SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS

AND DISPOSITIONS 1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

February 23, 2023 Start: 10:12 a.m. Recess: 11:15 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - COMMITTEE ROOM, 14TH

FLOOR

B E F O R E: Farah N. Louis, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Oswald Feliz

Christopher Marte

Sandy Nurse Sandra Ung Inna Vernikov Rita Joseph

APPEARANCES

Kelly Murphy, Director of Real Estate Services at the School Construction Authority

Michael Martinez, Senior Manager of Real Estate Services at the School Construction Authority

Kate Lemos McHale, Director of Research at the Landmarks Preservation Commission

Sonia Guior, Director of Community and Intergovernmental Affairs at the Landmarks Preservation Commission

Amanda Davis, Project Manager of the New York City LGBT Historic Sites Project

Michael Lent, homeowner

Cheryl Sealey, homeowner

Jesse Miller, homeowner

Julie Miller, homeowner

II	SUBCOMMITTEE	ON	LANDMARKS,	PUBLIC	SITING	SS I
			AND	DISPOSI	TIONS	3

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone check for the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Disposition located on the 14th Floor Hearing Room, recorded by Nazly Paytuvi on February 23, 2023.

Good morning and welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Dispositions.

If you wish to submit testimony, you may at testimony@council.nyc.gov.

At this time, please silent all electronic devices.

Chair, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: [GAVEL] Good morning. I'm Council Member Farah Louis, Chair of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Disposition. I am joined today by my Colleagues, Council Members Feliz, Ung, Vernikov, and Joseph.

Before we begin with today's agenda, I will recognize the Subcommittee Counsel to explain today's hearing procedures.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Thank you, Chair Louis. I am Arthur Huh, Counsel to the Subcommittee.

This meeting is being held in a hybrid format. Members of the public who wish to testify may do so in person or remotely via Zoom.

Those wishing to testify remotely are asked to register online, and you may do so now by visiting www.council.nyc.gov/landuse to sign up. If you have already registered but not yet signed into the Zoom, please do so now and remain signed in until after you have testified.

If you have written testimony you would like the Subcommittee to consider in addition to or instead of appearing before the Subcommittee, please send it via email to

<u>landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov</u>. Please indicate the LU number or project name in the subject line of your email.

In the event of any technical issues with today's meeting, we ask everyone for your continued patience as we work through those.

Chair Louis will now continue with today's agenda.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. I will begin today's hearing meeting by opening two public hearings for applications submitted by the School

2.2

2.3

Construction Authority pursuant to Section 1732 of
the New York School Construction Authority Act for
proposed site selections for school facilities. We'll
first hear from SCA staff regarding the two sites and
then we will take public testimony on both items.

I'll remind anyone wishing to testify remotely, if you have not already done so, you must register online and you may do that now by visiting the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.

We will Preconsidered Application number G 220027 SCQ, a proposed site selection for a new approximately 547-seat primary school facility located at 23-10 43rd Avenue in the Court Square Long Island City neighborhood of Queens in Council District represented by Council Member Won.

We will also hear Preconsidered

Application number G 220028 SCQ, a proposed site

selection for a new approximately 659-seat high

school facility located at 13-20 124th Street in the

College Point neighborhood, also in the borough of

Queens, in the Council District represented by

Council Member Paladino.

Presenting these items on behalf of the School Construction Authority will be Kelly Murphy.

Real Estate Services.

25

2.2

2.3

We are very happy to be here today to present two site selections for a proposed new primary school at 23-10 43rd Avenue in Long Island City and a proposed new high school at 13-20 124th Street in College Point.

The School Construction Authority has undertaken the site selection process for a new approximately 547-seat primary school located at 43rd Avenue, Block 436, Lot 21 in the Borough of Queens. The site is approximately 21,156 square feet, about half an acre, and it was formerly utilized as a five-story office building. The site is located within Queens Community District number 2, Community School District number 30, and the Long Island Court Square neighborhood. Can we go to slide two?

There we are. Here's an overview of the site. You can see the Queens Borough Bridge and the Sunnyside Yards to the south and to the east, and it's located in the heart of Court Square. Next slide.

There's a tax map of the site shown. It's one tax lot 21 on block 436. Next slide.

This is just a closer-in view of the site. You can see the actual building, and the site

is bounded by 43rd Avenue to the north, 24th Street to the east, 23rd Street to the west, and there's currently a residential development to the south.

Next slide.

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

This is the official notice of filing. The notice of filing for the site plan was published in AM New York in the City Record on November 28, 2022, at which time Community Education Council number 30, Queens Community Board number 2, and the City Planning Commission were also notified. Queens Community Board number 2 held a public hearing on January 5, 2023, and they issued a letter of support on January 6, 2023. Community Education Council number 30 also held a public hearing on December 12, 2022. All public comments received on the site were considered as part of the site selection process. The SCA affirms the site plan pursuant to Section 1731 of New York Public Authority's Law in accordance with Section 1732 of PAL that SCA submitted the proposed site plan to the Mayor and City Council by letter dated February 17, 2023. Next slide.

These next couple of slides are just some images of the building and the surrounding area so you can see the existing five-story building. The

picture on the left shows the site looking southwest from the intersection of 43rd Avenue and 24th Street, and the one on the right shows the view looking southeast from the intersection of 43rd and 23rd Street. Next slide.

