COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 1
CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE

----- X

June 26, 2023

Start: 10:20 a.m. Recess: 11:46 a.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Kamillah Hanks, Public Safety

Committee Chairperson

Selvena N. Brooks-Powers,

Transportation and Infrastructure

Committee Chairperson

PUBLIC SAFETY COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Tiffany Caban

Carmen N. De La Rosa Robert F. Holden

Rita C. Joseph

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 2

TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE COUNCIL MEMBERS:

David M. Carr
Amanda Farias
Ari Kagan
Linda Lee
Farrah N. Louis
Mercedes Narcisse
Carlina Rivera
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Vickie Paladino Oswald Feliz

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Chief Michael Pilecki, Commanding Officer of the Transportation Bureau at the New York Police Department

Deputy Chief Tania Kinsella, Executive Officer of the Patrol Service Bureau at the New York Police Department

Juliane Farruggia, Managing Attorney of the Legislative Affairs Unit at the New York Police Department

Josh Benson, Deputy Commissioner of Traffic Operations at the Department of Transportation

Maureen Kokeas, Director of the Office of Tax Enforcement at the Department of Finance

Marricka Scott-McFadden, Deputy Commissioner of Intergovernmental and Legislative Affairs at the Department of Social Services

Eric McClure. I'm the Executive Director of StreetsPAC

Danny Pearlstein, Policy and Communications Director at the Riders Alliance

Steve Vaccaro

Alex Stein

Jason Fromowitz

2

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone check for the Committee on Transportation joint with the Committee on Public Safety. Recorded on June 26, 2023, located in Chambers by Nazly Paytuvi.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for the Committees on Transportation and Infrastructure joint with Public Safety.

At this time, we ask that you silence all cell phones and electronic devices to minimize disruptions throughout the hearing.

If you have testimony you wish to submit for the record, you may do via email at testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is testimony@council.nyc.gov.

At any time throughout the hearing, please do not approach the dais. We thank you for your cooperation.

Chairs, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [GAVEL] Good morning. I am Council Member Kamillah Hanks, Chair on the Committee of Public Safety. Welcome to today's joint oversight hearing on enforcement of defaced, fraudulent, and expired license plates.

2.2

2.3

I am joined by Council Members Williams,
Carr, Kagan, De La Rosa, Louis, Ariola, Lee, Farias,
Joseph, Paladino, Felix, and Chair Brooks-Powers.

At this hearing, we will also be considering three pieces of legislation in the Public Safety Committee, Introduction 987 sponsored by Council Member Feliz, a bill to create new enforcement authority to prohibit the operation of a motor vehicle with fraudulent or expired license plates, Introduction 988, also sponsored by Council Member Feliz, legislation to create new penalties for the sale or distribution of fraudulent license plates, Introduction 1011 sponsored by Chair Brooks-Powers to provide information on reduced fare programs to individuals arrested or summoned for fare evasion.

I would like to take this time to thank
my Colleagues, Council Member Brooks-Powers, Chair on
the Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure,
and our Staff for their hard work in putting together
this hearing.

As a City, we must work proactively to address the widespread use of defaced, fraudulent, and expired license plates. This illegal behavior

TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 6

poses significant risk to our communities, and we are here today to closely examine NYPD's strategies in combatting this pressing problem. Fraudulent license plates allow individuals to evade law enforcement, tolls, and speed enforcement cameras. This not only

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

tolls, and speed enforcement cameras. This not only
undermines the integrity of our transportation
systems, but it also fosters an environment where

9 criminal activity and reckless driving can flourish

10 unchecked.

2.2

2.3

At this hearing, we will examine the effectiveness of current enforcement strategies, evaluate resources allocated for combatting this issue, and identify areas in which improvement is needed.

When defaced, fraudulent, and expired license plates become rampant in our communities, our streets become less safe and we forego a vital tax revenue. I look forward to hearing to hearing today's testimony from the Administration and how we can collaborate to improve traffic safety, alleviate financial strain to our citizens, and, more importantly, uphold the integrity of our transportation systems.

2.2

2.3

Thank you all for being here, and now I will turn it over to Chair Brooks-Powers for her opening statement. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,

Chair, and good morning, everyone. Thank you for

joining today's joint hearing of the Committee on

Public Safety and the Committee on Transportation and

Infrastructure.

Today's hearing continues a crucial ongoing conversation about how the City can improve street safety, eliminate traffic violence, and realize Vision Zero.

Our speed and redlight cameras do not work when they cannot read a license plate number. That restricts their ability to do what they are designed to do, reduce speeding and reckless driving. Those who deface or distort or otherwise use fraudulent plates know this and are operating outside of the law. We cannot continue to let them. Both the State and City have sought to address this issue legislatively. In October 2021, the State enacted a law to increase the maximum penalty of license plate obstruction to a 300-dollar fine, and in January 2022 the City enacted Local Law 22, which prohibited the

sale or distribution of materials that obscure license plates or distort images on license plates. That law created a fine schedule of 300 dollars for the first violation and at least 500 dollars for any subsequent violation. In recent years, the NYPD has been issuing more tickets and making more arrests for fraudulent or defaced license plates, but simple observation of our roads shows that the problem of such license plates remains. If we do not do more to address the problem, we risk undermining the very effective programs that this City has set up to keep our streets safe.

The first is our redlight camera program operationalized in 1994 as the first such program in the nation. The redlight camera program allows the City to operate cameras at 150 locations throughout the City.

The second is our automatic speed enforcement camera program, which has been in place since 2013. As of 2019, the State enabled the City to place speed enforcement cameras in 750 school speed zones and codified into DOT's practice of using data to guide installations at locations where the

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 9

greatest impact on preventing injury and death could

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

be realized.

The effect of these enforcement programs has been clear. Consider the speed camera. Through December 2021, speeding at fixed camera locations had dropped on average 73 percent. These results led the State to authorize an expansion of operating camera hours to 24 hours a day, seven days a week. From August 1, 2022, to December 20, 2022, according to the New York City Comptroller's Office, New York City's 24/7 speed camera programs have issued nearly 3 million violations, and the City has received nearly 100 million dollars from fines paid during that time. None of those fines, however, were assessed on drivers who obscure their license plates or have obtained them fraudulently. That fact is unfair to drivers who do follow the law, and it is dangerous for all road-users who are forced to share the road with these drivers who operate with relative impunity.

I look forward to questioning the

Administration today on the enforcement of laws

prohibiting fraudulent, defaced, and expired license

plates, gaining more up-to-date statistics on the

2.2

2.3

issue, exploring how we can partner with other states to establish a more uniform system of enforcement and working together to ensure a reduction and use of those so-called ghost plates.

In addition to the oversight portion of today's hearing, I'm excited that we will hear several bills relevant to this issue.

I am proud to be co-prime sponsor on Introduction 987 and 988, which would increase civil fines for driving with fake license plates and for selling or distributing fraudulent plates. I thank Council Member Feliz for his leadership on this issue.

I am also excited to hear my bill,

Introduction 1011, which would require NYPD officers

patrolling in subway stations to carry fliers with

information about what Fair Fares is, who is

eligible, and how to apply. These officers would be

required to give those fliers only, only to any

individual who receives a summons or is arrested for

fare evasion in the subway. At a time when too many

are criminalized just because they cannot pay the

fair, the Administration should at least be required

to take proactive steps to spread more information

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 11

about the Fair Fares program. I note that the Council is fighting hard to ensure this year's budget

5 program to ensure more residents in need can ride at

includes an expansion of the City's Fair Fares

6 a reduced rate.

