

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS

Jointly with

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

May 3, 2022  
Start: 11:10 a.m.  
Recess: 3:34 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing - Virtual Room 2

B E F O R E: Nantasha M. Williams  
Chairperson - Civil & Human Rights

Kamillah Hanks  
Chairperson - Public Safety

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Rita C. Joseph  
Christopher Marte  
Kristin Richardson Jordan  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Inna Vernikov  
Joann Ariola  
Erik D. Bottcher  
Justin L. Brannan  
Tiffany Cabán  
Carmen N. De La Rosa  
Robert F. Holden  
Darlene Mealy

Althea V. Stevens

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Andrew Arias

NYPD Deputy Inspector, Commanding Officer of  
NYPD Hate Crimes Taskforce

Michael Clarke

NYPD Counsel

Deanna Logan

Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice Director

Hassan Naveed

Deputy Executive Director for Office of  
Prevention of Hate Crimes

Sapna Raj

Deputy Commissioner of Law Enforcement at the  
NYC Commission on Human Rights

Kajori Chaudhuri

Deputy Commissioner for Community Relations  
Bureau at CCHR

Laurence Hong

Chief of Staff for Assembly Member Yuh-Line Niou

Michael Cohen

Eastern Director of Simon Wiesenthal Center

Chanterelle Sung

Chief of Strategic Operations for Manhattan DA

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Scott Richman  
Anti-Defamation League Director for New York/New  
Jersey

Ada Lin  
Coalition for Asian American Children and  
Families, CACF

Leo Ferguson  
Strategic Project at Jews for Racial and  
Economic Justice

Lakshmi Sanmuganathan  
CACF

Avi Posnick  
Regional Director at StandWithUs

Medha Ghosh  
CACF

Benice Mach  
Chinese-American Planning Council

Jennifer Diaz  
Manager of Community Engagement at New York  
Immigration Coalition

Tydie Abreu  
Director of Policy and Social Impact for  
Hispanic Federation

Ravi Reddi  
Asian American Federation

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Wes Rixon  
Anti-Violence Project

Gerard Filitti  
Lawfare Project

LoriKim Alexander  
Anti-Violence Project

Gobi Romo  
Anti-Violence Project

Cheryl Fishbein  
President of Jewish Community Relations Council  
of New York

Panthea Lee  
Journalist

Mon Yuck Yu  
Academy of Medical and Public Health Services

Jeffrey Lax  
CUNY Professor

Elyse Buxbaum  
Executive Vice President Museum of Jewish  
Heritage

Megha Jain Narsimhamurthy  
President-elect for South Asian Bar Association  
of New York

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Israel Bitton  
American Against Anti-Semitism

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 6

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you, and good  
4 morning, and welcome to today's remote New York City  
5 Council hearing of the Committee on Civil and Human  
6 Rights jointly with the Committee on Public Safety.  
7 At this time, would all Council Members and staff  
8 please turn on their video? To minimize disruption,  
9 please place electronic devices on vibrate or silent  
10 mode. Thank you for your cooperation. We are ready  
11 to begin. Chair Hanks, you're just on mute.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: We're good? Okay.

13 Good morning. I am Kamillah Hanks and the Chair of  
14 the Committee on Public Safety, and I am joined by my  
15 Council Members Ariola, Bottcher, Brannan, Marte,  
16 Stevens, Yeger, Kristen Jordan, Mealy, and Minority  
17 Whip Vernikov. Thank you so much. Today's hearing  
18 held jointly with Natasha Williams and the Committee  
19 on Civil and Human Rights will examine the City's  
20 response to hate crimes and discrimination. In the  
21 recent years, New York City along with the country as  
22 a whole has experienced a frightening increase in  
23 hate crime sand bias incidents. Last month,  
24 statistics show that hate crimes in the City were up  
25 by 76 percent compared to the same period last year.  
On April 24<sup>th</sup> there were 160 hate crimes reported

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

7

1 citywide this year. This is according to NYPD. Too  
2 frequently our residents, visitors, and workers have  
3 experienced the manifestation of hatred that  
4 permeates society, the violent targeting and  
5 harassment of individuals due to their perceived  
6 ethnic, racial, religious, gender, or sexual  
7 identities. Our city has been rocked by bouts of  
8 violence against our Asian-American neighbors as we  
9 begin celebrate Asian-American Pacific Islander  
10 Heritage Month. It must be of the utmost importance  
11 not only to use it as a time of celebration but to  
12 commit to curtailing any forms of violence and hatred  
13 against the members of this community. As the city  
14 is built on the strength of immigrant communities,  
15 our local government has an obligation to stem the  
16 rise of hate crimes and hate-based incidents to  
17 reassure our residents of the City's commitment to  
18 diversity, inclusion, and dignity for all. Today's  
19 hearing will be an essential opportunity for this  
20 council to examine the citywide response to hate-  
21 based incidents. Whether behavioral rises-- whether  
22 behavior rises to criminal conduct under state law,  
23 or discrimination pursuant under New York City Human  
24 Rights Law, we must ensure that our law enforcement  
25

1 and city agencies treat hate-based incidents  
2 seriously that are impacting cities and feels the  
3 city sufficiently protects all New Yorkers from hate.  
4 Combatting hate must truly be a collaborative effort  
5 from many city agencies in order to be successful.  
6 That collaboration includes the City Commission on  
7 Human Rights, the Mayor's Office for Prevention of  
8 Hate Crimes, the NYPD and the Council. I look  
9 forward to hearing all of their testimonies today on  
10 this topic and on the collective responses to hate  
11 crimes in this city. I'm also going to make note  
12 that we are also examining hate crimes on LGBTQ, our  
13 Jewish residents, and everyone else, and even  
14 including seniors. So I'm-- I want to note if  
15 counsel-- excuse me-- Chair Williams is ready for  
16 her-- to give her opening statement?

18 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: No, I am not ready  
19 right now, but I will in a second, and I am listening  
20 in, and I just want to thank all of my colleagues  
21 that are here today, the Administration, of course  
22 you, Chair Hanks for partnering with me on this very  
23 important topic, and also helming the ship in the  
24 interim. Thank you so much.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

9

3 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: No, you are standing  
4 in solidarity with a very important issue, so we  
5 definitely-- we will wait for you. So, with that,  
6 I'll turn it over to our moderate, Committee Counsel  
7 Joshua Kingsley to go over some procedural items.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.

9 And Chair Williams, we'll turn back to you when  
10 you're available as well. Thanks everyone. I'm  
11 Committee Counsel Josh Kingsley for the Public Safety  
12 Committee. I'm going to go over some procedural  
13 items for this hearing. Before we begin, I'd like to  
14 remind everyone that you'll be on mute until you are  
15 called on to testify. At which point, you'll be  
16 unmuted by a host. During the hearing I'll be  
17 calling the panelists to testify. Please listen to  
18 your name to be called, and I will be periodically  
19 announcing who the next panelist will be. At this  
20 hearing we'll have-- receive testimony from the NYPD,  
21 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice which is part  
22 of the Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes, or  
23 the Office of Prevention of Hate Crimes is part of  
24 the Mayor's Criminal Justice, the Commission on Civil  
25 Rights, and then also members of the public. Council  
Members, if you have any questions for the

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

10

3 Administration or a specific panelist, please use the  
4 Zoom raise hand function. I will call on you when  
5 it's your time. For all panelists, when you're  
6 called on to testify, please state your name and the  
7 organization you represent, if any. I will now call  
8 on representatives of the Administration to testify.  
9 We'll begin the testimony with folks from the NYPD  
10 and the Mayor's Office for Prevention of Hate Crimes,  
11 followed by Commission on Civil and Human Rights. So  
12 to begin, we're going to start by swearing in the  
13 NYPD and the Mayor's Office to Prevent Hate Crimes.  
14 So please raise your right hand and affirm the  
15 following statement. We're going to first actually--  
16 I'll list the names of the folks who we're going to  
17 be hearing from. We're going to hear from Andrew  
18 Arias [sp?] who is the Deputy Inspector at NYPD,  
19 Deputy Inspector or the Commanding Officer of the  
20 Hate Crimes Taskforce, and then Deanna Logan [sp?]  
21 who is the Director of the Mayor's Office of Criminal  
22 Justice will be representing the Office to Prevent  
23 Hate Crimes. We'll also be hearing from Deputy  
24 Executive Director Hassan Naveed from the Office to  
25 Prevent Hate Crimes, and Michael Clark from the  
Mayor's-- or the Police Department. Sapna Raj from

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

11

1 the Human Rights Commission will also be testifying,  
2 but we're going to turn to her after the NYPD and the  
3 Office to Prevent Hate Crimes. So, without further  
4 ado, let's swear in the witnesses, and then we can  
5 begin Administration testimony. So, Andrew Arias,  
6 Michael Clarke, Deanna Logan, and Hassan Naveed,  
7 please if you could raise your right hand and affirm  
8 the following statement: Do you affirm to tell the  
9 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth  
10 before this Committee and to answer honestly to  
11 Council Member questions?  
12

13 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: I do.

14 MICHAEL CLARKE: I do.

15 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I do.

16 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: I do.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great, thank you,  
18 all. NYPD you may begin, and then we'll pass it off  
19 to OPHC after that. So, go ahead everyone. Thank  
20 you.

21 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Good morning,  
22 Chair Hanks, Chair Williams, and members of the  
23 Council. I am Deputy Inspector Andrew Arias, the  
24 Commanding Officer of the New York City Police  
25 Department Hate Crime Taskforce. I am joined here

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

12

1 today by Michael Clarke, Director of Legislative  
2 Affairs Unit for the NYPD, as well as my colleagues  
3 from the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice and the  
4 New York City Commission on Human Rights. On behalf  
5 of Police Commissioner Keechant L. Sewell, we are  
6 pleased to testify before your committees regarding  
7 the work of the NYPD's Hate Crimes Taskforce and our  
8 investigation of hate crimes in New York City. I  
9 think we can all agree that hate crimes are  
10 particularly insidious crimes because their intended  
11 effect on the safety and freedoms of entire  
12 communities. When perpetrators of hate crimes select  
13 their victims based on race, color, national origin,  
14 ancestry, gender, gender identity or expression,  
15 religion, age, sexual orientation or disability, they  
16 place an entire community that shares the same traits  
17 or beliefs in fear, fear of being attacked on their  
18 way to run errands, fear of letting their children  
19 walk to the local playground or to school, fear of  
20 being themselves and living their lives openly  
21 without the type of oppression many immigrated to  
22 this country to escape. New York City rightfully  
23 prides itself on its diversity, a true melting pot  
24 where people from just about every background live  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

13

1 and work together, a city where hate and bigotry have  
2 no place and are not tolerated. Whether it is a  
3 seven random attacks of Asian women in a single day,  
4 the deplorable graffiti of swastikas on Brooklyn  
5 synagogues or attacks targeting our Sikh community in  
6 Queens, the NYPD's Hate Crime Taskforce is committed  
7 to thoroughly investigating such crimes and bringing  
8 those perpetrators to justice. The recent pattern of  
9 hate crimes in the city is deeply troubling. There  
10 were 202 confirmed hate crimes between January 1<sup>st</sup>  
11 and May 1<sup>st</sup> of this year, in comparison to the 159  
12 hate crimes in the same period in 2021. This is an  
13 increase of 27 percent. Anti-Semitic incidents  
14 increased the most this year, increasing by 72  
15 percent. In the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic, there  
16 was an alarming increase of hate crimes targeting  
17 Asian Pacific Islanders. While hate crimes against  
18 our Asian community members are down 62 percent  
19 compared to 2021, the 67 last year and 25 in the same  
20 period this year, this number is still significantly  
21 higher than pre-pandemic levels. Sadly, these trends  
22 are mirrored throughout the nation. The FBI reported  
23 more hate crimes in 2020 than it had since at least  
24 2008. According to the Human Rights Campaign, 2021  
25

1 was the deadliest year for transgender and gender  
2 non-conforming people in this country. The City and  
3 the Department are aware of these disturbing trends  
4 and we are taking action. With 20 investigators  
5 assigned to it, the Department's Hate Crime Taskforce  
6 is the largest unit dedicated to the investigation of  
7 hate crimes in the nation. Its mission is to  
8 vigorously investigate all reported hate crimes in  
9 the City. Whenever members of the NYPD respond to a  
10 crime that has a possible bias element, the  
11 responding officers are required to notify the Patrol  
12 Supervisor. The Patrol Supervisor verifies the  
13 determination and is required to notify the  
14 Commanding Officer or Duty Captain. The Duty Captain  
15 or Commanding Officer is required to prepare an  
16 unusual occurrence report which is then sent to the  
17 Hate Crimes Taskforce and the Chief of Detectives.  
18 The Hate Crimes Taskforce then commences an  
19 investigation to determine if there is a bias element  
20 and crime that makes the incident, in fact, a hate  
21 crime. The investigation of hate crimes is a team  
22 effort. The Taskforce is routinely assisted by  
23 precinct detective squads, evidence collection teams,  
24 patrol officers helping to identify witnesses, and  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

15

1 neighborhood coordination officers helping to locate  
2 and retrieve video, just to name a few. The  
3 Taskforce also works with other NYPD bureaus to help  
4 prevent such crimes. Hate crimes are discussed at  
5 CompStat meetings as well as with local precincts so  
6 that they can appropriately deploy resources and be  
7 able to increase presence around potentially  
8 vulnerable locations. We speak with the Precinct  
9 Commanding Officer and with our Community Affairs  
10 Bureau after any significant incident, and we work  
11 together on a plan with outreach to the community.  
12 Moreover, we work closely with key members of the  
13 community to ensure that everyone is informed. The  
14 Department's continuing partnership with the  
15 community remains a cornerstone of our Neighborhood  
16 Policing strategy, and it's especially important when  
17 dealing with incidents of bias. Our Liaison Unit and  
18 our Community Affairs Bureau have created working  
19 partnerships with members of the community and help  
20 us to provide information to them. We also work very  
21 closely with the Mayor's Office to Prevent Hate  
22 Crimes. They will speak more about their work, but  
23 they are vital in helping to ensure coordination  
24 between government agencies and community  
25

1 organizations. Last year, the NYPD Hate Crime Review  
2 Panel was formed to assist us in investigating hate  
3 crimes. This civilian panel reviews suspected bias  
4 crimes to determine whether the Department correctly  
5 classified the incident. This panel assesses the  
6 circumstances of the cases that may have presented  
7 challenges in establishing whether a victim's actual  
8 or perceived race, national origin, ethnicity,  
9 religion, disability, or sexual orientation were  
10 motivating factors, and makes reconditions as to  
11 whether the evidence collected would support  
12 classifying the case as a hate crime. This provides  
13 another layer of rigorous review to ensure justice  
14 for victims. We believe that transparency is key to  
15 the prevention of hate crimes. That is why hate  
16 crimes have been added to our public-facing CompStat  
17 2.0 which is updated weekly. Individuals can look at  
18 incidents in each precinct and see what crime was  
19 charged and where it occurred. Additionally, we  
20 publish more detailed data on our Hate Crimes  
21 Dashboard that is updated quarterly. The Dashboard  
22 allows users to look hate crimes in each precinct  
23 broken out by the motivation and charge type.  
24 Finally, pursuant to a law passed by the Council, we  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

17

3 publish quarterly reports on hate crimes which are  
4 located on our website. The NYPD is committed to  
5 working tirelessly to bring justice to victims of  
6 hate crimes and affected communities, and to work  
7 with our government, non-government, and community  
8 partners in furtherance of an atmosphere of safety  
9 bred out of respect for one another's diversity.

10 Thank you very much for the opportunity to testify  
11 before you today, and I will now turn it over to my  
12 colleagues.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
14 your testimony. Next we'll turn over to both MOCJ  
15 and the Mayor's Office for Prevention of Hate Crimes.  
16 Ms. Logan, or whoever from your office will read the  
17 testimony. After that, we'll do specific questions  
18 for these two agencies, before turning over to the  
19 Commission on Human Rights.

20 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Go ahead, ma'am.  
22 Thank you.

23 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Good morning, Chair  
24 Hanks, Chair Williams, and members of the Committee  
25 on Public Safety, and the Committee on Civil and  
Human Rights. I'm Deanna Logan, and I am the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

18

1 Director of the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice,  
2 affectionately known as MOCJ. I'm joined here today  
3 by Naveed Hassan who is our Deputy Executive Director  
4 for the Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes, as  
5 well as my colleagues from NYPD, and the Commission  
6 on Civil Human Rights. MOCJ advises the Mayor on  
7 Criminal Justice policy and is the Mayor's  
8 representative to the courts, District Attorneys,  
9 defender organizations, and state criminal justice  
10 agency among others. MOCJ designs, deploys, and  
11 evaluates citywide strategies to promote safety,  
12 reduce unnecessary arrests and incarceration, and  
13 improve fairness. Recognizing that public safety  
14 cannot be achieved by law enforcement alone, MOCJ  
15 brings together community and institutional  
16 stakeholders to address the systemic issues that  
17 undermine the safety and stability of our  
18 neighborhoods. MOCJ strives to move our city forward  
19 by promoting better resources and the access to  
20 supports needed to promote and maintain healthy  
21 communities for all New Yorkers. The Office for the  
22 Prevention of Hate Crimes, or as we refer to it as  
23 OPHC, was launched in 2019 and is a part of MOCJ.  
24 OPHC works closely with the Mayor's Community Affairs  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

19

1 Unit to provide training and community education on  
2 preventing and responding to hate crimes. OPHC plays  
3 a very unique and unprecedented role in city  
4 government by coordinating citywide hate crimes  
5 prevention and response efforts. What we know from  
6 our work in community and with our city agency  
7 partners is there is not one single way to fight  
8 hate. The fight against hate requires a multi-  
9 pronged approach that engages community, city  
10 agencies, and law enforcement. OPHC carries out this  
11 effort to prevent and to respond to hate crimes  
12 through the interagency coordination of three  
13 intersectional pillars, community relations,  
14 education, and laws with law enforcement. When we  
15 talk about interagency coordination, it's to ensure  
16 effective coordination of city agencies who work to  
17 prevent and respond to hate crimes. OPHC has  
18 established the City's first interagency committee on  
19 hate crimes, and it's referred to as IAC. It's  
20 composed of more than 20 city agencies, including the  
21 New York City Police Department, all of the five  
22 District Attorney's Office Hate Crimes Unit. The IAC  
23 has coordinated immediate responses to hate crimes,  
24 implemented community-based strategies to combat  
25

1 hate, referred victims to services, and strengthen  
2 communication among all stakeholders working on hate  
3 crimes and bias incidents in the City. On the  
4 community side, OPHC created the City's first network  
5 of over 80 community organizations committed to  
6 standing untied against hate. These organizations  
7 represent the immense diversity of New York City.  
8 OPHC serves as a bridge between the city government  
9 and communities most vulnerable to hate crimes.  
10 Whether providing systemic analysis on hate crimes  
11 data to city agencies or working with community  
12 organizations on neighborhood safety plans, OPHC  
13 plays an integral role in advancing a comprehensive,  
14 strategic response to hate crimes that integrate  
15 government and community stakeholders. As part of  
16 its interagency efforts and in direct response to the  
17 increase in anti-Asian American, Pacific Islander  
18 bias incidents in April 2020, OPHC convened the Stop  
19 AAPI Hate Interagency Working Group. Comprised of  
20 several city agencies, the Stop AAPI Hate Interagency  
21 Working Group continues to meet and address the  
22 increasing hate crimes and bias incidents against  
23 Asian New Yorkers. The working group leverages the  
24 expertise and experience of city agencies and  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

21

3 community-based organizations, ensuring that efforts  
4 are culturally competent, language appropriate, and  
5 educational. In addition to directly addressing the  
6 anti-Asian incidents, the working group broadened its  
7 approach during the peak of the pandemic by engaging  
8 with all vulnerable communities on hate crimes and  
9 bias incidents, and disseminated much-needed  
10 resources and information on COVID-19. OPHC has  
11 convened the working group on a regular basis since  
12 April 2020 to ensure effective coordination of  
13 programs and events. As we look at the pillars that  
14 OPHC is committed to, committee relations is the  
15 first pillar. OPHC manages the network of 80  
16 community-based organizations committed to fighting  
17 hate through strategies that seek to strengthen  
18 relations between communities and educate the public  
19 on hate crimes. OPHC worked closely with the  
20 community organizations and city agencies to produce  
21 virtual and in-person events that seek to raise  
22 awareness on hate crimes and bias incidents in  
23 multiple language across all five boroughs. The  
24 following community initiatives comprise OPHC's  
25 community network. Partners Against Hate, referred  
to as Path Forward, community advisory and service

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

22

1 teams, CAST. In addition, OPHC coordinates and  
2 administers the City's Hate Crimes Prevention  
3 Initiative. The PATH, or Partners Against Hate,  
4 understanding critical role that the community  
5 organizations have prevented is a response that was  
6 launched in May 2021 in order to provide the support  
7 that community-based organizations most vulnerable to  
8 hate crimes require to conduct their work. PATH  
9 Forward funds programs and services in the following  
10 areas: neighborhood safety, community relations,  
11 strategies to enhance hate crime reporting, education  
12 including bystander intervention training, victim  
13 services, and data collection through Path Forward.  
14 Through Path Forward, OPHC invested 2.4 million  
15 dollars into six anchor organizations. These anchor  
16 organizations use those funds and distributed them to  
17 over 50+ sub-organizations that are actively working  
18 to combat hate in our city. In order to broaden its  
19 community engagement and provide innovative  
20 opportunities to New Yorkers, OPHC also launched Hate  
21 Crime Prevention Innovation Grants, which also  
22 provide up to 20,000 dollars of innovative community  
23 projects for individual organizations and schools.  
24 In the last quarter of 2020, OPHC also created the  
25

1 Community Advisory and Service Teams, CAST, a  
2 partnership with New York City community-based  
3 organizations that supports and elevates important  
4 grassroots work to serve the communities that are  
5 most vulnerable to bias-motivated incidents and hate  
6 crimes so that our city is better positioned to  
7 improve services, to respond to the needs of our  
8 diverse communities, and ensure safer, more welcoming  
9 New York City for all. Education being our second  
10 pillar, OPHC continues to expand its education  
11 offerings to all New Yorkers, both in schools and for  
12 the public. The primary focus of OPHC's efforts is to  
13 educate New Yorkers on hate crimes, bias incidents,  
14 and the differences between the two, the overall hate  
15 crime reporting process, city and state laws, victim  
16 resources, and services, and what New Yorkers can do  
17 on their own to fight hate in their individual  
18 communities. OPHC also works with community  
19 organizations to develop curated trainings and events  
20 that educate all communities on a variety of issues  
21 related to hate crimes, bias, and discrimination.  
22 These trainings include Preventing Hate Together,  
23 which is a comprehensive, one-hour interactive  
24 training on the basics of hate crimes and bias  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

24

1 incidents, OPHC community-based efforts and how New  
2 Yorkers can stand up to hate and the biases and  
3 prejudices that can lead to bias or hate-based  
4 incidents of violence. Preventing Hate Together is  
5 offered at events that OPHC coordinates closely with  
6 community organizations and other city agencies  
7 throughout all five boroughs. In these events,  
8 community members also engage directly with city  
9 agencies, including the New York City Police  
10 Department. In addition to community training, OPHC  
11 also produces educational fact sheets, victim guides,  
12 and other resources and information as needed  
13 throughout the year. OPHC offerings include: "What  
14 is a Hate Crime Guide, Hate Crimes Victim Guide to  
15 Help," both of which are offered in 14 languages, as  
16 well as informational web pages on hate crimes and  
17 hate crime symbols. In August of 2020, as a  
18 complement to its educational efforts, OPHC launched  
19 HeARTwork Against Hate, which is actually one of my  
20 favorite initiatives. It is an art contest for New  
21 York City youth ages 10 to 18 that creatively  
22 expresses the positive values that makes New York  
23 City great while raising awareness about how everyone  
24 can stand against all forms of bias, excuse me,  
25

1 discrimination and hate. The contest has proved a  
2 valuable teaching tool, and the 2020 winners were  
3 announced this spring. Their artwork will be  
4 displayed digitally throughout the City. I invite all  
5 New Yorkers to look for it. When we think about our  
6 laws and law enforcement, OPHC works closely with  
7 NYPD Hate Crimes Taskforce often serving as a bridge  
8 to affected communities. Through NYPD hate crimes  
9 data and community engagement, OPHC identifies hate  
10 crimes and bias incident trends, shares information  
11 with communities and city agencies, and develops  
12 comprehensive plans to address them. Pursuant to  
13 Local Law 49 in 2020, OPHC in partnership with NYPD  
14 created a system to alert elected officials and  
15 affected communities whenever the New York City  
16 Police Department determined that a potential violent  
17 hate crime occurred. OPHC distributed list for the  
18 notification system contains over 500 contacts,  
19 including elected officials, Community Boards and  
20 community-based organizations. Notifications include  
21 the hate motivation and the location, date, and time  
22 of the incident. OPHC uses these notifications to  
23 guide its responses, to coordinate, and to connect to  
24 community organizations. There are no easy answers  
25

1 and no quick fixes when it comes to fighting hate.

2 As our testimony has demonstrated, OPHC and the  
3 Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice under the guidance  
4 of the Mayor is committed to deploying a wide variety  
5 of interventions in order to empower communities and  
6 coordinate government in the ongoing struggle against  
7 bias and hate. I'm optimistic that with Mayor Adams'  
8 vision of bias-free New York and the support of this  
9 body, that OPHC will continue to make a positive  
10 difference for all New Yorkers. Thank you.

11  
12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
13 your testimony. Council Members, please use the Zoom  
14 raise hand function if you have any questions. We'll  
15 first turn to Chair Hanks and then move on to Council  
16 Member questions. As a reminder, we'll call on the  
17 Commission on Human Rights after Council Members have  
18 an opportunity to ask these questions. Go ahead.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Josh. I  
20 appreciate that. Thank you so much for both your  
21 testimonies. I'm going to start with Ms. Logan of  
22 MOCJ, and then I'll move over to some of my questions  
23 for NYPD. What is the mandate for OPHC, and what  
24 work has OPHC done in advancing its mandate? I know  
25 you mentioned a few things, but--

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

27

3 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So, OPHC is the  
4 coordinating arm, and I will let Hassan Naveed who is  
5 our Deputy Executive Director talk to some more of  
6 the specifics that-- and details that were already  
7 outlined in the testimony.

8 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: Thank  
9 you so much, Chair Hanks, and so, as Ms. Logan had  
10 brought up, we have three pillars that really drive  
11 the work of what OPHC does, and that in itself really  
12 encompasses what the mandate is of the office, which  
13 is community relations, education, laws, and law  
14 enforcement. And as we discussed, when it comes to  
15 community relations we have the PATH, which is the  
16 Partners Against the Hate, in which we invest 2.4  
17 million dollars into community organization and  
18 community-based approaches towards combatting hate.  
19 That's among other examples, but I'll just sort of  
20 debrief it. I'll provide-- education, as well, too.  
21 As we saw the rise to the Anti-AAPI hate crimes that  
22 occurred, we understood the need of how students  
23 within the schools themselves were asking the  
24 question what's going on. Right? What is happening?  
25 Why are folks in our community being attacked,  
especially our neighbors, AAPI neighbors here in New

1 York. So we work with DOE to be able to put out  
2 informational and curricular materials for teachers  
3 to be able to facilitate those conversations. And  
4 this is something that happens as needed, and we've  
5 done it in different contexts as well, too. And then  
6 going to law enforcement, or laws and law  
7 enforcement, the notification systems is integral for  
8 the community, the public, as well as Council Members  
9 to be kept up to date of when a potential violent  
10 hate crime has happened. That system in itself is  
11 something that really connects OPHC directly to  
12 community organizations. Yes, we receive inquiries  
13 from community orgs as those incidents come out, and  
14 we do our best to be able to respond to them, but  
15 also connect those victims when we can to those  
16 organizations that provide services, right? Because  
17 many of OPHC's community network, going back for  
18 community relations pillar, is 80 organizations, 80+  
19 organizations that encompasses immense diversity of  
20 folks who work on hate crimes, bias incidents, as  
21 well as victim services, too. And so those are just  
22 three within those pillars itself and those three  
23 examples are just ways in which we are pushing the  
24 mandate forward of OPHC. And just noting, that we  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

29

3 started in 2019 with literally zero, and we've worked  
4 our way to be able to expand into something that's  
5 become so much bigger, and then we're happy with  
6 that.

