

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----- X

January 31, 2019
Start: 09:53 a.m.
Recess: 12:00 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway- Committee Rm, 16th Fl.

B E F O R E:

FRANCISCO MOYA
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

CARLINA RIVERA
RITCHIE J. TORRES
COSTA CONSTANTINIDES
BARRY GRODENCHIK
RORY I. LANCMAN
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
ANTONIO REYNOSO

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Richard Lobel
Attorney
Sheldon Lobel, P.C.

Andrew Till
C.O.O.
Simon Baron Development

Melanie Meyers
Member/Partner
Fried Frank Harris Shriver and Jacobson

Toby Snyder
Senior Associate
FXCollaborative Architects LLP

Panos Cutriez
Member
32BJ

Mitch Gibson
Senior Vice President
Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce

Iziah Thompson
Research and Urban Planning Fellow
New York Building Congress

Jack Davies
Policy and Campaigns Manager
Transportation Alternatives

Jaclyn Scarinci
Associate
Akerman LLP

Paola Duran
Director
Housing Development

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Edward La Grassa
Member
Community Board II Landmark Committee

Brendan Levy
Queens Chamber of Commerce

John Kurtz
Resident

Amire Con
Resident

Kelly Fernandez
Spokesperson
Economic Development Corporation

Sophia Yurudia
Resident

Allison Curreri
Associate
Greenberg Traurig LLP

David Schwartzbaum
Associate
Greenberg Traurig LLP

May Yu
Vice President of Real Estate
Downtown Brooklyn Partnership

Cassie Carrio (sp?)
Member
32BJ

Collay Okar (sp?)
Resident

Carrington
Resident

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dia Plunkett (sp?)
Resident

2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Good morning and
4 welcome to the meeting of the Subcommittee on
5 Zoning and Franchises. I'm Council Member Francisco
6 Moya, the chairperson of this subcommittee. And
7 today we are joined by Council Members Grodenchik,
8 Richards, and Reynoso. Today we will be holding
9 hearings on a number of applications and we will
10 also be conducting a vote on five previously heard
11 applications. If you are here to testify on an
12 application for which the record is not already
13 closed, please fill out a white slip with the
14 Sergeant at Arms and indicate the name and/or the
15 LU number of the application you wish to testify on
16 on that slip. Our first hearing is on LU's 333 and
17 334, the Caton Park Nursing Home rezoning for
18 property in Council Member Eugene's district in
19 Brooklyn. The applicant seeks approval for a zoning
20 map amendment to rezone the southwest corner of
21 Caton Avenue and Rugby Road from an RX... from an R3X
22 district to an R6A district and a related zoning
23 text amendment on the map of to, a map of a
24 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing utilizing option one
25 and option two. These actions would permit the

1 expansion of the existing building located on 1312
2 Caton Avenue and allow the existing roof deck to be
3 enclosed to provide new space for programmatic use
4 for nursing home residents. I now open the public
5 hearing on this application. And I'd like to call
6 up Richard Lobel and Rick Trent, is it? Where's the
7 microphone? Yeah, thank you. Counsel will you
8 please swear in the panel?
9

10 COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm that
11 the testimony you are about to give will be the
12 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
13 and you will answer all questions truthfully? As
14 part of your answer please state your full name for
15 the record.

16 RICHARD LOBEL: I do. Richard Lobel.

17 RICK TRENT: Rick Trent.

18 RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you Chair Moya and
19 Council Members. Richard Lobel from Shelden Lobel,
20 P.C. We're here today to discuss the Caton Park
21 Nursing Home rezoning which has received much
22 support in the local community in the form of a
23 nearly unanimous community board resolution in
24 favor as well as from the Brooklyn Borough
25 President's Office and the City Planning

1 Commission. The rezoning itself is fairly
2 straightforward as you'll see in the materials on
3 the first page. The facility is an existing
4 facility. It's a roughly 34,000 square foot
5 facility and it's one to a 119-bed nursing home
6 which has been at the property since the mid-60s.
7 The proposal would merely allow for the extension
8 of an R3... an R6A district, which is existing on the
9 western portion of the site already, across an R3X
10 district to allow for what amounts to the covering
11 and enclosure of rooftop recreation space which
12 would now allow for more rehabilitation space and
13 other accessory space for the facility. So, you can
14 see from the area map in front of you in the dotted
15 area that's circled at the center of the map the
16 blue portion of that block is the existing nursing
17 home facility. And you can see that the R3X
18 district exists on the eastern portion while the
19 R6A districts exist on the western portion. And in
20 the 2009 Flatbush rezoning the entire area was
21 rezoned, including this block. At the time,
22 however, they didn't really affect the zoning of
23 this property. They merely rezoned an existing R31
24 district to the R3X district. So, if you take a
25

1 look at the tax map that's in front of you now the
2 rezoning would affect two lots; the subject lot,
3 where the nursing home is located, as well as a
4 5,000 square foot lot to the south of that lot
5 currently occupied by a Buddhist Temple. The zoning
6 change map is very straightforward. You can see the
7 R6A district equidistant between Argyle road and
8 Rugby Road on the portion on the left whereas after
9 the change it would result in a R6A portion on the
10 right. The R6A district would extend it through to
11 Rugby Road and would be located at a distance of
12 approximately 170 feet from Caton Avenue. So just
13 merely to show you the end result of the plans, on
14 the third page of the plans, you have the shaded
15 area which would now be the enclosed area. I would
16 say that prior to requesting any questions from the
17 committee that this is a valued facility in this
18 area. The, there is a shortage right now within
19 this facility of both central dining area as well
20 as rehabilitative space. So, the central dining
21 area and rehabilitative space operate in a way
22 which does not currently meet the standards that
23 are set forth by both the Medicare and Medicaid
24 organizations as well as the Department of Health.
25

1 And so, allowing for this rezoning would allow us
2 to provide more rehabilitative space for patients,
3 for a larger central dining area. It would really
4 allow for more rehabilitation to take place in a
5 centralized location which would prevent
6 rehabilitation from being accomplished within
7 patients' bedrooms. This is often isolating and we
8 prefer to have them in a, you know normal healthy
9 circulating environment. We've, again, received
10 phenomenal support from the surrounding community
11 and we would be happy to answer any questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you.

13 Just a quick question. So, what are the MIH in
14 conveyance for this project if you can just go
15 through that?

16 RICHARD LOBEL: So, the MIH options are
17 really going to be, or intended to be, options one
18 and two. The reason for that is that there is no
19 intended redevelopment at either the facility,
20 which is an existing overbuilt facility, as well as
21 the adjacent religious house of worship. But one in
22 two to the extent that in the future there was any
23 contemplated redevelopment those would be the
24 options in, and redevelopment could take place with
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 10
3 greater optionality for, for which level of
4 affordability was desired.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, thank you.

6 RICHARD LOBEL: Sure.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your
8 testimony today. Thank you. Are there any other
9 members of the public who wish to testify on this
10 item? Okay, seeing none, I now close the public
11 hearing on this application, and it will be laid
12 over.

13 RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you Chair, Council
14 Members.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your
16 testimony. Okay. We're just going to pause for one
17 second. We're waiting for one of our other members
18 to join us. Okay. Okay, we've been joined by
19 Council Member Levin. And today we are going to be
20 voting to approve LUs 317 and 318, the east 241st
21 street rezoning in the Bronx. The applicant seeks
22 approval for a zoning map amendment to rezone a
23 number of lots on a single block from an M11 to an
24 R7D C24 district, and a zoning text amendment to
25 modify appendix F on the map of a mandatory
 inclusionary housing area utilizing options one and

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 11

3 option two. The text would also add the rezoning
4 area for the transit zone to reduce parking
5 requirements. These actions will facilitate the
6 development of a new mixed use commercial and
7 residential building. Council Member Cohen is in
8 support of this application. Okay. We will also be
9 voting to approve LUs 319, 320, and 895 Bedford
10 Avenue rezoning in Brooklyn. The zoning map change
11 under LU 319 would map an R7A C24 district in place
12 of an existing M12 district. The zoning text
13 change, LU 320 would establish a mandatory
14 inclusionary housing utilizing MIH Option 1 or MIH
15 Option 2. Together, the applications would
16 facilitate the development of a seven-story mixed
17 use building with ground-floor commercial space and
18 approximately 36 housing units. Council Member
19 Levin is in support of this application.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Just want to
21 thank Mr. Chair, the, the applicant for working
22 with us and with this committee on modest changes
23 to this proposal to ensure that there's more family
24 sized units and that would be reflected within the
25 market rate and the affordable units. Greatly

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 12
3 appreciate their willingness to work with us. Thank
4 you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you.
6 Thank you Council Member. We will also be voting to
7 approve on LU 321. The 100, 103 North Conduit
8 Avenue, Avenue rezoning in Queens. The proposed
9 zoning map change would establish a C22 district
10 within an existing R3X district in order to
11 facilitate the development of a new used group
12 sixteen automotive service station subject to
13 future BSA approval. The site would also include a
14 one-story 3,990 square foot store as well as 13
15 accessory parking spaces and room for at least five
16 reserved spaces. Council Member Ulrich is in
17 support of this application. We will also be voting
18 to approve LU 322. They, 5153 White Street zoning
19 special permit in Manhattan. The property consists
20 of an existing building in the Tribeca East
21 historic district and the special permit would
22 modify certain regulations related to height and
23 setbacks, courts, and minimum distance between
24 windows and lot lines. It would facilitate the
25 enlargement of an existing building while also
providing for this continued restoration and

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 1 2

3 maintenance. Council Member Chin is in support of
4 this application. And lastly, we'll be voting today
5 to approve LUs 323, 59 Greenwich Avenue zoning
6 special permit, also in Manhattan. The property
7 consists of an existing building in the Greenwich
8 Village historic district. And the special permit
9 would permit the modification of the existing use
10 regulations to allow the provision of group six
11 uses on the existing building second floor as well
12 as the modification of certain bulk regulations
13 related to minimum distance between windows and lot
14 lines. The application would facilitate the
15 reconstruction and enlargement of the existing
16 historic building while also providing for its
17 continued restoration and maintenance. The speaker
18 is in support of this application and has asked me
19 to note that the applicant has agreed to a
20 prohibition on eating and drinking establishments
21 for the second floor of the building in response to
22 concerns raised by the community board and the
23 borough president. Were there any questions from
24 the subcommittee members on any of these items?
25 Seeing none I now call for a vote to approve the
following applications which have the support of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

15

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: So, we're going to
the leave the vote open for a few more minutes. So,
we will leave the vote open until the, the end of
the hearing and we will now be moving to... Okay. So,
our next hearing is on LUs 338, 339, 340, the 12
Franklin Street text amendment and related special
permit application for property in Council Member
Levin's district in Brooklyn. The applicant is
seeking a zoning text amendment to include the
subject block which is bounded by Franklin Street,
Meserole Avenue, Gem street, and North 15 Street
within an industrial business incentive area and a
related special permit that if approved would allow
an increase in the maximum permitted floor area for
specific industrial and commercial uses modifying
height and set-back regulations and reduce the
applicable off-street parking and loading
requirements. Approval of the special permit would
facilitate the development of a seven-story
building with approximately 16,000 square feet of
retail space, 96,000 square feet of office space
and 22,000 square feet of light industrial space. I
now open the public hearing on this application,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 and I would turn it over to Council Member Levin
3 for some remarks.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Chair I'll waive
5 my remarks and ask them a couple questions after
6 the presentation.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you
8 Council Member. Melanie Meyers. Last name
9 Schneider, I'm sorry I can't make out the first
10 name.

11 TOBY SNYDER: Toby Schneider.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it. Andrew Till.
13 Great. Counsel please swear in the panel.

14 COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm that
15 the testimony you're about to give will be the
16 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth,
17 and you will answer all questions truthfully? As
18 part of your answer please state your full name.

19 ANDREW TILL: Yes, Andrew Till.

20 TOBY SNYDER: Yes, Toby Schneider.

21 MELANIE MEYERS: Yes, Melanie Meyers.

22 ANDREW TILL: Are we okay to just start.

23 Oh, okay, sorry. Thank you for having us present
24 today. My name is Andrew Till. I'm the COO of Simon
25 Baron Development. Simon Baron is a New York City

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 17

3 based Real Estate Development Firm founded in 1990.

