

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

CHARTER MEETING

----- X

January 8, 2020
Start: 12:20 p.m.
Recess: 12:52 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Robert Holden
Ben Kallos

Andy King
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jimmy Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 STATED MEETING

4

2 JOE JOE GIGOLO: Mic check, mic check,
3 one, two, one two. Today is January 8, 2020, and it
4 is being recorded by Joe Joe Gigolo.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: January 8, 2010,
6 welcome back. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo.
7 Please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I pledge
10 allegiance to the flag of the United States of
11 America, and to the republic for which it stands, one
12 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and
13 justice for all. Roll call.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron. Borelli.
21 Brannan.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

1 STATED MEETING

5

2

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

3

COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

5

COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy. Deutsch. Diaz.

6

Dromm.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene. Gibson. Gjonaj.

11

Grodenschik.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes.

13

COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

15

COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos. King.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

17

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

19

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

21

COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman. Lander. Levin.

22

Levine.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

24

COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.

1 STATED MEETING

6

2

COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

4

COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Moya. Perkins. Powers.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Present.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Presente.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

12

COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

14

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

16

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez. Lancman.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

18

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Present.

20

COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal. Salamanca.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

22

COUNCIL CLERK: Torres.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

24

COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger. Ulrich.

25

Vallone.

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer. Yeger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here. Matteo.

5 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Here.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We have a quorum
11 and we will now have today's invocation, which will
12 be delivered by the Reverend M. Zidde Hamatheite,
13 spiritual leader of Wayside Baptist Church, located
14 at 1740 Broadway in Brooklyn.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

16 REVEREND HAMATHEITE: Let us bow our
17 heads or however we do to talk to God. Good morning,
18 God. We thank you for this opportunity, for giving
19 us breath in our bodies, you allowed us to see this
20 day, you brought us into a day we've never seen and
21 we'll never see again. And, God, in this special
22 occasion, in this privilege to be able to pray for
23 our City Council, in the times of trouble, trials,
24 and turmoil that has faced and plagued our country,
25 our nation, and our city, through it all I pray that

2 you give strength, clarity of mind, clarity of site,
3 for we are in year 2020, that we be able the see
4 clearer, hear clearer, think clearer, understand
5 better, through prejudicialness and hatred and
6 bigotry and strange cares and non-caring issues in
7 our society, that this council will be balanced to
8 understand that they are assigned, they are called,
9 they are voted in to keep the city in a balanced
10 situation. God, we pray that you have your way in
11 their lives. Give them peace, serenity, and power in
12 times like these. In the name I know, Jesus' name,
13 amen.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
15 much, Reverend Hamatheite. I'd now like to ask
16 Council Member Espinal to spread the invocation on
17 the record.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you, Madam
19 Majority Leader. I just want to note that the
20 Reverend is actually one of God's chosen people as he
21 was born in Brooklyn, New York, where he's been all
22 his life. He studied at Long Island University and
23 received his master's degree from Fordham University
24 in 2017. As an advocate for change and awareness,
25 Reverend Hamatheite's concern for the community is

2 evident, especially in his work with the youth in
3 Brooklyn. After working in the department of
4 education for several years and seeing the need of
5 young people, Reverend developed a program entitled
6 Move, M-O-V-E, Men of Valor Empowered, to teach and
7 mentor young men in the community. Since arriving at
8 Wayside Baptist Church in 2010, the pastor
9 established the Wayside Baptist Church Bible
10 Institute and is honored to sit on the leadership
11 council for Habitats for Humanity as well as a board
12 member for the Conference of National Black Churches.
13 Thank you, Madam Majority Leader. I would like to
14 thank the pastor for being here today and for all the
15 work you do for your congregants and our community in
16 District 37, and I make a motion that this invocation
17 be spread in full upon the record.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
19 much, Council Member Espinal, and Council Member
20 Alicka Ampry-Samuel would also like to join in with
21 you in spreading with the invocation.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Of course I
23 have to say a little something about my pastor,
24 Pastor Hamatheite, who has been a spiritual leader
25 and advisor and everything else in my life for many

