

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID
WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

October 28, 2016
Start: 1:13 p.m.
Recess: 2:06 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:
ANTONIO REYNOSO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Andy L. King
Vanessa L. Gibson
Costa G. Constantinides
Steven Matteo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kathryn Garcia
Commissioner
New York City Department of Sanitation

Dennis Diggins
First Deputy Commissioner
New York City Department of Sanitation

Jim Esposito
Deputy Commissioner
Planning and Preparedness
New York City Emergency Management
Department

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 3

2 [sound check]

3 [pause]

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Good afternoon and
5 welcome to this hearing concerning DSNY's 2016-2017
6 Snow Plan. Today we're also hearing testimony
7 concerning one of the bills that relates to snow,
8 Int. 1023.

9 Most of us recall the blizzard that hit
10 New York City at the end of 2010 which dumped as much
11 as two feet of snow in the five boroughs that
12 significantly impacted the daily lives of New
13 Yorkers. In the aftermath of the storm, the Council
14 held a series of hearings focused on the City's
15 preparedness for future storm events and subsequently
16 enacted several laws, including Local Law 28 of 2011.
17 This law requires the DSNY Commissioner to submit to
18 the Council very specific plans for snow plowing and
19 removal no later than November 15th of each year and
20 submit draft plans a month prior. These plans cover
21 the Department's planning, training, snow removal
22 priorities, designation categories, assigned
23 equipment and personnel, and implementation of the
24 Plan during a snow event. The 2016-2017 Draft Plan
25 includes expansion of its pilot program of new

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 4

2 plowing routes, which it refers to as "snow-
3 sectoring," in all community districts.

4 In addition to these plans, we will be
5 considering one snow-related bill, Int. 1023,
6 introduced by Council Members Van Bramer and
7 Greenfield, which would require that the Commissioner
8 of the Office of Emergency Management include in the
9 Department's annual snow preparedness and response
10 report a plan for the removal of snow and ice from
11 bicycle paths and greenways.

12 Before we hear the Commissioner, I want
13 to applaud her and her staff for their handling of
14 the January 2016 blizzard -- despite a record-setting
15 amount of snow that fell in the city, the Department
16 had most parts of the city cleared by the following
17 Monday -- a lot of upset young children that had to
18 go back to school early, Commissioner, so thank you
19 on their behalf as well.

20 But with no further ado, we have Jim
21 Esposito, who's the Deputy Commissioner for Planning
22 and Preparedness with us as well, but for their
23 testimony, Commissioner Kathryn Garcia from the
24 Department of Sanitation.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 5

2 KATHRYN GARCIA: And let me just start by
3 saying that I remember all four snow days or
4 hurricane days that I got off in my entire -- what
5 was it, 12 years of public school in the City of New
6 York; they were all very special days.

7 Good afternoon Chair Reynoso and members
8 of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste. I am
9 Kathryn Garcia, Commissioner for the New York City
10 Department of Sanitation. With me here today is
11 First Deputy Commissioner Dennis Diggins.

12 I'd like to thank Chair Reynoso and the
13 members of the Committee for this opportunity to
14 discuss with you the Department's Draft Snow Plans
15 and our preparedness for the upcoming snow season.
16 And it did suddenly get cold today, which actually
17 makes it -- so at least it's not 80 degrees when
18 we're talking about snow.

19 Our Draft Snow Plans detail the
20 Department's snow planning procedures from the onset
21 of precipitation to snow-clearing operations after
22 every snowstorm. The Plans identify how we will
23 allocate personnel and equipment resources in each
24 borough and district, the coordination of services
25 among agencies and customer service protocols. They

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 6

2 also outline the continuation of policies and
3 programs that the Department has previously
4 introduced, including the expansion of snow-sectoring
5 to all 59 community districts, and initiatives we
6 will implement to enhance our response and
7 effectiveness this winter. We will consider all
8 comments and recommendations received by elected
9 officials on our draft Plans, and then we will
10 publish the Final Borough Snow Plans on the
11 Department's website by November 15th.

12 Last January, the City experienced a
13 historic blizzard that covered our streets and
14 sidewalks with more than two feet of snow. At each
15 of the City's three National Weather Service
16 monitoring stations -- Central Park (they had to
17 reevaluate theirs; they weren't historic until about
18 two months after the storm), JFK and LaGuardia
19 Airports -- the blizzard set new records for snowfall
20 accumulations, and amateur spotters in parts of
21 Queens measured accumulations of up to 34 inches. I
22 am immensely proud of the dedication and
23 determination with which our employees took on the
24 task of fighting this storm and digging our city.

25

2 In the days, weeks and months after the
3 blizzard, we took the time to review our response and
4 identify our successes as well as opportunities to
5 continue to improve our planning, preparedness and
6 response. The Department has made several changes
7 for the 2016-2017 snow season, and I will take a few
8 minutes to highlight several of these changes.

9 We invested \$21 million in capital funds
10 to purchase additional snow equipment to more
11 effectively remove snow from narrow streets,
12 especially during storms with accumulations over 12
13 inches. And I wanna thank the Council for the
14 enormous amount of support we got for that
15 expenditure. These investments include:

16 Purchasing 21 new front-end loaders that
17 will be used instead of the mid-sized front-end
18 loaders we currently utilize during salt-loading
19 operations. Larger loaders will allow the Department
20 to decrease turnaround on salt-loading and lower queue
21 lines. In addition to increasing overall efficiency
22 for salt-loading, using large front-end loaders for
23 salt operations frees up the medium-sized loaders for
24 other uses, such as plowing dead end streets. The
25 Department can then deploy those in streets during

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 8

2 heavy snowfalls to ensure standard plows and V-plows
3 remain usable when large amounts of snow have
4 accumulated;

5 Purchasing 40 new skid steer plows to
6 further mechanize the clearing of crosswalks and bus
7 stops to more quickly clear pedestrian
8 infrastructure. (Skid steers, otherwise known as
9 Bobcats.);

10 Purchasing 80 additional small salt
11 spreaders, called haulsters, that together with our
12 other equipment, will allow the Department to
13 eliminate the use of outside contractors that have
14 been supplementing our plow operations on smaller,
15 narrow street segments. Shifting these operations to
16 the Department will improve snow clearing on smaller
17 streets that are more difficult to efficiently clear
18 during a storm, and greatly improve snow operations.

