CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

JUNE 13, 2022 Start: 6:31 P.M. Recess: 6:59 P.M.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: JUSTIN L. BRANNAN, CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: DIANA I. AYALA

CHARLES BARRON GALE A. BREWER

SELVENA N. BROOKS-POWERS

DAVID M. CARR AMANDA FARÍAS KAMILLAH HANKS CRYSTAL HUDSON

ARI KAGAN

FARAH N. LOUIS CHI A. OSSÉ KEITH POWERS

PIERINA ANA SANCHEZ MARJORIE VELÁZQUEZ

JULIE WON

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: (gavel pounding)
3 Quiet please.

CHAIRPERSON JUSTIN BRANAN: Okay. Good evening. And welcome to this evening's Finance Committee Hearing where we will be adopting the Fiscal 23 Budget. I am Council Member Justin Brannan and I chair the Committee on Finance. I want to acknowledge my fellow committee members that are present, of course, Speaker Adams, Council Members Velazquez, Osse, Louis, Barron, Hanks, Sanchez, Ayala, Carr, Kagan, Won, Farias, Hudson, Brewer, Powers, Brooks-Powers and Moya. Thank you all for joining us this evening. The Finance Committee will take the necessary actions for the City Council to adopt a \$101 billion budget for Fiscal Years 2023. In all, this Committee will vote on 21 items tonight. I would first like to thank Speaker Adams for her leadership over these past six months and through the entire budget process. The Speakers commitment to advocate for a budget that is fair, equitable to all New Yorkers, truly represents the values of this entire Council. Speakers commitment to a fair and open and deliberative and collaborative process amongst all the Council Members has also been most

25

[phonetic].

2 welcomed during this budget process and I believe it's a testament to the type of leader that the 3 4 Speaker has been since becoming the leader of this 5 I want to thank the incredibly, incredibly bodv. hard working staff of the Council's Finance Division 6 from preliminary in February through adoption tonight 8 I know that there were very, very long hours, many questions from Members, countless meetings, presentations, zooms, reports, briefings, and 10 11 spreadsheets. Your dedication is recognized very, 12 very much appreciated. To all the financial 13 analysis, the economist and administrative support 14 staff who got us to this vote tonight and a very 15 special thank you to the Finance Divisions leadership 16 team who spearheaded the effort, Managing Deputy 17 Director Jonathan Rosenberg, Deputy Director Eisha 18 Wright, Deputy Director Paul Scimone, Deputy Director 19 and Chief Economist Dr. Majewski, Assistant Director 20 Emre Edev [phonetic], Assistant Director Dohini 21 Sompura, Supervising Economist Paul Sterm, Unit 2.2 Heads, Chima Obichere [phonetic], Aliya Ali, James 2.3 Reyes, Crilhien[phonetic] Francisco and John Russell. Senior Counsel Malcolm Butehorn 24

Thank you for stepping up and leading us

2 through the budget process and all the budget 3 hearings throughout May and, of course, special 4 counsel Jim Caras [phonetic]. Of course a resounding thank you to the fearless finance division CFO 5 Tanisha Edwards for her amazing leadership. None of 6 7 the budget success that we have achieved today would have been possible without the committed efforts of 8 you and your staff. I would be remiss if I did not thank the Legislative Documents Unit for all the work 10 11 they did to put this together and dealt with 12 countless emails, changes and last minute corrections 13 and requests from central staff. Every hearing, 14 every vote, every statement. Thank you to Jonathan 15 Ettrick, Ruthie Del Franco, Ivette Molina, Billy Martin and Matt DiStefano. The ever present 16 17 Sergeant at Arms. They keep things orderly. 18 keep things safe from City Hall to 250 Broadway to 19 parades and other events. Ever present Sergeant at 20 Arms, thank you Carl, Rafael and your entire team and our condolences to Carl on the loss of his family. 21 2.2 And last but not least a special shout out to my 2.3 staff for all they do back home in the district and my special advisor, Jonathan Yedin. Okay. This budget 24 represents a new day for this legislative body. 25

