Committee Staff:

Women & Gender Equity

Brenda McKinney, *Legislative Counsel*

Chloë Rivera, *Senior Legislative Policy Analyst*

Lauren Hunt, *Financial Analyst*

**THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

##### COMMITTEE REPORT OF THE HUMAN SERVICES DIVISION

Andrea Vazquez, *Legislative Director*

Smita Deshmukh*, Deputy Director, Human Services*

**Committee on Women & GEnder Equity**

Hon. Tiffany Cabán, *Chair*

**June 1, 2022**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Proposed Int. No. 179-A:** | By Council Member Moya, Cabán, Stevens, Farías, Richardson Jordan, Menin, Won, De La Rosa, Nurse, Bottcher, Williams |
| **Title:** | A Local Law in relation to a report on the role of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers |

1. **Introduction**

On June 1, 2022, the Committee on Women and Gender Equity, chaired by Council Member Tiffany Cabán, will hold a vote on Proposed Int. No. 179-A, sponsored by Council Member Francisco Moya, in relation to a report on the role of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers. This bill was originally heard at a joint oversight hearing of this Committee, the Committee on Civil Service and Labor, chaired by Council Member Carmen De La Rosa, and the Committee on Economic Development, chaired by Council Member Amanda Farías, on April 19, 2022, regarding *Gender Diversity in the Trades*, at which the Committees heard testimony from the New York City (“NYC” or “City”) Commission on Gender Equity, the Mayor’s Office of Workforce Development (“WKDEV”), the NYC Economic Development Corporation (“NYCEDC”), the NYC Department of Small Business Services (“NYCSBS”), and the NYC Building & Construction Trades Council, as well as advocacy groups and organizations, organized labor, other interested stakeholders and members of the public.

1. **Background**

*The Trades in New York City*

Skilled trade occupations (“trades”), which are typically hands-on jobs that require a particular skillset, knowledge, or ability, provide structured career pathways with high pay and good benefits.[[1]](#footnote-2) Many job titles in the trades do not require a college degree and, instead, require apprenticeship training or moderate to long-term on-the-job training, during which apprentices are paid while learning specialized skills.[[2]](#footnote-3) In NYC, the trades industry encompasses about 130 different construction and non-construction occupations.[[3]](#footnote-4) Among the most common occupations are laborers, carpenters, construction managers, electricians, and pipe-layers and plumbers.[[4]](#footnote-5)

Although the COVID-19 pandemic halted the growth of the United States (U.S.) construction industry in 2020, the industry had been experiencing strong growth.[[5]](#footnote-6) In the nine years prior to the pandemic, the New York State (“New York” or “State”) construction industry added 99,800 jobs at an average annual rate of 3.2 percent.[[6]](#footnote-7) Following a record addition of 406,600 jobs in 2019, the industry lost 44,000 jobs (10.9 percent), falling to 362,200 jobs in 2020.[[7]](#footnote-8) While this was the worst annual decline in more than 25 years, the change was 0.7 percent less severe than the decline seen in the State’s overall total private employment performance.[[8]](#footnote-9) More recently, in October 2021, the New York Building Congress reported an expected resurgence in spending and job creation, projecting the City’s building industry will spend $174.1 billion over the next three years.[[9]](#footnote-10)

From 2010 to 2019, the average salary in the construction industry increased by 20.5 percent, one percent faster than in the overall private sector.[[10]](#footnote-11) By 2020, construction was the fourth highest-paying employment sector in NYC, with an average salary of $87,200, which was 11.5 percent higher than the statewide average.[[11]](#footnote-12) It was also the highest-paid sector among the State’s metropolitan areas.[[12]](#footnote-13) While total wages in construction declined in 2020, for the first time since 2010, the average salary increased by four percent.[[13]](#footnote-14)

In 2019, there was a total of 284,400 workers, of which 73 percent lived in NYC, in the City’s construction industry.[[14]](#footnote-15) Of that total, 53 percent of those jobs were held by immigrants, which is a much higher share than the rest of the State and country.[[15]](#footnote-16) According to the 2020 U.S. Census Bureau’s one-year American Community Survey (“Census Survey”), 66 percent of the construction industry workforce identified as U.S. citizens in 2019.[[16]](#footnote-17) Workers that identified as Hispanic comprised 39 percent of the industry, white workers comprised 37 percent of the industry, Black or African American workers comprised 14 percent, and Asians comprised nine percent.[[17]](#footnote-18) Additionally, over 56 percent of workers had no college experience, which is higher than in any other sector.[[18]](#footnote-19) Lastly, according to the Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater New York (“BCTC”), there are 124,100 unionized construction workers in NYC, representing more than half the workers in the trades.[[19]](#footnote-20)

