

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION  
AND INFRASTRUCTURE

----- X

March 3, 2026  
Start: 10:04 a.m.  
Recess: 4:04 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - 8th Floor - Hearing  
Room 1

B E F O R E: Shaun Abreu,  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Selvena N. Brooks-Powers  
Eric Dinowitz  
Shahana K. Hanif  
Shekar Krishnan  
Farah N. Louis  
Christopher Marte  
Justin E. Sanchez  
Pierina Ana Sanchez  
Julie Won  
Phil Wong

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Mike Flynn  
DOT Commissioner

Margaret Forgione  
First Deputy Commissioner

Paul Ochoa  
Executive Deputy Commissioner

Eric Beaton  
Deputy Commissioner for Transportation Planning  
and Management

Rick Rodriguez  
Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental and  
Community Affairs

Darnell Sealy-McCrorey  
Families for Safe Streets

Maria Kaufer  
Families for Safe Streets

Lindsey Cormack  
Community Board 8 in Manhattan

Valerie De La Rosa  
Manhattan Community Board 2

Tammy Meltzer  
Manhattan Community Board 1

Betsy Mak  
Community Board 7 in Queens

Max Bookman  
New York City Hospitality Alliance

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Eric McClure  
Streets PAC

Lisa Daglian  
Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA

Ahmed Razin  
Student at Pacific College

Pauline Barkin  
Transportation Alternatives

Elizabeth Adams  
Transportation Alternatives

Sara Lind  
Open Plans

Cecil Brooks Jr.  
Self

Zach Miller  
Trucking Association of New York

Kevin Jones  
AARP New York

Alia Soomro  
New York League of Conservation Voters

Mary Beth Kelly  
Families for Safe Streets

Ligia Guallpa  
Workers Justice Project

Joshua Wood  
Los Deliveristas UNIDOS

Jeri Denise Thompson  
One Fair Wage

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Chauncy Young  
Harlem River Coalition

Eric Huntley  
Self

Steve Flack  
Self

Shanequa Lewis  
One Fair Wage

Giovanni Uribe

Rayan Semery-Palumbo  
One Fair Wage

Russell Jackson

Daniel Bush

Samuel Riviera

Vianna Vang Olsen

Charles Diamond  
Self

Mylinda Lee  
Self

Sandra Rayburn

Matthew Robinson  
Self

Ned Shalanski  
Self

Carol Puttre-Czyz

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Liam Jeffries  
Self

Yosef Meltzer  
Self

Joe Cianci  
Self

Norma Cote  
Self

Kathy Morano

Michele Campo  
Q-UP

Augustine Hope  
West Village Residents Association

Evan Sweet  
Meat Packing Business Improvement District

Sproule Love  
West 124th Street Block Association

Allie Ryan  
Q-UP

Marc Wouters  
Urban Planning Studio

Leidis De la Rosa  
La Colmena

Naila Rosario  
High Road Restaurants

Lou Martins

Andrew Paulsen

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jacqueline L Heureux  
Self

Raphael Orlove  
Riders Alliance

Jolyse Race  
Riders Alliance

Lizi Rahman  
Self

Chris Sanders  
TA Manhattan Activist Committee

Daquane Mays  
Riders Alliance

Abby Dziura  
Riders Alliance

Dianna Maeurer  
Chelsea West 200 Block Association

Sean Sweeney  
SoHo Alliance

Kathryn Arntzen

Inje Ivchenko  
London Terrace Tenants Association

Leif Arntzen  
Self

Brit Byrd  
Representing Brooklyn Borough President Antonio  
Reynoso

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Christine Berthet  
CHECKPEDS

Mary Evancho  
Self

Chris Schuyler  
New York Lawyers for Public Interest

Jim Wright  
American Institute of Architects New York

Natasha Elder

Clint Smeltzer  
Community Board 3

Matthew Shapiro  
Urban Justice Center

Michele Birnbaum  
Community Board 8

Emma Culbert  
Space Block Association

Susan Stetzer

John Grimes  
Self

Alexis Adler  
El Sol Brillante

Deborah Farley  
Q-UP

Charlton D'souza  
Passengers United

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Stuart Winchester

M. Petretti  
Self

Michelle Koppersmith  
Self

9th Street A-1 Block Association

Robert Dobruskin  
Council Chelsea Block Associations

Laura Sewell  
East Village Community Coalition

Christopher Leon Johnson  
Self

Scott Lyne  
Self

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 9

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Mic check, mic check, this is  
3 a mic check on the Committee on Transportation and  
4 infrastructure. Today's date is March 3, 2026,  
5 recorded by Walter Lewis in the HR 1.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to  
7 today's New York City Council Hearing for the  
8 Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure.

9 At this time, we ask you to silence all  
10 electronic devices and at no time is anybody to  
11 approach the dais. Chair, you may begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Welcome to the Superbowl of  
13 Streets Plan everybody. Good morning and welcome to  
14 today's hearing on the New York City's Council  
15 Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure. I am  
16 Council Member Shaun Abreu, Majority Leader and Chair  
17 of this Committee.

18 Today, the Committee is holding an oversight  
19 hearing titled 'Streets Plan Update' assessing the  
20 state of the streets plan in 2026. We will expand  
21 the Department of Transportation's latest progress in  
implementing the Streets plan, how they intend to  
comply with the law's requirement in 2026 and what  
more can be done to improve upon the Streets plan in  
the years ahead.

2 We will also hear several pieces of legislation  
3 related to street safety, accessibility,  
4 transportation equity and the use of public space.  
5 Intro. Number 13, sponsored by Speaker Menin in  
6 relation to the installation of solar-powered  
7 crosswalks.

8 Intro. Number 93, sponsored by Council Member  
9 Brewer in relation to expanding the Bicycle Parking  
10 Station program.

11 Intro. Number 163 sponsored by Council Member De  
12 La Rosa, in relation to a study and report on the  
13 feasibility of providing ferry service to Inwood.

14 Intro. Number 202, sponsored by Council Member  
15 Gutiérrez in relation to the time permitted for the  
16 installation of a traffic calming device or traffic  
17 control device on any street adjacent to a school.

18 Intro. Number 310, sponsored by Council Member  
19 Marte, in relation to requiring the Department of  
20 Transportation to install bilingual street name  
21 signs.

Intro. Number 628, sponsored by Council Member  
Restler, in relation to expanding access to sidewalk  
and roadway café applications.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 11

2 Intro. Number 655, sponsored by Council Member  
3 Restler in relation to expanding access to roadway  
4 and sidewalk cafés.

5 Preconsidered Intro. Sponsored by Council Member  
6 Hanif in relation to requiring curb extensions at  
7 certain dangerous intersections.

8 Preconsidered Intro. Sponsored by Speaker Menin  
9 in relation to maximum clear path requirements for  
10 sidewalk cafés and Preconsidered Intro. Sponsored by  
11 Council Member Restler in relation to the expansion  
12 of pedestrian space.

13 The Streets Plan was enacted to move New York  
14 City toward safer streets, faster buses, better bike  
15 and pedestrian infrastructure and to create a more  
16 equitable transportation system. It established  
17 clear mandates, clear legal mandates and timelines to  
18 ensure that the city took actionable steps to ensure  
19 street safety.

20 Since the launch of Vision Zero, New York City  
21 has made important progress and the recent decline in  
22 traffic fatalities is somewhat encouraging but we all  
23 know that the city experienced years in which traffic  
24 deaths increased and far too many New Yorkers,  
25 pedestrians, cyclists and drivers continue to be

2 killed or seriously injured on our streets. For many  
3 advocates and communities, the concern has not been  
4 whether we know it works, but whether we are moving  
quickly enough to implement it.

5 That is why the Streets Plan matters so much. It  
6 is the city's central mandate to deliver protected  
7 bus lanes, protected bike lanes, transit security -  
8 transit signal priority upgrades, bus stop upgrades,  
9 accessible pedestrian signals, pedestrian space  
improvements and intersection redesigns.

10 Yet, as prior years have shown, the Department of  
11 Transportation has repeatedly fallen short of these  
12 requirements particularly with respect to bus lanes,  
bike lanes and bus stop upgrades.

13 Today marks a turning point in the Streets Plan.  
14 We have a new Mayor and a new Commissioner, and the  
15 next five year plan is due at the end of this year.  
16 So, today, we will find out where DOT stands in its  
17 fulfillment of the Streets Plan Mandates and how the  
18 agency plans to meet the next phase of street plan  
19 requirements. And of course, how we can make up for  
lost time.

20 In addition to the Streets Plan update, today's  
21 legislative agenda reflects the broad scope of DOT's

2 work and the many ways transportation policy  
3 intersects with public safety, accessibility,  
4 economic activity and neighborhood quality of life.  
5 From safer crossings near schools to clearer  
6 directions, through bilingual signage to the  
7 Administration of sidewalk and roadway cafés to  
8 safety improvements like curb extensions and  
9 illuminated signage. These proposals speak to how  
10 New Yorkers experience the city everyday. As always,  
11 our goal is to understand what is working. What is  
12 not and what changes are needed to move forward. It  
13 is our goal to ensure that the city's transportation  
14 investments are advancing safety, accessibility,  
15 reliability and equity for all New Yorkers.

16 Before we begin, I'd like to thank my staff on  
17 the Committee for their hard work in preparing for  
18 today's hearing Jalissa Quigley, my Deputy Chief of  
19 Staff and Director of Legislation and Budget, Mark  
20 Chen, Senior Counsel to the Committee, Theodore  
21 Miller, Counsel to the Committee, Kevin Kotowski,  
Senior Policy Analyst to the Committee, John Basile,  
Senior Policy Analyst of the Committee and Adrian  
Drepaul, Principal Financial Analyst to the  
Committee.

2 I would also like to thank Sarah Swain, Senior  
3 Counsel and Natalie Meltzer, Senior Policy Analyst  
4 from the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection  
5 for their assistance.

6 I will now pass it over to Council Member Marte  
7 to speak on his legislation.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Good morning everyone. I  
9 would like to thank Majority Leader Abreu for holding  
10 this hearing and for all the advocates that are here  
11 today. If you visit Chinatown in Lower Manhattan,  
12 you'll see one of the most unique pieces of  
13 infrastructure in New York City: bilingual street  
14 signs, both in English and Chinese. While there are  
15 few specific streets in the city that have bilingual  
16 signs, only in Chinatown does every corner in the  
17 neighborhood have these bilingual signs.

18 For the thousands of residents in Chinatown and  
19 the 10,000 more who visit from across the city and  
20 world, these street signs aren't just a nice amenity,  
21 they are a lifeline. For 60 years Chinese immigrants  
who don't read English, have been using these street  
signs to navigate around their community. They could  
not live in Chinatown without the help of these  
street signs but unfortunately, they are

2 disappearing. While the DOT installed these signs in  
3 the 1960's and 1980's, there has not been an  
4 investment in bilingual street signs since then.

5 Intro. 310 would change that. The bill will  
6 require DOT to commit to a permanent bilingual street  
7 sign program in Chinatown but even more exciting,  
8 this bill will expand bilingual street signs  
9 citywide, allowing Council Members to request these  
10 signs in their district. By passing this bill, we  
11 can give all immigrant communities the same benefit  
12 Chinatown has. Expanding bilingual street signs  
13 would not only provide language access to those who  
14 need it, but it will also add to the culture and  
15 character of these immigrant communities, giving them  
16 even greater ownership of their neighborhoods.

17 At a time when the federal government is trying  
18 to criminalize our immigrant neighbors, this bill is  
19 just one easy way we can push back and make it clear  
20 that our city welcomes everyone and embraces  
21 immigrants.

I look forward to hearing the administration  
testify today and working with my colleagues to pass  
this bill. Thank you Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member  
3 Marte. I'm now going to pass it over to Council  
4 Member Restler to speak on his legislation.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Chair, I can beatbox.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Can you beatbox? Is  
7 that a thing? No, alright. Uhm, wonderful. Well,  
8 let me just say Chair Abreu, it is wonderful to be  
9 here. This is my first Transportation Committee, I  
10 have the chance to join you, so thank you Majority  
11 Leader and thank you Chair. Excited to have you in  
12 this role and to have such a great champion for  
13 improving safe streets across our city.

14 I'm really excited to have not one, not two, but  
15 three bills on the agenda today. First, we're  
16 hearing Preconsidered legislation to expand  
17 pedestrian space and this was frankly a missed  
18 opportunity in the last version, the original version  
19 of the Streets Plan. Walking is the primary way that  
20 we all get around as New Yorkers and frankly the city  
21 does far too little to ensure that we have adequate  
pedestrian space across our communities, especially  
in the most congested areas. This legislation would  
require the City of New York to add one million  
square feet of pedestrian space every single year for

2 the next five years. This would be expanding  
3 sidewalk space around the busiest subway stops and  
4 bus stops. This would be adding more open streets,  
5 adding more public plazas, adding more daylighting so  
6 that we all have the necessary pedestrian space that  
7 we need to get around.

8 As a New Yorker, I don't think there is anything  
9 more frustrating than being stuck behind a slow  
10 walking person and it often happens in these highly  
11 congested areas because we just don't have enough  
12 space for all of us to get around. Do you want to  
13 walk on Fordham Road with Council Member Sanchez or  
14 on Jay Street, with me in Downtown Brooklyn, or on  
15 125th Street with the Majority Leader, you will see  
16 that we do not have enough pedestrian space for our  
17 communities.

18 Secondly, we are hearing Intro. 655 that will  
19 restore year around outdoor dining and relax hurdles  
20 and make it easier for small businesses to  
21 participate in the program. I am thrilled that  
22 Speaker Menin has been a champion of restoring year  
23 end outdoor dining and supporting my legislation.  
24 New Yorkers have been clambering, clambering for year  
25 around outdoor dining since the program was ended

2 some years ago. It's one of the few during the  
3 pandemic, you know we saw 6,000, 7,000, 8,000  
4 restaurants secure permits for roadway dining and it  
5 was a tremendous success. It was great for  
6 restaurants. It was great for restaurant workers.  
7 It was great for our neighborhoods. Most of all, it  
8 was great for all of us to be able to enjoy a  
9 wonderful meal sitting at a favorite restaurant  
10 outside on a favorite block but instead, this new  
11 version of the program has essentially decimated the  
12 outdoor dining program. I think 450 restaurants;  
13 we'll get the updated numbers from DOT today but 450  
14 restaurants have secured the full permits, not the  
15 conditional permits but full permits for the spring.  
16 It's just - it's abysmal and we have so much  
17 improvement to do to make this program better. Year  
18 round outdoor dining will make it easier for  
19 restaurants to participate in the program and I want  
20 every restaurant in New York City to have confidence  
21 this spring that year around outdoor dining is coming  
back and coming back swiftly.

19 We do absolutely need to keep rules in place for  
20 high standards of cleanliness to help avoid rats. We  
21 need to address snow removal and safety concerns. We

2 need to address quality of life impacts to make sure  
3 that outdoor dining structures are not negatively  
4 impacting neighbors who live upstairs or down the  
5 block. But we can do all of this with clear  
6 standards and enforcement while ensuring a successful  
7 year round outdoor dining program.

8 And lastly, we're also hearing Intro. 628, which  
9 will require the Department of Transportation to  
10 establish in person application locations and allow  
11 restaurants to save their progress on the application  
12 and return at a later date when they are applying for  
13 outdoor dining permits. This is an extensive  
14 application, probably too extensive, with lots of  
15 information required and throwing out the application  
16 itself should not be yet another burden that gate  
17 keeps restaurants from participating in this valuable  
18 program.

19 I am grateful to so many partners who have worked  
20 with us on this package of bills, especially  
21 Transportation Alternatives, Open Plans New York,  
Hospitality Alliance and many, many, many small  
businesses and restaurant owners from across my  
district and across the city. I cannot wait to bring  
back this dynamic year around outdoor dining program

2 and hopefully expand pedestrian space with this  
3 package today.

4 Thank you to the Chair and look forward to good  
5 updates on the Streets Plan. I don't know what that  
6 was but hopefully it was nothing I said and I'm just  
7 thrilled that we have a Mayor who actually cares  
8 about these things for the first time in some years.  
9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Sergeants, Sergeants can we  
11 have another seat here please to have five people  
12 testify? So, we're going to have the prepanel  
13 testify Lizi Rahman, Chris Sanders, Daquane Mays,  
14 Raphael Orlove and Jolyse Race. Some folks are in  
15 the overflow room and they are going to make their  
16 way here. And after this panel testifies, Abby  
17 Dziura will be on virtually.

18 You may begin.

19 LIZI RAHMAN: Hello, my name is Lizi Rahman and  
20 you already had sent that; I have been holding on to  
21 a picture and I have been holding on to this picture  
not only now, for the last 18 years. This boy, he is  
my son and he was only 22 years old when he was  
killed by a reckless drunk driver on a wide street  
without a bike lane in 2008, which is Queens

2 Boulevard. You know, Queens Boulevard was known as  
3 uhm, Boulevard of death at that time but after my  
4 son's death, I promised to myself, somehow I'll get  
5 bike lanes on this treacherous, dangerous street.

6 And I fought for it. I got help from a lot of  
7 people, a lot of organizations, a lot of elected  
8 officials and finally we got it. It was finalized,  
9 completely done last year but work started after my  
10 sons - six years after my sons death. It was so slow

11 and uhm, the thing is, he can't be saved anymore. He  
12 is gone but the thing is his life, his blood, my  
13 tears, it all paid for a clear path forward. All the

14 other bikers, people those who bike Queens Boulevard  
15 and others in New York City and my plea to the new  
16 Mayor and this Committee is that we should make sure

17 that all the people in New York City, bikers,  
18 pedestrians, uhm, you know drivers, they are safe and  
19 to do that, we had to take a lot of measures and you  
20 can't alone fix the system. You got to get

21 experienced people so you know we hope you'll make

sure that Transportation, DOT, has uhm more

experience and qualified people to do the job and the

Mayor has to make sure and we have a lot of hope on

this Mayor. We know the past four years, not that

2 much has been done, maybe nothing has been done but  
3 we are hopeful that in the beginning of this Mayor's  
4 term, we have seen progress and we have seen hope,  
5 and we hope that things will move in the right  
6 direction. And who will make pedestrians and  
7 bicyclists and drivers and children safe in our city  
8 and I urge you to make sure that this law is passed  
9 all around New York City Schools. Speed limits  
10 should be 20 miles per hour and another point is,  
11 bike lanes, Queens Boulevard has bike lanes and a lot  
12 of major streets. They have bike lanes and many they  
13 don't have but those bike lanes, they have to be  
14 connected, like people ride their bikes on a bike  
15 lane and then like they are stranded in the middle of  
16 a bridge and they just fall down because there is no  
17 protection, nothing to save them, nothing to protect  
18 them.

19 So, I request- I urge that there are connected  
20 bike lanes from one street to another street and  
21 there are more bike lanes to keep bikers safe and  
people have already discussed and they will be  
discussing more that biking is - serves a lot of  
different purposes. It serves - saves global warming  
and uhm it saves time. It's good for the health and

2 more and more young people and older people, they are  
3 riding bicycles and -

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Appreciate that. Thank you.  
5 Thank you very much.

6 LIZI RAHMAN: Thank you for the time. Thank you  
7 very much for listening to me.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We are going to go to the  
9 next panelist. I appreciate your testimony and for  
10 sharing your very personal experience and that's why  
11 we're holding today's hearing, so that we can prevent  
12 you know, what would happen to your son from  
13 happening in the future. Again, thank you so much  
14 for sharing that.

15 CHRIS SANDERS: Alright thank you Shaun. Thank  
16 you Transportation Committee. My name is Chris  
17 Sanders, I am the Co-Chair of the TA Manhattan  
18 Activist Committee. I have fought for a better bike  
19 infrastructure in this city for roughly six years now  
20 and let me tell you, the fight has not been easy. I  
21 lived in Harlem for 12 years before moving to Midtown  
last year and uhm Harlem and neighborhoods like it,  
have far too little protected bike lanes. When I  
ride up to my barber shop in Washington Heights, like  
everybody is parked in the bike lane. You know Adam

2 Clayton Powell, whew, not safe. The bike lane stops  
3 at 116th Street and that's all you get.

4 Uhm, so, uhm look, I experienced getting run down  
5 by cars, people swerving, not paying attention and I  
6 would feel the differences when I would come  
7 downtown. So, I used to work at Clear and I would go  
8 into the office, like 2021-2022 and you know, I would  
9 you know down below 110th Street, the bike lanes you  
10 know are nice and fancy and they're protected.

11 Uhm, and the reason I would still choose to bike  
12 then and now is because it's literally the fastest  
13 way for me to get around most of the time. Like the  
14 fastest, like I don't have to wait on the subway  
15 platform. I can go straight into work, all that and  
16 recently I've been traveling around to other global  
17 cities and some of these cities are prioritizing bike  
18 lanes, like London and Barcelona, and Zurich,  
19 shockingly Amsterdam, which everybody already knows  
20 and I think we should use this second Streets Plan to  
21 get New York where it needs to be. It is a global  
city. It's not competing with the rest of America,  
it's competing with the rest of the world and we need  
to bring our streets up to that high, high, high  
standard.

2 A new Streets Plan gives me hope that a bike lane  
3 network can work for everyone. Bicking makes us  
4 healthier, makes our community stronger, it's  
5 imperative that bike infrastructure feels safe while  
6 integrated, while connected for the whole city. The  
7 gaps in the network lead to confusion, unnecessary  
8 conflict, uhm -

9 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: If you could please wrap up  
10 your thoughts. Thank you.

11 CHRIS SANDERS: Oh okay, yeah, so basically the  
12 current bike network, it's not a network. It's just  
13 luck if they happen to connect together and ideally,  
14 I'd like the new streets plan to focus on making the  
15 bike lanes a network and expanding them to the areas  
16 that don't have it. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much.

18 JOLYSE RACE: Hello, my name is Jolyse Race. I'm  
19 with Riders Alliance. We are a grassroots  
20 organization that fights for better public  
21 transportation in New York City and I want to thank  
the Council for giving us the space to speak as a  
group here today.

So, for the past six years, I've been organizing  
bus riders across the city and four years ago, I

2 stood outside of City Hall and rallied with other  
3 transit advocates to ensure proper funding for the  
4 Streets Plan which we won. Unfortunately, this plan  
5 has not yet resulted in meaningful speed, bus speed  
6 or services improvements for most riders in New York  
7 City.

8 As a Transit Organizer it was a long four years  
9 fighting for bus riders under the Adams  
10 Administration and for four years the Streets Plan  
11 was ignored and bus riders were completely  
12 disrespected by the elected officials, save a few,  
13 whose salaries quite literally paid for by the  
14 working class people that are riding the bus. Riders  
15 cannot afford another administration like our last  
16 one and our hope here today is to encourage DOT,  
17 Council, and our Mayor to bring the changes we need  
18 to give bus riders the dignified commutes they  
19 deserve.

20 For the past two years, I've been focused on  
21 organizing riders to bring faster bus service to  
Flatbush Avenue. We've held dozens of community  
meetings, canvassed and talked to thousands of riders  
taking buses along the corridor and we hear the same  
thing, over and over and over again. Riders are

2 waiting too long in extreme weather conditions, only  
3 to board crowded buses that get stuck in traffic.  
4 Bus lanes are not respected by individual vehicles  
5 and bus riders are showing up late to work,  
6 interviews, picking up their children, appointments  
7 and everything else and I can't even count the amount  
8 of times that the B12 has made me late to meetings.  
9 And this kind of stress adds up over time and  
10 seriously impacts the overall quality of life for  
11 millions of people in the city.

12 50 percent of riders, bus riders are essential  
13 workers. The very people who are keeping our cities  
14 educated, healthy, and fed. So, why are they treated  
15 like their commutes don't matter?

16 Uhm, I hear that I have to wrap up. So, we are  
17 calling on the Mayor to speed up buses citywide by 20  
18 percent and we are asking the Council and DOT to use  
19 the Streets Plan in order to do that because it's  
20 possible. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much.

22 RAPHAEL ORLOVE: Hi, I'm Raphael Orlove. I'm  
23 here with Riders Alliance. Uhm, I've lived on and  
24 around Flatbush for over a decade now and the buses  
25 improved over that time in so many ways. It is much

2 easier now to pull up an app to find a bus route and  
3 knowing that bus is coming but that has only made it  
4 so much more painful to get on that bus and be stuck  
5 in the same traffic as everyone else.

6 I'm a reporter writing about transportation. I  
7 own a car and have covered car ownership and car  
8 culture in the city for 15 years.

9 But the city gives too much leeway to cars and  
10 nowhere is that more clear than on Flatbush Avenue.  
11 Where double and triple parked cars regularly hold up  
12 traffic until they bus after bus. These are riders  
13 who depend on the bus. They are predominantly women.  
14 They are predominantly people of color. They are  
15 essential workers often commuting to a downstate  
16 hospital.

17 Even me, I don't commute by bus. I don't depend  
18 on it to get to work but this is how you get across  
19 this part of the city. An unreliable service makes  
20 the whole side of Brooklyn cut off. And while there  
21 are many proposals to speed up the neighborhood's  
buses whether it's outdoor boarding, reducing the  
number of stops, even making all buses free, none of  
this tackles the problem of buses getting boxed out  
by someone double or triple parked.

2 We don't need new enforcement. We don't need new  
3 fines. We can't rely on painted lines in the road.  
4 We need protected bus lanes and it's not right to  
5 have them only in the richer touristy neighborhoods  
6 of Manhattan or downtown Brooklyn. We need them in  
Flatbush too. It's the backbone of Brooklyn.

7 The Mayor needs to commit to speeding up buses by  
8 20 percent citywide. The only way we're doing this  
9 is with dedicated, protected bus ways on Flatbush  
Avenue and beyond. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you, next.

11 DAQUANE MAYS: Hello, my name is Daquane Mays and  
12 I am a member of Riders Alliance, as a regular member  
13 in the Bronx. I have experienced consistent issues  
14 with service reliability and overall ride quality.  
15 Bus arrival times displayed on applications such as  
16 Google Maps and transit frequently do not align with  
17 actual arrival times. On multiple occasions, I've  
18 arrived at a stop several minutes before the bus is  
19 supposed to arrive, only to find out that the bus has  
20 left and have to wait an additional 15 to 20 minutes  
21 for the next bus to arrive and at times, a lot of  
chances the buses aren't normally overcrowded.

2 As a working class New Yorker who relies on  
3 public transportation daily, I believe we deserve a  
4 system that is dependable, clean, and respectful of  
riders' time and financial investment.

5 For someone like myself who is actively seeking  
6 employment, service unpredictability can directly  
7 impact access to job opportunities and economic  
8 mobility. These are one of the many stressors I have  
9 to endure to make ends meet. On top of that, with  
10 the rising cost of housing and living expenses, we  
11 can't afford to lose opportunities due to preventable  
transit inconsistencies.

12 I urge leadership to prioritize on time  
13 performance, service accountability, and rider  
14 experience improvements so that public transportation  
15 fulfills its roles as a reliable source for the  
communities it serves.

16 I believe we deserve ridership in every corner of  
17 the Bronx. What we demand is that the Mayor act now  
18 to speed buses up by at least 20 percent citywide.  
19 We've seen where less gets us. It gets us delays,  
20 overcrowding and missed opportunities. The Streets  
21 Plan law is the city's chance to deliver on its

2 promises and it's about time we put words into  
3 action. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. This panel is  
5 hereby excused. Thank you so much for coming in.  
6 Abby Dziura on Zoom.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: They are not on Zoom.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: If they are not on Zoom now,  
9 then we'll call on Abby later on. I will now call on  
10 - before I call on Committee Counsel to administer  
11 the oath, I want to recognize we've been joined by  
12 Council Members Epstein, Wong, Marte, Restler, and  
13 Pierina Sanchez and Gale Brewer. And Gale Brewer has  
14 remarks on her opening.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I just want to talk about  
16 Intro. 93, which is the bike parking expansion and as  
17 we know, micromobility is growing in our city. We  
18 all know that because that's why we're here.

19 Since 2002, we've seen a huge increase in  
20 ridership average daily trips from 550,000 to  
21 620,000. '26, 13 percent increase in four years and  
of course the deliverista 65,000 of them and the 56  
percent of New Yorkers who are car free. I am one of  
them. Manhattan is 76 percent. The bike parking  
inventory has reached 36,000 racks, which is about

2 72,000 spaces but we still have a deficit and that's  
3 why we have the Bill Intro. 93, it would require DOT  
4 to install at least 5,000 bicycle parking stations  
5 over the next five years. It would require potential  
6 sites to be found. At least 400 stations to be  
7 installed on commercial blocks, hopefully reducing  
8 sidewalk clutter. We've been doing that on 71st,  
9 72nd Amsterdam Broadway working with DOT and the  
10 Community Board to do exactly that and make sure that  
11 we improved street safety, because then you have more  
12 street curbside space for bike parking. It's also  
13 sometimes used in daylighting, same space. Equity  
14 and also soliciting, input from entities is  
15 incredibly important. I do want to thank the  
16 Transportation Alternatives, Bike New York, New York  
17 League of Conservation Voters for their support.  
18 This all came about with an Upper West Side  
19 Micromobility Taskforce meeting and I certainly want  
20 to thank Chair Abreu for holding this hearing. I  
21 want to thank Nick Kotowski, Committee Staff, Mike  
Chen and Theodore Miller and to say I actually see it  
in Community Board 4 where the Community Board, DOT  
came up with specific locations. It's making a huge  
difference. Thank you very much.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.  
3 We've also been joined by Council Members Ariola and  
4 Thomas-Henry on Zoom. I will now call on the  
5 Committee Counsel to administer the oath for the  
6 Administration.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I'm Mark Chen,  
8 Counsel to the Committee on Transportation and  
9 Infrastructure. Our first panel will be from DOT  
10 Michael Flynn, Margaret Forgione, Paul Ochoa, Eric  
11 Beaton and Rick Rodriguez.

12 I will now administer the oath. Please raise  
13 your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth,  
14 the whole truth and nothing but the truth before this  
15 Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member  
16 questions?

17 PANEL: I do.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. You may begin  
19 when ready.

20 MIKE FLYNN: Good afternoon Chair Abreu and  
21 members of the Committee on Transportation and  
Infrastructure. I'm Mike Flynn, Commissioner of the  
New York City Department of Transportation.

With me today are First Deputy Commissioner  
Margaret Forgione, Paul Ochoa, Executive Deputy

2 Commissioner, Eric Beaton, Deputy Commissioner for  
3 Transportation Planning and Management, and Rick  
4 Rodriguez, Assistant Commissioner for  
5 Intergovernmental and Community Affairs.

6 Thank you for the opportunity to testify on  
7 behalf of Mayor Zohran Mamdani on the New York City  
8 Streets Plan. I also want to acknowledge the  
9 advocates who spoke before us. Your experiences are  
10 deeply felt. Your hard work is seen and appreciated  
11 and it's having an impact.

12 Although we're only a couple months into the new  
13 year, we're already making great strides in achieving  
14 the Streets Plan's goals with efforts built on the  
15 bold and ambitious work of previous years. In 2025,  
16 we made significant progress in improving  
17 transportation and the city achieved some major  
18 milestones. We ended the year tied for the fewest  
19 traffic deaths in New York City's history with  
20 traffic fatalities down 31 percent since the launch  
21 of Vision Zero in 2014.

These successful results are a direct reflection  
of our safety focused approach to street redesign and  
education and enforcement.

2 In addition to historic progress making our  
3 streets safer, Manhattan also benefitted from the  
4 MTA's Congestion Pricing Initiative, which led to an  
5 11 percent reduction in traffic, faster bridge and  
6 tunnel crossings of up to 50 percent and increases in  
transit ridership and walking trips.

7 Combined with our Major Street Redesign projects,  
8 it's easier and safer to walk, take transit and cycle  
9 throughout the city. Speaking of Street Redesign  
10 projects across the five boroughs, we completed over  
11 130 projects in 2025 that support safe and  
12 sustainable transportation. These include expanded  
13 pedestrian cyclist space on the Queens Borough  
14 Bridge, a transformational bike boulevard on 31st  
15 Avenue in Astoria, bus lanes on Hillside Avenue in  
16 Eastern Queens that improve service for more than  
17 215,000 daily riders, a new pedestrian plaza in  
Washington Heights, a new segment of the Harlem River  
Greenway on Bailey Avenue in the Bronx and many, many  
more.

18 But there is much, much more to do. When Mayor  
19 Mamdani selected me to serve as DOT Commissioner, he  
20 tasked us with thinking big, being ambitious and  
21 making our streetscape the envy of the world and

2 that's exactly what we're going to deliver. We're  
3 going to deal with a focus on safe, affordable and  
4 low pollution transportation and building a vibrant,  
5 inequitable public realm.

6 As someone who spent his career focused on this  
7 work, it's deeply personal to me and I recognize the  
8 special opportunity that I have in this important  
9 role serving my fellow New Yorkers. As I know from  
10 the nearly ten years that I previously spent serving  
11 our city at DOT, the agency has some of the world's  
12 best minds in transportation and is full of  
13 hardworking, mission driven employees. So, we're  
14 ready for the challenges that lie ahead. Our most  
15 immediate steps have been to resume important street  
16 redesign projects that stall due to political  
17 considerations or legal challenges. These projects  
18 include implementing parking protected bike lanes  
19 along McGuinness Boulevard in Greenpoint, extending  
20 the Madison Avenue double bus lane South from 42nd  
21 Street to 23rd Street in Manhattan, and restarting  
the process to redesign the 31st Street corridor in  
Astoria.

Just last month, we also announced the revival of  
two stalled bus and bike lane projects which include

2 finalizing the designs for the Fordham Road offset  
3 bus lanes and completing the final segment of the  
4 protected bike lane on Ashland Place in Brooklyn.

5 This spring, we'll also implement other Brooklyn  
6 bike lane projects, including a long delayed plan to  
7 build a bike lane network across Midwood, Flatbush  
8 and East Flatbush and we'll also install parking  
9 protected bike lanes on East New York Avenue and  
10 conventional bike lanes will be added in the Prospect  
11 Lefferts Gardens Neighborhood, and that's just the  
12 beginning.

13 Later this year, we'll release the second streets  
14 plan, presenting the city's comprehensive vision to  
15 make our streets even safer, more welcoming and more  
16 sustainable. This time, we'll focus squarely on  
17 outcomes, not just miles. We have to be in tune to  
18 how the work we do improves the lives of New Yorkers.  
19 We'll ask clear, measurable questions. Are buses  
20 moving faster? Are fewer people being killed or  
21 seriously injured? Are more New Yorkers choosing to  
bike? Is it easier and more affordable to get around  
our city without a car?

Is the public space we're creating high quality  
and equitably distributed? These are metrics that

2 matter. I want the agency to go big and be bold but  
3 ambition alone is not strategy. The next streets  
4 plan should be a blueprint that aligns aspiration and  
5 execution to deliver real results for New Yorkers.  
6 The scale and pace envisioned in the original streets  
7 plan, reflected a significant and immediate shift.  
8 Experience has shown that sustained delivery requires  
9 aligning goals with an ability to execute at scale.  
10 If we are to move faster and deliver more impact, the  
11 agency needs the flexibility to prioritize its  
12 resources and the projects that produce the greatest  
13 results.

14 We want to focus on strategies that ensure  
15 scalable long-term progress and prioritize  
16 investments that maximize impact. This is something  
17 that mandates alone cannot achieve. We'll expand  
18 proven tools, designs and treatments across the city  
19 while introducing new programs and commitments to  
20 transform our streets into vibrant, dynamic public  
21 spaces, and we look forward to working with the  
Council to deliver these results in every district  
with shovels in the ground, building protected bus  
lanes, expanding pedestrian space, building protected  
bike lanes and delivering lifesaving street safety

2 projects. No New Yorker deserves lesser results  
3 based on their Council District.

4 Turning to the legislation before the Council  
5 today. First, Intro. 13, sponsored by Speaker Menin.  
6 This bill would require DOT to install at least 100  
7 illuminated solar-powered traffic controlled devices  
8 at crosswalks annually over the next five years and  
9 to study the efficacy of these devices in comparison  
10 to regular crosswalks.

11 DOT frequently tests new materials to enhance  
12 safety on our streets and we're always open to  
13 testing new technologies to increase safety.  
14 However, we have done some preliminary studies on the  
15 types of technologies envisioned in the bill and we  
16 have some concerns about their efficacy. Our  
17 previous tests found no notable difference in  
18 compliance compared to regular stop signs and crashes  
19 did not significantly change in the five pilot  
20 locations when testing Rectangular Rapid Flashing  
21 Beacons or RRFBs. Additionally, NETCD guidelines  
would only allow for a limited universe of  
intersections since in roadway warning lights cannot  
be used at intersections controlled by traffic  
signals, stop signs or yield signs.

2 Analysis from other jurisdictions across the  
3 country identifies greater benefits in higher speed,  
4 lower traffic streets, which are typically in  
5 non-urban settings. Research also indicates a  
6 flashing light fatigue effect, in which the more  
widespread the treatment, the less effective it is.

7 Finally, this bill would require DOT to install a  
8 large number of devices, significantly more than is  
9 needed to determine their efficacy. We look forward  
10 to discussions with the Council and appropriate  
11 stakeholders on this legislation and the best  
strategies to explore new technologies.

12 Next, Intro. 93, sponsored by Council Member  
13 Brewer. This bill would create a bicycle parking  
14 station program. In the first year, it requires DOT  
15 to identify 5,000 locations of potential sites for  
16 bicycle parking stations, 2,000 of which are to be  
17 within commercial corridors. Over the next five  
18 years thereafter, DOT is to install bike parking  
stations in at least 1,000 locations a year, 400 of  
which must be in commercial corridors.

19 It also requires DOT to make a map of all  
20 locations installed and submit a report to the  
21

2 Council within six years of the effective data  
3 analyzing the program.

4 Our city's cycling trends continue to grow and  
5 with more than 600,000 bicycling trips taken in the  
6 city each day, we know accessible bicycle parking is  
7 critical for New Yorkers. Currently, we're aiming to  
8 install at least 2,000 bike racks per year on the  
9 sidewalk or roadway but we're often exceeding our  
10 goal as we strive to offer free, short-term bike  
11 parking to keep our city moving. We install our  
12 large and small hoop racks, along with our bike  
13 corrals based on bike parking demands and we're also  
14 looking to the future to include secure bike parking.

15 Similar to current practice, we plan to use  
16 public input to identify locations for secure bike  
17 parking access, which will continue to fuel New  
18 Yorkers' embraced cycling as a safe and  
19 environmentally friendly transportation option, while  
20 balancing operational considerations and competing  
21 roadway and sidewalk needs.