2	have secured new units off appropriation to hold
3	agencies accountable 18 in total, including six in
4	the NYPD, four in the Department of Corrections which
5	is nothing short of monumental in the history of the
6	Council Budget negotiations. Negotiated robust terms
7	and conditions to allow the Council and it's
8	Financial and Legislative Divisions to help us make
9	better informed policies and decisions that will
10	ultimately benefit all of New York City and more
11	importantly we have secured a Council record of \$1.1
12	billion during City Budget negotiations to invest in
13	communities for key programs and services. This
14	budget answered so many of that this Council made in
15	response to the Mayor's Preliminary Budget back in
16	February. We have expanded youth programs including
17	100,000 slots for the summer youth employment
18	program. We've expanded housing access. We've
19	restored sanitation cuts. We provided a salary
20	adjustment for our critical Human Service Program
21	workers and increased funding for mental health
22	services to name but just a few. Something extremely
23	near and dear to myself, um, personally is the \$1.4
24	million Eye Care Pilot which will provide free
25	optometry services to low-income New Yorkers and will

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

truly be a game changes for so many people who are without Eye Care or Eye Insurance. Also providing a property tax rebate to New York City resident homeowners earning \$250,000 or less who are struggling with rising costs across the board. This is the first property tax rebate in 14 years. Time and time again during our budget process I continually said that as Finance Chair I work with our speaker to secure a fair and balanced budget, one rooted in fairness and equity for all New York City residents and we do this while putting historic amounts away to address future risks. The last few years have taught us at least two huge lessons. need to address inequity in the City and we need to plan better for the inevitable hard times that may As we emerge through COVID and we entire our new normal, the Fiscal Year 2023 budget provides a solid ground from which we can begin recovery. means is this budget a panasthia for all the issues confronting our City but it is an incredibly solid foundation from which to grow over these next few years. So now let's turn to adopting this budget. Before we get to the vote, I want to discuss the specific items that we will vote on today. Finance

2 Committee Members were emailed a Budget Packet by the 3 Committee Counsel that contains all of the budget 4 related legislation that must be voted on by the Committee and again by the full Council in the Stated 5 Meeting later this evening. A description of all the 6 7 items were also emailed to you. So I'm just going to 8 list the items that are on our agenda this evening that require a vote. The first item is Intro 347. local law to amend the Administrative Code of the 10 11 City of New York in relation to suspending the annual 12 tax on state licensed retailers selling liquor, wine 13 or beer at retail for on or off premises consumption within the City of New York for the Tax Year 14 15 beginning in 2022. Items two through six allow us to set the property tax for the coming years. 16 17 second item is a Resolution computing and certifying 18 the base percentage, current percentage and current 19 base proportion of each class of real property for FY 20 23 to the State Board of Real Property Tax Services 21 pursuant to Section 1803A of the real property tax The third is, the third item is a Resolution 2.2 2.3 computing and certifying adjusted base proportion of each class of real property for Fiscal 2023 to the 24 State Board of Real Property Tax Services pursuant to 25

section 1803 A of the real property tax law. 2 3 fourth is a resolution establishing for Fiscal 2023 a 4 zero percent increase on the current base proportion of any class over the adjusted base proportion of the immediately preceding years for purposes of 6 determining the current base proportion. The fifth 8 item is the report of the Committee on Finance in favor of approving a Resolution of the City Council of New York fixing the tax rate for the FY23 adopted 10 11 June 13, 2022 upon the recommendation of the Committee on Finance of the Council. The sixth item 12 13 is a Resolution to provide the amounts necessary for 14 the support of the Government of the City of New York 15 and the counties therein and for the payment of 16 indebtedness thereof for the Fiscal Year beginning 17 July 1, 2022 and ending on June 30th, 2022 by the 18 levy of the taxes on the real property of the City of 19 New York. The seventh item is a Transparency 20 Resolution number 14. The eighth items is the 21 Mayor's Communication submitting the Expensive Revenue Contract Budget for Fiscal 23 pursuant to 2.2 2.3 section 249 of the New York City Charter. The ninth item is the resolution to adopt a budget 24 25 appropriating the amounts necessary for the support

