CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----- X

February 8, 2023 Start: 10:24 a.m. Recess: 12:58 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - COMMITTEE ROOM, 14TH

FLOOR

B E F O R E: Kevin C. Riley, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Erik D. Bottcher
David M. Carr
Farah N. Louis
Francisco P. Moya
Lynn C. Schulman
Oswald Feliz
Kalman Yeger

### APPEARANCES

Emanuel Kokinakis, Mega Group Development

Michelle Ponce, Mega Group Development

Cal Hedigan, CEO Community Access

Joseph Sbarro, Akerman LLP

Thomas Furman

Eunia Destine-Latinwo, Vice President of 1199 SEIU

Paul Regoord, Community Healthcare Network

Cynthia Stuart, Chief Operating Officer of Supportive Housing of New York

Kalisha Reid

Irene Lugo

Eric Palatnik, PC

Pastor Harold Beard, Associate Pastor Coney Island Cathedral

Reverend Frank Mason, Senior Pastor Christ Temple United Baptist Church

Tiara Williams, Local 79

Alvaro Gonzalez, Local 79

Beth Antibi

Joseph Martini

# A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Eli Kady

Albert Turejo

Reuben (INAUDIBLE)

Mordechai Sharaby

Meyer Elnadav

Yaakov Kaplan

Jack Braha

Elizabeth Denys

Mark Grippo

Isaac Magraby

Miriam Klein

Elad Danino

Marvin Schlanger

Lawrence Dayan

Jane Choueka

Joyce Chabbott

Logan Phares, Political Director of Open New York

Daniel Setton

David Masrou

Chancy Blumenfrucht

Sam Levy-Kadi

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Meir Erani

Jennifer Halfon

Freida Choueka

Robert Eissenberg

Murray Choueka

Linda Dayan

Bishop Waylyn Hobbs

Seema Stein

Avi Greenberger

Eliyahu Setton

Tery Blatt

Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and
3 welcome to the New York City hybrid hearing on the

Please silence all electronic devices to vibrate.

Chair, we are ready to begin.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Good morning and welcome to a meeting of the Subcommittee of Zoning and Franchises. I am Council Member Lynn Schulman. I'm going to be the temporary Chair of the Subcommittee until our Chair arrives.

This morning I am joined by Council

Members Erik Bottcher, Farah Louis, Council Member

Carr, Council Member Moya, and Council Member Hanks.

Today, we will hold public hearings for two rezoning proposals, one in the Bronx and one in Brooklyn. Before we begin, I recognize the Subcommittee Counsel to review the hearing procedures.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: Thank

you, Chair Schulman. I am Angelina Martinez-Rubio,

Counsel to the Subcommittee. This meeting is being

held in hybrid format. Members of the public who wish

to testify may testify in person or via Zoom. Members

of the public wishing to testify remotely may register may visiting the New York City Council website at <a href="https://www.council.nyc.gov/landuse">www.council.nyc.gov/landuse</a> to sign up or, for those of you here in the Chambers, please see one of the Sergeants-at-Arms to prepare and submit a speaker card. I would just also say that we're going to start with East Tremont so if there's anyone here to testify for that item that has not signed up with one of the Sergeants, please see one of them so you can fill out a card.

2.2

2.3

Members of the public may also view a livestream broadcast of this meeting at the Council's website.

When you called to testify before the Subcommittee, if you are joining us remotely, you will remain muted until recognized by the Chair or I to speak. When the Chair or I recognizes you, your microphone will be unmuted. Please take a moment to check your device and confirm that your mic is on before you begin speaking. We will limit public testimony to two minutes per witness. If you have additional testimony you would like the Subcommittee to consider or if you have written testimony you would like to submit instead of appearing before the

zoning map amendment to rezone an existing C4-5X, M1-

Community Access, not Chris Lacovara.

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: Okay, so thank you. For those of you, can you please raise your right hand so that I can administer the affirmation?

Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this Subcommittee and in your answers to all Council Member questions?

ADMINISTRATION: (INAUDIBLE)

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: Thank you.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you.

For the viewing public, if you need an accessible version of this presentation, please send an email request to <a href="mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov">landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov</a>. Now, the applicant team may begin. Panelists, as you begin, I'll just ask you to please restate your name and organization for the record when you speak. Thank you.

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: Good morning, Council
Members. Thank you for having us this morning. My
name is Emanuel Kokinakis with Mega Group
Development, and we're very excited to present the
521 East Tremont Rezoning. This project is a 100

another not-for-profit organization that will operate

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 12

the federally qualified health center and will also
own that health center in the long-term. Mega Group

Development and Mega Contracting are your development
and building partners for this project, and we have

6 | SLCE Architects as our project architect. Next slide,

7 please.

2.2

2.3

Community Access is a not-for-profit firm. They've been serving the city for nearly 50 years and have well over 1,000 units in development that they own and operate and provide property management services and on-site supportive services for. They also provide other services for Bronx residents at their multiple projects that exist in the Bronx. Next slide.

Community Healthcare Network is a federally qualified health center with 14 facilities throughout the city. They serve over 60,000 New York City residents on an annual basis. They're actually a current tenant at the site where they serve nearly 4,000 Bronx residents and will be able to significantly expand those services with a brand new facility that will be developed here. Next slide, please.

We can go to the next slide.

Mega is an affordable housing builder with over 30 years of experience building affordable housing throughout the boroughs and has worked with all the team members on this project on other projects so this team has worked together and been successful in completing other affordable housing in the Bronx and throughout the boroughs. Next slide, please.

SLCE Architects has been around since
1940. Vast experience in affordable housing design
and a lot of other prominent buildings throughout the
city. One notably is the Woolworth Building a block
away, and all team members have had great experience
working with SLCE in the past on other projects. Next
slide.

 $\label{eq:continuous_continuous$ 

JOSEPH SBARRO: Good morning, Council
Members. Joseph Sbarro from Akerman, LLP, Land Use
Counsel representing the applicant. I'll quickly
introduce the application to be followed by Michelle
Ponce from Mega Development and Cal Hedigan from
Community Access who will provide more detail on the

2.2

2.3

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.2

2.3

please.

transformational mixed-use development to be
facilitated by this land use application.

This slide shows the rezoning area and the development site's location on a prominent corner of East Tremont Avenue and 3rd Avenue, both wide streets across from Walter Gladwin Park. The site is well-served by public transit including the Bx15 bus which runs along 3rd Avenue and 125th Street and the Bx40 bus and the Bx42 bus, both of which run along East Tremont Avenue. The Tremont Avenue B/D subway station is located approximately 0.6 miles northwest and the Tremont Metro North station is located approximately 0.2 miles to the west. Next slide,

This slide shows the development site within the context of the neighborhood. The surrounding area is generally characterized by a mix of uses including residential, commercial, and a range of building heights. You can see her just to the south on 3rd Avenue another 100 percent affordable development recently completed by Mega, the Wilfrid. Next slide, please.

This slide shows photos of the current conditions at the development site which consists of

2.2

2.3

please.

four underutilized tax slots. One is unimproved and vacant, one is a commercial parking lot, and the building on the corner is a three-story commercial and community facility building that houses retail use on the ground floor and Community Healthcare Network on the second floor. The third floor is vacant. The remaining lot is a one-story commercial building with smaller retail tenants all with expiring or month-to-month leases. Next slide,

This slide shows the existing zoning map and notes the proposed change from the existing C4- 5X/R7X equivalent and 1-4/R7A and R6A zoning districts to a C4-4D/R8 equivalent zoning district. Next slide, please.

This application proposes a zoning map change and zoning text amendment to establish a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing area Option 1 to replace the current Voluntary Inclusionary Housing designated area. It's important to note that the current zoning permits mixed-use development up to 5.0 FAR and 12 stories. The proposed rezoning coupled with the MIH designation would permit a moderate increase in density up to 7.2 FAR and an additional

2.2

2.3

detail.

two stories in height. The proposed land use actions are necessary to provide for a feasible affordable housing program while also permitting two full floors of commercial and community facility to accommodate a vibrant retail frontage and a significant expansion of Community Healthcare Network's operations in the neighborhood. I'll now turn it over to Michelle Ponce from Mega to discuss the proposed development in more

MICHELLE PONCE: Thank you, Joe. My name is Michelle Ponce. I am a Project Manager at Mega Group Development. Good morning, Chair and Council Members, and thank you for the opportunity to discuss the 521 East Tremont Avenue Rezoning in more detail. Next slide, please.

As my Colleague, Joe, mentioned, we're asking for a rezoning that will facilitate additional density and a modest height increase of two floors which will allow us to address community needs through the project, highlighting specifically a Community District 6 2021 report where they cited issues concerning homelessness, health, and crime. This project will deliver on those community concerns by providing affordable housing and a significant

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 expansion of the Community Healthcare Network which

3 you'll hear in more detail from my Colleague, Paul,

4 from CHN during the public testimony piece, but also

5 building on our experience at the Wilfrid down the

6 block at 1880 Bathgate Avenue, we received over

7 35,000 applications for the affordable housing

lottery, at least 7,000 of which were from residents

9 of Community District 6. Next slide, please.

The proposed development that our team is here to discuss has four components. The first is the residential. We are going to build approximately 205 100 percent affordable units. You'll hear more about the unit mix and the households from my Colleague, Cal. The second is a Community Healthcare Network expansion. As we mentioned already, CHN currently exists on the site. They've been operating since 2011. They currently house 3,800 square feet. This rezoning will allow for an expansion up to 10,000 square feet which is going to allow them to increase the amount of services that they provide, a new service would be dentistry, and they're going to be able to double the amount of patients that they see. They'll have the second floor and have a ground floor lobby entrance. The third floor is the ground floor

2 retail. We will also have a ground floor retail

3 that's going to be approximately 12,900 square feet.

