

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING
AND FRANCHISES

----- X

October 25, 2021
Start: 10:12 a.m.
Recess: 4:26 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING - VIRTUAL ROOM 1

B E F O R E: Francisco P. Moya,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Diana Ayala
- Joseph C. Borelli
- Margaret S. Chin
- Robert E. Cornegy
- Barry S. Grodenchik
- Stephen T. Levin
- Antonio Reynoso
- Carlina Rivera

A P P E A R A N C E S

1 Tucker Reed
Principal of Totem

2 Vivian Liao
Principal of Totem

3 Elizabeth Canela
Project Manager at Totem

4 Colvin Grannum
Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation

5 Eric Palatnik
Land Use Council for the Applicant

6 Jason Diaz

7 Bhaskar Srivastava
Principal at Density Works Architecture

8 Frank Lang
Director of Housing for St. Nicks Alliance

9 Renzo Ramirez
Member of 32BJ SCIU

10 Shabazz Stuart
Resident of Crown Heights and Bed-Stuey

11 David Ehrenberg
President and CEO of the Brooklyn Navy Yard
Development Corporation

12 Melanie Meyers
Fried Frank Land Use Counsel

13 Brady Meixell
Economic Development Specialist for the Southwest
Brooklyn Industrial Development Corporation

14 Adam Friedman
Director of the Pratt Center

15 Jonathan Bowles
Executive Director of the Center for an Urban
Future

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

James Williams
Chief Operating Officer at Nanotronics in the
Brooklyn Navy Yard

Jan Michael Maluto
Ferra Designs

Kayon Pryce
Founding Principal of the New York City
Department of Education's Public High School
Program, The Brooklyn Steam Center

Kyiesha Kelly
Co-Owner of Hip Hop Closet

Sinade Wadsworth
Council Representative for the New York City
District Council of Carpenters

Jennifer Gravel
Director of the Housing and Economic Development
Division at the Department of City Planning

Alex Placas
Project Manager for the Citywide Hotels Text
Amendment

Jeannine Nixon
Resident of downtown Flushing, Queen's resident
for many years

Carlos Encarnacion
Longtime Resident of Brooklyn

Saul Scherl
President of the Tri-State Region for the Howard
Hughes Corporation

Chris Cooper
Architecture and Planning Office of SOM

David Karnofsky
Land Use Attorney and partner at Fried Frank

Adam Meister
Co-Chair NY Urban Development Mixed-Use Council

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

1 Wesley O'Brien
2 Special Counsel in the Real Estate Department

3 Charlie Fields
4 AKRF

5 Michael Kramer
6 Representing the Seaport Coalition

7 Diana Switaj
8 Director of Planning and Land Use at Manhattan
9 Community Board One

10 Paul Goldstein

11 Adrienne Sosin
12 Resides in South Bridge Towers

13 Andrea Goldwyn
14 New York Landmarks Conservancy

15 Jonathan Boulware
16 President of the South Street Seaport Museum

17 Marrissa Williams
18 Representative of 32BJ SCIU

19 Adam Ganser
20 Urban Development Mixed-use Council

21 Diego Robayo
22 Historic Districts Council

23 Joanne Gorman
24 Speaking on behalf of Friends of South Street
25 Seaport

Emily Hellstrom
PTA Co-President of the Peck Slip School and a
Co-Founder of Children First

Megan Malvern
15-year plus Resident of the Seaport area

Kate McLetchie-Sheldon
Representing the Waterfront Alliance

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Paul Hovitz
Retired Vice Chair CB1

Brendan Sexton
Chair of Trustees, the Board of Trustees at the
South Street Seaport Museum

Ernest Tollerson
Board of the South Street Seaport Museum

Linda Roche
43 year Resident in the Seaport area

Nicole Rossi
Vice President of the 265267 Water Street Co-op
Board

Linda Hellstrom
Resides on Water Street

Alia Soomro
Menapace Fellow in Land Use Law at the Municipal
Art Society of New York

Anne Beaumont
Resides on Pearl Street

Neil Flaherty
In support of the South Street Seaport Proposal

Jay Jacobson
Volunteered at the Museum for about 40 years

Susan Murray
South Street Seaport Museum Volunteer and an
Advocate for the Seaport Historic District

Grace Lee
Lower Manhattan Resident and mother of three

Christina Roccas
Mother, Business Owner, Wife and a Huge Fan of my
Neighborhood for almost 15 years

Louis Coletti
In Support of the South Street Seaport Proposal

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

1 Terrence Cullen
2 Communications Director for the New York Building
3 Congress

4 Ankur Dalal
5 In support of South Street Seaport Project

6 Jay Hellstrom
7 In support of South Street Seaport Project

8 Denny Salas
9 In support of South Street Seaport Project

10 Roland Lewis
11 Strong Proponent of the development at 250 Water
12 Street

13 Jill Poklemba
14 Senior Director at New York Harm Reduction
15 Educators

16 Elizabeth Kerr
17 In Support of the Development at 250 Water Street

18 Bob Tierney
19 In Support of the Development at 250 Water Street

20 Mark Bozek
21 In Support of the Development at 250 Water Street

22 Nelson Chan
23 Director of Affordable Housing at AAFE Downtown
24 Manhattan Community Development Corporation

25 Richard Dykema
Resident of the Fulton Seaport Neighborhood

Christopher Marte
In opposition of 250 Water Street Proposal

Colleen Robertson
PTA Co-President at Peck Slip

David Sheldon
Volunteer at the South Street Seaport Museum for
20 years

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Kim Busi

Long Term Resident of Lower Manhattan and
specifically the Seaport District

William Thomas

In Support of 250 Water Street Proposal

James Kaplan

Chairman and Past President of the Lower
Manhattan Historical Association

Aaron Singh

Vessel Operations Teacher at the New York Harbor
School

Huntley Gill

Preservationist at Guardia Architects

Timur Galen

Resident of Lower Manhattan and an Architect

Erik Antokal

Assistant DP for Programs at Nontraditional
Employment for Women

Catherine McVay Hughes

Served on Manhattan Community Board 1 for 20
Years

Patrick Quinn

Representing iPic Theaters

Frank Sciame

CEO of Sciame Construction

Daniel Del Vecchio

In support of 250 Water Street Proposal

Kerry Noland

Long Term Volunteer at the South Street Seaport
Museum

Laura Norwitz

Senior Director of Programs and Education at
South Street Seaport Museum

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

1 Joshua Pickard
2 NoHo Hospitality Group

3 Scott Dwyer
4 Representing Sons of the Revolution in the State
5 of New York

6 Edward McWilliams
7 Representative of the New York City District
8 Council of Carpenters

9 Sarah Babanouny
10 Longtime Resident of Lower Manhattan

11 Lili Chopra
12 Executive Director Artistic Programs at the Lower
13 Manhattan Cultural Council known as LMCC

14 Douglas Hanau
15 Lifelong Resident of New York City

16 Maria Ho-Burge
17 15 year Seaport Resident, a Peck Slip School
18 Parent and a Local Small Business Owner

19 Michelle Koppersmith
20 Resides in CD3 but office is in CD1 at 85 Broad
21 Street

22 Sinade Wadsworth
23 Council Representative for the New York City
24 District Council of Carpenters

25 Jessica Lappin
President of the Downtown Alliance

Bob Ghassemieh
Represents the ownership of the hotel commonly
known as the Mr. C Seaport

Niral Shah
Resides in New York City for almost 15 years

Denise Courter
Founder of a Downtown Website called, FiDi
Families.com

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

1 William Kornblum
2 Native New Yorker and Resident of Jackson Heights
3 Queens

4 Adam Brodheim
5 Historic Preservationist studying at Columbia
6 University

7 Jeremy Moss
8 Longtime Owner at 324 Pearl Street

9 Nick Ramphal
10 Unreserved Support for the 250 Water Street
11 Redevelopment

12 Stacey Shub
13 Local Resident whose lived at South Bridge Towers
14 for over 25 years

15 Burchenal Green
16 President and Executive Director of the National
17 Maritime Historical Society

18 Aislinn McGuire
19 General Counsel to the Contractors Association of
20 Greater New York

21 Harrison Grinnan
22 Resident of Council Member Levin's District in
23 Brooklyn

24 Donald Hong
25 UA3 and in Support of Project

Howard Wizenfeld
Strongly Support the Howard Hughes Proposal

Stephen Marmon
Strongly Support the Revised Plan for 250 Water

1
2 SERGEANT HOPE: Recording to the cloud in
3 progress as well.

4 SERGEANT PEREZ: Backup is rolling.

5 SERGEANT MARTINEZ: Excellent. Good morning and
6 welcome to today's Remote New York City Council
7 Hearing of the Subcommittee on Zoning. At this time
8 would all panelists please turn on their video. To
9 minimize disruption, please silence your electronic
10 devices and if you wish to submit testimony, you may
11 do so via email at the following address

12 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that
13 [is landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

14 Thank you for your cooperation, we are ready to
15 begin.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you and good morning.
17 I'm Council Member Francisco Moya, the Chair of the
18 Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I am joined
19 remotely today by members Ayala and Cornegy. Today,
20 we will hold public hearings on Rezoning Proposals
21 for the 1045 Atlantic Avenue in the Special Navy Yard
22 District in Brooklyn. As well a development proposal
23 for 250 Water Street in Manhattan and a proposed
24 citywide zoning text amendment concerning a special
25 permit mechanism for hotel development.

1 Before we turn to our hearings, I will first
2 recognize the Subcommittee Counsel to review the
3 remote meetings procedures.
4

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Moya. I am
6 Arthur Huh, Counsel to this Subcommittee. Members of
7 the public wishing to testify were asked to register
8 for today's hearings. If you wish to testify and
9 have not already registered, we ask that you please
10 do so now by visiting the Council's website at
11 www.council.nyc.gov/landuse. Members of the public
12 may also view a livestream broadcast of this meeting
13 at the Council's website.

14 As a technical note, for the benefit of the
15 viewing public, if you need an accessible version of
16 any of the presentations shown today, please send an
17 email request to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

18 When called to testify, individuals appearing
19 before the Subcommittee will be recognized by the
20 Chair to speak. Applicant teams will be recognized
21 as a group and called first followed by members of
22 the public. Please take a moment to check your
23 device and confirm that your microphone is on before
24 you begin speaking. Public testimony will be limited
25 to two minutes per witness. If you have additional

1
2 testimony you would like the Subcommittee to consider
3 or if you would like to submit written testimony
4 instead of appearing before the Subcommittee, you may
5 email it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please
6 indicate the LU Number and/or project name in the
7 subject line of your email.

8 During the hearing, Council Members with
9 questions use the Zoom raise hand function. Council
10 Members with questions will be announced in order as
11 they raise their hands and Chair Moya will recognize
12 them to speak. Witnesses are requested to remain in
13 the meeting until excused by the Chair as Council
14 Members may have questions.

15 Finally, there will be pauses over the course of
16 this meeting for various technical reasons and we ask
17 that you please be patient as we work through any
18 issues. Chair Moya will now continue with today's
19 agenda items.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Arthur. I now open
21 the public hearing on Preconsidered LU items for the
22 1045 Atlantic Avenue Rezoning proposal under ULURP's
23 Number as C 210276 ZMK and N 210277 ZRK requesting
24 zoning map and zoning text amendments relating to
25 property in Council Member Cornegy's District in

1
2 Brooklyn. For anyone wishing to testify on this
3 item, if you have not already done so, you must
4 register online and you may do that by visiting the
5 Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse. And I
6 see we have Council Member Cornegy on. I want to
7 turn it over to him if he has any opening remarks
8 before we start the presentation.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you Chair Moya. I
10 just wanted to express my support for this project.
11 What we are here in Bedford Stuyvesant and Northern
12 Crown Heights is no less than the epicenter of
13 gentrification. And in an effort to create more
14 affordable housing units, there is a need to be
15 creative. And along that Atlantic Avenue Corridor,
16 it allows for a zoning change to have more
17 affordability.

18 The feasibility study that has been done as
19 stated and dictated that a building of this magnitude
20 does not affect the ancillary homes that are located
21 in close proximity including site lines and including
22 shading. It has also been you know been brought to
23 my attention that this is one of the ways to create
24 by far one of the highest degree of affordability in
25 the district in one site. So, I am in full support

1
2 of this project at 1045 Atlantic Avenue and I wanted
3 to register that for the record. Thank you Chair
4 Moya.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council Member
6 Cornegy. I now would ask the Council please call the
7 first panel for this item.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel for this
9 item will include Tucker Reed and Vivian Liao and
10 Elizabeth Canela at Totem. Colvin Grannum of Bedford
11 Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation and Eric Palatnik
12 as Land Use Council for the applicant. We also have
13 available for Q&A Jason Diaz and Bhaskar Srivastava.

14 VIVIAN LIAO: Good morning, can everyone hear me?

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

16 VIVIAN LIAO: Okay, thank you so much for having
17 us here today to the Subcommittee and to Councilman
18 Cornegy for those remarks. My name is Vivian Liao, I
19 am one of the principals -

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Excuse me. I'm terribly
21 sorry. Panelists, I need you to be sworn in first.

22 VIVIAN LIAO: Oh, I'm sorry.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Would all panelists please
24 raise your right hand? Do you swear or affirm that
25 the testimony you will provide for the Subcommittee

1
2 with be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but
3 the truth and will answer truthfully to all Council
4 Member questions?

5 PANEL: Yes. I do.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: My apologies and just quickly
7 as a reminder, sorry. Thank you for that Arthur.
8 Just a reminder when you are ready to present your
9 slideshow, please say so and it will be displayed on
10 the screen and slides will be advanced to you by our
11 staff. For the benefit of the viewing public, if you
12 need an accessible version of this presentation,
13 please send an email request to
14 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And now, you and
15 your team may begin and again, if you can, we ask you
16 to restate your name and your organization for the
17 record. Thank you.

18 VIVIAN LIAO: Sure, I was just so excited to get
19 started. You can bring the presentation now. Again,
20 my name is Vivian Liao, I am one of the Principals of
21 Totem and thank you all for having us here today.
22 We're excited to be partnering with our friends at
23 Bed-Stuy Restoration Corporation to help bring new
24 affordable housing and other benefits to Central
25 Brooklyn. You'll be hearing from some of the other

1
2 team members in a moment but first, a quick intro to
3 our firm. You can go to the next slide.

4 We started Totem five years ago, bringing our
5 collective experience in government, urban design and
6 real estate to focus on local projects that benefit
7 communities. The common thread tying our projects
8 together is the approach we take to centering the
9 voices of communities in which we work. As a group
10 of former public servants, we see the opportunity to
11 leverage the power of the market place to create
12 lasting benefits for the community. We're literally
13 trying to chart a new way of development one building
14 at a time.

15 This slide shows the hallmarks of a Totem
16 development, how we're trying to build intentionally
17 and with the community in mind. Focus on a few key
18 principle around housing affordability, economic
19 mobility, inclusive infrastructure and
20 sustainability. And we're particularly proud of how
21 we plan to put these principles into action
22 specifically at 1045 Atlantic Avenue and for more
23 details on that, I'm going to turn it over to my
24 partner Tucker Reed now to take you through the
25 details.

1
2 TUCKER REED: Thanks Vivian. Good morning.
3 Tucker Reed from Totem, Principal of Totem and thanks
4 for having us this morning. Next slide please.

5 Building on the remarks by Council Member
6 Cornegy, thanks again for your support and leadership
7 on this project. Really, what the major issue that
8 we're trying to address with this project is the need
9 for a large amount of new affordable housing in
10 Community Board 3 in Bedford Stuyvesant. So, with
11 all of our projects, we're really data driven. I
12 think you know hopefully this visual helps us
13 understand. On the left hand side is the amount of
14 affordable housing that's been built in Community
15 Board 3 since 2014. Only about 200 units of
16 inclusionary housing.

17 On the right hand side is the amount of market
18 rate, of which there has been more than 3,200 units.
19 So, only you know five to six percent of new
20 construction has been affordable, only 200 units or
21 so and so we're excited about the opportunity to
22 bring a significant amount of affordability to this
23 site. Next slide please.

24 Just to orient us to the site, here is the zoning
25 map. Next slide please will you zoom in on Atlantic

1 Avenue. We are on Atlantic between Franklin and
2 Clawson. The current zoning of the five lots that we
3 own is designated as M11, which allows for one FAR of
4 Correctional Development. Next slide.

5
6 And you know over the last two years, working
7 with City Planning and Council Member Cornegy, we've
8 arrived at a zoning overlay of the C53A which is an
9 R9 equivalent for the site. Next slide. Which would
10 result in a building op, and sorry, sorry the land
11 use map that shows we're really a kind of a
12 commercial hole of the donut in a sea of housing that
13 surrounds the site. Next slide please.

14 And we're also very aware of the fact that there
15 has been an ongoing dialogue with the community
16 boards and City Planning over the last number of
17 years to develop this M-Crown framework. We actually
18 form a purple trapezoid here with the yellow project
19 site highlighted, which had been designated for
20 higher density commercial uses. But that is a
21 project of our conversations with particularly
22 Community Board 3 over the last two years has
23 expressed to us a real desire to see as much
24 affordable housing built on our site as possible. And
25 so, we really tried to wed the priorities around

1
2 affordable housing with Community Board 3 with the
3 kind of guiding principles around the M-Crown
4 Planning District here that called for some
5 reactivation of commercial uses.

6 And so, you'll see on the next slide, what we
7 tried to do is create a building program that tries
8 to thread that needle. So, C63A, we're going to have
9 a retail base of about 33,000 square feet. 25
10 percent of which we would set aside for small
11 neighborhood business owners. A priority of Council
12 Member Cornegy. At least one store of commercial
13 office use or community facility use in keeping with
14 the uses that were identified as priority in the M-
15 Crown planning framework. And then the balance of
16 the building being multifamily apartments.
17 Approximately 420 of which 126 or 30 percent will be
18 set aside as permanently affordable housing. Next
19 slide please.

20 Another result of the conversation of the
21 Community Board about density and height on this site
22 in particular, was to really make sure that we did
23 our best to design a building that had as de minimis
24 impact as possible from a shadow perspective on the
25 surrounding buildings. And also, took into account

1
2 sustainability planning around green infrastructure
3 of which will be a hallmark of this project in
4 particular.

5 So, we go to the next slide, we can quickly just
6 talk the Committee through the great pains that we
7 took from an urban design standpoint, carved the
8 building to reflect the pathway of the sun across the
9 site. So, here is the kind of as of right box at C
10 638 and as you start to go through the progression –
11 next slide please, you start to see how we've taken
12 the bulk and reoriented it to allow for the pathway
13 of the sun as it crosses the site throughout the day.
14 Keep going kind of through this progression and then
15 using that green infrastructure to move up the
16 building with setbacks and green walls, etc., to
17 provide privacy also to the backyards of the
18 buildings that are above our site.

19 And so, the next slide, I think it shows the – op
20 sorry, go back one slide. Sorry, just the final you
21 know product here, shows hopefully the great pains
22 that we're taking to carve the building to reflect
23 the solar path of the son and have de minimis impacts
24 from a shading standpoint but also, the green and
25 sustainable elements that have gone into creating

1
2 what we hope will become a kind of a marque building
3 in the Bed-Stuy community.

4 And next slide, the last thing, after many
5 conversations with City Planning, this will arrive
6 with the density multiple that kind of supports the
7 R9 designation. I really looked at the Fulton Street
8 rezoning that was done a number of years ago and that
9 was an 80 foot wide street and the kind of density
10 multiple that was arrived at the Fulton Street was
11 one in a half times the street width for building
12 height. And so, we applied that same multiple here
13 on the Atlantic Avenue site which is 120 feet wide
14 and allows for a building height of a max of at 175
15 feet. Next slide please.

16 And then just a few views of the rendered
17 building on Atlantic Avenue. This is from the
18 Barkley Center side of Atlantic from the southwest.
19 Next slide. From the southeast really taking into
20 account the kind of height precedence that are
21 created by the armory building on Atlantic building
22 not far from us. Next slide please.

23 And then uhm, the kind of ground floor activation
24 of the building, you see that we're trying to create
25 a building here that is welcome and inviting to the

1
2 neighborhood. Particularly from a pedestrian safety
3 standpoint, Atlantic avenue with all the vehicular
4 traffic often doesn't feel like the most inviting
5 pedestrian thoroughfare. And so, we've worked with
6 City Planning here to widen the sidewalk to a wider
7 street that would accommodate both tree planting's
8 and retail activation but a pedestrian friendly and
9 inviting environment. Next slide please.

10 Uhm, I'm going to turn it over to partner Liz
11 Canela to talk a little bit through the further
12 program elements of the building.

13 ELIZABETH CANELA: Hi everyone. Liz Canela,
14 Project Manager at Totem. Next slide please. So,
15 the large part of the project is sort of why we're
16 doing it and the community benefits that are
17 accomplished for Bed-Stuy. So, as a reminder, slide
18 three, we talked a little bit about the housing
19 production in neighborhood and there's only been
20 about 200 units over the last like almost a full
21 decade. So, in this project we're able to build 126
22 units of affordable housing and we would be pursuing
23 Option 2, where there's an average of 80 percent of
24 AMI. And something that was important was to include
25 a unit starting as low as 40 percent of AMI in that

1
2 average. And happy to answer a little bit more
3 questions there but in addition to the housing,
4 there's also an important jobs piece and to which, we
5 can go to the next slide and I'll turn it over to
6 Colvin.

7 COLVIN GRANNUM: Good morning. My name is Colvin
8 Grannum, I am the President and CEO of Bedford
9 Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation. The first thing
10 I would like to do is just acknowledge Councilman
11 Cornegy for his vision and guidance. Not just with
12 respect to this project but with respect to housing
13 and small business development in Central Brooklyn.

14 So, this project is in many ways intended to
15 reflect the priorities and preferences that he
16 established over his term, his tenure as a
17 Councilperson. Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration is the
18 nations first community development corporation. Our
19 mission is to relentlessly pursue strategies to close
20 gaps in family and community wealth, so that all
21 families in Central Brooklyn are healthy and
22 prosperous. Our strategic direction is to close, to
23 disrupt and close the racial wealth gap.

24 We do that through economic mobility services and
25 programs that are intended to help people increase

1
2 their income, save more and build strong careers.
3 Housing is a major part of that and we're very
4 pleased to be a part of this project team working
5 with Totem. A firm that we've worked with on
6 multiple projects. We're excited about the
7 significant amount of affordable housing units that
8 are being added to the Bed-Stuy Crown Heights area
9 and the effective use of 1045 Atlantic as a transit
10 oriented housing site.

11 Our collective team, which includes St. Nicks and
12 others, has great experience and has been effective
13 on other projects in the areas of job training, MWBE
14 engagement, economic mobility services, affordable
15 housing market and administration and small business
16 support. We see Crescent Consulting; they've been
17 working on the MWBE issues. 32BJ as you well know
18 provides prevailing wage jobs. Collectively, we will
19 be recruiting folk to work on the construction side.
20 We will also be recruiting local residents who are
21 entrepreneurs to open businesses in the commercial
22 sites.

23 We expect this project to be not just a generator
24 of affordable housing but a generator of economic
25 development and equity. Thank you.

1
2 TUCKER REED: Thank you Colvin. Next slide
3 please and I'll just round out quickly the rest of
4 the building program and community benefits that we
5 see in creating this project. First of all, we are
6 excited to pilot both with restoration and the
7 Brooklyn Community Foundation. The idea of a kind of
8 tenant led community impact fund of the building.
9 The building will contribute \$50,000 a year to seed
10 grants to local community-based organizations. And
11 that effort will be hopefully guided by the residents
12 of the building, both the affordable and market rate
13 residents. Who can come together and think about how
14 to distribute these funds to support local based
15 nonprofit groups that benefit the neighborhood. Next
16 slide please.

17 You know, my partner Vivian mentioned that a
18 design, an urban design is really the forefront of
19 our thinking about our development projects. This
20 site in particular along Atlantic Avenue for those
21 that are familiar with it, know that it has been
22 neglected for many, many years and many places in the
23 public spaces particularly under the MTA
24 infrastructure, there's often trash stringed about
25 etc.. So, we look forward to working with the MTA and

1
2 the Community Board on reactivating these spaces and
3 creating warm, inviting safe spaces for community to
4 access both our site and also reclaim some of these
5 forgotten spaces from trash and dumping etc. Next
6 slide please.

7 We're excited to partner with Oonee, who is going
8 to provide secure bike parking on site that is free
9 and open to the public. Oonee is a Black and Brown
10 led company founded in Crown Heights. And we're
11 excited about the entrepreneurial spirit that they
12 are going to be bringing to the building and we think
13 its been a representative of the types of
14 partnerships that we hope this building will bring to
15 Bedford Stuyvesant. Next slide please.

16 And then also, most excitingly we have - we're
17 hoping to pilot a technology here that would use a
18 battery technology to capture energy at off peak
19 times during the grid and use it to both power our
20 building but also, potentially to pump energy back
21 into the grid at times when there are peak usage that
22 you know requires strain on the grid. So, like
23 floods, brownouts, blackouts, etc.

24 Using this technology, we're excited about the
25 fact that we are going to reduce the greenhouse gas

1
2 emissions of the project greatly. In fact, we are
3 not going to have any cooking gas in the building.
4 All of the appliances will be powered by electricity
5 and hopefully, you know, piloting a very green
6 technology with this addition that we'll make the
7 building close to carbon neutral, which we hope is a
8 precedent for future development in the area as well.

9 And then finally, next slide. Uhm, there's a
10 number of green infrastructure elements that are
11 built into the project that we already mentioned.
12 Things like carving of the sun in the green roofs but
13 also bioswales in the street etc. Things – the
14 priorities particularly that were articulated to us
15 by Borough President Eric Adams and we're excited to
16 incorporate into this project.

17 And so, finally on the last slide, just a
18 foundation of all of the program elements that we
19 talked about. That ranging from the significant
20 amount of new affordable housing that the project
21 brings to the kind of inclusive infrastructure and
22 sustainability components that went into our thinking
23 and have informed the development. And thank you for
24 the opportunity to present for the Subcommittee and
25 we're happy to answer any questions.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you very
3 much. Just a couple of questions before I turn it
4 over to Council Member Cornegy. So, how did you
5 determine the C63A? Was an appropriate density to
6 propose for this site on Atlantic Avenue?

7 One, because the Borough President and Community
8 Board 3 both recommended a lower C62A zoning district
9 that would allow a 7.2 FAR and 145 height. How do
10 you respond to those recommendations?

11 TUCKER REED: Thank you for the question
12 Chairman. Yeah, we definitely have gone through a
13 long dialogue with both the city and the local
14 Council Member and the Community Board on just this
15 topic. You know, the urban planning rational that
16 went into the height proposal here, really driven by
17 a few factors. One was the street width and the kind
18 of precedent that's been set for other development in
19 the neighborhood in terms of a density factor that
20 was really recommended to us both by City Planning
21 and by Council Member Cornegy. But also, hopefully
22 it came through you know the significant amount of
23 community benefits that we're able to provide in this
24 project and the additional density certainly unwrites
25 our ability to provide that depth of community

1 benefit and the amount of affordable housing here.

2 And so, while the 30 feet, a difference may not seem
3 like a lot to some folks, it obviously drives a lot
4 in terms of project value and our ability to provide
5 these benefits.
6

7 And then just lastly and our Architect Bhaskar is
8 here to help answer questions if we would like to
9 drill down into this further. But our ability to
10 solar carb the building and remass the density, the
11 flexibility that C63A really makes that possible. At
12 the lower density there is not room to carve and so,
13 the box of the building outline would be fairly fixed
14 and we had concerns about the impact on the shadows
15 in that case.

16 ERIC PALATNIK: And good morning, it's Eric
17 Palatnik. Good morning Councilman. If it's okay if
18 I could add to Tucker's response a little there. Uh,
19 I don't know, can you hear me okay?

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, we can hear you.

21 ERIC PALATNIK: Good morning. So, I just wanted
22 to call to your attention that you may recognize
23 Tucker and his team. Our team just came before you
24 on a rezoning that we completed on 4th Avenue and we
25 were able to complete such a successful rezoning

1
2 there through a careful balance between the
3 community's needs, what the city wanted to see with
4 the Council, people wanted to see and ultimately
5 coming up with a great development.

6 And here, I think we're mimicking the same thing
7 here. There is as you know a C45D across the street,
8 so there is a precedence at least for a taller
9 building now. It's the extra few feet here that
10 Tucker was just speaking about that we've addressed
11 through what we're calling solar carving. But it's
12 really through good architecture. And the good
13 architecture is able to be done hand and hand with
14 the bulk that we're getting. Because Bhaskar is able
15 to design a nicer building that is able to address
16 the concerns of people with height.

17 So, if you'd like, we could show you some
18 pictures of it because we haven't shown any pictures.
19 Maybe that'll help ease some of the concerns. Is
20 that okay with you? Is that acceptable?

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, that's totally fine.

22 ERIC PALATNIK: Oh, great. Bhaskar, is it okay
23 if you speak for few minutes and whoever is
24 controlling the screen, can they pull up some imagery
25 for us?

1
2 BHASKAR SRIVASTAVA: So, this is Bhaskar, I'm the
3 Principal at Density Works Architecture. We are a
4 minority and women owned business, a small business
5 ourselves and we've been taking a deep look at this.
6 I live, I've lived in the neighborhood in this
7 community district the last 20 years myself and uh,
8 I'm very intimate with the street character and parts
9 of it that are landmarked and the street character is
10 very precious to the community here. At the same
11 time, around our community district that is this very
12 unique corridor of 120 roadbed that Atlantic Avenue
13 provides us. This really wide piece of
14 infrastructure can actually handle a lot of street
15 traffic, pedestrian traffic, infrastructure and for a
16 wider right away to support a taller building is not
17 just a landuse rational here but form based zoning's
18 all across the planet are using that.

19 When you have a big piece of infrastructure
20 that's being handed down to us through planning or
21 eminent domain whatever it is, and to take that piece
22 of infrastructure and low density honored because it
23 has immediate access to transit, is probably the
24 highest best use of this right away that we have been
25 provided here.

1
2 So, we looked at Fulton Street rezoning, where
3 Fulton is an 80 foot right away with 5.6 FAR and a
4 maximum building height of 115 feet. Atlantic Avenue
5 is 120 right away, so which is one in a half times
6 Fulton Street. So, if you take one and a half times
7 5.6 FAR or one in a half times a building height of
8 115 feet that's allowed on the 85th Street right away
9 Fulton, you come up with an FAR of about 8.5 and a
10 building height of approximately 175 which
11 automatically led us to a 6C3AR9A kind of volume that
12 was you know like an after shelf project in the city
13 planning you know in the zoning districts that was
14 available to us. And it was remarkably close to
15 exactly the one in a half times the density of Fulton
16 that this street would support. And there's very few
17 streets that are at this kind of right of way and
18 proximity to transit. To give it away to like a
19 lower density would be giving up an opportunity that
20 would address our infrastructure need. Would address
21 our sustainability needs. Would address our
22 inclusionary and affordable housing needs. So, that
23 was our rationale for the massing that we proposed
24 here. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you very much. Thank
3 you for the added information of course. I just
4 wanted to skip to one last question. At the end, you
5 kind of were talking about the Tenant Led Community
6 Impact Fund of \$50,000 a year to be distributed to
7 local organizations in a participatory process.
8 Which is a very like novel concept. Where did the
9 idea come from? And when do you anticipate the work
10 to begin?

11 TUCKER REED: Uh, yeah, thank you. I think the
12 concept can really I don't conversations with both
13 Bed-Stuy Restoration and Colvin's leadership and
14 vision and urging to make sure that the building
15 creates benefits that connect back to the
16 neighborhood and some of our own thoughts around how
17 to make sure that when you're introducing new density
18 into a neighborhood, that there is connective tissue
19 created between the new residents that are moving in
20 in the existing community. As well as helping to —
21 helping mitigate some of the impacts of the you know
22 introduction of the units which are both needed from
23 a housing shortage standpoint but also uhm, you know
24 can put a drain on community resources in terms of
25 you know serving new neighbors. And so, this was our

1 attempt of trying to pilot a new approach to sharing
2 some of the benefits that are created by the building
3 with the actual neighborhood that it's located in.

4
5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you. Thank you so
6 much. That's it for me in terms of questions. I
7 want to turn it over to Council Member Cornegy.
8 Before that I just want to acknowledge that we've
9 been rejoined by Council Member Borelli and also
10 joined by Council Member Reynoso. And just as a
11 reminder to my colleagues, we have a five minute
12 clock set up for questions. You can always come back
13 again for a second round of questions if need be.
14 I'll now turn it over to Council Member Cornegy.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you Chair Moya.
17 Again, I just want to reiterate my support for the
18 project. It you know, I think that the way that it
19 was articulated by both of the nonprofit partner and
20 by the developer is that this was a painstaking
21 thoughtful process to make sure that this doesn't
22 have a negative impact, but only a positive impact.
23 My community has unfortunately had the misfortune of
24 projects happening to them and not for them. It was
25 a long tedious drawn out process to get to a place

1
2 that could provide maximum affordability. Some
3 commercial viability in an area that had been
4 underutilized at least for residential. So, I think
5 that it is time that in these communities where
6 affordability is a real, real issue and like I said,
7 I stated earlier we are clearly at the epicenter of
8 gentrification in Bedford Stuyvesant and northern
9 Crown Heights. It requires us to be bold in our
10 thinking and move forward with things that may not
11 necessarily been a part of lexicon for development in
12 the past.

13 So, this is one of those projects that I support
14 at first blush. I know that the Borough Presidents
15 Office Community Board 3 had their misgivings about
16 it. I still stand firmly in my support for the
17 project. I believe that it's what Bedford Stuyvesant
18 needs to begin to do in order to create affordability
19 but also not push out you know, as we create deep
20 affordability not forget our middle class on projects
21 like this.

22 So, the range, I think is the right range. The
23 partnership I think is the right partnership. So, I
24 again, stand firmly in my support for this particular
25 project on Atlantic Avenue. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Councilman Cornegy.
3 I turn it over to our Counsel to see if we have any
4 Council Members that may have any questions for this
5 panel.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair Moya, I see no
7 members with questions for this panel. Excuse me,
8 Council Member Ayala. Council Member Ayala with
9 questions.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I'm sorry.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It's okay.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. I think I may
14 have missed this but, how many stories is this
15 building?

16 BHASKAR SRIVASTAVA: 17.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: 17 stories. And what's
18 the total unit count, I know it's 126 units of
19 affordable housing I think I heard.

20 BHASKAR SRIVASTAVA: So, it is about 420. 420
21 units at which 126, about 126 are affordable housing,
22 inclusionary housing.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I mean, yeah, I think, I
24 don't know, I like the idea. I love the project, you
25 know it's a beautiful building, beautiful design, I

1
2 just worry about the density in that community and I
3 agree with Council Member Cornegy, I mean, you have
4 to be, uhm, you know we have to start thinking about
5 the future of that community and you know we need to
6 start building affordable housing because we're not,
7 you know it seems like that part of Brooklyn is kind
8 of at a standstill. Uhm, but that's a lot of density
9 for that community and the Community Board is in
10 opposition at this point. Did I hear correctly?

11 TUCKER REED: Community Board actually voted
12 unanimously in favor of the project. Just, they
13 recommended a slightly lower density in terms of
14 height.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I just want to add
16 Council Member Ayala, you know under normal
17 circumstances, I feel the same way except it's on a
18 commercial thoroughfare and it's one of the widest
19 streets that we have here and not just in my district
20 but in Brooklyn and its been tremendously
21 underutilized and also changing its landscape from
22 low density commercial is I believe the right way to
23 go. If this would have been in the center of Bed-
24 Stuy, I would say you know obstruction of use, out of
25 context perhaps, however it is on a commercial

1
2 thoroughfare and if we're not going to do it and be
3 bold there where its been that thoroughfare for
4 example has been tremendously underutilized and we
5 can get affordability there. You know that's where I
6 take exception to the density argument because what
7 can happen in the future ten years from now in
8 another administration is that we don't get the
9 affordability and we still get a height.

