

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION JOINT WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

January 26, 2017
Start: 10:26 a.m.
Recess: 2:39 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

VANESSA L. GIBSON
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Daniel R. Grodenchik
James Vacca
Margaret S. Chin
Stephen T. Levin
Deborah L. Rose
James G. Van Bramer
David G. Greenfield
Costa G. Constantinides
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Vincent J. Gentile
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Jumaane D. Williams
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.

Chaim M. Deutsch
Rafael Espinal, Jr.
Rory I. Lancman
Ritchie J. Torres
Steven Matteo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner
NYC City Department of Transportation

Ryan Russo, Deputy Commissioner
Transportation Planning and Management
NYC City Department of Transportation

Thomas Chan, Chief
Transportation Bureau
NYC Police Department

Dennis Fulton, Inspector
Transportation Bureau
NYC Police Department

Dawn Miller, Chief of Staff
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Madeline Labadie, Senior Analyst & Vision Zero Lead
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Keith Kerman, Deputy Commissioner
Department of Citywide Administrative Services, DCAS
NYC Chief Fleet Officer

Gale Brewer
Manhattan Borough President

Julia Kite, Policy and Research Manager
Transportation Alternatives

Hindy Schachter
Families for Safe Streets

Janey Hall
Hit & Run Victim

Mark O'Connor
Transportation Alternatives
Also Appearing for Allen Snead

Eric McClure, Executive Director
StreetsPAC.

is Kristen Bertet
Co-Founder of Check Peds

Joanna Altman-Smith
Safe Street Advocate

Alec Slatky, Representative
Triple A Northeast

[sound check, pause]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] [on
mic] Sorry. Good morning and welcome to today's
joint hearing of the City Council's Transportation
and Public Safety Committees. I'm Ydanis Rodriguez,
Chair of the Transportation committee, and I am
joined by my colleague Council Member Vanessa Gibson,
the Chair of the Public Safety Committee. First, let
me recognize the council members who are here with
us, Council Member Matteo--Matteo, Vallone, Deutsch,
Chin, Reynoso, Vacca, Gentile--[background comments]
Council Member Lancman, and this morning we will be
examining the city's Vision--Vision Zero program, and
hear testimony on a variety of important legislation.
Reducing traffic fatalities through Vision Zero was
one with the Mayor de Blasio with Speaker Mark-
Viverito, and we the rest of the Council in our city.
As we enter our fourth year, we can definitely say
Vision Zero has saved lives on our streets. With
year over year reductions in the number of New York--
New Yorkers tragically killed in traffic, this
expands to a--to a great work and partnership between
DOT Commissioner Trottenberg, Chief Chan of the NYPD
and the full de Blasio Administration, Speaker Mark-

1 Viverito and the rest of the colleagues here in this
2 body. At the same time, the goal of reducing traffic
3 fatalities entirely by 2024 remains a goal that we
4 must be aggressive in achieving. Today, these
5 committees are interested in discovering what we've
6 learned, where we proceed, and what challenge
7 remains. We lost 229 people to cars last year.
8 While this is down from 234 in 2015, pedestrian and
9 cyclist fatalities rose with 144 and 18 deaths
10 respectively in 2015 up to 139 in '14 and 2015. This
11 is basically reminds all of us in our city how
12 important it is not to race on our path too fast, and
13 instead continue to push forward with proven
14 strategies. I'm glad to see the Administration is
15 planning JOSAP (sic). We had good news early this
16 week when Mayor de Blasio announced new investments
17 in Vision-Vision Zero totaling nearly \$400 million.
18 We are glad to say that these were even greater
19 investments than what the Council requested last
20 year. These committees are eager to hear where this
21 funding will be spent, and how projects will be
22 prioritized. Of course we know that much more can
23 and must be done. When it comes to enforcement we
24 want to make sure that the NYPD is focusing its
25

1
2 efforts in ways that will have the most impact on
3 making drivers, passengers, cyclists and pedestrians
4 safer, and we heard from the Mayor yesterday that
5 that's his priority, too. We would like to hear more
6 about how the Police Department is maximizing use of
7 the tools available including the Right-of-Way Law.
8 We also want to hear how the Police Department's
9 interactions with crash victims can be improved.
10 Every incident, especially when someone is injured or
11 dies, deserves a fair and thorough investigation—for
12 an investigation, and victims and their families
13 deserve to be treated with the compassion, and
14 provide timely and comprehensive updates regarding
15 their case—they're eager—their case—I'm sorry—to the
16 maximum extend possible. Additionally, the Council—
17 the City needs to work closely with our District
18 Attorney to ensure that cases of traffic violence are
19 treated with the attention and seriousness that are
20 deserved throughout the judicial process. It is sad
21 to know that less than 5% of those drivers who get
22 involved in hit and run aren't put behind the bars in
23 our city. Therefore, we need to go ask if those
24 treatments of drivers. As many of you know, one
25 should realize a very important thing, and many of my

1 colleagues is the—~~is~~ the scourge of hit and run
2 incidents on our city streets. We here at the
3 Council have legislated repeatedly on this issue,
4 raising penalties, increasing reporting, and yet
5 tragic incidents like the one just last week in
6 Midtown are still all too common in our city. When a
7 collision occurs especially with—~~with~~ a vulnerable
8 pedestrian or cyclist, drivers need to recount any
9 emotions they may have and remain at the scene in
10 order to ensure that assistance can reach everyone
11 involved quickly, and so that there can be a fair and
12 accurate investigation. Albany also has to act.
13 They need to close the loop. There's an incentive
14 for drivers to leave the scene because the penalties
15 today are higher for the drivers that is drunk than
16 the drivers who—~~that~~ commit a hit and run, and that's
17 where Albany to change the law to allow the DA to be
18 able to have more tools to prosecute those drivers.
19 Those who cannot—~~mostly~~ the most basic level of human
20 decency, their decency needs to face serious
21 consequences so we make clear that such behavior is
22 not acceptable in the city of New York. I want to
23 work with the City on this effort, and my colleagues
24 here to—~~and~~ hear from the DOT and the NYPD on what
25

1 strategies that aren't being employed today can help
2 support more arrests and convictions of these crimes.

3 I have laid out several steps we can start to take
4 through a reward upon and Amber Alert system, and
5 legislation that I will be introducing in the next
6 couple of days, and remain open to other ideas. As
7 your partners in this effort, these committees are—
8 and the Council are committed to taking any

9 legislative action we can do to assist—to assist in
10 this important work to save lives, the lives of poor,
11 rich, middle-class, black, white, Asian, Latino,
12 tourists, residents of our city of all New Yorkers.

13 We will hear testimony on ten bills today many aimed
14 at strengthening the city's tools in achieving Vision
15 Zero. These bills range strengthening protection in
16 communities with a higher number of senior citizens,
17 a bill I introduced to improving a streetscape around
18 a school. These populations are our most vulnerable
19 when it comes to traffic violence, and our—while they
20 are a priority to this Council. We also will hear
21 bills updating process through technology and data
22 reporting to ensure New Yorkers are more aware of
23 what is happening on our streets especially if it
24 involved them. Lastly, I would just like to offer a
25

1
2 word of defense to the safe street advocacy
3 community, particularly the victims of—and families
4 or victims and their organizations, Families for
5 Safer Streets, you being our hero. You are the ones
6 leading this effort. Also, I would like to thank
7 Transportation Alternatives for all the work that you
8 do championing this important issue. Much of the
9 progress this city has made extends to your tireless
10 efforts. Your voice is an important one, and we
11 greatly value your commitment and your partnership.
12 Now, let's hear from the Chairman of the Public
13 Safety Committee, Council Member Gibson.

14 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much,
15 Chair Rodriguez and good morning to each and every
16 one of you. Welcome to City Hall. I am Council
17 Member Vanessa Gibson of the 16th District in the
18 Bronx, and I am proud to chair the City Council's
19 Committee on Public Safety. I thank each and every
20 one of you for being here, to all of my colleagues,
21 to my co-chair, Chair Ydanis Rodriguez. Today's
22 joint hearing of the Committees on Public Safety and
23 Transportation is truly a very important topic that
24 we are discussing. I welcome you all, and I thank
25 you for being here. This morning we are examining

1 Vision Zero, progress and needs. The safety of our
2 pedestrians, our cyclists, our motorists is of
3 paramount importance. Three years ago in 2014, our
4 Mayor Bill de Blasio announced that this
5 Administration would commit to reduce and eliminate
6 traffic fatalities by 2024. We commend the
7 incredible amount of work and commitment that has
8 been done towards achieving this goal by the
9 Administration especially the Department of
10 Transportation led by our Commissioner Polly
11 Trottenberg, the NYPD led by our Chief of
12 Transportation Chief Thomas Chan and his staff, all
13 of our transportation advocates, family members,
14 community leaders and many, many stakeholders. I
15 especially want to applaud the work of my incredible
16 colleague and Co-Chair Council Member Rodriguez for
17 his relentless and tireless advocacy. When we
18 launched Vision Zero three years ago, we forth to
19 ensure that every New Yorkers truly had a voice
20 whether they could get to City Hall or not, and we
21 traveled to each and every borough Staten Island,
22 Manhattan, Queens, Brooklyn and the Bronx, and we
23 held hearings, listening to residents and bicyclists
24 and pedestrians and so many stakeholders on their
25

1
2 concerns about our shared streets. We got tons of
3 feedback, lots of information, and certainly for
4 those that were not able to travel to City Hall, we
5 really heard from them. Unfortunately, there were
6 still too many fatalities on our roads year to date.
7 Every single life matters, and every tragedy is a
8 learning experience and an opportunity to learn how
9 we can do better, and how we can better protect our
10 streets. Our crosswalks need to be the safest place
11 on our streets. They used to be, and even now they
12 should, and through this work they will be. Overall,
13 fatalities are down, and we are commending the
14 Administration for that work, but we know there has
15 been an increase in pedestrian and cyclists deaths.
16 Many of these fatalities target our most vulnerable
17 New Yorkers. Seniors 65 years and over account for
18 33% of traffic fatalities, and children under the age
19 of 14 are most likely to die from an injury sustained
20 after being hit by a vehicle. While the Department
21 of Transportation plays its role in traffic
22 accidents, as Chair of the Public Safety Committee, I
23 am interested in learning the role of the NYPD's
24 Collision Investigation Squad, and keeping our
25 streets safe because we know while we enforce and

1
2 make sure that our laws as strong as possible, it
3 means nothing without enforcement. As all New
4 Yorkers, we have many forms and modes of
5 transportation whether by foot, bicycle, bus or car,
6 and we have to learn to share our streets even more.
7 Our priority as a city is first and foremost to
8 ensure the safety and wellbeing of everyone that uses
9 our roads. Though we continue to face challenges,
10 through these hearings and the legislation that we
11 put forth, we want to make it clear that public
12 safety is our absolute priority. I hope in today's
13 hearing to learn more about what the Administration's
14 plans are for addressing the fatalities, and
15 certainly the injuries that we've seen year to date,
16 and their continued plans of making our streets
17 safer. I also want to recognize and applaud our
18 Mayor and many advocates for their commitment. We
19 know that this week's Preliminary Budget has made
20 significant investments in our streets, and making
21 sure that they can be much more safe for each and
22 every one of us. So many of our family members and
23 advocates and community stakeholders have been with
24 us from day one, and we thank you so much. Those
25 family members who lost loved ones who recognize that

1 through their pain they can develop a plan and a
2 purpose. We thank you so much, and certainly on a
3 personal level in my own community in my hometown on
4 January 9th, unfortunately we had tragedies in the
5 Borough of Brooklyn. We have three individuals who
6 were tragically killed while they were traveling in
7 the street and one of those individuals was a
8 childhood friend of mine. His name was Marlon
9 Palacios. He was 43 years old, and in the late
10 afternoon on Monday, January 9th, around 4:30 in the
11 afternoon he was crossing Linden Boulevard and Avenue
12 A in East Flatbush to travel to pick up his four-
13 year-old son, and unfortunately because of an out-of-
14 control driver, he never made it to pick up his son.
15 And I have been with his family. I've known him
16 since we were both raised together, and sadly he
17 leaves behind a wife and three sons. And so, many of
18 you we all have a story, and we know that behind
19 those numbers there are faces that look just like
20 ours. And so I have a heavy heart today because my
21 heart is hurting because a wife no longer has her
22 husband, and three boys no longer have their father.
23 And so to all the advocates I know your pain. I've
24 known your pain since the beginning, but now on a
25

1 personal level I know it even deeper. And so I—I
2 dedicate today's hearing to my friend Marlon, to his
3 family. I will neve stop working with them. I will
4 continue to be an advocate to protect our children
5 and our families and our seniors on our streets, and
6 I certainly thank the Administration for their work
7 and for being here. And I want to recognize the
8 Public Safety staff that did the work to put this
9 hearing together, our Legislative Counsel Deepa
10 Ambekar; our Legislative Counsel Beth Golub; our
11 Policy Analyst Casey Addison; our Finance Analyst
12 Steve Riester; and want to also recognize the members
13 of the Public Safety Committee who are here our
14 Minority Leader Council Member Steve Matteo, Council
15 Member Chaim Deutsch, Council Member James Vacca,
16 Council Member Rory Lancman, Council Member Vincent
17 Gentile, and I also want to say that we are—in the
18 Public Safety Committee we have two bills that are on
19 today's agenda. The first bill is sponsored by
20 Council Member Wills. It's Intro 1040, which relates
21 to establishing a commission to study and make
22 recommendations regarding the root causes of violence
23 in our city. The second bill is sponsored by Council
24 Member Deutsch, which relates to require the Police
25

1
2 Department to share collision reports digitally. And
3 as Chair Rodriguez mentioned, I certainly want to
4 thank him for his leadership in sponsoring bills on
5 the agenda today, and also want to recognize Council
6 Member Vallone, Council Member Maisel, Majority
7 Leader Council Member Van Bramer, and Council Member
8 Deutsch, who have bills on today's agenda as well.
9 Looking forward to have a very productive hearing
10 today. Thank you for being here, and now I will turn
11 this back over to my co-chair, Chair Rodriguez.
12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
14 Chair. Before hearing from the Administration, we
15 will hear a few words from the sponsor of the bill
16 First Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
18 very much to our chairs. I know we have a very
19 packed agenda, so I'll be relatively brief, but I
20 just want to say that making sure that the routes to
21 every single one of our schools is as safe as it
22 possibly can be is perhaps one of the most important
23 things—things that we can do. I know that all of you
24 share that passion [coughs] and—and want that just as
25 badly as we do, but to make sure that we're doing

1 everything we can. Intro 1257 would require the DOT
2 to create a safe route to school action plan
3 identifying the most dangerous school sites with the
4 most significant number of crashes, and then to
5 devise a traffic safety plan near the schools, and
6 include what will be done such as installing stop
7 signs, speed bumps, roadway reconstruction and
8 release a schedule for implementing these upgrades.
9 Incredibly important. Every two years the plan will
10 be updated, and I know the DOT is already doing some
11 of that work, and I've already read your testimony,
12 Commissioner Trottenberg, so I know what you're going
13 to say about that bill, but I look forward to asking
14 you some questions about your response. And then
15 Intro 1116 codifying the Vision Zero View Map into
16 law would increase the amount of information DOT must
17 make available to the public. Currently, information
18 is available, but we think that data should be
19 drilled down, and—and information such as the types
20 of crash, rear-end, turning vehicles, fatal serious
21 injury, injury non-fata, et cetera. Contributing
22 factors to each crash: Driver inattention,
23 pedestrian error, et cetera. The pedestrian crash—
24 the percentage of pedestrians in a collision who are
25

1
2 crossing with the signal, the percentage of crashes
3 involving turning vehicles, and the time of day of
4 crashes. That information should also be available
5 to the public who don't just want to know where
6 crashes are occurring in their neighborhoods, but why
7 those crashes are—are occurring. I also saw your
8 reference to that bill in your testimony, but look
9 forward to seeing both of them passed into law and
10 signed into law. So I want to thank our chairs,
11 thank all of our colleagues and the advocates for
12 making this day a reality. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you to our
14 co-chairs. Very simply we have a bill Intro 671, and
15 I took a sneak peak at the testimony. I'm happy to
16 see that we will be supporting, and for everyone
17 that's here, 671 is a requirement to enact countdown
18 pedestrian signals at intersections, intersections
19 adjacent to our schools and our parks. Needed,
20 overdue, it needs to be done. Without question our
21 seniors and our students are the most vulnerable when
22 trying to cross our intersections. I know the DOT
23 is—is starting to implement those countdowns. This
24 will mandate that we get to them, to every one of

1 them. So I look forward to the testimony, and—and
2 thank you to both of our Chairs.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Good morning,
5 everyone. Thank you Chair Gibson and Chair Rodriguez
6 and to all my colleagues who are here this morning.
7 Today I—I am discussing two bills that I'm
8 introducing, Intro 1311 and Intro 1280. Both of
9 those are common sense pieces of legislation that
10 will save our constituents and our first responders
11 time and wasted energy. Intro 1280 mandates NYPD to
12 provide online access to accident reports who involve
13 parties. This will save drivers the hassle of
14 several trips and phone calls in order to obtain a
15 copy of the report, and it will allow officers—police
16 officers to reduce lines at the precincts and instead
17 focus on more important issues. Intro 1311 requires
18 the Department of Transportation to notify the Police
19 Department and Fire Department five days in advance
20 of street resurfacing so as to ensure that they are
21 aware of streets to avoid the—the traffic backups
22 during million and paving. This will save the
23 valuable seconds and could mean the difference
24 between life and death when police officers, fire
25 fighters or EMS workers are responding to an

1 emergency call. I'm looking forward to this hearing
2 and hearing from the officials of the NYPD and DOT
3 about both of these bills, and I'm eager to hear the
4 input of my colleagues. Thank you. [pause]

5
6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I'd
7 like to recognize also that we've been joined by
8 Council Members Menchaca, Richards, Wills and also
9 thank the Transportation Committee staff Gafar
10 Zaaloff, Jennifer Messarano, Emily Rooney, Chima
11 Obichere, and Brandon Swift. Now, we will be asking
12 the representatives of the Administration who are
13 here with us will—I'm sorry. I would like to welcome
14 the representatives of the Administration who are
15 here with us today. As you know, more than \$300
16 million in this budget to redesign—continue
17 redesigning dangerous intersections, correcting the
18 area that it had been—where we've been getting a lot
19 of crashes. It's important also of having the NYPD
20 about the leadership with our DOT Commissioner. Have
21 been so meeting together (sic) with Chief Chan of the
22 NYPD and no we will-- So we go back to the other
23 things and representatives for Council Member Wills
24 to speak on opening statement.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I just want to
4 thank the co-chairs and all of my colleagues who have
5 bills today for the diligent work that you have put
6 in, but I am withdrawing my bill from this hearing.
7 It has been brought to my attention that it was never
8 meant to be passed. It was just a hearing given to
9 satisfy the rules of the Council and some good
10 government groups. So I am withdrawing my hearing
11 from that. This is not a rant, but I refuse to waste
12 anybody's time, hours or the public's with play-along
13 games. If we're going to put bills forward they
14 should have-respected, and they should have real
15 hearings and debate. Any members that would like to
16 withdraw their names because they get any pressure to
17 withdraw it, I'm fine with that. And any members that
18 would choose to I guess defend the Speaker on what I
19 just said, you're welcome to jump out the window and
20 see where you land. Aaron Dirkland (sp?). I'm
21 looking forward to your hit piece. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So going
23 back again I would like to welcome the
24 representatives of the -of the Administration led by
25 the DOT Commissioner Trottenberg and-and-and NYPD
Chief Chan. Thank you for the great job and

1 leadership, and now we're going to be asking—ask the
2 counsel to administer the affirmation, and then
3 invite the Administration representatives to deliver
4 their testimony.
5

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
7 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
8 your testimony before this committee, and to respond
9 honestly to Council Member questions?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: We do.

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We do.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Come up here,
13 sir.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Alright, would
15 you like me to get started? Okay. Thank you. Good
16 morning Chairman Rodriguez, Chairwoman Gibson and
17 members of the Transportation and Public Safety
18 Committees. I'm Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner of
19 the New York City Department of Transportation. On
20 behalf of Mayor Bill de Blasio, I'm honored to
21 testify today on the City's progress towards
22 achieving the Vision Zero goal of elimination traffic
23 fatalities and serious injuries. I'm pleased to be
24 joined today by my Deputy Commissioner for
25 Transportation Planning and Management Ryan Russo and

1 my other Administration colleagues. The first three
2 years of Vision Zero have been the safest three-year
3 period on New York City streets since recordkeeping
4 began in 1910. We're proud of the work the de Blasio
5 Administration has done to save lives of friends,
6 family members, neighbors and fellow New Yorkers, and
7 our condolences to you Chairwoman Gibson. As you
8 mentioned a friend of yours who lost his life on the
9 streets, it reminds us all of why this work is so
10 important. I want to commend Mayor de Blasio for his
11 leadership on Vision Zero, and for giving us the
12 resources necessary to take on this urgent challenge.
13 Thank you as well to the City Council, including
14 Speaker Mark-Viverito, Chairman Rodriguez, Chairman
15 Gibson and their committees for the unwavering
16 support that you have all given us over the last
17 three years. In 2016, New York City had 230
18 fatalities on our streets down from 299 fatalities in
19 2013, a decline of 23%. Pedestrian deaths declined
20 21% from 184 fatalities in 2013 to 145 in 2016, and
21 the declines we saw in New York City bucked national
22 trends. Traffic fatalities increased by 7%
23 nationwide in 2015, the biggest single year increase
24 since 1966 and through September of 2016 are up an
25

1 additional 8%. And tragically, some of our sister
2 cities around the country saw even greater increases
3 in fatalities. In 2016, New York also saw some
4 promising trends we hope to build on. There were 48
5 motorist fatalities in 2016, the lowest year on
6 record. The average U.S. resident is now 13 times
7 more likely to be killed in a motor vehicle than a
8 New York City resident. Nineteen motorcyclists lost
9 their lives in 2016 approximately half of the pre-
10 Vision Zero average. I particularly want to commend
11 Chief Chan for his extraordinary efforts on
12 motorcycle safety. In a year when we continue to
13 expand the use of speed cameras and work with the
14 Department of Education to bring traffic safety
15 curriculum into our schools, we also saw a steep
16 decline in fatalities among school age children ages
17 5 to 7. In 2016, three school age children lost
18 their lives while walking on New York City streets.
19 This is still unacceptable, but it was the fewest
20 ever annual traffic fatalities of school children
21 from a previous record roll of seven. The pre-vision
22 year average was about eight children per year, and
23 as recently as 2004, 17 school children were killed
24 while walking on our streets. Additionally, in a
25

1 sign of our ability to clearly transform our streets,
2 Queens Boulevard, formerly as we all know—known as
3 the Boulevard of Death, passed a second straight year
4 without a traffic fatality after the implementation
5 of two comprehensive street redesigns in the last two
6 years. As recently as 2013, there were eight traffic
7 fatalities on Queens Boulevard, and back in 1993, at
8 the most notorious time there were 24. For the first
9 time in history, New York City's pedestrian fatality
10 rate per capita has fallen below the average for the
11 U.S. as a whole. This is despite New York City's
12 dramatically higher share of pedestrians as compared
13 to the rest of the U.S. Our traffic fatality rate per
14 capita is now on par with Sweden, the birth place of
15 Vision Zero. Sweden enjoys broad power to mandate
16 new auto technologies, has a far lower legal limit
17 for alcohol, and issues \$500 speeding tickets, and
18 has reduced traffic deaths by over 50% in 20 years.
19 In our third year of Vision Zero we've reduced
20 fatalities by 23%, and for the record in the first
21 three years of Sweden's Vision Zero program, traffic
22 fatalities actually climbed to 9%. However, as—as
23 the—both chairs have mentioned, we do face real
24 challenges, and there is still too much loss of life
25

1 and serious injuries on our roadway. In 2016, 145
2 pedestrians were fatally struck in traffic up from
3 139 in 2015, and the 18 cyclist fatalities in 2016
4 were roughly equal to the pre-Vision Zero average of
5 17, four more than 2015, and the pedestrian cyclists'
6 fatalities are up despite the fact that DOT installed
7 a record number of pedestrian and bike safety project
8 last year. As I've said in the past, unfortunately
9 progress is not on the linear every year, but the de
10 Blasio Administration remains focused on Vision Zero
11 for the long run. We're working to eliminate
12 traffic deaths the same way we approach other complex
13 multi-dimensional public policy problems like crime,
14 homelessness or the spread of infectious disease.
15 We're using the data to get the causes of the problem
16 utilizing scalable and proven solutions measuring our
17 progress, and revising our approach accordingly. And
18 like reducing crime or homelessness or combatting
19 disease, this work has not always produced a straight
20 line from inputs to outcomes. That's why we continue
21 to focus on the data driver strategies outline in
22 NYPD's and DOT's Borough Pedestrian Safety Action
23 Plan. In those borough plans we analyzed five years
24 of crash data, and identified priority corridors,
25

1 intersections and areas that were the most crash
2 prone. For example, the priority corridors represent
3 just 8% of city streets that account for half of the
4 locations where pedestrian fatalities and severe
5 injuries occur. The City committed to concentrate
6 our engineering enforcement and education resources
7 in these priority locations so our efforts would have
8 the most impact. We believe this data driven
9 approach is working. Fatalities at these locations
10 have dropped steadily from 153 in 2013 to 100 in
11 2016. Pedestrian fatalities at these locations
12 dropped from 114 to 72. For example, on the Grand
13 Concourse, we had seven fatalities in 2013, all of
14 them pedestrians tragically. We lowered the speed
15 limited, added speed cameras, changed signal timing,
16 deployed street teams with NYPD and implemented a
17 project to calm traffic and shorten pedestrian
18 crossings. In 2016, there were zero fatalities on
19 this corridor.
20

21 Another benefit of a data drive approach
22 is that it ensures we pursue safety interventions in
23 the communities with the most crash prone locations
24 guided by our expertise and analysis rather than just
25 those communities with a lot of spaces. (sic) I want

1 to invite the members of the committee to review the
2 attached summary of our Vision Zero accomplishments
3 and hopefully everyone has got the hand-out. I want
4 to touch on some of the most notable highlights of
5 our work in 2016. With 105 safety projects completed
6 last year in all five boroughs, DOT is now working at
7 more than double the pre-Vision Zero pace. The Canal
8 Street entrance to the Manhattan Bridge was one of
9 the largest safety projects we concluded last year,
10 and had previously been among the city's most crash
11 prone locations for pedestrians. Between 20-[coughs]
12 excuse me-between 2011 and 2015 over 120 people were
13 injured at the intersection with seven people
14 seriously injured. The \$1.5 million project improved
15 safety at the intersection with new signals, expanded
16 pedestrian space and more consistent and predictable
17 traffic patterns. In the border between Bushwick and
18 Ridgewood, we implemented safety improvements
19 including a new pedestrian plaza at the complicated
20 six-leg intersection of Myrtle Avenue, Wyckoff Avenue
21 and Palmetto Street, a busy transportation hub with
22 two subway lines and a bus terminal. Since 2009,
23 there have been three pedestrian facilities and
24 numerous injuries at this intersection. The changes
25

1 reduced vehicle and pedestrian conflicts and improved
2 safety for pedestrians and drivers. In Brooklyn, we
3 tackled the busy five-leg intersection of the Jackie
4 Robinson Parkway with Jamaica, Pennsylvania and
5 Bushwick Avenues. At this one intersection there
6 were over 357 injuries from 2011 to 2015. Prior to
7 the project, hundreds of pedestrians a day were also
8 crossing the parkway side of the intersection with no
9 crosswalks or pedestrian signals. So we reconfigured
10 the intersection with new crossing and signal timing
11 changes to make it safety for pedestrians. We're
12 very proud of this project, and you can see the
13 picture of it here. What an incredible improvement I
14 think we've made.