4 It'll wrap around East Tremont and 3rd Avenue, which

5 | is again a prominent commercial corridor in the area

6 and will also help revitalize the commercial corridor

7 as we've heard many times from community members

8 throughout our public engagement process that they'd

9 | like to see. The last component is parking where we

10 will have 17 surface parking spaces and approximately

11 | 103 bicycle parking spaces in the bicycle room. Next

12 slide.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

With the rezoning and the construction of the project, there will be a local economic development impact in the community. The first is through construction. The team is expecting to employ approximately 350 workers through all trades and subcontractors. Our team also has an excellent track record of success with local hiring and maximizing M/WBE hiring through our partnerships with organizations like Hire NYC, and we're also super excited to be providing OSHA-40 trainings to members of the community in the area that are interested in getting their OSHA certification. Also through permanent operations, the local economic development

2 | impact, CHN is going to expand their current 10 staff

3 | to approximately 35. The building, itself, is

4 expected to employ approximately 10 new people

5 through the building operations and through Community

6 Access social service staff, and the new ground floor

7 retail is expected to generate approximately 38 new

8 jobs for the community. Next slide, please.

Now, I'll just go through more physical descriptions of the project. Here, we have a site plan. As you can see, the building has frontage along East Tremont and 3rd Avenues. We have an inverted L-shape. The building would be 14 stories, and you can see the parking in the rear. That would be accessed from Bathgate Avenue, addressing any concerns that there might be too much congestion either on Tremont or 3rd Avenue. Next slide, please.

Here we have a rendering of the project.

This view is from Walter Gladwin Park. As you can see here, the building, we have frontage along Tremont and 3rd Avenue, and you can see some of the setbacks that we have on the 11th and 13th floors. These upper floors will have green roofs and will have an accessible outdoor space on the second floor for the

1

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

### SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.2

2.3

2 residents that will be accessed through a community 3 room. Next slide, please.

Here we have the view from 3rd Avenue.

I'd like to point out here that we have separate entrances for the residential and for CHN space, but, again, we can also see the setbacks on the 11th and 13th floors. Next slide, please.

Lastly, we have here the aerial view of the project. Again, you can see frontage along

Tremont and 3rd Avenue as well as all the setbacks on the building across the 11th and 13th floors. Also, down the block, if you can see just down 3rd Avenue and Bathgate, that is the Wilfrid where Mega was builder/developer as well.

With this slide, that concludes my portion. I'm going to pass it along to my Colleague, Cal Hedigan, from Community Access. Thank you.

CAL HEDIGAN: Hi. My name is Cal Hedigan.

I'm the CEO of Community Access, and we're really excited to be part of this development. Just to go into a little more detail on the residential units, next slide please.

Of the 205 units, 143 of them will be housing units for households earning between 30

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2.2

2.3

superintendent which really in our experience really adds to higher quality maintenance and upkeep of the building.

Now, I believe I'm turning it over to someone else.

Thank you very much for hearing our presentation, and we're open for...

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: So what I'm going to do first is I want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Feliz. I'm going to ask him to make any opening statement he has, I'll ask some questions, and then hand it back over to him to ask questions.

everyone. I'm Council Member Oswald Feliz. My opening statements are very brief. Just want to thank all of you for presenting about this project and also want to thank all of you for being very accessible. We've had hours and hours and hours of conversations about how to improve this project and how to make it work for everyone in the community, and we're very thankful for that. Thank you.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Okay, I have a few questions for the applicant team regarding

2.2

2.3

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: We're getting additional roughly 60 units, and we went through early exercises with HPD for project feasibility to make the financing work so that's why we're seeking the rezoning to get a density and a bulk that allows us to have the project financially feasible.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you.

How does this rezoning impact the Community

Healthcare Network's ability to support its work and
mission here in the Bronx?

MICHELLE PONCE: The Community Healthcare

Network right now currently has the second floor.

It's subpar conditions, and it's impacting their

daily operations. During construction, they're going

to be temporarily operating down the block at 1880

Bathgate Avenue at the Wilfrid so they won't have any
interruption in services, and, once construction is

completed, they'll be able to move back into a 10,000

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 24
square foot new facility that's going to have an
additional four exam rooms and three dentistry room.

Dentistry is going to be a new service that the
current Tremont residents do not have.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you.

This application proposes 100 percent affordability.

Where do conversations stand with HPD on supporting
the development of this proposal and what term sheet
is being sought to make this building a reality?

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: We've had multiple conversations with HPD. They're fully aware of the project, and we'd be utilizing the ELLA term sheet.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Okay. I now turn it over to Council Member Feliz to ask questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you so much,
Chair Schulman. A few questions. The first one was
why is the rezoning to the project and you mentioned
feasibility. How or why is it not feasible to build
the current project including expanding the
healthcare facility under the current rezoning? If
I'm correct, the East Tremont section of this part of
the Bronx was rezoned approximately 10 years ago, and

2.2

2.3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 it was drastically rezoned so why is it not feasible
3 to build under the current zoning?

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: Thank you, Council Member. The area was rezoned in 2010. We are looking to facilitate many community needs here including expanding or refreshing the ground floor retail so maintaining that as well as expanding Community Healthcare Network's healthcare services to the community on the second floor. Under the current program for providing supportive services and the affordable housing, we were not hitting a critical mass with the current zoning in order to achieve a financially feasible with HPD. We went through probably, three, four years ago a very detailed feasibility analysis with HPD, and it was determined that we needed additional units and these additional two stories to accommodate those units in order to make the project financially feasible.

MICHELLE PONCE: I would also add that the critical mass also lets us provide a highly

(INAUDIBLE) building that's going to include 24/7 security.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay, so how many stories is the building going go be? 12, 14, 13?

2.2

2.3

2 MICHELLE PONCE: 14. As of right, we can
3 build up to 12, and we're asking for an additional
4 two.

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: And those upper floors would be set back.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Currently, there's, if I'm correct, a three-story building on this lot.

We're going to be building 12 to 14 stories. What effect is that going to have on the local park which is right across the street, if any?

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: On the park across the street, there will be no impact. There is a community garden up the block on Bathgate Avenue where there will be shadows cast in the winter months so it won't be during growing season or a season when the park is really active, but there will be some additional shadows I think for a couple hours during the winter months.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: And that will be a couple hours per day for how long?

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: I think it's mostly in the month of December.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Thank you. No more questions for me. Thank you so much.

2 ACTING CHAIRPERSO

2.2

2.3

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: I now turn

3 it over to invite my Colleagues to ask questions.

Council Member Louis has a question.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Chair. I just have a few quick questions, and I think you probably answered it. The first one is the current tenants that have leases that are expiring or they're on month-to-month, are those the folks that you said will be going into a new facility?

Healthcare Network is an existing tenant. They will be going into a temporary facility during construction. Most of the retail tenants have vacated as a result of COVID. The tenants that are remaining are getting lease buy-out payments so they are being made whole on their lease payments. There's a handful of tenants there including one that's the landowner. He operates a pizzeria.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Okay. The OSHA training that's going to be provided, who will be the operator?

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: We would work with the Council Member and the Community Board to find a

2.2

2.3

2 local provider to provide that training that we would
3 sponsor.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Okay. I just want to caution you want to find a qualified one. The green roofs that were mentioned and people suffering with mental illness, what support will you provide to those that will have access to that roof?

MICHELLE PONCE: The green roofs will be on the upper floors that have the setbacks on the 11th and 13th. Those will be inaccessible for those same concerns that you raised, Council Member. The second floor will have an accessible roof that will have the protective barriers.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Last question regarding 17 parking spaces and 103 bike racks, is that a sufficient amount of parking spaces for providers that will be providing support?

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: The 17 parking spaces, they're surface-level parking and self-park. We expect the demand to be larger, hopefully, and would be able to have an attended parking that would be able to maximize the parking, including stackers and whatnot. I think we just want to get a sense of the demand before putting that infrastructure in.

### SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.2

2.3

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Will you have EV 3 charging stations in those spaces?

EMANUEL KOKINAKIS: That's a good question. I think that's something we can certainly accommodate.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I think you should think about that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: All right. Thank you so much, Chair.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: There being no further questions, the applicant panel is excused, and I am now going to turn this hearing back over to Chair Kevin Riley.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council Member Schulman, and excuse me for my tardiness, everybody. Thank you to the applicant team for presenting and answering all the Council Members' questions.

Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish to testify on 521 East Tremont Avenue Rezoning Proposal remotely or in-person?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: Chair Riley, we have about three people signed up online, and I think there might be one of you here in

2 Chambers so if there's anyone that wants to testify

3 also here in the room, please see one of the

4 Sergeants to fill out a card, and I'll just make a

5 | quick announcement that for those of you waiting to

6 testify, please note that you will be called in as a

7 panel and please standby when you hear your name

8 being called and prepare to speak when the Chair says

9 that you may begin. Please note that once all

10 panelists in your group have completely their

11 | testimony, if remotely, you will be removed from the

12 meeting as a group and the next group of speakers

13 | will be introduced. You can continue to view the

14 livestream on our website.

Now, we will hear from the first panel,

16 | if the Chair wants to call the person if they're

17 here.

1

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes. Members of the

19 | public will be given two minutes to speak. We're

20 going to stick to our two-minute rule today because

21 | we have a lot of testimonies today. Please do not

22 begin until the Sergeant-at-Arms has started the

23 clock.

2.2

2.3

The first panel we're going to call up is an 1199 representative, I'm sorry if I mispronounce your name, Eunia Destine-Latinwo.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Let's give her one second to get there, Sergeant.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: While we have her set up here in the room, I'll just announce for those of you that are remote, the next panel will be Cynthia Stuart, Kalisha Reid, and Irene Lugo.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Can you just state your name for the record? I'm sorry if I mispronounced it.

 $\label{eq:eunia} \mbox{EUNIA DESTINE-LATINWO: It's okay. It's} \\ \mbox{one of those unique names.}$ 

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, it is.

EUNIA DESTINE-LATINWO: My name is Eunia

Destine-Latinwo. Good morning. My name is Eunia

Destine-Latinwo, Vice President of 1199 SEIU,

representing community-based organizations and

pharmacy division. I represent Community Healthcare

Network (CHN) workers, a network of 14 federally

qualified health centers that also staff school-based

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

care and high-quality care regardless of the ability

7 to pay. Adding dental care to the existing services

8 | will enhance the community's assistance.

