

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND  
WORKER PROTECTIONS

----- X

May 6, 2025

Start: 10:18 a.m.

Recess: 5:01 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Julie Menin,  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Public Advocate Jumaane Williams  
Shaun Abreu  
Gale A. Brewer  
Carmen De La Rosa  
Amanda Farias  
Shekar Krishnan  
Sandy Nurse  
Chi A. Ossè  
Pierina Sanchez  
Julie Won

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Joshua Goodman  
Deputy Commissioner, Public Affairs & Customer  
Experience, DSNY

Haris Khan  
Chief of Staff, SBS

Carlos Ortiz  
Deputy Commissioner for External Affairs, DCWP

Corinne Schiff: Deputy Commissioner for  
Environmental Health, DOHMH

Eric Mosher  
IBO

Alaina Turnquist  
IBO

Matt Shapiro  
SVP

Carina Kaufman-Gutierrez  
SVP

Mohamed Attia  
SVP

Calvin Baker  
SVP

Cleotilde Juarez

Erin Piscopink  
Co-Chair, NYC BID Association

Barbara Blair  
Garment District

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Evan Sweet  
Meatpacking

Nelson Eusebio  
National Supermarket Assoc.

Scott Foletta  
NDS

James Gonzalez  
La Fonda

Adrian Cepeda  
Worlds Borough Bookstore

Juan Nunez  
NWBCCC

Shamier Settle  
IRI

Noah Sheroff  
Bayside - QNS

Brian McGinn  
Bryant Park/34th Street

Dan Scorse  
Hudson Yards/Hells Kitchen

Eliana Jaramillo  
Make the Road

Angel Flores  
Make the Road

Jose Sanchez

Luz Uruchima

Lisa Soren

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Bronx Chamber

Jessica Walker  
Manhattan Chamber

Betsy Mark  
Queens Community Board

Pedro Goico  
National Supermarket Association

Nick Aquino  
VOLS

Dylan Dellisanti  
Institute for Justice

Balanda Joachim  
ANHD

Nishat Tabassum  
Make the Road

Elsa Saraceni  
Voces

Salvador Quintana  
Voces

Juliana Salas  
Voces

Jimmy Hernandez  
Voces

Leidys Bueno  
Voces

Lilia Gomez

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Brenda Irizarry  
NWBX Community and Clergy

Maryam Shuaib

Pamela Franco Larg  
Chinese American Planning Council

Joshua Boom  
JFREJ

Calvin Harrison  
SVP

Kele Nkhereanye

Magdy Elobky

Waleed Salama

Xhang Jie

Yun Lin

Helen Fang

Ni Jin Fang

MD Rahman

Julie Torres Moskovitz

Nick Gulotta

Abram Moritz

Evelia Cayotzi

Xiomara Reges

Vicente Veintimilla

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Guadalupe Sosa

Shuai Hui Zhen

Shuang

Ngai Kwan Lian

Yu Chaohang

Roselia Alvarez

Margarita Armenta

Jessica Quintero

Teresa Carpio

Andrew Gustafson

Flor Caballero

Lola Siguencia

Ana

Tiffany Hervas

Marlene Ensaldo

Lucia Maldonado

Jennifer Salgado

Mohamed Awad

Ana Villa

Mahmoud Zaed

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Leeane G-Bowley

Jackson Chabot

Mouhel Ahmed

Christopher Leon Johnson

Sandra Jaquez  
NYS Latino Group

Bill Bruno  
Mind Spring

Justin Pollack

Rob Martinez

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 8

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Sound check for the Committee  
3 on Consumer and Worker Protections. Today's date is  
4 May 6, 2025 being reported by Danny Huang at the  
5 Council Chambers.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet down please. Good  
7 morning and welcome to today's New York City Council  
8 hearing for the Committee on Consumer and Worker  
9 Protection. At this time that I ask that you please  
10 silence all electronic devices and at no time are you  
11 to approach the dais.

12 If you would like to sign up for in person  
13 testimony or have any other questions throughout the  
14 hearing, please see one of the Sergeant at Arms.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
16 [00:00:40]- [00:01:23].

17 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
18 [00:01:26]- [00:02:09].

19 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
20 [00:02:14]- [00:02:56].

21 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
22 [00:03:01]- [00:04:22].

23 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
24 [00:04:26]- [00:05:13].  
25



SERGEANT AT ARMS: Chair Menin, we're ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: [GAVEL] Good morning everyone. My name is Julie Menin and I'm Chair on the City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection and I just want to welcome all of you today on this rainy day to our hearing that's focused on street vending enforcements and the issuances of licenses pursuant to Local Law 18 of 2021.

I first of all want to recognize a number of my colleagues who are present, Council Member De La Rosa, Council Member Sanchez. I will recognize additional colleagues who are here and we've also been joined by our Public Advocate Jumaane Williams.

Street vendors have long contributed to the vibrancy of New York City streets and to this city's food and retail landscape. Since the late 1800's, street vending has been an important entry level entrepreneurial opportunity for new immigrants and has often been one of the most, really the most and only viable employment options that are available to them.

For as long as there have been vendors that have been selling goods on city streets, there have

however been complaints and concerns about vendors, that they create sidewalk congestion, sanitation problems and unfairly compete with brick and mortar small businesses. Compounding these issues, street vending is regulated through a patchwork of state and local laws and rules that have created a tremendous amount of confusion for vendors, for residents, for businesses and enforcement officials alike.

In 2021, the City Council passed landmark legislation to increase opportunities to legally vend in New York City, as well as to bridge the gaps around enforcement. Local Law 18 of 2021, established a new licensing and permitting scheme for mobile food vending and enabled the city to issue 445 new mobile food vending permits each year for ten years, increasing the number of permits available for the first time since 1983.

Local Law 18 of 2021 established the Office of Street Vendor Enforcement, creating a specialized unit with expertise in the city's myriad and complex vending regulations as well as cultural competence to work with the diverse vending population to be the primary agency responsible for enforcement of vending regulations.

The Office of Street Vendor Enforcement was first established within the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection and then was moved to the Department of Sanitation in April of 2023. Despite this major effort to improve both vending licensing and enforcement, issues still remain. Both vendors and brick and mortar businesses feel that enforcement is inconsistent and arbitrary and that there is not coordination between the multiple agencies responsible for enforcing vending laws. The waitlist for vending licenses are extremely long and the total number of new mobile food vending licenses authorized by Local Law 18 of 2021 has not been issued as individuals who receive applications decide not to follow through with them and vendors do not feel that there is sufficient education and outreach from the city to help them thrive as businesses and maintain compliance with the complex vending requirements.

Today, we are hearing a number of bills on this topic. Introduction 408, sponsored by the Public Advocate would create a division within the Department of Small Business Services to assist street vendors and require SBS to update SBS programs

to permit access to mobile food vendors and general vendors.

Introduction 431, sponsored by Council Member Sanchez would amend Local Law 18 by increasing the number of mobile food vending licenses made available annually from 445 to 1,590 through 2029. It would also make 1,500 additional general vending licenses available during the same period. And finally, after 2029, the bill would lift the cap on the number of vending licenses available for both food general merchandise.

Introduction 1164, sponsored by Minority Leader Ariola would create an interagency portal to share enforcement history across all agencies that enforce street vending laws.

Introduction 1251, sponsored by Majority Leader Farias would clarify the DOHMH shall ensure the maximum number of mobile food vending licenses authorized by Local Law 18 are issued each year. DOHMH could continue to move down the priority list and send out enough license applications each year to meet the requisite 4,445 licenses to be made available before 2032.

I look forward to examining the Administrations approach to street vending enforcement and hearing from a variety of stakeholders regarding the legislation on today's agenda.

Before I pass it over to a number of bill sponsors to make their statements, I just want to recognize we've been joined by Council Member Nurse, by Majority Leader Farias, Council Member Abreu on Zoom. And I will now turn it over to Public Advocate Williams to read his statement.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much Madam Chair. Good morning everybody. First of all, let's go Knicks. Great game. I said Knicks, I said what I said.

Good morning. My name is Jumaane Williams, Public Advocate for the City of New York. Thank you again Chair Menin and Committee Members for holding this hearing. This day has been fought for a long time. The hearing is essential at a moment when the federal government is actively seeking to criminalize many communities and prosecute our small businesses. New York Street Vendors are our smallest business, many of which are a minority and women owned business. They are frequently the targets of

excessive enforcement by law enforcement and city agencies. Today, we are one step, one important step closer to changing the dangers dynamics of criminalization.

In 2024, excuse me, the NYPD and Department of Sanitation issued nearly doubled the amount of vending related tickets issued in 2023. Five times higher than the number of tickets issued in 2019. The enforcement costs related to issuing these tickets vastly out way the revenue generated by penalties. In addition, the Independent Budget Office found that license proposal made by Intro. 431 would boost the city's GDP by \$17 million. Frankly, this legislation is common sense, long overdue. As of October 2023, there were almost 11,000 individuals on the waitlist for general vendor license. Another 10,000 individuals waiting to receive a food vendor permit. As a part of the street vendor reform package, I introduced Intro. 408, which would create a division within the Department of Small Business Services or SBS to assist street vendors. This division would provide much needed services and resources for street vendors alongside important educational and training programs on save vending.

2 These bills are part of a package for a reason.  
3 Each piece is essential. There is a budget proposal  
4 this year that would allocate an additional \$7.7  
5 million to Department of Sanitation for vendor  
6 enforcement. Notably, there is still nothing to  
7 support vendor compliance and education. We have to  
8 try our best to end the criminalization of street  
9 vendors, many of whom have been vending for years,  
10 must include more licenses, more services and more  
11 training, not simply more enforcement.

12 I said this before and we'll say it again; you  
13 can't rain down enforcement on an unfair system. The  
14 goals of Intro. 431 and for vendors and consumers.  
15 And as I close, I cannot overstate how crucial these  
16 bills are at this current moment. The President in  
17 particular and unfortunately too often with the  
18 support of our Mayor, are quickly leading our  
19 communities and economy into extreme hardship and  
20 undo criminalization. We must provide our  
21 communities with ways to help support themselves and  
22 their loved ones. This is common sense legislation  
23 being heard today. It's a major step in direction  
24 that chooses opportunity over criminalization and  
25 level of fear for our smallest businesses.

This is an amazing intersection of immigration of economic empowerment and small businesses. We have to find a way to help the folks that our fabric is based on. I don't think any New Yorker could think of a New York City without our street vendors who were out there in the rain today providing the services they always do. We can find a way to regulate this in a way that is actually fair and make sure everybody has what they need. So, I look forward to hearing what the Department and agencies have to say today. Thank you Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much and now, I'm going to call on Council Member Sanchez to read her opening statement.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much Chair Menin. I'd also like to thank the Speaker, my partner in crime Majority Leader Farias on co-priming and the 25 cosponsors that Intro. 431 has.

I'd also like to thank all of the members of the Administration who are here and those who have taken time off work to testify before the Council. Our city is home to over 23,000 street vendors. They are our smallest businesses. A mainstay of the vibrant street life that makes New York City great and for



generations, they have served as a foothold for immigrant New Yorkers trying to find a way in the city. I know first-hand. I am the daughter and granddaughter of street vendors but I also know that today and I think that many of us agree, our street vending system is broken. Access to licenses is incredibly scarce thanks to an outdated cap created in the 80's with more than 10,000 individuals sitting on a now closed waiting list. Many vendors with years and in some cases even decades to finally win their golden ticket.

Today, nearly 70 percent of street vendors citywide and in my district, 80 or 90 percent even on some beautiful days operate without a license. Not because they do not want to follow the rules but because we've created a system that locks them out. And instead of supporting them, we've increased enforcement, NYPD enforcement putting immigrant vendors at risk of immigration enforcement exposure. No one should fear deportation for trying to feed their family the right way. This lack of access is partly responsible for an enforcement regime that has failed everyone.

Enforcement is uneven, arbitrary, unfair where agencies lead to large confiscation of vendor goods but fail to deter the bad actors who are back again the next week. Sometimes the same afternoon.

Enforcement has also been ineffective precisely because licenses are so unavailable. Without access, unlicensed spending has proliferated and without a license that they could lose, vendors have no real incentive to follow the rules designed to bring order to our streets. My bill 431, part of the larger street vending reform package attempts to address these fundamental issues by increasing access to licenses over time for both mobile and general vendors, mobile food and general vendors.

A phased approach that eventually lifts the arbitrary cap and posed more than 40 years ago. This legislation will bring more vendors into the formal economy and incentivize compliance with the rules New Yorkers actually care about. Food that is sanitary, streets that are clean and safe, and neighborhoods where prosperity is shared. And talking brass tacks, the Independent Budget Office estimates that legalizing vendors could bring in \$59 million in tax revenues. More than triple what the city currently

collects. I've also proposed amendments to our legislation that would strengthen enforcement into respects. First by increasing the number of sanitation officers as the availability of licenses increases and second, by creating clear standards for how a vendors license can be suspended and revoked after persistent violations. These amendments emerge from ongoing conversations that we have held with just about every side of this issue, vendors themselves, supermarkets, business improvement districts, brick and mortar restaurants, city agencies, my colleagues on the Council and November 2024 we went a step further organizing street vendor convenings in partnership with the speakers community engagement division, shout out to you all. These conversations were designed to bring a wide range of stakeholders, more than 50 together with the goal of listening to our shared challenges and developing shared solutions.

Thank you all for participating. And in closing, I'm thrilled that we have this public forum to discuss these issues to hash out differences and to work toward a collective solution. I do believe sincerely that there is a collective solution here.

That the gap between positions is bridgeable. We can't let the momentum end today. My pledge to you is that together, we will find a path forward for vending in New York City. Thank you so much Chair and thank you to all stakeholders who are here today.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you and I'll now call on Majority Leader Farias for a statement.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you Chair Menin. I'd like to highlight and be associated to the words of my counterpart, partner in crime, Council Member Sanchez. This hearing is a long time coming, specifically on the bills we have in front of us today. Myself and Council Member Sanchez have worked diligently to lift up the voices of vendors in the peoples house. Street vendors are a vital part of New York City's economy. They're entrepreneurs, cultural ambassadors and community anchors but our city's regulatory framework continues to fail them, keeping vendors trapped in an outdated, unfair system that limits opportunity and invites criminalization. I'm proud to sponsor Intro. 1251. It addresses a major flaw in the city's implementation of Local Law 18. That law mandates the Department of Health to make 445 supervisory license applications each year

through 2032. But application available is not the same as licenses issued. As a result, we are falling short of a goal this loss they failed to achieve each and every year, which is continually keeping licenses out of the hands of our vendors.

Intro. 1251 fixes this by authorizing the Department to issue more than 445 applications per year. Actually as many as necessary to ensure that 445 licenses are issued each year. That's the only way we'll reach 4,450 licenses by 2032, as the law intended to do from the beginning. This is a simple and essential correction that would help get more vendors out of the underground economy and into safe, legal employment.

I'm also proud to be the coprime sponsor of Introduction 431 alongside Council Member Pierina Sanchez. This legislation lifts the arbitrary caps on food and general vendor licenses, increases the number of licenses issued each year for the next five years and strengthens local training rules and restrictions.

If we're serious about equity and opportunity than lifting those caps is long overdue. Together with Intro. 408, these bills form a package rooted in

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 22

2 fairness, economic justice, and common sense. They  
3 move us away from over policing and toward a system  
4 that respects the value of street vendors and what  
5 they bring to our city every day. Let's get this  
6 done and give vendors the dignity recognition and  
7 protection they have long deserved. Thank you for  
8 the time.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: We will now call on  
10 representatives of the Administration to testify.  
11 We'll be hearing testimony today from Joshua Goodman  
12 who is from DSNY, Deputy Commissioner Public Affairs  
13 and Customer Experience. From Haris Khan from SBS,  
14 Chief of Staff, from Carlos Ortiz from DCWP, Deputy  
15 Commissioner for External Affairs and lastly, from  
16 Corinne Schiff from DOHMH, Deputy Commissioner for  
17 Environmental Health. I'll turn it over now to  
18 Committee Counsel to administer the affirmation.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the  
20 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth  
21 before this Committee and to respond honestly to  
22 Council Member questions?

23 PANEL: I do.

24 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Good morning Chair Menin and  
25 members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker

Protection and the wide array of New Yorkers who have joined us today. I am Joshua Goodman, Deputy Commissioner of Public Affairs and Customer Experience at the New York City Department of Sanitation.

In April of 2023, Mayor Adams designated DSNY as the agency with primary responsibility for coordinating enforcement of the city's rules around street vending, particularly around cleanliness, street pass ability, and quality of life. The Mayor designated DSNY for this role because we are uniquely positioned to enforce these kinds of rules. We have a uniformed police force of trained and licensed peace officers but we also have substantial experience protecting and enforcing access to our streets and sidewalks. Over the last two years, we have leveraged this experience successfully and having the Department of Sanitation serve as the lead agency on this incredibly complex issue means that this work is done thoughtfully with a focus on balancing the needs of vendors, brick and mortar businesses, and communities at large. Our enforcement work is rooted in the belief that all New

Yorkers across every neighborhood in every borough deserve clean, safe sidewalks.

We take a warnings first approach. Often posting dozens of warning signs throughout an area before taking any enforcement actions. But we also engage in robust enforcement to protect cleanliness and quality of life. This enforcement is civil in nature and sanitation police as a general rule do not make arrests. In fiscal year 2025 so far, the 35 sanitation police assigned to street vending enforcement have conducted more than 8,000 inspections, issued approximately 5,000 summonses and donated or composted about one and a quarter million pounds of food that was either abandoned or being vended illegally.

Generally about one quarter of summonses issued by DSNY are for unlicensed vending. The overwhelming passage of proposition two in November of 2024 shows that this work is resonating with the public. This measures gives DSNY the ability to enforce street vendor rules in public areas that are not streets. However, at this time, we have not yet used this authority and are developing a plan for implementation. In any case, the passage of



proposition two is that if New Yorkers support ongoing enforcement of these laws. As is the continued volume of requests for enforcement that we receive via 311 from community groups and in particular from members of this Council.

While DSNY does not set the laws or penalties, we are responsible for fair and consistent enforcement, particularly in cases where public safety or sanitation is compromised. We enforce these laws with a focus on situations where vending has created dirty conditions, safety issues, items being left overnight, set ups to block curbs, subway entrances, bus stops, sidewalks or store entrances.

Several of the bills on the agenda today deal with issues of licensure and we will yield to our agency partners to speak about them. One bill, Intro. 1164, sponsored by Council Member Ariola does deal with enforcement requiring the development of an interagency portal for sharing street vending enforcement information.

The bill duplicates much of the work of the Office of Street Vendor enforcement, legislating a text solution to a problem that we have not encountered in a systemic way. DSNY does of course

share data with relevant agencies and they with us but as the lead agency on vending enforcement, this is done at a staff level. Given the fiscal and time impact of this bill and the fact that significant data is already on open data, we feel that it is unnecessary at this time.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify and look forward to taking your and now I will pass it over to my colleges from New York City Small Business Services for their testimony.

HARIS KHAN: Thank you. Good morning Chair Menin and good morning to members of the City Council on the Committee of Consumer and Worker Protection. My name is Haris Khan; I serve as Chief of Staff at the Department of Small Business Services. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today.

At SBS, we're committed to supporting entrepreneurship including startups, micro-enterprises, storefronts and street vendors. Our no cost services include business courses, legal consultation, help navigating concessionary opportunities and more. Our programs are accessible to New Yorkers through SBS's seven neighborhood based business solution centers, our hotline, 888-SBS-4NYC

and our My City business site at [nyc.gov/business](https://nyc.gov/business). Our work is grounded in an education first approach that seeks to equip small business with clearer understanding of current regulations and connects them to resources that can help them grow and thrive.

Street vendors play a vital role in the city's economy as they are in many ways the smallest of small businesses. Recognizing this, the Administration has included leadership from the Street Vendor project and the Small Business Advisory Commission from Vendor Executive Order 15 in 2022. This ensures that the voices of street vendors are included in conversations by the regulatory landscape facing small businesses.

SBS also partners with sister agencies to conduct outreach to vendors when new licensing opportunities arise. Over the past three years, we've mailed over 22,000 pamphlets to street vendors, making them aware of available SBS services in a host of language including Spanish, Haitian Creole and Wolof. In coordination with DOHMH's supervisory license rollout, we also provided DOHMH over 15,000 pamphlets.

Additionally, we translated DOHMH's technical assistance presentation into multiple languages and cohosted physical and virtual workshops to help vendors better understand the opportunity.

Our services are broadly accessible to all whether a business operates from a storefront or from a cart and in FY24, over 24,000 New Yorkers benefited from our services. We are proud of that reach and impact.

I'd now like to turn to Intro. 408, which would create a division of street vendor assistance within SBS and require the Department to tailor programs specifically for street vendors. While we support the goal of ensuring vendors take advantage of our services, SBS's existing programs are already inclusive and designed to meet the diverse needs of small businesses. Creating a separate division could divert limited time and resources away from service delivery and into new layers of reporting and program design. Moreover, the bills reporting requirements, especially tracking vendor participation, can deter engagement from a community that includes many immigrants. We welcome continued dialogue with the bill sponsors and the Council to find effective ways

to ensure street vendors are supported and look forward to answering any of your questions. And I'll pass it our colleague from Department of Consumer and Worker Protection.

CARLOS ORTIZ: Good morning Chair Menin and members of the Committee and Public Advocate Williams. I am Carlos Ortiz, Deputy Commissioner of External Affairs at the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on issues related to street vending.

The Department of Consumer and Worker Protection issues general vendor licenses to those who sell goods or services in a public place such as the street or sidewalk. There are currently approximately 1,900 license general vendors. The number of licenses issued to nonveteran general vendors is capped at 853 licenses and the waiting list for nonveteran applicants is currently closed.

The license applications for general vendors are available to veterans or the surviving spouses or domestic partners of a veteran.

Introduction 431 would increase the number of food vendor supervisory licenses and general vendor license available each year for five years and

thereafter would remove the cap on food vendor supervisory licenses and general vendor licenses. The Administration supports reducing regulatory barriers on businesses, including expanding the total number of street vending licenses to bring more street vendors into regulation and compliance. However, the Administration is opposed to the cap entirely on street vendor licenses, due to concerns about the impact on the quality of life for everyday New Yorkers. We look forward to engaging in a legislative process with the Council and stakeholders here today to join this conversation on examining license caps and understanding how the city can better support street vendors or small business, while balancing the needs of brick and mortar establishments. Thank you for the opportunity to testify before the Committee on these issues. I would now like to pass it over to my colleagues at the New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene for their testimony.

CORINNE SCHIFF: Good morning Chair Menin and members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection and the Public Advocate. I'm Corinne Schiff, Deputy Commissioner for Environmental Health

at the New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. On behalf of Acting Commissioner, Dr. Michelle Morris, thank you for the opportunity to testify today on the Health Department's enforcements of street food vending and on the legislation before the Committee.

The Departments mission is to protect and promote the health of all New Yorkers, including by promoting the safety of food sold from food carts and trucks. We do that by issuing permits to operate a food cart or truck issuing licenses to the people who vend food, providing mandated training for food vendors on food protection and conducting food safety inspections.

I want to start by providing an update on the Departments implementation of Local Law 18 of 2021, which expanded opportunities for street food vending. Local Law 18 established a new mobile food vending license called a supervisory license and a new kind of permit, a supervisory license permit. The mobile food vending license authorizes a person to vend and a permit authorizes a food truck or food cart or truck to be used for vending. A food cart or truck

will a supervisory license permit must be operated by a person with a supervisory license.

The Department is charged with issuing 445 applications for a supervisory licensee each year for ten years as of July 2022. Supervisory license applications are issued to people on waiting lists in accordance with the Local Laws detailed criteria and prioritization. Vendors on the waiting list can track their progress on the Departments lookup tool available on our website.

Once a person has a supervisory license, they are entitled to apply for a supervisory license permit for a food cart or truck at any time. There is no deadline or waiting list to apply. The Local Law requires that as of July 1, 2032, all full term food carts and trucks, other than green carts operate under a supervisory license permit. The Department has issued almost twice as many supervisory license applications that the Local Law requires offering not only the 444 supervisory license applications per year for the last three years but also reissuing applications that didn't turn into supervisory licenses and offering applications that became available for legacy permits no longer in use.



2 As of late April, 823 vendors applied for the  
3 supervisory license and after approving the  
4 applications, the Department issued all 823  
5 supervisory licenses. So far, 382 of the 823  
6 licensees have obtained their supervisory license  
7 permits. Other vendors are in the permitting process  
8 and because the local law has no deadline to apply  
9 for the supervisory license permit, others may be  
10 preparing to apply some time in the future.

11 I will now turn to the legislation under  
12 consideration today. Introduction 431 would  
13 accelerate the transition to supervisory license  
14 permits by moving the deadline from 2032 to 2029,  
15 increasing the number of supervisory license  
16 applications required to be issued each year and  
17 would remove the cap on licenses as of 2029.

18 The New York City Health Department has no  
19 concerns about issuing more supervisory license  
20 applications annually than Local Law currently  
21 requires and would like to work with the City Council  
22 on some of the details to ease implementation. The  
23 Administration is opposed to lifting the cap entirely  
24 and looks forward to further conversations. If the  
25 Council changes the cap on food vending carts and

trucks, this will expand the Health Departments current workload to monitor food safety, including the issue of license and permits, provision of mandatory food safety training and inspections, leading to increased costs for the Department. We have no concerns with Introduction 1251, which would allow the Department to issue additional supervisory license applications if needed to meet licensing targets. We want to note that New York State and New York City law require food carts and trucks to have a commissary. Commissaries provide cleaning, storage and facilities for food preparation. Any vending expansion must ensure sufficient commissary space to meet food safety requirements.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify. I, along with my colleagues from DSNY, DCWP and SBS are happy to take your questions.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you so much. So, I'm going to start, I have a number of questions focused first on licensing, then on enforcement. So, some of the data you said in your testimony but I want to get it out again in a clear fashion. So first of all, please provide an update on the number of approved supervisory licenses and improved

supervisory permits but that are broken down by citywide, non-Manhattan and then lastly, those designed for veterans and disabled veterans.

CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes, so as you heard in my testimony, we have issued 823 supervisory licenses. 510 of those are citywide, 232 of those are for the boroughs other than Manhattan and 81 are for veterans or people with disabilities.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Now in your testimony and I'm just going to read from it. You said, so far 382 of the 823 licenses have obtained their supervisory license permits. Why is there this discrepancy?

CORINNE SCHIFF: There's no discrepancy. There are two pieces. There's a license that allows-

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Right, I don't mean discrepancy. I mean why the differential?

CORINNE SCHIFF: So if I understand your question, your question is why if there are 823 people with a license, why have 382 need permits?

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, correct.

CORINNE SCHIFF: So that's an important question. We don't know the answer to that. As I noted, the Local Law doesn't have a deadline to apply for the

1 permit. And so, they may eventually turn into  
2 permits. We don't know.

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: What is the communication  
5 between the agency and those that are applying for  
6 the permits?

7 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, we have done extensive  
8 outreach and education to make sure that people who  
9 are eligible to apply for the permit understand that  
10 opportunity. First, who are eligible to apply for  
11 the supervisory license understand that opportunity  
12 and then understand the opportunity to apply for the  
13 permit. You've heard from my colleague at SBS, we've  
14 worked closely together to make sure that those who  
15 are on the waiting list who are then offered the  
16 license are aware of the opportunity and we've got  
17 materials in many languages on our website. We've  
18 held forums, we talk to vendors on the phone, so we  
19 are really working hard to get the word out about  
20 this vending opportunity.

21 But is there a cut off period if you don't hear  
22 back from an applicant?

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: There is a deadline to apply for  
24 the license. So, when we issue the supervisory  
25 license application, there's 90 days to submit that

application. That's why we've been able to issue more. After that deadline passes, we see what came in, what did not, what was not returned and then we put those back into the hopper and send them out again.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I see, okay. How does the number of supervisory permits issue compare to the number of supervisory license issues and what do you believe that you know? We talked about the reason for the discrepancy but what do you believe could be the fix for it? Like, how can solve this issue in your recommendation?

CORINNE SCHIFF: So, I don't know. I think there's an important question about why people become supervisory license holders and do not immediately become permit holders. I think it's an area for investigation and I think it's - you know the local law was set up in a way to allow people to have time before they apply for a permit.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, does that aspect of the law in your recommendation need to be changed?

CORINNE SCHIFF: I don't have a recommendation for that. You know it depends on what the objectives are. What we have done at the Health Department is

taken the law that the Council enacted, under Local Law 18 and we have implemented it.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Moving to enforcement. Can you tell us about the enforcement strategy that the agency has?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Of course. Thank you Madam Chair. The enforcement strategy is very straight forward. New Yorkers deserve clean streets, clear sidewalks. The city has never historically had a meaningful strategy for dealing with how vending that does not follow the city's rules impacts cleanliness and quality of life.

Ultimately vending enforcement is a cleanliness issue. It's an issue of pedestrian accessibility and it should be treated as such. We've toured many communities over the two years that DSNY has been the lead agency on coordinating street vending enforcement with elected officials who have asked DSNY to help solve the vending problems that both compete with rule following vendors, right? Because a vendor who is trying to follow the rules may be facing unfair competition from a vendor who isn't, brick and mortar businesses and residents.

So, we take a warnings first approach at most times in which were either post written warnings in locations ahead of time or issue individualized written or verbal warnings but of course, if DSNY encounters a particularly egregious situation when conducting inspections, a vending regardless of whether a warning was issued, we will take corrective action and that can include summonsing, confiscation or just an on the spot correction of an unallowed behavior.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Before we go on, I want to mention we've been joined by Council Member Krishnan. So, how do you determine where you're sending enforcement agents? Is it solely complaint driven or is the agency - like what - talk about a little bit.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: It's largely complaint driven but those complaints may come informally through 311 or informally from civic associations, community groups, other agencies or members of the City Council who frequently bring areas that they are concerned about to our attention.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I know a lot of our colleagues from speaking to them really across the board are concerned about this enforcement piece, so

that's why I want to drill down on some of the specifics. So, an analysis of Oath hearings related to vending violations shows that the total number of vending related cases across enforcement agencies at Oath was much lower in 2024 than it was a decade ago, specifically with 10,578 cases in 2014 compared to 6,688 in 2024. So, what caused this substantial decrease?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Well, the law that sets the current sort of standards around licensing and enforcement is very different than it was at 2014, right? So, it's a completely different legal regime today than it was at that time.

As often as possible, DSNY is seeking to resolve concerns about unlicensed, unpermitted or time and place vending violations in the moment if we can.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And how many complaints in the past year about street vendors have you received and what are the most common complaints? And explain how the city is responding to those complaints.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, if we were to say speak about fiscal year 2025, there were about - that this is going through the end of April. There were just over 22,000 311 complaints about street vending.



CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Can you break them down by borough?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: I have them by Community Board.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Or I could provide a borough breakdown at a later date if you'd like.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: But I have them by Community Board, by zip code and by Council District. Those complaints are, they run the gamut. It may be this is a no vending area and there is vending occurring. It may be I'm a brick and mortar business and there's someone vending right in front of my entrance, which is not allowed. This may be the narrow sidewalk issue and there's you know no clearance. It may be material left behind. So, these basically lead to inspections. DSNY Sanitation Police Officers inspect these locations, particularly focusing on areas of the highest amount of 311 complaint or addition info from members of this Council community groups and if the issues can be resolved with inspections, with verbal communication, they are and if they cannot be, they are resolved through summons issuance or confiscation when warranted.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And before issuing a  
3 violation, how is the agency working to correct  
4 noncompliant activity and also, what are you doing on  
5 education?

6 JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, we are doing work on sharing  
7 outreach and education materials prepared by the  
8 agencies that are here beside me today. DSNY is not  
9 primarily an outreach and education agency on this.  
10 We are the lead enforcement agency. However, the  
11 warnings are created - in our written warning notices  
12 are created in coordination with the outreach and  
13 education agencies. We also have done tremendous  
14 work including with a lot of guidance from the  
15 Majority Leader on increasing the cultural competence  
16 and language access of our enforcement teams. We  
17 obviously use language line as so many other city  
18 agencies do but we also have sanitation police  
19 officers who are either Native speakers or fluent in  
20 seven languages, so that's right there in the moment  
21 and then of course we utilize additional resources  
22 whenever needed.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And can you talk a little bit  
24 - I guess this is more directed to SBS than about the  
25 outreach that your agency is doing.

HARIS KHAN: Thank you Chair Menin. So, we help partner with city agencies whenever licensing opportunities arise and an example of that was the close partnership with the Department of Health over the supervisory licenses. We mailed out 22,000 mailers and then we did another 15,000 pamphlets, and in the general course of our work, we also promote concessionary opportunities that may exist throughout city agencies, such as the Parks Department or other agencies. And so, whenever opportunities arise under the current regulations, we make sure that vendors can take advantage of those resources and our services generally are broadly accessible to all, so when they do access our services, they can benefit from business courses, business planning, digital marketing. There is no arbitrary barrier that is set by our agency to serve as street vendors. We're proud of that partnership.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Going back to DSNY. At a previous hearing on this topic, you testified that the agency exclusively issues civil penalties for violations of vending laws and I know you touched on this a little bit in your testimony, I just want to get it out for the record.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Has the agency changed their enforcement policy and has the agency ever issued criminal penalties for vending violations?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: No. No.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Going to DOHMH. How does DOHMH engage vendors to correct noncompliant activity prior to issuing a violation? It's the same question that I asked before.

CORINNE SCHIFF: So, the Health Department uses a risk based inspection program and every inspection is really a teachable moment to help the vendor learn any of the food safety conditions that they're not meeting at the time of inspection.

In 2018, the Council had us launch a grading program for mobile food venders. That provides a great incentive to meet food safety standards. A vendor that gets an A at the time of the initial inspection doesn't get any summons at all but we nonetheless provide information and an inspection report about our observations.

So, that's really how we are promoting food safety compliance.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And what - this is really open to all of you. What role would an interagency portal play? I mean you each have your own regulatory jurisdiction. How would an interagency portal improve the landscape?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: We don't feel that it would improve the landscape. It would create a sort of tech hall for communication that already takes place between these agencies. There's a lot of interagency work where you know kind of work where an additional tech based solution might be warranted for this kind of work, which happens in the public realm in real time. We don't feel that it's necessary or appropriate.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay I have many more questions but I want to be respectful of my colleagues who I know have a lot of questions, so I'm going to come back on round two and open it up to my colleagues for questions. Thank you. I'm just going in order of who said they wanted to speak first, so Council Member De La Rosa, you are up.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you. I just have a quick question. Uhm, once of the bills are made into law, what is going to be the training

specifically with the agencies on the enforcement and regulations around these bills. One of the things we see in districts like mine for example, is if DSNY, just to give the example of that agency, comes in and does enforcement, they often tell our vendors, "well you can go apply for a license." And then the vendor goes down to apply for a license, there's no license to be applied for. There is a waitlist forever and ever and so, it's kind of like a false hope that I being created but also a false standard where they're not able at this moment to regulate their status as vendors.

And so, wants these laws that my Council colleagues are hoping to get done. We're all hoping to get done, what is going to be the process across the agencies for training and ensuring that the information filters down to the vendors on the street?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Well, I can just start by saying Council Member that as I mentioned in my testimony, about a quarter of summonses issued by DSNY for street vending violations are for unlicensed vending. The number of interactions with unlicensed vendors is likely higher than a quarter because one of the first

things that an unlicensed vendor will do when they see enforcement personnel from any agency is to leave the area. In general, we do typically find interactions with licensed vendors about the rules and regulations around vending to be more productive than interactions with unlicensed vendors. But look our staff are trained and licensed peace officers. They obviously are required to always be up to date on the law. If the law changes, they will be up to date on that. I will say that there's a lot of implementation work that would be required but I can tell you something about what our interactions are like with licensed versus unlicensed vendors.

HARIS KHAN: Council Member, thank you for the question. Once if there is a decision to lift the cap by the Council and if that is the policy decision that takes place and when we are in the development of implementation across the agencies that would be involved, SBS would certainly play a role in coordinating with those sister agencies and making sure our material, our resources and our team that provides compliance and regulatory assistance is trained in the new pathways available to street vendors as they take advantage of those

opportunities. And that has happened consistently whenever there are new opportunities that arise in the regulatory scheme. One example could be the cannabis entrepreneurs that we've helped at the agency as the state rolled out new license opportunities for those particular businesses across the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Council Member Nurse.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you. I just - I only had a question about kind of protocol for sanitation because sometimes I'm confused about who is doing enforcement. We have a couple hot spots and you all have come out as well as other agencies and done pre-inspections and done a ton of communication but unfortunately sometimes enforcement ends up being the case.

Often times, we'll get photos or videos of police officers there and you all are not there and when we call down to Sanitation, they say well, we didn't ask them to be there. So, can you walk through kind of the protocol for your interactions with local precincts in terms of when you communicate the need



for police presence or PD presence and just like how you're in communication with them on a regular basis on these things.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Be happy to of course Council Member. DSNY partners with the NYPD in specific designated circumstances. As I mentioned, our enforcement work on vending is civil in nature all the time but we work with the NYPD on events where counter fit goods are present because that's a criminal matter. On complaints about vending that includes the sale of drugs. Right, again a criminal matter and sometimes as part of interagency NYPD operations where they request DSNY assistance.

So, we do work closely with the NYPD, coordinating particularly around you know some of the sort of persistent areas of concern in the city but generally the partnership is where DSNY is providing the civil enforcement and NYPD is present because of criminal matters believed to be taking place.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: So, would - are you all being called down from PD doing enforcement in areas.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: PD does often request DSNY assistance.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: For street vendor enforcement?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: When they're down there doing street vendor enforcement, they're calling you all down?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: I couldn't speak to every situation but there are situations like the one you describe, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: But is that not what the current protocol is? I mean isn't that you all have the enforcement portfolio for street vending?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: DSNY is the lead agency on coordinating street vending operations but there may be situations where NYPD is engaged in a different quality of life operation. You know part of this is street vending. We should get the Sanitation police here to assist with the street vending concerns.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: So, when it comes to street vending and both are on the scene, who is the lead?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: DSNY is the lead agency on street vending operations citywide.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Okay and have you asked PD in situations to stand down?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Not to my knowledge, we work closely with the NYPD.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Okay, those are my questions. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you. Majority Leader Farias.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you. I just wanted to go back if possible to the supervisory license applications. I see in the testimony you are open to Introduction 1251. You don't see any initial problems or you know concerns around it. Do you think it would help address the gap between the license applications released and the license issued every year?

CORINNE SCHIFF: I don't know because we are essentially all ready. We had the same idea that you did so we are already really doing that. We will issue the license application. If it's not submitted for a license, a supervisory license, then we will reissue it to the next person on the waiting list. So, we're already creating those opportunities. So, I don't know whether it would result -

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Except not at a necessary  
3 accelerated rate, right? Or at the very least, maybe  
4 putting in some sort of timelines other than the 90  
5 days for reissue to communicate with the folks that  
6 have maybe are only the holders and not moving  
7 towards getting the license?

8 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, I think that there are - the  
9 bills compliment each other and 431 would have us in  
10 the first instance issue more supervisory license  
11 applications. So, if we put them together, more  
12 supervisory license applications would be issued. I  
13 think it's a good hypothesis that more would become  
14 licenses, supervisory licenses.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, thank you for that.  
16 Then just, I have a couple questions. One for DCWP  
17 and uh, so in New York City we have rules that I  
18 wanted - you spoke in your testimony about the  
19 competition or the business competition I believe or  
20 one of the agencies mentioned competition on the  
21 corridor. Regardless, do we have any rules  
22 regulating competition for DCWP or for any of the  
23 agencies testifying in terms of like, we have x-  
24 amount of businesses on this corridor selling produce  
25 or selling a burger, so someone else it not allowed

to open up or to sell closest to that store that sells the same product?

CARLOS ORTIZ: I didn't - I don't believe I mentioned it in my testimony. I'm not aware myself of any rules as such but I think I would defer to the Law Department if they had any guidance.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: There is uhm, I'm sorry if you don't mind, I'll just jump in. There is a restriction on street vending within five feet of the entrance of a store front. It's not restricted based on like oh, it's a cellphone store, so you can't sell cellphones, it's not like that but just, you can't be within five feet of a storefront entrance.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, that we know. Thank you for that. And I just wanted to highlight Deputy Commissioner from DSNY, thank you for highlighting our language access work from our corridor tours. It's super appreciated. And then I wanted to ask some questions surrounding the enforcement piece. I know you folks are the lead agency on enforcement. I guess for me, my question is around the piece on outreach and education, right? As you folks are the people that are supposed to be going out, enforcing, whether there's - what type of

vending is happening and if rules and restrictions are being followed. Why do you think the agency hasn't quite incorporated much of the education or outreach components?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: I would frame it slightly differently and I think that our discussion about language access is a good example of how we do a tremendous amount of outreach and education. It's just that outreach and education has to take place in a wide variety of venues, right?

You brought up these issues about a few languages that you believed were underserved among our term and you were totally right and we were so happy to be able to take that feedback and make the change based on that. And so, our - there are low triple digits of sanitation police overall but 35 of them are focused on street vending, right? And that's by design, having a specific team that knows the issues of these laws. That knows the issues of these communities and that is working on this every day. So, these are people who know what resources are available and can connect vendors to those resources. They're just not the ones actually providing the resources. So, they can say, "hey you know, here's

the website where you can get more info from SBS."

"Here's the website where you can get more info from DCWP." "Here's the website or the you know info about info sessions by the Health Department." It's just that a Sanitation Police Officer in the field is not the appropriate one to be conducting that counseling. Although they do make it a point to always connect people to that counseling.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Last question Chair.

Okay, can we talk a little bit about and I want to kind of pull out a little bit of what I think Council Member Nurse was speaking about with the police intervention or when they respond versus when you folks respond. When you are responding to complaints, or your enforcement agents are going out and responding to complaints, is that solely coming from a 311 call? And are we seeing that the NYPD response calls are coming from 911 calls?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: You know it's an interesting thought that there is you know these two separate call centers are what's causing differentiated enforcement. All complaints about street vending would go to 311. If you called 911 and said there's somebody vending outside my store, they would say

this is misuse of 911. Hang up and call 311. But it is possible that 911 calls about things like drug dealing right, would lead to NYPD intervention and I couldn't speak to it specifically, although I could reach out to them. 311 calls are one of the largest drivers of our enforcement but they're not the only one. And another huge piece of it is what we hear from Council Member directly. Can you please come to this location in my district? You know I'm hearing a lot from this business that they need support, and also other you know sort of local community groups.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: So, I guess we're trying to figure out when - how does the NYPD end up on site?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: I can speak to operations where NYPD is there at the request of DSNY and those are times like counterfeit goods, drugs, where we think there's a criminal matter involved. Where we've gone out and investigated it and said this is not peer time place manner street vending, right? There's something else happening here. And that's where NYPD would be involved.



As far as other NYPD operations, I don't know what triggers those but DSNY coordinates the street vending operations that take place around the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: And I know you can't answer this because you're not the NYPD but have you heard or at least in your like interagency communications, that sometimes we're having whether that's business improvement districts or corridor organizations calling directly to the local precinct because maybe they work with CAU or they work with their community affairs and they're negating telling their businesses or telling patrons to call 311 first?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: You know I'll say if that's happening, which I don't know that it is. It would mean that those groups are making a lot of calls because they certainly call us and ask for DSNY enforcement. We hear from BIDs and you know from merchant associations, all kinds of groups all the time. If they're also calling precincts, that would be a duplicative effort and I would say on the record now that they should not be doing that and they should reach out to us directly.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, thank you so much for responding to my questions.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you. I've got a number of questions for SBS. So, how many street vendors have received support from SBS since Local Law 18 went into effect?

HARIS KHAN: Thank you Chair Menin. So, our services are broadly accessible to all New Yorkers, that includes microenterprises, store front businesses and street vendors. We not disaggregate the data of the folks that we serve throughout our business solutions.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yeah, but you must have data on how many street vendors the agency has provided services to.

HARIS KHAN: So, we've conducted outreach and coordination with our sister agency partners that we referenced at this hearing but we do not disaggregate the data of folks that are consuming our services, particularly with the concern that that might actually disincentivize participation from a community that includes many immigrants.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Just providing informational  
3 outreach about how to work with various government  
4 agencies?

5 HARIS KHAN: To ask them to disclose whether  
6 they're a street vendor or not would lead to  
7 disincentivize participation.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, what work are you doing  
9 to support the street vendor community?

10 HARIS KHAN: Chair Menin, all of our work is in  
11 service to the city's small business, which include  
12 street vendors and we're proud of the partnership we  
13 have with Mohammed Attia from the Street Vendor  
14 Project who serves on the Small Business Advisory  
15 Commission. We're always looking for feedback. In  
16 fact, it was feedback from SVP that lead to the  
17 decision of translating our pamphlet's for street  
18 vendors into understanding that there is a community  
19 of street vendors that has that language need. And  
20 so, we're constantly in conversation with our  
21 community stakeholders, and through the Advisory  
22 Commission, making sure that our services are  
23 accessible and remain accessible to New Yorkers  
24 across business types.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 60

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And what about outreach? Are  
3 you doing outreach to BIDs, to the community boards  
4 to let people know about Local Law 18?

5 HARIS KHAN: So, Chair Menin, we do outreach in  
6 general on all of our services that are available and  
7 whenever there are licensing opportunities or other  
8 opportunities that are made available, we'll partner  
9 with those sister agencies to conduct outreach and  
10 make sure businesses are aware and can benefit.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I want to go back to a  
12 series of questions that I started to ask on  
13 licensing, so I'm just going to go back to that. So,  
14 what are the conditions that make a general vendor  
15 license available to the issue to the next person in  
16 the waitlist?

17 CARLOS ORTIZ: Thank you Chair Menin. In general  
18 for nonveteran general vendors, there's a cap of 853.  
19 So, what typically would allow somebody to apply for  
20 an available license is if a license under that cap  
21 became available by somebody deciding not to vend  
22 anymore, moving away from the city, passing away,  
23 likewise if their spouse or domestic partner did not  
24 want to use the license anymore. That would result  
25

in us now calling on the waitlist and asking for an additional person who want to take up that license.

On the veteran side, there is no cap on those folks taking those licenses, so anybody who is a veteran or a spouse or domestic partner of a veteran could come in and apply for a license, they just have to - they would have to demonstrate a proof of eligibility.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And so how long is it taking the agency - well, how long is it taking for a license to be issued then to the next person on the waitlist once it is available?

CARLOS ORTIZ: Uhm, well typically, I think it's a process that involves - yeah, I think it really depends on the next person that's on the waitlist. It is a process that involves sending letters, emails, we also follow up with phone calls as well. We like to give them an amount of time before we move on to the next person. Whether that's a yes or a no or a nonresponse. Generally, I would say if I could pull these numbers up, since 2016, we've issued 996 general vendor licenses. Let's say that became available since that point and time and we were able

to call another vendor off the waitlist or a veteran decided to apply.

In general, 95 percent of our license applications are processed within ten days and then the rest are usually processed within 30 days on a typical basis. That's in for all of our categories really.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, DCWP previously shared that 161 new general vending licenses were issued from July 2022 through April 2023. How many general vending licenses have been issued since May 2023?

CARLOS ORTIZ: I have yearly breakdowns here, so 118 general vendor licenses issued in 2023, 110 in 2024 and 15 so far in 2025.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And then just to clarify how many people are on the waitlist for the general vending licenses?

CARLOS ORTIZ: Currently there are about 10,500 people on the general vending waitlist.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So what can be done about that?

CARLOS ORTIZ: Sorry, at this point and time, there's a cap in place for nonveterans, which is I guess why we're having the conversation today about

1 Introduction 431. You know the Administration  
2 supports reducing regulatory burdens on street  
3 vendors, including expanding the number of licenses  
4 that are available. Albeit, I think we have concerns  
5 about lifting the cap entirely but I think that's a  
6 conversation we're open to engaging in. That  
7 involves all the stakeholders here today, both the  
8 street vendors, brick and mortar businesses, my  
9 partner agencies here. I certainly appreciate the  
10 need for balance and for collaboration. I think it  
11 is an issue that is complicated but one that I think  
12 all of us are committed to, to working through to  
13 always find better solutions for New Yorkers.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and I guess, I want to  
16 go back to SBS because I still, I'm troubled by your  
17 answer that you don't have any data on help for  
18 street vendors. I mean, I just - as someone who  
19 previously served as Commissioner of DCWP, we  
20 aggregated data. We always tried to make sure that  
21 we were being responsive and I'm concerned that and  
22 just saying, you don't keep any data, it just - it  
23 seems like a nonresponse to me.

24 HARIS KHAN: Chairman, we did not say we don't  
25 keep any data. I think what we're sharing here to

the Council is, we're concerned about adding the kinds of questions that might deter engagement and participation from vulnerable communities, including the street vending community that includes many immigrant entrepreneurs. Our services are accessible. We do serve street vendors. I think a difference with my colleague from DCWP and other agencies is we don't issue licenses for street vending; therefore we don't have you know categories of data associated with that particular license type.

What we do provide is services that are broadly accessible and so, when a New Yorker accesses our service, we have general questions that we need to track participation but we will not create, we do not create additional barriers that may make them think twice, especially in the moment that we're living in about whether they should engage with a city agency and benefit from -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: But are you going out to visit with them? So, like for DCWP, I can say with firsthand knowledge that DCWP does an excellent job in terms of going out to businesses, letting them know how to cure fines before receiving any kind of violation. What kind of work are you doing for



street vendors? Are you going out to street vendors?  
Are you meeting with them? Are you explaining about  
sort of the regulatory environment and all of that?  
You need to meet them where they are.

HARIS KHAN: And we're really proud of the work  
of meeting them where they are and that's why when  
the Council, when the administration decided to issue  
supervisory licenses, we were out there with DOHMH,  
partnered with the Street Vendor Project, make sure  
the materials were in language and not only organized  
a virtual webinar but made sure it was physical and  
virtual to accommodate the needs of the vending  
community, and that work continues. I think one of  
the things that we're looking forward to is as  
there's more clarity on the licensing landscape here,  
we would be involved in that partnership across the  
city agencies. If there are licenses that are  
increased in any category, we will be a partner to  
those agencies in getting the word out.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, can you quantify in the  
past year, how many times has SBS gone out into the  
field to meet with street vendors?

HARIS KHAN: I can't off the top of my head share because we don't the data of whether the business we're interacting with -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: This is a very frustrating nonanswer. I mean, again, one of the things that we're trying to do, this is like uh, we have so many complaints on a number of different issues regarding the vending situation. Some in terms of enforcement and some in terms of outreach and making sure the vendors understand what resources exist at the city level.

Also making sure that there are opportunities to cure before going right to a violation. So, I'll leave it at that and I'll turn it over to my colleague Council Member Sanchez for her questioning.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you Chair and I just want to start by thanking the members of the Administration for your coordination to get here today. I know that that is a lot of work. There's a lot of different agencies involved here and I just want to appreciate that it is very heartening to hear this position. The Administration supports reducing regulatory barriers on businesses, such as expanding the total number of licenses to

bring more street vendors into regulation and compliance. I'm very heartened to hear that and look forward to further dialogue. My first question is for the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. Based on some conversations that I've had with supermarkets and brick and mortar businesses, just point of clarity, do all current licenses and permits - will they all eventually be replaced into the supervisory system?

CORINNE SCHIFF: So, the way that Local Law 18 works is by 2032, July 2032, all full term, so that's year around permits other than green carts will become supervisory license permits.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Great. Thank you. I hope you all heard that. Okay, and regarding commissaries, I understood from your testimony a number of concerns around commissary space, the availability. Can you just share a little bit about what the landscape looks like and the role of commissaries and helping to keep food that is vended on our streets safe?

CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes and thank you for highlighting this point because it's important as the Council considers expansion of food vending and to

consider the role of commissary. So, as I said in my testimony, both state and city law require that a food vendor be associated with a commissary. And that is because it's a very important part of food protection.

Our food carts and trucks need to be stored in a commissary. They need to be cleaned in a commissary. There are some FDNY rules about storage at a commissary that I will leave the FDNY to address and many food vendors rely on commissaries for food preparation. There are other places where you can prepare food if it's at a commercial permitted kitchen but many food vendors do use the permitted commissary kitchen for that food preparation.

All of that is very important. Cleaning, we don't want carts left out on the street, that's a pest control risk. There's a food contamination risk. We don't want people hosing down food carts on the street. So, the expansion of commissaries is really a key part of considering any expansion of food vending.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you and so, I just want to state for the record, Department of Health is not taking a position on the number of licenses that

are - licenses and permits that are issued but merely the safety of the food that is being sold on our streets.

CORINNE SCHIFF: So, as I testified, the Administration is opposed to the lifting of the cap. We are looking forward to speaking with you but from the Health Departments perspective, the focus that we bring to the conversation is on food safety.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Turning to Department of Sanitation. So, am I understanding correctly? You have 35 agents dedicated to enforcement. You received 22,000 complaints in the last year and issued 5,000 violations?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes, that's correct it's 35 sanitation police officers. In calendar year 2024, it was about 25,000 complaints. We want to do fiscal year 2025 to date is 22,000. So, that's about how many we're looking at in an average year and thus far in fiscal 2025 we've issued just shy of 5,000 summonses.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. If every eligible street vendor had access to a license, every vendor that is out in the street today, how would this effect your work as an enforcement agency?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, the question is, just to make sure I understand that question. You're talking about no net increase in vendors. Just making sure that everyone who is there today is licensed.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Exactly.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Generally speaking our interactions with licensed vendors are far more productive than our interactions with unlicensed vendors. We're able to work with them on corrective action around hey, you know, you can't leave this here. This is a little too big. You know you're allowed to vend on that side of the street but not this side. Can you head back over? We're able to connect them to resources like from the Health Department to make sure that all food safety regulations are followed.

Whereas with an unlicensed vendor, the conversations are often extremely limited. The only think I'll just flag is that we don't know whether any change to the cap does lead to change in the number of vendors on the street.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you. May I Chair ask just one more follow up of sanitation?

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Ask as many as you want.

3 That's fine, not a problem.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so  
5 much Chair and I appreciate that response. So, if we  
6 were to increase the number of licenses available  
7 over time, would it be important from your  
8 perspective to have a proportional increase in the  
9 number of sanitation enforcement personnel and if so,  
10 how would you go about thinking about that  
11 calculation? How many more personnel would you need  
12 to be fully staffed today and in the future from an  
13 enforcement perspective.

14 JOSHUA GOODMAN: So much of it is dependent on  
15 specific numbers but I can certainly say that the 35  
16 sanitation police officers are at their capacity for  
17 enforcement today.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And how did 35  
19 sanitation police respond to 22,000 complaints?

20 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Well, often the complaints and  
21 you know aggregated, okay we're getting a lot in this  
22 area. We're going to go; we're getting a lot in this  
23 area. Worked very hard to provide equitable levels  
24 of service but there is certainly no capacity to do  
25 more enforcement with our current staff involved.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. And then for DCWP, do you believe that lifting the current cap on the number of available licenses would lead to congested and disorderly streets as was stated in the press today by members of the Administration?

CARLOS ORTIZ: I'm not to be honest, I'm not necessarily certain if it would lead to more congestion or less congestion. I think - you know I think that's something that as my colleagues mentioned remains to be seen if there will be a net increase in vendors. But I also think that's why we want to make sure that we're taking an approach that avoids any unintended consequences. I think that's why we have concerns with lifting the cap entirely, albeit still open to expanding the number of licenses.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And for DCWP and for Department of Health, how do you think the number of licenses should be determined or will you leave that to us?

CARLOS ORTIZ: I think for me it's important to consider that this hearing is being kind of one of the first steps in the legislative process and really hearing from stakeholders, street vendors themselves,



also brick and mortar establishment representatives. I think they also have concerns. I think there are two sides to that issue that would need to be married. Certainly, you know taking as perhaps a metric, the waitlist of general vendors of 10,500 that is a number that would certainly quire us over a period of time to need new resources to develop that. I know we submitted an FIS to the Council for 23 lines. And on the flip side, there would be potential revenue for the city too in terms of just basic license fees. But again, to answer your original question, I think it's really - we're in this process now determining what the right number is for the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Can you help us understand both from each agencies perspective how your staffing needs would be to - how the staffing needs would change if we were to raise the cap on the number of licenses available? What costs would be associated? What revenue would the agency see? And if you could talk about the different roles, the professionals within your agencies that are involved in the enforcement system?

2 CORRINE SCHIFF: I can start for the Health  
3 Department perspective. As my colleagues have  
4 testified, I think we don't know what the additional  
5 numbers of license - really for the Health Department  
6 for permitted vending units. There is, as you know  
7 there's no cap on licenses. If a person is licensed,  
8 they are able to vend and we have no cap on those and  
9 there would be, as I testified, there would  
10 additional cost for us to manage food safety among  
11 the additional permitted units. We have staff who do  
12 issue licenses and permits. We have health  
13 inspectors who conduct inspections both to check that  
14 the vending unit meets food safety requirements and  
15 then conducts inspections out on the streets and  
16 sidewalks to make sure that those are operating in a  
17 way that meets food safety standards. We have a  
18 training staff at our health academy who provide food  
19 safety training, which is required for anyone with a  
20 food vending license. So, there would certainly be a  
21 proportional need to increase our staff proportionate  
22 to the number of increased vending units.

23 CARLOS ORTIZ: I think likewise I mean on the  
24 general vendor side of things, we're certainly  
25 talking about moving from a cap of 853 that was

established many decades ago. Whatever number we're able to land on based on conversation today and throughout the legislative process, there would be new resources particularly on license intake, attorney's as well. Yeah, I think that would be for DCWP.

HARIS KHAN: For the Department of Small Business, this would change and the cap would impact - could impact our outreach staff and our regulatory assistance staff. That team currently supports all of these sister agencies and other agencies informing them by the regulations that currently exist. An increase in what's possible for businesses and the opportunities that are possible could be to increase volume and those would be the teams that would be impacted by such as change.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: And I think I spoke to it.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, last question and thank you so much Chair for the time is for Small Business Services. So one major issue with street vending is that vendors are not in compliance with many of the existing regulations from siting rules to public health hazards and we know that that is one piece and not the only piece of the puzzle is robust

education and outreach so vendors who especially those who do not speak English are aware of the rules. Are there existing SBS programs that are particularly good at doing education and outreach and how might those programs be adapted to serve more directly to the Chairs line of questions, our smallest business owners for the street vendors?

HARIS KHAN: Thank you Council Member for this important question. There's several business industries; there's several licensing types where there are opportunities for entrepreneurs in New York City to take advantage of those resources and join the fabric of our small business community. In those cases, we are ready and able to serve those businesses. Businesses can reach out to our New York City business express service team. That team under this Administration was formed and has already saved businesses over \$40 million in fines and fees by educating them about fines and fees that they could avoid as a licensed business operator. As more licensing opportunities open up, we would train that team with new license opportunities. Make sure they're cross trained across the sister agencies and

are able to meet the needs as they arise throughout the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Great, thank you. Thank you so much Chair and to the Department of Sanitation. I just thank you for sharing that reflection that interactions with licensed vendors are so much more productive. That's exactly what we're trying to accomplish with Intro. 431. Thank you Chair and thank you to the members of the Administration.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you and Majority Leader Farias.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you. Just two quick questions and one for SBS. Can you - I'm trying to pull out I think a little bit of the data aggregation thought process or question. I know you folks don't necessarily tag people that you're serving as a street vendor, and so, they get lumped into the larger small business tag line.

Can you explain maybe through the data aggregation process, if there's any points where you can help to find when you are serving a vendor? Are you tagging people that have one or two owners or maybe not within a storefront or a mobile business?

Are there other ways to showcase data points that you folks are maybe serving directly to our vending community?

HARIS KHAN: So I think just - I want to make it very clear, we serve street vendors. We serve storefront businesses.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah.

HARIS KHAN: When we're out in our neighborhood, we've already done 100 plus events in this fiscal year and when we're in those communities and there's a street vendor and we're doing outreach across that corridor, we will share our street vendor resources with them. I think on the particular question of if there are proxies that could help us get to what the universe of street vendors are, that consumer services, I think it's very difficult. I'm not sure it would be the most accurate but just for general awareness on how data gets entered, when we speak to a customer, one of the businesses that we serve, we enter into our database the industry that they're in. So, for street vendors, if we're talking about food vendors, that would fall under the accommodation, the food and accommodation kind of category as defined by the NAICS codes, which are national codes.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay so in this food category, I mean that's also restaurant tours?

HARIS KHAN: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: So, I guess for our data point where we're trying to better understand is when SBS - how do you define the difference in services you're getting to a vendor versus a restaurant owner?

HARIS KHAN: So, I think businesses themselves define the type of service that they'd like to consume. So, when they approach us and particularly the ones that we promote for street vendors, they are business courses, legal consultations where we can help a vendor whether they should be a sole proprietor or they should be in a partnership or form an LLC. We can connect them to capital access resources that are available and so our services overwhelmingly are broadly accessible to the vending population and we are proud of the partnership we have.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, I think that we know, right? We understand that component but I guess when we are looking to you to tell us I serve ten people a year or 10,000 people a year or 10,000 inquiries came in versus ten inquiries came in

specifically from x-community. Like, that is what we're trying to better understand how our agencies are working to provide the supportive services.

So, just food for thought for us to continue about how we're going to disseminate information while also disaggregating data to make sure we're serving the people at the right pace.

HARIS KHAN: Right, certainly if there's particular zip codes or corridors where there's an interest of understanding whether we have served or not, we'd be happy to do some analysis to understand that trends there and we'd be happy to serve if there's any business owner, anyone, any New Yorker that reaches out to your office and says, I'm not sure if SBS could be the right option for us. Please connect them to us. We are the right option for overwhelming majority of New Yorkers that are either entrepreneurs that are doing businesses from their homes and apartments as a result of the historic -

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, I mean it would probably be interesting for us as a Council to also see if there is an analysis from your agency on what looks like vendor services, specifically in our



corridors but I'm happy to continue talking offline about that.

