

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

March 24, 2022

Start: 10:15 a.m.

Recess: 10:47 a.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Speaker Adams
- Diana Ayala
- Charles Barron
- Gale A. Brewer
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- David M. Carr
- Amanda Farías
- Kamillah Hanks
- Crystal Hudson
- Ari Kagan
- Farah N. Louis
- Francisco P. Moya
- Chi A. Ossé
- Keith Powers

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONT.)

Pierina Ana Sanchez
Marjorie Velázquez
Julie Won

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S

Michael Blaise Backer
SBS, Deputy Commissioner, Neighborhood
Development

Roxanne Earley
SBS Director, BID Program, Neighborhood
Development

Yazmin Cruz
Representing Anthony DeRosa
Castle Hill Avenue

William Rivera
Bronx CB9

Susanna Aaron
Property Owner/resident and Steering Committee,
West Village BID

Brooke Schooley
West Village BID Steering Committee

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1

2

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, good morning.

3

Welcome to today's Finance Committee Meeting. I'm

4

Council Member Justin Brannan and I'm privileged to

5

Chair the Finance Committee. We are joined today by

6

Speaker Adams, Council Members Hanks, Ossé, Farias,

7

Louis, Barron, Hudson, Brewer, Brooks-Powers, Carr,

8

Kagan and Ayala.

9

Today, the Committee will be voting on two items.

10

An Article 11 Property Tax Exemption and one bid

11

related Resolution. In addition, we'll be holding a

12

public hearing in Introduction 0047 and 0073, to

13

authorize the establishment of the Castle Hill and

14

the West Village Business Improvement Districts

15

respectively.

16

So, let's start with the Land Use item, which is

17

the Southern & Willis project in Council Member

18

Ayala's District in Manhattan. The properties will

19

receive a full 40 year property tax exemption to

20

preserve 76 units of affordable housing. Council

21

Member Ayala is supportive of the project in the

22

Bronx, sorry. Oh, my God. You'll never forgive me

23

for that.

24

Next, we have the Bid Resolution. It sets forth

25

April 7, 2022, at 10 a.m. in this Committee Room as

1
2 the date, time and place to hold a public hearing to
3 consider the Local Law that would increase the amount
4 to be expended annually in the Sutphin Boulevard
5 Business Improvement District. Extend the boundaries
6 of the BID, Change the method of district charge
7 assessment, increase the maximum total amount to be
8 expended for improvements and it would dissolve the
9 boundaries of the existing 165th Street and Jamaica
10 Center Special Assessment Districts.

11 The existing BID and the proposed expanded
12 boundaries are located in Council Member Williams and
13 Gennaro's district in Queens and runs adjacent to
14 Speaker Adams district as well. All Council Members
15 including the Speaker are supportive of the amended
16 district plan.

17 Speaker Adams, you want to give some remarks.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Sure.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much Mr. Chair and
21 good morning everyone. Just once again to show my
22 full support for the Sutphin BID Integration. It's
23 been a long time coming. As past Chair of the
24 Jamaica Now Project, this is something that we've
25 been looking forward to for a very, very long time.

1
2 Funds and movement around the Jamaica Corp. has
3 started years ago but of course, the pandemic did
4 slow everything down. This consolidation of the BID
5 between conceivably three different districts in
6 Southeast Queens. It's going to make a substantial
7 difference to the merchants, to the look, to the
8 businesses in the downtown Jamaica Corp and I fully
9 support this and encourage my colleagues to support
10 it as well. Thank you Mr. Chair for the time.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Speaker. Uhm, and
12 lastly the Committee today will be holding a public
13 hearing on Introduction Numbers 0047 and 0076, which
14 would authorize the establishment of the Castle Hill
15 and the West Village Business Improvement Districts
16 respectively.

17 Additional information regarding the BID
18 establishments can be found in the Committee Reports
19 prepared by the Council's Finance Division and
20 reports prepared by the City Planning Commission.
21 Council Members Farias and Bottcher are supportive of
22 the BID items in their respective districts.

23 So, today we'll hear from any witnesses who wish
24 to testify. Once we've heard any testimony, we'll
25 then adjourn the hearing for at 30-days to allow any

1
2 property owner within the proposed area of the BID to
3 file an objection to the BID's establishment with the
4 City Clerk.