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

8 If you can-- I for myself, you know, I did hear in  
9 Ms. Logan's testimony that they are located in all  
10 five boroughs, and so if it would be-- it would be  
11 great for my colleagues to have the listing of these  
12 organizations so we can add that to our list of  
13 resources that we can disseminate, and I'll get back  
14 to that in a moment. So, you know, my line of  
15 questioning is really just to find out what consist  
16 and what constitutes a hate crime under New York  
17 State Law, what line between criminal behavior and  
18 activities protected by the first amendment. So I  
19 guess this is an NYPD question.

20 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Thank you very

21 much, Chair. It's important to note that we need the  
22 defendant to have committed a predicate offense, and  
23 then paired with the defendant selected that person  
24 against whom the offense was committed or intended to  
25 be committed in whole or in substantial part because  
of a belief or perception regarding the protected

1 characteristic of that victim, regardless of whether  
2 the belief or perception is in fact correct. It's a  
3 very high standard and a very, very complicated law  
4 that requires intense review and collaboration with  
5 our partners both as agency attorneys here and with  
6 our District Attorney prosecutorial partners.  
7

8 MICHAEL CLARKE: and just to add a little  
9 bit. The specified offenses, it's listed in Article  
10 485 of the Penal Law. There's about 60 offenses that  
11 are listed. I don't know the exact number, but it's  
12 roughly 60. So the offense has to be one of those  
13 first, one of those 60 offenses, and if it's not,  
14 then it won't qualify as a hate crime. Then as the  
15 inspector said, motivation has to be in whole or  
16 substantial part. The victim has to be selected in  
17 whole or substantial part because of their membership  
18 of a protected characteristic, protected class.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. So, what  
20 is the-- sorry. What are the rates of arrest for  
21 hate crime allegations comparable to what if other  
22 crimes, if lower and why? Does that make sense?

23 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Well, our  
24 clearance rate are as follows: For thus far for  
25 calendar year 2022, our clearance rates for hate

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

31

3 crimes within the Hate Crimes Taskforce are 40  
4 percent per seven major felonies, and 26 percent for  
5 total cases, overall felonies and misdemeanors. I  
6 don't have comparable data for clearance rates of  
7 precinct detective squads or entities that would not  
8 be-- that would not be investigating hate crimes, but  
9 I could tell you based solely on an incident to  
10 arrest nexus. For instance, thus far for the year,  
11 we have 34 arrests for anti-Asian crimes, and of  
12 those 34 arrests if we were to look, those 34 arrests  
13 are for crimes against a person versus crimes against  
14 property. And this year we see that there are 25  
15 hate crimes for anti-Asian. So there's a high  
16 percentage as these crimes come in for us to do our  
17 best to solve them, triaging them by first person  
18 versus property with the goal of successfully  
19 clearing [sic] them to arrest.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Among  
20 hate crime arrests, what trends exist in the recent  
21 years regarding victim identity, neighborhood of  
22 where incidents occur, or type of prohibited conduct?  
23 We kind of want to know what the underlying criminal  
24 offenses are most commonly charged as hate crimes.  
25 That's like super important.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

32

3 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: So, right.

4 Well, if one were to go against the bias type,  
5 meaning the motivation and the classification of  
6 victim, for instance we would see an increase of  
7 anti-Asian crime from one in 2019 to 17 in 2020 to 67  
8 in 2021, and now at 25 year-to-date in 2022. And if  
9 we were to take the aggregate of those numbers going  
10 down, we would see that anti-Jewish crimes, for  
11 instance, that there were 83 in 2019, 57 in 2020, 55  
12 in 2021, and 95 currently year-to-date. If we were to  
13 see anti-male homosexual, we would see that there 13  
14 in 2019, five in 2020, 10 in 2021, and 20 year-to-  
15 date, bring us to 48. And right now, if we were to  
16 look at anti-black, 14 in 2019, nine in 2020, 12 in  
17 2021, and 24 in 2022. If we were to look at the  
18 actual crimes for incidents, and those were the four  
19 largest categories that we see right now, but then if  
20 we were to by crime we would see that criminal  
21 mischief and related offenses meaning property  
22 damage, swastikas, things of those, of that nature,  
23 it's 166 over that time in 2019 to current. And then  
24 we would see that assaults continued to spite to  
25 drive hate crimes as our violations of order of  
protections, offenses against public order and

1 sensibility, which would be offenses against a person  
2 as well.  
3

4 MICHAEL CLARKE: And just the number, the  
5 166, it's the total of year-to-date, 2019, 2020, 21,  
6 and 22, not the total for the entire year. So it's  
7 January 1<sup>st</sup> to May 1<sup>st</sup> of those four years.

8 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. I guess  
9 the next question is for both MOCJ and NYPD, because  
10 in Ms. Logan's testimony they talked about  
11 organizations that are, you know, coming out and  
12 talking about hate crimes in schools. So my next  
13 question is, when you say you work with NYPD, what is  
14 the average age of individuals arrested for alleged  
15 hate crimes, and is there a demographic breakdown of  
16 individuals arrested for hate crimes, and is the  
17 coordination between-- sorry-- OPHC connected with  
18 NYPD in that statistic? So are we talking to the  
19 people that are more than likely getting arrested?  
20 You know, are we targeting the prevention based on my  
21 question which is, you know, the average age of  
22 individuals that are arrested for alleged hate  
23 crimes? So, first I would like to know the average  
24 age, and then I would like to hear from MOCJ. Sorry,  
25 it's a double one.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

34

3 DIRECTOR LOGAN: It's okay. I'll let  
4 NYPD go ahead and give you those numbers, and we'll  
5 talk about the educational resources that we are--

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [interposing] Thank  
7 you.

8 DIRECTOR LOGAN: deploying.

9 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: I do not have a  
10 demographic breakdown of the age and-- age and  
11 classification of the perpetrators, and that's  
12 because it's transcendental. It's by incident. And  
13 each crime complaint that we receive is specific and  
14 unique to the victim, and we look at it with who the  
15 perpetrator that committed that individual act is.  
16 So, it's something we could get back to you with, and  
17 aggregate those arrests, but I don't have that on me.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, because I feel  
19 that that's super important in order for OPHC and  
20 MOCJ to be successful, that we start looking at those  
21 demographics and start breaking that down so we have  
22 an understanding so we know what to target, and then  
23 I'll turn it over to Deanna Logan.

24 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you, Chair Hanks.  
25 So, as I said in our testimony, education is one of  
the tenants and pillars that we are working on, and

1 I'm going to let-- I won't steal Hassan Naveed's  
2 thunder, but I do-- you know, I mentioned in our  
3 testimony the HeARTwork Against Hate which is one of  
4 the programs that I think OPHC has done phenomenal  
5 work on, is getting young people between the ages of  
6 10 and 18 to really, really use art to show the  
7 diversity of the City and also the community  
8 convening together. In addition to other programs  
9 where we promote young people going to museums to  
10 learn about other members of their community. I'll  
11 turn it over to Hassan Naveed now to really go into  
12 some more details on that, but education and  
13 deploying of resources where people start to know  
14 their neighbors is one of the fundamental activities  
15 of this office.

17 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: Thank  
18 you very much, Deanna, and-- you folks can hear me,  
19 right? Okay. So targeted intervention is something  
20 that really is important in really proving the  
21 effectiveness of our efforts overall. And so when it  
22 comes to trends, our conversations about trends,  
23 whether they're happening at that particular level or  
24 where they're happening geographically or where  
25 they're happening in-- wherever they're happening

1  
2 itself is an important factor of how we end up  
3 determining what intervention looks like in those  
4 places, right? And how we determine what  
5 intervention looks like involves engaging with our  
6 law enforcement partners, or DA's offices, the NYPD,  
7 as well as our community organizations, right? And  
8 it's important for us to be able to figure out a  
9 comprehensive response of doing. So one example that  
10 I can provide is the recent-- as we all know, the  
11 anti-Asian incidents that have really hit the City  
12 across, you know, across the city. And we've noticed  
13 that particular incidents are happening in certain  
14 parts of the city through our engagement with PD,  
15 particularly in Midtown or Harlem, in these areas.  
16 And so we go back to the interagency committee that  
17 we have. We have a working group that specifically  
18 brings these other city agencies together that  
19 focuses on AAPI hate crimes, and we ask the question,  
20 how can we work towards target intervention. In one  
21 example in which our partners at the City's  
22 Commission on Human Rights has really led, as well as  
23 the Community Affairs Unit is in [inaudible] of  
24 visibility, where we actually end up going to these  
25 places where these incidents have occurred. Engage

1 directly with businesses, in subway stations, riders,  
2 other sorts of information to be able to get folks  
3 information out from what happened and what they can  
4 do to be able to address that hate crime as they see  
5 it's going on in a safe way, who to call, where to  
6 call. On the education front, Deanna brought up the  
7 HeARTwork Against Hate. We also look at targeted  
8 intervention in places where we're noticing certain  
9 incidents are happening, right, like swastikas as it  
10 pertains to vandalism, property vandalism itself.  
11 And we've seen that those particular areas are places  
12 where that might happen are in Brooklyn. So we've  
13 actually gone and specifically targeted schools and  
14 other sorts of community organizations in order to be  
15 able to provide information and education on those  
16 hate symbols and what they mean. And in also  
17 bringing in members of the Jewish community itself,  
18 other faith communities to those school to be able to  
19 have those conversations about these issues. And so  
20 this target intervention are just two examples that  
21 we've given among the other stuff that we do. Thank  
22 you.  
23

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much.  
25 That leads me to, you know, really kind of unpack,

1 you know, when does offense versus public order meet  
2 in practice. So when does hate speech or behavior  
3 cross the line into criminal behavior? Drawing a  
4 swastika, as you said, is one example, but you know,  
5 is that harassment? Like, how do we determine? And  
6 in order for us to know that, then we can actually  
7 find out solutions to stop it. So, that's my one  
8 last question. Not last question, but--

10 MICHAEL CLARKE: Yeah, I mean, I think  
11 that's, you know, clearly drawing a swastika is, you  
12 know, destroying or damaging property. So I don't  
13 think-- of course, pretty clear that that is going to  
14 be-- eligible for hate crime. You know, if you  
15 strike or shove someone, then you're getting into  
16 that aggravated harassment. That'll be something  
17 that if the motivating factor is there can lead to a  
18 hate crime. If there's like a pattern, maybe,  
19 against the person--

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [interposing] Right.

21 MICHAEL CLARKE: But like a single slur,  
22 as horrible as that is, you know, as terrible as it  
23 is for a person to have to suffer that, probably  
24 wouldn't without more. So, it's sort of a case by  
25 case determination when we hit that threshold. It's

1 a little hard to say in the abstract, but you know,  
2 has to-- you have to commit the crime to get there.

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Well, so with that  
5 said, what obstacles does the NYPD face in  
6 investigating and arresting individuals for reported  
7 hate-based incidents? Are there certain types of  
8 incidents particularly challenging to investigate,  
9 and if so, why? What are the most common reasons  
10 alleged hate crime incidents reported to NYPD do not  
11 result in an arrest?

12 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: So, the triaging  
13 process poses challenges. We receive the Hate Crime  
14 Taskforce of a possible bias incident. When that  
15 arrives at us, we then triage the case, and we  
16 investigate the case, and eventually prior to the  
17 close, it winds up in what we perceive it to be one  
18 of four categories, obviously, a hate crime, and as  
19 we discussed we need the predicate offense and the  
20 second prong which is the defendant selected the  
21 person, as we described earlier. Then there are  
22 incidents where it meets some bias motivation, but it  
23 doesn't meet Penal Law 485-05. Like, for instance, a  
24 harassment second degree with very offensive,  
25 hurtful, vitriolic free speech. Or it reaches a non-

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

40

1 hate crime, but we continue to investigate, for  
2 instance because we want to know who the perpetrator  
3 of the case was and if at any point via prior arrest  
4 that are clearly unsealed, or social media, or things  
5 of that nature, whether there was a motivation from  
6 that factor. And then, a non-bias offense, or non-  
7 bias incident where there's a crime, but no bias, but  
8 if it made it to us through the channels as a  
9 possible bias incident. For instance, an example  
10 could be an ongoing neighbor dispute with eventually  
11 after a number of incidents, a gratuitous statement  
12 used, but all of those levels pose challenges,  
13 because to us conscionably there's a fifth level, and  
14 that is the cases that we see as human beings that  
15 shake us to the very core. And those cases pose the  
16 greatest challenge. When we see or hear of something  
17 that we don't know if it would even fit into one of  
18 those four categories, but the onus is on us as a  
19 Hate Crimes Taskforce as human beings and persons  
20 sworn to take an oath to investigate and try to  
21 figure out where it fits. And those cases tend to be  
22 the largest most challenging because we have to start  
23 at the ground level with partners, prosecutorial  
24 partners, or partners within legal, our stakeholders,  
25

1  
2 our community members, or nongovernmental  
3 organizations to figure out whether these cases can  
4 entirely fit into one of the four areas, and the best  
5 plan to bring closure to a victim whose been so  
6 shattered by having been victim of perceived  
7 [inaudible].

8 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I think, you know,  
9 the line of questioning is really trying to  
10 understand so then we can apply preventative and  
11 intervention which is why we have MOCJ here, and you  
12 know, we want those resources to be put towards good  
13 use. When does the verbal hate speech cross the line  
14 into illegal behavior, into bias, into hate crimes?

15 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Well, every case  
16 is so different, and we see it on a case-by-case  
17 basis is this a possible bias incident to us, and you  
18 know, there are specific examples when one sees in  
19 the media or one sees on social media of crimes, and  
20 each one of those individual cases is triaged  
21 [inaudible] prosecutorial partners to determine that.  
22 And I mean, citing specific examples, certainly, a  
23 lady riding the train and being told as she was at  
24 Times Square about where was she born, and anti-Asian  
25 slurs being uttered as was found on social media. We

1 were able to prove that there was menacing and  
2 menacing based upon her national origin and  
3 ethnicity. And it's a high legal standard, and we  
4 have to take each case and each situation  
5 individually on its merits and bring it to our  
6 prosecutorial partners in order to charge with the  
7 guidelines.

9 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Are there  
10 any examples-- well, let me rephrase. Are there any  
11 examples of conduct that is driven by bias or hate,  
12 but not currently considered criminal that the  
13 Department believes should be criminalized? And what  
14 do you feel that could be done legislatively to  
15 enhance the ability to prosecute hate crimes?

16 MICHAEL CLARKE: Yeah, I mean, I think,  
17 you know, something-- we could always add more crimes  
18 to the list. I, you know, I don't know which ones  
19 would make sense, but you know, [inaudible] menacing  
20 is one that when you-- is crossed the line, putting  
21 yourself in fear, like that crosses the line of  
22 physical safety. The standard on-- the high standard  
23 that we have to meet is something that could be  
24 helped, you know, and we're always willing to talk to  
25 anyone-- you know, this is a state statute-- in the

1 state to talk about it. If there was any movement on  
2 making that change, but I think those-- I think the  
3 real answer is, if you increase the amount of crimes  
4 that are covered and then change the standard to when  
5 your motivation meets it.  
6

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. That's  
8 helpful. Has the NYPD implemented target patrols or  
9 other localized efforts following the trends of hate-  
10 based trends incidents in certain communities?

11 MICHAEL CLARKE: Sure. We definitely  
12 have the, you know,-- we do a few things. Before a  
13 major religious event, for instance, Rosh Hashanah or  
14 Ramadan, we will increase patrols around sensitive  
15 target, potential targets like synagogues and  
16 mosques. When there's been a major incident in New  
17 York City or elsewhere we'll do the same. If there  
18 is in a state of, you know, hate crimes, we will add  
19 more patrol to those communities, you know, and if  
20 there's-- so we'll definitely do that, and we're  
21 constantly looking at data, and when community gets  
22 like a jump, we'll increase resources in that  
23 community.

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Do you find that when  
25 you increase resources that you see a drop in

1 incidents? Is there a-- has there been an increase  
2 in reporting like future hate-based crimes?  
3

4 MICHAEL CLARKE: It's a little hard to  
5 say, you know, because where-- you know, every hate  
6 crimes, you know, a terrible thing, but it's still,  
7 you know, 200 year-to-date. It's not a huge number  
8 that we can say. I mean, that's a huge number, but  
9 it's not--

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [interposing] Yes, it  
11 is a huge number.

12 MICHAEL CLARKE: Yeah, that's not what I  
13 meant, but it's a big number, but it's not-- it's not  
14 so big that trends are easy to identify in that way.  
15 I think we can-- certainly, you know, when there's  
16 more presence our belief crime does come down and  
17 hate crimes will go down with it. But it's hard to  
18 without, you know, doing some kind of study to show  
19 for sure.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah, I mean, you  
21 know, presence has its place, but I mean-- and this  
22 is my final question both for NYPD and OPHC, which is  
23 really trying to figure out whether the public is  
24 sufficiently informed as what is-- what constitutes a  
25 hate crime and what could be done on the local level

1 in communities. I know that Naveed had spoken about  
2 that a lot in his opening, but I think that there's a  
3 space to do more, especially if, you know, we could  
4 drill down and start adding information to  
5 organizations as to what is hate crime and do we  
6 think that the public is sufficiently informed, and  
7 what could we do better. You can both answer. For  
8 both of you.

10 MICHAEL CLARKE: Yeah, so I know, you  
11 know, we have our Community Affairs Officers who in  
12 light of incidents will come out and try and do  
13 things. Inspector Arias will go talk at the  
14 precincts and the NCOs. You know, I think it's a  
15 complicated, you know, what rises to a hate crime is  
16 complicated and it's difficult to communicate, but  
17 you know, that-- there are avenues where we're  
18 attempting to do that, and I know Office to Prevent  
19 Hate Crimes has their own notification systems, so  
20 I'll let them talk about their work.

21 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Yeah, if we could unmute  
22 Deputy Executive Director Naveed. But that was one  
23 of the areas that the Office to Prevent Hate Crimes  
24 identified as its initial challenge to tackle, which  
25 was the fact that the community at large did not

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

46

3 understand the difference between a hate crime and a  
4 bias incident. And so many of the resources that OPHC  
5 has been put towards trying to give the public that  
6 level of clarity, and I'll give you the opportunity  
7 to speak to that in more detail.

8 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: I

9 thank you so much, Deanna. Public education  
10 obviously is extremely important, especially around  
11 this topic area, and in the last two years of OPHCs  
12 existence, along with the several city agencies that  
13 we work with, we identified this as being an issue  
14 that we need to be able to work towards educating the  
15 public about what a hate crime is, what bias  
16 incidents are, who to call, what services are  
17 available in terms of victim services, and what New  
18 Yorkers can do. And I'm proud to say that our  
19 interagency coordination which involves the NYPD and  
20 the District Attorney's Offices has resulted in over  
21 150 events, town halls, community forums, virtually  
22 during the time of COVID and also in-person. And  
23 we've also gone directly to senior centers, health  
24 clinics, food pantries to be able to disseminate  
25 information on those networks to be able to get folks  
to know what's going on about hate crimes. And so I'd

1 say that with those-- that 150 different events as  
2 well as these different networks disseminate  
3 information that's coming from our interagency  
4 coordination, we've done it in multiple languages.  
5 We've been culturally competent in our approach as  
6 well, too. You know, I'm just-- I just remember us  
7 doing a few events where we had simultaneous  
8 translation, just like in the United Nations, we have  
9 the entire set-up there, because we are really  
10 serving an immensely diverse city, and we know that  
11 it's important for us to be able to make it as  
12 accessible as possible. We've also used-- you know,  
13 to reach vulnerable populations, we've met  
14 communities where they're at. We know that some  
15 messaging apps that particularly are used by certain  
16 communities like Kakow [sp?] talk which is used by  
17 the Korean community, or WhatsApp which is used by  
18 the South Asian community, or We Chat. We've also  
19 worked to really put information out in those areas  
20 to be able to get folks to know that events are  
21 happening, what's happened, and also what a hate  
22 crime and a bias incident is. And so those are some  
23 of things that we continue to do so. We just had an  
24 event last week with the Filipino community, a town  
25

1 hall that focused on hate crimes after some concerns  
2 that were brought to our attention, and we also spoke  
3 in a synagogue at the Upper West Side as well, too.  
4 And that is something that we continue to do so as  
5 our interagency coordinating committee works together  
6 to be able to ensure that we have every city agency  
7 there that can answer that question, and also folks  
8 that are in those spaces, from those communities have  
9 direct access to government to ask further clarifying  
10 information as well.  
11

12 DIRECTOR LOGAN: And so Council, just so  
13 we're clear, we are open to working with the Council  
14 and if there are constituencies that you think we  
15 haven't reached yet--

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [interposing] Right.

17 DIRECTOR LOGAN: let us know, because we  
18 are committed to making sure that that information is  
19 disseminated far and wide across the City.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah, and we want to  
21 definitely want to also drill down and get NYPD to  
22 get back to us on the demographics. So we are  
23 talking to the people how need to be taking to, to  
24 really start the prevention conversation happening. I  
25 am so excited. My colleague, Chair Williams, is on,

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

49

3 the incredible Natasha Williams, and I will pass it  
4 over to her, and thank you so much for your answering  
5 my questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you so much,  
7 Chair Hanks. I'm actually going to quickly hand it  
8 over to Council Member Cabán. Just quickly, we had  
9 asked, you know, the different caucuses who are  
10 members of certain demographics that have been  
11 historically discriminated against or targets of hate  
12 crime to provide one minute quick open statement.  
13 And so Council Member Cabán will do her statement,  
14 and then I know she's already in the que for her  
15 questions, because I recognize that other members  
16 have been in the que for questions. So, to Council  
17 Member Cabán who is also co-chair of the LGBTQIA  
18 caucus here in the Council.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you, Chair  
20 Williams. Thank you Chair Hanks for the opportunity  
21 and for holding this hearing, and I know that we will  
22 be hearing from my Co-Chair Crystal Hudson a little  
23 bit later. But I want to say that I'm proud to be  
24 here in my capacity as Co-Chair of the LGBTQIA+  
25 caucus. You know, the amount of hate violence that  
LGBTQ+ folks have endured year after year has made

1  
2 one thing perfectly clear to us. in order to prevent  
3 hate violence, in order to prevent-- in order to find  
4 the courage to be an up-stander [sic], in order to  
5 learn self-defense, in order to respond after an  
6 incident of hate violence when it does occur in a way  
7 that centers the material and emotional need of the  
8 survivor. The most important element is a trust  
9 relationship. And how can you develop partnerships  
10 for safety with someone you can't trust? How can you  
11 be vulnerable enough to open up about your fears with  
12 someone you can't trust? How can you turn for  
13 comfort and support in a moment of crisis to someone  
14 you can't trust? You can't. Creating safety  
15 requires cultivating the trust relationship. That's  
16 why we desperately need to invest in a non-police  
17 approach to hate violence prevention and survivor  
18 support. the experience of LGBTQIA+ folks, especially  
19 trans folks, shows why as clearly as can be the same  
20 group targeted for hate violence is also targeted for  
21 over-policing for among other things sex work, for  
22 example. And of course, that makes the trust  
23 relationship impossible to cultivate. That's what  
24 makes hearings like this so necessary. So thank you  
25 for giving me the time to say that.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

51

3 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: You're welcome and  
4 we look forward to your questions. And so I'll just  
5 be very brief with my opening statement. And again,  
6 just wanted to express my immense gratitude to Chair  
7 Hanks for always being so flexible and an awesome  
8 partner. So, good afternoon. My name is Natasha  
9 Williams, Chair of the Civil and Human Rights  
10 Committee. I want to thank you all for your  
11 flexibility and joining this virtual hearing today  
12 with the Committee on Public Safety on citywide  
13 response to hate crimes and discrimination. Before  
14 begin, I would like to acknowledge my colleagues. I  
15 think [inaudible] Joseph, Council Member Joseph was  
16 on, and I know others have been already acknowledged,  
17 and I'm sure others will pop in from time to time.  
18 Today is a very busy day. We all know New York City  
19 is one of the most diverse places in the world, and  
20 we pride ourselves on celebrating our diversity and  
21 pursuing an inclusive agenda. This month was a  
22 rarity in the Holy calendars that took place  
23 approximately every 30 years where Christians, Jewish  
24 folks, folks who are Muslim all were sort of united  
25 in this wonderful month, the Holy Month. It's been  
such a holy month. But we know that it is our unity

1 that really keeps us together. and so unfortunately,  
2 in the past few years, we have seen more reports of  
3 bias-based incidents and hate crimes in so many of  
4 our diverse communities, whether it's the black  
5 community, Asian community, Muslim community, Jewish  
6 community, our LGBTQIA New Yorkers who make such a  
7 sizable percentage of the victims. As our country  
8 continues to reckon with its past and grapple with  
9 the devastating impact of the pandemic, we have seen  
10 such an uptick in hate crimes and discrimination. In  
11 2020 alone, the NYPD reported a 360 percent increase  
12 in hate crimes, which is alarming, almost half of  
13 which were motivated by race and COVID-related  
14 stigmas. While we know CCHR has a bias response team  
15 as well as COVID-19 response team, it is important to  
16 find out more about the affirmative steps CCHR, OPHC,  
17 and NYPD are taking to prevent additional hate crimes  
18 and bias incidents in New York City. During our  
19 hearing today you've heard already testimony from  
20 MOCJ and the NYPD. We continue to look forward to  
21 learning what measures these agencies are engaging in  
22 for the affected communities. We'll hear from CCHR in  
23 just a bit, and we really want to work with them to  
24 restore a feeling of safety and security to their  
25

1 neighborhoods-- to our neighborhoods. And we look  
2 forward to hearing the additional testimonies from  
3 members of the affected communities as well as  
4 advocates and other stakeholders, to hear their  
5 recommendations on how we can tackle this increase in  
6 discrimination in hate crime. I'd like to thank my  
7 staff for putting this hearing together, Jaythree  
8 [sp?], Liam, Jack, and of course my office staff,  
9 Everton [sp?] and Ashley. And with that, I'll just  
10 quickly hop into my questions which are very brief  
11 because Chair Hanks asked most of the same. And if  
12 I'm asking a question that was already answered,  
13 don't be shy. I will not be offended. Please say  
14 that's already asked and answered. So the question I  
15 have, whether it's NYPD or OPHC, is there anything  
16 that you can share with us in terms of what you  
17 believe accounts for the recent trend of the  
18 increasing occurrence of bias-based incidents?

20 MICHAEL CLARKE: I mean, I think there's  
21 a lot of factors, right? I mean, it's hard to say,  
22 you know,-- one thing we learned with the-- this  
23 sharp rise in anti-Asian violence, you know, you can  
24 very much pinpoint the reason that happened, and that  
25 is widespread, you know, blame with on-- based on

1 COVID. There are things that happened in the media  
2 that can sort of spike hate crimes, or in the news,  
3 again, certain individuals. So I think that's part--  
4 I think part of it is-- there's a lot of work by a  
5 lot of people to increase awareness of hate crimes.  
6 So we might see more reporting of hate crimes that  
7 may not have happened in the past, but it's a variety  
8 of factors that can always contribute to it.

9  
10 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Deanna, I saw you  
11 had taken yourself off mute.