HARIS KHAN: Yeah, absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: And then just the last question that came to thought and all or any can answer. Would you all agree that regulating and setting a standard for the unpermitted vending whether that's on cart setup, food safety, street enforcement, like many of the good actors that are currently vending without a permit are doing now would help us get all the bad actors on more targeted outreach or more targeted enforcement?

HARIS KHAN: I mean I think the situation that you describe relies on a compromise that also includes increased enforcement but certainly, we agree that reducing regulatory burdens and providing ways for people to come into compliance leads to more productive interactions between enforcement personnel and vendors and between vendors and the communities around them.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay great. So, I just want to switch gears and talk about confiscations because we haven't really spoken that much about that.

So, when the Office of Street Vending Enforcement was situated at DCWP, the agency authorized just 37 confiscations out of over 25,000 inspections conducted between June 2021 and March 2023. How many inspections has OSVE conducted since moving to the Department of Sanitation April 2023 and how many confiscations have been authorized?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: I apologize Madam Chair. I have very good data on that question for Fiscal Year 2025 to date.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, I can do just off the top of my head, I can do July to April 30<sup>th</sup>. So in that time, there were 8,390 inspections and 3,374 confiscations. And confiscations happen in a few situations. They occur when DSNY issues a summons for operating a mobile food vehicle with no permit, operating a mobile food vehicle with no license, unlicensed general vending or abandoned property and that abandoned property one is one where the issue of unlicensed vending becomes significant because many of those situations are when a vendor sees sanitation police and leaves without packing up. And then the summons is issued after the vendor claims

the abandoned property as part of the retrieval process.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, how do you determine if the property is abandoned for confiscation?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: If there is no one present and no one will identify themselves and say, yes, that is mine, it is abandoned property.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: What's the percentage of confiscations that are conducted on mobile food vendors versus general merchandise vendors?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: I want to say that I have that. Give me one minute, I apologize. If not, we'll have to get it to you.

Uhm, you know I think I just have information on total confiscations; I apologize.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, if you can get that over to the Committee. Thank you.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes, we can work on that.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And can you just -

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Oh, no, I'm sorry I do have it here.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, great.

2 JOSHUA GOODMAN: The uhm, confiscations - oh no,  
3 this is breakdown on how much of it was picked up.  
4 I'm sorry, which is not your question. I apologize.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, okay yeah if you can  
6 get that to Committee. And can you describe the  
7 process for property retrieval?

8 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes, I actually have right here  
9 in front of me the information that is given to  
10 vendors in those situations. So, I can tell you  
11 exactly what they are told.

12 So, vendors are given a property redemption  
13 notice that explains how they can retrieve their  
14 property. When abandoned items are confiscated and  
15 they are then given a notice that says, if you are  
16 redeeming your property within two business days of  
17 the date of the summons, please contact - and then  
18 there's contact information. Experienced staff will  
19 guide you through the redemption process, answer your  
20 questions and tell you what documents are required to  
21 redeem your property and then the business hours.  
22 Please be advised that after the first two days of  
23 storage, storage fees are charged at a rate of \$16  
24 per day. Upon payment of storage fees, you will be  
25 issued a redemption order to retrieve your property

and then there's the address of our storage facility. Property that is not claimed and redeemed after 90 days after it was taken, even if storage fees have been paid, will be donated to a 501C3 organization.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And what percentage of goods have been retrieved?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: Okay that was that number that I have here. 6Y 2025 through April 30<sup>th</sup>, about 16 percent have been picked up, 38 percent are still in the storage. Like meaning, it hasn't been the 90 days. We have it and they can come back and get it, and 46 percent were composted, donated, or discarded as appropriate.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And where is the agency donating to?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: If it's nonperishable food, it's food pantries. Other items are donated to C3's that we identify in coordination with other agencies.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, uhm, that concludes my questioning. Does any other colleague have any other questions? Council Member Sanchez.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you Chair. Just one point of clarification. Deputy Commissioner, I think you said vendors are required

to be at least five feet away from entrances but  
isn't it twenty feet?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: I apologize, I think there might  
be a distinction between food and general vending.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Oh is there?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: We'll double check on it because  
Carlos said the same thing, so I think we have to  
double check on that but yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, alright, thank  
you. Thank you. Look forward to that. Uhm, and  
just one last simple question on the Chair - just  
following up on the Chairs line of questions on  
confiscations. From your estimation, have  
confiscations been successful in deterring unlawful  
vending?

JOSHUA GOODMAN: They are successful in  
maintaining many of the goals of these regulations  
around clear and passable streets. You know  
obviously in an abandoned set up, is a street  
obstruction and that you know, harms quality of life  
in a community. Whether they deter repeat offenders,  
I couldn't speak to other than to say that there are  
certain areas where it happens again and again.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Yeah, that is my experiences as well but thank you Chair, really appreciate the time.

JOSHUA GOODMAN: And you're right about the 20 feet, I'm sorry I was looking at some old data. I apologize.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: No problem, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. We appreciate the testimony from the Administration, so thank you that concludes that portion. Before we move to the public comment period, I'm now going to call on the New York City Independent Budget Office, who is going to be testifying and specifically we'll hear testimony from Eric Mosher and Alaina Turnquist. If you could please come up. Thank you and then after that we will move right into the public comment. [01:34:06] - [01:34:46]. Okay thank you, we are ready to begin.

ALAINA TURNQUIST: Hello, okay, it's on. Good morning Chair Menin and members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection. My name is Alaina Turnquist. I am a lead budget and policy analyst at the New York City Independent Budget Office, also known as IBO. I am joined here today by my

colleague, Eric Mosher. He is a lead economist at IBO. IBO is an independent, nonpartisan City agency that conducts fiscal and policy research for the City. Thank you for the invitation to testify today. I will be speaking about the fiscal impact to the City's budget, were the cap on street vending permits and licenses to be eliminated.

At the request of 14 Council Members, IBO analyzed the fiscal impact on the City's budget that could result from lifting the cap on street vending in New York City. In January of 2024, IBO published a report outlining potential impacts to the City's tax revenue and agency spending. The report also detailed the current regulatory environment for various types of vending in New York City.

We found that lifting the caps on the number of vending permits and licenses would have a net positive fiscal impact on the city's budget. The scale of the fiscal impact, however, would depend on the number of vendors that become permitted. If ten percent of people on the current vendor permit waitlists, which is around 2,000 people were to become permitted, the net revenue gained to the city would be around \$5.9 million annually. If 100



percent of those on the waitlists were to become permitted or licensed, which is around 20,000 people, the net impact would increase to about \$59 million.

IBO expects that new sales tax revenue from permitted vendors would be the largest source of new revenue for the city.

In preparing for this testimony, IBO identified an error in our original analysis that caused an underestimate of forecasted tax revenues. The January 2024 report misstated the \$59 million upper estimate as \$17 million. We have since updated the report on IBO's website but this really does not change our overall methodology or the key findings and conclusions of the report.

IBO expects the overall macroeconomic impact of eliminating the cap on street vendor permits would be minimal. However, the microeconomic impact to individual vendors to become permit or licensed could likely be substantial. For example, holding a legal permit or license would prevent some street vendors from receiving costly tickets or having their materials confiscated by Law Enforcement assuming that other city regulations and rules are followed while vending.

Vendor revenues and profits overall we found were modest according to the survey data for both permitted and unpermitted vending. According to IBO analysis of vendor survey data, the average annual profit for all vendors in the city was roughly \$41,000 in 2019.

General vendors would sell merchandise had lower average annual profits compared to mobile food vendors. On average, general vendors had an estimated annual profit of around \$35,000 compared to \$46,000 for mobile food vendors.

In terms of additional administrative costs, IBO expects additional costs would be born by the Department of Consumer Worker Protection, as well as the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene.

Additional mobile food vending permits have higher administrative costs than additional general vending licenses, primarily due to Health Department resources required to inspect mobile food vending units as to ensure food safety.

IBO assumed no additional uniformed agency enforcement costs would automatically result from removing the permit cap for street vending. Any change would be at the city's discretion. Law

Enforcement for vending has shifted away from criminal summons and towards civil enforcement over the past decade. Importantly, even without a cap on the number of permits and licenses, vendors would need to comply with other regulations. For example, strict siting rules make many streets off limits for vending, even with a permit and food vendors are required to store their vending units in city permitted commissary facilities which have a limited capacity.

Therefore, while lifting the cap on permits and licenses would likely benefit many vendors and provide fiscal impact, positive fiscal impact to the city overall, it is unlikely to immediately bring all street vendors into the permitted vending economy.

Finally, vendors must pay any outstanding fines to the city before being eligible to receive a license or permit. For unpermitted vendors seeking to legalize paying outstanding fines may present a barrier and could effect the number of individuals who would ultimately be able to convert from informal to formal market vending.

In conclusion, lifting the cap on vending permits and licenses would likely have a positive fiscal

impact on the city's budget. The overall scale of the impact is highly dependent on the number of vendors who are able to enter the formal permitted market as well as the type of vendors who become licensed and permitted. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions. Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Chair. I just want to follow up. You said the macroeconomic impacts of lifting the cap would be minimal while the microeconomic impacts would be substantial. One concern that we often hear about Intro. 431 is whether uh, the question about whether lifting the caps would cause a massive influx of new vendors that aren't on the streets today. How did you handle assumptions about that aspect of the number of vendors on the streets and does IBO have a perspective of what might happen?

ALAINA TURNQUIST: Sure, I'll let my colleague Eric take that one.

ERIC MOSHER: Thanks. Hi. Thank you for the question Council Member. So, we in our research and analysis, the basic assumption that we made is that the decision whether or not to be a street vendor or

to you know, to do that work is not - is more dependent on individual you know socioeconomic conditions rather than the policy landscape that's in place.

So, one of the kind of you know, central assumptions underlying our analysis is that lifting the cap or eliminating the cap alone would not lead to an influx in the street vendor population.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so much. Thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you very much for your testimony.

ALAINA TURNQUIST: Thank you.

ERIC MOSHER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Alright, I'm now going to move on to the public comment period. So, I now open the hearing for public testimony. I want to remind members of the public that this is a formal government proceeding and that decorum shall be observed at all times. As such, members of the public shall remain silent at all times. The witness table is reserved for people who wish to testify. No video recording or photography is allowed from the witness table. Further, members of the public may

not present audio or video recordings as testimony but they may submit transcripts of such recording to the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record. If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized, you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing topic.

If you require translation services, you will have a total of four minutes for you to speak on today's hearing topic and for the interpreter to interpret your testimony. We ask that you pause frequently to give the interpreter enough time to interpret your testimony as you go.

Today's hearing topic is of course street vending enforcement and the issuance of licenses pursuant to Local Law 18 of 2021 along with related Introductions 408, 431, 1164, and 1251. If you have a written statement or additional written testimony that you wish to submit for the record, please provide a copy of that testimony to the Sergeant at Arms. You may also email written testimony to [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov) within 72 hours of this hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be

accepted and let me just conclude before I call the first panel, every speaker as I said is going to get two minutes. I run a very tight hearing because I respect everyone's time and so, if you go over two minutes, it's simply not fair to the other speakers who are waiting here. So, to be clear at two minutes, I'm going to ask every person to wrap it up and we will move on to the next speaker. You can of course submit your written testimony. So, with that said, I'm going to call the first panel and just so everyone understands, generally we do those that are in favor, those that are against, we try to alternate so we can incorporate everyone's perspective into this hearing.

So, the first panel is going to be comprised of Matthew Shapiro, Carina Kaufman-Gutierrez, Mohamed Attia, Calvin Baker, and Cleo. If you could please come forward. Thank you.

And I understand we need an interpreter for Cleo. Do we have an interpreter here? Okay, do we have an interpreter? Do we have an interpreter? Okay, we're getting the interpreter. The interpreter is here. Okay, please begin. Thank you.

MATTHEW SHAPIRO: Hello, we ready?

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, we're ready. Thank you.

3 MATTHEW SHAPIRO: Hello, my name is Matthew  
4 Shapiro and I'm the Legal Director of the Street  
5 Vendor Project at the Urban Justice Center. We are a  
6 membership based organization of over 3,000 vendors  
7 who work in New York City's public spaces. These  
8 include a large community of immigrant vendors as  
9 well as the Native born and veteran street vendors.  
10 The organized vendors that have their voices heard  
11 when it comes to policies that affect them as well as  
12 provide legal and small business services to main and  
13 grow their businesses. We are here today to talk  
14 about economic justice and relief for the 23,000  
15 vendor small business owners who are currently  
16 selling food and merchandise in our public spaces,  
17 serving New Yorkers and visitors alike.

18 81 percent of all vendors use vending as their  
19 primary source of income. The problem as you well  
20 know is that there is currently almost no legal  
21 pathway for vendors to formalize their business and  
22 obtain the required license and permits to operate.

23 In 1979 and 1983, the number of food vendor  
24 permits and general vendor licenses were capped with  
25 a modest additional amount of only food vendor



permits being released every year due to the passage of Local Law 18 in 2021. However, every week vendors come into our office either asking how they can get a license and permit to sell food or merchandize or they come with multiple thousand dollar tickets because they took a risk selling tacos, ice cream or cut mango's to support their family. These high fines are in addition to having their food seized and disposed of by the NYPD or Department of Sanitation. 800,000 pounds of food from vendors was seized by DSNY in 2024 alone. Vendors cannot even get on a waiting list for a license, which has thousands of names and is currently closed. Intro. 431 is the solution gradually increasing the number of licenses available for a multiyear period will allow those vendors who are currently working to formalize their business and work legally. Some will pose this legislation may say that this will open the flood gates with vendors everywhere. Quite the opposite. By giving vendors a license and permit, compliance with the sidewalk rules will increase since vendors have skin in the game and incentive to have a legal business.

There simply cannot be unlimited vending in New York City. Since 80 percent of New York City sidewalks are less than 12 feet wide and are therefore restricted for vending. There are numerous restricted streets and sidewalk placement rules that when fairly enforced will ensure that vendors keep adequate clearance from crosswalks, bus stops, taxi stands and brick and mortar entrances.

Street vending has been an economic pathway for small businesses since New York City was founded. For far too long the city has placed insurmountable barriers for vending. Instead, prioritizing strict enforcement and criminalization.

It is time for the city to allow vendors to formalize vendors, brick and mortars and all New Yorkers will be better off. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: Good afternoon, my name is Carina Kaufman-Gutierrez and I'm the Deputy Director at the Street Vendor Project. Thank you Chair Menin for the opportunity to testify today in support of Intro. 431, 408, and 1251. Perhaps no industry in New York City faces enforcement from as many agencies and departments as street vending.

There are at least seven city agencies that play a role in enforcement. The amount of summonses issued both civil and criminal just keeps climbing.

NYPD was in fact the agency that issued the highest number of summonses in 2024. 9,376 total, 18 percent of which were criminal and this was five times higher than in 2019 when the agency was actually the one in charge of vendor enforcement.

In 2024, DSNY conducted more confiscations than tickets, 4,323 confiscations versus 4,144. This ticketing is costly and ineffective. Researches with Cornell University found DSNY operates at nearly a \$21 loss per summons. And as you heard today, there's not a single city agency that conducts outreach, education, or compliance with street vendor small businesses. Having equal institutional support for small businesses is not only fair, it's better for the city. We've seen incredible success in community education and outreach. When we can equip vendors with information, tools, and a clear path to follow, they know how to operate and can focus on what they love to do, making their food and serving the community.

Now, should the Council not act, what is the impact of this costly and ineffective enforcement? Number one, immigration risks. Increased NYPD policing equals increased risk of ICE policing. As long as the current outdated vending system is in place, this Council is putting street vendors at risk of interactions with law enforcement. When immigrants who are at risk of deportation have encounters with the police for any reason, their risk of getting funneled into detention and deportation increases regardless of the outcome of the case. How does this play out in real life?

One of our members received a criminal court ticket for vending without a permit. If I may? The day of her court appointment her daughter was -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask you if you could please wrap up and then submit the testimony. Thank you.

CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: Her daughter was sick at school. She had the impossible choice to make between taking her daughter to the hospital or showing up in criminal because if she didn't show up, a warrant would be automatically issued for her arrest.

Lastly, this is a loss to the cultural fabric of New York City. We're thankful for the Council's listening to this to pass the street vendor reform package. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you.

CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
[01:50:54]- [01:51:30].

INTERPRETER: Good morning. My name is Cleotilde Juarez. I am a street vendor. I live and work at Queens Borough. I'm here to ask you to ask the Council that I need you to approve the reform package for street vendors and they are proposals 431, 408, 47 and 24.

As a single mother because I'm a single mother and a lot of us are single mothers and we are also grandma's. And a lot of us have to take care of our grandchildren and even a lot of us are survivors of domestic violence.

CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
[01:52:32]- [01:53:07].

INTERPRETER: Okay, we support and we make sure to take food to the table to our households. We have to pay rent. So, I have to ask you in the name of all of us, to approve the reforms but I also think

that it's been hypocrite because in the New York Times has recognized our food and our sales but we don't have the opportunities that we deserve to be able to sell them. So, that's why I say it's been hypocritical so far at this point.

CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
[01:53:47]- [01:54:03].

INTERPRETER: Behind every street vendor there's a person who has a business. We are entrepreneurs and we want to help the economy. We actually help the economy already and make it thrive but we want to help even more. We want to contribute even more.

CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE  
[01:54:30].

INTERPRETER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

CALVIN BAKER: Good afternoon Council Members. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. I come before you not as a street vendor but as a father, a deacon in my faith community and a proud New Yorker. There were a series of actions that have led to this day. I've marched these streets with thousands of vendors in the lines demanding for vendors rights and stood on the corners, not just selling but to serve

with propose with pride and with a call rooted in faith and family. I've given testimony before this very body sharing the struggles of street vendors and I've gathered hundreds of petitions and post cards from my neighbors and customers who stand with me, who believe that this reform is long overdue.

As a father, I know that it means to work long hours to ensure my children have a roof over their heads, food on their tables and the opportunities to dream. As a deacon, I have dedicated my life to serving others, advocating for the poor and standing in the gap for those who live in fear. Therefore their voices are often unheard and as a street vendor, I experienced first hand the struggles that come from trying to make an honest living while navigating the system that too often leads us vulnerable, paralyzed or ignored.

Today, I am here to support two critical pieces of legislation, Intro. 431 and Intro. 408 part of the street vendor reform package. Intro. 431 is about a firmness a about giving me and my family and my fellow vendors a chance, a real chance to operate legally by expanding access to the vendors license.

Right now, thousands of hard working men and women,  
many of them immigrants -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask  
you please to wrap up.

CALVIN BAKER: Families like me, and our focus to  
work.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, if you want to submit  
the rest of your testimony, we would welcome that.

CALVIN BAKER: No problem.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you so much.

CALVIN BAKER: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

MOHAMED ATTIA: Good afternoon. My name is  
Mohamed Attia, I'm the managing director of the  
Street Vendor Project. I want to thank Chair Menin  
and the Council Members for the opportunity to  
testify. Street vending in New York City has a long  
rich history. In the 1600's people were selling  
oysters. In the 1800's, the first push cart market  
was created by Jewish immigrants on the lower east  
side. Thousands of immigrants and minorities to make  
a living and live the American dream here in our  
city.



When we think of street vendors, we think of our daughters, Macy's, the Hallal guys, so many names. We think of families moving up the economic ladders, sending their kids to college so they can have a better future. Becoming community leaders and elected officials while serving their communities and providing affordable product and services. For decades now, the street vending system has been set up to fail everyone. Some people like to blame the vendors for that, for the city's failure. They blame the vendors for not having a business license. We heard it and saw it over and over again.

Here's a crazy fact for you. Vendors want to follow the law but the city is not allowing them to do so. Thanks to the limits on the number of licenses. Intro. 431 is a huge step forward to address this dilemma the vendors and New Yorkers are dealing with. For decades, the city has been trying to target vendors with heavy enforcement and it has not worked. Constant enforcement of inequitable laws mean keeping the vendors community in a vicious circle of poverty. This bill offers a different approach. It offers a solution for the system to finally work hopefully for everyone. Some folks are

under the illusion that this bill will add more vendors to our city streets. However, the fact is our city - the fact is in our city, 75 percent of vendors operate without a proper permit, 37 of the merchandise vendors operate without a license.

This bill will not add more vendors to our city. It will only formalize the existing vending businesses. After passage of Local Law 18 and after three years of implementation, we're seeing the scene is not really changing. The rollout is very slow.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask you to wrap up. I know you'll submit the testimony.

MOHAMED ATTIA: I will and we know that the rollout we heard today from Health Department, there is a huge bottleneck called the waiting list. They are doing their part as an agency but nothing is really moving the way it should be. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you so much to this panel. Any questions for the panel? Okay, Council Member Sanchez.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Yeah, thank you Chair. Uhm, in your view and specifically for SVP, why has there been a rollout - actually, let me just skip to this one. We have a number of vendors who are

licensed but still actually, let me - sorry, sorry.

Let me clarify this one. There are vendors across the city who do follow the rules and don't follow the rules. What is your position on how Intro. 431 can address the situation? And finally, in this era of heightened federal immigration enforcement, what have you seen on the ground and what are you hearing from vendors?

MOHAMED ATTIA: Sure, so now, we know that the city is not creating any incentive for vendors to be in compliance with the law. As we said over and over again, the vendors are not allowed to obtain the proper business license. There is no one doing street outreach to educate the vendors of the law. And as a result, vendors are out there breaking the law, trying to be in compliance with the law but they're not allowed to. We heard from the sanitation; they go out and give the 24 hour warning. That notice is not education. It says you are in violation of some of the rules. Here are three bullet points that you might be breaking. Some of them do not apply to most vendors who sell food; however, that's the only education that the city is doing. So what we believe this bill will do is it

will create a mechanism where vendors are obtaining the proper business license, getting the training after the passage of 408 and making sure that they understand the laws, they are in compliance and they are following them. After that, any enforcement action will only be fair.

Right now what we're seeing is that the whole enforcement mechanism is not working. The whole enforcement system is so unfair. It's going after vendors including the good apples. Including those who are in compliance with 99 percent of the law but they don't have that piece of document from the city that says a license on it. We heard also from DCWP, the issue on average 110 licenses every year. It's going to take us 95 years to go over the exiting waiting list. 10,500 names, 95 years. Meet me next century. Brother Calvin here is not on the waiting list. He doesn't have a chance to get a license. Yet he's been a vendor for more than 20 years. Where is Calvin in the equation? Where is Calvin in the thinking of the city? The system is failing everyone. It's not only failing vendors. It's failing the entire economy of the city.

I hope that answers your question Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. It does, thank you and have you heard concerns around the new federal immigration enforcement with respect to vendors on our streets?

CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: Yes, I can answer that. In our current political climate, there has absolutely and frankly at the city level as well, there being the heightened criminalization and intimidation of street vendors has become all the more alarming. I want to show a few photos. This is what immigration enforcement looks like. You could see it says police, police, police. Department of Sanitation uniforms say police, police, police. You're a street vendor and you're outside operating and you don't know which agency, one of the seven that do street vendor enforcement could be approaching you, meanwhile you're also potentially fearful of an ICE approaching - an ICE agent approaching you as well. There's extreme concern and fear that just stepping outside could result in something more dangerous. And as long as the current outdated vending system is in place, this Council is putting street vendors at risk of interactions with local law enforcement.

Because when immigrants who are at risk for deportation have encounters with the police for any reason, their risk of getting funneled into detention and deportation increases regardless of the outcome of this case. And the reason why is because any encounter with NYPD can result in fingerprint sharing, even if that person is not actually charged.

In particular, any case where fingerprints are taken, they're sent via to FBI to ICE to determine whether the person is a target. Additionally, there is an impact in the discretionary element. Many applications for immigration relief and defense to deportation include a discretionary element. So, any arrests or tickets, even just a summons right, a civil summons, where even when a case is dismissed does have the potential to be used as a negative factor.

So again, there is a lot of concerns within the community, 96 percent of street vendors are immigrants.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you and I just want to thank SVP for all the work that you've done to get us here. For all the conversations you've had with additional stakeholders. You've gone far beyond

your own role and even helped us. So, thank you for all the work.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, just a couple questions that I have. So, do you think there is enough legal space for vending if the number of license each year increased substantially?

MATT SHAPIRO: Yes, uhm one thing that I always think about if right now food vendors are paying on the underground market \$15,000, \$20,000 to use another person's permit. They're stressed about that, so they're trying to recover as much money as possible, so maybe they think they need to be in the most prime location. If vendors have the opportunity to have their own permit, not pay that \$15,000, you know pay a more reasonable amount, directly to the city I might add, they will probably not need - you know they probably won't stress as much to have that prime location where every other vendor wants to be and perhaps spread out a bit and go to those areas where there is not as much vending, because they won't be in the whole \$15,000 or \$20,000 and be constantly thinking about recouping that money.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: What impact would this have to the brick and mortar small businesses?

2 MATT SHAPIRO: Increasing?

3 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Increasing the cap. So, if  
4 the brick and mortar, small businesses that are  
5 paying rent and sometimes business interruption  
6 insurance and myriad different costs, what impact  
7 would it have on them?

8 MATT SHAPIRO: Well vendors also pay costs. They  
9 have to pay for their carts. They have to pay  
10 licensing and permitting fees. They have to pay  
11 commissary storage fees. They don't pay nearly as  
12 much as brick and mortar's do that's correct but they  
13 also get a lot less. For a brick and mortar, they  
14 have a few thousand feet, a big store, 10,000 feet.  
15 They pay a lot more but they get a lot more. A  
16 vendor gets at most 10 feet of space on the sidewalk  
17 and they pay a lot less. So, they should get a lot  
18 less. So we believe that it's a fair you know, what  
19 they're paying is proportionate to what they're  
20 getting in return. There's all different types of  
21 business in New York City. There's big grocery  
22 stores, there's small produce stores, there's farmers  
23 markets, there's street vendors. All of these  
24 different types of business have always existed and  
25 they'll continue to exist side by side.



MOHAMED ATTIA: And if I may add Council Member, just one little thing here with the competition back in 2008, the Bloomberg Administration created the Green Card program and there was a huge opposition from the grocery stores and the bodega owners, saying that creating this program would pretty much kill their business selling fresh produce. However, years later, a study showed that the sale of fresh produce in these bodegas increased by 20 percent. So if we're looking at the economic impact, having more vendors in neighborhoods bring more foot traffic, bring more economic mobility into these neighborhoods and into these sidewalks, that benefits everyone. At the end of the day, if there are some small businesses who are concerned about competition, we heard earlier from DCWP that it's not the city to regulate based on competition. You cannot say sorry bodegas; you cannot be within 1,000 feet from super markets. You can not say sorry, you know brick and mortar restaurants, you cannot be within 500 feet from McDonalds. This is not the city's job but sadly, this is the main drive of the conversation because the city is taking sides and this is illegal. If were to take this to court, if the caps are placed

on the licenses and permits based on competition to curb the competition, we should be taking the city to court but the city never said that. The city never put on the record that they are keeping the caps only for the competition reasons. They are saying it's a public safety issue. However, years later after they place the caps, in 1995, a group of military veterans sued the city and they want access to all limited general vendor licenses. The public safety is still doing pretty well. The sky hasn't fallen. The vendors are not packed on every sidewalk. The system is still working and there is no limit. As of now there are about 1,200 veterans who own a merchandise vendor licenses. If 10,000 veterans walked tomorrow to DCWP office, they are entitled to receive the license immediately and hopefully public safety will not be an issue.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Have you met with the BIDs who are raising objections to this? Because I have obviously heard from many BIDs and other groups that have concerns about impact to small business. Many immigrant owned small businesses who are saying they're struggling to survive. What impact will this

have on them? So, have you sat with them to address their concerns that they're raising?

MOHAMED ATTIA: We have Chair Menin and we have over and over again over the last ten years met with a lot of BIDs and a lot of other groups who are concerned and some of them are in the position that we should limit the vendors or create specific places for vendors and get them away from our storefronts to eliminate the competition.

We shared over and over again that this is illegal. This is not something we will ever support. We believe that this city should work for everyone. If you have \$500 to start a business on a table, you should be able to have the opportunity. If you have half a million dollars to start a supermarket, good for you but you can not really come down on the little person.

In the conversation, their main concern is the enforcement. We're not against enforcement. We are against enforcement of a system that doesn't make any sense to anyone. We are against enforcement that a DSNY agent is going to a vendor yelling at them, telling them go get a license, it's cheap and then the vendor goes to DCWP and they are turned away,

1 saying sorry, we don't have a license. This is the  
2 kind of enforcement we are against. If there is some  
3 middle ground where we can have a functioning system  
4 that protects everyone's rights, we're 100 percent  
5 for it but I'm not going to sign off on something on  
6 a road that says oh, the vendors are second class  
7 businesses. They don't deserve the same opportunity  
8 that storefronts. We're going to keep them 1,000  
9 feet away from every storefront. This is something  
10 we cannot support. Because before there were  
11 supermarkets, there was vendors. Because there was  
12 bodegas there was vendors, because there was  
13 supermarkets and restaurants and any other brick and  
14 mortar, people were selling on the streets. So, if  
15 someone is reasonably discussing the topic with us,  
16 we're more than happy to discuss with them, find the  
17 middle ground, find how we can work together.

19 The only problem that they have and some of them  
20 mentioned off the record, that they don't have any  
21 problem with increasing the number of permits or  
22 licenses. Their main issue is enforcing the laws,  
23 which is again, we're not against enforcing the laws,  
24 if the laws make sense. If they don't make sense,

we're against every single ticket that's straight to the vendor that the vendor cannot comply with.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And last question that I have is related to the testimony we heard earlier from SBS because I was very troubled by SBS's apparent inability to give me a simple data point of how many small - how many street vendors they've helped with SBS services, so any comment on that?

MOHAMED ATTIA: Yes ma'am. Real quick and I can pass it to my colleagues as well. I happen to be a former food vendor. I was a vendor for ten years. I still keep my food vendor license active and a good status and I do get the letters from the city. This is a flyer that I received from SBS. The first sentence of the flyer it says, we have the resources. Street vendors need to operate or expand. Let's put expansion aside. Let's just talk about operating. If I need a permit, how would they help me get a permit? If brother Calvin here needs a license to operate the business; this is one, if you want to start business, one is to get the paperwork ready. So, the flyer they are sending to the vendors is misleading. If a vendor walks into their office and say hi, I'm selling merchandise, I need the proper

license and proper paperwork, they cannot help them cut the line.

On the other hand, mailing 22,000 of these doesn't really get you a lot of results. We as a small nonprofit, we hit the ground every single day. We are ten or maybe eleven staff members, we do street outreach. This is where we meet the vendors. The vendors don't google small business support. They don't google Street Vendor Project. That might happen once or twice a year but you have to meet people where they're at.

