

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

----- X

February 27, 2018
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 12:00 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.
14th Fl.

B E F O R E: MARK LEVINE
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alicia Ampry-Samuel
Inez D. Barron
Mathieu Eugene
Keith Powers

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dr. Aletha Maybank, Deputy Commissioner
Center for Health Equity
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

Dr. Torian Easterling, Assistant Commissioner
Birth Equity Program
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

Cassie Toner, Assistant Commissioner
Division Management & Division of Finance
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

Jane Bedell, Assist. Commissioner & Medical Director
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, Bronx Office

Javier Lopez, Assistant Commissioner
Bureau of Systems Partnerships
Center for Health Equity
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

Sheila Katzman, President
International Association for Women in Radio & TV
Steering Committee Chair, NYC 4 CEDAW Act

Mary Luke, President,
U.S. National Committee for UN Women
Metro New York Chapter

Juan Pinzon, Director of Health Services
Community Service Society, CSS

2 [sound check, pause] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Good morning,
4 everybody. Good morning. We're going to get
5 started. I'm Mark Levine. I'm pleased to be the new
6 Chair of the City Council's Health Committee. I'm
7 very excited about this hearing. I'm pleased that
8 we're joined by Dr. Mathieu Eugene, Council Member
9 and fellow member of the committee, and excited about
10 our topic today. We are going to looking at the
11 racial disparities in health outcomes in New York
12 City and the important work of the Center for Health
13 Excellence in addressing those inequities. This is a
14 topic I'm excited to start off with for my inaugural
15 hearing, and one of many pressing concerns that we'll
16 be addressing in this committee from the opioid
17 crisis to the lack of health insurance amongst
18 hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers, and much else.
19 Now, to the big picture. With the overall health and
20 longevity of New Yorkers improving over the last
21 decade, we have unfortunately seen unacceptably high
22 inequities in outcomes, and persistent inequalities
23 in health outcomes among racial and ethnic
24 communities and socio-economic levels in our city.
25 The level of disparity in maternal mortality

2 illustrates this point vividly and painfully. In New
3 York City African-American mothers are a shocking 12
4 times more likely to die than white mothers from
5 complications related to pregnancy, and tragically,
6 the infant mortality rate in 2015 was three times
7 higher for non-Hispanic blacks than for non-Hispanic
8 whites, and 2.3 times higher for Puerto Ricans than
9 for non-Hispanic whites. I'm not sure why we have
10 the data on Puerto Ricans, and not all Latinos, but a
11 disturbing point nonetheless. Even the current flu
12 epidemic, the worst our city has seen in years is
13 impact by inequality of the vaccination rates for
14 African-American seniors is 19% lower than that of
15 white seniors. We also know that health outcomes can
16 vary dramatically based simply on your zip code. A
17 child living in West Harlem in my district is eight
18 time more likely to be hospitalized for asthma than a
19 child in Borough Park. Adults in West Harlem are six
20 times more likely to be hospitalized for diabetes
21 than they are—than those in Greenwich Village and
22 Soho, and despite a decrease in infant mortality
23 across the city, the rate in West Harlem is still
24 almost five times higher than the rate on the Upper
25 East Side. DOHM's Center for Health Equity was

2 created to tackle this injustice head on pursuing a
3 four pronged strategy. First, internal reforms in
4 the department itself to help staff directly confront
5 racism and other forms of discrimination. Second,
6 neighborhood based strategies to deliver public
7 health services at local offices in East Harlem and
8 South Bronx and Central Brooklyn. So, we were
9 pleased to tour the East Harlem Office last week. An
10 extremely impressive operation, and third the
11 creation of strategic partnerships with faith-based
12 groups and other community organizations, and fourth,
13 communication strategies, which shine a light on
14 racial inequities in our health system. What
15 progress have we made since the Center's founding in
16 closing the racial inequity gaps in health outcomes
17 in New York City? Which of the center's programs
18 have demonstrated the greatest impact? In what ways
19 can we extend and deepen our efforts in order to make
20 further progress in closing the health outcomes gap?
21 We'll explore these and other critical questions in
22 today's hearing as we work towards our common goal of
23 ensuring that all New Yorkers regardless of
24 background can attain the highest level of health.
25 Alright, I'm going to ask our committee counsel now

2 to swear in our administration, those testifying from
3 the administration.

4 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
5 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
6 your testimony before this committee, and to respond
7 honestly to Council Member questions?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: I do.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: [off mic] Okay,
10 please begin. (sic)

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.
12 Good morning Chair Levine and members of the Health
13 Committee. I am Dr. Aletha Maybank, Deputy
14 Commissioner of the Center for Health Equity at the
15 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, and on
16 behalf Commissioner Mary Bassett, we thank you for
17 the opportunity to testify. I would also like to
18 recognize Council Member Eugene, Barron, Ampry-Samuel
19 and Powers for your commitment to health and the
20 wellbeing of New Yorkers, but especially a commitment
21 to health equity. I also want to give a shout to
22 our—our partners that are also here because the work
23 that we do really is partnership with those who are
24 here in the audience. It really wouldn't be
25 possible, and for those who know, there are slides

2 that we have as well with our testimony. Much like
3 other cities in our country, but at the same time
4 unique in its own way, New York City is best
5 understood when appreciating the distinctive
6 characteristics of our respective neighborhoods.
7 These characteristics that we can be proud of and
8 promote, but also those that illustrate significant
9 differences in the lives that are being lived across
10 these same neighborhoods. An 11-year gap in life
11 expectancy currently exists in our city between the
12 Financial District in Manhattan and Brownsville in
13 Brooklyn. Stark inequities exist across other key
14 outcomes like infant mortality, premature mortality
15 as well as health conditions such as asthma, diabetes
16 and mental illness. We refer to these disparities in
17 health as health inequities. They are a consequence
18 of well documented social inequities that exist at
19 the neighborhood level. They include concentrations
20 of poverty, differences related to education and
21 housing and incarceration. We call these drivers the
22 social determinants of health, and they often keep
23 our residents from living their healthiest lives. We
24 have known for quite some time that health inequities
25 are not a biological phenomenon, but are the result

2 of long tendered systems of racism that have
3 segregated and assaulted communities of color.
4 During the history of our institutions and
5 government, unjust policies and practices have
6 yielded inequitable health outcomes. So, dismantling
7 systems and structures that perpetuate injustice
8 requires a commitment to equity beyond equality. We
9 must recognize that people do not start their lives
10 with equal power and privilege, and without the
11 advancement of equity, and what is fair and just,
12 there can be no equality. While the national
13 conversation regarding inequity is often
14 characterized by class particularly in regards to
15 wealth, in our city inequity is particularly and
16 principally a matter of racism. The history of the
17 New York City includes the systemic segregation of
18 people of color into neighborhoods that were deprived
19 of resources for decades. To this day, these
20 neighborhoods still carry the burden of decisions
21 made through the prism of racism. At the beginning
22 of Commissioner Bassett's tenure, she committed the
23 department to equity, justice and inclusion. The
24 Principal demonstration of this was the formation of
25 the Center for Health Equity. The Center prioritizes

2 the department's work on the elimination of health
3 inequities, which are rooted in historical and
4 contemporary injustices and discrimination, and with
5 that commitment came an understanding of the city's
6 historical role in executing injustice and our
7 present responsibility to undo it. The center's
8 first role is to reform our own institution. We're
9 working to transform the Health Department into a
10 racial just, multicultural organization that actively
11 promotes and needs of communities that have been
12 oppressed. These include communities of color and
13 the LGBT community. Our second role is to expand the
14 narrative around what creates health and make
15 injustices visible through the department's data. We
16 seek to elevate the stories of those directly
17 affected and the efforts to confront it. The third
18 role is to invest in neighborhoods with some of the
19 worst health outcomes in our city. As a city agency,
20 we also recognize our influence to inspire and
21 encourage change. To encourage change. Sorry. Our
22 fourth role is to engage sister agencies and other
23 institutions and to provide guidance and support on
24 how best they can advance equity and health in their
25 work. To support health on the local level, we

2 cannot just be deciders, but far more often we need
3 to be followers and supporters, and today I want to
4 share with you some of the efforts or our reform with
5 our institution and also how we are investing in our
6 key neighborhoods. In 2016, the Center for Health
7 Equity launched Race to Justice, our internal reform
8 effort. We understand, as mentioned before that
9 structural racism is the fundamental cause of health
10 inequities in our nation, and through this initiative
11 We are learning more about how racism operates within
12 our institution. That is why we are engaging staff
13 in conversations about race, power and privilege. We
14 are also facilitating trainers to improve staff
15 capacity to undue racism, and gender bias, and to
16 recognize how implicit bias affects us all. Finally,
17 we are fostering leadership for racial and gender
18 equity and advancement. The department is working
19 collaboratively with experts in this field, and other
20 cities engaged in similar efforts all across this
21 country. In order to ensure dissemination and
22 sustainability of this effort we have organized a
23 diverse group of core team members and staff
24 champions from across the department, and their work
25 is really focused on four particular areas:

2 Communications and organizational identity; Community
3 engagement and partnerships; workforce equity and
4 development; and equitable contracting and budgeting
5 practices. A key part for implementing Race to
6 Justice is really normalizing conversations within a
7 department around race, gender and LGBTQ issues as
8 well as power, privilege and equity. Since we began
9 this effort in 2016, over 5,000 staff have received
10 some form of training on these topics, and we
11 anticipate that all staff will have received training
12 over the next three years on racism and gender
13 equity, which is in alignment with the city's race
14 and gender equity legislation that was passed by
15 Council in 2017, and we commend our Council as well
16 as the Administration for moving forward on this
17 important issue. This learning lens is already
18 starting to change the way we do work at the Health
19 Department. Our epidemiologists have changed how
20 they present neighborhood level data to show more
21 clearly the inequities that exist across the
22 neighborhoods. The most recent community health
23 profile showed data by community board, the local
24 geography that parallels what most New Yorkers
25 identify as their neighborhoods. This has made the

2 data more accessible and readable for residents and
3 advocates alike. Our emergency preparedness staff
4 have revisited how the city organizes and deploys
5 staff in the even of a public health emergency or a
6 natural disaster, and they are working to ensure that
7 qualified leadership is equitably—equitably located
8 in all neighborhoods across New York City in times of
9 crisis. Our Early Intervention Program provides
10 services to children under three years who are
11 experiencing developmental delays and disabilities,
12 and after documenting an unequal pattern, the Early
13 Intervention staff asked questions about well why are
14 black children not utilizing these free eligible
15 services in the way that Latina, Asian and white
16 children were in the city. The program is now
17 building demand by getting out the news about these
18 free services and educating providers in prioritized
19 neighborhoods. While we are not the first
20 institution to seek to become a racial just
21 organization in the country, we have started a
22 transformative process. It is one that we are
23 working with our sister agencies to amplify.
24 However, we cannot wait of our institutions to
25 transform. We must also serve the communities who

