

COMMITTEE ON HOSPITALS

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

THE COMMITTEE ON HOSPITALS

----- X

Thursday, June 8, 2023

Start: 10:35 A. M.

Recess: 10:50 A. M.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Hon. Mercedes Narcisse, Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Charles Barron

Selvena N. Brooks-Powers

Jennifer Gutiérrez,

Rita C. Joseph

Francisco P. Moya

Carlina Rivera

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Julie Menin

COMMITTEE ON HOSPITALS

A P P E A R A N C E S

1  
2 SERGEANT WONG: This is a soundcheck for the  
3 Committee on Hospitals. Today's date is June 8, 2023  
4 being recorded by Danny Wong in the Committee Room.

5 SERGEANT PEREZ: Quiet, we're rolling!

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning, welcome to the  
7 New York City Council Vote for the Committee on  
8 Hospitals. At this time please place all electronic  
9 devices to vibrate or silent mode. Thank you for  
10 your cooperation, Chair, we are ready to begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Good morning.

12 [GAVELING IN] [GAVEL SOUND]

13 Good morning, I am Council Member Narcisse, Chair  
14 of the New York City Council Committee on Hospitals.

15 I want to thank my colleagues and members of the  
16 Hospital Committee for joining at today's vote.

17 We are meeting today to vote on the proposed  
18 Introduction 844 and Resolution 512 both sponsored by  
19 Council Member Julie Menin.

20 These two pieces of legislation are intended to  
21 increase access to hospital services while promoting  
22 financial stability for hospitals and lowering health  
23 care costs for all New Yorkers.

24 As a registered nurse, I am very aware of the  
25 health care struggles which impact New Yorkers. It is

1  
2 critical that we work to ensure that our diverse  
3 communities are equally aware and feel empowered and  
4 confident to make health care decisions for  
5 themselves and their families.

6 And, thank you again, to Julie Menin and the  
7 coalition for this bill in is incorporated necessary  
8 amendments. This version creates a distinction for  
9 safety net hospitals and allows for a more vigorous  
10 study of their financial crisis. It will also  
11 provide a more comprehensive reporting of multiple  
12 factors impacting health care costs as a whole.

13 I want to thank... I want to conclude by  
14 thanking Council Member Menin and her staff, as well  
15 as my staff, Saye Joseph, for their dedication to  
16 this issue; the Health Care Committee, and Hospital  
17 Committee staff. I want to thank the Administration,  
18 advocates, and my team for their continued work on  
19 this legislation.

20 Before we begin the vote, I will now pass the  
21 microphone to Council Member Menin for her remarks.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Thank you so much, Chair  
23 Narcisse, and I really want to thank you and your  
24 staff for your tremendous support of this bill. I am  
25 so excited to be voting on this bill. This has been

1  
2 real labor of love. This bill, The Consumer  
3 Protection and Health Care Accountability Act, is  
4 going to mean that we are creating the first in the  
5 nation Office on Health Care Accountability. And  
6 basically, this office is going to have a website  
7 that discloses, by medical procedure, by hospital  
8 what patients are being charged. It is also going to  
9 assess the amount of money that New York City is  
10 spending on health care. Right now, there is no  
11 other industry where as a consumer you're procuring a  
12 service and you have absolutely no idea what you're  
13 going to be charged for that service. So, if you are  
14 a woman having a C-section in New York City and you  
15 go to Montefiore, you're going to get a bill for  
16 \$55,000. If you go to another New York City  
17 hospital, you will be charged \$17,000. And that is  
18 the case for so many different medical procedures.

19 Also, this bill is going to allow New York City  
20 to save potentially up to \$2 billion based on studies  
21 on this bill. So, specifically, New York City is  
22 spending \$11 billion on public sector employee  
23 retiree independent health care, that is double what  
24 we spent five years ago. And, so, we cannot continue  
25 to sustain these skyrocketing health care costs. So,

1  
2 this will allow us to harness our purchasing power to  
3 drive down costs.

4 I really want to thank Chair Narcisse; I want to  
5 thank the 41 council members who signed on; I want to  
6 thank our phenomenal Labor Coalition who has worked  
7 on this bill. Uh, we've got really just a tremendous  
8 coalition.

9 And, also, I want to say one word about  
10 Resolution 512 that we are voting on, which calls on  
11 the state to create a independent commission to  
12 oversee hospital pricing and to increase access to  
13 services, because in 1996, Governor Pataki  
14 deregulated hospitals. We need to go back and really  
15 increase the regulation, and that is what Reso 512  
16 would do.

17 Finally, I want to thank the many people who  
18 helped to draft this bill, because this was a bear of  
19 a bill, and I am so thrilled that we are now at the  
20 finish line.

21 I want to thank the bill drafters, Sara Sucher,  
22 Nick Widzowski, Nell Beekman, Julia Goldsmith-  
23 Pinkham, Mahnoor Butt, Christopher Pepe, and  
24 particularly Sara Liss, who worked so hard on this  
25

1  
2 bill. And from my team, Jonathan Szott, Brandon  
3 Jordan, and Anna Correa.

4 And now I am thrilled to turn it back over to  
5 Chair Narcisse, thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Thank you, and now I will  
7 pass it on to the clerk for a vote.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Good morning, William Martin,  
9 Committee Clerk; roll call vote, The Committee on  
10 Hospitals; items are coupled.

11 Chair Narcisse?

12 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: I vote aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I proudly vote aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I vote aye, and  
17 congratulations, Council Member Menin, for this  
18 amazing bill. Both of them.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Aye, congratulations,  
21 Julie.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of four in the  
23 affirmative, zero in the negative, and no  
24 abstentions, both items have been adopted by the  
25 committee.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOSPITALS

And we will hold the roll open by the request of the Chair.

CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: We will keep it open, yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Moya?

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (NO RESPONSE)

UNKNOWN: [INAUDIBLE]... (CROSS-TALK)

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: (NO RESPONSE)

UNKNOWN: Hello?

COMMITTEE CLERK: Yes, hello, this William Martin Committee Clerk for Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [BACKGROUND NOISE]

[INAUDIBLE] my name?

COMMITTEE CLERK: I'm sorry, Council Member Barron, is that you?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, it is.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Oh, thank you, sir, there is a vote on Committee on Hospitals, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

The vote is now currently at five in the affirmative and remains open.

This is a continuation, Committee on Hospitals, Council Member Moya?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (NO RESPONSE HEARD)

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Moya, we are  
unable to hear you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Okay.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: The vote is now currently at six  
in the affirmative.

This is a continuation roll call Committee on  
Hospitals, Council Member Joseph?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: (NO RESPONSE)

COMMITTEE CLERK: Continuation roll call Committee  
on Hospitals, Council Member Joseph?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: [INAUDIBLE]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.

Final vote Committee on Hospitals... (CROSS-  
TALK)

UNKNOWN: I'm sorry... I'm sorry

CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: It wasn't even on...

UNKNOWN: Can you... Can you repeat your vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Yes, I vote aye. Aye on  
all.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOSPITALS

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member  
Joseph.

Final vote is now 7 in the affirmative, zero in  
the negative, and no abstentions.

[APPLAUSE]

CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Now concluding, thank you,  
everyone.

[GAVELING OUT] [GAVEL SOUND]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 10, 2023