5 In the absence of any objections filed either by
6 a majority of all the impacted property owners or by
7 property owners owning a majority of the assessed
8 value of the property within the proposed BIDS, the
9 Committee and the full Council may adopt a
10 legislation establishing the BIDS. In order to do
11 so, the Committee and the full Council must be
12 prepared to answer the following four questions in
13 the affirmative for each BID: One, where all notices
14 of hearing for all hearings required to be held,
15 published and mailed as so required?

16 Two, does all the real property within the
17 districts boundaries benefit from the establishment
18 or the expansion of the district, except as otherwise
19 provided by the law?

20 Three, is all real property benefitted by the
21 district included within the district? And lastly,
22 is the establishment or expansion of the district in
23 the best interest of the public?

24 If the Committee and the full Council find in the
25 affirmative on these four questions, the number of

1
2 objections required to prevent the establishment of
3 the BIDS are not filed, then the legislation can be
4 adopted.

5 For further details on the Castle Hill and the
6 West Village BIDs, please refer to the Committee
7 Reports, the City Planning Commission Reports and the
8 Proposed District Plans. Before we proceed with
9 testimony on the proposed BID establishments, I need
10 to acknowledge on the record that the Council had
11 recently become aware of a drafting clerical error in
12 Exhibit to the District plan for the West Village BID
13 submitted by the Department of Small Business
14 Services or SBS.

15 This error, this clerical error miscategorized
16 some of the blocks and lots included within the BID
17 boundaries and the assessment method that would
18 apply. Because this clerical error is inconsistent
19 with the rest of the plan, Council Staff do not
20 expect that any of the plan supporters knew of or
21 relied upon such information. I understand that SBS
22 is prepared to address this error with a revised
23 exhibit and that they will send notice of the update
24 to affected property owners so that there can be no
25

1
2 confusion when we reconvene in May to vote on the
3 establishment of the proposed BID.

4 So, we'll now hear testimony from SBS on the
5 Castle Hill and the West Village BIDS and we are
6 joined today - okay, and we're joined today by the
7 Deputy Commissioner for the neighborhood development
8 Michael Blaise Backer and the Director for the New
9 York City Business Improvement District Program
10 Roxanne Earley.

11 Before SBS begins, I'm going to turn it over to
12 my Committee Counsel to swear in the witnesses.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning Mr. Backer and
14 Ms. Earley. Do you affirm that the testimony you
15 will give to us today is truthful to the best of your
16 knowledge, information and belief?

17 MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: I do.

18 ROXANNE EARLEY: I do.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. You may proceed
20 when ready.

21 MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: Thank you. Good Morning
22 Chair Brannan and member of the Finance Committee,
23 Speaker Adams. I am Michael Blaise Backer, Deputy
24 Commissioner of Neighborhood Development at the
25 Department of Small Business Services. I am joined

1
2 by our BID Program Director Roxanne Earley and we are
3 here to testify in support of the Proposed Castle
4 Hill Business Improvement District.

5 Throughout the pandemic and recovery, SBS has
6 been a key provider of programs, services and
7 critical information to small businesses and
8 commercial corridors alike. Most recently, my team
9 has focused on improving interagency coordination to
10 address public safety and quality of life challenges
11 and ensuring a strong, economic recovery for our
12 commercial districts. We believe that these efforts
13 are central to supporting BIDs, who are valuable and
14 proven partners in fostering the vitality of the
15 city's neighborhoods and commercial districts.

16 In addition to our role overseeing and supporting
17 the city's existing network of 76 BIDs, SBS also
18 supervises the BID formation and expansion process,
19 serving as an advisor and resource for communities
20 interested in developing or expanding BIDs. We work
21 closely with each steering committee to follow a
22 transparent process that solicits community input and
23 can demonstrate broad based support through
24 comprehensive outreach.
25

1
2 Moreover, we are cognizant of the unique nature
3 of each community we assist and empower local
4 stakeholders to make determinations on the proposed
5 services, the boundaries, budget size and the formula
6 that distributes the assessment in an equitable
7 manner. When working with any BID formation effort,
8 we recognize that the power and effectiveness of BIDs
9 rests in their unmatched understanding of local needs
10 and issues.

11 Beginning in January 2017, the Castle Hill
12 formation effort involved numerous meetings and
13 consultations with local stakeholders throughout the
14 planning and outreach phases. After an extensive
15 outreach effort and close coordination with all key
16 parties, SBS determined that the documented support
17 among all stakeholder groups, including over 50
18 percent of the areas total assessed value was
19 sufficient to submit their application to City
20 Council.

