

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

October 29, 2018
Start: 10:16 a.m.
Recess: 12:40 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Fernando Cabrera
- Costa G. Constantinides
- Chaim M. Deutsch
- Ruben Diaz, Sr.
- Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
- Peter A. Koo
- Stephen T. Levin
- Mark Levine
- Carlos Menchaca
- I. Daneek Miller
- Antonio Reynoso
- Donovan J. Richards
- Deborah L. Rose
- Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

2

A P P E A R A N C E S

Edward Grayson
Director of Bureau of Cleaning and Collection

Rebecca Zack
Intergovernmental Community Affairs.

Josh Benson
Department of Community for Traffic Operations

Zach Miller
Trucking Association of New York

Bruce Kraft

Sandy McCallion

Betsy Sargisson

Chelsey Brownridge
Dog Spot

Jack Davies
Transportation Alternatives

Clyde Vanel
District 33

Kelly Hodges
On behalf of Allie Taylor

1
2 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Good morning
3 everyone. Thank you for being here in a busy day,
4 we're going to be hearing 13 bills related to parking
5 and regulations. As you know parking regulation is
6 related to congestions, its related to everything not
7 only for drivers but also for pedestrians, also
8 relating in this case to animal rights.

9 Good morning and welcome to this hearing on the
10 City's Councils Committee of Transportation. My name
11 is Ydanis Rodriguez, the Chair of the committee.

12 One of the great things about Chairing this
13 Committee are the broad numbers of transportation and
14 issues that fall within this jurisdiction and that we
15 can review.

16 Last transit congestion comprising alternate
17 side park and regulations, muni-meters, traffic
18 control device has **[inaudible 2:22]** bicycles,
19 sidewalks, and others.

20 This committee deals with many issues that
21 affect the everyday life of New Yorkers. I am proud
22 of the work we have done over the past five years and
23 that we will continue to do to improve the
24 transportation infrastructure here in the city and
25

1
2 the numerous transportation services that are offered
3 to our residents.

4 As you can see from today's agenda, we have a
5 full plate before us. First, the committee will be
6 conducting an oversight hearing on parking
7 regulations in New York City. The city's parking
8 regulations play a vital role in vehicle movement and
9 govern where they can stop, stand, and park.

10 These regulations are in place to help ease the
11 flow of traffic, facilitate on the street parking,
12 assist in the delivery of goods to businesses and
13 maintain our streets clean. However, sometimes these
14 regulations can become too burdensome or outdated.

15 Many of them or all must be modified, which is
16 why we are here having this hearing today.

17 It is my hope that during today's hearing, we
18 will hear testimony for the administration, advocate
19 and the stakeholders on ways we can continue to
20 improve parking regulations and traffic flow in the
21 city for vehicles and trucks. While at the same
22 time, and the most important, maintaining our
23 commitment to pedestrians and cyclist's safety.

24 The committee will also be considering 14 pieces
25 of legislations to bills that I have a sponsor

1 related to muni-meters. INTRO. NO. 325 related to
2 rounding up parking time, it won't allow a person
3 purchasing time at a muni-meters to pay only up to
4 the last full units of time before the end or they
5 pay parking period.
6

7 These will prevent a person from having to pay
8 beyond the mandatory paid parking. People should
9 only pay for the time that they use the parking, not
10 more.

11 In INTRO 334, will require DOT to create a
12 mobile application or approve the use of a mobile
13 application that would connect individuals, so that
14 they can exchange unused muni-meter time.

15 We will hear several bills related to
16 alternative side parking restrictions.

17 INTRO NO. 370, sponsored by Council Member
18 Salamanca will suspend alternate side parking
19 regulations on Three Kings Day. As we are honored to
20 celebrate other holidays, the Three Kings Day is
21 important not only to the Puerto Ricans and the
22 Latino community, but it should be important to
23 everyone.

24 INTRO NO. 497, is sponsored by Council Member
25 Koo, will suspend alternative side parking

1
2 regulations on Lunar New Year's Eve. The same
3 support that I explained before to the Salamanca
4 bills is the same understanding that I have for the
5 Council Member Koo bills. We should also treat that
6 particular day special for everyone. We will also
7 hear several bills related to improving pedestrian's
8 safety.

9 INTRO NO. 206, sponsored by Council Member
10 Matteo, will require DOT to install pedestrian's
11 countdown displays at any intersections where there
12 is a photo-enforced traffic violation system.

13 INTRO NO. 1142 is sponsored by Council Member
14 Constantinides will require leading pedestrian's
15 interval signals or LPIs intersections adjacent to
16 hospitals, libraries, schools, and senior centers.

17 Additionally, we will hear bills related to
18 sidewalks in the street space.

19 INTRO NO. 886 is sponsored by Council Member
20 Espinal will require permits commercial
21 establishments to place pet harbors in front of their
22 businesses, so that owners can leave their small pet
23 unattended in a safe enclosed shelter for a short
24 period of time while they shop.

1
2 INTRO NO. 867 is sponsored by Council Member
3 Adams will require DOT to review the street widths in
4 order to reevaluate street traffic flow designations
5 and INTRO NO. 928 also sponsored by Council Member
6 Adams would require at least two corners of a street
7 intersection to have the appropriate street name
8 signage installed.

9 Some of the bills related to commercial vehicles
10 and truck deliverers including INTRO 1140, also
11 sponsored by Council Member Constantinides will
12 require DCAS to develop an off-hour delivery plan and
13 for that plan to be submitted to the Mayor and the
14 speaker of the Council.

15 INTRO NO. 1010 sponsored by Council Member
16 Miller will increase the penalties for certain
17 commercial vehicles that park overnight on
18 residential streets.

19 INTRO NO. 1011 also sponsored by Council Member
20 Miller will reduce the maximum time certain
21 commercial vehicles may park to no more than 90
22 minutes.

23 Finally, two bills related to parking fines
24 under the jurisdiction of parking fines. INTRO NO.
25 570 sponsored by Council Member Treyger will waive

1
2 parking violations issued to motorists who park their
3 cars in a spot that have illegible parking signs.

4 Let me now recognize my colleagues who are here
5 and also Council Member Yeger, Koo, Cabrera, Diaz,
6 Espinal, Rose, Salamanca, and Constantinides.

7 I now invite a sponsor to give opening
8 statements on the bills. First, starting with
9 Council Member Salamanca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Good morning. Thank
11 you, Chair Rodriguez for holding today's oversight
12 hearing on parking regulations in New York City.
13 Good morning to our partners.

14 New York City is one of the most diverse places
15 in the world. You can find global cuisines in any
16 borough, hear different languages spoken in every
17 community and celebrate your own traditions through
18 religious and cultural holidays.

19 One of the bills we'll be discussing today is
20 INTRO 370. I introduced Intro 370 which will suspend
21 alternate side parking regulations on Three Kings
22 Day, a Christian holiday widely celebrated by many
23 Latino communities here in the City of New York every
24 January 6th.

1
2 For many of the Christian faith, the Christmas
3 season officially ends on this day with parades,
4 celebrations, and religious ceremonies taking place
5 all over the five boroughs, especially in the Bronx
6 and El Barrio. Just as the city recognizes the vast
7 number of religious and cultural holidays, and
8 suspends alternate side parking, many in the Latino
9 community request the same treatment. I and my 18
10 colleagues who co-sponsor this bill, agree.

11 I want to thank Chair Rodriguez again for
12 holding today's hearing especially well in advance of
13 January 6, the next Three Kings Day. I am hopeful
14 that we can pass this bill prior to the celebration
15 and send a message to the Christians in Latino
16 communities that your celebrations matter and the
17 city recognized them. Thank you Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Let's
19 hear now from Council Member Espinal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you Chair. I'm
21 speaking on INTRO 886, a bill I introduced that would
22 allow pet harbors on the sidewalks of New York City
23 streets. For those of you that don't know, just not
24 too long ago, DOT actually issued an order to remove
25 these dogs' safe harbors and because of that move, we

1
2 are essentially hurting a small business that has
3 provided a new technology that I believe is an asset
4 to pet owners, but also small businesses across the
5 city.

6 So, what my bill will do would actually carve
7 out these pet harbors as we had them in the past, to
8 carve other coin machines. So, to ensure that New
9 Yorkers can live in our city knowing that there are
10 these conveniences for them and their pets moving
11 forward.

12 I do have some questions and I won't be able to
13 stay here for the rest of the hearing, but you know,
14 my questions are one, why does DOT feel that pet
15 harbors are any different than any other coin machine
16 in our streets? And two, you know why are we setting
17 an example where we are not being open to the idea of
18 new businesses, new technology actually paving the
19 way for our city to move forward? Why are we putting
20 laws in place that would get in the way of these
21 businesses and be able to expand our city? Thank
22 you.

23 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Council
24 Member. Council Member Koo.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Chair. Today I
3 am introducing INTRO 497 which is to amend the
4 administrative code of the City of New York
5 regulation to suspending alternate side parking
6 regulations on Lunar New Year's Eve.

7 We all know Asian-Americans has grown
8 tremendously in the last 15 to 20 years. Now we are
9 kind of almost in the 16 percent of the city
10 population and Lunar New Year is one of the biggest
11 holidays we celebrate and of course we don't just
12 celebrate the New Year Day. We celebrate the Eve
13 before. You have a big dinner, parties, and people
14 having drinks. So, its not wise not to suspend the
15 alternate street side parking because people in the
16 holiday mode, is not good to tell them oh, yeah, to
17 go out and move the car to the other side, you know?
18 So, I hope my colleagues and the administration will
19 support this bill. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
21 Thank you Council Members I would like to welcome the
22 representative of the administration who are here
23 with us today. Thank you for being here and now I'll
24 ask the Committee Council to administrate the
25

1 affirmation and they invite you to deliver your
2 statement.