2 years, and although Wayside Baptist Church is just
3 across the street from my district on Rockaway
4 Avenue, it is my home and the home of my family, and
5 so I just want to thank you for everything you've
6 done for me and the community and the city at large,
7 and so I just wanted to lend my voice and emotion
8 today. Thank you so much.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
10 Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel. And we thank
11 Reverend Hamatheite today for your leadership and
12 your New Year's Eve prayer. And we will now call on
13 Council Member Adrienne Adams for the adoption of the
14 minutes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Madam Majority
16 Leader, I move to spread the invoke in full upon
17 the record.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Message and
19 papers from the mayor.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Oh, I'm sorry.
22 I'm sorry, I got ahead of myself.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Madam Majority
24 Leader, I move that the minutes of the Stated Meeting
25 of November 26, 2019, be adopted as printed.

1 STATED MEETING

11

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
3 much, Council Member Adams. We will now have
4 messages and papers from the mayor.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Communication
7 from city, county, and borough offices.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Petitions and
10 communications.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Land use callups.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We
15 will now have communication from Speaker Corey
16 Johnson.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
18 Majority Leader, good afternoon, Happy New Year to
19 everyone for this charter meeting of the City
20 Council, our first Stated Meeting of the year. Last
21 week marked the beginning of my third year as Speaker
22 of the City Council and I am proud of what we have
23 accomplished together and what we have done to make
24 the lives of every New Yorker better. We still have
25 a tremendous amount of work ahead of us, but together

2 we'll keep fighting to make sure that our city works
3 for everyone. Sadly, we started off this year, our
4 city started off this year, our state started off
5 this year by facing a rash of anti-Semitic attacks
6 across this city and state. These intolerable acts
7 are an attack against our values and everything we
8 hold dear. This past Sunday I joined many of and
9 many other leaders and tens of thousands of New
10 Yorkers in a march of solidarity with the Jewish
11 community and Jewish New Yorkers, and we marched
12 across the Brooklyn Bridge. We must never be silent
13 when it comes to anti-Semitic attacks or behavior.
14 And I as well as members of this body remain united
15 with our Jewish sisters and brothers and condemn
16 these unacceptable acts of hate. We will not and
17 cannot continue to let them happen. I also want to
18 take a few moments to acknowledge a few losses that
19 our city has faced recently. The FDNY is mourning a
20 great loss. Their chief historian, Jonathan Jack
21 Lurch, recently passed away at 88 years old on
22 December 17. He was the department historian for
23 more than 50 years and knew more about the history of
24 New York's bravest than almost anyone. My prayers
25 are with the family of Jack and the women and men of

2 the fire department. During each Stated we
3 acknowledge the lives of those who have died from
4 9/11-related illnesses. The NYPD lost Sergeant Scott
5 Johnston to 9/11-related melanoma on December 19.
6 Sergeant Johnston was an active sergeant and he served
7 the department for over 20 years. He was only 50
8 years old. The New York State Police also lost a
9 member of their department. Investigator Ryan
10 Fortini died of 9/11-related cancer on New Year's
11 Day. He was 42 years old. My prayers are with the
12 families of Sergeant Johnston and Investigator
13 Fortini, and both the NYPD, the FDNY, and New York
14 State Police. Please stand for a moment of silence
15 as we remember Chief Historian Lurch, Sergeant Scott
16 Johnston, and Investigator Ryan Fortini.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise. [moment of
18 silence]

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. The council
20 is also sadly losing a vital member of our team this
21 week. Julie Kim, the executive director of the
22 council's Women Caucus, Women's Caucus, is leaving us
23 to become the Queensborough director for the US
24 Census, which is such an important position. So even
25 though we are losing her, she is doing something

2 incredibly vital and important for our great city.

3 Julie became the caucus's first executive director in

4 2018 and has done amazing, amazing work in her role,

5 working with the cochairs of the Women's Caucus,

6 Carlina Rivera and Margaret Chin, to help lead our

7 city on gender equity. We will miss you, Julie, and

8 we wish you best in all your endeavors, and I want to

9 give her a big round of applause, where is she? Is

10 Julie here? [applause] Thank you, Julie. And over

11 the past few days we have watched the island of

12 Puerto Rico suffered a devastating earthquake and

13 damaging aftershocks. Recovery will be difficult and

14 as with Hurricane Maria we as a city need to make

15 sure that Puerto Rico gets the federal resources

16 needed to make repairs. I know that Council Member

17 Salamanca and other members yesterday sent a letter

18 to the mayor asking that our city help the island at

19 this difficult time and the island remains in an

20 official state of emergency, and our thoughts are

21 with our brothers and sisters in New York's sixth

22 borough. So Happy New Year. Thank you, Madam

23 Majority Leader. And I look forward to working with

24 you all in this year of 2020. Thank you very much.