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

of the government of the City of New York and the counties therein and for the payment of indebtedness thereof for the Fiscal Year beginning July 1, 2022 and ending on June 30, 2023 in accordance with the provisions of the New York City Charter. Resolution is to adopt the contract budget setting forth by agency categories of contractual services for which appropriations have been proposed for the Fiscal Year beginning on July 1, 2022 and ending on June 30, 2023 in accordance with the provisions of the New York City Charter. The 11th item is a message from the Mayor submitting the Executive Capital Budget for FY 23 pursuant to section 249 of the New York City Charter. The 12th item is a Reso A for Fiscal 2022 Capital Budget approving the schedule of changes for the Capital Budget since the Executive Budget including Council Discretionary allocations. The 13th item is Reso B for the Fiscal 2022 Capital Budget which is an approval of the Capital Budget as amended by Reso A. The 14th item is a communication from the Mayor submitting the proposed City Fiscal Year 2023 Community Development Program. proposed CFY 23 Budget, the proposal reallocations, the CD 48 year funds, and proposed CD 49th statement

of objectives and budget dated April 26, 2022. 2 3 15th item is the Resolution approving the City Fiscal 4 Year 2023 Community Development Program reallocation of the 48th year community development funds and the 5 proposed 49th year of community development program. 6 7 The 16th item is a communication from the Office of 8 Management and Budget transferring City funds between various agencies FY 22 to implement to the City's expense budget pursuant to section 107 B of the City 10 11 Charter. The 17th item is the resolution approving a modification of units of appropriation and transfer 12 13 of City funds between agencies as proposed by the Mayor pursuant to section 107 B of the City Charter. 14 15 The 18th item is a communication from the Office of 16 Management and Budget appropriating new City Revenues 17 in FY 22 pursuant to section 107 E of the New York 18 City Charter. The 19th item is a Resolution 19 approving the modification pursuant to section 107 E 20 of the New York City Charter. The 20th item is a 21 communication from the Department of Education and Construction Authority submitting proposed February 2.2 2.3 22 amendment to the Fiscal Year 2020 to 2024 five year Capital Plan. The 21st item and the final items 24 are the Resolution approving the amendment of the 25

2 five year Capital Plan submitted by the DOE and SCA. 3 The other documents were emailed to you which do not 4 require a separate vote which are a Schedule C, a list of the terms and conditions adopted by Fiscal 2023 and the Borough President proposed changes. As 6 7 a reminder to remember Schedule C is a schedule of 8 the expense and contract budgets and the appropriations for the organizations listed in Schedule C are funded by the Expense and Contract 10 11 Budgets. Council Members will have to sign a 12 disclosure form indicating whether or not a conflict 13 exists with any of the groups listed in Schedule C or 14 in Reso A which details the designations of Capital 15 Discretionary Funds. A separate disclosure form must be completed for the transparency resolution. 16 17 Council Member has a potential conflict of interest 18 with any of the organizations included he or she then 19 has the opportunity to disclose the conflict at the 20 time of their vote. If you have not yet signed those disclosure forms staff from the General Counsel's 21 Office are available to guide you through the process 2.2 2.3 so please contact one of them before you vote. friendly reminder please disclose any conflicts that 24 you may have with proposed subcontractors that are 25