2.2

2.3

I look forward to hearing from the Administration, advocates, and members of the public regarding the oversight and legislation at this hearing.

I want to thank my Staff and Committee

Staff as well for their hard work, Samuel Breidbart,

Counsel to the Committee, Mark Chen, Counsel to the

Committee, Kevin Kotowski, Senior Policy Analyst,

John Basile, Senior Policy Analyst, Michael Sherman,

Senior Financial Analyst, Jack Seigenthaler, my

Policy and Budget Director, and Renee Taylor, my

Chief-of-Staff. I also want to thank the Public

Safety Committee Staff on their work as well.

With that, we will now hear from Council Member Feliz on Intros 987 and 988.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: All right. Good morning, everyone. I'm Council Member Oswald Feliz.

Thank you, Chairs Hanks and Selvena Brooks-Powers, for this hearing.

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I'll say what we all know. Paper plates have created new issues for the City of New York, issues related to ghost cars, ghost cars that cannot be easily traced and identified and ghost cars that are being used to evade our rules and laws without accountability including our traffic laws such as speeding rules and redlight camera rules but also being used to commit major crimes. These ghost cars and these paper plates are costing us our safety, but they're also costing us resources. The MTA every single year loses tens of millions of dollars every single year through toll evasion due to these fake plates. This is a huge issue. People are using these fake plates very openly. People are also selling these plates very openly. I went on Craig's List yesterday and saw individuals advertising fake plates from Georgia and Jersey, 30-, 45-day plates allegedly with insurance for 150 dollars so this is a huge issue that people are engaging in very openly. We need to fully resolve this issue, and this is an issue that can be best resolved by the federal government given that it involves rules related to, for example, printing plates in Georgia and Texas and New Jersey. However, there is a lot that the City of

Executive Officer of the Patrol Service Bureau;

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 14
2	Juliane Farruggia, the Managing Attorney of the
3	Legislative Affairs Unit. From DOT, we have Josh
4	Benson, Deputy Commissioner of Traffic Operations.
5	From the Department of Finance, we have Maureen
6	Kokeas, the Director of the Office of Tax
7	Enforcement. From DSS, we have Marricka Scott-
8	McFadden, Deputy Commissioner of Intergovernmental
9	and Legislative Affairs.
10	If you could all please raise your right
11	hands?
12	Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
13	whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this
14	Committee and respond honestly to Council Member
15	questions?
16	ADMINISTRATION: (INAUDIBLE)
17	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Seeing all witnesses
18	answered in the affirmative, we can begin testimony
19	in whatever order you prefer.
20	DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Good morning, Chair
21	Hanks, Chair Brooks-Powers, and Members of the
22	Council. I am Deputy Chief Michael Pilecki, the
23	Executive Officer of the New York City Police
24	Department Transportation Bureau. I am joined here

today by Deputy Chief Tania Kinsella, Executive

Officer of the Patrol Service Bureau, Juliane

Farruggia, Managing Attorney of the Legislative

Affairs Unit along with our colleagues, Josh Benson,

Deputy Commissioner of Traffic Operations with the

Department of Transportation, Marricka Scott
McFadden, Deputy Commissioner of Intergovernmental

8 and Legislative Affairs with the Department of Social

9 Services, and Maureen Kokeas, Director of the Office

of Tax Enforcement with the Department of Finance. On

behalf of Police Commissioner Keechant Sewell, I am

12 here to testify before your Committees on the

13 proliferation of fraudulent and expired license

14 plates throughout the city and the Department's

15 efforts to combat their use.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

One of the many unforeseen consequences of the pandemic was the sharp increase in the use of temporary paper license plates, particularly the plates seemingly issued by other states. The COVID lockdowns forced DMVs in every state to close for longer periods than expected. This required repeated extensions on the expiration dates of registrations and license plates, which also relaxed enforcement on paper tags. Whether due to complacency on the part of drivers, a willingness to take the risk or as a means

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 16 of giving cars untraceable anonymity during violent crimes, we continue to see the number of expired plates far outpacing pre-pandemic levels. Many out of state DMVs are still allowing the online registration of motor vehicles with the printing of temporary paper plates. This has unfortunately enabled a black market in the printing and sale of temporary license plates, leading to rampant fraud. Any vehicle bearing one of these fraudulent plates instantly becomes undetectable to nearly every aspect of street-level enforcement, from tolls to speed and red light cameras and even parking enforcement. They become ghost cars to the system and evade enforcement on a widespread scale. For example, these cars often park illegally in bike and bus lanes, in crosswalks, and at hydrants, causing hazardous conditions for pedestrians, bicyclists, and drivers alike. These cars are also involved in hit and runs of both pedestrians and other motorists, leaving innocent bystanders injured and without recourse. Summonses issued to these vehicles are unenforceable, and scofflaws know that, often leaving towing as the only effective countermeasure. For that reason, the

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

Department continues to prioritize vehicles with temporary paper license plates for towing.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Despite the outbreak of fraudulent and covered plates, the Department remains undeterred in its efforts to prevent these scofflaws from continuing to plague our streets. Last year, we issued 258,000 summonses to vehicles with covered or obstructed plates, arrested nearly 4,200 drivers for forged or altered plates, and seized 7,520 cars that had fraudulent paper plates or were parked illegally while displaying a temporary paper plate. So far this year, we have already issued over 130,000 summonses to vehicles with covered or obstructed plates, arrested 1,777 drivers for forged or altered plates, and towed over 1,100 vehicles this year for obstructed or covered plates. We are also continuing our educational outreach to all the auto parts stores throughout the city to ensure compliance with legislation recently passed by Council that prohibits the sale of plate covers.

The use of fraudulent plates goes beyond parking, speeding, and toll evasion. Their use by recidivist criminals poses another threat to public safety. Savvy criminals have learned that ghost cars

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 18 2 help make them ghost perpetrators. We have connected fraudulent and counterfeit paper license plates to 3 4 murders and armed robberies as well as any number of violent crimes. We have even seen the same plate 5 fleeing the scene of separate crimes but on different 6 7 cars. Of the 1,777 arrests made so far this year where the paper license plate was forged, the top 8 charge was criminal possession of a weapon in 13 of the arrests, criminal possession of a controlled 10 11 substance in 37 arrests, criminal possession of 12 stolen property in 14 arrests, DWI in 9 arrests and 13 grand larceny auto in 7 arrests. Addressing these issues is a daily focus for the NYPD and the 14 15 Administration. That is why last year, Mayor Adams 16 announced the formation of the Vehicle License Plate 17 Working Group which joins together members from NYPD, 18 DOT, MTA, the Port Authority, the Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority, State Police, the Sheriffs, and 19 the District Attorneys for strategy sessions. The 20 goal is to apply shared knowledge to attack the 21 2.2 problem from every possible angle using a holistic 2.3 approach to each challenge posed by flouting the

license plate and registration laws.

1 2

2.2

2.3

Administration-wide focus on this wideranging problem as well our collaboration with law
enforcement and motor vehicle departments in other
states will continue to enable the Department to
quickly and effectively identify these fraudulent
plates and get these cars and the criminals who use
them off the streets.

I would now like to turn to the bills being heard today. Intro. 987 would prohibit the operation of a motor vehicle bearing fraudulent or expired license plates, including fraudulent or expired temporary plates. The bill creates a civil penalty returnable to the Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings for fraudulent plates of 500 dollars for the first offense and 1,000 dollars for any subsequent offenses and a civil penalty for expired plates of 300 dollars for the first offense and 500 dollars for any subsequent offenses, which are higher than the penalties imposed under the state Vehicle and Traffic Law.