19 The Department now has a total of 689
20 large and small salt spreaders in our snow-fighting
21 fleet. This is an increase of 56 percent over the
22 spreader fleet in place when I was appointed
23 Commissioner in 2014. This expanded fleet not only
24 makes us better prepared to respond more effectively
25 to large snow storms but also improves our ability to

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 9

2 respond to ice storms and other types of frozen
3 precipitation where plows alone are ineffective.

4 This year the Department has also
5 expanded its successful Snow Sectoring initiative
6 citywide. This initiative replaces the "Primary,
7 Secondary, Tertiary" priority classifications for
8 city streets with new critical, sector and haulster
9 routes. In a heavy storm with significant expected
10 accumulation, the Department will begin plowing of
11 all three types of routes at the same time, providing
12 more timely service for many residents. This
13 approach was first tested during the 2013-2014 snow
14 season and it has improved the efficiency of snow-
15 fighting operations by dramatically reducing
16 redundant travel miles.

17 The increased number of small salt
18 spreaders, combined with the expansion of the Snow
19 Sectoring initiative, has allowed the Department to
20 terminate the Tertiary Plowing Contracts previously
21 used in large snow storms. These streets will now be
22 plowed by Department employees and will receive the
23 same high level of service that we have come to
24 expect for all city streets.

25

2 This fall the Department has conducted a
3 comprehensive snow training program during September
4 and October for all Sanitation workers and
5 supervisors. Held on Sundays for the past several
6 weeks, this full-day training program combined a
7 classroom module on proper techniques and procedures
8 with a real-world driving training, with workers
9 operating plows and spreaders on sector routes.

10 Additionally, the Department, in
11 partnership with the Department of Information and
12 Technology, will continue to improve PlowNYC and
13 other GPS systems by upgrading the back-end dataset
14 systems that process and map the GPS signals received
15 from snow equipment. As a result of this updated
16 technology, Department snow plow data will be made
17 available in near real-time during snow events, with
18 plow locations updated several times per hour.
19 Employing this frequent automation will allow us to
20 identify challenges in neighborhoods where conditions
21 are detrimental so we can reallocate resources to
22 those areas that need them the most.

23 The Department's snow budget for Fiscal
24 Year 2017 is \$88.1 million. The Department has
25 adequate staffing, with over 6,400 Sanitation workers

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 11

2 available to manage this winter's snow and ice
3 storms, including 369 new Sanitation workers inducted
4 at a ceremony earlier this week. On November 14th,
5 the Department will begin Night Plow organization by
6 increasing manpower on both night shifts to ensure
7 coverage for snow or winter weather responses as
8 necessary, and will perform a full-scale snow drill
9 rehearsal in mid-November. The annual dress
10 rehearsal involving multiple agencies entails
11 Department personnel loading salt spreaders,
12 attaching plows to the trucks, installing chains to
13 the trucks and spreaders, field testing GPS
14 equipment, testing emergency radio talk groups, and
15 operating equipment along plowing and spreader
16 routes. Performing a mock snow drill reinforces the
17 importance of early coordination among the many
18 agencies that provide essential services, from public
19 transportation to emergency response, so that the
20 Administration is fully prepared to manage any type
21 of snow event.

22 We also have available at the onset of
23 this snow season more than 375,500 tons of road salt
24 stored at over 41 locations citywide, with contracts
25 in place to deliver an additional 550,000 tons as

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 12

2 necessary. This is the highest pre-season salt
3 inventory in recent memory.

4 Our Draft Snow Plans outline the
5 framework of policies and procedures that fortify our
6 preparedness. The Department is an agency that
7 responds quickly and learns from past experience.
8 Future Department practices will benefit from last
9 year's experiences, particular after Jonas last
10 January, which produced record-breaking snowfall. Of
11 course we must be mindful that every storm brings
12 different challenges that impact the speed with which
13 streets are cleared, including the storm's intensity,
14 temperature, time of day, traffic on the roadways,
15 and overall quantity and accumulation of snowfall.
16 As we have learned from past storms, different
17 communities may experience different and heavier snow
18 bands than neighboring communities which can
19 potentially disrupt normal traffic patterns and
20 public transportation for longer periods of time. We
21 ask the public to be patient so that Department
22 workers, who are performing under tough conditions,
23 can safely complete their tasks timely and
24 effectively.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 13

2 Int. No. 1023 is also on the agency for
3 today's hearing. This bill would require the New
4 York City Emergency Management Department to include
5 in its annual snow preparedness and response report a
6 list of bicycle paths and greenways in the city,
7 along with a plan for removing snow and ice from
8 these areas. As described in the Department's Draft
9 Snow Plans, once the Department has completed
10 clearing city streets, the Department addresses snow
11 and ice removal from bike lanes on city streets and
12 pedestrian infrastructure like overpasses, bus stops,
13 crosswalks, and step streets. In addition to manual
14 shoveling, the Department uses skid steers and pick-
15 up plows to clear these areas. Greenways, although
16 not clearly defined in Int. No. 1023, are generally
17 located within parks or parkways and are not the
18 responsibility of the Department of Sanitation. I
19 defer to my fellow agencies regarding any further
20 questions you may have regarding It. No. 1023. We
21 have both First Deputy Commissioners from the
22 Department of Transportation as well as Parks and
23 Recreation, Margaret Forgione and Liam Kavanagh.