1

2

3

4

6

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

In closing, CHN's East Tremont facility's expansion will increase and improve the healthcare services provided to this community. 1199 SEIU requests your support for this project. Thank you for this opportunity to testify before you today.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I believe we also have Paul Regoord as part of this panel as well. Sorry if I mispronounced your last name. You may begin.

PAUL REGOORD: Paul Regoord for Community
Healthcare Network. I'm the Center Director of our
Tremont Site and also the Director of our Mobile
Health Clinics.

Just to add to Eunia's presentation, I
think some of the things that are of concern of us
now is the current conditions of the building. We
currently have a facility on the second floor with an

CYNTHIA STUART: Hi. Oh, wait. I wait.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, you may begin. Go 3 ahead.

CYNTHIA STUART: Oh, okay. Thank you so much for the opportunity to speak on behalf of the proposed rezoning to allow for the creation of this extraordinary project proposed for 521 Tremont. My name is Cynthia Stuart, and I'm the Chief Operating Officer of the Supportive Housing Network of New York. We're a membership organization that represents 200+ non-profits statewide that collectively run more than 58,000 units of supportive housing. As someone who has been working in the New York supportive housing community for nearly 30 years, I wholeheartedly support this stellar project and it's A-list participants. Community Access is one of our most treasured members, having helped start this movement in the (INAUDIBLE) and continued to evolve their approach since. They are one of the best providers of housing and services in New York, and they have, I think, 11 buildings in the Bronx and a well-earned reputation for excellence. I really can't say enough about them. Our community has also known and prized Mega Group for decades, one of the preeminent developers of supportive and affordable

2 housing. They're fast, they're excellent, and 3 probably of greatest interest to the community, 4 responsive. They've been great partners in creating glorious high-quality affordable and supportive 5 housing and, during the pandemic, they actually let 6 7 us use one of their warehouses to distribute personal 8 protective equipment to our communities, workers, and tenants. The architects too, SLCE, have been designing gorgeous, high-quality affordable and 10 11 supportive housing forever so you're in excellent

36

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

be hard-pressed to do better, and all have a long

16 history creating housing in the Bronx. The building

hands there. Of course, Community Healthcare Network

is already in the neighborhood. All four partners are

extraordinary in their individual fields, and you'd

will be 143 top-quality apartments to the

18 neighborhood that fit a high swath of income levels,

19 providing much-needed quality affordable housing.

20 It'll have great security.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

CYNTHIA STUART: Okay. Thank you very much

23 for the opportunity.

24

21

2.2

1

12

13

14

2 CHAIRPERSON R

1

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Cynthia.

The next witness will be Kalisha Reid. Kalisha, you may begin.

KALISHA REID: Hi. Good morning. My name is Kalish Reid. I'm a tenant here at 985 Bruckner Boulevard. I don't know where to begin. Just please be patient with me. My children are home. I've been living here for the past two years now, and Community Access has definitely been (INAUDIBLE) create a foundation for my children coming out of the shelter system. I can't say enough how much Community Access has given me the opportunity to give my children a firm foundation. The different workshops here, the staff here, they've really been amazing. I've had opportunity to have a space with my children which is great. They have a lot of festivities for holidays and things like that. We get pantry, produce. It's really been a good opportunity for me. I wouldn't have it any other way, me coming into my first apartment. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Kalisha. The next witness that will testify is Irene Lugo. Irene, you may begin.

IRENE LUGO: Good morning, everyone. My
name is Irene Lugo. I've been going to Community
Healthcare Network on East Tremont for about 10
years. My youngest son was 3; he's now 13. First
thing I want to say the staff, the doctors, the
nurses, psychiatrists, therapists are all amazing. I
always feel welcome. Whenever my sons' doctors are
not available, they always find a way to make sure m
kids are being seen. Whenever I need anything for
myself, they are there. They show support. They ask
you if you need anything. I think it will be a great
asset to the community to make sure that we have a
bigger location for East Tremont because I think it
will benefit a lot of people. Also, I love the idea
that they will now have dentists available because
it's hard to find a good location, speaking from
experience, that are good with taking care of your
teeth. I just want to say I've been going there for
about 10 years, and I've moved all the way to
(INAUDIBLE) Parkway, and I still would travel and no
go nowhere else but Community Healthcare Network.
Thumbs up. I really hope that this is approved for
them. Thank you so much for your time.

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much, 3 Irene.

I'm just going to do a last call to make sure no one here wants to testify on 521 East Tremont.

Okay, do any Council Members have any questions for this panel?

Thank you. There being no more members of the public who wish to testify on Preconsidered LUs related to ULURPs C 220306 ZMX and N 220307 ZRX relating to the 521 East Tremont Avenue Rezoning Proposal, the public hearing is now closed, and the items are laid over.

Thank you, Counsel.

I will now open the public hearing on LUs 168 and 169 relating to the 1880-1888 Rezoning Proposal in Council Member Yeger's District in Brooklyn. This application seeks a zoning map amendment to rezone an existing C8-2 zoning district to a C4-5A zoning district and the related zoning text amendment to map an MIH program area.

For anyone wishing to testify on this item remotely, if you have not already done so, you must register online, and you may do that now by

For anyone wishing to testify on this item remotely, if you have not already done so, you must register online, and you may do that now by visiting the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.

2.2

2.3

24

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: If you could all raise your right hand and answer the following question.

Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the Subcommittee and in your answers to all Council Member questions?

ERIC PALATNIK: I do.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. For the viewing public, if you need an accessible version of this presentation, please send an email request to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

Now, the applicant team may begin.

Panelists, as you begin, I'll just ask that you please restate your name and organization for the record.

ERIC PALATNIK: Thank you, Councilman Riley. My name is Eric Palatnik, and I am an attorney representing 1880 Coney Island Avenue. If I may just request at the outset, Councilman Riley, I know we're allocated 10 minutes, if we may have maybe 12 minutes or so, that would be great, let us talk a little bit at ease. We have a lot to tell you.

2.2

2.3

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

First, I wanted to comment before we go into the formal presentation that I sense as we all sense that we're at a watershed moment when it comes to affordable housing in New York City. We want to thank you for taking the time to study the obstacles that we're confronting in making this development work.

We started this process four years ago hoping to build an eight-story building working with Councilman Yeger. We've come to the position where Councilman Yeger has indicated, and I'll let him speak, that he would be happy with a five-story building. Unfortunately, a five-story building at this location with the provision of MIH housing with the lack of 421 with the inflation that we're all confronting in our daily life with the interest rates as high as they are, with the cost of construction, a five-story building is simply not buildable. Consequently, nobody can afford to build it. We've studied at a five-story building, we've studied at a six- and a seven-story building, and we've got some reports here, and we have an expert to speak to you. It's pretty common now in New York City that without the 421 with the interest rates where they are it is

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

very difficult to build, and this building is no different. Eight stories makes financial sense and it fits within the character of the neighborhood. I'm going to show you picture after picture of building after building all around this building that are eight stories tall, similar in height to what we're asking for here and do not provide a shred of MIH housing. As a matter of fact, this development will double the amount of MIH housing built within the district in the last decade. The irony is that the proposed residential building that we're seeking to speak which is eight stories is just a fraction of the allowable building. The C8-2 district that we're in allows for a 23-story sky exposure plane community facility building similar in density to one that was just build a few feet away at the corner of Avenue P that's at nine stories. That building was limited by its lot size. We're four times larger in lot size. We could go four times higher. That building is nine stories; we could be 23. The property could also be put to use as an automotive service station or an automobile dealership, which Plaza Auto Mall, the operator, the owner of the property runs. We have no desire to build an automobile dealership here, an

2 auto body shop, a self-storage facility, or a 23-

3 story community facility. We want to build an eight-

4 story housing development with affordable MIH housing

5 that matches the heights of all the buildings across

6 the street in the R7A district which rests just

7 across the street. The C8-2 line runs down Coney

8 Island Avenue.

1

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

This property is being developed without any money at all from the government. There's no tax abatement. There's no federal subsidies. There's no city subsidies. It's near mass transit. It has a union labor component. It has many green features. It will create much-needed market-rate housing. The avenue itself, Coney Island Avenue, is akin to one of the great boulevards of New York City. We have Coney Island Avenue, the Grand Concourse, Ocean Parkway, Queens Boulevard, all well-known avenues. Of all those avenues, Coney Island Avenue is the only one that is littered with cars being repaired with their radiators off on the street and one-story pre-war three-story walkups as the main source of housing. I dare say we can do better as a city so we're here today to ask you to make a difference with us, and we recognize that the Councilman is opposed to it, and I

2 know there are many people here who live on East 10th

3 Street that's behind it that don't like the size of

4 it. I'm also going to show you information that's

5 going to show how it may improve some people's lives.

6 If I can go now to the next slide and thank you for

 $\parallel$  giving me the introduction.

2.2

2.3

This slide, which you can't really see probably from where you are, but what's important to note on it is that the middle slide at the bottom dot speaks to the fact that the C8-2 zoning district in this area has been here since 1961. It was created by Robert Moses himself who we are now spending time trying to undo the legacy of in the Cross Bronx Expressway. He created the C8-2 district in 1960, three months before he left office in 1961, and it's remained as the racial barrier that it's been for the past 60 years preventing any new development on this side of the street. Next slide, please.

The slide you can see here on the left side is the existing and proposed zoning map. As you can see on the left side, the existing condition in the Ocean Parkway Subdistrict which is the jewel of Ocean Parkway was created to make sure that communities thrive with beautiful structures and

to change that. Next slide, please.

2.2

2.3

there's all sorts of design regulations. The C8 rests within that as you can see here. Ironically, as you can see, the R7A district runs the entire length of Coney Island Avenue across the street. It's almost as if somebody intentionally decided that one side of Coney Island Avenue should have housing and the other side of Coney Island Avenue should be relegated to automotive uses for eternity. We're here to ask you

This shows you what the proposal is. It's a C4-5A, the right side, it gives you all the dimensions I gave you before, but basically it's a 90-foot tall building, eight stories, 49 MIH units, doubling the amount built within the last decade, and 191 total apartments with 49 at a market rate. Next slide, please.

