

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
Jointly with the
COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION
and
COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

May 10, 2022
Start: 9:07 a.m.
Recess: 4:09 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Diana Ayala
- Charles Barron
- Gale A. Brewer
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- David M. Carr
- Amanda Farias
- Kamillah Hanks
- Crystal Hudson
- Ari Kagan
- Farah N. Louis
- Francisco P. Moya
- Chi A. Ossé
- Keith Powers
- Pierina Ana Sanchez
- Marjorie Velázquez

Speaker Adrienne Adams
Vickie Paladino
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Julie Menin
Nantasha Williams
Keith Powers
Erik Bottcher
Rita Joseph
James Gennaro
Sandy Nurse
Lincoln Restler
Althea Stevens
Shekar Krishnan
Sandra Ung
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Shahana Hanif
Oswald Feliz
Linda Lee
Eric Dinowitz
Mercedes Narcisse
Amanda Farías
Lynn Schulman

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

David Banks
New York City Schools Chancellor

Nina Kubota
President and CEO New York City
School Construction Authority

Cora Liu
Vice President of Capital Plan
Management, School Construction
Authority

Dan Weisberg
First Deputy Chancellor Department
of Education

Lindsey Oates
Chief Financial Officer Department
of Education

Kevin Moran
Chief Schools Operations Officer
Department of Education

Carolyne Quintana
Deputy Chancellor Division of
Teaching and Learning
Opportunities Department of
Education

Camille Varlack
Senior Advisor Department of
Education

Jawana Johnson
Chief of School Culture, Climate
and Wellbeing Department of
Education

Jade Grieve

Chief of Student Pathways
Department of Education

Thomas Taratko
Chief Executive Officer, Office of
Space Management, Department of
Education

John Shea
Chief Executive Officer Division
of School Facilities Department of
Education

Anuraag Sharma, Chief Information
Officer Department of Education

Rebecca Rawlins
Chief Executive Office of District
Planning Department of Education

Cristina Melendez
Executive Director of Family and
Community Empowerment Department
of Education

Kenita Lloyd
Department of Education

Jessica Tisch
Commissioner, Department of
Sanitation

Bridget Anderson
Deputy Commissioner, Department of
Sanitation

Gregory Anderson, Deputy
Commissioner, Department of
Sanitation

Chief Javier Lohan, Acting Deputy
Commissioner for Financial

Management and Administration,
Department of Sanitation

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

6

2 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: We are alive I'm just double
3 checking the live stream. Live stream is good at
4 this time we'll start just please start the
5 recordings. Once again at this time, will Sergeants
6 please start the recordings?

7 Thank you.

8 SERGEANT PÉREZ: Recording into the cloud all set.

9 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: Thank you and good morning
10 and welcome to today's remote New York City Council
11 physical 2023 Executive Budget hearing of the
12 Committee on Education, and then later the Committee
13 on Sanitation and Waste Management. At this time,
14 would all council members and staff please turn on
15 their video.

16 To minimize disruption please place electronic
17 devices on vibrate or silent mode. All public
18 testimony will be given on May 25 at 10 a.m. If you
19 would like to submit testimony, you may do so at
20 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your
21 cooperation we are ready to begin.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Sergeant. Good
23 morning, and welcome to the third day of fiscal year
24 23 Executive Budget hearings. Today we'll hear from
25 the Department of Education and Sanitation as well as

2 the School Construction Authority. I am Councilman
3 Justin Brannan. I have the privilege of chairing the
4 Finance Committee of the City Council, and I'm joined
5 today by Speaker Adams, as well as my Co-Chair for
6 our first hearings. Councilmember Rita Joseph, Chair
7 of the Education Committee.

8 The Department of Education's projected fiscal 23
9 budget of \$30.95 billion represents 31.1% of the
10 city's proposed fiscal 23 budget in the executive
11 plan. The D.O.E.'s fiscal 23 budget in the executive
12 plan is \$612.5 million less than its fiscal 22
13 adopted budget, primarily due to the large amount of
14 federal stimulus funds budgeted in fiscal 22.

15 Overall, D.O.E. has a \$7 billion in federal
16 stimulus funding, with a large portion of the federal
17 stimulus funds allocated to supporting existing long-
18 term programs. The Executive Budget includes nearly
19 \$515 million in fiscal 25 program... for programs
20 that will require funding after federal funds expire
21 in December of 24. It is uncertain how the city will
22 account for the costs of these expanded programs in
23 fiscal 26 and beyond. Additionally, the previous
24 administration used federal stimulus funds to restore
25 baseline cuts through fiscal 2024 only with \$90.6

2 million in restorations for fiscal 23 and fiscal 24.
3 These cuts to the D.O.E. budget will resume in fiscal
4 25 with \$87.6 million in reductions, which will
5 impact air conditioning, school supports, the
6 Education and Equity Program, arts instruction and
7 Health Ed works.

8 I welcome the Department of Education and the
9 School Construction Authority being here today, and
10 I'll be focusing my questions on unspent FY 22
11 federal spending, enrollment changes, and any
12 associated budget cuts that may result in those
13 enrollment changes, school accessibility and
14 something I care about very much: vision and hearing
15 care, especially for those students that may not have
16 access to such services.

17 And finally, for the School Construction
18 Authority, I will look into the S.C.A.'s review of
19 suitable sites for new school buildings. I want to
20 thank the Finance Division who has been working very,
21 very hard behind the scenes to make these hearings
22 possible, especially Chelsea Beytemur, Masis
23 Sarkissian, Dohini Sompura, and my Senior Adviser
24 John Yeddin[sp?], for preparing for today's hearing
25 especially.

2 I also want to thank all the Council staff that's
3 involved in putting together this hearing behind the
4 scenes.

5 I am now going to turn to my colleague, Chair of
6 the Education Committee Rita Joseph, to deliver her
7 opening remarks.

8 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you Chair Brannan.
9 Good morning, everyone. Good morning and welcome to
10 education committee's hearing on fiscal 2023
11 Executive Budget. We have been joined by Chancellor
12 Banks, First Deputy Chancellor Dan Weisberg, and
13 D.O.E. Financial Officer Lindsey Oates, who will
14 testify on D.O.E.'s Executive Budget.

15 I want to thank Chair Brannan for his overview of
16 the D.O.E.'s budget and the Executive Plan, and in
17 the interest of time, I'll keep my remarks brief.

18 For the executive budget hearing, I would like to
19 focus on redistribution of \$421 million in the
20 federal stimulus funding for new chancellor
21 priorities for which \$310 million is reallocated in
22 fiscal 2023 and \$111 million is relocated in fiscal
23 2024. These reallocations have a net zero effect on
24 D.O.E.'s overall federal funding amounts, but

2 represent a shift and what programs the funding
3 supports.

4 For existing funding categories within the
5 D.O.E.'s budget impacted the shift include
6 operational supports, academic recovery, students
7 supports, curriculum support and IT supports. These
8 changes are meant to fund the following chancellor
9 and administration priorities: bilingual education
10 expansion, digital learning, pathways expansion, safe
11 supportive, schools, Summer Rising, contracted
12 nurses, gifted and talented, literacy and dyslexia,
13 translation and interpretation, and parent and family
14 engagement. While the council look forward to
15 hearing more about these necessary programs, and
16 D.O.E.'s implementation plan, we must ensure that
17 these programs offer focus, support to most of our
18 vulnerable student populations. Additionally, we look
19 forward to hearing how these new initiatives differ
20 from enhancing existing D.O.E. programs. Lastly,
21 while the executive budget shifts existing federal
22 dollars to support several Chancellor's priorities
23 and programs, we are disappointed that the Executive
24 Budget failed to allocate funding for items called
25 for in the Council's Response to the Preliminary

2 Budget. This includes funding for social, school
3 based mental health staff, a citywide expansion of
4 restorative justice, pay parity for special education
5 pre-K providers, pay parity for daycare directors,
6 increased arts and music, per pupil allotments, and
7 hiring of Office of Foster Care staff. I look
8 forward to your testimony on these issues.

9 Some housekeeping: The committee may not get all
10 of the questions or you may not have responses, so
11 we'll send follow up letters for unanswered
12 questions. I will now turn to the Committee Counsel
13 to Swain members of the Administration. Thank you.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you chairs. Madam
15 Speaker, did you want to say anything before we swear
16 in the administration?

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: I will hold my questions for that
18 time. Thank you.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay, thank you. Okay, thank
20 you, Chairs Brannan and Joseph, and Madam Speaker.
21 Good morning, everyone, and welcome to the first
22 agency hearing for May 10, The New York City
23 Department of Education and the School Construction
24 Authority. My name is Malcom Budehorn and I am
25 Counsel to the Finance Committee.

2 I would first like to acknowledge council members
3 present for the record. We are joined this morning
4 by Council Members, Schulman, Brannan, Joseph,
5 Farias, Narcisse, Dinowitz, Velázquez, Lee, Feliz,
6 Brewer, Paladino, Gennaro, Hanif, Kagan, Louis, and
7 Brooks-Powers.

8 Unlike in past council members and members of the
9 mayoral administration will have the ability to mute
10 and unmute themselves. When not speaking, we please
11 ask that you remember to mute yourself. If people
12 forget to do so and we hear background noise we will
13 just go ahead and mute, you but remember, you will be
14 able to unmute yourself in the future.

15 Council members who have questions should use the
16 raise hand function in zoom. You will be called on
17 in the order with which you raised your hand. And
18 please remember that we have five minutes for the
19 clock. We do have other agencies testifying today.
20 So please listen for the cue from the Sergeant At
21 Arms.

22 The following members of the administration are
23 here to testify and/or answer your questions. David
24 Banks, New York City Schools Chancellor, Nina Kubota,
25 President and CEO New York City School Construction

2 Authority, Cora Liu, Vice President of Capital Plan
3 Management, School Construction Authority, and from
4 the Department of Education, Dan Weisberg, First
5 Deputy Chancellor, Lindsey Oates Chief Financial
6 Officer, Kevin Moran, Chief Schools Operations
7 Officer, Carolyne Quintana, Deputy Chancellor
8 Division of Teaching and Learning Opportunities,
9 Camille Varlack, Senior Advisor, Jawana Johnson,
10 Chief of School Culture, Climate and Wellbeing, Jade
11 Grieve, Chief of Student Pathways, Thomas Taratko
12 Chief Executive Officer, Office of Space Management,
13 John Shea, Chief Executive Officer Division of School
14 Facilities, Anuraag Sharma, Chief Information
15 Officer, Rebecca Rawlins, Chief Executive Office of
16 District Planning, Cristina Melendez, Executive
17 Director of Family and Community Empowerment, and can
18 Kenita Lloyd.

19 I will first read the oath and after I will call
20 on each member from the administration individually
21 to respond. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
22 whole truth and nothing but the truth before these
23 committees and to respond honestly to council member
24 questions? Chancellor Banks?

25 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes.

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

14

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: President Kubota?

3 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I do.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Vice President Liu?

5 VICE PRESIDENT LIU: I do.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: First Deputy Chancellor

7 Weisberg?

8 FIRST DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: I do.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CFO Oates?

10 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Schools Operations

12 Officer Moran?

13 CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICER MORAN: I do.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Chancellor Quintana?

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: I do.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Senior Advisor Varlack?

17 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: I do.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Johnson?

19 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Not here at the moment.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Chief Grieve?

21 CHIEF GRIEVE: I do.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Taratko?

23 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: I do.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Shea?

25 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER SHEA: I do.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CIO Sharma?

3 CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER SHARMA: I do.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Rollins?

5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER ROLLINS: I do.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Chancellor Lloyd? I
7 saw you on the Zoom. Okay, we tried.

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: She did respond.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: We'll try it one more time.
10 Okay.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Can you see her now?

12 (background voices).

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Well, if you do answer any
14 questions, just say "Yes, you do", before you speak.

15 Chancellor Banks, you can begin when ready.

16 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you. And first of all I
17 wanted to say Good morning to Madam Speaker, Adrienne
18 Adams. I didn't realize he would be here with us
19 this morning. Always good to see you. And good
20 morning Chair Brannan, Chair Joseph, and all the
21 members of the Finance and Education Committees.

22 We're here today. I'm pleased to join you all,
23 along with several members of my team. I think you've
24 pretty much mentioned all of our senior leadership
25 and the key members of our team who are joining us

2 here today. We work together as a team. And in the
3 course of this conversation today, many of them I
4 will call on to help support me in answering any of
5 the questions that you have. But thank you for the
6 opportunity to testify about the mayor's Executive
7 Budget for New York City public schools.

8 Before I begin, I would like to express my
9 deepest thanks to this council for your partnership,
10 advocacy and insight. Your dedication to our city's
11 children is truly inspiring. And as I've said
12 before, we're committed to working with you all hand
13 in hand as partners, real partners, and improving the
14 educational experience for all of our students. The
15 council has been instrumental in securing funding
16 through the American Rescue Plan act, that is helping
17 our school communities to rebound from all the
18 disruptions caused by this terrible pandemic. We've
19 expanded P.S.A.L. so that students across the system
20 have access to sports teams, and we're in the process
21 of hiring dedicated staff for the first time ever to
22 the office was a students in foster care. We're very
23 excited about that.

24 The Council's partnership has also helped to
25 provide the resources needed to ensure that every

2 school from every zip code receives funding to hire a
3 full-time social worker. And with direct funding
4 from The Council, we're also expanding language
5 access, mental health services, community schools,
6 and community access to school playgrounds. These
7 are a lot of vital successes that we have
8 accomplished really working together. Since I was
9 last here with you almost two months ago, I've
10 continued to visit schools across all five boroughs.
11 And I've been so impressed at how our students are
12 bouncing back academically and socially through the
13 hands-on support and dedication of our educators.

14 Returning to face to face learning has restored a
15 sense of normalcy in our classrooms, which you can
16 see in the joy expressed in the faces of our
17 students. You can really feel the sense of excitement
18 and energy as you walk through our buildings. I
19 visited over 40 schools in the four months that I've
20 been in office, and it has really been just very
21 inspiring to see our young people as they are back in
22 the routine of being back in schools.

23 So one powerful indicator of that renewed
24 enthusiasm is the overwhelming response to this
25 year's Summer Rising program. Summer Rising will be

2 jointly administered by the DOE and DYCD, connecting
3 110,000 elementary and middle school students to fun,
4 culturally relevant hands-on experiences to
5 strengthen their academic, social and emotional
6 skills. This is a real opportunity for students to
7 sustain the joy of learning after the regular school
8 year ends with rigorous academic programming while
9 also experiencing all that our city has to offer
10 beyond the classroom walls. We're prioritizing
11 students in temporary housing and students with 12
12 month IEPs to ensure equitable access to this
13 program, and we're really thrilled by the immense
14 response. To date, we have almost 90,000 of our
15 youngsters that have registered with their families.

16 We also recently announced the expansion of our
17 Gifted and Talented Program is an important step that
18 as a result of listening to what our parents wanted.
19 We added 100 kindergarten seats and 1,000 third grade
20 seats, expanding both entry points to all districts.
21 And through this expansion, and updates to the
22 admissions process, the city's Gifted and Talented
23 program will serve every school district citywide for
24 the first time, providing more opportunities for
25 accelerated learning to even more families. At the

2 same time, we'll be implementing a much more
3 equitable process than in the past to identify
4 students who will most benefit from this accelerated
5 learning opportunity. These expansions of Summer
6 Rising and G&T are products of community engagement
7 that we organize with families across the city.
8 We've been listening. Our commitment to real
9 community partnership doesn't begin and end with
10 Gifted And Talented. We're going to bring the same
11 level of deep real parent engagement to improving the
12 quality of education of every school in every
13 neighborhood. As I've said before, engagement is not
14 a slogan for me. It is in my DNA, and it's something
15 that we take seriously, day in and day out.

16 So let me turn now to the details of the mayor's
17 Executive Budget. The Department of Education 2023
18 budget totals \$37.6 billion, which includes \$31
19 billion in operating expenses. Our funding is a
20 combination of city state and federal resources, with
21 city tax levy money making up the largest share at
22 54%, state funds at 36%, and federal dollars at 10%.
23 To 2023 Executive Budget reflects a real reallocation
24 of a portion of the federal Coronavirus aid provided
25 through the Coronavirus Response and Relief

2 Supplemental Appropriations Act and the American
3 Rescue Plan aligned with the priorities of the Adams
4 administration. We plan to spend over \$3 billion of
5 stimulus dollars in fiscal year 2022, and we're
6 working with OMB to ensure the adopted budget
7 reflects our final spending projections. \$2 billion
8 of this funding has already been spent, including
9 \$500 million in the last two months alone. We expect
10 spending to continue apace this year, including
11 significant payments for goods and services received
12 in FY 2022 but not invoiced or paid until the summer.

13 I want to reassure the council and the public
14 that federal funding is available over the next
15 several years. Anything not spent this year as a
16 result of pandemic-related supply chain and staffing
17 challenges, is available to support our work next
18 year. The investments in this budget reflect an
19 advanced vision for the Department of Education that
20 you have previously heard me put forward. I believe
21 that for our schools to deliver on the original
22 promise of serving as the engine of the American
23 dream, we need to do things very differently in ways
24 that build trust among our families and school
25 communities one big step at a time.

2 Our schools need to connect with our students to
3 the real world and what matters to them. I want to
4 say that again: Our schools need to connect our
5 students to the real world, and what matters to them.
6 Preparing each and every one of our students to
7 graduate with a pathway to a rewarding career, long
8 term economic security, and equipped to be a positive
9 force for change.

10 Together with Mayor Adams, our vision for our
11 schools is built on four pillars that this budget
12 makes real investments in. Number one, the first
13 pillar is reimagining the student experience, which
14 means redesigning what happens in our schools to be
15 relevant and exciting to our students, while
16 providing them with the skills and knowledge that are
17 attractive ultimately to employers. This starts with
18 our \$33 million investment in Pathways Expansion to
19 improve economic mobility and security for all New
20 York City public school students. There'll be more to
21 come on that in the coming days. Our pathways
22 expansion efforts will build on the effective
23 programs we already have in place, such as the Thomas
24 Edison CTE High School in Queens, which provides

2 training in fields like engineering and medicine to
3 prepare students for life after high school.

4 Another way that our budget is reimagining the
5 student experience is better supporting students with
6 print based disabilities, including dyslexia. And
7 there'll be more to come on that in the coming days
8 as well.

9 Finally, and acknowledging the importance of 21st
10 century learning, and building on what we learned
11 during the pandemic we will enhance digital
12 experiences across the system. That effort will also
13 increase access to in-demand coursework, while
14 further supporting students who face challenges in
15 attending school in person. We've been listening to
16 our parents and our families.

17 Number two, the second pillar, which we call
18 scaling, sustaining, and restoring what works. And
19 that entails identifying amazing practices throughout
20 our system, and sharing them so that they become
21 models that other schools can emulate.

22 In addition to our expanded Summer Rising and
23 gifted and talented programs, we're enhancing
24 bilingual education. Bilingual Education is the
25 favorite program model for supporting the long term

2 success of English language learners that we hold to
3 the same high expectations as all of our other
4 students. Our plan includes strengthening and
5 sustaining the quality of existing bilingual
6 education programs, opening or growing 50 bilingual
7 education programs in 2023. Supporting district wide
8 planning to ensure a pathway to multilingualism for
9 every student. And in order to accomplish this,
10 we'll be investing in purchasing and developing
11 curriculum and materials in students home languages,
12 recruiting, training and staffing high quality
13 certified bilingual teacher candidates, empowering
14 families of multilingual learners, with resources to
15 enable them to make informed decisions about
16 bilingual education to increase awareness of
17 bilingual program options and benefits, and also
18 ongoing professional learning, program design and
19 implementation support for school leaders and staff.

20 We have so many amazing practices throughout our
21 system to hold up and share so they can be more
22 broadly emulated. For example, Mark Erlenwein. He's
23 the principal of Staten Island Technical High School.
24 Just last week, he was honored as the New York State
25 Secondary School Principal of the Year, in part for

2 encouraging students to have opportunities to redo
3 some of their learning, versus relentlessly being
4 pushed forward and wondering how to catch up. It's
5 called Mastery Learning, and it's something that we
6 want to study and have him share with schools all
7 across the city. That approach of creating second
8 and third chances cultivates perseverance and deeper
9 learning. And another example is the Brooklyn
10 Occupational Training Center, a district 75 school,
11 which has continually innovated to engage students
12 with wide ranging learning needs in a quality civics
13 education. The teacher Matt Gorun[sp?], he has
14 adapted participatory budgeting resources to engage
15 students through big circle mapping, which allows
16 verbal and nonverbal students to graphically
17 represent their ideas and engage in discussion,
18 debate, and to show support for each other.

19 So just want to tell you good things are
20 happening in our schools. And we want to use
21 technology to capture these practices in a way that
22 makes sense for school principals to help better
23 share best practices, and enable schools to
24 collaborate, we're planning to create an app that
25 school leaders and teachers can easily access from

2 their phone or desktop. We will ensure that
3 principals are able to give feedback and partner with
4 us before any future rollout of this technology.

5 The third pillar is prioritizing wellness.
6 Because students who feel healthy, safe, well-
7 nourished, and intellectually stimulated, are best
8 able to concentrate and engage with their academic
9 work. Safety has been at the forefront for too many
10 of our students. So to that end, under this budget,
11 our schools will contract with community based
12 organizations that specialize in violence
13 interruption programming, which empowers and equips
14 young people with the tools that they need to make
15 positive choices for themselves, and to uplift pro
16 social development pathways as an alternative to
17 violence. These strategies include social and
18 emotional support for students, violence interruption
19 techniques, like de-escalation, mediation, conflict
20 resolution, and extended learning opportunities to
21 ensure that students feel safe, supported and
22 empowered in their school communities. And given
23 that the pandemic is by no means over, we are also
24 going to continue to strive to ensure that all of our
25 schools continue to have nurse coverage in 2023.

2 And finally, without respect to our fourth
3 pillar, engaging families to be our true partners.
4 One of our top budget priorities for this year is to
5 enhance our Family and Community Engagement Office by
6 hiring community coordinators from underrepresented
7 groups. We want to make sure that we're reaching
8 families that we have rarely heard from in the past,
9 and elevate their voices. Since approximately 40% of
10 New York City Public Schools families speak a
11 language other than English at home, we are also
12 investing in improving response time for families
13 requesting translation and interpretation services.
14 We also know how important it is for students to see
15 themselves in our curriculum. We've been hard at
16 work building a more inclusive curriculum, and there
17 will be more to come very soon when highlighting our
18 AAPI curriculum work. Once details are finalized,
19 we'll welcome the City Council to Tweet to share in
20 that announcement, one of the work ahead.

21 Many of these investments are not only D.O.E.
22 priorities, but outgrowth of conversations and
23 collaborations with all of you as the City Council,
24 as well as other stakeholders. We are acting on our
25 promise to not only engage with this Council, but

2 directly incorporate your feedback and hoping to
3 shape our budgetary and policy decisions. That is the
4 true partnership that we will continue to nurture.

5 In conclusion, these investments will build on
6 the progress that we have begun to make in rebuilding
7 the trust of our families, and further excite them
8 about sending their children to our schools. Be
9 clear, we have lost 120,000 students over the last
10 five years, and we have to do everything we can to
11 give our families a reason to stay in our public
12 schools.

13 So again, I want to underscore that we deeply
14 appreciate the vital role that the council plays in
15 working with the mayor, OMB, DOE and the various
16 stakeholders in shaping this final budget. Together,
17 we're creating a budget that advances the needs and
18 priorities of our students and families. So I want to
19 thank you. We're here to answer any of your
20 questions.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: We're also now turning to our
22 opening statement from SCA President CEO Nina Kubota.

23 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. Thank you very
24 much. Good morning Speaker Adams, Chairs Brannan and
25 Joseph, and members of the Finance and Education

2 Committees. My name is Nina Kubota, and I am the
3 President and CEO of the New York City School
4 Construction Authority. In addition to our
5 colleagues at the DOD, I'm joined by Cora Liu, Vice
6 President of Capital Plan Management for the SBA.

7 We are pleased to be here today to discuss the
8 February 2022 proposed amendment to the current FY
9 2020 to 2024 five-year capital plan. We thank the
10 Council for their openness and have enjoyed the
11 dialogue we have been able to share since the
12 beginning of January. The council's participation
13 and partnership has always been critical to the
14 success of our projects and our schools, and we look
15 forward to building upon our strong spirit of
16 collaboration.

17 When I was last before you in March, we
18 highlighted how the SCA operates on a fixed five-year
19 capital plan with yearly amendments as set forth in
20 our enabling legislation, and talk through what makes
21 up the overall structure and implementation of our
22 plan. The February 2022 proposed amendment to the
23 fiscal year 2020 to 2024 plan totals \$20.6 billion
24 and is the largest capital plan in our history.

2 The funding breaks down as follows: The capacity
3 program, totaling \$9.84 billion, the capital
4 investment category, with \$7.26 billion and finally
5 our mandated program at \$3.51 billion. Since we last
6 spoke, I'm happy to report that our proposed February
7 amendment was approved by the Panel for Educational
8 Policy on April 27, and will be part of the city's
9 budget that this council reviews and adopts by June
10 30. We continue to work day in and day out to
11 fulfill the city's commitment of adding 60,000 seats.
12 Through the new capacity program, we are on our way
13 to identifying locations for all new seats funded in
14 this plan. Since February, we have sited in
15 additional four projects, with over 1500 seats. Of
16 the 45,883 seats to be constructed through the new
17 capacity program, there are 25,525 seats already in
18 progress and another roughly 5400 currently in the
19 pipeline. That means we are two thirds of the way
20 toward identifying these needed seats.

21 Additionally, we continue to make substantial
22 progress in the creation of seats through our other
23 capacity programs. We have four projects that are in
24 process as part of the replacement program. A PSIS
25 is located at 3761 10th Avenue in Manhattan, PS163 in

2 the Bronx, PS47 in Queens and a D75. School located
3 at Willowbrook Avenue in Staten Island.

4 Through the class size reduction program, there
5 are two currently two projects underway, one at
6 Medgar Evers in Brooklyn, and another at the Harbor
7 School located on Governors Island that will receive
8 additional seats to alleviate overcrowding in the
9 schools that otherwise would not have seen this
10 investment, as they are located in an area without
11 funded new capacity program C need. Through the class
12 size reduction program, we are able to provide relief
13 to these schools.

14 While the addition project at PS 96 and Queens
15 was the first project to be funded from newly created
16 a program to add capacity to support the removal of
17 TCUs, it certainly won't be the last. We have
18 several more that we are developing plans for and are
19 looking forward to sharing them with The Council and
20 the public as soon as we can. Due to the decline in
21 enrollment and birth rate, we were able to shift
22 funding that was previously dedicated for the new
23 capacity program to other capacity programs I
24 highlighted: Class size reduction, replacement, and
25 capacity to support the removal of TCUs. Through

2 these expanded programs, as a result of the shift in
3 funding, we will create about 14,000 seats bringing
4 our total number of seats created to approximately
5 60,000. Last year, we received over \$800 million to
6 support the Early Education Initiatives which sought
7 to expand 3K citywide as well as upgrade certain
8 Early Learning Centers as part of the ACS transfer of
9 a number of sites into the DOE portfolio. This
10 September, we are scheduled to open over 2900 3K
11 seats at 23 sites across all five boroughs.

12 While creating seats is a vital part of what we
13 do. We cannot forget that 200 of our buildings are
14 over 100 years old, and the majority of our buildings
15 are over 50 years old. The plan directs a total of
16 \$7.26 billion for capital investments. The capital
17 investment portion of the plan includes two main
18 categories \$3.27 for the capital improvement program,
19 which includes building upgrades and necessary
20 capital repairs, such as roof and facade work,
21 structural repairs, and safeguarding our buildings
22 against water infiltration, and \$2.81 billion for
23 school enhancement projects, which funds the
24 realignment of existing facilities to better suit
25 instructional needs, along with bathroom upgrades,

2 science labs, accessibility, and other necessary
3 improvements. Every year, we make progress on
4 removing TCUs. This plan dedicates \$352 million for
5 the ongoing removal of these units, with dedicated
6 capacity funding allocated to construct the needed
7 seats to allow for the removal of the TCUs. As of the
8 February amendment, we removed 266 of the original
9 354, and developed plans to remove an additional 45
10 units. Since February, we have identified the path
11 for the removal of 10 more TCUs at three sites, now
12 leaving us with a total of 33 TCUs located at 11
13 sites.

14 The mandated program category with \$3.51 billion
15 allocated includes approximately \$650 million for
16 boiler conversions in buildings currently using
17 number four oil. The remaining funds are assigned to
18 cover other required costs such as code and local law
19 compliance, the SCAs wrap-up insurance, and
20 completion of projects from the prior plan. Many
21 factors contribute to the successes we have
22 experienced in implementing our capital plans, but
23 one of our strongest core values is our commitment to
24 our MWBE contractors. The SCA is continually
25 developing a larger and more diverse group of

2 contractors who can bid on our work and complete
3 large and complicated projects.

4 We have been incredibly successful in increasing
5 the participation of minority owned businesses. In
6 this plan so far, the SCA has obligated over \$955
7 million in prime contractor obligations, and \$884
8 million in subcontractor awards to MWBE firms. Our
9 mentor program seeks to cultivate smaller MWBE firms
10 by providing them with the skills and experience
11 needed to develop and grow within the construction
12 industry, and to establish long-term business
13 relationships with the SCA. We currently have 150
14 firms in our mentor program, and roughly 85% of those
15 firms have won contracts. We intend to award over
16 \$100 million in our mentor program to small
17 contractors by the end of the fiscal year. We are
18 incredibly proud of our accomplishments. We continue
19 to identify more ways to build on these successes.

20 As a way to further support and develop our
21 mentor firms, our maximum contract value that they
22 will be able to bid on will increase to \$3 million in
23 July. Once again, I can't overstate the importance
24 of the partnership between the City Council, the SCA,
25 and the DOE. Our collaborative relationship is vital

2 to the successful implementation of our capital plan
3 that directly provides the state-of-the-art
4 educational facilities that our students need to
5 succeed. I thank you for allowing me to testify
6 before you today. And I along with my colleagues at
7 the Department of Education will be happy to answer
8 any questions you may have. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you so much.

10 President Kubota and Chancellor Banks. Before we get
11 into questions from the committee, I want to hand it
12 over to Speaker Adams.

13 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Chair
14 Brannan and good morning. Thank you Chair Joseph.
15 Good morning to Chancellor Banks. Good to see you
16 always. Good morning, President Kubota. Very glad
17 to see you as well. And all of the teams and
18 representatives of DOE and SCA. Good morning to all
19 of you and to my colleagues as well.

20 I know that my colleagues have a lot of questions
21 for you this morning. Mine have to do with something
22 very, very specific and a concern dealing with
23 community schools right now.

24 In 2021, the Coalition for Community Schools
25 excellence advocated for the Office of Community

2 Schools within the DOE to revise the community school
3 funding model in a way that would ensure equity on
4 the average community school allocations. In June
5 2021, the D.O.E. released a new community school RFP
6 and CBOs were notified about their new contract
7 rates. The funding formula was adjusted from the
8 prior solicitation in a way that increased the
9 amounts for smaller schools that were in need of
10 considerable support. However, the formula also
11 decreased the awarded amounts to larger schools and
12 campuses that were in need of support. In total 52
13 Community Schools were impacted by the shifting to
14 funding in the RFP, including Richmond Hill High
15 School in my district, which received \$400,000 less
16 in this RFP. This school is vital to my community,
17 and just because it's a largest school, it shouldn't
18 be subjected to a formula that arbitrarily impacts
19 their ability to deliver services to its students.
20 To the Council, the importance of continuing to fund
21 larger community schools was clear. We negotiated a
22 \$9.16 million one-year restoration in fiscal 2022 to
23 bring 52 Community Schools back to their pre RFP
24 contract levels. Sadly, however, the Administration
25 did not baseline this funding for the upcoming fiscal

2 year. So my question... my first question is: How
3 was the formula to fund Community Schools determined?
4 And why didn't the D.O.E. advocate for more funding
5 for the RFP that allowed smaller schools to receive
6 their resources, while not impacting larger schools
7 and their historical funding?

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Uh, I appreciate the...
9 appreciate the question, Madam Speaker. I'm going to
10 have... CFO Lindsay, you want to... you want to take
11 a stab at that, please?

12 Lindsay?

13 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you, can you
14 hear me?

15 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes.

16 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Great. So thank
17 you, Speaker Adams for the question. We have been...
18 last year (audio fades out)

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Actually, Lindsay, you're
20 we've you started out strong. And that totally faded
21 out?

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Oh. Can you hear
23 me now?

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: That's better.

2 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes. Okay. Thank
3 you. Thank you, Chair Brannan. So thank you, again,
4 Council, for the increased resources that we received
5 this fiscal year in order to provide additional
6 supports to the Community Schools Program. As we
7 committed to at the time, that was meant to increase
8 values to schools as part... that were awarded as
9 part of the repeat of the system in fiscal year 21,
10 and fiscal year 22. And we appreciate the interest
11 in this program. And we were happy to have the
12 resources available this year. I think we're
13 continuing to look at the right sizing of the school
14 budgets... or excuse me, the community school budgets
15 going forward, and want to make sure, I think most
16 importantly, that community schools across the system
17 receive equitable funding. And that's what the
18 original Community Schools RFP funding model was
19 meant to support. And I can let Dr. Johnson speak to
20 the future of the program.

21 CHIEF JOHNSON: Good morning. Thank you. Thank
22 you again, Chair, for the question.

23 So where we are right now is we are actually
24 looking to expand with the Community Schools
25 initiative to increase an additional 40 schools to

2 really bring the number to well over 400. One of the
3 things that we know is that historically, schools
4 have used... we've utilized various funding sources
5 in order to be able to fund community schools. And
6 prior to the equitable funding formula, we had
7 community schools that ranged from an annual budget
8 of \$83,000, to schools that had budgets that were
9 well over \$900,000. And so the equitable formula was
10 seeking to really ensure that we were able to provide
11 greater resources and greater support for those
12 schools that really were underserved. As we think
13 about that, the adjustment, there were 90... there
14 were well over 90 schools that were also able to
15 really get to closer to sustainable funding. There
16 was a RAND report that was released that really
17 advocated for the effectiveness of community schools
18 with a greater amount of resources. And so we were
19 incredibly thankful for the Council for being able to
20 be able to provide the restoration funding last year
21 to really enable the schools that received an
22 adjustment to be able to transition into the new
23 formula. And so we look forward to continuing to work
24 in partnership with the Council to really figure out
25 ways to explore the best... best allocation and then

2 the best source of resources to support community
3 schools to ensure that we are best able to meet the
4 needs of our students and families within these
5 communities. Thank you.

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: I appreciate the response. But
7 still getting to the core of my question, how did the
8 DOE envision the larger schools to serve students
9 with less resources, and did the do we provide any
10 guidance on what programs and services could be
11 reduced for the schools receiving less funding under
12 the new RFP?

13 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you chair. So in the
14 original in the original allocation, schools received
15 the prior... the prior budget. And so when they got
16 the prior budget, they... they realized that there
17 would be a shortfall. So restoration funding was
18 really offered as a transitional source of funding to
19 allow for CBO partners to really think about how can
20 we reconfigure, and how could we reimagine what the
21 programming would look like with a different set of
22 resources? So the guidance was... initially when the
23 funding was... was adjusted, here was what your new
24 funding formula will be. And we understood that the
25 timing for that was not ideal. And so the restoration

2 funding the city council was able to provide enabled
3 CBOs to think about in this year, how do we adjust
4 and transition for... transition our funding formula?
5 How do we transition our services to really be able
6 to move more strategically? I will also say that by
7 doing so... by making this adjustment, we were again,
8 able to fund additional... additional schools to
9 provide them with additional resources. We are also
10 able to engage in the expansion to increase the
11 number of access to more students and more families,

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: we're actually going to lose a
13 lot of services, and we're actually going to take
14 away a lot of vital services in our schools by
15 decreasing this funding. It's going to have a
16 tremendous impact not just on a school in my district
17 that I know of, but I'm sure in schools across the
18 city. So it has the D.O.E. considered amending the
19 RFP awards in FY 2023 with an additional \$9.2 million
20 so that schools are able to remain whole for another
21 year? And actually have the opportunity to further
22 plan on how to provide services at a lower contract
23 value beginning in FY 2024?

24 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thanks again for the question. At
25 this point, we are exploring all different types of

2 financial resources and look forward to working
3 closely with the with the Council to figure out if
4 there are any additional options that we can explore.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: I think that my suggestion is a
6 good one. Again, a lot of students are going to be
7 impacted by a tremendous shortfall. For one school
8 alone, we're talking almost a half million dollars,
9 and it will dramatically affect students and their
10 care in our schools across the city. So I'm going to
11 let my colleagues get in. I don't want to belabor
12 that. But it is extremely important that we consider
13 options for this.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: And I'm glad that you raise it
15 Madam... Madam Chair. So is duly noted. And we will
16 we will follow up on this right away.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Chancellor.
18 Thank you, chairs.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Speaker. Before
20 we get into further questions, I... I know it's going
21 to be a long day. The committee may not get to all
22 the questions, or D.O.E. may not have sufficient
23 responses, although we hope that's not the case. But
24 we will follow we will follow up with a letter for
25 any of the unanswered questions that we'd like to get

2 back ASAP so it'll help in our in our budget
3 negotiation.

4 Okay, I'm gonna get moving right into the unspent
5 federal funding and the ARPA deadline. So the
6 D.O.E.'s fiscal 22 budget includes \$2.57 billion in
7 federal stimulus funding for short-term recovery
8 efforts, such as academic recovery and operational
9 supports. Additionally, the budget recognizes \$528
10 million in federal stimulus funded long term
11 expansions. Has D.O.E. spent all of this funding in
12 FY 22, and if not, how much of this funding remains
13 unspent and for what programs and supports?

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsay

15 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: (inaudible)

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Lindsay, we can't hear you.

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me
18 better now?

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Not really.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It sounds like on your
21 microphone or something.

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me
23 better now?

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It sounds like you're deep in
25 a tunnel.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It's not changing.

3 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It could be your headphones.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Go ahead. Just...

5 Just talk.

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me?

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Yes, we can clearly.

8 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So thank you,
9 Chair Brannan, for the question we have... I really
10 appreciate the opportunity to talk through this
11 issue. So as we all know, we're super grateful for
12 the additional funding that we've received from the
13 federal government. And we have been funding this
14 funding throughout the school year, we're going to
15 continue to spend this through the rest of this
16 fiscal year. And we have several months left in the
17 fiscal year to continue the spending. And I think
18 that there have been some numbers that the
19 comptroller's office has shared recently about our
20 stimulus spending. And I think it's important to
21 reflect on... that of our, you know, over \$3 billion
22 that we have in fiscal year 23, err on the side of
23 funding. And again, there are reasons why there have
24 been a slow, slow starts to the spending of that
25 funding. We've had some staffing challenges, we've

2 had some programs that started later, and this
3 administration has really taken a close look at the
4 stimulus plan that were in place, and have wanted to
5 make sure that the spending aligns with their
6 priorities. A lot of these things have been issues
7 that have been reported nationally in other school
8 districts and the challenges that are facing similar
9 things, not the least of which is the worldwide
10 supply chain issues. And the way that that plays out
11 in actual spending is that items are delayed in
12 delivering, as many of us have experienced in our
13 personal lives. So you may have bought a piece of
14 equipment or furniture for your school in October, it
15 may not yet have been delivered. We can't actually
16 pay the bill until the item has been delivered, which
17 means that spending is delayed because of the delays
18 in delivery on a lot of those items. So that's why
19 some of the trends may seem like they're low. Right
20 now, we've spent about 60% of our stimulus budget.
21 And like I said, we're continuing to spend every day.
22 We've spent an additional \$500 million since the
23 controller's office issued their report with their
24 snapshot data. The good thing is, is that at the end
25 of this fiscal year, if there is underspending, we

2 don't lose that money. That funding is available to
3 us. And we'll work with OMB to move that funding
4 from fiscal year 22 to fiscal year 23, just like we
5 would with any other federal grants or any other
6 grants that span multiple years. So that funding,
7 would we determine if there is any underspending and
8 what that value is? We'll get moved from fiscal year
9 22 To 23 to support other programs.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. I appreciate that. I
11 mean, obviously, the reason why I'm asking is because
12 the council has... has plenty of suggestions for how
13 to spend that money. So can the D.O.E. rollover some
14 of these unspent funds into fiscal 23 to support some
15 of the priorities that we outlined in our preliminary
16 budget response?

17 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely, we can. And we'd
18 certainly love to hear, you know, some of the
19 suggestions from the Council as well. We always... we
20 welcome that. As we said, we're looking to be real
21 partners with you, but it absolutely can be rolled
22 over, so that sense of urgency is not there. We...
23 we don't intend to leave a funds unspent. That is not
24 what we're doing. It's just a delay in the process as
25 our CFO just explained.

