

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

November 4, 2022
Start: 10:13 a.m.
Recess: 12:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Kamillah Hanks
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Tiffany Cabán
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Robert F. Holden
Rita C. Joseph
Darlene Mealy
Althea V. Stevens

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jumaane Williams
Public Advocate

Nora Daniel
Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice Chief of Staff

Sarah Cassel
Director of Diversion and Reentry Initiatives
Office of Neighborhood Safety

Cana Osborne
Office of Neighborhood Safety Deputy Director

Karina Christiansen
Office of Neighborhood Safety Deputy Director

Rodny Carvajal
Office of Neighborhood Safety Senior Director

Mike Perry
CMS True 2 Life

Pen Perry
CMS True 2 Life

Jacqueline Gosdigian
Brooklyn Defenders

Roslyn Morrison
Legal Aid Society

Rachel Swaner
Research Director at the Center for Court
Innovation

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and
3 welcome to today's New York Council hearing for the
4 Committee on Public Safety. If you wish to submit
5 testimony, you may at testimony@council.nyc.gov. At
6 this time, please silence all electronic devices.
7 Thank you for your cooperation. Chair, we are ready
8 to begin.

9 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Good morning. Hello,
10 I am Council Member Kamillah Hanks, Chair on the
11 Committee of Public Safety, and I am joined today by
12 Council Member Stevens and Council Member Williams.
13 Today's committee is holding an oversight hearing on
14 supporting providers serving the City's crisis
15 management system. The Committee will also hear two
16 pieces of related legislation. Introduction 439,
17 sponsored by Council Member Nantasha Williams, which
18 requires the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice to
19 evaluate the effectiveness of criminal justice
20 programs that received funding from the City. And
21 Introduction 756, sponsored by myself, which requires
22 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice to provide
23 training and operational support to not-for-profit
24 service providers participating in New York City's
25 crisis management. The New York City Crisis

1 Management System, also known as CMS, is a violence
2 reduction program based in-part on the Cure Violence
3 model which aims to prevent gun violence using a
4 community-based public health approach. This anti-
5 violence model works to detect and interrupt
6 conflicts, identify and treat individuals at the
7 highest risk of becoming-- of committing violent acts
8 and change social norms. To prevent patterns of
9 escalating violence and retaliation, CMS relies on
10 credible messengers, also known as violence
11 interrupters. These trained individuals are
12 culturally-competent community members, many of whom
13 are formerly incarcerated or previously belonged to a
14 gang. They provide credibility that is crucial to
15 conducting outreach and building relationships with
16 high-risk youth. CMS also includes community-based
17 wrap-around services and interventions in targeted
18 neighborhoods such as mental health services for
19 youth at risk for violence, legal advocacy and
20 education, therapeutic services available to victims
21 and community members impacted by gun violence, and
22 increased investment in educational placement, job
23 readiness, and training. Currently, CMS consists of
24 more than 50 community-based organizations operating
25

1
2 in 22 communities experiencing high rates of gun
3 violence. In recent years, the City significantly
4 increased its investment in CMS, expanding the
5 program's funding to more than 100 million in Fiscal
6 Year 2022. However, I believe that there is more
7 that the City can be doing to help service providers
8 doing anti-violence work. As CMS grows, the City
9 must provide the support, resources, and funding that
10 is necessary to deliver high-quality services. My
11 bill, Introduction 756, aims to do just that,
12 requiring MOCJ to provide training and operational
13 support to not-for-profit organizations participating
14 in the City Crisis Management System. I am eager to
15 hear testimony from MOCJ regarding this legislation
16 and to learn more about existing efforts in the
17 Administration and how-- and takes to support this
18 important work and help these service providers
19 thrive. With that, I look forward to hearing the
20 Administration and public testimony. And I'm also
21 joined by Public Advocate Jumaane Williams. Thank
22 you so much for joining us today.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Before we begin
24 testimony we're going to turn to the Public Advocate
25 Jumaane Williams and Council Member Nantasha Williams

1
2 who is the sponsor of one of the legislations being
3 heard. Go ahead.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so
5 much, Madam Chair, for giving me a moment to speak.
6 My name is Jumaane Williams and I'm Public Advocate
7 of the City of New York. Again, thank you to the
8 Chair and the Members of the Committee for Public
9 Safety for holding this important hearing. Stress and
10 trauma of the COVID-19 pandemic led to an increase of
11 violence, particularly gun violence in our city.
12 Although the spike in gun violence has begun to
13 decline, even one shooting is too many. We must also
14 make clear that this violence has increased all
15 across the country, but New York City does have an
16 opportunity to lead. While it may be necessary to
17 make an arrest and take a person who's perpetrating
18 an act of gun violence off the streets, it is clear
19 that traditional policing by itself cannot address
20 the root problems of-- the root of the problem, and
21 thus does not have the long-term effects that we
22 desire. In September of this year, my office
23 released a report on reimagining gun violence
24 prevention which outlined a number of alternative
25 solutions to traditional policing. Mayor Adams and I

1
2 sometimes disagree on the most impactful ways to
3 address crime and violence in our city, but I applaud
4 his support of alternative solutions to violence,
5 including violence interrupters and Crisis Management
6 System. I'm also proud to have been one of the
7 leading voices getting this off the ground. So to
8 see this go from the five million dollars originally
9 allotted to where it is now makes me very proud.
10 This city's Crisis Management System is a network
11 that deploys teams of credible managers-- it's
12 actually the Crisis Management System is a network
13 that is centered around credible messengers who help
14 mediate conflicts in the street, but it also does so
15 much more than that. It helps connect high-risk
16 individuals to services that can reduce a long-term
17 services and risk of violence. We make sure that the
18 Crisis Management System was not just the Cure
19 Violence program, but also provided non-punitive
20 wrap-around services including school conflict
21 mediation, employment programs, mental health
22 services, and legal services. We have evidence that
23 alternatives to policing work to reduce violence. CMS
24 data from 2010 to 2019 did the opposite of what
25 people said would happen. They told us the sky would

1 fall in and crime would rise, but we showed that the
2 program has contributed to an average 40 percent
3 reduction in shootings across program areas compared
4 to a 31 percent decline in shootings in the 17
5 precincts in New York City with the highest rates of
6 violence. We also found that violence decreased in
7 those catchment areas even further than the city as a
8 whole. Brownsville, Brooklyn 73rd Precinct
9 exemplifies success and necessity of these type of
10 programs. In December 2020, police withdrew from
11 their regular posts on [inaudible] Boulevard for five
12 days. Instead of a police presence a CMS group was
13 called, called Brownsville In Violence Out, watched
14 over the two blocks between Picken [sp?] and Sutter
15 [sic] Avenues. No valid 911 or 311 calls were made
16 during this pilot. Second round of this experiment a
17 few months later saw the Cure Violence group and
18 their community partners finding a missing four-year-
19 old and intervening in a fight brewing between groups
20 of teenage girls all without the help of police. I
21 also want to shout out CCD run by Kay Baine [sp?].
22 I'm very proud of that because he was a legislative
23 director at the time when we got this off the ground.
24 And the [inaudible] he has in Queensbridge went a
25

1 whole year-- the largest public housing in the
2 country went a whole year with no shootings at all.
3 This is what public safety can look like, an
4 investment in communities with robust services and
5 allowing those closest to the problem to lead the
6 solution. Absolutely understand that our law
7 enforcement partners are necessary. The problem is
8 when we ask them to do the job of so many others.
9 That is why I'm expressing my support and hope to
10 sign onto Intro. 756 introduced by Chair Hanks, which
11 would require the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice
12 to provide training and operational support to
13 nonprofit-- not-for-profit organizations
14 participating in CMS. Also, integral to expand the
15 system is Intro. 0439 which I'd also like to sign
16 onto introduced by Council Member Nantasha Williams
17 which mandates that MOCJ evaluate the performance of
18 any organization that received funding from the City
19 for criminal justice related services and submit a
20 summary of evaluation to the Mayor and the Speaker.
21 As a matter of fact, after-- when we had the original
22 pilot program, there was funding made available for
23 this program to be evaluated. I'm not sure what
24 happened. Thank you to both Chair Hanks and Council
25

1
2 Member Williams for introducing these important
3 bills. As widespread support for alternatives to
4 policing grows, I'm excited to work with the Mayor's
5 Office and the City Council to support and expand
6 these critical programs and services that have bene
7 proven to keep New Yorkers safe. As I mentioned,
8 this is a problem all across the country, and I also
9 know that data means nothing to people who are
10 suffering in the city. We have an opportunity to
11 lead here and we should. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much,
13 Mr. Public Advocate.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
15 Williams?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you so
17 much, Chair, for holding this very important hearing.
18 I am excited that my bill, Intro 439 is being heard
19 today, a Local Law to amend the New York City Charter
20 in relation to requiring the Mayor's Office of
21 Criminal Justice to evaluate the effectiveness of
22 criminal justice programs that are receiving funding
23 from the City. This bill would require the criminal
24 justice office to evaluate the performance of the
25 city-funded criminal justice-related organizations

1 and provide a summary of such evaluations that must
2 be submitted to the Mayor and the Council annually.

3 Crisis Management organizations are dedicated to
4 identifying and de-escalating potential acts of
5 violence, as well as preventing them from happening.

6 They are devoted to keeping the public informed about
7 potential threats, and they also help communities
8 respond to crises in an organized way. In my former

9 role as a Board Member at a Crisis Management
10 organization, I'm personally well-aware of the

11 importance of protecting our communities. As they
12 say, an ounce of prevention is worth more than a

13 pound of cure, and these groups are providing vital,
14 preventative solutions to the community. Because

15 Crisis Management organizations are integral to our
16 communities, it is necessary to ensure that they are

17 operating at their optimal capacity. Intro 439 will
18 provide transparency on the effectiveness of these

19 programs to see areas that might need improvement,
20 but more importantly to highlight the amazing work

21 that is already being done and figure out ways to
22 duplicate efforts and implement these solutions and

23 practices throughout the City. Thank you.
24

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you Council
3 Member. Next, we'll turn to the Administration for
4 testimony. Administration we're going to be hearing
5 from the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice Nora
6 Daniel who is the Chief of Staff. We also have Sarah
7 Cassel who is the Director of Alternatives to
8 Incarceration and Reentry Services, Cana Osborne who
9 is the Deputy Executive Director of Office of
10 Neighborhood Safety, Karina Christiansen who's the
11 Deputy Director-- Deputy Executive Director of the
12 Office of Neighborhood Safety, and then Rodney
13 Carvajal who's the Director of-- another Senior
14 Director of Office of Neighborhood Safety. So, Ms.
15 Daniel, you could begin. I mean, I'm just going to
16 do a little oath here. So if you all could just
17 affirm you're going to tell the truth, the whole
18 truth and nothing but the truth before this committee
19 and to answer honestly to Council Member questions?
20 You all do, great. Thank you. Go ahead.