3
4 COUNCIL: Please raise your right hand. Do you
5 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
6 but the truth in your testimony before this committee
7 and to respond honestly to Council Member questions?
8 Thank you.

9 JOSHUA BENSON: Good morning Chair Rodriguez and
10 members of the transportation committee. I am Deputy
11 Commissioner for Traffic Operations Joshua Benson and
12 with me today is Assistant Commissioner for
13 Intergovernmental and Community Affairs Rebecca Zack.
14 Together with our colleague Edward Grayson, Director
15 of DSNY's Bureau of Cleaning and Collection, we are
16 pleased to be here to testify on behalf of Mayor de
17 Blasio on a number of bills before the Council on the
18 issue of parking as well as several other topics.

19 I will begin with a little background on DOT's
20 regulation of curbside parking in New York City and
21 then discuss the bills before you today.
22 With approximately 76 million linear feet of curb in
23 New York City, DOT believe curb space is a shared
24 public resource that should be managed to safely
25 benefit multiple users, including local businesses,

1 bus riders, pedestrians, bike riders, drivers, both
2 visitors and residents alike. Proper curb
3 management, the policies, programs and regulations
4 which dictate the functionality of this space, is
5 critical to allow the city to expand its travel
6 choices, support business activity, manage
7 congestion, improve neighborhood livability, reduce
8 pollution, and enhance traffic and pedestrian safety.
9 When it comes to parking, DOT has over 385,000 signs
10 specifying who can park when, where, and for how
11 long. DOT maintains over 85,000 metered parking
12 spaces served by over 14,000 parking meters and the
13 ParkNYC pay by cell program. As we testified back in
14 June, we have accomplished two major transformation
15 of our metered parking system in recent years, one of
16 the largest in the world, through the transition to
17 muni-meters and the launch of ParkNYC.
18 DOT is now exploring a third transformation towards
19 and integrated, electronic payment and license plate-
20 based, electronic payment and permit management and
21 enforcement solution. The rollout of ParkNYC
22 together with NYPD's ASES enforcement handhelds for
23 their TEAs, are potential first steps in this
24

1
2 process, which would allow for much more efficient
3 and fraud-resistant parking enforcement.

4 Since ParkNYC became citywide in July 2017, usage
5 has steadily increased to the point where now 1 in 8
6 of the \$2.3 million parking transactions in a typical
7 week are handled by ParkNYC and usage continues to
8 grow. Customers have reported that they strongly
9 prefer the app to using the meters and find it far
10 more convenient. They know about, use, and like the
11 ability to extend their parking session from their
12 smart phone. And we are happy to say that the data
13 indicates relatively high satisfaction with the app
14 overall.

15 On the other hand, DOT is learning that users of
16 the app want to park longer than the one- or two-hour
17 limits currently allow posted for most passenger
18 parking and may be willing to pay progressively
19 higher rates in order to do so. This is something we
20 are trying with our regulations in Manhattan below
21 96th Street, where we recently added a second,
22 higher-priced hour to one-hour metered parking zones
23 to offer a little extra time for those who need it
24 while still promoting curb availability.

1
2 While some of the features proposed in today's
3 bills are ones we could explore in the future, DOT is
4 also actively seeking input from the public about how
5 to make it more convenient for them to park and pay
6 for parking using customer surveys to identify what
7 improvements they would most like to see. In
8 general, moving away from cash to virtual payments
9 will lend greater flexibility.

10 When it comes to innovation, another area we are
11 focused on is our regulations, which have not always
12 kept up with the ebbs and flows of New York City.
13 Changing land use and population shifts and evolving
14 neighborhoods and travel mode are putting added
15 pressure on the curb. New regulations such as those
16 for our carshare pilot are one example of needed
17 innovation.

18 But perhaps most glaringly, the structure of our
19 metered parking rates for both passenger and
20 commercial vehicles had not evolved very much as our
21 city transformed. Incredibly diverse settings were
22 served by similar regulations, providing little
23 curbside management benefit to many areas that depend
24 on meters to open up parking spaces for more people.

1
2 Recent meter rate changes are one example of
3 beginning an effort to more closely match the
4 prevailing regulations with the current activity and
5 needs of many areas of the city by creating a tiered
6 approach.

7 Finally, we know congestion is of concern to so
8 many stakeholders, including of course, this Council.
9 At DOT we look to maximize the safe use of our shared
10 street resources, including curbside parking, to
11 address congestion and best manage this limited
12 resource in such a dense city. So that is why it is
13 important for people to follow our parking
14 regulations, and why strong disincentives for not
15 following those regulations are necessary.

16 Now, beginning with INTROS 325 and 334. As DOT,
17 including Commissioner Trottenberg testified in 2014
18 and again in 2015 on predecessors to these two bills,
19 we understand it can be frustrating to overpay for
20 parking. I am pleased to report that one of the
21 chief features of ParkNYC is the ability to extend
22 the parking session from your phone, up to the legal
23 limit. This allows users to pay for only the minimum
24 time needed, while retaining the ability to add time
25 remotely if it becomes necessary to stay longer than

1
2 expected. In practice, users report frequently
3 taking advantage of this feature.

4 Regarding the proposals before you today, a
5 system for electronic exchange of unused time as
6 proposed in INTRO 334 is not something we have in our
7 current system and would be logistically complicated.
8 This is particularly true because the unit being
9 exchanged is not simply remaining value, but
10 remaining time, which is constantly diminishing. On
11 the other hand, the option to pay from your phone as
12 you go addresses the issue the bill seeks to solve by
13 providing users a means to not buy more time than
14 they need.

15 When it comes to the last increment of payment
16 before a meter's hours end and the occasional need to
17 go over the metered time, the ability with ParkNYC to
18 pay as you go instead of in advance has reduced the
19 occurrence of this as well. A system without the use
20 of cash would no longer require the use of
21 increments, perhaps a solution to the issues in
22 certain areas in the future.

23 Back when we testified in 2014, we produced some
24 estimates of the actual amount of this type of
25 overpaying. Of the amount that does occur, the

1 majority is in the commercial environment. For
2 passenger parking, updated for 2018 the amount is
3 approximately \$35,000 of overpayment for all
4 transaction annually, or a figure equal to about
5 .0008 percent of the payments we process in a typical
6 week. ON the other hand, the proposed solution would
7 be an amount into the millions of dollars to absolve
8 all parkers of the last increment of a meter's posted
9 time.
10

11 In partnership with the Council, DOT took the
12 major step starting in 2013 of ensuring that meters
13 are switched off and cannot accept payment outside
14 the hours they are in effect. While this may sound
15 straightforward, it was actually complicated on a
16 programming level, and with a meter system as large
17 as ours, the cost to implement was significant.

18 We also implemented the ability to pre-pay before
19 the start of meter hours, so that you can pay for
20 time up to the legal limit, starting when the
21 regulations begin. Previously, if you arrived before
22 a regulation started and you wanted to pay for
23 metered parking starting when the regulation began,
24 you were forced to pay for the time before the
25 regulation in addition, in order to park.

1
2 These two steps eradicated the vast majority of
3 overpayment issues faced by customers. Regarding
4 both the bills today, reprogramming the existing
5 system to meet these requirements would be costly and
6 would take time to implement while providing a very
7 small benefit. So, DOT does not support either piece
8 of legislation at the current time. But we look
9 forward to continuing discussions about what we are
10 learning customers want and making additional
11 enhancements in the future, for both customer
12 satisfaction and to best manage our curb for the
13 purposes I have mentioned.

14 Next, I will speak about INTRO 570, which would
15 waive parking violations when a single parking sign
16 is illegible. Our durable, high quality signage has
17 an average lifecycle of 10 years, and accordingly,
18 last year we installed 138,975 signs, or about 10
19 percent of our stock, and over 135,000 signs the year
20 before. DOT operates the largest municipal sign shop
21 in the country to support the continual maintenance
22 of our signs.

23 As background, over recent years, DOT has
24 undertaken an effort to update our signage and reduce
25 the clutter of excessive signage. In replacing old

1
2 signage with the current standards that will provide
3 more legibility and better lifespan, we have focused
4 on areas that we believe have a higher percentage of
5 signs that are at or beyond their useful life.

6 Overall, the public does a very good job of reporting
7 signs that need replacing. And in the case of
8 Alternate Side Parking, our single largest category
9 of parking regulatory signs, DSNY notifies us when a
10 sign is faded or has gone missing.

11 On most block faces there are multiple signs
12 which display the parking regulation. When someone
13 wishing to part encounters a faded sign, it is
14 usually as simple as looking up and down the block
15 for the next sign to confirm whether parking is
16 legal.

17 It is DOT's understanding that in the case of a
18 missing, faded or defaced sign, the enforcement agent
19 shall determine if there is sufficient parking
20 guidance on the block, and only then issue the
21 violation. As New York City Traffic Rules state, one
22 authorized regulatory sign anywhere on a block is
23 sufficient notice of restrictions in effect on that
24 block.

1
2 Finally, while the proposal may be conceived to
3 further incentivize DOT to replace illegible parking
4 signage, were it to be enacted, it might in fact
5 result in more motorists defacing signs so that they
6 park illegally without consequence, only leading to
7 further confusion of the current parking regulations.
8 For these reasons, DOT opposes INTRO 570, while we
9 encourage motorists to follow posted regulations that
10 apply.

11 Next, on the topic of truck parking, this
12 Administration recognizes that truck parking
13 overnight and in residential areas is a significant
14 issue. While the proposed pieces of legislation,
15 INTROS, 1010 and 1011, requires further discussion,
16 we are exploring charges that are available to more
17 frequently enforce higher fines that are currently
18 being used and are working with NYPD to determine the
19 feasibility. At the same time, the need for truck
20 parking in the five boroughs is a reality and
21 continued efforts involving multiple city agencies to
22 identify new options or sites are necessary.