2 need help now. That is why we are also focusing
3 efforts in neighborhoods that have long experienced
4 public and private disinvestment and have endured
5 some of the worst health outcomes in our city. Our
6 recently established Neighborhood Action Centers
7 stand on the shoulder of the District Public Health
8 Offices that were established in 2002. It also draws
9 on the history of over a century ago of the district
10 health centers in New York City. These were started
11 under Mayor La Guardia and these were meant to serve
12 those too poor to pay for private doctors and make
13 additional resources available to physicians working
14 in these neighborhoods. The District Health Center
15 movement sought to institutionalize coordination
16 between city agencies, community partners and the
17 neighborhood residents in order to foster collective
18 action, and so for over a decade, the District Public
19 Health Officers, which are located—were located in
20 South Bronx, East Harlem and Brooklyn developed and
21 implemented programs, conducted primary research and
22 participated in coalitions and worked with other
23 agencies on local projects all at the neighborhood
24 level. And many strong initiatives started within
25 these offices and continue today including our New

2 York City Teens Connection, our Teen Pregnancy
3 Prevention Program, which started in the South Bronx
4 and recently expanded to Central Brooklyn and Norther
5 Central Island–Staten Island, and the programs reach
6 and impact continues to grow. Teen pregnancy rates
7 in New York City declined 60% from 2000 to 2015, and
8 the racial disparity has narrowed considerably.

9 Asthma continues to be the leading cause of
10 hospitalization, emergency room visits and
11 absenteeism among our children. The East Harlem
12 Asthma Center for Excellence has served the needs of
13 thousands of children with asthma and their families
14 since 2008, and from the period of 2008 to 2014, the
15 program graduates have experienced significant
16 reductions in emergency room department visits and
17 hospitalizations due to asthma. In Brooklyn, our
18 office worked with the Department of Transportation
19 to facilitate a participatory planning effort, to
20 bring 28 miles of bike lanes to Brownsville in East
21 New York. Neighborhoods with little infrastructure
22 in the way of supporting active transportation. This
23 effort was critical to promote physical activity, but
24 also to give residents increased freedom to move
25 about the city. Our team is now working to ensure

2 that that Citi Bike expands fairly by promoting
3 accessibility and affordability to neighborhoods that
4 could also benefit from bike share. We have also
5 sought to elevate and address a major concern of
6 residents and ours, which is gun violence in New York
7 City. Our Cure Violence Program provides
8 alternatives to violence. It's a neighborhood based
9 health intervention focused to decrease violence and
10 shift community norms around violence within the
11 neighborhood. The program is now in in 18 sites in
12 neighborhoods that have historically been impacted by
13 gun violence and gun related homicides. This
14 neighborhood based approach, which is also in
15 partnership with the Mayor's Office of Criminal
16 Justice is part of the reason why there are only 290
17 murders in New York City in 2017 compared to 335
18 murders the previous year. It is because of all
19 these successes and really the persistent gaps that
20 we see on health inequities that we are committed to
21 focusing on these neighborhoods, and figuring out
22 even better approaches, and to this end, last year,
23 we launched our Neighborhood Health Action Center in
24 which we've taken underutilized apartment buildings
25 and revitalized them by co-locating community-based

2 organizations, city agencies and clinical health
3 service organizations all under one roof. We have
4 introduced new activities and programs in these sites
5 and centers, and they prevent convening spaces for
6 the public to hold events, family wellness weeks that
7 offer support to mothers, families and their—and
8 fathers, and plans also for community kitchens and
9 teaching kitchens. We see partners are meeting and
10 they are organizing and they're mapping out their
11 efforts within and outside of our walls. The Action
12 Centers are located in respective neighborhoods of
13 Tremont, East Harlem and Brownsville. Through co-
14 location of services of and programs, we are better
15 able to collectively serve community members, act as
16 an engine of improved asset linkages, identify gaps
17 in coverage and reduce duplication of services. A
18 key partner in this effort has been NYC Health Plus
19 Hospital whose health centers operate in several of
20 our locations, and we—and having IDNYC on site in
21 East Harlem and Tremont has brought many New Yorkers
22 into our doors. We have also brought on a team of
23 community health workers, and staff to support
24 neighborhood residents to navigate what is available
25 in the building, and to re-road them to additional

2 services within our neighborhoods. Governance
3 councils are being formed to provide partners and
4 residents an opportunity to guide our work so that we
5 can work in partnership and have it be more
6 meaningful. The East Harlem Action Center has
7 numerous co-located partners, some of which are in
8 the room today. These partners include the
9 Association to Benefit Children, Concrete Safaris,
10 Public Health Solutions, and Smart University. The
11 Departments of Health—the Departments of—Department
12 of Health Harlem Advocacy Partner Program, which is
13 our Community Health Worker Initiative, provides over
14 800 residents in our NYCHA developments with one-one
15 on coaching. And over 1,700 residents have
16 participated in group wellness activities such as
17 Shape Up and walking groups, and over the last year,
18 the East Harlem Action Center received over 16,000
19 visits. The Brownsville Action Center has a
20 particular focus on reducing racial disparities and
21 the rates of infant mortality and severe maternal
22 morbidity. The Action Center features services
23 provided by our co-located partners like Health and
24 Hospitals, Adult Pediatric Clinical Services and
25 Brownsville Multi-Service Family Health Centers HIV

2 Care Coordination, Cardiology and Nutritional
3 Services. Another Center partner Brooklyn Perinatal
4 Network provides emotional support programming and
5 peer education trainings to neighborhood women and
6 their families. Over the last year, the Brownsville
7 Action Center has received nearly 14,000 visits. And
8 at our Tremont site we are providing primary care as
9 well as teen pregnancy and opioid overdose
10 prevention. I'm proud to announce that last week,
11 the Action Center was officially registered with the
12 state as an opioid overdose prevention program,
13 delivers monthly overdose prevention trainings to
14 community members. The Action Center is also a
15 steering committee member of the #Not 62 Campaign.
16 This campaign supports borough wide efforts to
17 improve the health of Bronx residents. In addition,
18 we are elevating the history of the neighborhood.
19 Earlier this month we launched an exhibit called
20 Undesign the Red Line. The interactive exhibit
21 explores the history of structural racism and wealth
22 inequality, how these designs compounded each other
23 from the 1938 Redlining Map until today, and how
24 residents, our partners and other stakeholders can
25 come together to undesign these systems. Over the

2 last year, the Tremont Neighborhood Health Action
3 Center received over 8,000 visits. The Action Centers
4 also operate as critical conduits to amplifying other
5 work of the Health Department in our neighborhoods.
6 Throughout all Action Centers, we have focus and
7 outreach to residents to help them prevent and
8 control diabetes, and we work with the National
9 Diabetes Prevention Program to support ten community
10 faith-based residents and organizations who deliver
11 year-long workshops for community members reaching
12 over 65,000 New Yorkers each year, and in addition,
13 the Action Center serves as a hub for community
14 members in mental health first aid and also
15 connecting visitors to mental health services. Over
16 the last year, the Action Centers have collectively
17 welcomed over 37,000 visits and provided over 500
18 referrals. We welcome all residents of our
19 neighborhoods, and surrounding areas to visit us
20 soon, and in the words of Action Center's Public
21 Awareness Campaign, we encourage or neighbors to be
22 heard, be powerful and to be here. This is just the
23 start for the Center for Health Equity and the
24 Neighborhood Health Action Centers. A lot of work is
25 being done, and, of course there is much more work

2 that we need to do. Thank you for the opportunity to
3 testify and it's an honor to lead this important
4 mission. I'm happy to take any questions at this
5 point. [pause]

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you very much,
7 Deputy Commissioner for your testimony, and for your
8 work on these important issues. It was wonderful to
9 see you and your team in action at the East Harlem
10 facility. I see we have Dr. Maringo here as well.
11 It's great to up close the kind of impact that being
12 no the ground in the community can have, and I do
13 want to focus on impact.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Sure.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Understanding that
16 we are tackling problems that haven't appeared.
17 They've been decades and generations in the making,
18 and they have myriad causes, many of which are-are-
19 are tied to some of the most ingrained problems we
20 have in society--

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --which you-which
23 you have acknowledge and been quite upfront about
24 appropriately, but having said that, it's important
25 to track our progress on closing these gaps.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

3 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: How is that you
4 measure city's success to wards closing gaps and
5 outcomes where we see such wide disparities based on
6 race and geography and other socio-economic factors?
7 What are the indicators that you're looking to?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.
9 So, as you—as you clearly state, you know, health
10 inequity and solving health inequity is something
11 that we all have a responsibility towards because
12 we're very clear that what creates health has
13 something to do with healthcare, but not sufficient.
14 Something to do with the health—the public health
15 system, but no sufficient, but also factors related
16 to housing and education and other social
17 determinants of health impact. What's going to
18 happen at the neighborhood level, and for us at the
19 Health Department of the years, you know, we—we have
20 our surveillance methods and our community health
21 surveys that I—I mentioned earlier with our Community
22 Health profiles that are issued every year, and
23 that's one way we've been able to measure trends over
24 time, and also our vital statistics, a key role of
25 what a health department does. What we're clear

2 about it, though what, you know, needs to happen
3 moving forward is how do we think about how do we
4 better integrate and find ways to collect and—and
5 look at other data from other institutions that also
6 impact the work at a neighborhood level. And the
7 city is definitely taking a lead in that I know
8 through the Mayor's Office of Operations and looking
9 at social indicators and how they impact health at
10 the neighborhood level, and then we ourselves at the
11 Health Department also for the first time did a
12 Social Determinant of Health Survey as well.
13 Specifically for the neighborhoods and for us and
14 what we're able to do at the Action Centers what
15 we've been fortunate to have is a research and
16 evaluation team at each one of the Action Centers,
17 and over the years, they've been able to at minimum
18 and maximum at times measure definitely and evaluate
19 our programmatic work and how it's been successful
20 and with—with the opportunities that we've had is to
21 really pilot a lot of initiatives at this very local
22 level, and figure out if it works, and if it works
23 then how can replicate it across the city. And a
24 great example is the New York City Teens Connections,
25 which really started in the Bronx, but because it did

2 such a wonderful job, it was recognized nationally,
3 and the CDC actually funded us at one point in time
4 to really expand it to other areas across the city.