21 CHIEF DANIEL: Good morning Chair Hanks,
22 members of the public, and members of the Committee
23 on Public Safety, and Public Advocate Williams.
24 Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony to
25 the Council. My name is Nora Daniel, and I'm chief

1 of Staff for the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice.
2 I'm joined today by Sarah Cassel, Director of
3 Diversion and Reentry Initiatives from the Office of
4 Neighborhood Safety, ONS, Deputy Directors Cana
5 Osborne and Karina Christiansen, and Rodny Carvajal,
6 Senior Director for ONS. Thank you so much for the
7 opportunity. MOCJ advises the Mayor on Public Safety
8 Policy and designs and implements programs and
9 justice initiatives from the New York City Crisis
10 Management System to alternatives to incarceration
11 and reentry services. We work with law enforcement
12 agencies and personnel, other City agencies, service
13 providers, not-for-profits, foundations, and the
14 public to implement effective strategies that make
15 the City safe and fair for all New Yorkers,
16 recognizing the interconnected and holistic nature of
17 public safety in historically disinvested communities
18 that also experience the brunt of heightened levels
19 of gun violence. In December 2021, this body
20 codified the Office of Neighborhood Safety. ONS
21 housed within MOCJ is a crucial component of the
22 public safety continuum and is a necessary part of
23 our efforts to produce public safety and partnership
24 with local communities. ONS combines efforts from
25

1
2 the Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety, MAP,
3 the Office to Prevent Gun Violence, OPGV, and Atlas
4 to share resources and holistic assistance for New
5 Yorkers affected by violence. ONS teams work with
6 our network of residents and community leaders to
7 ensure that more New Yorkers have the agency and
8 ability to define public safety directly for
9 themselves. As such, ONS relies on the strength,
10 experience and expertise of community as guiding
11 principles and is committed to ensuring that
12 marginalized communities have access to capital and
13 opportunities. Given these initiatives' goals of
14 enhancing safety, Atlas, OPGV and MAP serve
15 overlapping populations in the City's highest crime
16 neighborhoods. All three programs are part of a
17 larger effort to reduce violence and prevent and
18 minimize criminal justice involvement by addressing
19 the root causes of violence that have
20 disproportionately impacted ONS service communities.
21 I will share here a few more details about the OPGV
22 portfolio and the Crisis Management System. Launched
23 in 2014, OPGV works to address gun violence through a
24 shift in social norms and the work of community
25 members in mediating disputes to prevent such

1 shootings. The Crisis Management System, CMS,
2 deploys teams of credible messengers, community
3 members whose backgrounds allow them to connect with
4 and motivate at-risk individuals to 31 sites where
5 they implement the Cure Violence model of mediating
6 conflict on the street and direct New Yorkers to
7 services that can create peace and support healing,
8 including a year-round employment program, mental
9 health services, trauma counseling and other
10 opportunity-centered resources. This initiative has
11 brought measurable benefits to communities citywide.
12 Researchers found that across CMS sites shooting
13 victimizations fell by 28 percent over the first 24
14 months following a site launch. Compare to the 24
15 months prior to the launch with gun injuries down 33
16 percent. Researchers also found that CMS increased
17 trust in police and decreased residents' reliance on
18 violence to settle disputes. As a part of the
19 City's historic investment in public safety and in
20 partnership with the City Council, the City increased
21 its commitment to CMS and anti-violence work by
22 launching an RFP for the CMS system in FY22. The
23 RFP awards will be announced in the spring of 2023.
24 The Administration continues to improve its
25

1
2 commitment to innovative programming that enhances
3 safety within communities. In addition to
4 investments in CMS, the City is also expanding its
5 MAP programing to include a total of 30 MAP sites, up
6 from 15. We are looking forward to implementing this
7 programming in the coming months. I'll now elaborate
8 a little bit on the bills the Council has introduced.
9 Intro 439 would require MOCJ to submit an annual
10 report on criminal justice programs, including
11 alternatives to incarceration, reentry and other
12 programs. We are supportive of the goals of Intro
13 439 and we look forward to the-- to working with the
14 Council to ensure that we're able to present the
15 information in the manner that would best demonstrate
16 the effectiveness of the programs. Intro 756 would
17 require MOCJ to provide training and operational
18 support to organizations in the Crisis Management
19 System. MOCJ supports the goals of Intro 756, and we
20 are committed to provide and support the CMS
21 organization's need to thrive. Currently, CMS
22 providers are subcontracted to the BlocPower. Under
23 this subcontract, CMS providers have been afforded
24 one-on-one support through the subcontracting process
25 to ensure that they are able to fulfill the

1
2 Administrative requirements of contracting while
3 continuing to provide the vital services that support
4 our city's public safety continuum. In addition,
5 recently, CMS providers participated in nonprofit
6 capacity building workshop provided as a partnership
7 between MOCJ and the law firm Cleary, Gottlieb, Steen
8 and Hamilton. I'm grateful to the Cleary for their
9 support in that. We are currently working with
10 Cleary to schedule a second workshop and other
11 supports as needed. ONS continues to explore ways to
12 provide additional support to CMS providers to ensure
13 that they have the training and validation required
14 to operate their program. The Administration is
15 grateful for the Council support of the Crisis
16 Management System and our criminal justice programs,
17 and we look forward to working with you to implement
18 the goals of the bills. Thank you for the
19 opportunity to present testimony on MOCJ's work, and
20 I'm happy to answer any questions.

21 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much,
22 Ms. Daniel. Before I allow my colleague, Council
23 Member Williams to kick off the questioning, I would
24 like to recognize Council Members Bottcher, Council
25 Member Holden, and De La Rosa who have joined us.

1
2 So, thank you. Council Member Williams? I was going
3 to defer to you.

4 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Chair is so
5 gracious. Thank you. Thank you for being here
6 today. Can you tell me what research found that
7 across CMS sites shooting victimization fell by 20
8 percent? Like, where does that research come from?
9 Do you have a source?

10 CHIEF DANIEL: It was a John Jay study
11 done, I believe, in 2014, and you know, we're always
12 looking to continue to evaluate the programs.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Have you
14 don't any recent evaluations of the programs, and if
15 so, what is the methodology of the evaluation?

16 CHIEF DANIEL: so, we're continuously
17 monitoring the programs, and we are currently in the
18 process of an independent evaluation through a
19 Federal grant. When we have more on that, we will
20 definitely share it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. And are
22 Crisis Management organizations, could you share with
23 us sort of what metrics of success they're held to if
24 you can?

1
2 CHIEF DANIEL: Sure. We work with
3 organizations to ensure that they are appropriately
4 responding to shootings that they're involved in the
5 community and that they are consistently performing
6 on their program. Each site has a variety of
7 programs, and so we work with them to make sure that
8 those programs are being administered effectively.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Do you
10 have a specific criteria you use to evaluate new
11 needs within the CMS system? So, for instance, I
12 have my own little theories about the Cure Violence
13 model perhaps needing to be reworked, considering
14 like the nature of crimes. Like, a lot of crimes now
15 are originating online and the original Cure Violence
16 cease fire programs really were about physical in-
17 person, in the street sort of activity, if you will.
18 So do you have a way to assess or criteria to
19 evaluating new needs, new models?

20 CHIEF DANIEL: So, you know, as we're
21 looking at the independent evaluation, we are
22 consistently working with organizations to help them
23 to develop methods to or ways to improve whatever it
24 is that they're doing. So, each-- because each
25 community is different, some of those things can look

1
2 different depending on what people are seeing. You
3 know, I hear you about the-- that models can be
4 different depending on what's happening when they
5 were develop and new technologies that come out, and
6 I definitely think it's worth having a conversation
7 about, you know, if there's something specific that
8 you're seeing within your district and how we might
9 be able to be helpful.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. I noticed
11 on your list that life camp is-- says that it's in my
12 council district, but their office is located in the
13 speaker's district. Can you explain that map? I
14 don't know if it was a mistake. I mean, Life Camp
15 just goes everywhere really, but they technically are
16 placed in the Speaker's district.

17 CHIEF DANIEL: understandably they also
18 do work in yours as well, so I think that we have it
19 as both, but if there was a mistake, we can correct
20 it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, it
22 doesn't have it as both. And I'm aware of some
23 things that they do in my district, like I know they
24 have a program at Eagle Academy that's in my district
25 but for the most part a lot of their work is

1 Southside, which you know, I only have a sliver of
2 Southside. It's really the Speaker's district, and a
3 little bit of the Southside that I do have, King of
4 Kings is actually a little closer.

5
6 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we can definitely talk
7 about what services are available in your district,
8 and we can correct the list if there's a mistake.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. The last
10 thing that I'll say, I know we actually FOIL'd the
11 contracts by you all redacted the sections that we
12 actually wanted to see, which was-- what was the
13 sections, Althea?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [inaudible]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, we wanted
16 to actually see the scope of work. So what are
17 Crisis Management organizations actually supposed to
18 deliver, and you guys redacted that information. So
19 can you actually tell us what is the scope of work
20 and the contract? Maybe some of the contracts look a
21 little different, but if you can give us a general
22 sense of what is the scope of work in the contracts
23 with the Crisis Management organization?

24 CHIEF DANIEL: So, scopes of work, each
25 organization has their own scope of work, but

1
2 generally speaking for a CMS site you have the
3 credible messengers, Cure violence, you have school
4 conflict mediation, and you have therapeutic
5 services. But if we have more-- so for the questions
6 about, you know, if there's specific things that you
7 would like to see that aren't being done or specific
8 things that you're interested in that have-- that you
9 would like to see enhanced, we can definitely discuss
10 that as well. And in addition, we also have-- if you
11 would like to see like a full range of what we're
12 looking for-- I mentioned the RFP in our-- in the
13 testimony. We can also share the RFP documents as
14 well, and that will give you a really full look at
15 what we're-- what we're looking for from CMS
16 organizations.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
18 Yeah, we would love to see the RPF, and part of the
19 reason why we wanted to see the scope of work is
20 because we really wanted to understand, you know,
21 what are these organizations tasked with doing and
22 how are they implementing that work and how that work
23 is being evaluated. And further you know, we noticed
24 that some of the Crisis Management organizations may
25 have really great therapeutic services but perhaps

1
2 their Credible Messenger program isn't up to par. Or
3 maybe they're not-- or maybe they don't have sort of
4 scope of work or contracting to provide a suite of
5 services that might be useful for that community, but
6 another crisis management organization is. so you
7 know, it is our thoughts and our hopes that the work
8 can be standardized so that there is a model that
9 sort of fits across the board and allow for the
10 flexibility for organizations that might need to
11 tweak things to fit their community, but there should
12 be like a base level standard. And from some of our
13 anecdotal sort of research, it was hard to sort of
14 put our hand on line a current theme across the many
15 Crisis Management organizations, but look forward to
16 speaking with you again about this and the bill, and
17 just want to thank the Chair again.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Council
19 Member Williams. Before I get into my line of
20 questioning, we've been joined by Council Member
21 Ariola. So, thank you so much. We're just going to
22 kind of go over like the baseline, you know,
23 questioning for the Mayor's Office of Criminal
24 Justice. So, describe the current landscape of the
25 City's Crisis Management System and what are the

1
2 different components and types of services that
3 comprise CMS.

4 CHIEF DANIEL: So, the Crisis Management
5 System is 31 catchment sites across the City.
6 Generally speaking, they include Cure Violence
7 crisis-- you know, Cure Violence and Credible
8 Messengers, school conflict mediation and therapeutic
9 services. There are also a wide range of services
10 that are offered within different catchment areas,
11 depending on the provider that's providing it. And I
12 will turn it over to Deputy Executive Director
13 Osborne to discuss a little bit more.

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: Good morning.
15 So, the Crisis Management System-- Good morning. The
16 Crisis Management System sites each contain the Cure
17 Violence model, therapeutic services, school conflict
18 mediation. All of the sites are also afforded legal
19 aid services for participants or community members
20 that may need it. We also have job set asides
21 through our anti-gun violence employment program and
22 job readiness through DOP Works Plus [sic].

23 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
24 What other city agencies are involved in the
25

1
2 operations of CMS and what roles do other agencies
3 serve?

4 CHIEF DANIEL: so, we work with a broad
5 variety of other agencies, especially when we-- when
6 there's other needs that arise. So, as Ms. Osborne
7 mentioned, we work with DOP. We work with-- you
8 know, we have to-- we liaise with DOHMH and H+H.
9 There are other agencies that we also work with, and
10 I'll let her add a little bit more color to that.

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: Sure. So we
12 also work with the NYPD on a high level just to get
13 hotspot information about areas that may need
14 additional attention from our Crisis Management
15 System partners. We work with the DOE. We work with
16 DOH for our hospital response component. We also
17 have partnerships with ACS and DOC for some of our
18 partners who work in ACS secure and non-secure
19 detention facilities as well as provide mentorship
20 services on Rikers Island.

21 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
22 What is the breakdown of the funding for CMS between
23 MOCJ and the other coordinating agencies?

24 CHIEF DANIEL: I do not have a full
25 breakdown of the funding between MOCJ and the other

1
2 coordinating agencies. Generally speaking, the CMS
3 system is about 75 million.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Does CMS receive
5 funding from any other city agencies or non-city
6 resources, I should say?

7 CHIEF DANIEL: They-re-- directly, we do.
8 We have received federal funding for CMS. Both for
9 the evaluation and then also through-- through grant.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: When it comes to, you
11 know, capacity building and organization's ability to
12 host a program, a CMS program, what is the
13 contracting process for programs that receive funding
14 through MOCJ? Like, talk me through how that works,
15 how they're identified.