10 So, I've got an opportunity to set a precedent
11 for on commercial thoroughfares, on underutilized, on
12 low density commercial thoroughfares getting
13 affordable housing. I'm going to do that all day,
14 every day. So, generally it would be out of context
15 if this was a Bed Stuy proper, meaning if it's on
16 Fulton Street, meaning if it's on you know Malcolm X
17 Boulevard. Places where there's low density. Here
18 we have an opportunity on a commercial thoroughfare
19 that has characteristically been low density
20 commercial get affordability and the studies have
21 been done to protect the ancillary communities and
22 blocks from shading and from uhm, and from any
23 disproportionate negative impact.

24 So, that's where I stand. So, at first blush
25 yes, our communities don't want to be over saturated

1
2 and have our density violated but on commercial
3 thoroughfares where that can happen and we can be
4 responsible for that and lead the charge for
5 affordability. That's why I stand in the support of
6 the project. So, I understand you Council Member
7 Ayala. We serve similar districts, I get it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, yeah, no, I mean—

9 COLVIN GRANNUM: Council Member, may I say a
10 couple of words about this?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes, yes.

12 COLVIN GRANNUM: You know what's interesting if
13 you look at the rendering you will see that a lot of
14 that density is actually being given back to the
15 community. Like, it's not being fully utilized. We
16 are not creating a block, a building that's you know,
17 just one cube. But you can see the amount of effort
18 that went into accommodating and responding to the
19 concerns about height. As an affordable housing
20 advocate, I have been respectfully arguing that we
21 should not be afraid of density. That for people of
22 color and people of low and moderate income needs,
23 density is a means for us to have a place in this
24 city.

1
2 Wherever, whether it's Brooklyn or elsewhere, the
3 density is low, people of color are displaced. So, I
4 think this is a very innovative way to make sure that
5 if our city grows, that people of color included
6 throughout this city, density is not an issue. And
7 as we look to the future, density is a way to make
8 housing available to people of a range of incomes out
9 of request that you look at the debt, from that
10 perspective as well.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Understood. Is there any
12 possibility, I mean, are we stuck on the 126 as a
13 number of affordable units for this project? Because
14 that's 30 percent of the project and I mean, I would
15 argue right that there is a significant need for
16 affordable housing in that community and if uhm, you
17 know 70 percent of it is market, then is there room
18 for that?

19 BHASKAR SRIVASTAVA: In addition Council Member,
20 in terms of the mechanisms available in the zoning,
21 30 percent is quite - is probably the maximum amount
22 in there for this kind of a development. But in
23 addition, there's 25 percent of retail being set
24 aside for affordable retail and there's about 9,000
25 square feet of community services spaces in the

1
2 commercial second floor being set aside for
3 neighborhood services. Which could be you know
4 senior centers or childcare or other services that
5 could be provided on the second floor.

6 So, it's not just the housing but it's other
7 things. In addition to that as Tucker mentioned, the
8 building itself is striving to be a low burden on the
9 infrastructure by being sustainable by performing
10 better from an energy perspective. So, it's a lower
11 burden on the city's already strained infrastructure.
12 And at the same time, it's trying to create
13 infrastructure for the community and the neighborhood
14 by having a rechargeable battery stations that can
15 give back in times of need when the infrastructure is
16 hard pressed. Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I just also want to add
18 to that Council Member Ayala. You know me to be
19 someone who always tries to get a double benefit out
20 of a project. The commercial affordability, the
21 displacement of our small businesses in our
22 communities has led to – is a trend that people don't
23 talk about often.

24 They talk about the trend of displacement for
25 residential residents but very rarely mention the

1
2 displacement of commercial tenants. So, for me,
3 being able to create residential affordability
4 simultaneously hand and hand with commercial
5 affordability has been what I've attempted to do on
6 every project in my district. If you ask around, if
7 you ask anybody, my goal has been and I've sat with
8 developers over and over again and they generally
9 lead with the commercial affordability.

10 Because for me, as the former Chair of Small
11 Business, that is an added benefit and will help
12 bolster our community over the long term. We know
13 that our small businesses have the tendency to hire
14 immediately from their community. So, that's a means
15 of job creation. So, there were a lot of
16 considerations on this project. And I just didn't
17 want to like, you know kind of hog the stage on what
18 we thought about in those projects. But now that you
19 mention the commercial affordability, that was a huge
20 benefit to this project and moving forward, I think
21 it's a replicable model for your community and
22 marginalized communities throughout the city. Where
23 we don't just solely focus on residential
24 affordability but we actually build this network or
25

1
2 this ecosystem that has residential affordability and
3 commercial affordability.

4 I know projects in districts across this city
5 that focus wholeheartedly on residential
6 affordability and that residential affordability was
7 paid for by over priced commercial rentals and
8 provides zero services for the residents that live in
9 their very buildings. I know for a fact that there
10 are buildings in the City of New York that are
11 affordable buildings that have a big box store at the
12 bottom. That the people who reside in the building
13 can't even patronize. So, the thoughtful process of
14 creating an ecosystem around residential
15 affordability in conjunction with commercial
16 affordability is a more sustainable model for
17 communities going forward and it was that thought
18 process and then some that led to me being supportive
19 of this particular project and projects like it.

20 Like again, I think are replicable throughout the
21 city especially in marginalized communities. If we
22 do not urban plan in that way, we will have out of
23 context building, where you have deep affordability
24 in the building and residents are unable to access
25 the commercial -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Council Member?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No, it's okay. Thank you for that. We're trying to keep it to five minutes because we do have a long day today of hearings. So, I appreciate it.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No, no, no. We totally understand. I just need to keep the hearing moving. So, thank you for that. Let me just quickly recognize that we've been joined by Council Member Rivera and Council Member Barry G. If we could, there he is, the number one Met fan at City Hall.

If we could Counsel, is there any other Council Members that have any questions for this panel?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no other members with questions for this panel.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Council Member Ayala, did you want to come back for a second round of questions or are you okay?

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No, I'm fine, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you. Thank you. There being no further questions for this panel, the panel is excused and Counsel, do we have any members

1
2 of the public who wish to testify on 1040 Atlantic
3 Avenue rezoning application?

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes Chair, there are
5 approximately five public witnesses who have signed
6 up to speak. For members of the public here to
7 testify, please note again that you will be called in
8 a group - uh, uh, you will be called in a panel. If
9 you are a member of the public signed up to testify
10 on the 1045 Atlantic Avenue rezoning proposal, please
11 stand by. When you hear your name being called,
12 prepare to speak when the Chair says that you may
13 begin. Please also note that once everyone in your
14 panel has completed their testimony, you will be
15 removed from the meeting as a group and then you will
16 be able to view the livestream broadcast of this
17 meeting on the Council website.

18 And we will now hear from the panel, which will
19 include Frank Lang, Raymond Rivera, Rohan DeFreitas,
20 Renzo Ramirez, and Shabazz Stuart. The first speaker
21 on the panel will be Frank Lang.

22 FRANK LANG: Hi, good morning. Thank you all.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

24 FRANK LANG: My name is Frank Lang and I'm the
25 Director of Housing for St. Nicks Alliance. St.

1
2 Nicks Alliance is a 46-year-old non-for-profit based
3 in Brooklyn and we are delighted to be a part of this
4 project as the administering agent. Our
5 responsibility working with the development team and
6 Bed-Stuy Restoration is to ensure that the marketing
7 and lease up of the units, both the initial marketing
8 and lease up and the ongoing compliance of the
9 building follows fair housing, reaches out to a wide
10 variety of residents deep in the community and beyond
11 and adheres to the HPD and HDC guidelines in terms of
12 making sure the process is done.

13 We are an extremely experienced organization and
14 we're delighted to be a part of the project and just
15 testifying to assure the panel that the process is
16 being done in a way that's going to you know ensure
17 that all residents of the community have a fair and
18 open ability to live in these buildings. Thank you
19 very much.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be
21 Raymond Rivera who will be followed by Rohan
22 DeFreitas.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We're going to come back to
25 Raymond Rivera and the next speaker will be Rohan

1
2 DeFreitas. Rohan who will be followed by Renzo
3 Ramirez.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Rohan -

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will come back to Rohan.

7 ROHAN DEFREITAS: Okay, here I go.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Op.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

10 ROHAN DEFREITAS: I'm sorry, having technical
11 difficulties. Good morning everyone and it's a
12 pleasure to be here and I want to speak on behalf of
13 support in this project. First and foremost, let me
14 say, I represent a major consulting company that's
15 involved with this project, Crescent Consulting and
16 we're being involved in helping to assist in the
17 diversity component of this project. And as Colvin
18 mentioned earlier, we will be working very closely
19 with the Bed-Stuy Restoration to ensure that the
20 minority and women owned businesses and local
21 businesses from Brooklyn are included in a
22 development like this.

23 But more importantly, I think it's good for the
24 Council to understand that with developers like Totem
25 partnering with Bed-Stuy Restoration, projects like

1
2 this put forth to accomplish all of the great things
3 that you've heard the project is scheduled to do.

4 And then, more importantly, we will be working to
5 ensure that local residents are given every
6 opportunity and local businesses are also given every
7 opportunity to participate in projects like this.

8 For the 30 odd years I've worked in this business,
9 uh, over these years, it's projects like this that
10 excites me in terms of being involved and ensuring
11 that local communities can see economic opportunities
12 when projects like this are developed. I urge you to
13 support this project, so that you know the community
14 can flourish tremendously on initiatives like this.
15 Thank you and have a good day everyone.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you and thank you for
17 your testimony today.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be
19 Renzo Ramirez who will be followed by Shabazz Stuart.

20 RENZO RAMIREZ: Hello, can you guys hear me?

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you Renzo.

22 RENZO RAMIREZ: Alright, great.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

24 RENZO RAMIREZ: Good morning Chair Moya and
25 members of the Subcommittee. My name is Renzo

1
2 Ramirez and I am a Member of 32BJ SCIU. I am here
3 today on behalf of my union to express our support
4 for the proposed project at 1045 Atlantic Avenue.
5 32BJ is the largest property service union in the
6 country, representing 85,000 property service workers
7 in New York City. Including many who live and work
8 in the Bed-Stuy neighborhood.

9 32BJ supports responsible developers who invest
10 in the communities where they build. I'm happy to
11 report that the developer Totem, has made a credible
12 commitment to creating prevailing wage building
13 service jobs and 126 affordable housing units at this
14 site. We estimate that this development will lead to
15 creating as many as 14 new building service jobs. On
16 behalf of 32BJ SCIU, I respectfully urge you to
17 approve this project. Thank you so much for your
18 time.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Renzo
20 for your testimony today. Counsel, do we have any
21 other speakers?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be
23 Shabazz Stuart, who will be followed by Raymond
24 Rivera.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1
2 SHABAZZ STUART: Hi, good morning everyone. My
3 name is Shabazz Stuart. I'd like to speak
4 enthusiastically in support of this project. Really
5 from two perspectives. For most, as a resident of
6 Crown Heights and Bed-Stuy for most of my life, uhm,
7 we desperately need affordable housing. And I think
8 this project will deliver that in a portion of the
9 neighborhood that's desperately underserved by
10 affordable housing availability.

11 But secondly, also as the Founder and CEO of
12 Oonee, that's going to be at this project, the city's
13 first secure bike parking network on scale, I think
14 this is going to be a great location. It's going to
15 provide a really valuable intermodal transportation
16 opportunity to the residents of Bed-Stuy, Crown
17 Heights and beyond. I think it's great that it's in
18 proximity to a busy subway station. And I look
19 forward to playing a role in partnership with Totem
20 in bringing this transit and climate friendly utility
21 to the area. Thank you so much.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Raymond Rivera will be the
24 next speaker.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Should we try him again?

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Raymond Rivera will be the
3 next speaker. I can see Raymond Rivera and it
4 appears that his microphone is enabled. Okay, uh, we
5 appear to be having a technical issue with Raymond
6 Rivera. And that was the last speaker on this panel.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, are there any Council
8 Members that have any questions for this panel?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
10 with questions for this panel.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, there being no
12 further questions for this panel, this panel is now
13 dismissed. Now, Counsel, can you call up the next
14 panel please?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any additional
16 members of the public who wish to testify on the 1045
17 Atlantic Avenue proposal, please press the raise hand
18 button now and Chair Moya, the meeting will briefly
19 stand at ease while we check for any newly registered
20 members of the public.

21 Chair Moya, there are no additional members of
22 the public who wish to testify on this item.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no members
24 of the public who wish to testify on the
25

1
2 Preconsidered LU items for the 1045 Atlantic Avenue
3 Rezoning Proposal under ULURP's Number C 210276 ZMK
4 and N 210277 ZRK, the public hearing is now closed
5 and the items are laid over.

6 I now open the public hearing on Preconsidered
7 LU's for the proposed Special Navy Yard District
8 under ULURP's Number C 2104762 ZMK and N 210463(A)
9 ZRK. Seeking a zoning map and zoning text amendment
10 relating to property in Council Member Levin's
11 District in Brooklyn.

12 Once again, if you wish to testify on this item,
13 please visit the Council's website to register. That
14 link is at www.council.nyc.gov/landuse. You may also
15 submit written testimony by emailing it to
16 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And seeing that we
17 don't have uhm, Council Member Levin here, Counsel,
18 can you please call the first panel for this item?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Chair, it appears that
20 Council Member Levin is here.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Oh, okay.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I'm not aware of the -

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Do we have Council Member
24 Levin?

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I'm not seeing a Council
3 Member Levin in the list but perhaps he's not quite
4 ready or available.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Let's proceed with the
6 applicant.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel for this
8 item will include David Ehrenberg of the Brooklyn
9 Navy Yard as well as Shani Leibowitz and Melanie
10 Meyers Land Use Counsel for the applicant.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, Counsel, can you please
12 administer the affirmation?

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please raise your
14 right hand and state your name for the record.

15 DAVID EHRENBURG: David Ehrenberg.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell -

17 SHANI LEIBOWITZ: Shani Leibowitz.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry. Do you affirm to tell
19 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
20 in your testimony before this Subcommittee and in
21 answer to all Council Member questions?

22 DAVID EHRENBURG: Yes.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

24 SHANI LEIBOWITZ: Shani Leibowitz.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you, I just
3 wanted to make sure that before we begin that as a
4 reminder for anyone who requires an accessible
5 version of this presentation, please send an email
6 request to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. For the
7 record, panelists, as you begin, I will ask that you
8 please restate your name and organization and now
9 your team may begin. Thank you.

10 DAVID EHRENBURG: Thank you and good morning. We
11 will be presenting a power point, which I think you
12 have, so if you could pull that up, it would be
13 great. Again, my name is David Ehrenberg, I'm
14 President and CEO of the Brooklyn Navy Yard
15 Development Corporation. And after a few slides,
16 I'll be handing it over to Melanie Meyers, our
17 outside Counsel who will be going over some of the
18 more technical details of the special district
19 application. If you can go to the next slide.

20 So, very quickly, as way of introduction to the
21 Brooklyn Navy Yard, we are a former federal Naval
22 Shipyard on the waterfront here in Brooklyn,
23 effectively taking up the entire waterfront between
24 Dumbo and Vinegar Hill and Williamsburg. The
25 property is now controlled by a mission driven non-

1
2 for-profit whose mission is to create high quality
3 middle class jobs in the manufacturing and industrial
4 sector and connect local residents to those jobs.

5 And over the years, we have developed we believe to
6 be a real leading model for place base economic
7 development at this scale. Next slide.

8 Very quickly, we're large. We're 300 acres,
9 which is about half the size of Prospect Park, about
10 one-third of the size of Central Park. We have over
11 70 buildings here at the Navy Yard which we
12 administer in nearly six and a half million square
13 feet of property under roof of buildings. We're home
14 to 450 tenant companies who employ over 11,000 people
15 here. We are just about to hit 12,000 jobs at the
16 yard. Next slide.

17 We think it's important to very quickly touch on
18 our model and mission before getting into the special
19 district, because in many ways, we think of this
20 special district application as a physical embodiment
21 of that mission. Very quickly, we start with a focus
22 on high quality middle class jobs in the
23 manufacturing sector, in particularly the modern
24 manufacturing sector. Which pays living wage jobs
25 and yet is a deeply accessible uhm, industry with

1
2 over half of the workforce or just under half of the
3 workforce. Having nothing more than a high school
4 diploma and the vast, vast majority having less than
5 a college degree.

6 We then use the tools that we have as a mission
7 driven non-for-profit landlords to help our tenants
8 create these kinds of jobs. Again, we focus on
9 manufacturing companies, which often struggle to find
10 long term permanent homes in the city. And we
11 provide to them both the rents that they can afford,
12 as well as the long term stability so that they can
13 continue to invest in their companies and continue to
14 grow and hire more and more Brooklynites and local
15 residents and New Yorkers more generally.

16 And then, the last piece of the mission for us is
17 workforce development and we've built quite a range
18 of workforce development tools here at the yard from
19 direct placement of adults looking for jobs to
20 internship programs focused primarily on the CUNY
21 system. To physically having CUNY schools here at
22 the yard and having opened a new career and technical
23 education here at the Navy Yard, which has become a
24 model for such schools here in the city and
25 elsewhere.

1
2 When you bring all three of those things
3 together, what we are really trying to do as a
4 mission driven landlord, with a large physical
5 holding, is to create a truly equitable central
6 business district. And importantly, the partnerships
7 that we have were deeply embedded in the local
8 community. We've been here for nearly, for 200
9 years, over 200 years and have developed long term
10 relationships. And so, this special district, this
11 master plan, we went through a long process of
12 working with local community stakeholders, community
13 board, local NYCHA residents. But in many ways and
14 most importantly our work with them way predates this
15 activist planning exercise. Next slide.

16 And we've seen extraordinary growth at the Navy
17 Yard in the last eight years, we've doubled the
18 number of jobs from six to 12,000. And based on
19 developments that are underway and tenants moving
20 into the Navy Yard, we will hit 20,000 in the near
21 future. We have been expecting to closing in 21,000
22 jobs by this point. The pandemic obviously slowed
23 that down but it is important to note that we are
24 just over our pre-pandemic employment numbers here at
25 the Navy Yard and continuing to grow quickly. We've

1
2 provided a real stability in the employment sector,
3 in the commercial sector here in our area of
4 Brooklyn. Next slide.

5 We are here today though because much of that
6 growth, which will over you know more than tripled
7 the number of jobs at the Yard, is based on
8 adaptively reusing historic buildings that the Navy
9 left to us. In many cases, well over 100-year-old
10 buildings.

11 While we have significant investments we continue
12 to make in our existing buildings, all major
13 buildings here are fully utilized. And so, we don't
14 have vacant buildings or underutilized buildings
15 which we can go in adaptively reuse and invest in and
16 create hundreds or thousands of jobs at a time. And
17 so, we are now space constrained. However, we see
18 very strong ongoing demand for the kinds of space
19 that we provide. Over 200,000 square feet of new
20 leases for manufacturing companies signed during the
21 pandemic, which is a real testament to the need for
22 this kind of space. And that creates an imbalance
23 where we don't have the space anymore in our existing
24 buildings to meet that demand and it means that we
25 may pass up unless we figure something out. We may

1
2 pass up job growth for both ourselves and our local
3 community in the coming years. Next slide.

4 And so, we uhm, a few years ago recognized that
5 this was going to be happening and again, a master
6 planning process that led to this special district
7 application to really envision a new ground up
8 development scheme here at the yard. So, moving away
9 from adaptively reusing vacant buildings that the
10 Navy left us, to building new construction buildings
11 tailormade for manufacturing companies in urban
12 America.

13 At the same time, as you'll see all of the
14 development sites that we're focused on are at the
15 edge of the yard and it allows us to integrate the
16 Navy Yard into the surrounding community in ways that
17 frankly have not been the case for generations,
18 hundreds of years. And we also in this special
19 district, grappled with the fact that there are uses
20 that are not typically allowed in manufacturing zones
21 which have becomes essential for our, for our
22 mission. And we'll talk a little bit more about that
23 in the future but we are looking to add some uses
24 that will help us connect local residents to not just
25

1
2 the jobs here at the Yard, but also the skills
3 necessary for those jobs in the future. Next slide.

4 And as I said, the vision here is to create large
5 scale ground up development for modern manufacturers
6 in types of buildings that have never been built
7 before in urban America and this will fuel the next
8 phase of significant job growth here at the Yard,
9 brining us to a total when these buildings are built
10 of over 30,000 jobs here at the Yard. So, an
11 additional 10,000 compared to where we will be in the
12 coming years. Next slide.

13 As I mentioned, the major development sites that
14 are available to the Yard are at the edge of the
15 yard. And that has gone into a lot of our thinking
16 about the types of development that are appropriate
17 on these sites. Next slide. To restate what the
18 special division seeks to do is to optimize these
19 buildings for modern manufacturers, to preserve the
20 working waterfront while allowing us to integrate
21 with the local community more and allowing us to
22 continue our mission of connecting local residents to
23 the skills and jobs at the yard. What we are not
24 seeking to do is add any density, add any height or

1
2 any uses that are inconsistent with the current
3 understanding of our mission. Next slide.

4 And so, in the three main buckets are of what the
5 special district needs to do is to optimize the
6 building for modern manufacturers. The industrial
7 zoning was written in the 1960's or adopted in the
8 1960's and a lot has changed in manufacturing uses
9 since then. Particularly parking and loading
10 requirements under existing zoning are significantly
11 higher than are necessary and so, the special
12 district rationalizes parking and loading
13 requirements based on our experience of exactly what
14 manufacturers truly need. It would allow for some
15 additional signage consistent with what's already at
16 the yard. But help with wayfinding and a sense of
17 arrival when you get to this historic part of the
18 waterfront but which frankly, many New Yorkers don't
19 fully understand and allows for these extra large
20 manufacturing floors at the base of the buildings so
21 that as manufacturers truly get the scale and need a
22 fully functioning factory floor in an urban setting,
23 we're able to provide that in these buildings that
24 requires some bulk adjustments in the special
25 district. Next slide.

1
2 Uhm, and the next thing is the integration with
3 the local community. And so, what we are proposing
4 is on those development sites that are again at the
5 edge of the yard, we open the perimeter of the yard
6 to the public and create truly engaging public spaces
7 at the yards edge. The rest of the yard would remain
8 inaccessible to the general public as it has been for
9 many years and we think that's important in order to
10 preserve the working waterfront nature of what
11 happens at the yard with our very heavy manufacturing
12 and ship repair and maintenance etc., that happens
13 here. But we believe there's an opportunity for this
14 integration. We would then line those public spaces
15 with programming that showcases the yard and is
16 consistent with what's happening at the yard. So, we
17 are imagining show rooms for product being
18 manufactured at the yard or museums focused on
19 engineering and robotics, things like that.

20 There then is a set of shared amenities and
21 resources, which frankly we could have now at the
22 Navy Yard but we would not be allowed to make those
23 accessible to the community. Things like conference
24 centers or childcare centers, which we want to -
25 which we allowed as accessory but we want to make as

1
2 of right in the special district so we can open those
3 facilities up to the general public as well.

4 And when we do all of this, it's extraordinarily
5 important for us to ensure again, that we can
6 maintain the efficient operations of our industrial
7 manufacturing companies here at the yard. And a lot
8 of thought has been given in this special district to
9 that.

10 And lastly and I apologize there is not a slide
11 for this but there is some additional uses. I have
12 mentioned childcare, which we see as absolutely
13 essential to the vision of an equitable central
14 business district that is not allowed under current
15 zoning in manufacturing zones unless it's accessory
16 and exclusively available to those working at the
17 Navy Yard and educational uses which have become more
18 and more and more a part of our mission. As the
19 skills required for all jobs in our economy increase.
20 That's also true in manufacturing and so, our
21 partnerships with local uhm, high schools and
22 particularly the CUNY system, we see as an absolutely
23 essential piece of our mission.

24

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 64
2 With that, I will hand it over to Melanie Meyers
3 who will go through a few more of the technical
4 details.

5 MELANIE MEYERS: Thank you very much David.
6 Thank you Chair Moya and Council Members. My name is
7 Melanie Meyers, Fried Frank Land Use Counsel for the
8 applicant. Next slide please.

9 Thanks. So, the actions before you today are a
10 Zoning Map and a Zoning Text Amendment that together
11 will create the Special Brooklyn Navy Yard District
12 and will establish special rules to facilitate the
13 master plan buildings that David spoke about. The
14 Zoning Map Amendment, which you can see on your left
15 will regularize the zoning near the perimeter of the
16 yard with a uniform M21 District at the master plan
17 sites and will map the Special District over the
18 yard. As part of the text amendment and as you can
19 see on the right of the slide, there will be three
20 perimeter subdistricts and these are tied to the
21 master plan sites and there will be one core
22 subdistrict relating to the rest of the yard. Next
23 slide please.

24 Overall, there are five main aspects of the
25 Special District Text and they are focused in large

1
2 part on the perimeter subdistrict where development
3 is expected. These are use, signage, building form,
4 parking and loading and open space and urban design.
5 Next slide please.

6 So, first, the text will allow as David
7 mentioned, a limited amount of additional uses. And
8 these will be there to support the core manufacturing
9 functions of the yard. These will include academic,
10 daycare, other community facilities such as museums,
11 and it will allow for additional retail opportunities
12 so that yard tenants can present their products to
13 the public. Next slide please.

14 Second, the text will allow for a limited amount
15 of place making signage at defined locations at the
16 perimeter of the yard and these will be similar to
17 the signage that exists today on building 77. And
18 this will allow for the yard to have an identity
19 along each of its boundaries and it's better
20 integrated and it sits off to the public. Next slide
21 please.

22 Third, as David mentioned, there will be limited
23 modifications to height and setback and other bulk
24 controls at the barge basin and the Flushing
25 subdistrict. So, on the east and the west of the

1
2 site. And what this will allow is a tripartite form
3 of building that allows for more office like space
4 for early stage prototype design at the upper levels
5 of initial production and more standard manufacturing
6 activities at the midlevel floors. And at the lower
7 portions of the buildings, an extra large scale
8 manufacturing space to provide for the maximum amount
9 of flexibility and needs of the manufacturing
10 community.

11 In addition, the zoning will require that
12 development be set back from the shoreline by at
13 least 30 feet and this is thinking ahead and allowing
14 for the opportunity to introduce resiliency measures
15 at the yard into the future without there being a
16 conflict with the development as being proposed.
17 Next slide please.

18 Fourth, the parking and loading measures that
19 exist in zoning today will be rationalized and
20 improved in three ways. They'll be limiting curb
21 cuts from the surrounding streets for the new
22 development to ensure that traffic is coming into the
23 yard in as an efficient and least interfering way as
24 possible with the surrounding streets. There will be
25 parking controls will be replaced by a transportation

1
2 management plan that will incentivize alternate forms
3 of transportation to the yard and provide for ongoing
4 monitoring of traffic conditions at the yard and in
5 the area. And finally, the loading will be rather
6 than the excessive loading that exists today under
7 zoning, it will be allowed to be tailored to the
8 yards actual needs. Next slide please.

9 Finally, as part of the Special District, there
10 will be a requirement that publicly accessible open
11 space be built as part of each of the master plan
12 developments. When complete, there will be almost
13 190,000 square feet or approximately 4.3 acres of
14 open space introduced to the yard. This will include
15 plaza's in the Flushing and Navy Street Frontages and
16 a waterfront esplanade in the Barge Basin area. As
17 David said, there will be requirements for these
18 basins to be surrounded by active uses, by
19 transparency, by building articulation at the ground
20 level to provide for additional vitality at these
21 locations and to make sure that what's being created
22 is an inviting and attractive amenity. Next slide
23 please.

24
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 68
2 And that concludes the presentation. Thank you
3 very much, we'll be happy to answer any of your
4 questions.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just a few quick
6 questions. The Navy Yards Master Plan close to the
7 construction of new vertical mixed use buildings with
8 predominantly industrial space. Another thing
9 actually is in the proposed special district, which
10 would require the development to be predominantly
11 industrial. They could for example be new buildings
12 with predominantly office space there. What
13 assurances does the public have that the Navy Yard
14 will continue to prioritize industrial jobs and
15 development?

16 DAVID EHRENBERG: Uhm, as a mission driven not-
17 for-profit, in many industrial jobs have been at the
18 core of what we've done for 60 years and that will
19 not be changing. Uhm, proposals to limit our ability
20 to and tailor the zoning, more narrowly to only allow
21 manufacturing doesn't work because of our unique
22 commencing structure that has allowed us to borrow
23 very large amounts of money to fuel this current
24 phase of development and all four – the manufacturing
25 uses that we've developed.

1
2 And so, while we understand the desire to ensure
3 that we will continue to focus on manufacturing,
4 that's what we've done for 60 years and that's what
5 we will continue to do. And we need the flexibility
6 in order to continue our successful execution of our
7 mission.

8 MELANIE MEYERS: Yeah, and I could say just one
9 thing in addition. For the additional uses that we
10 are asking for permission for as part of the special
11 district, all of those would be limited to a quite
12 small amount. The Navy Yard as a whole is about 22
13 million square feet of development both today and
14 under this zoning. In terms of those additional
15 uses, it's less than a million square feet.

16 So, we are trying to make sure that those
17 additional requests that we're asking for are very
18 much a limited portion of the development as a whole.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you and historically,
20 the Navy Yard has accommodated its expansion through
21 the mayor of the mayoral zoning overrides. Why was
22 it now deemed necessary to create a new zoning
23 special district?

24 DAVID EHRENBERG: Uhm, the next phase of growth
25 like I said is - uhm, requires these new buildings.

1
2 And so, we thought as we were planning for that next
3 phase of growth it made sense to rationalize the
4 rules of the road. The zoning at the Yard, so that
5 we could go ahead and execute on the use buildings
6 without the need for repetitive mayoral overrides.

7 And so, it is our expectation that if past, this
8 would allow for the next phase of development and
9 overrides would no longer play as large of a role at
10 the yard or may not be necessary at all.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uh, thank you that's it
12 for me. I'm going to check with our Counsel to see
13 if we have Council Member Levin on for any questions.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Chair, please stand by
15 while we just make sure.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Uh, in the meantime, if
17 they are trying to locate Council Member Levin. Do
18 we have any other Council Members who have any
19 questions for this panel?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, uh -

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I think we have Council Member
22 Reynoso who -

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Reynoso has a
24 hand up.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah, I just uh, more of
3 a comment Chair. Just really excited to see how this
4 process develops. The Brooklyn Navy Yard is a model
5 related to like manufacturing development and
6 economic development in the country. And I think
7 this project can definitely be something that assists
8 in continuing that trend. I want to hear what
9 Council Member Levin has to say. You know I'm always
10 concerned about office space or any commercial space
11 in manufacturing districts but in this case, you know
12 the rationale to allow for these spaces to highlight
13 the work that's happening from the manufacturers is
14 really something that I think could be special.

15 I'm also a big fan of any public access that is
16 available in the Navy Yard. You know I have to go
17 through Flushing when I'm riding my bike. One day,
18 hopefully I can run through the Navy Yard safely, so
19 I will be excited about that one. But again, just
20 want to thank the team at the Navy Yard. These folks
21 really get it. Very thoughtful, communicate very
22 well.

23 Again, concerned a bit about the commercial
24 space, mostly the office space but if it's again, to
25 compliment the work that's happening in the

1
2 manufacturing, it will be a home run. So, again,
3 thank you so much Chair for allowing me to say a few
4 words. Oh, I do have one question for the applicant.
5 It's just waterfront access for actual work, a
6 maritime use. I really want to see that grow in the
7 Navy Yard. Is this something that can assist or
8 impede that growth or is it just to shadow? I just
9 want to understand what the waterfront access looks
10 like and its ability to assist manufacturing
11 businesses. And that will be my last question, so
12 thank you again Chair.

13 DAVID EHRENBERG: Uhm, yeah and thank you for the
14 question. So, the master plan was pretty carefully
15 tailored to make sure that the working waterfront
16 here was preserved. The areas of the waterfront
17 where public access will be granted under this
18 special district are frankly too shallow to allow for
19 real commercial ship repair or maintenance. There
20 may be opportunities to have very small production
21 there, which we will explore as we build these
22 buildings but the majority of our maritime uses here
23 are in the core district of the yard. Which will not
24 be publicly accessible and will remain as an active
25 ship repair maintenance upgrading facility.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 73
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you for that.
3 Thank you Chair.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Okay, one last
5 call for Council Member Levin and then we're going to
6 move on.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Chair, I see no other
8 members with hands raised with questions.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uh, there being no
10 further questions, the applicant panel is excused.
11 Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish
12 to testify on Special Navy Yard District Proposal?

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. For members of the
14 public here to testify, please note again that
15 witnesses will generally be called in panels of up to
16 four or five names at a time. If you are a member of
17 the public signed up to testify on the Special Navy
18 Yard District applications, please stand by when you
19 hear your name being called and prepare to speak when
20 the Chair says that you may begin. Please note
21 again, once all panelists in your group have
22 completed their testimony, you will be removed as a
23 group and the next group of speakers will be
24 introduced. Once removed, participants may continue
25

1
2 to view the livestream broadcast at the Council's
3 website.

4 And we will now hear from the first panel which
5 will include Brady Meixell, Adam Friedman, Renzo
6 Ramirez and Jonathan Bowles. The first speaker on
7 the panel will be Brady Meixell, who will be followed
8 by Adam Friedman.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 BRADY MEIXELL: Good morning. My name is Brady
11 Meixell and I am the Economic Development Specialist
12 for the Southwest Brooklyn Industrial Development
13 Corporation. I'm testifying here today in support of
14 the proposed Brooklyn Navy Yard Special District.

15 For over 40 years SBIDC has provided services to
16 small industrial and manufacturing businesses and a
17 workforce development program into local residents
18 into Southwest Brooklyn. We understand well the
19 challenges to bridging the jobs offered along the
20 industrial waterfront with the local workforce. The
21 Navy Yard has been a leader in making these
22 connections happen.

23 The COVID pandemic confirmed what industrial
24 advocates have long argued. That industrial and
25 manufacturing jobs, industrial businesses and

1 industrial land are a vital resource for our city.
2
3 As the city begins to recover from the pandemic,
4 industrial jobs can be a key part of making our city
5 more equitable because these jobs are accessible to
6 folks with barriers to employment and they offer
7 living wages in a pathway to the middle class.

8 But these jobs need to be accessible to the
9 general public and training for these jobs needs to
10 be part of students education. The Brooklyn Navy
11 Yards plan to create an equitable central business
12 district is important to accomplishing this goal.
13 Their plan to modernize manufacturing space, bring
14 and grow industrial businesses on the campus and
15 expand public spaces interfaces with the local
16 community will help integrate industrial business
17 opportunities and jobs into the fabric of communities
18 all over Brooklyn.

19 SBIDC strongly supports the Navy Yards plan to
20 invest in the future of New York City's industrial
21 sector and the residents in the surrounding
22 community. Thank you for your time.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Adam Friedman will be the
24 next speaker followed by Renzo Ramirez.

2 ADAM FRIEDMAN: Good morning. I'm Adam Friedman,
3 Director of the Pratt Center, which runs the Made in
4 NYC program serving more than 1,500 local
5 manufacturers. And I also Chair the National Urban
6 Manufacturing Alliance which includes practitioners
7 in more than 200 cities. As a long time member of
8 the Navy Yard's Board of Directors, I've seen the
9 evolution of their model for mission driven
10 development.

11 I often use the Navy Yard to illustrate best
12 practice in everything from the curation of tenants
13 to build out a strong ecosystem to the employment
14 center which has been so successful in recruiting and
15 placing NYCHA residents to the very deliberate and
16 comprehensive redesign of their programs and
17 operations to advance racial and economic justice.

18 Chairman Moya and Council Member Reynoso raised a
19 critical issue regarding nonindustrial uses, such as
20 hotels being located in M-zones, which could ignite
21 displacement in which I oppose but that is not a risk
22 here. Converting buildings to maximize profit is not
23 a risk because it is not the mission of the Navy
24 Yard.

