

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

----- X

October 20, 2016  
Start: 1:10 p.m.  
Recess: 1:54 p.m. 1

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.  
16<sup>th</sup> Fl

B E F O R E: BRAD S. LANDER  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez E. Dickens  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Margaret S. Chin  
Deborah L. Rose  
Jumaane D. Williams  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mark Levine  
Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito  
Steven Matteo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright. [gavel]

4 Good afternoon, and welcome to the New York City  
5 Council Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections.  
6 I'm Brad Lander, the Chair of the Committee, and  
7 we're joined this morning by committee members,  
8 Steven Matteo, Debbie Rose and Inez Dickens. We are  
9 doing two—I also want to acknowledge that counsel to  
10 the committee Patrick Bradford and thank our staff  
11 Chuck Davis, Director of Investigations as well  
12 Alyssa Burcell (sp?), Andre Johnson-Brown and Addo  
13 Knight. We have two nominations before us today. In  
14 a letter dated October 4, 2016, Mayor de Blasio  
15 formally submitted the name of Kenneth Mitchell to  
16 the Council for our advice and consent regarding his  
17 recommendation by the Staten Island Delegation of the  
18 Council for appointment to the New York City Taxi and  
19 Limousine Commission or the TLC, and in a letter  
20 dated October 9, 2016, the Mayor formally submitted  
21 the name of Laurie Hawkinson to the Council for our  
22 advice and consent regarding her nomination for  
23 appointment to the New York City Art Commission.  
24 We're doing to do Mr. Mitchell first, and I'll say  
25 just a couple of opening words, and then Council

2 Member Minority Leader Matteo will make an opening  
3 statement because he has to run down to another  
4 hearing where he has a bill on some very important  
5 oversight matters on, and then we'll proceed to Mr.  
6 Mitchell's opening statement and questions. And Ms.  
7 Hawkinson, you're welcome to stay there, but you're  
8 also—like we're going to—It's, yeah, we will—we're  
9 going to have, you know, Mr. Mitchell in the hot  
10 seat, you know. [laughs] No, very good. Exactly.  
11 You know, if we—if we throw something, you know, we  
12 don't want to hit you by accident. So, if Mr.  
13 Mitchell who's a Staten Island residents received the  
14 advice and consent of the Council and is subsequently  
15 appointed to the TLC, he will be eligible to complete  
16 the remainder of a seven-year term at the TLC  
17 expiring on January 31, 2022. I won't go through all  
18 it, but as folks know the Taxi and Limousine  
19 Commission oversees the—the broad array of policies  
20 around taxi and limousine and for-hire vehicle and  
21 black car service in New York City, and does a broad  
22 range of policy for oversight and regulation of that  
23 industry. In some cases, study rates, standards,  
24 criteria, licensing vehicles. When the driverless  
25 cars get here, they'll be the ones that license them

2 as well, at least the for-hire ones I suspect. It  
3 consists of nine members appointed by the Mayor all  
4 with our advice and consent. Five must be a resident  
5 from one from each of the five boroughs recommended  
6 by the majority vote of council members. Of that  
7 respective borough that's the seat here, the Staten  
8 Island position. They're appointed for a term of  
9 seven years and serve until the appointment and  
10 qualification of a successor. The Mayor then  
11 designates one member to act as chairperson and chief  
12 executive officer, and members other the chair are  
13 not compensated, and all proceedings of the TLC and  
14 documents or records in its possession are public  
15 records, and they make an annual report to this, and  
16 we do a lot of hearings on issues that are relevant  
17 to them and to us as well. So, Mr. Mitchell, thank  
18 you for being before us here today. We welcome your  
19 nomination. Before I ask you to be sworn in, to make  
20 your opening statement, I'm going to turn it over to  
21 Minority Leader Matteo for an opening statement.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you, Chair  
23 Lander, and I appreciate the time to make the opening  
24 statement. As you know, we sometimes have to be in  
25 two or three places at once. Welcome Council Member

2 Mitchell back. You—I love having you here, and on  
3 behalf of my delegation I’m very proud to speak in  
4 favor of the del—the delegations recommend—  
5 recommendations with the Staten Island representative  
6 on the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission.  
7 The TLC was and has been an important institution to  
8 my borough. We have a number of successful liver  
9 companies that have been serving Staten Islands for  
10 years. Our nominee former Council Member Kenny  
11 Mitchell knows the issues facing these small  
12 businesses as well as the transportation challenges  
13 faced by Staten Island. His time in the City Council  
14 both as a member and as chief of staff to his  
15 predecessor Mike McMahan prepared him well to  
16 carefully consider the matters that come before him,  
17 and he is uniquely suited to understand the needs of  
18 industry and the communities that they serve.  
19 Moreover, Kenny’s tenure as Executive Director of the  
20 Staten Island Zoo, one of Staten Island’s Premier  
21 not-for-profit entities give him a strong sensibility  
22 for compliance with professional standards and best  
23 practices and the nuances for budgeting at large  
24 complex entity. Kenny is the right mix of private  
25 experience and public service to make an ideal choice

2 to be Staten Island's voice on the TLC, which is why  
3 he has the unanimous support of our delegation. So I  
4 thank you, and I urge my colleagues to consider and  
5 support his nomination.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you, Minority  
7 Leader Matteo, and now I have extended you the—the  
8 pre-opening statement courtesy. I will do the same  
9 to Council Member Debbie Rose also from Staten Island  
10 for an opening statement.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you so much,  
12 Chair. Staten Island Staten Island has unique  
13 transportation issues. I'm—I'm not sure that  
14 everyone has heard from the Staten Island Delegation  
15 just how unique and—and one size does not fit all in  
16 terms of transportation issues or the challenges that  
17 we face. So Staten Islanders need strong voices at  
18 every level of city government, chief among them is  
19 transportation. Staten Island has an immense and  
20 unique challenge in this area, which will only  
21 increase with the new development. As you know,  
22 we're developing waterfront and several of our  
23 neighborhoods as an off-shore, and as new technology  
24 and business models are greatly altering the cab and  
25 car service industry, it's going to be necessary that

2 we have someone who recognizes what those needs are.