16 CHIEF DANIEL: So, previously through CMS
17 we would identify providers from recommendations from
18 the community, from the Council Member, and from --
19 and also working with the NYPD.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Is there any criteria
21 that they-- that a recommended organization that is
22 going to host one of these programs, is there any
23 type of pre-requisite that is necessary for them
24 before they-- a track record, you know, any--
25

1
2 CHIEF DANIEL: [interposing] That is
3 usually what we're looking at, yeah.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay.

5 CHIEF DANIEL: However, as I mentioned,
6 the RFP. You know, there's a whole list of
7 requirements that organizations will have to meet in
8 order to be selected through the RFP process.

9 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So what accounting,
10 record-keeping, or data is shared-- sharing is
11 required by MOCJ as part of the contract terms with
12 CMS program operators?

13 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we use a database that
14 allows us to look at the work and to track and
15 monitor what our organizations are doing. I'll let
16 Ms. Osborne talk a little bit more about that
17 database.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you.

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: Sure. So, the
20 database, we've implemented about for the last year
21 to capture a lot of the work that we had for our ONS
22 portfolio. So, currently we have a partnership with
23 Care For [sic] to collect the data for our Cure
24 Violence Programming, and also we've added our
25

1
2 therapeutic services and school conflict mediation to
3 that, to that database.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: What does MOCJ's role
5 as a contract manager for CMS programs entail? What
6 does that look like?

7 CHIEF DANIEL: So, currently, the
8 contracts are subcontracted through BlocPower, and
9 they work with an organization called Promise Pay
10 [sic] that works with the CMS providers to get them
11 through the subcontracting process. So essentially,
12 it's one on one work with getting folks there,
13 helping people to get their scopes, their budgets,
14 and then also to work through the actual process of
15 submitting those documents and making sure they have
16 everything that they need.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So, what would be
18 some of the challenges that an organizations may face
19 when going through that process?

20 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: It sometimes
21 difficult for organizations to develop the
22 appropriate scope of work and to match it the budget
23 that they want to have.

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Is there any kind of
25 work that you do, technical support to allow-- which

1
2 is what we want our bill to do, but is there anything
3 that you think that needs to be done to get
4 organizations prepared to do this kind of work
5 through that process?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: I think, you know, they
7 currently-- they get one on one help in order to be--
8 one on one support in order to be able to complete
9 those documents.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay. What type of
11 quantitative data is examined when evaluating
12 success?

13 CHIEF DANIEL: So, I will let-- so when
14 we're looking at success, we're obviously-- in order
15 to select the sits, we're looking at levels of gun
16 violence over the last five years. As we're
17 measuring success for programs, that is one of the
18 things that we're also looking at. We're also
19 looking at how they are operating within the
20 community, whether or not they're responding to
21 issues of gun violence, whether or not they are
22 implementing the programs, those are the kinds of
23 things that we're looking at.

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So, as communities
25 and CMS programs approach violence prevention and

1
2 intervention in different ways are there efforts to
3 facilitate a collaboration between organization or
4 collective works, a collaborative on developing best
5 practices for improved program effectiveness?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: So, yes, we are-- our
7 providers do have meetings where they come together
8 to try to support one another and share practices
9 across the continuum.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Is there anything
11 official? How many times do they meet? What would
12 be, you know, the briefing as a result of some of
13 those collaboratives? I know that I've seen programs
14 that do summer youth development. They have a
15 collaborative and that collaborative, you know, helps
16 with technical support. So talk to me a little bit
17 about, you know, drill down a little bit more on the
18 official-- is there an official collaborative?

19 CHIEF DANIEL: Yeah, so a collaborative--
20 well, to be specific, there's meetings where they
21 come together to support one another while they're
22 also receiving training. So, that would usually be
23 for Cure Violence global training is what they're
24 receiving and working together and sharing any issues
25 that they've had or that they've seen across the

1
2 system. For a little bit more information I'll turn
3 it over to Mr. Carvajal.

4 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Hi. So, in
5 regards to additional support and oversight, we have
6 bimonthly program managers meeting which Cure
7 Violence Global leads. We also have our own internal
8 staff that have quarterly site visits and weekly
9 check-ins with providers to see areas of support,
10 areas of concerns, and any needs or additional
11 assistance that can be provided to them.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Is there
13 specific funding for your, like, technical, these
14 collaborative meetings. Do you think that there's a
15 need to have a separate space for that?

16 CHIEF DANIEL: So the funding is included
17 in the--

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [interposing]
19 Included.

20 CHIEF DANIEL: Included in our budget.

21 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Can you
22 speak to situations that have proven particularly
23 challenging? Are there some issues that violence
24 interrupters face within their course of work, and
25

1
2 can you describe the role of CMS during a hospital
3 response? You know, what are some of the barriers?

4 CHIEF DANIEL: As you know, the work is
5 quite challenging. The credible messenger are in
6 situations that are sometimes very fraught, and
7 they're looking to interrupt cycles of violence. So
8 we do know that their work is very-- it's very
9 intense, and it can be very-- it can be very
10 demanding. I will turn it over to Cana to talk a
11 little bit more about hospital response.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: Sure. So one
13 of the issues that come up or challenges that come up
14 with the Hospital Response Program is identifying
15 space within the hospital for the CBO partners to,
16 you know, operate and set up shop when they are
17 scheduled to be there, just because space in the
18 hospital is very limited. So that's one of the
19 challenges that we always come up with. And then
20 another one that they usually present is parking.
21 For them to be able to be on-call at the hospital
22 when, you know, violent traumas come in, to be able
23 to park their vehicles to make-- get there in a fast
24 capacity.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

And my last question before I pass it along to my colleagues. Does MOCJ track long-term outcomes for youth in areas served by CMS such as the data on educational attainment or future employment rates?

CHIEF DANIEL: I don't think we track that independently as a part of this specific evaluation, but it is something we look at as we're looking at general needs of an area or how-- and then it's also a topic for-- definitely for a long term evaluation.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. Thank you. So, that ends my questioning. Before I pass it along to my colleague, Council Member Stevens, I'd like to recognize Council Member Mealy and Council Member Rita Joseph.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Hi, good af-- good morning. Just one of the first questions I have is can you tell us how much you received from federal funding and how much you've committed to FY 2023?

CHIEF DANIEL: I can get you that total amount. I don't have it on me at the time.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: So you guys
3 don't know how much you received overall or for in
4 the past?

5 CHIEF DANIEL: We do have it in our
6 records. I just don't have it currently at this
7 time, but we can get it to you as quickly as
8 possible.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: One of-- thank
10 you. One of the things that I've heard from
11 providers, expressed concerns about is like often
12 they feel like the contracts are piecemeal. So, as
13 you guys stated, you have like the hospitals. You
14 have the school, and then you have the credible
15 messengers. And one of their issues they've said is
16 that Cure Violence is a holistic approach and they
17 should really be having the whole contract and not
18 pieces. So could you talk to me a little bit about
19 like why contracts are set up that way when, you
20 know, they feel like one provider should be doing
21 those services holistically?

22 CHIEF DANIEL: I think it really depends
23 on what the needs are for the area. We-- sometimes
24 they are a bit piecemeal, but also often times people
25 don't have that specific expertise, and so it makes

1
2 more sense to subcontract in order to work with
3 another provider to provide that service.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And so you've
5 been thinking about-- you're saying that they don't
6 have the capacity, so then how do we-- what supports
7 are MOCJ giving to ensure that hey are building those
8 capacities so that we can get some place that they
9 can do that work. Because I think it's-- it's hard
10 when you have different folks coming into families
11 who have been traumatized and having less contact,
12 and we know that that works. Having less contact is
13 what should be happening and having one provider and
14 having them see the whole thing through typically
15 makes the most sense. I think it's really important
16 for us to think about how are we moving in that
17 direction. Okay.

18 CHIEF DANIEL: I definitely think
19 continuity of service is something that we can
20 discuss and make sure that we're building that
21 capacity within organizations. We-- over the past
22 few years, the CMS org-- the CMS system has been, you
23 know, adding significant amounts of funding to it.
24 And part of that has been to help organizations to
25 build their capacity. We do see the need for helping

1
2 people along and to ensuring that they have what they
3 need to thrive, and that's something that we're
4 continuing to explore.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And could you
6 just talk about when you say you're exploring? Could
7 you give a little bit more detail about what that
8 actually looks like?

9 CHIEF DANIEL: Sure. So, currently--
10 previously, we had a workshop that was done in
11 conjunction with the law firm Cleary, and we are
12 working with them based on feedback from our
13 providers to see what might be more helpful-- what
14 might be even more helpful to build on that success
15 for the next workshop. In addition, we're also
16 exploring other ways to provide additional capacity
17 building.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Can you talk
19 about what those-- that exploring looks like? I'm
20 sorry.

21 CHIEF DANIEL: It would look like helping
22 people to-- through nonprofit management, through
23 legal assistance. A lot of the things that your
24 bill, the bill, [inaudible] bill references. So
25 we're looking at improving nonprofit management,

1
2 improving the ability to contract with the City,
3 improving their accounting control, that kind of
4 thing.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: What
6 coordination does MOCJ help with other city agencies
7 in CMS sites, particularly NYPD? So that was another
8 challenge that a lot the CMS sites say that they have
9 or they're not giving them information from NYPD, and
10 so it also creates a struggle and a boundary. And
11 also, even with some of the other sites where it was
12 like even with victim services and things like that
13 that they don't have the access in that way. So how
14 are you guys coordinating those partnerships and
15 making sure that there's transparency between all the
16 city agencies?

17 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we work very closely,
18 you know-- victim services is within our office as
19 well, so we work very closely with that portfolio in
20 order to provide services that people need and with
21 our contracted provider, one of which is Safe
22 Horizon, in order to do that. In terms of
23 coordinating with NYPD, we do try--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing] I'm
25 sorry, but could you talk a little bit about what

1 that looks like, and not just saying coordination?

2 Because I--

3 CHIEF DANIEL: [interposing] Sure.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Like, what does
5 that coordination actually look like?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: So, when we hear from CMS
7 providers that there's a need, that need goes to the
8 ONS team, and the ONS team reaches out to either
9 OCVS-- we're currently staffing OCVS-- but to Safe
10 Horizon to get that person connected to the services
11 that they need.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: So do they have
13 like monthly check-ins as their shared goals? Are
14 they working on things together? Like, you know, are
15 we ensuring that they're in the room consistently and
16 not only when an issue arises?

17 CHIEF DANIEL: So usually victim services
18 is, you know, when there is a victim, and so it's
19 sort of like individualized. However, you know, we
20 always see more need for improving our systems. And
21 so if we're seeing an issue consistently come up,
22 that is something that we would try to address. And
23 I would love to talk to more about things that you're
24 seeing and if you're seeing gaps or not.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: This is feedback
3 that I'm getting from providers from the things that
4 they're seeing. Could you just talk a little bit
5 about what does the coordination look like with NYPD,
6 because I'm hearing that there's a lot of struggle
7 there, and they're not able to get the information
8 sometimes that they need to be shared. So I'm
9 hearing that they're sharing information, but NYPD is
10 not necessarily sharing information. Obviously,
11 there are legal restraints around some things, but I
12 think that that coordination is important and that's
13 where we should be moving.

14 CHIEF DANIEL: We absolutely agree that
15 that coordination is important, and if you're seeing--
16 - you know, each precinct is different, and so each
17 precinct tends to have a different relationship with
18 each provider. And so we are-- we do consistently
19 work to make sure that that relationship is good, but
20 if there's an issue that you're seeing or that our
21 providers are seeing, that is something we try to
22 work on on that individualized basis.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Can you talk to
24 me a little bit about how catchment areas are
25 determined? Because that's another issue that I'm

1 hearing where like providers have these very screwed
2 catchment areas, and so we often know that BEEF
3 [sic], they don't have catchment areas. And so, could
4 we talk about that and that process and how is that
5 determined, and how do we-- you know, how often is
6 that evaluated? How does it change? How do-- you
7 know, what does this look like a little bit?