With regard to gender, women represent a small but growing share of the workers in the construction industry.19 Between 2009 and 2019, the number of women in the industry in the City increased by 63 percent,20 but the percentage decreased from 9.5 percent in 2019 to 8.7 percent in 2020.21 However, data show that the gender pay gap in the industry is much narrower than the national average; 61 percent of women in the industry earn over $50,000 compared to 49 percent of men.22

*Barriers to Recruitment and Retention of Women in the Trades*

Historically, racial and gender discrimination has been prevalent in the construction trades nationally and, in particular, in NYC.[[20]](#footnote-21) Following decades of demonstrations and pressure, including litigation brought under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act by civil rights and community groups, a combination of government monitoring and court and regulatory rulings resulted in some changes to increase diversity in the City’s construction industry.[[21]](#footnote-22) In 2009, a memorandum of understanding was entered into by the BCTC to “promote diversity” in 24 union apprenticeship programs.[[22]](#footnote-23) As a result, by 2012, two-thirds of the City’s 5,743 registered apprentices were people of color and almost 11 percent were women.[[23]](#footnote-24)

Nationally, results from the Institute for Women’s Policy Research’s (IWPR) 2021 Tradeswomen’s Retention and Advancement Survey (“IWPR Survey”) show that the challenge for improving gender diversity in construction apprenticeships is retention as much as recruitment.[[24]](#footnote-25)

While many women who work in the trades have reported feeling respected and enjoying their work and the support and comradery among co-workers, many others face isolation, are held to a different standard than their male co-workers, and must contend with an unsupportive or even hostile work environment.[[25]](#footnote-26) A 2019 NBC News profile of eight women in the City’s construction trades exposed the reality of being a woman in a male-dominated industry, which included issues related to (1) being the only woman on the job, (2) sexual harassment, (3) a lack of separate changing rooms or restrooms at the job site, (4) being passed over for promotions due to concerns that they will miss work to care for their children, and (5) being “berated for working in the industry as a woman.”[[26]](#footnote-27)

Male-dominated workplaces are a risk factor for workplace sexual harassment and assault, and being isolated at work can be alienating and dangerous for women working in the trades.[[27]](#footnote-28) Nationally, the IWPR Survey found that 26.5 percent of respondents reported that they always or frequently experience gender-based harassment, 23.6 percent always or frequently experience sexual harassment, and 21.7 percent of respondents of color reported always or frequently experiencing racial harassment.[[28]](#footnote-29) Relatedly, 19 percent of LGBTQ+ respondents reported that they suffer harassment based on sexual orientation.[[29]](#footnote-30) Overall, 25.2 percent of survey respondents reported that they are always or frequently told that they are on the job solely to fill a quota.[[30]](#footnote-31)

Another result of being a woman in a male-dominated workplace is the feeling of not being treated equally to men.[[31]](#footnote-32) According to the IWPR Survey, 84.4 percent of respondents reported feeling they received unequal treatment to men in at least one aspect of work and learning experiences, such as being held to a different standard, regarding promotions and leadership roles, and in hiring and layoffs.[[32]](#footnote-33) Among women of color in the industry, 47.7 percent reported that they are “rarely or never” held to the same standard as men, and only 18.9 percent felt that they could “frequently or always” rely on basic equality standards and expectations.[[33]](#footnote-34) Black respondents were more likely than others to report rarely or never being treated equally in the allocation of overtime (21.1 percent) and also reported comparatively high inequality when it came to layoffs (31.6 percent) and promotions (36 percent).[[34]](#footnote-35)