24 In closing, I want to assure you that
25 snow-fighting is core component of our agency's

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 14
2 mission and the Department's workforce understands
3 that their performance is critical to keeping this
4 City functioning 24/7. The Department is a dynamic
5 agency with excellent staffing levels for this snow
6 season, and I am confident the Department's workforce
7 can and will respond quickly and effectively to any
8 major snow event. As we approach the official 2016-
9 2017 snow season, I look forward to your input and
10 suggested comments on our Draft Snow Plans.

11 My staff and I are now happy to answer
12 your questions.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you
14 Commissioner. At this moment we want to allow for
15 Mr. Esposito to go ahead and make his statement
16 regarding 1023 before we ask any questions. Thank
17 you.

18 [background comments]

19 JIM ESPOSITO: Okay. Alright, thank you.

20 Good afternoon Chairperson Reynoso and
21 members of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid
22 Waste Management. I am Jim Esposito, Deputy
23 Commissioner for Planning and Preparedness at New
24 York City Emergency Management.

25

2 Local Law 26 of 2011 requires agencies
3 responsible for preparing and responding to snow
4 emergencies to provide an annual snow preparedness
5 and response report for each snow even of six inches
6 or greater no later than November 15th of each year.
7 As this local law falls into Administrative Code 30,
8 it is the responsibility of New York City Emergency
9 Management to collect and collate this information
10 and public the report, which we do so on our website
11 as well as provide direct to the Council. The report
12 gets no more than 20 site views each year from our
13 website.

14 We rely on agencies to provide us the
15 required information for the report. Referring to
16 the legislation at hand, if the Department of
17 Transportation and the Department of Parks and
18 Recreation have lists of bicycle paths and greenways
19 for which the City is responsible for, it can be
20 added to the annual report.

21 However, please note that this
22 legislation also calls for plans for removal of snow
23 and ice from bicycle paths and greenways and
24 resources used for such removal to be added into the
25 annual report. NYC Emergency Management does not

2 public other agencies' operational plans on our
3 website and we do not put them into our reports.

4 Therefore, this part of the legislation would need to
5 be redirected to the relevant agencies and removed
6 from our code.

7 Thank you for permitting me to testify
8 today. Along with the Administration's subject
9 matter experts from DOT and Parks, we are prepared to
10 take your questions. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Deputy
12 Commissioner for your testimony. And I don't know if
13 some of you have noticed that we are actually using
14 technology and going as paperless as possible here in
15 the City of New York; I do wanna say that the paper
16 we do have comes from the Administration and the
17 Mayor's office, but everything that's paperless comes
18 from the City Council, so a big pat on our backs,
19 thank you very much.

20 But on the subject of technology, I
21 wanted to start there, Commissioner, if you could let
22 us know since last snow season what improvements has
23 the Department made to the GPS equipment to allow for
24 more accurate tracking of vehicles; we all know that
25 that was the issue of concern for some folks that

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 17

2 assumed that their streets were not plowed or maybe

3 their streets weren't plowed, and saw it on the GPS

4 tracking system that the City had made available to

5 them that it was plowed and whether or not we were

6 able to make any advancements there or the concerns

7 that we had last year or the issues we had last year

8 still are gonna remain and that we make sure that we

9 let people know that that is still an issue and that...

10 [interpose]

11 KATHRYN GARCIA: Certainly. So we have

12 done a lot of work with DoITT in terms of the back

13 end of the process and the datasets that -- so the

14 GPS signals go from the vehicles -- I'm gonna call it

15 the cloud; it's not a cloud -- but to a server where

16 they make determinations about where that point

17 belongs on the map and then it paints the map; we've

18 done a lot of enhancements on that that particular

19 processing algorithm. In addition, we have added GPS

20 software modules to other pieces of equipment, so

21 that now the front-end loaders have them, the skid

22 steers have them, so that as we're moving into

23 operations either at a very heavy snowfall or that

24 we're past clearing and we're really doing sort of

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 18

2 bus stops and crosswalks; we'll be able to see that
3 as well.

4 In addition, one of the things that I
5 think hampered us during the very large storm is; we
6 had never actually kept PlowNYC up for more than 24
7 hours; there had never been a storm that had lasted
8 more than 24 hours. And so one of the things is, it
9 recycled after 24 hours and you lost everything that
10 you had done before the end of the storm. So we've
11 made changes to that so that we can manage very long
12 snowfalls. I do wanna say that there is always a
13 level of error in any GPS system, you know, that is
14 just inherent in that particular technology, it's not
15 always perfect, but we think that we've made it a lot
16 more accurate and we also are going to be able to be
17 -- and I'm not exactly sure and we'll have to get
18 someone from DoITT to actually talk through what the
19 technology piece is, but allow people to pull from
20 the PlowNYC website the actual long-lat data so that
21 you can double-check us. So we're trying to be
22 transparent and we're trying to make it so that it's
23 a tool that's helpful to people at home, but also,
24 more importantly, for me; it is helpful to me in
25 terms of situational awareness.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 19

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you
3 Commissioner. So just so we could have any
4 disclosure on the website, when it is up, explaining
5 how it might not be 100% accurate... [crosstalk]

6 KATHRYN GARCIA: It does actually; it's
7 always said that on the website... [crosstalk]

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh, make it larger,
9 larger print [**inaudible**]... [crosstalk]

10 KATHRYN GARCIA: Larger print. Okay,
11 well now that I am wearing reading glasses, which I
12 was not the first time I sat in front of your
13 committee, I have a new appreciation for a large font
14 size.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Appreciate it. So
16 with the new personnel and equipment that you've
17 received, how were they allocated; was this strictly
18 demand, I guess, or an assessment that you made where
19 they need to be or equal distribution, just
20 [background comment] -- especially for folks in
21 Queens that saw a harder time than other folks,
22 whether or not that they receive more... [interpose]

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: So let me just talk a
24 little bit through what our process is, 'cause I
25 think that that's useful.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 20

2 So we create these three different route
3 packages that are designed for big spreaders or big
4 plows or little spreaders and little plows; we then
5 measure that lane mileage and we use that lane
6 mileage to divvy up the equipment -- so Queens gets a
7 lot more snow equipment than anybody else, they've
8 got more highways; they're actually just
9 geographically bigger -- and then we assign the
10 personnel to make sure we can actually run that
11 equipment. But we are focused on what the mileage is
12 for each of that and so we create packages. For the
13 bigger highways we have to use more pieces of
14 equipment because there are more lanes, so you'll see
15 us in tandem -- if we're on the Long Island
16 Expressway or something, you'll see multiple pieces
17 of equipment plowing for that so it's not one just
18 one on the Long Island Expressway.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So now can we speak
20 specifically to Queens and just how that sectoring
21 has changed, if it's been modified in any way, and
22 then specifically speak to their increase in
23 personnel and equipment as well.