9 CHIEF DANIEL: so, the catchment areas
10 were determined by the persistence of gun violence
11 over five years prior to the selection of the
12 catchment area, and we are consistently looking at
13 catchment areas and areas--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing]
15 I'm sorry, you said it was looked at over five years?

16 CHIEF DANIEL: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Okay.

18 CHIEF DANIEL: Like, the average of
19 shootings over the last five years. And so that's
20 how the sites were selected. We do continue to
21 evaluate how the-- how gun violence and how shootings
22 are evolving in that area, or the rate of these
23 shootings are evolving in different areas, and so
24 it's something we are consistently looking at

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Yeah, because I
3 think it's just a little bit strange, right? If
4 you're just looking at where the shootings are taking
5 place, because we should be looking at where beef is
6 arising and those things, and so I think even the
7 termination of catchment areas is a little bit
8 skewed, because it's not allowing for us to look at
9 it from a city perspective because often-- and I'll
10 take the Bronx for example. There's folks who might
11 be beefing in the Millbrook houses and they might be
12 beefing with our RPT, and if you have a catchment
13 area, you can't-- the cross-collaboration doesn't
14 work, and so I think we should really be thinking
15 about how are we moving forward and really evaluating
16 this in a different way.

17 CHIEF DANIEL: Okay. Thank you.
18 Appreciate that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And then I guess
20 my last question because I'm taking up too much
21 space. RFP apparently has been open in my district
22 for a while in District 16 and apparently it's been
23 pushed back several times. So for the last two years
24 this has not been done. So could you talk to me,
25

1
2 like what's taking so long with the RFP process, and
3 when could we expect for this to be done?

4 CHIEF DANIEL: Sure. So, the-- we have a
5 large response to the RFP and also we are looking to--
6 - this RFP was very-- it was-- you know, we designed
7 it very specifically for this system because it is
8 supposed to be so community-based. So, we wanted to
9 have lot of input across the community, and because
10 of that the RFP had taken a little bit of time, but
11 it was hard to because we had such a large response
12 but we are looking to-- it is nearly complete, and we
13 will be announcing awards in the spring of this year.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Yeah, I mean, I
15 think it just-- it kind of becomes redundant if we
16 saying that we see an uptick in violence here, and
17 that's why we did the RFP, then taking two years. So
18 two years of no services in a area that is needed dos
19 not make sense, and so we really have to do better.
20 So I understand that we do want to make sure that
21 we're picking the right provider, and I'm not saying
22 that we should skip on that, but I think that we need
23 to be thinking about how do we make sure we're
24 expediting these processes especially when money has

1
2 been designated and has been sitting here for two
3 years. Thank you, Chair.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
5 Great questions. I will call on the Public Advocate
6 to ask questions.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
8 Madam Chair. Thank you so much for the testimony,
9 and as I mentioned before, I'm just so proud of where
10 this is now, but I also know that even when we got
11 the model from-- originally from Chicago, we, I
12 always say, New York-ized it. We changed it a little
13 bit because it wasn't a one for one, and I think it's
14 okay for it to adapt even further as we are moving
15 forward. And I'm always-- as I mentioned, the intent
16 was to make sure there was evaluation in a way that I
17 haven't seen happening, and I think it is imperative.
18 As I mentioned, violence is going up all across this
19 country. Actually, New York City, even in comparison
20 to other place are "still safer." That means nothing
21 to the people who are actually being harmed and
22 traumatized, and so we have to make sure we lift that
23 up as well, and I think the City can really show some
24 leadership here. I did have a question about-- do
25 you-- have you looked at data now? Like how is the

1
2 program doing right now, even as the crime is going
3 up in the areas where they are, particularly the gun
4 violence?

5 CHIEF DANIEL: So, each catchment area is
6 different, and we can definitely get the data on the
7 specific catchment areas, but there have been
8 catchment areas where we've seen a recent decrease in
9 shootings for sure.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. And
11 I agree, we may want to look at how the catchment
12 areas interact because I know-- I think it was a 10
13 by 10 block radius if I'm not correct. But that
14 model, the way we had it just may not have-- may not
15 work the way it was before and it can adapt. I did
16 want to know-- I do think this program needs to be
17 expanded and we definitely need additional funding. I
18 also know it's not the end-all and be-all. And so I
19 know a lot of folks now, as soon as they try to work
20 on gun violence, they feel they have to have a site
21 to do that. How are you happening other kinds of
22 services that are not necessarily CMS get funded and
23 be connected to this work?

24 CHIEF DANIEL: So, the CMS works-- it
25 works across a broad range of services including

1
2 school conflict mediation as well as the therapeutic
3 services. In addition to that we also have our MAP
4 program, which is-- it's localized within NYCHA, but
5 it is designed to allow communities to both define
6 safety for themselves and also to improve the aspect
7 of the physical environment and also the services
8 that we know promote safety. And we also have the
9 program Atlas, which provides services to people who
10 are most at risk of being involved in gun violence.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: And I do know,
12 just to reiterate really what Council Member Stevens
13 was getting at, getting money out the door to these
14 groups have been tremendously problematic for quite
15 some time. Is there something we're working on to
16 try to get the money out the door to these groups in
17 a quicker pace?

18 CHIEF DANIEL: That is something that we
19 have identified as an issue, and it is something that
20 we have worked very hard on this year, and I think
21 that we've been able to make significant improvements
22 on that this year. We were able to issue advances to
23 the organizations, you know, pretty much immediately
24 when their contracts-- you know, as soon as the
25 contract is registered this year. The contract is

1 registered by July 1, organizations were allowed to
2 get advances, and they have been invoicing since
3 then.
4

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Alright, I
6 think they're-- it would be great to find out or
7 get information of what is actually holding it up,
8 and if it's just the way contracts are handed out in
9 the city. We just have to find- I've always been a
10 proponent that some-- we have to find a way to
11 streamline on contracts even more than others, and I
12 think this is definitely one of them. I also want to
13 just put on the record and you can respond or not.
14 There was a city article that came out about a
15 program called Advance Peace. That program, we
16 actually change as well, same way we did this. It
17 was actually going to be hyper-mentorship model
18 focused on the people who were most likely to be
19 shooters, and it was unfortunate because that program
20 was announced in March of last year and the money
21 never got to the organization, CCD in Queens. The
22 report actually was erroneous and made it seem as if
23 the money had gotten there, and it's frustrating
24 because it was set up the same way that this was. We
25 wanted to pilot it to see if it worked. If it didn't

1 work, it didn't. If it did, you'd keep it going.
2 That didn't happen. That also got conflated with the
3 advance piece organization which came from Oakland,
4 and they apparently are working on something else
5 themselves that didn't fall through. But I just
6 wanted to make sure we put on the record that this
7 money never got to the organization, and this was a
8 great time to actually be trying to see if that
9 worked. They set up infrastructures. They met with
10 actually the DA. This is so they can help identify
11 the people they should most focus on, and then they
12 were told to being the work. They actually may have
13 to begin letting some folks go and they may have
14 start closing down offices that were opened up. This
15 is the type of program I think we should be investing
16 in, and we should be seeing if it works or it
17 doesn't. But I want to make clear on the record for
18 that report that was put out that the funding never
19 got to the group. So my hope is that in November of
20 this year or December, we can hopefully get that
21 funding there because it's an important overlay I
22 believe the type of work that we've been doing.
23 Thank you.
24
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: thank you so much Mr.
3 Public Advocate. Council Member Bottcher, do you
4 have questions?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: thank you so
6 much. So, the Cure Violence programs are currently
7 in 21 precincts, is that correct?

8 CHIEF DANIEL: We have 31 catchment
9 areas.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: 31 catchment
11 areas, but 21 precincts, is that right?

12 CHIEF DANIEL: Yes, that's correct.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: And how many
14 precincts are there total in New York City?

15 CHIEF DANIEL: 77.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: 77. These
17 programs are effective in bringing down gun violence
18 in your opinion?

19 CHIEF DANIEL: We believe that the
20 programs are effective in helping to alleviate gun
21 violence yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Why are they
23 only in 21 out of 77 precinct if in the Adams'
24 Administration's opinion they're effective at
25 bringing down gun violence? Presumably we have

1
2 problems with gun violence in more than the 21
3 precincts, right?

4 CHIEF DANIEL: So, these precincts were
5 selected as the ones that have the highest levels of
6 gun violence over the past five-- you know, over the
7 past five years before they were selected.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Are there plans
9 to expand them to other precincts?

10 CHIEF DANIEL: That's definitely
11 something that we should evaluate and see if there's
12 a need for the program in other district.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Are there plans
14 to do that evaluation between now and the budget
15 adoption in June?

16 CHIEF DANIEL: So it's something that
17 we're consistently looking at. Right now we have an
18 RFP out for the sites that have currently been
19 selected, but it's definitely something that we can
20 continue to discuss.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: I'm looking at
22 a series of evaluations by John Jay College of
23 Criminal Justice, which found these programs to be
24 effective and evaluated precincts that had these
25 programs against those that didn't have these

1
2 programs, but why is it that John Jay College of
3 Criminal Justice is doing these studies and not the
4 Adams' Administration? Why isn't the City publishing
5 this data?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we continue to monitor
7 the programs to make sure that they are fulfilling
8 the requirements of their contract, but John Jay
9 evaluates them because we want our evaluations to be
10 independent. We want them to be done by someone
11 who's not conducting the work.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Does the
13 Administration publish the evaluations that you
14 conduct publicly?

15 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we don't publish the
16 monitoring that we do of the organizations but it's
17 definitely some that we can have a conversation a
18 about.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
21 Council Member Holden and then Council Member Ariola.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, chair.
23 And thank you for your testimony. Just in
24 understanding where violence is coming from, how
25

1
2 many-- do you have a number of how many acts of
3 violence are from gang members or gangs in general?

4 CHIEF DANIEL: I don't think I have that
5 number.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: That's an
7 important-- wouldn't that be important, if you're
8 going to address violence, to know where it's coming
9 from?

10 CHIEF DANIEL: So within the catchment
11 areas that we work with, we do work with NYPD to
12 determine which places are the best for folks to be
13 deployed or which-- where the needs are. So that's
14 usually how the program works. We don't necessarily
15 monitor specifically gang violence throughout the
16 City.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: well, I mean--

18 CHIEF DANIEL: [interposing] But it's
19 something we can--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] It's
21 kind of common sense, though. If-- I would think a
22 gang would be a tougher haul to really kind of-- to
23 break through to, than just random violence. So you
24 really have to understand, you know, what you're
25 dealing with because it might be quite dangerous to

1 deal with and try to get through a gang because
2 they're protecting one another and that would-- you
3 would need that data and you would need to really
4 understand before you address it, before you send a
5 group in, before you think that you'll make an
6 impact, to know who you're dealing with. And so you
7 don't keep that data? You don't-- NYPD doesn't
8 provide that, or?

10 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we work very closely
11 with NYPD to have that information within the
12 specific catchment areas that we have-- where we have
13 providers.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, but I just--
15 - again, to mem, if you're dealing with the
16 situation, you should give me a number like 50
17 percent, 30 percent in certain neighborhood are gang-
18 related, because that's a-- I think a tougher haul.
19 I just to me, again, I'm not an expert on this. You
20 are, but we would need the data on what type of
21 violence is happening at a certain area to deal with
22 it and to deal it with effectively. Otherwise, we're
23 putting people in harms' way.

24 CHIEF DANIEL: Agreed, and we work very
25 closely with NYPD within the catchment area. I was

1
2 answering the question regarding citywide, but within
3 the catchment area, we do work with NYPD to get that
4 info.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So you know if
6 it's gang related--

7 CHIEF DANIEL: [interposing] [inaudible]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: you take a
9 different approach, or the providers take a different
10 approach?

11 CHIEF DANIEL: Yes, for sure. So a lot
12 of the-- it's a more complicated question, but yes
13 and yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright.

15 CHIEF DANIEL: But the approaches are
16 specific to the situation that they're in.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And it does say
18 in our committee report that 82 percent of all
19 incidents were confined to 40 precincts, and we're
20 addressing half of that kind of, right, with this
21 2020, 21?