Overall, 44.4 percent of the IWPR Survey respondents reported that they have left or seriously considered leaving the trades due to workplace hostility and harassment.[[35]](#footnote-36) The share is particularly high among LGBTQ+ respondents, 54.3 percent of whom have left or seriously considered leaving the industry due to workplace hostility and harassment.[[36]](#footnote-37) The most commonly cited reasons for deciding to leave, by 47.2 percent of respondents, was a lack of respect/harassment, which was ranked as the most important issue by Black and white non-Hispanic respondents, and the second most common reason for Latina respondents.[[37]](#footnote-38) Meanwhile, 32.9 percent of respondents reported that they were tired of the “yelling culture” and disrespect experienced on the job.[[38]](#footnote-39)

While the most frequently cited reasons for women leaving the trades are linked to poor workplace environments,[[39]](#footnote-40) another major contributing factor to women leaving is the difficulty many women face in finding childcare.[[40]](#footnote-41) Though the majority of IWPR Survey respondents were parents thriving in the trades, pregnancy, maternity, and child and eldercare responsibilities presented problems for many tradespeople and lead some to consider leaving the trades.[[41]](#footnote-42) Difficulties surrounding parental leave and childcare costs are amplified for women working in the trades because many jobs are demanding when it comes to the early hours and physical nature of the work.[[42]](#footnote-43) Data also suggest that women have concerns about the availability of accommodations for pregnancies, such as whether paid time off is possible if temporary light duty is not available, and related to being able to find accessible childcare during construction hours.[[43]](#footnote-44) According to the IWPR Survey, 69.1 percent of respondents with children reported that difficulty with finding childcare is a “very or somewhat” important reason for considering leaving.[[44]](#footnote-45) Of those women, 67.7 percent reported they want to spend more time with their kids, 63.4 percent reported that a lack of pregnancy accommodations is/was very or somewhat important for thinking about leaving, and 58.7 percent noted a lack of breastfeeding support.[[45]](#footnote-46)

*The Importance of Unionized Construction Jobs for Women*

 According to the IWPR Survey, over 60 percent of women enter the trades because of the pay and benefits that are available in construction jobs.[[46]](#footnote-47) However, when disaggregating union and non-union respondents, 70.3 percent of union respondents identified earnings as a “very important” reason for entering the trades, versus 53.4 percent of non-union respondents.[[47]](#footnote-48) This difference likely reflects the fact that pay and benefits are substantially higher in construction jobs that are covered by collective bargaining agreements compared to those construction jobs that are not.[[48]](#footnote-49) A national analysis of the full-time earnings of construction workers from 2016 to 2018 found that women not covered by a union contract earned 40.1 percent less than women who were covered by such a contract.[[49]](#footnote-50) Meanwhile, the corresponding gap for men was slightly smaller, at 34 percent.[[50]](#footnote-51)

 The differences between union and non-union respondents were even greater when it came to benefits: 73.8 percent of union respondents described benefits as being very important, compared to 41.8 percent of non-union respondents.[[51]](#footnote-52) Similar to the earnings issue, these responses likely reflect the fact that “good benefits” are much more common in the union sector.[[52]](#footnote-53) According to the Center for Construction Research and Training, data show that 72.2 percent of union construction workers, compared to 38.8 percent of non-union workers, received health insurance.[[53]](#footnote-54) Moreover, union construction workers are also more likely to have access to and participate in retirement plans.[[54]](#footnote-55)

 Finally, outreach is another issue. Despite the opportunities for earnings and benefits, most women learn about jobs in the trades through family and friends.[[55]](#footnote-56) Data suggests that job training programs, high school counselors, and American Job Centers generally fail to alert women to industry opportunities.[[56]](#footnote-57) This, in turn, speaks to the outdated notion that construction is men’s work, which is a mindset that continues to negatively affect women in the industry today.[[57]](#footnote-58)

*The Apprenticeship Pipeline in New York City*

 Trade unions assist in recruiting, training, and educating skilled workers. As many jobs in the trades require apprenticeship- or moderate- to long-term on-the-job training, the training offered by unions can be vital to finding an entry into the industry.[[58]](#footnote-59) Further, union apprenticeships offer opportunities to work while developing skills and earning apprenticeship certificates – which can be “tantamount to a $40,000 - $50,000 technical education program”[[59]](#footnote-60) and can lead to comparatively higher wages.[[60]](#footnote-61) In New York, many of the city’s apprenticeship training programs are supported through the City’s construction industry’s Joint Apprenticeship and Training Committee (JATC), which was developed via collective bargaining between the unions and the city’s developers.[[61]](#footnote-62) The JATC provides apprenticeships, continuing education, training programs, and other types of training for all union members.[[62]](#footnote-63) The lifelong qualifications offered by apprenticeships can act as a pathway to future work in unionized construction anywhere in the country.[[63]](#footnote-64)

