

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON MENTAL  
HEALTH, DISABILITIES, AND  
ADDICTION

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON HOSPITALS

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON FIRE AND  
EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

----- X

Monday, February 6, 2023

Start: 10:18 a.m.

Recess: 5:00 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Linda Lee, Chairperson  
Mercedes Narcisse, Chairperson  
Kamillah Hanks, Chairperson  
Joann Ariola, Chairperson

## COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu  
Diana Ayala  
Charles Barron  
Erik D. Bottcher  
Justin L. Brannan  
Gale A. Brewer  
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers  
Tiffany Cabán  
David M. Carr  
Carmen N. De La Rosa  
Oswald Feliz  
James F. Gennaro  
Jennifer Gutiérrez  
Robert F. Holden  
Rita C. Joseph  
Darlene Mealy  
Francisco P. Moya  
Kevin C. Riley  
Keith Powers  
Carlina Rivera  
Althea V. Stevens  
Shahana K. Hanif  
Vickie Paladino  
Nantasha M. Williams  
Kalman Yeger  
Public Advocate Jumaane Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jason Hansman  
Deputy Director  
Mental Health Initiatives, Crisis  
Response, and Community Capacity  
Mayor's Office of Community Mental Health

Omar Fattal, MD  
Systems Chief for Behavioral Health  
Co-Deputy Chief Medical Officer  
New York City Health and Hospitals

Michael Fields  
Chief of Emergency Medical Services  
New York City Fire Department

Theresa Tobin  
Chief of Interagency Operations  
New York City Police Department

Juanita Holmes  
Chief of Training  
New York City Police Department

Michael Clarke  
Director of the Legislative Affairs Unit  
New York City Police Department

Jamie Neckles  
Assistant Commissioner  
Bureau of Mental Health  
New York City Health Department

Karim Walker  
Outreach and an Organizing Specialist  
Safety Net Project, Urban Justice Center

Graham Nyaasi  
Advocacy Specialist at Community Access  
Steering Committee Member of  
Correct Crisis, Intervention Today NYC.

Danny Kim speaking for Eric Vassell  
Justice Committee

Ellen Trawick  
Mother of Kawaski Trawick

Christine Henson  
Mother of Andrew Henson

Oren Barzilay  
FDNY EMS, President of Local 2507

Selena Trowell  
Vocal New York Homeless Union

Beth Haroules  
New York Civil Liberties Union

Siya Hegde  
Housing Policy Counsel  
Bronx Defenders

Elena Landriscina  
Staff Attorney  
Legal Aid Society

Anthony Feliciano  
Vice President for Community Mobilization  
Housing Works

Rabbi Joshua Stanton  
Tirdof: NY Jewish Clergy for Justice

Craig Hughes  
Social Worker  
Bronx office of Mobilization For Justice

Antonine Pierre  
Brooklyn Movement Center

Toni Smith  
New York State Director  
Drug Policy Alliance

Danielle Regis  
Supervising Attorney  
Mental Health Representation Team  
Criminal Defense Practice  
Brooklyn Defender Services

Dr. Samuel Jackson  
Psychiatrist  
New York Doctors Coalition

Dr. Michael Zingman  
Psychiatry at Bellevue Hospital  
Secretary Treasurer  
Committee of Interns and Residents

Dr. Ashley Brittain  
Resident physician of Emergency medicine  
Regional Delicate  
Committee of Interns and Residents

Luke Sikinyi  
Director of Public Policy  
New York Association of  
Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services

Chaplain Dr. Victoria Phillips (Dr. V)  
Mental Health Project  
Urban Justice Center

Dr. Betty Kolod  
Primary Care Physician  
New York Doctors Coalition

Jessica Fear  
Senior Vice President for Behavioral  
Health  
VNS Health

Fiodhna O'Grady  
Samaritans of New York

Casey Starr  
Co-Executive Director  
Samaritans of New York

Toni Smith  
New York State Director  
Drug Policy Alliance

Danielle Regis  
Supervising Attorney  
Mental Health Representation Team  
Criminal Defense Practice  
Brooklyn Defender Services

Dr. Samuel Jackson  
Psychiatrist  
New York Doctors Coalition

Dr. Michael Zingman  
Psychiatry at Bellevue Hospital  
Secretary Treasurer  
Committee of Interns and Residents

Dr. Ashley Brittain  
Resident physician of Emergency medicine  
Regional Delicate  
Committee of Interns and Residents

Luke Sikinyi  
Director of Public Policy  
New York Association of  
Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services

Chaplain Dr. Victoria Phillips (Dr. V)  
Mental Health Project  
Urban Justice Center

Dr. Betty Kolod  
Primary Care Physician  
New York Doctors Coalition

Jessica Fear  
Senior Vice President, Behavioral Health  
VNS Health

Fiodhna O'Grady  
Samaritans of New York

Casey Starr  
Co-Executive Director  
Samaritans of New York

Helen "Skip" Skipper  
Justice Peer Initiative

Sarah Blanco  
Clinical Director  
Midtown Community Court Midtown  
Center for Justice Innovation

Nadia Swanson  
Licensed Clinical Social Worker  
Director of Technical Assistance and  
Advocacy  
Ali Forney Center

Christina Sparrock  
A Founder of Person Centered Intervention  
Training  
Mental Health Response Pilot

Lena Allen  
Policy Analyst  
Fountain House

Nadia Chait  
Senior Director of Policy and Advocacy  
The Center for Alternative Sentencing and  
Employment Services

Alexandra Nyman  
CEO  
Break Free Foundation

Ruth Lowenkron  
Director, Disability Justice Program  
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Jason Bowen  
Peer Advocate  
Community Access Crisis Respite

Richard  
Homeless person

Dr. Jeremy Kidd  
President  
New York County Psychiatric Society

Sandra Gresl  
Co-Chair, Social Welfare Law Committee  
New York City Bar Association

Deborah Berkman  
Supervising Attorney  
Shelter Advocacy Initiative  
New York Legal Assistance Group

Lauren Galloway  
Advocacy Coordinator  
Coalition for Homeless Youth

Carolyn Strudwick  
Associate Vice President  
Street Work Project  
Safe Horizon

Dr. Erick Eiting  
President  
New York County Medical Society

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,  
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 11

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to  
4 today's New York City Council hearing for the  
5 Committees on Hospitals, Mental Health, Public Safety  
6 and Fire and Emergency Management at this time please  
7 silence all electronic devices. Chairs we are ready  
8 to begin.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Good morning everyone.  
10 My name is Councilmember Linda Lee, Chair of the  
11 Committee on Mental Health, Disabilities, and  
12 Addiction. I'd like to thank all my colleagues,  
13 Councilmembers Mercedes Nasrcisse, Chair the  
14 Committee on Hospitals, Councilmember Joanne Ariola  
15 who's with us virtually, Chair of the Committee on  
16 Fire and Emergency Management, and Councilmember  
17 Camilla Hanks Chair the Committee on Public Safety  
18 for being here at today's joint hearing on oversight  
19 for mental health and voluntary removals, and Mayor  
20 Adams recently announced plan. And I also want to  
21 thank all of the folks who are here from the Admin  
22 who are here to testify.

23 This may be a long hearing, so I want to thank  
24 all of you, potentially-- I want to thank all of you  
25 ahead of time for your patience. And just as a  
reminder, you know, just to keep it respectful and

2 cordial in the chambers and if there's any issues,  
3 please let us know or any of the staff know as well.

4 So thank you so much. As I mentioned,  
5 representatives from OCMH, Health and Hospitals,  
6 FDNY, NYPD, and DOHMH for being here to provide  
7 testimony and answer the Committee's questions.

8 And we will also be hearing two bills Proposed  
9 Intro 273 A sponsored by Chair Narcisse, which would  
10 require police officers to receive training related  
11 to recognizing and interacting with individuals with  
12 autism spectrum disorder, and Intro 706 sponsored by  
13 Councilmember Shaun Abreu, which would require the  
14 Office of Community Mental Health to create an online  
15 services portal and guide on available mental health  
16 services in this city.

17 So at this time, I'd like to acknowledge our  
18 colleagues who are here with us today. So I'm just  
19 going to stand up so I could see everyone. We have  
20 Councilmember Cabán, Councilmember Barron,  
21 Councilmember Hanif, Councilmember Bottcher. Our  
22 Public Advocate has joined us Jumaane Williams. We  
23 have Councilmember Rita Joseph, of course, our Chair,  
24 fellow Chairs, and we have Councilmember De La Rosa,  
25 Majority Leader Keith Powers. We have Councilmember

2 Vicki Paladino, Councilmember Holden, Councilmember  
3 Carr. So thank you all for joining us today and for  
4 being with us.

5 And it's also great to see my fellow social  
6 service colleagues, former colleagues in the audience  
7 as well who will be testifying today.

8 To begin the term Serious Mental Illness or SMI  
9 as defined by DSM as a mental health disorder that  
10 substantially interferes with or limits one or more  
11 major life activities. All mental health conditions  
12 have the potential to interfere with someone's  
13 quality of life, so it's important to note that in  
14 many instances, using quote/unquote "serious" to  
15 refer to a mental health condition can vary depending  
16 on the context. Generally, SMI refers to disorders  
17 such as schizophrenia and subsets of major depression  
18 and bipolar disorder.

19 In New York City, nearly one in every 25 adults  
20 is living with a diagnosed SMI, and according to the  
21 most recent statistics, although white New Yorkers  
22 have a higher percentage of SMI diagnoses, black New  
23 Yorkers actually have higher hospitalization rates.  
24 Adding to this suffering is the fact that according  
25 to OCMH, the highest poverty neighborhoods have over

2 twice as many psychiatric hospitalizations per capita  
3 compared to the lowest poverty neighborhoods.

4 We are not here to dispute the seriousness of  
5 this issue or does to dispute that we are in a  
6 psychiatric and homelessness crisis which deserves  
7 recognition as well as our immediate support and  
8 action, but we are here today to talk specifically  
9 about the Mayor's recently announced directive to  
10 city agencies, which provides updated guidance on how  
11 to carry out involuntary removals of individuals with  
12 SMI in our communities. The directive interprets the  
13 state's mental health hygiene law standard for  
14 involuntary removal, which provides that law  
15 enforcement, peace officers, or mobile outreach teams  
16 may remove any person who appears to be mentally ill,  
17 and is conducting themselves in a manner which is  
18 likely to result in serious harm to the person or  
19 others. The law explicitly states that "likely to  
20 result in serious harm" means a substantial risk of  
21 physical harm to other persons as manifested by  
22 homicidal or other violent behavior by which others  
23 are placed in reasonable fear of serious physical  
24 harm. However, both the State Office of Mental  
25 Health and the Administration have released guidance

2 that interprets this standard as also applying to  
3 those who appear mentally ill and display an  
4 inability to meet basic living needs such as lack of  
5 food, clothing, or shelter. In other words, this  
6 standard permits unhoused individuals in our  
7 communities to be removed even when they have not  
8 committed an observable or overtly dangerous act.

9 I respect the Administration's dedication to the  
10 psychiatric care crisis in our city, but I would be  
11 remiss not to mention that there are many valid  
12 concerns that come with this standard. We do not  
13 want New Yorkers being removed from our communities  
14 merely because they are homeless or unhoused, only to  
15 be cycled out of hospitals and back onto the streets  
16 without adequate care or housing. We do not want New  
17 Yorkers with disabilities and substance abuse  
18 problems to be unfairly targeted due to inadequate  
19 training by those carrying out this directive, and we  
20 do not want black and brown New Yorkers to experience  
21 the brunt of the trauma that may occur if this  
22 directive is not carried out equitably.

23 The goal of today's hearing is not just to gather  
24 more information on the Mayor's directive, and how it  
25 will be implemented, but also to receive feedback

3 from community based groups, nonprofits, public  
4 defender organizations, medical and mental health  
5 professionals, and other advocates on how this plan  
6 will directly impact our communities and to hear any  
7 recommendations for improving oversight of this plan  
8 going forward.

9 In closing, I'd like to thank the Administration  
10 and the dedicated advocates and community members  
11 here today that are here to testify. I would also  
12 like to thank my colleagues and staff as well as the  
13 Committee staff, Committee Counsel, Sarah Sucher, and  
14 Senior Legislative Policy Analyst, Christy Dwyer, for  
15 their work on this hearing, who both have extensive  
16 knowledge and experience in this area.

17 I will now turn the mic to my colleague Chair  
18 Narcisse of the Hospitals-- Oh, I'm sorry, Chair  
19 Ariola. Just kidding. To give her opening  
20 statement.

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you Chair Lee. Good  
22 morning to everyone joining us here. My name is  
23 Joanne Ariola, and I'm the Chair to the Fire and  
24 Emergency Management Committee. I'd first like to  
25 thank my colleagues, Chairs Camilla Hanks, Linda Lee  
and Mercedes Narcisse, for holding today's hearing.

2 In the interest of time, I will keep my opening  
3 brief, because the Committees have a lot to examine  
4 and discuss in relation to the Mayor's recent plan on  
5 mental health involuntary removals.

6 As we all know, New York City Emergency Medical  
7 Services personnel, provide critical emergency care  
8 and work endless hours helping ensure the well-being  
9 of New Yorkers. Their responsibilities ranged from  
10 responding to cardiac arrests, fires, automotive  
11 accidents, as well as numerous other incidences. EMS  
12 first responders are often the frontline of  
13 responding to 911 calls and are tasked with providing  
14 immediate care, which includes the responsibility of  
15 caring for individuals with emotional disturbances or  
16 other serious health illnesses.

17 The Committee wants to examine what steps the  
18 fire department has taken, and plans to take moving  
19 forward to ensure that EMS personnel is receiving the  
20 necessary training to handle the individuals with  
21 serious mental health illness. Specifically, has the  
22 Department provided professional training on properly  
23 identifying if someone is under duress, de-escalation  
24 and self defense tactics if personnel are under  
25 attack, and are personnel provided with adequate

1 equipment to handle cases involving individuals  
2 identified with mental health issues?

3  
4 I have concern over assaults that have taken  
5 place on EMS personnel, and how these incidents of  
6 workplace violence have increased over the years.  
7 Ultimately, we are here to support these first  
8 responders provide the proper care for their in the  
9 individuals who have serious mental health, illness,  
10 and work to avoid further increase of assaults  
11 against EMS workers by ensuring the safety of these  
12 vital public servants.

13 Again, thank you all for being here today  
14 regarding this very important issue, and hopefully,  
15 at the conclusion of today's hearing, we will all  
16 have a better understanding of how the city plans to  
17 address and support New Yorkers with Serious Mental  
18 Illness, as well as providing the necessary tools and  
19 training and safety equipment needed for our first  
20 responders.

21 I'd also like to thank our committee's legal  
22 staff, led by Josh Kingsley, and our Chief Analyst,  
23 William Hongash.

24 And now I'd like to turn the mic over to Chair  
25 Lee.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Chair  
3 Ariola. Now I'd like to turn over to Chair Narcisse  
4 of the Hospitals Committee to give her opening  
5 statement.

6 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Good morning, and I want  
7 to say thank you to my colleague, Linda Lee, Hanks,  
8 and Ariola, for being part of this needed process to  
9 see how we are functioning in as a city when it comes  
10 to mental health.

11 Good morning, everyone. I'm Councilmember nurses  
12 Chair of the Committee on Hospitals. Thank you for  
13 joining us for this very important hearing to discuss  
14 Mayor Adam's recently announced plan regarding mental  
15 health involuntary removals.

16 As many of you know, mental health has been one  
17 of the most overlooked and neglected issues in our  
18 healthcare and justice system. According to the  
19 National Institute of Mental Health, 1 in every 25  
20 New Yorkers suffer from a diagnosed Serious Mental  
21 Illness known as SMI. That is over 3.38 million New  
22 Yorkers that might be suffering from schizophrenia,  
23 severe depression, bipolar disorder. Just last year,  
24 over 131,000 mental health crisis calls were made to  
25 911. This equates to roughly 500 calls per day.

3 NYPD are usually the first to arrive from the  
4 response team, who often lack proper training in  
5 interacting with individual with SMI or developmental  
6 disabilities which could further escalate the  
7 situation, jeopardizing the lives of the officers,  
8 the individual suffering from the crisis, and the  
9 people involved. It should not be this way.

10 So, today, I am proud to announce my Intro 273 A,  
11 which could require police officers to receive  
12 training related to recognizing and interacting with  
13 individuals with autism spectrum disorder so they  
14 could be better equipped when encountering someone  
15 suffering from a crisis. As you know, the mental  
16 health crisis is a multifaceted issue that has been  
17 brewing over decades of policy misshapes and has only  
18 been exacerbated by the pandemic. According to OCMH  
19 2023 Annual Report, one of the greatest challenges  
20 facing the provision of mental health services is the  
21 current workforce shortage.

22 The CEO of Mental Health Association of New York  
23 State, Glenn Lippmann, said in an interview that  
24 COVID-19 has amplified the shortage tenfold, as some  
25 mental health programs are seeing 30 to 40% vacancy  
rates. Additionally, many of the cities er are

3 overwhelmed by the influx of individuals suffering  
4 from mental health crises. Psychiatric staff is  
5 overworked, understaffed, and underpaid. We need to  
6 create better incentives and working conditions for  
7 our healthcare workers who care and nurture us back  
8 to health.

9 Additionally, the city has a severe shortage of  
10 psychiatry beds. We know that. For a population of  
11 about 8.47 million New Yorkers. The city only has  
12 2225 functioning psychiatric beds. According to a  
13 Wall Street Journal report, during the peak of the  
14 pandemic, about 14,000 individuals suffering from  
15 mental health issues were prematurely discharged  
16 without any proper follow up. The current rise in  
17 mentally distress people could be attributed to the  
18 untimely discharges as there was an 8% increase in  
19 911 calls related to mental health crisis between  
20 2021 and 2022.

21 This is a clear need for investment in our mental  
22 health landscape with a focus on black and brown  
23 communities who are often neglected and giving the  
24 short end of the stick. If you look at the statistic  
25 in 2017 SMI prevalence among white New Yorkers was  
seven times higher than among black New Yorkers, and

2 yet, black New Yorkers had a higher rate of mental  
3 health related hospitalization than any other ethnic  
4 groups. In fact, according to the Mayor's Office of  
5 Community Mental Health, the highest priority  
6 neighborhoods, which as we know, tend to house black  
7 and brown communities, have over twice as many  
8 psychiatric hospitalization per capita as the lowest  
9 priority new neighborhoods in New York City. This  
10 fact paints a clear of the systematic inequalities  
11 that are prevalent in our healthcare system.

12 Since this hearing is about involuntary removal,  
13 I would be remiss if I did not remind my fellow city  
14 and the state legislature and administrators to be  
15 mindful of the broad nature of voluntary removal  
16 directives and guidelines and how they can impact  
17 certain communities.

18 Surely, a lot of work needs to be done around a  
19 credible mental health axis in New York City, but I  
20 want to give credit where it is do believe it or not.  
21 Thank you, Governor Hochul and Mayor Adams for  
22 bringing in much needed funding in efforts to fix our  
23 mental health care system by restoring psychiatric  
24 beds lost during the pandemic, creating loan  
25 repayment plans for psychiatric doctors and nurses

2 and a funding program to help New Yorkers suffering  
3 from mental illnesses. And most importantly, I want  
4 to say thank you to my city agencies, H&H, DOHMH,  
5 OCMH, and NYPD, FDNY, EMS and all the advocates  
6 present. As you are the people working on the ground  
7 and making things to keep all New Yorkers safe, I  
8 look forward to hearing all of your testimonies.

9 I want to conclude by thanking my staff as well  
10 as committee policy analysts Manoh Butt, and Masaf  
11 Saya Joseph, my Chief Of Staff, for their work on  
12 this hearing. Now I will pass it on turn it over to  
13 Chair Hanks, Chair of Public Safety. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. Chair  
15 Narcisse. Good morning. My name is Kamillah Hanks.  
16 I am the Councilmember and Chair on the Committee on  
17 Public Safety, and I am very happy to be joined by my  
18 colleagues. I'd like to thank Chairs Lee, Narcisse,  
19 and Ariola for joining this Public Safety Committee  
20 and convening this important hearing on involuntary  
21 mental health removals and Mayor Adams's recently  
22 announced mental health plan. I'd also like to thank  
23 the panel that all came here today to testify.

24 As my colleagues have all stated, there are many  
25 outstanding questions regarding how these plans will

3 be implemented, what role NYPD will play in these  
4 efforts, and how the Administration will limit any  
5 adverse consequences to some of our most vulnerable  
6 New Yorkers.

7 So the goal of this hearing is to learn how the  
8 Administration will implement a fair, compassionate,  
9 and practical plan for and for providing the care and  
10 support needed by those with severe mental illness,  
11 while at the same time protecting the public from  
12 those who may inflict harm to themselves or to  
13 others. We also want to avoid criminalization and  
14 provide and provide meaningful access to treatment  
15 and to the long term support that we know is  
16 desperately needed.

17 Moreover, we want to learn how the Administration  
18 intends to evaluate the success of their plan and  
19 examine the impact that Mayor Adams's plan will have  
20 on public safety for all New Yorkers, and we hope to  
21 hear more from the NYPD and how they will record data  
22 and maintain transparency regarding these efforts.  
23 Furthermore, we want to understand how NYPD intends  
24 to train its officers to successfully navigate  
25 engagements with people experiencing a mental health  
crisis.

2       Additionally, the Public Safety Committee will be  
3 hearing Introduction 273, sponsored by my colleague  
4 Councilmember Narcisse, which will ensure that all  
5 new NYPD officers are provided with the necessary  
6 training for engaging within individuals with autism  
7 and on the spectrum. This important legislation for  
8 which I am a proud co-sponsor seeks to provide  
9 officers with the skills necessary to promote  
10 effective communication between officers and with  
11 those with autism, in hopes to minimizing risks for  
12 officers and civilians alike. I look forward to  
13 hearing the Administration's testimony and the  
14 valuable perspectives brought by the members of the  
15 public and experts who dedicated their lives to  
16 providing care and service to those with mental  
17 health issues.

18       I also like to thank our Committee Counsel Josh  
19 Kingsley, and my staff, Chief of Staff Marcy Bishop  
20 and my Senior Counsel Mr. Paul Casalli, thank you.

21       CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yes. Thank you, Chair.  
22 Thanks. And now I would like to first recognize  
23 additional Councilmembers we've been joined by. We  
24 have Councilmember Gutiérrez, Councilmember Brannan,

2 Councilmember Abreu, Councilmember Feliz, and also  
3 online we have-- on Zoom we have Councilmember Moya

4 And so now I'd like to turn it over to  
5 Councilmember Abreu, if you'd like to say a few words  
6 about your bill.

7 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Good morning, and thank  
8 you, Chairs. I want to speak very briefly about my  
9 bill Intro 706, our Mental Health One-Stop Shop  
10 legislation.

11 We've learned so much in recent years about the  
12 importance of supporting mental health. Access to  
13 services is critical, but sadly, I hear from  
14 constituents who are facing barriers to care due to  
15 lack of information, and lack of options when it  
16 comes to paying for care. Our bill would centralize  
17 all available free city-sponsored options into both a  
18 digital and print format resource guide, broken down  
19 by population and type of service. It would also  
20 require outreach on the portal while also putting in  
21 place important security measures to ensure public  
22 trust that their information is safe and  
23 confidential. Mental health services are critically  
24 important and I'm hopeful this legislation will  
25 ensure that all city resources are centralized in one

2 place for maximum benefit to those in need. Thank  
3 you and I look forward to hearing from the  
4 Administration.

5 Thank you again Chairs.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Councilmember. And  
7 now I'd like to turn it over to our Public Advocate,  
8 Jumaane Williams, to make a statement.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much. As  
10 I mentioned, my name is Jumaane Williams, Public  
11 Advocate of the city of New York.

12 I want to thank all the Chairs and the members of  
13 committee for holding this important hearing. In any  
14 given year, one in five New Yorkers experiences  
15 psychiatric illness, and hundreds of thousands of  
16 those are not connected to care or support. Those  
17 who are not receiving treatment or services for their  
18 psychiatric disabilities are more likely to be low  
19 income people or of color.

20 In addition to a shortage of inpatient  
21 psychiatric beds, our city is also experiencing an  
22 affordable housing crisis forcing more and more  
23 people into the shelter system in the streets, making  
24 people experiencing homelessness and or symptoms of  
25 psychiatric disability even more visible. In

2 response to a rising crime rates in the subway,  
3 including two tragic and high profile incidents where  
4 people who were experiencing symptoms of psychiatric  
5 disabilities pushed commuters in front of trains,  
6 Mayor Adams announced in November of last year that  
7 NYPD and FDNY will be allowed to involuntarily take  
8 people perceived as being unable to take care of  
9 themselves to hospitals. Many perceived this to mean  
10 that they will be removed regardless of whether they  
11 pose any threat of harm to themselves or others. It  
12 also seemed that this was simply an announcement of a  
13 tactic, much less a full entire plan.

14 First, we have to make sure we're clear that  
15 mental health is not a crime, and most people who are  
16 experiencing mental illness will not commit crimes.  
17 Until that announcement, people experiencing mental  
18 health crisis could be involuntarily detained only if  
19 they were deemed to be an immediate risk to  
20 themselves or others. Now it was assumed, based on  
21 that announcement, that those perceived to be  
22 mentally ill and unable to care for their basic  
23 needs, can be detained and forced into hospitals,  
24 even if they pose no risk of harm to themselves or to

2 others. If this is the case, it would not only be  
3 dangerous but also a waste of resources.

4 It's important to point out there is no evidence  
5 that court-ordered involuntary treatment in hospitals  
6 is more effective than community-based treatment. In  
7 fact, Martial Simon, the man who fairly pushed  
8 Michelle Alyssa Go in front of a train while  
9 experiencing the symptoms of schizophrenia, had been  
10 hospitalized at least 20 times and reportedly was  
11 upset that hospitals were discharging him before he  
12 believed he was well enough to live on his own.

13 Involuntary hospitalizations also have a broad  
14 negative impact on many areas of a person's life  
15 often leading to the loss of access to basic rights  
16 and services including employment, parenting,  
17 education, housing, professional licenses, or even  
18 the potential right to drive.

19 Involving police as the primary people to respond  
20 or having them present without being called when  
21 responding to a person a mental health crisis can be  
22 extremely dangerous and has had some historic deadly  
23 results. The number of NYPD officers who have  
24 received crisis intervention training has dropped  
25 over the last two years to the point where two thirds

2 of active duty officers remain untrained, and the  
3 NYPD has no way to ensure that those officers who  
4 have been trained are the ones responding to 911  
5 calls reporting mental health crisis.

6 To name only one tragic story in 2019, two police  
7 officers were dispatched to the home of Kawaski  
8 Trawick, a 32 year old black man experiencing a  
9 mental health crisis. Within two minutes the  
10 officers escalated the encounter to the point that  
11 one of the officers fired four shots, killing Mr.  
12 Trawick, who did not have a gun. The officer who  
13 fired the shots had attended crisis intervention  
14 training just days prior.

15 Mayor Adams says that the City has a moral  
16 obligation to help those who have acute psychiatric  
17 disabilities and I agree. However, merely holding a  
18 person in hospital before releasing them into the  
19 same environment does not help anyone, and in  
20 fact may make people distrustful and less likely to  
21 seek behavioral services.

22 Just a few weeks before that announcement, my  
23 office released a report saying how we were doing on  
24 mental health and what we could be doing better. I  
25

3 did not receive any response from the administration.

4 All of our reports do go to the Administration.

5 If the City truly wants to fulfill its moral  
6 obligation to New Yorkers with psychiatric  
7 disabilities, it must invest in a continuum of care  
8 that everyone needs. I will also mention that on  
9 December 1st, my office sent a letter to the  
10 Administration to get questions answered about many  
11 of the things that not only my office but many New  
12 Yorkers and reporters were asking to see if we can  
13 flesh out if there was a fuller plan here. As of  
14 today, we still have not received any responses. The  
15 continuum of care has to include affordable and  
16 supportive housing, affordable community-based health  
17 services, accessible education, non-police response  
18 to mental health crisis, and employment, should find  
19 mental health support and services, not weapons.

20 I want to be clear that most communities that can  
21 access this continuum of care are generally white and  
22 wealthier. Most who cannot a generally poorer,  
23 black, and brown, and unfortunately, receive a  
24 response of police, forced hospitalizations, and  
25 arrests.

1  
2           So we want to make sure that we can provide a  
3 continuum of care that's actually needed that may  
4 include hospitalizations, but it needs to be clear  
5 what that plan is. And my hope is that with this  
6 hearing today, perhaps we can get many of the  
7 questions answered that many of us have and including  
8 mine and hopefully my letter can be responded to  
9 shortly. Thank you so much.

10           CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And I'll  
11 turn it over to Sarah Sucher to administer the oath.

12           COUNSEL SUCHER: Will you please raise your right  
13 hand?

14           Do you affirm to tell the truth nothing but the  
15 truth before this committee and to respond honestly  
16 to Councilmember questions?

17           ALL: I do.

18           COUNSEL SUCHER: You may begin when ready.

19           DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Good morning,  
20 Chairperson Hanks, Chairperson Lee, Chairperson  
21 Ariola, and Chairperson Narcisse and members of the  
22 Committees on Public Safety, Mental Health,  
23 Disabilities, and Addiction, Fire and Emergency  
24 Management, and Hospitals. My name is Jason Hansman,  
25 and I am the Deputy Director of Mental Health

1 Initiatives, Crisis Response, and Community Capacity  
2 at the Mayor's Office of Community Mental Health or  
3 OCMH. I'm joined this morning by my colleagues Dr.  
4 Omar Fattal for tall Systems Chief for Behavioral  
5 Health, and Co-Deputy Chief Medical Officer at New  
6 York City Health and Hospitals, Chief Michael Fields,  
7 Chief of Emergency Medical Services at the Fire  
8 Department, Chief Theresa Tobin, Chief of Interagency  
9 Operations, Chief Juanita Holmes, Chief of Training,  
10 and Michael Clarke, Director of the Legislative  
11 Affairs Unit, all from the Police Department, Jamie  
12 Neckles is Assistant Commissioner of the Bureau of  
13 Mental Health at the Health Department.

14  
15 OCMH coordinates and develop citywide policies  
16 and strategies to facilitate critical mental health  
17 care so that every New Yorker in every neighborhood  
18 has the support that they need.

19 In November of 2022, Mayor Adams announced a plan  
20 to create a culture of engagement for New Yorkers  
21 with untreated Serious Mental Illness. It is clear  
22 that we have a responsibility as a city to lead with  
23 compassion and care, and that there is more that we  
24 can do to help New Yorkers experiencing a mental  
25 health crisis, especially when their mental illness

3 is so severe that they lack the ability to recognize  
4 and care for their own needs. The plan that Mayor  
5 Adams announced is an important step to delivering  
6 essential care to our most vulnerable fellow New  
7 Yorkers.

8 Our office had a significant role in crafting the  
9 Administration's mental health involuntary removal  
10 policy, and has an ongoing role and coordination  
11 across these agencies. I'm happy to testify before  
12 you today to discuss Mayor Adams's recently announced  
13 plan, including his policy regarding involuntary  
14 removals.

15 New York state Mental Hygiene Law allows for  
16 individuals to be removed from the community to a  
17 hospital for evaluation by a medical and psychiatric  
18 professional who can assess the need for admission  
19 and treatment. The policy the Mayor announced in  
20 November draws on two of the Mental Hygiene Law's  
21 provisions that grant this authority: section 958 and  
22 Section 941. Section 941 authorizes a police or  
23 peace officer to remove an individual who appears to  
24 be mentally ill and is conducting themselves in a  
25 manner likely to result in serious harm to self or  
others from the community to a hospital to receive a

1 psychiatric evaluation. Similarly, Section 958  
2 authorizes designated clinicians or mobile crisis  
3 outreach teams, which can include a licensed  
4 psychologist registered professional nurses, and  
5 certain social workers to direct the same kind of  
6 removal for evaluation at a hospital.  
7

8       Importantly, the Section 941 and 958 only  
9 authorize removal to a hospital where a physician  
10 then conducts an evaluation to determine if the  
11 individual should be hospitalized. They do not allow  
12 for designated clinicians, or police officers, or  
13 peace officers to order the involuntary hospital  
14 admission of any individual. In February of 2022,  
15 the New York State Office of Mental Health, OMH,  
16 issued interpretive guidance stating that both  
17 Sections 941 and Section 958 authorize the removal of  
18 an individual who appears to be mentally ill, and  
19 displays an inability to meet basic living needs,  
20 even when no recent dangerous act has been observed.  
21 Their guidance was intended to help clinicians and  
22 other community providers make thoughtful, clinically  
23 appropriate determinations relating to involuntary  
24 removals, while at the same time respecting an  
25

2 individual's due process and civil rights. The City  
3 concurs with OMH on their interpretation.

4 Before this plan, these removals were done  
5 without a coordinated approach across agencies.  
6 First responders and clinicians often followed their  
7 own protocols that we're usually unknown to one  
8 another. With the Mayor's new policy, everyone is  
9 working off the same playbook, and ensuring our most  
10 vulnerable New Yorkers have an opportunity to be  
11 connected to life saving and life changing care.

12 As the Mayor said in November, job one is as  
13 follows: New York State law allows us to intervene  
14 when it appears that mental illness is preventing an  
15 individual from meeting their basic human needs. We  
16 must make this universally understood by outreach  
17 workers, hospital personnel, and police officers.

18 To that end, the Mayor's New DOHMH, FDNY, EMS,  
19 and NYPD directive does two things: Number one, it  
20 creates an expedited step-by-step process for  
21 involuntary transportation for individuals in crisis.  
22 And number two, it states explicitly that in  
23 concurrence with OMH, it is appropriate to use this  
24 process when individuals appear to be mentally ill  
25 and unable to meet their basic needs.

2 Second, the Mayor also announced enhanced  
3 training for outreach workers. This training led by  
4 the New York City Health Department in consultation  
5 with OMH emphasizes the need for basic needs  
6 interventions, and includes engagement strategies to  
7 try before resorting to a removal as voluntary  
8 transportation is always a goal. Training is already  
9 underway.

10 Third, the Mayor announced establishing  
11 specialized intervention teams. He announced a  
12 special cadre of clinicians and officers to ensure  
13 safe transport of those in need of hospitalization.  
14 These specialized teams will have the training, the  
15 expertise, and the sensitivity to handle these  
16 complex cases.

17 Fourth, the Mayor announced creating a new  
18 support line staffed by clinicians from Health and  
19 Hospitals to provide support and advice to police  
20 officers in real time as they consider potential  
21 response to individuals with mental health needs.  
22 This support line became operational last week.

23 Fifth, the Mayor announced that the city's  
24 legislative agenda includes working with state  
25 partners to amend the law to make clear that serious

2 harm includes the harm that comes from an inability  
3 to meet basic needs because of mental illness. This  
4 would codify court precedent to make this principle  
5 widely understood across the state. Additional  
6 legislative needs he announced were requiring  
7 hospital evaluators to consider all relevant factors  
8 such as treatment history and recent behavior, not  
9 just how a person presents in the moment, allowing a  
10 broader range of mental health professionals to  
11 perform hospital evaluations and serve on mobile  
12 crisis teams, and requiring Kendra's Law or AOT  
13 eligibility screening in hospitals to help our most  
14 vulnerable New Yorkers stay engaged in treatment.

15       Importantly, the Mayor's plan does not call for  
16 sweeps of people living with mental illness in public  
17 spaces. It does not expand the powers of City  
18 personnel to transport individuals for hospital  
19 evaluation. It does not increase the reliance on  
20 police to address untreated Serious Mental Illness.  
21 It does not allow for 958-designated clinicians or  
22 police officers to involuntarily admit individuals to  
23 the hospital, and it does not represent the sole  
24 answer to fix our public mental health system.

2 The City will be releasing our Behavioral Health  
3 Agenda in early 2023 That covers Serious Mental  
4 Illness, youth and family mental health, and  
5 preventing overdoses

6 To ensure that we are doing all that we can for  
7 our fellow New Yorkers, this work requires an  
8 interagency approach to maximize connections to  
9 mental health services. All of this work begins with  
10 high quality training. For 958-designated  
11 clinicians, DOHMH conducts a two-day virtual Section  
12 958 training. Trainings include a variety of experts  
13 in mental health crisis intervention and risk  
14 assessment. At the end of this training, DOHMH  
15 confirms the trainees credentials, licensure and  
16 employment on an approved mobile crisis outreach  
17 team, and issues a DOHMH identification with photo  
18 and letter signed by Executive Deputy Commissioner of  
19 the Division of Mental Hygiene, designating a person  
20 as authorized to direct a 958 removal. These  
21 credentials expire every two years and can be renewed  
22 by recertifying licensure and employment.

23 DOHMH also conducted refresher training in  
24 November focused on clinicians doing outreach on the  
25 subway and streets to ensure that clinicians doing

2 958 removals understood the guidance from OMH. This  
3 included composite vignettes from real situations  
4 involving people experiencing street and subway  
5 homelessness.

6 This refresher training content will be folded  
7 into the regular ongoing 958 designation training  
8 curriculum for all eligible clinicians working in  
9 mobile outreach teams for housed, unsheltered, and  
10 unsheltered individuals. The NYPD trains officers on  
11 how to interact with people suffering from a mental  
12 health crisis starting at the academy. There, the  
13 NYPD has designated modules that provide officers  
14 with the skills that they need to make determinations  
15 on whether an individual needs to be removed to a  
16 hospital pursuant to Mental Hygiene Law Section 941.  
17 This training is reinforced throughout an officer's  
18 career, through command level training videos, and  
19 training at the Academy including during training  
20 whenever an officer is promoted to sergeant,  
21 lieutenant and captain.

22 Additionally, the NYPD is working to provide all  
23 officers with a four-day crisis intervention  
24 training, which provides an officer with more in  
25 depth skills when responding to a mental health call.

3 When the Mayor announced this directive, the NYPD  
4 added new training that builds upon and reinforces  
5 the training officers already receive. This training  
6 developed in consultation with OCMH and DOHMH ensures  
7 that officers understand the guidance from OMH.

8 To help reinforce this training, NYPD is also  
9 producing a training video that all officers must  
10 watch. Moving forward, the OMH guidance will be  
11 incorporated into existing training.

12 The training for all outreach workers, hospital  
13 personnel, and police officers emphasize the  
14 importance of using best efforts to encourage the  
15 individual to be transported to the hospital  
16 voluntarily. To that end, when a 958-designated  
17 clinician believes that an individual may be  
18 evaluated at a hospital, their first responsibility  
19 is to use their clinical skills, where safe and  
20 appropriate, to work collaboratively with the  
21 individual to secure their voluntary agreement to be  
22 taken to the hospital for further evaluation. In the  
23 less common cases where an involuntary removal is  
24 necessary, the clinician will call for NYPD to assist  
25 with this process. In all of these cases, NYPD's

2 role is to aid the individual in getting to the care  
3 that they need.

4 Working with the clinician, EMS and NYPD will  
5 effectuate a transport to the hospital. In the case  
6 of a Section 958 removal, the decision to remove is  
7 solely the clinician's. NYPD and FDNY follow the  
8 clinician's lead.

9 In the case of a 941 removal, once again NYPD's  
10 role is to aid an individual and getting to the care  
11 that they need. When officers determine that an  
12 individual is suffering from mental illness and is  
13 engaged in behavior that is likely to cause harm to  
14 themselves or others, consistent with Section 941,  
15 they will work with EMS to bring the individual to  
16 the hospital where a physician can do a comprehensive  
17 evaluation. To provide additional support to  
18 officers in the field, Health and Hospitals is  
19 providing a dedicated support line for NYPD officers  
20 as they encounter potential 941 situations. This  
21 support line is staffed 24/7 by behavioral health  
22 clinicians from Health and Hospitals Virtual Express  
23 Care Service, who can answer questions and advise  
24 officers as they determine whether circumstances

2 truly call for the last resort of an involuntary  
3 removal.

4 Critically Health and Hospital staff also provide  
5 NYPD officers with information on other appropriate  
6 community and social service resources to consider  
7 for those individuals who do not meet the criteria  
8 for involuntary removal, or who might otherwise be  
9 better served in the community. Importantly, if  
10 individuals feature location is predictable, and they  
11 appear at no risk of imminent harm, Health and  
12 Hospitals might advise sending out a clinician the  
13 next day.

14 To reiterate, the 958-designated clinician and  
15 the police officer or peace officer in the case of  
16 941 removals can only have the individual taken to  
17 the hospital for evaluation. They cannot have the  
18 individual involuntarily admitted. That is at the  
19 sole discretion of the physician at the hospital.

20 Once an individual arrives at the hospital, the  
21 958-designated clinician or police officer, assist  
22 them in registering and provides information about  
23 the reason for the removal to the hospital staff. At  
24 that point, the role of the 958-designated clinician,  
25 NYPD, and EMS is complete. Ideally, the hospital

2 will then obtain additional relevant information on  
3 the individual by contacting family members,  
4 community providers, and outreach teams, and at that  
5 point, conduct a thorough psychiatric evaluation. If  
6 necessary, they will admit the patient following  
7 Mental Hygiene Law admission criteria. And if not,  
8 they will be discharged with a discharge plan that  
9 includes follow up care and community resources.

10 All of this work is about ensuring that New  
11 Yorkers and psychiatric crisis get the highest level  
12 of care that the city can provide. This is a truly  
13 health-driven approach, and one that is grounded and  
14 trying to connect everyone with the care that they  
15 deserve. I thank your committee's for your attention  
16 on this important topic, and we're happy to answer  
17 any questions that you might have.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great, thank you. So I'm  
19 just going to dive right into the questions, and I'll  
20 try to keep it brief because I know my colleagues and  
21 I are going to tag-team.

22 So thank you so much, again, for being here. So  
23 I'm going to focus largely most of my questions to  
24 DOHMH as well as OCMH. So if you guys-- but feel  
25

2 free, you know if anyone wants to jump in to go  
3 ahead.

4 So what is DOHMH's opinion for the Mayor's  
5 proposed expansion of the legal definition of "likely  
6 to result in serious harm"? How do you guys-- what's  
7 your interpretation of that? I'll hand that Jamie to  
8 respond to.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Red is on.  
10 Interesting.

11 I'm actually-- I don't have a legal position on  
12 that. I'm sorry to decline your question, but I'm  
13 not prepared to take a legal position here on that  
14 proposed legislation.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: No. No opinion.  
17 I can't comment on the proposed legislation.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, if you could let us know  
19 or get back to us, that'd be great, because a lot of  
20 the new policies seem to be around this new  
21 definition of what it means to "likely result in  
22 serious harm." So I think that'd be great to get a  
23 better understanding of that.

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Will do.  
25

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So in an ideal world, in  
3 your informed opinion, as medical and healthcare  
4 experts, what would be the best way to approach  
5 individuals with SMI who are homeless. Is B-HEARD  
6 the ideal model? What about the other co-response  
7 teams? If you could speak a little bit to that as  
8 well.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I'll start on  
10 that. And I think, you know, for-- for folks who are  
11 both homeless and have an SMI, it's going to really  
12 depend on-- on the situation, right? I think-- we do  
13 have homeless outreach teams through Department of  
14 Homeless Services that are skilled in working with  
15 folks who are both homeless and have SMI. If someone  
16 is --in certainly in a-- in a mental health crisis,  
17 B-HEARD within the pilot areas could also be an  
18 option, as could mobile crisis teams that are  
19 dispatched through NYC-WELL. So we have a wide range  
20 of options for folks who are who are homeless, who  
21 are seriously mentally ill, and might need connection  
22 to support, and much of that actually does start with  
23 our DHS homeless outreach teams that are on the  
24 ground serving street homeless New Yorkers every day.