22 CHIEF DANIEL: Thereabouts.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, so, it
24 looks like this has to be expanded. I mean, that
25

1
2 would make sense, but alright. Thank you for your
3 testimony. Thanks.

4 CHIEF DANIEL: Thank you. Appreciate it.

5 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much
6 Council Member Holden. I'd like to recognize Council
7 Member Cabán, and Council Member Ariola has
8 questions.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you, Chair.
10 These are questions for the providers and the
11 advocates. Can you provide examples of some success
12 stories for either individuals or communities? Can
13 you speak to some of the situations that have proven
14 particularly challenging?

15 CHIEF DANIEL: Sure, absolutely. Thank
16 you very much. I will turn it over to Mr. Carvajal
17 to talk a little bit about that.

18 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Thank you,
19 Council Member. So, in regards to success stories,
20 we have many. You know, through our anti-gun
21 violence employment program we help employ youth
22 across the City throughout the year, you know, to get
23 accessibility, mentorship, and other types of
24 resources. Through that program we're able to
25 provide youth with a safe space to be in, an

1
2 alternative to, you know, violence that's happening
3 in the community. We also have many other success
4 stories throughout the City where our credible
5 messengers and our violence interrupters actually
6 mediate and de-escalate situations anywhere from
7 domestic violence to gang violence. And to make a
8 note to what the former Council Member was stating
9 regarding gang intervention, there are many in-roads
10 that our credible messengers have in regards to gangs
11 across the City. This is something that is very
12 critical to their work where they can actually
13 influence and de-escalate situations. So when we're
14 talking about crime, whether it's index crime, or
15 shooting analytics, or whatever, you know, we
16 actually-- we need to tell the full story how our
17 programs and our providers are helping prevent crimes
18 from happening that often go unreported, right? So
19 we talk about a shooting that takes place, very
20 public, but what about all the situations where our
21 credible messengers actually prevented violence from
22 happening in the community. And there are dozens and
23 hundreds of stories that we can actually share with
24 you all individually regarding, you know, your
25

1
2 precincts or your districts, and you know, what have
3 the providers done in those areas.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you. And
5 to what extent is the NYPD aware of your day-to-day
6 work, you know, as a CMS program? Just to piggy back
7 on what you talked about, about gang members that
8 you're positively influencing to stop gang violence,
9 how important is the gang database for you to really
10 identify gangs, identify those who are members of
11 gangs, so that you can infiltrate and you can
12 possibly intervene with your skilled professionals?

13 CHIEF DANIEL: So, our work with the NYPD
14 is not-- we don't work with them related to the--
15 specifically to the gang database. We work with them
16 rather on identifying hotspots, identifying issues
17 that they're seeing on the ground.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: I think that kind
19 of leaves you going in cold. I would worry about you
20 if you were my son. I worry about you and you're
21 not. Has there been cooperation with the local
22 precincts to improve operations with CMS? Are you
23 finding that there's a good working relationship with
24 our local precincts?
25

1
2 CHIEF DANIEL: I'll turn that over to Mr.
3 Carvajal.

4 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Thank you.
5 Thank you, Council Member, for that question. So we
6 actually have weekly conversations and check-ins with
7 NYPD Crime Analytics at a leadership level where
8 they'll tell us and they'll notify us of one, either
9 concerns that they have across the City of potential
10 shootings or potential rivalries or beefs amongst
11 gangs. They'll also notify us of recent shootings or
12 violence that have taken place where that'll inform
13 the weekend [sic] deployment that we have with our
14 crisis management system across the City and areas of
15 concern where they need to deploy staff, either
16 through the later evening hours or specific hotspot
17 locations where they can intervene and have a
18 presence to de-escalate or prevent violent situations
19 from happening. So we do that on a weekly basis.
20 That information comes from our office to the crisis
21 management providers across the City and that informs
22 the work that they do on a week to week basis.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Okay. So,
24 Council Member Holden mentioned that there are 21
25 precincts that you're working in now. There are 40+,

1
2 I think you said, that are identified as needing this
3 type of intervention. So, how many crisis management
4 CBOs does MOCJ work with currently and have oversight
5 of?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: I would say across the
7 whole system roughly 50 to 60.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: And what is the
9 current number of employees with MOCJ that does the
10 oversight? What is the-- [inaudible] budgeted
11 people-- to do this oversight of the 50 CBOs?

12 CHIEF DANIEL: The budgeted number I
13 could not tell you, but I will let Cana answer on the
14 number of staff members.

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: So, currently
16 there are 10 staff at ONS.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: And how often do
18 they have contact with the CBO's for oversight on a
19 daily basis?

20 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: On a daily
21 basis.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: On a daily basis.
23 I just have one final question, only because I think
24 it's important. You do also go into hospitals where,
25 you know, there's been incidences. How are you

1 navigating the different COVID protocols that each
2 hospital may have when you arrive?

3
4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR OSBORNE: So, for each
5 CBO they all went through the process with the
6 individual hospital and protocols are in place, so
7 they're aware of what they can and can't do.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Good. Okay,
9 thank you. Thank you for your time and your answers.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
11 Council Member Cabán, you have questioning?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you, Chair.
13 Thank you to the folks testifying today. I want to
14 hit a couple of different buckets, but I do want to
15 build on what Council Member Bottcher said earlier in
16 terms of expansion and the public advocate in terms
17 of funding. You know, we see in the report that yes,
18 crisis management programs are reducing gun violence
19 in areas, but I think it's worth pointing out that we
20 still have not invested to the size and scale of our
21 problem. While we're seeing 30, 40 percent
22 reductions in gun violence, there are models across
23 the country, and even in previous years where we saw
24 more concentrated investment where you can results of
25 up to 75/80 percent reductions in gun violence. And

1
2 it is a problem that we ask these groups to save
3 lives and do a lot with a little, and then ask them
4 to expand their catchment areas or move into other
5 parts of the neighborhood, but give them a fraction
6 of the resources they do, and then the results are
7 diluted. And so we are not doing, you know, this
8 successful strategy. It's full-service. So I just
9 state that we need to get money out to these groups
10 quicker, but we also need to give them a lot more
11 money and resources. I did want to ask you about
12 sort of MOCJ's ability to be able to follow-up with,
13 be in compliance with some of this legislation that's
14 being proposed. I do have some concerns, you know,
15 through budget hearings and multiple prior hearings.
16 We have seen that MOCJ has experienced quite a few
17 vacancies. I'd love to know where you are at with
18 filling those. In addition that, I'm concerned about
19 the ability and the operations, you know, saw coming
20 out of the Renewable Rikers Act. There was an MOA
21 for lots of millions and millions and millions of
22 dollars that were supposed to go out to restorative
23 justice groups and programming, and for a while that
24 money-- it had not been spent or executed. That
25 money appeared to be lost. The folks that were

1
2 supposed to convene on how it was supposed to get
3 spent, identifying somebody who was going to sort of
4 hold those funds in trust and execute them, none of
5 those things happened on the timeline that they were
6 supposed to. So I have real concerns about MOCJ's
7 ability to do the things that are laid out here. So
8 if y'all could speak to that quickly, and then I have
9 just one more additional question after that.

10 CHIEF DANIEL: Sure. So we're continuing
11 to work on the restorative justice programming, and
12 we do anticipate implementing it later on this year,
13 and we'll definitely keep you looped on how that is
14 happening.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Well, what
16 happened with the-- I mean, the Fiscal Year is
17 passed. What happened to those millions and millions
18 of dollars that didn't get spent?

19 CHIEF DANIEL: There was a delay in
20 getting things off the ground, and that was-- we had
21 some difficulty getting off the ground.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [inaudible] that's
23 not a-- it's a real problem and it's not very
24 encouraging. Where do you stand with vacancies and
25

1
2 filling those and having the office have the capacity
3 it needs to execute its functions?

4 CHIEF DANIEL: so, we're consistently
5 working on filling our vacancies. We've got a few
6 vacancies now. If you [inaudible] if you know of
7 anybody who would be great for those roles.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. So, my
9 last question is for the providers. There was
10 mention of the gang database, and you know, in my
11 experience not just as a young brown woman who was
12 raised in a community that was heavily over-policed,
13 but also as a public defender, I have seen that this
14 gang database be a catch-all and a drag net of black
15 and brown predominantly young men in neighborhoods
16 thrown on a database for wearing the wrong colors,
17 for living in the same projects, you know, being--
18 standing out in a park with somebody, and then seeing
19 those-- that list be leveraged to forward
20 prosecutions, right? Getting young teenagers to
21 testify against other kids to make other cases, to
22 throw them into jail, so on and so forth. But what
23 I've also seen from the providers is that while the
24 gang database has served to be this really awful
25 racist dragnet that y'all have built the kinds of

1 relationships in the community to actually more
2 accurately identify who is, you know, a member of
3 gang, what has compelled them to be a part of a gang,
4 and build relationships and sort of like move people
5 away from different kinds of activities and things
6 like that. Can you talk a little bit about the work
7 that you do in relationship to gang activity in
8 neighborhoods? As well as, I just also want to point
9 out I think that the relationship between the CMS
10 groups and the police is also delicate, and it think
11 you can speak to that too, because depending on the
12 flow of information, y'all's lives get put in danger
13 if the police are a little bit too heavy-handed or
14 demand certain kinds of communications, because not
15 only do you lose your ability to be a credible
16 messenger, but then there's the step further with a
17 fear of being that as a snitch. So it's a necessary
18 relationship, but it's also a very delicate balance.
19 I think y'all are best-situated to kind of lay out
20 what those relationships need to look like. Sorry,
21 that was a lot.

23 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Thank you for
24 that, Council Member Cabán. So, definitely hear you
25 on a lot of concerns regarding credibility and

1
2 confidentiality. We actually had this conversation
3 with our CMS provider on Wednesday during our bi-
4 monthly program manager's meeting, leadership
5 meeting, and we don't share names or confidential
6 information. We do help inform the work that the CMS
7 providers do on the ground to better engage,
8 intervene, and de-escalate situations from happening,
9 and we are in the mindset of providing opportunities
10 to our black and brown communities whether they're
11 gang-involved or not gang-involved, we want to make
12 sure that every individual that, you know, has some
13 type of negative interaction in community that we've
14 had some type of support for them, and every person
15 that is arrested is a person that, you know, we have
16 failed, and we need to provide more support for,
17 because that's one individual that represents a
18 family, that represents a whole host of community
19 members that need additional supports. We're talking
20 about crime. We're talking about violence
21 committing. There are very deep root causes that
22 stem in our black and brown communities. You know,
23 poverty being one of those. So, being able to
24 provide a safe space and haven for our youth that
25 often times have the highest rates of incarceration,

1
2 as you might know, you know, where they might just
3 need, you know, a mentor, someone that can walk them
4 to school. They might just need a space where they
5 can speak to someone or have access to food. So, in
6 our work with our credible messengers, when we're
7 identifying common issues that are happening on the
8 ground and what supports or services we can improve
9 or we can bring to the table to these communities and
10 make government one, more effective, but also in
11 partnership in co-developing what is the localized
12 strategy to address crime that's happening in these
13 communities. We can go on to specific examples, but
14 those are just very top lines, you know, in response
15 to your statement.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I just want to
17 thank you for you work and your holistic approach to
18 reducing violence in your communities. Really
19 deeply, deeply appreciate it.

20 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Thank you,
21 Council Member.

22 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Council
23 Member. Council Member De La Rosa, questions?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
25 much, and thank you for being here and testifying. I

1
2 have a few questions around the catchment areas. So
3 as of right now, do we have the information, like is
4 that-- is it public information where the catchment
5 areas are?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: So we can provide the
7 information where the catchment areas are. It's not--
8 - it is-- it's not something that we publish, but
9 it's available to anyone who'd like to have it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Okay. I
11 think that it is important to have some transparency
12 around that, because I think at least for me-- and I
13 don't want to talk for all of my colleague. I
14 represent Upper Manhattan and Washington Heights, and
15 my community is a community that is a high gun
16 violence community. We have a lot going on up there,
17 and you know, I've been having the conversations on
18 the ground with groups that exist in my communities--
19 there's trust in my community-- to try to see how we
20 get some Cure Violence groups going and supported in
21 my community, but the infrastructure has never
22 existed. And so it's difficult, right. To build
23 trust and also build the infrastructure at the same
24 time, because it would be easy to bring like a group
25 that is operating in Harlem, for example, that is a

1
2 neighboring community up to my district but the trust
3 wouldn't be there. Right? We'd have to establish
4 that trust. And so one of my direct question is, are
5 there any areas in New York City that are
6 experiencing high rates of gun violence that could
7 benefit from further expansion of CMS? And I
8 understand there's a resource question, so that's
9 important. But have you all sort of taken inventory
10 of other areas that may need expansion?