Just some more images. On the left is a view along East 23rd towards the project site. You can see the number 7 train in the view there, very close, and on the right looking southwest along 23rd Street between 42nd Road and the Queens Borough Bridge Ramp. Next slide.

Just some project facts. The existing building will be demolished to accommodate the construction of the new primary school. The site is very well-served with transit, subway and buses. The new primary school will have approximately 547 seats, and the design for the school includes classrooms for pre-kindergarten to grade five, District 75 classroom, music and art classrooms, a science room, library, reading and resource rooms, cafeteria, and an administrative space.

I'll just stop here to see if there's any questions.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you for your presentation. I now invite my Colleagues if you have any questions.

All right. Council Member Feliz would love a school in his district. All right.

If there are no further questions, the applicant panel is excused.

Oh, you have a question? Sorry, go ahead. Council Member Joseph.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Good morning. Is there a playground for children?

KELLY MURPHY: Yeah, it looks like it will be a little bit on the ground floor, but the school hasn't been designed. We just do a test fit to make sure we fit the program, but we'll know more when the project gets designed, but right now we're planning on having a small playground.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: You're planning on having open space for the kids?

KELLY MURPHY: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. Council

Member Marte.

1	DISPOSITIONS 12					
2	COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: (INAUDIBLE)					
3	question.					
4	CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: You still have a					
5	question?					
6	COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: No, sorry.					
7	CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. Thank you.					
8	If there are no further questions, the applicant					
9	panel is now excused.					
10	Counsel, are there any members of the					
11	public who wish to testify on this item?					
12	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: If there are any					
13	remote public participants who wish to testify and					
14	have not already done so on the Preconsidered LU					
15	items for these two SCA school sitings, please press					
16	the raise hand button now.					
17	If you are here with us in person and					
18	wish to testify, please see one of the Sergeants to					
19	fill out a speaker card.					
20	Chair, the meeting will briefly stand at					
21	ease while we confirm no other speakers.					
22	CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. Being there					

are no members of the public who wish to testify on

the Preconsidered LU items for the two SCA school

24

23

220028 SCQ, the public hearing is now closed.

sitings under application numbers G 220027 SCQ and G

2

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

We will now move on to the number of LPC...

KELLY MURPHY: I apologize for interrupting. That was just the first school. I hadn't presented the second school.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: We will reopen the public hearing, and we'll give you the opportunity now to present.

KELLY MURPHY: There's a second presentation. Go to the next slide. Thank you.

The New York City School Construction Authority has undertaken a site selection process for a new approximately 659-seat high school facility located at 13-20 124th Street, Block 3998, Lot 1 in the Borough of Queens. The site is approximately 47,952 square feet, about 1.1 acres. The property was formerly utilized as a private Catholic high school and consists of a vacant school building, surrounding grounds, and a paved parking lot. The site is located within Queens Community District number 7 and Community School District number 5 in the College Point neighborhood of Queens. You can see this overview. The site is located in the heart of College

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Thank you.

2 Point in the middle of a low-density neighborhood.
3 Next slide, please.

This is just the tax map. This is Block 3998, Lot 1. Next slide, please.

This is our official notice of filing. The notice of filing of the site plan was published in AM New York in the City Record on November 28, 2022, at which time the City Council on High Schools, Queens Community Board number 7, and the City Planning Commission were notified of the proposed site plan. The Education Committee for Queens Community Board number 7 held a public hearing on December 13, 2022, and the full Queens Community Board number 7 held a public hearing on January 9, 2023. The Citywide Council on High Schools held a public hearing on January 11, 2023. All public comments received on this site were considered as part of the site selection process. The SCA affirms that the site plan pursuant to Section 1731 of New York Public Authority's Law and in accordance with 1732 of the PAL. The SCA submitted the proposed site plan to the Mayor and City Council dated February 17, 2023. If you can move to the next slide, please.

2.2

This is just some images of the site. The first photo is a view of the project site looking northwest from the intersection of 14th Avenue and 124th Street, and the photo on the right is looking southwest from the eastern side of 124th Street. next slide.

This is just a straight view of the existing school building, which will be repurposed for the new high school. Next image.

The picture on the right is the rear of the school building and the parking lot viewed from 123rd Street looking east, and the photo on the right is a view of the rear of the building from 123rd Street looking right. Next slide.

Just some project facts. As I said, this is an existing private school building that will be converted to a new high school, and the site consists of the school grounds and a parking lot. The proposed new high school will have approximately 659 seats and includes 18 classrooms for 9th through 12th grades, two special education classrooms, a music room, an art room, science room, science lab, reading and speech resources room, a gym and exercise room,

)

kitchen/cafeteria, a library, guidance/medical suites, and administrative offices, and a play yard.

We look forward to the Subcommittee's favorable consideration of our two proposed school sites. Thank you for your time.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. You said that it was going to be repurposed. There's going to be no construction done at all?

KELLY MURPHY: They'll be renovations of the building itself. There will be a new play yard onto the site. It's an older building so there will be some substantial renovations to the building.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. Thank you.

Do any of my Colleagues have any questions?

All right. If there are no further questions, the applicant panel is now excused.

Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish to testify on this item?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Once again, if
there are any remote public participants who wish to
testify on either of these two SCA sitings, please
use the raise hand button now, and if you are here in
in person and wish to testify, please see a Sergeant
to submit a speaker card.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Being that there are no members of the public who wish to testify on Preconsidered LUs items for these two SCA school sitings under application numbers G 220027 SCQ and G 220028 SCQ, the public hearing is now closed.