Intro. 988 would prohibit the sale or distribution of fraudulent license plates, including fraudulent temporary plates. The bill creates a civil penalty returnable to OATH of not less than 1,000

dollars for the first violation, and not less than 2,000 dollars for any subsequent offense.

The Administration certainly welcomes any additional tools to combat the use of fraudulent and expired plates, especially temporary plates, and looks forward to working with the Council and the sponsors on ways we can assist in promoting this important program.

Intro. 1011 would require officers assigned to patrol any subway station to carry flyers created by the Department of Social Services/Human Rights Administration regarding reduced fare programs offered by the City, and to distribute them to each individual who is arrested or summonsed for theft of services, trespass, criminal trespass, or fare evasion. The Department supports equitable fare programs that encourage legal entry into the transit system and looks forward to working with the Council and the sponsor on the most effective way to achieve the bill's goals.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify about these important issues, and we look

2.2

2.3

forward to answering any questions that you may have.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I appreciate your testimony. We're going to jump right into questions.

In 2002, the Council enacted Local Law 22 which relates to the unlawful sale of materials that obscure license plates. How has the City implemented this law and has there been an increase of enforcement by NYPD since this law was enacted?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: There has, and there's a few things that we've been doing to address this issue.

I'll first start by saying and laying a little groundwork the Transportation Bureau holds weekly Traffic Safety Forum meetings which are similar to the COMPStat meetings that the Department holds to reduce crime. Each week, the Chief of Transportation and myself host the executives from a particular borough, which would be all the precinct executive officers so, for example, if we were going to hold a meeting with the Bronx Commanders, all the executive officers of the Bronx precincts would come down to headquarters along with the one-star Chief

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

from the borough, the executive officer, who was responsible for the borough's traffic safety plan. At those meetings, we discuss each precinct's traffic safety plan. We discuss the statistics regarding collisions with injuries, pedestrians, bicyclists, fatalities, and we ensure that the precincts are focused on addressing the recent spikes in accidents,

collisions in particular areas effectively.

At the beginning of each meeting, and I would say generally for half of the meeting, and they're generally two hours, at the beginning of each meeting we hold an information session where we discuss things as covered license plates with the executives. We discuss the fact that although covered plates are illegal to put on a vehicle anywhere in New York State or put on a parked vehicle anywhere in New York State, in New York City they're illegal to sell. We disseminate that information to our executives, and we direct them to have their traffic safety personnel, each precinct has a traffic safety team, which is generally three, four, or five officers, and we direct them to have those traffic safety officers visit stores such as Auto Zone or other auto parts stores that would sell these types

2.2

2.3

of devices and just inform them that they're illegal to sell in New York City, to first give them a warning and then to follow up to make sure that they have, in fact, removed them from sale and, if they are still there, to summons them and notify our Legal Bureau for the issuance of a cease and desist letter. I can tell you we started pushing this about two months ago, and already we've had about 25 to 30 visits throughout the City by our traffic safety personnel so we're encouraged by that. We think we're going to make some good ground on that.

Also, City Hall a while back had been in conversation with the Transportation Bureau about this, and we had provided City Hall with a list of locations that were selling these things online,

Amazon in particular, and City Hall had taken the lead on that and had been in conversation with Amazon to get them to stop selling these license plate covers, not just in New York City but in New York

State because they're illegal anywhere in New York

State so I know that's being done as well.

With regard to the enforcement that our officers and traffic agents are conducting out there,

I can give you some data. With regard to moving

2.2

2.3

violations issued to vehicles with covered or obstructed plates, so far this year we're up 151 percent in moving violations, 6,321 so far this year versus 2,513 last year.

With regard to summonses issued to motorcycles with covered or obstructed plates, we have 992 of those. I was unable to get data on where we stood so far last year to compare.

With regard to parking summonses issued to vehicles with covered or obstructed plates, we're up 0.8 percent over last year, 123,741 versus 122,813.

With regard to obstructed plate parking summonses to motorcycles, we have 786 of those.

With regard to the towing of vehicles with covered or obstructed license plates, we're up 192 percent in that area. We have 1,104 tows of that type versus 351 last year.

So the information is getting out to our police officers and our traffic agents. We think they're responding well. We think the actions taken by City Hall are going to be helpful in getting Amazon and other online retailers to stop selling these things to people in New York City and the

State, and I think the visits to the auto parts stores is going to be worthy and helpful as well.

2.2

2.3

That was exactly what I wanted to know, but I also want, you testified that you've been looking at this for the past two months and there have been 25 to 30 visits and now you can quantify, and I really appreciate that data of how many moving violations, covered plates, all of the things that you were talking about that I'm making notes on, but explain to me and my Colleagues what is the process so when you say that, what is the difference between a violation, when do you tow, just describe the process in which NYPD traffic is going through, identifying, then issuing a violation, and then what are the other steps that are taken?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Sure. Our traffic agents are the ones that issue the parking summonses for the most part throughout the City. They issue roughly 8 million parking summonses per year. Our police officers are the ones who issue the moving violations summonses.

We make it a priority for our traffic agents out in the field, and we direct them that when

2.2

2.3

they come across a vehicle that has a covered license plate, it's illegal to park their car on a New York City street, so regardless of whether that vehicle is committing any other type of violation, we want them to summons that vehicle and tow it for that violation so it doesn't have to necessarily be parked in a nostanding or a no-stopping. If it's otherwise parked illegally and it has a plastic cover over that plate, we want them summonsing and towing the vehicle.

They'll tow that vehicle into the tow pound. When the owner comes to reclaim that vehicle, we require the owner to remove that plastic from the plate before we will return the vehicle.

The police officers, again, they're the ones who are out there observing traffic. They see vehicles with obstructed or covered license plates, they pull the vehicle over to the side of the road, they'll issue the appropriate summons to the motorist.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. That's exactly what I would like to know.

Does the Department of Consumer and
Worker Protection enforce provisions of Local Law 22
on local businesses? Are there any licensed

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 27 2 businesses that might be at risk of losing City 3 licenses for selling materials that obscure license 4 plates? DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Don't know the 6 answer to that. I'm sorry. 7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, let's try to find an answer to that. 8 9 Which of the City agencies enforce local or state laws related to the unlawful operation of a 10 11 motor vehicle with fraudulent or expired license 12 plates? 13 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Fraudulent plates. 14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Right. 15 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: So a fraudulent 16 license plate can be enforced by any police agency in 17 the state. It's possession of a forged instrument. 18 The issue is that when an officer pulls a vehicle 19 over to conduct an investigatory cause stop, there's 20 a few things that we found out from our working 21 group. 2.2 One is very interesting. When our 2.3 officers conduct an investigatory cause stop and they want to check a registration plate or a motorist's 24

license, they check it through the New York State

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Police Information Network, which we refer to as NYSPIN. NYSPIN has information on paper temporary plates from only 10 states within the country. The other 40 states do not provide New York State with that information so it makes it a little bit more difficult for our officers conducting those types of cause stops.