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, and I've-- I've asked  
4 this before in other-- because I just know from being  
5 on the nonprofit social sector side, how not, you  
6 know, a lot of times the issues are that city  
7 agencies don't always coordinate or communicate with  
8 each other. And I know there's a lot of different  
9 outreach teams out there. Some are state, with AOT  
10 and others, and then others are through the City.  
11 DOHMH has one, EMS, DHS, DOH, and there's ICT, IMT,  
12 B-HEARD.

13 So how are you all coordinating the outreach  
14 teams in terms of who has what, and who responds to  
15 what situation? How are you guys communicating with  
16 each other?

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I'll get that  
18 sorted and see if Jamie wants to add anything on the  
19 DOHMH-specific teams. But many-- much of it relies  
20 on, you know, how an individual might come to-- come  
21 to the attention of the city. So you know, certainly  
22 if someone is in a mental health crisis, and they  
23 call NYC-WELL, they are likely to get a mobile crisis  
24 team. If they're street homeless, they might get a  
25 homeless outreach team. And I think within the  
confines of-- certainly within the confines of the

1  
2 law and being able to share information, that  
3 information is shared, I think across agencies,  
4 right?, especially when there are multiple  
5 touchpoints for singular individuals across different  
6 teams.

7       And I think there's a-- there's certainly a  
8 difference between kind of our, our mobile teams that  
9 are kind of doing outreach, so our DHS teams, even  
10 our mobile crisis teams, our B-HEARD teams, kind of  
11 our longer-term treatment teams like our ACT Teams,  
12 our Assertive Community Treatment Teams, and our  
13 Intensive Mobile Treatment Teams, or IMT teams, which  
14 provide kind of that longer-term treatment. But  
15 within-- I think within the confines of law, all of  
16 them are trying to work together to-- to serve those  
17 individuals. And we are constantly I think, talking  
18 about how to improve that system and make sure that  
19 the right individuals are getting the right  
20 touchpoint at the right time.

21       CHAIRPERSON LEE: So what does that handoff look  
22 like though? So for example, if someone comes in and  
23 originally is on the short-term team, let's just say  
24 for treatment, crisis treatment, and then it turns  
25

2 out that they need longer term care. So how does  
3 that handoff happen? And what does that look like?

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I'll actually  
5 hand that to Jamie, and maybe give an example of  
6 moving from a mobile crisis team to maybe like an ACT  
7 Team, how that would work out.

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Yeah. So crisis  
9 intervention services are, you know, they're  
10 providing de-escalation in the moment, sometimes  
11 transporting to the hospital for a higher level of  
12 care, as we've talked about, but most often  
13 connecting to ongoing community based treatment.  
14 That is their main mission. And the most sort of  
15 successful outcome that we can see for a mobile  
16 crisis intervention team is connection to ongoing  
17 care. So that looks different for you know,  
18 different people in different situations. And  
19 they'll usually make an appointment, and help the  
20 person get to the appointment if needed, and confirm  
21 that connection to care before closing out a case.  
22 So-- so a crisis intervention steam, you know, main,  
23 you know, focus, is that that linkage to community-  
24 based care.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And actually, you  
3 brought up a good point, Mr. Hansman, which is a  
4 perfect segue to my next question about the 911  
5 operators.

6 And just out of curiosity, if I could just take a  
7 poll of the room, how many of you are familiar with  
8 988? Okay, good. Well, I'm probably speaking to the  
9 choir here.

10 But I think a lot of folks are not aware of 988  
11 and-- and when to call 988 versus 911. And then,  
12 when people call 911, I think the issue becomes that  
13 oftentimes, it's up to the operators who answer the  
14 calls to navigate which mental health type of crisis  
15 to direct the calls to.

16 So just out of curiosity, what does-- what  
17 guidance does DOHMH or H&H provide to operators on  
18 how to navigate the mental health crisis calls?

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Sure. So 988 is  
20 a three-digit number to connect to a local crisis  
21 hotline. In New York City, that local crisis hotline  
22 is NYC-WELL, so you can either dial 1-888-NYC-WELL,  
23 or 988. You get to the same place, the same cadre of  
24 trained crisis counselors, who will do risk  
25 assessment and connect the person to, you know, maybe

2 on the phone, telephonic risk assessment, or  
3 connection to a mobile crisis team, dispatch the most  
4 appropriate team citywide, so that the caller doesn't  
5 have to be expert, the caller doesn't have to  
6 remember all these different three and four, you  
7 know, letter acronyms. The caller doesn't have to  
8 decide, is this right or wrong. The counselor will  
9 use his or her skills to, to gather information and  
10 make the next step. Often, you know, these are  
11 referrals to in-person Crisis Response Teams.  
12 sometimes it's a handoff to 911 if there is an  
13 emergency and-- and a need for an ambulance response,  
14 for example. So that-- the burden is not on-- on the  
15 on the general public, right? We have trained  
16 counselors who can help make these decisions.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: And as-- just real  
19 quick, as for the difference between, for instance,  
20 911 or 988 or NYC-WELL, we advise people call 911  
21 when there is an immediate emergency, when a person  
22 is in immediate risk of hurting themselves or others,  
23 or is in imminent danger because of a health  
24 condition or other situation. Anything beyond that  
25 is appropriate for NYC-WELL, and then to that point

2 that Jamie made, they can make that determination on  
3 the call if it does need to get escalated to 911.

4 I'll make one other point just about 988, and  
5 about, you know, where you're calling from and what  
6 your area code might be. It is true that if you call  
7 from a New York City Area code 988, you're going to  
8 get NYC-WELL, what if you call from outside of New  
9 York City, you're likely to get the-- the mental  
10 health hotline for that city that you're that you're  
11 calling from in your area code.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So moving on to the 958  
13 trainings: Has the agency designed delivered and  
14 updated the 958 trainings for the participating  
15 agencies? And if yes, what agencies have received  
16 the training? What does the training consist of?  
17 And if not, when do you anticipate the training to  
18 get up and running?

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So yes, trainings for  
20 958 have been updated at DOHMH, and that NYPD. So  
21 both of those trainings are already underway at this  
22 moment.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And also has the agency  
24 began conducting the 958 trainings for clinicians who  
25 will be part of the outreach teams?

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yes, there was-- there  
3 was an updated training in November of 2022 for the  
4 clinicians.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So in terms of-- I know,  
6 the Public Advocate mentioned continuum of care, and  
7 that like that language speaks to my heart, because  
8 coming from the nonprofit CBO side of things, I just  
9 want to give a shout out to anyone here who is  
10 providing services in the community, on the ground,  
11 because you all are doing amazing work and are our  
12 key to community services. And I just want to make a  
13 note also that that doesn't even capture the  
14 culturally-competent language barrier folks that have  
15 LEPs that are not even anywhere in the system.

16 And so I think that's a continuous issue that we  
17 need to address because we have so many languages  
18 that we speak in the city. And so how do we increase  
19 the caseworkers and the folks that speak all these  
20 diverse languages? So I just wanted to put that out  
21 there. But, you know, we all know that peer  
22 services, CBO nonprofit services, even if they're  
23 not, quote/unquote, "clinical" by definition, that--  
24 those are all services that statistically are  
25 evidence-based to prove someone's success in care.

2 So how are you coordinating with the CBOs?

3 Because I know that there was a nonprofit resiliency  
4 committee at one point that partnered with agencies,  
5 but are you actively engaging a task force that have  
6 CBO partners that are included to really inform a lot  
7 of this care, because I think oftentimes, where I got  
8 frustrated was that someone would be in an inpatient  
9 and not get referred out properly.

10 And so how do we better utilize our nonprofit  
11 sector, you know, organizations and-- and handoff  
12 those services, and if you could, you know, provide a  
13 list not necessarily today, but of groups that you do  
14 partner with, because I personally would love to see  
15 who it is that you're working with in the community.  
16 But if you could speak a little bit more to the  
17 partnership there.

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I think what I  
19 would say just to-- to Jamie's previous point about,  
20 I think the role of our crisis services, and even in  
21 hospitals, it is about getting to that next level of  
22 treatment and services and to community providers.  
23 That is a critical part of all of our-- all of our  
24 crisis workers-- all of our interactions with  
25 individuals is to get them to-- to community

2 providers. And this policy itself was driven, at  
3 least in part by conversations with-- with community  
4 providers, as well, especially our providers who are  
5 working with this population, day in and day out,  
6 which we continue to hear from about, you know,  
7 individuals that are experiencing a Serious Mental  
8 Illness and-- and can't get connected to care. So I  
9 think we're continuing that work. And we will--  
10 we'll get back to you about providing a list of-- of  
11 community providers.

12 And I'm not sure if, Jamie, you want to add  
13 anything or Omar.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: I can add to  
15 that. Sure. So at DOHMH we-- we develop and deliver  
16 the training that leads to designating qualified  
17 physicians or mental health professionals to direct  
18 958 removals. Most of the clinicians that we're  
19 training are working on community-- within CBO-- CBOs  
20 that are in contract with the city and/or licensed by  
21 the State Office of Mental Health.

22 So the vast majority of clinicians who are doing  
23 this work are based in CBOs based within the  
24 communities that they're serving. I'm also happy to  
25 say that we added dedicated peer lines, roles. They

3 are specialist roles to our mobile crisis teams a  
4 couple of years ago. So all those teams have peer  
5 perspectives folded into their crisis response work.  
6 And of course, NYC-WELL has an option to talk to two  
7 peers as well, and about 20% of people who call in to  
8 NYC-WELL opt to speak to a peer specialist. And so I  
9 think we've done-- you know, we have a long way to go  
10 but we've gone a long way already in terms of making  
11 peer services and peer perspectives and greater  
12 language diversity available through all of our  
13 crisis response services.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, thank you. So I'll yield  
15 the rest of my time and ask questions later. Follow  
16 up if I have any, but I wanted to hand it off to  
17 Councilmember Narcisse, if you have any questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Before I get to the  
19 question, I want to make sure that we address the  
20 Intro 273 will require the training for the NYPD. At  
21 the end of the day it's to make sure the officers are  
22 safe, and the person that the provided care is safe  
23 as well, is to train them how to interact with  
24 someone with autism, and recognizing it, and getting  
25 skilled to deal with that.

2 It will require our police force to undergo this  
3 training and could possibly save lives, right?

4 Traditional tactics and approaches that would work  
5 for neurotypical people may not work for people with  
6 autism.

7 As a nurse for over three decades, I'm sure that  
8 I have done with so many individuals, that you will  
9 think that the person is okay by their appearance,  
10 but the person is really dealing. It's not only for  
11 autism, but mostly I want to focus on autism, because  
12 so many times things could have been prevented.

13 So I hope all my colleagues will join as a matter  
14 of fact signing and supporting this piece of  
15 legislation. And most importantly, I did not do it  
16 by myself. I have to thank some terrific folks,  
17 community partners, who helped get this legislation  
18 to this point, ADAPT community network, Brooklyn  
19 Conservatory of Music, My Time Inc, YAI, and Michael  
20 from the NYPD Legislative Team that helped us to get  
21 through this great journey, to make sure that we  
22 address those vulnerable folks in our community.

23 And of course, thanks to my dynamic Colleague of  
24 Staten Island, Councilwoman Hanks, and her  
25 legislative team. That was very-- that worked

2 closely with my team, Chief of Staff Sai Yee. Thank  
3 you.

4 And, um, I have a couple of quick questions by  
5 listening.

6 Has anyone been taking into custody under this  
7 initiative that we're talking about right now?

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll note that, you  
9 know, 958 and 941, the longstanding law that has been  
10 used and is used by mobile crisis teams, by mobile  
11 crisis outreach teams, and NYPD.

12 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Okay, since it was  
13 announced, I'm talking about going back to November  
14 after the Mayor made the announcement, did anybody  
15 been...?

16 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: There have certainly  
17 been-- been individuals who have been involuntary  
18 removed under 941 and 958 since the announcement.

19 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Have all NYPD officers and  
20 FDNY EMS been trained to recognize the behaviors that  
21 could initiate involuntary removal? If so, how long  
22 was the training, and what did it include?

23 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So training has begun  
24 at NYPD and I'll hand it to my NYPD colleagues to  
25 give some further details.

CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Good morning.

CHIEF HOLMES: Good morning, everyone. Good morning Chair. So yes, training has begun at NYPD. There are several trainees that's been conducted. Since this initiative was-- was brought to our attention to directive by the Mayor in November, as a result of such there was a telephonic communication put forward that this was up and coming. There was also the creation of a training. This training was dear to my heart, especially the language surrounding it, the individuals delivering it, and more importantly, the comprehension of the men and women, the end users.

And as a result of such we had a roll-call training. Naturally the primary goal, voluntary compliance, voluntary compliance. I can't say that enough. I don't use the term removal. The term that I like is voluntary and involuntary transports, and I thought it just had a more softer connotation. We have learning outcomes, understanding effective crisis communication, to assist with those voluntary transports, recognizing the legal authorities and department policy involving involuntary transports, and naturally understanding the Mental Hygiene Law

2 958 and 941, recognizing situations that may  
3 necessitate the involuntary transport of an  
4 individual who is mental-- is mentally ill and a  
5 danger to themselves or others or not capable of self  
6 care. And a lot of those factors we're surrounded  
7 about around what is mental health crisis? What does  
8 that look like? And naturally, sometimes its  
9 behavior, speech, and just the-- the thought  
10 contents.

11 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: So how long was the  
12 training?

13 CHIEF HOLMES: The training is given at roll  
14 call. That particular training is about 25 minutes  
15 of training, lecture, both discussion and  
16 interactive.

17 In addition to that, there's a video to assure  
18 compliance. So roll call training is about 88%.  
19 That's now cease and desist because the video was  
20 uploaded. And the video now is at 60% of the agency,  
21 but know that 88% of the agency operational has been  
22 trained in that training, 60% of the same individuals  
23 that received the roll call training. The video  
24 ensures compliance that everyone had it-- has it, so  
25 it allows us to collect that data.

2 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: There is a special unit  
3 that you have to respond, right?

4 CHIEF HOLMES: It's not-- it's all.

5 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Or is it all officers? So  
6 how many officers that you have?

7 CHIEF HOLMES: So currently -- I'll get the  
8 number -- the department's about 33,000. So all--  
9 everyone's going to be trained in it.

10 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: How many have been trained  
11 to date?

12 CHIEF HOLMES: How many have been trained?

13 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: To date.

14 CHIEF HOLMES: Operational?

15 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Mm-hmm.

16 CHIEF HOLMES: I do have the numbers one second.

17 Okay, so on patrol, we have 16,436, and over  
18 8000. Transit has completed 91% of all transit  
19 officers, 89% of housing officers-- and forgive me  
20 87% of all patrol officers. I apologize. 14,461 out  
21 of the 16,436 have been trained.

22 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Thank you.

23 CHIEF HOLMES: You're welcome.

24 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Reports show that one out  
25 of five New Yorkers have symptoms of mental health

1 disorder. With rates so high why are NYPD CIT  
2 training figures lagging behind?  
3

4 CHIEF HOLMES: Right. So the CIT training now is  
5 currently at 17,000-plus, but we've had some  
6 retirements and resignations. So it's 13,000-plus,  
7 but that's in-service training. So there is a large  
8 amount of people trained in it. And I apologize it  
9 started in 2015. Every recruit attends CIT training.  
10 So all of our recruits that have graduated since 2015  
11 has that training as well, in addition to the 13,000-  
12 plus.

13 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: With many facilities  
14 reporting that their psych beds at full capacity,  
15 especially in New York, in Manhattan, right? How do  
16 we anticipate being able to accommodate the flux of  
17 patients into the system.

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll hand it over to  
19 Dr. Fattal to talk a little bit more about the--  
20 about the hospital bed situation in New York.

21 DR. FATTAL: Good morning. So we-- I can speak  
22 for H&H. Obviously, we are the largest provider of  
23 behavioral services in New York, including inpatient  
24 beds, but we're not the only providers. So there are  
25 other providers as well. We have about 1000-- a

2 little bit more than 1000 beds that are open right  
3 now. And we have plans to reopen up to 200 beds by  
4 the end of 2023. And to know that since that  
5 announcement in November, we have not seen an  
6 increase in emergency room visits to our ERs.

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll also note that the  
8 Governor did make an announcement to push hospitals  
9 to reopen the beds that have been closed since 2020.  
10 Throughout, I think the remainder of this year and  
11 next year, to kind of help with that situation of  
12 hospital bed availability.

13 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: I got that understanding.  
14 That's why I say thank you to her and the Mayor as  
15 well for putting-- pushing forward. We know it is  
16 not at the capacity we would like to see it.

17 The standard for detention appeared to be a very  
18 broad and potentially open our city up to Civil  
19 Rights lawsuits. Has the Corporation Council or  
20 other city attorney issued an opinion to this plan to  
21 you.

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: They have reviewed the  
23 policy, yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: They did? Okay.  
25

3 If this percentage of New Yorkers suffered from  
4 mental illness, why can't we get 100% training,  
5 coming back to you, to CIT.

6 CHIEF HOLMES: Well CIT is four-day training. So  
7 naturally it's very challenging when members of the  
8 service still have to do what we do. And it's a  
9 smaller class. And we're aiming for that.  
10 Naturally, that's a primary goal. But it's 30  
11 individuals to a class, it's co-training. So we're  
12 relying on licensed medical clinicians, as far as  
13 community partners, but with that it's a more  
14 intimate training, right? We want them to have a  
15 clearer understanding of what this really is when it  
16 comes to crisis.

17 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: All right. So we're  
18 looking forward for the 100%. Do they anticipate--  
19 do you anticipate, right?, not our side, you-- do you  
20 anticipate that this initiative will cause an  
21 increase in patients?

22 CHIEF HOLMES: Will it cause an increase in  
23 patients? Absolutely. You say that-- what? Can you  
24 hear me? Oh. I thought it was you.

25 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: That's all right.

1  
2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah. So here's what  
3 I-- here's what I-- I'll hand it over to Dr. Fattal  
4 in a moment. But what I might say is-- you know,  
5 this-- this initiative, and this-- this new plan of  
6 looking at involuntary removals is very new, right?  
7 So it was announced in November of 2022. And we are  
8 still looking at-- we're still looking at data. And  
9 what I might also add is that removals in and of  
10 themselves are not necessarily the measure of success  
11 that we're-- that we're using. We are looking at  
12 really-- we're looking at all manner of engagement  
13 and ensuring that you know, our partners, both at you  
14 know, DOHMH, and Health and Hospitals, at NYPD, and  
15 FDNY are having this culture of engagement, not just  
16 on the removals themselves, but on engaging folks in  
17 in treatment, in long-term treatment.

18 I'll let Dr. Fattal talk about what-- what  
19 they've been seeing on the-- on the H&H side. But I  
20 did want to make that note about-- it's not  
21 necessarily entirely about increasing the number of  
22 involuntary removals, but about the engagement of  
23 folks who are experiencing a mental health crisis, or  
24 Serious Mental Illness, and have that, you know,  
25 that-- that potential for danger to self or others.

2 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. I agree 100%. And since  
3 November, we have not seen an increase in the number  
4 of patients coming to our emergency room. But we do  
5 have plans to reopen up to 200 beds in the coming  
6 year by end of 2023. And that's because of this  
7 initiative and other initiatives that are being  
8 rolled out by the City and the State. So we want to  
9 be prepared in case there is an increase in demand.  
10 And we are keeping a very close eye on this. And  
11 we're very committed to meeting the need if it does  
12 go up.

13 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: My last question: They say  
14 out there in newspapers that folks are getting into  
15 the hospital, but they are discharged too fast before  
16 they get stabilized. What do you think, coming from  
17 the H&H?

18 DR. FATTAL: Yeah, I mean, it's hard to comment  
19 because every-- you know, we have thousands of  
20 discharges to the ER, so it's very hard to comment on  
21 a specific case. Every one is different. But when  
22 it comes to this initiative, we take it very  
23 seriously, because it takes sometimes hours and days,  
24 sometimes weeks to actually plan a removal. So we--  
25 once we get the removal to our facility, we take that

1 very seriously. We make sure that we do a thorough  
2 psychiatric evaluation and assessment. But also,  
3 more importantly, we make sure that we connect that  
4 patient with community resources and a follow up plan  
5 before we discharge them.

6 So I think the key is not the timing, it could be  
7 quick or delayed. But the idea is we want to make  
8 sure when we discharge people that they have a  
9 discharge plan, and that they're connected with  
10 outpatient services and community resources that they  
11 need to stay in treatment.

12 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: What-- I said it was my  
13 last, but something just popped in my head. The  
14 discharge planning: Do you actually communicate,  
15 making sure that the folks understand their discharge  
16 planning before they leave the hospital?

17 DR. FATTAL: You mean the patients?

18 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: The patients.

19 DR. FATTAL: Definitely. We start discharge  
20 planning on day one. And that's something that we  
21 you know, work with the patients, but also with  
22 families or their support systems. Most of our  
23 patients have a caseworker or other people in their  
24 lives who are involved in their treatment. So we  
25

1  
2 make sure that we include them as well in the  
3 planning of the discharge itself. So this is not a  
4 one-way communication. This is something that we  
5 work on collaboratively with the patient and whoever  
6 they have in their lives.

7 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: I'm going to leave it as  
8 that. But the communication have to be clearly, both  
9 for the patient and person that is discharging the  
10 individuals. Thank you.

11 DR. FATTAL: Sure. You're welcome.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Sorry. I just want to  
13 recognize we've been joined by Councilmembers  
14 Stevens, Ayala, Riley, and Councilmember Brooks-  
15 Powers. And with that, I'll hand it off to  
16 Councilmember Hanks. Chair Hanks, I'm sorry.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: That's okay. Thank you,  
18 Chair Lee. I appreciate it.

19 Thank you. I kind of want to, you know, put my  
20 questions more towards giving a little background to  
21 how we got here. And then, as my colleagues, I  
22 think, one of the most important pieces is going to  
23 be the recognition of someone who is mentally ill,  
24 and what is the training for officers?

2 So my first question is, how many 911 Mental  
3 Health calls were-- were there between 2021 and 2019?  
4 And do you see any trends of calling increasing  
5 during COVID?

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll hand it over to  
7 NYPD.

8 CHIEF TOBIN: Good morning Chair. In 2020-- in  
9 2019, where you first referenced, there were 171,490  
10 calls. In 2020, there were 161,268 calls. So there  
11 was a reduction of 911 calls during COVID in 2020.  
12 In 2021, there were 166,487, and in 2020, to 176,311.

13 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. So how many of  
14 these 911 health calls resulted in emergency  
15 dispatch, and how many calls were referred to other  
16 resources like NYC-WELL or other community-based  
17 services?

18 CHIEF TOBIN: So all mental health calls result  
19 in an emergency dispatch. The only exception to this  
20 as the B-HEARD pilot presence where NYPD will not  
21 dispatch alongside FDNY EMS, unless there is  
22 violence, there is a weapon, or imminent risk of harm  
23 to self or others.

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay. So of the calls to the  
25 police civilian encounters, how often are people

2 designated, quote/unquote, "emotionally disturbed"  
3 and what implications does that carry?

4 CHIEF TOBIN: Could you repeat that?

5 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So of the calls to police and  
6 civilian encounters, how many people are designated  
7 as emotionally disturbed persons? Because I think  
8 you touched on it a little bit when you said there  
9 was a weapon, I mean, because we want to make that  
10 distinction.

11 CHIEF TOBIN: So in 2022, of the 7,170,174 calls  
12 to 911 176,311, which was 2.5%, were mental health  
13 calls.

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay.

15 CHIEF TOBIN: The NYPD continues to respond along  
16 FDNY EMS to mental health calls and to assist in  
17 transporting to the hospital for mental health  
18 evaluation if necessary.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay. So of these calls in  
20 these civilian police encounters, how often does it  
21 lead to an individual being arrested and for what  
22 charges?

23 CHIEF TOBIN: Sure, in 2022, approximately 1% of  
24 all mental health calls resulted in an arrest. Most  
25 of the arrests were resulting from EDP calls, or for

2 charges such as assault 3 -- which does not include  
3 assaults on police officers or EMS -- criminal  
4 contempt, violating an order of protection, and  
5 menacing. Many of the calls that we go to are  
6 actually domestic incidents when we must arrest the  
7 individual due to the violation of an order of  
8 protection, or if an arrest must be made to prevent  
9 further violence and to ensure the safety of all  
10 members.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So when we've talked about  
12 the, you know, how you testify that officers are  
13 trained, and for people suffering mental health  
14 crisis, and you have these dedicated modules. Is  
15 there a differentiation in that training where  
16 there's a difference between mentally disturbed  
17 person who needs to be, as you say, transported, and  
18 someone who was transported or and or arrested, and  
19 how does that training differentiate?

20 CHIEF HOLMES: So the training that was put in  
21 place as a result of the Mayor's directive  
22 encompasses "not capable of self care," right? So  
23 that's something different. It's always been there.  
24 I think it's something that we weren't really, really  
25 focused on when it came to 9.41.

1  
2           But with that being said, that training is really  
3 designed to remind them of that particular aspect  
4 when you're transporting. But when you speak about  
5 arrests -- and that's why the percentage is so low, 1  
6 percent, when it comes to this -- when you're  
7 speaking about arrests, when it comes to the  
8 community of mental health crisis, nine times out of  
9 10 there's no arrest as a result of the officer being  
10 assaulted. It's a protective community, it's a  
11 person in crisis. And it kind of, for lack of a  
12 better term, it comes with the territory, meaning  
13 comes with the job. So if the officer is injured as  
14 a result of that particular encounter, then it's what  
15 we call a line-of-duty injury. It's not an arrest,  
16 but, you know, made because of that, if that makes  
17 sense.

18           CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much. So the  
19 other question I have is in regard to when you're in-  
20 - when NYPD officers are in this engagement, do we  
21 have any guidance on whether officers are engaging  
22 with the person who's being removed for  
23 hospitalization, or whether they're resisting arrest?  
24 Is there a difference? Because if they're...?  
25

2 CHIEF HOLMES: So-- so it's not-- it really isn't  
3 a difference, you know, as far as I'm concerned, you  
4 know, officers are trained in de-escalation, active  
5 listening. Naturally, if they have-- if it comes to  
6 someone's safety, you may need to take some sort of  
7 immediate action. There is non-lethal devices that  
8 they're trained in. The one thing about the New York  
9 City Police Department, largest city agency, allows  
10 for quick response 24/7. But we're equipped and  
11 trained, and not just for the individual that's in  
12 crisis, but also for all the partners that are  
13 responding to the scene that don't have these-- that  
14 particular type of equipment.

15 DIRECTOR CLARKE: And I think that's part of the  
16 training as well to--

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: It's like a laser shot on--  
18 on the training component--

19 CHIEF HOLMES: Yes it is. That's part of the  
20 training.

21 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: --and how to make those  
22 differentiations.

23 CHIEF HOLMES: Yes.

24 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Right. And I think just to  
25 build on what Chief Holmes was saying. It's part of

2 the training is-- I think your question earlier was,  
3 you're responding to a person with a gun, you're  
4 responding to a past crime, responding to a person in  
5 a mental health crisis. All three trainings are  
6 different on how to handle that situation, right?  
7 And when you're responding to mental health crisis,  
8 you're trained specifically for that, and part of  
9 that is understanding that people may be struggling,  
10 maybe violent, may act out towards you, and how to  
11 handle that, with de-escalation, with compassion,  
12 working with everything we can to get a voluntary  
13 transmission, transported back to the hospital, in  
14 order to de-escalate that situation.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. What is the  
16 current status of the CIT training and the future  
17 plans for the training program going forward? But  
18 I'm sorry, first I wanted to ask how many officers  
19 have completed this crisis intervention team training  
20 between 2022 and like 2016. The training was first  
21 implemented in 2015. We currently have 17,000 plus,  
22 which resulted in 3000, with some resigning or  
23 retiring, so currently, it's about 13,400 that are  
24 trained in that particular training. That's in  
25 service. So I relate in service to people that are

1 already NYPD officers. We bring them back for  
2 additional training.  
3

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay.

5 CHIEF HOLMES: But we still have the graduates,  
6 since 2015, up until current that have received that  
7 training. That's not-- that number is not  
8 encompassed in that. And I apologize for not having  
9 the exact number of graduates, but I can get that to  
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So does the department  
12 anticipate reaching a point where all officers have  
13 received the training? And if so, do we have like a  
14 timeline on what that looks like?

15 CHIEF HOLMES: So that is the primary goal. I  
16 don't have a timeline, being it is so small in  
17 nature, the classes are consisting of 30 members,  
18 usually on a 4-day particular training, but that is  
19 the primary goal, that everyone's trained in that.  
20 We also have training-- roll call training. So  
21 that's given every three to four months on de-  
22 escalation, active listening. You know, it's not the  
23 whole, comprised crisis intervention training, but  
24 it's key components of that training that's given on  
25 a regular to all members of service.

1 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you.

2 CHIEF HOLMES: You're welcome.

3 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So, okay, so we asked those  
4 questions as far as the training is concerned.

5 So does the department plan to update the patrol  
6 guide on these trainings? And if so, in what way  
7 will procedures change?

8 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Yeah, so we did is initially we  
9 put out a message to all the officers, alerting them  
10 to the standard, that is the new standard. We are in  
11 the process of updating our patrol guide procedure,  
12 and we anticipate that coming out in the coming  
13 weeks.

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, thank you. That's all  
15 for right now. I'll pass it back to Chair Lee.  
16 Thank you so much. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: To Chair Ariola. Sorry.  
18 Before I begin, I just want to recognize we've been  
19 joined by Councilmember Brewer as well. So Chair  
20 Ariola, please take it away with your questions.

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you Chairs. My  
22 questions are for Fire Department EMS. How many EMS  
23 personnel have received training in de-escalation  
24 and/or self defense in other-- and any other  
25

1 specialized training for responding to calls for  
2 people in crisis?  
3

4 CHIEF FIELDS: So of the 4300 EMTs and  
5 paramedics, 99% have received the 12-hour course on  
6 de-escalation and self defense, 28% have received the  
7 second module of the same training, and there's a  
8 total of five modules.

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: You anticipated my question.  
10 Thank you.

11 Mayor Adams's directive says the MPs must  
12 transport the individual to the closest appropriate  
13 hospital. What does "appropriate hospital" mean?  
14 And are certain hospital facilities designated as  
15 such?

16 CHIEF FIELDS: Yes. So we deal with CCC  
17 categories. That's in respect to mental health. So  
18 if a hospital has mental health capabilities and  
19 they're not on diversion, that will be the  
20 appropriate hospital.

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Is there a collaboration  
22 between FDNY and NYPD in creating operational  
23 guidelines regarding mental health calls, and-- and  
24 removals?  
25

2 CHIEF FIELDS: Currently we're in the process of  
3 updating the protocols. So we don't have anything  
4 that's current that I'm aware of. But we are working  
5 to develop the program. We anticipate that March,  
6 the second week of March, we should have everything  
7 finalized.

8 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: But there is a  
9 collaboration, or at least contact, even though it's  
10 not finalized in written form, you do work  
11 collaboratively when 911 calls go out.

12 CHIEF FIELDS: Oh 100%. Definitely. So that's  
13 pretty much-- we work collaboratively with NYPD on  
14 daily operations, especially when dealing with mental  
15 health crisis on a daily basis.

16 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, and how often do  
17 voluntary hospital units respond to an EDP incident?  
18 Would you have that data?

19 CHIEF FIELDS: No, I don't have that data but the  
20 voluntaries are 30% of the 911 system, so they do  
21 respond to the priority 7 psychological mental crisis  
22 calls.

23 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And when you are in  
24 the middle of a hospital transport of an emotionally  
25 disturbed person, does the police officer accompany

1 you to the to the hospital every time? Do they  
2 accompany the ambulance?  
3

4 CHIEF FIELDS: Every time? I'm trying not to  
5 live in the world of definitives. Should they? Yes,  
6 they should. But I can't attest to every time.

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: What happens when you-- when  
8 you arrive at a scene with a with an EDP, and you're  
9 faced with an EDP that has a weapon, and PD is-- is  
10 en route. How does the EMS handle at that point?

11 CHIEF FIELDS: Our EMS members are taught to  
12 retreat. So they should retreat to a safe distance,  
13 and get an ETA for NYPD as well as supervision to  
14 that location.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, I appreciate your  
16 answers, Chief Fields. And that's it for me. Thanks  
17 so much, everyone.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: For now.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yes. For now. I think all of  
21 us have more questions, but I'm going to hand it off  
22 to our colleagues also for questions. So first we  
23 have Councilmember Barron, followed by Councilmember  
24 Cabán, and then Powers. So-- How many minutes? Two  
25

1 minutes. So if you guys could limit it to two  
2 minutes each with some wiggle room.

3  
4 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much and I  
5 find these hearings incredible, how you can come  
6 before us and not even have a list of the community  
7 organizations that you're funding. This is a serious  
8 here, and "I'll get back to you," and then have the  
9 police department fumble on voluntarily/involuntary.  
10 I think that was incredible. "I don't support the  
11 involuntary thing." "They voluntarily got--" and  
12 those who do go and voluntarily, come on now you know  
13 that kind of flip flop and double talk I find  
14 incredible.

15 Also the Mayor's definition-- he wants to  
16 redefine, you know, what is considered serious--  
17 "likely to result in serious harm." That has to be  
18 redefined. What does that redefinition going to  
19 mean?

20 And on a very serious note, I don't think a  
21 police officer who hasn't been psychiatrically  
22 evaluated themselves should be in the streets with a  
23 nine millimeter Glock, a laser, and a baton, dealing  
24 with people who are mentally challenged or having  
25 some difficulties.

2 I think you need to put something-- or do you  
3 have something in your program to evaluate each and  
4 every police officer on their mental state? Because  
5 I've been around them. I've been around them and  
6 when they get this little herd mentality, they go  
7 crazy. And they very dangerous. So I think this is  
8 a dangerous proposition.

9 A few more things and don't finished.

10 For my colleagues, stop complimenting the  
11 governor so much on what she's given to mental health  
12 and the Mayor. We haven't even gone through the  
13 budgets yet. And already, 27.5 million for 1000  
14 beds? Beds that they took away during the pandemic  
15 and gave it there, and shut down the mental health  
16 beds. I was in the State Assembly. And I saw what  
17 they did with mental health in the State Assembly.  
18 So when someone comes before us-- [Bell rings] Just a  
19 few more seconds and I'll be finished. When someone  
20 comes before us with a \$227 billion budget, and you  
21 compliment her for 27.5 million and 1000 more beds,  
22 when we need 10 times as much as that, is an insult  
23 to our intelligence.

24 So I think we should be stronger on those who  
25 have planned to fund this program.

1           And then finally, you know, in my dealing with  
2           this issue over the years: Peter Funches, years ago,  
3           murdered by police, mentally challenged. Eleanor  
4           Bumpers, in the Bronx. Her eviction notice was a  
5           shotgun blast. And they said, "Well, it was done  
6           rapidly." So the first blast blew her hand off that  
7           they claimed she had a knife. So why the second one  
8           that blew a hole in her chest and killed her.  
9           Deborah Danner, also killed. Saheed Vassell killed.  
10          I can go on the rest of this hearing, talking about  
11          all the people that were killed by police.

12           So I think that this is a dangerous proposition  
13          that you're presenting here. If we don't do  
14          something about getting peer intervention more than  
15          you, I'm fearful that there'll be more death as it--  
16          as opposed to a solution to this problem.

17           And finally, poverty and mental illness is  
18          connected. So if the Mayor really wants to deal with  
19          mental illness, deal with poverty, deal with  
20          homelessness, deal with the real issues, the root  
21          causes to mental illness. We're not born this way.  
22          Conditions drive people to make the decisions, and  
23          their state of mind is to conditions, and for us to  
24          have \$102.7 billion budget in the city and a \$227  
25

2 billion budget in the state, it is unconscionable and  
3 unacceptable that we allow poverty to exist the way  
4 it is.

5 So I just think your proposal is dangerous. And  
6 I think that you should be more prepared when you  
7 come before us to address the issues. Thank you.

8 [APPLAUSE]

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Councilmember.

10 Okay, so just as a reminder, you guys actually  
11 were ahead of me. Instead of clapping, we usually do  
12 this in the chambers. And so thank you. You know,  
13 you did-- you guys are good.

14 So thank you so much, Councilmember Barron, next  
15 we-- oh, before we move on, sorry. I just wanted to  
16 recognize we've been joined by Councilmembers Mealy,  
17 Yeger, and Rivera.

18 [To others:] Oh, yes, I do. Okay, sorry.

19 And so next we have Councilmember Cabán followed  
20 by Councilmember Powers.

21 And I know two minutes is not a long time, but we  
22 have a long list of folks who are testifying today,  
23 so please stick to it as much as possible, thank you.

24 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you Chairs. So I  
25 just want to start by commenting on, or addressing

2 some of what was testified to today. And-- and also  
3 just a blanket statement that, you know, when-- when  
4 there is a mental health crisis occurring, the life-  
5 threatening emergency is the wrong response, and we  
6 have to keep that at the forefront.

7 And we're sending street response because other  
8 systems have failed. And I know, I certainly am, and  
9 there are lots of folks here committed to this, we're  
10 not going to continue to watch people die on the  
11 responder side, but we have to address the upstream,  
12 where the investments need to happen.

13 And to put like a real emphasis on it, that  
14 treatment response needs to be a medical response,  
15 not a police response, a medical response. And it--  
16 and I have had the privilege of traveling to  
17 different cities to see how they address their mental  
18 health crisis on the ground. And what I have learned  
19 from those places, including from their police  
20 chiefs, I must say, that it needs to be big enough to  
21 be effective, which means more funding, which means  
22 you cannot cut the DHS budget that-- that's  
23 happening. You cannot cut DHS which is in the  
24 proposed budget. You cannot cut B-HEARD and all  
25 these other things while the NYPD budget stays

2 intact. So it has to be big enough to be effective.  
3 It has to be nimble enough to be effective. And it  
4 has to be separate from the police.

5 But I do want to address your testimony. There  
6 was-- there was an emphasis by you all that, you  
7 know, it's a physician at the hospital making the  
8 termination?

9 Well, I had the opportunity to speak to a street  
10 outreach mental health professional that works with  
11 the City that does co-response work, and told me that  
12 the thresholds are different. That the thresholds  
13 for them on the street when they're making an  
14 assessment is not the same threshold that the doctor  
15 in the emergency room is using.

16 And so what happens is, is that somebody is  
17 agitated, they are upset, they are involuntarily  
18 brought to a hospital, they don't meet the hospital  
19 threshold, they are left where they're at, and  
20 oftentimes, obviously, we know the intersection of  
21 our homeless population and folks that are struggling  
22 with mental health issues. That is a real gap and a  
23 real problem that is not being accounted for.

24 In addition to that, you testified important--  
25 quote, "importantly, that the Mayor's plan does not

2 call for sweeps of people living with mental illness  
3 from public places." But again, the intersection  
4 between our homeless population and the mental health  
5 population is such that you cannot ignore the fact  
6 that he does direct sweeps of homeless encampments.  
7 That includes sweeps of people experiencing mental  
8 health issues.

9 And I would just like a few more seconds to  
10 address the testimony. You know, for-- for agency,  
11 testimony that says that they will not be relying  
12 increasingly on police to undress this, three  
13 quarters of the testimony given here today was  
14 focused on trying to convince us that the police had  
15 the tools to do this job. That tells a very  
16 different story. And we know that police make up 20%  
17 of the city's entire workforce. That is a problem.

18 I say all this to say that we have to make sure  
19 that we are building out a continuum of care that we  
20 have the right workers responding to this, and it is  
21 not reflected by the line items in the budget. I am  
22 deeply, deeply concerned about the plan that's being  
23 presented.

24 And I will ask one question, can you share data  
25 on how many mental health involuntary removals the

2 NYPD does per year, the locations of where people are  
3 removed from, and what hospitals they get taken to,  
4 the amount of hours that NYPD officers spend on  
5 average on each involuntary removal, and demographic  
6 data of those involuntarily detained?

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So-- so what I'll say  
8 about the data on involuntary removal is that it's  
9 very fragmented and very dependent on the type of  
10 removal.

11 So while we have for a long time tracked certain  
12 types of removals for certain types of teams, in  
13 other places that data is just now being built out  
14 because of this initiative. And we're working across  
15 agencies to identify the data to collect to ensure  
16 that we're using our best effort to implement this  
17 plan in the most responsible way. This will include  
18 looking at how successfully we engage people in  
19 getting connected to all kinds of treatment across  
20 the continuum of care, to include involuntary  
21 hospital transports for the purposes of evaluation.

22 The plan under the Mayor's directive has only  
23 been announced for a bit over two months, and we've  
24 learned as we've been planning and rolling out that  
25 limited data for this was previously tracked. This

2 means we're building much of this from the ground up  
3 on the-- in respects for data.

4 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Well, let me amend my  
5 question, then: Can you commit to-- that those--  
6 those data points that I just mentioned. Can you  
7 commit to giving them to this council?

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: What I would say is  
9 that those are very similar to the data points that  
10 we are looking to collect for--

11 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Right. And when you-- but  
12 you're not answering my question. I just want-- when  
13 you-- when you collect them, can you commit to giving  
14 them to this Council? That's my question. It's a  
15 yes or no.

16 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I believe we will. We  
17 will answer the Council's questions on the data as we  
18 collect it. Yes.

19 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And if we have time  
21 later, we'll try to do a second round questions for  
22 members as well.

23 Okay, so next we have Councilmember Powers  
24 followed by Councilmember Hanif.

2 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I know you  
3 don't have data for-- I just wanted to follow up with  
4 a question from my colleague. Do you have data on  
5 the last two months since the announcement was made,  
6 or whatever the timeline is, of how many-- how many  
7 folks have been-- have been-- with the new law  
8 changes and the new policy, just how many folks have  
9 been taken into custody because of that?

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: We have some data, but  
11 not all data.

12 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Can you share that with us  
13 real quick?

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I can say that the  
15 data that we have is very longstanding for our mobile  
16 crisis teams. So I'll hand it to Jamie just to give  
17 a bit of an overview. So these would be specifically  
18 for 9.58.

19 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Just-- if you can just  
20 give us the numbers. I don't need a narrative just  
21 to know what the exact numbers are.

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So the Health  
23 Department monitors mobile crisis teams. Mobile  
24 crisis is both a generic and a brand name, if you  
25 will, so it's used differently in different

2 scenarios. But there are 24 mobile crisis teams  
3 operating across our city, that have been operating  
4 for decades.

5 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Just-- I had a question  
6 and we only have two minutes-- I have 50 seconds now.  
7 So I just asked a question, what the number is. Can  
8 you just give us the data points on how many people  
9 have been--

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: I'm trying to  
11 give you some context, because it's a very small  
12 snippet of a larger system.

13 So in December, there were 42 removals conducted  
14 by these mobile crisis teams. They are not just  
15 serving homeless people. In fact, they are mostly  
16 serving people who are housed, not people who are  
17 homeless or on the subway. So there's-- this is  
18 Mental Hygiene Law that could apply to, you know,  
19 anybody in New York State.

20 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: I understood. Thank you  
21 for that. Look, this is obviously one of the most  
22 complicated issues, I think, facing our city and our  
23 state right now, is how to help individuals who have  
24 mental health-- serious mental health needs, and who  
25 are also potentially presenting a public safety

2 threat to New Yorkers. And I don't think it's nearly  
3 as simple as some people are presenting, and I also  
4 think that how to get people effective care, and make  
5 sure that people are not being a threat to New  
6 Yorkers-- I know I've had this in my district plenty  
7 of times, is really kind of essential. And I don't  
8 take-- I don't envy anybody who has got to try to  
9 figure that out. But that's why we're here.