4 Since founding, Simon Baron, has constructed and

5 owned numerous buildings in Brooklyn, Queens, and

6 Manhattan. We have focus and expertise in all

7 facets of development and invest in project as

8 long-term owners. We're extremely excited to add 12

9 Franklin Street to our portfolio. It's a unique

10 site on the boarder of Greenpoint and Williamsburg

11 in the heart of an industrial business zone. The

12 mixed use, the mixed commercial and industrial

13 building will build, with the approvals before you,

14 will cater to and service local businesses of the

15 neighborhood with a space designated to meet the

16 needs of modern light industrial firms and modern

17 office space of a size and scale that works for

18 businesses and entrepreneurs in the area. We

19 believe that this will be an important building for

20 the area adding jobs and strength and employment

21 opportunities in North Brooklyn. I'm now going to

22 turn over, turn it over to Melanie Meyers and Toby

23 Schneider to describe the project and actions

24 before you. We thank you for your consideration.

25 MELANIE MEYERS: Thanks. I do have it on

 right? Thanks. So it's Melanie Meyers with Fried

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 12

3 Frank, Harris Shriver and Jacobson. I'm going to go
4 a little bit through the actions before you and
5 then Toby will talk about the building itself. From
6 a location standpoint the, the site that we're
7 talking about is on the Greenpoint Williamsburg
8 waterfront at southern end of Greenpoint. It's has
9 an interesting site. It's across from what will be
10 the future Bushwick Inlet Park. And it's bounded by
11 a series of streets that kind of give it a, an
12 interesting pentagonal shape. Looking at the site
13 itself, you can see it's a series right now of one-
14 story buildings. It's underutilized and it's a site
15 that we think is ripe for producing a more of a
16 economic development than exists today. From an
17 area map standpoint, you can see that the site is
18 the midst of a area of, of industrial and
19 commercial uses, most of which are one and two
20 story buildings. But what you can also see from the
21 area map is that there is a lot of the yellow which
22 is residential. So, it's one of the areas which it
23 is an industrial zone and it's one that we think
24 would really benefit from a proposal that would
25 allow for a project that creates jobs to help sort
of solidify the, an industrial and a commercial

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 1 a

3 presence in the area. From a zoning standpoint the
4 site is in an M12 zone and it is close to a project
5 known as 25 Kent which is the first project that
6 used this particular special permit. So, what we
7 think that we're doing with that project, with this
8 project, and what I expect will be future projects
9 before you is really approaching and thinking about
10 this area as a place to draw businesses and to
11 allow for the Brooklyn waterfront to have a strong
12 presence... a commercial and industrial presence.

13 From a zoning standpoint there's three actions. The
14 first is the zoning text amendment to simply make
15 this block, an industrial business incentive area
16 that will unlock two special permits, one of which
17 will allow for the building to have a floor area
18 ratio of 4.8 which is the floor area that's
19 available for community facility today. And the
20 third is to address the very high parking, and we
21 believe unnecessary parking requirement to reduce
22 the parking requirements and to adjust the loading
23 requirements to sort of more modern light
24 industrial uses. Zoning map, the zoning text will
25 simply be adding the block to an existing map that
is in the district today. The special permit will

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 allow for a 134,000 square-foot development, most
3 of which will be commercial. It will include 22,370
4 square feet of light industrial space. The parking
5 that we are proposing would be 36 self-park spaces.
6 Zoning would require for 135-ish thousand square
7 foot building, 396 spaces. This is not an area that
8 needs parking. It's, it's not an area... We, we do
9 not want to encourage people to drive. So, we're
10 asking for 36 spaces and we are increasing the
11 bicycle parking that's required under zoning by
12 five. So, we'll be having 85, five times. So,
13 there'll be 85 park, bicycle parking spaces instead
14 of roughly 17 that are required. This is just
15 simply sort of showing the building and sort of, in
16 section. And I'll turn it over to Toby to start
17 talking about the project in a minute. But the
18 required the light industrial use will be on the
19 second floor. It will have a strong presence both
20 on the, you know on the outside of the building and
21 it will have flexible floor plates to allow itself
22 to, you know to, to accommodate a variety of
23 different users. And we're really excited about it
24 as a project. From a process standpoint, we've,
25 community board issued recommendations in support

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 21
3 of the project. They had some suggestions about the
4 parking restriction. We also received
5 recommendations of approval from the Borough
6 President and the City Planning Commission. And so,
7 we're very pleased about the support and the
8 interest that the projects had this far, and we
9 look forward to your consideration.

10 TOBY SNYDER: Thank you Melanie. I'm
11 Toby Snyder, Senior Associate at FXCollaborative
12 Architects. As Melanie mentioned I'll show you the
13 site here in relationship to the building. We are
14 across the street from the future park. We're,
15 we're having four sides, four street frontages,
16 15th Street, Franklin Street, Meserole and Gem
17 Street. The main lobby would be coming off of 15th
18 Street. There would be retail on all four sides.
19 And then on the southern portion along Gym Street
20 is where there's parking and loading and exits.
21 Just to zoom in here right on the ground floor.
22 Again, the main lobby access is here on the, on the
23 lower left-hand portion of the building. It also
24 connects through to Gem Street. So, there's both
25 pedestrian and bicycle entrance from both of those
sides. The retail wrapping around on all sides, it

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 ??
3 was important for us to have this project to an
4 active retail presence on all of the streets. On
5 the second floor what Melanie indicated as the
6 dedicated industrial floor. This is, this is
7 similar to the office floors and being 15-foot
8 floor to floor heights. It's got its own outdoor
9 space. It has direct access to the freight elevator
10 and oversized corridors if there were multiple
11 tenants in it. There's a potential possibility that
12 there's some commercial space on the floor as well.
13 The remaining floor plates as we go up the building
14 are dedicated to typical office uses and the very
15 top two floors could be for a eating or drinking
16 establishment as the building sets back from its
17 main height to these terrace floors. Some three-
18 dimensional views of the project. You can see that
19 it has a larger core on the south side that is
20 popping out along our lot line condition, but the
21 rest of the building is predominantly, this gridded
22 window system with these large two story Loja
23 space, outdoor spaces that have been sort of cut
24 out of the frame of the building on... to give... each
25 floor its own outdoor space. Here's a, a view from
 Franklin Street looking at the main office lobby

3 and then some of these larger two-story spaces. So,
4 the, the architectural intent here is to create a
5 building that reinforces the industrial character
6 of the neighborhood. It has a strong reading of its
7 structural grid which is typical of the larger
8 warehouse in manufacturing buildings of Brooklyn.
9 There's a fairly low window wall ratio which is not
10 typical of an office building. So, we're using the
11 notion of these larger sort of factory size windows
12 broken into smaller pieces. And then of course the
13 two-story openings. This lower window wall ratio is
14 not only sort of part of its architectural
15 character that is one of the most important things
16 you can do for the energy consumption of the
17 building. It really reduces that, it's about half
18 as what... half as much as what would be expected of
19 a, a typical office building. Here's a cross
20 section through the building right at the ground
21 floor. It is in the flood zone and so we've worked
22 very closely with the Department of Buildings to
23 come up with a solution that both enables the, the
24 majority of the space on the first floor and cellar
25 to be out of the flood zone. But right at the
 perimeter still brings life access and retail

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 presence down. So, there's this unique condition of
3 having a wet flood proof perimeter band that wraps
4 around the building and enables that certain
5 portions of the building to, to withstand floods
6 whereas other portions are raised out of it. So,
7 one, one final view from the future park, we don't
8 know the timing of the future park, but this
9 building is very much in attempting to bring
10 important vital retail presence and activity and
11 life to that. So, in many ways we're trying to
12 address that the future, both the past and the
13 future of the neighborhood. I think... Yeah, thank
14 you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just two
16 quick questions before I turn it over to Council
17 Member Levin. So, can you just go into again what
18 type of tenants previously occupied the space?

19 MELANIE MEYERS: Sure. There were five
20 tenants on the site. There were two bars within
21 that, one of which was a brewery, but there were
22 two bars. There was a warehouse for Polish canned
23 goods. There was a plumbing supply store and then
24 there was a sound studio. So, of those five tenants
25 four of them have space. Some of them have

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 25
relocated. One of... some of them are in the process
3 of relocating. And the fifth one is looking for
4 space at this point. And, and we believe one of the
5 bars is, is looking for a space in the area.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. And sort of can
7 you go into kind of the commitment to good jobs?

8 MELANIE MEYERS: I think there's a, a
9 couple of things. One of the, one of the... you know
10 the goal of the, the goal of the special permit was
11 to make sure that there was a variety of jobs. So...
12 variety of jobs including the light industrial
13 space. One of the things that they think is really
14 great about this particular building is that the
15 floor plate sizes and the size of it, it's not an
16 enormous building. It's an opportunity for
17 businesses that are in the range of 2,000, 5,000,
18 10,000, 20,000... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm talking about
20 more of the service workers.

21 MELANIE MEYERS: Yes. And I think some
22 are 32 BJ standpoint if that's what you're talking
23 about. There is an agreement... I believe that there
24 will be people from 32 BJ speaking as well.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 26

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you. I
4 now want to turn it over to Council Member Levin
5 for questions.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
7 much Chair. So, let's see. Thank you at the outset
8 for you know working with, with the council and my
9 office and the local industrial community on, on
10 this proposal. Why did you pursue the special
11 permit versus an as of right development?

12 MELANIE MEYERS: At a technical level,
13 at a technical level, one of the things that's
14 strange about this zoning. So, we're in an M12
15 zone. Again, community facilities can be built to
16 4.8 FAR. And so, the building that you see is that
17 size. Commercial zoning is limited to a 2 FAR. So,
18 you really would be talking a building that is less
19 than half the size. So, the, there's a challenge
20 in, you know in, when you're thinking about a site,
21 like when you're thinking about a site is, you know
22 is it feasible, viable, to build a commercial
23 space, you know, new eight, new industrial space at
24 an FAR of two. So, I think that might be part of
25 the reason why there's been limited development in
this area. So, the reason for the special permit is

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 27
3 to allow for a 2 FAR project which probably would
4 not have been built to be at a scale that makes it
5 a viable project and has it generate office uses in
6 light industrial uses as opposed to just a, a
7 community facility.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Community
9 facility being limited to a very... you know select
10 number of... [cross-talk].

11 MELANIE MEYERS: Actually yes, within
12 this district the community facilities that are
13 allowed on an as of right basis are doctors'
14 offices and houses of worship otherwise you need a
15 special permit for, that would allow some others.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right. Now what
17 kind of tenants do you envision for the light
18 manufacture, light, light industrial space and have
19 you had discussions with local industrial services
20 providers on helping to identify or curate the
21 space, or identify potential tenants or, and what
22 do you envision there? And then I have a follow up
23 question on that.

24 ANDREW TILL: Sure. So, we've worked
25 very closely with Evergreen. I believe they
 submitted testimony to your office. They were going

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 to come today and they were unable. But they've
3 worked very closely with us to help us identify.
4 They believe that there is demand for the space.
5 They believe that it could come from the prop
6 movie... movie part of the... movie bit, film industry
7 business that supports Steiner Studios in Astoria.
8 They also believe there is demand for possible food
9 manufacturing uses. They think there's some other,
10 you know other various uses. I don't think they
11 believe anything like very heavy... truly light
12 industrial.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Mm-hmm.

14 TOBY SNYDER: But they think there's a
15 real opportunity and their sense on occupancy or
16 interest is going to be closer to when we're ready
17 to deliver because most of the tenants that they
18 believe will, will want to take this space are you
19 know out, are looking in the market, 120 to 100 and
20 you know, between 120 and 180 days out from their
21 current expirations.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. The Borough
23 President raised the issues of accessory retail
24 potentially taking up too much space intended for
25 industrial use and that quote unquote digital

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 na
3 manufacturing might not accomplish the intent of
4 the special permits. I wanted to know if you had a
5 response to those concerns.