While union work can provide a springboard into the middle class, entry into union construction jobs can be challenging for persons unfamiliar with the process.[[64]](#footnote-65) Individuals typically need to apply via apprenticeships which are regulated by the New York State Department of Labor (NYSDOL). NYSDOL sets the standards for “recruitment, education, safety and welfare of apprentices” and issues Certificates of Completion.[[65]](#footnote-66) Applicants can apply either through general recruitment – which is publicized by the union every two or three years – and includes a specific number of spots available in an apprenticeship program; or via so-called “direct-entry” applications, which come via qualified graduates of pre-apprenticeship or veterans programs.[[66]](#footnote-67) Approved pre-apprenticeship and veterans programs include:

1. Construction Skills – for NYC public school students
2. Helmets to Hardhats – for veterans of the U.S. armed forces
3. Non-traditional Employment for Women – for adult women
4. Building Works – for low-income unemployed individuals.[[67]](#footnote-68)

While direct-entry applicants via NYSDOL are also required to have all the requisite skills required for apprenticeships,[[68]](#footnote-69) these approved direct-entry pre-apprenticeship programs ensure people interested in obtaining union jobs can enter the workforce during the interim period between general recruitments.[[69]](#footnote-70)

**III. City-Sponsored Initiatives to Increase Equity and Diversity in the Construction Industry**

*2020 Project Labor Agreements*

In August 2020, former NYC Mayor Bill de Blasio announced an agreement between the City and BCTC on a series of new Project Labor Agreements (“PLA”).[[70]](#footnote-71) A PLA is a comprehensive contract between building trade unions, the City, and site contractors that governs terms and conditions of employment for all craft labor on a designated construction project.[[71]](#footnote-72) In addition, as a pre-hire agreement for various trades working on a project, the PLA establishes uniform terms and conditions such as wages, hours, and work rules, as well as grievance, dispute, and arbitration procedures.[[72]](#footnote-73) The purpose of the agreement is to allow project owners, contractors, and unions to anticipate and avoid problems that increase the costs or slow down a project.[[73]](#footnote-74)

The Citywide Renovation PLA covers renovation construction on City-owned buildings led by a dedicated set of City of agencies and the New Construction PLA covers new construction on selected future projects.[[74]](#footnote-75)Both of these PLAs are valid on active construction projects through 2024. Each PLA also includes an apprenticeship Memorandum of Understanding (“MOU)” requiring that 70 percent of new apprenticeship positions be filled by graduates of certain following pre-apprenticeship programs.[[75]](#footnote-76) These are: (1) public high school students from the Edward J. Malloy Initiative for Construction Skills, (2) veterans referred by New York City Helmets to Hardhats, (3) women of Nontraditional Employment for Women (“NEW”), (4) NYCHA and Section 8 residents, and (5) employees of certain certified Minority and Women-owned Business Enterprises (M/WBEs).[[76]](#footnote-77) Specifically, 15 percent of annual apprenticeship slots are reserved for female graduates of NEW’s pre-apprenticeship program.[[77]](#footnote-78) According to the MOU, the BCTC and the Building Trades Employers Association (“BTEA”) are required to pursue funds to support these goals; namely through pledged support of pre-apprenticeship positions, in order to reach scheduled annual targets for the apprenticeships.[[78]](#footnote-79)

Upon the announcement of the agreement, some expressed skepticism about the deal, charging that the Mayor’s Office did not address whether contractors or the BCTC would be penalized if they failed to meet their targets.[[79]](#footnote-80) The Minority and Women Contractors Developers Association also remained skeptical and emphasized the importance of how the stated goals might interact with other minority and women-owned business targets on publicly-funded projects.[[80]](#footnote-81) However, the de Blasio Administration and the BCTC touted that the PLA would connect low-income New Yorkers and those from marginalized communities with apprenticeship opportunities that will lead to well-paid unionized jobs in the construction industry.[[81]](#footnote-82)