11 CHIEF DANIEL: So, it's something that we
12 are consistently looking at where gun violence is
13 happening across the city. You know, it's a longer
14 conversation about who in the CMS groups are bringing
15 in the model, just because it depends on the kind of
16 violence that's happening. If there's like an
17 available provider, and then also resources, but it's
18 something that we are consistently looking at.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: And is there
20 technical support for a district like mine where I
21 have no infrastructure, and it should have-- the
22 infrastructure should have been there in the 90s when
23 we were at the crosshairs on the war of drugs, right?
24 But it never came about and now we're in a situation
25 where the gun violence has increased and to some

1
2 extent in certain areas, and we don't have the
3 ability to sort of interrupt that violence through
4 community-driven solutions. So is there-- does MOCJ
5 have any supports for that type of work?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: It's definitely something
7 we can talk about. We have definitely worked with
8 Council Members, community members, and the NYPD and
9 other organizations to see what we can do in
10 situations like that when there's not a specific
11 provider or catchment area identified.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Yeah, because
13 I feel like one of the challenges here is that we
14 have discretionary funding. We're able to channel
15 discretionary funding in our district. But not all
16 youth services providers are necessarily equipped to
17 deal with the type of issues that we're talking about
18 when it comes to gun violence. So, you know, the
19 children that are walking into an afterschool program
20 are not necessarily the same children that you don't
21 need that intervention on the ground. And so I feel
22 like more needs to be done in terms of helping to
23 equip our community to know how to respond to the
24 violence that we're seeing.

1
2 CHIEF DANIEL: Okay, that's definitely
3 something that we should discuss if there's something-
4 - I mean, obviously you're talking about a situations
5 of who you're seeing in your district and you're
6 seeing in community. So we should definitely discuss
7 next steps in how we might be able to be helpful.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: I look
9 forward to reaching out to you offline. Thank you,
10 chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Council
12 Member De La Rosa. I have questions for Council
13 Member Joseph and then Council Member Mealy.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you, Chair.
15 Good morning. My question is around data, and
16 earlier your catchment-- are you utilizing data to
17 allow your target approaches to prevent violence?
18 Are you using data for preventative measures as well?

19 CHIEF DANIEL: To a certain extent. I
20 will turn it over to Mr. Carvajal to talk a little
21 bit about our coordination with the NYPD and the data
22 we receive from them.

23 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Thank you.
24 So, in regards to crime data, we receive index crime
25 on a weekly basis. We also have weekly conversations

1 with NYPD on hot spots or ongoing crime or recent
2 shootings within our catchments, within the precincts
3 that we provide services, and a localized response.
4 We also coordinate with NYPD and other community
5 groups where there's additional supports needed. So
6 I'll give an example of the South Bronx where a town
7 hall was held, and this was in partnership and led
8 with our CMS providers, our resident stakeholders,
9 both in Patterson Houses and Mitchell Houses, and
10 NYPD from PSA7 and the 40th Precinct. There's also
11 localized strategies on ongoing supports and in-roads
12 that can be done to address safety issues or
13 identified crime concerns in these precincts. So we
14 do receive data on a weekly basis. We do work with
15 NYPD and coordinate on recent shootings or homicides
16 or other safety concerns.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Do you use that
19 data to constantly adjust how you use your
20 programming to prevent, and how is your data being
21 used once you receive it? How are you using it?

22 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: That's a great
23 question. So we have ongoing-- so our canvassing
24 hours, our violence interrupters and outreach workers
25 are out there on a weekly basis. What the crime data

1
2 informs is where there are specific areas of concern,
3 where we need to pivot or have more of a focused
4 strategy. In those specific areas, we can take an
5 example, like Millbrook Houses or Mitchell Houses
6 where they might have beef or Van Dyke Houses or
7 Brownsville Houses in Brownsville where there might
8 be a recent shooting, or NYPD might inform us of some
9 type of gang activity and concerns that they have on
10 incoming or upcoming potential shootings between
11 rival gangs, and that will help determine how our
12 deployment and how our CMS providers deploy staff for
13 that week. There's a standardize as far as the
14 catchment and canvassing and office hours, but the
15 data on the week to week basis, or recent shootings
16 and crimes thus inform and pivot our programming and
17 our resources to address those immediate concerns.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Are you working
19 with other city agencies such as DYCD, HRA, the DA to
20 support pathways and resources that help prevent
21 violence before it happens?

22 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: So, we do have
23 several programs that provide youth employment or
24 mental health support, mentorship through the Office
25 of Neighborhood Safety, while this conversation is

1 focused on the Crisis Management System. We do have
2 several other programs that can provide additional
3 resources and supports, one to our CMS providers, but
4 also to the larger communities that they're in and
5 that daily service. So we do this through Atlas and
6 also through the Neighborhood SAP program under the
7 Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety. So,
8 yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Also
11 we know that data from NYPD and other law enforcement
12 agencies always show that youth violence always
13 starts in schools and social settings. Are you
14 supporting organizations that reach into communities
15 to engage young people before they decide to join any
16 gangs or gang affiliations?

17 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: So, we have a
18 school conflict mediation program. We're in 95
19 schools across the City, and we also-- the Department
20 of Education recently launched a pilot program which
21 provides additional funding and programming for
22 conflict mediation and crisis management, you know,
23 assistance and supports in those schools. Within
24 these programs our providers are able to engage young
25 people. They also have Safe Passages for youth in

1
2 these schools. Often times-- not often times, but
3 when we do get alerts from NYPD on potential safety
4 concerns at specific schools, it helps inform our
5 employment, and we pivot resources-- to my previous
6 point on-- you know, having a presence and being able
7 to be physically there to de-escalate and prevent a
8 violent situations from happening.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: How soon once you
10 get the data you're able to quickly turn around and
11 respond to that?

12 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: So, we have
13 formal meetings on Thursdays every week, and those go
14 out immediately, either that day or early Friday
15 morning, and that informs what's happening very, very
16 quickly. If there are other concerns that happen
17 throughout the week, either through community
18 members, local partners, or NYPD. We also have those
19 conversations through our check-ins with our
20 providers or, you know, just simply alerting them of
21 a situation so that they can respond accordingly.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you.

23 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, I guess I
3 have to say something. You done named three of my
4 developments. Are there places where the programs
5 have been more successful than others?

6 CHIEF DANIEL: So, organizations
7 sometimes are at different levels in their
8 development. So, sometimes when we see that people
9 have had less experience, but they tend to get better
10 of time.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Then what do you
12 do? Do you send that program somewhere else or you
13 learn from it and then start implementing the
14 program, the same thing in which helped them other
15 places?

16 CHIEF DANIEL: So, basically, we try to
17 work with them to help them to develop the expertise
18 that they need in order to work within their specific
19 community. But I will-- it'll turn it over to Rodney
20 or Cana to talk a little bit--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] But
22 before he go--

23 CHIEF DANIEL: Oh, sorry.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How many programs
25 right now that do not have a catchment area that no

1
2 one is working? At a catchment area that is there
3 but no one is really assigned to it.

4 CHIEF DANIEL: I think we have one
5 catchment area that nobody is assigned to.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Isn't that my
7 district?

8 CHIEF DANIEL: No, it's the 88th. It's
9 the 88th Precinct.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I have the 67th and
11 the 77th in which I wrote a letter. I have two Cure
12 Violence programs. They trying to say this is my
13 area. Another one saying no, it's my area. I wrote
14 you-- your organization a letter, and I still have
15 not gotten anything in regards to that. That's an
16 area that is still-- Linden [sp?] Boulevard.

17 CHIEF DANIEL: Okay, we can definitely
18 discuss that and try to figure out a solution there.
19 I don't think that we were aware of a situation. So,
20 I--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] No,
22 I wrote and spoke to you.

23 CHIEF DANIEL: I apologize if there was
24 some miscommunication. But we will absolutely--
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] We
3 really need to know who is manning that area, and
4 it's okay because two organization came at one time.
5 When Kay Luen [sp?] passed away, the 12-year-old, we
6 had almost three Cure Violence programs there, but
7 it's no specific program there. So, please, as soon
8 as possible let's rectify that. And how does the
9 Administration plan to address longstanding issues
10 regarding delays of the payments for the CMS
11 providers? Do you have a plan B?

12 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we worked really hard
13 this year to expedite their payments. At the very
14 beginning of the year, all the organizations received
15 several advances in order to be able to start their
16 work without invoicing, and now they should be in a
17 place where they can invoice and they can get paid on
18 a regular basis.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I did hear you say
20 that. How many of the programs took the cash
21 advancement or was even aware of it, because some of
22 the programs are not really aware or know how to do
23 the cash advancement. How do you let them know you
24 can get a cash advance?

25

1
2 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we're currently
3 working with a-- most of our providers are under a
4 subcontract with BlocPower, and BlocPower works with
5 them and has let everyone know that there is an
6 advance available.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, how many of
8 these program use the advance?

9 CHIEF DANIEL: All of them received an
10 advance.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: All of them?

12 CHIEF DANIEL: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, that's good.
14 Okay, how regularly are the programs evaluated?

15 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we're consistently
16 monitoring the programs. We, you know, speak with the
17 programs on a daily basis and they also use the
18 database Care4 [sic] to ensure that we are keeping
19 track of the work that they're doing.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Excuse me. Say
21 that again. I'm sorry.

22 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we-- it's through a
23 combination of monitoring as in like talking to the
24 programs and also meeting with them and visiting
25

1 sites as well as using the database Care4 to monitor
2 the work that they're doing.

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, if you see a
5 program that is not keeping up to its standards, what
6 is the recourse on that?

7 CHIEF DANIEL: So, we try to work with
8 that program to find out what the issues are, what's
9 causing the issue, and how we can work with them to
10 remedy it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Have you ever had
12 a program needed that service?

13 CHIEF DANIEL: Yes, we've had programs
14 we've had to work with more closely.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: What is the outcome
16 of it?

17 CHIEF DANIEL: Usually we see an
18 improvement, usually.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Usually? Have any
20 of the programs ever you felt that the funding should
21 be taken away?

22 CHIEF DANIEL: We have-- we have had
23 programs that have either reduced their catchment
24 area or have-- we're no longer working with them.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, so I keep
3 writing and keep up with it. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Council
5 Member Mealy. So I have one follow-up question that
6 before we get into the public testimony should
7 colleagues be finished with their line of
8 questioning. So MOCJ testified-- you testified, you
9 know, that the total CMS funding was 70 million.
10 This is a huge drop from prior publicly announced
11 funding levels. So can you talk about the funding
12 levels from 2019 to 2020 to 2021 to--

13 CHIEF DANIEL: [interposing] So, the
14 program's funding has significantly increased over
15 the past few years. When we talk about the
16 programming, usually with the Council, we're talking
17 about all the anti-gun violence programming. So, all
18 the anti-gun violence programming is about 139
19 million.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, thank you very
21 much. Council Member Cabán, do you have any further
22 follow-up questions before we get into the public
23 testimony? Okay, thank you.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you everyone.
25

1
2 CHIEF DANIEL: Thank you. Thank you,
3 Chair Hanks and members of the Committee. Appreciate
4 it.

