 7 percent at  
14 60 percent of AMI, 12 percent at 80 percent of AMI,  
15 38 percent at 100 percent of AMI, and 9 percent at  
16 120 percent of AMI.

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Thank you. The  
18 plan includes a school site. Which Phase is the  
19 school site part of and what grade level, how many  
20 seats, and what's the estimated timeline for that  
21 school?

22 FRANK MONTERISI: The school site is in  
23 Phase One. Phase One is comprised of the 880 units.  
24 I'm happy to point at the screen if it makes sense.

25 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Nope, it's fine.

2 FRANK MONTERISI: (INAUDIBLE) the 880  
3 units then there's 220 units of senior housing. We're  
4 going to pull the image up on the screen here. The  
5 220 units of senior housing. We're hoping that  
6 that'll close later this year. We're in the middle of  
7 design for that, and we really want to get going on  
8 that later this year, and then the pad after the  
9 senior housing is the school site, and it's a 650-  
10 seat school that we're basically delivering the pad  
11 to the SCA, and the SCA is going to build the 650-  
12 seat school on that site.

13 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Are they going to have  
14 it built by the time the building's built? That was a  
15 SCA joke.

16 MELISSA ROMAN BURCH: It's really up to  
17 the SCA.

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: That was a SCA joke,  
19 if you didn't get it.

20 MELISSA ROMAN BURCH: It's being turned  
21 over to the SCA as a clean, fully remediated pad in  
22 2025, and it'll serve 650-seats K through 8.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. What is the  
24 size of the community activation fund, which I really  
25

2 like that idea, and how would community members use  
3 and access it?

4 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: It is a total of  
5 500,000 dollars. It'll be 100,000 dollars a year for  
6 the first five years, and there will be an online  
7 reservation booking system that we'll have. We will  
8 ensure that we publicize the available dates and,  
9 through our community liaison who will be working  
10 with that calendar, that booking system, they'll be  
11 able to book the site for whatever events they'd like  
12 to have. There's no rent that will be charged that.  
13 Those types of costs would be for cleaning, for the  
14 operation of the space that they'd want to use. It's  
15 really trying to keep the cost to a minimum, for  
16 especially the smaller organizations that you don't  
17 have the means to be able to go out and rent spaces.

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: And why just five  
19 years? Are there any talks about continuing this  
20 after five years?

21 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: We haven't discussed  
22 that yet, but the initial conversations were around,  
23 the commitment was around the first five years for  
24 sure.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Lastly, this is  
3 a beautiful residential building, but it's adjacent  
4 to two stadiums. I'm thinking about noise  
5 cancellations and affecting anyone's sleep patterns  
6 so can you just go into that a little bit more into  
7 depth for me.

8 ETHAN GOODMAN: Sure. You are correct.  
9 It's not just the stadium, but anybody who's been a  
10 Met fan for any number of years knows there's other  
11 stuff going on in the area too. As part of our  
12 extensive environmental impact statement here, we did  
13 noise monitoring throughout to determine existing  
14 levels where new residences would be built, and I  
15 believe what emerged from that is certain  
16 environmental regulations, E-designation regulations,  
17 that requires certain minimum amount of window wall  
18 attenuation in the residential windows so, depending  
19 if you're facing the subway facing south, there's a  
20 little bit of a higher level than if you're facing  
21 something that's not necessarily as close to one of  
22 those high noise generators. With respect to the  
23 stadium proper, and Jennifer can speak more about it,  
24 the goal of the stadium is largely to keep a lot of  
25 that noise inside and internal to the stadium so we

2 actually don't anticipate there's much in the way of  
3 leakage of noise from there. It's really more about  
4 the train, the planes, other things that are going on  
5 in the neighborhood, but rest assured that all of  
6 these units will be designed so that they maintain  
7 acceptable interior noise levels.

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Thank you.

9 Council Member Moya.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you, Chair  
11 Riley. I just have a couple of questions.

12 Can the football club just discuss a  
13 little bit about the community programs that you've  
14 already implemented in New York City, but especially  
15 in the borough of Queens? A lot of people here in New  
16 York know that when sports franchises come in,  
17 there's very minimal that gets done with the  
18 community. You give a couple of tickets to a couple  
19 of schools and, throughout the year, but you guys  
20 have been doing some things and I think it's  
21 important that you share that publicly. Thank you.

22 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: Yeah. Thank you very  
23 much for the opportunity to discuss our community  
24 programming, and I think it's the one thing that  
25 we're probably the proudest of. It's not so much what

1 we do on the pitch, but off the pitch as well, and  
2 our community team, I always say I would put them up  
3 against anyone else. They are a force to be reckoned  
4 with, and their passion and dedication is unmatched.  
5 30,000 kids across the five boroughs in New York over  
6 the last 10 years have received free soccer  
7 programming as a direct result of the work that our  
8 City in the Community team does. The Saturday Night  
9 Lights initiative, as I mentioned, opens up safe and  
10 accessible places for kids to play on Friday and  
11 Saturday nights in conjunction with the DA's office  
12 and the NYPD and, in Queens specifically, we have a  
13 number of programs, including a couple in your  
14 District that are Healthy Hat Trick, which is healthy  
15 eating for kids. We've constructed over 50 mini  
16 pitches, as I said, across the communities in the  
17 last 10 years with another goal to provide 26 more  
18 before the '26 World Cup comes. I think when you look  
19 at the reach that City in the Community has, there is  
20 not another professional football club that does what  
21 our team does on the ground, ensuring that kids have  
22 safe, accessible places to play, that they have  
23 access to a sport that inner city children are often  
24 excluded from and not part of and, so for us, it is  
25

2 all about ensuring that this game is accessible to  
3 all. You never know where the next Messi or Ronaldo  
4 is going to come from until you put a ball at their  
5 feet.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Let's omit the  
7 second name that you mentioned from the record,  
8 please, if we could, Mr. Chair.

9 How many Saturday Night Live programs do  
10 you have right now currently?

11 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: Eight.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Eight, and I think  
13 two more are coming down...

14 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: Two more are coming.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Two more are coming  
16 down the line. I want to commend the City Football  
17 Group for doing work in schools like mine that have  
18 one of the highest number of migrant children and  
19 providing free clinics for them. Really, it is a  
20 universal language for a lot of these children that  
21 are newly arrived here. The one thing that they do  
22 know and love is football, and you all have been  
23 very, very good in making sure that we made those  
24 young kids feel very, very comfortable in the new  
25 community and in the new setting that they're at so I

2 really want to applaud you for the great work and  
3 partnership there.