21 In light of COVID, SBS requested the Castle Hill
22 Steering Committee conduct additional outreach above
23 and beyond the traditional requirements.
24 Specifically, we requested that the Committee send
25 notifications to all stakeholders in the district and

1
2 provide an opportunity to get feedback or withdraw
3 support due to any impacts from the pandemic. Before
4 beginning the formal legislative process, Castle Hill
5 conducted additional mailings and outreach in the
6 areas and were able to confirm continued majority
7 support for these formations. No stakeholders
8 withdrew their support for this formation.

9 As required by law, the Castle Hill Steering
10 Committee mailed the summary of the City Council
11 Resolution, no less than ten days and no more than 30
12 days before today's hearing, to property owners and
13 tenants of the proposed district.

14 Furthermore, SBS arranged for the publication of
15 a copy of the summary of the Resolution at least once
16 in the City record.

17 I'd additionally like to acknowledge and thank
18 Council Member Farias for her support of the Castle
19 Hill BID formation effort.

20 Lastly, I'd like to acknowledge that
21 representatives of the BID formation effort are here
22 present today to testify and address any specific
23 questions that I am unable to answer.

24 At this time, I'm happy to take any questions.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Any members have questions?

Okay, thank you.

MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: Did you want us to do West Village now or wait for the -

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Why don't we bring up the Castle Hill representatives and then you can return. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. So, I will now hear from the Chair of the West Village Steering Committee. Oh, we're going to do Castle Hill now. Okay. We're going to hear from the Castle Hill Steering Committee, so Yasmin Cruz on behalf of Tony DeRosa and Steering Committee Member William Rivera. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We don't need to swear you in, so you can begin when ready.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You can begin when you are ready, we don't have to swear you in. Thank you.

YASMIN CRUZ: Great, I'm representing Anthony DeRosa, Property and Business Owner in the Castle Hill. He is also a member of the Castle Hill BID Avenue Steering Committee.

I have been a commercial property owner since 1983 in addition to being a business owner on Castle

1
2 Hill Avenue. Castle Hill Avenue has always been a
3 diverse working class community. A neighborhood
4 proud of its position in the Bronx. For as long as I
5 can remember, Castle Hill Avenue has been a part of
6 my life. The avenue was always busy with shoppers.
7 The streets were well kept and clean and there was a
8 variety of desired businesses. Each complementing
9 the others.

10 There was shopping at any time and no fear of
11 walking the avenue. Today, there are many vacant
12 storefront. Popular Bank has closed and the large
13 retail Rainbow Shop will be closing its doors soon.
14 I know Castle Hill Avenue can once again be a more
15 engaging area of shopping and activity. I have seen
16 the success that our neighboring merchants at
17 Westchester Square and Morris Park have had in their
18 BID and I believe that the BID formation for Castle
19 Hill Avenue would be a great asset in improving the
20 overall shopping district and the community.

21 The needs of the shopping district are
22 substantial. Most importantly, immediately getting
23 the streets and sidewalks cleaned. The garbage is a
24 huge problem. The trash and dumping along the
25 commercial corridors has become overwhelming. The

1
2 program will clean street sidewalks and graffiti free
3 walls, snow removal and crosswalks and at bus
4 shelters. Also, the additional flower and plant beds
5 along with additional enhanced pedestrian trash free
6 cycles would have an immediate impact.

7 Services would include marketing and promoting
8 the commercial corridor, events to promote foot
9 traffic, social media and internet tools for the
10 merchants. Improved street lighting with increase
11 security to help create a safer shopping environment.

12 Wi-Fi hotspots, emergency street telephones,
13 closed circuit surveillance, may be considered
14 especially during the holiday shopping period to
15 improve pedestrian circulation. Merchants and
16 property owners need support navigating the numerous
17 New York City and New York State laws and
18 requirements.

19 With an advocate in place, merchants and property
20 owners will have direct access to assistance and
21 guidance for loans, grants and storefront improvement
22 programs. There has been an overwhelming support
23 from the local community since the steering committee
24 was formed in 2017. Meeting monthly and working
25

1
2 diligently over the past four years to achieve our
3 goal of the Castle Hill BID.

4 We would like to thank everyone for their time
5 and consideration and support of the Castle Hill BID.
6 As we firmly support and believe that the formation
7 of this BID, Castle Hill Avenue will develop into a
8 cleaner, safer and prosperous area for all involved.
9 Thank you again.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Any of my
11 members have questions? Okay, thank you so much.