2 people of New York. The families that are struggling 3 with high rents, families that are struggling with 4 foreclosures, families that are struggling with 5 unemployment, poverty, most of your districts and communities of color have 30 and 40 percent poverty 6 7 rates. Most have double digit unemployment and this 8 budget of \$101 billion and they lurge you into a budget negotiation process which is the annual dance. I've done 12 budget so you're going to be celebrating 10 11 \$1.1 billion. I saw another number, \$870 million of 12 your initiatives and summary and statements to some 13 agencies. This budget when it comes to unemployment 14 \$1.7 million in workforce development. \$1.7 million 15 in workforce development. There is a cut to the 16 school budget, even if they tell you it's because of 17 absentees. There's a cut to the school budget. 18 There's a cut, pegs as he calls them programs to 19 That's a cute name for pegs. eliminate the gap. 20 Many agencies will be cut with vital human services 21 even if you're going to get some more litter baskets Many of the agencies will be cut and 2.2 for your areas. 2.3 most of the agencies that we see federal money, that money is running out. Some of it in next year, some 24 25 of it this year, that money is running out. We had

- an opportunity to do better. One point and how many
 of you really read the Capital Budget that has
 billions of dollars for more jails and \$1.7 million
- 5 for more jobs.

tonight.

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

- 6 CHAIRPERSON JUSTIN BRANNAN: Council
- 7 Member how do you vote?
- 8 CHARLES BARRON: I'm not finished
 9 talking. I'm going to have my word tonight. I don't
 10 care what you say. I'm going to have my word
- 12 CHAIRPERSON JUSTIN BRANNAN: One more 13 minute.

CHARLES BARRON: Because. No. I'm going to have my word tonight. Y'all going to win this battle but you ain't shutting my mouth so forget about it. We have a budget that is \$101 billion and there's cuts to every major agencies. In fact many of the agencies cannot hire anybody, fill any vacancies and when you have money for jails and money for the police, \$11 billion for the police, \$513 million for overtime for the police and the Crisis Management System Teams, \$100 million. And you so in lizar so you can get some creditability. This Budget doesn't meet the urgency and emergency of the people

2 in our districts. You all know that and yes, I'm not going to get any money from the \$41 million that the 3 4 speaker has to dole out to you who did the right 5 thing by her. Those of us who didn't, four or five of us who might not be voting for this budget, we're 6 7 not going to get that money. The little \$41 million. 8 Who does she hurt? Not me. She's hurting hundreds of thousands of our people in black and brown communities because they didn't vote for the budget. 10 11 This is what happens every time. This budget has too 12 much that was take from vital services and when you 13 pass it even the rebate, \$150 rebate, \$250 from the 14 State and then November the property tax is going up. 15 They are going to have to use that rebate to give it back to pay the tax in November. That ain't even 16 17 There's too much in this budget that's a 18 contradiction to what the budget is supposed to be 19 The Budget is supposed to reflect the values. about. 20 The budget is supposed to reflect the needs of the 21 people. Wall Street made \$58 billion profit. 2.2 Street, an unexpected \$3 billion in revenue came in. 2.3 Another \$1.5 billion in revenue is coming in next year and you already had \$6.3 billion in reserve 24 \$10 billion we should have eliminated all the 25

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2	gaps. We should have restored all the revenue for
3	the federal money and we should have had a anti-
4	poverty program. Crime goes up because poverty,
5	unemployment and mental health. None of those three
6	areas have been adequately funded. So we're going to
7	have high crime and with the 50,000 police officers
8	and their \$11 billion budget crime has gone up from
9	January to now by 41 percent.

CHAIRPERSON JUSTIN BRANNAN: Council Member.

CHARLES BARRON: So my colleagues I want to encourage you to do the right thing by the people and not your personal interest. Not because you got a Chair, not because you're getting your favorite program but for the people. Those are people who voted for you. I am voting no on all of the items except for the Transparency, the Transfer Budget and number one the tax, yeah.

WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Council Member Brooks-Powers?

SELVENA BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that. I was eager to vote. Failed to disclose. just want to disclose my conflicts. I am, I along with my deputy chief of staff is both members of

Social Services.