4           What existing partnerships do you have  
5 already in place that facilitate internships and  
6 employment opportunities, especially for the people  
7 of Queens?

8           JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: We have actually a  
9 number of relationships with local Queens  
10 universities, including St. John's, LaGuardia, Queens  
11 College, York College, and our Human Resources  
12 Department works very closely with them in terms of  
13 ensuring that we are getting qualified, diverse  
14 candidates throughout the pipeline into the football  
15 club. We have a number of graduates of those schools  
16 and programs that are currently employees of ours. We  
17 do a lot of career workshops. We do a lot of  
18 mentorship programs. We have a lot of our staff from  
19 the organization who go and speak to students,  
20 letting them know just about what the different types  
21 of jobs are in sports. It's not always just about  
22 being a coach, an agent or a player but, if you're  
23 into graphics design, if you're into journalism, if  
24 you're into all of these other different areas of the  
25 business that sports provide, and so a lot of it is

2 ensuring that these local students understand and  
3 know that there's a pathway for them if they are  
4 interested, and so it's a priority for us to ensure  
5 that we are bringing in kids from the five boroughs  
6 and specifically now Queens to let them know that  
7 there are opportunities within the club.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I believe we are  
9 still in talks with CUNY to develop that connection  
10 with CUNY students to be working...

11 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: With the New York  
13 City Football Club in the areas of hospitality that  
14 would create a program for them to be part of that  
15 when the stadium is built?

16 JENNIFER O'SULLIVAN: That is correct.  
17 We've been limited in those types of opportunities  
18 because we don't have our own stadium to play in but,  
19 once we do, that opens up an entirely new area of the  
20 business for us to be able to bring students into.

21 The one other thing I'd like to mention  
22 too is our City in the Community program. We do have  
23 our Young Leaders Program and, through that, is a lot  
24 of those kids are kids who come up through our  
25 programs who then become coaches, part-time coaches

2 and leaders in their own communities and  
3 neighborhoods, and we have a lot of them that come  
4 through the club as interns as well and have become  
5 full-time employees with us.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: That's great. Just  
7 want to say thank you again for being here today.

8 I'm going to ask a couple of questions  
9 on housing, which is just really quick because I just  
10 want to get back to some of the things that Chairman  
11 Riley had brought up.

12 In my community, it has a much lower AMI  
13 than the multi-county regions used as a baseline to  
14 determine the City's affordable housing, but can you  
15 explain the income levels associated with the deeply  
16 affordable units in this project that actually align  
17 with areas like Corona?

18 MELISSA ROMAN BURCH: Council Member, you  
19 remember about six months ago or maybe it was eight  
20 months ago, when we were trying to put the Phase One  
21 deal together and finalizing the AMIs, and you came  
22 to me and you said we need to lower some of the  
23 affordability levels here, and it was you as the as  
24 the Council Member for the District that communicated  
25 to us that we needed to rethink the levels and come

1 up with what we closed on in November. The fact of  
2 the matter is that in affordable housing, sometimes  
3 it can get a little wonky, you can get a lot of  
4 spreadsheets, but it comes down to what we're doing  
5 is providing housing for New Yorkers, and it really  
6 needs to be, when you look at one of these projects,  
7 you need to match the spreadsheet with the reality on  
8 the ground and, for that to happen, there needs to be  
9 good, consistent communication between the  
10 development team, all the local stakeholders,  
11 yourself being, you're first among those, but  
12 everybody, and I can think back to in my time working  
13 on this project over 10 years and, again, having  
14 grown up in the area, those conversations are  
15 important so that we can create an affordable housing  
16 project that meets the needs of the local community  
17 and the areas around it, and so really like that's  
18 what it's all about is figuring out the affordability  
19 levels with HPD and matching them to the  
20 affordability levels in the District, and I think  
21 what we've come up with for Phase One, which we're  
22 going to take forward into Phase Two, takes all that  
23 into account.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Great. Thank you.

3 Last question is, look, other sports arena projects  
4 in the city like Atlantic Yards famously promised  
5 affordable housing but has yet to deliver on many of  
6 those promises. Can you explain a little bit of how  
7 this project is different?

8 FRANK MONTERISI: I think for why this  
9 project is different from my perspective. First, I  
10 think, give a lot of credit to the team that's  
11 working on this, and that's not just the private  
12 development team, that's the public development team.  
13 We were designated the developer of this site in  
14 2012. We've been working with our City partners at  
15 EDC for a long time. We've been working with our  
16 local stakeholders, yourself, and others for a long  
17 time. I think, at the end of the day, what makes this  
18 project different, look, there's a lot of tough sites  
19 in New York City. This is a tough site. In the last  
20 two years, we removed 200,000 tons of contaminated  
21 soil from the site. You had to remove contamination  
22 that has been there for decades. Right now, if you  
23 come out to the site, as I know you have been, but  
24 for anybody else that comes out to the site, you'll  
25 see infrastructure going in. We had to build new

2 roads, we had to put new utilities, we had to plan  
3 all of that with our public partners. This was years  
4 and years of hard work in the making, and so I think  
5 what it comes down to is I think that there's really  
6 a teamwork around the site and we all have to listen  
7 to each other and figure out the obstacles as we go  
8 along. Honestly, I think that's the difference.

9           ETHAN GOODMAN: And I want to add one  
10 other thing because Frank's too modest to add it. The  
11 major difference is coming out of the ground right  
12 now. If you go to Willets, you're going to see  
13 construction cranes and earth moving, and that's for  
14 affordable housing, 100 percent affordable housing,  
15 and that's before anything else gets built at  
16 Willets. The first structure that's coming out here  
17 is going to house 880 families and individuals in 100  
18 percent affordable housing, and that proof is in the  
19 pudding right there.

20           COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you. Lastly,  
21 Chair Riley has shared that he would like to do a  
22 tryout along with myself for the next season coming  
23 up as part of this process.

24           Thank you so much. Thank you, Chair  
25 Riley.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council  
3 Member Moya.