*HireNYC: NYCEDC Development*

In October 2015, Mayor de Blasio announced a new citywide initiative called *HireNYC*, a public-private partnership designed to create new jobs and training opportunities for New Yorkers.[[82]](#footnote-83) According to the de Blasio Administration, *HireNYC* would leverage the City’s purchasing power and public investment in construction and real estate,[[83]](#footnote-84) and ensure that large contracts, which make up over 90 percentof the City’s non-emergency spending, as well as construction and development investments, would help provide New Yorkers with access to thousands of jobs.[[84]](#footnote-85) The citywide initiative was also designed to expand upon targeted hiring programs, while also establishing new guidelines to require employers receiving City contracts – or working on development projects receiving City subsidies – to work with the City’s public workforce.[[85]](#footnote-86) Further, *HireNYC* includes five different programs, applying to different aspects of city business, and each program has differing requirements[[86]](#footnote-87) and requires qualifying developers, general contractors, and sub-contractors to enroll with the *HireNYC portal*[[87]](#footnote-88) and interview qualified candidates who meet the requirements of the entry and mid-level positions associated with the contract.[[88]](#footnote-89)

Under the *HireNYC* initiative, solicitations for NYC Economic Development Corporation (“NYCEDC”) projects valued above $1 million, and NYC Housing Preservation and Development (“HPD”) projects valued above $2 million, also contain new language requiring HireNYC obligations.[[89]](#footnote-90) For example, solicitations for NYCEDC projects above $1 million require qualifying employers hiring for construction-related positions to:

1. Enroll with the *HireNYC* portal within 30 days of the full execution of the contract, in order to attest to upcoming hiring needs;
2. Share information about the new entry and mid-level open positions associated with the contract;
3. Interview the qualified candidates referred by the City; and
4. Report on the individuals interviewed and hired.[[90]](#footnote-91)

Further, while the *HireNYC* stipulations would not require an employer to hire the specific candidates that the City referred, it does require that employers comply with NYCEDC’s process of engagement, including providing an explanation as to why it did not hire the candidates referred by the City and it creates accountability for breach.[[91]](#footnote-92) Namely, pursuant to the program’s guidelines, “liquidated damages of up to $2,500 per breach” will be assessed for not registering with the *HireNYC* Portal in a timely manner, withholding relevant job openings from the City, or failing to interview qualified candidates;[[92]](#footnote-93) while other breaches could lead to an assessment of $500 in liquidated damages and “continued failure may lead to the City holding the Contractor in default of the contract.”[[93]](#footnote-94) Additionally, pursuant to the program, HPD’s affordable housing projects receiving $2 million or more in City subsidy require developers, contractors and sub-contractors to post open construction positions and to consider qualified Workforce1 candidates.[[94]](#footnote-95) Since March 2016, 34 projects have been included in this program.[[95]](#footnote-96)

While the *HireNYC* initiative is considered a local- or low-income hiring program, the program is devoid of geographical or income requirements.[[96]](#footnote-97) Instead, many of *HireNYC*’s programs encourage employers to consider referrals made by the City through the NYCSBS Workforce1 Career Centers.[[97]](#footnote-98) There are an estimated 22 Workforce1 Career Centers spread throughout the city, which serve primarily low-income residents.[[98]](#footnote-99) The City also conducts outreach in neighborhoods near city-supported housing or economic development projects and works with local community-based organizations to help residents get referrals to the *HireNYC* projects through their Workforce1 center.[[99]](#footnote-100) To date, there has been little to no information or data publicly released from which to assess the outcomes *HireNYC Development* program.

**IV. Proposed Int. No 179-A**

 Proposed Int. No. 179-A would require an office designated by the Mayor to submit to the Council and publish online a report containing information about the role of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers no later than July 1, 2023. This report would review the role of women and gender non-binary, non-confirming and intersex workers in nontraditional careers, which would encompass industries that have traditionally hired a higher proportion of male employees, including the construction, utility, maintenance, green and transportation industries. The report would be developed in consultation with various city agencies, individuals who are currently employed in a nontraditional workplace, who work at unions or organizations conducting relevant work or research and at least one representative from a university or similar academic institution with academic experience and expertise in the study and analysis of labor markets and policy.