24 KATHRYN GARCIA: So they were sectored
25 last year; we went through and redid many of their

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 21

2 routes, based on their experience; it was actually
3 the first snowstorm that they had been sectorized in;
4 it was actually the first snowstorm for 500 of my
5 employees, they had never plowed any snow prior to
6 Jonas. So we have gotten a lot more equipment, and I
7 can let you know what we have for -- oh goodness, I
8 never think about the fact that Queens is one
9 borough; we actually consider it two. But in total,
10 they have 766 pieces of equipment assigned to them in
11 a spreader plan three with plows and then the
12 personnel matches. If we end up in a C+ storm; that
13 number would go up to just shy of 800.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And can you just,
15 for the general public, C+ storm?

16 KATHRYN GARCIA: That's an internal; it's
17 sort of like -- so our plow plan is for -- we do A,
18 B, C; plus is like anything else we can find and put
19 a body on, [background comment] all hands.

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And then in the
21 case where we might miss some streets or something
22 might not be cleared or we might get complaints or
23 [background comment] concerns through 311 and so
24 forth; what process do you have in place to address

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 22

2 those issues after you've done like an additional
3 plowing of all streets?

4 KATHRYN GARCIA: So there are a couple
5 reasons why we might miss a -- one of the banes of my
6 existence after the blizzard was -- I believe ABC
7 News set up right at one street and when you went and
8 pulled the GPS, that operator had done every single
9 street on his route except for that one; when asked
10 why that one wasn't done, there was a car stuck on
11 that street, and he tried to go up the opposite way
12 and couldn't make it up the hill. So one of the
13 things we've stressed to folks is; you need to get on
14 the radio and let us know every obstacle that you are
15 facing out there, because we do have other resources;
16 we could have sent a tow truck out to pull that car
17 out to then be able to get to that block. So that
18 has been what we have been reiterating to folks, and
19 one of the big takeaways is like we completely
20 understand that maybe there's an oil truck on that
21 block or somebody's still doing a delivery on that
22 block and you can't get down; you've gotta let us
23 know, 'cause we need to keep track of it so we can
24 get back to it.

25

2 In terms of 311 complaints, until we have
3 done a first sweep you can leave your complaint, but
4 we're not gonna respond to it, 'cause it makes us
5 less efficient. If I start answering 311 complaints
6 because people think I should have already been on
7 their block; we will start tracing and not be plowing
8 and miss more streets. So that's the way that we
9 operate during that particular type of an event.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And then in just a
11 general sense, how long would it take to -- so once
12 they see the first truck on the street, how long can
13 a resident assume that all streets have been plowed
14 so that they can feel comfortable that thereafter all
15 311 complaints would be addressed or..

16 KATHRYN GARCIA: That's really gonna
17 depend on the storm, because if it's a light storm
18 where you're talking about like say maybe up to four
19 inches, we may be done in four or five hours, you
20 know we may call it done in four or five hours; I
21 mean that might be you know really quick. If you're
22 talking about a storm where it's continuing to snow
23 the whole time, it may take us 12 hours after the
24 last snowfall before we start saying we're gonna

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 24

2 start taking complaints. So it's gonna vary
3 depending on what the weather provides.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: An issue where
5 trucks getting stuck in the middle of blocks or
6 [background comment] taking on too much snow,
7 [background comment] I guess it's difficult for the
8 general public to comprehend how a larger truck can
9 possibly get stuck ever, and it being the vehicle
10 that's supposed to help us get out of being stuck.
11 So can you just go through the process by which a
12 vehicle can get stuck and then the process that you
13 go through after that to unstuck [sic] it, I guess,
14 to move it.

15 KATHRYN GARCIA: So one of the things we
16 learned in the last blizzard was; it was not actually
17 new Sanitation workers who got stuck; they actually
18 had, on average, seven years on the job, which means
19 that we actually don't plow 30 inches of snow that
20 often and so one of the things we did was go back and
21 do a lot of training on exactly what the protocols
22 were -- how do you deal, particularly as you're
23 turning into a side street where the avenue may be
24 clear but there's now a ridge that's five feet tall;
25 how are you supposed to manage cutting that down and

2 backing up and dealing with it? So we've gone
3 through all the techniques. Could they still get
4 stuck if there's another storm of that size?

5 Absolutely. We use two different pieces of equipment
6 to pull them out; we will either use a front-end
7 loader to try and pull them out or we will bring a
8 wrecker or tow truck out to try and pull them out.
9 The front-end loader usually tends to be more
10 effective in some of the smaller areas; the wrecker,
11 you know, you do need a certain amount of space to
12 maneuver.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And this could be
14 -- I guess I will say; someone told me that the
15 trucks try to not go in reverse, as much as possible
16 for safety reasons, and some Sanitation workers don't
17 wanna risk hitting someone or getting into a crash or
18 damaging property because of the blind spots at the
19 rear end, even though they can possibly exit by
20 reversing that they just don't do it **[inaudible]**...
21 [crosstalk]

22 KATHRYN GARCIA: Actually, they are
23 never, under our protocols and safety protocols,
24 supposed to back up without a guide man, whether
25 there is snow or no snow they are not supposed to be

2 backing up without a guide man. Supervisors will
3 come and back them up; they need to get on the radio
4 and say they're stuck, but they could be back up and
5 a supervisor can back them up or we can send another
6 Sanitation worker to back them up. [background
7 comment] There are certain routes where we send out
8 a guide man with them because they're dead end, so we
9 know they're gonna have to back up every single time.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: That's good to know
11 for, again, for the general public, 'cause they see a
12 street that's plowed behind them and they're probably
13 telling them back up, back up and they just don't;
14 that it's under, I guess a policy not to.. [crosstalk]

15 KATHRYN GARCIA: It's... It's just it's
16 dangerous to back up a big truck like that; if they
17 hit someone; that person probably dies.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right, absolutely.
19 And then the last part is; have all the trucks -- are
20 they equipped with rear wheel guards yet?