15
16 DOT has also dramatically increased the
17 installation of leading pedestrian intervals, which
18 provide a head start to pedestrians when crossing the
19 street. This proven treatment reduces the number of
20 turning of crashes that result in serious injuries to
21 pedestrians and cyclists by more than 60%. When
22 Vision Zero launched, there were 254 LPIs in all of
23 New York City. Last year we installed three times
24 that number, 776 and since the start of Vision Zero
25 we've implemented over 1,000 LPIs on our prior-on our

1 priority corridors. In 2016, I'm also proud that
2 we've installed a record breaking 18 miles of
3 protected bike lanes, and over 63 total miles of
4 dedicated cycling lanes. DOT had a banner year
5 including protected network expansions on Brooklyn
6 Boulevard, Queens Boulevard, Amsterdam Avenue, the
7 Pulaski Bridge and Sixth Avenue, just to name a few.
8 And a someone who commutes to work-to work by bike
9 when she can, I can tell you first hand that these
10 new lanes are extremely popular, and are bringing new
11 cyclists to our streets. We've gotten great feedback
12 from fellow cyclists about a couple of very key
13 protected bike lanes we installed in 2016: Jay
14 Street in Brooklyn, Chrystie Street on the Lower East
15 Side. A cyclist can now ride from Downtown Brooklyn
16 to the Bronx on nine miles of protected bike lanes.

18 I also want to take the opportunity to
19 commend NYPD for a new 2016 Cyclist Safety
20 Initiative, Operation Safe Passage, which involves
21 stronger enforcement against hazardous parking and
22 moving infractions that put cyclists at risk.
23 Additionally, DOT has been productive on so many
24 other fronts, retiming signals to discourage speeding
25 on over 300 miles or 72% of all our priority

1 corridors; assigning priority corridors with more
2 than 2,400 new 25 mile an hour speed limit signs;
3 improving lighting at nearly 1,000 intersections; and
4 installing 400 speed bumps and more. DOT is also
5 embarking on some new cutting edge initiatives.

6
7 A year ago the Mayor announced DOT's new
8 focus on left turns, which are more dangerous due to
9 the sweep of the turn, the driver's speed and
10 obstructed view. In response, DOT release Don't Cut
11 Corners, our study of left turn crashes, which we
12 prepared at the direction of the Council to support
13 Vision Zero. As part of this study, we announce the
14 Left Turn Calming Pilot, which we developed and
15 installed left turn treatments at 107 intersections,
16 including 86 priority locations. The early results
17 are promising as the treatments have reduced vehicle
18 turning speeds by 24%. We look forward to sharing
19 the full evaluation with the Council and the public
20 in coming months.

21 DOT is also working the Department of
22 Health to deepen our understanding of how serious
23 crashes occur, and the impact on those involved in
24 crashes. The Department of Health led the City's
25 first research and road-Research on the Road

1 Conference, which connected over 40 external
2 researchers with the agencies on the Vision Zero Task
3 Force to discuss shared research interests. The
4 Department of Health also advanced the Data Linkage
5 Project, which will provide a new age analyzed injury
6 pattern, severity and demographic information and
7 their associations with key characteristics. This
8 project could provide fresh insights into the
9 priorities we pursue under Vision Zero. In our
10 analysis 2015 data, DOT observed that the earlier
11 onset of darkness in the fall and winter was highly
12 correlated to an increase in traffic injuries and
13 fatalities, and a higher incidence of crashes
14 involving turns. In the last quarter of 2015, we saw
15 over 40% of the year's pedestrian fatalities. In
16 response, the Mayor announced in October the City's
17 Dusk and Darkness Safety Initiative, a new multi-
18 agency seasonal approach targeted in evening rush
19 hours of the fall and winter. NYPD concentrated
20 enforcement during these hours, and officers were
21 instructed to focus on the most hazardous violations.
22 DOT and NYPD street teams engaged drivers and other
23 New Yorkers in 16 Vision Zero priority areas in all
24 five boroughs during a day or awareness making tens
25

1 of thousands of contacts regarding the challenge of
2 driving safely at dusk. We expanded the Your Choices
3 Matter Campaign with fresh content including new
4 radio advertisement time to air specifically around
5 those drive time sunset hours. In this new campaign,
6 listeners were educated about the correlation between
7 darkness and crashes, and remind to lower their
8 speeds and turn slowly. The Taxi and Limousine
9 Commission staff handed out over 20,000 calling
10 cards, to drivers at La Guardia and JFK Airports and
11 TLC facilities, sent messages to all TLC licensed
12 drivers, promoted messages on TLC social media and
13 radio shows popular with drivers and worked with
14 fleet managers and industry organizations to get out
15 the message. The Dusk and Darkness Safety Initiative
16 is one of our most promising new efforts in 2016, and
17 we believe it contributed to a 25% reduction in
18 pedestrian fatalities from its launch in October to
19 the end of the year. This decline during the most
20 high crash months of the year is encouraging and we
21 contend to—we intend to continue this initiative in
22 2017. With the Dusk and Darkness and Left Turn
23 Initiatives, we've expanded beyond our focus on
24 geographical data, and are now tackling Vision Zero
25

1 based on driver behavior and on temporal and seasonal
2 factors, and soon we hope to utilize Department of
3 Health data to better inform our safety efforts.
4

5 In our borough plans DOT committed to
6 achieving engineering and planning milestones for the
7 end of 2017, and we are on track to reach those
8 goals. I was proud yesterday to stand with the Mayor
9 to announce an extraordinary new level of funding for
10 Vision Zero work, and thank the Chairman as well. In
11 Fiscal Year 17 to 21, the Mayor has committed an
12 increase of \$400 million in capital and expense doors
13 which amounts now to over a \$1.6 billion in to total
14 Vision Zero funding. The funding includes \$323
15 million, \$77 million in expense funds to support
16 street reconstruction, better maintenance of our
17 markings, left turn calming, bike network
18 intersection upgrades and street light enhancements.

19 We're particularly excited about the new
20 funding the Mayor has provided for street markings.
21 This increase substantial increase will take our
22 funding for this work from \$27 million to \$33 million
23 in the current year with progressive increases all
24 the way up to \$42 million by Fiscal Year 21. This
25 funding will allow us to set a new citywide high

1 visibility crosswalk standard and continue our
2 ambitious pace of new safety projects while better
3 maintaining our existing markings. At the state
4 level, we hope to expand our Speed Camera Program,
5 our top Vision Zero legislative priority. As you
6 know, here in New York City nearly 85% of traffic
7 fatalities and serious injuries occur during hours or
8 in places where state law prohibits the use of our
9 speed cameras. The City supports legislation to
10 increase the scope of the program, which reduces
11 speeding by over 50%. I would ask the Council to
12 lend your support to our effort up in Albany.

14 I'd now like to comment briefly on the
15 legislation before the committee today. Before
16 getting to the individual bills, I want to speak
17 about the importance of DOT's professional and
18 engineering judgment when it comes to selecting
19 particular locations for study or safety
20 interventions. And I want to say if there are
21 particular areas of concern, we always want to work
22 with local communities and elected officials.
23 However, we do oppose rigid quotas imposed by
24 legislation for particular locations or treatments
25 not guided by DOT's engineering and professional

1 analysis and expertise. When we deviate from where
2 the crash data leaves us, we risk diverting resources
3 and attention from the most crash prone locations
4 where we believe we serve them as well. (sic)

5
6 Now, I'd like to turn to the specific
7 bill. On Intro 552 by Chairman Rodriguez we share
8 you concerns, of course, about protecting seniors and
9 I would like to discuss how we pursue this goal.
10 DOT's Safe Streets for Seniors Program brings traffic
11 calm and treatments to 37 multi-block focus areas
12 determined by crash data. DOT has implemented 165
13 safety projects in these key areas since the program
14 was launched in 2008. Additionally, in 2017, we will
15 be prioritizing the installation of leading
16 pedestrian integrals in this focus area. We'd be
17 happy to further discuss our approach with you.

18 Regarding Intro 671 by Council Member
19 Vallone, I'm happy to report that DOT's has been
20 diligently working to accomplish many of the goals of
21 the legislation. In three rounds of large scale-
22 large scale countdown signal installations, we
23 prioritized schools, senior centers and community
24 requests as well as other locations. DOT engineers
25 have now evaluated nearly every intersection in the

1 city, and we've installed countdown signals at over,
2 7,500 of our 12,800 signalized intersections
3 citywide. DOT will continue evaluations and
4 installations on an as-needed basis, and we're
5 certainly always glad to consider additional
6 locations.
7

8 Intro 911 by Chairman Rodriguez would
9 require DOT to complete a study of pedestrian and
10 bicycle safety along bus routes and execute an action
11 plan based on this study. DOT and MTA have been
12 working together to study bus crashes throughout the
13 city. We compared 23—we've completed 23 separate
14 safety projects this year in partnership with the
15 MTA, and installed 77 leading pedestrian-leading
16 pedestrian intervals on bus routes to enhance safety.
17 Our work has led to significant improvements, and
18 this past year saw only three people fatally struck by
19 buses, a decline from 7 in 2015 and 10 in 2014. Of
20 course, we are open to further discussion on this
21 bill. Regarding Intro 1116 by Council Member Van
22 Bramer DOT supports the concept of codifying the
23 Vision Zero portal. Some of the data required by the
24 bill is already provided to the public in the Open
25 Data Portal through the NYPD, and we'd like to work

1 with the Council and the NYPD to further discuss the
2 intents of this legislation.
3

4 Intro 1257 also by Council Member Van
5 Bramer would require us to update and continue our
6 Safe Routs to School Action Plan. Of course, we
7 share the Council's deep interest in school safety.
8 As you may know, the Safe Routs to School program
9 dates back to before the beginning of Vision Zero.
10 Now, all of our school safety work is driven by our
11 Pedestrian Safety Action Plan, and this year's data
12 on school children fatalities shows our data driven
13 approaches working. We welcome the opportunity to
14 discuss our approach further with you, as well as
15 safety concerns around a particular school.

16 Intro 975 that Council Member Maisel
17 would increase the penalty for failure to remove
18 abandoned utility poles. DOT shares the bill
19 sponsor's concern about damaged or abandoned poles,
20 and we have ongoing conversations with the utilities
21 about addressing the removals expeditiously. Happy
22 to work with the sponsor of the bill on this topic.

23 Intro 1071 also by Council Member Maisel
24 would created a task force to study private streets
25 including an evaluation of possible city acquisition.

1 Because private streets are typically not built or
2 maintained to city standards, each one can present
3 unique challenges and acquisition can create an
4 enormous expense and complexity for the city costing
5 tens or even hundreds of millions of dollars.
6 Therefore, DOT has serious concerns about this bill,
7 and believes the time and attention to complete a
8 study and certainly any acquisition would take
9 substantial resources away from other key priorities.
10 Again, we're always willing to discuss specific
11 street concerns with Council Members.

12
13 Intro 1311 by Council Member Deutsch,
14 would require DOT to provide five days notice to NYPD
15 and FDNY of any non-emergency resurfacing work. DOT
16 currently publishes our milling and paving schedule
17 for the upcoming week on our website, and distributes
18 it through a large email list, which already includes
19 police precincts, community boards and local
20 newspapers. We'd be happy to discuss any gaps we
21 might be missing in the distribution of this
22 information with the bill's sponsor.

23 In closing, in the three years since
24 Mayor de Blasio and family members who lost loved
25 ones in traffic crashes stood in Woodside, Queens to

1 announce the Vision Zero Initiative, we have relied
2 on the dedicated, creative and hard working team at
3 DOT to turn that vision into reality. I want to
4 thank everyone at DOT for their efforts as well as
5 the many agencies and the incredible teams from all
6 of us that are part of the Vision Zero Task Force.
7 Finally, I may—I also want to express my deep
8 gratitude on behalf of New Yorkers to Transportation
9 Alternatives and particularly Families for Safe
10 Streets whose forceful advocacy has been essential to
11 advancing our street safety work. As I've said many
12 times, these groups keep us honest, and remind us of
13 the human impact of what we do. Thanks to both
14 committees for inviting us to testify today, and I'm
15 happy to answer your questions. [pause]

17 Good morning, Chair Rodriguez, Chari
18 Gibson and Members of the Council. I am Chief Thomas
19 Chan, the Chief of Transportation Bureau of the New
20 York City Police Department. With me here today is
21 Inspector Dennis Fulton also from the Transportation
22 Bureau. On behalf of the Police Commissioner James
23 P. O'Neill, I wish to thank the City Council for the
24 opportunity to speak to you today about the progress
25 and the needs of the City's Vision Zero Initiative.

1 Since its launch in 2014, the Police Department in
2 collaboration with the Department of Transportation,
3 Commissioner Trottenberg, and other city agencies and
4 the Council has been steadfastly committed to Vision
5 Zero and the goal of reducing fatalities on our city
6 streets. After three years, the city has made
7 significant progress. 2016 was the safest year in
8 New York City's history with the fewest traffic
9 fatalities ever recorded, 230 improving on the record
10 of 234 set in 2015. It is the third consecutive year
11 in which traffic fatalities in New York City have
12 declined in sharp contrast to the increasing traffic
13 fatalities occurring nationwide. At year 3, we can
14 take stock that what has been achieved under Vision
15 Zero, but the Police Department is not resting on its
16 laurels. We will remain committed to driving down
17 fatalities and injuries, but each life lost on city
18 streets is also an occasion to reflect on the urgency
19 of the Vision Zero goal. What perhaps is one of the
20 most significant accomplishments under the Vision
21 Zero Initiative is in the change in public attitude
22 toward dangerous and reckless behavior that can occur
23 on our city streets. The NYPD has targeted its
24 efforts towards reducing traffic fatalities, serious
25

1 injuries by directing enforcement of the most
2 dangerous driving behavior. How that has driven the
3 approaches to enforcing the traffic laws have led us
4 to focus on six Vision Zero designated moving
5 violations that are known to contribute to traffic
6 and pedestrian fatalities. Speeding, there's the use
7 (sic) of the pedestrian, signal violations, improper
8 turns, phoning-cell phones, texting while driving,
9 disobeying signs. Each year since 2014 there has
10 been a steady increase in the issuance of these
11 specific summonses. In 2016, the NYPD issued over
12 638,000 summonses for the six Vision Zero focused
13 violations, which now total more than 60% of all our
14 moving violations issued by the NYPD each year. Of
15 note, the NYPD issued over 137,000 speeding summonses
16 and approximately 65% increase from 2013, and over
17 42,000 summonses for failure to yield to pedestrian
18 summonses an approximate 185% increase from 2013. It
19 has been our experience under Vision Zero that
20 consistent and regular enforcement of these
21 violations deter dangerous behavior, prevents crashes
22 and saves lives. The increased safety on our streets
23 is no coincidence. Under Vision Zero, the NYPD has
24 intensely focused on enhancing traffic safety for
25

1 everyone. Since 2014, the NYPD has devoted more
2 resources to improving traffic safety by purchasing
3 advance speed protection equipment, lava (sic) guns
4 as well as upgrading speed protection technology
5 available to our precincts. We have also obtained
6 more of our personnel on this equipment. The
7 Department has also enlarged the staffing at highway
8 district, as well as modifying our precinct level
9 traffic plan to increase the focus on pedestrian
10 safety. Under Vision Zero the department has
11 launched an enforcement and an education campaign to
12 deter dangerous motorcycle riding. Only two percent
13 of the registered vehicles in New York City are
14 motorcycles, but the motorcyclists account for
15 approximately 14% of traffic fatalities. While the
16 department has increased the number of summonses for
17 speeding and unlike this operation of motorcycles, it
18 can also really target hazardous situations for which
19 the officer can initiate a stop, and again, thereby
20 reducing speeding and reckless motorcycles. Because
21 unskilled motorcyclists are likely to cause harm to
22 themselves and other during the interaction. This
23 has led the department to focus on registration,
24 equipment violations against parked motorcycles,
25

1 resulting in more ticketing and more towing of these
2 particular vehicles. In addition, the department has
3 developed and distribute—distributed motorcycle
4 safety materials warning motorcyclists of increased
5 enforcement and providing safety education. The
6 department has welcomed the expansion and the
7 installation of speed cameras under Vision Zero
8 because they expand our enforcement net, and hold
9 dangerous drivers accountable. This critical law
10 enforcement tool, however, has also led to the
11 development of technology that attempts to defeat
12 their purpose. Most notably license plate covers,
13 which seek to evade speeding penalties and tolls. The
14 use of license plate covers operating a motor vehicle
15 is illegal under the State Vehicle Traffic Law, and
16 can result in the issuance of a moving summons. In
17 order to combat illegal plate covers, and supplement
18 the enforcement by our offices, the department has
19 also directed our Traffic Enforcement Agents to pay
20 attention to parked vehicles that have illegal
21 license plate covers, and to issue these vehicles
22 parking violations quarterly. As a result of the
23 increased enforcement, there has been a significant
24 reduction in the use of illegal license plate covers.
25

1
2 In 2016, the department instituted
3 Operation Safe Passage, a safety project that
4 directed all 77 precincts to focus on drivers who are
5 committing traffic violations that endanger our
6 bicycles. In addition, the NYPD Traffic Agents were
7 instructed to pay close attention to the parking
8 violations most associated with bike collisions such
9 as parking in the bike lane, double parking, parking
10 in no standing zones. In conjunction with the
11 Department of Transportation and the Department of
12 Education, we expanded this initiative to contemplate
13 enforcement on hazardous parking and moving
14 violations near a school with particular emphasis on
15 speeding, and vehicles that disobey stop signs that
16 are attached to school buses. Both intra-agency and
17 inter-agency partnerships have been crucial to
18 Vision Zero's continued success. Each week the Tri-
19 borough Traffic Stat meetings are held by my office
20 at police headquarters to outline, review and to
21 manage the NYPD's traffic program. Typically,
22 several police precincts will appear at Traffic Stat
23 to present their pedestrian, bicyclists and motor
24 vehicle crash data, as well as issues and strategies
25 for comment and review. Traffic Stat, however,

1 focuses not just on enforcement, but also on
2 engineering and education as key to traffic safety.
3 It is a collaborative process involving
4 representatives from New York City DOT, New York
5 State DOT, the Taxi and Limousine Commission,
6 Triborough Tunnel-Triborough Bridge and Tunnel
7 Authority. We also should note that in 2016 the NYPD
8 made its Traffic State database available to the
9 public on our website. We regularly partner with our
10 colleagues in DOT to develop outreach and educational
11 information related to Vision Zero. During the last
12 quarter of 2016, we partnered up with DOT on the Dusk
13 to Darkness Initiative, and an enforcement education
14 campaign dedicated to the fall and winter evening
15 hours that is most dangerous for our pedestrians.
16 When the initiative began, the number of people who
17 were killed in New York City traffic crashes were
18 above the 2015 level, but instead at the year it
19 ended with record low numbers of fatalities.
20 Notably, the City Council has been an important
21 partner in Vision Zero by expanding our enforcement
22 toolbox. In 2014, the Council passed the Right-of-
23 Way Law, Administrative Code Section 19-190, which
24 creates a criminal and civil penalty for careless
25

1 motorists who enter or kill our pedestrians and
2 bicyclists. Since its effective date in 2014, the
3 NYPD has issued approximately 1,900 summonses and
4 arrested 74 motorists under that law. Last year the
5 Council bolstered pedestrian sections by passing
6 Local Law No. 115, which requires traffic the right-
7 of-way to pedestrians when the steady walking has a
8 flashing red hand—upraised hand or a flashing
9 upraised hand with a countdown clock that’s displayed
10 on a pedestrian controlled signal. We are grateful
11 for the Council’s partnership. Our local elected
12 officials are often our best resources for
13 identifying the areas that require our attention. We
14 look forward to further collaborate in reference to
15 Vision Zero and continue to make progress.

17 New York City streets are the safest
18 streets since they initiated Vision Zero. They are,
19 however, used by more than—more of our pedestrians,
20 our cyclists, more vehicles and motorcyclists alike.
21 This is why as Mayor de Blasio and Commissioner
22 O’Neill had noted [coughing] we must remain dedicated
23 to the effort because pedestrian and cyclists remain
24 at risk. We can always improve, and we are committed
25 to further reducing crime, and making our city

1 streets even safer in this new year especially as the
2 city continues to buck the national trend. Before
3 con-concluding my remarks, I want to turn my
4 attention to one bill under consideration today.
5 Intro No. 280-A would require the department to share
6 collision reports digitally. As you know, in
7 collaboration with Council Member Deutsch, the
8 department recently launched an online web portal
9 that allows interested parties in a collision to
10 obtain a collision report free of charge. Prior to
11 the launch of this portal, those who were involved in
12 collisions, had to obtain the report at a local
13 precinct where the collision occurred. The new
14 portal will certainly save people time. We support
15 Intro 1280-A, and we thank Council Member Deutsch for
16 his partnership on this issue. Thank you for your
17 opportunity to speak with you today, and I'm pleased
18 to answer any questions that you may have. Thank
19 you. [pause]

21 DAWN MILLER: Good morning Chairs
22 Rodriguez and Gibson and members of the
23 Transportation and Public Safety Committees. My name
24 is Dawn Miller and I am Chief of Staff of the New
25 York City Taxi and Limousine Commission. With me

1 today in the—in the second row because we have a
2 crowded panel is Madeline Labadie, a Senior Analyst
3 at the Commission and who is also the TLC's Vision
4 Zero Lead. Thank you for inviting TLC here today to
5 speak about our Vision Zero program for the for-hire
6 transportation sector. Since the Vision Zero
7 Initiative began in 2014, TLC licensees totals have
8 grown rapidly. TLC licensed drivers have grown from
9 113,000 in January 2014 to over 150,000 in late 2016.
10 Similarly, TLC licensed vehicles have grown from
11 69,000 vehicles to over 100,000 vehicles in just two
12 years. Vehicles licensing growth is almost entirely
13 based in the black car sector, which includes app fee
14 providers like Via, Lyft and Uber as well as
15 tradition black car basics. Under Mayor de Blasio's
16 leadership, TLC is leading the way nationally in
17 Vision Zero programming for the for-hire
18 transportation sector providing a model for safety
19 programs in other jurisdictions. Focusing on
20 regulated spaces like ours is a crucial step in the
21 success of Vision Zero. Because our licensees spend
22 so much time on the road, they have a vital role to
23 play in preventing crashes. As professional drivers,
24 they must set a professional example. Being the best
25

1 drivers on our roads can keep everyone safer. At TLC
2 our Vision Zero programs fall under four major
3 categories: Education, Enforcement, Technology and
4 Outreach.
5

6 Education: One of the core tenets of
7 TLC's Vision Zero efforts is improving and broadening
8 driver training. Prior to Vision Zero only taxi
9 drivers were required to take 24-hour training course
10 prior to licensure. No course is required for
11 drivers of liveries, black cars and luxury
12 limousines. Now, not only taxi drivers, but also
13 for-hire vehicle drivers are required to take a
14 specially designed—designed course prior to
15 licensure. TLC also added a special limousine module
16 to the curriculum, which provides instruction on new
17 road designs like protected bike lines, hazardous
18 driving behaviors that lead to crashes and the
19 important role that professional drivers play in
20 promoting a culture of safe driving. Drivers also
21 view the *Drive Like Your Family Lived Here* video
22 developed by TLC, DOT, Families for Safe Streets, and
23 Transportation Alternatives, which provides the
24 strength and moving length of the aftermath of unsafe
25 driving through the eyes of families who have lost

1 loved ones to traffic related tragedies. In just the
2 first year of the course expansion, we've been able
3 to reach over 37,000 drivers. On average in 2016,
4 about 3,000 driver took this valuable course each
5 month.
6

7 Enforcement: As you know, TLC has a
8 small but dedicated team of 183 Field Enforcement
9 Officers in 15 squads whose mission is to enforce TLC
10 rules and complement the traffic safety enforcement
11 done—work done by the NYPD. Prior to Vision Zero,
12 TLC's Field Enforcement Operations included some
13 traffic safety enforcement, enforcement against
14 certain dangerous violations such as speeding was
15 sight limited. TLC's access information about field
16 crashes is often delayed. Since Vision Zero began in
17 2014, we significantly improved enforcement focus and
18 capabilities to promote traffic safety. In 2015, we
19 created a specific quad of enforcement officers who
20 focus on traffic safety violations. Our officers are
21 instructed to focus on traffic violations most likely
22 to lead to serious crashes like speeding with taxi
23 driving and signal violations. We also now have
24 lighter (sic) speed enforcement technology so we can
25 better combat speeding.