6 MELANIE MEYERS: You know... And it's,
7 that's been part of the conversation. So, this is
8 looking at the light industrial space, floor. And
9 again about 22,000 and change would be for the
10 light industrial uses. And then there's an
11 opportunity for a little bit of commercial. You can
12 see it in the purple. You know that could
13 theoretically be like a little retail outlet or
14 something like that. It could be a conference room
15 that the entire building could share. You know, so
16 there had been a discussion about whether there
17 could be a limitation, should be a limitation. It
18 was discussed a bit at the borough president, also
19 discussed at the city planning commission. And I
20 think there was a concern, at least with some of
21 the people who were thinking about it about how
22 some of these, you know these entrepreneurs, these
23 light industrial users use their space. They were
24 thinking about if you had somebody who had a, that
25 had a production bakery for example. We're, I think
we're worried that if, that if that meant people

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 30
3 were coming in and being able to you know have a
4 birthday party where they were making their own
5 cupcakes or something like that, whether that,
6 having that kind of flexibility would be
7 compromised by sort of establishing a restriction.
8 So, we think that the way the text reads is that
9 the space needs to be for the industrial use. And I
10 think the concern when people had concerns was that
11 it didn't want to compromise the ability of an
12 industrial user to be successful.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: In terms of the
14 types of rents that in, like manufacturing or
15 industrial space could get. The typical range right
16 now in the areas between 15 and 25 dollars a square
17 foot which is considerably lower than the officer
18 retail market. Do you have a sense of what the
19 price range is on the light manufacturing space?
20 And how do you suppose that will work in terms of
21 if it's outside the range of what, of what typical
22 light manufacturers are able to pay?

23 MELANIE MEYERS: Yeah, so I think Andrew
24 can speak to the, sort of, his sort of, their
25 assumptions about it because that certainly is the

2 expectation, is that it's going to be a well below
3 market rent.

4 ANDREW TILL: Yes, it's definitely a
5 well below market rent. We've also spoken to
6 Evergreen about the rents for the users they
7 believe would take the space. Their indications
8 were a bit higher than what you're noting. But we
9 have, the way we have run this economically is the...
10 our rents are obviously nowhere near the range of
11 the office, office... and we don't have an
12 expectation, we have an expectation to fill that
13 space. We don't have an expectation to leave it
14 vacant.

15 MELANIE MEYERS: And one of the things...
16 And it was, I think, part of the discussion at the
17 time of the 25 Kent, is that within the zoning text
18 itself there's a number of protections that ensure
19 that this space is being made available for the,
20 you know light industrial users and light
21 industrial users only. It includes a restrictive
22 declaration, but it also includes a requirement
23 that the restriction be on the certificate of
24 occupancy. There are posting requirements at the
25 building. There are third party reporting

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 22
3 requirements on an annual basis. There is also a
4 requirement to maintain records online throughout
5 the operation of the building to identify who the
6 users of, are of the second floor. So, there's a
7 number of protections that we believe that are in
8 the text and a violation, for what it's worth, you
9 know it's clear that the violation would allow for
10 a, a removal of, or a rescission of the certificate
11 of occupancy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: As proposed there
13 is, is there a eating and drinking establishment
14 proposed on the top floor? Is that right? On the
15 roof... [cross-talk]

16 MELANIE MEYERS: There's the opportunity
17 or the possibility... So, it's possible that what you
18 see is kind of the uppermost floor could be an
19 eating and drinking establishment. The way that the
20 text works is that there are things that are called
21 permitted uses which can occupy up to 2 FAR of the
22 building. And that would include retail uses..
23 include office as well. Then the incentive uses,
24 which you see in the yellow, are more limited. So,
25 it's office space and things like that. So, we do
26 want the flexibility of including rooftop eating

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 and drinking establishment. But, it's possible that
3 that would be office as well, and it would say that
4 one, one of the bars, both of the bars, one of the
5 bars that was there had a rooftop space on the
6 site.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Oh, okay.

8 TOBY SNYDER: Northern territory most of
9 their business was rooftop.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. Give sense
11 of what type of commercial tenants you're seeking.

12 TOBY SNYDER: We think, and from the
13 feedback that we're getting from activity at 25
14 Kent, as well as users that are potentially
15 residents of the area, Greenpoint, North
16 Williamsburg/Williamsburg and other parts of
17 Brooklyn, are we think it's going to be a big draw
18 for the TAMI Tenants that are currently in the
19 Flatiron district that are coming in and out, from
20 the L Train, the Union Square, Flat Iron district.
21 We think that will revolve around advertising
22 firms, architecture firms, different maybe
23 different types of, of technology, companies. We
24 think it's a very similar, we believe it's a very
25 similar tendency, the thing that we're very pleased

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 21

2 with, with the design as well as the, just the you
3 know layout of the footprint is it really allows
4 for a smaller sized tenant who needs 7,000 square
5 foot requirement, or a 10,000 square foot
6 requirement because we're, we're able to easily
7 break up the, break up the floors. So I think we're
8 really going to appeal to groups that maybe will be
9 just coming out of startup type phase, and are able
10 to, want to expand and have their own office space
11 coming out of a maybe a work-sharing space.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. Think it's
13 my last two questions. How do you see the building
14 interacting with the park across the street? Is
15 there a, how do you see that... kind of taking place..
16 it's the side of Bushwick Inlet Park which has,
17 hasn't been built yet but is a... will be built one
18 day.

19 MELANIE MEYERS: So, I can talk a little
20 bit about it but you know certainly the way that..
21 The site has this really unique geometry. So it, we
22 did think about it, and Toby mentioned a little
23 bit, is that we wanted it to be something that you
24 know was welcoming, inviting, and sort of visually
25 attractive from the park. But also, to kind of

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 25

2 lighten up the ground floor so that there could be..
3 you know it's pedestrians are what... walking back
4 and forth that there was visually interesting to
5 them. There might be a coffee shop, there might be
6 something like that. So, we went into a little bit
7 of depth about trying to figure out how to make the
8 retail frontage actually have a street presence to
9 try to make that interaction between the building
10 and the street and the people that'll be on the
11 streets as lively as possible.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And then my last
13 question has to do with parking. So, I support
14 reducing parking requirements where, where
15 possible. And you have put that into your
16 application. The community board sees it a
17 different way and wanted more on-site parking. So
18 how do you, how did you arrive at the number of
19 parking spots and why do you think it's enough?

20 MELANIE MEYERS: We'll talk a... So... There
21 was, it was interesting. There were three votes at
22 the community board on the parking because I think
23 there was a bit of a split of decisions or thoughts
24 about it there. So, the community board recommended
25 about 60 spaces, 62 spaces, something like that.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 26

2 The reason why we chose the number is that the site
3 is like located next, there's good public
4 transportation. There is a bike lane. We would
5 prefer to have no parking in the, the garage at
6 all. We looked at it from an environmental
7 standpoint and, and thought that there was enough
8 parking in the area that we didn't need to have
9 more spaces and we didn't want people who might be
10 inclined to drive if they had a spot to drive. So,
11 we looked at it from that standpoint. We looked at
12 it from the, from the standpoint of what we thought
13 was a reasonable amount that wasn't going to act as
14 a, an incentive. And we also wanted it to all be
15 below grade. And so, you know we have a garage that
16 allows for self-parking below grade.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, that's all
18 my questions. Thanks.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council
20 Member Levin. Council Member Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you
22 Chair. I want to thank Council Member Levin for
23 always being at the forefront of these creative
24 like manufacturing... happening in the district and
25 just being very attentive to exactly what we're

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 27

3 looking for. We're trying to do something like
4 this, I want to say district-wide, community board
5 1. We think that it's possible to have mixed use
6 manufacturing with commercial, with retail, in the
7 district in some portions of the IBZ or in, or I
8 mean outside of the IBZ. We're having a little bit
9 of a hard time with DCP, getting on the same page
10 but you being here kind of proves that it can be
11 done and that 25 Kent is not a one-off. I want to
12 ask a couple of questions though. I see that it's a
13 15 feet height on all floors except I think the
14 first on the retail space is 14 feet.

15 Traditionally, higher ceiling heights for the
16 manufacturing sections are attractive. Wanted to
17 know if Evergreen had any discussion with you on
18 whether they thought 15 feet was an appropriate
19 amount of height for the industrial uses?

20 TOBY SNYDER: Well in this district
21 we're actually looking at, light manufacturing are
22 the required uses that would go in here. And, and
23 perhaps higher floor to floor heights are, are more
24 expected in heavy manufacturing which is not
25 permitted use here. We're also trying to get all of
this area within the height limitation of the, of

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 28
3 the zoning regulation as it is. But we have shown
4 this to Evergreen at a number of points throughout
5 the last few years. And it seems like there's a
6 number of tenants where these kind of floor-to-
7 floor heights are very appropriate for their uses.

8 ANDREW TILL: I also want to say just
9 for Evergreen. They also gave us a lot of feedback
10 not only on the ceiling heights but also on the
11 freight elevator sizing, the depth of the loading
12 docks. So they have, they gave us a lot of very
13 good input on that design.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...I just want to
15 make sure that if the use, if it's being built it's
16 going to be used. We have other buildings that have
17 significant amount of manufacturing space that are
18 being used more as a empty visual, visually
19 appealing site and not actually being used, leased
20 out, so they're taking the hit almost as the cost
21 of doing business to have to build, to have to find
22 the tenant in the manufacturing side or in the
23 industrial side. So, I don't want that to be the
24 case here. The other thing is the price per square
25 footage that you're going to rent it. I know you,
 you mentioned that it would be low commercial and

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 ra
3 office... of course it is because it's manufacturing
4 space. But how low? So what's the price per square
5 footage that you're thinking about?

6 ANDREW TILL: We, the way that we've
7 gauged it is we, in terms of on a percentage basis,
8 the way we're looking at the office comps, we're
9 going to be in the neighborhood of between 30 and
10 50 percent lower than where the office will be. So,
11 we'll be in like the, you know in the 30s, is where
12 we've underwritten it. Again, we are, we are long
13 term owners of our property. We are not in the
14 business of keeping space vacant. We've been given
15 indications that those rents are achievable for the
16 types of users. But we will see where the market,
17 you know once we're ready to deliver, in terms of
18 what Evergreen's given us in indications of when
19 people actually look to occupy we'll be, you know,
20 tracking the market. But we're not, you know
21 anywhere in the neighborhood of where the office,
22 the class A office market is.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No, and I know,
24 and just, with all due respect, you keep saying
25 that but there's no, no one in their right mind
that thinks that it would be close to the office

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 ^{an}
space. Right now when we're looking at high end
3 manufacturing we're looking at 24 to 26 dollars a
4 square foot in parts of, of North Brooklyn. So to
5 go that 30, It's still going to be...

6 MELANIE MEYERS: It's close.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...very high.
8 You're going to be at the higher end. When I hear
9 that, even though there's some, some conversations
10 that I saw here that you're going to be doing it at
11 affordable rates at 20 percent below market. Right
12 now, I see that, I don't see that. So, I'm just
13 concerned that if you're if you're underwriting
14 that way you won't be able to make... you know pay
15 mortgage assuming that you're going to get 30
16 dollars a square foot unless you're getting some
17 really high-end manufacturer which could be what
18 you're trying to go for. But that's not... I don't
19 think whatever Green's goal is when he's talking
20 about finding tenants for you, or assisting you in
21 finding tenants.

22 ANDREW TILL: Again we just, we have
23 discussed it with them. And I think the, also I
24 think the, also the fact we can divide the floor
25 into smaller spaces can... it will relate into more

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 ¹¹
3 efficient space and will relate into a higher per
4 square foot maybe on those smaller spaces, on the
5 grow spaces for industrial, you know a light
6 industrial user. That chunk rent would be I think
7 very achievable. I think it would align closely
8 with, with our, the indications and our, you know,
9 ability to achieve those prices per square foot.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Is it, is there
11 an incentive here to ensure that you will not keep
12 that space vacant outside of your personal
13 commitment?

14 MELANIE MEYERS: There's a number of,
15 again, there's a number of restrictions in the
16 zoning resolution that are both, which are, which
17 are penalties on the site. So, again, there's a
18 restrictive declaration. There's, you know
19 something that needs to be recorded in... against the
20 property. There's a requirement that the
21 restriction be on the certificate of occupancy.
22 There's a requirement that there be a public, that
23 a website be maintained to identify the users of
24 that space. And there's a requirement of an annual
25 reporting to a third-party entity that's been
 approved by The Department of Small Business

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 ¹²Services. So, there are a lot of protections. It's
3 not just Andrew Till saying we're going to rent it
4 to the right people. We really can't rent it to
5 anybody but a user. And if you know the, the notion
6 that a 30-dollar rent is, is too high and there
7 isn't a market for that. Then the choice is that
8 you don't rent the space or you rent it at 26
9 dollars. And you know 26 dollars sounds better than
10 zero.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay and then
12 just two more questions. How many parking spaces
13 are there again? How many parking spaces?