Since introduction, this bill was amended from requiring the city to create a task force to evaluate the role of women in nontraditional workplaces, such as women in the construction, utilities, maintenance, green, or transportation industries, to requiring a report; and on role of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers. The bill was also amended to clarify that the mayor may choose the office that would create the report, but to also provide more comprehensive guidance on what the city would study, who the city would consult in creating the report the timeline for the report, and to clarify that the information in the report would be included to the possible without revealing personally identifiable information.

**(Intentionally left blank)**

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed Int. No. 179-A By Council Members Moya, Cabán, Stevens, Farías, Richardson Jordan, Menin, Won, De La Rosa, Nurse, Bottcher and Williams A Local Law in relation to a report on the role of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers Be it enacted by the Council as follows: Section 1. a. Definitions. For the purposes of this section, the following terms have the following meanings:Nontraditional careers. The term “nontraditional careers” means industries that have traditionally hired a higher proportion of male employees, including, but not limited to, fields such as the construction, utilities, maintenance, green, and transportation industries.Sustained negative work environment. The term “sustained negative work environment” means a negative, toxic, or hostile work environment or culture due to harassment, assault, or discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation or gender.b. No later than July 1, 2023, a city office to be designated by the mayor shall submit to the council and publish online a report containing the following information about the role of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers:                     1. A comprehensive review of the role of such individuals, including, but not limited to:i. Issues related to recruitment and retention of such individuals;ii. Issues related to sustained negative work environments for such individuals;iii. How these environments value diversity, equity, and inclusion; andiv. Other significant barriers to success for such individuals, where success is indicated by factors including, but not limited to, promotions, raises, continued employment, and reasonable accommodations;2. Where feasible and to the extent possible without revealing personally identifiable information, demographic data related to the status of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers, including, but not limited to, the following information:i. The total number of individuals working in nontraditional careers in the city and the number of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers, for the past ten years, disaggregated by year, gender, sexuality, race, ethnicity, zip code, and age;ii. The total number of individuals in management positions who identify as women or gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers, for the past ten years, disaggregated by year;iii. The average salary of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers, for the past ten years, disaggregated by year, gender, sexuality, race, ethnicity, zip code, and age; andiv. Current actions being taken to promote the inclusion of women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers, in each industry;3. An overview of city resources and information available to such individuals, and an overview of any actions and efforts underway to support such individuals in pursuing, obtaining, succeeding in, and staying in nontraditional careers; and4. Recommendations for potential mechanisms, resources, and avenues to build upon existing resources, strengthen support, and to empower women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers to pursue and succeed in nontraditional careers, including, but not limited to, recommendations for policy and legislation.c. Such report shall be created in consultation with the commission on gender equity, the city commission on human rights, the economic development corporation, the department of small business services, the department of consumer and worker protection, at least three individuals who are currently employed in a nontraditional career, at least two individuals who work at unions or organizations conducting work or research related to women and gender non-binary, non-conforming, and intersex workers in nontraditional careers, and at least one representative from a university or similar academic institution with academic experience and expertise in the study and analysis of labor markets and policy.§ 2. This local law takes effect immediately.     Session 12BMLS# 22885/11/22 7:05 pm |