On the other side, with all due respect, all my lovely Council Members here, more than half of them send us email requests every single week requesting outreach in their districts and we get that much support from the Council, less than 20 percent of our budget. So, how can I be in 51 districts all at once educating the vendors. This is not the nonprofit job. This is the city job and if we are calling for \$7.7 million to the DSNY enforcement office of street vendor, let's call for \$7.7 million to create the resources for the vendors to educate them, right? We are seeing the response from the City Council. Last

2 month calling for \$7.7 million for the enforcement  
3 but zero dollars for education.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And how many times has SBS  
5 gone out with the Street Vendor Project to visit  
6 street vendors?

7 MOHAMED ATTIA: As far as I know, zero times and  
8 I've been involved with SVP for the 12 years.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay. Thank you very much to  
10 this panel.

11 CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: May I just add briefly  
12 on that?

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yeah.

14 CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: I just want to  
15 highlight the Street Vendor Project is very grateful  
16 for the support that we do receive from the Council  
17 and SBS for the work that we do. We are required to  
18 report on all of our grants that we receive. The  
19 location, the zip code. We have to provide photos  
20 for every meeting that we have, sign in sheets so it  
21 seems a bit hypocritical to require organizations  
22 that receive funding to do that if our city agencies  
23 are not required to do the same. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Thank you  
25 for your testimony, we appreciate it. Okay, I'm

going to call the next panel Erin Piscopink, Barbara Blair, Evan Sweet, and Nelson Eusebio. I apologize if I mispronounce, I can't read the writing. If you could please come forward. Oh thank you. Okay, thank you. Please begin. Oh, you need one minute, no problem. Oh, no, yeah, that's fine so instead uhm, do you want to go first? Yeah, great.

EVAN SWEET: Good day Chair Menin and Council Members. My name is Evan Sweet. I am the Director of Neighborhood Operations for the Meat Packing Business Improvement District. The BID is responsible for managing and maintaining one of New York City's premier live, work and play cultural districts on Manhattan's west side.

The Meat Packing BID provides comprehensive range of supplemental services, including sanitation, landscaping, public space management. All of which collectively ensure our neighborhood remains clean, safe, and welcoming to residents, businesses and visitors alike. These services are undermined by proliferation of mobile food and goods vendors which seriously infringe on pedestrians rights of way frequently block access to storefronts, fire hydrants, pollute catch basins from cooking grease



and undermine the investments in the public realm.

Things that have made the made the meat packing districts public spaces so successful.

While some believe the existing vending rules are enough to deal with limited bad actors, our daily experience managing New Yorks public realm tells a different story. Each day, vending creates a list of issues that are unaddressed by the city and outside of the Bid's ability to change. If it were any other industry, the matter would be swiftly addressed and legislation proposed to fix and not fumble this matter. We understand that properly regulated vendors are an important component of our city's diverse economy and cultural fabric and for many, a mobile street vending permit is a path to economic opportunity. However, we believe that simply expanding the number of permits without substantive structural changes to the city's vending policy will further complicate street vending and lead to worse outcomes across the five boroughs.

Any legislation must directly address the city's inability to enforce existing vending rules and to provide a comprehensive framework for integrating street vendors into the urban landscape and to not be

a detriment to brick and mortar businesses, public realm stores and the pedestrian experience.

Today's legislation falls short and thus only exacerbates the range of challenges directly caused by poorly regulated street vending which BIDs and communities across the city struggle to manage.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Yes, do you want to next?

Good morning Chair Menin and members of the Committee. I'm Barbara Blair, I'm the President of the Garment District Alliance, a BID in Midtown Manhattan and I'm here to testify against 431. The time has come for well-grounded legislation which addresses the city's wild, wild west vending policy. Despite repeated calls from the community for regulation of this pervasive public realm disorder, the Council persists in introducing legislation that allows for more vendors but lacks fundamental guardrails to regulate their activities. To be clear, we are not against vendors. In fact, the issue of how many licenses you want to give is irrelevant to the Garment district. What is relevant is regulating time, place, and manner that are

enforceable, rules that are enforceable and are in fact vigorously enforced. The bill, which adds vendors to the streets but does not specify regulations with ample funding and staffing to enforce them will only complicate the chaos in our neighborhoods and make rule enforcement more challenging. It's time to reimagine our communal spaces. Consider that neighborhoods are different and the midtown vending rules because of pedestrian, bike, vehicular congestion should be different for public safety and quality of life reasons.

Vending should be planned in the context of other public realm users such as pedestrians, cafés, emergency vehicles, brick and mortar retail entrances, bike docking, delivery vehicles, easy charging stations, to name a few. For our part, we request that any vendors be located in the curblane, not on the sidewalk. The argument the vendors would need to step into traffic is ridiculous. All drivers step out into traffic when they get out of a parked car. The bill does not address enforcement, which should be dramatically more rigorous.

As it currently is, vendors in our area act with impunity and shrug off citations.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Who wants  
3 to go next?

4 NELSON EUSEBIO: Can I go?

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, yes.

6 NELSON EUSEBIO: Thank you. My name is Nelson  
7 Eusebio. Thank you Chairman and members of the  
8 Committee for the opportunity to submit testimony  
9 from the National Supermarket Association. NSA is a  
10 trade organization representing the interest of  
11 independently owned supermarkets in New York City and  
12 beyond the five boroughs. NSA advocates for more  
13 than 600 supermarkets and 15,000 employees. NSA  
14 members are predominantly immigrant and minority  
15 entrepreneurs who have built a business from the  
16 ground up.

17 Our member stores are locally family owned  
18 business, many passed down from one generation to the  
19 next. That serves as an economy engine in the  
20 community and anchors of health, affordable food in  
21 our neighborhoods across our cities. Our member  
22 employs thousands of workers, pay local taxes and  
23 invest directly in the communities where they live.

24 We submit these comments today, not to oppose  
25 street vendors. Many of whom share similar

backgrounds to our members but to call for a functional, fair and enforceable vending system that works for all New Yorkers. The current system of street vending in New York City is deeply flawed. Overcrowded sidewalks, unregulated vending, inconsistent enforcement, have created an unattainable situation for both permit vendors and brick and mortar business.

For supermarkets in particular, the consequences are serious. Vague city and rules setting rules allow vendors to operate directly outside our store renters, which not only affects visibility and access but also creates real liability risk. Under law, supermarkets are responsible for maintaining the sidewalks in front of the stores and are legally liable for incidents that occur there. If a pedestrian should slip and fall on the crowded sidewalk, crowded with unregulated vending activity, the supermarket, the supermarket not the vendor is held liable.

This unfairly shifts the financial and legal responsibility onto supermarket owners. I know I just got the whistle but I just want to say that the brick and mortars are literally subsidizing

everything that goes on that sidewalk. We are responsible for the sidewalk from insurance, from fines from Department of Sanitation and if the city chooses to replace that sidewalk, they send us the bill.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and lastly.

ERIN PISCOPIK: Apologies for my delay.

Chairman and members of the New York City Council, my name is Erin Piscopink. I am the Executive Director of the SoHo Broadway Initiative but I'm here today in my capacity as Co-Chair of the New York City BID Association.

The Association is comprised of the 76 business improvement districts across New York that are as diverse as the city itself. BIDs are on the frontlines of economic development, neighborhood vibrancy and public realm management. It's critical that BIDs have a seat at the table when making public policy decisions about our street scape including vending. We understand that New York City has always had street vendors. Entrepreneurs who are trying to make a living and support their families. The same motivation drives our storefront businesses including the small shops and restaurants that make our

communities unique. As stewards of vibrant neighborhoods, BIDs welcome licensed street vendors who play by the rules in their districts. Some have voluntarily added vendors to their boards. However, BIDs are also deeply concerned about the lack of enforcement when it comes to common sense, time, place and manner restrictions on vending.

We welcome and have supported common sense changes to laws that will make it easier for street vendors to make a living but only in conjunction with the enforcement of sight and criteria and other regulations meant to ensure things like clear path for pedestrians and distant from storefront businesses. We're also not philosophically opposed to issuing new vending licenses but don't believe the city should double down on a broken system.

And I'll add here, you know we heard from DSNY earlier today that only 25 percent of the violations are regarding licensure, so we think a bigger part of the problem is time, place, manner.

Specifically, Intro. 431 would require the city to make available over 7,500 new vendor licenses over the next five years and then an unlimited number after that. The changes in Local Law 18 of 2021,

which require a gradual increase in the number of licenses along with increased enforcement and impact studies have yet to be fully realized. We respectfully believe that the new supervisory license system and Office of Street Vendor Enforcement should be given more time and resources to roll out before the number of licenses is increased. We also believe that an unlimited number of vending licenses will create many more problems than it will solve.

I'll end by saying we look forward to continuing our work with the Council and the Administration on this important policy discussion. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you very much for your testimony. I do have a question. I know for the and just in looking at the written testimony, the meat packing district, the National Supermarket Association, both of you are recommending particular structural reforms. Could you talk for a minute about what those reforms are that you urge the city to implement?

NELSON EUSEBIO: Sure, from my experience directing the operations in the Meat Packing District, I can say that even working with city agency partners to enforce issues that we see as it



relates to time, place and manner are very difficult if not impossible to undertake. We think that there needs to be some sort of changes to the way that enforcement is done or in clarity from perhaps the Council or from the city itself to direct different agencies on how to undertake enforcement and what actions are clearly enforceable or not enforceable to undertake.

EVAN SWEET: Yes, uh we believe expand enforcement resources allocate \$10 million to hire additional 118 DSNY enforcement agents to Community Board to ensure educated year around proactive oversight, set clear and enforceable requirement. We asked for a 55 foot buffer from the front of our stores, decriminalize violations, we feel people shouldn't be criminalized because they're out there vending. Create a Mayor's Office of Street Vending. We support the Intro. 408, but we advocate to centralize and coordinate of many agencies involved in street vending. With these measures, we believe we can support this bill.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you. Any questions from colleagues?

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 130

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Do you happen to have  
3 uhm, the number of how many of your supermarket  
4 members have vending directly in front of their  
5 markets?

6 EVAN SWEET: Currently, about 20 percent.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: About 20 percent. How  
8 many members do you have in the association?

9 EVAN SWEET: Over we represent over 600  
10 supermarkets.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay.

12 EVAN SWEET: In the five boroughs.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, great thank you so  
14 much.

15 EVAN SWEET: Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Chair. I just  
17 want to thank you all for continued engagement. I  
18 don't know that all of you but most of you attended  
19 the conversations we had in November and I think  
20 we've come a long way. I really tried; we really  
21 tried to make sure that the hearing was on the  
22 amended legislation but it just didn't work out but I  
23 want to ask questions about the amended legislation.  
24 The amendments that we are wanting to pursue which  
25 are particularly first increasing the number of

1 sanitation officers as the availability of licenses  
2 increases, so that we're increasing the capacity to  
3 as you said, I'm sorry, I have a lot of papers in  
4 front of me but as you said, make sure that we as a  
5 city have the ability to go after the time, place and  
6 manner you know restrictions that are currently on  
7 the books and even as we consider others.

8 And second, the second amendment would create  
9 clear standards for how a vendors license can be  
10 suspended and revoked after persistent violations.  
11 So, these items go hand and hand, right? It's all  
12 about balance. This is not - I'm not here to be  
13 dogmatic. I'm not here to do anything except try to  
14 get as closer to something that makes sense. A  
15 rational system in the City of New York. And so, I  
16 ask you and you highlighted a few changes already but  
17 beyond licenses and we can have many conversations  
18 about how to change the number of licenses and I look  
19 forward to those. On enforcement, is there anything  
20 else that you would specifically want to see the city  
21 do? You mentioned 50 feet, a change to 50 feet. Are  
22 there any other specifics you would want to see  
23 changed?  
24  
25

BARBARA BLAIR: Well, I think just having listened to the panel that you had, the City Administration panel about education and reaching out to the vendors, you know the licensing, to receive a license, maybe instead of relying on them maybe getting an SBS brochure that maybe they do or don't read. You know maybe there's some course that you have to take like you have to take a course to get a driver's license and then you have to pass the course and then you're issued a license.

So, that's just one thing. The other thing that we mentioned. My testimony is not two minutes; was the idea that as you add licenses, you add enforcement and so, that requires money in the budget to hire those people because we heard that there's not the capacity within these agencies because they're already over capacity in terms of what they have to do. There's just not enough staffing. And then finally, at least from our perspective in the Garment District in Midtown Manhattan, the streets are very narrow. There very crowded. We have illegal vending all over the place. NYPD, DSNY, we are in touch with them all the time. They enforce to the degree that they're able to. If you're a repeat

offender, your goods should be confiscated and destroyed and you're never vending again, ever. And this idea that you can get multiple summonses and use them as wallpaper in your living room makes a mockery of the Council and our justice system.

ERIN PISCOPIK: I want to just thank you for the effort that you put in to those roundtables in the fall. I'm really appreciative to have a seat at the table like we discussed but uhm, what's clearly a good faith effort on your part to continue in the dialogue. I appreciate it very, very much.

I think with respect to DSNY, I worry that there might be some kind of missing components around enforcement education. As a brief example, we - after literal years of asking for enforcement from DSNY, we're able to get enforcement in SoHo about a week ago and consistently 90 percent of the vendors we have in the district are out of compliance in one way or another with vending laws.

When DSNY came out, they issued only two summonses which were kind of outside of the scope of DSNY enforcement. More related to vending from metered parking. Because the vendors they were interacting with were licensed but that doesn't mean

that time, place, manner was correct. It just means they were licensed and so, I think there's a real gap in where we're seeing enforcement and where we need enforcement in the community as it is. And I'll also say I can completely understand an agency needing increased resources but it's interesting to me that in the first week where you know composting became mandatory, the agency was able to issue I think 2,000 summonses in that opening week. So, the agency clearly has the ability to do enforcement and issue summonses. I think there's just a mismatch or some problems that we could solve together.

EVAN SWEET: Just to add on a little of that, you know I don't want to say too much about our agency partner who we work very closely with to make sure our streets are clean you know day in and day out but I will say that with DSNY enforcement issues, we have found a disconnect as Erin just mentioned about their understanding of where vending law or vending enforcement can take place or what they're able to enforce. I think having better education on the agency side on being clear and those guidelines would be very important and supportive of the overall ability to enforce.

The second thing I would say is that you know I work in the operation side of our organization as well as the public realm investment and improvement. So, when I work with agencies like the DOT to install new seating or new public space amenities, I have to go through landmarks. I have to go through the DOT review and a number of different places and while I'm not here to suggest that we need to put a whole new administrative burden on vending, I think the ability for an entity to just set up on a street without any kind of guidance, framework, or structure or what is frankly in the city limited guidance framework infrastructure versus what I have to do is very difficult.

I know in some other cities, the city even in fact designates parking spots as vending spaces and sells those to street vendors, right? There's a number of other ways to help codify and structure on the locations for vending and kind of helped with some of these time, place and manner issues in that way and I also would agree with Barbara Blair here about having the opportunity or the ability for vending to take place in the curb lane versus on the sidewalk, especially in very congested districts like

the Meat Packing District or the Garment District on Broadway.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. I was taking vigorous notes. I really want to appreciate that. I guess I just want to just link from my heart, just say this out loud right? You know because you probably heard her crying. I have two babies. One is five months old. She calls the shots. What she wants, she gets right but the two year old, the two and a half year old, there's only so much sternness that I can do to get him to behave the way I want, right? It's bed time, if I just tell him it's bed time, it's not going to work, right? There has to be a back and forth and not to infantilize this situation but to bring it to the policy making realm, we have to have carrots and sticks. We can't just have the sticks. I agree the sticks are important and we got to fix the way that we lay out the sticks, right. Pick up sticks, seven, eight, lay them straight.

Okay, we have to fix the way that we enforce right but this aspect about the licensing, I really want to continue conversation with you all because I think it can go such a long way to changing behavior



the way that when I sit down and I reason with my two year old or I try and I tell him mommy's really tired, can you please help me and go to bed? Every now and then, he's like alright mom, fine. So, I just want to thank you for the ongoing engagement, for the good ideas, and you know really just like ask and you know implore; that's the word I'm looking for, implore you to continue coming to the table and helping us to get to a better place.

NELSON EUSEBIO: And we thank the City Council for this opportunity. We'd just like to say from behalf of the supermarkets that just remember in the 70's where New York was falling apart and a lot of the change, most of the change left the City of New York. It was the independent supermarkets that kept these neighborhoods together. It was the independent supermarkets that kept these neighborhoods away from all the drugs and the unemployment and so forth, and we are the first stepping stone for immigrants that come to this country seeking a work place. They come to us. Where in some cases, just like you said, we're too big and in some cases, we're too small. We're not against street vending's but we have fought hard for the position that we have now and still like

2 I said before, we subsidize these sidewalks. We're  
3 in charge of these sidewalks. Everything that  
4 happens on the sidewalks comes to us. We're not  
5 asking to eliminate street vendors but we're asking  
6 please if they can just sit a little further away  
7 from our front door.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you so much  
9 for that response. I have Council Member that has  
10 questions for this panel.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I have a question. I  
12 have been listening online because I was at a  
13 funeral, so I was at the funeral with my - listening  
14 in my earbuds. My question is to the supermarkets  
15 because I have had a situation where I am conscious  
16 of a small bodega and a coffee person vending  
17 outside. And so, I have actually moved them myself,  
18 you know gotten them to go further away but if you  
19 call to do that, do you get any response?

20 In other words, I do think it's unfair if you are  
21 a small grocery store, bodega, having somebody send  
22 coffee right outside. When you call, does that make  
23 any difference as to the person moving?

24 NELSON EUSEBIO: It's such a sad situation  
25 because right now when you call, they tell you that

they will get to it and they give you like a little number, your number 321 or whatever the case may be. 90 percent of the time, they never show up and when you check your number has been removed from the waiting list, and when we do have them come and remove the person, a week later, that person is back in front of our stores all over again and then when you try to call them back that they feel that the issue hasn't already been settled or you don't get nobody on the other end of the line. It's really frustrating on that part.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you and for the BIDs, my question is roadway, would that be a parking issue as opposed to the sidewalk? But if it is roadway, would that make a big difference in terms of support for the vendors?

BARBARA BLAIR: I think these BIDs as you well know Council Member all very, very different. So, in Midtown Manhattan, in the Garment District, our sidewalks are unusually narrow.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know.

BARBARA BLAIR: So, right? So, in our case, we would much prefer that they were in a parking spot in the curb line. Not all districts are equal so I do

think it has to be a little more nuanced and maybe the guideline is the width of the sidewalk.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: SoHo?

ERIN PISCOPIK: Hi, I'll echo what Barbara just said and with my BID Association hat on add to the nuance that we're talking about 76 districts in 76 neighborhoods. Many of which are -

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know all the ones in Manhattan.

ERIN PISCOPIK: Yeah, many of our you know colleague BIDs are in the outer boroughs where parking is a really, really, really important issue for people and so, yeah, I'll just echo. I think that this isn't a one size fits all solution but it could help alleviate some of the sidewalk congestion in particular districts.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Well, maybe with the sidewalk and community board somewhere have an input might be helpful. Okay, thank you.

NELSON EUSEBIO: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Seeing no other questions. This panel is now dismissed. I'd like to call up for the next panel Scott Foletta, James

Gonzalez, Adrian Cepeda, Juan Nunez, and Shamier Settle.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Sorry, please begin. Thank you.

SCOTT FOLETTA: Thank you. My name is Scott Foletta and I am the Managing Attorney for the Immigration Defense Team at the Neighborhood Defender Service of Harlem, the public defender office for upper Manhattan and I just wanted to speak to you today about the critical importance of street vendor reform for immigrant New Yorkers.

New comers to New York City often face many challenges finding employment from lack of work authorization to limited English proficiency to employment discrimination and street vendor businesses offer a way around these challenges by starting your own small business and become your own employer. And in this way, street vending enables many immigrants to provide for their families but over policing risks placing these same individuals into the deportation pipeline.

Newcomers are often unaware of the laws around street vending and enforcement can be arbitrary and punitive. When somebody is arrested or given a

criminal summons, they're fingerprinted and that fingerprint automatically triggers ICE to become aware of their case. If the person is arrested by ICE, any conviction they get through this process can result in them being denied benefits like asylum by an immigration judge. So, Introduction 47 addresses these risks by requiring civil as opposed to criminal summonses and ensuring that these violations are no longer treated as misdemeanors.

The Trump Administration is targeting all immigrants in our city, not just those who are undocumented and they aim to spread fear in immigrant communities and use criminalization as a tool to deport more of our neighbors and unfortunately, our mayor has taken dangerous steps to collaborate with this deportation agenda. New Yorkers should not have to fear being placed into the deportation pipeline simply to provide for their families.

So, while ICE is trying to tear communities down, let us instead build them up. This Council should decriminalize street vending and provide New Yorkers increased access to this critical stepping stone to stability. Thank you.

2 ADRIAN CEPEDA: Hi, good afternoon. My name is  
3 Adrian Cepeda, I am the sole owner of the Worlds  
4 Borough Bookshop that is located in the Worlds  
5 Borough, which is Queens It is a bookstore that  
6 amplifies BIPOC voices and really represents a  
7 diversity of Jackson Heights.

8 Now, I had a different speech before I came here  
9 today but as someone who represents brick and mortar,  
10 this idea of competition and this idea of them taking  
11 resources or businesses away is extremely interesting  
12 to me because it doesn't make any sense personally.  
13 When you see competition, I don't view competition as  
14 something that's bad. Competition is important for  
15 everyone. It is what leads to innovation. If I am  
16 selling books, not serving my community and there's  
17 another book store across the street from me, who is  
18 offering events, authors internationally and from  
19 across the United States, I'm going to assume that  
20 book store is doing better than me.

21 If your store, given the amount of feet that I am  
22 given, I cannot give enough to my community or offer  
23 community events, know your rights workshops, bring  
24 in these authors, offer a third space for them, then  
25 I'm not doing what I was supposed to do.

So, I want to make you guys understand and make everyone here know that Jackson Heights, I've lived there for 30 years. I was a first immigrant here. My mom was born here but my dad was not. He came here. He did not go to college. They did not have college education of the first in higher ed. A lot of these families are just working to provide for their children. I am working to provide for not only my child but for the children of the neighborhood who are now growing up with a book store where when I grew up there for 30 years, I did not have a book store. There was no book stores anywhere. But what was there were food venders, street vendors. I grew up all around there with street vendors and food vendors and they are the ones who served me when I was a borough college student. They are the ones who served many families around there and they are the ones who provided payments to the catholic school that I went to for their children because they wanted their kids to have good education.

So, these families are here to work hard. They're here not to make one million dollars. They're here just to provide food. I own a book store. I will not be a millionaire. I know that but



I do it to provide for the community, just like these street vendors are.

JAMES GONZALES: Thank you first and foremost for taking the time to hear us out. So, my name is James Gonzalez. I'm the Co-owner of La Fonda Boricua or known as La Fonda now. The heart of the change in New York City and I stand here not just a small business owner but as a New Yorker who believes deeply in the promise of opportunity. Equality and dignity for all who labor to make this city live.

That's why I support the Street Vendor reform package, especially Intro.'s 431 and 408. They aren't just bills, they are recognition. A recognition that the people selling food, T-shirts, books or belts on our corners and sidewalks are entrepreneurs just like me. They are the beating heart of our neighborhoods, cultural bearers, and job creators. They are not a nuisance; they are a necessity. Right now we have a system that punishes the very people it should be uplifting. It is outdated, unjust and unsustainable but with these reforms, we have the chance to create a system that is fair, enforceable and rooted in reality. One where street vendors can operate with clarity,

respect, and the same chance to growth that every small business deserves. This isn't just about economics, it's about the soul of the city when we open doors for one another, we build a New York that thrives not just in profit but in purpose.

If we allow these bills to live, we allow the people to live. We begin to remember how to grow not apart but together. Let's move forward not with fear but with faith, the kind of faith that built this city in the first place. Thank you.

JUAN NUNEZ: Good afternoon everybody. My name is Juan Nunez. I am a community organizer with the Northwest Bronx Community and Clergy Coalition. I wanted to thank Chair Menin and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today in support of Intro.'s 431 and 408. I'm currently organizing around the redevelopment of the Kings Bridge Armory. This massive building that is already having a massive impact on the small businesses on the Kings Bridge Corridor that includes brick and mortar and street vendors.

The Northwest Bronx fights for racial justice and economic justice to transform the Bronx and beyond so that all of our people could thrive. We help form

tenant associations; merchant associations and we're here as part of the Street Vendor Reform Coalition with Street Vendor Project because we know that communities thrive when we work and organize together. Because you see the street vendor that was ticketed is your neighbor whose kids attend the local elementary school two blocks away from the church you all go pray at on Sunday's. We are all going through the same struggle. Everything is getting more expensive. We have some of the highest eviction rates in the city in the Bronx, residential and commercial. So, if it's happening to you, it's happening to your neighbor.

Over the past three years I've been working closely with the brick and mortar businesses on the corridor, hoping to reactivate the merchant association, providing resources, training, workshops, through SBS and other really good partners.

And I've been meeting with the vendors at the armory also providing resources, compliance training, direct services, anything we can do to support them which isn't much unless they have a permit or a license.

Which is interesting because the same could be said for brick and mortar businesses operating without long term leases. So, I really don't understand how any small business owner could be opposed to these two pieces of legislation knowing that the biggest threat to your business is real estate speculation, not the lady selling taquitos down the block. This is a human rights issue. There is no need to send sanitation police in swat gear, which I've seen myself to hand people a \$250 ticket. We have NYC best teams that go to brick and mortar businesses, we could do the same for street vendors and provide permits and licenses.

So please, I'm in support of these two bills and I thank you for your time.

SHAMIER SETTLE: Good afternoon members of the New York City Council and Chair Menin. My name is Shamier Settle and I'm a senior policy analyst at the Immigration Research Initiative. I'm also a Native New Yorker and a fourth generation resident of City Council 9.

In September 2024, we published a report, Street Vendors of New York. For an industry that's characteristic of life in New York City, we have

until now known surprisingly little about the vendors that provide economic activity that ignites so many city streets. How many vendors work in New York City? How much do they earn? What countries are they from? What challenges are they facing? How old are they?

This report for the first time gives a comprehensive empirical answer to these questions. The report was based on data collected from a comprehensive survey that was administered to more than 2,000 street vendors in 2021 by the Street Vendor Project. The survey was analyzed by us at the Immigration Research Initiative using statistical weights that were provided by Professor Johnathan Auerbach from George Mason University, so that the findings and the report would represent the approximately 23,000 vendors that operate throughout the city.

So, Professor Auerbach's report said that there were approximately 20,500 mobile food vendors and 2,400 general merchandise vendors. From that, our key findings say that according to our survey analysis, there are most vendors have licenses, so that's 63 percent. Only one in four food vendors

have permits. There's a whole list of finding that you can see in the report. 96 percent of vendors are immigrants; 49 percent of vendors are women. Two out of every three vendors lack access to a restroom where they work. It was a really, really extensive survey and I look forward to your questions.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Do you have questions? Okay, we do not have questions but we would appreciate if you could submit the written testimony.

SHAMIER SETTLE: Yeah, will do.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you so much. Thank you for your testimony today. I'm now going to call the next panel. Angel Hart, Noah Sheroff, Brian McGinn, and Dan Scorse. If you could please come down. Thank you.

Wait just one second. I called four names. Uhm, I just want to make sure. Okay, so Brian McGinn, Noah Sheroff, Angel Hart, Dan Scorse. Okay, okay, alright, please begin. Thanks.

DAN SCORSE: Everyone agrees that street vending in New York City is broken. However, Intro. 431 simply doubles down on that brokenness. Street vending is a private for profit business taking place

on public land. The city has the right to regulate street vending. In fact, the city has the duty to regulate it.

Lifting the vendor cap would be a disaster. All areas with high foot traffic would be inundated with vendors, choking sidewalks and local businesses. If that happens, I will look forward to returning to this room when just accessors propose reinstituting the current cap.

Why not test this limitless license idea in a small part of the city? Perhaps in a business commercial area represented by one of the bill supporters. Unfortunately I doubt any City Council member would sacrifice their district to test a plan that's destined to fail.

I have 30 more seconds and your attention, so please allow me to make one more point. Under city law, any truck driver caught idling for over three minutes is subject to a hefty fine and yet we allow thousands of food vendors to run gas power generators all day every day within inches of pedestrians. These generators are loud, polluting and stay in the sidewalks. Please fix this hypocritical loophole and

expressly prohibit street vendors from using gas powered generators. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Can you just identify yourself for the record because we didn't get that.

DAN SCORSE: Sorry, Dan Scorse, the Hudson Yards Hells Kitchen Alliance.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay great, thank you.

NOAH SHEROFF: Good afternoon Council Members.

Thank you for this opportunity. My name is Noah

Sheroff and I represent a small business improvement

district in Northeast Queens, the Bayside Village

BID. We are located in what is often referred to as

a transportation desert. Two bus lines run through

the districts, as does the Long Island Railroad.

Still commercial rents are high. Some examples

include 13,000, 14,000 and 23,000 per month with an

additional 4,000 to 8,000 per month in utilities.

Costs that street vendors and mobile vendors do not

face. Currently, three food trucks operate in the

district. Two of them on a daily basis and one

weekly. An additional periodic street vendors sell

flowers and gifts. The BID has little ability to

help businesses impacted by these vendors. For food

trucks, the main violation is either you're parked in



a metered space during certain hours. A few months ago, a business closed its doors after years of battling the food truck selling cuisine several yards from its entrance for a fraction of the cost.

While I understand and certainly empathize with the street vendors, times are indeed tough and getting tougher. I recognize that there are small business owners from diverse backgrounds, including a substantial Chinese and Korean business community within the district already struggling to survive. As one business owner stated, additional street vendors would adversely impact our business at a time it's already difficult to survive. This would likely result in a substantial loss of jobs. I ask that you please reconsider this proposal and help our brick and mortar stores thrive. Thank you.

BRIAN MCGINN: Good afternoon ladies and gentleman of the Council. My name is Brian McGinn and I sit before you today on behalf of the 34<sup>th</sup> Street Partnership and the Bryant Park Corporation. Two business improvement districts in Midtown to testify against Intro.'s 431 and 1251.

In the 34<sup>th</sup> Street District, which spans from 29<sup>th</sup> Street to 35<sup>th</sup> Street and from Park Avenue to Tant

Avenue, we regularly observe license vendors operating in prohibited areas and unlicensed vendors working illegally.

Together, they pose a serious threat to pedestrian safety and quality of life in public spaces. These are the same vendors that operate every day and they know the rules. The most common complaint we hear from the property owners is that the vendors throughout the storefronts and obstruct the pedestrian right of way on already crowded sidewalks. Even license vendors frequently ignore these restrictions on when and where they're allowed to operate.

Our security staff works hard to protect pedestrians when vendors behave dangerously. In an alarming incident last year, a licensed vendor illegally operating in our district threatened one of our security guards with a knife. We are deeply concerned that expanding the number of vending licenses or eliminating the cap entirely would have an immediate harmful effect on pedestrian safety and the quality of life in Midtown and across the city. Thank you for your time.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much for your  
3 testimony. Any questions? Oh yes and we've been  
4 joined by Council Member Brewer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I was here earlier.  
6 Thank you. Brian, the question. I know how uhm,  
7 your boss feels about this issue.

