

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

December 14, 2021
Start: 9:38 A.M.
Recess: 9:57 A.M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING VIRTUAL ROOM 2

B E F O R E: Chair Adrienne Adams

COUNCIL MEMBERS: ADRIENNE ADAMS
HELEN ROSENTHAL
CARLOS MENCHACA
ROBERT HOLDEN
I. DANEEK MILLER
KEITH POWERS
JUSTIN BRANNAN
KEVIN RILEY
VANESSA GIBSON
FERNANDO CABRERA

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 SGT. MARTINEZ: Cloud recording under
3 way.

4 SGT. PEREZ: Backup is rolling.

5 SGT. LEONARDO: Good morning and welcome
6 to today's remote New York City Council hearing for
7 the Committee on Public Safety. At this time, we ask
8 that all council members and council staff, please
9 turn on their video for verification purposes. To
10 minimize disruptions, please place cell phones and
11 electronic devices to vibrate or silent. Thank you
12 for your cooperation. Chair, we are ready to begin.

13 CHAIR ADRIENNE ADAMS: Good morning. I'm
14 Council Member Adrienne Adams of the 28th District in
15 Queens, and I'm the chair of the Committee on Public
16 Safety. I want to thank the members of the Public
17 Safety Committee who are here this morning. Council
18 Members Miller, Powers, Holden, Brannan, Riley,
19 Gibson, Menchaca, and Rosenthal. We'll be voting on
20 two pieces of legislation this morning. First,
21 Proposed Introduction number 2493-A, sponsored by
22 Council Members Rosenthal and Brooks-Powers. This
23 introduction will require the New York City Police
24 Department to train officers on responding to
25 incidents involving domestic violence, sexual crimes,

2 or human trafficking. The training will be delivered
3 to all new recruits and thereafter, to all members of
4 service who regularly interact with crime victims.
5 The training curriculum will be developed from
6 recommendations made by an interdisciplinary
7 interagency committee consisting of representatives
8 of the NYPD, the Mayor's Office to End Domestic and
9 Gender-Based Violence, the Mayor's Office of Criminal
10 Justice, domestic violence service providers, sexual
11 assault service providers and human trafficking
12 service providers. In addition, the Bill would add
13 such service providers to the city's domestic
14 fatality review committee and create a fatality
15 advisory committee to review individual case level
16 data on gender-based and domestic violence
17 fatalities. In October, the Public Safety Committee,
18 along with the Committee on Women and Gender Equity
19 examined the NYPD's Special Victim's Division which
20 is responsible for investigating allegations of
21 sexual assault. At that hearing, one of the most
22 memorable in my tenure here at the Council, by the
23 way, at that hearing the committee heard
24 heartbreaking accounts from sexual assault survivors
25 detailing their traumatic experiences and reporting

2 crimes to the NYPD. Experiences involving stalled
3 investigations, non-responsive police officers, and
4 insensitive comments. These courageous survivors
5 blew the whistle on the ongoing failures of the NYPD
6 in assuring its officers are equipped with the skills
7 needed to appropriately engage with individuals
8 reporting sexual assaults and other crimes of gender-
9 based violence. This legislation will send a
10 powerful message that this Council will continually
11 fight to support survivors and work diligently to
12 ensure the NYPD handles such cases with the
13 sensitivity, care, and attention they demand.