12 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Yeah. You know, we look  
13 at trends and data to see where we're seeing these  
14 bias incidents. The underpinnings of what actually  
15 causes this uptick is something that I don't know  
16 that we can have a-- that we've been able to pinpoint  
17 one direct correlation. What we do know is that even  
18 as much as we're seeing these bias incidents  
19 reported, that may more of the incidents go not  
20 reported. And so we are striving to make sure that  
21 we continue to deploy education, resources, build  
22 bonds across communities that are diverse so that  
23 neighbors have empathy and patience in a time where  
24 we know that COVID has exacerbated people's ability  
25 to be compassionate in empathetic.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

55

3 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. The  
4 next question I have is, when arrests are not made  
5 following reported hate or bias-based incidents, what  
6 are the NYPD protocols for notifying and/or  
7 communicating complaint status with members of the  
8 public and impacted communities?

9 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Thank you very  
10 much, Chair. By virtue of the crime not being closed  
11 to arrest, our detectives should have developed a  
12 relationship enough with the complainant or victim to  
13 let them know that their case is closed. It  
14 certainly, having taken over Hate Crime Taskforce on  
15 February 21<sup>st</sup>, something that is aspirational, that  
16 every victim be spoken to by our detectives at the  
17 close of the case successfully to arrest or in the  
18 worst case scenario, where all leads were exhausted.  
19 But it's something we need to improve upon as a Hate  
20 Crime Taskforce and something that I aspire to  
21 improve during my tenure with the unit.

22 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Right. Because we  
23 do have the New York City Commission on Human Rights  
24 on the call, and we also have been hearing a lot from  
25 the Mayor's Office of-- for Prevention of Hate  
Crimes, and so just wondering if there is any other

1 services or support or referrals that are given to  
2 folks, individuals who have been victims. So outside  
3 of detectives, you know, maybe not closing out the  
4 case, are officers also providing referrals and  
5 resources to other spaces that they could  
6 potentially, you know, get some type of either  
7 personal support for themselves or just support in  
8 terms of addressing and getting justice for whatever  
9 issue that they were impacted by?  
10

11 MICHAEL CLARKE: So, one thing I will say  
12 we have in every precinct, crime victim assistance  
13 advocates, and they, you know, should be reaching out  
14 to people who are victims of crimes to, you know,  
15 talk to about services that may be available in their  
16 community. Certainly, that's something that officers  
17 could also do, but, you know, we do have that role in  
18 every precinct, so every person can avail themselves  
19 to that. And you know, a lot of precincts have great  
20 relationships with the programs in their  
21 neighborhoods. So, you know, when they-- that  
22 [inaudible] policy at the Department, I think the  
23 CVAP program is really where it's supposed to happen,  
24 but they can talk about, you know, these people in  
25 the community can help. But the CVAP is really

1 designed to help the victims find the places they  
2 can--

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: [interposing] And  
5 it's called-- I'm sorry, can you say the program  
6 again, C--

7 MICHAEL CLARKE: CVAP, its Crime Victim  
8 Assistance Program, and it's a contract we have with  
9 Safe Horizons.

10 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Yeah, I wish they  
11 provided [inaudible] because I actually have a heard  
12 a lot of different complaints about Safe Horizons and  
13 sort of the coordination between Safe Horizons and  
14 the Police Department and what Safe Horizon actually  
15 can offer folks. So I would love to-- maybe we can  
16 have a conversation with them, or they can also join  
17 at another hearing. Because sort of to the point  
18 that you were mentioning, is we wanting to understand  
19 if precincts communicate with local communities or  
20 faith-based organizations following hate-based  
21 incidents. So, is Safe Horizon, you know,  
22 coordinating with the mosque [inaudible] or a temple  
23 if there was a hate-based incident that might have  
24 occurred in a particular community.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

58

3 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So, Chair Williams, I

4 think on the actual outreach after incidents,  
5 individual victims, the CVAP program, that Crime  
6 Victims Assistance Program, will reach out directly  
7 to individuals for crimes that are reported, right?  
8 The one thing that we do know is that some crimes go  
9 unreported, and sometimes people have been victims of  
10 hate crimes will-- it will be known, but they will  
11 not necessarily want to, as Chair Member Cabán said,  
12 want to go forward with the formal government  
13 process, and what OPHC has done in those incidents is  
14 to make sure that they are doing the warm community  
15 bridging with organizations that are in the victim's  
16 area, locality, that speak to individuals that the  
17 person who has been the person most hurt by this  
18 particular bias incident to give those types of  
19 support. so, for example, when we saw that horrific  
20 crimes against the Sikh community our Deputy  
21 Executive Director was out in community and going to  
22 the mosque and doing that type of work. And I'll let  
23 him expand on that warm community touch that OPHC is  
24 a bridge too for those incidents.

25 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: And as you go into  
describing that warm touch, also if you could just

1 kind of comprehensively really explain the roles that  
2 is served and kind of share with us the different  
3 types of people you have working in OPHC. What type  
4 of functions are they serving on a given basis around  
5 hate crimes and prevention of hate crimes?  
6

7 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: Thank  
8 you so much, Chair Williams, and thank you Deanna.  
9 Just to first answer this question, I think we just  
10 need to recognize that whatever approach we do in  
11 engaging with a survivor or a victim is centered  
12 around what they feel comfortable with and what they  
13 want to. It's a very victim-centered approach. And  
14 so in these situations where we learn of the victim  
15 of a hate crime, and they are willing and they're  
16 wanting to engage with OPHC, and we learn this either  
17 from PD or we learn this from a community  
18 organizations. We work our best to be able to curate  
19 services for that individuals that best meet their  
20 needs, and those are things that obviously pertain to  
21 language accessibility, cultural competency. And so  
22 one aspect of OPHC as we've mentioned earlier is our  
23 community relations [inaudible] right? In which we  
24 have 80 organizations or 80+ organizations that  
25 provide education, outreach, and also services to

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

60

1 hate crime victims and they represent the immense  
2 diversity of this city. So if we come to learn about  
3 an individual who wants additional assistance from an  
4 organization that serves their community, we have the  
5 ability because we have that relationship with these  
6 organizations already to make that connection  
7 directly, right? Whether that's someone who has--  
8 was working through the criminal justice system to be  
9 able to reach to get those services, or they reach  
10 out directly to us, or they go through a community  
11 organization, or an institution itself has like a-- a  
12 religious institution has reached out itself. And  
13 the example that Ms. Logan provided in what happened  
14 in Queens in Richmond Hill in which we saw Sikh men  
15 who were attacked. I think it was two incidents in  
16 one day, overall. Us going directly to the-- go the  
17 [inaudible] the temple there was an extremely  
18 important way for us to engage directly with the  
19 victims as well and say listen. And they were more  
20 than happy to be able to have us there. What  
21 services can I turn to? Following up on how their  
22 CVAP stuff is going, following up on how we can  
23 provide additional compensation and resources and  
24 services. And we do this whenever we learn and we do  
25

1  
2 it and we try our best to be able to provide that  
3 sort of direct engagement on those members.

4 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you.

5 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: And if I may,  
6 just quickly--

7 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: [interposing] Of  
8 course.

9 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: jump in, ma'am,  
10 in regard to the Sikh incidents. Investigative, one  
11 of the things that we did early on was start  
12 communicating with [inaudible] Sing [sp?] at the Sikh  
13 Coalition to bridge any gaps and to keep her and her  
14 community advised of the investigative progress that  
15 we're making, to let and relay both directly to the  
16 victim and his loved ones, his son particularly, in  
17 the one incident, the victims themselves in the  
18 second incident. The work-- but also let Nikki Singh  
19 [sp?] let the community know on a macro level the  
20 work that was going in, and I think we were on the  
21 phone two, three, four times a day from the first  
22 incident to-- through the arrest process, to the  
23 arraignment process so that she would be able to  
24 relay accurate, precise facts to bring an heir of  
25

1  
2 comfortability to the community that was so  
3 devastated by such violence.

4           CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Absolutely, and  
5 thank you so much for that. I also just want to  
6 acknowledge that we have been joined-- I don't think  
7 they have been acknowledged-- by Council Members  
8 Holden, Salamanca, Stevens, and also Council Member  
9 Dinowitz, and Hudson, and Council Member Dinowitz and  
10 Hudson I know also have prepared one-minute remarks,  
11 and we will get to them shortly. The only other two  
12 questions I have, which really are for the Mayor's  
13 Office for Prevention of Hate Crimes, and then we can  
14 go to a few Council Member questions. I know folks  
15 have been waiting for some time. Are there  
16 recognized best practices for holistically addressing  
17 hate-based incidents, and what entities are working  
18 on developing these practices? So I don't know if  
19 there's consulting organizations or nonprofits that  
20 have some best practices, and just wondering if the  
21 City is incorporating any of those practices. No,  
22 okay. So the city--

23           DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED:

24 [interposing] No, I mean, I can answer that--  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

63

3 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: [interposing]

4 [inaudible] preferences, oh, okay.

5 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: Yeah,

6 I was waiting to see. I can go and answer that.

7 Thank you so much, Chair Williams. Yes, in many ways

8 the Office in the way that it's been developed is

9 really in itself advancing its mandate through those

10 three pillars we had provided earlier, which really

11 pertained to addressing those best practices within

12 hate crimes. And that's one, really working towards

13 community relations, and then two, it's education,

14 and three, it's laws and law enforcement. Those

15 three pillars are something that are consistent with

16 best practices as mentioned by the US Department of

17 Justice and other sorts of areas across the country.

18 and so we've moved-- we moved forward with those, and

19 each of those pillars have programmatic reach, and

20 also we look towards trying to make sure that we are

21 working in making anything that we do, of course,

22 accessible to the immense diversity of our city.

23 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. And

24 are you aware if whether or not the DOE has

25 implemented anti-hate curriculum as developed

according to the OPHC 2020 Annual Report?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

64

3 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: I am  
4 not aware of that.

5 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Okay. Well, if  
6 you could--

7 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED:  
8 [interposing] But I will add, though, that we work  
9 constantly with DOE on a variety of other educational  
10 curriculum. And an example I gave earlier, for  
11 example, as we saw an increase of anti-Asian  
12 incidents that were occurring in the City, we knew  
13 that many of the students in the classes, whether they  
14 were in elementary school, middle school or high  
15 school had expressed concerns about what was going on  
16 and what was happening. And in those sorts of  
17 instances we work with DOE to produce resource  
18 information, and we also provided training for  
19 educators and being able to facilitate those  
20 conversations in class and also turn those folks--  
21 turn students towards resources that are available.  
22 All that information obviously involved immense  
23 collaboration with our community organizations that  
24 are there. We've also done this in the context of  
25 hate symbols as it relates to the swastika and as  
well as nooses and other instances that we see as-

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

65

3 needed through the course of what's happening. And  
4 DOE's been an excellent partner with that.

5 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Awesome. Okay, I  
6 think that is all the questions that I have, but I  
7 will turn it over to the Committee Counsel to explain  
8 the next steps because we do have a lot of  
9 maneuvering to do, and I'm actually wondering maybe  
10 Council Member Dinowitz, if you can take 30 seconds  
11 for your opening, and Council Member Hudson for a  
12 one-minute before we go, which what I believe would  
13 be back to CCHR for the sake of time, but NYPD, MOCJ,  
14 and OPHC should stay on for further questions from  
15 Council Members. So, Council Member Dinowitz, can  
16 you do a very quick opening?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I'll do my  
18 best. I'll try to quickly. Thank you, Council  
19 Member, Chair. I want to thank you for bringing up  
20 the Education piece, because we talk a lot about hate  
21 crimes, but no one starts out their hate crimes by  
22 punching Jews, for instance, in the back of the head.  
23 It starts out much earlier in their lives. And it  
24 is-- one of the things that I think about is  
25 holocaust education. So, it is encouraging to hear  
that there's anti-hate training. I don't know about

1 the holocaust education in our school system. I  
2 think it's probably not that good. having worked in  
3 the schools for 14 years, and having had students put  
4 no knowledge of the holocaust and cannot identify a  
5 swastika, which may mean-- which may be one of the  
6 reasons why in one survey almost 20 percent of people  
7 who the Jews caused the holocaust. I'm encouraged to  
8 hear that there are resources available for educators  
9 and teachers given that anti-Semitism is the number  
10 one hate crime here in New York City. Though  
11 without-- if it's not coupled with training, anti-  
12 implicit bias training especially, it'll go nowhere.  
13 And I, myself, have experienced this implicit and  
14 explicit bias as a Jewish teacher here in New York  
15 City with administrators being upset that I am taking  
16 so many days off for Jewish holidays. A friend of  
17 mine who took some days off for some Jewish holidays,  
18 administrator was furious, so he stopped sharing who  
19 he was a Jewish teacher. A few years later he  
20 decided to share his heritage with his students. The  
21 administrator made a comment which was-- said,  
22 "you've come out of the Jewish closet," and then he  
23 corrected himself to say, "Or should I say Jewish  
24 attic." And for those of you that don't know, this  
25

1 is of course a reference to Jews who hid in attics  
2 during the holocaust to avoid a genocide. I can go  
3 on for many, many minutes with more horrifying  
4 stories of the biases that occur here in our city in  
5 our public spaces. Suffice to say that when our  
6 people in public spaces are making it okay to be  
7 anti-Semitic, it then makes it okay to commit hate  
8 crimes. So there's inextricably linked. I-- we need  
9 to highlight that. We need to talk about that.  
10 You'll be sure to hear a lot more from me about it,  
11 but certainly not at this hearing. Thank you, Chair,  
12 for the time.

14 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. And  
15 just again, everybody, we had invited the co-chairs  
16 and chairs of certain caucuses who are members of  
17 those communities. So I just wanted to like flag  
18 that. There's no favoritism here. Everything was  
19 crazy. Everyone had intended to join at the exact  
20 time, but we had the emergency press conference. So I  
21 just wanted to thank you as Chair of the Jewish  
22 Caucus for coming on today to provide those very  
23 important remarks. And with that, I will turn it  
24 over to Committee Counsel to swear in CCHR, and NYPD,  
25 MOCJ, OPHC, again, please stay on because I know my

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

68

3 colleagues have questions for you. And so after CCHR  
4 testifies we will go to questions from my colleagues.  
5 Thank you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Thank  
7 you, Chair Williams. So, CCHR you can testify. I  
8 already swore you in earlier, so you're good to go.  
9 Council Members, after CCHR testifies, you'll be able  
10 to ask questions to any of the agencies that are  
11 present, and for Council Member questions, we're  
12 going to start with Council Member Bottcher, Minority  
13 Whip Vernikov, followed by Council Member Holden.  
14 So, CCHR, you can provide your oral testimony, and  
15 we'll go from there. Thank you.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: You're just on mute.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: Sorry about  
18 that. Okay. Sorry. Thank you. Good morning, Chair  
19 Hanks, Chair Williams and members of the City  
20 Council. I'm Sapna Raj, the Deputy Commissioner of  
21 Law Enforcement at the New York City Commission on  
22 Human Rights. The Commission on Human Rights is  
23 tasked with addressing and investigating violations  
24 of the New York City Human Rights Law, which is a  
25 civil, not a criminal law. The agency's bias  
response team meets the needs of communities and

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

69

1 victims who experience bias and discrimination, and  
2 works to contact victims to inform them of their  
3 rights and provide guidance on possible responses.  
4 Today's testimony offers a brief description of the  
5 complementary work of the Commission's Community  
6 Relations Bureau and the Law Enforcement Bureau. The  
7 Commission's Community Relations Bureau fosters  
8 inter-group relations, one of the core founding  
9 mandates of the agency. It works daily to prevent  
10 bias and discrimination, and to offer a rapid  
11 response whenever any acts of bias occur in New York  
12 City. In Fiscal Year 22, the Commission revamped its  
13 approach to Bias Response from a reactive approach,  
14 that is responding to incidents after they occur, to  
15 a more holistic approach which focuses on prevention,  
16 solidarity, and community building. This is  
17 complementary to our ongoing business corridor  
18 outreach, which includes materials on the hate  
19 impacting AAPI communities, as part of the Commission  
20 on Human Rights' "I Still Believe in Our City  
21 campaign." The Human Rights Commission adopted new  
22 tools of engagement like the multi-lingual Bystander  
23 Intervention Trainings and Restorative Justice  
24 Circles, and the Commission also engaged in  
25

1  
2 conversations and events to emphasize preventive work  
3 in communities. The Commission also continued to do  
4 significant outreach to build trust in communities so  
5 that it could be more effective in responding to  
6 potential harms. In Fiscal Year 21, the Community  
7 Relations Bureau worked together with community-based  
8 organizations to host nearly 50 bystander  
9 intervention trainings in English, Mandarin, Korean,  
10 and Cantonese, empowering New Yorkers with the tools  
11 to be up-standers against bias and violence. During  
12 the same fiscal year, the Commission organized in-  
13 language Town Halls with other partners such as the  
14 Mayor's Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes and  
15 the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, NYPD, and  
16 the DA offices. These events helped demystify the  
17 process of reporting bias incidents and hate crimes  
18 and improved the trust between communities and  
19 government. Of course, the most well-known  
20 protections within the City Human Rights Law are the  
21 prohibitions on discrimination in employment,  
22 housing, and public accommodations. The Human Rights  
23 Law also has protections against discriminatory  
24 harassment. The discriminatory harassment provision  
25 creates a civil cause of action for any individual

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

71

1 who is threatened or injured because of the  
2 individual's protected status. Claims under this  
3 provision do not require that a specific relationship  
4 such as worker/employer, tenant/landlord, or  
5 customer/business owner be established. As a result,  
6 individuals that face bias-motivated violence and  
7 harassment have the option of bringing civil claims  
8 to the Commission, in addition to reporting to the  
9 police, to assert their rights and obtain remedies.  
10 Thank you for this opportunity to discuss the ways  
11 the Commission, and its partners are working to  
12 prevent and respond to bias and hate in New York  
13 City. We look forward to continuing to work-- to  
14 continue this work in collaboration with NYPD, MOCJ,  
15 and the Council. Thanks.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much.

18 We'll now turn to Council Member questions. For  
19 Council Member questions, please use the Zoom raise  
20 hand function. The order so far is Council Member  
21 Bottcher, followed by Minority Whip Vernikov,  
22 followed by Council Member Holden, and then Council  
23 Member Cabán. Council Member Bottcher, you may go  
24 ahead.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

72

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Hello. My  
4 question is for Deputy Inspector Arias. How are you  
5 Deputy Inspector? Deputy Inspector Arias? Sorry, he  
6 stepped away.

7 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: I apologize.  
8 Can you hear me?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Yes, no problem  
10 at all. Deputy Inspector--

11 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: [interposing]  
12 Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: when an officer  
14 responds to a crime, it is incumbent on that officer  
15 to report to a patrol supervisor when there's any  
16 possible bias element to that crime. in my work with  
17 the Hate Crimes Taskforce and at the-- going back 13  
18 years, to when I was the LGBT Liaison at the City  
19 Council's Community Outreach Unit, what I found then  
20 and what we hear about now are instances in which  
21 police officers do not report to the patrol  
22 supervisor a bias element or do not mark that in the  
23 report. So, they'll fill out a police report unsolved  
24 [sic] but failed to put in there that there was a  
25 bias element to it. Do you have any-- to what extent  
do you know how frequently that happens? What

1 training do officers get in the Academy and post-  
2 Academy, and what are the consequences for officers  
3 that do not report bias-based incidents?  
4

5 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Council Member,  
6 thank you for bringing this matter to the table  
7 today. Number one, as a Hate Crimes Taskforce we  
8 want to know. We want to know about possible bias  
9 incidents because it's our mandate to invest  
10 [inaudible], and it's our passion as investigators to  
11 want to bring successful closure to victims, and  
12 there are anecdotally a myriad of incidents where we  
13 may not hear, because of the layers from the  
14 responding officer all the way up to Duty Captain  
15 where certain cases may never make it to us. That  
16 being said, there are other avenues where we are  
17 receiving cases from our partners at the DA's  
18 offices, from our partners at OPC and MOCJ, from  
19 elected officials, from non-governmental  
20 organizations and nonprofits who are able to hear the  
21 voices often when there's a stop-gap measure that was  
22 not met on the NYPD's side. That being said, we have  
23 a program with training, that since my tenure I've  
24 looked to make more robust where officers are trained  
25 in the Patrol Guide procedure that exists already in

1 the police Academy. And then, Sergeants are trained  
2 when they're getting promoted to Sergeant.  
3 Lieutenants are reminded of that training and they're  
4 getting promoted to Lieutenant, and Captains are  
5 clearly trained by a captain who's my Executive  
6 Officer on the procedures of deeming something  
7 possibly biased. That being said, we can always do  
8 better, sir, and we can always aspire for 100 percent  
9 compliance in this area as something we're looking to  
10 improve, but the message I would like as a message to  
11 take away is that we as a Hate Crime Taskforce want  
12 to know and we want to investigate, and we want to  
13 hear the voices of those who believe they've been  
14 victims.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: What extent are  
17 outside organizations, community-based organizations  
18 brought in to assist with the training, the lead  
19 trainings?

20 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Sir, I'm very  
21 sorry, there was a siren in the background and I  
22 could not hear.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: We're on 30<sup>th</sup>  
24 Street in Midtown. To what extent are community-  
25 based organizations involved in the training that

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

75

3 officers receive regarding hate crimes both at the  
4 Academy and after the academy?

5 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Sir, not enough.  
6 I am dialogue with the Asian American Bar Association  
7 of New York, the Asian American Federation, partners  
8 at JCRC and the Community Security Initiative at the  
9 ABL where I want to aspiration ally utilize their  
10 voices to augment our efforts, and it's something  
11 that I have to in my short tenure improve upon and  
12 ensure that you're listening. That is the-- the  
13 question you asked is the question that is widely  
14 asked at various meetings that I attend and at the  
15 stakeholder conversations that I have, because I  
16 believe we can augment our training with victims,  
17 victims' advocates, nonprofits and community  
18 stakeholders to build strength and improve our  
19 ability to investigate as detective [inaudible].

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you  
22 [inaudible] and I look forward to hearing more about  
23 those ongoing efforts.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council  
25 Member. Next we'll hear from Minority Whip Vernikov  
followed by Council Member Holden.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

76

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Good afternoon.

5 First of all, I want to thank everyone for testifying  
6 today as well as-- especially my colleagues Chair  
7 Hanks and Chair Williams for putting this hearing  
8 together. I represent a large number of Asian  
9 Americans and Jewish Americans that are victims, some  
10 of them are victims, and [inaudible] impacted by the  
11 anti-Asian and anti-Semitic crimes that are plaguing  
12 our city. So I really thank you for doing all this.  
13 I also would like to congratulate Inspector Arias on  
14 his new role. I think all New Yorkers [inaudible]  
15 for success and I want to wish you luck, and I also  
16 would like to thank the NYPD for what they  
17 [inaudible] hate crimes and all crimes and just  
18 keeping New Yorker safe. And just in response to  
19 some of the remarks earlier today, I just want to say  
20 that we do need members of our law enrollment, our  
21 men and women in uniform to fight crime. With that  
22 being said, my first question is for the NYPD. My  
23 question is, how often is the NYPD [inaudible] hate  
24 crimes or discrimination occurs on college campuses?

25 MICHAEL CLARKE: Sorry, I apologize. Can  
you repeat the question? It cut out a little bit.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

77

3 [inaudible] can you repeat the question real quick?

4 We just-- it cut out as you were doing it.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Sure. How  
6 often is the NYPD referred cases about hate crimes  
7 and discrimination that occurs on college campuses?

8 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: That's not a  
9 metric that we track, and I don't know what the  
10 referral would be, the methodology that you're asking  
11 about, Council Member. I don't know if you mean from  
12 the public safety Department at a college or  
13 university or through a student advocacy group  
14 themselves. So I can't comment with substantive data  
15 [inaudible].

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Well, I guess  
17 more generally, is the NYPD referred cases or is the  
18 NYPD told about hate crimes and discrimination on  
19 college campuses?

20 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: We receive  
21 complaint reports through various mechanisms, and  
22 reporters and witnesses and complainants alike, and  
23 those generate complaint reports that eventually make  
24 their way to us, but whether it's specifically from  
25 an institution I cannot comment, because it's not a  
data metric that we would track.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Okay. I  
3 understand. My next question is somewhat related to  
4 a question that was earlier asked by my colleague  
5 Kamillah Hanks, Chair Hanks. We have a lot of  
6 instances on college campuses where SJP, the  
7 [inaudible] group called SJP, Students Justice for  
8 Palestine, calls for an anti-fadah [sp?], makes calls  
9 for to get Zionists [sic] out of CUNY, and anti-  
10 fadah, as I understand it is a violence uprising, to  
11 call for a violent uprising, and it has led to  
12 violence whether it's on CUNY campus or outside of  
13 CUNY campus. So I know that [inaudible] free speech  
14 and what is actually a crime. So, my question is at  
15 what point does such calls actually call for an  
16 arrest?

17 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Well, a complaint  
18 has to be generated in such a way that it met the  
19 threshold of a hate crime itself. Obviously, meeting  
20 that threshold with the defendant having committed a  
21 predicate offense and then meeting the additional  
22 criteria. There is a fine balance between free speech  
23 and the crime, and we have to maintain the freedom of  
24 groups that make political statements, and we take  
25 each case individually on its merits, and we look to-

1  
2 - if the complaint report is generated, work with our  
3 partners prosecutorially [sic] and our lawyers here  
4 at NYPD to ensure the right to free speech, in  
5 addition to the rights of victims who are affected by  
6 hurtful and hateful vitriolic language.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: so is the short  
8 answer it's case by case basis?

9 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Yes. Okay,  
10 thank you. And my next question is for HR. What is  
11 the process-- and I apologize if this was answered  
12 before. But what is the process by which an act of  
13 hate or discrimination reported-- is reported?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: Was it for  
15 CCHR? I'm sorry.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Yes.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: So, our process  
18 for reporting a hate crime is no different than  
19 reporting any other discrimination that someone would  
20 suffer in New York City. You can come to our  
21 offices. You can call us, you know, and our  
22 [inaudible] line which is our intake line, answer and  
23 assess the facts. You can-- we have a web form so  
24 people can fill that out online. They can call 311  
25 and 311 can direct them to us. Sometimes we get, you

1 know, calls from elected officials or other  
2 community-based organizations. So we get complaints  
3 sent to us in many different ways, and that's the  
4 same for hate crime. Wouldn't be a civil hate crime,  
5 discriminatory harassment.  
6

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Okay, and once  
8 that is [inaudible] to you guys what process, what do  
9 you do next?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: So, once it's  
11 reported, we do an intake, an initial intake. If  
12 there is jurisdiction, it is assigned to an attorney  
13 who does a detailed intake. There's an investigation  
14 where you would investigate whether, you know, you  
15 would investigate both sides. We don't represent on  
16 all the other sides [inaudible] investigators. Once  
17 the investigation is over, if we think that there is  
18 probable cause, then a probable cause finding is  
19 issued, and it will then go to trial before the  
20 Office of Administrative Services [sic], and then a  
21 decision is rendered by that Administrative Law  
22 Judge, comes back to our commissioner for a decision  
23 and order.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you. I  
25 don't have any more questions.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much,  
4 Council Member. Next, we'll hear from Council Member  
5 Holden followed by Council Members Cabán, Stevens,  
6 Dinowitz, and Richardson-Jordan. Council Member  
7 Holden?

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you,  
10 Chairs, for this important hearing. This question  
11 can go to either MOCJ or NYPD. Can you tell me the  
12 percentage of individuals who are arrested for hate  
13 crimes that also have been identified they have a  
14 mental health issue? Because some of the videos that  
15 we're seeing, when you just randomly select a person  
16 and just punched them in the face, that seems to  
17 point to a mental health issue, when you randomly  
18 take people and just, you know, attack them. So, do  
19 we have that number?

20 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: I do.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay.