3 And with decades of experience in the public and non-

4 profit sectors, Kenny Mitchell—Ken Mitchell not only

5 knows Staten Island and its challenge as well, but he

6 also sees the citywide context and the perspective of

7 these challenges. He is well suited to advocate for

8 the interest of Staten Islanders as the TLC

9 Commissioner and I support his appointment to this

10 important position, and I know you're going to do

11 something about that those green cars, and things at

12 the—at the ferry terminal right? [laughter] Thanks.

13 KENNETH MITCHELL: That's so right.

14 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And we'll—we'll come

15 back to you to ask that question of him once we've

16 sworn him and hear his opening statement. [laughs]

17 Well, no, you can go first. I will give you that

18 first question, but alright, thank you Council Member

19 Rose. Council Member Mitchell, if you will raise

20 your hand to be sworn in.

21 LEGAL COUNSEL: Sir, do you swear of

22 affirm to—that the testimony you give today will be

23 the truth.

24 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We need to put you

25 on the mic.



2 KENNETH MITCHELL: I'm at the hearing.

3 LEGAL COUNSEL: Sir, do you swear or  
4 affirm that the testimony you give today will be the  
5 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth?

6 KENNETH MITCHELL: I swear.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much.  
8 Now, if you'll go ahead and proceed with your opening  
9 statement. Thank you.

10 KENNETH MITCHELL: Thank you, Chair  
11 Lander. Good afternoon, Chair Lander, and members of  
12 the Rules Committee. It is my pleasure and honor to  
13 be with you today regarding my potential appointment  
14 to the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission.  
15 By way of background, it's been a little awry, but  
16 for the past six years I served as the Executive  
17 Director of the Staten Island Zoo. The Staten Island  
18 Zoo is located on the eight-eight-acre park owned by  
19 the City of Island. The State Island Zoo hosts  
20 185,000 visitors per year. It is the home of 1,200  
21 animals, 70—and 350 species we're representing and 72  
22 are endangered. The zoo's additions are our  
23 conservation carousel and a sprawling outdoor habitat  
24 for animal leopards, which is the world's rarest cat.  
25 The zoo is a member of the New York City Cultural

2 Institutions Group, and is fully accredited by the  
3 Association of Zoos and Aquariums, and was named the  
4 best little zoo in the city of New York by the Wall  
5 Street Journal. So I always have to give a plug for  
6 Staten Island Zoo wherever I go.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: You know the  
8 groundhog questions are coming, don't you so-  
9 [laughter]

10 KENNETH MITCHELL: I would have brought  
11 my zoo counsel. [laughs] Prior to my appointment as  
12 Executive of the Staten Island Zoo, I served as a  
13 member of the New York City Council for the 49<sup>th</sup>  
14 District succeeding the Honorable Michael McMahan,  
15 and the city hard work, tenacity and dedication of  
16 Council Member Rose. I wasn't there that long  
17 [laughter] but it will work out in the end. Prior to  
18 that, I served as Councilman McMahan's Chief of  
19 Staff. While-while in the City Council I served on  
20 the Sanitation, Health, Juvenile Justice and  
21 Oversight and Investigation Committees, an experience  
22 that reinforced a deep appreciation for the important  
23 work of the City Council affecting nearly-nearly  
24 every aspect of the lives of our citizens. From 1997  
25 to 2001, I served as a law clerk and court attorney

2 in Kings County Supreme Court and Richmond County

3 Criminal Court. I am a lifelong third generation

4 Staten Islander. I reside in the new Brighton

5 section of Staten Island. My wife Jaqueline, a

6 public school teacher and my five-year-old son

7 Charlie. I've long had a deep passion to sever and

8 give back to my community. As a member of Community

9 Board 1 on Staten Island at the age 19 with Council

10 Member Rose. So her and I go way back. [laughs] But

11 I was the youngest at that time. I was instrumental

12 at the age of 22 in downsizing my neighborhood to

13 protect it from overdevelopment. Throughout my life

14 I have continuously worked in my community. I have

15 served on numerous not-for-profit boards working for

16 the betterment of the Staten Island community.

17 Currently, I'm a member of the Lifestyles for

18 Disabled Board, which provides realistic work setting

19 for the developmentally disabled; United Activities,

20 which provides for after school activities; tutoring,

21 counseling, day camps and summer youth employment for

22 children, many of whom are at risk. I am on the

23 board of the Staten Island Economic Development

24 Corporation, an organization and mission-whose

25 mission is to enhance the Staten Island community by

2 promoting public and private investment to improve  
3 the quality of life and provide employment  
4 opportunities in the borough. As I hope you can see,  
5 I have long had the desire and deep compassion to  
6 serve and give back to my community. I would welcome  
7 and embrace this opportunity to serve as the New York  
8 City as the New York City Taxi and Limousine  
9 Commissioner, and to work to provide that all New  
10 Yorkers and visitors to the city have access to taxi  
11 cabs, car services, and commuter van services that  
12 are safe, sufficiently plentiful and provide good  
13 passenger service. Thank you for this opportunity  
14 today, and I'd be happy to answer any questions you  
15 may have for me.

16 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much.  
17 I will point members to the pre-hearing questions,  
18 which go into a lot of the different issues facing  
19 the TLC that were submitted in advance, but we'll ask  
20 a few of them, and I guess I just want to start in a  
21 certain way. Council Member Rose alluded to the  
22 particular needs of State Island, and I just, you  
23 know, how do you see your role particularly as the  
24 State Island member of the—of the TLC addressing, you

2 know, the particular needs that the--that the borough  
3 has in relationship to taxi and for hire limousines.