14 Next, we will be voting on Resolution
15 number 1782, sponsored by myself, Council Members
16 Louis and Cumbo as well. This Resolution calls for
17 changes to state law related to qualifications for
18 being a police officer by asking the state
19 legislation to enact and governor to sign
20 A7284/S6489, known as the Wandering Officers Act
21 which seeks to amend the New York State Executive Law
22 to require the state's municipal police training
23 council to adopt to rules relating to eligibility for
24 civil service appointment as police officers such
25 that an individual shall be prohibited from

2 appointment if such person had previously been
3 dismissed from any police department due to findings
4 of misconduct or resigned while under investigation
5 pursuant to a charge of misconduct. This is a common
6 sense reform that will, if enacted by the state
7 legislature, result in better qualified police
8 officers working throughout the state. Before voting
9 on these measures, the committee welcomes a statement
10 from Council Member Rosenthal who has championed in
11 proving the city's response to gender-based violence
12 throughout her time in the council, and sponsors the
13 legislation being voted on today. We welcome and
14 thank my colleague, Council Member Helen Rosenthal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HELEN ROSENTHAL: Thank
16 you so much, Chair Adams. I appreciate you very
17 much. I'm going to get into that in a moment. You
18 have taken the reigns of this committee and led it
19 with your full heart and intelligence, and I just
20 really have appreciated working with you this term on
21 these issues, but I want to speak just for a minute
22 about my Bill and sort of add on to what Chair Adams
23 has already highlighted. You know, I was very
24 pleased to work closely with the NYPD on the language
25 of this Bill. We had a very constructive

2 conversation. They were very interested in
3 negotiating with the City Council on this, and I want
4 to publicly acknowledge and thank them for that. I
5 thought that was an incredibly meaningful statement
6 just from the get-go. The Bill has two component
7 parts as Chair Adams has said. The first part has to
8 do with training of NYPD officers and Chair Adams
9 mentioned several of the just heartbreaking stories
10 that we heard. I want to add that, you know, many
11 times, unfortunately, survivors are dismissed right
12 from the first time they encounter police, and this
13 summer, unfortunately, a survivor had a just a very
14 unfortunate experience with officers, responding
15 officers in Central Park. She called 9-1-1,
16 responding officers came immediately, the assailant
17 was there, and was immediately apprehended. The
18 survivor told her story and the responding police let
19 the assailant go because they didn't, I guess,
20 understand her way of talking about the rape that is
21 often language that is used for someone who has just
22 been traumatized. They let the assailant go. She
23 called again, believe it or not, and the second set
24 of officers showed up who unfortunately also let the
25 assailant go, but this time, those officers did call

2 the Sex Crimes Unit, and the assailant was then
3 arrested, although again, the victim was treated
4 poorly. You know, and I commend the arrest for sure,
5 it shouldn't take a victim three times of having to
6 tell her story to be believed by the responding
7 police officers. So, I'm really again, appreciative
8 of the NYPD for negotiating this Bill together. The
9 second part of the Bill addresses the issues of
10 domestic violence fatalities or inter-partner
11 violence fatalities. The number of people who have
12 been killed in these relationships or associated
13 people killed in these relationships has remained
14 steady at 50 to 60 people every year for as long as
15 I've been looking at the data which is about since
16 2010, and the fact that, you know, while crime during
17 this period plummeted and homicides plummeted from
18 2000 down to, you know, in the 200s, and now it has
19 spiked back up, but why is it that we can bring down
20 homicides in the general population, but not for
21 victims of domestic violence or their families, and
22 so the second part of this Bill really addresses that
23 issue so that we can better understand these
24 homicides and government can be given the tools to do
25 a better job addressing this issue and preferably

2 bringing them down as, you know, as we have done for
3 homicides during the same period. So, I cannot thank
4 Chair Adams enough. I can't thank this Council
5 enough, the Council staff who helped negotiate this
6 Bill. So, and I really want to appreciate, and if I
7 get the name wrong, just you can, you can send me a
8 text and I will fix it at a later time, but
9 (inaudible), but also previous Dan Attus (SP?), Bryan
10 Crow (SP?) were phenomenal partners in thinking about
11 these issues and trying to help government, help
12 survivors just a little bit better, and of course,
13 Chair Adams, I meant to say it at the end, but I
14 guess I said it at the beginning. You know, you have
15 been a phenomenal leader of this committee. You have
16 always been so gracious and as I've said to you
17 privately, I really have learned from you, and I want
18 to thank you for helping me understand working with
19 the NYPD in a more constructive way, and it really
20 paid off in this Bill. So, thank you, thank you,
21 thank you. (Crosstalk)