12 Mr. Rivera, you can speak as well if you'd like.
13 Of course, yeah.

14 WILLIAM RIVERA: Thank you Mr. Chairman and
15 Council Members. I'm a member of the Committee, this
16 Committee established in 2017. I was the Chairman of
17 the Committee Board, thank you, when this started.
18 Now, the District Manager of Community Board 9. I
19 just want to thank SBS and the Steering Committee for
20 all the great work gathering support from elected
21 officials, our current Council Member, we thank you
22 for your support and this is something that's
23 extremely needed in our district. We have the
24 largest district by population in the Bronx. We have
25 currently no BID in our Community Board. This will

1
2 be the first BID and we're excited. I've seen the
3 work that they've done at Westchester Square BID,
4 Morris Park and 3rd Avenue and this is something
5 that's really needed. I'm looking forward to working
6 with our future BID and with Sanitation, policing
7 issues, security, etc..

8 This is something that's extremely needed. Our
9 Community Board supports it. Our land and Zoning
10 Economic Development Committee supports it and
11 hopefully we have your support. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you and thanks for
13 all your work on the Steering Committee putting this
14 together. I want to acknowledge; we've been joined
15 by Council Members Moya and Powers and we're going to
16 call back up Deputy Commissioner Blaise Backer and
17 the Business Improvement District Program Director
18 Roxanne Earley again to speak about the West Village
19 Bid. Thank you.

20 MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: Great. Thank you. Good
21 morning again Chair Brannan and members of the
22 Finance Committee. I am still Michael Blaise Backer,
23 Deputy Commissioner of Neighborhood Development and
24 I'm joined by Roxanne Earley, Director of the BID
25 Program. And for brevity, I have omitted some

1
2 sections from my oral testimony, which are redundant
3 to my previous testimony for Castle Hill.

4 The West Village formation effort began in 2018
5 and involved numerous meetings and consultations with
6 local stakeholders throughout the planning and
7 outreach phases. After an extensive outreach effort
8 and close coordination with all key parties, SBS
9 determined that the documented support among all
10 stakeholder groups, including 50 percent of the areas
11 commercial assessed value providing written support
12 in favor, was sufficient to submit the application to
13 City Council.

14 A majority of the outreach phase for this project
15 was conducted during the pandemic with roughly half
16 of all property ownership support confirmed after
17 March of 2020. Before beginning the formal
18 legislation process, West Village conducted
19 additional mailings and outreach to residential and
20 commercial tenants and were able to confirm continued
21 support for the effort from early respondents, as
22 well as additional support from previously
23 unresponsive stakeholders who saw the value the BID
24 would bring to the district despite the impacts of
25 the pandemic.

1
2 Finally, as part of the City Planning Commission
3 review process, the BID has also secured approval
4 from Manhattan Community Board 2.

5 As required by law, the West Village Steering
6 Committee mailed the summary of the City Council
7 Resolution, nor less than ten days and no more than
8 30 days before today's hearing to property owners and
9 tenants of the proposed district. Furthermore, SBS
10 arranged for the publication of a copy of the summary
11 of the Resolution at least once in the city record.

12 As Chair Brannan alluded earlier, SBS has been
13 made aware of a clerical error in Exhibit C of the
14 West Village District Plan whereby the list of
15 benefitted properties have been incorrectly
16 classified. I've included a copy of the correct
17 benefitted property list with my testimony today and
18 furthermore, SBS will file an amendment to the
19 district plan on file with the City Clerk and re-
20 notice these changes in the City Record.

21 I would also like to acknowledge and thank
22 Council Member Erik Bottcher for his ongoing support
23 of the West Village BID formation effort.

24 I'd lastly like to acknowledge the
25 representatives of the BID formation effort are

1
2 present here today to testify and address any
3 specific questions I am unable to answer. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Are there any
5 questions from members?

6 I just want to acknowledge we've been joined by
7 Council Member Velázquez and Council Member Brewer
8 has a question.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I
10 know there's a lot of support. I think the SOHO BID
11 is the only one that has not a majority but several
12 residents. How is it going to work in terms of
13 residents on your BID?

14 MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: Uhm, actually, so, I
15 certainly think the Steering Committee could address
16 some of the specifics but it's worth noting. So,
17 about 15 BID's of our 76 actually have an explicit
18 residential assessment. So, I know it's -

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I only know Manhattan.