14 MELANIE MEYERS: 36.

15 TOBY SNYDER: 36.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: 36. And that's
17 the potential given a possible waiver approved by
18 Council Member Levin?

19 MELANIE MEYERS: That, that requires,
20 that requires a waiver, it requires a special
21 permit... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Special permit,
23 oh okay. And I just want to let Council Member
24 Levin know that I'll be very supportive in giving
25 you that waiver. It's, it's remarkable that not

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 12

2 only is it environmentally the right thing to do,
3 but financially it makes sense for you as well. And
4 if we're limiting the burden that we have on your
5 economic model by removing parking and allowing for
6 maybe to have more affordable rent everywhere else
7 because you don't need to build it, I think is
8 extremely appropriate. And we have to move away
9 from, again, incentivizing vehicles in a place
10 where, where it, it doesn't make any sense
11 considering its mass transit options and its, and
12 its accessibility to bikes and ferries. So, thank
13 you for, for this. I'm looking forward to this
14 project. I'm really excited about it. Thank you.

15 MELANIE MEYERS: Thank you.

16 TOBY SNYDER: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: One thing to add to
18 that is that it also reduces traffic too which is
19 everybody's goal as well.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: It's... [cross-
21 talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank, thank you...
23 [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...always the
25 car's fault.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council
3 Member. Thank you very much for your testimony
4 today. Thank you. Are there any other members of
5 the public... Sorry, correction. We're going to go
6 back to take a vote. Council Member Torres... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye Mr.
9 Chair.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: ...continuing, continue
11 the vote to approve the previously named LU items.
12 Council Member Torres.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

14 COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
15 Torres. By a vote of six in the affirmative, zero
16 in the negative, and zero abstentions the land use
17 items are approved and referred to the full land
18 use committee.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I'd like
20 to call up the next panel. Panos Cutriez, Mitch
21 Gibson, and Izhiah Thompson. And you have two
22 minutes to read your testimony. If you just can
23 state your name and then you, then you can begin.

24 PANOS CUTRIEZ: Good morning Chair Moya
25 and members of the Subcommittee. My name is Panos

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

15

2 Cutriez. I work as a doorman at 995 5th Avenue. I
3 have been a member of SCIU 32 BJ for two years and
4 I'm speaking on behalf of my union local 32 BJ. 32
5 BJ is here to support the 12 Franklin rezoning. SDJ
6 Property Management LLC, an affiliate of Simon
7 Baron has committed to provide good building
8 service jobs when there are, when their building
9 opens. These are the kind of jobs that will allow
10 working families in Brooklyn to live with dignity,
11 mobility, and security. The developer's commitment
12 to good property service jobs illustrates their
13 commitment to the larger Brooklyn community and we
14 are pleased to be supporting them throughout this
15 process. For these reasons we urge you to support
16 this project. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. If you can
18 just state your name and then you can begin.

19 MITCH GIBSON: Good morning. My name is
20 Mitch Gibson. I am Senior Vice President and Chief
21 Program and Economic Development officer at the
22 Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce. I'm presenting this
23 testimony in support of the project proposed by
24 Simon Baron at 12 Franklin Street. The Brooklyn
25 Chamber promotes economic development throughout

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 16
3 the borough and advocates on behalf of our member
4 businesses. The Brooklyn Alliance is a not-for-
5 profit economic development affiliate of the
6 Brooklyn Chamber which includes the New York City
7 Business Solution Center in Brooklyn and we manage
8 that as well. I would like to express our support
9 for 12 Franklin Street Project. This seven-story
10 boutique office building on the Greenport,
11 Greenpoint North Williamsburg Boarder has been
12 designed to help alleviate the lack of class A
13 office space in the area which is booming because,
14 with, with residential development, dining, and
15 nightlife options. North Brooklyn residents
16 increasingly would like to work closer to home and
17 12 Franklin will meet that need by regarding modern
18 amenity-rich office space that Brooklyn small
19 businesses have come to expect. The 134,000 square
20 foot building which 24, which includes 23,000
21 square feet dedicated to manufacturing space will
22 reinforce the industrial character of the
23 neighborhood while offering wide open light filled
24 loft spaces, access to outdoor gardens on every
25 floor and an in-building mix of workplace
 manufacturing, and retail uses. This project is

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 17

3 also expected to help create an active pedestrian
4 and retail corridor across from the new Inlet park
5 reinforcing the live/work/play environment that
6 Brooklynites are looking to maintain and grow. The
7 building is just a five-minute walk from the Nassau
8 Avenue G train station along with numerous city
9 bike stations, mopeds, and a 10 minute walk from
10 the North bay, North Williamsburg and Greenpoint
11 Ferry Terminal. Because 12 Franklin Street is
12 designed to encourage public transportation used
13 and help ease traffic congestion. The developer
14 have requested a waiver from zoning requirements to
15 reduce the number of parking spaces and we also
16 support that. Thank you for the opportunity to
17 speak.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

19 IZIAH THOMPSON: Good morning. My name
20 is Iziah Thompson. I'm the Policy Research and
21 Urban Planning Fellow at the New York Building
22 Congress. On behalf of the Building Congress, I
23 urge you to support the thoughtful application
24 brought before you by Simon Baron Development for
25 the building at 12 Franklin Street. The New York
Building Congress is a nearly 100-year-old

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 12

3 organization working to encourage the growth and
4 success of the New York city building industry and
5 the vibrancy of the city at large represent over
6 5,000, 500 constituent organizations and employ
7 over a quarter million professionals and
8 tradespeople. The commercial office environment
9 evolves in New York City. We need more space and
10 this project represents a well-grounded approach to
11 alleviate that lack of office space in Greenpoint
12 and north Williamsburg. And New York and across the
13 city workers want to work close to home. And this
14 office space really meets that need to provide a
15 modern amenity-rich space that Brooklyn's small
16 businesses really want. And our members support
17 that and support really as stewards of the Urban
18 Environment it's important that we support projects
19 which possess practicality, sustainability, and
20 meld into the infrastructure and character of the
21 neighborhood in which they are built. So, we ask
22 that Simon Baron should be granted a waiver from
23 the zoning requirement to reduce the number of
24 parking spaces in the project. And thank you for
25 your time to be heard on this matter.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 1a

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
4 for your testimony today. Thank you. I'm going to
5 call up the next panel. Jack Davies and John Nipsa
6 (sp?). Did I say that right? Jack Davies. John... how
7 do you say that? Napiza? Napiza? John Napiza? Going
8 once, going twice... okay. Jack.

9 JACK DAVIES: Good morning. Thank you
10 for convening the hearing, for the chance to
11 testify. My name is Jack Davies. I'm the Policy and
12 Campaigns Manager for Transportation Alternatives.
13 I'm here today to voice TA's strong support for the
14 waiver from the zoning requirement to reduce the
15 number of parking spaces requested at 12 Franklin.
16 New York needs growth that encourages public
17 transit use, walking and bicycling instead of
18 driving. And we feel that the requested permit in
19 this case is the responsible approach to
20 development in New York. Research has shown that
21 when the supply of parking is high the demand to
22 drive also increases even when that driving isn't
23 critical. This in turn leads to increased traffic
24 congestion, slower bus speeds, increased air
25 pollution, and compromised pedestrian and bicycle
safety all across the city. 12 Franklin is designed

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 50
3 to encourage public transportation use and help
4 ease traffic congestion. The building is just a
5 five-minute walk from the Nassau Av G Train station
6 along with numerous Citi Bike stations, revel
7 electric mopeds, and a 10 minute walk from the
8 North Williamsburg and Greenpoint New York City
9 Ferry stations. There's traffic congestion, safety,
10 and pollution reach crisis levels in New York. We
11 should not be encouraging development that
12 needlessly keeps more cars on the road. Granting
13 the requested permit would set an important
14 precedent, not only in development best practices,
15 but in prioritizing people over motor vehicles.
16 Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
18 for your testimony. Are there any other members of
19 the public who wish to testify? Seeing none, I now
20 close the public hearing on this application. And
21 it will be laid over. Our next hearing is on LUs
22 331 and 332 the Douglaston Parkway rezoning for
23 property in Council Member Vallone's district in
24 Queens. The applicant seeks a zoning map amendment
25 to rezone the west side of Douglaston Parkway from
 Northern Boulevard and extending to North,

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

51

1 approximately 700 feet to a bearing depth of
2 approximately 170 feet. The map amendment would
3 rezone an existing R12 district and an R6A C12
4 district. There is a related zoning text amendment
5 to establish a mandatory inclusionary housing area
6 utilizing MIH option 1 or option 2. These actions
7 would facilitate the development of an eight-story
8 building and a five-story building resulting in a
9 total of 83 dwelling units of which 34 would be
10 affordable independent residents for seniors, or as
11 we call them AIRs, in accordance with the MIH
12 program as well as 12,678 square feet of commercial
13 floor area. I now want to open the public hearing
14 on this application but I'm going to read Council
15 Member Vallone's remarks before we, we get to the
16 panel. The, the proposed action by the applicant
17 would construct an eight-story residential building
18 containing 24 residential units and 17 accessory
19 parking spaces at 4380 Douglaston Parkway and
20 construct a five-story mixed use building
21 containing a 12,678 square foot ground floor
22 restaurant and 59 residential units with 89
23 accessory parking spaces at 241-15 Northern
24 Boulevard. It is important to note this property at
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 52
3 241-15 Northern Boulevard has a variance that would
4 allow construction of a three-story building. But
5 community board members at their public hearing
6 overwhelmingly oppose this application due to
7 concerns about lack of parking, increased traffic,
8 fears of northern boulevard being rezoned by the de
9 Blasio administration and reduced quality of life.
10 However, concerns remain from our office and the
11 Borough President's Office as to the unfortunate
12 procedures and inflammatory language that was
13 permitted at the said meeting. The applicant was
14 not allowed to present prior to the discussion,
15 comments and voting on this matter. Any project
16 must be given a fair opportunity to be heard. This
17 unfortunately was not followed. In fact, unfounded
18 comments about homeless shelters as well as other
19 disturbing statements were made and written by
20 members of the board and the community which must
21 be taken in totality with this application. It is
22 important to note that there are already existing
23 traffic issues at this area and that have been
24 exacerbated by the recent installation of a
25 contentious bike lane on Northern Boulevard. The
 applicant's builder's pavement plan must be

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 52
3 reviewed by DOT and DOB to mitigate traffic
4 concerns on Northern Boulevard and Douglaston
5 Parkway. In November 2018, Queens Borough President
6 Melinda Katz reviewed the rezoning and recommended
7 that the eight story building be lowered to seven
8 stories to match the adjacent buildings and that
9 the applicant coordinates with the Department of
10 Transportation to mitigate any potential traffic
11 congestion during construction and after
12 completion. Furthermore, she indicated that there
13 is an acute need in Queens for affordable housing
14 particularly for seniors. In light of these
15 concerns, the borough president disapproved of the
16 zoning map amendment district application and
17 approved the zoning resolution text amendment to
18 designate the project a mandatory inclusionary
19 housing designated area. It is my understanding
20 that the applicant is willing to make a number of
21 concessions since Borough President Katz' public
22 hearing. Conversations with the Council's Land Use
23 Division, Council Member Paul Vallone's Office, and
24 the applicant have discussed the following that
25 should commit to. Committing to work with
stakeholders with binding restrictive deed language

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

51

2 to both parcels of land including minimum,
3 including, to minimize the proposed number of
4 parking spaces, reducing the building height on the
5 development site one which limits and limits on its
6 use. In addition to restrictive deed language the
7 housing must be marketed to all seniors with a
8 local preference for Community Board 11. The
9 proposal only requires 30 percent of affordable
10 senior housing and we must receive assurances that
11 only seniors will occupy all residential units. The
12 applicant has agreed to have HANAC serve as the
13 administrative agent for both buildings, an
14 essential part of this potential project.
15 Affordable senior housing is undeniably one of the
16 greatest needs and concerns in Queens and
17 throughout the city of New York. Projections by the
18 city planning see the number of Queens residents 65
19 and older are jumping to 3,777 thousand by 2040, a
20 31 percent change from the 2010 figure of 288,000.
21 As we all know eastern Queens has the largest
22 population of seniors in the city of New York.
23 Based on the ongoing concerns about the history of
24 this site we still have reservations regarding this
25 application and thank Chair Moya and members of

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

55

2 this committee for hearing this matter today. We
3 are joined by Council Member Rivera. And now I call
4 up Paola Duran and Joselyn Sacarini? Did I say it
5 right?