22 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: This year, out  
23 of our 100 arrests that we've made--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]  
25 Right.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

82

3 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: 47 have prior  
4 documentation of an EDP incident for lack of a better  
5 description, meaning that they were in our system as  
6 an aided [sic] for prior emotional disturbed person  
7 job.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: so, if there are--  
9 - if they're arrested and they keep getting re-  
10 arrested, what are-- what measures are we talking to  
11 really give them specialized treatment? I mean, are  
12 we-- are they given any help on an outpatient,  
13 inpatient? What happens to them? Because obviously  
14 we read many cases where they're-- people are re-  
15 arrested for the same-- they just keep attacking  
16 people. What's happening now, let's say?

17 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Well, the arrest  
18 to arraignment procedure would be that we're  
19 conducting our investigation. Somebody's placed  
20 under arrest, and clearly they're arraigned on the  
21 charge that they were arrested for. From that  
22 arraignment it goes to our prosecutorial partners who  
23 work, obviously with CJA and Defense Counsel to try  
24 to come up with the solution from that arraignment  
25 proceeding to best deal with the person. We do not  
see-- this year we see six repeat offenders of hate

1 crimes, out of that 100 that we've discussed, but we  
2 as part of our crime analysis, if you will, we are  
3 doing crisis outreach response notifications, check  
4 our crisis outreach support unit. That being said,  
5 you know, I think we have to improve in our  
6 partnering with mental health professionals to ensure  
7 that there's a holistic treatment for people that may  
8 not necessarily be, you know,-- that may have mental  
9 health issues.  
10

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, because  
12 we're seeing-- again, you may have said there are  
13 six, but it looks like about half of the people have  
14 mental health issues. So that's like what really  
15 have-- probably more than that. Because we know just  
16 by the burden of proof that, you know -- I had an  
17 incident in my neighborhood where somebody pulled up  
18 in a car, gave a racial slur to a woman, threw liquid  
19 on her and then was following her. She refused--  
20 subsequent to that, she refused to talk to the police  
21 officers or detectives, and then the case-- it didn't  
22 happen. So there was no bias incident, but there was,  
23 and obviously we know, but it's talking to a  
24 detective that sometimes scares people off. So  
25 that's why I think we need maybe a more holistic

1 approach to this rather-- you know, some people just  
2 will-- like Council Member earlier, Cabán, mentioned  
3 that some people won't talk to a detective. So  
4 that's where we need maybe a little bit more of just  
5 reporting it and just getting the-- where we can get  
6 somebody from a not-for-profit to just interview the  
7 person first. That might be a solution. I'm not  
8 saying it is. Also, the NYPD clears, and this what  
9 you know, we read here-- NYPD clears just one in  
10 three hate crime cases including just one in five  
11 anti-Semitic incidents. So, as the City recently  
12 reported it, the City's DA's get convictions in just  
13 15 percent of the hate crimes. You know, we talked  
14 about this many time in the Council, and including  
15 just one percent in the Bronx, so I know we need  
16 really an approach where we could try to get more  
17 convictions, and then that would deter more people,  
18 and also just get to more specific mental health  
19 solutions here, and I think that's what the Mayor's  
20 trying to do. Just one last question, and this would  
21 be for the police. What police precincts are we  
22 focusing on where we're seeing more hate crimes  
23 throughout the City? Are there a few precincts that  
24 we really need to bring in more resources?  
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

MICHAEL CLARKE: Quantitatively,  
quantitatively certainly the first precinct, Midtown  
South precinct, 19<sup>th</sup> precinct, 61<sup>st</sup> precinct, 90<sup>th</sup>  
precinct, and then the 112<sup>th</sup> precinct.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Which is-- I take  
in a little in the 112, so-- you mentioned that  
they're doing resources for those precincts. Could  
you get into specifically what is being done, what  
resources are being brought in on the precinct level?

MICHAEL CLARKE: Sir, I think that I  
misinterpreted your question, because I believe you  
asked quantitatively what the precincts that would be  
requiring the most resources are, and so I answered  
with what I perceived the precincts would--

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] No,  
no, yeah, that was my question, but I'm saying now  
what are we doing to address it? What are we giving  
those precincts in the way of resources?

DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: We as a Hate  
Crimes Taskforce investigate incidents of hate, and  
we communicate with the precinct commander and our  
Community Affairs Bureau when crimes arise and we  
receive complaints that have come to us of hate

1 crimes. And then our partners both with Community  
2 Affairs and the Liaison Unit and at the precinct  
3 level continue to message and communicate with the  
4 residents and stakeholders and business owners and  
5 persons who are regularly in that precinct with the  
6 crime via their own messaging.  
7

8 MICHAEL CLARKE: I don't think-- I don't  
9 have like the precinct-- the numbers of officers in  
10 the precincts with us. We can look into getting that  
11 to you, but I don't-- I can't say exactly how many  
12 officers are in each precinct as a result of, you  
13 know, hate crimes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, but are we  
15 connecting-- so are we connecting those precincts  
16 with not-for-profits and also just some, really some  
17 groups that could help with the victims of the crimes  
18 and actually talk to the neighbors who are  
19 experiencing this, because many times, like-- and I  
20 told you one case, but many times you'll find there's  
21 a lot more cases that are not being reported. So  
22 that's why we need an approach to, you know, identify  
23 the precincts that are having the most hate crimes,  
24 and then giving them the resources to address it, and  
25 I think that's-- and education, we talked about with

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

87

1  
2 DOE, but I think that needs the approach, I think, to  
3 address and to reduce the number of hate crimes in a  
4 particular precinct. Well, thank you. Thank you,  
5 Chairs. Thanks for the extra time. Thank you  
6 everyone.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council  
8 Member Holden. I'm recognizing that we're joined by  
9 Council Member Won. Next we'll hear from Council  
10 Member Cabán, followed by Council Member Stevens,  
11 Council Member Dinowitz, and Council Member  
12 Richardson-Jordan. Council Member Cabán, if you're  
13 available?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah, thank you.  
15 Can you hear me?

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we can hear you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Awesome. Thank  
19 you. So my questions are actually for MOCJ, you  
20 know, the Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes  
21 [inaudible] impacted by hate violence, connecting  
22 them with resources and innovating new and better  
23 responses. With the increasing number of hate crimes  
24 and the need for-- and also OPHC-- and the need for  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

88

3 OPHC's work, does the hiring freeze impact OPHC, and  
4 how many staff lines does OPHC have?

5 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Hi, good afternoon and  
6 thank you for your question, CM Cabán. OPHC has a  
7 table of org for five staff members. It's currently  
8 staffed by three and we are posting to fill the two  
9 vacancies. We are approved to fill those vacancies.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.  
11 Awesome, thank you. And what's the progress on the  
12 search for [inaudible] OPHC Director? Has the  
13 Administration identified someone yet? Are there any  
14 internal candidates applying? We're three months  
15 into the Administration, and it looks like  
16 [inaudible] obviously surpassing the hate crime  
17 numbers compared to last year.

18 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Well, given that our  
19 Executive Director resigned just a few months ago, we  
20 have posted the position, and individuals have  
21 expressed interest. We are going to be filling.  
22 That is one of the two lines that is not filled, so  
23 we will be interviewing to fill that line.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And what do you  
25 anticipate the timeline being there?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

89

3 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Hopefully within the  
4 next couple of weeks we will have identified  
5 successful candidates and we will present them to the  
6 Mayor as individuals for consideration.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. And  
8 many organizations have communicated the challenges  
9 of getting City Council discretionary funding, so  
10 another question is like what's the hold-up? We know  
11 that OPHC only plays a coordinating role between the  
12 grantee and the larger procurement process and it  
13 involved other city agencies. So just curious about  
14 where the hold-up is. Is it at the mayor's Office of  
15 Contracting Services? Is it somewhere else?

16 DIRECTOR LOGAN: you're talking about  
17 discretionary funds that the Council provides to--  
18 directly to CBOs?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: The Hate Crime  
20 Prevention Initiative, specifically.

21 DIRECTOR LOGAN: so, the issue with  
22 discretionary funding is I understand from our  
23 procurement shop [sic], because not only is it the  
24 Hate Crime Initiative but many of the discretionary  
25 funds come through the Mayor's Office of Criminal  
Justice procurement. Oftentimes there is some delay

1 in it actually the funds being certified in the  
2 system. So even though Council has said this has to  
3 go to Organization A. If the funds have not been  
4 certified in the system, then the-- our procurement  
5 shop cannot actually transfer them to the  
6 organization. We have to go back and look at the  
7 specific organizations to see the status and to  
8 figure out where the actual last check is waiting.  
9 As you know, that many of the-- most of the  
10 procurement processes now done through the Passport  
11 system which has codified and essentially made sure  
12 that the rules of procurement are intertwined into  
13 the system. So a lot of times what we see is if one  
14 actor hasn't checked yes on their side, none of the  
15 other steps can happen until that works, because it  
16 is a way that the system holds everybody accountable  
17 by making sure each step in the process is completed.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Got it. I mean,  
19 I'm going to try to see if I can squeeze in one more.  
20 The-- the Path Forward program has been a major  
21 success story, I think largely due to the selection  
22 of highly competent and trusted anchor organizations.  
23 Does the Mayor's Office plan to use the same Path  
24 Forward anchor organizations as before?  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 91

3 DIRECTOR LOGAN: My understanding is that  
4 we are.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: Okay. Oh, I think  
6 I can fit in one more. Okay, so will OPHC have a  
7 program budget or receive a significant investment in  
8 the Hate Crimes Prevention Initiative in addition to  
9 the OPHC Partners Against the Hate Initiative budget?

10 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Wait, I'm sorry, Council  
11 Member Cabán, I didn't-- that was really fast. I  
12 didn't catch it.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I'm sorry.

14 DIRECTOR LOGAN: No, it's also because I  
15 have a cold-- I'm not feeling well, so my ears are  
16 kind of clogged.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I'm sorry. I hope  
18 you feel better. I also-- I'm-- yeah, I'm speaking  
19 too fast. I apologize. Will OPHC have a program  
20 budget or receive a significant investment in the  
21 Hate Crimes Prevention initiative in addition to the  
22 OPHC Partners Against the Hate initiative budget?

23 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I have to go back and  
24 look at all of the investments, but I can say that  
25 the Mayor has made significant commitments to  
investing in our Office to Prevent Hate Crimes, and

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

92

3 we are using all of those resources to make sure that  
4 we are continuing its good work.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Great. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Really quickly, I  
7 know that Council Member Won, we had originally  
8 invited Council Member Lee who's Vice Chair of BLAC  
9 [sic]. As stated many times, we know that the rise  
10 in anti-Asian hate has increased, and so we just  
11 invited Council Member Won to speak on behalf of the  
12 Asian community in Council Member Lee's absence. So,  
13 Council Member Won, if you can do a very quick, brief  
14 opening statement.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Thank you so much,  
16 Council Member-- Chair Williams and Chair Hanks for  
17 holding this really important hearing. On behalf of  
18 the AAPI community I am extremely disheartened by so  
19 many [inaudible], especially our [inaudible] 39  
20 percent of the hate crimes across the [inaudible] of  
21 Asian Americans [inaudible] Pacific Islanders, verbal  
22 harassment 53.7 [sic] percent, [inaudible] 60.5  
23 percent [inaudible]. We've heard everything in our  
24 public spaces from parks where youth are being  
25 bullied, beaten and stepped on. [inaudible] being  
pushed [inaudible] leading to death, stabbings, as

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

93

3 well as [inaudible] in addition to the verbal  
4 harassment.

5 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: I was about to  
6 jump in and say that her service was not working, but  
7 I guess the service-- Council Member Won, I don't  
8 know if you're still here. I still see you here.  
9 Okay, we're going to go to the next question as  
10 Council Member Won get her service together.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.  
12 Next we'll hear from Council Members Dinowitz  
13 followed by Council Member Richardson Jordan,  
14 followed by Council Member Ariola, and then back to  
15 Council Member Won. Council Member Dinowitz--

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
17 starts now.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you.  
19 Just to follow up on somewhat of what Council Member  
20 Holden was asking. So you have the data regarding  
21 arrests. Is there any data that exists that show  
22 what percentage of people arrested for hate crimes  
23 get mental health treatment, what percent end up in  
24 jail, and then what percent are actually released,  
25 found not guilty? Does that data exist, and is it  
public data?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

94

3 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: That is not data  
4 that we track as the Hate Crimes Taskforce. That  
5 prosecution to sentencing is not something that we  
6 maintain as the Hate Crimes Taskforce.

7 MICHAEL CLARKE: And some of that might  
8 be in the District Attorney's offices, or the courts,  
9 what the final outcome is. Right, because the--  
10 District Attorney's offices in the borough, OCA have  
11 mental health reports [sic] that they can send people  
12 to who commit crimes based on their mental health,  
13 because of, you know, mental health issues. so that  
14 they might have that data of how many were diverted,  
15 but it's not something-- we can see if-- if we can  
16 get it run here, but we don't have that with us on  
17 how often that happens.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: You know, I  
19 think that data is really important, because you  
20 know, it's-- these hate crimes impact not just the  
21 victim. It impacts an entire community, and I think  
22 each of those individuals who are going out and  
23 committing these hate crimes, I think as a community  
24 we need to know what happens. Are they receiving the  
25 help that they need, if that's what they need, or are  
they off the streets knowing, you know,-- people need

1  
2 to know if they-- is there a reason you don't collect  
3 that data, or communicate with the DA's offices about  
4 that data?

5           MICHAEL CLARKE: I mean, I'll just have  
6 to check with our-- like what data comes back and how  
7 robust it is. Right, we may find out that, you know,  
8 at the end of the case you complete your treatment  
9 program and the case is dismissed, and to find out  
10 whether that comes back as dismissed or dismissed  
11 because of treatment program. So, we'll look into  
12 it with our, you know, [inaudible]. How much we get  
13 back, I just don't have that. We don't have it with  
14 us right now.

15           COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Okay.

16           MICHAEL CLARKE: If we have it at all.

17           COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: If you have--  
18 okay. Alright, you know, because you know I hear  
19 that from-- we hear from PD. We hear a lot of the  
20 talk that oh, the people they commit crimes and  
21 they're back out on the street and no one's ever  
22 convicted of anything. It'd be nice to have some  
23 data that could actually speak to or against that,  
24 particularly when it comes to hate crimes. And my  
25 other question is for the City Commission on Human

1 Rights. Thank you, NYPD. Thank you. And of course,  
2 thank you for the work you do for our city, for the  
3 City Commission of Human Rights. You know, I kind of  
4 mentioned it briefly in my very-- in my opening  
5 statement, but you know, I have found that a lot of  
6 the implicit bias training that I've received as a  
7 public servant in-- working as an employee of New  
8 York City, a lot of my friends received as an  
9 employee of New York City, excluded implicit biases  
10 about Jewish people. I highlighted some of the more  
11 explicit ones, some of the more implicit ones. I  
12 don't want to take too much time to share. Maybe  
13 I'll share those on social media. But what work is  
14 being done to ensure that implicit bias training  
15 include biases against the Jewish community which do  
16 make up the plurality of hate crimes that we see in  
17 New York City.

18  
19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: Thank you for  
20 the question. I'm going to turn it over to Deputy  
21 Commissioner for Community Relations, Kajori  
22 Chaudhuri, to talk about the lead advisors we have  
23 for different community groups, including the Jewish  
24 community.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

97

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHAUDHURI: Thank  
3 you, Sapna. Good afternoon everyone. My name is  
4 Kajori Chaudhuri. I'm the Deputy Commissioner for  
5 Community Relations Bureau at CCHR. Council Member  
6 Dinowitz, we-- we did see a similar thing, and one of  
7 the things that on our part we do is we have the  
8 Community Board to our borough offices and  
9 [inaudible] reach communities, but we also have lead  
10 advisors and liaisons who specifically work with  
11 communities who have been historically marginalized  
12 or are-- or are vulnerable. And so one of our  
13 positions is a Jewish Community Liaison, and our  
14 Jewish Community Liaison has-- we also saw a similar  
15 disconnect, and so one of the trainings-- some of the  
16 trainings that we offer are not only about one's  
17 rights and obligations under the New York City Human  
18 Rights Law. The trainings go-- some trainings go a  
19 step further, and it is about understanding different  
20 communities, and that comes from our full man-- our  
21 full county [sic] mandate fostering intergroup  
22 relations. So we have recently launched a training  
23 which is called Understanding Jewish Experiences and  
24 Combatting Anti-Semitism, and I-- this-- we launched  
25 it in April right before Passover, and right now we

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

98

3 are in the process of training many of our city  
4 agencies, including staff from DOE. And I'll be  
5 happy to talk to you more and present [sic]  
6 [inaudible].

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I would love.  
8 Thank you, Deputy Commissioner. I would love to. You  
9 know, it's been my experience that--

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
11 expired.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: we're mandated  
13 to take these trainings which are very important.  
14 It's vital that in the mandated trainings we're  
15 including really all of the communities that are  
16 marginalized, and we'd certainly love to talk with  
17 you more about both of these what sound like optional  
18 trainings, but also specifically the mandatory ones,  
19 because really I think those can have a huge impact  
20 in the type of conversations we're having, especially  
21 in our schools, and as a result the type of violence  
22 and hate that we're seeing throughout our city.  
23 Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council  
25 Member. Next we'll hear from Council Member  
Richardson Jordan, followed by Council Member Ariola.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

99

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Hi.

5 Yes, I wanted to ask about the hate crimes advocates,  
6 specifically how are they selected? How are they  
7 trained? And then what kind of guidance or oversight  
8 is there for them?

9 MICHAEL CLARKE: Are you talking about  
10 the Crime Victim Assistance Program, or? I'm not  
11 sure what you mean by the hate crimes advocates. I  
12 apologize, Council Member.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Yeah,  
14 I mean, the hate crimes advocates. They were  
15 referred to in the first part of the hearing, and  
16 then I think it's the assistance, the assistance  
17 program.

18 MICHAEL CLARKE: Right.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Yeah,  
20 Crime Victim-- oh, I'm sorry. Crime Victim  
21 Advocates.

22 MICHAEL CLARKE: Right. So, right.  
23 They're not totally dedicated to hate crimes. It's  
24 all crimes, right? So they're selected by, I  
25 believe, Safe Horizon. They're Safe Horizon  
employees, and Safe Horizon provides training for

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

100

3 them, I believe, on their duties in the precinct. I  
4 don't know here exactly what that training looks  
5 like.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Okay.

7 So that's all through Safe Horizon. Do they receive  
8 any like mental health training, are you aware?

9 MICHAEL CLARKE: I apologize. I'm not--

10 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So, hi, Council Member  
11 Richardson Jordan. It's Deanna Logan, the Director of  
12 MOCJ. The Crime Victims advocates are individuals  
13 that do have training in social work. Safe Horizon  
14 makes sure that individuals have underlying  
15 understanding of how to engage survivors. A lot of  
16 their work historically has been on the domestic  
17 violence side of criminal cases, but they are trained  
18 to engage and support the victims of other types of  
19 crime. CVAP is actually now part of the Mayor's  
20 Office of Criminal Justice and has been ported out of  
21 NYPD, and our larger office of Crime Victim Services  
22 is working to strengthen the supports that the  
23 advocates provide to survivors of crime. And so we  
24 are working through what that should look like as we  
25 continue to talk with Safe Horizon about what the

1 future should be and what the supports need to be for  
2 survivors of crimes as a whole.

3  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Okay,  
5 okay, great. Thank you. Thank you for that.

6 DIRECTOR LOGAN: You're welcome.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Thank  
8 you, Council Member. Council Member Ariola?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you.

11 Thanks you Chairs Hanks and Williams. I just-- I  
12 don't have a question, but I do have just a statement  
13 I wanted to make. Mr. Naveed, you mentioned earlier  
14 about the hate crime at the Gurdwara on 118<sup>th</sup> Street  
15 in Richmond Hill. Although that is not in my  
16 district, certainly people, constituents from my  
17 district worship at that Gurdwara. I want to tell  
18 you, NYPD and any of the agencies from the Mayor's  
19 Office and any agency involved, that this really was  
20 a best practice. You guys really came into the  
21 community, worked utilizing non-police intervention  
22 via the Sikh Cultural Society, community leaders,  
23 community groups, elected officials, the 102 precinct  
24 garnering, fostering trust within the community and  
25 the victims, and I believe that that left-- that

1 caused the swift apprehension of the assailant. So,  
2 this really is a big-- a best practice, and kudos to  
3 all of you who worked on this particular case, but it  
4 really-- you know, it showed what can be done when we  
5 all work together towards a common cause. Thank you.  
6

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you so  
8 much Council Member Ariola. Any other Council  
9 Members? Okay, I see Council Member-- Council Member  
10 Vernikov.

11 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Council Member Won  
12 is back on now.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Oh, she is back on.  
14 Oh, okay. Sorry about that.

15 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: and then I have  
16 some questions, too, but we can--

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [interposing] Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: let Council Member  
19 Vernikov go, because I know both have had to wait for  
20 some time.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay. Let's go to  
22 Council Member Won followed by Vernikov, and then  
23 back to Council Member Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Thank you so much.  
25 Sorry about that. I was having bad service inside.

1 But I was just saying how important it is. Thank you  
2 so much for making the space to highlight AAPI  
3 violence, anti-hate crime [inaudible] taking place,  
4 because we've seen 339 percent increase in hate  
5 crimes nationwide, as well as 53.7 [sic] percent in  
6 verbal harassment. And a lot of these are happening  
7 in public spaces. 31.6 percent of the incidents were  
8 in public streets, 30 percent of incidents were in  
9 transportation such as subway that we've seen where  
10 women were pushed off the subway car like Michelle  
11 Gogh [sp?], and women and seniors are so  
12 disproportionately highly targeted than Asian men,  
13 making up more than 63.3 percent of all reports. And  
14 we know that this is an under-reporting of all the  
15 hate crimes that have taken place, especially in New  
16 York City. We know that culturally it is harder for  
17 Asian Americans, especially immigrants to make these  
18 reports. And I just have a few questions as well.  
19 What really breaks my heart is for all the AAPI hate  
20 crimes culturally making it really difficult,  
21 especially for seniors and immigrants to report these  
22 hate crimes. Just [inaudible] highly ranking, head of  
23 the Hate Crime Unit was removed after there was an  
24 interview on [inaudible] about how she was  
25

1 repeatedly, and we have other anecdotal evidence how  
2 she was dismissing Asian hate crimes when they were  
3 reported. Could you please explain to me why even  
4 though when they reported, when Asian Americans have  
5 reported cases, they were dismissed? And when--  
6 there's a statement from Sergeant Edward Riley [sp?],  
7 the incident did not factor into her reassignment.  
8 Can you one, answer-- this is a question for NYPD--  
9 where she was reassigned to, and why there was no  
10 repercussions or any sort of disciplinary action  
11 taken when there is testimony from multiple Asian  
12 Americans who have said that their hate crime reports  
13 were not taken seriously?

14  
15 MICHAEL CLARKE: So, I'm not sure where  
16 Inspector Corey [sp?] was reassigned to. I could find  
17 that out. And I-- not aware of-- yeah, I'm not aware  
18 of where she is right now. So, I could find that  
19 out, though.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Sorry, it keeps on  
21 muting me automatically. But if you-- could you  
22 please find out where she was reassigned to, and  
23 could you help me understand why there was no  
24 disciplinary action taken despite all the outcries of  
25 Asian Americans who have said that they have reported

1  
2 or try to report hate crimes but they have been  
3 dismissed, mocked, and laughed at?

4           MICHAEL CLARKE: so, again, I just am not  
5 aware. I mean, I don't know. I don't know. We  
6 could look into both your questions. I just don't  
7 have answers for that.

8           DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: And ma'am, as  
9 the Commanding Officer of the Hate Crimes Taskforce,  
10 I'd like to reassure you on the seriousness with  
11 which we investigate these crimes and the seriousness  
12 with which we look to close these successfully and  
13 appropriately within the parameters and the  
14 guidelines of the law. Nobody in this city should  
15 have to face violence or vitriolic speech or any of  
16 the like when going about their business. We're  
17 meant to co-exist peacefully in a kind city. and as  
18 a process we're taking it very seriously and looking  
19 to partner with stakeholders and community partners  
20 and members to let everybody know A, we wish to  
21 receive reports, and B, we'll thoughtfully and  
22 thoroughly investigate the reports, and allow the  
23 investigations to be steered into a successful  
24 conclusion impartially and within the guidelines and  
25 framework of the law.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Could you also share  
4 with the AAPI community what your-- what strategy or  
5 plans you have to decrease the hate crimes that have  
6 risen in our city against Asian Americans and Pacific  
7 Islanders?

8 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: Sure. We, as a  
9 Hate Crimes Taskforce, as I mentioned earlier,  
10 investigate individuals' incidents of hate, and we  
11 partner with other city agencies, including OPHC. We  
12 partner with nongovernmental organizations,  
13 nonprofits, our Community Affairs Bureau and Liaison  
14 Unit, and the precinct commanders to deliver a  
15 message that number one, if you're the victim, we  
16 want to hear from you, and number two, that we'll  
17 thoughtfully and thoroughly investigate the case and  
18 bring it hopefully to successful conclusion through a  
19 prosecutor within the law. But we really do have to  
20 partner with our community stakeholders and make--  
21 utilize social media intelligently and thoughtfully  
22 and utilize our request for media assistance and  
23 whatnot to bring attention to a macro issue in order  
24 to see a diminishment, because one crime is too many  
25 for us to see in this state, and one victim is too  
many of a hate crimes. You can see that by

1 partnering with nongovernmental organizations,  
2 bringing awareness and working with other  
3 stakeholders, we do a see a diminishment right now of  
4 raw possible bias incidents. That does not account  
5 for a lack of reporting, and that's why I so strongly  
6 encourage and welcome reports so that we have a fair  
7 and accurate number. But it's our hope to partner  
8 with the other stakeholders in an effort [inaudible].  
9

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Okay. Thank you so  
11 much. I'll be following up for the questions about  
12 [inaudible] Corey and what disciplinary actions or  
13 why the city is choosing to not take any disciplinary  
14 actions for [inaudible] Corey's reassignment. Thank  
15 you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council  
17 Member. Next we'll hear from Minority Whip Vernikov  
18 before turning back to Chair Williams.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you. My  
21 question is for the CCHR. If you know how many  
22 employees does CCHR have?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: I think current  
24 count is 132.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

108

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: 132. Do you  
4 know how many of those employees are Jewish?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: I am not sure.  
6 I don't have the demographics for that, but we can  
7 find out. I think it's something that we report.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Please, yes, I  
9 would like to have that information.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council  
11 Member. Did you have any other further--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: [interposing]  
13 Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay. Chair  
15 Williams, go ahead.

16 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you so much.  
17 So, at the March Public Safety Committee hearing the  
18 NYPD testified that the Taskforce has 19  
19 investigators and about 25 members of the AAPI  
20 community working as translators and doing outreach.  
21 Are there any additional officers or non-uniformed  
22 staff assigned to the taskforce above those numbers?

23 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ARIAS: We have 20  
24 investigators. We have one civilian, and we have  
25 five supervisors. We additionally have collocated in  
our office two State Trooper Investigators that work

1 with the state, State Crime Taskforce. They're  
2 collocated with us in our offices. In the Asian Hate  
3 Crimes Taskforce we are fortunate enough to have  
4 Inspector Tommy Ang [sp?] supervising 18, I believe,  
5 and that number can be fluid depending on [inaudible]  
6 promotions, but 18 AAPI investigators that augment  
7 and enhance and help us tremendously, for whom we're  
8 so grateful.  
9

10 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. In  
11 2017 there were 325 hate crime complaints to the  
12 NYPD. In 2018 there were 353. In 2019 there were  
13 420. Then, in 2020, overall crime in New York City  
14 plummeted as the City went into COVID-19 lockdown,  
15 and hate crimes went down too from 420 to 282, but in  
16 2020 arrests also fell by 23 percent. Then, in 2021  
17 the number skyrocketed up to 565 complaints, and  
18 coming out of Q1, complaints were up by 75 percent  
19 over last year. So we have hate crimes going up and  
20 up and then falling, not due to policing, but due to  
21 the lockdowns, and then continuing to rise again  
22 dramatically, and I really can't see any indication  
23 that the strategies have made any real impact. And  
24 so could you provide some insight on why the Council  
25 should sort of continue to invest in this strategy

1  
2 instead of perhaps prioritizing some community-based  
3 prevention strategy?