We will now move onto a number of LPC designations on our calendar. Because of the number of Landmark items we have today, we will first hear a series of presentations from LPC staff relating to all of the proposed designations and then we will give members of the public an opportunity to testify on these designations.

For anyone here wishing to testify regarding more than one Landmark designation, I'll ask that you please fill out a separate speaker card for each item and, if you would clarify during your testimony which items you are speaking on, we will allow you to provide your remarks all at once.

With that, I will now open the public hearing for four separate LPC designations including LU 167 for the Lesbian Herstory Archives in Brooklyn, LU 170 for the Samuel Gompers Industrial High School in the Bronx, LU 171 for the Julius' Bar Building in Manhattan, and Preconsidered LU for the Melrose

2.2

2.3

2 Parkside Historic District in Brooklyn under 3 application number N 230177 HKK.

Before we hear from the LPC's panelists,

I'll take this moment to read into the record

statements of support by some of my Colleagues in

whose districts these Landmark designations are being considered.

am in support of the Historic Landmark designation of the Samuel Gompers Industrial High School. This building was constructed in 1931/1932 and was one of the first vocational high schools in New York City devoted to a specific industry. The building continues to train the next generation of innovators and leaders at home to Mott Haven Community High School, Health, Education, and Research Occupations High School, also known as H.E.R.O., and New Visions Charter School for the Humanities. I hope that my Colleagues will join me in supporting this historic designation and vote yes."

I will now read remarks from Council

Member Bottcher. "I am proud to support the Historic

Landmark Designation of the Julius' Bar Building, New

York City's most significant site of pre-Stonewall

2.2

2.3

LGBTQ activism. Every LGBTQ New Yorker stands on the shoulders of those before us who came out, stood up, and were counted and demanded equality. I would like to thank the Landmarks Preservation Commission for their equitable approach to making our rich history visible because LGBTQ history is New York City history. I urge my Colleagues to join me in supporting this designation to vote yes."

I will now read remarks from Council

Member Hanif. "I am proud today to offer my support

for Landmark designation of the Lesbian Herstory

Archives. The Lesbian Herstory Archives is the

nation's oldest and largest collection of lesbian
and queer-related historical material. Borne out of

the movement for LGBTQ rights in New York City,

inclusion and community were at the forefront of its

founding. Since its inception, one of its founding

principles has been to be a place where ideas and

experiences from the past interact with the living

issues of the lesbian community. I would like to

thank the Landmarks Preservation Commission for

spotlighting the largely unseen but important history

of lesbian and queer New Yorkers. I urge my

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 Colleagues to join me in supporting this designation 3 and to vote yes.

Last but not least, Council Member Joseph is here as well, and I'd like to turn it over to Council Member Joseph to deliver her statement today. Council Member Joseph.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Good morning. Thank you, Chair Louis. I'd like to commend the applicant team for their consideration of the history of Flatbush. I'm pleased to support the designation of this block in my District. The houses on this block were built between 1909 and 1915 are well-preserved and architecturally distinctive within the Flatbush neighborhood. They stand out with their neoclassic architectural style and as early examples of the Kinko style two-family homes. Over the last century, the neighborhood has been home to black and Caribbean families, and designation preserves not only the buildings but the legacy of the people who created a community here. I encourage my Colleagues to join me in support and to vote yes on this Historic District designation. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Council Member Joseph.

DISPOSITIONS 1 With that, Counsel, would you please call 2 3 the LPC panelists and administer the affirmation? 4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Appearing today on behalf of the LPC is Kate Lemos McHale and also 5 available for Q and A is Sonia Guior. Panelists, 6 7 would you please raise your right hands and I'll ask 8 each of you individually in turn to answer the following. Do you swear to tell the truth, the whole 10 11 truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the Subcommittee and in answer to all Council 12 13 Member questions? Kate Lemos McHale. 14 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: I do. 15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Sonia Guior. 16 SONIA GUIOR: I do. 17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Thank you. 18 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: You may begin. 19 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you, Chair 20 Louis, and thank you, Subcommittee Members. I'm Kate Lemos McHale. I'm the Director of Research at 21

We're really glad to have the opportunity to present these recent designations. They have all

Landmarks. Sonia Guior joining me is our Director of

Community and Intergovernmental Affairs.

2.2

2.3

24

25

helped further LPC's goals of equitable designations through the five boroughs and they protect significant architectural character that highlight the City's diversity, and we've had good support for them.

Archives. If we could go to the next slide, please.

484 14th Street in Park Slope, Brooklyn is culturally significant as the home since 1991 of the Lesbian Herstory Archives, the nation's oldest and largest collection of lesbian-related historical material.

The organization's headquarters for over 30 years, this Renaissance Revival Style building is where the archives expanded its collection, grew to national prominence, and it continues to serve a vital role.

Next slide, please.