23 Now, moving on to the topic of Leading Pedestrian
24 Intervals or LPis. INTRO 1142 would require DOT to
25 install at least 400 LPis annually at signalized

1 intersections adjacent to hospitals, schools, and
2 senior centers until all such intersections have
3 received an LPI. On behalf of DOT, we strongly
4 appreciate the Council's interest in the aggressive
5 implementation of this proven safety measure. We
6 have installed 2,774 LPIs since the start of Vision
7 Zero, including 855 last year. To put this in
8 context, since Vision Zero started installations are
9 up by 5,000 percent. In fact, we are hitting more
10 than double our goal every year.

12 We prioritize placement at high-crash
13 intersections and corridors. While we do consider
14 locations such as schools, DOT believes the
15 implementation of this treatment is best guided by
16 the safety data and our engineering judgement and we
17 therefore target Vision Zero priority corridors.

18 We are always happy to look at requests for
19 specific locations, as well. But requiring DOT to
20 follow a formula to target locations next to specific
21 facilities for 400 installations annually could
22 replace at least some other higher-crash locations
23 that we would select. And having to follow such a
24 formula could affect our overall efficiency as well,
25 that allows us to install such high numbers of LPIs

1
2 in recent years, a key Vision Zero accomplishment
3 which we plan to continue. Therefore, DOT opposed
4 the bill as drafted.

5 Now, turning to INTRO 206, which would require
6 DOT to install a pedestrian countdown display at
7 every location with a red-light camera. Pedestrian
8 countdown displays provide a proven safety benefit to
9 pedestrians. As DOT has testified previously, more
10 than half of all the City's over 14,000 signalized
11 intersections have a countdown display, and we have
12 plans to install more.

13 When it comes to intersections that have been
14 chosen based on safety data for installation of a
15 red-light camera, we reviewed those locations and
16 currently close to two-thirds have a pedestrian
17 countdown display as well. DOT will assess the
18 remaining locations for possible countdown display
19 installation based on our engineering judgement and
20 specifications.

21 Regarding INTRO 928, this proposal would require
22 no fewer than two diagonally opposite corners on each
23 street intersection to have a street name sign for
24 each street. This is the goal of all our
25 intersections, and it is the standard we are meeting

1
2 when we replace approximately 12,000 to 13,000 street
3 name signs each year across the City. However,
4 meeting the requirements for all the intersections
5 citywide within 180 days of enactment as required by
6 the bill would be a significant challenge to our
7 resources and would divert efforts from vital safety
8 work. Therefore, DOT opposes the bill.

9 Regarding INTRO 867, this proposal would require
10 DOT to assess every street in the City to determine
11 whether to change its one-way or two-way designation.
12 Conversions to one-way are in our Vision Zero toolkit
13 as part of our Street Improvement Projects. Such
14 assessments are appropriately guided by our data-
15 driven approach for safety improvements, or by
16 community interest. However, assessing all of our
17 6,000 miles of street in New York City for whether
18 they should have one way or two-way traffic flow is
19 not an appropriate targeting of our resources.
20 Therefore, while we are happy to further discuss the
21 topic of conversions, including how to identify the
22 streets on which to focus, DOT opposes this bill.

23 Regarding INTRO 886, to permit pet harbors to be
24 placed in front of commercial establishments, modeled
25 on an existing law for coin-operated rides, which

1
2 dates back to at least the 1980's. As you know, our
3 city has grown significantly, so have the demands
4 placed on our sidewalks to accommodate larger numbers
5 of pedestrians and our focus on accessibility for
6 persons with disabilities has never been greater.
7 DOT does not support this use of the sidewalk in
8 light of population growth, accessibility needs, and
9 other potential uses of the sidewalk space. In
10 addition to DOT's purview, other City agencies have
11 potential concerns and are in the process of
12 reviewing this legislation.

13 Regarding INTROs 497 and 370 to add addition
14 holidays to the ASP calendar, DSNY has testified on
15 similar legislation in the past and remains opposed.
16 These bills eliminate two additional days of
17 alternate side parking during the year, in addition
18 to the existing 34 alternate side parking holidays
19 that are already in place, some of which are for
20 multiple days. DSNY believes that their street
21 sweeping vehicles are the most effective tool in the
22 City's street cleaning arsenal, and further
23 reductions in street cleaning regulations would limit
24 the effectiveness of this tool. We at DOT refer
25 additional questions about these bills to them.

1
2 Finally, regarding INTRO 1140, promoting off-hour
3 deliveries is an important tool to reduce congestion
4 and emissions. DOT's off-hour deliveries program
5 focuses on shifting truck deliveries from peak
6 periods to off-hours in conjunction in specific
7 congested areas such as Midtown Manhattan, Downtown
8 Brooklyn, Flushing and Jamaica. We conduct targeted
9 outreach to business locations, and also work with
10 transporters and receivers to facilitate curbside
11 access needed to support such deliveries.

12 The bill before the committee today is a
13 worthwhile proposal that this Administration,
14 including DCAS and DOT, would be happy to explore
15 further before possibly implementing a plan.
16 Challenges to off-hour delivery can include the
17 transporters ability to service off-hour deliveries,
18 the availability of secure drop off facilities, the
19 potential for refrigeration if needed, and other
20 logistics. DOT has already initiated an assessment
21 of deliveries to DOT facilities to examine
22 opportunities for improving freight efficiency.

23 I will finish by saying that with so much density
24 of people and activity, we all know competition is
25 very fierce for the many uses of street and sidewalk

1
2 in New York City. At DOT, we are continually
3 improving and innovating how we manage this valuable
4 resource safely and efficiently for the greatest
5 benefit while balancing all of those competing uses.

6 Regarding some of our other signal and street
7 treatments we are discussing today, DOT welcomes
8 conversation with the Council about how we utilize all
9 the tools in our toolkit and as I have said, we are
10 always happy to review particular location. We would
11 now welcome any questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I have some
13 questions, but my colleague Council Member Salamanca
14 had to go or else I would have let him go first, but
15 of course I appreciate that you got from DOT
16 Sanitation is here. I've been a bit frustrated that
17 traffic and I hope that the issue that has many bills
18 related to traffic, I know that from DOT perspective,
19 you can answer some of the questions, but it doesn't
20 make sense that no one is here from traffic
21 enforcement to be able to respond to some of the
22 questions. Council Member Salamanca.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you Chair
24 Rodriguez. Thank you for your previous statement.
25 My questions really, you may think I'm going off

1
2 topic but I'm going to circle it back to my statement
3 or the reason for my bill which is INTRO 370 which
4 would require that on Three Kings Day alternate side
5 parking be suspended and as I stated in my statement
6 you know, this holiday, it's a holiday that's
7 celebrated by the Christian and Latino communities
8 but yet in your statement, DOT - because this is your
9 statement. There was no statement by sanitation,
10 your opposed to it. I have a question. Can you
11 explain to me the diversity in your leadership? I am
12 interested in knowing who in DOT will be opposed to
13 counseling alternate side parking on a holiday that's
14 highly respected and celebrated by the Latino
15 community, yet you feel that it's not necessary
16 cancel alternate side parking. So, can you explain
17 to me how many Hispanics do you have in the
18 leadership in DOT?

19 JOSHUA BENSON: Council Member, I appreciate the
20 question and I definitely understand the importance
21 of the holiday and the statement that I read is about
22 cleaning and it comes from DSNY, so I'm going to
23 defer the question to -

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: No, I understand that
25 but I'm just curious because the Department of

1
2 Transportation sent you to come and give a statement
3 here in City Hall. I would like for you to tell me,
4 how many leaders, how many Hispanic leaders are there
5 in the Department of Transportation?

6 REBECCA ZACK: Council Member, I can get back to
7 with information, we don't know -

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Exactly, you have no
9 idea how many Hispanic leaders there are in the
10 Department of Transportation, yet you want to sit
11 here and tell us that a holiday, that's highly
12 respected by the Hispanic community, can not get an
13 alternate side suspended.

14 REBECCA ZACK: I just want to clarify one thing.
15 Because there's so many bills and its just only a
16 couple bills for DSNY, we were including their
17 testimony in our testimony, so be a little more
18 streamline effective. We don't oppose the bill we
19 were speaking on behalf of.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Well, your statement
21 says that you are not supporting the bill, so
22 therefore, you're opposing the bill.

23 REBECCA ZACK: I think we could have clarified
24 that a little bit better on behalf of DSNY is the
25 opposition.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, you do not know
3 how many Hispanic leaders you have in the Department
4 of Transportation?

5 REBECCA ZACK: I don't know that off the top of
6 my head.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I'm sorry Ms. Zack.

8 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And let me
9 this. You know, everyone lives with their pride the
10 group that we come from and make this city a great
11 place. The Jewish, the Italians, the Irish, African-
12 American, Latinos, Black, and others. There is a
13 reality here. I don't think that many people even
14 know that in the 1900 Census the New York City
15 population was 96 percent white, 2 percent African-
16 American, Latino were no counting. Today's
17 population is 29 percent Latino, 27 percent African-
18 American. Together in the 50 percent nation, we made
19 the largest group here. Based on **[inaudible 38:20]**
20 who unfortunately died, a great epidemic and I don't
21 think that anything has changed.

22 I do give credit for some improvement that we
23 have seen in the City, but no doubt that was Council
24 Member Salamanca is bringing and he is so connected
25 with the bill that I fully support, and I hope that

1
2 we can work together because its important. It
3 should be important for everyone. This is important
4 to the second largest group of New Yorkers in the
5 City and not into the question, there's a reality.
6 There are 10,000 leadership positions in the City of
7 New York and there's only 200 Latino in leadership
8 position.