4 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you, Chair

5 Williams. I kind of want to take a step back and  
6 think about what we're seeing in terms of reporting.  
7 Similar to domestic violence, we know that as we see  
8 more reports of incidents, that may not necessarily  
9 be a bad indicator, because what it does indicate is  
10 that people are-- do have the trust to come forward  
11 and to let us know about the incidents that are  
12 happening. So, in a very ironic way, the fact that  
13 people are comfortable to come forward and to tell  
14 about the horrible incidents that are happening to  
15 them may be part of the work that you see and the  
16 collaboration that you see between OPHC, CCHR, and  
17 NYPD where between our community partners, between  
18 our city agencies, and law enforcement stakeholders,  
19 we have made it very, very clear that New York City  
20 is a diverse, inclusive place, and that we will not  
21 tolerate that type of hate and bias incidents, and  
22 therefore people are more comfortable to let us know.  
23 And we do absolutely believe commitment to education  
24 is the path forward to making sure that we don't see  
25 the incidents occurring as much, but I'm not quite

1 sure that in this moment, that seeing increased  
2 reporting is a criteria that we should take as  
3 something negative.  
4

5 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Okay. Thank you.  
6 The question I have for CCHR is how often has CCHR  
7 received complaints of bias/hate incidents, but I  
8 think you might have answered this already.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: I think I did,  
10 but we can--

11 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: [interposing] So  
12 then we can go to the next question. What challenges  
13 does CCHR face in pursuing complaints of bias or hate  
14 incidents?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: So, on the  
16 civil front, I think one of the problems is  
17 identifying who the perpetrator is, and then being  
18 able to go after them. It's usually an individual  
19 that we may not have information about, but once we  
20 do have that information, then we can go forward and  
21 see what can happen through the investigation,  
22 whether there is a way to get an apology or whether  
23 the person is entitled to [inaudible] victim  
24 [inaudible] damages. So, I don't think there are  
25 huge challenges, except you know, finding the person

1 and proving that they're connected between what  
2 happened whether there were threats or not and to the  
3 protected class of the person who is coming forward  
4 to complain.

6 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. Does  
7 CCHR refer these complaints to other agencies? So,  
8 similar to how I asked the NYPD if they're referring  
9 certain things to other agencies, are you all also  
10 referring different complaints to the various  
11 agencies? If so, which ones?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: So, we do work  
13 with OPHC and if we think that we do not have  
14 jurisdiction, then we would report it out to OPHC or  
15 to NYPD if it is that the person should pursue  
16 criminal prosecution. And then we do, you know, get  
17 help from other community organizations that might  
18 assist the person if there are ways in which that  
19 person can be assisted other than by filing the  
20 complaint with us.

21 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: And how do you  
22 determine sort of whether a complaint should be  
23 referred or not?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: So, that's  
25 something that our intake staff is trained on, and

1 they work with their supervisors and with the  
2 attorneys here at the agency to see whether it's  
3 something that we can handle or whether it's  
4 something that we don't have jurisdiction over that  
5 needs to be referred out to another agency. It's  
6 just like any other discrimination complaint that  
7 comes before us. If we don't think that we have the  
8 appropriate agencies, then we will offer referral.

9  
10 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Okay. I think  
11 Council Member Dinowitz might have somewhat asked  
12 this question. But can you share with us, if you  
13 didn't already answer this-- how often CCHR conducts  
14 anti-discrimination, hate training or other types of  
15 events to prevent hate incidents?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: I'm going to  
17 let Deputy Commissioner Chaudhuri who does most of  
18 those trainings and her staff to talk about it.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHAUDHURI: Sure, and  
20 we can get back to you with specific numbers, Chair  
21 Williams, but we-- our teams through training and  
22 education every week. And it depends-- basically,  
23 there is one of four training that they do on like  
24 the bystander interventions, and again, I can get  
25 back to you on the specific numbers that we reported.

1 Fiscal 22 [inaudible] but we can get back to you with  
2 department numbers. And then there are all the  
3 trainings that focuses on understanding of the  
4 community whether it is our anti-Semitism one,  
5 whether it's understanding Muslim experiences,  
6 whether it is understanding our transgender  
7 communities. Those also are done, and I can get back  
8 to you with exact numbers for this.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: And I would  
11 just add that if it is-- if it becomes a complaint  
12 and a case before us, and it gets settled, very often  
13 we will have as part of our settlement reconciliation  
14 agreement, that the respondent gets some kind of  
15 training or works with a community organization, or  
16 issues an apology so there are restorative justice  
17 ways in which we, you know, address the issue,  
18 including training.

19 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. And  
20 the last question I have for CCHR, just before-- one  
21 more question to either OPHC or NYPD is do you all  
22 have any policy recommendations to combat hate bias-  
23 based incidents?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: I'm sorry, was  
25 that for CCHR?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

115

3 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Yeah, it was for  
4 CCHR, but it's for whoever, but the question was do  
5 you have any policy recommendations on how we can  
6 combat hate and bias based incidents? I know-- I say  
7 this all the time privately, but I'll say it  
8 publicly. Council Members are very smart, but we're  
9 generalist [sic] at best, and so we don't often have  
10 the intellectual rigor when you talk about specific  
11 issues. and so this is sort of a question turning it  
12 back to the expert in terms of if you feel there's  
13 any policy recommendations that you have that the  
14 Council should consider in terms of how we combat  
15 hate and bias-based incidents.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: I'll go quickly  
17 and say I think something that everyone has talked  
18 about today is more training. I think that's really  
19 important to reach out to the youth. I know our  
20 Community Relations Bureau works a lot with the youth  
21 to work with communities themselves that are facing  
22 discrimination, ensuring that people who don't have  
23 immigration status are afraid that if they come  
24 forward that that will be an issue, ensuring that  
25 they understand that we don't ever ask about the  
immigration status. So they should be comfortable to

1  
2 come forward, you know, reaching out to all the  
3 communities, the Jewish, Muslim, South Asian, East  
4 Asian, African, every community that probably faces  
5 discrimination in New York City, reaching out to them  
6 and teaching them about what their rights are and  
7 what the obligations of others are, teaching  
8 bystander training, that it's really important to--  
9 without interfering with somebody else's rights and  
10 without putting yourself in danger, [inaudible].

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHAUDHURI: Sure.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RAJ: So I think  
13 that's really important.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHAUDHURI: So, our--  
15 the-- it is about community solutions, and I know  
16 Council Member Cabán when she was talking [inaudible]  
17 what can people do. And so understanding, getting a  
18 sense of who is [inaudible] safety [sic], and then  
19 using some of the time-tested methods of  
20 intervention. And this can be-- so we, in this case,  
21 we request for [inaudible] all New Yorkers, and one  
22 of the things that we do is partnership with  
23 community-based organizations, and hopefully to  
24 similarly some of the [inaudible] members to do this,  
25 is making sure that our trainings are translatable in

1 different languages so that New York's-- like every  
2 New Yorker has the sense of like what those  
3 interventions [inaudible] be and can help interrupt  
4 bias and hate. We often talk about bystander  
5 intervention training in terms of almost like first  
6 aid where you train you to that, you know, you get  
7 the training on a regular basis so that you develop  
8 [sic] muscle [sic] memory to disrupt the intention as  
9 to like, you know, how to intervene when you are  
10 seeing an incident of bias or discrimination taking  
11 place in your community so that the community at  
12 large can be responsible for interrupting bias. So,  
13 we would add the bystander intervention training and  
14 bringing communities together in a holistic way as  
15 part of the council recommendations.  
16

17 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. And  
18 final question that I have which was sort of  
19 discussed is we know from researching and common  
20 sense that hate violence is massively under-reported,  
21 and I think a lot of the wonderful experts here had  
22 mentioned that, and the number of complaints NYPD  
23 received is likely a fraction of the number of  
24 complaint actually occurring. Again, at the March  
25 Public Safety Committee hearing, NYPD testified that

1 the taskforce closure rate was about 50 percent. So  
2 at best, the NYPD is making arrests in half of a  
3 fraction of the total number of incidents. In  
4 addition, only about 15 percent of those arrests lead  
5 to hate crime convictions. So, a fraction of a  
6 fraction of a fraction. How can this possibly be an  
7 effective approach to reducing hate violence? And do  
8 you have any thoughts on what other approaches we  
9 could be using? And I know MOCJ and OPHC and CCHR  
10 for that matter are more so focused on those  
11 community-based prevention approaches that we love so  
12 much. And so just trying to get a sense of, you  
13 know, how do we use the best practices because we  
14 clearly aren't closing out cases and convicting  
15 people for hate crimes?

17 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NAVEED: This  
18 is Hassan from OPHC. I can speak to a little bit  
19 about the under-reporting aspect of stuff and how we  
20 look to compensate, we'll look to address our  
21 response in a comprehensive way. We know that NYPD  
22 data itself is something where folks, you know, feel  
23 comfortable reporting an incident to the Police  
24 Department or whatever the case might be, but we also  
25 know, as Chair Williams stated, that there are many

1 reasons why someone may not necessarily report a hate  
2 crimes or a crime, and we function within the context  
3 of that existence, right, that there is a large  
4 portion of incidents that are not being reported.  
5 And how do we work about getting a comprehensive  
6 picture of what that looks like is really important  
7 for our community engagement, our community  
8 relations. NYPD data plays an important role for us  
9 to get an idea of what's happening, but also our  
10 engagement directly with communities. Some of these  
11 organizations collect their own hate crime data or  
12 bias incident data, and they also provide qualitative  
13 information and experiences from community members  
14 that helps inform us at OPHC but also our interagency  
15 committee, our interagency efforts that includes  
16 those 22 city agencies that are involved, a bigger  
17 picture of what the state of hate, what the state of  
18 bias, state of discrimination looks like, right?  
19 That includes data related to bias incidents,  
20 bullying, all this sort of stuff so we can get a  
21 complete idea of how we can work towards doing that.  
22 We can't rely on just one source of data. It has to  
23 be something that is comprehensive for us to be able  
24 to tackle this issue in a way that is comprehensive,  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

120

3 and then from there on out we'll work on those  
4 policy, programmatic, and other sorts of outcome  
5 events that it might be-- that are target  
6 interventions in addressing these issues in the  
7 bigger picture.

8 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. With  
9 that, I will turn back over to Committee Counsel, and  
10 then just again want to say thanks to MOCJ, OPHC, and  
11 NYPD and CCHR-- of course, cannot forget CCHR-- for  
12 doing the good work and for joining this hearing and  
13 providing testimony and answering our questions.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much,  
15 Chair. If any other Council Members have questions,  
16 speak now, or we'll pass it off to public testimony.  
17 Chair Hanks, anyone? Nope? Okie doke, everyone.  
18 Thank you Administration for your testimony. We're  
19 now going to move on to the public testimony portion  
20 of this hearing.

21 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: And if you guys can  
22 stay on. Sorry, Josh. Feel free to stay on to  
23 listen to the public's testimony as well.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, thank you so  
25 much, Chair. So now we'll talk to members of the  
public. We'll now be having public testimony. I'd

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

121

3 like to remind everyone that unlike our typical  
4 council hearing, we'll be calling on individuals one  
5 by one to testify. Each panelist will be given three  
6 minutes to speak. Please begin once the Sergeant has  
7 started the timer. Council Members, if you have  
8 questions for a particular panelist, use the Zoom  
9 raise hand function, and we'll call on you after the  
10 panelist has completed testimony. For panelists,  
11 once your name is called, a member of the staff will  
12 unmute you, and so kind of please keep an ear open  
13 because I will be announcing a cue of panelists as  
14 we're getting ready. So, before-- without further  
15 ado, we will begin with-- we're going to start with--  
16 we're going to invite Laurence Hong, followed by  
17 Michael Cohen, followed by Chanterelle Sung.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 LAURENCE HONG: Hi, my name is Laurence  
20 Hong, Chief of Staff to Assemblywoman Yuh-Line Niou.  
21 She is currently at Albany right now for conference  
22 and her legislative session. So I am testifying upon  
23 her behalf. "So, good morning and thank you for the  
24 invitation to speak at this hearing regarding the  
25 horrifying anti-Asian violence that has targeted New  
York's Asian American communities. In my roles as a

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

122

1 state Assembly Member, I am proud to represent the  
2 oldest Asian American community in all of the City,  
3 Manhattan's China Town, and to be one of a small  
4 number of Asian American elected officials on the  
5 state level. The dual pandemics of COVID and hateful  
6 violence have hurt our community deeply. Our people  
7 are scared and our neighborhoods are struggling. The  
8 recent attacks on AAPI New Yorkers have been  
9 terrifying and despicable. The tragedies of  
10 Christine Ali [sp?], Michelle Goh [sp?], Yao Pen Ma  
11 [sp?], Uncle Quac [sp?], and just this past weekend,  
12 Gee Mon Yun [sp?] haunt us. These attacks are not  
13 just a manifestation of COVID induced racism. They  
14 are the latest chapter in a long history of violence  
15 towards and disinvestment from Asian American  
16 communities that has been ongoing since the first  
17 immigrants arrived here hundreds of years ago. In  
18 addressing the current wave of violence, our goal  
19 must not be just a return to 2019, but rather a more  
20 equitable future where we get the full equity,  
21 safety, and support that we deserve. To that effect,  
22 this past year I spearheaded efforts to fund the AAPI  
23 Equity Budget on the state level. The Equity Budget  
24 was a proposal drafted by community-based  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

123

1 organizations, advocacy groups and the Asian Pacific  
2 American Taskforce for protect us from and prevent  
3 violence. To help us fight the high levels of  
4 poverty in the Asian American community and to  
5 provide culturally sensitive, social, and translation  
6 services to individuals who need it the most. The  
7 enacted budget allocates 20 million dollars for the  
8 proposal, half of which is earmarked specifically for  
9 confronting hate crimes. This is a massive increase  
10 over years past, and a significant win for our  
11 community, but it is less a third of what the  
12 original proposal called for. While this year's  
13 massive increase in funds from the state is a  
14 victory, needs remain, and it is time for the City  
15 where most of the hate crimes are occurring to rise  
16 to the occasion, as well. Asian Americans are 18  
17 percent of the population. Despite this, the City  
18 has yet to do its part addressing the funding gaps  
19 fueling hate crimes. I encourage the Council to work  
20 with the advocates who crafted the state level equity  
21 budget proposal to fully fund the programs they have  
22 identified. The need for service is great with a  
23 quarter of AAPI adults living in poverty. This body  
24 truly wishes to address anti-Asian hate must start by  
25

1 fully funding our AAPI Equity Budget. I'd also like  
2 to talk about some of the sentiments that many  
3 community members have shared with me regarding the  
4 effectiveness of earlier programs and services. Our  
5 community feels unheard due to language barriers and  
6 the lack of cultural sensitivity in city services,  
7 including public safety measures and social services.  
8 97 percent of the Asian Pacific American seniors are  
9 foreign-born, as opposed to 47 percent the general  
10 senior population. Many of seniors have told me that  
11 when they tried to collaborate with law enforcement  
12 or city officials, the in-translation apps used are  
13 miserably ineffective. As you might be aware, word  
14 travels fast in local communities, especially ones as  
15 tight-knit as ours. A handful of frustrating  
16 failures [sic] can circulate quickly. The sentiment  
17 that the city services including public safety  
18 services are inaccessible and ineffective, and  
19 unfortunately, comments like that remain unaddressed.  
20 If this is not resolved, it will be impossible for us  
21 to collaborate on addressing the dire issue of  
22 hateful violence. Increasing--

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
25 expired.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

125

3 LAURENCE HONG: cultural and language  
4 accessibility throughout all of this city's current  
5 and future initiatives must be a priority." I still  
6 have about another minute or two. Would you mind if  
7 I finished?

8 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Go ahead.

9 LAURENCE HONG: Thank you. Let's see.  
10 Where was I? "A key way to increase cultural  
11 competence and language accessibility, is to increase  
12 AAPI representation at all levels of city  
13 Administration, from clerks and fireman to Council  
14 Members and Commissioners. There are New Yorkers all  
15 over the city who come to my office for constituent  
16 services, even though they do not live in my district  
17 because their elected representatives' offices are  
18 not equipped to support language accessible services.  
19 People want support, but they want support from  
20 people that understand their language and their  
21 culture. Asian Americans are almost 18 percent of  
22 the City's population. Unless we see ourselves  
23 reflected in the faces that represent the city at all  
24 levels, it will be difficult to collaborate with any  
25 program the city might introduce. Similarly, if you  
want to create programs that Asian American New

1  
2 Yorkers actually use and that actually work for us,  
3 the most important thing is to make sure that we are  
4 present in the rooms where these programs are  
5 designed and decisions are made. Another barrier to  
6 successful collaboration between AAPI communities and  
7 city resources is a general feeling of neglect and  
8 disrespect from the City. We feel disrespected  
9 because all too often our neighborhoods are expected  
10 to bear a disproportionate number of facilities that  
11 serve the entire city. I believe in the enforcement  
12 of safe havens and the need to close Rikers Island,  
13 but China Town has absorbed more than its fair share.  
14 No one denies that there is a dire need for these  
15 critical services. Safe havens are important spaces  
16 with life-saving services and our city needs more of  
17 them if we want to phase out our existing  
18 insufficient shelter system. We must acknowledge--  
19 we must also acknowledge that these initiatives meant  
20 to serve the entire city are disproportionately  
21 concentrated in communities of color, specifically  
22 China Town. Why is it that after advocates of color  
23 spoke out against horrific conditions at Rikers and  
24 the need to close it, the solution was to build four  
25 new Rikers in communities of color without addressing

1 the call for a gross decrease in cells and the root  
2 causes of over-incarceration and carceral [sic]  
3 cruelty. The problem as always is the City unwilling  
4 to engage with residents on a one-to-one level and  
5 incorporate community feedback into their planning  
6 processes. We can and must do better to ensure all  
7 New Yorkers share equally in the cost and benefits  
8 running our city. And finally, there are systemic  
9 issues of racism and mental health that brought us to  
10 the point where we are today, and it is always  
11 systemic responses that will get us past it.  
12 Unfortunately, the solution is not just about adding  
13 a few extra patrol cars on a given street, a few more  
14 police officers on the beat, or a few more  
15 surveillance cameras that we did subway station. The  
16 city has tried this, and it is clear that it does not  
17 work. A large part of the solution is ending a  
18 history of neglect and elevating communities of  
19 colors as partners. I urge the City to heed the  
20 recommendations that our community organizations and  
21 community members have made. This means working with  
22 our organizations and advocates across all  
23 communities of color, increasing dedicated funding  
24 for AAPI needs, promoting and implementing community  
25

1 engagement, and increasing language accessibility and  
2 cultural competency across all current and future  
3 city services. Thank you.”

4  
5 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you,  
6 Laurence. I have a quick question. You said that  
7 the 20 million has been allocated. What is the--  
8 what is the gap? What are you proposing?

9 LAURENCE HONG: I believe CACF is also on  
10 here and they could probably go into more detail, but  
11 my understanding is that the original ask that we had  
12 was approximately 40 something million. I'll have to  
13 double-check on that number but it was about half of  
14 what we were asking for, and these services would go  
15 to a number of plans, and I'm happy to forward over,  
16 I guess, the full budget proposal to your office as  
17 well.

18 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: I would love that.  
19 Thank you so much. And we definitely would like to  
20 meet with you after the hearing. So please speak to  
21 our Council staff and we'll try to set something up.  
22 Thank you very much for your testimony.

23 LAURENCE HONG: Yeah, I appreciate it.  
24 Thank you. Oh, 64.9 million, that was the  
25 [inaudible] Yep.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

129

3 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Okie dokie,  
4 thanks.

5 LAURENCE HONG: Thank you

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your  
7 testimony. Next we'll hear from Michael Cohen  
8 followed by Chanterelle Sung.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 MICHAEL COHEN: Thank you, Chair Hanks  
11 and Chair Williams and the Committees for holding  
12 this morning's crucial hearing on our city's  
13 responsiveness to the continuing surge of hate  
14 crimes. My name is Michael Cohen, Eastern Director  
15 of the Simon Wiesenthal Center, a Jewish global human  
16 rights organizations with a constituency of over  
17 400,000 families, 150,000 of them in the New York  
18 Metropolitan area. The Simon Wiesenthal Center  
19 confronts anti-Semitism, racism, and all forms of  
20 hate while promoting human rights and dignity  
21 throughout-- through its wide range in educational  
22 programs that serve New York's diverse community.  
23 Everyone here this morning knows that behind the  
24 shocking statistics our fellow citizens who have  
25 suffered physical attacks and mental anguish, that  
every swastika, every anti-Semitic curse, every anti-

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

130

1 Asian screed [sic], every defacement of our houses of  
2 worship injure our souls. We are appreciate that our  
3 city's leaders, Mayor Adams, City Council Speaker  
4 Adams, and the members of these important committees  
5 have had-- been sounding the alarm while pressing the  
6 need for unity and healing. While raising awareness  
7 is absolutely key, let us use this hearing to ensure  
8 that as the title of today's hearing indicates, we  
9 operate our resolve to develop coherent, collective  
10 responses that will send the clear message that New  
11 Yorkers will not tolerate hate crimes no matter who  
12 the perpetrator, no matter who the victim, no matter  
13 what the cause. This center in close collaboration  
14 with the City Council has for years brought our  
15 Combat Hate programs to New York City's public school  
16 system, teaching students to identify and report  
17 instances of hate on social media platforms and  
18 gaming systems while ensuring that we give them the  
19 tools so that they can exercise their personal social  
20 responsibility in combatting online bullying and hate  
21 recruitment. Just last week, Chair Williams along  
22 with a host of City Council Members, joined the  
23 center in a press conference with Speaker Adams  
24 unveiling our annual report on digital hate. This  
25

1 report demonstrates how much work we have to do in  
2 pressuring powerful digital platforms to adopt zero  
3 tolerance for hate targeting our city's children. The  
4 New York State Assembly recently sponsored the  
5 creation of one of our center's mobile museum of  
6 tolerance for our great state. This incredible tool  
7 will be a major educational asset that will bring--  
8 that will bring our message of empowerment against  
9 hate and building a future based on hope and mutual  
10 respect to the five boroughs of this great city and  
11 across the state of New York. The center works  
12 closely with NYPD's Hate Crimes Taskforce and New  
13 York City's unique Office for the Prevention of Hate  
14 Crimes launched in 2019. And as we all know, much  
15 more needs to be done across our city and it needs to  
16 be done with a sense of urgency and a sense of unity  
17 in incorporating our many diverse communities and  
18 cultures. As a recipient of the New York City  
19 Council Hate Crimes Prevention Initiative funding,  
20 the Wiesenthal Center is honored to be recognized by  
21 this body as a leading organization on the front  
22 lines of this crisis, and we thank the Council for its  
23 signals to-date of ensuring that the overall funding  
24 of this initiative will be once again prioritized. We  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

132

3 are so grateful that this Council truly gets it. We  
4 wouldn't all be here today, though, if we believe  
5 that enough is already being done. The Simon  
6 Wiesenthal Center stands by the Council's side ready  
7 to expand its work and services that we know is and  
8 will continue with your support to make a difference  
9 where it counts most, with our children. Thank you  
10 very much.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
12 your testimony. Next we'll hear from Chanterelle  
13 Sung, followed by Rich-- sorry, Scott Richman, Aida  
14 Lynn [sp?], and Leo Fergusson [sp?]. Chanterelle?

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 CHANTERELLE SUNG: Good afternoon. Thank  
17 you Chair persons Hanks and Williams and members of  
18 the Committee on Public Safety and Civil and Human  
19 Rights for the opportunity to submit this testimony  
20 regarding the New York County District Attorney's  
21 Office Investigations and Prosecutions of Hate  
22 Crimes. My name is Chanterelle Sung, and I am the  
23 Chief of Strategic Operations for the Manhattan DA's  
24 Office, and I am incredibly grateful that our city  
25 and this council is focused on combatting hate crimes  
and committed to responding to the urgent and grave

1 situation that our office faces every day in  
2 Manhattan. The number of hate crime cases that the  
3 Manhattan DA's Office currently prosecutes remains at  
4 an unprecedented high number. We are currently  
5 prosecuting approximately 87 hate crime cases. These  
6 are charged hate crime cases, whether by Criminal  
7 Court complaint or Grand Jury indictment, and these  
8 include misdemeanors such as bias-driven spitting or  
9 liquid throwing incidents, some of the most serious  
10 felonies such as murder and attempted murder as Hate  
11 Crimes, as well as everything in between from  
12 unprovoked violent attacks against members of a  
13 certain protected identity, anti-Semitic graffiti and  
14 harassment cases and more. The largest category of  
15 hate crime prosecutions in Manhattan are anti-Asian  
16 with 34 open hate crime cases. The second largest  
17 category of hate crimes are those against the LGBTQ+  
18 community at 24 cases, and our next two largest  
19 categories of current pending hate crimes are anti-  
20 Black at 11 open cases, and anti-Semitic at 10 open  
21 cases. We are also prosecuting anti-white and anti-  
22 Hispanic hate crime cases among others. the  
23 Manhattan DA's Office Hate Crimes Unit is currently  
24 comprised of a Chief, a Deputy Chief, two  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

134

1 investigators and an analyst who supervise and  
2 provide investigative support to the Trial Division  
3 Prosecutors who handle hate crimes investigations and  
4 prosecutions, and their work is overseen and  
5 supported by two executives, myself for Strategy and  
6 Operations, and the Chief of our Trial Division, Joy  
7 Smith [sic] for casework. Our unit works closely  
8 with detectives assigned to the NYPD Hate Crimes  
9 Taskforce to investigate potential hate crime  
10 incidents, for instance to gather and review digital  
11 forensic or social media data and evidence,  
12 conducting interviews of witnesses and victims, and  
13 conferring on investigative strategies. The unit  
14 also receives pre-arrest investigations directly from  
15 victims or witnesses who call the hate crimes hotline  
16 number and will also conduct post-arrest  
17 investigations to determine whether an arrest made by  
18 local authorities should be charged as a hate crime.  
19 in March, DA Bragg testify before the New York City  
20 Council seeking 1.6 million to fund the expansion of  
21 the unit, and I'll submit in written testimony more  
22 details on the staffing structure for this expansion,  
23 but I will note that this expansion is necessary  
24 because in addition to the rising number of cases  
25

1 that need to be investigated and prosecuted, we must  
2 implement long-term prevention and deterrent  
3 solutions that focus on community engagement,  
4 building our victim support services, enhancing  
5 cultural and linguistic competencies, conducting  
6 specialized hate crimes--

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
9 expired.