The Landmarks Preservation Commission

designated this building an individual landmark on

November 22nd. We received in-person and written

testimony in support of designation from 40 people

including representatives of the Lesbian Herstory

Archives, the New York City LGBT Historic Sites

Project, and several organizations, and we're really

grateful to have the support from Council Member

2.2

2.3

Hanif. The Archives is located within Brooklyn's Park Slope Historic District. It was originally a two-family row house. It was built in 1908, and it contributes to the character of the Historic District but, because that district was designated in 1973 before the Archives was located here, the report doesn't talk about the significance of the Archives and, in particular, the significant LGBTQ significance here so the designation as an individual landmark does recognize that significance, solidifies the period of significance to their time in the building, and is Brooklyn's first landmark designated specifically for LGBTQ significance. Next, please.

entirely volunteer-run non-profit organization. It was founded in 1974 by activist Joan Nestle and Deborah Edel and others, and it was originally housed in their apartment on the Upper West Side. This was a time when the LGBTQ community faced widespread legal and social discrimination, and the Archives began as a grassroots attempt to end the silence around lesbian history, to share lesbian stories as an integral piece of American history, and to create a physical archive for study and community gathering.

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

It was intentionally feminist in nature and inclusive with women of color among its early supporters and contributors. Next, please.

By 1991, the collection had outgrown its space, and the Archives raised enough money to purchase 484 14th Street in Park Slope which was the center of New York's lesbian community. After more than a year of renovations, the building was transformed into their new home with space for archival storage and display, offices, community space, and a caretaker's apartment on the top floor, and they were really drawn to it because it was a residential building and a residential feel which is how they started. They were able to pay off their mortgage which really had enormous significance in that they had a permanent home that could serve as a direct response to the pervasive homophobia, sexism, and lack of lesbian space the community had experienced. Next, please.

In this location, the Archives has grown to hold a wide variety of materials that have been collected and donated by lesbians themselves. The collections are national in scope. They include books, periodicals, files on lesbian activists and

community groups, audiovisual materials, oral histories, materials pertaining to issues like

4 marriage equality cases, and personal and

5 professional papers of lesbians from diverse

6 communities including, for example, from the African

7 American poet and activist Audre Lorde, and the

8 Archives continue to expand their collection and make

9 them more accessible by digitizing them. Next,

10 please.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

2

3

From this location, the community-based organization has broadened its national and international standing, inspired the creation of similar archival collections in other communities, and held numerous events and exhibitions and contributed extensively to important LGBTQ exhibitions in larger institutions. Next, please.

The Archives has diligently maintained the building. They've worked with LPC to make minor alterations such as the addition of a chairlift to support its use and accessibility as a public institution. The designation highlights its period of significance associated with the Lesbian Herstory Archives, which has really played such an essential role in telling the story of a mostly unseen

2.2

2.3

community of women who have contributed meaningfully to America's cultural, political, and social history. At the end of 2022, Time Out New York listed this designation among the 15 best things that happened in the city last year, which was great.

That's it for this one. Do you want me to go through all of them and then take your questions?

Okay.

If we could maybe go to Samuel Gompers High School.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Just need a couple of seconds to load up in between.

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: No worries. Great. If we could just go to the next slide. Thanks.

Located in the Mott Haven section of the South Bronx, Samuel Gompers Industrial High School is a significant civic structure. Designed in the mid-1920s by William H. Gompers and Walter C. Martin and constructed in 1931 to 1932, it blends medieval revival and art deco design features, and the arcaded brick facades and richly ornamented towers make the high school building distinctive among New York City school buildings. It was designated on December 6th, and the Commission received testimony supporting

2.2

2.3

designation from representatives of the Art Deco

Society of New York, Historic Districts Council, Mott

4 Haven Historic District Association, and the New York

5 Landmarks Conservancy, and we're really grateful for

6 Council Member Ayala's support as well. Next, please.

The impressive public structure was identified as a priority by LPC staff in survey work in the Bronx and as well as of schools as a typology. It really stands out as prominent. It fills almost an entire block it's highly visible, and this is an area where we don't have a lot of landmark designations. Next, please.

Samuel Gompers Industrial High School was originally planned as Bronx Vocational High School William H. Gompert, confusingly these architect and schools, was the Board of Education's architect and Buildings Superintendent, designed the school in a distinctive medieval revival style, which you can see on the left in 1924 to 1925. The architect, Walter C. Martin, who succeeded Gompert revised the design, changing the color of the brick from red to brown and adding elaborate art deco style ornament to the towers and entrances. The Board of Education began naming schools for inspiring individuals at the end

2.2

2.3

of the 1920s and the Bronx Vocational High School was renamed for Samuel Gompers, the first and longest serving President of the American Federation of Labor. Next, please.

The design reflected the school's innovative curriculum, which had evolved to focus exclusively on the study of electricity. It was the first school of this type in New York City and described as a model of its kind. The building has a square plan and two striking towers. Decoration of the towers features inscriptions and terra cotta reliefs that illustrate the various trades that depend on expertise in electricity like aviation, architecture, mechanics, etc. Above the three main entrances, large relief panels proclaim the structure's original purpose. Next, please.

Samuel Gompers Industrial High School for Boys opened in September 1935. The Wall Street

Journal reported that it had one of the most extensive complements of electrical laboratories every provided for an institution of this kind, and the New York Times praised its course in neon lighting which taught the principles of the Great White Way, which Broadway was called. Most of the

1

early students were from the Bronx and Upper

3 Manhattan and by the early 1970s most students were

black and Latino. We've learned one of its more 4

famous graduates was Grandmaster Flash. Girls were

first admitted in the early 1980s. The school closed 6

7 in 2012 and was converted to an educational campus

containing three independent secondary schools. Next, 8

please.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

With its striking architecture and innovative curriculum serving a diverse student body, Samuel Gompers Industrial High School is really among the City's most distinctive public high school buildings.

We can move to Julius' Bar Building, please. Okay, and the next slide, please.