20 MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: I'm sorry?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: It's a joke. I only know
22 Manhattan.

23 MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: Oh, fair enough. Fair
24 enough. A lot of them are in Manhattan. I mean
25 obviously they are some of the early BID's. But it's

1
2 also worth noting that uhm, and then also several
3 BID's of course incorporate assess value and
4 therefore I will also have a residential assessment.

5 So, in this case, you know as you are well aware,
6 certainly by law, the BID law requires one
7 residential tenant but because property owners must
8 be in the majority on a BID board, those property
9 owners can be commercial property owners or
10 residential property owners.

11 So, it really would take place you know during
12 the annual meeting each year when they nominate a
13 slate to participate on the board. That's like and
14 those property owners can be residential or
15 commercial and so, it really would be up to the board
16 to make that determination.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So, it wasn't an issue as
18 it was at SOHO? It didn't become an issue.

19 MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: Not that I'm aware of.
20 Exactly, I think in this case as the Steering
21 Committee can attest to, that residents were if
22 anything, spearheaded this effort early on and we
23 have been very involved throughout.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Thank you Mr.
25 Chair.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHAEL BLAISE BACKER: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Are there other questions?

Okay, SBS, thank you so much.

Okay, so now we'll hear from the Chair of the West Village Steering Committee Brooke Schooley. I'm sorry if I pronounced that wrong. And Steering Committee Member Susanna Aaron. And you can begin when you are ready.

BROOKE SCHOOLEY: I'm Brooke Schooley, is this on? There we go. I'm Brooke Schooley, a West Village property owner and Chair of the West Village BID Steering Committee.

In 2014, I founded the 7th Avenue South Alliance, a nonprofit that provided clean and green services to the neighborhood through 2020. In 2017, our Board identified a BID as a more sustainable way to provide supplemental services. We formed a BID Steering Committee and began surveying businesses and residents in-person, online and by mail about the needs of the community.

The mission of this BID is to support a culturally rich commercially vibrant community reflecting the West Villages history and character. This is a very mixed use, popular destination

1
2 neighborhood with primarily ground floor commercial
3 space, a heavy concentration of restaurants and bars,
4 and sanitation needs exceed the basic services
5 provided by the city.

6 Accordingly, the majority of the BID's, nearly
7 \$600,000 budget will go to clean and green services.
8 The goal of this small BID is not to further
9 commercialize the village and our limited budget
10 mission and planned services are certainly reflective
11 of that. This is a lean, clean, green BID.

12 The median commercial property owner will pay
13 just over \$100 on a monthly basis and that modest
14 assessment has made this very appealing to our small
15 businesses. Residential owners will pay a flat \$100
16 per year, per tax lot. That is going to cover about
17 ten percent of the BID budget and we felt it was
18 really important that residents contribute
19 financially. We are, like I said, a truly mixed use
20 district where residents will benefit from these
21 services and by resolution of the Community Board,
22 they will enjoy outsized board representation at the
23 BID.

24 We've completed significant community outreach,
25 including extensive work to call or email every

1
2 property owner. We reached almost 90 percent of the
3 commercial property owners, most of whom are small
4 enterprises or individuals. We have a very
5 fragmented holding in the village and make in person
6 visits to the businesses.

7 Additionally, we've sent three mailings to all
8 property owners and tenants and extra mailings to
9 owners unreachable by phone or email, distributed
10 flyers, held two public meetings, received coverage
11 from the Village Sun, as recently as last month,
12 posted information on Next Door and Bleeker Street
13 Beat, sent nearly 40 emails to our distribution of
14 over 1,000 stakeholders and had local Block
15 Association spread the word via news letter and
16 sidewalk display boxes. We also participated in a
17 public information session hosted by CB2 in addition
18 to last years two official public CB2 hearings.

19 As Blaise said, we have signed statements of
20 support from property owners representing the
21 majority of the commercial assessed value. Over 60
22 residential property owners and over 100 mostly small
23 businesses and residential tenants.

24 Those few owners and tenants opposing the BID in
25 writing comprise less than one percent of assessed

1
2 value and no one has spoken in opposition in any
3 public forum.

4 CB2 supported the BID almost unanimously with
5 only one member opposing. We have letters of support
6 from the Block Associations representing Grove,
7 Barrow, Bedford, Carmine, Commerce and Downing
8 Streets as well as 7th Avenue South. And I want to
9 say that Kathy Donaldson, the longtime President of
10 the largest Block Association in the BID is here
11 today in support.