This slide just gives you a depiction of the building. I'm going to skip through it and go to the next slide, please.

This slide is where the guts of things are at, and I'd like to spend a minute calling to your attention. This was all taken from the Racial Equity Report, which as you know the City recently enacted for us to study. When we studied it and we

2.2

2.3

please.

started going into the PUMA tract, what you'll start to notice is this area is grossly underserved with housing. The population in this area, the right top dot, shows you that it's gone up by 6 percent in population in the last decade. However, the second DOT shows you that housing in this area only went up by 2 percent. In contrast, Brooklyn went up by 8 percent, and the City went up by 6. We're way behind in this area. We're underperforming. Next slide,

Next slide is just the Mayor's, what we've all heard and what we all know, nobody can afford to live in New York right now and we need more housing. Next slide, please.

This slide tells more tales. I'm giving you a lot of statistics. This slide, again, was taken from the Racial Equity Report from the City's Equitable Data Map. The bottom 99.5 percent is showing you that that is all the housing that has no affordable housing in the area. 99.5 percent, no affordable housing in the area. The top two numbers are telling you that 53 units have been created in Community Board 12, that's what the map on the right is showing you, that's Community District 12, those

2 numbers in the dots and the number of housing units

3 | that have been built, you add those up, they add up

4 | to 53. Look at ours; we're at 49. We're nearly

5 doubling the amount of MIH housing. I know the

6 Councilman wants a five-story building here. We can't

7 afford to build it. If we build eight, we can include

8 the affordable housing that we need. Next slide,

9 please.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

Next slide shows you 65,000 dollars on the righthand side is the community median income. That's what we're all talking about now. We all realize the AMI is nonsense. It's the community median income that means somethings. The CMI here, the average median income for the PUMA tract 4016 is 65,000 dollars which is a spot on to our 60 percent MIH targeting the exact people and demographic that need the affordable housing. Next slide.

The unit distribution slide was done in response to Councilman Yeger's request to increase the number of larger units. We had a lot of studios before. He asked us to bring the building down to five stories. I said I could not do it. He asked to mix up the unit count. I said I could. This is what I can do to accommodate his request, and this is what

you're seeing here with a vast majority of the units
being two bedrooms and others being one and three and

4 no studios. Next slide.

1

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

The next slide is great, full of information. This slide is all taken from the Racial Equity Report. Going from the top left, I'm going to go down, and then I'm going to go to the right side. The population in the area is made up of 63.2 percent white non-Hispanic, that's me. The remaining 37 percent are ethnic. That's gone up by 9 percent over the past decade so it's trending away from white non-Hispanic and towards the other ethnicities. It's 19 percent Asian. Its foreign-born population is 49 percent. That's astronomical to me, nearly 50 percent of people are born in another country, and limited English proficiency, 36 percent have limited English. The right side shows you the housing shortage. Specifically, the housing units at the top are what I told you before, all the same stats, but the affordability, the third one down, 21 percent of the units in the area, the people that need affordable housing is only available to 21 percent of them. Lowand moderate-income, it's only available to 75 percent of them. There's a 25 percent need for

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 | moderate-income housing, there's an 80 percent need

3 for low-income housing, and I'll go up to the rent,

4 | the dot above that which I should've mentioned, the

5 rent burden. 53 percent of the people in the

6 community are rent-burdened and 28 percent of that 53

7 percent are severely rent-burdened. All of this

information is taken from the City's Racial Equity

9 Report, which is all online. Next slide, please.

These show you the buildings that are built all around us within feet, within walking distance, spitting distance. The building on the top left is the as-of-right community facility built on a much smaller lot than us using a sky exposure plane. It's a medical office building. It's built by a local person in the community. It rests lot-line to lotline and goes up the identical height to what we're requesting. They built in the C8-2 because the C8-2 allows a 6.5 community facility FAR with a sky exposure plane. Our lot is 50,000 square feet, 60,000 square feet, the size of our lot lets us go up like the Empire State Building for an as-of-right development. I'm simply suggesting that because people are here today opposing what we want to build which has a benefit to the city. What's allowed to

built there can go much higher, and I don't know what

a 23-story medical building could do, but even the

as-of-right for an automotive use, which is Plaza

Auto Mall who owns the property could be an auto

6 repair, auto body, things like that, none of which I

7 think has any tangible beneficial use. Next slide,

8 please.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

The top left slide here shows you what goes on at Coney Island right now. You go out to this property right now, you walk around the block, and you will see radiators on the street, you'll see toilet seats under cars, you will see tires off of cars, hoods up, engines out, windshields off, it's a chop shop on the auto body shops. Now, we understand that cars need to be repaired, but as you can see parked perpendicular to the sidewalk on the major arterial roadway of New York City that should have housing doesn't really work. If you look at the middle, that's what's on the block right now in the R7. I think we can do better than that. If you look at the bottom, I think that we all know what a block looks like. I'm almost down with my presentation. Thank you for giving me the time. I have three or four more slides. The next slide, please.

This slide, the entire gray matter on the other side of Coney Island Avenue, our site's in the red, is zoned R7A and would allow for a development of exactly the same height as we are seeking here with no MIH housing whatsoever, and I showed you already and I'll show you a few more pictures of the buildings that have been built in that picture that you're looking at right now across the street that exist. They're eight stories, seven stories. They're beautiful. They're glass. They're brand new, and they don't have a stitch of affordable housing. We're simply asking that we be allowed to do the same thing on our side of the block. We understand that the zoning is C8-2, but we're to ask to change it. Two more slides, or three more. Next slide, please.

This slide just shows you in more detail what I was speaking to and thank you for paying such close attention, Council Member, I greatly appreciate it. If you can see up in the right side of your page are the two buildings that are up in the air built, an 85-foot, seven-story residential building in the R7 district, the lower side on the right, 95-foot, seven-story office building, same size we want to

2.2

2.3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

build as of right, exactly what we could build where
we are.

Next slide just simply shows you the automotive uses. Next slide, please.

This shows simply what I'm speaking to about Coney Island Avenue. Next slide, please.

This shows you what could be constructed here as-of-right. I think it's quite compelling since the objectors are here mainly opposed to what we are proposing to build saying it's going to affect them. This could be lot-line to lot-line. Our building cannot. It can go 23 stories tall. Our building cannot. Something will be built. There's a building on the property now occupied by Staples. They're closing. It will be demolished, and there's another building that was operated by Esty's, a very famous local wig maker, demolished and gone. The site is ready to be developed. The question for everybody in the room is do we develop it with an automobile dealership, a community facility, or a residential apartment building that could support the affordable housing that the city and this Committee is asking us to provide without any state, city, or federal subsidies. Next slide, please.

This slide, there are people here that
are speaking on East 10th Street. I'm here to tell
you that, next slide, please, next slide, there you
go, this is interesting and from a land use
perspective, if you look at the bottom of the slide
you'll see the landscaped rear yard. That's the
dumpsters you see in the picture at the top. The site
jigs into the properties behind us. The people that
are here opposing live on that block that the site
jigs into. The parking lot for Staples goes right up
to their back doors, you can see it in the picture,
right there, the dumpsters, the kids hanging out,
everybody drinking, deliveries, cars, the works,
right up against the houses, you can see the
dumpsters here. We're asking to turn that into a
landscaped area. When we're done, they'll be a 50-
foot buffer area from those homes and then they'll be
an additional 30 feet above the first floor
separating our building from those homes by up to 80
feet, and that concludes my presentation.

I thank you for giving us the time to present it, and I'd be happy to answer any questions, and Bishop Taylor I think has a few words as well.

1

\_

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

BISHOP MITCHELL TAYLOR: Okay. Good morning. I'm Bishop Mitchell G. Taylor from Inside Track PR. I was engaged by the owner to do some outreach and some research on this community and to offer my expertise as it relates to this project.

Thank you for the time to learn about the

issues that are preventing us as a city from catching up on the housing crisis. As Eric was talking and referring to the Racial Equity Report, which I have combed through days and days with Sedia (phonetic) and others that were on that committee, I feel like this was exactly why that report was done. When I look at the lines of demarcation that prevent prosperity from one side of the community and allows it for the other side of the community and when I think about what Governor Hochul said at a State of the State about 800,000 units of housing and then what Mayor Adams said about 500,000 units of housing in New York City, 1.3 million units of housing in the midst of a housing crisis where we have 75,000 migrants, 47,000 homeless New Yorkers depending on who's counting, and we don't have enough places to put them, and so here we have a project that is contextual, that makes sense in a neighborhood that

2.2

2.3

has been disproportionately ignored and overlooked for so many years, and I don't want to pull the race card, I don't want to talk about the redlining that seems to be here that was developed by Robert Moses so long ago that even right now City Planning is studying some of the stuff that he put into place because it is disproportionately impacting people of color, people in urban tracts, and we don't want this project to be cast in that same light. Mr. Palatnik said so eloquently that eight stories is just not appropriate for this neighborhood, but it's not only...

ERIC PALATNIK: Councilman Yeger did.

Councilman Yeger said it's not appropriate for this neighborhood, but it only becomes viable when it's an eight-story building. There's no 421-A, there's no subsidies, this project is almost impossible to build. If you look at the margins and these reports about how much money will be made, you almost think that the developer of this property is doing it for altruistic reasons, and I believe that it is. We all sense the watershed moment we are collectively experiencing in housing, a shortage across all income levels, the proposed 191 units of housing including

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

49 MIH units targeting 60 percent of the AMI with a percentage of those units matching the CMI is a perfect storm for people that need housing. We are seeking a zoning designation of C4-5A, the residential equivalent of the R7A district which already exists all around this building. I want to say what could be built as-of-right will not only be intrusive, not only block views, not only be burdensome to the residents that are on that block that we see up here on the screen, it'll be something that we'll all be regretting for years and years to come. It makes no sense to me, but make no mistake about it the surrounding R7A district has recently seen the addition of numerous seven- and eight-story multiple dwellings identical to that which is proposed here, yet none of which, which was already said, include any affordable housing. I want to skip over here a little bit. Our side of Coney Island Avenue is zoned as it has been for the past 65 archaic years, 65 years. Go to that block. I was just there last week. It's a blight on the neighborhood. It's a mark, it's a stain, I can't even believe it, and it was designed for automobile use, allowing towering community facility structures, one has

2.2

2.3

already been built just a few feet away from our site that our site can accommodate one as well that can rest lot-line to lot-line and raise more than 100 feet tall on that site. It was created by the previous Commissioner, Robert Moses, and I believe that this is a time now for us to look at this critically because people need housing today. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Eric and Bishop, it's a pleasure to see you both today and to everybody here today.