1
2 Creating industrial jobs is its mission and there
3 are other safeguards including the yards tenanting
4 guidelines and that the board must approve each
5 lease. As the Navy Yard is ultimately controlled by
6 the Mayor, it's just not – I don't think it's an
7 issue. Allowing showrooms and academic space will
8 strengthen the manufacturing ecosystem. I appreciate
9 that landuse planning typically considers the use and
10 not the user. So, it might appear that a for-profit
11 developer is the same as a non-for-profit from a land
12 use perspective. That assumption is no longer valid.
13 A nonprofit developer typically makes different
14 decisions about many things. From waste handling and
15 energy efficiency to parking and incentives for mass
16 transit and local employment, which will encourage
17 walk to work communities.

18 All of which lead to a different landuse impact.
19 Allowing show rooms and academic space will add to
20 the resources and vibrancy of the Yard and support
21 the manufacturing ecosystem. In this case, I have no
22 hesitation supporting the proposed amendment because
23 there are controls beyond zoning –

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2 ADAM FRIEDMAN: Including the contracts and the
3 admissions. Let me just say these controls are
4 decisive and as David Ehrenberg said at the
5 beginning, the zoning should embody the mission.
6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
8 Renzo Ramirez will be the next speaker followed by
9 Jonathan Bowles.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 RENZO RAMIREZ: Can you guys hear me?

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

13 RENZO RAMIREZ: Alright cool. Good morning Chair
14 Moya and members of the Subcommittee. My name is
15 Renzo Ramirez and I am a member of 32BJ SCIU. As you
16 know, 32BJ is the largest property service union
17 representing 85,000 property service workers across
18 the city. We represent workers who maintain, clean
19 and provide security services in buildings, like the
20 one being discussed at the Brooklyn Navy Yard.

21 32BJ supports responsible developers who invest
22 in the communities where they build. I am happy to
23 report that the developers affiliated with the
24 project building 77 QALICB Incorporated and NYC Small
25 Business Services have a track record as responsible

1
2 employers. We are happy to report that the
3 developers associated with this project have made a
4 credible commitment to creating prevailing wage jobs
5 at this site. We estimate that this rezoning, which
6 will allow the construction over four million square
7 feet in support of the creation of manufacturing jobs
8 over the next ten years.

9 We estimate that the proposed project would
10 increase the commercial office by more than one
11 million square feet. Which could result in 33
12 additional cleaning jobs, 15 additional security
13 jobs. On behalf of 32BJ SCIU, I respectfully urge
14 you to approve this project. Thank you so much for
15 your time.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Renzo. Thank you
17 for your testimony today.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jonathan Bowles will be the
19 next and last speaker on this panel.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 JONATHAN BOWLES: Good morning. My name is
22 Jonathan Bowles and I am the Executive Director of
23 the Center for an Urban Future. A thinktank focused
24 on creating a more equitable economy in New York.
25 I'm testifying in favor of the proposed Brooklyn Navy

1
2 Special District. One of the most concerning
3 economic trends in New York in recent years has been
4 the extremely slow growth in middle class jobs that
5 are accessible to New Yorkers without a college
6 degree.

7 In the ten years prior to the pandemic, one-third
8 of all the new private sector jobs in the city were
9 created in just three industries: home health care,
10 restaurants, and retail. Each of which is among the
11 lowest paying sectors of the economy. Tens of
12 thousands of additional low-wage jobs were created in
13 nail salons, the social assistant sector, and gig
14 economy positions. At the same time, industries that
15 used to provide large numbers of middle class jobs in
16 New York have had little or no growth in the past
17 decade. Including hospitals, finance, legal
18 services, and traditional manufacturing. Where good
19 accessible jobs have been growing in New York, its
20 largely been in the kind of things being created at
21 the Navy Yard.

22 Jobs related to modern manufacturing and in
23 innovative companies, the intersection of production,
24 technology, and design. That's why I am so
25 supportive of these proposed zoning changes, which I

1
2 believe are crucial to enabling the Navy Yard to grow
3 even more good jobs in the future.

4 In addition to cultivating these jobs, the Navy
5 Yard Development Corporation has been among the best
6 in the city in taking steps to expand access to good
7 jobs through place based job training and education
8 programs. The partnerships they created with their
9 next gen career and technical education high school
10 and CUNY's graduate phone program at the yard, our
11 models that should be emulated in other parts of the
12 city. I would like to see more of those kind of
13 partnerships, that's another reason I support these
14 proposed zoning changes. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
16 testimony today.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
18 speaker on this panel.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, do we have any questions
20 for the panel?

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, I see no members with
22 questions for this panel.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uh, there being no more
24 questions for this panel, this panel is now excused.
25 Counsel, if you can, please call the next panel.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
3 James Williams, Jan Michael Maluto, Kayon Pryce,
4 Kyiesha Kelly, and Sinade Wadsworth. The first
5 speaker will be James Williams followed by Jan
6 Michael Maluto.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 JAMES WILLIAMS: Good morning. Thank you
9 esteemed City Council Members. My name is James
10 Williams and I am the Chief Operating Officer at
11 Nanotronics here in the Brooklyn Navy Yard,
12 testifying in support of the Special Brooklyn Navy
13 Yard District.

14 The world is in the throws of the greatest
15 material supply and health crisis in over a century.
16 The last time our country had to navigate crisis like
17 these, New York City had a larger manufacturing
18 workforce than any other city in the country. We're
19 living in an urgent time to build. Without the
20 infrastructure to train our neighbors and ourselves
21 how to build for both today and tomorrow, we risk
22 running up against long term economic struggle.

23 Nanotronics Manufacturers inspection and process
24 put in for a wide range for other manufacturers.
25 From biotech to aerospace from toothpaste to tires.

1
2 Our largest customers are in the semiconductor and
3 genomics industries. Two industries that have become
4 part of our daily conversations. Without the ongoing
5 support of the Brooklyn Navy Yard and its ability to
6 bring us dedicated and resourceful talent, we would
7 not have been able to grow at the speed the world
8 needs. More vocational training for the next
9 industrial revolution is needed now and in
10 perpetuity. These crisis are not temporary long term
11 effects of COVID. COVID stressed the weakest points
12 of the supply chain.

13 This crisis will persist unless we come together
14 collaboratively to foster invention. The next
15 industrial revolution, much like the first American
16 industrial revolution is being built on the New York
17 waterfront. This city, our city, is uniquely
18 positioned to train and grow the workforce that will
19 bring us all closer to abundance and a better future.
20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony
22 today. Next.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jan Michael Maluto will be
24 the next speaker followed by Kayon Pryce.

25

1
2 JAN MICHAEL MALUTO: Hi, good morning Council
3 Members, Chair Moya and member of the Subcommittee.
4 My name is Jan Michael Maluto and I am testifying in
5 support of the Navy Yard Special District. I
6 represent Ferra Designs, we're architectural metal
7 workers and glazers. Ferra has been a Navy Yard
8 tenant for over 20 years and employees over 40
9 talented metal workers, machinists, finishers and
10 designers and I'm proud to share that our employees
11 represent all five boroughs of the city and you can
12 see they work on projects including Trinity Church
13 Wallstreet, Pier 57 and the Morgan Library.

14 I can tell you with confidence that it would be
15 difficult to support our type of work, all done
16 locally by New Yorkers without the continued support
17 of the Navy Yard. We utilize every zone of our
18 20,000 square foot base and often mount full scale
19 mock ups and preinstallation assemblies that can
20 exceed 20 feet.

21 The XL floor plans in the Special District, truly
22 represent how a manufacturer like us actively
23 utilizes industrial space. Of perhaps greater
24 significance, the Navy Yard's mission based business
25 support and workforce development services has been

1
2 proven to be vital partners in our work. The Owl
3 Wilcher (SP?) Performance Center has connected us with
4 installers, fabricators, and a senior project
5 manager. We've trained our machinists at the Seam
6 Center and enrolled fabricators and finishers in new
7 management training.

8 On a personal note, as I've done in previous
9 testimony, I can also thank the Yard for my own
10 career development through City Techs Manufacturing
11 Department, I joined the first cohort of SBS's Tech
12 Training Program. I interned for over eight years
13 and multiple projects and now a Director here at
14 Ferra. Thanks to the Yard, I am proud to say that
15 we've hosted and hired many other city tech interns
16 since. Go City Tech.

17 As a lifelong New Yorker and a manufacturing
18 tenant, I am proud to work on a campus that's
19 constantly affirming its manufacturing centered
20 mission. The yard actively engages its manufacturing
21 tenants and details of the master plan showed it.
22 Ferra celebrates the recent arrival of new industrial
23 and construction tenant including Nanotronics. As
24 well as quality transport and access improvement.
25 I've been a Ferra commuter since their first day of

1
2 service and actively use the Dumbo and Atlantic
3 Terminal Shuttles. I support the vision and –

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 JAN MICHAEL MALUTO: And we look forward to many
6 years there. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Kayon
9 Pryce followed by Kyiesha Kelly.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 KAYON PRYCE: Good morning everyone. Chairman
12 Moya, thank you for hearing my testimony. My name is
13 Kayon Pryce and I serve as the proud Founding
14 Principal of the New York City Department of
15 Educations Public High School Program, The Brooklyn
16 Steam Center.

17 The Steam Center is a socioeconomically diverse
18 school that is located on the third floor of one of
19 the Navy Yard's largest properties building 77. It
20 brings together high school juniors and seniors for
21 the purpose of career and technical education
22 programming across five distinct industries.

23 As a proud Brooklynite who grew up in Crown
24 Heights in East Flatbush, attended high school at
25 George Westinghouse High School and has worked on the

1
2 Navy Yard for the last three years, I'm incredibly
3 proud to be a member of this community and a partner
4 to Brooklyn Navy Yard Building Corporation.

5 Like so many New Yorkers whose community has been
6 significantly impacted by COVID-19, which has only
7 accentuated the deep public health and economic
8 inequities of our city, I am internally grateful for
9 the Navy Yard's support in helping us meet the needs
10 of our community since our inception. Over the past
11 18 months and since our beginning, the Brooklyn Navy
12 Yard Development Corporation has secured grants for
13 our school, purchased wireless hotspots, technology,
14 food and delivery services to help meet the needs of
15 our families and our scholars during their time of
16 need.

17 When the DOE was slow to respond, the Navy Yard
18 jumped in and helped us immediately provide for our
19 community and significantly lowered the learning loss
20 that many New Yorkers experienced during the COVID-19
21 pandemic.

22 During the beginning of the shutdown, the Navy
23 Yard placed a callout to its employer community and
24 partnered with us both to utilize the manufacturing
25 equipment in our space to produce masks, ventilator

1
2 parts when there is as nationwide shortage. To
3 recover and grow and thrive as a city, we need to
4 invest in proven models to economic growth for
5 everyone.

6 The Brooklyn Navy Yard has proven that it can
7 successfully bridge the gap between workforce
8 development, education, private industry and the
9 public sector to create viable, middle income jobs -

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 KAYON PRYCE: That support all New Yorkers. I'm
12 excited to see a special district and the access that
13 it provides for our community and I support the
14 proposal that's been submitted to the City Council.
15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you so much. Thank you
17 for your testimony today. Next speaker.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Kyiesha Kelly will be the
19 next speaker followed by Sinade Wadsworth.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 KYIESHA KELLY: Hi, my name is Kyiesha Kelly, I -
22 oh, excuse me. Hi, uhm, Congressman Moya and Special
23 Committee. Thanks for having me today. I am here
24 speaking on the behalf of - in support of the
25 Brooklyn Navy Yard. And we have been - My name is

1 Kyiesha Kelly and I'm the Co-Owner of Hip Hop Closet.

2 I was born and raised in Fort Greene and went to
3 elementary school and junior high school directly
4 next to the Brooklyn Navy Yard. We have been a
5 tenant in the Navy Yard for 23 years and the Navy
6 Yard has been instrumental in helping us with growth
7 and we've utilized the employment center to get
8 employees throughout the years. We've had interns
9 that we were able to hire and we've also worked with
10 the Steam Center to have high school interns help us.
11

12 We manufacture clothing and accessories in our
13 space and the rezoning of the Navy Yard would be
14 instrumental in helping us grow. We would not be
15 able to grow like we have without the help from the
16 Brooklyn Navy Yard. The business services and
17 External Affairs Department at the Navy Yard has
18 provided unparalleled services and in 2017, we were
19 able to participate in the first Navy Yard business
20 cohort that empowered me to expand my business and
21 ultimately increase our revenue by 175 percent.
22 Throughout the pandemic, they have never left our
23 side and they've provided many seminars and resources
24 to keep our business alive.
25

1 Seeing that amazing transformation throughout the
2
3 23 years that we've been here has been just
4 tremendous and we look forward to more growth. The
5 proposed rezoning of the Brooklyn Navy Yard would
6 help us to welcome the community more effectively,
7 enable us to offer more services and ensure that more
8 young adults enter the workforce with tangible
9 skills.

10 The rezoning would allow all of the businesses in
11 the Brooklyn Navy Yard to hire and create highly
12 employable local individuals. It is for these
13 reasons that I support the special zoning proposal.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you so much
16 for your testimony today.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sinade Wadsworth. The next
18 and last speaker on the panel will be Sinade
19 Wadsworth.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 SINADE WADSWORTH: Good afternoon Chair Moya and
22 Council Members. My name is Sinade Wadsworth,
23 Council Representative for the New York City District
24 Council of Carpenters.
25

1
2 I would like to take the time to express our
3 support for the project, however, I'm a little
4 perturbed that the word jobs is being thrown around
5 after such a horrible pandemic. You know a lot of
6 people lost their livelihoods and I didn't hear one
7 mention of careers today. I didn't hear one mention
8 of apprenticeship's today. I, myself, came through
9 an apprenticeship program called Nontraditional
10 Employment for Women ten years ago and to this day, I
11 still have a career that one day I can hopefully and
12 will retire with dignity.

13 So, with that being said, I wanted to know if
14 there can be any implementation of apprenticeship
15 programs. Pre-apprenticeship programs and pathways
16 that [LOST AUDIO 1:43:49] -

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sinade?

18 SINADE WADSWORTH: With that being in support of
19 the project, but again, if apprenticeship programs
20 can also be added and give people the opportunity to
21 retire with dignity, I think that would really,
22 really, really help people in our community. Thank
23 you so much.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Sinade. Thank you
25 for your testimony today. And as we move forward, we

1
2 have still some time to be talking about the issues
3 that you brought up today during your testimony. So,
4 thank you again for being part of this hearing today.
5 Counsel, any more uhm, panelists?

6 You're muted. If we can unmute Arthur. There we
7 go.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry. Sinade Wadsworth was
9 the last speaker on this panel. I see that Council
10 Member Levin has a hand raised for questions.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Council Member Levin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I just wanted to -

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I apologize, I'm Chairing
15 another hearing concurrently, so I'm stepping away
16 for a moment.

17 We're still discussing the Navy Yard correct?

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We are.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh, would it be possible
20 that I ask Representatives from the Navy Yard a
21 handful of questions? Are they still on?

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: They're not on.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: They're not on anymore,
24 okay. Okay, I just wanted to take the opportunity to
25 uhm, uh, acknowledge the work that they have put into

1
2 this application. The work that they have done
3 really over the last 15 years uhm, to make the Navy
4 Yard an example of economic development that is
5 focused on job creation as Sinade said just now. I
6 mean, I do think that they are focused on career
7 creation, career advancement and not just jobs but
8 businesses and careers.

9 I do want to acknowledge the perspective when
10 looking at this application of how we're able to best
11 ensure you know the priority of how we're able to
12 best ensure that uhm, that the additional floor area
13 that's created as a result of this rezoning. Uhm,
14 produces light manufacturing and other types of
15 manufacturing and is not exclusively office space
16 that doesn't have a manufacturing - because the Navy
17 artist unique in its configuration and the way that
18 it has access to loading docks and closed off streets
19 and uhm, uh, things that a lot of other industrial
20 areas don't have. That it is important that we take
21 advantage of that for the purpose of creating long
22 term more manufacturing space.

23 So, we've been in conversations around this issue
24 uhm, for a number of months. And so, we're hopeful
25 that we'll be able to get to a good combination there

1
2 or resolution in terms of how we're able to best
3 ensure that and track that in the future. And uh,
4 and with that, I'll turn it back over to the Chair.
5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Council
7 Member Levin uhm, for your remarks. Counsel, do we
8 have any other panelists?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any other
10 members of the public who wish to testify on the
11 Special Navy Yard District Proposal, please press the
12 raise hand button now. Chair, the meeting will
13 briefly stand at ease while we check for any members
14 of the public who may have registered.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Do we see any members of the
16 public?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry Chair, just waiting for
18 a final confirmation. Uh, okay Chair, I see no other
19 members of the public who wish to testify on these
20 items.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no more
22 questions for this panel, the witness panel is now
23 excused.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And with that I see no other
25 members of the public who wish to testify.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. There being no members
3 of the public who wish to testify on the
4 Preconsidered LU items under C 210462 ZMK and N
5 210463A ZRK for the Special Navy Yard District
6 Proposal. The public hearing is now closed and the
7 items are laid over.

8 I now open the public hearing on the
9 Preconsidered LU item under ULURP Number N 210406 ZRY
10 for the Citywide Zoning Text Amendment to establish a
11 Special Permit for Hotel Use. Proposed by the
12 Department of City Planning. I will remind the
13 viewing public for anyone wishing to testify on this
14 item. If you have not already done so, you must
15 register online and you may do that now by visiting
16 the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.
17 Counsel, can you please call the first panel for this
18 item?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel for this
20 item will include Jennifer Gravel and Alex Placas
21 both of the Department of City Planning.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you and if you could
23 please administer the affirmation.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please raise your
25 right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the

1
2 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
3 testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer to
4 all Council Member questions?

5 PANEL: Yes.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay. Just a quick reminder
7 for anyone watching this meeting who requires an
8 accessible version of this presentation. You may
9 send an email request to

10 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And now, you may
11 begin your presentation and I will just remind you
12 both as you begin speaking, please just state your
13 name and organization for the record. Thank you.

14 JENNIFER GRAVEL: Thank you Chair Moya and thank
15 you for having us here today. My name is Jennifer
16 Gravel, I am the Director of the Housing and Economic
17 Development Division at the Department of City
18 Planning and I am joined by my colleague Alex Placas
19 who is the Project Manager for the Citywide Hotels
20 Text Amendment. And I'd like to turn it over to Alex
21 to run through a brief presentation and will be back
22 to answer any questions you may have.

23 ALEX PLACAS: Thank you Jenn and if you could
24 bring up the presentation please. Alright, hello, my
25 name is Alex Placas. I am the Planner at the

1
2 Department of City Planning and this is the
3 presentation of the Citywide Hotel Special Permit.
4 Next slide please.

5 So, the proposed text amendment would create a
6 new special permit for hotel development citywide.
7 It's intended to create a consistent framework for
8 hotel development and ensure that hotels do not
9 negatively effect the surrounding area. Next slide
10 please.

11 A special permit is a discretionary action, which
12 will require any hotel project subject to ULURP. A
13 special permit requires environmental review and the
14 application is reviewed by the Community Board and
15 Borough President, the City Planning Commissioner and
16 City Council. The average time to receive approval
17 ranges between 18 to 36 months. Next slide please.

18 Over the years, rapid growth of new hotels has
19 occurred throughout the city. In CMX districts,
20 hotels have introduced conflicts with surrounding
21 uses. Overnight accommodations differ from other as
22 of right uses in proximity because they are similar
23 to both commercial and residential uses but also have
24 the potential to conflict with both. The distinction
25 of hotels may require additional scrutiny to ensure

1
2 they are developed in ways that won't present
3 conflicts with the neighborhood and local businesses.

4 Hotels have the potential to create land use
5 conflicts in a variety of neighborhood context and
6 zoning districts. For example, the hotel on the
7 screen here is located in the Rockaways. As a hotel
8 with better site planning may have led to a wider
9 sidewalk. The current sidewalk leading to the beach
10 is thin and may push pedestrians into the street,
11 causing safety concerns for guests and residents
12 alike. The robust tourism economy is vital to the
13 city's economic health and is expected to recover
14 from the pandemic. Once the industry recovers from
15 the pandemic, hotel development is expected to
16 resume. Next slide please.

17 So, the new special permit will be applicable in
18 higher density commercial districts, mixed use
19 districts and paired and 1R Districts where there is
20 not a special permit today. The new special permit
21 will apply to those areas that already have a special
22 permit and the proposal would apply to the new
23 special Gowanus mixed use district approved by the
24 City Planning Commission. N1 Districts will retain
25 the findings from the N1 hotel special permit since

1
2 those address unique concerns in light industrial
3 areas.

4 The map here shows the applicability of this
5 proposal. The magenta color shows areas that would
6 require the new citywide hotel special permit. This
7 means, that any hotel development would need to apply
8 for this special permit with the Department of City
9 Planning. This process would make all proposed
10 hotels subject to ULURP review. Which includes time
11 for the Community Boards review, adopt and submit a
12 recommendations to the City Planning Commission. The
13 grey color shows areas on the map where hotels are
14 already subject to this special permit process and
15 require public review. The white areas do not allow
16 hotel development. Next slide please.

17 So, the current findings are that the hotel use
18 shall not impair the future use and development of
19 the surrounding area. And then, the CPC approved
20 additional findings are included on the screen here.
21 These two findings are from the existing N1 Special
22 Permit and are applicable to a wide range of
23 neighborhood context and provide additional guidance.

24

25

1
2 These modifications have been in response to
3 community boards and others who have stated that the
4 current findings are vague. Next slide please.

5 There are modifications to the vesting
6 provisions. I reviewed the status of filed and
7 certified applications as of June 30th of 2021,
8 indicated that several projects may not require the
9 approvals and time to meet vesting and exclusion
10 criteria. And may require additional time to obtain
11 approval and flexibility to modify the proposal.

12 Although the department assumed most filed
13 application would best of the day of the adoption of
14 the text amendment, many projects have not had
15 sufficient time to process applications.

16 These modifications will not expand the universal
17 projects that may vest like the projects who have
18 worked in good faith, time to reach the above
19 milestones. Next slide please.

20 And now, we are happy to take any questions.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you very
22 much. Just a couple of questions uhm, to go with
23 what the presentation was, what you were saying in
24 the presentation. Is there an assumption that a
25 certain percentage of special permit applications

1
2 would be disapproved and thereby impact the hotel
3 industry recovery?

4 JENNIFER GRAVEL: You mean in the assumptions in
5 the environmental review or—? Uh, no, there was an
6 assumption in the number of projects that would seek
7 and get approved in over the course of a year. But
8 no assumptions about disapproval of applications.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Uhm and why is the
10 special permit for hotels in M1 districts being
11 preserved but other existing hotel special permits in
12 special districts are being standardized?

13 JENNIFER GRAVEL: Sure, I can take that question.
14 The M1 hotel special permit was very recently adopted
15 and was also intended to address the very unique
16 conditions in industrial areas. Across the city over
17 time, we have developed a number of special permits
18 primarily in special districts that are similar but
19 slightly different. So, we have what was — had
20 become kind of patchwork framework for reviewing
21 hotel development. And this proposal is creating a
22 more standardized and consistent way to consider
23 those hotels.

24 But where there are special permits prior to
25 this, they would continue to have a special permit

1
2 but would simply be replaced by a consistent
3 framework.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, if approved, are
5 there certain areas of the city that you feel are
6 inappropriate for new hotel special permits?

7 JENNIFER GRAVEL: Uhm, I mean there are areas of
8 city where we don't allow hotels and that's not
9 changing as a result of this proposal. Uhm, so the
10 special permit is simply creating a process for
11 additional review in areas where we do believe they
12 are appropriate. So, in commercial districts and
13 mixed use districts and manufacturing zones. I mean,
14 I do imagine there maybe instances where a specific
15 project given its surrounding context may not be
16 appropriate but it would be up to the future at sort
17 of commission and City Council to make that
18 determination.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Uh, and just my last
20 question here. Can you for the record restate the
21 public purpose for excluding shelters from the
22 special permit requirement.

23 JENNIFER GRAVEL: Sure. So, the special permit
24 is intended to address the concerns related to the
25 siting of commercial hotels. It would not effect the

1 city's current rules relating to setting shelters.

2 We understand that there have been concerns expressed
3 about the shelter exemption but we have maintained it
4 to address really the chronic shortage for temporary
5 housing. And so support the city's legal obligation
6 to provide eligible individuals and families with
7 access to shelter.
8

9 And retaining the exemption for the shelter
10 really provides for a sufficient flexibility for the
11 city and for nonprofit providers of emergency
12 shelters to really most efficiently affordably and
13 appropriately shelter a population with very diverse
14 needs.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Uhm, that's it for me in terms
16 of the questions. Counsel, do we have any Council
17 Members that have questions for this panel?

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
19 with questions for this panel.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no further
21 questions, the applicant panel is excused. Counsel,
22 are there any members of the public who wish to
23 testify on the Hotel Special Permit Proposal?

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we do have a few
25 witnesses. For members of the public here to

1
2 testify, please note again that witnesses will be
3 called in panels. If you are a member of the public
4 signed up to testify on a Proposed Hotel Special
5 Permit Text Amendment please standby when you hear
6 your name being called and prepare to speak when the
7 Chair says that you may begin.

8 We will now hear from the first panel, which will
9 include Jeannine Nixon and Carlos Encarnacion.
10 Jeannine Nixon will speak first followed by Carlos
11 Encarnacion.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Uhm, and members
13 of the public, you will be given two minutes to
14 speak. Please do not begin until the Sergeant at
15 Arms has started the clock. And the first panelist,
16 you may begin.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh we're going to come back
19 to Jeannine Nixon and first hear from Carlos
20 Encarnacion. Carlos Encarnacion.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

22 CARLOS ENCARNACION: I'm ready to.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Whenever you're ready, you can
24 begin Carlos.

1
2 CARLOS ENCARNACION: Okay. Thank you panelists.
3 Thank you for the opportunity to address this
4 commission. I'm a longtime resident of Brooklyn. I
5 have seen many changes throughout the years. Some of
6 those changes are positive, some are not that
7 positive, especially for people like me, for people
8 in low income communities. Uhm, although we need
9 hotels because we need the influx of money, the
10 tourism bring to the city but we also need uh the
11 fabric of the city, you know to be diverse.

12 So, that means you know including affordable
13 housing in some other setting. So, that's why I urge
14 you to support this Special Permit for hotels because
15 that will allow for more inclusive and diverse city.
16 And also, it will impact you know the tax base for
17 the city. Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next panelist.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We'll try one more time to
20 hear from Jeannine Nixon.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

22 JEANNINE NIXON: Hi, good morning. Good morning,
23 can you hear me?

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Good morning Jeannine. We can
25 hear you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: We hear you.

JEANNINE NIXON: Okay, great, great, great. I'm sorry, I did have just a little difficulty.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It's okay, you can start.

JEANNINE NIXON: Okay, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Jeannine?

JEANNINE NIXON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You may begin.

JEANNINE NIXON: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hold on one second.

JEANNINE NIXON: Good morning Council Member.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hold on one second Jeannine. We had to restart your clock. Now, you may begin.

JEANNINE NIXON: Good morning Council Members. My name is Jeannine, I do live in downtown Flushing and I have been a Queen's resident for many years. I support the Hotels Trade Amendment because I've seen first hand how the hotels development around here and near the airports have negatively impacted our communities without any input from residents.

Over the past ten years, a lot of the new hotels have opened in New York City and not just in Manhattan. Hotels have opened all around the outer boroughs. Some of the hotels have brought tourists

1
2 to the neighborhoods while others were built in
3 places that haven't become popular neighborhoods to
4 stay in. If there is anything New York City has play
5 of these days is hotels. I am not against the hotel
6 development. The vast majority of the hotels in this
7 city provide good accommodations to millions of
8 tourists. They have good jobs. They generate tax
9 dollars but I do, I do think that there have been
10 some cases especially here in Queens where the hotels
11 have changed the surrounding areas and it's hard to
12 argue that they were needed. It shouldn't be too
13 much to ask. That the hotel developers work with the
14 neighborhoods around where they want to build.

15 The city already has a surplus of hotel rooms in
16 2019, which was a record years, you know for years of
17 tourism. So, it definitely is not in danger of
18 running out of the hotel rooms anytime soon. Letting
19 the public have a say in the hotel development may
20 slow new hotel construction but it will help make you
21 know sure that the development going forward is
22 substantial and doesn't destroy the character of the
23 city and bring tourists here. That's if they bring
24 them here in the first. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
3 testimony.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
5 speaker on this panel.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, is there any questions
7 for this panel?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I see no members with
9 questions for the panel.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no questions
11 for this panel, the witness panel is now excused.
12 Counsel, can you please call up the next panel?

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any other
14 members of the public who wish to testify on the
15 Proposed Citywide Hotel Special Permit Text
16 Amendment, please press the raise hand button.
17 Chair, the meeting will briefly stand at ease while
18 we check for any members of the public who may have
19 newly registered to testify.

20 Chair Moya, I see no other members of the public
21 who wish to testify on this item.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no members
23 of the public who wish to testify on the
24 Preconsidered LU item relating to the Proposed Hotel
25 Special Permit Text Amendment under ULURP Number N

1
2 210406 ZRY, the public hearing is now closed and the
3 item is laid over.

4 I now want to open the public hearing on LU
5 Numbers 906 and 907 for the 250 Water Street
6 Proposal, which seeks a Zoning Text Amendment and a
7 Zoning Special Permit relating to property in Council
8 Member Chin's district in Manhattan. I will remind
9 the viewing public for anyone wishing to testify on
10 this item, if you have not already done so, you may
11 register online and you may do that now by visiting
12 the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse. I
13 want to acknowledge that we have been joined by
14 Council Member Chin and I would like to turn it over
15 to the Council Member to say some opening remarks.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair Moya. I
17 just wanted to thank you again for hosting a long
18 hearing for a rezoning project in my district. So, I
19 really appreciate that and also, to the Committee
20 Member and I just want to welcome everyone to this
21 hearing today and I look forward to the presentation
22 and to all the testimony from the Community Board and
23 from the public. So, thank you Chair Moya.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you. One second,
25 I'm sorry. Before we proceed, I just need to - I

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

want to make a brief correction in my opening statement, when I said I now opened up public hearing on LU's Number 906 and 907 for the 250 Water Street Proposal, which seeks the Zoning Text Amendment and a Zoning Special Permit linking to property in Council Member Chin's District in Manhattan. I will note that an application for disposition approval in connection with these actions is expected to be filed with the Council at a later date.

So, I just want to make that correction before we go into the next panel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. The applicant panel for this item will include Saul Scherl, Chris Cooper, and David Karnofsky. Available for question and answer will include Adam Meister, Wesley O'Brien and Charlie Fields.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay Counsel, if you could please administer the affirmation.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer to all Council Member questions?

PANEL: I do.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Uhm, just as a reminder to the
4 - before the panelist begins, I just want to let
5 everyone know once again, anyone who requires an
6 accessible version of this presentation may send an
7 email request to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

8 And now your team may begin. I just remind you to
9 please when you begin speaking to state your name and
10 the organization for the record. Thank you.

11 SAUL SCHERL: Good morning Chair Moya and Council
12 Members. Thank you for this opportunity to present
13 our proposal today. I am Saul Scherl, President of
14 the Tri-State Region for the Howard Hughes
15 Corporation. I will provide today a brief overview
16 of Howard Hughes role in the community through our
17 project and then I will turn it over to Chris Cooper,
18 a partner at SOM to review the design followed by
19 David Karnofsky, our Land Use Attorney and partner at
20 Fried Frank to review the land use actions you are
21 considering today. Next slide please.

22 Over the past decade, Howard Hughes has worked to
23 preserve and revitalize the South Street Seaport.
24 Our work has included giving new life to historic 19
25 Century buildings on Schermerhorn Row reconstructing

1
2 Pier 17 above the 100 year floodplain and
3 refurbishing the beloved tin building. The parking
4 lot at 250 Water Street has been a barrier and a gap
5 with urban fabric in the seaport neighborhood for
6 over 50 years. Have we caught up to the slide yet?

7 Our proposal with the design approved by LPC
8 would finally transport this site into a welcoming
9 gateway to the South Seaport Historic District. Next
10 slide please. The plan will transform the 50-year-
11 old parking lot into a mixed use building near the
12 Fulton Subway Station. As we all know, a major lower
13 Manhattan Transit Hub. It will bring much needed new
14 housing, including 80 plus deeply affordable
15 apartments allowing families making 40 percent AMI to
16 live near public transit and good jobs with access to
17 the waterfront in a neighborhood where little
18 affordable housing exists today.

19 Our proposal will ensure the long term stability
20 of the beloved South Street Seaport Museum, activate
21 the streetscape and enhance community life as well as
22 implement a safe environmental cleanup. Importantly,
23 this proposal will generate over \$1 billion in
24 economic activity creating thousands of new
25

1
2 construction and permanent jobs when New York City
3 needs it most.

4 And this new building will add hundreds of new
5 patrons for struggling local businesses and help to
6 fuel New York City's post COVID recovery. Next slide
7 please. The proposal enjoys strong support from 32BJ
8 to local residents, business, and nonprofits to
9 citywide civic organizations and leaders. Over 100
10 local small business owners have signed a letter
11 saying a project is needed and will fuel new
12 businesses. And 8,000 supporters or close to 8,000
13 supports have signed a petition in favor of this
14 project, a real vote of confidence in our stewardship
15 and vision for this unique and special part of New
16 York City. Next slide please.

17 It's not everyday that you see the editorial
18 boards, three New York City daily papers getting
19 behind a development project. The New York Times
20 post the daily news, as well as many other
21 publications have endorsed 250 Water Street and the
22 benefits that it brings to the Seaport. And the New
23 York Times Urban Planning architecture critic,
24 Michael Kimelman(SP?) praise it as a worthy example
25 of smart urban planning. Next slide please.

1
2 I want to take a few minutes and just quickly
3 touch very briefly on Howard Hughes commitment to an
4 engagement with the Seaport community. Next slide
5 please.

6 I took over Howard Hughes in the Seaport a little
7 over five years ago. In that time, I made it a
8 priority to invest in ways that benefit all who live
9 and work in this community. And to all those who
10 visit to experience the beautiful waterfront and
11 learn about this essential piece of New York City
12 history.

13
14 To date, Howard Hughes has invested over \$700
15 plus million in the project. And we've committed
16 another \$850 to preserving and developing the
17 Seaport. Including this proposal for transforming
18 the parking lot at 250 Water Street to productive
19 use. Our investments have created thousands of jobs
20 and generated over \$1 billion dollars in economic
21 activity. Including introducing unique independent
22 retail, dining, entertainment and cultural events to
23 revitalize this area.

24 HHC has reconstructed this Pier 17 and the tin
25 building on a new resilient pier as well as

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

refurbished and maintained the upland 19 Century Buildings along the Seaport Cobblestones. And we've made the waterfront more open, accessible and resilient. These efforts have greatly enhanced our neighborhood. The safety and quality of life and over the past year and a half, we partnered with our community to ensure the Seaport is able to survive and thrive as the city emerges from the COVID pandemic. Next slide please.

Here are just a few examples of programming the community events that Howard Hughes is proud to support at the Seaport. Next slide please. And here are some examples of the robust relationships we have worked with. So many local nonprofits from cultural to social services and environmental organizations that are doing incredibly important work in the Seaport.

I'm now going to hand things off to our architect Chris Cooper, who is going to talk about our planning process and the LPC approved proposed design. Thank you.

CHRIS COOPER: Thank you. Chris Cooper from the Architecture and Planning Office of SOM. Next. And next again, please. There have been decades of

1
2 planning efforts by the city, the community. Next.
3 And various civic groups. Yet, the promise of the
4 Seaport has not been fully realized and its not for
5 lack of good ideas or worthy aspirations, but there
6 has not been a mechanism for implementation or a
7 source of funding sufficient to realize the broader
8 vision. And that's what we think we are bringing
9 forward today. Next.

10 250 Water Street is a unique full block site,
11 situated at the edge of the South Street Seaport
12 Historic District. Three blocks from the waterfront
13 and adjacent to the towers of lower Manhattan. Next.
14 For more than 50 years, this site has persisted as a
15 surface parking lot, not contributing to the vitality
16 of the neighborhood or the community.