8 BRIAN MCGINN: Yeah.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: My question is, when you  
10 call for 311, 911, in any case, what happens? Is it  
11 no response? Because I know that you -

12 BRIAN MCGINN: So, it depends on the situation.  
13 Like I said in my testimony, a lot of the vendors  
14 that we have in the 34<sup>th</sup> Street Partnership, we  
15 manage Harold Square. We manage Greely Square.  
16 These are public parks that the partnership manages  
17 and we'll get the same vendors everyday that when we  
18 ask them to leave they out and out refuse to leave.  
19 So, then of course, we have to call the police  
20 department to take some kind of enforcement action.  
21 Also, the Sanitation Department. So, we call over  
22 and over 311. We have a decent relationship with  
23 both agencies and this is when it gets you know  
24 enforcement action is taken but it's the same vendors  
25 that know the rules over and over and they refuse to

do it. I invite any one of you to walk 34<sup>th</sup> Street with me on a nice day. There's no vending on 34<sup>th</sup> Street and you'll see food cart after food cart with smoke into Macy's over by the Empire State Building, Madison - by Madison Square Garden. You see vendors in front of the souvenir shops that call us constantly every day and they're losing a fortune when people have their items spread out.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But there are some legal vendors in legal places that are doing the right thing. Is that a correct statement?

BRIAN MCGINN: There are some. The ones that we deal with on 34<sup>th</sup> Street are licensed vendors at an illegal spot.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: In the wrong place.

BRIAN MCGINN: And when we ask them to move, sometimes it gets a little testy and they know that they're wrong and they continue to do it and you know Barbara Blair in her testimony, you could give them a million summonses. They could use it as wallpaper. She's 100 percent right. Something needs to be done.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright thank you.

BRIAN MCGINN: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay Majority Leader Farias.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Have you folks ever considered looking at concession, legal concession areas versus street vending? For example, in 34<sup>th</sup> Street. I mean I was there last night and I think many of us that are born and raised in this city know what 34<sup>th</sup> Street is like, just like 42<sup>nd</sup> and all of the other major hubs where there's an arena or a major institution and there will always be some level of vending.

Have you considered looking at mandating concession areas with the City of New York in those zones?

BRIAN MCGINN: I think that would be a great idea. I think if there was a spot that we could work together with to say okay, this is a concession zone and as long as the businesses also agree with it and it's not effecting somebody's business or a pedestrian right of way, I think it's a great idea.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Because I know we've attempted some pilot like that in Queens right, where we have an entire space designated with kiosks that have concession stands and I have had conversations with the Administration in our side in the Council. There might be hubs in areas where even the folks

that are unlicensed, even though it sounds like you're having problems with some of the licensed people as well could purchase you know their spot and their time with the concession area and it's there's and it's mandated and that's where it's regulated. I'd love to continue the conversation offline to see how I can be helpful in that.

BRIAN MCGINN: Absolutely, I think it's worth looking into yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, please.

DAN SCORSE: Just one of the things I want to mention in response to that. I think even though we may have fewer vendors that would be a great idea if we had the space in Queens. Unfortunately, we just don't have the availability to do that. Parking is a major concern for both BID visitors and merchants alike. So, it's quite difficult and that tends to be part of the battle unfortunately.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, no, I think that's totally understandable. I think the reason why I bring up the example of concessions in this one space versus you know attracting vending is I agree and I think we all agree there isn't a one size fit all in

all of New York City and there are some folks that are here today asking for vending to move to a parking spot. My district does not want the outside dining regulations and they don't want vending in the parking spot either right.

And not every sidewalk can take it. That doesn't necessarily mean that we don't look at every angle that we can that fits the best community. This will take an all hands approach from our side of the Council but also from the Administration who might just only see that we want to expand. We want to look at every measure that's possible to make New York City and its entrepreneurs and business owners work well together and thrive and like that's the goal here. And that might mean that we're looking at multiple approaches.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Council Member Sanchez.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Chair. I'm now present with my Co-Chair my - I know, with [INAUDIBLE 03:01:56]. First, I just want to address I would sacrifice my district to have limitless licenses because there already there, right and if I can just get them to behave the right way that you know, I think that would make a big difference.

With that said, I just want to you know go back to my earlier point, understanding where you folks stand in terms of you know lifting the caps entirely. I described the amendments that we are proposing to Intro. 431 regarding increasing - you're being distracted Majority Leader. Regarding increasing enforcement. Is there anything that you would add? Same question that we asked to the last panel. Is there anything beyond increasing enforcement resources and then you know to your point about the paper on the wall, adding escalating enforcement and suspension and revocation. Is there anything else you would add?

BRIAN MCGINN: Yeah, again, I would just say uhm, continued violations - we'd have to have continued - worse consequences. Uhm, like I said, the vendors that we have that we have the problems with did the same ones over and over and over and that would be my only comment.

DAN SCORSE: I'm going to say that if there was a way to directly speak with food truck operators, that would be helpful. Just to give an example, one of the issues we're facing is uhm every weekend there's a food truck operator that comes and because of the



smoke, it's a [INAUDIBLE 03:03:36] food truck. The food is fantastic admittedly but it does interfere with one of the second floor tenants has really bad asthma and he's been impacted by the smoke going into his window and that's something that we've been going back and forth with bouncing from say DSNY to NYPD to Department of Health to DEP will start to get involved since it's related to smoke and it's just a matter of at this point, I'm not even sure where to turn. It sometimes feels like we're pounding the pavement and even though the agencies have been very receptive and very helpful, sometimes it just feels sort of like a whirlwind. Thank you.

NOAH SHEROFF: I think I said it in my testimony but gas powered generators I think are ridiculous for street vendors. I understand why they want to use them. Some of them do use batteries and have backup batteries. It is an option but I don't think gas powered generators should be allowed and similar to the smoke in the second floor window comment.

But I wanted to also say that the revocation of permits for repeat offenders would obviously be a great thing.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you very much to this panel. The next panel is Eliana Jaramillo, Angel Flores, Jose Sanchez, and Luz Uruchima. If you could please come down. Thank you.

Okay, please begin.

JOSE SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE:  
[03:06:50]- [03:08:06].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Jose Sanchez. I have been a street vendor in the City of New York for 12 years. I live in the Bronx and I work in Westchester Avenue. I am a father of family and I need to provide for my children, my business as a street vendor generate employment for my community and my friends and then he was - SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:08:33]- [03:08:35].

JOSE SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:08:37]-  
[03:08:41].

INTERPRETER: And I put in God's hands and his authority the decision that you will make.

JOSE SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:08:48]-  
[03:08:52].

INTERPRETER: It's an outcry from the people that we have every day so that's what we have behind.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 163  
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Please silence your cell  
3 phones guys, please.  
4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:12]-  
5 [03:09:14].  
6 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Luz  
7 Uruchima.  
8 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:18]-  
9 [03:09:23].  
10 INTERPRETER: And I've been a street vendor all  
11 my life since my parents taught me how to work.  
12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:28]-  
13 [03:09:32].  
14 INTERPRETER: I live in Brooklyn. I work in  
15 Sunset Park.  
16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:35]-  
17 [03:09:37].  
18 INTERPRETER: I sell general things.  
19 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:39]-  
20 [03:09:43].  
21 INTERPRETER: And you have talked today about a  
22 lot of things but the main issue here -  
23 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:47].  
24 INTERPRETER: Is the customer.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 164

2 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:49]-

3 [03:09:50].

4 INTERPRETER: What does the customer want?

5 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:52]-

6 [03:09:55].

7 INTERPRETER: What does the customer ask when

8 they come into a store?

9 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:58]-

10 [03:10:01].

11 INTERPRETER: They discriminate us as street

12 vendors on the street.

13 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:06]-

14 [03:10:10].

15 INTERPRETER: But have you asked them, the

16 customer, how they are treated by the owners of

17 businesses?

18 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:15]-

19 [03:10:17].

20 INTERPRETER: They are discriminated when they go

21 inside stores, they get discriminated.

22 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:20]-

23 [03:10:22].

24 INTERPRETER: They don't let them touch their

25 merchandise.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 165  
2 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:26].  
3 INTERPRETER: Not all of them, some.  
4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:28]-  
5 [03:10:30].  
6 INTERPRETER: But they have done this and I have  
7 witnessed this.  
8 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:34]-  
9 [03:10:37].  
10 INTERPRETER: Owners that mistreat people who  
11 come in to their store to buy.  
12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:42]-  
13 [03:10:48].  
14 INTERPRETER: Knowing that they live from us and  
15 they mistreat them, nonetheless.  
16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:53].  
17 INTERPRETER: And they don't care.  
18 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:55] -  
19 [03:10:58].  
20 INTERPRETER: In less than a week, the police  
21 issued three tickets to me.  
22 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:03] -  
23 [03:11:04].  
24 INTERPRETER: In less than a week.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 166  
2 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:06]-  
3 [03:11:07].  
4 INTERPRETER: Each ticket is \$1,000.  
5 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:09]-  
6 [03:11:15].  
7 INTERPRETER: It's not even what we earn or  
8 someone like you earn \$1,000.  
9 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:20]-  
10 [03:11:21].  
11 INTERPRETER: And nobody cares.  
12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:22]-  
13 [03:11:24].  
14 INTERPRETER: Nobody cares but we are good  
15 people.  
16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:26]-  
17 [03:11:30].  
18 INTERPRETER: We are honorable, responsible  
19 people. We pay our taxes every year.  
20 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:35]-  
21 [03:11:39].  
22 INTERPRETER: And all that we do is provide the  
23 community a service.  
24 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:42]-  
25 [03:11:47].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 167

2 INTERPRETER: Just like a doctor does, a

3 president does, a cab driver does.

4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:50]-

5 [03:11:56].

6 INTERPRETER: We provide a service and we give to

7 the community.

8 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:58]-

9 [03:12:00].

10 INTERPRETER: God says make an effort, be

11 courageous.

12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:04]-

13 [03:12:08].

14 INTERPRETER: Here, we have courageous women and

15 men representing. We are parents, mothers.

16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:15]-

17 [03:12:18].

18 INTERPRETER: Single moms who don't have a

19 husband to support them.

20 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:21]-

21 [03:12:25].

22 INTERPRETER: We have to pay bills. We have to

23 pay rent. We have to support ourselves.

24 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:29]-

25 [03:12:30].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 168  
2 INTERPRETER: And we go to the street to provide  
3 a service.  
4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:33].  
5 INTERPRETER: And what does the government do?  
6 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:37]-  
7 [03:12:40].  
8 INTERPRETER: They want to cancel us as if we  
9 were criminals, which we are not.  
10 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:43]-  
11 [03:12:47]  
12 INTERPRETER: What we do, what we serve, what we  
13 manufacture.  
14 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:51]-  
15 [03:12:54].  
16 INTERPRETER: We do food, we provide, we create  
17 gifts and all that we do is with our heart.  
18 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:13:00]-  
19 [03:13:04].  
20 INTERPRETER: In order to pay our bills and to  
21 move our families forward with honor.  
22 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:13:08]-  
23 [03:13:09].  
24 INTERPRETER: Thank you for listening to me.  
25



1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 169

2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

3 [03:13:21]- [03:13:24].

4 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon and your excellency

5 in the audience.

6 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

7 [03:13:27] - [03:13:34].

8 INTERPRETER: My name is Eliana. I am very proud

9 to be a member and leader of [INAUDIBLE 03:13:37].

10 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

11 [03:13:39]- [03:13:42].

12 INTERPRETER: And I am a founding member of

13 Street Vendor Project.

14 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

15 [03:13:46]- [03:13:49].

16 INTERPRETER: I have lived in the city of New

17 York for 43 years.

18 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

19 [03:13:52]- [03:13:57].

20 INTERPRETER: And I have worked as a street

21 vendor for 39 years.

22 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

23 [03:14:01]- [03:14:08].

24 INTERPRETER: So, I work legally with a license

25 but I have never been able to obtain a permit.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 170  
2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
3 [03:14:13]- [03:14:16].  
4 INTERPRETER: I live alone and this is how I  
5 survive.  
6 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
7 [03:14:19]- [03:14:23].  
8 INTERPRETER: I do not have a big business or a  
9 boss to protect me.  
10 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
11 [03:14:26]- [03:14:30].  
12 INTERPRETER: I just have my own hands and my  
13 efforts.  
14 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
15 [03:14:32]- [03:14:39].  
16 INTERPRETER: In fact, after all these years, I  
17 continue receiving summonses because I don't have a  
18 permit.  
19 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
20 [03:14:45]- [03:14:48].  
21 INTERPRETER: The truth is that we cannot obtain  
22 one.  
23 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
24 [03:14:53]- [03:15:04].  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 171

2 INTERPRETER: So the truth is that when we go to  
3 request a permit, the city tells us we have no  
4 licenses for you and then they punish for not having  
5 one.

6 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
7 [03:15:13]- [03:15:21].

8 INTERPRETER: This is why we are demanding that  
9 the City Council approve the projects, the bills, the  
10 reform bills for street vendors.

11 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
12 [03:15:30]- [03:15:38].

13 INTERPRETER: Number 431, 408, 47 and 24.

14 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
15 [03:15:42]- [03:15:50].

16 INTERPRETER: These bills would finally provide  
17 street vendors a pathway to work legally and without  
18 fear.

19 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
20 [03:15:56]- [03:16:02].

21 INTERPRETER: Street vending is not a job for me.

22 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
23 [03:16:04]- [03:16:06].

24 INTERPRETER: It's my independence.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 172  
2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
3 [03:16:07]- [03:16:08].  
4 INTERPRETER: It's my survival.  
5 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
6 [03:16:10]- [03:16:13].  
7 INTERPRETER: It gives me the power to survive on  
8 my own.  
9 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
10 [03:16:16]- [03:16:22].  
11 INTERPRETER: With dignity after decades  
12 contributing to this great city.  
13 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
14 [03:16:27]- [03:16:29].  
15 INTERPRETER: We do not depend on government  
16 help.  
17 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
18 [03:16:34]- [03:16:36].  
19 INTERPRETER: We pay our taxes.  
20 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
21 [03:16:37]- [03:16:40].  
22 INTERPRETER: We contribute to the economy.  
23 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
24 [03:16:42]- [03:16:46].  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 173

2 INTERPRETER: We want to follow the law but the

3 city will not allow us.

4 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

5 [03:16:49]- [03:16:56].

6 INTERPRETER: Every day that I go to work, I

7 carry this fear of being ticketed.

8 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

9 [03:17:00]- [03:17:02].

10 INTERPRETER: Harassed or something worse.

11 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

12 [03:17:04]- [03:17:07].

13 INTERPRETER: As an immigrant woman who works

14 alone.

15 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

16 [03:17:10]- [03:17:11].

17 INTERPRETER: This is a huge fear.

18 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

19 [03:17:13]- [03:17:15].

20 INTERPRETER: But I continue going.

21 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

22 [03:17:16]- [03:17:22].

23 INTERPRETER: While we fight for permits to

24 formalize our work.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 174

2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

3 [03:17:25]- [03:17:28].

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask

5 you to wrap up and you can submit the written

6 testimony.

7 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

8 [03:17:32]- [03:17:34]

9 INTERPRETER: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:17:35]-

10 [03:17:37].

11 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

12 [03:17:36]- [03:17:41].

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you very much.

14 INTERPRETER: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:17:44]-

15 [03:17:46].

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

17 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

18 [03:17:47].

19 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:17:54]-

20 [03:19:30].

21 INTERPRETER: Hello, my name is Angel and I'm an

22 active member of [INAUDIBLE 03:19:34]. Thank you for

23 the opportunity to present my testimony. I have

24 worked as a street vendor in the City of New York

25 during five years of the pandemic forced me to do it.

I live in the Bronx and I work in different areas of the city trying to support myself in an honest way.

I am here to ask the Council to please approve the reform package for street vendors projects 431, 408, 47, and 24. We need these to be approved in order to work without fear and with dignity. Street vendors contribute to New York City's economy paying taxes and business and personal taxes. We work hard but even though we don't receive any type of reimbursement.

An example of this is this check of \$0.01 that I got sent. It's a reminder of the little that we received in exchange for our contributions. Street vending is the only source of income for me and my family. It's not just a job, it's how we survive. It's my survival. It's how I put food on the table for my family and I'm not asking for charity. I am asking for the right to work legally.

These reforms are very important for me because they would give us a security to do our job without a constant fear. Every day I have fear of being ticketed or arrested, just because I'm trying to support myself.

ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:20:50]-  
[03:22:11].

INTERPRETER: The Health Department tells us to get a license and when we apply, they tell us they can't give us one. This is the cruel cycle and they make us jump through hoops and then they close the door on us. We live in fear, especially during the Trump Administration. At any moment we could be arrested for a violation we can't avoid and that charge has the potential to impact our immigration status. The fear is heavy on our hearts every single day. We want to comply with the regulations but the city won't allow us to obtain the permits and licenses that we need. We're trying to do the right thing but we're trapped by a system that refuses to help us.

Street vendors don't qualify for government programs. We are self-sufficient. We're not asking for handouts, we just want the ability to work without fear to support our families and to contribute to the city that we so much love. The passage of these laws would bring order to our streets, our neighborhoods and our communities but



2 most importantly, it would allow us to work with  
3 dignity as we have always tried to.

4 I'm asking the City Council to pass these street  
5 vendor reform bills now, so that we can finally work  
6 with a permit and without fear. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?  
8 No, oh yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
10 [03:23:26]- [03:23:37].

11 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:23:40].

12 INTERPRETER: \$1,000.

13 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:23:41]-  
14 [03:23:49].

15 INTERPRETER: And if you go the next day then  
16 it's \$1,000 every day.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [03:23:54]- [03:23:58].

18 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:23:59]-  
19 [03:24:09].

20 INTERPRETER: So just like the panel before  
21 earlier today said there's organizations that work  
22 for small businesses.

23 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:16]-  
24 [03:24:24].

INTERPRETER: So these small businesses have a representative and they call the police every time you show up.

ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:29]-  
[03:24:37].

INTERPRETER: So, I feel a lot of anger because personally they harass me a lot.

ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:41]-  
[03:24:48].

INTERPRETER: So, I've been arrested and in the last year, they've called the police on me every single day and I've gotten so many tickets.

ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:56]-  
[03:24:57].

INTERPRETER: So what should I do stay home?-

ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:59]-  
[03:25:02].

INTERPRETER: Or steal? We don't know how to steal. We keep working honorably or with honesty every day.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Gracias. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you to the panel. Thank you very much. I'm now going to call the next panel.

INTERPRETER: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE

[03:25:22]- [03:25:33].

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Thank you very much. Thank you. Lisa Soren, Jessica Walker, Betsy Mark, and Pedro Goico if you could please come down. Thank you.

Okay please begin. Thank you.

PEDRO GOICO: Good afternoon SPEAKING IN SPANISH

[03:26:11]. My name is Pedro Goico. I'm currently the National Supermarket Association Treasurer but at the same time, I'm an immigrant from the Dominican Republic that came here 14 years old with my mom looking for a better future like everybody else that has spoken here.

In that time, my first job coming out of high school was in a supermarket. I was bagging bags and then I made my way over to the supermarket and I can be so thankful of the owners of the supermarket. But thanks to them, 25 years ago given the location of the supermarket, today, I can say I proudly own three supermarkets.

So, what I want to say today here is and I've spoken Pierina about this. I have met - impression with the street vending and Mohamed. I think we have

all the same solutions. We know the solutions. It is give them licenses in a very responsible matter, right? Because we just can't lift the ban and that's it. We have to see how things go for at least a year or two. Once that happen right, we have to also understand the enforcement have to be done. Just like Pierina said, my mom told me many times, if you open that door, your going to hit. If I opened it, I got hit and I learned. I learned that to open that door is not the right thing to do but there's are rules and regulations that your cancel here passed and not to be respected.

In reference to a gentleman I'll say it in Spanish SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:27:28]- [03:27:32]. I think he's very lucky to receive that penny check because as a business of brick and mortar, I haven't received one of those in a long time. SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:27:39]- [03:27:56], right? So, I'm [INAUDIBLE 03:27:58] for getting those \$1,000 tickets that she's getting because me as an owner, I just got a ticket for \$6,500 because my temperature was under 36 degrees in one of my refrigerators.

So, I understand what's getting a ticket as well. What I'm telling you here is go ahead and I'm sorry

if you give me a few minutes, as you give them because of the translation just like 30 seconds more but if you can please you know do this. This is a time that whatever you guys do, it will be like for the history. There will be people here sitting here 15, 20 years from now in your desk talking about what happened here today. So, let's be responsible about that and let everybody understand give them the license but let's do it fair. This is not about being petty about somebody. It's about being fair for everybody.

Thank you and I hope that you guys make the right decision and that's on the lease. That report from the Independent Business from the city, that's a very bias report. The same way they're going to make \$70 million for the city. The same way we're going to lose 50 million brick and mortar. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Okay, thank you. Just put the red button on. Just press the button until it's red.

BETSY MAK: I'm Betsy Mak, I'm the Vice Chair of Community Board 7 in Queens. CB7 is strongly opposed to this new proposal. Our board received numerous complaints about illegal vending in downtown

Flushing. The complaints include not only block sidewalk, pedestrian congestion and huge amount of garbage left behind but most dangerously the unsanitary food from unknown sources.

According to our NYPD Sergeant Hodge, who leads a six officer enforcement team from the 109 Precinct, he coordinates with the Department of Sanitation for a once a week operation, enforcement operation. No matter how many merchandise or food is confiscated, the vendors return shortly after every enforcement.

Six officers assigned seems like a sufficient number, however his team has to cover elsewhere when any 109 Precinct Officers are on vacation and when there are parades.

The once a week enforcement often get canceled. Just in April 2025, only one enforcement operation actually took place. An additional following operation Restore Roosevelt, which lasted for three months with continuous enforcement effort in neighboring Corona and Jackson Heights. Many vendors from there moved the operation to downtown flushing.

In the meantime, the city tested this bill as a pilot by issuing more of the license at Corona Plaza. When I passed by, there were no illegal vendors on

the plaza and only few legal food trucks, because there were continuous police presence and a police mobile commence center truck at the plaza. So, the cost of the illegal vending problems is the lack of enforcement. Increasing vendor licenses would -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask you to wrap up and then submit the written testimony.

BETSY MAK: Increasing vendor licenses will require even more resources for enforcement. The solution is not to issue more licenses. The solution is to have constant enforcement. We need to see the illegal vendor situation under control now before even talking about more licenses.

CB7 is strongly opposed to this proposal.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you.

LISA SOREN: Sorry about that. Good afternoon Chair Menin and esteemed members of City Council. My name is Lisa Soren, President of the Bronx Chamber of Commerce representing thousands of small businesses across the borough and the city. We support licensed permitted street vending as part of New York City's vibrant, small, business ecosystem. However, Intro. 431 seeks to expand street vendor licenses and permits while failing to address a deeply rooted

issue, the unchecked proliferation of illegal street vending.

Today, more than 23,000 unlicensed street vendors operate citywide, many without health inspections, safety oversight or adherence to location restrictions. This undermines licensed vendors and puts our brick and mortar business who pay high rents and taxes, employ residents and follow strict rules and regulations at a competitive disadvantage.

If not handled appropriately, this will result in a continuation of shuttered storefronts, declining retail corridors and diminish community investment. We strongly oppose any consideration of uncapping the number of street license vendors as this would negatively impact the retail and restaurant businesses in New York City. We have grave concern as it stands now, city agencies do not have the capacity or resources to enforce its existing laws. Without a real enforcement plan, increasing street vendor licenses now risk further weakening compliance and worsening street level conditions. Especially in underserved areas like the Bronx where sidewalks are already overcrowded and quality of life concerns are mounting.



City agencies have already demonstrated that they have been unable to implement the components of Local Law 18 passed in 2021. Therefore the Bronx Chamber respectfully urges the Council to pause legislation that further expands street vendor licenses until there is a comprehensive and fully resourced enforcement strategy in place.

Let's get enforcement right first so all businesses, vendors, and residents can thrive in a fair and safe commercial environment. Thank you for your leadership and opportunity to testify today.

JESSICA WALKER: I'm Jessica Walker. I'm the President and CEO of the Manhattan Chamber of Commerce. We represent the 125,000 businesses across Manhattan, both large and small. New York absolutely needs a vibrant food truck and street vendor scene and we support them.

The citywide small business resource network that we operate with the other four borough wide chambers of commerce with funding from the City Council can provide free help to any business in the city with fewer than 100 employees, including street vendors and food trucks and we are here to help.

We support the decriminalization of street vending but completely lifting the permit cap before solving the problems with the current system makes no sense. Let's solve the problem. The problem is about where and how. Vendors have to be in a proper location and operating safely. So, let's solve the problem. Start by working with BIDs and community boards to identify the places where vendors can operate legally without being disruptive. Create an inventory of available spaces and then designate the proper times and uses for each space so there is never unfair competition with the brick and mortar.

The number of spaces would be linked to the number of permits issued by the city, which makes sense. Then each vending slot operates like a parking space that individual permitted vendors can reserve through an online portal on a daily, weekly, monthly, or annual basis and you know whatever the city deems is best and fairest.

Then the vendor can use that space freely. Such a system would be largely self-enforcing because if you show up someone is taking the space you reserved, you can usually shoo them away without incident.

This is only one possibility. My main point here is that there is a compromise here that supports all businesses, all businesses. We don't need to fight over crumbs. Simply lifting the cap does not get us there. So, let's get there. I think we're all committed to working with you to do that. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Just thank you. Thank you for the good suggestions, I really appreciate it.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Alright, I'm going call the next panel Vladimir Choli(SP?), Nick Aquino, Dylan Dellisanti, Balanda Joachim, and Nishat Tabassum.

Okay, please begin.

NICK AQUINO: Good afternoon. My name is Nick Aquino, and I am a Staff Attorney with the Microenterprise Project at Volunteers of Legal Service. We help small business owners access free legal services in New York City. Providing street vendors the path to legal compliance it often impossible, not because they refuse to comply but because the current permitting system is broken. When clients come to us for help, in nearly every

case, we must tell clients that they simply cannot legally vend.

One of our clients, a disabled veteran in his 60's has been on the waiting list for years. Although veterans are supposed to have some preference, the reality is that even with this benefit he has been unable to secure a permit to run his food cart and unfortunately his story is not unique. We urge the Council to pass Intro. 431, which addresses this inequity by expanding access to permits and ending arbitrary caps that keep thousands of vendors in legal limbo.

This bill would bring much needed order and fairness to the system but access alone is not enough. Even when rare opportunities to apply for licenses arise, vendors frequently lack the support to successfully complete the process. One of my clients after years on the waitlist was finally given the chance to apply but due to a minor misunderstanding in the application process, he was denied and pushed back to the line again. That is why Intro. 408 is equally critical. It would create an office of street vendor services within SBS to provide vital education, outreach and compliance

support with proper training and resources, vendors can be fully integrated into the city's small business ecosystem.

Thank you for the opportunity to submit this testimony on behalf of myself and Volunteers of Legal Service. We urge the Council to pass Intro. 408, and 431 to create a fair, supportive and inclusive system for street vendors across New York City. Thank you.

BALANDA JOACHIM: Thank you Committee Chair Julie Menin and members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection for the opportunity to testify today in support of Intro. 408 and Intro. 431. My name is Balanda Joachim; I'm a campaign organizer at the Association for Neighborhood and Housing Development. I am here today on behalf of the United for Small Businesses of New York City Coalition. A community organization across New York City committed to protecting small businesses and nonresidential tenants from the threat of displacement. Particularly owner operated, low income and BIPOC run businesses that serve our city's low income neighborhoods and communities of color.

Small businesses are cornerstones of our city and neighborhoods. They provide jobs, culturally

relevant goods and services and community keeping our neighborhood thriving and vibrant places to live.

Our coalition supports some of the most iconic BIPOC and immigrant business corridors in the city. From Jackson Heights to the lower east side and the Bronx. And our coalition members work directly with both brick and mortar businesses and street vendors.

The passage of Intro. 408 would be crucial too for organizers conducting outreach and supporting vendors with their merchant associations. Creating a dedicated street vendor division within SBS would ensure the street vendors who are often integral parts of local commercial ecosystems receive the resources education support they need to operate safely and in compliance with regulations.

However, the effectiveness of this division depends on street vendors having proper access to permits and licenses. Currently the cap on permits continues to push vendors into informal markets and exposes them to punitive enforcement and displacement. This not only harms vendors but also negatively impacts foot traffic and economic vitality of nearby brick and mortar businesses. The passage of Intro. 431, which would lift the caps on vendor

permits, is essential. By ensuring proper legal access to permits, we empower vendors and allow USV NYC and its partners to more effectively support them as vital members of our city's commercial and cultural entity.

DYLAN DELLISANTI: Hi there, my name is Dylan Dellisanti. I am an economist at the Institute for Justice. We're a public interest law firm that defends the rights of Americans everywhere to earn an honest living.

Over the last 10, 15 years, we've done a great deal of research looking into the safety of street vending food and the contribution that street vendors makes to the local economy. And I wanted to call attention to a study that was published about three years ago that looked into this question of whether or not street vendors took away stole business from brick and mortar counterparts. And what we found is that as there is an increase in mobile food vendors, there was no subsequent decrease in brick and mortar establishments.

This might seem a little counter intuitive but if you think about it, street vendors, brick and mortar businesses are selling two different types of goods,

right? If you want a Michelin dining experience, you probably want to go to somewhere with an air conditioning. If you want something more affordable, a street vendor might make more sense for you.

It's also more important to recognize that street vendors themselves if they are empowered economically, they have money to spend that goes back into local economy and street vendors are of course, are going to choose to locate in places that are more complimentary to their business. The book seller who spoke earlier mentioned that he didn't feel like the street vendor is distracted from their business, they probably added to the vitality of the neighborhood by offering a complimentary product.

And I'd like to call attention to another way in which street vendors and brick and mortars have a symbiotic relationship. Street vending is selling of a pipeline into greater economic opportunity. I think everybody in New York is probably familiar with Nathan's Hot Dogs, which started in Coney Island selling you know hot dogs from a push cart. Basically every person in this room wearing the yellow cap, every street vendor here who came in today has this sort of unbounded economic potential



that we will not be able to recognize unless we lift the caps. So, for that reason, we support Intro. 431. Thank you.

NISHAT TABASSUM: Hi, good afternoon. My name is Nishat Tabassum and I'm sharing this testimony on behalf of Make the Road and Daniel Coates who is the Director of Public Affairs.

On behalf of 28,000 members, I thank the Committee for the opportunity to testify. Make the Road works to build the power of immigrant and working class New Yorkers who reaches thousands of New Yorkers per year with our legal and survival service including legal services and outreach for low wage workers.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify. I wanted to thank Council Member Sanchez for her leadership on these bills, as well as Majority Leader Farias, Council Member Krishnan, Council Member Menin and Speaker Adams for moving this issue forward.

The issues that plague street vendors today are not new and much has been done over the years to attempt to address the problem of licenses and compliance but there are some common sense solutions

that are within our grasp if we can take advantage of the progress that has been made.

Like immigration reform at the federal level, we live in a situation where all sides agree that the system we have is broken and like immigration reform, there is a consensus in the middle about steps that can be taken to recognize the reality that there will always be street vendors and basic dignity that vendors deserve, respect and support as entrepreneurs trying to support their families.