4 KENNETH MITCHELL: Staten Island, as you  
5 know, is a very unique place. We don't have a  
6 subway. In fact, there was an article in the Staten  
7 Island Leader (sic) yesterday that said don't expect  
8 one for the next century. So it's a very unique  
9 place as far as transportation issues. For the most  
10 part, our--our community depends greatly on livery  
11 based community car services. We're seeing--we're  
12 beginning to see a use of Uber, but the communities,  
13 in my opinion, still is leaning towards the livery  
14 based car service. I think it's important that we  
15 give them the opportunity to continue to thrive on  
16 Staten Island, and also with transportation on Staten  
17 Island, you know, not even regarding taxis, you know,  
18 there is a need for rapid bus transit and other  
19 issues, and I would work on the TLC Commission to  
20 see if we could bring all things about.

21 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And now I'll just  
22 ask one more question, then I'll--I'll turn it over  
23 to--to my colleagues, but I think you alluded to this  
24 in the questions around Uber, but the--the field is in  
25 a significant transition because obviously there's

2 substantial growth of apps--of app-growth of app-based  
3 services especially, but not only Uber. That is  
4 leading to a whole set of kind cascading changes in  
5 yellows and greens and for-hires and raises  
6 questions, and policy questions around accessibility  
7 around access. I was only half hearing. There is  
8 actually a hearing in the Council next week on  
9 driverless cars. So, you know, I--and I just wonder,  
10 you know, you don't have a--like a--a history in  
11 working on this set of issues. So, what will you  
12 bring, how will you be looking at that set of policy  
13 questions--

14 KENNETH MITCHELL: [interposing] I think--

15 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --and transitions as  
16 things evolve over time?

17 KENNETH MITCHELL: I think I would it  
18 back when they asked me to become Executive Director  
19 of the Zoo. I had no experience running a zoo, let  
20 along working in a zo, but one of the things I  
21 brought to the table was I took a look and I--Yeah,  
22 when I took over the Staten Island Zoo, it was in bad  
23 financial straights, and one of the things is I  
24 realized I had to develop consensus between the city  
25 and the DC37 Union, our funders our Board of Trustees

2 and com about with a solution and, you know, we were  
3 able to all work together and come up with a viable  
4 solution-solution. Now, the zoo is a viable  
5 institution on Staten Island. I would apply that  
6 same prospect here-process here to TLC where I'd  
7 gather all the stakeholder together, the City  
8 Council, the Mayor's Office, the members of the  
9 industry, the drivers, the passengers, and see what  
10 consensus we can come to making sure that we continue  
11 to provide reliable, safe and sufficiently plentiful  
12 taxi service on-in the city of New York.

13 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And on any of those  
14 specific issues, you know, we're grappling, for  
15 example, with how we ensure accessibility in the for-  
16 hire system. There's rules for the yellows. There's  
17 not yet rules for accessibility around for-hire  
18 vehicles. You know, just do you have in addition to  
19 the good goal of always seeking to kind of talk to  
20 all stakeholders and-and ensure consensus some, you  
21 know, principles you'll bring, some ideas about how  
22 to make sure we-

23 KENNETH MITCHELL: [interposing] I think  
24 this-I believe-I firmly believe that we have to apply  
25 the rules across the board as far as accessibility is

2 concerned. We can't have one set of rules for one  
3 group and one set of rules for another. So we have  
4 to—you know, I'll look at it and see what we can do  
5 to make sure the accessibility is provided in all  
6 facets of the industry.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you. Council  
8 Member Rose as our--the remaining Staten Island  
9 member, do you have questions that you--that you want  
10 to ask before we move on?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Just--just maybe one  
12 or two. Knowing the uniqueness of Staten Island,  
13 and--and the situation with the green cars, and the  
14 fact that there are very few on Staten Island, and I  
15 don't even know how much they are actually utilized.  
16 How would you sort of promote them and--or do you  
17 think that there's a need to increase the fleet of  
18 green cars, and if so, how would you promote them so  
19 that Staten Islanders would actually benefit and--and  
20 utilize them?

21 KENNETH MITCHELL: I have to--I agree with  
22 you Council Member Rose. I--I see very few of the  
23 green taxis on Staten Island. I think that a lot of  
24 folks don't realize that they can have them. They  
25 just see them driving around, and just think they're



2 green, and it's okay if they don't get it. I-I  
3 alluded in my-I mentioned in my pre-questionnaire  
4 that I think we have to have more public outreach  
5 regarding what that service is for whether that be  
6 social media, traditional media, and things of that  
7 nature. Let the public know that they can have those  
8 cars. And certainly we need more of them on Staten  
9 Island. I think they probably think it's a volume  
10 issue on Staten Island, but certain sections of  
11 Staten Island certainly could use those green cabs.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Is there anything  
13 special you would do inform the-the community about  
14 it.

15 KENNETH MITCHELL: I think we could-I  
16 would-I would work with the council, the city, the  
17 TLC. I think we could work on a public awareness  
18 campaign that adds social media. One of the things I  
19 found at the zoo. We weren't doing well with  
20 promoting ourselves on social media. Now, we want to  
21 get something out there. We're slap it up on social  
22 media and people come to the-the actual print media  
23 comes to us because that's where they're picking it  
24 up.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And I've—I've  
3 actually experienced here in Manhattan where a taxi  
4 driver would not pick me up because I was a person of  
5 color. On Staten Island it's somewhat different  
6 because we don't have street hails, but we have  
7 livery services that refuse to go into certain  
8 communities after a certain hour. Is this something  
9 that you would try to address as the TLC  
10 Commissioner?