10 CHANTERELLE SUNG: for police and  
11 prosecutors and furthering anti-bias education and  
12 awareness efforts. And if it's okay, I just have a  
13 little more that I wanted to speak to. We have  
14 developed a comprehensive strategy for addressing  
15 hate crimes that is deeply informed by our livid  
16 experience, law enforcement as well as community-  
17 based and victim-centered solutions and extensive  
18 stakeholder engagement. With these resources we will  
19 be able to effectively implement this strategy. I am  
20 prepared to submit written testimony that highlight  
21 some of our significant cases that we are currently  
22 prosecuting, but if time allows, I will just  
23 highlight a couple of those cases right now. On  
24 February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2022, defendant Stevens Ajunk [sp?]  
25 began a series of unprovoked assaults on seven Asian

1 women on the east side of Manhattan between Houston  
2 and East 30<sup>th</sup> Streets during an approximately three-  
3 hour period. As a result of those attacks, six of  
4 the women suffered injuries, including lacerations  
5 and bruising to their faces, and one of the women was  
6 knocked unconscious by the defendant later treated at  
7 the hospital for concussion. The Grand Jury indicted  
8 the defendant for all these hate crime charges on all  
9 seven incidents. So that is a case that is currently  
10 pending in our office. The other case that I wanted  
11 to highlight is another anti-Asian hate crime case.  
12 Earlier last year, April 23<sup>rd</sup> of 2021, 61-year-old  
13 Chinese immigrant named Yao Pen Ma [sp?] was in  
14 Harlem collecting cans when the defendant Jared Paul  
15 [sp?] ran up to him from behind, knocked him to the  
16 ground and repeated stomped on his head and kicked  
17 him in the head, face, and neck. As a result of  
18 traumatic brain injury and being placed on life  
19 support, Mr. Ma died on December 31<sup>st</sup> of 2021. The  
20 defendant had made statements to law enforcement in  
21 which he claimed to have been attacked by two Korean  
22 or Japanese men the day before he attacked Mr. Ma,  
23 but admitted that he did not report the alleged  
24 robbery to the police. A Manhattan Grand Jury  
25

1 indicted the defendant for murder in the second  
2 degree as a hate crime, and that case is currently  
3 pending in our office as well. I will just conclude  
4 by thanking you for your time and dedication to  
5 ensuring that hate crimes are given the  
6 prioritization and attention necessary and for giving  
7 me the opportunity to submit this testimony. We are  
8 very proud of the work we're doing each and every day  
9 to zealously combat hate crimes, and with the  
10 additional funding we have requested in next year's  
11 budget, we will be able to fully realize our long  
12 term strategy. I know that our office, the Council  
13 and the City share our values on this issue, and we  
14 look forward to continuing to work with all our  
15 partners to hold those who commit crimes in Manhattan  
16 accountable. Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
19 your testimony. Next, we will hear from Scott  
20 Richman followed by Ava Lin [sp?], Leo Fergusson  
21 [sp?]. Scott, you may go ahead.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 SCOTT RICHMAN: Okay, thank you. I wasn't  
24 able to unmute.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: sorry about that.

1  
2 SCOTT RICHMAN: Okay. So good afternoon  
3 and thank you so much Chair Williams and Chair Hanks.  
4 My name is Scott Richman, and I serve as the Director  
5 of ADL's New York/New Jersey Regional Office. Thank  
6 you so much for the opportunity to testify here today  
7 regarding the concerning rise in hate crimes in New  
8 York City and what we can all do to curb these  
9 trends. Since 1913, the mission of ADL has been not  
10 only to monitor and respond to anti-Semitism, but  
11 really to fight all forms of hate, believing that if  
12 one group is persecuted, then all groups can be.  
13 Over the past few decades, ADL has been recognized a  
14 leading resource on effective responses to violent  
15 bigotry, conducting an annual audit of anti-Semitic  
16 incidents and drafting model hate crimes statutes for  
17 state legislatures. You've now heard for several  
18 hours about the rise in hate against so many  
19 communities in the City, so I will not repeat that.  
20 What I will stress are the findings of ADL's audit.  
21 It was just released last week, so really hot of the  
22 press. It's gotten a lot of visibility, and it's  
23 really a unique way to assess the temperature of  
24 anti-Semitism, the state of anti-Semitism because  
25 it's a reflection of ADL's day to day work. It's our

1 incident response work. And according to the audit,  
2 across the United States there were a total of 2,717  
3 incidents of both criminal and non-criminal acts of  
4 harassment, vandalism, and assault, which is a 34  
5 percent increase, over 700 more incidents than last  
6 year, and the highest year on record since we've been  
7 keeping track of anti-Semitic incidents since 1979.  
8 Across the country, we dealt with anti-Semitic  
9 incidents in 50 states, and there is no state that  
10 has more anti-Semitic incidents than New York, and  
11 about two-thirds of the incidents in New York took  
12 place in New York City. We're talking about 416  
13 incidents which is up from 336 the year before. What  
14 we also saw in New York was something very, very  
15 disturbing which is an incredible rise in anti-  
16 Semitic assaults. Across the country we had 88  
17 assaults, 51 of those took place in New York State,  
18 and 48 of those took place in New York City. So  
19 we're talking about a huge number. The majority of  
20 anti-Semitic assaults taking place right here in New  
21 York City with a very significant number in Brooklyn.  
22 And you know, in general, incidents targeting  
23 Orthodox Jews throughout the state have increased at  
24 an alarming rate. You can refer to ADL's heat map.  
25

1 That's a real-time look at not only anti-Semitic  
2 incidents, but incidents of hate, extremism, anti-  
3 Semitism and terrorism that ADL is following. They  
4 range from swastika graffiti to other forms of  
5 vandalism to anti-Semitic slurs. We saw in a  
6 specific neighborhood, a family of three was attacked  
7 with a child who was one year old and another man--  
8 in another instance a man approached a visibly Jewish  
9 woman and said, "You people are disgusting," and  
10 threw an unknown liquid substance in her face. ADL  
11 has documented a number of physical assaults as well  
12 relating to--

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
15 expired.

16 SCOTT RICHMAN: [inaudible] Zionism in  
17 New York. I just have another minute or so to put  
18 forth my recommendations. Is that okay? So, you  
19 know, with all of this in mind, I want to recommend  
20 five steps that the Council can take. First, the  
21 City Council should strengthen partnerships with and  
22 support to community-based organizations when it  
23 comes to data collection and reporting. These  
24 organizations are often the first call when acts of  
25 hate and bias occur, and it's critically important

1 that they're adequately resourced and have the  
2 capacity to track and monitor incidents as they  
3 occur. Second, the City Council should take steps to  
4 help ensure the collection of data regarding hate  
5 crimes prosecutions in New York City with particular  
6 attention to the extent to which racial disparities  
7 may exist when it comes to hate crime charges,  
8 convictions, and criminal sentences. Third, the City  
9 Council should make sure that the New York City  
10 Office of Prevention of Hate Crimes is appropriately  
11 staffed and resourced. We've heard quite a bit from  
12 them. We urge the City Council to direct more  
13 resources to studying the rising tide of hate and  
14 harassment online, including in the form of swatting  
15 and doxing to ensure that government agencies have  
16 the resources and expertise needed to investigate and  
17 respond to these incidents when they occur. And  
18 fifth, we urge the City Council to invest in  
19 restorative justice approaches and other non-carceral  
20 [sic] approaches to hate crimes, and prioritize  
21 community-based prevention initiatives which can  
22 include but are not limited to violence prevention  
23 and interruption programs, anti-bias peer-to-peer  
24 education, and holocaust and genocide education in  
25

1 New York City's K-12 schools. It's a major part of  
2 ADL's work. We work in hundreds of schools in New  
3 York doing that kind of anti-bias and Holocaust  
4 education work. These approaches can empower impacted  
5 communities while still holding hate crime offenders  
6 accountable. Thank you all for the work that the  
7 Council does to ensure that New York City is safe,  
8 welcoming, and inclusive city for all.  
9

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Alright, thank you so  
11 much for your testimony. Next we'll hear from Ada Lin  
12 followed by Leo Ferguson.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 ADA LIN: Good afternoon. My name is Ada  
15 Lin, Program Coordinator at the Coalition for Asian-  
16 American Children and Families. Thank you Chair  
17 Hanks and Chair Williams and the rest of Council  
18 Members for the opportunity to speak. As the  
19 nation's only Pan Asian children's advocacy  
20 organizations, Coalition for Asian-American Children  
21 and Families, CACF, aims to improve the health and  
22 wellbeing of Asian-Americans and Pacific Islander  
23 children and families in New York City. Currently  
24 I'm a Program Coordinator for the Asian-American  
25 Student Advocacy Project, which is also known as

1  
2 ASAP. ASAP is a youth leadership program for Asian-  
3 American and Pacific Islander youth across New York  
4 City. One of the youth in the [inaudible] shared,  
5 "The reason the frequent anti-Asian hate crime have  
6 constantly made me feel like I'm on edge, especially  
7 as a Asian woman. I find myself making myself smaller  
8 in public spaces, being distrustful of everyone  
9 around me, and generally feel like this city isn't my  
10 home anymore, because there is no sense of community  
11 around me." Another youth shared that, "As I started  
12 going outside I feel anxious any time when someone  
13 approaches. When I'm on the train I wonder if people  
14 sees me, an Asian-American wearing mask, and will  
15 move-- and move-- and will move to sit somewhere  
16 else. When I close the front door of my home, I want  
17 to know why do I feel relief. All members of our  
18 community deserve to feel safe." Another youth  
19 defined safety as, "being able to go about our day  
20 without constantly questioning whether we or our  
21 loved ones will go through as physical and emotional  
22 harm." They continued, "There are so many ways to  
23 describe what safety can look like in our community,  
24 such as street light brightening up the path in the  
25 dark. Public safety [inaudible] services and

1 [inaudible] fun place to be after school. Safety  
2 means that we have the resources when we need help."  
3 We need to raise our collective voices and commit to  
4 ending hate and racism. Most of incident, if not  
5 all, are a result of lack of resources in our  
6 community and lack of knowledge we have about each  
7 other. In all aspects of our life, we need to be  
8 able to see ourselves as whole being with a sense of  
9 care and connectedness to people within our community  
10 as well as across community of color. We believe  
11 safety is the presence of wellness and not just the  
12 absence of crime. The criminal justice system does  
13 not and cannot address the wellbeing of our community  
14 members. City must stop using criminal justice  
15 system to address social and-- to address social and  
16 economic issues [sic]. We urge the City Council to  
17 invest in our city and in our community. More than  
18 ever, we need culturally and linguistically  
19 responsive and sensitive services to ensure the needs  
20 of our community members are being met and our voices  
21 are being heard. We need the City to invest in our  
22 community because safety means feeling welcomed,  
23 heard, and included. Every community member deserve  
24  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

145

3 that, and we need to make sure that we feel supported  
4 and safe. Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
6 your testimony. Next we'll hear from Leo Ferguson  
7 followed by Lakshmi Sanmuganathan followed by Avi  
8 Posnick. Leo, you may go ahead.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 LEO FERGUSON: Good afternoon Chairs  
11 Hanks and Williams and Council Members. My name is  
12 Leo Ferguson and I am the director of Strategic  
13 Projects at Jews for Racial and Economic Justice. I  
14 am testifying on behalf of our organization and our  
15 partners at the Diverse NYC Against Hate Coalition.  
16 It has been five years since the rise of the modern  
17 white nationalist movement, and we are four years  
18 into New York City's hate violence crisis. Two  
19 mayoral administrations, two Police Commissioners,  
20 two City Council Speakers, and many other officials  
21 proclaim zero tolerance, and the City has spent tens  
22 of millions of dollars operating expanding the NYPD  
23 Hate Crimes Taskforces, but in that five year period,  
24 and only 87 hate crimes convictions in New York City,  
25 and the number of bias incidents continue to go up  
and up. One thing is crystal clear, our current

1 strategy of policing and prosecutions is not working.

2 In fact, research shows that hate crimes laws have no  
3 deterrent effect, and as Council Member Holden  
4 pointed out, many of the communities targeted by hate

5 violence are also the least likely to report to the  
6 police. The law enforcement approach to fighting

7 hate violence has officers running around the city

8 looking for individual perpetrators who, according to

9 the NYPD's own testimony, have a 50 to 70 percent  
10 chance of getting away with their crimes. So I'll

11 say it again, our current strategy of policing and

12 prosecutions is not working. It's not keeping our  
13 communities safe. We cannot continue to do the same

14 thing and expect a different result. Instead, an  
15 effective hate violence prevention strategy must

16 begin within the communities that are being targeted

17 and resource community-based organizations to empower

18 vulnerable New Yorkers and address the factors that  
19 lead to bias incidents. The good news is that we

20 have extraordinary community organizations that have

21 been doing this for three years, and are eager, in  
22 fact, desperate for the resources to do this work.

23 The bad news is that community-based hate violence

24 prevention in New York City has been wildly under-  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

147

1 resourced. In the midst of an ongoing hate violence  
2 epidemic, NYC Against Hate has had to fight every  
3 year to get even modest investments in non-policing  
4 approaches to hate violence prevention. While we  
5 appreciate the funding we have received, it should be  
6 obvious that two to four million dollars divided  
7 between many organizations is not adequate to address  
8 a major crisis in a city of 8.5 million people. So  
9 we are calling on the City Council to finally say  
10 enough is enough and direct the right resources to  
11 the right strategy. You must provide adequate  
12 funding and staffing to OPHC. We applaud the City  
13 Council's proposal to increase hate crimes prevention  
14 and AAPI Community Support Initiative's funding in FY  
15 23, and we request the Council increase hate crimes  
16 prevention initiative funding to five million dollars  
17 in addition to a six million allocation to the AAPI  
18 Community Support Initiative. We ask that the  
19 Council fully fund the Hope Against Hate Campaign,  
20 the Asian American Federation led violence prevention  
21 program. We call on Mayor Adams to increase funding  
22 for his Path Forward program to 10 million dollars  
23 directed to the same experienced anchor organizations  
24 so that they build on the program's success to-date.  
25

1 And finally, success in combatting hate violence will  
2 necessarily include addressing the same social and  
3 public health harms and lack of resources that fuel  
4 all violence and prevent our communities from  
5 thriving. High-quality universal healthcare and  
6 mental healthcare and guaranteed supportive housing  
7 are the essential pre-conditions for healthy, safe,  
8 thriving communities. Continuing to fund failed hate  
9 crimes policing and prosecution strategy to the  
10 detriment to these investments is a tragic waste of  
11 resources. It's past time for the Mayor and the  
12 Council to take hate violence prevention seriously  
13 and invest in a rigorous, community-based approach  
14 shaped and driven by the needs of the diverse array  
15 of communities who are directly impacted by this  
16 tragic violence. Thank you Chairs Hanks and Williams  
17 for the opportunity to testify.

19 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you, Leo. I  
20 would definitely love to also meet with you, if you  
21 can reach out to our Council staff.

22 LEO FERGUSON: Yeah, for sure we'd love  
23 to.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 149

3 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: I'd like to drill  
4 down on some of things you were talking about. Thank  
5 you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you so  
7 much for your testimony. Again, next we'll hear from  
8 Lakshmi Sanmuganathan followed by Avi Posnick  
9 followed by Medha Ghosh.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

11 LAKSHMI SANMUGANATHAN: Good afternoon  
12 and thank you to Chair Hanks and Chair Williams for  
13 holding this important hearing and providing us the  
14 vital opportunity to submit testimony. My name is  
15 Lakshmi Sanmuganathan and I am a Budget Policy  
16 Coordinator at the Coalition for Asian-American  
17 Children and Families, CACF. For the past 35 years  
18 now, we have been the nation's first and only Pan-  
19 Asian children and families advocacy organization  
20 that leads the fight for improved and equitable  
21 policies, systems, services, and funding to support  
22 those most in need. CACF also leads the 18 Percent  
23 and Growing Campaign which brings together well over  
24 60 AAPI organizations across all five boroughs of New  
25 York City, and we come together on an annual basis to  
fight for an inclusive and equitable budget that will

1 protect the needs of our most vulnerable AAPI  
2 community members. Over the past nearly three years  
3 now, our AAPI community members, especially our  
4 seniors and our women, have continued to experience  
5 increased incidents of public assaults, harassment,  
6 and hate crimes across the City. Last year alone in  
7 the US there were over 9,000 reported incidents of  
8 anti-Asian violence, and in New York City we saw a  
9 361 percent increase in anti-Asian-related hate  
10 crimes which is the highest of all cities in the US.  
11 Despite these painful challenges, our AAPI community  
12 has been serving on the front lines of New York City  
13 for nearly three years, risking their own health as  
14 doctors, nurses, human service workers, early  
15 childhood teachers, grocers, delivery workers and  
16 more to support the health and wellbeing of our  
17 fellow New Yorkers. The abhorrent rise in anti-Asian  
18 violence also exacerbates the devastating social,  
19 economic, and health impacts that have been brought  
20 on our community by COVID-19. This includes a 6,900  
21 percent increase in unemployment amongst the Asian  
22 American community and a 35.7 percent mortality rate  
23 among Chinese American New Yorkers, both of which are  
24 the highest rates in New York City. To address the  
25

1 root causes of racism and injustice, resources must  
2 be allocated to community-based organizations that  
3 have the trust and deep ties within our community to  
4 provide human services, healthcare, mental health  
5 support, and racial justice healing and literacy in a  
6 manner that is culturally accessible and language  
7 inclusive for our community members. We believe to  
8 address the longstanding racial inequities that have  
9 underwritten the rise in anti-Asian violence in this  
10 city, we need to expand funding to the AAPI community  
11 support initiative. We're asking for an expansion of  
12 six million dollars to fund critical programming  
13 including mental health support, hate crimes  
14 intervention work, gender-based violence intervention  
15 and prevention work, youth programming, racial  
16 literacy training and other culturally responsive  
17 services that are needed to build long-term safety,  
18 care and healing for our AAPI New Yorkers during this  
19 critical and painful time within our community. The  
20 AAPI Community Support Initiative was actually the  
21 first of its kind in New York City. It was passed  
22 last year at four million dollars, and it was able to  
23 fund 47 AAPI organizations who are able to reach our  
24 most vulnerable and often underserved community  
25

1 members through the power of culturally responsive  
2 and language accessible programming. We truly  
3 believe is not merely the absence of violence, but  
4 more so the presence of wellness, and we stand in  
5 solidarity with our neighbors to confront racism and  
6 injustice by addressing their root causes. We must  
7 continue to work together in solidarity with other  
8 communities of color, with immigrant communities,  
9 with LGBTQ community, and other marginalized  
10 community to firmly state that hate has no place in  
11 this city. we look forward to working closely with  
12 the City Council to ensure that New York's most  
13 vulnerable communities have the services and  
14 resources that they need to not only survive, but to  
15 thrive in these troubling times. Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you so  
18 much for your testimony. Next, we'll hear from Avi  
19 Posnick followed by Medha Ghosh, followed by Bernice  
20 Mach-- oh, Benice, apologize.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 AVI POSNICK: Thank you to Chair Hanks  
23 and Chair Williams for convening this important  
24 hearing. My name is Avi Posnick and I'm the  
25 northeast [inaudible] an international organization

1 that's educating [inaudible] students and communities  
2 to combat anti-Semitism and hate. As was mentioned  
3 by a number of panelists, we have seen [inaudible]  
4 crimes in New York City at an all-time high.  
5 However, hate is also being directed at the leaders  
6 of tomorrow, our students. On the college campuses,  
7 high schools, and even middle schools, Jewish  
8 students are bullied and targeted because of their  
9 Jewish identity. We have seen swastikas and other  
10 derogatory images drawn on bathroom walls, carved  
11 into [inaudible], etcetera. In some cases, school  
12 administrations condemned these actions and called  
13 them out for what they were, and brought in the  
14 police to investigate. In some cases, however, the  
15 Administration tried to downplay these incidents  
16 [inaudible] pressure on them to do so. I can  
17 [inaudible] incidents that have been here in New  
18 York, and the numbers, but I will suggest some  
19 concrete actions. One, to properly defeat anti-  
20 Semitism, we must have a clear definition of what  
21 modern day anti-Semitism is. Like when [inaudible]  
22 there are more [inaudible] and others that are not  
23 [inaudible]. Like a vi-- because a virus mutates, so  
24 do manifestations of anti-Semitism. Number two, we  
25

1 must provide more education to our young people.

2 Every school in New York City should be required to  
3 have more, not just education about anti-Semitism,  
4 racism, and hate, but what can be done to combat it.  
5

6 Our students must be educated and empowered  
7 [inaudible] anti-Semitism and hate of any kind.

8 Three, we must reach out to communities that have

9 [inaudible] by hate, listen to each other, build

10 [inaudible] and community-based solutions [inaudible]

11 and what is needed locally as we did just last week

12 in Queens with the Office of Prevention of Crimes and

13 others. One group cannot fight anti-Semitism,

14 discrimination, and hate alone. Finally, as

15 Holocaust Remembrance Day was observed last week, we

16 should be sure all of our schools are teaching the

17 Holocaust to ensure we learn its lessons. The

18 education should not only [inaudible] anti-Semitism

19 as it [inaudible] 42 [sic], but how it manifests

20 itself in 2022. As [inaudible] declared Holocaust

21 denial as the new variant of anti-Semitism. Thank you

22 to the Council Members who sponsored Resolution

23 number 14 calling on the New York Legislature to pass

24 and the Governor to sign S121-A and A472-A

25 authorizing the Commissioner of Education to conduct

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

155

3 a study regarding course of study on the Holocaust  
4 within the state. Now, this resolution to be  
5 unanimously passed by the full Council. [inaudible]  
6 Council, policy makers, and local communities on  
7 these recommendations and others so that we can stand  
8 together against anti-Semitism, discrimination, and  
9 hate. Thank you very much.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
11 your testimony, Avi. Next we'll hear from Medha  
12 Ghosh followed by Benice Mach, Jennifer Diaz, and  
13 Tydie Abreu.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 MEDHA GHOSH: Good afternoon. My name is  
16 Medha Ghosh and I'm a Health Policy Coordinator at  
17 CACF, the Coalition for Asian-American Children and  
18 Families. Thank you very much, Chair Williams and  
19 Chair Hanks for holding this hearing and providing  
20 this opportunity to testify. Founded in 1986, CACF  
21 is the nation's only Pan-Asian children and families  
22 advocacy organizations and leads the fight for  
23 improved and equitable policies, systems, funding,  
24 and services support those in need. CACF believes  
25 safety is the presence of wellness and not just the  
absence of crime. The criminal justice system does

1 not and cannot address the wellbeing of our community  
2 members. The City must stop using the criminal  
3 justice system to address social and economic issues.  
4 Violence is a public health problem requiring public  
5 health solutions. We urge the City Council to invest  
6 in community-based solutions. More than ever we need  
7 culturally responsive and linguistically accessible  
8 mental health services to ensure the needs of our  
9 communities are being met. The rise of anti-Asian  
10 hate coupled with the COVID-19 pandemic is  
11 intensified by mental health issues of the AAPI  
12 community and NYC, causing an even higher demand for  
13 mental health services. Despite this increased  
14 demand, there is still a lack of access at those  
15 services because of language barriers and an absence  
16 of culturally responsive care. AAPI's have the  
17 highest rate of linguistic isolation of any group in  
18 NYC. There's a lack of understanding including data  
19 and research of AAPI' lived experiences, needs,  
20 strengths, healing practices and knowledge around  
21 mental health. With all these unique challenges, the  
22 City must address the diverse mental health needs of  
23 the AAPI community. this past April, CACF and Council  
24 Member Linda Lee co-hosted a community convening with  
25

1 planning [sic] support from the NY Coalition for  
2 Asian American Mental Health to discuss the mental  
3 health issues impacting our AAPI chest and strategize  
4 community-centered solutions to address them. Our  
5 findings from this convening show that poverty and  
6 decreased insurance coverage exacerbates difficulties  
7 many New York City's AAPI community experiences  
8 seeking mental healthcare. There's also a major need  
9 of integrated services and supports. Given the  
10 interaction between poverty and mental wellbeing.  
11 Further supports and findings should funneled to  
12 CBOs, many of which only have established  
13 longitudinal relationships with the communities they  
14 serve, but also provide social services, community  
15 building opportunities and other holistic forms of  
16 care. Fostering community cohesion and developing  
17 more accessible community-based services may  
18 encourage individuals to seek out mental health  
19 support earlier before involving the police. Our  
20 communities recover and healing must be rooted in the  
21 life-affirming services provided by community-based  
22 organizations who are often the safety nets for AAPI  
23 New Yorkers. The CBOs have built trust with our  
24 diverse communities, a direct line of communication  
25

1 to our constituents, hired employees, thousands from  
2 within with the community, and have the knowledge and  
3 understanding of our communities heal [sic].

4 Community-focused investments must be prioritized in  
5 the pursuit of an equitable recovery and brighter  
6 future for all New Yorkers. investing in AAPI-led  
7 and serving CBOs is a critical step towards  
8 actualizing this goal by addressing the root causes  
9 of anti-Asian racial bias and supporting inclusive  
10 community healing for all. The City must invest in  
11 healing-centered solutions to address the root causes  
12 of anti-Asian racism and hate. There is growing  
13 recognition that we should implement evidence-based  
14 public health approaches to violence and public  
15 safety overall. Investing in AAPI and all  
16 marginalized community's quality of life by improving  
17 access to culture and linguistic responsive  
18 healthcare, education, affordable housing, and well-  
19 paying jobs centers our community's healing and  
20 ability to feel safe and cared for all. Thank you.

21  
22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
23 your testimony. Next, we'll hear from Benice Mach  
24 followed by Jennifer Diaz, Tydie Abreu, and then Ravi  
25 Reddi.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

159

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

4 BENICE MACH: Good afternoon. Good  
5 afternoon Chairs and committee members. My name is  
6 Benice Mach and I am the Project Coordinator at the  
7 Chinese-American Planning Council. CPC is the  
8 largest Asian-American social service organization  
9 and the newest [sic] where we provide vital resources  
10 to 125,000 people every year through more than 50  
11 programs, 30 sites, specifically within Manhattan,  
12 Brooklyn, and Queens. We also employ over 700 staff  
13 that provide comprehensive services that are  
14 linguistically accessible, culturally sensitive, and  
15 highly effective in reaching low-income and immigrant  
16 individuals and families. With the ongoing COVID-19  
17 pandemic, AAPI hate crimes have surged more than 339  
18 percent nationwide last year, with NYC surpassing its  
19 2020 hate crimes rate. CPC's community members have  
20 increasingly mentioned their fear of simply going  
21 outside and the need for community safety overall.  
22 While some of our community members may call for more  
23 policing, many of them also know that increased  
24 policing does not necessarily equal safer cities or  
25 decreased crime rates. If anything, severe mental  
health symptoms and poverty are unjustly

1 criminalized, specifically in black communities and  
2 other communities of color. New York City must  
3 address persistent disparities in access to health  
4 and mental health services amongst our most  
5 vulnerable communities. CPC urges the City Council  
6 to invest in preventative safety measures and address  
7 root causes such as housing and education for our  
8 communities instead of increased policing and  
9 incarceration. Investing in our communities is  
10 healthcare justice and will open up the conversation  
11 for increased mental health access and decrease the  
12 stigma in our communities. Community-based  
13 organizations are best situated to offer long-term  
14 solutions and more direct community engagement to  
15 address and prevent hate violence. The City must  
16 expand funding for CBOs working in the chest like the  
17 NYC Against Hate Coalition, which includes a diverse  
18 groups of organizations representing communities  
19 across the City to coordinate responses to incidents  
20 of hate violence and equip New Yorkers with tools to  
21 address harassment in public spaces. Specifically,  
22 the City must increase funding for the AAPI Community  
23 Support Initiative to six million to directly support  
24 AAPI-led and serving organizations who offer critical  
25

1 programming to our AAPI communities including direct  
2 services, mental health support, youth programs,  
3 racial literacy, and other culturally competent  
4 services which work to more comprehensively address  
5 the causes and effects of hate violence. Non-  
6 policing approaches to hate violence through the  
7 Office of the Prevention of Hate Crimes, Partner's  
8 Against the Hate initiative, must also be fully  
9 funded to 10 million with a renewal at the same  
10 grantee cohort. As our communities face increased  
11 hate violence and harassment, it is more critical  
12 than ever to ensure that we are providing community  
13 members all over the city with the resources and  
14 support necessary to be safe and find healing. The  
15 City alongside community partners--

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
18 expired.

19 BENICE MACH: must expand the approach to  
20 preventing and addressing hate through non-carceral  
21 methods and match those new ideas with the political  
22 will to support them. CPC appreciates the  
23 opportunity to testify on these issues that so  
24 greatly impact the communities we serve and look  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

162

2 forward to working with you all on them as well.