I'll just give you some information on what we've seen. New Jersey was a problem with us for a while. One of the issues was that New Jersey is not one of the states that provided information to NYSPIN. Our officers would literally have to call up the New Jersey Commission on Motor Vehicles to get information on a particular plate. They had a bar code on their plates that our officers could not scan. A while back, I would say about a year ago, Jersey came up with a QR code on their plates so it makes it a lot easier for our officers now when they're conducing an investigatory cause stop to determine the legitimacy of that plate. They literally can scan it and get all the information necessary to make sure that it matches the vehicle properly, etc., so that one thing that you had mentioned, who can conduct enforcement? Any law

enforcement officers can conduct enforcement on forged plates. I hope that answers your question.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much.
You've come prepared. I'm very excited about that.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: What roles does the

Auto Crimes Unit play in enforcement of provisions

related to defaced license plates and have there been
any directives for officers on patrol to expand

related enforcement?

they really are our experts when it comes to the identification of fraudulent plates. They liaison with other states, other cities, other agencies, and are constantly updating our training material with regard to what's current and what's changed on certain plates. They are trainers. They conduct investigations based on information that they obtain, possibly from informants, or the Council Member had mentioned before information he obtained online on temporary plates being sold, they follow up on those investigations, they effect arrests. One thing can lead to another. They might start with a paper plate that might end up taking them to narcotics or stolen

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 30

cars, etc., so Auto Crime plays a big role in this for us.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Last.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Last question before I pass it along to Chair Brooks-Powers. What efforts has NYPD or the City done to coordinate with other jurisdictions to investigate out of state businesses that are suspected of issuing fraudulent license plates?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: That's something that our Legal Bureau can certainly look into, coordinating to get them to stop, Craig's List and other online retailers that offer these things for sale, to serve them with the cease and desist letters as well.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

Chair Brooks-Powers.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you and thank you for those responses.

I wanted to start by talking about Vision Zero and safety. What ways do defaced, fraudulent, and/or expired license plates undermine street safety, and does the NYPD how many street safety incidents involve vehicles with defaced, fraudulent, or expired plates?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: So far this year, there were four fatalities that involved paper plates. All those plates were determined to be legitimate paper plates. They were fraudulent or defaced.

Certainly, there is an issue involved with getting these plates off of the streets because, as we previously mentioned, when you commit a crime and you have one of these license plates on your vehicle and they're not detectable, there's no way for a detective to follow up. It makes it much more difficult so, to that extent, it's a hurdle.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you feel like they're more likely to be involved in hit and runs. I know it's kind of hard to tell if it's one that's not necessarily traceable and they leave the scene per se.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yeah. I don't have any data on that. I wish I did. I honestly can't say. I could dig a little deeper and get back to you on that.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Are there Vision Zero related summonses issued for defaced, fraudulent, and/or expired license plates...

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Like is there one specific for that?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yes. I could tell you very quickly so far this year with regards to forged license plates, we've effected 1,777 arrests, and I broke it out by borough, and it turns out that the Bronx had the highest number of arrests with 488 followed by Brooklyn with 487, Manhattan 375, Queens 362, and Staten Island 65. When I took a look at the year-end in 2022 versus 2021, we were up in arrests in by 17 percent, 4,199 in 2022 versus 3,568 in 2021. I then looked at where we stood in 2022 versus 2019 because we often compare where we stand versus 2019, pre-pandemic. We're actually up 257 percent in those types of arrests versus 2019, which is really good stuff, 4,199 in 2022 versus 1,178 in 2019, so we continually push this at our traffic safety forums that I mentioned. Every week, we're talking to 12 executives from a particular borough. We discuss this. We discuss covered plates, fraudulent plates, and we think we're getting a good response from the officers?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And what is that attributed to from your perspective?

the increase in the arrests?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: What specifically?

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: In terms of

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: I think the fact that we explain to our officers the importance of getting these cars off of the street. Auto Crime has prepared some really excellent training material that makes it easier for the officers to identify these plates out in the street because ordinarily if you didn't have the material that would explain that, for example, a Texas temporary tag would have seven digits that have to begin with a letter. When you pull over a Texas plate and you have one that begins with a number, you know that you have a fraudulent plate and you dig a little deeper so these tidbits they got out to patrol, our officers out there in the field, they're more aware of what's a fraudulent plate versus a legitimate plate. It just makes it a little easier for them.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You mentioned that towing was much more effective so why is there

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE more of the summonses and arrests versus the towing 2 3 since you find that to be more effective? 4 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Because the arrests are effected by police officers stopping moving 5 vehicles so they take those people into custody, they 6 7 charge them with forgery, that vehicle is taken into 8 custody, the plate as evidence. The vehicles that are towed are issued parking summonses by our traffic agents, and the traffic agent would then call a tow 10 11 truck to respond to the scene to remove the vehicle. 12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So they're 13 towing that car, giving them a parking ticket, but is the City getting the money back for the charging for 14 15 the towing? 16 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: There are a couple 17 of different things. If it's a covered license plate, 18 yeah, the City would get the money for the towing certainly, and we would require ... 19 20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: From the 21 person who... 2.2 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Who comes to redeem 2.3 the vehicle. So now we have the other vehicle, say with a temporary plate, in custody. Let me just see 24

if I can find a piece of data here because there's an

interesting piece of information. With the paper plate tows, so far this year we have 1,084 vehicles towed with paper plates, not necessarily fraudulent but just vehicles with paper plates. Of that number, 356 were unclaimed and went to auction, so we always find that of the total number of paper plates, and this is historic, generally more than 25 percent are unclaimed by their owners and go to auction, and these are legitimate temporary plates.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Why do you think that is?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: I don't know.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That's interesting that they would leave their cars. I think some of my Colleagues are going to have some more followup questions on that. That is pretty interesting data.

Moving on the New York City redlight and speed camera programs. We know defaced, fraudulent, and/or expired license plates are utilized to evade redlight and speed camera programs. Does DOT track the number of vehicles with such license plates who have evaded redlight or speed cameras?

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: Good morning, Chair, and thank you for the question.

Yes, we do track the number of vehicles that are evading accountability for our automated enforcement programs, and it's a small portion of the total number of violators, but it's, as you rightly noted and your Colleagues rightly noted, this is a concern that there are some people out there who are using these tactics to evade accountability for their violations.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How many in 2022 versus 2021, and have we seen more evasion in the past few years?

question. Going back to 2019, as the Chief pointed out, that's the place that we like to look back for kind of comparing today's behavior against prepandemic. We used to see fewer than 1 percent of violations were untraceable due to temporary plate, no license plate, or unreadable or obscured license plate, and in recent months, this is a statistic that changes month-by-month, but it's been in the 5 percent range I would say so it is elevated from where it was before the pandemic. There's a number of

2.2

2.3

things going on. As you and your Colleagues have pointed out, there are people with fraudulent plates, with covered plates, with temporary plates. A portion of this is people with motorcycles and mopeds that are not bearing any license plate so that's another piece of that 5 percent.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How much revenue does the City estimate is lost from evading enforcement of such cameras based on the numbers you have?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: Right. It's a difficult number to calculate because the violations that are rejected for not being traceable could in theory be rejected for another reason. If the plate was traceable, just to take a step back of how our programs work, so each automated enforcement program, despite the name automated, we have human reviewers, staff who review each violation before it's issued so there are many violations that are rejected for reasons having nothing to do with the license plate. For example, a motorist enters a bus lane and blocks a bus that's approaching. However, an ambulance was passing in the general travel lane. Our technician can see that on the video. They see that the motorist

2.2

2.3

was, even though they did in fact violate the bus lane, they were captured on camera, that violation would be dismissed because they are properly moving out of the way of an emergency vehicle so there are cases like that so it's hard to say that the number of violations that are untraceable actually would equate to exactly the number that were lost if the review process had gone through its full cycle. I would say that would probably be a little bit lower than the 5 percent if you really went through the full review process on each of these.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'd also like to share that we've been joined by Council Member Rivera.