25

1 STATED MEETING

15

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
3 much, Speaker Corey Johnson. We will now move into
4 discussion of general orders. Seeing none, report of
5 special committees.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Reports of
8 standing committees.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: General order
11 calendar.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing
13 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
15 orders. And at this time I am asking for a roll call
16 vote on the general order calendar, and just so folks
17 know the only thing on the general order calendar
18 today is the Commissioner of Deeds. So I ask for a
19 roll call vote on that.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron. Borelli.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy. Deutsch. Diaz.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye.
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson. Gjonaj.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

1 STATED MEETING

17

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: King.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: I vote aye. I also want
8 to wish all my colleagues a happy, healthy, and
9 prosperous New Year.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye, and I
12 also want to wish everybody a happy, health New Year.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin. Levine.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Feliz anno
23 nuovo. I vote aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins. Powers.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal. Salamanca.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich. Vallone.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer. Yeger.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.
25 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Aye.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All items on
7 today's general order calendar are adopted by a vote
8 of 39 in the affirmative, zero negative, and zero
9 abstentions. Introduction and reading of bills.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are referred
11 to committee as indicated on the agenda.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
13 Speaker Johnson. Thank you. There aren't any
14 resolutions on today's calender, so we will now move
15 into general discussion. And we will begin with
16 Council Member Yeger.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam
18 President. I rise first to thank Mr. Speaker for his
19 words earlier. Over the last several days he has in
20 very real ways reached out to Jewish community
21 leadership in the city to try to find pathways
22 forward for the necessary security measures that have
23 unfortunately become abundantly clear are needed in
24 the Jewish communities in New York. I appreciate the
25 thousands of New Yorkers and those who came from

2 elsewhere to stand tall this Sunday against anti-
3 Semitism. I also think how we got to here should be
4 discussed. For far too long too many who hold public
5 office and those who portend themselves to be members
6 of the media have tinkered at the fringes of anti-
7 Semitism. You market an us versus them message
8 against Orthodox Jews. You did this. When you
9 deliberately paint a portrait of Orthodox Jews as
10 backwards members of society who don't vote how you
11 like, don't do what you want, don't educate our
12 children how you wish, you did this. Those who took
13 the time over Hanukah to show up near a menorah but
14 play divide-and-conquer politics with the lives of
15 Orthodox Jews, you did this. When an unprecedented
16 verbal pogrom was unleashed in this chamber earlier
17 this year for no purpose other than dividing New
18 Yorkers and checking a box for your anti-Semitic
19 friends, you did this. Those who spent Sunday posing
20 for pictures with Jews, but spend the other 364 days
21 of the year festering hate against my community, you
22 did this. When you hold signs that claim you stand
23 with Hasidic Jews, but then you go stand with anti-
24 Semites, you did this. I won't be silent about who's
25 responsible. The notion that a lack of tolerance is

2 at issue, as if Orthodox Jews are so heinous that our
3 presence in society is something to be tolerated is
4 grotesques. We have the right to live in our city
5 like anyone else. We have the right to go about our
6 day without being assaulted. We're not doing this to
7 anyone. You're doing this to us. You attack our
8 yeshivas regularly, repeatedly, with hatred. But
9 whenever has anyone seen a group of yeshiva students
10 run down a street and smack someone in the head? Why
11 is that never discussed? How we raise our children
12 to be honorable, intellectual, decent members of
13 society, how we are kind to one another...