2
3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. So something
4 that's... that's near, dear, and personal to me is
5 arts and music instruction in our public schools.
6 Can the DOE use any of the unspent stimulus funds to
7 support a minimum allocation of \$100 per student for
8 core arts instruction programming?

9 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yup, for now.

11 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Okay. Sorry for
12 the technical difficulties, I apologize. You would
13 think after two and a half years of doing this, we
14 would have it down. So in terms of arts funding,
15 we're happy to review your proposal that was in your
16 pulmonary budget response in more detail. In the
17 meantime, what we have done with stimulus funding, is
18 we have prioritized arts in the stimulus plan. The
19 academic recovery allocations that went directly to
20 schools, which was a \$350 million allocation requires
21 25% of that funding is spent directly on arts
22 enrichment programming. And we've also have been
23 working strategically with our office of supplier
24 diversity to make sure that schools know what _____
25 programs are available in that space to make sure

2 that they can utilize that funding on their new E
3 vendors, in addition to other vendors. And so those
4 are things that we've been doing. In addition, you
5 have us stimulus score of \$15 million reduction into
6 the arts budget, which has been critical to getting
7 post pandemic, or during pandemic arts programs back
8 in schools, and we will continue to review
9 opportunities going forward.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we're pushing for the
11 minimum allocation of \$100 per student because I know
12 coming from a family of teachers, if they're given
13 money, they're going to spend it on what they think
14 is most important. If it's earmarked specifically
15 for arts and music than it has to be used for arts
16 and music, which is why we're... we're serious about
17 that. So the ARPA in particular must be obligated by
18 December 31 of 24. So how much in ARPA funding has
19 been... has the D.O.E. allocated so far?

20 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Give me one
21 second while I get that number. So our ARPA
22 allocation has... we've allocated about a billion
23 dollars, I believe, of the ARPA funding.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You said one 1 billion with
3 a B.

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes, sir.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And how much of the
6 ARPA funds have been spent and how much is allocated
7 in FY 23 in the out years?

8 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: The final, so...
9 Well, in the out years, we're continuing to finalize
10 how the budget will sort of work itself out. The
11 SRSA funding source, which is the earlier stimulus
12 allocation from the federal government that you may
13 be familiar with actually expires before the ARPA
14 funding. And so we've been strategically trying to
15 ensure that we are using the SRSA allocations first,
16 because they expire at the end of fiscal year 23. And
17 so, as we are strategically aligning those funds,
18 we're prioritizing those first because ARPA will last
19 a little bit longer.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, you... you mentioned
21 a percentage before you said 60% had been spent, what
22 is... of what? What funding is that?

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thanks for asking
24 me to clarify. 60% of the fiscal year 22, total SRSA

2 and ARPA allocations. So the federal education
3 stimulus allocations.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Okay, I want to I
5 want to move quickly but efficiently here.

6 So mid-year adjustment and enrollment change. So
7 I'm interested to know what guidance D.O.E. has given
8 schools regarding budget cuts. The FY 21 prelim
9 budget identified a savings associated with
10 enrollment decline totaling \$375 million in FY 23,
11 and in the out years, offset by \$160 million in
12 federal stimulus funding. So what guidance is D.O.E.
13 given schools regarding right-sizing budgets in terms
14 of cutting vacancies or personnel, or what programs
15 or categories of funding might be exempt from a
16 budget cut?

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So thank you,
18 sir, for the question. We announced this plan with
19 the Mayor in the middle of February, as you know, in
20 the Preliminary Budget, and that's actually the
21 earliest we've been able to announce to schools that
22 we have information around their next year's budgets
23 in terms of the whole timelines. And so as we move
24 towards what we call our initial school budget
25 allocations, which we are hopefully will come out in

2 the next few weeks, we will be providing additional
3 information to schools around how to support... how
4 they can be supported through their... these
5 enrollment related reductions. And again, we're
6 really grateful to have the federal stimulus funding
7 to offset and give schools the time to right-size
8 their operations to support the students that they
9 have in their buildings now, and we'll share more
10 information with schools as we usually do in the next
11 couple of weeks around hiring and what the details of
12 their budget are.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Generally, and this
14 is somewhat related... Generally speaking, what...
15 what are what are we doing to reduce classroom size?

16 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes, thank you. I'm sorry. I'm
17 trying to go on mute... off mute... coming back and
18 forth.

19 We've been spending a lot of time talking about
20 that. We've been having a number of meetings with
21 the UFT, Michael Mulgrew, having these conversations.
22 Our First Deputy has been kind of leading the charge
23 here, Dan Weisberg. Dan, do you want to speak to
24 that?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yeah, thanks very
3 much, Chancellor. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The first
4 thing I'm... we're doing a number of things. I would
5 say, Chair, that on the capital side, President
6 Kubota could can talk about... or she's already
7 mentioned in her opening remarks, but certainly can
8 speak more specifically about the additional
9 classrooms that we're building. There's basically two
10 things you can do to lower class size. One is build
11 more classrooms. The other is hire more teachers.
12 We're doing both. On the human capital side, we...
13 we have seen class size reduced this past year by
14 over 6%. That's not happenstance. So the... the
15 ability through... through you and a lot of people on
16 this... this hearing to advocate for 100% funding of
17 the fair student funding formula has had a huge
18 impact. That has translated into, you know, the...
19 that's hundreds of millions of dollars going directly
20 out to schools, most of which -- and Lizzy will check
21 me on this -- most of which is going to hire
22 additional teachers. And so what we've seen over the
23 last five years is, even though as the Chancellor
24 pointed out in his opening remarks, we have 120,000,
25 fewer students, we actually have more teachers during

2 that time. And a lot of that is due to fully funding
3 the Fair Student Funding Formula. So we have also
4 gotten direct help from the Council, which we are
5 very grateful for, to allow us to further reduce
6 class size, and we are seeing this happen across the
7 city with lower class sizes. And that doesn't mean
8 that we don't still have some classes, that should be
9 smaller. And we're going to continue to work on this
10 as the Chancellor said, with UFT and our labor
11 partners and others, but we are making significant
12 progress, both because we're building more classrooms
13 in places where they need it, and because we are
14 hiring and retaining more teachers.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I appreciate that.
16 What's... the Council... obviously, it's a priority
17 of the Council, the Speaker, and we want to support
18 you however we can in making that happen. We're all
19 on the same page. Is there is there a goal that..
20 that the D.O.E. has with regard to reducing classroom
21 size? Whether it's online or... (crosstalk)

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: There is a... you
23 know, we have contractual class size limits, which
24 obviously we are we are bound to abide by. The SCA
25 has utilization data that we look at very, very

2 closely in conjunction with SCA. So, you know, we...
3 we don't have specific numerical targets at this
4 point. But, but we do want to see in general, that
5 each of our students ultimately is getting a good
6 personalized experience.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I think it would be helpful
8 to have some sort of goal, I mean, even if it was an
9 ambitious one, or an aspirational one, you know, that
10 we can work towards and, you know, we can keep
11 ourselves honest and check ourselves and how we're
12 doing as far as progress. You know, one of the
13 things anecdotally... you know, I want our public
14 schools to be the best in town, for there to be no
15 other. You know... and this is coming from the son of
16 a Catholic school teacher. So I want our public
17 schools to be the best in town, and that to be the...
18 the obvious option, the number one choice for folks.
19 And I think what we're hearing, certainly through
20 COVID, is what... you know, we're losing parents,
21 because they... you know, just outside the city, they
22 can, you know, have a Little House on the Prairie
23 classroom. I understand that's outside the city, but
24 I think it's something we should be working towards.
25 So we want to be partners in that. So...

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yup. Yeah, we look forward to
3 working with you on it as well, right? You know,
4 there are a number of priorities. Safety is key,
5 lower class size, but there's also a lot of research
6 that says, you know, you've got to increase teacher
7 quality. So that's a huge part of the focus that
8 we'll be leaning in on as well. The reality is that
9 you can reduce class size, but if you don't have a
10 quality teacher in the classroom, it doesn't matter
11 how small the class size actually is. So we got to
12 do all of it. We've got to do it all together. And we
13 continue... we'll continue to work with all of you
14 and the Council on this. It's a priority for us as
15 well.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to I have just
17 a couple more, and then I want to hand it over to
18 Chair Joseph. So with regard to... to school
19 accessibility and reaching maximum practical
20 accessibility, in the follow up to the preliminary
21 budget hearing, the DOE stated that it would take
22 approximately \$4 billion over 20 years. Can the
23 administration commit to appropriating the necessary
24 level of funding in the capital commitment plan?

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I believe we've I believe we
3 also have here... I believe we have Tom is with us,
4 Tom Taratko. Tom, do you want to speak to that?

5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: Thank you,
6 Chancellor, and thanks for the question . Well, I
7 can't, uh, personally answer the... the commitment
8 funding question. But I can tell you that with, I
9 believe it's about 503 buildings that are... don't
10 have any accessible option right now, and with the
11 historic data that we've had, through this plan,
12 doing 57 full accessibility projects to date, and the
13 money that we spent on that, we projected that out to
14 try to get a guesstimate, because we get asked every
15 single year that I've been doing this and that's over
16 10 years, about how long is it going to take to make
17 all our buildings accessible? At some point, we're
18 going to hit a roadblock where the building's age,
19 the configuration, the landlocked status of a
20 Manhattan building, per se, will be adverse to making
21 those buildings. We took an estimate that about 150
22 buildings will be that way. And then we projected
23 out the average costs, looking at those remaining
24 buildings and came up with a very, very guesstimate
25 answer for you, but closer than we've ever had,

2 Chair. (crosstalk) So on the 4 million for every
3 capital plan for the next four, I won't be here. So I
4 can't answer that. Maybe Nina can. She's much
5 younger, so I'll pass it over to her.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina is here as well.

7 (crosstalk)

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Right. I mean, the reason
9 why I'm asking too, I mean, is, in the past, the
10 Council has had to lobby for additional money in the
11 five-year plan. And, you know, I think this is such
12 an important long-term issue, that shouldn't be
13 necessary.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right. Right. Does the SCA
15 want to speak to this as well? Nina?

16 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yes. Thank you. Thank you,
17 Chancellor, and thank you, Chair.

18 So absolutely, I think it is a... it is a
19 priority for this Administration. As you can see,
20 from the development of this capital plan, the fiscal
21 year 2020 to 2024, we've heard all the advocacy for
22 this program, and we've increased it fivefold from
23 the last capital plan. We had less than \$150 million
24 in the last capital plan and now we're at \$750
25 million. And I think that's really important to show

2 our commitment... our ongoing commitment. And that's
3 a dedicated funding source for accessibility
4 projects. Don't forget, as we do our capital
5 improvement projects, if we touch an instructional
6 room, we make that instructional room, if it's not
7 already, accessible as well, so that... while there's
8 \$750 million dedicated in this plan, we also have
9 other streams that that make other rooms, bathrooms,
10 and things of the like, accessible as well. So there
11 is a lot of money dedicated to making our buildings
12 accessible.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So how do we how do we
14 define maximum practical accessibility? And how do we
15 select which sites are chosen for accessibility
16 projects?

17 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I see Tom is coming off of
18 mute... he's sort of (crosstalk) disability.

19 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: Yeah. The
20 Office of... of space management handles that, Chair.
21 And we looked at... when we took over central... the
22 central view of accessibility, we found that there
23 was a large equity issue in the city of New York due
24 to a lot of factors. So we went through with
25 geographic need, or historically underserved

2 districts with the lowest percentage of accessible
3 options for our students. That was first, we also
4 looked geographically in that district, the larger
5 districts that have might have highways crossing the
6 options and trying to get as many options in a
7 geographic area. We look at specialty programs. We
8 look at the enrollment of the schools to serve as
9 much as many children as we possibly can, for bang
10 for the buck kind of thing, and we are at the end of
11 this plan, we will have reached two goals that were
12 stated in the previous Administration. One is to
13 have 50% accessible options in every elementary
14 building that has elementary grades, and the other
15 will be 33% fully accessible buildings in every
16 school district. So that'll be the first time that
17 that equity will be out there in the city of New
18 York. So we're very proud of that.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So... Thank you, Tom.
20 What... what's the goal if we're... if we're... if
21 the DOE is stating, it's going to take approximately
22 \$4 billion over 20 years, how many sites, back in the
23 envelope do we expect to still be inaccessible and 20
24 years?

2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: It's... it's
3 just from a lot of knowledge of the buildings chair,
4 but I would say somewhere between 150 to 200
5 buildings will be... those buildings over 100 years
6 old that have historical classification, or are
7 landlocked, or have configuration issues. Some
8 schools are just too small and surrounded by other
9 buildings and things where to put an interior
10 elevator in there would take away the capacity of the
11 classrooms, and therefore it would... it would not be
12 a practical, you know, project to overtake. You'd be
13 losing valuable seats in an area that might need it
14 to do that. So that building would have to basically
15 be knocked down and rebuilt in newer standards. So
16 we're not close enough to that to give you those
17 details yet, you know, that's in the out years, so...
18 we're getting there.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to switch
20 gears, and then I want to hand it over to our... our
21 Education Chair. So Vision and Hearing Care,
22 something I was speaking to council member Schulman
23 about. Does the D.O.E. offer free vision and hearing
24 screening to students when they enter public schools?

2 I mean, when I was a kid, they used to do that. Do we
3 still do that?

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I believe that we do. Dr.
5 Johnson?

6 CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes. We currently offer free
7 vision screening.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So we don't do the hearing
9 test anymore?

10 CHIEF JOHNSON: Oh yes, we also do vision and
11 hearing. My apologies chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You do both?

13 CHIEF JOHNSON: Were you able to hear me?

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So you do both hearing and
15 vision?

16 CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes, we do hearing and vision.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And then... are
18 children who... who show early signs of print-based
19 and other disabilities given assistance in accessing
20 vision care?

21 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Can you repeat that
22 question for me chair?

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. So if you if you
24 identify a student who has a vision or hearing issue,
25 what's the next step?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: We couldn't hear
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Can you... Can you hear me
5 now?

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It looks like she... speaking
7 of vision hearing chair, it looks like she can't.
8 Something must be wrong with her speaker.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. (background voices)

10 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, can you just repeat the
11 repeat the question again?

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. So yeah, if... I'm
13 happy to hear we're still doing vision and hearing
14 screenings in our public schools. So if a student
15 then is, you know, identified that a kid has a
16 hearing or vision issue, what's the next step?

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So, for
18 disabilities, we have a multi-pronged approach that
19 we're going to take, and I appreciate the question, I
20 think it's... you're asking about both vision issues
21 and about reading concerns, right? And so, any type
22 of print-based disability, right now there are
23 resources that students can use in terms of... if
24 we're talking about vision, there are texts and
25 technology that children can access that will help

2 them with the actual mechanics of reading. In terms
3 of our larger projects that we're working on, and I
4 think that we're spending a great deal of time
5 planning out, and we've allocated some funding to it
6 as well, we're really excited to be building out a
7 grand-scale literacy approach that will ensure that
8 teachers are trained not only in dyslexia awareness,
9 but also in foundational explicit phonics
10 instruction, and making sure that in grades K through
11 2, the schools have phonics curricula, so that all
12 students really have access to that foundational
13 reading instruction.

14 In addition to that, for our students who do not
15 make adequate progress, we are building in... so
16 right now all of our students are screened using
17 general screeners in grades K through 2. Its
18 Acadians in grades 3 through 5. Schools have
19 choices. If our students are not making adequate
20 progress, we are currently piloting additional
21 screeners, so secondary screeners, to look for signs
22 of risk of dyslexia or other print-based
23 disabilities. And when we have that information,
24 we're partnering with different organizations to
25 provide not only the intervention that's needed, but

2 also if students require an additional evaluation, so
3 if we're looking at students who may require that
4 third tier of intervention, we've partnered with
5 organizations to provide evaluations as well. So all
6 of that is going to become part of our larger plan
7 for next year, so that a greater number of students
8 have access to that kind of support.

9 In addition, we are opening to different types of
10 programs. So one is a standalone school for dyslexia
11 that will begin as an incubated model within a school
12 in district 7. And we'll build out 2 sections. So
13 grades three and four, that will become a school for
14 dyslexia. And then in district five, we're actually
15 building out a model that is just an extension of the
16 grade. So an additional set of classes in grades one
17 and two, that will provide really targeted
18 intervention for students who need that kind of
19 additional support. And we'll use both of those
20 programs as opportunities to both train and support
21 additional teachers and leaders. And in fact, we have
22 a partnership with City College to do that pre-
23 service kind of work as well.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: That's helpful. In
25 addition to the vision and hearing screenings, in

2 addition to dyslexia... if... with regard to health
3 care, access to vision or eye care, if a parent is
4 seeking free or reduced cost for vision care, does
5 the DOE provide any assistance? What's the
6 contingency there?

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsey?

8 CHIEF JOHNSON: So, with regard to... thank you
9 Chair for the question. With regard to vision
10 screening, all entrants into the DOE are screened for
11 vision in the... within six months of their entry.
12 And so what that means is that all of our pre-K and
13 kindergarten students are also required to do so in
14 addition to our 3K students. When young people get to
15 grades three through five, there is also some
16 additional screening that occurs at that time. For
17 schools that received the community school funding,
18 there is additional dedicated vision screening and
19 visual supports through the _____ partner
20 partnership, and as well as for families, students in
21 temporary housing. So when we think about families
22 that are most impacted by many of these extenuating
23 and challenging services, being able to provide the
24 additional support for those families is one way that
25 we're working to address this challenge.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I appreciate that.
3 I... uh. We've got a... we've got a long day here.
4 So I want to hand it over to the Education Chair,
5 Chair Joseph, and I thank you all for your time.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

7 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you, Chair Brannan. I
8 appreciate you. All right.

9 So, my first question is contracting nurses. Why
10 is the DOE increasing the budget for contracted
11 nurses by \$40 million. In fiscal 2023, the executive
12 budget increased the budget for contracted nurses by
13 \$49 million in fiscal 2023 from a baseline budget of
14 \$28.3 million. So the Council was told each year
15 building has access to nurses in the current school
16 year, what is the purpose of nearly tripling the
17 budget for the contracted nurses with DOE? And how
18 is DOE determining which school will receive these
19 nurses? How many nursing positions are in the
20 schools now between contracted and DOE staff nurses?
21 And how many will this add as well?

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you, Chair
23 Joseph for the question.

24 The investment that you see in the executive
25 budget actually just continues the same level of

2 contract nursing supports that exist in schools
3 today, and it ensures that we're able to maintain the
4 commitment of having a nurse in each school building,
5 which is critical to obviously our health and safety
6 investments. And it's something that we started at
7 the beginning of the pandemic and have continued
8 throughout the last several years and will continue
9 again in the upcoming school year.

10 CHAIR JOSEPH: So I know some of the nurses also
11 come from DOH. Is there a partnership between you and
12 DOH? And do you know how many nurses are in our
13 schools from DOH and DOE?

14 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: I can speak to
15 the... there is a partnership between DOE and DOH in
16 regards to nursing. The funding that is in the
17 executive budget supports the DOE contract nursing
18 costs, but we do have partnerships with also Health
19 and Hospitals. Some of their contract nurses support
20 our schools. And so between the DOH nurses, the DOE
21 nurses, and our contract nurses provided by H and H
22 and D.O.E.'s contracts, we are able to make sure that
23 our students get the health and safety care that they
24 need.

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: If you wanted a specific
3 breakdown, you know, we could just get that to you.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Absolutely. Also, we addressed
5 some pay parity between the nurses as well?

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: The investment in
7 the executive budget, Chair, is related to the cost
8 of a contract nursing.

9 CHAIR JOSEPH: So the contract nurses... does it
10 take away nursing nurses from DOE as well?

11 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: No. The contract
12 nursing is in addition to the services provided by do
13 DOH, H and H, and DOE nurses.

14 CHAIR JOSEPH: But is there... is there a pay
15 disparity. You see... we see the 4410 with the...
16 with the preschools for special education, there is a
17 pay parity. Is there a pay parity between the nurses
18 as well?

19 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So I think pay
20 parity is a complex issue that we're having
21 conversations with our city partners about across a
22 variety of initiatives.

23 CHAIR JOSEPH: All right, well, that will be one
24 of the things you can address when you answer the
25 letters that I send you. I would love to see some of

2 the numbers and the breakdowns and the data for that.
3 Thank you.

4 Next one of my favorite items, part of this is
5 also CTE. The Council was very happy to see \$33
6 million devoted to pathway expansions in the
7 executive budget and the 2023 and \$52 million in the
8 fiscal year 2024. Will this programming be different
9 from CTE programs? Will these courses also offer
10 college credits and other career pathways? How will
11 the school identify for enrollment? And what is the
12 funding breakdown between spending in high schools
13 and middle schools for FY 23 and FY 24?

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, no, we see this very
15 differently. This is not just a traditional CTE
16 expansion, although there'll be some of that, but we
17 have a vision for a much greater expansion of... of
18 CTE as a focus. And one of the things we've done, we
19 brought on Jade Grieve. Jade, I ask that you speak
20 to this question. This is really in many ways, the
21 Northstar for this Administration, and the work that
22 we're going to do as relates to creating pathways for
23 our students. And Jade is the chief of... of career
24 pathways of for us. Jade?

2 CHIEF GRIEVE: Thank you, Chancellor, and thank
3 you, Chair, for the question. Can everyone hear me
4 okay? Just checking audio. Okay.

5 So thank you. Thanks, again, for the question.
6 I'm glad to be here to talk a little bit about..
7 about this work, and would like to at the outset,
8 just acknowledge and thank the City Council for the
9 consistent support to strengthen College and Career
10 Pathways both through CTE programming, and through
11 high-quality internships. I know this is a big area
12 of focus and I appreciate the support.

13 As the Chancellor shared, we've kind of laid out
14 here a really ambitious vision for expanding career
15 connected learning as one of the big visions in the
16 way that we'll charge towards the Chancellor's
17 Northstar around long term economic security to
18 ensure that all young people are leaving our schools
19 with really strong preparation, awareness
20 experiences, and really set up well to be on a
21 rewarding pathway to a strong career.

22 One of the big areas of focus in this budget, as
23 you mentioned, Chair, is around the expansion of what
24 we're calling student pathways, which is really
25 building actually, in many ways from the strength of

2 CTE programming. But I would say there's a few... a
3 few kind of additional features, and actually, you
4 touched on some of them in your in your question.

5 So were our plans here are to work with a set of
6 schools next year, and as the Mayor said, in his
7 State of the City, to expand that overtime citywide,
8 where we'd hope all students have access to be in
9 some of these high quality career pathways and
10 student pathways. And we see these... these new
11 career pathways having a really strong focus on like
12 as an innovative model that's blending the best of
13 college and career readiness and preparation.

14 And so there's a few features of that. One, that
15 students would be getting the opportunity to, in
16 addition to their academic experience, to really
17 learn through the lens of career. So career
18 connected thematic instruction. Two, that
19 students... that every student would be getting
20 strong advisement to help them kind of plan for their
21 post-secondary path, whatever they might do be that
22 college or career, and it's connected to the kinds of
23 experiences they're having in school. Three, that
24 all students would... would have a chance to get a
25 head start, to really like get it get a sense of what

2 are the breadth of career... careers out there that
3 they might be interested in. And we know that there's
4 a lot to do, particularly given how fast the world of
5 work is changing, to open up more awareness, and
6 exposure to the different kinds of really good paying
7 jobs and careers across the city. And that that
8 ultimately is culminating in not just awareness, but
9 that students are getting expanded work based
10 learning opportunities, including paid work
11 experience.

12 And then lastly, that students are getting this
13 this this notion of a headstart. So we're getting the
14 chance to... to try out... are these really the
15 careers that they're kind of passionate about and
16 find their purpose in.

17 And so to your question, Chair, that includes
18 things like early college credit, and doing that in a
19 meaningful way where students are getting not just
20 any credit, but getting some sequences of... of
21 credits, so really building meaningful amounts of
22 credit in that career pathway, which will give them a
23 chance to, if they want to head into post-secondary
24 to really accelerate and kind of go in with full
25 momentum, having some credit behind them already,

2 and/or that they could get the chance to get industry
3 credentials. We know there are a bunch of
4 opportunities, especially in places like in the
5 fields of technology, that there are industry
6 credentials that can open up some really strong entry
7 level jobs for young people.

8 So those that's how kind of we're thinking about
9 this new focus around career pathways and wanting to
10 start with a set of schools to build that in
11 partnership next year, and excited to... I would
12 certainly love the opportunity to talk more to... to
13 the Council about how that's how that's unfolding,
14 and some other... we're currently in good and
15 important engagement with schools and... and other
16 partners around... around this scope of work.

17 There's a couple of other things that was... that
18 was emphasized in the Mayor's speech that was touched
19 on that relates to this... to this investment as
20 well. The other is around youth apprenticeship,
21 expanding opportunities for youth apprenticeship. I
22 know that's been an interest of the of the Council,
23 as well as wanting to do more in middle schools to
24 really support broader career awareness. So we can
25 happy to take some follow up questions, and further

2 if you'd like to see around some of the difference in
3 cost, but certainly there in middle school we'll be
4 much more focused on career awareness and exposure
5 broadly, and in high schools, we see that's where
6 there's a chance to kind of really go much deeper
7 with the kinds of experiences that I mentioned
8 before. And so there are cost differentials there
9 and working through all of that.

10 CHAIR JOSEPH: How will the student know... how
11 will the schools be identified for enrollment? How
12 does the child know that the school offers this
13 programming? How does how we plan on getting the
14 word out?

15 CHIEF GRIEVE: So shortly, we hope to -- and I
16 think the Chancellor mentioned in his opening remarks
17 around more details to come -- but shortly, we hope
18 to kind of open up the opportunities for schools to
19 be part of the first cohort next year. So we'll be
20 doing this... this pathways build next year in with a
21 group of schools, and so there'll be opportunities
22 to... for schools to apply to be part of that. And
23 as we're doing that, we'll be thinking, the
24 applications, and will be focused around ensuring
25 that we're reaching the real equity lens on the kinds

2 of schools that we're able to bring in and work with
3 to start to build this. So there'll be there'll be
4 broad awareness around it. We'll certainly... and
5 the Chancellor will be engaging in this to make sure
6 that it's clear kind of where these programs and
7 pathways will be. But really, just to emphasize that
8 next year is the first year we'll be building these,
9 and our hope is for that to be much broader and will
10 continue to grow each year.

11 CHANCELLOR BANKS: And you should should just
12 know, as well, Chair, that, you know, there have been
13 a lot of schools in very specific districts around
14 the city which have struggled, which have... which
15 have really never had much exposure in terms of real
16 career opportunities, and it is those districts,
17 those schools, that are... we're going to give very
18 short consideration to providing real opportunity for
19 them.

20 You know, I've often said it's hard for kids to
21 dream of becoming an investment banker, if they've
22 never met one. And this is an opportunity that we
23 believe in deeply, and... and one that we're going
24 to... we're going to be engaging the community. And

2 we'll certainly engage council members as well in
3 this process.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Wonderful. Will there be
5 partnerships with CUNYs in our cities? You know,
6 that's one of our....

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. (crosstalk)

8 CHAIR JOSEPH: in the city.

9 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I had a meeting, had a meeting
10 with Felix yesterday... the Chancellor of CUNY, and
11 that's exactly what we're talking about, together
12 with the mayor's office: How do we build real career
13 pathways? So we're not operating in isolation, and
14 that this is a real K-16 kind of continuum here. And
15 so working together with our... with our partners at
16 CUNY is going to be central to what we're doing as
17 well.

18 CHAIR JOSEPH: Wonderful. Thank you so much.

19 Um, we've talked about New York City schools
20 having a communications problem in the past, and that
21 we need parents to know all about the great programs
22 we have across the city. I want to know what plan do
23 you... you plan to roll out additional great programs
24 in underutilized schools? That's one of the things I
25 complained a lot about, that we don't sell enough of

2 the public schools. So what are the plans? I'd love
3 to hear them.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yep, yep. First of all, one of
5 the things that we do know is that there are a lot of
6 great things that are happening in our schools. Many
7 people don't know that. Let me say that. We very
8 often hear the narrative of nothing but negativity in
9 our schools. And I will tell you, by having visited
10 schools all over the city in the four months that
11 I've been here, there are wonderful and amazing
12 things that are happening in our schools that we
13 should really be proud of, but more importantly, we
14 should all know about.

15 And so, one, it helps for us to get _____ about
16 what their peers are doing, and two, to build trust
17 with our families to learn what's actually happening
18 in our schools. And so it's a priority of our deputy
19 chancellor, our Deputy Chancellor, Kenita Lloyd, is
20 here. She's in charge of Family and Community
21 Engagement as well as external affairs. And so
22 Deputy Chancellor Lloyd, do you want to speak to
23 this?

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: Certainly. Thank you,
25 Chair Joseph. So we are working... the Family, the

2 Office of Family and Community Engagement is working
3 across all of our divisions here at DOE to break down
4 silos, to share communications, and to increase the
5 methods of communications that we have with our
6 families. Those will... We are internally launching
7 and creating and capturing new digital content that
8 we look to share with our families, with our
9 educators, and with our school leaders. We are
10 exploring a variety of ways and innovative uses of
11 new methods of communicating with families using
12 technology, surveys, one-on-one communication, but
13 also critically important is ensuring that all of
14 those tools are available in languages that our
15 families speak. I know that that is a huge priority
16 of the Council, of your committee, and others. So we
17 are working very diligently to expand the capacity in
18 those areas to ensure that our communications are
19 available in multiple languages and multiple methods
20 across the agency and across the city.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: If I may add, you
23 know, I know that thank you for that question. You
24 and I have had wonderful conversations about
25 practices we've seen in schools that are worth

2 sharing. And so part of the plan too, is to create
3 opportunities for schools to learn from one another,
4 to really create those kinds of networks between
5 schools. And we've had some successful programs in
6 the past, through New York City Public Schools. And
7 so we're looking to revamp some of that, right?, to
8 build off of what already existed, to take from what
9 we've learned, and create opportunities for schools
10 to learn from those schools that may already have
11 really wonderful practices. And that will be through
12 school inter-visitations, and also through
13 technology. And so really using a school website,
14 rather, the daily website in order to provide
15 stories, almost, of schools where we can share the
16 information about what practices a school is using,
17 share some of their processes, share information,
18 like templates and resources, and then really connect
19 schools to one another so that they can learn about
20 the challenges as well as what led to the successes.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. My next question is
22 going to be about one of my favorite things: class
23 size. We know that many times schools are
24 underutilized across the city. And that's an example.
25 There can be a great school... as recent data shows

2 me... I was looking reviewing some stuff, and it said
3 255 schools with sixth to eighth grade classes have a
4 class size under 23. Here alone in just these three
5 grades of students enrolling under capacity school,
6 we would have the same impact of creating 3000 seats,
7 the same amount. So SCA is scheduled to open this
8 fall across all grade levels. What can you guys tell
9 me about class size? It's important to us we know
10 that students do well when class sizes are smaller,
11 and teachers also thrive because they have more time
12 to dedicate to these students. So underutilized
13 schools along with class size?

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Sure. Well, first of all,
15 just... just wrapping up on that final point you
16 talked about, the overall narrative in communication
17 as well, I just want to add in one other point, which
18 is a very simple thing, right?, But the reality is
19 that we're... we're completely overhauling our
20 website, which is has been a disaster, and I've heard
21 it from everybody. And it should be much more
22 parent-friendly, and we are committed to that, and
23 that work is happening as we speak.

24 So we spoke a little earlier about the class size
25 issue, but Dan Weisberg, our first deputy, again, you

2 want to lean in and talk a little bit about that?

3 And then, together with Nina, you know, some of the
4 efforts that we're making.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Thank you,
6 Chancellor, and thank you Chair. That... you're 100%
7 correct that we have a number of models, and we have
8 more of them than we've had in the past to what the
9 chancellor has talked about very directly that we
10 have, we've lost enrollment, we've lost a lot of
11 enrollment. So not surprisingly, we have a lot of
12 under-enrolled schools. The medium-term strategy is
13 to -- as the chancellor has talked about many, many
14 times -- is to reestablish trust and win back
15 families. And so I'm hoping, frankly, that we have
16 in the coming years fewer underutilized schools. And
17 that, you know, we but at the same time, we totally
18 agree we need to hold the line on class size, which
19 has been reduced significantly, as I mentioned
20 earlier, as a result of the city council, our state
21 partners, our federal partners that we have been able
22 to, during this time, when you have seen enrollment
23 dropped pretty significantly. The number of teachers
24 is not dropped, in fact, it's increased. And so we do
25 have lots of students that are getting more

2 personalized experience more personalized attention,
3 because of that, because of things like fair student
4 funding being funded fully because of the help we've
5 gotten from... from the council. So, you know, this
6 is going to be the challenge, I would say, but I feel
7 very confident we're going to be able to meet it,
8 which is, Madam Chair, increasing enrollment as much
9 as possible, particularly in those under enrolled
10 schools. Because as you know extremely well one of
11 the problems with an under-enrolled school is, it is
12 very, very difficult to provide a full slate of
13 services and programming for students when you're
14 under-enrolled. So we want to get the enrollment in
15 those schools back up as much as possible at the same
16 time holding the line on class size. And so that...
17 that would be our... and see class size particularly
18 in the early grades, continue to decrease and come
19 down across the city. So that's the... that's the
20 goal for us, and those are the two tracks we are
21 going to be working on.

22 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: And if I may, you know, this
23 is a multi-pronged approach, obviously you've heard
24 everyone saying. And, you know, I don't want to
25 minimize that that overcrowding is solved only by

2 doing these shifts, right? Building needs to occur
3 and we are working on... on building. And instead of
4 taking the... the 60,000 seats with this declining
5 enrollment and saying, you know, we only really need
6 45, we really looked at it strategically with the DOE
7 and said, "Where can we allocate those other 15,000
8 seats, approximately, to help those schools that
9 might not be in an area of identified need?" So we
10 truly believe that with the 45,000 seats that we'll
11 be building in this capital plan to reduce current
12 and projected overcrowding, along with the DOE
13 helping to create those programs to attract and to
14 retain our students that we can achieve the lower
15 class sizes, and this has been a big push, I know,
16 from all the advocates, to really lowering the class
17 size as we have sort of done through our capacity
18 calculations in the blue book: 23 for grades four
19 through 8, 25 for 9 through 12. So our... our data
20 is reflecting those class sizes, and now we're
21 working with the DOE of how best to implement it.

22 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you, I'd love to see that in
23 detail as to how we move forward. We're the only
24 district New York City public schools that has such
25 overcrowding, and you know it doesn't benefit the

2 teacher or the students. So I'd love to hear further
3 details on how we approach that in the next... in our
4 follow up letter. Thank you so much.

5 I'm going to touch on bilingual education. What
6 programming and initiatives with \$11.2 million in
7 fiscal 2023, and \$13.2 million in fiscal 2024 for
8 Bilingual Education Support? Is there any of this
9 programming new? How many languages do you aim to
10 target with these programs? And how many outside the
11 common 10? So I'm going to start with those
12 questions. And I have two follow ups.

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Chair
14 Joseph, appreciate the question. It's an incredibly
15 important issue for us. So this is one that has come
16 up here. We are investing a little over \$11 million
17 in bilingual education for the coming year, and we
18 are committed to providing our multilingual learners,
19 especially our ELLs with high quality instruction, so
20 that they can graduate on the pathway to a rewarding
21 career, long-term economic security, and we want to
22 make sure that they can be validated for what they
23 bring to the classroom, their own language, right?

24 And you heard the chancellor in his opener, talk
25 about investing in bringing in heritage language

2 curricula. Really, what we're looking to do is to
3 expand bilingual programs, and so that looks like
4 both the Transitional Bilingual and dual-language
5 programs and really thinking about expanding where
6 they're already in place, and opening new ones where
7 they aren't yet. And so by 2023, we hope to open or
8 grow about 50 bilingual education programs. We're
9 collaborating with superintendents to review data on
10 ELLs in their districts. And we're looking at
11 building out a two-year plan so that we really can
12 learn from what we're working on. We're working with
13 the school development teams so that they can really
14 help us through what it means to design an actual
15 school so that it is meeting the needs of our
16 language learners. And we'll... we'll have to
17 obviously, look at other factors like current ELL
18 enrollment, home language, parent choice, and pay
19 attention to trends so that we can determine what
20 languages we'll be building out in.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Out of the languages are you...
22 are you planning on expanding out of the common 10.
23 Or...?

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: If there is a demand
25 for any other language, then we would consider that

2 but otherwise, it would remain with the schools that
3 we currently have in place. We don't want to open
4 programs that just can't have continuity. And so we
5 want to make sure that wherever we're opening a
6 program, it is because there is enough of a
7 population for that program to be sustainable, and
8 that we actually have educators. So right now we're
9 looking to partner with families and communities on
10 local plans for those programs and for growth and
11 expansion. And we'll use the data that we have in
12 hand to make decisions.

13 CHAIR JOSEPH: As a former educator also, I know
14 that you can build a bilingual program but also
15 rates... retaining teachers... bilingual educators
16 have always been a shortage across New York City,
17 either with bilingual education licensing or even ESL
18 licensing. How do you plan to address that as well?

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that
20 question. A really important question, and actually
21 a conversation that we've been having with teachers
22 very recently. We currently have incentives in place
23 for our content area teachers to receive bilingual
24 extensions. What we don't have yet and something
25 that we've we're hoping to have conversations with

2 the state about is how we can go about actually
3 getting those extensions for our current ELL teachers
4 so that they can be content teachers as well. But we
5 are looking to recruit more teachers with that
6 bilingual license, and we've been working with our
7 teacher recruitment and quality office to work on
8 that very specifically, and have started having
9 conversations with folks in higher learning, and we
10 met actually with the State last week to talk a
11 little bit about how we can work together on that
12 teacher pipeline.

13 _____: (inaudible)

14 CHAIR JOSEPH: I can't hear. I didn't hear that.

15 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Oh, I'm on mute. Okay. Can
16 you hear me now, Chair?

17 CHAIR JOSEPH: Yes.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, one of the things we're
19 excited about also is possibility of a partnership
20 with the Dominican Republic, we've... We've met with
21 the council, General there. They're excited about
22 lining up dozens of their teachers to actually come
23 and work here in some of our shortage areas. So
24 these are conversations that are also happening and a
25 part of a plan that we exploring. We're exploring

2 all possibilities, and to the degree that you all
3 have other ideas and suggestions as well that would
4 help us, I think we've got to think outside of the
5 box, and not just continue to do it in the way that
6 we've been doing it, and this relationship that we're
7 forging with D.R. is something that is an out-of-the-
8 box approach, and something we're excited about.

9 CHAIR JOSEPH: Bilingual pupil services is also a
10 great pipeline for bilingual educators.

11 I will... um... how will the DOE identify which
12 50 schools will receive this new programming? Can
13 you commit to working with council to identify these
14 schools?

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that
16 question, Chair. Yes. So we're going to collaborate
17 with superintendents. We're going to be looking at
18 ELL data in their respective districts, and would
19 absolutely welcome Council to be part of that process
20 as well. And as you know, a real big priority for
21 the Chancellor this year... actually, for this
22 Administration in general, has been to engage the
23 community in all processes. And so it'll be very
24 important for us to make sure that we have really
25 strong community engagement through our family and

2 community engagement, folks to that we are really
3 listening to the needs of our communities.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah. That point again, it...
5 for me, it will go without saying that engagement
6 with the Council is something that I stand ready to
7 do at any moment. And I welcome it, I don't believe
8 that we can impact that... our students and our
9 schools and our families at the maximum level, if we
10 just think we're going do it through the people who
11 work here at the D.O.E. It will not happen. We can
12 move it, but we won't be able to move in a maximum
13 way. I see every one of you who are in the City
14 Council. Each one of you are community leaders, you
15 know, your schools in your community, you know the
16 parents, you know the principals. So we... you
17 know, we I don't ever want to be in a place of being
18 adversarial at all. This is... we are... we should
19 be real partners. And that's why I've sought to reach
20 out to as many of you as I possibly can. And I say to
21 all of you even now: Feel free to reach out to me
22 with your ideas. We don't have to wait until the
23 hearing. You can always share with me on a regular
24 basis your thinking and your suggestions, and I'm in
25 full partnership with you on all of this.

2 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you Chancellor Banks. How
3 much of this funding will support the hiring of the
4 ELL instructional specialists? What does this
5 timeline look like? How will you determine the
6 placement? What specific role will the ELL
7 specialists play in bilingual education? And how will
8 you fund these positions after fiscal 2024?

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So part of that is
10 that is the planning that is taking place right now,
11 right? And so we are making decisions about each of
12 those components. And then part of that means
13 working with our local districts again. So really
14 making decisions about how much staffing we already
15 have in place, when we're looking only to expand. Do
16 we have enough teachers in those... those buildings
17 and in the schools? So all of that is being worked
18 out at this time. And that \$11.2 million will...
19 will be used in part for training, in part for the
20 curricula, and in part for hiring personnel. We've
21 already started working too with Council Members, and
22 so we're really excited about continuing that. We
23 met with district school district 24 and 30 _____
24 this week, and we anticipate that with the Chair's
25 experience with English language learners as well,

2 that will, we'll certainly have a really strong
3 partnership there. So we appreciate.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. Thank you. Family
5 engagement. I know that's one of the things that
6 Chancellor Banks talks a lot about.