The trick is always - as can be is the legislative needle that needs to be threaded to find a compromise that everyone can live with. In this case, it seems that we have arrived at one. I want recognize the Street Vendor Project for their amazing leadership on this bill and also commend that brick and mortar's and business associations who are the table working through the thorny details.

The status quo does not work. It is chaotic and vendors, despite being one of the city's more vulnerable populations are heavily overpoliced in a moment when immigrant communities are under relentless attacks.

2 Many of Make the Roads members are vendors and  
3 you heard from some of them today and we agree with  
4 the Street Vendor Project when we say that a  
5 predictable well-regulated system that prioritizes  
6 education over punitive action is one that everyone  
7 can support. These are the kinds of problems that we  
8 need legislative bodies to address. Legislators are  
9 meant to take clear problems, understand them and  
10 develop policies and solutions.

11 We understand that after meeting with a range of  
12 stakeholders, Council Member Sanchez has proposed a  
13 thoughtful set of amendments to the bill that would  
14 add common sense enforcement provisions. We urge  
15 Speaker Adams to include these amendments as the bill  
16 moves forward after this hearing. The nature of  
17 legislating is compromised and I think we have that  
18 here. Under this Speaker, there have been many  
19 conversations and we have bills here that while  
20 certainly not perfect for either side, get the core  
21 components done. We can still tackle hard things in  
22 New York. It might seem like we're far from the end  
23 but we are close. Vendors are apart of New York  
24 City's lifeblood and the truth is that they will be  
25 whether we pass this legislation or not.

2 So, let's do it. Let's update our rules, create  
3 a system that fits the current moment and show the  
4 rest of the country that New York City supports  
5 immigrant entrepreneurs in a moment when so much is  
6 stacked against them. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?  
8 No, okay thank you to this panel. I'm now going to  
9 call the next panel Leidys Bueno, Lilia Gomez,  
10 Salvador Quintuna, Juliana Salas, and Jimmy Hernadez.  
11 If you could please come down.

12 Leidys Bueno here? Yes, okay, great thank you.

13 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:47:40]-  
14 [03:48:01].

15 INTERPRETER: Okay one moment. Good afternoon.  
16 My name is Lilia Gomez.

17 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:12]-  
18 [03:48:17].

19 INTERPRETER: Before street vendors would  
20 obstruct sidewalk.

21 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:20]-  
22 [03:48:22].

23 INTERPRETER: It used to be restaurants that  
24 obstructed the sidewalks.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 197

2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:26]-

3 [03:48:28].

4 INTERPRETER: When the pandemic started -

5 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:29]-

6 [03:48:31].

7 INTERPRETER: They built a sheds

8 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:32]

9 INTERPRETER: Outside on the sidewalks.

10 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:35]-

11 [03:48:47]

12 INTERPRETER: So, after those sheds, after that

13 was denied, they continued working on the sheds and

14 no tickets were issued.

15 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:57]-

16 [03:49:02].

17 INTERPRETER: It's not true that when the police

18 ask us to leave, we don't leave.

19 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:13]-

20 [03:49:18].

21 INTERPRETER: The majority are immigrants and

22 we're all under terror because of the police.

23 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:24]-

24 [03:49:26].

25 INTERPRETER: So, immediately we leave.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 198  
2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:27]-  
3 [03:49:32].  
4 INTERPRETER: Because besides being terrified and  
5 harassed by the police -  
6 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:38]-  
7 [03:49:43].  
8 INTERPRETER: Nowadays we're also in terrible  
9 fear because of ICE.  
10 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:48]-  
11 [03:49:54].  
12 INTERPRETER: I've been a street vendor in New  
13 York for two years.  
14 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:56]-  
15 [03:49:58].  
16 INTERPRETER: In Brooklyn and Sunset Park.  
17 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:00]-  
18 [03:50:03].  
19 INTERPRETER: So, selling on the streets is my  
20 only job.  
21 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:06]-  
22 [03:50:09].  
23 INTERPRETER: I'm a single mom to a 16 year old  
24 boy.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 199

2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:12]-

3 [03:50:14].

4 INTERPRETER: And a 15 year old daughter.

5 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:16]-

6 [03:50:20].

7 INTERPRETER: I ask that they let me work so that

8 I can buy my food.

9 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:24]-

10 [03:50:26].

11 INTERPRETER: Pay the rent, which is very high.

12 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:28]-

13 [03:50:33].

14 INTERPRETER: Okay, I don't have a license to be

15 street vendor because they're not available and if

16 they were available, I would have already requested

17 one.

18 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:47]-

19 [03:50:49].

20 INTERPRETER: I felt so harassed by police.

21 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:52]-

22 [03:50:59].

23 INTERPRETER: One time when I was working, they

24 approached me in a very aggressive way.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 200

2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:03]-  
3 [03:51:06].

4 INTERPRETER: They asked for my license and when  
5 they saw that I didn't have one -

6 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:10]-  
7 [03:51:14].

8 INTERPRETER: They said if you don't leave in an  
9 hour, we are going to issue a ticket. Sorry, if you  
10 don't leave in a half hour - we will issue you a  
11 ticket.

12 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:23]-  
13 [03:51:27].

14 INTERPRETER: So, I want you to leave now.

15 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:29]-  
16 [03:51:32].

17 INTERPRETER: And when they left, I started  
18 crying.

19 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:34]-  
20 [03:51:37].

21 INTERPRETER: Because I was thinking, how am I  
22 going to pay my rent now?

23 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:40]-  
24 [03:51:45].  
25



1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 201  
2 INTERPRETER: And so that month, I was unable to  
3 pay my rent because I couldn't continue working.  
4 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:50].  
5 INTERPRETER: Thank you.  
6 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:58]-  
7 [03:52:01].  
8 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Juliana  
9 Salas.  
10 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:05]-  
11 [03:52:09].  
12 INTERPRETER: I've been a street vendor in New  
13 York City for three years.  
14 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:15]-  
15 [03:52:18].  
16 INTERPRETER: My county is Brooklyn and Sunset  
17 Park.  
18 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:21]-  
19 [03:52:28].  
20 INTERPRETER: And I'm here to ask the Council to  
21 please approve the reform packet for street vendors.  
22 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:33]-  
23 [03:52:40].  
24 INTERPRETER: So to please pass 431, 408, 47 and  
25 24.

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 202

JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:46]-  
[03:52:49].

INTERPRETER: These reforms are so important for  
me.

JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:52]-  
[03:52:57].

INTERPRETER: Because then I could be a vendor  
without being intimidated by the police and being  
under terror.

JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:53:02]-  
[03:53:07].

INTERPRETER: Just like my colleagues said, we  
have been continuously intimidated.

JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:53:11]-  
[03:53:18].

INTERPRETER: And if we had these permits, we  
wouldn't have to undergo these harassments by the  
police.

JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:53:23]-  
[03:53:25].

INTERPRETER: Thank you for listening to me.

SALVADOR QUINTANA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:53:35]- [03:53:43].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Salvador Quintuna and I've been a street vendor in the City of New York for three years.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:53:49]- [03:53:56].

INTERPRETER: I live in Brooklyn and I work in Sunset Park on 51<sup>st</sup> Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:02]- [03:54:09].

INTERPRETER: I am here to ask the City Council to please approve the reform packages for street vendors.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:16]- [03:54:22].

INTERPRETER: Proposals 431, 408, 47 and 24.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:26]- [03:54:33].

INTERPRETER: These reforms are very important for us because we want to be supported by these laws.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:39]- [03:54:41].

INTERPRETER: We need to work legally.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:43]- [03:54:46].

INTERPRETER: In order to be able to bring food  
to our families.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:48]- [03:54:49].

INTERPRETER: And also be able to pay rent.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:52]- [03:54:54].

INTERPRETER: Thank you for receiving us in this  
hearing.

SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:54:57]- [03:54:59].

INTERPRETER: May God enlighten you and thank you  
very much.

LEIDY BUENO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:55:08]-  
[03:55:11].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon, my name is Leidy  
Bueno.

LEIDY BUENO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:55:13]-  
[03:55:29].

INTERPRETER: Okay, I support Laws 431, 408, 47  
and 24 for all the street vendors. We deserve  
permits and licenses. Thank you very much and have a  
blessed day.

JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Good afternoon. My name is Jimmy Hernandez. I am a 26 year old young adult and I currently do not have a job and I do not have the money or the income to put a store and to sell the products I buy online or to rent a retail location to sell the products I buy online and I love to vend, I really do. The reason I like to vend is because I do not want to spend the rest of my life working for someone else.

I'd rather work for my dreams and work for myself. In Bryant Beach, I want the street vendor packets reform Intro. 431, 408, 47, 24. The problem is there are no more licenses available. I am not a veteran. I am not a spouse of a surviving veteran, so I do not qualify for a veterans general vendors license but I really need it so I can sell my merchandise, such as toothpaste, mouthwash, toothbrushes, deodorants, or fabric bleach, laundry detergent, household stuff, that good stuff.

I ask you Chair to pass the Street Vendors Package Reform. I cannot continue to pay tickets for just setting up a small table with essential household goods and hygiene goods. I want to thank

everyone for their time. Please, that's all I'm asking for.

I recently gotten like tickets, so \$250 last week, last Monday so I'm scared to go out into the street and try to promote, sell, offer my products because I cannot be constantly getting these tickets.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm sorry, your time is up so if you want to submit any written testimony, please feel free to do so. Thank you so much.

JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Okay, alright.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you.

JIMMY HERNANDEZ: It's done?

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, thank you very much.

JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Already?

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, yes, thank you.

JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Okay.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

[03:58:05]- [03:58:23].

INTERPRETER: Okay, good afternoon. My name is Elsa Saraceniego and I've lived in the State of New York for 20 years.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

[03:58:36]- [03:58:41].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 207

2 INTERPRETER: I live in the county of Brooklyn in

3 Sunset Park, I'm a street vendor.

4 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

5 [03:58:45]- [03:58:51].

6 INTERPRETER: So, I've been a vendor for 18 years

7 and at the same time, I became an alternative

8 therapist.

9 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

10 [03:58:56]- [03:59:00].

11 INTERPRETER: I live - I sell [INAUDIBLE

12 [03:59:02]- [03:59:06].

13 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

14 [03:59:06]- [03:59:09].

15 INTERPRETER: That are used during therapy.

16 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

17 [03:59:12]- [03:59:15].

18 INTERPRETER: In order to be able to take care of

19 a lot of street vendors.

20 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

21 [03:59:19]- [03:59:26].

22 INTERPRETER: In the spaces that bosses you and

23 has provided for us.

24 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

25 [03:59:32]- [03:59:35].

INTERPRETER: And we use this in order to calm their ails, their pain.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:59:40]- [03:59:47].

INTERPRETER: And also to be able to reduce the stress, the depression and the anxiety.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:59:51]- [03:59:53].

INTERPRETER: That has been caused by the mistreatment.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[03:59:55]- [04:00:02].

INTERPRETER: To calm down the anxiety, the depression, and the stress caused by all the arrests performed by the police, the New York Police.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[04:00:09]- [04:00:21].

INTERPRETER: I am here to ask the City Council to please approve 408, 431, 47, and 24.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[04:00:28]- [04:00:34].

INTERPRETER: So that these laws can be approved and defend the rights of street vendors.



ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

[04:00:38]- [04:00:41].

INTERPRETER: Because we've all been paying our taxes to this country.

ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

[04:00:44].

INTERPRETER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions? Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I just want to say thank you to everyone including this panel for sharing your stories, it's so important. So, SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:00:59]- [04:01:05].

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you to the panel. Thank you. Okay, I'm going to call the next panel. Maryam Shuaib, Brenda Irizarry, Pamela Franco Larg, Joshua Boom, Calvin Harrison.

Okay, uhm, oh okay so just give a minute to the last person is here. Okay. Yeah, just one second. Okay sorry, some of the handwriting was difficult to read so I apologize if I mispronounced someone's name. I did call Brenda Irizarry. You're Brenda? Okay, wonderful. Okay please begin.

MARYAM SHUAIB: Hello everyone. Thank you so much for your time and for hearing my testimony. My name is Maryam; I'm a representative of the Council on American Islamic Relations of New York and our work extends to protecting Muslims everywhere.

Street vendors are a cornerstone of New York City emblematic of their rich culture and diversity that is the foundation of the city that we love. In fact, the iconic chicken over rice meal originated from Halal food vendors just like the ones down the street who wanted to give cab drivers an accessible halal food option.

The number of available permits is way too low which subjects people to over policing and risking their economic security. The current cap on permits for street vendors is unrealistic and currently does not justify the over policing of street vendors. Over 10,000 street vendors await their turn in a dysfunctional system that is impractical and inaccessible at best. As a result, New York City has issued over 10,000 tickets to street vendors, confiscated over 800,000 pounds of food with DSNY issuing over 400 summonses in Corona, East Elmhurst and Jackson Heights in the last year alone. Most of

these tickets confiscations and summonses were issued because of the absence of a permit.

In the words Mohammed Ali, who has the right to have rights? Is it the Muslim street vendor who was issued a \$250 ticket for not having a permit? Or is it the officer who raided his table in Jackson Heights just mere days before the start of [INAUDIBLE 04:03:55] as they sold prayer mats and copies of the [INAUDIBLE 04:03:57]. What about the 14 year old girl standing by her mother on a hot summers day? No permit was all it took for an NYC Parks Patrol Officer to handcuff a street vendor before wrestling her 14 year old daughter to the ground. The current permit system excludes those who need it most. Your support of Intro. 408 and 431 can change this unsustainable dynamic. Intro. 431 would ensure regulatory compliance of all mobile food and merchandize, which would create sustainable, economic opportunity for the city's smallest and mightiest businesses.

Intro. 408 would create an in office of street vendor services within SBS ensuring that street vendors -

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask  
3 you to wrap up and then you can submit your written  
4 testimony.

5 MARYAM SHUAIB: Right and outreach to support  
6 businesses and thank you so much and I hope that you  
7 all vote in support of both resolutions. Thank you.

8 PAMELA FRANCO LARG: Good afternoon. Thank you  
9 Chair Menin and members of the Consumer and Worker  
10 Protection Committee for the opportunity to testify  
11 in supports of Intro. 431 and 408. My name is Pamela  
12 Franco Larg and I'm a Learn and Earn Student from  
13 Franklin Delano Roosevelt High School as part of the  
14 Chinese American Planning Council. Both my mother  
15 and father are street vendors and I carry this truth  
16 not with same but with unwavering pride. My father  
17 who cannot read or write and my mother whose English  
18 is limited and their daily acts of quite cruelty over  
19 discrimination as they try to make a living and  
20 support my family.

21 I stand here today, not just as a first  
22 generation child of Mexican parents but as an  
23 embodiment of their sacrifices as they made in order  
24 to provide me with a better future. Intro.'s 431 and  
25 408 do not merely represent policy changes, they

bring recognition to the lives that have long existed within these margins.

If enacted fully these reforms would lift a veil of anxiety that shadows every work day for my parents and many others.

Intro.'s 431 expand access to vending permits, offering legitimacy as well as adjusted or belonging to those who have felt alienated due to harmful stereotypes. In addition, Intro. 408 focuses on shifting oversight away from law enforcement.

Transferring responsibility to a dedicated agency that understands the complexities of street vending. This replaces intimidation with understanding and punishment with guidance. These actions acknowledge the struggles of those who work tirelessly to survive. Treated not as criminals but as workers with their own stories deserving respect and protection. An actual right many take for granted.

Thank you for accepting my testimony today. I urge the City Council to take crucial steps of passing Intro.'s 431 and 408 as part of the Street Vendor Reform package. I speak not only for myself but for my parents, whose strength is a reminder that

dignity, respect and projection should never be  
privileges but rights.

BRENDA IRIZARRY: Good afternoon City Council  
Committee Members and the audience. My name is  
Brenda Irizarry. I live in the Norwood section of  
the Bronx. I am a member of the Northwest Bronx  
Community and Clergy Coalition.

As a coalition and community member, I urge the  
Committee to support Intro. 431 and Intro. 408, which  
is part of the street vendors reform package. Street  
vendors play a vital role in our economy. They  
provide goods and services to our neighborhoods.  
They contribute to our city's tax base. Most of all,  
street vending is a gateway for immigrants, people of  
color and veterans to operate their own businesses.

The need for reform is imperative. Vendors that  
aren't licensed or don't have permits face fines and  
harassment. The process to obtain a license or  
permit takes too long and is capped. Intro. 431  
would solve this problem by increasing licenses and  
permits over time. Thus, more vendors would become  
regulated without fear of being shut down or fined.  
Intro. 408 would benefit all vendors with much needed  
support towards success with their businesses. By

creating a special office that provides services and resources vendors would feel they are valued stakeholders in our economy.

In closing, the street vendor reform package would bring about a fairer system that force the support for all vendors by appeal to this Committee to support all the bills contained in the reform package. Thank you for giving me this opportunity to testify.

JOSHUA BLOOM: Good afternoon. My name is Josh Boom and I am Liaison from JFREJ, Jews for Racial and Economic Justice to the Street Vendor Project. I'd like to thank Chair Menin and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today in support of Intro.'s 431 and 408. JFREJ is the home for Jewish New Yorkers to organize with our neighbors and allies in New York, for New York where everyone has the freedom and opportunity to thrive.

We always draw on our Jewish values and history to inform our work but street vending itself has its own Jewish history as Mohamed mentioned earlier today. The modern street vending system in New York started around the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century with

immigrant Jewish push cart vendors in the lower east side.

So, it is near and dear to our hearts that vending and vendors get the respect they deserve. Vending is long appealed to recent arrivals for the flexibility it provides. When you are your own employer, you do not need to fear discrimination, harassment or exploitation. You can work on a schedule that allows you to observe religious or cultural customs, attend school and/or care for your family. But then as now vendors were subjected to explicit encoded xenophobia and classism mask curating as concerns around sanitation, congestion, business competition and fraud and then as now all the data suggested that actually vendors were generally very much in compliance, especially ones educated and in economic and cultural boon to the city.

We've heard testimony outlining the positive economic impact on the city. Utility is a career incubator for immigrants and veterans, especially women. You've heard testimony on the diversity vendors bring. I'd like to add also their contributions to public safety. We've heard a lot,



this assertion that vendors cause congestion on sidewalks and they risk two pedestrians with no evidence or data to actually back that up. Where as we do have evidence of vendors -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask you to wrap it up and you can submit your testimony.

JOSHUA BLOOM: Fostering public safety. Thank you. We hope you support these packages.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Next.

CALVIN HARRISON: Good afternoon Chairman and the Committee. Thank you for this opportunity to speak. My name is Calvin Harrison. I'm an organizer at the Street Vendor Project and a JFREJ member. I'm honored every day to be able to support and work with the city's hardworking vendors. I'm so proud of all the vendors who joined us today to advocate for themselves and speak about their struggles. Their testimony is more than enough to explain why these small businesses need access to licenses and permits. Therefore I'm speaking not in my professional capacity but in my perspective as a New Yorker. So, much of the conversation around vending centers around this idea of quality of life and I really want to urge the Committee to reflect on that phrase.

When I think of what makes my life in New York better, I think of stopping on my way home at the produce stand. I think of grabbing a coffee and a donut from a vendor on a dreary Monday. I think of finding a merch vendor with umbrellas when I know it's about to rain. I think of a plate of chicken over rice, extra white sauce, in the late afternoon after I had to skip lunch. Vendors improve my quality of life not just because of what they sell but because of the role they play as eyes on the street as Jane Jacobs would say.

I feel safer in neighborhood when I pass the same friendly faces of vendors every day. I feel safer at night when I see the bright LED lights of a Halal cart lighting up the sidewalk. I certainly feel much safer seeing a vendor serving their customers than I do watching armed NYPD officers harassing and forcibly removing my working class neighbors from my community. New Yorkers quality of life doesn't come from empty sidewalks lined by chain stores and restaurants with \$20 burgers. Street vending fills our streets with vibrant culture and delicious, interesting food.

We should be uplifting rather than shutting out these vendors. Our quality of life can easily be improved by providing access to the licensing vendors need and supporting them with small business services. Therefore, I urge you to please pass Intro. 431 and 408 as well as the rest of the street vendor reform package. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Any questions for this panel? Okay, thank you to this panel. I'm now going to call the next panel. Ibra, Kele Nkhereanye, and then Ibra Sia(SP?). I don't know if that's the same and Karim Ala(SP?) if you could please come down.

I'm just going to read the names again and just make sure Karim Ala, Ibra Sia, Kele Nkhereanye and then Ibra again. We're getting an Interpreter? Oh they left? Okay, okay, great if you could please begin. Thank you.

KELE NKHEREANYE: Good afternoon Council Members. My name is Kele Nkhereanye. I'm a street vendor, a community chef, a community gardener, and I'm here to share that street vendors need your support. I wrote something but it has been difficult listening to people that oppose street vendors. We're not thieves. We're not trying to take jobs away. We

want to comply with the laws that the city has. We are smallest of the smallest business owners in New York City. We contribute our taxes. We love the city and we need your support. Department of Health is aware of the failed system that has caused harm to vendors. They are aware of how many permits their given, how many vendors are on the streets, how many licenses they have, and the BIDs and small business owners, they know we are partners. We are trying to make the city a well loved city that everyone loves. Nobody wants to stop the Garment Industry BID from making money. We just want to work aside with them. I feel very insulted by some of the people who are not telling the truth because as a vendor, I respect myself. I respect other business owners and there's no reason why people want people to support their cause without understanding that we are a team that want to support New York City to thrive.

I hope that the Council Members will take all sides and understand that vendors are here to stay. We are part of history of New Yorkers. We are part of the immigrant communities that make this city thrive. Everyone come from a culture that value family, that value hard work, workers' rights, human

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 221

2 rights, women's rights or workers rights and we are  
3 here to get your support. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Questions? Okay,  
5 thank you. Our next panel is Ibrahim Shehata(SP?),  
6 Waleed Salama, and Magdy Elobky and Ahmed Marad(SP?).  
7 If you could please come down.

8 Okay, I'm just told we need the Arabic  
9 Interpreter. Are they here? If not could we - oh  
10 great, okay just give us a minute then. Okay, please  
11 begin. Thank you.

12 MAGDY ELOBKY: Hello, my name is Magdy Elobky. I  
13 come today to request support for the law 431 and 408  
14 and the law 431. I work in Time Square just for 12  
15 years and I have a family here. I have child  
16 support. I do not have to pay because I don't work  
17 like two years. I don't have a payment and I can and  
18 a ticket for the SB Loan, for the small business. I  
19 take a big loan and I don't have money for pay  
20 because I doesn't work. Okay, thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you.

22 WALEED SALAMA: SPEAKING IN ARABIC [04:19:57]-  
23 [04:21:47].

24 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Waleed  
25 Salama. I have been working as a street vendor for

the past 25 years. I live in the Borough of Brooklyn and I work in Manhattan. I came here today to support the pass of the bill to support the street vendors for the bill of 431 and 408. I have been working since the year of 2000 until now. I don't have a permit until today. I have been working and I have been hoping to have the opportunity to get like a permit. It apparently costs us about \$15,000 to \$20,000 a year every two years, which is like an average of \$10,000. This money caused us to also add the cost of the food and when customers look at us we think that we collect all of this money into our pockets. However, that effects everything else including the merchandise and the renting of the permit.

The second thing I wanted to add is the violation that we get, we have been getting in the past two years. I've been working as a street vendor for the past 25 years. In the past two years, only I got violations that would equal to 23 years of work. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions? No, okay thank you very much to this panel, and our next panel is Ni Jin Fang, Helen Fang, Yun Lin, and

Xhang Jie. If you could please come down and I understand we need a Mandarin translator please.

Sorry, Xhang Jie, Yun Lin, Helen Fang, Ni Jin Fang. Okay, yeah, okay great, thank you.

NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:24:51]-  
[04:25:02].

INTERPRETER: So, my name is Ni Jin Fang. How are you? Mostly, I work out of Flushing. Mostly I sell plants, various different plants.

NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [04:25:11]-  
[04:25:15].

INTERPRETER: So, I have a child, two of us in the United States.

NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:25:19]-  
[04:25:23].

INTERPRETER: So, my main income is relying on the vending on the street to make some money.

NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:25:31]-  
[04:25:34].

INTERPRETER: Unfortunately the police are acting very frequently. They're acting on us frequently, much more.

NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:25:48]-  
[04:25:56].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 224

2 INTERPRETER: So, the police told us to go to the

3 city and get permits but when we get there it was an

4 impossible task. We couldn't do it. I couldn't do

5 it.

6 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:26:07]-

7 [04:26:16].

8 INTERPRETER: So, I felt that uh vending in

9 Flushing actually brings up the uhm, help push the

10 commercial activities in the area.

11 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:26:33]-

12 [04:26:40].

13 INTERPRETER: So as a vendor, mostly uhm other

14 than working very hard, there's nothing beyond

15 working very hard generally speaking as a vendor.

16 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:26:53]-

17 [04:27:05].

18 INTERPRETER: So, I hope the government agencies

19 will take our condition into consideration and

20 consider the reality of what's going on and allow us

21 to at least work a few days out of the week, three

22 days maybe out of the week.

23 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:27:29].

24 INTERPRETER: Thank you.

25



1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 225

2 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:27:40]-  
3 [04:27:52].

4 INTERPRETER: So, Helen Fang is a name. I'm from  
5 Flushing. So, how are you? There are two main points  
6 I want to talk to you about.

7 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:02]-  
8 [04:28:09].

9 INTERPRETER: So, vending needs control just like  
10 a driver needs a license.

11 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:14]-  
12 [04:28:15].

13 INTERPRETER: So, that's only natural.

14 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:19]-  
15 [04:28:21].

16 INTERPRETER: So if you violate with your  
17 license, then you get a deduction, you get a fine if  
18 you have a license.

19 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:27]-  
20 [04:28:32].

21 INTERPRETER: And if you violate enough and  
22 gotten enough points, your license might be  
23 suspended.

24 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:40]-  
25 [04:28:42].

INTERPRETER: So, I feel that's very effective.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:45]-  
[04:28:48].

INTERPRETER: Just like vendors like us needs a  
license permits as well.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:54]-  
[04:29:05].

INTERPRETER: And if someone violates just like  
the situation that was brought up before, if they  
have enough violation, they should be suspended just  
like the example I gave before.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:29:23]-  
[04:29:27].

INTERPRETER: So this way, it would make more  
rooms for the people behind. Speed up the people  
that's behind in the line.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:29:37]-  
[04:29:43].

INTERPRETER: And it does not conflict with  
giving out commercial licenses. Both can be done at  
the same time.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:29:51]-  
[04:29:54].

INTERPRETER: And the reason that recently  
there's more and more vendor rather than less -

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:03]-  
[04:30:06].

INTERPRETER: Is actually a reflection of the  
needs of the actual needs in the community in the  
society.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:16] -  
[04:30:17].

INTERPRETER: So, that's just a natural pathway  
of the economic development.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:24]-  
[04:30:27].

INTERPRETER: Vendor did not decrease in number  
only because just because there's more uhm execution  
of the - by the police.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:40]-  
[04:30:44].

INTERPRETER: Why is the government uhm, uh, stay  
in place in the middle of this contradiction?

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:56]-  
[04:31:02].

INTERPRETER: So, I think it's just very normal  
to give our licenses, permits and if they violate it,

then they should be fined and given points. To me,  
it's just very normal, natural.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:16]-  
[04:31:19].

INTERPRETER: The other point I want to make is  
about license for veterans.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:23]-  
[04:31:31].

INTERPRETER: So, this is a benefit for people  
who contributed as veterans after they retire to make  
a living for themselves.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:41]-  
[04:31:47].

INTERPRETER: And uh however, not for them to use  
it as an opportunity to rent out the license that  
they have an exorbitant price.

HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:59]-  
[04:32:06].

INTERPRETER: They don't really care how much  
people who rent a license from them -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I need to ask you to  
wrap up please and you can submit a written  
testimony.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 229  
2 INTERPRETER: Okay, SPEAKING IN MANDARIN  
3 [04:32:15]- [04:32:21]  
4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Okay.  
5 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:30]-  
6 [04:32:34]  
7 INTERPRETER: So, my name is Yun Lin. I'm from  
8 Flushing.  
9 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:38] -  
10 [04:32:40].  
11 INTERPRETER: And I've been a vendor in Flushing  
12 for two years.  
13 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:44]-  
14 [04:32:48].  
15 INTERPRETER: So, so far I have had over \$10,000  
16 worth of merchandise that was confiscated.  
17 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:57]-  
18 [04:33:02].  
19 INTERPRETER: So combining with my friends, we've  
20 been given over 20 violations, tickets.  
21 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:33:11]-  
22 [04:33:17].  
23 INTERPRETER: And I believe they are mainly  
24 caused by complaints of local shop owners.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 230  
2 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:33:27]-  
3 [04:33:33].  
4 INTERPRETER: So someone earlier mentioned that  
5 there were within a year over 100,000 phone  
6 complaints from -  
7 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:33:45]-  
8 [04:33:49].  
9 INTERPRETER: So I believe the majority of these  
10 phone complaints from local business owners, shop  
11 owners.  
12 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:02]-  
13 [04:34:06].  
14 INTERPRETER: So I believe overall the society,  
15 the community needs us small vendors.  
16 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:14]-  
17 [04:34:19].  
18 INTERPRETER: So a free market, free society,  
19 should have free and open competition.  
20 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:25]-  
21 [04:34:30].  
22 INTERPRETER: So if you provide superior service  
23 then someone with an issue. If not, you will be  
24 eliminated.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 231

2 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:41]-

3 [04:34:56].

4 INTERPRETER: So to allow us under normal

5 circumstances, reasonable circumstances, within the

6 law to fairly compete and that should be a normal

7 government agency should do, to allow us to do.

8 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:35:11]-

9 [04:35:16].

10 INTERPRETER: It shouldn't be a situation where

11 there's a big tree with no grass at the root.

12 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:35:24]-

13 [04:35:36]

14 INTERPRETER: So a more perfect society would

15 allow everyone to survive big ones, big guys, small

16 guys, and that should be the normal, the norm.

17 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:35:47]-

18 [04:35:56].

19 INTERPRETER: And uh you probably notice that a

20 lot of the items that the vendors sell on the streets

21 of every popular people support the items that we

22 sell on the street.

23 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:36:09]-

24 [04:36:14].

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 232

2 INTERPRETER: So it's a society for everyone big  
3 or small.

4 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:36:23]-  
5 [04:36:34].

6 INTERPRETER: So I urge that we, the public  
7 people would be allowed to get a license of vendors  
8 so then we can do our work.

9 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:36:45].

10 INTERPRETER: Thank you. Thank you. Thank you  
11 everyone.

12 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:05].

13 INTERPRETER: Dear friends.

14 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:09]- [04:37:11].

15 INTERPRETER: Government -

16 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:13]-

17 INTERPRETER: And guests.

18 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:16]- [04:37:21].

19 INTERPRETER: Thank you for the platform you're  
20 providing me right now.

21 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:24]- [04:37:26].

22 INTERPRETER: I'm also from Flushing.

23 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:27]- [04:37:29].