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,
15 Council Member Yeger, Madam Majority Leader, I want
16 to allow Council Member Yeger to have time to finish
17 his remarks.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
19 Speaker. It's almost timed exactly. I appreciate
20 it. You paint us all with a scarlet letter of
21 derision. You did this to us. Those of you who did
22 this know who you are and you've done its, and it's
23 your responsibility to stop it, and I'm asking you
24 all not just to show up one day a year and take a
25 couple of pictures, but do this for the other 364

2 days that you stand up and you hurt our community
3 with your words, with your acts, with divide-and-
4 conquer politics, with the things that are not
5 necessary in this city just because you don't like
6 how think or you don't like how we dress or you don't
7 like how we educate our children. Leave us alone and
8 let us be part of this city without you festering
9 hate on us. Thank you very much, Madam President.
10 Mr. Speaker, thank you very much for your indulgence.
11 I appreciate.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Council Member
13 Grodenchik.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,
15 Majority Leader Cumbo, and thank you, Mr. Speaker,
16 for your words before. They are well-meant and well
17 received by me and millions of others who live in
18 this city. 116 years ago my grandfather, Max
19 Grodenchik, Mordechai Aaron Ben Issen, left
20 [inaudible] tsarist Russian to find a new way of life
21 here in New York City. His story is not unique.
22 It's shared by millions of New Yorkers and countless
23 millions of people like him and their descendents
24 across our nation. One week from today we will
25 celebrate and remember Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.,

2 who would have been 91 next week. Dr. King wrote and
3 spoke we must learn to live together as brothers or
4 perish together as fools. I speak today to thank my
5 colleagues in this chamber who are not Jewish
6 especially, who have spoken out recently against the
7 torrent of anti-Semitism that has stained our great
8 city in recent weeks and months. Our history as
9 human beings is littered with genocide. Armenia, the
10 Holocaust, Rwanda, the Rape of Nanchang, the
11 brutality of Stalin, the killing fields of Cambodia,
12 the middle passage of millions of Africans, and the
13 brutality that we visited on Native Americans and
14 other aboriginal peoples around the world. It must
15 stop. And I didn't want to let this session pass
16 without speaking my mind. The Jewish community in
17 New York City is not going away. It has been here
18 for over 350 years. It has contributed greatly, not
19 only to the city but to the world at large. The
20 polio vaccine, the internet, half invented by Dr.
21 Robert Kahn from Flushing. For God's sakes we even
22 gave you Scarlet Johansson. So I ask today that all
23 people of good will come together, not just today,
24 not just this week, and not just this month, but each
25 and every day to build a better and more just

2 society. I thank you for indulging me, Mr. Speaker
3 and Madam Majority Leader. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and
5 I'll just close with, as you said so eloquent, the
6 words of Dr. Martin Luther King, injustice anywhere
7 is a threat to justice everywhere, and we must
8 recognize that we have to stand up with each other
9 against all forms of hate, even if leadership favors
10 one over the other. Injustice anywhere is a threat
11 to justice everywhere, and we have to unite in order
12 to end hatred all throughout this country. And so I
13 was so glad that our communities have continued to
14 unite. But it's important that we recognize that we
15 cannot tolerate hate speech about any particular
16 group of individuals anywhere in this country. And
17 so I will call on Council Member Steve Levin to close
18 us out.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
20 Majority Leader. First, I want to vote aye on all
21 general order items, as well. But I did want to take
22 the opportunity here as well. I represent
23 Williamsburg in Brooklyn, which is a very diverse
24 community. There's Hasidic people, families. There
25 are African American families. There are Latino

2 families. And during this recent increase in anti-
3 Semitic attacks there was one, there was one report
4 that was in my district and it was at a NYCHA
5 development that is about a third Hasidic, a third
6 Latino, a third African American, and there was a
7 report that two children were punched in the
8 elevator. Two Hasidic children were punched. And
9 when I heard that my heart sank, because I thought,
10 you know, this is a development, everybody's lived
11 together for a couple of generations at this point,
12 and there's very rarely incidents of violence in
13 these developments, very rarely, and it's almost, you
14 know, a matter of course. You live next door to
15 people that don't look like you. And so my heart
16 sank. A couple days later I heard that that case
17 actually was not, it did not happen. It was a false
18 report. The kids were scared when a bunch of older
19 kids entered the elevator and they, and they said
20 that they were hit, but they actually weren't. And,
21 you know, I was tremendously relieved because that
22 comported the reality, the truth, comported with,
23 with the truth that I know of that development, and
24 those developments, which is that when people live
25 together in close quarters and experience this city