22 CHAIR ADRIENNE ADAMS: Thank you so much,
23 Council Member Rosenthal, and I must say your
24 dedication to this cause and always being the number
25 one champion of women's issues in particular,

2 specially around this issue of sexual abuse and
3 assault, your commitment, your dedication, you
4 thoughtfulness has brought so much to so many, and I
5 thank you for being such a vital part of this
6 committee as well. This work will go on, you will be
7 missed dearly in this Council, by the way, and thank
8 you again for your leadership and mentorship
9 throughout my career in the New York City Council.
10 Thank you so much. It's been an honor to work with
11 you. We've also been joined by Council Member
12 Cabrera, and I now call for a roll call vote on these
13 two pieces of legislation.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Thank
15 you and good morning. This is the Committee on
16 Public Safety, roll call vote on Intro 2439-A and
17 Resolution 1782. Chair Adams.

18 CHAIR ADRIENNE ADAMS: I vote I on all.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Council
20 Member Cabrera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FERNANDO CABRERA: I vote
22 I on all.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Council
24 Member Gibson.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VANESSA GIBSON: I vote I
3 and I want to echo the sentiments of our Chair and
4 congratulating and thanking Council Member Helen
5 Rosenthal for your leadership, for always being a
6 champion, fighting for gender equity and making sure
7 that we transform the Special Victims Division, and
8 we really make sure that we give victims a real
9 powerful voice and the services they need. I am so
10 proud to work with you, call you a colleague and my
11 friend, and I proudly vote I on all. Thank you,
12 colleagues.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Thank
14 you. Council Member Menchaca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CARLOS MENCHACA: Yes, I
16 vote I, and I just want to say thank you to Helen
17 Rosenthal, an incredible Council Member. We came in
18 together and thank you so much. Watching you fight,
19 not just for this unit and the incredible, the
20 transformation of this unit really goes to you, and
21 the colleagues that have been supporting this, but
22 Council Member and Chair Adrienne Adams for your
23 support on this and your grace. Thank you so much.
24 I vote I.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 13

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Thank
3 you. Council Member Miller.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER I. DANEEK MILLER:
5 Permission to explain my vote, please?

6 CHAIR ADRIENNE ADAMS: Council Member
7 Miller, explain your vote.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER I. DANEEK MILLER: Okay,
9 Chair Adams, I just want to thank you for your
10 leadership over the past years that you have Chaired
11 this committee. You have done it with distinctions
12 certainly, really moved the needle on police reform
13 and other issues, particularly supporting communities
14 of color. I want to thank you for that, and
15 certainly Helen Rosenthal, you have been champion for
16 the voiceless. It has not been easy. Thank you so
17 much and I am proud to vote I on all.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Thank
19 you. Council Member Brannan.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JUSTIN BRANNAN:
21 Congratulations to all. I vote I.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Council
23 Member Holden.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROBERT HOLDEN: I
25 congratulate the sponsors of these Bills, especially

2 Council Member Rosenthal. More has to be done, but
3 right now in my local precinct, survivors of sexual
4 attacks or domestic violence are forced to meet in a
5 dingy basement office, and I want to use that term
6 loosely, it's not really an office. You're under a
7 stairwell, and you have to meet with the officer, and
8 I can't even stand up in that office. That's how
9 low, underneath the stairwell, so more has to be
10 done. I've spoken to the NYPD. They're going to
11 redesign that and hopefully move that up onto the
12 third floor and give it the attention it needs, but I
13 want to thank everyone, especially Council Member
14 Rosenthal. I vote I on all.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Thank
16 you. Council Member Powers.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KEITH POWERS: Also, a big
18 congratulations and thank you to Council Member
19 Rosenthal and Chair Adams, and with that, I vote I.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Thank
21 you. Council Member Riley.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KEVIN RILEY: I vote I.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL JOSH KINGSLEY: Thank
24 you. By a vote of nine in the affirmative, zero in

2 the negative, and zero abstentions, both items, Chair
3 Adams are adopted.