Julius' Bar Building is New York City's most significant site of pre-Stonewall LGBTQ activism. In 1966, gay rights' activists staged a demonstration at Julius' to protest the closure of bars by city and state authorities simply for serving gay people. The event known ever since as the Sip In exemplified the movement's new eagerness to confront society's persecution of LGBTQ people head-on, embracing the direct action modeled on the Civil

2.2

2.3

Rights movement and anticipating the activism of
Stonewall and the Gay Liberation Movement. The
designation on December 6th received widespread
support and testimony including from Julius' Bar
owner Helen Buford, Sip-In witness Ricky Wicker who
referred to the event as "gay people's declaration of
independence," elected officials including New York
State Assembly Member Deborah Glick, State Senator
Brad Hoylman, several organizations including the NYC
LGBT Historic Sites Project and Village Preservation,
and more than 200 letters and emails, and we're very
grateful for Council Member Bottcher's support here
as well. We could go to the next slide, please.

Julius' is located at West 10th Street and Waverly Place in the Greenwich Village Historic District, and, as with the 2015 designation of Stonewall Inn, designating the Julius' Bar Building as an individual landmark officially recognizes its centrality to the history of the gay rights' movement and cements the moment of the crucial protest that took place here as its period of significance. Next, please.

The building evolved into its current form over the 19th and early 20th centuries and today

1

4

6

7

8 9

10

11

12 13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

appears much as it did at the time of the Sip-In. A saloon was operating there by 1900, and Julius' Bar and Restaurant opened by 1930 during Prohibition. It soon became known as a gathering place for artists, writers, and journalists and was the founding location of the Village Voice in 1955. Next, please.

At the time of the Sip-In, the LGBTQ community faced restrictive laws and legal and social discrimination across the country. Gay men were targeted as criminals in New York City and entrapment by plainclothes police officers was common. The State Liquor Authority viewed the mere presence of LGBTQ people on a premises as disorderly and revoked licenses from bars that served gay people. This practice could destroy the personal and professional lives of LGBTQ individuals as well as shut down the places where they were able to meet freely. In 1965, the Mattachine Society of New York, then the country's largest gay rights organization, was determined to stop the closure and secure the rights of gay men and lesbians to gather openly in public. These efforts were led by their new president, Dick Leitsch, who joined fellow activists Randy Wicker and Craig Rodwell who are shown here. Next, please.

2.2

2.3

The Mattachine Society planned a public action to document the discrimination and force the State Liquor Authority to answer for its policies. Three conservatively dressed men followed by the press would present a letter telling a bar manager they were gay and ask to be served. Though clearly not disorderly, they expected to be denied service since bar managers understood serving a known gay patron to be illegal. The action was carried by Leitsch, Rodwell, and John Timmons on April 21, 1966. Next, please.

After a few attempts, it was at Julius' which at the time attracted both gay and straight patrons, where the three men joined by Randy Wicker as a witness received their denial and were able to document it publicly. As Leitsch later recalled, the bartender covered the glass and said I can't serve you if you're gay, you know that, you're with the Mattachine Society, you know it's against the law to serve homosexuals, we got busted last week. Village Voice photographer Fred W. McDarrah's photo shown here capturing the moment is one of the iconic images of the early LGBTQ rights' movement. Next, please.

2.2

2.3

Media coverage included a sympathetic article in the Village Voice, and the New York Times using derogatory language typical of the time called the event a noontime Sip-In and that apparently coined the term that it's known as now. A few days later in the Times, William H. Booth who was the former head of the New York State NAACP and the City's new Commissioner of Human Rights stated his support for the Mattachine's goals and its opposition to "the denial of bar service to a homosexual simply for that reason. This was the strongest statement in favor of LGBTQ rights by a major city official up until that time. Next, please.

In recent years, the legacy of the Sip-In has increasingly come into focus. Dick Leitsch, Randy Wicker, and Craig Rodwell are considered pioneers and major figures in the city's gay rights' movement. The Sip-In itself represents the ascendency of a new militancy and fearlessness without which the 1969 Stonewall Rebellion might not have happened. As the site of the Sip-In, this building shines a light onto this activism and it remains a place of active LGBTQ history commemoration. Mayor Adams and Council Member Eric Bottcher celebrated the designation at Julius'

_

that day and among news and social media coverage the designation was also listed among the coolest things that happened in the city last year which was great.

Next, please.

This is the end. The last one is the Melrose Park Site Historic District. I can just start in.

The Melrose Park Site Historic District is a cohesive group of 38 architecturally and significant single- and two-family duplex row houses designed by two prolific Brooklyn architects and built between 1909 and 1915. It has a strong sense of place from its intact historic character and contains likely the largest and most distinctive collection in the city of a house type unique to Brooklyn known as the Kinko House. Next, please.

The Historic District is located on

Parkside Avenue between Flatbush and Bedford Avenues

in the Flatbush neighborhood of Brooklyn. It was

identified through surveys and in response to

requests from property owners to evaluate it, and

some of our supporters are shown here on the slide

being interviewed by New York 1. In our study of the

district within the broader neighborhood, we really

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

did find it to stand out for the quality of the 2 3 architecture and the consistency and integrity in 4 comparison to the surrounding areas. The district as you can see here includes just the row houses that were built in a very short period of time and share 6 7 this great quality. Outreach and engagement with 8 property owners began before the pandemic and continued through many conversations, and we had two virtual meetings with property owners to talk about 10 11 the study, to explain what living in a historic district means, and to help build understanding and 12 13 support for the District. We did get a lot of support 14 here in letters and in testimony, including from some 15 lifelong residents. We did also hear from some people concerned about regulation who opposed designation, 16 17 and all of that record is in the designation report. 18 Next, please.