If a license plate is expired, is there a way of still identifying the violator and issuing them a ticket?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: For the automated programs, yes. If the license plate was properly registered but then expired we can still trace it back to the registered owner and that doesn't present a problem.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But how does DOT handle it once the automated system triggers it?

Do you work with DMV or NYPD, like how does that work?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: Right. That's an excellent question. There are a few ways we can do the lookups to get the information about the registered vehicle owner. If it's a New York State license plate and a New York State owner, there's a system we use called PREED that allows us to send the license plate number to the New York State DMV and we get the results back. That's the simplest case. Then there are dozens of other states that participate in a law enforcement data-sharing program called NLETS. That's another avenue to get data back. Then there are third-party commercial providers that do DMV look-ups on our behalf for a small fee per look-up such as LexisNexis is the biggest one that you've probably heard of. You think of it as like a legal research tool, but they offer this service as well so it's through either one of those look-up services, directly from the New York State DMV, or through the law enforcement data-sharing system called NLETS.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What do you do with that information once you have it?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: Once we retrieve the vehicle owner information, we populate a violation notice with the name and address of the vehicle owner, the photograph of the vehicle and violation, the specific data about their violation, how many miles per hour they were traveling, the location. That's presented to our reviewer team. They review all of the data, check it for accuracy, check, like I said, for extenuating circumstances or other things that could've inadvertently caused them to commit a violation, and then they affirm the violation. We print and mail the violations, and that's...

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But how are you handling the fact that it's an expired license plate?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: That it's expired? We issue the violation regardless of whether the...

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So the violation is on the speeding portion...

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: Yes, correct.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But in terms of the expiration of the license plate, what do you

TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 41

do with that information? Is it not handed over to

the NYPD to then do something about it or does the

person get to still continue to drive with the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

2.2

2.3

expired license plate?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: We just issue the speed, bus lane, or redlight violation. We don't

have any authority to address the expiration issue?

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, but that just shows that there may be a gap there is what it says to me because you're giving them that ticket, they may pay it, they may not, I mean they didn't renew their license plate, maybe they forgot, right, but even a notification to say this plate is expired, please handle, or maybe having an interagency partnership in terms of that would be warranted to be able to address that piece.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: That's a good observation, Chairperson, and we can certainly follow up on the expired plates. Typically, the expiration notices are going out from the DMV so, as the DOT, it's not normally our role but in terms of the followup with law enforcement...

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, totally get that, but just when we think about getting those

types of vehicles off of the roadway, wanting to have some type of mechanism to do so.

Does the City support full autonomy over its redlight and speed camera programs?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BENSON: Chairperson, that's an excellent question. I think our Commissioner has been in Albany each session pushing for more and more authority to expand our enforcement programs, and we've been very successful in those requests for expansion and built our program from, you mentioned in your opening remarks we launched the redlight camera program in 1994 with just a handful of cameras and now we have over 2,000 speed enforcement cameras in school zones, we have close to 400 bus lane enforcement cameras on fixed routes, we have hundreds of bus lane cameras that the MTA operates partnership that are on their buses so we have had tremendous success growing these programs by leaps and bounds and, yes, we want to continue pushing for more authority to operate, reduce the geographic restrictions that we have and there are other flavors of enforcement that we think could be valuable to pursue as well.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that. I'm hoping that the Commissioner is looking at infrastructure as well, like when having the conversations about the autonomy, recognizing how they go hand in hand and cannot happen separate from one another.

Switching over to NYPD enforcement, how many tickets and arrests were issued or made for defaced, fraudulent, and/or expired license plates in 2022 compared to the previous years? I think you had mentioned it a little earlier, but I just wanted to...

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: You pulled together a few categories there. What I will give you is for fraudulent or defaced plates, that was 1,777 so far this year. If we go back to prior years, when we compare 2022 to 2021, we were up 17 percent, 4,199 versus 3,568. When we compare 2022 to 2019, we were up 257 percent, 4,199 versus 1,178 in 2019.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm going to yield my questions to allow my Colleagues to ask some questions as well.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

Next, we'll have Council Member Feliz with questions.

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you, Chairs, again for this hearing. I also want to thank all the different departments and agencies that work to remove ghost cars from our streets, including the NYPD, the Sheriff, the Sanitation Department, and all others.

We need to tackle the use of these fake plates. We also need to tackle the sale of these plates. Very clear that people are selling them very openly, on Craig's List, eBay, even on Facebook Marketplace, even on Instagram so just wondering what is the NYPD doing to combat and prevent the sale of these fake plates?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: As I mentioned before, Council Member, our Auto Crime Division is responsible for these types of investigations. They get information on the sale of these types of plates online as you mentioned, they actually go online and do inspections. They get information from debriefing where they arrest someone and they question them regarding criminal activity. They're the ones that actually do the investigations. I don't have any data right now regarding how many arrests they have made in those cases, but I can tell you the investigations

summonses, but I really couldn't say.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Correct.

three lots for the towing of cars?

2.3

today, just want to make sure.

2.2

2.3

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Again, with the forged plates, there were 1,777 that were taken into custody.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: In the last year or two years?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: So far this year taken into custody in conjunction with arrests.

Again, 2022 versus 2021, there were 4,199. You have to assume that every one of those was taken into custody as well.

With regard to the towing of paper plates, we have so far this year, excuse me one second please, 1,084. With regard to that number, our traffic agents have been trained in identifying forged paper plates so although 1,084 vehicles with paper plates were towed into the pound, only 18 were determined to be forgeries.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Obviously, we've had a drastic increase in the sale and the use of paper plates. Where are these plates mostly coming from, what states? I know New Jersey is top.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yeah, I would say

New Jersey is the biggest. We see Texas plates online
as well so I'd say those were the two biggest.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Earlier today
3 you mentioned we only have the information of about
4 10 states.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Paper plate information into NYSPIN from 10 states, correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Have we had conversations with the other states about potentially sharing their information and how have the conversations been?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yeah, we've had conversations with our partners in the New York State Police about the state police reaching out to other states to get information including into NYSPIN, and we would have to follow up on that to see where they stand, but that's certainly a discussion we had and the importance of it was stressed.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Two final questions. I know my Colleagues have questions.

What are the 10 states that have provided their paper plate information?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Alabama, Florida, Georgia, Louisiana, Michigan, New York obviously, Ohio, South Carolina, Tennessee, and Texas.

2.2

2.3

1

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Final question. I think we could safely say that there are

4

3

fake plates that you just print out of Google and

two types of fake plates. You have the super duper

6

then you have the ones that you obtain through let's say a fraudulent dealership. Can you talk to us about

7 8

the plates that are obtained through the fraudulent

dealerships, the fictitious dealerships, do they come

10

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: There is a location

11

12 in New Jersey that we're aware of where there are,

with insurance, registration, etc.?

13

and our Auto Crime Division is aware of it and they

14

are in communication with their Jersey counterparts.