17 As a full city block, the four sides are all
18 unique from one another and you can see that on the
19 images on the right. When masonry historic buildings
20 to our south and east on Beekman and Water Street and
21 tall and modern buildings to our north and west on
22 Peck Slip and Pearl Street. Next.

23 Here we show the site in its current use, looking
24 north. Next please. Looking North with Peck Slip
25 School. Directly to our north and the widened Pearl

1
2 Street to the west with South Bridge Towers directly
3 across Pearl Street. The sites exceptionally well
4 served by public transportation, especially the mini
5 subway lines. They could be accessed by the Fulton
6 Street and City Hall stations and the mini bus routes
7 that run along Pearl Street. As well as water taxi's
8 and ferry stops on the East River. Next.

9 In a two decade trend, Community District 1 has
10 experienced significant residential growth.
11 Essentially doubling it's residents in the past 20
12 years, increasingly the area has become an even more
13 vibrant mixed use community. Albeit one that is not
14 as diverse or affordable as other parts of the city.
15 Next.

16 In the blocks immediately surrounding the parking
17 lot at 250 Water, is a vibrant neighborhood filled
18 with active streets, sidewalks lined with local
19 restaurants, retail shops, pharmacies, grocery store,
20 private and public schools. Uhm, and as you just
21 heard from Sol, many of these business owners and
22 institutions support this project and an increase in
23 even more local customers. Next.

24 And finally, it's worth noting that thanks to
25 significant investments by the City of New York, this

1 neighborhood is also home to several new open spaces.

2 Next. So, with that is context. Let's take a look
3 at the proposed design. Next.

4 Our proposal is a direct response to the city's
5 uhm, and sites immediate context. Both the rich
6 history and the evolution of the broader urban
7 context that surrounds the site. Next.

8 To achieve that, we have proposed a two part
9 massing that responds to the contrasting scales of
10 this full city block. A low base with a tall
11 residential building. Next. And here in plan, you
12 can see how we've shifted the bulk of the building to
13 align with pearl street, that's represented in the
14 lighter color. The tall bar is configured as a
15 composition of small, rectangular blocks to break
16 down the massing. And to our east and to our south,
17 the site faces direct uhm, directly low masonry
18 historic buildings. And so, we've provided
19 significant setbacks to or east on Water Street of
20 nominally 50 feet and to our south on Beekman Street
21 of 90 feet. Next.

22 The Water Street elevation as seen here is kept
23 low. It responds directly to scale, texture and
24 materiality of the district. The street wall heights
25

1 vary and it's defined by multiple small entrances to
2 retail and community facility. Next. On Pearl
3 Street, we've continued the low street wall around
4 the corners but we break the masonry façade at the
5 center of the block. And we changed the material
6 here and the proportion to relate directly to the
7 tall massing above, which clearly associates the tall
8 portions of the building with Pearl Street.
9

10 All the primary entrances to the building and
11 I'll show this in plan shortly, are located here on
12 Pearl Street. Next. A couple of renderings. First
13 standing on Fulton Street looking north up Pearl
14 Street, you can appreciate the first, the benefit of
15 the deep 90 foot setback, which is on Beekman. It
16 separates the low scale four ground from the taller
17 massing. And then the height for the building is
18 clearly positioned here on Pearl Street. And so, the
19 sheering of the volumes that I showed in plan, you
20 can see here breaking down the mass of the building.
21 And you also see the break in the masonry façade uhm
22 mid-block to create a strong sense of entry for the
23 residences above. Next. And then as we cross the
24 street, cross Pearl Street and stand within the
25 district looking north on Water Street, you see very

1
2 clearly how the two part massing addresses the
3 difference of scale between Pearl Street and Water
4 Street.

5 The tall building clearly faces onto Pearl Street
6 and is in the context of its neighbors that are tall.
7 And uhm, and no Water Street, uhm the low massing
8 then enhances and strengthens the district context
9 and relates directly to the masonry buildings that it
10 faces. Next.

11 Here, we look at the specifics of our proposal
12 and the stack. The program uh section here shows the
13 distribution of program. So, we have a five story
14 base of mixed program, particularly at street level.
15 Retail, community space and various entrance lobbies
16 and then four floors of commercial office space in
17 blue that make up the base of the building. And the
18 residential bar rises above that. And uhm, as
19 mentioned there is 20 percent of the residential is
20 affordable housing and that is shown as rental units,
21 four floors of rental, affordable rental units and
22 then above that are for sale condominium units.
23 Next.

24 So, we look at the site plan, you can see that
25 we've focused uhm, the majority of the programming

1
2 and uh, and active entrances on Pearl Street, which
3 is the wide active street. So, all vehicular access
4 is off of Pearl Street, the blue diamonds represent
5 first the loading dock on the north and then
6 vehicular access to parking on the south. So,
7 there's an entrance to parking and then an exit
8 directly onto Beekman, which loops you directly back
9 to Pearl. So, we keep the traffic out of the narrow
10 cobbled streets. The plan is really organized around
11 one central through block, residential lobby with the
12 primary entrance on Pearl Street. A convenience
13 entrance on Water Street. This is a shared lobby for
14 affordable rental and market rate condominium. And
15 there's an office lobby also on Pearl and then the
16 rest of the block is activated by small neighborhood
17 retail spaces. And then an anchor community space
18 which is on the corner of Water and Peck Slip facing
19 onto Peck Slip. Next.

20 I'll conclude with just few more renderings. The
21 first is the rendering from the Brooklyn Bridge and
22 you can really see the idea of the two part massing,
23 a low base relating to the four ground and a tall bar
24 relating to the context of the city. The building in
25 height steps down from the height of its neighbors to

1
2 the south. And the massing of the residential bar is
3 broken into smaller kind of composition of parts to
4 remove it from the language of the broader office
5 buildings in the adjacent context. Next.

6 And this view, we're looking south on Pearl
7 Street. We see uhm a variety of scale, an entrance
8 conditions including the large residential entrance
9 midblock. And the next final view, stepping over
10 onto Water Street, you see by contrast Water Street.
11 Next please. By contrast, Water Street represents a
12 different scale all together and a low masonry scale
13 that responds and activates and uhm, the character of
14 the historic district itself. Next. And I will pass
15 now to David Karnofsky.

16 DAVID KARNOFSKY: David Karnofsky, Fried Frank
17 Land Use Counsel to the project. Next slide please.
18 The centerpiece land use change here is to sever
19 floor area that currently sits on the waterfront at
20 Pier 17 and moves it from the waterfront to a more
21 suitable upland location. And I'm going to go
22 through how that works. Next please.

23 The first action is to modify the site plan for
24 the existing large scale general development in the
25 area, which consists today of Pier 17 and the Tin

1
2 Building shown in red. What would happen is that in
3 addition to the Pier 17 Tin Building zoning lot, the
4 streets, the de-mapped streets that intervene between
5 205 Water Street and Pier 17 would be added into the
6 large scale and together with 250 Water Street would
7 form a new expanded large scale development.

8 And I'm going to now speak stick to the third for
9 a minute, the zoning text amendments. Also needed to
10 form this scale, it's a zoning text amendment that
11 confirms that these, the mapped streets. These
12 streets were de-mapped in the '80's and have no floor
13 area associated with them, may serve as zoning lots
14 for purposes for the definition of a large scale.
15 The former streets became zoning lots upon the de-
16 mapping in '83 but at that time, there was also
17 zoning text added to the zoning resolution that said
18 that they could continue to serve as streets for
19 certain zoning purposes related to height and setback
20 in the light. The purpose of this text amendment is
21 simply to confirm that they can perform the function
22 of zoning lots for purposes of the large scale.

23 With the large scale in place, the next action
24 going back to number two, is to allow for the
25 distribution of floor area from Pier 17 to 250 Water

1
2 Street. 234,630 square feet of unused floor area on
3 Pier 17 would be moved to 250 Water Street. In
4 addition, the large scale would be used to facilitate
5 height and setback waivers that would accommodate the
6 building that was approved by the Landmarks
7 Preservation Commission and last week by the City
8 Planning Commission.

9 The proposed waivers would permit the buildings
10 reduce the minimum base height. In certain
11 locations, increase the maximum base height in other
12 locations and allow encroachments into setback areas
13 around Pecks Slip and Pearl Street and exceed the
14 maximum permitted roof height of 120 feet. All of
15 these waivers as I said, are intended to facilitate
16 the building approved by LPC.

17 In addition, the building requires a curb cut
18 authorization on Pearl Street, which is a wide
19 street. This will be a 20 foot curb cut and would
20 serve as the entrance as Chris explained to the below
21 grade as of right accessory attended parking facility
22 with the exit located on Beekman Street.

23 And the last couple of actions listed here relate
24 to the site plan for Pier 17 and reflect minor
25 changes to the Pier 17 site plan including the

1
2 addition of bollards, tree guard groups along the
3 access drive and a skylight on the Pier 17 building,
4 as well as the realignment of the access drive which
5 is on the apron that runs from South Street to the
6 Pier 17 building. And that's the summary of the land
7 use actions.

8 SAUL SCHERL: Next slide. So, this is as I
9 touched on earlier, this is a project that will
10 deliver many benefits to the community and New York
11 City. I'd like to review a few of those exciting
12 attributes in greater detail in the next few slides.
13 Next slide please.

14 This is well known lower Manhattan, it's one of
15 the most affluent neighborhoods in New York City with
16 little affordable housing. This was exacerbated by
17 the removal of 1,600 apartments that comprised of
18 South Bridge Towers from the Mitchell Lama Housing
19 Program. Leaving the neighborhood well out of reach
20 for working families.

21 Our proposal, which will be privately financed,
22 will voluntarily conform to the requirements of
23 mandatory inclusionary housing program to a binding
24 agreement with HPD. This will immediately increase
25 diversity and needed affordable housing to this area.

1
2 Specifically, we're proposing to bring some 80
3 permanently deeply affordable family apartments at 40
4 percent of AMI, Area Median Income, approximately
5 \$45,000 a year for a family of four. The affordable
6 housing will incorporate onsite amenities as well a
7 community facility space of approximately 5,000
8 square feet. Importantly, these new homes would be
9 located near one of New York City's largest transit
10 hubs, good employment opportunities and high quality
11 schools. Next slide please.

12 The proposal will create thousands of
13 construction and permanent jobs and generated needed
14 economic activity as you can see from this slide.
15 Next slide please. The Seaport Museum is the heart
16 and sole of the historic district. The longstanding
17 cultural institution has been a champion for the
18 historic district and bolstered its vitality. Its
19 leadership, staff and volunteers work tirelessly to
20 preserve and promote the story of this historic
21 entryway to our city. Through exhibitions and
22 programs and landmarked buildings and on historic
23 ships. Its collections preserve thousands of
24 artifacts and records.

25

1
2 Agency development rights purchase will generate
3 \$40 million that the city will set aside for a museum
4 undoubted fund that will generate significant annual
5 investment earnings that will be distributed to the
6 museum for operating support, ensuring its long term
7 fiscal stability. In addition, the city has also
8 committed \$10 million of capital in the recent budget
9 to advance funds for future museum capital
10 rehabilitation projects. Next slide please.

11 We are designing a building to meet and exceed
12 Lead Silver and now, I'm going to hand it over back
13 to Chris Cooper who is going to talk about that.

14 CHRIS COOPER: Yeah sure, I just want to make a
15 point that we are uhm, you know sustainability is on
16 the front of everybody's mind right now and we are
17 making great steps with this project to have it be
18 very aggressive to meeting the new Local Law 97. And
19 working towards an all-electric future and also,
20 building a resilient building. We are on the edge of
21 the design flood elevation and this is a fully
22 resilient project as well. Next.

23 SAUL SCHERL: The only thing that I would add to
24 that is that within Howard Hughes, we have a full
25 team that is working on sustainability and these

1
2 issues that will be intimately working closely with
3 Chris and his team on this to make sure. Uhm, the
4 project contains many hallmarks of what is recognized
5 as smart urban planning and design. For example, it
6 will eliminate now 50 plus year old surface parking
7 lot. It will add residential housing units close to
8 transit jobs, transit and jobs. It will have a
9 vibrant mix of uses including residential housing,
10 offices, neighborhoods, retail and community oriented
11 space.

12 The design is LPC approved and contextual to the
13 historic district. We've located the height and bulk
14 as Chris mentioned, closer to the financial district
15 and put the loading and parking access on Pearl
16 Street, a wide commercial street. The streetscape
17 design is contextual as well with bluestone and
18 cobblestone sidewalks, street trees and historic
19 light fixtures that will harmonize within the
20 historic district. Next slide please.

21 As to environmental, I'd like to reiterate that
22 Howard Hughes is an active member of this community
23 and the safety of our community and neighborhood is
24 of critical concern to all of us. When we purchased
25 this site, we were fully aware that contamination was

1
2 present and that it had been there for over 100
3 years. We immediately voluntarily entered the New
4 York State Brownfield Cleanup Program. A rigorous
5 program that mandates robust community input and
6 close oversight by the New York State DEC and DOH.
7 We've been engaged in that process now for over two
8 years and have committed to transparency since day
9 one.

10 HHC has funded an independent community monitor
11 with expertise in hazardous materials to ensure that
12 the community can track every detail of the project.
13 As of now, a remedial investigation work plan has
14 been completed by Lyman Engineering in consultation
15 with Community Board One, our elected officials and
16 the community monitor. And we have been approved by
17 the state DEC and DOH.

18 DEC and DOH are now reviewing the draft remedial
19 action workplan and we have a website dedicated to
20 providing public and transparent information. Next
21 slide please.

22 I'd like to thank you again Chair Moya and
23 members of the Subcommittee and Council Member Chin.
24 We appreciate your consideration of this project,
25 which we and our many supporters believe is essential

1
2 to moving the Seaport forward. We believe the
3 Seaport best days are ahead. We hope to continue to
4 play a dynamic role in its recovery and a bright
5 future for New York City. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just a couple of
7 questions before I turn it over to Council Member
8 Chin. Uhm, you know we have heard concerns from the
9 adjacent school about potential construction impacts.
10 Can you describe any measures you're planning to
11 avoid any disruptions?

12 ADAM MEISTER: Sure, thank you Chair Moya. Uhm,
13 we are going to be working through a robust set of
14 measures to protect the adjacent community. These
15 will range from sidewalk ridges to appropriate
16 signage, safety barriers and netting, noise
17 mitigation features. We'll be undertaking a
18 construction protection plan with consultation from
19 the Landmarks Preservation Commission to protect
20 historic structures and we will uhm, be formerly a
21 construction working group, to work very carefully
22 with all of the surrounding neighbors and all of the
23 sensitive receptors.

24 We are in dialogue and will be you know as we
25 finalize our construction plans with the neighborhood

1
2 to make sure that the appropriate mitigations are in
3 place from a noise perspective, from an environmental
4 perspective. And some of those you know examples
5 include uhm providing for storm windows or you know
6 excess levels of glazing to the extent those are
7 required, replacing air conditioning units. So, it's
8 a whole range of things. We spelled out a number of
9 those in the very detailed environmental impact
10 statement that was worked through with community
11 input and those are just a few of the highlights. If
12 uhm, Wesley, if you had anything to add to that, I'd
13 encourage you, as I know you were you were carefully
14 involved as was Charlie Fields with AKRF in terms of
15 analyzing all of the various impacts and mitigations
16 that are under consideration.

17 WESLEY O'BRIEN: Sure, I would just add that the
18 measures that are committed to, they are very fine
19 grain. There are a number of construction best
20 management practices that the applicant team has
21 committed to in terms of emissions reduction and
22 noise reduction during construction.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you. Uhm, moving
24 on, I know that you were talking about the affordable
25 housing units there. Because this proposal doesn't

1
2 include an up-zoning here and instead relies on a
3 transfer mechanism, can you explain how the
4 affordable housing units will be memorialized as part
5 of this project?

6 DAVID KARNOFSKY: Uh, yeah, David Karnofsky.
7 Uhm, you're absolutely right, it is not governed by
8 MIH strictly speaking because it is not an up-zoning.
9 However, HHC had agreed that as a condition of its
10 ability to use the floor area that it's purchasing,
11 it will enter into a regulatory agreement with HPD
12 that will require adherence to all of the
13 requirements of MIH as a program.

14 So, that the closing on the development rights
15 can not take place until that regulatory agreement
16 has been executed.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Uhm, and how has
18 development improved the pedestrian experience around
19 the area? And will there be any new crosswalks added
20 here?

21 SAUL SCHERL: Chris, do you want to take that
22 one?

23 CHRIS COOPER: Yes. There are not additional
24 crosswalks being added but what I would say is that
25 we have uhm, we have been careful to put any

1
2 congestion outside of the narrow gobble stone streets
3 and focused the primary entrances onto Pearl Street,
4 which then have direct connections to public
5 transportation. And so, we have all of our entrances
6 are specifically the direct entrances are recessed
7 off of the sidewalk and then we have gone through -
8 we are actually enhancing the entire perimeter
9 sidewalk with historic materials. So, stone
10 sidewalks and a specialty paving around the
11 perimeter.

12 But I would say that the primary gesture we have
13 made is to place the entrances carefully on the wide
14 street of the block.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Uhm, and my last
16 question and I think you were touching upon this
17 towards the end of the presentation. But as you know
18 the building is in the 100 year flood plain but
19 beyond the minimum building code standards, what
20 flood mitigation strategies will the proposed
21 development employ? If we can just get into more.

22 CHRIS COOPER: Sure, maybe I'll start there and
23 Adam, you may want to continue but we are doing dry
24 flood proofing of the majority of the perimeter and
25 we are - so we are implementing store fronts because

1
2 we are also in a historic district, we don't want to
3 build barriers or visual barriers. So, we're
4 implementing glass storefronts that are also storm
5 proof, that are flood proof. And uhm, and so we're
6 actually going above and beyond to try to make sure
7 that we bring the program all the way down to
8 sidewalk level but still provide a full barrier of
9 flood protection around the perimeter. Our site is
10 kind of half in half out of the floodplain, and so,
11 all of the primary entrances are on Pearl Street,
12 which is the high point of the site. So that we
13 don't have any primary entrances within the
14 floodplain.

15 And so, we also then know that our building can
16 be operational during flood and also immediately
17 after flood. And we know also that our building will
18 not cause any unintended consequences to the
19 perimeter to buildings beyond our site or outside of
20 our site.

21 ADAM MEISTER: Yeah, the only thing I would add
22 to that is that the building, mechanical systems and
23 critical infrastructure will be elevated generally
24 above the first floor and well out of the floodplain.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 135
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you very much.
3 That's it for my questions. I now want to turn it
4 over to Council Member Chin.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair Moya.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you for your
8 questions. Thank you. I just want to also to
9 follow up with the noise mitigation question.
10 Because you know the development is going to be right
11 across the street you know from two schools. And so,
12 I know that we have experienced in lower Manhattan
13 that construction time you know can be flexible when
14 kids are in school. And are you looking at that?
15 Because especially when you are doing the real noisy
16 stuff of pile drilling or the foundation work, that
17 you need to take that into consideration. So, that's
18 one question.

19 The other is that if you can do a breakdown on
20 the MIH in terms of the different AMI and number of
21 units in those categories and I also have some
22 interest in terms of your climate you know resiliency
23 and you know presentation. You talked about rain
24 water retention. I mean, I captured rain water, I
25 mean, so how does that work in terms of utilizing

1
2 that resource to water the plants or do you know, to
3 help you know green the area?

4 And the other concern is that right across the
5 street from the school, I mean the whole, the Peck
6 Slip space, there's a playground for the DOW but is
7 there a commitment to really helping the school do a
8 play street? So, there is more active uhm, open
9 space for the Peck Slip School? So, Saul or Adam?

10 ADAM MEISTER: Sure, yeah thank you.

11 SAUL SCHERL: Thank you.

12 ADAM MEISTER: Thank you Council Member Chin.
13 Uhm, I'll just go through each of these.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Oh, one more.

15 ADAM MEISTER: Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: One more is that I saw in
17 the real deal, that HHC is talking with Pace
18 University about doing a possible community theater
19 on your office space or retail space. So, maybe if
20 you could elaborate on that because I have never
21 heard of that before. Thank you.

22 ADAM MEISTER: Sure, I'll go through each of
23 these and other members of the team I think will
24 contribute as well. In terms of the noise
25 mitigation, again, we're very much committed to

1
2 working with our neighbors to minimize the impacts
3 from noise. In terms of specific timeframes, you
4 know we're going to be as we get to the point where
5 we have a detailed construction schedule, we will be
6 engaging with uh, with those local neighbors, with
7 the Community Board to outline that and specify it in
8 great detail. And we are you know open to you know
9 working around and making the schedules flexible as
10 it can be in terms of you know times of days and
11 critical periods, so that we minimize that
12 disruption.

13 In terms of the number of units and the
14 affordability. We're, as was in the presentation, we
15 are targeting an average of 40 percent AMI. Uhm, we
16 don't have the specific mix in terms of you know
17 where that all falls. So, some of the AMI's will be
18 below and some will be above. It's going to be
19 pursuant to the uhm the deep affordability option
20 within MIH so we will conform to that. I think there
21 is a cap of 130 percent AMI but I'm not sure we'll
22 even be up that high to hit the average of 40 percent
23 but it will be around that 40 percent and that's what
24 the unit average will be.

25

1
2 And the size, the unit size requirements also
3 will conform to the MIH parameter in terms of the mix
4 and the uhm, you know for example the number of – you
5 know two bedrooms versus studios and so on.

6 Uhm, on the climate resiliency, uhm, Chris, maybe
7 you could chime in here?

8 CHRIS COOPER: I'd be happy to. So, you
9 mentioned uhm, rainwater retention or stormwater
10 management. And one thing I want to make an
11 important point is that right now, this is a surface
12 parking lot and all the rainwater falls onto that lot
13 and then runs downhill from where it falls directly.
14 The big advantage that we have is as we build the
15 site, we have major set back in outdoor spaces that
16 come in, catch the rainwater. So, all of our
17 rooftops are designed with landscaping and with the
18 way that we're uhm, planting and accommodating the
19 roofs to capture the rainwater, instead of letting it
20 just run off the site to the adjacent sites.

21 And so then once we hold that, we can do – we do
22 two things with it. Some we retained, actually use
23 for the maintenance of the landscape on the roof and
24 some just gets taken slowly into the stormwater
25 system. So, it's a better way of managing the

1
2 stormwater on the site than what is currently there
3 today.

4 ADAM MEISTER: Okay, thanks Chris. Uhm, in
5 regard to the – so I don't know if you want – the two
6 questions that were left were the Play Street and
7 Pace and anything else you wanted to add.

8 SAUL SCHERL: Yeah, as it relates to the Play
9 Street obviously, it involves coordination with DOT.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 SAUL SCHERL: I'm sorry.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We'll let them finish up,
13 yeah. It's okay.

14 SAUL SCHERL: It involves coordination with DOT
15 and we're working very closely with DOT. We are in
16 favor of the Play Street and we'd like to see it stay
17 and make sure that not only to protect the
18 construction but it is something that stays beyond
19 construction in long term. Obviously that somewhat
20 requires coordination among city agencies. So, we
21 are working with them and would like to see that
22 happen as well.

23 And in relate to your question on Pace
24 University, you know they have expressed interest in
25 the community about finding a theater space. They

1
2 are expanding their theater program and uhm, we have
3 no commitment with them. No, letters of intent or
4 anything like that. They were curious to find out
5 about the base of the building. And because of that
6 question and with some discussions we had with them,
7 we wanted to have that as an option if down the road
8 Pace we were able to come to terms with them about
9 building them some type of you know space that would
10 be good for the arts. But there's no transaction or
11 nothing that we can share with you at this point.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, I mean, I think it
13 would be nice to have that going but uhm, that will
14 be a nice addition right? Thank you Chair. If I
15 have any other questions I will come back. But I
16 really look forward to hearing -

17 SAUL SCHERL: We agree that it would be an asset.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Testimony from the public.
19 Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sure, okay. Thank you Council
21 Member Chin. Counsel, do we have any other Council
22 Members that have any questions?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I don't see any
24 members with questions for the panel.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, there being no
3 further questions, the applicant panel is excused.
4 Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish
5 to testify on the 250 Water Street Proposal? We just
6 need you to unmute Arthur, sorry.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry, for members of the
8 public who are here to testify, please note again
9 that witnesses will generally be called in panels of
10 four. If you are a member of the public who has
11 signed up to testify on the 250 Water Street
12 Proposal, please stand by and when you hear your name
13 being called and be prepare to speak when the Chair
14 says that you may begin.

15 We will hear from the first panel. We have
16 approximately 60 persons registered. The first panel
17 will include Michael Kramer, Diana Switaj, Paul
18 Goldstein, and Adrienne Sosin. Chair, with your
19 permission, I just want to make a quick procedural
20 announcement to all of the people waiting to testify.
21 If you have registered and you are now waiting in the
22 Zoom, there is no need for you to use the raise hand
23 function. We will get to everyone and we appreciate
24 your patience. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just a reminder
3 for our members of the public, you will be given two
4 minutes to speak. Please do not begin until the
5 Sergeant at Arms started the clock. Now, the first
6 speaker may begin.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Michael Kramer.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 MICHAEL KRAMER: Good afternoon. My name is
10 Michael Kramer and I represent the Seaport Coalition.
11 In the matter of 250 Water, foiled emailed show that
12 City Planning was instructed by City Planning was
13 instructed by City Hall to proceed as a priority
14 project. The drop will give lower priorities to
15 another project, given their workload and pipeline.

16 Deputy Mayor Vicki Been organized a weekly
17 Tuesday 4:00 p.m. 250 Water City Hall, EDC, DCP, LPC,
18 check-in to keep it moving though the regulatory
19 pipeline. The applicant has unleashed a team of
20 lawyer lobbyists upon city agencies. The former
21 general counsel to DCP is now representing HC, the
22 former general counsel to LPC is now representing HC.
23 In the first three reporting periods for 2021, almost
24 \$600,000 has been spent on lawyers and lobbyists.
25 Fried Frank's fourth period filing is now a month

1
2 overdue, so these numbers through August 31st, might
3 approach as much as \$750,000 or more.

4 This application is flawed. Not only is the
5 development at Pier 17 not integral to 250 Water,
6 neither are the pedestrian ways which provide the
7 only access to several buildings on these blocks. I
8 do not abut 250 Water or Pier 17. It is an absurd
9 construct that you should reject. Seaport Streets
10 define the boundaries of blocks. Zoning lots are
11 found within blocks, including former streets in the
12 proposal is just a work around scheme to move air
13 rights.

14 The head of Community Board One has a plan to
15 fund an endowment for this for the South Street
16 Seaport Museum. Without this tower, overwhelming and
17 dominating the historic district. This large scale
18 general development plan diminishes the Seaport's
19 unique relationship to the water and compromises the
20 last intact 19 Century neighborhood at a place where
21 New York began.

22 And four members of the City Council Land Use
23 Committee will find the 250 Water ULURP to be a
24 corporate give away by the Mayor -

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2 MICHAEL KRAMER: We implore Council Members to
3 stand up to the Mayor on this application and vote
4 no. Thank you for your attention.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony
6 today. Uh, next speaker.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Diana Switaj will be the next
8 speaker followed by Paul Goldstein.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 DIANA SWITAJ: Good afternoon. My name is Diana
11 Switaj, I am Director of Planning and Land Use at
12 Manhattan Community Board One. CB1 is strongly
13 opposed to this application for the privately owned
14 250 Water Street site. As it seeks major changes to
15 the long-standing Seaport zoning.

16 It is an egregious departure from years of
17 carefully crafted zoning regulations meant to guide
18 the orderly growth of the Seaport and the
19 modifications proposed by HHC to reconfigure these
20 rules or to advance a private profit driven agenda.
21 CB1 is extremely disheartened by CPC's vote to
22 approve this application with only one objection and
23 almost no discussion.

24 In 2003, CB1 sponsored a ULURP application to
25 change the zoning to C62A and won overwhelming

1
2 support from the community, property owners, the
3 Seaport Museum, Downtown Alliance, CPC and all
4 elected officials. This current zoning caps building
5 heights for new buildings at 120 feet and is meant to
6 maintain the low scale size of buildings within the
7 unique historic district.

8 CB1 has adopted multiple resolutions indicating
9 it would support a new building at 250 Water Street
10 that complies with the existing zoning and is
11 extremely troubled by the proposed building that is
12 roughly three times taller than what is currently
13 permitted.

14 There is critical concern and uncertainty
15 surrounding the Seaport Museums in endowment and the
16 pledged John Street law expansion as a result of this
17 proposal. The project team in the city are currently
18 working to find a solution to this problem but
19 regulatory hurdles may prohibit the funds from being
20 guaranteed to the museum and the exact mechanism for
21 this funding has not yet been shared, including what
22 guarantees are in place.

23 Already EDC has not fulfilled its 2019 promise to
24 the Seaport Museum with the FCRC funding stream it
25 asked CB1 support. There is a history at the Seaport

1
2 of agreements left unfulfilled by HHC, including the
3 Pier 17 rooftop, once presented as an expansive open
4 space for primarily communities. Now mainly a
5 private event in concert venue, as well as a
6 commitment for a 10,000 square foot local and
7 regionally sourced affordable and accessible market.
8 Now planned to be a high end food market curated by
9 Celebrity Chef. CB1 is extremely troubled by the
10 idea of support for this project in exchange for a
11 guarantee to save the museum -

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 DIANA SWITAJ: And the potential that this will
14 be eventually added to a list of commitments left
15 unfulfilled. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
17 testimony. Next speaker.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Paul
19 Goldstein followed by Adrienne Sosin.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 PAUL GOLDSTEIN: Okay, ready?

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Ready.

23 PAUL GOLDSTEIN: This 345 foot tall tower before
24 you would be a great addition.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 147
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sorry Paul, just one second.
3 We just got to restart the clock.

4 PAUL GOLDSTEIN: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yep, there we go.

6 PAUL GOLDSTEIN: This 345 foot tall tower before
7 you would be a great addition to build virtually
8 anywhere else in lower Manhattan. But it's grossly
9 out of scale and inappropriate for the South Street
10 Seaport Historic District.

11 Approving these ULURP applicants would set
12 several bad precedents including one, allowing
13 development rights to be moved into historic
14 districts. What will prevent this maneuver from
15 taking place in other historic districts.

16 Two, rewriting the special rules governing the
17 transfer of development rights in the Seaport whereby
18 they are only supposed to be moved to sites outside
19 the historic district.

20 And three, allowing developers to rewrite the
21 rules which allow the transfer of developed rights
22 from an adjacent site but instead using a de-mapped
23 street to create a fake connection to sites located
24 blocks away. The current C62A zoning was put into
25 place in 2003, when the city approved a plan

1 supported by CB1, the Downtown Alliance, local
2 elected officials, EDC, the Seaport Museum and the
3 City Council. The current proposal totally ignores
4 good faith efforts by the Community Board and
5 community to suggest alternative ways to help fund
6 the Seaport Museum and to build affordable housing
7 that can be done without approving a building three
8 times the height of what is permitted.
9

10 We are aware of other local property owners
11 outside the Seaport interested in purchasing Seaport
12 air rights. The city should let them bid for these
13 rights, so that we can move them outside the historic
14 district and still raise money needed for the museum.
15 I urge you not to approve the proposal before you
16 today. Let's work together to come up with a better
17 plan to help the Seaport Museum and build more
18 affordable housing.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

20 PAUL GOLDSTEIN: While also preserving and
21 protecting our special Seaport Historic District and
22 I thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you very much for your
24 testimony. Next speaker.
25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
3 speaker on this - excuse me. The next and last
4 speaker will be Adrienne Sosin. Adrienne Sosin.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

6 ADRIENNE SOSIN: Hello. Thank you for the
7 opportunity to speak. I am Adrienne Sosin, I live in
8 South Bridge Towers and for everyone who lives in
9 this formerly Mitchell Lama development, it remains
10 affordable housing for 1,650 families who will be
11 adversely effected by the noise and dust of
12 construction for many years and to the loss of daily
13 sunlight forever.

14 I must bring your attention to why to pause 250
15 Water Street. To not hastily move forward a project
16 that will ultimately harm New York City more than it
17 will ever help. What is being discussed is a fraud
18 and a theft of public property but legally, namely
19 the historic Seaport district, the unique and
20 irreplaceable national treasure is imperiled by real
21 estate interests seeking an inappropriate tower of
22 luxury condominiums that will threaten the
23 foundations of surrounding historic buildings. One
24 of which was just evacuated this week and break the
25 zoning precedence.

1
2 The rezoning and lease applications create a
3 geographical system for a single private property
4 owner. In this case, Howard Hughes, that will
5 privatize public spaces beyond the time when any of
6 us is alive. The oversized building the Howard
7 Hughes Corporation has applied for, has implications
8 that are being overlooked and the hast and priority
9 the Mayor's Administration has awarded.

10 What is most immediately important is the danger
11 to public health posed by this rush. 250 Water
12 Street is a toxic nightmare. The parking lot borders
13 both the public Peck Slip School and the Blue School
14 that serves hundreds of families. Sensitive
15 receptors now imperiled by Howard Hughes threat to
16 break through the sites protective cap, almost
17 immediately upon receiving approvals.

18 Exemplifying the shock doctrine applied to the
19 local community.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 ADRIENNE SOSIN: The parents and communities
22 appeal to stop this excavation before safety is
23 ensured adequately. Their plan does not even
24 consider COVID protocols.
25

1 Please do not do this and please wait to certify
2 this application. Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
4 testimony today.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
6 speaker on this panel.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Do we have any Council
8 Member with questions?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I see no members with
10 questions for this panel.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no questions
12 for this panel, the witness panel is now excused and
13 if you could, please call up the next panel.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
15 Andrea Goldwyn, Jonathan Boulware, Marrison Williams
16 and Adam Ganser. The first speaker will be Andrea
17 Goldwyn followed by Jonathan Boulware.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 ANDREA GOLDWYN: Good day Chair Moya and Council
20 Members. I am Andrea Goldwyn speaking for the New
21 York Landmarks Conservancy. The Conservancies public
22 Policy Committee attended numerous meetings in late
23 2020 and early 2021 to review the application for 250
24 Water Street that was made to the Landmarks
25

1
2 Preservation Commission. The Committee appreciated
3 that the project team listened to comments from the
4 public and the Commissioners at several LPC hearings
5 and responded to them. The Public Policy Committee
6 supported the final proposal to LPC which the
7 Commission approved.

8 That proposal was much more successful than
9 earlier versions in reflecting the context of the
10 South Street Seaport Historic District. The Building
11 base features a warm pallet and materials that
12 compliment the fine grain details of the historic
13 streetscape. The tower section was reduced in height
14 and its massing relocated to the western most edge of
15 the – excuse me, western most section of the lot at
16 the edge of the historic district. Variations in the
17 fenestration and subtle terminations at the roofline
18 made the tower more visually interesting. With these
19 modifications, the building will be a better neighbor
20 to the South Street Seaport. This site has proved to
21 be a long and unfortunate challenge which many have
22 tried to solve.

23 The South Street Seaport Historic District
24 deserves more than a parking lot. We believe this is
25

1
2 a good solution. Thank you for the opportunity to
3 express the Conservancies views.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you again
5 for your testimony today. Uhm, next speaker.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jonathan Boulware will be the
7 next speaker followed by Marrison Williams.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 JONATHAN BOULWARE: Thank you Chair Moya. Thank
10 you for the opportunity to speak. My name is
11 Jonathan Boulware, I live in the South Street Seaport
12 Historic District with my family. I also serve as
13 the President of the South Street Seaport Museum.

14 In the 1960's when what we now know is the
15 historic district was facing demolition, a band of
16 volunteers stood in front of the wrecking ball.
17 These same folks founded the Seaport Museum, creating
18 a completely unique organism. A museum that saved a
19 district and functions as its programmatic anchor.

20 Today, the museum provides an irreplaceable
21 perspective on New York. A metropolis that was a
22 Seaport, long before it was a city. And indeed, much
23 of what we think about when we think about New York
24 has its roots in a seaside trading port that would
25

1
2 become the financial and cultural capital we know
3 today.