We look forward to ongoing conversations with the  
Council to identify initiatives that meet our shared  
goal to support continued cycling growth.

2 Next, Intro. 163, sponsored by Council Member De  
3 La Rosa, this bill would require DOT in consultation  
4 with the Department of Small Business Services and  
5 the New York City Economic Development Corporation to  
6 conduct a study on the feasibility of providing ferry  
7 service to Inwood in Manhattan. Although DOT owns  
8 and operates the Staten Island Ferry, we do not  
9 oversee or operate New York City Ferry Contract and  
10 defer to our sister agency EDC who does.

11 Turning to Intro. 202, sponsored by Council  
12 Member Gutiérrez. This bill would require DOT to  
13 complete installation of any necessary traffic  
14 calming device or traffic control device on any  
15 street adjacent to a school in no more than 60 days  
16 after DOT issues its traffic study determination.

17 DOT shows the goal to act as expediently as  
18 possible and we're continually striving to deliver  
19 more efficiently. We work to enhance safety through  
20 a variety of traffic calming and traffic control  
21 design changes that together, make streets safer by  
encouraging slower speeds and reducing opportunities  
for aggressive driving. For traffic controlled  
devices, we have a detailed process called an  
intersection control study, to determine if traffic

2 signals or multiway stop signs are appropriate. We  
3 also consider weather conditions and active site  
4 constraints like construction and sidewalk sheds.  
5 Even in a perfect scenario, we still need to consider  
6 factors that are out of our control when determining  
7 timing for installation.

8 Additionally, our traffic calming design  
9 guidelines determine the appropriate conditions for  
10 installation based on a field study. Many of our  
11 traffic calming measures are dependent on weather  
12 conditions and some treatments may fail to  
13 deteriorate or lead to increased risk if installed  
14 during suboptimal conditions.

15 Regardless of the treatment, we're taking  
16 unprecedented steps in our safety engineering efforts  
17 with thoughtful and comprehensive review that may  
18 take time prior to installation and we welcome  
19 collaboration in identifying specific areas of  
20 concern where we can bring additional safety  
21 intervention.

22 We look forward to discussions with the Council  
23 on this legislation and the best strategies to ensure  
24 efficient yet thoughtful treatment of installation  
25 timeframes.

2 Next, Intro. 1310 sponsored by Council Member  
3 Marte. This bill would require DOT to establish a  
4 program to ensure each sign in Chinatown has the  
5 street name in Chinese and in English. As part of  
6 the program, DOT would also conduct a study that  
7 determined the Chinatown borders and then add the  
8 Chinese name of the street to each English only sign  
9 within the borders.

10 This bill would also require DOT to replace any  
11 damaged bilingual street name sign in the city with a  
12 new bilingual sign and enable a Council Member or the  
13 Public Advocate to request DOT add a street name in  
14 English and another language.

15 Lastly, this bill would require DOT to create and  
16 maintain a website regarding bilingual street name  
17 signs for the Council Members and the Public Advocate  
18 to enter sign requests, a searchable map, and a  
19 searchable database. With over one million street  
20 signs citywide, our teams work quickly to prioritize  
21 the repair and maintenance of signs with designs  
following federal guidelines which have a direct  
impact on safety.

At the same time, we're committed to maintaining  
the current set of signs in Chinatown and would want

2 to make sure not to add new Administrative burdens on  
3 that process.

4 We think Council's current practice of working  
5 with the city to identify street co-naming locations  
6 is the smart strategy when there's an interest in  
7 celebrating cultural influences at specific  
8 locations. We'd be happy to have further discussions  
9 with the Council about this bill.

10 Turning to Intro. 655, sponsored by Council  
11 Member Restler. This bill would expand the city's  
12 outdoor dining program by allowing grocery stores to  
13 apply for a sidewalk cafe license, removing seasonal  
14 restrictions on roadway café operation and providing  
15 the option to expand frontage for certain cafés upon  
16 consent. This bill would also streamline the review  
17 process for restaurants applying to operate a  
18 sidewalk or roadway café by restricting community  
19 boards from requiring applicants to supply additional  
20 materials.

21 We're continuously exploring new ways to increase  
program participation and remove barriers to access  
for Dining Out NYC and support the bill, while also  
acknowledging some operational and other  
considerations.

2 We're exploring new roles to address heating and  
3 winterization standards, strengthen sanitation and  
4 quality of life requirements and enhance enforcement  
5 protocols. As we prepare for the program's second  
6 season, we look forward to using lessons learned from  
7 the program's first year to continue improving upon  
8 the program's success. We're happy to have more  
9 discussions with the Council and stakeholders about  
10 adapting our program processes.

11 Next, Intro. 628 sponsored by Council Member  
12 Restler. This bill would require DOT to issue and  
13 receive applications to operate a sidewalk café and  
14 roadway café online and add a physical location  
15 accessible to the public. This bill would also allow  
16 applicants to save partially filled out online  
17 applications in order to complete the application at  
18 a later date.

19 Our Dining Out NYC team works diligently with  
20 applicants to provide support on the outdoor dining  
21 application process, both virtually and in person  
based on applicant preference.

We already offer robust resources and partnership  
with sister agencies to provide free services for  
applicants to submit applications in person and

2 applicants already have the opportunity to apply  
3 online or in person.

4 We're continuously exploring how to improve our  
5 online application process and are pleased to  
6 announce that the function to save in progress  
7 applications is available for applicants.

8 We look forward to continuing the ongoing work of  
9 enhancing our application process by working with the  
10 sponsor on this bill.

11 Turning to Preconsidered Bill 1336, sponsored by  
12 Speaker Menin. This bill would limit the clear path  
13 requirement for pedestrian paths in front of sidewalk  
14 cafés to no more than 8 feet or 50 percent of the  
15 width of the sidewalk, whichever is greater.

16 Sidewalk space is becoming more competitive than ever  
17 and it's critical to prioritize a sidewalk as being a  
18 safe place for New Yorkers to walk, use a wheelchair  
19 or push a stroller or shopping cart. Further,  
20 sufficient clear path requirements are necessary for  
21 our planners to meet various needs, including  
providing space for bike racks, EV charging stations,  
city bike stations, bus shelters and other street  
furniture.

2 It's also imperative to maintain sufficient space  
3 for pedestrian access and people with disabilities.  
4 As we have seen all too well from the winter weather,  
5 overcrowded sidewalks during storms can lead to  
6 additional accessibility issues. Currently, there  
7 are three tiers of clear path in the Dining Out NYC  
8 program based on DOTs Innovative Pedestrian Mobility  
9 plan, 12 feet on global corridors, 10 feet on  
10 regional corridors and 8 feet on all other streets.  
11 The global and regional corridors exist largely in  
12 the central business district in Manhattan, in the  
13 most heavily foot traffic in the city. 97 percent of  
14 all streets in the city already fall into the 8 foot  
15 clear path requirement.

16 We're thrilled with the growing interest in the  
17 program but we're also weary of creating sidewalk  
18 congestion and compromising the accessibility needs  
19 for New Yorkers in the busiest sections of the city.  
20 We're happy to discuss our current clear path  
21 requirements to determine if any adjustments can be  
made while maintaining our commitment to making our  
pedestrian space safe and accessible for all.

Next, Preconsidered Bill 1335, sponsored by  
Council Member Hanif. This bill would require DOT to

2 identify intersections that pose the greatest danger  
3 to pedestrians based upon incidents of traffic  
4 crashes involving pedestrians and implement curb  
5 extensions prohibiting parking within 15 feet of a  
6 crosswalk at a minimum of five intersections in each  
7 borough.

8 While curb extensions are an important tool in  
9 our traffic calming toolbox, we strongly believe that  
10 mandating specific treatments across the board,  
11 without considering the specific issues at a specific  
12 location isn't advisable. Through the Vision Zero  
13 Borough Pedestrian Action Plans, the agency utilizes  
14 crash data as well as engineering judgement to  
15 determine the locations most in need of safety  
16 interventions and what safety interventions are best  
17 suited for that location.

18 While we support the overall goal to focus safety  
19 investments where they are needed most, we will want  
20 to ensure our engineers retain flexibility to make  
21 holistic determinations on where safety treatments  
are needed and which treatments will be most  
effective in those areas. We always welcome input  
from Council Members on any suggested locations to  
explore additional safety improvements.

2 Finally, Preconsidered Bill 1338, sponsored by  
3 Council Member Restler. This bill would require DOT  
4 to include in its next Streets Master Plan to be  
5 issued by December 1, 2026. A benchmark to expand  
6 pedestrian space by one million square feet per year  
7 for the next five years and to prioritize expanding  
8 pedestrian space in the areas around bus stops and  
9 subway stations that have the highest rates of  
10 pedestrian traffic.

11 Since streets make up 27 percent of the city's  
12 total land area, we maintain and manage a large  
13 portion of the city's public space. Pedestrian space  
14 is transformed, reclaimed roadway into vibrant social  
15 public spaces for all to enjoy and these projects  
16 simultaneously work to increase safety by enhancing  
17 pedestrian comfort and flow.

18 As demand for pedestrian space increases, we're  
19 responding by expanding opportunities that prioritize  
20 pedestrians at the block, corridor, or district-wide  
21 scale. We're also developing some exciting new  
programs and commitments on this topic that we intend  
to incorporate into the upcoming new streets plan.  
These new commitments will compliment our existing  
goals, which result in approximately a half a million

2 square feet of new pedestrian space a year. We look  
3 forward to ongoing conversations with the Council to  
4 identify initiatives that meet our shared goal to  
5 increase pedestrian space citywide.

6 In conclusion, I would like to thank the Council  
7 for the opportunity to testify before you today. I'm  
8 really looking forward to partnering with you and  
9 your colleagues to ensure that all New Yorkers and  
10 especially our least advantaged neighbors can benefit  
11 from safe and livable streets that offer many  
12 different choices for how to get around. We would  
13 now be happy to answer any questions.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Commissioner. I  
15 would like to add that we've been joined by Council  
16 Member Brooks-Powers remotely and in person Council  
17 Members Dinowitz and Krishnan.

18 Commissioner, Local Law 195 of 2019, also known  
19 as the Streets Plan or the Transportation Master  
20 Plan, was passed in October 2019 by the Council to  
21 expand the city's biking, bus, and pedestrian safety  
infrastructure and to enable a holistic approach  
developing the city's transportation network.

The Council has heard numerous hearings with DOT  
about the progress made toward the requirements of

2 the Streets Plan. While DOT has had some successes  
3 with respect to intersection redesigns, accessible  
4 pedestrian signals and new pedestrian space that has  
5 lagged significantly with respect to bike and bus  
6 infrastructure, including bus shelter upgrades.

7 The numbers for protected bus lanes and bus stop  
8 upgrades are almost too low to believe and while DOT  
9 has made a fair effort to install protected bicycle  
10 lanes, they still fall short of what is required.

11 The first question on our mind is with the new  
12 mayoral administration and under your new leadership  
13 Commissioner Flynn, is the Department prepared to  
14 invest more to fulfill the requirements of the  
15 Streets Plan and ensure its success?

16 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you Majority Leader. So, the  
17 Mayor has been clear that we can and must do better  
18 and that safe and livable streets are a priority for  
19 this Administration and we've already received an  
20 initial downpayment as part of the January plan, as  
21 well as the Mayor announcing the lifting and  
loosening our ability to hire, which has really been  
a constraint in the past. We're committed to  
delivering more transformative and ambitious street  
redesign projects going forward. We are doing

2 everything to make 2026 a great year and expect to  
3 significantly out perform the last couple of years.

4 Uhm, while also building significant internal  
5 capacity to aim much higher and be bigger and bolder  
6 in the years ahead.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you and we'll ask about  
8 whether or not that downpayment is enough for what  
9 we're expecting. Uhm, and at the same time, thank  
10 you for sharing that perspective and commitment.

11 The Streets Plan also requires that DOT submit a  
12 report to the Council and publish it on its website  
13 on February 1st of each year. This report is  
14 required by law to require an update regarding any  
15 changes to the plan from the previous year and to  
16 include the status of the implementation of each  
17 benchmark mandated by the plan.

18 As of this morning, this year's report has been  
19 shared with the Committee but has not been made  
20 publicly available. Why has there been a delay in  
21 publishing this required report?

MIKE FLYNN: Uhm, I believe it should be posted  
as of today and I can say the delay in publishing it  
was due to two things. One, we were still finalizing  
the end of year totals from 2025 and there was a

2 delay as well in the publishing of the U.S. Census  
3 American Community Survey Data, which we used to  
4 calculate some of the metrics in the report.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: It wasn't up at nine o'clock  
6 but my team tells me it is up now. What would DOT do  
7 to make sure it meets next year's February 1st  
8 deadline?

9 MIKE FLYNN: We'll do everything in our power for  
10 sure to you know get a head of it, to compile the  
11 numbers. In this case, like I mentioned, sometimes  
12 we're at the mercy of some of the data sources that  
13 we need, so we T-up 95 percent of the update and then  
14 we just need to wait to fill in a couple of the  
15 blanks.

16 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You mentioned in your opening  
17 testimony that as part of the second Streets Plan,  
18 there are metrics, measurable questions, metrics that  
19 you'll be using. Are buses moving faster? Are fewer  
20 people being killed or seriously injured? Are more  
21 New Yorkers choosing to bike? Whether or not it is  
easier or more affordable to get around our city  
without a car. Is this public space creating high  
quality and is it equitably distributed? Are those  
metrics going to be in a Second Streets Master Plan?

2 MIKE FLYNN: We're still developing the content  
3 of the plan but absolutely, it's a priority for us to  
4 also look at what I would call outcomes, right? Not  
5 just output.

6 So, measuring mileage and you know square footage  
7 and things like that is one important way to measure  
8 our output but we're also very interested in how it  
9 affects the day to day lives of New Yorkers. We want  
10 to make sure you know not only that we're creating  
11 infrastructure but that the infrastructure is high  
12 quality. That it's equitably distributed across the  
13 city and that we have good means of measuring those  
14 kinds of things too.

15 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I was at a press conference  
16 this morning with the advocates and you know  
17 Transportation Alternatives including other important  
18 advocates who were there. You know they speak to not  
19 only the high volume that is needed in terms of  
20 having more bus lanes and bike lanes but that the  
21 quality is being matched with that, that ridership is  
going up. That commute times are improving and so,  
can you - are you able to commit today that these  
metrics will be added in the second Streets Master  
Plan?

2 MIKE FLYNN: I believe it's very likely that  
3 those metrics and possibly others as well will be in  
4 there because I think that they're meaningful ways of  
5 looking at how New Yorkers get around. You know and I  
6 think that there's some good examples even this year  
7 of projects that kind of illustrate this.

8 For example, the center running bus lanes on  
9 Flatbush Avenue that are being implemented, which you  
10 know will have a very dramatic impact on the commutes  
11 of tens of thousands of New Yorkers. Things like  
12 widening sidewalks on 9th Avenue in Manhattan and  
13 then widening the bike lanes on 6th Avenue in time  
14 for the World Cup is emblematic of how it may not  
15 actually contribute to our Streets Plan mileage  
16 targets but it can have a really major impact on how  
17 people experience the city.

18 Uhm or something like Ashland Place, which is  
19 just a block basically but is going you know the some  
20 is greater than the parts in a way. The impact of  
21 creating that continuous north, south protected bike  
connection through Brooklyn will be huge. Uhm, so  
those are a few examples.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Great, based on what I can  
tell, it seems that this year's Streets Plan is much

2 shorter than in previous years. What is the reason  
3 for that and is DOT planning to publish any  
4 additional materials to supplement this report.

5 MIKE FLYNN: Right, so the one year update for  
6 the 2025 update, which we just published is uhm,  
7 smaller than the previous ones and that's honestly a  
8 sort of a reflection because we're very focused on  
9 the new plan and going forward and kind of resetting  
10 the vision, re invigorating it, aiming higher and  
11 some of the things I mentioned earlier about also  
12 kind of how we measure it, measure progress.

13 So, that's you know, we wanted to obviously  
14 comply with the law. We wanted to provide the update  
15 on those metrics that we're required to report on but  
16 we're really focused on the new era.

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Is it shorter because there  
18 was less work being done?

19 MIKE FLYNN: Uhm, I think 2025 by some metrics,  
20 there was more output. By some metrics, there was  
21 less. We could talk more about the details if you  
want.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And I'll get into that -  
okay. Since the report has now been publicly  
available, we would like to sort of take a deeper

2 dive you know on the record on some of those numbers  
3 with respect to the Streets Plan in 2025. So, how  
4 many bikes - how many protected bike lanes were  
installed?

5 MIKE FLYNN: Uh for 2025, we installed 18.2 miles  
6 of protected bike lanes.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And what was the requirement?

8 MIKE FLYNN: The requirement was 50 miles.

9 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Alright and why, why was it  
so woefully short from the requirement?

10 MIKE FLYNN: I think there's two basic reasons.  
11 One, is that uhm you know to be honest, the  
12 implementation of the Streets Plan and the capacity  
13 to do that was not uhm, I think fully prioritized by  
14 the previous administration. That's one reason and  
15 the other reason is that a certain number of projects  
16 were paused or delayed or cancelled, either because  
of political considerations or lawsuits.

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: It is encouraging to see that  
18 DOT completed more miles of bus lanes in 2025 than  
19 the 13.5 miles being completed in 2024. What enabled  
20 DOT to do better with respect to the bus lane  
21 installation requirement in 2025?

2 MIKE FLYNN: Sure, so the definition of bus lanes  
3 in the Streets Master Plan Law is a little bit  
4 different from I think how people usually think about  
5 bus lanes. It includes either bus lanes that are  
6 physically protected, which is a relatively small  
7 portion of the total or bus lanes that are protected  
8 by cameras.

9 So, working in partnership with the MTA, we were  
10 able to very dramatically expand the On Bus Camera  
11 Enforcement Program, their East program, which makes  
12 a very dramatic difference in helping the bus lanes  
13 that we have stay clear.

14 So, the MTA did great in rolling that out. We  
15 work with them. We process those violations and we  
16 look forward to continuing to work on that rollout  
17 this year, even as we add more of the actual bus  
18 lanes on the street as well.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Is it your position that the  
20 underage of the construction of bus lanes was that  
21 under the legal requirements that were set out?

MIKE FLYNN: Yes, the legal requirement was 30  
and we completed 20.8.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Okay and do you - you know I  
have to ask. Do you find that the benchmarks set out

2 in the Streets Plan, do you find that to be a  
3 mandated requirement by law or as a suggestion?

4 MIKE FLYNN: Well, the numbers are set in the law  
5 and uhm you know we're very focused moving forward on  
6 creating the capacity to uh meet those kinds of  
7 numbers and really take our output to the next level  
8 and we're you know - we're excited that we have a  
9 mayor for whom this is a top priority and we're ready  
10 to move ahead with that.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: So, you see it as a  
12 requirement not as a suggestion?

13 MIKE FLYNN: Correct.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: While 20.8 miles completed is  
15 better than in past years, it was still below the 30  
16 mile requirement. And so, what is DOT going to do  
17 moving forward to meet the 30 mile mandate?

18 MIKE FLYNN: As I mentioned a little earlier,  
19 we're very focused on increasing our capacity to  
20 deliver and that's you know - that's partly - look  
21 government is a big ship to turn right and so, we're  
basically building back from a few years where maybe  
the capacity wasn't quite there and we're focused on  
building it going forward. That's things like  
staffing up. It's things like the contract capacity

2 for the you know putting markings or signals or  
3 things like that. It's the facilities and the  
4 vehicles that we need to actually go out and install  
5 these things and maintain them.

6 So, you know I want to be realistic that - that  
7 takes some time but I feel confident that we're going  
8 to well out perform last year this year. I think it  
9 also underscores because the resources and the  
10 capacities want half of the equation but the other  
11 half of that is the conversations and the way we work  
12 with communities and I think it really underscores  
13 the leadership of the Council and community members  
14 you know to help us work with communities to advance  
15 these important projects.

16 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Uhm, so communities are  
17 serving as impediments to meeting this legal  
18 obligation?

19 MIKE FLYNN: No but I believe that you know we've  
20 seen the streets are some of the most highly valued  
21 and sometimes contested spaces in the city. There's  
a lot of different opinions. Sometimes there's  
louder voices, sometimes there's voices that aren't  
as well heard. Sometimes there's special interests  
right. And so, I think it really takes thoughtful

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 62  
2 discussions and engagement to work with communities  
3 to uh to advance the best possible solutions.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Right, the City Council  
5 passed this law in 2019, there was a lot of community  
6 input that went into that bill. Now, you have the  
7 legal obligation to fulfill this requirement. And  
8 so, to the extent that there's a hurdle, I mean  
9 again, I don't want there to be you know excuses for  
10 not fulfilling that legal obligation.

11 I understand that folks can get riled up I mean,  
12 when I had trash containerization come to my district  
13 and we lost 500 parkings spots in 40 blocks, I mean  
14 that was part of the impediments that came with it  
15 but the community - there was also another side of  
16 the coin where their community also made their voice  
17 known to say that we want open streets, that we want  
18 on-street containerization.

19 So, this is now the law and so, it is our hope  
20 that those targets would not only - you would not  
21 only out perform last years but out performing last  
years targets could also mean that you do two extra  
miles and that could still fall short of the legal  
requirement. And so my question is by out

2 performing, do you mean that you're going to meet the  
3 legal requirements?

4 MIKE FLYNN: Your points are well taken, Majority  
5 Leader. We're in the process of developing our 2026  
6 implementation program. I don't think that I could  
7 commit to a specific number today.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: That brings me a lot of  
9 concern. As the Chair of this Committee but also as  
10 someone who is speaking on behalf of the Council, we  
11 take the laws that we pass very seriously. And so,  
12 when you speak about capacity and resources about  
13 implementing bus lanes in our city, what does the  
14 capacity look like? What's the headcount you need to  
15 get to reach these legally mandated targets and how  
16 much money do you need in the budget to make that  
17 happen? And I need precision here because I need to  
18 know what I need to advocate for in this year's  
19 budget and to make sure that we're having the same  
20 conversation on what is needed.

21 PAUL OCHOA: Yeah, thank you Chair. As the  
Commissioner mentioned, you know resources can mean a  
lot of things. We are with conversations with City  
Hall and OMB to make sure that they understand those  
numbers. We're going to have a Preliminary Budget

2 hearing in two weeks I believe where we can dive deep  
3 into what current capacity we have. At this moment,  
4 we don't have an exact number of headcount and OTPS  
5 needs but it is a part of a conversation that we're  
6 having with City Hall and OMB. Uhm, to make sure  
7 that we have those resources to meet these mandates.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Look, I know this is very  
9 important to the Mayor, It is certainly important to  
10 the Council Members here that you know we talk about  
11 fast and free. The fast part, that's the bus lanes.  
12 The fast part is a budget that is fully funded to  
13 meet these legal requirements.

14 And so, at the Preliminary hearing, I expect the  
15 Administration to tell me whether or not you achieve  
16 it on your end is one thing but I expect to know  
17 exactly what is needed in terms of headcount, in  
18 terms of capacity, in terms of resources and budget  
19 in order for the legally mandated requirements to be  
20 done. Because we're also trying to make up for lost  
21 time. Right, we've lost under Eric Adams, I mean, I  
believe in the last two years, there were 57 percent  
of bus lanes that were done and 48 percent of bike  
lanes that were done. A 50 percent is a big fat F  
you know for our school students and so, the other 50

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 65

2 percent is something that we need to make up for lost  
3 time but also moving forward, I would also like to  
4 hear what you need from us and so, I hope at this  
5 next hearing, we can get that information.

6 MIKE FLYNN: Yeah, and Council Members listen,  
7 Preliminary Budget hearings is the start of the  
8 budget process. We're going to have another hearing  
9 in May so there are multiple steps that you know the  
10 Council and the Administration goes through to make  
11 sure that agencies have the proper resources to  
12 deliver what New Yorkers and the Mayor is expecting  
13 from them.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Now, pivoting to bike lanes.  
15 DOT completed 29.3 miles of protected bike lanes in  
16 2024. Why was the Department only able to complete  
17 18.2 in 2025? Again, I understand this happened  
18 under Mayor Adams's watch. Uhm, but if to the extent  
19 we can answer that here, I know Commissioner Forgiore  
20 served under Mayor Adams, so if we can get  
21 information from her, that would be great.

MIKE FLYNN: Well, I think the response would be  
- is similar to what I mentioned about bus lanes in  
terms of what the constraints were. It's you know  
capacity at that time and maybe being less of a

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 66

2 priority for that Administration and it's also the  
3 sorry - I lost my train of thought. The uh - oh yeah  
4 right, sorry, projects that were cancelled, paused or  
5 delayed.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Yeah and I'll go into  
7 contractual procurement delays shortly. Uhm, with  
8 respect to bus shelters. My understanding there was  
9 only 18 - sorry, bus stop upgrades. Was that there  
10 were only 18 done last year and the requirement was  
11 500. Is that right?

12 MIKE FLYNN: Chair, so I'm going to take the  
13 blame here because I was part of the team that was  
14 negotiating the original law in 2019. That should  
15 have been an or. And so, the way - the way the  
16 current law was written is in order for it to count  
17 as a bus upgrade, there needs to be a bus shelter  
18 installed and real time passenger information device.  
19 And so, we usually do one or the other. So, we do  
20 have a little side note that says, that if you count  
21 either or, we meet that - we well over meet that  
22 target.

23 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Why can't you do both?

24 MIKE FLYNN: So, there's - you know we're going  
25 to get into RTPI and our future plan but usually it's

26

2 - we can get into the contracting thing but uhm, we  
3 had to make some hard decisions last administration  
4 in rounds of PEGs and RTPI was one of those projects.  
5 But we are looking at restarting the real time  
6 passenger information in the next few months. But I  
7 do want to clarify that we did, we well exceeded the  
8 installation. If it had been ignored - it's just  
9 unfortunate the way the law was written that it needs  
10 to be both counted. It was 600 uhm, over 600 bus  
11 stops improvements if it was an or.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: What is the current state of  
13 the contract and procurement issues involved with the  
14 bus stop upgrades? To the extent that bus stop  
15 upgrades are low due to contract issues. I'm not  
16 sure that's an issue.

17 MIKE FLYNN: We actually don't have huge  
18 contracting issues. I would say though towards the  
19 end of the last administration, we did announce a  
20 huge investment in bus stop improvements that we're  
21 going to be rolling out in the next few years. I  
think we expect to get about 10,000 bus stop  
improvements and benches throughout the city over the  
next I believe four years and Eric can correct me if  
I'm wrong but four or five years. That is a very

2 exciting investment that you know we're looking  
3 forward to working with the Council and implementing  
4 and installing.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: So, given that uhm a lot of  
6 these benchmarks you know we fell short of - the  
7 department fell short on these benchmarks in 2025.  
8 Did DOT in 2025 have 50 miles of protected bike lanes  
9 planned out for 2025 to begin with in its plan for  
10 last year?

11 PAUL OCHOA: So, we - among the things that the  
12 Commissioner talked about it you know we have to  
13 build the capacity all through the place, so.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Yeah, but was there a plan in  
15 2025 to do -

16 PAUL OCHOA: So, we do have a plan each year for  
17 meeting or exceeding these targets. We don't have  
18 signed engineering

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You did a total 50 miles in  
20 the plan last year. Did that plan total 50 miles  
21 last year?

PAUL OCHOA: Our plan had 50 miles but it's not  
that we left 20 miles or 30 miles that was fully  
designed. Part of what we need to do is hire the

2 planners, hire the engineers, like hire all the steps  
3 in the process.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Is that plan publicly  
5 available?

6 MIKE FLYNN: Well, we have the Streets Plan,  
7 which shows our priority corridors and areas where we  
8 want to expand the bike network and that helps guide  
9 our team's work. So, you could think of it like a  
10 hopper right? We have a lot of bike lanes in the  
11 hopper and then we take them through the process of  
12 designing and implementing them and each year as  
13 Deputy Commissioner said, you know we basically we  
14 advance the maximum amount that we can with the  
15 resources we have further along into design,  
16 engineering and implementation. But we have you  
17 know, my point is that we have the uhm, we have that  
18 longer list. We have that universe of projects that  
19 could move forward.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: How does DOT prioritize and  
21 pick locations for specific treatments when working  
towards the Streets Plan benchmarks?

MIKE FLYNN: So, the uhm, I could start and  
anyone is welcome to detail. Uhm, yeah, so the  
Streets Plan really is the starting point and we're

2 very proud that the original Streets Plan for the  
3 first time created an equity driven framework for  
4 prioritizing our investments so that's you know,  
5 that's kind of the starting point in terms of how we  
6 decide where to focus. We also are continually  
7 looking at things like crash data, speeding data,  
8 volumes of different modes. Also always listening to  
9 the community and hearing from our elected officials  
10 and community boards and we have teams of planners  
11 basically who kind of take all those inputs and use  
12 it to determine where we can have the greatest  
13 impact.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: How long does - so is  
15 community input being implemented or does it inform  
16 the Streets Plan?

17 MIKE FLYNN: Absolutely. It's kind of an ongoing  
18 process right. We hear from the community whether  
19 it's through 311, whether it's through Council  
20 hearings or community board meetings. Whether it's  
21 through community board budget priorities. You know  
all the different ways that we hear from communities  
about what they want and we also have our borough  
offices, right? So, they really know the intimate  
details of their borough and work with our technical

2 staff to basically take what they're hearing from the  
3 community and have it inform our technical work  
4 program.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: How long does DOT take to  
6 respond to specific street calming measure requests?

7 MIKE FLYNN: I believe the answer is that it kind  
8 of depends on which channel it's coming from. I  
9 don't know if others would like to add.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And what are those channels?

11 MARGARET FORGIONE: So, i would say uhm, for one  
12 thing we work carefully with each community board to  
13 take their feedback. So, often times when we hear  
14 from a community board as well as an elected, whose  
15 speaking on behalf of the larger folks in that  
16 community, that's a very critical piece of input for  
17 us. We also as you can imagine receive you know  
18 thousands of pieces of correspondence. When we do  
19 receive requests, we also do look as the Commissioner  
20 said, back on the crash and injury stats uhm to look  
21 at whether there are issues in those neighborhoods or  
we have plans in those neighborhoods and we try to  
incorporate that feedback.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: So, there's no specific  
3 timing that you can provide to us on the response  
4 times?

5 MARGARET FORGIONE: Uhm, we have response times  
6 for all kinds of correspondence and in some cases, we  
7 talk about an upcoming project. In other cases, we  
8 see if there's something we can do or we may not feel  
9 that a measure is necessary there but we respond to  
10 all of those.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I would like to have a  
12 breakdown on response time for different you know  
13 requests. I mean, just speaking from my experience,  
14 before you started Commissioner, uhm, you know my  
15 office puts in requests on a lot of traffic calming  
16 measures and calls for street designs and  
17 improvements, street lighting and either we get  
18 responses, sometimes when we get responses and  
19 sometimes - this is before you started Commissioner.  
20 Sometimes we would get responses and there would be  
21 times when we get responses and then no follow  
through. And so, you know, to have the breakdown for  
us would be very, very important.

MARGARET FORGIONE: Chair, oh Chair just one  
other thing I want to mention about responses. There

2 are also factors that have to do with the time of  
3 year and also for different requests, we have  
4 different volumes of course, right? So, for example,  
5 if we're looking at a traffic signal, we're not going  
6 to look at it during summer vacation if it's in the  
7 vicinity of a school. If it's the middle of the  
8 winter and we have holiday traffic patterns, same  
9 thing. We're not going to do things on certain days.  
10 Some things we're pretty quick about; I'll be very  
11 upfront about that, so if you're looking at a parking  
12 regulation change, that is something that we can  
13 usually do within a matter of weeks to get an answer  
14 back.

15 If it's something like a speed hump, we have a  
16 bit of a backlog in doing most studies. It might  
17 take a little bit longer. So, we do have timeframes  
18 for all of the different types of service requests  
19 and we're happy to follow up with you and get you  
20 more information on that.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And the requests that office  
has made in the past has been throughout the year.  
It's not even the times - whether it was a holiday or  
not. I mean this was just relevant throughout the  
year and I've spoken to the Commissioner about that.

2 So, I'm happy to proceed now to just talking  
3 about the Streets Plan 2026. Looking ahead, what  
4 does DOT have in store in terms of Streets Plan  
5 projects? Do you have 30 miles of protected bike  
6 lanes - bus lanes miles planned out, 50 miles of  
7 protected bike lanes, intersections selected for  
8 redesign, transit signal priority or accessible  
9 pedestrian signals?

10 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you Chair. So, we're  
11 definitely in the midst of developing all those  
12 details uhm but we do have you know some really  
13 exciting and large scale projects planned. Things  
14 like Flatbush bus lanes Northern section, Fordham  
15 Road bus lanes, Linden Boulevard in Brooklyn,  
16 Lexington Ave in Manhattan. These are all bus  
17 projects. Madison Ave 116th Street, Bay Parkway, and  
18 Victory Boulevard. Those are a few. Bike projects  
19 include of course McGuinness Boulevard and 31st  
20 Street, Ashland Place, which we announced. Uh, the  
21 Midwood Neighborhood expansion, Flatbush and East  
Flatbush, 3rd Avenue in Manhattan, 31st Ave, 51st  
Street in Astoria, bike boulevards in Jamaica, and a  
network in North Brooklyn.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I was in Buenos Aires very  
3 recently and I saw the BRT system there with buses  
4 running in the center lane and cars on the outside.  
5 It was a beautiful system. Is that something the  
6 Admin is taking a look at, a true BRT bus lane in our  
7 city?

8 MIKE FLYNN: Well, I can say the Mayor has  
9 definitely challenged us to uh aim higher and be  
10 bolder and clearly fast buses are our top priority or  
11 one of our top priorities. We're going to have a lot  
12 more to share. We definitely are developing some big  
13 ideas and yeah, we're really excited to share them.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Well, we certainly love the  
15 central lane BRT system that I saw in Buenos Aires  
16 and my hope is that the Administration is thinking as  
17 big as that. Uhm, buses there run very, very  
18 quickly. In the center lanes, transit is very, very  
19 fast and on the outside, cars and commercial vehicles  
20 are able to do dropoffs. It's a beautiful system to  
21 see and I would like to see the Administration come  
up with a plan on that.

The next five year plan is due at the end of this  
year and it has to include a completed bicycle  
network, protected bus lanes on all bus routes where

2 they can be installed, bus stop upgrades at all bus  
3 stops where the upgrades are feasible. Continued  
4 installation of accessible pedestrian signals and the  
5 installation of pedestrian ramps.

6 Has the Department internally developed a roadmap  
7 to achieve these goals? I think you said you were  
8 working on that.

9 MIKE FLYNN: We're working on it. More to come.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And by when should we get  
11 this new streets plan?

12 MIKE FLYNN: We're uh we're still figuring out  
13 the exact timing.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Alright, as soon as you get  
15 that information, please get that to us and I would  
16 imagine the answer is yes to this. Do you require  
17 additional funding, personnel or something else to  
18 fulfill that plan? And I think you said earlier that  
19 you do not have the dollar amount yet, a specific  
20 headcount and I would like to reiterate that by  
21 preliminary hearing, budget hearing, it is super  
important that we get that information because we  
want to know exactly what you need to fulfill the  
Streets Plan.

2 I'm now going to turn it over to my colleagues  
3 for some questions, then I have a second round of  
4 questions afterwards. And I first have Council  
5 Member Pierina Sanchez for questions.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Majority  
7 Leader, actually I'll take another few minutes. I  
8 had a very bad fire in the district, so I'm a little  
9 distracted.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'm so sorry about that  
11 Council Member. Council Member Marte. Council  
12 Member Epstein.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Morning Chair. Thank  
14 you Commissioner for being here. Uhm, so we've got -  
15 you know we've been trying to get bike corrals in our  
16 neighborhood. We have a lot of bike messengers who  
17 are coming to the neighborhood, doing a lot of  
18 deliveries and the timeline that it takes to get  
19 those corrals up and running. I know Council Member  
20 Brewer talks about like creating an infrastructure  
21 for bikes. I'm wondering why it takes so long to get  
those corrals designed and put on the street for all  
the bike messengers?

PAUL OCHOA: Thank you Council Member. There are  
two types of - I think the secure bike parking is

2 what Council Member Brewer was talking about and we  
3 actually put out an RFP about two years ago that we  
4 were evaluating the Mayor in his preliminary budget  
5 finally funded us to carry out that program. But if  
6 you're talking about individual bike racks-

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: No, i'm talking about  
8 corrals on the street where you took a quarter of a  
9 block. We did a walk through a year ago trying to  
10 get those put up. We got one put up on 11th Street  
11 and 1st Avenue. There are probably 500 bikes in the  
12 one corral. We got to spread that out and we just  
13 really need these to get in the neighborhood because  
14 we have a lot of people who are delivery workers who  
15 need a place to put their bikes.

16 PAUL OCHOA: Yeah, I think that's a fair comment  
17 and something we could look to do better at. We have  
18 increased pretty dramatically the amount of bike  
19 racks and bike corrals we put out on the street.  
20 There's a lot of demand and we want to make sure  
21 we're doing it all over the city but we hear you too  
and we'll see.

COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Yeah if there's a way -  
if we're asking for - the community board was asking  
for it and then a year and a half goes by and we just

2 hear neighborhood complaints. It doesn't help you or  
3 us sit on this because like we have egg on our face.  
4 So, I appreciate it if there's a way to kind of speed  
5 that up but what we need, as the Chair said, if there  
6 are additional resources to move this up quicker,  
7 that would be really great to know.

8 MIKE FLYNN: And I would just add, you know we're  
9 all for supporting that. It's you know if we can  
10 allow 40 people to park their bike or however 10  
11 right versus one car, that's actually a more  
12 efficient use of public space.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: I agree with you. I  
14 want to turn our attention to the sidewalk sheds.  
15 So, a lot of these restaurants have a liquor license  
16 permits with the State Liquor Authority, which have  
17 hours of operation and sometimes, the DOT will  
18 directly contradict whether they sign a stipulation  
19 to their liquor license. How do we have licenses in  
20 the city that are a direct contradiction of the State  
21 Liquor License?

MARGARET FORGIONE: Yeah, if you know of any  
actual examples, I would love to get those because  
the hours of operation that we have for dining out

2 should not contradict what the State Liquor Authority  
3 has issued.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: I have hundreds of those  
5 in my neighborhood. So, I have where the SOA  
6 attached to the permit says, let's say outdoor dining  
7 has to close at 10 o'clock because of the  
8 stipulations that they have attached to their liquor  
9 license but then, on the city's side, we'll let them  
10 stay open until midnight, even though they might have  
11 a stipulation that says 10 o'clock. So, what we're  
12 doing is an indirect contradiction to their State  
13 Liquor Authority License.