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: Are they equipped with
22 side guards? Not all of them; just shy of 200 are
23 equipped with side guards.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 27

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Now I just
3 wanna allow for Council Member Matteo to ask a few
4 questions apparently.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I'm gonna ask a
6 lot of questions, Mr. Chair. [laugh] Just...

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: Well there are only two
8 of **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: **[inaudible]** two
10 of us...

11 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yeah, **[inaudible]**...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: **[inaudible]**...
13 [crosstalk]

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Uh it's Staten
15 Island... it's Staten Island **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

16 KATHRYN GARCIA: **[inaudible]**

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I'm gonna start
18 though with a shameless plug and thank the
19 Commissioner for your partnership on e-waste program;
20 we've had great success over the first two weeks and
21 I just wanna make Chair Reynoso a little bit jealous
22 as well, so.

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yeah, you shouldn't say
24 this around people from other boroughs.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [laugh]

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 28

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Very concerned now,
3 I'm very concerned.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: But thank you,
5 seriously, it's been a great success and thank you
6 for partnering with me.

7 So let me start; I wanna clarify a couple
8 things you said and then I'll go into some other
9 questions. The Chair talked about how long it takes
10 before you will take complaints; obviously, I assume
11 that it's different for each borough and..

12 KATHRYN GARCIA: No, it's different for
13 each storm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: from each storm.
15 So I'll phrase the question this way; how long does
16 it take in Staten Island in an average storm of five,
17 six inches for you to get to all the streets?

18 **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

19 KATHRYN GARCIA: Oh that's a different
20 question I think..

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Right, and that's
22 what I'm...

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: So in a normal average
24 storm that's plowable, where I'm sending out
25 everything, so you know, it's over two inches, the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 29

2 routes are designed to be about two hours..

3 [interpose]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Two hours for

5 all...

6 KATHRYN GARCIA: but we are looking for

7 Sanitation workers to get, basically, in one.. we want

8 them to get through with.. between three and four

9 hours they've done a good job, but they're designed

10 to be done in two, but we wanna make sure that we

11 give them the time to get everywhere.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So when they're

13 finished and it's as-needed, they'll go back?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yeah. Yeah.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Would they have

16 to check in and do it again or they're just goin'

17 back.. [crosstalk]

18 KATHRYN GARCIA: Oh no, they stay on

19 their route till we pull them off and the supervisor

20 says they're clear [sic].. [crosstalk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, so once

22 you're finished with your route, the driver just goes

23 back to the beginning.. [interpose]

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 30

2 KATHRYN GARCIA: You go back to the
3 beginning and you stay on that route until we tell
4 you you can leave.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. And we've
6 talked about this before; on the Island sometimes,
7 you know we'll start getting complaints; it's snowing
8 and they'll see the trucks on Richmond Avenue
9 because, I think, and I think we've talked about
10 this, that there's a shift change; [background
11 comment] when are the shifts and is there a moment
12 during the day where the trucks aren't out because of
13 a shift change?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: Oh absolutely. I mean
15 if we're full force and we're on split shift, the
16 shift changes at seven and seven.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Seven and seven.

18 KATHRYN GARCIA: Seven and seven, and so
19 like they do need to come back to the garage; they've
20 gotta refuel, the spreaders have to be salted up, and
21 you know, we've gotta get the people home and the
22 people in the chairs. We do try and stagger,
23 particularly the spreaders, and hold them an extra
24 hour on the street so that we don't lose too much,
25 but shift change is the most challenging period

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 31
2 during any snowstorm, 'cause basically you're talking
3 about -- I've got somewhere between 2,200 and 2,400
4 people who literally have to change hats.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And how long does
6 it usually take?

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: Depends on the garage...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

9 KATHRYN GARCIA: some can do it in like,
10 you know, an hour; [background comment] some take
11 longer.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

13 KATHRYN GARCIA: The bigger garages tend
14 to take longer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And so when
16 someone... the driver's shift is nearing towards the
17 end, they finish the route or they just...

18 KATHRYN GARCIA: No, it's a time call...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

20 KATHRYN GARCIA: they get call... like at a
21 certain time it's like you mark where you finished..
22 [crosstalk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And they start,
24 the next shift starts there?

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 32

2 KATHRYN GARCIA: and the next shift is
3 supposed to start where you finished..

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

5 KATHRYN GARCIA: and you go back so that
6 you're fueled up and ready to go for the next
7 Sanitation worker.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. Obviously
9 -- and you mentioned this in your testimony -- but
10 we've seen it on Staten Island for the last, I think
11 two or three Sundays, the prep work; we've all been
12 getting some interesting calls **[inaudible]**...
13 [crosstalk]

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: They think I have
15 knowledge they don't have... [crosstalk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Yeah, they're
17 wondering if we see snow and they don't. So can you
18 tell me how the prep work is going; is it change...
19 [crosstalk]

20 KATHRYN GARCIA: Absolutely.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: is it changing
22 routes... [crosstalk]

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: So the... the...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: you know; are we
25 bettering the route because of the prep work?