7 What programming initiatives will the \$13.8
8 million in the fiscal 2023 and the \$3.8 million in
9 fiscal 2024 for parents and family engagement
10 support? Is there any of this programming new? How
11 many of the community coordinators will the \$1.8
12 million fund, and what will be the average salary?

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: Thank you for that,
14 Chair Joseph. So first, let me just say that... just
15 to re-echo the Chancellor's sentiments about our
16 commitment to increasing dialogue with families and
17 parent leaders. We intend to use those funds to
18 backfill vacant positions to start, in an attempt to
19 increase staff capacity to support our ability to
20 engage families. As some of you know that engagement
21 happens on various ways and on a multitude of issues
22 around the DOE, not only in family engagement, but
23 through the Office of Student Enrollment, school
24 utilization, focus groups and other methods that
25 happened around the agency. So we really are working

2 interdepartmentally to share that... share that
3 feedback. And as I said before, to break down
4 those... those silos by having more people on the
5 ground, more people working across our agency, and
6 more people in direct conversation with families. We
7 are exploring innovative methods to meet families
8 where they are, such as the use of targeted...
9 targeted surveys, additional digital content, videos,
10 and a variety of other ways.

11 We're going to continue to engage families,
12 parent leaders, advocates, through one-on-ones,
13 through group meetings, through town halls... and
14 town halls using every method that we have available
15 so that no stone is left unturned.

16 CHAIR JOSEPH: The community coordinators you
17 plan to hire... how much will you hire? How many can
18 you hire? And what's the average salary?

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: I will follow up with
20 an answer on both of those, Chair Joseph.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. Um foster care, the
22 last time we met, we talked in the fall of 2021,
23 after a lot of years of advocacy, the DOE committed
24 to hiring seven, first ever team to focus on
25 educational needs of students in foster care. How

2 many of the seven positions have posted up on the DOE
3 sites? Have you begun the interviewing process? What
4 does the hiring timeline look like? Can you share the
5 average salary for these titles with us, please?

6 Thank you.

7 CHIEF JOHNSON: Morning again, Chair Joseph,
8 thank you for the question. So we have posted... we
9 posted four of the positions. As per our previous...
10 previous hearing on foster care, we posted four of
11 those positions. We are in the process of
12 interviewing for those positions now, with a goal of
13 hiring and filling those positions shortly. We
14 intend to continue to negotiate... to expand... to
15 increase the remaining positions available and with
16 regard to the salary and and offerings they vary
17 with... with regard to each of the positions and
18 capacity, and I can get that information back to you
19 at a later time.

20 CHAIR JOSEPH: Well, I look forward it... I
21 definitely look forward to it because I would love
22 that unit to be up and running. So by the fall the
23 students are being served. It's been long overdue.
24 Thank you.

2 My next question is for SCA. We've heard concern
3 about SEM moving forward towards more prefabricated
4 mainstream masonry panels over the use of typical
5 handset brick laying. Can you give us some details
6 on when SCA chooses to use utilize prefabricated
7 masonry in the projects. Does it SCA have any
8 analysis on the effectiveness of prefabricated versus
9 traditional masonry? Is it cost? Impacts on job or
10 the broader city economy? Can you answer that one?
11 Please?

12 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you, Joseph, for that
13 question. Yes, we have a team that's continuously...
14 we have a unit within the SCA that's continuously
15 looking at new materials, and they analyze it, and
16 their usage and their durability. And we have to say
17 that precast panel is being used a little bit more
18 than the traditional masonry as... as we have in the
19 past for both... both reasons that you cited quite
20 honestly, cost and speed. We have found that it's...
21 it is cost effective, and it is faster to install. So
22 we have moved a little bit towards that. It doesn't
23 happen in every application of our new school. And
24 again, this is for new builds, so our traditional
25 schools that have you know, bricks are already there.

2 When we replace those bricks, we are replacing them
3 in kind. So we are replacing them with bricks.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you.

5 Um, Malcom, I'm opening up the floor to my
6 colleagues for questioning.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Chairs Joseph and
8 Brannon. We will now turn to Councilmember
9 questions. I do you want to remind all council
10 members present, we're dealing with the two biggest
11 committees, so we have lots of questions. I ask that
12 you please stick to the five-minute timer and listen
13 for the sergeant's queue. We do have another agency
14 that has to appear before us later on today.

15 Many of you have come in and out of the zoom, so
16 I have locked in your places with hands raised. So
17 we're going to go off of my list. We're going to
18 start with councilmember Gennaro followed by
19 councilmembers Dinowitz, Hanif, Brooks-Powers,
20 Narcisse, Louis, and any others, but we will first
21 turn to Councilmember Gennaro.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you team
24 moderator. Thank you, Chair Brannan. Thank you, Chair
25 Joseph, I like to thank... I'd like to thank the

2 Chancellor for making a highlight of Edison High
3 School in your remarks. That is in my district, and
4 I worked hard with Principal Moses Ojeda. I want to
5 give him a shout out. And I want to thank you, Mr.
6 Chancellor for being very available and open to me
7 and to SCA President Kubota, thank you for your
8 investment in the Harvest School. I was part of that
9 school's founding when it was in Bushwick, and
10 further when it was moved over to Governor's Island,
11 and that's going to be a big part of that, you know,
12 institute is going to be founded there. So thank you
13 for all that.

14 Let me get into my questions, of which I will be
15 brief. This is for President Kubota. During your
16 statement, you talked about the boilers in the
17 schools that currently burn number four, and that are
18 going to be upgraded. A local law, as you may know:
19 all buildings must phase out number four oil by
20 January 1, 2030. I'm trying to accelerate the
21 citywide phase out of number four oil burning by five
22 years to January 1, 2025, by local law. And I would
23 ask... rather than discussion of it, I would ask that
24 you send me some kind of analysis... your people
25 would send me an analysis about your ability to meet

2 that 2025 number four oil phase out, if possible to
3 do so. Certainly, you know, any correspondence
4 between me and the SCA would also, you know,
5 necessary loop Chair Joseph. I never, you know,
6 believe in interacting with agencies, if I don't loop
7 in the Chair. So let me just put that out there.
8 And get into my next thing, and then just respond as
9 you see fit, Madam President.

10 The Carbon Free and Healthy Schools Initiative,
11 which is driven by Climate Jobs New York calls for a
12 deep... deep energy retrofits and the installation of
13 solar power and battery storage and advocates for
14 schools and communities that have been historically
15 under-resourced and also suffering from high rates of
16 childhood asthma and the negative impacts of climate
17 change. We asked that these schools be made a
18 priority. If this effort is fully implemented, it
19 would create over 60,000 good union jobs. It would
20 save millions... save the schools millions annually
21 in energy costs and make the schools healthier and
22 safer.

23 So my question finally: Are there plans, you
24 know, to make these improvements that I just
25 outlined, and to increase energy efficiency and

2 prepare schools for decarbonisation, and... and for
3 renewable energy sources, such as solar power panels.
4 And feel free to talk about like the number four item
5 that I put on the table. I haven't given you a lot
6 of time, but there you have it.

7 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. Thank you,
8 Councilmember. Great questions. We love all of our
9 sustainability measures.

10 Absolutely. We are certainly working not just
11 with the administration, but with our partners at
12 D.C.A.S. uh, to look at, you know, all things, both
13 solar, and our boiler program as well. We are
14 committed to coming off of number four oil as quickly
15 as possible, and we are looking at alternative
16 sources to that, right? We... we look at potentially
17 electrification as one way, not just number four oil,
18 reducing it to gas or biofuel, but we are exploring,
19 and we constantly explore those different options.

20 And so that is all under discussion right now.
21 And we're trying to think of the most cost effective,
22 seamless way of doing it because we also, when we,
23 when we move to electrification, we have to employ a
24 whole different set of contractors rather than our
25 traditional boiler moving from oil to gas. So that's

2 all under exploration right now. And we're happy to
3 share, you know, more details about that, maybe a one
4 on one, I'd love to have that discussion with you.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: But we also we are looking at
7 energy conservation methods for building
8 electrification, as I mentioned. We have our pre-K
9 center opening at Hall of Science. That is 100%
10 Electric.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam President, I would
12 like to stay within the five minutes. You've been
13 very gracious with your comments and your... you
14 know, willingness to indulge, perhaps, you know, we
15 should take this offline. And as I said before, I
16 will not have any communications with you or the SCA
17 that don't loop in Chair Joseph. So thank you very
18 much. Thank you very much to the chairs and to the
19 moderator. Thank you.

20 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
22 Gennaro. Next, we'll turn to Council Member
23 Dinowitz.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time started.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good morning. Thank
3 you, Chairs Joseph and Brannon. Thank you,
4 Chancellor, Deputies, and Chiefs. I want to talk
5 about the budget of federal stimulus money. I first
6 want to clarify that 100% of the funding that's not
7 being spent this year can be rolled over into next
8 year? I just want to clarify that point.

9 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes,
10 Councilmember, that's absolutely correct.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good to hear. There was
12 a there was an article in Chalkbeat, in which...
13 which one of your spokespeople said the opposite. I
14 imagine there are a number of teachers and principals
15 who are concerned. I'm happy to send you the
16 article. I have the... It's okay.

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember. I
18 actually... if I make may clarify. Because I think
19 what you're... (crosstalk)

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Sorry, it's okay. You
21 can clarify later. I have four minutes and 15
22 seconds...

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: ... and I believe you.
25 I just want to make sure... I trust what you're

2 telling me now, I believe you. I do want to focus on
3 that money and how we're spending that money. I
4 understand what you said in your statement about
5 certain things not being able to be spent because...
6 they... like furniture and supply chain issues. But I
7 want to ask about the other funding for academic
8 supports for teachers, things like tutoring, and that
9 money is also not being spent. I just want to ask
10 you about some of the issues in that portion of the
11 spending, please.

12 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure, and I do
13 you want to just clarify your earlier question. I
14 think the Chalkbeat article that you're referencing
15 is talking about not allowing schools with
16 underspending to roll funding from one year to
17 another. We as an agency, and as a grantor, are able
18 to roll funding and unspent money from one year to
19 another. So I think that's an important
20 clarification I just wanted to put on the record
21 there.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you.

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: In terms of the
24 academic recovery allocations that we've made
25 directly to schools, we are seeing spending in that

2 area. However, I just want to pull this back to the
3 start of the school year when the VAX mandate was in
4 place, when things were uncertain, we had the Omicron
5 virus... or Omicron surge. There's been uncertainty
6 throughout the school year, some of that has resulted
7 in delays and spending on the school-based
8 allocations, in addition to the well-publicized sort
9 of staffing shortages that we've had as a result of
10 some... of a variety of different things that I've
11 mentioned. And so some of those things have combined
12 towards underspending in schools, but we've heard, by
13 and large, from principals that this funding has been
14 effective and welcomed.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Wonderful, I want to
16 talk about those staffing issues, you know,
17 Chancellor, CFO, everyone here, I really value a lot
18 of the pillars that were laid out earlier this year.
19 You know, and some of the things you said about K
20 through 16 a continuum, that school is part of a
21 continuum, you know, working with our city partners,
22 and scaling and restoring what works, that's pillar
23 number two, and I want to highlight, you know, a
24 particular program that's called CUNY Tutor Corps.
25 This is a program that allows CUNY Students to tutor.

2 Pretty self explanatory to tell. CUNY Tutor Corps,
3 where CUNY students go into schools, middles, and
4 middle and high schools and provide direct
5 instruction and direct support to our students. And
6 this results in positive outcomes, individualized
7 attention, increased test scores, all of the things
8 that we want to see. And in your conversations, I'm
9 wondering if this particular program has come up. And
10 if you've been able to talk about scaling this
11 program? Because it works, and because it, I think
12 fits in really nicely with pillar number two.

13 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I completely agree. And it's
14 interesting that it came up yesterday when we met the
15 Chancellor of CUNY. And so you're right. It is an
16 example of exactly what we're talking about
17 programming that actually works. Deputy Chancellor
18 Quintana is the one who is really charged with
19 driving this. Deputy Chancellor?

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you. And
21 thank you for that... thank you for that question.

22 So we are actually working together with CUNY,
23 und using CUNY Tutor Corps. Particularly this summer,
24 you'll see their work across some of our schools, and
25 they are working with a number of schools right now

2 as well. And we want to build out some of that, not
3 only to provide that type of intervention where there
4 are gaps in learning, but also in partnership with
5 career pathways work that Jade Grieve is leading,
6 we're talking about using those opportunities to help
7 build out future teacher pipelines, so that we have
8 access to additional... or more exposure rather for
9 students in college and students at our own schools
10 to see teaching as a viable option.

11 So we are working together with CUNY. We're
12 working with a number of other organizations to
13 provide high-dosage tutoring, and we are piloting
14 some of those now...

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ... and we'll be
17 using many of them in the summer as well, so that we
18 can see what's really going to be beneficial for next
19 year.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: So can we look forward
21 to seeing some of these unspent funds going towards
22 this... going towards programs like CUNY... CUNY
23 Tutor Corps? Can we look forward to those funds
24 being spent? Because conversations are great,

2 they're slightly different than committing to that...
3 to that funding and investment.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, what we are committed to
5 is ensuring that we provide a level of excellence for
6 all of our students, and... and we've been engaged in
7 dozens of conversations with lots of different
8 service providers, and there have had a lot of great
9 ideas that have been brought to us. So are we
10 shifting... sifting through all of this to try to
11 figure out the best... the best things. And so we
12 appreciate the heads up on this. We've already got a
13 heads up on it. It sounds like a great program that
14 would be very helpful. It's being taken under strong
15 consideration.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Yeah, it's a great
17 program that will help our students, our K-12
18 students, help the CUNY students get that experience,
19 and honestly help the teachers are already struggling
20 to address the individualized needs of our students.
21 And one can only throw around the word
22 differentiation so much before you actually have to
23 have a real plan and real... real individualized
24 attention and intervention. This is a wonderful
25 program, and I think that this money... this federal

2 stimulus money that's not being spent can certainly
3 be used for this program.

4 Again, Chancellor, Deputies and Chiefs, I want to
5 thank you all for your time, and Chairs, thank you.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll call
8 on Council Member Brooks-Powers.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 Hi, and good morning. It's great to see you,
11 Chancellor, and the team. I have some questions for
12 the Department of Education and School Construction.
13 I just want to ask all the questions and then allow
14 both agencies to answer afterwards. So for the
15 Department of Education, since the start of the
16 pandemic, what mechanisms and resources have you
17 enabled to ensure students in under-resourced areas
18 have access to reliable broadband or other internet
19 service? Especially for students in temporary
20 housing? How have you been able to reach students
21 that do not have access to reliable broadband? This
22 is a consistent thing that I've been hearing in the
23 community in terms of concerns throughout the
24 pandemic, but even beyond. What was the success rate
25 of your hotspot lending program? Do you plan to work

2 with the same providers to expand access? And how is
3 AARP funding to expand its reach?

4 For School Construction Authority, many areas
5 citywide like Edgemere in my districts are bracing
6 for an influx of new development and residents as a
7 result of new zoning projects and other significant
8 housing investments. How are the department of
9 Education and School Construction Authority preparing
10 to meet the needs of families and residents in the
11 areas experiencing significant growth? How has the
12 pandemic affected the school construction authorities
13 ability to complete capital projects in a timely
14 manner? Are there any other factors causing delay?
15 And I know I've been in communication with both
16 agencies, pertaining to, one, the need for an actual
17 school as a part of the Arverne East project where I
18 know one has been sited, but still not anything put
19 in motion for it, but then also in Arverne-By-The-
20 Sea, there was a school promised to the community
21 about 15 years ago, and through substantial delays
22 from the past Administration, inflation has left a
23 gap, and it is a \$7 million gap. I want to
24 understand how we can be able to resolve that so that
25

2 they can be shovels in the ground for that school for
3 the community. Thank you.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: So why don't we... why don't
5 we start out with the issue around operations
6 broadband and the hotspots? Camille Joseph Varlack,
7 you've been, you've been driving that work. Do you
8 want to provide some support around that?

9 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you. Thank you,
10 Chancellor. Thank you for the question. Actually,
11 I'm going to ask our Chief Technology Officer,
12 Anuraag Sharma, to go ahead and respond in detail
13 with respect to the broadband and access questions.

14 CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER SHARMA: Thank you for
15 thank you for the question. You know, we are very,
16 very committed to making sure that our students have
17 the right devices and access to broadband when it
18 comes to their academics. And so from the start of
19 the pandemic, we have distributed over 675,000 LTE
20 enabled devices, both Chromebooks and iPads. All of
21 the services are split between two providers,
22 Verizon, as well as T Mobile. So we continue to work
23 with our schools as and when more device needs come
24 up, we fulfill those across our school system.

2 In addition, we've also distributed over 29,000
3 hotspots, which have coverage as well, LTE coverage.
4 And so schools are still able to request more
5 hotspots as they need them. And we are able to
6 fulfill those requests. And so right now we have
7 inventory on both devices and hotspots for schools
8 that... that need them they work through... through
9 our team. They request them and we were able to get
10 them in in very short order. So you know, we will
11 continue to work on this program and expand as we
12 need it for both LTE services across our system.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Thank you.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina. There were a number of
15 questions around the school construction return.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Yes, hi, Nina. I
17 don't see you on the screen through.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Did we lose her? She's trying
19 to... she's trying to unmute let's give her a second.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You should be able to unmute
21 yourself, Nina.

22 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Council Member said please.
23 She doesn't want to lose her time.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. I graciously ask
3 for an extension of time from my Chairs to get my
4 response. The connectivity of this broadband.

5 VICE PRESIDENT LIU: I'm not sure. Nina might be
6 having some technical difficulties. This is Cora Liu,
7 from the School Construction Authority. So I can try
8 to answer your questions... some of your questions,
9 Council Member Powers, I think your first question
10 was about development.

11 We do work with all city agencies, whether it's
12 city planning EDC, HPD, when there are both city
13 lands as well as private development. So to make sure
14 we are involved in the planning phase, and
15 there are many times when there is the need or there
16 is the possibility for land to be reserved, we try to
17 grab them and to make sure that school planning is
18 part of the overall rezoning planning. We review...
19 review the citywide permit data for your buildings
20 and development data from other developments annually
21 to make sure we have the most comprehensive
22 information in our planning for new seats.

23 I think your next question was about COVID's
24 impact on our project schedule. Um, we definitely
25 had... our project schedule has suffered from COVID.

2 There was a period of time all our projects were
3 paused. So some of the projects were delayed. We
4 have communicated with schools and other communities
5 and stakeholders to make sure they understand the
6 impact, that we're doing our best to try to catch up
7 and make sure the schedules do not slip any further.

8 I think your third question was about the charter
9 school... or the school that's planned as part
10 Arverne-By-The-Sea development. As you know, we've
11 been working with your office, as well as other
12 agencies and city halls to try to fulfill the
13 commitment of that, helping build a night school.

14 We have followup meeting, I think, scheduled for
15 next week that we will hopefully to talk to you with
16 more details about how to... how to help the charter
17 organization and school to make it happen. So we
18 love to connect with you more next time... next week.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Thank you. Thank
20 you so much for that. And thank you for the work that
21 you all do, because it School Construction Authority
22 isn't normally a leader around MWBE's, and thank you
23 Chancellor for your responses as well.

24 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll
3 call on Council Member Hanif

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much. I have
6 a couple questions, and I'd like to start with how
7 much will it cost the D.O.E. to fill the additional
8 1,363 current vacancies for school safety agents?
9 Does the current administration plan to fill these
10 vacancies, and how many?

11 And then as a follow up to that, I wanted to
12 know, just based on some of the education equity
13 advocates we've been working with, the recommended
14 ratios of social workers and guidance counselors to
15 adequately meet the needs of students is one social
16 worker and one guidance counselor for every 150
17 students in most schools, and one for every 50
18 students in high-needs schools. And then to reach the
19 recommended ratios over the next five years, the city
20 should invest \$150 million to hire 500 new counselors
21 and social workers this year. The current
22 administration's prioritization of funding,
23 additional school policing, infrastructure, culture
24 and practices in a school system, where not every
25 school has a social worker is absolutely

2 unacceptable. Will the administration commit to
3 invest \$150 million to hire 500 new counselors and
4 help students grow and thrive instead of hiring new
5 school cops to replace current vacancies?

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you,
7 Councilmember for the question. In terms of the
8 school safety agent question, they're employees of
9 the New York City Police Department. So we would
10 defer those questions to them around cost estimates.

11 And then in terms of the social worker question,
12 I'll start and then turn that over to Dr. Johnson.
13 From our team to speak more. We have used stimulus
14 funding to make great strides in the investment of
15 social workers directly in our schools. We've added
16 600 social workers, guidance counselors, and other
17 school psychologists with this funding, which has
18 been hugely helpful and successful. And we continue
19 that investment over the next couple of years. In
20 addition, with the increase in the Fair Student
21 Funding Floor, this school year, we've seen schools
22 use that funding in some instances to also hire
23 additional... additional social workers and
24 counselors. And so I think we have seen investments
25 in that area. We're always looking to do more, and

2 I'll turn it over to Dr. Johnson to share more
3 details.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you.

5 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you, Council Member for the
6 question. I think, at the core of your question is
7 this notion of how we provide supports to young
8 people. And so by increasing the ratio of guidance
9 counselors and social... social workers, as well as
10 school-based mental health supports for young people,
11 we provide greater access. I think we've got to
12 rethink how we are actually calculating the ratio,
13 and think about how we increase the number of people
14 who have access to support for young people, both
15 clinical supports, as well as non-clinical supports.

16 And so in doing so, we've... we've activated...
17 in addition to the hiring that Lindsay mentioned,
18 we've also activated Healing Centered Ambassadors,
19 who are community and family members who are trained
20 in de-escalation strategies, different engagement
21 strategies. If you think about... if you think about
22 it in this way: If we're able to activate and
23 support community members, we actually have a
24 generational strategy, because young people come from
25 homes. And if young people are experiencing trauma,

2 a lot of times communities are experiencing trauma.
3 So by activating the Healing Centered Ambassadors,
4 we've been able to really deepen community
5 strategies. We have Healing Centered Ambassadors
6 across all of the districts, but we welcome funding
7 to... to activate more. And we also are... we've
8 launched a smaller pilot to deepen that work and have
9 Healing Centered projects, where community members
10 work in tandem with the social workers and guidance
11 counselors within the community to think about
12 targeted projects and to support young people to
13 provide greater support.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And how much funding is
15 going towards the Healing Centered Ambassadors and
16 how many exist right now across city schools?

17 CHIEF JOHNSON: So there are... I can get back to
18 you in terms of the... the full funding, but there
19 are 92 Healing Ambassadors across... across 16
20 targeted districts. We have a smaller pilot that
21 we've launched to deepen... to deepen the work across
22 an additional 20 targeted schools and locations.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I really appreciate that.
24 And I absolutely want to agree with your approach. I
25 think that is the approach that's absolutely critical

2 to just the city's recovery at this moment. So
3 really excited to learn more about the Healing
4 Centered Ambassadors initiative.

5 And then very quickly, I want to ask about
6 culturally competent curricula. The research is
7 clear that students that engage in a curriculum that
8 embraces and affirms their identities and cultures
9 perform better and graduate at higher rates. Yet,
10 according to a report from the New York City
11 Coalition for Educational Justice, 84% of books in 10
12 commonly used elementary school curricula are written
13 by white authors, and 51% have white main characters
14 despite the fact that 85% of the city's public school
15 students are black, Latinx, or Asian. What percent
16 of percentage of current New York City students have
17 access to a culturally responsive sustaining
18 education? How many dollars in this proposed budget
19 are dedicated to CRSE programming? And how does this
20 compare to previous budgets? That is the first
21 component. And then: Will the city commit to
22 inclusion of Asian American history in any plans for
23 culturally responsive education and curricula? You
24 know, with increased... increase in targeted hate
25 experienced in our Asian American communities and

2 resulting in trauma. It's just critical that CRSE in
3 our city is inclusive of Asian American history.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you.

5 Thank you for that question, Council Member Hanif.

6 We're really excited actually about what we are able
7 to... what we are proposing to do, actually, what
8 we've already started to do with the collaboration of
9 community organizations. We are building out a range
10 of different curricula that reflect the ethnicity and
11 history and... and lives of our varied student
12 population. So we are in the process of building out
13 a Black Studies curriculum that is actually happening
14 through a number of community based organizations
15 with the partnership with the Department of
16 Education. We are also building out an AAPI
17 curriculum, again, with universities and local
18 organizations and the participation of varied members
19 of the community as well. We already implemented an
20 LGBTQ plus curriculum.

21 And each of these, the exciting part of this is
22 that they are being integrated into what already
23 exists. So our API and LGBTQ plus, for example, have
24 already been... or we're working on rather, embedding
25 them into our passports, social studies curriculum

2 that is already present in over 90% of our schools.
3 We are also working with each of these groups to make
4 sure that we can integrate parts of these curricula
5 into our different existing content areas, so that it
6 isn't exclusively a part of social studies. But we
7 want to make sure, more than anything, that a range
8 of students can... can see the information and must
9 see the information and not relegate it exclusively
10 to a an elective course that maybe only happens in a
11 high school that chooses to take it. And so that's
12 one way that we're doing that. And we... for the
13 AAPI, hope to pilot some of those lessons in the
14 coming year, and then we will again, it's a 2-year
15 process to complete the whole curriculum.

16 The... In terms of the other portions of CRSE
17 that you've mentioned, we continue to use the
18 framework that was developed with a partnership with
19 NYU, and so that work continues and has not... has
20 not slowed down actually, and it is going to be a
21 very big part of what we will do and it's partnership
22 actually, between Dr. Johnson's department in my own,
23 that will work on making sure that all of our schools
24 are building in culturally responsive curricula,
25 culturally responsive practices, and culturally

2 responsive classroom libraries. One of the things
3 that our team has also been working on is increasing
4 the diversity of the texts that are available to our
5 children through the online library. So through
6 Sora, our kids have access to a range of books. And
7 in fact, part of the Mosaic funding last year was
8 used to create... or to send, actually, to schools
9 diverse library collections, and we'll continue to do
10 that this year, as well. And we are still building
11 out Mosaic. And so we're really, really excited about
12 that work. I know that we started the parent
13 engagement last year, and so we're going to continue
14 with that work. We've put together a small team that
15 will build that out as well. And so you'll see that
16 coming in, in future years, too.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: That's really wonderful.
18 Exciting. I'd love to be invited to a classroom to
19 see like how the API curriculum or the Black Studies
20 programming is taught. I would be really excited. I
21 was a Women's and Gender Studies major at Brooklyn
22 College. And that was, I think, my first
23 experience... sort of reading authors of diversity in
24 the classroom. And so I would love to be engaged in

2 that. And then do you have a budget number that is
3 going towards the CRSE in the... in the fiscal year?

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember, I
5 can speak to that. We're finalizing the budget based
6 on the feedback from Carolyn and the Chancellor and
7 others, and we'll be able to share an update soon.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much. My
9 time is up. But I'll be following up with more
10 questions about school bathrooms to the SCA. Thank
11 you.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next, we'll
13 hear from Council Member Narcisse, followed by
14 councilmembers Louis, Stephens, Baron and Carr, but
15 we'll turn to Council Member Narcisse.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Good morning. Good
18 morning Chair... Both chairs, Justin and Ritalin, and
19 Chancellor, thank you for staying so long, and every
20 step that make it possible. Thank you.

21 One of the question that I have while I was here
22 is for SCA first. I'm hearing from the business
23 perspective, being in business, I'm listening to Ms.
24 _____ bringing the precast panel, right? So when
25 your bring the precast panel, you're going to take

2 jobs out of the local. So I want to know how many
3 masonry that producing block in our city, block
4 manufacturers that we have. And I want... I would
5 like for you to keep in mind when you take
6 manufacturers, and most of those manufacturers are
7 located usually in the places where people who need
8 the most, and those school... those children are
9 going to the school that they build, and they are
10 taxpayers. So I want to know how it's going to
11 affect them, because they're usually in a place where
12 people need those jobs. SCA?

13 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. I think I have
14 this, right? Thank you, Council Member for that
15 question, and apologies to the entire council for
16 freezing. I'm glad Cora was able to address some of
17 your questions.

18 So I think I mentioned before that... that, yes,
19 while we look at precast as an alternative, we are
20 not eliminating the use of brick and block. In fact,
21 you know, I sort of alluded to this, most of our
22 schools we are only building probably, you know, in
23 the last couple of years, using precast as a... as a
24 cost effective, accessible, and typically faster way
25 of delivering new schools. But the remaining 1300 to

2 1400 of our school buildings are brick and block, and
3 when we replace that -- which we do. We spend a lot
4 of money on our masonry and our parapets, making sure
5 that our buildings are watertight -- we are... we are
6 replacing them in kind... So with brick and block.
7 So it is a very small percentage of what we're doing.
8 And again, we are just exploring different...
9 different methods. You know, 20 years ago, there was
10 a lot of, you know... do we do rainscreen? Do we
11 do...? You know, almost all sorts of delivery
12 methods in terms of exploring cost and speed.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Yeah, I understand that
14 we have to be cost effective. And I'm one of the
15 person that don't like waste, but at the same time, I
16 have to keep in mind, who we are affecting the long
17 term, not the short term, not what... what's in front
18 of us. I thank you for that. I'm happy to hear that
19 is a very small portion. We still have to maintain
20 cost effectiveness

21 But in terms of the transfer, I have a problem
22 with the transfer for the school. I know, we have
23 five transfer schools, which is for the young folks
24 that just arrived to America. So, for me, I know
25 there's five transfer schools. And four of them are

2 in Manhattan. So what happened with Bronx, Brooklyn,
3 Queens, Staten Island and all? Because we have so
4 many, especially when it comes to Brooklyn. Who can
5 answer that for me?

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that
7 question. One of the things that we have actually
8 planned for upcoming school year is to expand the
9 number of transfer schools that currently serve the
10 needs of our English language learner population.
11 And what we're looking to do is twofold: Wherever
12 possible in future years to develop standalone
13 schools, and wherever possible, actually, what we
14 would prefer to do is to design, or redesign,
15 existing transfer schools so that they can meet the
16 needs of our English language learners by using
17 models that are already successful. So one example
18 of that is Ellis in the Bronx: We visited. They
19 have great programs in place, a high literacy focus,
20 and we want to make sure that we are using the
21 leadership and the teachers that are there to design
22 some of those transfer schools. And we are paying
23 attention to those districts where they don't
24 currently exist, where we have high numbers of
25 students that have need, so that we can build those

2 in those spaces. And so we're working very closely
3 with our school design folks, to make those decisions
4 and to build those out as we can.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you, as an ELL
6 student myself, I know that the rates of dropping
7 out, and all this is can be addressed by making sure
8 that they are accessible within the distance of
9 one's... one's home. We know how young folks are.
10 If their school is very far, there's a lot of excuses
11 that we're going to get.

12 In terms of mental health, I'm very concerned as
13 a nurse for so many decades... for three decades,
14 actually. Last year, we allocated \$5 million, right?

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: to make sure the school
17 that addressed the mental health crisis and the
18 services that was provided. So I want to know that
19 in the school now, how are we going to continue
20 having the needs that we need in our school building,
21 especially with this pandemic, what we're dealing
22 with?

23 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you for the question,
24 Councilmember. As I mentioned before, what we
25 recognize is that mental health is layered and

2 complex. And so the idea of how we leverage clinical
3 supports, as well as non-clinical supports are going
4 to be critically important. When we think about the
5 clinical supports that we have been able to invest
6 and add the resources to the school community, we've
7 been able to add 600 social workers to ensure that
8 students at every school have access to either a
9 guidance counselor, a social worker, or school based
10 mental health center. And so access to the resources
11 when young people need them are available to them.
12 And then this notion of how we think about expanding
13 access outside of that clinical support to engage
14 community work: At this point, it is privately
15 funded. And so being able to think about ways to
16 leverage that funding, on a greater scale, I think,
17 is a way that we get to maximize the mental health
18 supports for young people in this critical time,
19 because we know that it takes a village in order to
20 support our young people.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Oh, I appreciate that.
22 And I know my time is up, but we are talking about
23 \$9.2 million, we talking about for the violence anti
24 violence program in our school interruption program.
25 So I want to find out if we did... I mean if D.O.E.

2 is going to provide any funding to utilize or hire
3 restorative justice coordinators? Because that's one
4 of the things that I had in mind. How does this
5 initiative fall in D.O.T. existence? And how will you
6 identify the school and CBOs to partner with? Because
7 that's the key importance because the people in the
8 community knows the community's best than anybody
9 else.

10 CHIEF JOHNSON: No, I think that is a great
11 question, Councilmember. And thank you for that
12 question. I think when we talk about violence
13 interruption, and we talk about restorative justice,
14 restorative practices, we are really talking about
15 how we are leveraging trusting relationships amongst
16 young people. And so when we look at the intersection
17 between restorative practices, and engaging
18 restorative... restorative coordinators who can work
19 within the school base, we know that our young people
20 are in school for a certain number of hours, and then
21 they go into the community, they go home. And so the
22 idea of how we leverage our community partners to
23 ensure that young people have support, to build
24 trusting relationships, and also to intervene in
25 those instances where they have been exposed to

2 community levels of violence and access. And so I
3 think you and I were both at a school earlier this
4 week talking about anti-gun violence, violence,
5 engaging with a community... community partners who
6 are doing justice work. And so we are currently
7 working to... to allocate the funding to community
8 based partners who are able to really kind of that
9 engaged support... boots on the ground support, in
10 addition to our restorative practices that we've
11 already activated and engaged.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you so much,
13 Chancellor. I'm going to be reaching out to you, you
14 know why, already. Thank you.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll turn
16 to Councilmember Lewis.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you so much. Good
19 morning, everyone. Thank you Chair Joseph and Chair
20 Brannan. Thank you for highlighting in your
21 questions class size, arts, music and programming and
22 Executive Budget. Chancellor, I'm happy to see you
23 and your whole team. Thank you for your diligence.
24 I'll ask a couple of questions, and hopefully it can
25 be answered here or via email. I look forward to

2 working with all of you. So regarding chronic
3 absenteeism, reports showing that so far 73% of
4 students can be considered chronically absent. So I
5 wanted to know how does D.O.E. plan to address this,
6 and what steps will the DOE take in the fiscal...
7 upcoming fiscal budget to ensure that students have
8 the support they need to be motivated to be present
9 in the classroom? I also wanted to ask about D.O.E.'s
10 plan for mental health, career, and guidance
11 counseling for district 79 schools as well as
12 district 75? So if that question was answered
13 earlier, but I wanted to know how much funding was
14 being put in the fiscal 23 budget for that.

15 And my last question is for SCA, I wanted to
16 know, regarding infrastructure and addressing the
17 need for smaller classroom sizes and fast tracking
18 construction for that, has SCA considered expanding
19 their MWBE vendors for the FY 23 budget and out years
20 in order to achieve that goal for our scholars?
21 Thank you so much.

22 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you so much for the
23 question, Councilmember Louis. So there are a couple
24 of questions that you asked. And so I'll address a
25

2 couple of them, and then I'll defer to my colleague
3 for the last question.

4 So with regard to chronic absenteeism, what we
5 know is that in order for young people to learn, they
6 have to be present in school. And so what we've done
7 to address chronic absenteeism is we've activated
8 our... our superintendents, and our borough
9 community... our borough central offices to really
10 kind of look at the data for... for chronic
11 absenteeism. When we think about what the numbers
12 represent, in order for a young person to be defined
13 as chronically absent, they need to have missed over
14 17-plus days. And so when we talk about numbers of
15 chronic absenteeism, right now, we can't actually
16 talk about the rates of chronic absenteeism, but we
17 can talk about projections for chronic absenteeism.
18 And so what we are currently doing is working in
19 partnership with our superintendents, as well as our
20 borough central offices to really think about what it
21 is, of course, that we can put in place to really
22 ensure that young people who may have missed several
23 days up to this point in... are able to continue to
24 attend every... every day. We know students have to
25 be present in order for them to learn. And so we've

2 been activating that. We've been working with our
3 attendance team... our attendance teachers to really
4 kind of get out and find... make certain that we know
5 where all the young people are, and to get them back.
6 And the other part of that is ensuring that our
7 school practices, curriculum opportunities, provide
8 engaging experiences that young people want to go to.
9 So when the chancellor talks about how we're
10 expanding... expanding career pathways, and providing
11 more engaging opportunities for young people, that is
12 also an attendance intervention strategy, because you
13 got to have a great place that you want to attend.

14 So that was the first question. Um, the second
15 question with regard to social workers... if you
16 just give me one moment.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yeah, and I did hear you
18 mentioned it earlier. So I apologize. This is
19 regarding the district 75 and 79 schools as well for
20 the social worker (inaudible).

21 CHIEF JOHNSON: My apologies.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: While Dr. Johnson
23 looks at that the information for that particular
24 question, I did want to address one of the other
25 questions that I think I heard you ask was, what are

2 the ways that we will engage students and sort of
3 bring them back? Right? So Dr. Johnson alluded a
4 little bit to that when she was talking about the
5 instructional... instruction, right?, and making sure
6 that our instructional core is strong, and that we
7 are engaging students. We also talked a little bit
8 about... you heard both chancellor and Jade Grieve
9 talk a little bit about career pathways. And so those
10 pathways are part of what we want to make sure are
11 integrated into our core. The supports that were
12 asked about earlier as well, that tutoring piece that
13 really... the kids are voting with their feet. The
14 parents are too. We want to make sure the resources
15 are in place. And then really exciting, we have some
16 opportunities to improve our digital learning. And
17 so we're going to be training teachers to make sure
18 that they have the tools that they need, and that
19 they really do know how to access digital processes
20 and digital strategies that they can use as well.
21 And really exciting with that digital piece is that
22 we intend to open to brand new virtual schools, so
23 that students can have some more flexibility in how
24 they go to school. And hopefully that will reengage
25 some of those that...

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

3 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ... we've lost as
4 well, and so that we can bring them back in that way
5 too. But the biggest piece is making sure that our
6 schools are really reflective of the kids in front of
7 us, that our teachers are well-trained to meet their
8 needs, that they have the adequate supports in place,
9 and that means not only the CRSE pieces that we
10 talked about, the social work pieces that we talked
11 about, but also making sure that our teaching and
12 learning is grounded in inquiry, and is student
13 centered. And so that that's the kind of support and
14 training that we will offer across all of our
15 schools.

16 CHIEF JOHNSON: Sorry, and thank you. My
17 apologies for the delay, I wanted to ensure that I
18 was able to give you accurate information.

19 So with regard to the specific ratios for
20 district 75 and district 79, we'll get back to them.
21 One of the things that we do know is that for the
22 social worker support, district 79 students are
23 connected to their home-based schools. And so they
24 would still have access to the Social Work support
25 that's available through their home-based schools.

2 But I'll find out the specific ratio as assigned and
3 aligned to district 79, which we know supports adult
4 education and several other... several other non-
5 traditional academic pathways.

6 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Do we still have time for...
7 (crosstalk)

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: If it's okay, Chair
9 Brannan and Joseph, my last question was for SCA
10 regarding MWBEs and construction.

11 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Correct. So... So currently,
12 we have about 2000 vendors prequalified with us, and
13 about 1000 of them are MWBE'e. I will say that 61%
14 of our construction contractors are MWBE firms. So,
15 you know, we are always looking to expand that. And
16 how we do that is we work with the smaller firms
17 through our mentor program. They are all MWBE's, and
18 we work with them for over six to eight years
19 mentoring them so that they can bid in sort of the
20 open market at the SCA. And we started out with...
21 we've recently changed it, we went to a \$1 million
22 threshold that they could bid on to \$1.5 to \$2, and
23 in July, we're going to increase it to \$3. So I will
24 say we're always looking to attract not just MWBE
25 firms, but smaller MWBE firms that we can, you know,

2 raise up. Look, we all have room for improvement,
3 and we're always looking to refine and to, you know,
4 get better. So I'm always happy to... to, you know,
5 take some suggestions, but we have a pretty, pretty
6 well developed program. And we're we want to expand
7 it not just within the construction industry, but
8 within our professional services. So that is
9 something that we're looking to do starting this next
10 fiscal year.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, everyone. Thank
12 you Chairs.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll go
14 to Councilmember Stevens, followed by councilmember
15 Barron.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Hi, good morning,
18 everyone or good afternoon. I do not know what the
19 time is at this point. Thank you, um, Chairs, for
20 this hearing. I just have a couple of questions.
21 And hello D.O.E.. It's very nice to see you guys.

22 So I'll start with my Summer Rising questions,
23 and then I have some Bronx-wide questions that I
24 wanted to ask today.