I'm just going to get right to it. I know this is a sensitive topic, this particular project, so I'm just going to ask everybody to please have respect to each other and when you're asking questions to please answer them in respect.

Housing is an issue that we want to address within New York City so every community has to play their part but also every developer has to play their part as well when they're talking and negotiating with the community. It looks like eight stories isn't what the community wants. It looks like five stories isn't what the developer wants so hopefully we can come to the table and come up with

2 storage. Self-storage is viable. It's returns, we

3 have it here, we could show you it does very good

4 returns. He's (INAUDIBLE) analyzed it. That's one

5 opportunity. The second opportunity is they run Plaza

6 Auto Mall so they could obviously put their

7 automobile dealership or repair or prep yards or

8 whatever is related to their business there for that,

9 but it's more unlikely than not that it'll become a

10 self-storage facility, probably of a similar height,

11 | if not more, than what we're proposing here with a

12 | larger bulk.

13

14

15

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I know

Council Member Yeger has a few questions and his

intro so I'm going to let Council Member Yeger go.

16 Thank you, Council Member Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.

Chairman. I'm glad that you began by talking about

the blight on the neighborhood because in good part

the blight on the neighborhood is caused by the

people who you are here representing. I'm glad that

the Bishop took the time to visit Coney Island

Avenue. I wish you would've gone just a few blocks

over to see Nostrand Avenue. Nostrand Avenue where

the client that you represent has literally destroyed

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

a neighborhood, destroyed a neighborhood from Avenue L Street to Kings Highway, taken over two drugstores, a Rite Aid and a CVS and created parking lots, taken over a synagogue and created his car leasing company, taken over privately owned and operated businesses with residents on top, crushed them to the ground, paved it over, and put his used car rental lot while he, at the same time, is banging on the doors of homes on East 29th Street to try to buy them so that he can increase the size of his parking lot. We have dark holes in our neighborhood created by your client. That's the blight that exists. Mr. Palatnik and I visited Coney Island Avenue, and he took great joy in telling me what a disgusting neighborhood I represent. The street is disgusting. He said, Councilman, don't you want this cleaned up, and I said, Eric, it's your client's property that this filth is in front of, your client has owned this property in your words to me for 40 years and it is disgusting. He doesn't take care of the street and then you come here and you tell us what a disgusting avenue Coney Island Avenue is. The homes across the street that you pointed to and said, well, couldn't there be something better there, there are real

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2

3

4

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

height. Not don't build, not don't build, so when you tell us that every neighborhood needs apartments, and our neighborhood needs apartments and you bring strangers into our neighborhood to tell us what we need, and I appreciate being schooled by other people from other neighborhoods to tell us what it is we need in our neighborhood, what we're telling you is the same thing. We also need housing, but there is responsibility in development. We don't build towers on top of people's homes. We don't do that anywhere in the city. It's a big city, and it's a different kind of city and a lot of different neighborhoods and the city is made up of neighborhoods, and when we have a neighborhood that is a typical low-rise neighborhood where we can welcome apartment buildings because we do have apartment buildings, there is a responsibility to develop it in a way that fits into the neighborhood so let's talk a little bit about what it is that your client has done in terms of, I haven't asked a question yet so don't worry about the mic, to our neighborhood and why it is that there are a lot of people who feel he can't be trusted and why a lot of people feel look, if he wants to build five stories that's great, and we'll try to welcome that

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

and try to hold him to promises that he made, but he's not been somebody whose promises have been trustworthy. He has ruined, ruined the Nostrand Avenue corridor between Avenue L and Kings Highway, Avenue M, Avenue N, Avenue O, Kings Highway, he's ruined them, destroyed them, destroyed them for profit, his own profit. Altruistic was a word that was used here today. I tried very hard to hold my face from laughing. He's not altruistic. Giving out turkeys on Thanksqiving is very nice, but he's not altruistic. He has destroyed a neighborhood, and now he proposes to do similar destruction on Coney Island Avenue. Nobody is saying that we want a Staples instead of housing. We don't, and if Staples has to go, that's fine, but we didn't want to lose a Rite Aid and we didn't want to lose a CVS two blocks away from each other because your client's greed forced those businesses out. We didn't want to lose all the small businesses along Avenue M between East 29th Street and Nostrand Avenue, my childhood barbershop being one of them, that was bought out, crushed to the ground, and had a paved parking lot put over it. Literally paving paradise to put up parking lots is your client's business model so when you tell us that

make sure we get to everybody. I don't think there's

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.2

2.3

2 any more questions or comments for this applicant
3 panel so you guys are excused.

ERIC PALATNIK: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: We have a few people to testify so I'm going to make a few announcements regarding that. We have a few of you here in person, we're going to call you in panels, and a few waiting online, thanks for your patience.

For those of you that are here to testify, please know that you will be called in panels of four or five. If you're a member of the public signed up to testify on the proposal, please stand by when you hear your name being called and prepare to speak when Chair says that you may begin.

Please also note that once all panelists in your group have completed their testimony if remotely you will be removed from the meeting as a group and the next group of speakers will be introduced. Once removed, participants may continue to view the livestream broadcast of this hearing on the Council website.

We will now hear from the first panel. If the Chair wants to read the names of the panels inperson so you can set up and we can call you.

2.2

2.3

up there.

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, I'm going to call
3 on Tiara Williams, Alvaro Gonzalez (phonetic),
4 Reverend Frank Mason, and Pastor Beard. You can come

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: You can come up there and we'll...

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Members of the public will be given two minutes to speak. I will be cutting everybody off at two minutes. I'm so sorry. There's a lot of people signed up to testify today. All right, so you will be given two minutes to speak. Please do not begin until the Sergeant-at-Arms has started the clock.

First, I'm going to start with Pastor Beard. Pastor Beard. You may begin.

PASTOR BEARD: Good morning. My name is

Pastor Beard. I'm Associate Pastor of Coney Island

Cathedral, and I've often heard of projects coming to

my community with promises of progress, but it's rare

to find a project that is focused on affordable

housing. As an advocate for my community, we fight

for fair, equitable housing every day to foster

social, economic, and community advancement. However,

it is impossible without stable housing. I strongly

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 believe that this development will be part of solving

3 housing crisis in our neighborhood. Additionally,

4 this project will benefit our community and residents

5 | because it will generate opportunities for economic

6 and social growth. It will not only bring affordable

7 housing but jobs, retail space, a significant

8 | facelift among Coney Island Avenue. In my opinion,

9 | this is more than just a development. It is a much

10 needed housing solution for our neighborhood, and to

11 add it would be an upgrade to what we have now.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Pastor

13 | Beard. Next is Reverend Frank Mason.

REVEREND FRANK MASON: My name is Reverend Frank Mason. I'm the Senior Pastor of the Christ Temple United Baptist Church. As an advocate for my community, I am very concerned about the lack of affordable housing that has been made available to our community. In order to keep up with the growing needs of our community, we need more housing and a secure interest in investments into our community. That is why I am in support of the 1880-1888 Coney Island Avenue Project has the potential to be a real gamechanger in our community. This project has many

Τ	SUBCOMMITH	'EE ON	ZONING	AND FR	ANCHISE	is
2	community	benef	its inc	luding	retail	jobs,

opportunity, affordable housing options that will

4 help generate revenue for the small businesses and

5 force the economic growth which is a step in the

6 right direction. We need new, smart, and creative

7 development in our community. This project checks all

8 those boxes and helps improve the quality of life for

9 the whole community. I am confident that the 1880-

1888 Coney Island Avenue Project will be a blessing

11 to our growing community and fully support this

12 project. On behalf of myself and the Christ Temple

13 United Baptist Church, we support the rezoning of the

14 | 1880-1888 Coney Island Avenue Project and ask that

15 you consider its approval.

I'd like to say thank you to all of you for your time and consideration. I also have with me letters that's been signed from other people in our community that was not able to be here because of work and so we are definitely in support of the project.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Reverend Mason.

24

23

3

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: Thank
3 you, and we will take your letters so we can include
4 them in the record.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Next, I will have Tiara Williams. Tiara, you may begin.

TIARA WILLIAMS: Good morning. Excuse my voice but thank you for the opportunity to testify today. My name is Tiara Williams, and I'm a proud six-year member of Local 79 and a former resident of District 44. I grew up with my grandparents and enjoyed walks on Coney Island Avenue to get a Kosher pickle with my grandparents and the frequent visits to various bakeries in the area, the trips to Midwood to Murrow to watch high school games are some of my pleasant memories there that I had as a child. At the age of seven, my grandfather passed away. Four years later, my grandmother fell ill as she fought to keep her apartment. Sadly, she died when I was 14. My aunt tried keeping her apartment because she was pushed out of the one that she had directly upstairs. She could only maintain for a few years. The rent increases on these old apartments were heavy burdens. I had no choice but to move into my mother's already crowded apartment in Flatbush, which is a very

different and much more complicated area. Then and now, as decision-makers in New York City, you have the responsibility to build affordable housing. We need to create housing opportunities for the people who cannot afford market-rate apartments like my aunt, my grandmother, and my grandfather. We need to create family-sustaining jobs as well when we consider building these apartments for the members of those communities. These opportunities can help shape a child's future that they don't have to heal from. It's very important that we all do our fair share of creating housing that doesn't burden a family in old or young age. Fair meaning inclusive to the whole 100 of the said community, not just a percentage of the whole. It's essential to create jobs that help those people as well to dictate their financial future. 1880 allows both, and I support the project's eightstory plan. At eight stories, it is not only financially viable, but it offers more affordable units than any other project in District 44 in the last 10 years. The more this project offers, the less families fall into unfortunate situations as mine did. Thank you.