6 JACLYN SCARINCI: Jaclyn.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Jaclyn, I'm sorry.

8 COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm that
9 the testimony you are about to give will be truth,
10 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth and you
11 will answer all questions truthfully? In part of
12 your response please state your full name.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You got to press the
14 button.

15 JACLYN SCARINCI: I will. Jaclyn
16 Scarinci.

17 PAOLA DURAN: I will. Paola Duran.

18 JACLYN SCARINCI: Good morning Chair
19 Moya and members of the Zoning and Franchises
20 Committee. My name is Jaclyn Scarinci of Akerman
21 LLP representing the applicants 241-15 Northern LLC
22 and North Shore Realty Corp in connection with the
23 proposed rezoning action. I'm joined here today by
24 Paola Duran of HANAC who is the non-profit
25 organization that will be partnering with the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 56

2 developers of this project to ensure that quality
3 senior housing and affordable housing is maintained
4 at the project. The proposed zoning map amendment
5 will facilitate the development of two
6 underutilized lots with too much needed senior
7 housing buildings which will include a five-story
8 residential buildings with a ground floor eating
9 and drinking establishment and an eight, an eight
10 story proposed residential building. In addition,
11 the proposed zoning changes will better reflect the
12 existing non-complying residential developments
13 that exist today. The project site location is
14 located in Queens community district. The Leban
15 (sp?) and Douglaston Queens. And it's located at
16 the northwest corner of Northern Boulevard and
17 Douglaston Parkway. Northern Boulevard is a major
18 East/West route to the North Shore Long Island in
19 this, in this section of Queens and also eighty,
20 Douglaston Parkway is an eighty-foot wide street.
21 The project area adjoins the 657-acre Alley Pond
22 Park and is located very, very close to the
23 Douglaston Long Island Railroad stop which is
24 located just to the northwest of the site.
25 Development site 14380 Douglaston Parkway is

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

57

1
2 currently vacant and development site two, 241-15
3 Northern Boulevard which is located at the corner
4 is a one story, it used to be a one-story
5 automotive service station but it's currently used
6 as parking for the Giardino's restaurant which is
7 located across the street. The current zoning for
8 this site is in R12. However, as you can see with,
9 within the proposed rezoning area for, for the R6A
10 there are three existing non-complying and non-
11 conforming buildings since the R12 would only
12 permit single family residential homes at a .5 FAR
13 these existing buildings are overbuilt and also
14 would be brought into compliance with the proposed,
15 not into compliance, would substantially comply
16 with the proposed rezoning which would permit a 3.9
17 FAR for developments that would provide affordable
18 independent residences for seniors. Just to show
19 you the existing site conditions. This is a view of
20 the corner lot which is referred to as development
21 site two. There are, these existing, were
22 buildings, that are six stories in height already
23 even though this is an R12 zoning. And then this is
24 the site of development site one which is just
25 currently a vacant lot. Our, our rezoning proposal

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 52

3 to an R6A would facilitate a, our two zoning
4 actions, our rezoning map amendment to rezone from
5 an R12 to an R6A and R6AC12 and also a zoning text
6 amendment to designate the project area a mandatory
7 inclusionary housing area. It's just a zoning
8 change map, project area. And the applicant mapped
9 both option one and option two but based on the
10 AMIs within the area has proposed option two for
11 this site. Also, because we're proposing the MIH
12 component to be affordable independent residences
13 for seniors it works well to have the units that
14 are restricted at 80 percent AMI and below. And
15 it's a little bit about HANAC... I'm going to allow
16 Paola to speak about the, the work that HANAC does
17 throughout New York City with senior housing and
18 particularly affordable senior housing in a little
19 bit, as soon as I finish. Just quickly an overview
20 on, on the two developments. Development, this,
21 241-15 will have approximately 59 dwelling units of
22 which 20 would be the affordable independent
23 residences for seniors. The entire building is
24 intended to be marketed to Seniors 55 and over. And
25 the ground floor will be a, an eating and drinking
establishment. We'll, we will also have 89

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 5 a

3 accessory parking spaces. Only 64 of those spaces
4 will be required and the additional 25 would be
5 permitted parking. Which as you stated in Council
6 Member Vallone's statement, the applicant has
7 committed as part of the public review process to
8 make these additional parking spaces available to
9 the community. And we even believe that some of the
10 parking spaces that are required here may not be
11 used by the tenants since many seniors wouldn't,
12 may not have cars. And then the other proposed
13 development is, will, is proposed that it's an
14 eight story 34,000 square foot multiple dwelling,
15 24 dwelling units of which 14 would be affordable
16 independent residences for seniors, and 19
17 accessory attended parking spaces. Okay. I'll just
18 turn it over to Paola to give a brief statement.

19 PAOLA DURAN: Hello, Good morning. My
20 name is Paola Duran. I'm the Director of Housing
21 Development for HANAC. And as Jaclyn was stating we
22 will be working with the team to make sure that the
23 MIH units are marketing and managed correctly. So
24 HANAC is a non-profit organization founded in 1972
25 in Astoria. And we are city based social services
 and affordable housing developer organization that

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 ^{en}
3 provides a wide of programs and services, most of
4 them in Queens. HANAC owns and operates for full
5 service senior residents that consist of more of
6 400 units in Queens. And currently we have under
7 construction 232 units in Flushing for low income
8 seniors and families. HANAC is fully committed with
9 the development of affordable housing and we
10 support any effort... that go, that is the main
11 reason why HANAC will be working with the honor for
12 these Douglaston projects in order to act as the
13 managing agent for the affordable housing units for
14 the seniors as presented on the proposal. HANAC's
15 role will be to do the marketing of the units and
16 be the management agent of these MIH units. And in
17 addition, HANAC will be providing the social
18 services for the tenants and community members. So
19 HANAC is planning to extend its portfolio of social
20 services to this community board for tenants and
21 community members. Thank you for the opportunity
22 and for your consideration in this matter.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. We're just
23 going to pause for one moment to take a vote.
24
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 61

3 COUNSEL: Continuing the vote on
4 previously called, approval of previously called LU
5 items. Council Member Rivera.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

7 COUNSEL: By a vote of seven in the
8 affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero
9 abstentions the LU items are approved and referred
10 to the full Land Use Committee.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: And we will now be
12 closing the vote on today's items. Thank you. So
13 just a couple of questions. Can, can you walk us
14 through, again, the AIRS component of your project.

15 JACLYN SCARINCI: Sure. So, the develop,
16 the proposed development at 241-15 Northern
17 Boulevard will have approximately 20 affordable
18 independent residences for seniors. And the
19 proposed development at 4380 will have 14
20 affordable residences for seniors. And all of these
21 units will be restricted at or below 80 percent AMI
22 in compliance with the zoning resolution.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Can you say that
24 again? The, what was the AMI?

25 JACLYN SCARINCI: 80 percent and below.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 JACLYN SCARINCI: So, it'll, it will
3 also comply with MIH option two which requires an
4 average. But the AIRS are more restrictive here so
5 we, we won't have units above 80 percent AMI.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: And how much of the
7 FAR do you plan to utilize at each of the
8 development sites?

9 JACLYN SCARINCI: So, for the AIRS FAR?
10 Actually, 4380 Douglaston Parkway is not utilizing
11 the airs bonus. 241-15 we are, we are taking
12 advantage of the FAR, that would be 55,000, so I
13 can get back to you on the exact square footage but
14 we, you're eligible up to a 3.9 FAR for the,
15 through the proposed rezoning for the R6A.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: If you could get that
17 to us that'd be great.

18 JACLYN SCARINCI: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Are the
20 proposed developments that have been proposed here
21 to use the preferential FAR for airs?

22 JACLYN SCARINCI: I'm, I'm sorry, can
23 you repeat the question?

24

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 62

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm sorry, sorry,
4 sorry. What is the percentage of units that are
5 expected to be airs in each building?

6 JACLYN SCARINCI: The percentage in... 30
7 percent in both.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: 30? 30 percent, okay.

9 JACLYN SCARINCI: It's actually more in,
10 in the Douglaston Parkway because the way that the
11 building units were laid out... we had larger units
12 originally but because through the ULUR Process we
13 worked with the, the Borough President's Office had
14 to ask us to reduce the building one story. So we
15 are working on, we will have to, we, we're trying
16 to maintain the 24 total dwelling units, but now
17 we're going to have one less story so the, that was
18 why the, there ended up being, there was more
19 affordable units in terms of percentage wise than
20 30 percent just because originally it had larger
21 units. But now with the redesign we will still
22 maintain the 14 airs units. However, that
23 percentage will maintain 30 percent units because
24 the, both projects while also they're not seeking
25 any public financing, but they will be looking for
 the affordable New York tax exemption which

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 requires that 30 percent of the units be
3 affordable.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. So total of 30.

5 JACLYN SCARINCI: Correct.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it. What is the
7 total square footage expected for the airs in each
8 building?

9 JACLYN SCARINCI: It's 30 percent of the
10 residential floor area. Because we're, we're using
11 the image, option two here so we would, we're, we
12 are complying under both programs AIRS and MIH
13 option two. So, it's 30 percent of the residential
14 floor area and at least 30 percent of the
15 residential units.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: How will the, these
17 age restrictions be enforced?

18 JACLYN SCARINCI: Through a regulatory
19 agreement with the HPD.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Are there other
21 additional approvals needed to restrict the age of
22 residents within the portion of the building?

23 JACLYN SCARINCI: Not that we're aware
24 of. Those, in, in our conversations with HPD there
25 will be an, a regulatory agreement that would have

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 ⁶⁵
3 the age restriction in it. And based on a number of
4 conversations we've had they also have spoken with
5 the state human rights because we would need to
6 have a waiver for a partial AIRS building. And
7 they've also indicated that they're, that they
8 would be supported of such a waiver for a project,
9 a senior project like this.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Are there any state
11 waivers required for the partial AIRS buildings?

12 JACLYN SCARINCI: Yes, from the state
13 human rights. Really, it, the age restriction.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Have you met with DOT
15 to review any of the proposed changes to
16 intersection on Douglaston Parkway and Northern
17 Boulevard?

18 JACLYN SCARINCI: We have not yet met
19 with DOT. But the, the developers committed to meet
20 with DOT as we go for our builder's pavement plan
21 for this site and any suggested mitigation
22 measures, we will incorporate into the proposed
23 development.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it. So maybe I,
25 you're not going to have the answer to this one but
any preliminary discussions on how to address the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 “
3 concerns about the traffic congestion at that
4 intersection?

5 JACLYN SCARINCI: I'm sorry, any
6 preliminary discussions... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Preliminary
8 discussions that deal with addressing the concerns
9 about the traffic congestion at that intersection?
10 It was brought up in the community board meeting.
11 The council member brought this up as well. So, I'm
12 just wanting to know if you had any discussions
13 with anyone regarding that?

14 JACQULIN: We, we will work with the
15 council member on... Okay, so we actually have spoken
16 with some members of DOT and, and they have agreed
17 to come out after the, the, if the rezoning is
18 approved to do a site visit and to recommend some
19 mitigation measures for the traffic in this area.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, so there has
21 been some conversation with DOT?

22 JACLYN SCARINCI: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yes? Okay. What are
24 the expected commercial uses at the development
25 site number two?

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

67

2 JACLYN SCARINCI: It is proposed to,
3 actually the restaurant that's located across the
4 street is proposed to be, relocate, located within
5 the, within our development site two.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

7 JACLYN SCARINCI: Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: So, it's going to be
9 a restaurant.

10 JACLYN SCARINCI: A restaurant, yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. And do you, can
12 you provide a unit mix and the affordability you
13 expect to be included in the building?