9 So, yes, we are lacking our fair representation
10 in government, academic, media, and other places and
11 that's why when we have any hearing here, you all are
12 going to see a lot of Latinos sitting there
13 representing those and I think as African-American
14 community, having very efficient making the cases.
15 Anytime that there are panels and there's no
16 representation for African-American community, they
17 speak loud and clear and we are in solidarity with
18 the call but it our time to say, where is our Latino
19 seat in all agencies? So, the reality is that no,
20 there is not Latino fair representation in any agency
21 of the City of New York and that's why probably
22 there's a lack of understand on how important it is
23 to work on this bill. Not only for Puerto Ricans or
24 Dominican but for all Latinos.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you Mr. Chair.
3 My question to Sanitation, how many Latino leaders do
4 you have in the leadership in the Department of
5 Sanitation.

6 EDWARD GRAYSON: Good morning. My boss, the
7 first Deputy Commissioner is a Latino. We have a
8 couple of Chiefs that are Latino, so we have – Latino
9 is at the upper ranks in Sanitation, I don't have an
10 exact number to give you, but I report directly to a
11 Latino leader every day.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: That's awesome. So,
13 can you explain to me why would the Department of
14 Sanitation be opposed to a highly respected holiday
15 in the Latino community?

16 EDWARD GRAYSON: We're not opposed to –

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: To the side parking –
18 canceling of the –

19 EDWARD GRAYSON: No, no, we're opposed to
20 canceling of alternate side parking. We are not
21 opposed to it because of the catalyst event. Our
22 job, our core mission is to keep the streets clean.
23 We work very hard to try to do that.

24 Our most effective tool in keeping New York City
25 clean for all New Yorkers regardless of race and

1
2 denomination, is – our most effective tool is
3 mechanical brooms. In order for that tool to be
4 effective, we need the ASP regulations in effect.
5 So, we oppose anything that takes a day away from us
6 being able to clean up. That's what we're opposed
7 to, not the cost, not the requesters cost, just the
8 fact that we can't get the street clean every time
9 the suspensions are lifted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, thank you. Mr.
11 Chair, again, I really thank you for your support and
12 I want to thank my 18 colleagues who have signed onto
13 this bill. When you look at the 34 days of alternate
14 side parking that has been suspended, you know, you
15 have a various, – there suspended for various
16 religious reasons and I just feel that the Three
17 Kings Day is also a holiday that should be considered
18 as a 35th day to suspend alternate side parking.
19 With that, thank you Mr. Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Let me ask you a
21 question. First of all, we appreciate the work that
22 men and women do in Sanitation, keeping our City
23 clean, picking up garbage and this is something that
24 we would be working at the Council helping ensuring
25 by every year the negligence of the administration is

1 not funding for you guys to be able to keep picking
2 up our garbage, so however, it is by adding important
3 holidays as we also are doing other – suspending
4 other days, it doesn't mean that we are adding more
5 to the issues on how the street can not be doing the
6 work. This is about as we have done with other
7 holidays, we feel that this particular one is so
8 critical, especially for the Latino and the Asian
9 community. How many – I have a few questions now.
10 How many tickets were given last year because of
11 traffic violation?
12

13 JOSHUA BENSON: Council Member we don't have the
14 parking violation data with us. We could certainly
15 get that back to you.

16 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And again, very
17 proud of the work that we have done, and we will
18 continue doing at the DOT, but we don't have the
19 answer because there is no one here from traffic and
20 we ask for you guys, the administration should know.
21 Not that particular agency but the administration as
22 a whole that a hearing we have all those many bills,
23 should be sure that everyone for the agency, that who
24 could provide those questions, they should be here.
25 Do you know like how many – we'll talk about the

1
2 important to update this Three Signal in New York
3 City, like, how many – do you know like how many
4 signals do we have right now that they should be
5 updated?

6 JOSHUA BENSON: Can you clarify the question a
7 little bit? We have 14,000 traffic signals,
8 intersection of the traffic signals. What do you
9 mean by updating them?

10 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: **[Inaudible 44:31]**
11 that they are not working anymore but still people
12 are getting ticket because they are not using anymore
13 and still, the City has not updated those – churches
14 that used to be opened.

15 REBECCA ZACK: Oh, you mean the parking signs not
16 a traffic signal.

17 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, the parking
18 sign.

19 REBECCA ZACK: Because when a traffic signal is
20 out, we just batch emergent servers on to that.

21 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: But how many signs
22 do you feel that should be –

23 REBECCA ZACK: Parking signs are like defaced or
24 faded or whatever. I'm actually not sure.

1
2 JOSHUA BENSON: So, at any given moment I don't
3 think we know the number, what we do is, we rely a
4 lot on the public in particular and Council Members,
5 your constituents, to report any issues like that
6 that they see.

7 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Well we need to
8 know because we are reaping New Yorkers their money
9 for - We're taking their money knowing as an
10 individual, as a particular agency.

11 We as a city are taking money from the pockets of
12 people. Like there's a movie theater and its not odd
13 to say Council Member, please give me the
14 information. You know what I mean, like why a movie
15 theater used to be working at on of the **[inaudible**
16 **45:40]** in Broadway and that movie theater has been
17 closed for the last two years and DOT, they don't get
18 it that that no parking sign should be removed
19 immediately.

20 You know you as an institution whose ever agency
21 gather report that that movie theater is closed.
22 That sign should be - if it's not needed because of
23 pedestrian safety, which I supported. Why **[inaudible**
24 **46:05]**, that a fine line that it's not working
25 anymore, and residents need more. They're getting

1
2 tickets because we need that money to balance the
3 budget. Why sanitation is continued like, no like,
4 sometimes giving tickets in area like people sitting
5 waiting for the control to pass by and you're still
6 giving those tickets when their driver is still
7 waiting to move their car.

8 So, when I look to those signs, my concern is
9 don't come and tell us only little information
10 because I can tell it's important to allow the dog
11 owners to be able to work with their business and
12 establish you know, they harbor its space in front of
13 the business, because you know, I'm all about
14 sidewalks.

15 I'm about pedestrians and cyclists as a top
16 priority but for me, it doesn't make sense, and
17 everything is local about, but I can tell you story
18 is simply that I know many council members can tell
19 you.

20 A year ago, I told you guys, I can show you a
21 photo. So, Nicholas Avenue between 180 and 181st, a
22 business owner takes 90 percent of the sidewalk plus
23 the street. If you go right now and you guys are not
24 enforcing on someone who in DOT has information,
25 traffic has that information, and say we can't work

1
2 on it. So, when we have major issues on someone that
3 is taking like 90 percent of the sidewalk and you're
4 doing nothing and not only that, their even taking
5 the street right now if you go and here **[inaudible**
6 **48:03]** of something that is part of life or everyone
7 in New York to say, whoever on the dock, they should
8 be able to put it in a location close to their
9 business, to have their dinners – how can we balance?
10 You know, how can you work with us to be sure that we
11 go after those who violate you know, every day and I
12 can tell you right now, cases, that's one of many
13 that we have in many communities.

14 People who are using the sidewalk and we as a
15 city are doing nothing and then here, we are – and
16 so, yes you may build. That is important for a large
17 percent is on New Yorkers who say how can we work.
18 So, how can we balance? How can we execute and go
19 after those who violate as my case and the one that I
20 told you, and I gave information to you guys a year
21 ago and at the same time work with something that is
22 important for a large percent of the New Yorkers to
23 allow to take their dog when their having a brunch,
24 when they have a dinner, when they have coffee.

25

1
2 REBECCA ZACK: You're referencing the grocery
3 store in your district correct.

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Excuse me.

5 REBECCA ZACK: The grocery store on Saint
6 Nicholas Avenue -

7 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: It's on Nicholas
8 Avenue between -

9 REBECCA ZACK: Right, that's the one and I think
10 there had been a multiagency effort I think also with
11 DC-

12 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: What are we
13 waiting for.

14 REBECCA ZACK: I know, can I get more details
15 from my borough office and follow up.

16 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: You can but you
17 had a year ago, many times, over and over.

18 REBECCA ZACK: Understood.

19 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And anyone that
20 goes right now and take a photo, abusing the whole
21 sidewalk and abusing the street, in both sides of the
22 street. So, one, work with me, work with us in cases
23 where people are abusing. They're excessively using
24 the sidewalk that they are not supposed to. They are
25 supposed to have three feet and then let's work with

1
2 us with the bill as we have many representatives or
3 animal rights who love [inaudible 50:02] and the
4 Council Member here and let's see how we can work
5 around the bill.

6 REBECCA ZACK: We always enjoy working with you
7 Council Member and I think we've made great strides
8 in the past five years, so we welcome that.

9 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. On
10 sanitation how close do you work in coordination with
11 traffic? With the traffic enforcement agents?

12 JOSHUA BENSON: With the NYPD Traffic
13 Enforcement?

14 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Hmm, hmm.

15 JOSHUA BENSON: They're in there. They get
16 assigned agnostic to how we are signed. So, we do
17 not - we are aware, we do not summons any vehicle
18 that they have already summons. That is something
19 that we completely - its right there on the ticket,
20 we bypass it because as it pertains only to street
21 cleaning regulations, but we don't dispatch our
22 assets around where they dispatch theirs.

23 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay, again, I
24 know all about supporting sanitation department for
25 you to be able to enforce the law, so that you can be

1
2 sure that they pick up the garbage and clean the
3 streets. I have issues sometimes with a certain
4 agency that I feel, that still even though it doesn't
5 happen as before, I believe there is still
6 productivity and is also mandated and there is like a
7 number of tickets enforcement has to give every day
8 and that's why sometimes instead of only going for
9 after those who violate the law, which we should.
10 There're also cases of us giving ticket. And
11 that's why I say its so sad that traffic is not here
12 to respond to questions on how they guarantee that
13 they are working to go after those who violate the
14 law but at the same time, not to abuse it and yes,
15 given a ticket sometimes is given because they have
16 to give a number of tickets every day. Do we think
17 we used to the productivity today, enforcement for
18 traffic and I didn't mention NYPD on traffic, they
19 have to give a number of tickets every day?