2 Number one, thank you guys. I know you guys have
3 been super hands on the ground and doing... and doing
4 a phenomenal job with getting Summer Rising off the
5 ground, which is a huge task. And I know we've been
6 meeting and talking consistently, but one of the
7 things that I'm still getting a lot of calls back and
8 pushback from is from my parents around the
9 enrollment process, around how young people who were
10 in current programs and schools weren't given
11 priority. And now they're, you know, they're being
12 told that they have to go to other locations that are
13 really out the way, and really going to put a
14 hardship on them. I've gotten calls within the last
15 week with the same issue from actual parents. So one
16 would love to hear how we're addressing this issue.

17 The next one is I'm in the D.Y.C.D. budget is we
18 have Summer Rising baselined until 2026, but that is
19 not the case in the DOE budget. What does... how do
20 we plan on continuing this program if only one side
21 has been funded? So could you talk a little bit
22 about what that plan looks like?

23 Then another issue that we have and just... this
24 is the Bronx-wide issue around teacher retention in
25 the Bronx. We have some of the higher retention

2 rates in the Bronx, around retaining teachers, and
3 getting teachers who actually want to work in the
4 Bronx and stay there. So what is the plan? And what
5 does it look like, um, in the next couple of years to
6 build up this potential and getting teachers to come
7 and wanting to stay in the Bronx. And then my last
8 question, which is for SCA, is around trailers and
9 one of the districts in the Bronx which is
10 Councilmember Feliz's district 15. He has over 15
11 schools that have trailers in his district. Oh...
12 he's here. So I'll let him ask this question. But
13 he'll ask that question, so I'll... I'll yield back
14 for that question. So I'll just go through those
15 other questions I asked.

16 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you very much Chair
17 for... for the question. So we are extraordinarily
18 pleased the opportunity to speak with both you and
19 Chair Joseph in most recent weeks about Summer
20 Rising, and we continue to work to make it sort of
21 the best summer program that we have had thus far. We
22 are aware that there are some families that have been
23 locked out. We have encouraged those families to send
24 emails to us, and we are retaining that information
25 and staying in very close contact with them. As you

2 may be aware, last year there certainly were
3 challenges. And there was a lot of feedback related
4 to it that we wanted to make sure that we address
5 this year. One of the feed... one of the... some of
6 the feedback that we received had to do with making
7 sure that the quality of the program was as high as
8 possible, and making sure that we had sufficient
9 staff for the number of students that we had. So as a
10 result, we made sure working in partnership with our
11 D.Y.C.D. partners, that we capped enrollment at
12 approximately 110,000 students for K through eight,
13 because we wanted to make sure that we would have
14 sufficient staffing for all of those... all of those
15 students. We did prioritize our students in
16 temporary housing as well as students with 12 months
17 IEPs, as well as our students that are going to be
18 mandated for summer school. With respect to families
19 that unfortunately did not have an opportunity to get
20 their first choice they certainly have the ability to
21 choose another spot within Summer Rising, another
22 location. And separately, they have sent us... many
23 of them have sent us emails and we are tracking
24 those. So when enrollment closes, we will have an
25 opportunity to sort of see which families that have

2 currently signed up for a spot that are continuing
3 with Summer Rising, we will be actively engaging with
4 those... with those families over the summer because
5 we know that many families sign up for a... for a
6 slot, and then they decide not to go. When those
7 slots become available, as we believe some will, we
8 will be reaching out to the families that have
9 contacted us asking to either switch location or
10 switch CBO providers.

11 With respect to your question on budget, I will
12 ask our CFO, Lindsey Oates to take that question.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I'm gonna... just before
14 you answer that question, I just wanted to give a
15 little feedback as well, because we have both
16 parents... I got an email, basically, a parent was
17 told that she should just get a babysitter because no
18 spots will be opened up. So I just want to make sure
19 that we are having messaging going out to everyone
20 around providers and how they are relaying those
21 messages to parents. And I'll be in contact with you
22 to give you more details. That's a huge issue.

23 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Be sure to get that to us
24 directly, because we can follow up on that and who

2 told her that. We'll... we'll do some immediate
3 follow up for sure.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Thank you.

5 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember...
7 Thanks, Chancellor. In relation to... in response to
8 your question about the budget, the Department of
9 Education has an existing budget that we are using
10 for Summer Rising and we are also repurposing...

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

12 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: ... about \$176
13 million in stimulus funding to further expand the
14 program this year. That's how we funded Summer
15 Rising in fiscal year 21, and how we will fund the
16 expanded program in fiscal year 23. And I... I
17 obviously cannot speak to D.Y.C.D.'s budget, but
18 we're grateful to have the funding resources to be
19 able to invest in this really important program this
20 summer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: But my concern is that
22 it is baselined in the D.Y.C.D.'s budget until 2026,
23 but it's not baselined in D.O.E.'s, so that's...
24 that's my concern. So what does this program look
25 like in a year or two when it's not in your budget,

2 but it's in D.Y.C.D.'s budget, and it's literally a
3 collaboration?

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Understood. I
5 hear your concern, and I appreciate that. And I
6 think for a lot of these issues, where stimulus
7 funding is temporarily supporting programs, we're
8 working with our city partners on solutions for the
9 out years.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And then my last
11 question was just around, um, teacher retention and
12 the Bronx being very high. And what are we doing to
13 address that?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yeah. Thank you,
15 Councilmember. You know, we're fortunate that
16 teacher retention across the city is quite high,
17 particularly in relation to what you see in other big
18 urban districts. So it's... it's the most recent
19 figures or teacher retention is about 94%. But
20 you're 100% right, it tends to be higher in the
21 Bronx. And so this is something we've got to be
22 laser focused on. Part of... part of the strategy for
23 that is fully funding F.S.F. which benefits
24 disproportionately -- which is a good thing --
25 schools in the Bronx, gives principals there more

2 resources so that teachers there feel better support,
3 and that could be in the form of lower class size,
4 that could be in the form of additional programming,
5 that could be in the form of additional mental health
6 support to CBO partnerships. But we're... we're not
7 standing pat on that. That's a number we watch very,
8 very closely, and would love to talk to you about
9 what you are hearing, and what... what additional
10 targeted supports we can provide to make sure that we
11 have a level playing field, that the principals and
12 other leaders in the Bronx have the same opportunity
13 to access talent, which is the most important thing:
14 Access teaching talent and other staff talent, as
15 they do in Manhattan or the other boroughs.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: No, I really appreciate
17 that. But I think this is a major issue. And this is
18 a service to our kids. So we definitely have to
19 continue to work together in partnership and
20 collaboration, not with just me, but with all the
21 council members to really address this, because you
22 know, with having teachers not saying, it has a toll
23 on the kids... on the young people that we serve. So
24 I definitely look forward to continue partnering with
25 you guys on this issue. And, you know, although I

2 always have very pointed questions about Summer
3 Rising, it is it is going well, and I just want to
4 give you guys kudos for the continued collaboration
5 between both D.Y.C.D. and D.O.H., because it's not an
6 easy task, but you guys are getting it done. So
7 thank you.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll turn
9 to Councilmember Barron.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much,
12 Chancellor, welcome. I was so perplexed and puzzled
13 Chancellor. I thought you and the mayor were tight,
14 and he's cutting a billion dollars from your budget
15 and you tried to fix it to make it seem like that's
16 alright. But uh, we'll talk about that when you come
17 visit me.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I'm coming to see you real
19 soon too.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I know. You're on the
21 schedule. But I thought you had it like that. I
22 expected to see an increase in the budget, not a
23 decrease. Anyway, I want to talk about how do we
24 measure success? You know, oftentimes it is measured
25 by the graduation rate.

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But I want to know the
4 status on college readiness, and career preparedness.

5 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Because the diploma means
7 nothing if they're not prepared for a career or ready
8 for college. And last I heard is that 80% of the
9 students that are going into CUNY need remediation...

10 CHANCELLOR BANKS: That's right.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ... after coming through
12 the system. So that's one thing. Secondly, they are
13 predicting another crisis, another breakout for
14 COVID. What are we going to do as a contingency plan
15 for... if there's a COVID? outbreak in September? I
16 know we talked about it. Y'all said you were doing
17 stuff about it. We never heard a whole lot back.
18 Will there be a virtual option for parents? Which I
19 think should still happen right now. But I'd like
20 for you to address that: Are we ready? Are we ready
21 for that? And also the colocation of charter schools
22 in our buildings. That's... that's horrific.
23 Buildings that we're designed for one principal, and
24 one school, now have four principals, four schools,
25 and it's cutting back on the very class size and

2 class expansion that we need for the students. So I
3 want to know about that. And my wife, Inez Barron,
4 former Council Member, Assemblymember, Senator Robert
5 Jackson, and myself: We fought so hard for campaign
6 for fiscal equity. And we got it \$1.5 billion for
7 the next three years -- because of the federal money,
8 not the state -- but how was that being used? Is that
9 getting to our schools? Because sometimes we fight
10 for these things, and we never see the benefits of
11 it. I want to thank Council Member Hanif for that
12 brilliant breakdown of the cultural relevant
13 curriculum. I think we should heed to what she's
14 saying.

15 And the School Construction Authority: A \$20.6
16 billion budget, how many new schools are being built
17 in black and brown communities? I had to fight. I
18 got a couple in mine, but that was a real battle.
19 I'm concerned about all over. And then the contracts
20 have to not just be for \$1 million or \$2 million.
21 There are some black companies that can handle the
22 same kind of contract that these white construction
23 companies get.

24 And then is... Chancellor, is there still a
25 rubber room? Do they still have that? I know you

2 may have changed the name, but is the... is the
3 concept still the same when teachers are punished,
4 because a lot of black faculty got stuck in rubber
5 room years ago for some penalties. I wonder if that
6 still exists, even if it's a change in name, what's
7 the status of that?

8 And then also, how are you addressing the needs
9 in black and brown communities? We need to computer
10 labs, the science labs, the library updates, music
11 teachers with the equipment, sports programs, after
12 school programs, and wraparound services in our
13 community.

14 And then finally, what are we going to do about
15 civic and career education? You know, I really think
16 that civic responsibility is important. Career
17 education is important. There's one school in
18 Manhattan that has career education school. It is
19 really awesome. I'd like to have one in my district
20 as well. So these are some of the questions, because
21 firmly I believe that education should be for
22 liberation. Education should be teaching our
23 students about the true nature of the system they
24 live under: A racist, colonial capitalist system,
25 and we should tell the truth and not be afraid of

2 C.R.T. or whatever they're talking about. But the
3 capitalist system... our children need to know about
4 capitalism, socialism, African communalism,
5 communism. Teach them about all the systems and how
6 they work, because when they come out, the only thing
7 they know is about a capitalist system that is
8 inherently... inherently working against them, even
9 if they get a PhD. So we got to... and I know,
10 Commissioner Banks, that you're down with me with the
11 revolution, so I know that you're going to be
12 teaching our kids how to radically... radically --
13 just meaning getting to the root of the problem --
14 radically change this system. I appreciate it if you
15 would respond to some of these questions.

16 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Which ones you want me to
17 respond to? All of that?

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: All of them! (laughs)
20 All of the above.

21 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Listen, let me just say this:
22 I greatly appreciate you. I appreciate the spirit in
23 which you asked all those questions. And I think at
24 the core of all of it is really about... it really is
25 about liberation. It's about transformation. I did

2 not come here to stand into defense of a system that
3 has fundamentally failed so many of our children,
4 particularly black and brown children. And I'm fully
5 committed to the transformation of this system. I've
6 said it from the time that I got here, and I will
7 continue to do that. This team that I have, that we
8 have assembled is fully committed to that as well.
9 So just very quickly, you talked about college and
10 career readiness, and this... this system has not
11 done a good enough job.

12 We graduate children, but we don't graduate them
13 with enough of an understanding, so that they... and
14 the skills that they need to be successful in
15 college, certainly not in careers. That's why this
16 work that we're doing on Career Pathways is something
17 that we're leaning into. We believe very deeply in
18 it. We're going to give kids while they're in middle
19 school and high school a real insight into what the
20 real world actually looks like, and how they can be
21 fully prepared to take their place in this 21st
22 century economy. We're not just going to school,
23 just to be going to school.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But Chancellor, do you
25 have any numbers on that? What's the percentage...

2 the last latest percentage on college readiness and
3 career preparedness?

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I don't have it off the top my
5 head, but we can certainly... about 58%, in terms of
6 even college and career, particularly in...

7 (crosstalk)

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And in some schools...
9 some schools, it's even lower than that. It is very
10 low.

11 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. What it says is
12 that we've got major work to do. It also connects to
13 why we still have lost so many of our kids. It also
14 connects to this whole notion of disengagement, and
15 why it's hard to get teachers to come and work in the
16 Bronx. These are all pieces of a puzzle that are
17 working together, because there are some fundamental
18 flaws in how we are doing our work in the first
19 place, how we are measuring our schools. This is
20 something that we're working together, even with our
21 state representatives, that we should not measure the
22 success of a school purely on standardized exams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's right.

24 CHANCELLOR BANKS: You can do well on
25 standardized exams all day and have no idea what the

2 City Council does. So when you talk about civic...
3 civic education, that is something that we're leaning
4 into, when I talk about the reimagined student
5 experience. I want every child who graduated from
6 the New York City public school, to be ready not only
7 to vote, but to be able to take their rightful place
8 in this democracy and understand how to make change
9 within this system. You cannot make change if you
10 have no idea what's going on. I want young people to
11 be out here, be prepared to vote. I want them to
12 come to your town hall meetings. I want them to
13 understand what the attorney general does. There
14 should be a student government in every school in New
15 York City and there will be. So we... I just got
16 here in January, and we've been using this time to
17 try and just put a plan together. We are still in
18 the midst of all that. So as we get into September,
19 we'll really be able to hit the ground... hit the
20 ground running.

21 As it relates to some of the issues around
22 colocation, you know, we're doing the best that we
23 can. There's not a lot of appetite at the state
24 level for the continued creation of more and more
25 charter schools. We're seeing less of that. But

2 what I do believe is that charter schools and
3 traditional public schools have a lot that we can
4 learn from each other. And we've got to... we've got
5 to eliminate that divide. At the end of the day,
6 they're all of our kids, and we've got to make sure
7 that we're learning. When charter schools were
8 created in the first place, they were meant to be
9 places of innovation that the entire system would
10 learn from, and somewhere along the way we got away
11 from there. And as I've met with charter school
12 leaders, I told them, I'm interested in scaling what
13 they have learned, and share that across schools.
14 But I'm also want to make sure that you know that we
15 got traditional public schools that are doing amazing
16 things, I'm sure in some of your district...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's right.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: ... this idea that it's only
19 that the charter schools that are doing great things
20 is not true. There are great charter schools, and
21 they are great public... traditional public schools.
22 And we got to all work together to share...

23 (crosstalk)

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But Chancellor, on that
25 real quick: You're absolutely right on the original

2 intent of charter schools. That was to be a model
3 for the rest of the schools, not setting up another
4 tier education system, and then the private sector
5 that's behind them, the hedge funds that's behind the
6 charter schools and fronts, not for profits, let them
7 pay for it. Not... don't take it out of our public
8 school money. They're hiding behind there, creating
9 not for profits. Let them pay for the physical
10 facilities for charter schools.

11 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, at the end of the day,
12 charter schools are public schools, and parents...
13 (crosstalk)

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: They say... they say
15 public charter, but I'm not... don't mean to be
16 rude... but a public charter is an oxymoron. You are
17 either owned by the public school system, are you
18 owned by a private not for profit or for profit.
19 There's no in between Chancellor.

20 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, listen, I'm not... I'm
21 not here for that debate. That's for another time,
22 but I am here simply to say, I was asked by this
23 Mayor to be the Chancellor of the school system, and
24 in doing that, my responsibility is to the children
25 who are in these traditional public schools, to give

2 them the best quality education that we possibly can.
3 That's what I am committed to. As relates to the
4 virtual option, that is something I believe that
5 if... if we are, God forbid, hit with another massive
6 surge, and we got to close our schools down, I
7 believe that we are much better prepared now than we
8 were before. So much so that we will be announcing -
9 - and you heard a little bit mentioned today around
10 some virtual school options that are going to be full
11 time options where kids will be able to go to school
12 virtually -- we're going to use that... those schools
13 as also labs of innovation. We want to learn from
14 that, so that in fact informs how we will teach
15 virtually to all of our kids. I believe that virtual
16 learning is here to stay, whether or not we have a
17 pandemic or not. And we want to look at it from a
18 positive standpoint and figure out how do we use that
19 technology so that kids can think beyond the four
20 walls of the classroom and be exposed to the best
21 teaching the best experiences all over the world.
22 They ought to be global. So you can't be a global
23 citizen with a neighborhood mentality.

24 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: Time expired.

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: ... the larger work, and
3 that's what we tried to do. So I did my best to
4 answer all 85 of your questions, and we can certainly
5 follow up at a later time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'll get the other 70
7 when you come to meet us.

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: You got it, Charles.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we will
10 call on Council Member Carr, followed by
11 councilmembers Brewer, Faris, De La Rosa, Hanks, and
12 we have others, but we'll turn to Councilmember Carr.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you so much. Thank
15 you to our Chairs for putting together this hearing
16 on the Exec Budget. Chancellor, it's good to see you
17 as always. You know, you talked about charters, you
18 know, conceived as a model for innovation, and you
19 came and saw on yourself in my district earlier this
20 year Bridge Prep, which is serving students who have
21 dyslexia. And you know, as you heard from the
22 parents there, you know, they and their children are
23 looking forward to the future, and looking for a high
24 school model that does what Bridge Prep is already
25 doing. I'm glad to see that, you know, we're

2 investing more for dyslexic students, but I was
3 wondering if you had any thoughts on that, and if
4 you're willing to work with us to create that high
5 school model so that students have that option as
6 they age out of Bridge Prep?

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. And we certainly
8 want to work with you. I just want to say that was
9 one of the best visits I've had, to go out there to
10 Staten Island and to see -- and primarily kids of
11 color -- who are in this school that has as its focus
12 students who are suffering from dyslexia. It
13 completely aligns with what our mayor has been
14 talking about. We've got to provide the kinds of
15 services that our kids who have those kinds of
16 challenges need, and they are there are thousands of
17 them all across our school system. And so we are
18 fully committed to doing that. Our Deputy Chancellor
19 Quintana is leading... leading that work. And so we
20 are absolutely going to continue to work with you.
21 She was part of that... that visit as well. And we
22 thank you also for... for you and former Borough
23 President Otto for all the work that he did, in
24 helping to create that model, because it can really
25 be a real model for so many of our kids. We need to

2 learn from what they what they have done there, and
3 we are pledging a commitment to you. I know, in the
4 immediate term, they're looking for what the high
5 school piece can be. I'm just asking that you stay
6 working very closely with our Deputy Chancellor
7 Quintana around that, and we're going to do the best
8 that we can to be supportive.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Happy to do that. We
10 really love to. And you're right, it's a very
11 diverse campus, and they're flourishing students.
12 And it's an it's great, and I and I hope that it's
13 something that can be... can be brought to other
14 boroughs as soon as possible.

15 As far as you know, gifted and talented goes, I'm
16 really glad to see you know, the administration's
17 commitment to that. In the past, we never had
18 sufficient G&T seats on Staten Island. I, you know,
19 we met many parents who were traveling off borough so
20 that their children could have that opportunity. And
21 I just wondering, you know, what... what, you know,
22 number of seats do you think is sufficient to meet
23 the need in Staten Island? And when do you think they
24 would become available? And what's the process for
25 determining where that's going to be?

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, I'll speak to that a
3 little bit. (inaudible) the borough, but we are
4 committed to the concept for sure.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you. And
6 thank you Chancellor for pitching the question in
7 this direction.

8 So as you know, the process that we're using will
9 pull from each of the different schools that are in a
10 district. The top 10% of students then become part
11 of the pool of students eligible for G&T. And so
12 we're committed to building... or opening at least
13 one G&T program in each district. And if there is
14 greater need, and if we have schools and principals
15 and teachers who are both willing and ready, then we
16 can take a look at whether or not there's the
17 capacity to add additional programs. But at the very
18 least we would have one. And the idea is that
19 because it is per district, you really can pull first
20 from the community. So it would add those seats
21 directly in Staten Island for students from Staten
22 Island. And I think that that increases some of
23 those... those opportunities for folks.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: And what's the concept of
3 what the average program size would be in each
4 district in terms of seats?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So we're opening a
6 section in kindergarten and in third grade where
7 there isn't already a kindergarten and third grade,
8 and we'll use those standard classroom designations
9 in terms of space, in terms of union policies, and so
10 we'll make decisions based... And also it really
11 depends on the number of students that have parents
12 who actually apply and are interested in the program.
13 And we'll do our best to, you know, make spaces
14 available for the number of kids who are invested in
15 this type of work, and if we need to open additional
16 programs, and we can certainly look into that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you. And my last
18 question is around what some of my colleagues were
19 raising earlier, which is about the presence of
20 social workers and guidance counselors in schools.

21 You know, I believe very strongly in a strong
22 school safety program, but I do think that social
23 workers and guidance counselors are essential to both
24 the safety and the wellness of students on campus.
25 And I'd love to get more details offline about you

2 know, what we have in our schools here on Staten
3 Island, and what that is... whether or not that's
4 meeting, establish metrics.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you, Council Member Carr.
7 I look forward to engaging with you more deeply
8 around the counseling and social work Support. I
9 just would like to add at the highest level that
10 every school across the entire city including the
11 borough Staten Island, young people have access to a
12 guidance counselor, social worker, or school based
13 mental health center. So they do have access to
14 this resource. What that looks like specific to
15 your, your district or region, and we can engage at a
16 later time. So thank you for the question.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I appreciate that so much.
18 And thanks for answering my questions. I really
19 appreciate it.

20 CHIEF JOHNSON: Absolutely.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member
22 Carr. Next we'll turn to Council Member Brewer.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Thank you
24 very much Chancellor and all of D.O.E. I also like
25 the fact that you're moving the enrollment centers

2 under a superintendent according to the newspapers.

3 So congratulations on many fronts. Nothing is easy.

4 A couple of questions on school food. I've
5 always pushed to have more summer food opportunities.
6 It's there but not used. I'm wondering what you're
7 doing, budget wise, to allocate... to make sure
8 parents know about the school food. And then
9 according to the material we have \$25 million and
10 cafeteria upgrades is possible. I put in some of
11 those deli to some of the high schools it makes a
12 huge difference. And I think school food is
13 important. I know the Mayor talks about plant based,
14 and that's important. But just to have it... to be an
15 opportunity to... to use... to make people healthy is
16 not always done because of how it is presented. So
17 school food is one.

18 Then the second question I have is just on
19 literacy: How much has been allocated? You know
20 better than I that there has been a loss of it during
21 this pandemic. All the principals are complaining to
22 me. So what are we doing in terms of specifics? And
23 also, is there a budget allocation for recruitment of
24 math and science teachers, particularly, teachers of
25 color? Because math and science are lacking. I know

2 lots of teacher types are lacking, but that's in
3 particular.

4 And then in terms of SCA: Bathrooms. I know
5 somebody, Councilmember Stevens, mentioned it, but I
6 get all the time: I need new bathrooms. I'm like,
7 why do I have to pay to not deal with this. So what
8 are... is there an allocation for bathroom upgrade?
9 And also, it takes about a year and a half for SCA to
10 get the technology, even just for smart boards. So
11 I'm just wondering, is there some other opportunity
12 for speeding up the money that we use for SCA on
13 technology?

14 And then finally, everybody's talking about
15 social workers. I've been talking about for about 30
16 years. And the question is... I think there's a
17 March 22 DOE report on social workers. It hasn't
18 been completed, so... and I think it is mandated. So
19 I just would hope that you would keep us very much up
20 to date, because even though we say every school has
21 a social worker, they don't because we call around.

22 I could go on. But those are some questions, and
23 I appreciate everything you're doing.

24 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you, Council
25 Member, for your... your questions. I'd like to

2 start by just talking a little bit about the school
3 food program. We are equally as pleased at the
4 opportunity and the focus from both the Mayor as well
5 as the Chancellor on school food. And it's
6 certainly something that we talk about almost daily
7 here at the department.

8 With respect to the cafeteria enhancement
9 program, we are incredibly pleased with the progress
10 that's been made to date. And we are looking to
11 continue to invest and to move forward with enhancing
12 those cafeterias across the city with... so that is
13 certainly ongoing, and we can certainly have a
14 conversation and share more specifics on... on what
15 the plan is. And with respect to summer food, we are
16 also looking forward to having a robust summer food
17 program over the summer. We are working on
18 finalizing those details and we will certainly be
19 moving to advertise about what those programs are
20 going to be and where they will be located in short
21 order.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, because usually
23 it's done the day school ends. So I assume that will
24 not be true this year. That's been my experience in
25 the past.

2 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Yes, that's true. I
3 believe that advertising will actually be earlier
4 this year.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I hope so. Then literacy
6 in math and science.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What happened?

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Can you repeat that
9 question, please?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What's the budget? And
11 how are we making sure that literacy is funded
12 appropriately of coaches, of teachers? Kids are not
13 reading... we... every teacher and every principal
14 tells me, and I know that from personal experience.
15 And then are we allocating anything to recruit math
16 and science teachers, particularly communities of
17 color? You're really short on math and science
18 teachers... not to mention other kinds of teachers,
19 but those are two in particular. And a lot of the
20 friends I know they're going to the private schools.
21 Why are they going to the private schools as math
22 teachers out of the University of Chicago and
23 elsewhere? New Yorkers? Because it's easier. It's
24 too hard to become a D.O.E. teacher. So they quickly

2 go to the private schools, and we need them here, not
3 to mention the charter schools.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you,
5 Councilmember Brewer, I think Chancellor Banks wanted
6 to make a comment first.

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No no. I'm good.

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Alright, then I'll
9 answer the question. Incredibly important, and I
10 absolutely agree. We need to be able to better
11 support our students across our classrooms, not only
12 those with print-based disabilities, but in general
13 to make sure that they have the foundation and the
14 mechanics of reading. And so we're going to, I
15 think, it mentioned already the...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ...the process to
18 support folks with the very specific training for
19 dyslexia, and part of that is also just in general,
20 bringing in an explicit phonics curriculum in grades
21 K through two, making sure that we have supports in
22 place so we are actually building out a team of
23 coaches who will provide support K through two, a
24 separate set of coaches for three through five,
25 another for grades six through eight, and then

2 finally for grades nine through twelve, where we have
3 not had across K-12. And so we're building this team
4 of coaches. In addition, we'll be putting AIS points
5 at every district, at least one at every district --
6 and in districts with higher needs two or more -- so
7 that they can provide supports. And for schools that
8 may have students who may need secondary
9 interventions, who may need secondary... sorry,
10 screeners and evaluations. And so those AIS points
11 will be trained on how to support schools, but also
12 on how to do those interventions themselves. So
13 we're... we're offering opportunities to... for
14 teachers to be trained. Initially, every teacher
15 will receive free training for dyslexia awareness,
16 and very specific skills to address the needs in
17 classrooms. And that are skills that will... or
18 strategies rather, that will benefit all students.
19 And as I mentioned, we're going to use evidence-based
20 foundational literacy programs. So curricula very
21 specifically that schools will have choices to
22 acquire, that comes with training. And then just
23 ensuring that there are tiers of support, depending
24 on what folks need. We're also employing -- and this
25 is, I think, something incredibly important for a

2 budget meeting because one way of ensuring that even
3 after these initial funds are not available in future
4 years, but and to just to make sure that we don't
5 need to keep investing in the same ways -- we're
6 building a train-the-trainer model. And so we're
7 really working on facilitators who have very explicit
8 knowledge of... uh, Orton Gillingham, for example, is
9 one of the... the programs, right?, so we'll use a
10 train-the-trainer model to make sure that we have
11 tiers of folks who are trained, and can provide
12 support, and then additional training. So if they
13 become certified, they can then train our teachers,
14 they can train our leaders, and we'll have those
15 sustainable practices in place.

16 And then as I mentioned, the opening of those two
17 programs: one standalone school, and one program
18 embedded within a school, provides a space for almost
19 like a lab site for teachers to be trained for
20 leaders to be trained, and for them to see those
21 practices in place. So that we can build off what's
22 there.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What about math
24 teacher... math teachers recruitment... math, math?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So for math and
3 science, and actually just any of our areas of need,
4 right?, so we have an area of need with teachers for
5 students with disabilities, for bilingual Ed, for a
6 range of teachers. We're working very closely with
7 our teacher recruitment and quality folks to recruit
8 teachers using a range of incentives, including...
9 sometimes it's not even recruiting brand new
10 teachers, but rather looking for teachers who may
11 want to have an extension to their licenses. We're
12 also working with local institutions. We've been
13 working with organizations like Burke out of Fordham
14 University and at the state. I think I mentioned
15 that I met last week with folks from the state
16 directly to think about how we better recruit and
17 prepare teachers. And I think that, you know, part
18 of it is just making sure that they see this as a
19 viable option, right?, that teaching is a viable
20 option.

21 But the other piece is just making sure that
22 there are adequate supports in place so that our
23 teachers don't leave, right? If we're creating the
24 kinds of environments that are really holding and
25 supporting our teachers, affirming who they are,

2 making sure that they receive development, and
3 then... then they'll stay. And I think... I don't
4 know if Dan, if you want to add to that.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yep. Thank you.
6 Thank you, Carolyn. Just... I know, we're out of
7 time... but councilmember, I would love to talk to
8 you. Your point is so well taken that it's too
9 difficult to become a teacher not just in New York
10 City, but in the state, frankly, we may need your
11 help.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I don't care about the
13 state. I only care about New York City.

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Sorry.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I just care about the
16 city. I don't care about the state. I'm serious. I
17 got it then, go ahead.

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Just... just to say
19 this is something we are really focused on. It's not
20 only too difficult, but one of the reasons we lose
21 great talent to like private schools. It's really
22 expensive. It's really expensive. And one of the
23 reasons we don't have the diversity that we should in
24 our teacher core is because it costs a lot of money
25 to become a teacher. Now we're doing some things...

2 I don't want to say... teaching fellows programs or
3 other programs where we're trying to address that,
4 but it's not enough. So we would love to work with
5 you on that because it is it's a real problem.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Finally, just quickly SCA
7 on the technology too long and the bathrooms.

8 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you councilmember
9 quickly on the bathrooms. So we have \$50 million set
10 aside in our bathroom upgrade program. But that is
11 in addition to any of the bathrooms that we make
12 accessible and renovate as part of our accessibility
13 program as well. And we do do full scale bathroom
14 upgrades during our full accessibility pro...
15 projects.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: How much does each
17 bathroom costs? It's like a million dollars. Some
18 crazy amount of money.

19 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yeah, so... so certainly, we
20 have heard this in the past and we worked with our
21 colleagues at division of school facilities where we
22 are now doing a pair of bathrooms for boys and girls
23 for \$170,000. So under the... under the \$50 million
24 bathroom upgrade program, we are able to accomplish
25 150 pairs of bathrooms.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And then my tech.

3 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: On your tech... and
4 (inaudible) may still be on. But I will say two
5 things to that. One is that... you know, you're...
6 you, as a council member and former Borough
7 President, we're probably talking schools in the
8 January timeframe getting those allocations ready.
9 As it goes through the budget process, we don't... we
10 work with OMB to get the CP from them, probably late
11 fall even end of the calendar year. So we... you
12 know, we're trying to strategize with OMB of how we
13 can get that CP process done quickly. Because we
14 don't get that funding and we can't do anything, we
15 can't reach out to the schools and get the orders in
16 until that's complete. So that coupled with supply
17 chain issues, I think, is really where you're seeing
18 the delay. I will say we are trying to work with
19 them to speed up that process.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Thank you very
21 much. Thank you.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we will
23 turn to Councilmember Farias.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Hi, folks, and thank you
3 so much for all the testimony today. And please, if
4 any of the questions I'm about to ask have been
5 already answered, just flag that for me and I can go
6 back.

7 I really wanted to highlight really quickly...
8 thank my colleagues, Chair Brannan, and Chair Joseph
9 along with Speaker Adams for asking about our... the
10 very many issues we have going on in our schools
11 along with the community school models, and why funds
12 need to be advocated for, specifically because
13 schools in the Bronx and in my district really do
14 need the wraparound services, additional supports due
15 to lack of healthy food access, being in healthcare
16 deserts, lack of equitable transit, etc. So thank
17 you.

18 I just wanted to ask some questions around career
19 and technical education. Do we... do we know or have
20 a process for bolstering monetarily our CTE
21 schools... individually our CTE schools right now?

22 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsey?

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember
24 Yes, we do provide additional resources to our CTE
25 programs through a variety of different ways. We

2 recognize that our career pathways programs have
3 really different expenses. Whether you're running a
4 nursing program or a culinary program, you obviously
5 have different supplies that you need, perhaps
6 different teachers or access to experts. And so we
7 do provide additional funding to support those costs.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, great. And I
9 guess... I'm sorry I did not frame this in the
10 same... in this way that I particularly wanted it
11 answered. But I know that for my for my previous
12 experience in workforce and partnering up with our
13 CTE schools that some students are literally placed
14 in CTE because it's their last choice on their high
15 school application, and it was not their first or
16 second or third. And so are we looking at ways to
17 increase outreach to get the students that enjoy
18 working with their hands that enjoy working in a...
19 in a field, that our CTE schools are, you know,
20 training folks in right now? Are we looking at ways
21 to even answer for the direct concerns that some of
22 our parents have by their students going into a trade
23 versus college where we, you know, have a DOE system
24 for years that was solely focused on college for all?

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No, I agree. I appreciate
3 that. That's a great question. And... and it is one
4 of the challenges that we have, which is helping...
5 helping everyone to understand that this new career
6 pathways work that we're talking about is not
7 necessarily traditional, you know, just CTE. There's
8 going to be some traditional CTE and trade work, of
9 course, but we're talking about a much broader plan
10 than that. This is not your grandfather's CTE,
11 right? I came up at a time where they would say to
12 really smart kids, we want you to go to college, and
13 the other kids who don't do so well, you know, do
14 something with your hands, go into a trade. There
15 were a lot of racial, you know, applications around
16 that and language around. What we're talking about
17 today are opportunities for kids who are coming out
18 of high school to make \$75,000 and be... and be on a
19 pathway to the middle class, to get off Mommy and
20 Daddy's payroll and have like real skills to do real
21 stuff. And... and that is what this this 21st
22 Century economy is demanding. They're telling us you
23 got to produce kids who have real skills,
24 certifications to go in and not just, you know, not
25 low level jobs, but high level jobs that... but they

2 require real skill. This is going to have tremendous
3 implications for our workforce, our teachers to help
4 the entire system to get better. And I don't know if
5 you heard our chief of career pathways, will just ask
6 her to take a minute on it as well, Jade Grieve, if
7 you can just kind of expound a little bit on it.
8 Because this is a really big deal for us. This is
9 not just expanding on a few more CTE classes. That's
10 not what we're talking about. Jade.

11 CHIEF GRIEVE: Thank you, Chancellor, and thank
12 you, Council Member for the question. And just to
13 say, we'd appreciate the chance to talk more about
14 you about this with you, if you'd like given... given
15 your interest. But just to share a little bit more
16 about some of the career pathways programs that we're
17 planning for launch in the coming school year, and
18 then wanting to expand those right across the city
19 beyond that, but we really see this as an opportunity
20 to blend the best of college and career readiness.

21 So looking to really... and in... in the spirit
22 of the Chancellor's push around redesigning the
23 student experience to be to be blending both career-
24 themed instruction within the walls of the academic
25 experience, as well as giving students the

2 opportunity for... alongside that sequence advising
3 and readiness around ensuring that they're all able
4 to develop a very strong post-secondary plan,
5 regardless of whether they're going to college, or
6 career, coming out of school, ensuring that we're
7 giving students the chance to...

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 CHIEF GRIEVE: ...really kind of get a broad
10 sense of the career opportunities and get some get
11 some career awareness, experience, and exposure as
12 part of that. And then lastly, giving students a
13 chance for a head start, so the Chancellor's talked a
14 bit about some of the opportunities that that do
15 exist with the right kinds of industry credentials,
16 and certainly the chance to get some early college
17 credit before they graduate.

18 So we see the opportunities of blending those,
19 actually addressing some of the things that you
20 raised in your question about this, about college for
21 all and CTE. And this is really an opportunity to
22 bring the best of those together. And we're excited
23 to... to start that next year, next school year with
24 some schools.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you. And I
3 know what the interest of time, if I can just ask the
4 last couple of questions that you folks can briefly
5 touch on, and then I will mute myself that if the
6 chair allows. Chair?

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, that's fine.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, thank you. Um, so
9 the last thing I wanted to say about CTEs... or two
10 things I want to say about CTE, really, that the
11 pathway to employment part are finding those
12 signatory employers that are really matching up with
13 our CTE schools is critical, only because right now,
14 from what I've seen, I've seen from my experiences,
15 we have folks learning how to... or, or getting an
16 internship at the MTA, for example, but then, upon
17 graduation, are stuck on a two-three year waiting
18 list for the civil service exam. I'd really like us
19 to see... it's something I've been talking about for
20 years while partnering up with the state to push back
21 on finding a loophole or finding a credentialing way
22 certification way to say, how do we move people,
23 especially those that we are training and we know are
24 ready to go right into the workforce? How do we move
25 them beyond the civil service exam, or the waitlist

2 of the civil service exam, and then I'd like to hear
3 what we're doing within our education system around
4 bridge programming.

5 And then if we can touch on a budget for crossing
6 guards across the board for all of our schools.
7 Recently, I had a crossing guard, one of my schools
8 pass away, and within that week, unfortunately,
9 we had a student that was hit by a car in that... in
10 that school zone. So I know they're kind of needed
11 across the board, and I just like to hear what
12 does... what does that line item look like in terms
13 of ensuring not only that we're training folks to
14 become crossing guards and into those fields? But
15 also, are we addressing the need that we have
16 budgetarily to ensure that every school can get
17 access to them?

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, let me say... on the
19 crossing guards piece, they know they technically are
20 part of NYPD, and we probably have to address that
21 with them. But to your first point, I think you're
22 absolutely right. I... if our kids are getting a
23 level of exposure, particularly in high school, we
24 should put them in a position where they don't have
25 to sit on the back of all of a waiting list for some

2 of these jobs. We should be preparing them for
3 direct entry into some of these city positions. And
4 it would certainly seem to me that that's something
5 the City Council could help us with. We don't have
6 direct authority, right with MTA, but I think you
7 know, as council members, that's something that you
8 can help to drive in partnership with us. That will
9 be great on behalf of our kids.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you. You
11 can sign me as a partner in that. I'm ready to
12 tackle some of those issues with you. Thank you so
13 much for answering my questions today.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Next we'll turn to
16 Council Member De La Rosa.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much,
19 Chancellor and all the team and our Chairs for this
20 wonderful hearing. Chancellor first let me say that
21 you made me very happy this morning and very excited
22 about the possibility for the partnership with the
23 Dominican Republic. As you know, our community is
24 one of the largest in the school system. And it's
25 very important for us to have that reflection in the

2 leadership of your Administration. So thank you so
3 much.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: (inaudible) Adasa! Adasa!

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Exactly. Adasa.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: It's coming from.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Exactly. So, in that
8 same vein, part of my question is about the hiring
9 freeze, and if you've already answered this question,
10 I'm happy to just look back at it as well. But in
11 the March budget hearing, it was mentioned that there
12 was a hiring freeze at the D.O.E.. We see that...
13 that... We did not see a change in the PEG in the
14 executive budget. So what is the status of the
15 hiring freeze? And the reason I'm asking is because
16 of obviously an underlying concern about special
17 education students, our students, which we know are
18 at a crisis point, right now. And so I'm trying to
19 reconcile in my mind, how are we going to deal with
20 the services that are needed if there is a freeze?

21 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember,
22 thank you very much for the question. There was
23 briefly a hiring freeze put in place by the city, but
24 that has since been lifted. And that hiring freeze
25 never impacted school based positions. It doesn't...

2 and nothing is impacting school hiring now. And we
3 expect that, you know, we will have more information
4 about school hiring for the upcoming school year in
5 the next couple of weeks.

6 As it pertains to our, sort of, non-school based
7 positions, obviously, we review positions closely and
8 work with our city partners, but there is no longer
9 you know, full scale freeze on... on any positions.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Okay. And can you
11 talk a little bit about the services for the ELL
12 students and the special education students and what
13 that looks like?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you,
15 Councilmember De La Rosa. So in terms of services,
16 we are continuing to build some of our inclusive
17 programs so that we can expand what we have seen is
18 working, right?, to one of the pillars of the
19 chancellor. We're finding that programs that are
20 inclusive for our students, first with special needs,
21 are very... have shown it to be more effective, and
22 have also shown to be less expensive. And so we're
23 really looking at duplicating some of those efforts.
24 So for example, the ASD Nest program, our horizons
25 program, those types of programs where students are

2 receiving supports within the community school are
3 most effective for our students with disabilities.
4 In addition to that, we are building up practices
5 across the curriculum. And so building out literacy
6 practices, building out different types of strategies
7 to meet the needs of students with math, and then
8 really using some of those assessments that we've put
9 in place, with screeners to find out what it is that
10 students need in terms of intervention, and building
11 out those strategies, for example, with our students
12 with disabilities as well. So there are already
13 programs very specifically to meet those literacy
14 needs in the... in those... for that community.

