CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

Subcommittee on Zoning & Franchises

----- X

August 6, 2024 Start: 11:18 a.m. Recess: 11:59 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm., 16th Fl.

B E F O R E: Kevin C. Riley

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu
David M. Carr
Kamillah Hanks
Francisco P. Moya

Yusef Salaam Lynn C. Schulman A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to today's New York City Council Subcommittee hearing for the Committee on Zoning and Franchises. At this time, please silence all cellphones and electronic devices to minimize disruptions throughout the hearing. Thank you for your cooperation. Chair, we're ready to begin.

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Good morning everyone and welcome to a meeting of the Subcommittee of Zoning and Franchises. I'm Council Member Kevin Riley, Chair of the Subcommittee. Today, I'm joined by Council Member Moya, Schulman, Marmorato. we are scheduled to vote on eight different proposals. The first proposal has been a long-time in the making, and there's an exciting opportunity for the Bronx. Four new metro north stations are scheduled to be constructed by the MTA by 2027 in the Bronx at Co-op City, Parkchester/Van Nest, Morris Park, and Hunt's Point. Not only will these four new stations provide the Bronx with new, better public transportation, but they will also provide an opportunity to create a new affordable housing and more jobs. Known as the Bronx Metro-North Station

proposal is an exciting opportunity for the Bronx

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING & FRANCHISES 2 because we need new housing, especially affordable 3 housing. We've just been joined by Majority Leader 4 Amanda Farias. If we do not build more housing, 5 communities in the Bronx will continue to get priced out. So we need to act. But this does not mean we 6 7 should just build anywhere. We can ask as high as we 8 can. New buildings have to take into account that the surrounding context in existing residents. Development should not be disproportionately bigger 10 11 than neighborhoods' buildings. Therefore, we are 12 recommending several modifications to these proposals to achieve this balance. In the section of rezoning 13 that will be near the new Morris Park Metro-North 14 15 Station, we are recommending less density in this area, and capping building heights. This will still 16 17 create an opportunity for the creation of much-needed 18 housing. It will also allow the expansion of the 19 medical campuses around Morris Park which will 20 provide more jobs while also being sensitive to 21 existing homes in nearby lower density areas. Another modification we are recommending is to make 2.2 2.3 the rezoning more contextual at 1601 Bronxdale Avenue, one of the largest sites of the rezoning. 24

Here we must recognize its proximity to lower density

recommending the removal of two relatively small

to make sure that the families that move into these

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

million in the communities that will be impacted by

Members whose communities in the Bronx will be

3

4

5

6

7

_

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

1920

21

22

23

24

25

directly affected by the Administration's proposal as an opportunity to comment. I will now give the floor to Majority Leader Farías.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Thank you, Chair Today, we are voting to bring a long overdue investment to the Bronx with four new Metro-North stations. The approval of this rezoning will create much-needed housing, more jobs, facilitate pedestrian safety upgrades, additional transit options, and substantial infrastructure investment throughout the rezoning area. The design features laid out in this plan are informed by the extensive community outreach I initiated along with the City Council Planning and Land Use teams. Over the last several months I hosted four in-person and virtual events in Parkchester allowing my constituents multiple opportunities to discuss the proposals with the Department of City Planning and local developers. This was critical in ensuring neighbors could provide direct feedback on the essential aspects of maintaining the culture of our shared community. heard feedback on the type of community space needed, what types of infrastructure enhancements we'd like to see, and had detailed conversations about

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

investments that are needed throughout the communities currently. I am particularly excited to approve a project that is mandating affordable Through modifications, no less than 25 housing. percent of units created in Council District 18 will be provided to households at an average of 60 percent of the area median income. In other words, that means the housing will be affordable to the average Bronx family who is already living there. As Chair Riley noted, we are modifying two R8X areas near Parkchester to create more flexibility to provide much-needed amenities such as additional parking, retail and community space, open green space and accessibility. I want to thank the hundreds of community members who came to our public info sessions and filled out our survey to guide us to this decision. While I'm proud to champion housing development in this proposal, I'm equally as proud of the City investments that I have secured in this process. I have been at the negotiating table day and night over this extended period of time fighting to deliver key wins for the future of Parkchester, Castle Hill and our surrounding communities. Through this rezoning, Parkchester in District 18 can expect

upgrade, sewer improvements, and water line repairs,

are all long-term Bronxites, and the success of this

2 rezoning is a testament to our collaboration and

3 dedication to neighborhoods that made us, and our

4 love for our home boroughs of the Bronx. This

5 rezoning is the future of our borough, a future with

6 more access to jobs, greater transit, new space for

7 community connections and organizations, state of the

8 art housing for everyone, and safer streets. And

9 with that, I urge my colleagues to vote aye.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Majority

11 Leader. Council Member Marmorato?

10

25

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you,

13 Chair Riley. Members of District 13 that are here

14 | today or at home listening, I speak to you directly.