2 KATHRYN GARCIA: So we have never
3 actually retrained the entire force on snow; we think
4 that it's been enormously successful. So some of it
5 is, true thing [sic], route, and so part of it is,
6 when they are riding the routes that may have been
7 done even over the summer, new things pop up -- new
8 bollards pop up, new Citi Bikes pop up -- and now
9 they can't make the turn, [background comment] and so
10 you have to straighten out that route because now the
11 big truck can't make the turn or they'll switch the
12 equipment and say, you know this actually needs to be
13 a small spreader route and not a big truck route. So
14 we're getting all of that information from the field
15 right now and tweaking the routes; we don't
16 anticipate that there will be changes, but those are
17 all the types of situations that slow us down. And
18 so to our ability to know that now is extremely
19 important and also just having -- driving the truck
20 with a plow is a completely different feel than
21 driving the truck without the plow. In addition, we
22 have a lot of new equipment, you know people are
23 like; I didn't know where the kill switch was in the
24 new piece of equipment... [crosstalk]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Right.

2 KATHRYN GARCIA: that they gave me. So
3 making sure that they all have a good feel for what
4 we're gonna have available -- I mean we've gotten
5 phenomenal feedback from the field.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Right. As an
7 aside to that, we had to work on some improvements at
8 Milford Drive at Ocean Terrace and we shifted the
9 one-ways and closed the street down, so I'm sure your
10 drivers are seeing that, but it's just something just
11 to take note; I'm sure it's definitely gonna impact
12 some of the plowing in that area.

13 I wanna talk about last year's snowstorm.
14 For me, you guys were... you did a great job, constant
15 communication; your borough chief is fantastic. What
16 we did see was the narrower streets, especially
17 Wesley [sp?] and New Dorp Beach [background comment]
18 where we had to bring in the small pieces of
19 equipment, which was extremely helpful and worked; I
20 assume that the new equipment is dealing with that,
21 the small equipment where we had to actually -- I
22 mean obviously we're hoping we don't get another 30-
23 inch storm, but where we actually had to dig the snow
24 out, put it in trucks and deliver them. Are we

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 35

2 getting more pieces of equipment for that type of
3 removal?

4 KATHRYN GARCIA: Yeah, so we have... those
5 are front-end loaders.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: So we did get more
8 front-end loaders and...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Do you have the
10 Staten Island numbers?

11 KATHRYN GARCIA: and let me get you the
12 Staten Island numbers on front-end loaders; hold on.
13 Did I bring the front-end loader number? [background
14 comments] So you have 7 more front-end loaders, 11
15 more haulsters and 4 more skid steers on the Island.
16 The other thing that I think is important; we've
17 never used front-end loaders for real dedicated
18 plowing routes before; [background comment] we have
19 now picked locations for front-end loaders to stage
20 across the city if we think we're gonna be over 12
21 inches...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: so that they can
24 actually start earlier rather than like, oh my
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 36

2 goodness, we're being and now I've gotta go dig out
3 this entire neighborhood.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. So are
5 they staged in Staten Island at all three or in two
6 in the middle; where... [interpose]

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: Oh yeah, no, no; there...
8 there are specific loca... I mean they have some
9 interesting names, like, why are you here, tight
10 streets [sic]...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. And that's
12 the borough commissioner's call when to use them;
13 your call?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: No, it'll be our call.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. Okay.

16 KATHRYN GARCIA: I mean he has an
17 enormous amount of discretion, but I suspect that if
18 we think that there is a 12-inch storm coming,
19 they're all gonna get the orders that they need to
20 pre-stage these.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. Two inches
22 of snow is when you plow; when is it the call to make
23 for salting?

24 KATHRYN GARCIA: Oh we will pre-position
25 the spreaders if we have information from each of the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 37

2 three weather services that we're anticipating some
3 sort of frozen precipitation, so you may see them out
4 there for a long time and then they will as soon as
5 we see first flake.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. For the
7 Staten Island route, obviously, you make specific
8 instructions to get, especially the night before
9 school, to get to the schools first or... [crosstalk]

10 KATHRYN GARCIA: Right, so...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: using your longer
12 route?

13 KATHRYN GARCIA: So the schools should be
14 on critical routes; they should be getting taken care
15 of, but they are the first thing that we are looking
16 at as we are in the middle of a storm, particularly
17 if we think there's school the next day, not only
18 just their streets, but trying to get closer to the
19 curb so that buses can discharge children in a way
20 that's safe.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So the issue that
22 we mostly had after you plowed is, especially in the
23 narrow streets, like I said, in New Dorp Beach and
24 Wesley, around the schools and Midland Beach is where
25 we're putting the snow, and that become problematic.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 38

2 So I just wanted to bring to your attention that I
3 think that is somewhere where we're gonna have to get
4 the equipment in to remove the snow because
5 [background comment] last year we were just running
6 out of places, and I'm not even worried about
7 parking; I'm just worried about -- we couldn't even
8 get through, parents weren't able to get through to
9 get their kids, so I just wanna make sure that that's
10 a priority.

11 We always talk about catch basins, but
12 these new small pieces of equipment will help clear
13 the basins?

14 KATHRYN GARCIA: Well it just makes us
15 faster on all of like what are called corner caps,
16 crosswalks, bus stops, and any time we're doing a
17 crosswalk we include the catch basin as part of the
18 clearing.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So when do you
20 start the crosswalk removal?