24

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Miss

3 Williams. Next, I'll have Alvaro Gonzalez. Alvaro,

4 you may begin.

1

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

ALVARO GONZALEZ: Hello. Thank you for the opportunity to testify. My name is Alvaro Gonzalez. I'm a proud six-year member of Local 79, and I am here to testify in favor of the rezoning located at 1880 Coney Island Avenue. When I started in the construction industry, I used to work non-union in the Midwood neighborhood. I worked on apartments, houses, commercial buildings. Through my time working there, what I thought was first a good opportunity I came to realize I was being exploited. I worked with no safety standards, no living wages. Accidents on job sites always went unreported. We were always pushed to the point where it became dangerous. During demolition phases, there was never any test done to see if there was asbestos or anything harmful. PPE was rarely provided. Something as simple as wearing your hard hat was a rare site. While industry safety standards have increased, many construction companies in Midwood still do not follow basic safety regulations. By working and earning low wages, I could never have afforded to live in one of those

Τ	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 74
2	apartments where I was working on. Buying meals and
3	transportation for work took away 25 percent of my
4	income. While making around 550 dollars a week, I
5	used to struggle paying 1,200 dollars in rent.
6	Healthcare coverage was not even an option as I was
7	quoted 250 dollars a month for basic coverage. I
8	could not afford it now was it offered to me through
9	my job. When I got hurt, I was told to stay home
10	until I got better, but I was not paid for my time
11	off or company offered to pay my medical bills.
12	Today, as a union member, I know my rights. There are
13	people in this District who desperately need
14	affordable housing due to their low wages. The
15	project offers real opportunity, good wages, and
16	housing that workers can afford. We need every unit
17	of affordable housing we can get to make our city
18	livable. Please consider my testimony and open the
19	doors to a dignified future by approving this
20	rezoning. Thank you.
21	CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Council

Member Yeger, do you have any questions for this

panel?

## SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.2

2.3

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Very brief

question. Good morning, Pastor Beard. Just wondering
if you can tell us where is your church located?

PASTOR BEARD: 2816 Mermaid Avenue.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, and good morning, Reverend Mason. Where's your church located?

REVEREND MASON: 2678 86th Street in the Bensonhurst section of Brooklyn.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, beautiful neighborhoods both. Those are about a 20-minute drive, 25-minute drive from this location. Is that correct?

REVEREND MASON: Yes.

that I have in terms of questions. Just in terms of my friends from Local 79, I just want to tell you that in my District there's not been a single project that has built that has come before this Council that hasn't been a union job that hasn't been with prevailing wages, not a single approval has come out of, from me, from my good Colleagues on this Committee or from Land Use Committee that hasn't been a union job. This will be a union job. If they want to build a five-story building, they can get started

very quickly put together petition, all of whom are

strongly against this variance, almost all of whom

24

2 do not want it. People that live in the neighborhood,

3 people that live in the blocks around this area, that

4 know what this is going to do to the neighborhood so

5 I just want to quickly mention that and make sure we

6 have it on the record that there are 650 people

7 | opposed to it.

1

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I also want to mention that the Community Board voted on this project, and they turned it down. They're the people that live in the neighborhood and on the ground and know what the people of the community need. This is not something that we need. This monstrosity is not something that we need. They want to put 230 apartments. That easily over 1,000 people in our backyards. Where is the infrastructure for that? Where is the plan for that? The kids going to school, the supermarkets, there's no plan for that. It's just going to create a huge mess on top of an already congested area. We're living in this area for over 20 years, paying taxes, we are the ones that made the neighborhood, and now they want to shove this project down our necks. It's not fair. It's not fair to anybody. It really is not. If this was of much smaller footprint, much smaller scale, we'd want it. We want affordable good housing, but it's not the

- 2 case. What are the benefits for the neighborhood?
- 3 What benefits are the neighborhood getting from this
- 4 project? They haven't said one thing the
- 5 | neighborhood's getting from this project. A building
- 6 | like this should built in a different area and not
- 7 | infringe on our neighborhood. That's all I gotta say.
- 8 Thank you so much.

- CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Joseph.
- 10 | Next person to testify is Eli Kady.
- 11 ELI KADY: Good morning, Chair and Council
- 12 Members. My name is Eli Kady. I looked at the
- 13 | environmental assessment that they proposed. There's
- 14 many inconsistencies over there, but one of the
- 15 things is that the traffic, they went and reported
- 16 the traffic. If you look at the traffic, and it was
- 17 on January 7, 2021, right when the second COVID wave
- 18 came about. Everybody was home. January 7th is also
- 19 the Greek Orthodox Christmas which is in our
- 20 | neighborhood, also there's a Greek Orthodox Church.
- 21 | Many people stayed home. You had in one hour 475 cars
- 22 and taxis, 739 light trucks and SUVs, 49 medium
- 23 trucks, 18 heavy trucks, 94 buses, that's 1,375
- 24 | vehicles in one hour between 7:30 and 8:30 a.m. on a
- 25 | day that's supposed to be no traffic at all. One of

change. For the sake of the two-minute, we'll only be

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

able to mention a few. Be happy to speak about it further later. The first thing is the traffic. The existing traffic in and around that area creates gridlock. Taking the children to school just four blocks away could take 45 minutes on an average morning. Anybody who lives in that area knows that. This proposed building would be between Avenue O and Avenue P. Avenue O as it goes towards Coney Island Avenue does not go through (INAUDIBLE) as there's a one-way street oncoming the other way so anybody who is going up Avenue O towards Coney Island Avenue needs to make a right turn, which would be right where this building would be which would take up almost an entire city block or make a left which is nearly impossible because of the oncoming traffic the other way. The existing infrastructure and traffic in our area cannot support a ton more cars and massive influx of approximately 1,000 new residents in a oneblock area. As a lifelong Brooklynite, we live in a diverse, multicultural, hardworking, family-oriented community, and I stress the word family. Indeed, almost all the residents in our area regardless of background, race, religion are all families, many of them large families. When reviewing the proposed

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

plans for this building, it seems there was zero care taken to make it livable for the local residents of our community. All the apartments are tiny, even with the changes that Mr. Palatnik proposed and don't have enough bedrooms while in our area, it's typically large families who live in the area, they need three-, four-, five-bedroom apartments so I understand the goal of the city is to provide more housing and affordable housing, but care should be taken to put it in the right spot and to make it suitable for residents of the community. This building doesn't do any of that. Should this zoning change be approved, it would open the floodgates to buildings like this on every block up and down Coney Island Avenue and cross-streets, literally overwhelming the singlefamily homes and multifamily homes of people that have been living in this area for generations. Indeed, if I may just finish, 10 more seconds, myself, I'm a fourth generation Brooklynite. My great grandfather was an immigrant who came to this country over from Syria, and my children are fifth generation so I've been living in this area for quite a long time and I know what we need. This is not what we need.

2.2

2.3

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you.

ALBERT TUREJO: I respectfully ask you to stand with the local community, the local Community Board, and the local Council Members who know what's best for this community and oppose this zoning change. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Next we will have, excuse me if I mispronounce your name, Raun, Reuben (INAUDIBLE)

REUBEN (INAUDIBLE): As a grandfather, when I receive a phone call from my grandchildren, they tell me, Saba, how do we cross the street, which way should we go. Anyone of you came in the morning or in the afternoon when kids coming out of school or going into school, did you ever see them frightened and can barely walk on a green light. We're not talking about red. We're talking about green. They cannot pass the street. They call me, can you come pick us up. We're coming to a point where they're trying to fit a 53-foot trailer into that dead-end street and tell them make a turn, you can make a turn, you can turn, but we can't. Where do we draw the line? Where does it stop? Where and when? Some common sense over here. You're representing somebody.

hear you.

2	MORDECHAI SHARABY: Hi, my name is
3	Mordechai Sharaby, and I live on East 7th Street. I
4	do not live on East 10th where they're planning to
5	build the building. I live on East 7th. I'm a Rabbi
6	of a shul community, have over 60 members in the
7	shul. We all suffer daily from parking. I come back
8	at night after giving classes. I cannot find parking
9	I don't believe if you build a building with so many
10	apartments and so many new people coming down with
11	their cars to park, there's no way where they're
12	going to park. It's not that they're planning to giv
13	three floors for parking, but if we now, where we
14	live, I live on East 7th, I do not live on East 10th
15	East 7th there's no parking, East 8th there's no
16	parking, East 9th there's no parking, East 10th
17	there's no parking. I can go to East 12th, East 13th
18	East 14th, there's no parking, and now you want to
19	add on another 50 apartments, another 100 apartments
20	another 400 apartments. I just don't believe it make
21	any sense. It's going to ruin the community from A t
22	Z. I just don't see how it's going to help anybody

that lives in the area. I understand people need

places to live, they need houses, I respect that we

23

SUBCOMMITTEE	OM	ZONTNG	AND	FRANCHISES

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

all need it, but don't put it in an area that already
has no space. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: Thank you. The next speaker is Meyer Elnadav.

MEYER ELNADAV: Thank you for this opportunity. Can you hear me?

 $\label{eq:committee} \mbox{COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: We can}$  hear you. Go ahead.

MEYER ELNADAV: Okay, thank you. First off, I'd like to ask for the reverends that came today if you have an attendance of maybe I'm going to guess 200, 250 people that come to your church on a Sunday morning one day a week, would you be willing to flatten your buildings, put everybody on the first floor for a few hours on a Sunday morning and build an eight-story project on top of you, how would the rest of the residents of your area, how would they like it? That's one question. I mean that's exactly what's happening to us. I don't know about complaints that have been happening on Coney Island Avenue for what the lawyer has pointed out. I do see garbage. I do see cars. It's kind of par for the course, but it's not something that is disgusting as he had placed it or anything that's unsightly or a blight to

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

the community. I really oppose such statements and do you have a list of people that have opposed over the years the conditions of that area? When I need to go somewhere, I walk right by it. Nobody says boo to me, and I don't have a problem walking down there. There's garbage because there's always garbage, and where you're placing this new building, how many more mom and pop are you going to be able to fit there? If the State wants to build 800,000 additional affordable housing units, and I may add affordable housing units, I understand that it's important, but you have to understand that the price of housing and rent in our area is based on supply and demand. There's a great demand, and, therefore, the prices are high, and that's an economic property that works everywhere in the world, supply and demand. If you would like to have a lot of housing, go to an open area. I'm not saying specifically this coming area that I'm going to mention the name like Floyd Bennett Field, very wide area. If the State or the City would like to, they can build thousands of housing units over there and build groceries and businesses and supermarkets and tailor shops and all kinds of things...