15 | I know that when the proposal of the Bronx Metro-

16 North was introduced to District 13, many within our

17 community anticipated this project with excitement,

18 | myself included, but once the proposal to create

19 | housing was presented to us, many of us had concerns

20 of how this would impact and affect our community in

21 | everyday life. So, it's an honor to be in this role

22 | to help navigate what our vision of development in

23 \parallel District 13 should look like. Today, we stand at a

24 pivotal moment for our community. In countless

meetings, my constituents and I have made it clear

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

that we are not anti-development. We care deeply about our neighborhoods, and it's our duty to ensure the integrity, fabric and content of district, that it remains intact. The original proposal that was presented to us in January threatened to alter our community in an unacceptable and irreversible way, but through tireless consultations with our City Council Planning, Land Use team, District 13 constituents and key community stakeholders, we have fought and won significant modifications alongside a package of real capital investment to District 13. And I want to be clear, I understand the desire to build housing. However, one size does not fit all, and it's my job to represent and fight for what our district wants and needs. I have listened to you and fought to make sure the Administration heard our needs loud and clear. We have capped building heights throughout the rezoning area to maintain our community's character. This means that new developments will not overshadow our homes, streets, preserving the skyline and ambiance to make our neighborhood unique. We have reduced density along Eastchester Road and floor area potential near Morris Park Station to respect our low-density neighborhood

creating parking for our district and our residents.

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Parking is essential for daily activities such as dropping children off at school or practice, grabbing groceries for the week, and even commuting to work. By reinstating parking mandates, we provide the community with the promise of accessibility, transportation and the ability to fully commute within our district and beyond. We also have a commitment from the Administration to create a parking lot near one of our District 13 stations. And since the beginning of this process, especially since taking office, I have been firm that any changes in zoning must align with our community's vision and come with substantial city investment in our community. Our working class families in our borough and our district have been largely disregarded by the City for decades, and this must change. It will change now. We need improvements to our parks, substantial upgrades to our sewers, and flood prone streets, and respect for the suburban lifestyle that has brought many families to the East Bronx for generations. I am proud to announce the following commitments from the Administration based on our tireless efforts. With the influx of people

coming in our area, we need to invest in our

community's public safety and law enforcement 2 3 agencies. They are the fabric of our neighborhoods and the front line workers that protect our 4 neighbors, children, and communities. I am so proud to have secured \$10 million for substantial upgrades 6 to rehabilitate and modernize the 49th precinct. These funds will ensure that our police officers have 8 the resources and facilities they need to keep our community safe and secure for now and in the future. 10 11 Thank you to our officers for everything that you do, 12 and we hope to see your new and improved precincts soon. You guys really do deserve it. The current 13 Morris Park families and the new families that come 14 15 to our district need quality parks and playgrounds. 16 With the highest rates of asthma, we need to invest 17 in greenspace in our parks. I have secured more than 18 \$50 million to upgrade Loreto Park, Bufano Park, but 19 anybody in my district calls it Waterbury Park, Brady 20 Park and the Pelham Bay Park ball fields. 21 ensuring that they host families for many, many years 2.2 to come. These upgrades will include new 2.3 playgrounds, equipment, improved landscaping, and enhance safety features creating a vibrant and 24

welcoming space for our children to play and for our

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

1213

14

15

1617

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

community to gather. Long-neglected streets like Bassett Avenue, Stillwell Avenue, Eastchester Road will finally receive the significant upgrades including lighting, sidewalks, intersection, and traffic monitoring improvements, addressing our community's concerns about traffic and congestion on the roadway. These improvements will make our streets safer for pedestrians and drivers alike, reducing accidents and improving the overall quality of life for our travelers, and we are supposed to-tonight, we're supposed to have some type of flooding here in our district, I guess throughout the whole city, but this is nothing new to District 13. I have firsthand witnesses the damage caused to our home streets, due to the lack of effective sewer and draining infrastructure. Knowing this, I would not allowed any new construction or building to happen without commitments of improvements to our infrastructure. I'm proud to have secured nearly \$200 million from the DEP to study and implement upgrades to flood-prone areas such as Bassett Avenue, Marconi Street, Stillwell Avenue, and the Morris Park area, ensuring that our community does not continue

to get damaged or washed out during this type of rain

be about has been absolutely amazing, and I

2 appreciate it. I also want to thank my team, the

3 District 13 team, for holding down our district

4 office throughout this process, and most importantly,

5 my Chief of Staff April Cardena [sp?]. You have been

6 | solid throughout this process and I appreciate the

7 long days and night you have put in alongside me.