1
2 In 2016, our officers issued nearly three
3 times as many traffic summons and violations as
4 compared to 2013. We went from a negligible number
5 of student violations issued in 2013 to more than 8-
6 to more than 800 in 2016. Distracted driving remains
7 an issue among some TLC licensed drivers, and the TLC
8 continues to combat it. TLC issued over 6,000
9 violations to drivers meaning in this dangerous
10 behavior in 2016, doubling the rate of enforcement in
11 2013. [pause] Our enforcement officers are
12 also heavily focused on illegal operators such as
13 legal vans whose unsafe driving poses a risk to the
14 public. In 2015 and 2016 TLC has 305 joint van
15 operations with NYPD and issued more than 1,200
16 summonses for illegal operation. We are grateful for
17 the leadership that Council Members Miller and
18 Williams in their field, which led to the commuter
19 van perform package the Council just passed, and that
20 will strengthen impact of future joint operations.
21 As you may know, TLC licensed drivers are also held
22 to a high standard through the Critical Driver
23 Program in which TLC continuously reviews each
24 driver's DMV record for points accrued. TLC licensed
25 drivers who accumulate six or ten points in a 15-

1 month period are subject to respectively suspension
2 and revocation of their TLC licenses. These centers
3 are hiring (sic) and greatly in need for private
4 drivers and provider licensees with a powerful
5 incentive to drive safely. Actual collaboration and
6 communication the NYPD and TLC supports the mission
7 of Vision Zero. TLC is now alerted to serious crashes
8 almost immediately, and we send our staff to the
9 crash location to assist NYPD with its investigation,
10 and gather information TLC needs to quickly determine
11 whether suspending a driver under Coopers Law or
12 Local Law 28 is appropriate.

14 We also receive all crash data directly
15 from NYPD, which we provide in reports available
16 online allowing the public to review crashes by
17 severity and TLC vehicle types. Better enforcement
18 also relies on improved rules addressing unsafe
19 driving behaviors. In July 2016, we passed Fatigue
20 Driving Prevention Rules regulating hours of service
21 for taxi and FHV drivers. Fatigued driver reaction
22 time can be as dangerous as driving while
23 intoxicated. Although most TLC licensed drivers do
24 not drive excessive hours, these new rules when
25 finalized will ensure those currently driving too

1 many hours shift toward driving time that allows for
2 sufficient rest. Thank you to Council Member and the
3 other members of Council who are supporting TLC's
4 efforts to address fatigued driving. In the coming
5 year, TLC is committed to continuing to emphasize the
6 enforcement of traffic safety violations. We will
7 continue our partnership with the NYPD including
8 joint enforcement efforts for illegal van operations,
9 crash investigations and additional training on
10 enforcement against speeding. This year, following
11 extensive outreach and education, TLC will also begin
12 its working on rules to prevent fatigued driving.

14 Technology: One of the most promising
15 areas of operation and the need for traffic safety is
16 leveraging technology. Prior to Vision Zero, TLC
17 piloted and adopted a variety of innovative and
18 vehicle technology solutions such as requiring credit
19 card acceptance in taxis and filling apps. These
20 technologies commonly focus on the consumer
21 experience. However, since the Vision Zero program
22 began, TLC has expanded its role as a testing ground
23 for new technology to include a vehicle safety
24 technology pilot program. Through this program, we
25 are currently piloting black boxes and cameras that

1 monitor driver behavior, alert systems that
2 proactively warn drivers when a dangerous situation
3 is arising, an analytics platform that translated
4 selected data into actionable information for drivers
5 and fleet managers. This pilot would not be possible
6 without the partnership of safety technology
7 companies and our licensees. The pilot projected and
8 has installed eight different systems in 385 vehicles
9 including both taxis and for-hire vehicle. So far,
10 crashers per vehicle have declined slightly for
11 vehicles participating in the pilot with problems in
12 climate (sic) TLC will continue to monitor.

14 Over time, we've also seen the market for
15 vehicle safety technology expand leading to greater
16 competition, technological advancements, and
17 declining system costs that could make adoption
18 easier. We've also seen more vehicle manufacturers
19 adding safety technology into their newer models.
20 This year we will issue the final report on the pilot
21 program, and evaluate potential policy making on
22 those technologies. We'll also with DOT and other
23 stakeholders to learn more about autonomous vehicle
24 technology as it related to traffic safety.

1
2 And finally Outreach. In addition to
3 formal classroom education describe earlier, outreach
4 has been an essential component of TLC's work on
5 Vision Zero. Prior to Vision Zero, traffic safety
6 outreach was not a primary element of TLC's outreach
7 programming. Now, we reach out to everyone in our
8 orbit, drivers, bases, fleets and distributors and
9 passengers to promote traffic safety. We believe
10 meeting with drivers face-to-face can be powerful for
11 gaining their partnership in Vision Zero. In 2014,
12 TLC's small but active external affairs staff has
13 held 422 Vision Zero meetings for drivers at their
14 garages across the city to discuss Vision Zero and
15 traffic safety strategies. This team did 139 visits
16 in 2016 alone. We believe recognizing those drivers
17 who truly set the example for safe driving can be
18 inspirational and motivating for other TLC licensed
19 drivers and all New Yorkers. Every year since the
20 Vision Zero Initiative began, we have held an honor
21 roll annually highlighting drivers with sterling
22 safety records, 378 this year with no injury crashes,
23 no traffic violations, and no TLC rule violations
24 over the past four years, making them truly an elite
25 group. Research shows that bases and fleets play an

1 important role in reinforcing the safe driving
2 methods because they interact with their drivers so
3 regularly. We now honor those bases with the best
4 safety record at this currently. Thank you again to
5 both chairs, and several other members of the Council
6 for attending past ceremonies. Our honorees always
7 appreciate seeing you there, and your encouragement.
8 We've also expanded our outreach channels to retail
9 licensees and the public in more places than ever
10 before. In 2015, we developed a text messaging
11 program that can send information to all of our
12 drivers including safety messages. Our Safety PSEs
13 and the Drive Like Your Family Lives Here film are
14 available online and on our YouTube page. We send
15 safety messages through our agency's social media
16 channels reminding drivers and the public of safe
17 practices, and as always, we partner with DOT for all
18 citywide outreach campaigns like last fall's Dusk to
19 Darkness Campaign to make sure licensees received the
20 messages on all platforms. TLC looks forward
21 continuing these successful outreach programs in
22 2017. We'll also hold focus groups with honor roll
23 drivers and business managers to develop best
24 practices and hear policy suggestions for improving
25

1 safety and reaching even more drivers. Finally, we
2 use data to promote traffic safety. TLC could not be
3 as effective at our job without a rich set of data we
4 receive about the industries we regulate. This point
5 is especially true when it comes to safety. Being
6 able to monitor our licensees for safe behavior is
7 and use the data printout to promote safety and sound
8 policy making. One way we used data analysis to
9 support—support Vision Zero efforts was in developing
10 the first ever Vision Zero base report released in
11 June, which are a collection of statistics such as
12 crash rates and safety violations for each TLC
13 licensed space. There are several audiences for the—
14 these reports. First, the public, which can use the
15 reports to inform various stations of consumers.
16 Second, basement injures (sic). This is the first
17 time to know about their aggregate safety records and
18 how they compare to those of their peers. Third, TLC
19 staff who are using the Vision Zero base reports to
20 target our outreach and education efforts to those
21 bases who would benefit from this engagement the
22 most. This data driven approach has helpful—is
23 helping us allocated limited out—outreach resources
24 to where they will be most impactful. A great
25

1 example of how crash data and trip data presented to
2 us to develop smart regulations in a key safety area
3 and for development of our safety driving prevention
4 rules. In the past, TLC only had a driving hour
5 limitation in say for yellow taxi drivers, and it was
6 written in such a way that it was difficult to
7 enforce. When this agency determined it needed rules
8 that were both enforceable and protected the public
9 to interact not only with yellow taxis, but also with
10 FHV drivers, we turned to our data to learn more
11 about how hours drivers are driving, and how we can
12 improve our rule. In addition, the data published
13 empowers the public to advocate for their own needs.
14 TLC makes available generalized versions of this
15 information. We have the City's Open Data Portal.
16 So research institutions, elected officials and
17 advocacy groups can easily perform their own analysis
18 and raise issues of importance. In 2017, we'll
19 continue to use data to analyze our Vision Zero
20 programs that targeting our outreach and enforcement
21 efforts, and continue to provide safety information
22 to the public about our licensees.

23
24 In conclusion, TLC is using every tool to
25 improve the safety the safety of our streets. Each

1 piece of the programmatic puzzle, enforcement
2 education, outreach and technology works together to
3 move the needle on Vision Zero. Everyday our
4 licensees share the road with millions of other New
5 Yorkers. TLC's Vision Zero programs serve to remind
6 them to make active choices after safety. We believe
7 that for-hire drivers and members of our community,
8 looking to make it home safety to their loved them,
9 can lead the way when it comes to traffic safety New
10 York City. We are proud of the efforts our staff and
11 licensees make each day to promote safety, and there
12 is much continued work ahead moving toward our goal
13 of zero fatalities. For TLC cooperation with our
14 Vision Zero sister agencies is integral for our
15 progress towards Vision Zero. The Vision Zero
16 agencies have an excellent working relationship,
17 mission driven, collaborative and more integrated
18 than ever before. We appreciate our colleagues'
19 partnership, and the partnership of the City Council
20 and Safe Streets advocates on this important
21 initiative. Thank you for allowing us to speak on
22 TLC's Vision Zero efforts, and I'd be happy to answer
23 any questions you may have.
24
25

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: Good morning
3 Chair Rodriguez and Chair Gibson, members of the
4 Committees on Transportation and Public Safety, and
5 other members of the City Council. I am Keith
6 Kerman, Deputy Commissioner of the Department of
7 Citywide Administrative Services and the Chief Fleet
8 Officer for New York City. New York City operates
9 nearly 30,000 owned and leased vehicles, the largest
10 municipal fleet in the United States. New York City
11 maintains fleet units of 37 dedicated fleet repair
12 facilities, has over 400 in-house fueling locations.
13 We utilize 841 distinct locations throughout the city
14 to park our fleet. More than 2,000 city employees
15 work full-time in fleet repair and garage operations
16 across the ten largest fleet operating agencies. In
17 total, over \$800 million is spent annually on fleet
18 related costs including acquisitions, repair,
19 fueling, parts, and collision claims. DCAS leads
20 efforts to share and improve services and safety
21 across the ten major fleet operations involving the
22 following city agencies: The NYPD, the FDNY,
23 Department of Correction, Department of Sanitation,
24 Environmental Protection, Parks, Transportation,
25 Education, Health and DCAS. In addition to these

1 large agencies, over 40 other agencies with smaller
2 fleets are managing service through DCAS. One of the
3 current focuses of DCAS' efforts is a series of
4 safety and risk management projects that are a part
5 of Mayor de Blasio's Vision Zero Initiative. DCAS
6 works closely with the Mayor's Office, DOT, NYPD,
7 Health, TLC and others in these efforts. In 2017,
8 DCAS began our fourth year in a major effort to train
9 and reinforce safety among all authorized fleet
10 operators. As part of Vision Zero, we have now
11 trained 34,000 city staff in safe driving including
12 over 8,600 at the Department of Sanitation alone.
13 These day-long classes focus on specific collision,
14 fatality or injury events that the fleet has been
15 involved with and emphasized safe driving practices
16 to avoid these types of events. DCAS utilizes data
17 from our new collision tracking system called CRASH,
18 and our vehicle tracking units to inform and focus
19 this training. DCAS has also conducted surveys on
20 fleet operations and safety with over 12,000 fleet
21 operators so far to incorporate driver priorities and
22 insights. In 2016, DCAS rolled out a poster campaign
23 for city facilities and emphasizing safety. The
24 emphasis on safety also included a ban on the use of
25

1 phones hands-free or handheld by city fleet drivers.
2
3 The ban is based on research, which demonstrates that
4 the distraction caused by driving with a hands-free
5 set is just as dangerous as the distraction caused by
6 texting or using a handheld phone. A new rule
7 barring hands-free phone use will be a focus of the
8 training moving forward especially as we begin to
9 bring in all drivers from the city for a second day
10 of training starting this year.

11 In January 2015, DCAS launched the
12 nation's largest truck side guard rollout. Since
13 2015, DCAS has installed 663 sideguards on city fleet
14 units from all major agencies to protect pedestrians
15 and bicyclists. We will continue to install retrofit
16 side guards on fleet units in Fiscal Year 17. In
17 addition, all new trucks that the city procures will
18 now come outfitted with side guards as standard
19 safety equipment. DCAS currently has 28 vehicle
20 contracts in place covering 652 new trucks so far
21 that will come with side guards in the next year.
22 Side guards have been shown to reduce the likelihood
23 of death by 61% for bicyclists and 20% for
24 pedestrians colliding with the side of a truck. Side
25 impact collision types account for approximately half

1 of all bicyclists and one-fourth of all pedestrians
2 killed by trucks. About 32% of bicyclist fatalities
3 and 12% of pedestrian fatalities in New York City
4 involve trucks. I would like to take a moment to
5 acknowledge the City Council's leadership in this
6 area. Local Law 56 of 2015 now requires side guards
7 on eligible city trucks and also on commercial waste
8 trucks. This implementation must be complete by
9 2024, and DCAS along with the Business Integrity
10 Commission and DOT have been working with private
11 companies on both the fleet and side guard supplier
12 level to make this a reality. Working with over 40
13 agencies, DCAS has installed speed tracking devices
14 on city vehicles. The City for the first time can
15 report on speed, hard braking and accelerating as
16 well other—as well as other vehicle indicators, and
17 it's using this data to improve driving behaviors
18 with city staff. As the nation's largest municipal
19 fleet, New York City is continuously working to make
20 it one of the most sustainable and efficient fleets
21 in the country. Equally important are these efforts
22 to make it the safest fleet. To that end, I am happy
23 to report that we have achieved reductions in
24 fatalities, injuries and preventable collisions with
25

1 city fleet vehicles from 15—from Fiscal Year 15 to
2 Fiscal Year 16. To give a reference point, in
3 calendar year 2014, the city fleet was involved with
4 eight fatal vehicle events when we started Vision
5 Zero. In over two since, there have been three
6 fatalities with two involving ambulance operations.
7 Our Vision Zero efforts--Vision Zero efforts are
8 having an impact and show that the city fleet
9 agencies ae working diligently to improve the safety
10 of our streets for both pedestrians and drivers.
11 DCAS is also working to develop the first safe fleet
12 transition plan governing how we prepare
13 specifications for the 154 types of fleet units that
14 the city operates. We want to ensure that we procure
15 the safest units that are viable in the market, and
16 that a regular process exists to evaluate
17 developments in safe technology and to revise
18 specifications as needed. DCAS is partnering with
19 the US DOT, Volpe National Transportation Systems
20 Center on this effort, and as a result, the city
21 will, among other things, expand use of safety
22 technologies including driver alert, automatic
23 braking, telematics and back-up cameras. DCAS
24 expects to receive its first fleet units with
25

1 automatic braking technology this spring, and to give
2 a reference point, half of our accidents that involve
3 injuries involved rear-end events. So automatic
4 braking can really target an enormous amount of those
5 events. Finally, in November 2016, DCAS hosted its
6 third annual Vision Zero Fleets Forum. The forum
7 offers an opportunity for private and public fleets
8 to share ideas and partner with safety advocates and
9 vehicle manufacturers to advance safety. Through the
10 forum, over 60 private fleets and fleet suppliers
11 have endorsed Vision Zero publicly, and companies
12 like Fresh Direct and Coca-Cola have begun their own
13 side guard initiative. DCAS will continue to work
14 with our partners in city government, and in the
15 private sector to expand and strengthen these
16 efforts. Thank you to the City Council for your
17 support and leadership as well as the opportunity to
18 discuss these initiatives today. Thank you.

19
20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you my
21 colleague and—and the Co-Chair will have most of the
22 questions on Public Safety. I just have two
23 questions, and then Council Member—Chairman Gibson
24 she also have a question. My colleagues also will
25 follow her. Let me turn over to the DCAS first.

1 It's good news to know that and how DCAS is working
2 to install the side guards on fleet units, and other
3 programs you've been doing. Like what is your—do you
4 have like a five-year plan when we are hoping to have
5 all the trucks under DCAS to have side guards?
6

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: Yes, so
8 while the law requires us to fully outfit by 2024, we
9 think that we will be done by about 2021 and, you
10 know, we've been retrofitting so far, and
11 retrofitting means you take a truck that already
12 exists, and you design a guard for it. That is more
13 technically difficult to do. Some trucks really were
14 not designed to have the guards. The good news is we
15 now have 28 contracts, a lot of city contracts that
16 involve the original equipment manufactured based on
17 new trucks coming with side guards. So this year we
18 should have about 800 trucks just in 2017 give or
19 take when they deliver including 5 to 600 Sanitation
20 trucks all coming with new side guards, and the first
21 30 Sanitation trucks showed up a few weeks ago. So,
22 between the retrofits and the new vehicles, I know we
23 should be about 15 to 1,600 by the end of this year.
24 I think we will have the whole fleet outfitted, which
25

1 is approximately 4,000 vehicles by about 2021. So
2 we're making a lot of progress.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, and—and
5 following that, you know, you always bring together--
6 most of those are the Truck Association who also come
7 and move the good in the city. How you and with--
8 should we encourage those representatives of the
9 truck drivers to also on a volunteer base those who
10 are coming to the city to also follow DCAS with a
11 similar plan? And the second piece is, you know, to
12 our DOT Commissioner, how can we also—because this is
13 a federal level, you know, to get all the trucks. We
14 are on the Interstate and there's a lot of trucks
15 that we they come here that are going to other
16 places. So can we get one, the Minority Leader in
17 the Senate, Senator Schumer also if there's not an
18 initiative to take the leadership on—on starting—
19 following what DCAS is doing so that we put them
20 nationwide, and probably if anyone follows President
21 Trump, you know, put in the theater encouraging the
22 president, you know, take the initiative at the
23 Senate with his leadership also to do one thing good.
24 You know, he did the city awful for things. What
25 about if we send a message to her and calling the

1 president to help us to follow these types of truck
2 throughout the nation. They should put those
3 protections because you have fixed. You reduced
4 crashes for cyclists and—and pedestrians also.
5

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: So, I'll
7 just go first. So one thing, of course is side
8 guards are a fascinating story, and we did a report
9 with the USDOT Volpe Center on this in 2015. If you
10 go to England, if you go to Europe, if you go to some
11 places, if you go to Brazil, side guards have been
12 mandated technology on trucks for over 20 years, and
13 the data that we have on effectiveness comes from
14 those countries where they have long—they've had a
15 long lead time to study it. If you come into the
16 States, you know, we're trying to change this now,
17 but it has been very hard to find the side guards.
18 You know, these—and many of the manufacturers are the
19 same manufacturers who—who operate worldwide. So, we
20 have been through our Vision Zero Fleets Forum and
21 through a lot of other efforts communicating with
22 private fleets. Coca-Cola and Fresh Direct have both
23 adopted side guards in partnership with us. That's
24 voluntary efforts that they've been doing, and we've
25 been working with them on the designs. The waste

1 industry regulated by the Business Integrity
2 Commission I know they're up to about 120 side guards
3 in the early implementation on--on the waste side, and
4 they are also regulated. So they have until 2024.
5 The other good news I'll tell is when we started this
6 with you just two years ago, there was really only
7 one company we could find in North America that made
8 a side guard, a company come Canada called Air Flow.
9 We now have four companies who are designing and
10 manufacturing these. So we're also doing the kind of
11 work that build an industry to--to provide these
12 sideguards and that's happening very quickly. So we
13 think there's a lot of promise here. It's a know
14 technology. It's not a new technology. It may be
15 new to the States, but it's absolutely not new to the
16 fleet world, and so we certainly support any effort
17 to expand it.

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And--and I'll
20 take a crack, Mr. Chairman, at talking a bit about
21 this work at the federal level and--and my colleague
22 mentioned that the City has worked with the Volpe
23 Center up in Massachusetts. We have also in recent
24 years worked very closely with NHTSA looking at
25 different safety techniques, and I'm happy to say I

1
2 think the incoming Secretary of Transportation Elaine
3 Chow at her confirmation hearing and public statement
4 she's made has clearly said that she's very
5 interested in safety. It's going to be a high
6 priority. So I think certainly once that that
7 Administration is up and running, we're—we're—we're
8 keen to go speak to them. I think the one challenge
9 we may find is at the same time there is also
10 obviously an incoming administration that has talked
11 about, you know, I think taking a look at regulatory
12 burdens. So I—I assume that will be something of
13 attention in these discussions, but obviously we're—
14 we're keen to engage at the federal level as well.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you see—I
16 mean based on not only what the city is doing with
17 the trucks that DCAS operates that we're—we—the
18 volunteers position of those private sectors also
19 doing similar work on installing the side guards. Do
20 you see that this is something that—and again, New
21 York City, as you know, we move some in trucks like
22 those come here like people in cars. They can go to
23 the nearest borough (sic) from other places. Do you
24 see that this is advertised at the City level, at the
25

2 nationwide level to make a mandate where all trucks
3 in the nation also will get--?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: Well,
5 obviously their—I mean I can tell you what—where the
6 NTSB and NHTSA were on this subject as of a few weeks
7 ago, which is that truck guards are something that
8 the National Transportation Safety Board has
9 recommended be assessed a regulatory requirement
10 especially involving tractor trailers. And if you
11 think about tractor trailers when they come off the
12 highway, and then trying to operate in narrow streets
13 in cities and town, you know, the—the risk there is
14 extraordinary. So certainly it's a know technology
15 at the federal level. There is an NT—NTSB
16 recommendation. I believe it's from 2014 about
17 pursuing truck side guards for a federal regulation.
18 You know, that said, as the Commissioner said, you
19 know, we have to see and evaluate where—where the
20 administration will be now.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I think that
22 this is like a big number, and just repeating, you
23 know, what you just said, side guards have been shown
24 to reduce the likelihood of death by 61% of cyclists
25 and 20% of pedestrians in our city that, you know,

1 colliding with the side of—of a truck. I think
2 that's—thank you, you know, for what you're doing,
3 and let's continue working together to see how, you
4 know, with the new Secretary of Transportation,
5 President Trump I hope that he also will take it as
6 something important for the city and for the nation.
7 My last question before the other Chairman will have—
8 ask her questions, is about how—how important is the
9 city looking at redesigning those intersections with
10 the approach of the corners, all the four corners of
11 those intersections? Like how much are we investing
12 right now where we look at any particular
13 intersection that is heavily used by cars and also by
14 pedestrians to close in those intersections
15 especially at the corners side. How much are we
16 investing, and how do you see that with the new
17 budget that we will have we can be able to increase
18 those investments because it is at those corners
19 where most pedestrians cross on our streets.
20

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm going to
22 take a crack at that, and then turn it over to Deputy
23 Commissioner Russo as well, and I think you heard in
24 my testimony first of all the Mayor has given us
25 tremendous new resources both to continue our capital

1 projects, but also to do another, a bunch of other
2 things that are particularly focused at
3 intersections: High visibility crosswalks, improving
4 lighting, doing our left hand turn treatments to make
5 it safer, and I'd like Deputy Commissioner Russo to
6 talk about some of the details, but we are very
7 cognizant and focused on the fact that so many
8 crashers happen that have serious consequences for-
9 for pedestrians cyclists happen at intersections.
10

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: Sure. Thank
12 you, Commissioner. The-the testimony got into the
13 fact that the Left Turn Traffic Calming programs that
14 came out of our Don't Cut Corners Study was piloted
15 in this last calendar year, and represents the
16 innovation that we've been looking into. We've been
17 focused on slowing turning vehicles including trucks,
18 and the traditional way of doing that would be to
19 build out sidewalk extensions, curb extensions neck
20 down if-if you will, and those can be expensive and
21 slow, involve catch basin relocation and capital
22 work. So the-the pilot that we did, and there's
23 photos of it in-in your hand-out the Left Turn
24 Traffic Calming program includes marking in plastic
25 bollards and other types of treatments to slow-to

1 slow those turns and, you know, that—that has a—a
2 cost to it and—and a maintenance aspect.

3 Occasionally the larger vehicles will hit those
4 things, and—and have a maintenance executing. What
5 we're excited about is that after this pilot it's
6 promising enough, and if—if they're still in pilot
7 mode, but we have funded the maintenance and the
8 additional deployment of that treatment so that we
9 can work on slowing those turns, slowing the larger
10 vehicle turns related to the—to the trucks, and we
11 continue to do that aspect. So we're going to
12 probably do about another 100 intersections in 2017.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I—I just think
15 that it is amazing to see how the private sectors use
16 [coughs] especially and a lot of good work. They are
17 doing so much amazing innovation when it comes to,
18 you know, bringing the tools that we need when it
19 comes to technology especially looking at core needs.
20 And—and when you look let's say anything, any
21 particular corner that you are interested in that
22 based on the study you see you need to improve many
23 that you have done already. What is the cost when it
24 comes to technology that DOT have to incur in order
25 to bring the technology to dangerous intersections.

COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well, I guess I'll speak about sort of a couple different elements. I think—I think one lines you spoke about the good news about I think some of the treatments we're pursuing again like the—a left hand turn payment is just—they're very low cost and—and can be done very, very quickly. If we're getting into bigger capital work, obviously that's much more expensive. We are looking at other types of technologies. For example, we've got a \$20 million grant from USDOT to do connected vehicle technology, which gets—which gets into I think some of the areas that Keith was talking about ways now that vehicles can better detect—they can predict other vehicles. Hopefully eventually pedestrians and cyclists and other obstacles in the roadways and essentially talk to each other, and I think there's a lot of belief that that technology is very, very promising. It's—it's—it's slowly starting to evolve into vehicles right, but ultimately we think it can hold huge, huge promise, and again New York City is now one of the communities piloting that work.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I—I just would like to encourage especially, you know, with—since

1
2 now we have other resources that the Mayor is, you
3 know, providing to the agencies. But we at the
4 Council will continue to advocate for more resources
5 that corners are the place where pedestrians need to
6 cross the street. That's where we can see it, and I
7 think that as we have, you know, protection at 50
8 Center Street or across 120 Center Street I think
9 that besides bringing the technology, we expand for
10 us also to teaming and perfection especially in those
11 corners where heavily pedestrians use to cross at the
12 crosswalk. Those are, you know, when we address
13 dangerous intersection, it is on the corners or any
14 particular intersection that most traffic fatalities
15 occurs. (sic)

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Well, I-I do
17 want to be care about that because what-part of what
18 we're trying to do with our pedestrian plans is look
19 where the crash data sends us, which is often
20 correlated with density where there are a lot of
21 pedestrians, but not always. There can be other
22 factors that go into what the crash rates look at.
23 So, you know, again we're targeting our treatments
24 where we see the most, unfortunately the most
25 crashes, serious injuries and fatalities happening.