21 KATHRYN GARCIA: Not until I'm sure that
22 all the streets are cleared.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So streets
24 cleared; then you start with the crosswalk.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 39

2 KATHRYN GARCIA: Then I start with
3 pedestrian infrastructure and bike infrastructure.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: You know and each
5 year we talk about bus stops and getting more
6 laborers to help; I know you've put it out already;
7 [background comment] are you getting more; are people
8 applying **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

9 KATHRYN GARCIA: We haven't had a lot of
10 take-up yet, but it's early...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

12 KATHRYN GARCIA: the other thing though,
13 is we are gonna cap the total number. We ended up
14 with 6,400 during the blizzard; they're just not
15 effective 'cause we don't have enough supervision and
16 so one of the challenges is -- at least I, driving
17 around, would see a whole bunch of laborers not
18 laboring, so we wanna make sure that we're putting
19 them in places that are effective and able to move
20 them more around the city to where we need them.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. You and I
22 have had private conversations about this last point
23 too, about getting the bus stops; it's been
24 problematic on Staten Island, just because it's
25 difficult and we're using express buses to get to the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 40
2 city to work; you know, I'll continue to send you the
3 locations; using Bobcats was extremely helpful last
4 year; I ask that we continue that and we up our game
5 a little bit just to get to more bus stops and clear
6 the streets too and the sidewalks around it, and I
7 know it becomes an interagency battle, I get it, you
8 know and you know we speak with everybody -- DOT and
9 MTA -- but it is one of the most problematic pieces
10 of a storm because I don't want my constituents or
11 all Staten Islanders in the street -- on Highland
12 Boulevard or Richmond Road, Forest Avenue --
13 unfortunately, when we can't get to the side.. the
14 sidewalks are icy and they're in the street and it,
15 as you know, makes it problematic, so I ask that we,
16 you know, we'll continue to work with everybody and I
17 just wanna put that on the record and make sure that
18 we're prioritizing that.

19 KATHRYN GARCIA: Right. No, and I mean I
20 think that we didn't have all of the express bus
21 stops on our radar last year and I appreciate the
22 fact that you raised some that were either not on bus
23 routes, some of these express bus stops. I know the
24 borough chief has kept a running list of what these
25 areas are; if you have other locations, you know that

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 41

2 we'll take a look at them and make sure that we are
3 addressing the ones that are your highest priority.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I appreciate it,
5 and we'll keep sending them to you and I thank you
6 for your cooperation and for your partnership on
7 Staten Island; my constituents extremely appreciate
8 it.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Just to follow up
10 on a couple other questions. Bus stops; we were
11 hearing incidents of buses getting stuck, emergency
12 vehicles getting stuck; who makes the call on the
13 buses and when they should stop, they should clear
14 the road and be **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

15 KATHRYN GARCIA: That's an MTA call.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right and are you
17 in the room when... are you an adviser, I guess, with
18 MTA as to when that needs to happen?

19 KATHRYN GARCIA: There is a large agency
20 coordination call; what we provide is where we think
21 we will be at certain points in the storm, and then
22 they make an operat... both their surface as well as
23 their subway service about how long they wanna run.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Now with
25 Int. 1023, obviously there's some concerns over how

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 42

2 well we do with clearing snow in bike paths; can you
3 just talk about the system and how that works with
4 DSNY, and how soon after, I guess... when is it that
5 you start clearing them; do you do the entire bike
6 network, and how is it that you get it done?

7 KATHRYN GARCIA: So we will not look at
8 bike paths until we are completely done with the road
9 network, and then we will start clearing bike paths
10 and we clear bike paths that are part of streets; we
11 don't clear bike paths that are in parks, and we will
12 continue to do that until we have completed all of
13 that infrastructure. We don't do bridges either.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So I guess to the
15 Deputy Commissioner Esposito, I know you said it in
16 the testimony here that you're concerned about adding
17 the bike network or how they should be cleared in the
18 comprehensive snow plan; what other avenues do we
19 have outside of doing that to really make it a
20 priority for the City to clear the bike lanes or take
21 it just as seriously clearing the general roadways?

22 JIM ESPOSITO: You know... yeah, please.

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: It's not. It will never
24 be as big a priority as a roadway because the roadway
25 carries the ambulance and the fire trucks and the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 43

2 police cars, and so it will always be the first
3 priority and bicycles will always be the second
4 priority.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: No, I agree with
6 that, Commissioner, 100% agree, but I guess what I'm
7 saying is, the fact that it gets cleared at all and
8 that actually be done I think is the concern. A lot
9 of bike paths were not cleared last time at all or..

10 KATHRYN GARCIA: **[inaudible]**

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: when the snow
12 melts, I guess, but before the snow melts..

13 KATHRYN GARCIA: I had help. I had help.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I hear you; you did
15 get help, but we're hoping that even if the help
16 doesn't come that eventually, on Monday or Tuesday,
17 that folks that generally get to work and move around
18 on bicycles also have access to get to work and move
19 around; that's all. So we just wanna hear -- how do
20 we get that done after spaces like for emergency
21 vehicles and police and so forth get cleared, how we
22 do that for bikes thereafter?

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: Then you just start on
24 all of the bike routes, I mean every single borough
25 has a list of every bike route and they are actual

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 44
2 routes just like car routes and they are usually
3 cleared with a haulster or a pick-up plow.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: But that's not
5 included in your plan here; is it anywhere publicly
6 for residents of the City of New York to see how it
7 is that we clear and how fast or when do we start...
8 [interpose]

9 KATHRYN GARCIA: So I mean I'm happy to
10 add a paragraph that talks about our approach to bike
11 lanes, but it's not gonna be -- oh, apparently I have
12 in my plan, which I apparently did not -- I thought I
13 had reread the whole thing -- on page nine, exactly
14 our approach to both pedestrian and bicycle
15 infrastructure.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. And then
17 what about putting... So I guess what people wanna see
18 is; we're not gonna be able to get a GPS map of all
19 the bike lanes that are cleared, but I...

20 KATHRYN GARCIA: I mean the challenge you
21 would have is that bike lanes are often on streets,
22 so there is no way to differentiate between the two
23 when the haulster is in the bike lane or the haulster
24 is a lane mile; I mean the technology's not that
25 good.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 45

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And then resources...
3 are resources put out to deal with -- let's say North
4 Brooklyn, for example, has an entire bike lane
5 network or a substantial bike lane network in a way
6 that Central Brooklyn doesn't have; are there extra
7 resources provided to North Brooklyn specifically to
8 address the bike lanes that they have as opposed to
9 let's say Central Brooklyn?