10 So I just had a couple questions. And I'm sorry  
11 to take more time, but I just-- I'll just do  
12 questions, just to clarify the policies that are in  
13 place, because I get this question all the time from--  
14 - we encounter this all the time in my district.

15 Number one is: Is the policy around -- I know what  
16 the state law allows, it says individuals from  
17 meeting their basic human needs, I believe, is the  
18 definition -- how does that differ then from  
19 individuals who might be-- Because there might be  
20 some individuals who have-- there's a public safety  
21 issue, but perhaps they are meeting some of their  
22 basic human needs. And there's a question about  
23 exactly in a gray area question. So I want to  
24 understand the sort of human-needs policy versus the  
25 public safety aspect of that.

1  
2           And the second part I have is where you talk  
3 about involuntary transfer, but then when they-- and  
4 I've seen this happen in my district and I've had  
5 this question, so I'm just asking it a plain, fact-  
6 of-the-matter way, not in any agenda way -- but which  
7 is when they get to a hospital and then they're asked  
8 to take a voluntary transfer, I think, to services if  
9 I'm correct? So isn't it sort of-- like I'm trying  
10 to understand the involuntary versus voluntary parts  
11 of that, which is to say, somebody might take-- you  
12 might take them into custody, because you believe  
13 they can't meet their basic human needs, then get to  
14 the hospital and they are asked to volunteer-- I  
15 think-- I believe they'll voluntarily sign something  
16 saying that they'll accept treatment.

17           There's again, there's like one analysis saying,  
18 maybe they can meet their needs, and the second one  
19 saying, but they're in a mental health state where  
20 they can actually voluntarily sign their rights away.  
21 And I think that's, to me a big question about how  
22 that policy works.

23           DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So-- so let me talk  
24 about the-- what the-- the actual 958/941 Mental  
25 Hygiene Law says. And that is around that appearance

1 of mental illness, and conducting themselves in a  
2 manner likely to result in harm to self or others.  
3 So that's our public safety -- to put in your terms --  
4 - kind of standard. Within that "serious harm to  
5 self", OMH issued guidance around that inability to  
6 meet basic needs. So that's how-- it's not really a  
7 gray area. It's more of just on top of that-- that  
8 serious harm to self, which will include inability to  
9 make-- meet basic needs, and that serious harm to  
10 others in the community, which is more of that  
11 potential public safety standard.  
12

13 What I'll say about the removals themselves and--  
14 and heard it earlier also about there being two  
15 different-- two different standards between the  
16 removals. I think, Councilmember Cabán mentioned  
17 this. The different standards between the removal  
18 and what happens in the hospital, I might ask Dr.  
19 Fattal to talk a little bit more about that. But I  
20 think that is-- that is by design, because that  
21 removal is just to get that evaluation, right?, and  
22 to understand a little bit more about what that  
23 individual is experiencing and what kind of treatment  
24 and support that individual needs. But I'll hand it  
25 over to Dr. Fattal to talk a little more.

2 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. Just to clarify, I think this  
3 is a continuum. So the-- the removal, which happens  
4 in the community, and at that point, obviously,  
5 whenever we can do it voluntarily, then we do it  
6 voluntarily. But if the person is not agreeing to  
7 it, then it becomes involuntary. The same thing  
8 happens when someone presents with emergency room, we  
9 always try to-- if someone meets the criteria for  
10 admission to do it again, voluntarily. So at every  
11 moment, we go back to the idea of trying to do it  
12 voluntarily. But if they refuse, then we have to  
13 follow the Mental Hygiene Law. And I'm going to go  
14 back to an earlier comment that the standard for--  
15 that was issued by OMH in February of 2022 is the  
16 same. It's the exact same criteria for involuntarily  
17 removing someone, or involuntarily admitting someone  
18 to the hospital. It's the same concept, which is  
19 danger to self or others, and under danger to self,  
20 inability to care for basic needs is a form of danger  
21 to self. So we're following the same standard.

22 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Just one last follow up  
23 question: On the 41 individuals in December who were  
24 removed, how many-- and I understand that's a wide  
25

1 range of people, or a range of people -- how many  
2 were then admitted into-- to get medical help?

3  
4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: I don't have  
5 that. I don't have that information available.

6 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Okay, if you can get us  
7 information, that would be helpful. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Next we have Chair--  
9 Oh, sorry. Councilmember Hanif, as well as  
10 Councilmember Ayala after that, and then Bottcher.

11 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Great. Thank you so much.  
12 I agree with them, some of my colleagues who've  
13 shared that this directive is dangerous. It is  
14 regressive and-- and violent. We cannot police our  
15 way out of the city's homelessness and mental health  
16 crises. There are successful voluntary mental health  
17 programs that work, and we should be engaging in and  
18 expanding those critical services, including recovery  
19 based mental health programs, respite centers, peer  
20 supports, clubhouses, and much, much more.

21 My colleague, Councilmember Cabán pointed to  
22 other cities that have developed these kinds of  
23 programs. We should be looking to them, modeling,  
24 and actually be doing them even more successfully in  
25 our city.

1  
2           And we know that coercive mental health treatment  
3 has not proven to have better effects than voluntary  
4 treatment, and is it disproportionate-- the  
5 involuntary treatment is disproportionately applied  
6 to black, Latinx immigrants, LGBTQI folks, and other  
7 communities of color, who are often over diagnosed  
8 and underserved.

9           So I'd like some-- a summary of some of the data  
10 and I know you haven't been successfully able to  
11 share data with us. But I'd like to know what  
12 happens to individuals who are taken to hospitals by  
13 the NYPD on involuntary removals, how long they spend  
14 in the hospital, if they are physically or chemically  
15 restrained, what other kinds of care they receive,  
16 and if they are successfully connected to services  
17 when they are discharged?

18           What is the discharge plan for folks who have  
19 been involuntarily placed in-- in the hospital  
20 setting?

21           DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I'll hand it to Dr.  
22 Fattal to talk about what happens in Health and  
23 Hospital, hospital settings for folks who are brought  
24 there in a crisis. What I might say is that, you  
25 know, this-- this policy is not the starting point

1 for engagement, right? Starting points for  
2 engagement, include, you know, our teams that DOHMH,  
3 our teams at DHS that are working with-- with folks  
4 on the street every-- every single day, those are  
5 really our starting points for engagement, to get  
6 people into, you know, this critical care that can  
7 get them that long term treatment. This is really  
8 meant for a very, very small subset of folks where--  
9 where that engagement might not have been--  
10

11 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Respectfully, I understand.  
12 But I'd just like to know, how many have been taken  
13 to the hospital on an involuntary basis. And what  
14 those folks' discharge plan has looked like, what  
15 services they were offered, what has happened after  
16 their hospitalization, and how long they've been  
17 hospitalized?

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Understood. I'll hand  
19 it to Dr. Fattal.

20 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. Just to clarify, H&H is only  
21 one provider. So not every removal comes to us. I  
22 just want to make sure to put that in context, that--  
23 and also, it's-- the plan varies between different  
24 people. So I'm going to give you a general idea of  
25

1 what we do for someone, right? It's very hard to  
2 break it down exactly.

3  
4 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Great.

5 DR. FATTAL: But it all starts with receiving the  
6 information. So we're part of this initiative. And,  
7 you know, a key component of this initiative is  
8 collaboration and coordination. And it starts at the  
9 point of receiving heads up that someone, again, as  
10 Jason mentioned, this is a very, very select group of  
11 people, to get heads up that someone is coming to our  
12 one of our facilities, to get the information, make  
13 sure that we have it.

14 And then once we have someone come in, we do  
15 comprehensive psychiatric evaluation, but also a  
16 medical evaluation. A lot of people who have been  
17 living out on the streets have some medical issues  
18 that have been ignored as well. So we make sure that  
19 we address both the mental health needs and the  
20 psychiatric needs. And also get additional  
21 information to put the person in context history, we  
22 outreach the 24/7 command center that has information  
23 about people, and can connect us with the outreach  
24 teams that have been working with them so we can get  
25 the full picture.

2 Then once we've done a very thorough assessment  
3 that could include keeping someone for observation  
4 for up to three days in the emergency room, if you're  
5 not sure immediately. Then we answer the biggest  
6 question, which is: Does someone need to be admitted  
7 or not, right? And not every single person who was  
8 brought to us ends up being admitted, but some end up  
9 being admitted either voluntarily or involuntarily.  
10 And then once you're admitted, the main goal of the  
11 admission is stabilization. This is a you know, an  
12 inpatient unit, so you don't want keep someone there  
13 for too long. But then we have to make sure that  
14 they have a discharge plan, which we've talked  
15 briefly about before. But a discharge plan includes  
16 making sure someone has follow up appointments and  
17 follow up care, so that they're able to--

18 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: How does the follow up  
19 work?

20 DR. FATTAL: It depends on each person. So  
21 usually it's an appointment. It could be, depending  
22 on the level of care, could be in an outpatient  
23 clinic, could be in a post program, it could be in a  
24 partial program, it depends on what the person needs.  
25 But more importantly, we make sure that they have

2 wraparound services, which could include case  
3 management, and depending on the person it could be a  
4 caseworker, or it could be as intensive as critical  
5 time intervention team working with them for up to  
6 nine months.

7 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Got it. I hope you  
8 understand that I'm not just trying to like probe you  
9 all and trick you into asking these questions, but it  
10 is really important for us as Councilmembers who have  
11 constituents who may be involuntarily and coercively  
12 moved to a hospital setting, that there is a plan,  
13 that this is not just a revolving-door strategy, a  
14 short-term strategy, that they in fact-- once they  
15 receive these wraparound services during the three  
16 day-- three day period where you all are evaluating  
17 them, plus deciding whether they're admitted to the  
18 hospital, or whether they can come back at a later  
19 time, that there should be a long term strategy.

20 That they're not just coming back into the ER for  
21 services and then getting sent back to the streets.

22 So it would be really-- it's really urgent that you  
23 provide us with more transparent data, even if that  
24 data set isn't available yet. It doesn't-- I don't  
25 think it needs to be public. But we deserve to know

2 how exactly all of these agencies are administering  
3 this-- this directive.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, so next,  
5 we're going to move on to Councilmember Ayala and  
6 then Councilmember Bottcher.

7 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Thank you, Madam Chair. I  
8 just want to start by saying that there's a-- I'm  
9 really disappointed, and I don't-- in everything that  
10 I'm hearing today, but you know, our mental health  
11 system is a sham. It is completely broken,  
12 completely broken, and not recognizing that as part  
13 of this conversation, I think is a disservice.

14 The fact that the commissioner is not here is  
15 also insulting. Commissioner Vasan, I have a lot of  
16 respect for him, but he should have been here. I  
17 don't-- I can't think of a conversation more  
18 important than the one than we're having here today,  
19 and he should have been here.

20 I want to just, you know, highlight a couple of  
21 points that I have been, you know, sitting here kind  
22 of contemplating on. First of all, the term  
23 "community based care" has been brought up as part of  
24 this conversation continuously. When was the last  
25 time that anybody, you know, check the data to see

2 what the number of mental health providers were per  
3 community, you know, based on the on the number of  
4 hospitalization rates? Because in my community, I  
5 will tell you that it may take you up to a year to  
6 get an appointment in a community-based organization  
7 because we cannot attract or retain staff, because we  
8 don't pay them enough, because the Medicaid  
9 reimbursement rate is laughable, because we're losing  
10 people to the private sector every single day.

11 And so people are going. These people that are  
12 involuntarily being, you know, taken to the emergency  
13 room have been to the emergency room many times  
14 before that. That's not the problem. They've been  
15 there. They've been there on their own. They've  
16 been there with their family members. They're held  
17 for three days, and then they're released out into  
18 the community with no supervision, with no aftercare,  
19 with no follow up, expected to make decisions that  
20 they are unable to make sometimes on their own.

21 So while I agree with the Administration's  
22 position on, you know, it'd be inhumane to allow  
23 people to walk the streets when they are in that  
24 state, I blame the system, because the system is  
25 putting them out there.

2 So you're not rectifying anything by picking them  
3 up and taking them back to the hospital that they  
4 already came out of, right?

5 And I will, you know, I also, I want to highlight  
6 two cases, because they really bother me because I  
7 think that they're really connected to this. One was  
8 the case of Eric Davita. Eric Davita walked into a  
9 hospital in my district, and he was-- he took himself  
10 to the emergency room under duress. He knew that he  
11 needed care. Nobody needed to pick them up. His  
12 family didn't take him. He took himself. And while  
13 he was there, under whatever manic phase he was  
14 under, he got into an altercation with a security  
15 guard, and instead of treating him they arrested him,  
16 sent him to Rikers where he then committed suicide.

17 Explain that to me. Explain that to me. Because  
18 I need to understand. I don't I don't get it. I  
19 don't know who is on the receiving end, who's-- who  
20 is making these decisions, but our system is broken  
21 and that is why we fought so hard last year to create  
22 the Office of Mental Health, because we wanted to  
23 ensure that all of these gaps in services that  
24 somebody was looking at them and creating real policy  
25 to create meaningful change.

2 I'll share one last thought and I'm sorry, Madam  
3 Chair. But my brother -- and I bring them up all the  
4 time, you know, he has bipolar disorder. He was in a  
5 in manic -- in a manic state, a really bad manic  
6 state, and was released from a hospital. Even after  
7 I, the Deputy Speaker of the City Council, begged,  
8 begged them to keep him on a psychiatric hold,  
9 because he had been manic for days, hadn't been  
10 eating, hadn't been sleeping. He was on, you know,  
11 social media for days on end rambling. And I knew, I  
12 knew that he was at threat of being, you know, having  
13 himself beat up outside on the street, or being a  
14 danger to somebody else.

15 They released him against my recommendation.  
16 They didn't listen to anything that I had to say.  
17 They released him. He took himself took himself to  
18 Bellevue. Went AWOL three times. Again, he's in a  
19 manic state. The last time they brought him in, they  
20 left him in a room by himself with a-- with a doctor,  
21 he punched her in the face. And now where is he?  
22 He's in Rikers Island facing three years. And he'll  
23 do his time. Because, you know why? We don't even  
24 have court mental health court. The fact that he was  
25 under-- under mental health distress wasn't even a

2 part of the conversation. It became an assault like  
3 any other assault. What a disservice, not only to  
4 him -- and I bring him up, because he is the rule,  
5 not the exception. This is what we're seeing. And I  
6 am-- you know, I'm very passionate about this,  
7 because, you know, I've been very fortunate to be  
8 given a platform where I can speak to things I  
9 actually know about, because these are my life  
10 experiences, my lived experiences. I go through this  
11 every single day.

12 And nobody has ever picked up the phone and said,  
13 You know what, Councilmember? We would like to hear  
14 a little bit more about what those-- those gaps and  
15 services are because you've lived it. I don't know  
16 when was the last time any of you took one of your  
17 siblings or anybody in your family to the emergency  
18 room. I will be fascinated to find out.

19 [APPLAUSE]

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Thank you, Deputy  
21 Speaker for sharing.

22 And next we will go to Councilmember Bottcher,  
23 and then Majority Whip Brooks-Powers.

24 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHER: Hi. So the Mayor's  
25 announcement in November, as I understand it,

2 essentially expanded the criteria for transporting  
3 someone to the emergency room involuntarily.

4 Prior to November, the guidance that was given  
5 was for someone who appears to be mentally ill, and  
6 is conducting themselves in a manner which is likely  
7 to result in serious harm to themselves or others.

8 Now, the criteria has been expanded to also  
9 include those who appear mentally ill and-- and who  
10 display an inability to meet basic human needs, like  
11 the need for food, clothing, or shelter.

12 Dr. Fattal, you had said that there's been no  
13 increase in emergency room visits at H&H. How is it  
14 possible that there's been no increase when that  
15 universe has been expanded so much? It wouldn't need  
16 to be such a big universe, if we were providing  
17 actual community-based services like clubhouses and  
18 other services on the ground. But it is a big  
19 universe. How has there been no increase?

20 And you don't have the numbers today of how many  
21 people have been transported on the whole? When do  
22 you think we'll be able to get those numbers? Also,  
23 another question: You said you had a goal of  
24 expanding site bed capacity by 200 by the end of the  
25 year? Do you also have hard number goals for other

2 steps in the continuum of care, like medical respite  
3 beds? And what are those number goals?

4 And also, third question: These involuntary  
5 transports are done by the NYPD. Are there  
6 involuntary transports to the ER done by civilian  
7 entities as well?

8 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. I'm going to try to answer  
9 but I'm definitely going to defer to my colleagues at  
10 DOH and OCMH to also answer some of these questions.  
11 Again, H&H is has only one provider. We're one  
12 player in the mental health field in New York.

13 As far as the numbers. I think-- I hear exactly  
14 your question. I think the issue is in the context.  
15 I said we didn't have an increase. We see thousands,  
16 and I can get back to you with exact numbers, but  
17 Bellevue alone sees 12,000 people a year in our CPEP.

18 So the universe of people who are homeless-- and  
19 again, this initiative is very, very narrow. We're  
20 not going and, you know, doing this everywhere. This  
21 is a very, very, very small denominator of people  
22 that we're talking about who are homeless and have  
23 severe mental illness, and are being targeted by this  
24 intervention. So the whole number is very small --  
25 the denominator, not everyone's being removed --

2 compared to the volume of people that we see in our  
3 ERs, it's very small in that context. I feel like  
4 that's the-- what I was trying to say that the volume  
5 has not increased.

6 As far as other than beds, we definitely have  
7 different programs and initiatives that we're working  
8 on and have been working on planning. But I also  
9 would defer to Jamie to talk more-- we had said that  
10 there's a plan that's going to be announced. And,  
11 you know, I don't know how much you can share today,  
12 but there's definitely a very robust plan that's  
13 being worked on that will address a lot of what you  
14 mentioned. Not to mention the plan that the governor  
15 just announced a few days ago that includes also a  
16 lot of additional supportive housing and other  
17 housing-related items.

18 And the third question about--

19 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHEER: Civilian.

20 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. I also defer to Jason and  
21 Jamie for that one, because they have that answer.

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah. Just for-- for  
23 transports, just to be-- to be clear, the transports--  
24 - the actual transports themselves are being done by  
25 FDNY EMS with the support of NYPD, and those are just

2 for the involuntary transports. So-- and Chief  
3 Fields can talk more about that. On the-- on the  
4 numbers, I think, over the over the coming months, we  
5 should have more numbers to share about what actually  
6 is happening on the ground and how that relates into  
7 what's happening inside of the hospitals. It's, as I  
8 mentioned, I think, incredibly complex and  
9 fragmented, these numbers, and then how the kind of  
10 the outcome, if you will of the hospital system, how  
11 it's all related to the actual removals themselves.  
12 I'll also just make another note, and I'll see if  
13 Jamie or Chief Fields wants to add anything in, just  
14 about the standard: That the Mayor didn't expand the  
15 criteria, right? So that was-- it was interpretive  
16 guidance out of OMH in February of 2022 that really  
17 clarified the statute for both 941 and 958 removals  
18 to include this interpretation along the basic needs,  
19 and in November, the Mayor simply released a  
20 comprehensive way that the city will be conducting  
21 these-- these removals which did not exist before,  
22 and concurred with the state's guidance.

23 But Jamie or Chief Fields anything to add?

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Yeah, I would  
25 agree that the standard was not greatly expanded. It

2 remains very, you know, consistent with Mental  
3 Hygiene Law for a long time. And our focus is always  
4 on connecting to a lot of the great services that  
5 many of the Councilmembers and my fellow presenters  
6 have-- have mentioned, crisis alternatives, respite  
7 centers, support and connection centers, peer support  
8 services on a brief, you know, intervention.

9 And then the real measure of success is  
10 connection to ongoing care, right? Clubhouses are a  
11 great resource. Treatment services-- there's a lot  
12 of innovative treatment models that are out there and  
13 our more comprehensive mental health agenda will  
14 include broader metrics focused on the whole  
15 population, connections to care, moving into stable  
16 housing, right?, improved quality of life, those  
17 things that we know that are more robust and long  
18 standing in terms of their impact on an individual  
19 person and our city at large.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. Thank you. So  
21 next, we have Majority Whip Brooks-Powers, followed  
22 by Councilmember Holden.

23 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you Chairs.

24 As you all know, we had a hearing back in  
25 December, a joint hearing on subway safety, and at

2 the time, the Administration didn't provide any-- a  
3 clear answer that I'd like to follow up on today.

4 It's very much in line with what Deputy Speaker Ayala  
5 was referencing in her remarks.

6 But individuals with severe mental illness tend  
7 to be disoriented, have a typical thoughts such as  
8 paranoia, and are generally not in the best position  
9 to comply collaboratively with law enforcement.

10 If law enforcement engages and the individual  
11 reacts poorly, would the individual then be arrested  
12 and charged with a felony assault on a police  
13 officer? Or will they still be taken in for  
14 evaluation? When this was asked of the NYPD in our  
15 December subway safety hearing, it seemed that no  
16 clear guidelines had yet been worked out for how to  
17 handle the situation. So I'd like to have an update  
18 on that today.

19 And then as a follow up in terms of the CIT  
20 training, how was the crisis intervention training  
21 course selected by NYPD as the best option? How does  
22 this training course compared to other police  
23 precincts? Is it the most rigorous among major city  
24 police departments? And in terms of co-response,  
25 what is the NYPD's long term approach to co-response?

2 Does administration have a plan to increase the  
3 number of clinicians that serve in the field in  
4 response to mental health calls? Thank you.

5 DIRECTOR CLARKE: So I'll start with the first  
6 question. I think, you know, it really comes down to  
7 training. And I was at the hearing in December, and  
8 I think, when we look at the data, which we didn't  
9 have with us, about 1% of mental health crisis calls  
10 result in arrest. And as Chief Tobin mentioned  
11 earlier, the majority of that is assault three-- or  
12 not the majority, the most common is assault, third  
13 grade, criminal contempt, which is violating an order  
14 of protection, and menacing. So frequently, we're  
15 coming into domestic violence situations.

16 It is infrequent, and it's very uncommon for the  
17 felony arrest for assault on a police officer or an  
18 EMT. It's not zero, but it's infrequent. And I  
19 think it turns to training, on how we train our  
20 officers, and part of that is training them to  
21 respond to people in a mental crisis.

22 So even if-- the goal is to get voluntary  
23 compliance, but even if we don't, you know, to make  
24 sure we're providing a medical transport with EMS,

2 and bringing them to the hospital for care, and not  
3 to criminalize that.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Is there any  
5 corrective measures taken in the event that an  
6 officer may not have been trained, and someone who's  
7 had a mental health crisis ends up in Rikers, where  
8 at some point someone is assessing that this person  
9 may have had a mental health crisis, so that we're  
10 not criminalizing mental illness?

11 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Yeah. And I think-- so, you  
12 know, every case is individual, so I can't speak  
13 about why-- why individuals made that choice. But,  
14 you know, after that, even in those situations where  
15 an arrest happens, we're still bringing them into the  
16 hospital for evaluation. The district attorney's  
17 office have programs for people suffering from mental  
18 health to sort of off-ramp them from the criminal  
19 justice system.

20 If it's inappropriate, there's supervision to try  
21 and make sure we're instructing officers on the  
22 proper way to handle these situations. But there are  
23 off-ramps in the criminal justice system for people  
24 suffering from mental health crisis.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: But there's a  
3 chance that they can be charged with the felony?

4 DIRECTOR CLARKE: I mean, like I said, it's  
5 infrequent. For--

6 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So then that means  
7 that they can be. I just need a clear answer.

8 DIRECTOR CLARKE: It can be, but the goal on the  
9 training is not to do that, and it's infrequent.

10 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Let's change the  
11 question. Has-- has it happened?

12 CHIEF HOLMES: So, I can speak to that. I'm  
13 Chief Holmes, right? Because I'm a training I've  
14 been here 37 years and NYPD and I touched many  
15 aspects of the department. So Can that happen? Yes.  
16 The primary goal is for that not to happen. I've  
17 been in precincts myself, where I'm the commanding  
18 officer or a sergeant on the desk. Someone brings an  
19 individual in that was suffering from a mental health  
20 crisis, and sometimes it's quickly resolved that this  
21 person needs to go to the hospital, not be arrested,  
22 the arrest is voided, things of that nature. And I'm  
23 talking long-- I'm talking way back because I've been  
24 here a long time. But the training that's in place  
25 now, hopefully is addressing that. We're pushing it

2 out more often. I believe in reoccurring training is  
3 essential in getting the message out and making it  
4 stick. And like it was testified to today that the  
5 leadership training courses encompass that. If  
6 you're a new sergeant, new Lieutenant, captain, going  
7 through the course, it's-- it's emerged in that--  
8 that training is emerged in those particular forums.  
9 But hasn't happened? Obviously, because I've  
10 listened to some of the Councilmembers here today.  
11 That is not what I think any of us want to see as a  
12 result of such. And, you know, if it happens, and  
13 we're made aware of it, naturally, officers are made  
14 aware of it. And we speak quite often.

15 It doesn't have to happen in New York, something  
16 can happen. And still I feel the need or the agency  
17 feels a need: Let's get it out there before our men  
18 and women and make sure to try and offset it from  
19 happening here in New York.

20 And with that being said, we're talking about a  
21 national model, which is the crisis intervention  
22 training, national model initially, I think it was  
23 Memphis, Tennessee, in 1988. We adopted it in 2015.  
24 But I'm still looking for if there's a better product  
25 out there, believe me I'm trying to research and look

2 for it. And that's-- training is ever-evolving and  
3 we're always looking for growth here in the agency.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry. Just a last  
5 followup question. I just want to know if the  
6 training is required for all offices and how  
7 frequently those trainings happen. Because I know  
8 oftentimes, you know, I hear from officers also  
9 feeling that they're not getting enough training.  
10 And so with something as sensitive as this, I'm just  
11 interested in understanding what investments are  
12 making-- are being put in place to ensure that they  
13 are receiving that training.

14 CHIEF HOLMES: So yes. This training, especially  
15 the one that was recently implemented, it's for all  
16 officers. I don't care what unit you're in. I don't  
17 care if you're in an administrative position, because  
18 at any given time -- and we saw that recently -- you  
19 can be put in a position where you need to have this  
20 particular training.

21 And training currently, right now the entire  
22 agency took an overhaul. So I know I'm writing a  
23 succession plan where I want to see training for NYPD  
24 in the next two years, if not more current.

2 So it's-- yes, it is mandated to answer your  
3 question for all officers in NYPD.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Thank  
5 you.

6 CHIEF HOLMES: You're welcome.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: So next we have Councilmember  
8 Holden, followed by our Public Advocate Jumaane  
9 Williams.

10 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair. And  
11 thank you, Chief Holmes, for-- for that.

12 You have a wealth of experience in this. Yeah, I  
13 was behind at another council. But-- and that's why  
14 you're so valuable to NYPD. You have the history and  
15 you know some of the problems that we've experienced  
16 in the past, but let me-- I was critical of Thrive  
17 NYC in the last administration, because we had a lot  
18 of, we probably still do, but a lot of acts of random  
19 violence. Somebody just punched somebody for no  
20 reason. They didn't know the person is just punching  
21 somebody.

22 And we had multiple times like say dozens of  
23 times, they were rearrested and then just sent out  
24 again, with-- nobody red flagged him. I asked  
25 Thrive, "Does anybody red flag these people?" And

2 they have probably a Serious Mental Illness that  
3 needs to be, you know, needs to be handled. A lot of  
4 them had schizophrenia, you know, whatever it is,  
5 they're just getting rearrested. So-- and I think  
6 that's probably still happening to some degree.

7 When somebody is-- attacks someone else, doesn't  
8 know them just punches them for no reason, no  
9 apparent reason. And they're, you know, they're--  
10 they're diagnosed. I mean, they're brought to a  
11 hospital by a police officer or EMS, does the doctor  
12 have access to their records, their arrest records of  
13 that individual?

14 DR. FATTAL: I have to get back to you about that  
15 one. I-- yeah, I need to confirm.

16 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: But see, this is the  
17 problem.

18 DR. FATTAL: Yep.

19 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: When-- if we don't, then  
20 it's-- it's a merry-go-round. It's going to keep  
21 happening.

22 DR. FATTAL: Yeah.

23 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: And that person might be  
24 sent to Rikers and never be diagnosed. When we, you  
25 know, we could admit them. And that's-- so we got to

2 get off this merry-go-round of this kind of, you  
3 know, lack of communications.

4 So if you can get back to me on that, because  
5 that's very important, that the officer tells the  
6 doctor. I don't know if the officer can hang around,  
7 but that's a that's a big issue.

8 DR. FATTAL: Oh, I'm sorry. I thought you were  
9 talking about, if someone is brought to us by  
10 someone, we do receive that information. But you're  
11 saying if-- sorry, maybe I don't understands.

12 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, no. We just we just  
13 see the same-- you know, we read about the newspaper  
14 the same individual keeps getting arrested and  
15 re=arrested and re-arrested, for the-- for obvious  
16 signs that they're unstable.

17 DR. FATTAL: Yeah.

18 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: And they're put back on  
19 the streets. Why are they-- why are they out on the  
20 streets first of all, and why aren't they committed  
21 to an institution where they can get better? You  
22 know what I mean. So I'm asking you, does the doctor  
23 have the records of that individual to-- the arrest  
24 records?

2 DR. FATTAL: So if someone is brought to us by  
3 NYPD than we do receive that information when they  
4 bring them to us. So we would have access to that  
5 information.

6 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: But the officer hangs  
7 around until the doctor comes? How does this work?

8 DR. FATTAL: Oh, so this is part of the protocol.  
9 Maybe Jason can talk more about that. But definitely  
10 the chain of custody ends when we take over the  
11 patient. So the patient is never left without any--  
12 you know, being under the custody of anyone. So  
13 definitely they hang around long enough to make sure  
14 that the patient is registered in our emergency room.

15 And by definition, if you're registered, that  
16 means that now you're under our custody, it means  
17 that our healthcare professionals--

18 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: So if they're brought in  
19 by EMS, what happens? They have the arrest records  
20 if there's no police officer there?

21 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: You know, they might  
22 not. What I what I might go back to is you know  
23 what-- what happens in the hospital around talking to  
24 service providers, to other collateral contacts, and  
25 that might be where some of that gets-- gets

2 uncovered and gets to the physician who's doing that  
3 psychiatric evaluation. I think the-- the intent,  
4 and Dr. Fattal can talk a little more about the  
5 intent of psychiatric evaluation, is really meant to  
6 collect some of that information beyond arrest  
7 records, right? We're talking about, you know, you  
8 know how they have been in treatment, you know what  
9 other folks that they have?

10 DR. FATTAL: Yeah, I mean, I can talk about this  
11 also, as a physician, the physician is only a member  
12 of the team. So the team has the nurse has the clerk  
13 has transport person. We have EMRs. So obviously,  
14 when you do an evaluation, you're not only relying on  
15 the information that was given to you personally,  
16 you're relying on everything that happened, including  
17 the EMS records, including the registration  
18 information. So yes, if the information makes it at  
19 any point in our system, then we have access to it.

20 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, I just think-- I'm  
21 sorry Chair, but I just think that we need a very  
22 definitive process. That-- and I think that's the  
23 critical thing. Because we all-- we read about it in  
24 a newspaper every day. Somebody just punches  
25 somebody, and the same person was re-arrested 46

2 times. Is anybody out there red flagging all these  
3 arrests? I mean, that's what we need somebody in  
4 oversight looking at this, a doctor or, you know,  
5 somebody that that can red flag people. Because  
6 that-- in the last administration, I was very  
7 critical. All this money from Thrive was going out  
8 there. And they said most of it was for training.  
9 But that we didn't even see. So that's the-- that's  
10 the problem here. And I hope the Administration-- I  
11 like what's-- what's happening in this  
12 administration. At least they're communicating. But  
13 we didn't learn anything in the last eight, you know,  
14 eight years, especially in the last four of Thrive  
15 NYC. We didn't get that information. There's a lot  
16 of money out there, but we didn't see a difference.  
17 Thanks.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: And for my colleagues, as  
20 a triage nurse, you come to us first. And when you  
21 come, we get the record. And then we give it to the  
22 doctor, and then we have a meeting. We have that a  
23 lot. The biggest problem we have, believe it or not,  
24 is the continuous service with the CBOs in our  
25 community, the-- we don't have enough support system.

2 Because when those guys come to us, we have to refer,  
3 get the social worker involved, but by the time we do  
4 that, we don't have enough. And that's what happens.  
5 You don't have enough beds, you don't have enough  
6 support services, you don't have enough support  
7 housing. And that's the crisis we're dealing with  
8 right now. Unfortunately, been going on for decades.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, next we have  
10 our Public Advocate Jumaane Williams, followed by  
11 Councilmember De La Rosa.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much,  
13 Madam Chair. First, again, just reiterating  
14 hopefully, the answers to the letters-- to the  
15 questions that my office submitted will be answered  
16 shortly.

17 I did want to say this framework in context, I  
18 think there's something we have to break down that  
19 caused a lot of some of these questions to be moot.

20 The first one is: we're getting better as a  
21 society, but as a society as a whole, and government  
22 in particular, has a hard time letting go with police  
23 having to be the response to everything that goes on  
24 in our city, and in our state in our country. That  
25 is one of the primary problems that we have: Police

2 do not have to be the ones responding to everything.  
3 But we haven't committed to that even as we say it.  
4 Even if we look at the budget right now, the police  
5 department is one of the larger funded. They also  
6 have access to unlimited overtime that no one else  
7 has access to. If I was asked about the overtime  
8 access for H&H for DOHMH and EMS, it would pale in  
9 comparison to the NYPD.

10 Also, NYPD is the only one not facing any cuts so  
11 that other agencies are facing cuts on top of not  
12 having any access to overtime, and on top of that the  
13 recent budget laid out by the governor is giving NYPD  
14 additional funding for overtime, while not giving any  
15 money to try to restore cuts to the other agencies.

16 That said that framework is a framework that we  
17 have to change not just in words, but in practice. I  
18 know it's hard to do. These are hard questions. And  
19 these are hard things to put into play. But if we  
20 don't do it, we're going to continue seeing the  
21 problems over, and over, and over again.

22 And that leads me to saying why I want to make  
23 sure that people are trained, we have to make sure  
24 our officers are trained continually training is not  
25 going to solve the problem. The question is how when

2 why and who were using law enforcement to replace?

3 That's the question that we have to ask and who gets  
4 the brunt of that. But I did want to just point out  
5 hopefully I have-- I'm sorry.

6 On page four and page six, you mentioned clearly  
7 that the orders did not expand any powers. You also  
8 said that they cannot create involuntary admittance.  
9 I just want to be clear, we're playing with semantics  
10 here, because there was a change that the Mayor was  
11 trying to make clear, that did expand some things in  
12 its clarity.

13 Also, while they may not be able to involuntary  
14 admit, they can involuntary bring people to the  
15 hospital, so I want to just be clear about that.

16 And also on page five it said the clinicians can  
17 call for NYPD in person, that they are in the lead.  
18 I also want to be clear what we've heard, is that the  
19 person with the gun is the lead. So that's one of  
20 the reasons the best intentioned officer, I believe  
21 what we've learned is the presence of the officer  
22 with a gun in uniform can heighten the situation even  
23 for the best-intended and best-trained officer.

24

25

2 So I did have a question so I can better  
3 understand, because you said clinicians can call for  
4 NYPD, which would assume that NYPD is not there.

5 So I want to understand how it works with these  
6 teams, is there a law enforcement person already  
7 there? Or are these teams going out, assessing  
8 situations for themselves, and then if it's  
9 necessary, calling for NYPD.

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I'll hand it to  
11 Jamie in just a second, but first Public Advocate I  
12 do-- I do want to just note that we did receive your  
13 letter, we're working on responding to it, and we're  
14 going to respond to it very soon.

15 And the other thing I'll just say is: It's going  
16 to depend on when and where this happens. Sometimes  
17 PD will be there, other times they won't.

18 But I'll let Jamie talk a little bit more about  
19 the situations where they may or may not be there.

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Sure. So,  
21 again, there's a lot of different types of teams.  
22 There's teams that explicitly focus on crisis  
23 intervention, and there's other teams that work with  
24 people on an ongoing basis. And sometimes those  
25 people may also have a period of crisis, you know, if

2 they're working with somebody over the years. I'll  
3 focus on the specific crisis intervention teams that  
4 respond over 16,000 referrals a year via NYC-WELL.  
5 General public providers concern family members,  
6 anybody can call NYC-WELL, they will connect if a  
7 person is in crisis, and they can't get to treatment  
8 themselves, or they will dispatch a mobile crisis  
9 team that will meet with the person wherever they  
10 are, these teams focus on people who are housed,  
11 which would actually include shelters, but is mostly  
12 people in private residences or supportive housing,  
13 et cetera, 16,000 referrals a year. They include  
14 peers and clinicians, they de-escalate, connect to  
15 ongoing care. Less than 4% of the time, they will  
16 assess the person as needing to go to the hospital.  
17 The person may go voluntarily, they may, you know,  
18 "My brother will drive me. We'll go right now."  
19 They may not want to go voluntarily, in which case,  
20 that mobile crisis team would call 911, and the  
21 police and EMS would respond.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay, thank you. I  
23 have other questions hopefully the letter will  
24 respond to. I did want to also say part of the  
25 problem is that when this was announced, it was

2 announced as a plan, but it was a tactic. And that  
3 is a difference. And if we can talk about a full-  
4 fledged plan, it would help relieve a lot of the  
5 concerns that we have. We all know that there are  
6 failures happening now. I do want to lift up  
7 Samantha Prius, I believe her name was. She was let  
8 out of Queens Hospital. She was nonverbal mute, on  
9 autism spectrum, let out in the freezing cold. Her  
10 parents-- her family waited for weeks to find them.  
11 To Shawn Carter, Michael Lopes, who were getting help  
12 on a psychiatric hospital who were brought to Rikers.  
13 They're now dead.

14 And so we do know that they are failures here.  
15 And we have to work on getting a continuum of care  
16 system that is not reliant on simple law enforcement  
17 because it has never worked before, and it harms  
18 black and brown communities primarily.

19 Thank you so much. I appreciate it.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. So next we  
21 have Councilmember De La Rosa followed by  
22 Councilmember Paladino.

23 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much. I  
24 want to piggyback on some of my colleagues comments.  
25 I want to uplift that there is inherent violence in

2 the interaction between police and people who are  
3 suffering from severe mental illness. And those  
4 interactions have been, you know, have been plastered  
5 all over newspapers for us to see for over a decade.  
6 They are the names of New Yorkers that have been  
7 murdered by police officers in these interactions.  
8 And they are people with families.

9 And I just want to say that we have been given  
10 information that talks to some of the disparities  
11 that exist in these practices. Black New Yorkers  
12 have been found to have a higher hospitalization rate  
13 for mental illness despite lower prevalences of  
14 lifetime diagnosis and severe mental illness, as well  
15 as-- as well-- We also know that the highest poverty  
16 neighborhoods that have over twice as many  
17 psychiatric hospitalizations per capita as the lowest  
18 poverty neighborhoods in New York City. Those data  
19 points point to the targeting of black and brown New  
20 Yorkers who are severely mentally ill, as well as the  
21 criminalization of poor New Yorkers in those same  
22 communities.

23 So while there has been an emphasis today in the  
24 testimony on trainings, trainings alone will not  
25 change this bias and the disparity that exists. We

2 need accountability as well. And I want to say that  
3 we have information that since 2017, the CCRB, has  
4 recorded close to 2700 allegations that police abused  
5 their power when sending someone to the hospital  
6 against their will. This is an alarming number,  
7 obviously, and complaints about NYPD abuse during  
8 involuntary removals and what is-- so we want to  
9 know, right?, that this-- this data point is that we  
10 want to know what is happening for NYPD officers who  
11 in the past have been-- had a CCRB complaint, have  
12 abused their power when having interactions with New  
13 Yorkers? What is the accountability for those  
14 officers in this process of involuntary removal?  
15 That's number one.

16 And then number two, just to ask both of my  
17 questions quickly. I do have a question regarding  
18 staffing at these agencies, the Office of Community  
19 Mental Health, and the office-- and the Department of  
20 Health and Mental Hygiene. We know that there is a  
21 staffing crisis in New York City. So if training is  
22 relying upon, for example, DOHMH to do this training,  
23 but we don't have enough staffers to-- to even  
24 service our city, how is that happening, and what are  
25

2 the impacts on actual trainings if those agencies are  
3 hollow?

4 CHIEF HOLMES: So I'll take the first component  
5 as far as accountability. First and foremost,  
6 there's body worn cameras now, and those cameras,  
7 it's mandated and encompassed in the training, that  
8 that camera is to be activated upon the first  
9 encounter with an individual.

10 And, you know, full transparency, you're right.  
11 We've seen where officers have forced wants someone  
12 to the hospital, and they've been disciplined as a  
13 result of it. As a matter of fact, I used one of  
14 those scenarios in my training, as to "this is not  
15 what we want to see."

16 So you know, some can be training, and then some,  
17 yes, you do have where someone has interacted in, you  
18 know, inappropriately, and, and been met with  
19 discipline.

20 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: So are you red  
21 flagging? Since we're talking about red flagging New  
22 Yorkers who are walking down the street? Are we red  
23 flagging NYPD officers who have a history of  
24 brutality.

2 DIRECTOR CLARKE: So I also want to put a little  
3 context in here. You know, we're talking about 2745  
4 complaints. We're responding to 170,000 of these  
5 calls a year. So this is, again, of this-- between  
6 2017 I don't have the math in my head right now, but  
7 we're talking 600,000 to 800,000 responses to calls a  
8 year, and we're talking about 2000 complaints. So I  
9 agree with Chief Holmes: When it is improperly done,  
10 it should be, it should be investigated by CCRB, and  
11 there should be accountability for the officer.

12 But by and large, we're talking about officers  
13 who are handling situations correctly given the vast  
14 numbers of calls we respond to, and the low number of  
15 complaints comparatively.

16 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: I will say that it's  
17 not apples to apples. Just the fact that you have  
18 that many complaints points to a problem. And the  
19 fact that the CCRB has not always acted independently  
20 leads us-- leads me to have concerns over the  
21 validity of the of the complaints that have been  
22 dismissed.

23 And so that's not apples to apples, in my  
24 opinion, and to have those complaints be at the  
25 forefront. Those are still people. Those are not

2 just numbers of complaints. Those are people that  
3 are walking in New York City streets, and as you  
4 heard our colleagues say here, there are people with  
5 people with families, who are concerned about their  
6 well being when an interaction happens, right?, with  
7 police officers. They leave their house, they're in  
8 a manic state, and there is an interaction. So we  
9 need accountability as well as training. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, next we have  
11 Councilmember Paladino, followed by Councilmember  
12 Abreu.

13 COUNCILMEMBER PALADINO: Good afternoon,  
14 everybody and thank you for coming.

15 I'd like to commend you, Chief Holmes. I'd like  
16 to thank the Mayor's Office for taking the steps that  
17 you are taking. It's a long time coming. We've seen  
18 this mental health crisis put be put on hold for  
19 decades now. Let's not remember-- let's remember,  
20 when state hospitals were considered inhumane and  
21 they were closed. We presently have a lot of vacant  
22 properties that can actually be used to serve the  
23 mentally ill. The mentally-- the mentally ill, and  
24 the mentally challenged, cannot be put in a criminal  
25 status. They are mentally ill.

2 Now when I think of these safe spaces, this is a  
3 safe space where they could receive the treatment  
4 that they need, whether it be long-term or short-  
5 term.

6 So I think you guys are doing your jobs right  
7 now, but we have to go deeper. We've got \$227  
8 billion coming down from the state of New York. What  
9 are they doing with that? We had Thrive New York,  
10 which was a joke, \$1.2 billion, and yet we're sitting  
11 here talking about this as if it's a new problem.  
12 It's misappropriation of funds.