14 JACLYN SCARINCI: Currently we are
15 working on a unit distribution for both buildings,
16 but we will have a mix of studios, one bedrooms,
17 and two bedrooms.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. And last
19 question, for development site number one, how do
20 you plan to ensure that the windows of the building
21 on the south side of the project site will have
22 access to light and air?

23 JACLYN SCARINCI: Okay. Even within the
24 seven stories of the building we're not changing

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 the footprint of the building as it is proposed
3 which does provide the 30-foot rear yard.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you for
5 your testimony. Thank, thank you. Calling up the
6 next panel. Edward Laganna? Did I say it right?

7 EDWARD LA GRASSA: La Grassa.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: La Grassa, I'm sorry.
9 Brendon Levy, and John Kurtz. If you can please
10 state your name. We have two minutes and you can
11 begin. If you can push the button.

12 EDWARD LA GRASSA: Ah.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: There you go.

14 EDWARD LA GRASSA: Is it on? Okay. I'm a
15 member of Community Board 11's Landmark Committee.
16 I'm a trustee of the Douglaston Little Neck
17 Historical Society and I have been so for about 20
18 years. I am not representing them, I am
19 representing the community. I'm an active member in
20 Douglaston. I'm an also, an adjunct professor at
21 NYU's Graduate School of Real Estate. I'm active in
22 the ULI both nationally and locally. The proposed
23 building that is being planned at the intersection
24 of Douglaston Parkway and Northern Boulevard
25 incorporates sound planning principles. It is

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 ca
3 focused on senior citizens. It is near public
4 transportation. It is midrise. And it is contextual
5 in keeping with the scale of the adjacent apartment
6 buildings. It provides parking for local residents
7 and small retailers. And I feel that it is
8 aesthetically pleasing. I've seen the drawings for
9 the larger project and is the kind of development
10 that will be good for the community both on a need
11 and an aesthetic basis. This is important to me as
12 an active member of the community, an architect,
13 and one interested in good design and preservation.
14 At the meeting on October 22nd at the community
15 board the developer discussed their two projects.
16 However most of the people in the room came to the
17 meeting with a predetermined negative attitude.
18 Providing correct information did not alter this
19 attitude since many attendants, attendees were
20 there to stop any development. There are several
21 people in the community who are against all
22 development and they are leading an opposition
23 effort. They do not represent all the community.
24 Prior to the October 22nd meeting I received three
25 phone calls from people asking me to protest a
project they had never seen and all of them were

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 70
3 misinformed. They did not want to be confused by
4 facts and they were all nimbiam (sp?) protests.
5 Since October 22nd meeting several people have
6 quietly expressed support for the rezoning but they
7 were afraid to, afraid to talk. I'm not afraid to
8 support sound land use and development. Thank you.

9 BRENDAN LEVY: [off mic] Good morning,
10 Brendan Levy with the Queens Chamber. Is this on?
11 [on mic] Can you hear me now? Brendan Levy, Queens
12 Chamber of Commerce on behalf of the President, CEO
13 Tom Grech. I'm going to read a letter that Tom
14 Grech signed. We are in support of the project for
15 the Douglaston Parkway, Northern Boulevard
16 Rezoning, block 80-92, tax lots 5 and 39, portions
17 of lots 20525, 28 and 33 known as the rezoning
18 area. Letter's addressed to Council Member Vallone.
19 I write in support of the proposal to change the
20 rezoning area from R12 to an R6A zoning district.
21 The rezoning proposal includes a commercial overlay
22 at the intersection of Douglaston Parkway in
23 Northern Boulevard and designation of a mandatory
24 inclusionary housing or MIH area. The proposed
25 rezoning will allow the development of two
 buildings, the building at 24115 Northern Boulevard

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 71

3 will be a five-story building with 59 senior
4 housing units including about 20 units of
5 permanently affordable senior housing since 692
6 square feet of recreation space for seniors. There
7 would also be a recreation space for ancillary
8 services. There will be, as noted earlier, 89
9 attended parking spaces. And the owner is committed
10 that access spaces that are underutilized will be
11 available to local community when shopping in the
12 local commercial district. The second building at
13 4380 Douglaston Parkway will be an eight-story
14 apartment building with 24 dwelling units, about 14
15 of which will be permanently affordable for seniors
16 through the MIH program. The second building will
17 also contain about 1400 square feet of community
18 room space for seniors. All of the residential
19 units within the two buildings will be marketed to
20 seniors aged 55 and older, about 34 units who are
21 30 percent of the residential floor area
22 approximately, will be a permanently affordable for
23 low income seniors. In contrast to the citywide
24 senior population which is only 13 percent seniors
25 comprise 20 percent of the Douglaston population in
the blocks surrounding the rezoning area, the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 72

3 senior population increases to 22 percent. Queens
4 Community Board 11 residents who are in need of
5 affordable housing will be given preference to half
6 of the permanently affordable units. The applicant
7 has also committed to working with local non-profit
8 organization, HANAC who spoke earlier to provide...
9 [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
11 for your testimony. Thank you. We have two minutes.
12 Thank you.

13 BRENDAN LEVY: Anyway the, the chamber's
14 in support.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

16 BRENDAN LEVY: And..

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

18 BRENDEN: ...there's a great need for
19 senior housing.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you very much.

21 JOHN KURTZ: Thank you. Good morning. My
22 name is John Kurtz. I will be reading two letters
23 of whom are from the Community Board 11 and local
24 residents of Douglaston Queens. First will be from
25 George Mahaltas (sp?). Dear New York City City
 Council, I'm a local resident and I support the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 72

2 proposed UL, URP and redevelopment of 241-15
3 Northern Boulevard and 43-80 Douglaston Parkway.
4 The proposed development will improve the
5 appearance of two unused sites that are currently
6 an eye sore and have been for years. Additionally,
7 the proposed buildings will fit in well
8 contextually with adjacent buildings. Most
9 importantly the Northeast Queens community
10 especially in Douglaston, Littleneck and the base
11 side area, area have an acute lack of affordable
12 senior housing and services. I'm glad to hear that
13 all the residential units will be marketed to
14 seniors age 55 and older including a significant
15 number of affordable units. It is for these reasons
16 that I support this proposal. Sincerely, George
17 Mahaltas. The next letter will be from Alias
18 Feelhas (sp?). Good morning, my name is Alias
19 Feelhas. I live in Douglaston Queens and I am
20 currently a member of Community Board 11. I support
21 this rezoning application because I would like the
22 two lots on Douglaston Parkway puts a productive
23 use. There are many older residents in the
24 Douglaston area looking to relocate to smaller and
25 more efficient and modern looking apartments like

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 71

3 the ones being proposed. I think the design of the
4 new, the new buildings fit in well with the
5 neighborhood and would benefit the community by
6 adding the much needed senior housing. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I'm now
8 going to call up the next panel as Amire Con. Kelly
9 Fernandez. Excuse me if I mispronounce it. Is it
10 Sophia? You, how do you say your last name?

11 [off mic comments]

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I just
13 didn't want to butcher that one. I'm so sorry. We
14 may begin. Just please state your name and, and you
15 can start.

16 AMIRE CON: I guess..

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just push the button.

18 AMIRE CON: I'll begin. I wasn't.. I was
19 going to do the ladies first but it's okay. Good
20 morning Chair Moya and members of the subcommittee.
21 My name is Amire Con. I work as a doorman in the
22 upper east side of Manhattan. I've been a member of
23 32 BJ for the past nine years. I'm here today
24 speaking on behalf of my union not only as a member
25 but also as a lifelong resident of Queens to
express our support for the Douglaston Parkway

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 75

3 rezoning. As you know 32 BJ is the largest property
4 service union in the country. We represent 80,000
5 building service workers here in New York City who
6 clean and maintain buildings like the two being
7 proposed today. 241-15 Northern LLC and Northshore
8 Realty Group have committed to provide prevailing
9 wages ops for building service workers when their
10 buildings open. These are family sustaining jobs
11 that would allow workers to support their families
12 and continue to live in Queens. 32 BJ SCIU also
13 fully supports affordable housing for seniors. We
14 see this project as an important investment in
15 creating equitable and inclusive community in
16 Littleneck and we urge you to approve it. Thank you
17 for your time and thank you for having us this
18 morning.

19 KELLY FERNANDEZ: Good morning. My name
20 is Kelly Fernandez. I am here on behalf of the
21 Queens Economic Development Corporation. Reading a
22 letter. I am writing in support of the proposal to
23 change the zoning on the above referenced site to
24 allow for new development. The Queens Economic
25 Development Corporation supports projects that it
believes will benefit the community. In this case

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

76

2 the project calls for 59 units of much needed
3 senior housing, recreation, and ancillary space. 20
4 of the units will be affordable. This is important
5 as there are many deserving seniors in the
6 community. Additionally, the local nonprofit,
7 nonprofit designated to administer the senior
8 housing and programming is well respected and has a
9 great deal of experience in the borough.

10 SOPHIA YURUDIA: Good morning. I'm
11 Sophia Yurudia (sp?).

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

13 SOPHIA YURUDIA: Thank you for hearing
14 me. I'm here to support the rezoning for the two
15 buildings. I have lived and worked in the area most
16 of my adult life. I'm happy to hear that there is
17 going to be senior affordable housing, myself
18 included. We don't want to leave the neighborhood.
19 And to know that that is going to be available is
20 comforting to me. I'd like to stay there. I don't
21 think that the buildings are out of character if
22 you take a walk in the neighborhood. They're all
23 about that same level that we're speaking of. And
24 finally, I think that the additional foot traffic
25 would be huge for the local mom and pop stores that

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 77

3 lose a lot of business to the mall down the road.

4 So just to close I, I do support it. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you very
6 much. Thank you all for coming today and for your
7 testimony as well.

8 SOPHIA YURUDIA PLUNKETT: Thanks.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Are there any other
10 members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing
11 none, I now close the public hearing on this
12 application. And it will be laid over. We are now
13 going to our last public hearing for today and it
14 is LUs 335, 336, and 337, the 570 Fulton Street
15 rezoning for property in Majority Leader Cumbo's
16 district in Brooklyn. The applicant seeks approval
17 for a zoning map amendment to rezone property
18 located at the intersection of Fulton Street and
19 Flatbush Avenue from a C64 district to a C69
20 district. A series of related zoning text
21 amendments to the special downtown Brooklyn
22 district regulations these amendments would
23 establish a maximum permitted FAR of 18 for
24 commercial or community facility uses. They'd apply
25 to the special district height set back and tower
 regulations to C69 districts and create a new

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 72
3 special permit to allow modifications to bulk
4 requirements other than FAR. There is also a
5 special permit application pursuant to the proposed
6 zoning text to modify certain bulk yard and lot
7 coverage requirements. These actions would
8 facilitate the development of a 40-story mixed use
9 tower with retail use on the ground and second
10 floors, office use on floors three through 16 and
11 residential use on floors 17 through 40. I now open
12 the public hearing on this application. We are
13 calling David Schwartz and Allison...

13 ALLISON CURRERI: Curreri.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Curreri.

15 COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm that
16 the testimony you are about to give will be the
17 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth,
18 and that you will answer all questions truthfully?
19 As part of your response please state your full
20 name.

21 ALLISON CURRERI: Allison Curreri, yes.

22 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: David Schwartz,
23 yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Before we begin, I
25 just want to read the opening statement from

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 7a

3 Majority Leader Cumbo. Good morning, and thank you
4 all for attending this hearing. Downtown Brooklyn
5 is one of the most rapidly changing parts of New
6 York City. Development pressure seems to increase
7 by the day as we constantly learn of new plans for
8 ever larger towers. And these towers are far
9 different than what was originally projected by the
10 2004 rezoning. They contain prominently,
11 predominantly residential space instead of office
12 space and often with little real affordable housing
13 or provisions for local businesses, non-for-profit
14 organizations or cultural arts groups to share in
15 the growth of our borough. The tremendous boom in
16 downtown Brooklyn development has also placed
17 increased stress on our infrastructure and
18 neighborhood services. I constantly hear concerns
19 from my constituents about the consequences of over
20 development, subways busting at the seams,
21 overenrolled schools, long-time businesses
22 shuttering to be replaced by vacant storefronts or
23 chain stores, and housing costs increased far above
24 what they can afford. If we are to consider
25 allowing significant new density on top of the
tremendous development already occurring, we must

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 on
3 be sure that significant public benefits are
4 delivered to address these key challenges of
5 affordability and infrastructure capacity. This
6 project would be the first 18 FAR zoning district
7 approved in downtown Brooklyn and would set a
8 precedent for others to come. If we are going to
9 consider setting this precedent for density, I
10 believe we must also set a precedent for
11 significant public benefits, affordability, and
12 inclusive development. I look forward to hearing
13 from the developers on how they will address these
14 issues, and from my constituents and the public on
15 this important project for the future of downtown
16 Brooklyn. Thank you. And you may begin.