4 There being no more questions for this  
5 applicant panel, you are now excused. Thank you so  
6 much for testifying.

7 Seriously, thank you so much for  
8 everyone's patience here today. I'm going to open up  
9 the floor for the public testimony.

10 We're going to give everyone two minutes.  
11 If you go over two minutes, I'm just going to tell  
12 you to wrap it up.

13 The first panel that I'm going to be  
14 calling is Nelson Jarrin, Bailee Englin, Brad Sims,  
15 and Oscar Garcia. If I mispronounce your name, I  
16 apologize. Once again, that's Oscar Garcia, Brad  
17 Sims, Bailee Englin, and Nelson Jarrin.

18 Okay, we have people online. We're going  
19 to do the in-person testimonies first, and then we're  
20 going to go to online testimonies.

21 We can begin with Mr. Nelson Jarrin.

22 NELSON JARRIN: Okay. Hi, everyone. My  
23 name is Nelson Jarrin.

24 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Nelson, can you just  
25 speak into the mic?

2 NELSON JARRIN: Sure. Sorry. Can you hear  
3 me better?

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes.

5 NELSON JARRIN: My name is Nelson Jarrin.  
6 Hi, everyone. Thank you, Council Members, Chair  
7 Riley. I'm a Bronx native. Ten years ago, I remember  
8 I was in college, and I was just trying to figure out  
9 what to do with my life, and I remember hearing  
10 there's going to be a new club coming up here, and I  
11 was thinking, oh, wow, this is something that I just  
12 want to be a part of right off, took all my, whatever  
13 little bit of money that I have and be like, okay,  
14 let's become a season ticket holder so I'm a founding  
15 member since then. Then after that, these last eight,  
16 nine years of being a fan, it's just been such an  
17 integral part of my life. I love it. I go to the  
18 games every week and, being part of the Bronx, I was  
19 20 minutes away from Yankee Stadium, but now I know  
20 that there's a new stadium coming up, and I'm  
21 extremely excited to go to Queens, because I'm like,  
22 okay, you know what, this is going to be my new home,  
23 this is going to be my new area, and, in just seeing  
24 the increase of people becoming fans, I'm taking  
25 friends, and just people wearing shirts, and colors,

2 instead of wearing these other popular brands, other  
3 popular clubs, Real Madrid, Barcelona, PSG, like  
4 those are foreign clubs. I just want to be proud of  
5 my local team, my local club, and having this  
6 stadium, having this community come up here in Queens  
7 is just going to be something I could be proud of and  
8 be like, hey, yeah, that's my club. Ten years from  
9 now, I don't know where I'll be, I don't know what's  
10 going to happen, but all I know is that I just wish  
11 I'll be at the stadium, screaming and shouting,  
12 supporting this team and club.

13 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Mr. Garcia.

14 OSCAR GARCIA: Chair Riley and Members of  
15 the Council, thank you for having me here. My name is  
16 Oscar Garcia. I'm from Whitestone. This project is  
17 close to my heart, and I'm also a New York City  
18 football fan as well as a season ticket holder since  
19 the beginning, and New York City Football Club has  
20 shown from the beginning that they are a sporting  
21 venture, not a business venture so they care about  
22 people more than profits because I have seen from the  
23 beginning how they treat us and what they've done to  
24 the community as well as so many kids that have come  
25 out of the academy, which is like the farm for the

2 teams, correct, guys like Justin Haak from Bushwick,  
3 James Sands from Rye and, of course, Tayvon Gray from  
4 the Boogie Down Bronx, which I'm very proud, and  
5 these kids, if New York City wasn't here, I don't  
6 think the school would have been found so New York  
7 City is moving forward, creating and stopping pay for  
8 play, which is all our parents know how much does it  
9 cost to bring a kid in New York City, Queens  
10 especially, if they want to play soccer, how  
11 expensive it is. New York City is going to eliminate  
12 that. I believe that they will. This is for our kids,  
13 for our grandkids, not just for us now, and I see it  
14 in the community, how this has all changed. They  
15 mentioned Saturday night lights. Flushing High School  
16 just started just recently. We never had that in  
17 Queens where kids don't have to pay to go learn how  
18 to play soccer from a professional team so that's why  
19 I support this the most. Never mind that I'm a fan,  
20 that soccer is my religion, football is my religion,  
21 never mind that, but just that we have a New York  
22 City football team right in in our community that's  
23 going to help our kids, our grandkids, great  
24 grandkids, because they're here to stay, and I cannot

2 say it about any other sport franchise that done  
3 that. Thank you very much.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Mr. Garcia.  
5 There being no questions, you're now excused.

6 OSCAR GARCIA: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: The next panel I'm  
8 going to call up is Patrick Shields, Brian Hunt,  
9 Jeanette Abbott, and Ramon Reyes.

10 We can begin with Patrick Shields.

11 PATRICK SHIELDS: Hi. Patrick Shields here  
12 first and foremost. We on the clock?

13 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yeah.

14 PATRICK SHIELDS: New York City resident,  
15 American soccer fan, and also proud member of the  
16 Third Rail Supporters Club of the New York City  
17 Football Club, Friends of Los Templeanos and all  
18 other New York City Football Club supporters. I  
19 cannot begin to tell you how pleased and proud I am  
20 to be here today. After 25 years of hammering away to  
21 anyone who will listen about getting MLS and soccer  
22 on the ground here, I'm pleased and proud to be here  
23 today on the record in this matter. You and your  
24 Council Colleagues have the opportunity to make a far  
25 more monumental statement in this process than zoning

change alone. In rare instances, it means far more.

In this case, imperfect though all projects of this

scale are, its reach will be global. You have the

opportunity to clear a path for a sport which is

challenging the status quo across the board. Globally

open, gender neutral, racially diverse, ownership

diverse, let me repeat, ownership diverse, multiple

teams and growing, and also soon to be exponentially

expanding on the ancillary new business side. As a

veteran small business owner, I see only opportunity

for all. New storefronts, coaches, clinics,

academies, agents, PR teams, graphics agencies,

endless business opportunities for and reflecting a

truly diverse workforce and ownership stake. Soccer

matters, and we all know sports and heroes matter in

ways far beyond the cornerstone laid by my union

brothers and sisters. As a veteran now of nine World

Cups, as a traveler, I tell you this, the world is

waiting to purchase its flight to and through New

York City, and those that fly into a newly remade

LaGuardia over the great Borough of Queens will look

down and see the final piece of that puzzle. What

they will also see is that you will have established

a template for cities all over the country and indeed

2 the world, especially in dense urban areas. You will  
3 signal to the world that arena construction will not  
4 happen without substantial affordable housing  
5 construction attached. Soccer can, will be, and must  
6 be part of that housing solution. This project will  
7 be that north star. It will guide other cities. Do  
8 not underestimate the importance of this project and  
9 where it will lead. It is the one time you will be  
10 able to look back and be proud of what you will have  
11 moved forward. It will reach exponentially. Thank  
12 you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, Brian  
14 Hunt.