12 We also have letters of support from State
13 Senator Holyman, State Representative Glick, and our
14 Council Member Bottcher. We hope that you will allow
15 us to move forward. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Any questions
17 from members? Majority Whip Powers.

18 MAJORITY WHIP BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you and just
19 you know of course not being fully versed in the
20 demographics of that community. Was the information
21 that has been disseminated shared in other language
22 outside of English and if so, which languages?

23 BROOKE SCHOOLEY: Uhm, no communications were
24 made outside of English.

1
2 MAJORITY WHIP BROOKS-POWERS: Do you know if in
3 the community there, if there is a population that
4 speaks other languages outside of English as their
5 primary language?

6 BROOKE SCHOOLEY: Uhm, I did not encounter that
7 in my outreach to certainly to property owners and
8 like I said, we did reach almost 90 percent of them.
9 Uhm, when we went to small businesses or went to all
10 the businesses, we were able to speak in person, in
11 English, if not the first time, the second time. Uh,
12 you know finding the owner or someone there. So, no,
13 we have not seen that to be an issue.

14 MAJORITY WHIP BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I only
15 ask because I know that there have been times where
16 there have been big projects and the assumption has
17 been that the merchants are in support but when you
18 go back to them, you find that English is not
19 necessarily a first language and they haven't fully
20 taken in what's being asked of them.

21 So, I just wanted to ask that just from personal
22 experience. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Other questions. Okay,
24 thank you so much.

25 SUSANNA AARON: Yeah, can you hear me?

1

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Oh, I'm sorry, go ahead.

2

3

SUSANNA AARON: Hi, I'm Susanna Aaron. Thank you guys for this opportunity to speak. I'm a lifelong Greenwich Village resident and a current property owner. I've served on Community Board 2 for almost ten years where I currently Chair the Human Services Committee. I've been involved with my community in many ways. At various times, working with Village shop owners to bring the history of the Stonewall rebellion to Christopher Street. Introducing city officials to some of our legacy businesses and representing my community, my community board on plans to turn Christopher Street Park into the nation's first LGBT national monument.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I also serve on the Steering Committee for the West Village BID and the reason I join this effort is because one of the cornerstones of its mission is to preserve neighborhood character. It will bring needed beautification and enhanced sanitation to this area that welcomes so many visitors from throughout our city and our nation and the world but it will not do this at the expense of the local value that we all hold dear. Greenwich Village as you know, was the model for Jane Jacob's transformational views on

1
2 urban planning. It's mix of uses and architecture
3 and people. It's vibrant street life. These
4 qualities endure in the village despite the great
5 change the neighborhood has undergone in the 60 years
6 that I have lived here. Its history is still a very
7 precious part of who we are.

8 I think that this BID will if anything, offer
9 opportunities to enhance that history for new
10 generations. The role played by residential property
11 owners, the fact that they too will be assessed,
12 ensures that the people who live here every day are
13 going to have a strong voice in the BID's activities.

14 I urge you to support the very good work that the
15 Committee has done and thank you so much for
16 considering this initiative.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Susanna and
18 Brooke for all your hard work. Okay, if there are no
19 other questions, we'll include the SBS's updated
20 Exhibit, the benefitted properties on the record.
21 And if there are no other questions, I'm going to ask
22 Billy Martin, the Committee Clerk to call the roll.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Good morning. William Martin,
24 Committee Clerk roll call vote Committee on Finance
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

on Resolution and Land Use Item, items are coupled.
Chair Brannan?

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Ayala?
COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Moya?
COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Powers?
COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Louis?
COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Brooks-Powers?
COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer?
COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Farias?
COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Hanks?
COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Hudson?
COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Kagan?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ossé?

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Velázquez?

COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Carr?

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 15 in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions, both items have been adopted by the Committee.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. With that, this hearing is adjourned. [GAVEL]

[CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN REOPENS VOTE 29:15]

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we're just going to reopen the vote on the Committee on Finance. I'm going to give it to the Committee Clerk Billy Martin.

COMMITTEE CLERK: On Resolution regarding Sutphin Boulevard and Land Use item 31. Council Member Sanchez?

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. The final vote now Committee on Finance, both items have been adopted by the Committee, 16 in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, and with that, this meeting is adjourned. [GAVEL]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 21, 2022