The name Melrose Parkside reflects the early history of the block where an 18th century manor house called Melrose Hall was once located and became the namesake for a planned suburban development in the 19th century that actually never came to pass. The property was sold to a wealthy brewer whose son, William Arthur Alexander Brown

began developing it with single- and two-family houses in the early 20th century, and they were built between 1909 and 1915 in distinct rows as you can see here. Next, please.

The dominant house type within the district is an unusual type of two-family duplex apparently unique to Brooklyn. The Kings and Westchester Land Company first developed these in 1905 in other neighborhoods and marketed them as Kinko Houses. They were designed to offer greater privacy than conventional two-family brownstones with completely separate entrances. Brown, the developer, envisioned Parkside Avenue as an exclusive neighborhood and marketed his duplex houses as "the most perfect houses ever built for two families yet with the privacy of a one-family house." Next, please.

2.2

2.3

The architect, Benjamin Driesler,

composed six distinct alternative designs in the

classical vocabulary to create what the Brooklyn

Eagle described as the latest type of modern house

building with artistic and varied fronts of fine

architectural design. The two rows of these houses in

the district are the largest and most distinctive

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

collection of this house type that we know of in the city. Next, please.

In 1912, Brown again turned to Benjamin Driesler to design a row of eight single-family houses which he marketed as "easy housekeeping, nobasement houses," and these have deep open areaways and they have a variety of classically inspired elements and wide terraces. Next, please.

In 1913, Eli H. Bishop and Son began building a row 10 American basement plan singlefamily houses. Those were built by 1915, designed in the neoclassical style by the architect, Axel Hedman, and these are quiet elegant houses and feature prominent central entrances and a variety of (INAUDIBLE) or flat bays. Next, please.

Early residents in the district were white and predominantly born in the United States. By the mid-20th century, Flatbush saw a large increase in African American and Afro-Caribbean residents. The area soon became the center of the city's growing Afro-Caribbean community, and today this vibrant block of Parkside Avenue continues to reflect the diversity of Flatbush. The Block Association is active, and the community's excellent stewardship of

these buildings contributes to its special character and sense of place. Next, please.

With this distinctive variety of row houses united by classically inspired design elements, the Melrose Parkside District has highly intact historic character and a strong sense of place. The Commission voted unanimously to designate the District, and we're very grateful to have Council Member Joseph's support here.

 $\mbox{I'm happy to answer any questions you}$ have on this or any of the previous designations.

Want to say thank you for capturing the true
historical essence of each project in your testimony.
I really appreciate it. Council Member Joseph had to
run to another hearing. She had three quick questions
so I'll ask them and then open it up for my
Colleagues. What are the consequences of not
landmarking this block?

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: That's a good question, and I think that this is an area where people are seeing development kind of encroaching around it, and we did hear from some property owners here concerns about that so I think by not

2.2

2.3

designating it then you run the risk that a building could be demolished and replaced by something really out of character or something that would disrupt the character of the block so I think the people who live here and the support we got, some people who have lived here for 40 years, really do appreciate that

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Does the landmark status make upkeep of the homes more expensive for homeowners?

character and wanted to see it protected.

question we get, and actually it's one that we talk about a lot with people when we're trying to make sure they understand. Landmark designation does come with more responsibility. You need to put projects through a review process with the Landmarks

Commission, and it's hard to say really what a change in cost might be because we don't know what people would've done otherwise.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: But there's definitely a cost?

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Well, I think there are, and I'll talk you through some things.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I'm aware of it. Just 2 for the record, for those that are listening.

4

3

require homeowners to make change. It allows change.

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Landmarks doesn't

6

5

their buildings. We don't require certain contractors

People come to us with what they want to do with

8

7

or architects so people can choose who they want to

actually help guide people to do things that are

work with. Our staff has a lot of expertise to

11

10

better in the long-run health of their building. A

12 13

actually in the labor, like if you have to repoint a

lot of work that people do on buildings, the cost is

14

façade, and so we can guide people to make sure that

15

16 actually preserve the building better and may save

they're using the right mortar that's going to

17

money in the long run. We guide people to replace

18

19

there historically and doors. There is flexibility,

windows with units that are appropriate to what was

20

for example, if you have a one-over-one sash window,

21

we can really approve any kind of replacement for

2.2

that as long as it fits into the historic frame, and

2.3

so we have those row house districts throughout the city and our staff is very accustomed to the needs of

24

Q

Z 4

the owners of these houses so we really do what we can to try to help them achieve what they need to.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. We were joined by Council Member Nurse, and Council Member Vernikov has a quick question.

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: My question is if the individual property owner, if a specific individual property owner would like to opt out of the landmark designation, do you know if that's a possibility?

doesn't require owner support or consent to a designation. We do work really hard to get it though because this is kind of a contract that's going on and on, and we want to be able to work with people who want to be part of it. In a district, it's not uncommon to have some people that are not as supportive as others. We work really hard to make sure people understand our process and have someone they can talk to in our staff, and we try to get a majority of support.

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: So it wouldn't be possible if I understand correctly?