13 Now let's keep an eye on our governor, and let's  
14 see what she plans to do when it filters down here to  
15 the city so that we can get a grip on this problem.

16 Another thing I went on a ride along. I went on  
17 a ride along to Friday nights ago with the one on  
18 Ninth precinct. And I watched your officers handle  
19 two very severely mentally challenged people, one  
20 knife wielding, and I watched the EMS come in  
21 everything you spoke about here, your training, I saw  
22 put to good use. And another person who went crazy  
23 in Rite Aid, totally ballistic, throwing things  
24 around threatening people. Once again, the offices I  
25 was-- I were with, one was a-- on the force for 16

2 years, the other fresh out of the academy. I  
3 couldn't be more proud the way you guys handled this  
4 situation. I know there's a crisis once your  
5 inputted, and there's no long term solutions. So  
6 long term solutions rests in the \$227 billion that  
7 the state is supposed to be giving this city.

8 So let's make sure the money is used properly.  
9 And the Mayor could go forward in purchasing perhaps  
10 Creekmore, which is 300 acres of state-owned land.  
11 There are places and-- and things we could do. I  
12 work with these people all the time, and I look  
13 forward to furthering this and not just talking about  
14 it. It's time for action. Thank you very much.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And next we will go  
16 with Councilmember Abreu followed by Councilmember  
17 Gutiérrez.

18 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Thank you Chair.  
19 Considering there is a shortage of mental health  
20 staff across all H&H hospitals, how many more mental  
21 health professionals need to be hired to meet the  
22 demands of AOTs?

23 DR. FATTAL: Yep, thank you. I'm going to defer  
24 to Jamie from DOHMH, who oversee the AOT program.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Sure. Yeah.

3 The Department of Health implements assisted  
4 outpatient treatment in New York City.

5 We have-- I don't-- about 100 staff on my team,  
6 clinicians and non-clinicians, you know, lawyers.

7 It's interdisciplinary. I don't have the exact  
8 headcount, but certainly, you know, there-- there are  
9 vacancies in the program and across our agency, and  
10 AOT is no-- no exception to that.

11 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Is it fair to say that you  
12 don't have the-- enough staff to meet the demand?

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So AOT is a  
14 court monitoring program, civil courts, a civil  
15 matter. We're not providing care. So everybody on  
16 an AOT court order is receiving community-based  
17 treatment and care coordination provided by CBOs,  
18 hospital-based clinics. And so those, that larger  
19 behavioral health workforce is not DOHMH staff or  
20 city staff necessarily, there are also shortages  
21 within the sort of larger behavioral health workforce  
22 that I think we're all aware of.

23 But everybody on an AOT court order in New York  
24 City is in treatment, that is the requirement of the  
25 program. So nobody on AOT is without treatment.

2 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Thank you for your  
3 question. And because Intro 706 is being heard  
4 today, I would like to have perspective by OCMH on  
5 that. Is this something that's feasible? Would it  
6 be possible to create a virtual interactive map that  
7 shows where services are located?

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So thank you,  
9 Councilmember. So we support the goal of providing  
10 access to mental health services, which is why we,  
11 with our partners at DOHMH launched NYC-WELL. This  
12 commitment to access includes ensuring that there are  
13 places for New Yorkers to find the resources that  
14 they need. And so NYC-WELL, which is New York City's  
15 single point of entry for behavioral health services,  
16 provides a robust online portal that the public can  
17 access now, and it's organized by population, type of  
18 service. They can also call and have counselors and  
19 peers to help navigate the system and provide crisis  
20 counseling via phone, text, and chat.

21 OCMH also published a how-to help guide to help  
22 walk folks through how to get services in the city  
23 and direct folks to that comprehensive resource that  
24 is NYC-WELL.

2 So we look forward to talking to you about the  
3 bill and how to make it-- and how to get these  
4 resources out to folks.

5 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: So we-- there's-- there's a  
6 path for us to work together on this.

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Absolutely.

8 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Thank you so much.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So actually, we're going  
10 next to Councilmember Brewer followed by  
11 Councilmember Rivera.

12 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. Just  
13 a few questions. In my discussions with all of the  
14 mental health groups, at least in Manhattan, it's all  
15 about the staffing. So I always hope that agencies  
16 don't work in silos. So my question to you is, are  
17 you -- sometimes it's hard to fight OMB, I know that  
18 -- but are you willing? Are you able are you doing  
19 advocating for more funding for the mental health  
20 agencies, you'll hear about the clubhouses, there are  
21 many other models. That's question number one,  
22 because without that support, you can't be  
23 successful.

24 Number two, I wonder if you have any statistics,  
25 whatever the overall number of voluntary or

2 involuntary, of people who are going back to the  
3 shelters, are they going back to families? Where are  
4 they where are they going after three days, et  
5 cetera, because there is very little opportunity for  
6 a stable environment in our city. And it's not your  
7 fault, but that's the housing problem.

8 Third, I believe there are 50 -- at least in the  
9 Manhattan court, and I know DA Bragg is upset about  
10 it -- only 50 People can be handled by the mental  
11 health court. Are you-- is it worth it? Do you need  
12 more slots there? What are you doing about that?

13 And then finally, leaving Rikers has been a  
14 problem for I don't know, 40 years that I've been  
15 doing this. Me and Madam Holmes, or we've been doing  
16 this for a long time. 40 years I've been doing this.  
17 So is there any change in leaving Rikers? I know  
18 there's a lot of talk. Rikers has a lot of people  
19 with mental illness. What are we doing as a city --  
20 even though there's a lot of talk -- to make sure  
21 that people coming out from Rikers have support.  
22 When you leave the state system? I know I had a son  
23 who came from the state criminal justice system,  
24 mentally ill, they do pay attention, but does--  
25 Rikers talks about it, but those could be recidivism

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 140  
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 unless you're paying attention to mental health. So  
4 those are my four questions.

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I'll take it from  
6 the top. If I miss anything, let me know. Just on  
7 the funding and staffing, what I'll say about the--  
8 the staffing is staffing is a national issue, right?  
9 So we're facing--

10 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I don't live in Iowa. I'm  
11 interested just in New York City.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I understand. I think  
13 we're facing staffing issues across many of our--  
14 many of our programs, and we are I think actively  
15 working on many, many strategies to-- to kind of, you  
16 know, get out of this staffing crisis that we're in.

17 So whether that's, you know, collective job  
18 fairs, whether that's, you know, enhanced recruiting  
19 efforts, we're trying to find the staffing that we  
20 need to really fill our vacancies across our teams,  
21 and within the Administration.

22 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Definitely for the  
23 Administration, but also for the nonprofit community-  
24 based organizations that really are an extension of  
25 city government. Are you fighting for them to get  
money too against OMB?

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I mean, I think we're  
3 always looking at ways that we can some work support  
4 community providers, to make sure that they can find  
5 the staff that they need to hire and have the  
6 appropriate level of support.

7 Just on the statistics, for discharges back to  
8 shelter, I'll hand it over to Dr. Fattal to talk  
9 about what happens after that three day period.

10 DR. FATTAL: Yeah, and I just wanted to go back  
11 to-- I know I mentioned three days, but I want to  
12 clarify the context I used it. It's the-- if someone  
13 comes to our emergency room, we can do an evaluation,  
14 and we could keep them up to three days in the  
15 emergency room for observation, but that's not the  
16 overall duration. If they ended up being admitted,  
17 then, you know, the admission is definitely a longer  
18 stay.

19 So just want to clarify that because I don't want  
20 the impression to be that we only keep people to up  
21 to three days.

22 And as far as what happens to them afterwards, I  
23 think that's the data that was asked for before and  
24 we can get back to you on that, but we do keep track.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: But it is the most  
3 important data of this whole conversation. Just so  
4 you know.

5 DR. FATTAL: Yes.

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Um, the other one  
7 around Rikers. So when I might say, you know,  
8 there's Correctional Health Services that provides  
9 health services at Rikers that does--

10 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I know.

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, an amazing job  
12 to-- to help folks--

13 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Comme ci, comme ça.

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Understood. And you  
15 know, they're helping folks as they get discharged to  
16 get connected into-- into treatment. And I think  
17 we're trying to find ways to make that a easier,  
18 better process.

19 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: But what are you doing to  
20 make that easier and better, because people leave? I  
21 know, I've been there. They leave, and they just  
22 don't necessarily follow appointments, and so on and  
23 so forth. So what is the connection there between  
24 leaving Rikers and support?

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So my-- I'm going to  
3 have to defer that to Correctional Health Services,  
4 and I'll get back to you with what they're-- they're  
5 working on.

6 Similarly with mental health courts, that's  
7 within the purview of MOCJ. I'll get back to you on  
8 the-- the mental health courts as well.

9 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I  
10 guess what I'm trying to say after 40 years, we still  
11 silo, and we cannot-- we've got to stop siloing  
12 agencies. That's a huge issue. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Next, we  
14 will go to Councilmember Rivera, followed by  
15 Councilmember-- Oh, we actually did that. Go ahead.

16 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Good afternoon. Thank you  
17 for being here. Nice to see you, Chief Holmes.

18 I want to go over some of the numbers that you  
19 mentioned today. It was mentioned that 42 removals  
20 were made in December 2022. Is that correct?

21 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Um, so that was just  
22 for our mobile crisis teams.

23 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Do you know where those  
24 removals were made? I'll defer to Jamie.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Yeah, so mobile  
3 crisis teams operate citywide. We would know the  
4 location--

5 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: You wouldn't?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: We would. We  
7 would. I don't-- I couldn't tell you the location of  
8 all of them off the top of my head. But yes, we have  
9 the location.

10 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Could you get those--  
11 those neighborhoods for us? I only ask because the  
12 highest-poverty neighborhoods have over twice as many  
13 psychiatric evaluations per capita as the lowest  
14 poverty neighborhoods in New York City. So how the  
15 city responds to the these individual areas, I think,  
16 is important. So I would love to know that.

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: When I-- can I  
18 just respond to that, because I totally agree. And  
19 the training that we do for 958 designation includes  
20 a module on anti racism and bias in mental health  
21 services. So we completely understand the role.

22 [crosstalk]

23 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Let me just say-- I  
24 appreciate that. I just want to ask about were those

2 removals through calls that were made regarding a  
3 mental health crisis that was in progress?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So the removals  
5 I'm talking about were calls to NYC-WELL, where the--  
6 there was a report either, you know, by the person,  
7 or by a loved one, or by a provider, anybody who  
8 might know them, explaining that there was a mental  
9 health situation that was assessed to be a crisis by  
10 the NYC-WELL counselor, and then dispatched to a  
11 local CBO operated team, who then went out into their  
12 home, did an assessment, and then assessed the-- if  
13 the threshold was met for removal.

14 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: So 16,000 referrals were  
15 made to NYC-WELL in a year, you mentioned, and all of  
16 these go to nonprofit organizations?

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: No. So there's  
18 about 400,000 contacts to NYC-WELL, about 16,000  
19 referrals to mobile crisis teams through NYC-WELL--

20 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: And those go to  
21 nonprofits?

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: They go to a  
23 variety of-- it includes nonprofits, as well as  
24 hospital based mobile crisis teams. So there's 24  
25 mobile crisis teams. Some of them are operated by

2 hospitals, including but not limited to Health and  
3 Hospitals. Some of them are operated by voluntary  
4 hospitals. And then some are operated by community-  
5 based organizations in contract with DOHMH.

6 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: And is NYPD ever involved  
7 in those?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So, no, the  
9 mobile crisis teams are staffed by clinicians and  
10 peers. If those-- the clinician on scene assesses  
11 the person to meet the criteria for hospital-- or  
12 potentially meet the criteria for hospitalization,  
13 they would attempt to get the person to the hospital  
14 voluntarily. If that's not an option, then they  
15 would engage the police and EMS to transport the  
16 person involuntarily.

17 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: I just have one more  
18 question. Is that okay.

19 I only ask because you have organizations, and  
20 we'll hear from them later today. But VNS was  
21 formerly visiting nurse, you know, they've been doing  
22 this for decades. And they really must be leveraged  
23 and fully funded if you rely on them for that many  
24 thousands of calls every single year. And that goes  
25 for our community based organizations that approaches

2 this work in a very, very culturally humble way. So  
3 I just want to put that on the record.

4 And my last question was, it was said that 2.5%  
5 of 911 calls are mental health related, with 1% of  
6 crisis calls resulting in arrests. And Chief Holmes,  
7 you mentioned that some of those arrests eventually  
8 are voided. Is that-- is that crossover in the same  
9 percentage?

10 And secondly, why again, is NYPD the best to  
11 handle these calls?

12 CHIEF HOLMES: So I'm not-- when I speak about  
13 some of them being voided, I'm speaking from personal  
14 experience, my tenure as a commanding officer. I  
15 don't know the stats now. I will look into it, now  
16 that it has come to my attention.

17 As far as police being the best to respond. No,  
18 I am not going to say I agree to that. What I'm  
19 going to say is: Is it necessary for our response  
20 sometime? Most of the time we're responding, it's  
21 either someone's flagging us down, or someone's  
22 calling 911, and it warrants a response based on the  
23 circumstances being given: They have a weapon,  
24 they're screaming, some sort of circumstances that  
25 leads communications to notify us, as well as our--

2 one of our primary agencies there, EMS to respond to  
3 that particular scene. And when we get there, that  
4 that deter-- that assessment is made. There's  
5 several times that EMS may get there before we get  
6 there. And they can give us you know, give further  
7 feedback.

8 But as far as us being the best to respond. If  
9 it's something emergency in nature, we took an oath  
10 to protect and serve, that's what we do. As far as  
11 the Mayor's directive, my interpretation of that is,  
12 we don't leave someone in the street. It's inhumane  
13 to leave someone in the street that requires some  
14 sort of assistance, whether it's reeking of urine and  
15 incoherent, or open wounds and not capable of self  
16 care. That's my interpretation. Those are some  
17 examples used in our training, something to that  
18 magnitude.

19 CHIEF TOBIN: I'd just like to piggyback on that  
20 and say that the NYPD's default with responding to  
21 mental health calls is always as an aided case, not  
22 as a criminal justice matter.

23 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Always as an aided case?

24 CHIEF TOBIN: Like it's someone that requires  
25 medical or behavioral health attention.

2 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Right. I just asked  
3 because the, you know, if there are resulting  
4 arrests, that's what's so concerning, I think, for  
5 this body, but I know we're trying to...

6 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: So I just want to point  
7 out, I think it was earlier, that there are  
8 situations where it's a must arrest. So if we go to  
9 a scene, and it's called in as a mental health call,  
10 and when we get there it's actually a domestic  
11 dispute, and the person has an order of protection,  
12 we have to arrest for criminal contempt.

13 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: All right, well I look  
14 forward to a breakdown of those arrests and related  
15 to the mental health crisis calls.

16 Thank you, Madam Chairs for the graciousness and  
17 the time.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And I will  
19 actually hand it off to our fellow Chair Camilla  
20 Hanks for just a couple more second-round questions  
21 really briefly. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Chair Lee. And I  
23 thank my colleagues. I mean, this has been very  
24 informative. The questions were leading, they were  
25 engaging, and I think we learned a lot here.

2 Second, I would like to thank everyone on this  
3 panel, because you know, your expertise, and it's not  
4 easy what we're discussing here. So I do want to  
5 thank all of you for coming here today and talking  
6 about that. To that end, we discussed, you know,  
7 training, we discussed that 1% that goes into police  
8 custody, that lead to arrest, they may be on Rikers,  
9 they are released. Councilmember Holden explained,  
10 you know, what is the pipeline to making sure that  
11 those individuals if they are rereleased? How do we  
12 interact with that?

13 So all of that is coming under the umbrella of  
14 training. And I appreciate, Chief Holmes, your  
15 candor is like, "No, this isn't the proper, this is  
16 what we have to do as law enforcement that when we're  
17 called we have to answer."

18 So I think I want to end this by saying to a  
19 person, regardless of funding, because everybody  
20 always wants more funding: What do you think we need  
21 to be doing or looking at to make this work better,  
22 in your, in your opinion, to a person?

23 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I think some of  
24 the ways that that we-- some of the things that we  
25 need to do to make this work better. We've-- we've

2 heard it today, some of the coordination. That's  
3 partially what this plan was meant to address is a  
4 coordination between agencies.

5 But you know, it is-- it's difficult when we have  
6 a bunch of we have we have a lot of agencies that are  
7 working with individuals and across individuals. So  
8 coordination is I think one of the things. I think  
9 staffing is another one. We do have that-- that  
10 nationwide staffing shortage and that citywide  
11 staffing shortage that affects really from-- from the  
12 top to the bottom, right? Every-- every part of this  
13 response does have a staffing component that does  
14 need to-- you know, does need more support. And a  
15 lot of a lot of that is outside of the control of the  
16 city sometimes, right?, just because of how staffing  
17 is done.

18 So interagency-- more interagency coordination.  
19 And I think it's a testament to our interagency  
20 coordination that we have, you know, health agencies  
21 up here along with our public safety agencies, really  
22 trying to do what we can for the support and care of  
23 New Yorkers. And staffing, I think across-- across  
24 services.

25 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Anyone else? Please?

2 CHIEF HOLMES: So I have to agree. First of all  
3 this is-- I think it's a collaborative effort. I  
4 know we have a call every Wednesday with the Deputy  
5 Mayor Isom Williams, who is very passionate about  
6 this subject as well, and the coordination that I see  
7 as far as tracking an individual from the beginning  
8 to the end, and what services they're receiving. I  
9 think it's phenomenal.

10 But we all know, this is a whole entire ecosystem  
11 that-- that requires some adjustment-- adjusting and  
12 staffing in order to make it work.

13 As far as a temporary, quick fix, for lack of a  
14 better term. I think that each agency here is  
15 focused on doing the best that they can with our  
16 client-customer, with that particular community in  
17 mind, and best interests in mind. The humanity in  
18 this, I think, is amazing. And that's just from the  
19 phone calls that I participate in as well as how you  
20 feel about this particular subject as well. I know  
21 Councilmember Brewer -- , I think she's gone already  
22 -- you know, when I think about Rikers, I just think  
23 about-- it's something I talk about. Maybe something  
24 like I say a Welcome Wagon at the foot of Rikers  
25 Island when you're being discharged, that's not

2 Rikers personnel, but have agencies, different  
3 agencies represented. Even something as simple as  
4 getting a CDL license? Do you have children? And if  
5 so, plugging them in to ACS. You'd be surprised. A  
6 lot of people don't even know ACS gives cribs and  
7 things of that nature.

8 People want to eat, you're going to have  
9 recidivism, right? Because they have no other  
10 option. So I think just trying to plug them into  
11 different things, you know, different services and  
12 educating about that. And, I think it'd be helpful.

13 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. Is that  
14 it? Does anybody else have a--

15 DR. FATTAL: Just very quick, just to-- I agree  
16 with Jason, and add that, you know, I've heard, "Is  
17 this the best approach? Or is this the best  
18 approach?" I think different people need different  
19 approaches. I think the key is coordination. Also,  
20 because we need all the different approaches. We need  
21 all these different agencies to work together,  
22 because not everyone is going to be the same. So--  
23 and every situation needs a different response.

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. And  
25 thanks for-- actually, I have one comment about the

2 mobile unit. I had a situation where there was a  
3 person, a good friend of mine, in a mental health  
4 crisis, and we called the mobile crisis unit, and  
5 they did not respond, and then NYPD had to come in.

6 And what the CBOs were able to do was highlight  
7 the history of this person, so they would not be  
8 attacked or treated with, you know, with their civil  
9 liberties intact.

10 So my last thing is, what do you need from CBOs?  
11 What kind of capacity building measures do you think  
12 you would like to propose to make sure our CBOs and  
13 folks are-- are supporting and making sure that maybe  
14 that coordination is happening, or there's training  
15 on a local level, so the civics the CBOs, are also--  
16 who are really on the ground, understanding who these  
17 folks are in individual communities can be helpful.  
18 Anything that you would want to...?

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah. I think we  
20 always want to hear from CBOs, and how-- how  
21 individual cases play out. So I think for-- in this  
22 case, Chair, where you didn't get the mobile crisis  
23 team, I think we would want to look into kind of  
24 where-- where that broke down, so that we can improve  
25 for the next time, or explain why it broke down,

2 right? And I think same with the CBOs. I think we  
3 would, we would want to hear from them on the ground  
4 about what they're seeing, so that we can develop, I  
5 think, the best process that that we can.

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. That's  
7 the end of my questioning. Thank you, Chair Lee.

8 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. I just wanted  
9 to continue with some of my commentary and follow up  
10 on some of the answers that were given earlier, in  
11 addition to some of the additional testimony that I  
12 have heard.

13 You know, I will say that, respectfully, I'm  
14 hearing that the-- the threshold for removal is the  
15 same in in the field as it is in the hospital. And  
16 there's been you've protected a lot of confidence  
17 about the approach that's being taken. But I do want  
18 to note that there are doctors across the city that  
19 are vehemently opposed to this plan. And I'm just  
20 just to name a few, for example, like CIR of the  
21 SEIU, doctors and residents-- the interns and  
22 residents union that say that this is not medical  
23 best practice, and think that it is very harmful and  
24 dangerous. And so I just want to point out that

2 there is a very differing opinion across the medical  
3 community on this response.

4 I did also hear about the point is not  
5 criminalization. Maybe somebody gets brought into  
6 the precinct, and then they're like go, I just want  
7 to accurately and clearly define what criminalization  
8 is. Criminalization is not the act of an arrest.  
9 Criminalization is responding to a social ill with  
10 policing, and that very interaction at every single  
11 point is a traumatic event, and most often, with  
12 somebody experiencing mental health struggles, it is  
13 one that escalates rather than de escalates. It is  
14 one that further-- furthers decompensate  
15 decompensation, rather than making a situation  
16 better.

17 I also want to talk about metrics. It was also  
18 mentioned earlier that the goal is to look at how  
19 often we are connecting people to care. And that is  
20 an important metric, but I think what we need to  
21 understand about that is that the infrastructure  
22 doesn't exist. That models in other cities, what  
23 they have that's different than us is more  
24 investment, so there's more places to take people.  
25 That the only two options are not a shelter, or a

2 hospital, or third, Rikers Island, and that actually  
3 a real measure of success would be to be responding  
4 less.

5 And so that idea about a Welcome Wagon coming off  
6 the island. We need welcome wagons in our  
7 neighborhoods, before people get onto Rikers Island.  
8 And so my question for you all is, do you agree that  
9 the DHS budget, the DOHMH budget, the B-HEARD budget,  
10 do you agree that those should not be cut, that they  
11 should not be subjected to PEG, and that those  
12 budgets should actually increase?

13 And then my-- my next and last question are, and  
14 then I have an additional comment, if you'll bear  
15 with me Chairs is-- you know, I have had the  
16 opportunity to talk with police chiefs and fire  
17 department chiefs in different cities, particularly  
18 the Portland Street Response Team, the Denver Stars  
19 team, and the things that they have told me  
20 unequivocally, is that their police department is not  
21 the right workforce to be doing this work, and there  
22 is no amount of additional training that can do that.  
23 We've heard a lot about additional training.

24 So my question for-- for the NYPD representative  
25 is: Do you agree with that, that the NYPD cannot and

2 will never be fully equipped to address this crisis,  
3 and that what is really needed is an alternative-- a  
4 deeper investment and an alternative models so that  
5 we have more capacity to respond to more than 2% of  
6 eligible calls, for example. Because I believe,  
7 based on the last B-HEARD data in that catchment area  
8 of all the calls coming in that are eligible, there's  
9 only capacity to respond with that team to 2% to 3%  
10 of those.

11 And the last thing, I will add, I promise, thank  
12 you, is that, you know, this question about when a  
13 mobile crisis team is sent or an alternative is sent.  
14 This is not a unique issue and problem. Like yes,  
15 the biggest issue has a lot to do with whether  
16 there's personnel to get that done. But it's also in  
17 dispatch.

18 I've had the opportunity to stand in the middle  
19 of 911 Dispatch, and hear how these calls are, are  
20 coming in how they're routed and what gets done. And  
21 a big part of the problem that they are experiencing  
22 is-- it's not so much as the dispatchers inaccurately  
23 coding or putting a call in. They have to by law,  
24 they have to rely on the information given to them.  
25 And so it really relies on how an officer or how a

2 community member is describing the person. And if  
3 they use certain buzzwords than they are handcuffed.  
4 They can't send an alternative team when they want  
5 to.

6 And so is there a plan to make, for example,  
7 everyday community members better reporters, so they  
8 aren't using stigmatizing language, so that they  
9 aren't categorizing behavior that maybe-- might seem  
10 like they are dangerous, but mental health  
11 clinicians, for example, know that it is not, and  
12 that they would be more than happy and more than  
13 comfortable to be the people who respond.

14 So the three questions were: Do you agree that  
15 instead of cuts in PEGs, those different social  
16 services should be getting more funding in the  
17 preliminary budget? Does the NYPD agree that they  
18 are not the agency that should be doing a lot of this  
19 work, and that somebody else should be doing it, and  
20 that we need to invest in that? And third, are there  
21 any plans or thoughts around that dispatch problem,  
22 which really, really necessitates, I believe, a  
23 education for community members who are looking to  
24 help their neighbors?

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'm going to touch on--  
3 on all three questions, and then I'll hand it to PD  
4 to talk about the second one.

5 I'll say that, you know, I don't have enough  
6 information at my fingertips right now to make a  
7 determination about whether-- like what the budget  
8 should look like. What I will say is we-- we are in  
9 from what I understand a budget crisis, and there--  
10 there are going to be adjustments.

11 And I will note around B-HEARD specifically,  
12 because I can talk about the B-HEARD budget, which is  
13 one of the budgets that was-- that was cut, and the  
14 B-HEARD budget was readjusted based on our expansion,  
15 right? So it wasn't-- it was numerically cut in the  
16 budget, but it was based on--

17 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: My understanding is that  
18 there were like 50 positions that weren't filled.  
19 And so that is being touted as a basis for reducing  
20 that budget when, again, my argument is that actually  
21 we need to be expanding an alternative workforce.

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, and we need to we  
23 need to fill these lines, and we will fill these  
24 lines as we expand to additional areas. So we'll be-

2 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: But we can't tell them  
3 because of the PEGs.

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: We still have-- there  
5 is still money in the B-HEARD budget to continue to  
6 hire, again, both at H&H and at EMS--

7 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: But it's \$13 million less  
8 than it was last year.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Correct. And it's  
10 based on the rate of expansion that we see as  
11 reasonable and feasible within this fiscal year. So  
12 we are going to be expanding into parts of Queens by  
13 the end of this fiscal year, and the budget is  
14 reflective of that expansion.

15 So that's what I-- that's what I'll say about the  
16 budget. I will also say around-- around B-HEARD,  
17 right? B-HEARD is meant to be this alternative  
18 response where it is located now. So in Northern  
19 Manhattan, South Bronx and parts of Brooklyn, and we  
20 are responding to upwards of 20% of the calls-- of  
21 the Mental Health calls within our pilot areas within  
22 the operational hours, which is higher than many of  
23 the other municipalities that are really handling  
24 about single digit numbers of their mental health

2 calls, to include Denver, to include CAHOOTS out in  
3 Eugene, Oregon.

4 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Can I ask a question? You  
5 know, when those-- when those cities put out their  
6 their evaluation reports every six months or so, and  
7 I've read them, they're about 40-45 pages long, I had  
8 the opportunity to take a look at B-HEARD's, and it  
9 was seven, eight pages long. And so I think there's  
10 like a lack of information for us to be able to  
11 really, like, reflect on and think about, you know,  
12 where are the pain points? What is working, what is  
13 not? Where we're getting more input, and can be  
14 better partners in the work and strengthening the  
15 program. We know we need peers, we know we need-- we  
16 know that there are other pain points that aren't  
17 being talked about.

18 And so like, again, I think that there's--  
19 there's so much promise, and I am a big champion of  
20 this. But there's a lot of work that could and needs  
21 to be done. And it continues to feel like the  
22 prioritization is giving the police more and more and  
23 more training to respond to a thing, instead of  
24 really looking at these-- these other health-first  
25 directives.

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Understood, and I'll  
3 pass it to NYPD on the dispatch and the NYPD  
4 question.

5 CHIEF HOLMES: The dispatch, as far as the  
6 community, that's a-- so currently right now, and I  
7 am working with Communications-- Chief of  
8 communications, where we're going to be doing a group  
9 training, kind of overhauled communications.

10 What that plays on the community is completely  
11 different. It can address the community with the  
12 questions that the 911 operators are trained to ask  
13 or inquire of, when someone is placing a call for  
14 service.

15 But with that being said, I think you mentioned  
16 about the NYPD responding to these-- look, as a-- as  
17 a responsibility, as taking an oath to protect and  
18 serve, we respond to incidents where I said, where  
19 we're responding because there's a weapon mentioned,  
20 or there's some sort of danger associated with it,  
21 someone hears someone screaming, things of that  
22 nature.

23 Do I think arbitrarily that's our that's our  
24 assignment, and we should be responding? Only if the  
25 circumstances present itself where there may be life-

2 threatening circumstances. Then we have to respond  
3 to rule that out. It's what we do as a-- as a police  
4 department.

5 CHIEF TOBIN: And to answer that, I want to say  
6 that the NYPD supports alternative responses to  
7 people in mental health crisis, to go-- to be handled  
8 by the appropriate agency.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, thank you.

10 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: And I mean, does that  
11 support extend to being an advocate to say that we  
12 shouldn't be doing this and other people should get  
13 more resources to do it, and, you know, and I--  
14 again, to give an example of like, what you answer  
15 to: Some things are seen as a dangerous situation by  
16 others or by police officers that are not by mental  
17 health clinicians. And it could be-- it could be--  
18 you might say, it's a weapon.

19 To give an example, I spoke to somebody who  
20 responded to a call, where the person was  
21 experiencing a mental health episode, and they had a  
22 bunch of rocks in their pocket. And that might seem  
23 like that's dangerous that you can't send somebody  
24 in. The mental health responder said, "No, we want  
25 to go in first. We're going to convince them to take

2 all the rocks and drop the rocks out of their  
3 pockets. It's what we know how to do. We know how  
4 to we know how to approach folks. We're going to sit  
5 with them. We're going to do these things." It's a  
6 much different approach than a police officer would  
7 take, because of the way that you all are-- are  
8 trained, right?

9 Like you are preparing for a different kind of  
10 situation. You're preparing for the worst. Whereas  
11 these folks are saying, "No, we recognize these  
12 behaviors. We're not threatened by them. We're not  
13 scared by them. We're the best people to de-escalate  
14 here."

15 CHIEF HOLMES: I would say that was the case  
16 years ago. We are trained for pretty much--  
17 hopefully for any situation. De-escalation is a key,  
18 key component to our training, where we go and we  
19 don't over respond, right? Take time. Necessary  
20 time, active listening, take a step back and see  
21 what's going on and assess the situation.

22 We've been trained that since the Academy this  
23 didn't this training didn't begin just with this  
24 directive. From day one and police academy you have  
25 over 40 hours of training throughout every

2 curriculum, scenario-based training, preparing you  
3 hopefully for the best-case scenario or outcome to  
4 the worst case scenario. But it's not where we're  
5 just trained in one particular way.

6 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: I'm going to pass it over  
7 to the Chair, but I will finish by saying, with all  
8 due respect with all of the training, this has been  
9 the deadliest year for people experiencing mental  
10 health issues who have died at the hands of police,  
11 and so that is why-- I mean like this is-- that is  
12 why I-- I keep going so hard on this because the  
13 training is not showing in the results.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Councilmember.

15 And I know Councilmember Holden, you also had  
16 another question you want to ask?

17 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, just one question.  
18 You know, this is for the doctor, possibly. But  
19 upon-- when a patient is discharged, whether they  
20 were involved in, you know, criminal justice arrest  
21 or, but they were brought to the hospital for  
22 treatment, is there a report that's required by the  
23 state or the city to be generated by a physician or  
24 the hospital?

2 And it's called the-- it was called-- I remember  
3 talking to somebody, there's a, there's a report that  
4 has to be generated. So these, so individuals don't  
5 get, you know, like, kind of just put aside, that we  
6 are following up.

7 DR. FATTAL: The only two reports I'm aware of  
8 the NICS database and the safety. So the NICS  
9 database that we have to-- if someone is admitted  
10 involuntarily, we have to submit that data to the  
11 state, and the other one that's related to the weapon  
12 registry that we have to check. But other than that,  
13 I'm not aware of one.

14 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Well, I understand that by  
15 law -- this is what I was told -- that hospitals have  
16 to generate a report that has to be filed. And H&H  
17 is doing it. It's required. It's required from all  
18 the hospitals, but that the private hospitals aren't  
19 doing it, and that's why people are falling through  
20 the cracks in the system. So if we could -- and  
21 again, it's really, it's a state-- I was told that  
22 it's a state law, that they have to generate a  
23 report.

2 DR. FATTAL: I can't answer for other providers  
3 outside of H&H. But, I can look more into this and  
4 then get back to you.

5 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, if you can get back  
6 to me, because that's important aspect. Because we  
7 were told that that's-- you know, that's the problem.  
8 That's why a lot of people are under the radar who  
9 should be actually treated further in the mental  
10 health area. Again, they're not-- there's no report.  
11 Thank you. Thank you, Chair. I'm sorry.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And then I just had  
13 one-- Oh, we've been joined also by Councilmember  
14 Gennaro, so I just wanted to recognize him.

15 And then just one last question for myself also,  
16 as well as a comment is: If you could clarify what--  
17 what are the police officers and NYPD being-- NYPD  
18 being trained to look for under "cannot meet basic  
19 living needs?"

20 Because I just wanted to be clear, my  
21 understanding was that the "cannot meet basic needs"  
22 standard is not in the state law. It comes from the  
23 state administration's interpretation of case law.  
24 So if you could just clarify that, that'd be great.  
25 And like, is it-- is it that they're barefoot? Is it

2 that they're-- you know, what are the what are the  
3 more specific details, if you could go into that a  
4 little bit?

5 CHIEF HOLMES: So it's something extreme, right?  
6 Someone has open wounds and-- and obviously not  
7 capable of seeking medical treatment, based on their  
8 behavior, their thoughts, or their speech utterance,  
9 ideation.

10 Or it's 10, below zero, and you have a T shirt on  
11 and you're under cardboard box, and you're uttering  
12 to yourself. And upon questioning, you're exhibiting  
13 some sort of mental health crisis, compounded with  
14 the fact that it's 10 below zero outside. Extreme  
15 conditions is usually what they're trained for.

16 I mentioned earlier reeking of urine, that  
17 ammonia smell, your clothes and your skin's not-- not  
18 clean or rotting flesh, something extreme is what  
19 they are-- those examples that they're trained to.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Councilmember  
21 Gennaro, did you have any questions? No? Okay.

22 Thank you. And I just wanted to thank you for  
23 being here and for taking the time to answer our  
24 questions. I mean, clearly, this is an issue that  
25 many, many of us care about. And on a personal

2 level, myself as well, I have very close family and  
3 friends that suffer from severe mental illness, which  
4 is why I got into nonprofit and social work to begin  
5 with. And, you know, we know that the system is  
6 broken, and it goes beyond just the agency sitting  
7 here. There's a lot of advocacy we need to do at the  
8 state level, insurance coverage of services, which is  
9 very key to make sure that our nonprofits are staying  
10 afloat is essential as well.

11 But the silo issue, I think, is something that  
12 you've heard over and over again. And if you could  
13 just, you know, something I want to make sure that we  
14 do is to follow up. Because I do think that there is  
15 a lot more data that we need. And this is sort of  
16 just an initial hearing where we want to hopefully  
17 start ongoing dialogue, conversation, because we need  
18 to make sure that the data is being disseminated to  
19 the public and that we have information and access to  
20 information.

21 So thank you so much for being here today. And  
22 with that, we're going to move on to our public  
23 testimony.

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Thanks so much.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: So I think we're going to just  
3 take a quick few-minute break. And in the meantime,  
4 if we could get the first panel ready to go. If you  
5 want head-- So we're going to call up the first  
6 panel. If you guys could get ready first.

7 I also strongly urge members of the  
8 administration to remain for public testimony. I  
9 feel like it would be extremely beneficial to hear  
10 from the public.

11 COUNSEL SUCHER: While we're taking the break, I  
12 will call up the first panel. It'll be Eric Vassal,  
13 Ellen Trawick, Christine Henson, Karim Walker, and  
14 Evelyn Graham Nyaasi. This will be a mixed panel so  
15 we'll have in-person as well as Zoom.

16 All right, we will, we will begin. We're now  
17 moving to public testimony.

18 I like to remind everyone that I will call up  
19 individuals and panels and all testimony will be  
20 limited to three minutes. Due to the large number of  
21 people registered to testify, we will be strictly  
22 enforcing the three-minute limit. And as a reminder,  
23 written testimony may be submitted to the record up  
24 to 72 hours after the close of this hearing by  
25 emailing it to [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). The first

2 three panels will be mixed, meaning they will have  
3 in-person as well as Zoom participants.

4 For our first panel, just to reiterate, we have  
5 Karim Walker, Evelyn Graham Nyaasi in person, Eric  
6 Vassell on Zoom, Ellen Trawick, on Zoom and Christine  
7 Henson on Zoom.

8 Kareem Walker, you may begin one when ready.

9 MR. WALKER: Good afternoon, ladies and  
10 gentlemen, the council My name is Karim Walker and  
11 I'm an Outreach and an Organizing Specialist with the  
12 Safety Net Project at the Urban Justice Center.

13 I want to talk about compassion and dignity.  
14 Because these are central to why we are here today.  
15 City Hall's call to hospitalize homeless people in  
16 voluntarily and allow police officers to use their  
17 discretion should give this body and the city writ  
18 large pause in how we treat the most vulnerable and  
19 dispossessed in our city in our city today. While  
20 Mayor Adams has built this as a mental health  
21 directive, we all know who the intended targets are:  
22 the city's homeless. Over the past year the Mayor  
23 has shown a willingness to use as aggressive as a  
24 tactic as he possibly can to criminalize homelessness  
25 in New York City. And he's shown a willingness to be

2 a bully when it comes to homeless people, as the  
3 street sweeps have indicated, as evidenced with last  
4 week's sweep of the Washington Hotel.

5 These forced hospitalizations would be no  
6 different from the streets, and another part of his  
7 plan is to police our homeless neighbors, out of  
8 sight without properly addressing their material  
9 needs.

10 My city has worked with homeless individuals who  
11 have been threatened with hospitalizations such as a  
12 military veteran, sleeping in Washington Square Park,  
13 who was forcibly removed and hospitalized by  
14 outreach, who refuse to believe that he was an  
15 accomplished musician and only-- only after they  
16 Googled his name did they realize who he was--  
17 recognize who he was. We work with many in Manhattan  
18 and Brooklyn who have been threatened with  
19 hospitalizations during-- during sweeps as a-- as a  
20 means of harassment, and the forced hospitalization  
21 of homeless people who may not necessarily have a  
22 mental illness, and by police officers who do not  
23 have the medical or psychiatric training to handle  
24 these, to recognize a messy healthy person from  
25 someone who is that could have disastrous

2 consequences for the city and the individuals in  
3 question. We have misgivings regarding the  
4 demographics of those who this directive will impact  
5 the most. As we know black and Latino New Yorkers  
6 make up the overwhelming majority of homeless New  
7 Yorkers. And the two groups that throughout this  
8 city's history make up the disproportionate majority  
9 of interactions with the police, interactions that  
10 repeatedly have ended in violence or worse.

11 This measure fails to guarantee that the homeless  
12 will have the dignity and the respect that they  
13 deserve and the encounters with the police will be  
14 safe and uneventful.

15 This directive is also a costly direct assault on  
16 the New York City Human Rights Law among other  
17 statutes, such as the 4th and 14th amendments of the  
18 US Constitution, and possibly the Americans with  
19 Disabilities Act, as had been argued in ongoing  
20 litigation. Our municipal budget is a moral document  
21 reflecting what we-- what we prioritize as a city.  
22 And by increasing the budget of the NYPD while  
23 simultaneously slashing funding to support public and  
24 social services, Mayor Adams has shown his cards and  
25 where his loyalties lie.

2 There is no dignity in a man's plan, nor is there  
3 a modicum of compassion. The only way a homeless  
4 person can get can get those is through stable  
5 housing.

6 Thank you for your time and I'll gladly answer  
7 any questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much for your  
9 testimony. And I love those words, compassion and  
10 dignity, so I second that. Thank you.

11 MS. GRAHAM NYASSI: Thank you Chairperson Lee,  
12 Hanks, Narcisse, and Brewer, and New York City  
13 Councilmembers for allowing me to speak at this  
14 hearing. My name is Evelyn Graham Nyaasi. I am an  
15 Advocacy Specialist at Community Access, a Howard and  
16 Harvard graduate with peer specialist training, and a  
17 Steering Committee Member of Correct Crisis,  
18 Intervention Today NYC.

19 I'm here because I would like you to reject Mayor  
20 Adams's directives to expand the use of involuntary  
21 hospitalization. I know firsthand what it is like.  
22 One time I had eight to nine police officers come to  
23 my home because someone said I had a knife. I didn't  
24 have a knife, and I didn't argue a fight with them  
25

2 because I didn't want to be harmed or killed. So I  
3 followed their instructions.

4 As a result, I ended up involuntarily  
5 hospitalized at Bellevue, I was placed in a room that  
6 had people screaming and yelling, and we were locked  
7 up like animals. It was traumatizing, and it still  
8 affects me today.

9 Because I didn't know my rights, I wasn't  
10 released until two weeks later. It is because of my  
11 personal story that I have learned that power of  
12 peers, and I firmly believe that all Mental Health  
13 Crisis Response Teams must be led by peers. Peers  
14 can make an individual feel safe, because they  
15 understand what they're going through, and  
16 furthermore, the police presence can be traumatizing.  
17 Even uniforms can be traumatizing. Police do not  
18 know how to de escalate the situation. And only  
19 about 36% of all new police officers have CIT  
20 training, and four hours or four days is definitely  
21 not enough to change them.

22 Peers are being used to initiate conversation  
23 with individuals experiencing a mental health crisis  
24 all over the US. Trust must be developed, and that  
25 can only happen with peers who have lived experience.

2 I know this firsthand. Because this past fall, I  
3 went to Portland, Oregon, and visited the Portland  
4 Street Response Program, which is supposed to be like  
5 B-HEARD, but it incorporates peers.

6 I'm asking that you please reject the Mayor's  
7 proposal, and instead advocate for expansion of peer  
8 specialist. Peers are the best people equipped to  
9 support these crises, make them feel safe, and ask  
10 them if they'd like to go to the hospital, a crisis  
11 stabilization center, or crisis respite, which is a  
12 much less traumatizing experience than being forced  
13 to go to the hospital.

14 Thank you all for your time. And I'm available  
15 for questions.

16 Before I leave, I like to ask that you not allow  
17 Mayor Adams plan to be forcefully hospitalized people  
18 with mental challenges. Instead, New York City  
19 should use taxpayer dollars to provide more  
20 supportive housing and better health care for those  
21 who are unsafely housed. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And you had a  
23 question?

24 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Yes. Thank you for your  
25 testimony. And I just, I just want everybody here to

2 know who Evelyn is and what she does. She is an  
3 incredible peer advocate and a leader who is teaching  
4 all of us a lot. I had the privilege of also joining  
5 Evelyn in Portland on that field trip. I was there  
6 with a number of other Councilmembers from across the  
7 country who deeply care about mental health crises,  
8 were they are representing, and they brought  
9 different staff members.