3 Thank you.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
5 your testimony. Next we'll hear from Jennifer Diaz,  
6 followed by Tydie Abreu, Ravi Reddi, and Wes Rixon.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

8 JENNIFER DIAZ: Hi, good afternoon. My  
9 name is Jennifer Diaz and I'm the manager of  
10 Community Engagement at the New York Immigration  
11 Coalition. Now more than ever we need a strategic  
12 approach that responds to the varied experiences of  
13 New Yorkers in order to effectively identify,  
14 prevent, and report hate crimes. The NYIC hopes that  
15 members of this council will support budget  
16 initiatives that will not only target support to  
17 specific affected communities, but also show that  
18 hate and the violence that manifest because of that  
19 hate isn't just a problem of the targeted  
20 communities. It isn't just an Asian problem, a  
21 Jewish problem, a Muslim problem, a Sikh problem.  
22 It's an all of us problem. We urge the Council to  
23 support the Hate Crimes Prevention Initiative and  
24 commit one million dollars towards it. As a convener  
25 [sic] with trusted relationships with immigrant

1 communities and immigrant serving agencies, the  
2 NYIC's roles in the Hate Crimes Prevention Initiative  
3 is needed as a thought partner, community educator,  
4 and trainer for service providers. Our Know Your  
5 Rights workshops educate the public about protection  
6 measures and legal rights for hate crime victims with  
7 specialized resources in the top languages. With New  
8 York City Council funding, the NYIC will continue to  
9 equip our communities and service providers with the  
10 tools to identify, prevent, and report hate crimes.  
11 The NYIC also implores this council to provide six  
12 million dollars to the much-needed [inaudible]  
13 Community support Initiative. This would support  
14 organizations like our member org Asian American  
15 Federation and their Hope Against Hate Campaign.  
16 This would provide funding to Asian-led, Asian-  
17 serving orgs to fund anti-violence and community-  
18 centered, and community-demanded programming. The  
19 Stop AAPI [sic] Hate platform collected over 9,000  
20 reports of anti-Asian incidents from March 2020 to  
21 June 2021 from all 50 states as well as D.C. In New  
22 York City there were more than 2,170 incidents  
23 reported by Asian American Federation, Stop AAPI  
24 Hate, NYPD, and CCHR. Only a fraction of which were  
25

1 reported to the NYPD. These bias normal are  
2 significantly under-reported, as 70 percent of Asian  
3 New Yorkers are immigrants and systemic factors like  
4 high rates of poverty, limited English proficiency,  
5 and lack of immigration status deter reporting and  
6 reinforce continued systemic inequities. And lastly,  
7 we must address the NYPD's nearly 10 billion dollar  
8 budget, an over-bloated budget that is larger than  
9 what NYC spent on health, homeless services, youth  
10 development, and workforce development combined. We  
11 understand the inclination to increase this budget to  
12 help combat the current level of hate-based crimes,  
13 but we believe if 10 billion dollars isn't enough,  
14 then it doesn't matter how much money you give the  
15 NYPD, because ultimately policing isn't the solution.  
16 We support a dramatic reduction of funding for the  
17 NYPD. Those funds should be reinvested in long-  
18 ignored and underfunded communities for healthcare,  
19 education, and housing initiatives. Once again,  
20 thank you for convening this extremely important  
21 hearing and allowing me to testify.

22  
23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you so much for  
24 your testimony, Jennifer. Next we'll hear from Tydie  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

165

3 Abreu followed by Ravi Reddi, Wes Rixon, and Gerard  
4 Filitti.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 TYDIE ABREU: Thank you, Chair Williams,  
7 Chair Hanks, and all other committee members for the  
8 opportunity to provide testimony. My name is Tydie  
9 Abreu, and I'm the Director of Policy and Social  
10 Impact for the Hispanic Federation, a nonprofit  
11 organization seeking to empower and advance the  
12 Hispanic community, support Hispanic families and  
13 strengthen Latino institutions through direct service  
14 programs and legislative advocacy. We're proud and  
15 honored to be a part of the Partners Against Hate,  
16 Path Forward Initiative to combat hate crimes. With  
17 the City's leadership and support, we give assistance  
18 and create safer communities for everyone who calls  
19 New York City home. Now more than ever, City Council  
20 and the Mayoral Administration must expand response  
21 plans to address the current rise in hate crimes.  
22 With the increased violence towards immigration and  
23 especially the Asian American community, the City  
24 must divert additional funds to city initiatives like  
25 the Hate Crimes Taskforce and the Office for the  
Prevention of Hate Crimes. Additional investments

1 will enable city agencies to work together to-- to  
2 work closer together to further coordinate effective  
3 responses to bias-based crime, provide robust  
4 services for victims and respond to community  
5 concerns about hate incidents and discrimination  
6 complaints. We also wanted to share preliminary  
7 results of the survey Hispanic Federation conducted  
8 of Spanish-speaking residents for the New York City  
9 Office of Prevention of Hate Crimes to better  
10 understand how to get information to victims of hate  
11 crimes and also understand what resources they are  
12 aware are available to them. We ask respondents what  
13 would be the best way to combat hate crimes and  
14 situations of discrimination. Twenty-four percent  
15 said community workshops and Know Your Rights events,  
16 16 percent having information available at local  
17 community centers, 15 percent said public information  
18 campaigns, 15 percent said more police presences, and  
19 finally 14 percent said providing information through  
20 the media such as social networks, radio and  
21 television. The result of this survey provide a  
22 snapshot of ways to strengthen efforts to address  
23 hate crimes, discriminatory behavior and bias-based  
24 profiling across New York City. Intentional  
25

1 marketing efforts would help to more widely  
2 disseminate educational information and ensuring this  
3 information is linguistically acceptable. Widespread  
4 marketing will also ease the minds of those that are  
5 reluctant to engage with authorities due to their  
6 immigration status. There's an urgent need for  
7 culturally and linguistically diverse public  
8 information campaigns for two reasons. One, to ensure  
9 undocumented individuals feel comfortable reporting  
10 discrimination or hate crimes. They have other  
11 experienced or witnessed. And two, to ensure  
12 individuals know exactly who to report these  
13 incidents to in their communities. This is crucial  
14 because according to our survey, 42 percent of  
15 respondents do not know who to go to when reporting a  
16 hate crime. Additionally, 15 percent of respondents  
17 were unsure if they would be willing to report a hate  
18 crime to the police, and six percent--

19  
20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
21 expired.

22 TYDIE ABREU: And six percent said they  
23 would not. With a city as diverse as ours, we need  
24 to ensure everyone feels comfortable engaging with  
25 the police and other authorities if they have been

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

168

3 victims of discrimination or a hate crime. Thank you  
4 for listening to our testimony.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you so much for  
6 testifying. Next we'll hear from Ravi Reddi. Wes  
7 Rixon, Gerard Filitti, LoriKim Alexander, and Gobi  
8 Romo.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: starting time.

10 RAVI REDDI: I want to thank Chair Hanks,  
11 Chair Williams and the Council Members of the  
12 committees for holding this hearing. My name is Ravi  
13 Reddi, and I'm the Associate Director of Advocacy and  
14 Policy at the Asian American Federation where we  
15 represent the collective voice of more than 70 member  
16 nonprofits serving 1.5 million Asian New Yorkers.  
17 We're also thankful for our partners like the  
18 Hispanic Federation and JFREJ. As Jennifer from  
19 another one of our partners NYC mentioned, thousands  
20 of cases have been reported of bias incidents and yet  
21 thy still represent significant under-reporting  
22 because of high rates of poverty, limited English  
23 Proficiency and lack of immigration status, deterring  
24 reporting and reinforcing continued systemic  
25 inequities. A recent survey conducted by AAF of  
Asian small business owners showed that over 60

1 percent of respondents said they were worried about  
2 anti-Asian bias and hate crimes for the safety of  
3 themselves, their staff, and their establishment.  
4 And the recent violent killings of Asian-American  
5 women, and the almost daily physical assaults are  
6 deepening the crisis in our community on multiple  
7 fronts. We're also here because our most vulnerable,  
8 our seniors, are heavily targeted by anti-Asian  
9 violence. As we mourn the recent death of several  
10 Asian seniors, many of our seniors continue to be  
11 anxious, fearful, and on high alert. In the spree of  
12 seven anti-Asian attacks mentioned earlier, the first  
13 woman attacked was a 57-year-old Chinese American  
14 woman. The City needs to invest in community-based  
15 safety measures like those being implemented by  
16 organizations participating in our Hope Against Hate  
17 campaign to provide an immediate response to street  
18 violence and support the coordination and rollout of  
19 initiatives like a Safety Ambassador program to  
20 escort vulnerable Asian immigrants in public spaces,  
21 training volunteers in de-escalation strategies, and  
22 you know, creating a safe [inaudible] in our  
23 neighborhoods. From the creation of safety pamphlets  
24 and e-resources, continued robust community  
25

1 engagement on self-defense and upstander trainings is  
2 community members who trust them first. Our CBOs are  
3 doing the work, and our City needs to support them as  
4 they lead by example. The City's approach to public  
5 safety must also consider how to help victims heal  
6 from traumatic events. We're asking the City to fund  
7 recovery services in Asian languages to help victims  
8 heal from their attacks, including providing access  
9 to victim compensation funds, and supporting a  
10 network of Asian CBOs that can provide mental health  
11 support, legal services, and other supportive  
12 services. Furthermore, we must support programs that  
13 increase access to mental health services for all  
14 communities since perpetrators themselves may have  
15 and often do have mental illness and need services so  
16 as not to further harm others and themselves. Our  
17 recommendations real quick. Our ask is simple, that  
18 our nonprofit be provided enough resources to  
19 implement and expand essential services to support  
20 the public safety and mental health needs of our  
21 diverse community. That comes from increasing  
22 funding to Asian-led, Asian-serving organizations to  
23 centralize reporting of incidents in order to connect  
24 victims to services they need. And we're also  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

171

1 calling on City Council to increase funding for the  
2 AAPI Community Support Initiative to the tune of six  
3 million dollars in order to sustain and expand direct  
4 services that are seeing increased demand, as well as  
5 fund critical anti-violence programming in our Hope  
6 Against Hate Campaign. Third, expand funding to  
7 include culturally competent in language and senior-  
8 focused non-traditional mental health service models.  
9 This includes prioritizing CBOs that have a history  
10 of providing free or subsidized non-traditionally  
11 culturally competent services for funding  
12 opportunities. And lastly, support recovery services  
13 in Asian languages to help victims heal from the  
14 trauma an increase access to mental health services  
15 for all communities to reduce violence. We look  
16 forward to working together with City Council and  
17 members of the committee to restore a sense of safety  
18 in our community by prioritizing their needs and the  
19 service providers they depend on. Also, a special  
20 shout out to Josh for just helping us navigate this.

21  
22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thanks. Thanks,  
23 Ravi. Thank you for your testimony. Next we'll hear  
24 from Wes Rixon, Gerard Filitti, followed by LoriKim  
25 Alexander.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

172

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

4 WES RIXON: Okay, cool. Good afternoon  
5 everyone. Thank you to Chair Hanks and Chair  
6 Williams for putting together this oversight hearing  
7 on hate crimes. It's been a little bit overdo. I'm  
8 Wes. I use she/her pronouns and I'm here with  
9 support of and in support AVP, the New York Anti-  
10 Violence Project. In my time that I've been working  
11 with AVP I've been kind of an auxiliary member. I'm  
12 not an official employee of AVP, but I've attended,  
13 witnessed and co-facilitated multiple think pools,  
14 social awareness and action workshops as well as City  
15 Council hearings with the intentions of organizing  
16 and demanding for safe spaces for survivors of hate  
17 violence via hate based on race, gender identity,  
18 sexual orientation, religion, mental health status,  
19 financial status, profession, the list really goes  
20 on. It gets pretty deep. For over 40 years, AVP has  
21 had a mission to offer direct services as well as  
22 advocate for New York's LGBTQ and HIV/AIDS-- sorry,  
23 HIV-affected communities. In my time working with  
24 AVP, I've worked with people from many different  
25 walks of life, and it's very clear that we are the  
people that we're aiming to help. Oh my gosh, I'm so

1  
2 sorry. I've been able to take facts, resources, and  
3 methodologies that I've learned back to members of my  
4 own community, and I know that I wouldn't have been  
5 able to run into these resources if it wasn't for  
6 this nonprofit itself, AVP. This has definitely  
7 directly influenced my belief that a more holistic  
8 approach to hate crime prevention is what's needed to  
9 reach the corners of our communities in New York  
10 City. The most recent workshop I was a part of was  
11 centered around up-stander intervention, awareness  
12 and safety. I did hear way earlier in the beginning  
13 of this hearing some folks talk about bystander  
14 workshops that were available weekly, and this is--  
15 you know, this is something that's great to hear.  
16 This is something that I hadn't heard about before I  
17 started working with AVP. One thing that I pulled  
18 from that workshop that kind of stuck with me was the  
19 idea of being an upstander versus a bystander,  
20 meaning equipping people in the-- like civilians with  
21 the tools to help prevent things from getting out of  
22 hand. So it goes kind of into the underbelly which  
23 is something that I feel got really-- sorry--  
24 addressed pretty hard here. This intensive was meant  
25 to affect mobilization, sort of like if you see

1 something and it's safe to do so, go ahead and say  
2 something. Pull apart and event [sic] and find where  
3 you can prevent escalation or protect a victim or  
4 support a survivor. And these tools in the hand of  
5 community members is a level of prevention that does  
6 need to be utilized and funded for more. We can be an  
7 avenue of a more non-carceral approach. LGBTQ--

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
10 expired.

11 WES RIXON: Finish out, is that cool?  
12 Thank you. LGBTQ, Black, indigenous, and other  
13 people of color are targeted for violent hate crimes  
14 at an extremely high rate in New York City. LGBTQ  
15 people who experience hate violence are most likely  
16 of any population to sustain injuries, and 95 percent  
17 of black, brown, and trans-- black and brown trans  
18 women and [inaudible] who were murdered in New York  
19 over the past couple of years have died by gun  
20 violence. The City needs to prioritize funding to  
21 support survivors and prevent, not-- sorry-- and  
22 prevention, not increase funding for law enforcement.  
23 In order for survivors to stay safe, we need housing,  
24 healthcare, education, [inaudible] security, and  
25 trauma-informed services, not a budget for sweeps on

1 homeless encampment or not a big plan to replace  
2 abusers as sick leave policy in order to make Rikers  
3 run better. Since the last hate crimes oversight  
4 hearing in November 2018, advocates have successfully  
5 pushed the City to fund the New York City Office for  
6 the Prevention of Hate Crimes, which was covered in-  
7 depth here. Hi guys. The creation and launch of  
8 OPHC is a very big step for New York and itself, and  
9 the sector of the Mayor's Office is not only dealing  
10 in data collection around hate crimes and violence,  
11 but also works with other initiative to provide  
12 education, preventative measures and restorative  
13 survivor support through many different community-  
14 based organizations as well as city agencies.  
15 However, while we along with our peers in the NYC  
16 Against Hate Coalition have advocated for both  
17 increased resources for hate violence prevention and  
18 divesting from the NYPD. To date, the foreseen NYC  
19 budget for 2023 is around 99.7 billion dollars with  
20 NYPD seeing a budget increase. The Anti-Violence  
21 Project is committed to working with the City and our  
22 communities to keep coming up with solutions of  
23 prevention and responding to hate violence and crimes  
24 that are centered in affected communities. For this  
25

1 commitment, we would like to see more funding where  
2 we believe that we could help or use it to help out.  
3 Thank you for the opportunity to let me tune in. you  
4 can learn more about AVP and its efforts at AVP.org,  
5 but I do have some colleagues here as well. So, be  
6 well everyone, and thank you.  
7

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you so  
9 much for your testimony.

10 WES RIXON: Thanks.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next we'll hear from  
12 Gerard Filitti followed by LoriKim Alexander, Gobi  
13 Romo, and Cheryl Fienbein-- or Fishbein, apologies.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 GERARD FILITTI: Good afternoon. My name  
16 is Gerard Filitti. I'm an Attorney and Senior Counsel  
17 at the Lawfare Project, a nonprofit that provide pro-  
18 bono legal services to protect and uphold the civil  
19 and human rights of the Jewish community. I'd like  
20 to thank Chair Hanks and Chair Williams for the  
21 opportunity to be here today as well as Council  
22 Member Vernikov. I'd specifically like to thank Chair  
23 Hanks in mentioning at the beginning that this is  
24 AAPI heritage month, and as a city it's crucially  
25 important that we are stronger together when we

1 recognize and respect our diversity. I'd also like  
2 to remind everyone that it's also Jewish American  
3 Heritage Month, so please give that a thought as  
4 well. In October 2000, shortly after we signed the  
5 bill introducing the penalties increased for hate  
6 crimes, then Governor George Pataki said that hate  
7 crimes are so inherently destructive to society that  
8 they deserve special consideration under the law.  
9 The Jewish community knows this very well. Looking at  
10 the victims between 2019 and 2022, the Jewish  
11 community was the group most targeted in bias crimes  
12 in New York City based on the number of arrests for  
13 NYPD's bias motive descriptors. As Scott Richman from  
14 the ADL testified, just last week the ADL reported  
15 that anti-Semitic attacks in New York increased by  
16 325 percent over the prior year. It's the highest  
17 number of anti-Semitic assaults on-record in New York  
18 State, and there were more anti-Semitic assaults in  
19 Brooklyn than anywhere else in America. Yet, as  
20 Council Member Holden and others have mentioned, only  
21 15 percent of hate crime arrests have resulted in  
22 hate crime convictions. This is particularly  
23 troubling and it highlights a gap between the  
24 rhetoric of punishing hate crimes and the harsh  
25

1 reality that appear few if any consequences for the  
2 people how commit them. We need better transparency  
3 on the status of this position of cases. We need  
4 accountability for why cases are or are not being  
5 prosecuted. Once a case goes from arrest into the  
6 judicial system, we often lose track of what happened  
7 and why, and as a result we can't help find a better  
8 solution to the problems that we face. For the  
9 Jewish community, it's specifically troubling. The  
10 root cause of anti-Semitic hate crimes is Jew hatred,  
11 which is a more accurate term for the systemic anti-  
12 Semitism that is propagated and perpetuated on a  
13 constant basis whether by white supremacists or  
14 supporters of the BDS movement that target Jewish  
15 people with discrimination and on occasion violence.  
16 We see it on the streets, in the workplace, on  
17 college campuses, and schools. We are deeply  
18 concerned with the normalization of Jew hate that  
19 occurs when our elected officials fail to speak up or  
20 take action, especially when you have violent  
21 rhetoric of globalizing the Antifada, which is  
22 globalizing violence against Jews, violent rhetoric  
23 that results in actual physical violence against the  
24 Jewish community. Just as we have multiple  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

179

3 investigations into the horrific violence of January  
4 6<sup>th</sup>, 2021, we need to hold accountable the people who  
5 instigate violence against the Jewish people, whether  
6 online or during protests in which hateful rhetoric  
7 reverberates in our city streets. Accountability  
8 starts with investigations and prosecution as well  
9 as--

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
11 expired.

12 GERARD FILITTI: [inaudible] nation by  
13 our elected officials. In closing, I wish you'd been  
14 able to hear today from our client Matt Greenman  
15 [sp?] who as the victim of a horrific assault less  
16 than two weeks ago. You need testimony from people  
17 like him who are brave enough to come forward and  
18 persist in getting their story out there, and in  
19 assuring that responsible parties are prosecuted and  
20 hold accountable for hate crime violations. Thank  
21 you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
23 your testimony. Next we'll hear from LoriKim  
24 Alexander, Gobi Romo, Cheryl Fishbein, Panthea Lee,  
25 and Mon Yuck Yu.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

180

2 LORIKIM ALEXANDER: Good afternoon and  
3 thank you Chair Hanks and Chair Williams for holding  
4 this oversight hearing. My name is LoriKim  
5 Alexander. My pronouns are she/her and we/our, and  
6 I'm a community organizer at the New York City Anti-  
7 Violence Project. I'm also a survivor of multiple  
8 forms of hate violence, including police violence.  
9 And you've already heard, AVP over 40 years old, and  
10 we have served the New York City's Lesbian, Gay,  
11 Bisexual, Transgender, Queer, and HIV-affected  
12 communities through direct service and advocacy. We  
13 are the only organization in New York City that  
14 provides free counseling and legal services and does  
15 advocacy with LGBTQIA+ survivors of hate violence.  
16 We collect data on hate violence based on calls,  
17 texts, and online reports made from LGBTQ New Yorkers  
18 to our 24/7 hotline. And you know, it's been three  
19 and a half years since the last hate crimes oversight  
20 hearing in November of 2019, and we are grateful that  
21 the City has made investments in community-based  
22 efforts to prevent hate crimes, but members of our  
23 communities remain vulnerable to violence. As you  
24 heard Wes say, that we are an act [sic] organization  
25 as part of the Path Forward initiative that launched

1 funding resources in 2021. However, while we along  
2 with our peers in NYC Against Hate Coalition have  
3 advocated for both increased resources for hat  
4 violence prevention and divesting from NYPD. The  
5 budget for carceral sponsors [sic] has continued to  
6 climb, and again, as you heard, LGBTQ survivors of  
7 hate violence and the population-- are the population  
8 most likely to sustain injuries during attack. That  
9 said, the number that was read out earlier by the  
10 NYPD Hate Crimes Taskforce, those numbers are  
11 inaccurate. LGBTQ survivors are less likely and  
12 often cannot report to the police due to in large  
13 part to police violence. They're reporting to  
14 trusted community organizations like us and are  
15 getting services from us. But again, more direct  
16 funding and services is needed for survivors  
17 directly, just to get their basic needs met. Just so  
18 you know, that in general, trans and gender expansive  
19 folks have reported sexual and other assaults from  
20 police while in custody, and on the streets are  
21 harassed or dismissed when reporting violence, and  
22 these numbers more than double when it comes to black  
23 trans and gender expansive people. Just yesterday,  
24 we saw proof that NYPD do not keep us safe. There  
25

1 were multiple arrests of black Muslims during an  
2 [inaudible], and the NYPD were brutal, and we do know  
3 that black folks are disproportionately experiencing  
4 hate violence at the hands of the NYPD. Black Muslim  
5 folks--  
6

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
8 expired.

9 LORIKIM ALEXANDER: black Trans folks and  
10 other of our intersectional identities need the  
11 support. Black and Latinx survivors tell me that  
12 they're not going to the police because of this  
13 harassment and discrimination and assault. I have  
14 also experienced some of this firsthand. Police  
15 routinely respond after violence has occurred and any  
16 prophylactic where policing is involved are woefully  
17 ill suited to deal with the issues of LGBTQ+  
18 survivors and victims, and very often again there's  
19 more violence due to racism. There will be more  
20 information in my written testimony, but I want to  
21 say here that AVP along with the NYC Against Hate  
22 conducted bystander interventions at about 50  
23 locations around the city before the pandemic. That  
24 provided training to hundreds of New Yorkers, and AVP  
25 is still continuing that upstander training. We have

1 trained hundreds more now during a pandemic. Our  
2 current upstander framework aims to equip folks in  
3 the city with the tools that they need to safely  
4 assess [inaudible] and provide a community-focused  
5 response to all forms of hate violence. That training  
6 is trauma-informed. It is survivor-centered, and it  
7 helps participants to work their way through thinking  
8 about anti-blackness, homophobia, transphobia,  
9 ableism, racism, and sexism, and how that we can  
10 effectively show up for each other despite all of  
11 that. This is one of the ways we see community  
12 safety as a proper and direct response to violence in  
13 New York City, and there are also facts-- this is  
14 also our after the fact response in terms of  
15 collecting data and things like that. But our  
16 upstander training and providing information about  
17 our resources, canvassing in areas of hate violence.  
18 That's our before the fact work that we're doing. So  
19 this work is vital and more funding is necessarily--  
20 necessary for these initiatives that are being done  
21 by organizations like ours. Thank you so much for  
22 the time.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you so much for  
25 your testimony. Next we'll hear from Gobi Romo,

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

184

3 Cheryl Fishbein, Panthea Lee [sp?], Mon Yuck Yu, and  
4 Jeffrey Lax.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: starting time.

6 GOBI ROMO: Good afternoon Chairs Hanks  
7 and Williams. My name is Gobi Romo, they/she  
8 pronouns, and I'm a community organizer at the New  
9 York City Anti-Violence Project. We work with  
10 community members who are among the most marginalized  
11 and vulnerable in this city and who have become more  
12 so during the pandemic. This includes LGBTQ and HIV-  
13 affected immigrant survivors of violence, black and  
14 indigenous people of color, trans, and gender non-  
15 conforming people, and people in the sex trades, all  
16 who are facing greater economic and housing  
17 insecurity, the devastation of the pandemic, and in  
18 some communities, increased threats of hate violence  
19 and other forms of violence. During times of crisis,  
20 political and economic instability and many forms of  
21 violence increase. 2021 was the deadliest year on  
22 record for trans and gender non-conforming people,  
23 surpassing 2020 numbers, both pandemic years with  
24 record rates of hate violence that hit marginalized  
25 communities of color harder in every way possible.  
The City has historically overemphasized policing,

1 the NYPD Hate Crimes Taskforce and prosecutions to  
2 address hate violence which are ineffective  
3 strategies at preventing violence and do not heal  
4 communities. LGBTQ survivors of hate violence often  
5 do not or cannot go to the polices, which means in a  
6 system where most reporting and resources for  
7 survivors is tied to policing and prosecution, there  
8 is under-reporting and survivors of violence are left  
9 without any support or access to important services  
10 and resources. This is why community-based approaches  
11 to safety are so important. Right now, the work of  
12 AVP and community-based organizations and the NYC  
13 Against Hate Coalition is more important than ever.  
14 AVP's work and hotline provide an important lifeline,  
15 an alternative for survivors who cannot or will not  
16 go to the police. We support survivors in the midst  
17 of crisis and in the aftermath of violence. Our  
18 upstander intervention trainings, engagement with  
19 small businesses, and local electeds and community  
20 canvassing days aim to prevent hate violence by  
21 mobilizing communities to root out violence. But  
22 community-based organizations like AVP are woefully  
23 underfunded to do this work. The Mayor should  
24 increase funding for the Path Forward Program to 10  
25

1 million dollars, directed to the same anchor  
2 organizations so they can build on the program's  
3 successes. The City Council should also expand the  
4 Hate Crimes Prevention Initiative which provides  
5 resources to community-based organizations to engage  
6 in culturally competent hate violence prevention and  
7 education, from 1.7 million dollars to 5 million  
8 dollars in Fiscal Year 23. Both of these funding  
9 streams support AVP and allied organizations in doing  
10 the community work that creates safer communities and  
11 supports survivors of violence. We appreciate past  
12 support and look forward to working with you to build  
13 a new, more equitable future. Thank you.

14  
15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you so much for  
16 your testimony. Next we'll hear from Cheryl Fishbein  
17 followed by Panthea Lee, Mon Yuck Yu, Jeffrey Lax,  
18 and Elyse Buxbaum.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 CHERYL FISHBEIN: Good afternoon. I'm  
21 Cheryl Fishbein. I'm President of the Jewish  
22 Community Relations Council of New York.  
23 Approximately 6:30 p.m. on April 20<sup>th</sup>, 2022, at the  
24 corner of Lexington Avenue and 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, a Jewish  
25 male was assaulted by anti-Israel protestors. Video

1 footage of the assault was posted to social media.