15 BRIAN HUNT: Hello. Good afternoon,  
16 everybody. We, too, like affordable housing and just  
17 as that provides benefits to the community and as we  
18 heard from New York City Football Club having a  
19 franchise there in Queens provides benefits to the  
20 community, so does union labor. Union labor provides  
21 a lot more than the brick and mortar that you see  
22 going up around town. There's a lot more to it, as  
23 you all know, and that's why we're excited to be a  
24 part of it as well. It is a partnership. For the  
25 first time, we're going to have a 100 percent

1 privately financed and union-built stadium in New  
2 York City. It's going to be built by the safest and  
3 most skilled workforce in New York City. Union labor  
4 is a function of this economy. It puts dollars back  
5 into the community but these projects, like I said,  
6 they're going to build more than just the brick and  
7 mortar that we walk into every day, and it's going to  
8 provide the benefits that you'll see and that we have  
9 seen for a long time. Build union and you're  
10 supporting education through our apprenticeship  
11 programs. You're supporting healthcare. You're  
12 supporting a lot of different programs that are  
13 important to the community and important to the  
14 members of the local unions as well as the small  
15 businesses that they spend their money in, the delis,  
16 the shops, and everything else that comes along with  
17 that. New York is a benchmark for many things, and I  
18 think it's always been a benchmark for labor, and I  
19 think it needs to continue to be a benchmark for  
20 labor. That should be at the top of the list, or one  
21 of the things at the top of the list, but it sets an  
22 example, not just for the nation, but  
23 internationally, because it is soccer, football. It's  
24 something that the whole world can look at, and we  
25

2 could see how it's built and they could look at this  
3 as an example, which I'm very proud to be a part of,  
4 I think we all are, and it shows the values that we  
5 share as a city. I think, again, labor is a major  
6 part of that and I think it's a good example to use  
7 as the values that we share as a city and how we  
8 treat our workers with dignity and we give them a  
9 pathway, not only to the middle class, but also an  
10 opportunity to retire with dignity and raise a family  
11 and continue to live in the city. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Mr. Hunt.

13 Next is Jeanette Abbott.

14 JEANETTE ABBOTT: Hello and good  
15 afternoon. My name is Jeanette Abbott, and I am a  
16 member of Local 638. I'm currently in the  
17 apprenticeship program as a second-year apprentice  
18 and, wow, it has truly changed my life tremendously.  
19 I've gone from working dead-end jobs to basically  
20 being catapulted into being able to support my entire  
21 family, and that speaks volumes. Union jobs takes  
22 someone like me, like I said before, and catapults us  
23 up to a new level. Union work means safe and reliable  
24 construction being built by skilled and experienced  
25 men and women like myself. The Willets Point Project

2 is vital to 638. It means more than jobs. It means  
3 building our economy and putting money back into the  
4 city, and that is the way things should be done.  
5 Being from Queens, I am extremely proud to be a part  
6 of a project that will be truly committed to  
7 providing 100 percent affordable housing, which is  
8 vital to our community. We are New York City, and now  
9 it is time to show the rest of the country how not to  
10 just build buildings, but to also build and  
11 strengthen our entire community and our economy.

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Ms. Abbott.  
13 And last, Mr. Reyes.

14 RAYMON REYES: Yes, how are you doing?  
15 Thank you, Chairman Riley, Members of the Assembly  
16 Committee, (INAUDIBLE). My name is Ramon Reyes. I  
17 have been a member of 32BJ and, for five years,  
18 worked for Rise Board Community Partnership. I am  
19 part of the Residential Division. The SEIU 32BJ is  
20 dedicated to representing the interests of 175  
21 members across 11 states in Washington, D.C. Our  
22 union members are the pillars of the property  
23 services sector here in New York City, performing  
24 crucial roles in the commercial residential  
25 buildings, stadiums, airports, and multitudes of

1 other locations. Our diverse membership shares common  
2 goal to elevate employment standards throughout our  
3 industries. SEIU 32BJ has secured a credible  
4 commitment for Related for the creation of good  
5 permanent jobs within the residential housing aspect  
6 of the project. Additionally, we have a credible  
7 commitment from the NYCFC for good stadium jobs.  
8 Those commitments ensure job standards where they  
9 will adhere to prevailing wage wages and benefit  
10 standards which 32BJ has diligently fought for and  
11 achieved within the industry. The inclusion of the  
12 NYCFC stadium in the proposal is a crucial component  
13 of the job growth in the area. Our members have a  
14 track record for working in the stadiums across New  
15 York City, including in iconic venues like MSG, Citi  
16 Field. The football club new flagship home will join  
17 the ranks of New York City stadiums that generate  
18 quality jobs in the area for union build to pose  
19 construction's positions showcasing the positive  
20 impact of the well-crafted job that we have on the  
21 community. The SEIU 32BJ is proud to support the  
22 reimagining Willets Point Project, and we believe it  
23 will (INAUDIBLE) substantial economy growth and  
24

2 investment in the City of New York. Thank you for  
3 your time today.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Mr. Reyes,  
5 and thank you to the panel. You're now excused.

6 The last panel that is presenting in  
7 person will be Mildred Santana, Chris Batres, and  
8 Edith King.

9 Is Edith King here? No?

10 Okay, Ms. Mildred Santana, you may begin.

11 MILDRED SANTANA: Good afternoon. Hello,  
12 Mr. Chairman Riley and Council Members. My name is  
13 Mildred Santana, and I'm a member from the Hotel  
14 Gaming and Traders Council. I am probably resident  
15 from Queens, especially from the area of Corona. I've  
16 been living there for over 26 years since I came from  
17 my country. I am here to share my support in support  
18 of my union, HTC, for the Willets Point and also to  
19 provide dozens of good hospitality jobs and with a  
20 new soccer stadium and 1,000 new apartments. This  
21 project is going to be a huge for surrounding  
22 neighborhood. I urge to the Committee and the City  
23 Council to approve this project. As a member of the  
24 union and also as a person that live in the area, I  
25 think that it will be a huge change.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Ms.  
3 Santana.