5 SENIOR DIRECTOR CARVAJAL: Thank you.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you so much.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We're now going to
8 turn to the public section of the hearing. We're
9 going to start with-- we're going to start with two
10 individuals who are on Zoom, Pen and Perry who
11 represent a Cure Violence program out of Staten
12 Island, True 2 Life. So I'll let you all kind of
13 start and then we'll turn to a panel of folks in the
14 room. So, we're going to give three minutes to
15 testify and the Council Member could ask any
16 question. So, I'll let you gentleman just introduce
17 yourself and talk a little bit about your program.
18 Go ahead.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 MIKE PERRY: Yes, peace. Peace everyone.
21 Good morning if we're still in the morning. There
22 was a lot said. Thank you all for the opportunity to
23 speak. My name is-- I am Iron Mike Perry. I am the
24 leader of this CMS site on Staten Island, True 2
25 Life. First and foremost, I definitely need more

1 than three minutes, but I'ma [sic] hold it to three.
2 Thank you, Councilwoman Hanks, for the opportunity.
3 Thank you, Jumaane, for being a champion for us CMS
4 sites. Thank you Council Member Williams. I want to
5 definitely-- I know he's not in the room, but I
6 definitely want to thank Kaye Bank [sp?] for also
7 being one of the pioneers, Erica AT [sic], to allow
8 us to do what we do here in New York City. I also
9 want to thank our Executive Director at Central
10 Family Life Center, Demetrius Carolina, for allowing
11 me to lead and my partner, the former supervisor
12 Malcolm [sp?] who's on the line, True 2 Life to the
13 successes that I'm about to speak of. First and
14 foremost we are approaching 365 days in our target
15 area without a homicide. Also, another target area
16 we have in Mariners Harbor [sp?], we are approaching
17 1,000 days without someone being shot. So I know a
18 couple of things were said about the numbers, and so
19 these numbers are accurate. It takes a lot to do
20 this work and to reach those goals and numbers. So
21 when you talk about the successes, I mean, I think
22 it's clear that the model works, right, when it's
23 done correctly. So I just wanted to speak on that
24 really quick as far as what the numbers look like.
25

1
2 The second thing I wanted to speak on was the
3 precincts. I know a couple of the Council-- a couple
4 of the questions were regarding the precincts and
5 what goes on. So the precincts don't cover all of
6 these gun-- these neighborhoods that are plagued by
7 gun violence. On Staten Island we have the 120
8 precinct, but we have-- so we work, we work those
9 grounds over there, but it doesn't cover the five or
10 six neighborhoods in total, in the 120 precinct. So
11 when we're talking about advocating for more
12 programs, more funding and more boots on the ground,
13 we need to look at that, because you may see the 120
14 and 120 precinct. Yeah, there's a Cure Violence site
15 that covers those areas that doesn't cover the full--
16 those full neighborhoods, right? I'm born and raised
17 in Staten Island. There's five or six neighborhoods
18 on the north shore that is plagued by gun violence.
19 The 120, we only work in about maybe two, two and a
20 half of those target areas. You have another two and
21 a half to three that is not touched, and those
22 numbers are up in shootings when you look at the
23 numbers that I just mentioned. So it's clear if we
24 are in these other spaces doing the work, we can see
25 1,000 days with no shootings. We can see 365 days

1 with no shooting. I also want to say what's up to
2 and peace to Rodny and Cana for being at MOCJ ONS.
3 Thank you guys for all that you're doing. Also, the
4 Admin's [sic] peace model was promised to Staten
5 Island, and we were looking at possibly that violence
6 prevention program, and I think that definitely needs
7 to be relooked at, because it allows us to do more
8 work on Staten Island, to cover more ground to bring
9 shootings down, to hire people, and to really change
10 the trajectory on Staten Island as we've done as the
11 leaders of the CMS site on Staten Island.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

13 MIKE PERRY: That's time?

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Continue.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: That's time.

16 MIKE PERRY: Oh, okay, okay. Thank you.

17 Also, again, just being able to advocate, looking at
18 the numbers, looking at what we've come to already so
19 far with these historical numbers. We also have a
20 record of 1,065 days without a homicide in the
21 Stapleton Park Hill area. Now when you look at these
22 target areas, it-- we don't even cover the whole
23 Stapleton and the whole Park Hill like Jumaane
24 mentioned. There's a 14-- 10 to 14 block radius. We
25

1
2 don't cover the whole thing. So we really need to
3 push funding, more possible anti-violence initiatives
4 such as Advance Peace and things of that nature so we
5 can look at really, really bringing these numbers
6 down in this crime. also, the last thing that I want
7 to say is I want to advocate now, here and now as I
8 always do for higher wages for CMS staff who are on
9 the grounds, boots on the grounds risking their lives
10 day in and day out to help this city be a safer
11 place. Thank you, Kamillah. I appreciate you. I
12 know you hear me, and I know you riding for Staten
13 Island. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I
15 do have one follow-up question. When it comes to--
16 and we've discussed this often, capacity building--
17 Staten Island only has one True 2 Life or Cure
18 Violence program. Talk to me about some of what your
19 organization would need by the way of capacity
20 building, training in order to expand your footprint
21 on Staten Island?

22 MIKE PERRY: Oh, 100 percent. I mean,
23 you know, [inaudible] organization. Me and my
24 brother was on lock [inaudible] We are--
25

1
2 PEN PERRY: [interposing] Yeah, could I
3 speak on that?

4 MIKE PERRY: You got it. You got it.

5 PEN PERRY: So, like, City Council woman
6 Kamillah Hanks, thanks for asking that question. Can
7 you guys hear me? Yeah, so there is one site on
8 Staten Island. It's-- Staten Island is just like
9 known as a one-shot pony. There's just one of
10 everything out here. And as Mike discussed, the gun
11 violence reaches all across the north shore of Staten
12 Island. Pen and Perry Inc. was just an extra
13 component to help deal with all of these issues on
14 Staten Island surrounded around gun violence. As a
15 violence interrupter for the last 10 years or so,
16 that catchment area that Mike Perry was talking about
17 with over 1,000+ days, that's my catchment area. And
18 I've noticed that through the years we've been doing
19 a lot of work outside of our work scope, dealing with
20 therapeutic healing, therapeutic services with
21 individuals, and just so much on workload with True 2
22 Life. There wasn't enough time. There wasn't enough
23 staff to actually continue to help service this whole
24 north shore. So we formed Pen and Perry Inc. to
25 actually be an extra extended hand to help service

1
2 our people here on Staten Island. And we were
3 looking forward to doing the Advance Peace out here,
4 because it's needed. True 2 Life is only one program
5 out here, and it covers the entire Staten Island.
6 There was just a shooting on the south shore. True 2
7 Life was there, right? But True 2 Life is just one
8 program, and like Mike Perry said, I think we need to
9 look at more funding for Pen and Perry Inc. and other
10 programs to do the work out here.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much
12 Malcolm and Mike. Thank you for all the work that
13 you do, and Shellen [sp?], thank you very much. So,
14 before I get to the next line of questioning, I just
15 want to recognize the School of New York Times is
16 here to join us. Thank you very much. Give them a
17 hand. I hope you enjoy our hearing. So, take it
18 away, Josh.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Thank you
20 all for your testimony. Next we're going to hear
21 from a panel of public defenders. So we're going to
22 hear from Brooklyn Defender Services Jackie
23 Gosdigian, and Roslyn Morrison from the Legal Aid
24 Society. Yeah, we'll start with you two and then
25 we'll move on to other individuals. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has started.

JACKIE GOSDIGIAN: We good to start?

Okay.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, you may.

JACKIE GOSDIGIAN: Good morning. My name is Jackie Gosdigian. I'm Senior Policy Counsel with Brooklyn Defender Services, and I have been a public defender for 13 years. Thank you to the Council, Chair Hanks, and the members of the Committee on Public Safety for the opportunity to present testimony today. I want to start off by saying that Brooklyn Defender Services commends this council for recognizing the importance of community investment and crisis management as part of the solution to end violence. We call on the City to increase funding for community centers, high-quality and engaging programming and organizations using the Cure Violence model, and reallocate more resources away from punitive responses to alleged gang membership, toward interventions that have proven effective in reducing violence and other unlawful activities. While the Crisis Management System and the Cure Violence model are a critical part of ending violence in this city, the City must also focus on what happens if someone

1
2 actually gets arrested. We cannot assume that
3 because the City is increasing the number of credible
4 messenger and enhancing CMS, that this reaches every
5 member of the community. The fact is even with CMS
6 arrests are still happening, and what happens to
7 these New Yorkers, often young people, has been
8 overlooked to an extent. There has been quite a bit
9 of discussion in New York City around different
10 approaches to preventing violence, but there is a
11 lack of programming for alternatives to
12 incarceration. BDS is fortunate to have great
13 relationships with several alternatives to
14 incarceration programs that prove many of our
15 clients' holistic services and greatly benefit our
16 clients, their families, and their communities.
17 However more funding is needed for new evidence-
18 informed programming and alternatives to
19 incarceration for New Yorkers that have been
20 arrested, especially for gun possession, but these
21 alternatives will not be successful without
22 sentencing reform at the state level because harsh
23 mandatory minimum sentences make non-jail
24 alternatives unattainable. That is why we also urge
25 the Council to pass a resolution in support of both

1
2 the End Mandatory Minimums Act and the Youth Justice
3 and Opportunities Act. These are just two of many
4 available legislative solutions in New York that can
5 work in tandem with community investment and crisis
6 management. Mandatory incarceration coupled with a
7 criminal record have lifelong insurmountable
8 consequences for a person, their families, and their
9 communities. BDS welcomes the opportunity to work
10 with the City to create opportunities for people who
11 have been arrested to participate in ATI programming
12 that addresses gun and other violence as a public
13 health issues, as well as addressing the harm of
14 police profiling and surveillance in low-income black
15 and Latin and immigrant communities. Thank you.

16 ROSLYN MORRISON: Good afternoon
17 everyone. I'm Roslyn Morrison, Senior Attorney and
18 the Community Justice Unit of the Legal Aid Society.
19 I provide general counsel support to CMS nonprofit
20 organizations in the borough of Queens. I've worked
21 in CJU for the past year, although I've been a public
22 defense attorney for almost 20 years. I know I look
23 young. I would like to thank City Council Chair
24 Kamillah Hanks as well as the entire City Council
25 panel for recognizing the importance of the CMS

1 system and for advocating for increased investments
2 in CMS, providing them with the support that they
3 need to continue their work and expand. CMS should
4 always be a priority within the Council because it is
5 an important part of the public safety ecosystem. CJU
6 shares the Cure Violence philosophy that violence can
7 be curtailed with early intervention and community
8 engagement. In addition to legal services, the
9 Community Justice Unit conducts extensive community
10 outreach and draws on cross-functional expertise in
11 all divisions of the Legal Aid Society such as civil,
12 which entails immigration, housing, access to
13 benefits, family law, which includes representation
14 of juveniles, and of course, our criminal defense
15 division. We have connected our CMS partners,
16 participants, and community members to a vast network
17 of services, including, but of course, not limited to
18 Know Your Rights, Safe Surrenders, navigating Family,
19 Criminal, and Housing Courts, certifications of
20 completion, community support at shooting responses,
21 immigration services, housing rights advocacy, a 24-
22 hour seven days a week legal hotline and much more.
23 CJU's collaboration with Red Hook Initiative to
24 create a Youth Ambassador training is a great example
25

1 of how CJU provides legal services to community
2 participants. CJU staff teaches youth Know Your
3 Rights and gang database workshops so that they can
4 then present those workshops to their peers. This is
5 important because of course information lands
6 differently when it comes from another youth and
7 member of the same peer group. Furthermore, the
8 youths receive certifications and also acquire
9 leadership as well as conflict resolution skills.
10 CMS organizations in New York City have been shown to
11 reduce shootings by 20 percent in some areas, and
12 over 60 percent in others. The current model has
13 been-- oh, I'll speed up. The current model has been
14 very effective, and there is increasing demand for
15 CMS organizations to expand their services due to a
16 number of factors such as the event-- the end of the
17 eviction moratorium, displacement due to rezoning, an
18 uptick in gang activity, inflation, among others.
19 But they need more funding. CMS CV, Cure Violence
20 organizations receive a fraction of the funding in
21 comparison to NYPD. NYPD has been allocated over 10
22 billion dollars for Fiscal Year 2023. CMS
23 organizations will likely receive less than one
24 percent of this level of funding, even though
25

1 statistics not only show that they directly reduce
2 violence in their communities, but they also prove
3 that engaging with CMS organizations, community
4 members often choose non-violent methods of dispute
5 resolution. The support for CMS organizations
6 envisioned in bill number 756 of 2022 is vital.
7 However, it would be worthwhile for the Council to
8 consider allowing MOCJ the option of outsourcing the
9 provision of these services. For example, some of
10 the smaller more newly established CMS organizations
11 receive technical support, human resources, grant
12 writing, and alike from a larger more established
13 organizations. This has been apparent with
14 organizations such as Sheltering Arms and Rock Safe
15 Streets in Queens, as well as CAMBA [sp?] and BEVO
16 [sp?] in Brooklyn. CJU provides holistic
17 representation, training, and otherwise supports CMS
18 organizations to ensure that they meet their
19 contractual obligations and fulfil the needs of their
20 participants and community members. Another
21 consideration might be a partnership with CMS
22 organizations and the Department of Health and Mental
23 Hygiene to provide mental health services or ramp up
24 those services in catchment areas. Outsourcing
25

1
2 together with an expansion in partnerships with those
3 who have been providing those supportive services
4 outlined in the bill may be the best way to address
5 the needs of CMS organizations without overburdening
6 MOCJ. I strongly urge this council to pass Bill 756
7 of 2022, taking into account the recommendations that
8 I've shared so that CMS organizations can expand
9 their exemplary work and continue to not only make
10 communities safe, but ensure that they thrive. Thank
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much for
13 your testimony, and I agree with you. one question
14 that I have is-- I started Staten Island's first
15 Youth Build program before joining the Council, and
16 you know, this introduction of this bill also speaks
17 to that, that there are organizations that have their
18 ear to the ground that could be-- that could benefit
19 from this type of training, so I would like to speak
20 with you offline and see how we can build that out in
21 a more productive way. And I very much thank you for
22 your testimony.