Thank you. Thank you, Chair. And I vote aye.

8

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council

10 Member Marmorato. We've been joined by Council

11 | Member Restler. The second proposal we are voting on

12 | today is to approve with modifications LUs 101

13 | through 104 concerning a proposal known as Arthur

14 Kill terminal. The proposal consists of creating a

15 manufacturing staging area for assembly of wind

16 turbines just south of the outer bridge crossing in

17 | Minority Leader Borelli's district. We have seen

18 once again this summer, climate change is here, and

19 \parallel as a city we need to reduce our carbon footprint. A

20 critical way to achieve this is to increase the

21 | supply of renewable energy. This proposal was a key

22 | component to constructing new wind turbine off the

23 | coast of New York State. The Arthur Kill Terminal

24 proposal involves four actions. The first proposed

25 action involves a text amendment to the special South

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Richmond development district. The text amendment would update the goals of the special district to recognize the need to create new sources of renewable It will also expand the special district's eneray. authorization to specifically address projects to seek to support eh City's green energy infrastructure. The second action is to land a fill-- is a land fill action to create the needed dock on the portion of the site that is under water along the shore. The third action is a special permit to increase maximum building heights which would accommodate the needed components of the wind turbines. And the fourth action is to de-map a portion of Richmond Valley Road. We're recommending proposed modification to the text amendment application to ensure that in order to receive a City Planning Authorization for any needed flexibility in the zoning, that the project must support the City's green energy infrastructure which the Arthur Kill Terminal does do. Minority Leader Borelli supports this proposal as modified. The third vote is to approve LUs 122 and 123 relating to the Prince Point development proposal located at the southern of Staten Island also within Minority Leader Borelli's

2 district. The requested action together will 3 facilitate the establishment of the new mapped streets and the development of a 108 detached single-4 family homes in the Prince Bay neighborhood and in the special South Richmond Development district. 6 7 proposal includes two actions. The first is a city map amendment to map four new streets. The second is 8 a zoning text amendment related to the vesting [sic] provisions in the special district, and more 10 11 specifically to facilitate certain development 12 approved prior to the adoption of lower density 13 growth management areas. Minority Leader Borelli is 14 in support of this proposal. The fourth vote is to 15 approve with modifications LUs 114, 115, and 116 relating to the 500 Kent Avenue proposal located in 16 17 Williamsburg neighborhood in Brooklyn within Council 18 Member Restler's district. The requested actions 19 will facilitate the development of a new 23-story 20 commercial office building with ground floor retail, 21 234 parking spaces, over 49,000 square feet of public 2.2 accessible open space which will include 2.3 approximately 23,000 square foot waterfront public access area. The proposal consists of three actions. 24 The first is a zoning map amendment to change the 25

2 existing M3-1 district to an M1-5 district. There

3 are also two related zoning special permits which

4 | will permit the modification of certain bulk

5 regulations on waterfront blocks and also permit a

6 parking garage with 234 parking spaces. With this

7 proposal we are recommending a modification to the

8 restricted declaration which accompanies the special

9 permits approved by the City Planning Commission to

10 ensure that all traffic mitigations required by the

11 | project's environmental impact statement are

12 | implemented in a timely matter. Council Member

13 Restler is in support of this proposal as modified,

14 and I would like to give the floor to Council Member

15 Restler to give any remarks.

1

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I just want to firstly say it always a pleasure to be with Chair Riley in this subcommittee. Chair Riley does a tremendous job and we're fortunate to have him in this critical role. You know, I'm very proud that District 33 has generated more new housing than any other council district in the City of New York for about 15 years. And with the two land use actions that we're advancing today, we will both expand