11 KENNETH MITCHELL: Absolutely, that would  
12 be something we would have to address, and the way to  
13 address it is to enforce, and we would have to do  
14 spot checks and, you know, do enforcement to let  
15 these drivers know that these commuters—and let based  
16 out operators know that these communities need to be  
17 served.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And—and then the  
19 last question is at the ferry terminal, we had issues  
20 of dollar vans versus livery cabs versus all types of  
21 modes of transportation. What—what is your feeling  
22 about the—the dollar vans coming into the ferry  
23 terminal?

24 KENNETH MITCHELL: I think with regard to  
25 the dollar vans, they have—we have to make sure that

2 they're regulated. We have to think of--listen I--I  
3 took--I'm a North Shore Staten Islander. Just like  
4 you, I utilize--utilize the cab service at the ferry.  
5 Sometimes it reminds me of where I go to work every  
6 day. It's a zoo and also it's crazy. [laughter]  
7 But I--I certainly think we need to take a look at  
8 making sure that anybody that goes in there is  
9 regulated. Is there a need? Is it providing safe  
10 and reliable service, and one of the things--I have to  
11 agree, one of the things I said should--should the  
12 City Council appoint me to this position, one of the  
13 things I would like to take a look at is that the  
14 ferry and the entire operation. When I go there, I  
15 notice that they're trying to put as many people into  
16 a car as possible. They're not giving you an option  
17 to go by yourself.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: That's one of--

19 KENNETH MITCHELL: That's something that  
20 I would work with TLC staff to see what we can do to  
21 make that more safe and reliable and provide quality  
22 service for Staten Island using that service.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And this is just a  
24 comment. You know, I really hope that you focus also  
25 on accessibility issues for people who have varying

2 stages of disabilities even Council Members with knee  
3 replacements and things like that.

4 KENNETH MITCHELL: [laughs]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you.

6 KENNETH MITCHELL: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And—and  
8 congratulations. I hope you are voted.

9 KENNETH MITCHELL: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you, Council  
11 Member Rose. We have been joined by Council Members  
12 Chin and Garodnick. Welcome. Do any of the other  
13 council members have questions for this nominee?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic] I do.

15 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Council Member Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Good afternoon.

17 Just to follow up with what my colleague was talking  
18 about. One of the things that I've been working with  
19 the TLC on is it's willing to help commuter vans,  
20 help legalize them, help them become more safe, and  
21 also to educate the public, which one are the ones  
22 that are legal that have the sticker (sic), you know  
23 they have insurance, and then the public needs to  
24 know that. I mean down the road, we need these forms  
25 of transportation. I mean in my community like going

2 from Chinatown, you know, to Queens or Chinatown to  
3 Brooklyn, they are—they care of a lot of people. So,  
4 I think TLC I think going forward I would hope that  
5 you can also really look at this industry, and sort  
6 of help make it better because they do serve a vital  
7 services especially for a lot of communities, and  
8 also communities where public transportation are not  
9 that accessible.

10 KENNETH MITCHELL: I agree. It's  
11 something we should look at.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright, I think in  
14 light of those answers and of our—both our Staten  
15 Island colleagues' strong support, we can—we can  
16 conclude this hearing. I should have said this at  
17 the outset. We don't vote in this committee on the—  
18 on the day of the hearing. We like to provide some  
19 time for—I think these are both going to go very  
20 smoothly and not raise issues, but when issues arise,  
21 we have a little room to digest them afterwards. So,  
22 we'll put the hearing into recess, and we will reopen  
23 the committee mostly likely next Thursday on the day  
24 of our Stated Meeting to vote out these nominations.  
25 So thank you very much.

2 KENNETH MITCHELL: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We'll close the  
4 hearing on this nomination. It's an honor to have  
5 you with this, and thank you for your time, and we  
6 will now go to our second nominee of the day. As I  
7 mentioned before that is of Laurie Hawkinson to be  
8 considered for the Art Commission nominated by the  
9 Mayor as the Council gives our advice consent. Ms.  
10 Hawkinson, was a Manhattan resident, will be  
11 appointed to the Art Commission in the seat  
12 designated for an architect and be eligible to  
13 complete the remainder of a three-year term that  
14 expires on December 31, 2016. The Art Commission  
15 also known as the Public Design Commission reviews  
16 permanent works of art, architecture and landscape  
17 architecture on or over city-owned property whether  
18 construction and renovation—and renovation,  
19 restoration of buildings, museums, libraries, parks,  
20 lighting, streetscape elements, and anything else  
21 that's in the public realm. The Commission is  
22 composed of the Mayor and his or her representative.  
23 The President of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, the  
24 President of the New York Public Library, the  
25 President of the Brooklyn Museum, one painter, one

2 sculptor, one architect, one landscape architect all  
3 of whom have to be residents and three other  
4 residents who can't be painters, sculptors,  
5 architects, landscape architects or active members of  
6 any fine—other profession in the fine arts, and their  
7 last names cannot end in L. We know that that last  
8 part was not true. The Mayor and the Museum and  
9 Library President serve in ex officio capacity, and  
10 the members serve without compensation. There's a—a—  
11 a paid director or chair, but that's not one of the  
12 positions we're considering now. We've done a number  
13 of these nominations in the committee, and I think  
14 developed a—a good dialogue with the nominees and  
15 with the Executive Director, who doesn't come before  
16 the commission, but I think in previous terms we  
17 wrapped that dialogue, and I'm pleased to say in my  
18 time as Chair, we've built up a very good dialogue  
19 with the Executive Director. Had a chance to have  
20 good dialogue at our nominations hearings, and I  
21 think those have actually just been oversight hearing  
22 on the Public Design Commission. I think we've made  
23 a lot of progress as a Council. And so we welcome  
24 you here, and ask again that you raise your hand to  
25 swear or affirm that you'll tell the truth, and then

2 give your opening statement, and we'll ask some  
3 questions.