7

9

13

14

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

- Queens Alumni Chapter of Delta Sigma Data Sorority

 Incorporated. I also am member of the Greater Allen

 AME Cathedral of New York. My Director of Scheduling

 is a PTA member for Eagle Academy and my Deputy Chief

 of Staff serves on the board for Rochdale Village
- 8 CHARLES BARRON: And Mr. Chair let me

just disclose that my son works for BRICK.

- 10 CHAIRPERSON JUSTIN BRANNAN: Thank you.

 11 Billy. Uh, Billy, Council Member Powers has a

 12 disclosure testimony.
 - WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Powers.
- 15 KEITH POWERS: [bad sound]
- 16 CHAIRPERSON JUSTIN BRANNAN: Thank you.
 17 All yours Billy.
- 18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer?
 - GALE BREWER: I vote aye and I do want to thank all the people whom the Chair mentioned and also to say Charles Barron I also have 13 years this year, both of us as budget passings, 11 years as a staff in the City Council and 4 on the Merrill Staff. A lot of budget in the past and I want to say this is

the most open, transparent and the most discussion

Parenthood Federation of America. I believe we will

Thank you. I will give a very, very short version of

remarks because I'm going to save it for later 2 3 really. But just to, to acknowledge that this is a 4 historic budget that when we look at the education and youth investments that we are making in FYP and 5 we're going to grow in so many different programs 6 7 these are programs that believe in my district. 8 They're going to make a huge difference. Many of you know that I had for instance two shootings in front of my office in the last month. They happened in a 10 11 two week period and when I talked to those kids 12 because bills are my constituents. Those are my 13 babies. When I talked to them what they said to me was Miss, we don't got anywhere to go. Miss we don't 14 15 got things to do. We want a basketball tournament. And so this is an extremely meaningful opportunity to 16 be able to vote in support of this budget. 17 18 also want to acknowledge that the primary thing that I've been fighting for on behalf of my district and 19 20 so many New Yorkers is a deeper Capital Investment in 21 the Housing Budget. This Council pushed the Mayor for a \$4 billion annual investment in Capital Funds 2.2 2.3 for housing and we did not get there this time around. We got to \$5 billion over a 10 year period 24 which is about 12.5 percent and so in, in voting aye 25

JULIE WON: I vote aye on all.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank
3 you. Carr?

DAVID CARR: Go ahead and disclose on the record that my domestic partner is a student at CUNY and we're funding CUNY in this budget and with that I vote all on all with the exception of Pre-considered M 73 and Pre-considered resolutions 221, 222 and 233 on which I vote no. Thank you.

WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: you. One moment. Okay items are adopted with the following results. Introduction 347 adopted by the Committee with 17 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions. Pre-Considered Resolutions 221, 222 and 223 along with M73 and it's companion Reso are adopted by the Committee with 15 in the affirmative, 2 in the negative and no abstentions. Pre-Considered Resolution and the Transparency Reso were adopted by the Committee 17 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions. M50 and its companion Resolutions are adopted by the Committee with 15 in the affirmative, 2 in the negative and no abstentions and 51 and its Resolutions are also adopted with, by the Committee 15 in the affirmative, 2 in the negative and no

1	COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 24
2	abstentions. We have M52 the Community Development
3	and Pre-Considered M71 with its Resolution, Pre-
4	considered M72 with its Resolution, M35 and its
5	Resolution along with the Ms to be filed are adopted
6	by the Committee with 16 in the affirmative, 1 in the
7	negative and no abstention.
8	CHAIRPERSON JUSTIN BRANNAN: Thank you.
9	Just a reminder to my colleague make sure you find
10	the General Council staff to fill out your forms in
11	addition to what you disclosed tonight. Okay with
12	that this meeting is adjourned. [gavel pounding]
13	
14	TRANSCRIBERS NOTE: Vote Revision: Pre-
15	considered Resolution 223. 16 affirmatives, 1
16	negative and 0 abstentions.
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date JULY 24, 2022