2  
3 IN May 2021, it was a spike in anti-Semitic hate  
4 crimes concurrent with events in Israel. In 2014, we  
5 noted a doubling of possible anti-Semitic hate crimes  
6 following the same pattern. Events in Israel spun  
7 attacks against Jews in New York. We're concerned  
8 when events abroad spawn hate and violence here in  
9 New York. The NYPD Hate Crimes Dashboard shows that  
10 anti-Semitic hate crimes increased 279 percent for  
11 the first quarter of 2022 compared to 2021. Hate is  
12 up. In general, anti-Asian hate crimes increased in  
13 [inaudible] 223 percent, and Jews and Asians total  
14 105 of the 142 reported hate crimes in New York City.  
15 We at the JCRC New York believe that one hate crime  
16 is too many. We condemn those who commit them and  
17 urge that they be prosecuted to the full extent of  
18 the law. We laud the NYPD and the Hate Crimes  
19 Taskforce for its ongoing serious response to all  
20 reported hate crimes. Two years ago, UJA Federation  
21 of New York and JCRC of New York partnered to form  
22 the Community Security Initiative. Our talented team  
23 works closely with Jewish communities throughout New  
24 York City. Two of our most important roles is to  
25 ensure that when there is a possible hate crime it is

1 reported to the NYPD, and that any appropriate  
2 incident is investigated as a possible hate crime.  
3 We note that a large portion of the violent hate  
4 crimes against Jews result in arrests. It is  
5 frustrating that only a portion of these cases result  
6 in convictions. We also commend New York City's  
7 Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes, OPHC, for  
8 its Path Forward Program. This was mentioned earlier  
9 today. JCRC New York is dedicated to meeting the  
10 complex threat and challenges of hate and anti-  
11 Semitism in our city and its neighborhood. As one of  
12 the six anchor agencies in the Path Forward Program,  
13 JCRC New York has made 17 grants amounting to 300,000  
14 dollars to a broad array of Jewish community-based  
15 agencies across the city to develop--

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
18 expired.

19 CHERYL FISHBEIN: implement initiatives  
20 designated to meet the complex challenges of anti-  
21 Semitism and hate in New York's neighborhoods.  
22 Unfortunately people hate for so many reasons, and we  
23 understand that combatting hate in our city requires  
24 a multipronged effort, countering every poisonous  
25 species of hate, and comprises law enforcement

1 education and community organizing. Thwarting hate is  
2 hard, but with appropriate resources and good will  
3 across the spectrum and solid teamwork, we can make  
4 substantial progress. Thank you for this  
5 opportunity.  
6

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Cheryl, thank you so  
8 much for your testimony. Next, we'll hear from  
9 Panthea Lee, Mon Yuck Yu, Jeffrey Lax, Elyse Buxbaum.  
10 Yeah, Panthea, you may go ahead.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 PANTHEA LEE: Thank you. Good afternoon  
13 Chairs Hanks and Williams and committee Council  
14 Members. It is an honor to be with you today. My  
15 name is Panthea Lee, and I am a New York City-based  
16 journalist and social justice [inaudible] cultural  
17 scholars, forensic psychiatrist and public defenders,  
18 and I wish to offer some broader context. What I  
19 want to remind us of today is that despite rhetoric  
20 about the recent surge of anti-Asian violence, there  
21 is a long history of institutionalized violence  
22 against Asian communities by the US state and in this  
23 country. The line from America's earliest empire in  
24 the Philippines through wars in Japan, Korea, and  
25 Vietnam, and now to the surge of anti-Asian violence

1 here across the country and in New York City is  
2 straight, clear, and written in blood. But by in  
3 large, we are taking a historical approach, which  
4 means we are misdiagnosing the problem and often  
5 applying the wrong solutions. Despite this long  
6 history, officials have treated, often times, these  
7 attacks as isolated incidents. When asked for  
8 comment about Christina Yuna Lee [sp?] tragic murder,  
9 Mayor Adams replied that the city must do more to  
10 address mental illness. The message, these attacks  
11 are strange coincidences, the attacks of mentally ill  
12 people. So we'll just lock them up, put them away.  
13 But mental illness is a red herring. Treating  
14 perpetrators as aberrations, as bizarre deviants from  
15 the norm, misses the point. Mental illness operates  
16 within specific cultural context and our government  
17 has a lot of responsibility. Marshal Simon [sp?],  
18 the man who pushed Alyssa Goh [sp?] to her death had  
19 been in and out of hospitals for years. The New York  
20 Times found that in 2017, a psychiatrist at a state  
21 mental institution noted that Mr. Simon had said it  
22 was just a matter of time before he would push a  
23 woman onto train tracks. Despite this, he was still  
24 discharged. So, who is to blame? The mentally ill  
25

1 or the system that should be taking care of them.

2 Asian communities, we do not want our trauma

3 exploited and politicized, used to advance carceral

4 solutions. There's fear mongering that some law

5 enforcement officials and politicians are doing

6 because it helps police agencies get more money. We

7 need to address-- we need to not just address the

8 crimes, we need to address the systemic inequality

9 that is producing crime. For justice is more than

10 just prosecution and policing prisons, justice is

11 transforming our system and our condition so that

12 we'll stop violence altogether. And this is what I

13 respectfully ask of the Committee on Civil and Human

14 Rights and the Committee on Public Safety. The

15 abolitionist organizer, Miriam Okaba [sp?] asked us

16 to think when you say, "What would we do without

17 prisons?" What you are reality saying is, "What

18 would we do without civil death, exploitation, and

19 state sanctioned violence?" Asian communities are

20 hurting right now, but we don't want our trauma to be

21 exploited and politicized to drive further divisions

22 between us and other marginalized communities.

23 Justice is more--

24  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

192

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
4 expired.

5 PANTHEA LEE: [inaudible] for AAPI  
6 history and cultural education. It is more serious  
7 consideration and investment in restorative justice  
8 approaches to crime, and it is more resources for  
9 affordable housing, healthcare, mental health  
10 support, and social services. We keep us safe.  
11 Justice is creating resources for collective care.  
12 Thank you so much for your time.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for  
14 your testimony. Next we'll hear from Mon Yuck Yu  
15 followed by Jeffrey Lax.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

17 MON YUCK YU: Good afternoon. My name is  
18 Mon Yuck Yu, Co-founder of the Academy of Medical and  
19 Public Health Services, or AMPHS. Thank you Chair  
20 Hanks and Chair Williams for the opportunity to  
21 testify. AMPHS is a not-for-profit public health  
22 organization in Sunset Park, primarily Chinese and  
23 Latino community. Their work is to bridge a health  
24 equity gap among communities of color through  
25 individualized health education, social services, and  
preventative health services to immigrant populations

1 of New York City free of cost and regardless of  
2 immigration status, serving over 15,000 community  
3 members annually. Over the past two years much of  
4 our work has included addressing rising anti-Asian  
5 hate crimes against our community. Our Asian  
6 communities are feeling the stress of racism and  
7 harassment every day when they ride the subway going  
8 to work. There is 339 percent spike in anti-Asian  
9 hate crimes nationwide since last year, with many  
10 more cases going unreported. Sunset Park is a  
11 neighborhood with the highest reported rates of hate  
12 crimes among [inaudible] across New York City. And  
13 just three weeks ago, our community was victims of  
14 the April 12<sup>th</sup> subway shooting. While we are  
15 uncertain whether this incident was racially  
16 motivated, what we do know is that nearly all the  
17 victims were working class immigrants. We have  
18 organized healing circles and a victim support fund.  
19 Yet, the community is still reeling from the direct  
20 and vicarious trauma of this tragedy and hate crimes  
21 that continue day after day. Our community lives in  
22 fear that one day where their loved ones go to school  
23 or visit a doctor, they may not return. Seniors are  
24 afraid to leave their homes. Instead they live in  
25

1 solitude, sometimes even missing critical healthcare  
2 appointments, and there's an unspoken fear that they  
3 would be next. We would like to thank the City  
4 Council for its historical support of our funding  
5 through the AAPI Community Support Initiative and the  
6 Path Forward Initiative for our partner organization,  
7 Asian American Federation. We urge the City Council  
8 to continue and enhance funding for these initiatives  
9 to continue supporting this work, in addition to  
10 supporting more organizations, the Hate Crime  
11 Prevention Initiative. The initiative has loudly  
12 [sic] support our community safety programs where we  
13 offer free to short-term-- free, short to middle-term  
14 bilingual mental health counseling, support groups,  
15 social services, and self-defense classes, and  
16 upstander and bystander intervention workshops for  
17 our most vulnerable community members including women  
18 and seniors. There's currently a three-month waiting  
19 list for mental health services as community members  
20 continue to experience loss, isolation, and  
21 increasing anxieties. As a partner of AAF's Hope  
22 Against Hate campaign, we are providing community  
23 businesses with safe zone [sic] training so  
24 businesses can serve as safe spaces to help targeted  
25

1 individuals with immediate resources and reporting  
2 while also providing [inaudible] company met  
3 services, where volunteers are trained in bystander  
4 intervention, and accompany vulnerable residents to  
5 everyday activities. And finally, we're offering  
6 solidarity building to help our communities build  
7 mutual understanding to stand up for one another.  
8 Our community can only heal when our city can support  
9 us in doing so. AAPI's are now 18 percent of the  
10 City and growing, and we can no longer be  
11 invisiblized [sic]. We appreciate your support  
12 pertaining to this critical work, because we know  
13 that this public safety crisis will not end until we  
14 can come together as a community to actively prevent  
15 and address the violence that we're experiencing.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you.

18 Thank you so much for your testimony. Next, I see  
19 Council Member Cabán has her hand raised. Council  
20 Member Cabán, do you have a question for one of the  
21 panelists?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah, thank you.

23 Just a very, very brief comment. I know lots of folks  
24 have been just giving such powerful testimony, but I  
25 did want to highlight the testimony given by Panthea

1  
2 Lee and just encourage folks that are also here when  
3 we talk about getting to the roots of violence and  
4 really identifying the causes. I don't know, this is--  
5 - maybe it's a little bit inappropriate, but it would  
6 just implore folks in addition to exploring all of  
7 the testimony that's been given, but checking out the  
8 nation piece that they wrote called, Sex, Death, and  
9 Empire, the Roots of Violence Against Asian Women. I  
10 know I learned a lot and it would add a lot to this  
11 conversation as well, and I just want to thank all of  
12 the advocates that continue to tell their personal  
13 stories and share with us all on this really  
14 important issue and topic. So thanks.

15 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Can you send it  
16 to our offices, the test-- the report? Thank you,  
17 yeah, the report. Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you so much  
19 everyone. Next we will be hearing from-- bear with  
20 me for a second. Next we'll be hearing from Jeffrey  
21 Lax followed by Elyse Buxbaum.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time. You're  
23 just still on mute, Mr. Lax.

24 JEFFREY LAX: Can you hear me?

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

197

3 JEFFREY LAX: My apologies. Honorable  
4 Council Members, Chair Hanks, Chair Williams, it is a  
5 privilege to be able to testify before you, and I  
6 deeply appreciate the opportunity to tell my very  
7 personal discrimination story. As a college  
8 professor, I really appreciated the incredibly  
9 civility and collegiality demonstrated by all of you  
10 in today's discussion. I've been here all morning  
11 and all afternoon. I wish more leaders and  
12 politicians would follow your lead. Councilwoman  
13 Vernikov, I know your fight against anti-Semitism  
14 goes back a long way with the Lawfare Project and so  
15 many other things. Thank you so much for your  
16 dedication to this important scourge. My name is  
17 Jeffrey Lax. I'm a professor at CUNY and I've  
18 chaired the Department of business at Kingsborough  
19 Community College for the past 12 years. I'm a CUNY  
20 lifer. I love New York City. I was born in Brooklyn.  
21 I was raised in Staten Island, Shoutland [sic], and I  
22 do love CUNY. I myself went to CUNY for both college  
23 and for grad school. So it is with unbelievable,  
24 genuine sadness coming from the depths of my heart  
25 that I tell you that CUNY campuses have become  
cesspools of anti-Semitism, pains me. Just this past

1 Friday night, this past Friday night right before the  
2 Jewish Sabbath, leaders from the PSE CUNY Faculty  
3 Union held a rally demanding #zionismoutofCUNY.  
4 Zionism out of CUNY was the rally. What is Zionism?  
5 Well, for me, like for many Jews, Zionism, like Mecca  
6 for Muslims, is a religious belief that is  
7 inextricably connected to the Jewish people and the  
8 land of Israel. There are 613 commandments in the  
9 bible. 204 of them, a third, require the land of  
10 Israel to be completed. You can't do them without  
11 the land of Israel. The connection between the  
12 Jewish people and the land of Israel comes from the  
13 Bible, for me and for many believers like me. To  
14 watch our own union representatives quite literally  
15 marching to get their own Zionist Jewish members  
16 ejected from the University was horrifying. This,  
17 just one year after around 300 Jewish faculty  
18 members, 300, resigned from the union for issuing a  
19 deeply anti-Semitic resolution that abhorrently  
20 condemned the loss only of Palestinian civilian  
21 lives. They are victims, but so are Jewish  
22 civilians. They didn't even mention the Jewish  
23 civilian lives that were lost, as if somehow Jewish  
24 lives matter less. This Jew-hating climate has been  
25

1 enabled by CUNY, and it hit me up close up and  
2 personally on my own campus. In April 2019, I was in  
3 the faculty dining room when five professors  
4 surrounded me and began screaming at me incoherently.  
5 Twice I tried to leave, but they physically stopped  
6 me. One professor put his hand above my head and  
7 said, "You're not-- we're not done. We're just  
8 getting started. We're not done. We're just getting  
9 started." That's a quote. I don't even know these  
10 professors, but they somehow knew everything about  
11 me, that I was Jewish, observant, Zionist. One of  
12 them admitted that they learned about me because they  
13 were googling me before we ever even met. I learned  
14 they were also googling other Orthodox and Zionist  
15 Jews in my campus whom they also never met. Scary.  
16 The professors were part of a radical union-endorsed  
17 group called the PFC. They created rules banning  
18 [sic]--

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
21 expired.

22 JEFFREY LAX: I just need 41 seconds,  
23 about-- banning Orthodox and Zionist Jews. They had  
24 rules banning Orthodox and Zionist Jews from their  
25 group, and they arranged meetings on Friday night so

1 that me and other observant Jews could not attend.  
2 Their leader, Anthony Alsandrini [sp?] used campus  
3 space to raise money for an NGO connected to the  
4 PFLP, a US-recognized terror group. The New York  
5 Daily News did a report on that. He leads the CUNY-  
6 wide BDS, Boycott Divest and Sanctions Campaign.  
7 He's written articles defending terror against Jews,  
8 and he refers to Ashkanaju [sic] like me as white  
9 supremacists. As a grandchild of four Holocaust  
10 survivors and eight grandparents who were tortured  
11 and gassed to death by the Nazi's, I cannot described  
12 to you how appalling it is to be called a white  
13 supremacist. In May 2019, I filed a complaint with  
14 the EEOC. The investigation completed vindicated all  
15 of my claims, every single one, finding that Jewish  
16 professors were discriminated against, subject to a  
17 hostile work environment on my campus, and that  
18 observant and Zionist Jews were banned from the PSE,  
19 just like I said and that meetings were held  
20 purposefully on Friday nights, which they admitted to  
21 doing in the investigation in order to exclude  
22 observant Jews. But things have only gotten worse  
23 for me. Our President and the Chancellor have  
24 ignored all of my pleas and refused to act on the  
25

1 findings. The New York State Executive Order that  
2 bans BDS and this type of treatment based on Zionism  
3 has not been enforced by the Governor. I know this is  
4 a City Council meeting. It is this callous  
5 indifference to anti-Semitism that foments Jewish  
6 hate, and I am asking you for help. Thank you so  
7 much for this time. It means everything to me.

9 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you, Mr.  
10 Lax, for your patience. I know Minority Whip Vernikov  
11 was fighting really hard for you to be bumped up, but  
12 then you had hopped off. I just want to thank you  
13 for being on this hearing for so long and for your  
14 patience and for hearing your story. I just wanted  
15 to highlight that because I know you had been  
16 patiently waiting, and wanted to just thank you.

17 JEFFREY LAX: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yes, and I also want  
19 to echo the sentiments of Chair Williams. Thank you  
20 so much for sharing that painful testimony, and we  
21 will definitely be speaking offline. Thank you.

22 JEFFREY LAX: Thank you.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much.

24 Next we will be hearing from Elyse Buxbaum followed by  
25

1  
2 Megha Jain Narsimhamurthy. Apologies for the  
3 mispronunciation there. Elyse, go ahead.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: starting time.

5 ELYSE BUXBAUM: Thank you, Chair Hanks  
6 and Chair Williams and members of the committee for  
7 hosting today's hearing on the citywide response to  
8 hate crimes and discrimination. My name is Elyse  
9 Buxbaum and I'm honored to testify today as Executive  
10 Vice President for the Museum of Jewish Heritage, a  
11 living memorial to the Holocaust. The museum is  
12 committed to the crucial mission of educating diverse  
13 visitors about Jewish life before, during and after  
14 the Holocaust, and the lessons about what hate can  
15 do. We are dedicated to remembrance and education. I  
16 don't need to tell you that hate crimes are on the  
17 rise in our city. NYPD data shows a 100 percent  
18 increase in hate crimes over the last year and  
19 already a 21 percent increase year-to-date. Anti-  
20 Semitic hate crimes throughout the City are occurring  
21 a 325 percent increase over the year prior.  
22 Unfortunately, the museum is no stranger to this.  
23 Not only do we educate on the lessons of the largest  
24 hate crime in history, but we too have been  
25 victimized. On January 7<sup>th</sup>, 2021, the museum found a

1 confederate flag tied to our front door. The crime  
2 was reported and the act has since been attributed to  
3 the Proud Boys. This event only reiterated how  
4 important our mission is and that educating current  
5 and future generations is essential. In a growing  
6 climate of Holocaust denial and misinformation,  
7 education is our first line of defense. Since we  
8 first opened our doors in 1997, the museum has  
9 educated more than two million visitors, including  
10 tens of thousands of school children each year about  
11 the history and lessons of the Holocaust through our  
12 exhibitions, education programs for both teachers and  
13 students and public programming. Our Holocaust  
14 curriculum is a free educational resource developed  
15 with support of the New York City Department of  
16 Education, and with generous support from the City  
17 and countless donors, an average of 60,000 students  
18 annually receive free exhibition tours and the  
19 critical and unparalleled opportunity to learn  
20 firsthand from a Holocaust survivor. In June, the  
21 museum will unveil a new exhibition, The Holocaust:  
22 What Hate Can Do, a monumental presentation of  
23 Holocaust history revealing what happens when hate  
24 and bigotry go unchecked through survivor  
25

1 testimonies, treasured belongings, and objects from  
2 the museum's collection. The exhibition reveals the  
3 diversity and vibrancy of Jewish life that so many  
4 sought to destroy. In the exhibition, stories of  
5 Jewish agency offer a narrative of resistance and  
6 hope in the face of widespread anti-Semitism. The  
7 diversity of New York City is what makes us so great,  
8 and yet hate and repolarization have become common  
9 place. Now, when our synagogues and cemeteries are  
10 being desecrated, now when individuals are being  
11 attacked on the street and in our subways, it is more  
12 important than ever that we teach our children what  
13 it truly means to be part of a community, to respect  
14 our neighbors, and to instill in them the duties of  
15 citizenship. Museum of Jewish Heritage is proud to  
16 be an educational resources in the City's work to  
17 combat hatred and bigotry in all forms. Thank you  
18 again to the Committees for your continued support of  
19 public safety and the prevention of hate crimes in  
20 our city.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: great. Thank you so  
23 much for your testimony, Elyse. Next we'll hear from  
24 Megha Jain Narsimhamurthy followed by Israel Bitton.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

205

3 MEGHA JAIN NARSIMHAMURTHY: Good

4 afternoon everyone. Hi, my name is Megha Jain  
5 Narsimhamurthy and I'm the President-elect for the  
6 South Asian Bar Association of New York. Thank you,  
7 Chair Williams, [inaudible] and to all the members  
8 for organizing this today. I'm shocked, saddened,  
9 and feel helpless hearing the stories of increased  
10 hate crimes and discrimination going on in our  
11 country right now. This South Asian Bar Association  
12 of New York was founded in 1996. We're a group made  
13 up of attorneys from all communities, South Asian  
14 heritage which includes Bangladeshi, Bhutanese,  
15 Indian, Indo African, Afghans, Indo, Caribbeans,  
16 Maldivians, Nepalese, Pakistanis, Sri Lankans, and  
17 Sikh practicing all in the New York metropolitan area  
18 in all areas of the law including individuals  
19 fighting for civil rights and discrimination.  
20 SABANY's members have been directly affected by hate  
21 crimes and we are committed to shedding light on this  
22 important topic, but there is no reason that violence  
23 and hate crimes should be committed against  
24 individuals because of their race, ethnicity or  
25 national origin. In response to this recent uptick,  
SABANY has made a commitment to shed light on this

1 issue and do whatever we can to help our community.

2 We're committed to hosting events on the topic of  
3 social justice and fighting against these injustices  
4 in our pro-bono clinic which has been running  
5 throughout COVID and has helped many individuals and  
6 community organizations that need legal counsel.

7 Since 9/11 there's been increase in anti-Muslim  
8 harassment, hate crimes targeting Muslims, Arabs,  
9 Sikhs and south Asians. Today, this is still  
10 continuing, hate crimes against Asian New Yorkers. In  
11 2021, as Chair Williams mentioned, is up 361 percent  
12 from the previous year. It's a disturbing statistic  
13 that requires us to act immediately. Hate isn't  
14 something that we can prosecute our way out of  
15 because it's cultural. It begins with changing the  
16 narrative that just because someone is different  
17 doesn't mean that they are bad. We are all  
18 responsible to fight it by creating-- increasing  
19 dialogue and cultural understanding. We hope there's  
20 a brighter future for all of us, and we stand  
21 together. SABANY is committed to being at the  
22 forefront of this and promises to do whatever we can  
23 to stop hate crimes and create organizations to join  
24 us as we promote unity during this difficult time.  
25

1  
2 SABANY's asking local law enforcement, government  
3 agencies to help identify, investigate, report and  
4 prosecute those responsible for these acts. We must  
5 fight for equal protection, and thank you for the  
6 opportunity to submit testimony on this important  
7 topic.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you so  
9 much for your testimony. Finally, we'll be inviting  
10 Israel Bitton to testify. Before Israel goes ahead,  
11 if any other members of the public are on and have  
12 not been called, please use the Zoom raise hand  
13 function. Israel, you may go ahead.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 ISRAEL BITTON: Good afternoon. My name  
16 is Israel Bitton. I am the Executive Director of  
17 Americans Against Anti-Semitism. I want to thank  
18 everyone on the committee for the opportunity to  
19 delivery this brief statement before you today. Our  
20 organizations has been studying the phenomenon of  
21 hate crimes in New York City for several years, with  
22 an emphasis on NYPD and Criminal Court data. By now  
23 most people have heard or seen the annual headlines  
24 about Jews being the most targeted group, by counting  
25 for an average of 60 percent hate crime victims.

1  
2 However, rather than sounding the alarms in the halls  
3 of government, condemnations of hate, the lowest  
4 hanging fruit, are readily offered, but little else  
5 is being done that's proven effective. How do I know?  
6 Because anti-Jewish hate crimes have only been  
7 increasing. Consider this. So far this year the  
8 NYPD had reported that out of a total of 142 hate  
9 crime incidents, 67 targeted Jews. The vast majority  
10 of which were felonies and misdemeanor assaults. At  
11 this rate, we are on par to surpass 2019's incident  
12 total of 242, by 26 incidents, and 2019 was a record-  
13 breaking year for anti-Jewish hate crimes in New York  
14 City. when the 2019 data was released, it has been  
15 widely noted again how Jews represented some 60  
16 percent of hate crime victims, and elected officials  
17 rush to condemn the hate, but few have bothered to  
18 examine the phenomenon even on layer beneath the  
19 surface. If they had, they would surely have noticed  
20 and brought attention to the disturbing fact that in  
21 the peak year of 2019, anti-Jewish hate crime  
22 incidents were reported in nearly 80 percent of NYPD  
23 precincts, 80 percent, 77 to be exact. The next two  
24 most-targeted groups who are victimized and under 35  
25 percent of precincts. That means that not only are

1  
2 Jews simply the most targeted group by volume and  
3 obviously per capita and they are attacked-- but they  
4 are attacked in the most areas, and almost in a  
5 majority of police jurisdictions. Jews who  
6 constitute less than 13 percent of New York City's  
7 population are attacked where they live, where they  
8 work, where they study, where they shop, and even  
9 where they don't. Such a data point is far more  
10 revealing and telling than the one most often  
11 reported about Jews representing 60 percent of hate  
12 crime victims. Likewise, the data also discloses two  
13 other vital points that cannot be ignored by anyone  
14 serious about stymieing the tidal waves of violent  
15 hatred. First, the majority of perpetrators of anti-  
16 Jewish hate crimes or other minorities. Second, the  
17 majority of violent offenders were under the age of  
18 25 with a significant proportion in their teens.  
19 There's no time now to elaborate, but I will say  
20 this, leaving aside the complex issues of criminal  
21 justice, the only way any kind of hate an ever be  
22 extinguished in young impressionable minds is through  
23 education. I'm glad I heard a lot spoken to that  
24 today. What is being and still can be done in that  
25 regard is in my view ground zero, and we need to work

1 from there. Our organizations will be releasing a  
2 detailed report to the public by the end of this  
3 month on the matter of hate crimes in New York City  
4 which I'll have--

5  
6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time  
7 expired.

8 ISRAEL BITTON: in advance with members  
9 of the committee. Thank you very much.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you so  
11 much for your testimony, Israel. Seeing no other  
12 members of the public who are signed up to testify,  
13 we will now pass it off to Chair Williams and Chair  
14 Hanks to give closing statements, and to close out  
15 the hearing.

16 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you so much  
17 to all of my colleagues that have joined today, for  
18 your patience. Of course, this has been a very  
19 interesting day. As a result of the unprecedented  
20 leak of the draft opinion, so things were a little  
21 bit crazy. So I just want to underscore my gratitude  
22 for the flexibility that was demonstrated by both my  
23 colleagues, the Administration, and all the wonderful  
24 advocates and victims who testified today against  
25 hate crimes and bias-based incidents. And of course,

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

211

3 Committee Counsel Josh for all your work hard work  
4 and my Committee Council Members, and shout outs to  
5 Hassan, who I see has stayed the entire time. So  
6 kudos to the Administration for that, and I look  
7 forward to continuing to find ways to better address  
8 the issues that were raised today. Hate crimes are  
9 so important in terms of the conversation and  
10 continuing to have the conversation. I think a crime  
11 happens and we sort of disappear, but we need to  
12 continue the conversation consistently and I look  
13 forward to doing that. And I will turn it over to  
14 Chairwoman Hanks to close us out.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I also want to echo  
16 the sentiments of my colleague and Chair Williams.  
17 Definitely thank the Administration. I want to thank  
18 Josh for putting together, you know, and facilitating  
19 this conversation, and the powerful, powerful  
20 testimonies by everyone. I learned a lot, and this is  
21 just the beginning of the conversation. And I feel  
22 that this body of council folks who came on and  
23 testified and, you know, this is going to be an issue  
24 of utmost importance, and you know, education as  
25 Israel had pointed out as the last person to testify  
is, you know, is truly, truly important. And so I

1 want to thank everyone. We knew when I became the  
2 Chair of the Public Safety, that hate crimes was  
3 going to be the first piece that we would really want  
4 to address, and I'm glad that we did, and I'm glad  
5 that I have my colleague Chair Natasha Williams who  
6 gave also just an incredible opening statement. So  
7 thank you all so much, and this will not be the last.  
8 We are going to be touching base with many of you.  
9 I'd like to thank my colleagues like Council Member  
10 Cabán who is sending me all these great articles, and  
11 these are the things-- it's just getting started, so  
12 I appreciate that. And thank you and have a great  
13 rest of your day.  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL & HUMAN RIGHTS WITH  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 29, 2022