10 KATHRYN GARCIA: So the likelihood is no,
11 we would not move resources from Central Brooklyn to
12 North Brooklyn; North Brooklyn's got pretty decent
13 resources to deal with their bike lanes; they would
14 have different equipment; they will have more
15 haulsters. It's like Manhattan, you would think, why
16 would anyone in Manhattan need a haulster; it's all
17 gigantic avenues, but they have haulsters 'cause they
18 have bike lanes. So it wouldn't be that there would
19 be more resources or we move things around, because
20 in Central Brooklyn we're dealing with a lot of
21 pedestrian infrastructure, you know and talk about
22 Brooklyn South and I know you have colleagues who
23 think that I need to clear the entire median on 4th
24 Avenue; it's just, you know we get to the priorities;
25 as we move through we think we will be faster with

2 the skid steers; we've basically doubled that fleet
3 and that will really help, so we have an approach to
4 it; we also think that -- one of the challenges that
5 I think may also be true for bicycles; while we often
6 get to blacktop, we don't always get to blacktop on
7 the road network, but it is passable, you know people
8 can get by. Bicycles don't do very well if it's not
9 a blacktop, and so often things that you say weren't
10 cleared, they might've been cleared that it would've
11 been good enough for a car with all-wheel drive, but
12 it's not gonna work for somebody who's on a bicycle.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So I guess the
14 intent of the legislation that is being pushed by
15 Council Members Greenfield and Van Bramer is that
16 we're able to report back as to the progress or what
17 we did with bike lanes and so far I know while we
18 have a plan on how to address it thereafter...

19 [interpose]

20 KATHRYN GARCIA: We can report back on --
21 and we do reporting back on, you know, how many
22 crosswalks have we done, how many bus stops have we
23 done -- like we keep track of all of that as we move
24 into the later portions, like the latter half of the
25 week, we were definitely keeping track of all of that

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 47

2 information, so we can provide that to the Council,

3 but I'm not sure, without significantly expanding the

4 resources that I actually am achieving what you're

5 looking for.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay and I think

7 that maybe this report is trying to achieve that,

8 make it so that you might need more resources to get

9 this done the proper way and that's okay, but what we

10 need is, again, a report back as to which bike lanes

11 were cleared, how did the bike networks thereafter --

12 Monday, Tuesday or Wednesday -- look in the City of

13 New York prior to a storm, and that there be some

14 attention paid to it. Especially in Queens, some

15 networks were not cleared at all and that was an

16 issue. Queens actually has the largest population of

17 people that use bike lanes to get to work, so when we

18 talk about outside of emergency vehicles, this is a

19 very important way of getting people to work or the

20 only way to get people to work in certain parts of

21 Queens and Brooklyn, and for us to not have that

22 system available at a decent time, that is a big

23 issues.

24 KATHRYN GARCIA: Right; I still think

25 that we may not meet your expectations on time, but

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 48

2 we can certainly provide information on when certain
3 bike lanes are clear.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay.

5 KATHRYN GARCIA: But I just... I don't
6 wanna oversell that it's... I think what you are
7 looking for I do not have the resources or the people
8 to do.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So we should have a
10 conversation, or at least with the writers of the
11 introduction, and really see what it is we're looking
12 for and see where we could compromise and get to a
13 place where everyone's satisfied that we'll get the
14 information and it'll be a priority and it'll get
15 done; that's what I think the folks are looking for.
16 And then the greenways, I understand, the greenways
17 or any Parks Department bike lanes and so forth have
18 to be addressed through them, and that would be
19 something that -- would it be something that the
20 Emergency Management could ask of the Parks
21 Department as to what their plan is to remove snow
22 from what they're responsible for?

23 KATHRYN GARCIA: The only thing... I
24 actually think... before they answer -- just remember,

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 49

2 I take a lot of their equipment for the roads, so
3 they may be thinned at the beginning of a storm.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Do you have
5 anything to add?

6 JIM ESPOSITO: No, Chairman; I just wanna
7 reiterate that operational plans belong to each and
8 every agency; we do not publish operational plans on
9 our website; we can take information about, you know,
10 the percentage of streets cleared per borough or
11 whatever that information may look like, whatever the
12 datasets are and put them up, but as far as the
13 operational plans and the resources and the
14 expenditures, that belongs to the agencies and that's
15 who we would direct those questions to.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right; we always
17 have concerns over interagency communication and
18 who's responsible for what and when you think snow
19 removal, folks might assume it's all DSNY, and what
20 we wanna do is, be able to make sure we know who's
21 responsible for what, so that when it doesn't get
22 one, we can hold them accountable and I guess maybe
23 the details of the report are what we're asking for;
24 might not necessarily need to be published on the
25 website, but who's responsible for it and whether or

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 50
2 not they got it done is something people wanna see,
3 or Council Members wanna see.

4 JIM ESPOSITO: You know I understand
5 that, but that would belong to the agency's specific
6 plan... [interpose]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right, but you
8 can't ask the Parks Department to give you something
9 that speaks to the work that they did in removing
10 **[inaudible]** [background comment]? I think that's
11 what... So I think maybe the legislation itself is
12 written too detailed or too onerous for your liking,
13 but I think with conversations with the co-sponsors
14 of the bill, I think we can get to a place where we
15 can make this happen. But again, thank you very much
16 and I assume that after a snowstorm this dais would
17 be filled, so we'll see you then... [interpose]

18 KATHRYN GARCIA: You're finding yourself
19 lonely on this fall day...

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: No... I know. No,
21 listen, I'm here with Council Member Matteo and all
22 the love I have for Staten Island, so it's already a
23 good day.

24 KATHRYN GARCIA: **[inaudible]** a beautiful
25 day.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 51

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: There you go.

3 [laugh] Thank you guys, and as of now, this meeting
4 is adjourned.

5 [gavel]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 27, 2016