5 And so, those are the ways that we've been using our
6 data to really demonstrate impact, but then also grow
7 our programs. We've also been able to look at, and I
8 mentioned earlier our Asthma Initiative in looking at
9 the neighborhood level, and from the time that our
10 Harlem Center has been present from 2008 to 2014,
11 they've been able to actually show they were at one
12 point in time first in hospitalizations from the age
13 of 4 to 14, and now they're actually fourth, which is
14 not great but it's better. And they used to be first
15 in terms of ER, but—so now they're fifth for ages 0
16 to, and so we're able to measure again like on the
17 programmatic level what the impact is and what's been
18 happening with the residents. And I mentioned
19 earlier about Cure Violence and the reduction of
20 violence at the community level. And then we also
21 have our programs and our newer programs such as
22 Harlem Health Advocacy Partners where—again, we're—
23 we're piloting an initiative within our NYCHA houses
24 within Harlem over five developments, and this is a
25 community health worker program, and from the first

2 three years that we have had that, we've been able to
3 demonstrate now at this point in time that we have
4 seen increased satisfaction among our clients that
5 we've seen improved control of diabetes and increased
6 connection to people to follow up with care, and also
7 improve self-reported health, which is pretty
8 significant and important to us. And then another
9 program I just want to highlight that we've been able
10 to demonstrate success with, which is in Brooklyn and
11 this was just published recently in one of the
12 journals is our DOULA Program, which actually helps
13 support our mothers and babies to—to live—want babies
14 to live their first year of life, and also to support
15 mothers' health, but we've been able to demonstrate
16 lower rates of pre-term birth, which is a key driver
17 to infant mortality as well as lower rates of lower
18 birth weight itself, and then also improve patient
19 satisfaction and their engagement with the hospital.
20 So, those are very specific ways in which we're able
21 to do things at a very local level, figure out what's
22 happening and figure out how to—how we can replicate
23 it if possible, and if we find that the results
24 [bell] are good then how do we—we change it around in

2 order for it to kind of do what we would like for it
3 to do.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Right, and—and those
5 are all incredibly impressive, and I—I know that you
6 have a data orientation, which throughout the agency,
7 which is what it takes to do successful public health
8 policy.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: You in your—in your
11 remarks cited trends on asthma, on teen pregnancy
12 rates. I'm not sure whether you cited diabetes, but
13 that's also a well known area where there's a real
14 disparity. I mentioned in my remarks some very
15 painful reports recently about disparities in deaths
16 in childbirth as well as infant mortality rates,
17 which has been a longstanding area of disparity. So,
18 I want to pause it now because we also been joined by
19 our wonderful new colleague here in the Health
20 Committee Keith Powers. Could you give us the global
21 view on where we're at on disparities amongst
22 different racial or socio-economic groups, and any of
23 the areas that I mentioned or others that you might
24 feel are relevant.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: The global
3 view-[laughter]. I-I would-I would say and frame it
4 kind of in our New York City context, and then
5 you've-you've said it as-already before that many of
6 these inequities have persisted-been persistent over
7 time. I mean the great thing about public health and
8 in New York City specifically we've made huge
9 improvements of health overall, and-and for the most
10 part with the exception of maternal mortality, health
11 has been improved in the city, but the challenge is-
12 and-and for all the reasons that we mentioned earlier
13 regarding social conditions and then the structures
14 that impact those social conditions were very clear
15 that neighborhoods are still pretty much suffering
16 within the context of New York City and these gaps
17 still exist. You know that's why we're as the Center
18 to really have some more intentional focus, and
19 figure out what is the it that we need to do in order
20 to really-to-to close those gaps, and I think, you
21 know, our placement at the local level has really
22 helped us have a better pulse on what is happening
23 actually with people, develop the relationships in
24 order to have community engagement and solution
25 development. That is more meaningful. I mean

2 historically a lot of our institutions have been very
3 top down and very much, you know, this is what we
4 need to do. This is what you need to do as a
5 community and it hasn't really worked. I think
6 overall we'd be able to show advances, but not really
7 at the nitty-gritty as the local level.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Does the Mayor's
9 Management Report include metrics related to
10 inequities?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: I believe
12 it includes measures for inequities, but I could get
13 back to you just to be specific. I think they're
14 working on it. Because of the racial and gender
15 equity legislation, we have been speaking with the
16 Mayor's office to figure out how do we--what are the
17 metrics that need to be in place that better outline
18 what we're doing as addmini--as--as an administration
19 especially as we move forward to kind of figure out
20 what are we going to do around this legislation. How
21 are we going to implement at the city agency level.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And are there any
23 metrics on the MMR that specifically relate to your
24 team to or to the Center for Health Equity.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Not
3 specifically to the Center of Health Equity. No.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Right so--so the
5 Health Department metrics are about broader public
6 health issues, but--

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --but not directly
9 related to your center. Well, I'm going to pass it
10 onto my colleagues for questions, and then I'll come
11 back for more in a minute, but I--I think that we can
12 both recognize the incredible complexity in moving
13 the needle on--on public health outcomes in general
14 and--and certainly specifically related to inequities,
15 and it wouldn't be fair to--to expect that. I think--I
16 think your--your East Harlem office has been open for
17 less than two years. Do I have that right?

18 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Yes, in the
19 current form.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right, in
21 the current form.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: In the current form,
23 yes. It goes back a century, but it--

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK:
25 [interposing] Right.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --it wouldn't-it
3 wouldn't be fair to allow-expect us to-to solve
4 public health and equities in two years on the ground
5 in a neighborhood.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: But having said all
8 of that, we gain a lot by tracking our progress.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And, um, the-the-the
11 data might not be pleasant, and it might even show
12 that we're not making progress when you look at the
13 big picture, but better to confront that. So, that
14 it forces us to allocate ever more resources or push
15 the envelope in other ways, and-and later on you want
16 to talk about the resource piece, but-but if-if we
17 learn that we're not making sufficient progress
18 toward closing the gap then we have to ask what more
19 we can do, what more resources we can allocate to
20 make the kind of progress that we need and deserve.
21 So, I know that our colleague Dr. Eugene has
22 questions and I'll pass it off to him.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you. Thank
24 you very much Mr. Chair and I want to commend you for

2 your leadership. In addition, this very important
3 issue, and I want to thank also Dr. Aletha.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
6 much and all the members of the panel, and I want to
7 thank also all your colleagues, and for the wonderful
8 job they are doing--

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: --for the people
11 of New York. We all know that health it creates a
12 very big issue, very big one affecting people from
13 all across New York City in all five boroughs. In
14 your testimony--testimony you say that the
15 Neighborhood Health Action Centers are located in the
16 respective neighborhoods of Tremont and East Harlem
17 in Brownsville.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: What prevents
20 you, you know, the--the department to open in our city
21 the Neighborhood Centers in all the areas since we
22 know that this is an issue that affect people all
23 over New York City, and when do you expect--one thing
24 we anticipate that--that very important centers will
25

2 be open also, and other neighborhoods of New York
3 City.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: A great
5 question. So, we have focused on these three areas
6 because that's where the data have guided us
7 initially, and that's what we initially have funding
8 for. We are definitely certainly open to discussing
9 sites in other places, and—and funding for those
10 sites as well. We do also do other work in other
11 places in New York City even though we don't have
12 physical Neighborhood Health Action Centers just to
13 make sure that—that it's highlighted. Our Brooklyn
14 space also works out of Bedford in Bedford-Stuyvesant
15 as well as Bushwick, and then we also programming
16 through Cure Violence as well as the National
17 Diabetes Prevention Program, and our faith based work
18 as well as New York City Teens Connection in areas of
19 Queens as well as in Norther Staten Island. So, even
20 though we don't we have a physical framework and
21 structure of a Neighborhood Health Action Center, we
22 do definitely have a presence in other neighborhoods
23 across the city in recognizing that there are other
24 areas that are also experiencing tremendous
25 inequities.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
3 for answering that. We know that in health and
4 medicine language—our languages are very important.
5 Let me put it communication is very important. If
6 you are a doctor and you are seeing a patient, you
7 cannot communicate, this is a big problem. You may
8 be the best physician that you can be. If you don't
9 understand your patient or the patient doesn't
10 understand you, this is a big problem and this is
11 dangerous.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I see you have
14 been talking about all the progress, all the
15 strategies that you know, there's—the—the department—
16 the department is putting together is putting in
17 place, to address the equity issue. What about
18 languages? We know that the New York City, New York
19 City is—I see that all the time. It's home to so
20 many immigrant people talking different languages,
21 and thousands of immigrant people they have their own
22 culture, their own languages. People let's say in
23 the caravan people and the caravan people when they
24 come over in terms of preventive medicine, in terms
25 of going to the doctor, they have a different

2 opinion. I'm telling you. You can ask many people
3 in this room. So what the department is doing to
4 fill this gap and to address that issue that the half
5 equity is addressed in terms of culture, you know,
6 issue. Language issue because thousands of immigrant
7 people were contributing to the fabric of New York
8 City. They are facing barriers and among those
9 barriers culture and languages.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Absolutely.
11 So, several things. It's important also to
12 understand the role of the Center for Health Equity,
13 and so while this is definitely the Commissioner's
14 strongest commitment to ensuring that the—the Health
15 Department has a focus on it, we are not the only
16 ones responsible within the health department to make
17 sure that equity is pursued from the agency's
18 perspective from the Health Department, and so there
19 are many others within our agency that are also doing
20 work around language access, and ensuring that all
21 languages or as many as we possibly can get are
22 available for many of the materials that we have in
23 terms of communication. But also what happens as a
24 result of, you know, pursuing this lens of health and
25 racial equity, and I use Ebola as the example of—of

2 when that came around a few years ago, that it was
3 well recognized that maybe, and we were getting
4 feedback from community residents as well and some of
5 our internal staff that were from West African
6 countries who experiencing Ebola among their family
7 members and—and were having--were going through a lot
8 of trauma, and we really took upon ourselves to make
9 sure we were listening to exactly what was happening,
10 and part of the feedback was what we were providing
11 as communication materials may not have been given
12 the message that we want to give, and so we actually
13 took a step back, and worked with community members
14 to make sure (1) it was in the right languages and
15 the various languages that it needed to be in, but
16 also languages also about the symbols and the designs
17 and—and what are the pictures on something, and what
18 does that communicate? And so we—we made sure that
19 evolved that, and—and reissued that, and that was
20 really all with the support and the help of many of
21 our—our community members. And so, this work about
22 equity is also pushing us as a health department
23 across the board not as the Center for Health Equity
24 to really challenge how we're creating the materials
25 that we're creating, and making sure we're putting

2 our racial equity lens to it, and often times that
3 means that we can't create materials in silos, and
4 that we have to go to our neighborhood residents and
5 our partners to get input on what is working is
6 working in terms of our materials and what is not
7 working.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Yes, I do
9 understand that you are not--your expectation of those
10 centers that are not the only groups or organization
11 addressing the language or cultural issues, but are
12 you working together? Do you collaborate?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Oh,
14 absolutely.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Could you--?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Could you explain
18 it? Give us more detail about your collaboration
19 with those institutions to make sure they address
20 properly the health equity issue?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Which
22 institutions?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: You say that, you
24 know, the Health Center they are not the only
25

2 institution addressing the language issue, if I
3 understand when you said that.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: What I was
5 saying that--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [interposing] So,
7 my question is that--

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: --are you
10 communicating with those other as the groups, those
11 other liberal group or community groups to make sure
12 that you work together, you join forces to better
13 address--addressing the--the health equity issue.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Yes. So,
15 in the example that I was explaining, I was--I'll--I
16 talked fast so, I can talk slower again. Um--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [interposing] I
18 just want to, you know, like more detail about what
19 you said there.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right, and
21 so I'm--I'm going to bring it because it was really a
22 powerful push for us, and so, our Health Department
23 as, and I'm not talking about--I'm talking about the
24 Center for Health -Health-Health Equity, and other
25 folks within the Health Department.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Uh-hm.