15

100 LLCs registered that are dealers, and the bar in

There's a location in Jersey where there are maybe

16 17

New Jersey to be a legitimate car dealer is set very,

18

very low. For example, you have to have an office

19 20 with a chair or two, you have to have two parking

21

spots available, and, if you have those things, you qualify as a legitimate car dealer. If somebody goes

2.2

2.3

to that car dealer, and they have access to the

24

permits, so if someone gets a permit from that

25

legitimate dealership, the plates pretty much are

Jersey database to print out legitimate temporary

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 51 2 legitimate plates unless there's some type of fraud 3 going on, but ordinarily they are legitimate plates and we've had this discussion with our Auto Crime 4 Division. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: What comes with 6 7 those plates? Do they come with insurance, temporary 8 insurance, temporary registration? 9 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Certainly to operate in New York State you would have to have your 10 car insured. 11 12 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: So the plates being 13 obtained from New Jersey, they do come with insurance, I guess temporary insurance... 14 15 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: To operate within 16 New York State, they would have to be insured. If 17 they're a New York State resident, they have 30 days 18 to register their car in New York State. 19 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Right, but I guess 20 the question is are the plates that are being 21 obtained, do they come with insurance and temporary 2.2 registration? DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: I don't know. I 2.3 would imagine they do, but I can't tell you for sure 24

that they would have to show proof of insurance to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 52 the dealership before they would give them a plate. I 2 3 don't know. I do know in New York State though to 4 drive you have to insurance. Sorry, I can't answer 5 that for you. COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Cool. Thank you. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much, Council Member. 8 9 I would like to recognize Council Member Won and Council Member Bottcher, and next we'll hear 10 from Council Member Farias. 11 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Hi. Good morning, 12 13 folks. I just have some questions off of the testimony and answers you've given and if we can just 14 15 run through them quickly. 16 Initially, I wanted to know where are we 17 finding most of our fake plates, and I'm sorry if you 18 said this throughout your questions. Are they like parked in the streets, through traffic violations, 19 20 through accident, like how are we coming to terms... 21 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: I would have to say that based on the number that we found to be 2.2 2.3 fraudulent based on towing paper plates, so the data shows that we towed 1,084 paper plates so far this 24

year. When those plates were taken into our tow

2.2

2.3

pounds and our traffic agents who have been trained in identifying fraudulent paper plates, they've only found 18 cases where there were forgeries versus 1,777 arrests that were made by police officers who pulled over cars that had forged or altered plates on a vehicle so I'd have to say moving violations is the way we're getting them.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, so moving violations primarily, but we are also training traffic agents to identify them which is great.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yes.

that what's been helpful is that we've been notified of the plate differences and what to look out for in terms of within the PD of people going out. Do you think if the public had that information it would increase maybe the street notifications, like parked cars that we'd be able to identify, and do you think that would be helpful before we end up with a traffic violation pull-over of a fraudulent license plate versus maybe in the neighborhoods being able to identify where they are?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Possibly, but if you did that, you would be letting the people know

2.2

2.3

who produce these fake permits what they're doing wrong so they could then correct them and have them appear to be legitimate.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay. Interesting perspective. I just have two more followups on other things. This is in relation to the cars that end up going for auction, this is when we were talking about the cars going up for auction, the thing that came to mind that I said to the Chair out loud was are those cars not registered, their VIN numbers not registered so we can't identify who owned those cars and they're in violation?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: They appear to be legitimate paper temporary registrations, they're not fraudulent, we only have 18 of those. My thought is that, and it's historic. I could give you data going back a few years. It's always around 25 percent of paper plate tows remain unclaimed so it's a historic number. What I'm going to do is when I get back to the base, I'm going to ask the tow pound to kind of break that out a little bit to see how old the vehicles are, are they more than 10 years old, 15 years old, what type of condition are they in. I would think they're probably in not such great

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 55 condition and people just figure, you know what, I'd rather just let it go than pay to have it reclaimed, but I'll find out for sure.

2.2

2.3

I just had a thought around what's our relationship like with the DMV, especially with the gap in communication that we're having with expired registrations, and you kind of touched on that already, but do you think there's any way to maybe have us either figure out a way to get some of that revenue in in terms of for the State with expired registrations versus us just hoping that at some point people will pay them?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: I could give you a quick piece of information. We've issued 204,000 parking violations to vehicles with expired registration, which is up 2 percent from last year, so pretty much that's all going to be recovered (INAUDIBLE) cars. Moving violations, we're up 64 percent in moving violations issued to vehicles that aren't properly registered or with expired registration, and all that's going to be recovered. I think, as Josh and I discussed before, it's the case where a car that's not registered goes through a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 56 2 speed camera or a redlight camera, and there's really 3 no mechanism in place to pick that violation up. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay. Thank you, 5 folks, and thank you, Chairs, for the additional 6 time. 7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Council Member. 8 9 Next, we'll hear from Council Member 10 Carr. 11 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Chairs. 12 Chief, Deputy Commissioner, good to see you. 13 I'm going to be asking these questions on behalf of my Colleague, Council Member Nantasha 14 15 Williams, who had to depart. In your response to your questions from Chair Brooks-Powers you mentioned that 16 17 traffic agents can initiate a tow when they discover 18 a vehicle with fraudulent paper plates. Are they able to do that in real-time upon their first discovery of 19 20 a vehicle like that even if there's no other violations known? 21 2.2 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yes. 2.3 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: In terms of that, how many are towed without the presence of a driver 24 25 on a regular basis?

2.2

2.3

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: I would say the majority, the vast, vast majority of vehicles are towed without a driver.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Okay.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Generally, the policy is when someone is sitting in their car, we instruct the traffic agents to give the person the opportunity to move for the most part so, generally, a high percentage are unoccupied.

a little bit about before in your answer to Council

Member Feliz about the capacity that the Department

has to hold these vehicles. Is the availability of a

tow ever an issue? I assume there's a lot of demands

on the Department's tow capacity. Is there discussion

about expanding that capacity maybe through

additional contracting with an outside vendor? Do you

need more tows internal to the Department? What's

your position on that?

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: I think what we need is larger tow pounds. We lost the Manhattan tow pound a few years ago, which hurt us, but if we had more space to tow vehicles, a quick example and just a quick aside is that we know that large commercial

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

vehicles parked overnight are a problem citywide, right, and we had explained at our traffic safety forum the difference in summonses that could be issued to the larger commercial vehicles which is a Code 6, which carries with it a 250-dollar fine for the first offense and a 500-dollar fine for the second offense within six months by the same owner so we can issue that summons to large 18-wheelers. The law lists four types of larger commercial vehicles, and we can issue, and we've issued a lot of those summonses and we have a big increase in those summonses. The bottom line is the ability to tow them. In Queens South this year, we've done a couple of really great initiatives where we've towed like 80 of those vehicles over a couple of week period, but we were able to do that because the police borough commander was able to identify a location that could be secured that we could utilize for a several week period, and it was a very successful initiative so the one thing we need is tow pounds and space.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Okay. I appreciate that, and I think there's maybe some synergy for us to discuss because Staten Island has that same challenge that Southeast Queens has as you discussed,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 59 2 and we do have some space out in our borough so maybe 3 we can discuss that. 4 My last question on my Colleague's behalf is do you have a breakdown of all of the tows or the 5 incidents where there was a fraudulent or expired 6 7 plate and the breakdown between the fraudulent end 8 and then expired temporary. DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: See if I have that. I have fraudulent. As I had mentioned, we had towed 10 11 1,084 vehicles with paper plates so far this year, 12 paper plates. Only 18 were determined to be forgeries 13 of that number. I hope that helps. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you. 15 Appreciate. Thank you, Chairs. 16 DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Thank you. 17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Council 18 Member. 19 Next, we'll hear from Council Member 20 Holden. 21 Before that, I'd like to recognize 2.2 Council Member Brannan has joined us as well. 2.3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chairs. Thank you, Chief, for all the information and all the 24 25 hard work by the NYPD on this.

I just have a question on the language of the bill. When it's mentioned a fraudulent license plate, does that also include a doctored or obscured license plate, let's say there are very creative ways where people block their license plate, and I've seen people use a leaf, tape, paint, you name it. Would this bill address that, the bill 987?