1 And some of that intersection work. Some of it is
2 also corridor work.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] [on
5 mic] If I walk from here to 120 Center Street, and I
6 walk on that sidewalk, I know that I'm protected. I
7 know that from 120 Center to the Municipal Building
8 all the way to 110 Center Street where the courts
9 are, I will feel protected. I think that those
10 decided to nail them, and I must say I'm not telling
11 you, you know, to just pay as some of DOT is doing in
12 making that. But I think it's the recommendation
13 office who look on—who look on should we also, you
14 know, look at that matter. That's the reason why we
15 have a protection in place because we can do it
16 simultaneously. Don't—Trump—we aren't stopping Trump
17 from coming to the sidewalk. So the most dangerous
18 intersections they should have all the protection
19 that we can bring, and I just, you know, encouraging
20 the DOT to look at those on the other half here at
21 Center Street and think about it, how we can, you
22 know, learn from that.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think Mr.
24 Chairman, you're—you're referring to the Barns Dance
25 we have at—at Center Street, right? Right by City

3 Hall where we give pedestrians as the base of the
4 service is so low and protected base across?

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] [on
6 mic] We need to install everything we have to in
7 order to be sure about the pedestrians who are
8 crossing in those dangerous intersection. They know
9 that the cross. (sic) [off mic] Council Member
10 Gibson.

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
12 Chair Rodriguez, and I also want to acknowledge that
13 we were joined by Council Members Rafael Espinal,
14 Jumaane Williams, Elizabeth Crowley, David
15 Greenfield, Dan Garodnick, and Daneek Miller. Thank
16 you colleagues for joining us and thank you all to
17 the NYPD, to the Department of Transportation. Thank
18 you to DCAS and TLC for your presence, your
19 participation, your partnership, your commitment and
20 your testimony. So I just have several questions
21 before I get to my other colleagues who were here,
22 and certainly the prime sponsors will talk
23 specifically about their bills. Well, I wanted to
24 first start with Chief Chan and his colleague as it
25 relates to enforcement. I want to ask about the
Collision Investigation Squad, CIS as we know it that

1 does all of the investigative work on any crashes
2 that happen on our city streets. I wanted to ask
3 about the make-up of the unit in terms of how many
4 investigators we have in CIS, how these are broken
5 down by borough, and then I wanted to ask about the—
6 obviously the average time it takes to investigate a
7 case. What happens when the accident or injury first
8 happens to the point where the case is closed?
9

10 CHIEF CHAN: [off mic]

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Your microphone is
12 not on.

13 CHIEF CHAN: In terms of the Collision
14 Investigation Squad, again, when we have a fatality,
15 when we have a seriously injured and an individual
16 who is likely to die, and a request by Patrol
17 Precinct for the CIS Investigative Out Teams will be
18 dispatched to go to those precincts to conduct those
19 investigations. Currently, there are 26
20 investigators in the CIS Unit. Those are the actual
21 investigators not including the supervisor. They
22 have citywide coverage. I don't have the exact
23 breakdown of how many in which borough, but again,
24 it's citywide coverage, and that—the selection of how
25 the Collision Investigation Squad investigators they

1
2 come from Highway Patrol. Like any other patrol
3 function officers are picked and selected and/or
4 apply to come to Highway Patrol. They're interested
5 in working in-in traffic, working in the-in the
6 enforcement and in traffic and things of that nature.
7 Eventually, we will select officers sometimes to-from
8 that group within Highway Patrol to work in our
9 Collision Technician group. These are the officers
10 that will respond to the CIS Team, and they will be
11 photographing. They'll be taking measurements, and
12 other pertinent information, cameras, the video and
13 start the investigation. The actual investigators
14 who are-could be detective or White Shields will
15 follow up on those cases. So what happens at the
16 selection of these officers to become-eventually be
17 actual investigators is a relatively slow process
18 because we find the people who are interested in
19 working in Highway Patrol. They come to work in CPG
20 for us also, but they don't have to always be in CPG.
21 They have to be motivated. They have to be
22 interested, and we see that, and we pick those people
23 from within Highway Patrol to become the
24 investigators, and during the investigative process
25 they learn as White Shields, and eventually they do-

1 they are promoted to the detectives in that unit.

2 When we conduct an investigation in CIS, it's
3 comparable to a homicide investigation that's done by
4 the Homicide-Homicide Squad--
5

6 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh, okay.

7 CHIEF CHAN: --from Manhattan South, from
8 Manhattan North. This covers a great deal of retail.
9 It's from A to Z. It's a full scale investigation,
10 photographs, interviews, evidence looking at the
11 vehicles involved, and the evidence that's on the
12 scene for processing. So it's does require a great
13 deal of--of time. I'll use a very quick example. If a
14 person flees from a bank from robbing a bank, he may
15 flee on foot, and we'll see where he may travel. A
16 vehicle leaves--he might actually use--use the vehicle.
17 He may travel a mile. We are going to be looking for
18 video cameras all along that distance to try to
19 figure out where he went, and try to identify who he
20 is. So it is a time consuming process when we
21 conduct these investigations. Some of the
22 investigations result in arrests that may be outside
23 the calendar year. It can occur a year. It can
24 occur six months. It could occur in a week. So
25 there is no time line. If that particular case is--

1 needs to have work, and we're waiting for any other
2 additional witnesses or additional witnesses do come
3 forward, then we will add that to that particular
4 file. So will not put a timeframe on how long a
5 particular case on average will take.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Well, no, it-
8 it definitely sounds lengthy and certainly if there
9 are multiple individuals involved or multiple
10 vehicles it obviously gets a little more complicated.
11 Whose responsibility is it within the CIS Unit to
12 work with the families impacted in terms of updates
13 on the case, and then, you know, obviously the
14 criminal liability and culpability of that particular
15 individual. You know, obviously it's-it's very
16 challenging. So, I do know in the past there have
17 been some instances where the driver him or her
18 wasn't necessarily criminally negligent because there
19 was some sort of a medical issue that was deemed as a
20 reason for the accident. So what does your unit do
21 in terms of the partnership that you have with the
22 next part of this process, which is the District
23 Attorney of that particular county? How do you guys
24 work with that entity to make sure that a case once
25

1 your work is done it's followed through and it goes
2 to the next level in the criminal process?

3
4 CHIEF CHAN: We certainly have an
5 excellent relationship with all five DAs. We have
6 regular meetings, monthly meetings with the—the five
7 district attorneys' representatives where we discuss
8 the various issues that may impact any traffic
9 related issues. We—we—leaving the scene or things of
10 that nature. One of the things that you mentioned in
11 terms of dealing with the families, our investigators
12 will try to update, but sometimes they will not
13 necessarily share current investigations exactly
14 where the investigation is all—what they're looking
15 for at this particular time. But again, one of the
16 things that we are going to do this year in 2017 is
17 that we are going to form a Transportation Outreach
18 Unit within my bureau. At this time, we are going to
19 assign personnel to that particular unit. Part of
20 their responsibility is going to be to do an outreach
21 in terms of education, and also for a campaign to
22 prevent for example programs in reference DWI. How
23 people can prevent it. We have a program called
24 Lower Your Limit and this is a very proactive
25 situation where our officers, it could be our

1
2 community affairs officers will to go to a venue for
3 example outside Madison Square Garden where there is
4 a hockey game, and we'll set up a table, and they'll
5 have portable alco-sensors where you can test for
6 alcohol, and people come by and they are welcome to
7 come by and say, hey, please, you know, you can test
8 to see what your alcohol level is, and this very like
9 a proactive way, and if the person is, you know,
10 they're not driving. It's not a confrontational
11 situation. They say well, let's see how many he
12 blows there are. He had two or three beers and he
13 blows oh, look at that, .08. You would be arrested
14 if you were driving. So we're going to do outreach,
15 but part of it with the outreach unit, and we are
16 going to make an attempt along with our Community
17 Affairs partners in the local precincts when we have
18 CIS cases to work with the families and to add in
19 more of an element where we can keep them informed on
20 what's going on on the process.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. So is CIS
22 always called to the scene, and you're called in by
23 the local command?

24

25

1
2 CHIEF CHAN: The—the call for the CIS is
3 quite often a—a determination by the Emergency
4 Medical Service. They will make--

5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] And
6 they arrive on the scene?

7 CHIEF CHAN: Right, they arrive on the
8 scene and they are trained and our police officers
9 are not EMTs and Paramedics. The EMS will make a
10 determination if we have a fatality, we have somebody
11 who is seriously injured and likely to die, and then
12 that will trigger that the officer will say okay this
13 person is—is in serious condition that we could
14 request CIS. It could be the police officer even
15 the—the sergeant on the scene. We also take into
16 consideration that everything will fall into that—
17 that framework and we give the discretion to our—our
18 precinct captains, our executive officers that can
19 call for a CIS job, and move it. For an example we
20 have a very young child. We have a senior citizen.
21 There are either multiple people that were struck.
22 They—they hit somebody. They also took out the side
23 of a building. So we would want CIS to do that
24 particular job, and we would call them. So again,
25 it's strictly certainly with the—the—the injury

determination by EMS and also that we have the capability to have determination by our precinct captains, XOs and other personnel who are on patrol that are working to move it up to a CIS level and to press that person up for that.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, I wanted to ask about the collaboration and traffic status similar COMPSTAT?

CHIEF CHAN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You guys have monthly Traffic Stat?

CHIEF CHAN: Weekly.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Weekly and then the borough also has Traffic Stat boroughs. Okay, and then down to a precinct level I know precinct commanding officers and XOs also have Traffic Stat with their officers as well. I'm very involved with my-my commands, and I work with my Cos and I close a lot because, you know, with all these numbers and traffic stat data, I am always looking at trends and patterns. So what I want to understand is, you know, DOT with Vision Zero we have borough needs a borough plan that ever borough has pretty much come up with in terms of street enhancement and street safety.

1 How do you guys all work together on looking at data
2 so if you have a defined area where there are
3 multiple, you know, crashes, something needs to be
4 looked at in that particular area. So how does NYPD
5 work with DOT, you know, to determine what items and
6 what investments we can make in that particular area
7 to make it more safe for the residents and
8 pedestrians in that particular area?

9
10 CHIEF CHAN: Well, first of all, we have
11 regular meetings with DOT in my office, and we
12 alternate. Sometimes we go to DOT.

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

14 CHIEF CHAN: We share information. We
15 also have our statistician in our office Lieutenant
16 Paul Brennon that works with DOT to make sure that
17 our numbers are meshing, and things of that nature.
18 So we are constantly sharing information for our
19 meetings on a regular basis. We see each other. So
20 this information is shared. When we go back to the
21 traffic stat issue, we have a traffic safety sergeant
22 that is assigned to the command that oversees a
23 Traffic Safety Team. But also we have our regular
24 patrol officers who are on patrol who are doing
25 enforcement out there. That information is shared

1 when we have identified a collision for a location,
2 and some locations are in commands that are
3 historically problematic because they have a large
4 amount of traffic, a high volume tractor trailers or
5 large vehicles or things of that nature. So those
6 are historical locations. When we get this
7 information, it's shared with our officers on patrol,
8 and we—we ask that they do conduct enforcement and
9 preferably the hazardous violations that we feel will
10 impact and reduce our injuries to our—our pedestrians
11 and also to our—for the fatalities. This Traffic
12 Site is held on a weekly basis, and as a matter of
13 fact at 2 o'clock, I have—have to go to a Traffic
14 Stat that's being held in my office. So what happens
15 is that we do it on a regular basis, and with a
16 borough where the borough representatives in—if
17 Manhattan South is coming, all 10 precincts will show
18 up--

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

21 CHIEF CHAN: --unless we have a—a special
22 one where we identify individuals.

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Uh-huh.

24 CHIEF CHAN: So this is on a regular
25 basis on a weekly basis that we're having this

1 Traffic Stat. The information, we have
2 representatives from DOT, TLC, State DOT there. So
3 we—we share the information. We identify problematic
4 locations, and then if it requires additional
5 lighting, if it requires pavement markings, these are
6 Traffic Intelligence Reports that are generated by
7 the officers, and then we forward it to DOT
8 [coughing] they will respond to us because they
9 realize that we've identified it. This is not the
10 general public. This is where officers will say
11 well, can we take a—a look at this location on a
12 possibility of a—a stop sign or the paving marking is
13 a little—is faded at this location. This is a very—a
14 location near a school, near a senior citizen center.
15 So they just prioritize that and try to advance that
16 schedule to make sure that things are done.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

19 CHIEF CHAN: So we are sharing
20 information on--

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] Okay.

22 CHIEF CHAN: --a daily regular basis.

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And I have said and
24 I, you know, obviously give lots of credit to Vision
25 Zero. I've seen my community affairs officers at

1
2 train stations and major corridors in the district on
3 a regular basis with papers giving out information.
4 They're at Precinct Council member, community board
5 meetings. I mean these are the arenas where you can
6 attract the most people. So I certainly encourage,
7 you know, DOT and everyone to continue to keep that
8 up because it's very helpful because everyone has a
9 role to play in keeping our streets safe. I just
10 have two final questions and, you know, obviously the
11 role of Albany is very important in the work we do.
12 I never forget that as a former member. When we
13 auth-when we got the authorization to lower the speed
14 limit to 25 as a default, and we also were able to
15 get the approval of the speed cameras around schools
16 during school hours, I wanted to ask is there a plan
17 this year, this session where we're looking at
18 vehicle and traffic law and where we have some gaps
19 where we can raise the penalties for those drivers
20 that unfortunately leave the scene of an accident
21 when someone is severely injured and/or killed? I
22 know that, you know, that's codified in state law,
23 but we have to put our agenda forth to make sure we
24 can get the support from our colleagues in Albany.
25 And I also wanted to ask there's been a lot of talk

3 and a lot of proposals about expanding the cameras we
4 have around schools. So I think the number—are we
5 under 200 or is that 150, 180? Somewhere, but I have
6 seen that number.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
8 We have—we have about 200 cameras--

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] Okay.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --fixed at
11 about 100 locations and the 40 mobile cameras, which
12 go to different locations there.

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] They
14 move around.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So a total 140
16 school zone locations at any given time.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, great. So my
18 question is are we putting forth an agenda for
19 identifying gaps in vehicle and traffic law in
20 Albany, and if so how can we at the Council help?
21 Number two, are we looking to ask Albany for
22 expanding on that number that the Commissioner talked
23 about. And number three, who has access to this
24 data? So I know, you know, as a driver and many of
25 us that drive in the city, we've been subjected to
those infractions, and we get a ticket in the mail

1 from the Department of Finance. But in terms of the
2 data looking at, you know, time stamps of when the
3 speeding is happening the most during schools hours,
4 who has access to that information, and do we have
5 the authority to use those cameras during non-school
6 hours?
7

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So I-I-I'll--

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [off mic] Oh,
11 dear, I think I blew out my microphone.

12 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh, no, not that one
13 either. Oh, no. These questions live here. (sic)

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [off mic]
15 Technical-technical--

16 FEMALE SPEAKER: Oh, oh here.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --technical
18 difficulties. The-the city Speed Camera Program is
19 authorized by the State. It enables us to install
20 speed cameras at 140 school zone locations. So that
21 means we can't have multiple cameras at one location.

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: The cameras can
24 only be operated during the hours when school is
25 open--

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] Uh-
huh.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --and they can
only be placed on streets that abut the school within
a quarter mile in each direction of the intersection.
So I'll say right away that one of the challenges of
that program. Wee think it's been incredibly
important and one thing I think we didn't highlight
in our testimony today, but I would highlight it. I
often do is we think one of the single biggest
factors to saving lives on the streets is controlling
speed. Because whatever else is happening, whatever
distractions, whatever obstacles whatever other
challenges we face, if drivers are traveling at a
safe speed they are less likely to have a collision,
and if they do have a collision obviously it's less
likely to have fatal consequences. So I think
everyone in this field agrees speed is so, so
important to making our streets safer. So the
cameras we have now we think they have been
transformational. In places we put them we typically
see speeding go down by 50%. That said, right now if
you look at the last five years of data on crashes
where people were killed or seriously injured, 85% of

1 those happened in times or places where we cannot use
2 our speed cameras. You know, and for example we're
3 talking about the cyclist number today. We—we saw
4 this past year unfortunately cycling fatalities
5 happen late at night with cars speeding. Our speed
6 cameras can't be deployed to help get at those
7 crashes.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] Okay.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So I think for
11 us obviously there are a couple of ways we would like
12 to expand the program. We would like to have the
13 ability to go to more locations, but we would also
14 very much like to be able to expand the use of those
15 cameras--

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] Right.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --because, you
18 know, unfortunately a lot of crashes do not happen
19 near schools or during school hours. They happen at
20 night. They happen on, you know, as a classic
21 example, I referenced it in my testimony when I sit
22 with the Mayor when we were on Northern Boulevard in
23 Queens where a little boy named Musho Lyon was
24 killed. He was crossing to get to the school. The
25 school itself sat on a pretty small street. It did

1 not abut Northern Boulevard. So I couldn't put a
2 camera right there. That clearly--that's clearly not
3 the outcome we want. We want to be able to put the
4 cameras basically in the zone where children are
5 heading to school, which may or may not necessarily
6 be exactly the street that abuts the school. So, I
7 sat with the Mayor yesterday. He announced that the
8 City is committed to going back to Albany again this
9 year to try and get expanded authority on speed
10 cameras. I know we have some of the advocate
11 community here. They are also I know going to be up
12 there, and obviously we would love to partner with
13 the Council. Your support is absolutely essential.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Well, great. Moving
16 on Albany, too. We have lots of little reforms.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [laughs] I
18 know.

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And Chief, can you
20 speak a little bit to the Vehicle and Traffic Law,
21 and what you think we could do.

22 CHIEF CHAN: Sure, and--and one of the
23 things again in terms of the additional speed cameras
24 throughout the city, we are--we definitely support
25 that issue. I mentioned in my earlier statement that

1 that will provide a larger net in terms of coverage
2 and exactly speed, which is certainly one of the
3 major components of-of crashes and injuries and
4 fatalities. So we would be definitely supportive of
5 the additional speed cameras. When we took a look at
6 the-we were asked to submit suggestions and in terms
7 of the impact of legislation at least compared to our
8 legal bill with the Police Department that-that
9 currently the penalties for a hit and run are less
10 than the penalties for DWI and therefore the drivers
11 tend to flee the crash instead of remaining at the
12 scene and being arrested being DWI. So what happens
13 is that we certainly support the additional penalty
14 for-and raising it so that the individuals if they
15 flee the scene that they know that there-there is
16 going to be jail time and things of that nature.
17 That will certainly be another deterrent to
18 individuals who leave scene, but again I think it is
19 very important and certainly the education. The
20 design certainly helps, and we-we work
21 collaboratively with DOT on that.

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, thank you very
24 much, and I just want to make sure if anyone didn't
25 understand the lingo, DWI is driving while

1 intoxicated, right? Okay. Well, thank you, guys.
2
3 I—we'll try to get back if we have time to ask
4 additional questions, but let me also just thank you
5 for your partnership, and also add another
6 stakeholder, great public servants that are working
7 with youth, that are working in our streets every
8 single day and those are our school crossing guards,
9 and I'm grateful. In this Preliminary Budget we're
10 going to add additional school crossing guards plus
11 supervisors because they work with you to keep our
12 children and educators safe, and they're in the
13 streets all day during morning, during afternoon
14 dismissal, whether it's rain, sleet or snow. And,
15 you know, I want to recognize, you know, our school
16 crossing guards because they are great public
17 servants that are obviously in dangerous conditions
18 at times protecting our children going to and from
19 school. Thank you very much for the work you're
20 doing, and looking forward to continued partnership.
21 I'll turn this back over to Chair Rodriguez.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Chair,
23 and now I'd like to go back to our colleagues, and
24 we're putting the clock on five minutes because we
25 have 14. Some is here, others are out of here, but

1 they will be back. We're putting the clock on five
2 minutes. Please. You have to do it in five minutes.
3 First, Council Member Deutsch.

4
5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
6 Chair. First—firstly, I'd like to thank our Chief
7 Chan and Commissioner Tisch for your support and
8 collaboration and partnership on Intro 1280-A. So
9 thank you for that. This will help thousands if not
10 more, thousands of New Yorkers, tens of thousands of
11 New Yorkers. I—I have some questions regarding Intro
12 1311 that requires—that would require DOT to notify
13 emergency first responders at least five days prior
14 to resurfacing roads. The DOT Commissioner did
15 mention that DOT is already doing that, and based on
16 that large—to a large email list, which already
17 includes the local police precincts. So my first
18 question is to Chief Chan. Who receives these DOT
19 emails in the NYPD local precincts?

20 CHIEF CHAN: Those particular emails are
21 received by our Traffic Management Center, and they
22 are then forwarded to the boroughs for their review,
23 but ultimately in the Traffic Management Center we do
24 have personnel that take a look at it, and again,
25 they will not necessarily look at each and every one

1 of those particular permits, but certainly we're
2 concerned about Fifth Avenue around areas where the
3 demonstrations are on 57th Street and things of that
4 nature. So we're—we're going to look at these
5 locations where we were involved and loaned to the
6 construction, and again, we've worked with DOT and
7 also reached out to the Building Department to make
8 sure that if we're going to do this that we don't
9 have conflicting times and scheduled where if they're
10 going to do paving and things of that nature that
11 will cause problems—problems where the Police
12 Department and other agencies are involved.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So for example,
15 I said in my district if it's not a Fifth Avenue and
16 the NYPD's see notification from DOT, does—do the
17 patrol officers receive that information of any local
18 street—streets, and would that go to all the first
19 responders?

20 CHIEF CHAN: That—I would say that the
21 local police officers would not have that type of
22 information because they would be inundated with too
23 much information. When we take a look at that
24 information, and we receive it at the Traffic
25 Management Center, we send out notices when it's

1 going to impact us. I receive emails and notices
2 when there is bridge construction, cranes and things
3 of that nature, but the Traffic Management Center
4 personnel will look at it and when it's pertinent
5 they will forward that information to the borough
6 concerned.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So what would
9 happen if they first respond to these funds, and
10 there's a specific block or two blocks or sometimes
11 even three blocks being resurfaced, and the NYPD or
12 the Fire Department or the MS worker cannot get down
13 the block, and they did not get this notification.
14 Otherwise, they would have to—they would know to take
15 another route?

16 CHIEF CHAN: That is always a possibility
17 that is always a possibility that—that if the
18 repaving information, but I think that those are
19 natural obstacles that occur in New York City. If
20 it's a police and if it's a—it's a—depending the type
21 of emergency response, they may very well go onto
22 that block. I can definitely—I could probably vouch
23 for the Police—the Fire Department that probably
24 would not hold their rates from going to the fire if
25 it's a fire scene itself. But I—I think that it is

1 important that we have that information. There is an
2 issue sometimes is that if we farm each and every
3 piece of this information in terms of every
4 construction building and resurfacing or some other
5 types of permanent information now we will innovate
6 and just let the officers even if they have the cell
7 phone that would be too much information.
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, my next
10 question is for Commissioner Polly Trottenberg.
11 Approximately how many streets in New York City are
12 repaved each year, and do you anticipate even more
13 streets being repaved in the coming years?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah, and—and
15 Council Member Deutsch I'd like to say your bill sort
16 of raised a concern that I hadn't heard before. We
17 try very, very hard to get our milling and paving
18 schedules out again to community board to precincts
19 to first responders to NYPD to merchants. If there
20 is some communication gap obviously we're happy to
21 try and work on it, and to the extent that we're
22 doing work and emergency vehicles need to get through
23 the stakes, we let them through. We are and I guess
24 I'm pleased to say that the Mayor has included in his
25 most recent budget and other banner year for

1 resurfacing. We're going to be doing another 1,300
2 lane miles. We'll be doing those all over the city,
3 but we try as—as I think as Chief Chan has said to
4 work closely with our sister agencies to come up with
5 a schedule that minimizes conflict and traffic. We
6 work with local community boards, and we're—we're
7 happy to do that in any community. We know that
8 milling and paving it—it can cause some
9 inconvenience, but I think in the long run we've done
10 a lot to improve the condition of the streets
11 throughout the city, and I've definitely gotten a lot
12 of good feedback on that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So when DOT does
15 million and paving, what is their traffic plan
16 generally?