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Heard back
4 from our community-based organizations, our partners
5 within the community. We specifically reached out to
6 many West African organizations to hear from them
7 how—what was happening in terms of just—in terms of
8 dealing with all that was happening with Ebola
9 knowing that many of their families were dying back
10 home. But also learning from our partners and our
11 community-based organizations what are some of the
12 best strategies that we need to take on board in
13 order to make sure we're getting the messaging out in
14 a proper way, and part of that messaging relates to
15 language, that language in terms of literal words
16 and, you know, the type of language but also the
17 visual part of the language. And so, through the
18 feedback that they provided us made sure that it was
19 in the proper languages both the words, but also the
20 visuals that were on the particular promotional
21 materials that were—we were putting out. And so,
22 we've worked very closely with our community partners
23 in terms of getting feedback on how we can involve
24 what we're doing, and how we can do it better as
25 compared to, you know, before in the past.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Alright, you
3 mentioned Ebola. That's was one event.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: That one, you
6 know, what you mentioned that was the reaction, you
7 know under the aftermath of Ebola, but what I'm
8 think--talking about is if we have to be proactive,
9 preventive and I love preventive medicine--preventive
10 medicine. So, what I'm talking about is before the
11 event--

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK:

13 [interposing] Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: --and your
15 strategy and your strategy planning do you work
16 together with other organizations to prevent, to be
17 proactive. Not when something happens and you could
18 make it with the neighborhood, we do something. Do
19 you have in your plan, you know, how and where you
20 communicate, you work together, you sit down together
21 with the different organizations, and say that, you
22 know what? Language is very important in terms of
23 providing, you know, health to the people. What can
24 we do together to make sure that people who are not
25 speaking English properly can benefit from the

2 services that we are—we are providing? That's what
3 I'm asking.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK:

5 [interposing] Yeah, that's clear enough. So, yes and
6 a lot of the work in the partnerships through our
7 Neighborhood Health Action Centers have those
8 relationships up so that when program development is
9 happening, we are influenced by what is actually
10 happening within the neighborhood. We have evolved
11 several of our materials, and have gotten feedback
12 from Harlem specifically more recently. There's a
13 large Mandarin community that we are learning about,
14 and definitely engaging more with, and making sure
15 that we are proactive in producing and developing
16 materials, but also figuring out what we need to do
17 better in order to address and work with the Mandarin
18 community, which means language is a context that we
19 have to be very aware of. We also have hosted Mental
20 Health First Aid in Spanish to make sure that we have
21 been responsive to the need of our communities and
22 within our neighborhoods, and so there are many
23 moments and—and efforts that we have, and most of
24 our—Oh, another actually really big thing. The
25 National Diabetes Prevention Program, nationally

2 actually didn't have the program in Spanish, and so
3 we were the first ones here in New York City to do
4 this program, this prevention program in Spanish, and
5 made that it was offered. It actually influenced
6 national practice as well. So, we definitely
7 prioritize that--prioritize making sure the what we do
8 is accessible on many levels and every level with our
9 community partners, but a lot of this we have really
10 learned, and been pushed by our community partners at
11 the neighborhood level due to the relationships that
12 we've had over the years.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I'm looking at
14 something, you know, from your testimony that I love.
15 I want to read it for you.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: That's
17 good.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [laughs] It says
19 that in all our potential or dissemination in system
20 mobility of this effort we organized a diverse core
21 team of staff, champions from across the department.
22 It's wonderful. That's is also--

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK:
24 [interposing] Yes, yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: --my question,
3 you know, part of my question.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: And you say that
6 their work is focused on four areas: Communications,
7 and organizing this unit's identity, community
8 engagement and partnerships. Great. Partnership and
9 also work force equity and development and equity
10 constructing and budgeting practices. My question is
11 how diverse is these teams you're talking about? How
12 diverse is this team--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: --the components
15 of this team? Do we have people from across the--the
16 communities? We cannot get everybody, but, you know,
17 we have to when we create a team to address equity to
18 address fairness and regardless of the department, we
19 got to make sure that we include as many people as
20 possible, people from all over the place, all the
21 state, but we won't be able to include everybody, but
22 as a many people as we can. But how--this is my last
23 question--how diverse is the team, this team that
24 you're talking about? How diverse is the team?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Okay, so to
3 clarify as far-as far as that core diverse team of
4 champions, we're referring to folks within our agency
5 as the Health Department. You know, often times
6 within-when you a program within anything, we tend to
7 as leasers within an institution pick who we feel
8 should be a part of the team to lead the work
9 internally, and this is part of our internal reform
10 effort to become an anti-racist organization. So, in
11 a way to do it different, we opened up-we opened up
12 the application process for our entire employees, up
13 to 7,000 employees across the agency that if they
14 were interested in helping to lead some of this work
15 to become an anti-racist organization, that they
16 could-they could apply and be a part of it. And so,
17 we have team members that are from-we have 13
18 divisions within the Health Department. We have team
19 members are from all the divisions as from different
20 levels of management or employment staff across the
21 agency, different years of how long they've been in
22 the agency, gender, race and ethnicity that are a
23 part of this core team that are-that's transforming
24 our own institutions. In addition to I think what
25 you have mentioned, over the years again and through

2 the Action Centers we have developed lots of
3 relationships, and have lots of diversity in terms of
4 who we engage with at the neighborhood level. Each
5 of the Action Centers are now really working towards
6 how do we build councils that are going to—that we
7 are going to work with, but also inform our work in
8 more direct ways, and they have been engaging with
9 neighborhood residents on best how to do that. So,
10 instead of us saying that this is how it should be
11 done, we are going to the residents in our various
12 areas of whether we're working faith-based
13 organizations, NYCHA developments, community-based
14 organizations, eve the schools, and getting ideas on
15 what should we do in order to engage people around
16 the Action Centers to make sure that we're doing the
17 work in the way that's most—that's best for the
18 neighborhood, but also that's best for them as
19 organizations and residents within the neighborhoods.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
21 much, and I do appreciate all the efforts, you know,
22 that have been done to make sure that all the team is
23 diverse, but this is something that you opened the
24 application for people who are interested, but I
25 think this is our obligation as a city as government

2 as the leaders to do this this synergy planning in
3 the way that—that we include people not because
4 they're interested, but we have to have the—the plan,
5 the synergy plan to include everybody. It is our
6 moral obligation, and I say that. I want to put
7 emphasis on that. We won't be able to include
8 everybody, but as many people, as diverse people as
9 we can. Thank you very much for all the effort that
10 you are doing, and thank you for your answers.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.
12 Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you, Dr.
16 Eugene. We want to ignore—acknowledge we've been
17 joined by our colleague on the Health Committee,
18 Council Member Inez Barron and I believe that Council
19 Member Powers has a question.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Yes. Thank you
21 and congratulations to our Chair on your first
22 hearing, right. Yes, and glad to be part of the
23 committee, which obviously you are addressing a lot
24 of important issues, and I thank you for the work
25 you're doing. I walked in a late. I'm apologize for

2 missing parts of it, but I walked in right in right
3 when you were talking about infant mortality and
4 other issues. I know that in the report the—it's
5 actually my district that does particularly well here
6 in terms of when you talk about the equality gap and
7 recognize that the work you're doing is to help to
8 make sure that every district has those same
9 opportunities. And just a quick question, and then
10 I'll pass it back to the chair, is when you talked
11 about infant mortality rate, you noted that in 2006
12 and 2015 a decline in it citywide amongst all poverty
13 groups. I didn't see a reason or reasons maybe
14 listed in terms of things the city had done or
15 programs that we had invested in, or if it's other
16 reasons that led to a decline in the mortality rate
17 in that 10-year period?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Sure. Well,
19 over the ten-year period I mean I think we've had
20 improvements in—in health in many different ways, but
21 I would say we've done a lot of work and a lot of
22 efforts across the city. We have Newborn Home
23 Visiting Program that was launched maybe 15 or so
24 years go that also focuses on visiting moms shortly
25 after they have delivered as well as in home. So,

2 they visit in the hospital as well as in the home. We
3 have other programs such as Healthy Start Brooklyn.
4 That has had a lot of focus on Brooklyn and working
5 with partners to help support programs such as Nurse
6 Family Partnership, which is a well know, well
7 established program that's not only in Brooklyn, but
8 other places across the city, and so there's been
9 lots of very pointed efforts in New York City to have
10 a focus on infant mortality, and especially within
11 the neighborhoods that we know have the highest
12 rates.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Got it.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: And
15 working, and we're working a lot with partners also
16 in-in planning around what needs to happen within the
17 neighborhoods, and to be very clear, and there are a
18 lot of partners within this room, there are a lot of
19 people across New York City. We have perinatal
20 networks. We have other people who are also working
21 with Healthy Starts within other bureaus-boroughs
22 that have been doing work in home visiting and-and
23 counseling and all types of work across the last-over
24 the last couple of years, and really drilling down,
25 and-and highlighting and calling out that infant

2 mortality is not just—and it's not right for black
3 babies to be dying two to three times more likely
4 than—than white babies. And so moving forward we're
5 doing —really elevating this—this effort, and really
6 working towards being more collective across city—the
7 city government, but also with our community partners
8 to develop plans that are more cohesive and
9 coordinated, and focusing on areas such as safe sleep
10 and housing and focusing on really women's health.
11 There's been a huge shift in understanding that
12 really drives infant mortality within the city, but
13 also the country is how healthy a woman is before she
14 gets pregnant and then also a recognition that
15 structural racism has a tremendous impact on a woman
16 and her family within the context of her neighborhood
17 that leads ultimately to chronic stress and chronic
18 disease, and so we fell in elevating that narrative
19 it also creates a platform that we're more able to
20 come together, but also for other people to see how
21 they can be part of the solution in decreasing infant
22 mortality in New York City.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Great. Thank you
24 and one—one more question is I have the distinction—