10 And can I tell you that that those folks and  
11 myself learned just as much from the Portland Street  
12 Response Team as we did from Evelyn, because she's a  
13 directly impacted person who has been doing this work  
14 for a very long time. And so I would just urge the  
15 Administration, and other folks who have any ability  
16 to strengthen these programs, and change these  
17 responses, to talk to people like Evelyn, to talk to  
18 people and organizations like CCIT, who are experts  
19 in the space. So I want to thank you for the work  
20 that that you do. It is deeply, deeply appreciated.

21 MS. GRAHAM NYASSI: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Evelyn, for sharing  
23 your story and also the importance of showing us the  
24 importance of peer work, as well as lived experience  
25 in this work. So thank you.

2 And next week, we'll have Eric on Zoom.

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

4 MR. KIM: Hi, Mr. Eric Vassell had an emergency  
5 here to attend to. So my name is Danny Kim. I'm an  
6 organizer with the Justice Committee, which is a  
7 member organization of Communities United for Police  
8 Reforms, and Mr. Vassal asked me to read his  
9 testimony on his behalf.

10 "My name is Eric Vassell. I'm the father of  
11 Saheed Vassell who was killed by the NYPD on  
12 April 4 2018. I'm here to oppose Mayor Adams's  
13 directive to force hospitalization on people with  
14 mental illnesses. This is not a plan. It is  
15 giving the NYPD more power to sweep people off  
16 the street just because officers think they don't  
17 have a place to stay, or have a mental illness.

18 This is the opposite of what communities  
19 need. We need affordable housing and quality  
20 mental health care. I know this firsthand  
21 because I watched the city's health care system  
22 fail my son long before the NYPD killed him.

23 Saheed first started to struggle with mental  
24 illness after his close friend was killed by the  
25 police. We could not find programs in our

2 community that would help him and treat him like  
3 a human. Without anywhere else to turn we would  
4 call 911. The police and EMS would take him to  
5 the hospital but instead of helping, they just  
6 gave him a whole lot of pills and locked him  
7 down. For Saheed being in the hospital was like  
8 being in prison.

9 NYPD anti crime and SRT officers murdered my  
10 son without warning at a busy intersection in  
11 broad daylight. My son was unarmed and not a  
12 threat to anyone. None of the officers were ever  
13 disciplined.

14 My son's story is not unique. Muhammad Bah's  
15 mother was not able to find services for her son,  
16 so she called 911. The NYPD showed up and killed  
17 him. Kawaski Trawick, Deborah Danner, Imam  
18 Morales. There are too many names. Too many  
19 community members do not have homes. Too many  
20 struggle with mental illness. And with the  
21 pandemic it has only gotten worse.

22 Instead of making a plan to address this  
23 mayor Adams is cutting budgets for housing and  
24 healthcare and throwing more police at this  
25 problem. Police officers don't have the skills

2 to diagnose or care for people. They only have  
3 the skills to criminalize and arrest people.

4 I'm calling on the New York City Council to  
5 stop the Mayor's dangerous forced hospitalization  
6 directive, and to invest in housing, community  
7 based mental health care and other services for  
8 our communities. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. We'll now  
10 move to Ellen Trawick. After that we'll have  
11 Christine Hanson, and then Oren Barzilay.

12 Ellen, you may begin when ready.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 MS. TRAWICK: get to know my name is Ellen  
15 Trawick, and I am the mother of Kawaski Trawick who  
16 was killed by NYPD officer Brandon Thompson and  
17 Herbert Davis on April 14, 2019.

18 I was appalled to learn that Matt Adams has  
19 directed the NYPD to sweep people off the street and  
20 force them into hospitals just because officers  
21 decide that they were mentally ill or homeless.

22 Sending the NYPD to respond to people who are  
23 struggling with mental illness issues has already  
24 caused New Yorkers too many lives, including my son.

2 Mayor Adams directive will only lead to more  
3 brutality.

4 In 2016, Kawaski came to New York to follow his  
5 dream. In 2019, the NYPD destroyed those dreams and  
6 stole him away from me.

7 Kawaski lived in a supportive housing facility in  
8 the Bronx. He was living there to receive care for  
9 his health. Instead the facility called 911 on him.

10 Officer Brandon Thompson and Herbert Davis showed  
11 up, illegally entered his home, barking orders and  
12 refused to answer any questions.

13 Officer Thompson tased him and shot him within  
14 112 seconds. Neither Thompson nor Davis tried to  
15 administer any aid. They just closed the door and  
16 left him to die.

17 From Kawaski's story, it's clear New York City  
18 Health Care System and the NYPD does not see black  
19 people as humans. Both of the officers who killed  
20 Kowalski had-- had been to CIT training. One of them  
21 within three days of murdering my son.

22 That shows you police have no business being  
23 involved in mental health response. Yet Mayor Adam  
24 is giving them more power in this area.

2 I'm calling on the City Council to stand with me  
3 and my family and other family members who have lost  
4 their loved ones to the NYPD in opposing Mayor Adam's  
5 forced hospitalization. Instead, New York City must  
6 focus on making sure that people like my son get the  
7 care they need by investing in community-based  
8 service and treat them with dignity. I am also  
9 asking city councilors to call on Mayor Adams and  
10 Commissioner Sewell to ensure Officer Davis and  
11 Officer Thompson are fired, and to stand with me at  
12 the NYPD trial officer of Officer Davis and Officer  
13 Thompson, which will start on April the 24th. I'm  
14 sorry. I just want to say thank you you for having  
15 me here today. Thank you.

16 Thank you so much, Ellen, for sharing your story.

17 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to Christine  
18 Hanson. You may begin when you're ready.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 MS. HENSON: Hi. Hello. Thanks for having me,  
21 and allowing me this opportunity to speak. My name  
22 is Christine Henson and I'm the mother of Andrew  
23 Henson, who is affected by autism and limited speech  
24 abilities. When he was 16, he was assaulted by  
25 several police officers. Since then, I have been

2 afraid for Andrew's life. A lot of what I've heard  
3 today is making that feeling worse. I'm here to  
4 oppose the Mayor's involuntary hospitalization  
5 directive and Intro 273. The NYPD should be  
6 completely removed from responding to people with  
7 mental illness and people affected by autism. In  
8 2018, I had a meeting with the principal. I  
9 requested a speech evaluation at Bronx Care. She  
10 arranged for it to happen that day, and she had a  
11 staff member, the assistant principal corps for EMS  
12 to transport us to that location, Bronx Care. Over  
13 two and a half dozen officers from two different  
14 precincts were present.

15 When we got out of the ambulance, Andrew told me  
16 he wanted to get something to eat. So he took one  
17 step, as we had to go get food. Within seconds, the  
18 EMT worker put his hand on him and told him you're  
19 not going anywhere. And I said we're here  
20 voluntarily. And then police officers rushed over  
21 and they piled on top of my son. Five officers  
22 helped my son's arms behind his back while his neck  
23 was choked and twisted. And again my son is affected  
24 by limited speech abilities. I saw my son's body go  
25 limp while his hands were held behind his back. They

2 were twisting him as if he wasn't human. He was  
3 taken inside into the waiting area, where his face  
4 was placed down on a seat and his knees were pressed  
5 down on the ground. He was forced in a position. My  
6 voice was ignored when I say he has special needs.  
7 My son needed care, voluntary care. Instead, my son  
8 was forced and criminalized and mistreated and  
9 violated. When we should have received something to  
10 receive assistance for him, he was traumatized.

11 So he's re-traumatized now, because he's been  
12 recently affected by police officers again. Since  
13 2018, he regressed. I now have to buy my son  
14 diapers. That excessive force that he experienced  
15 has altered his life. I live my life moreso now than  
16 ever fearing for his safety, because he's a young  
17 male of color, and he's someone that was affected by  
18 a violent type of assault by police officers. He  
19 didn't deserve that.

20 There is no amount of training that will prepare  
21 NYPD officers to respond to people like my son with  
22 autism or people with other disabilities and mental  
23 illness. The purpose of NYPD is to arrest and  
24 criminalize people, not to care for them. Intro 273  
25 may be good intention, but it will only teach--

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time Expired.

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Oh. Go ahead and finish.

4 Sorry.

5 MS. HENSON: Please. If we keep sending armed  
6 officers to help people in distress or people with  
7 limited speech over disabilities, we will keep  
8 getting violence and deaths, and Intro 273 must be  
9 opposed. We need to completely remove NYPD from  
10 responding to those who are struggling with mental  
11 illness or disabilities. We need to keep them safe.  
12 We need to get police out of schools. We need to  
13 have them respected. They are human too. They just  
14 need a different type of love and care.

15 Please, I thank you for this opportunity. I just  
16 would like to see my son live a very long time  
17 without being mistreated ever again. He cries when  
18 he sees police officers, and he shakes. I've never  
19 seen that in anyone.

20 Please, I'm asking with respect to save his life  
21 and his safety. We shouldn't have to live in fear.  
22 Every day of his life, I live in fear. And he  
23 doesn't deserve that. He just deserves to live.  
24 Thank you so much. Thank you for this opportunity.  
25 Thank you so much. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Christine.

3 COUNCEL SUCHER: Next, we'll hear from Oren  
4 Barzilay. You may begin when ready.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 MR. BARZILAY: Good morning, Committee  
7 Chairperson and honorable Councilmembers. My name is  
8 Oren Barzilay. I'm a 25-year veteran of the FDNY  
9 EMS, and I'm president of Local 2507. I am here  
10 today to spotlight a very considerable issue for our  
11 city EMTs and paramedics, who despite their pivotal  
12 role in serving and protecting New Yorkers, fear  
13 Mayor Adams policy to forcibly take people believed  
14 to have mental illness to hospitals against their  
15 will has increased in already significant number of  
16 assaults on our members.

17 Over the past two years there have been over 200  
18 reported assaults on active EMS workers. From where  
19 I am, I can tell you that it is more than that. EMT  
20 assaults are at an all time high, doubling in the  
21 last year, and many hundreds of members are not even  
22 reporting them. Why bother due to the lack of any  
23 action at all by both the department and the City?

24 When we arrive at the scene of an emergency, we  
25 don't carry guns like NYPD has. We don't have access

2 like our counterparts, firefighters brethren. We  
3 roll up to the scene of an emergency with a doctor's  
4 back to provide medical care. The Mayor's policy  
5 doesn't change things. We need significantly more  
6 funding and getting trained people into the system.  
7 The policy does not consider the severe staffing  
8 shortages among our workforce and the lack of  
9 training handling these matters.

10 FDNY EMS call volume have doubled in recent years  
11 yet headcount has remained the same or dropped. It's  
12 placing an additional burden on the EMS system.

13 My members are unarmed and get routinely  
14 assaulted as it stands now. We know that forcing  
15 people with mental health issues to unwillingly  
16 comply with the policy can place EMTs in harm's way.  
17 My worry is that this policy is exacerbating the  
18 danger our members are faced with on a daily basis.  
19 The City is not doing much about the assaults on our  
20 members as is. If you're faced with such high chance  
21 of getting assaulted in your workplace, it's an  
22 employer's responsibility to keep the workforce safe.  
23 That protection of our members is absolutely not  
24 happening right now. EMS is being totally and  
25 completely starved of necessary resources to allow us

2 to work safe and protect the city's citizens at the  
3 same time. Where are we going to put all these  
4 patients that need mental health? The state closed  
5 down state psychiatric centers like Creekmore in  
6 Queens, which can has thousands. EMS is so beyond  
7 short staffed that you would think that our call  
8 volume reaching 5000 calls a day, that the department  
9 would take steps to increase resources.

10 Instead, we are tasked with more responsibility  
11 that only put EMTs in more dangerous.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. You're asking  
13 people who are making \$17 to \$18 an hour to put their  
14 life on the line. We must not forget the lives of  
15 EMTs and paramedics lost while on duty by the people  
16 we work to serve and assist. The policy may be well  
17 intentioned, but our city's leaders have to recognize  
18 that these new responsibilities add more strain on  
19 our severely understaffed, overworked, and underpaid  
20 workers.

21 The dedicated women and men of EMS and the  
22 citizens we are sworn to protect deserve better than  
23 we have been subjected to. Thank you all for your  
24 time and consideration.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. We'll move  
3 on to the next panel. And for those family members  
4 that are still on and listening, thank you so much  
5 for waiting, and for sharing stories of your family  
6 members. I know it must be painful, so I just wanted  
7 to say thank you.

8 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move on to our second  
9 panel which will also be mixed between in-person and  
10 Zoom. For in-person we'll have Beth Haroules from  
11 NYCLU, Elena Landriscina from Legal Aid Society, and  
12 Siya Hegde from Bronx Defenders. On Zoom, we'll have  
13 Selena Trowell from Communities For Police Reform,  
14 and then Anthony Feliciano. Selena, you will be the  
15 first to testify on this panel, so you may begin when  
16 ready.

17 MS. TROWELL: Good afternoon. My name is Selena  
18 Trowel, and I'm testifying on behalf of Vocal New  
19 York Homeless Union who was a member of Communities  
20 United For Police Reform. My role at Vocal New York  
21 is that of the Homelessness Union organizer, where I  
22 do street outreach and engage and build collective  
23 power among those who are actively and formerly  
24 homeless through membership. In addition to my role  
25 as an organizer, I'm also a licensed social worker

2 and a lifelong resident of District 41 Brownsville  
3 Brooklyn, where the rate of adult psychiatric  
4 hospitalization is nearly triple the citywide rate.

5 The Administration has yet to provide the public  
6 with a plan of transparency and accountability, and  
7 also provide proof that we are not wasting our time  
8 reinventing the broken wheel of the 80s. For decades  
9 to treatment-first approach has failed hundreds of  
10 New Yorkers, and today will continue to perpetuate  
11 the cycle of involuntary confinements, short-term  
12 treatments, and discarding of human beings right back  
13 to the streets because the city has refused to  
14 prioritize utilization of available housing stock as  
15 a public health approaches housing and mental health  
16 crisis. A study done in 2019 showed that housing,  
17 when connected with supportive services, specifically  
18 for those with severe mental health complexities was  
19 extremely cost effective.

20 Once you question if we have an administration  
21 that has identified 2000 empty supportive housing  
22 units with thousands of people on the streets, why  
23 did the city opt to only cherry pick at individuals  
24 for a copycat pilot program. In 2020, 26 studies in  
25 the United States and Canada compared treatment-first

2 versus housing-first models. It found that housing-  
3 first programs decreased homelessness by 88%, and  
4 improve housing stability by 41%. And for those who  
5 are immunocompromised health, it reduce homelessness  
6 by 37%, viral loads of 22%, depression of 13%,  
7 emergency department used by 41%, hospitalizations by  
8 36%, with the mortality rate by 37%.

9 Coercive mental health treatment is a form of  
10 carceral institutionalization that further  
11 exacerbates the health and trauma of those on the  
12 street. The answer, according to decades of research  
13 has and will always be housing. Why do we continue  
14 to ignore decades of evidence-based empirical data  
15 that tells us housing is in fact mental, physical,  
16 and emotional health care? The Mayor's directive is  
17 antithetical to providing a solid infrastructure of  
18 trust, housing, services, and community support. New  
19 Yorkers need a public-health-based approach that is  
20 addressing mental health and homelessness that puts  
21 public health workers and peers at the forefront of  
22 engagement and expands voluntary mental health care  
23 services and supports.

24 The trauma of police guns, garbage trucks, and  
25 involuntary removals, are being toted under the

2 pretense of care and compassion and housing. It is  
3 deeply concerning to see police be used to fill the  
4 gaps in the public health sector where there while  
5 there are simultaneous cuts of expert critical  
6 infrastructure.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 MS. TROWELL: One more minute please, for the  
9 Department of Mental health and Hygiene, the  
10 Department of Social Services, the Department of DHS,  
11 and Department of Housing and Community Development.  
12 We are calling on the Mayor and this administration  
13 to end all considerations and implementation of this  
14 harmful and socially irresponsible directive, and to  
15 invest in housing and care that is decarcerated,  
16 trauma-informed, and evidence-based.

17 Also in acknowledging Black History Month, I am  
18 also testifying in honor of the life and legacy of  
19 Joyce Billie Boggs Brown, with a history of street  
20 homelessness, drug use, and mental health  
21 complexities, Ms. Brown, a black woman who in 1987,  
22 would single handedly seek out legal teams and  
23 successfully petition that then Mayor Ed Koch in the  
24 city for her release from a psychiatric facility  
25 after being swept off the street and involuntarily

2 admitted under the failed program of Project Health.

3 After becoming stable and housed, she would travel to  
4 the likes of Harvard and Yale University to lecture  
5 about how to fight for self agency and housing in New  
6 York City. Thank you for your time.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

8 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to our three in-  
9 person panelists, and then Anthony Feliciano, you  
10 will go after these three individuals testify. So  
11 first, we'll hear from Beth Haroules. You may begin  
12 when ready.

13 MS. HAROULES: Thank you for holding these  
14 oversight hearings. They are well delayed. This  
15 process has been rolled out in November, and we  
16 didn't hear anything today that provided us with any  
17 information about what exactly is going on, when  
18 Mayor Adams has directed the mental hygiene arrests  
19 of potentially hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers  
20 who are unhoused and dealing with mental health  
21 issues.

22 Our written comments address the variety of  
23 resources that are being diverted here into a failed  
24 strategy of involuntary psychiatric hospitalizations  
25 and forced treatment. We do an analysis of how this

2 policy in fact allows removals that are not justified  
3 under the state or federal constitution, or the rest  
4 of the complex web of laws and guidance that govern  
5 in this field. We just heard about Joyce Brown  
6 Billie Boggs. Miss Brown was a client of the New  
7 York Civil Liberties Union in connection with her  
8 struggle for self-determination. And today to see  
9 OMH and the city perverting that case law that looked  
10 to a very extreme set of circumstances that justified  
11 involuntary retention. She was never swept off the  
12 streets in the way that this policy contemplates.

13 Certainly the policy reflects and exacerbates  
14 bias. Everything that we have heard from the Mayor,  
15 the Administration, and from the partnership of the  
16 Governor perpetuates bias and stigma and draws a  
17 direct line between a person who is unhoused and  
18 suffering with suffering, experiencing mental health  
19 challenges and violence that is just about to be  
20 triggered against the public. People with mental  
21 illness, people who are unhoused, are more likely  
22 than anyone else to be themselves the subject of  
23 violence and trauma.

24 We didn't hear and we know the council is very  
25 interested in making sure there's appropriate

2 collection of data, transparency, and accountability.

3 Here our testimony provides you with a number of  
4 categories.

5 We did not hear an answer to the question of how  
6 many New Yorkers have in fact been brought in for  
7 evaluation under a mental hygiene arrest by law  
8 enforcement under this policy. We also didn't hear  
9 how many people who had been brought in on a mental  
10 hygiene arrest basis were in fact admitted. A person  
11 who was brought in for observation has no right to  
12 counsel, Mental Hygiene Legal Services does not  
13 represent those folks when they are in a psych  
14 setting until they have been admitted, until status  
15 has been conferred. There are no discharge planning  
16 provisions that will attach to a person who's brought  
17 in for observation and released in that 72-hour  
18 period. We didn't hear any of that today. We didn't  
19 hear any plans. We didn't hear any details. We  
20 heard absolutely nothing other than the information  
21 that has been released by press release and very  
22 selectively by discharge of particular information to  
23 the New York Post.

24 To hear that the telehealth backup support went  
25 live last week is just astonishing. We don't know

2 who, what clinical lines are staffing that supportive  
3 backup. What we heard today, though, is very  
4 concerning. It's NYPD all the time out on the street  
5 under failed crisis intervention training, and a  
6 video that they watched at the start of their shifts.

7 That is unacceptable. It is immoral. It is  
8 unconstitutional.

9 Thank you for having this hearing today. We look  
10 forward to working with the Council. We did submit  
11 comments on the two incidents before you. I share  
12 the concerns of the family member who testified with  
13 respect to attempting to train the NYPD to respond to  
14 people with autism. It leaves them completely  
15 unprotected. I'm Willowbrook class counsel at the  
16 NYCLU. There are numbers of people with  
17 developmental disabilities who are not protected by  
18 that particular end. And there are numbers of people  
19 with disabilities who are not protected by that and  
20 you can talk to your NYPD and mandate them to behave  
21 towards people with dignity and humanity. They  
22 should never be interacting with anyone's  
23 disabilities. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And we  
25 definitely have shared interest in receiving a lot of

2 that data and pressing them on that. So that's  
3 something that we're going to follow up with as well.  
4 So thank you.

5 Hello. The Bronx Defenders thanks the council's  
6 joint leadership for holding this very important  
7 oversight hearing.

8 My name is Siya Hegde, and while I testify today  
9 in my capacity as Housing Policy Counsel to the Bronx  
10 Defenders civil action practice, my testimony really  
11 does encompass a holistic defender perspective to  
12 highlight our collective concerns around this  
13 directive and its far-reaching consequences on the  
14 communities that we serve in the Bronx.

15 So as holistic defenders we are positioned to  
16 defend against structural systemic failures of  
17 directives like this that trigger our clients family  
18 separation, threats of eviction and displacement from  
19 homes, lack of access to essential support services,  
20 and violation of their civil liberties. Black and  
21 Latino identifying people of color in the Bronx have  
22 suffered decades of over-policing, surveillance, and  
23 other racially discriminatory violent practices by  
24 law enforcement agents that are completely  
25 inexcusable.

2 Rather than committing to addressing the unmet  
3 needs of New Yorkers who are unhoused or at risk of  
4 being unhoused. This directive sets a dangerous  
5 precedent for public safety, while reinforcing such  
6 historic discriminatory measures.

7 So since it took effect, there are two anecdotes,  
8 two stories that I'd like to uplift our client Mr. A,  
9 a queer identifying black man with serious mental  
10 health conditions was sent to a psychiatric emergency  
11 room against his will. This all took place during a  
12 verbal dispute with a family member who alleged that  
13 Mr. A was refusing his medications without any  
14 display of violent behavior exhibited on his part,  
15 and a licensed social worker from our office who  
16 advocated on his behalf to law enforcement agents and  
17 EMS staff. He was eventually deemed ineligible for  
18 admittance by hospital personnel, with the treating  
19 psychologist describing his situation as unjust.

20 As additional context here, Mr. A is fighting an  
21 eviction case And of grave concern the Mayor's  
22 directive, as we see, was abused as a means of  
23 circumventing court process to displace him from his  
24 home.

2 Similarly, another client Miss P, a black woman  
3 with underlying mental health conditions, who was a  
4 victim in an alleged domestic incident was forcibly  
5 grabbed and pinned to her bed by police officers who  
6 handcuffed her violently, and she was injected with  
7 what appeared to be a sedative by EMT personnel. As  
8 she allegedly resisted arrest and verbally expressed  
9 her desire for treatment and therapy, she eventually  
10 charged with assaulting an officer and an EMT  
11 personnel and taken against her will to a hospital.

12 Though she is no longer admitted to that hospital  
13 at present police intervention led to her criminal  
14 prosecution and her children being removed from her  
15 care and custody by ACS.

16 As these stories demonstrate the critical dangers  
17 of forced institutionalization do not make  
18 communities safer. Instead, as we've heard, they  
19 mimic the deleterious harms of carceral punishment  
20 when law enforcement agents are given untethered  
21 deference to make clinical diagnoses and presume an  
22 individual's threats to public safety in the absence  
23 of medical recommendations.

24 Therefore, the Bronx defenders urges the Council  
25 to rollback this initiative and instead invest in

2 community mental health services and housing  
3 investments that directly to the needs of this  
4 vulnerable group and offer voluntary support without  
5 entangling people in more harmful systems.

6 We expressly asked the council to permanently  
7 fund programs like the MOCJ emergency reentry hotels,  
8 emergency housing that provides barrier free holistic  
9 support and social services, including humane  
10 compassionate medical care, and offer residents  
11 access to vocational and educational opportunities  
12 and pathways to permanent housing.

13 Thank you so much again, for the opportunity to  
14 testify. We do intend to submit written comments and  
15 we very much appreciate your thoughts and  
16 considerations. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Siya.

18 MS. LANDRISCINA: Thank you. We applaud the  
19 Committees for their oversight over this important  
20 issue. Mayor Adams would have us believe that  
21 individual bad choices have caused people with mental  
22 illness to be unable to care for their basic needs.  
23 He has said for example, that people who urgently  
24 need treatment quote, "refuse it when offered." This  
25 type of rhetoric obscures how the government is

1 furthering discrimination and racial injustice. The  
2 city is responsible for providing a comprehensive  
3 system of community-based care for people with  
4 disabilities. Under federal disability rights law,  
5 the city is required to administer this system in a  
6 manner that enables people with disabilities to be  
7 accommodated in the most integrated setting  
8 appropriate to their needs. This law recognizes that  
9 unnecessary institutionalization is discrimination.  
10

11 Most people with mental illness can be served in  
12 the community. What that looks like is people living  
13 in safe integrated housing where they can be decision  
14 makers and maintain their relationships. It looks  
15 like people having individualized support to help  
16 them navigate systems and obtain care. In the words  
17 of a legal aid client, housing keeps the body and  
18 soul together. Our client lived in a shelter for 14  
19 months. He was also involuntarily committed for an  
20 entire summer which he described as traumatizing. By  
21 contrast, housing offers stability.

22 Our practices represent many people who are not  
23 in housing. The Mayor's Office estimates that  
24 approximately 40% of the shelter population has  
25 mental illness. The state estimates that 4000

2 individuals with mental illness live on the streets.  
3 The city is effectively doubling down on this crisis.  
4 Rather than provide services in integrated settings,  
5 the city's directive shunts people into hospitals.  
6 Our clients experienced the consequences of the  
7 city's failure to develop an effective system every  
8 day. They rotate through a revolving door of  
9 institutions, jails, shelters, hospitals, rarely  
10 receiving the treatment and services and housing that  
11 they need. The city lacks adequate outpatient  
12 services, residential treatment programs, housing and  
13 supportive services, and these deficiencies have a  
14 devastating impact. First, people with mental  
15 illness spend longer periods in jail, because DAs and  
16 judges refuse or reject proposed release plans until  
17 housing is secured. Our attorneys move mountains to  
18 find scarce housing to free our clients from abysmal  
19 jail conditions.

20 In other cases our clients are discharged to  
21 shelters that are unsafe, and there they languish as  
22 their applications for housing and services are  
23 slowly processed in an overly bureaucratic system.

24 The mayor's proposal to further cut social  
25 services will exacerbate these problems. The city

2 must ensure that voluntary services are available and  
3 accessible. It should maximize the state's proposed  
4 investments in mental health to provide adequate  
5 care. Without such efforts the city effectively  
6 condemns our clients to a vicious cycle of  
7 institutionalization and the involuntary removals  
8 policy does nothing to break the cycle. It keeps it  
9 spinning instead. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

11 COUNSEL We'll now turn to Anthony Feliciano on  
12 Zoom, you may begin when ready.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 MR. FELICIANO: Thank you for the opportunity to  
15 testify. My name is Anthony Feliciano. I am the  
16 Vice President for Community Mobilization at Housing  
17 Works. Housing Works urges the Council to exercise  
18 its oversight authority to reject the Mayor's Adams  
19 proposal to scale up involuntary law enforcement  
20 driven responses to New Yorkers with unmet mental  
21 health needs, who struggle to survive on our streets  
22 and subways.

23 This directive erodes the confidentiality of the  
24 medical information. While coercive mental health  
25 treatment has not proven to have better outcomes than

2 voluntary. It is disproportionately applied to  
3 black, Latinx, immigrants, LGBTQI people and other  
4 communities of color while often over-diagnosed and  
5 underserved. It skips over the issue that was  
6 seriously underfunded public health mental health  
7 system, an almost completely lack of safe and  
8 appropriate housing placements for people with  
9 Serious Mental Illness. The NYPD has a track record,  
10 as we all know, of being violent and deadly when  
11 responding to people experiencing, or perceiving to  
12 be experiencing a mental health crisis, and abusing  
13 New Yorkers experiencing homelessness. At Housing  
14 Works, we know from regular experience how difficult  
15 or impossible it is to access for Serious Mental  
16 Illness. We are unable to access desperately needed  
17 mental health even for residents of our supported  
18 housing programs. Indeed, a significant challenge  
19 facing Housing Works and other supporting housing  
20 providers are in the unmet needs of residents who  
21 experience significant mental health crisis, often  
22 combined with substance abuse disorder.

23 We offer 700 units of supportive housing for the  
24 most vulnerable New Yorkers, including many  
25 residents, people dealing with co-occurring mental

2 health and substance abuse issues. While the overall  
3 majority of residents manage these and other issues  
4 to behavioral health care provided by Housing Works  
5 and other community based providers, not infrequently  
6 will a resident experience a crisis that will  
7 necessitate transfer by an EMS to the hospital, and  
8 invariably these residents are released within a few  
9 hours with no outpatient treatment plan.

10 In one extreme case last week, Housing Works  
11 called emergency services four times over the course  
12 of three days up for a resident experiencing  
13 psychotic episodes. Each time he was released back  
14 to us without any intervention, to the frustration to  
15 all. Supportive housing is a compassionate and  
16 effective intervention, but while access to inpatient  
17 and outpatient mental health and substance abuse use  
18 disorder treatment, untreated residents pose great  
19 issues and concerns for all of us.

20 One of our asks here is the Mayor must make a  
21 major aim of transparency about how a voluntary  
22 removal directive be implemented, and the impact on  
23 communities and neighborhoods. The Mayor's office  
24 should make public the details of how many more New  
25 Yorkers are being involuntary detained, on what

2 grounds, how long they're being kept in the hospital,  
3 and what kind of care support they receive during and  
4 at discharge. We also call on the Council to demand  
5 decisive action to promote the housing and services  
6 required to meet the need of many shelter and  
7 unsheltered people.

8 COUNSEL SUCHER: Time has has expired.

9 MR. FELICIANO: And finally, I think we need a  
10 lot in terms of stabilization also. We heard about  
11 the MOCJs, but also want for us to understand the  
12 State and the City's connection here when they asked  
13 for more psychiatric beds.

14 We need to know where those beds are going. We  
15 need to have community input and community-driven  
16 initiatives that are around mental health. And right  
17 now, what this directive does is it again harms the  
18 most vulnerable communities in New York. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Anthony. Good to  
20 see you. And Councilmember Brewer had a couple  
21 questions, I think?

22 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Just for any  
23 of the panelists here, and thank you all for your  
24 service. The-- I mean, when I talk to the community  
25 mental health providers, they just don't have the

2 staff, they can't retain staff, et cetera. So I'm  
3 just wondering if that is what you are experiencing  
4 in terms of trying to find locations for endless  
5 support and ongoing support for your-- for the people  
6 you're representing.

7 MS. HAROULES: I mean, certainly, we are  
8 experiencing a massive staffing shortage. But staff  
9 who work in these particular community-based  
10 programs, including programs for people with limited  
11 English proficiency, are not recognized in terms of  
12 worth and value, which goes to why there is a  
13 workforce retention issue.

14 This is a very difficult job, for a person to  
15 provide hands on compassionate services to people  
16 with disabilities, and they're not recognized. And  
17 you know, we see you know, the funders, government  
18 sheltering behind the pandemic. This was an issue  
19 that existed before the pandemic. The pandemic  
20 obviously has made it worse. What we're seeing here  
21 is a diversion of resources into a policing model as  
22 opposed into service supports, including housing  
23 supports. We really urge the council during the  
24 budget hearings to focus on that. We do not need  
25 more policing resources.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I understand that. I'm--  
3 I'm very specific oriented after--

4 MS. HAROULES: Yeah. Workforce.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. Anything from the  
6 Bronx?

7 MS. HEGDE: I'll echo the sentiment that yes, we  
8 are in a severe staffing shortage. And I'm not  
9 saying that just from the angle of support services  
10 on the ground that are operating in connection to  
11 courts. But you know, in our office, we do have a  
12 fairly large staff, one of the largest one largest  
13 public defender offices in the country, really. And  
14 to think that our staffing operation of social  
15 workers who are so critical, so-- so-- I mean, the  
16 example that I gave. It's like if that social worker  
17 was not on the line with NYPD, even despite her  
18 incredible skill set and holistic assessment of what  
19 the situation was, you know, I really fear for what  
20 folks on the ground who are-- were the most  
21 vulnerable, have to risk here in terms of advocates  
22 who are looking out for them.

23 And I think that's something that we've seen from  
24 a funding angle from the angle of, you know, legal  
25 service, holistic providers and care, and to think

2 that there are ways that this directive could harm  
3 court process and you know, to use to circumvent  
4 court process that we see in housing eviction  
5 proceedings, where the numbers in the Bronx are  
6 absolutely so voluminous as is, is a real, real  
7 concern. So something that we need to keep mindful  
8 of with staffing.

9 MS. LANDRISCINA: And I'll just say I agree. I  
10 mean, we hear about staffing, and that really goes to  
11 how the entire system is not adequately funded, so  
12 that people in the workforce are being recognized and  
13 valued.

14 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And as  
16 someone who came from a language-culturally-specific  
17 nonprofit organization, I can tell you that it is  
18 extremely difficult to find social workers and  
19 workforce as is. But then especially on top of that,  
20 if you add the language component, it's even much  
21 more difficult. And it took-- and on the other side  
22 of the spectrum, you know, it took four years for me  
23 to start up our outpatient mental health clinic  
24 because it-- we saw so many rates of suicide going up  
25 in our community, which is why we felt the need to

2 create a clinic from the community itself that they  
3 trust and that they know, which I think is very  
4 important, but the licensing piece is extremely  
5 difficult. So that's a separate issue that we could  
6 spend a whole day on.

7 But I'm-- just to emphasize that I think that's  
8 something that we need to advocate for on this-- on  
9 the state level as well.

10 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you so much. This panel  
11 will now be moving to our next one, which will also  
12 be a mix of in person and Zoom. For in person,  
13 Joshua Stanton. And then on Zoom, please be prepared  
14 to testify following Mr. Stanton, it'll be Greg  
15 Hughes from Mobilization For Justice. Antonine  
16 Pierre from Brooklyn Movement Center, Toni Smith from  
17 Drug Policy Alliance, and Danielle Regis from  
18 Brooklyn Defender Services. Mr. Stanton, when you're  
19 ready, you may begin.

20 RABBI STANTON: Good afternoon and thank you so  
21 much to the Committee Chairs and Councilmembers. I'm  
22 Rabbi Joshua Stanton speaking on behalf of Tirdof:  
23 New York Jewish Clergy for Justice, which is a joint  
24 program of T'ruah: The Rabbinic Call for Human  
25 Rights, and Jews for Racial and Economic Justice, the

2 latter of which is a member of Communities United for  
3 Police Reform.

4 I'm testifying today to express my deep concern  
5 about Mayor Adams's involuntary removal directive.  
6 Throughout the centuries and indeed the millennia.  
7 Jewish tradition has both acknowledged mental health  
8 as a human need, and has urged us to assist those  
9 struggling to find treatment and solace not in  
10 isolation, but in a communal context.

11 Removing individuals in psychiatric distress, who  
12 are not a danger to themselves or others from their  
13 neighborhoods or public spaces further isolates and  
14 stigmatizes these New Yorkers, and denies them the  
15 community contact that they need in order to thrive.

16 Well, I agree with Mayor Adams that we must find  
17 solutions to the crisis facing unhoused New Yorkers  
18 suffering from mental illness, but instead of  
19 investing in genuine care and compassion, the Mayor's  
20 directive proposes additional police encounters,  
21 which hold the potential to become violent. Giving  
22 the NYPD significantly more scope and authority to  
23 detain people is playing fast and loose with the  
24 legal rights of New Yorkers, especially given the  
25 NYPD's troubling track record with individuals

2 experiencing or perceived to be experiencing a mental  
3 health crisis.

4 Just to give you a sense of how far back this  
5 goes, Jewish tradition urges us to care for our  
6 neighbors, especially when they are in trouble, and  
7 in fact, irrespective of cost for at least half a  
8 millennia. We learned from the 16th century text  
9 known as the Shahanarol[ph], that if you see your  
10 neighbor is in trouble, you are obligated to save  
11 them or hire others to save them. You are obligated  
12 to trouble yourself and to hire others to save them.  
13 You may not shirk of your duty because of this, and  
14 you must save them at your own expense, even if they  
15 are not able to pay. If you refuse to do so you're  
16 guilty of transgressing the negative command, "do not  
17 stand idly by while your neighbor's blood is shed."

18 I know the members of this committee-- these  
19 committees rather, and that the entire City Council  
20 does not want to be associated with those who stand  
21 idly by while-- while our neighbor's blood is shed,  
22 and indeed, while our neighbors are in deep distress.

23 So I urge the council to reject the Mayor's  
24 directive, and instead invest in genuine care and  
25 compassion, which means housing, mental health

2 services, and social supports. Unless the city of  
3 New York adequately invests in the long-term health  
4 and well being of New Yorkers and affordable housing,  
5 and mental health crisis will continue. May add a  
6 personal word in under 30 seconds? Thank you so  
7 much.

8 So as a matter of Jewish law and tradition, in  
9 fact, homelessness is against Jewish law, but not for  
10 the person who is facing homelessness. It's actually  
11 against the law for society. It is against the law  
12 for all of us. And it goes against all kinds of  
13 social mores In Jewish tradition that have been  
14 around for at least two millennia that we allow  
15 homelessness to exist, and the fact that we are  
16 further blaming people who perhaps as a result of  
17 homelessness, or perhaps not are facing mental  
18 illness, the fact that we are penalizing them, and  
19 might be putting them in dangerous situations is  
20 unconscionable. Thank you so much.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Rabbi.

22 COUNSEL SUCHER: Next, we'll go to Craig Hughes.  
23 After Craig will have Antonine Pierre, Tony Smith,  
24 and Danielle Regis. Craig, you may begin when ready.  
25 Time has begun.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

3 MR. HUGHES: Hi. Thank you Chairs for holding  
4 this hearing today. My name is Craig Hughes and I'm  
5 a Social Worker at the Bronx office of Mobilization  
6 For Justice. I've worked with homeless individuals  
7 with Serious Mental Illness in New York City for more  
8 than 15 years, and I can't urge the Council any more  
9 strongly to push back on the involuntary removal  
10 initiative.

11 We can't accept the Administration's framing  
12 here. It needs to be placed in context of more than  
13 a year's worth of efforts to remove homeless people  
14 from sight, often using absurd spins on words like  
15 dignity and compassion. To be clear, nothing about  
16 the Mayor's multiple sweep initiative is dignified or  
17 compassionate. Rather, they're being deployed to  
18 legitimize the broken windows policing approach of  
19 this administration, which guides the  
20 Administration's engagements with homeless people.

21 Homeless people have long been the target of  
22 broken-windows policies and practices, which take at  
23 their core the baseless argument that of homeless  
24 people were conceived, of as signs of disorder, a  
25 word which the Mayor often uses are removed from

2 site, somehow crime will magically disappear. What  
3 this has meant for decades is the criminalization of  
4 homelessness and poverty and the sustained harassment  
5 of homeless people, which has overwhelmingly harmed  
6 black and brown people in New York City. A basic  
7 timeline of those broken-windows efforts targeting  
8 homeless people under the Adams administration would  
9 include the January 6th announcement of an  
10 omnipresence of police in the subways, the January 24  
11 blueprints on gun violence that announced plans to  
12 lean heavily on coercive practices towards homeless  
13 people with mental illness, the February 28 subway  
14 safety plan which was a mass sweep initiative, the  
15 March 25th above ground encampments initiative, which  
16 was another mass sweep initiative, and the November  
17 29th announcement of involuntary removal.

18 For many individuals with Serious Mental Illness  
19 this has meant being pushed out of sight and being  
20 criminalized while cycling in and out of hospital and  
21 jails, often for quality of life crimes, rather than  
22 getting support that actually helps.

23 In our testimony would go into this in detail and  
24 give a series of recommendations. I'll highlight one  
25 major area that isn't being discussed much today,

2 though it was briefly discussed in the Committee's  
3 report for this hearing, which is that of supportive  
4 housing.

5 The supportive housing system is marketed as the  
6 panacea for unsheltered homelessness and housing for  
7 those with Serious Mental Illness. The reality is  
8 far different. As a result of organizing by SHOUT  
9 (Supportive Housing Organized United Tenants) in  
10 2021, the council passed what became Local Law 3 of  
11 2022, mandating a report on who does or doesn't get  
12 into supportive housing. The data show that  
13 supportive housing providers reject people from  
14 housing for any reason they want, and those reasons  
15 are facilitated by the Department of Social Services.  
16 Often the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene is  
17 also aware, as is the state OMH office.

18 This is called creaming, which is actually which  
19 is actually often what amounts to disability  
20 discrimination, and it makes it almost impossible for  
21 people on the street with Serious Mental Illness to  
22 exit homelessness and enter housing. In other words,  
23 those who will be targeted by the Mayor's involuntary  
24 removal initiative, also find themselves unable to  
25 access supportive housing.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

3 MR. HUGHES: If I can just take one more minute.

4 In other words, those who will be targeted by the  
5 Mayor's removal initiative also find themselves  
6 unable to access supportive housing. The main  
7 resource market is to support them.

8 Instead of reforming the front door of supportive  
9 housing, the Administration has opted to police  
10 homeless people out of sight. As of last fall, there  
11 were some 2600 empty supportive housing units. We  
12 strongly urge the City Council to press the  
13 Administration on this. For tenants in supportive  
14 housing, there is an eviction crisis. Sometimes this  
15 looks like an informal evictions. Often it looks  
16 like formal eviction evictions instead of providing  
17 the support to help people stay housed.

18 Of note neither the city nor the state track  
19 evictions from supportive housing. Officials do,  
20 however, often meet with industry lobbyists who have  
21 opposed reform efforts. Our other recommendations  
22 include pushing back at every turn on the broken-  
23 windows theory that added that Mayor Adams is pushing  
24 forward, ending sweeps, providing outreach teams and  
25 clinicians with actual support and resources.

2 And just one final note for the Committee. You  
3 know, there's been a pattern under this  
4 administration when asked for data that might be  
5 sensitive to come to the Council and say, well, we  
6 don't have a lot to get back to you. And it's a  
7 pattern across committees and across officials.

8 And I will say that there's a difference between  
9 not having something, and deliberately being  
10 unprepared with something. And the Administration  
11 has decided, as what appears as to be policy that  
12 they will try to avoid this with the Council, giving  
13 the Council data that the public desperately needs to  
14 know and is needed to hold them accountable. Just a  
15 reminder that the council does have subpoena power,  
16 and the council's can subpoena the Administration for  
17 the data they are being-- they're refusing to give  
18 that is desperately needed to inform the public's  
19 knowledge and assessment of policies like the violent  
20 involuntary removal policy that we need to be able to  
21 really comment on with the information that they as  
22 they said themselves they are tracking. So thank  
23 you. I apologize for going a little bit over.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Craig and  
25 for the work that you do. And next we will go to...?

2 COUNSEL SUCHER: Antonine Pierre, you may be you  
3 being begin when ready.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

5 Hi. Just thank you to the Chairs and thank you  
6 for your coordinated effort to hold this joint  
7 hearing on a really important topic.

8 MS. PIERRE: My name is Antonine Pierre and I  
9 work with the Brooklyn Movement Center, which is a  
10 black-led group that organizes in Bed-Stuy and Crown  
11 Heights. The BMC builds power so that black central  
12 Brooklynites are able to play an active role in  
13 shaping the decisions and institutions that impact  
14 our daily lives.