housing and affordable housing where it's terribly

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

needed, and we will also create an exciting new economic development project in both-- both projects are in the heart of the South Williamsburg/Bed-Stuy community. The first project on Myrtle Avenue, 712, will generate over 40 units of housing, be an MIH option one project that generates deeply affordable housing for the Orange County. The development team has been an absolutely pleasure to work with. They are deeply rooted in our community, care about our neighborhood. They've even agreed to make some modest community facility space available to a great organization, [inaudible] that does this beautiful thing where they provide rides to people who need to go to medical appointments or family members who are visiting family members who are in medical care at no cost, but that extraordinary volunteer operation happens at -- you know, from people's homes. Now, we'll finally have a home-base where those volunteers can better coordinate those rides at this new residential development -- mixed-used development I should say. And the other project, 500 Kent, is one that we have painstakingly negotiated since before I was even on the City Council. The development team approached me when I was Council Member-elect, and I

| 2 | wasn't ever sure that we were going to get this |
|----|------------------------------------------------------|
| 3 | project done. There were some very, I think, big |
| 4 | open concerns. My number one concern was that this |
| 5 | project could that the zoning that we're approving |
| 6 | could allow for a last-mile [sic] facility. But |
| 7 | thanks to, I think, a development team an applicant |
| 8 | team that was willing to work with us creatively, |
| 9 | care deeply about partnering with the community. We |
| 10 | were able to develop a project where we have total |
| 11 | confidence that this will never, ever be a last-mile |
| 12 | facility, and I'm optimistic that we're going to |
| 13 | create some great jobs and a great project in the |
| 14 | heart of South Williamsburg connected to the Navy |
| 15 | Yard. I really want to thank everybody who's been a |
| 16 | part of both of these projects. At 712 Myrtle, Rabbi |
| 17 | A. Lichtenstein and Ms. Lichtenstein have been a |
| 18 | pleasure to work with. At 500 Kent I really want to |
| 19 | thank the Council team, especially William Vidal |
| 20 | [sp?], who's not here today, but was instrumental in |
| 21 | us coming up with a creative solution to make this |
| 22 | happen. Lina [sp?] from Council Land Use, Brian from |
| 23 | Council Land Use have both been tremendous patterns |
| 24 | and guides. My staff, Molly Hailey [sp?] in |
| 25 | particular, has been really helpful. I want to thank |

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Ashley Thompson from Capilino [sp?] who is always an honest broker and a helpful partner in navigating projects in our district, and I want to lastly but perhaps most importntlhy thank UJO and Rabbi Niederman who developed a joint application with the applicant partner that really gave me confidence that this was a project that would be for the betterment to my community. And you know, we take a bit of a leap of faith as Council Members in approving land use changes, that what applicants tell us or what they will actually do, and in this instance, I think we have real protections to have confidence that the 500 Kent project is going to be what we have been And so I really just want to think everybody for their support and guidance on both of the lease land use actions. I'm really happy to hear-- happy that we're continuing to build more housing and create more economic opportunity in District 33. It's a good day for our community. So, thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council
Member Restler. The fifth vote is to approve with
modifications LUs 120 and 121 relating to the 712
Myrtle Avenue proposal located in Bedford Stuyvesant

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

neighborhood in Brooklyn, also within Council Member Restler's district. The promised development consists of new nine-story mixed-use building projected to have approximately 62 units, including 15, permanently affordable housing and ground floor retail. The proposal consists of two actions. first is a zoning map amendment to change an existing M1-2 district to an R73/C20-4 district. The related actions of the zoning text amendment to map a mandatory inclusionary housing area. modification will be to remove MIH option two and to add the deep affordability option, which will make 20 to 25 percent of the proposed income restricted apartments permanently affordable. Council Member Restler supports this proposal as modified. sixth vote is approve with modifications, LUs 117 and 118, relating to the 3033 Avenue V proposal located in Sheepshead Bay Neighborhood in Brooklyn, and within Council Member Narcisse district. This proposed development consists of a new nine-story mixed-use building projected to have approximately 109 units including 27 affordable apartments and ground floor retail. The proposal consists of two The first is a zoning map amendment to

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

29

related to the 197 Berry Street proposal located in the Williamsburg neighborhood in Brooklyn within Council Member Gutiérrez district. The proposal will rezone an area within the existing special mixed-use district which will have the effect of reducing the required accessory parking requirements applicable to an existing building. The proposed consists of a zoning map amendment to change the existing M1-2/R6B district to an M1-4/R6B district within the existing special MX-8 mixed use district. Council Member Gutiérrez is in support of this proposal. The final vote for today is a vote to recommend the disapproval of LU 124, a petition for Wings and Seafood Incorporation seeking a revocable consent for a sidewalk café located at 785 Fairview Avenue in