4 CHAIR ADRIENNE ADAMS: Thank you very
5 much. I'd like to recognize Council Member Rosenthal
6 who, I believe has something to say.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HELEN ROSENTHAL: Thank
8 you so much, Chair Adams. Just two quick things.
9 Council Member Holden, thank you for sharing that
10 story. Let's continue to keep an eye on that
11 together, and I want to mention this in particular,
12 to the returning Council Members, the NYPD has
13 pledged and has followed through on the pledge to
14 improve the facilities, the Sex Crimes Unit's
15 facilities in every borough, and that was frankly,
16 Mayor DiBlasio's leadership that is going to make
17 that happen. One of the borough Sex Crime Unit
18 offices is going through a Euler, and I encourage and
19 hope that the next City Council will support that
20 Euler when it comes to a vote. It's in the Bronx, in
21 Council Member Cabrera's current unit. Council
22 Member Pierina Sanchez will carry it, probably in
23 January or February. So, I really appreciate your
24 remembering this conversation, and helping to push it
25 through, and Chair Adams, I neglected to mention,

2 thank you for your Resolution. You are spot on. I've
3 been listening to multiple pod cast recently. I'll
4 send you the names of them when I remember them, but
5 talking about this exact issue that police officers,
6 when they are, after egregious activity over and over
7 and over again, when they are finally dismissed,
8 moved to another county, moved to another state, and
9 are hired, and we do, you know, again continue with
10 their pattern, frankly, of abusing their authority.
11 So, thank you for that Resolution. I will stand with
12 you to lobby the state to pass their Bill. So, I
13 just wanted to make sure to thank you for that.

14 CHAIR ADRIENNE ADAMS: Thank you very
15 much Council Member Rosenthal. I'd like to recognize
16 Council Member Gibson as well.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VANESSA GIBSON: Oh, so
18 sorry, Chair Adams. I neglected to thank you. I
19 realize this is probably our last committee meeting
20 on the Committee Public Safety, so I just wanted to
21 publicly, in front of our colleagues, just express my
22 gratitude and appreciation to you serving as Chair,
23 following in the footsteps of not just myself, and
24 Donovan Richards (SP?), but you have led this
25 committee with commitment and compassion and

2 consistency and dedication, and I just wanted to say
3 thank you and thank you to the entire Public Safety
4 team for all of their hard work. I think we have set
5 our footprints in history for others to follow and
6 what it means to really create public safety
7 priorities in the Council and make sure our
8 neighborhoods are safe across the city of New York.
9 So, my sister, fellow Women's Caucus member, I just
10 want to say congratulations on all your success, and
11 I wish you the very best in your next term. Thank
12 you so much for serving as Chair.

13 CHAIR ADRIENNE ADAMS: Thank you, Council
14 Member Gibson for those thoughtful words, and we
15 certainly have looked up to you as being the first
16 woman to serve as Chair of this wonderful committee,
17 this Public Safety Committee, so I thank you also. I
18 congratulate you for all of your future endeavors and
19 look forward to serving with you in the community,
20 continuing that relationship that we've built, and
21 thank you so much for those words. Thank you to all
22 of my colleagues for participating this morning in
23 this Public Safety Committee. I'd also like to thank
24 Committee Counsel Josh Kingsley and Matt Townsend,
25 and of course, he's not here anymore, but Dan Attus

2 as was mentioned who has done so much work for us on
3 this Public Safety Committee. I thank all of you for
4 helping us to move this committee forward. We look
5 forward to continuing to do just that. This meeting
6 is now adjourned.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

19

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 31, 2022