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It—it very
18 much—it depends [bell] on the road, but again we
19 usually will notify community boards, precincts, et
20 cetera. It will often be published in local
21 newspapers. We'll put up notices ahead of time. If
22 it's a major boulevard we do the work at night to try
23 and minimize the traffic disruption.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay. So I just
25 want to end off with my concern about this. First of

1
2 all, is when--when DOT does milling and paving and
3 they close up streets, now first of all you have the
4 people, the parents that drive the kids to school.
5 You have those people going to work, leaving to work
6 when they don't know what street to close. They
7 don't know which way to go. This causes even more
8 congestion, and then when you have emergency
9 responders such as EMS, the Fire Department, NYPD,
10 and also throughout the city. In my district alone
11 you have--you have Tella, which is a volunteer
12 ambulance and you have Assist. You have other
13 volunteer agencies, and ambulance companies that get
14 tied in through this congestion when there's no
15 proper notification or traffic plan of any type of
16 traffic. So this is my concern. This is what my
17 borough was put in for to make this proper
18 notifications to everyone to know what streets are
19 being closed and for how long.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: We--we do,
21 Council Member, put notices on streets a few days
22 before we do the work. Again, the--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [interposing]
24 But that I agree. I am--I am--

25

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --the
3 community board dissem--disseminates the information.
4 It's often in local papers. So if there is--obviously
5 it sounds like there's some entities you think aren't
6 getting the information. We' happy to work with you
7 to make that happen. I--I have generally gotten good
8 feedback, but people do know when milling and paving
9 is coming,. It is certainly, you know, an
10 inconvenience for a couple of days, but it's the only
11 way we can, you know, maintain the quality of our
12 roadways.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [off mic] Thank
14 you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner,
16 before my council members may ask a question wo when
17 they're asking--been asking me for bringing the
18 suggestion on the time that we are giving to
19 pedestrians to cross the amount of infrastructure? I
20 know at the local--at a local level I know that they
21 brought a DOT Commissioner being in conversation with
22 some of my staff because consistently he brought to
23 my attention that pedestrians they only 15 minutes to
24 cross--15 seconds to cross from east to west after
25 7:30. And I know that, you know, sometimes we've

1 been pushed back, but I can tell you I lived that
2 experience. I was not able to get back in order to
3 deal with the site until your administration took
4 place, and the excuses was that if we put a signal, f
5 we did one for pedestrian, we would have an impact on
6 the drivers. So, you know, I leave those. I believe
7 that we have to somehow guide them and learning to
8 read the change and better for the pedestrians. So,
9 can we look—can DOT work with the—and I know that you
10 work 24/7, but can we keep working to increase those
11 seconds that we just did for that intersection. (sic)
12 I believe that it has to be like a low pedestrian
13 crossing for us only to be 15 seconds.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I—I—I
16 think as you heard in my testimony I think the
17 Department has really I think kind of taken a
18 transfer to—transformational look at—at what we would
19 call leading pedestrian intervals, which is giving
20 pedestrians those extra seconds. And look, of course,
21 we're obviously happy to go look at locations, and I
22 think you've seen our work has tripled and quadrupled
23 and we've become very enthusiastic about it, and we
24 agree we see tremendous reductions in collisions
25 involving pedestrians when we do that work. But, we

1 do—when we do have to bring our traffic engineers to
2 bear because one of the challenges we have in busy
3 intersections is to the extent that the pedestrians
4 are going, you're holding the traffic, and the
5 traffic is backed up. So it's always a balancing
6 act, but I think you're seeing, Mr. Chairman, we are
7 increasingly doing the pedestrian intervals. We
8 recognize what an important safety tool it is, and
9 again happy to come and take a look at the
10 intersection. We agree with you, it's—it's proven
11 itself. (sic) One thing I will note. It's very
12 funny just when you see that the—the way the signals
13 works is first you'll see the walking signal, which
14 is the light walking signal. Then you will start the
15 countdown. The countdown is actually not the entire
16 pedestrian phase. People thin that it is. I—I-I
17 know it's understandable, and if you go to
18 Washington, D.C. it actually is the way they do it.
19 It's not the way we do it. Washington they actually
20 got an exemption from the federal requirement that
21 first you have some segments of the light walker.
22 Then you have the countdown. Then you have the red
23 flashing hand. So, the—the time that the pedestrian
24 has actually starts from the minute you see the white
25

1 walker come, and not for when you see the count down.
2
3 But again, happy to look at the places where you
4 think we need to give people more time.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I-I-I just would
6 like to encourage DOT to—and again because we are in
7 this place to reduce the number of deaths by 2024 to
8 zero, and I think that— I can tell you at the local
9 level we can think about any intersection and the
10 west side in the west end that probably we could say
11 there's not many pedestrian crossings. There's no ne
12 that's heavily trafficked. It will make sense, but
13 there should not be any-- They—I think that there
14 should be some expanded from where we're saying this
15 should be. (sic) We have to provide at least 30
16 seconds for this because again, I think that become
17 better. As for one that's probably 10 or 15 years
18 ago. I wouldn't have been thinking so much and
19 protecting the pedestrians and cyclists. But today,
20 maybe because I'm the Council Member and Chair this
21 committee, but no because I have two daughters. I am
22 just saying what the Families for Safer Streets, but
23 most New Yorkers are for safer streets. Drivers have
24 to slow down, and I think that, you know, it doesn't
25 like for 15 seconds. You know, unless you try to

1 lower pedestrians and hold up to your status of the
2 same. And again, in June you have to do the work.
3 It certainly has to be done. All I'm saying is not
4 only to wait for the—myself or the colleagues to
5 bring it to your attention, but it's can we look at
6 how many intersections that we have run by 15 seconds
7 compared to those that are 30 seconds, and how can we
8 equalize those sites? Thank you. Council Member Van
9 Bramer.
10

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
12 very much. Commissioner Trottenberg, my questions
13 are for the most for you, and because of the time
14 limit I'm going to ask as many yes or no questions as
15 I possibly can. I didn't go to law school. I didn't
16 get to practice. So, with respect to Intro 1257, I'm
17 sure you're familiar there was a 2013 Columbia
18 University Study published in the Journal of the
19 American Academy of Pediatrics talking about the
20 importance of the Safe Routes to School Action Plan,
21 and pointing out that if we were to expand the
22 program, and had plans for each of the then 1,471
23 schools we could prevent over 200 children from being
24 injured and possibly killed in crashes. Are you
25 familiar with that study? Yes.

1

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

2

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you,

3

and—and I want to also say to you I agree with what

4

you said your testimony which just to repeat:

5

However, we opposed rigid quotas imposed by

6

legislation for locations, and treatments not guided

7

by DOT's Engineering and Professional Analysis and

8

Expertise. Instead you say, when we deviate from

9

where the data leads, we risk diverting resources and

10

attention from those crash prone locations. Would

11

you agree that 1257 is the data driven piece of

12

legislation?

13

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I guess I have

14

to say yes or no. [laughs]

15

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes and no.

16

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So, if we are

18

requiring the Department of Transportation to

19

identify the 135 elementary and middle schools with

20

the highest number of traffic crashes within a half

21

mile radius that's data, no?

22

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I guess. I'm

23

sorry. I can't give you a yes or no to this. I

24

think our work on the Borough Pedestrian Safety

25

1
2 Action Plan has sort of superseded that approach. I
3 mean we have now looked at corridors, intersections
4 and areas all over the city and, you know, there is
5 not a huge correlation to schools. It tends to
6 correlate to big busy intersections and corridors
7 where you have many lanes of traffic, places with a
8 lot of pedestrian and vehicular activity as Chief
9 Chan—I mean there are some schools in those
10 locations, but it's not a particularly tight nexus.
11 I think that's some of the good news. Some of our
12 schools are tucked away on safer places.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So I think to
15 the extent that the citywide data leads us to those
16 schools, of course, we're focusing on it, and I do
17 want my—mostly to talk about. We do have a whole
18 school safety program that I wanted to elaborate on.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [interposing]
20 So can I just say--

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
22 Sure.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --but borough
24 safety action plans are not the same as school
25 safety, correct?

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, the-
3 the-the Borough Safety Action Plans are looking at
4 the citywide crash data. I'll have Ryan talk a bit
5 about the details of the work we do at each school,
6 but all I'm saying is that data shows us that there
7 are some school areas where there are crashes and
8 some school areas that are-where there's very low
9 crashes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right, but we
11 have two more minutes to go. So I'm just going to
12 ask a few more questions if you don't mind. So, do
13 school-do Safe Routes for School Action Plans make
14 children safer?

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, again,
16 I-[off mic] I'm having problems with my mic today.
17 Again, I think we have an approach now that sort of
18 supersedes that, and I-I would really like to
19 actually take a minute to talk about now how we do
20 handle our school plans because I think you'll be-
21 you'll be interested. I think we're doing some very
22 good work around schools.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: But I'm trying
24 to get to do you think Safe Routes to School Action
25

1 Plans are—are obsolete and no longer needed? Is that
2 what you're saying?
3

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Again, I would
5 say I think we're now taking a more comprehensive
6 approach. It includes looking at schools, but it
7 also includes looking at the data all over the city.
8 Some schools clearly there is an issue of looking at
9 the crash data telling us we need to do
10 interventions. In some schools the crash data
11 fortunately is very good, and there's not that big a
12 need.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So what's the
14 harm in identifying the 135 most severe school
15 locations, and then having an action plan and
16 publishing that and updating it every two years.
17 Tell me what's wrong with that?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I—I think the
19 challenge and we face this on so many fronts, signal
20 studies, requests for traffic lights, et cetera. To
21 the extent that we're using engineer study and
22 resources to go to places where the data tells us
23 they're not the most crash prone, that's resources
24 and engineering and time spent not going after the
25

1 places that the data does tell us of in those crash
2 reports.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: But we're
5 only going after the 135 locations, and if they're
6 with the—the most demonstrably problematic data, no?

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: But I'm
8 looking at all the schools, am I not? That's—that's
9 what this is tasking me to do, and I can tell just
10 looking from my Borough Pedestrian Safety Action
11 Plans that there are many schools where fortunately
12 the—you know, the crash data looks not so bad.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right, and we
14 want more of that, and this could be a—a help to
15 getting there. So, I'm trying to—to figure it out,
16 and I think the analysis and the expertise, which is
17 what you referred to in your testimony is—is in
18 response to the data. It isn't the data itself,
19 right? I mean we need the data. Then we certainly
20 need your experts to—to analyze it and then do things
21 that it would make children safer, which I know that
22 you and the Commissioner are so—spend every day
23 trying to figure out to do. So I just want to say in
24 closing I hope that we can continue to talk about
25 this, and work towards getting it done unless you say

1 that you believe this is an obsolete at this point,
2 that is say for us the safe us the School Action
3 Plan, and then just lastly, I have a resolution 1075
4 to make sure that we lift the quota on speed cameras
5 in the city of New York. So I hope that this Council
6 will take that and pass it and then fight with you to
7 make sure that we lift this silly restriction on
8 speed cameras in the City of New York. On that we
9 can agree.
10

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I thank—
12 thank you for your leadership on speed cameras.
13 Look, we're happy obviously to sit down and continue
14 the discussion on school safety. Of course, we—we
15 welcome the Council's interest and input, and would
16 like to spend more time telling you what we're doing,
17 and obviously if you think there are things we can
18 do—being doing better, let's—let's work on that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And I always
20 enjoy hearing Commissioner Russo, but I had five
21 minutes, and I have to go.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before calling
23 Council Member Chin, I would like to recognize also
24 our friend and partner and I believe I should like to
25 recognize Council Member Lander, Constantinides,

1 Levin—Levin and—and the Manhattan Borough President
2 Gale Brewer who have been here leading the charge
3 when yes you were in a role with the Council and now
4 as the Manhattan Borough President who also we will
5 hear from her testimony after the Administration.
6 Now, we're calling Council Member Chin.
7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair
9 and thank you to the panel, and first of all the
10 safety measure that's been put on Canal Street thank
11 you Commissioner. It's great and also the—the bike
12 lane on Chrystie Street. One of the biggest issues I
13 have down in Lower Manhattan, we have a growing
14 residential population, and we have hundreds of
15 thousands of people who work down here and tourists.
16 So, my constituents are asking the city for a Lower
17 Manhattan Pedestrian Traffic Safety Mobility Study
18 because the streets are very narrow, and we just need
19 to figure out how do we use these streets, share
20 streets that some are that the DOT pilot was a
21 wonderful program. So, that is something that we're
22 looking forward to, and we hope that we could work
23 with DOT to do this—this comprehensive study. Maybe
24 the data you always have. Because that the streets
25 are so narrow, you know, you have parents with a baby

1 stroller and we have also mounting garbage because of
2 the residential, and the other thing, too, we have
3 the private parking problem. All these illegal
4 parkers. Okay. I have gotten so many pictures from
5 Transportation Alternatives from the residents. It's
6 not even a real placard. Just a little note saying
7 I'm NYPD or one of those traffic agents uniforms
8 ourselves putting in the windshield. We've got to do
9 something about that, and it's because what happened
10 is then you have to delivery trucks, the UPS trucks
11 even the postal trucks parking on the sidewalk,
12 forcing parents and kids to have to walk on the
13 street, but we don't want anybody to get hit. But
14 last week one of my high school students in the Leman
15 High School got hit, got injured and the drove-driver
16 drove away. And so I mean like-and furthermore,
17 Commissioner Kerman he's DCAS because these agencies
18 parking their cars along these narrow streets like on
19 Whale Street. I got a whole-the Department of Trans
20 or Sanitation takes up more than a block. It's their
21 car and then it's people who work with the agency.
22 So you have no room for these delivery trucks, and
23 then guess what, they park on the sidewalk. I got a
24 picture of two UPS trucks parking on the sidewalk,
25

1 and right near the school at the school street I have
2 a new-a-a post-a post office delivery truck parked on
3 the sidewalk and they told us we have no jurisdiction
4 over them because they're federal. So it's like
5 Chief Chan, can we get some enforcement on these
6 placard parkers?
7

8 CHIEF CHAN: Definitely. That-that-that
9 issue with placards goes back many, many years and
10 existed even when I was the commanding officer in the
11 Fifth Precinct in 1994. I don't want to date myself,
12 but what happened is that we are going to work. Last
13 year the NYPD issued over 20,000 parking violations
14 to people with placards, and things of that nature.
15 We've seen unfortunately an increase in permits that
16 are not-not legitimate, they're illegitimate, and
17 where it could be a court officer, but is not a legal
18 placard and things of that nature. We will work
19 closely with the Fifth Precinct and Inspector Tommy
20 Enger (sp?) and in terms of dealing and talking and
21 what happens then--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] Not
23 just in Chinatown. I didn't talk about Chinatown.
24 They-they took all of the streets.

25 CHIEF CHAN: Well, well, well--

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But I'm talking
3 about down here--

4 CHIEF CHAN: [interposing] Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --in Lower
6 Manhattan.

7 CHIEF CHAN: In the Lower Manhattan area
8 including the seven and probably more in the First
9 Precinct there in those areas, and we've worked very
10 closely with our counterparts in patrol, the patrol
11 precincts because what happened is that when they
12 turn out to be let's say an NYPD personnel then we
13 can take further action because an issue of
14 disciplinary action against those officers if they're
15 in violation of things of that nature. But also
16 there are other placards in there. As you mentioned
17 before, people roll up like a-a reflective device and
18 they put it in their-their-their dashboard thinking
19 that that will protect them from the--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] Chief
21 Chan, so why couldn't the traffic agent or the NYPD
22 officer just give them a ticket for the parking
23 violation. Let them go fight it, right? If they're--
24 they're on official duty, they're not paying money
25 into the meter. The muni meter is great, but they're

1 not paying money into it. Give them a ticket. Let
2 them go fight the ticket just like ordinary system.
3 If you have illegal parking you get a ticket. You a
4 summons.
5

6 CHIEF CHAN: That is something that we
7 will work out with the local precinct in the Lower
8 East Side whether the—the Integrity Control Officer,
9 which is a sergeant or a lieutenant from that local
10 command and we'll address it, and then we will issue
11 summonses there. We've worked in the confines in
12 Brooklyn near the court system there and again there
13 was a problem where people were parking illegally,
14 and causing congestion there, and we were able to
15 resolve the problem itself. So, we will--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] We
17 want to see some improvement. I mean come on, we got
18 to work on this because do you expect people to
19 follow the law when the people who support the
20 enforcing the law is not following the law, and the
21 city employees. So the agency parking we have to
22 work on that because the streets are very, very
23 narrow, and agencies they need parking. They—they
24 need to find some place off the street to parking
25 sharing cars, you know, carpooling, walking, public

1 transportation. You know, we cannot have so many
2 cars from the agencies. And Commissioner, I want
3 that study--

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --so that we could
6 work on the problem comprehensively.

7 CHIEF CHAN: I will follow up--

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
9 Happy to discuss with you about that.

10 CHIEF CHAN: --and I will follow up with
11 you--your office and referencing--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes.

13 CHIEF CHAN: --and applying some of the
14 rules and we're--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] Well,
16 the DCAS Commissioner. We also want to follow up
17 with you and see how we can, you know, take care of
18 these problems. We don't want cars and trucks to be
19 parked on the sidewalk, and this way forcing the
20 pedestrians onto the street.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: Well, I will
22 mention just one thing quickly. We did announce as
23 part of the November Plan and an announcement of the
24 Mayor that we are going to be expanding car sharing.
25

1 One of the things and this is one of the reasons
2 we're doing it, we have a plan to reduce the city's
3 fleet further in the next fiscal three fiscal years,
4 as part of the November plan with OMB. One of the
5 things DCAS is going to do for the first time is we
6 are going to introduce actually using 50 all electric
7 GM Volts the first citywide pool fleet to try to show
8 it to have all agencies start to use the same common
9 pool vehicles, and to get away from the current
10 model, which is the agency's owned and possessed
11 cars, and whether they use them or they don't use
12 them, they will use them everyday, not every day,
13 they've got to deal with them and to get really
14 focused on the Zipcar type model on transport needs.
15 And so we are going to start this this year with the
16 first citywide pool fleet, and hopefully that will be
17 successful, and hopefully we can grow that and-and-
18 and relieve some of these issues that we know exist.

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much,
21 Council Member Chin and I just want to quickly
22 interject before we get to Council Member Lander, and
23 I'm thankful that another colleague brought it up
24 before I did because it was on my list, and I think,
25 you know, in addition to the Lower Manhattan

1 challenges, let me just speak from the perspective of
2 the Bronx and the districts I represent is the civic
3 area of Bronx County. So we have Housing, Family,
4 Criminal and Civil Courts. That also includes
5 Central Booking and Night Court. So to say that we
6 have challenges, Chief, is an understatement, and the
7 fact that if we're looking at broad message and, you
8 know, general work we're doing across the city,
9 everyone has to follow the rules, and I cannot
10 emphasize that enough. I get criticized quite a bit
11 almost every day about city officials using placards,
12 taking up spaces, parking in crosswalks and bus stops
13 et cetera. And I understand for the purposes of
14 court our officers have to go to court. I
15 understand, but there has to be a way where NYPD and
16 DOT can work with the City to identify alternative
17 measures. So what we've done in the Bronx next to
18 the DA's building at 198 East 161st Street there is a
19 huge parking lot because there's a mall. We've
20 allowed city workers to park in that lot, but they
21 have to pay. That's the challenge: No one wants to
22 pay. I get it. At a local level what I try to do
23 as, you know, a member in my district is work with my
24 three CO's on parking issues because one of my
25

1
2 commands has over 400 officers. So I know what the
3 nightmare is like every single day, and that doesn't
4 even include when there's Yankee's game because
5 that's even worse. So, just to stay on topic, what
6 can we do, and what conversations are we having about
7 making sure that city officials with city vehicles
8 with their, you know, obviously their work vehicles
9 are abiding by the rules and we're identifying ways,
10 you know, in which they can park their vehicles
11 because they have to go to work. They have to go to
12 court. I understand that but also on certain days
13 it's a traffic nightmare. If you driver across 161st
14 Street right now from Jerome to Morris Avenue it will
15 you a half hour just to get five blocks east. And so
16 that's a nightmare that my district faces everyday
17 and, you know, Council Member Chin here in Lower
18 Manhattan and, you know, my colleagues in Queens with
19 the Queens Court. So we're just trying to figure out
20 what to do because at the end of the day we want
21 everyone to be safe, but we want everyone to be fair
22 about the rules. We can't enforce rules for some and
23 not for others and, you know, obviously it gets
24 really challenging at times. So I'd like to know is
25 there a plan and, you know, what are we planning to

1 do with some of these areas where you have these
2 unique challenges in our city?

3
4 CHIEF CHAN: The issues are with court's,
5 with the courts, Family Courts and based on the
6 nature we're police officers. We'll descend upon
7 them when they go to those particular jurisdictions
8 and these are a matrix. (sic) We found that the most
9 effective way to address these particular issues is
10 dealing with the local precincts that are involved at
11 those locations, and getting their participation, and
12 in the past even down here in Lower Manhattan because
13 you have all of Manhattan responding here, if they
14 make an arrest they will respond to Manhattan
15 Criminal Court. We have people from the whole
16 borough. So quite often you're not going to get the
17 same car the next day. They may be only down there
18 for a court case. It's one day. So the solutions
19 are—long-term solutions ultimately that work for us,
20 and—and as an example I mentioned in Brooklyn where
21 we were able to get and notify the people the court
22 officers and also the local precincts that were
23 coming there, and we cleared an area, and kept the
24 three in the vicinity of Borough Hall. So again, we
25 will take a look at the—the—all the locations

1 throughout the city where we have these courts and
2 situations, and ask our local precincts to cover
3 those areas, to come up with a plan and get-get their
4 Integrity Control Officers involved. And also, in
5 working with our counterparts and other agencies to
6 see if we can free up some of those spaces there for
7 the motoring public who are looking for these spaces.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Thank you
10 very much, and I'd like to continue to have the
11 conversation because even at the command level when
12 the commands come up with, you know, traffic
13 mitigation plans, they need the support from your
14 unit and from headquarters.

15 CHIEF CHAN: Uh-huh.

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So if we're looking
17 at parking lots where we can work with owners, where
18 we can get, you know, free spaces or it's a discount
19 something of that nature. I just need our local
20 precincts to be given the support because they don't
21 have the resources to do it at their local level. We
22 need downtown to take care of some of those very
23 challenging issues. Okay, thank you very much, and
24 now we'll have Council Member Lander.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you to the
3 chairs. I feel great gratitude to the agencies and
4 all the advocates for the progress we've made, but in
5 the interest of time I'm going to jump right to my
6 questions. I was very pleased to see the school
7 crossing guard increases that are in the budget that--
8 that Chair Gibson and I especially been pushing in
9 this Council. But as part of that work we had
10 convened a year or so ago NYPD, DOT and Department of
11 Education to talk about the location of guards as
12 well. The new model of supervisors is great,
13 covering uncovered post super, but as far as we could
14 tell, all that data driven work the commissioner
15 spoke about has almost no influence on where they're
16 located, and we had asked that DOT take a look at the
17 most dangerous intersections near schools, compare
18 them to the crossing guard posts and analyze were
19 they in the right places? Are they not in the right
20 places? Should we, you know, how--it's wonderful to
21 have the local knowledge of the commanding officers,
22 and that is important. I don't want to take that
23 away, but it also should be balanced and connected to
24 where are new schools opening, and where are the most
25 dangerous intersections just as this commissioner

1 spoke about. So could you give us an update on
2 whether that has happened, and if not, can we get it
3 to happen?
4

5 CHIEF CHAN: The NYPD certainly is
6 fortunate in identifying and looking at those
7 programs where the people are assigned, and again,
8 quite often it is on a local level at a precinct
9 level where they are in contact with the--the
10 individual schools, the public school where they need
11 school crossing guards, or are they requesting
12 additional crossing guards? But that certainly is
13 being looked at. It is through our patrol services
14 that monitors of our Transportation bureau provides
15 the additional traffic agents to cover when--in the
16 absence. When they're not available, we will cover
17 those locations--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [interposing] So
19 chief--

20 CHIEF CHAN: So we are currently working
21 on that. We are working on that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: But--but it
23 doesn't sound--I mean look you're doing a great job.
24 That's a total non-answer to my question. I asked
25 this publicly in previous hearings. You told me that

1 we would do it privately in the conversations that
2 we've had. I know DOT has the maps and the data.
3 They've done all the analysis the Commissioner
4 discussed, and I'm pretty sure what you just said is
5 we are not consulting DOT's data about dangerous
6 intersections. We're just relying on the local
7 command--precinct commanding officer to locate the
8 crossing guards and, of course, as a local elected
9 official, I want to be able to talk to my precinct
10 commanding officer about where they think they're
11 needed, but it seems very short sighted to me to have
12 no relationship between DOT's data about dangerous
13 intersections and all these safe routes schools and
14 where we're putting the crossing guards. So can you
15 agree to work with them to make sure they're at the
16 right intersections?
17

18 CHIEF CHAN: Absolutely, and--and also we
19 are working within bureaus, and we--the Transportation
20 Bureau is a point--our patrol bureau, which has
21 normally covers our school crossing guards and again,
22 I will touch base with Chief Monahan and also make
23 sure that we are sharing that information with the
24 DOT, and we will get back to you on that also.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: But I'm—I'm
3 asking for not just you sharing your information with
4 DOT, but you're looking at the information.

5 CHIEF CHAN: We will.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: It shouldn't be
7 that hard to cross-reference the crossing guard posts
8 with the DOT data, and see if there are intersections
9 that, you know, it makes more sense to cover, less
10 sense to cover. So you guys will—will do that?

11 CHIEF CHAN: We will do that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Beautiful. Thank
13 you. A conversation I've had with you and Inspector
14 Fulton that I want to appreciate being here, I am
15 also pleased with the resources that are going to go
16 to increased enforcement that you spoke about.
17 Obviously, that is important and reckless driving in
18 addition to all the other work we're doing is
19 critical to achieving Vision Zero. One questions is
20 that what happens when people get those summonses and
21 we have tried, as you know, at Urban Justice Center
22 working with the Center for Court Innovation,
23 Transportation Alternatives, a model of a program
24 that—that assigns people who are—who have those
25 charges to take part in a reckless driver restoration

1 class that has had really good results so far, and I
2 just wonder if you've had a chance to look at that.
3 I know the inspectors in some of those early meetings
4 at the Justice Center, and if now, if we can take a
5 deeper look at whether that program is working, and
6 whether it might be good to explore with the Mayor's
7 Office of Criminal Justice doing it in other things
8 so we are driving even further behavior change out of
9 our enforcement programs in smart ways, but don't
10 just wind up jamming people up, but actually help
11 them change behaviors.
12

13 CHIEF CHAN: Right, thanks Council
14 Member. They do good work over there. I was at the
15 meeting with—where they went over what they do there
16 and it sounds like a great alternative to some of the
17 traditional penalties. They started to work on
18 exactly—I know they do get some cases, the additional
19 cases that need some thought. I mean we've just I
20 know one of these objections was the—the different
21 violations that may go to DMV Traffic Court. The
22 thing with the—because they're a criminal court is
23 that Traffic Court is able to assign different
24 penalties that they would not be able to. So it's
25 just—you're correct they do quality work there, and

1 there may be somewhere where we can send something.
2 We just haven't—we haven't thought of it at this
3 point.
4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And we can follow
6 up to work a little more on exploring how that might
7 be replicated elsewhere, and address some of the
8 questions you're talking about.