4 The Seaport, with the museum as its beating
5 heart, is the birthplace of New York. It is for this
6 compelling reason that I and so many others for
7 decades have poured our energies into this
8 perennially under resourced but critical institution.
9 Embedded in the founding concepts of the museum, was
10 the premise that real estate operations and devices
11 like air rights transfers would provide needed
12 support for the museum long term. This has been
13 pointed out. It did not work consistently. But the
14 proposal before this Committee today, is what will
15 really preserve the Seaport as we know it, as we love
16 it long term. It proposes to use an air rights
17 transfer, a device that was invented here in the
18 first instance, first used here to deliver reliable
19 recurring revenue to the cultural anchor of the
20 Seaport.

21 These mechanisms were carefully designed to
22 effect exactly this outcome. The Seaport's own early
23 1970's masterplan envisioned just such a building on
24 this site. This is a good and appropriate use of
25 this device and its success will mean a thriving

1
2 Seaport that illuminates New York for its residents,
3 for its visitors and for the world for generations to
4 come. Thank you for your consideration on this and
5 for the opportunity to speak to you today.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
7 testimony. Next panelist please.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panelist will be
9 Marrissa Williams followed by Adam Ganser.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 MARRISSA WILLIAMS: Good morning Chair Moya and
12 members of the Subcommittee. My name is Marrissa
13 Williams and I'm a representative of 32BJ SCIU. I am
14 here today on behalf of my union to express our
15 support for the proposed project at 250 Water. 32BJ
16 is our largest property services union in the country
17 representing 85,000 property service workers in New
18 York City including many who live and work in the
19 neighborhood.

20 32BJ supports responsible developers who invest
21 in the communities where they build. I am happy to
22 report that the developer Howard Hughes has recently
23 made a credible commitment to creating prevailing
24 wage building service jobs at this site. On behalf

1
2 of 32BJ SCIU, I respectfully urge you to approve this
3 project. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
5 Uhm, Counsel can we please call up the next panelist?

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panelist, Adam
7 Ganser.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 ADAM GANSER: Can you hear me?

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

11 ADAM GANSER: Great, my name is Adam Ganser. I
12 am the Executive Director of New Yorkers for Parks.
13 New Yorkers for Parks is 100-year-old not-for-profit
14 that champions equitable access to quality parks and
15 open spaces throughout New York City. We do this
16 through research advocacy and programming. I am
17 testifying today in support of HHC's proposal to
18 develop a mixed use building at 250 Water Street.
19 The project will spur economic development, add
20 residential housing near transit and good jobs.
21 Create permanent and deeply affordable housing in
22 lower Manhattan's affluent Seaport neighborhood and
23 generate funding for the Seaport Museum. A district
24 and asset that are essential to the fabric of New
25 York City.

1
2 Further, the development will create a welcoming
3 gateway to the Seaport, increase pedestrian access to
4 existing and planned waterfront parks and provide
5 additional open space through pedestrianizing and
6 activating streets near the Seaport. It will also
7 refurbish the esplanade and Titanic Park. This is
8 the right time for a development like 250 Water
9 Street in one of New York City's densest
10 neighborhoods. HHC is prioritizing affordability,
11 increasing access to existing and future open spaces
12 and parks. And increased access to pedestrian only
13 streets, priorities that match the direction of the
14 city's advocates and push to create a more livable
15 and equitable New York City. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
17 Next speaker.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
19 speaker on this panel. I see no members with
20 questions for this panel.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, seeing there's no
22 questions for this panel, this witness panel is now
23 excused. Counsel, can you please call up the next
24 panel?

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
3 Diego Robayo, Joanne Gorman, Emily Hellstrom and
4 Megan Malvern. First speaker will be Diego Robayo
5 followed by Joanne Gorman.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

7 DIEGO ROBAYO: Hey, good afternoon. My name is
8 Diego Robayo and I work for the Historic Districts
9 Council. The Historic Districts Council is the
10 advocate for New York City's designated historic
11 districts and neighborhood maritime preservation.
12 Its Public Review Committee monitors changes within
13 historic districts and changes to individual
14 landmarks and has reviewed this application.

15 The public in control components of this
16 application have improved immensely. However, this
17 doesn't change the fundamental issue of scale that is
18 of the heart of this project. This debate and this
19 historic district. Absent from these extensive
20 restudy is a survey of new construction within the
21 historic district since the time of designation and a
22 considered study on analysis of why those approved
23 buildings are successful. Unlike those projects who
24 became contextual neighbors, this proposal and this
25 applicant leaves it to be the exception to the rule.

1
2 This is not a Seaport scaled building and no matter
3 how nuanced or considered the base for where the
4 building is, it is extremely difficult to hide a
5 skyscraper. To this point, the skyscraper kind of
6 hide here and therefore it is an imposition. The
7 Historic Districts Council looks forward to seeing a
8 scale appropriate proposal at a future hearing or
9 meeting. If it cannot be Seaport size perhaps it
10 just does not belong here and the applicant should
11 build the bulk that they desire outside the historic
12 district. Thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
14 testimony today. Next speaker.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Joanne
16 Gorman followed by Emily Hellstrom.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 JOANNE GORMAN: Good afternoon. My name is
19 Joanne Gorman and I'm speaking on behalf of Friends
20 of South Street Seaport. The Howard Hughes Corp.
21 recently replaced a prior plan to access and
22 redistribute city-owned air rights within the
23 protected Seaport. With its latest contrived large
24 scale general development framework that mocks the
25 meaning of street adjacency common ownership. Its

1
2 plans would exploit city-owned development rights
3 meant to preserve Seaport assets and public streets
4 de-mapped for public benefit could advance a sole
5 developers private profit driven agenda.

6 It played on a financially strapped museum and
7 the city housing needs by initially dangling 50
8 million contribution and 100 affordable rental units
9 as bait. The money was never a contribution. The
10 affordable units are relegated to low floors with
11 separate elevators and separate mail rooms, while
12 prime views are reserved for the luxury condo's
13 above.

14 With deceptive wording and promotion, Howard
15 Hughes has worked to manipulate city agencies and
16 local elected officials to acquiesce to a tower that
17 dismisses the unique low scale setting of the
18 Seaport.

19 As far back as 2019, Howard Hughes originated and
20 participated in multiple meetings with city agencies,
21 the museum, our borough president and our current
22 local Council Member. Bringing participants into
23 constant contact, creating a setting choreographed by
24 Howard Hughes for all to become vested in its plan
25 for 250 Water. Under the guides of applicants,

1
2 Howard Hughes has access to our city agencies that
3 the general public is never afforded.

4 On May 16th, the Seaport Coalition initiated a
5 legal challenge to the landmarks May 4th approval of
6 a 320 foot tower as appropriate within the Seaport.
7 So, the judge recently dismissed the legal action as
8 not yet right for judicial review. He also dismissed
9 it without prejudice. Advocates watching the Seaport
10 will bide our time for the LPC apple to ripen. The
11 city is on notice as it continues to expend resources
12 to rush this project through. This is the wrong
13 project for the historic Seaport. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you so much
15 for your testimony. We can call up the next speaker.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Emily Hellstrom will speak
17 next followed by Megan Malvern.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 EMILY HELLSTROM: My name is Emily Hellstrom and
20 I am the PTA Co-President of the Peck Slip School and
21 a Co-Founder of Children First. A grassroots
22 organization with over 600 family members. I want to
23 make sure that you know how this plan will effect the
24 hundreds of Pre K and elementary school children who
25

1
2 attend school directly next to this site. How
3 untrustworthy this developer is.

4 From the beginning, they told our school
5 community that there was only organic mercury when
6 they new that there was toxic elemental mercury from
7 a former thermometer factory. They told us there was
8 no mercury vapor detected during testing. But the
9 report says there was. They told us we were doing
10 test pits but they didn't.

11 Saul talks about a community monitor, one that we
12 advocated for and secured. We recently uncovered an
13 email from a foil request that shows that Saul was
14 angry when we didn't comply with the deal to support
15 the project once she was in place. HHC with their
16 slick lawyers, lobbyists, and billionaire investors,
17 spread their money around to buy support. They
18 display unprecedented arrogance and no one holds them
19 accountable.

20 In the Historic Seaport District, they say one
21 thing and do another. But this time, the health and
22 wellbeing of our children is at stake. Just look to
23 their last ULURP to see the public promises and
24 amenities disappear. A 10,000 square foot community
25 market, never realized. A promised public open green

1
2 space, now a private outdoor concert hall. Public
3 streets taken over as private clubs that you need a
4 special credit card to enter. And now, they promise
5 \$50 million to the museum with no legal mechanism to
6 pay.

7 Even their promise of affordable housing is
8 deeply suspect. It is not guaranteed. The housing
9 is relegated to poor floor and they have a lawsuit
10 against them in another state for raising maintenance
11 on tenants just to push them out.

12 If the takeover of our public spaces does not
13 bother you, I hope the health of our children does.
14 They want to use a zoning trick to rip the lid off a
15 site that contains elemental mercury, toxic
16 irritants, neurotoxins, renal toxins, and more. As
17 an NYU Scientist put it, the chemicals discovered in
18 the soil are a whose who of environmental toxicology.

19 Also, the -

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 EMILY HELLSTROM: Also, the billionaire Bill
22 Ackman and other shareholders can make even more of a
23 profit. Above all, for the health of our children, I
24 urge you to vote no.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
3 testimony. Uh, next speaker.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Megan
5 Malvern.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

7 MEGAN MELVERN: Chair Moya and the members of the
8 Subcommittee, thank you. My name is Megan Melvern.
9 I'm a 15-year plus resident of the Seaport area, a
10 mom, a hard worker, PTA Vice President, and a New
11 York City resident. Who has wholly disregarded by
12 the woman you are prepared to give deference to on a
13 project of which she has no meaningful knowledge or
14 depth of care. For more than a year and a half, my
15 schools principal has asked Ms. Chin to hear our
16 concerns from the parents who have children going to
17 school just inches from where a rushed and incomplete
18 toxic remediation in the states Brownsville Program
19 is set to start in January ahead of this buildings
20 construction.

21 The last time the city trusted another agency
22 about the safety of the air in lower Manhattan, tens
23 of thousands of residents were poisoned by the toxic
24 air of September 11 terror attacks. To this day,
25 thousands suffer from our city's failure to do their

1
2 own work and verify findings. This FEIS is a
3 blueprint for disaster that defers the safety of New
4 York City's children to an out of reach agency filled
5 with people who do not have any skin in this game.

6 It is my son who will be exposed to the
7 neurological toxins, not theirs. I beg you, please
8 watch CBS's news report on mercury fears at the
9 Seaport by Natalie Duddridge about the problematic
10 work done to date. This Council has the life and
11 health and education of nearly 800 children in its
12 hands. Margaret is gone in eight weeks. You will be
13 left to explain why you approved a project that will
14 a. cost the city millions of dollars in devalued
15 assets benefiting Howard Hughes. Rely solely on the
16 state to oversee a never before attempted elemental
17 mercury cleanup just inches from our young children.
18 Believes HHC's unofficial MIH delivery and trusts
19 that the promised funding of an undetermined amount
20 of money via yet to be seen agreement, will find its
21 way to the perpetually poor and poorly managed South
22 Street Seaport Museum.

23 This proposal also, I'd like to point out, sets a
24 precedent that sidesteps the Council's authority on
25

1 allocating city monies to cultural centers. Why does

2 HHC —

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

4 MEGAN MALVERN: Directly, I would also ask Chair
5 Moya, please would you take a meeting with my
6 principal because Margaret Chin won't listen to us
7 and she won't return our phone calls. Thank you and
8 please turn down this.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony
10 today. Uhm, let's move on to the next panelist.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
12 speaker on this panel.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Do we have any questions for
14 this panel?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
16 with questions for the panel.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing none, this
18 witness panel is now excused. If you could please
19 call up the next panel.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: This panel will include Kate
21 McLetchie-Sheldon, Paul Hovitz, Brendon Sexton and
22 Ernest Tollerson.

23 Kate McLetchie-Sheldon first followed by Paul
24 Hovitz.
25

1

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

2

KATE MCLETCHIE-SHELDON: Yes, hi, can you hear
me?

3

4

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

5

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes.

6

KATE MCLETCHIE-SHELDON: Okay, sorry, I just
didn't see myself. Okay, uhm, alright, so thank you
Council Members. My name is Kate McLetchie-Sheldon
representing the Waterfront Alliance. The leader in
waterfront revitalization, climate resilience and
advocacy for the New York, New Jersey Harbor region.
The Waterfront Alliance unequivocally supports the
Howard Hughes Corporation proposal to develop a mixed
use building at 250 Water Street that creates
affordable housing in lower Manhattan Seaport
neighborhood and generates much needed funding for
the Seaport Museum through the sale of air rights.
It is important to recognize the wide support that
this project has garnered including the Landmarks
Preservation Commission, which found the project
appropriate.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Howard Hughes Corporation has conducted extensive
outreach to the local community through the Seaport
Stakeholder Planning Workshops, such we have

23

24

25

1
2 participated in. Their commitment to making the
3 redevelopment of 250 Water Street, part of an overall
4 plan for district-wide improvements is clear. The
5 Waterfront Alliance is committed to sustainability
6 and mitigating the effects of climate change. We are
7 therefore pleased that the 250 Water Street Project
8 will meet or exceed regulatory requirements for
9 resiliency and sustainability. And will certified
10 lead silver at a minimum.

11 Importantly, we believe this project will support
12 – uhm, provide significant and needed funds to the
13 South Street Seaport Museum. The museum would
14 receive sustainable funding as well as new resilient
15 building in order to operate as a world class
16 institution. And the plan will allow the museum its
17 first ever reliable recurring income stream helping
18 to put it unsound footing and fulfill its true
19 potential.

20 Waterfront Alliance feels strongly about the
21 South Street Seaport Museum as a critical and
22 important part of the city's past and future and yet
23 the museum is at a crossroads. We believe this is
24 the right project at the right time for the Seaport
25 lower Manhattan and New York City. We urge the City

1
2 Council to support the land use actions necessary to
3 make the development possible. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
5 Next speaker.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: It will be Paul Hovitz
7 followed by Brendan Sexton.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Paul Hovitz, we need you to
10 accept the unmute request if you see it. We will
11 come back to Paul -

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Why don't we come back to
13 Paul, yeah and go to the next speaker.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will go to Brendan Sexton
15 next. Brendan Sexton who will be followed by Ernest
16 Tollerson.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 BRENDAN SEXTON: Hi, thank you. My name is
19 Brendan Sexton. I am a long time local resident.
20 I'm an Urbanist and I am Chair of the -

21 PAUL HOVITZ: Hello?

22 BRENDAN SEXTON: Hello, is there a problem?

23 PAUL HOVITZ: Yeah, this is Paul Hovitz. Am I
24 allowed to speak.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Paul, we're going to come
3 right back to you.

4 PAUL HOVITZ: Okay.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just hold on. Let Brendan
6 finish, so Sergeant at Arms, if we can just restart
7 the clock. Brendan, yeah, you can start and then
8 we'll go to Paul right after, okay?

9 BRENDAN SEXTON: Yes, thank you.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

11 BRENDAN SEXTON: Yes, thank you again. Hello
12 again and I am again Brendan Sexton, the Chair of
13 Trustees, the Board of Trustees at the South Street
14 Seaport Museum.

15 The museum as some know has been running most of
16 times or at least much of the time on fumes ever
17 since Super Storm Sandy and then COVID-19 and we
18 could close. People have to keep that in mind if we
19 are not able to secure necessary funds to keep us up
20 and running. What we do in the next few weeks and
21 months will determine the museums future forever,
22 whether there is a future.

23 I genuinely believe that this proposal deserves
24 your serious attention and supports, so that we can
25 together make a bold commitment to a historic

1
2 preservation by investing in the districts historic
3 home and its worth. What Jonathan calls the beating
4 heart of the historic district. Your museum, telling
5 about the birth of New York City.

6 Reliable recurring revenue for the first time
7 will put us on a – put a platform underneath us to
8 help ensure that we will be here and on a more sound
9 footing so that we can more seamlessly weather storms
10 like those of the past 20 years. And so that we will
11 be here to serve New Yorkers and our visitors.

12 We will use the infusion of the critical support
13 from this project to stabilize. Reopen from a place
14 of strength, open. We want to be open and then grow.
15 Our focus must be on showcasing our incredible
16 collection, not just a shift but our photos and maps
17 and art all telling the story of how the port was
18 critical to the founding of our city and then of
19 America itself. How the port and lower Manhattan are
20 central to the story of both the trans-Atlantic study
21 of trade and the struggles to freedom. How business
22 in and around the port led to New York to become the
23 global financial capital it is today, ensure our
24 city's history.

1
2 We take our job as steward of the district very
3 seriously and the reality is that the museum's well-
4 being and its job as steward of our history was the
5 key motive for creating the Seaport District in the
6 first place.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 BRENDAN SEXTON: And this plan is the best, most
9 appropriate plan to that. Please approve this
10 proposal. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Let's go to our
12 next speaker.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Paul Hovitz will speak next.
14 Paul Hovitz will be followed by Ernest Tollerson.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 PAUL HOVITZ: Hi Chairman.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi Paul, how are you?

18 PAUL HOVITZ: I'm okay. Chairman Moya and
19 members of the City Council, thank you for your
20 service. Unfortunately, I only have audio available.

21 So, my name is Paul Hovitz, Retired Vice Chair
22 CB1, Advisory Board Member of the downtown hospital,
23 Board Member of Manhattan Youth and resident to South
24 Bridge Towers for 37 years. I support the
25

1
2 implementation of Howard Hughes 250 Water Street
3 Proposal.

4 Before Pier 17 was rebuilt, the Seaport was a
5 ghost town. Howard Hughes brought life, jobs and
6 renewed activity to our Seaport and our community.
7 Eleven years ago, our Spruce Street School was in
8 fundraising. The taste of the Seaport was born.
9 Howard Hughes provided funding each year and hundreds
10 of thousands of dollars. Now, this even includes our
11 Peck Slip School as well. Their community support
12 extends to our mission, our hospital and our South
13 Street Seaport Museum, centerpiece of the historic
14 district.

15 The proposal before us provides for all of the
16 above as the desperately needed affordable housing.
17 Six years ago, South Bridge Towers voted to exit the
18 Mitchell Lama Program for Private Ownership. This
19 removed 1,650 middle income affordable housing units
20 from our district. Our children live in a diverse
21 world and need the benefit afforded by that
22 diversity.

23 This 250 Water Street Proposal is smart for all
24 parties. It will allow Howard Hughes to move ahead
25 with real planning for the Seaport and New York City,

1
2 resulting in support for our arts, cultural entities,
3 including the Seaport Museum. Howard Hughes has
4 invested \$1 billion in our community. They have
5 shown their intent -

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

7 PAUL HOVITZ: Is right up with mutual benefit for
8 the locality. We sink or swim together. We allow a
9 partial application of historic air rights within the
10 historic district, gain the affordable housing, save
11 the Seaport Museum and allow it become a brand new
12 digital age Seaport Museum.

13 I remind those and Save our Seaport, that the
14 Save our Seaport Museum was the organization we
15 created. Please do not kick it to the ground.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We got to wrap it up.

17 PAUL HOVITZ: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next and last speaker on this
20 panel will be Ernest Tollerson.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 ERNEST TOLLERSON: Good afternoon. My name is
23 Ernest Tollerson, I am on the Board of the South
24 Street Seaport Museum and I've lived in lower
25

1
2 Manhattan, or what ought to be called New Amsterdam
3 for 40 years.

4 Without the museums pier side and land side
5 treasures, New York would have a difficult time
6 unpacking the phenomena people and forces had turned
7 a sleepy trading outpost into a world city. The
8 museums assets are what makes the historic district
9 come alive. As a trustee with a fiduciary
10 responsibility to rebuild the museums sources of
11 recurring operating revenue, I have a deep and
12 abiding interest in the Community Benefits Fund that
13 would be created if 250 Water Street is developed.
14 Frankly, revenue from any kind of commercial activity
15 within the South Street Seaport Historic District,
16 including revenue from any new land use development,
17 should indeed – must provide financial support for
18 the museum and its mission to tell the unvarnished
19 truth, the good and problematic about the rise of New
20 York from the 1600's until today.

21 As the conscience of your constituents, the City
22 Council has the power to resuscitate a bedrock
23 principle of this historic district, which was
24 created after the birth of the museum and was
25 intended to support the museum as the historic

1
2 districts anchor institution. As the city's
3 legislature, I hope you choose to breathe new life
4 into this foundational principle.

5 Again, capturing new sources of revenue within
6 the historic district to support an advanced museums
7 mission. If a viable proposal emerges from the ULURP
8 process, the museum and affordable housing should be
9 the primary beneficiary of community benefit funds.

10 Those funds will not only ensure that this museum
11 exists to tell the unvarnished truth about New York,
12 it will also prevent the historic enclave from being
13 disfigured by the geography of nowhere.

14 In short, the Community Benefits Fund should
15 prioritize two smart and worthy investments. We're
16 storing the financial stability of the South Street
17 Seaport Museum -

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

19 ERNEST TOLLERSON: And building affordable
20 housing in a neighborhood that so really needs it.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
23 testimony.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
25 speaker on this panel.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Any questions from any of my
3 colleagues?

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
5 with questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing none, this
7 witness panel is now excused. If you could please
8 call up the next panel.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
10 Linda Roche, Nicole Rossi, Linda Hellstrom, and Alia
11 Soomro. First speaker, Linda Roche followed by
12 Nicole Rossi.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Do we have our first panelist?

15 LINDA ROCHE: Hello. I'm sorry.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It's okay.

17 LINDA ROCHE: Can you hear me?

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I can hear you.

19 LINDA ROCHE: Where, where, where did you last
20 hear from me? Nothing?

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We just heard — nothing, so
22 whenever you're ready.

23 LINDA ROCHE: Okay, sorry.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It's okay.
25

1
2 LINDA ROCHE: Thank you for the opportunity to
3 speak in opposition of this application. My name is
4 Linda Roche and I am a 43 year resident in the
5 Seaport area. I would like to call your attention to
6 the Community Board 1 six page resolution
7 overwhelmingly opposing this development, setting
8 forth very specific and flaws that the community at
9 large also overwhelmingly agrees with.

10 From the beginning, this project has had back
11 office dealings with city officials and city
12 agencies, the community was not aware of which has
13 been born out many foil requests we received. And
14 holding the Seaport Museum hostage with the bribe of
15 money in order to get elected officials onboard is
16 disingenuous at best.

17 The Brownfield Cleanup concerns are very real and
18 a very big problem for the two schools and the
19 residents adjacent to the property. And I would beg
20 you to listen to the parents concerns because they
21 are real. I ask the Commissioners to think about
22 this Historic Landmark District and the over 10,000
23 people who signed their name in opposition to this
24 project. Keeping the building to its legal height of
25 120 feet and make it 100 percent affordable housing

1
2 and the community will thank you for your concern in
3 preserving this 19 century historic district. Thank
4 you so much.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
6 testimony. Next speaker.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Nicole Rossi who will
8 followed by Linda Hellstrom.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 NICOLE ROSSI: Can you hear me?

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

12 NICOLE ROSSI: Great, hi, thank you for your
13 time. My name is Nicole Rossi, I am the Vice
14 President of the 265267 Water Street Co-op Board. I
15 am also the Treasurer of the Peck Slip PTA. I have
16 two small children Sienna and Lucca; they are five
17 and six. They both go to Peck Slip and we live right
18 down the block from 250 Water Street.

19 I'd like to go on the record regarding 250 Water
20 Street. I'd like to request that the city and
21 building regulators maintain accountability for the
22 projects that they approve. As of now, there appears
23 to be rational in favor of 250 Water Street because
24 of its ability to provide affordable housing.

1
2 Unfortunately, it's my understanding that this
3 affordable housing will come at the cost of possible
4 mercury contamination to residents and to elementary
5 school aged children, including my own at the Seaport
6 area during the time of the proposed construction.
7 There appears to be an inconsistency in the approval
8 processes. Owners applying for Goss railings on
9 rooftops for example are shutdown. And yet,
10 approvals or large structures that could check an
11 affordable housing box despite the human cost,
12 otherwise is passed with approval.

13 I'd like to provide two anecdotes from this block
14 alone. The Peck Slip School, when it was built was
15 build abutting a historic building. There were many
16 exceptions that were overlooked or allowed. Just
17 this week and by tomorrow, there are 26 families that
18 need to be evacuated from that building because it is
19 no longer structurally sound.

20 Just a few days ago, as I said, they've all been
21 given notice to evacuate and I'm sorry. Residents on
22 the entire block are fearful of the buildings
23 collapse and the health repercussions of what could
24 happen.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NICOLE ROSSI: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your testimony. Next speaker.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Linda Hellstrom who will be followed by Alia Soomro.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

LINDA HELLSTROM: Can you hear me? I think I have an echo.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yup, so Linda, you may have two devices going on at the same time. Your phone or your -

LINDA HELLSTROM: Oh, I wasn't sure I was going to call in and then -

LINDA ROCHE: Take one off Linda.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You'll have to take on off, yup.

LINDA HELLSTROM: One off, so I need to mute it. Okay.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You'll have to log off of either the computer or get off the phone, one or the other.

LINDA HELLSTROM: Okay, is that better?

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: That's better Linda.

1
2 LINDA HELLSTROM: Okay. I'm Linda Hellstrom, I
3 live on Water Street. Just because Howard Hughes
4 promised a donation to Gayle Brewer and Margaret
5 Chin's favorite charity and a small number of units
6 of affordable housing that will likely never be
7 built, one corporation is then allowed to break rules
8 that everyone else who builds in the Seaport has had
9 to follow.

10 Elected officials, why aren't you asking Howard
11 Hughes purposely letting things run down around the
12 parking lot. Demanding that HHC cleanup the trash
13 and piles of shards of broken glass on the corner of
14 the Peck Slip School Street. Howard Hughes is
15 rushing to dig by January. 1,200 truckloads of soil
16 containing thermometer mercury and garage oil will be
17 removed. Beep, beep, beep, beep from backing trucks
18 along the toxic soil all day long with kids and
19 teachers sitting in COVID mandated open window
20 classrooms. You should be actively working to
21 prevent HHC from breaking ground during school
22 sessions.

23 Our granddaughter [LOST AUDIO 3:41:11]—

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Did we lose her?
25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We seem to have lost Linda
3 Hellstrom.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yup, okay. Uhm, Linda, you
5 can always submit your testimony. We have - is she
6 back?

7 Linda, if you're back, you want to unmute
8 yourself. You got to accept the unmute request.

9 LINDA HELLSTROM: Okay. Our granddaughter
10 attends Peck Slip School built with the expectation
11 that zoning rules would be followed and as of right
12 building, 120 feet tall. That only takes one year to
13 build. This monster tower, 200 feet over zoning that
14 actually looks like a replica of Creedmoor Hospital
15 will take over five years to build. Five years of
16 dust, pile driving, planking steel and beeping
17 trucks, rumbling all day long during six hours of the
18 school day for 200 kids. Some of them for their
19 whole elementary school career.

20 You, the City Council Members who vote on this -

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 LINDA HELLSTROM: Should be out demanding that
23 this process stop until we have safe answers about
24 the toxins. We are not a divided community, far from
25 it. We are hundreds who live directly next to the

1
2 site and thousands who live in the district. Don't
3 turn your backs on the 800 children.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

5 LINDA HELLSTROM: Teachers, families and elders -

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Linda. Thank you
7 for your testimony today. We really appreciate it.
8 Thank you. Next speaker please.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next and last speaker on this
10 panel will be Alia Soomro.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 ALIA SOOMRO: Hi, can you hear me?

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

14 ALIA SOOMRO: Thanks. Good afternoon. My name
15 is Alia Soomro and I am the Menapace Fellow in Land
16 Use Law at the Municipal Art Society of New York.
17 From a policy perspective, MAS is fundamentally
18 opposed to allowing the transfer of city-owned
19 development rights to a private party without a clear
20 disclosure of what agencies, institutions and
21 projects ultimately benefit. In the case of 250
22 Water Street, the full array of project benefits, the
23 scope of each individual benefit and the reliability
24 of them remains obscure.

1
2 The original intent of the Seaport subdistrict
3 was to ensure that development rights transferred,
4 benefit the South Street Seaport Museum, not a city
5 agency or project developer. We continue to support
6 the intent of the 2003 rezoning and maintain that the
7 city's historic zoning policy or the Seaport be
8 respected. MAS would support an appropriately scaled
9 development at 250 Water Street while transferring
10 the bounds of development rights outside the Seaport
11 Historic District.

12 MAS maintains that the city must disclose the
13 development rights value and the legal process of
14 facilitating development rights transfer. Without
15 this disclosure, the public does not have the
16 information to evaluate whether the proposal can be
17 fully executed as planned and publicly discussed.
18 Regarding the museum funding, as of today, HHC has
19 not provided the public any details about the museum
20 funding proposal. At this point, there is no
21 guarantee that the original 50 million will be
22 offered to the Seaport Museum. MAS stands firm in
23 that details of the funding mechanism must be
24 finalized before this project can be approved.

1
2 MAS recognizes the importance of developing 250
3 Water Street, especially since this site has remained
4 a vacant parking lot for decades. As well as
5 building affordable housing and the high opportunity
6 and transit rich area. However, we strongly urge the
7 principals and body and the city's zoning policy for
8 more than 40 years be respected.

9 If permitted, this proposal would significantly
10 depart from the city's zoning intent and may
11 subsequently be a negatively precedent for a historic
12 district citywide. We urge the Council to reject
13 this application. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
15 Next speaker please.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: That was the last speaker on
17 this panel.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, any questions from
19 my colleagues?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, no Chair, I see no
21 members with questions.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no more
23 questions for this panel, the witness panel is now
24 excused and if you can, please call up the next
25 panel.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panel will include Anne
3 Beaumont, Neil Flaherty, Jay Jacobson, and Susan
4 Murray. First, we will hear from Anne Beaumont
5 followed by Neil Flaherty.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

7 ANNE BEAUMONT: Okay, my name is Anne Beaumont
8 and I've lived on Pearl Street, one block from 250
9 Water Street for 11 years and I've been a volunteer
10 at the South Street Seaport Museum for 15 years.
11 Save our Seaport was founded in my living room. I am
12 pleased to speak in support of the proposal before
13 this Subcommittee today.

14 The beating living heart of our neighborhood is
15 the South Street Seaport Museum and its ships are
16 iconic symbols of New York and its history. And the
17 museum is much more than its ships, it cares for
18 thousands of artifacts and preserves some of the
19 oldest buildings in the city including Minoru, the
20 original World Trade Center.

21 The museum's work is hard and expensive and it's
22 also important and worthwhile. With so many
23 obligations and a slate of bad luck that runs from
24 September 11th through to Hurricane Sandy in 2012,
25 it's not a surprise that the museum would be back on

1
2 its heels even though it has done all the right
3 things.

4 But COVID has been a step too far. The
5 investment in the museum included in this proposal is
6 a critical lifeline that will allow the museum to
7 plan for the future from a place of financial
8 strength. The choice is simple, either we build on
9 an unhistorical parking lot and save the cultural
10 anchor of our neighborhood or we do nothing and lose
11 that anchor, that invaluable landmark forever.

12 That's the choice and there are no viable
13 alternatives to the proposal before you today. The
14 reasons to approve the proposal are compelling and
15 significant and I hope you will support it. The
16 reasons given not to build the proposed building are
17 neither and they are merely reasons never to build
18 any building ever.

19 Construction is disruptive. That's a fact of
20 life with any construction and yet we build new
21 building's in the city all the time. Another
22 complaint is about the Brownfields cleanup, which is
23 adjacent to two schools, not to mention hundreds of
24 homes including mine. It's high time to do the
25 cleanup and it's unfathomable to me that any parent

1
2 honestly wants their child to go to school across
3 from an un-remediated toxic waste site for a day
4 longer than necessary. Time is short, so I won't
5 attempt to revisit all of the complaints about the
6 proposal but I will simply close by asking you to
7 support it. The time has come to build at 250 Water
8 Street. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Neil Flaherty who will be
11 followed by Jay Jacobson.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

13 NEIL FLAHERTY: My name is Neil Flaherty and I
14 would like to thank you for the opportunity to speak
15 in support of this plan that will enhance the
16 district, provide jobs, increase affordable housing,
17 and sorely needed financial support to the South
18 Street Seaport Museum.

19 I've been a part of this community since I began
20 working in the financial district in 1967 and started
21 volunteering at the Seaport Museum in 1981. This
22 museum is more than just about ships. It connects us
23 to our city's history and the people who built it.
24 The ships are an incredible asset for our city but so
25 are the rest of its collections. The maps and

1
2 historic artifacts, not to mention the bygone skills
3 encultured keeps alive. The museum is critical to
4 the district. It attracts visitors from all over the
5 world and this tourism provides the lifeblood to many
6 of the districts small businesses. This project will
7 provide the financial stability that the museum needs
8 and deserves. This project will allow the museum to
9 continue its mission of educating the public and the
10 stewardship of the Seaport environment.

11 The project is not a detriment. Instead, it will
12 provide a great boost to the district that the
13 existing parking lot has not and certainly will not
14 in the future. The project will add affordable
15 housing, something the community has been in need of
16 for decades.

17 It will also provide jobs and will add new life
18 to our streets, supporting our small businesses,
19 eateries and cultural institutions. If I have to
20 choose between a parking lot and no museum or a
21 multiuse building and a vibrant Seaport Museum that
22 future generations can experience, I choose the later
23 every time.

24 This project will provide the financial stability
25 that the museum needs and deserves. I ask you to

1 support it and the South Street Seaport Museum.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jay Jacobson who will be
5 followed by Susan Murray.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

7 JAY JACOBSON: My name is Jay Jacobson. I am a
8 lifelong New Yorker and have volunteered — start my
9 video. How does that work? Okay, I have volunteered
10 at the museum for about 40 years. It's a heck of a
11 place and it really is terrific to have as part of
12 the City of New York.

13 We have got in New York an abundance of museums.
14 We have great museums for the arts. We have great
15 museums for natural history but the Seaport Museum is
16 a great museum to the city and to tell the tale of
17 the people who have worked in the city and built it
18 to the metropolis that we are today.

19 We have suffered setbacks at the museum. 911
20 knocked it off its feet for two years. The financial
21 crisis of 2008 hit the museum hard and Sandy hit it a
22 hell of a lot harder. But doing nothing about it and
23 not standing up for it at this point is giving up.
24 The redevelopment of 250 Water Street by the Howard
25

1
2 Hughes Corporation and the commitment to both units
3 of affordable housing and to investing in the museum
4 is, as I understand it, a plan that is a combination
5 of creative corporate capitalism and a contribution
6 to the cultural capital of New York. Let's do it.
7 Let's get it done. Thank you very much.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next panel, uh,
9 next speaker please.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next and last speaker on this
11 panel will be Susan Murray.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

13 SUSAN MURRAY: Hi, I'm Susan Murray. I am a
14 proud South Street Seaport Museum volunteer and an
15 advocate for the Seaport Historic District. I
16 support the 250 Water Street proposal because it will
17 further the legacy of the Seaport and the
18 preservation of New York City's most unique and
19 important neighborhood.

20 I grew up in a working class family but I was
21 fortunate to have a mom who brought me and my
22 siblings to just about every New York City cultural
23 or historical site we could reach by foot or mass
24 transit. I am truly thankful that the historic
25 district was founded 50 years ago and it's still here

1
2 for families today. But as a volunteer, since the
3 early 1980's, I know the museum has had its share of
4 ups and downs. I saw the physical and financial
5 impact Hurricane Sandy had on the entire
6 neighborhood. Of course, now we're dealing with
7 COVID-19. This proposal will give our community
8 members not only stability but the ability to thrive.
9 The much needed investment in affordable housing will
10 bring socioeconomic diversity and reenergize small
11 businesses and local institutions.

12 I often hear about New York's strength and
13 resilience. Just think what new jobs and retail
14 stores will do for economic resilience and think
15 about how the buildings base façade will blend in
16 with and beautify the district compared to the
17 current parking lot, which doesn't blend into
18 anything or inspire anyone to consider New York's
19 history.