15 For our English language learners. We talked a
16 little bit about building out more heritage language
17 opportunities, as well as some of those bilingual
18 extension programs. And our biggest piece is making
19 sure that our content area teachers as well as our
20 English Language Learner teachers, and our teachers
21 of students with disabilities are all well trained to
22 meet the needs of our kids. So the responsibility
23 isn't exclusively on the teacher who is an ELL
24 teacher, or teacher of students with disabilities,

2 but rather all of our teachers really have those
3 strategies in place.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Great. And I wanted
5 to also uplift Council Member Gennaro's comments
6 around carbon free and Healthy Schools. Chair Joseph
7 and I just wrote an Op Ed in City Limits around this
8 topic and the need to make sure that environmental
9 justice communities like ours, are taken into
10 consideration, especially the infrastructure needs in
11 our schools. I've personally been touring the
12 schools in District 6. There's a lot of need. One
13 of those needs as well is the... the access to water
14 fountains. You know, lead remediation in schools,
15 some of these buildings are 100 years old, as you
16 know. And so I wanted to just uplift those comments
17 that my colleagues made. And of course, the class
18 size comments. You know, there have been people that
19 have been working on the reduction of class size, you
20 know, while I was still in school, and so I want to
21 uplift the need for us to take a look at it, right?
22 Education has changed since the pandemic is upon us,
23 and the ability for our children to have adequate
24 class size continues to be a great need. And so I

2 wanted to just highlight both of those points. Thank
3 you so much for answering our questions today.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you councilmember
5 Council Member De La Rosa. Next... I do not see
6 Council Member Hanks, so we will turn to Council
7 Member Menin.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now. .

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Hi, thank you so much. And
10 I really want to thank the chairs for this fantastic
11 hearing. It's incredibly helpful to really drill down
12 on these details. So I also, in continuation of what
13 my colleague, Councilmember De La Rosa, just said, I
14 also want to uplift the comments on class size
15 matters. I really believe that the class size is
16 absolutely imperative and really urge administration
17 to take all the comments that were raised by my
18 colleagues very seriously on that. So I had a
19 question about funding for construction of outdoor
20 play spaces, because we do have a number of schools
21 that don't have gyms and then don't have outdoor play
22 spaces, so I wanted to understand if there was any
23 additional funding allocation for that to ensure that
24 all the schools have that.

25 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina still here?

2 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Regarding gyms, we did start
3 an initiative where we did look at 76 buildings where
4 there were not gyms, and in many cases we were able
5 to create gymnasiums. This was an initiative that
6 was started about eight years ago and has not seen
7 funding in this capital plan to expand that to more
8 schools. We... and under that we were able to
9 create a prototype and installed are constructed 22
10 or 23 standalone gymnasiums. We... we do, you know,
11 in terms of outdoor play space, we do have funding in
12 the plan to either create or renovate a lot of the
13 playgrounds, as well as over \$100 million for fields.
14 So certainly we are looking at outdoor play space as
15 a... as a priority for us. And also--I'm sure we'll
16 get more questions on this--as we're removing the
17 TCUs, we do renovate the playground, if an addition
18 is not needed to be built in that space. We also try
19 to, you know, be creative in some constraints of the
20 building itself. And we do look to sort of... if
21 there is space in the existing school, if there's any
22 way that we can modify some of the spaces to create
23 indoor play space, maybe like a multipurpose room,
24 you know, aside from the cafeteria, I'm not saying
25 that, but just where they could play indoors as well.

2

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: So does that mean with this
4 \$100 million fund that you just mentioned... I have
5 schools in my district and I know other colleagues do
6 as well, but for example, my district in the East
7 Harlem part of my district, we have one of the
8 highest childhood obesity rates and childhood asthma
9 rates. We have schools in my district that don't
10 have any outdoor play space. Is the administration
11 then committing to create those outdoor play spaces?
12 Like what will that \$100 million fund... how many
13 schools will that cover? Does it cover all the
14 schools that are in need?

15 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: So just to clarify, the 100
16 million that I was referring to was for athletic
17 fields, mostly the those that exist, not so much new
18 ones. And as I mentioned that we did... we did have
19 some funding set aside for gymnasium... standalone
20 gymnasiums. I don't think with the funding that we
21 have, we can commit to creating play space for every
22 school that does not have it yet. We do work with
23 D.O.E. to make sure that outdoor play space is made
24 available, whether it's through closing streets and
25 things like that... not the ideal scenario, and I'm

2 sure you will... will agree to that. But we do also
3 have \$50 million set aside for playground
4 renovations. So we do have some money, but I cannot
5 commit to saying that every school that does not have
6 an outdoor play space will have an outdoor play space
7 created by the SCA.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: And what about new
9 construction for new schools?

10 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: That is... (crosstalk)

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Is that the commitment that
12 SCA is making? That you are going to allocate that?

13 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: we do create outdoor play
14 space with our new schools? Yes. Okay. Sometimes
15 it's rooftop, But we try to do as much at-grade
16 space, You know, when it's possible.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Yeah. Because in our
18 district, as you know, we have many schools that are
19 closing the streets, kids playing right by traffic.
20 It's not as you said... it's less than AN ideal
21 situation.

22 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Understood.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I have another question if
24 I still have time on dual languages. Can you talk a
25 little bit... could someone from D.O.E. speak a

2 little bit about the dual-language programs, any
3 commitment to it? We have a lot of inquiries in my
4 district about dual language programs and what the
5 administration's commitment is to that.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you for
8 that question, Council Member Menin. We are looking
9 to expand our bilingual programs and want to make
10 sure that we are designing programs that are going to
11 be successful for students using data and information
12 that we have in collaboration with the folks at
13 district. So working with superintendents, working
14 with parents, we hope to open about 50 bilingual
15 programs... open or expand rather about 50 bilingual
16 programs, and we'll make decisions based on... on
17 where and what languages with all of that information
18 in that engagement.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay, thank you.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember.
21 Next we'll turn to Council Member Feliz followed by
22 Council Member Hudson.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: All right, hello,
25 everybody. So good to see everybody. Thank you,

2 Finance Chair Brannan and Education Chair Joseph, for
3 this very informative hearing. And also, thank you,
4 Chancellor Banks, very good to see you. Thank you
5 and your team for the very important work that you do
6 right here in the City of New York.

7 My questions are about trailer classrooms in our
8 city, also known as TCUs. I have so many of them in
9 my district. I think everyone in this room has many
10 goals in common, including the goal of ensuring that
11 every child in the city of New York gets the high
12 quality education that they deserve, and I think we
13 could also agree that in order to get that high
14 quality education, we need a lot of tools, including
15 educational spaces that are good for learning. And
16 I'm extremely concerned about the fact that we still
17 have so many Temporary Classroom Units. We call them
18 to see us and we also call them non TCU temporary
19 buildings. But at the end of the day, they're still
20 trailer classroom buildings. Again, I have so many
21 of them in my district. And I represent a very poor,
22 very vulnerable district. And I think it's a big
23 problem. Trailers that are 20 or 30 years old, or
24 even older. Um, you could only imagine that
25 condition. And it's a problem. And I'm not blaming

2 this administration. I know the administration has
3 been in office for four months. And this is a
4 problem that has been accruing over the years and
5 decades. But, you know, obviously, all of us get to
6 decide how we move forward on this issue of, you
7 know, children, still learning in trailers,
8 especially low income, vulnerable children.

9 So a few questions about the trailer classrooms,
10 and for general context, can you provide information
11 on how many trailer classrooms or trailer buildings
12 we have in our city, including those that we call
13 TCUs, but also those that we call non-TCU temporary
14 buildings?

15 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you for that question,
16 Councilmember. I know, Councilmember Stevens was
17 afraid that you weren't going to be on to ask this
18 very important question. So she even asked on your
19 behalf. So thank you for bringing that up. And
20 so... so we started out with 354 TCUs throughout our
21 system. And we've removed about 270. And we have
22 plans like... it's in process for many more. So we
23 are working on plans to remove the remaining 33 for
24 which we don't have plans. I will say that is for
25 TCUs. Of those remaining 33, there are two in your

2 district at one school and two in councilmember
3 Stevens, district one we're talking about the Bronx,
4 as well. So there are four TCUs that we do not yet
5 have plans for. We are working very hard to get
6 plans for that. There is, as you mentioned, other
7 temporary structures, which we you know... we were
8 really looking at this as a multi-pronged approach.
9 Let's get rid of all of the... the majority the 354
10 TCUs, and then let's go and look at the other
11 temporary structures, the non-TCU temporary
12 structures. And what we're trying to do is do it in
13 a more systematic way. We have been able to remove
14 some of them by creating additions, PS 105, in the
15 Bronx, 95 and 96 in the Bronx, Q2, obviously in
16 Queens, but we haven't been able to... we don't have
17 the funding in this plan and we're trying to come up
18 with a systematic way to remove those remaining
19 temporary structures. There are about 65 of them and
20 Chair Joseph shared with me pictures of PS85 in the
21 Bronx when she was there with you, and I do see, can
22 you see that this one... PS85 in particular is very
23 long and is right next to the existing school
24 building. Now that that temporary structure has
25 about 200 kids supposedly enrolled, enrolled in that

2 building. And I want to say before I go on with that
3 we do not count the capacity of those structures. So
4 when you're looking at the Bluebook, the capacity of
5 that temporary structure is not included. But for
6 practicality purposes, it's... it's harder to remove
7 something that contains 200 Children, where... where
8 on the site is where the ideal place to build maybe
9 an addition, without figuring out how to move those
10 children while we build an addition. So this... our
11 approach was really to get rid of the TCUs -- not an
12 easy task, but easier because they are smaller
13 structures -- and then let's work with the D.O.E. to
14 come up with... do we temporarily re-site them? What
15 can we do in order to build a more permanent
16 structure? Sorry, I don't mean to interrupt.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: ... and how many... I'm
18 sorry, I know time is limited. How many? So you
19 mentioned 65 temporary structures. Can you give a
20 breakdown of how many we have per borough?

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I'm happy to give that...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Super-rough numbers if you
24 don't have the hard numbers in front of you.

2 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yeah, I don't have broken down
3 by... I have it by council district. So I'm happy
4 to send that to you afterwards, if you don't mind.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Yeah, okay, that's fine.
6 And also, if the chair would permit, just a few more
7 points on this very important topic.

8 CHAIR JOSEPH: Yes, Council Member, please go
9 ahead.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. I really
11 appreciate it. Um, so approximately how much money...
12 or is there any way that the SCA and the Department
13 of Education could prioritize this issue? Many of
14 these temporary... TCUs... trailer classrooms...
15 let's call them trailer classrooms. So that's what
16 they are, regardless of whether we call them TCU or
17 non-TCU... many of them are located in school
18 buildings that have really large playgrounds. The
19 TCUs or the trailers are located right in the middle
20 of the playground. So it is possible to basically
21 construct a school extension right on the corner of
22 the playground, and then demolish the TCU, or the
23 trailer after that extension is built, so that you
24 don't have to disrupt classrooms. You don't have to
25 transfer the students to other areas. What can we do

2 to, I guess, accelerate the timeline. It is 2022.
3 It is unacceptable that the poorest, most vulnerable
4 children are learning in... in trailers with water
5 leaks every time it rains, or with lack of proper
6 ventilation, air conditioning system, what can be
7 done at this level of government to accelerate that
8 timeline?

9 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: So that's exactly what we're
10 starting to look at now, is whether it's feasible to
11 create an addition to remove such temporary
12 structures. We were able to do that... exactly what
13 you're talking about at PS96 in Queens, where we are
14 building the addition, and after the addition is
15 built are we able then to remove the TCU. So the
16 kids will be in place during the duration. So again,
17 I think, you know, we were so focused on the TCUs
18 that, you know, like I said, we have about 65 or so
19 of our... the TCBs or these other non-TCU temporary
20 structures. That's exactly the deeper dive that we
21 need to go into now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Like, how much money would
23 it cost to get all the TCUs and TCBs replaced? I know
24 it's a super... you know, you're not going to have

2 the hard numbers there. But more or less, how much
3 are we talking about?

4 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: It would be hard for me to
5 give a number without looking at each one of those 65
6 or so sites. I think with the \$352 million that we
7 have in this capital plan, we will be able to remove
8 the TCUs. That's why, I want to just say if you
9 could give us a little time to start looking at those
10 TBCs, I don't want to give you a number that is so
11 wrong, so if you give us a little time, we will
12 certainly come back to you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Well, thank you so
14 much. And I hope that that SCA and also the
15 Department of Education could, you know make this a
16 top priority. We cannot talk about high quality
17 education when children are learning in trailers.
18 And again, I'm not blaming this administration. This
19 has been happening for many decades. But I hope we
20 could come up with a real plan to get this resolved
21 soon because, you know, our generations cannot
22 continue to wait for... for good education. Thank
23 you so much.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you and next we'll turn
25 to Councilmember Hudson.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Hi there. Thank you for
4 the opportunity to just ask you a question. I know
5 that my... many of my colleagues have asked a lot of
6 really great questions, and apologies, I don't
7 believe this has been asked yet I've been trying to
8 follow along as best as I can, and trying to, you
9 know, multi... multitask here. But you mentioned
10 earlier about expanding the Gifted and Talented
11 program. And in my district, I have one of the first
12 schools to sort of self-select out of the Gifted and
13 Talented program, and eliminate it really in an
14 effort to achieve true parity in the education
15 system. And we know that black and brown kids are
16 disproportionately underrepresented in gifted and
17 talented programs. So I would just like to know what
18 you'll be doing to support and empower the school
19 communities that have chosen not to participate in
20 Gifted and Talented program, and how you'll ensure
21 that the kids who have traditionally been left out of
22 these programs will have access. And how much are
23 you investing in the Gifted and Talented program for
24 fiscal year 23? Thank you.

25

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No, I appreciate that, Council
3 Member, and I appreciate when we had the opportunity
4 to to visit my old elementary...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Yeah, new bridges. That
6 was great.

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, which was PS167, back
8 when I was a teacher there. But nonetheless, you
9 know, what you raised is... is kind of representative
10 of the challenge of being in a job like this. When
11 you speak, there's no monolithic way that parents and
12 communities feel. There are some parents which were
13 desperate to have gifted and talented and told me at
14 every turn. And then others who said, you know, we
15 we don't support gifted and talented. But the reason
16 that we made the decision to offer the opportunity to
17 have a gifted and talented in every district was in
18 fact, to help to diversify the Gifted and Talented
19 program. If we put a Gifted and Talented program in
20 Ocean Hill, Brownsville, we are going to get black
21 and brown students who are part of the Gifted and
22 Talented program. If I... there are many districts
23 here that you all represent that if we open it up, we
24 go to Southeast Queens, which is what they asked us

2 to do, by definition, we're going to diversify the
3 program, which is one of the issues.

4 So the diversity question was a question I think,
5 at its heart when.... when it was such a scarcity
6 model in only a handful of spots. But by putting it
7 in every district, it... were going to open it up to
8 everybody. That's number one.

9 The other part of it is... because we've been
10 asked by a couple of communities around not doing it
11 at all. What we have said, and my position on it is
12 this, I would let the community voice what they want
13 to do by... by voting with their feet. So we will
14 know in your district to anybody else's district, if
15 there's no demand for it, then we won't have it.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, great.

17 CHANCELLOR BANKS: But I didn't want to... and
18 I've spoken to some school leaders and a couple other
19 community leaders, and they were telling me, "We
20 don't want it." I said, "Well, let's let the parents
21 decide." You know, in one sense, we can't... you
22 know, we've had a lot of conversations around mayoral
23 control of schools and everything else. And people
24 say to me all the time, the parents don't feel that
25 they have a voice, that they don't have a seat at the

2 table. So I can't in one sense, say "I'm opening up
3 to parents," and then another sense, say, "Well, I'm
4 not... You're not going to get it because other folks
5 have spoken for you." I can't do that. And so we're
6 just opening up as an option. There will not be a
7 Gifted and Talented program in your district if the
8 parents in your district say we're not interested,
9 then there won't be one. But if they if they fill up
10 a classroom for kids, then we'll have it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, that... that's
12 helpful. And just to be clear, it's you know, the...
13 My district is very diverse, and all the schools are
14 very different. So there might be even diversity in
15 thought and in those requests in my district alone,
16 and I have both districts 17 and 13. So school
17 districts 17 and 13.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: What we want to do is we want
19 to we want to just open it up, we want to get
20 started. We're just trying our best to establish
21 some kind of a baseline. And we're here to see what
22 we learn and what the experiences are. And in some
23 districts, they're going to want to expand it. Other
24 districts may say we don't need it. We'll figure it

2 out. We going to try to give it a year to take a
3 look at it.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: That sounds good. And
5 then just in terms of investment. Is there dollar
6 amount that you're putting into the Gifted and
7 Talented program to expand to every district?

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah. Uh, Lindsey, what do
9 you got, Lindsey:

10 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yeah,
11 Councilmember is 1.9 million.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. Citywide?

13 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Correct.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you. Thanks,
15 Commissioner. Thank you all.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
17 Hudson. And I do not see Councilmember Nurse, so next
18 we will turn to Councilmember Lee.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Oh, sorry. I didn't realize
21 it could unmute myself. Hi, everyone. Thank you so
22 much to our leadership, Madam Speaker, as well as
23 Chairs Brannan and Joseph, and thank you so much
24 Chancellor for being on here, as well as president
25 Kubota, sorry, from SCA, and all the staff. Also

2 forgive me for being in and out, I was actually
3 visiting schools for their career day. So hopefully
4 that gives me a legitimate pass for if I missed
5 something. But I actually wanted to focus... I know
6 that a lot of folks have been asking about social
7 workers and mental health is super important in the
8 schools. And I specifically wanted to focus in on
9 the \$5 million that was allocated for the mental
10 health continuum. As you know, this is an important
11 issue for me as Chair of the Mental Health Committee,
12 and I just wanted to check in because I know this
13 is... if I... if I'm understanding this correctly,
14 it's the first initiative that D.O.E. has
15 collaborated with H&H on, Health And Hospitals, and
16 DOHMH to help the students that are severely... that
17 have significant mental health challenges in the
18 schools. And so I just wanted to get a sense of how
19 the partnership... I'll ask all the questions at
20 once, so you can just answer them one at a time.

21 But I just wanted to get a sense of how the
22 collaboration is working with the other city agencies
23 that are part of this model? Has it been going well?
24 What are some of the challenges? And also, you know,
25 how have the schools that... I believe it's been 50,

2 it's in 50, high-need schools in South Bronx and
3 central Brooklyn. So I just wanted to know the
4 status of the initiative in those schools
5 specifically and how it's been going? And also, if
6 it's something that you would support, which I hope
7 you will, for FY 23, and then extending it into the
8 budget? And also where... if you think there's
9 certain increases that need to be made? Or if it's
10 too early to tell? If you could just speak on that a
11 little bit more.

12 CHIEF JOHNSON: Okay, sorry about that. Thank
13 you for the question, Councilmember. So the mental
14 health continuum: We've been working in partnership
15 with Health And Hospitals. We've been working with
16 other colleagues to really kind of explore and deepen
17 this level of access. As we are examining the
18 success of this particular initiative, one of the
19 things that we're finding is... trying to figure out
20 and trying to navigate access to the resources across
21 the various agency pathways, and then coordinating...
22 leveraging those resources to engage staff. And so
23 that has been a place where we've... we've been
24 looking for... we've been working collaboratively.
25 We've also been working to figure out ways to

2 continue to provide continued and additional funding
3 for this. And... and we found that leveraging the...
4 the funds across the various teams, has presented a
5 little bit of a challenge. So with regard to the
6 specific progress for each of the 50 schools, I'd
7 have to confirm with the team and get back to you to
8 this, around the specifics for that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Okay, and I guess if you
10 could get back to me on, you know, if... if the
11 numbers are low, because I would imagine \$5 million
12 is a drop in the bucket when you're talking about
13 city wide. And so even with the 50 schools, I would
14 imagine it's not enough. And so if you guys could
15 come back to us with some sort of evaluation or
16 assessment on where you guys think the needs are,
17 because I'd be very curious to see how it has been
18 working in those schools where it's it started. And
19 if you could give us a sense of what the challenges
20 are and how much more resources you guys would need
21 in terms of that program or initiative. So if you
22 guys could get back to us. That'd be awesome.

23 CHIEF JOHNSON: Absolutely. Thank you for the
24 question.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Thank you.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember Lee.

3 And next we'll turn to Councilmember Sanchez.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Good afternoon everyone.

6 Good afternoon, Chancellor. Good to see everyone.

7 So my... my question is going to be about students

8 living in shelter. So, no reason why you would have

9 necessarily seen, but you know, I had a shootout... a
10 shootout in front of my office yesterday in the

11 afternoon. Right after I finished chairing the

12 Executive Budget hearing, we all had to jump to the

13 floor and you know... just... just cover right as

14 nine, nine shots were fired, and one of my

15 constituents... her son was shot in the leg.

16 And, you know, for me, it's... I love these kids,

17 these are my kids. They're doing terrible things,

18 because of the realities that we grow up in, right?,

19 and the difficulties and some of them have just never

20 had a fighting chance, right? And so, when you look

21 at something like what's in my district, which is we

22 have, we have some schools where 40% of children are

23 living in shelter... or are living in temporary

24 housing, right? We have... we have... and it's by the

25 way, it's right by where my office is, right? And so

2 when we put these things together I, you know, I'm
3 just so frustrated, right and angry. And I know that
4 we all are in.... we share this, but what are what
5 are we doing? Right?

6 So, you know, I know we need community
7 coordinators, that Council's budget response is
8 asking for 100 of these community coordinators for
9 students living in temporary housing. We have to
10 help our students, right? We have to, um, fighting
11 for housing on the other side, but within our
12 schools, you know, we have to, we have to be there
13 for them. And not... not just the the community
14 coordinators, but making sure that, you know, what
15 I'm hearing from these principals in these schools
16 with... with the high shelter and temporary housing
17 numbers is social workers and guidance counselors,
18 and folks to really be there for... for those
19 wraparound services.

20 So I know we're asking for 100 Community
21 coordinators, we absolutely need them, the students
22 need the supports. And so my first question is just
23 about the status of the 50 that you already committed
24 to? And can can we do more?

2 CHIEF JOHNSON: So thank you for the question,
3 Councilmember. So as you know, we've been looking
4 creatively at ways to really address some of the
5 needs for students and families experiencing
6 homelessness. And first, before I get into the depth
7 of the question, I just wanted to pause for a moment
8 to say: Are you okay?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I'm okay. My team is
10 okay. Thank you so much for asking.

11 CHIEF JOHNSON: I think it... you know, that...
12 that's just what sits at the core of the work is, you
13 know, just ensuring that we and our families and
14 communities are okay.

15 And so I think as we think about the supports
16 that we are leveraging for students in temporary
17 housing, we've been really excited to really access
18 the American Rescue Plan funding to really be able to
19 -- as you'd mentioned -- identified the 50... the 50
20 community coordinators to support students in
21 temporary housing. As we figure out what makes sense
22 and how we... how we align those additional supports,
23 we realize we... we need additional supports. These
24 particular supports... these additional 50 staff
25 members will be shelter-based staff members and will

2 be able to work in partnership and coordination with
3 the school teams and school coordinators. They will
4 also work in collaboration with our school base,
5 bridging... bridging the gap social workers, who are
6 the team of social... social workers who are
7 identified exclusively for the supports for students
8 in temporary housing. And we've been able to hire
9 100 of those Bridging the Gap social workers, in
10 addition to the existing number of 107 community
11 coordinators that already exist. So the 50 will add
12 to that core. And then they work in partnership with
13 our family assistance. And so we have about 117
14 family assistance. And so when we think about
15 leveraging these well over 300 staff members, and
16 adding an additional 50 to this core, we really are
17 working to meet the need. We do recognize that
18 there's still more that needs to be done. And I've
19 committed to kind of working in partnership to figure
20 out creative ways to figure out sourcing... to
21 sustain the sources for these for these families who
22 are experiencing homelessness at this time.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you and
24 are... is the D.O.E. applying for a second round of
25 Homeless Children And Youth funding.

2 CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes. Yes. So in the first
3 round, and there was about \$9 million that was
4 allocated. And the second round of funding is
5 slightly more expensive. It's roughly about \$23 or
6 \$24 million. And we've been really excited to
7 work... to really engage multiple voices and multiple
8 stakeholders. So within the D.O.E., we're working
9 not just within the Office of Students in Temporary
10 Housing, but working across all of the sectors where
11 families and students are affected. We've been
12 working more deeply within the core members who are
13 part of the... part of the team, and who actually
14 have the direct experience with students and families
15 who are experiencing homelessness...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 CHIEF JOHNSON: and we also are working in
18 partnership across agencies. And so being able
19 to... to activate on the kind of the mayor's priority
20 to work across... inter-agencies, and really to think
21 about DSS to think about ACS, and to really
22 incorporate all of the different ways that families
23 are touched by this particular matter, and to use
24 that to leverage how we are going to adequately be

2 able to allocate the funds. And so we're working to
3 draft that response in the coming weeks.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so
5 much. I will just follow up and request a
6 breakdown... if the DOE could provide a breakdown of
7 where these 117 plus 50 workers are going to be
8 located and how the service is going to be divided?
9 That would be really helpful. And Chancellor Banks,
10 I will be reaching out to do a walkthrough in my
11 district. I would love to host you here.

12 CHANCELLOR BANKS: (inaudible)

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. I'm not seeing
15 Council Member Restler. We will turn to our final
16 Council Member for questions for the Department of Ed
17 and the SCA, Councilmember Avilés.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Hello everyone. Thank
20 you so much to chair Brannan and Chair Joseph and
21 everyone else for being on this call for so for so
22 many hours. I appreciate you and all the work you're
23 doing.

24 I just want to first start wholeheartedly
25 agreeing with Council Member Hanif, who talked about

2 culturally... culturally responsive and sustaining
3 education. I had a very particular instance in my
4 district where a principal told me that she had
5 received these books, that she had instructed her
6 teachers not to distribute and use because she found
7 the books racist. They were books sent through the
8 Mosaic Program. And I asked her to tell me which
9 book they were, and we could sit together and look at
10 it. In fact, they were not racist, they were anti-
11 racist books. But what it led... what it led me to
12 understand was she had received boxes and boxes of
13 beautifully selected new resources without any
14 training and support and PD opportunities for
15 teachers that don't understand or haven't done the
16 self-reflection work around what it is to be an anti-
17 racist educator. So I would love to hear what the
18 plans are to fill that gap. Because I suspect that
19 this is the case across other school districts, and
20 this is a critical component to getting us to the
21 place that we need.

22 Also, I'd love to know a little bit more about
23 the justification for... for funding, potentially
24 almost 800 school safety officer positions, when the
25 rest of the D.O.E. budget is getting cut. That's in

2 addition to what already exists. I don't understand
3 that, particularly since we are I mean, we're just
4 talking about the need for... you know, transition
5 advisors and social workers, and still the lack of...
6 while investment is increasing, and that still, so
7 many of our schools need really that kind of support.
8 It is the first thing I hear from schools in my
9 district. We need more of these kinds of support. So
10 I would love for y'all to respond maybe to those two
11 questions.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you.
13 Thank you, Councilmember Aviles. Sorry for the echo.
14 Sometimes it makes us feel like a superstar in here.

15 So I appreciate you asking about the books. And
16 actually, that is something that that I learned when
17 we when I arrived here: That there were, you know,
18 really great resources that were sent to schools, and
19 we're incredibly happy about the fact that schools
20 have received these texts, and we want to continue to
21 do that, to be able to provide more diversity in the
22 types of books that we are providing to schools, both
23 the hardcopy books that kids can hold in our part of
24 their classroom library, and the books that they can
25 access through the electronic library, through SORA.

2 One of the things that that we noted was that
3 they were sent without that support. And so for the
4 schools that are very-well-versed in what it means to
5 be an anti-racist school, or that are already talking
6 about and learning about liberatory practices,
7 they're fine. But you're absolutely right that in
8 other places, it looks like we may need to do other
9 types of... of training, and to really have
10 conversations with the community about what the books
11 are that we're sending. If at any point, a school
12 does have a problem with a book, there is a process
13 to be able to contest that book as well, but I
14 appreciate that you sat with them and looked through
15 the books, to see that in fact that we're not racist.
16 And so thank you for helping to do that. I know that
17 the more that we can provide representations of who
18 our community is, the kinder and safer that we're
19 building across the community. So I appreciate that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Well, I'd love to follow
21 up on that please, in particular, because I think the
22 principal has still decided she... she reads this a
23 particular way, and has instructed all her teachers
24 to put those books on the side and to ignore them.

2 And so I think it really speaks to what... what
3 is the guidance, parents won't know that these books
4 even exist because they don't come home. So how...
5 how is it that that the DOE is ensuring that these
6 curriculums are getting rolled out responsibly?
7 And... and with adequate support? She wouldn't... I
8 don't know if she identified that, if she even wants
9 to have that battle. It's easier for her to just put
10 them aside and direct her teachers to do otherwise.
11 So I guess I'm curious kind of like what the
12 mechanism is there to make sure that... that we
13 are... we are pushing our schools down this path in a
14 loving and gentle way but certainly with... with
15 urgency because they can be ignored.

16 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, let me just say this
17 also... got to mute... you know, there was a large
18 body of work that was done before we even came into
19 office, that... that really dealt with a lot of anti-
20 racist trainings for...

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 ... all across the city. And so that's a body of
23 work that we're going to continue to support. When
24 you hear... I don't know that this is a wide ranging
25 citywide issue, so to the degree that you hear about

2 it, please, you know, let us know directly, what
3 school, what principal, and we can follow up on that
4 for sure. But... but trust me during the last
5 several years, this is a this was a big body of work.
6 And... and you know, it's not easy work, and everyone
7 is not fully prepared for it. And... but we are
8 going to continue to be as supportive as we can to
9 all of our schools and our superintendents and our
10 principals to really make sure that they're getting
11 the support that they need to do this work
12 effectively. But I've not heard a lot of pushback.
13 That's what I'm saying I don't... it doesn't strike
14 me as something that's a city-wide response and that
15 people feel as though they have not gotten fully
16 prepared. You may get that in a case you were there,
17 and that's why we do. Just bring it to our
18 attention. We can follow up for sure.

19 CHIEF JOHNSON: And so, Councilmember, thank you.
20 I've wanted to so I just wanted to address the second
21 portion of... of your question. With regard to the
22 SSA is an NYPD. With regard to SSA is they are NYPD
23 staff, and so they're hired and organized through the
24 NYPD. We do work in partnership with them to ensure
25 that we're providing the appropriate supports to our

2 schools. And as we said, if we think about who our
3 school safety agents are, if we think about how we
4 align those with the both clinical and non-clinical
5 supports, we are working to address some of the
6 challenges that young people are facing in this
7 space. And we do realize recognize that there is
8 additional work that needs to be done in that space.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm sorry, I'm sorry, I
10 don't understand your response. Are you suggesting
11 we need we need the 800, we can only get 50 transfer
12 coordinators and 100 social workers but it is okay to
13 do 800 Police in schools?

14 CHIEF JOHNSON: No council member I just... I
15 guess to clarify, I was saying that the NYPD hires
16 and maintains the school safety... school safety
17 staff. And so when we think about young people
18 creating a safe and supportive environment for young
19 people, we think about how we how we sustain both the
20 emotional safety as well as the physical safety. So
21 there is a need for the SSAs, and NYPD will... will
22 handle the... the staffing and the hiring of those.
23 And on our part is we think about building out the
24 emotional safety, the support for young people and
25 supports in the schools. So apologies if I misspoke.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: No, no, no. I appreciate
3 the clarification. Thank you.

4 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. And
6 I note that the chancellor had to step away. But
7 Council Member Restler has his hand up. So Council
8 Member, the DOE team is up. The chancellor is still
9 here. So if you just want to go and ask your
10 questions, I will turn it back to the chairs.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You can unmute yourself.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Well great. What a
14 gift. Thank you, Malcom. Well, let me firstly just
15 recognize my good friend and our Distinguished Chair,
16 Rita Joseph. I greatly appreciate her tremendous
17 leadership. Everybody likes to say that December 23,
18 she was still in the classroom. She... she taught
19 her whole way through the campaign. She's an
20 extraordinary person she thinks about her students.
21 I was lucky to have her in my district, visiting a
22 high school last week. And I've now made it to over
23 30 schools in my district. So I'm trying to keep up
24 with you, Chancellor on your school visits. I like
25 to start every morning with a school visit. It is

2 wonderful. It's... it's the best part of my day. I
3 love getting to meet with our principals visit our
4 students. I was at the Brooklyn International High
5 School this morning, all English language learners.
6 It's a really special place, project based learning
7 approach. I just loved it. But it's good to have
8 you Chancellor and your whole team. Thank you for
9 for being with us.

10 The first thing I wanted to ask about is an issue
11 of great concern to me, which is about the enrollment
12 peg. And I understand that it's going to be somewhat
13 moderated by the federal stimulus dollars and that
14 you've tried to spread it out over a few years. But
15 I'm still very concerned. And I ask: Could you
16 please share the average net impact on fair student
17 funding to each school in fiscal year 23, and the net
18 impact of the fair student funding plus enrollment
19 revenue adjustment in fiscal 23, and the following
20 two years so that we can actually have a breakdown.
21 Because I'm visiting the schools every day, and this
22 is what they're freaked about. This is what my
23 elementary schools and my middle schools are just
24 unnerved about what it's going to mean for them next
25 year. And they were planning to bring on a

2 librarian, and they're planning to do other things.

3 But they're now feeling like, we're going to be

4 totally screwed by this peg and this reduction. It's

5 a technical question, but if... if Lindsey or the

6 team could help speak to it, I would greatly

7 appreciate it.

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No absolutely. And Lindsey...

9 Lindsey will speak to it. It's stuff that we talk

10 about here every day, Councilmember, and I thank you

11 for that. First of all, thank you for visiting your

12 schools as intensely as you do. And we hear about it

13 as well. It's all good. And we really appreciate

14 you. And so... so Lindsay, will speak to you because

15 it's a little bit of a conundrum that we're in. We've

16 had declining school enrollment. And yet we've been

17 using these funds, but they're stimulus funds, to

18 kind of keep schools as close to you know, where they

19 are as possible. But you know, it also becomes a

20 challenge when the school had 500 kids, and now they

21 have 250 kids, and they say, but don't cut my budget,

22 right? So... uh...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But... but within

24 reason, right? And I... the thing I really want to

25 say is like, bring us in as councilmembers as

2 partners. I want to be the biggest marketing
3 champion for my public schools. The amount that our
4 charter... that the charters put into marketing is
5 egregious relative to what we do. So let's be
6 partners in trying to engage... I'm talking to
7 families in my district every day all day. I want to
8 get them into our public schools, let's work as
9 partners in that effort. But I'm very keen on the
10 numbers, if we have the chance to do it. And a
11 chance I look forward to sit down with you and
12 talking more about it.

13 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. I'd love to sit
14 down some more, particularly around how we can do a
15 better job of marketing, our schools. But in the
16 meantime, Lindsey, if you would pick up the question.

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure. Thank you,
18 Councilmember for highlighting this really important
19 issue. So we are really... and I'm really focused,
20 the Chancellor's really focused on exactly what you
21 just identified, which is getting schools information
22 about their budgets as soon as possible. That's
23 something that we want to be able to do in the next
24 couple of weeks. And when we have that information,
25 I'm happy to sit down with you and share the impact.

2 And again, really hoping that we can get school
3 budgets out in the next couple of weeks. And I would
4 also just ask that, you know, part of the marketing
5 of our school system is ensuring that we're
6 advocating to the state and the feds to support our
7 school system as we're thinking about stimulus
8 funding running out and making sure that we have the
9 adequate resources that we need. And I know you'll
10 join us in the fight for additional funding at the
11 state at the federal level.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I look forward to
13 reviewing those budgets. And Lindsey, I appreciate
14 your offer to meet, and I will gladly take you up on
15 it. But the question I had was a kind of average
16 across the board, which I'd imagine you'd have now.
17 And so we'll put that in writing to you. But we'd
18 really appreciate a quick reply if you could get that
19 to us and realize it will take time to go school by
20 school.

21 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: The I do want to commend
23 the Council Finance Team, Justin, the speaker,
24 everyone, for pushing for more funding for CTEs, for
25 ELLs, for community coordinators. We really need to

2 focus on... on students in temporary housing. And...
3 and Chair Joseph's emphasis on students in foster
4 care. Appreciate the emphasis there and appreciate
5 the resources you all put in on Summer Rising. The
6 areas that I really want to see more funding are on
7 guidance counselors and social workers, around
8 librarians, and really echo Chair Brannan's comments
9 around arts education.

10 The other piece that I wanted to ask you about
11 today, which is a major concern of mine, and then
12 I'll do... sneak one last thing and if I can, that's
13 a teeny one, is transfer schools.

14 The reports I'm getting are that because of this
15 same...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. ... of schools
17 not wanting to reduce the enrollment, we're not
18 referring kids who should be in transfer schools to
19 transfer schools. And I'm very concerned that we
20 don't have enough central oversight... oversight from
21 TWEED to make sure those referrals are happening. So
22 kids who really would benefit from a transfer school
23 environment are not there because students are trying
24 to hold... because schools are trying to hold on to
25 their students for the pursuit of per pupil funding.

2 And then I'm just going to tack on my last
3 question before I get in trouble with the
4 Distinguished Chair.

5 We now have more NYC ferry service that is being
6 used by students to get to and from school. We have
7 connections from Brooklyn to the Harbor School on
8 Governors Island and others, but we don't have any
9 student discount on the NYC ferry. This is city
10 agency to city agency. We should be able to figure
11 this out. I know that Mark Trager cares about this
12 one. It would be great if we could get a commitment
13 from D.O.E. leadership that they're going to help us
14 work with EDC to subsidize fair usage for student
15 commuters. So those are the two final questions if I
16 can sneak those in. Can someone speak to transfer
17 school?

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yes. Thank you,
19 Councilmember. We would love to... you know maybe
20 this... I've only been here for one week, but we'd
21 love to hear more detail about that. Typically, it's
22 the other way around, as you know, like, where we
23 have students who may be over-age and under-credited,
24 who get kind of encouraged to discharge themselves
25 and aren't necessarily connected to transfer schools.

2 So we worry about those disconnected youth quite a
3 bit. Certainly what we do see objectively and may
4 support your point is attendance in transfer schools
5 is really.... is really quite low. And so that is
6 something that we are really focused on. And
7 certainly, we want to make sure that all of our
8 principals, all of our staff are thinking
9 holistically, not just about, you know, the... what's
10 going on at their particular school, what they can
11 offer holistically about what programming is best for
12 a particular young person. And if it's a transfer
13 school, then the family and then the student ought to
14 be given information about that. So if that's not
15 happening in an attempt to prop up enrollment, we
16 certainly would like to know about that. And we want
17 to make sure that we have really high quality
18 transfer schools for students who need that. And
19 Chancellor mentioned this before, I'll just make a
20 little plug, when we're thinking about virtual
21 school, we're thinking about, in part, these
22 students. When we're thinking about other
23 programming, we're thinking about these students. We
24 want to create actually a broader range of options
25 for students who, you know, traditional schools may

2 not work for them for various reasons. But would love
3 to connect with you to hear more specifics about
4 that? Because if that's happening, that's a real
5 problem.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: We will send you a
7 formal letter, and I appreciate your willingness to
8 follow up and work with us on it.

9 And any... any comment on the ferries? Is that
10 something y'all are thinking about working on? I
11 know, it's a small little thing, but it would make a
12 big difference to a bunch of families,

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: We are going to talk
14 to Mark Trager on that one, as you suggest, and we'd
15 be happy to... to, to get back to you on that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: That man loves the
17 ferry. He is going to help. (crosstalk)

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: ... to help
19 facilitate our students, and particular our students
20 who come from low-income families to make sure they
21 get to school.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you very much. I
23 appreciate it. Thank you all.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member
25 Restler. So Chairs, I will turn it back to you.

2 We've completed counseling for questions for SCA and
3 DOE.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Chair Joseph, do you want
5 to give a closing remarks?

6 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Oh, I just had two quick
7 questions I wanted to answer: One: I know we have
8 social workers in schools. What I'm hearing on the
9 ground and as Council Restler, I visit schools, I
10 live in schools. Those are my favorite buildings to
11 be in, and I'm aware of everything. On one of the
12 things we wanted to see as much as we put guidance
13 counselors, social workers in schools, the training
14 has to be there as well. That has to be PD provided
15 to support what's happening in the classroom,
16 especially around -- we throw this word around a lot
17 -- social and emotional learning, but they're not
18 connected to the classrooms. So there cannot be a
19 disconnect, or we will not see the results that we're
20 looking for. So I would love for someone to answer
21 on that. And I have one other question as well.