20 REBECCA ZACK: I'm sorry, could you say that
21 again regarding NYPD traffic?

22 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And again, if you
23 cannot answer because of traffic, I'm fine with that
24 if you can give me the question with someone. Does
25

1
2 the New York City Traffic NYPD enforcement traffic
3 have to a number of tickets every day?

4 REBECCA ZACK: I'm sorry, I don't know that
5 answer to that.

6 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and my last
7 thing is about congestions. There is a lot of
8 concern and you hear from my colleague now **[inaudible**
9 **52:56]** about trying to work around being sure that
10 commercial trucks, they are not parking the rest of
11 the day and ensure to limit it but that's also
12 connected for me with an incentive.

13 What incentive are we providing to the truck
14 associations and all the members that work around
15 them to be sure that they focus on delivering a
16 night?

17 JOSHUA BENSON: Chairman it's an excellent
18 question and deliveries at night, you know there's
19 some and maybe they're not evidence to everybody, but
20 there are some real congestion benefits to deliveries
21 at night. Its - you know, the traffic is both
22 lighter, so it's a benefit to the person making the
23 deliver that they're not sitting in delays and then
24 on the flip side, they're not contributing to the
25 congestion during the peak periods.

1
2 So, at DOT, we have an off-hour delivery program
3 and that consists of doing outreach and demand
4 management with both receivers of deliveries and
5 transporters and trying to work through their
6 concerns and make a match where we can and its
7 difficult. There are a lot of challenges, there are
8 a lot of – you know, there are a lot of reasons why
9 people take deliveries during the day, quite frankly
10 and you know, in particularly on the staffing side at
11 the receiving site, tends to be the biggest challenge
12 and so, one of the things we try to encourage people
13 is to look at lock boxes and other ways of securely
14 receiving goods while no staff are present at the
15 facility.

16 So, those are some of the things we work on.
17 There are about 100 businesses right now
18 participating in the off-hour delivery program at
19 about 300 sites. So, we are just trying to build on
20 that momentum.

21 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I just feel that
22 based on conversations that I have with the
23 stakeholder from Truck Association months ago, there
24 is a need for you know, DOT and DCAS to continue
25 working close with them, so that as we approach those

1 bills that we have here and I understand that it is
2 important to protect the residential area, but also
3 work with the members of the Truck Association to be
4 sure that as we continue addressing congestion, that
5 is real and this is our time to put together a
6 comprehensive plan related to congestion that those
7 institutions who delivered food and other goods that
8 they also continue being engaged with DOT and DCAS to
9 talk about incentive and not only ongoing after then,
10 so that's one thing.

12 My last thing is about my two bills. One is the
13 one that is rounding up parking time. I feel that
14 people should pay only for the time that they park.
15 If someone needed to park for 50 minutes, they should
16 only pay for those 15 minutes. They should not be
17 forced to pay for an hour and I feel that the
18 technology is there for it to make that happen and I
19 hope that we can continue conversations about the
20 rounding up and I know that we have started many
21 times being on opposite sides in some bills and some
22 initiatives through conversations. We decide to do
23 things through legislation and as an agency, any
24 agency now, in the future, in the past, will prefer
25 to do more by themselves but I fear that whatever way

1 through legislation or through the agency the
2 rounding up parking time is nearing. Someone
3 shouldn't be paying more than when they are using the
4 time.
5

6 The second thing on the INTRO 334 that will
7 require DOT to create mobile application or approve
8 the use of mobile application that would connect
9 individuals so that they can exchange unused muni-
10 meter time. Who ever pay, is there time, its not our
11 time and it's their money and again, I remember
12 coming back from DC when I introduced a bill that
13 will ask DOT to add to create an application and we
14 were able to work together with you guys and we did
15 it through the agency. One was on here, technology
16 is there. When you say that probably there is some
17 complication how to do it, you will hear from many
18 techs that we should be able to work to
19 allow exchange unused muni-meter time.

20 As a Council Member as I've been told there's a
21 bill that I have that I've been told by stakeholders
22 and they say look, if you pass this bill the City
23 will reduce \$85 million because you know, we would
24 not be able to enforce in those areas and I think
25 that yes, we would need this money to keep the

1
2 library up and get more hours for the library but
3 this is about technology is there and how can we work
4 with the tech field to be sure that if you have any
5 doubt on how that can be addressed, that we can work
6 -

7 JOSHUA BENSON: Mr. Chairman, I agree that you
8 know we have a lot of great ideas on the tech side
9 that could make some of this possible and I think we
10 absolutely want to keep working with you and keep
11 refining our parkNYC app. You know, we just launched
12 it now only two years ago and I think absolutely, we
13 don't see this as - it's not perfect, it's not the
14 end state. We want to keep refining it and working
15 on it, so we would be more than happy to work with
16 you on delivering some more benefits to the customers
17 and finding ways to further eliminate any overpayment
18 that maybe happening.

19 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you.
20 I would like to acknowledge that Council Member
21 Reynoso, Miller, Deutsch, and Levin they are here and
22 now they we're going to question the findings.
23 Council Member Koo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Chair. Thank you,
25 Commissioners. So, my question is I am very

1
2 disappointed that the administration is opposing the
3 bill 497 and 370 because we always said this is a
4 City of diversity, culture and ethics and a heritage
5 for every group of people in the city. So, my
6 question is you said you would make the street dirty
7 if you put two more days on the schedule. So, what
8 do you do on the particular day of sweeping?
9 Alternate side cleaning, what does sanitation do on
10 the particular hour or two hours that you can not
11 park on the street, right?

12 JOSHUA BENSON: Yes, so your asking - just so I'm
13 clear, your asking what do we do on the days that the
14 street is suspended? Well, the mechanical brooms
15 will still go out in a limited number to get, because
16 there are some open curb lines, regardless - they're
17 not directly ASP driven, that we also clean. So, we
18 will put them out to add some level of service but
19 the routing of our regular posted signage, those
20 regulations, does not get completed on any day that
21 its suspended.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, when we celebrate a
23 holiday, its particularly the Asian Lunar New Year or
24 the Lunar New Years' Eve, we don't have a parade.
25 You know, the streets are not dirty. No one makes

1
2 the streets more dirty. We celebrate at home or in
3 the restaurants. So, why does it effect the
4 cleanings of the streets?

5 JOSHUA BENSON: You actually bring a very good
6 point. Its not directly related to any holiday.
7 Unfortunately, there is liter in the city every day,
8 regardless of holiday and our mechanical brooms are
9 our most effective tool to clean the city for all New
10 Yorkers every time we run them. So, we're not saying
11 that - our position is not that any holiday would
12 impact direct brand-new liter being put on the
13 street. We have to clean the street everyday to the
14 best of our ability, adding two more suspension days
15 makes it more difficult for sanitation to do that.
16 That is all.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah but, you already had 34
18 days -

19 JOSHUA BENSON: 34 reasons to suspend, some of
20 those are multiple. So, like for calendar year, 18 I
21 believe it was like 40 or 41.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, I don't understand the
23 significance, adding two more days there.

24 JOSHUA BENSON: Oh, well, because you don't clean
25 the streets.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: You already have a list of so many days. Okay, do you know all the days? Can you say them out to me? All the holidays?

JOSHUA BENSON: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I mean its not the holidays.

JOSHUA BENSON: No, I would gladly. Martin Luther King Jr. Day, Lincolns Birthday, Ash Wednesday, Asian Lunar New Year, Washington's Birthday aka Presidents Day, Purim Holy Thursday, Good Friday, Past Over, the first and second days. Holy Thursday, Good Friday, I'm sorry. **[Inaudible 1:03:06]**, Shavuot, Eid Al-Adha, Eid al-Fitr, Feast of Assumption, Idahosa, Rosh Hashanah, Yom Kippur, **[inaudible 1:03:15]**, **b** **[inaudible 1:03:17]** Columbus Day, All Saints Day, Diwali, Election Day, Veterans Day and Thanksgiving, the Immaculate conception and Christmas.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, I'm sure on this we always spend all those holidays, right? I'm sure some of us don't recognize some of those holidays. Do you recognize all those holidays? What is the purpose of it?

JOSHUA BENSON: Well, I recognize them all. They're on the calendar. I don't treat the street.

1
2 Do I personally celebrate all of them? No sir, I do
3 not.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Because to me the argument is
5 Three Kings Day is a very important holiday for the
6 Latinos, right? Asian Lunar and New Years' are very
7 important days for Asian Americans, so we want to
8 include these days on the list of alternate street
9 side cleaning. So, we wanted to do it. If you don't
10 want to do it, our Council will do it for you.

11 JOSHUA BENSON: Dually noted sir.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And one more point is for
13 transportation, on the meter parking I notice in
14 Flushing, we have to pay the meter until 10:00 p.m.
15 but while in the city and other parts of Queens, its
16 up to 7:00 p.m. So, my constituents are always
17 complaining to me. You know we are paying a single
18 hour being discriminated, you know, we had to pay
19 meters up to 10:00 p.m. at least. So, why is the
20 discrepancy you know.

21 JOSHUA BENSON: Council Member its an excellent
22 question, very astute question, so the metered hours
23 vary by location. They're not uniform across all five
24 boroughs and places that tend to have more activity,
25 more congestion, more customers, will tend to have

1
2 longer meter parking hours. So, I think the meat
3 packing district actually has the latest metered
4 parking hours because of very late-night activity
5 there. So, the flushing, downtown flushing as you
6 well know is a very busy area. It's a very popular
7 area. Many people are driving there to park and you
8 know, partake of the establishments there. So, it
9 reflects the activity. That's the purpose of it and -

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Constituents are arguing
11 that the city won't do - it's just to get more money
12 you know from our district.