9 CHIEF CHAN: Yeah.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
11 much.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank
13 you Council Member now Council Member Miller followed
14 by Council Member Williams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr.
16 Chair, Madam Chair for holding this hearing. It's
17 long but necessary. Thank you to DOT and NYPD and
18 TLC and the rest of the agencies that are here.
19 [sneezing] So bless you, Madam Borough President.
20 So, there is--there's a lot going on here, too, this
21 afternoon, and lot we want to talk about. I didn't
22 hear much about private streets, and--and--and what
23 that looks like. I'm assuming that those are
24 community driveways and so forth that--that I know
25 they--that's a problem that plagued our communities,

1 and the communities that have significant private
2 homeownership, and we are certainly looking for some
3 relief on that. But before we get there, in terms of
4 Intro 911, what makes this data different from the
5 studs—the reporting bills that currently exist as it
6 relates to bicycles throughout the city that DOT is
7 currently required to report finding it? (sic)

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I guess my
10 testimony on Intro 911 is that, you know, you—I know
11 you remember this well, Council Member Miller. A
12 couple of years ago when we had the first right-of-
13 way, like obviously there was a lot of discussion
14 with MTA and the bus drivers about how we improve
15 safety on bus routes. There are a lot of fatalities,
16 and a lot of discussion, and I'm happy to say to I
17 think DOT and MTA formed a very effective
18 partnership. We also worked with union
19 representatives, and undertook a pretty comprehensive
20 study looking at a lot of major bus routes throughout
21 the city, and what we discovered is the crash data on
22 bus routes it sort of matches the crash data at
23 large, which places in the city where we see a lot of
24 crashes of regular vehicles, and that's where we see
25 crashes involving buses, and the—the two agencies I

1 think we've really tolled up our sleeves and worked
2 very, very well together. We've done now 23 major
3 projects. We've started doing a lot of pedestrian
4 enhancements like leading pedestrian intervals on bus
5 routes, and went online to talk a little bit about
6 some of the other particular safety projects that
7 we've done, but I think in the past few years we've
8 become very, very focused on these bus routes.
9

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So-so at it
11 relates to reporting bills are we still collecting
12 the data on the cyclist incidents and accidents
13 throughout the city?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And what makes
16 that different from the cyclist data that we-that-
17 that we're looking for here?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I guess I-I
19 sort of view them as-as one and the same, which is
20 and-and I think we've-I don't know whether we handed
21 it out, but you can see it online our dashboard where
22 we basically look at our fatality and crash data and
23 we slice it many different ways.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, I-I could
25 because this is limited time, one of the-one of the

1
2 problems is that that data is—it is exactly that that
3 it is fatality data, and not—and not collecting data
4 around incidents or accidents that occurred. It was
5 reported in one of my local dailies that those
6 numbers were woefully under-reported by a couple of
7 hundred sometime last year, and—and so how do we get
8 better if, in fact, the numbers that we're—the data
9 that we're looking at is—is not the data that we
10 need. Secondly, in terms of coordination, in terms
11 of left turns and—and so forth, and particularly as
12 it pertains to bike lanes, I spent the better time
13 with two decades in operations and planning for New
14 York City obviously the Transit—the Transit Authority
15 in particular around bus routes, and it—it took
16 forever to get left turns. In fact, if—if we made 25
17 requests over the past 20 years, we might have two of
18 them, right? And I see some on the list. I would
19 hope that now that DOT is involved we can get it—get
20 it done, but my question is about coordination
21 between agencies because my experiences have been
22 that we could—we couldn't agree on where to put a bus
23 stop in the past. Has that coordination improved and
24 what, in fact, are we doing about it?

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well, I'll—I'm
3 going to answer the second question first. I'll
4 about data, and then I'm sure NYPD will want to jump
5 in on that as well. Look, I think it is—it is a work
6 in progress, but I—I am proud I think over the past
7 couple of years and again spurred I think very much
8 obviously by the concerns of bus drivers and the
9 Right-of-Way Act. The two agencies I think have
10 started to work a lot better together having our
11 Borough Pedestrian Safety Action Plans and focusing
12 in on where we're seeing the bus crashes has really
13 helped us target our interventions. I mentioned when
14 in my testimony today a notorious one where you have
15 the Myrtle-Wyckoff-Palmetto Intersection. As you
16 know there we had unfortunately several fatalities
17 involving buses and we've been able I think to really
18 transform that space working hand-in-hand with the
19 MTA. On the data you referenced [bell] fatality data
20 we're able to get pretty instantaneously. Injury
21 data it takes unfortunately a long time because the
22 data goes up to the state. It's processed and then
23 it comes back to us, but I think we try and get the
24 most robust data we possibly can, but NYPD is really

1 at the scene. So maybe I'll turn to them as well on
2 that issue.
3

4 CHIEF CHAN: With the—the reduction in
5 traffic fatalities, we've worked closely with all the
6 agencies and—and it's certainly a model program of
7 that is that when we incidents involving other
8 agencies whether it be MTA buses, whether it be
9 involving the TLC, we will make a notification
10 through our Traffic Management Center so if a—ad
11 collision or a serious major occurs at 2 o'clock in
12 the morning, there will be notifications that will go
13 out to those individual agencies so that they can
14 have a prompt response to those locations. So we are
15 all for having those agencies on the scenes, and they
16 can assist us in our investigations whether with the—
17 with the drivers and all the other agencies that are
18 involved that will help us to make sure that if there
19 is a criminal activity that we—we act on it.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you. So
21 finally, and—and—and that again I just wanted to
22 highlight that the number that we received here at
23 the Council was woefully less. So, finally, I—I
24 distributed this picture here, and this was taken
25 last night. You know, last week. The—the Council

1 passed the Commuter Van legislation that would
2 regulate this—further regulate the industry. The
3 Mayor was supposed to sign off last night, and this
4 was as we left City Hall last night. This quite
5 disturbing because there are no less than—there were
6 no less than 60—50 illegal vans at this location
7 where hundreds, literally thousands of folks pick up
8 the bus every night, and this is in a bus stop, and
9 if you look above, this is in a bus stop that is
10 being photo enforced. And there are six vans sitting
11 there. There is absolutely no enforcement. This is
12 every day. I did a—a walk-through with the NYPD and
13 TLC and DOT. We highlighted this specific area, and
14 everyday this is what it goes to. So it is not only
15 the fact that they are sitting in a bus stop that is
16 supposed to be regulated by a camera, NYPD aren't
17 enforcing. When they enforce, they are giving them
18 parking tickets instead of moving violations for
19 being in—in—in—in the bus lane. And so this is a
20 real problem, and so we are talking about reporting,
21 and we're passing legislation, but if we don't get
22 enforcement, this is—it continues to be a travesty.
23 And let me just add that these illegal vans in
24 Southeast Queens are the number one affront to Vision
25

1 Zero. They are in accidents. They ride up and down
2 unregulated causing and forcing accidents and—and we
3 are doing nothing about it. And this is—can't people
4 will obviously miss.

5
6 CHIEF CHAN: I think that we've done
7 numerous joint operations with TLC during the year,
8 and—and we have identified locations. I just want to
9 make sure that we have this location. We'll take
10 that information, but gain, we—with Commission Joshi
11 last year, we met also with some of the owners
12 identifying different areas of concern because of—of
13 problematic of these vans. They're not licensed.
14 Sometimes even the—the operators whether they are
15 licensed themselves, and certainly they may not be
16 licensed to carry those number of individuals. They
17 are in violation. But nevertheless, we will continue
18 to work closely to do joint operations in any of
19 these identified areas where we have these
20 problematic illegal van services.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Well, I—I would
22 appreciate that at Parsons Boulevard and Archer
23 Avenue, and this is every night so—

24 MADELINE LABADIE: [interposing] And—and
25 if I may add.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you to the
3 Chair and Madam Chair.

4 MADELINE LABADIE: Thank you for bringing
5 this to TLC's attention, and thank you for all of the
6 work you've—you've done with us over the years
7 especially with the commuter vans or formerly just
8 station package. You should know TLC agrees with you
9 that the unlicensed vans are a big problem and a big
10 problem for Vision Zero. In addition to the joint
11 operations we've been doing with NYPD 305 in the last
12 two years. We plan to continue those significant
13 efforts. You know, we have other tools that we're
14 developing to try to enforce against illegal vans.
15 As you may know, years ago we were able to seize
16 unlicensed vans. Due to a court decision, we lost
17 that power. Since then, the agency has been
18 developing other tools we can use to deter this
19 behavior. We've recently begun a program that would
20 enable us to forfeit the vehicle over (sic) to the
21 offender unlicensed van, and we think that it's a
22 very extreme consequence, and we think that as the
23 word gets out that that's something we add code and
24 TLC power to do that would be a very strong deterrent
25 to the unlicensed activity. So we look forward to

1 continuing to work with you, and to these new tools
2 we're developing in order to combat this problem.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member.

7 CHIEF CHAN: Council Member, just to let
8 you know, I did reach out to the Queens Commanding
9 Office at 103 about this location. So I'll follow up
10 with him, and find out what we can do if the problem
11 is not getting solved.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Thank you.
13 I have spoken with Inspector Chapman. May I just add
14 on thing, that camera does not actually exist at that
15 location. There's a lot—the block before and the
16 block after, but there's no actual enforcement camera
17 at that location. So I don't know how it happened. I
18 did—I spoke with Commissioner Garcia about it, and
19 hopefully we can have it fixed since I'm asking.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

21 Before calling on Council Member Williams, I want to
22 reinforce, and I want to bring to your attention
23 that, you know, again because we are in the—in the
24 same—with the same mission that in case all agencies
25 are being expected to by the Mayor to accomplish this

1
2 goal to reduce the number of pedestrians being
3 killed, and dealing with an object that can affect
4 the disability or, you know, a-a driver-the bus
5 drivers who had space and they have to go-- [off
6 mic] No, this is the type of thing that I just hope
7 that we allocating us, you know, right now. And I
8 think that this area that is so obvious in the
9 district where it's happening, that I just hope that,
10 you know, with all the resources and especially with
11 yesterday as we heard from the Mayor saying it is
12 important that we make sure we go to a higher level.
13 And I know you shared the number yesterday on how
14 important-just by numbers being increased in the last
15 two or three years. I just that, you know, with that
16 goal this is something any particular area where
17 there's not just one van, but it's like a number of
18 vans. Like to the TLC I can tell you the front of
19 Tigrass Avenue at 226th, this continued being an area
20 where taxi drivers that they are not properly
21 licensed by the TLC, they are still passing there,
22 and each one has to work. And it's not something
23 that happened, you know, like twice a day. When
24 things like this happen so obvious, I just hope that,
25 you know, now that we have a new president have the

1 real terms from the-from the mayor that we can work
2 together, you know, to go after in the violators that
3 this should be a bus lanes. No one should take it.
4 And, of course, like, you know, I-at the local level
5 I can tell you that some of the bike lanes that I
6 have seen my area Sherman Avenue, you know, what I
7 have seen--and this is something that we need to work
8 together on greatly we can see the local incentive--
9 but it's leaving some of those people in those
10 buildings. They take those garbage cans and they use
11 the bike lane, and I have taken-I have been taking
12 photos. So I can share the date and rest, and you
13 can go. Like, you know, this is happening. Each
14 lane has one, and I think that-I hope that we, you
15 know, can continue sharing this information, and go
16 after those people that they don't respect the bike
17 lane or they don't respect the bus lane either.
18 Thank you. Council Member Williams.

19
20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, Mr.
21 Chair and Madam Chair, and Madam Chair for this
22 hearing. First, thank you Commissioner Trottenberg,
23 and Deputy Russo. Thank you to Commissioner Joshi
24 for all the work you did on the dollar vans. It's
25 much appreciated. I only have five minutes and I

1 appreciate the leniency yes, but Commissioner, I'm
2 sorry the Chair has been giving, but I want to try to
3 get through it. But one, just again, thank you for
4 the dollar vans. I just want to back up what my
5 colleagues have been saying. We just need
6 enforcement on them, and Chief Chan I mean I know
7 there are some joint enforcement that occurs between
8 you and TLC. It's not enough. I know for a fact
9 that TLC can't do it by themselves. I myself
10 actually had to jump in a few years ago to try to
11 help a TLC officer who was being daily—he was by a
12 bunch of dollar van drives. And so I do know that
13 they have to do this with the Police Department for
14 it to be effective, which I guess since we lost the
15 power for—at some point to take a look a vans, we've
16 seen a spike in illegal behavior. I'm glad that we
17 have that power back again, but we have to have it.
18 We want it and the support of the industry. The van
19 drivers themselves want it, but please step up the
20 enforcement. On Kings Highway, Commissioner, there's
21 a huge problem. We've done some—some work that's
22 been. I've had a left turn signal put in on Foster,
23 and you did some great work, and the roundabout on
24 Kings Highway we had a fatality for a young lady and
25

1 the time of her life on Kings Highway and Ocean, and
2 we almost lost someone who was run over by a school
3 bus and on Kings Highway and Avenue M, and this is a
4 hard strip. It is a combination of new devices—
5 needed new devices and pedestrians also being
6 cautious when they're crossing, but we have to look
7 into that. It's a—I do want to say it chief grade
8 above, Commissioner is very good, and a club that is
9 always very responsive. I want to make sure that I
10 shout them out. But my main focus, and it's a
11 comment that I want to finish, but my main focus is
12 on Vision Zero. I'm—I'm interested in the speeding
13 some of this. First, what is the average speed of
14 the accidents that occur that there have been
15 fatalities? [pause]

17 CHIEF CHAN: Yes, we don't—they don't
18 always get the speed at the location. It takes
19 certain things whether it be skid marks or different
20 technical things that they do at the scene, but
21 there's not always an indication of what the speed
22 was. So there is no—we don't have the average speed
23 at the—

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Do you have any
25 data at all?

1
2 CHIEF CHAN: We can—I can get back to on
3 like we can tell you how many instances that they
4 recorded the speed.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, I would
6 like to—I would like to know that. I—I believe in
7 Vision Zero except having brought the speed limit to
8 25. I think it was unnecessary. I think we could
9 have done all of the enforcement. I think it's the
10 enforcement mechanisms that have been helping. I
11 think dropping it to 25 was problem because it's very
12 difficult to drive at 25 miles an hour in some places
13 and, of course, everybody gets hit with those
14 speeding—speeding tickets, which are costly for a lot
15 of families, and if we don't need to have it at 25,
16 we shouldn't have it at 25. I see, though, we've had
17 an increase in summonses, which I assume has come
18 with the increase funding stream. Do we know how
19 much funds and I'll—we'll have—how much funds are we
20 now collecting as opposed to what we were collecting
21 before the change?

22 CHIEF CHAN: In terms of moving
23 violations, I—I think the City actually loses money
24 in terms of issuing the summons because the
25 surcharges go to New York State. Our officers have—

1 are taken off the patrol when they go to Traffic
2 Court. But I want to backtrack to the answer that
3 you mentioned in your reference to speed of-average
4 vehicle speed in terms of fatalities. CIS when they
5 conduct these investigations and certainly they have
6 the capability with the newer cars to look at the
7 black boxes. They also look for skid marks, but if
8 it rains there are no skid marks, and then also the
9 amount of damage on the vehicle. Base on that damage
10 if it's two vehicle colliding they could--there's
11 formulas for figuring out, estimating the amount of
12 speed. But I think that we--each case is going to be
13 on a case-by-case basis, and the--the vehicle speeds
14 where pedestrians and--and on the street there may not
15 always be a situation where we are going to be able
16 to find out the--the speed of the vehicle at the time
17 of the collision, alright. Because what happened is
18 that in the black boxes it will get that information
19 when we have the--the air bags in place, and that will
20 be something that--that the box in the vehicle will
21 record that type of information. So again, but we'll
22 take a look at that and I'll ask our CIF people to
23 see if we can get you that answer.
24

25 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And I do have, Council Member, if you want to have the revenue data for speed cameras, red light cameras and bus lane cameras.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]
Yes.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I can share it with you now or afterwards.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Well, I guess afterwards--

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --because I'm running out of time, but it's important to note I do feel that my constituents and possibly myself have been inundated with these since those cameras were put into place, and I don't think the speeding portion. At 25 I know it's not at 35, but I'm not sure that is the case of some of these, and so I would like to see the data to make sure that that is the cause. I think as I mentioned lowering it to 30 or 35 I think would have been fine, and I think the enforcement that we're doing is the problem, and--and that's about 25 miles an hour, and I think many of my

1 constituents feel the same way. If I may, I would
2 love to see that data, but if I may just in my last
3 point I've mentioned my issues with the SBS lanes
4 publicly, privately. I'm still waiting for data to
5 know how much time is being saved when these SBS
6 lanes go into it. Particularly on Ocean Avenue I've
7 been told somewhere about 10% or so, which amounts
8 roughly to 12 minutes. I don't think that's worth
9 the exchange of the bottleneck of cars that happen
10 during rush hour particularly in certain areas where
11 there's no enforcement on the lane that's supposed to
12 be open. Getting an extra 12 minutes I'm not sure
13 it's worth it. I've consistently asked how are
14 gauging accessible lanes? And if it's not
15 successful, how are we going to reverse it? Again,
16 with those lights for some reason we believe it worth
17 \$115 to be in that SBS lane and only \$50 to run a red
18 light. This doesn't make sense. I think some of it
19 is a revenue grab, and my constituents are really
20 suffering. So I want to make sure there is some kind
21 of balance on that.

22
23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'd-I'd like
24 to just take a second to answer some of your-and-and
25 for the record, those-the different fine amounts, the

1 bus lanes versus the speeding is done at the State
2 level. I—I think we don't disagree that, you know,
3 that the sort of how the sums are arrived at. It
4 doesn't necessarily make sense. I actually think
5 speeding is a worse violation than being in the bus
6 lane. So, unfortunately that's not something the
7 city controls. I would just say on the speed limit,
8 you know, studies have shown that speeding is one of
9 the biggest factors in terms of what makes the crash
10 fatal or—or cause a serious injury, and we have seen
11 with out speed cameras—and—and I know nobody likes to
12 get a ticket, but what we've seen is generally where
13 we put in a camera, over time we see a decline of
14 summonses. We see a decline usually by 50%, and we
15 typically see that the vast majority of people who
16 get one ticket don't get a second. For what it's
17 worth. I'm happy again to share the numbers with you
18 and talk about—we're going to be doing some things to
19 a bill the Council passed at the Senate, Council
20 Member Lander's bill, a big study of our SBS routes
21 and looking at, you know, what constitutes success,
22 and how the data looks. So we will be working on
23 that.
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. Mr.
3 Chair, just one second for the-- I agree that
4 speeding is an issue. Of course, speeding is defined
5 by where you set the mark. My understanding is 40
6 miles per hour is where you're least likely to
7 survive a crash, which is why we had at I believe 30
8 or 35 before, and I'm saying at 25 I don't think it
9 is necessarily saving lives. I know it's a feel good
10 thing. So I want to get data that 25 is, in fact,
11 saving lives as oppose to 30 or 35, and that's where--
12 that's where my dispute is.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, one-one
14 argument we did make when we--when we go the speed
15 limit change up in Albany is actually you even see
16 dropping from 30 to 25 that the--if there is a crash
17 that the likelihood of a fatality is reduced by 50%.
18 But look, I understand. I mean at--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]
20 So at 25 to 20 we'll probably be seeing a 20 to 15.
21 We're probably seeing it lower. (sic)

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
23 Well, look there's--there's we--we--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]
25 Thank you.

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: --I think we
3 negotiated up in Albany a speed that the city, our
4 elected officials up there and the advocates thought
5 was a--was a speed that enabled drivers to get where
6 they were going, but made the streets safer. And I
7 think over the past couple of years, we've--we've seen
8 that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Well, thank
10 you. I'd love to see hopefully the--the response in
11 time of--of safety. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And--and as I
13 have said before, Council Member Williams, you know,
14 one of my best friends that I have here at that
15 Council I can say that I said before I think that you
16 were here, 50 years ago I would never have the same
17 level of consciousness that I have today when it
18 comes to slowing down to get to the place safe and
19 save lives. I think that, you know, as someone who
20 is so--that's so committed, you know, for the public
21 of everyone, and--and I think that it is important for
22 all to continue understanding that only 1.5 million
23 New Yorkers own cars to a total of 1.8 million cars.
24 More than 6 million New Yorkers are relying on buses,
25 bikes and water taxis and trains, and at the end of

1 the day if we have to go to 20, if the state would
2 allow to go to 20, I would say we should go to 20.
3 We were not able to go there because we were not
4 allowed to but, you know, like all those victims that
5 we have and when we look at the eyes of all those
6 members or their families have stayed with the other
7 children that we've been losing. As a person of
8 faith, not because of that, but they're choosing for
9 them. But yes, because someone, you know, wanted to
10 go so fast, and—and I think that it is important that
11 we continue working in that direction. I think one
12 concern that I have especially to Chief Chan when it
13 comes to collecting of data, receiving one, I have a
14 relative of mine—Maria Rodriguez who was a victim,
15 and she was on Fourth Avenue and 204 Street. That
16 case happened like a year and a half ago. When she
17 was hit by the car she was taken to Harlem Hospital
18 in critical condition like for the moment, but then
19 she was able to articulate and staying home. And all
20 her—most of the organs were disfigured. She passed
21 away a year after. That happened because of hit and
22 run, but I don't think that the law that we have
23 right now mandate the NYPD to collect the numbers and
24 to include that number so that someone that was hit
25

1 by a car going to the hospital in critical condition
2 living for a year and then dying. So that was just
3 for me another number that we have in 2015, but we
4 are—it's not part of the 29 that we have documented.
5 I think that's, you know, I have that concern of how
6 are we following all of those cases? So she went
7 into the hospital. Maria-Maria Rodriguez by any
8 typical sayings of hit and run, but then later on
9 that person dies, and I don't think that it's in the
10 database of an individual.

12 CHIEF CHAN: We—we get a notification on
13 those types of jobs I think what you described is the
14 person was in critical condition. So we wouldn't
15 have taken any police accident report, and then what
16 happens is we will get a subsequent notification if
17 the person dies a week or a year, as you described
18 later from the Medical Examiner's Office, and it
19 would—it would count on our numbers, and we can look
20 into it.

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And I—I would
22 emphasize you will sometimes see that a fatality
23 number from a previous year will suddenly go up, and
24 that will often be the case, but someone who even—
25 they were injured in the crash, but it didn't—they

1 didn't die for a year or two afterwards. We will get
2 that data, and change our numbers even if it's a
3 couple of years later.

4
5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] [on
6 mic] -if it's all from the legislative body that, you
7 know, we look at those particular cases to see what
8 is the part in the census (sic) up there. My-my
9 other thing on the-on the hit and run is like the
10 last-first of all, have, you know, this epidemic is
11 too much. Like, I don't think and I don't know if
12 you have the data. It's probably like less than 5% of
13 drivers who were involved in hit and run that we are
14 able count. Like the vast majority of those drivers
15 like they are driving somewhere. Here they go to
16 another state, and I know that this is important to
17 the Administration. Of course, we are working on
18 legislation that what if the new thing that we can
19 expect from the NYPD and you'll see more technology
20 on working with the DA that we can say no, and we
21 shared yesterday.

22 CHIEF CHAN: One of-Councilman, one of
23 the things that we see is that we believe that, and
24 we're going to target DWIs, Driving While
25 Intoxicated. We think that people who are driving

1 and that's a certainly the situation on Mueller's Bay
2 itself. People were drinking, did party and they—and
3 they were involved in a collision. They said well
4 the police are going to arrive. I'm going to be
5 arrested for DWI. So they are going to leave. So we
6 are certainly looking to increase our enforcement.
7 We arrested 8,400 people for a DUI last year an
8 increase of 3%. We also think that people who are—
9 have suspended licenses they're likely to leave the
10 scene also because, you know, my license is
11 suspended. I didn't answer any of those summonses
12 so, therefore, I'm going to take off because I'm
13 going to be arrested if I'm—when the police show up.
14 So we are targeting those individuals and that's not
15 only before Vision Zero. Last year we locked up
16 almost 2,700 people—no, 27,000 people for 511 in that
17 area. In terms of the CIS, and I mentioned earlier,
18 we are looking and we're touching base with our—the
19 Fire Department and EMS on that issue where we're
20 going to expand someone leaving the scene. Collision
21 where we have people who are—who are injured,
22 possibly right now that we may not have responded
23 when they were simply unconscious, and with those we
24 will add to the workload of the CIS teams, and I'm
25

1 looking to certainly expand our CIS personnel,
2 investigators in that area. We are also working, and
3 this year with patrol to identify locations, which
4 had body shops and also windshield places that make
5 repairs, and—and with that survey get information,
6 and some will cooperate, some will not, but if they
7 give us and share information like email information
8 of that nature, we may very well send out an email
9 blast that we're looking for a blue Honda with
10 windshield damage and things of that nature. That
11 will help us in—in targeting people who are leaving
12 the scene, have damage to their vehicle, and now
13 they're looking to repair it and things of that
14 nature. So we are going along that line certainly
15 the education. The legislative is certainly part of
16 it, but I think that targeting people who are drunk
17 drivers, targeting people who have suspended license,
18 because there—there—there is a high probability that
19 they're going to leave because they know that they
20 are—they cannot be behind the wheel when they're—when
21 they're driving and especially if they're involved in
22 a collision.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And what—what
25 about those the last, and again whatever you can

1 share. I know that there is investigation right, but
2 we and I know how important it is because we deserve
3 to know the issues, especially victim of Ms. Claudine
4 in the last year, that DJ call that, you know, that
5 there was some arrests, and this year the DA didn't
6 want to do the impact (sic). At the beginning, you
7 know, the driver was arrested, but later on he was
8 let go. The investigation continued and as I said
9 before, I know I need that experience of your
10 graduate in the Bronx two years that it took like
11 last year that I showed the image, two years ago
12 where they caught fire. They put the image of the
13 drivers putting car on fire two after-two hours after
14 the hit and run, and I was involved in that crazy
15 because a good friend of mine, too, and-and, you
16 know, it took like three years for the DA to notice a
17 deal, two or three years with that particular driver
18 that only 400 bikers see you. So, and-and I know
19 that many of the things could be related to the move
20 that we had at the state level. So what is, you know,
21 what can-and I was going to start, whatever-but
22 whatever you could share that we can use to help to
23 those-to that particular familiar because there was
24 an arrest read that, you know, that it can confident

1 that NYPD that the DA did an investigation and that
2 we're going after that one deeply respected case.
3
4 (sic)

5 CHIEF CHAN: I will reach out to the
6 commanding officer of the CIS unit and I'll get any
7 additional updates for later. I don't want to give
8 you information that's not totally updated, and so we
9 will reach out to you after the public hearing.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Chairman.

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much,
12 Chair Rodriguez. Just a few more questions before we
13 continue with the hearing. I know we have other
14 panelists behind you, and thank you again for being
15 here and for the work you're doing. I just wanted to
16 ask very quickly I understand—is there a new
17 initiative that the city has to provide some sort of
18 reflectors to seniors so that they're able to be more
19 visible at night through using, you know, canes and
20 wheelchairs and other mobile devices. Is that the
21 case? And can you expand on that little bit. I just
22 heard it in the wind.