2.2

2.3

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: To have one person opt out of a district, no, typically no.

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Do any of my other Colleagues have any questions?

All right, since there are no questions, the applicant panel is excused.

Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish to testify on any of these four items?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Yes, Chair Louis.

There are approximately five public witnesses who have signed up to speak remotely.

If you a member of the public signed up to testify on any of these LPC designations, please stand by as you hear your names being called and prepare to speak when the Chair says that you may begin.

Please also note that in the event that Council Members have questions, you're asked to remain online until excused as Council Members may have questions.

We will now hear from the five witnesses in the following order. First, we will hear Amanda

Davis who will be followed by Michael Lent who will be followed Cheryl Sealey. Amanda Davis to testify

4 first.

1

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Amanda, you may begin.

AMANDA DAVIS: Good morning. Can you hear

7 me, Council Members?

 $\label{eq:chairperson Louis: Yes, we can, and you} $$ $$ \text{may begin.}$

AMANDA DAVIS: Okay, thank you. My name is Amanda Davis, and I'm the Project Manager of the New York City LGBT Historic Sites Project. I'll be testifying in support of the Lesbian Herstory Archives and Julius' Bar Building.

Just quickly, we're an award-winning and nationally recognized cultural heritage initiative founded in 2015 to document historic places connected to the LGBTQ community in the city's five boroughs, and we're proud to say that New York City continues to lead the nation in the number of LGBTQ officially landmarked sites.

The project strongly supports the designation of the Lesbian Herstory Archives as a New York City landmark which is the first LGBTQ historic site to be designated in Brooklyn. When we launched

our website with an inaugural 100 sites several years 2 ago, the Lesbian Herstory Archives was included. Its 3 4 resources, particularly its archival photographs, have also been invaluable to our project in documenting many of the 430-plus sites on our 6 7 website. With a history that plans nearly 50 years and 30 of those in Park Slope, the Lesbian Herstory 8 Archives is likely the first longstanding lesbianspecific community space in the city. It's also an 10 11 early example of a group run by and for lesbians. The 12 Archives was born out a need to provide a voice for 13 lesbians who often felt underrepresented and unheard in gay male dominated groups and to connect emerging 14 15 lesbian artists and writers with more established 16 ones at a time when lesbians were less visible in the 17 mainstream culture and access to this previously 18 unknown lesbian-affirming literature, ephemera, and other archival items has also empowered women and 19 linked them with their past. The Archives' location 20 21 in Park Slope also speaks to the importance of the 2.2 neighborhood to lesbian history because by the early 2.3 1990s Park Slope was popular with lesbians and their families as a place to live and find community, and 24 several lesbian-associated groups and businesses 25

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

including the Archives operated here and so this designation of the Archives Building as a New York City landmark would also highlight and celebrate Park Slope's significance to the lesbian community.

For Julius' Bar, we also strongly support the designation of this building as a New York City landmark. In 1994, when LGBTO representation as a whole was virtually visible in mainstream society, our three project founders helped create what we believe is the first map in the country to document LGBTQ historic places, and the building that houses Julius' was included. The NYC LGBT Historic Sites Project was founded as a continuation of this early 1990s effort, and landmarking the Julius' Bar Building was one of its first priorities. We researched and wrote the National Register of Historic Places nomination for Julius' which was approved in April 2016, one day before the 50th anniversary of the so-called Sip-In. Julius' being located just a few-minutes walk from the more famous Stonewall Inn means that it has a place in LGBTQ history that is just as significant. The events at Stonewall in June 1969 did not exist in a vacuum. In the decades leading up to that uprising, bars were

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 one of the few places that LGBTQ people could gather 3 openly. Yet, at the same time, there were always 4 inherent risks since the mere presence of a homosexual in a bar was considered to be disorderly, frequent police raids and other forms of entrapment 6 7 could lead to arrests, loss of employment, and 8 physical and mental abuse among other threats. With photographers in tow, the game-changing public action by the Mattachine Society on April 21, 1966, which 10 11 culminated at Julius' was the earliest planned effort 12 to capture LGBTQ discrimination in real-time, and 13 when we give walking tours in the area we typically end at Julius', and young people, in particular, are 14 15 often surprised to learn that at one time, even in 16 New York City and even in Greenwich Village, LGBTQ 17 people faced these hardships in bars of all places. 18 Julius' is therefore not only a great place to hang 19 out but also a valuable teaching tool, and so today 20 the NYC LGBT Historic Sites Project asks that the 21 City Council Subcommittee on Landmarks...

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time has expired.

AMANDA DAVIS: Approves this designation for Julius' Bar and the Lesbian Herstory Archives. Thank you.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Amanda. Now, we'll hear from Michael.

MICHAEL LENT: Good morning, Chair Louis, and I want to thank our Council Woman Joseph and also the Landmarks Commission on supporting the Melrose Parkside Historic District.