13 JOSHUA BENSON: So, the purpose behind it is to
14 turn that parking over, make it available for more
15 customers and you know, if there's a particular
16 situation that you don't feel is working, we would be
17 happy to talk with you about it and we can make
18 adjustments.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, I think we ought to
20 discuss on those because in downtown New York, its up
21 to 7:00 p.m., if you go to the bathroom in the
22 meantime, 7:00 p.m. they stop.

23 JOSHUA BENSON: It varies. There are definitely
24 places in Midtown where it goes much later than that.
25 Near the theater district, you know, but we would be

1
2 happy to review any site with you and look at it for
3 sure.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay, sure, thank you.

5 JOSHUA BENSON: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I just – you know,
7 I would like to reinforce what I said before as I was
8 addressing the importance of the support that I'm
9 putting behind the Three King Days and the Lunar Day.

10 I don't think that the city – I believe that the
11 city needs – we need to create a task force to revise
12 holidays that we all serve and also to look at all the
13 included, because I feel that I respect all the days
14 that you mentioned and I join – I will continue to
15 join my celebration on those days but I feel its not
16 on sanitation, its we as a city. The city does not
17 get it how we have changed. How there's a
18 group like the Asians, more than 70 percent. Latino
19 is 29 percent and I feel that in order for our
20 children that we are raising right now, you don't have
21 to Asian or Latino to understand that piece.

22 The piece of history, how we celebrate that. So,
23 my thing is it would be remitted, and I will be
24 working with colleague. I already told him I started
25 to put it in this request to create a task force. To

1
2 look at all the days that **[inaudible 1:07:35]** all the
3 days. That also we should study and see if we should
4 include those days and serve in a loving light as we
5 have done on other days.

6 I would like to acknowledge Council Member
7 Menchaca now, Council Member Yeger, and follow with
8 Council Member Constantinides.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you, Mr.
10 Chairman. Good morning, as the chairman indicated
11 earlier we are hearing 13 bills today designed to make
12 it easier for people to live in New York, to do
13 business in New York, to make it fairer, to make our
14 streets safer, to recognize the various cultures and
15 religious observances that people have in the city to
16 rid our residential neighborhoods of commercial
17 parking to keep trucks off neighborhood streets. To
18 do good things for New Yorkers, 13 bills.

19 I listened to your testimony, I read it before
20 you started speaking and then I listened to every word
21 you said. Not a single one of those 13 ideas are
22 things you agree with as currently written, not a
23 single one. I don't agree with all 13 bills. I co-
24 sponsor some of them because I think their great
25 ideas. Some of them I think are good ideas, some of

1
2 them I need to be convinced but in a universe of 13, I
3 was able to find at least one that I thought was a
4 good idea that I could sign on to.

5 You can't find a single idea in these 13 bills
6 that you like and its not the only 13. Chairman
7 Rodriguez has a bill that would allow people to
8 reclaim their streets in their neighborhoods after the
9 street sweepers have gone by. So, in the 90-minute
10 zone, when you can't park, and the street cleaner
11 comes by in the first ten minutes. The next 80
12 minutes go back to the community, so people can park
13 again. You oppose that. Its not being heard today,
14 but you oppose that.

15 There are a number of parking bills that are not
16 being heard today that you oppose as well. So, let's
17 just talk about the universe of 13. Not a single one
18 of these bills is something you can live with? Not a
19 single one of these ideas is something you can say,
20 you know what Council, you also got elected, you're
21 here to serve the public, we'll agree with that. Some
22 of these bills have the votes to pass. I'm not sure
23 what it is that you really want from New Yorkers, I
24 really don't. I really don't. I wake up every
25 morning and I see some of the things that DOT does,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

some of the things that sanitation does, I appreciate that you pick up the trash, I really do, but in my neighborhood on the board that I share with Councilman Deutsch, we have a commercial area and a residential area that has midnight to three regulation. The middle of the night, people can't park on one day a week on the other side of the street, you know, it alternates, trying to get that removed and changed to a 7:30 to 8:00 a.m. or an 8:00 to 8:30 a.m., so people can park overnight. It's hard for people to park overnight. I hunt for parking. The Department of Sanitation opposes that. WE don't have enough street sweepers they say, to hit the streets from 7:30 to 8:00. It will affect our ability to keep the streets clean. No body I know believes that. I don't even think your department believes that but there's this resistance to change. The idea that you would oppose a bill that would require a summons to be dismissed if the sign is not legible because a. people couldn't look up and down the block for the legible signs. B. Because don't worry about it, New Yorkers Traffic Agents only write tickets when the sign is very legible and otherwise, they won't write a ticket. They only write good tickets, we all know that and C.

1
2 New Yorkers, you awful people that we are, are going
3 to just go around with spray paint and start spraying
4 up the signs. I mean does this make sense? This is
5 how our government is reacting to these ideas. In
6 what universe does any of this make sense. I'm not
7 even asking for a question. This is a reflection on
8 what I've been hearing today. ParkingNYC app, I use
9 it. When the time expires, even if there's more time
10 that you're permitted to park there, you can't renew
11 it.

12 You have to wait about I think its 15 minutes or
13 a half hour even if your still within that hour or
14 two-hour zone. So, if I park my car and pay .25 cents
15 because I thought I'd only be there for 15 minutes.
16 If I'm wrong, just wave your hand, I'll stop talking.
17 Am I wrong?

18 JOSHUA BENSON: I just want to respond to that
19 point on ParkNYC. So, the app should be allowing you
20 to renew your time up to the time limit, if its not -

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: After it expires.
22 Another words, if I bought 15 minutes and now its 18
23 minutes and I want to renew at the same meter, I can
24 just renew it?

25

1
2 JOSHUA BENSON: So, you have to renew it before
3 it expires and you -

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: That's what I just
5 said.

6 JOSHUA BENSON: You should be able to set it up
7 to get an alert to renew it before the expiration.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Sir, I agree with what
9 you're saying. I can do it before it expires, but I'm
10 saying, I park for 15 minutes, put the quarter on the
11 app, went into the dry cleaners, below and behold,
12 there is 11 people in front of me, so it took me 17
13 minutes and I didn't take out my phone and put more
14 time in, but now I realize its 17 minutes later, gosh,
15 I got to put another quarter on the app and I take out
16 my phone and I try to do that, no sir. No, you can't
17 do that.

18 JOSHUA BENSON: You're correct.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: That's right.

20 JOSHUA BENSON: That's something we would love to
21 work with you on.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Don't work with me on
23 it. I'm not a tech guy. Its broken, it didn't break
24 yesterday. Its been broken since the day your rolled
25 it out. I'm not here to micromanage your agency.

1
2 Anybody who follows me on twitter, knows I can't
3 manage anything in your agency, but there are things
4 that you're doing that are so simple to not do and you
5 just don't want to do it, and then you come in front
6 of the Council and I'm sorry that the Commissioner
7 couldn't be bothered. I'm sure she's very busy today
8 painting bus lines in my neighborhood but the idea
9 that you're here today and you can't find a single
10 idea that we like, - Mr. Chairman I recognize the
11 clock and I'll wrap up. You can't find a single idea
12 that you like. You can't find - you know these
13 problems exist and the app has rolled out for two
14 years and I've been using it for entirety of the two
15 years. I'm sure that's something that you can check
16 and see my name in there and how much money I've put
17 in it. I still use it all the time. You know these
18 problems exist. Don't tell us that hey, you know,
19 it's not a final product yet. No technology product
20 is ever a final product. These are problems you know
21 of. Replace the signs its not rocket science. You
22 know that sign - you New Yorkers have to let us know
23 when the sign is bad. No, your traffic agents have to
24 let you know when the sign is bad. We pay them.

25 Mr. Chair I appreciate your time, thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Council
3 Constantinides.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Chair
5 Rodriguez. So, just quickly about the LPIs, what is
6 the process that DOT looks at for the installation of
7 LPIs?

8 JOSHUA BENSON: Council Member, thank you very
9 much for the question and if your – we agree with you
10 strongly that it's a great tool and so what we do to
11 roll them out is we're actually looking at places
12 where pedestrians were injured over time. So, we have
13 crash data that we're sorting through and looking for
14 corridors and intersections that show a history of
15 those type of crashes and that's where we focus the
16 effort for LPIs. I think its in the same vein as what
17 your proposing but its just a slightly different way
18 of looking at it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And so, how many
20 do we install every year?

21 JOSHUA BENSON: Last year was 855.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: 855?

23 JOSHUA BENSON: Yeah.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay and how many
25 of them are near schools?

1
2 JOSHUA BENSON: We could do an analysis and give
3 you that number but again, we're not tying them to
4 schools, we're tying them to where the pedestrians
5 were being injured. So, I don't have that number but
6 there will be many that are near schools for sure,
7 hundreds.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And I
9 wholeheartedly agree that we have to take care of
10 those intersections. There's not a disagreement
11 there. I'm just saying that as a proactive step,
12 right, I would rather have a situation where we're not
13 responding to a tragedy and actually get out in front
14 and these are areas where senior centers, parks,
15 schools, hospitals, where we have children, seniors,
16 crossing the street where there's potential for issues
17 and we trying to be proactive. So, I'm hoping that we
18 can walk and chew gum at the same time. That we can
19 take care of the reactive issues, which are very
20 serious and still be proactive, correct?