14 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, I see what you're  
15 saying. So, if there are locations that continue to  
16 serve say past the 10:00 p.m., obviously they're not  
17 supposed to. If there's more coordination with State  
18 Liquor, we can talk to them about that because they  
19 can still serve food of course.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Yeah, so I have hundreds  
21 of those locations that serve past the time and I've  
done walk-throughs with the State Liquor Authority at  
midnight that show kind of that activity. State  
Liquor Authority only has you know 28 inspectors who

2 need to hire the state and really could rely on DOT  
3 to be a partner in that.

4 So, I'd appreciate that - better coordination  
5 between the SOA and the DOT.

6 MARGARET FORGIONE: And if there are ways we can  
7 reinforce that with the participants in our dining  
8 out program, we're happy to do that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Yeah, that would be  
10 great. We've heard some people about building  
11 entrances. There's some rules around five feet from  
12 building entrances but not every building counts as  
13 an egress, where you can have five feet away from the  
14 entrance to do a sidewalk shed. I'm wondering, it  
15 seems a little random. Some buildings get the five  
16 foot protection and some buildings don't. I'm  
17 wondering if we can have a uniform policy on that?

18 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, so what you're saying  
19 is that for the sidewalk set ups, in some cases we're  
20 enforcing five feet, in other cases we're not?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Some cases you say five  
feet. The five foot rule applies in some buildings.  
You say the five foot rule doesn't apply. It depends  
on maybe the size of the building sometimes, the

2 egress, the neighborhood. And we're trying to make  
3 sure that there's a uniform process.

4 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, so maybe there is a  
5 discrepancy between a residential versus a  
6 non-residential but we're happy to talk with you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: These are all  
8 residential buildings. So, all throughout my  
9 district and we've heard from different residential  
10 people; I'm making sure of that.

11 And so, I just want to make sure uhm, so when  
12 roadway applications come before you, different than  
13 sidewalk applications. You know we're talking about  
14 expanding this to year round. I wonder what the  
15 roadway applications to year round would have impact  
16 on street milling, how they would have impact on  
17 other cleaning activities and what you're seeing  
18 around those potential conflicts.

19 MARGARET FORGIONE: Right, so those are some  
20 considerations for us to take into account with year  
21 round and we're looking into things such including  
heating, cleaning, whether or not the setups might  
become more apt for storage and things of that  
nature. So, our intention would be if this advances

2 into year around, we need rules to govern a lot of  
3 those things.

4 Also, keep in mind that the setups are now  
5 designed to be very movable. And so, for street  
6 work, we don't do as much milling and resurfacing  
7 during the winter time period but if Con Ed needs to  
8 get there or what have you, they need to be movable.  
9 So, we would still want the structures to be movable  
10 in a year around scenario.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.  
13 Council Member Brewer.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. I love DOT, I  
15 just want to be clear. Uhm, benches, I want to thank  
16 you for benches, which you are installing on Columbus  
17 Avenue, so thank you very much.

18 Regarding Intro. 93, I guess I want to know what  
19 is the current status of the Parking Station program?  
20 You're right, we were talking mostly here about  
21 parking stations and racks.

And then secondly, are you - you did talk about  
expanding it but could you be more specific? And  
then when you talk about the bike lane map. I assume  
you also do racks at the same time, and then I do

2 want to talk about the corrals but if you could just  
3 be a little bit more specific about -

4 MIKE FLYNN: Sure, I could start about the secure  
5 bike parking, the new program. We're really excited  
6 that we received funding in the January budget, and  
7 so, this would be new secure parking that's on top of  
8 the 2,000 plus standard bike racks we do each year  
9 and we're currently in the contracting process  
basically and looking to roll it out later this year,  
the secure bike parking.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so I guess we'll  
11 talk about some of the numbers in our bill and see  
12 how we can work together. That's sort of what you  
said.

13 MIKE FLYNN: Absolutely.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Second, the corrals,  
15 which I know Council Member Epstein mentioned.  
16 Community Board 4 has done a great job with them.  
17 How - this is the issue in my district is that many  
grocery stores, not all have Instacart.

18 I helped them with their Instacart work and then  
19 outside I don't know, 50, 60 deliveristas. Are you  
20 looking to see how these grocery stores could work  
with you on corrals? Because what's happening now is

2 they just have a grocery store and random  
3 deliveristas and they're asking for help. I didn't  
4 know how you are - it's a new start up and obviously  
5 doing very well but it exists all over the place. I  
6 just didn't know how you are addressing the corral  
7 issue in front of some of these stores, grocery  
8 stores.

9 MIKE FLYNN: Yeah, we've definitely observed the  
10 same thing and we have started a program to create  
11 spaces where we're seeing a lot of these deliveries  
12 picking up. So, it's sometimes as part of a grocery  
13 store. Sometimes it's in front of a very busy  
14 restaurant. In some cases, we make sure that they're  
15 intentionally very large to be able to take the  
16 larger cargo bikes too when deliveries are made that  
17 way.

18 So, we do try to scale it to the appropriate  
19 space. But we do agree that that's a good use of  
20 street space in those locations is so that they can  
21 congregate and not block the sidewalk.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so you're saying  
that where you see it as happening, do you have like  
311 calls that you're paying attention to because in  
front of Fairway, it's a wild west.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 86

2 MIKE FLYNN: Yeah and the street too. Fairway  
3 loads on the street and the trucks are double and  
4 triple parked.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Right.

6 MIKE FLYNN: That's a particularly challenging  
7 location but yes, sometimes we hear from the public,  
8 sometimes we hear from the grocery store, however we  
9 get it in, we take a look and see if it's appropriate  
10 to do so.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright, I hope that you  
12 would look at that site in particular.

13 MIKE FLYNN: Okay.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: The other thing is the  
15 part of the bike plan and extending it as the Chair  
16 indicated, the transverse of central park, are they  
17 part of any bike plan for the future?

18 I'm very supportive of having a transverse bike  
19 opportunity. Is that part of your bike plan?  
20 Everybody is concerned and asking about that.

21 MIKE FLYNN: Yeah and we know it's an idea that's  
been raised by Central Park and it's something that  
we're looking at.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so you - how are  
you determining what will be part of this bike plan?

2 Is it input from the community? Is it - how is that  
3 being taken into consideration? How do we get it on  
4 your list?

4 MIKE FLYNN: In the Streets Plan?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes.

6 MIKE FLYNN: Uhm, yeah, I mean it's sort of a  
7 holistic approach. So I think you know those kinds  
8 of ideas, once they're on our radar, you know we look  
9 at it in the context of all the other considerations  
10 right in terms of flushing out the network, trying to  
11 improve the network on routes that have really high  
12 ridership or where there's a safety concern.

12 Also, trying to extend the networking to  
13 neighborhoods that really don't have much coverage  
14 but certainly if there's ideas that we know are a  
15 priority, then we're going to give it a very close  
16 look.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright, so we'll add it  
17 to your list by making it a priority. The other  
18 thing is I know this is heresy in this world but  
19 where you list one, two, three, four, five, about how  
20 to focus on buses and whether they are moving faster.  
21 I know this is a topic that others won't like but  
when you have a bus lane and you get a ticket because

2 you're unloading or loading for five minutes, what is  
3 the rule on that because people are getting tickets.  
4 I know people here hate cars. You know I got but I  
5 do think if you're unloading and loading, you  
6 shouldn't get a ticket.

7 So, what is the law on that in a bus lane? Five  
8 minutes, not even to unload your stuff and you get a  
9 ticket and then Gale Brewer has to fight the ticket.

10 MIKE FLYNN: Sure, so obviously the intent of the  
11 bus lane is to keep the lane clear for the buses.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know.

13 MIKE FLYNN: But we - generally -

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: We can let them suffer,  
15 go ahead.

16 MIKE FLYNN: In most cases a bus lane is a no  
17 standing restriction.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so they can't go to  
19 unload.

20 MIKE FLYNN: Which allows people to quickly get  
21 in or out of cars and quickly you know if a person  
uses an accessibility device you know the camera can  
see that happening and not get a ticket. It's not  
meant for people to load and unload vehicles, which  
takes a longer amount of time and can delay the bus.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 89

2 We do try to create dedicated loading zones on those  
3 streets so that there are legal places and if there's  
4 a place where you're hearing about a lot of tickets,  
5 we'd love to do that so that they can do it  
6 appropriately without blocking a bus.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member. We  
8 could also do a second round of questions later.  
9 Council Member Restler.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Wonderful but firstly  
10 congratulations Commissioner Flynn. It's nice to see  
11 you and I'm looking forward to connecting. I am like  
12 truly thrilled that making our streets safer is one  
13 of Mayor Mamdani's central priorities and I really  
14 hope that we can make District 33 a model for the  
15 city, where we have a true network of protected bike  
16 lanes, fast moving buses, more pedestrian space, and  
17 safer streets on every single corner.

16 A few questions from me. First, just quick yes,  
17 no just cause I want to make sure everyone hears it.  
18 The Administration supports year round outdoor  
19 dining?

19 MIKE FLYNN: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: For 2026?

21

2 MIKE FLYNN: I think yeah, yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: That's a good answer.  
4 So, let's get that done. We're thrilled to have your  
5 support and partnership and eager to bring this back  
6 as quickly as possible and looking forward to more  
7 testimony here today.

8 I'll shift gears to the Streets Plan. We'll  
9 start with pedestrian space. So, over the past I  
10 guess four years, we've averaged about 400,000 to  
11 500,000 square feet of new pedestrian space per year.  
12 Do you have a breakdown of that space between open  
13 streets, daylighting, new public plazas for how  
14 you're looking at - you can provide that to us?

15 PAUL OCHOA: So, yes we can and just an overall  
16 note is that this number counts space that's  
17 permanently pedestrianized. So, like if it's an open  
18 street, that's two days a week. We don't try to  
19 count it as two sevenths of open space.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Yeah, I don't want you  
21 to undercount my pedestrian space. So, how does DOT  
evaluate when more pedestrian space is needed? Do  
you look at the data on the highest traffic subway  
stations, highest traffic bus stops. There's lots of  
great analysis of where we have the most pedestrian

2 congestion in New York City. What is DOT doing to be  
3 responsive?

4 PAUL OCHOA: Sure and there's a lot of different  
5 types of pedestrian space. So, certainly when we  
6 talk about pedestrian mobility, that's where we're  
7 talking about crowding, making sure that there's  
8 enough clear space on the sidewalk and we do look at  
9 subway stations and you know busy sidewalks all over  
10 the city. We also compare it against the data on how  
11 wide the sidewalk is now, right. If it's busy but it  
12 has a 20-foot sidewalk, they may be less important  
13 than a place that has an 8-foot sidewalk. But public  
14 space is more than just people walking, so we want to  
15 look at the public realm as well and that's where  
16 things like plazas and open streets come into effect.  
17 Some of that is driven by us seeing that there is a  
18 need in a community. A lot of it is also driven by  
19 community members who identify the space and come to  
20 us and we work with them to help develop it into a  
21 more permanent space. So, there's a lot of different  
types of public space and they each have their own  
way that they come into our program.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So, there is a regular  
analysis done of the most congested areas, subway bus

2 stops, an analysis of whether there's adequate  
3 pedestrian space in those areas and DOT is regularly  
4 responding to try to make sure that there is more  
5 space for us all to get around?

6 PAUL OCHOA: Yes. For example, the Commissioner  
7 earlier mentioned the World Cup and trying to make  
8 sure that we have improvements in place by then and  
9 so, for example, this year, there's a big focus on  
10 9th Avenue in Manhattan in that Midtown area where  
11 the sidewalk? There's a lot of street furniture and  
12 other things and we want to make sure that the  
13 increased crowds have places to be able to walk and  
14 enjoy Manhattan.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You have to just forgive  
16 me because you know when I look at the report that  
17 you came out with this morning on updates to the  
18 Streets Plan, there's nothing that quantifies  
19 progress on pedestrian space, unless I'm missing it.

20 PAUL OCHOA: Well, the report covers the legal  
21 milestones. In the first five years, what was  
written into the law was a million square feet in the  
first two years, which I'm glad to say we met and we  
didn't stop then right?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But there has been no  
3 progress or updates that have been provided as a part  
4 of this. There's no longer metrics included since  
2023 on pedestrian space in the Streets Plan.

5 PAUL OCHOA: So, we're happy to provide those  
6 updates. This is reporting on the law and the law is  
7 what it is.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Alright, so let's shift  
9 to what we're reporting on in the Streets Plan. So,  
10 going back over the last four years, we were required  
11 - we, the City of New York, the Department of  
12 Transportation, were required to build 180 miles of  
protected bike lanes. We built 100, 100.5, 55  
percent of our goal.

13 Commissioner, how disappointed are you in our  
14 failure to achieve - I mean to significantly come  
15 short of achieving our goals and how - why should we  
16 be confident moving forward that the Department of  
Transportation is going to start to get it done?

17 MIKE FLYNN: Well, Council Member, I can't speak  
18 to the prior administration, although I mentioned a  
19 few of the reasons why our output didn't meet the  
20 goals in the past. What I can say is we have the  
Mayor's commitment and my commitment to dramatically

2 increase our work and to you know increase our output  
3 both in terms of things like mileage or square  
4 footage but also like I said, in terms of the quality  
5 and the distribution of it and the impact it has on  
6 New Yorkers and you know to look at it really with  
7 that holistic perspective.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And when we look at  
9 protected bus lanes I think over the last -

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Wrap up Council Member.  
11 Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay, I would just say  
13 the record is uninspiring and to me it makes clear  
14 that we need significant new leadership, vision,  
15 resources, from the Department of Transportation to  
16 get on track. The way things have been working is  
17 not good enough and I hope that you are hearing that  
18 clearly from the City Council that we want to see  
19 significant improvement. I've heard it from the  
20 Mayor. We want to start seeing that demonstrated  
21 because we don't want to be coming back to you in six  
or nine or twelve months with failures again on not  
building enough bike lanes, not building enough bus  
lanes, not building the pedestrian space we all need

2 to make our community safer and to make it faster for  
3 all of us to get around.

4 So, I will try to do a round two but Chair uh,  
5 Majority Leader, thank you for your leadership.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Of course and we will have a  
7 round two. Council Member Justin Sanchez.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Good morning, howdy.

9 So, really quickly, one of the - just based on your  
10 previous testimony, one of the concerns that I have  
11 is the focus on transportation issues in Manhattan,  
12 especially around the World Cup. A lot of,  
13 especially in my district, I have a huge football  
14 phonetics in my district and their family members are  
15 going to be coming out. There's going to be massive  
16 traffic. I represent the Hub, which is the most  
17 visited place in New York City, in New York State  
18 after Time Square on a daily basis. I would like it  
19 on the record that I want to completely transform  
20 that into Pedestrian Plaza. It is the most - exactly  
21 what you're talking about in terms of transportation  
hubs. So, please look at my district as we are  
expanding these programs.

One of the other questions that I have on Intro.  
310, I want to specifically talk about the finance

2 part of that bill because and I know there are two  
3 different; there's the State DOT and the City DOT.  
4 However, there are neighborhoods in the Bronx that  
5 have been renamed over one G, Justice for  
6 Throggsneck. It is with two GG's. I want that  
7 officially on the record and all of our signage now  
8 only has one G, because of the cost of an extra G.

9 So, uhm, I'm not even joking and I would like to  
10 understand now based on Intro. 310, now that we're  
11 going to do signage in different languages, what that  
12 cost would be to the Department, to the City because  
13 I would love my street signage in Spanish and in  
14 French, so I would like to see what this looks like  
15 and you know.

16 MIKE FLYNN: Uh, what I can - the Throggsneck is  
17 news to me, so I'm going to look into that but what I  
18 can say is that uhm, you know for the bilingual  
19 signage, we have an incredible amount of street signs  
20 clearly around the city. I think I mentioned earlier  
21 that uhm, we think that the current practice of  
working - with the Council working with us through  
the Street co-naming process, would be a great way to  
achieve this goal. It's more of a community driven  
approach and you know, we're not kind of the arbiters

2 of which you know how to define different kind of  
3 boundaries and things like that. I don't know that  
4 we could give exact you know financial or things like  
5 that but we'd be happy to circle back.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Do we know what the cost  
7 of one sign is? And then maybe we can extrapolate  
8 from there.

9 MARGARET FORGIONE: We do know the cost of one  
10 sign and it's less the manufacturing of one sign.  
11 Rather it's the staffing and as the Commissioner  
12 started to talk about, arbitrating, is this truly a  
13 Greek area? What is the history of this French  
14 speaking area? Like, those are sort of the tricky  
15 things and we know in New York, we're obviously  
16 multilingual. We're totally diverse, some of that  
17 stuff will be kind of hard to get at, so really I  
18 think it's more about staffing to try to work through  
19 those issues and as a result, we do prefer the Local  
20 Law renaming process for this.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Is there a concern that  
a bill like this, not just in Chinatown but if this  
was any kind of - would set a bad precedent around  
the city for you know all Council Members and all  
electeds now trying to -

2 MARGARET FORGIONE: This is more of a far  
3 reaching application, yes.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you and then you  
5 know just want to underscore uhm, please look at  
6 District 17 when you're expanding your streets. Uhm,  
7 you know a lot of the times, no offense to my  
8 colleagues in Brooklyn but Brooklyn and Manhattan get  
9 a lot of the open streets, pedestrian plazas and the  
10 Bronx gets left behind and I would really like to see  
11 a true investment in pedestrian plazas and other  
12 walking places. Sorry to my friends in Riverdale who  
13 love their cars but you know we like our trains and  
14 our buses so we would like to see an expansion of  
15 14th Street into just a bus way would be - uh, the  
16 3rd Ave into a bus way would be amazing. Thank you.

17 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you Council Member.  
18 Definitely noted.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We have also - we'd also like  
20 to recognize we've been joined by Council Member  
21 Hanif and I'm now going to turn it over to Council  
Member Pierina Sanchez.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Majority  
Leader and good morning everyone. Thank you for your  
testimony so far. I feel like this question has been

2 asked but I haven't heard any numbers attached to it.  
3 So, I'm going to go ahead and ask it again. With  
4 respect to the, you know, breath of fresh air, you  
5 know recommitment from Mayor Mamdani and this DOT,  
6 this iteration of DOT with your - under your  
7 leadership Commissioner Flynn. Sorry about my  
8 tongue, a kid smacked into me. You know what that's  
9 like. Uhm, under your leadership, I'm hearing a  
10 fresh commitment, a recommitment to the Streets  
11 Master Plan but just talking in terms of numbers, the  
12 original estimate when Local Law 195 passed in 2019,  
13 the Council then estimated that we would require \$1.7  
14 billion in funding over ten years and additional  
15 funds have been added.

16 I'm curious if we have today, what has been the  
17 capital commitment rate of that - if that funding was  
18 reflected in previous budgets, what has been the  
19 capital commitment rate and what is the shortfall, if  
20 there is a shortfall in the new plan? And then I  
21 have some locally related questions on the plan.

ERIC BEATON: So, as you mentioned, some aspects  
of the Streets Plan are met with capital funding.  
Our capital commitment rate as an agency hovers  
around 90 to 95 percent on any given year. I can

2 provide a breakdown of what capital projects  
3 accounted for a Streets Plan. I could think of  
4 plazas that counted towards the Streets Plan. Also,  
5 protected bike lanes and capital dollars like Queens  
6 Boulevard should have counted towards the Streets  
7 Plan. So, I'm happy to provide a breakdown but I  
8 would say in terms of capital commitment as an  
9 agency, we were around 90 to 95 percent on a given  
10 year.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: It sounds like you're  
12 spending what you're allocated but we know that we're  
13 way behind on uhm, you know bus lanes and the other  
14 items that have been raised today. Do we have a  
15 number on what that shortfall is in the budget?

16 MIKE FLYNN: So, like you said, I just want to  
17 clarify one thing. You're asking Council Member  
18 about capital funding specifically?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Capital funding first is  
20 fine.

21 MIKE FLYNN: Okay, so I would just mention that  
uhm, I think the majority, probably the vast majority  
of our mileage and in terms of meeting the target or  
working towards the targets is actually our in-house  
projects. So, they're not through the capital

2 funding. It's the things that we do with our expense  
3 funding so I mean that's just to provide some context  
4 on that but you mentioned the capital funding side of  
5 it and yeah, I guess you're asking - are you also  
6 asking about the operations, the expense side?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Yeah just trying to I  
8 guess understand uhm, how much money we need. You  
9 know we could continue this in Prelim but how much  
10 money we need to meet the ambitious goals of the  
11 plan.

12 MIKE FLYNN: So, uhm, understood. Like I  
13 mentioned earlier, we know we're kind of in the thick  
14 of or we're getting into the budget process. We  
15 don't have specific numbers yet.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay thank you and then  
17 my second - the second part of my question is you  
18 know looking at Fordham Road and the Fordham Road bus  
19 way as an example of this Administration  
20 recommitting. I have said in public and in private  
21 that I don't think that the community and stakeholder  
engagement for the Fordham Road bus way or bus lane  
improvement was done the right way last time. You  
know for instance, by the time that folks were  
speaking to me about the project, you know there had

2 been major institutions and stakeholders who would  
3 come out in opposition of any bus lane changes.

4 And then you know I - when the Mayor announced  
5 the recommitment of the Fordham bus lane project a  
6 couple weeks ago, my conversations were disconnected  
7 from what you testified today and what I saw in the  
8 Press where my conversations I understood you all to  
9 be restarting community engagement to make sure that  
10 we're speaking to all stakeholders, not just the  
11 powerful institutions in that part of the Bronx but  
12 today I hear you testifying that you're just  
13 finalizing designs but there has been no  
14 conversations.

15 So, the question is how are you going to do  
16 community and stakeholder engagement differently to  
17 lead to success in these projects because I certainly  
18 want to be a partner in the success of that. Part  
19 one and part two is on December 19th of 2025  
20 unrelated, the DOT released the Harlem River Greenway  
21 Implementation Plan and what is the commitment of  
this new Administration to see that Implementation  
Plan forward? Thank you.

MIKE FLYNN: Thank you Council Member. So, in  
community engagement, I want to mention that this is

2 a really important topic to me. I think the work we  
3 do is tangible right? It's our front yard. It's our  
4 public space and therefore people have very strong  
5 feelings about it rightly and so, it's so essential  
6 to do it as best as we can and really be effective  
7 and I'm all ears. We're all ears, always looking to  
8 do better. This is something that will be a priority  
9 for me.

10 So, and then on Harlem River Greenway, that's  
11 certainly a very high priority project for us. We're  
12 excited that we'll be continuing the first phases of  
13 it as we go down south down Bailey Avenue this year  
14 and we're looking at the future phases as well.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. I'm sorry,  
16 Majority Leader if I can, when can we expect a  
17 reconvening of stakeholders on Fordham?

18 MIKE FLYNN: So, yeah, we're kind of getting our  
19 ducks in a row and we'll be doing that basically  
20 starting later this month for the next few months.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you  
Commissioner. Thank you Majority Leader.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Council Member Wong.

COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Thank you Chair. I just  
have a few questions to the Commissioner or to the

2 panel, whoever could answer me. First, solar panel  
3 traffic controlled devices at crosswalks, Intro. 13.  
4 Now, I was involved before I got elected, the solar  
5 power parking meters, where you put money in and then  
6 you have a ticket. You know and those solar panels  
7 are supposed to be like BONO and you know and it  
8 turns out that they don't work on cloudy days like  
9 today, right? So, I just want to hear from you that  
10 the solar power devices really should have a reliable  
11 power source and don't just rely on solar panels  
12 because like those parking machines, and where I have  
13 to call 11 all the time, quite often the solar panels  
14 were not maintained or they weren't working and then  
15 leading to a lot of inconveniences. So, this is my  
16 comment to you that the traffic controlled devices,  
17 the solar power, they really have to have like AC  
18 power backing them otherwise you know they need to be  
19 working 24/7. They are traffic devices. We cannot  
20 afford any down time. So, that's one.

17 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you for that feedback, Council  
18 Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, yes. Next, I've seen  
20 bike racks in my district or as well as parts of the  
21 city. Quite often, yes private bikes occupied them,

2 that's fine but they're also occupied by delivery,  
3 food delivery trucks, like you know those would make  
4 thermal packs you know tied to their backs and quite  
5 often they are left there like days at a time. I  
6 don't see a system where DOT handles abandoned bikes.  
7 The bikes there were clearly left there months at a  
8 time with missing parts. You know just a frame or  
9 just the wheel. So, DOT needs to have a system to  
10 clear out those bikes that were clearly abandoned.  
11 Can you talk - is there such a program? Please talk  
12 about it.

13 MARGARET FORGIONE: Yes, thank you Council  
14 Member. I agree, it's valuable space and we don't  
15 want people occupying bike racks with derelict bikes  
16 for weeks or months on end. We do have a program, we  
17 work very carefully with the Department of Sanitation  
18 and it's defined by law as to what constitutes a  
19 derelict bike. It's a certain number of pieces  
20 basically that are broken, missing, that sort of  
21 thing.

22 So, if you have any locations for us, we're happy  
23 to follow up and report back to you exactly on what  
24 we found and what we can do there.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: The conditions vary, like  
3 sometimes just a frame or sometimes just the wheel  
4 but you have to get rid of it. You can't just leave  
5 it there.

6 MARGARET FORGIONE: Correct.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Yeah, okay uhm also, are  
8 these racks like reserved for pedestrian bikes or  
9 what is people start using them for like Uber Eats or  
10 Grubhub you know and they start changing it. What's  
11 DOTs policy on that?

12 MIKE FLYNN: Yup, so they're public bike racks,  
13 so basically anybody is free to lock their bikes  
14 there.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: With no time limit right?

16 MIKE FLYNN: As long as it -yeah if it doesn't  
17 become derelict the way it's defined in the law.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Yeah, but they can leave  
19 them there days right? As long as the bike is in  
20 good condition, they can -

21 PAUL OCHOA: Yeah, so what we do when we see  
abandoned bikes that are in good condition is we go  
and tag the bike and put a tag on it that says if  
this bike has been here more than seven days, we will  
remove it and then we go back a week later and if the

2 tag is still there and hasn't moved, we can remove  
3 the bike and we work with the Police Department to  
4 store it for the person to pick up.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay yeah.

6 PAUL OCHOA: So, if you give us locations we're  
7 happy to go take a look.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Sure and just my  
9 observation because uh like there are places where  
10 rent bikes like right at the entrances of Central  
11 Park, if you put the bike racks there, you know they  
12 take up all the spaces and then that is an issue that  
13 you need to address.

14 Okay, my next question is to Intro. 202. Uh, it  
15 requires DOT to complete installation of any  
16 necessary traffic calming device or traffic control  
17 device on any street adjacent to a school. Uhm, I  
18 used to serve in a school board right and we asked  
19 for devices and it takes months, just to get a reply  
20 from DOT. Okay, we would do a survey at the  
21 intersection and the survey can last for like six -  
any time, six months to a year before DOT gives us a  
determination. Okay, we have concluded. We need a  
stop there or we need a traffic light there. You  
know so, okay, I see that you need 60 days but it

2 takes a long time for DOT to do traffic studies and I  
3 don't see a deadline on that because I know that  
4 traffic studies can take a very long time. Can you  
5 talk about like how long do these traffic studies  
6 last and do you have a time limit on that?

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.

8 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you. So, we're always looking  
9 for ways to be more communicative and more  
10 responsive, so we're certainly open to that kind of  
11 feedback. I think First Deputy Commissioner Forgione  
12 earlier mentioned some of the different kinds of uhm,  
13 the different ways that we may, you know weather  
14 could be a factor or time of year or that kind of  
15 thing, whether school is in session. I think for  
16 context, I'll just say last year, we got over 3,000  
17 requests for speed humps, speed reducers or speed  
18 cushions and we got also over 3,000 requests for  
19 other kinds of traffic controlled devices like  
20 traffic signals and stop signs. We certainly do our  
21 best to uh you know work through them as quickly as  
we can and be communicative in the process as well,  
just to help set expectations about the timeline.

COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you. Can I get  
one more question or no?

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: There will be a second round  
3 if you would like to stick around.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Thank you, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: That would be great. Council  
6 Member Dinowitz followed by Hanif.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you Chair. I  
8 feel it was the most un-Bronx like thing to insult  
9 and then leave but I do, I do, we love our cars, not  
10 because we have an emotional attachment to them and  
11 whether it's Riverdale, Kingsbridge, Woodlawn,  
12 Wakefield, Inwood, Norwood, sorry Bedford Park or  
13 Vancullen Village but because that's the way so many  
14 of us in the other boroughs travel.

15 That's how we get to and from work and from my  
16 house to one of the schools in my district is an hour  
17 and a half by public transit and 20 minutes by car.  
18 That's the story for so many people in my district.  
19 So, the cars and the parking is really of importance  
20 to so many people that live in the outer boroughs and  
21 it feels often times that people making the decisions  
make them from like this place, where you have the  
four train, the one, the two, the three, the A, the  
C, the R, the W and where I live, we don't have that  
same access. So, uhm, what efforts, if any, is the

2 DOT making to increase the number of parking spots  
3 available in parts of the city that aren't near  
4 public transit?

5 MARGARET FORGIONE: Hi Council Member, happy to  
6 take a shot at that. So, pretty much over the years,  
7 I have to tell you, I feel like there's no stone that  
8 has not been unturned, so we don't have shy  
9 communities in New York. Sometimes people see an  
10 area of no standing any time or they see a street  
11 that is wide. They ask why can't there be angled  
12 parking? Why can't we restore parking to those  
13 curbsides? We have looked at so many of them. We're  
14 happy to look at more if there are other  
15 neighborhoods where we currently prohibit parking and  
16 we can consider that for more parking. But  
17 realistically it's going to be hard to find large  
18 quantities of more parking in New York City.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I do by the way want to thank  
20 you because you were installing city bikes in part of  
21 my district, which I support. We worked with the DOT  
and were able to move some of them on the sidewalk,  
demonstrating that we can have our city bikes and our  
parking at the same time, which is what we want.

2 But is the answer then that you are relying on  
3 the local community to identify the spots where we  
4 can add parking?

5 MARGARET FORGIONE: No, I wouldn't say that.  
6 Sometimes when we are doing street redesigns and  
7 there could be a loss of some parking, we often look  
8 at the whole neighborhood. We scour the whole  
9 neighborhood to see if there are any older parking  
10 regulations that are no longer needed. We will  
11 proactively look at neighborhoods to see if we can  
12 find more parking.

13 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And do you look at properties  
14 to determine whether any of those properties could be  
15 purchased or utilized for public parking, when that  
16 parking is removed for whether it's city bike,  
17 whether it's a new building going off the designated  
18 required parking, whether it's a new busway, whether  
19 it's a pedestrian plaza, all of these things that we  
20 love individually coming together takes away so much  
21 of what we need to get to school, get to work, get to  
our friends house. Do you look at properties like  
that?

MARGARET FORGIONE: We have not looked at private  
properties, no.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Okay, I want to move on to my  
3 second question, which is about stop signs. We love  
4 stop signs too. They slow down traffic and I've  
5 looked at some traffic studies. It seems so hard to  
6 get stop signs so much of the time and we know that  
7 we don't even know how long these traffic studies  
8 take, that we don't have that data available to us  
9 today.

10 Uhm, but I'm looking at a traffic study and it  
11 says from this time to this time, how many vehicles  
12 there were. Uhm, vehicles per hour, major, minor,  
13 total pedestrians observed. School children  
14 observed. Does the DOT measure velocity when  
15 determining whether or not to install an all way stop  
16 sign?

17 PAUL OCHOA: So, we - for stop signs, we rely on  
18 guidance from the manual on Uniformed Traffic  
19 Controlled Devices, which is a federal set of  
20 guidelines.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I have it in front of me, so  
that's great.

PAUL OCHOA: We generally - we look at crashes.  
We don't necessarily look at speed. If we see a

2 speeding problem, we do use other tools like speed  
3 reducers and cameras and other tools.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: But if you're not measuring  
5 it, how do you see it? Like it's not reported in  
6 your traffic studies and I would add that - unless  
7 I'm reading the wrong document, it says if the 85th  
8 percentile approached speed of the traffic exceeds 40  
9 miles an hour, like there's language in there about  
10 velocity. So, am I reading something different?  
11 Please tell me if I'm reading it wrong.

12 PAUL OCHOA: No, so that's right. It's focused  
13 on whether the pedestrian has time to cross or not.  
14 So, we do measure speed. Sorry, I said that wrong  
15 but if the problem is a speeding problem, the stop  
16 sign isn't our solution.

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: But why not?

18 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Because stop signs where they  
19 don't meet those requirements are not always helpful.  
20 You know people don't always stop at stop signs if  
21 they're not put in the right places. So, we're very  
careful about trying to create situations where  
people stop, right places and then we have other  
tools that control speed and we want to do those  
where speeding is the problem.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Okay, my time is about to  
3 expire and I want to come back to this because it  
4 seems that you're not reporting on the velocity but  
5 you're measuring it but it's not used. The car speed  
6 isn't measured but you're measuring pedestrian speed.  
7 There's a lot of things that don't add up. I don't  
8 want to take more time but I do want to say for the  
9 record, Commissioner, it's a pleasure to make your  
10 acquaintance and you have two of the smartest people  
11 to your left and to your right supporting you in your  
12 work and I look forward to a collaborative -

13 Well, two and two is four. What did I say wrong?

14 PAUL OCHOA: I'm a constituent man.

15 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Two and two. You have four  
16 people, if we're adding, four people on either side  
17 of you who are supporting you in your work.

18 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you Council Member. I  
19 couldn't agree more. Thank you Council Member.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: That's a lot of smart  
21 individuals in this room.

I'm going to turn it over to Council Member Hanif  
for questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much Chair  
and good afternoon Commissioner Flynn and the DOT

2 team, everybody who is here. So, I want to get to my  
3 piece of legislation, Preconsidered Bill 1335.

4 In 2024, you also passed the benchmark in Local  
5 Law of redesigning 400 intersections and gave us  
6 2,688 redesigned intersections. However during the  
7 first half of 2024, of the incidents in which  
8 pedestrians were killed at an intersection, 92  
9 percent of those intersections had no daylighting  
10 measures at all and 100 percent of those  
11 intersections lacked physical daylighting to stop  
12 drivers from parking all the way to the crosswalk.  
13 Can you share how you measure or count a redesigned  
14 intersection and what has to occur at an intersection  
15 or for an intersection to be considered redesigned?

16 PAUL OCHOA: Sure, so when we count those, we  
17 count a number of different things, some of which can  
18 be hardened daylighting. Some of which can be things  
19 like leading pedestrian intervals, that's the signal  
20 timing change, where pedestrians are able to  
21 establish themselves in a crosswalk before traffic is  
allowed to move. It can be - it can be any number of  
different treatments and we put them altogether to  
get that intersection number.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 116

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Got it, so daylighting is  
3 considered redesign.

4 PAUL OCHOA: Yes, with daylighted intersection,  
5 it would go into that number.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And then you mentioned  
7 some - can you name some of the other uh measures?

8 PAUL OCHOA: Sure, so it can be a leading  
9 pedestrian interval. It can be a raised crosswalk.  
10 It could be a neckdown, like you talk about in your  
11 bill. So, it's really anything that makes the  
12 crossing shorter for pedestrians or more protected in  
13 some way.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And is there a list of all  
15 of these measures that count as a redesign that we  
16 can get?

17 PAUL OCHOA: Yeah, we can send you that.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And then could you  
19 describe how you currently prioritize which  
20 intersections DOT redesigns every year?

21 PAUL OCHOA: Sure, so as the Commissioner said  
earlier, we look at a tremendous amount of data. You  
know particular crash data but other types as well  
and we always want to address the most dangerous  
locations first but it isn't like we just number them

2 from 1 to 44,000 and work our way through. If we're  
3 doing for example, a bus corridor project, we don't  
4 want to say this is a bus project and so, we're not  
5 going to improve safety as well. So, while we're  
6 doing that project, we'll make sure that we're  
7 upgrading safety along the whole route.

8 So, the projects can come in from a number of  
9 different directions. You know, sometimes someone  
10 points out a dangerous condition where the crash  
11 number might be low because people are afraid to  
12 cross the street in the first place.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: So essentially these are  
14 coming from New Yorkers, elected officials, how are  
15 you all then deciding what the priorities are for  
16 that year?

17 MIKE FLYNN: It could be from data analysis, from  
18 crash data. I would also want to make a plug for our  
19 Vision Zero Borough Pedestrian Safety Action Plan.  
20 So, that's been really one of the key inputs in terms  
21 of how we prioritize our work and hone in on you know  
either the intersections corridors or neighborhoods  
where we really see the biggest challenge.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And then could you  
describe the different daylighting measures available

2 to make an intersection safer? Could you describe  
3 how curb extensions work as a tool to protect  
4 pedestrians at dangerous intersections?

5 MIKE FLYNN: I could start. Uhm, so definitely  
6 daylighting is sort of a term right? It can  
7 encompass anything that tries to keep that corner  
8 area clear so pedestrians can see drivers and vice  
9 versa.

10 What we have found is that the effective way to  
11 do it is by hardening it right? By having physical  
12 objects or raising it up like a built out sidewalk or  
13 uhm, you know it could be different things, planters,  
14 even city bike docks or anything really that makes it  
15 physically impossible for a driver to make that turn  
16 faster, which is what could otherwise happen if you  
17 pull it back.

18 So, it could be a wide range of things.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Got it and then after  
20 redesigning close to 3,000 intersections, the  
21 deadliest intersections for pedestrians still do not  
receive daylighting. Could you describe how you  
integrate crash data into your process for  
prioritizing certain intersections? And then could

2 you describe how you treat intersections that are  
3 dangerous for pedestrians at the moment?

4 PAUL OCHOA: Sure and I sort of want to look at  
5 the intersections that are not being treated but at  
6 the most dangerous places, daylighting is helpful but  
7 not enough, right? Where things are really  
8 dangerous, daylighting can help but we need to do  
9 more than that to make sure pedestrians are being  
10 protected, so we need to make sure cars are going at  
11 appropriate speeds when on the street or turning.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And how much of that is uh  
13 DOT working on or is that available to us?

14 PAUL OCHOA: All the time. Like, every year we  
15 look at the most dangerous intersections. As the  
16 Commissioner said, looking at the Vision Zero Borough  
17 Action Plans and we make sure that we really are  
18 addressing them and in very substantial ways.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.  
20 There will be a second round of questions. I'm going  
21 to start - kickoff that second round.