2.2

2.3

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

MEYER ELNADAV: Sorry. And be able to support a new community instead of building on top of an existing community. Everybody out there who wants to have this project should think, do you want an eight-story building in addition to where you live now? Thank you very much. I oppose the project.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much. The next person I will have present is Jack Kaplan. Jack, you may begin.

YAAKOV KAPLAN: Hello. Good morning. Thank you, everyone, for listening. I have an opportunity to both be someone who lives four blocks away as well as being the Vice Chair of Community Board 12

(INAUDIBLE) represents the area. Everyone knows that Brooklyn needs housing desperately, especially in parts of Midwood, and we're at the crossroads here. Either we're going to let people (INAUDIBLE) our community, buy out and build out our community, or we're going to stand short and hold developers accountable to build housing that looks and feels right for our community. We're going to choose people over profit, the backbone of the community over the bank accounts of the developers. When you have a

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. The next person to present is Jack Braha.

in our community (INAUDIBLE) Thank you very much.

2.2

23

2 JACK BRAHA: Good morning. Can you guys

3 hear?

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you. You may begin.

JACK BRAHA: Thank you. Thank you for giving us time and allowing us to voice our opinion on a matter that affects the neighborhood at large. First off, I, myself, am living in this neighborhood for over four decades. I have a very good beat on the community and what transpires daily within the community. I believe that at the beginning when the lawyer spoke for about 12 minutes, he did not address the key issues that have to be addressed. It's not an emotional thing. It's a serious thing. It has to do with parking, safety, garbage, and all that fun stuff that comes with 100+ apartments that are being developed. We keep hearing about affordable housing, but no one has said how many of the apartments are affordable housing, what is the percentage of this big structure that is being built that is going to have affordable housing. No one has mentioned that. Is it 20 of them? Is it 40 of them? We don't believe that the reason for this project is in the benefit of the neighborhood and affordable housing, but rather

do believe that the applicant team did provide some

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO:

Elizabeth, you'll go first, but, again, just a reminder that for those of you who are testifying online, please stay on the meeting in case the Council Members have questions for you. Elizabeth Denys will be our first speaker on this next panel.

ELIZABETH DENYS: Hi, my name is Elizabeth Denys, and I live just two miles north of the project along Coney Island Avenue on the other side. I'm speaking in favor of the project today. It's wellmatched in scale for the surrounding neighborhood. I regularly take the B-68 bus to get around, and I see buildings that look like this on both sides of the street. I also think it's a really important step towards relieving the pressures the housing crisis brings to our area. Rents are skyrocketing throughout our neighborhood with many folks having experienced huge rent increases in 2022, putting them into the severely rent-burned category, and these new 190 homes with 49 permanently affordable is really what we need. It's the kind of development every Council Member should want in their district, a mixed-use development with the ample affordable housing wellmatched to the incomes in the neighborhood as

thank you so much for allowing me the time to speak

about this project, and I really hope the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 Subcommittee votes to approve the 190 more very badly needed...

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Elizabeth.

Next person to speak is Mark Grippo. Mark, you may begin.

MARK GRIPPO: Hi, my name is Mark Grippo, and I reside in District 44. I'm testifying in support of rezoning on 1880 Coney Island Avenue. I've been living in this district for 15 years. Like me, the majority of the people that live in this district are renters. Living in an apartment that's affordable and rent-stabilized has been key to making sure I can provide for my wife and two kids. As a member of Local 79, I'm able to receive a living wage and benefits. Thanks to these two factors, I'm able to create beautiful memories in this district alongside my family. Today, I enjoy the financial stability to not have to worry about living paycheck to paycheck. I'm able to take vacations, personal days off, and to contribute to my local economy by spending money at the local businesses. Not having to worry about paying a high rent has allowed me to concentrate on building a future for my family and concentrate on other things. People in this district deserve

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

96

2 affordable housing and living wages, which both will

3 be generated by this project. With my testimony

4 today, I hope you vote in support of this project and

5 provide as many people as possible with the same

6 opportunities I was provided. Thank you very much for

7 your time.

1

8

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Mark.

9 Council Member Yeger, do you have any questions for

10 | this panel?

Mr. Grippo, I, too, am a resident of the 44th Council District, and, like you, I too am a renter. I'm a renter my whole life, but I want to make sure that you heard what I said earlier to your Colleagues from Local 79. Never, never has there been a job that got approved by me, by this Subcommittee, by the Land Use Committee, by this Council in my District that was not a union job. This is going to be a union job if the developer wants to build. He does not want to build, and that's why the union's not getting jobs, and I just want to make sure that you understand that the impediment to Local 79 getting good, safe, union

jobs on Coney Island Avenue is because the developer

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. I'm just going to ask if we can allow Jack Kaplan to come back in so Council Member Yeger can ask him the question.

I believe we lost him. Jack is back. Council Member Yeger, go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.

Chairman, I appreciate it, and we are still working out the kinks of the technology and we're three years in but it works sometimes.

Mr. Kaplan, thank you for being here. You are the Vice Chair of Community Board 12, and my question to you is, because we have had in our Community Board many, many multiples of hearings on housing proposals and various kinds of proposals, not just housing, but commercial and all kinds of development throughout our District. To your recollection, is there ever a time that a strictly residential proposal in our Community Board at any time in the last five, six years has been rejected by our Community Board?

YAAKOV KAPLAN: No. The only times we've talked when developers come to our Community Board to

2.2

2.3

hear from what the Community Board wants, we always iterate the same thing, that we want housing for our community in our community. When developers come to build for profit and not for the need of the community, what that does is it displaces people who grew up in the community, who spent their life in the community, whose grandparents, great grandparents, or people who just came to the community a few years earlier, they get displaced when developers build for people outside the community for profit versus building for people inside the community for what the community needs.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, so just to be clear, the no vote from Community Board 12 on 1880

Coney Island Avenue on this project is the first strictly residential proposal that received a no vote, there has never been a no vote to your recollection in the last five years or six years for a strictly residential proposal that received a no vote. This is unique in our Community Board. Is that correct?

YAAKOV KAPLAN: Correct, in the five, six years I'm at the Community Board, maybe even a little bit longer, maybe seven years now, we have never

begin and please start your video if you're here on

24

25

Zoom, please.

1

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

ISAAC MOGRABY: Hi, can you see me okay? CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can see you and hear you. Go ahead.

ISAAC MOGRABY: Okay, great. Thanks. My

name is Isaac Mograby. I do live within the area on the East 10th block, which has been the opposing block, but I want to say the reason I'm opposed to this structure that's being built on East 10th has nothing to do with it interfering with what some might say my light, my view, that's all irrelevant to me. I'm closer to the corner where it's not, mind you, it's almost one block long, this structure, and I'm not directly in back of it so it's not why I'm opposing it. Something I've just been watching and noticing and I heard the prior people that spoke on the panel, it became great that everybody here wants families to move in, wants a big structure, but all within reason, within limits of the community. Everybody is mentioning five stories. It looks like without a doubt everybody's for that, which the Councilman and everybody else had mentioned so they're not saying no to this project. They're just saying do it with the way it'll fit and not just the way that the dollars will fit within the developer's

MIRIAM KLEIN: It's Miriam Klein. Thank
you for having me. I am very strongly opposed to this
for safety reasons of the whole neighborhood. There
are not enough streets for parking, for traffic. If
an ambulance has to get through, it's a matter of
minutes, it's a matter of life and death. There's
just no room. It has to go somewhere else. That's
all. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much.

Next, we will have Elad Danino. Elad, if you can hear

me, please unmute yourself and you may begin.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: I think we're having trouble with him so we can call on the next one and then we can come back to him.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

1

3

4

6

7

8

now?

10

11

12 13

14

16

15

17

18

19

20

21

2.2 2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay, the next person I'll call on is Marvin Schlanger. Marvin, if you can hear me, please unmute yourself and you may begin. You can press star 6 to unmute yourself and you may begin.

MARVIN SCHLANGER: Hello, can you hear me

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can.

MARVIN SCHLANGER: Okay, my name is Marvin Schlanger. I live just two blocks away on East 9th Street and I've been living here for 36 years. One of the things that I find remarkable about those people who have been speaking in favor of this project including the members of the clergy that none of them live in the immediate area. They're speaking about people who are churches that are 20 minutes away. I don't know exactly where they live, but they live also probably in proximity to the churches so they are not affected by anything that they're saying now. It's the people here that are affected, and I'd like to also speak about something that's very, very different than anybody else has spoken. It's the issue of crime. There have been statistics that are available online, studies that have been done by the

2	ELAD DANINO: Can you guys hear me?
3	CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you,
4	but we need you to put your camera on as well.
5	Elad, you can go ahead if you're having

Elad, you can go ahead if you're having complications.

ELAD DANINO: Okay, you guys can hear me?
CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you.
ELAD DANINO: Is it better now?
CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you.

ELAD DANINO: I'm a local broker and just wanted to tell everybody that I understand that the housing is needed, definitely needed, but at the same time I live in the neighborhood and I know how congested it is so I think it has to be done in a logical way, and, as everybody has mentioned, it can be done coming together, maybe making the building a little smaller, less units, and that's what I think.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Elad, for your testimony. This panel is now excused, and the next panel I will be calling up is Lawrence Dayan, Jane Choueka, Elaine Laty (phonetic), and Joyce Chabbott. Excuse me if I mispronounce your name.

2.2

2.3

Go ahead.