22 CHIEF JOHNSON: Okay, thank you for the question
23 Chair. So with regard to social emotional supports,
24 we... as you know, we use the academic recovery funds
25 to really launch the social emotional learning

2 screeners across all schools in the city. And what
3 we were able to do with the social emotional
4 screeners was to create a baseline of common
5 language. And so by having schools kind of examine
6 what are their social emotional supports that they
7 provide for students, but also to look at young
8 people and figure out where do they sit? Prior to
9 that, we use teachers, anecdotal data, we use the
10 range of different things, but now there is a set of
11 common goals. And so looking to take the screener
12 data, and then align that data to how we're
13 leveraging social emotional support. So thinking
14 about the training that happens, that connect...
15 that's connected to the actual implementation
16 execution, how you leverage the supports, and look at
17 your young people, and how they performed according
18 to the indicators... the eight indicators...
19 indicators like optimistic thinking, responsible
20 decision making self-awareness. So how do we look at
21 where young people fit along that continuum? How do
22 we put targeted supports in place? How do we leverage
23 social emotional practices? And so we have the
24 Harmony Program, which is available for all... all
25 elementary schools. It's free. We have the Ruler

2 Program that we're utilizing. And then we've also
3 been working with... with our schools to think about
4 how do we leverage social emotional supports outside
5 of just the... the separate social emotional space,
6 but in the space where students spend the majority of
7 their time, which is actually in the classroom? And
8 how do we leverage those schools to deepen the
9 learning and the academic outcomes?

10 And so working closely with DC Quintana, and the
11 teaching and learning team, we've been thinking about
12 how do we provide those wraparound supports for those
13 young people? And how do we access those supports to
14 really advance the academic outcomes? Because
15 optimistic thinking helps you to prepare for problems
16 that you need to go and solve. That math problem:
17 You've got to think that you're able to do it in
18 order to be able to engage with it.

19 So your question was around training for the
20 adults? And so we've trained people around how to
21 leverage and how to access and implement the
22 screener, what are the systems and the conditions
23 that you need in place to actually use a data driven
24 strategy to align to the supports? And then we have
25 targeted training and support that is within each of

2 the different mechanisms, but we also encourage
3 school teams to use these data processes to say, what
4 are the best supports that we need to put in place
5 for our students in our population? And in our
6 setting?

7 CHAIR JOSEPH: Okay, okay. All right, I'll come
8 back... Another... another thing, um, when we... when
9 we roll out curriculum, this is something I've seen
10 22 years in and out. When we roll out curriculums,
11 they mean well. We celebrate them. And when it
12 comes time to train the teachers, and the training...
13 there's no training to really support the teachers.
14 The training has to be ongoing, because the programs
15 have different components, because you do have to
16 touch the needs of your ELL students. You have to
17 have touch the needs of your SWDs, especially in ICT
18 settings, and self-contained, you have all of that
19 where lessons have to be modified. What type of
20 training and PD are we ongoing with these new
21 curriculums? I know there is a new curriculum that
22 is going to that's going to be rolled out soon.
23 What... what does the training look like? And you
24 have to invest in the trainings as well. So how does

2 that look like dollar wise? And how does it look
3 like in the classroom?

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Chair.

5 So it will... it's going to look... so it depends on
6 the program. But what will happen is we will roll
7 out professional learning sessions, a series of
8 sessions, and we will necessarily follow that up with
9 job-embedded support.

10 I think one of the things that we have noted is
11 that when teachers attend a standalone training, that
12 often it is really useful in that moment. But if
13 they don't receive the support to really implement
14 that or to understand how to integrate what they've
15 learned into what they're doing, that it doesn't
16 stick in the same way. And so we're going to make
17 sure that there's that job-embedded support.

18 The other component that's really important to
19 us, and we're working with DC Blackburn on this, with
20 his team on this as well, is to make sure that our
21 leaders are trained. And so superintendents and
22 principals will need to know. And there will be
23 strategic planning support for those principals, so
24 that they really are integrating, and whether it's as
25 you just heard, Dr. Johnson talk about the framework

2 for whole-child education that we're basing all of
3 our work on, you know, thinking about supportive
4 environments, as emotional development, the system of
5 supports, all of those kinds of things that we want
6 to make sure are really embedded in how we do
7 schooling, or if it's just a specific program. So we
8 talked about, you know, the K through 2, explicit
9 instruction of reading... whether it's that sort of
10 large scale, or the more specific, we want to make
11 sure that there's strategic planning with the
12 principals so that they are integrating that into the
13 way that they work. And it really becomes part of
14 the DNA of the school.

15 CHAIR JOSEPH: And working in cohorts also really
16 helps, so having teacher support and turning keys to
17 each other, also help also in how they retain the
18 information and transfer and turn key to their
19 colleagues. Um, that's it for me. Um, Chair
20 Brannan?

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Chair Joseph,
22 Chancellor, and your team. Thank you so much. I
23 appreciate your time today and doing your best to
24 answer all of our questions. And if we have any
25 outstanding issues that weren't sufficiently answered

2 today, we'll follow up and send a letter so that we
3 can get that in writing. But we look forward to
4 negotiating this budget together to get it to a good
5 place that it serves all of our kids in public
6 schools. So I really appreciate your time tonight.
7 Thank you.

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: We appreciate you, both of you
9 as chairs, not just here today, but also thank you
10 very much for just the continued partnership. We
11 said we're going to be joined at the hip. We're
12 gonna work together on behalf of all our kids, and we
13 mean it. We look forward to continued partnership
14 with you. In fact, we get to get up and stretch now.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: (Laughs) That's a luxury we
16 don't have but enjoy. Thank you so much, Chancellor.

17 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you, everybody. Bye-
18 bye.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chair Brannan, we have a few
20 minutes before we switch over to the Department of
21 Sanitation. And for the record, we'll just... for
22 the prior hearing, we'll just make sure that we... we
23 were joined by Councilmembers Gutierrez, Ossé,
24 Hudson, Moya, Hanks, Restler, Stevens, Speaker Adams,
25 Krishnhan, Abreu, De La Rosa, Ayala, Carr, Barron,

2 Ung, Avilez, Sanchez, Mennon, Nurse, and Paladino. I
3 think we have most of the City Council.

4 Chair Joseph, it was good seeing you.

5 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Same here.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chair Brannan, will do a...
7 once the admin is on for DSNY, we'll do a mic check
8 and then we will just get right to it with you and
9 Chair Nurse.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I'm just gonna grab a cup
11 of water.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Sure.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Have a great hearing,
15 Council Member Nurse. I'm gonna stick around. I've
16 never been to sanitation.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Tickets are \$5 for this.

18 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Can I get... Can I get a
19 matinee ticket? Council Member Barron, good seeing
20 you too.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Good seeing
22 you too.

23 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you for those amazing
24 questions.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, I can't wait to get
3 them in the district. I ain't finished with him!

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm coming to visit you
5 soon!

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, I'm looking forward
7 to it.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Commissioner Tisch welcome.
9 You should be able to unmute yourself.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I just did.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay perfect. Deputy
12 Commissioner Gregory Anderson?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'll make sure he's on in a
14 second.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Deputy Commissioner
16 Bridget Anderson?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Good Morning
18 or... good afternoon. Good afternoon.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect we can hear you. And
20 Chief Lohan? You should be able to unmute yourself.

21 CHIEF LOHAN: Good afternoon. I'm on.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect. Thank you.

23 [266:15 to 268:45 SILENCE]

24

25

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Gregory
3 Anderson, do you want to unmute yourself just make
4 sure we're able to hear your audio?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Hey there how
6 are you?

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect. Thank you.

8 All right chairs, just let me know when you're
9 both ready.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: I'm ready whenever
11 councilmember Brannan is.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I'm good.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Give me just a moment to
14 get started in just a second here. We're only four
15 minutes behind schedule. Not bad. For the record,
16 we'll just recognize who we're joined with:

17 Councilmembers Brannan, Nurse, Paladino, Barron,
18 Ayala, Brewer, Gennaro, Louis, Ossé, Sanchez, Joseph,
19 Farias, Hudson, and Bottcher.

20 Chair Brandon I will turn it to you for for your
21 opening remarks.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN:

23 Thank you, Counsel. Good afternoon, and welcome
24 to the second portion of today's fiscal 23 executive
25 budget hearing. This afternoon we have the pleasure

2 of hearing from the Department of Sanitation, and I'm
3 joined by my colleague and co-chair, Council Member
4 Sandy Nurse, Chair of the Committee on Sanitation.

5 The Department of Sanitation is projected fiscal
6 23 budget of \$1.83 billion represents 1.8% of the
7 city's proposed fiscal 23 budget in the Executive
8 Plan. DSNY's fiscal 23 budget increased by \$50.5
9 million, an increase of 2.8% from the fiscal 23
10 preliminary plan of \$1.78 billion. The increase is a
11 result of a number of actions taken, most significant
12 of which are \$17.9 million for organic programs, \$7.9
13 million for waste characterization study \$13.3
14 million for motor fuel adjustment, and \$2.9 million
15 for bike lane sweeping. I want to thank Commissioner
16 Tisch for joining us this afternoon. I look forward
17 to hearing more from the department on the executive
18 budget plan. I'll be digging deeper into the issues
19 of the FY23 Council budget response and especially
20 the Administration's lack of funding for many of the
21 programs that were highlighted in the Council and its
22 budget, corner litter baskets, and the fact that no
23 funding was included in the executive budget for a
24 litter basket service, the restoration of curbside e-
25 waste collection, overtime usage, and something I

2 know you'll be familiar with, which is sanitation
3 service levels by district.

4 I appreciate the efforts of the department as
5 made with programs like organics, but if we cannot
6 get the basics right, as in getting our corner
7 baskets picked up, then I'm troubled by all the other
8 things that department wants to do, frankly. So
9 forthright answers to these questions or more will be
10 very important today as we as we get through this
11 hearing.

12 I want to thank the Finance Division, especially
13 John Seltzer, and Carillion Francisco, and my senior
14 advisor John Yeddin for help in preparing for today's
15 hearing. There's a lot of work that goes on behind
16 the scenes to get these numbers right. And I
17 appreciate their hard work. And I want to thank all
18 the Council staff working behind the scenes to get
19 this virtual hearing off the ground today.

20 I want to say that I've long said sanitation
21 workers have one of the most thankless, and demanding
22 and important jobs in our city, we leave our trash
23 outside, and we expect it to disappear. We don't
24 notice when it does disappear. We only notice when
25 it doesn't, and that's when we all lose our minds.

2 So I appreciate that. I appreciate the work that our
3 sanitation men and women do, and I call them everyday
4 heroes for a reason. With that, I want to turn it
5 over to my colleague and Chair of the Sanitation
6 Department. I want to acknowledge the... the energy
7 that Council Member Nurse has brought to sanitation,
8 which is very helpful because frankly, back in the
9 old days, it was me and Paul Vallone who were the
10 only people who were yelling and screaming about
11 sanitation funding. So it's nice that the cavalry
12 has finally arrived. But now you've got the Finance
13 Chair and the Sanitation Chair who care a lot about
14 keeping our streets clean, and we want to work with
15 you and get it right that especially as we recover
16 from this pandemic.

17 So with that I want to turn it over to Co-Chair
18 Sandy Nurse for her opening remarks.

19 CHAIR NURSE: Thank you. Good afternoon,
20 everyone. Thank you Chair Brannan. I'm hoping to
21 get one of those War On Trash posters for my
22 backgrounds as well, and thank you for all your
23 advocacy for the budget for a lot of the sanitation
24 services we need. I want to thank sanitation
25 committee members and other members for being here.

2 Congratulations Commissioner Jessica Tisch, and
3 welcome to your first Sanitation Committee hearing.
4 Great to see both Deputy Commissioners Anderson and
5 Anderson, and additional leadership for joining us
6 today.

7 As... as we have seen the city 311 data through
8 the needs assessment reports of our community boards
9 and in the media, sanitation affects public safety,
10 public health, and environmental outcomes in every
11 single neighborhood across the city. I along with
12 many New Yorkers am impacted, and we've all been a
13 little bit disappointed in the level of sanitation
14 service our city has received over the past two
15 years, mostly due to the deep cuts made by the prior
16 administration. Last month, council members
17 responded to the mayor's preliminary budget with a
18 unified voice. The Department of Sanitation must be
19 adequately funded and baseline, and we must invest in
20 the waste infrastructure and operations required to
21 achieve our city's long term zero waste goals. We're
22 committed to addressing both the immediate needs of
23 New Yorkers, those basic services the chair was
24 speaking about and, investing in the absolutely
25 critical long term innovative and sustainable waste

2 management systems we need to address environmental
3 and justices and the climate crisis.

4 I'm looking forward to discussing FY 2003 budget,
5 which totals about \$1.83 billion. While the
6 administration included funding for new and restored
7 programs that the council called for in our budget
8 response, there truly is so much more to be done. A
9 majority of our items were not funded including
10 expanded, curbside organics, rat mitigation programs,
11 litter basket service, uniform headcount
12 restorations, civilian vacancy restorations, the
13 build-out of a new organics processing facility, and
14 funding for a long overdue Save As You Throw study.
15 These restorations should have been prioritized by
16 the Administration and from my perspective is a win-
17 win-win for everyone. It seems that everyone in New
18 York City really wants us to get on top of trash and
19 rats.

20 Last month I alongside my fellow council members
21 Keith Powers and Shahana Hanif introduced a robust
22 Zero Waste legislative package for universal organic
23 composting accessibility and for requiring the city
24 to establish, report on, and meet our 2030 waste
25 diversion goals. So I'm excited to work with you

2 commissioner to ensure New York City is positioned as
3 a national and global leader on zero waste and
4 sustainability, because we know the future of New
5 York City depends on us getting it right and in time.

6 As always, I want to thank my wonderful
7 legislative director Enelle Hernandez for her hard
8 work preparing for this hearing. I also want to
9 thank John Seltzer, Jessica Steinberg Albin, and
10 Ricky Challah for supporting me as Chair. Thank you
11 especially to John for answering as many questions as
12 we had and the Finance Team for their analysis and
13 insights on the sanitation budget.

14 Additionally, I want to applaud the leadership of
15 Speaker Adams, Chair Brannan, the budget negotiation
16 team, my fellow council members and all of the
17 advocates and New Yorkers who raise their voices to
18 demand a well-funded DSNY as prioritized in this
19 year's budget process.

20 So thank you again, looking forward to this
21 hearing. I will now turn it back to committee
22 counsel.

23 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Chairs Brandon and
24 Nurse. Good afternoon and welcome everyone to the
25 second agency hearing for May 10, The Department of

2 Sanitation. My name is Malcolm Butehorn, and I am
3 counsel to the Finance Committee. There are some
4 additional council members we want to acknowledge:
5 Councilmembers Carr, Velázquez, and Kagan. Unlike in
6 past I want to remind Council Members and members of
7 the mayoral administration, you will have the ability
8 to unmute yourselves. Council Members who have
9 questions should use the raise hand function in Zoom.
10 You will be called on in the order with which you
11 raised your hand, and Council Members will be limited
12 to five minutes. We please ask that you listen to
13 the cues from the Sergeant At Arms. The following
14 members of the administration are here to testify and
15 are answer questions:

16 Jessica Tisch, Commissioner. Bridget Anderson,
17 Deputy Commissioner. Gregory Anderson, Deputy
18 Commissioner, and Chief Javier Lohan, Acting Deputy
19 Commissioner for Financial Management and
20 Administration.

21 I will first read the oath and after I will call
22 on each member from the administration individually
23 to respond. Do you refer them to tell the truth, the
24 whole truth and nothing but the truth before these
25

2 committees and to respond honestly to council member
3 questions. Commissioner Tisch?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Bridget
6 Anderson.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: I do.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Gregory
9 Anderson.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: And Chief Lohan?

12 CHIEF LOHAN: I do.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Commissioner
14 Tisch, you may begin when ready.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you. Good afternoon
16 Chairs Brannan and Nurse and members of the City
17 Council Committee on Finance and Sanitation and Solid
18 Waste Management. My name is Jessica Tisch and I am
19 Commissioner of the New York City Department of
20 Sanitation. Thank you for the opportunity to testify
21 today on the department's executive budget for fiscal
22 year 2023. I am joined by Gregory Anderson, Deputy
23 Commissioner for Policy and External Affairs, Bridget
24 Anderson Deputy Commissioner for Recycling and
25 Sustainability. And Chief Javier Lohan, Acting

2 Deputy Commissioner for Financial Management and
3 Administration.

4 I am delighted to be here in front of these
5 committees today, and I look forward to working with
6 you and this entire city council to clean up our
7 streets and make New York City a more vibrant and
8 sustainable place to live, a goal that I know we all
9 share. I am a lifelong New Yorker, and that means I
10 have spent my entire life admiring the work of the
11 sanitation department and its 10,000 members of
12 service, who have spent the last two years showing
13 that they are the epitome of essential, the epitome
14 of the neighborhood hero. They care about clean
15 streets, they care about giving their neighbors that
16 peace of mind they deserve, about getting our city
17 moving and keeping our communities safe, healthy, and
18 of course clean.

19 As this is my first hearing in my new role as
20 Sanitation Commissioner, let me take a moment to
21 introduce myself. I've worked in city government for
22 nearly 15 years, most of that time was at the NYPD.
23 And more recently, I served as Commissioner of the
24 Department of Information Technology and
25 Telecommunications during the pandemic. I consider

2 myself to be an effective problem solver who knows
3 how to get things done for New Yorkers and will run
4 through a brick wall trying. I've applied a can-do
5 attitude to things like overhauling the city's
6 vaccination approach, bringing down 911 response
7 times, ending the digital divide for homeless
8 children and their families, and rolling out body-
9 worn cameras to every uniform member of service of
10 the NYPD. And that's what I'm going to continue
11 doing as Commissioner of the Department of
12 Sanitation.

13 Over the past three weeks, I've gone to 6am Roll
14 call garages in every borough. I've spoken to
15 hundreds of sanitation workers about the work they do
16 day in and day out, largely unseen from the public
17 eye. And I visited our marine transfer stations to
18 see the results of more than a billion dollars in
19 investments in sustainable, effective, and equitable
20 waste management infrastructure. I've been getting
21 under the hood of this department, meeting with every
22 chief and borough chief, understanding and digging
23 into the department's programs, policies and
24 priorities, and I feel quite blessed to be doing it.

2 I want to be very clear upfront that I agree with
3 New Yorkers who feel that our study is meaningfully
4 dirtier than it was before the pandemic, and that is
5 not acceptable. I've long felt that to fix a
6 problem, you have to understand it. And the good
7 news is it's patently obvious to me what happened
8 here. And even better news is that with your help in
9 partnership, the Adams Administration will be
10 addressing it aggressively.

11 First street sweeping, effective July 5, we will
12 finally be sweeping the streets again, which will
13 make a meaningful difference in the cleanliness of
14 every neighborhood in this city. The partial
15 suspension of alternate side parking was a pandemic
16 measure to let people stay inside more, but it went
17 on for far too long, and it largely sideline the most
18 effective clean streets tool we have in our arsenal,
19 the mechanical broom. When I say the mechanical
20 broom, or street sweeper is the most effective clean
21 streets tool in our arsenal, I mean it, they don't
22 just sweep the trash on the streets to the curb, they
23 suck it all up inside the cab. In fact, on an
24 average shift, a single mechanical broom can suck up
25 1500 pounds of street litter. That's taking 1500

2 pounds of litter off the city streets on a single
3 route. The dirty little secret here is that when ASP
4 went to one day a week instead of two, in practice,
5 it was like having no cleaning on lots of blocks in
6 the city. Don't get me wrong. That's not because we
7 stopped sending street sweepers to do their jobs.
8 It's because the policy created a world where too
9 many people saw once in a once-in-a-while ASP ticket
10 as just the cost of doing business. Our sanitation
11 workers operating the brooms estimated that 50 plus
12 percent of cars didn't move for ASP under the more
13 limited pandemic rules. So the pandemic policy
14 change had a disproportionate effect on the amount of
15 cleaning the agency could do. It was intended to
16 halve it, but in practice it more than halved it. It
17 follows that restoring ASP to twice a week should
18 more than double the amount of cleaning weekend and
19 we'll do. The restoration of full alternate side
20 parking regulations comes with a headcount increase
21 of 41 sanitation workers that had been cut in January
22 2021, and \$1.9 million in additional funding in FY
23 23.

24 Second topic is bike lane sweeping. This summer
25 New Yorkers will see a new fleet of mini-sweepers

2 that can also be used as snow plows in the winter
3 that we'll be performing year round cleaning and
4 maintenance of the city's growing network of
5 protected bike lanes. Bike lanes are a great thing.
6 But the program was rolled out nearly a decade ago,
7 and over 100 miles a protected bike line lanes have
8 been built out without a practical plan in place to
9 keep those bike lanes clean. That ends now. With
10 the advocacy and partnership of Commissioner
11 Rodriguez and the Department of Transportation, we
12 are addressing this issue. This starts with a
13 capital investment of \$6.7 million in a fleet of mini
14 sweepers beginning with 10 units with sweeper
15 attachments this summer. By the end of next year, we
16 will have a permanent fleet of 45 total units in two
17 different sizes to clean and plough even the
18 narrowest protected bike lanes. We also have \$2.8
19 million in new expense funding in FY 23 to provide
20 person power to operate and maintain this equipment
21 for years to come, and purchase a suite of
22 attachments that will make them some of the most
23 versatile units in our street cleaning arsenal. This
24 new stack will allow us to sweep protected bike lanes

2 year round with a goal of sweeping every lane once a
3 week.

4 Third topic is litter baskets. We are committed
5 to cleaning up our city. We hear your complaints
6 about the overflowing conditions and agree that they
7 are not dignified, they are not okay. In FY 2022, we
8 have more than doubled the litter baskets service
9 from pandemic lows in FY 21 to 588 weekly trucks. We
10 would greatly appreciate any additional funding to
11 expand services, and we stand ready to implement.
12 The Adams Administration looks forward to working
13 closely with the council to determine an appropriate
14 level of service for all New Yorkers.

15 Can I guarantee after the adopted budget that New
16 Yorkers will never see an overflowing litter basket
17 again? No. But we will work to ensure that these
18 conditions are minimized and call on all New Yorkers
19 to do their part to keep our city clean. Overflowing
20 litter basket issues that remain should be the result
21 of the misuse of the litter basket rather than lack
22 of service. Litter baskets are for walking trash
23 only -- the coffee cup -- as opposed to residential
24 or commercial trash, and when they are misused, it
25 creates a blight on our communities.

2 Fourth topic is rats. On my third day on the
3 job, I was thrilled to join Mayor Adams senior
4 administration leadership and several council members
5 to unveil the city's first clean curbs bins in Times
6 Square, the first step in an effort to containerize
7 trash that used to be piled in bags on the street,
8 serving as a free all-you-can-eat buffet for rats.

9 DSNY and SBS recently announced the neighborhood
10 challenge grant program for bids and community based
11 development organizations to make public space and
12 cleanliness improvements with a particular focus on
13 bids in underserved communities. The department
14 received 29 applications for funding last month and a
15 second round of grant applications will open this
16 summer. The city is moving ahead with a five-borough
17 approach to the Clean Curbs pilots, deploying bins
18 for residential BID and commercial waste using a
19 combination of public and private funding. This new
20 five-borough approach includes \$1.3 million in new
21 funding in FY 2023 and recurring in the out years.

22 Fifth topic is dog poop. New Yorkers see it
23 everywhere, and it has become a bigger problem over
24 the past two years, yet in 2020 and 2021, a grand
25 total of zero summonses had been written to people

2 who don't pick up after their pets. That changes
3 now. This is about decency, courtesy and respect,
4 and the Department of Sanitation won't tolerate it
5 anymore.

6 Sixth topic is illegal dumping. For those who
7 are unfamiliar with the term that's when a business
8 which is required to dispose of its waste itself or
9 through the use of a private carter decides instead
10 to leave piles of trash bags in a vacant lot or even
11 on a sidewalk. Illegal dumping tends to be a bigger
12 problem in the most underserved parts of the city.
13 It's a huge issue in Hunts Point. It's a huge issue
14 in East New York. Here we are taking a several
15 pronged approach. We are precision cleaning teams in
16 each borough whose main job is to clean known dumping
17 locations, but continuously chasing dumps doesn't
18 solve the problem because it keeps happening. We
19 have also stepped up our enforcement efforts over the
20 past three months, investing in cameras in known dump
21 locations to catch illegal dumpers in the act. When
22 caught an illegal dumper is subject to a \$4,000 fine,
23 and if they're using a car to transport the material,
24 their car will be impounded. I want to be very clear
25 that illegal dumping is a theft of public space, and

2 I can think of no more important use of our
3 enforcement team's time than ensuring that those who
4 are knowingly dumping their trash in our communities
5 be held accountable for it.

6 The seventh topic is derelict vehicles. There
7 are citywide problems and their local ones. Derelict
8 vehicles are a local issue but with big implications
9 for quality of life in the outer boroughs. We see
10 this problem in parts of the Bronx, Southeast Queens,
11 and central Brooklyn. Not only do these vehicles
12 become eyesores, they also prevent our brooms from
13 cleaning the streets. I am going to refocus on
14 getting these vehicles off the streets, and we will
15 be partnering with our counterparts at the NYPD to
16 get this done. Clean streets should be the reality
17 for all New Yorkers, regardless of where they live.
18 I want to be clear that I do not believe in
19 enforcement for enforcement's sake, and there are
20 many problems that you can't and shouldn't enforce
21 your way out of. That can be dangerous. But I do
22 believe that enforcement must be a tool in our
23 arsenal to deal with that very small percentage of
24 New Yorkers and New York City businesses who choose
25 not to do the simple right thing, who choose not to

2 abide by the straightforward laws and rules that
3 relate to the cleanliness of our city. As an
4 example, at two in the afternoon, New Yorkers should
5 see virtually no trash bags piled up on the streets.
6 But we do in every neighborhood and every community
7 in our city. It can be a business that is decided to
8 put their trash out early, over and over and over
9 again, or a big chain retail store that rarely does
10 its duty sweeping in front of its storefront. We
11 have heard this a lot in particular in Bay Ridge.
12 Well, to all the residents that have complained about
13 this type of thing to 311, and to the Department of
14 Sanitation, I say: I hear you, and we are going to do
15 everything in our power to correct that behavior.
16 And if we have to write summonses, well then so be
17 it.

18 I also want to commit to you that my obsession
19 with the cleanliness of our city today will not be to
20 the exclusion of the important work that we have to
21 do around securing our collective future. To the
22 contrary, our work around sustainability could not be
23 more urgent, and I am committed to elevating
24 environmental justice as a core principle in all
25 aspects of our work. That of course includes the

2 successful implementation of the ambitious Commercial
3 Waste Zone Program, as well as following through with
4 the groundbreaking Waste Equity Laws that the council
5 passed during the last administration. The executive
6 budget includes \$29.1 million in new funding in
7 fiscal 23 to expand our commitments to zero waste and
8 sustainable waste management long term. Most
9 importantly, we have \$17.9 million in new funding for
10 organics programs in FY 23, nearly zeroing out the
11 reductions in organics funding under the preliminary
12 budget peg program. Managing organic waste, which
13 makes up 34% of our waste stream is an important part
14 of achieving our zero waste goals, but we must ensure
15 we do so both effectively and cost effectively. This
16 new funding allows us to expand a program that we
17 know works well and sets the stage by educating the
18 next generation of New Yorkers. In partnership with
19 DOE, we will begin expanding compost collection to
20 all New York City public schools, nearly doubling the
21 size of the school composting program that exists
22 today. The budget includes funding to expand compost
23 collection to all public schools, and to provide the
24 education and support that school staff, including
25 principals, custodians, teachers and food service

2 workers need to successfully divert their organic
3 waste.

4 I thank the Council for their advocacy for this
5 measure, and we look forward to working with you to
6 ensure the rollout is successful at every school in
7 every neighborhood. We will also leverage these
8 expanded school organics routes to expand access to
9 composting for residents. We will add 100 new smart
10 bins near public schools for parents and community
11 members to drop off their own food scraps. These
12 bins which are accessed using an app or a free RFID
13 card will be collected using the same trucks that
14 already service our public schools and will be cited
15 to maximize equity in our network of drop off sites
16 citywide. The new funding for organics programs also
17 continues, and baselines \$3.5 million in annual
18 funding for our community composting partners and
19 food scrap drop off sites that was first added to the
20 budget in FY 22. This will support an expanded
21 network of 221 partner hosted drop off sites in every
22 community district citywide and provide vital support
23 to our nonprofit partners that educate New Yorkers
24 about the importance of composting and the
25 connections of healthy and vibrant neighborhoods. I

2 met last week with many of the volunteers who work
3 these sites and they are a blessing to the city.

4 Lastly, this new investment provides baseline
5 funding for the department's annual fall leaf and
6 yard waste collection program for the first time in
7 many years. This program may just may be just 4
8 short weeks, but it regularly collects 3000 tons or
9 more of leaves and other yard waste to be converted
10 into valuable and nutrient rich compost. The
11 executive budget also includes \$2.6 million to
12 support the relocation of the Lower East Side Ecology
13 Center compost site, which has been temporarily moved
14 out of East River Park to facilitate the construction
15 of the East Side Coastal Resiliency Project.

16 We won't stop there, I am taking a comprehensive
17 look at our composting programs past and present to
18 figure out what works and what doesn't. This
19 administration is committed to making strides on
20 organics, but we cannot throw good money after bad.
21 I look forward to working with you all to discuss
22 these programs and develop a path forward for the
23 future. Aside from composting organics, the
24 executive budget funds two important programs that

2 will help us plan for a more sustainable and
3 equitable future of waste in New York City.

4 First, it includes \$7.9 million in FY 23 and \$8.4
5 million total to conduct a new waste characterization
6 study. The waste characterization study gives us the
7 clearest possible picture of what New Yorkers throw
8 away on a daily basis, and helps us tailor existing
9 and new programs and policies in our efforts to move
10 toward zero waste. It will also be our first
11 opportunity to see the detailed impact of bans on
12 home products, and single use plastic bags. In
13 addition, the executive budget includes \$550,000 in
14 funds for the first phase of planning for our new
15 Solid Waste Management Plan. This plan, on track to
16 be completed in 2026, will be the first major update
17 to the city's landmark 2006 comprehensive solid waste
18 management plan, which laid the groundwork for our
19 sustainable and resilient network of marine and barge
20 based transfer stations that we rely on today.

21 Now I will briefly take you through the more
22 technical details of the department's FY 23 budget.
23 DSNY's fiscal year 23 executive budget includes \$1.83
24 billion in expense funding. This is broken down
25 between \$1.06 billion and personal services to

2 support 9444 full time positions and \$775 million
3 other-than-personal services, or OTPs. For fiscal
4 year 22, the expense budget increased by \$100.2
5 million from the Preliminary Budget to the Executive
6 Budget. This increase is largely due to personnel
7 services adjustments due to increased spending in the
8 current fiscal year and adjustments reflect actual
9 spending during the 21-22 snow season. For fiscal
10 year 23, the expense budget increased by \$50.4
11 million for the Preliminary Budget the Executive
12 Budget. This increase is primarily driven by the new
13 initiatives I mentioned earlier in my testimony, as
14 well as adjustments to motor fuel, and heat, light,
15 and power budgets to reflect increased costs for
16 these line items given market conditions. DSNY's
17 fiscal year 23 Executive Budget includes \$3.41
18 billion in capital funding and the 10 year plan,
19 \$1.23 billion of which is for garages and facilities,
20 \$1.96 billion for equipment, \$59.2 million for IT,
21 and \$164 million for solid waste management
22 infrastructure. The capital budget includes funding
23 for several major facilities projects currently
24 underway, including construction of the new
25 sanitation Staten Island district 1 and 3 garage,

2 managed by DDC which has an overall budget of \$198
3 million and is forecast to be completed by 2024.
4 That can't come soon enough. Construction of the new
5 Brooklyn district 3 garage which has an overall
6 budget of \$204 million, and is forecast to be
7 completed by 2024, and upgrades to the facility that
8 will serve as the new home for the Manhattan District
9 11 garage, which has an overall budget of \$26.9
10 million and will be substantially complete later this
11 year.

12 I'll just close by saying this: I see these
13 committees and every member of the City Council as
14 partners in achieving all the goals discussed today.
15 I have worked closely with the Council for over a
16 decade, and your feedback, input, and even your
17 criticism have consistently elevated my performance.
18 My door will remain open to you at all times, and I
19 will not shy away from tough conversations about the
20 steps we need to take as a city to keep New York
21 healthy, safe and clean. I look forward to many
22 years of collaboration with each of you and with the
23 many stakeholders that play an important role in our
24 work.

2 Thank you again for this opportunity to testify
3 today on the department's important work. My
4 colleagues and I are now very happy to answer your
5 questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Commissioner.
7 We're all on board. Sounds... sounds great. We look
8 forward to working with you. A clean neighborhood as
9 a safe neighborhood and a safe neighborhood is the
10 foundation for everything else. So we all want to
11 get this right.

12 I want to dive in. The committee... we might not
13 get to all of our questions... or we don't... We
14 hope not, but if you don't have answers or responses,
15 we'll send a followup letter for the unanswered
16 questions, which are important to us as we go through
17 our budget negotiations.

18 So let's dive right in. In the council's fiscal
19 23 budget response, we called upon the administration
20 to add approximately \$96 million in expense items and
21 \$1 million in capital items to the executive budget.
22 However, as of the executive budget, only \$17.5
23 million was restored. Although we're happy to see
24 some of these items included, we're still missing
25 additional funding for some of the following items:

2 So \$22 million for additional litter basket service
3 citywide, \$47.8 million to restore fiscal 23 budget
4 cuts mainly for garaged utility or splinter group
5 staff reductions, curbside organics program
6 expansion, and civilian vacancies. \$4.8 million for
7 additional rat mitigation program funding, \$3.6
8 million for curbside e-waste collection, \$3.4 million
9 for additional enforcement personnel to help with
10 illegal dumping that you mentioned, \$2.2 million to
11 restore prior year lot cleaning cuts, \$864,000 to
12 restore a prior cut for supplemental highway ramp
13 cleaning, and \$1 million for the Same As You Throw
14 Study, as well as \$1 million for a new organics
15 processing facility.

16 So I'm rattling off all these items, because I'm
17 hoping that you or someone at your agency can speak
18 to whether the \$17.5 million that was restored...
19 what, if any, conversations were had internally or
20 externally regarding the council's budget response
21 requests and how determinations were made? Because
22 we're happy with a lot of this stuff. But it's not
23 even close to the full loaf that were looking for.

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you Chair for that
25 question. I unfortunately cannot speak to the

2 conversations that happened internally as part of the
3 Executive Budget process because I started here three
4 weeks ago. It was after those conversations
5 occurred. But what I can say is, I and the
6 sanitation department... we are deeply appreciative
7 of the council's advocacy for so many of these
8 issues, and we were actually pleased to see that the
9 Executive Budget funded a number of really important
10 strategic programs that will lay the groundwork for
11 things to come. Importantly, was the investment in
12 cleanliness, restoring alternate side parking to
13 twice a week, as I mentioned in my testimony,
14 desperately needed and will make a huge dent in the
15 cleanliness of the city, and also what I think are
16 very smart investments in organics, not throwing good
17 money after bad, not doubling down on a strategy that
18 didn't necessarily work, but focusing our resources
19 for the time being on strategies that we know will
20 work. So an investment in organics in our schools...
21 teaching the next generation of New Yorkers up front,
22 giving them the muscle memory to separate out their
23 organic waste.

24 Another one that I just like to highlight is the
25 smart bins... that we're investing in 100 additional

2 smart bins that will be rolled out by 100 Public
3 Schools, and they're an opportunity for parents,
4 community members to drop off their organic waste in
5 bins. This builds... this investment builds on a
6 pilot program that we've conducted in... in Astoria,
7 which has actually been wildly successful, where
8 we've placed 20 Smart bins for organics collection
9 throughout Astoria. Every day, every bin is full, it
10 has pristine organic material, and that organic
11 material is collected every day. So I guess, my high
12 level answer to your very detailed question is:
13 While I understand that the administration didn't
14 fund everything, I think we made investments in... in
15 a lot of the right places: Alternate side, organics,
16 and of course I would appreciate any additional
17 funding that is worked out in the adopted budget for
18 litter baskets. With litter baskets more is
19 certainly more.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Right. Yeah. Okay. I
21 mean... it's... there's just a significant Delta
22 there, right? We had... we called on the
23 administration to add approximately \$96 million, and
24 sanitation came back with \$17.5 million. So there's
25 a significant gulf.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. And we expect the
3 administration and the council to be able to
4 negotiate some of the critical programs that you
5 prioritize.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All right, let's talk about
7 litter baskets. This is one of my favorite subjects.
8 So as you know, the council provides a substantial
9 amount of funding each fiscal year to the sanitation
10 department for supplemental sanitation services, as
11 well to procure high end litter baskets. So in
12 fiscal 22, the council allocated approximately \$5.2
13 million in funding across various discretionary
14 initiatives for supplemental sanitation services.
15 What... can you tell me, what is the primary service
16 that Council Members fund your agency for?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alright. It's really...
18 it's really three things. So the first is purchase
19 of new litter baskets, and then the associated
20 service required for those litter baskets. We also
21 have some council members who prioritize extra
22 curbside pickups. So if the standard... if you want
23 to add an extra day, prioritizing that. And then
24 more recently, cameras at illegal dumping sites.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Council Member Brewer,
3 could you mute your phone?

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: I've gone ahead and done that.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Counsel.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chair, I know that you have
7 funded extra curbside collection in your district.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, yeah. I mean, you
9 know what, in the... during COVID, In the DeBlasio
10 budgets, you know, the, the basic services were cut
11 so drastically that the money that I would normally
12 allocate to someone like the DOE fund, or ACE or
13 Wildcat to do supplemental services, me and a lot of
14 my former colleagues had to give that money back to
15 sanitation just to get us back up to... you know, you
16 can't go from six days a week basket pickup to three
17 days a week and think that, you know, it's just going
18 to work itself out.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And we've seen the numbers
20 play out. So we saw in the 311 complaints, for
21 example, I used to run 311, we saw the number of
22 complaints around litter baskets literally double as
23 a result of the cuts like almost immediately.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yup. It's overnight. You
25 cut the sanitation budget, you feel it overnight.

2 Alright, let's keep moving. So the current
3 number of weekly basket trucks citywide for fiscal 22
4 -- correct me if I'm wrong -- is 588, of which 452
5 are baseline and 136 trucks are supplemental due to
6 one-time funding the council negotiated to be
7 included at adoption this year. As of the executive
8 budget, can you tell me what the baseline weekly
9 projected litter basket service level for FY 23 is,
10 and how does it compare to the current fiscal year?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. The baseline is still
12 452. And obviously, the 452 is lower than the 588,
13 and we appreciate working with the council to come up
14 with the right level of service to give New Yorkers
15 the cleanliness that they deserve. As I said on
16 litter baskets: more as more.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Alright, let's keep talking
18 about my favorite topic. So the council would love
19 to see twice a day litter basket pickups... twice a
20 day corner basket pickups in every district citywide
21 Monday through Saturday, which is why we call for an
22 additional \$22 million on a city wide basis. How
23 many districts would you say receive this level of
24 service currently?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, geez. I mean, it's
3 under 20% right now. So it's under 20% of the
4 city... of districts in the city have twice daily
5 pickup, and it's not even necessarily twice daily
6 throughout the whole that... even the districts that
7 are covered... that whole district. The way it's
8 been is we have prioritized districts that have a lot
9 of... that see a lot of foot traffic. So districts
10 in Manhattan downtown Brooklyn, parts of
11 Williamsburg, the vast majority of the city has once
12 daily.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah. Once daily and how
14 many times a week?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's... It's six.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I'd love to get that
17 to six days a week, twice a day. That's what we need
18 because I don't want I don't want Council Member
19 Nurse to kill me, but all this other... the
20 composting is very... it's getting more and more
21 important, and it's getting more mainstream which is
22 great, right? But if I'm taking my kid to school and
23 I see that overflowing garbage can then I get on the
24 D train and I go to work and I come home I pick my
25 kid up from school, that same basket is still

2 overflowing, and now it's... it's growing... it's
3 multiplying. That's what people see. That's what
4 they think. "Ah, the city is going to hell, you
5 know, everything is falling apart." That's the stuff
6 that they see. That's why corner basket pickup is
7 so... is so crucial.