So, Sammy's Law allows New York City to lower its  
speed limit to 20 miles per hour with posted signage  
except on roads with three or more motor vehicle

2 travel lanes in the same direction outside of  
3 Manhattan.

4 With traffic calming, speed limits can be reduced  
5 to 10 miles per hour on select roads. For all speed  
6 limit reductions, New York City must provide notice  
7 60 days in advance and comment opportunity to the  
8 Local Community Board. How has DOT implemented  
9 Sammy's Law within the city?

10 MIKE FLYNN: I'll say uh, you know we're fully  
11 committed to implementing Sammy's law and we've begun  
12 implementing it in target areas. We're currently  
13 actively evaluating how to most effectively scale it  
14 up but you know we certainly value having that as  
15 another really important tool because we know speed  
16 is such a critical factor in a lot of the crashes and  
17 fatalities we see.

18 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'd like to you know state  
19 for the record that under the past Administration, my  
20 office has sent in requests for certain areas that  
21 constituents have raised as places that would be -  
you know my constituents view would be appropriate  
for Sammy's Law to be implemented. I would  
appreciate a follow up on that.

2 Are there any current plans for the expansion of  
3 this policy within the city? If so, where?

4 MIKE FLYNN: Uhm, so I think what's important is  
5 we in general almost always it's most effective to  
6 pair a reduced speed limit with physical changes to  
7 the street and this kind of gets to the earlier  
8 discussion around stop signs too.

9 Uhm, we want to design a street that what we  
10 would call legible, right? Where it's like, if  
11 you're a driver, it's almost compelling you to go  
12 slower. And so, there's all different tools you can  
13 do for that. So, we try to pair our lower our lower  
14 speed limit.

15 With physical changes, I think schools to us are  
16 the most obvious and probably the low hanging fruit  
17 in terms of where we can begin and focus on having  
18 this more neighborhood wide or area wide approach to  
19 lower speed limits.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You know I guess you know  
21 advocates but also folks in my office and folks in  
our community, they would like to have a you know the  
common schools are we talking about? Like something  
more specific on how Sammy's Law will be implemented  
versus just saying this something we'll have to do

2 better on. You know I think that we have to do a lot  
3 more when it comes to this.

4 So, I would really appreciate specifics if you  
5 have that right now.

6 MIKE FLYNN: We definitely understand that this  
7 is really important and like I mentioned, we're  
8 committed to it. So, I don't have specific numbers  
9 or locations but we're very much you know - we would  
10 love to get those recommendations and help us kind of  
11 think through that.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Do you have a timeline by  
13 which you would like to tell us the plan on where  
14 Sammy's Law will be implemented by?

15 MIKE FLYNN: Not that I can share today.

16 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Okay, we would continue to  
17 apply pressure to have that.

18 Recently, the city lowered the bike speed limit  
19 in Central Park to 15 miles per hour. In light of  
20 this, a lawsuit began fighting this order. In  
21 February, a State Supreme Court Judge temporarily  
blocked the city from implementing this reduction.  
What is the current status of this policy and what  
was the reason for reducing the bike speed limit to  
15 miles per hour? And also, the use of Sammy's Law

2 within Central Park but not using Sammy's Law in  
3 other places.

4 MIKE FLYNN: I can't comment on pending  
5 litigation.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Daylighting is becoming  
7 increasingly popular throughout the nation as a tool  
8 for increasing visibility and safety at  
9 intersections. In particular, New York City has been  
10 a leader - according to the Department of  
11 Transportation on hardened daylighting, which  
12 involves the installation of a physical barrier, such  
13 as post or granite blocks to prevent vehicles from  
14 parking next to intersections.

15 I am supportive of daylighting. I believe a vast  
16 majority of Council Members in the fall were  
17 supportive of daylighting. And in light of a recent  
18 DOT report analyzing daylighting, I am skeptical  
19 about the previous Administration's report, analyzing  
20 the impacts of unhardened daylighting.

21 I believe the past Administration said that  
unhardened daylighting is more dangerous at  
intersections compared to hardened daylighting. I  
would appreciate the Administration's position - the  
new Administration's position on daylighting both

2 hardened and unhardened. Do you find it to be safer  
3 or less safer?

4 MIKE FLYNN: Well, I'll start by saying that one  
5 death is one too many and there's certainly more work  
6 to do and we work tirelessly - our planners and  
7 engineers every day to bring traffic crashes down and  
8 we're proud that last year was tied for the lowest  
9 traffic fatalities on record.

10 We really try to work proactively as I think  
11 Mayor Mamdani himself has said. We want to try to  
12 prevent these crashes even before they happen, rather  
13 than just responding to them and that's really the  
14 approach we take and we use every tool available to  
15 make our streets and intersections safer.

16 Daylighting is definitely one important tool but  
17 as a few of us have mentioned earlier. We always  
18 take a holistic approach and we really look at the  
19 unique conditions and context of each location and  
20 you know we do believe that when daylighting is done  
21 right, it can keep corners clear. It helps with  
visibility. It can also slow turning vehicles and  
that's really important. Last year, we installed  
hardened daylighting at 444 locations, which improve  
visibility where crashes are most likely to occur and

2 we definitely intend to build on that progress as  
3 part of this holistic street safety strategy. We  
4 look forward and I look forward to working with the  
5 Council and other partners on how we can continue to  
6 expand these efforts quickly and effectively.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Does the Administration  
8 support the research that the previous Administration  
9 did on daylighting? Are there any concerns with the  
10 data and the methods used?

11 MIKE FLYNN: Well, my understanding - I wasn't  
12 involved in the research. My understanding is that  
13 the Council had looked at our study and hadn't found  
14 issues with it. Uhm, based on what I've seen, I  
15 believe strongly that -

16 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'm sorry, did you say you  
17 hadn't found issues with it?

18 MIKE FLYNN: Had not.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We raise skepticism.

20 PAUL OCHOA: The Council had raised skepticism  
21 and did analysis that in my understanding has also  
22 found that unhardened daylighting did not improve  
23 safety.

24 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: So, my understanding is that,  
25 the previous Administration suggests that unhardened

2 daylighting is more dangerous than no daylighting at  
3 all. Is that correct?

4 PAUL OCHOA: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Is that - you said yes, so is  
6 that your position?

7 PAUL OCHOA: Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And that is still your  
9 position?

10 PAUL OCHOA: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: So for the record, the  
12 Administration believes that unhardened daylighting  
13 is more dangerous than no daylighting at all?

14 I think there's a lot of skepticism in this room  
15 about that.

16 PAUL OCHOA: Yeah and you know I guess uhm, just  
17 taking a step back, if you create a wider corner  
18 radius, it basically lets drivers turn faster and  
19 that's I think where you know where the concern comes  
20 from and that's what we saw in the data.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'll let the advocates come  
after you guys on that one. So, I will ask questions  
on behalf of Christopher Marte who had to step out  
and step out to Chair his own hearing.

2 His question is, as part of the Streets Plan,  
3 will DOT be announcing the start of the FiDi  
4 Pedestrianization Study. This was promised nearly a  
5 decade ago and hasn't started yet. What updates on  
6 this plan can you share?

7 MIKE FLYNN: I'm aware of the study. Uhm, you  
8 know I think there's a lot of opportunity in the  
9 financial district. It's such a unique neighborhood  
10 of the city and on many levels could make a lot of  
11 sense to continue to prioritize pedestrians there. I  
12 don't think we have an update today but it's  
13 certainly something we're looking at.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: It would be great to have an  
15 update for the Council Member as soon as you can.  
16 State law bans the granting of liquor licenses to a  
17 business within 500 feet of three existing liquor  
18 licenses. This issue also exists in outdoor dining  
19 where neighborhoods like the lower east side and east  
20 village can have over 20 sidewalk and roadway cafés  
21 on a single block. Can we implement similar density  
metrics to outdoor dining to prevent the health and  
safety risks associated with this type of density?

2 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, so if that's something  
3 the Council looks at, we're happy to consider that  
4 but we have no plans to limit it at this time.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Intro. 310 states that the  
6 Department of Transportation wouldn't install more  
7 than 260 bilingual signs over the next four years.  
8 In your testimony, you say DOT Administers over one  
9 million signs. Can you elaborate on how 260 signs  
over four years places an administrative burden on  
the agency? I think that's a great question.

10 PAUL OCHOA: Yeah, so I don't think it's actually  
11 the 260 signs that we feel like is a burden and  
12 particularly in Chinatown, most of those signs  
13 already exist and we maintain them. I think as First  
14 Deputy Forgione said, what we want to make sure is  
15 that we're not in the business of having to try to  
16 figure out boundaries and how to classify different  
neighborhoods. The sign itself, that's our bread and  
butter. You know we can work with people to do that.

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Did you say in the opening  
18 that this was an Administrative burden?

19 PAUL OCHOA: So, the taking of requests, the  
20 building of the website, the having to determine  
21 where signs go is a potential administrative burden.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Is it potential or is it?

3 PAUL OCHOA: If people do a lot of requesting, it  
4 would be a burden.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Okay, uhm it doesn't seem  
6 like an Administrative burden. This is just in my  
7 view, I would like to see - I don't think the  
8 argument is compelling. I mean this is I think, my  
9 opinion on that but I'm happy to move on to the  
10 second round. Council Member Restler.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great, thank you Chair  
12 Abreu and I'd just like to continue to focus some of  
13 my questions on our legislation to expand pedestrian  
14 space. So, our bill specifically calls out adding  
15 space around subway and bus stops. Busy, highly  
16 trafficked, highly utilized subway and bus stops.

17 More than half of New Yorkers don't own a car but  
18 75 percent of our streets are devoted to storing and  
19 moving vehicles. Has DOT looked specifically at  
20 converting parking and other spaces around subway  
21 stations into pedestrian space? Do you support doing  
more of that? I will say I've raised at least five  
or six specific examples with DOT over my four years  
in the Council around busy congested areas where I'd  
like to expand pedestrian space. None of them have

2 moved forward. So, is this something that the agency  
3 is supportive of and that your intent on doing more  
4 of during your ten years Commissioner?

5 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you for the question, Council  
6 Member. Uhm, curb space is one of the most you know  
7 contested pieces of real estate in the city, right?  
8 And what we know is that in the last few decades, the  
9 number of potential uses of that space is completely  
10 proliferated. We absolutely support trying to use  
11 curb space for its highest and best use and that  
12 obviously depends on the neighborhood and the  
13 situation but certainly areas with sidewalk crowding,  
14 as Deputy Commissioner Beaton mentioned earlier, is  
15 something that we look at in a systemic way. We're  
16 looking for pedestrian crowding and how we can  
17 alleviate it. I know there's examples around the  
18 city of where sidewalks have been wide and using  
19 temporary materials or even a capital construction  
20 project uhm to create that breathing room around the  
21 subway stairs or elevator. So, I mean I think, I  
think just as a general, uh concept it makes sense.  
I don't know about the specific locations but we're  
definitely open to ideas.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great, glad to hear that  
3 it's something that you're broadly interested in  
4 exploring with us. We set an ambitious target in the  
5 bill, a million square feet of additional pedestrian  
6 space per year. Do you support that target? Is  
7 there an alternative number in mind?

8 MIKE FLYNN: Well, I mentioned uh the - we've  
9 been creating I think roughly a half a million square  
10 feet year on year and in line with the other things  
11 we talked about, bike lanes, bus lanes, you know  
12 pieces of the plan. Uhm, we're doing everything we  
13 can to ramp up capacity and increase output. It's  
14 hard sometimes to comment on a specific number. You  
15 know I think something we've tried to underscore  
16 today is that it can be really helpful to us to have  
17 the flexibility to redirect resources and to be able  
18 to focus that based on the needs that we're hearing  
19 or you know to work with the community. So, that's  
20 something that we would you know encourage us to uh -  
21 we're always happy to work with you, with the  
Council, with other stakeholders to determine what  
the priorities are and how we can focus our  
resources.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Fair but I do think that  
3 having targets, creates real accountability and so,  
4 when we set ambitious goals, around protected bike  
5 lanes, around bus ways, around pedestrian space, we  
6 hold ourselves accountable to try and achieve them  
7 and lay out an array of projects that will meet those  
8 ambitious standards.

9 You know, if we're operating between 50 and 60  
10 percent of our goals on bike and buses, uhm, maybe  
11 we're at 50 percent of our goals on pedestrian space  
12 too and should be hitting the million target.

13 There was a transportation alternatives analysis  
14 recently that showed significant inequities in public  
15 plazas. The communities with large, non-white or POC  
16 populations had significantly less access to  
17 pedestrian plazas. How does DOT ensure that  
18 pedestrian space is distributed equitably across all  
19 communities?

20 MIKE FLYNN: Well, I can start you know by saying  
21 that this is a high priority for me and I've said in  
the past, you know what we mean when we say reimagine  
our public realm. A big piece of that is really some  
of the systemic challenges that we've seen over time  
where it was historically uhm- it was a heavier lift

2 in a way to have these public spaces in other  
3 neighborhoods and it's something we've been very  
4 intentional about fixing and addressing and I would  
5 ask my colleagues to talk about the public space  
6 equity program.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And just briefly, so I  
8 can work on one more question.

9 MIKE FLYNN: Sure, so we have a public space  
10 equity program that's designed to both be able to  
11 give money as well as technical support and in some  
12 cases, even full maintenance capacity to locations  
13 that wouldn't otherwise have it. So, it's something  
14 we leaned into pretty hard. It's fair to say we  
15 could do more and I think it's something we're  
16 excited about.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thanks so much Deputy  
18 Commissioner. Lastly, I just wanted to ask a  
19 question around open dining. I fully support  
20 standards for cleanliness and ensuring that these  
21 structures do not increase rats in our community but  
I do think it's important to clarify that you know we  
have three million on street parking spots in New  
York City and at least in my community, far too many  
of those vehicles never ever move for alternate side

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 134  
2 parking and there is very little accountability from  
3 the NYPD and other agencies.

4 Roadway dining structures make up less than one  
5 percent of the total on street parking spots. We  
6 have - what I'm really asking is, do you think that  
7 there's a risk around rats and cleanliness concerns  
8 that are greater with roadway dining than with  
9 sidewalk dining based on the designs of the new  
10 structures?

11 MIKE FLYNN: I guess structurally the difference  
12 is that with the roadway structures, you do kind of  
13 have that gap underneath and that's where we heard a  
14 lot of the concerns and saw a lot of the concerns,  
15 especially during the original COVID era.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But we saw significant  
17 improvements with cleanliness and reductions in rat  
18 related issues in the updated designs that DOT  
19 approved.

20 MIKE FLYNN: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So, with that new  
design, do you think there's a consequential  
difference in rat related and cleanliness issues with  
roadway dining versus sidewalk dining?

MIKE FLYNN: I think there's -

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: On the COVID era.

3 MIKE FLYNN: There's a significant improvement  
4 with the new designs for sure. So, you know we  
5 always want to think about all the operational  
6 concerns but it's true for sure that it's improved.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great and we look  
8 forward to working together on cleanliness, snow  
9 removal, noise related issues to make sure that the  
10 year around program is a great success. Thank you  
11 for your testimony today.

12 MIKE FLYNN: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And you know I just want to  
14 add on, for the record, I support our year round  
15 dining but to the extent that we can make sure that  
16 the structures are rodent improved, as the former  
17 Chair of Sanitation and a big rat hater, we want to  
18 make sure that we are doing this in a way that would  
19 be conducive to less rats on our streets.

20 Now turning it over to Council Member Wong.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Hello, Commissioner Flynn,  
uhm two issues. One, uhm Councilman Restler  
mentioned that he would like this bill 1338, one  
million square feet per year of pedestrian space for

2 the next five years. Do you feel that's a realistic  
3 figure or that's too ambitious of a goal?

4 MIKE FLYNN: Like I mentioned a moment ago, I  
5 think any time specific numbers are given to us, it  
6 can be tricky and we, you know, we're always willing  
7 to work with our partners to figure out how we can  
8 have the greatest impact. It's hard to comment on  
9 that specific number.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Yeah, once it becomes law,  
11 it's kind of hard to comply if you think this is too  
12 ambitious of a figure. That's always in the - you  
13 said a box size and you're trapped into this box and  
14 they may not be too good if it's too ambitious. Do  
15 you agree?

16 MIKE FLYNN: It's something that we need to -  
17 right once that number is set and it's set into law,  
18 it's something that we then need to react to and work  
19 with.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you. Next  
21 question is uhm, my office gets calls - whenever you  
22 have a street closed under the name Open Streets. We  
23 have kids with special needs on a wheelchair that  
24 like they have to go to District 75 schools. There's

2 a bus that they expect to come to the door where they  
3 can just board and go to school.

4 Likewise for seniors with mobility issues,  
5 walkers, they need wheelchairs, walkers and canes.  
6 They'll have access to ride requests that they expect  
7 these rides to come to their door but with the street  
8 closed, they have to walk a considerable distance to  
9 wait for the bus or ride to come and many said it  
10 violates the ADA.

11 What would you tell them? I mean, is this okay  
12 or no, it violates the ADA?

13 MIKE FLYNN: I would say that accessibility is a  
14 top priority for us and that we're always working to  
15 comply with ADA. Sometimes when we are, you know,  
16 we're working to innovate right and we may launch new  
17 programs or try new approaches. There may be things  
18 that come to light that we become aware of and then  
19 we work diligently to address it. So, uhm Open  
20 Streets is something that's really pretty recent and  
21 I can tell you that we're actively working to  
continue to improve the way that it's designed and  
operated.

COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you. Just a  
quick reminder, uhm, I was at the Chinatown Lunar New

2 Year Parade and I was at Park Road. There was a  
3 redesign of the bus stop. The bus stop is actually a  
4 very narrow island. It was about 3 feet wide, 10  
5 feet long and you wait for a bus there. The bike  
6 lanes behind the people and the buses in the front.  
7 It's a very narrow strip. It's a very narrow bus  
8 stop with no guardrails. When it's really crowded,  
9 people have to stand on the bike lane or stay on the  
10 streets and wait for the bus, creating a very unsafe  
11 condition. So, I'm going to ask this panel, please  
12 look at it. It's just not the way to design a bus  
13 stop where there's a lot of people waiting for a bus  
14 and you're forcing them to stand in the bike lane.  
15 You know, that's just unsafe for everybody. Just  
16 please look at it.

17 MIKE FLYNN: We certainly will. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you and I'll pass it  
20 along to Council Member Dinowitz followed by Brewer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you Chair. You  
know Commissioner, with the three people to your  
right and the one person on your left, you're going  
to do great things. I want to follow up on this  
discussion because even following up, listening to

2 some of the testimony, and I don't want to get the  
3 quote wrong so I'll just paraphrase like, well, we  
4 may not put in all way stop signs because people may  
5 not stop for the stop signs was sort of the  
6 testimony. That's what it was, right?

7 PAUL OCHOA: What research has found is that if  
8 you put in stop signs in places where they're  
9 inappropriate, they don't serve their purpose well  
10 and they don't create safer spaces.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Safer for who?

12 PAUL OCHOA: Safer for reducing crashes. Any  
13 kind of crashes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Including with  
15 pedestrians?

16 PAUL OCHOA: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: And so, by that logic,  
18 because I'm trying to understand, you are all the  
19 experts but that logic, what's the point of Sammy's  
20 Law to like the speed limit is also just a sign just  
21 indicating giving direction to people. That's the  
same thing with stop lights, they are just  
directions. So, people engage in certain behaviors  
and that's what we would want with all ways stop  
signs so please, yes.

2 PAUL OCHOA: Yeah, it's something really  
3 interesting about traffic engineering versus say  
4 bridge engineering is that it's almost just like just  
5 as much social science right? Because it's all about  
6 human behavior and that's why a lot of what you'll  
7 hear us saying is that we really need to take this  
8 holistic approach to planning and engineering and  
9 coming up with the right design solutions because it  
10 really is so dependent on the expectations of the  
11 road users and what they see physically. Is it a  
12 wide road, a narrow road? Are there trees? All  
13 these things have been shown to affect human  
14 behavior.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Right so that's the  
16 human behavior I would think for the most part right?  
17 If a person is going to drag race on a long road,  
18 they're going to drag race, no matter what sign you  
19 put up. No matter what stop sign, stop light. I'm  
20 not talking about those people. I'm talking about  
21 the everyday people who want to follow the rules and  
want to be safe at an all-way stop sign is kind of  
the way to go and between not reporting on - if  
you're measuring it, it's a secret. Between not  
reporting on the velocity of cars in these traffic

2 studies and not knowing even how long these traffic  
3 studies take, and you've heard it year after year  
4 from this Council, that it seems almost impossible to  
5 get - we're talking about a stop sign. I'm just  
6 trying to understand what the resistance is and  
7 you're citing different things about human behavior.  
8 Humans will stop if they know they're supposed to  
9 stop at a stop sign. The same way the DOT says,  
10 well, if we paint- if we do nothing with physical  
11 barriers but paint the streets a certain way to  
12 include bike lanes, people will see that and think  
13 that they have to go a little slower.

14 So, I'm trying to understand as a Council Member,  
15 just trying to get a couple stop signs in my  
16 district, why we are so adamant and supportive of  
17 paint and why we do traffic studies without velocity  
18 but we can't just put in a stop sign. Can you please  
19 talk about that?

20 MIKE FLYNN: Council Member, I would say it's  
21 definitely not resistance. I would say that we're  
eager to do the best possible safety improvements in  
any given location and I think you know the fact that  
aside from the COVID, which was a unique situation,  
traffic fatalities in the city have been steadily

2 declining for years and last year was tied for the  
3 lowest ever.

4 So, we're absolutely - we enjoy and we want to  
5 partner to make our streets as safe as we can.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I would like to - there  
7 are certain stop signs and I don't want to do it at  
8 the hearing but I want to revisit them because if  
9 you're committed to partnering, our community is  
10 pretty smart when it comes to traffic control  
11 devices. We're not resistant to them. In fact we've  
12 been asking for them. There's one location, uhm, it  
13 took - that the community was asking for. It may not  
14 have been exactly fitting with the measures of your  
15 traffic studies but the community was asking for a  
16 stop sign that's in better light - sorry, stop light,  
17 it's better lighting in an area, Spuyten Duyvil and  
18 it took a woman getting run over by a bus and her  
19 brains being splattered all over the sidewalk for the  
20 DOT to come in and putting that stop light and coming  
21 and putting better lighting and make it just safer.  
And I think we all agree, it shouldn't take that. We  
may disagree where we put them but if a community is  
asking for it, if a community is asking for traffic  
controlled devices, I would think that that in some

2 cases may supersede the federal traffic control  
3 guidelines that it seems that you hide behind some  
4 instances to not put in all-way stop signs.

5 Can we get a commitment to revisit some of the  
6 areas and I know the deputies know exactly what I'm  
7 talking about offline to install and take into  
8 consideration more community input for these all-way  
9 stop signs?

10 MIKE FLYNN: Please do, let us know.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: And when you start  
12 measuring velocity and including that in your traffic  
13 studies so the community can better understand what  
14 you are and are not including in your determination  
15 to reject things like all-way stop signs.

16 MIKE FLYNN: I'm sorry, can you repeat that?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Can you include  
18 velocity, the speed at which cars go, maximum and  
19 minimum speeds you're observing in your traffic  
20 studies? So, we as communities can better understand  
21 why all-way stop signs, which are designed to save  
people's lives, are being rejected.

MIKE FLYNN: Yeah, what we're measuring really  
will depend on the type of study that we're doing and  
the issues that have been brought to our attention.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'll let you follow-up on  
3 that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you. So, if we  
5 are bringing to your attention the fact that cars may  
6 be going very quickly down a narrow street. The  
7 velocities that we're bringing to your attention -  
8 will velocity be included in the traffic studies or  
9 can they be included in the traffic studies?

10 MIKE FLYNN: Yeah, we can certainly share the  
11 data that we're looking at.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Okay, I look forward to  
13 that. Thank you Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Council Member Brewer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: One small question. So,  
16 in the past, we never used to get complaints about  
17 street lights being out and we're getting tons of  
18 them. So, I don't know if that's a part of a  
19 different philosophy. If it's part of not having the  
20 funding to do the maintenance etc., but obviously  
21 it's a safety concern. I assume when you redo  
intersections, maybe putting different kinds of  
lights that are not as susceptible to whatever is  
causing this problem but it's constant and never  
before have I had so many outages of lights. I'm

2 just wondering, just regular street lights, what's  
3 going on?

4 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, so we're talking about  
5 street lights not traffic signals, okay. So, if you  
6 get those to us, we will get them back asap.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: No, I know you do - no, I  
8 do get those and you do get them back but there's  
9 something wrong because it's so pervasive. It's  
10 never been as pervasive. It's like whole entire  
11 stretches out and obviously it takes a little while  
12 to get them back and during that time period, people  
13 are scared because of the dark, so.

14 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, so good, as you give us  
15 more, I'll take a look at those and find out what's  
16 happening if there's something happening in a certain  
17 neighborhood.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Can I add on to that and can  
20 we stop the time. I've asked for you know street  
21 lights that were promised years ago, we've gotten  
nothing along 165th Street and Riverside Drive. I  
understand that DOT had conversations with the Parks  
Department recently because they told me that you all  
are looking into that but the notion that this is a

2 new thing for me is just unfathomable. This is -  
3 we've been requesting street lights for a very, very  
4 long time with no follow up.

5 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay Chair, I will get - if  
6 you get me those locations, I'll get you an answer  
7 right away.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We all should have that.

9 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And then just quickly,  
11 street signs that have faded. This is again, not a  
12 safety - nobody is going to die because of it but it  
13 creates concern, people don't know where they're  
14 going etc.. How are they able to be replaced? Is  
15 there funding for that? Obviously in neighborhoods  
16 that are older with signs that have been there for a  
17 long time, they are faded. Is that something that  
18 you get complaints about? Is that something that's  
19 able to be basically - needing a new sign or do you  
20 repaint it? I don't know.

21 MARGARET FORGIONE: Yes, we have uhm the largest  
municipal sign shop actually in the country. We  
produce our own signs. We can do them very quickly.  
If you get them to us, we will get them right back  
out if they're faded or missing.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, thank you very  
3 much.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.  
5 Council Member Hanif followed by Epstein.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you. While we're on  
7 the conversation of traffic lights, street lights, I  
8 do want to thank DOT for installing traffic lights in  
9 my district at Bond and Baltic. It only took two  
10 years but we got it done and we also celebrated. We  
11 had a traffic light party just a couple days ago.

12 Uhm, I want to come to - I want to wrap up the  
13 questions about my bill. Could you just share - I  
14 know that you mentioned you don't support it. Could  
15 you just elaborate on why you don't and what instead  
16 is the plan?

17 MIKE FLYNN: I think it's - we find we can be  
18 most effective when we have the flexibility to, you  
19 know, to match the right treatments to the right  
20 locations. That would be you know if there's  
21 specific types of treatments and specific number of  
locations and mandates like that, you know that's  
just something that can make it a little more  
challenging for us to take this.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: What happens immediately  
3 after a crash? When you learn about a pedestrian  
4 fatality or an injury, how does DOT respond?

5 MARGARET FORGIONE: Yes, so DOT attends every  
6 single site of every single crash immediately after  
7 it occurring. We have 24/7 staff that go out to a  
8 location and examine. Fatals, I'm talking about  
9 fatalities and examine the conditions at that site.  
10 Uhm, we work closely with NYPD, if there's anything  
11 immediately that needs to be addressed, we address it  
12 but then we also have a team of people and -

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Could you share address as  
14 in what?

15 MARGARET FORGIONE: Just say there's some faded  
16 marking at that location that potentially could have  
17 contributed.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Got it. Do you also  
19 assess if that intersection could have used hardened  
20 daylighting?

21 MARGARET FORGIONE: We look at the safety of that  
intersection. Deputy Commissioner Beaton has staff  
that then looks. We have the shorter term staff that  
looks. We have the shorter term staff that go out  
there immediately and then we have staff that look at

2 every location and high crash locations for other  
3 treatments as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And do you have a report  
5 or data on the fatalities that took place say last  
6 year, year before, and what was done in the  
7 intersections following the incidents?

8 MARGARET FORGIONE: Right, it's a quarterly  
9 report. Yes, we do.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Great, okay, I'll look at  
11 that. I wanted to come to pedestrian plazas. My  
12 district, Kensington Plaza, has greatly benefitted  
13 from the Public Space Equity Program and I really  
14 thank DOT. Kensington is where I was born and  
15 raised, a huge Bangladeshi immigrant community and  
16 that plaza has just made our lives so much better and  
17 uhm, so much more welcoming.

18 Uhm, however, I'm concerned about the plazas that  
19 are not getting the care and attention they deserve.  
20 What is DOT's plan?

21 MIKE FLYNN: Are there specific plazas?

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: The one that I'll raise is  
Fort Street Plaza but it's not considered a plaza  
according to DOTs definition but it is a plaza and  
what we have going on there is that the Fifth Avenue

2 Bid, you know attempts to keep programming running in  
3 partnership with my office. We've got some neighbors  
4 and we all come together but you know it's a sort of  
5 - we're improvising constantly and the money that  
6 needs to be spent is coming from the Bid, which they  
7 don't have a lot of.

8 MIKE FLYNN: Yeah, I think now that we're aware,  
9 we're happy to look at it. We have a great, what we  
10 call our public realm team and they take, you know,  
11 a multifaceted approach to how we can maintain and  
12 enliven our public spaces.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Yeah, I would really uh  
14 push for just more investment in the plaza program.  
15 I think plazas are incredibly important in our city,  
16 not just allowing New Yorkers to be able to come and  
17 have lunch by themselves but also to meet their  
18 neighbors and in this time, we really need that but  
19 without the proper investments, they fail and I don't  
20 want to see Fort Street Plaza become the parking lot  
21 it once was to MS 51.

MIKE FLYNN: Yeah, I couldn't agree more. I  
think you know that's why our goal is not only to  
create the pedestrian space but to really make sure

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 151

2 it's high quality and that's not only when it's first  
3 built but how it's maintained, programmed over time.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Is there a public realm  
5 zar or is somebody - sombodies full portfolio about  
6 plazas?

7 MIKE FLYNN: We have an Assistant Commissioner  
8 for Public Realm who is - who oversees the plaza  
9 program.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.  
12 We'll now move on to Council Member Epstein followed  
13 by Marte.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Thank you Chair. I just  
15 want to say we've raised issues with street lights on  
16 a couple locations and we haven't gotten follow up  
17 either, so the lighting issue that you heard earlier  
18 about. So, it would be great to get a follow up on  
19 that. You mentioned daylighting, did you feel like  
20 that data doesn't support the daylighting though.  
21 Can you share whatever report or data you have with  
us so we can evaluate that independently?

PAUL OCHOA: Yes, we'll send you the report and  
we actually shared the full dataset with the Council  
last year for them to look at as well.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: I'd appreciate that.

3 And I just want to thank Council Member Hanif on the  
4 plaza's issue. I think we all want to slow down  
5 traffic. We want more pedestrian plaza's but we want  
6 to make sure those are activated, so it's great to  
7 know - I didn't know that there was an assistant  
8 commissioner there, so I think I would love to be  
9 able to connect up with them as well and give them  
10 the opportunity.

11 Can I just turn back to sidewalk sheds and stuff  
12 like that? So, sometimes it can be stipulations with  
13 an applicant when they're doing the sidewalk shed.  
14 What do you do with those stipulations?

15 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, those stipulations are  
16 not part of our record. They're not part of the  
17 license that we give to the restaurant. So,  
18 sometimes some types of informal, separate,  
19 understandings are created. We are not a party to  
20 that and we don't enforce that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: So, why would you not  
22 have those stipulations be part of the record? The  
23 SLA has those stipulations as part of the record but  
24 they're licensed. Why not include those stipulations  
25 as part of your record and with the applicant? It's

2 an agreement the applicant made with the community.

3 Why wouldn't you include those?

4 MARGARET FORGIONE: So, what I can say is that  
5 what we hear a lot of and with the bills that are  
6 being offered up is to really increase dining out and  
7 to facilitate it, so we're not looking at those  
8 additional restrictions, which really again, we're  
9 not a party of to put those onto the record and to  
10 enforce something. Council Member, we may not be  
11 able to even have the ability to enforce some of  
12 these agreements within the rules that we have.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: So, I push back to say I  
14 think if there's an agreement that parties have made,  
15 I think this is the best way to move forward and that  
16 parties have agreed to it. It makes no sense to me  
17 why you wouldn't enforce those stipulations.

18 So, but I think we'll just continue that  
19 conversation at a later date. So, you mentioned that  
20 uh, the sidewalk shed, the roadway bed sheds will be  
21 removed for snow, for street milling. How is that  
happening if there's a platform and it just snows the  
day before? How practically is that going to happen?

MARGARET FORGIONE: Right, so the kinds of things  
- first of all, the floors are now in segments,

2 movable segments. They're not one large continuous  
3 built in space floor that we saw during COVID and the  
4 kinds of things we're considering and will continue  
5 to consider over the next months are, if we know  
6 there's a large storm coming, like the two that we  
7 had, that may be the circumstances that we tell  
8 people to remove the set ups in the roadway.

9 If it's a smaller storm, probably not but these  
10 are the kinds of things we're going to have to give  
11 more thought to.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: And then, what happens  
13 if an applicant doesn't remove it?

14 MARGARET FORGIONE: We would have the ability to  
15 issue a violation.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: But you would have to -  
17 it would still be left there, you'd have to somehow  
18 plow around that structure?

19 MARGARET FORGIONE: Correct.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: So, you would just have  
21 to leave it and then figure it out later? You  
wouldn't remove it yourselves?

MARGARET FORGIONE: And as we're you know  
building up to a storm and we have our own storm

2 response, it would be unlikely we'd be able to remove  
3 locations like that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Right, so we talk a lot  
5 about the sidewalk sheds and uh, sorry, the sidewalk  
6 sheds and it being ADA accessible. Are you doing  
7 anything about ensuring ADA accessibility for  
8 bathrooms for people who are maybe with a disability  
9 who needs to use a bathroom while they're dining out?

10 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, they should be able to  
11 get right back into the main uhm, part of the  
12 restaurant.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: So, are you doing  
14 anything to require the main part of the restaurant  
15 to make an accessible bathroom?

16 MARGARET FORGIONE: Well, there's accessibility  
17 requirements for the restaurant already in existence  
18 and uhm, it's level to get off the roadway setup onto  
19 the sidewalk, so there should be no impediment to  
20 getting out of the dining out structure and into the  
21 restaurant.

COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: So, if there is an  
accessible bathroom, what if anything do you do in  
the application process to ensure someone will have  
access to an accessible bathroom?

2 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, that's probably  
3 something we'd have to talk to like DOB about because  
4 that comes back to the building.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EPSTEIN: Alright. Uhm, and okay,  
6 so I just want to - one last question I think. We've  
7 heard a lot from FDNY around kind of the question  
8 Council Member Marte asked earlier around multiple  
9 sheds on a small street on both sides and really  
10 concerns around safety, having access if there's a  
11 fire. What are you looking at? If there's, you know,  
12 you could have a small road where there's a sidewalk,  
13 there are roadway beds on both sides and there's kind  
14 of just a middle lane of traffic, how are you going  
15 to help us all figure out how to manage that?  
16 Especially if the FDNY has an issue there?

17 MARGARET FORGIONE: Good, no it's a fair point.  
18 Uhm, so we consult with FDNY based on the widths of  
19 roadways and we do provide them with applications and  
20 we take in their feedback. A lot of times we're  
21 looking at roadways. We all know we have narrow  
roadways, sometimes parking is allowed on both sides  
of the street and in those cases, we would allow  
dining out on both sides of the street but we also

2 solicit FDNY feedback if there are some circumstances  
3 we are not aware of.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.  
5 Council Member Marte.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Thank you Chair. I want  
7 to build on what Council Member Epstein said when it  
8 comes to bathroom requirements. Administrative Code  
9 Section 403.3 requires a restroom for food and drink  
10 establishments with more than 20 seats with outdoor  
11 dining and especially if the program is made year  
12 round, many establishments would newly exceed the  
13 threshold when including outdoor dining seats. How  
14 can we assure that this rule appropriately includes  
15 outdoor seating and that in such scenarios the city  
16 agencies will take appropriate actions to enforce  
17 bathroom requirements where establishments now  
18 require them?

19 MIKE FLYNN: That's something we can definitely  
20 take a closer look at.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Thank you and I want to  
22 just plus one what Council Member Epstein said about  
23 stipulations right? This is an agreement between two  
24 parties and for us to take out the bad actors right,  
25 there's a - I feel like there's a few bad actors that

2 are ruining it for everyone else and if there's no  
3 sense of like commitment followed through or  
4 enforcement on some of the agreements they made with  
5 community board, then why are they even going in  
6 front of the community board right? If there's no  
7 reason to have any oversight or enforcement on it and  
8 that brings me to my next question about when DOB has  
9 an application in front of the community board, they  
10 need a professional to legally sign off that what  
11 they're proposing to community boards are exactly  
12 what they're going to be built and that it's safe.

13 Right now, for outdoor dining sheds, there's no  
14 architect or engineer that has to sign off on these  
15 layouts or designs and I think that kind of hinders  
16 the trust of these establishments because even in my  
17 district, we have seen applications go in front of  
18 the community board and with a design and then a few  
19 weeks later when they're actually building it out,  
20 it's completely different and there's nothing we can  
21 do to have oversight because it's up now and there's  
no like follow-up on enforcement.

19 MARGARET FORGIONE: Okay, we ensure that every  
20 structure that is built does comply with that it was  
21 that we approved. So, if you have any of those, we

2 can confirm for you. We have inspectors. They  
3 inspect all of these set ups that were built  
4 according to our standards and what was approved.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Okay thank you and you  
6 know I think sidewalk cafés have worked for a really  
7 long time because the Council have oversight. In my  
8 district, I have probably the most or maybe former  
9 Council Member Bottcher's district has probably a  
10 little bit more than me but we both have the most  
11 sidewalk cafés application than the city and 99  
12 percent of the applications are never called right  
13 because they're good applicants. They're good with  
14 the community. They respect the time. They respect  
15 enforcements however, there are times where we need  
16 to call up really bad actors. Why isn't there a  
17 system for the Council to call up bad actors when it  
18 comes to outdoor dining sheds?

19 MARGARET FORGIONE: So, what I would say is that  
20 uhm, as issues are happening, like if they're  
21 continuing to operate in the hours they should not.  
If they violate the noise code, things of that  
nature, that is one we would want to make sure that  
we're enforcing or our partner sister agencies are  
also enforcing.