4 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Okay. Okay.

5 LEGAL COUNSEL: Would you please raise  
6 your right hand. Do you swear or affirm that the  
7 testimony you give today will be the truth, the whole  
8 truth and nothing but the truth?

9 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thanks very much,  
11 and if you'll go ahead and give your opening  
12 statement.

13 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Okay, great. Thank  
14 you for having me. Good afternoon, Chair Lander, and  
15 members of the Rules, Privilege and Elections  
16 Committee of the New York City Council. My name is  
17 Laurie Hawkinson, and I'm honored to be here before  
18 you today. I arrived in New Your City almost 40  
19 years ago--I can't believe it's that long. I'm not  
20 that old--as a student of the Whitney Independent  
21 Study Program for Post-Graduate Studies in Studio  
22 Art. I later received my professional degree in  
23 architecture from the illustrious Cooper Union, and  
24 went to teach architecture and form a practice with  
25 my partner Henry Smith-Miller. I tell you this



2 because my background and experience are both in art  
3 and architecture.

4 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I'm not sure that's  
5 allowed under the charter, though. Just a joke.

6 [laughter] All those firms.

7 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Professionally, yes.  
8 I have more than 30 years of experience as a public  
9 architect and have completed several city and federal  
10 projects both for design excellent programs and for  
11 the New York City Department of Design and  
12 Construction and GSA, which is the General Services  
13 Administration. I've completed public architecture  
14 projects with individual artists participating in  
15 Percent for Art programs, and for NYCDDC at Pier 11  
16 Wall Street Ferry Terminal. Maybe some of you have  
17 gone in and out of there, and at the Port of Entry at  
18 Massena, New York, which I doubt you have. It's very  
19 cold. It's an unbelievably northern site on the New  
20 York State border for the GSA. I'm interested in the  
21 public realm. I'm committed to equity and service to  
22 the public, and committed to design excellence. So,  
23 what is design excellence and how do we know it when  
24 we see it? So I thought I'd talk about that for a  
25 minute. Design excellence is expressed in a generous

2 Democratic approach to space within and outside of  
3 buildings. Architecture and art marked by design  
4 excellence is built for the people who use it, and  
5 it's connected to its surroundings creating a  
6 compelling alternative world open to all. It's design  
7 is determined not by fashion, not by a desire to  
8 generate a spectacle for its own sake, but through  
9 varied ideas and techniques through which it's  
10 created. Design excellence is marked by creativity,  
11 and creativity could be meeting budgets, meeting  
12 schedules, and sometimes doing the most with very  
13 limited means, and that's what we often are doing in  
14 architecture. We're trying to do the most with very  
15 limited means. Design excellence is sensitive to  
16 local context in different communities and  
17 constituencies. Design excellence also reflects an  
18 understanding that materials in the public realm must  
19 stand the test of time, and must be extremely  
20 resistant to weather, wear and tear. Design  
21 excellence is often the result of collaboration,  
22 collaboration with other professionals, artists,  
23 stakeholders, communities and constituencies. Design  
24 excellence for the public realm is not created in a  
25 vacuum, but through a process of open feedback and

2 exchange. Design excellence has no specific scale or  
3 function. It can be small—as small or beautiful as  
4 a—as a beautifully designed handrail or a handicap  
5 access ramp, or as larger as piece of infrastructure  
6 in the city. Design excellence applies to—it could  
7 be in proportion of a walkway, a walking path, the  
8 material and design of curb cut for a wheelchair is  
9 important, or a very large elegantly designed bridge  
10 or roadway. Design excellence also engages with  
11 long-term issues of climate change and the impact of  
12 a change to the environment. It requires a  
13 commitment to work creatively with the realities and  
14 constraints on one of the biggest challenges we face  
15 in New York City and globally. Just as our city is  
16 changing, so are the materials and methods that we  
17 use to construct our buildings and our public spaces.  
18 So design essence is also innovate. New materials  
19 such as high strength concrete, plastics,  
20 prefabricated systems, innovations using tried and  
21 true materials such as wood, which are now even being  
22 used in high-rise construction, are being tested  
23 successfully today. In my practice as an architect,  
24 I hold design excellence to be the foundation for all  
25 the projects we work on. For example, when thinking

2 about the design of a temporary public art piece for  
3 creative time, which was actually right over here a  
4 Foley Square—and some of you might have seen it. It  
5 was called Freedom of Expression National Monument.

6 I found it important to create it, and give the  
7 public an opportunity to voice their opinions

8 together with an artisan, performance artist we  
9 worked on. The project involved both of them,

10 creating a very large red megaphone positioned  
11 downtown inviting the public to step and speak out.

12 I've also been involved with the design of Louise  
13 Nevelson Plaza in Lower Manhattan, which provided

14 public open space in an area of Manhattan where very  
15 little exists and still does. At the same time, it

16 also restored and displaced five very large

17 sculptures by the artist. It was important for me to

18 design a plaza that was symbolic and symbiotic,

19 excuse me, to both pedestrians and motorists because

20 there's a lot of crosstown traffic there. I designed

21 the Zerega EMS Station in the Bronx, which proudly

22 displays a fifth-façade with a green roof. We have

23 the first—there's a green roof for a fire station in

24 Manhattan, a solar water heater, water collection to

25 a cistern. It's used by a community garden next

2 door, all these things we fought for for the project.  
3 My goal is to give residents of the public housing  
4 project next door a great view from their windows as  
5 they look on the roof of this building. I don't want  
6 the building to serve one purpose. I wanted it to  
7 bridge to the community together. In honoring—I'm  
8 honored to be considered for the Public Design  
9 Commission and to use my expertise in assisting  
10 projects for this review. Thank you for your  
11 consideration for nomination, and I'm happy to take  
12 any questions.