1 COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

49

2 actually I walked in when you were talking about the
3 DOULA DOULA program.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I sort of vaguely
6 remember last year at Bellevue, which is in my
7 district--

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER POWER: [interposing] --
10 there was a--there was a program that was cut or lost,
11 and folks reached out to me about it. I think it was
12 at Bellevue? Do you have any sense of what I'm
13 talking about?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: No.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: There was a--or
16 folks that were associated with Bellevue. I can--I'll
17 follow up with you in a--in a--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER [interposing] Yeah that
19 would be great.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: --in a--in an
21 offline, but there were some concerns about cuts to a
22 program, and I think the city was investing in, and I
23 can--it was a while ago, but I'll--

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK:

25 [interposing] Okay.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: --I'll follow up
3 with you.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Alright,
5 great.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Great,
8 thanks.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you, Council
10 Member and I believe that Council Member Barron has a
11 question.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, thank you to
13 the chair. Welcome. Look forward to continuing to
14 work on this issue with you as the new chair. To the
15 panel thank you for coming and sharing. It's—I think
16 it's very important that we recognize as a part of
17 the document has said that the Health Department's
18 work is to eliminate health inequities, which are
19 rooted in historical and contemporary injustice and
20 discrimination including racism. I think that's
21 important that you have that in your statement, and
22 that until we recognize that, and the implications of
23 how all of that has filtered into what we've been
24 doing all these years, we're not going to make
25 significant progress. I think I heard you also

2 saying that the social and economic conditions of the
3 community contribute to chronic stress and other
4 conditions that have a negative impact on a person's
5 health. So, part of the reference material says that
6 28%--23% of black patients give birth--only 23% of
7 black patients give birth in the safest hospitals.
8 So, we know that a part of that is based on the lack
9 of or the poorer health conditions that we have in
10 our poor communities. How is your division going to
11 address the issues of maternal mortality? How are we
12 going to be able to reduce that? Do you see it
13 related not just to the mothers, the mother-to-be's
14 health condition prior to giving birth, but also to
15 conditions that exist in those hospitals that are in
16 our poorest communities.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right. So,
18 for the--Health Department is having a lot of focus,
19 and I'm going to ask Dr. Torian Easterling who is
20 overseeing our Birth Equity to come up to kind of
21 expand a little bit more, but we as the Health
22 Department have definitely elevated this issue, and
23 we have recently convened a Mortality Review or
24 Material Review Committee to really on looking at
25 cases of why women are dying in New York City as it

2 relates of child birth and making sure that it's
3 definitely more intentional to find out more in-depth
4 what is happening so solutions can be put forward and
5 those meetings have happened more recently. So,
6 that's something that—that has started, and we have
7 been fortunate to receive as the Health Department
8 for New York City, and this was just announced more
9 funding to support how we collect data, and how we
10 look at data to better understand what is happening
11 at the city as a whole, but also understand what is
12 happening in the hospitals. And then there's a lot of
13 attention right now from the Health Department to
14 build relationships with hospitals and meet with them
15 and to convene with them to talk about what is the—
16 what are their systems like, and what are the
17 potential gaps within their systems that are not
18 supporting women to be the healthiest that they can
19 be or—or what's not supporting the women to get the
20 best treatment that they could get potentially within
21 the hospital system. So, that work is also
22 happening, and then at the neighborhood level there
23 has been lots of convening. [background comments]
24 It's—it's—I feel it's good for you to meet some other
25 people, too because they're--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I know. There's
3 mainly Dr. Easterling. It's glad that he's here. Do
4 you need to swear him in?

5 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And yes, we'll just
6 have the Committee Counsel do the affirmation.

7 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
8 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
9 your testimony before this committee, and to respond
10 honestly to Council Member questions?

11 DR. EASTERLING: I do.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And since I'm new,
13 Dr. Easterling, if you could explain your role.

14 DR. EASTERLING: Sure. Good morning to
15 the committee. My name is Dr. Torian Easterling. I
16 am the Assistant Commissioner for the Brooklyn
17 Neighborhood Health Action Center within the Center
18 for Health Equity, and I also work within our
19 division with other colleagues within our department
20 to lead our Birth Equity Initiative through New York
21 City to really think about how we're addressing the
22 racial inequities around infant mortality as well as
23 maternal mortality, which is given directly to
24 Council Member Barron's questions. And so, as the
25 data already points out, and we have already

2 highlighted multiple times that the inequities still
3 exist around maternal mortality as well as infant
4 mortality. I think it's important to—to highlight
5 that the division continues to work to engage our
6 community partners around how we think strategically
7 about the work that we do in our neighborhoods.
8 Through our Neighborhood Health Action Centers, we
9 are—we have established the Family Wellness Suite,
10 which are convening spaces for women and their
11 families to think about how we provide resources, and
12 also to think about how we provide respite spaces for
13 families. Again, getting to the chronic stresses
14 that we know that exist within our neighborhoods.
15 The other role that we are playing—playing around
16 convening is using data to really think about how we
17 identify (1) The root causes of these inequities, but
18 then also to think about some of the interventions
19 that have played out to address some of these
20 inequities, thinking about Healthy Start Brooklyn,
21 Newborn Home—Home Visiting, but we know that we have
22 community partners who have been leading home
23 visiting services who have been providing perinatal
24 support as some of our partners who are here right
25 now who are leading a lot of this work within our—

2 within high need neighborhoods. So, really thinking
3 about how we use data. That is what we call the
4 perinatal period of risk report, and just to get back
5 to—the Council Member Eugene had mentioned how we're
6 thinking about how we inform, how we present the
7 data. A lot of this data is well known, but we want
8 to provide a racially justice lens to ensure that
9 what we present comes with a—with a lens that people
10 understand and how we can think about action steps.
11 And so that's another example of how we're using our
12 community input before we put out data because a lot
13 of people know this information. But just to get to—
14 specifically to the question around hospitals, it is
15 important that we play a role. As you know, that the
16 New York City Department of Health has partnerships
17 with hospitals. We have hospitals within Central
18 Brooklyn who are faced with this issue. Because they
19 are safely in those hospitals, they are for—they are
20 dealing with lack of resources and capacity to really
21 address this issue. I think that this—it's important
22 to acknowledge that we have provided some input into
23 the Vital Brooklyn Plan to ensure that we elevate
24 this issue. Because there is funding that is coming
25 down from the Governor's Office, there is an

2 opportunity as we are thinking about the merger of
3 three hospitals within Central Brooklyn and other
4 safety net hospitals, there are best practices that
5 can be integrated into their plan. But we need to
6 have, you know, our recommendations taking consider-
7 consideration into their plan, and brought to the
8 table as well. So, I think that it's an opportunity
9 to really address sort of the racist practice that
10 we've seen in hospitals, but also to also think about
11 some of the best practice that we've seen across the
12 country as well.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. That-
14 that's a part of the concern that I had because, as
15 you know, Brookdale is one of the three hospitals
16 that's a part of that. We want to make sure-I think
17 there's a meeting that's going to be held even
18 Thursday with the Legislators, and the state is going
19 to be coming together--

20 DR. EASTERLING: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and working
22 further on that vital Brooklyn plan to make sure that
23 we're aware of all of the indices that show that we
24 have a great disparity in terms of the services that
25 are given to black and Latinos, and how can we use

2 that data to make sure that we can improve what's
3 done. So thank you so much, and I appreciate the
4 work that you've done—that you've been doing, and the
5 event you had last year at the Health Center. [mic
6 squawking] It was fantastic. So, I look forward to
7 the next one.

8 DR. EASTERLING: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: I look forward to it
11 as well. [background comments] Maybe I'll get an
12 invite. [laughter] Okay. Thank you, thank you,
13 Council Member Barron. Dr. Maybank, collecting data
14 is one of the core functions of—of the department.
15 You're collecting data from emergency rooms, and
16 other hospital departments from medial labs from
17 probably pharmacies and environmental monitoring from
18 thousands and thousands of source I'm sure. To what
19 extent do we have demographic data attached to that
20 reporting? If for example heaven forbid we should
21 have a pediatric death from the flu. I know your
22 department leans about that, but do you also learn
23 the race or other demographic data about the—the
24 child in such a case, and—and is that a universal
25 practice across all data collection?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Many—much
3 of our data collection within the Health Department
4 has race and ethnicity or demographic s attached to
5 it, and it's been that way at the Health Department
6 for a long time. Whatever data sources do and how
7 they collect the data we're not able to fully control
8 or have—have a sense of what this is going to be, but
9 we definitely have better data when we do have
10 demographics attached to that data.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: So—so for the health
12 conditions that we've spoken about today, mortality
13 from heart disease, from asthma, from—from diabetes,
14 do—do we have full coverage of demographics in—in
15 that data collection?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: We do. I
17 mean we have pretty good demographics. I think we
18 always improve, and I think that is the challenge and
19 the work of racial equity and gender equity and—and
20 how collect data. You know, right now for the most
21 part we have very broad categories especially as it
22 relates to race and ethnicity, and we're very clear
23 that there are many—I don't want to say subgroups or
24 other groups and other ways in which people define
25 themselves. So, as an example, Asian is a very broad

2 category, but many folks who identify as Asian also
3 they come from different origins and different
4 nationalities in which, you know, health plays out
5 potentially in a different way. The same thing with
6 Latinos, as you mentioned. The same with-with
7 blacks, and so I think there's always an opportunity
8 to get more granular in how we collect demographic
9 data whether it's even around income and where people
10 live, and how, you know, how micro can we really go
11 to understand what's happening within a specific
12 area, and among a specific population I think is an
13 important challenge for us as folks within the Health
14 Department. So there are always opportunities for
15 improvement and strengthen our collection around data
16 within New York City.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And who sets those
18 rules? Who—who determines just what demographic data
19 is reported? You brought up a great example of Asian
20 being such a broad term that it can sometimes obscure
21 very important differences. When—when you receive
22 reports from hospitals or from medical labs, are they
23 following rules that the Health Department sets on
24 exactly what kind of data to report?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right. We
3 don't have--there are certain kinds of data that we
4 have influence on and saying that we need to collect
5 it within the New York City, but in terms of
6 demographics and how agencies and institutions
7 collect their data (1) it's going to be important to
8 go to that institution and find out what their source
9 is, but often times they have a source and guidelines
10 that are provided and requirements of what they need
11 to collect data on, and how that data is presented.
12 We at the Health Department definitely have some
13 level of control over how we collect our data, and
14 what it is that we're going to present, and we can
15 always push ourselves as the Health Department to do
16 better, but also we can--we can work with other
17 partners to see what they're doing, and I think we
18 can work collectively to push one another to say this
19 is what we need to collect in order to have a full
20 spectrum of--of the picture, but no everybody has to
21 do that, and there are not requirements always and
22 guidelines to--to go deeper.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Understood. Dr.
24 Maybank has an MBA I think right, among his eight or
25 nine other degrees. So, they--they--they teach you in