2 and experience life as neighbors, that is the
3 antidote to hate. The antidote to hate is accepting
4 one another for your differences and in growing up
5 next door to one another. That's, that's the
6 antidote to hate, and so I feel very firmly that
7 those of us in this room and the principals and the
8 teachers in our schools and every parent and every
9 civic leader out there in New York City has a
10 responsibility to bring our children together. Bring
11 our children together. Let them get to know one
12 another as human beings, and, you know, we are, we're
13 not miracle workers and we can't drive hate out of
14 somebody's heart, particularly an adult who has come
15 by that hatred and is unwilling to let it go. But we
16 can and we must make sure that our children don't
17 hate, because it's not just about today. It's about
18 the world that we pass on to our kids and our
19 grandkids. We have to deal with the hatred out
20 there today. But the most important thing that we
21 can do is teach our children to love one another.
22 Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.
24 Council Member Treyger, followed by Council Member
25 Koslowitz.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,
3 before the council members go I want to ask unanimous
4 consent that Council Members Levin and Cornegy and
5 anyone else who may have come in after we had closed
6 out before, I want to ask unanimous consent that they
7 are able to be marked present today and to vote on
8 the general order calendar. Is there any opposition
9 to that from any members? So with unanimous consent
10 I ask that Council Members Cornegy and Levin be able
11 to vote on the general order calendar.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye on
14 all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Were there any other
18 members?

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Hold on. Let's,
21 Council Member Rodriguez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: That's everyone?
24 Great. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All items on
3 today's general order calendar are adopted by a vote
4 of 42 in the affirmative, zero negative, and zero
5 abstentions. We will now continue with Council
6 Member Treyger, followed again by Council Member
7 Koslowitz.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
9 Majority Leader. I also just wanted to thank the
10 speaker for his strong words and strong leadership
11 and to my colleagues. I want to note that today I'm
12 introducing Introduction 1847, which will make sure
13 that there is a comprehensive, holistic,
14 individualized response to these violent hate crimes.
15 I'm proud to have Council Members Rivera and Torres
16 as prime co-sponsors. As we've heard, our city must
17 stand united against all forms of hate. All New
18 Yorkers should feel safe. We must all work together
19 to make sure that no one is afraid to live, pray, to
20 be in our city. My bill would make sure that there
21 is an individualized response in a culturally
22 responsive way to violent hate crimes and that the
23 affected community is notified and mobilized within
24 24 to 48 hours after it has been determined that a
25 hate crime has, has been occurred. The rise in hate

2 crimes is unacceptable. It's chilling and we must
3 look at every resource possible to make sure that we
4 protect New Yorkers. It's imperative that the Rapid
5 Notification and Response Process, which the city
6 uses in its Cure Violence initiative, apply to hate
7 crimes, which could have a chilling effect on
8 commuters. Hate crimes require more than just tweets
9 of condemnation and currently there's not enough of a
10 local connection to the response work. Our city must
11 do everything possible to fight back against the
12 rising levels of hate. For months I joined with the
13 majority of my colleagues in the City Council to
14 advocate that hate crimes be included in com stat and
15 thankfully NYPD has heeded our call and announced
16 this week that it will be adding hate crimes to com
17 stat. My bill is another way the city could ensure
18 that there is transparency, accountability around
19 hate crimes, and that there is a localized,
20 individualized response to make sure that all
21 communities are welcome and feel safe in our city.
22 Thank you, Majority Leader, for your time.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 Council Member Koslowitz.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. In
3 1923, before my time, way before my time, I can't say
4 that too often now, but my grandfather was removed
5 from his house in Poland by the Cossacks and taken
6 out because he was Jewish and killed. They're not
7 sure if he was shot or he was buried alive, but he
8 was dead. And as I grew up I heard all these
9 stories, and always thinking that this can't happen
10 here. And as I live through the days now and read
11 the newspapers, these things are happening here. It
12 is something that we cannot ignore, no matter who you
13 are, what you are, hate is a disease and we must stop
14 the hate that are shown to the people of our city and
15 right now the Jewish people of our city. Let my
16 people, leave my people alone. I am Jewish. I am
17 proud. I am proud to have friends of different
18 faiths, different colors throughout my life. Just
19 leave our people alone.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I'll call on
21 Speaker Corey Johnson to close this meeting.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you for all these
23 remarks. I think it's important to have a discussion
24 about this. The charter meeting of January 8, 2020,
25 is hereby adjourned.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

31

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 10, 2020