13 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much.  
14 It's great to have you here, and obviously reviewing  
15 your resume and your pre-hearing answers and learning  
16 about your experience, you have, you know, it's great  
17 to see someone with the-the qualifications and who  
18 has done projects in both the public and the private  
19 realm and gone through some these processes. As we  
20 talked about before, I noticed we—we want people who  
21 have gone through them, obviously people who have  
22 gone through them may find themselves still in the  
23 middle. So I know--

24 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Right.

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --have sought and  
3 received guidance from the Conflicts of Interest  
4 Board about a couple of projects that you have, and  
5 you have a letter from them.

6 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Uh-huh.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: If you could just  
8 for the record outline what that, you know, what that  
9 finding was and commit to abide by it.

10 LAURIE HAWKINSON: So I'm—I will seek and  
11 follow the guidance of the COIB and the Council of  
12 the PDC and Sidney Neslon, who is the head of the PC—  
13 she wrote on my behalf to the Conflicts of Interest  
14 Board, and I've read and I understand the COIB  
15 letter. So I have no problem, and I—we—just to go  
16 onto say that we are not selected for the next—well,  
17 20 projects with PDC. So I don't expect we would be—  
18 there would be any projects coming up.

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: It's my  
20 understanding there are two that you have currently  
21 that are--

22 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] We have  
23 two current projects. One for the Brooklyn Animal  
24 Shelter in—on Linden and Shepherd Avenue and Essex,  
25 near Essex Street, and that one will go before it,

2 and my partner Henry Smith-Miller will be—is charge  
3 of that project and he'll be taking it through, and  
4 then we have Queens Garage 7, a Sanitation garage  
5 project that is in the very early stages. I—I don't  
6 know. That's a long—we have—we haven't even—we don't  
7 even have a contract yet. So I don't know, but that  
8 could come before us. So those are the only two I  
9 can imagine, and I would on both of those would  
10 recuse myself.

11 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Okay, thank you.

12 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Uh-huh.

13 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I thought your—your  
14 general outline of design excellence and what it  
15 means was excellent in your testimony. I wonder if  
16 you could give an example or two of a place where  
17 either, you know, it doesn't have to be going through  
18 the PDC, but in some kind of review process either.  
19 You--you know, a change was brought to your attention  
20 that you made on one of your projects that's the kind  
21 of thing you would look to do in your service--

22 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Uh-huh.

23 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --or that you've  
24 made such a suggestion and gotten-- You know, help  
25 us walk through it. We're not—we're not out. We

2 don't see those meetings. You know, what are some  
3 examples of things where, you know, either through  
4 your intervention or a project that you had through  
5 that kind of intervention on principles like the ones  
6 you articulated changes were made that you'd look to  
7 be, you know, the kinds of things you'd be looking  
8 out to—to adjust and--and make changes of in your  
9 space?

10 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Well, you know, it  
11 could be anything from a material that I might have  
12 some experience with and I could maybe warn them that  
13 this is not going to work. Be as simple as that, or  
14 it could be on a project where I might be advocating  
15 for more space in a lobby for passing research (sic)  
16 or something. So, in my own experience I think—I can  
17 think of Louise Nevelson Plaza. There was, you know,  
18 concerns about lighting levels. You know, we had to  
19 demonstrate that it was safe, you know, at night even  
20 though—and we did have a tremendous amount of  
21 illumination from the street light. So I think, you  
22 know, there are very pragmatic and practical concerns  
23 that—that we would take on in the Design Commission.  
24 I'm just say we already, but I would find it to be my  
25 responsibility to take on. So it's not just the



2 aesthetic but also pragmatic concerns that are super  
3 important.

4 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And then let me ask  
5 a little more about those pragmatic concerns as I  
6 think you, and I, you know, just speaking personally,  
7 I'm a—a big fan of—of design excellence in the public  
8 realm It's something I care a lot about, and love  
9 that you bring that disposition. Members of the  
10 Council much more in the previous term than in this  
11 one, I have experienced frustration with PDC when  
12 projects especially in the Parks Department, but  
13 other kinds of projects as well, were subjected to  
14 reviews that took time or added cost or delayed  
15 projects in ways that members felt were either  
16 overwrought for what the project was, or didn't  
17 recognize the challenge of constrained budgets and  
18 how long it takes to make capital projects happen.  
19 Those things have improved substantially in this  
20 term, and I think the relationship between the PDC  
21 and the Parks Department is—is much improved, but  
22 this remains an issue. You know, there's a tension  
23 between design excellence on the one hand and cost  
24 and in some cases, you know, expeditious processing  
25 on the other. So, if you could just speak to that

2 tension and how you'll view it, and maybe how you've  
3 adjusted, you know, how you've addressed it in--in  
4 your own work on public--on public projects in  
5 particular, that would be helpful.

6 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Well, as someone with  
7 I think and in-depth understanding of public capital  
8 projects, I'd work to review the projects in as  
9 efficient way as possible, and, you know, I'm very  
10 sympathetic to that--these on the other side. So I'd  
11 want to I think encourage agencies to submit projects  
12 to the Commission as early in the design process to  
13 allow for more collaboration because I think if  
14 there's more early on discussion maybe you can avoid  
15 any delays afterwards, but I think the process is,  
16 you know, there's either one, two or three meetings  
17 and it can--it's quite streamlined, and I think that  
18 I--it would be in our interest and it's certainly in  
19 my interest to--for those to be as efficient as  
20 possible, and not to cause delays. In terms of, you  
21 know, I'm pretty aware of what things cost even  
22 though if somebody were to come to me as a client I  
23 often say I--I don't want to give prices, but I--I--  
24 having for 30 years in the public realm I do know.  
25 And so, I--I'm aware of when I'm--would be requirements

2 and you're asking somebody to change a material, it's  
3 some, you know, cost implication, and I wouldn't by  
4 any means want to do that. So I respect that  
5 process.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright. I might  
7 ask a few more questions in this vain, but I suspect  
8 my colleagues will have some of those as well. We've  
9 been joined by Council Member Jumaane Williams from  
10 Brooklyn, and I recognize Council Member Garodnick  
11 for questions.