15 Nearly three years into a global pandemic, we  
16 have to face the truth of our city's mental health  
17 crisis, not punish people for not being able to meet  
18 their quote/unquote "basic living needs." We're all  
19 suffering from long-term untreated trauma, and  
20 managing conditions like anxiety, depression and PTSD  
21 on a daily basis. The changes that were made to all  
22 of our lives in lockdown, mass unemployment, and the  
23 harsh economic conditions black, indigenous and other  
24 people of color have experienced during the COVID-19  
25 crisis have harmed all of our mental health.

2 While the Mayor would like us to believe that the  
3 people being removed from the street are served by  
4 being ushered through the revolving door of the  
5 city's broken mental health system by NYPD officers,  
6 we should remember there are actual people with  
7 actual family members like us who care for them when  
8 they're not well.

9 If you've ever cared for family and friends with  
10 mental health conditions are in crisis, you know that  
11 a police officers presence can turn an already  
12 stressed out person into an agitated and panicked  
13 one. Responding to crisis often looks like pleading  
14 with someone to go back in the house, to please take  
15 their medication, or to go to sleep after days of  
16 being awake.

17 We are not going to train cops out of being cops.  
18 The tragic murder of Saheed Vassell in Crown Heights  
19 by the NYPD on April 4, 2018, tells a story of a  
20 broken system that is more likely to inflict harm  
21 than care for black, indigenous, and other people of  
22 color suffering from chronic mental health issues.  
23 While we support the development of Community Mental  
24 Health Guide and Portal, this community support is

2 undermined by retraining police officers who are just  
3 in the wrong agency to do this work.

4 This resource would be better allocated to more  
5 widespread community training that can help create a  
6 culture of care around mental health. This plan from  
7 the Mayor is an attack on black mental health at a  
8 time when we need to be rebuilding community health  
9 infrastructure. We deserve a new vision for  
10 supporting New Yorkers through crisis that honors our  
11 dignity and moves people in need from the streets  
12 into stability. Mayor Adams Giuliani-era policies  
13 will only give the same results we've already gotten:  
14 Long-term psychiatric incarceration with no pathway  
15 to wellness. A generation of black families in  
16 central Brooklyn has already been torn apart by the  
17 City's involuntary hospitalization policies in the  
18 80s and 90s that locked up our loved ones under the  
19 guise of quote/unquote "treatment". An appropriate  
20 mental health response should take into account more  
21 than the acute symptoms of the city's mental health  
22 crisis. It should help secure housing employment,  
23 use development program and comprehensive mental  
24 health care for New Yorkers.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

2 MS. PIERRE: Getting this right looks like safety  
3 and care, not thinly veiled incarceration and fear.  
4 Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

6 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to Toni Smith.  
7 And after Tony Smith will have Daniel Regis. Toni  
8 Smith, you may begin when ready.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

10 MS. SMITH: Thank you. Good afternoon. My name  
11 is Toni Smith. I'm the New York State Director for  
12 the Drug Policy Alliance, also a member of  
13 Communities United for Police Reform. Thank you to  
14 the joint committees of the Council for holding this  
15 very important hearing. The Drug Policy Alliance is  
16 the leading organization in the United States  
17 promoting alternatives to the war on drugs and we  
18 oppose the Mayor's directive. It will be harmful to  
19 people struggling with substance use who are likely  
20 to get swept up in the enforcement of this directive  
21 by continuing policies that punish people for  
22 substance use, perpetuate stigma, and ignore  
23 evidence-based care. This directive goes far beyond  
24 anything related to mental health, mobilizes the NYPD  
25 to sweep up essentially anyone who is experiencing

2 homelessness. As we know that NYPD has a terrible  
3 record of responding to people experiencing or  
4 perceived to be experiencing a mental health crisis,  
5 Routinely abuses homeless New Yorkers primarily  
6 inflicting harm on our black and brown New Yorkers  
7 our folks. The mayor's directive attempts to  
8 simplify the problem as people not being able to  
9 identify that they need support.

10 In fact, our voluntary care systems are  
11 significantly limited on the basis of cost, cultural  
12 competency, capacity, insurance, causing many people  
13 who are voluntarily seeking care to be shut out.  
14 This is particularly true for people with co-  
15 occurring health needs, including substance use  
16 disorder. We need more low barrier, person-centered,  
17 voluntary care options, and more supportive housing.  
18 Forced treatment is criminalization by another name,  
19 and like criminalization, it is not effective to  
20 address root causes of instability and unwellness.

21 Inadequate funding for education, housing, health  
22 and other social services create the conditions that  
23 destabilize people's lives and contribute to health  
24 issues, intensifying the services people then require  
25 to achieve health and stability.

2 For the many people who will be swept up through  
3 this directive who have a substance use disorder,  
4 being forcibly hospitalized can lead to painful and  
5 sometimes life-threatening withdrawal symptoms and  
6 place them at an increased risk of overdose death.

7 This directive tries to mask the function of  
8 police. Police are the frontline of criminalization,  
9 not public health, and the disruption and trauma  
10 people experience at the hands of the NYPD only  
11 creates more of the instability and health challenges  
12 that the Mayor claims to be addressing.

13 So thank you. We're calling on the City Council  
14 to prioritize funding for actual public health  
15 solutions and oppose this directive. And we'll  
16 provide more in our written comments.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Toni.

18 COUNSEL SUCHER: Daniel Regis, you may begin when  
19 ready.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

21 MS. REGISTRATION: Good afternoon. My name is  
22 Danielle Regis and I am a Supervising Attorney in the  
23 Mental Health Representation Team of the Criminal  
24 Defense Practice at Brooklyn Defender Services. I've  
25 represented people in the Brooklyn mental health

2 court for the past five years. Thank you for this  
3 opportunity to testify.

4 BDS is gravely concerned about the Mayor's plan  
5 to expand the use of forced hospitalizations of  
6 people who are experiencing housing instability and  
7 may be living with mental illness. The dragnet plan  
8 will most likely result in numerous unnecessary  
9 police encounters that have the potential to risk the  
10 safety of those individuals. Even for those who may  
11 need treatment, involuntary removals are inherently  
12 traumatic. People are torn from their homes,  
13 communities and support systems. For the people  
14 experiencing homelessness, their belongings are often  
15 thrown away. This forcible often violent removal  
16 creates a traumatic association with the hospital, a  
17 place that should be associated with access to  
18 treatment and care, not as a punishment. Instances  
19 of armed police instead of EMTs or Mental health  
20 professionals responding to someone experiencing a  
21 mental health crisis too often end in arrest, abuse,  
22 or even death. Often, people who we represent are  
23 charged with resisting arrest and assaulting a police  
24 officer when they decline transportation to a  
25 hospital. They are then arrested and charged with a

2 violent felony offense, a bail-eligible offense,  
3 often resulting in sending more people with mental  
4 illness to jails, where they have limited, if any,  
5 access to mental health treatment.

6       Instead of relying on failed practices that  
7 channel people in crisis into course of treatment or  
8 the criminal legal system, the city must invest in  
9 services and housing. New Yorkers with Serious  
10 Mental Illness are disproportionately homeless or  
11 housing insecure, which creates additional barriers  
12 to accessing treatment. The city shelter system is  
13 overcrowded and unsafe. I have clients sitting on  
14 Rikers Island right now decompensating in horrific  
15 conditions with inconsistent access to mental health  
16 support, because they are unhoused and the judge is  
17 unwilling to discharge them into the shelter system.  
18 I worry every single day that I will need to call the  
19 family of a person that I represent to inform them  
20 that Rikers Island has claimed their loved one's  
21 life.

22       The city must invest in housing that allows  
23 people to come home with dignity, both to decarcerate  
24 Rikers Island and to prevent more people from cycling  
25

2 into criminal legal systems simply for displaying  
3 symptoms of a mental illness in public.

4 This must include fully funding and maintaining  
5 the MOCJ reentry hotel program. This transitional  
6 housing model has been life changing for the people  
7 we serve.

8 The City also needs to invest in proven programs  
9 like supportive housing, scattered site housing, safe  
10 havens, and crisis respite centers.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

12 MS. REGISTRATION: As a public defender, I have  
13 seen how critical housing is for my clients. When  
14 they have a safe and stable home, they can engage in  
15 treatment more effectively. When their basic needs  
16 are met, they can choose to access medication, health  
17 care, counseling, and services. The city cannot  
18 arrest and involuntarily hospitalized its way to  
19 mental wellness and public safety. People  
20 experiencing mental illness deserve access to housing  
21 and treatment and in a non-coercive manner.  
22 involuntary commitment and expansion of Kendra's law  
23 are not the answer.

24 Thank you for your time and I welcome any  
25 questions.

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Danielle.

4 COUNSEL SUCHER: We will now move to our next  
5 panel which will also be mixed. We'll hear from  
6 three Zoom participants and then two in person. So  
7 while I call up the Zoom can actually-- no scratch  
8 that. Alright, so we'll hear from Dr. Samuel Jackson  
9 on zoom, Dr. Michael Zingman on Zoom, Dr. Ashley  
10 Brittain on Zoom, and then in person we'll hear from  
11 Luke Sikinyi, and then Dr. V from the Mental Health  
12 Project Urban Justice Center as well.

13 Dr. Samuel Jackson, you may begin when ready.

14 DR. JACKSON: Great, thank you. Good afternoon,  
15 everyone. My name is Dr. Jackson. I'm a  
16 psychiatrist at a large safety net hospital, a chief  
17 resident and provider of psychiatric services for  
18 people experiencing homelessness in transitional  
19 housing and in outreach. Today I've been a part of  
20 the hearing listening in, but going and seeing  
21 patients out on the streets, in the shelters, and in  
22 our CPEPs, the exact thing that we're talking about  
23 all day.

24 I'm also representing today an advocacy group  
25 called New York Doctors Coalition.

2 My uncle who has schizophrenia experienced  
3 homelessness for many years and was shot by police  
4 while experiencing a mental health crisis. So I know  
5 the pain, the family's fear, and that they feel when  
6 someone in behavioral health crisis interacts with  
7 police, and that at times it can be lethal and  
8 deadly. I talk to families weekly who are afraid to  
9 call the police in times of crisis knowing that this  
10 call for help can be deadly. We need to emphasize  
11 non-police response first, and that police only are  
12 involved if there's a crime or a weapon in play. I  
13 want to ask the group, rhetorically, a question.  
14 This directive is to bring those experiencing  
15 homelessness with mental illness to emergency  
16 departments. It's a public health intervention. Has  
17 there been a study done that shows if these this  
18 population this specific group who are homeless with  
19 Serious Mental Illness has gone to an ED or a  
20 psychiatric emergency room in the last year? As a  
21 provider of someone, of people who are have Serious  
22 Mental Illness, both who are housed and who are  
23 unhoused, I can tell you that they frequently go to  
24 emergency departments and inpatient units. So these  
25 people who we're proposing to help by bring them to

2 emergency rooms are already coming in. But they  
3 don't get the treatment that they need once they come  
4 in. Respectfully, Dr. Fattal outlined what the  
5 disposition planning would be for people who come in.  
6 It was very generic. And I would think, as a rule --  
7 but I'm curious to see data -- as a rule, all of  
8 these people who would get it have already had it  
9 done in the last year. They've had a psychiatric  
10 evaluation, they've had coordination of care, they've  
11 had an appointment with a PHP or a clubhouse or  
12 something that they didn't engage with.

13 If there are interventions being done that don't  
14 have housing linked to them, more harm can be done to  
15 the individuals and to the system. 25% of police-  
16 involved killings involve someone with a mental  
17 health crisis. Black Americans are two times more  
18 likely to be killed. Black Americans with mental  
19 illness are 10 times more likely to be killed.

20 I'm just going to add in the last 30 seconds that  
21 there are solutions in New York City that need to be  
22 scaled up. Rehabilitation centers out of Bellevue  
23 are cost effective and bring people to housing. But  
24 we're short so short staffed in our hospitals, we  
25 haven't been able to scale this up yet. We don't

2 transition people to safe havens, which are tailored  
3 transitional housing centers for people who are  
4 chronically homeless with Serious Mental Illness.  
5 The capacity of the system has to be brought up  
6 before people are brought to emergency rooms, because  
7 we're understaffed and stressed and already cannot  
8 provide these people, who are already coming to the  
9 emergency rooms the care that they deserve. Thank  
10 you very much.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Dr. Jackson.

12 COUNSEL SUCHER: Dr. Michael Zingman, you can  
13 begin when ready.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

15 DR. ZINGMAN: Hi, my name is Dr. Michael Zingman.  
16 I'm a resident physician in psychiatry at Bellevue  
17 Hospital, and Secretary Treasurer of my Union, the  
18 Committee of Interns and Residents, or CIR, which  
19 represents more than 6500 physicians in New York  
20 City.

21 When Mayor Adams first announced the mental  
22 health involuntary removals directive my fellow CIR  
23 members and I were outraged. We found it appalling  
24 that as patients face long wait times in our  
25 overcrowded hospitals, as people are evicted because

2 they can't make ever-increasing rent, as our  
3 neighbors face the constant threat of incarceration  
4 and deportation. Our mayor would focus his attention  
5 on increasing police power to further criminalize and  
6 involuntarily hospitalize houseless individuals.

7 We understand that this directive may result in  
8 critical danger for the people it impacts,  
9 particularly if they are people of color,  
10 undocumented, people with developmental disabilities  
11 or LGBTQ+ individuals. As a psychiatrist who took an  
12 oath to do no harm, I cannot stand by as houseless  
13 New Yorkers are further criminalized and endangered  
14 by police and then forced into hospital stays that by  
15 their very nature cannot address the needs of these  
16 individuals.

17 Let me be clear: When somebody is brought into  
18 the hospital by the police, no matter how hard we as  
19 staff work to provide quality care, we cannot change  
20 the violent way that the patient arrived, and we  
21 cannot provide true care. True care requires patient  
22 trust and safety which this directive casts aside  
23 with abandon. Rather, the Adams directive will make  
24 physicians and other health care workers an extension  
25 of the carceral system. It will force us to compound

2 the trauma of folks already experiencing the daily  
3 trauma of homelessness by keeping them in the  
4 hospital against their will. This will also erode  
5 patient's trust in their physicians and the  
6 healthcare system, which is key to providing quality  
7 care and improving mental health outcomes.

8 As so many great people have stated today there  
9 are real needs in our community that Mayor Adams and  
10 this Council must address. We need access to  
11 permanent and affordable housing, clean air, healthy  
12 food, jobs that pay fairly, and long-term community  
13 based mental health care.

14 These are the things that I know as a physician  
15 would most positively impact my patient's health.  
16 And that's the directive that I wish we were here to  
17 talk about today.

18 In my time left, I just would comment on a few  
19 things that were either discussed or not as potential  
20 solutions. You know, I think mobile crisis units  
21 like B-HEARD, where police are not the first  
22 responders, are really important. At Bellevue and  
23 soon at Kings County we will have an extended care  
24 unit, which is a longer-term inpatient psychiatric  
25

2 hospital unit in which we connect people to ongoing  
3 either respite or supportive housing.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

5 DR. ZINGMAN: Early interventions, also  
6 transitional housing units, and supportive permanent  
7 housing. Thanks.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Dr. Zingman.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: Dr. Ashley Brittain, you might  
10 begin when ready.

11 MS. BRITTAIN: Hi, thank you so much for allowing  
12 me this opportunity. My name is Ashley Brittain.  
13 I'm a resident physician in emergency medicine in the  
14 Bronx and also Regional Delegate for the Committee of  
15 Interns and Residents. I'm here on behalf of myself,  
16 and my union Express, as many others have done before  
17 me a deep opposition to this violent directive.

18 I'm also here to explain uniquely what happens on  
19 the other end of the process in the emergency  
20 department. I believe we've heard from psychiatric  
21 residents. But the emergency department is also  
22 involved in this as well. I have to warn you that  
23 what I'm about to share with you for those that have  
24 not been through it can be intense.

2 When someone is involuntarily brought into the  
3 hospital by the police, which is not something that  
4 is rare in our line of work, after suffering that  
5 immense trauma, they will be placed into a yellow  
6 gown to indicate that they are a elopement risk.  
7 This is for their safety, as well as the safety of  
8 others, and they're there because we're concerned  
9 that they're going to leave. And so the yellow gown  
10 marks them as that risk so that everyone involved in  
11 their care knows that that person does not have the  
12 civil liberties to leave on their own. They'll be  
13 told that we need their blood and their urine to test  
14 before they can then see the psychiatric team. And  
15 if they don't cooperate, they'll be restrained,  
16 either chemically, or in rare and more extreme  
17 occasions, physically. They may wait in a crowded  
18 emergency department for hours or days for a  
19 psychiatric bed to open up.

20 We've had some people anecdotally that have been  
21 in the emergency department for a week, two weeks  
22 while waiting for a psychiatric bed to open. I just  
23 want to give that a moment to sink in.

24 It is beyond evident that this is not the  
25 healthcare we have dedicated our lives as physicians

2 to provide. There is no other way to describe this  
3 process than as an extension of the carceral system,  
4 one that will contribute to this ongoing process and  
5 problem of patients cycling in and out of our  
6 hospitals without ever receiving proper long-term  
7 mental care in the community. I also believe that  
8 one of the most important responsibilities I have as  
9 a physician is to uplift and safeguard my patients  
10 autonomy. I'm very passionate about this.

11 Their ability to make decisions about their own  
12 life and their own rights is a human right. And this  
13 directive for Mayor Adams seems to operate under the  
14 principle that if someone is homeless, they forfeit  
15 that basic right. I refuse to accept this, and our  
16 City Council should refuse to accept it. Instead,  
17 our elected officials here today should join me in  
18 demanding may or revoke this directive immediately as  
19 an urgent matter of racial, economic, and disability  
20 justice and of public health. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

22 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to our in-person  
23 panelists, Dr. Victoria Phillips from the Mental  
24 Health Project at the Urban Justice Center as well as  
25 Luke Sukini from the New York Association of

2 Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services. Dr. V may begin  
3 when ready.

4 MR. SIKINYI: Hi, and thank you for having us  
5 today. My name is Luke Sikinyi, and I am the  
6 Director of Public Policy at the New York Association  
7 of Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services. More  
8 importantly, I'm someone who both uses services--  
9 mental health services in the city and state and also  
10 someone who has extensive experience providing those  
11 services to individuals directly.

12 So I have my written statements here. There's a  
13 lot of voluntary alternatives that we have put  
14 forward to you all for your reference, but I'm not  
15 going to belabor that right now. I think the  
16 important thing is to really look at this plan and  
17 look at what it truly means.

18 So the first thing to think about here is this  
19 mental health emergency is a public health crisis.  
20 And I really want to stress that because it doesn't  
21 make sense to me as a provider of services and  
22 someone who has used services, that we have a public  
23 health crisis. And we decide the first thing we  
24 throw at it is police officers.

2 There are no other public health emergencies  
3 where police officers are the first responders are  
4 the best people to respond. We know that many of you  
5 have worked in the services or hospitals, and we know  
6 that that is not the way to go.

7 Second, this expansion of "danger to self" to  
8 include things that are not of imminent danger,  
9 suggest that police are not the people to be here.  
10 This isn't a public safety issue if there is no  
11 imminent danger. So I'm not really sure once again,  
12 why we're using police officers.

13 Third, you heard it yourself. The police  
14 commissioner said they're not the best people to  
15 respond to these issues. And if they know that, and  
16 we know that, why are we continuing to send them?  
17 And more importantly, why do we continue to think  
18 that we're going to get a different outcome if we're  
19 not changing the process.

20 The directive is the expansion of an old practice  
21 which has not worked. Many of these people who have  
22 been scooped off the street go into hospitals, they  
23 come right back out, and they get sent right back in.  
24 And we start all over again. I've been there I've  
25 provided those services, and I've struggled to wonder

2 what we're doing wrong. And the truth is, we're not  
3 investing in our community-based services. We know a  
4 lot of services that do work that have been effective  
5 and getting people into the sort of help that they  
6 are asking for, and keeping them out of hospitals,  
7 keeping them out of the carceral system.

8 We can't keep putting people back into the system  
9 and expect a different outcome without intentionally  
10 providing improvements. This starts with discharge  
11 planning. But any good discharge plan falls apart if  
12 the services to continue that plan in the community  
13 are not there, if the workforce is not there to  
14 actually carry out those plans.

15 So I sit here to ask you all: One, reject these,  
16 the Mayor's plans because it is not a real solution.  
17 It's a quick fix, but, two, we need to invest in this  
18 workforce, because this is what-- these are the  
19 people who are actually carrying out this good work.  
20 These are the people who are creating those  
21 relationships with individuals that are providing  
22 compassionate care, because they know them, they take  
23 the time to do so. And it is difficult work, and we  
24 should be paying them accordingly, so that people

2 come into this field, stay in the field, and continue  
3 to help people recover. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

5 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Peace and blessings,  
6 everyone. Okay, I'm Chaplain Dr. Victoria Phillips.

7 Everyone calls me Dr. V. And today I'm here  
8 representing the Mental Health Project at the Urban  
9 Justice Center. You might know me for many other  
10 things. I also want to highlight that for the last  
11 six and a half years, I was part of the advisory  
12 board for the Department of Corrections, and  
13 currently, I'm the co Chair of to deal with these  
14 young adult Taskforce.

15 So let me just start off by saying, I'm a  
16 Brooklynite, and Shirley Chisolm once said you don't  
17 make progress by standing on the sidelines, you make  
18 progress by implementing ideas. And I'm here to tell  
19 you that Mayor Adams's idea is faulty and asinine.

20 I just want to start off by saying, I'm very  
21 disappointed in my own Councilmember, I won't say her  
22 name on a record right now, but she knows who she is,  
23 because earlier today when NYPD said they have not  
24 trained all their officers and CIT in the last eight  
25 years of having the training available, my

2 Councilmember responded with, "Okay, thank you." And  
3 I want you to understand, why not? You have an \$11  
4 billion budget, and for someone to sit up here in  
5 front of Council and say, "Well, we have 30 persons a  
6 class to make it more intimate." Again, you have an  
7 \$11 billion budget, get the training done.

8 Heartbeats mean something to me. As an Army brat on  
9 domestic soil with a mother buried in a military  
10 cemetery, every heartbeat on domestic soil means  
11 something to me.

12 I also want to say I have CPEP individuals from  
13 SROs over the last 20-plus years in my line of work,  
14 I've even been held hostage myself in a microshelter.  
15 And I say these things because I no time did I  
16 utilize any brutality, any weapons. I utilized my  
17 training my de-escalation and not once that I have to  
18 call NYPD. I also want to say B-HEARD needs to B-  
19 HEARD and step up. It needs to be a 24/7 access.  
20 Just like all ERs are, because mental health is a  
21 physical matter. It is something that occurs 24/7,  
22 and the city is not doing good enough. I also want  
23 to highlight that the NYPD said a video will go out  
24 to the officers. They did not discuss if the  
25 officers actually watched the video, if they're

2 quizzed on the video, if the video even documents if  
3 they stopped the video. And I want to know with an  
4 \$11 billion budget, what is going on with that?

5 And I would like the Council to actually flush  
6 out -- because the video does not flush out -- would  
7 be scenarios and anything like that. So again, \$11  
8 billion is falling short for the people of New York.

9 And I would like to address -- I usually try to  
10 keep petty stuff off the record, but I had to stop  
11 Councilmember Holden in the hallway. I usually do  
12 that with people who express white supremacy ways and  
13 bigotry in the council. So I stopped him in the  
14 hallway, and I'm bringing it up for a reason because  
15 I said, you know, "You said certain things that do  
16 not line up. We're having a hearing"-- Let me  
17 finish. Let me just finish. "We're having a hearing  
18 today on individuals who have not been charged with a  
19 crime, and you've said several times arrest records  
20 being mixed with medical records, and do you not  
21 understand HIPAA." And he said, "Well, why do they  
22 have to have HIPAA, if they're brought in by the  
23 police?" And I said, "Again, the hearing is on  
24 people who have not been charged with the crime.  
25 HIPAA is very real. And HIPAA is for you, and I,"

2 and he responded, talking to me with his hand like  
3 this. And I said, Please don't talk to me with your  
4 hand up. And he turned to walk away. And I want to  
5 highlight that on the record, because if I am a  
6 professional trying to talk to a lawmaker about a  
7 very real issue with their constituents, and that is  
8 his response, what is the response for the police?

9 And lastly, I will finish with this, and I want  
10 my Councilmember to pay attention. Two Sundays ago,  
11 I was called to the First Baptist Greater Church on  
12 Eastern Parkway to give-- to give a teaching on  
13 policing and mental health in the community and how  
14 the community should respond, and I'm very nervous to  
15 have NYPD interact with my community for many more  
16 reasons than I will stay today. But I know for a  
17 fact police lie. And so on my way home from church,  
18 I told my son to come downstairs with the dog, and I  
19 will take him and drop him off. I say that because I  
20 got one block from my apartment with my son in the  
21 car and had officers make a U turn, whoop-whoop, and  
22 stop me-- 30 more seconds. They stopped me. And  
23 then he won't I was recording. I'll give you the  
24 video if you want. And I was recording. And he  
25 walked-- one of the officers walked up to me-- eight

2 officers, one sergeant and seven uniformed officers  
3 in regular uniform. And the officer who walked into  
4 my driver said, "I'm stopping you because you have a  
5 light out." Regular stop, right? I said, "Oh, I was  
6 not aware, I'll go get it fixed in the morning."  
7 They was obviously doing some type of training thing.  
8 So I started talking to the sergeant because I want  
9 all the attention on me and none of it directly to my  
10 son. And I say this because they could not find  
11 nothing on me. I am a citizen, a productive citizen.  
12 And I do what is right.

13 And because that-- that aggravated them that I  
14 knew my rights, the sergeant even said, "Oh, you  
15 sound like someone who knows your rights," because I  
16 was asking about the COs, the Cos at the present.  
17 And I say that because they could not find nothing.

18 And you know they did, they gave me a criminal  
19 court ticket for a suspended registration, which is  
20 not true. I had the registration, I have the copy  
21 from the DMV, the very next day I went to get another  
22 one. And I want to say that because a regular civil  
23 stop turned criminal. And if I do not go to court,  
24 there will be a warrant for my arrest.

3 So easy to get swept up in the criminal legal  
4 system. So easy for an officer to lie on myself and  
5 any of my community members and for your to allow  
6 this to be implemented, for you to sit and thank  
7 police officers you do with police officers, and the  
8 DOC and not highlight the needs of your constituents  
9 is wrong. And it has to stop today. And you all  
10 need to start holding Councilmember Holden and  
11 Councilmember Vicki with all the bigotry, responsible  
12 and accountable. Peace and blessings.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

14 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Any questions?

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No. That's what I'm asking.

16 Do you guys have any questions?

17 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Well, thank you for the  
18 work you've been doing. You seem very passionate  
19 about it. And-- and I like that because the passion  
20 brings what's been going on. I understand we cannot  
21 continue doing the same thing over and over and  
22 expect different results.

23 So what would your recommendation be right now,  
24 for us as a city council. I hear all the things you  
25 said. But now take it a step-- [breathes in]. Yeah.

2 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: I don't need no breath.  
3 I can answer you.

4 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Okay.

5 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Right now city council  
6 needs to expand the respite. There's not enough in  
7 every borough. Period. There is no reason someone  
8 in crisis has to go to an ER when they are respites  
9 in the community. That's one thing you could do  
10 right now.

11 Also, you can hold NYPD accountable for these  
12 frequent trainings that has been available for the  
13 last eight years. There is no reason constituents  
14 have died on your watches. And NYPD is allowed to  
15 float in and float out with, "We're sorry, but we'll  
16 do better." So that is something that can be done  
17 right now.

18 Right now you can also ask the doctors what needs  
19 to be done. You could put social work-- you know  
20 what when I worked in hospital, I worked in Bellevue  
21 and I worked in Kirby, and when we didn't have enough  
22 staff, we had to float, whether we want to go to that  
23 unit or not. So why aren't your floating people?  
24 Why aren't you moving staff in HAC to put them in  
25 Rikers where they need to be. Mr. Carter died last

2 year. Every city agency failed him. The hospital,  
3 DHS shelter, intake at Rikers failed him. And so we  
4 can't even take care of people in custody, why are we  
5 taking people off the street to hospitalized them,  
6 when we're going to fail them again.

7 Right now, you need to have your people-- you're  
8 hospital right? Hospital Committee. Make sure HAC  
9 is doing their job. I see all these other  
10 Councilmembers who are asking about discharge. This-  
11 - wardens call me because discharge doesn't even  
12 work. It doesn't even work when people have mental  
13 health diagnosis, a Brad H. diagnosis, and they're  
14 getting ready to get released. And DOC staff hasn't  
15 even followed up with them. And what is-- I've even  
16 testified right here in this council, wardens will  
17 reach out to me because of that. Those are things  
18 that you can make sure right now. Why isn't there a  
19 triage unit that actually trains officers, and a  
20 triage unit to actually go to housing units in jail?  
21 Because they all work together. So there is-- I  
22 could talk to you offline. You're my Councilmember,  
23 so I could talk to you for days about what we could  
24 do right now to implement. I have no problem doing  
25 that. Any other questions?

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, thank you so much.

3 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: That's it. Thank you.

4 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Thank you for the  
5 questions.

6 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: And by the way, I have a  
7 lot of mental health in my own family that I have to  
8 deal with. And so I appreciate you.

9 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: It's not easy.

10 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: It's not easy.

11 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: And after my brain  
12 surgery, I was diagnosed with depression and anxiety.  
13 Do you imagine how I feel after 8 cops pulled me over  
14 for a bogus charge? And threw my name in the system?  
15 Go ahead.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much, you  
17 know, you-- you've added much to this conversation.  
18 And I appreciate that. So when we're talking about  
19 the respite. I'm from Staten Island, so I'm  
20 unfamiliar with that. What is that, and why do you  
21 say you need more?

22 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Well, I don't have the  
23 exact numbers in my head. But I think it was less  
24 than 60 right now in the whole city, if I'm not  
25 mistaken.

2 [BACKGROUND VOICES FROM CHAMBER]

3 Well, there's less than 60 beds in total.

4 [BACKGROUND VOICES FROM CHAMBER]

5 Yes. That's what I'm saying. And so, so that's  
6 kind of like a break, a timeout.

7 [BACKGROUND VOICES FROM CHAMBER]

8 Yes. But that's kind of like a timeout for-- for  
9 a basic explanation of it. And so what it is, is  
10 that you could pretty much call, family members could  
11 call, social workers could call the individual. And  
12 you could call to see if they have a space available,  
13 a bed available. And what that means is it's  
14 literally like a checkout. You're allowed to come in  
15 there for like a week, have services, be directly  
16 engaged around your mental health concerns. And like  
17 someone said in the audience, it is peer run. And so  
18 it's just-- it's just a restart. It's a reconnect.  
19 And that's why I say we need to expand it because  
20 it's truly a help, rather than an hospitalizing  
21 someone. Sometimes all you need is a break. You  
22 know, it's almost like when you-- I don't know if you  
23 have kids or anything--

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I've got four. I need a  
25 respite like right now.

2 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Well then you understand  
3 my-- my example. You call a loved one, "Girl just  
4 take them for the afternoon. I need a break." So  
5 it's a mental health break.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So see, these are the  
7 things that we're learning from this, you know, and,  
8 and I know that, you know, your-- your colleague or  
9 Councilmember may not have said, "Thank you," but,  
10 you know, we're looking at this holistically, right?  
11 And so there are a lot of folks out there and  
12 including in law enforcement and in these hospitals  
13 that are doing a good job. So it's only proper to  
14 say thank you, and thank you for your testimony, as  
15 we would say to you. There's a lot of emotion  
16 surrounding this, and I think that it's folks like  
17 you that make us smarter about it.

18 And one of my last questions to everyone that was  
19 testifying was basically what-- what do you need from  
20 us? And it's-- and we understand, like the  
21 heightened emotion that's involved in this, because  
22 we want to protect people who are severely mentally  
23 ill that may hurt someone else. We want to protect  
24 people who have not gotten the treatment that they  
25 need, but they don't need to have to be having their

2 civil liberties violated. So these hearings, kind  
3 of, you know, we break this out.

4 And so the respite something I learned today.  
5 How do we understand how to build capacity with our  
6 local organizations that you know, the police can't  
7 do everything--

8 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: They sure can't.

9 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: --and it doesn't make them  
10 you know, villains. But I think after a while, that  
11 that kind of is what the result is because so much of  
12 it has been put on them. So we have to look at this,  
13 you know, holistically, and-- and the things that  
14 you're saying add context to that. So I would love  
15 to talk to you offline about respites. Because like  
16 I said, I'm from Staten Island, and we have those  
17 issues as well. And I think that we need to figure  
18 out how to build out more of those things and, and  
19 mitigate some of these issues. But I really do thank  
20 you for your testimony. And I appreciate your  
21 passion.

22 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Thank you for asking the  
23 questions.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah. Thank you so much for  
25 your passion, like, Chair Hanks was saying, and, you

2 know, this is, again, a very-- there's a lot of  
3 issues around the systemic problems that we have  
4 around mental health. And I just want to thank you,  
5 and all the folks that are still here that will  
6 testify for your-- for your testimony and for adding  
7 to the conversation. And, you know, I know that I  
8 want to be respectful of my colleagues. And I know  
9 that we may have differing opinions on things, but we  
10 do all know and understand that this situation around  
11 the mental health crisis needs to improve. So I just  
12 wanted to say thank you again, so much.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you. We'll now move to  
14 Betty Khalid on Zoom. Dr. Betty Khalid, you may  
15 begin when ready.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

17 DR. KOLOD: Good afternoon, I hope you can hear  
18 me I had to run out. I'm a public health and primary  
19 care physician for people who use drugs, and I'm  
20 speaking in opposition to the Mayor's involuntary  
21 removal directive. And that's on behalf of New York  
22 Doctors Coalition, a network of over 800 New York  
23 City Health Professionals and health justice  
24 advocates who support housing first, as a public  
25 health intervention.

2 I'm going to share a few anecdotes that highlight  
3 the true gaps in psychiatric care for people  
4 experiencing homelessness and the link to overdose,  
5 the leading cause, and increasingly so, of death  
6 among persons experiencing homelessness. We know  
7 this matters because the latest health department  
8 overdose data reflects the unrelenting acceleration  
9 of overdoses in New York City.

10 My patient Alexander walked into my clinic, like  
11 the Deputy Speaker's brother, asking for help staff  
12 were frightened by his disorganized behavior. He  
13 said that he knew how he would hurt himself and  
14 described violent assaults saying that he didn't want  
15 to be like that anymore. He was voluntarily escorted  
16 to our Psych ER, and on arrival, he was handcuffed  
17 and strip-searched after they found heroin in his  
18 pocket. He immediately retracted his statements  
19 about hurting himself and others, and he was released  
20 from our crowded overwhelmed ER within minutes. He  
21 now declines all mental health referrals.

22 I just say this to say that coercive carceral  
23 mental health does not work, and instead has proven  
24 deadly for New Yorkers, especially those with  
25 marginalized identities.

2 My patients cannot access mental health care.  
3 Referrals to psychiatry take months, even for those  
4 in psychosis. Often people who use drugs are  
5 ineligible. My patient Ashley has schizophrenia.  
6 She's sleeping and injecting alone in stairwells  
7 because she's terrified of going into crowded  
8 shelters we referred her to an ACT team months ago,  
9 we have not received a response.

10 My other patient, Jeffrey, is staying in a  
11 shelter and was turned away from psychiatric care  
12 because he has a remote history of opioid use.

13 However, my patients Barry and Sam, who have  
14 schizophrenia and bipolar disorder were relieved to  
15 move into their apartments recently. Their opioid  
16 use has stabilized or completely stopped, and as they  
17 wait for their psychiatric referrals to pan out, they  
18 are at least safe.

19 So to address mental health gaps that are that  
20 are frightening the public and potentially fatal for  
21 affected individuals, we need permanent housing,  
22 universal health care, financial support, investment  
23 in community based health care, and to break down  
24 mental health and addiction silos.

2 The involuntary removal directive and cuts to the  
3 City Health Department, Department of Social  
4 Services, DHS, and the Department of Housing and  
5 Community Development will only exacerbate the  
6 problem. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

8 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to in person  
9 panels. Our next panel will be Jessica Fear from VNS  
10 Health, Fiodhna O'Grady from Samaritans of New York,  
11 Casey Starr from Samaritans of New York, Helen "Skip"  
12 Skipper from Justice Peer Initiative, and Cal Hedigan  
13 from Community Access.

14 Is Fiona or--

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: She was here. Okay.

16 COUNSEL SUCHER: Is Cal Hedigan here?

17 Jessica, you may begin when ready.

18 MS. FEAR: Is this on? Okay. Great. Thank you  
19 so much. I just want to say thank you to The joint  
20 Committees for hosting this hearing. I appreciate  
21 your stamina today. I believe that stamina is going  
22 to be required of all of us to be able to address  
23 this problem successfully. I have all these prepared  
24 written comments, I'm actually going to go a little  
25 bit off script, based on everything that we've heard

2 everyone say today. I kind of want to boil it down,  
3 you have my written testimony. There's lots that I  
4 say in there that speaks to the need. I just kind of  
5 want to boil it down to what I feel like I'm hearing  
6 from everyone, and where I feel like we come from.

7 I am with VNS Health. I'm the Senior Vice  
8 President for Behavioral Health. VNS Health,  
9 formerly the Visiting Nurse Service of New York, our  
10 behavioral health teams have been in the community  
11 serving individuals with Serious Mental Illness for  
12 over 35 years. We do it on the street. We do it in  
13 the homes. We do it in the shelters. We go and find  
14 folks wherever they need us. This past year, we  
15 served over 20,000 New Yorkers. We have five ACT  
16 teams. We have six mobile crisis teams. We have  
17 five IMT teams. We provide 958 training for the  
18 city.

19 I say all this to say, when we talk about the  
20 investment in community based resources, we could not  
21 be more in support of that as a sustainable solution  
22 for the problem that everyone has been speaking to  
23 very passionately and eloquently today. We do  
24 applaud the increased investment in capacity.

2       However, I cannot stress enough how imperative it  
3 is for the community-based mental health programs to  
4 be funded, to keep those who can be stably sustained  
5 in the community at home in the community where they  
6 belong. This will absolutely free up the treatment  
7 capacity for those who actually need stabilization in  
8 hospitalization.

9       What we know is that we have watched -- across  
10 our mobile crisis teams -- we have watched referrals  
11 to mobile crisis double over the last five years. Of  
12 those referrals -- and some of these statistics we  
13 didn't get to hear today, so I'll share some with you  
14 on our end -- only 5% of the referrals that come to  
15 our mobile crisis teams need to go to the hospital,  
16 are transported. And of those 3% of adults and 1% of  
17 the youth are transported involuntarily. What that  
18 means is we are able to intervene, reduce the crises  
19 and the need for hospitalization and unnecessary  
20 hospitalization and keep people at home in the  
21 community where they belong.

22       We cannot do that -- here we go; we're out of  
23 time -- we cannot do that without the proper  
24 workforce to address this, right? And people have  
25 said this throughout the day. I just want to

2 underscore that the workforce crisis will-- is  
3 imperative. It's imperative that we solve this.  
4 Increased capacity will not be able to be realized  
5 unless we have the people to staff the positions to  
6 do the work. And those of us who are the community-  
7 based providers, who are the safety net for the  
8 individuals that we serve, we don't have the staff to  
9 do it today. And without additional investments,  
10 we're not going to be able to do it tomorrow. So  
11 thank you for your time.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Good to see  
13 you, Jessica. And I just wanted to let everyone know  
14 that if you have written testimony, I promise you  
15 that the staff and the Committee does read every  
16 single word, so no worries.

17 MS. FEAR: Thank you

18 COUNSEL SUCHER: Fiona, you want to go next?

19 MS. O'GRADY: Hello, and thank you Chairs Lee,  
20 Ariola, Chair Hanks for the opportunity to speak  
21 today. I'm Fiodhna O'Grady, and I'm representing the  
22 Samaritans of New York. It's a Suicide Prevention  
23 Center. Been around for 40 years and we operate New  
24 York City's only anonymous and completely

2 confidential suicide prevention hotline. And we also  
3 operate education programs in all five boroughs.

4 Samaritans provides immediate and ongoing support  
5 to those in distress, and it's also a safe  
6 alternative to existing clinical government-run  
7 programs. We are the go-to service for the  
8 underserved, the untreated and those most impacted by  
9 stigma. And I'd like to echo -- I think it was Chair  
10 Lee who was saying, we're part of the "one size does  
11 not fit all and therefore we exist." Samaritans  
12 hotline acts as a safe point of entry to mental  
13 health services, especially for people of color,  
14 LGBTQ, young, undocumented people, and people living  
15 with mental health conditions or disabilities, and  
16 for those experiencing homelessness 24/7. Before the  
17 pandemic suicide rates had been increasing for two  
18 decades. And while they remained stable during 2020,  
19 they're on the rise again, CDC 2022.

20 For prospective New York City DOHMH estimates  
21 that someone dies by suicide every 16 hours in New  
22 York City. And what we say is violence expressed  
23 outwardly is homicide. And think of the care that we  
24 apply and the amount of energy we apply to combating  
25

2 homicide. Suicide is violence expressed inwardly.

3 And we need more care.

4 While mental health is an important aspect of  
5 suicide and suicide prevention, our efforts cannot be  
6 confined solely to the mental health sector. And  
7 that is why we have decided that we're coming here  
8 today also, because obviously, housing instability  
9 and homelessness are two important social  
10 determinants of both physical and mental health. And  
11 I think we've heard it again from Councilmember  
12 Barron, Councilmember Cabán, the Bronx defenders,  
13 this lovely lady who sat here before us, and  
14 involuntary removals and forced institutionalization  
15 are policies that seek to hide the problem. They do  
16 not expand access to housing, nor do they address the  
17 structural and individual factors underlying  
18 homelessness.

19 As a city we need to examine all the factors  
20 contributing to homelessness, and adopt a holistic  
21 approach. This means addressing systematic  
22 inequalities, providing access to stable housing,  
23 health care and education and offering options for  
24 mental health support.

3 Samaritans wants to thank the City Council for  
4 their support, which allowed us to respond to over  
5 60,000 calls in FY 22 in our role as an essential  
6 member of the New York City Safety Net. We-- we  
7 applaud all your efforts at this hearing today. And  
8 in the interest of compassion and dignity, community  
9 mental health care is everything. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Fiodhna.

11 COUNSEL SUCHER: Casey Star, you may begin when  
12 ready.

13 MS. STARR: Thank you to the Committee Chairs  
14 here today and to everyone who is also still here and  
15 giving voice to this. I'm Casey Starr, and I am the  
16 Co-Executive Director of the Samaritans of New York.

17 Samaritans is the only anonymous and completely  
18 confidential crisis service in this city, and we  
19 prioritize autonomy and agency of an individual in  
20 crisis. A caller's absolute anonymity to our service  
21 ensures that no action will be taken without their  
22 consent, and this helps to build trust, it reduces  
23 feelings of helplessness and isolation, and it's been  
24 shown to increase engagement in services and help-  
25 seeking behaviors.

2 From the 1.4 million call Samaritans has answered  
3 from New Yorkers in crisis, we have learned that  
4 trust, autonomy and dignity are at the heart of  
5 helping someone. And what we've learned by listening  
6 to the voices of people who call is reflected in the  
7 extant research.

8 Unfortunately, we've also observed significant  
9 resistance to centering these values in social  
10 services and governmental policies. So as the only  
11 crisis service that does not engage in non-consensual  
12 interventions, including 988 and DOHMH, said that  
13 that's NYC-WELL, and in this city, that does happen  
14 when you call. Not always, but it can. We know that  
15 alternatives work. We're proof of that. And we're  
16 deeply troubled by the Mayor's plan to address  
17 homelessness and the move towards forced  
18 institutionalization and forced carceral care.