4 Last, Mr. Chris Batres.

5 CHRIS BATRES: Thank you very much. My  
6 name is Chris Batres. I'm a proud resident of Queens  
7 and a voting union member of Carpenters Union. I  
8 stand before you today to advocate for job creations,  
9 family-sustaining wages at the Willets Point Soccer  
10 Studying Project. This endeavor presents a remarkable  
11 opportunity, not just for economic growth, but for  
12 the betterment of the entire community. First and  
13 foremost, let's recognize the power of the good jobs.  
14 They are not just about paychecks. They're about  
15 dignity, stability, and prosperity for our families.  
16 By ensuring that the jobs created at the Willets  
17 Point soccer stadium are high quality, we're not only  
18 securing a brighter future for ourselves but also for  
19 generations to come. Moreover, investing in a good  
20 job is investing in our community's well-being. When  
21 workers are treated fairly and compensated justly  
22 just can contribute more meaningful to our local  
23 economy. They can afford to shop in our businesses,  
24 invest in our schools, and strain the fabric of our  
25 neighborhoods, but this is isn't about economics.

2 It's about values. As a union member, I know  
3 firsthand the importance of fairness, equality, and  
4 opportunity. By standing up for good jobs at the  
5 Willets Point soccer stadium, we're standing up for  
6 these principles. We're saying that every worker  
7 deserves respect, every family deserves security, and  
8 every community deserves prosperity so let's seize  
9 this moment to build something truly remarkable.  
10 Let's ensure that the jobs created at the Willets  
11 Point soccer stadium project are not just any jobs,  
12 but good jobs, jobs that uplift our community,  
13 empower our workers, and inspire our future.  
14 Together, let's make this vision a reality. Thank you  
15 very much.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much. I  
17 want to give the floor to Council Member Moya.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you, Chair.  
19 It's just a quick comment. I just want to say to my  
20 union brothers and sisters, you're just not building  
21 a structure. You're building something that is going  
22 to be there for generations to come, where you can  
23 actually point to your children and your  
24 grandchildren and say I helped build that stadium. I  
25 transformed this area that was once the Valley of

2 Ashes, that was an area where the junkyards used to  
3 exist, and now you've made a difference to creating a  
4 brand-new neighborhood for the first time in New York  
5 City in four decades, and it couldn't have been done  
6 without that support that we have received from the  
7 community and the tireless effort that always comes  
8 in from our union brothers and sisters, and I thank  
9 you for that.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much.  
11 You're excused. Thank you.

12 Now, we're going to go to the online  
13 testimony. I'm going to call on Jenny Lando,  
14 Washington Torres, Sergio Munoz, and Chelsea Quito.

15 We're going to first start with Jenny  
16 Lando. Jenny, if you can hear me, you may begin.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Jenny, if you can hear  
19 me, you may begin.

20 Okay, if we don't have Jenny, can we go  
21 to Washington Torres?

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

23 JENNY LANDO: Hi, this is Jenny. I was  
24 just promoted.

25 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Oh, go ahead, Jenny.

2 JENNY LANDO: Sorry. Hi, good afternoon,  
3 Chairperson Riley and other Committee Members. My  
4 name is Jenny Lando. I'm a native New Yorker, and  
5 I've lived in three of the five boroughs. I currently  
6 reside in Astoria in Tiffany Cabán's district 22. I'm  
7 a parent and an educator and a dedicated and  
8 passionate supporter.

9 WASHINGTON TORRES: I'm hearing the other  
10 person. I don't know if I'm supposed to speak or  
11 what.

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: No, just wait one  
13 second, Mr. Torres. We're going to go with Jenny,  
14 okay? We'll come right back to you after.

15 JENNY LANDO: I strongly support the Phase  
16 2 part of the Willets Point Project. In 2014, while  
17 my two young daughters and I were watching the World  
18 Cup, we saw an ad for an MLS team coming to New York  
19 City. I turned to my husband and said we are going to  
20 become a fan family, and he turned to me and said I  
21 don't like soccer so we only bought two full season  
22 tickets, and I alternated which kid came to games  
23 with me, and now I've been a season ticket holder for  
24 10 years, and we are still happily married. Since our  
25 first home opener to the most recent this past

weekend, we, my family and many other NYCFC supporters have been hoping for our own stadium. Our boys in blue deserve it, even when they are not winning games, and especially after bringing the MLS Cup to New York City in 2021. Community Board 7 did their due diligence, Queens Borough President Richards carefully determined how to strengthen the Willets Point plan, Dan Garodnick and the City Planning Commission approved it and, now, after providing testimony to all of them, I am here to ask you to help us build our own stadium and a new public school and more affordable housing in Queens and a hotel and even new streets. How often do you get this opportunity? One which would come with a world class soccer team and an organization which has already invested a decade of good work here. I work at a Queens public school and bring many of our parents and students to NYCFC games annually. I'm hopeful this project will bring the beautiful game to more young people and families in our city. As well, the proximity of a K-8 school near a professional soccer stadium can only lead to some interesting career day and community service opportunities. As a lifelong New Yorker, I can say that this project will

2 unequivocally help make my community, my borough, and  
3 my city stronger, and I hope that the City Council  
4 votes to keep the..

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Your time  
6 has expired.

7 JENNY LANDO: Willets Point Project moving  
8 forward. Thank you for your time.

9 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we'll  
10 hear from Washington Torres.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

12 WASHINGTON TORRES: Hello, good afternoon.  
13 Can you hear me?

14 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you.

15 WASHINGTON TORRES: Okay. Hello, New York  
16 City Council Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises.  
17 My name is Washington J. Torres. I speak to you today  
18 as a loud-and-proud born-and-raised New Yorker and  
19 resident of Forest Hills, Queens, New York. I'm also  
20 a husband, a father, a registered voter, a veteran of  
21 the United States Navy, and a fellow civil servant  
22 with the New York City Fire Department, FDNY, and a  
23 proud founding member of New York City Football Club,  
24 also known as NYCFC. I'm in full support of approving  
25 the Phase 2 redevelopment of Willets Point project,

2 which includes, among other things, a new school, the  
3 construction of affordable housing, and the NYCFC  
4 Stadium. Queens is the world's borough and soccer is  
5 the world's sport. It's only fitting that NYCCFC's  
6 home be located in Queens. I strongly urge you to  
7 recommend the...