2 Lawrence Dayan, if you can hear me, you may begin.

3 You may begin, Lawrence.

2.2

2.3

thank this Committee and, of course, Councilman Yeger for his hard work and his commitment and love for our community and our neighborhood. I live in the neighborhood, lived there for my whole life, and the key factors like everybody's talking about is safety, traffic, parking, all the above. It's not a place to put an enormous structure of just countless apartments and homes, and it's something that is just too large for the spot. Thank you for your time and, again, appreciate everybody's service to the neighborhood.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Lawrence.

The next person that will testify is Jane Choueka.

Sorry if I mispronounced it. Jane, if you can hear

me, please unmute and you may begin.

JANE CHOUEKA: Hi. I've lived in this area for my entire life, 60 years. We've been living here for generations, and the area is like everyone said, a family area, large families, and the congestion is just unbearable. As it is with the traffic, getting from Ocean Parkway to Coney Island Avenue can take

stand with the current zoning of the building code.

SUBCOMMITTEE	ON	ZONTNG	AND	FRANCHISES

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Once again, thank you for hearing me out, and I do appreciate it.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Council Member Yeger, do you have a question for this panel?

Thank you so much to this applicant team.

I'm going to call on Logan Phares and Asia Thomas for the next witnesses. If you can hear me, Logan, you may begin.

LOGAN PHARES: Great. Thank you, Chair Riley, Council Member Yeger, and Members of the Subcommittee for the opportunity to share testimony in support of this project. My name is Logan Phares, and I serve as the Political Director of Open New York. Open New York is an independent grassroots prohousing non-profit. New York is in a housing crisis. Over the past two decades, available jobs have grown far faster in the city than the number of homes, meaning more renters are competing for the same number of apartments, and landlords hold all of the bargaining power. Right now, New Yorkers are facing rent increases of up to 50, 60, and 70 percent as rent discounts offered during the pandemic expire. This project would create over 200 apartments including (INAUDIBLE) income-restricted apartments,

My name is Daniel Setton. I (INAUDIBLE) between O and

2.2

2.3

P right behind the property. I'm opposing of the project even though, in essence, if they would work with us and not make it seven stories, I would not oppose it. I would be totally okay with it. If it was five, I'd be totally okay with it. I think affordable housing is very important. I think that we definitely need to help the people that need the help, but it doesn't seem like the developer is all into that because if he was he would make it from seven to five which other people have said so in that case I am in support of a self-storage, and I would definitely be the first customer to join the self-storage facility if you ever open it up. Again, I oppose the plans.

Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Daniel. The next person to speak will be David Masrou. David, if you can hear me, please unmute and you may begin.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: David, it's star 6 on your phone to unmute.

DAVID MASROU: Yes. Good afternoon. Thank you very much for hearing me. I live on East 10th between P and O, right behind the proposed building.

Now, we are really very concerned about the zoning change being considered for construction at the 1880-

CHANCY BLUMENFRUCHT: Hi. Do you hear me?

6

8

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can hear you, 3 Chancy.

4 CHANCY BLUMENFRUCHT: Hi, how are you?
5 I've been living in the neighborhood for over 30

7 happened on Nostrand Avenue was a disaster for the

9 and became actually a large parking lot. I don't know

neighborhood, destroyed the whole retail footprint,

years. I do have to agree with the Councilman what

10 enough about this because I was just notified about

11 this very, very shortly, like I was notified about

12 | yesterday. I could not research everything, but if it

13 | is the same developer that did Nostrand Avenue, I

14 would be very leery of what the true intentions are

and if it's really for all of those people seeking

16 affordable housing which I know is a need. I'm not

17 sure about the intentions so I definitely would be

18 opposed to it until much more is researched and much

19 more is told to the neighborhood that this is going

20 | into. That's all.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Do we have

22 Yeta Solomon on the phone?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: I don't

24 | believe we do. Oh, we do. Yeta, can you unmute

25 | yourself?

2.2

2.3

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: You can press star 6 and you may begin.

Yeta, you may press star 6 and you may begin. Yeta, are you there?

Okay, we'll move on to the next panel.

The next panel I'll call up will be Sam Levy-Kadi,

Meir Erani, Jennifer Halfon, and Freida Choueka. So
sorry for mispronouncing these names.

 $\label{eq:theorem} \mbox{The first person to testify will be Sam} $$ \mbox{Levy-Kadi.}$ 

SAM LEVY-KADI: Can you hear me?

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, we can. Go ahead,
Sam.

(INAUDIBLE) behind the proposed structure. I can tell you that there are times that I'll get home at 8, 9, 10 o'clock at night, and I will be circling around within a four-block radius for 20, 30 minutes, and I have to give up eventually and I'm like okay, I'm going to park by Kings Highway and then I have to wake up at 6:45 in the morning in order to walk the 10, 15 minutes in order to get to my car to go to move it, to put money into the meter, and I have a very busy day where I'm starting my day at like 7:15,

2.2

2.3

I have to run to a meeting. Everything is just crazy in the area. Like everyone is saying, parking is absurd. Traffic can sometimes 15, 20 minutes to go four block, five blocks. I can only imagine what's going to happen if you go and you put more. There is a restaurant on Coney Island between O and P which before they put in their eight or nine parking spots, it used to be even worse, the parking, so now if you're going to put in another 200 plus families, it's going to be an absolutely nightmare. I'm okay with putting in five stories. I think that affordable housing is a very important thing, but to go in to put a seven-story monstrosity, eight-story

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much. The next person we'll call is Meir Erani. Meir, you may begin.

monstrosity is not the place. That's all.

MEIR ERANI: Thank you very much. Thank
you, Mr. Riley. I'm a resident of East 10th Street,
almost right behind the center of the proposed
construction. I feel that building a monstrosity like
that is just not what the community needs. We need
affordable housing. Yes, we're in for that, but
affordable housing with three- and four-bedrooms,

proposal and will not help the community at all so I

am firmly against the building. My personal take

24

are built, but the infrastructure between the sewer,

entire life. Everybody knows you cannot drive down

proposal. I only heard about it recently. I've

listened to all of the comments, and I can tell you

as a resident and as someone who's been involved in

2.3

24

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

public things, it's a terrific thing. We do need public housing, but this proposal provides for less than 30 percent of the structure will be available housing. The developer wants to make a great deal of money. He's not interested in building it just for public housing, affordable housing. Otherwise, he would agree to building a five-story structure. The proposal would create massive issues with traffic and parking, and it's simply not in the context of our neighborhood of one- and two-family homes. Going straight from (INAUDIBLE) Avenue all the way to Nostrand Avenue, we have many five-story structures, six-structures on Ocean Parkway. Affordable housing, again, is extremely important, but this proposal is not addressing that at all. It's simply a proposal where the developer wants to make a great deal of money, and I'm certainly opposed to it and I feel that it's a no-brainer. Thank you for your time in allowing me my comments.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Robert. The next person to testify will be Murray Choueka.

Murray, you may begin.

MURRAY CHOUEKA: Hi, I'm Murray Choueka.

(INAUDIBLE) time. I've lived in the area my entire

oppose this project. The traffic is insane. It just

2 keeps getting worse. I drove to my brother's house on

3 | East 10th, O and P last week. I think I circled for

4 parking for about 30 minutes and ended up parking

5 | blocks away. Adding this building is just going to

6 make it worse. There are many children that go to

7 school in the area. My nieces and nephews go to

8 school in the area. They walk home sometimes in the

9 dark. I think that this project is going to be

10 unsafe, cause tons of traffic. I think someone

11 mentioned ambulances can't get through. I strongly

12 oppose this. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Lastly, we'll have Bishop Waylyn Hobbs.

WAYLYN HOBBS: Yes, thank you. I'm here in support of the project. We hear the Governor even now talking about how New York State is growing in job opportunities but places to live is not there and so we need affordable housing that will help to keep our Brooklyn, Coney Island what it is. I have many members, although our church is not directly in that area, but I have members that come from Long Island, from New Jersey, and all parts of Brooklyn, and New York needs more affordable housing. I'm in support of

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

## SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.2

2.3

2 it. I think it'll give people an opportunity for
3 better living and so I support it.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Council Member Yeger.

Thank you. This panel is excused. The next panel I'm going to call up is Seema Stein.

Seema, if you can hear me, please unmute yourself and you may begin. Seema Stein, and I'm going to call again Yeta Solomon because I still see Yeta is in the chat.

Seema, if you're calling in, please press star 6 to unmute yourself. Okay, I think we lost Seema.

Yeta Solomon. Yeta, if you're still here, please unmute yourself and you may begin.

Okay, I don't believe we have neither applicant. Counsel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL MARTINEZ-RUBIO: Chair, so what we'll do now, we'll do a last call for those of you who are still in the Zoom that have not testified yet. If you can either raise your hand using the Zoom function or if you're calling via phone, do a star 9 so that staff can identify you and we'll promote you so that you can unmute yourselves

of Coney Island Avenue and Avenue O where this

## SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

1

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

simply doesn't.

2 in here. There's been multiple speakers, I think 3 probably at this point perhaps two dozen or something 4 like that, there have been two speakers from 5 supposedly Brooklyn who have been in support of this rezoning, and one of them is around 45 minutes away 6 7 and one of them lives nearby. This represents something, and it's that this community uniformly is 8 against this sort of rezoning in general and, not only that, understand that it's not within the 10 11 interest of anybody living here to bring in these sorts of people in. It's not that we don't need 12 housing. We need housing for the community. We need 13 14 housing that would represent what we want, and this

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Do we have anyone else registered to testify?

We have a Tery. Tery, please unmute yourself and you may begin.

TERY BLATT (PHONETIC): Hello. Yes, thanks for taking my call. I live in the neighborhood. My name is Tery Blatt. My children grew up here. My family's been living here for at least 60 years, and my husband's family, and then when I got married, we moved in about 30 years ago, and the traffic that has

Thank you. There being no more members of

the public who wish to testify on LUs 168 and 169

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES relating to 1880-1888 Coney Island Avenue Rezoning Proposal, the public hearing is now closed and the items are laid over. That concludes today's business. I would like to thank the members of the public, my Colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land Use, and other Council Staff and Sergeant-at-Arms for participating in today's meeting. This meeting is hereby adjourned. Thank you. [GAVEL] 

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 13, 2023