2 business school if—if you don't measure it, you can't
3 manage it, and so I really would like to ensure that
4 we are measuring the demographic disparities in
5 health outcomes in this city.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: You're so
7 right.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: As I mentioned
9 before, even if what it tells us might be painful,
10 that's the first step addressing it. So, I look
11 forward to working with you, and your team pushing
12 the envelope on that. First, making sure that people
13 are reporting the full richness of-of demographic
14 information, and secondly that we're—we're
15 aggregating that from a citywide perspective and
16 reporting it. Perhaps on the MMR or other outlets
17 that—that I'd like to explore further with you. I
18 want to just shift to the budget question for a
19 moment. So, your—your team or the Center for Health
20 Equity has a \$14.5 million annual budget. Is that
21 correct?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Correct.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And so, that would
24 include, you know, on the ground program meaning your
25 community outreach, and—and your communications work

2 and even the kind of internal efforts you've made to--
3 to--to change the dynamics around confronting racial
4 inequity that fall under the single budget of \$14.5
5 million.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: So, you've probably
8 never heard this in a City Council hearing before,
9 but that sounds like not a lot of money [laughter]
10 considering --[laughter/applause] --considering that
11 (1) the scale of your operation, but even more
12 importantly the scale of the challenge.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Right.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And can you break
15 out the piece of that budget which is going to your
16 Neighborhood Action--Health Action Centers?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: I mean I
18 referred it. So, Cassie Toner is my Assistant
19 Commissioner of Division Management and over Finance.
20 So, she's sitting here.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, and--and we--

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Strictly
23 to--to answer these questions.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Great, and sorry to
3 do this, but if we could also have you do the
4 affirmation.

5 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
6 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
7 your testimony before this committee, and to respond
8 honestly to Council Member questions?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TONER: I DO.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: I'm sorry again.
11 New guy. So, you're the Assistant Commissioner for--
12 ?

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TONER: Division
14 of Management, which includes the budget.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Got it. Okay.

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TONER: So, you
17 know, very specifically the new funding that we have
18 for the Action Centers is \$1 million per Action
19 Center. That funds our staffing model, which is a
20 critical part of the--the Action Center model, which
21 I'm sure that you see in East Harlem, which is our
22 Navigators our Promoters who go out into the
23 community, our Referral Specialists who are doing all
24 that exciting work on making sure people get the
25 social services they need that, of course, are the--

2 address the social determinants of health. The rest
3 is really split among our programming and has existed
4 prior. So, NYCTC. So the Teens Connection Program
5 oar all of our various programs have their own
6 individual budgets and a lot of that goes towards the
7 Action Centers, but as a whole the Action Center
8 model was funded at \$1 million per year per center.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay. So, that must
10 mean that we're leveraging that money partly through
11 non-profits, which we partner with who take up
12 residency in these centers, which brings about great
13 synergy. In terms of the staff that you're funding
14 with that, what would be the--the approximate head
15 count we're getting for \$1 million a year in those
16 centers?

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TONER: We have
18 about 11 staff that were added per center.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, got it. Well,
20 considering they're medical professionals I'll also
21 say there is something I'm used to hearing they
22 included and nothing overpaid. So that, that's good
23 to know, but, boy, that sounds like an incredible
24 bargain, and so it leads me to ask why instead of
25 having only \$3 million a year, why don't we have 30

2 or 50 considering the enormous need and what sounds
3 like a pretty reasonable cost per-per center.

4 [background comments]

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: I mean,
6 yeah, okay. [laughter] I can add--so I think where,
7 you know, right now we have the three, and we are
8 always open to discussing more and--and how--any ideas
9 that you may have around funding other Action Centers
10 across the city.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Alright I know that
12 there's a--there's a capital need, and we were lucky I
13 think in all three of these locations to have a
14 legacy of a--of a facility that was created in some
15 cases 100 years ago. Are there more--if that's the
16 right term--legacy facilities out there that might
17 need a renovation, but at least they're---they're in
18 our in our inventory that we could bring back to
19 life?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: There are? How many
22 more are there?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: I can get
24 back to you with that number--

25 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: --so we can
3 talk more about that.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, okay. Is-is-is
5 that a politically sensitive question, or it's just
6 that you have the number off hand? It's fine if you
7 want to get back to me, but--

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: There's a
9 mix. I don't have the number offhand. I mean I have
10 an estimate, but I think there's, you know, we can
11 get back to you.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Do you know, at the
13 height of--of what at the time was very innovative
14 with this district office--District Health Office
15 program, do you know how many facilities we had at--at
16 a peak?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Yes. There
18 are about 30, a little--a little over 30 facilities
19 across the city, and so you--you were at the flagship
20 program that really was--it was a pilot initial--
21 initially, and the Red Cross approached the Health
22 Department. They showed success over actually three
23 years initially, and then the city funded the
24 building of the building at the Harlem site, and it
25 was really from that success, and demonstration over

2 ten years of a decrease in infant mortality and
3 premature mortality that the city felt that they
4 needed to invest in other health-district health
5 centers across the city specifically in areas that
6 they knew had the worst health outcomes, and at that
7 time many immigrants and blacks and-and Latinos lived
8 in those neighborhoods.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Well, there's no
10 doubt that these are priority areas and-and-and I,
11 you know, I applaud you for putting your resources
12 where the need is greatest, but just to understand.
13 So, 30-so at 30 facilities, are-are they currently
14 abandoned? What-what is the use currently for these
15 facilities?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: So, over
17 time, you know, and I would have to get back to you
18 as far as the number of facilities exactly and-and
19 speak to our admin, people to have the number more
20 exact in my mind, but in terms of overtime, what
21 we've experienced as the Health Department is that
22 there was an underutilization of the buildings. You
23 know, we have gone through periods of where the
24 Health Department has been very centralized and then
25 decentralized in the early 1900s, and then became

2 very centralized again and, you know, we did offer a
3 lot sort of health clinical services, but as you
4 know, we're not really in that business so much any
5 more. So, those buildings became even more
6 underutilize and that when Dr. Bassett came back on
7 board in 2002, there was recognition that we can't be
8 so centralized any longer as a Health Department
9 because we're—one because these disparities exist
10 within these neighborhoods, and we don't have a sense
11 of what's really happening because we don't have
12 teams that are really present there to be within the
13 spaces to—to talk with people and to work with people
14 in a very intentional way. And she—her attempt with
15 what we call the District Public Health Offices at
16 that time were to—to at least admittedly with what
17 she did have, decentralize as best as she can, and
18 then when she came back on board again having a
19 commitment to a neighborhood approach and figuring
20 out what it is that we can do. So, while it
21 definitely, you know, you know, could be more, I will
22 say it is more than what it was three years ago, and
23 our commitment as the Health Department to what is
24 happening, and being present at the local level where
25 we know disparities exist in the city.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Right. Look the
3 health—the public health landscape is always
4 changing, and today if you look at the top, as you
5 well know, the top preventable diseases they are
6 things are heart disease and diabetes and—and gun
7 violence unfortunately is high on the list. And, to
8 combat them, I think there's a stronger argument than
9 ever for being on the ground in communities. We need
10 to impact things like diet and exercise, and to be
11 present in neighborhoods. There's just no substitute
12 for it.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Absolutely.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And so, it—it may be
15 that there was an argument for centralization in a
16 different era. We were combatting a different list
17 of top diseases, but boy it sure feels like what
18 we're struggling with today that you couldn't do all
19 that from your wonderful building in Long Island
20 City, and I'm sure you agree. It's part of the
21 rationale for your—for you office, but, you know, I
22 would certainly like to explore with you--I'm getting
23 lots of nods from Council Member Powers—the—the idea
24 of—of dramatically increasing our on-the-ground
25 presence and we've—we've had a proof of concept now

2 in three neighborhoods, and kudos to Commissioner--
3 Commissioner Bassett--

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK:
5 [interposing] Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --for--for re-
7 envisioning what a local office can be in--in the 21st
8 Century. But now we've got a couple of years of
9 experience. There seems to be enormous demand as
10 evidenced by the 16,000 visits a year, or 15,000
11 visits a year. So, we've answered that question.
12 You know, the people--the communities want this
13 obviously and are willing to come in. So, let's--
14 let's--let's work together on finding a way to--to
15 extend this success in other neighborhoods.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Absolutely
17 and we're working to make sure, you know, as you
18 mentioned earlier that we're definitely evaluating
19 the model and--and what it is because it is unique and
20 having co-located partners and the clinical entities
21 of the community-based organizations. But, I also
22 want to say, if I'm allowed, that it's important to
23 understand that, you know, we need to be present in
24 the neighborhood. It provides another opportunity to
25 work with other city agencies that are also in the

2 neighborhood because if we understand that all of
3 these other things impact health and create health in
4 terms of whether it's housing, or education, mass
5 incarceration, that it's not only the sole
6 responsibility of the health and the health field to
7 create and resolve and decrease the gap in health
8 inequities. And, I think it provides a wonderful
9 opportunity for us at the Health Department to work
10 with our city agencies to actually help them put a
11 health lens and understand the health impacts of
12 their work, and we have had—we have led some of that
13 work under the leadership of doctor—doctor—Major
14 Doctor Javier—Javier Lopez who is one of our
15 assistant commissioners who had done great work.
16 It's not—it's not health in all policies per se, but
17 it's health in all policies, right, in which his team
18 of some city planners have worked to build capacity
19 of other—other city agencies to just understand that
20 creates health overall and—and all of that—that often
21 times people really aren't clear about. They think
22 health is just about the healthcare system, and the
23 hospital. But also to understand the equity impacts
24 potentially of their—their work. And, what it has
25 led to over the last year is these plans that have