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Mr. Torres, you're  
9 breaking up.

10 WASHINGTON TORRES: (INAUDIBLE) support  
11 the project (INAUDIBLE) construction of a new school  
12 (INAUDIBLE)

13 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Mr. Torres, we can  
14 barely hear you. You're breaking up.

15 WASHINGTON TORRES: This project will put  
16 Willets Point on the global (INAUDIBLE) Many people  
17 (INAUDIBLE) city of London, but only (INAUDIBLE)  
18 people know the neighborhood of Wembley in London is  
19 because of Wembley Stadium. Many people know the city  
20 of Barcelona, but the only reason to be, oh, no, I'll  
21 try to my best, but (INAUDIBLE) when an area is known  
22 globally, then the local government (INAUDIBLE) I  
23 don't know if I have a bad communication. Can you  
24 hear me now? You hear me now?

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: You're going in and  
3 out but, if we can't hear you, you can always submit  
4 a written testimony to us as well. Okay. Thank you.

5 Next, we're going to hear from Sergio  
6 Munoz. Sergio, if you can hear me, please unmute and  
7 you may begin.

8 SERGIO MUNOZ: Hello, everyone. I am  
9 Sergio Munoz. I'm Queens resident, an architect, and  
10 a local small business owner. I'm also a very proud  
11 founding member of New York City Football Club. The  
12 proposed project for the new community, including the  
13 stadium, is already a positive impact in the  
14 community, even before it is approved. Something  
15 great happening already, the improvement of the area,  
16 the contamination, and the programs that the club  
17 have with the local schools and nightlife. Also,  
18 great benefit for the future, thousands of  
19 construction and permanent jobs, local hiring  
20 practices. It means that a lot of Queens residents  
21 will be able to live and work in a brand-new  
22 neighborhood. Local business opportunity and big  
23 opportunities helping to expedite a new police  
24 presence. The fact that it's surrounded by public  
25 transportation makes the perfect location for the

1 stadium. The fact that we will have an average of 17  
2 to 25 games per year will not generate a major  
3 schedule coordination with the Mets. Games will not  
4 be at the same time as the Citi Field on the NYCFC  
5 new stadium. The stadium will provide community  
6 spaces, city square, where the community will have  
7 access to recreational and relaxing areas while no  
8 soccer games are in progress. Also, it will serve as  
9 a team headquarters so it will be a continuous use  
10 during the entire year. Since the stadium is only  
11 25,000 seats, we can expect less impact compared to a  
12 Mets game. Also, we already played some games at the  
13 Citi Field without major impact that the area is  
14 custom to handle at the time of the games. The  
15 stadium will be sustainable, including solar panels  
16 generating electricity continuously. All the energy  
17 generated not used for the stadium will be sent back  
18 to the Con Edison grid so it can be redistributed in  
19 the neighborhood. No major battery storage will be  
20 required for the stadium.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you so much. Your  
23 time has expired.

24 SERGIO MUNOZ: Hello?  
25

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we'll  
3 hear from Chelsea Quito.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

5 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Chelsea, if you can  
6 hear me you may begin.

7 CHELSEA QUITO: Hi, I think the Committee  
8 Room is muted so I don't know if you called me.

9 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: We can hear you.

10 SERGIO MUNOZ: My apologies. Okay, I'm on  
11 the screen. Hello. Hi, my name is Chelsea Quito. I  
12 was born and raised in the South Bronx by amazing,  
13 hard-working Ecuadorian parents. I joined the City in  
14 the Community Foundation proudly supported by New  
15 York City Football Club when I was 17, and I have  
16 been actively involved for a little over six years  
17 now. I gained numerous opportunities through City in  
18 the Community programming, leading to my nomination a  
19 recipient of the ESPN Billie Jean King Humanitarian  
20 Award in 2020. I am honored to say that I have served  
21 as a volunteer, summer soccer block program, and  
22 after school coach, Youth Leadership Council leader,  
23 Young Leader Training coordinator, it's a mouthful,  
24 and currently I work part time with the club as  
25 special projects lead at CITC Foundation. I am truly

2 touched by all the help I've received from the CITC  
3 Foundation and the club since the beginning. Looking  
4 ahead, I'm filled with hope and excitement about the  
5 many people we're going to help and change for the  
6 better through our work together. Thank you for  
7 listening.

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much.  
9 There being no questions, this applicant panel is  
10 excused.

11 The last applicant panel that we are  
12 going to hear from is David Vazquez, Jennifer  
13 Quezada, and Xan Cambiero. I'm so sorry if I butcher  
14 your name.

15 We'll begin first with David Vazquez.  
16 David, if you can hear me, please unmute and you may  
17 begin.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: David Vazquez, if you  
20 can hear me, please unmute.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: We're just going to go  
23 on pause real quick.

24

25

2 CHELSEA QUITO: Hi, sorry, the Committee  
3 Room is muted, so I can't hear anything. I don't know  
4 how to.

5 ZOOM HOST: Hi, Chelsea. If you can hear  
6 me, please bear with us. Just one second. Thank you.

7 CHELSEA QUITO: Okay, thank you.

8 WASHINGTON TORRES: (INAUDIBLE) technical  
9 difficulties (INAUDIBLE), will I be allowed to  
10 testify again since I got cut off. I'm not sure.

11 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I'm sorry everyone.  
12 We're just having technical difficulties. We're just  
13 trying to figure it out and then we're going to  
14 resume. We should have just one more panel to testify  
15 and then we should conclude, all right. Just give me  
16 one second.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: This is a test  
18 on Zoom to confirm that you can hear the Committee  
19 Room.

20 ZOOM HOST: Zoom Host can hear you. Thank  
21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I'm now  
23 calling on David Vazquez. David Vazquez, if you can  
24 hear me, please unmute and you may begin.

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Mr. Vasquez, can you  
3 hear me?

4 DAVID VAZQUEZ: Hello? Can you hear me?

5 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you.