21 JOSHUA BENSON: We would love to do both, and we
22 do try to do both and so I think we take any and all
23 requests that people have for LPIs and we accommodate
24 those as well as the approach I was describing. So, I
25 agree very much so with you that LPIs are a great

1
2 tool. We are trying to protect pedestrians in the
3 best way we can and there's an efficiency to doing
4 groupings of them and that's what we do but we
5 absolutely take requests and want to be proactive with
6 you as well.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And I think we
8 need to do more than just take requests. I think we
9 need to be a little bit more proactive here in our
10 policy. Me being able to point out intersections, I
11 may or may not get an LPI. They're a great tool, we
12 should come up with a more formulated idea than just
13 me sending you requests, correct?

14 JOSHUA BENSON: We would love to sit down with
15 you and explore revisions to our methodology and see
16 whether we could come up with something that you know,
17 is a little different than what we've been using, but
18 continuing to you know, address the need.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright and so,
20 moving onto the nighttime deliveries and I think that
21 again, I wholeheartedly agree with the administrations
22 visions zero plan and I think these fits within it.
23 What would need to happen for us to get an agreement
24 with DCAS here to make this a reality?

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

JOSHUA BENSON: So, we've spoken with DCAS and I think you know DOT ourselves, we've undertaken an assessment of our own deliveries to try to get familiar and come up with our own internal strategy around evening deliveries, but I think they're eager to look at this issue with us, with you. So, I think we could explore this further together and I think it's something there's a lot of interest around.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I think that we need to get it done right? As we're looking to reduce traffic on our streets, coming up and having the city lead the way, when it comes to nighttime deliveries and getting those deliveries and during non-rush hour times when our streets are already packed, already dealing with lots of congestion. Getting City deliveries off the road during those times are extremely important, I think we have that shared goal, correct?

JOSHUA BENSON: Yes, I agree with you and I think it's a paradox where you know, its hard for people to see what those benefits are. It's sort of abstract so, I think demonstrating it is the way to go.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: So, do I. I think its time for us to lead the way. So, I

1
2 appreciate that we're going to be able to get there on
3 this and I look forward to working with the Chair to
4 getting this plan done and I'll just comment on this
5 whole issue of the DSNY opposition to these two bills
6 today and let's say how civil it sounds. Frankly, I
7 wasn't going to comment but hearing the defense that
8 somehow losing two days of broom is going to somehow
9 point our city in a bad direction when it comes to
10 street cleaning, I find that to be a very flimsy
11 argument. I really do. I think there are 365 days in
12 the year, there are 34 days that are currently
13 suspended adding to more, in respect, particular
14 holidays for Latino communities, for Asian
15 communities, it just makes sense and the argument that
16 we're making today, I hear it, and this doesn't ring
17 true in any way shape or form. So, that's my comment,
18 you can respond to that or not.

19 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Council
20 Member. Council Member Deutsch.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you Chair. Thank
22 you for this important hearing. So, first I just want
23 to commend Deputy Commissioner Rebecca Zack, that's
24 the title I gave you and I could definitely say that

1
2 you could walk, chew gum, talk on the phone, and
3 listen to everything at the same.

4 So, I commend you for being able to multitask and
5 I had a great experience always with you offline and
6 online, so I want to thank you for everything you do.
7 So, I just want to touch upon INTRO 570. So, in
8 testimony, you mentioned that when a sign is faded,
9 its as simple as looking up and down the block for the
10 next sign to confirm whether parking is legal. So,
11 our city, just, I want to mention that it used to be
12 accommodating for all and its very difficult for a
13 senior citizen when he or she needs to walk out of the
14 car to start looking for unfaded sign, that's legible
15 as well as parent with children, you know, to walk out
16 of the car, otherwise you have to leave the kids
17 behind the car, which is not good. But then you have
18 to walk out with the children to go look for a sign
19 that is legible. So, I just want to make a
20 recommendation that if we could do - you did mention
21 that the public is not doing a good job reporting
22 signs that need to be replaced.

23 If we could do some type of outreach, because I
24 know sometimes it takes awhile for a faded sign to be

25

1
2 replaced. Do you know what the timeline is between a
3 report of a faded sign to when DOT corrects that?

4 JOSHUA BENSON: So, Council Member, it's an
5 excellent question. Safety related signs get the
6 highest priority, so a stop sign, do not enter one
7 way, and parking signs are in the next tier so it's
8 not immediate, but I really like the idea of
9 outreach encourage reporting if that's what you're
10 getting at to really you know, get the information in
11 so we can get out there and fix these signs right
12 away, that would be a great way to handle the concern.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, so if we could do
14 an outreach, I would definitely want to be involved in
15 that and to look at the constituents know that we have
16 a certain week that we could call it in and this way
17 we compile a list of all the faded signs throughout
18 the district. But also, when it comes to a summons, I
19 know that DOT is not the one to decide if someone's
20 found innocent or guilty. So, we just need to send
21 out a message that if a senior, someone has defense
22 this is something that is pretty common sense that if
23 the person cannot get a legible sign, they shouldn't
24 always be found guilty. Shouldn't be found guilty at
25 all on that summons.

1
2 One other thing I wanted to mention is the truck
3 loading and unloading that was just installed recently
4 in my district in certain areas that I've been working
5 with MT and DOT about. So, I did bring it up to DOT
6 that those signs, the new signs number one, they are
7 the same color as the other signs. So, its very
8 difficult for people to really realize that a new sign
9 came up and it defeats the whole purpose because
10 people are parking in the truck loading and unloading
11 zones without realizing that it's a new sign. So, two
12 things, one and my request was if they could place put
13 in another color, like the no standing anytime signage
14 and if they could do that like, as soon as possible
15 because people are receiving summonses every single
16 day now. They are coming to my office, so those are
17 unjust summons because its very confusing. So, if
18 they could put a red sign, like the no standing signs
19 number one. And number two is that I put in an INTRO
20 that all new signage from DOT should have the words
21 new on top. Because I know on some signs you do have
22 it and others you don't, so people don't know that
23 it's a new sign when you install a parking loading and
24 unloading sign. But the left turns you do have the
25 words new on top, so I have an INTRO on that, I hope

1
2 your going to support it, to have the words new on
3 every single sign that's installed by DOT. Those are
4 basically the two issues that I have for today and
5 we'll definitely, - yeah, you wanted to say something?

6 REBECCA ZACK: Thanks Council Member, no, I was
7 going to ask if you could have Toba follow up directly
8 with me regarding the loading and the new unloading in
9 your district? I'm assuming she's back from her
10 honeymoon.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, she's back from
12 her honeymoon and she's probably watching. You
13 probably have the email already in the in box.

14 REBECCA ZACK: Great, have her follow up directly
15 with me then. I probably do. Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you very much.

17 JOSHUA BENSON: One more comment on the signs.
18 We very much appreciate your interest in the
19 maintenance of the signs and DOT takes this very
20 seriously. The numbers I gave in my testimony
21 represent about 10 percent of all signs being replaced
22 every year, so we take it seriously. We would love
23 more customer feedback on where we need to focus. We
24 want the signs to be clear for everyone. We don't

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

want anyone to be getting a summons because they didn't understand what the sign was trying to convey.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. Thank you for your partnership, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good morning. Thank you Chair Rodriguez and I want to thank my colleagues for the introduction, it is important OS's and legislation that we're speaking about this morning in a number of different ways that reflect the communities throughout the city. The needs and the values of communities and so, before I talk about my INTRO's I'd certainly like to elaborate on those. Particularly Three Kings and Lunar New Year certainly reflect the values and the needs of a significant portion of our community and our citizenry around the city of New York and certainly, their quality of life and their religious faith base and cultural commitment of being impeded when we don't recognize their needs as we have for communities in the past.

So, I want to go on the record by saying that and let me further say, that in the five years that I've been a part of this transportation committee, today

1
2 was not the first time nor the second or third time
3 that we questioned the diversity of the DOT and its
4 impact on the communities that they serve and its
5 policy and decision making.

6 So, I'd love to further have that conversation
7 with the Commissioner and certainly we have had that
8 conversation in the past. As we talk about the LPIS,
9 I know that my office has requested annually slow
10 zones around parks, hospitals, churches, synagogues,
11 malls, and schools, and that has yet to come to
12 fruition either.

13 So, we would like to continue to work
14 collaboratively but we'd like to work expeditiously
15 when we know that these slow zones are absolutely
16 necessary in keeping our communities and our most
17 vulnerable safe.

18 Also, and well, I think the entire package is
19 relevant to the quality of life of our city. One
20 more, the sidewalk introductions is certainly
21 something that we have been talking about for a number
22 of years now. The congestion in our commercial
23 corridors, there are still owners who have more
24 product on the street than they have in their stores,
25 and that is unacceptable, but we have not gotten the

1 support from the administration that we have done a
2 number of walkthroughs with sanitation, which
3 temporarily help. We had DCA and even DOT along, but
4 without constant enforcement, it is not working.
5

6 So, again, I am here specifically to talk about
7 INTOS 1010 and 1011 and I have my assembly member Mr.
8 Clyde Vanel, who shares the district with me? We have
9 our Community Board Chair Ms. Rene Hill and our
10 transportation Chair from Community Board 12 as well,
11 Ms. Michelle Keller to highlight how critical this
12 issue is in our community.

13 These bills would reduce the amount of time
14 during which 18 wheelers can be legally parked from
15 three hours to 90-minutes and increase the fine for
16 violation to \$400 and subsequent violation within a
17 six-month period to \$800. The parking abuse of 18-
18 wheel commercial big rigs have been persistent quality
19 of life issued throughout our city from Saint
20 [inaudible 1:28:57] to Bay Ridge. They reduce load
21 traffic. The most monstrous park next to our
22 playgrounds, schools, homes, for hours, sometimes even
23 days at a time.

24

25

1
2 They block fire hydrants, they idle to keep warm,
3 cold in the summer and keep warm during the winter or
4 while being parked, in our residential communities.