2 come out through the city, our Bushwick Plan, our
3 Brownsville Plan. You can see there are explicit
4 callouts for health now, and health inequity within
5 their—in these plans. Now, how that all materialized
6 to action, it's not completely clear, but at least
7 it's a start that we're able to, you know, get the
8 city agencies to start seeing this particular lens.
9 But that's an area I think that if we're pursuing
10 health equity, and we're really focused at the
11 neighborhood level of—of achieving, closing these
12 gaps, that we also have to figure out how we're
13 working with other city agencies to implement a
14 health lens.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: On—on the funding
16 front, almost every agency—I think actually every
17 agency in New York City gets some federal money, but
18 like galvanizing for the Health Department it's—it's
19 quite a large portion of your total budget. One
20 program that I believe is funded federally through
21 the CDC is the Teen Connection Program.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Can you comment on
24 the risks that we face from a hostile White House and
25 Congress who I'm imagining are undervaluing the kind

2 of important public health work that you're doing,
3 and whether we've actually have already taken hits on
4 federal funding through the Teen Connection program
5 or others?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Yes. So,
7 we've learned that the program will be cut
8 nationally, and it—funding will end this coming June.
9 So, you know, it impacts a large part of—of the work
10 that we do. We reach currently 15,000 young people
11 across New York City through linking community health
12 centers with high schools, making sure that teens
13 have access to and are utilizing their local health
14 care centers, but also ensuring that these health
15 centers are also teen friendly and responsive to
16 young people. And we've been working with DOE to
17 implement curriculums that help promote racial
18 justice, but—not racial well racial justice and
19 reproductive justice in ensuring that young people
20 understand and know their sexual and reproductive
21 rights, and—and will access information in the way
22 that they need to, and then we've been working with
23 young people to also be leaders of this campaign, the
24 Develop Communications Campaigns across the city. So
25 this cut will have a tremendous impact on our ability

2 to engage with teens across New York--New York City,
3 and as I mentioned before, this has been one of our
4 successful programs in which we started, you know, in
5 one area and expanded in others because it
6 demonstrated tremendous success, and we have seen,
7 you know, decreases definitely within the Bronx teen
8 pregnancy rates, but also across the board in New
9 York City.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And-and so what is
11 the budget of that program, and is it entirely
12 federally funded, and is that now all been cancelled?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: So, I'm
14 going to call up so that you get to meet another
15 Assistant Commissioner--

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, that's great.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: --because
18 I--you're going to get to meet almost all of them
19 hopefully.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Right.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Dr. Jane
22 Bedell, and she's over our Bronx Office, who has been
23 really the leader and pioneer in pushing this program
24 and creating the model.

25 DR. JANE BEDELL: Good morning.

2 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
3 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
4 your testimony before this committee, and to respond
5 honestly to Council Member questions?

6 DR. JANE BEDELL: I do.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And so, Dr. Bedell,
8 you're running the South Bronx Health Action Center.
9 Is that your role?

10 DR. JANE BEDELL: That is my role--

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, got it.

12 DR. JANE BEDELL: --and in that role now
13 that New York City Teens Connection is--has expanded,
14 I'm also, you know, what we call the Lead Assistant
15 Commissioner for New York City Teens Connish-
16 Connection as well.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay and so these
18 budget questions. What is the budge of the program?

19 DR. JANE BEDELL: Yeah. So, the budget
20 is approximately \$1.2 million. We were first funding
21 from the CBC at a slightly lesser annual budget, and
22 then the--this work at the federal level moved to
23 another part of Health and Human Services, the Office
24 of Adolescent Health, and we got even more funding
25 when we applied for a grant there. We're in the

2 middle of second year, and we've been, you know, like
3 our colleagues across the country rudely told that
4 our five-year kind of guaranteed funding is not
5 really guaranteed, and it's going to end in June.
6 So, it's devastating to--to many--

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: [interposing] So the
8 program--

9 DR. JANE BEDELL: --many municipalities.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --as of now is set
11 to close June 30th?

12 DR. JANE BEDELL: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Have--have we not
14 looked at a plan to replace the funding year with
15 city money or another source?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: We are
17 pursuing looking at a plan.

18 DR. JANE BEDELL: Yes, we--we are in
19 negotiations, and talking about how we might be able
20 to fund some of it. I--I--I don't--it would be hard to
21 --to get CTL money that would be as richly endowed as
22 the federal grants are, and also to say that the
23 federal grants have with them this ability to do some
24 connecting with other cities and municipalities that
25 look like us, and to learn from them. So, even with--

2 if we are able to get funding to continue the
3 program, there are aspects of the federal funding
4 that are very important to, you know, nationally, and
5 we at least during this presidential administration
6 are unlikely to be able to be learning from our
7 colleagues across the country.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Pleas keep us posted
9 on this. It would be tragic if the program was
10 discontinued.

11 DR. JANE BEDELL: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: I think it's
13 important to prepare alternate financing if that does
14 come about.

15 DR. JANE BEDELL: Great. Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Please keep us
17 posted and—and let us help if we can.

18 DR. JANE BEDELL: Okay. We'll do that.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: We haven't talked
20 much about the specific healthcare challenges faced
21 by LGBTQ New Yorkers. I know that is part of your
22 mandate, and I think you have a task force that is
23 specifically addressing that, and I wonder if you
24 could say a word or two about the—how you
25 characterize the challenges for that important

2 segment of New Yorkers, and—and what your role in
3 addressing it is.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Sure, so I
5 am going to call my other director and Assistant
6 Commissioner Javier Lopez up, but in the meantime
7 before he—he comes up, what we've been able to—to
8 work at and this was really under the leadership of
9 Johnson, who was committee chair before really
10 highlighting and recognizing that we need to have
11 very specific efforts with the LGBT community and
12 that we need to have teams and staffing that are
13 working in that way. And so, you know, he designated
14 and the City Council designated and—and asked that
15 there be liaisons at the agencies, and we took that
16 on, but we also made sure that we also provided
17 additional funding and actually have more—more of a
18 team than one person. And so what the responsibility
19 of this team is, is (1) working internal to the
20 agency, and making sure that we're coordinating
21 efforts, and so we have a lot of work actually coming
22 out of the Health Department through our Bureau of
23 HIV that has issued a Healthcare Bill of Rights
24 through some of our mental health first aid work.
25 Also working very closely with the Unity Project with

2 the--with the Lady's--the First Lady's Office. And
3 then making sure--we just launched Out for Safe Spaces
4 in which we're working with community-based
5 organizations.

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER LOPEZ: I bless
7 the prompt. So, everybody can get excited and you--
8 you--the City Council could become an Out for Safe
9 Spaces space.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Alright

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: So, working
12 with community-based organizations and clinical and
13 hopefully clinical entities to make sure that they
14 are building their capacity so that they are
15 responsive and relevant for our LGBTQ and TGNC
16 communities and especially our communities of color.
17 We have been working with faith-based organizations
18 as well as our Cure Violence partners to elevate and
19 build their capacity to talk about the stigma as it
20 relates to LGBTQ and TGNC Communities and really
21 address masculine toxicity as well. And so there are
22 different ways in which, you know, we're working to
23 coordinate within our agency. We're working and
24 we're liaisons with the Mayor's Office, with the
25 First Lady's Office, with the Commissioner of Gender

2 Equity. We're also working internally to train our
3 own staff. We have now a Gender Equity Module that
4 staff have to actually complete. Most I think many
5 staff across the city have to, and our teens help
6 developed this particular training module, and then
7 we're also working as I mentioned with--with the
8 United Project. Javier, do you want to--?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER LOPEZ: [off mic]
10 I think you covered everything in your remarks. I
11 can go deeper if you think I should. (sic)

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Okay. So,
13 I--I guess I handled this.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: I think--I think you
15 did--

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK:
17 [interposing] Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --a swell job there.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Very good.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Alright--alright,
23 well thank you so much, Commissioner Maybank and to
24 the great team that you brought forward today. We

2 really look forward to working with you on these
3 important issues.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MAYBANK: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, and we're
6 going to call up our next panel, which is Juan Pinzon
7 from the Community Service Society, Mary Luke, and
8 Sheila Katzman both are from--thank you--CEDAW New
9 York. [background comments, pause]

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, welcome to you
11 all. We're going to have a three-minute clock on-on
12 you all, but-but there will be time for questions as
13 well, and would you like to kick us off?

14 SHEILA KATZMAN: Okay. Thank you very
15 much. My name is Sheila Katzman. I am the President
16 for the International Association for Women in Radio
17 and Television, USA and the Chair of the Steering
18 Committee for the New York City 4 CEDAW Act. We're a
19 voluntary community based coalition advocating for
20 women's rights--the women's bill of rights in New York
21 City based upon international standards embodied in
22 CEDAW, with is the Convention and the Elimination of
23 all forms of Discrimination Against Women. First, we
24 wish to express gratitude to you Council Member Mark
25 Levine and for the Council in general for inviting us

2 back here again. We also want to focus a bit here on
3 mental health, and want to emphasize our appreciation
4 to the First Lady Chirlane McCray for the initiative
5 on Mental Health. Allow me to highlight three
6 specific articles of the 17 Articles of CEDAW that
7 have particular resonance to women's health and
8 mental health, which always seems separate. Article
9 12: Health Care and Family Planning. Countries must
10 guarantee equal access to health care and ensure
11 women and girls are not discriminated against in
12 health care and have access to services. Article 13:
13 Economic and Social Life and then and last Article
14 16: Marriage and Family Life because even listening
15 around I didn't hear any of these things coming out.
16 Could the results of discrimination over time lead to
17 mental health problems preventing women from reaching
18 their potential and tying girls into early marriage,
19 which we know do sometime here could result in
20 depression and/or other mental health problems.
21 Having said all that, with a gender assessment New
22 York City CEDAW Act would require the DOM-DOHMH to
23 play-to pay close attention to trends and make sure
24 problems and proper-are properly identified. The-too
25 often the media is inundated with news on mental

2 health. However, we are concerned that these reports
3 usually refer to men and to men who are privileged
4 like the Las Vegas shooting—shooter or the most
5 recent shooter in Florida. Mental health becomes a
6 major topic when we speak of homelessness and mental
7 health the gender is male. We are concerned that
8 women will be overlooked, or worse excuse their needs
9 without asking them. Race and gender clarifies who
10 can be identified as having mental health problems or
11 being merely a valiant criminal depending on race and
12 gender. Too often women are this big discriminated
13 majority. Historically, mental health has been used
14 to take away women's voices with egregious practices
15 of drugs and even institutionalization. Thankfully,
16 we are no longer at the place—that place, but we wish
17 to ensure that this will never happen again. Our
18 major ask is that each city agency and department
19 assess their work through a gender lens. The city is
20 a major employer. The city is a major implemental
21 program. The city is a major founder of projects.
22 In each of these areas, we want to ensure that gender
23 discrimination is a thing of the past. A key
24 component to any gender assessment is access to
25 desegregated data. [bell] There are many areas that

2 may be inadvertently overlooked, and the gender
3 assessment will ensure that nothing is missed. A
4 gender assessment will help the city and the public
5 to identify these problems and allow the city to take
6 action. Gender assessment needs assess to—to access
7 the data that is disaggregated by gender and is
8 accessible to the public. Lastly, we recommend the
9 Department of Health in its collection of data broken
10 up by gender and wish for its continuance for the
11 public access to raw data. We would like to ensure
12 that this data collection is incorporated in law and
13 not policy so that future administrations may not
14 easily change this forward looking strategy. We know
15 that other forms of discrimination aggravate problems
16 with gender. So, we recognize that intersectionality
17 also requires disaggregation of data by race and
18 other traits that have historically discriminated
19 against women. We would also ask, too, that when we
20 get these invitations, which we got pretty late, that
21 we get some backup background information, which we
22 go when we arrived here. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay. Well, thank
24 you, Ms. Katzman for your testimony and for bringing
25 this very, very important issue to light. If you

2 haven't already, let's make sure you also connect to
3 our Committee on Women's Affairs. Maybe we have
4 joint hearing at some point. They have a wonderful
5 chair in Helen Rosenthal. Perhaps we can team up to
6 look at gender concerns or the concerns of women as
7 they related health more broadly, and so we'd love to
8 have you as part of that conversation.