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Queens in Council Member Holden's district. This Subcommittee held a public hearing on July 24th, 2024 at which serious concerns and quality of life issues concerning this proposed sidewalk café would raise by Council Member Holden and whose district this restaurant is located. The Council Member -- Council Member Holden has provided the following statement explaining why this disapproval is warranted which he had asked that I read into the record. He thanked He said, "Thank you, Chair Riley and members of the Subcommittee for the opportunity to address you regarding the application D2450087057SWQ Wings and Seafood seeking the revocable consent to operate a sidewalk café at 785 Fairview Avenue in Ridgewood within Community District Five. I am opposed to this application for several reasons. One, underutilization and misuse. This outdoor dining setup is rarely used and often repurposed for storage or decorated purposes. Such misuse of public space in unacceptable. Two, excessive occupation of public space, the combination of sidewalk café and outdoor dining is excessive. The sidewalk is a critical public pathway located at the entrance/exit of the Forest Avenue M Train station. It is across from the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Greater Ridgewood Youth Council Afterschool Program building, IS93, the Queens Library Ridgewood Branch, and Rosemary Playground. Private entities should not monopolize public spaces for profit, especially in such a heavily trafficked area. Three, unauthorized construction: the application constructed the sidewalk café structure before obtaining approval, resulting in the Department of Buildings violation for extending the building without permits. disregard of regulation is concerning. During the July 24th, Subcommittee hearing, the owner responses where insufficient and demonstrated a lack of understanding and sincerity about the violation and community concerns. Additionally, we have received many complaints from residents and the owner failed to provide evidence of community support for both the roadway dining and sidewalk café, contrary to their The lack of community support for this claims. establishment is clear indication of community strong opposition. Ridgewood is a heavily congested community with many pedestrians utilizing sidewalks and cars being parked. This establishment has shown disregard for both pedestrians and vehicular needs. Given these issues, I urge my colleagues to vote no

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

32 or vote yes to disapprove on this sidewalk café application. The establishment has shown a genuine commitment to working -- has not shown a genuine commitment to working with the community and approving this application will set a concerning precedent. Thank you for consideration -- considering my position on this matter." That concludes the content of Council Member Holden's remarks. Counsel, are there any Council Members with questions or remarks at this time? Appearing remotely who have questions or remarks of today's items should use the raise hand button now. Counsel in any members in order that the hands are raised want to ask questions? There being no members with questions, I will now call for a vote to approve with modifications LUs 101, 102, 103, and 104 relating to the Arthur Kill Terminal proposal, to approve with modifications LUs 106, 107, 109, 110, 111, 112, 113 relating to the Bronx Metro-North Station area proposal, to approve with modifications LUs 114, 115, or 116 related to the 500 Kent Avenue rezoning proposal, to approve with modifications LUs 117 and 118 relating to the 3033 Avenue V rezoning proposal, to approve LUs 119 relating to the 197 Berry Street

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING & FRANCHISES 33 |
|----|-------------------------------------------------------|
| 2 | rezoning proposal, to approve with modifications LUs |
| 3 | 120 and 121 relating to the 712 Myrtle Avenue |
| 4 | rezoning proposal, to approve LUs 122 and 123 |
| 5 | relating to the Prince Point development proposal, |
| 6 | and to disapprove LUs 124 relating to the Wings and |
| 7 | Seafood sidewalk café proposal. Counsel, please call |
| 8 | the roll. |
| 9 | COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Riley? |
| 10 | CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Aye. |
| 11 | COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Moya? |
| 12 | COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye. |
| 13 | COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Abreu? |
| 14 | COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye. |
| 15 | COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member |
| 16 | Schulman? |
| 17 | COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye. |
| 18 | COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, by a vote of |
| 19 | four in the affirmative, 0 in opposition and no |
| 20 | abstentions, the items are approved or approved with |
| 21 | modifications as you've just described except LU 124, |
| 22 | the Wings and Seafood sidewalk café application which |
| 23 | is disapproved. All items are referred to the full |

Land Use Committee.

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING & FRANCHISES 34 |
|----|------------------------------------------------------|
| 2 | CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. We will |
| 3 | close the vote. That concludes today's business. I |
| 4 | would like to thank the members of the public, my |
| 5 | colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land Use and other |
| 6 | Council staff, the Sergeant at Arms participating in |
| 7 | today's meeting. This meeting is hereby adjourned. |
| 8 | [gavel] |
| 9 | |
| 10 | |
| 11 | |
| 12 | |
| 13 | |
| 14 | |
| 15 | |
| 16 | |
| 17 | |
| 18 | |
| 19 | |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date August 13, 2024