16 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you
17 Councilman, Chairman.

18 ALLISON CURRERI: Good morning. Allison
19 Curreri Greenberg Traurig, LLP. We're discussing a
20 proposal for a rezoning and related actions to
21 increase the maximum community facility and
22 commercial FAR at the project site from 10 to 18
23 with no change in the maximum residential density
24 in order to facilitate the development of 87,000
25 square feet of much needed office space in downtown

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 p 1

3 Brooklyn for local and growing companies. The
4 project site is in the special downtown Brooklyn
5 district at the intersection of Fulton Street and
6 Flatbush Avenue in an existing C64 zoning district
7 and fully surrounded by the C64 and a C64.5 zoning
8 district which are high density mixed use
9 districts. 570 Fulton Street, the development site
10 labeled DS on the screen is located along Fulton
11 Street. The proposed rezoning and related
12 applications are made with the respect to its
13 redevelopment utilizing air rights from the
14 adjacent parcel at one Flatbush Avenue which is
15 controlled by an affiliate of developer. The area
16 to rezone, be rezoned consists of lot 35 which is
17 the development site 570 Fulton, lot 26 which is
18 one Flatbush and will be merged as a single zoning
19 lot with the development site as well as a portion
20 of lot 24, 25 Flatbush Avenue which would not be
21 part of the development site. Our ULERP application
22 consists of the following actions. A rezoning of
23 the affected area from C64 to C69 which under a
24 text amendment would increase the maximum permitted
25 commercial and, or community facility FAR in the
C69 district from 10 to 18 and maintain the maximum

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 residential FAR at 12. It would also include text
3 amendments to establish the maximum of 18 FAR and
4 to create a new special permit that would permit
5 bulk waivers other than FAR waivers on a regular
6 sites in C69 districts within the special district.
7 And we would seek a special permit under that new
8 special permit application, four modifications of
9 setback, rear yard, port recess, and tower lot
10 coverage. And those special permit waivers are in
11 order to allow better floor plates and a shorter
12 building overall. And as I mentioned the primary
13 purpose of the application is to allow for a,
14 approximately 87,000 square feet of office space
15 which otherwise would not be developed to be
16 provided in the new building. If the actions are
17 approved 570 Fulton would be redeveloped with an
18 approximately 202 square, thousand square foot 40
19 story building, about 45 percent of which would be
20 commercial on 17 commercial floors including 87,000
21 square feet of office area. The office floor plates
22 would range from about 4,800 to 5,700, sorry to
23 7,500 square feet... that is a small typo there. And
24 these relatively small floor plates would be best
25 suited for small local companies and growing

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 □□

3 companies in the area. Above the commercial floors
4 we would have 23 stories of residential rental
5 units, approximately 139 units total. Because no
6 residential density increases associated with these
7 actions the project isn't subject to MIH but the
8 developers providing 25 to 30 percent of the units
9 as affordable units under the affordable New York
10 program and a portion of those units would also be
11 permanently affordable in order to increase the
12 residential FAR from 10 to 12 under the voluntary,
13 voluntary inclusionary program in the R10
14 districts. This shows a section and rendering of
15 the building. You can see the proportion of office
16 to residential space. The base of the building
17 which all would be commercial would rise ten
18 stories before our ten-foot setback from Fulton
19 Street above which seven more stories of office use
20 would be provided, and above that 23 stories of
21 residential. Above the base we would also setback
22 from the side lot line with the adjacent tower,
23 successive ten feet segments. Within the commercial
24 base we've also discussed with Council Member Cumbo
25 incorporating a cultural use or nonprofit component
in a manner that we could tie into the, the, these

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 21

2 applications either through a change to the
3 approved drawings or a text change and David can
4 talk about that a bit more. The building would rise
5 to a maximum height of 518 feet and 40 stories. And
6 here you can see how that looks in the context of
7 adjacent surrounding towers. The build... although
8 we're seeking an 18 FAR rezoning because of the
9 existing 12 FAR building on one Flatbush which
10 would be part of the zoning lot the building would
11 ultimately build, be built to 11.5, the new
12 building would be built to 11.5 FAR, the remaining
13 7.5 FAR would be within the one Flatbush building
14 on the zoning lot. And that together with the
15 special permit waivers we're seeking results in a
16 40-story building that we feel is in line with the
17 surrounding development. The special permit waivers
18 we seek are all intended to improve the floor
19 plates to make them a little bit larger and overall
20 decrease the total height of the building. The
21 first one is for a setback waiver in order to
22 setback 10 feet at 150 feet rather than what would
23 be required under the current tower regs which
24 would be 20 feet at 85, at a height of 85 feet,
25 waiver for the 20 foot required commercial rear

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 25

3 yard, a waiver for the residential rear yard that
4 would be required as well as an inter-court recess
5 waiver which is only required due to the merger of
6 the two parcels as a single zoning lot and wouldn't
7 affect the light and the air of the one Flatbush
8 units. The final waiver we're seeking is a tower
9 lot coverage waiver that again results just from
10 the merger of the two parcels as a single zoning
11 lot. It results in a lot coverage above a height of
12 150 feet that is in excess of the tower
13 requirements. Something that we've discussed and
14 heard a lot about in the public review process is
15 the impact of the project on the subway station at
16 Nevins Street which is directly adjacent to 1
17 Flatbush on Flatbush Avenue. There isn't an
18 entrance adjacent to the 570 building. We you know
19 seek to help that subway entrance get considerable
20 improvements. The problem is that the MTA hadn't
21 previously identified specific improvements that
22 they would like to have been made at that subway
23 entrance other than certain improvements that
24 developers affiliate already undertook in
25 connection with the development of the 1 Flatbush
building. So, in furtherance of, of making further

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 RC
3 improvements to that station including potential,
4 much better access for ADA. The developer has
5 agreed to make a 550,000-dollar contribution to
6 fund a study that the MTA would be able to put
7 towards identifying improvements that are, that
8 need to be made and can feasibly be engineered for
9 that subway station. And I'll turn it over to David
10 to talk more about that. And add anything else?

11 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: So, regarding the
12 subway station, that was a, something that came up
13 from community board, and that was a recommendation
14 from the borough president's office as well as from
15 city planning. So, it's something that we very much
16 agree with. I think the challenge there is that the
17 Nevin Street subway station, it's pressed right up
18 against Flatbush Avenue. It's very high up. So,
19 it's, there's no room really to get across with an
20 ADA access. So, it's a, it's a really tough station
21 and the MTA realizes that. And they, they need to
22 figure out, they, they really need to commission a
23 study in order to figure out what needs to be done
24 because it's not an easy solution. So, it's
25 something that we're happy as landlords there. We
 think, we agree that the Nevin Street Station as

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 27

3 well as unfortunately many stations need you know
4 significant improvements.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: That, that's a... okay
6 great. So, just a couple of questions. The zoning
7 that we're voting to allow, to give here, and it
8 gives you the ability to build a hotel. Are you
9 going to build a hotel?

10 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: We are not going to
11 build a hotel. And I think, you know one of the
12 things that's important to note here is this lot is
13 a very irregular lot. So, all of the waivers that
14 we're seeking are to make the floorplate big. It's
15 not a floorplate that would work as a hotel. And we
16 are committed to put in writing that we're not
17 going to build a hotel.

18 ALLISON CURRERI: I'll also, I'll also
19 note as a process matter you know city planning
20 approved this project because they wanted offices
21 here. The special permit plans that have been
22 approved in connection with the application by city
23 planning state that the commercial uses will be use
24 group 6A and 6B retail and office use, yeah retail
25 and office use, do, a change to use group 5 if we
are building pursuant to the special permit would

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 o o
3 require going back and getting the modification
4 which we don't think city planning is interested in
5 approving.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great and in writing
7 would be...

8 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: You're, we're happy
9 to work with, with, with council, with, with the
10 city, with council, for the city council to put
11 that into writing.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you. So
13 there's no MIH in this project, correct?

14 ALLISON CURRERI: Correct.

15 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: There's no increase
16 to residential FAR I think is an important point so
17 that's why there's no MIH. But we are agreeing to
18 do the affordable New York program.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Right. So, going to
20 the 421A, affordable New York program what are the
21 options there?

22 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: So, there are three
23 options. We've discussed with the Council Member of
24 I think it's option A or option 1. I, they keep
25 changing whenever we, they change the, the names
 once we figure it out. And that is an option of 10

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 aa
3 percent of the units at 40 percent AMI, 10 percent
4 at 60 percent AMI, five percent up to 130. Although
5 in our conversations with the Council Member this
6 week we talked about the, five percent at 130
7 lowering at five percent of 130 down to a, five
8 percent of a hundred. We have not finalized that
9 but that's the current discussion.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. So that would
11 be option A.

12 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yeah.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Because we know that
14 affordable housing at 130 AMI is hardly affordable.
15 You know those rents are going to be over 2,000 per
16 month. I'm glad to hear that you're committing to
17 lowering the AMIs on those units. I know that
18 that's very important to the majority leader. How
19 are you looking to memorialize that commitment?

20 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Again, we're open
21 to put that as well, as well... into writing. And we
22 are, we're committed to work with the city council
23 and with Council Member Cumbo and her office to
24 memorialize all of those items.

25 ALLISON CURRERI: We'd also be happy to
26 notify HPD of the same intention to..

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

an

2 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: And, and...

3 ALLISON CURRERI: ...pursue that option.

4 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: And, and any other
5 recommendations that there are we are happy to
6 comply.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. And will you
8 partner with a local non-for-profit to, to be the
9 administering agent for the affordable housing?

10 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yeah, we will
11 partner if we have not already with impact that
12 this would be, this will be our third project with
13 impact that was formally pack, private area
14 community council. This will be our third project
15 with them. And if we have not already signed an
16 agreement with them we will sign an agreement with
17 them, we will sign an agreement with them and they
18 have done, they've done other lease ups for us in
19 the neighborhood.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Right. So, you know
21 that one of the very important issues for the
22 majority leader has always been the space for
23 cultural and non-for-profits, especially for
24 projects that involve adding significant commercial
25 density. I know she believes that there should be

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 a1

3 some stronger tools for reserving the space for
4 arts and cultural organizations in the new
5 development. Will you reserve a portion of the
6 commercial space in the building for an arts or
7 cultural use or for a non-for-profit office space?

8 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yes, we are
9 prepared to do that. We agree with the majority
10 leader that it is important to keep the, the
11 cultural district which is what we, one of the
12 things that we love so much about this area is that
13 cultural district. So we are in discussions with,
14 with Council Member Cumbo and her office is to how,
15 exactly what that means. But we are committed to
16 having space for cultural and or non-profits. And
17 lastly will you consider a preference for
18 independent local retail in the retail space for
19 this project?

20 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: So that's something
21 that we'll have to take under consideration and
22 discuss with the team.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. One second.
24 Thank you. I'm going to turn it over now to Council
25 Member Levin.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 a?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Mr.
4 Chair. So, I want to also ask you a few questions
5 on behalf of Council Member, or Majority Leader
6 Cumbo. Just following up on the, on the commercial
7 affordability or not, not for profit cultural
8 space. Would you work with us to pursue potential
9 options to require that that happened in the
10 zoning?

11 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Sure. We're totally
12 open to any mechanisms to, you know to require
13 whatever we agree to.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay.

15 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: So, any mechanisms
16 that you guys can think of, you know we're... [cross-
17 talk]

18 ALLISON CURRERI: Yeah, we've, we've had
19 some initial discussions with the staff in terms of
20 changes that we could make to either the approved
21 drawings or the zoning text in a way that would be
22 in scope that would, that would tie us into that
23 commitment.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. The... why
25 did... do you know why the 1 Flatbush building

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 a2
3 received a waiver for the requirement to build new
4 subway stairs. 1 Flatbush was your development.