12 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Hi.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very  
14 much, Mr. Chairman. I really just have a couple of  
15 questions and they related to the quoted letter, and  
16 I just wanted to follow up--

17 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Yes, uh-huh.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --because  
19 obviously, your--your credentials are--

20 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] I have  
21 it here, yep.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --are very good  
23 for the position. So I won't even try to pretend  
24 expertise on the subject.

2 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] I'm  
3 sorry there was so much paper. I made like one page  
4 of statement. This is for Greenfield--Council Member  
5 Greenfield. He said my resume is too long so--  
6 [laughter] I was very efficient.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Well, you did  
8 the trick.

9 LAURIE HAWKINSON: I didn't want to waste  
10 paper.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: No, we  
12 appreciated him, but perhaps more than the--the Design  
13 Commission I might have a little more expertise on  
14 the subject of the legal guidance you got from COIB--

15 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Okay.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And one thing  
17 confused me that I just wanted to run through with  
18 you if you don't mind. The--the advice that you got  
19 was that you--that it wouldn't be a conflict for your  
20 firm--

21 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Smith-Miller and  
22 Hawkinson.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Smith-Miller  
24 and Hawkinson Architects LLP to appear before the  
25 Commission on projects that are sponsored by the

2 city, or by a city affiliated not-for-profit. So  
3 what I wanted understand is--

4 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Yep.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --I get the  
6 projects sponsored by the city. That's sounds like  
7 the Sanitation garage in Queens, simple and easy.

8 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Uh-huh.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: A city  
10 affiliated not-for-profit. Can you help me  
11 understand what constitutes a city-affiliated not-  
12 for-profit?

13 LAURIE HAWKINSON: I don't have any of  
14 those projects in my office right now. I could  
15 imagine it might be something where a--an organization  
16 is receiving money in terms of grants from the city  
17 because I'm on a--I'm a board of the Wooster Group,  
18 for instances, for performing garage downtown. If I  
19 were there architect maybe and I had to go before the  
20 PDC, I would have to--I think because I'm on their  
21 board, I would have to step aside, or if I were--if  
22 that organization I mean if it was for MOMA and I  
23 were doing--I wish I wasn't doing anything else, but  
24 in addition to MOMA, and they're receiving funds from  
25

2 the city. That's my understanding, and so correct me  
3 if I'm wrong.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Well, I  
5 actually don't know. I'm-I'm--

6 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Yeah, that's my  
7 understanding.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --asking  
9 because I actually think it's worth our--

10 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Yeah.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --  
12 understanding because I actually don't-I don't think-  
13 -

14 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] We don't  
15 either, just to be honest but that's what I would  
16 say.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I don't think  
18 that the COIB letter actually defines your particular  
19 position as to that not-for-profit, but it talks  
20 about--

21 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] I don't  
22 have any of those projects right now,

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: But it talks  
24 about city affiliated not-for-profit.

25 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Oh, I see. I see.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And so I will  
3 provide this. Mr. Chairman, maybe you can help if  
4 you want for this issue. (sic)

5 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Oh, it's  
6 like the Central Park Conservancy or something maybe.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I don't—I  
8 don't know.

9 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Okay.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I don't know  
11 and so I would—I would like to understand that.

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: So I'm—well, two  
13 things I'll say. One, this is why we do these  
14 hearing with a little time before we vote, and I  
15 think we can just make sure. If they don't have it  
16 fully understood, we clarify it before we vote next  
17 week. I'm advised by Chuck Davis that—that—that he  
18 believes that things like—and let's remember, it's  
19 only public realm projects that come before PDC. So  
20 it wouldn't be a non-profit with city funding doing  
21 its own project

22 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Okay, so  
23 my mistake.

24 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --but, you know, a  
25 project in Central Park that's the Central Park

2 Conservancy is commissioning, you know, then-then  
3 that sits on public land. So, you know, they do a  
4 project. It might well come before the commission,  
5 but let's-

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [interposing]  
7 Right, but the problem parameter-

8 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --say PDC adverse-

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --if it's  
10 defined as a not-for-profit that receives any money  
11 from the City, that is doing a project that appears  
12 before the Design Commission. That may be  
13 unnecessarily inclusive in a way that perhaps COIB  
14 did not intend to be. So I-I-I don't know. It's  
15 sort of something, which jumped-just jumped out at me  
16 as I looked at this.

17 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Sure.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: It's not  
19 really a design question. So I apologize, but it  
20 really is a question perhaps more internally and for  
21 the Mayor's Office as to what exactly that means. So  
22 I-I--

23 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: [interposing] Well,  
24 let's ask our-



2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --I will read  
3 it.

4 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --and--and the  
5 Mayor's counsel to work together just to clarify this  
6 with COIB to make sure that we understand it.

7 LAURIE HAWKINSON: And--and let me know if  
8 there's anything else in my---[laughter]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Good. Thank  
10 you.

11 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Yeah.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you.

13 Oh, and--

14 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And in those  
16 situations, you are permitted to work at the firm and  
17 share profits, but you are not allowed to appear  
18 before the commission on behalf of the firm, and you  
19 would recuse yourself--

20 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Correct.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --as a member  
22 of the--the--the Commission in those situations?

23 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Right. I understand  
24 that.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I'm just building on  
3 this as I understand it on--so you have the two  
4 projects you identified--

5 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Uh-huh.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --going forward  
7 because you are not for next year on that list, it's--  
8 it's like to be--

9 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Yeah,  
10 and I think they're every other year. So it would be  
11 at least two years.