6 DAVID VAZQUEZ: Perfect. Thank you,  
7 everyone. You've heard a lot already today about the  
8 affordable housing, the common space, the hotel and,  
9 besides that, the club has done a lot of work for the  
10 community already, like the mini pitches built around  
11 the city. Besides the stadium being privately funded,  
12 which is a huge change to recent deals that we've  
13 seen in the state and surrounding states, instead of  
14 having a team threatening to leave the area if they  
15 don't get required subsidies, we have a team more  
16 than willing to invest in the community they reside  
17 in. But beyond all of that, I just want to speak on  
18 an intangible benefit, which is how it brings New  
19 Yorkers together. I've been fortunate to follow this  
20 team from its inception. Because of this team, I've  
21 met hundreds of fellow New Yorkers I otherwise  
22 wouldn't have met, and these aren't just some like  
23 acquaintances that I see a couple times a year. These  
24 are people who have gotten me through loss of life  
25 situations, recovering from traumatic injuries. These

are the people I had in my wedding. In my experience, fans have been extremely welcoming to newcomers and continue to have new people come to matches.

Recently, we've even started noticing a new generation of fans popping up which speaks to the welcoming nature of fans and it bodes well for the team's future. Last year, Gallup and Meta conducted a joint study, the results of which stated that nearly one in four people worldwide feel very or fairly lonely. This team is the reason why so many of our fans don't fall into that category. Results on the pitch aside, they've created and fostered this community. I'm proud to support this project, and I look forward to the day that we can further share our love of this club and city with others. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we'll hear from Jennifer Quezada. Jennifer, if you can hear me, please unmute and you may begin.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

JENNIFER QUEZADA: Hi. Good afternoon, City Council Members. It's an honor to be on this call. My name is Jennifer Quezada, founder and CEO of Digital Moda. At Digital Moda, we specialize in assisting businesses across various industries and

bringing their ideas to life, particularly in the garment manufacturing industry, and I am proud to express my support for this remarkable project.

During the challenging times of the pandemic, Digital Moda collaborated closely with New York City Football Club, leveraging our production expertise to manufacture essential personal protective equipment for the City of New York. Witnessing NYCFC's unwavering commitment to serving the city and residents was truly inspiring. Their dedication to sustainability as demonstrated by repurposing their jerseys to create PPEs during the height of the COVID-19 crisis exemplifies their values. As a native New Yorker and a small business owner, I can attest NYCFC's effectiveness in supporting local communities and entrepreneurs through various initiatives such as grant programs, strategic partnerships, their genuine efforts to uplift small businesses resonate deeply with me. My parents immigrating to this country from Ecuador with a single goal to make a positive impact on their community, both here and abroad, I am proud to know and feel that I'm following in their footsteps through collaborating with NYCFC, not just during the pandemic, but on ongoing efforts to

2 support other small businesses. Small businesses are  
3 the lifeblood of New York City, and they continue  
4 that partnership, underscoring their commitment to  
5 the city by adding onto the entrepreneur ecosystem.  
6 In conclusion, I wholeheartedly endorse New York City  
7 FC on this project and their endeavors to foster  
8 community engagement, sustainability, and support for  
9 small businesses with this historical project, a  
10 historical project that will continue on for  
11 generations. Thank you, everyone.

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we'll  
13 hear from Xan Cambiero.

14 Xan, if you can hear me, please unmute  
15 and you may begin, and excuse me if I butchered your  
16 name.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

18 XAN CAMBIERO: Good afternoon. My name is  
19 Xan Cambiero. I have been running youth soccer  
20 programs in Queens for 36 years. I was an educator  
21 with the New York City Department of Ed for 31 of  
22 those years. It was my intention to be at the City  
23 Council this morning but, because my program is about  
24 to start here in Flushing, I had to do it online. As  
25 a matter of fact, my kids are coming in. Just wait a

second, guys. I'm sorry for this. It's delayed today. New York City has been supporting our soccer program since the inception in 2015. That first year, they already helped us get equipment that was badly needed at the time. Other examples of things that they have done for us is they provided coaching for us, they've given us league support, summer jobs to the kids, internships, opportunities for our players to become coaches themselves and three tickets to New York City FC games, including this past Saturday we had about 100 kids at the game. Recently, just a month ago, New York City FC started the Night Light programs at our Flushing campus, which is a wonderful new experience for our kids. Providing opportunities for our young students to grow up as responsible adults is what New York City FC is all about. Soccer is a wonderful, healthy, safe activity that teaches kids how to relate to each other in positive ways and provides a platform for more fulfilling life. Soccer transforms children's lives for the better and, no matter what they choose as a career, it really contributes to them becoming productive members of society. A local soccer stadium is something that is built for them

2 and for the coming generations. We really, really  
3 welcome in Flushing. Thank you very much.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much,  
5 Xam.

6 We're going to pause because we have one  
7 more person who's going to testify.

8 Okay, it looks like we have two more  
9 panels that want to testify. Thank you all for being  
10 patient.

11 The next panel I'm going to call up is  
12 Jennifer Rodriguez, Ingrid Oscal, Jenny Salinas and  
13 Evan Hooks.

14 If you can hear me, Jennifer Rodriguez,  
15 you may unmute and you may begin.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

17 JENNIFER RODRIGUEZ: Hi, good afternoon.  
18 Sorry.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Go ahead, Jennifer.

20 JENNIFER RODRIGUEZ: Hi, good afternoon.  
21 My name is Jennifer Rodriguez, and I was born and  
22 raised in this community. I want to thank and I do  
23 approve this project in my community. It's a great  
24 opportunity for our growing children in this  
25 community and more jobs and equal housing for our

2 families. I want to thank Councilman Francisco Moya  
3 for supporting my school, Pioneer Academy, and our  
4 community, our mixed-race community in Corona,  
5 Queens. I do approve this project, more opportunities  
6 and jobs for our growing children, for our teenagers  
7 that are planning to go to high school and have a  
8 side job to support for their books and their  
9 education. I want to thank everyone that's listening,  
10 and I do approve this project in my community. Thank  
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Next, we'll  
13 hear from Ingrid Oscal. Ingrid, if you can hear me,  
14 you can unmute and begin.

15 INGRID OSCAL: [SPEAKING SPANISH]

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Ingrid.  
17 Next, we're going to hear from Jenny Salinas. Jenny,  
18 if you can hear me, please unmute.