2 So, those are the mechanisms. We, you know we're  
3 happy to talk to you more about long standing bad  
4 actors, okay.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Hmm, hmm, thank you. And  
6 just switching subjects. I'm a true supporter of  
7 Sammy's Laws. You know you - DOT implemented it in  
8 the last administration in my district and I think  
9 it's been going extremely well. There's a lot of  
10 safer intersections now because of it. However, I  
11 believe implementing Sammy's Law in Central Park,  
12 it's a way to target a lot of the delivery workers  
13 who are using that protected bikeway and also hinders  
14 you know cyclists from actually doing recreational  
15 cycling in the morning for a lot of the club  
16 competitions that they have and so, I highly urge and  
17 recommend DOT to remove that provision that was put  
18 in by the Adam's Administration when it comes to  
19 Central Park.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Council Member.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: One more question. I just  
wanted to -

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: The Council Member does  
triathlons, so he cares a lot about biking.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Yes, I use Central Park a  
3 lot but not too much anymore because of the speed  
4 limit but my final suggestion is, I want to plus one  
5 what Council Member Hanif said about Public Plaza.  
6 We have a new plaza partner at Barnett Newman  
7 Triangle, who is looking to, you know, take some up.  
8 Take some of the parking spots to enhance and  
9 beautify that area, however, it just seems that the  
10 process of moving forward is just taking too long and  
11 it seems like it take multiple years even after you  
12 have a willing plaza partner, you have Council Member  
13 funding to actually move forward with it and painting  
14 some of the streets and adding some tree beds or  
15 greenery or planters to the area. So, I would love  
16 to work with DOT to expedite the project and not wait  
17 until the full canal redesign to have an impact on  
18 that intersection.

19 MIKE FLYNN: Uhm, if it's the location that I'm  
20 thinking of - this is the location where it exists in  
21 temporary materials and now where we have the capital  
project moving forward to rebuild it permanently?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: So, it's in front of the  
Rosy Hotel. So, just right here a few blocks away.  
You know, friends of Barnett Newman Triangle just

2 became plaza partners. They're envisioning you know  
3 really nice capital projects but we know that's years  
4 along the way but they're asking to take up some of  
5 the parking spaces there to expand the plaza and add  
6 some planters to help beautify it.

7 MIKE FLYNN: Okay, I'm happy to - I'm not  
8 personally familiar with that location but it sounds  
9 like we are actively talking to the community partner  
10 there about more we can do with that site. Uhm, but  
11 I'll make sure that you know we're moving forward  
12 together.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Cool, thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you and two more  
15 questions and then this panel will be excused. I  
16 want to appreciate our members of the public who are  
17 patiently waiting to testify and also the  
18 administration for your patience as well.

19 Just two questions. On Intro. 13, regarding the  
20 installation of solar-powered crosswalks. DOT stated  
21 in their testimony that they had concerns regarding  
the efficacy of the types of technologies envisioned  
in the bill and in the fall, DOT testified that they  
were open to discussing other new technologies and  
smaller scale pilots. What are other options, uh to

2 increase visibility of signage and increased  
3 compliance at crosswalks?

4 MIKE FLYNN: Sure, so in terms of new  
5 technologies, we're actively investigating the  
6 feasibility of solar-powered accessible pedestrian  
7 signals. So, like the button and at a limited number  
8 of signalized intersections, where traditional  
9 conduit and electrical cable installations aren't  
10 feasible due to the subsurface conditions or  
11 conflicts with utilities. Uh, in terms of pilots, we  
12 recently installed a few solar pilot locations in New  
13 York City and we're evaluating the effectiveness of  
14 those devices in terms of their durability, the  
15 battery longevity, the communication performance and  
16 the long term maintenance costs.

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. My last question  
18 is Speaker Menin's Preconsidered Bill has been  
19 amended since DOT last heard it to set a maximum  
20 clear path of 8 feet or 50 percent of the width of  
21 the sidewalk, bringing sidewalk dining back to its  
roots. Sidewalk dining worked well in the past using  
a standard like this. Why couldn't it return to this  
standard?

2 MIKE FLYNN: Uhm, so we're you know we're all for  
3 - we're trying to balance different needs, right?

4 So, we're all for trying to support more outdoor  
5 dining and more vital public realm. We have to  
6 balance that with some of these other considerations.

7 Some of it we see kind of how it works out there  
8 in the world right as we introduce these programs,  
9 introduce new requirements or standards and then see  
10 how it works and we might have to adjust.

11 I would come back to what I said earlier, which  
12 is that the areas where the requirement is greater  
13 than 8 feet, either 10 or 12, is almost entirely in  
14 the Manhattan Central business district. It's really  
15 just the most congested parts of the city by and  
16 large.

17 So, you know we think it strikes a good balance  
18 but we're always open to uh talking and hearing -

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: That was my next question,  
20 are you open to working with the Speaker on figuring  
21 at how to arrive at a good place on this?

MIKE FLYNN: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much. This  
panel is excused. Thank you very much.

PANEL: Thank you Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And we - I now open the  
3 hearing for public testimony. I remind members of  
4 the public that this is a government proceeding and  
5 that decorum shall be observed at all times. As  
6 such, members of the public shall remain silent at  
7 all times. The witness table is reserved for people  
8 who wish to testify. No video recording or  
9 photography is allowed from the witness table.  
10 Further, members of the public may not present audio  
11 or video recordings as testimony but may submit  
12 transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant at  
13 Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

14 If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please  
15 fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms  
16 and wait to be recognized. When recognized, you will  
17 have two minutes to speak on today's hearing topics,  
18 which are, Introduction Number 13 in relation to the  
19 installation of solar-powered crosswalks.

20 Intro. Number 93 in relation to expanding the  
21 bicycle parking station program. Intro. Number 163,  
in relation to a study and report on the feasibility  
of providing ferry service Inwood. Intro. Number  
202, in relation to the time permitted for the

2 installation for a traffic calming device or traffic  
3 controlled device on any street adjacent to a school.

4 Intro. Number 310, in relation to requiring the  
5 Department of Transportation to install bilingual  
6 street name signs. Intro. Number 628 in relation to  
7 expanding access to sidewalk and roadway cafe  
8 applications.

9 Introduction Number 655, in relation to expanding  
10 access to roadway and sidewalk cafés. Preconsidered  
11 Intro. in relation to requiring curb extensions at  
12 certain dangerous intersections. Preconsidered  
13 Intro. in relation to maximum clear path requirements  
14 for sidewalk cafés, and Preconsidered Intro. in  
15 relation to the expansion of pedestrian space. If  
16 you have a written statement or additional written  
17 testimony you wish to submit for the record, please  
18 provide a copy of that testimony to the Sergeant at  
19 Arms.

20 You may also email written testimony to  
21 [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov) within 72 hours of this  
22 hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be  
23 accepted.

24 I urge patience with everybody, we have about 70  
25 people signed up to testify and so, I respectfully

2 ask that you keep your remarks to within two minutes  
3 and again, if you go - we'll review your comments.

4 So, if you want to submit your written testimony,  
5 even though I may cut you off at the two minute mark,  
6 remember we're going to read all the testimony that  
7 comes in.

8 So, I'm going to now call the first panel,  
9 Darnell Sealy-McCrorey, my apologies for  
10 mispronouncing. Samuel Riviera, Maria Kaufer and  
11 Mary Beth Kelly and Abby Dziura remotely.

12 You may begin and please state your name for the  
13 record.

14 DARNELL SEALY-MCCROREY: Bear with me, I'm just  
15 under a lot of emotional distress but uhm, good  
16 afternoon. My name is Darnell Sealy-McCrorey and I  
17 am a member of Families for Safe Streets.

18 Families for Safe Streets is an organization made  
19 up of people who have either lost a loved one or been  
20 injured in a traffic crash. Just recently, two years  
21 ago, my 13-year-old daughter, Niyell McCrorey was hit  
by a speeding SUV driver at the intersection of West  
110th Street in Manhattan Avenue, October 25, 2024,  
6th District Manhattan. My beautiful intelligent  
daughter Niyell had a passion for dancing, learning

2 and inspired many, many other family members and  
3 teenagers via Tik Tok with her self taught  
4 choreographed dance routines. She had inspiring  
5 dreams of becoming a doctor or attorney who fights  
6 for one's rights, freedom and justice. Never in a  
7 million years after being released from a four year  
8 incarceration sentence did I think her mother and I  
9 would bury our daughter so soon. Sadly as she was  
pronounced deceased November 1st, within the same  
year.

10 Today, we could protect our families from  
11 suffering like this. To stop super speeders will  
12 require speed limiters and the cause of the most - of  
13 the worst - sorry. And the cause of the worst of the  
14 worst repeat offenders. Some vehicles are racking up  
15 hundreds of speeding tickets a year and if we don't  
16 do something another one of these riders are going to  
17 kill again soon. The Mayor, Mamdani and City Council  
18 must follow the Streets plan that is the law. We  
19 must do the following to make our streets safe, fully  
20 funding the Department of Transportation so that it  
21 can implement the safe streets infrastructure,  
mandated by the Streets Plan, implement Sammy's Law,  
20 mile per hour zones within a half mile of every

2 school district in New York City, prioritize the city  
3 streets infrastructure mandated in the Streets Plan  
4 to ensure the life saving is done quickly, create  
5 more pedestrian plazas in the city where residents  
6 are completely safe from the dangers of cars. And  
7 lastly, focus on a connected network of protected  
8 bike lanes to avoid dangerous gaps.

9 This is my third time appearing for this  
10 testimony and I've lobbied to New York, Albany New  
11 York over seven times. So, my fellow members of  
12 Families for Safe Streets are going to keep on going  
13 to Albany and bringing more and more people with us  
14 until we get the message through. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Darnell and I'm  
16 very heartened that you're here today. I know this  
17 is very difficult for you and your family. This  
18 happened in my district and I just want you to know  
19 that beyond my thoughts being with you, I have made  
20 requests to DOT soon after that for Sammy's Law to be  
21 implemented on Manhattan Avenue. I didn't get a  
response from that. I asked for more street design  
and improvements along that corridor and I have not  
gotten any follow-up on that. But I just want you to

2 know that this is something that I take very  
3 seriously and it's something I want to see action on.

4 DARNELL SEALY-MCCROREY: Thank you for your  
5 consideration.

6 MARIA KAUFER: Good afternoon. My name is Maria  
7 Kaufer and I am a survivor of traffic violence. I  
8 became a Families for Safe Streets member on December  
9 13, 2023, when I was struck by a driver making a  
10 right turn in their sedan off Queens Boulevard onto  
11 Ascan Avenue in Forest Hills, where I have resided  
12 since 1992.

13 I was walking across the street on a crosswalk  
14 with a full right of way and had almost reached the  
15 middle of the road when I was struck down by the car.  
16 I sustained multiple, physical injuries throughout my  
17 body, the most serious of which were a left fibular  
18 head fracture and permanent damage to all of the  
19 ligaments supporting both of my knees.

20 I have spent the last two years and three months  
21 in great pain and in addition to copious physician  
visits and body scans, I have been doing physical  
therapy two to three times a week.

I continue to need physical therapy for different  
parts of my body. It seems like once we finish

2 healing or improving the tissues, the issues in one  
3 body part, pain signals force me to attend to the  
4 problems in a different body part.

5 Along with physical problems, I have suffered  
6 financial, emotional, and psychological trauma.  
7 Instead of granting me an unpaid medical leave as a  
8 reasonable accommodation to heal from physical  
9 injuries, my employer committed disability  
10 discrimination and illegally fired me from my job.

11 To add insult to injury, they denied me  
12 unemployment benefits, claiming I had violated  
13 company policy by going on an unauthorized leave of  
14 absence, which is the status they had designated and  
15 forced me to use up all of my saving and tap into  
16 multiple lines of credit to pay for my living  
17 expenses for almost two years while I was recovering  
18 from injuries.

19 Not always but randomly and unpredictably, I have  
20 nightmares and suffer post-traumatic stress disorder  
21 when crossing streets and have had to see a  
22 psychotherapist for trauma informed therapy.

23 I hope that no other New Yorker excuse me, ever  
24 has to endure what I have these past two and a half  
25 years. It is a heavy cross to bear. I ask the City

2 Council and the Mayor to immediately implement the  
3 Streets Plan to spare as many New York pedestrians as  
4 possible from suffering the immediate impact and  
5 ripple effects of traffic violence. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Maria, thank you very much  
7 for coming to testify today and may you continue  
8 lending you know your voice to this and you've  
9 inspired action. You've inspired me, both of you  
10 have. Thank you very much for coming today. This  
11 panel is excused. I'm now going to have Abby on uh  
12 remotely.

13 ABBY DZIURA: Hi, yes can you guys hear me?

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We sure can.

15 ABBY DZIURA: Thank you so much. My name is Abby  
16 Dziura, I'm here with Riders Alliance and I'm here to  
17 talk about the Streets Plan today. I live in Harlem  
18 and work in the Bronx and I take the bus on Fordham  
19 Road every single day and I'm frustrated by how often  
20 it is late or delayed by traffic.

21 But not only is my life affected but the lives of  
my students are as well. I work with an after school  
program and they are constantly late or absent  
specifically because of the buses and in fact, I have  
a quote from one of my students here who wrote to me

2 about their frustrations in an essay. He said,  
3 "taking the bus in New York is something you can only  
4 grasp if you do it." "The X22 line is the bus I have  
5 been taking every day since elementary school.  
6 Taking public transportation makes you learn how to  
7 be aware of your surroundings. The 22 is the worst  
8 bus in the world and I hate it because it's always  
9 late and takes at least 30 minutes in between each  
10 bus."

11 Riders like myself - sorry, that was the end of  
12 his quote.

13 Riders like myself and my students deserve  
14 better. Buses stuck in traffic every day interfere  
15 with our daily lives, affecting our ability to go to  
16 work and school. The Streets Plan is an opportunity  
17 to create and deliver a bold plan to speed up buses  
18 in a significant and tangible way for riders,  
19 including with such improvements, such as the Fordham  
20 Road Busway. The Streets Plan is a law that the  
21 Mayor must follow and he can't fail riders like Mayor  
Adams did. They disrespected riders by ignoring the  
law and riders are demanding a 20 percent citywide  
speed increase during Mayor Mamdani's Mayor  
Administration.

2 City streets are a public space where all people  
3 using them deserve space and bus riders like my  
4 students and myself are constantly left behind.  
5 Thank you so much.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you for your testimony  
7 Abby. I'm now going to call up the next panel.  
8 Lindsey Cormack, Valerie De La Rosa, Tammy Meltzer,  
9 Betsy Mak, and Max Bookman.

10 And the folks who are remote, once the in-person  
11 testimony is over, we'll pivot back to you. You may  
12 - you may proceed.

13 LINDSEY CORMACK: Good afternoon. I'm Lindsey  
14 Cormack and I'm speaking today in my role as the  
15 Chair of the Street Lights Committee for Community  
16 Board 8 in Manhattan. Let me begin by saying  
17 clearly, our board supports outdoor dining. We  
18 recognize it's important to restaurants, to our  
19 economic vitality and to the city's street scape.  
20 It's a part of what we want to do but Intro. 655 as  
21 drafted, raises concerns.

The bill expanding eligibility that allows cafés  
to operate year round, might not work in every  
neighborhood. In dense neighborhoods like ours with  
narrow streets, high pedestrian volume and already

2 constrained curbstreet, dedicating a roadway space to  
3 a single, private, commercial use year around means  
4 that that might become the default in New York City,  
rather than the exception.

5 Like the Commissioner said, curbspace is one of  
6 the city's most contested shared resources. Since  
7 the expansion of outdoor dining, our board has seen  
8 increased complaints to vermin, sanitation, and late  
9 night noise. Many operators in the upper east side  
and Roosevelt Island are responsible and attentive  
10 but the structures of the roadway cafés create new  
11 conditions for food debris, storage issues, and  
little houses for rats to build their own lifestyle.

12 That directly affects residents living not only  
13 adjacent to these establishments but above these  
14 establishments. Expanding year round operation  
15 increases these pressures.

16 The bill also importantly limits community boards  
17 abilities to request additional materials beyond the  
18 petition itself and that compresses our meaningful  
19 review. Community boards are also the only venue  
20 where neighbors can raise specific concerns about  
obstruction, sanitation, emergency access, noise

2 impacts and more. Reducing that review weakens local  
3 accountability.

4 The bill does also not sufficiently address snow  
5 removal, street milling and maintenance. Roadway  
6 dining structures complicate plowing, curb clearing  
7 and access to catch basins. Snow build up around  
8 fixed structures can narrow travel lanes and  
9 pedestrian space, creating safety hazards.

10 Finally, the fixed 8 foot restrictions near  
11 crosswalks removes flexibility that may be necessary  
12 for safety in certain intersections, setting a  
13 maximum of 8 feet presumes that every city block is  
14 the same and that visibility and historical accident  
15 patterns can't be used to make reasons and informed  
16 decisions. Thank you for your efforts on this and I  
17 urge the Council to reconsider some of the provisions  
18 to reduce local review and design flexibility.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you, next.

20 BETSY MAK: My name is Betsy Mak and I'm the Vice  
21 Chair of Community Board 7 in Queens. We are  
strongly opposed to your proposal and we were  
unanimous to disapprove the 2022 Open Restaurant Tax.  
Downtown Flushing is one of the most congested  
neighborhoods in the city. We have the second most

2 pedestrian intersections in the entire city, second  
3 behind Time Square. Our sidewalk, main street  
4 already expanded but the conditions are severely  
5 strained due to legal vendors and street violators  
6 occupying much of the space. These vendors and  
7 violators create a crowded and unsafe condition,  
8 pedestrians are often forced off the sidewalk and  
9 dangerously into the roadway where we have busy SBS  
10 bus service.

11 There's absolutely no room to accommodate any  
12 additional sidewalk or roadway cafés. Two fires  
13 occurred at night in Downtown Flushing at 135-05 40th  
14 Road and 133-40 to 48, 37th Avenue. The fire started  
15 from the roadway café, the wooden structure then  
16 spread to six buildings.

17 These are not AI generated photos that I'm  
18 sharing and it is shocking that all of the roadway  
19 cafés are reviewed by FDNY. CB7 Queens, urges you to  
20 exclude Downtown Flushing into this proposal. We ask  
21 that you prioritize pedestrians and building tenant  
safety and the quality of life in our community.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you for your testimony.

TAMMY MELTZER: Good afternoon. My name is Tammy  
Meltzer and I am Chair of Manhattan Community Board

2 1. Community Board 1 strongly opposes Intro. 655 and  
3 T130 - 1336. We voted in opposition in 2025 with a  
4 margin of 34 to 1. The board would have voted again  
5 on the rename bill but there was not sufficient time  
6 between introduction and this hearing to do so.

7 665 extends outdoor dining to year round, reduces  
8 required distance for roadway cafés to crosswalks to  
9 just 8 feet. Yet the bill provides no clear  
10 standards for how pedestrian clear paths,  
11 accessibility or service isles must be measured in  
12 consistent interpretations. Lack of clarity for the  
13 public and businesses have eroded space meant for  
14 safe pedestrian calculation.

15 The most serious injuries and fatalities occur at  
16 intersections with turning cars. The 20 foot  
17 clearance is designed to protect visibility of  
18 pedestrians and cyclists. While the city is  
19 increasing corner clearances for safety and DOT  
20 reviews updated plans for areas like canals  
21 [INAUDIBLE 196.38]. This moves in an opposite  
direction to restrict further site lines.  
Furthermore, there have been no environmental or  
traffic studies provided to show that 8 feet would be  
safe for everyone.

2 We also oppose expanding roadway cafés beyond the  
3 business lot line. Many businesses that are smaller  
4 than 20 seats are not required to provide public  
5 restrooms, allowing them and others to expand  
6 permanent seating without meeting health code  
7 bathroom requirements, is neither practical nor in  
8 the public interest.

9 Similarly given property owners discretion to  
10 improve expansions. Risks harming neighbor  
11 storefront operators, maybe renters and have no  
12 opportunity to input or notification in this  
13 decision. The bill would also allow retail food  
14 stores and warehouses, businesses that do not provide  
15 public access nor public restrooms to operate roadway  
16 cafés. This definitely does not serve the public  
17 realm and should be removed completely. For T1336,  
18 Lower Manhattan experiences some of the highest  
19 pedestrian volumes in the city and full sidewalks are  
20 often absolutely necessary to handle daily  
21 congestion.

18 We already have people who step into bike lanes  
19 and the street to pass others creating dangerous  
20 conflicts with cyclists and vehicles.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Please wrap up. Thank you.

2 TAMMY MELTZER: Diminishing any clear path to  
3 just 8 feet or just 50 percent of the sidewalk would  
4 worsen these conditions and increase unsafe  
5 interactions. We have a lot of experience. National  
6 restaurant associations statistics -

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
8 testimony, next.

9 TAMMY MELTZER: I'll provide it in full.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much.

11 VALERIE DE LA ROSA: Good afternoon Chair Abreu  
12 and members of the Committee. I'm Valerie De La  
13 Rosa, Chair of Manhattan Community Board 2,  
14 testifying on behalf of the board. CB2 supports  
15 outdoor dining as a vibrant part of our streetscape  
16 but it must protect pedestrian safety, accessibility  
17 and the public realm that belongs to all New Yorkers.

18 Dining Out NYC is wildly successful in CB2. CB2  
19 has the highest number of roadway and sidewalk cafés,  
20 more than any other community district in all five  
21 boroughs. 30 percent of all cafés in Manhattan and  
nearly 20 percent across all five boroughs.

Regarding Intro. 655, which seeks to remove the  
seasonal ban on outdoor dining, we understand the  
Council's goal of supporting small businesses hurt by

2 costly tear down and storage requirements and the  
3 economic value. I do teach economics and I am an  
4 economist that outdoor dining brings.

5 And there's undoubtedly merit in reducing  
6 bureaucratic burden, however, sustaining roadway café  
7 structures through winter in lower Manhattan brings  
8 real infrastructure, sanitation and emergency access  
9 issues in narrow street segments like those in CB2.  
10 Regarding T2026, 1336, we are concerned about capping  
11 the clear path at a maximum of 8 feet.

12 Narrowing the clear path on the city's busiest  
13 sidewalks can impair safety and comfort for people  
14 walking, especially seniors, people with mobility  
15 challenges and families with children. Best  
16 practices for clear pedestrian space are outlined in  
17 NYC DOT's Pedestrian Mobility Plan and should not be  
18 compromised at the expense of accessibility for all  
19 in the name of simplification.

20 I see I have about 20 seconds. Our community's  
21 experience shows that seasonally managed roadway  
allows for essential street maintenance, snow  
removal, deep cleaning and avoids structures becoming  
de facto storage. We urge the Council to adopt  
reforms that expand outdoor dining opportunities in

2 the areas where participation by operators is low.  
3 As I mentioned, we have the highest number of cafés  
4 in all of New York City. Thank you so much.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you, next.

6 MAX BOOKMAN: Good afternoon. My name is Max  
7 Bookman, I am Legislative Counsel to the New York  
8 City Hospitality Alliance, which is the largest  
9 industry trade association in the five boroughs for  
10 our all important bar and restaurant industry. On  
11 behalf of our Board of Directors, our Executive  
12 Director Andrew Regie, I want to thank Speaker Menin,  
13 Council Member Restler, Chair Abreu for today's  
14 outdoor dining bills, which our industry strongly  
15 supports. Outdoor dining is extremely popular with  
16 New Yorkers and those who visit our city. When  
17 Speaker Menin shared an oversight of DOTs current  
18 outdoor dining program last year, however, it made  
19 public that something we in the industry have already  
20 known, which is that the current program is failing  
21 the five boroughs and must be fixed.

Before COVID, outdoor dining participation was at  
about 1,400 businesses, almost entirely concentrated  
in Manhattan. During the COVID era, that exploded to  
13,000 bars and restaurants. It was a vibrant

2 program across the five boroughs, which showed that  
3 when you lower cost, process and paperwork barriers,  
4 participation skyrockets.

5 The current post COVID program, based on our  
6 estimates, is back down to roughly 3,000  
7 participating businesses and we expect it to drop  
8 even further as more businesses drop out of the  
9 program because they're dismayed with it. This is a  
10 failure by any metric. Not only is the program  
11 failing bars and restaurants, it's failing restaurant  
12 workers and failing the public.

13 The key to improving the program is the Speaker  
14 and Council Member Restler's bill to return clear  
15 path to 8 feet or 50 percent, whichever is wider.  
16 This is returning to a standard that had been in  
17 place for almost 40 years. This is a tried and true  
18 metric that is easy to administer and we're really  
19 disappointed to hear that the Mamdani Administration  
20 today has basically joined the Adams Administration  
21 in objecting to it. We do not support and we were  
really surprised by the current set of clear path  
requirements which is not in the legislation. This  
is something that DOT surprised us with in rule  
making. We had been assured that there would not be

2 a reduction in sidewalk café footprint but we're  
3 turning to this old rule.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Wrap up.

5 MAX BOOKMAN: If we're turning to this tried and  
6 true rule would allow us to have the proper sidewalk  
7 café footprint that some businesses have had for 40  
8 years. Thank you very much.

9 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much. My last  
10 two panelists handwrite their speeches. That's very  
11 impressive. I don't think folks do that anymore.  
12 Thank you very much for testifying.

13 MAX BOOKMAN: Thanks for noticing.

14 VALERIE DE LA ROSA: And on a legal pad.

15 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And on the legal pads, I love  
16 that. I used to have one of those legal pads too.  
17 Alright, I'm going to recognize Council Member Farah  
18 Louis who has joined us and this panel is excused.  
19 Thank you very much.

20 MAX BOOKMAN: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: The next panel is Eric  
McClure, Lisa Daglian, Ahmed, Pauline Barkin, and  
Elizabeth Adams. You may begin when you are ready  
and remember to press the button.

2 AHMED RAZIN: Good afternoon Chair Abreu and  
3 members of the City Council. My name is Ahmed Razin.  
4 I am a Brooklyn resident and a student at Pacific  
5 College. My bicycle is my primary mode of transport  
6 for school, work, and my social life. I am here  
7 because while New York has expanded its bike network,  
8 we cannot confuse coverage with quality. A bike lane  
9 that is consistently blocked is not a lane, it's a  
10 trap. Crucial pathways like Dekalb and Lafayette  
11 Avenues are the life blood of the Brooklyn cycling  
12 network. Yet, on these corridors, the safety  
13 promised to us on paper vanishes in person. In  
14 downtown Brooklyn alone, data shows an average of  
15 over 450 illegally parked cars daily on streets like  
16 Adams Street and Dekalb Avenue.

17 When a vehicle double parks, it forces me into a  
18 leap frog maneuver swerving into high speed traffic  
19 and risking my life on roads never designed for  
20 shared use. We have the laws but they lack teeth to  
21 protect us. To solve this, I'm calling on the  
Committee to enforce the New York City Streets Plan  
and pass Intro. 0607 to move parking enforcement out  
of NYPD and into a dedicated DOT enforcement unit.  
We need agents whose primary mission is transitful

2 not professional courtesy for play card holders and  
3 prioritize daylighting to mandate the removal of  
4 parking within 20 feet of intersections on corridors  
like Dekalb.

5 Uhm, we need - we don't just need more lanes, we  
6 need lanes that work. So, our lives depend on the  
7 quality and foundation of these designs and help move  
these bills out of the Committee and into the floor.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much.

9 LISA DAGLIAN: Hi, good afternoon. I'm Lisa  
10 Daglian and I'm the Executive Director of the  
11 Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA,  
PCAC. We're the official voice of riders created by  
12 the New York State legislature and we include the New  
13 York City Transit Riders Council. We have a  
14 non-voting seat on the MTA Board and we're working  
15 very hard to make sure that that strong voice gets a  
vote one of these days as well.

16 Thank you very much for holding this hearing  
17 today. I thought that this morning's conversation  
18 with DOT was particularly interesting. I was  
19 thrilled to hear you talk about BRT. We just  
20 released a report on BRT that we'd love to share with  
you. We were so excited to see that you were on site

2 at some of the places that we called out and we have  
3 some specific recommendations for implementation in  
4 the city.

5 In fact, my staff was meeting with the MTA today  
6 to talk about how we could potentially make that  
7 happen on a couple of specific corridors.

8 We firmly believe that buses are the engine of  
9 opportunity for the two million people who ride them  
10 every day and they deserve the smoothest, fastest,  
11 trips possible. And the premise and promise of the  
12 Streets Plan was very exciting but obviously it  
13 didn't live up to its expectations.

14 I was kind of - well, I was totally surprised  
15 this morning to hear that the automatic camera  
16 enforcement counts towards a bus improvement lane.  
17 If that's what I actually heard. Now, we know that  
18 Ace does help to increase bus speeds by 5 percent or  
19 in some cases even more than that but I'm not sure  
20 that that counts as a bus lane.

21 I think that it is absolutely an improvement and  
we oppose some efforts that have been made to try and  
squash it in specific communities around the city.  
Once you open that door, it's very hard to close. We  
do urge the Mayor and the Council to work with you to

2 staff up. We think that that's particularly  
3 important as well.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We'll make sure to ask at the  
5 Preliminary Budget hearing, what the - you know what  
6 resources they plan on dedicating to realize all the  
7 amazing things that Council put out in 2019.

8 LISA DAGLIAN: And also Fair Fares. That's  
9 critically important too.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Eric.

11 ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you Majority Leader Abreu,  
12 Council Members. My name is Eric McClure, I'm the  
13 Executive Director of Streets PAC. When the Council  
14 passed the Streets Plan into law in 2019, many of us  
15 celebrated what promised to be a sea change for New  
16 York City Streets and Transportation systems. With  
17 its benchmarks for the creation of physically  
18 separated bike and bus lanes, upgraded intersections  
19 and bus stops, transit signal priority and new public  
20 plazas, the Streets Plan appeared truly  
21 transformative. The potential for that  
transformation however was largely squandered by the  
previous mayoral administration which failed by wide  
margins to meet many of the Streets Plans mandates.  
Installation of new protected bike lanes is like well

2 behind the annual requirement of 50 miles. The  
3 implementation of new bus lanes is fared just as  
4 badly. Whether the cause was mayoral indifference in  
5 adequate DOT staffing and outright hostility to the  
6 Streets Plans goals. The lack of progress has been  
7 deeply disappointing. That's not to say that  
8 progress hasn't been made in a number of places and  
9 in a number of important ways, but it's hard not to  
10 look at the Streets Plan glass as half empty rather  
11 than half full.

12 But elections bring change and change brings  
13 opportunity. Improved bus service to keep planks in  
14 Mayor Mamdani's electrical platform and he frequently  
15 arrived at campaign events by bike, bus or subway.  
16 Since his inauguration, the Mayor's been quick to  
17 revive the number of stalled street safety projects  
18 and his Administration appears poised to meaningfully  
19 increase capital in the operational funding for DOT.

20 Breathing new life into the Streets Plan and  
21 launching a truly ambitious next phase can firmly  
cement New York City as a leader among its peers and  
transforming the ways in which people get around and,  
to quote the Mayor, "make New York City streets the  
envy of the world."

2 With that in mind, we have a handful of  
3 recommendations and I'll just take these off very  
4 quickly. First, it's essential to fully staff and  
5 fund DOT to allow this work to move forward.

6 Secondly, while the Administration bears no fault for  
7 the failings of its predecessors, we need to play  
8 catch up wherever we can for the missed targets of  
9 the past.

10 Thirdly, not all bus lanes are created equal and  
11 the Administration should prioritize true bus rapid  
12 transit wherever possible. Fourth, we need to make  
13 sure that our network of protected bike lanes is  
14 fully connected. No system is any better than its  
15 weakest link.

16 And finally, we should set ambitious targets for  
17 results including implementation of secure bike  
18 parking facilities, 20 mile per hour speed limits,  
19 daylighting -

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Please wrap up.

21 ERIC MCCLURE: And I will just say in closing,  
uhm, it's also essential that the Council be a  
committed partner to the Streets Plan success. It's  
not enough to support meeting the benchmarks in other  
people's districts but we need a little bit in every

2 neighborhood. I will submit more detailed written  
3 testimony. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for that  
5 Kevin - Eric.

6 PAULINE BARKIN: Hello, I am Pauline Barkin. I  
7 live in Brooklyn in Flatbush and I'm a volunteer and  
8 activist with Transportation Alternatives. I very  
9 much support making our streets safer and improving  
10 our streets through the streets plan. It will not  
11 only make a meaningful impact on the quality of our  
12 life but it has the potential to save lives. You  
13 know and it's a win, win. It keeps bikes out of the  
14 way of cars and it keeps cars out of the way of  
15 bikes, right?

16 You know about a decade ago, I was bike riding  
17 before there were you know complete or even real bike  
18 lanes. Sandwiched between a taxi and a semi with  
19 just inches on either side and it was just pure luck  
20 that I ended up safe right? And this type of  
21 situation happens to thousands, countless, millions  
of New Yorkers you know who are at the mercy of our  
roads and providing a connected network will have a  
real impact and improve New York and make our city  
the envy of the world.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Next.

3 ELIZABETH ADAMS: Good afternoon. Thank you  
4 Chair and the Committee for holding today's hearing.  
5 My name is Elizabeth Adams at Transportation  
6 Alternatives. Like millions of New Yorkers, I am a  
7 bus rider, a bike rider, a transit user and a  
8 pedestrian. At TA we believe the greatest city in  
9 the world deserves the greatest streets in the world,  
10 and the streets plan is a key component of how we do  
11 that. It was passed by the Council to transform New  
12 York City Streets to make them safer, more equitable,  
13 and more accessible for everyone.

14 It set clear, measurable goals and created real  
15 accountability where far too long there had only been  
16 promises. And yet it was stalled in the last  
17 administration who took it as a mere suggestion  
18 rather than a legal mandate and that is why we're  
19 behind where we need to be right now on protected  
20 bike lanes and green ways, on dedicated bus ways, and  
21 on intersection redesigns like daylighting and  
critical safety improvements that New Yorkers were  
promised. We need urgent change and we need to bring  
the Streets Plan back to life.

2 Today, we are calling for two main things. One,  
3 for the city to catch up and make sure that the DOT  
4 has the funding and the resources they need to get  
5 the projects in the street on the ground now.

6 And two, to go further. If we want to make New  
7 York City Streets the envy of the world, we need the  
8 next phase of the Streets Plan, which is due this  
9 year to be bigger and bolder and go further.

10 That means an overhaul for faster buses, like  
11 BRT, no more gaps in our bike network, Sammy's law 20  
12 mile per hour zones across the city where plazas and  
13 open streets in every neighborhood and a fundamental  
14 shift away from car dependence as the default way to  
15 get around our streets.

16 We're heartened to hear that the Commissioner's  
17 commitment to ambitious Streets Plan metrics and  
18 while we support the call for focus on outcomes, it  
19 is important to be clear that these outcomes come  
20 from meeting mileage mandates when it comes to bus  
21 and bike lanes and pedestrian space. We can and must  
do both and I want to thank the Chair for  
acknowledging the accountability role required for  
this by the Council.

2 This Committee is also hearing a number of bills  
3 that we proudly support that I want to name quickly  
4 including just if I may, uh, 1338 by Council Member  
5 Restler which will bring back the needed one million  
6 square foot requirement for pedestrian space in the  
Streets Plan.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Please wrap up.

8 ELIZABETH ADAMS: Intro. 93 uhm by Council Member  
9 Brewer and the Open Streets, the outdoor dining  
10 restaurants. And just to say on the record,  
daylighting saves lives. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much. This  
12 panel is excused. I now have for the next panel Sara  
13 Lind, Cecil Brooks Jr., Zach Miller, Kevin Jones, and  
Alia Soomro. Sara, you may begin.

14 SARA LIND: Good afternoon. Thank you Chair  
15 Abreu for holding this hearing. My name is Sara Lind  
16 and I am the Co-Executive Director for Open Plans.  
An organization fighting for a more livable city.

17 The Streets Plan is an ambitious reimagining of  
18 our streetscape and while we are discouraged by the  
19 stalling of the plan in recent years, we're hopeful  
20 and excited for its completion and looking ahead to  
21 the release of the updated Streets Plan later this

2 year. There's opportunity for an even more ambitious  
3 expanded plan.

4 First, low traffic neighborhoods, areas with  
5 intentional street design to limit cut through  
6 traffic while keeping local access have shown to be  
7 effective around the world. The goal of five LTNs in  
8 each borough by 2030 should be included in the  
9 Streets Plan. LTNs would help reach a number of  
10 stated goals in the Streets Plan including increasing  
11 safety and accessibility for pedestrians and  
12 cyclists.

13 Second, expanding hardened daylighting with the  
14 goal of universality, should be a stated goal in the  
15 Streets Plan.

16 Daylighting is a proven safety measure that  
17 increases visibility at intersections, making them  
18 safer for pedestrians and drivers alike. And to this  
19 point, we urge the Council to consider and pass  
20 Intro. 511, which would mandate universal  
21 daylighting.

22 Third, DOT should create a vehicle miles traveled  
23 reduction goal of 40 percent in the Streets Plan.  
24 Many of the critical goals in the plan, for example,  
25 speeding up buses, are impossible to achieve without

2 reducing VMT. Other states like Minnesota have  
3 already passed similar legislation and New York City  
4 should be a leader in this space as well.

5 Finally, DOT should expand the Open Streets for  
6 schools, Full Closure School Streets Program due to a  
7 host of issues, including administrative capacity, a  
8 lack of involvement from DOE, and a lack of funding.  
9 The School Streets program isn't reaching its full  
10 potential.

11 With the Council's assistance in the budget  
12 process and with focused effort from DOT and  
13 coordination with DOE, the School Streets program  
14 could serve more kids citywide. These aren't pie in  
15 the sky ideas. They're continuations of the Streets  
16 Plans goals and we look forward to working alongside  
17 the Council and DOT to realize this potential. Thank  
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you.

20 CECIL BROOKS: Okay thank you. Happy National  
21 Coldcuts Day. National Moscow Mule Day, and National  
22 Nutrition Month for my fellow fruities in the  
23 nightlife world. My name is Cecil Brooks, a proud  
24 uptown resident and professional fruity who wants to  
25 see our city thrive.