20 The environmental benefit will be cleaning up
21 something no neighborhood wants, a brownfield site.
22 As for zoning, this is a unique situation for an
23 historic district but this project offers a unique
24 opportunity. Now is the time to invest in
25 communities like the Seaport. This project is

1
2 exactly the kind of project New Yorkers need to
3 advance to a better future while staying connected to
4 our past. I strongly urge you to approve this plan.
5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: That the last. Susan Murray
8 was the last speaker on this panel Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, that being the last
10 speaker and seeing no members with questions -

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I see - Chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm sorry.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Chin has her
14 hand up.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair. I just
16 wanted to thank this panel. I mean, the volunteers
17 that's been volunteering for so many years and I know
18 that you have worked hard to support and save the
19 museum. And I also wanted you know Anne, from your
20 testimony, you live right there. I mean, it is
21 unconscionable for people to think that we would
22 allow anything to harm our children and our
23 neighbors. You know, we have worked through this
24 whole you know process with the State Department of
25 Health, the Oversight Agency from the state that

1
2 oversight you know the Brownfield Cleanup. We
3 advocated for an independent monitor. Me and my
4 staff have been meeting with parents, principals,
5 community members. You know, we believe in the
6 health and safety of the residents and of our
7 children.

8 And that's going to continue. They will be
9 monitored on the site. Even the City Council, I
10 introduced legislation to even provide more oversight
11 on mercury cleanup. So, I just wanted to get that on
12 the record. That my staff have been so committed and
13 myself, working on this issue and working with Howard
14 Hughes to make sure that oversight are in place.

15 So, and going forward, it's so important as all
16 the people who have testified. The museum is the one
17 that created the historic district and this is a once
18 in a lifetime opportunity. The mechanism, how to get
19 the money to the museum. We are still working on it
20 to make sure the museum gets every dollar that they
21 deserve. And we will get that done before we vote in
22 the City Council. Thank you Chair for giving me the
23 time. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Councilwoman. So,
25 that being it for this panel, the witness panel is

1
2 now excused. And if you could call up the next panel
3 please.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
5 Grace Lee. Grace Lee.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

7 GRACE LEE: Hi, is there a way to turn on my
8 video? No, okay, everyone can hear me?

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yup.

10 GRACE LEE: Hello, my name is Grace Lee. I am a
11 lower Manhattan resident and a mother of three
12 children who have attended school for nearly a decade
13 at the Blue School just steps away from 250 Water
14 Street. I am entirely offended by other people in
15 this community telling parents how they should feel
16 about a toxic waste site in front of their children's
17 school. Every day I walk by there with my two year
18 old - three year old child and I have to worry about
19 whether they can go to school safely.

20 I stand in strong opposition to this development
21 because it is a threat to our kids and our community.
22 The South Street Seaport neighborhood is anchored by
23 two schools that are home to over 800 children. You
24 don't have to be an engineer to know that years of
25 construction of this out size out of luxury building

1
2 will undoubtedly impact those schools. The work from
3 this project will rob our children of an outdoor play
4 space for six years, which is an entire elementary
5 school career.

6 Our kids have spent nearly two years shut inside
7 our apartments due to this pandemic, which might get
8 worse before it gets better. These kids need to be
9 in school, have safe places to play but no one can
10 tell us how do they expect these kids to learn
11 safely. And as we continue to battle COVID, we want
12 to ensure our unvaccinated kids are back in
13 classrooms that are safe and ventilated. How are
14 teachers supposed to open the windows to dust and
15 noise which jeopardize not just the health and safety
16 of our children but also their ability to focus in a
17 quiet learning environment.

18 Neither do the developer nor the elected's have
19 given us any answers on this. I am tired of our kids
20 being viewed as collateral damage to this pandemic
21 and now to this development. We cannot put a price
22 tag on the health and safety of our children. Howard
23 Hughes already showed indifference when they told our
24 group of moms not to worry, that there was only a
25 little bit of mercury on this site.

1
2 We, as mothers had to go to the archives and
3 discover that the site had been a thermometer factor
4 and that it presented more danger than Howard Hughes
5 initially wanted to acknowledge.

6 As recently as last month, Howard Hughes's
7 engineer attempted to lead the public by saying no
8 mercury vapor was found on the site when it fact was
9 detected in multiple areas of the lot. So, now as
10 parents -

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

12 GRACE LEE: We have to ask ourselves, what else
13 don't we know about? What else doesn't Howard Hughes
14 want to acknowledge? We want our children to be safe
15 and there is nothing, not even a museum that is worth
16 our children's health. I ask you to vote no.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
18 testimony today. Next speaker please.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, that was the last speaker
20 on this panel Mr. Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing no questions from
22 my colleagues, this panel is uh, this witness panel
23 is now excused. If we can call up the next panel
24 please.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panel will include
3 Christina Roccas, Louis Coletti, Terrence Cullen, and
4 Ankur Dalal. Christina Roccas will speak first
5 followed by Louis Coletti.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

7 CHRISTINA ROCCOS: Hi, thank you. Good afternoon
8 everyone, Committee Members. My name is Christina
9 Roccas, mother, business owner, wife and a huge fan
10 of my neighborhood for almost 15 years. This
11 Subcommittee has the advantage of already knowing
12 what happens if the Howard Hughes Corporation
13 Proposal to develop 250 Water Street fails to pass.

14 An empty eyesore of a lot, sitting underutilized
15 for perhaps another 50 years, never properly cleaned
16 up, more blight and for what? We've been over and
17 over the pros and cons of building at the edge of the
18 historic district. The Landmarks Commission were
19 careful and exacting in what this type of
20 construction needed to be and Howard Hughes listened
21 and responded. The anti-progress folks are well-
22 organized and loud but please do not mistake their
23 noise as representing the majority of effected
24 residents.

1
2 This mixed use building design offers so much to
3 the community. Desperately needed housing, including
4 80 units of affordable housing and new jobs for area
5 residents. And that's setting aside the side
6 benefits of an influx of cash to save the Seaport
7 Museum. That would be great but it's not what drew
8 my family to the area, instead the five of us are
9 here for the excitement and beauty of the Seaport,
10 its restaurants and its stores and lately, the many
11 cultural offerings at Pier 17. The transformation at
12 Pier 17 by HHC has been a massive success.

13 If you haven't actually been to the Seaport
14 lately, you really need to see the new life it has
15 breathed into what was once an ugly underused mall.
16 In conclusion, I urge you to allow the very important
17 cleanup of 250 Water Street to begin and be a part of
18 the positive and exciting transformation of lower
19 Manhattan. Thank you so much.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
21 Next speaker.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Louis Coletti, who will be
23 followed by Terrence Cullen.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

25 LOUIS COLETTI: Can you hear me?

1

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes, we can hear you.

2

3

LOUIS COLETTI: Okay, thank you. Chairman Moya and members of the Council, I want to thank you for this opportunity to give testimony on this subject and also, to thank you for continuing to do the city's business during these very difficult times.

4

5

6

7

8

I couldn't have said it any better than Councilwoman Chin did. I'm glad she said it and I fully agree with everything she said. We are here obviously and I shouldn't say obviously, to offer 100 percent support to this project. This project has gone through one of the more extensive review processes and change in scope. To meet the communities needs that I've seen in a long, long time. And that's a credit to you, a credit to Howard Hughes Corporation and this is a badly needed project on a parking lot that has been such an unseemly gap in our city's urban fabric for over 50 years.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Uh, if you don't mind, I'm going to take a little bit of a different attack and focus on the economics because I think you've heard a number of people testify about the benefits of the project. It's time to get this city moving again, okay. According to the New York City Independent Budget Office, here are

1
2 some staggering numbers. Here's what COVID has cost
3 us in over a year and a half. \$9.8 billion in
4 construction activity, 74,000 jobs, \$5.5 billion in
5 total wages and 8.3 percent in commercial rent
6 mortgage recording taxes.

7 We need to get this city moving. My members, I
8 represent 1,200 union contractors who have the
9 largest number of minority and women owned
10 contractors who were looking for work in the State of
11 New York. We employ the 100,000 members of the
12 building trade unions who are a 55 percent minority
13 and women and we need work and this is a project
14 whose scope and scale make absolute sense for the
15 future of New York City.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

17 LOUIS COLETTI: I'm done.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You can wrap up. I'll give
19 you time to wrap up.

20 LOUIS COLETTI: Okay. Let me wrap up and say
21 this. Back in 1998, the City Council did a report
22 called Hollow in the Middle, the Rise and Fall of the
23 New York City Middle Class and the genesis of that
24 report, the main summary, was that we had less people
25 in the New York City middle class in 1998 than we did

1
2 in 1977. Well, today, I would suggest to you that
3 that hole in middle is a crater. And the
4 construction industry represents the opportunity to
5 give all those New Yorkers, 43 percent who don't have
6 high school degrees, opportunities to work in a
7 project that makes sense to the community and for the
8 City of New York. I strongly urge you to approve
9 this project.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

11 LOUIS COLETTI: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker
13 please.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Terrence Cullen who will be
15 followed by Ankur Dalal.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

17 TERRENCE CULLEN: Good afternoon Chair Moya and
18 Council Member Chin. My name is Terrence Cullen, I
19 am the Communications Director for the New York
20 Building Congress.

21 On behalf of the Building Congress, we support
22 the HHC proposal for 250 Water Street. At a pivotal
23 time in our city, this project to provide affordable
24 housing, great jobs and boost economic activity is
25 critical. Since our founding in 1921, the Building

1
2 Congress has advocated for investment and
3 infrastructure, received job creation, promoted
4 preservation and growth in the New York City area.

5 Our association is made up of over 550
6 organizations comprised of more than 250,000
7 professionals. Through our members events and
8 various committees, we seek to address the critical
9 issues in the building industry and promote the
10 economic and social advancement of our city and its
11 residents.

12 As a 100 year old organization, the Building
13 Congress celebrates the lasting impact of the past on
14 today's urban fabric. We appreciate how the project
15 will complete the prominent streets – excuse me,
16 streetscape by transforming a parking lot into a
17 contextually appropriate mixed-use development and
18 how funding for the South Street Seaport Museum will
19 restore the heart of this historic district.

20 Moreover, HHC has addressed community concerns
21 related to the height and massing. The current
22 proposal creates a seamless transition between the
23 more modern tall structures whining a wide tall
24 street and the historic building on the narrow Water
25 and Beekman streets.

2 The transfer of air rights will also ensure a low
3 ride waterfront for the neighborhood. Lastly, with
4 our city in a critical economic moment, this project
5 will create at least 80 affordable housing units for
6 extremely and very well income New Yorkers. Generate
7 \$850 million in economic activity and support
8 approximately 1,600 construction jobs and 1,700
9 permanent jobs in the commercial, retail, and
10 nonprofit sectors. The Building Congress proudly
11 supports this proposal and urges the Committee to
12 advance 250 Water Street. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next and last speaker on this
15 panel will be Ankur Dalal.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

17 ANKUR DALAL: Hi, thank you for the opportunity
18 to speak in favor of this project today. I support
19 this project because it will produce hundreds of new
20 homes in the neighborhood including many affordable
21 homes that are desperately needed in this part of the
22 city. The proposed development is located in
23 Manhattan CB1 which has lost thousands of affordable
24 homes this past decade.

1
2 In 2014, the South Bridge Towers located across
3 the street from 250 Water voted to exit the Mitchell
4 Lama affordable housing program. Removing over 1,600
5 affordable homes from the neighborhood. Today, we
6 have an opportunity to begin to correct this wrong.
7 While one building can't support 1,600 new affordable
8 apartments, it is a start. I hope the Council
9 understands that some of the opponents to this
10 project from whom we heard earlier today are simply
11 trying to protect their property values. We need
12 members of the Seaport Coalition and Save our
13 Seaport. Own apartments, the views of which would be
14 effected by 250 Water Street and the President of the
15 Board of an adjacent building that's pushing to
16 preserve the lot as is, wrote a letter asking
17 residents to oppose this building because it would
18 "decrease property values for units that face the
19 east river."

20 What's particularly troubling to me is that some
21 of the neighbors who oppose this project live in the
22 newly privatized Mitchell Lama buildings. When they
23 needed affordable homes, the government helped these
24 folks. Now, some of these folks are trying to pull
25 the ladder up behind them in the face of a proposal

1
2 to create new affordable homes in the neighborhood.
3 The city should not stop reasonable development on a
4 parking lot that will fund a museum, create jobs and
5 build affordable homes for New Yorkers. I urge you
6 to support the project.

7 Finally, I'd like to personally thank Council
8 Member Chin, her leadership on this project, the
9 Elizabeth Street Haven Green Project and the SoHo
10 rezoning shows a commitment to creating new homes for
11 New Yorkers. Including homeless for immigrant
12 families like mine, even when it would be politically
13 easier to capitulate to local amenities. So, thank
14 you very much. I really appreciate it.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
16 testimony. Was that the last speaker?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, seeing none of my
19 colleagues have questions for this panel, the panel
20 is now excused. And if you can, please call up the
21 next panel. Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
23 Jay Hellstrom.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

25 JAY HELLSTROM: Can you hear me?

1

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you Jay.

2

3

JAY HELLSTROM: Thank you very much. I am Jay Hellstrom and I want to assure you; I am not a nimby and I am for building. And I dislike being called various things without my ability to speak to those.

4

5

6

7

But that, given the fact, the Seaport needs your attention and commitment to turn down this project.

8

9

You can right now, preserve our historic district, a cultural and economic engine, where we in the world can see the birthplace of modern New York City. Or

10

11

12

you can open the floodgates to a magnitude of

13

14

variances, contrive street abandonments and dubious precedents. For what? Just another luxury, generic

15

16

tower with no legal commitment for affordable units and that will jumpstart the demise of the Historic

17

Seaport District.

18

19

Already, we and our neighborhood is my community anticipate – are seeing the anticipation of breaking

20

21

this. Waters through this row of 18 and 19 century buildings in their true setting. Not in a sad museum

22

23

state but in the actual real. It's showing a sad glimpse into the future of its demise. Too large,

24

25

abandoned buildings on each corner of Water Street, my block recently put on the market have just been

1
2 left to run down with broken windows, graffiti, just
3 waiting to be developed many, many stories higher
4 just as 250 Water Street is seeking approval.

5 And who testified at HHC for each of these
6 hearings? Four downtown developers. Gayle Brewer
7 and Margaret Chin tried to save a museum but risked
8 ruining the historic museum that's supposed to be its
9 steward. This in league with the Howard Hughes
10 Corporation, who lied about making a \$50 million
11 donation to save the museum. While basking in
12 applause for being so generous, they invented a
13 scheme to get the city to give the money. But HHC
14 says the museum won't get any money unless their
15 demands are met with a variance of two or four feet —

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

17 JAY HELLSTROM: Or 140 and I say for years, the
18 Historic Division is just another ordinary bunch of
19 tall buildings if you approve this. So, don't cast
20 your vote for Howard Hughes and for their
21 billionaire. Please turn down this tangent. Thank
22 you.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay Chair, that was the last
24 speaker on this panel. And I see no members with
25 questions for this panel. We will now hear from the

1
2 next panel, which will include Denny Salas, Roland
3 Lewis, Jill Poklemba, and Elizabeth Kerr. The first
4 speaker will be Denny Salas followed by Roland Lewis.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

6 DENNY SALAS: Good afternoon Council Members. My
7 name is Denny Salas and I ask this Committee to
8 support this housing project on the basis of how it
9 will positively effect working class families?
10 Building affordable homes in this wealthy
11 neighborhood will provide access to good schools and
12 economic opportunities that are otherwise non-
13 existing in many of our poor communities.

14 The increased socioeconomic diversity will allow
15 families and their children to learn from those who
16 may be better off and access resources that are
17 typically unavailable to them. As several studies
18 and my personal experience have shown. In our city,
19 the chances to succeed is often dictated by where a
20 child lays their head at night and I urge this
21 Council to see the opportunity for some of these
22 families and support the 250 Water Street project.

23 On a side note, opponents attacking the personal
24 character of Council Members of color, borderline on
25 traditional racist tropes. Council Member Chin, you

1
2 have done an excellent job supporting affordable
3 housing projects throughout this district during your
4 tenure. Your legacy is one of helping working class
5 families and is commendable and to be mimicked.

6 Thank you for your time everyone and I hope you have
7 a wonderful day.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. The next speaker
9 on this panel will be Roland Lewis followed by Jill
10 Poklemba. Roland Lewis.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

12 ROLAND LEWIS: Thank you. Good afternoon
13 Committee. Good to see you all. I'm a strong
14 proponent of speaking as a private citizen. A strong
15 proponent of this development at 250 Water Street. I
16 think it's an important contribution to ensure the
17 longevity of the South Street Museum. Important for
18 the South Street District in downtown Manhattan and
19 important for the entire City of New York.

20 I have a couple of unique characteristics,
21 qualifications for my testimony. I, for ten years, I
22 had the good fortune of working in the South Street
23 Seaport District. But I had the slight misfortune of
24 starrng at that vacant lot or the parking lot for
25 ten years too.

1
2 This building as designed, will be a vast, vast,
3 improvement for that area. And as some of you may
4 know, as I led for 13 years the Waterfront Alliance.
5 Again, I'm speaking now as a private citizen. We
6 fought the Howard Hughes Corporation over an ill
7 conceived project at the Tin Building in the river.
8 And we defeated them actually. That building is not
9 going to be built but this is as you heard from my
10 former colleague earlier in the testimony, this is a
11 very different building and a different time and
12 much, much too commended for your approval.

13 And finally, as my good friend Margaret Chin will
14 remember, I was a housing advocate and housing
15 developer for many years, as she was too. And I
16 can't emphasize enough on the resiliency and the
17 economic development and all the other good things.
18 The affordable housing for downtown New York is so
19 important. South Bridge Towers went sort of quasi
20 private. That Mitchell Lama is no longer a part of
21 the affordable housing mix. We need more affordable
22 housing in the City of New York, especially in
23 downtown, which has become kind of wealthy enclave.

24 So, again, I urge the Council to approve this
25 project and thank you very much for your time.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker on this
3 panel will be Jill Poklemba. Jill Poklemba who will
4 be followed by Elizabeth Kerr.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

6 JILL POKLEMBBA: Hi, my name is Jill Poklemba. I
7 am a Senior Director at New York Harm Reduction
8 Educators. Uhm, and I am speaking on behalf of our
9 organization as well as our Executive Director Stan
10 Rivera.

11 We are in the process of emerging with another
12 nonprofit organization to be called one organization
13 on point. And we can ag-medically underserve
14 residents of Manhattan to harm reduction services,
15 specifically to address the opioid crisis, as well as
16 the crisis of homelessness and incarceration.

17 Although we are located in upper Manhattan, we serve
18 residents of all parts of Manhattan including the
19 lower east side, China Town and the Financial
20 District.

21 Our Executive Director Stan Rivera was born and
22 raised on the lower East side and has deep roots and
23 deep connections to the lower east side community.
24 He also has a close friendship with the actor Lewis
25 Guzman, who was actually involved in advocating for

1
2 affordable housing going back to the 1970's in the
3 Seaport District.

4 And the two of them strongly support this project
5 as well as our organization. We believe it will be a
6 strong community based project that will create
7 opportunities for people in lower Manhattan and in
8 the neighborhood where they both grew up. We
9 strongly support this proposal and know how important
10 it is to create affordable housing for residents of
11 Manhattan.

12 Before he became Executive Director last year,
13 Sam Rivera was Associate Vice President of the
14 Fortune Society, where I also worked as well. It is
15 a reentry organization that owns two housing
16 facilities in upper Manhattan. One of which was a
17 mixed use supportive and affordable housing facility,
18 that gave us the opportunity to see the impacts, the
19 positive impacts that facilities like this can have
20 on the entire neighborhood.

21 And New York City definitely needs more projects
22 like this. We've also had the opportunity to
23 participate in events in collaboration with the
24 Howard Hughes Corporation and have seen first hand
25

1
2 the positive impacts it has on other charitable
3 organizations.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you for your
5 testimony. The next speaker please.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next and last speaker on this
7 panel will be Elizabeth Kerr.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

9 ELIZABETH KERR: Good afternoon everyone and
10 thankyou for giving us the time to speak and address
11 you all. It's going to be a long afternoon and I
12 know a lot of people have very passionate positions
13 to present, I will attempt to be brief. While I am
14 in support of the development at 250 Water Street,
15 both in terms of the architectural housing and
16 economic possibilities, I'm speaking primarily as a
17 long time volunteer at the South Street Seaport
18 Museum and I strongly support this proposal in that
19 it will secure the future of this vital institution.

20 The museum is one of things that brings people to
21 the Seaport District beyond simple commerce and
22 entertainment. It offers an absolutely unique
23 perspective on the mercantile history of the city.
24 The power that built the city that it is now and that
25 we all love and want to see continue with all the

1
2 health and economic viability it can. It offers
3 visitors an absolutely unique perspective on the
4 city, on its history, on its waterfront even. Just
5 something most of us don't have the opportunity to
6 pay enough attention to.

7 In short, I am very hopeful that this proposal
8 will be passed and that as part of this exciting
9 innovative development in the neighborhood, the
10 future of the museum will be secured and its many
11 offerings preserved for generations to come. Thank
12 you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
14 That being the last panelist, and seeing no questions
15 from my colleagues, this witness panel is now
16 excused. If you can please call up the next panel
17 please.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
19 Bob Tierney, Mark Bozek, Nelson Chan, and Richard
20 Dykema. The first speaker on the panel will be Bob
21 Tierney followed by Mark Bozek. And Mr. Chair, if I
22 could just make a brief logistical announcement. For
23 anyone who is currently logged into the meeting and
24 wishing to testify, you are required to register
25

1
2 online in advance at the New York City Council's
3 website. The website is www.council.nyc.gov/landuse.

4 Again, if you intend to testify at this hearing,
5 we need you to register online at that website. And
6 now, we will go to the first speaker Bob Tierney.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

8 BOB TIERNEY: Unmute, can you all hear me?

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

10 BOB TIERNEY: Okay, great, thank you very much to
11 the Chair of the Subcommittee, Chair Moya to Margaret
12 Chin, who I worked with for 12 long years, 12 great
13 years as Chairman of the Landmarks Commission from
14 the year 2002 on. And I am here on my own behalf
15 today because I believe deeply in the importance of
16 the South Street Seaport Museum and it's inextricably
17 intertwined to the historic district. Both will be
18 saved in my opinion and stabilized for the future by
19 approval by this Subcommittee and the full Council of
20 the proposals that have gone through an exhausted
21 public process.

22 It's multiple city agencies with multiple public,
23 much public input. My specific focus really for
24 obvious reasons was to look very carefully at the
25 preservations issues. And I did. I went into them

1
2 in great depth. Looked to be careful that nothing
3 was done here that was of course inappropriate or
4 that wouldn't in any way be a bad precedent for other
5 historic districts.

6 Luckily in both counts, this came out totally
7 with flying approval and flying colors. This is a 50
8 year – this parking lot has been here for 50 years.
9 We can have the opportunity of building on it in an
10 appropriate way as the Commission has found,
11 Landmarks Commission has found with no demolition.
12 It's a dream come true in a way. No demolition, a
13 new site, nothing is harmed, no historic fabric is
14 touched and what do we get after all is said and
15 done, a viable historic museum and an incredibly
16 important viable historic district.

17 So, I'd like thank again, Margaret Chin for all
18 of her support over the years. My dozen years or
19 more in public service and thank this Committee for
20 doing its work on this important project. Thank you
21 very much.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
23 testimony. Next speaker please.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mark Bozek who will be
25 followed by Nelson Chan.

1 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

2 MARK BOZEK: Hi, uhm, good afternoon and thank
3 you all. As a New Yorker since I was 18-years-old, I
4 could not be happier seeing how dedicated and caring
5 HHC has been in revitalizing this incredibly
6 revitalized neighborhood. This past September 11th,
7 we hope to experience to times of Bill Cunningham
8 Exhibit in the Form of Abercrombie and Fitch store.
9 Creating an immersive exhibit based on a documentary
10 film on Made about New York Time Photographer Bill
11 Cunningham. We've had 7,000 visit the Seaport in the
12 last six weeks. Now the plug is over.

13 In the past three months, I've spent nearly every
14 night and day at the Seaport staying at a hotel a few
15 blocks north on Pearl Street. I leave the hotel at
16 5:00 a.m. every morning and have to pass by the 250
17 Water Street Parking lot. Given all the care and new
18 beauty that has been brought to the Seaport passing
19 the parking lot, reminds one of looking for parking
20 in the Bronx for a Yankee game. It is also the
21 location that I completely avoid at that time of the
22 morning and I cross the street. The tired notion
23 that a big bad Texas corporation and billionaire
24 investor is coming in with no respect or
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 220
2 understanding of the existing beauty is just plain
3 bologna.

4 The number of people that have come to the
5 Seaport in these last two months that I've interacted
6 with, more than half who have not been here since
7 getting drunk in the '80's and smelling the fish
8 market at the smelly Pier 17, have been absolutely
9 blown away by how the Seaport has changed for the
10 better. A historic district does not mean a
11 hysterical district. With out of date and bogus
12 complaints about toxic dirt and fear mongering, that
13 anyone these days or ever would put any child at
14 harm.

15 The Historic District cannot become hysterical. I
16 resoundly support the 250 Water Street Project and
17 see its future as a final jewel into the Seaport to
18 what is other a tawdry, dirty parking lot. Thank you
19 very much.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Nelson Chan who will be
22 followed by Richard Dykema.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

24 NELSON CHAN: Good afternoon esteemed members of
25 the City Council. My name is Nelson Chan, a lifelong

1
2 New Yorker born and raised in the lower east side and
3 currently the Director of Affordable Housing at AAFE
4 Downtown Manhattan Community Development Corporation.

5 My passion and our mission is to ensure that
6 immigrant New Yorkers and low income communities of
7 color can continue to live in the neighborhoods that
8 they built. That they help build. Chinatown and the
9 lower east side and all of lower Manhattan are in the
10 midst of an affordable housing crisis. That has only
11 grown more dire during COVID. It is for this reason
12 I am here to testify today in support of 250 Water
13 Street, a project that will create 50 or more units
14 of deeply affordable housing in Community Board 1.
15 Where a very small number of affordable units have
16 been created in recent decades.

17 The project now is sized to more appropriate
18 levels for the area making it contextual with the
19 surrounding community. The development is also a
20 positive catalyst for economic development and job
21 creation in the neighborhood but for me what's
22 exciting about this plan is again, the creation of 80
23 units of affordable housing, permanent affordable
24 housing. Permanent affordable housing at 40 percent
25 of Area Median Income or below and this is incredibly

1
2 unusual in today's market and especially important in
3 CB1.

4 As an affordable housing advocate, my hope is
5 that the projects permanent affordable units will
6 have a community preference and even a NYCHA
7 preference. I'm also advocating for the inclusion of
8 social service staff to provide adequate support for
9 the tenant body as well.

10 Our community has been devastated by the pandemic
11 and is in desperate need of affordable housing, good
12 jobs and supportive services. This project can be a
13 big step towards the recovery of lower Manhattan.
14 Again, I am very supportive of this project and urge
15 the City Council to support as well. Thank you very
16 much.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. The next panelist
19 please.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Richard Dykema will be the
21 next and last speaker on this panel.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: The clock is ready.

23 RICHARD DYKEMA: Okay, try it again. My name is
24 Richard Dykema, I'm a resident of the Fulton Seaport
25 neighborhood. I am in the Seaport District multiple

1
2 times a week. I applaud the Howard Hughes
3 Corporation for what they've done so far. And I
4 appreciate the proposal that they've made for
5 housing, which New York City desperately needs.

6 You can always argue against any housing proposal
7 on the basis that it is going to create more density
8 and there is going to be construction. That's just
9 the nature of having more housing. If you don't have
10 those things, you don't have more housing. And this
11 is a great proposal and the City Council should
12 support many more proposals like that.

13 The current ugly parking lot does nothing to
14 enhance the historic district whereas the proposal
15 will bring in more people. Will bring in more
16 customers to the Seaport District that makes it
17 viable financially and that will also help the
18 reopening of the Seaport Museum.

19 And so, I thank the Council Members for their
20 service and ask the Council and the Subcommittee to
21 approve the project as submitted. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you Richard.
23 Seeing that there is no questions from my colleagues,
24 this witness panel is now excused and I'm going to
25 turn it over to our Council for a brief announcement.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. I just want
3 to make a quick reminder to all those listening. If
4 you have successfully registered and you are waiting
5 for your turn to testify, we will get to you. So, we
6 ask that you please just be patient and do not use
7 the raise hand function. Similarly, if you have
8 already testified, there is no reason to use the
9 raise hand function. Thank you for your
10 participation.

11 The next panel will include Christopher Marte,
12 Colleen Robertson, and David Sheldon. Christopher
13 Marte.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi Chris, can you hear me?

16 CHRISTOPHER MARTE: Hi, yes, I can hear you.
17 Thank you for hosting this Committee Council Member
18 Moya. One thing I really reject the text amendment
19 that's happening here with 250 Water Street. The
20 main reason is the de-mapping of streets. The city,
21 if approves this rezoning of 250 Water Street, it did
22 not learn its lesson from what happened in Hudson
23 Yard. Where we have one developer who will go by any
24 means to get the development they want. And that's
25 what Howard Hughes is doing now with de-mapping of

1
2 streets and transferrin of air rights. Which is
3 believe is an illegal transit action that's happening
4 within a historic district.

5 This is going to continue to set a terrible
6 precedent for historic districts and protected areas
7 throughout this city. So, I ask you and the rest of
8 the Committee to vote no on this proposal and I'll
9 follow up with a more thorough testimony. Thank you
10 again.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Chris. Thank you
12 for your testimony today. Can we please call up the
13 next speaker?

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Colleen Robertson who will be
15 followed by David Sheldon.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

17 COLLEEN ROBERTSON: Hi, can you hear me now?
18 Sorry.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

20 COLLEEN ROBERTSON: Hi, uhm, thank you for
21 letting me speak. My name is Collen Robertson. I'm
22 sorry, I'm outside waiting to pick up my kids from
23 Peck Slip School in five minutes, so I don't have my
24 video on and it might be a little bit loud.

1
2 I am the PTA Co-President at Peck Slip. I have
3 two little boys, a kindergartener and second grader.
4 Uhm, I have been PTA Co-President for the past two
5 years and I've been trying with our Principal to get
6 a meeting to ensure the safeguards be put in place
7 and no one seems to be listening. It's very, very
8 upsetting. Uhm, please do not approve this right
9 now. Please make sure the health and safety of our
10 children is ensured. This construction is going to
11 be so damaging to them.

12 I was a teacher for 12 years over at PS89 when
13 there was construction happening in Battery Park City
14 and first hand saw kids breaking down and unable to
15 learn because of the pile driving, because of the
16 noise pollution. This just cannot happen and thank
17 you for your time.

18 Lastly, I just want to say, I find it so
19 offensive, as do others, that Chair Moya is posting
20 on Twitter during the hearing about a development
21 that is threatening the health and safety of our
22 children. Daylen, my seven year old asks if we've
23 been able to stop Howard Hughes from taking their
24 play street. This is all so heartbreaking, as you
25 can probably hear from my voice, trying not to cry.

1 So, thank you so much. Please do not approve
2
3 this.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
5 testimony today. If you can please call up the next
6 speaker.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next and last speaker on
8 this panel will be David Sheldon.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

10 DAVID SHELDON: Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: David, we can hear you.

12 DAVID SHELDON: Okay, thank you. My name is
13 David Sheldon, thank you for this opportunity to
14 testify. I have been a volunteer at the South Street
15 Seaport Museum for 20 years. In fact, I was part of
16 that meeting in Anne Beaumont's living room when Save
17 our Seaport was founded. And I have continued to be
18 an active member of Save our Seaport ever since. And
19 continued in that capacity to advocate for the South
20 Street Seaport Museum and I couldn't agree more that
21 it is something that we must save. We must preserve
22 and that it is in fact the beating heart of that
23 district.

24 So, where is the \$50 million? We have heard
25 about this bonus since this project hit the ground.

1
2 And yet, we have never seen anything made concrete or
3 viable. It's still under discussion. We're still
4 working on it. I hear these quotes every day and yet
5 I do not see this money. It is instead a diversion
6 and frankly and it makes me heart sick, a tool to
7 suborn the resources of the museum.

8 That doesn't stop me from volunteering and it
9 doesn't stop me from wanting to see that museum
10 thrive. I want to say something about views. Are we
11 thinking for a moment that the Howard Hughes
12 Corporation will not be using the views from its
13 tower as a selling point? And yet some how the rest
14 of us aren't allowed to even talk about it. That is
15 a point of fact. Frankly most apartments in South
16 Bridge Towers don't have a view in question anyway.

17 I want to close with one moment. I was able to
18 have dinner with two friends of mine, who I used to
19 say I was at the Seaport. They've been away for
20 quite some time and they went down to the Seaport and
21 they came back and they said, good lord, that place
22 has gotten really pricey. So, let's think about that
23 when we think about affordable housing. Thank you
24 very much.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
3 testimony. There being no questions from my
4 colleagues, this witness panel is now excused and
5 Counsel, please call up the next panel.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
7 Kim Busi, William Thomas, James Kaplan and Aaron
8 Singh. Kim Busi will speak first and then William
9 Thomas.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is ready.

11 KIM BUSI: Thank you very much. My name is Kim
12 Busi and I am a long term resident of lower Manhattan
13 and specifically the Seaport District. I raise my
14 family here and I've been a resident for over 20
15 years. I'm also trained as a physician and a K-12
16 School Leader for Children with various disabilities.
17 I strongly support the HAC proposal.

18 First, the project is needed and is needed now.
19 In a time of deep economic need and vast uncertainty,
20 New York City needs economic development urgently.
21 This project can begin construction only a few months
22 from now if it is approved and allowed to move
23 forward, now when it is needed. Jobs, customers,
24 visitors, we need them now. And the value of the
25 affordable housing cannot be overstated.

1
2 Second, I believe this project is safe. If done
3 correctly, construction is at worst disruptive but
4 neither physically nor mentally harmful. I have
5 confidence in the safety plan. This teams proven
6 ability to run a safe construction site sensitive to
7 our communities needs and for the oversight provided
8 by various governmental organizations that I trust,
9 including Margaret Chin.

10 Third, the projects design is deeply respectful
11 of this historical neighborhood and concerns raised
12 were responded to multiple times over very long
13 periods of time. The land use actions and air rights
14 are necessary to get this done. You know of course
15 HHC is a developer. I've become convinced that they
16 are one of the good ones. Their investment in our
17 neighborhood has made this area livable and vibrant
18 again, instead of derelict and deserted.

19 Prior development and investment in our area
20 brought new public schools, community centers, and
21 many new residents. They are so good. The many
22 residents move here to attend them. This is the same
23 type of transformative project and I urge you to
24 support it. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker
3 please.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be William
5 Thomas and then James Kaplan.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We can come back to William
8 Thomas and take James Kaplan next and then Aaron
9 Singh.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: James Kaplan, if you can
12 hear me, accept the unmute request. Okay, we'll try
13 to move on to Aaron Singh and come back to James
14 Kaplan later. Aaron Singh.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

16 JAMES KAPLAN: Can you hear me? This is James
17 Kaplan.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hey James, one second okay.
19 Did we have Aaron on already?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I don't see that his mic is
21 on yet. We can take James Kaplan.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Let's say James and then we'll
23 go to Aaron okay. So, Aaron, hang tight. James,
24 when you're ready, you may begin.

1
2 JAMES KAPLAN: Okay, my name is James Kaplan. I
3 am the Chairman and Past President of the lower
4 Manhattan Historical Association. Which is a
5 consortium of various historical groups in lower
6 Manhattan including the Fraunces Tavern Museum, the
7 New York Veteran Corp of Artillery, the Museum of
8 American Finance, and various other patriotic groups.