5 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yeah so... the MTA
6 didn't want to put the subway stairs into the
7 building. They, they actually wanted to keep the
8 subway entrance adjacent, you know where it is
9 right now right at Flatbush Avenue. So that was
10 sort of an older view where they, you know at one
11 point in time they were, I think in like the early,
12 the 90s I think they were moving a lot of Subway
13 stations inside buildings. They decided they didn't
14 want to do that. So that was at the MTA's
15 discretion.

16 ALLISON CURRERI: And, and it was very
17 related to the engineering challenges that David
18 described earlier which relate to, instead of being
19 able to go down to one set of stairs to the subway
20 platform, the only way to keep the platform in its
21 current location would be to tunnel underneath the
22 stairs and build stairways back up... [cross-talk]

23 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: There, there are
24 two subway tunnels... [cross-talk]

25 ALLISON CURRERI: ...which alone wouldn't
really improve... [crosswalk]

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 a.n

3 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: ...on Fulton Street
4 and Flatbush Avenue so they both come like this and
5 leave the, the 45 on Flatbush Avenue is actually
6 like touching our building. So, when we excavate it
7 at 1 Flatbush it's actually touching the building.
8 So, it's so close. So, it's a very challenge... it's
9 a... and it's also a... the train kind of turns when it
10 comes in there. It's a challenging station for
11 them.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. Can you, I
13 mean in light of this tragedy that happened this
14 week of the young mother who, who died falling down
15 the, the stairs at a subway station in Manhattan.
16 You know I think that there's a, an increased focus
17 on ADA or accessibility at a subway station. Can
18 you describe the agreement with city planning and
19 the MTA to advance ADA access to the Nevin Station?

20 ALLISON CURRERI: Sure. The agreement
21 that has been put in writing to the chair of the
22 city planning commission is that the developer will
23 make a 550,000-dollar contribution to the MTA to
24 fund the MTA's study of improvements that can be
25 made to the Nevin Street station particularly with
 respect to ADA access. We, there's no kind of

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 as
3 current scope of what that will entail other than
4 you know that they're going to look at...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: That's a
6 commitment made by, by your team.

7 ALLISON CURRERI: Yes.

8 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yeah. And that was
9 something you know... that kind of came out of
10 conversations with the borough president where... you
11 know the conversations that he and his staff was
12 that they're, they're going to be a lot, there's
13 going to still be a lot of development,
14 specifically at this intersection if you look
15 around. And the problem is that if you ask the MTA
16 today what they need they don't know yet because
17 they need to do that study. So really the idea was
18 that...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I mean they
20 should. That's, you know at this point...

21 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: That's...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah.

23 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: I won't, I won't
24 get into that. I think... I don't disagree with you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 a6

3 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: But you know I
4 think that we want to have some definitive, so this
5 way that they can have some definitive needs as
6 downtown Brooklyn continues to develop. And for us
7 we totally agree. We agree with, with you and it is
8 a tragedy and we agree with everything that you and
9 your colleagues have said that there needs to be
10 you know quite a few fixes to the MTA and... [cross-
11 talk] you know this station is certainly one of
12 them that we want to see you know continue to be
13 fixed.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah, yeah.

15 ALLISON CURRERI: So, the, and the hope
16 being that the improvements identified in
17 connection with that study could ultimately be tied
18 in with future applications.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah. This
20 statement, this station is a, a dismal station. I,
21 I, there's a... there's a staff member here at the
22 council that reminds me every, every couple of
23 weeks that there's a...

24 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: I take the train
25 from there. I mean it's, it's a tough station, it's
a bad station.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 a7

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah. Falling,
4 chipping, peeling paint and you know... [cross-talk]

5 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: And there are just
6 a lot of challenges, a lot of infrastructure
7 underneath that station also. So, it's a...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: It's very
9 neglected by the MTA, very neglected.

10 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Agreed.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Public art at Fox
12 Square. Can you... because it's an important location
13 in terms of Gateway to downtown Brooklyn. Will you
14 commit to working with local arts organizations on
15 public art at Fox Square?

16 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Absolutely. I mean
17 we would love to do that. And actually, we've had
18 some conversations downtown, Brooklyn partnership.
19 They have some really amazing ideas so we would
20 love to work with them, other groups, local
21 artists. It's something that's near and dear to our
22 heart. We love it. Something that they... the council
23 member has been mentioning to us for years as this
24 project's been going on. So, we'd be committed to
25 do that.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 o o

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Sustainability
4 and resiliency. What are those measures proposed or
5 contemplated for this project?

6 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: So, we did submit
7 that to the borough president. We could submit
8 that... I don't know off hand but we're happy to
9 submit. We had, we had done a write up on all the
10 sustainability features from the architect. So,
11 we're happy to submit that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Certainly. We
13 encourage green roofs, solar roofs, green solar,
14 you know the combinations are, you know... [cross-
15 talk]

16 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yeah, we're, we, we
17 agree on sustainability and we, well we can submit
18 to, to whoever at the council what we plan to do
19 there.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right, Passive
21 House or Net Zero, anything like that would be,
22 would be well received here. And lastly regard to
23 building service workers is there a commitment to
24 good jobs since there's going to be a, commercial
25 component is here as well.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 aa

3 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yes, we've, we have
4 an agreement with 32BJ.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay.

6 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: And they I believe
7 are here to testify but we've, we already have an
8 agreement with them for 570 Fulton as well as 1
9 Flatbush.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And then do you
11 have a plan in place for local hiring and...
12 participation?

13 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Yes, we will. We've
14 already, we have, we have an agreement with Team
15 Brown consulting, and we will continue to do local
16 hiring.

17 [off mic talking]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Good, how are
19 you?

20 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: And we have, we
21 have a, a commitment to continue to do that. And we
22 do that on all of our projects.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. Thank you.
24 That's all for me. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 DAVID SCHWARTZBAUM: Thank you.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 100

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you very much
4 for your testimony today. I'm going to now call the
5 next panel. Cassandra Carrillo (sp?), May Yu.

6 [cross-talk]

7 MAY YU: Good morning Chair Moya and
8 Council Members. My name May Yu. I'm the Vice
9 President of Real Estate at the downtown Brooklyn
10 Partnership where my role is leading our research
11 on job and firm growth as well as speaking with
12 potential tenants about opportunities to locate
13 their offices in downtown Brooklyn. And on behalf
14 of DBP I'd like to express our strong support for
15 the proposed project at 570 Fulton Street. As the
16 applicant mentioned the proposal as we understand
17 it only asks for a up zoning for commercial only
18 while limiting the residential FAR to their as-of-
19 right, as allowed per current zoning. And in doing
20 so, they would really be able to provide the much-
21 needed office space. In fact, about 87,000 square
22 feet of commercial office which if fully tenanted
23 could yield up to 400 plus office jobs near the
24 intersection of Fulton Street and Flatbush Avenue.
25 As many of you know downtown Brooklyn is the city's
third largest central business district and it has

2 seen record job and business grown over the past
3 several years. In fact, out pacing the growth of
4 Brooklyn as a borough as well as New York City as a
5 borough. And we've seen particularly strong growth
6 and the tech information and arts and entertainment
7 sectors. Despite a very constrained office market
8 downtown Brooklyn has had about a two to seven
9 percent office vacancy in the past several years
10 and that's, indicates a really high demand for
11 office space compared to about 10 to 12 percent in
12 the financial district in midtown Manhattan. The
13 project would meet additional demand and would
14 support continued job growth in the cultural
15 district just two blocks away from two subway
16 stations and Flatbush Avenue. We've seen and spoken
17 to a number of creative companies such as Blue
18 State Digital which is known for their digital
19 campaigns and launch of Obama for America as well
20 as Gimlet Media, the Brooklyn's favorite podcasting
21 company, take space at small floorplate offices
22 along Flatbush Avenue as well as FXCollaborative,
23 the architecture company who is headquartered, will
24 now be headquartered a few blocks away. Again, 570
25 Fulton's small floorplate offices catering

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2 100
3 specifically to small businesses and entrepreneurs
4 would help to spur job growth in the area. And it's
5 something we extremely supports. Just additionally
6 downtown Brooklyn Partnership helps to maintain Fox
7 Square as part of our bid services and plaza
8 program with DOT. And we have been working with
9 local arts organizations such as Brick, Bam, and is
10 part of Department of Cultural Affairs city Canis
11 (sp?) program to look at additional arts
12 installations in the area. And we're happy to work
13 with Slate and with landlords of 570 Fulton to make
14 sure that that's incorporated there. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

16 CASSIE CARRIO: Good morning Chair Moya.
17 My name is Cassie Carrio (sp?) and I work for 32BJ.
18 I'm speaking today on behalf of my union to express
19 our support for the pros, proposed project at 570
20 Fulton. 32BJ also represents over 700 workers who
21 live in District 35. It's our estimation that when
22 open this building will be staffed by about six
23 building service workers. 570 Fulton LLC and
24 affiliate... has committed that these jobs will be
25 good jobs with family sustaining wages. These are
the types of jobs that give New Yorkers dignity and

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 102

3 access to mobility. 32BJ and Slate have been
4 building a strong relationship throughout their
5 portfolio. And we are confident that they will be a
6 responsible employer at this site. We urge you to
7 approve this project. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
9 for your testimony today. Are there any other
10 members of the public who wish to testify? Did you
11 fill out a slip? With the Sergeant at Arms? You
12 have to fill out a speaker slip with the Sergeant
13 at Arms.

14 COLLAY OKAR: Okay. Good morning Council
15 Members. My name Collay OKar. I'm from the
16 surrounding area over there by 55, 570 Fulton
17 Street at Ingersoll Houses. And over the past year
18 the Slate group has demonstrated great commitment
19 to our community. They have been undergoing a lot
20 of changes in our community. And they have been
21 front and forward with it. I'm giving out book from
22 book back drives to organizing things. And Brooklyn
23 right now is very heavily populated. And they had a
24 lot of creative minds. And this office space is
25 very needed, that the Slate great, the Slate group
 is talking about the affordable office space is

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 1001
3 very needed because you know the traveling, you
4 don't have to travel and you know guide people in
5 the neighborhood to them small businesses, guide
6 people in the neighborhood. So, I think that that's
7 a great, great idea, especially for a small
8 business owner like me. That's looking forward to
9 it.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: What kind of business
11 do you have?

12 COLLAY OKAR: Oh, I make tee shirts.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Very nice.

14 COLLAY OKAR: Thank you. I make tee
15 shirts, anything you want.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm going to have
17 come visit you then.

18 COLLAY OKAR: Alright, thanks.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your
20 testimony. It's okay.

21 I will fill this out when I'm finished..

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You could just state
23 your name and then you can... [cross-talk]

24 CARRINGTON: Yes. [cross-talk]

25 CARRINGTON: ..Carrington. Okay. I live
 in the district. And I'm just really here to, to

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2 105

3 hopefully you guys can pass the project so that we
4 can get jobs and housing for the area, much needed.
5 You know? And we can continue to be a part of the
6 change in downtown Brooklyn.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you.

8 CARRINGTON: Want to ask me anything?

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No, I think we're
10 good...

11 CARRINGTON: Thank you very much.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Do they,
13 do they have anybody else? Anyone else from... How
14 you doing? Just if... [cross-talk]

15 CARRINGTON: 570 Fulton Project.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just state your name
17 and then you can begin.

18 DIA PLUNKETT: My name is Dia Plunkett.
19 And this project is much much needed in the
20 neighborhood for it's much, a good suggestion for
21 our neighborhood, for, just for everything to work
22 better, optimistic for the future for everybody.
23 But this a very much needed program for me, a lot
24 of people. I'm kind of shaky but I'm just... [cross-
25 talk] ...rolling with the program Sir.

 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No, it's okay.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

106

DIA PLUNKETT: But I'm, I'm very much optimistic about this program. And I think that it'll do a lot for everyone in the community. And I'm here to represent a family, everyone before me. And this is a much-needed program. That's all I can say for the moment.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sorry. Thank you. I appreciate you coming down here and testifying.

DIA PLUNKETT: Thank you sir.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Have a great day. Okay are there any other members of the public who wish to testify? Okay seeing none I now close the public hearing on this application, and it will be laid over. This concludes today's meeting and I would like to thank the members of the public, my colleagues, the council, and Land Use staff for all their great work to get this done. This meeting is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 02, 2019