1. New York State Department of Labor, *The Skilled Trades in New York State*, Division of Research and Statistics 1, 5 (Jun. 2016), *available at* <https://dol.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2021/03/the-skilled-trades-in-new-york-state.pdf#:~:text=As%20noted%20above%2C%20many%20skilled,and%20refrigeration%20mechanics%20and%20installers>. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. New York State Department of Labor, *The Skilled Trades in New York State*, Division of Research and Statistics 1, 5 (June 2016), *available at* <https://dol.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2021/03/the-skilled-trades-in-new-york-state.pdf#:~:text=As%20noted%20above%2C%20many%20skilled,and%20refrigeration%20mechanics%20and%20installers>. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. New York State Comptroller Tom DiNapoli, *The Construction Industry in New York City: Recent Trends and Impact of COVID-19* (Jun. 2021), *available at* <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/reports/osdc/construction-industry-new-york-city-recent-trends-and-impact-covid-19>. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
6. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
7. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
8. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
9. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
10. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
11. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
12. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
13. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
14. New York State Comptroller Tom DiNapoli, *The Construction Industry in New York City: Recent Trends and Impact of COVID-19* (June 2021), *available at* <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/reports/osdc/construction-industry-new-york-city-recent-trends-and-impact-covid-19>. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
15. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
16. New York Building Congress, *COU: Workforce Snapshot 2022* (Mar. 2022), *available at* <https://www.buildingcongress.com/advocacy-and-reports/reports-and-analysis/construction-outlook-update/COU-Workforce-Snapshot-2022.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
17. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
18. New York State Comptroller Tom DiNapoli, *The Construction Industry in New York City: Recent Trends and Impact of COVID-19* (June 2021), *available at* <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/reports/osdc/construction-industry-new-york-city-recent-trends-and-impact-covid-19>. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
19. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
20. Lawrence Mishel, *Diversity in the New York City Union and Nonunion Construction Sectors*, Economic Policy Institute (Mar. 2, 2017), *available at* <https://www.epi.org/publication/diversity-in-the-nyc-construction-union-and-nonunion-sectors/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
21. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
22. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
23. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
24. Ariane Hegewisch and Eve Mefferd, *A Future Worth Building: What Tradeswomen Say about the Change They Need in the Construction Industry*, Institute for Women’s Policy Research (2021), *available at* <https://iwpr.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/A-Future-Worth-Building_What-Tradeswomen-Say_FINAL.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
25. Ariane Hegewisch and Eve Mefferd, *A Future Worth Building: What Tradeswomen Say about the Change They Need in the Construction Industry*, Institute for Women’s Policy Research (2021), *available at* <https://iwpr.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/A-Future-Worth-Building_What-Tradeswomen-Say_FINAL.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
26. Sarah Jackson, ‘Not the boy’ club anymore’: Eight women take a swing at the construction industry, NBC News (Nov. 29, 2019), *available at* <https://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/not-boys-club-anymore-eight-women-take-swing-construction-industry-n1091376>. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
27. Ariane Hegewisch and Eve Mefferd, *A Future Worth Building: What Tradeswomen Say about the Change They Need in the Construction Industry*, Institute for Women’s Policy Research (2021), *available at* <https://iwpr.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/A-Future-Worth-Building_What-Tradeswomen-Say_FINAL.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
28. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
29. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
30. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
31. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
32. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
33. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
34. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
35. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
36. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
37. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
38. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
39. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
40. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
41. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
42. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
43. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
44. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
45. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
46. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
47. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
48. Ariane Hegewisch and Eve Mefferd, *A Future Worth Building: What Tradeswoman Say about the Change They Need in the Construction Industry*, Institute for Women’s Policy Research (2021), *available at* [https://iwpr.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/A-Future-Worth-Building\_What-Tradeswomen-Say\_FINAL.pdf.](https://iwpr.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/A-Future-Worth-Building_What-Tradeswomen-Say_FINAL.pdf.%20%20)  [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
49. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
50. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
51. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
52. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
53. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
54. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
55. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
56. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
57. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-58)