2 As part of the Open Plan scene, we have long  
3 advocated for an outdoor dining program, which makes  
4 our streets as vibrant and delicious as possible.  
5 Intro. 655 makes great progress toward that goal.  
6 The last time you saw us, we were fresh off of our  
7 curbside restaurant week initiative where thousands  
8 of New Yorkers voted with their pocket books and  
9 their butts to sit in at world class dining  
10 establishment such as [INAUDIBLE 218:12} in the Upper  
11 East Side, Grand Army in Downtown Brooklyn, and  
12 Queens Borough in East Elmhurst. Unfortunately, this  
13 celebration could not offset tens of thousands in  
14 unnecessary costs that led to the very preventable  
15 closures of [INAUDIBLE 218:27] in Mount Haven,  
16 [INAUDIBLE 218:29] in Jackson Heights, and Hi Note in  
17 the East Village.

18 Intro. 655, can make the program better by  
19 protecting the right of the restaurant industry and  
20 many of our immigrant business owners to operate year  
21 around while making the application process more  
accessible.

19 We at Open Plans and the 10,000 dining  
20 establishments who have remained shut out of the  
21 process since the pandemic, look forward to working

2 with the Council to make our outdoor dining - our  
3 Dining Out New York City program as successful as  
4 possible.

4 Thank you very much.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I forgot for my government  
6 team to post on National Moscow Mule Day. I'll make  
7 sure to change that as a holiday on our calendar.  
8 Next.

8 ZACH MILLER: Thank you. Good afternoon Chair  
9 Abreu and Members of the Transportation and  
10 Infrastructure Committee. My name is Zach Miller and  
11 I serve as the Vice President of Government Affairs  
12 for the Trucking Association of New York.

12 Since the earliest days of the COVID-19 pandemic,  
13 the Trucking Industry has supported the expansion of  
14 outdoor dining whether on sidewalks or in roadway  
15 setups. We support our fellow small businesses, many  
16 of whom are customers in efforts that help them grow  
17 and enhance the neighborhood that we serve.

17 At the same time, we must be realistic about the  
18 day to day logistics required to service these  
19 businesses in an increasingly constrained curb  
20 environment.

2 A typical restaurant may receive multiple  
3 deliveries in a single day, such as produce,  
4 beverage, meats, linens and other supplies. Each  
5 vendor serves numerous establishments along  
6 commercial corridors every day and restaurants are  
7 not the only ones; retailers, pharmacies, medical  
8 offices, and other small businesses on the same block  
9 also depend on regular freight access.

10 None of them can operate without reliable  
11 deliveries. As the city builds out the permitting  
12 framework for outdoor dining, it is essential that  
13 curb space for commercial deliveries is part of the  
14 conversation. Truck access at the curb should be  
15 preserved, replaced, or newly created if space is  
16 removed. Equivalent access should be given  
17 thoughtfully integrated into the corridor planning.

18 And I do also want to just quickly touch on  
19 daylighting. The trucking association has been  
20 supportive of daylighting for some time you know  
21 publicly, vocally. Uhm, you know it does improve  
siteline, enhance safety for all road users,  
particularly the operators of larger and specialized  
vehicles, and safety improvements should not be you  
know unintentionally - you should not -

2 Let me try again. We do have some concerns about  
3 loss of curbspace with daylighting but typically we  
4 believe that it provides enough flexibility in the  
5 way it's designed, that it's something that overall  
6 our membership is really supportive of. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. Alia.

7 ALIA SOOMRO: Good afternoon. Is this - okay,  
8 it's on. My name is Alia Soomro and I am the Deputy  
9 Director for New York City policy at the New York  
10 League of Conservation Voters. Thank you Chair Abreu  
11 as well as members of the Committee on Transportation  
12 for the opportunity to testify today. I have  
13 submitted longer written comments.

14 NYLCV believes that all New Yorkers should have  
15 access to affordable, clean, sustainable modes of  
16 transportation to improve our city's air quality,  
17 combat climate change, and reduce congestion. NYLCV  
18 fully supported the passage of Local Law 195 in 2019,  
19 creating a Streets Master Plan every five years.

20 Although progress was slow when it came to  
21 implementing this plan during the last Admin. Going  
forward, we hope the Mamdani Administration fully  
funds and staff DOT to achieve the milestones  
mandated in the existing Streets Master Plan,

2 continues to restart long delayed bus and bike lane  
3 projects with an emphasis on increasing bus speeds  
4 and works toward publishing a comprehensive and bold  
5 vision of transit in streets in the upcoming 2026 New  
6 York City Streets Plan.

7 As we look to the next iteration of the plan, we  
8 hope the city works with the MTA to consider bus  
9 rapid transit for corridors with the highest  
10 aggregate bus ridership potentials, time savings and  
11 areas where current and future affordable housing  
12 developments will be built.

13 When it comes to cycling, we urge the city to  
14 continue working towards a comprehensive citywide bus  
15 network, and additionally, the Streets Plan should  
16 increase access to and improve safety for  
17 micromobility users. That includes more public  
18 charging stations and battery spots for e-bike and  
19 e-scooters.

20 The city must continue to prioritize Vision Zero.  
21 Relatedly, NYLCV strongly supports Intro. 511  
22 sponsored by Council Member Won, that's the  
23 daylighting bill. And then when it comes to the  
24 bills being considered today, NYLCV supports the

2 passage of Intro. 93, sponsored by Council Member  
3 Brewer in relation to bicycle parking stations.

4 Wrapping up, timely implementing the New York  
5 Streets Plan is more crucial than ever. We're you  
6 know seeing the federal government gut climate and  
7 environmental regulations, so local leadership is  
8 more important than ever and we look forward to  
9 working with the Council on that and going forward.  
10 Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Saved by the bell right  
12 there, that was great. Next.

13 KEVIN JONES: Great, thank you. Good afternoon  
14 to the Chair and to the members of the Committee. My  
15 name is Kevin Jones. I'm the Associate State  
16 Director for Advocacy at AARP New York, representing  
17 750,000 members across New York City and the more  
18 than 3.5 million adults age 50 and up across the five  
19 boroughs.

20 So, walkability is essential to life in New York  
21 City. Safe sidewalks, visible crosswalks,  
well-designed streets are all critical to a livable  
city that supports aging in place.

But too often that's not the reality.  
Pedestrians account for the majority of the traffic

2 fatalities citywide and one-third of those killed are  
3 over the age of 60.

4 Older adults are disproportionately victims of  
5 fatal crashes, many often facing mobility challenges,  
6 making cracked sidewalks and short cross times unsafe  
7 and really calling extra attention to the unsafe  
8 intersections that are daily hazards for our members.

9 Falls are the leading cause of injury related  
10 death among older adults and unsafe walking  
11 conditions increase that risk. The 2019 Master Plan  
12 set clear targets to expand protected bike lanes, bus  
13 lanes, pedestrian space and safer intersections. And  
14 while progress has been made, the DOT has fallen  
15 short of required benchmarks.

16 In 2026, the city must recommit to meeting and  
17 exceeding those goals. AARP's transportation  
18 priorities are simple, safer streets, better  
19 pedestrian infrastructure and reliable accessible  
20 transit options for people of all ages, especially  
21 older adults who rely heavily on walking and buses.  
The Streets Plan must prioritize intersection  
redesign, longer crossing times, daylighting, traffic  
calming and full implementation of 20 mile per hour  
zones under Sammy's Law.

2 Sidewalks must be maintained, pedestrians should  
3 be expanded and made permanent where possible. Oh,  
4 so you need pedestrian space. We also support a  
5 connected network of protected bike lanes that do not  
6 end abruptly and reduce conflict between the road  
7 users. Bus priority is critical as many older adults  
8 depend on buses as a daily lifeline and I also want  
9 to just emphasize that buses are our only fully  
10 accessible mode of transportation. I will submit a  
11 longer uhm, written testimony but thank you for your  
12 time.

13 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
14 testimony today. This panel is excused. I'm now  
15 calling on the next panel. A constituent of mine  
16 Mary Beth Kelly, Chauncy Young. My apologies if I  
17 didn't get your name right. Ligia Guallpa, Joshua  
18 Wood and Jeri Thompson.

19 Alright, alright, ready to go.

20 MARY BETH KELLY: Thank you. Can you hear me  
21 now? Okay, my thanks to you Chair Abreu and to the  
Council. I wish they were still here, however, I  
will proceed.

My name is Mary Beth Kelly and I am a Cofounder  
of Families for Safe Streets. An organization where

2 you don't belong unless you have lost a loved one to  
3 traffic violence or have been severely injured. My  
4 loss was my husband. This is the last family  
5 photograph that was taken of us as an intact family.

6 Uhm, this was a few months before he died. My  
7 son played soccer with our Mayor at the Bronx High  
8 School of Science and so, I've known our Mayor since  
9 the time he was 14. Not well but on the field and  
10 I'm thrilled that he is our new mayor and I'm also  
11 thrilled that he understands what a challenge it is  
12 that we have on our city streets because of the  
13 neglect for so many years of what would make 8  
14 million pedestrians safe when they are navigating our  
15 city. So, I have a few things to say. One is, I'm  
16 sorry our ultra marathoner isn't here right now. My  
17 husband was as well, he had run 29 consecutive New  
18 York City Marathons, most of them under three hours.  
19 I too was in a marathon but those were a long time  
20 ago.

21 As you can say, this work ages. Out here for 20  
years now. It was 2006 when he and I took a bike  
ride together. We had biked really all over the  
world with our kids, before our kids, after our kids,  
but a tow truck took a fast uhm, illegal turn into an

2 intersection and missed me but killed my husband.  
3 Not immediately, he died from injuries three days  
4 later.

5 Is my time up already? Oh my gosh.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'll let you wrap up.

7 MARY BETH KELLY: Thank you, okay. One thing I  
8 just want to say is for those who think that parking  
9 is in the bill of rights, ask yourself at the end of  
10 the day, would you rather say that you saved parking  
11 spots or saved lives? And I hope that will be  
12 communicated to my fellow Council Members. There's  
13 an organization nationwide for the highest in  
14 fellowship. It is made up of drivers who are killed  
15 unintentionally.

16 Their own grief, their guilt, their shame is  
17 profound. Of course these are the people who join  
18 this organization but it has thousands of members and  
19 some of them live here in New York City.

20 So, don't let that be you and don't let it happen  
21 because you thought a parking space was more  
important than saving a life.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Well, thank you so much and  
as your elected representative, I'm very, very proud

2 of you for lending your voice to this very important  
3 issue and I hope to make you proud as well.

4 CHAUNCY YOUNG: Good afternoon Chair Abreu and  
5 honored members of City Council. My name is Chauncy  
6 Young, a Bronx resident and coordinator of the Harlem  
7 River Coalition as well as Co-Chair for the New York  
8 City Greenway Coalition. We stand in support of the  
9 Streets Master Plan and the Greater Greenways Master  
10 Plan.

11 The New York City Greenways Coalition is a  
12 collective of Greenway aligned groups focused on the  
13 completion and continuing enhancement of an equitable  
14 greenway network of New York City.

15 We collectively advocated for the Comprehensive  
16 Greenway Master Plan and a complete multiuser bicycle  
17 and pedestrian network. Locally along the Harlem  
18 River for decades, our neighborhoods in the Bronx and  
19 upper Manhattan have been severed from our waterfront  
20 by Robert Moses and his car centered planning,  
21 including the Major Deacon and Cross Bronx  
Expressways, the Harlem River Drive, which isolated  
our neighborhoods and caused industrial neglect.

We are fighting to rectify this by completing a  
seven mile Harlem River Greenway in the Bronx

2 connecting Van Cortlandt Park with Randalls Island.

3 This is a matter of public health and equity. The

4 Bronx remains 62 out of 62 counties in New York

5 State. For health outcomes, our residents face

6 staggering rates of asthma and diabetes, active

7 transit, walking and cycling, as well as for

8 recreation is a proven prescription for these

9 disparities. However, our current streets prioritize

10 cars over people, creating a barrier to health.

11 Although it has been mentioned many times, if a

12 parent is terrified to let their child walk or bike

13 to school or a senior feels unsafe crossing to a

14 park, they will stay indoors. This lack of safe

15 infrastructure is a public health crisis. It is a

16 moral decision for New York City. A connected

17 bicycle and greenway network is not a luxury, it is a

18 moral obligation every community regardless of income

19 deserves clear and safe access to their parks and

20 waterfront infrastructure that protects life rather

21 than endangering it. A transportation network that

serves everyone, not just the privileged few. We

applaud the progress that has happened throughout New

York City but we cannot stop here. DOT remains far

2 behind its goal of 50 miles of protected bike lanes  
3 each year.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you.

5 JERI DENISE THOMPSON: Hello, good afternoon.

6 I'm Jeri. A little closer to the mic - there we go.

7 Alright, hi, I'm Jeri, this is my first time doing

8 something like this but uhm, I'm always telling

9 people your voice matters, so it makes sense that I

10 ended up here. So, my name is Jeri Denise Thompson,

11 a volunteer with One Fair Wage. I'm a Chef and a

12 Pastry Chef by trade but I left the industry to

13 pursue my art and music endeavors because the

14 industry was so unfair. I have a degree in baking in

15 pastry arts from CIA and I worked in the food and

16 beverage industry for 15 plus years in New Jersey,

17 New York, Connecticut and even Virginia. And I'm

18 here today to testify on behalf of the restaurant

19 workers and subminimum wage workers in New York. I

20 have a simple question. Do you actually care about

21 the tip workers as much as Donald Trump says he does?

Employees can't live on a subminimum wage. Workers

can't keep depending on tips alone. Trump won

millions of tip workers' votes with the slogan "no

2 tax on tips." Whatever you think of him, he looked  
3 at the subminimum wage workers and said, "I see you."

4 New York City can do better than just a slogan.  
5 Give us one fair wage. A full minimum wage with tips  
6 on top. If you are about to let restaurant owners  
7 take over public sidewalks and make more money off  
8 our very, very valuable labor, our underappreciated  
9 labor, the least you can do is make them pay a real  
10 wage. Show us, show me, show the world that you  
11 actually care.

12 Another thing that people should know about is  
13 being a tip worker is that when you pay - when your  
14 pay depends on tips, you are uhm - sorry. When your  
15 pay depends on tips, you put up the things that no  
16 one should have to put up with. I've been grabbed,  
17 I've been hit on, I've been talked about in ways I  
18 can't repeat here and I smile through because I  
19 didn't - because if I didn't, it would mean I will  
20 struggle to pay my bills. This is what this pay  
21 system does. It makes us choose between our dignity  
and our rent.

Now, you want to give restaurant workers -  
restaurant owners a new sidewalk, new table, more  
business.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much and I  
3 remind folks to stay on topic of the hearing topics  
4 for the day. Thank you. Thanks.

5 JOSHUA WOOD: My name is Josh Wood. I'm a  
6 working delivery cyclist speaking on behalf of Los  
7 Deliveristas UNIDOS and the New York City Bike  
8 Messenger Association.

9 Micromobility is the most efficient form of last  
10 mile delivery. 80,000 workers understand that a  
11 little bit every single day, delivering food,  
12 groceries, packages and more by ebikes, mopeds, bikes  
13 and e-cargo bikes. We are constantly risking our  
14 lives being shoehorned into infrastructure that was  
15 not designed around us. For too long, it means being  
16 ignored as workers continue to get hurt and killed on  
17 the job.

18 In the past year, the city has chosen to  
19 criminalize us with criminal summons for minor  
20 traffic violations, rather than reimagining the  
21 future of how street infrastructure can work for  
everyone.

What we need are initiatives like Intro. 093  
sponsored by CM Gale Brewer establishing bike parking  
spaces and corrals with a focus on commercial zones,

2 which is what we're going to be using the most. We  
3 understand that riding on sidewalks is a safety  
4 hazard. We also understand the difficulties of  
5 safely accessing storefronts and homes for our  
6 pickups and dropoffs, which are on the sidewalk,  
7 leaving the street through a small gap in between  
8 parked cars with fast moving cars honking behind us.  
9 Under time pressures from our apps and customers  
10 dozens of times per day.

11 The infrastructure must be comprehensive and  
12 widespread. While protected bike lanes are a great  
13 start and we encourage the city to build as many of  
14 them as we can, delivery workers do not always have  
15 the luxury of only sticking to bike networks.

16 The needs of a parent biking their kids to school  
17 and an e-cargo bike, each one of which is relieving  
18 the city of horrendous truck traffic are not  
19 necessarily going to be the same. They do not always  
20 need to share the same infrastructure. We call for  
21 an implementation of Sammy's Law. Lowering the speed  
limit and key rules to 20 miles per hour. This will  
pave the way for future dedicated micromobility lanes  
and align the felicity of our streets more closely  
with the most advanced cities of the world. Cars and

2 trucks can share the road with all the other people  
3 who need to use them. We call for daylighting  
4 intersections, hardened infrastructure and other  
5 traffic calming measures.

6 While we understand the complexities behind road  
7 safety conversations, it hurts to see my comrades get  
8 demonized in the public discourse as reckless on the  
9 roads and occupying too much space for loading on the  
10 sidewalk. We are essential workers simply trying to  
11 make it through our shift.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much for your  
13 testimony. Ligia.

14 LIGIA GUALLPA: Yeah, thank you so much Chair for  
15 the opportunity to testify today. My name is Ligia  
16 Guallpa, I'm the Executive Director of the Workers  
17 Justice Project, which is a Los Deliveristas UNIDOS  
18 representing 80,000 app delivery workers. I'm here  
19 in the strong support of Intro. 093, sponsored by  
20 Council Member Gale Brewer to expand the bicycle  
21 station program, particularly along the commercial  
22 corridors. Delivery workers are the backbone of New  
23 York City as you heard from my comrade here who does  
24 delivery work, completing nearly 2.7 million  
25 deliveries per week. Bringing food, groceries,

2 medicines to New Yorkers, even during snow storms  
3 like we just had recently.

4 Over the past five years, delivery workers have  
5 won significant labor rights protections but they are  
6 not enough, yet the lack of critical bike  
7 infrastructure such as, secured parking, protected  
8 bike lanes, e-bike charging stations continues to  
9 fuel the street safety crisis affecting all of us.  
10 Street safety is the top priority of delivery  
11 workers, who are the ones being injured and killed at  
12 the highest rate in our city.

13 We look forward to working with the Council uhm  
14 and DOT to redesign and reimagine what our streets  
15 could look like for bike users and also for 80,000  
16 app delivery workers who ride across the city  
17 delivering central goods to New Yorkers. Our city  
18 streets crisis persists because of the lack of  
19 infrastructure and really hasn't really followed the  
20 pace of the rise of e-bikes and also delivery  
21 business models that prioritizes the speed over  
profit, over safety.

Companies like Uber, Doordash, they relied on  
opaque algorithms that pressure delivery workers to  
move faster disregarding their own safety and public

2 safety. E-bikes are not just tools for work, they  
3 are essential, affordable, and environmental,  
4 sustainable transportation options for working class  
5 New Yorkers. If the city is serious about reducing  
6 congestion, pollution, traffic debts, e-bikes must be  
7 part of that solution.

8 We look forward to working and reimagining what  
9 true e-bike infrastructure could look like for all  
10 New Yorkers.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much Ligia.  
12 This panel is excused. Next, we have Eric Huntley,  
13 Shanequa Lewis, Giovanni Uribe, Rayan Palumbo, and  
14 Russell Jackson and Steve Flack.

15 You may begin.

16 SHANEQUA LEWIS: Hi, my name is Shanequa Lewis.  
17 I'm a New York City resident. I'm a community  
18 activist and leader. I'm here today with One Fair  
19 Wage. I have a lot of loved ones in the restaurant  
20 industry and I've seen first hand the effects working  
21 for tips.

Instead of a fair wage and with these tips income  
have done to a lot of people. We have a lot of  
responsibilities, a lot of things, upkeep in our  
daily lives, such as rent is the same every month

2 right and it's hard to pay your rent when your income  
3 is not stable. When you work for tips, you never  
4 know what you're going to make. A slow night, a bad  
5 table, a rain storm, anything can really wreck your  
6 day, wreck your week, cause depression, cause any  
7 setbacks, especially when you're trying to care for  
8 yourself, care for your loved ones.

9 And then that means you can't plan, you can't  
10 save. It's hard to budget because you never know  
11 what you're going to make. There's no promise,  
12 there's no guarantee.

13 Outdoor dining adds another inconsistency because  
14 when it rains, when a patio clears out, everything  
15 that's unpredictable just adds onto more uncertainty  
16 and it affects the people that work for tips because  
17 if it's cold and people don't sit outside, you don't  
18 get any customers.

19 The tips drop and there's nothing you can really  
20 do about it. So, if you're about to make outdoor  
21 dining a permanent part of the city, that means more  
tip workers' income is going to depend on the  
weather, if the sun comes out, if it's adjustable, if  
the temperature is comfortable. So, if outdoor  
dining is here to stay, one fair wage needs to be

2 here to stay with it so that a real wage - it could  
3 be a real wage that workers can count on no matter  
4 the uncertainty. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much. Next.

6 ERIC HUNTLEY: Good afternoon Council. Uhm, my  
7 name is Eric from Brushwick, New York. I've been a  
8 server for over 30 years in Bushwick and let me tell  
9 you what outdoor dining expansion means for me. More  
10 tables, more customers, longer shifts, same wage. We  
11 can't keep living like this. You can't ask us to  
12 rely on tips as a whole paycheck. What you're voting  
13 on today is giving restaurant owners public  
14 sidewalks, space that belongs to all of us, so they  
15 can make more money. That's a huge benefit for them.  
16 If you're going to give them public space to grow  
17 their business, make them pay their workers one fair  
18 wage. That's all we are asking. More business for  
19 them should not mean the same poverty wages for us.  
20 One fair wage. Thank you very much Council.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Appreciate the testimony,  
next.

RAYAN SEMERY-PALUMBO: Thank you for your time  
and for considering. My name is Rayan  
Semery-Palumbo. I'm an economist and I support One

2 Fair Wage. Using public space to expand your  
3 business is a privilege. It's not a right. No other  
4 industry in the city gets to use public space and we  
5 should reserve that privilege for the businesses that  
6 best care for our community, starting with the  
workers that serve in them.

7 We know what happened the last time the city  
8 expanded outdoor dining without that condition.  
9 Restaurants set up sheds on our sidewalks and grew  
10 their businesses but the workers inside couldn't even  
access unemployment insurance.

11 Two-thirds were told that their subminimum wages  
12 were too low and their tips didn't count toward the  
13 calculation of unemployment benefits. So, they were  
14 forced back to work before it was safe while the CDC  
15 named restaurants the most dangerous place for adults  
16 to be in. Women were told to remove their masks so  
17 customers can judge their looks and tip accordingly.  
18 And during COVID, as many as 12,000 restaurant  
19 workers died. 1.2 million left the industry and New  
20 York lost more restaurant workers than any state in  
21 the country. One in five workers left the industry  
in New York State.

2 This is what happened - this is what outdoor  
3 dining looked like under subminimum wage and we  
4 should not repeat that. Today, tipped restaurant  
5 workers are the only workers left in this entire  
6 state still paid a subminimum wage and the median  
7 tipped worker in New York City earns less than  
8 \$24,000 a year, which is less than half what it costs  
9 to live here.

10 If the city is going to grant restaurants a  
11 privilege that no other businesses receive, those  
12 restaurants should meet the standard every other  
13 business already meets, a full minimum wage.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you for your testimony.  
15 Next.

16 GIOVANNIE URIBE: Hi, I guess uhm, to make this  
17 short and clear, I am Giovannie. I am a restaurant  
18 worker, 20 plus years in the industry. I don't know  
19 where all the Council Members went, so I guess just  
20 you Councilman Abreu.

21 Uh, I uhm fully support the expansion of outside  
seating, sidewalk seating or whatever you call it but  
I do believe we should be - a fair minimum wage  
should be attached to this uhm permit, licensing and  
I just grew grew without my folks that are here that

2 you know we can't ever plan. Rent stays the same.

3 We can never budget. Uhm, so I'd like to encourage

4 that the Council really takes into consideration that

5 the worker is affected as well. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you, next.

7 STEVE FLACK: Hello, Steve Flack, friendly

8 neighborhood loud mouth. Growing up in Brooklyn, the

9 street in front of my home was a collective third

10 space for our community. A place where we learned to

11 ride bikes, have block parties and where spontaneous

12 games of whiffle ball could break out.

13 The call of a car alerting our friends of the

14 occasional driver coming through was a hallmark of

15 our afternoons but that joy has been stolen from us

16 by the ramping growth of car culture. In the biggest

17 city with America's greatest public transportation

18 system, the streets are the implied property of the

19 private car, causing environmental, financial, mental

20 and physical harm to our neighbors. That is why I am

21 calling on the City Council and the Mayor to

implement a Streets Plan that works for all New

Yorkers, not just the entitled motorists who believe

the streets belong to them free of charge. We

2 deserve protected bike lanes that connect citywide to  
3 bolster green transportation.

4 We deserve loading zones and delivery microhubs  
5 to aid our changing economy. We deserve green  
6 pedestrian plazas, busing open streets and a year  
7 long outdoor dining program where communities can  
8 gather and local businesses can thrive. We deserve a  
9 citywide implementation of Sammy's Law and universal  
10 daylighting at every corner, so the most vulnerable  
11 New Yorkers don't have to worry about being another  
12 statistic in the growing number of traffic  
13 fatalities. And we need to implement it all before  
14 another life is lost, not after.

15 And most importantly, we need to follow through  
16 on Mayor Mamdani's goal of faster buses throughout  
17 New York City. No longer should the bus rider be  
18 considered a second class citizen. We deserve a  
19 connected system of dedicated and protected bus lanes  
20 throughout all five boroughs, so everyone can see  
21 what the children - what our children see, the joy of  
riding a New York City bus.

I look forward to a New York City Streetscape  
that works for all and finally vanishes the ghost of  
Robert Moses out of the Greatest City in the World.

2 Over my last 20 seconds, I'm a restaurant eater.  
3 I do not like the tipping system either and I just  
4 want to make sure you guys are paid a fair minimum  
5 wage because I don't want to run their books. Thank  
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much for your  
8 testimony. This panel is excused. Next up we have  
9 Charles Diamond, Mylinda Lee, Sandra Rayburn, Matthew  
10 Robinson, and Ned Shalanski.

11 Is Carol here? I'll just have you go because I  
12 think we have an empty seat now. Carol, that's you.  
13 Yes, come on down. No, you're okay, you may proceed.

14 CHARLES DIAMOND: Thank you so much Majority  
15 Leader and Chair Abreu. My name is Charles Diamond.  
16 I'm speaking in my personal capacity but I worked as  
17 an attorney for the city for ten years in various  
18 capacities, including particularly regarding  
19 revocable consents. Of which, outdoor dining is one.  
20 There's a couple of thoughts I wanted to pick up on  
21 that your colleagues had raised. I think very, very  
significantly about how do we deal with bad actors.  
If we're opening up the outdoor dining legislation  
that was created, we need to look at 19-160.5. That  
is enforcement right? So, we're talking about how do

2 I deal with all of these different things? That  
3 section of the Admin Code, which is in the power of  
4 the Council to alter right? A lot of the problem  
5 with the DOT rules but what can the Council do?

6 We can look at that section to make enforcement  
7 more real. Right now, a condition, a negative  
8 condition of any kind, any kind has to be formally  
9 noticed by the DOT. So what, that's going to be  
10 several months after you call it in. They're going  
11 to take formal notice of it. They've investigated  
12 it. They sent an inspector out. We saw it then  
13 there's a required 30 day period to do a corrective  
14 action plan.

15 All this sounds great. All of this sounds  
16 fantastic but in the case of a genuinely bad actor,  
17 they're going to be able to go months and months and  
18 months and months and on their maximum violation they  
19 can receive is \$500. I think the last panel spoke  
20 about the fact of - we are giving public land to a  
21 private business to make more money. That might be a  
good idea but we're giving them less enforcement and  
less outcomes and less consequences than for their  
use of their own land.

2 So, we need to look at the enforcement. That  
3 section, I would advise if we're looking at this  
4 again for 655, for all of the different uhm, bills  
5 that are looking at outdoor dining? Let's take this  
6 time, work with DOT, to look at enforcement, how we  
7 can make it more realistic because that's the  
8 problem. We got the burdens wrong last time, partly  
9 because of DOT rule making that made getting the  
10 license almost impossible, very administratively  
11 burdensome but once you get it, it's very hard to do  
12 anything about it.

13 So, I would urge us to flip that. We'll look at  
14 that as part of this process, really look at that  
15 section .5, the area where it deals with enforcement.  
16 Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much. Next.

18 MYLINDA LEE: Good afternoon. It started out to  
19 be good morning on my notes uhm and I guess I'm here  
20 as a representative as a non-paid, non-lobbiest, for  
21 old people. I'm 81 and I'm annoyed by the pretext  
that this Committee and the absence of these Council  
Members and the disappearance of DOT for the  
opportunity to listen to real people and to listen to  
a non-paid lobbyist - advocate. It's insulting.

2 So, as far as the 655 and 628, this is not about  
3 charming café tables. It's about taking public  
4 streets and public sidewalks and residential piece  
5 year round and handing them to one industry that has  
6 already been massively subsidized and deregulated.

7 And as you noted, where has enforcement been?  
8 For years now residents like me have endured lasting  
9 music, all hours noise, crowd spillover, blocked  
10 sidewalks, crummy Council Members and I filed 311  
11 complaints. Nothing. NYPD, nothing. DOT, nothing.  
12 Where's our help? Where's our enforcement? You  
13 can't enforce it permanently. If you can enforce it,  
14 you have no business expanding it.

15 Finally, how about introducing non-paid lobbying  
16 organizations like the EV Safety Alliance who will  
17 tell you about the terror and the harm and I can tell  
18 you about the deaths of e-vehicle deliveristas and  
19 others who have killed people, old people, young  
20 people. This is an inequitable hearing because if  
21 you talk about safety, you have to talk about  
e-vehicles and Pricilla's Law. This is nonsense and  
if you want to talk about restaurant sheds, you  
should be talking to [INAUDIBLE 253:55] and the group  
that have been besieged by this nonsense. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you for your testimony,  
3 next.

4 CAROL PUTTRE-CRYZ: Hello, my name is Carol  
5 Puttre-Cryz.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Turn the mic on please.  
7 Thank you.

8 CAROL PUTTRE-CRYZ: Okay.

9 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You may restart. You may  
10 restart it.

11 CAROL PUTTRE-CRYZ: My name is Carol Puttre-Cryz  
12 and I'm here for the East 5th Street Block  
13 Association. I'd like to know if any of the City  
14 Council members who are in favor of year round dining  
15 sheds actually live upstairs from a restaurant with  
16 these sheds. I'm sure not because if they did, they  
17 would never want to subject themselves 12 months a  
18 year to the noise, trash and rat infestation these  
19 sheds bring.

20 The noise from a full house of shed diners rises  
21 up and is formatable. It gets louder as the dinner  
time progresses into the late night hours and as more  
alcohol is consumed. Add to that the outdoor music,  
which I know is prohibited but it happens anyway.  
Calling 311 is useless for ten minutes after the

2 police leave, the music is back. Who will monitor  
3 this noise? The local police have enough on their  
4 hands already.

5 And in the apartments upstairs from these dining  
6 sheds, the noise is unbearable. It is impossible to  
7 watch and hear TV and forget about sleeping until the  
8 restaurant closes. In addition, during the three to  
9 four months of freezing weather, the sheds will be  
10 unused. Really, who would want to sit outside in 20  
11 degree weather even with a space heater when you have  
12 indoor dining and what wait staff would want to serve  
13 outside during these cold months. These shelters  
14 will become homeless encampments, trash dumping  
15 grounds and rat infestations. Added to that, where  
16 will the snow plows put the plowed snow after storms.

17 With lanes filled with bus lanes, bike lanes and  
18 dining sheds, there's maybe one left. One left over  
19 for the plowed snow. Great, one lane of traffic  
20 going South on Second Avenue leading to the  
21 Williamsburg, Brooklyn and Manhattan bridges during  
rush hour.

Please do not listen to the well paid restaurant  
lobbyists. This is not Paris. COVID is over. Do

2 the right thing for the residents of our city. Vote  
3 no on year round dining sheds. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much for your  
5 testimony.

6 CAROL PUTTRE-CRYZ: And I'd just like to say,  
7 it's pretty disheartening to only have three Members  
8 of the City Council here. We waited four hours to  
9 speak. That's it.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Next.

11 MATTHEW ROBINSON: Hello, yes, okay my name is  
12 Matthew Robinson. I live in Chelsea and I've been  
13 going to Community Board 4 meetings a lot. One thing  
14 that I want to say is as far as the dining sheds or  
15 the dining corrals and it being 12 months of the  
16 year. We have said no, emphatically said no to that.  
17 That 9 months is enough.

18 Like everyone else who has preceded me has said,  
19 is that, it is snowing, it is cold, it is not being  
20 used. It's used as a dumping area. It's an area for  
21 rats to be underneath. So, during that time, if that  
22 corral were not there, uhm, that could be an area  
23 where you could shovel the snow away from the curb,  
24 away from the corner, and as far as the laws in terms  
25 of snow removal, snow redistributing, it's horrible.

2 You can maybe the roadbeds are nice and clean. The  
3 sidewalks are not. There's no enforcement of snow in  
4 terms of the sidewalk. Once you get to the corner,  
5 you then - you have the avalanche of dealing with the  
6 piles of snow and you can't even cross the crosswalk.

7 As far as streetlight design, as someone had  
8 mentioned earlier, you have to think of when there's  
9 foliage and when there's not. When there's foliage,  
10 the light has to be lower. When it doesn't matter  
11 when there is no foliage.

12 So, I'm against 24/7. I agree with everyone else  
13 that it is a land grab. That it is an industry that  
14 doesn't need it. Uh, that Grub Hub is enough to  
15 support them and give them additional things. Also,  
16 in terms of the bike lane, the bike lane is not being  
17 enforced in terms of drivers going in the right  
18 direction. They are going every direction but the  
19 right direction and they are doing it on the  
20 sidewalks and that should be enforced.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
testimony, next.

NED SHALANSKI: My name is Ned Shalanski and I am  
a licensed landscape architect with over 17 years  
experience designing New York City public spaces.

2 Currently I design public parks for the City Parks  
3 Department, Council Members. It's a pleasure to  
4 design green spaces in your districts.

5 I'm also a resident of the Lower East Side. The  
6 vibrance wording I hear so often connected with  
7 roadway dining means for residents, constant noise,  
8 crowds, and less livable streets.

9 It is vexing to me that I should have to defend  
10 my neighbors and I from City Council, greenlighting  
11 beer gardens outside our windows that operate loudly  
12 late into the evening. That Council Member Restler  
13 should propose this environmental transformation be  
14 made year around is not only out of touch with every  
15 day New Yorkers quality of life, it demands a  
16 thorough public EIS.

17 I love this city and just like you, I want to see  
18 it flourish. Years of evidence shows that  
19 restaurants have not, cannot mitigate the downsides  
20 of year around street eateries. DOT cannot safely  
21 maintain its current portfolio of operations, let  
alone an expanded portfolio of thousands of  
independent restaurants, operating individual roadway  
setups. Dodging waiters and diners as they cross

2 bike lanes to street eateries is not safer for me as  
3 a bicyclist.

4 City Council should not be governing according to  
5 hypotheticals or private profit led promises. The  
6 current seasonal program is already more than  
7 generous to restaurants. Year round roadway dining  
8 is a square peg in a round hole and deep down, I  
9 think we all know this.

10 Intro. 655 represents the privatization and the  
11 entertainmentization of a significant swath of a  
12 public space within our city. If DOT and City  
13 Council want a successful outdoor dining program,  
14 it's careful cityled planning initiatives, not the  
15 inshrining of at hoc pandemic era rules by industry  
16 insiders. Contrary to the Hospitality Alliance,  
17 Transal, Open Plans, NYC and others, street eateries  
18 are not unanimously popular. New York City  
19 residents, especially families, deserve a better,  
20 fair, restful post pandemic reality, reasonableness  
21 and not the prevailing wish list that special  
interest groups ought to prevail.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
testimony and thank you for this panel. It is  
excused.

2 Next, we have Yosef Meltzer, Vianna Vang Olsen,  
3 Liam Jefferies, Andrew Paulsen and Joe Cianci. Am I  
4 mispronouncing that?

5 Thank you so much. Alright, I just want to make  
6 sure I have a full panel, so we'll see how many after  
7 folks come up. Excuse me, are you on this panel, the  
8 folks standing up? Nope. Yosef Meltzer. Vianna?  
9 No Vianna? Vianna had to leave, okay. Liam  
10 Jeffries. Okay, Andrew Paulsen and you're Joe, okay.  
11 You may begin.

12 YOSEF MELTZER: Hey, I'm Yosef. I'm here in my  
13 capacity as a lover of nice things. Specifically,  
14 I'm very excited about the new Streets Plan, however,  
15 I think it's important to look back, see what  
16 happened with the last Streets Plan and then kind of  
17 iterate going forward.

18 Specifically when we talk about how many miles of  
19 bike lanes we want to put in, looking at the biggest  
20 impediment to what happened before, which is for each  
21 mile of bike lane that we need to put in, DOT needs  
22 to do like multi-million dollar traffic studies.  
23 Sometimes it will take like years to get back and  
24 then it has to go through a community board process,  
25 which are I think instruments for outrage to say the

2 least and people like me will go but that's because  
3 there's something severely wrong with me. You know  
4 there's like, each argument is like there's going to  
5 be traffic everywhere. Everybody is going to go out  
6 of business. Everybody is going to die. And so, we  
7 kind of have the structure to - like to impede the  
8 speed of how quickly we get these bike lanes in. I  
9 think you mentioned before you had just recently been  
10 to Buenos Aires. I spent, you know, multiple months  
11 there recently and it's actually incredible.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Don't get me started.

13 YOSEF MELTZER: It is - they live in the good  
14 place. Anyway, uhm, they did most of their bike  
15 lanes and pedestrian infrastructure in an incredibly  
16 short amount of time. They actually used to be  
17 really car oriented and I think even today they have  
18 the widest urban boulevard in the world. So, just  
19 kind of looking at what they do differently than what  
20 we do. I think one of the biggest differences is the  
21 traffic studies. How long and expensive they are.  
Like we kind of almost uniquely do that and just as  
someone who wants this to get done in my lifetime, I  
would hope that maybe we would take a look at those  
processes. Thank you for your time.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Next.

3 LIAM JEFFRIES: Hello, good afternoon. I thank  
4 Council Member Menin, Transportation Chair Abreu, and  
5 the other members of the Transportation Committee for  
6 this hearing. My name is Liam Jeffries, I am a  
7 lifelong New Yorker and upper east sider and I'm here  
8 to express my strong support for the Streets Plan. I  
9 am in many parts of the city regularly, both in  
10 Manhattan and the outer boroughs and a major lying  
11 throughout my travels is my feeling the safest as a  
12 pedestrian, cyclist, and transit user in places that  
13 are designed to - that are designed from the outset  
14 to fully account for my needs as a street user, as  
15 opposed to making them an afterthought.