23 ROSLYN MORRISON: Thank you so much. I
24 would love that.

25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Cabán,
3 do you have statement, question?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yes, thank you. I
5 mean, first I just want to say thank you for the work
6 that y'all do, and I fully appreciate the fact that
7 you came and you testified for more money and
8 resources for CMS when also the reality is that y'all
9 need more money, too. I know that you said that
10 you've been a defender for over 20 years, and that's
11 like a rarity. None of us can stay in that job that
12 long anymore, and it's a serious problem, and it's
13 clear that you are doing a lot to support the work
14 and protect the work that Crisis Management System
15 workers are doing, and so it's an ecosystem and y'all
16 are a big part of that and I just want to acknowledge
17 that. But the other thing I would like to hear more
18 about, and it's okay if you're not able to do it
19 today, but something that peaked my interest is the
20 recommendation to outsource some of this work because
21 if-- you know, earlier I asked MOCJ and had serious
22 concerns about their ability to take on more work,
23 because in my opinion I've seen just like an utter
24 failure to execute the duties and responsibilities
25 they had over the last Fiscal Year. And so I would

1
2 love to hear more about, you know, what a plan to
3 outsource some of that work might look like, whether
4 it's now or a follow up, or yeah.

5 ROSLYN MORRISON: I will-- I can
6 definitely would love to speak with you and work with
7 you on-- to share some ideas on how to-- how some of
8 that part, those partnerships would look like. In a
9 way, this is not to be self-serving of my
10 organizations, but the Legal Aid Society is providing
11 the support and we would like to continue and assist
12 CMS organizations in expanding. There was Council
13 Member Booher [sic]-- I hope I'm pronouncing his
14 name. Bottcher? Okay. He mentioned how in looking
15 at the data, and there's an issue with the fact that
16 data isn't necessarily being collected, right, but
17 the data that is available has shown that-- well,
18 there are 21 precincts where CMS organizations are
19 active. However, there's a need for support, and I
20 believe he said 42 precincts. So only 50 percent of
21 the needs are being met. We can see from the John
22 Jay report and other sources that this is successful.
23 When, you know, one of the benefits of working on the
24 ground with CMS organizations is seeing them, you
25 know,-- I guess the saying is you make a dollar out

1 of 15 cents. Well, we see that over and over again.
2 They take what funds they have and stretch them, but
3 it shouldn't be this fiscal gymnastics for them to
4 provide the support that communities need. So I'll
5 give you a couple of quick specific examples. So,
6 the-- you know, the fact that they're out canvassing
7 every single day. They're out there from
8 particularly King of Kings Foundation in Jamaica.
9 They're out from 2:00 p.m. often into the night to
10 provide safe passage. They're present. They're
11 talking to people. They're building trust. They
12 have made so many inroads with youth who, you know,
13 when people look at adolescents-- this is no
14 judgement, but I'm just going to state what is often
15 a fact. They look at them maybe see them dressed in
16 a certain way. They get-- they look at the frown or
17 the exterior and they kind of shy away from them.
18 King of Kings and other CMS organizations are out
19 there. They build relationship with these youth.
20 And while it's important to emphasize non-violence
21 and putting down guns and maybe not picking them up
22 in the first place, but you have to provide an
23 alternative. You have to, you know, show how to
24 engage in conflict resolution in a way that's
25

1 accessible. So when you have-- I call them OG's.
2 when you have the OG's who maybe served some time or,
3 you know, took their lumps, when they go out and they
4 talk to these youths who are maybe kind of beginning
5 the wrong path, what they say, their life experience
6 is so incredibly valuable because there's trust
7 there. They're not just talking at these young
8 people. They're bringing them in. They're becoming
9 the family. And largely, you know, if you look at why
10 someone engages in violence, a lot of times it's lack
11 of support. The family structure has broken down in
12 some ways. You know, people talk about victims of
13 violence versus perpetrator of violence. You know,
14 there's a significant amount of overlap in those
15 groups of people, right? And so the important part
16 is-- and a lot of what the CMS organizations are
17 doing on the ground as to acknowledge the pain of
18 maybe when you were a victim helping you overcome and
19 heal from that, but also encourage you not to inflict
20 that, not to retaliate and keep that negative cycle
21 going to someone else and someone else's family and
22 your community as a whole. So, I hope I touched on
23 answering your question.
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: You did. Thank
3 you. And I would just end by saying well-known in
4 the public defense community, to your point, is that
5 one day somebody is a victim. The next they are a
6 witness in the case, and the next maybe they're the
7 defendant in the case. And it's-- very much so
8 interconnected. So, again, thank you. Appreciate
9 it.

10 JACQUELINE GOSDIGIAN: And just briefly,
11 if I could add on what Roz was saying was that, you
12 know, she talked about needing to learn about
13 conflict resolution, and that doesn't change for a
14 young person just because they've been arrested, and
15 they still need to learn conflict resolution or
16 whatever other services they need. They still come
17 from the same situation, and just because they've
18 been arrested are now in the criminal system, they're
19 far fewer opportunities for them if they were not one
20 of the lucky ones happened to have been helped by the
21 Cure Violence model. And so what we're seeing
22 especially in the world of gun possession are
23 virtually no alternative to incarceration options for
24 our young people who are in these gun parts in these
25 courtrooms. Many of them are, you know, 19 to 24,

1
2 25-year-olds who don't have criminal records, who are
3 facing three and a half to seven years mandatory
4 minimum jail sentences, and so they're not getting
5 any of the benefit of some of the same things that
6 the members of their community are getting who happen
7 to have interacted with someone who was part of the
8 CMS programming. So I just wanted to add that.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

11 Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you all.

13 Appreciate your testimony. Next we'll hear from
14 Rachel Swaner from the Center for Court Innovation,
15 and then Ramik Williams for Kings Against Violence
16 Initiative, as well. Do we have a Ramik Williams in
17 here, or? Anyone? Go ahead when you're ready.

18 RACHEL SWANER: My name is Rachel Swaner
19 and I am the Research Director at the Center for
20 Court Innovation. Our research team has evaluated
21 programs that address gun violence in New York City
22 and around New York State and has also recently
23 conducted a unique and participatory research study
24 into why young New Yorkers carry guns. This work has
25 provided us with many lessons learned for effectively

1 reaching the Crisis Management System's target
2 populations and for understanding the importance of
3 consistent and quality implementation to archive the
4 results some of these models have demonstrated in the
5 past. I'd like to share some of the findings from
6 our work evaluating programs addressing gun violence
7 around the state, particularly regarding the
8 implementation of programs meant to address gun
9 violence and reach these young gun carriers. First,
10 while some models may be evidence-based, success is
11 not a given in all replications and is highly
12 dependent on modeled fidelity and robust
13 implementation. Second, credible messengers are a
14 key component of many of these programs, but they
15 must be credible with the target population in the
16 present moment for them to be effective. These
17 programs need people within current street networks
18 to validate them for young people to safely and
19 regularly engage in the support services that they
20 want and need. Third, many of these community-based
21 credible messengers who are the right fit for the
22 work have not held traditional jobs before, and may
23 need training and support to transition to the
24 nonprofit work world and the technology and
25

1
2 communication skills that might entail and that might
3 be expected of them. In Brooklyn where we piloted
4 and evaluated the Cure Violence model in New York
5 City, we've created a consortium that aims to support
6 emerging nonprofits to sustain funding for, track,
7 and implement this kind of work to program fidelity.
8 Assessing key metrics would demonstrate level of
9 model fidelity. New questions need to be asked that
10 assess that such as do we have real credible
11 messengers and how do we know that they have
12 legitimacy with the young people who might be
13 carrying guns. How much training have we offered
14 them on things necessary to the program, ranging from
15 being trauma-informed, conducting data entry, and are
16 we reaching the target population, or are we serving
17 at-risk people from these communities who are not
18 really likely to pick up or use a gun? Finally, the
19 findings speak to the need for new and innovative
20 approaches to addressing gun violence, particularly
21 for programs that are focused not just on stopping
22 shootings, but that build safe space and supportive
23 community for gun carrying and gang-involved youth
24 and provide a safe location for these young people to
25 explore individually and collectively what the world

1
2 has to offer beyond the block and what the block has
3 to offer the world. Thank you for the opportunity to
4 testify today and happy to take any questions.

5 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. One
6 question that I have is, do you think that there
7 should be some sort of a boiler plate training manual
8 where it's standard of what a CMS worker would be?
9 You spoke about young people or people who have been
10 involved. They want to help, but you know, they may
11 not have had a formal job. So, again, you know,
12 working in youth development in my previous life
13 there were always manuals like leadership development
14 manuals. How do you deal with-- how do you become a
15 CMS worker? Is there like a boiler plate model that
16 we can look to to kind of replicate everywhere so
17 everyone's kind of baseline as far as what are the
18 skills needed to be able to do this work and sustain
19 this work?

20 RACHEL SWANER: Yeah, absolutely. I don't
21 think it necessarily exists right now, but I think
22 that that would be a great thing to create and all of
23 the different roles that the CMS has and what might
24 be expected of them, and that's communicated to new
25 workers as well so that they're not set up to fail,

1 because they don't have the social capital or
2 cultural capital and traditional nonprofits that, you
3 know, would make it difficult for them to meet
4 expectations. So I think that training would be
5 really important. you know, a lot of our research,
6 we talked to over 330 young people ages 16 to 24 in
7 New York City who were carrying guns, and as somebody
8 just mentioned, the line between victim and defendant
9 on these cases is very blurred and there's a lot of
10 overlap, and these people have experienced a lot of
11 trauma, both at the individual level, and our study
12 88 percent had, you know, people who had been shot
13 or-- in their family or in their close networks, and
14 81 percent had been shot or shot at themselves, and
15 they've experienced and witnessed a lot of violence.
16 So I do think that there's an important role for
17 trauma-informed work to be built into a lot of this
18 training as well.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much.
21 Appreciate your testimony.

22 RACHEL SWANER: Thank you.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great, thank you so
24 much. Next, we'll hear Sheri Tolk [sp?]. Is there a
25 Sheri Tolk here? Is there a Ramik Williams? Or if

1
2 anyone else wants to testify who has not yet
3 testified, please come to the front of the room.

4 Seeing nobody, I guess Council Member Hanks, you can
5 close out this hearing.

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much for
7 everyone who's participated in this really important
8 hearing. I appreciate you taking your time. And
9 with that, this meeting is adjourned.

10 [gavel]

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 12, 2022