23 CHIEF CHAN: On that I believe there was
24 article in the Daily News that indicated that I been
25 interviewed. We had during the year 2016 we

1 certainly identified that our seniors are more
2 vulnerable. They are 13% of the population.
3 Sometimes they—they are up to 50% of our fatalities
4 because they—they don't as quickly through the
5 intersection, and we thought that it was important,
6 and we do have many tools out there. Just the
7 bicyclists who wear helmets to prevent injury if
8 they're slow moving and they're carrying canes, which
9 then that's probably going to mean that they are
10 probably moving a little bit slower than the average
11 person crossing the—the intersection or if they're
12 using a walker or they're pushing. So, we
13 requisition and use some of our funds to purchase
14 reflective equipment and—and—and we will visit with
15 our Community Affairs Officer to the senior centers,
16 and we're all there playing Backgammon or they're
17 Mahjong or whatever games we will actually apply that
18 material on their walker and the—most of them—some of
19 them are silver latex, and it blends right in there.
20 It's nothing that will—but when the lights from the
21 headlight hits it, it makes them more visible. And
22 again, that's not a guarantee. We will continue to
23 do our enforcement and—and identify locations, and
24 part of this year's strategy and last year is that
25

1 we're reaching out to seniors going to those 220-over
2 200 locations, senior centers where they--where they
3 live, where they shop, doing traffic intel reports on
4 lighting, recommendations for LPIs, pavement markings
5 anything that will help and protect our seniors and
6 also identifying certainly, of course, that we share
7 this information where the pedestrian injuries and
8 fatalities are occurring because we know that this is
9 a vulnerable population, and we need to do more to
10 try to protect them and to help them. And again,
11 having those items reflected material on their--their
12 walkers and canes certainly will not hurt them in any
13 way. They will certainly help them.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

16 CHIEF CHAN: So again, it's just a
17 proactive measure that the Police Department had done
18 has done.

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, I understand
20 and I--I certainly think, you know, it's important as
21 you said to emphasize. It's not a replacement, but
22 it's a compliment the work we're doing, and it's an
23 additional safety feature. Have we already starting
24 implementing the reflectors is this bill--?

25

1
2 CHIEF CHAN: We've been doing that
3 through 2016.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

5 CHIEF CHAN: Approximately three months
6 ago we distributed additional—we actually had police
7 officers that went out on their own and purchased
8 some of this material during last year in 2016. So,
9 the latter part of the—of 2016 we received shipment
10 and we sent out--every borough has a supply of this
11 so that our Community Affairs Officer or our Traffic
12 Safety Team. My preference is Community Affairs
13 Officers. They—they can go there. They can do the
14 education alone and DOT is coming out with a
15 phenomenal video for seniors and things of that
16 nature to help protect themselves, but our seniors
17 sometimes need to be reminded. My mother and father
18 needed to be told more than once because sometimes
19 they would forget some of these things. So we want
20 to continue the message, and revisit them because
21 they are a vulnerable population.

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, I appreciate
23 that because I know many of us work directly with DOT
24 through the Education Campaign. I visited schools,
25 seniors centers. So we work with DFTA and a lot of

1 our providers of our senior centers and NORCs to
2 provide the education. I mean the challenge is we
3 live in a city where people just don't have patience.
4 When I think at any given time we will all become a
5 senior and we desire to get to senior years, and I
6 think about my mom, you know, who takes my nephew to
7 school every morning, and has to travel the streets,
8 and even in the evening picking him up after school.
9 So I certainly want to do everything possible to make
10 sure that everyone, but especially seniors who have
11 lived, you know, longevity and we appreciate that
12 and, you know, we're grateful, but if we can do
13 anything possible to continue to allow them to be
14 safe and for everyone to have patience as they cross
15 the street that will be a great thing.

17 CHIEF CHAN: I think that article was
18 seen by Commissioner Calise from the Disabilities--

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

20 CHIEF CHAN: --and he's--he's reached out
21 to us. He says, well about this reflector thing?
22 How can we be--

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] Okay.

24 CHIEF CHAN: --involved in that. So
25 again, I think that that will help, and it certainly

1 could not hurt, but again, it's not a replacement for
2 enforcement and education.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, great, and
5 then moving into the new budget season will the
6 Transit unit in NYPD be looking for any further
7 resources around technology? I mean some of the
8 measures you've received funding for in the recently
9 adopted budget is that something you're going to be
10 looking towards as well, or are we at a place where,
11 we don't need more?

12 CHIEF CHAN: We'll--

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [interposing] I know
14 you can never say you never need more.

15 CHIEF CHAN: It will always be you can
16 use more, but what happened is that technology when
17 we first testified here at City Council we were still
18 working on an antiquated system called TAMS and--and
19 built back in the '70s utilizing forms. Deputy
20 Commission Tisch we--we now have in--we're inputting
21 the Police Accident reports into the system, and we
22 have better ability to analyze this information.
23 It's much faster. It's--it's connected to our main
24 awareness system, our traffic stats. So eventually
25 in 2017, they are going to have the ability to input

1 the location of the summonses that are written so
2 that we can identify this is where the injuries are
3 occurring, and again decision policing data driven
4 and we can identify where are our summonses are being
5 written at those locations. Because right now we—we
6 still rely on our personnel to—to identify counts of
7 how many summonses we issued at this intersection and
8 things of that nature. We're moving ahead with the
9 additional information and traffic information like
10 Google and Ways. These are apps that are out and
11 available. Certainly that will help identify
12 locations that are problematic to move traffic
13 throughout the city if there's construction, is there
14 an accident those apps, too, will also tell you where
15 the police are doing enforcement, and things of that
16 nature. So technology is certainly helping us do our
17 job, and the—the—the vision for the additional
18 equipment, to light our equipment. They have also
19 added the veritable message signs. We asked for
20 additional five veritable message signs. There again
21 DOT has been just fantastic giving us the data.
22 We've been talking about it since—since last year the
23 left turns. Left turns three times as likely to
24 cause an injury to a pedestrian as opposed to a right
25

1 turn, but the turns in general are more problematic
2 for vehicles, and that's the message. You'll see
3 best (sic) signs throughout Manhattan, and we are now
4 getting the outer boroughs to also place them at
5 locations. If we can get every driver to know that
6 when you're making a turn whether it be a left and
7 left is more problematic because of the seat, the bar
8 that blocks your view. And that vehicles do make
9 turns faster, and speed is a factor that when they
10 make turns faster than five miles an hour that
11 there's a probability or the possibility of injuring.
12 So again, with the traffic calming devices that are
13 being placed on the roadways it's slowing these
14 vehicles down, and we can get our motorists. We're
15 handing out flyers telling them that left turns are
16 very problematic and we wait for them. While they're
17 in the left turning lane, we have our auxiliaries
18 handing out flyers, and we've printed over 150,000 of
19 those flyers. We've been handing that out since
20 December or November of last year. So we're going to
21 work and get that message to all New Yorkers who
22 drive.

23
24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, and—and I also
25 want to just go back quickly to the reflectors

1 because I know they're—once the article hit I was
2 getting a couple of inquiries where, you know,
3 seniors felt like we were, you know, putting them out
4 there. And, you know, not that they necessarily felt
5 like, you know, they were being targeted, but I want
6 to make sure. You know, obviously the—the messaging
7 is really important on this measure and, you know,
8 obviously safety is the most important and essential
9 goal, but, you know, I don't want seniors to feel
10 like we're, you know, targeting them or we're putting
11 them out there with these reflectors. So now you'll
12 see seniors in, you know, wheelchairs and—and walkers
13 and using canes, and then the reflectors are just all
14 over the place. So I just, you know, want to make
15 that clear and, you know, really ask your—your unit
16 because you guys are doing this to make sure that
17 that's emphasized and we're not, you know, targeting
18 seniors. Okay. I just wanted to make sure. I have
19 to give the senior centers all the time. So I just
20 want to make sure. Okay, great, and then I guess my
21 final question is Vision Zero moving year four, the
22 investments that we're making. Great work. I saw in
23 the testimony Grand Concourse a lot of improvements.
24 I represent most of the Grand Concourse in CB4 and 5.

1 So I'm very, very grateful. All of the mechanisms we
2 put in place have been very helpful. The countdown
3 cross that are real time 35 seconds and more where
4 you can really get across a six-lane street is great.
5 Some of the more pedestrian plazas with defined
6 crosswalks so you actually stand in a crosswalk and
7 feel safe like at 165 in the Concourse by the Bronx
8 Museum has been great. I've seen a lot of the work
9 being done. I just want to expand on that a little
10 bit because some residents have come to me at
11 community boards because they see the countdown
12 crosswalks on major thoroughfares like the major
13 streets where you have a lot of vehicle and foot
14 traffic, but they don't necessarily see it in some of
15 the more residential neighborhoods. So you get off
16 the train at Jerome Avenue, and go west into High
17 Bridge or into Morris Heights in my district. You
18 don't really see it or like a Burnside Avenue or a
19 Davidson Avenue. So, I'd like to see or know in the
20 future as you expand on the countdown signals is that
21 something you're looking to do? I don't know it's
22 strategically done between the engineering team, but,
23 you know, I'd love to see that. And then also I know
24 with this additional funding we're going to expedite
25

1 the process of filling up those potholes that we
2 don't want to see in our streets. Lighting is so
3 important, and I've talked to the Bronx team and
4 they're great. They get my calls all the time
5 because residents not only need to, you know, feel
6 safe, but they need to see more lighting, and some of
7 the lighting under the train on Jerome Avenue where
8 we have elevated trains is not lit enough. I have
9 the distinction along with Council Member Rodriguez
10 we have these wonderful step streets that no one
11 outside Northern Manhattan and the Bronx know about
12 because they're all population in my district, but
13 they're heavily used. And it's DOT, Parks and
14 Sanitation. Wonderful. The lighting belongs to DOT.
15 Those are the things that I—I certainly when the
16 requests come into DOT I certainly need, you know,
17 obviously priority is great. Sometimes the timing
18 has not always been great. We've had to wait for the
19 season. You know, I understand, but, you know, the
20 people need the lighting, and, you know, from a
21 public safety perspective I've had some pockets in
22 the district where there have been car break-ins, and
23 the local precinct has come in with more foot patrol,
24 but then also they've installed their own lights,
25

1 which is great because the longer term plan from DOT
2 is lighting, but it's no necessarily a short-term
3 infusion. So what I'd love to know is with the new
4 funds we're getting through Vision Zero for this year
5 or can we see, you know, these inquiries being
6 expedited where you talk about these quality of life
7 matters that really are important to everyday
8 residents that have to travel? You know, and I say
9 that because the Bronx is very unique. I'm
10 surrounded by highways and trucks everywhere and step
11 streets and hills. You can't see the hill until you
12 get to the top of it. You can't see what's below you
13 until you get to the bottom. So that to me is very
14 concerning because I-I can't stop residents from
15 traveling other ways because obviously it's a much
16 longer distance, and if they come off the train, they
17 can take the step street and go home. So, could you
18 please give me a little bit of insight as it relates
19 to what the future of Vision Zero will look like in
20 some of these initiatives?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Sure, and—and
23 certainly with the new resources that the—that we
24 have gotten in this budget, and we're grateful to the
25 Mayor for that, and we'll be working with the Council

1 on that. We are going to continue I think the
2 aggressive pace, and as you're heard we're doing more
3 and more with leading pedestrian intervals, and I
4 think the kind of things you're mentioning. Lighting
5 I agree it's a very big issues. It's very important
6 in the Bronx particularly where you have so much
7 basically overhead elevated structures, subway
8 structures, highways. We're keenly aware that your
9 borough probably most of all really needs good
10 lighting. We are going to be coming in this year, as
11 you know, with LED lighting, which will do a lot to
12 brighten the borough, and by the way, working closely
13 with local elected officials with their particular
14 corridors you want us to prioritize. We're also
15 trying to work more closely with the MTA and Parks on
16 additional lighting under elevated structures. I
17 think actually to come and sit down with you and
18 we'll have some talk about particular locations.

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, great and then
21 I think, you know, DOT, NYPD you guys are all a part
22 of the neighborhood re-zonings and the Jerome plan,
23 which is coming underway. Obviously the district I
24 represent will get more attention because of that.
25 Some of the streetscaping and we've already made

1 significant changes. One of my colleagues talked
2 about narrow streets. Yes, I have them and you know
3 what they're two-way streets, and not all of these
4 narrow streets need to be two-way any more. So I—I
5 certainly, you know, respect and appreciate and
6 encourage us to look at 2017 and how we travel
7 through our streets. I—I guess my final question,
8 and I don't know that it's ever been addressed, but
9 we have defined truck routes in the city of New York.
10 How often do we look at truck routes, and how could
11 we go about maybe modifications based on increased
12 population and density of residential? So I live
13 near the Major Deegan, and I also live near the
14 Cross-Bronx Expressway 95, and all the traffic coming
15 in and out of Jersey comes through my district. When
16 the highway gets backed up, you know what they do?
17 They take the side street, which is a residential
18 street, and they're allowed to do that. I don't
19 necessarily agree with that, but I'd love to see, you
20 know, what we can do about the assigned truck routes,
21 and how we make modifications based on 2017
22 population and, you know, demographics in our city.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We're happy
25 to—happy to talk to you more about that.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay, thank you very
3 much. Great. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So thank you and
5 before you leave, of course, I would like to as we
6 know that we are working in that collaboration that
7 we all were able to come together with the car-free
8 days for the system. The number showed that more
9 than 30,000 additional New Yorkers use mass
10 transportation. We were—we were able to pool that
11 together with the leadership of DOT, DCAS and every
12 and—and I hope that again that for April—Saturday,
13 April 22 this year we can be able to put it out.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: I—I think
15 we're meet—our teams are meeting next week, Mr.
16 Chairman, to—to make Car-Free Day even better for
17 this coming year.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank
19 you and thank you—thank you again, and now we will
20 have our—our Manhattan Borough President who has been
21 very patient. I'm sorry for all the delay. She will
22 join us, and share her testimony. We can take two
23 minutes. [pause] [background comments, pause]

24 GALE BREWER: Good afternoon. I'm Gale
25 Brewer, Manhattan Borough President. I'm here with

1 David Dodge from our office. I'm glad to be here.
2
3 You should just know that a member of our staff a
4 couple of weeks ago was crossing the street at 72nd
5 and Central Park West and was hit by a car exactly
6 what the individuals who spoke on the agencies' left
7 turn going north, left turn. The car was—tried to
8 get away, and to the credit of the individuals in the
9 neighborhood they ran after the car and stopped it,
10 and it was a woman from Newark, New Jersey who
11 doesn't seem to know the difference between the brake
12 and the accelerator. So luckily the individual who
13 worked for me is okay. He went to the hospital, but
14 it happens only too frequently. So I in addition to
15 debating the merits of the package of bills before
16 the committee, today I also understand the purpose of
17 the hearing is to report on both the progress and
18 tools of Vision Zero. The successes are clear. Many
19 traffic safety members have improved, and in 2015 the
20 City recorded its lowest number of deaths since 1910.
21 Preliminary statistics show that the number dropped
22 even further in 2015, as you know. Our rate of
23 traffic deaths is a quarter of the national rate, and
24 with the Mayor's impressive show of support for
25 Vision Zero find—funding—finding—funding new totals

1
2 \$1.6 billion through 2021, it was just the beginning
3 of the improvements. However, there's room for
4 improvement. The bills today if passed will help.
5 Intro 4-542 and 671 sponsored by Chair Rodriguez and
6 Council Member Vallone respectively will do so by
7 creating new traffic calming measures at
8 intersections that needs them such as senior center
9 locations, parks and schools. Other major-other
10 measures such as Intro 1230 sponsored by Council
11 Member Deutsch would call for more robust data
12 collection with respect to vehicle injuries and
13 fatalities helping ensure Vision Zero remains data
14 driven. Very important. These and similar measures
15 will help continue to make Vision Zero a success a
16 success. Another area that needs additional focus is
17 the one Chair Rodriguez has helped highlight in
18 recent weeks. That's that hit and run collision. We
19 have all seen the news reports. 2017 has just begun,
20 and we have witnessed multiple tragic hit and runs.
21 This is not unfortunately a new phenomenon. While we
22 have yet to see statistics reported for 2016, which
23 in and of itself is a problem, the hit and run
24 figures we have from 2015 are far from encouraging.
25 Apparently there were 38,000 hit and runs that year

1 just in New York City. With Chair Rodriguez's
2 proposal to create a reward fund could help us live
3 up to the Mayor's Vision Zero commitment.
4 Accompanying legislation requiring that hit and run
5 crashes be reported regularly by NYPD would likewise
6 keep the program data driven. We must also work to
7 increase the speed at which certain vision zero
8 improvements are deployed around the city. Last
9 year, for instance, the city committed to installing
10 10 miles of protected bike lanes per year, which
11 seems insignificant—insignificant in light of the
12 \$1.6 billion Vision Zero investments. I'm greatly
13 encouraged that the Mayor has increased funding for
14 bike lanes for the coming fiscal year from \$245,000
15 to \$690,000, and hope that the increase will result
16 in protected bike lanes in areas of Manhattan that
17 need them such as Fifth and Seventh Avenues and Sixth
18 Avenue north of 33rd Street. I also just want to
19 mention in terms of data I want to commend the Taxi
20 and Limousine Commission. I've been on many
21 hackathons and panels regarding that data, and it is
22 very impressive for the City of New York. It is the
23 most impressive in the world. And I also want to
24 just mention in terms of safety issues something that
25

1
2 I note because as a council member I was underground,
3 and as the borough president I'm above ground driving
4 in a car. I had no idea what goes on on the street,
5 but the red light cameras, which didn't come up, are
6 a state issue, as certainly the former Assembly
7 Member knows, but they are—would—they would take care
8 of many challenges. Every single car seems to go
9 through a red light. So that issue of red light
10 cameras would capture a lot of people and maybe slow
11 down their speed where they seem to have to go
12 through red lights. It's totally illegal. Lastly,
13 Vision Zero is also lacking in its accessibility
14 upgrades for New Yorkers with disabilities. Something
15 that I've championed for a long time. The city has
16 been diligently installing curb cuts that didn't
17 exist before. Thanks to a 2002 settlement that
18 forced the Department of Transportation to bring the
19 city's corners up to ADA standards. Still 14 years
20 later, however, we have yet to see 100% of the city's
21 curb cuts full installed. A canvass organized by my
22 office several years ago located 142 missing curb
23 cuts just on Broadway. ADA-compliant pedestrian
24 ramps may not be noticeable—an accomplishment to the
25 average New Yorker or a sleek new separated bike

1 path. They know those bike paths. However, they are
2 just as important the curb cuts as the street safety
3 measure particularly for New Yorkers with
4 disabilities, and I just want to also add the whole
5 issue of trying to get signals for people who are
6 blind. We all know that DOT as we heard from the
7 Commissioner is committed to installing the LPIs,
8 which are the lead pedestrian intervals as we have
9 here at 1 Center and Chambers, and I believe that
10 three times as many LPIs were installed last year
11 2016 as there were in 2004, as an example, and I know
12 that we passed the bill. I certainly helped with it
13 for accessible pedestrian signals to go from 25,
14 which was my original bill, to 100, and that is
15 supposed to be every single year. However, where
16 there's an LPI installed, we should also have an APS,
17 and that is not being done in the way in which I
18 think it should be done. I just want to add that for
19 those who are disabled. Overall, we have much to be
20 proud of in our streets. We are demonstrating safer
21 thanks to all of you and to Vision Zero. We must
22 continue proposing and implementing innovative ideas
23 that work such as those being discussed today as we
24 need to achieve a future with more traffic-less
25

1 traffic and injuries and fatalities. Goodness knows.
2 Thank you very much, and this has been an excellent
3 hearing, and as you know, I love listening. Thank
4 you very much to both committee chairs.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
7 Manhattan Borough President. I have a question.
8 Like it was—we have a scourge again our district when
9 it comes to—and I'll to the Commissioner for the DOT
10 and the Administration. The fact that we have many
11 intersections that only give 15 second for
12 pedestrians to cross. Is that something you have seen
13 in other areas of Manhattan?

14 GALE BREWER: Yes, I mean the—yes, even
15 when sometimes DOT has tried to assess the situation
16 and there are X number of seconds that are added to
17 the crossing, you still get complaints. Yes, I think
18 this balanced—I'm not an engineer—between adding
19 seconds so that seniors are able to cross and getting
20 the traffic to move, and that's an ongoing balance,
21 but I do think it always needs to be restructured,
22 and, of course, we're going to have many more seniors
23 in the very near future, and that's another reason to
24 perhaps keep looking at it. The senior population is
25 growing tremendously. Unfortunately for me. [laughs]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Chairman, do you
3 want to go? No. Thank you.

4 GALE BREWER: Thank you very much.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So our next panel
6 will Julia Kites, Transportation Alternatives;
7 Michael Connor from the Sharp Center; Jennie Eve, and
8 Eric McClure. [pause]

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We will put a
10 [off mic]-[on mic] So, you know I should think that
11 you can read that in the two minutes. If not, please
12 summarize. Thank you.

13 JULIA KITE: Thank you Committee Chairs
14 Rodriguez and Gibson for calling this hearing. My
15 name is Julia Kite and I'm the Policy and Research
16 Manager of Transportation Alternatives, New York
17 City's 44-year-old membership organization dedicated
18 to walking, biking, and safer streets. We would like
19 to express our gratitude to the DOT, NYPD and TLC for
20 their hard work in keeping Vision Zero visible, and
21 very physical job, very intensive and a balancing act
22 among many parties. I will summarize our statements
23 on Vision Zero of our testimony in support several of
24 today's bills. This is in the written version. With
25 brevity today, I will just talk about Vision Zero.

1 We're greatly encouraged by the Mayor's announcement
2 in is Preliminary Budget that \$317 million will be
3 allocated for new street safety reconstruction
4 projects. These are investments in saving the lives
5 of New Yorkers, and we look forward to working city
6 agencies on delivering safer streets. So let us be
7 clear, Vision Zero is working. New York City can be
8 proud of another year in which traffic deaths
9 declined to record lows. Those who say Vision Zero
10 is a mere marketing slogan or a cash grab are ill-
11 informed at best. However, when it comes to the
12 benefits of Vision Zero policies, it is not working
13 fast enough, and it is not reaching every part of the
14 city. It is not enough that New York City bucks the
15 national trend towards increasing traffic fatalities.
16 Our streets different from the rest of the country,
17 and our city is like nowhere else. Our goals when
18 adopted by only a handful of cities that have in
19 common the will to embrace a goal that others think
20 is impossible, and with this bold goal comes the need
21 for bold action. We are sure that the additional
22 funding allocated for Vision Zero in the Preliminary
23 Budget will help reduce—reduce deaths and injuries
24 and street redesign are comprehensive are
25

1 comprehensive, thorough and pedestrian focused.
2
3 Arguably, the biggest factor in reducing road deaths
4 is to start with Vision Zero has been the 25 mile per
5 hour speed limit. This is a gutsy far reaching
6 action, and we need more of those. The best place
7 now to focus some major investment in Vision Zero
8 would in infrastructure making roads by design. A
9 recent poll conducted by Penn Shoen and Berland on
10 behalf of Transportation Alternatives showed 94% of
11 New Yorkers support infrastructure investment to fix
12 dangerous streets. A few individual interventions
13 while undeniably helpful lacks the transformative
14 power of a full redesign along complete streets
15 principles. Transportation Alternatives recently
16 published the Vision Zero street design standards to
17 show arterial roads across the city can be
18 transformed using tools already in the DOT's Street
19 Design Manual. And while it is still very early in
20 the year we've noticed clustering and fatalities.
21 Two pedestrians have been killed Nostrand Avenue
22 within less than two blocks of each other. A
23 pedestrian and cyclist were killed in close proximity
24 on Avenue X and Boston Road in the Bronx has also bee
25 the site of two deaths. These are priority

1 corridors. Their dangers already known, and what
2 they need are fixes now. The necessity to
3 redesigning the street quickly and efficiently was
4 made even more clear by the December ruling of New
5 York City State Court Appeals, the highest court in
6 the state *Di Toro v. City of New York*. The court
7 found the city could be held 40% liable for a crash
8 in which a 12-year-old boy was hit and severely
9 injured by a speeding driver on a stretch of
10 Garretson Avenue that was know to be dangerous, which
11 had not received a sufficient speeding study or
12 intervention to calm the traffic. This case makes
13 both the financial argument and legal basis for
14 redesigning streets to be safer. Finally, we applaud
15 the DOT for the progress made in 2016 with regard to
16 expansion of the bike network. Unfortunately, 2016
17 was also a year in which cyclist fatalities increased
18 showing that we need even more work on protected bike
19 lanes in parts of the city that have not yet reached
20 them. And we would also call up on the DOT to
21 override objections that are opposed to safe street
22 design solely on the basis of losing parking. Vision
23 Zero gives the DOT a mandate to use their expertise
24 to make streets safer, and we are confident that we
25

1 use it. I know our Vision Zero goals cannot be
2 expected to be achieved overnight, and there is not
3 just one solution to make streets safer, there are
4 many, and the good news is that the city has tools
5 and the expertise to make Vision Zero happen. I
6 know that we agreed this is something we must
7 achieve, and fortunately we can achieve it. Thank
8 you very much.