MANAGING ATTORNEY FARRUGGIA: We believe that the bill would address doctored license plates.

that's a very important, you believe, but there has to be, that's a very important issue because I see more doctored license plates, obscured license plates than anything. I mean I see it around precincts. I see it, from my office, I can see one out of maybe 15 cars that go by have an obscured plate with some kind of doctored plate.

MANAGING ATTORNEY FARRUGGIA: This would be someone intentionally obscuring their plate...

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right. (INAUDIBLE)

MANAGING ATTORNEY FARRUGGIA: Not

necessarily covered with leaves, but we can work with the Council to come up with definitions or language to make this more clear in the bill.

council Member Holden: Again, if I paint over it, if I scratch it, you name it it's being done, tape, so that's what has to be in the bill.

That's why I'm not on this bill because I'm not sure if that's the case here. The language should be for any obscured, I would obscured, I would add doctored, I would add all the language that if you hide it somehow or even if it's illegible that that becomes, obviously like a camera can't pick it up or a toll can't pick it up. That's an obscured plate.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Councilman, that's a good point because we do see that. I've seen it out there myself, and the language 402 with the VTL does make that illegal the way it's worded so you can't have any numbers or letters covered. I think it says clearly readable or clearly discernible so it is illegal. Our officers do take action in those cases, and it's a great point.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I think also at one of the hearings we had the penalty right now for that is 65 dollars.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Yes, that's correct.

2.2

2.2

do that in the City of New York right now with the current penalties because how much are tolls, tolls can be 65 dollars. You could use that in one day and make it back so even if you do get caught, it's 65 dollars. That's why the current bill, if it covers that and it obviously would be a 500-dollar fine, that at least starts to address it. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Thank you so much for all of you testifying. A special shoutout for Inspector Kinsella from Staten Island. It's good to see you.

Thank you, Chair Brooks-Powers, and all of my Colleagues that have been here.

We're going to move to public testimony. Thank you so much.

DEPUTY CHIEF PILECKI: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we'll be turning to public testimony.

For in-person panelists, please come up to the dais once your name has been called.

For virtual panelists, we'll be calling individuals one-by-one to testify.

2.2

2.3

We'll be limiting public testimony today to two minutes each. Please begin once the Sergeant has started the timer. For virtual panelists, once your name is called a Member of our Staff will unmute you and the Sergeant-at-Arms will set the timer and give you the go-ahead to begin. Please wait for the Sergeant to announce that you may begin before delivering your testimony.

 $\label{eq:continuous} \mbox{I'd like to call up to the dais Eric} $$\operatorname{McClure}$ and Danny Pearlstein.$

Eric, you can start whenever you're ready.

ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you. Good morning. My name is Eric McClure. I'm the Executive Director of StreetsPAC. I want to thank the Co-Chairs, Chair Hanks and Chair Brooks-Powers, for hosting this hearing today.

Ghost cars, vehicles with fake, obscured, or illegally covered license plates are a serious and widespread and seemingly worsening problem in New York City. Untraceable and unreadable plates allow drivers to flaunt speed and redlight cameras and electronic tolls, an issue that will only compound when congestion pricing goes into effect. As Jesse

Coburn has reported in a wide-ranging investigative series for Streetsblog, the proliferation of license plate cheating costs the MTA, the Port Authority, and New York City more than a combined 100 million dollars in lost toll and ticket revenue in 2022, and that's not the worst of it. Drivers of ghost cars have also left behind a trail of death and destruction. Isaiah Benloss, a former student of Council Member Rita Joseph's, was struck in 2020 by the driver a car with temporary New Jersey plates and later died. The driver was never caught. Davina Afokoba, a 10-year-old constituent of Chair Brooks-Powers, was killed by a driver of a car with temporary Texas plates early last year. That driver received only a summons.

Sadly, Isaiah and Davina were only the tip of the iceberg. According to NYPD, more than two dozen New Yorkers were killed by drivers of cars with temporary plates over the past two years, and 40 percent of those plates were fake. Cars with counterfeit or unreadable plates have been used in the commission of crimes including murders. While, according to Coburn's reporting, the NYPD towed 3,300

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 65

vehicles with paper plates last year, they're barely

3 putting a dent in the problem.

2.2

2.3

strongly support Council Member Feliz's Intro. 987
which would make it unlawful to operate a motor
vehicle in New York City with fraudulent license
plate, fake temporary plate, or expired license
plate. The legislation also sets a reasonable
graduated fine schedule which includes a curing
period for replacing expired plates. The proposed law
would not put anyone in jail, but the penalty should
be substantial enough to curtail a fair amount of the
illegal activity assuming the law is adequately
enforced.

We also support Council Member Feliz's related bill, Intro. 988, which would prohibit the sale or distribution of fraudulent plates including fake temporary plates by updating Section 10-182 of the City's Administrative Code which already prohibits the sale of license plate covers and sprays. The bill would also impose substantial fines, 1,000 dollars for the first offense and 2,000 dollars for subsequent offenses, which could mount quickly

for someone engaged in the illegal business of selling fake plates.

2.2

2.3

Taken together, we believe these bills will help put a dent in the spread of fraudulent license plates which will both make the city streets safer and help reduce toll losses. We urge that both bills be passed by the Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure and Committee on Public Safety and the full Council as soon as possible.

We also would strongly urge the creation of a task force that would include the NYPD, the New York City Sheriff, New York State DMV, and regional and federal transportation law enforcement authorities to address the scourge of ghost cars.

Jesse Coburn's reporting reveals that the problem is widespread and crosses many state lines, and solving it will require a coordinated and holistic effort.

Lastly, we support Intro. 1011, Chair
Brooks-Powers' bill that would require police to
distribute information about reduced fare programs to
persons arrested or summonsed for fare evasion. While
not everyone who jumps a turnstile is doing so purely
for economic reasons, the City's Fair Fares program
is greatly undersubscribed, and access to half-price

2.2

2.3

fare may help to encourage people to pay to ride public transit. It's certainly worth try. We'd even support an effort to give drivers whose ghost cars are impounded information about E-ZPass. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you, and I really appreciate the feedback in terms of the task force because that's where I was going when it became evident that there are some gaps between the State and the City agencies so thank you for that.

DANNY PEARLSTEIN: Good morning, Chairs and Council Members. My name is Danny Pearlstein. I'm the Policy and Communications Director at the Riders Alliance. Thank you so much for having me.

On the Fair Fares information bill, obviously we're strongly supportive. We believe that this is an important pathway to getting the word out about Fair Fares. At the same time, we believe it pairs incredibly well with an expansion of the program that we believe will allow it to reach its full potential, and we're so grateful to the Council and to Speaker Adams for supporting that expansion, and we hope to see it in the budget concluded this week.

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

At the same time, we are supportive of Council Member Feliz's bills as described by my Colleague, Eric McClure, and has illustrated the need by the website Streetsblog, both Jesse Coburn's series and, of course, the editor, Gersh Kuntzman's Criminal Mischief series of going around town and correcting ghost plates and obstructed plates.