9 I am speaking in support of the proposal of the
10 Howard Hughes Corporation for 250 Water Street. I
11 remember 50 years ago, when I began working in lower
12 Manhattan and things were much worse economically,
13 how the South Street Seaport Museum and its parade of
14 ships showed us how things could get better. I
15 remember particularly how the concerts at Pier 16
16 with performers such as Peter, Paul and Mary, Pete
17 Segar, John Bias, and Bob Dillan inspired us to
18 believe the city could recover from its economic and
19 psychological doldrums.

20 It seems that now the South Street Seaport Museum
21 has over the years fallen on tougher times and is in
22 need of funding. I've now sat through and testified
23 at five public hearings on this subject. From my
24 perspective, the focus has been on what is in the
25 failures of the recent past. But I urge you the

1
2 members of the City Council to focus on not the
3 recent failures but what once was and what could be
4 in the future.

5 Let us rebuild the great cultural historic
6 center, which once stood here on the east river to an
7 even greater one in the future. In our view, more
8 than even finance, it is the - it's the city's
9 history and its cultural resources which will be the
10 key to its future. We have never in the 50 years
11 that I've worked on Wallstreet begrudged letting a
12 private developer that was investing my makes of
13 money from a project if it was for the public good.
14 I urge you to support this project. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. And now, we'll go
16 to Aaron.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hold on Aaron. Got it.

19 AARON SINGH: Great, thank you. Thank you so
20 much Chair Moya and thank you for the opportunity to
21 testify here. My name is Aaron Singh, I'm the Vessel
22 Operations Teacher at the New York Harbor School and
23 I'm a long time volunteer at the South Street Seaport
24 Museum. In fact, I started off as a volunteer in
25 1995 and got my captains license at the ripe age of

1
2 19. And I'm been fortunate to see the museum through
3 thriving years where hundreds of thousands of public
4 school students were able to visit the vessels, get
5 down to the waterfront. And I want to bring in a
6 topic and kind of a point of view, that the Seaport
7 District is not just lower Manhattan. The South
8 Street Seaport is New York City's five boroughs
9 access to the water.

10 I grew up in Spanish Harlem and I got down to the
11 water and found this amazing career path to be able
12 to work on the water. 92 percent of the folks that
13 work in the harbor are White, Caucasian Male. And
14 so, the goal of Harbor School, which South Street
15 Seaport Museum started back in 2003 is to get a
16 diverse group of students that come from an urban
17 area connected with the water and marine, science and
18 tech.

19 And so, we look forward to actually South Street
20 Seaport Museum and Howard Hughes building up and this
21 250 Water Street Proposal is going to give the museum
22 the power, the support that it needs to continue. To
23 get back on track post 911, post Sandy, and the
24 financial crisis. And so, we need to be able to
25 support this idea and again, think a little bit about

1
2 this. You don't think about the students that have
3 to get access to the water. When most people think
4 about waterfront, they think about real estate
5 development, high priced condos. I'm talking about
6 getting intercity kids down to the waterfront to
7 learn, respect, experience. And I want to thank you
8 know uh, the Manhattan Borough President Gayle Brewer
9 and Councilwoman Chin, who has done an amazing job
10 for the district and thinking about young people.
11 So, I thank you for your time.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony
13 and the next speaker will be William Thomas.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

15 WILLIAM THOMAS: Hi there. Sorry, my Zoom
16 crashed. Uhm, but my name is Will Thomas. I am here
17 to support the proposal for 250 Water Street as the
18 Executive Director of Open New York. We're an
19 independent grassroots pro housing organization. We
20 hope the City Council will support the project as
21 well, as it provides desperately needed housing.

22 New York has a terrible housing shortage which
23 I've repeated many times for the City Council. I'm
24 going to repeat some of those facts again today.

25 Between 2010 and 2017, median rents increased by more

1
2 than double median wages. Homelessness has reached
3 the highest level since the great depression.

4 Pre-COVID, one out of every ten elementary school
5 students in New York City public schools went home to
6 shelters. So, moving on from a global pandemic,
7 we'll need as much affordable housing as we can get
8 and the 80 below market homes that this rezoning
9 would offer is an ideal place to start.

10 Uh, with that said, the market rate homes that
11 250 Water Street will also provide will help by
12 proactively preventing displacement elsewhere. The
13 median household income at the Seaport is well over
14 six figures, more broadly, the financial district is
15 a very desirable neighborhood and although it would
16 be many families first choice, they can't find new
17 places to live here, they will simply bid up the
18 prices of existing housing. Families who would have
19 otherwise lived in that housing or instead move to
20 more affordable neighborhoods.

21 As displaced demand increases, up goes the rent,
22 which forces currents to allocate ever larger shares
23 of their income to stay in their homes and knocks
24 those who can't pay to the street. So, if we don't
25 let young professionals live here, they are not going

1
2 to disappear, they are going to further displacement
3 pressures across the city.

4 We live in a city where there aren't enough homes
5 for the people who want to live here. It has
6 horrifying human consequences. That's the hulking
7 mass over the neighborhood. The quality of life
8 issue we really have to address.

9 But one other thing I would ask that the Council
10 to consider is uh, to uh, eliminate parking from the
11 proposal. The area is so transit rich, I would ask
12 the commission encourage replacing the parking with
13 literally anything else. Uhm, thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you William. Uhm, that
15 being the last speaker for this panel and seeing no
16 questions from my colleagues, this witness panel is
17 now excused and I'll have the Council call up the
18 next panel please.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
20 Huntley Gill, Timur Galen, Erik Antokal, and
21 Catherine McVay Hughes. Huntley Gill followed by
22 Timur Galen.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Can we see if uhm, we have
25 them on?

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Huntley Gill will be the
3 first speaker. If you can – okay, we're going to
4 come back to Huntley Gill. Uh, Timur Galen will be
5 the next speaker followed by Erick Antokal.

6 TIMUR GALEN: Hello, can you hear me?

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: We can hear you.

8 TIMUR GALEN: Hello?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Go ahead.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

11 TIMUR GALEN: Yeah, uhm, if you can hear me. My
12 name is Timur Galen. I am a resident of lower
13 Manhattan and an Architect. I submit this testimony
14 to underscore five points that I've already made in
15 testimony to the Landmark Preservation Commission and
16 the City Planning Commission in their review of 250
17 Water Street.

18 First of all, 250 Water Streets site is suitable
19 to receive additional density. The full block site
20 easily accommodates the inherent complexity of higher
21 density mixed use development. It is proximate to
22 public transportation, bus, ferry, subway path and
23 the cycle path. It occupies the zone between the
24 historic Seaport buildings in the financial district,
25 and the site is more appropriate to receive

1
2 additional density, the neighboring pier or
3 waterfront sites.

4 Second of all, the additional density is being
5 deployed to accomplish an appropriate mix of uses.
6 Market rate housing which will help extend several
7 decades of growth with residential population grow in
8 Manhattan. Affordable housing, which is key to
9 sustain the vibrance and diversity of the
10 neighborhood. Retail services and community oriented
11 spaces at street level. And alternative workplace
12 located at the [INAUDIBLE 4:50:50].

13 Third, the economic benefits of greater density
14 are being distributed in a very thoughtful way.
15 Crucial support for the South Street Seaport Museum
16 and essential public and cultural destination that
17 must be in a sound and viable institutional shape to
18 anchor the district and for the district to remain
19 sustainable. Affordable housing and of course other
20 community facing distance.

21 Fourth, the planning and fundamental massing of
22 the proposed project is appropriate in the context of
23 the historic district and has only been improved
24 since its emission hearing back in the early part of
25 this year. The contextual base is in scale and

1
2 empathetic with the bulk fabric of the district
3 itself. The residential tower sites back decisively
4 from contextual base and has a modest presence on the
5 skyline.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

7 TIMUR GALEN: And ground floor uses in the
8 proposed streetscape, successfully integrate with
9 those of the district.

10 In summary, the 250 Water Street application
11 demonstrates a sound partnership between essential
12 public interests. First and foremost the museum, the
13 district and affordable housing and responsible
14 private development.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you.

16 TIMUR GALEN: Thank you very much for your
17 consideration.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
19 testimony. Next speaker please.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Erik Antokal who will
21 followed by Huntley Gill.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

23 ERIK ANTOKAL: Hi, good afternoon and thank you
24 so much for holding this hearing. My name is Erik
25 Antokal, I am the Assistant DP for Programs at

1
2 Nontraditional Employment for Women. We're a 44-
3 year-old nonprofit organization serving the five
4 boroughs and beyond in pursuit of training, placing
5 and retaining more women, trans-folks and gender
6 nonbinary folks in the construction industry.
7 Specifically, uh, the union construction industry
8 where apprenticeship training and great wages and
9 benefits are possible.

10 Land Lease, which is a supporter and general
11 contractor on the project has committed to the use of
12 our new signature projects model. On this project,
13 which is why I come to you all testifying in favor of
14 this project. They have committed to set a workforce
15 diversity goal specifically for women workers on the
16 project. Which not only creates additional
17 opportunities for more women to come into the
18 construction industry through union apprenticeships,
19 but it will also create opportunities for those women
20 who are already in the industry to have richer career
21 paths as they face bias and other sorts of oppression
22 in the industry.

23 So, we support Land Lease and Howard Hughes in
24 setting these diversity goals for the project and we
25 recognize the positive impact that this project along

1
2 with the diversity goal will set uhm, uh, and put in
3 place for the five boroughs of New York. Including
4 local residents who are primarily low income and we
5 again, support this project and hope you all will
6 move forward with it. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony.
8 Next speaker please.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be
10 Huntley Gill followed by Catherine McVay Hughes.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 HUNTLEY GILL: My name is Huntley Gill with
13 Guardia Architects. I am a Preservationist and a
14 maritime preservationist. I first became involved
15 with the Seaport in this neighborhood when I was out
16 of graduate school at Columbia and uhm, was working
17 for the Mayor's Office of Development. And I'm very
18 familiar with the whole history of the planning
19 concepts here which of course relates to transfer of
20 development rights. The original idea behind the
21 museums development.

22 And as I look at this proposal, all I can say is
23 to support it, is that it is fulfilling exactly that
24 vision. The idea of the low rise historic
25 streetscapes surrounded by taller buildings that's in

1
2 turn supported financially. I also have to say
3 having been a friend of the Grusins(SP?) that it
4 also, I think anything that provides a good solid
5 wall between the Seaport District itself and the
6 Grusins Towers behind which really break up the
7 street and form a very bad background visually. And
8 as a planning element to the Seaport District is a
9 good thing.

10 So, all and all, my view of this and all of the
11 planning that goes into it, is that it's fulfilling
12 the original vision of the Seaport District and I
13 urge its support.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Uh, next speaker
15 please.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Catherine McVay Hughes.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 CATHERINE MCVAY HUGHES: Good afternoon. My name
19 is Catherine McVay Hughes, I served on Manhattan
20 Community Board 1 for 20 years. Half of that time as
21 Chair or Co-Chair. I have lived downtown since 1988.
22 For all those 33 years, 250 Water was an urban
23 blight. Nothing was done. It's great to see change
24 coming at last.

1
2 As someone who cares about her neighborhood and
3 is committed to its future, there are seven facts
4 about this proposal. One, 250 Water an eyesore,
5 replaces a 50 year old parking lot with a beautiful
6 building designed by world renowned architect.

7 Two, it will lose a contaminated brownfield that
8 has threatened the neighborhood for more than a
9 century. Three, it restores affordable housing loss
10 when South Bridge Towers went private. Four, it
11 brings new residential customers to the restaurants
12 and small businesses of the neighborhood. Five, it
13 provides new facilities for schools, including a play
14 street and community center. Six, it creates a new
15 future for the South Street Seaport Museum, its
16 vessels and collections and its education mission.
17 Seven, it demonstrates \$1 billion commitment to lower
18 Manhattan post COVID, a transformative investment
19 that echoes and expands on more recovery downtown
20 after 911. This project provides amenities that we
21 have needed for decades at a time of significant
22 budgetary constraints.

23 When the Seaport District was created in the
24 1960's with the South Street Seaport Museum at its
25 heart, the city planners included in the district,

1
2 the nearby blocks of lower Manhattan specifically for
3 redevelopment, not for preservation to support the
4 museum and the district for the long term.

5 The article from May of 1969 attached to my
6 testimony confirms this. Now is the time to execute
7 on this vision, seize this unique opportunity and
8 support the 250 Water Street project, the right
9 project at the right time. Thank you very much. I'm
10 just going to hold it up. Hopefully, it's from the
11 New York Times. It might be a little blurry.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 CATHERINE MCVAY HUGHES: But I hope you take a
14 minute to see the second page of my testimony and all
15 my affiliations have been disclosed. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
17 testimony. That being the last speaker on the panel
18 and seeing no questions, this witness panel is now
19 excused. Counsel, please call up the next panel
20 please.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
22 Patrick Quinn, Frank Sciame, Daniel Del Vecchio, and
23 Kerry Noland. Patrick Quinn first followed by Frank
24 Sciame.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1
2 PATRICK QUINN: Hello, my name is Patrick Quinn
3 and I am here today representing iPic Theaters. We
4 are a nearby business located in the Seaport. In the
5 beautiful and historic Fulton Market Building. We
6 strongly support the HHC proposal to develop a mixed
7 use building at 250 Water that will spur economic
8 development and residential housing near transit.

9 It will create permanently deeply affordable
10 housing in lower Manhattan's affluent Seaport
11 neighborhood and generate funding for the Seaport
12 Museum. Our iPic Theaters location serve as meeting
13 and entertainment locations for communities and as
14 such, we are heavily invested in the communities we
15 serve.

16 While we love the Seaport, we've been
17 disappointed that years into our operation 250 Water
18 still remains an unsightly gap in the city's scape.
19 The parking lot at 250 Water is a major detraction
20 from the neighborhood and it impedes its walk ability
21 particularly at night time.

22 The construction of the building design that the
23 LPC approved will activate this block from morning
24 until night. Not only improving safety but also
25 improving neighborhood moral. This will reinforce

1
2 the boundaries of the historic district while staying
3 contextual to its surrounding by being taller along
4 Pearl and lower as it meets the interior of the
5 historic district.

6 We truly believe the 250 Water project, will
7 transform the pedestrian experience throughout the
8 Seaport by connecting critical blocks of the historic
9 district with a cohesive mixed use plan. This will
10 translate to an increased engagement with the Seaport
11 from residents within and outside of the district.

12 And it's critical to the long term sustainability of
13 businesses within the district. There are many
14 businesses like ours struggling desperately to
15 survive as a result of the pandemic and the addition
16 of the 270 apartments plus 1,700 permanent jobs that
17 the development will generate will support local
18 businesses and add to the vibrancy of the community.

19 In order for iPic and other businesses to survive
20 and for the Seaport to thrive, we need 250 Water to
21 be built. This proposed project solves so many
22 problems the Seaport District and city currently face
23 and does so through smart urban planning. We at iPic
24 urge the City Council –

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 248
2 PATRICK QUINN: To support the land use
3 necessary. Thank you so much.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker on the panel
5 will be Frank Sciame who will be followed by Daniel
6 Del Vecchio.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 FRANK SCIAME: Okay, am I unmuted? Is my camera
9 on?

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Your camera is not on but we
11 can hear you.

12 FRANK SCIAME: Okay, good afternoon. Thank you
13 Councilwoman Chin and all of the Council Members for
14 your time. I'm Frank Sciame, CEO of Sciame
15 Construction. I have been involved with the Seaport
16 for over 40 years. I have started by building the
17 Seamon's Church Institute and when I built that
18 building, I fell in love with the neighborhood. I
19 ended up buying three buildings there. Two of which
20 were historic. I had my offices there for 20 years.
21 Became the Board Chair of the South Street Seaport
22 Museum. I just love the district.

23 I'm also the Passport Chair of the Landmarks
24 Conservancy and as a preservationist, I strongly
25 believe that we must save the historic Seaport. The

1
2 fact is that 250 Water Street project, it's the only
3 viable plan that exists to achieve this goal. The
4 plan will add a dynamic, resilient building with
5 affordable housing in place of a parking lot that for
6 a half century, has blighted the district.

7 As a builder, I'd like to highlight that Howard
8 Hughes Corporation has shown its commitment to the
9 Seaport through its rebuilding of Pier 17, the
10 restoration of the Tin Building, and the management
11 of complex projects throughout the area. They've
12 done this with sensitivity and expertise. The
13 transparent rigorous approach to the necessary
14 environmental cleanup of 250 Water Street and the
15 initial planning as outlined in their Draft
16 Environmental Impact Analysis are in keeping with
17 their community minded value system.

18 The Howard Hughes Corporation has been a trusted
19 and robust partner to this historic Seaport Museum,
20 to local nonprofits, to arts organizations, to small
21 businesses throughout the neighborhood. This is a
22 sound plan and a win-win for the South Street
23 Seaport.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.
25

1
2 FRANK SCIAME: And all of New York City. Thank
3 you for your time.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Daniel
5 Del Vecchio followed by Kerry Noland.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Daniel Del Vecchio, if you
8 can hear me, we need you to accept the unmute request
9 in order to begin your —

10 DANIEL DEL VECCHIO: Yes, I did. Can you hear me
11 now?

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

14 DANIEL DEL VECCHIO: Thank you. My name is
15 Daniel Del Vecchio and I strongly support HHC
16 proposal to develop a mixed use building at 250 Water
17 Street, that will spur economic development, add good
18 jobs, create permanent, deeply affordable housing in
19 lower Manhattan's affluent South Street Seaport
20 neighborhood and generate the funding to stabilize
21 the Seaport Museum. I urge the City Council to
22 support and approve the land use actions necessary to
23 make 250 Water Street possible. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker.
25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next and last speaker on this
3 panel will be Kerry Noland.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Kerry Noland, if you can hear
6 us, we need you to accept the unmute request in order
7 to begin with your testimony.

8 You have to accept the unmute request by touching
9 star six on your phone. Okay, we will come back to
10 Kerry Noland later. That was the last announced
11 speaker on this panel.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing that we have no
13 questions from my colleagues, this witness panel is
14 now excused and if you can call up the next panel.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panel will include Laura
16 Norwitz, Stefan Edick, and Joshua Pickard. Laura
17 Norwitz followed by Stefan Edick.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Laura Norwitz, we need you to
20 accept the unmute request in order to begin your
21 testimony.

22 LAURA NORWITZ: Hello, can you hear me?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

25 LAURA NORWITZ: Thank you very much.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Whenever you are ready Nora,
3 Laura sorry.

4 LAURA NORWITZ: Very good. My name is Laura
5 Norwitz, I am the Senior Director of Programs and
6 Education at South Street Seaport Museum. I support
7 the proposal. I've got a couple of points to make.

8 The particular design of the proposed
9 construction is not inappropriate for the
10 neighborhood and you cannot uncouple saving the
11 Seaport Museum from preserving the historic district.
12 I think most of the people here agree that the
13 Seaport Museum is a good thing and worth saving. I
14 wish it were saved already. Do I like tall
15 buildings? No, not particularly but this tall
16 building that abuts a neighborhood of tall building
17 just shifts the tall building line slightly.

18 So, what will be the experience from the street?
19 Right now, walking past the parking lot, there's lots
20 of light. Lots of visible sky. There is what looks
21 like open space because it's a parking lot. And what
22 will take away from that sky is any structure that's
23 four or five stories tall. From the street, it's not
24 a tower or a tall building that will block the site
25 lines, it's the bottom few floors. Anything that's

1
2 not set back and building as of right, wouldn't help.
3 In fact, it might even be worse. Wouldn't it be nice
4 to have a park there instead? Sure but Howard Hughes
5 is a business, so that ain't going to happen.

6 Do I wish we could save the Seaport Museum
7 another way? Sure. We could put air rights on the
8 market but what if nobody wants to buy them? I think
9 if there were another way to save the museum, it
10 would have been done already. Oh, I'm a parent and I
11 was a classroom teacher for years. So, yeah, it
12 would be lousy for construction to happen right
13 outside the classroom windows. I would hate it but
14 this is New York and in New York, things get built.
15 That's what happens in New York.

16 Also, maybe some of our neighbors think that it
17 doesn't really matter what happens to the museum
18 maybe they think if the museum is gone, the
19 neighborhood, the Seaport Historic District, it would
20 all still be there. But no, because if the museum is
21 gone, the Neighbor Tree is gone, Ambrose is gone.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

23 LAURA NORWITZ: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker
25 please.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Stefan Edick followed by
3 Joshua Pickard.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 STEFAN EDICK: Good afternoon everyone. My name
6 is Stefan Edick and I'm grateful for the opportunity
7 to speak in support of the proposal for 250 Water
8 Street. I'm a Career Maritime Heritage Professional
9 and I've been deeply involved with the Seaport
10 Community since I was employed there from 1998 to
11 2002. And uhm, I think as we are focusing on the
12 immediate, it's important to take a step back and put
13 the Seaport in the larger context because starting in
14 1968, the Seaport was a standard there. Not just for
15 maritime heritage preservation but for historic
16 preservation in general. As a small group of
17 determined people kept the district from the wrecking
18 ball. And as noted by Ada Louise Huxtable the role
19 of historic districts is not to embalm history but to
20 work as part of a dynamic conversation that combines
21 old and new for the preservation of the historic
22 fabric as a living thing.

23 The others have spoken here much more eloquently
24 about the qualities of the building, about the
25 importance of the affordable housing, the employment

1
2 opportunities that will be involved. I'd like to
3 address just two things just briefly. The first is
4 the significance of this project to the future. The
5 viability and the sustainability of the Seaport
6 Museum. The Seaport Museum is as others have noted,
7 a real icon for the history of New York and for the
8 history of the nation. Which was after all created
9 by ships and shipping and it uhm, in all of the
10 different things that converted wilderness and native
11 American, first nations territory to the most vibrant
12 community in the world. The Seaport Museum and
13 maintaining and preserving that connection plays an
14 absolutely vital role.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

16 STEFAN EDICK: And few organizations, a few
17 museums if any have had to endure the sort of
18 challenges that the Seaport Museum has had to in the
19 last 20 years. Whether disaster is natural or
20 manmade, they've presented a huge set of challenges
21 and that this part, the project provides funding for
22 the museum that will keep it viable going on into the
23 future.

24 And then second, as a side note -
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 256
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Stefan, thank you very much.
3 Your two minutes have expired.

4 STEFAN EDICK: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony
6 today. Next speaker please.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Joshua Pickard.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 JOSHUA PICKARD: Can you hear me now?

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

11 JOSHUA PICKARD: Okay, good afternoon Committee
12 members. My name is Joshua Pickard, I'm a Partner at
13 NoHo Hospitality Group which operates a restaurants
14 downtown New York. I am speaking today in support of
15 HSC and their mixed use building at 250 Water Street
16 on behalf of myself and my partners Luke Ulstrom(SP?)
17 and Andrew Carmaleni(SP?).

18 We invested in the Seaport District and support
19 this evolution into a wonderful balance between its
20 history and the future. This development will help
21 spur increased economic development, add residential
22 housing or public transit and good jobs, create
23 permanent deeply affordable housing at affluent
24 Seaport neighborhood, and generate funding for the
25 important Seaport Museum.

1
2 I've lived in downtown New York City since 1981
3 and know the Seaport quite well over the years. I'm
4 a founding board member that created the NoHo bid, so
5 I understand the development process in such
6 cherished neighborhoods. I was happy to see the
7 modifications made during the landmarks approval
8 process and I feel confident this this development
9 will be an important addition to the Seaport
10 District. It has been carefully scaled to the
11 existing historical structures that is inclusive to
12 the community needs. Over the past 20 - 32 years,
13 I've been involved in building 22 restaurants in four
14 states. I recently completed a three year project
15 with Howard Hughes at Pier 17, where we recently
16 opened [INAUDIBLE 5:12:50].

17 I can tell you with years of first-hand
18 experience at HSC that it's been the most conscious
19 buildings we have ever worked with. They have taken
20 extra ordinary level of responsibility in its
21 handling of all the projects in this area. While we
22 understand the construction be temporarily
23 disruptive, we have confidence in this team to run a
24 safe sensitive and responsive construction operation
25 at 250 Water Street.

1
2 The buildings design is contextual to its
3 surrounding. Specifically the buildings low rise
4 where it meets the interior of the historic district
5 and taller along Pearl street, which is wider and
6 faces the high rise financial district. I thank you
7 and I urge City Council to join us to support the
8 land use actions necessary to make 250 Water Street
9 possible. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Please call up the
11 next panelist please.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Josh Pickard was the last
13 speaker on that panel.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing no questions,
15 this panel is now excused. If you can, please call
16 up the next panel.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panel – the next panel
18 will include Scott Dwyer, Edward McWilliams, Sarah L.
19 Batanouny and Lili Chopra. Scott Dwyer will speak
20 first followed by Edward McWilliams.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Scott Dwyer, we need you to
23 accept the unmute request in order to begin your
24 testimony.

25 SCOTT DWYER: Sorry, can you hear me now?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

SCOTT DWYER: Great, thank you. My name is Scott Dwyer, I am Representing Sons of the Revolution in the State of New York. Who own and operate Fraunces Tavern Museum in lower Manhattan. The historic site dating to 1719 and a museum which opened in 1907, a short walk from the South Street Seaport Museum.

We strongly support the Howard Hughes Corporation proposal to develop a mixed use building at 250 Water Street, that will among many other things replace an unsightly parking lot and make possible significant funding for the imperiled South Street Seaport Museum. An essential component and anchor of the historic district, allowing it to restore and reopen its historic buildings and plan for a future expansion.

After a lengthy stakeholder process, the current design approved by the New York City Landmarks Commission will transform the lot, enhance the neighborhood and the historic district. We urge this body to support the land use actions necessary to make this development possible. Thank you.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 260
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Scott. Thank you
3 for your testimony. The next speaker please.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Edward McWilliams who will be
5 followed by Sarah L. Batanouny.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

7 EDWARD MCWILLIAMS: Good afternoon Chairman Moya
8 and the Committee. Thank you for the opportunity to
9 participate and uh, my name is Edward McWilliams. I
10 am a representative of the New York City District
11 Council of Carpenters. And I'm here to offer our
12 strong support for Howard Hughes Corporation's
13 proposal to develop a mixed use building at 250 Water
14 Street.

15 New York City needs economic development now more
16 than ever. It needs more projects like this one,
17 which encourages investment and is poised to be a
18 robust part of lower Manhattan and New York City's
19 economic recovery. The plan will generate
20 substantial investment in the Seaport of some \$850
21 million. Creating 1,600 muchly needed construction
22 jobs and over 1,700 permanent jobs in commercial,
23 retail and nonprofit sectors.

24 Not only will 250 Water Street spur economic
25 development. It will add good jobs, it will create

1
2 permanent and deeply affordable housing in lower
3 Manhattan's affluent South Street Seaport
4 neighborhood and generate funding to stabilize the
5 Seaport Museum.

6 I urge the Council, the City Council to support
7 and approve the land use actions necessary to make
8 250 Water Street possible. Thank you very much Mr.
9 Chairman.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
11 testimony today. Next speaker.

12 SARAH BATANOUNY: Hi, my name is Sarah Batanouny
13 and I've been a long time resident of lower
14 Manhattan.

15 We moved after, shortly after 911 to the
16 neighborhood and uh, I've seen the growth and the
17 revitalization of the neighborhood and I continue to
18 hope and believe that we can continue doing this.
19 This proposal will bring much needed jobs to the
20 neighborhood and again, I cannot stress enough how
21 what the Seaport and Howard Hughes has done for us in
22 the neighborhood. It's appreciated by a lot of us
23 who live down here.

24 I wanted to stress on two things that have been
25 brought up. I have worked with Councilwoman Chin

1
2 when I was PTA President at Spruce and nobody likes
3 and loves our kids more than she does. And I know
4 she has done all her due diligence. She has always
5 been a huge supporter of the kids. While we were
6 having construction during that time, it actually was
7 much more traumatic for the parents than the kids.
8 The kids were fine.

9 Our kids are fine. They are like now trying to
10 get into college. And I even remembered when I moved
11 into the neighborhood and I was trying to get into
12 PS20 at 234, it was sandwiched between two
13 construction sites and I just felt grateful that they
14 will just take my application. I did not feel like I
15 was entitled to tell them, don't do anything. I just
16 wanted my kids in a good education, free education in
17 New York City and that's what we have been getting.

18 So, I just wanted to stress that the kids will be
19 fine. I've been around a lot of construction and in
20 fact, at District 75 School, down the street now from
21 Peck Slip School has a huge construction site on
22 Beekman and nobody has said anything. I haven't
23 heard anything about that and those kids in District
24 75, they have sensory issues and this construction is
25 going on with no issues.

1
2 So, I just wanted to stress again that this would
3 be great for the neighborhood. It's now one of the
4 best neighborhoods in New York City and its been just
5 great living here. And thank you so much for
6 everybody's time. Take care, bye.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
8 testimony. Next speaker please.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Lili Chopra will be the next
10 and last speaker on this panel.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 LILI CHOPRA: Good afternoon. My name is Lili
13 Chopra, I am the Executive Director Artistic Programs
14 at the Lower Manhattan Cultural Council known as
15 LMCC. And it is on behalf of LMCC that I am honored
16 to testify today in support of the Howard Hughes
17 Corporation plan as we care deeply about the South
18 Street Seaport neighborhood. Both its physical
19 assets and the local community within it and around
20 it.

21 For more than a decade, Howard Hughes Corporation
22 has been strongly committed to supporting and
23 enhancing arts and culture in the Seaport area and we
24 are thrilled to see after so many years, in a
25 proposal come together to provide the South Street

1
2 Seaport Museum with a plan to thrive for the long
3 term. It is our strong desire that the museum and
4 its landmark spaces and historic assets will continue
5 to be an important cultural anchor in the Seaport for
6 the decades more to come.

7 The proposal for the parking lot will bring
8 affordable housing and community space that long
9 underutilize sites, which LMCC is indeed in support
10 of both the inclusion of affordable housing and a
11 dynamic community space. As being further important
12 assets to the downtown diverse community. Under its
13 leadership, the Howard Hughes Corporation has proven
14 to be responsive to local concerns as well as a
15 supporter of arts and culture within and around the
16 district.

17 And so, we really appreciate the outreach to the
18 local community and their commitment to making the
19 redevelopment of 250 Water Street inclusive of local
20 voices and responsive to their concerns. The design
21 is sensitive to the historic district and responds to
22 the issues raised by many community members. So, it
23 is our hope that the commission will approve this
24 appropriate sustainable development, which offer a
25 vital opportunity to strengthen the historic district

1
2 and bring affordable housing, jobs, economic
3 development and enhance the cultural offerings of the
4 Seaport and of lower Manhattan. Thank you so much
5 for your consideration.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
7 testimony today. Next speaker.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
9 speaker on this panel.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, that being - seeing no
11 questions from my colleagues, uh, that witness panel
12 is now excused and if you can call up the panel
13 please.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
15 Kerry Noland, Douglas Hanau, Maria Ho-Burge, Michelle
16 Koppersmith, and Sinade Wadsworth. Kerry Noland will
17 speak first followed by Douglas Hanau.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

19 KERRY NOLAND: Great, thank you and I appreciate
20 the opportunity to speak to the Council. My name is
21 Kerry Noland, uhm, I have a couple roles. I'm a very
22 long term volunteer at the South Street Seaport
23 Museum, where I started as a volunteer in 2005, uhm,
24 on the pioneer. I've worked my way up and I am now a
25 captain. I am also an architect and can speak about

1
2 the appropriateness of this project. Uhm, I work
3 with Breyer Blenderwell(SP?), which I'm sure as you
4 know is very versed in historic projects. I also
5 just in full disclosure, the South Street Seaport
6 Museum is a client of ours but we do not benefit from
7 this project.

8 Uhm, I think what I'd really like to speak to is
9 just the experience that this building will give to
10 the street level. The Seaport is a very walkable
11 neighborhood as you know. And having the parking lot
12 right now, it's a blight. It's just an empty spot.
13 I used to live on Pearl Street and having to walk
14 past that, I can tell you it would be a much more
15 pleasant experience if there was a residential
16 building there along with retail at the ground floor.
17 It will just improve the pedestrian experience to
18 have this building there instead of the parking lot.

19 As somebody who used to live in the neighborhood,
20 I was priced out about ten years ago. So, having
21 additional housing in this neighborhood especially
22 with the affordable housing that will be put in the
23 tower, I think is a really great move and will help
24 hopefully diversify the neighborhood as well.

1 I think that is all I have to say. Thank you for
2 letting me speak and I hope that you support South
3 Street Seaport Museum. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
5 testimony. Next speaker please.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Maria Ho-Burge followed by -
7 excuse me Douglas Hanau will be the next speaker
8 followed by Maria Ho-Burge.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 DOUGLAS HANAU: Hello, can you hear me?

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

12 DOUGLAS HANAU: My name is Douglas Hanau. I'm a
13 lifelong resident of New York City, raising two
14 teenage daughters. I want to ask Council Member Chin
15 to support this project wholeheartedly. I personally
16 wish it was bigger and I personally wish there was
17 more housing but as it is, it's a great plan.

18 New York City is facing a climate and a housing
19 crisis. Every elected official, every community
20 group, every community board, says this but when the
21 opportunity to build housing, an additional housing
22 that's dense, that's uhm, climate - that's better for
23 the climate than existing housing. That has uhm,
24
25

1
2 features that make it environmentally better comes
3 along, we reject it for parochial reasons.

4 We have to start stepping up as a city and build
5 housing everywhere. A parking lot is a great place
6 to start. So, my children, my teenage daughters
7 hopefully will have a place to come back to when they
8 graduate college or they finish high school and want
9 to work in the city. There needs to be housing and
10 that's just my family.

11 There are homeless families right now. There are
12 working poor families who can't live near jobs. Who
13 can't live in Manhattan. Who can't live in the city
14 and we are continually telling them no, we don't want
15 you here by denying projects like this.

16 So, please, pass this project. Pass all the
17 rezoning's and pass everything. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker
19 please.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Maria Ho-Burge to be followed
21 by Michelle KupperSmith.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

23 MARIA HO-BURGE: Hi everyone.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi Maria, whenever you're
25 ready, you can start.

1
2 MARIA HO-BURGE: Okay. Hi everyone, my name is
3 Maria Ho-Burge, I'm a 15 year Seaport resident, a
4 Peck Slip School parent and a local small business
5 owner. I have been and am currently in the Seaport
6 community for the long run. I am testifying in
7 support of Howard Hughes proposal for 250 Water
8 Street. I have to set the scene for you with regards
9 to the Howard Hughes.

10 Before the company came to the Seaport, as many
11 of you know, the area was [INAUDIBLE 5:26:55]. Since
12 they have come in, they made the Seaport a
13 designation again, one that all New Yorkers can be
14 proud of. They have been responsible and generous
15 community partners, having donated to local schools
16 hundreds of thousands of dollars over the years.

17 I'm also a Co-Chair of the Taste of the Seaport
18 Festival that takes place each fall. Just this year,
19 Howard Hughes again donated over \$100,000 to support
20 our schools arts programs. Our kids have musical
21 instruments because of this company. They have also
22 provided family friendly programming from tree
23 lightings to ice skating. All for either free or at
24 a reduced cost for people who live in the
25 neighborhood.

1
2 As a longtime resident, the improvements made to
3 the Seaport are why I continue to live here. As a
4 mother, I enjoy the amenities of our neighborhood
5 with my family on a weekly basis. As a small
6 business owner, I am appreciative of the business
7 Howard Hughes brings to the Seaport but we do need
8 more.

9 As far as areas of attention in lower Manhattan
10 this building will help with, safety. The area has
11 gone up and down in terms of safety and the
12 improvements that Howard Hughes have brought and will
13 bring are going to bring more people to the area and
14 help with safety.

15 Patronage for small business, as a small business
16 owner, my salon is very close to the heart of the
17 Seaport, if we are all to survive after the pandemic,
18 we need more people in the area. I received zero
19 help from the government. I need more people in the
20 neighborhood to patronize my salon in order to
21 survive and I will tell you that many, if not all of
22 the small business owners in this area feel the same
23 way.