9 SHEILA KATZMAN: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, is it Ms.
11 Luke? Is that right.

12 MARY LUKE: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, please.

14 MARY LUKE: Thank you. Thank you so
15 much, Commissioner and congratulations, and--

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: I'm just a lowly
17 City Council Member--

18 MARY LUKE: Oh, well. [laughter]

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --not a
20 commissioner, but--

21 MARY LUKE: That's true. [laughter]

22 Anyhow I'm—I am the President of the U.S. National
23 Committee the Metro New York Chapter and also on the
24 Steering Committee of this New York City 4 CEDAW
25 Initiative, and I think what we bring here is the

2 global perspective and the ability to connect the
3 global issues with the local issues, which I think
4 you--you asked earlier about the implications of New
5 York City's health disparities globally. So, our
6 role is to educate and advocate locally on issues
7 that affect women and girls globally, and using a
8 gender lens to advocate for health as a human right
9 with a focus on issues such as violence against
10 women, sexual and reproductive health and rights,
11 early marriage, economic and political participation.
12 So, we're going to speaking today mainly about the
13 importance of gender assessment based on gender
14 disaggregated data, and the planning policies the
15 services of the Department of Health and Mental
16 Hygiene. First, we really want to congratulate the
17 Center for Health Equity. They do fantastic work,
18 and I think we heard so much about it today, and your
19 questions were wonderful to really sharpen the focus
20 on certain aspects, which we totally agree with,
21 their Race to Justice Initiative, the New Gender
22 Justice Initiative, all of those are things that
23 really put the lens on issues that we are really all
24 concerned about. However, we feel that that Center
25 for Health Equity needs to continue to sharpen its

2 focus on planning and implementation through a gender
3 lens to add to the focus using the race-racial lens.
4 So, we think that's really important to kind of put
5 equal weight on both. The Center for Health Equity
6 has produced a really wonderful comprehensive report
7 called New York Takes Care 2020 and it reports on 26
8 indicators citywide by borough selected because of
9 your importance to community and social justice, and
10 this data has been captured by gen-by-yes, it's been
11 collected by gender. It really has not been
12 displayed by gender. So, what we see is data and
13 targets that were compared to baseline by race and
14 extreme poverty in neighborhoods. So, but-so we
15 don't have a sense of what the gender dimensions are
16 of that. Indicators such as obesity, physical
17 activity, overdose deaths, mental health needs [bell]
18 are all really needing to be looked at from a gender
19 perspective. So, our recommendations are what Ms.
20 Kaufman has already put forward. We really need to
21 have gender analysis. We need to have gender
22 disaggregated data. We would really encourage the
23 Department of Health and Mental Health to work
24 closely with the Commission on Gender Equity, and as
25 you just suggested the Commission on Women's Affairs.

2 We think that bringing together all of these agencies
3 and commissions that really are working towards the
4 same goal of gender and racial justice is really
5 important, and we would be happy to help in any way
6 by also really contributing toward the broader global
7 picture. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you. Okay,
9 sir. Sorry. Pinzon.

10 JUAN PINZON: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you.

12 JUAN PINZON: Thank you, Councilman and
13 thank you to your colleagues as well for holding this
14 hearing on this really important work for the Center
15 for Health Equity. My name is Juan Pinzon. I'm the
16 Director of Health Services at the Community Service
17 Society. CSS has a really long history, one of 75
18 years to be more precise. You know, being the voice
19 for low income and minority New Yorkers with health
20 programs. We help people enroll in health insurance.
21 We have the largest navigator grant from the state to
22 help people across the state enroll in health
23 insurance, but we also help people connect to care if
24 they—they cannot afford insurance. We also help them
25 understand their insurance and making sure that they

2 are able to access care through their insurance, and
3 we do that primarily through programs like Community
4 Health Advocates and Independent Consumer Advocacy
5 Network. Altogether we save about 1,000–100,000 New
6 Yorkers every year to these programs, and many of
7 these New Yorkers are people of color, but I also
8 wanted to make sure that we do this through this
9 Health (sic) Box model, which allows us to serve
10 consumers through a live-person help line, but we
11 have community based organizations, and more than 50
12 community-based organizations underground providing
13 these services. To day, I would like to talk more
14 about one of the initiatives that Dr. Maybank
15 mentioned in her testimony. This is the program
16 called Harlem Health Advocacy Partners, which is a
17 very unique initiative that serves five public
18 housing developments in East Harlem. We do this
19 with-together with the New York City Housing
20 Authority, and also with NYU CUNY Prevention Research
21 Center, and the goal of HHAP is to reduce health
22 disparities related to chronic diseases particularly
23 asthma that it is on hypertension. And since 2–2014,
24 CSS has served almost 900–900 residents with more
25 than 26,000 needs in this community. So, we are

2 recommending the city to expand the age and model to
3 all of our high need neighborhoods that could benefit
4 from these—from these services. The—the—the—the HR
5 model is very new (sic) because it's guided by a
6 health equity framework, and employs a three-pronged
7 approach to address the needs of the
8 administrations. So, the model combines the
9 assistance of 20—of 12 committee health workers, 3
10 CSS health advocates and 5 community health
11 organizers. The community health workers provide
12 health coaching to residences—to residents to manage
13 their existing health issues and set health goals for
14 the future. Then when residents address specific
15 barriers to health, and reach their goals by
16 providing them access to local health and social
17 services. The two advocates from CSS under our hand
18 provide health insurance enrollment and plus
19 enrollment expertise and assistance to help the
20 residents enroll, and use the health coverage, and we
21 work with community health workers to identify those
22 uninsured residents, enroll them in coverage and help
23 those who are already insured and make sure that they
24 are able to use the coverage. Health advocates also
25 have raised the ages—[bell] residents with questions

2 about the coverage. Since 2014, we have handled more
3 than 2,600 cases, and saved residents over \$170,000
4 in medical bills and connecting them to programs to
5 lower their prescription drugs. So, I just—I guess I
6 don't have time to go through my whole testimony, but
7 wanted to end by—by saying that this is a program
8 that we believe is already addressing the social
9 determinants of health, and you've seen health
10 disparities in East Harlem, and we believe this is a
11 program that we could easily expand to our
12 neighborhoods in—in New York City who—who need these
13 services. So, we hope that we can work there with
14 the Committee on Health and with the Department of
15 Health and Mental Hygiene to make this possible.
16 Thank you so much.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you. What—
18 where are you in East Harlem? Do you have your own
19 facility?

20 JUAN PINZON: So, we actually are located
21 in the Neighborhood Health Center--

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: [interposing] Got
23 it.

24 JUAN PINZON: --East Harlem. Yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, so you're
3 doing navigation and--and health insurance enrollment
4 at that site.

5 JUAN PINZON: Yeah. So, primarily, so
6 96% of the clients that we're serving actually
7 already have health insurance. Many of them are on
8 Medicare, Medicaid. Some of them involve Medicare
9 and Medicaid. So, our main function is actually
10 helping people, you know, understand their insurance--
11 -

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: [interposing] Right.

13 JUAN PINZON: --make sure that they don't
14 have any problem with the health insurance, which
15 happens very, very often. You know, medical bills.
16 People don't understand how to access them especially
17 how to, you know, access prescription drugs, medical
18 equipment. We help people with those issues.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Right. So, this
20 number I've seen is that there are 667,000 New
21 Yorkers who lack health insurance.

22 JUAN PINZON: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: That's around
24 adults. The kids are mostly covered by Child Health.

25 JUAN PINZON: Child Health, yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And many of them are
3 undocumented immigrants--

4 JUAN PINZON: Uh-hm.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --so that's a--that's
6 a separate challenge that we urgently need to
7 address.

8 JUAN PINZON: Right.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --but there are
10 still several hundred thousand. I don't know the
11 exact number but, in the hundreds of thousands of New
12 Yorkers who are eligible--

13 JUAN PINZON: [interposing] Right.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --for in the small
15 number of cases Medicaid--

16 JUAN PINZON: [interposing] Yeah.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --and in a large
18 number of cases, some subsidized insurance on the
19 exchange.

20 JUAN PINZON: Uh-hm.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: So, what could we do
22 to get every last one of them insured--what--that we're
23 not currently doing?

24 JUAN PINZON: Well, we need--so, the state
25 already funds the Navigator Program to help people

2 enroll in health insurance and it funds community
3 health advocacies where the people have access to-to
4 care and use their insurance, but there is not really
5 of lot of funding to community based organizations to
6 reach out to those people who are still uninsured.
7 There is—currently, there's an organization called
8 Access Health NYC, and it's a million dollars that
9 gives some of its funding to the city also to reach
10 out, but it's, you know, obviously not enough. So, I
11 think what we need is, you know, more funding for
12 community-based organizations to be able to do
13 community presentations, do home visits, be out in
14 the community and trying to get, you know, those
15 vulnerable New Yorkers, people who are, you know,
16 special immigrants who, you know, in this current
17 climate are very concerned about accessing care,
18 about applying for health insurance even if they're
19 eligible. So, we really need more resources to be
20 able to—to, you know, to do more outreach and reach
21 these hard to reach populations.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay. well that
23 sounds like something we need to be investing in for
24 sure, right. Excellent. Well, thank you, Juan and
25 thank you to the panel.

2 MARY LUKE: Thank you.

3 JUAN PINZON: Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Alright and this
5 concludes our hearing. Thank you all very much.

6 [gavel]

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 13, 2018