19 Nonconsensual interventions and policies, while  
20 well-intentioned, have severe unintended  
21 consequences. There is a real risk for physical  
22 danger and violence as well as exposure to just the  
23 fear associated with engagement with law enforcement,  
24 who are ill-equipped to evaluate and safely respond  
25 to mental health crises.

2 Psychological trauma and a worsening of mental  
3 health status is a actual consequence. Involuntary  
4 interventions have been shown to increase feelings of  
5 shame, reduce the likelihood that a person will  
6 disclose future suicidal ideation or seek help.  
7 Institutional settings often isolate people from  
8 their communities and support networks. This can  
9 further marginalize a person, especially someone who  
10 is already vulnerable and can exacerbate their  
11 challenges. Additionally, we know that suicide rates  
12 increase dramatically post hospitalization,  
13 especially for those who were involuntarily treated.  
14 And that doesn't even touch on the financial  
15 instability that this can cause, especially for a  
16 population him who are experiencing homelessness.

17 This poses a costly model for the city and for  
18 the individuals. Rather than preventing harm, these  
19 practices actively are harming and traumatizing the  
20 people they seek to help. So I yield the rest of my  
21 time.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: You can finish off. Yeah.

23 MS. STARR: Okay. People who experience  
24 homelessness have a higher rate of suicide attempts,  
25 and it's estimated they die by suicide at nine times

2 the rate of the general population. All New Yorkers  
3 deserve the same opportunity to make decisions about  
4 their health, wellbeing, and treatment, regardless of  
5 their housing status. People access help when they  
6 have choices they are comfortable with and services  
7 that make them feel safe. Mayor Adams said that we  
8 need to rebuild trust in our city. And we agree: If  
9 people don't trust you, you're not going to get very  
10 far. But to do that New Yorkers need compassion and  
11 not coercion. Coercion is not the basis for trust.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Helen, you may begin when ready.

14 MS. SKIPPER: Oh, excuse me, I'm sorry. I don't  
15 go by the name Helen most of the time, so I didn't  
16 know you were talking to me.

17 COUNSEL SUCHER: I apologize.

18 MS. SKIPPER: No problems. Good afternoon  
19 Council. I need to take my time, and I need to be  
20 intentional in my thoughts. I came with prepared  
21 testimony, but I'm not going to speak my prepared  
22 testimony. You have my written testimony. I'm not  
23 going to speak my prepared testimony, because I'm  
24 just going to talk about what everybody else has said  
25 repeatedly about how we need more community-based

2 services, about how we need more peer support, about  
3 how we need expansion of services, and a better paid  
4 workforce. We already know that. Everybody that has  
5 sat here before me has said that. What I am going to  
6 speak about is the fact that I don't feel represented  
7 and I don't feel heard. It is about the fact that I  
8 am directly impacted by the criminal justice system,  
9 by the mental health system, by the substance abuse  
10 system. It is about the fact that we are sitting  
11 here talking about policy and procedure.

12 But yet we are not represented here in this room.  
13 You want to talk about crafting policy and procedure.  
14 But I guarantee you if the Mayor had someone with  
15 lived experiences on his team, he would have never  
16 came with a plan such as this. I sat here all day,  
17 where members of departments sat here and attempted  
18 to quantify their actions with numbers. And I can  
19 get academic myself. I am a criminologist. I'll be  
20 entering into a Master's Ph.D program in the fall.

21 I can speak about numbers, but I prefer to stick  
22 with the qualitative. I prefer to stick with the  
23 narrative. You cannot build policy about vulnerable  
24 peoples without inviting us to sit at the table. We  
25 are the subject matter experts in the room. Yet when

2 it comes time for us to speak, when it comes time for  
3 the community to give testimony, I am looking at an  
4 empty chamber. When I sat here this morning with  
5 these talking heads, the Council Chambers was full.  
6 Yet today, at this moment, I sit here and I see less  
7 than a handful of Councilmembers. You are listening  
8 to me now. Ten minutes ago, whoever was here was on  
9 their phones. Where is the respect for the community  
10 members and those of us who were directly impacted?  
11 We are closest to the solution. [BELL RINGS]

12 And I'm going to take my time with this. See, I  
13 can turn that clock off because I've been watching it  
14 and I think is running fast. Anyhow, let me tell  
15 you: Those that are closest to the problems are  
16 closest to the solution. I have said this time and  
17 time again. Are you guys even listening? How can  
18 you build a plan to support or what you think you  
19 support, but you don't include the voices of those  
20 who are directly impacted. And yes, I'm directly  
21 impacted for 25 years. I went through the criminal  
22 justice system, the substance abuse system, the  
23 mental health system for 25 years, yet you still try  
24 to involuntarily confine us. You still try to take  
25 away our voice and choice, like we don't matter. Yet

2 I'm sitting here speaking to you just as  
3 comprehensively, just as coherently, just as  
4 intelligently as the next person. Use us. We are  
5 here. We demand to have a seat at the table. You  
6 have my written testimony, Councilmembers.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you for your time.

8 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you.

9 MS. SKIPPER: Oh, and I'll take questions if you  
10 have some.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, I just wanted to say thank  
12 you for that. Because oftentimes-- I always say this  
13 as a community person myself, as someone who's  
14 experienced it. But just the importance of having  
15 that lived experience and have a seat at the table.  
16 The seat at the table, and the voice is important.  
17 And that was a lot of what we were trying to advocate  
18 for on the nonprofit side as well, because we felt  
19 like there was a lack of that. So I just wanted to  
20 say, I appreciate you making that point.

21 MS. SKIPPER: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. So when  
23 you speak about, you know, a seat at the table, and I  
24 appreciate your-- your testimony. And you know, as  
25 Councilmembers, we try really hard. We are sitting

2 here, and-- and so it does matter that you have  
3 somebody and a face to talk to. So I appreciate  
4 that.

5 But when it comes-- because I mentioned before  
6 the capacity building. In what way do you think that  
7 that seat at the table-- given, you know, this is a  
8 big city. We all have the best intentions. But, you  
9 know, we sit here and these are why we have the  
10 hearings, to break down these policies, to listen to  
11 what everybody needs to say and say, "Okay, where's  
12 that happy medium? And where are we missing it?"

13 So my last question to all the folks -- you  
14 called them talking heads -- was, you know, what do  
15 you need from us? And so how do you envision that  
16 seat at the table. Logistically, how would that  
17 work, if you have any ideas?

18 MS. SKIPPER: Yeah, well, for starters, we meet  
19 to fix how we hold these proceedings. Just like you  
20 had a chance to ask questions of the talking heads.  
21 We would like that opportunity as well. Um, they  
22 come. They sit for a couple hours, and then boom,  
23 they're gone. I've been here since nine o'clock this  
24 morning, and I sit patiently waiting for my chance to  
25 speak. I have a couple of good questions for them as

2 well. You know, they should be held accountable for  
3 what they say. And again, like I said, if the Mayor  
4 had people who are directly impacted on his team, I  
5 guarantee you the plan that he put forth would be  
6 entirely different, because we who are directly  
7 impacted who has been through the systems would have  
8 pointed him in a different direction, because we  
9 would have shown him how wrong he was to think that  
10 we can take the voice and choice from people. There  
11 are better ways. You know, and that is what I mean  
12 by a seat at the table as you build these policies.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: So we would like you to submit  
14 your questions that you have that-- for-- for the  
15 folks who testified, and you could send it to the  
16 same place you submitted your testimony, and we'll  
17 get back to you.

18 MS. SKIPPER: Thank you. I appreciate your time.

19 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you to this panel will now  
20 move to our next in person panel.

21 It will be Sarah Blanco for Center for Justice  
22 Innovation, Nadia Swanson from Ali Forney Center,  
23 Christina Sparrock, from Centered Intervention  
24 Training, Lena Allen from Fountain House and Nadia  
25 Chait from CASES.

2 Sarah Blanco, you may begin when ready.

3 MS. BLANCO: Can you hear me? Okay. Good  
4 afternoon Chairs and esteemed Councilmembers. My  
5 name is Sarah Blanco. I'm the clinical director --  
6 fancy word for social worker -- at Midtown Community  
7 Court Midtown, a project of the Center for Justice  
8 Innovation, formerly known as the Center for Court  
9 Innovation or CCI.

10 Today I'm here to talk about our work serving  
11 people with mental illness, substance use issues, and  
12 co-occurring disorders, specifically our community  
13 first program and our Midtown misdemeanor mental  
14 health court.

15 Before I go into this, I want to say have 20  
16 years of experience of working on mobile crisis, ACT  
17 teams working with folks living with mental illness  
18 whose autonomy has been taken away, who have been  
19 hospitalized and who have not had a voice at the  
20 table as so many people have spoken today.

21 I want to just go jump straight into our  
22 misdemeanor mental health court part that we do have  
23 at midtown community court.

24 Unfortunately, folks with mental health issues  
25 are still being arrested. They're often being

2 arrested at a time where their mental health is  
3 destabilizing, something that's happened in their  
4 life, and they're either compensating or they're  
5 very, very traumatized. We are seeing this court  
6 part was launched by OCA back in February. It's open  
7 every Friday on at midtown community court. And  
8 folks are put into this court part, or either the  
9 clients or the legal stakeholders have identified the  
10 person as having some sort of mental health issue.  
11 It's a voluntary part, clients do not have to take  
12 part. We are not here to pathologize and further  
13 criminalize folks who live with mental illness.

14 What makes us very, very different than other  
15 court parts -- and I want to acknowledge I am talking  
16 about a court part, I am talking about someone who's  
17 been arrested for a misdemeanor, and we understand by  
18 the time the person comes to our court, they've been  
19 through arraignment, they've also been off also been  
20 very traumatized, often by the arrest process. And  
21 they've also been cycling in and out of the criminal  
22 legal system, where treatment was probably a better  
23 option, and usually was.

24 So I just want to highlight that hallmarks of our  
25 misdemeanor mental health court part or specialized

2 court part, when clients come into our court, it is  
3 not like a downtown criminal Court. They are met by  
4 social work staff case managers, to say hello to  
5 them, to treat them, like people to walk them through  
6 the process, to introduce them to their attorneys, to  
7 adhere to the pillars of procedural justice. This is  
8 what's happening, this is what's going to happen  
9 next. The social workers, case managers stay with  
10 the client from the beginning of their case to the  
11 end. We sit with them in court. We provide  
12 programming. We meet with them as real people. They  
13 are not defendants to us, they are real people.

14 Since launching the court part, we have  
15 identified several common themes among the clients  
16 referred to us. As I said, they're arrested at a  
17 time when there's something very traumatic happening  
18 in their lives, and it's causing a mental health  
19 issue or it's exacerbating a current mental illness.  
20 Our staff, our social work staff, our case management  
21 staff work with the legal stakeholders to develop  
22 treatment mandates. So while you might go to court  
23 and the legal parties might say, "You have to do five  
24 sessions, or five programs or whatever to to get  
25 through your court case," the legal stakeholders have

2 so much trust in us that they rely on the social work  
3 staff to co create with the client, what they would  
4 like to see in their case.

5 So our mandates are very short. But we're not  
6 saying you have a charge that this is what you're  
7 going to do we sit with the client. We listen to the  
8 client. We give space, so they can let us know what  
9 they need. We do not mandate mental health  
10 treatment, we really build a bridge to whatever  
11 services they want. And that can be when they come  
12 up and meet with us. They're often hungry,  
13 disconnected and unhoused, we can provide food  
14 clothing and a cell phone just to start that build  
15 trust out. From there, we co-create a treatment plan  
16 with the client. We have on site services from  
17 counseling, mental health services, case management,  
18 benefits assistance. We can link them pretty much  
19 immediately to all of this stuff, and it's built an  
20 enormous level of trust.

21 I will say that because we case conference weekly  
22 with our legal stakeholders, the attorneys, and the  
23 court attorneys, and we can show-- we can give  
24 context to the client. We can talk about their  
25 lives. We come to really, really quick dispositions.

2 Our cases-- often the clients' cases are often over  
3 in 33 to 44 days. This allows them to move on with  
4 hopefully some of the services and needs met through  
5 our social work and clinic staff and our amazing  
6 stakeholders, but they don't have the burden of a  
7 court case over them, which is-- that in itself is so  
8 incredibly stressful. And it can be paralyzing. You  
9 want to get a new job, but you have an open case.  
10 You want to do something else, but you have a new  
11 case.

12 I will say some of the highlights other than like  
13 the constant engagement with our clients, upon  
14 completion of the clients court case, we really tried  
15 to break down the hierarchy. The client can get his  
16 certificate of graduation. We clap for the client.  
17 The judge gets off the bench and we highlight their  
18 successes. We acknowledge the challenges, but we  
19 highlight their successes.

20 Clients have recorded that this is the first time  
21 in the justice system. They've actually felt  
22 physically looked at, heard, and felt like there-- I  
23 don't know, some state were supportive, but some say  
24 they just felt like they were treated like a human  
25 being. A lot of the clients we see in misdemeanor

2 mental health court continue to talk to us and work  
3 with our staff on a voluntary basis posts mandate,  
4 because they want to continue to get the help they  
5 decide they want.

6 I know I've run out of time. I just want to  
7 highlight that misdemeanor mental health court  
8 midtown communities court is unfunded. To continue  
9 to address these-- these rising case loads, these  
10 clients with a lot of needs, we need more money to  
11 support staff and programming. We don't want folks  
12 to be circling through the system. We want them to  
13 walk out with their needs addressed, and for them to  
14 to kind of move on with their lives. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I thank  
16 you for your testimony. As the Chair of the  
17 Committee of Public Safety, I've-- I've seen and  
18 witnessed the-- the benefits of the mental health  
19 court in Brooklyn and I-- I've experienced firsthand,  
20 the applause. And I've also experienced this when  
21 judges do use their discretion saying, "Okay, this  
22 person is not ready, and they need to be remanded."

23 How do you see the Center for Court Justice  
24 Innovation, what their role is, because we heard many  
25 of the public testifying that they need to be at the

2 table, but I also believe that -- I'm from Staten  
3 Island, so you see the one little like Justice  
4 Center. So we're working in earnest to get a mental  
5 health court in Staten Island, as well as a community  
6 court and how important those pieces are.

7 So is this-- how do you see an integration with  
8 the Mayor's plan? And seeing that, that piece needs  
9 to be in there? Because we've been all saying,  
10 "Well, what happens when they're let go? And what  
11 happens? What is the off ramp? What is the on ramp?  
12 What does that look like?" And I think that you  
13 know, the Center for Court Justice is just what the  
14 doctor ordered, and I've seen the great work that has  
15 been done. And it's-- it's-- how do we-- in your  
16 perspective, how do you see the integration of--  
17 because I think this is an important piece, right?  
18 That we just-- you weren't up here testifying with  
19 everyone else. But I think that that would have been  
20 a really nice bookend to-- we do have all of those--  
21 those pieces.

22 So how would you know, notwithstanding funding,  
23 because we get it, everybody who comes here and wants  
24 funding-- but how do you see that role playing so  
25

3 that even if we can advocate for funding, we're  
4 asking for something very specific. Thank you.

5 MS. BLANCO: Okay, I'm just trying-- Can you  
6 repeat the question? I'm just trying to--

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: How do you see your  
8 connection? If you know, you're-- you're saying that  
9 this is the Center for Court Justice and Innovation.  
10 How do you see that component in the current plan  
11 that the Mayor has-- has released for involuntary  
12 remanding?

13 MS. BLANCO: I mean, to be blunt, I don't see it  
14 as part of the plan. We don't-- we are not here to  
15 take people to the hospital who might appear that  
16 they are not doing well. I think those terms have  
17 been not defined yet. They're really, really broad.  
18 There's not been training. There's-- there's talk of  
19 bias. And I think what is going to happen if this  
20 plan goes through, we're going to see more people  
21 arrested and harmed. And so I think an off ramp is  
22 something we have-- or if an intercept model is to be  
23 proactive, we have a community-first model that works  
24 with folks on the street to try to engage them in  
25 services before they're involved in the criminal  
26 legal system. Or if they already are, we can provide

2 the supports to help them get through it. I think  
3 misdemeanor mental health court is a specialized  
4 court part that can sensitively, in a trauma-informed  
5 way, work with folks who are experiencing mental  
6 health issues, rather than cycle them in and out of  
7 the hospitals. Right. We'll get there. Thank you.

8 MS. BLANCO: Thanks.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: Nadia Swanson, you may begin  
10 when ready.

11 MS. SWANSON: Hello, thank you to the Committee  
12 for hearing our testimony today. My name is Nadia  
13 Swanson. I'm a licensed clinical social worker with  
14 12 years of experience, and the Director of Technical  
15 Assistance and Advocacy at the Ali Forney Center.

16 AFC is the largest and most comprehensive service  
17 for LGBTQ youth, ages 16 to 24, experiencing  
18 homelessness. Over 2000 youth a year access our 24/7  
19 drop in, clinical services and housing programs. And  
20 we oppose this initiative not only for the youth we  
21 serve every day but also because we know that  
22 nationally 44% of unhoused adults experienced  
23 homelessness before the age of 25.

24 We are all in agreement that we want all New  
25 Yorkers to be able to get the care they need. But

2 this is not the way to do it. It is harmful,  
3 criminalizing, stigmatizing. Having police be the  
4 first response to mental health needs to a complete  
5 lack of understanding of the issue. For youth, just  
6 the presence of police will enact their fight-flight  
7 response, creating the self fulfilling prophecy the  
8 cops will need in order to justify their choices.

9 Someone with mental health needs, someone in  
10 psychiatric crisis, and someone who is enacting  
11 violence are not the same thing. And when you just  
12 handle it correctly, it is done with thoughtfulness  
13 equitably, honoring their worth and self-  
14 determination. This initiative conflicts with our  
15 professional values and code of ethics that we're  
16 licensed to uphold. We go through years of  
17 specialized education, internships, exams,  
18 supervision and ongoing work to confront our own  
19 biases in order to be able to assess the nuance of  
20 imminent risk, and when other services for safety can  
21 be provided.

22 NYPD can't do that in a few hours of training,  
23 especially with the values of the NYPD. We have seen  
24 too many times that people are killed during a mental  
25 health call. This is especially true for LGBTQ youth

2 who are disproportionately black, brown, and trans  
3 and it does not address the specific needs of LGBTQ  
4 youth.

5 Because of this AFC does everything we can to  
6 avoid police interactions for our youth. Others have  
7 shared stories about the violence, dehumanization,  
8 and the trauma that our youth face.

9 So I'm going to share a quick story. One day at  
10 our drop in center, I responded to a youth that was  
11 screaming in the hallway about wanting a gun to shoot  
12 themselves. Over the course of the next hour I sat  
13 on the floor with her, listened, built rapport, was  
14 able to keep them with me instead of her running  
15 away, using my clinical skills, give tangible  
16 resources, art materials to express themselves  
17 allowing them space to be in privacy without the  
18 pressure to speak. And by the end she was calm. And  
19 I was able to determine that she was not actually  
20 thinking of harming herself, and was reacting to how  
21 the New York City system had failed her.

22 We were able to end with the safety plan, find  
23 them emergency shelter bed and outpatient services.

24 I see my co workers do this every day. If she  
25 had been confronted by the police at that first

2 moment, it would have ended in a physical violence  
3 against her, and you can't learn how to do all of  
4 that just described in an hour training video.

5 This initiative is infuriating. It's a waste of  
6 time and resources especially when we all know the  
7 answer: housing. We need early intervention for  
8 degenerative SMI, no-barrier affirming mental health  
9 care peer to peer support expanding programs like B-  
10 HEARD, which has been very successful at our drop in  
11 in Harlem, RHY mental health shelters and housing,  
12 housing, housing. Thank you.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Christina Speric, you may begin  
14 when ready.

15 MS. SPARROCK: Good day Chair and members. Today  
16 I'm requesting the Mayor's mental health plan to be  
17 re evaluated as it relates to the use of police to  
18 involuntary remote people they deem to have mental  
19 health conditions into hospitals without the  
20 individual even being a danger to themselves or  
21 others. I want to also ensure the city does not  
22 merely substitute mental health professionals for  
23 police, as some, I'm not saying all, as some mental  
24 health professionals are harming our neighbors who  
25 need care and place them in dire circumstances.

2 The solution instead should be centered around  
3 pair specialists, people with lived experience and a  
4 fully-transformed mental health crisis response.

5 Before I continue, I would like to introduce  
6 myself my name is Christina Sparrock. I'm a  
7 Certified Public Accountant living with a mental  
8 health condition. I'm a staunch mental health  
9 advocate and a founder of Person Centered  
10 Intervention Training, Mental Health Response Pilot,  
11 or PCIT, which is a peer-run up agency that  
12 destigmatizes mental health conditions and supports  
13 communities.

14 The PCIT program is a person-centered, strength-  
15 based, trauma-informed, and empowering model that  
16 meets people where they're at, removes the emphasis  
17 on what's wrong with the person, and focuses on what  
18 happened.

19 For instance, if a person needs immediate housing  
20 and has an emotional break, connecting them with  
21 housing, and offering involuntary support as opposed  
22 to police is the way to do it and not incarceration  
23 or hospitalization.

24 Not only is PCIT effective for people living with  
25 mental conditions, but it benefits others living with

2 substance use issues, those who are just as involved,  
3 unhoused, and the general population overall.

4 Whether it's a law enforcement officer, a teacher, a  
5 surgeon, or a psychiatrist, mental health conditions  
6 can affect everyone. It's not a them issue. It's a  
7 we issue.

8 In addition, PCIT employs peer specialists who  
9 are vital to the success of the program to help  
10 divert people from law enforcement to treatment and  
11 services. Peer specialists understand and have  
12 walked in the shoes of others' needs and know the  
13 path to recovery, and mental health condition is not  
14 a crime. It's about normalizing the condition,  
15 providing people with the services based on their  
16 unmet needs, and having empathy and patience.

17 Sadly, at the System for Mental Health Emergency  
18 has always been public safety or law enforcement as  
19 far as first responders, and things have been hugely  
20 exacerbated by the Mayor's new policy. And law  
21 enforcement now has the authority to involuntarily  
22 remove people they deem to have mental health  
23 conditions into hospitals without even knowing-- not  
24 without the individual you or even being in danger to  
25 themselves or others. Notably, hospitals can be very

2 traumatizing, and traumatizing. I know; I've been  
3 there.

4 Although the mental health professionals are a  
5 better option than police for engaging with people  
6 with mental health conditions, there are still red  
7 flags within the mental health system that must be  
8 addressed and rectified.

9 According to the recent article in [inaudible]  
10 Psychiatry, there is a growing body of evidence of  
11 mental illness, stigma, and health care. There's  
12 biases, there's discriminative practices, a whole lot  
13 of things, by people who took an oath to first do no  
14 harm, and to fact to continue to do the harm.

15 Without being treated with dignity and respect,  
16 without having access to trauma informed person  
17 centered care by peers, people with mental health  
18 conditions decompensate end up in hospitals, jailed,  
19 unhoused, unemployed, and fall victim to crimes and  
20 continue to be subjected to a plethora of emotional,  
21 physical, psychological tax due to no fault of their  
22 own. Right in my backyard, District 35, people  
23 living with mental health conditions, substance use  
24 misuse, and other you know unhoused, and just have  
25 now fallen victim to community-based organizations

2 and to mental health organizations which  
3 unfortunately led to unwellness. People in the  
4 community were neglected, didn't receive mental  
5 health treatment, no continuum of care. People of  
6 color were getting less services than their white  
7 counterparts. A person, continuum of care, she ended  
8 up missing. Persons-- people were overdosed. The  
9 peer specialists worked in the-- reported a hostile  
10 environment. They were bullied. They went on  
11 medical leave. They were hospitalized. They would  
12 quit. They were reported to HR, but humiliated. It  
13 was horrible, right?

14 Funders and the funders were misinformed.

15 I would like to share details more after, if you  
16 want to know more about it, because I would love to  
17 share it too, and offer it, and ask that you  
18 investigate.

19 Many vulnerable people consequences are forced to  
20 be silence. Peers are silenced all the time. While  
21 city/state funded foundation funding agencies go  
22 unpoliced and unpunished leads us to say, and for the  
23 reasons set forth, this is why innocent people fall  
24 victim to our systems and end up unwell, unhoused,  
25 and under the Mayor's plan are involuntary removed by

2 the police. I can get removed by police in my own  
3 neighborhood because I have a mental health  
4 condition.

5 So as a solution -- I have more to say anyway --  
6 as a solution, I have three requests for city  
7 council. First to support and fund peer-run response  
8 pilots like PCIT. Second to mandate culturally  
9 responsive trauma-informed, person-centered, training  
10 designed by peer specialists, because we know what's  
11 best for our you know, health and how we want to be  
12 approach, to train all health professionals and  
13 police, and also to create an independent peer  
14 advisory council that has access to data on quality  
15 of services of all health professionals, advise on  
16 best practices, assist in introducing and reviewing  
17 legislation, and issue public reports so we can all  
18 review them. Thank you. Any questions?

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No. I was just going to say,  
20 You took the words out of my mouth. Because when you  
21 were talking about that, I wanted to actually follow  
22 up with you afterwards. So I'll definitely make sure  
23 to get your contact information.

24 MS. SPARROCK: Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

2 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you. Next we'll hear from  
3 Lena Allen from Fountain House, you may begin when  
4 ready.

5 MS. ALLEN: Good afternoon committee Chairs and  
6 members. My name is Lena Allen. I'm a Policy  
7 Analyst at Fountain House and I'm here to testify  
8 against the directive to expand the use of  
9 involuntary removal to address mental health needs in  
10 New York City.

11 Fountain House appreciates this issue is  
12 receiving the attention it deserves, because robust  
13 and respectful policy to support people living with  
14 Serious Mental Illness, especially those who are  
15 unhoused, is long overdue. Fountain House, as the  
16 originator of the clubhouse model, knows based on our  
17 almost 75 years of experience, that real progress can  
18 be made with solutions that are rooted in person-  
19 centered public health approaches.

20 While respecting the Administration's increased  
21 focus. We are concerned about any effort that  
22 utilizes short term and voluntary measures as a  
23 starting place. We are equally concerned about steps  
24 that rely heavily on law enforcement because we know

2 public health workers are better positioned to be at  
3 the forefront of engaging this community.

4 We cannot and should not ignore people who are  
5 living on our streets but must ensure that our care  
6 efforts center on dignity and agency. Fountain House  
7 has partnered with other or community-based  
8 organizations to spearhead efforts that enable people  
9 not only to become housed but to recover and thrive.  
10 The key element is building trust.

11 40% of our members have been unhoused, a quarter  
12 have been involved with the justice system, and some  
13 have had experiences with involuntary treatment.  
14 Many of our members feel fearful of this new expanded  
15 directive, because their behavior could be  
16 misinterpreted and put them at needless risk of an  
17 encounter with law enforcement. Our members, of  
18 which there are 2000 in New York City, are people  
19 living with Serious Mental Illness who choose to  
20 voluntarily be part be part of our recovery  
21 community. Our members, staff, and partners are  
22 deeply committed to working together to protect our  
23 community, share our stories, and advocate for what  
24 we know does work.

2 Without a comprehensive plan that moves people  
3 from crisis to recovery, the approaches announced  
4 will not address the revolving doors to hospitals and  
5 jails and can further stigmatize people living with  
6 SMI.

7 And beyond the moment of crisis, the city must  
8 resource community based recovery models including  
9 respite centers, supportive housing, peer models, and  
10 club houses like Fountain House, which will greatly  
11 reduce the need for crisis response in the first  
12 place.

13 Mayor Adams stated in his speech, people living  
14 with severe mental illness deserve care, community  
15 and treatment and the least restrictive setting  
16 possible. We agree, and believe that now is the  
17 moment to develop the continuum of care plan, and to  
18 do so in partnership with people with lived  
19 experience, as well as organizations and  
20 professionals who have effectively served this  
21 community.

22 The greatest city in the world can and should be  
23 the most humane and visionary and caring for our most  
24 vulnerable. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Nadia.

2 MS. CHAIT: Good afternoon. Nice to see you,  
3 Chair Lee. I'm Nadia Chait. I'm the Senior Director  
4 of Policy and Advocacy at CASES, and we are an  
5 organization that's dedicated to serving New Yorkers  
6 who have Serious Mental Illness and who have had  
7 interactions with the criminal legal system.

8 To be blunt, our clients are those who are most  
9 likely to be caught up by this directive in ways that  
10 will be very harmful to them, and that will lead to  
11 their removal from the community, and from the  
12 services that we provide that are actually helping  
13 them. So we strongly oppose it.

14 But you've heard a lot today about all the  
15 reasons why this is bad. And so I'm going to focus  
16 on the things that we should do instead, because  
17 there is a clear need to help New Yorkers who are  
18 experiencing Serious Mental Illness as particularly  
19 those who are living on the streets.

20 We strongly urge the council to work with the  
21 Mayor to increase funding for intensive mobile  
22 treatment, to eliminate the waitlist for these  
23 services. CASES is the largest provider of intensive  
24 mobile treatment, which is a team-based model of pure  
25 specialists, behavioral health specialists,

2 psychiatrists, and nurses who provide wraparound  
3 support to individuals who have Serious Mental  
4 Illness, and are homeless or were recently homeless.  
5 These are individuals who have been repeatedly failed  
6 by our systems and fallen among the gap the, you  
7 know, gaping holes between the different silos of  
8 services. But IMT is incredibly successful. And IMT  
9 is built on the premise that when individuals receive  
10 the services that they need and are offered the  
11 services that they need, that they will engage with  
12 services in a voluntary fashion, and that we do not  
13 need to use involuntary commitment as a first step in  
14 serving individuals. Our understanding is that  
15 there's currently a 600-to-700 person waitlist for  
16 intensive mobile treatment services, which is  
17 unacceptable. And while the city does have an RFP  
18 out to add five additional teams, that will not  
19 eliminate the waitlist that'll serve about 135  
20 additional individuals. So we strongly encourage  
21 increased funding for intensive mobile treatment.

22 We also would like to see more support for the  
23 clinic based services, which -- Councilmember Lee I  
24 know, you know, the funding challenges of clinics  
25 very well -- but at CASES, we really struggle with

2 the need to provide holistic support for our clients  
3 under a model that is based on a fee-for-service, you  
4 do a thing, you get billed and that doesn't really  
5 treat our clients as the complex, wonderful people  
6 that they are, who might need criminal justice  
7 support, who might need housing support, who might  
8 need someone to go and visit them in the community,  
9 rather than making them come into the clinic.

10 So we had certified community behavioral health  
11 clinic funding, which was a SAMSA grant.

12 Unfortunately, our grant expired and our clinic  
13 currently operates at an annual deficit of \$700,000  
14 per year. That is not a loss that our agency can  
15 continue to maintain. We are the only clinic in  
16 Harlem or the South Bronx, and one of the only  
17 clinics in Manhattan that is dedicated to serving  
18 folks with Serious Mental Illness and criminal legal  
19 system involvement. And so we urge the council to  
20 explore ways to better fund services like ours.

21 And last, I'll just close with talking about the  
22 need to better serve those who are caught up in the  
23 courts. We are the pretrial service provider for  
24 Individuals who are facing trial in Manhattan in New  
25 York County. So we provide supervised release

2 services to a range of folks who are arrested and  
3 facing trial and Manhattan.

4 We find that unfortunately, those with mental  
5 illness are more likely to fall between some of the  
6 gaps that make it harder for them to succeed in  
7 pretrial services, particularly individuals who are  
8 homeless. And so to fill this gap, we would really  
9 like to see what we're calling a community care van,  
10 which would be a van located right outside of  
11 criminal court so that when folks are leaving  
12 arraignment, they could immediately go into the van  
13 for a clinical psychiatric and substance use  
14 intervention. The van would have a shower and a  
15 bathroom, we would be able to provide folks with  
16 clothes, food, and escort them to the services that  
17 they need. So instead of having individuals who were  
18 arrested because of their mental illness, left  
19 without help, or sent to Rikers, we would be able to  
20 provide them the holistic support that they need.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And unfortunately,  
23 that deficit is all too common with a lot of these  
24 outpatient nonprofit clinics. So hopefully, there's  
25 a lot we can change on the reimbursement system in

2 and of itself, which needs to be fixed. So I totally  
3 agree with you on that point. And I just want to  
4 thank all of you for the work you're doing in the  
5 community. So thank you. Thank you.

6 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you to this panel. Our  
7 next in person panel will be Ruth Lowencron, Ramon  
8 Leclerc, Simone Gamble, Ari Kadesh, and Alexandra  
9 Nyman.

10 Alexandra, you may begin when ready.

11 Good afternoon Chair Lee, members of the  
12 Committees. My name is Alexandra Nyman and I serve  
13 as the CEO of the Break Free Foundation that provides  
14 scholarships for individuals suffering from substance  
15 use disorders, so that they can attend a  
16 rehabilitation and outpatient program at no cost to  
17 them. Thank you for this opportunity to testify.

18 It is my firm belief that involuntary mental  
19 health hospitalizations cause obstacles to quality,  
20 evidence-based mental health care by creating a fear  
21 of forced treatment and fraying a person's trust in  
22 the mental health care system.

23 A family member of mine went through this when  
24 they were in college due to being in mental health  
25 crisis, and being confronted by an officer instead of

2 a mental health professional did not remedy this  
3 situation but intensified it. This confrontation  
4 resulted in them having a severe panic attack as the  
5 officer was not equipped to de-escalate the  
6 situation, but kept escalating things to the point  
7 that my family member did not feel safe.

8 After the officer called an ambulance. My family  
9 member was rerouted twice to two different hospitals  
10 before they were able to get to the proper  
11 facilities, causing my family member to be worried  
12 and panicked about how much this ride would cost  
13 them, which should be the last thing that you're  
14 experiencing when you're going through a bout of  
15 mania.

16 Instead of finding relief during their  
17 hospitalization, for the first 24 hours, they sat on  
18 a stretcher in a hallway waiting for an open room to  
19 open up getting little to no sleep. They were not  
20 able to contact me so I had no idea where they were  
21 for roughly 72 hours.

22 When they got into a room and were admitted into  
23 the behavioral health unit, they were lumped in with  
24 patients of varying mental illnesses. There was  
25 chaos in the halls screaming throughout the

2 corridors, with medication shoved down their throat  
3 forcefully.

4 This shut my family member down from talking  
5 about the experience until after years of intensive  
6 therapy. While my family member did not have a co  
7 occurring disorder, which further exacerbates this  
8 dire issue, and is not an unhoused individual, they  
9 were not given the qualitative treatment they needed.

10 I'm lucky that they're still here with us and  
11 that they are in recovery to this day.

12 People who struggle with behavioral health issues  
13 are marginalized and face stigma that can lead to  
14 severe consequences. Chair Hanks and members of  
15 these esteemed committees, you must realize that this  
16 policy perpetuates the belief that many people hold  
17 that individuals with mental health issues are  
18 dangerous. But in reality, they're more likely to be  
19 victims of crime and excessive use of force by the  
20 police than to cause harm.

21 I urge this committee to put an end to this  
22 policy. In the words of my esteemed colleague, Matt  
23 Kudish, the CEO of The New York chapter of NAMI, the  
24 city has the power to provide on-site treatment as  
25 well as treatment in homeless shelters or supported

2 housing, but has chosen not to. The time to make  
3 these changes and to address the mental health crisis  
4 within our city is now, but causing generational  
5 trauma and the process and resistance to behavioral  
6 health care is not the way to go about it.

7 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today  
8 and your continued leadership and partnership. I can  
9 answer any questions you may have.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much and good  
11 person to quote Matt Kudish. I know him personally  
12 myself, so he's a wonderful human being.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Before we move on to the next  
14 panelist, Ruth, I apologize. I'm just going to call  
15 the remaining in-person registrants to see if they're  
16 here, and for them to come up and please get ready to  
17 testify. So Stephen Nathaniel Reesie, Kate Whitmore,  
18 Jason Bowen, Christine Henson, and Richard William  
19 Flores. If you're here, please come to the table and  
20 get ready to testify for-- following Ruth. Thank  
21 you. Ruth, you may begin when ready.

22 Thank you. Ruth Lowenkron. I'm the Director of  
23 the Disability Justice Program at New York Lawyers  
24 for the Public Interest. My office is a proud member  
25 of CCIT-NYC, Correct Crisis Intervention Today, New

2 York City. I just want to point out that that is  
3 constituted of over 80 organizations that advocate in  
4 this space, and I think it's a really good link to  
5 one of my profound comments. I have prepared my  
6 testimony, and will share it with you.

7 So you're going to get a little melange of  
8 summary. Having sat here all day, there has to be an  
9 advantage. I have all kinds of other thoughts that  
10 occurred to me. And one of them is: So not only are  
11 these ad organizations, or as my mother would say,  
12 "anyone who's anyone", is a member of CCIT-NYC. But  
13 have you ever been at a hearing where everybody has--  
14 speaks in the same voice and says no to what the  
15 Mayor is doing? I think it's profound. And I think  
16 that really has to be underscored. There isn't a  
17 single person, other than the city agency, and I want  
18 to say to follow with Skip said: I think it's not  
19 only an entire disrespect, that they are not here,  
20 but in an outrage beyond that. We are the taxpayers.  
21 They don't want to hear what we have to say on this?  
22 How dare they leave the room without listening to  
23 what we have to say, without listening to the fact  
24 that nobody supports what the Mayor says.

2 So that's one profundity. And the others are  
3 perhaps just summaries. As I said, outside, I think  
4 there is no doubt that this is not only immoral, it's  
5 illegal as my colleague Beth Haroules spoke about.  
6 There is litigation about this. It is not hard to  
7 see why it's illegal.

8 And I think I'm going to try and break it down  
9 just a little bit, and then put it together with  
10 testimony we heard from NYPD.

11 So what this policy allows is for the police to  
12 stop individuals whom they think may have a mental  
13 health illness -- they don't know, and how would they  
14 know, and how could they know? So they think they  
15 have mental health illness, and they think they are  
16 unable to take care of their basic needs, whatever  
17 that might mean, because lord knows it is not defined  
18 anywhere.

19 What is so critical is that this is an absolute  
20 departure from all law that says that if you want to  
21 -- if the city, the police want to detain an  
22 individual, they must show that the individual is a  
23 danger to themselves or others. There is no pretense  
24 to even the idea that we are saying that the person  
25 has a danger to self or others. Perhaps they do, but

2 very more so what if perhaps they don't? And I think  
3 it's very telling, when we got a list of examples.  
4 I've been going a whole time talking about the Mayor  
5 saying about kickboxing. Kickboxing? You're kidding  
6 me. How does that show someone's a danger to  
7 themselves? Well, today I heard the ultimate insult,  
8 or the ultimate incredulity, when the when the NYPD  
9 said oh, you know, if someone reeks of urine -- and  
10 then perhaps I didn't hear her right, so she repeated  
11 herself. So someone reeking from urine would be  
12 thought of to be a danger to themselves. I do  
13 imagine there could be certain circumstances when  
14 that's true. I have a vivid imagination. But that  
15 doesn't mean that we are hearing something that we  
16 can rely on in terms of what the NYPD is being  
17 trained. It is very, very scary. If that's their  
18 idea of who the people are that they can be picking  
19 up.

20 I know the bell is ringing. So I'm going to say  
21 just a few more things, I think it's really important  
22 to know that if you would like to see, in addition to  
23 the incredibly compelling experiences, we heard of  
24 people and their family members, what my office has  
25 done is obtained the body-worn camera footage of a

2 number of the individuals who are killed at the hands  
3 of the police when experiencing a mental health  
4 crisis.

5 Under the banner "picture worth 1000 words", it  
6 is incredible. As one person said, first they  
7 escalate. Well, I don't know if that person said  
8 that. First they escalate. And then when all else  
9 fails, and they shoot the individual -- here's the  
10 part we heard already -- then they don't even try to  
11 take care of the individual they've shot.

12 So listen, the other elephant in the room. Let's  
13 be real here, and others have talked about this.  
14 This is not about helping people with mental health  
15 issues. Because if it were, we know how to do it.  
16 We absolutely know how to do it. This is about  
17 sweeping people with mental health issues away, so  
18 the rest of the city does not have to look at them,  
19 so the rest of the city does not have to feel like,  
20 "Oh my goodness, we're somehow failing and, ooh, look  
21 at that person." Let's call it for what it is.  
22 That's exactly what it is, and know that if you  
23 called it really helping someone, you would have a  
24 plan.

2 And that goes to two other quick thoughts. One  
3 is, I want to correct the record, when Jason Hansen  
4 said that he worked with the community. Again, I am  
5 hugely part of that community. I do not know anyone  
6 who was consulted on this. I think this was done in  
7 secret. The police didn't even know about it, as  
8 we've all heard.

9 And the last thing I want to close with is  
10 another statistic that picks right up off of my  
11 colleagues statistic. And that is not only are  
12 people with mental health, more likely to be victims  
13 than perpetrators. But we think, because the  
14 newspaper inundates us, because the Mayor tells us  
15 it's so, because popular culture tells us it's so  
16 that those people, quotation marks, with mental  
17 health issues are hugely dangerous and violent.

18 Well, that just is not true. They are no more  
19 dangerous and violent than anyone else in the  
20 population with or without a diagnosis. And I think  
21 that's a hugely important statistic to leave with. I  
22 will stop shouting at you now.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, thank you for that. Thank  
24 you for that. And you're passionate as well, because  
25 I know NILPI has done a lot of work around this, and

2 so I really appreciate your efforts on this. So  
3 thank you.

4 MS. LOWNKRON: Thank you, Councilmember.

5 COUNSEL SUCHER: You may proceed next when you're  
6 ready.

7 MR. BOWEN: Hello? All right. Hi, everyone. My  
8 name is Jason Bowen, my pronouns are they/them, and I  
9 work as a peer advocate at the Community Access  
10 Crisis Respite.

11 So for a brief Intro for folks who might not  
12 know, again, what Respite is. Respite is meant to be  
13 an alternative to hospitalization for folks in  
14 crisis. It's meant to be a place where folks can  
15 come for short-term residential support. Everyone  
16 that works there is a peer, meaning we have our own  
17 lived experience. You know, we cook meals together,  
18 we do workshops. Sometimes I sit with folks and hold  
19 their hand while they cry. Sometimes we go on walks  
20 and look at the sun or look at the moon together.  
21 You know, it's really just an experience of being  
22 with each other. Really that bone deep, loving,  
23 caring on another person that is so, so needed.

24 And yet, you know, it's meant to be an  
25 alternative to hospitalization for folks in crisis.

2 And the respite center that I work at has an average  
3 waitlist of about five to eight weeks. Weeks. So  
4 people are calling, "I need somewhere to go now. I  
5 need crisis support." And it's constantly, "Well,  
6 you can try calling NYC-WELL. You can try calling  
7 988. You can try going to the hospital." Been  
8 there. Done that. I've tried it. It's not working.

9 You know, at the Respite that I work at, I just  
10 came off a 12 hour shift actually. I worked  
11 overnight last night. I worked 8pm to 8am this  
12 morning and came straight here. And I'm going back  
13 tomorrow. And that's because you know, for a place  
14 to function 24/7/365, you need staff. I'm-- I'm  
15 grateful to be 22 years old, and then I've got the  
16 stamina to work 12/24 hour shifts, but we shouldn't  
17 have to do this. We should not have to do this.

18 And the work that we're supposed to be providing  
19 as peers is emotional care and support. I chose to  
20 become a peer because you know, I-- I come from a  
21 family who has a history of intergenerational trauma.  
22 I have my own traumas. And I came to be a peer  
23 because I was lucky enough to go to school in the  
24 city, and when I was having my-- you know, going  
25 through my mental health experience as an undergrad,

2 I was essentially told, you know, that either I  
3 should drop out because I wasn't fit enough to be at  
4 school there, or that if I did have a crisis that the  
5 police or campus security were warranted to come into  
6 my room and hospitalize me.