58. Lawrence Mishel, *Diversity in the New York City union and nonunion construction sectors*, Economic Policy Institute (Mar. 2, 2017), *available at* <https://www.epi.org/publication/diversity-in-the-nyc-construction-union-and-nonunion-sectors/>; *See* Kim Slowey, *NYC Unions Recruiting More Women* (Mar. 27, 2019), *available at* <https://www.constructiondive.com/news/nyc-unions-recruiting-more-women/551326/> (noting that [prior to the pandemic] the recruitment of women into New York City union apprenticeship programs was up 50 percent); Kathleen Culhane and Gary Labarbera, *Construction Unions Making Commitment to Recruit Women* (Mar. 20, 2019), *available at* <https://commercialobserver.com/2019/03/construction-unions-making-commitment-to-recruit-women/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-59)
59. Columbia University School of International and Public Affairs, *Construction Skills Report*, 1, 10 (2014) *available at* <https://sipa.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/Columbia_SIPA_Construction_Skills_Report_Final_March_2014_0.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-60)
60. Just as the cost of construction in NYC greatly outpaces the same costs in comparable American cities – so too do union wages for labor. As of 2014 a union carpenter in NYC earned $74.81 per hour, compared to $61.97 and $61.45 in Boston and Philadelphia, respectively. *See* Ester Fuchs, Dorian Warren & Kimberly Bayer, *Expanding Opportunity For Middle Class Jobs in New York City*, Columbia University School of International and Public Affairs, at 10 (Mar 2014), *available at* <https://sipa.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/Columbia_SIPA_Construction_Skills_Report_Final_March_2014_0.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-61)
61. *See* JATC, *About* (last visited Apr. 14, 2022), *available at* <http://www.jeojatc.com/about.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-62)
62. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-63)
63. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-64)
64. *Id.* at 12. [↑](#footnote-ref-65)
65. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-66)
66. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-67)
67. *Id*.; *see also* Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater New York, *Apprenticeship Readiness Collective* (last visited Apr. 12, 2022), *available at* <http://www.nycbuildingtrades.org/arc.aspx>. [↑](#footnote-ref-68)
68. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-69)
69. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-70)
70. New York City Mayor’s Office, *Mayor’s Office Announces Community Hiring Economic Justice Plan* (Aug. 13, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/588-20/mayor-de-blasio-community-hiring-economic-justice-plan>. [↑](#footnote-ref-71)
71. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-72)
72. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-73)
73. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-74)
74. Esther Fuchs, Dorian Warren, Kimberly Bayer, *Expanding Opportunity for Middle Class Jobs in New York City,* Columbia University (March 2014), *available at* <https://sipa.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/Columbia_SIPA_Construction_Skills_Report_Final_March_2014_0.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-75)
75. Mayor’s Office of Contract Services, *Project Labor Agreement Covering Specified New Construction of Identified City Owned Buildings and Structures 2020-2024* (Aug. 12, 2020) *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/mocs/downloads/pdf/pla/2020_New_Construction_PLA_Agency_Solicitation_Version.PDF> [↑](#footnote-ref-76)
76. Mayor’s Office of Contract Services, *Project Labor Agreement Covering Specified New Construction of Identified City Owned Buildings and Structures 2020-2024* (Aug. 12, 2020) *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/mocs/downloads/pdf/pla/2020_New_Construction_PLA_Agency_Solicitation_Version.PDF>. [↑](#footnote-ref-77)
77. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-78)
78. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-79)
79. Kathryn Brenzel, *City Construction Unions Strike Deal to Hire Low-Income Workers,* The Real Deal (August 13, 2020), *available at* <https://therealdeal.com/2020/08/13/city-construction-unions-strike-deal-to-hire-low-income-workers/> [↑](#footnote-ref-80)
80. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-81)
81. *Id.* at 1. [↑](#footnote-ref-82)
82. New York City Press Office, *De Blasio Administration Launches HireNYC to Help New Yorkers Access Jobs Through the City's Purchases and Investments* (Press Release) (Oct. 27, 2015), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/760-15/de-blasio-administration-launches-hirenyc-help-new-yorkers-access-jobs-the-city-s>. [↑](#footnote-ref-83)
83. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-84)
84. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-85)
85. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-86)
86. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-87)
87. HireNYC Portal (last visited Apr 15, 2022), *available at* <https://a801-worksource1.nyc.gov/emp>. [↑](#footnote-ref-88)
88. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-89)
89. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-90)
90. The City of New York, *HireNYC – Career Paths*, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/careerpathways/strategy/hireNYC.page> (last visited 4/18/2022). [↑](#footnote-ref-91)
91. The City of New York, *HireNYC: NYCEDC Development for Construction Positions*, 1-2, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/careerpathways/downloads/pdf/edc_construction.pdf> (last visited 4/18/2022). [↑](#footnote-ref-92)
92. *Id*. at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-93)
93. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-94)
94. HireNYC, *What is HireNYC and How Will It Apply to HPD-Financed Development*, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/careerpathways/downloads/pdf/hpd_construction.pdf> (last visited 4/18/2022). [↑](#footnote-ref-95)
95. Mayor’s Office of Operations, *New York City Mayor’s Management Report*, at 8 (Sept. 2016), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/operations/downloads/pdf/mmr2016/2016_mmr.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-96)
96. Abigail Savitch-Lew, *The Data on HireNYC,* City Limits (Nov. 21, 2017), *available at* <https://citylimits.org/2017/11/21/the-data-on-hirenyc/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-97)
97. Abigail Savitch-Lew, *The Data on HireNYC,* City Limits (Nov. 21, 2017), *available at* <https://citylimits.org/2017/11/21/the-data-on-hirenyc/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-98)
98. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-99)
99. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-100)