24 INTERPRETER: Engaged in small business.

25 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:32]- [04:37:38].



1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 233

2 INTERPRETER: So of course I'm hoping that my

3 small business would be legalized as well.

4 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:46]- [04:37:57]

5 INTERPRETER: So since the beginning of history,

6 people have been freely selling.

7 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:06]

8 INTERPRETER: And support their family that way.

9 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:11]- [04:38:12].

10 INTERPRETER: It's the same all over the world.

11 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:16]- [04:38:18].

12 INTERPRETER: So generally I think we are a weak

13 community.

14 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:24]- [04:38:28].

15 INTERPRETER: I hope the US government can help

16 and help us, the weaker community.

17 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:33]- [04:38:35].

18 INTERPRETER: That we can supply.

19 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:37]- [04:38:40].

20 INTERPRETER: To have a space to improve our

21 lives.

22 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:45]- [04:38:49].

23 INTERPRETER: Since we are a weak community to

24 begin with -

25 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:53]- [04:39:00]

INTERPRETER: So not powerful at all.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:02]- [04:39:05].

INTERPRETER: We don't have any -

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:08]- [04:39:11].

INTERPRETER: So I hope that we won't be locked up for an honest way of trying to live.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:21]- [04:39:23].

INTERPRETER: There's a 60, 70 year old lady-

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:28]- [04:39:35].

INTERPRETER: So uh I don't think it's fair to treat a 60, 70 year old vendor, female vendor and locking her up is fair.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:50]- [04:39:52].

INTERPRETER: It's not fair.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:56]- [04:40:03].

INTERPRETER: So I agree this new legislation if passed would advantageous to the small vendors.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:10]- [04:40:13].

INTERPRETER: On behalf of the other vendors in my area, I support this.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:19]- [04:40:25].

INTERPRETER: I hope this legislation if passed will be a life for all of us, a hope for all of us.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:33]- [04:40:35].

INTERPRETER: So, that's the end. Thank you.

SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:37].

INTERPRETER: Thank you. Thank you government.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great. Thank you very much.

Thank you for your testimony today. Okay, thank you.

I'm going to now read the next panel MD Rahman, Julie

Torres Moskovitz, Illa Hagy Dein(SP?), Nick Gulotta,

Abram Moritz. If you could all please come down.

Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: You may begin when  
ready.

MD RAHMAN: Good afternoon City Council and all  
of them here, everyone. My name is MD Rahman. I am  
a food vendor, mobile food vendor [INAUDIBLE  
04:42:38] and ten and I am the only food vendor who  
work from 2011 to 2021 on the New York City Brooklyn  
Bridge with license and legal permit but  
unfortunately city last 2021 city target the Brooklyn  
Bridge all illegal vendor. And I was the - with  
license me selling hot dog and water, soda but city  
this time don't respect me and my license. Two of my  
jobs was terrible for my working for my working life  
and very problem.

So, now I am working same food cart on the New York City Manhattan 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 22<sup>nd</sup> Street. I am selling same stuff and I take living with my family and take care of my kids and whatever they need every day food and my bill. I want to thank to City Council for bringing me here today speak about Street Vendor Reform Package. I need to thank my favorite organizer street vendor project for supporting me always and giving me always update for street vendor, bad news and street vendor something and problem, that's why a lot of the street vendor project and I still hanging with them from 2009 to now.

So now I want to explain about small sentences about my 15 years of street vending. The thing, every New Yorker alone, we are the hardworking people. We work outside at least ten hours every day and the effects, winter, summer, we stay outside at least ten hour. And every day, thousands and thousands of people pass by in front of us. We don't know who is the good people, who is the bad people. We have security concern also but sometimes law enforcement people, NYPD, Sanitation, come to all of us our vendor and give us summons for unreason sometimes. We have the legal also, so some of them

2 maybe they don't have license but they try to live  
3 with family, pay bill and the food their kids need.  
4 But if this time a vendor [INAUDIBLE 04:45:14] then  
5 why you guys do that with me? The Sanitation and  
6 NYPD say where your license and permit?

7 Ask them again, can you give me permit and  
8 license? They say, we don't give you permit, go ask  
9 the city. So, this is a game. So, my concern is now  
10 if the law enforcement people say go to city, apply  
11 for the permit and we hear that this morning, all  
12 them look like the laptop vendor people. They keep  
13 normal being never. They're still waiting, my  
14 friends Mohamed [INAUDIBLE 04:45:51], we need to  
15 maybe work for every vendor get the license from the  
16 waiting list. So my concern is now we not need to  
17 hope anything from the city. We need to hear the  
18 city what about we need and take action and give our  
19 license department, we need to live, we need to pay  
20 our bill, our family look like another New Yorker.  
21 Thank you very much again for bringing me here today.  
22 Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

24 JULIE TORRES MOSKOVITZ: Thank you. The city  
25 fabric depends on vendors for food, for convenience,

for safety and for livelihood. It's about small business. I am a small business person here too and an architect and urban designer. My name is Julie Torres Moskovitz and I live and work in Brooklyn.

Vendors make the city unique and special but the system is so dysfunctional, inefficient, plagued with underground market and discrimination of vendors. As a citizen, as someone who loves democracy and our government here, this is a challenge for us. We the people that take on and resolve because underground markets, agency enforcement switch Aroos, disorganize leadership that hurts vendors and the public has gone on way too long. City Council and the Mayor, I implore you to fix this and thank you for having this hearing. When you put your collective mind to it, you can do it. I'm here to be an enthusiastic supporter for you. That you are my representatives and there's only three of you sitting there now but I'm hoping the rest of the City Council hears this.

The answers are in the air here today. The summonses and enforcement is at farce when the system is so broken. Lift the caps entirely. Make it fair, just, and efficient. Let small business thrive. Support all of us in the city by supporting Intro.

431 and Intro. 408 and the reform package. Intro.  
408 for SBS to help small business is critical.  
Vendors are small businesses making permits available  
for a small business needs to be a given. A  
government for the people, by the people, and of the  
people as Lincoln says up there on the ceiling.  
There should not be a lack of will here. You are  
serving us, the people and that should be an exciting  
policy and operational challenge to solve and make  
success. Vibrancy and thriving happen that all of us  
appreciate and that marks you in history as great at  
doing your job. Dysfunction is not something we the  
people appreciate. You can do this and in fact you  
must. Anything short of that is failure.

I wish more City Council were here today and I'm  
happy to hear that 25 cosigned but it should be every  
City Council person.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Please conclude.

JULIE TORRES MOSKOVITZ: Thank you so much.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

JULIE TORRES MOSKOVITZ: And I really have faith  
in you. You can solve this for us.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

NICK GULOTTA: Thank you so much Chair Menin, Majority Leader Farias and Council Member Sanchez for your incredible leadership on this issue. I live off of Roosevelt Avenue in Jackson Heights and I took today off to testify along with several vendors who are my neighbors and friends to support Intro. 408 and 431.

Prior to today's hearing, I reviewed transcripts from the last ten years of Council hearings on vending. At each hearing, opponents of increasing the number of permits and from the Administration have asked the Council to go back to the drawing board. To conduct a comprehensive study, a census before doubling down on a broken system. At each hearing, they've described legislation to expand permits as premature and hasty. But the Mayor's Office actually did a comprehensive census and study on vending over 100 years ago, in 1905, the report on the Mayor's Push Cart Commission, which showed that New York City actually issued 7,463 vendor licenses and estimated that there were approximately 9,000 vendors.

Today, our population has doubled and the number of vendors has more than doubled, yet New York City



issues actually 600 fewer permits than we did 120 years ago.

This Council has the opportunity to finally address this issue through the Street Vendor Reform Package. A comprehensive rational approach to vending that will expand education. Establish clear and fair enforcement system in every Council district and create a thriving well-regulated street scape. Every day that goes by is another day where vendors, 96 percent of whom are immigrants, risk being given criminal summons or related charges that escalate from police enforcement. The NYPD issued 9,376 tickets to vendors just last year. New York City is the only major city in the country with a cap on vendor permits. As a result, over 70 percent of vendors take the risk to operate without one. Immigration legal service providers have raised the alarm about multiple cases where vendors were targeted by ICE because of criminal summonses they received. No one should be criminalized, arrested or subjected to deportation for feeding New Yorkers. I ask that the Council move these bills to negotiations and pass them. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

2 ABRAM MORITZ: I'd like to thank Chair Menin for  
3 the opportunity to testify today. Street vendors are  
4 an integral part of our communities. We must help  
5 them succeed. Not neglect them and criminalize them.

6 My name is Abram Moritz and I'm a constituent of  
7 Council Member Menin of District 5. On 81<sup>st</sup> Street  
8 between 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> in Manhattan, we depend on the  
9 fruit stand at the end of the block. Growing up, the  
10 produce my family got from that stand made up a good  
11 portion of my diet growing up and the man who runs  
12 the stand stays out day and night, cold and warm, and  
13 rain or shine to deliver your fresh food.

14 Street vendors provide New Yorkers with  
15 convenient food and products. They're vital to the  
16 city economy and their presence brings vibrancy to  
17 our streets. As a city, we must stop pushing them to  
18 the sidelines. The city and state punish street  
19 vendors for trying to make ends meet while they  
20 reward large companies with security details. As the  
21 cost of living has become top of mind to New Yorkers,  
22 criminalizing vulnerable entrepreneurs makes life  
23 harder for all of us.

24 I put forth my support for the street vendor  
25 reform package, including Intro. 431 and 408. Our

street vendors make our streets fun places to be and they make our streets safer with their eyes on the street.

Demonizing and criminalizing people destroys our streets and breaks down our communities. Do we want a sterile city with silent streets? If we do nothing to support our vendors, that's what we're going to get. We need these laws to create a bold and transformative relationship between the city and our street vendors. Intro. 431 will expand the opportunities for vendors to do their work within the law, rather than pushing them to the fringes. We need to integrate our vendors into our economy, not force them out and Intro. 408 will help our vendors to interface with the city and create buy in with these regulations. Vendors and patrons alike will benefit from the added resources.

I ask that you move these bills out of Committee and they be voted on as soon as possible. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much. Chair Menin had to step away for just a few minutes but I just sent her a picture of you testifying so. Thank you. Thank you all for your testimony.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 244

2 I will now call the next panel, Guadalupe  
3 Sosa(SP?), Vicente Veintimilla, my neighbor, Xiomara  
4 Reges, and Evelia Cayotzi.

5 SPEAKING IN SPANISH: Can I go first?

6 INTERPRETER: She's asking if she can go first?

7 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:55:18]-  
8 [04:55:28].

9 INTERPRETER: Good morning. My name is Evelia  
10 Cayotzi, I've been a street vendor in the City of New  
11 York for 25 years. I live in the Corona Queens  
12 neighborhood and I work in the Corona Queens  
13 neighborhood as well.

14 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:55:51]-  
15 [04:56:02].

16 INTERPRETER: I'm here to ask the Council to  
17 approve the package, the reform package for the  
18 following Intro.'s that are for the street vendors  
19 and they are number 431, 408, and 47 and 24.

20 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:56:24]-  
21 [04:56:44].

22 INTERPRETER: These reforms are very important  
23 for us and for me because we as a business, we do  
24 business for families, for the community, for friends  
25 and we pay taxes as well.

EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:57:01]-  
[04:57:10].

INTERPRETER: We are the same as any other  
business of the New York City but in return, we  
receive the harassment from police.

EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:57:18]-  
[04:57:22].

INTERPRETER: And for us it is important, the  
reforms are important. Thank you very much.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[04:57:28].

GUADALUPE SOSA: Hi, my name is Guadalupe Sosa,  
I've been vending since the day I was born right next  
to my mother. I am a second generation street vendor  
who have been actively advocating for our street  
vendors and I feel like it's tiring that we have to  
come here all the time, waste a day of our work, lose  
our income to stay here and always get the response  
that nothing is being done. So, now that we have  
this specific hearing specifically for the licenses  
and permits that we've been waiting for that there's  
been a cap for so many years, uhm, it's very  
meaningful that like one of the persons that was here

said, that we make history today. That these bills are passed into laws.

It's also New York City Small Business Month and yet again, nothing is included for us street vendors. There's really nearly no resources for our street vendors. Intro. 408 needs to pass in order to benefit from the Department resources that the city budgets.

It's important that we get regulated if that's what New York City residents call to complain on 311. Then it's crucial that bill Intro. 431 passes into law, so we could be regulated and we could be organized as street vendors.

Also, uhm now that social media became a thing, the viral videos that people often record when we're being harassed by law enforcements makes us vulnerable and targets of the public. Just last week, one of the street vendors in Time Square got shot just because he refused to get robbed. So, this is where it's crucial that we need to be regulated and organized so stuff like this doesn't happen and thank you.

XIOMARA REGES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:59:50]-  
[05:01:14].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Chair and distinguished members of the Council and the honorable members of the Council who are here from our beloved city. My name is Xiomara Reges and I'm a street vendor. I sell shirts and additional goods in the city. Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to address you and I do all of this in the Bronx. I'm also a leader of the Bronx Street Vendors. I have made an appointment today to fulfill our obligations as essential workers in New York.

Being a vendor in this city demands courage and resignation. Resignation to suffering and just persecution by authorities who you've seen an outdated law by affecting justice by [INAUDIBLE 05:02:17]. I'm sorry to say that they're using that type of law and that's it's outdated.

Every day is a challenge. Thank God we live safely however, we don't know if we return home from merchandise and be able to hug our loved ones. As long as this current law [INAUDIBLE 05:02:37], justify the [INAUDIBLE 05:02:41] we face, they will continue to be a tool that serves to promote discrimination and segregation in our community. Therefore, I urge you as several representatives to

inform and update the laws that could turn the page on the dark past and to change for the just hope or the fair hope that thousands of families demand and which now, rest in the hands of God and in your hands. Thank you.

VICENTE VEINTIMILLA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH:

[05:03:20]- [05:04:45].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Madam President of this prestigious Council. Good afternoon Council Members and anything which public. I would like to thank you for the opportunity to attend this hearing. My name is Vicente Veintimilla and I am a leader of the Bronx Street Vendors group. I have been selling general merchandise on Fordham Road in the Bronx for several years. I have come to this hearing to support the bills, reform the informal retail legislation.

Decades have passed since general merchandise licenses were frozen and in the case of food vendor permits, the ones issued today are insufficient. The failure to update this legislation has only benefited the Black market and harming vendors who in their eagerness to be able to operate with a permit or license "have fallen victim to their crutches of



[INAUDIBLE 05:05:45] procreators." Who promise to arrange it by using their influence causing irreparable damage to a meager economy.

You have the challenge of setting a mementos present. Deciding fair, equitable and inclusive legislation for the wellbeing of our entire community. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you for your testimony. SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:06:17].

UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:06:19]- [05:06:20].

INTERPRETER: He's asking you if you have any questions with respect to what we said, is his question.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [05:06:27]- [05:06:39].

And the question is for tickets that they have received, do they know what the cause is?

VICENTE VEINTIMILLA: [05:06:47]- [05:07:06].

INTERPRETER: Thank you. We believe that there's no justification for the tickets and the amount that have to be paid for them. For example, the ticket prices go from one of our colleagues that had to pay \$4,000 for selling tamales without a license for a

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 250

2 whole month to another colleague that was \$2,000 just  
3 for selling water.

4 VICENTE VEINTIMILLA: [05:07:52]- [05:08:23].

5 INTERPRETER: And also I want to say that some of  
6 our colleagues that are selling vitamins that they're  
7 supposed to be classified as food. They think that's  
8 \$2,000 for that and also for toothpaste. I don't  
9 really know where this came from but they're actually  
10 labeled as food and I want to say that SPEAKING IN  
11 SPANISH [05:08:48]- [05:08:51].

12 Okay, so I want to bring your attention to this  
13 because we do not deserve this as vendors.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much.  
15 SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:09:05].

16 [5:09:07]- [05:11:30] Sorry, we're just  
17 confirming something. SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
18 [05:11:31]- [05:11:34]. We'll resume in a few  
19 moments.

20 [05:11:36]- [05:13:27] I will now call the next  
21 panel Yu Chaohang, Ngai Kwan Lian, Shuang, Shuai Hui  
22 Zhen.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, please begin, thank  
24 you.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 251  
2 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:14:19]-  
3 [05:14:24]  
4 INTERPRETER: Hi, how is everybody? My name is  
5 Yu Chaochang. I'm from Flushing.  
6 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:14:33]-  
7 [05:14:44].  
8 INTERPRETER: I have some disability so I cannot  
9 do anything else and I rely on vending on the street  
10 to make a living.  
11 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:15:02]-  
12 [05:15:16].  
13 INTERPRETER: So my father has lung cancer and  
14 cannot walk out of the family only myself and my mom  
15 is working.  
16 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:15:26].  
17 INTERPRETER: I appreciate it.  
18 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN:  
19 [05:15:39].  
20 INTERPRETER: Can I speak?  
21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes please.  
22 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN:  
23 [05:15:46].  
24 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 252  
2 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN  
3 [05:15:51]- [05:15:57].  
4 INTERPRETER: So, Ngai Kwan Lian is my name. I'm  
5 from Flushing so I sell, I'm a vendor of electronic  
6 parts.  
7 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:03]-  
8 [05:16:12]  
9 INTERPRETER: So of course, I totally support the  
10 two proposed laws and I want to tell you some of my  
11 stories that I have.  
12 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:23]-  
13 [05:16:31].  
14 INTERPRETER: Such as the young man that just  
15 spoke who has some disability. He needed these uhm a  
16 proper channel. This licenses to make a living in  
17 order to make a living.  
18 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:46]-  
19 [05:16:51].  
20 INTERPRETER: And there are secondly, there are  
21 some other successful business men who started out as  
22 vendors.  
23 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:59]-  
24 [05:17:15].  
25

INTERPRETER: So, as new immigrants in a new environment, we needed more space, more time for us to become a more productive society and contribute to society.

NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:17:30]-[05:17:47].

INTERPRETER: So, I do not need as many permits as a food vendor. All I need is just a safe, stable environment where I can just provide and sell.

NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:18:00]-[05:18:22].

INTERPRETER: So, I hope to avoid this pressure that I feel the need to survive and to make a living. I hope to avoid these pressures checking and verifying and all the requirements that's excessive.

NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:18:45]-[05:18:57].

INTERPRETER: And I feel that actually I provide a service for people after work, let's say 8:00, 9:00 and I'm still able to provide items that they are able to buy at that hour. I believe I provide a good service.

NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:19:17]-[05:19:24].

INTERPRETER: So, I think that satisfy both sides that the items I sell is not expensive but is what they need and I can make a living from what I sell. I feel it's beneficial for both sides.

NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:19:38]-[05:19:49].

INTERPRETER: So not only are we bringing convenience but harmony to everyday life, especially with the tariffs going up these days out there.

NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:20:02]-[05:20:10].

INTERPRETER: So, I hope that we've been given this opportunity to get the license and do what we want to do to help and provide benefit.

NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:20:22]-[05:20:39].

INTERPRETER: So, I hope to rely on our own two hands and not just lay there, do nothing to use our own hands to help ourselves and help to relieve the pressure on ourselves.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm going to have to ask you to wrap up and please submit the written testimony. Thank you so much. Okay, thank you.

Next please, thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 255

2 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:13]-

3 [05:21:23].

4 INTERPRETER: So, I was an employee previously,

5 I'm also a street vendor recently from flushing.

6 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:29]-

7 [05:21:33].

8 INTERPRETER: Lost my job so I chose to be a

9 vendor to maintain my daily living.

10 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:41]-

11 [05:21:52].

12 INTERPRETER: So, I realize that this work is

13 very important to me, while I was doing this vending

14 job.

15 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:59]-

16 [05:22:11].

17 INTERPRETER: It brought impressions to the

18 customer. They like my product. Everybody

19 satisfied, everybody's happy.

20 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:22:19]-

21 [05:22:28].

22 INTERPRETER: But in th process I realize or find

23 out that the police keep arresting me while I'm doing

24 this work.

25

SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:22:38]-  
[05:22:48].

INTERPRETER: So, over an eight month period that  
I've been vending, I received over ten violation  
tickets.

SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:22:57]-  
[05:23:15].

INTERPRETER: So I remember one particular day, I  
received four violations in one day. Before I was  
even able to wrap up after the first two tickets were  
given, I was then given another two tickets. I had  
four for that day.

SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:23:34]-  
[05:23:46].

INTERPRETER: And the merchandize that's left  
there were stolen also by thieves.

SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:23:57]-  
[05:24:12].

INTERPRETER: And I was oppressed by people with  
the license claiming I don't have a license. Several  
days ago, someone complained about me again.

SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:24:25]-  
[05:24:37].



1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 257

2 INTERPRETER: So, I'm hoping that this process be  
3 open of giving a license for vending. That I would  
4 receive a license for vending. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Thank  
6 you. Okay.

7 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN  
8 [05:25:08]- [05:25:15].

9 INTERPRETER: So, Shuai Hui Zhen is my name. How  
10 is everybody? I'm from Flushing.

11 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:25:20]-  
12 [05:25:26].

13 INTERPRETER: So I sell fashion clothes items in  
14 Flushing.

15 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:25:32]-  
16 [05:25:44].

17 INTERPRETER: So, I'm already 70 plus years old  
18 already. I really have no wish at this moment other  
19 than to just get a legal license or permit that I'll  
20 be able to legal vend on the street.

21 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:25:59]-  
22 [05:26:01].

23 INTERPRETER: So nothing else really beyond that.  
24 Thank you very much. Thank you.

25

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Okay, thank you very much and we'll now call the next panel. Roselia Alvarez, Margarita Armenta, Jessica Quintero, Teresa Carpio.

Okay, thank you. Please begin. Okay ready? Great thank you.

ROSELIA ALVAREZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:27:03]-[05:28:23].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Roselia Alvarez. I come from the Bronx. I am 35 years old. Sorry, I've been here for 35 years correction from Interpreter and I've been a vender for more than 20 years. For me, I is an opportunity to work as a street vendor because I'm a single mother and I have the opportunity to work and to spend time with my kids especially because it's just us and to take them to school. Thanks to this, I can pay my rent and I can support them on my own.

This is where we get our economic support. I do pay my taxes but I don't want to say that - I don't have the sticker that you're required to put on our carts. I just have the ID because they are not permits for the trucks or the carts. I do have my license but the stickers are no because they're

frozen. So, when Sanitation picked me up, told me that I had to get a license for the rent but everything is frozen so everything has to be denied. So, it will be good to pay a rent of cart or of truck that you give us the license so we are not afraid that police and legal enforcement would pick us up from our places or spots or sanitation and take everything from us when they come to us with police. I'm going to know what's going to happen.

So, I just want to tell you that we need the help with the licenses and we just want the opportunity for support. We just want to work honestly. We are upstanding members of the society and we just want to have the opportunity to work and to get the licenses.

JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

[05:31:17]- [05:31:51].

INTERPRETER: Hello Chair Members of the Committee. My name is Margarita. I've been a street vendor for more than 25 years. I work in the Bronx neighborhood. I work on my own and this is an opportunity that has let me support my family and work for my family.

JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

[05:32:31]- [05:32:45].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 260

2 INTERPRETER: But everything they started to take

3 the merchandize and they have confiscated our goods.

4 It's been very difficult because we lack our income

5 and SPEAKING IN SPANISH. [05:33:01]- [05:33:05]

6 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

7 [05:33:08]- [05:33:20].

8 INTERPRETER: If you have the license it's

9 \$1,000. If you don't have that, then - if you don't

10 have any ID then if you don't have that then they

11 take your ID and then it is \$2025 to pay for the

12 tickets.

13 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

14 [05:33:38]-[05:33:44].

15 INTERPRETER: And then Sanitation, the Sanitation

16 Department, the first thing that they say is that you

17 have to go and get a permit. When they perfectly

18 know that there are no permits.

19 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

20 [05:33:57]-[05:33:59].

21 INTERPRETER: That's everything. Thank you very

22 much.

23 TERESA CARPIO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:34:12]-

24 [05:36:06].

25

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Jessica Quintero, an Ecuadorian and I represent the Association for Street Vendors in Corona, in Corona Plaza in Queens and I've been a street vendor in New York City for 20 years. I live at Corona Queens and I work in the neighborhood of Corona Queens as well.

I'm here to ask you - to ask the Council that you have to approve the reform package for the street vendors for the proposals or Intro.'s Number 431, 408, 47, and 24. These reforms are very important because street vending is unique and I cannot - oh I can only rely on being a street vendor. I can't rely on any other type of jobs but I can rely on street vending. I control my own schedule on my own time, especially I can spend time with my kids and the time and I can provide them the time that they need. From selling, from vending, I'm also I've been able to pay my taxes because I do pay my taxes every year and I pay the sales taxes every three months as well.

I do contribute to the economy of this country. Really, at this moment, with Trumps Administration, I am really afraid. I'm scared. I'm scared of immigration police, the NYPD, or the police from the Sanitation Department. They harass me or get uhm a

2 violation against me or that I have to answer to any  
3 charges pressed against me or to be detained or  
4 deported.

5 The same as any other business, we deserve the  
6 support of authorities within this city. It is my  
7 dream to obtain a license, a general merchandise  
8 license to be able to sell that. Street vendors are  
9 self-sufficient. We do not rely on the government.  
10 Since - ever since the past year 2024, we've been  
11 harassed by police, by New York Police and we've been  
12 arrested just as criminals. When in reality, we are  
13 working to be able to provide for our kids and give  
14 them food.

15 New York Police is giving us criminal tickets.  
16 Thank you very much for listening to me and to  
17 support the Street Vendors and I also want to say  
18 thank you for your support to all the street vendors.  
19 God may bless you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

21 MARGARITA ARMENTA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
22 [05:40:05]- [05:42:08].

23 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Chair of the  
24 Committee, Council Members and good afternoon to the  
25 public. My name is Margarita Armenta. I am a leader

of Bronx Street Vendors and a seller of Amway  
[INAUDIBLE 05:42:28]on Fordham Road in the Bronx. I  
have been practicing this noble activity for several  
years and through it, I have been able to educate and  
support my three children without having to be a  
burden on the state.

I'm here to promote the reform package to  
informal trade legislation, which will allow all the  
street vendors to operate in an orderly manner and  
without the unnecessary pressure from the sanitary or  
health that deteriorates or Health or the Sanitation  
Department.

I've been the big thing of discrimination by  
health inspectors who have fined me more than \$2,000,  
arguing that vitamins are considered food just like  
toothpaste. Some colleagues have also been victims  
of these unjustified atrocities. The new legislation  
will bring hope to thousands of families who depend  
on our work. It will also create an orderly city  
with qualified law abiding merchants. Since the  
courageous and determined Council Members like you,  
who are committed to serving your community. Thank  
you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Great, thank you very much. Okay, I'm going to call the next panel Lou Jang Yung(SP?), Ju Jing Low(SP?), Aio Gu Quin(SP?), Chen Yang Yun, Jou Ku(SP?). If you could please come forward. Anyone? They all left? Oh they all left, okay thank you very much. Thank you, we're going to call the next panel thank you. Okay, and we also need a Mandarin translator for this next panel please. Thank you.

Lin Yun Mu(SP?), oh okay, Chun Me Gee(SP?), Jou Ya Wang(SP?), A Long(SP?), Yu Yan Lin(SP?). Oh they all left, okay thank you very much. Okay next panel Robert Martinez, Andrew Gustafson, Arial Mince(SP?), Duane Jackson9SP?), Stefanie Bonen(SP?). Ah you're solo, just you okay, no one else on that panel? Okay, please begin.

ANDREW GUSTAFSON: Good afternoon. My name is Andrew Gustafson, I'm here to testify today in support of Intro.'s 431 and 408. I'm the Vice President Turn Style Tours, a social enterprise that works with nonprofit organizations that develop and operate tour programs across New York City.

Over the past 15 years, our team has had the honor to work with hundreds of vendors, while leading



tours about the city's street food industry. We've hosted tens of thousands of visitors from around the world and on our tours, we try to make visitors understand the experience of street vendors navigating the regulatory maze in New York City. Not just the chapter and verse of the regulations but how they play out in the real life vendors.

The virtual impossibility of receiving a legal permit. The constantly shifting rules and arbitrary decisions of enforcement officers. The endless tickets and summons issued by a half dozen different agencies. The constant fear of having your livelihood and perhaps even your freedom taken away.

For many street vending is not a chosen profession but one born of necessity. We're in the midst of an unprecedented global migration crisis with more people now displaced from their homes than in any other point in human history. New York City has been a refuge for so many people and street vending is how they have survived as so many people have attested to today.

We should be creating pathways for people to make better lives for themselves in this city and in this country. Instead, the current regulatory regime

1 makes it harder for people to make a living and it  
2 places vendors at greater risk for arrest and  
3 deportation. That street vending policy is bad  
4 immigration policy and it makes the New York City  
5 government and the City Council complicit in the  
6 cruel, racist and destructive mass deportation agenda  
7 of the Trump Administration.  
8

9 What street vendors want and what all New Yorkers  
10 want is a clear, fair and well regulated system where  
11 small businesses can be successful and contribute to  
12 their communities. Vendors want to operate legally.  
13 These bills offer them a much more viable pathway to  
14 do that. Vendors want to follow the rules. These  
15 bills will provide them with the education and  
16 support services they need to do that. These bills  
17 will not lead to more street vendors. The vendors  
18 are already there but instead they'll be legal and  
19 regulated, thus better protecting the vendors  
20 themselves and the public.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I'm just going to ask you to  
22 wrap up please and then submit your testimony.

23 ANDREW GUSTAFSON: Yup, so thank you so much for  
24 listening to my testimony. I hope you will support  
25 moving these bills forward. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 267

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. I'm now  
3 going to call our next panel, Lily Gonzalez(SP?),  
4 Isabelle Rosario(SP?), Marybelle Padraza(SP?) and  
5 then Antonio. Are any of them-anyone that I called  
6 here?

7 Okay, they're gone, alright. Okay now we have;  
8 we will need the Spanish Translator please for the  
9 next panel Lucia Maldonado, Flor Caballero, Marlene  
10 Enseldo, Lola Siguencia, Tiffany Hervas. Are any one  
11 that I called here? Okay.

12 Please begin, thank you.

13 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:49:33]-  
14 [05:49:41].

15 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. Thank you for  
16 having us here. I can see all of you're women.

17 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:49:45]-  
18 [05:49:49].

19 INTERPRETER: And I'm very pleased to see that  
20 because we know we're empowered women fighters.

21 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:49:54]-  
22 [05:49:57].