7 So these routes of involuntary coercion, not care  
8 are not unique to this legislation, are not unique to  
9 this era. This is systemic. It is the basis of the  
10 mental health system in this country. I mean, we  
11 have to literally look historically.

12 The first diagnoses of psychology in this  
13 country, you can go back to 1861 journal reviews,  
14 Drake Domani was one of the first diagnoses that  
15 existed in modern psychiatry. What was that?  
16 Drapetomania was what enslavers could diagnose  
17 enslaved people who ran away from plantations with.  
18 They could be diagnosed with drapetomania and forced  
19 to return to a plantation.

20 This is the same roots of the way that police act  
21 now it's involuntarily committing people to  
22 hospitals, involuntarily putting people in carceral  
23 settings, depriving them of the care that they need.  
24 Care does not look like putting someone in a setting  
25 where they can't go home, they can't call their

2 family, their phone is taken away from them, their  
3 clothes are taken away from them. It's horrible.  
4 It's horrible.

5 And we can, you know, I talk to people inside  
6 our, you know, hospitals. I talk to people inside  
7 Rikers every day. And I encourage everyone, you  
8 know, if your family if you haven't gone to that, do  
9 talk to people. Build those relationships. You  
10 know, we need to fund our programs. We need to fund  
11 nonprofits. But also, we need to love on each other.

12 You know, I'm so privileged to have built up my  
13 you know, crisis response skills, my radical mental  
14 health first aid, I want-- you know, I volunteer at a  
15 community garden. I share these skills with the  
16 folks in my garden. I want everyone to go knock at  
17 your local bodega, to go knock at your local  
18 restaurants to say, "Do you know what to do if  
19 someone's experiencing a mental health crisis? Do  
20 you know tools to call besides 911? Do you know who  
21 to call in your neighborhood? If you're going  
22 through crisis, do you know what family members you  
23 can call?"

24 The some of the things we can do, you know, are  
25 so complicated, but there are so many things we can

2 do individually, and with your support and funding  
3 that are so simple, so implementable, so clear. I'm  
4 22, and I can see it clear as day and there are  
5 people who have been fighting so much longer than I  
6 have black, queer, trans, indigenous, ancestors who  
7 are fighting every day. And you know, that's all  
8 Thank you. Yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you for that. I have a  
10 couple of questions, but I'm going to wait until the  
11 panel finishes first and then-- go ahead.

12 COUNSEL SUCHER: Sure, you may begin when ready.

13 RICHARD: Sorry, I'm currently homeless. And I'm  
14 residing at the BRC shelter on 47th Street. I've  
15 been a resident there since October 21 of 2021.  
16 Before I became a resident there, the volunteers used  
17 to come to speak to me on the subway. I didn't know  
18 about the BRC. I didn't know about the Manhattan  
19 Conservatorium. I didn't know that these agencies  
20 existed. I went to the drop-in centers to try to  
21 receive help against my will, because I became  
22 homeless because a family court judge committed  
23 perjury. They literally lied in court. And that lie  
24 became me being homeless.

2 I had a lawyer appointed to me for free by the  
3 city whom I saw before the court date, and brought  
4 him documentation to show what was allegedly being  
5 said about myself and my family. And he told me that  
6 documentation didn't mean anything to him. He told  
7 me that I had to find a job in a month, and if I  
8 didn't find a job in a month, I would be homeless.  
9 And this is documentation that I had from the  
10 hospital, being hospitalized several times,  
11 Documentation showing what had happened in the home,  
12 documentation showing what had happened with the  
13 police. And he literally told me, that didn't  
14 matter. He said, "If you don't do this, you're going  
15 to become homeless." And so I became homeless.

16 When the volunteers saw me in the street, I  
17 became aware of the fact that they weren't just  
18 looking at me as being a statistic. They were  
19 looking at me as someone who would become a victim to  
20 the legislation in this country. And I said to  
21 myself, "Wow, what what am I supposed to do now? I  
22 went to court, I had a lawyer. Perjury was committed  
23 in court. And now I'm, I'm a homeless person." I've  
24 worked in the financial industry in the city. I've  
25 worked for Chase Bank. I've worked for Toronto

2 Dominion. I've worked for many, many banks. I know  
3 it's kind of long.

4 And what I'm trying to surmise is, what I think  
5 is not being addressed here by-- by the Mayor's  
6 policies is that how, how could he dare treat an  
7 American citizen like that? How could legislation be  
8 passed like that?

9 It's a question that I think about every single  
10 day. Now, you talked about services. You talked  
11 about people being taken away from the streets.  
12 Everyone's talked about the work that they've done  
13 here for people. The work that they do every day.  
14 What I-- what's amazingly dismaying to me is that the  
15 BRC is a phony agency. They abuse people there.  
16 They routinely use racist comments, discriminatory  
17 practices. I emailed the Mayor. They called me  
18 back. I emailed the governor, they sent two  
19 detectives to the BRC shelter who gave a false  
20 interview with me about my complaints about what had  
21 gone on there. And the detectives called me back and  
22 said, "Sir, we don't have any evidence of the  
23 allegations that you made." And I said to them,  
24 "Sir, if he's if what I'm saying didn't happen, why  
25 would I text you?"

2 Now this is being done under the banner of men of  
3 mental illness, schizophrenia, paranoia. And to be  
4 perfectly honest with you, it's a trick. And it's  
5 somebody that's being done on purpose to incarcerate  
6 people, to make people sick and kill people.

7 The mayor and the governor are well aware of this  
8 issue.

9 And I guess lastly, what I'd like to say is the  
10 Mayor and the governor have to be held accountable  
11 for the fact that they too, are committing perjury,  
12 and they're spreading lies, they're spreading racism,  
13 they're spreading discrimination under the banner of  
14 the law.

15 And this legislation has to be changed. It has  
16 to be revamped to help the people in the way that  
17 they really need to be helped, or else this is going  
18 to go on, and 20 years from now. The kids who have  
19 been affected the young people have been affected by  
20 the policies that are being put forth today, there'll  
21 be sitting before the next committee, talking about  
22 what's affecting them. And this is just going to go  
23 on and on and on, despite the efforts of all the  
24 people trying to make things better, despite the  
25 efforts of your committee trying to make things

2 better. The governor, the Mayor. It's almost as if  
3 it's almost absurd, like-- like, it doesn't really  
4 matter. They're saying that it matters, but yet it  
5 doesn't really matter. They're putting these  
6 policies forward without a true conviction, without--  
7 without a true plan.

8 I could sit with the Mayor, I love listening to  
9 the people here. Every single day, I would love to  
10 sit with him. And if he asked me, "Richard, do you  
11 have any solutions?" I could provide solutions.  
12 I'll say, "Sir, I'm the one that's living at the  
13 shelter, not you." Right?

14 He went to the shelter the other day to spend  
15 time with the migrants there. And he said the  
16 conditions were deplorable. He said the conditions  
17 were awful, et cetera.

18 I thought a lot of it was a political show to be  
19 to be quite honest with you. Because he's been mayor  
20 for quite some time. Governor Hochul has been here  
21 for quite some time. And the first thing you will  
22 look for, for them, is for them to be perfectly  
23 honest and factual about what's going on, and not  
24 play a semantical game or a political game about  
25 what's going on. They should just simply tell the

2 truth. And therefore, when the budget proposals are  
3 are made, that money is supposed to be used to  
4 actually help the people.

5 I testified to the New York Senate in 2020, to  
6 the entire Senate, and the budget proposal was being  
7 passed back then as well. I told him my personal  
8 story, I told them what I thought about what they  
9 were doing, I told them about what their policies  
10 were doing. When we returned back to New York, with  
11 the agency, the group that I was with, guess where I  
12 was? Out on the street. And I'd been on the street--  
13 - I was on the street for seven years, in bone  
14 chilling weather, cold blue weather, denied shelter  
15 at Bellevue, denied shelter at the drop-in centers.  
16 Seven years. And that's-- that's a very traumatizing  
17 thing for them to turn around and say, "Okay, now  
18 we're going to provide you services," it's almost  
19 adding insult to injury, you know? It's really  
20 absurd.

21 So, the reason why I wanted to testify today is  
22 because perhaps it might help yourself, and help the  
23 Mayor, and help the Governor try to think about what  
24 strategies are going to be used, and what would be  
25 useful, hearing it from someone who's actually living

2 it every single day, you know, and it's-- I have to  
3 say, it's one of the hardest things I've ever had to  
4 deal with in my entire life.

5 And if these testimonials are taken seriously,  
6 then I think everyone here would hope to see some  
7 change. And not just talking about it, but doing  
8 something about it. I think it's high time that they  
9 do something about it, if they want actual change to  
10 happen. If he was sitting here, right now, I could  
11 sit with him and tell him exactly what's going on  
12 there. And they're supposed to say, "Okay, this is  
13 what we're going to do. Now, this is what we're  
14 going to change because we want these people's lives  
15 to be better." It's not just housing, as everyone  
16 said. It's a comprehensive strategy that needs to be  
17 used and maintained. And so far, so far, that hasn't  
18 happened.

19 I would love to be able to speak to the Mayor and  
20 speak to the Governor in person, and have the kind of  
21 conversation that we're having right now. That's it.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Richard. And I'd  
23 like to have-- well, on a separate note, I'd like to  
24 talk to you separately about your situation. But it  
25 just seems like also, there's an opportunity here as

2 well, because there are so many great community  
3 partners that hopefully we'll be able to connect you  
4 with, that are right here in this room, not to put  
5 you on the spot. But you know, so to really get down  
6 to the to the root of it. And to see-- I mean, I  
7 know, it's just one example, but your case, I think,  
8 highlights a lot of the-- the issues that we need to  
9 work on and dissect. And so I just want to thank you  
10 so much for being here and taking the time to just  
11 testify, and for waiting until now to share your  
12 story. So I really appreciate that. And I just want  
13 to say thank you.

14 And then just to the other folks who are on the  
15 panel, something that you have brought up Jason was--  
16 and this is a question for anyone, actually. But one  
17 of the feedbacks that we-- we would hear all the time  
18 from THRIVE, the previous version, was the mental  
19 health first aid training was one of the things that  
20 did seem to work well.

21 And I know that for us also, when I was at my  
22 CBO, we actually reached out to our faith-based  
23 leaders in a lot of the immigrant communities that  
24 were first gen that typically would -- me growing up  
25 in the church, right? -- they would typically say

2 things like, "Oh, you just have to pray harder," or  
3 pray it away, right? And I was actually, to my  
4 surprise, pleasantly surprised, because they were  
5 almost like craving and hungering for that type of  
6 training. Because I think they knew and understood  
7 and realized that, you know, there is a difference,  
8 for example, between spiritual and mental health  
9 issues.

10 And I think, you know, not just the faith based  
11 communities, but other communities, like you're  
12 saying, in your community garden and other folks that  
13 are around, you know, is that-- you know, and we  
14 actually offered it and translated it ourselves  
15 because there was no one to translate it for us. And  
16 so we did this whole train-the-trainer model, and I'm  
17 just wondering if-- if that is an effective type of  
18 training that you think we should also implement, not  
19 just within the city agencies, and amongst the staff  
20 for example, but-- but also something that can be  
21 offered to any community member that's interested in  
22 it. So I just wanted to get your thoughts on that  
23 real quick.

24 MS. LOWENKRON: Hi. I have some thoughts on  
25 training. And I think it allows me to talk just a

2 little bit about the B-HEARD program, which I think  
3 has gotten a really good sell job, that it perhaps  
4 doesn't really deserve.

5 And one of the concerns -- just one of the many  
6 concerns -- is its failure to appropriately train or  
7 in any event, to let us know how any of that training  
8 has happened. It's very similar to what we're  
9 hearing with the Mayor's proposal, or better said  
10 policy, since it's in place, that there's training  
11 going on. And today we just heard, "Well, yeah,  
12 there's this video." There's not a whole lot of  
13 information about it.

14 And so having said that, and to respond to your  
15 question, I think the answer is that you absolutely  
16 have to make sure that you're doing training that is  
17 culturally sensitive, and you have to make sure that  
18 you are involving people who have lived experience in  
19 doing the training. You have to have a review of the  
20 training. How's that training going? I was I could  
21 barely hold myself back from screaming, when we were  
22 told about the CCIT training that someone had seven  
23 years ago. Well, who's going to remember that? So  
24 another important part is that, you know, repeated.

2 Exactly, yeah. So I think those are some of the  
3 hallmarks. I hope that's what you were asking.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No. No, it is. And also, just  
5 to reframe the question a little bit and feel free  
6 like, any of you, if there is an example of one that  
7 you would recommend?

8 MR. BOWEN: Yeah, so, um, well, I actually wanted  
9 to talk about two things. One is kind of a direct  
10 response to your question. One is just on the piece  
11 about police training in general, the CIT training.

12 You know, I think it just it gets tiring to hear  
13 the conversations about police training over and over  
14 again, after a while. I think-- I mean, we can look  
15 straight to what has already happened. And we can  
16 look to Minneapolis. Minneapolis in 2015, they were  
17 granted a \$4.5-- almost \$5 million grant, to invest  
18 in police reform, to invest in crisis intervention  
19 training. And yet, we still saw a video of eight  
20 minutes of kneeling on George Floyd's neck after you  
21 know, years of crisis intervention training. And I  
22 know this is not to the question you're asking.

23 But continuing to give resources to a system that  
24 is broken, the policing system was never meant to  
25 heal us. It was never meant to take care of us. It

2 was meant to, as you know, Ruth was talking about, it  
3 was meant to create public order, it was meant to  
4 exclude certain people from that idea of order. You  
5 know, giving more money to that system to eventually,  
6 you know, train itself to do it something better.

7 You know, as someone who works in mental health,  
8 I crave trainings, I desire to learn more, because I  
9 actually see, you know, people-- people in healing,  
10 people in struggle, people in growth as people, and I  
11 desire love to learn more. I love to learn ways to  
12 sit with them, and to be human and to be whole with  
13 them. And if it's an exhausting thing for someone to  
14 sit down for a 30 minute training, then, you know,  
15 maybe don't want their help in the first place.

16 And then just in terms of, you know, radical  
17 mental health first aid, I can speak for myself a  
18 little bit, and then, you know, offer some other  
19 thoughts. For me, you know, I mentioned I'm young.  
20 I really became more radicalized more politically  
21 aware, more aware of my own experiences, too, as  
22 someone who lives with, you know, what is called a  
23 serious quote/unquote, mental illness throughout the  
24 pandemic. And so for me, I turned to a lot of online  
25 spaces.

2 There's a really wonderful group called Project  
3 LETS, which is campus based peer-support collective  
4 that has now expanded to not only campus based. They  
5 also do research and a lot of anti carceral mental  
6 health response, but project LETS is a great group.  
7 Cat-911 is also an anti-carceral, community-based,  
8 radical mental health response based out of  
9 California, and they actually have an abolitionist  
10 mental health crisis rapid response, four-day  
11 training on YouTube for free. I was able to attend  
12 it live, but it's available on YouTube completely  
13 free. I've shared it with multiple members of my  
14 community before.

15 And you know, I do think that, you know, scaling  
16 up models of mental health first aid for our  
17 communities is super-duper essential. I just get  
18 wary when those things get delegated to, you know,  
19 positions like this.

20 You know, I think with the power that the City  
21 Council has, we live in not only the richest country,  
22 but one of the richest cities in the world, and I get  
23 tired of solutions that ask for so little. You know,  
24 it makes sense for when we're getting together with,  
25 you know, a few of our community members, and we're

2 trying our best. You know, we can only get-- you  
3 know, maybe we can't get the interpreter, we can't  
4 have someone to do things in multiple languages. But  
5 when the city with all of its resources is like,  
6 "Yeah, we're going to have this one training one  
7 time. It's only in one language. No ASL. No, you  
8 know, Spanish or Mandarin." It's-- it gets tiring.

9 So, yeah, I think those things are needed, but  
10 they need to be accessible for folks of all, you  
11 know, communities. You know, there needs to be  
12 childcare, et cetera. You know, I think if we're  
13 going to invest in those things, we should really  
14 invest in them. You know, dream for the world that  
15 we want to live in, not continue asking to get by  
16 with the bare minimum.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you for that. And yes, I  
18 was referring more to the, like the peer-led  
19 trainings, because I do think that I've seen those  
20 become really effective and impactful. So I just--  
21 but yes, I hear everything you're saying. So thank  
22 you. And I wanted to you wanted to also respond to  
23 that.

24 MS. LOWENKRON: I just want to say one quick  
25 thing. And that is that a really good model for the

2 training is what comes out of the CAHOOTS Model that  
3 I don't think was mentioned, that has been doing  
4 mental health crisis response for over 35 years with  
5 incredible success. And it's what the Daniels Law  
6 that has just been reintroduced at the state level is  
7 based on, and with a tweak that we've have of it,  
8 ensuring that it is peer-led, and they have their  
9 crisis response teams, about 75% peers.

10 What Daniels Law has is a mandate that there is,  
11 on every team up here, but the training from the  
12 CAHOOTS program, I think is really important.

13 MS. CHAIT: To piggyback off and that with a  
14 CAHOOTS, they responded to 17,700 911 calls in 2021,  
15 which was 17% of all of the 911 calls, which dealt  
16 with a mental health crisis. Here in New York, we  
17 average about 139,100 911 calls that deal with deep  
18 emotional distress, just to add to that.

19 MS. LOWENKRON: Yeah. And I hope you're not  
20 suggesting by that-- that it's that it's a-- I'm  
21 sorry?

22 I mean, yes, it's a smaller city, a smaller  
23 model, but it's being adopted in Los Angeles and San  
24 Francisco. Denver has a similar model. Albuquerque  
25 is moving towards that. So I mean, yes, we have to

2 scale it up. And CCIT NYC has a proposal. We've  
3 talked about it a lot, I'd be happy to talk more  
4 about it with you. But we definitely think it can be  
5 scaled up, and the sponsors of Daniels Law certainly  
6 think it can be scaled up.

7 So I'd love to talk to you more about that. But  
8 I just wanted to raise it in this context, as it--  
9 for its training, because they do extensive training  
10 of all of their workers.

11 MS. NYMAN: So as the peer run training that you  
12 also mentioned, I created a 35-hour training on  
13 [inaudible] intervention training. And it's all peer  
14 run. It is 35 hours, and is able-- I train the  
15 community members. I train New York City Parks  
16 Department and other people as well, and got  
17 certified in it.

18 As for your mental health first aid, I took the  
19 mental health first aid training. I really think  
20 it's effective. The only issues with it, it's it  
21 needs to be-- when you do any training, it has to be  
22 geared for a particular audience. So if you're  
23 training faith based organization, you have to put in  
24 some scripture in there. You know, if you're  
25 training people in the black community, you got to do

2 this scenario. You're training people from the  
3 Jewish community, you got to put a little spice in  
4 there too, just to make it relevant to that  
5 community, because then they can be able to  
6 understand, because it resonates with them. And then  
7 it's more applicable. You bring in like real current  
8 issues and you know, history or something, current  
9 events and a paper, make it relevant. And I think  
10 it's effective. Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you all so much. I  
12 appreciate you taking extra time.

13 MS. CHAIT: So I just kind of wanted to answer  
14 your question on that. One of my thoughts on  
15 training with religious leaders. It's something that  
16 I get very upset about personally. When-- when I was  
17 younger, my mother took my younger brother to talk to  
18 our Catholic priest, after he had come out to her as  
19 being gay. And he had told my brother that he would  
20 burn in hell, and that the only way that he could be  
21 saved was if he did not act on his urges. And he  
22 told him he could still come to church, but that you  
23 know, he might be corrupting the people around us.

24 And that led to his first of many suicide  
25 attempts. And so I think in training, these

2 religious leaders, we have to be very sensitive, and  
3 also make sure that when they're speaking, they're  
4 speaking to a wide variety of individuals that may go  
5 against their personal beliefs, but not to use those  
6 beliefs to pervert religious beliefs and the trust  
7 that their congregants have within them.

8 My mother suffers from OCD and depression. And  
9 she would seek counsel and advice after she lost my  
10 father, from our priest. And so she really thought  
11 she was doing the right thing in reaching out and  
12 talking, and she never imagined that that would  
13 happen.

14 I do also want to talk about a program that I  
15 know of that is not faith-based that addresses  
16 individuals with substance use disorders and co-  
17 occurring disorders. We have around 1.4 million New  
18 Yorkers that have a co-occurring disorder, which is  
19 around 7% of New Yorkers. Only around 10% of those  
20 individuals actually seek out and receive treatment  
21 for that. It can be for a multitude of different  
22 reasons, some people just don't really click with AA.  
23 Some people just want to try to medicate with  
24 substances for their mental health issues. And I  
25 have found that programs like Smart Recovery For The

2 Individual is something that is very helpful in  
3 giving you task-based things to do, instead of basing  
4 it on scripture. Which for some people that can feel  
5 more productive, because then you're taking these  
6 productive steps, you're learning these tools, you're  
7 not always having to go to a meeting and being like,  
8 "Yes, I'm an addict. I've been in recovery for X  
9 amount of time." You're owning your recovery, and  
10 you can come to these meetings, or you could stop  
11 going after you feel that you have properly learned  
12 in immerse yourself within the toolkit.

13 So yeah, that's my thoughts on that. And there's  
14 also the craft method of recovery for families, for  
15 friends, for peers to learn so that they could learn  
16 how to cope with their loved one who may be suffering  
17 from a substance use disorder or co-occurring  
18 disorder.

19 And just in general, I think that we should be  
20 offering more awareness on Narcan and fentanyl  
21 testing strips. These different things that may not  
22 seem to directly correlate with mental health. But  
23 it really does, because most people who are using  
24 substances they're doing so I'd be a place of  
25 profound pain. Yes, thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

3 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you to this panel. We  
4 will now move to remote testimony. For remote  
5 panels, I will be calling out groups of names. So  
6 maybe about three or four names at a time so you can  
7 prepare to testify. As a reminder, once your name is  
8 called a member of our staff will unmute you, so  
9 please accept the prompt before speaking.

10 Our first remote panel will be Jeremy Kidd,  
11 Sandra Gresl, and Deborah Berkman.

12 Jeremy, you may begin when ready. Thank you.

13 DR. KIDD: Good afternoon. My name is Dr. Jeremy  
14 Kidd. I'm an Addiction Psychiatrist at Columbia  
15 University, public sector outpatient psychiatrist in  
16 Washington Heights and Inwood. And I'm speaking to  
17 you today as President of the New York County  
18 Psychiatric Society, an organization representing  
19 over 1600 psychiatrists in New York City.

20 Our members work in a variety of settings,  
21 outpatient clinics, inpatient hospitals, emergency  
22 departments, jails, prisons, and homeless shelters.

23 I want to echo some of the points that have  
24 already been brought up today, but also to highlight  
25 what someone said earlier that I am profoundly

2 impressed at the number of organizations and  
3 individuals that have come out today to speak against  
4 this policy. And it makes me wonder who that Mayor's  
5 Office consulted before implementing this policy,  
6 because it certainly hasn't been any of our members  
7 that I've spoken with.

8 We at NYCPS wish to voice our concern about the  
9 Mayor's directive. While we agree with the Mayor  
10 that housing and mental health crises in our city  
11 require immediate action. We believe that this  
12 directive inappropriately over-relies on the NYPD and  
13 does not adequately address the root causes of  
14 homelessness or untreated mental illness.

15 We hope that City Council will provide oversight  
16 in three areas. First, New York State law already  
17 dictates that people can be admitted involuntarily to  
18 hospitals if they have a diagnosable mental illness,  
19 and are at risk of harming themselves or others due  
20 to that illness. However, when poverty and  
21 homelessness are the primary contributors to  
22 someone's inability to care for themselves,  
23 psychiatric hospitalization is not clinically  
24 warranted. And City Council can provide oversight to  
25 ensure that due process and civil rights are

2 protected during the implementation of this  
3 initiative.

4 Secondly, inpatient bed capacity as you've  
5 already heard in New York City is severely limited.  
6 Our members working in emergency departments report  
7 that patients who need psychiatric hospitalization  
8 frequently wait hours or even days for a bed to  
9 become available, and City Council can help us track  
10 the impact of the Mayor's directive on emergency  
11 departments.

12 I was also pleased to hear some of my psychiatry  
13 and emergency medicine colleagues sharing information  
14 about what's actually happening on the ground, as  
15 opposed to the idealized version of discharge  
16 planning and inpatient hospitalization prevented by  
17 some of the Administration officials earlier.  
18 Unhoused people with mental illness need stable  
19 affordable housing and a housing-first model, access  
20 to community based mental health care. Involuntary  
21 removal, emergency detention, and involuntary  
22 hospitalization provide none of these.

23 The pre-pandemic shortage of psychiatrists has  
24 only gotten worse. With many outpatient treatment  
25 programs unable to fill vacancies. City Council

2 oversight can determine whether the Mayor's directive  
3 results in people gaining access to housing and  
4 outpatient care. We do not believe that it has.

5 Earlier someone mentioned intensive mobile  
6 treatment assist programs like the ACT system. And  
7 that's a wonderful--

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Time expired.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: : No, I was just going to say  
10 take a couple of minutes to close out. I mean, a  
11 couple sentences sorry. Thank you.

12 DR. KIDD: So in summary, the New York County  
13 Psychiatric Society asks City Council to ensure that  
14 the Mayor's directive does not impede on the civil  
15 rights of unhoused individuals with mental illness,  
16 and to monitor the impact of this directive on  
17 already-crowded emergency rooms, and overtaxed  
18 outpatient mental health services.

19 We're happy to be a resource to the council in  
20 the Mayor during this process. Thank you for your  
21 time and attention to this important matter.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much for joining  
23 and staying on remotely.

24 COUNSEL SUCHER: Sandra Gresl, you may begin when  
25 ready.

2 MS. GRESL: Thank you. Good afternoon, and thank  
3 you to the joint committees and everyone  
4 participating in today's hearing. I appreciate your  
5 patience and endurance. My name is Sandra Gresl.  
6 I'm testifying today on behalf of the New York City  
7 Bar Association, where I currently serve as Co-Chair  
8 of the Social Welfare Law Committee. My testimony is  
9 also informed by my experiences as a senior staff  
10 attorney in the Mental Health Law Project at  
11 Mobilization for Justice.

12 The New York City Bar Association has submitted  
13 written testimony that outlines in greater detail our  
14 primary legal and policy concerns regarding the  
15 Mayor's new directive. The testimony reflects the  
16 expertise and insights of the Social Welfare Law  
17 Committee jointly with the Civil Bars Civil Rights  
18 Committee, Disability Law Committee, Mental Health  
19 Law Committee, and the New York City Affairs  
20 Committee.

21 First and foremost, I'm here today seeking the  
22 Council's support to secure a commitment from the  
23 Administration to halt its rushed implementation of  
24 the involuntary removal directive, and instead to  
25 take the time needed to meaningfully address the

2 serious concerns raised in response to this directive  
3 by individuals with lived experience of mental  
4 illness and or homelessness, and the larger medical,  
5 legal, and service provider communities.

6 I'll just briefly outline the City Bar's three  
7 primary areas of concern with this directive.

8 Firstly, as has been mentioned earlier, the  
9 directive allows involuntary removals for reasons  
10 that fall outside the scope of what is permitted by  
11 our state and federal constitution and related state  
12 mental health laws, and I'm referencing the expanded  
13 basic needs standard here.

14 Earlier, we had one city agency representative  
15 who said she was not prepared to comment on the legal  
16 reasoning underpinning that standard. And another  
17 city agency representative who stated that court  
18 counsel reviewed the directive but didn't offer any  
19 additional information or context as to their  
20 interpretation.

21 The Bar's said second concern is that the  
22 directive is at odds with the city's obligations  
23 under federal, state and city anti discrimination law  
24 and at least two distinct ways. Firstly, involuntary  
25 removals could deny people access to public spaces

2 such as the subway and the streets based on their  
3 mental illness, or the perception of it, and a much  
4 broader set of circumstances than is allowable under  
5 the Americans with Disabilities Act, and without any  
6 provision for a reasonable accommodation.

7 Second, the initiatives focus on hospitalization,  
8 and the absence of adequate and appropriate community  
9 based services is inconsistent with both federal law  
10 and aligned state commitments to ensure the  
11 availability of treatment options.

12 Our written testimony details the City Bar's  
13 perspective on each of these points. Further, we  
14 invite the city to use us as a resource and would  
15 welcome the opportunity to meet with the Council and  
16 city attorneys to discuss these issues further.

17 Thank you so much.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Sandra.

19 COUNSEL SUCHER: Next, Deborah Bergman. You may  
20 begin when ready.

21 MS. BERKMAN: Chairs, Councilmembers, and staff.  
22 Good afternoon and thank you for the opportunity to  
23 speak to you today and thank you for you know,  
24 hanging in there for so long and waiting for our  
25 testimony. My name is Deborah Berkman, and I'm the

2 Supervising Attorney of the Shelter Advocacy  
3 Initiative at the New York Legal Assistance Group.

4 I've worked with numerous people experiencing  
5 street homelessness, who live in fear of being  
6 incarcerated because they are impoverished, and I've  
7 represented several individuals who have been  
8 subjected to involuntary removal. The mayor's  
9 current initiative criminalizes poverty and twists  
10 the standards of the Mental Hygiene Laws.

11 Additionally, it won't be effective at mitigating  
12 street homelessness. Mental Hygiene Law Section 941  
13 authorizes removal if a person appears to be mentally  
14 ill and is conducting himself in a manner which is  
15 likely to result in serious harm to himself or  
16 others. But the law specifically states that  
17 examples of likelihood to result in serious harm or  
18 threats of or attempted suicide, or homicidal or  
19 other violent behavior. These examples refer the  
20 spoken threats of physical harm.

21 The city's published guidelines. On this  
22 section, twist the definition of likely to result in  
23 serious harm to himself or others to mean a person  
24 who appears to be mentally ill and displays an  
25

2 inability to meet basic living needs, even when no  
3 recent dangerous act has been observed.

4 The city's guidance goes on to state that if a  
5 person appears to have mental illness and can't  
6 support their basic human needs, to an extent that  
7 causes them harm, they may be moved for evaluation.

8 That's a gross misreading of the words of the Mental  
9 Hygiene Law. Even more egregious in the NYPD's  
10 communication to its officers about this directive it  
11 uses as an example of someone appropriate for  
12 involuntary removal to be someone who appears  
13 mentally ill, and is not able to seek out food,  
14 shelter, and other things needed for survival.

15 This is nothing short of a declaration that  
16 extreme poverty constitutes grounds for involuntary  
17 removal, and Mental Hygiene Law Section 941 makes no  
18 mention of poverty being a factor to consider when  
19 determining whether involuntary removal is  
20 appropriate. Sleeping outside is not evidence of  
21 mental illness. It's a function of lack of resources  
22 and a fear of congregate shelter. In fact, the  
23 majority of my clients experiencing street  
24 homelessness have tried to stay in DHS congregate  
25 single adult shelters, and haven't been able to

2 remain there due to assault and trauma they endured  
3 while they were there. Quite simply, they are too  
4 scared to go back.

5 Ordering the hospitalization of people deemed to  
6 mentally ill to care for themselves, even if they do  
7 not pose a threat is not only cruel and inhumane, but  
8 will also undoubtedly be ineffective at helping  
9 people transition to inside.

10 I have two clients who had been removed, and  
11 neither left their sleeping spots permanently.

12 My first client Mr. V was escorted by an  
13 ambulance purportedly because he needed help. On the  
14 ride to the hospital Mr. V conversed with the EMTs  
15 and once the ambulance reached the hospital, the  
16 impatient EMTs released him before he even made it  
17 into assessment, presumably because they believed he  
18 was not a danger to himself or others. He then  
19 returned to his usual sleeping spot.

20 My other client was admitted to the hospital for  
21 two days after involuntary move removal but  
22 immediately returned to his old sleeping spot. In  
23 order to truly mitigate street homelessness, the City  
24 must create low barrier shelters with small rooms  
25 that are more accessible. Most of my clients who are

2 experiencing street homelessness would and do come  
3 inside when offered such placements. Thank you for  
4 the opportunity to speak.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much Deborah, and  
6 for the work that NYLAG is doing. Appreciate it.

7 COUNSEL SUCHER: Next we'll hear from -- I'll go  
8 through the names: Lauren Galloway from the  
9 Coalition for Homeless Youth, and then Carolyn  
10 Strudwick from Safe Horizon, and then Erick Eiting,  
11 and then Sam Cukoscka.

12 Lauren Galloway, you may begin when ready.

13 MS. GALLOWAY: Well, good evening. My name is  
14 Lauren Galloway, she/they, and I'm the Advocacy  
15 Coordinator at the Coalition for Homeless Youth. CHY  
16 has advocated for the needs of runaway and homeless  
17 youth, known as RHY, in New York State for almost 45  
18 years.

19 Thank you to Chair Lee and the rest of the  
20 Committee for holding today's hearing on the mental  
21 health involuntary removal, and Mayor Adams' recently  
22 announced plan.

23 I'll be submitting longer written testimony to  
24 address the mental needs of homeless youth and young  
25 adults, but like many nonprofits and other sectors,

2 runaway and homeless youth, RHY, providers and the  
3 majority of whom are funded by DYCD, echo the  
4 concerns raised by many legal service organizations  
5 that the city's broad language and the NYC removals  
6 directly would allow removals that are unjustified  
7 under the US Constitution and state mental health  
8 law.

9 The city's language announcing this initiative  
10 both reflects and will exacerbate biases against  
11 unhoused young people and young people with Serious  
12 Mental Illness in violation of the anti  
13 discrimination principles, and the NYC removals  
14 directives will disproportionately affect people of  
15 color.

16 This initiative directs resources into a failed  
17 strategy at a time when the city has reduced  
18 investments and effective strategies that connect  
19 people to long-term treatment and care, and this plan  
20 fails to address what the Mayor is proposing  
21 regarding youth specifically. CFY has no comments  
22 regarding the legislation being discussed. We would  
23 like to briefly outline some concerns and  
24 recommendations regarding youth and young adults that  
25 will be impacted by the Mayor's plan.

2 First recommendation: There are currently no  
3 mental health shelters, and currently DYCD RHY  
4 programs are not funded to provide this level of  
5 clinical services that many youth need. Therefore  
6 funding for mental services at RHY shelters needs to  
7 be prioritized.

8 Second, RHY providers encounter barriers when  
9 referring youth to supportive housing, or inpatient  
10 clinical services. The city must improve its  
11 coordination through the CAP system to ensure that  
12 youth regarding long-term and permanent housing that  
13 supports mental health needs to improve.

14 Third, there needs to be a clear policy regarding  
15 what training is responding to the entities that are  
16 providing services to RHY. I'm talking about NYPD,  
17 FDNY, and EMS.

18 Fourth, there needs to be a coordinated discharge  
19 plan between DYCD providers and the hospital. And  
20 lastly, there needs to be a plan regarding how minors  
21 will be treated under, this plan specifically those  
22 that are involuntarily committed and could be  
23 negatively impacted if communication and discharge  
24 from psychiatric services are linked to returning to  
25 unsafe home environments that they are like

2 previously led. This plan must account for youth  
3 that are not served through ACS. I'm here if you  
4 have any questions, and thank you and I look forward  
5 to our continued partnership.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Just one  
7 quick question. You said you guys receive funding  
8 from DYCD. Is that correct?

9 MS. GALLOWAY: Well, we're the Coalition for  
10 Homeless Youth, so we have over 65 providers, 29  
11 right here in the city, and those are all funded  
12 through DYCD.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Got it. Thank you.

14 MS. GALLOWAY: Yeah, of course.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: And thank you so much for the  
16 work you're doing, because the youth piece is  
17 something we don't talk enough about. So thank you

18 MS. GALLOWAY: Completely agree, Councilmember  
19 Lee. Thank you also for sticking around. I  
20 appreciate you.

21 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you. Next we'll hear from  
22 Carolyn Strudwick from Safe Horizon. You may begin  
23 when ready.

24 MS. STRUDWICK: Good afternoon, and thank you for  
25 the opportunity to provide this testimony. My name

2 is Carolyn Strudwick. I'm the Associate Vice  
3 President for Street Work Project, the homeless youth  
4 program at Safe Horizon. And my colleague Lauren and  
5 others touched on many pieces, so I won't be  
6 repetitive, thank you.

7 But what I want to highlight is why the  
8 Administration's plan directs resources in a failed  
9 strategy for youth, is that the Administration is  
10 approaching this homeless crisis with the mindset  
11 that unhoused youth are refusing support, rather than  
12 seeing an understanding that our current systems are  
13 vastly inadequate.

14 What we have is structural violence unattended.  
15 What we're dealing with is systemic racism. And the  
16 majority of homeless youth are obviously,  
17 disproportionately youth of color. Our system  
18 already to view RHY suspiciously, and that young  
19 people of color are actually a proxy for criminality.  
20 And what the thing is that what we have been facing  
21 as providers is unnecessary obstacles in terms of  
22 getting adequate housing, supportive and permanent  
23 housing for young people on the streets. And most  
24 importantly, what we have a major concern with is the  
25 Administration plan to use police officers to engage

2 with youth of color. Too many of our clients for  
3 NYPD does not represent a safe response. RHY people  
4 have been violated, from when they've been young.  
5 They have witnessed trauma and abuse in their own  
6 neighborhoods at the hands of police. And the bottom  
7 line is that we fear that interaction between police  
8 officers and young people would only lead to an  
9 increased violence and death. We have experienced  
10 this firsthand at Street Work Project, where we lost  
11 our client, David Felix, an unarmed young man who was  
12 running from the police, and was murdered by NYPD.

13 Another incident took place when NYPD entered our  
14 premises because we were forced to call 911. They  
15 came in riot gears, pinned the young person down.  
16 Staff had to deescalate the situation. We lost that  
17 young person to our service because they no longer  
18 felt safe to come to our program.

19 The police response is counterproductive to the  
20 therapeutic services and support we're trying to give  
21 marginalized and already traumatized young people.  
22 Safe Horizon does not support police response. And  
23 what the Administration needs to do is prioritize  
24 resources towards safe, permanent housing, create  
25 structures and communities that give proper mental

2 health, school and educational opportunities, decent  
3 paying jobs, and peers in community centers to help  
4 build youth, not over-policing of our environment.

5 We need to learn from the history of our country  
6 and understand where racism plays a role. I need the  
7 Mayor to understand, and he's a man of color, I know  
8 he's police, but we need to understand systemic  
9 racism is the issue here, not policing our  
10 communities. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

12 COUNSEL SUCHER: All right. Next, we're going to  
13 call Erick Eiting. You may begin once ready, thank  
14 you.

15 DR. EITING: Thank you. My name is Erick Eiting,  
16 and I'm President of the New York County Medical  
17 Society. In addition, I run a training program for  
18 LGBTQ medicine. And I'm also a medical director for  
19 an emergency department and a frontline emergency  
20 physician. But I'm here speaking on behalf of the  
21 New York County Medical Society, not on behalf of my-  
22 - it is clear that we're seeing an increase in the  
23 number of mental health conditions that we're seeing  
24 across the city and across the nation, tThat's both  
25

2 in new diagnoses, and also in people who are having a  
3 worsening and deterioration of existing conditions.

4 The emergency department is a great place for us  
5 to be able to address your acute life-threatening  
6 conditions. But it is the wrong place to address  
7 your chronic issues that don't give-- have limited  
8 abilities for us to intervene.

9 When I think of a an analogy, right? It's  
10 somebody who's having an acute severe asthma  
11 exacerbation, who maybe perhaps needs to be on a  
12 ventilator or needs multiple doses of medications in  
13 a very short period of time, the emergency department  
14 is a great place to be. But somebody who's suffering  
15 from severe chronic asthma and doesn't have access to  
16 medications, is living in a housing environment that  
17 is triggering their asthma to go off, and really  
18 isn't helping you to deal with the underlying  
19 conditions, the emergency department is not the right  
20 place to be.

21 We've had several conversations with elected  
22 officials across the city and state and one of the  
23 comments that was brought up with somebody suggested  
24 that patients would come into the front door of the  
25 emergency department and then 20 minutes later go out

2 the side door. And I had to say, "I don't know that  
3 that's a that's an incorrect analysis for what ends  
4 up happening," because we don't have the tools and  
5 are really not the right setting to be truly  
6 addressing some of the issues that are happening  
7 here.

8 I just want to paint a picture of what happens.  
9 And I know some previous speakers have brought this  
10 up. But you know, it's not uncommon for a patient  
11 who involuntary is brought into the emergency  
12 department for them to be upset, for them to be  
13 agitated. In fact, there are times when we've had to  
14 provide sedating medications, because they're so  
15 upset about what's going on. And we've even seen  
16 healthcare workers get injured, because people had  
17 been really disappointed.

18 And I think the biggest and hardest part to see  
19 is when patients see health care workers then as part  
20 of this failed system that really hasn't helped them  
21 address their underlying conditions, and then it  
22 becomes that much more difficult, if not impossible  
23 to engage these patients. So, so it actually becomes  
24 a situation in which can be dangerous.

2 It really is all about making sure that we come  
3 up with a model where we can meet patients where  
4 they're at. And that starts with the three pronged  
5 approach.

6 One is enhancing outreach teams. We want to make  
7 sure that we're able to engage our patients, meet  
8 them while they're at, understand what their issues  
9 are, collect information, truly understand the  
10 barriers, and be able to provide patients with those  
11 linkages to care that are so important to make sure  
12 that --

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your time has  
14 expired.

15 DR. EITING: So the last thing that I want to  
16 bring up as part of the model is mental health urgent  
17 cares. This was a model that we used when I worked  
18 in Los Angeles County and I think that there's  
19 tremendous promise in there.

20 So thank you, everyone for-- for putting this  
21 hearing together this has been a long day, but really  
22 important and great testimony and we appreciate the  
23 opportunity to continue to work with you in the  
24 future.

25 Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, thank you so much, and  
3 thanks for bringing up the mental health urgent cares  
4 because I don't think that has actually been brought  
5 up today, and that's an important point to make. So  
6 I just want to thank you for that.

7 COUNSEL SUCHER: Great. I'm going to call some  
8 names if you're here either please come up to testify  
9 or raise your hand on Zoom. Ramon Leclerc. Simone,  
10 Gamble, Cal Hedigan, Ari Kaddish, Kate Sugarman, Amy  
11 Doron, Eileen Mayer, Lucena Clark, Christine Henson,  
12 Steven Nathaniel Reesie, Kate Whitmore, and Sam  
13 Kokoschka. If you're in person or on Zoom, please  
14 raise your hand indicate that you're here.

15 Okay. Lastly, if there's anyone present in the  
16 room or on Zoom that hasn't had the opportunity to  
17 testify yet, please raise your hand.

18 Okay, seeing no one else, I would like to note  
19 that written testimony which will be reviewed in full  
20 by committee staff -- I can't stress that enough; we  
21 do read every single piece of written testimony that  
22 is submitted -- maybe submitted up to the record up  
23 to 72 hours after the close of this hearing by  
24 emailing it to [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). Chair Lee,  
25 we have concluded public testimony for this hearing.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And I just want to  
3 say again, thank you to everyone who has testified  
4 and for sharing your personal stories, lived  
5 experiences, and it's been really incredibly amazing  
6 hearing everyone's feedback. And so I have my notes,  
7 lots of notes, and so we will definitely take it  
8 back, and this-- this is something that we will  
9 continue as an ongoing conversation.

10 So thank you all to those that are here  
11 presently, a few folks, and then also online as well.

12 So thank you, and with that-- how many times do I  
13 gavel? Okay, I'm going to gavel out and close it.

14 Thank you.

15 [GAVEL]

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 02/13/2023