At the same time, we feel strongly that this is about equity. It's about safety. It's also about equity. Drivers using ghost plates are abusing a privilege to operate and maintain a car in public space, and they're yet another obstacle to the fast and reliable service that bus riders so sorely need. Bus riders in general need a bold approach to priority on the busiest streets, and busways, of course, are the strongest remedy that the City has in its toolkit, and busways have been implemented successfully in the last four years in areas of Manhattan, Northern and Southern Manhattan, in Eastern Queens, and, of course, now in Downtown Brooklyn, and we're looking forward to Flatbush Avenue, but nowhere is a busway more clearly indicated than on Fordham Road in the Bronx where 85,000 riders every single day use what is in essence

the cross-Bronx expressway of bus route, the Bx12-SBS and the four other routes that run on Fordham Road. We believe that, again the strongest remedy is the one that's indicated here. Obviously, there have been calls for balance, but balance can't come in the form of an obsolete street design that's 15 years old, that hasn't been implemented in the other boroughs in a decade and a half, and really would shortchange the 85,000 daily riders from Upper Manhattan and the Bronx that rely on Fordham Road to get across town. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

pust may add one thing. I did want to underscore what Council Member Holden said about the obscured and defaced plates. It's a really important issue. A 65-dollar fine clearly is not deterring anyone from doing that, and, if Council Member Feliz is open to it, amending the bill to include language regarding obstructed or defaced plates I think would be very beneficial.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that feedback.

2.2

2.3

3

4

6

7

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: We'll definitely look into that. I think that's already in the bill, but the big question is what are the penalties. Is it just 20 dollars for completely covering the plate or is it something that would actually deter people so we'll definitely review the language and modify it if

8

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much for your testimony. Leave it open for anyone else who

11

12

10

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We'll turn to Steve Vaccaro who's joining us virtually.

1314

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Your time will begin.

STEVE VACCARO: Thanks very much and thank

15

16

you, Chairs Brooks-Powers and Hanks, for the

needed to include that. Thank you.

wants to... One online?

17

opportunity to present evidence today concerning the

18

problem of fraudulent and defaced license plates that

19

the two bills, Intro. 987 and 988, are intended to

20

21

address.

I'm an attorney representing vulnerable road users, pedestrians and cyclists, against the

22

motorists who strike them, and I'm here to sound an

24

alarm. There has been a dramatic pullback in traffic

25

law enforcement against dangerous driving. Drivers

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 71 2 know it, and they increasingly are turning to 3 fraudulent or defaced plates to evade responsibilities for tolls, for parking violations, 4 5 and for the harm they cause when they strike New Yorkers. A recent landmark investigative report by 6 Jesse Coburn specifically focused on so-called ghost 7 8 tags, temporary paper license plates or tags issued by car dealers not in connection with the sale of a vehicle. They cannot be traced to any vehicle, these 10 11 ghost tags. Coburn learned that hundreds of 12 fraudulent temporary tags are issued by dozens of 13 registered auto dealers who list as their business 14 address a vacant lot in Bridgeton, New Jersey. In 15 fact, no cars are sold out of that lot, and New Jersey is extremely lax in enforcing the rules 16 17 against those dealers selling tags apart from any 18 vehicle. One of my clients, Raymond Wallace of 19 Brooklyn, was struck on May 8, 2023, while operating 20 a motorized scooter with a driver who had ghost 21 plates on issued by a dealership called Direct Auto 2.2 Wholesale located at the vacant lot in in Bridgeton, 2.3 New Jersey. Mr. Wallace went under the car, and he was dragged half a block before the driver stopped. 24

Luckily, he lived, but he suffered a fracture to his

2 | humerus, lost income, and many other consequences.

2.2

2.3

Police were there. They happened to be right there at the scene. They stopped the driver. When they checked his information, they found out he didn't have a license. His license had been revoked for DWI and other violations, but he was driving a car given to

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

him by someone in New Jersey...

STEVE VACCARO: Car, and who bought these fake ghost tags from Direct Auto Wholesale in Bridgeton, New Jersey.

New York streets are being flooded with these fraudulent tags that are issued by these ghost dealerships for 100 dollars, and I will include in the written version of my remarks the citation to the police accident report, to the filed complaint against the driver and the auto dealership that we're bringing for negligent entrustment of these temporary tags and of this vehicle to this driver as well as the citation to the article by Mr. Coburn, but this is a problem that is growing by leaps and bounds and dramatically needs to be addressed by Intro. 987 and 988, and I would urge that the law by its terms have extraterritorial effect to reach the furthest

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON 1 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 73 possible reach it can into auto dealerships in New 2 3 Jersey. There's a basis for this in the case law that 4 I read in New York that if you are sending a vehicle 5 with these temporary tags into the other state... COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sir, if you could wrap 6 7 up your testimony, please. Thank you. 8 If there is anybody present in Chambers 9 who wishes to testify who hasn't signed a slip, please see the Sergeant-at-Arms in the back. We have 10 11 one witness remaining. I call to the dais Alex Stein. ALEX STEIN: Is the mic on? Last time I 12 13 didn't have it on. You guys are crazy. I'll never turn it on. I got Selvena got the camera out. 14 15 I'm Primetime 99. I sued y'all and you 16 guys ought to settle it because you guys don't believe in free speech, and I'm a pimp on a blimp. 17 18 I want to say I love New York. This Pride 19 month has been so great. I've had so much anal sex. 20 Like last night at that parade, I learned this new 21 song. You ready? Jizz on my face, jizz on my face, I 2.2 need that jizz post-haste, stick that dick deep in my 2.3 shit, I want it in my poopy zone, I want to be a poopy clone, I love poo and gay sex, Pride month is 24

the very best, that's why I stick it deep in your

2.2

2.3

butt, yes that blood's not from a cut, it's from the insertion because I stick it deep, because I am an anal super freak, I love free speech, it's so great, when I walk down the street and see some gay sex oh play in front of my face, I love gay sex and the taste of jizz, stick it in my mouth, jizz, jizz, I love it so much, I love Pride, it's the best month, I

So I learned that song last night at Pride. My girl, AOC, was there. AOC, I miss you, baby, I'm sorry, please unblock me. I want to talk to you on Twitter.

love Pride, I love it so much.

Also, Oswald, I had some anal last night you would be jealous of, and I know you guys are all homosexuals because everybody in this city is a homosexual, and I love it. I just, when the guys, they whip out their things and then they slap it on my face, it brings me back to the locker room, the locker room with Lia Thomas, my favorite pro athlete. Lia Thomas, I'm swimming for you, I'm swimming for the marginalized, I'm swimming for the ones that can't swim for themselves. I'm Primetime 99, I'm a pimp on a blimp, and I love gay sex, and I love it with a dildo, I love it with a person, I love it with

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 75

a transgender, I love transgenders, I love transgenders, I love transgenders. I love them. Thank you. It's Primetime Stein on Instagram.

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We have one final witness, Jason Fromowitz. If you want, you want to slide down.

Oh, and this city is run like shit.

JASON FROMOWITZ: My name is Jason

Fromowitz. I wanted to provide my perspective on the issues that we're talking about today as a resident of Manhattan.

First of all, I wanted to thank the

Committees for addressing this issue of vehicles with

improper license plates. From my perspective, it's a

pervasive issue across the City, and I've just seen

it continue to grow over the last several months.

I wanted to express my support for bills

987 and 988, but I also wanted to encourage the

Council and these Committees to address vehicles with

completely missing plates, which I don't believe is

addressed by this bill, as well as specifically

calling for action for vehicles with defaced plates,

I know was also raised but I saw as lacking in the

current proposed bills.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 76

Additionally, I was hoping to enc the

Committee to look into and address the lack of enforcement given the existing illegality of much of what was discussed today and how there appears to be an issue with enforcement rather than lack of existing laws and penalties. That's all I had. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I just want to acknowledge for the record witnesses who signed up to testify, Kaylie Olanick (phonetic) and Dontarius Ingbom (phonetic).

Back to you.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. This hearing is adjourned. [GAVEL]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 30, 2023