8 Let's talk about curbside e-waste collection.
9 Trying to narrow it a little bit more. The fiscal 23
10 executive budget does not restore one-time fiscal 22
11 funding of \$1.4 million for the Staten Island
12 curbside e-waste collection, nor does the budget
13 provide funding for the citywide curbside e-waste
14 collection of which we call for it our budget
15 response. Prior to fiscal 21, curbside e-waste
16 collection programs serviced the Bronx, Brooklyn,
17 Queens, and Staten Island. So if I have an old
18 television to throw out, what do I do in fiscal 23?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: In fiscal 23, so far, you
20 have three options. So if you live in a building
21 that has 10 or more apartments, you can be part of
22 the E-Cycle Program, which is funded by our ERP,
23 which means you can... the building calls and makes
24 an appointment for pickup, and the vendor comes and
25 picks up. I think you said your old TV was the

2 example? The... obviously, that doesn't work for
3 people who live, for example, in single-family homes.
4 So for them, they have two additional options: They
5 can drop that TV off at one of our special waste drop
6 off sites. There's one per borough open every
7 Saturday and the last Friday of each month. Or they
8 can go to one of our safe disposal events. There are
9 two per borough per year. So those are the two
10 options that remain for them with the cut in the
11 curbside program.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So I got a great idea: How
13 about we allocate \$3.6 million to curbside e-waste
14 collection?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: As... as you know, um...

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What if I'm 95 years old,
17 and and I need to throw out my television and I...

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I hear you and I agree with
19 you... with the concept. My sense is, this was a
20 data driven decision, right? You look at the tonnage
21 and the amount that's collected through different
22 programs, and if you have to make cuts to make cuts.
23 Our... the truth of the matter is that when at when
24 our curbside program for electronics was operating at
25 its peak, which was in 2020, it collected under 1000

2 tons. So it's a very... very small numbers for,
3 uh... not as cost effective as other programs that we
4 have in place. When it's operating just in Staten
5 Island, obviously, the past year, that number has
6 been much smaller, it's been 129. But I think these
7 are difficult budgeting decisions where you look at
8 the... the tonnage and the data.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All right, let's talk about
10 some overtime usage. As of March of this year,
11 uniform overtime spending was approximately \$227
12 million while your agency was budgeted for
13 approximately \$126 million as of adoption.
14 Additionally, personnel service adjustment of \$66
15 million was included in the executive budget, which
16 in part offsets overtime costs at sanitation. So how
17 much of the \$66 million for personal service
18 adjustment was specifically for uniform overtime?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I believe it was \$43.4
20 million.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: \$43.4?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Correct.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And what is driving
24 the increased uniform overtime usage?

25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: New things. This year,
3 obviously, was extraordinary.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: But was a lot of that due
5 to the... the staffing issues during COVID?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. There was there was a
7 hiring freeze in the prior fiscal year, so that had
8 us shorter staffed. Thank God we hired 1000
9 additional sanitation workers last summer, so that's
10 been largely alleviated of late. We also had the
11 vaccination mandates. We had a lot of staff sick
12 leave increased, obviously due to COVID-19. And then
13 we had one thing which I want to explain which was
14 the allocation of our uniformed staff on overtime to
15 cleaning the garages, to cleaning their workspace to
16 keep them than safe and clean given the pandemic. So
17 those four things together, have contributed to the
18 overtime spend that you see.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, okay. I just, you
20 know, I want to certainly want to honor... I believe
21 it was nine sanitation workers who died during COVID,
22 and the extraordinary work that they did.

23 Speaking... staying on headcount for a sec, I
24 know... I believe there's one class scheduled for 140

2 heads, but don't we have it... don't we need like
3 over 450?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: My understanding is that it
5 was 250 in this class, which is great. And on that
6 issue of headcount, that will get us to a good number
7 of sanitation workers, especially as, like you look
8 historically, so that brings us right up to like,
9 pre-pandemic levels. And again, that was boosted by
10 the largest class we've ever had, or at least in any
11 sort of recent memory, of 1000 sanitation workers
12 last summer.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I'm going to finish
14 up and then I want to hand it over to Chair Nurse.

15 How does the sanitation department currently
16 determine how much funding or service specific
17 districts receive? Is that based on what, you know,
18 Council Members allocate or how does that work?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, it's... a lot of
20 different factors go into it. So it's largely the
21 responsibility of our bureau chiefs, obviously
22 working with management. And that involves daily,
23 weekly, monthly targets that are reviewed annually.
24 We... they rely on field observation, they rely on
25 tonnage trends, they rely on historical data, 311

2 complaints to determine needs, that's largely how it
3 works.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Okay, I'm going to
5 hand it over to Chair Nurse. I'm really hoping that
6 we can work to restore and get closer to the ask that
7 the council had of \$96 million. Borough equity is
8 very important in this council. The idea that you
9 can eat a sandwich off the off the ground in
10 Manhattan, but not in Staten Island, or not in the
11 Bronx. We don't want that we want everyone to have
12 the same amount of garbage pickup across the city and
13 prioritizing the neighborhoods that have been
14 historically ignored or have had disinvestment. So
15 we look forward to working with you on that. I
16 welcome you, Commissioner look forward to working
17 with you on one of my most important topics, I think,
18 for all New Yorkers. And I'm glad that sanitation
19 and the importance of sanitation is finally getting
20 the mainstream attention that it truly deserves.

21 And with that, I want to hand it over to Chair
22 Nurse who can take it from here. Thank you,
23 Commissioner.

24 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Chair Brannan. So
25 I'm going to start with several questions around

2 program... organics programs and then move into some
3 of the other items.

4 So for curbside organics collection program, the
5 council requested \$18.2 million in FY 23 in our
6 budget response, and we understand \$17.9 million was
7 restored for other organics programs. Since the
8 preliminary budget hearing, has there been any
9 expansion of the program in the current fiscal year,
10 FY 22, in terms of how many districts are currently
11 being serviced?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, it's still the same:
13 seven community districts for the curbside organics
14 program that have been in place.

15 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for FY 23, are there any
16 changes in terms of number of districts and number of
17 households being serviced or will be served?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not in terms of number of
19 districts, but hopefully in terms of number of
20 households. We encourage all New Yorkers in those
21 districts to sign up for the opt-in program. So in
22 those seven districts, if you haven't participated
23 and you want to participate, we welcome your
24 participation. We always welcome it. We encourage
25 it.

2 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for the staff in FY 23
3 for this program, will those folks be on overtime or
4 straight time?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: My understanding is that for
6 the civilian staff, it's... it's straight time.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for uniformed?

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: For uniformed, it is
9 overtime, because the program isn't baselined.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And in your
11 estimation, so we have Council Member Hanif here, who
12 introduced a bill on universal curbside organics,
13 which is really exciting, and hopefully will address
14 some of the critiques of the program and why it
15 wasn't successful. In your estimation, how much
16 would it cost to operate a citywide universal
17 curbside organics collection program, strictly on
18 straight time, inclusive of the necessary outreach,
19 education, staff, and new equipment required?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, my sense of that is that
21 at its height, budgeted, the organics program costs
22 \$30 million, what... and that was 24 districts. What
23 that doesn't include, however, is the overtime that
24 was spent on organics. One of the things I was
25 surprised to see was that there isn't a breakout in

2 this department of what the overtime is used for.
3 It's a post that has to get filled. And so we don't
4 have -- or I have not yet seen -- a true overtime
5 cost associated with just the organics program. And
6 I think, you know, I had said that I want to review
7 what happened in the old programs and learn what was
8 good, what was bad. It's difficult to do that
9 without understanding the full cost of it. So it's
10 something that I'm hoping that we can parse through,
11 and that the agency can... can understand and of
12 course, be fully transparent to you about it

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: That would be great. Yeah,
14 it would be really great to get a sense of what this
15 program would cost to be successful so we can plan
16 for an effective budget.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chair, I apologize. I was
18 told that I answered incorrectly on one question.
19 The uniform pickups for the seven community districts
20 for curbside organics are on straight time.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: On street time for moving
22 forward?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It has been on straight
24 time, yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, because I believe in a
3 previous hearing, we were told it was on overtime...
4 the program was being run completely on overtime.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It was baselined now to
6 seven districts, and so going forward, because it's
7 baselined, it's going to be on straight time.
8 Previously it had been on overtime.

9 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Got it. Okay. Okay. Um,
10 want to change to school organics. So for the school
11 organic component, the rollout of... or the
12 announcement of this is super, super exciting. It
13 seems the program is budgeted for \$9.2 million in FY
14 23, and \$2.8 million annually thereafter to expand to
15 534 additional school buildings, and to establish
16 public organic drop off sites using smart bins co-
17 located at or near 100 school buildings. That's
18 really awesome.

19 Can you speak to the success of the score clinics
20 program that has existed in terms of participation?
21 Or if you have diversion rates for what we're... what
22 we're building on?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, I actually... I don't
24 have the tonnage amounts in front of me, but we can
25 get them to us super quick on the school's program.

2 But it has been one of our most successful organics
3 programs with the participating schools. The thing
4 that we're looking forward to is getting every public
5 school in the city up and operational over the next
6 two school years. We're going to roll this out in
7 like four different tranches. So October and
8 February of next school year, and the year after will
9 bring groups of schools online. You may question the
10 timeframe, but we've worked very closely with DOE on
11 it. And it takes time to, you know, train the food
12 service staff and the administrators, and to set up
13 all of the bins and even start training... training
14 the students. So that's a really important piece of
15 the work and we want to make sure that this rollout
16 goes well.

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so that will... this will
18 cover -- I think that's what you said in your opening
19 testimony -- will cover all public schools now?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, every school building.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And so when would you
22 anticipate being fully operational in all schools
23 over the next fiscal year,

24

25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not next school year, but
3 the school year after that. I always screw this up.
4 So that's... this is 21-22... in two school years.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. And then can you
6 breakdown the FY 23 budget for school organics
7 collection in terms of civilian staff versus uniform
8 staff?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. There 325... It's
10 \$9.2 million total, with \$325,000 for additional
11 collection costs. So that's on the uniform side. We
12 have \$1.2 million in civilian staffing costs. That's
13 really to continue the organics program staff first
14 added in FY 22, which wasn't baselined. We have \$2.4
15 million for bin procurement, maintenance, and signage
16 for the schools. That separate from the smart bins
17 for the parents and the community members that are
18 going to be co located. That's \$500,000. And then
19 we have \$5.2 million allocated for outreach staff.
20 Those are the people who are going to, you know, go
21 into each school, work with each school, to actually
22 implement this and make sure that it gets rolled out
23 smoothly.

24 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: That's great. So I'll get
25 back to the staff in a second. But for the 100 smart

2 bins, do you anticipate that being one per school...
3 is the goal to have one per school, which I know can
4 be challenging, especially if the program is
5 successful, because we know that those bins are
6 somewhat limited capacity. So what... what do you
7 anticipate in terms of how many bins per school and
8 the order I guess of the rollout? And then my...
9 kind of like a sub-question to that is, are you all
10 going to be prioritizing schools in environmental
11 justice communities first? Or is are you going to be
12 building out with different types of criteria?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, um, right now, we have
14 half a million dollars in our budget to roll out 100
15 additional bins. I look at this as an expanded
16 pilot, but also like phase two of the pilot that
17 we've done in Astoria, with you know, 20-plus bins
18 all in one in one neighborhood. So this is testing
19 something different. If -- and I expect this will
20 work -- if and when this works, we are excited to
21 roll out these bins more broadly, including if it
22 works to every public school in the city. But right
23 now, the budget is for 100. And as to allocation,
24 exactly where they're going to go, I agree with you,
25 equity needs to inform all of our decisions in this

2 department, but in particular, the ones around smart
3 bins and access to organics education. So we look
4 forward to working with you and working with the
5 committee as we make the decisions about where to
6 place the first 100 bins. That hasn't been done yet.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, great. Do you do you
8 have a timeline of when you want to make that
9 decision by... so members, especially on the
10 sanitation committee might be able to support on
11 that?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. I'd like to do it
13 immediately. The funding drops for us on July 1st.
14 We're already working as much as we can on... as much
15 as we can do without the funding in place on the
16 procurement for the smart bins. So now in the... in
17 the weeks between now and July 1st, I think is, you
18 know, prime time to start thinking about and making
19 some of these decisions because I really want to roll
20 these things out aggressively. I think it can really
21 like chart an important part of our future for
22 organics in New York City.

23 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I totally agree. The
24 question about the... so when you said there's \$5.2
25 million for outreach staff: Do you have a sense of

2 how many positions that is? Is that temporary staff?
3 Are those contract staff? And what... what do you
4 anticipate the duration of their...?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's actually for... it's
6 for GrowNYC. They do our outreach for us. And
7 they're fabulous. I met a bunch of them last week at
8 an event. They are fabulous. They've worked with us
9 in the past on rolling out organics in schools. And
10 so this is to fund their work in outreach for the
11 schools to implement the program appropriately. So
12 the program is going to, as I said, be rolled out
13 over two school years. So that's what the outreach
14 will be.

15 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Is that an expansion of
16 GrowNYC Staff or just to support the existing?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You know, I want to let
18 Commissioner... Deputy Commissioner Greg Anderson
19 answer that question, because I'm not sure of the
20 answer.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, Thank you,
22 Chair. Great to see you. Thank you, Commissioner
23 for passing me this one.

24 So that's a substantial expansion in their
25 outreach staff. So, the budget does include the

2 baseline support for the Recycling Champions Program,
3 which had been previously cut. And then in the
4 current fiscal year includes a substantial increase
5 in that... the staff to do the education, and set up,
6 and work with the custodians and food service staff
7 at those schools.

8 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. I'm going to shift to
9 the community compost site relocation involving the
10 Lower East Side Ecology Center. The FY 23 Executive
11 Budget includes 448 and 129 in fiscal 2022 and \$2.19
12 million in fiscal 23, to support the LES Ecology
13 Center, to build out a compost site on Rockaway
14 Avenue in Brooklyn as a temporary location. Can you
15 walk the committee through how DSNY will be assisting
16 in that relocation and how long you all think it will
17 take?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, I can. So we have
19 \$2.6 million in the expense budget that has been
20 allocated to this. Right now, they're located...
21 well, they've historically been located in... at East
22 River Park. They temporarily moved to another
23 location, and we are looking to relocate them to a
24 location... it's Jamaica... Jamaica Avenue... well in
25 Rockaway, excuse me, in Rockaway. We are hoping to

2 get working on that relocation immediately. We think
3 it could take up to a year. We should do it within a
4 year, do that full build out work, and then they can
5 stay in that location until they're able to move back
6 to their initial home. Whenever the construction in
7 that park is complete.

8 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so for this... what will
9 happen to that site after the temporary relocation
10 period is over? And additionally, is any of that
11 funding coming from Parks at all? Or is it
12 exclusively through DSNY?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No. The funding for this
14 was put into the DSNY budget. So we are taking the
15 lead on building out their temporary location. We
16 are working very closely with them on it. And we are
17 committed to getting them a proper site that they can
18 temporarily operate in for as long as it takes to get
19 the park... their initial park site ready. As to
20 what's going to happen to that site after they move
21 back to East River Park, Greg... Deputy Commissioner
22 Anderson, do you do you know what the plans are for
23 that? I haven't been briefed on that yet.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Absolutely. So
25 you know, we're... we're very excited to get the

2 Lower East Side Ecology Center in there. We're
3 really hoping that they start to work with some local
4 partners as well. There's some great community
5 composters in that part of Brooklyn, including East
6 New York Farms. And so we're hoping that in the long
7 term, we can pull one of them in as an operator for
8 that... that site and really work with the community
9 to figure out what the right set of programming is
10 that makes sense for that location.

11 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Um, and just while
12 we're on the topic of our larger nonprofit community
13 orgs that are supporting our organic goals: We know
14 that Big Reuse is scheduled to lose their site under
15 the Queens Bridge -- which is you know, truly
16 unfortunate -- for a parking lot. What is the plan
17 to support Big Reuse's operations that currently
18 services Queens residents?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. So Big Reuse will be
20 able to stay in their current location -- we're
21 committed to that -- until we build out a new
22 permanent site for them at the Greenpoint Marine
23 Transfer Station. We have \$2.6 million in the
24 sanitation budget, which we are putting towards that
25 new... new project. We internally reallocated money

2 to do this, and we are committed to working with Big
3 Reuse and with the Parks Department to ensure that
4 they have a seamless transition from one location to
5 the next, that the new site is well built out for
6 them, as that will be a permanent site for Big Reuse.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Um, so one of the... the main
8 things that they're upset about and we don't want to
9 get too in the weeds of it, is that that essentially
10 will... will kind of reduce a site for Queens, um,
11 and so that's why they're concerned... they're
12 concerned that you know, the Queensbridge residents,
13 and some of the other areas do not have a composting
14 operation. So just putting that out there. The \$2.6
15 million is that in... that's for FY 23?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And for a couple of
18 our hearings, we've been asking, what exactly does it
19 cost to identify and build out kind of sizable
20 scalable, at scale, composting facilities for the
21 city in order to support achieving the universal
22 organics potential? And we asked if \$1 million was
23 realistic. We never... I don't believe we got an
24 answer. Is it... is it in the \$2.19 million or \$2.6
25 million range? That is what it costs for a site?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, I guess... I can tell
3 you the levers that affect the price, and I think
4 that that will be helpful, because as... as we work
5 together in the future on this, I think it's
6 important to just understand the general levers.

7 The first is, are we acquiring a new site? Like
8 is it a net new site to the city? That obviously, if
9 you're going to acquire a new site adds a tremendous
10 amount of cost. And then... or are you just... do
11 you own the property and are you just going to
12 construct the site?

13 Another big factor that contributes to cost is
14 what scale are you going to do? Are you going to do 4
15 tons per day are you going to do 10 tons per day are
16 going to do over 500 tons per day? We have different
17 sites run by different entities, some of them the
18 city, but they all have different processing
19 capacity. So the amount of processing capacity does
20 very much affect price. So that's the second lever.

21 And the third lever is: What type of composting
22 are you doing there? Are you? Are you building out a
23 large industrial setup, which obviously requires
24 more... more cost? Or are you doing something more
25

2 straightforward? Is it outdoors? Or is it indoors?
3 Those are the different levers.

4 So we see with... with the Lower East Side
5 Ecology Center, that it can be as inexpensive as \$2.6
6 or \$2.2 million, but you know, to do it much bigger,
7 it can be, you know, \$50 million, \$100 million. It
8 all varies based on what... what you set out to do.
9 So I hope that helps answer some of the question.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: No, I appreciate that. This
11 is the first time we've had a breakdown of what are
12 those factors, we've been asking. So I really
13 appreciate that.

14 Okay, I'm only going to ask a few more questions.
15 I know a lot of folks are on here who can ask more
16 detailed other stuff that's in the super weeds at the
17 later end.

18 For public space containerization before we dive
19 into FY 23, regarding the program, can you provide us
20 an update on the current pilot for the FY 22 year?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, sure. So as you know,
22 we announced and unveiled our first container in Time
23 Square working very closely with the Time Square
24 Alliance. That container is in place it's being
25 used. It generally looks pretty good, although I

2 cringed when I went to visit it, and I saw some trash
3 bags put out alongside of it, because the whole point
4 was to put the trash bags inside of it, but... but
5 generally, it has taken a large pile of trash and
6 concealed most... most of it. The other big, big
7 part of this is we are administering a grant program
8 with business improvement districts. We got 29
9 applications from BIDs already. We're putting a
10 second round out this summer where we're going to be
11 working with BIDs, giving them grants to do things
12 similar to what Times Square did. We're committed to
13 testing these bins in all five boroughs, not just
14 BIDs, but also residential commercial. We're working
15 on our first residential pilot with a few blocks in
16 in lower Manhattan that really have been aching to do
17 this, and we're excited for their... their
18 partnership. But we are looking to test all types of
19 bins citywide in all... in all five boroughs. I'll
20 just tell you that I had a very interesting
21 conversation yesterday with the people who run
22 sanitation in Barcelona, which is a leader in
23 containerization. They containerized their waste a
24 long time ago. I learned so much about it. I don't
25 think we need to get into all the details of it at

2 this this hearing, but I would love an opportunity to
3 walk you through what we learned. It was eye
4 opening.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. So for FY 23, it says
6 there's \$1.3 million in the out years to hire three
7 staff for the for the program. Has this expanded at
8 all or changed at all in terms of number of staff?
9 And what are the kind of job titles or, you know,
10 scope of work for these three, folks?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg, would you mind taking
12 that one?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: No problem.
14 Thank you Chair for the question. So the PS funding,
15 which is around \$300,000, for the three staff lines
16 include one line for our project manager for public
17 space initiatives, who we brought on board earlier
18 this year. And that was also funded for one year, at
19 exec last year, so that's just a continuation of that
20 line. And then for the other two, it's actually two
21 new uniformed supervisors. And there'll be working
22 in our collection office, doing site visits,
23 reviewing Waste Management Plan submissions, and
24 really just providing additional staffing capacity to
25

2 do the on the ground work that's necessary to
3 implement these programs.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So for the for the pilot
5 programs, do we know the timeline or when you all
6 will select where these other bins will be deployed?
7 And do you know how many you anticipate deploying?

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think the deployment
9 will... will vary based on cost. What we were
10 thinking for the BIDs we're estimating is about
11 \$20,000 per container. It may be high, it may be low.
12 It'll depend on how big and you know, a bunch of
13 other bunch of other factors. We're hoping to make
14 our first awards to BIDs soon in the coming weeks. We
15 are reviewing all of the grant applications now and
16 look forward to doing it and rolling out phase two of
17 the grant program.

18 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so those grants are they
19 inclusive of... I mean, I see there's three staff.
20 There's a bunch of BIDs that want to do it. There's
21 the \$20k per container, but then is the grant
22 inclusive of what it would cost for outreach or any
23 education for these pilot sites?

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg, do you mind taking
25 that one?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure.

3 Absolutely. So there's a few different tracks that
4 we're working on. On the... the pilot for
5 residential waste, we're absolutely expecting to do a
6 substantial amount of outreach, working with not only
7 residents in the districts where... where these are
8 deployed, but also with the building staff who
9 actually have to use them. So if the building has a
10 super or porters or something like that, we want to
11 make sure they understand how to use the bins
12 appropriately, and are doing so. So really need to
13 get their buy-in. On the BID side, we're expecting
14 the BIDs will... will be the sole users of those
15 bins. So less public interaction necessary, but
16 absolutely we will support education and public
17 outreach with the BIDs as necessary.

18 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So for the residential
19 ones... I'm sorry, I'm asking for super details, and
20 I didn't send some of these ones ahead... but for the
21 residential ones, how many of those do you expect to
22 pilot? And as though... how is the outreach being
23 engaged? I mean, are you going to have a dedicated
24 staffer do it across the different sites? Is that

25

2 the focus of some of these three people? I mean, I
3 know that you said they're uniformed folks.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think the answer on how
5 many residential is still TBD, to be honest. We want
6 to make sure we hit all five boroughs. We want to
7 make sure we get in some commercial, some BIDs, some
8 residential. I can't answer today how many are
9 going to be residential, unfortunately, but we'll
10 also look forward to working with you to sort that
11 out and prioritize.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Alright. And do you have an
13 initial timeline for when you think you'll be able to
14 give like your first report, like you've got enough
15 data under the belt enough time under the belt, where
16 you'll be able to say, "Hey, these are some of our
17 findings", because I know there's a special demand
18 for this and push, and I'm a little worried that
19 there's just going to be a lot of pressure to roll
20 something out and not do enough time to adequately
21 study it and make sure it's a success. So when what
22 you think you'll get for assessment?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think that an assessment
24 of this... to assess the program, you actually have
25 to have bins placed, and the new budget to really

2 like begin to roll out test bins in all five boroughs
3 hits on... on July 1st. I would imagine like a year
4 from now, we will have -- I hope a year for now -- we
5 will have rolled out some commercial, some
6 residential, and some BIDs, and we'll have had an
7 opportunity to look at how they're being used, what
8 the stakeholders think and feel, how we can make
9 improvements, but I wouldn't expect to see a real
10 valuable assessment until at least next year at this
11 time.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That of course, also
14 includes, you know, the other work that we're doing
15 now meeting with other cities that have rolled out
16 containerization. It's not just this pilot. Yes,
17 this pilot is important to see how it works in in New
18 York City specific. But like there's a lot of other
19 research and work we can do at the same time to
20 really hone our thoughts on it.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. I just have two more
22 sets of questions. So the first one is related to
23 headcounts. Um, this is around garage utility
24 workers, splinter group workers, and civilian
25 vacancies. The preliminary budget included \$5.1

2 million in savings in FY 23, growing to \$9.9 million
3 in the out years to reduce 107 garage utility staff
4 positions through attrition with the proposed
5 reduction budget headcount for FY 23, and in the out
6 years would be 378 positions for garage utility
7 staff, if I'm accurate. Has this reduction been
8 restored at all in the Executive Budget?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, it has not.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Do you have an update
11 on the projected impact that this might have in the
12 out years?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We're continuing to assess
14 that, but I'll just say a few things on each. The
15 splinter group staff reduction is something that I've
16 personally managed through before, in particular, in
17 my work at the NYPD, when we took cops out of some of
18 the administrative commands, I ran IT. They took
19 cops out of the administrative commands, and they put
20 them back out... back out into the field. So I've
21 managed through that before. It's difficult. You
22 know, you lose something, you lose that on-the-
23 ground, working knowledge, like how things
24 actually... actually are. But I think it's something
25 we can, and will have to manage through.

2 On the garage utility staff, I mean, those
3 workers do some really important things. You know,
4 they change tires. In the snow season, they put the
5 chains on the vehicles, they put the plows on the
6 vehicles. So I am expecting things should be well,
7 my... my team here... my operational team here...
8 the chiefs here are expecting that things should be
9 okay as a result of this reduction, but if we have
10 any issues during snow season in particular, we are
11 committed to funding that on overtime, and we will
12 give an assessment after snow season of how much
13 overtime actually had to be used, if any, to make up
14 for these cuts.

15 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. My last set of
16 questions is related to commercial waste zones. We
17 just had a hearing on it, and I appreciate it all of
18 the updates on the program so far from Justin Bland
19 and Deputy Commissioner Greg Anderson. So for the...
20 After our last hearing, it was mentioned that there
21 are about 27 civilians staffing the CWE program --
22 and I'll ask you to correct me if I'm wrong -- and 10
23 dedicated to outreach. Can you remind us of the
24 total cost of civilian staffing within the program?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um, Greg, do you have the
3 breakout for just the civilian staff?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yep. I'm
5 opening it now. So in FY 23, the PS funding for
6 civilian staff is \$2.2 million.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. It was also mentioned
8 there would be funding for temporary contractors to
9 support prepping the city for this program with
10 outreach. So how much is allocated for these
11 positions? Well, I also have several... several
12 questions around it. How much is allocated for these
13 positions? How many people will that employ? And how
14 long do you expect them to be on... doing This
15 outreach? And when do you think they'll start?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So we think it's 30... We
17 think it's 30 positions for outreach for the duration
18 of the implementation period. As you know, as we've
19 discussed, we're going to be implementing commercial
20 waste zones zone by zone. So the outreach staff will
21 work as long as the implementation takes.

22 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. Um, and you said you
23 want them to start this... this summer?

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Uh, yeah. I mean, once we
25 add the bids in and make award, yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Does the program have
3 a budget for translation service, and if so...

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The program does not have a
5 specific budget for translation services, but we will
6 be building language access into everything that we
7 do related to commercial waste zones. I believe very
8 much in language access, and will work very closely
9 with Moya to make sure that we have the tools and the
10 resources we need to do this important outreach
11 language in every... outreach work in every language
12 that is required.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. I mean, because this
14 impacts, you know, the small business community,
15 mostly, a lot of, you know... tons and tons of non-
16 English speakers, do you think you have enough
17 funding for covering that?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I am committing to making
19 language access a priority within the budget that we
20 have allocated for commercial waste zones.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And is it beyond just the
22 outreach staff? Are there going to be other forms of
23 outreach, such as radio advertisements, newspaper
24 town halls?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We have \$750,000 in our
3 budget for that type of outreach.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, those are all my
5 questions. Thank you to the other members who've
6 been waiting for a very long time. And thank you
7 Chair, and thank you, Commissioner and Deputy
8 Commissioners, and the rest of the staff here. I'm
9 going to pass it back over to the Counsel or the
10 Chair.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Chair Nurse. I'll
12 take it from here. We also want to say we've been
13 joined by Councilmember Powers, Williams, and Menin.
14 I want to remind council members that we are limiting
15 councilmember questions to five minutes. Please
16 listen for the cue from the sergeant for when time is
17 up. We are going to start with... Council Member
18 Ayala is no longer on. So next on my list is Council
19 Member Carr.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 COUNCIL MEMBERS CARR: Thank you Chairs Brannan
22 and Nurse. Thank you Commissioner for being here
23 today. You know my... I want to jump off where Chair
24 Brannan was asking earlier about wastebasket service,
25 especially because in that... you know that anecdote

2 he gave with those overflowing baskets you know, all
3 too often, that trash doesn't just stay there. It
4 rolls down the street and ends up in someone's
5 property, and the inspector comes by at the wrong
6 time, it could lead to some negative consequences for
7 a business owner or building owner. In Staten
8 Island, I believe we only have two days a week of
9 basket service for public baskets. In FY 19, I think
10 an extra \$250,000 was allocated to increase it to 4
11 or district 49 and 3 days in district 50. Sadly,
12 that was a casualty of the COVID budget in FY 21.
13 And you know it really... it really would be great
14 for our borough if we could get closer to our sister
15 borrows in terms of the frequency of service for
16 public wastebaskets. It would do a lot to protect
17 businesses and also keep the area clean. Can you...
18 can you let us know if that's something you're
19 willing to do and what the current allocation
20 provides in terms of wastebasket service for the
21 borough?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. First, I can tell...
23 I can just repeat what I said in my testimony, which
24 is that I appreciate any and all additional funding
25 that may be put in place during the adopted budget

2 for litter basket service. I agree that it is
3 absolutely fundamental to cleaning up the city and...
4 and restoring cleanliness post pandemic. But I don't
5 have the specific Staten Island numbers for you but I
6 can commit to getting them to you right after this
7 hearing. But what I will say on... on litter basket
8 service is right now, we have approximately... we're
9 at a service level of approximately once a day for
10 little basket six days a week in most districts, not
11 all districts. Obviously, we want to see that service
12 level go up. And if and when we get additional
13 funding to support litter baskets, we are going to
14 look at things like who has the least service now?
15 What are heavily trafficked areas? Where are the 311
16 complaints? Where are... what are the districts
17 where our staff just knows intuitively where they see
18 the problems most frequently? And we're looking
19 forward -- if we get new funding for litter baskets -
20 -- to working with the council and being transparent
21 about how we're making the decisions that we're
22 making.

23 Greg, do you by any chance have the Staten Island
24 numbers handy?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, I do. So
3 across the whole borough we have on weekdays, we have
4 10 litter basket trucks a week, and then 3 on
5 Sundays. So one in each district on Sundays. I will
6 say the allocations for the weekday trucks: It's six
7 trucks in district one, which is the sort of North
8 Shore and the area around Borough Hall, and then two
9 trucks each, as you mentioned, Councilmember Carr in
10 district two and district three, so certainly lower
11 lower service levels in those two districts.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you for that. So I
13 don't have much time left. So I'm just going to
14 package my three questions together and hopefully get
15 an answer from you. My predecessor championed the
16 waste curbside pickup program, the pilot that started
17 in Staten Island and began expanding, and
18 unfortunately yet another casualty of the COVID
19 budget. And now it seems like we're not going to
20 have any of that program at all. Given how seriously
21 you take the illegal dumping issue, and that's music
22 to my ears, nothing was more effective in curtailing
23 that in the borough than allowing for curbside pickup
24 anyways, because that was principally what we were
25 finding dumped in these vulnerable areas besides

2 contractor and construction waste. And so if we're
3 going to be successful moving forward at tackling
4 dumping, as you hope to do, we really need to
5 preserve this program, particularly given Staten
6 Island and other parts of the city don't have the
7 kind of building stock that makes us eligible for the
8 multifamily dwelling program. And so I really hope
9 that you'll reconsider that cut in particular for
10 Staten Island, but really, for all of our sister
11 boroughs. And I just want to also ask: Is there any
12 plan to add additional sanitation police. We only
13 have one sanitation police officer for the borough,
14 and despite attempts to you know, tackle littering
15 from vehicles, we have a lot of vehicular based
16 littering. We try to do more dumping stings. It's
17 really difficult when we don't have the sanitation
18 police, who as peace officers have... have a lot more
19 powers to act. And then finally, with respect to
20 swamp, it's amazing to think it's been almost 25
21 years already, and the most important principle to me
22 that came out of that 06 plan was borrow equity. No
23 borrow was ever going to be a dumping ground for
24 another borrows waste again. We owned Fresh Kills...

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: and is that something
3 you're going to commit to maintain in any update.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so on, I'll take the
5 three in order. On E waste, I appreciate your
6 perspective about how valuable the program is. It's
7 actually great for me to hear so early in my tenure.
8 I agree that the program is... is a valuable program.
9 And, you know, we'll look like based on all of the
10 priorities on whether and if we can secure more
11 funding for it. But I hear you loud and clear on E
12 waste and in particular on the link to illegal
13 dumping. On the swamp, uh, yes, I can commit to you
14 an emphasis... a continued emphasis on borough equity
15 in the next solid waste management plan. I
16 particularly... we all particularly see the benefits
17 to Staten Island over the past 20 years since the
18 last plan, and for sure we will have the same
19 commitment to borough equity there.

20 As to sanitation police, we don't have new
21 funding to increase the size of the sanitation
22 police, but we are... we do have vacancies like
23 funded vacancies that we are working actually now I
24 had a meeting with the enforcement team to fill. So
25 there will be more sanitation police but not a

2 meaningfully... a meaningful amount more sanitation
3 police, but I expect that in the in the weeks and
4 months to come.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thanks for your answers. I
6 look forward to talk more offline. And thank you
7 chairs for giving me this opportunity.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember and
9 next we'll turn to Councilmember Kagan followed by
10 Councilmember Batra.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: First of all, thank you so
12 much for this opportunity and for this great budget
13 hearing about very important topic, sanitation. I
14 have two questions to Commissioner. Number one: Are
15 you planning to increase any kind of sanitation
16 enforcement? And second question, in my district,
17 specifically in Bensonhurst on 86th street between
18 Bay Parkway and _____ Avenue, for many years
19 community complaining about complete massive chaos,
20 have ever been like Commissioner Teresa, Bensonhurst,
21 86 street, she did she for herself. I hear complaint
22 repeatedly. My predecessor have complained
23 repeatedly, but it's still total mess in terms of
24 sanitation conditions on 86th.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So on the first question
3 about whether I'm looking to increase sanitation
4 enforcement?

5 The answer is yes, I spoke a little bit about
6 this in my testimony. I don't believe in... in
7 enforcement for the sake of enforcement. But if a
8 business or resident isn't going to do the right
9 thing and abide by the... I think very
10 straightforward rules and laws we have around keeping
11 the city clean, then enforcement is a tool that we
12 can and will use.

13 During the pandemic, our enforcement numbers went
14 way down, like way down. And that I think is
15 understandable. It's a result of people were out
16 sick. Some of our enforcement agents were taken to
17 do other types of COVID-related enforcement, so
18 pulled for non sanitation duties. We have everyone
19 back now in the sanitation department. And I think
20 an important part of cleaning up our city is making
21 sure that we do the enforcement that we have to do to
22 keep the city... the city clean.

23 As to your invitation for me to come and visit
24 with you and take a tour of your district, I'd love
25 it. I spent the past several weeks meeting

2 sanitation workers, going to garages around the city.
3 And now I'd really like to see your districts,
4 understand what the very local issues are. I know
5 that there are a lot of issues that are citywide, but
6 even more that are local. And I want to make sure
7 that I understand them and I'll be joined in each
8 visit with my borough chief make sure that they see
9 them too firsthand what I see and I appreciate the
10 invitation. Happily take you up on it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Thank you. I would
12 welcome you to Bensonhurst.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER: Thank you, Councilmember Kagan.
14 And next we'll turn to Councilmember Bottcher.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you.
17 Commissioner, how are you?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm great, thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: My question is about
20 rat mitigation. And, you know, I think most New
21 Yorkers would be shocked to learn that the city cut
22 \$2.2 million dollars in rat fighting funds in the
23 sanitation budget two years ago. Last year, they
24 were only partially restored around \$700,000, if I'm
25 correct. In this budget, the city council asked the

2 mayor to add \$4.8 million for rat mitigation
3 programs, and that didn't happen in the response to
4 the city council, no additional funds were added for
5 rat mitigation. Can you help us understand what's
6 going on here? Why haven't we increased funding for
7 rat mitigation at this time and how much is being
8 proposed in this year's budget?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alright. So there is a city
10 wide task force on rat mitigation that the Department
11 of Sanitation is a member of. We happen not to chair
12 it. So the rat mitigation efforts in the city of New
13 York are led by the Department... the Department of
14 Health. So the sanitation budget isn't exactly the
15 right place for rat mitigation. However, this
16 administration is making a real commitment to rat
17 mitigation that you can see in our budget, and that's
18 through the... the \$1.3 million that was baselined in
19 our budget for containerization. And so if
20 containerization works -- and I will be the first to
21 acknowledge that is a big if; there is a lot to learn
22 over the next year -- but if containerization works,
23 then that is a fabulous rat mitigation strategy.
24 Obviously, it's a long term strategy. I would say,
25 for the short term tactical stuff, though, the budget

2 for rat mitigation is and should be in the Department
3 of Health.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: I am excited about the
5 containerization pilot. But the rat mitigation funds
6 that were cut were part of a city wide strategy with
7 the Department of Health. But what those funds were
8 for were for increased basket service in areas that
9 were defined as rat reservoirs. Those areas didn't
10 stop being rate reservoirs when COVID came.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. Yeah. That's...
12 that's a great point, and I'm sorry I neglected to
13 include this. We have said we would appreciate any
14 additional funding may be added in the adopted budget
15 for litter basket service. And as we hopefully roll
16 out additional litter basket service, one of the
17 criteria that we will use in determining how to
18 allocate that extra budget will be about where we
19 have major rat problems.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you, and I know
21 that we're on the same page about the desire to get
22 more funding for litter basket service, and I look
23 forward to fighting for that with my colleagues very
24 hard, because it's hard for me and others to explain
25 to our constituents that in a city with \$100 billion

2 budget, we can't scrape together a few million
3 dollars for rat mitigation programs. Thank you.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. And
6 next on my list... I do not see Councilmember
7 Velázquez or Hanif. So next, we'll turn to
8 Councilmember Hudson.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much.
11 Hello, Commissioner. And hello, Chairs. Quick
12 question about alternate side parking. I'm wondering
13 how much sanitation has allocated for alternate side
14 parking regulations in this budget? And does the
15 agency have plans to save funding by reevaluating
16 holistically current alternate side parking standards
17 to remove less dirty streets that currently have four
18 times a week cleaning, when two times a week has kept
19 it sufficiently clean? You know, I have streets in
20 my districts that have alternate side parking four
21 times a week compared to streets and other districts
22 that have it just one time a week. And you know, I
23 have heard from a lot of constituents about the
24 challenges with needing to move their cars four times
25 a week. So I just wanted to ask that question.

2 And then also regarding any plans and funding for
3 community donation programs. So I know that programs
4 exist, but I'm wondering if there are any plans to
5 expand curbside pickup or drop off at specific sites
6 and accompanying funding for that?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um sure. So let me take the
8 ASP question first. In the FY 23 budget, we had \$1.9
9 million of new funding and 41 headcount to restore...
10 restore alternate side parking to pre-pandemic
11 levels, which I said in my testimony is far and away
12 the best clean streets tool that we have in our
13 arsenal. Every mechanical broom on a single route,
14 can pick up 1500 pounds of street litter... or a
15 single mechanical broom, that is in addition to the
16 \$6.7 million that we have allocated for new street
17 sweepers, to sweep bike lanes in various sizes, which
18 should be a very versatile fleet. We're really
19 looking forward to that as well. So that's the
20 budget side of street sweeping. I hope that answers
21 that question.

22 The question as to looking at changing alternate
23 side parking service levels in the city. I'm
24 definitely open to it. That's not an overnight
25 process. But I am open to working with this council,

2 understanding where we think we have too much,
3 although I don't think we have too much right now,
4 but once it's restored where we have too much, where
5 we might not have enough.

6 I also note that there are some districts that
7 don't have alternate side parking because when those
8 rules were first put in place, they were more
9 industrial districts and they've become more
10 residential of late, so I do think wouldn't be a
11 worthwhile effort to undertake a review of it, and I
12 thank you for the suggestion and welcome the
13 Partnership on it.

14 Greg, could you... would you mind taking the
15 question on community donations? I know we have the
16 \$475,000 for Stop And Swap, but do you have anything
17 to add to that?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure, absolutely.
19 So we have a whole range of programs to support the
20 reuse industry in New York City. So we have a
21 program called Donate NYC, that not only operates our
22 Donated NYC exchange, where you can actually post
23 goods that are available, find goods for donation,
24 but we also have Donate NYC partners, which are, you
25 know, the large Housing Works and Goodwill and

2 Salvation Army type organizations all the way down to
3 neighborhood thrift stores and food pantries. So,
4 you know, really working to support that work.