16 I say this as someone on the receiving end of  
17 several harry incidents with bad drivers as a  
18 pedestrian and cyclist. For a city as reliant on  
19 non-car infrastructure as we are, it is remarkable  
20 just how little our streets are designed to reflect  
21 this fact. And while efforts to address this  
disparity do exist and now produce some really great  
projects. I am a very enthusiastic user of the Third  
Avenue bus and bike lanes on the East Side. These  
still aren't nearly enough to fully meet the scale of

2 the safety crisis facing New York pedestrians and  
3 cyclists daily.

4 It's a welcomed relief to see the Mamdani  
5 Administration take seriously again a plan that for  
6 specific and more reasons too innumerable to count  
7 should have never been stuck in limbo in the first  
8 place.

9 I heavily encourage this Administration to do  
10 everything they can to meet their legal and moral  
11 obligations under this plan. This includes fully  
12 funding DOT so that there's no ambiguity as to if the  
13 plan woefully happen and this includes actually  
14 implementing Sammy's Law around school zones like we  
15 were promised years ago and like it was written to do  
16 and not only using it for - as justification for  
17 rules that fly in the face of what Sammy's Law was  
18 meant to do and accomplish in the first place.

19 It's heartening to see the city treat this crisis  
20 with urgency and I have heavily encourage them to  
21 follow through on their promises. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. Cianci.

JOE CIANCI: Cianci.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Cianci. My apologies.

2 JOE CIANCI: It's okay. Yeah, my name is Joe. I  
3 am a lifelong cyclist. I also deliver food and I can  
4 tell you right now that protected bike lanes, they're  
5 dangerous because it seems like they only protect the  
6 rights for delivery workers and city bike riders to  
7 speed on because right now e-bikes they can go as  
8 fast as cars. They can go 25, 30 miles an hour and  
9 especially since they widened them from the first  
10 Streets Master Plan, uh apparently it's basically it  
11 gives them more of an opportunity to go the wrong  
12 way. It gives them more room to go the wrong way and  
13 stuff and also uh, uhm, uh Open Streets, outdoor  
14 dining, that's not transportation. That has nothing  
15 to do with transportation at all, especially Open  
16 Streets since they're closed streets. It's closed to  
17 traffic so it's anti-transportation and watching DOT  
18 testimony earlier, it seems like they don't even have  
19 confidence in their master plan and plans for the  
20 future because they don't have any money. They  
21 couldn't even give you a budget estimate. Even five  
years from now, yeah roll your eyes probably because  
you need money to like do all this. And uhm, you  
know and - and - uh, this is my legal pad by the way.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I like it. I like it.

2 JOE CIANCI: Yeah, the thing is you know and also  
3 it was reported recently that it's going to cost \$158  
4 million to like make six blocks. Like, it's sort of  
5 a public realm in the finite district. I mean, how  
6 are you going to do that with no money at all? I  
7 mean, especially and also the streets. The streets  
8 over the city are in disrepair from this winter.  
9 There's potholes everywhere, there's cracks  
10 everywhere. It looks like missiles hit it and the  
11 thing is like the money should go to that before the  
12 Open Streets - before any streets master plan but  
13 that should be the Streets Master Plan. Take care of  
14 the streets now instead of reimagining the streets.

15 And also, uhm, and also one more thing. This -  
16 you know this is New York City, not New York Realm  
17 and the Department of Transportation, not the  
18 Department of Transportation Alternatives because  
19 they are way too regulatory captured and this is what  
20 happens when -

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Please wrap up.

22 JOE CIANCI: This is what happens when agencies  
23 are run by ideologs.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
3 testimony and we appreciate the diversity of opinion  
4 in this Committee.

5 JOE CIANCI: It's not an opinion. It's not Mr.  
6 Abreu. In fact, you should change this because you  
7 engaged in a protest with them, in a rally with them.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I saw you outside earlier. I  
9 will next call on Kathy Morano, Michele Campo,  
10 Augustine Hope, Evan Sweet, and Sproule Love. My  
11 apologies if I'm butchering the pronunciation of your  
12 name.

13 Seeing that we have one empty chair, I'm going to  
14 call Daniel Bush. Is Daniel here or Bash? Not  
15 seeing Danny, I want to call someone else to come up,  
16 Norma Cote. Come on up Norma.

17 Alright, you may begin.

18 AUGUSTINE HOPE: Thank you very much. My name is  
19 Augustine Hope. I am President of the West Village  
20 Residents Association. I do want to agree that it's  
21 pretty shabby that Council Members Restler and Menin  
are not here after sponsoring the bill and we're here  
just to talk about what the problems are with the  
existing program. They should be here to listen to

2 it and I hope they are going to listen to this after  
3 the fact.

4 Corey Johnson's office back in during the  
5 pandemic did a study of how many restaurants were  
6 compliant with the rules at the time and he found -  
7 his office found that 93 percent of the restaurants  
8 were noncompliant with the rules.

9 Right now, I would say that exactly the same  
10 number are non-compliant with the rules and nobody  
11 here - Mr. Restler did not address DOT on this.  
12 Nobody at DOT has addressed the enforcement problems.  
13 Restaurants are not maintaining their clear paths.  
14 Restaurants are not handling their garbage properly  
15 and restaurants are not addressing neighbors'  
16 concerns about noise. Daylighting issues are not  
17 being addressed properly by DOT. All across the  
18 board, there is no enforcement of the existing rules.  
19 Now, we're just one percent of the city's population  
20 but we have 20 percent of the city's outdoor dining.  
21 We think we know what's going on here and what the  
problems are and we think people should be listening  
to us but nobody is coming to us to talk to us. And  
whenever we reach out to DOT or anybody, there's  
absolutely no response at all.

2 So, I'm going to submit some of our comments in  
3 writing and hopefully we can have a conversation.

4 I'm not holding my breath but there are some real  
5 problems with the existing program. Serious problems  
6 that have not been addressed and there seems to be no  
7 system in place at DOT to deal with enforcement.  
8 DCA, not DCWP, were much better at this. DOT is  
9 absolutely not able to handle this.

10 We think there should be some thought given to  
11 this. Thank you for your time.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And I agree that enforcement  
13 of the outdoor dining sheds during the pandemic was  
14 awful and so, to the extent that that's what we're  
15 working with, I mean that brings a lot of glaring  
16 issues and I agree that the enforcement piece is  
17 something that as a Committee we have to focus on.  
18 Thank you so much for your testimony.

19 EVAN SWEET: Good afternoon Chair Abreu. My name  
20 is Evan Sweet, I am the Director of Neighborhood  
21 Planning for the Meat Packing Business Improvement  
District. I'm here today to thank the City Council  
for taking up the challenge of Streetscape  
improvements in the public realm.

2 Our work in the Meat Packing District has  
3 demonstrated that the reprioritization of space for  
4 the public is vital to New York's economic and social  
5 vitality. Over the past decade, the Meat Packing  
6 District has led the transformation and in just the  
7 last year, Vast Company identified the Meat Packing  
8 District as New York's most walkable neighborhood.

9 This designation was no accident and only  
10 occurred through proactive efforts to transform the  
11 neighborhood's roads. Built for an industrial  
12 economy of loading docks and trucks into a space that  
13 prioritizes people and the economic activity taking  
14 place.

15 While the butchers gave way to boutiques, the  
16 streets remained unchanged. What our district's  
17 transformation has demonstrated is that rightsizing  
18 streets for how people actually use them is both good  
19 urban planning and good economic policy. We have  
20 seen our investments in the public realm derive  
21 commercial leasing, lift retail sales and create  
space or arts and cultural events that make the  
district a place people want to be. Our business  
community and stakeholders have embraced this and the  
results speak for themselves. In the past three

2 years, the Meat Packing District has worked - working  
3 with our great partners that the DOT has successfully  
4 reallocated 13,000 square feet of roadway space for  
5 pedestrian use through our Western Gateway Public  
6 Realm Vision.

7 These projects funded in advance by the BID with  
8 DOT's review and approval serve as a model for  
9 further expansion of pedestrian space throughout the  
10 city. Through these efforts, we have transformed  
11 roadways into curbside logistics hubs, public seating  
12 and spaces for arts and culture. The result is  
13 quarters that match the neighborhoods they serve and  
14 improve quality of life.

15 We have demonstrated these efforts could be  
16 replicated across New York City, thanks to the great  
17 work of DOTs Public Realm unit and community partners  
18 like BIDs and others. We have specific comments on  
19 selected Council Member introductions, which we'll  
20 share in our written testimony. Thank you for your  
21 time today.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you for your testimony.  
Next up.

MICHELE CAMPO: Okay, uhm greetings remaining  
Council Members. My name is Michele Campo. I am a

2 member of Q-UP. I'm a resident of Little Italy. I  
3 am a member of the Bowery Alliance of Neighbors. I  
4 am a member of the Bowery Block Association. I'm  
5 here for everybody as usual. And I just want to get  
6 - I wrote a piece but I just want to say that uhm,  
7 I'm here against Intro. 0655-2026 first off and as a  
8 resident and my husband is a cyclist, actually he's  
9 an award winning professional cyclist and he's in  
10 agreement with me on being against this proposition  
11 or what you call it. Uhm and uh, yeah, enforcement,  
12 enforcement, enforcement.

13 Okay, now this is what I wrote. The pandemic  
14 emergency is long over but the residents, especially  
15 those in lower Manhattan will again be the victims if  
16 this goes through. Our areas are extremely  
17 oversaturated and retail businesses are suffering  
18 being pushed out by bars and restaurants and greedy  
19 landlords looking for ever larger spaces and incomes  
20 and how are persons with disabilities to move inside  
21 a smaller pathway?

Residents need access to retail stores for daily  
necessities. Residents need some peace and quiet in  
their lives. Quality of life was lost when the sheds  
were up and many of us worked from home. There were

2 also the question of garbage, lack of street cleaning  
3 and difficulty for sanitation to clear residential  
4 trash and recycling.

5 Imagine how difficult it would be during another  
6 snow storm. The rodent population did not seize  
7 because the new receptacles were being used. The  
8 rodent seized because the roadbed sheds were  
9 eliminated, no more easy food. There were already  
10 too many obstacles in this city we love, let's not  
11 add more. Please let sanity return. Everybody in my  
12 neighborhood was ecstatic when they came down and  
13 there was one shed, when it was being cleaned, I  
14 could smell something from three blocks away. I  
15 said, what is that? It was what was underneath that  
16 they were cleaning. These things are disgusting and  
17 they are also a trap for you know as far as  
18 construction goes, yeah, bad.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much. In the  
20 previous iteration of outdoor dining, I understand  
21 that rats were a big problem and so, we need to look  
at the structures and if we're going to go year  
around, we need make sure we're looking at the  
structures that are not going to allow for rats to be

2 nesting in these city sheds. So, I appreciate you  
3 sharing your testimony. Next, next up.

4 NORMA COTE: My name is Norma Cote. I am a  
5 member of the public. I patronize outdoor  
6 establishments and I also live among them. I am not  
7 a representative of any group but I have spoken to  
8 many of my neighbors and friends and they agree with  
9 what I'm about to say to you.

10 As to allowing roadway cafés to operate during  
11 the winter, the dining public does not need anymore  
12 dining facilities outdoors during the winter. We  
13 already have outdoor dining at sidewalk cafés year  
14 round. We've always allowed it before the pandemic,  
15 during the pandemic, and now under the permanent  
16 rules. But during cold weather, many or most  
17 sidewalk cafés don't even operate outdoors. And  
18 those that do set up their tables and chairs get  
19 virtually no business.

20 Roadway Cafés would suffer the same fate. The  
21 general public including tourists and visitors would  
be negatively affected by unused roadway cafés during  
the winter months. They are a blight on the public  
streetscape, just as abandoned sheds are and that  
blight would persist 24 hours a day. Roadway setups

2 are unlike sidewalk cafés, which during the hours  
3 when they are not operating, they secure their  
4 chairs, they put them all together and they secure  
5 them with a cable or something and often they bring  
6 their perimeter demarcations in right next to this  
7 compact array of chairs. The Roadway Cafés will not  
8 do that. They are always going to be there. The  
9 structure is always going to be there, even if they  
10 pull their chairs altogether in one small space when  
11 they are not operating.

12 Uhm, I had heard people exclaim that my  
13 neighborhood, which is a tourist area, is much  
14 prettier and much more pleasant when roadway cafés  
15 are removed, and as they now must be during the cold  
16 season and we think that should continue.

17 My other point has to do with public safety and  
18 with the provisions in both of these bills that would  
19 set out precise measurements for distance for various  
20 parts of street and the sidewalk. Decisions about  
21 safe and effective distances should not be made by a  
legislative body. There are professionals who have  
had the knowledge and the experience to do that job  
in an efficient and safe manner. And this body, the  
City Council should not be overriding the judgements

2 of the professionals in that field. I have more to  
3 say about that but I guess I'll have to say it in  
4 writing.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Well, thank you so much for  
6 your testimony Norma, really appreciate it. Next,

7 SPROULE LOVE: Thanks for sticking around.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'm proud to be sticking  
9 around.

10 SPROULE LOVE: I appreciate the opportunity to  
11 speak and appreciate that you're having this hearing.

12 My name is Sproule Love. I live in Central Harlem.  
13 I'm here representing the West 124th Street Block  
14 Association and I want to speak strongly in favor of  
15 the Streets Plan.

16 We heard that it was not uhm, the goals were not  
17 met but uhm I want to speak in favor of meeting those  
18 goals for two reasons, safety and fairness.

19 Community Board 10, where I live, which overlaps with  
20 Council District 9 pretty much, is the only Community  
21 Board District without a protected bike lane and it's  
something that I think is glossed over. I was very  
disappointed to see -

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You said where?

SPROULE LOVE: Community Board 10.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You don't have a single bike  
3 lane there?

4 SPROULE LOVE: Not one protected bike lane.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Not one protected bike lane.  
6 Thanks for letting me know.

7 SPROULE LOVE: There's one on 5th Ave at the edge  
8 and then the one to the west is the Greenway. Uhm,  
9 and I was disappointed to see that that will continue  
10 according to the update that was posted today that  
11 the DOT Commissioner let us know about. Not only are  
12 there no protected bike lanes planned there but of  
13 the three tiers of priorities, Central Harlem is  
14 listed in the lowest tier priority. So, he talked  
15 about equity and I think this is a glaring hole in  
16 the plan and I hope in the updated plan they address  
17 that but I just wanted to let you know that as a  
18 resident, uhm, I don't feel safe riding with my  
19 family down to Central Park and a protected bike lane  
20 along Adam Clayton Powell runs right through Central  
21 Harlem and would be a great connecter between the  
Harlem River Greenway and Central Park. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
testimony. We hear you all loud and clear. This  
panel is excused.

2 So, for the last in person panel, we have Lou  
3 Martini, my apologies, how to pronounce it? He had  
4 to leave? Allie Ryan, Marc Wouters, Leidis De La  
5 Rosa, and Naila Rosario. You may begin.

6 NAILA ROSARIO: Hi, thank you so much. Thank you  
7 for hanging in here. Been here since 10 a.m. so glad  
8 that we have our chance. My name is Nailia Rosario.  
9 I'm the National Director of High Road Restaurants.  
10 High Road Restaurants is a coalition of restaurant  
11 owners that support paying a living wage. We have  
12 over 500 members in New York City. I'm here really  
13 to elevate the voices of those restaurant employers  
14 who are calling for New York City to ensure that the  
15 restaurants that get an outdoor license pay a full  
16 minimum wage with tips on top. Our coalition  
17 consists of restaurant workers who already pay a full  
18 minimum wage with tips on top and they report lower  
19 turnover, stronger staff morale, and uhm we really  
20 want to make sure that we can pay a full minimum wage  
21 because it's going to create stability and stability  
strengthens businesses.

Uhm, some industry representatives are saying  
that they cannot commit to paying a full minimum wage  
yet those are the same people that are asking the

2 public to give up space in the sidewalks and to  
3 expand the seating - and the seating is going to  
4 increase their revenue. If a business can afford to  
5 grow, it can afford to pay their workers a fair wage.

6 If the Council is granting more space for these  
7 property owners to profit, it is completely  
8 reasonable to require them to pay a full minimum  
9 wage, with tips on top.

10 One fair wage is good for workers, it's good for  
11 businesses and it's good for our city. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. Next up and can  
13 you say on whose behalf you're making this testimony?

14 UNIDENTIFIED - SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF ALLIE RYAN:  
15 Yeah, I'm making this testimony on behalf of Allie  
16 Ryan. Allie had to leave to pick up her daughter  
17 from school.

18 Allie is a member of Q-UP and the New York City  
19 E-Vehicle Safety Alliance. Today, I'll read it in  
20 her voice.

21 I'm speaking as a Council District 2 resident who  
has lived across the street from road bed curbside  
restaurants since 2020. My family and I can attest  
to the outdoor dining programs' negative  
environmental effects. Increase of rats and

2 mosquitos, noise pollution, inability to walk down a  
3 sidewalk, blight caused by graffiti and not  
4 maintaining these structures.

5 Roads not being cleaned and the slowing firing  
6 engines doing - you know promoting - you know keeping  
7 citizens safe. Today, I am testifying against Intro.  
8 655, 628 and 1336. I am one of thousands of New  
9 Yorkers who have testified against road bed curbside  
10 shacks since 2021. Residents sued to force the city  
11 to conduct an environmental review of outdoor dining  
12 to document residents citywide daily experiences  
13 living with road bed shacks.

14 In 2023, City Council passed the current outdoor  
15 dining plan. I remember Gale Brewer admitting that  
16 the details of running the program to New York City  
17 DOT were non-existent. Whereas, the City Council  
18 Members who voted no including Chris Marte apologized  
19 to New York City residents acknowledging the real  
20 life degradation of quality of life due to road bed  
21 restaurant shacks. There's no reason to redo this  
process after a year with a new program.

The Seasonal Outdoor Dining program is open seven  
months a year. It is commonsense for the outdoor  
dining program to be closed for winter. Due to its

2 distance from the equator, New York City experiences  
3 a winter of cold temperatures below freezing. This  
4 year, we've had two blizzards and today, it is  
5 sleeting. Winter alone makes it difficult, if not  
6 impossible to eat a hot meal outside.

7 On paper and to the restaurant industry and  
8 lobbyists, year round outdoor dining sounds great but  
9 to many residents and families like mine who live in  
10 and -

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much.

12 UNIDENTIFIED - SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF ALLIE RYAN:  
13 You're welcome.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: The remaining, you can just  
15 submit it and we'll include it in the record.

16 UNIDENTIFIED - SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF ALLIE RYAN:  
17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Next.

19 LEIDIS DE LA ROSA: Good afternoon everyone. My  
20 name is Leidis De La Rosa and I'm with La Colmena  
21 supporting One Living Wage for All. I'm here because  
if we want the privilege of expanding businesses on  
the public sidewalks to outdoor dining, we should  
meet the highest standard and that includes paying  
one fair wage, a full minimum wage with tips on top.

2 Other industries are required to pay the full  
3 minimum wage, restaurants shouldn't be an exception.  
4 Using public space is a public benefit and public  
5 benefits should come with public responsibility.

6 The COVID pandemic showed us how unstable the  
7 subminimum wage system is. When businesses dropped,  
8 workers were left without a safety net. No one,  
9 especially those who keep restaurants running should  
10 ever be forced to choose between their health or  
11 their paycheck. If other landing is going to expand,  
12 it should lift up everyone, not just restaurant  
13 owners but the workers who make businesses possible.  
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Next.

16 MARC WOUTERS: Thank you. It was very nice to  
17 meet you. Proud to be the last speaker of the  
18 afternoon. My name is Marc Wouters, I run an Urban  
19 Planning Studio in Brooklyn.

20 In April 2020, during the height of the COVID  
21 lockdown, I met with the Department of City Planning  
and presented some of the very first plans for the  
outdoor dining, road bed dining program and I have a  
passion for small businesses and it was hurtful to  
watch our businesses suffer during that period. I

2 also testified in June of 2020 to start the Outdoor  
3 Dining Program. But since then, in 2022, we saw a  
4 number of problems with the Outdoor Dining program.  
5 Uhm and I think a lot of them have been you know  
6 outlined here.

7 What I noticed very prominently is that a number  
8 of people, when they winterized their sheds, they  
9 privatized a public space, and that is something that  
10 New York City really has never allowed to do in 200  
11 years, 300 years. We haven't taken our public space  
12 that all of us use and turn it into private space in  
13 enclosed buildings to generate revenue for a private  
14 business. It belongs to all of us. And so, if you  
15 allow the program to become year long, the tendency  
16 of all of these people is probably going to be to  
17 make permanent structures. The guidelines say  
18 they're modular, they're supposed to be demountable  
19 but after a couple years, they're going to be  
20 permanent structures. We know that DOT doesn't have  
21 the facilities to monitor. I've seen so many  
violations of these sheds already.

And so, what you will have are permanent  
structures on top of our water supply lines that are  
under the street, the electrical lines, the gas

2 lines, the data lines, the sewer will all be blocked  
3 by these permanent structures. Fire fighters will  
4 have difficulty getting to the buildings behind them.

5 So, I urge you to keep it seasonal.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. I would say to  
7 that, I mean we have cars taking over our streets  
8 that are privately owned. It's one of the most  
9 pervasive uses of -

10 MARC WOUTERS: Yeah but you can move a car.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Yeah you could also -

12 MARC WOUTERS: You can move a car. You can't  
13 move a building.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Let me - you can also move  
15 outdoor dining. You can have movable structures as  
16 well. Also, City Bike is also privately owned, that  
17 is also used by the public in the same way that  
18 outdoor dining is privately owned and used by the  
19 public. I'm just saying there's analogies.

20 MARC WOUTERS: Pick up one of those structures  
21 and move it. It's not that easy.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We need to get the right  
structures in technologies but I agree - look during  
the pandemic and that's our baseline. The sheds were  
- a lot of them were not movable. They were

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 256

2 conducive to rats and I think we need to be - we need  
3 to like a better infrastructure to address a lot of  
4 the complaints.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: You're going to make it a  
6 permanent program based on no trial program. That's  
7 ludicrous.

8 MARC WOUTERS: I've been on three taskforces -

9 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We've had seasonal - we've  
10 had seasonal outdoor dining and that's our proof so  
11 far but either way, this panel is excused and I just  
12 want to thank you for testifying.

13 MARC WOUTERS: Thank you so much.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Of course. We'll take what  
15 you said into consideration for sure.

16 So, there have been individuals who were here in  
17 person. I just want to make sure that I don't miss  
18 them. Daniel Bush, are you here? Samuel Riviera,  
19 Vianna, Andrew Paulsen.

20 I will now turn over to Zoom shortly, just give  
21 me one moment. I'm going to adjourn for three  
minutes and I'll be right back.

[SHORT BREAK 293:27-296:06]

20

21

2 My apologies to the folks on Zoom. I have one  
3 more person who is in here to testify in person who  
4 already signed up and she will be joining us shortly.

5 [PAUSE 296:14-296:52]

6 Alright, Jacqueline?

7 JACQUELINE L HEUREUX: Yes, hi.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You may testify. You have  
9 two minutes.

10 JACQUELINE L HEUREUX: Okay, uhm, so my name is  
11 Jacqueline and I have been a restaurant worker since  
12 I was 14-years-old. When I was 18, I got a job in a  
13 nightclub inside a Trump hotel and the day that I was  
14 hired, they weighed me and told me that if I had  
15 gained more than ten pounds, I would be put on  
16 probation. I was the only person of color on staff  
17 and from day one, it was clear I wasn't being judged  
18 on the work I could do, I was being judged on how I  
19 looked. Every single night I worked I was harassed.  
20 People grabbed me, made comments about my body. They  
21 slipped me their hotel room numbers along with their  
tips and when I asked management for advice, they  
told me to play along. My safety didn't matter, only  
the tips did.

2 It took me years to undo a lot of the self-esteem  
3 damage that that work experience gave me and it all  
4 came down to wages. The system was designed so that  
5 my paycheck depended on whether or not I entertained  
6 harassment. That's not what a job should be. 70  
7 percent of tipped workers are women and without a  
8 real based wage, we experienced the highest rates of  
9 sexual harassment of any industry in this country.

10 Today, we're deciding whether to expand outdoor  
11 dining, more tables, more customers, more exposure  
12 for workers like me. More situations where we have  
13 to smile through things that no one should have to  
14 smile through because our rent depends on it. If  
15 you're going to give restaurants more public space to  
16 grow their business, the least that you can do is  
17 make them pay us one fair wage. No worker should  
18 have to choose between their dignity and their  
19 survival, not on the sidewalk or anywhere. Thank  
20 you.

21 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
testimony.

JACQUELINE L HEUREUX: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Jacqueline. On  
Zoom, Dianna Maeurer.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

3 DIANNA MAEURER: Okay, thank you. I'm going to  
4 read my testimony. Uhm, bear with me, I'm recovering  
5 from oral surgery, so I'm speaking weird.

6 My name is Dianna Maeurer. I'm Vice President of  
7 the Chelsea West 200 Block Association, which covers  
8 the areas of 7th to 8th Avenue between 19th to 22nd  
9 Street here in Chelsea Manhattan. I'm here to  
10 testify in opposition to the bill proposing, making  
11 roadway cafés year round and other changes to the  
12 outdoor dining program, including allowing grocery  
13 stores, etc., to sidewalk cafés.

14 Our main reason for opposing this is that  
15 enforcement, which is key to the success of the dine  
16 out New York program, has been woefully insufficient,  
17 ever since the program's inauguration. We cannot  
18 support any changes to the program until the City  
19 Council and the Administration commit to proper  
20 enforcement of current regulations.

21 My apartment is located directly above a bar and  
operates a roadway structure in flagrant and  
fibrillation of numerous dining, outdoor dining  
rules.

2 Since it is not locked or secured, this roadway  
3 structure is effectively open 24/7 and available for  
4 use by anyone to hang out well after the business is  
5 closed.

6 I'm speaking today, not only as a 50 year  
7 resident of West 19th Street but as a disabled senior  
8 with mobility challenges. Another location on my -  
9 another, also located on our block is a restaurant  
10 with both sidewalk and roadway café. Unable to  
11 patronize this establishment as it is not ADA  
12 accessible there. The roadway café is located on a  
13 raised platform.

14 I want to skip ahead so I don't run out of time.  
15 Uhm, and the sidewalk is blocked. The sidewalk, it's  
16 not partitioned off for the patrons.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

18 DIANNA MAEURER: Okay.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much. You may  
20 submit the rest of your testimony online and we'll  
21 make sure to read it.

DIANNA MAEURER: Alright.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Next up, we have Sean  
Sweeney.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin. Sean, you're  
unmuted. We can't hear you Sean.

3 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Sean, we'll come back to you.  
4 We're going to move now to Kathryn Arntzen.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin. Uh, Leif  
6 Arntzen is on. Kathryn left.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Leif Arntzen.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 LEIF ARNTZEN: Yes, can you hear me?

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yup, we can hear you.

11 LEIF ARNTZEN: Okay great, thanks so much. The  
12 sponsoring Council Members stressed that the public  
13 is clambering for expansion of the program to go year  
14 around. I really don't understand this so-called  
15 clambering. What I can tell you is that since the  
16 permanent program took effect a little more than a  
17 year ago, conditions improved as the sheds came down.

18 But clambering let's get real here please. I can  
19 tell you nobody in our neighborhood is clambering for  
20 year round outdoor dining for more sheds on their  
21 block, for less room on the sidewalks.

I don't know anybody who is clambering for the  
smell of disinfectant for more drug dens or after  
hours hook up spots because that's what these things

2 become and nobody is clambering for the rats and I  
3 mean do we have to go back to rat academy? And who  
4 is clambering to block the street sweepers and the  
5 snowplows or the waste haulers. Talk about dangerous  
6 traffic, I can't forget to mention the guy who got  
7 killed walking down the block from a garbage truck  
8 going backwards down the block. Why? Because sheds  
9 block the turn from the other end. And who's  
10 clambering to block the FDNY or NYPD or ambulances?  
11 I mean, what sense does this make for somebody having  
12 a heart attack at the restaurant or the apartments  
13 above it? Seriously?

14 Again, I know people in neighborhoods all over  
15 the city and I can't think of one clambering for more  
16 sheds but let's not think I'm really mad about this,  
17 I'm just trying to manage my disappointment. I just  
18 don't understand why we'd be contemplating, standing  
19 and scaling up this program. I mean, didn't we  
20 already figure this out and settle the rules? Who  
21 needs it? Who's clambering? Restaurant owners, is  
this what they want us to go through every few years  
and I don't need to say how much I love the  
restaurants and hope for their success. I do but  
uhm, you know the reimagining the vibrancy,

2 stakeholders, all New Yorkers narratives are just so  
3 tired.

4 They're running those words for me I think. The  
5 reality is the only clambering going on here is us  
6 trying to be heard and are you hearing us? I hope so  
7 because our neighborhoods need more headaches like a  
8 hole in the head.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

10 LEIF ARNTZEN: Thanks.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. We will now move  
12 on to Brit Byrd.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Brit, you're unmuted.

14 BRIT BYRD: Thank you. I'm here representing  
15 Brooklyn Borough President Antonio Reynoso presenting  
16 testimony on Intro. 655 and 628 regarding outdoor  
17 dining in the upcoming Streets Plan update.

18 As a member of City Council Borough President  
19 Reynoso was the lead sponsor on two bills dealing  
20 with outdoor dining. One that created the emergency  
21 program and a precursor to the bill that Council  
ultimately passed in 2023 to make the program  
permanent. The program has been a lifeline for small  
restaurants during the pandemic. It saved  
approximately 100,000 jobs. Allowed for people to

2 interact socially in a safe setting and generated tax  
3 revenue for the city. It has also helped New Yorkers  
4 reimagine what our streets can be, which is why so  
5 many New Yorkers share a desire to see the problem  
6 succeed, yet due to seasonal rules that the Council  
7 adopted, we've seen the number of open restaurants  
8 drop from about 8,000 at the peak of the program to  
9 about 2,500 and now zero in the winter months. The  
10 seasonal program simply creates too many burdens on  
11 small businesses. The cost of purchasing an outdoor  
12 dining set up and pay to construct it, only to have  
13 to pay again to take it down and then pay again to  
14 store it for the off season. It's too burdensome for  
15 many businesses and it is the most cited reason for  
16 why they are choosing not to participate.

17 Intro. 655 addresses this by allowing open  
18 restaurants to operate all year, as was originally  
19 intended. Intro. 655 also addresses other important  
20 issues with the program, including expedited  
21 approvals by preventing community boards from  
acquiring extra application materials. Acknowledging  
that agency level requirements are sufficient to  
ensure safety, appropriateness, cleanliness and  
accessibility.

2 It also expands the number of businesses that can  
3 participate by opening the option for sublet café to  
4 grocery and specialty food stores and by creating an  
5 option for businesses that are too small to have  
6 their own setup to coordinate with adjacent  
7 businesses to expand their space.

8 Moving is barriers is in line with their programs  
9 original intent to make it as easy as possible for  
10 small and immigrant run businesses outside Manhattan  
11 to participate -

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

13 BRIT BYRD: One sentence on the Streets Plan.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you.

15 BRIT BYRD: That the Borough President urges,  
16 extension of capacity in house at DOT. Uhm more uh a  
17 true BRT expansion and a pilot of low traffic  
18 neighborhoods.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Brit. Didn't we go  
20 to college together? Brit?

21 BRIT BYRD: Yes, we did.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We did go to college  
together. I remember you. Nice to see you man.  
Thank you for testifying. We now have Inje Ivchenko.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

2 INJE IVCHENKO: Hi, my name is Inje Ivchenko. I  
3 am the President of the London Terrace Tenants  
4 Association, which incomes 1,000 departments in  
5 Chelsea. I am a member of Community Board 4. I am  
6 also a member of the Chelsea Council Block  
7 Associations. I am speaking today on behalf of  
8 myself and the London Terrace Tenants Association  
9 when I say we do not need year round dining. This  
10 was brought on a few years ago after COVID and it was  
11 - there was a lot of public engagement. It was put  
12 up for 9 months. You now want to put it to 12 months  
13 where there is no enforcement.

14 There already is no enforcement. There's no  
15 enforcement for sidewalk cafés. There's no  
16 enforcement for outdoor dining things that are  
17 illegal. Residents have to take it upon themselves  
18 to file numerous 311's and nothing happens. We  
19 contact the Department of Transportation, nothing  
20 happens. I learned this morning at this meeting when  
21 Council Member Epstein asked about the stipulation,  
which I'm a fan of at BLP, the Business License and  
Permits Committees. However, there are no  
stipulations in force. So, when the community asks  
for stipulations, there are no stipulations. That's

2 not helpful. The only two Council Members that had  
3 anything positive to say about their constituents and  
4 their respect for their constituents quality of life,  
5 were Council Member Chris Marte and Council Member  
6 Harvey Epstein.

7 The outdoor dining has not even been in effect  
8 for a year. There are still problems with it.  
9 There's quality of life issues, location issues, they  
10 haven't - there's no enforcement now, so there needs  
11 to be better enforcement before we even discuss -

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

13 INJE IVCHENKO: Pardon?

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

15 INJE IVCHENKO: Okay, thank you so much. We are  
16 against it. There are 40 block associations in  
17 Chelsea in Hell's Kitchen that have written letters.  
18 Everyone is against it, so please listen to the  
19 constituents.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much for your  
21 testimony. We now have Christine Berthet.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

CHRISTINE BERTHET: Yes, good afternoon. Good  
night soon. My name is Christine Berthet. I am a  
founder of a 20 year old nonprofit group called

2 CHECKPEDS and we are fighting for more walking space  
3 and pedestrian safety in New York.

4 I want to point out that the pedestrians were not  
5 consulted in the writing of these bills. We support  
6 the extension of the Roadway Café to 12 months  
7 subject to a number of conditions. But if you are in  
8 favor of expanding pedestrian space, do not start by  
9 taking it away. We vehemently oppose Intro. 1336  
10 which would further limit the pedestrian clear paths  
11 to 8 feet, without any distinction for pedestrian  
12 crowding. There are 97 percent of the streets in New  
13 York City, which are 8 feet but the other 3 percent  
14 original and global courier where there are a lot of  
15 pedestrians and changing the measurement would be a  
16 huge step backward for pedestrian safety.

17 So, and you know promises of one million square  
18 feet in 5 years do not replace the walking space we  
19 have now.

20 We also oppose the sidewalk placement of café for  
21 retail food. Today, uh in front of those  
establishments, you have delivery sandwich boards,  
shopping carts, food displays etc., and all of those  
components would be forcing a clear pass once you  
have a café. Uh, if an expansion is permitted in

2 front of a residential property, especially those on  
3 lower floors, they wouldn't be subject to continuous  
4 noise. And we need to be very careful that the cafés  
5 are closing earlier and uh that a lot of space do not  
6 give away.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

7 CHRISTINE BERTHET: Oh, I'll send the rest, okay.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much. Sean  
9 Sweeney.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Coming back to you.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Sean, you are unmuted. Sean,  
12 you're unmuted.

12 SEAN SWEENEY: Yes, I am now.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yup, we can hear you.

14 SEAN SWEENEY: Thank you. I'm Sean Sweeney. I'm  
15 the Director of SoHo Alliance. Uh, 1,100 strong  
16 member organizations founded in 1992. I'm on  
17 Community Board 2 and I'm also the former President  
18 and current member of the Executive Board of the  
19 downtown independent democrats. And I'm going to go  
20 off script because it's petitioning time. You know  
21 how difficult it is to get people to sign petitions  
because they say, all the politicians, they're all

2 crooked and they are all corrupt, they don't listen  
3 to us. You know what? They're right. Who is -  
4 anyone here from the neighborhoods? People who have  
5 spoken? Do they want this? No. Who wants this? Do  
6 you want this sir? You live on West 81st Street. Is  
7 there one of these on your block? On Broadway? Not  
8 for blocks around. Lincoln Restler, he lives in a  
9 treeline brownstone building on Brooklyn Heights,  
10 there are none for blocks near here, his house.  
11 Julie Menin, she lives on Westend Avenue. None in  
12 front of her house. How would you like it to have  
13 one of these underneath your bedroom window that the  
14 people in Community Board 2 and Community Board 3  
15 were Marte and Epstein have spoken. How would you  
16 feel to have them, these kinds of places underneath  
17 your window?

18 AND don't give me this rat litigation. They've  
19 been there for years. I have videos I could show you  
20 of people fornicating there on 2nd Avenue. I have  
21 videos on Ludlow Street, people shooting up at 9:00  
a.m. in the morning. Kids are going to school. I  
had in SoHo- there's defecation going on at night in  
these bins. So, stop this - why don't you listen to  
the people instead of the lobbyists. You give the

2 politicians a bad name sir. I'm sorry I'm off script  
3 but you get me angry and I think I speak for a lot of  
4 people here. You're a disgrace and anyone else that  
5 supports this bill in the Council is a disgrace.

6 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: From Shaun to Sean, thank you  
7 very much. We now have Mary Evancho.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 MARY EVANCHO: Yeah, so can you hear me?

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I sure can.

11 MARY EVANCHO: Okay, my name is Mary Evancho. I  
12 am opposed to Intro. 628 and 655 and will make three  
13 points.

14 Number one, why have there been so few applicants  
15 in the permanent program? The answer, the program is  
16 no longer FREE. The program was free for four and a  
17 half years. The program is no longer free. It costs  
18 money to participate. Realty set in. People don't  
19 want to spend the money.

20 Number two, why should we not have year round  
21 dining? Because no one in their right mind wants to  
eat outside in the cold, much less the roadway when  
one can dine comfortably indoors.

Number three, why do I think expanding roadside  
is not a good idea? Has anyone considered where

2 garbage goes that would normally sit out front for  
3 pickups. Well, I'll tell you where the garbage goes.  
4 It goes to neighboring buildings who have been living  
5 with extraordinary amounts of garbage that is not  
6 theirs for years. Expand roadside, you'll have more  
7 garbage and it will be distributed further and  
8 further down the block.

9 So, no, I don't think expanding roadside is a  
10 very good idea. In my opinion, the only thing that  
11 needs quote fixing in this program is compliance.

12 Lastly, it should be mandatory that all Committee  
13 Members be present for public testimony. The fact  
14 that there are what, how many, how many Committee  
15 Members are left here two, three? Can I have an  
16 answer please?