My name is Michael Lent, and I live at 393-395 Parkside Avenue along with my wife, Diane, who's with me here and co-owners Jennifer Levy (phonetic) and Paul Schwab (phonetic). Our home is one of the Kinko homes designed and built in 1909 and 1910. We have lived at 393-395 Parkside for the past 22 years, and we bought our home in 1999 and moved here in 2000. We were attracted to the block because of the beautiful historic homes, the diversity of the neighborhood, and the welcoming neighbors we met. Many people, both homeowners and renters, have lived on the block for many, many years. We have a wonderful block association that has fostered a strong sense of community. Starting in 2015, we became aware that developers had determined that the neighborhood was an up-and-coming one and started buying homes on adjacent blocks, tearing them down, and building new multi-family dwellings, often not in

2	keeping with the neighborhoods' or blocks' character.
3	The dwellings torn down included wonderful all brick
4	and stone homes. This concerned many of our
5	homeowners and resulted in a group of homeowners
6	providing the New York City Landmarks Commission with
7	information on the historic nature of the homes on
8	our block and gaining the support of many of the
9	block's homeowners. We actually started this process
10	in 2016 so it's been literally seven years that we've
11	been working on this. We've petitioned the Landmarks
12	Preservation Commission several times. We understand
13	some of the extra work we needed to do to submit to
14	staff review, but we think the trade-off is worth it
15	in maintaining the character of this community, which
16	is of vital importance to us. Again, we appreciate so
17	much the work of the Landmarks Preservation
18	Commission in support of this effort and also our
19	City Council Woman Rita Joseph as well. Thank you
20	very much.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Michael. Now, we'll hear from Cheryl.

CHERYL SEALEY: Good morning. Thank you for allowing me to speak this morning.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Good morning, Cheryl. You may start. You have two minutes.

CHERYL SEALEY: Okay. I'm a longtime

resident of Parkside. One second. Sorry. I'm a longtime resident of 25+ years and a homeowner on Parkside Avenue. I've watched our community decimated by overdevelopment, homes on adjoining blocks destroyed to make way for new and out-of-context development. The early years had its struggles, but today we are facing new challenges of gentrification, overdevelopment, and destruction of existing homes. Parkside Avenue has experienced the same struggles and threats. We are a diverse block of not just private homes but also home to large amount of rentstabilized apartments including two HDFC buildings. Parkside is not just fighting to save the homes on the block but to preserve this diverse, inclusive, and caring community that we have created throughout the years. I urge the New York City Council Land Use Committee to support the designation of Parkside Avenue as a New York City Landmark Block. Thank you.

All right, you may start.

Julie available or Jesse?

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Cheryl. Is

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

JESSE MILLER: We're in a similar situation to Michael, and I'd like to really second everything he said. He basically told our situation. The only thing I'd like to add is that instead of his 22 years, we've been here for 38. As far as the block preserving historical or architectural significance status, I think the Landmark Commission has done a great job with that. I'd just like to answer really one of the key questions that was asked was do we need this status, and I would heartily add yes to that. As the other people have said, development is going crazy in our neighborhood and homes are being torn down and replaced with apartment buildings. The specific threat to our block is partially demolition, but the worst thing which could happen and is more likely to happen is someone adding floors on top of these houses which are generally always completely out of character and really ugly. That's what I'd like to say. We appreciate your consideration of this and would like to say that we and many of the other homeowners are in support of the designation.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. Can you state your name?

JESSE MILLER: Me?

2.2

2.3

2 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: State your full name,
3 yes.

JESSE MILLER: Yeah, Jesse Miller.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Okay. Now, we'll hear from Julie.

Want to add one piece which is that we do have a very tightknit block between homeowners and apartment dwellers, and I have spoken to many of our neighbors who are not homeowners, and they, too, are in favor of landmarking because they love living on a block where there is so much beauty. As a homeowner myself, I just want to say that I don't only see myself as enjoying the benefits of my own home, but I feel like I am stewarding architectural history, and that's a responsibility that I accept, and if it costs a little bit more I'm willing to accept that too. Thank you very much for considering this.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Julie. Do any of my Colleagues have any questions for the panel?

All right, Counsel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: If there are any other members of the public who wish to testify on

2.2

2.3

2 any of the LPC designations heard today, please press

3 the raise hand button now if participating remotely.

If you are here in person wishing to testify, please

5 see one of the Sergeants to submit a speaker card.

Members of the public who wish to testify on LU 167 related to the Lesbian Herstory Archives at 484 14th Street in Brooklyn, LU 170 related to the Samuel Gompers Industrial High School in the Bronx, LU 171 for the Julius' Bar Building in Manhattan, And Preconsidered LU related to the application N 230177 HKK for the Melrose Parkside Historic District in Brooklyn, the public hearing for these items is closed and the items are laid over.

Now, I would like to take the time again to recognize any of my Colleagues. I recognized Council Member Nurse already.

I will now hand it over to Counsel to call for a vote.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: On a vote to approve the designations, Chair Louis.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I now call for a vote to approve the Preconsidered application numbers G 220027 SCQ and G 220028 SCQ along with LUS 167, 170,

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS 53
2	171, and Preconsidered application number N 230177
3	HKK. Counsel, please call the roll.
4	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Chair Louis.
5	CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I vote aye.
6	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
7	Feliz.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Aye on all.
9	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
10	Marte.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Aye on all.
12	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
13	Nurse.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: I vote aye.
15	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
16	Ung.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye.
18	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
19	Vernikov.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Aye.
21	COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: By a vote of six
22	in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no
23	abstentions, the items are approved and referred to
24	the full Land Use Committee.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Congratulations to all my Colleagues. That concludes today's business. I remind you that if you have written testimony on today's items, you may submit it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicate the LU number or the project name or the project addressed in the subject heading. I would like to thank the members of the public, my Colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land Use Staff, and Sergeant-at-Arms for their participation today. This meeting is hereby adjourned. [GAVEL]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 25, 2023