5 What the commissioner just mentioned, is our stop
6 And Swap events, which we run in partnership with
7 GrowNYC. We do have close to half a million dollars
8 in funding for fiscal 23 to operate those programs...
9 to operate those events throughout the city. And
10 those are great events where you can bring anything
11 you have that's gently used, and you don't want any
12 more, drop them off for other people to sort of pick
13 through, and take and then anything you see that that
14 you want there, you can take as well. So if you...
15 you know have your eyes on... on a pair of sneakers
16 or a nice leather jacket, you can grab that drop off
17 your... your books or your toaster that you don't
18 want anymore.

19 And then we also have a substantial programs
20 related to textile reuse and donation. So the
21 Refashion NYC program, which... which is for
22 buildings, 10 or more units, operated in partnership
23 with Housing Works, as well as a number of other
24 efforts to support textile reuse and donation across
25 the city.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you. And then just
3 with my last few seconds, can you just explain how...
4 for pilot programs how certain neighborhoods or
5 communities are elected?

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. I mean, if you're...
8 let's take the containerization program, as I think
9 the best example of a pilot program we have going
10 on... going on right now. That one we've committed
11 to doing five boroughs. And I think that one will
12 largely be based on where there is real interest and
13 commitment to getting it done. But I will say that
14 equity will be a common theme that you will see
15 across everything in my leadership in the sanitation
16 department. So obviously that will inform our
17 containerization and other pilots as well.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thanks for that. I
19 would love to maybe have a follow up conversation
20 about including my district in the... in the pilot
21 program. We've got lots of willing participants.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I welcome it.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
25 Hudson, Councilmember Barron. I have you on my list

2 with your hand up, but it was down. I don't know if
3 you did it on purpose or by accident, lowering your
4 hand?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh, accident.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Oh, okay. So we'll turn to
7 you now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much. A
9 lot of my colleagues asked a lot of questions that I
10 was that I was going to ask, but I do want to talk in
11 general about environmental racism. You mentioned
12 environmental justice, but when it comes to a lot of
13 our poor black and brown communities, we have a lot
14 of bus depots and waste transfer stations. So I know
15 DEP and DEC and the Environmental Protection Agency
16 of the federal government has a lot to do with these
17 things, but how will you address the question of
18 environmental racism when it comes to sanitation?

19 Unfortunately, for us, as black and brown people,
20 racism permeates every institution and the Department
21 of Sanitation is no exception. So we have to look at
22 how regularly are... is trash going to be picked up?
23 We have to look at all of the issues, whether it's,
24 you know, little baskets, you name it, we have to
25 make sure that there's equity in the treatment of

2 that. So how will you assure us... particularly the
3 waste transfer stations? We have overwhelmingly, a
4 number of waste transfer... land waste transfer
5 stations, and then also have some boats that transfer
6 trash out. How will you assure to us that equity
7 occurs in every aspect of the agency, every aspect
8 from the minute to the macro to the major when it
9 comes to race. People like to ignore that will act
10 like it doesn't exist, but it does. That's one
11 question.

12 Secondly, and I think my colleagues already
13 mentioned this, but I don't know how you say the
14 Adam's Administration is working aggressively with
15 you to deal with sanitation and keeping the city
16 clean when we tried to restore \$47 million... zero
17 and his budget, litter baskets as the Chair
18 mentioned, \$22 million... zero in his budget,
19 restored a baseline for sanitation cuts \$12
20 million... he did \$1.9 million and his budget, rat
21 mitigation \$4.8 million... zero and his budget. And
22 I can go on and on, and I think you already know,
23 that is not my idea of somebody working aggressively
24 trying to keep the city clean. And I know that
25 one... that's not on you, but certainly hope my

2 colleagues in the city council are listening, that we
3 should not accept a budget that does not have these
4 restorations, and the enhancements when it comes to
5 sanitation, because I have to believe sanitation
6 along with health, education, and economic
7 development to deal with poverty and unemployment is
8 one of the most important aspects in our community.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So let me take the waste
10 equity and race question first. I think there are a
11 number of relevant things here that we have and can
12 and will do around waste equity.

13 The first is I take very seriously our
14 responsibility to carry out Local Law 152, which is
15 the waste equity law. And I can... I am proud to
16 tell you that prior to my arrival here, the
17 sanitation department had fully done what it needed
18 to do under that Waste Equity Law, which is to cut
19 permitted capacity at 22 facilities in North
20 Brooklyn, Southeast Queens, and South Bronx. I think
21 in North Brooklyn, it was by 50%. In Southeast
22 Queens, it was by 33%. And the same for the South
23 Bronx. In each of those areas, it cut permitted
24 capacity... we cut permanent capacity by 10,000 tons
25 per day. And so that is something that this

2 department is very proud of, and it is something that
3 we will continue to do and continue to stay on top
4 of.

5 I think the second piece on waste equity and the
6 siting of facilities... The next conversation we have
7 to have is about our solid waste management plan,
8 which really charged the course for the next 20
9 years, and may bring it down to 10 years. But
10 regardless, for a long time, how we make the
11 fundamental decisions about where... where things are
12 sited and how much permanent capacity where... that
13 plan is, is due to the council and to the state in
14 2026. This budget funded, I think it was about a few
15 hundred thousand dollars for the beginning... the
16 first phase of development of the waste... the solid
17 waste management plan, which is like the first
18 opposite part...

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... is what is the state of
21 affairs right now? And so just documenting that.

22 And so we look forward over the next three or
23 four years to working closely with the council, to
24 working closely with stakeholders as we develop the

2 solid waste management plan that is going to govern
3 how the city deals with waste over the next 20 years.

4 And the last piece that I would talk about is
5 commercial waste zones. And we implement that
6 commercial waste zone law, that means that fewer
7 truck miles are going to be run through communities
8 in... in this city. And so I believe that a very
9 important part of waste equity has... is wrapped up
10 in commercial waste zones, and I would welcome it
11 out. There's so much more I could say about each of
12 these... these things, but I would appreciate the
13 opportunity to discuss them with you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, thank you very much
15 for that answer. And I would like to meet with you,
16 because years ago when I was in the city council and
17 Gifford Miller was the speaker, we fought hard and he
18 had to have a maritime us waste management facility
19 in his neighborhood on 90-something street for the
20 first time because Manhattan doesn't deal with the
21 waste. The other boroughs...

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have visited it.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right. So the other
24 boroughs do... take care of all of the waste.
25 Manhattan doesn't do their share. So I think... you

2 know, I would love to have that discussion with you
3 because, we live, as you know, in a capitalist
4 society, and there's big cash in moving trash. So
5 matter of fact, a lot of it has gone to USA Waste or
6 Waste Management... I think they merged. And so
7 there's a lot of dollars in privatizing trash
8 collection. There's big cash in trash. So I'd love
9 to have that conversation with you to see how we
10 don't allow for that kind of capitalistic greed to
11 render our communities dirtier... and inequity and
12 picking up of trash. So thank you very much for your
13 comment.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Councilmember. And
15 next we'll turn to Councilmember Ossé.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Hi, good afternoon,
17 Commissioner. And good afternoon, Chair Nurse.
18 Thank you for hosting this amazing hearing, where
19 we're gaining some insight into our sanitation budget
20 and hopefully get to some... some solutions so that
21 we can clean up our city. You know, I have a
22 question that is related to Councilmember Barron's
23 question.

24 You know... as you know, there's a \$31.1 million
25 decrease for collection and street cleaning. And I

2 know that this decrease is mainly for uniform
3 overtime, salaries, and fringe benefits. However,
4 this will cut along with administration's failure to
5 restore \$47.8 million to the Department of
6 Sanitation. It will also decrease impact cleaning
7 services in the city. How much of this money will go
8 towards waste equity initiatives? And I know you
9 touched on that with Councilmember Barron's question.

10 But also what is the index in which you are, you
11 know, calculating which neighborhoods are most in
12 need of sanitation services, especially to provide
13 that equity that maybe is not provided in a
14 neighborhood that I represent, like Bed Stuy versus
15 another, maybe community in Manhattan?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you for that question,
17 Council Member, and I apologize for not being at the
18 last hearing on commercial waste zones. Just to
19 explain, I know you're concerned about that, to
20 explain, I was like a week and a half on the job, and
21 I really... when I appear before the council, I
22 really take very seriously giving accurate, complete
23 information. So that was the reason for my absence.
24 I didn't feel ready to give accurate, complete

2 information. What... your question was about...

3 Sorry.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: In terms of how you're
5 calculating...?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, yes. Yes. So, my... a
7 big part of my background is in like data and IT, and
8 I am a very data-driven person. I want this agency
9 to become... or to continue to be, but to increase
10 the amount that we rely on data. We collect so much
11 data in this department, both internally and also as
12 a city through 311. And that data should inform
13 almost everything we... everything we do. So as new
14 budgets... new budget cycles happen, as new, you
15 know, cuts are required, or hopefully, funds are
16 added, the allocation of that service will be based
17 on... based on the data. And of course, an important
18 consideration will also be equity.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you. The second
20 question I have is related to something that is more
21 current in our city right now. You know, I'm aware
22 that the Department of Sanitation has played a role
23 in the mayor's homeless encampment sweeps, removing
24 people's belongings and property in these sweeps.
25 You know, when our neighbors are facing the trauma of

2 homelessness, it is more devastating for them to lose
3 whatever they have left, rather than letting them
4 stay with it then. You know, the purpose of the
5 Department of Sanitation is to remove waste and to
6 ensure our streets are healthy and clean, not to
7 further traumatize our neighbors.

8 So I wanted to ask you, how much of our taxpayer
9 dollars is allocated to the Department of Sanitation
10 is involvement in the street sweeps? And to follow
11 up after that, what is the Department of Sanitation
12 doing with property taken from our homeless
13 neighbors?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so, on this topic,
15 Mayor Adams has been... been clear: We want to
16 encourage vulnerable New Yorkers to come in off the
17 streets and the subways into safer settings with
18 dedicated services and support. He's also been clear
19 that the city will not be dissuaded from offering
20 vulnerable individuals on the street the supports
21 that they are entitled to.

22 Our work on this on this interagency task force:
23 We are one of a few agencies who work on these issues
24 together. And our work in particular in the
25 sanitation department is done by our precision... by

2 our precision teams. It is not, it's generally not
3 done on overtime, it's done on straight time. So
4 it's not adding to the overtime burden. But we take
5 our precision sweep teams, and this is among the work
6 that they do.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: So this isn't an additional
8 cost for these types of sweeps or services?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It is not a new need. It is
10 not an additional... it is not an additional cost.
11 We have a unit in the sanitation department that does
12 precision related work, and they allocate some of
13 their time to participating interagency task force.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you for those
16 answers. And I hope to see you in the neighborhood,
17 Commissioner.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm looking forward to it.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember.
20 Next, we'll turn to Councilmember Williams.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hello, Commissioner.

23 Again, congrats on your appointment. We loved
24 Commissioner Grayson in my office, and we hope to
25 have the same relationship and welcome you to come

2 and visit us as well. We were happy to have
3 Commissioner _____ join us. And I also just really
4 wanted us to think Q12 because they have been really
5 helpful to us and very, very, very responsive. So I
6 would be remiss if we did not thank Q12 and Q13, who
7 always come to our support.

8 The first question I have... I'm actually going
9 to ask all of my questions, and then you can just
10 answer them.

11 The first question I have is in regards to state
12 and federal funding, we didn't see any increases in
13 the state's funding. And we know that federal
14 funding was a one-time deal. So I just kind of
15 wanted to understand how the agency is accounting for
16 not having those fundings, and if the agency thought
17 to advocate at the state level for more funding.

18 The other question that I had, and maybe you'll
19 appreciate this: You mentioned that you ran 311.
20 And so the question that I have is in regards to 311.
21 So in my district, when they made the special
22 classification for illegal dumping, my district
23 actually had the highest amount of illegal dumping in
24 terms of the 311 calls. And so I know a lot of my
25 colleagues mentioned enforcement, and just again

2 wanted to reiterate or ask what the agency plans to
3 do specifically in areas that are prone to illegal
4 dumping? The previous council member allocated money
5 in cameras. I am also hopefully at allocating more
6 money to cameras, wanting to understand even that.
7 So outside of having actual enforcement agents, which
8 I agree, we need to have more of those. And I
9 noticed again, that line item was also decreased in
10 this budget. But the timeline for cameras and
11 installing the cameras, because this money was
12 allocated last year, I plan to allocate more money to
13 put more cameras, I just want to have an
14 understanding of the timeline. And I have a very
15 innovative idea to make one of our historically
16 dumping areas, _____ a bike lane, since I've heard
17 1000 times on this hearing that you are planning to
18 keep those clean. So perhaps if it was a bike lane,
19 we wouldn't have illegal dumping in that area.

20 And the last and final thing that I wanted to say
21 is I know we've been having a lot of conversations,
22 my colleagues, are all you know supportive organics
23 program. But it's my understanding is schools that
24 currently have the program, there isn't really any
25 incentives or encouragement for school professionals

2 to encourage the kids to actually participate in the
3 program. And so if we're increasing support of the
4 program, I just want to understand what type of
5 coordination, encouragement, incentivization, I just
6 needed to learn what is taking place to ensure that
7 the person is actually working as intended to.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, I've written down all
9 your questions. And here goes:

10 The question about turning a known dump site into
11 part of a bike lane: Sounds great to me. What I can
12 commit to you is I will work with you and I will work
13 with the Department of Transportation to assess the
14 feasibility and see if we can push that forward.

15 On cameras... This didn't earn me a lot of
16 popularity in my time at the NYPD, but I was
17 responsible for building the NYPD Domain Awareness
18 System which included cameras and I would be thrilled
19 to put my camera-related background to work for you
20 and for illegal dumping. And so one of the things
21 that I'm going to do when I dig in with the IT team
22 here is to understand what the current approach is to
23 cameras, and see how we can... can speed it up. Like
24 once the cameras are procured, like those things
25 should go up really, really, really fast. It's not

2 rocket science to do. So I'm going get back to you
3 on timeline for cameras. I know we have a bunch of
4 cameras on order. I'm going find out when they get
5 in. But like, I don't want them sitting on shelves
6 here. Like they're coming in, and then they're going
7 up on... on street poles. That's the answer the
8 camera question.

9 The other part of the legal dumping question,
10 which had to do with 311 calls... how your district
11 had the most 311 calls for illegal dumping. First,
12 I'm very happy that we made that a specific category
13 in 311 so that we can collect good data on it. I am
14 going to dig into that data on illegal dumping and be
15 very transparent about it. I've already dug into the
16 311 data on litter baskets and learned a whole lot.
17 I can tell you that we have teams in each district
18 that address illegal dumping, and what we will do is
19 based on the data make sure that those teams are
20 sized correctly...

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... or appropriately from
23 district to district.

24 On the incentives for kids to do organics.

25

2 Greg, I apologize for leaning on you so much.
3 Can you take that question? I'm not sure exactly what
4 we do there. But Council Member, if we don't do
5 enough, I am a person who is all about
6 implementation. A programs is not worth it if it's
7 not implemented correctly. If the kids don't use it,
8 then what are we doing? So I'm very committed to
9 making sure that all stakeholders from the students
10 to the staff at school are bought in, understand it,
11 and the schools are set up?

12 So Greg, what do we have today on... on getting
13 the kids ready for organics?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure. And
15 actually, Commissioner, if you don't mind, I'm gonna
16 pass this over to Bridget Anderson and her team. Her
17 team is going to oversee all the outreach work and
18 education and oversees the school's organics program.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Thank you
20 Commissioner and Greg, and Councilmember. We are very
21 excited to roll out this program citywide. We want
22 to make sure that we are leveraging the learning
23 curve we've had rolling out curbside composting for
24 schools over the past several years.

2 This is... the heart heavy lift here is the DOE
3 and the... you know the enormous population that they
4 have to serve and motivate to do this program. So
5 our role is to enable and support them in doing that.
6 Part of it is the funding for the GrowNYC outreach
7 team. They have developed over the years a very
8 successful curriculum and program to support school
9 custodians, school staff, school students and
10 teachers. But we also know that you can't just go
11 there once leave and move on. There needs to be sort
12 of maintenance motivation. And that's something that
13 we're trying to figure out now: Is how do we make
14 sure that we have a light touch? Even after we've
15 done our intensive rollout, to make sure that staff,
16 there's turnover of staff, etc, that they remain
17 motivated. So we are happy to discuss that more with
18 you. But really, it is a partnership with us and the
19 DOE to make sure we have the buy-in by the right
20 people within every school.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I know my
22 time has expired. My other question is just the
23 funding... (crosstalk)

24

25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I am not sure what funding
3 that you're referring to. So maybe, Greg, do you
4 have a sense of this?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah. So we did
6 get a substantial amount of federal funding for the
7 current fiscal year fiscal 22 as part of the
8 Coronavirus relief bills that passed under the Biden
9 administration last spring. And that was intended to
10 be a replacement for lost revenue and was generally
11 put toward our... our waste export funding. You're
12 correct, Councilmember that funding is not renewed in
13 fiscal 23. That's a one-time shot. But we did
14 backfill those expenses with city tax levy funds.
15 That's what they had been funded with previously, and
16 that's what they'll go back to being funded with
17 going... going forward.

18 And I do just want to put one pitch in here. I
19 know the council has been very supportive of the
20 extended producer responsibility programs,
21 particularly for packaging. This is a place where
22 it's not necessarily state funding in that it's not
23 tax funding, but it's a place where state policy can
24 really bring funding to our agency. And this is
25 something that I know the legislature is considering

2 right now. They just passed a carpet recycling law
3 that we hope the governor signs. Actually just today
4 DC sent out a press release that the paint take back
5 program is going into effect which is going to bring
6 some funding for our special waste programs. So this
7 is just another place where, you know, we could get
8 potentially up to a \$100 million in funding if this
9 program goes through. So any advocacy you or your
10 colleagues can do, in addition to the resolution that
11 you all passed earlier this year, would be very
12 helpful.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Next is councilmember Brewer,
14 then Councilmember Sanchez, then Councilmember Menon.
15 We'll turn to Councilmember Brewer.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Hold on. No, she dropped off
18 the Zoom. Okay. We'll circle back. Councilmember
19 Sanchez?

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You asked me to bump you.
22 Okay, we'll go to Councilmember Menin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay, third time's the
24 charm. Thank you so much. First of all, thank you,

2 Chair for holding this hearing. And good to see you,
3 Commissioner.

4 So I really wanted to echo what my colleagues
5 have previously said, about restoring the budget
6 cuts, and particularly with increased litter basket
7 pickup in my district, this is a hot button topic,
8 and I know in so many other districts as well, and
9 it's probably one of the top constituent issues that
10 we are hearing from. But another issue that I'm
11 hearing a lot from on constituents is since the
12 announcement on alternate side parking, could you
13 walk us through...? Will there be any changes to
14 that? Is that now permanent? Are you going to be
15 looking at any of the streets where there may be some
16 issues? Because that's the question that we're
17 constantly getting in the office.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. So on... I'll just
19 take litter baskets first... with litter baskets, I
20 could not be clearer that we appreciate any
21 additional funding that is added into our budget to
22 support litter baskets, and we are operationally
23 ready to go and to increase service should the budget
24 allow for it.

2 On alternate side, there are no changes. So...
3 so basically, what we're going back to on July 5 is
4 the same program we had before March 2020. So it's
5 basically whatever the sign says. You're now
6 following all of what the sign says rather than
7 rather than half of it, which I know confused people
8 for a while. But what I did commit to and I'll
9 commit to you again on it, is that we're happy to
10 take a look at refreshing alternate side parking. I
11 mean, this is not an immediate thing, but undertake
12 an analysis of it, to see if there are streets that
13 didn't get it that should have it, or are there some
14 streets that have too much or too little, or there's
15 some districts that don't have it... have it at all,
16 and have recently become or in the past few years
17 become more residential. I'm happy to like put fresh
18 eyes... fresh eyes to that type of analysis and work
19 with the council.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: That would be incredibly
21 helpful, because we do get a lot of questions from it
22 and really doing a street by street analysis in
23 neighborhoods to see which streets it makes sense on,
24 which streets it doesn't make sense on would be very,
25 very helpful.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you for that
3 suggestion.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay. Great. Thank you,
5 and thank you to the Chairs for organizing this.
6 Thank you.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member
8 Menin. I don't see... oh, Councilor Sanchez. There
9 we go. Because I don't see councilmember Brewer. So
10 we'll turn to Councilmember Sanchez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Great. Thank you, thank
12 you so much, Malcom. And a huge shout out to Malcom
13 for the endurance of just being here through all
14 these hearings into our Sergeant At Arms. And
15 everyone, of course, to chair Brannan. So thank you,
16 thank you, Chair Nurse for this hearing... for
17 Chairing this hearing.

18 So my question is... you may have addressed it
19 earlier when you were talking about the illegal
20 dumping, but I didn't quite hear. So my question is
21 about the Precision Cleaning Initiative, which was
22 launched in fiscal 22. So I know that you use
23 borough-based teams to conduct the targeted cleanings
24 for litter conditions, illegal dumping, and
25 overflowing litter baskets. So just wanted to see if

2 there was an update of what this... what the program
3 has accomplished in this last year and future years?

4 And let me just put a point... a finer point
5 here. One, thank you so much for always answering
6 our calls at Department of Sanitation. And, you
7 know, whenever we have an issue I've had, you know,
8 just great responsiveness. So just want to
9 appreciate you all Commissioner, Deputy Commissioner.

10 And so that's part one of the question, and then
11 part two is illegal dumping and more broadly, you
12 know, just tips and advice for council members and
13 how we can, you know, sort of curb that... and
14 what... what the department's approach is to, you
15 know, curbing that, like figuring out who's doing it
16 and actually trying to stop it from the from the
17 root.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so I'll start with the
19 answer to the second part of the question. I don't
20 have in In front of me, the data about illegal
21 dumping district by district, and I'll ask once I'm
22 done. Maybe one of my colleagues has it here. If
23 not, we'll circle back with you really fast.

24 But as to the general approach on illegal
25 dumping, it's three things. All of them are related.

2 One is enforcement, enforcement, enforcement
3 enforcement. If you are caught... illegal dumping is
4 a theft of public space. If you are caught engaged
5 in illegal dumping, it is a \$4,000 fine. And if
6 you're using a vehicle, your vehicle can be
7 impounded. We take this very seriously. And I want
8 to make sure that the enforcement efforts around
9 illegal dumping are as robust as they need to be in
10 the places that suffer most from it, because we know
11 that this is not a citywide problem, it is a very
12 local problem, and it affects very much the
13 communities that that have it. So the first was
14 enforcement.

15 The second is Precision Cleaning, as you
16 mentioned, we have these teams in every borough.
17 Part of their work is to clean lots or places where
18 illegal dumping has occurred. We will get you that
19 data, but those cleanup efforts are very important.
20 The before and after pictures are fantastic. The
21 tragedy though -- and this is why I circles back to
22 enforcement -- is that it keeps happening in the same
23 places. So you clean it up one day, and then the
24 next week, it's back. We are committed to continuing
25 to clean it up and continuing to enforce it.

2 And that brings me to the third prong, which is
3 cameras, cameras, cameras. I had mentioned to one of
4 your colleagues that I have a lot of background and
5 experience running camera systems. I very much
6 believe in the value that cameras can add to stopping
7 the blight of illegal dumping. And I'm looking to go
8 all in on cameras where they are needed, and where
9 they are needed is in these repeat locations. Like
10 it's just too easy not to do. So I hope that answers
11 your question. I'm wondering if Chief Lohan or
12 Deputy Commissioner Anderson have any of the data
13 around Precision Cleaning and how many dump sites
14 we've cleaned this year? If not, Councilmember,
15 we'll get back to you really fast with it.

16 CHIEF LOHAN: Yes. Good afternoon, everyone. I
17 have some stats on Precision Cleaning. So since the
18 program started to date, we assigned 3162 crews.
19 They have been assigned to service 52,000 additional
20 litter baskets, over 20,000 additional drop offs, and
21 then over 10,000 additional block pieces swept. And
22 you know with that we encounter discarded syringes,
23 unfortunately, we removed over 1000 of those as well.

24 So it's been a pretty successful program, you
25 know, we look forward to continuing that and

2 expanding that, and hopefully, refining that as time
3 goes on.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Do you by any chance have
5 any borough-by-borough or district by district
6 information? If not, we can get back to the Council
7 Member, after but in particular, any work we've done
8 in the Bronx generally or Morris Heights?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 CHIEF LOHAN: Yes. I have... I have particular
11 stats. I can definitely share that. If you want to
12 get into that now. Or we could share that
13 afterwards. I think that would be responsive to the
14 Council Member's question.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Yeah, thank you.
16 After... after is fine, you know, so we can get in
17 writing. It's better for us.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, cool. We will send
19 that over to you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so
21 much.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
23 Sanchez.

24 I'm going to turn it back to the chairs. I know
25 Chair Nurse had two quick follow ups and her closing

2 remarks, and then Chair Brannan for his closing
3 remarks. So Chair Nurse.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I also just want to
5 recognize Councilmember Ayala had come back on.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: I saw hand up.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: She was the first name...
8 first hand up earlier, so I texted her to come back
9 on.

10 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. I really
12 appreciate that. Sorry, I had to jump off. I
13 apologize now, Commissioner, if you have already
14 responded to this question a million times. But
15 actually, I have a couple. One is regarding the
16 syringe litter program. I'm not sure now that we saw
17 cuts in last year's budget. I'm not sure if that's
18 the same this year... if those... those funds were
19 restored. Obviously syringe litter continues to be a
20 huge problem throughout the city. My district
21 specifically has seen an increase in the last few
22 years. So it's something that we lobbied for and
23 were really excited to grow... and then it was
24 abruptly cut. That's one.

2 I'll ask them that way so that we don't run out
3 of time.

4 Two, I was... I'm very curious to find out how
5 funding is broken down by district. Is it by garage?
6 Is it by community? I, you know, I often feel like
7 our community... and I know that Chair Brannan
8 mentioned that we want what everybody wants. I want
9 to kind of just state that I don't want what
10 everybody wants. I want everybody to have what they
11 have. But I want those communities that need more to
12 get that more, because I find, you know, I know for a
13 fact that, you know, the district south of me, you
14 know, may not... you know, may have more access to
15 resources to supplement cleaning needs to haul off
16 their garbage with private, you know, groups, but in
17 East Harlem and South Bronx, we don't have that that
18 privilege. And so we have a lot of density and that
19 means that we have a lot of garbage. So I would like
20 to know how that... that budget is broken down.

21 Three: Where my garbage cans? My garbage cans
22 are missing everywhere. There was a theory a couple
23 of years ago... a rumor that segmentation kind of
24 verify that they took the garbage cans because they
25 didn't want household garbage on corners, but that

2 has resulted in a huge problem for us, because now
3 people are just throwing, you know, their garbage on
4 the street. So I would like my garbage cans back if
5 possible.

6 And last but not least, I guess this is more of a
7 comment than anything else, but on Bruckner
8 Boulevard, there are some rails right underneath the
9 highway that are technically in councilmember
10 Salamanca's district in the Bronx. They smell
11 horribly throughout the summer months, I was driving
12 by I had my window closed, I had my air conditioning
13 on and my entire vehicle smelled of nothing but
14 garbage. I look to my left, and there's nothing but
15 residential homes there. And I know that the wind is
16 carrying that smell every single summer. So I wonder
17 if that's something that you are aware of? Maybe
18 anything that you can help with?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, Greg, I have not been
20 fully briefed up on the syringe litter programs. I
21 want to see if either Deputy Commissioner Anderson or
22 Chief Lohan could take that one.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure I can... I
24 can take that one. So councilmember, thank you for
25 those questions. And I certainly understand the...

2 the challenges in your district, I've been on several
3 walkthroughs, both in the Bronx, and the Manhattan
4 parts of your district, specifically focused on this
5 issue. And I'm happy to say that we do have the
6 additional syringe litter staff on board again, after
7 they were cut a year and a half ago, or so. So we do
8 have the six dedicated staff there. We are doing
9 daily patrols in the Bronx, and... and very frequent
10 patrols in East Harlem as well as other places around
11 the city where... where we do see those either 311
12 complaints or... or incoming from elected officials
13 or otherwise. So that's a very important issue for
14 us, and we certainly want to make sure that we're
15 deploying those staff effectively. So if there
16 are... if there are places where you're seeing
17 accumulations of syringes, please let our team know
18 and we'll certainly get them there.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Absolutely. Do you find
20 that six... six... You have six dedicated staffers.
21 Is that enough?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: As I think the
23 commissioner has said before, we can always do more
24 with more, but we're certainly getting to the most
25 problematic locations on a very regular basis.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I appreciate that.

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you so much, Greg.

4 The garbage cans in your district that have
5 disappeared. It's the first I'm hearing of this. I
6 commit to you that I personally will look into it. I
7 know the value of a litter basket in a community, and
8 losing them is a big deal.

9 I will say that if they were taken because they
10 have household trash in them... household trash in
11 litter baskets is a big deal. Part of the reason why
12 we see overflowing litter baskets is not enough
13 service, but the city will never be able to do enough
14 service to make it so that putting houses...

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... or household trash in
17 litter baskets won't cause overflowing conditions. I
18 don't know if we have to do community education,
19 public outreach, but litter baskets are for walking
20 trash only. To the extent people misuse them it
21 creates a problem for everyone. Now I'm not sure
22 that the right course of action is to remove...
23 remove the litter baskets. There are other steps you
24 can take. But I look forward to talking to you
25 offline, understanding where these litter baskets

2 were getting to the bottom, and hopefully restoring
3 them Your service there.

4 Your question on Bruckner Boulevard: If that...
5 it sounds terrible. I haven't experienced the smell
6 myself. But if that is an issue that needs cleaning,
7 we will obviously commit to doing that.

8 Greg, do you have more information in background
9 on Bruckner Boulevard?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, I do.
11 And... and thank you. For that question,
12 Councilmember. It's certainly something that we've
13 heard, particularly in the summer. There is an
14 intermodal facility next to the Oak Point Yard, that
15 does not handle containers of municipal solid waste,
16 but does handle some material that comes out of DEP
17 wastewater treatment plants. And, you know, we've
18 worked with them over the years to try to address
19 those odor concerns. We've also worked with DEP
20 that's something that... that we sit down with them
21 to talk through every summer. And you know, when
22 we... when we notice that there are issues going on,
23 we conduct enforcement as necessary as well. So
24 that's something that we're certainly aware of, and
25 are... (crosstalk)

2 COUNCIL MEMBERS AYALA: That's really important,
3 because if you if you consider where that the
4 placement of that rail yard, the fact that the
5 families that are across the street that include
6 children are already inhaling all of the fumes that
7 are coming from carbon emissions, right? And then on
8 top of it, the entire... that entire area, smells
9 like a garbage can, every single summer. I mean,
10 smells so bad. I felt really bad, you know, because
11 that was the first time I had ever experienced it.
12 And immediately I look left, and I'm like, oh my god,
13 like I couldn't imagine having to live here. And
14 smell that day in and day out.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Councilmember, I think your
16 final question was how are resources broken down?
17 It's really district by district. So by garage.

18 And I think maybe perhaps when you were on... so
19 my background is really in data, and I want to take a
20 very much a data driven approach to allocating
21 resources in the department, how many people work in
22 each garage, how many trucks we have in each garage,
23 those... those types of things and take a fresh look
24 at it. And we are committed to using our resources
25 equitably. Meaning the districts that need it

2 should... should have it and districts that have too
3 much and can do with less should... should do with
4 less. So that's a general high level, how... how
5 it's done and how we plan to do it going forward. I
6 was wondering if you had a more specific question
7 about that?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Well, yeah... I mean...
9 you know, again, what I understand is that, you know,
10 other districts, that are neighboring districts
11 receive a lot more funding, in comparison to East
12 Harlem. Again, because I have a higher density and,
13 you know, problem, and this is not specific to East
14 Harlem. This is the in the Bronx, you know, you
15 can't... I mean, it's horrible. I mean, it is just
16 really, really, really dirty. And I'm not asking. I
17 think we all got 2 street sweeps a day, then we all
18 get 2 street sweeps a day, but is sanitation in a
19 position to identify communities like mine, that
20 obviously need maybe four, right?, because we don't
21 have those resources, my small businesses can pay to
22 have a garbage carted. We obviously, you know, don't
23 have sufficient garbage cans. We have a lot more
24 garbage on our streets than normal. So when we
25 put... we opened the streets now for the restaurants,

2 the most of my restaurants can't even benefit from
3 that, because the rat population is now... you know,
4 surrounding them, because they're looking for garbage
5 that's readily available throughout the community.

6 So I want to know exactly how much each district
7 gets because I would like to know why, you know, why
8 there are disparities that exist in communities like
9 ours. And I appreciate, you know, that you're brand
10 new, and I look forward to working with you on this.
11 I like to be fair, and I know that you just got here.
12 So you know, this is this has nothing to do with you.
13 You're inheriting the situation. But I... I feel
14 that you know, for me, it's really important. And
15 it's for many of my colleagues, the equitability and
16 the distribution of services. But by that, I don't
17 mean that everybody gets the same cut as a pie. By
18 that I mean that our districts all look the same,
19 because the ones that need more are getting more.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I understand and what I...
21 the way I think we should proceed is very soon, like
22 this week, next week, like not two months from now.
23 To sit down and walk you through what the resources
24 are in your district, and understand like more
25 specifically where in the district you're not getting

2 the service that is required, and see what we can do.
3 As we get resources in, we want to allocate them,
4 equitably. Now, the street sweeping is really hard.
5 I'll be really honest, because street sweeping
6 today... meaning to... to change quickly, because
7 there are street sweeping rules, they're all posted,
8 and to change those is a big to do, it's not that we
9 won't do it, we can undertake an analysis, it's just
10 not an immediate thing. So it's hard to add extra
11 street sweeping immediately beyond what's... beyond
12 what's already coming... starting July 5, with the
13 return of alternate side. But we want to sit with
14 you and make sure we understand what the needs are so
15 that we can equitably allocate services across the
16 city.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay. I appreciate that.
18 Thank you so much. Thank you, Chair Nurse.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: All right, thank you. I'll
20 turn it back to you Chair Nurse and Chair Brannan.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you. I just had two or
22 three questions. I know we're all probably losing
23 our brain cells. I haven't eaten. I'm starting to
24 get.... like my head is going crazy. So I'll try to
25 be quick. These are just things I didn't want to ask

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE 346

2 because there was so many people waiting to ask. But
3 on leaf and yard collection. It's great to see
4 there's \$4 million baseline funding for that.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Right.

6 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: But how... can you break that
7 down in terms of, you know, is that across the whole
8 city? Or how many districts is that? How much?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's citywide.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: I know you mentioned it
11 earlier in your...

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, it's a citywide
13 program. Each district gets 2 Sundays a month in the
14 fall season. But it's run over... over four weeks, I
15 think or... or Greg, do you have how long the program
16 is... but it's two... it's two per district. And,
17 Greg, do you have in front of you the tonnage numbers
18 on fall leaf? Or Chief Lohan?

19 Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry. I said I said that
20 this was... was citywide. I meant the 38 leaf
21 districts. So it's not it's not citywide, but it is
22 in the 38 districts that have leafs. Sorry, go ahead
23 Greg.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah. And this
25 past... this past fall, we collected just under 2000

2 tones of leaves. That was an abbreviated program,
3 because of some issues we were having in November.
4 And then previously, we've collected as much as...
5 2017 was 3200 tons, 2019 was 3700 tons. So it can
6 really... it can really be a substantial amount of
7 material collected. It really does depend on the
8 timing of the collections. The leaves fall at
9 different times every year, sometimes they stay on
10 longer. Sometimes they hit the ground in early
11 November. So that's that is a factor.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, great. Um, Stop And
13 Swap. Sorry, I'm just kind of trying to crank
14 through because I know we're all brain dead.

15 What is the budget for the program in the... in
16 FY 23? And then can you give just any anecdotal...
17 or if you have data, kind of, you know, what's the
18 participation, attendance numbers of these events,
19 pre-pandemic versus what we're seeing now? In terms
20 of just effective strategies? Or reuse strategies?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So the Stop And Swap is
22 funded at \$495,000, which we are... we're pleased to
23 get. I have not yet been to a Stop And Swap event.
24 So if Bridget or Greg or Chief Lohan can give some
25 anecdotal details about it.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Sure, yeah.
3 Thank you for that question. We are funded, as the
4 Commissioner has said. Part of that is for one full-
5 time person that we hired last year that wasn't fully
6 baselined. And the remaining just shy of \$400,000 is
7 for our relationship with GrowNYC, who runs the Stop
8 And Swap program. We aim to have one per community
9 board every year, and this year, attendance was
10 highly variable because of COVID, and some of our
11 sites, you know, had to limit participation, but we
12 can see you know, more than 100 people in and out of
13 a Stop And Swap at any one location. They are very
14 much micro programs where we heavily do outreach in
15 the neighborhood, so people can you know, walk their
16 material in and out. Any material that is not
17 actually swapped gets donated to a local donation
18 outlet. So it's a... you know, in the, you know, 10s
19 to 100s, I would say. And it also depends on how
20 large the space is that were able to identify to run
21 the swap.

22 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And how much does an average
23 swap cost to put on?

24

25

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: It's a little
3 bit variable based on... based on the space we get,
4 but I can get back to you with an average cost.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Yeah, I'm just... I
6 would be curious to see like, you know, how much
7 material is being, you know, swapped... or reused,
8 how much material is actually then having to be
9 donated after... just to understand like the
10 effectiveness of this program as a reuse strategy?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: We can provide
12 you that in writing. Absolutely.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. My last question is
14 around Save As You Throw, one of my favorite topics.

15 We did... the council did put in request for -- I
16 can't remember if it's \$1 million or \$2 million at
17 this point -- for a study on it. I know in the past,
18 there was a contractor hired to conduct this study.
19 So before we talk about why or why not it may not be
20 included in the FY 23, is there anything that can be
21 shared from the previous attempt at this? Were there
22 any initial findings or anything that was... or is
23 shareable to the committee?

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The last real look at this
25 was 2014. There were plans to do it in 2017. And

2 then I understand that they got scrapped. So the
3 last study of it is quite old. I'm happy to share
4 it, if you're interested.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I would love that. And
6 anything that... I mean, I know some motion was
7 started in the second attempt, and I know that it was
8 scrapped, but I'm just curious if there was anything
9 that was ever documented or produced in terms of what
10 they started to do, or...

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You and me both. I'm going
12 to get that answer for both of us.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I would love that.
14 Okay, great. Um, you know, I just... you know,
15 curious what you feel about this, and if you think
16 this is something that departments should prioritize,
17 or that the administration should put some funding
18 towards at least studying. We're putting a lot of
19 money into a lot of innovative pilots and other
20 creative strategies. So I'm curious, from your
21 perspective, if this is something that we should work
22 towards investing in.

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um, so we have a lot of
24 studies going on, which we are thrilled to do,
25 because that will very much inform our operations. I

2 think this is definitely a worthwhile thing to study.
3 And certainly, if the last study was in 2014, like
4 refresh and get really smart on. Practically I
5 think, the right place to do it would be around the
6 solid waste management plan. It's... it is a huge...
7 it would represent a huge change to how sanitation
8 works in New York City, and it's not something that I
9 think can or should be... be rushed. And I think it
10 is... it is so big, but it is probably best done as
11 part of the larger plan for New York City.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. Awesome. Well, I
13 know that there is another meeting after this for
14 Chair Brannan. So I'm going to be done. I just want
15 to, you know, finally... just my last word is to
16 advocate for, you know, the rat mitigation zones, the
17 places that haven't had any of the pilot programs,
18 especially East New York, as I just want to uplift,
19 Councilmember Barron's remarks, for some of these
20 smart bins for the schools to have a chance to
21 participate. I think this will be really exciting,
22 especially if we have a site coming up on Rockaway
23 Boulevard there, it could be a really great
24 opportunity to lay the foundation for all the

2 outreach and education that is going to be required
3 to do potentially a universal program.

4 So thank you, again, Commissioner and Deputy
5 Commissioners and all the senior leaders and members.
6 I'm going to pass it back over to Chair Brannan.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Chair Nurse.
8 Yeah, thank you to the commissioner, obviously in
9 your leadership team, for answering all of our
10 questions.

11 You know, if I'm reading between the lines, I
12 think, you know, you agree with a lot of what the
13 council is pushing for, you know, and I hope that OMB
14 makes note of that as well. We are really dedicated
15 to bringing the city back stronger than ever and
16 making sure that our neighborhoods are clean, and
17 that we have equity across the city in every zip
18 code. It is a big part of that recovery and a big
19 part of the way people feel about their
20 neighborhoods. If their neighborhood is clean, they
21 feel a certain way, and we want people to feel like
22 the city is back. And that's why we're fighting so
23 hard for a lot of these restorations in these
24 different programs. So, we look forward to working
25

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

353

2 with you. Going forward again, welcome aboard

3 Commissioner Tisch.

4 And with that, I will adjourn.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

354

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 15, 2022