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Just one.

18 MARY EVANCHO: Yes, now just one, well, it's an  
19 insult sir to the people of New York City and I think  
20 something needs to be done about that and I'm going  
21 to ask that you do something about that. Will you?

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We need to do better.

MARY EVANCHO: Sir, will you do something about  
that? Not better. Will you do something about that?

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I can't compel anyone's  
3 attendance here but I'll communicate your concerns to  
4 my colleagues. Thank you very much. Please continue  
5 with your testimony.

6 MARY EVANCHO: I'm finished.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
8 testimony. We'll now move on to Chris Schuyler or  
9 Schuyler, my apologies.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

11 CHRIS SCHUYLER: Good afternoon Chair Abreu. My  
12 name is Christopher Schuyler. I'm a managing  
13 attorney in the Disability Justice Program at New  
14 York Lawyers for Public Interest. I'm a person who  
15 stutters. Thank you for holding the hearing today.  
16 So, just - I want to cover three points. I'll submit  
17 my broader points in writing later but I want to talk  
18 about how the Streets Plan impacts people with  
19 disabilities focusing on buses and on intersection  
20 redesign and pedestrian spaces.

21 So, really the Streets Plan promises to benefit  
all New Yorkers but particularly people with  
disabilities as they are shut out of other modes of  
transportation including the subway.

2 So, it's a - when we're talking about buses,  
3 we're in favor of bus stop redesigns and you know as  
4 DOT acknowledged today, that they are far behind in  
5 that category, as well as the bus speeds and  
6 improving bus speeds, it can be accomplished by many  
7 different ways. One way is actually hitting the  
8 bench marks up for building protected bus lanes. I  
9 want to stress that it's important to not remove bus  
10 stops as a way of improving bus speeds. That  
11 negatively impacts New Yorkers with disabilities as  
12 they had to travel further to get to the next bus  
13 stop.

14 So, I hope the Council will support other methods  
15 of improving bus speeds. And so, in terms of  
16 intersection redesign, daylighting is a positive  
17 thing. We heard a lot of mixed testimony from DOT  
18 today about how softened daylighting efforts are  
19 actually very dangerous. You know there are  
20 challenges but with hardened daylighting structures  
21 as well but including those large concrete blocks,  
which can impede disability and for people who use  
wheelchairs, who at a lower level, it can actually  
make it harder to see them. People with disabilities

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 275  
2 are disproportionately injured in traffic related  
3 accidents.

4 And lastly, pedestrian space, so my colleague  
5 Christine Berthet, referred to the Pedestrian  
6 Mobility Plan, which set out various levels of clear  
7 space requirements.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

9 CHRIS SCHUYLER: Thank you. Just the last -

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: You can wrap up. You have 15  
11 seconds.

12 CHRIS SCHUYLER: Thank you. Yeah, so just on  
13 that, we promote the implementation of the DOTs  
14 Pedestrian Mobility Plan as it demands clear space  
15 recommendations and we have some waryness around  
16 Council Members bill, which would impede clear  
17 pathways.

18 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much for your  
19 testimony.

20 CHRIS SCHUYLER: I'll submit the rest. Thank  
21 you.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'll transition now to Jim  
Wright.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin. Jim?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Jim, you are unmuted. Jim?

21

2 JIM WRIGHT: Here I am. Thank you Chair Abreu,  
3 Member Wong and Council for staying with us. This  
4 has been a long day for you.

5 My name is Jim Wright, an architect and urban  
6 designer speaking for the American Institute of  
7 Architects New York. AIA New York was a strong  
8 supporter of Local Law 195 2019 and the Streets  
9 Master Plan of 2021. While significant progress has  
10 been made in the first five year cycle of the master  
11 plan, a number of benchmarks are lagging as we've  
12 heard.

13 As DOT updates the Master Plan for the next five  
14 year cycle, we recommend adopting the following goals  
15 that reaffirm the city's vision of a safer and more  
16 balanced sustainable and equitable public realm  
17 mobility network for the city. First, develop a  
18 comprehensive, complete streets master plan that  
19 balances pedestrians with bike transit, emergency  
20 service commercial and private vehicle uses.

21 Next, commit to make up for the benchmark  
deficits from the first five year cycle with the next  
five year cycle, along with ambitious new targets  
with immeasurable performance outcomes.

2 Next, complete build out of a connected bike  
3 network for the entire city that prioritizes  
4 productive bike lane infrastructure, accommodates the  
5 increasing use of bikes for commercial freight and  
6 goods delivery, expands the network to reach  
7 underserved neighborhoods in the city, and expands  
8 the city bike share network to increase bike mobility  
9 options for everyone. The bike network should  
10 provide full connectivity with and fill gaps with the  
11 city's greenway network.

12 Next, continue to expand the city's public plazas  
13 and open space network, including the Open Streets  
14 program, prioritizing neighborhoods that are  
15 underserved by public open space and parks.

16 Next, coordinate with the MTA to expand the  
17 creation of priority and exclusive bus lanes to  
18 improve bus speed and real liability, encourage more  
19 transit ridership and reduce traffic congestion.

20 Next, accelerate the implementation of Vision  
21 Zero traffic safety strategies.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much for your  
testimony. You want to wrap up five seconds?

2 JIM WRIGHT: Sure. Ensure that all street  
3 crossings, intersections are designed for ADA  
4 accessibility, including visual and hearing impaired  
5 accessibility and ensure that DOT has the funding and  
6 its resources to implement the goals of the Street  
7 Plan.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much. Of  
9 course. Nantasha Elder.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

11 NANTASHA ELDER: Good afternoon Chair and members  
12 of the Committee. My name is Nantasha Elder. I'm  
13 the Regional Director for the New York Public  
14 Interest Research group, Straphangers Campaign. The  
15 New York - the NYC Streets Plan established clear,  
16 legally mandated benchmarks for protected bike bus  
17 lanes, safer intersections, pedestrian spaces and  
18 connected infrastructure. These were not  
19 aspirational goals. They were commitments to New  
20 Yorkers. Yet the required targets yet have to be  
21 fully met and these shortfalls have real consequences  
for riders. Riders can't afford another Streets Plan  
to be ignored like the last one.

As an organizer of CUNY students across the city,  
the message I hear is consistent. Their buses are

2 slow. Their commutes are too long and reliability  
3 remains a daily source of stress. For many students,  
4 balancing school, work, and family responsibilities,  
5 unpredictable bus service is not an inconvenience,  
6 it's a real barrier.

7 Corridors such as Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn and  
8 Mainstreet in Queens urgently need to be prioritized  
9 including focusing on dedicating bus lanes, transit  
10 signal priorities and physical sections to keep lanes  
11 clear.

12 These are proven to improve bus speeds and  
13 service liability. As the Council conducts oversight  
14 today, we urge a recommitment to amend the Streets  
15 Plan legal targets and ensuring that the Department  
16 of Transportation has the funding, staffing and  
17 authority necessary to close the distance gaps. The  
18 success of this plan should ultimately be measured by  
19 outcomes, faster speeds, safer streets and more  
20 dependable service for New Yorkers who depend on  
21 transit every day.

18 Thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much. Now we  
20 have Clint Smeltzer.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 280

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Clint, you're unmuted.

3 CLINT SMELTZER: Apologies for that, I was just  
4 getting on to my camera.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: No worries.

6 CLINT SMELTZER: I didn't realize I was on deck.  
7 Sorry about that.

8 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: And I'll get folks to follow  
9 up. Can you please restart his time?

10 CLINT SMELTZER: Okay perfect, sorry about that.

11 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Before you start, Clint,  
12 you're now and then Matthew Shapiro is next, so that  
13 the next person can start getting ready. Thank you.  
14 You can get started.

15 CLINT SMELTZER: Okay great. I am here - sorry.  
16 I am here speaking as CB 3's SLA Committee Chair.  
17 Our Community Board has not had a chance to actually  
18 vote on the year around road bed cafés, so I'm just  
19 going to basically discuss the problems with issues  
20 we've had. This is not a formal statement by the  
21 Community Board. The biggest issue we've had is that  
one size does not fit all for the different  
communities.

CB3 currently has 107 road bed café applications  
along with 147 sidewalk café that we have processed.

2 We don't know how many conditional applications DOP  
3 has processed. It's perhaps more than double that  
4 number. We had the second highest in the city by far  
5 after our neighbor CB 2. Other districts may have a  
6 few roadbed cafés. We've experienced residential  
7 side streets as well as avenues lined one after  
8 another on both sides of the street. This changes  
9 the whole nature of our community, as well as  
10 creating quality of life issues, especially on  
11 residential side streets under families bedrooms.  
12 Uhm, you know just imagine if there were road bed  
13 cafés lined during both of these of these last few  
14 snow storms we've had. I know that's already  
15 mentioned.

16 Business owners have made clear that one of the  
17 problems they have is the expense and the logistics  
18 of taking down and setting up the cafés as well as  
19 storage. And how will that happen for snow removal,  
20 for road removal, you know that would be an  
21 additional expense, which we also don't want to put  
on our businesses. This is one area we've discovered  
that the city may be able to help, possibly with  
credits using vacant city property for storage, other  
things.

2 Also, additional seating is not necessarily a  
3 problem in the winter. You can see that by our many  
4 unused year around sidewalk cafés that are mostly  
5 empty during this time. Sidewalk seating could be  
6 used as enclosed sidewalk cafés. That would be a  
7 much more reasonable solution for us as opposed to  
8 having road bed cafés year round. Because we're  
9 mostly residential, it cannot be treated in the same  
10 manner as some of the more commercial areas and also,  
11 districts that have fewer road bed cafés that don't  
12 impact the community as greatly.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
15 testimony. Matthew Shapiro followed by Michele  
16 Birnbaum.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Matthew, you are unmuted.

19 MATTHEW SHAPIRO: Can you hear me?

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes sir.

21 MATTHEW SHAPIRO: Okay thanks. My name is  
Matthew Shapiro, I'm the Legal Director of the Street  
Vendor Project at the Urban Justice Center. We're a  
membership based organization of over 3,000 mostly  
immigrant vendors, who work in New York City's public

2 spaces selling food and merchandise. And we  
3 recognize that outdoor dining has played a crucial  
4 role in allowing restaurants to use public space to  
5 ensure their survival and vibrancy and we support its  
6 expansion. However, it's critical that existing  
7 street vendor locations, not be lost due to  
8 restaurants and other stores expansion into public  
9 space. Our very limited concern with the outdoor  
10 dining laws is a potential displacement of longtime  
11 vendors due to restaurants and retail stores and  
12 outdoor setups.

13 This law and any accompanied agency rules should  
14 contain some safeguards to ensure that the outdoor  
15 dining setups do not result in the displacement of  
16 street vendors. Also, it should be noted that there  
17 are inequities in the way public space laws are  
18 enforced for vendors compared with restaurants and  
19 other retail food stores.

20 Vendors are subject to police enforcement either  
21 through the NYPD or DSNY while restaurants and retail  
stores are inspected by civilians from agencies.  
While we know that restaurants and street vendors  
have existed alongside each other for more than a  
century and we know that public space can be shared,

2 in the past, vendors have not had the same  
3 opportunities and legitimacies as brick and mortar  
4 businesses and this legislation should make clear  
5 that restaurants and food store expansion into the  
6 sidewalk and street space, should not come at the  
expense of vendors livelihoods.

7 The presence of street activities, such as  
8 outdoor dining and street vending, make New York City  
9 a livable metropolis. We look forward to working  
10 with the Council to ensure that restaurants, retail  
11 food stores and street vendors continue to thrive.  
Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much. We have  
13 now Michele Birnbaum followed by Emma Culbert.

14 MICHELE BIRNBAUM: Yes, thank you Chair Abreu and  
15 members of the Committee. Thank you for hearing my  
16 testimony today. I'm a member of CB 8 Manhattan and  
17 the Founder and President of Historic Park Avenue and  
18 although today, I am speaking on my own behalf, It is  
19 with great disappointment that I'm witnessing the  
20 revised effort to pass bills asking for year round  
21 dining for an increased number of restaurants,  
bodegas and grocery stores.

2 To my knowledge as neighborhoods and communities  
3 have not asked for this, it's painfully obvious that  
4 this is a giveaway to the hospitality alliance and  
5 restaurant associations.

6 This group has received ample compensation for  
7 COVID relief and mitigation. No need for that  
8 bailout to go on forever. These are sophisticated  
9 business owners who know full well how to turn a  
10 profit within their four walls of their rental  
11 establishments.

12 It's obvious what they have to gain from this  
13 additional square footage for expansion at a minimal  
14 cost. No requirement to increase their labor for a  
15 shared liability with the City of New York. Increase  
16 of business hours and capacity and the ability to  
17 dominate neighborhoods in the streets gain but the  
18 resident who lives above a restaurant or in an area  
19 has nothing to gain. That resident will experience  
20 an increase of noise, rats, street congestion, food  
21 orders, garbage accumulation, and a dangerous  
crowding of the pedestrian way.

With the under staffed, under budgeted Department  
of Transportation being in charge of this program, we  
can be assured that the conditional permit and final

2 permitting process will be unsupervised and of course  
3 leaving many establishments never to obtain a permit  
4 or license. The unlicensed as well as a licensed  
5 will be unsupervised with the laws being unenforced.  
6 There's no provision in either bill requiring  
7 increased budgeting for administrative and enforcing  
8 agencies - agents. Groceries, bodegas will have  
9 chairs, tables, on the street with a requirement of  
10 only 8 foot clearance to accommodate pedestrians,  
11 carriages, children, the disabled and with the street  
12 of only 25 feet wide -

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

12 MICHELE BIRNBAUM: Just let me finish up please.

13 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'll let you wrap up, 15  
14 seconds.

15 MICHELE BIRNBAUM: Thank you. You will have 17  
16 feet of café space because on a 25 foot block with 8  
17 foot clearance, you can have a café that takes up 17  
18 feet of pedestrian space. Also, insurance costs will  
19 increase for the proprietor -

18 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much.

19 MICHELE BIRNBAUM: Will be shared by the city -

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. Thank you very  
21 much.

2 MICHELE BIRNBAUM: Thank you very much. I'll  
3 submit testimony.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Appreciate it. We'll make  
5 sure to read it. We have next, Emma Culbert followed  
6 by Susan Stetzer.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

8 EMMA CULBERT: Good afternoon. Can you hear me?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: We can hear you.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I sure can.

11 EMMA CULBERT: Thank you. My name is Emma  
12 Culbert. I live on Canal Street for the last 20  
13 years. I'm a mother of two teenage sons, the  
14 President of the Space Block Association on the Lower  
15 East Side, a member of Neighbors on Canal and a  
16 property owner of a location that is completely  
17 surrounded by outdoor dining and an open street.

18 People think of Canal Street as six lanes of  
19 traffic but our stretch east of the Manhattan Bridge  
20 was the quiet side. It was a balanced ecosystem of  
21 mom and pop shops and immigrant families. Since  
2022, that equilibrium has shattered. While the  
residential population remains largely immigrant and  
working class, the commercial landscape has been

2 surrendered to a 24/7 alcohol and drug filled  
3 playground from April to November.

4 Many of my neighbors live in tenements and  
5 warehouses. They rely on open windows for  
6 ventilation. Now they are forced to choose between  
7 stifling heat or a sea of noise and clouds of smoke  
8 from marijuana and cigarettes.

9 A narrow street like Division, which is one third  
10 of the streets that comprise the Dime Square  
11 Triangle, the acoustics are such that the outdoor  
12 dining makes it impossible to sit in a living room  
13 without hearing a constant roar of noise. Our  
14 sidewalks are no longer navigable for two thirds of  
15 the year between the putrid filth left behind from  
16 sheds that street sweepers can't reach and the  
17 throngs of people blocking the clear path required by  
18 the ADA. My sons are forced to navigate in  
19 unhealthy, adult situations every single day.

20 Can you imagine how the city would have navigated  
21 the streets with the winter snow if it were also  
22 clogged with sheds? Noncompliance is the norm.  
23 Establishments are ignoring their 10:00 p.m. closing  
24 stipulations with zero consequence. The DOT fails to  
25 enforce stipulations. They only investigate if a

2 complaint is filed yet the 311 system for open  
3 restaurants is so convoluted it's nearly impossible  
4 for the average resident to use.

5 The Lower East Side has been treated as  
6 sacrificial lands for the nightlife industry. The  
7 food and beverage lobby is fierce, however, we are  
8 asking for you, the city, to lobby on behalf of the  
9 people for whom you serve. Year round roadway dining  
10 is an egregious and predatory ask, which commandeers  
11 public space for private profit.

12 Stop prioritizing sidewalk sheds -

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

14 EMMA CULBERT: Over the actual residents who live

15 -

16 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Please wrap up. Thank you.

17 EMMA CULBERT: Near and implement real proactive  
18 enforcement already on the books and maintain  
19 seasonal roadway dining timeline.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: No, thank you very much.

21 Susan Stetzer followed by John Grimes.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Susan, you are unmuted.

Susan?

20

21

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: We can come back to Susan if  
3 she's - if they are not available at the moment. Are  
4 they online?

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: They are online, just not  
6 responding to unmute.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Alright, we'll come back.  
8 John Grimes.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: John Grimes, you're unmuted.

10 JOHN GRIMES: Yes, I'm here. Thank you so much  
11 Chair Abreu.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: My pleasure.

13 JOHN GRIMES: My name is John Grimes. I'm here  
14 in my personal capacity. I'm a 35 year resident of  
15 the West Village and the experience - negative impact  
16 of the dining out program first hand. I'm opposed to  
17 any change to the program that would loosen the rules  
18 or provide for year round outdoor dining.

19 The underlying premise of the program is  
20 critically flawed and the impact on the environment  
21 including noise pollution has never been fully  
assessed as required by law. You heard that from  
some other comments today and now we are proposing to  
double down on a fall program by expanding it year  
round.

2 As others have mentioned, the recent blizzards  
3 show the fall of this proposal. The legislation  
4 tries to address this issue by talking about snow  
5 removal and sanitation but the language does not make  
6 sense.

7 In the case of a blizzard, such as the one last  
8 week, there will be no time to remove these  
9 structures, many of which have been granted waivers  
10 from complying with the Departments movable  
11 recommendations. I heard a lot about that today.

12 My quality of life has been severely harmed by  
13 this program with the associated noise and drunken  
14 behavior from patrons who congregate outside the  
15 establishment in my immediate neighborhood. Agents  
16 are standing around sheds, drinking, spilling out  
17 into the sidewalks, blocking access. The sheds are  
18 not a solution from sidewalk crowding but rather they  
19 contribute.

20 Writing rules for expanding sidewalk access yet  
21 allowing these structures in the roadways is entirely  
counterproductive. I'm also opposed to the drop in  
center. I haven't heard much about that today. Drop  
in center for restaurant owners. Where is the drop

2 in center for property owners who have been subjected  
3 to abuses of the program for years?

4 Instead, as was mentioned, we've had to file 311  
5 complaints. I filed hundreds of those yet the bad  
6 behavior continues with impunity and it will continue  
7 year round.

8 In summary, I'm speaking for those of us who live  
9 in neighborhoods such as the West Village that have  
10 been disproportionately impacted by this ill  
11 conceived program. I opposed any listening of the  
12 rules and ask that you conduct a long overdue  
13 environmental impact assessment before continuing.  
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you for your testimony.  
16 Susan Stetzer, we're coming back to you.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Followed by Alexis Adler.  
19 Susan, are you there? Alright, we'll come back to  
20 you Susan. Hopefully we can resolve the muting  
21 issues there. Alexis Adler followed by Deborah  
Farley.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

ALEXIS ADLER: Hi, thank you very much. My name  
is Alexis Adler. I'm calling in from the East 12th

2 Street Block Association. I'm a community garden  
3 member at El Sol Brillante and Down to Earth  
4 Community Garden. We just won an award at the Green  
Thumb Award Ceremony on Friday.

5 The only ones who are clambering for year round  
6 sheds are the rats. The rats, when we had year round  
7 sheds, they were pervasive. They were living  
8 underneath those sheds. When they were removed, they  
9 were scurrying about and I know that the new sheds  
10 are supposedly more cleanable underneath but that is  
11 not the case. If you have year round sheds, you  
12 cannot clean under them and there is just no way that  
13 you are going to avoid the rats and we don't want to  
14 live with them and they were in our gardens and it  
15 was just a battle and we were battling the sheds and  
16 so, we are opposed to those year around sheds. In  
17 the East Village, there's a million of them. We are  
18 just inundated and so, please vote against year round  
sheds. It's just wrong and like other callers have  
spoken up about snow removal, sanitation, it just  
can't be you know?

19 And so, please vote against it and uhm, I'm a  
20 biker as well and I'm for more bike lanes. I've been  
21 biking for 45 years and please, you know, support us.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

3 ALEXIS ADLER: Thank you very much. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much for your  
5 testimony. We'll now hear Deborah Farley followed by  
6 Charlton D'Souza.

7 DEBORAH FARLEY: Can you hear me?

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yup, we can hear you.

9 DEBORAH FARLEY: Okay, I'm Deborah Farley, I'm a  
10 Q-UP member and I oppose Intro. 655 and 628.

11 Expanding outdoor dining year round makes public  
12 health, environmental and safety concerns.

13 Winterized structures reduce visibility, limit curb  
14 access, impedes snow removal and restrict mobility  
15 for seniors and people with impairments.

16 Enforcing fire codes, building standards, ADA  
17 requirements and seasonal regulations, requires  
18 resources the city clearly lacks.

19 Previous year round outdoor dining led to  
20 unmaintained structures, rodent infestation, health  
21 and safety hazards that were both difficult and  
timely to get successfully resolved. Keeping outdoor  
dining seasonal allows for effective snow removal and  
the maintenance and the cleaning of streets and  
sidewalks at least four months each year. Outdoor

2 dining declines in colder months, leaving dining  
3 sheds underused or abandoned but still requiring  
4 maintenance and inspections by the DOT. Enforcement  
5 is virtually nonexistent. Outdoor dining is an  
6 amenity, not a core central service. Funding it  
7 citywide during a deficit prioritizes a limited  
8 sector over board or public needs. Outdoor dining  
9 mainly supports restaurants in wealthier high traffic  
neighborhoods, leading to unequal public spending and  
greater socioeconomic disparities.

10 It does not generate reliable direct revenue for  
11 the city, tax revenues from restaurants do not offset  
12 the programs operational and administrative cause.

13 The restaurant industry has already received  
14 substantial public funding and favorable policy  
15 changes. The federal government provided \$5.5  
16 billion in pandemic grants and forgivable loans to  
17 New York City restaurants. Sidewalk Café fees are  
18 now a quarter of the prepandemic level.

19 In closing, the city budget should reflect the  
20 Council's commitment to its constituents.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired.

DEBORAH FARLEY: Prioritizing funding for  
essential services that ensure quality of life

2 conditions, safety and wellbeing, rather than  
3 discretionary programs that bolster -

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much.

5 DEBORAH FARLEY: And serve proportionately fewer  
6 individuals.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you very much. We're  
8 now going to Charlton D'sousa followed by M.  
9 Petretti.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

11 CHARLTON D'SOUSA: Hello, good afternoon  
12 everyone. My name is Charlton D'sousa. I'm the  
13 President of Passengers United. We're a nonprofit  
14 organization. So, basically transportation,  
15 engineering professionals should be planning bus  
16 lanes with community residents, not outside lobbyists  
17 okay. And outside dining on roadways, it blocks fire  
18 trucks, police during emergencies and it causes  
19 traffic, rats, water bugs and drug use and I'll give  
20 you a perfect example of opening dining gone wrong.  
21 E 60th Street between Lexington and 5th Avenue over  
there, the Q32 bus got stuck in all the traffic for  
almost 30 minutes because of open dining on the  
roadway. So, again, you all need to consider that.  
This is why the Department of Health, NYPD, the fire

2 department, they should all be involved in the  
3 planning of this and they should be looking at these  
4 plans. And really, the City Council should not even  
5 be involved in this because it's dangerous. You know  
6 one time, a friend of mine was eating at a restaurant  
7 with his girlfriend and the rat came out of the  
8 opening dining area and was crawling on their leg  
9 while they were eating. Crazy story but it's true  
10 and yeah, you don't know what's in those planters.  
11 So, I would just say, uh they shouldn't be on the  
12 streets because that goes against transportation.

13 Transportation is supposed to be like you know,  
14 like streets where everything can pass through. As  
15 well as the bikes and the e-bikes, they're out of  
16 control and I agree that Priscilla's Law needs to be  
17 looked at. Safety needs to be looked at and they  
18 should really have bike licenses you know. And also,  
19 they don't care about pedestrians. A lot of times,  
20 if you're waiting at the light, they'll just run  
21 right through you and you have the right of way and  
that's how people are getting hit and many of these  
bikers don't have insurance, these e-bikes.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

20 CHARLTON D'SOUSA: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Charlton to Susan. I want to  
3 thank you for your testimony and I promise you I'm a  
4 rat hating Transportation Chair, so it's something  
5 that we definitely need to make sure that we're  
6 looking at is the rat problem, so next up we have M.  
7 Petretti followed by Michelle Koppersmith.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 M. PETRETTI: Hi, my name is Mary and I am a  
10 resident of Greenwich Village. I am a former  
11 restaurant worker. I'm now disabled, so I'm going to  
12 be speaking to the restaurant dining from those  
13 perspectives and backing up everything that Emma  
14 Culbert, John Grimes and Charlton D. Sousa just  
15 reported. You know I'm finding in assessing through  
16 CB2 the restaurants that want to have sidewalk and  
17 street dining, uhm, they did not - interested in  
18 being part of the community anymore and I feel that  
19 this has separated us. Uhm, it is impossible to  
20 police diners that are on the sidewalk and to make  
21 sure that there is a clear path. The density of the  
sidewalk and the space between the restaurant and the  
outdoor dining etc., saying they have sandwich boards  
and we're not here to police businesses. 311 is  
impossible to report all the transgressions and it's

2 not our job. We're okay to put in for 311 for  
3 potholes. All the restaurants in our neighborhood do  
4 not follow the rules. The density is tremendous.  
5 Businesses conducted on the sidewalk. There's no  
6 oversight. There are too many bad actors. The  
7 safety is not there and I think the Speaker's  
8 disingenuous to say that they want to make things -

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

10 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Please wrap up. Thank you.

11 M. PETRETTI: Been a burden to us to process  
12 this. Thank you for your time. I'm against for all  
13 outdoor dining.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
15 testimony.

16 M. PETRETTI: Dining call -

17 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much for your  
18 testimony. We now have Michelle KupperSmith followed  
19 by the 9th Street A-1 Block Association. Michelle,  
20 your time is now.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

MICHELLE KUPPERSMITH: Thanks, hi Chair Abreu.  
Thank you so much for having us here today and for  
taking the time to listen. I will just beg, I know  
you're a new Chair that maybe you can start numbering

2 people so that we know when we might get called  
3 otherwise we're sort of chained to our computers all  
4 day.

5 My name is Michelle KupperSmith. I live on East  
6 Broadway and during the current outdoor dining  
7 season, I live above at least four outdoor dining  
8 setups and I absolutely love it. To respond to  
9 previous testimony, I just want to say that it's  
10 compassionate to expand the outdoor dining program  
11 year round for several reasons. One thing I haven't  
12 heard today is about those who suffer from invisible  
13 disabilities and who suffer in a city that does not  
14 provide enough outdoor opportunities and so, they are  
15 so often forgotten.

16 I've heard several opponents claim that COVID is  
17 over, maybe to them it is but they're lacking  
18 compassion for those who are immunocompromised and  
19 for whom outdoor dining has been a lifeline.

20 I also want us to have compassion for the small  
21 business owners who are able to grow their businesses  
and pursue the American dream because of outdoor  
dining. With the current permanent program, we are  
unable to bear the cost of historical and dismantling  
set ups for non-year around dining.

2 So, in fact the current law benefits corporate  
3 restaurants, especially in Manhattan, which is how  
4 the program basically was before the expansion and  
5 the ZTA changes and in fact disadvantages of small  
6 business owners. I'm sure a lot of people testifying  
7 against the outdoor dining for year round purposes  
8 would claim support.

9 I also want us to be compassionate for the  
10 employees who lost their jobs due to the curtailing  
11 of the outdoor dining program, something that is well  
12 documented. So, I ask the Committee and the Council  
13 to support year round outdoor dining to make our city  
14 more equitable, and I also support any work that can  
15 be done to making sure that the City Street Plan is  
16 fully implemented. Unfortunately the last  
17 Administration really failed in its requirements  
18 there. And so, I thank you for revisiting this.  
19 Thank you all and have a great day.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: No, thank you for testifying.  
21 Next up, the 9th Street A-1 Block Association  
followed by Laura Sewell.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9TH STREET A-1 BLOCK ASSOCIATION: Hi, my name is  
Kate Plus, I'm Co-Chair of the 9th Street A-1 Block

2 Association. We represent about 60 members on our  
3 block of East 9th Street in the East Village, which  
4 is already overcrowded and over-saturated with liquor  
5 licenses. We are vehemently opposed to Intro.'s you  
6 know what I'm talking about. There is absolutely no  
7 public benefit to this privatization of public  
8 streets and sidewalks which will only benefit the  
9 restaurant and nightlife industries. For residents,  
10 your constituents, these bills only sell out our  
11 publicly owned taxpayer, paid for, and already  
12 overcrowded streets and sidewalks. They will only  
13 increase the difficulty we already have in navigating  
14 them, especially in our downtown neighborhoods where  
15 many sidewalks are already too narrow for the amount  
16 walking on them. These bills also hinder regular  
17 street cleaning and snow removal during the winter.  
18 New York City is not Paris, which has wide boulevards  
19 and avenues to absorb the noise, diners and drinkers  
20 make. We live in a densely packed city, at least in  
21 Manhattan and especially downtown with canyon-like  
avenues and streets where noise bounces off buildings  
and creates issues for residents and their living and  
especially sleeping quarters. Most of our residents  
on 9th Street, our bedrooms are on the street. So,

2 we hear pretty much everything out there. We as  
3 residents and taxpayers of New York City implore you  
4 not to pass these bills. Our quality of life and  
5 health is more important than the nightlife industry.  
6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Well, thank you. Next up, we  
8 have Laura Sewell followed by Robert Dobruskin.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

10 LAURA SEWELL: Hi, thank you. I'm Laura Sewell  
11 and I'm the Director of the East Village Community  
12 Coalition, which is known for our work and supportive  
13 independent businesses. We celebrate vibrant  
14 streetscapes or helping to steer the Avenue B  
15 pedestrian open street towards a long interest street  
16 improvement plan and support a robust streets plan.  
17 Unfortunately, winter roadway dining in our  
18 neighborhood has not been vibrant these past few  
19 years. I'd like to just elaborate on why the current  
20 roadway model does not work in over saturated  
21 neighborhoods such as ours. Especially when  
22 applications are considered individually and not in  
23 contact of like what next door.

24 So we have end to end outdoor dining structures,  
25 which leave no access for deliveries as our teamster

2 friends mentioned earlier or for DSNY to collect the  
3 residential trash placed in Amenities Lane behind  
4 them. There was provision for the restaurant trash  
5 in this plan but not how you get passed the end to  
6 end structures to get to it at all. Any form of  
7 shelter within 200 feet of a food source is an  
8 invitation to rodents. When it's unused, it becomes  
9 even more attractive.

10 I urge the BMT personnel and sponsors of this  
11 legislation to take DSNY's rat academy training to  
12 inform their work. You don't have to believe me.  
13 They do an excellent job of explaining what the  
14 problem is.

15 Our neighborhood businesses struggle through  
16 January and February. They can barely fill our  
17 indoor space, let alone sidewalk cafés. They are  
18 stymied by the ever changing rules for outdoor dining  
19 and about what to do with roadway structures over the  
20 winter. That does not necessarily mean they want to  
21 service them all year round.

22 So, allowing them to remain up and unused is not  
23 the answer. For operators that do want year round -

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you for your testimony.  
25 Time has expired.

2 LAURA SEWELL: Maybe some sort of exceptional  
3 path and for those who don't, we need other  
4 solutions.

5 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you so much. We now  
6 have Rob Dobruskin followed by Christopher Leon  
7 Johnson.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Robert.

10 ROBERT DOBRUSKIN: Thank you. I'm Robert  
11 Dobruskin, Vice President of the Council Chelsea  
12 Block Associations. While we recognize the value of  
13 outdoor dining to restaurants and neighborhood  
14 vibrancy, it is premature to expand the program as  
15 proposed. The current program suffers from  
16 inconsistent administration and insufficient  
17 enforcement.

18 Applications are often approved despite  
19 noncompliance and community complaints frequently  
20 result in little corrected action. Before expanding  
21 to year round roadway cafés, reducing pedestrian  
clear space, streamlining approvals, enforcement must  
be addressed. In residential areas like Chelsea,  
extended outdoor alcohol services also cause noise

2 and disorder, further underscoring the need for clear  
3 operating standards.

4       Regarding 1336, CCBA strongly opposes reducing  
5 the required pedestrian clear path. Dense  
6 neighborhoods already face obstacles like tree pits,  
7 scaffolding, subway entrances and bike docks.  
8 Pedestrian accessibility for seniors, families and  
9 people with mobility challenges must remain  
10 paramount.

11       CCBA supports a seasonal, European style dining  
12 model, tables, chairs, and umbrellas, which reduces  
13 construction, storage and insurance burdens while  
14 minimizing sanitation and quality of life impacts.

15       Outdoor dining must meet the same standards of  
16 accessibility, sanitation, enforceability and equity  
17 we expect of any long term public space use.

18       In summary, before broadening eligibility or  
19 reducing pedestrian protections, the city should  
20 demonstrate that the existing framework is  
21 enforceable, equitable and operationally sound. We  
urge the new administration and City Council  
leadership to reassess implementation, strengthen  
enforcement, and ensure long term public space use

2 balances community needs with responsible  
3 governments. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you. Next up,  
5 Christopher Leon Johnson.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

7 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah, hello, my name  
8 is Christopher Leon Johnson. I support the Street  
9 Master Plan but Mr. Abreu, you have to dispose to the  
10 people that the prepanel that was before the DOT,  
11 were all pro- car anti-car lobby nonprofits like the  
12 Riders Alliance and Open Plans and Transportation  
13 Alternatives and Families of Safe Streets. What you  
14 did today was you promoted, you exploited your  
15 position as Chair to promote an agenda knowing that  
16 the people, they get more than everybody else. You  
17 promoted an agenda using it as a platform sir but I  
18 respect what you're doing. You are a great person at  
19 heart. I know you're a great person at heart. I  
20 support Intro. 33 where it comes to extend the bike  
21 network. I want to keep it clear that this is for  
the deliveristas. They need this for the  
deliveristas. We need more bike parking for the  
delivery workers. I support that 100 percent.

2 The Streets - I support the Streets Plan 100  
3 percent the Street Master Plan for the city 100  
4 percent. I hope that Mamdani - but I want to make  
5 this clear right now that going forward, Mr. Abreu,  
6 you need to start talking to your girl at Workers  
7 Justice project to put a leash on her boy, Joshua  
8 Wood because this morning he stick his middle finger  
9 to JQ's face when he asked a question about Doordash,  
10 about why they locked up the apps.

11 So, going forward, we need to start having more  
12 respect for each other because that was uncalled for  
13 what Mr. Joshua did today by sticking his middle  
14 finger to JQ's face on City Hall steps.

15 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Can we stay on topic Mr.  
16 Johnson.

17 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: I'm on topic. I'm on  
18 topic. I'm making this clear that I support this 100  
19 percent but you need to start checking your boys and  
20 gals like [INAUDIBLE 356:51] and tell the people to  
21 chill out when it comes to killing people they don't  
approve of because what's going to happen going  
forward is that they're going to fall on that sword  
when it comes to many of these - when it comes to  
certain policies, especially with community

2 commercial daylighting because they work with  
3 Transportation Alternatives.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you for your testimony.  
5 Time has expired.

6 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Alright, thank you very much  
8 Mr. Johnson. Next up uhm, Susan Stetzer is off?  
9 Alright, so if we have inadvertently missed anyone  
10 that has registered to testify today and has yet to  
11 have been called, please the Zoom hand function is  
12 you testifying remotely and you will be called in the  
13 order that your hand has been raised. If you are  
14 testifying in person, please come to the dais.

15 Seeing no one approaching the dais and seeing no  
16 one else signed up - up, I may have acted  
17 prematurely. One second. Scott Lyne, are you ready  
18 to testify remotely?

19 SCOTT LYNE: Oh, yeah sure.

20 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Please proceed.

21 SCOTT LYNE: Hi, my name is Scott Lyne, I'm a  
resident of Manhattan Community Board 4. I submitted  
some written testimony just a few minutes ago but  
there are a couple things that have come up during  
the course of this hearing that I thought I would -

2 uhm, that were new to me and I thought raised  
3 different issues.

4 First, someone just testified about disabled  
5 people needing to be able to use the outdoor dining  
6 facilities during the winter. Uhm, my understanding  
7 is that the law permits but does not require  
8 restaurants to operate these facilities during winter  
9 months. It seems to me if we're going to permit them  
10 to have the facilities in operation during the winter  
11 months, they should be required to serve people who  
12 want to sit outside during those periods. It  
13 shouldn't be optional.

14 The second thing is sort of separately, I think  
15 it was news to me that the DOT is expecting that even  
16 if we allow these things to operate in the winter,  
17 that they would be required to remove the structures  
18 temporarily during heavy snowfalls or for milling and  
19 paving and things like that.

20 So, my understanding is that the only reason that  
21 restaurants want the ability to have the winter  
months is so that they don't have to ever take these  
structures down. And so, I guess there's a real  
tension there between the uh, the requirement that  
they wouldn't remove them before a snow storm and the

2 desire not to ever have to take them down. And so, I  
3 think that's something that the legislation needs to  
4 really struggle with before it gets passed because  
5 what are they going to do with the structure during  
6 the snow storm for the three days or the week?

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you for your testimony.  
8 Time has expired.

9 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: I'm going to give you another  
10 15 seconds to wrap up your thought.

11 SCOTT LYNE: That's it. I'm done.

12 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Alright.

13 SCOTT LYNE: You got the message. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON ABREU: Thank you Mr. Lyne for your  
15 testimony. Seeing no one else signed up on Zoom and  
16 seeing no one approaching the dais, this hearing is  
17 hereby adjourned. [GAVEL]  
18  
19  
20  
21

2 C E R T I F I C A T E

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.

10

11

12

13

14

15



16

Date March 29, 2026

17

18

19

20

21