23 INTERPRETER: And we fight for our children.

24 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:03]-  
25 [05:50:09].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 268  
2 INTERPRETER: What I ask of you with all my heart  
3 -  
4 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:12]-  
5 [05:50:23].  
6 INTERPRETER: So, please make this reform pass  
7 because we are women and we want to do the best for  
8 our children, have them study.  
9 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:33]-  
10 [05:50:38]-  
11 INTERPRETER: And I also want to a little  
12 personally.  
13 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:41]-  
14 [05:50:44].  
15 INTERPRETER: I've worked in the streets for 15  
16 years.  
17 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:46]-  
18 [05:50:51].  
19 INTERPRETER: But fortunately I want to work  
20 under the law.  
21 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:00]-  
22 [05:51:08].  
23 INTERPRETER: Three years ago with a lot of  
24 effort, I bought my food truck.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 269  
2 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:12]-  
3 [05:51:18].  
4 INTERPRETER: And I'm renting a black market  
5 permit.  
6 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:20]-  
7 [05:51:27].  
8 INTERPRETER: And I thought I would be okay but  
9 unfortunately it's not like that.  
10 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:30]-  
11 [05:51:34].  
12 INTERPRETER: Because the money that thought I  
13 would be able to save for my children's future -  
14 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:37]-  
15 [05:51:42].  
16 INTERPRETER: Is being spent in other peoples  
17 hands, passing to other people.  
18 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:46]-  
19 [05:51:56].  
20 INTERPRETER: And I know that I cannot continue  
21 giving \$20,000 away instead of for the city.  
22 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:03]-  
23 [05:52:08].  
24  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 270

2 INTERPRETER: Because I want a better future for

3 my children, allowing them to have studies with my

4 own work and my efforts.

5 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:14]-

6 [05:52:19].

7 INTERPRETER: Because I already did it with one

8 of my daughters. She studied general nursing.

9 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:23]-

10 [05:52:30].

11 INTERPRETER: But I'm not being able to -

12 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:31]-

13 [05:52:33].

14 INTERPRETER: But I'm not being able to do it

15 right now with my other three children because all

16 the money that I'm earning is going away in the Black

17 market.

18 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:41]-

19 [05:52:48].

20 INTERPRETER: That's what I'm asking you, please

21 on behalf and all these women with their children

22 that we can move ahead.

23 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:59]-

24 [05:53:09].

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 271

2 INTERPRETER: So that's what we want you to

3 understand and we ask you from the bottom of our

4 hearts.

5 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:53:15]-

6 [05:53:26] -

7 INTERPRETER: So that we don't have to be running

8 and if Sanitation comes and they don't see my name on

9 the permit, then we have to run and we live with this

10 fear every day.

11 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:53:36].

12 INTERPRETER: Thank you very much for your

13 attention.

14 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:53:50]-

15 [05:53:58].

16 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Lola

17 Siguencia and I come from Ecuador.

18 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:06]-

19 [05:54:10].

20 INTERPRETER: And I work as a street vendor in

21 Johnson and 37<sup>th</sup>.

22 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:14]-

23 [05:54:23].

24 INTERPRETER: And I say that the situation for me

25 has become very needy.

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 272

LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:26]-  
[05:54:31].

INTERPRETER: So the police have taken my things  
three times. I paid my tickets.

LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:36]-  
[05:54:40].

INTERPRETER: And what I'm afraid of -

LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:42]-  
[05:54:44].

INTERPRETER: The nerves are killing me because  
I'm always afraid that ICE or the police are going to  
come for me and that's it, thank you.

MARLENE ENSALDO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:55:06]-  
[05:57:29].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Madam Chair of the  
Council. Oh okay, my name is Marlene Ensaldo and I  
am the leader of the Bronx Street Vendors and I have  
been selling street fruit for several years in the  
Bronx.

At our last membership meeting on April 30<sup>th</sup>, we  
honored our children and as they introduced  
themselves, the children, we were able to see what we  
were building. Five of the kids aspired to police  
officers. Two others want to be doctors and



veterinarians but one child in particular told the audience that he wanted to be a lawyer to defend merchants and prevent them from taking their wages. Every child in our homes represents a professional for the development of BIDs, your city and your country. We street vendors sacrifice our youth and we sacrificed our youth and invested our time to leave for you a different legacy. Because my work on the streets offers no guarantee other than survival. That is why we ask you to make wise decisions based on the commitment of our community and the justice that a vulnerable community demands.

On behalf of us and our children, thank you for the opportunity.

ANA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH: [05:58:52]-  
[06:00:33].

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Madam Council Speaker and good morning everyone esteemed Council Members and to the public. My name is Ana. I am the leader of Bronx Street Vendor and I sell general merchandise in the Bronx. I have met today to ask you to approve this package of laws believing that it will necessarily have to follow process that in

practice demonstrate real changes and complicate different and inclusive legislation.

Sanitation was given the legal authority to regulate in formal commerce since April of 2023. Two long years have passed and there is no evidence of significant improvements in street vending. The only thing that has been evident is how they leave entire families fragmented, in dept and bewildered. This shows that as long as persecution, arrogance, discrimination and racism are used as tools to impose on just laws, dialogue, agreements and coherence will be unnecessary.

On behalf of all the vendors in New York City, thank you.

TIFFANY HERVAS: Good afternoon honorable Chair, esteemed Council Members and fellow New Yorkers. I am Tiffany Hervas, the President of the National Association of Puerto Rican Hispanic Social Workers and the Cofounder of Algundia.

I stand before you today to support Intro.'s, particularly 408 and Intro. 431 and shed light on the pressing challenges faced by immigrant families, particularly in children engaged in street vending.

Algundia, which means someday, is a grass roots volunteer led project born out of the resilience and commitment of formerly undocumented immigrants, dreamers and first generation New Yorkers. Our mission is simple but urgent. To support migrant families, especially children who have become vendors, street vendors selling candy in the New York City Subway systems just to survive. We're doing this work, just because we know that street vending is not just an act of survival, it's a form of entrepreneurship in a system that too often fails to provide pathways for newly arrived immigrants, via our project and by testifying here, our goal is to shift that narrative. These families are not a public safety issue. They are our neighbors full of hope and potential, vendor rights, dignity and solutions.

Into Intro. 408 and 431 represent a critical step toward regulatory reform that our city urgently needs. These bills would finally give street vendors a fair and transparent system to operate within, allowing them to provide services New Yorkers rely on in a regulated, predictable and safe framework. For too long our city has treated street vending as a

criminal act rather than recognizing that the vendors are just people trying to survive. Via our project, we conducted a survey where we identified 88 percent of vendors began doing so out of necessity to keep their families afloat. This outdated approach has only deepened economic hardship and fear in vulnerable communities. Instead of punishing vendors for trying to support their families, the city must remove unnecessary barriers. Intro. 408 represents a transformative opportunity for street vendors across New York City, especially migrants. We can attest that it will make difference, as in our survey we found that 93 percent of candy selling vendors in the subway had not received any assistance from organizations, agencies and 60 percent indicated fear of incurring fines and police interaction while vending.

Many cited a lack of childcare, case on point and awareness of city services as key barriers to finding safer, more sustainable work. Intro. 408 would help prevent families from being pushed into unsafe and unlicensed vending by giving them the tools and information they need up front before fines, before fear or enforcement come into play.

With that, thank you for your time and consideration. It is Algundia's hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing Intro. 431.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm going to ask you to wrap up please.

TIFFANY HERVAS: And the street vendor reform package.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you very much. Thank you so much to this panel. Oh no sorry, there's one more person. Sorry about that. Okay, right is there one more person who didn't? Yes, I believe you didn't, yes. Thank you.

FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:05:07]-  
[06:05:12]

INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Flor Cabellero. I come from Corona Plaza.

FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:05:21]-  
[06:05:36].

INTERPRETER: I am here to ask you please to allow us to have permits to work freely in the streets because we work to support our children and we don't depend on the city. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 278

2 FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:05:55]-  
3 [06:05:58].

4 INTERPRETER: And I ask you to please help us and  
5 support us.

6 FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:06:00].

7 INTERPRETER: And thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I just want to take this  
9 moment. I know I stepped away from the dais but I  
10 just want to take this moment to say how powerful it  
11 is to see you and I'll say it in Spanish, to see you  
12 testifying with your child as I listen with my child.  
13 You know we're doing this for the next generation.  
14 Everything that we do, they see and I hope that you  
15 know this Council will be able to make them all  
16 proud. So, SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:06:36]-  
17 [06:07:11].

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much for that  
19 panel. Thank you.

20 Okay, great we're going to keep on going. Uhm,  
21 okay the next panel, we need an Arabic translator  
22 please. Mohamed Awad, Victor Cha Cha(SP?), Jiamfony  
23 Corseni(SP?), Jimmy Joel Hernandez, Jennifer Salgado.  
24 Okay, please begin. Thank you.

25

MOHAMED AWAD: My name is Mohamed Awad. I attended here to support the Street Vendor Project Package that include its Law 431, 408, 47 and 24. Actually I changed my whole testimony after I hear a lot of stuff coming from some organizations that make testimony today. One of them is blame. Street vendors are not paying tickets; we just get tickets and we're not paying the tickets. So, I just paid yesterday almost \$2,000 and if you guys, Madam Chair if you want to see that receipt, I can show you the receipt right now.

Yesterday, I just paid \$2,000 fines, so who claim the street vendors doesn't pay tickets, it's totally lies. So, Madam Chair if you want to see the receipt, I can show you the receipt.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: You're welcome to submit anything in writing that you want. Thank you so much.

MOHAMED AWAD: Thank you. Okay, so the other one, one organization that testified earlier, you had this on your BID. They say they don't want more permit for vendors and they don't think vendors should use generators. The problem is, a vendor who works with them and pays in the park, they use

generators every single day. They show you the lies and stuff. We're dealing with this; a statement came in about the street vendors. I'm sorry. So, as they don't like street vendors. You want to eliminate the vendors when we are [INAUDIBLE 06:09:51].

So, is he talking about we're not supposed to use generators and the guy from the Haddison Yard BID, zero in for street vendors and they let him use generators. Okay and that's it, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much.

JENNIFER SALGADO: Hello everyone, my name is Jennifer Salgado. I'm the daughter of a former street vendor and a life long resident of the Bronx. I'm here today to express my full support for bills 431, 408, and the rest of the Street Vendor Reform Package.

When I sat down to write this testimony, I thought about telling my mother's vending story but the truth is, her story isn't unique. It mirrors what so many vendors have already shared today. The only difference is that her struggle happened over 20 years ago. And yet, here we are nothing has changed, so instead, I want to speak to what I see now in the neighborhoods of Kings Bridge and Fordham. Both of



1 which are areas I've worked and lived in. These are  
2 communities built on hustle. Commercial corridors  
3 that are full of life because of both storefronts and  
4 vendors, yet somehow, vendors are treated as threats  
5 to those storefronts. But let's be honest, the  
6 biggest threats of brick and mortar small businesses  
7 isn't a vendor, it's skyrocketing rents. It's the  
8 city's own neglect, real estate speculation further  
9 facilitated by BIDs, often lead by individuals who  
10 live outside of the neighborhood or even out of  
11 state. Making them disconnected from the needs of  
12 their own members.  
13

14 We heard business representatives here today say  
15 that we need regulation and I agree, we all agree.  
16 We are living under a broken unregulated system that  
17 picks neighbors against each other. Bill 431 is a  
18 step toward fixing that. It offers real regulation,  
19 accountability and protection for vendors and brick  
20 and mortar businesses.

21 Finally, I ask you to think about the city's  
22 youngest New Yorkers. I was just a child when I had  
23 to deal with my parents getting ticketed, arrested  
24 and pushed out. How many more children does the city  
25 want to traumatize under the current system? You

have a chance to change the course of thousands of lives and I ask you to vote in favor of this reform package. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you for your testimony and we're now going to move on to the next panel, Ana Villa, Magnum Navarate(SP?). I apologize, it's hard to read the handwriting on this one, Leeane G-Bowley, Mahmoud Zaed, Jackson Chabot. If you could please come down. Thank you.

LEEANE G-BOWLEY: Good afternoon my name is Leeane G-Bowley. I am a home owner in Elmhurst Queens, a voter, educator and director of public programs and partnerships at a Corona cultural institution. I've served multiple terms on the Queens Community Board 4, including on the executive and zoning Committees and I thank you for your time as I testify to support Intro.'s 431 and 408.

I walk daily to the institution where I work from Elmhurst to Corona and it reveals the power of our community and the role street vendors play in our lives. Families gather for meals before school. Our streets feel safer at night when I walk home because the vendors are there and their customers light up our neighborhood. Our committee - yet our city

disincentivizes these small businesses that bring economic security and public safety to our streets. The lack of available permits is weaponized against my community and I'm going to actually go for my testimony to respond to the DSNY testimony earlier. For example, on October 21, 2024, I was walking home from Roosevelt Avenue and saw a large NYPD truck with a number of street vendor products and carts on it. I asked why the DSNY wasn't doing enforcement and the NYPD told me they're gone for the day so we have to do it. That is not what was testified to earlier today and it quite frankly disturbs me.

When I speak to the leadership at my local precinct, they said I know I think you think it's cute to get authentic food on the street but they're breaking the law. Let's talk about breaking the law. We see our Mayor who threatens compliance with the legal tactics of mass deportation in collaboration with the federal government. A federal government that continues to break the law and defy court mandates. Passing these Intro.'s directly addresses the sphere mongering and potential legal actions from our government by getting rid of an arbitrary cap

that puts local small businesses at risk of police engagement.

Now, you can take that weapon out of the hands of those who want to harm these entrepreneurs, these small business owners and my neighbors in Elmhurst and Corona. Another indication that the City Council should pass Intro.'s 431 and 408 - I'll wrap up, is our local youth know that it's the right thing to do. Last year, I coproduced a local production where students showed their immigration stories through a play. Central to that play was the characters struggle to support her family.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask you to wrap up because we have to give everyone the exact same amount of time.

LEEANE G-BOWLEY: As a street vendor project, the students enacted seeking a permit combating fraud due to lack of appropriate government regulations and support.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay just please submit your written testimony. We'll take that. Thank you so much.

LEEANE G-BOWLEY: Thank you so much for your time.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Okay, next thank  
3 you.

4 MAHMOUD ZAED: Hello everyone. My name Mahmoud  
5 Zaed. Before I give my testimony, I have a comment  
6 to one of the testimonies that was given earlier  
7 today. One of the testimonies says that we are food  
8 vendors. We keep getting tickets that we never pay.  
9 Maybe we hang it on the wall. I, myself, have paid  
10 this month, not this month, last month \$4,975 and I  
11 still have more tickets to come that I'm still  
12 fighting. Last year, I paid almost \$12,000 for  
13 violation. So, we pay tickets. They're trying to  
14 get us out of business and we struggle to continue  
15 with that business.

16 I've been a food vendor since 2008 and I started  
17 my own business in 2009 and had to rent a permit  
18 through the Black market as I have never been able to  
19 obtain one in my own name. My business has grown  
20 over the years and we now have cars and trucks in  
21 Midtown, the upper east side and Long Island City.  
22 For years, I have been forced to pay thousands of  
23 dollars every two years to people who were able to  
24 get permits directly from the city. While they only  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 286

2 pay a small fee force it be a huge expense that  
3 ultimately is passed onto my customers.

4 The system is unfair and sustainable to small  
5 business owners like me. We need the city to issue  
6 more permits and Intro. 431 is a clear answer to  
7 speed up the permitting processes. I am a number  
8 myself, I'm a number 1,259 on the waiting list and so  
9 far, the city has only reached 865, the number.

10 Intro. 431, we will get more permits, vendor  
11 faster -

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask  
13 you to wrap up please.

14 MAHMOUD ZAED: If all vendors can get permits  
15 under their own name with the reduced cost  
16 significantly, this would allow us to lower our cost  
17 on the price that we use.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and if you could just  
19 submit your written testimony please. Thank you very  
20 much.

21 MAHMOUD ZAED: Thank you. You're welcome, thank  
22 you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay next.

24 EMILIA SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:03]-  
25 [06:18:12].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 287

2 INTERPRETER: My name is Emilia Legavon(SP?) and

3 I sell Amway products by the -

4 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:22]-

5 [06:18:29].

6 INTERPRETER: Sanitation issued two tickets to me

7 of \$1,250.

8 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:34].

9 INTERPRETER: I paid them.

10 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:37]-

11 [06:18:48].

12 INTERPRETER: So I asked Sanitation what I needed

13 to do in order to sell legally as they were asking me

14 to.

15 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:54]-

16 [06:19:01].

17 INTERPRETER: They asked me to go to 42<sup>nd</sup> and

18 Broadway to get a permit that they had permits to

19 sell.

20 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:07]-

21 [06:19:13].

22 INTERPRETER: I went, I took the class and they

23 did not give me the permit to sell.

24 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:17]-

25 [06:19:20].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 288  
2 INTERPRETER: They gave me a temporary permit.  
3 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:22]-  
4 [06:19:28].  
5 INTERPRETER: And they told me that was allowed  
6 as food but it is not allowed as food.  
7 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:34]-  
8 [06:19:41].  
9 INTERPRETER: Later on, I rented a space out of a  
10 store.  
11 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:45]-  
12 [06:19:51].  
13 INTERPRETER: And again, they came, they took all  
14 my things saying that that permit was not valid.  
15 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:56]-  
16 [06:20:10].  
17 INTERPRETER: I want to ask you to please pass  
18 those permits because we don't want to work  
19 illegally.  
20 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:14]-  
21 [06:20:16].  
22 INTERPRETER: And we don't want to be persecuted  
23 as if we were thieves.  
24 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:20]-  
25 [06:20:32].



INTERPRETER: We need to be heard because we are contributing to the country, to the state, we pay our taxes.

EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:37]-[06:20:42].

INTERPRETER: We pay a sales tax. We pay personal taxes as well.

EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:48]-[06:21:02].

INTERPRETER: And it's all that I'm asking, please pass those reforms so that we can permits to work. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

JACKSON CHABOT: Good afternoon. My name is Jackson Chabot. I'm the Director of Advocacy and Organizing at Open Plans. Where we advocate for New York City streets, sidewalks and plaza's. I'm here today to express Open Plans strong support for Council bills Intro. 431 and 408, which proposed by the reforms to New York City street vending laws. These bills will not only provide thousands of vendors the opportunity to operate legally but also ensure the continued vibrancy of our public spaces.

Street vendors are a cornerstone of New York City's culture, economy, offering diverse, affordable foods and goods. They enrich our public spaces, contributing to the city's unique energy and fostering social interaction.

Vendors also support the local economies, particularly in underserved neighborhoods and provide valuable services to both residents and tourists. Personally, they come into the rally, someone tried to order a hot dog about 9:45 this morning and the vendor did not have one by City Hall, so not a choice I would make but it was something I overheard this morning.

I'd like focus on the current siting regulations. The current siting guidelines for street vendors are rigorous and they're very specifically designed and many of them date back many, many years ago before many of us were born.

They were put in place allegedly to balance economic activity with public safety but what they do right now is our over prescriptive and offer many places where vendors cannot vend. So, I've heard today from some folks that if the caps were lifted, vendors could vend anywhere and we know based on the

current regulations, this is simply not the case.

There are specific 12 foot pedestrian path clearances for example.

And so, when we see this there is also these restricted zones that I mentioned in specific areas such as bus stops, taxi stands, near subway entrances as well as specific parts of the city including Midtown among other places. These rules were put in place and they offer very specific parameters. So, again, when we say that we're potentially lifting the caps or the permits here, there are still places -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay I'm just going to ask you to wrap up.

JACKSON CHABOT: Where vendors would not be able to vend. I'm asking you to take these bills into the phase and please pass them expeditiously. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you to that panel. I'm now going to call the last in person panel and if you are here and you want to speak and you haven't heard your name called, please just go see a Sergeant at Arms and fill out a card and then I'll be going to the Zoom panel because we had some speakers on Zoom. Mouhel Ahmed, Christopher Leon Johnson, Sharon Brown. Okay great.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Hello, Chairs my name  
- oh sorry, sorry.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Oh sorry, hold on one second.  
Oh, oh yes, yes, give us one second, we're just going  
to do a quick translation in Spanish.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH  
[06:24:19]- [06:24:33].

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Okay,  
please begin.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah, yeah, hello  
Chairs Menin and Chair Sanchez. My name is  
Christopher Leon Johnson. I'm speaking on behalf of  
myself. I'm wearing this hat to show my support to  
the Street Vendor Project and the Worker Justice  
Project. I want all the bills to go through. Thank  
you for finally having this hearing Ms. Menin. I  
don't know - I know that you don't understand how  
appreciated you are for having this hearing. I  
appreciate you having this hearing. We've been  
waiting for almost well, three years now for this  
hearing, so thank you for that.

Alright, so the reason I'm supporting these two  
bills is because we need to lift all the caps. We  
need to eradicate all caps for these vendors and they

need to be able to sell this stuff anywhere they want without harassment of the NYPD. Not only these license, these guys and gals are here, they deserve to make money here without no worrying about being harassed by the NYPD and even to these days under the Trump Administration ICE or DHS.

At the same time, the City Council needs to condemn Francisco Moya, our Council Member because he is against these guys and gals because there's a stadium called, the New York City [INAUDIBLE 06:25:42] stadium that that team suck anyway. He don't want these guys around Corona is because he don't want the tourists and the people that's going to try and watch those games see those people sell mixed stuff there.

Now, there's a lot of economic racism that's going on with this Council Member, with Francisco Moya. I think he's an economic racist because if you say you care about immigrants, why you against these vendors selling stuff on the street. Everybody know he's weaponized by Mazi Lugo, Ramis Freeas(SP?), and his hidden homeboy Hira Mossaratt(SP?). So this City Council like I said, not only do these bills need to pass in the City Council, all these bills, they need

a public accommodation of Council Member Francisco Moya for his economic racism towards these street vendors, these guys and gals.

So, at the end of the day -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm going to ask you to wrap it up.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: I know, I'm going to wrap it up. I'm wrapping up. I'm going to wrap it up. Uhm, cops city is happening in 2026. I am calling on you the next Speaker of the City Council to block all funding.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Block all funding -

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I'm going to ask you to wrap up. Thank you.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: I know \$20 million. Thank you. No cop city, thank you. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and next speaker.

MOUHEL AHMED: SPEAKING IN ARABIC [06:27:01]-  
[06:29:54].

INTERPRETER: Thank you so much for giving me the opportunity and your patience and listening to voices that often go unheard. Voices from sidewalks, from those who power the city, the city and formal economy

and fight every day just to survive. My name is Mouhel Ahmed, I'm a journalist of Brooklyn and proud member of the Street Vendor Project.

What bring me today is not for a report or personal lease. It comes from feel from an earlier story I have documented over the years. Stories that out of elected, the harsh and often unjust reality faced by thousands of street vendors in New York City, especially immigrants and working class families.

Number one, when help is needed, silence follow us and again I have seen law enforcement.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask you to wrap that up please.

INTERPRETER: Alright sure.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: You can submit it in writing. Yeah, you can submit it in writing. Great, thank you very much. Thank you. Okay that concludes our in person testimony. I'm now going to go to Zoom. We have three speakers on Zoom and then I'm going to call everyone who signed up on Zoom who we just want to make sure that we did not leave anyone out. Bill Bruno, Sandra Jaquez and Justin Pollack on Zoom.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

BILL BRUNO: Thank you so much Chairman Menin and Council Members. My name is Bill Bruno. I'm from Jackson Heights, the Center of West Street Vendor activity and I'm here to testify for Intro.'s 408 and 431. Street vending provides both an important business income and clearly a service to the community because people are shopping there and buying them. So, they meet a demand.

Since the sidewalk space many use, you need to have a system to balance the needs of the stakeholders. The current approach of doubling down enforcement doesn't do that. City limits pointed out NYPD tickets in 2024 is five times what they were in 2019 and twice as many in 2023.

So, clearly the peer enforcement approach did the trick. This would have solved the problem and also clearer enforcement is not being tried. So, instead not only do we have a needlessly punitive treatment in the street vendors, we don't have an organized system and be legalized, educated and everything will be better balanced.

431 removes and 408 is an important part of educating them and that will integrate them into the system and reduce the burden on enforcement. 431



removes an arbitrary cap. Arbitrary because it's uneasy to organize the street spaces doesn't get rid of the other sidewalk requirements like leading sidewalk space and not crowding doorways. Furthermore, enforcement efforts didn't constitute permits could then regulate that.

I checked the OATH data base for my neighborhood. The two precincts that cover Roosevelt Avenue, in 2024, the first three quarters, over three quarters of the police OATH stuff, the summonses were for permit violations. They're simply not being able to get a permit only about a quarter of the things you'd want our enforcement to regulate. You know sidewalk space, uh proximity to doors and so on. So, in other words, you have a blunt instrument that focuses on that, so by risking the permit cap, integrating the system, providing education resources, you can not only regulate in a way that -

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

BILL BRUNO: Alright, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay next.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

SANDRA JAQUEZ: Hi, this is Sandra Jaquez. Chair Menin and members of the Committee on Consumer Worker

Protection. Thank you for the opportunity to share comments today on the issue of street vending in New York City. My name is Sandra Jaquez and I serve as the President of the New York State Latino Bar and Association.

We represent Hispanic and minority owned restaurants bars and nightlife establishments throughout the five boroughs. Our members are small business owners, many of whom are immigrants who have invested their time and energy into building neighborhood establishments that serve as cultural anchors, economic drivers and community gathering spaces. These businesses operate in compliance with city laws and regulations and continue to persevere despite the significant challenges facing the hospitality industry including inflation, rising commercial rents and neighbor shortages.

We've heard testimonies that expressed concern about the state of New York City street vending system. The current lack of effectiveness enforcement has led to widespread disorder. This system is failing and in its current form, it is increasingly disadvantaged to brick and mortar establishments. What we are seeing today is that a

balance or well-regulated system, a coalition of vending activities with minimal oversight and inconsistent consequences.

Before the city considers any expansion of street vending permits, it must first demonstrate that a functional, effective, enforcement structure isn't safe. That means consistent, coordinated and well-resourced enforcement. It also means acknowledgement that weak enforcement is not mutual. It has a direct and damaging impact on small business owners who are playing by the rules and paying the price. Raising the vendor cap without first fixing enforcement will not only - it will not resolve the underlying problem; it would only deepen them.

Restaurants and nightlife establishments deserve a level playing field in the public realm where rules are applied fairly and enforced evenly. Our members are subject to vigorous inspection and must comply with strict health and safety standards, particularly regarding time and preparation.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

SANDRA JAQUEZ: Thank you.

JUSTIN POLLACK: Good afternoon. My name is Justin Pollack. I live on the upper west side and I

wanted to address something that I haven't heard yet during this really interesting hearing, which is the impact of street vendors on office workers like myself because I work in Manhattan at an investment firm that manages over \$150 billion, and over the past five years really since COVID, we've literalized our office policy to allow lot more work from home. Because rather than enforce everyone back to the office, we're looking for reasons to have them want to come into Midtown and I wish that was working with me but the reality is that's not quite enough reason for them to get on trains and buses and have long commutes. In the same way, they also don't go to Broadway shows every night. They don't go to lunch for hours at fancy restaurants but what they told me is they will come to the office because they get access to street food that they simply can't get where they live. In a lot of suburban neighborhoods where they are all around the city, they can get salads and hamburgers from the same chain restaurants that exists right off Park Avenue but what they can't get is access to Jam Rock Jerk Chicken on Park Avenue or Uncle Gussies Greek Food or the King of Falafel Middle Eastern Menu, Kal Kang on wheels has really

great Tai food or even you know a staple, Giannottos Pizza Truck. All those things are critical to getting our stock traders, our bond traders, our sales people, all of them back to the firm working and supporting the broader ecosystem and money that they spend in this city because the alternative is to give them an experience in New York that's just like the one that they have at home and they're going to stay there. So, I just want to encourage you to pass this series of reform bills for street vendors because it's going to contribute to the rebuilding of office life here in New York City. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Alright, we also have on I'm going to call the next three panelists on Zoom Ariel Mintz(SP?), Rob Martinez and Samna Escondar(SP?).

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

UNIDENTIFIED: Hi everyone. I just wanted to say a big thank you to the Chair and the Council for the truly yeomen's effort involved in listening to all these testimonies today. I just have one 30 second thing to add into the mix a little bit. I'm looking to start an independent coding label in New York City and I think that one really powerful way to connect with customers and people who would be interested in

the brand would be by selling on the street and really meeting people face to face, and I was disappointed, surprised to find out that it's literally impossible for me to do that right now. I'd love to see these Resolutions pass and be able to get an opportunity to sell my wares in the street and start making those connections with fellow New Yorkers.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Next speaker. Next speaker please.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

ROB MARTINEZ: Good afternoon. My name is Rob Martinez. I am a film maker and content creator. I make videos about people in food. I would like to thank Chair Menin and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today in support of Intro.'s 431 and 408. There are few videos that I've made in my life that have been more beloved than the videos I have made about New York City street vendors, whether it was [INAUDIBLE 06:39:47] who is amazing. It was made the New York Time top dishes of 2024 or with Fidel Cortes, when New York Magazine dubbed the Lemon Ice King of Bushwick Brooklyn or with the less but equally important [INAUDIBLE 06:40:01] who have

opened their commissary kitchens to me at 2 in the morning where they prep until 6 a.m. to be ready to feed hungry New Yorkers on their commute. These folks don't take up much space on the street but they've earned a massive space in the culture of New York City.

I was recently asked to contribute to a popular You Tube food channel with over 10 million subscribers and they were producing a street food competition between the cities of Austin, Portland, Los Angeles and New York City. In Austin and Portland, the street food scene is a vibrant pop up scene, an incubator for entrepreneurs who can't afford a brick and mortar.

In Los Angeles, street vending has been decriminalized and one of its most famous food trucks inspired the movie Chef, but in New York we have a broken system where vendors allocate for food but aren't given the opportunity to sell it legally. I wasn't able to recommend some of the vendors that I love most because increasing visibility on their business might actually harm their business, which is insane.

New York lost that street food competition. We came in last and the video currently sits at 3.4 million views on You Tube. I wish street vendors in New York were given the same opportunity to thrive as they are in these other major cities. This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want in a regulated, predictable and enforceable system and given a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods.

The city must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our small businesses to thrive. Street vendors deserve a shot at success like all New Yorkers. This includes a fair opportunity to make a living free from harassment. Thank you for accepting my testimony today. It is my hope that the City Council takes this critical step of passing Intro.'s 431 and 408 as part of the Street Vender Reform.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Uhm, okay and Sandia Escondar has dropped off. So, now what I'm going to do is I'm going to read everyone who signed up on Zoom to make sure we have not overlooked



anyone. So, I'm going to read these names and if you're on, please do the raise hand function on Zoom. Dillan Hatch(SP?), Ryan Pucos(SP?), Debbie Pria Trategy(SP?), Fy Tashay(SP?), Kevin M. Dell Casale(SP?), Elizabeth Murray(SP?), Francisco Gonzales(SP?), Eiden Gebre(SP?), Deana Elos(SP?), Calvin Ang(SP?), Johnathan Perez, Sam Yu(SP?), Monalla Lopez(SP?), Jennifer Salgado, Krishendu Ray(SP?), Pedro Suarez.

No, okay seeing no names, I really want to thank everyone for testifying today. It was unbelievable to see the turnout that the hearing got and just to hear the diverse views on these bills and so, I want to thank everyone for being here. I want to thank my colleague Council Member Sanchez and baby, who made it all the way to the end. And thank you once again for your testimony today and that concludes our hearing. [GAVEL] Oh and Council Sanchez's mom, babysitter extraordinaire. [GAVEL]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 15, 2025