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: So, it may not be a  
13 problem at all, but there is room if your firm  
14 obtained--it does obtain a commission on a project,  
15 which would come before the Commission that your  
16 partner would handle the project, and you would  
17 recuse yourself from--from it when it came before PDC.

18 LAURIE HAWKINSON: I agree.

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Okay. Any other  
20 questions from other Council Members?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.  
22 I'll just make a comment because in talking to the  
23 constituents in the district, and I did have an  
24 opportunity to talk with her over the phone, and I,  
25 you know, really thank the Mayor for the nomination

2 because she's highly qualified And I was really  
3 impressed about the part about really engaging the  
4 public--

5 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Uh-huh.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --and I know the  
7 Chair has talked about earlier that the frustration a  
8 lot of us have is--it's taking too long, you know, as  
9 commissions. So hopefully, you can help us to  
10 continue with the changes there to sort of help speed  
11 the process. Maybe you could just talk a little bit  
12 about, you know, based on your experience how to  
13 really get the public more engaged, and also  
14 understand the role of the Arts Commission, and how  
15 that--and how that work and--and how their comment and  
16 suggestion does have some impact.

17 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Uh-huh. So, of course,  
18 the public is invited to the meetings, which is  
19 great, and they're also put online afterwards because  
20 they are taped. So, you know, that process, and--and  
21 they would learn about projects at community board  
22 hearings. So they would have the opportunity to come  
23 there or to--to the public hearing. So I would  
24 encourage that. The, you know, the mission of the  
25 PDC, which is to meet both programmatic and

2 environmental requirements of projects, and improve  
3 the quality of life is what I want to do is really  
4 improve the quality of life in the most positive way  
5 we possibly could, and provide valuable public  
6 service to every neighborhood throughout the-  
7 throughout the city. So I'm hoping. You know, it's  
8 my hope that that can be done. I think that the  
9 community engagement is very important, and it's a  
10 dialogue. It's a dialogue and it's a dialogue and  
11 that's what projects are, architectural projects and  
12 art projects in the public realm are an iterative  
13 process, which means you take in information. You  
14 work, you give it back and that's how the most  
15 successful projects are created I think. So I'll be  
16 working very hard to make sure that happens and to  
17 encourage the community's engagement and involvement.

18 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And maybe I'll just  
19 extend on this question a little bit, and I think in  
20 some ways it's a little less the-you know, the-the  
21 Art Commission has the prescribed rule under the  
22 Charter--

23 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Uh-huh.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --and when you get  
3 the projects, you know, you don't go out in the field  
4 and engage community residents, you know.

5 LAURIE HAWKINSON: No, not it's those  
6 formats we have.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: But I do wonder I  
8 mean I—I think one, and this speaks to some of the  
9 things you said about design excellence, and it  
10 speaks to the belief that Council Members have of  
11 wanting that engagement. And just wonder if you  
12 could maybe talk a little bit on either architecture  
13 or art projects where—I—I—I think certainly on our  
14 end we are often pushing agencies to engage earlier  
15 and in ways that enable people who are not  
16 professionals to—to give input into projects.

17 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Uh-huh.

18 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: That's not a simple  
19 thing to do necessarily. When you can show people  
20 your drawings, you like it or you do not like it, but  
21 if you really want, you know, especially on a public  
22 art commission, but even on projects around park  
23 redesign, you know, there are methodologies for  
24 outreach and input and dialogue that I think can be  
25 more successful. And I just wonder what experience

2 you've had engaging members of the public on some of  
3 the projects and how you—how get greater value to it.

4 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Projects  
5 at the Canadian border?

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Yes, you know. This  
7 doesn't need to be here.

8 LAURIE HAWKINSON: So—so the Massena, the  
9 Port of Entry at Massena, which I bet you've never  
10 been there.

11 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Yeah. [laughs]

12 LAURIE HAWKINSON: We worked—it's very  
13 interesting because the border is there—the border  
14 was there before the Anasazi Nation was there. So we  
15 were working with them because they went back—they go  
16 back and forth across the border all the time because  
17 their burial grounds is a big place. Sports on one  
18 side. It's—the border doesn't exist, and so here  
19 we've got this border. The border has been hardened  
20 after 9/11, and we were working really hard to make  
21 that as smooth a transition as possible in their  
22 interest. We—I'm very proud to say we managed to make  
23 the road so much shorter by fighting with the DOT  
24 people there to make it very, very-- You know, we  
25 cut off like I think half a mile because they're

2 going all the time back and forth. We met with the-  
3 the Chief of the Anasazi, and we worked with them to-  
4 to achieve that. So I mean those kinds of things  
5 are, you know, you don't even see them, right, but  
6 they're very important to people who are engaged in,  
7 you know, participate in projects everyday where it's  
8 part of their daily life. So that was something that  
9 meant a lot to me that I know we may not have  
10 something like that here, but I will take that into  
11 account.

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: That's an excellent  
13 example. Absolutely. Any other questions from  
14 other-comments? Okay, so we will put this hearing  
15 into recess. We'll get the answer to this question  
16 about the COIB letter. I don't imagine that that  
17 will require you to come back next Thursday, but if I  
18 could just ask you to be available in case for any  
19 reason it does for us to ask you a question if we can  
20 just get the answer-

21 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Sure.

22 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --and qualify, we  
23 will do that.

24 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Great.

25 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright.

2 LAURIE HAWKINSON: Okay, great.

3 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright, thank you  
4 very much--

5 LAURIE HAWKINSON: [interposing] Thank  
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --for your time and  
8 for your interest in serving and that we will put  
9 the--that concludes the hearing on Ms. Hawkinson, and  
10 we put the committee into recess. [gavel]

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25



C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 8, 2016