19 Jenny, if you can hear me, please unmute.

20 Okay, until we hear from Jenny, we'll  
21 hear from Evan Hooks. Evan, if you can hear me,  
22 please unmute and you may begin.

23 EVAN HOOKS: Hi, my name is Evan Hooks  
24 from East Elmhurst. I do definitely support this

2 project. I'm glad to see the jobs that it'll bring  
3 into the area. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I believe  
5 we do not have Jenny online so we're going to move  
6 into the next panel.

7 The next panel will consist of Sameer  
8 Mullick, Jason Osborn, and Oswaldo Guzman.

9 We'll begin first with Samir Mullick.

10 Sameer, if you can hear me, please unmute and you may  
11 begin.

12 SAMEER MULLICK: Hello. Can you hear me?

13 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you,  
14 Sameer.

15 SAMEER MULLICK: What's up, guys? It's  
16 Sameer. I'm in favor for this Willets Point. I'd like  
17 to share some experiences as a City in the Community  
18 leader. I remember when I was 15 walking down my  
19 neighborhood that there was NYCFC coaches in a high  
20 school near me. I was thrilled thinking that it's  
21 tryouts and I might make it pro there so I walked up,  
22 and it was actually a Saturday Night Lights program,  
23 a program where City in the Community offers free  
24 soccer for young people like me. I immediately joined  
25 knowing that it was NYCFC and this is the real deal.

2 After joining this program, I got exposed with  
3 different other programs with NYCFC that are career-  
4 oriented like YLC, Youth Leadership Council, where  
5 it's a council where young leaders like me get  
6 mentored and enhance their career-oriented skills,  
7 their leadership skills, their critical thinking  
8 skills. YLC also exposed me with other trainings,  
9 like Young Leadership Training, where even more in-  
10 depth enhanced my leadership skills and critical  
11 thinking and coaching skills as well, which New York  
12 City Football Club and the City in the Community free  
13 coaching and job opportunities. One in specific, it's  
14 called Soccer Block. It's a six-week program where I  
15 get to coach little kids ages 6 to 12. It's a great  
16 way where young leaders could earn money and really  
17 pursue their passion. Also, now I'm an intern  
18 actually right now. See, I'm an intern. This is  
19 actually crazy. I never thought I would ever be an  
20 intern at New York City Football Club, and now I'm a  
21 Community Development Intern, which is absolutely  
22 crazy. I get to mentor people, host fundraisings.  
23 It's crazy and I'm so happy to be here.

24 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I hope you get a  
25 promotion, Sameer.

2 SAMEER MULLICK: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Next, we'll call on  
4 Jason Osborn. You may begin.

5 JASON OSBORN: Good afternoon,  
6 Subcommittee Members, Council Member Moya. My name is  
7 Jason Osborn. I'm here to offer my support to the  
8 project in two capacities. I'm a proud resident of  
9 downtown Flushing, Community Board 7. Secondly, here  
10 to represent on behalf of the Community Preservation  
11 Corporation. We're a non-profit affordable housing  
12 and community develop our community revitalization  
13 company based in New York City. We are long-time  
14 partners with HPD and HCR to finance affordable  
15 housing throughout the state and now across the  
16 country. In my work as a as a lender, I financed  
17 affordable housing throughout the city for the past  
18 10 years. I'm proud alumni of New York City Housing  
19 Development Corporation and very excited to see the  
20 first phase close with HDC and HPD last November. On  
21 a personal level, living in downtown Flushing, I've  
22 seen the rich communities there of Corona and  
23 Flushing and how those community members represent  
24 soccer cultures throughout the world so this is a  
25 very fitting site and a perfect site for a soccer

2 stadium. Being in Flushing for the past 10 years,  
3 I've created a family here. I have a 4-year-old son  
4 who is hopefully attending PS20 or 244Q, which I'll  
5 know this month actually for those parents out there.  
6 My son attends NYC Soccer Kids program for the past  
7 two years, which receives discount tickets from the  
8 club, and I've seen my son develop over the past two  
9 years, which has been amazing to see him develop as a  
10 player and a member of the community. We attended the  
11 home opener last weekend despite the rain and  
12 difficulty with the weather, and this is a very  
13 special thing me and my son have been a part of since  
14 the club has been founded and my son's been born as  
15 well. On a professional level, this site creates a  
16 rare opportunity for affordable housing at a large  
17 scale.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Your time  
19 has expired.

20 JASON OSBORN: Biggest opportunity in 40  
21 years. Thank you for the opportunity.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Lastly,  
23 we'll hear from Oswaldo Guzman.

24 Oswaldo, if you can hear me, please  
25 unmute and you may begin.

2 OSWALDO GUZMAN: Yes. Good afternoon.

3 [SPEAKING SPANISH].

4 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, and we do  
5 have another person. Is this the last one, Andrew?

6 The last person we're going to hear from  
7 is Aretha Wareham. Aretha, if you can hear me, please  
8 unmute and you may begin.

9 Aretha, if you can hear me, please unmute  
10 and you may begin.

11 ARETHA WAREHAM: Hi, hello?

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you,  
13 Aretha.

14 ARETHA WAREHAM: My name is Aretha  
15 Wareham. I've been a long-standing resident, over 40  
16 years in East Elmhurst, and that Willets Point area  
17 has always been an eyesore. This is a long overdue  
18 project. Yes, I approve it. There's been problems  
19 with flooding over there, vermin, garbage. I am for  
20 economic development, affordable housing, senior  
21 apartments, and jobs so yes, I solely, truly support  
22 this project.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Miss  
24 Aretha. Is there anyone else that wants to testify on  
25 the Willets Avenue project whether online, remote, or

2 in here in person. We will stand at ease until we  
3 confirmed that no one here is testifying.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: No, Chair, there  
5 is no one further sign up online or in person to  
6 testify regarding this Willets proposal.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There be no other  
8 members of the public who wish to testify on the pre-  
9 considered LUs to Willets Point 2 proposal, the  
10 public hearing is now closed and the item is laid  
11 over. That concludes today's business.

12 I would like to thank the members of the  
13 public, my Colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land Use  
14 and other Council Staff, and Sergeant-at-Arms for  
15 participating in today's hearing. This meeting is  
16 hereby adjourned. Thank you. [GAVEL]

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 2, 2024