10 HINDY SCHACHTER: Thank you. I Hindy
11 Schachter. I'm on the Steering Committee of Families
12 for Safe Streets, and I'm an activist for
13 Transportation Alternatives. I'm a live-long New
14 York City resident. I'm a motorist, I'm a cyclist
15 and I'm a pedestrian, and in all those roles I see
16 the need for street redesign. The city has already
17 designated hundreds of streets as Vision Zero
18 priority locations. It has said these streets need
19 redesign. Now is the time to provide that resign. I
20 started cycling the streets of Manhattan in the 1970s
21 with my husband Irving. These were the days before
22 bike lanes, before share the road signs. Drives
23 would roll down their windows and they would yell at
24 us, "Get off the street. You belong on the
25 sidewalk." Things have changed. We joined

1 Transportation Alternatives because we knew that we
2 could work to make a safer New York. We now have
3 bike lanes. Not enough. Certainly not enough
4 protected bike lanes, but some. We have Share the
5 Road signs. Now, we need to go to the next step. We
6 need street redesign. My husband Irving was also
7 life-long resident of New York City. He was a car
8 driver, an outstanding amateur cyclist in his prime,
9 and a pedestrian. On August 3, 2014, he was doing an
10 18-mile run in Central Park in preparation for his
11 second New York marathon. He was almost at the end
12 of his run when a 17-year-old cyclist veered out of
13 the cyclist lane at speed into the pedestrian only
14 lane collided with Irving and in a moment it was all
15 over. It was the end of a life that was still full
16 of athletic accomplishment. How do we understand
17 this tragedy and how do we prevent further tragedies.
18 One way is we can fixate on the character flaws of
19 the 17-year-old cyclist, and there's some usefulness
20 in that. It reminds us that this crash was not an
21 accident. The cyclist deliberately if wrong-headedly
22 went into the pedestrian only lane, but fixating on
23 character flaws is not going to solve the problem.
24 The problem is only going to be solved by street
25

1
2 redesign and strict enforcement of the laws we have,
3 and the laws we should have to limit speed. In my
4 husband's memory I am here today to ask the Council
5 to disburse money so that we can get on with the
6 business of redesigning streets. The people I am
7 primarily talking to, the Chairs of the Committees,
8 you're on our side. You want safe streets. Well,
9 you're the people who have the power to start
10 bringing this about. We need money to design
11 streets. We need to do it now. No more waiting.
12 Waiting only means more tragedy. 2017 is the year to
13 nail it. The only speed we need is speed in City
14 Council disbursement of money. Quickly get it in the
15 right hands so that we can start redesigning arterial
16 avenues, and recreational places. Senior centers and
17 the streets around the elementary and early childhood
18 facilities. Everyone deserves safe streets. It's in
19 your hands to provide the resources that will make
20 our streets safer. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

22 HINDY SCHACHTER: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] - [on
24 mic] -all money in this project, and I know the
25 Council last year because we always have to continue

1 to identify all the course of revenue to continue the
2 designing the intersection, but I believe that we are
3 starting in a good year when it comes to putting more
4 resources for redesigning those intersections and
5 fixing them.
6

7 JANEY HALL: Thank you. Hi, my name is
8 Janey Hall and thank you for listening to me speak.
9 There's very little that can prepare for the first
10 few minutes that your body gets hit by a speeding
11 car, but actually a car didn't hit me. It hit a
12 large heavy bag down the side of my body and some of
13 my organs. Had it hit those body parts I may not be
14 here today. Still be in the hospital because maybe
15 my three weeks in December weren't enough or maybe
16 I'd be somewhere underground covered by dirt. My
17 life would have been over that night. My family
18 would have planned my funeral. My friends would have
19 come, but everyone involved except for me, out to
20 grieve because I wouldn't have been ready to go. On
21 Wednesday, November 30th, 2016, just eight weeks ago
22 I was hit by a car that sped away leaving me in the
23 middle of the street on Staten Island. I fell,
24 though, when he hit my bag, 15 feet back onto my head.
25 My hip is bleeding deep five-inch bruises I've never

1 seen before down the side of my head throughout my
2 body and both my legs. My shoes were missing, my
3 socks were bloody. I got onto my three broken bones
4 unable to crawl back to the sidewalk as traffic
5 approached. Also unable to get his license plate that
6 stared me in the face for two seconds, and I couldn't
7 get it. If I had died that night this conversation
8 would be—still be the same, though, because many
9 people, thousands of people in New York have died
10 this way. I have just met their families. Proven
11 ways to deter these hits like altering hits via
12 speeding, impaired or distracted driving, all choices
13 that people make, proven ways that have dropped
14 speeding incidents by 50% where they've been
15 installed still need implementing in New York to
16 prevent nights like mine from happening again. Most
17 people know of hit and runs from 10-second voiceovers
18 in the news because they're fatal. But the pain
19 lasts well beyond 10 seconds for many victims because
20 the first week in the trauma unit where nurses—nurses
21 roll you onto your broken bones on both sides at 3:00
22 a.m. Beyond the teeth chattering animalistic pain
23 that lasts for hours after they put a hard bed pan
24 beneath your shattered bones. A bed pan, if you
25

1 haven't used one, is a large plastic device that you
2 use in your 30s, and you cannot go to the bathroom by
3 yourself. You can't sit up and you can't stand up
4 and you can't get into wheelchair to go to the
5 bathroom five feet away. The pain lasts beyond the
6 weeks in intensive rehab where you learn to walk
7 again with tears on the floor and you are terrified
8 of going outside or doing things you loved. When two
9 months later you are a shell of who you used to be,
10 and when eat dinner alone in a hospital gown for the
11 holiday season. And you're constantly living of your
12 hit and those first few hours in the ER screaming,
13 gasping, panting crying for hours and hours. I saw
14 you in the paper. I'm sorry for your accident. It
15 was hit and run. Someone chose to be distracted and
16 impaired reckless with speed so it wasn't an
17 accident. When people think of speeding, they think
18 of the dreadful—the dreadful drag race screeches they
19 hear in the distance from the bedrooms at night, and
20 they hope nothing is in their way because they would
21 never survive. What speeding really is, is a car
22 that just goes too fast. There's no engine revving,
23 no Indy—Indy 500 acceleration. It just goes too fast
24 to stop and too hard to prevent killing or injuring
25

1 the person in their way. It's a car that's trying to
2 beat the red light. So it turns too fast to see the
3 person in the sidewalk, in the crosswalk carrying a
4 huge bag on her left side filled with heavy boots and
5 magazines. A basic rule of economics is that people
6 seek to make themselves better off, and that means
7 making more money sitting time, but also not breaking
8 the law because they don't want crimes and prison,
9 and they don't like prison. Avoiding breaking the
10 law even going 15 minutes above the speed limit will
11 only happen if a law is widely known to be enforced.
12 That's a statistically proven way that prevents night
13 like crimes like mine that rob you of months and
14 years of your life are still on the speeding cameras.
15 One thing we do in the tack industry where I used to
16 work at Lincoln is to scale what has the most impact
17 using as few efficient resources as possible. Speed
18 cameras can do that, save time, money and be
19 effective. They are not a constant loop. They will
20 only capture a speed of a car when it exceeds the
21 known limit by 10--at least 10 miles per hour. Each
22 shot is evaluated before issuing a \$50 ticket without
23 touching the points a license. Tickets are
24 contentious, but so are thousands of statistically
25

1
2 preventable injuries every month. The aftermath is
3 long and ugly. Entities you thought should care
4 don't. So you have to fight from your hospital bed
5 or from the funeral homes. But remind us please of
6 those who can care. So I since I wonder my dad just
7 missed me, and he wants to see me again. I was
8 rushed to the hospital where he passed away years
9 ago. This hit was always his worst nightmare even in
10 his last day. But it's not just like one speeding
11 again. He notes, I have so much unfulfilled and my
12 family wouldn't deserve that. So he let me live.
13 I'm asking you with the power in your hands to care,
14 and to do the same for the next person who will be
15 hit by a car in New York and to let them live. Thank
16 you. [pause]

17 MARK O'CONNOR: Good afternoon Chairs
18 Gibson and Rodriguez and thank you very much for your
19 leadership in Vision Zero. My name is Mark O'Connor.
20 I am with Transportation Alternatives, and you would
21 think that testimony, stories like Janey's here today
22 should be enough to bring about the changes that we
23 need, but unfortunately they happen far too often.
24 I'm here today also representing Mr. Allen Sned who
25 was supposed to testify today, but he was called into

1 work this morning, and he lived in the Bronx. Just
2 this December his daughter was struck in a hit and
3 run in the Bronx, and while she was in the
4 hospital, in the ICU being treated for among other
5 things her pelvis being broken and fractured in seven
6 different places, after having cared for her in the
7 hospital, he contacted the local precinct office to
8 get the collision investigation report. And he when
9 he got on the phone the very first time was asked was
10 essentially hung up on. The second time he called he
11 was told that because he was not the victim, he could
12 not gain access to the collision report. And so
13 Council Member Deutsch's Intro 1280 speaks to gaining
14 access, easy access to the collision report for
15 families who are victims. We strongly urge the
16 legislation to be expanded to expand the interested
17 person definition to include family members. Ms.
18 Alice Snead was finally able to get the collision
19 report after he contacted a friend of his who was a
20 judge, and who helped get it for him. But while your
21 family member is in the ICU, or even after your
22 family member has ceased, you should be able to
23 access the collision investigation report. It has
24 important information that can help in insurance
25

1 claims and other things. To add to this and to
2 illustrate how horrible and important it is to have
3 access to the collision report, the collision and the
4 investigation report when Mr. Snead first saw it,
5 showed that the hit and run driver actually stayed on
6 the scene. He contacted the police precinct, showed
7 them the video of the scene showing the driver
8 leaving, and they then changed the collision report
9 to indicate that it was a hit and run. The last
10 thing I just want to say quickly is about these
11 changes that we are all seeking, and highlight a poll
12 that was commissioned recently by Transportation
13 Alternatives and release that Penn Shoen and Berland
14 showing overwhelming support among New Yorkers, and
15 not for overwhelming support for speed safety
16 measures. 94% infrastructure change is supportable.
17 (sic) When we ask New Yorkers whether they will
18 support these measures even at the expense of a few
19 parking places or less space for vehicles, the
20 support remains overwhelmingly strong, and finally I
21 just want to address the—what was raised earlier
22 about it being difficult to drive at 25 miles per
23 hour. I am sure I speak for most advocates, and—and
24 based upon facts of speed is the easiest speed to
25

1 drive is 30 miles per hour. The highest speed that
2 you go the more fatal it is. And speed cameras do
3 work, and speed kills, and condoning higher speed
4 limits of 40 miles per hour is tantamount to
5 condoning violence in other forms. And New Yorkers
6 overwhelmingly support these changes. Thank you.

8 ERIC MCCLURE: Good afternoon. My name
9 is Eric McClure. I'm the Executive Director of
10 StreetsPAC. On behalf of my colleagues, I'd like to
11 thank the Chairs for holding this oversight hearing
12 today on Vision Zero. We were heartened by the news
13 this week that Mayor de Blasio plans to budget an
14 additional \$400 million for Vision Zero. The City
15 Council's call last year for more funding for Vision
16 Zero we know that played a role in the Mayor's
17 decision. Thank you both for your continued advocacy
18 and the advocacy of the colleagues as well for
19 increased investments in safe streets. This
20 additional funding is critical because our ability to
21 achieve Vision Zero lies first and foremost in
22 redesigning our streets. Vision Zero is predicated
23 on the fact that people make mistakes, but those
24 mistakes should not cost someone a limb or worse his
25 or her life. The margin for human error must be part

1 of the equation whether that error is on the part of
2 the people using our streets or those whose job it is
3 to enforce the laws governing it. People on foot and
4 on bikes and behind steering wheels are fallible and
5 police can't be everywhere all the time. Street
6 design must mitigate human fallibility, and this plan
7 budget increase will help do that. It's not enough
8 to accomplish all that we need to do, but it moves us
9 in the right direction, and we count on the City
10 Council to continue to push the Mayor to invest in
11 life saving street redesign. I recently had the
12 privilege to speak with a group of 11th graders at
13 the York Early College Academy in Jamaica, which is
14 in Council Member Miller's district. An incredibly
15 diverse school whose students were deeply concerned
16 about the safety of the streets around their school.
17 One of the first questions they asked me was about
18 automated enforcement, and they were frankly
19 incredulous with very good reason. The deployment of
20 speed and red light cameras was tightly controlled by
21 Albany. They were further dumbstruck that the city
22 only has the right to deploy 140 speed cameras and
23 150 red light cameras in total throughout the five
24 boroughs. They quickly realized that these talking
25

1 (sic) members make it highly unlikely that they could
2 get even one camera placed near their schools on
3 dangerous Merrick Boulevard, which we could see a
4 literal stone's throw away from the classroom window.
5 I certainly didn't relish playing the part of Debbie
6 Downer when they had invited me there to help tackle
7 their safety concerns. I share this anecdote to
8 underscore how important it is to move forward
9 quickly with those things that the City can control
10 especially the redesign of unsafe streets. And if
11 the Governor, Assembly Speaker and Senate Leader are
12 listening we urge them in the strongest possible
13 terms to heed those kids' voices and empower New York
14 City to deploy automated enforcement technology in
15 whatever it deems appropriate. Lastly, in regard to
16 the specific pieces of legislation before the
17 committee today, StreetsPAC is broadly supportive of
18 initiatives to implement traffic calming devices in
19 proximity to senior centers and Naturally Occurring
20 Retirement Community-Retirement Communities to
21 install countdown clocks adjacent to schools and
22 parks, improve safety along bus routes, create safe
23 routes to schools, actions plans, improve reporting
24 on crash related injuries and fatalities and to make
25

1 crash reports more easily accessible. We would urge
2 the Council to use its power to monitor the operation
3 and performance of the Department of Transportation
4 and the NYPD in these matters to advance the
5 initiatives outlined in those various intros, which
6 we believe are largely embraced by the agencies,
7 implementing life saving infrastructure and
8 facilitating the sharing of information [bell] should
9 be goals we can all agree on and act upon with or
10 without legislation. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks to
13 everyone and we will—we are so committed to continue
14 working under the leadership of the Borough Families
15 for Safer Streets and those partners for your loved
16 one that you had lost to prevent for other people not
17 to go through that same situation. And I know
18 Transportation Center you are the ones that have been
19 leading, and we are here to say we are a partner with
20 you. And before the Chairwoman calls the next panel,
21 since we already have one from our team from DOT
22 sitting here, and I forgot to highlight it to the
23 agency when they were here to the rest of it, other
24 members, you know, I live in Inwood. I have two
25 daughters that go Riverdale. They go to the west

1 side. They go to the east side for programming for
2 my daughters. So one particular thing that I have
3 noticed especially Fifth Avenue between 86th and 85th
4 when you enter into the Central Park if that—that
5 lane is only for a bus lane going down from 86th to
6 85th and then entering into the park. However,
7 drivers also have to—have a right the light to get
8 into Central Park at 85th. So drivers they are
9 forced to get into the bus lane even though it's
10 painted only as a bus lane, and those who are
11 entering into the second lane, you know, first of all
12 it's not safe for neither the drivers or the
13 pedestrians. Because when people cross on
14 north/south 85th, then drivers also is entering into
15 Central Park from the second lane because the bus
16 lane is not supposed to be for driver. You can look
17 at that particular Fifth Avenue between 86th and 85th,
18 I think it's not safe for none, neither pedestrians,
19 cyclists or drivers. Thank you all.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you guys for
22 joining us, and thank you for sharing your story, and
23 I'm not sure if there is still a representative here
24 from the NYPD, but certainly since Mr. Snead had
25 issues with the 5-2, I'm definitely going to reach

1 out to the commanding officer. Like I don't want to
2 hear that local officers that are answering the phone
3 are—are blatantly rude to customers and to residents.
4 That's not acceptable. So I will reach out to the 5-
5 2. I know the Commanding Officer. [pause] We've
6 also been joined by Council Member Robert Cornegy,
7 and our next panel is Christine Rosette from Check
8 Peds. We have Barry Campbell from the Fortune
9 Society, Joanna Smith, 829 President, and Alec Slatky
10 from AAA Northeast. Are you still here? And we also
11 have been joined by Council Member Ritchie Torres.
12 [background comments, pause]. Thank you very much.
13 You can begin.

14
15 KRISTEN BERTET: Thank you Chairs of both
16 committees. Thank you for hearing us today, and we
17 are very pleased that you have the oversight of
18 Vision Zero, such an important-- My name is Kristen
19 Bertet (sp?), I'm Co-Founder of Check Peds, an
20 pedestrian coalition on the West Side of Manhattan,
21 and in our district last year, the pedestrians
22 fatalities have increased 300%, six instead of two
23 over 2013. This is not in my testimony. This is on
24 the side, and none of the pedestrian-most vendors
25 locations were fixed, and so we are a little

1
2 concerned about the speed at which the--Vision Zero
3 is being implemented. I can understand that other
4 things are happening in other districts, but we are
5 really suffering from the--the lack of speed of
6 implementation. So we are delighted by the new
7 budget. We applaud the introduction of this batch of
8 legislation to improve safety with the following
9 suggestion: On Intro 911, which recommends the study
10 of bus routes and installation of traffic cameraing,
11 no one wants to see a bus driver taken a way in
12 cuffs, and no one wants those injuries and
13 fatalities. Based on our study of the hundred of bus
14 routes, most of the priorities sectioned in the
15 Vision Zero Pedestrian Action Plan happen to be the
16 same as those where buses make a turn, and I have
17 attached pictures of that study in your testimony.
18 So this bill is going to do double duty by addressing
19 the most dangerous intersection for the public at
20 large and for the bus drivers. So we are very much
21 in favor of that. But while we are pleased that the
22 language specifically highlights best practices for
23 were designed allowing left turns to be made only on
24 a green left power signal. We encourage the
25 committee to strengthen this language and

1 specifically recommend that a red arrow signal
2 protected as free crossing. We request that only
3 proven remedies and not experimental measure be
4 relied upon for addressing such life and death
5 situations. You'll see the picture of some of those
6 experimental remedies, and we really do not believe
7 that they are very effective. And the last sentence
8 should be amended to say that if no measure or only
9 experimental measures are implemented then you would
10 want to review of that. The Intro 116 recommends
11 that NYPD improve its reporting of crashes. We are
12 very much in favor of this measure, but it would be
13 impractically of reporting the turn-turning movements
14 on crashes. We wish the contributing factor where
15 properly reported only today only a very small
16 portion of crashes are coded with a contributing
17 factor that makes any sense. And thus this
18 information is not meaningful. [bell] Finally, to
19 conclude I-I am really concerned that I-what I heard
20 today is that this experimental treatment on left
21 turn lanes provided a 24% improvement in safety when,
22 in fact, that practice pre-phases provides 50 to 77%.
23 I believe that the DOT should really give us the
24 highest safety possible at intersections and not, you
25

1 know, short change us on the safety. Thank you so
2 much.
3

4 JOANNA ALTMAN-SMITH: Good afternoon.

5 I'm Joanna Altman-Smith. I'm a longtime safe street
6 advocate, and I am so excited by the new budget that
7 has been presented. I really hope that it moves
8 forward, and please let us know what the advocacy
9 community can do to help make that a reality. I'm
10 also really interested in this vast raft of proposed
11 legislation we're looking at today. There are so
12 many great ideas, and I think there's a lot of
13 potential that the things we're looking at today are
14 going to save a lot of lives. So, you know, it's-it's
15 a really great time to see so much forward movement
16 when we have so much else to worry about in the
17 world. I have a couple of additional comments and
18 suggestions on some specific pieces we're looking at
19 today that I would just like to float in the room.
20 One is that Introduction 671, which is intended to
21 increase the number of pedestrian countdown clocks
22 adjacent to schools and parks, and I am concerned
23 that it's woefully inadequate given the current
24 number of parks and schools in New York City. We
25 have 1,700 parks, 1,800 public schools, around 1,000

1 private and religious schools, and if we're talking
2 about getting serious about protecting these students
3 we need to be looking at lot more than adding 100 per
4 year. This is one of DOT's most flexible and cost-
5 effective and very swift interventions that they can
6 take this reprogramming of pedestrian signals. And
7 so I'd encourage us to be even more aggressive in
8 asking them to install many, many more than 100 a
9 year. Also, while they're at it, I would hope they
10 would be doing quick studies on whether LPIs are also
11 feasible at these locations because LPIs are also
12 very easy to implement and are proven to save lives.
13 Introduction 1257 will go a long ways towards DOT
14 more accountable for providing safe routes to school
15 for our children. But if we are serious about really
16 improving this program, the reporting should happen
17 on an annual basis, not every two years. All the
18 current and upcoming DOT street redesign improvement
19 that we are now see in the budget and will in place
20 for as well as NYPD's increased enforcement are going
21 to change the dynamics of our streets and have major
22 impacts, and I believe that they should be studied on
23 a more regular basis so that we can apply our limited
24 resources to the locations that need them the most.
25

1 Introduction 1311 could be expanded to
2 include not only NYPD and FDNY, but to develop a more
3 tax based solution that would get this information
4 pushed out to citizens and private emergency response
5 systems that we have in place in the city. This
6 technology already exists, and I think DOT is
7 responsible for getting this information to everyone.
8 And then just a quick mention on Intro 975, which it
9 seems logical to remove all non-utilized utility
10 poles, but I would like to encourage the committee to
11 look at the possibility of leaving those that are in
12 strategic locations where we have high vehicular and
13 high pedestrian traffic because anywhere on the
14 street that you can provide hard infrastructure to
15 protect people from the all too often occurrence of
16 curb jumping drivers is, you know, it's an added
17 benefit. Even though the pole may not be serving its
18 original purpose, until we can really redesign all
19 our streets to make sure that bike lanes and
20 sidewalks are fully protected, I think some of these
21 poles on a case-by-case basis may actually serve the
22 public good. Thank you.

24 ALEC SLATKY: Good afternoon. Yeah, it's
25 afternoon. My name is Alec Slatky. I'm here

1 representing Triple A Northeast, which shows a
2 membership of over 570,000 residents of the City of
3 New York, 5.2 million region wide. I want to thank
4 the chairs for holding this hearing, and for sticking
5 around. I'm—I just want to comment not on any
6 particular bills but a—a few different issues related
7 to the Vision Zero. One has to do—I just want to
8 bring to your attention, one has to do with
9 allocating enforcement resources. Then the state
10 just passed a law that was supported by NYPD that
11 would fold in tinted windows into motor vehicle
12 inspections, and over 75,000 tinted window tickets
13 were issued in the City of New York in 2016, and I
14 know tinted windows is not just about traffic safety.
15 It's about officer safety. It certainly does help
16 with enforcing distracted driving violations, and—and
17 I don't know just how many of those tickets are
18 ancillary, right. So if they'd get pulled for
19 another violation, and they also get a tinted window
20 ticket. But to the extent that they are single
21 tinted window tickets, I want to make sure that those
22 man hours are now folded into continued traffic
23 enforcement and not disbursed among general police
24 enforcement. I mean it—the tinted window enforcement
25

1 varies based on different precincts. I mean for
2 example the 67th Precinct issued nearly a quarter of
3 all of its summonses for tinted windows. So we want
4 to make sure those—that that time is put back into
5 traffic safety. One thing we—we would like to see is
6 more seat belt enforcement. Over the past four years
7 we've seen a 41% decrease in the number of safety
8 belt summonses, but preliminary DMV estimates show
9 that 42 unrestrained vehicle occupants were killed in
10 New York City between 2015 and 16 compared with 31
11 between 2013 and 14, and last year more than half of
12 the motor vehicle occupants killed in crashes were
13 not wearing their seat belts. So, we want to make
14 sure that is paid attention to. Open data for moving
15 violations is my next issue, and I'm pleased to hear
16 that the NYPD is looking to move towards that—towards
17 using GPS data, because looking at the precinct level
18 data raises some interesting questions. I was taking
19 a look at the data really for every precinct, and
20 just one example. The 90th Precinct gives out 951
21 tickets for driving the wrong way on a one-way street
22 in 2016. The next closest was 194 tickets in the
23 year. What's happening is that the, you know, the
24 intersection of Morgan and Knickerbocker Avenue the
25

1 first time I went there almost drove the wrong way.
2 We can learn from that see where DOT can make
3 changes, and I just want to make one more point about
4 hit and runs. I know that's been a-a focus of yours
5 Chairman Rodriguez, and I have some data here about
6 when they occur and that they've actually been-
7 they've declined since 2010, but looking at the rate
8 of I guess arrests, it is different in New York City
9 than it is in the rest of the state with the same
10 laws. Over the past five years 210 hit and run fatal
11 crashes occurred in the City of New York, and only
12 16% of those resulted in an arrests. Outside New
13 York but in the rest of the state there were about
14 the same number of fata hit and run crashes, but 31%
15 resulted in an arrest. That's almost double the
16 number. So any effort that we can do to make sure
17 that we're not only cracking down on the drivers
18 before that are most likely to flee the scene, drunk,
19 impaired, drugs, unlicensed, but also making sure
20 that we after them using whatever innovative methods
21 we have to. I think that would be a great idea.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank
24 you and probably also we should find ways of how with
25 your partnership we can work the insurance company to

1
2 provide also some incentive for those drivers who are
3 the responsible ones. You know, so let's continue--

4 ALEC SLATKY: [interposing] Sure

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and I-in
6 conversation with being a great partner also--

7 ALEC SLATKY: Okay, yeah.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --with many others
9 in the city. With that from my end, we're coming to
10 the end and we'll hear from the Chairwoman Gibson,
11 but I would like to advantage to invite also
12 everyone, the public for our next hearing, which is
13 going to be February. It's going be dedicated to
14 both and oversight how the MTA been doing when it
15 comes especially to our train stations. As we have
16 the approach of Vision Zero today, some very good
17 accomplishments, but also addressing the areas on how
18 we can do better. Also the February hearing on the
19 train station also is motivated for the same reasons,
20 how good are we doing on renovating train stations
21 that what can we learn for those that have been doing
22 well to continue improving. So I encourage also
23 anyone in the city, my colleagues involving community
24 boards like they know about any particular train
25 station that we should highlight when we have a

1 hearing with the MTA to please share that
2 information. Chairwoman, please.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much,
5 and thank you to all the last panel for your work,
6 your advocacy, your commitment, and certainly helpful
7 suggestions on what we can do to further advance and
8 strengthen legislation that we put forth. And
9 certainly the investments we're making, the funding
10 will make a significant difference, and I appreciate,
11 you know, your positions. I appreciate the work you
12 do, your organizations that you represent, and we
13 look forward to working with you. Thank you for
14 being here, and certainly I want to thank my co-chair
15 and colleague. This has been a few hours since we
16 started 10 o'clock this morning, but I think when you
17 look at Vision Zero in year 4, we have made
18 tremendous progress. We are nowhere near perfect,
19 nor are we complacent. We know that much work
20 remains to be done, but I firmly believe as long as
21 we continue to focus on education, and enforcement
22 and outreach in technology, we will continue to drive
23 these numbers down. The personal stories that we've
24 heard today are heartbreaking. When you hear about
25 individuals that have been victims that could have

1 lost their lives, and for some reason they remain
2 here, and—and God has kept them here and we're
3 grateful for that. But we know for many, many
4 families across this city their tears will never
5 stop, but if we use those stories and those
6 testimonies as our catalyst for change, we will
7 continue to make the necessary reforms that are
8 needed. I want to thank all of our colleagues who
9 are here, and certainly the prime sponsors of all of
10 the legislation that's been put forth, to the members
11 of the Transportation Committee and Public Safety.
12 Thank you. Thank you to our Manhattan Borough
13 President, to all of the agencies, NYPD, DOT, TLC and
14 DCAS who were here, all of the staff that remain and
15 members of the public. Thank you to the sergeant-at-
16 arms for providing the necessary safety and security
17 that we need to run a hearing as smoothly as
18 possible, and thanks to our staffs for working so
19 hard to put this hearing together. We look forward
20 to having more dialogue, more conversation on Vision
21 Zero in year 4, and we encourage all of our residents
22 and constituents out there if you have inquiries and
23 suggestions for your Council Members, for your local
24 community boards, please come forward. We don't see
25

3 everything, and we cannot be everywhere, but we know
4 that everyone is a part of the conversation. So
5 please join the local community board, attend
6 meetings. Make sure your voice is heard so that we
7 ultimately have safe streets for every New Yorker in
8 this city. So thank you once again. Thank to my
9 chair for all of your work every single day to
10 achieve Vision Zero across the city. Looking forward
11 to more of that. Thanks.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

213

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

214

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 9, 2017