24 And affordable housing, I understand that as many
25 as 80 new units we offered and I may add that of

1 course the views in premium apartments, we savor
2 those who are paying the premium price. It's a
3 business not a charity. I just have to say that.

4 One last bit, as a parent, I would be remis not
5 to mention the mercury concern. I trust that Howard
6 Hughes will carefully and 100 percent manage the
7 process of removing it and dealing with it in a
8 responsible manner. As they are parents too and as
9 we all have heard today, Margaret Chin has vetted
10 this process carefully.

11 In summary, I urge you to approve the zoning for
12 250 Water Street and join me in applauding Howard
13 Hughes for turning an ugly parking lot into something
14 useful and in keeping with the areas aesthetic and
15 continuing to build up our beloved neighborhood.
16 Thank you for listening and considering my testimony.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Maria. Thank you so
18 much for your testimony today. The next speaker
19 please.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Michelle Koppersmith followed
21 by Sinade Wadsworth.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

23 MICHELLE KUPPERSMITH: Hi, thank you. Hi, my
24 name is Michelle and I live in CD3 but my office is
25

1
2 in CD1 at 85 Broad Street. Prior to COVID, I passed
3 the parking lot at 250 Water Street every day and I
4 am sure this development would brighten that area
5 significantly. Other folks talked about how they
6 avoid it. I do as well, except for when I have to
7 drop my city bike off there or pick a new one up.
8 And I'm sure that it would brighten it by both
9 removing the parking lot and also all the new
10 residents that would come as the prior speakers
11 talked about how important they are.

12 I could see this patch of asphalt turning into a
13 more vibrant place, so people that would patronize
14 Seaport businesses and others and give back to the
15 district in other civic manners. I hope that you
16 will take into consideration that CD1 is a district
17 of excellent transportation, schools, access to
18 parks, and with below average levels of poverty, rent
19 burdened and community in times.

20 Our city is an ever changing place which is what
21 makes it magical and this development will be a
22 positive change for a neighborhood that is both so
23 dependent on the business district and the tourism
24 that has both been hurt by COVID. I ask that the
25 Council vote yes on this proposal because we should

1
2 not be held hostage by a few property owners
3 concerned about changes or devaluations to their
4 property. If we keep limiting buildings like this,
5 developers will continue to only build the most
6 experience housing. If Ford had a 5,000 car per year
7 quota, do you think their building escalades or
8 focus's. That's the situation we're in currently
9 because we so strongly limit the building of new
10 housing here.

11 I first spoke in support of the original proposal
12 which had much more affordable and other housing,
13 before LPC demanded a reduction on November 12, 2020.
14 That is almost one year ago. In the past year, I've
15 spent hours waiting to testify in countless meetings
16 to support one apartment building that would replace
17 a blighted parking lot.

18 Please think about who is able to do that. I
19 feel less that I can and how that might distort the
20 so-called community input that you receive in
21 proposals like this. I've been on five of these
22 meetings at least, I can't even count any more and
23 every meeting the people who are notably absent are
24 the people who potentially in the affordable housing.
25

1
2 Again, please vote yes but also, please remove
3 the parking minimum and thank you Council Member Chin
4 for your support of affordable housing in our
5 district.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
7 testimony. Next speaker.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sinade Wadsworth will be the
9 next and last speaker on this panel.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

11 SINADE WADSWORTH: Good afternoon Chair Moya
12 again and members of the Council. My name is Sinade
13 Wadsworth, Council Representative for the New York
14 City District Council of Carpenters and we strongly
15 support the Howard Hughes Corporation proposed to
16 develop a mixed use building at 250 Water Street.

17 The proposal offers a vital and timely
18 opportunity to bring affordable housing, friendship
19 opportunities and economic development to the Seaport
20 in lower Manhattan. The parking lot at 250 Water
21 Street has been an unsightly gap in the urban fabric
22 for 50 years. The building design approved by the
23 New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission is
24 respectful of the history in its urban context. And
25

1
2 it will enhance the neighborhood and the historic
3 district.

4 I urge the City Council to support the approved
5 land use actions necessary to make 250 Water Street
6 possible. Thank you so much.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
8 testimony. Was that the last speaker? Okay, seeing
9 no questions from my colleagues, the witness panel is
10 now excused and I now ask you to please call up the
11 next panel please.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
13 Jessica Lappin, Bob Ghassemieh, Niral Shah, and
14 Denise Courter. Jessica Lappin followed by Bob
15 Ghassemieh.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

17 JESSICA LAPPIN: Alright, hello Chair Moya and
18 hello Councilwoman Chin. Lovely to see you. I am
19 the President of the Downtown Alliance Jessica
20 Lappin, which manages the business improvement
21 district south of Chamber Street and I'm pleased to
22 be in support of the 250 Water Street proposal before
23 you today.

24 While the Seaport is not by legal definition
25 within our assessment area, it is a vital asset for

1
2 the neighborhood and the entire city. We believe
3 this mixed use proposal continues to be an important
4 opportunity to create jobs, to boost our local
5 economy at such a critical juncture in our city's
6 recovery. To build sorely needed affordable housing
7 in CB1.

8 New York City needs economic development now more
9 than ever and this \$850 million investment will
10 create more than 1,000 construction jobs, 1,500
11 permanent jobs, and new patrons to support our local
12 businesses and merchants, those who struggled so
13 hard.

14 And of course, during the public review process,
15 the applicant has worked hard, really hard to be
16 responsive to a breath of community concerns and
17 feedback from LPC. And in addition to being approved
18 by the CPC, the projects also endorsed by the Daily
19 News, The Post, The New York Times Editorial, our
20 Borough President Gayle Brewer, a broad coalition of
21 residents, businesses and civic associations and of
22 course Councilwoman Chin. Thank you for all of your
23 leadership on this project.

24 Furthermore, this building will be resilient and
25 sustainable in structure and our neighborhood knows

1
2 unfortunately first hand just how important it is to
3 protect the Seaport from climate change and rising
4 sea levels. So, in closing, on behalf of our board
5 of the Downtown Alliance and myself, we strongly
6 support Howard Hughes application and encourage you
7 to vote in favor of these land use actions to make
8 this development possible. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Jessica. Always
10 good to see you. Hope you are well.

11 JESSICA LAPPIN: Same.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thanks for your
13 testimony. Uhm, next speaker please.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Bob Ghassemieh will be the
15 next speaker followed by Niral Shah.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

17 BOB GHASSEMIEH: Hi, my name is Bob Ghassemieh
18 and I represent the ownership of the hotel commonly
19 known as the Mr. C Seaport located very close to 250
20 Water on the corner of Peck Slip and Front Street.
21 Our group owns the real estate in addition to
22 operating the hotel business located there. Which
23 hotel is one of the largest employers in the Seaport
24 District.

1
2 We strongly support the proposed development. Us
3 property owners are very lucky to have an
4 organization like the Howard Hughes Corporation who
5 have spent considerable resources improving the
6 Seaport community and making it a desirable place to
7 live, work and visit. Their investment and
8 developments have been carefully thought out, well
9 planned and have allowed the Seaport to be
10 competitive with other parts of Manhattan and
11 Brooklyn.

12 As we all know, the Seaport was quite dilapidated
13 just as recent as seven or eight years ago. But it
14 is significantly improved in all facets. Mainly from
15 Howard Hughes's vision and commitment to the
16 neighborhood. The 250 Water project is appropriate
17 in design and scale and it will only further improve
18 the viability and longevity, which is us, property
19 owners and businesses need to survive and compete.

20 The mixed use development will boost economic
21 development at much needed residential housing near
22 public transit, both affordable housing and market
23 rate housing and create valuable jobs the city
24 desperately needs as we try to surface from COVID.
25 Of course the museum will bring a cultural draw to

1
2 the Seaport which Howard Hughes is funding in the
3 association of development. We are one of the
4 closest large properties, businesses next to the
5 parking lot and it's an eyesore. And is need of
6 improvement. Howard Hughes is proven to be a
7 responsible developer. We're lucky to have them
8 leading the construction. We all know construction
9 can be disruptive temporarily and a few property
10 owners are impacted as we are due to the proximity
11 but this is the right decision to support the project
12 and improve our Seaport community. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
14 testimony. Next speaker please.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Niral Shah followed by Denise
16 Courter.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 NIRAL SHAH: Hi, my name is Niral Shah, I've
19 lived in New York City for almost 15 years. I work
20 in lower Manhattan and thanks for the opportunity to
21 express my strong support of this development. You
22 know this is a first for me. I've actually only been
23 actively opposed to development efforts in the city
24 before but I do feel differently about this one.
25 Maybe I feel a little closer to it because I've

1
2 actually had the opportunity to sail on one of the
3 giant schooners going out of the Seaport. To me
4 there was a fundamental important reason to support
5 this project. And that's because the city
6 desperately needs more housing, particularly
7 affordable housing and particularly in a place that's
8 closer to where people actually work. I don't see
9 this as just a project. I see it as something that
10 aims to be a place where every day people can live,
11 visit, eat, go to school. Then I hear the concerns
12 of people, especially long term residents who are
13 opposed to it and I think this is part of what the
14 city always struggles with, the preservation and
15 maybe this site has been fraught as the Seaport
16 recently.

17 There is always an effort to try to preserve the
18 past in a way that it can't really be held in place
19 and it has the risk of rendering a place upon
20 interesting and inaccessible and that doesn't really
21 further the purpose of preservation if nobody wants
22 to interact with it.

23 You know, for whatever my aesthetic judgement is
24 worth, I find the proposal to be attractive
25 architecturally, consistent with and reinforcing the

1
2 character of the neighborhood rather than displacing
3 it. You know, I've seen my own neighborhood change
4 over the past decade, often for the worse and you
5 know maybe in other times, just in ways that stir up
6 my petty resentment that it's not my neighborhood
7 anymore. But part of what's hurt north Brooklyn is
8 that rezoning met a free for all of haphazard
9 construction with no regard for the people or places
10 or appearance where buildings were put. This to me
11 is a cohesive plan, not just a set of buildings that
12 takes into account how residents and visitors
13 interact with the space. The needs or infrastructure
14 of a diverse community and even a way that climate
15 change is going to increasingly threaten lower
16 Manhattan.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

18 NIRAL SHAH: Again, it's the alternative that it
19 [INAUDIBLE 5:39:44] parking lot for yet another
20 decade. And that there is no funding to keep these
21 important sites of the past available. I think this
22 is a good project and I hope the city proves the land
23 use changes necessary for it to go forward.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
25 testimony. Next speaker please.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 282
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Denise Courter.

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

4 DENISE COURTER: Hi, this is Denise Courter and I
5 am the Founder of a Downtown Website called, FiDi
6 Families.com. I am a home owner downtown and I'm the
7 parent of two kids who attended Peck Slip and would
8 like to voice my support of the cleanup and building
9 at 250 Water Street.

10 The parking lot has been an unsightly eyesore for
11 over 50 years. The building design has been
12 restructured many times with the input by local
13 community leaders, residents and stakeholders having
14 an opportunity to help revise this building. The new
15 design is respectful of neighborhood history and
16 urban contacts. In addition to the enhancement as
17 the neighborhood, the cleanup in the proposed new
18 building will assist the many businesses in the
19 Seaport and of course so many more.

20 This neighborhood is struggling and this project
21 will bring needed new customers to local restaurants
22 and retailers. The project will make possible
23 significant funding for the struggling Seaport
24 Museum, an essential component and anchor of the
25 historic district. With this funding, the museum

1
2 will be able to restore and reopen the stores
3 buildings and plan for future expansion. The Seaport
4 Museum is a hidden gem and over the years has been a
5 great destination for my family and for my children
6 who attended the Museum Mini-mates program. Had
7 field trips there and participated in an afterschool
8 program which was supported by Howard Hughes.

9 It's important to save the Seaport Museum and
10 bring it back to life. As a 15 plus year resident
11 and someone whose witnessed the transformation of the
12 Seaport. I appreciate the community building efforts
13 of Howard Hughes and their willingness to revise the
14 proposed structure height and timelines. HHC
15 continues to support our schools. As recently as
16 last week and with sponsorship of The Taste of the
17 Seaport, which raises money for enrichment programs
18 at Peck Slip and Spruce Street. Their engagement
19 with the downtown community continues to improve the
20 school experience for over 1,000 public school
21 students. Their community efforts continue even if
22 some have been against the project.

23 The organization continues to support local
24 nonprofits such as the Fulton Street Market and
25 continues to host fun events such as community

1
2 concerts and holiday events, which all lead to
3 increased visibility of this amazing neighborhood.
4 There are many reasons to support the efforts to
5 cleanup and develop a mixed use building at 250
6 Water.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

8 DENISE COURTER: Creating a safe and healthy
9 neighborhood for all to enjoy is just one reason.
10 Thank you so much and I offer all my support to this
11 project.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
13 testimony today. Next speaker please.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I believe that was the last
15 speaker on this panel.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing no questions from
17 my colleagues here, this panel is now excused and if
18 you can call up the next panel please.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panel will include
20 William Kornblum, Adam Broadheim, Jeremy Moss, and
21 Nick Ramphal. William Kornblum first and then Adam
22 Broadheim.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: William Kornblum, we need you
25 to accept the unmute request in order to begin your -

1

WILLIAM KORNBLUM: I'm here, can you hear me?

2

3

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

4

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

5

WILLIAM KORNBLUM: Okay.

6

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: William, you can begin

7

whenever you're ready.

8

WILLIAM KORNBLUM: Native New Yorker and resident

9

of Jackson Heights Queens. For three decades, I ran

10

a Planning Research Center for the National Parks

11

Service at the Community Graduate Center. I've done

12

research from the Statue of Liberty, Battery Park,

13

Battery Park City and many other waterfront sites in

14

the city and in the region.

15

So, I am intimately familiar with the issues

16

raise here. I speak as a private citizen and have no

17

connection to the Hughes Corporation. Council

18

Members, you have my sympathy for what is clearly a

19

difficult decision - at least for some of you I

20

suppose. The stewardship of the historic district,

21

seems to be opposed to stewardship of the South

22

Street Seaport Museum. A central cultural

23

institution.

24

And without the endangered museum, the district

25

becomes a hollow shell. I fear some of the districts

1
2 lower Manhattan neighbors are guilty of loving the
3 museum to death. The proposal represents a tradeoff
4 that is urgently needed. Finally, and on a personal
5 note, my family and I sail our city's waterways on an
6 historic cat boat. A sail boat originally built in
7 1916 and restored by the late Michael Corchmal(SP?).
8 Michael was one of the first captains of the Seaports
9 beloved schooner of the pioneer. He was one of the
10 many who learned his trade as a boat builder and
11 captain originally at the Seaport.

12 The museum, with its historic ships, is a vital
13 institution of the city's waterfront. And for all
14 those whose livings are named on its waters. Please
15 give the entire Seaport a new lease on life by
16 supporting this well-crafted proposal. Thank you
17 very much.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
19 testimony. Next speaker please.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Adam Broadheim will be
21 followed by Jeremy Moss.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

23 ADAM BROADHEIM: Good afternoon. My name is Adam
24 Broadheim and I am an Historic Preservationist
25 studying at Columbia University.

1
2 I want to echo the other preservationists who
3 have spoken before me today, that this is a fabulous
4 project that will replace a parking lot with housing
5 and will build, enhance and complete the historic
6 fabric of this neighborhood.

7 During the course of this project, some folks
8 have fearmongered about the precedent that this
9 project would set for our historic districts. The
10 precedent it would set is allowing our historic
11 districts to grow and evolve to meet our needs as New
12 Yorkers. The Landmarks Preservation Commission isn't
13 going anywhere. In fact, it has already brought
14 major changes to this project to make it better fit
15 with the surrounding environment.

16 I am an Historic Preservationist. I am a
17 lifelong New Yorker. I love our historic districts
18 and I'd love to see this building rise inside a
19 historic district showing how it's not only okay but
20 appropriate for our districts to adapt and evolve.

21 To do otherwise is a disserve to the history of
22 our city. The only recommendation I have is to get
23 rid of the parking from this development. We know
24 that it's not necessary for the success of this
25 project. As we look for ways to reduce our impact on

1
2 climate change, this is an easy no brainer. The EIS
3 showed that there are 1,500 parking spots in garages
4 within a quarter mile of this development. We don't
5 need 100 more. Thank you for your time and please
6 support this project.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
8 testimony. Next speaker please.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jeremy Moss who will followed
10 by Nick Ramphal.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts.

12 JEREMY MOSS: Thank you. Good afternoon Council
13 Member Chin and Chair Moya and the other Committee
14 Members. Uh, thanks for the opportunity to testify.
15 My name is Jeremy Moss, I am here in several
16 capacities. Uhm, I am first and foremost a long time
17 owner at 324 Pearl Street. A 50 unit condo that's
18 just a block away from the site of 250 Water Street.
19 I also work as an Executive Vice President of Office
20 Leasing for Silverstein Properties.

21 So, I've been involved with repopulating the
22 buildings at the World Trade Center since after 911.
23 So, I have a long experience in lower Manhattan and
24 I'm a huge advocate for its long term sustainability
25 and lastly a lifelong New Yorker.

1
2 I just want to make three points today. First of
3 all, the project is as I see it, respectful of the
4 historic context of the district, of the scale and
5 the architectural language. Including my building at
6 324 Pearl Street. I know many of my fellow residents
7 share that view.

8 Secondly, I think we're all very excited at the
9 prospect of having the streetscape restored and
10 having something more than a parking lot as our
11 neighbor. And third, it's going to bring not only
12 affordable housing and jobs but is clearly the
13 lynchpin to the long term viability of the museum.
14 And as a New Yorker, you know I can definitely say,
15 there really is no conversation about a historic
16 district without the museum.

17 So, with that, I thank you for the time and
18 encourage you to vote in favor of the land use
19 actions necessary to make 250 Water Street possible.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Jeremy.
21 Thank you for your testimony.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Nick Ramphal will be the next
23 and last speaker on this panel.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.
25

1
2 NICK RAMPHAL: Thank you all. My name is Nick
3 Ramphal and I wish to express my unreserved support
4 for the 250 Water Street redevelopment. I have a
5 very close connection to the project by virtue of
6 having previously lived in lower Manhattan for many
7 years. The fact that I currently work downtown and
8 having strong ties to many of the folks at Howard
9 Hughes who have worked tirelessly and with the best
10 of intentions to make this project a reality.

11 New York City is emerging from the pandemic,
12 battered though not defeated. It is in deep need of
13 economic development. The bottom line of this
14 project cannot be argued with. It will generate
15 substantial investment in the Seaport of some \$850
16 million. Creating 1,600 construction jobs and over
17 1,700 permanent jobs in the commercial retain and
18 nonprofit sectors.

19 From my personal experience, I know that HHC and
20 his team are good neighbors. They are measured,
21 reasonable and considerate and support a broad range
22 of local civic groups as was evident from their
23 sterling efforts during the pandemic. Over the past
24 decade, HHC has invested and committed \$850 million
25 in projects at the Seaport.

1
2 That area of lower Manhattan is far more inviting
3 for families and aesthetically pleasing due in large
4 part to HHC's efforts. The historic district will be
5 completed for the first time with the development of
6 this site. It has been nothing more than an
7 undeveloped surface lot for 50 years. In the final
8 analysis and having young children myself, I
9 appreciate its use as a playground for some but I am
10 hard pressed when measuring that against all those
11 families that will be helped in meaningful ways and
12 lives that will be changed for the better by the
13 economic and social benefits that will flow from this
14 development. Thank you for your time and allowing me
15 to testify.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
17 testimony. That being the last speaker and seeing no
18 questions for this panel, the witness panel is now
19 excused and if you can call up the next panel please.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
21 Stacey Shub, Stacey Shub.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

23 STACEY SHUB: Hi, my testimony is not a well-
24 crafted script loaded with buzz words, as I don't
25 work for the museum, nor HHC. I don't own a business

1
2 and I'm not on the Board of any charity that they
3 support, nor do I hope to do business with HHC in the
4 future. I'm just a local resident whose lived at
5 South Bridge Towers for over 25 years and I am
6 speaking from my heart. No, I do not have a view
7 from my apartment, so if I believe this project will
8 reinvigorate the neighborhood, then I am fighting
9 against my own financial self-interest since this
10 property value should go up.

11 So, why do I fight it? Well first, it doesn't
12 fit within the historic district and I challenge any
13 member of this Council to look at the model. Showing
14 it's easily five times the height of the neighboring
15 historic 18th and 19th Century buildings. Tell me
16 with a straight face that it fits, really. If you
17 haven't seen it, you can go to the website and see it
18 for yourself. It's enormous and it will change the
19 character of the Seaport forever and I don't mean in
20 a good way.

21 So, since it can't win approval on its own
22 merits, that's why there are all these red herrings
23 and hyperbole that's thrown into the mix. The
24 parking lot, the museum, affordable housing, and
25 economic development are all important. The parking

1
2 lot though, as an eyesore, we all agree we want
3 something better than the disgusting parking lot that
4 HHC runs. But we can do better than this proposal.
5 The museum, we all want the museum to survive but the
6 museum relying on a promise. A \$50 million endowment
7 that may never materialize and even if it did, wasn't
8 it just our money gained for the transfer of taxpayer
9 owned air rights? Think of it as regifting. We give
10 the money to HHC and they give it to the museum,
11 maybe.

12 Why not just sell the air rights to the highest
13 bidder without it having to go through a developer?
14 And let me share this as a previous executive
15 director of a 501C3 myself. My number one
16 responsibility was fund raising. I'm amazed at the
17 lack of fund raising success. Everyone loves a
18 museum but nobody is willing to give money. The \$50
19 million going to the museum kind of feels like a
20 broker person winning the lottery.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Stacey. Thank you
22 for your testimony today. If you can, please call up
23 the next speaker.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
25 speaker on this panel.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing no questions for
3 this panel, the witness panel is now excused and if
4 you can call up the next panel please.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
6 Burchenal Green, Aislinn McGuire, Harrison Grinnan.
7 Burchenal Green, pardon me, to speak first.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

9 BURCHENAL GREEN: Well, good afternoon. My name
10 is Burchenal Green and I am the President and
11 Executive Director of the National Maritime
12 Historical Society.

13 It's a nonprofit founded in 1963 to raise
14 awareness of our nations maritime heritage and how
15 our sea fairy roots continue to shape the future.
16 The Society is the national voice of our maritime
17 heritage. We have a global presence; a publication
18 of sea history is the preeminent journal in the
19 field. We host national conferences. Our website is
20 the unparalleled go to for maritime heritage resources.
21 Our advocacy efforts bring funding to the heritage.
22 I've introduced who we are, so you will understand
23 how we know, how significant the South Street Seaport
24 Museum is to the city and our country.

1
2 I am testifying today to support the
3 appropriateness of this proposed project. As it will
4 ensure the South Street Seaport Museums survival. An
5 unparallel contribution to New York's cultural
6 landscape and a decades long chronicler of the
7 nations maritime history.

8 New York became the prominent port in America and
9 that built New York City and that built the nation.
10 New York City needs to tell that story. The museums
11 pain staking stewardship of several historic
12 buildings in the district including the Bound Quinn
13 Shop is essential to the Seaports vitality and
14 preservation.

15 This historic district simply would not be what
16 it is today without the museum. Its closure would
17 put several historic buildings without the district
18 at risk. Allowing the closure of the Seaport Museum
19 would be giving our consent to Elishia of our nations
20 historic beginnings and grow. It would mean the
21 destruction of our historic district as we know it.

22 Frankly, it would put New York City to shame.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.
24
25

1
2 BURCHENAL GREEN: Only world class city with no
3 maritime museum. Even Paris, hardly a port city,
4 hosts an amazing maritime museum.

5 In closure, the National Maritime Historical
6 Society endorses this wise and appropriate investment
7 in historical preservation.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you so much for your
9 testimony today. Thank you. Thank you. Next
10 speaker please.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Aislinn McGuire will be the
12 next speaker followed by Harrison Grinnan.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

14 AISLINN MCGUIRE: Hi, can you hear me?

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

16 AISLINN MCGUIRE: Great, thank you. My name is
17 Aislinn McGuire, I am General Counsel to the
18 Contractors Association of Greater New York. It is a
19 multi-employer association of construction managers
20 and general contractors.

21 I am also a New York City resident though in
22 Community District 7, which has also seen a
23 significant amount of construction around Columbia
24 University where I live. So, I understand the impact
25 construction can have on a neighborhood. I've also

1
2 personally experienced that the disruption that it
3 causes is temporary. All the benefits that it
4 creates are not.

5 This is a critical and timely project.

6 Construction is critical to the revitalization of New
7 York City. But the Construction stall occasioned by
8 the pandemic has had a significant impact on our
9 economy and on our construction jobs. As you've
10 heard from other people testifying, this project will
11 provide some 1,600 construction jobs. What comes
12 with that, care use and contribution to businesses
13 all around the construction site, is important to
14 revitalizing the economy.

15 A recent study by the Building Trade Employers
16 Association showed each job on a construction site
17 results in a multiplier of 1.32 jobs and every dollar
18 spent on a construction site results in 1.32 spend in
19 the city. This is vitally needed money and an
20 economic boost for the city at a critical time.

21 In addition, as you've heard, the construction
22 industry is important because it provides well-paying
23 jobs to people without an advance degree. It is a
24 path to the middle class, which is critically
25 important as people try to come back from the

1
2 problems of the pandemic has caused for them
3 personally and for the city. I know that uhm, Howard
4 Hughes Corporation is a responsible builder and will
5 hire a responsible construction manager to oversee
6 the project. That it will be safe and adhere to all
7 protocols and I encourage and support the project.
8 Thank you for your time.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
10 testimony. Next speaker please.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Harrison Grinnan.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

13 HARRISON GRINNAN: Hello, my name is Harrison
14 Grinnan, I am a resident of Council Member Levin's
15 District in Brooklyn. I'd like to testify in support
16 of this project. Actually, I've never been to the
17 Seaport Museum although after all I've heard about it
18 today, I think I might have to go. It sounds great.

19 My main support of this project comes from the
20 homes that are part of it. I believe it's 280 homes
21 now after the downsizing in the LPC process and 80
22 affordable. Those 80 affordable homes, I think
23 everyone can agree New York needs more affordable
24 homes, especially at such a deep AMI level at 40
25 percent. That's really remarkable. Rich

1
2 neighborhoods like this are exactly where we're
3 supposed to use MIH because the market rate rents are
4 able to support such a great level of amenity for the
5 community. Both through the Seaport Museum, as well
6 as the affordable housing. But I'd like to also talk
7 about those 200 market rate homes.

8 Every additional market rate home we build in a
9 neighborhood like the Seaport, which is directly next
10 to the financial district, directly reduces
11 displacement out in Brooklyn, in Queens and in
12 norther portion of Manhattan and the Bronx. As an
13 example, I know many people who have high paying jobs
14 who live in lower Manhattan and then other people
15 with slightly lower paying jobs who aren't quite able
16 to afford it, so they live in Prospect Heights. They
17 live in Sunset Park. They live in all these
18 neighborhoods where people who lived there for
19 decades are being pushed out.

20 And it's not like they want to push people out.
21 You know, no one chooses uh, when they are moving to
22 the city like they dream of living in Sunset Park,
23 they dream of Manhattan. I really like Brooklyn but
24 not everyone dreams of that. So, I think that
25 creating more homes so that people can actually live

1
2 where the market rates are telling us they want to
3 live, that helps to reduce displacement, not only
4 locally but also throughout the city and to create
5 kind of a more fair and affordable city for everyone

6 So, I am a strong supporter of this project. I
7 think that it's a — you know, it's going in on a
8 parking lot. I mean next to a bunch of towers that
9 already taller than the one that is going in. This
10 is a pretty easy call for me. I'm strongly in
11 support. Thank you for your time.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
13 testimony. Next speaker please.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Steven Marmon. Steven
16 Marmon. Steven Marmon, if you can hear me, we need
17 you to accept the unmute request in order to begin
18 your testimony. If you are on a telephone, you
19 should unmute by pressing star six. Steven Marmon,
20 if you can hear me, we need you to accept the unmute
21 request in order to begin your testimony.

22 Alright, I think we're having some technical
23 difficulties. Chair, that was the last speaker on
24 this panel.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Seeing no questions for
3 this panel, the witness panel is now excused.
4 Counsel, can you please call up the next panel?

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any remaining
6 participants who wish to testify on the 250 Water
7 Street proposal, please press the raise hand button
8 now. You may do that on a telephone by pressing star
9 nine. Once again, if you are here in this meeting
10 and you have not already testified and you wish to
11 testify on the 250 Water Street proposal, please use
12 the raise hand button and you can do that on a
13 telephone by pressing star nine.

14 Okay, we have a couple of additional speakers
15 Chair. First speaker will be Donald Hong who will be
16 followed by Howard Wizenfeld. Donald Hong.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

18 DONALD HONG: Am I unmuted yet? Can you hear me?

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you. We can hear
20 you.

21 DONALD HONG: Alright, I'm Don Hong UA3 and we do
22 support this project. We fee somewhere around 1,400
23 people a week in lower Manhattan and as many as 7,000
24 per week in New York City.
25

1
2 We've given out over 6 million masks during the
3 summer and we daily trucks of PPE going out. Now
4 with hard coming money from the city, uh, and we
5 thank Margaret Chin for introducing us to Howard
6 Hughes and many other corporations who have made it
7 possible for us to function and deliver all these
8 goods to New York City and food corporations have
9 been able to respond.

10 Now, I live in Chelsea in Hell's Kitchen even
11 though I grew up in lower Manhattan and Hudson Yards,
12 I saw them develop. And yes, I lost the entire
13 beautiful view of uh, Hudson River disappear before
14 me but so did the drug trafficking and the sex
15 trafficking and the prostitution disappeared as well.

16 It is a much safer and a much more thriving area.
17 We have businesses and restaurants that are coming
18 back after COVID and were thriving before. Howard
19 Hughes, South Seaport of eight years of desolation
20 has now brought back South Seaport. And it's not
21 just important to South Street Seaport. It's also
22 important to Chinatown and lower Manhattan. All of
23 lower Manhattan because with housing coming in, both
24 low income and affordable, and market rate rentals,
25 that's people who are going to spend money in our

1
2 neighborhoods. We need this type of project. We
3 need development.

4 The economic development and this becoming a
5 destination for lower Manhattan will help us all.
6 So, I approve and I believe this project will be a
7 great contribution. Not just the South Street
8 Seaport but all of lower Manhattan. And I am a born
9 and raised lower Manhattan boy. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Next speaker
11 please.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Howard Wizenfeld who will be
13 followed by Stephen Marmon.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

15 HOWARD WIZENFELD: Hi, my name is Howard
16 Wizenfeld and I've been working in lower Manhattan
17 now for over a decade and I strongly support the
18 Howard Hughes proposal to develop a mixed use
19 facility at 250 Water Street. I think it will spur
20 economic development. It will add good jobs and
21 needed jobs as we're coming out of the pandemic and
22 create housing. And I think from everything we've
23 talked about today, I think that's one of the most
24 important things now here in lower Manhattan and in
25 Manhattan in general is after the pandemic, getting

1
2 back to affordable housing. Uhm, right now that it's
3 urgently needed.

4 We've heard today from - that the building
5 design, which we heard today from the New York
6 Landmarks Preservation Commission, that this building
7 is appropriate and it has been approved. It is
8 respectful of the history of the waterfront and it's
9 used in the urban context and I believe it will help
10 uhm, the historic district grow.

11 Now, as I said, in New York City, there is an
12 urgent need for housing and especially for affordable
13 housing. We've talked about this but as somebody
14 that's you know been working here for ten years,
15 there is census data that shows that New York City
16 has grown by over 600,000 people around the past ten
17 years. You can see it when you walk around, but in
18 that same time, the number of housing obviously has
19 not grown by any stretch of that imagination in the
20 same way. It's closer to like 200,000 units.

21 So, I think that this project is appropriate and
22 can grow the area in the way it needs to grow and can
23 help the city grow. Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Stephen Marmon will be the
25 next speaker. Stephen Marmon.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

STEPHEN MARMON: Can you hear me?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

STEPHEN MARMON: Good. My name is Stephen J. Marmon. I live just one block north of the proposed project from 1981 to 1986 and I strongly support the revised plan for 250 Water. I moved to 324 Pearl Street to begin work as an investment banker for Merrill Lynch in the summer of 1981 so I could walk to work, rather than take the daily subway rides I had previously used while living on the upper east side. That was two years before the opening of most of the South Street Seaport campus.

The area back then was a desolate site, except late at night and very early in the morning when people in trucks flooded the streets to handle the tons of fish at the Fulton Fish Market. But for a few restaurants like the late Bridge Café, there was little in the ways of stores and services. And if one needed anything than a hike north to Chinatown or West Broadway was required.

With the opening of the Seaport complex in late July 1983, there suddenly was a flood of shops and bars and restaurants. When I walked home late at

1
2 night from One Liberty Plaza, the streets were packed
3 with other New Yorkers and tourists, enjoying the
4 historic and unique attractions of the Seaport and
5 Pier 17.

6 Almost every day I walked by that empty parking
7 lot at 250 Water Street and wondered what and when
8 something would rise at that location. Now, we have
9 a plan to residential buildings that will fit into
10 the neighborhood, providing housing for hundreds of
11 new residents. Many of them will like me, so many
12 years ago, be those sneaking away to walk to work. I
13 saw the dramatic change in the neighborhood after the
14 opening of the Seaport Complex. As one who is a
15 campaign and city hall aid to Mariette Cotch, another
16 bridge café fan. I well know the critical importance
17 of affordable housing, lively streets and available
18 shops and restaurants throughout the community.

19 These buildings are not only appropriate -

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Stephen, if you can just wrap
22 it up. We ran out of time already.

23 STEPHEN MARMON: Okay. They provide the funding
24 needed to keep the Seaport open. The Seaport needs
25 to become an exciting and lively part of Manhattan,

1
2 like it was uhm, today and I urge you to approve the
3 proposal for 250 Water Street.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Stephen.
5 Thank you for your testimony today. Uh, the next
6 speaker please.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will hear from Nissi
8 Eber(SP?). Nissi Eber.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clock is ready.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Did we lose Nissi?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Just checking. It appears
12 that we have lost Nissi. Chair, I'm just going to
13 check with our staff. Just please stand by for one
14 moment. Sorry Chair, we do have one additional
15 registration under the name Lisa Wong. Lisa Wong, if
16 you can hear me, uh, you are being called to testify
17 after having registered and if you can hear me, we
18 ask that you please raise your hand, which you can do
19 on the telephone by pressing star nine.

20 Uh, alright Chair, it appears that we do not have
21 Lisa Wong and with that, I see no other members of
22 the public who wish to testify on this item.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no members
24 of the public who wish to testify on LU's Number 906,
25

1
2 907 for the 250 Water Street Proposal, the public
3 hearing is now closed and the items are laid over.

4 That concludes today's business and I remind the
5 viewing public that for anyone wishing to submit
6 written testimony for items that were heard today,
7 please send it by email to
8 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And I would like
9 to thank -

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair?

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Oh, I'm so sorry. I
12 apologize.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Chin has a
14 hand up.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yes, absolutely.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Oh, oh, I just wanted to
17 say thank you to Council Member Moya for this long
18 hearing again right. And I wanted to thank everyone
19 who came to testify. Whether you are pro or against,
20 mean, there has been a lot of work on this and I just
21 wanted to you know reassure that we still got work to
22 do, especially on the funding mechanism for the
23 Seaport Museum. We're going to get that done before
24 we come back to the Council vote. And I also want to
25 thank the Committee Staff and our Land Use Staff and

1
2 the Sergeants and thank you for supporting us on this
3 long hearing. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council Member.

5 Uhm, and with that, I would like to thank the members
6 of the public, my colleagues, the Subcommittee
7 Council, Land Use and Counsel Staff and the Sergeant
8 at Arms for participating in today's meeting. And I
9 would like to close by wishing my mom a very happy
10 birthday. I know she's watching, so ma [SPEAKING IN
11 SPANISH 6:14:30]. And with that, this meeting is now
12 adjourned. Thank you and have a wonderful day.

13 [GAVEL]

14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 25, 2021