5 As you can see by the photos that are displayed
6 here, our neighborhoods are routinely used as private
7 parking lots for these vehicles, which is simply
8 unacceptable. The commercial truck abuse act will
9 make the cost of doing business more than just the
10 companies can afford to bear, which they have always
11 been more than willing to do in the past at the
12 expense of our quality of life and I want those who
13 would argue that the legislation is burdensome on
14 small business to take a close look at these photos
15 and ask themselves, would they tolerate this abuse in
16 their communities, and I dare say not.

17 These proposals are not about doing harm to
18 commercial trucks and they are about discouraging the
19 most frequent parking abuses by industries worst at
20 this.

21 I want to also acknowledge the co-sponsor of this
22 legislation for their great support. Council Member
23 Adams, Richards, [inaudible 1:30:24] and
24 Constantinides. I look forward to the hearing and
25 once again, a hearing from DOT and the stakeholders in

1
2 the effort to address the regrettable lack of parking
3 facilities throughout the city for these commercial
4 vehicles but let me just say that we have sat down
5 with the commercial trucking industry. We've had this
6 conversation with our colleagues, DOT, NYPD, and
7 others in an effort to resolve this issue and
8 sometimes it is our goal that we can educate, so that
9 we can bring about the resolving and create the
10 quality of life that our community so richly deserve.
11 But when you can't educate, you must legislate.

12 These pictures here are absolutely indicative of
13 the abuse that communities throughout the city see, it
14 is not limited to southeast Queens and when I met with
15 the commercial trucking industry, they submit that the
16 big guys, the FedExes and the UPSs and other of the
17 world were not subject to that. That they had access
18 to parking facilities. Well I will submit to you,
19 that is just not the case as we see, we see a target
20 over. I have here, there is a single, FedEx 18-wheel
21 FedEx truck that for four weekends in a row have been
22 parked on a residential street and we're talking about
23 from Friday night to Monday morning and this abuse
24 absolutely has to stop. So, I'm hoping that, we have
25 about 32 sponsors which indicate that this is not

1
2 limited to southeast Queens, the borough of Queens but
3 this is happening throughout the City of New York and
4 that it has a tremendous impact, not just on the
5 quality of life but the health and safety of our
6 residents and yes, that our colleagues support this
7 and I look forward to, not just the passage of this
8 legislation, but certainty enforcement.

9 The problem is that we study, and we have
10 reporting bills and we create laws and we just don't
11 have the ability in enforce this and our communities
12 continue to be abused.

13 So, I look forward to working with the Chair on
14 this and let me just reiterate as a Chair of the
15 Black, Latino, Asian, caucus that represent four and a
16 half million New Yorkers here in this City that there
17 are communities that are not being heard, their voices
18 and their values are not being heard and we simply, by
19 addressing these simple parking alternate side
20 regulation would go along way in saying that we value
21 the voices of those communities as well. Thank you,
22 Mr. Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
24 Council Member Miller, before Council Member Deutsch
25 leaves to another responsibility. I would like for

1
2 him to join me and everyone here standing up in
3 solidarity to the Jewish community for the hate attack
4 that happened two days ago.

5 As we have said before, an attack against the
6 Jewish Day, Muslim Day, Latino's Day, the Asian, the
7 Whites, African American is an attack on all of us.
8 So, please join me standing up in solidarity and pray
9 to the family of those who lost a loved one two days
10 ago in the hate attack. Thank you.

11 It doesn't matter where the attack happened, we
12 as a City and a nation will continue fighting. So, be
13 sure that at some points a generation will be able to
14 eradicate hate for our society. Council Member
15 Menchaca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair, and we
17 all joined in solidarity for that message of healing
18 and solidarity. Thank you.

19 I want to spend my time thinking about our - or
20 one of my favorite things. The leading pedestrian
21 intervals. So, I'm going to start with some kind of
22 basic questions and then maybe end with an update on
23 our project that we're working on together that has
24 more to deal with the bike relationship with the LPIs
25 and so, I'll let your team kind of get an update from

1 me on that, for us on that. But let's talk a little
2 bit about LPIs in general and the testimony really
3 spoke to a vision about the LPIs that was connected to
4 Vision Zero, but I want to get a sense from you all
5 about what is your goal. You reference double - but
6 your hitting more than double of your goal every year.
7 What is that goal? Whats the ultimate long game on
8 LPIs and we'll start there.

10 JOSHUA BENSON: Thank you Council Member, so as I
11 mentioned before, we at DOT we believe that leading
12 pedestrian intervals, a head start for pedestrian in
13 an intersection is a very powerful safety tool. It's
14 a part of Vision Zero and that's why we've
15 aggressively pursued this. We used to do you know, 10
16 to 15, 20 per year.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, what is that goal
18 today?

19 JOSHUA BENSON: So, there's a 400 target in the
20 Vision Zero action plan that your meeting that goal,
21 your doubling that goal.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Right, so whats the
23 real goal around LPIs?

24 JOSHUA BENSON: I mean we're doing as many as the
25 team can support. Really, and I have a very lucky of

1
2 a great team who has been attacking this with a lot of
3 gusto and I really –

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And I met some of those
5 folks and their incredible analyst and team members.
6 So, I guess I want to get a sense of – you have a goal
7 that you're almost ignoring because you're
8 aggressively implementing them across the City because
9 you believe in them. We're trying to create a sense
10 of relationship to areas that in our district are
11 vulnerable spaces. So, I really want to get a sense
12 from you and your team about what is that long-term
13 goal and the aggressive nature of the installation of
14 the LPIs, really tell me that a couple things. One,
15 there's a limit. So, there's only a certain amount of
16 intersections that have opportunities for this. So,
17 that's – if we don't stop, we'll hit at every
18 intersection and so, is that the goal to hit every
19 intersection city – I want to get a sense, not just
20 the kind of advocacy, help me understand?

21 JOSHUA BENSON: Right, so, very good questions
22 and I appreciate your interest in the details of how
23 we do it. So, the guiding light for us really is the
24 Vision Zero priority corridors, priority intersection.
25 So, going back and looking at crash history over time.

1
2 Where are pedestrians vulnerable by the fact that we
3 know that people have actually been injured at those
4 intersections and then focusing on those areas. So,
5 some of the biggest streets that you know, you might
6 think of as being the high-risk streets in your
7 community are the ones that we are focusing on.

8 So, like let's say you know, Queens Boulevard,
9 Northern Boulevard, Fourth Avenue in Brooklyn, you
10 know those types of like major they're the ones that
11 are getting the focus and they certainly include many
12 schools, senior centers etc. Its not that you know, -
13 I hope I didn't give the impression to your colleague
14 that we don't think this LPI treatmetn applies to
15 those facilities. It absolutely does however, what
16 we're saying is because of the urgent need to protect
17 life and limb, we want to focus on those facilities
18 that happen to be on the streets that we know have a
19 history of crashes first and then move onto the
20 streets that have less of a history.

21 Will we get to every intersection? I would like
22 to, there are going to be some where its just not
23 really relevant because there's something else going
24 on where let's, say there's an all pedestrian phase,
25 or there's turning phases where the crosswalks are

1
2 protected in some other fashion. So, there are some
3 few intersections where its just not really relevant
4 to the way that intersection is managed but for the
5 most part, we're finding that it fits nicely on your
6 typical intersection.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great, and so I think I
8 got a better sense and we want to continue that
9 conversation and if you could end please with just an
10 update on that great pilot that we have started that
11 is getting us some good details and information about
12 utilizing the LPIs. Not just for our pedestrians but
13 for bicyclists to use that same head start for these
14 intersections and there's 50 intersections that are
15 being studied right now. Give us a sense about whats
16 going on excepts.

17 REBECCA ZACK: Correct, so I know that the pilot
18 runs through the end of this month which is obviously
19 this week and then there will be a period of time in
20 which we review all the data that the traffic and
21 planning team put together and I don't have like those
22 numbers at my finger tips right now, but I think every
23 thing indicates that things went well, but I haven't
24 gotten kind of an overall summary of how the entire
25 six months went. I don't have a timeline for when

1
2 that will be done but I am assuming – they've been
3 gathering data this whole time, so we would be tying
4 on that soon.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Lets set up a follow up
6 meeting and get crunching together.

7 REBECCA ZACK: Absolutely, I appreciate that.

8 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Council
9 Member. We're about to feel the questions. Could you
10 please read those – the suspend alternative side
11 parking data we have so far?

12 JOSHUA BENSON: Chairman, you would like me to
13 reread the list?

14 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Please.

15 JOSHUA BENSON: Sure. New Years Day, Martin
16 Luther King Jr. Day, Lincoln's Birthday, Ash
17 Wednesday, Asian Lunar New Year, Washington's
18 Birthday, Purim, Holy Thursday, Good Friday, Passover,
19 Holy Thursday, Good Friday, Passover, Psalm ascension,
20 Shavuot, Eid al-Fitr, Memorial Day, Independence Day,
21 the Feast of Assumption, Eid al Adaha, Labor Day, Rosh
22 Hashanah, Yom Kippur, [inaudible 1:41:56[[inaudible
23 1:4158] Columbus Day, All Saints Day, Diwali, Election
24 Day, Veterans Day, Thanksgiving Day, the Immaculate
25 Conception and Christmas Day.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Is that true that
3 the day after Christmas is one of those days that
4 people get more tickets?

5 JOSHUA BENSON: The day after Christmas, I have
6 no idea.

7 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I think that
8 lets see how we can look at those numbers because what
9 I heard someone that is catholic and follow the
10 Christmas tradition. I heard that in my communities
11 that the day after Christmas, that's the day when we
12 definitely spend most of our time celebrating with our
13 families but I don't want to add a new bill but I want
14 to see if you can also look at those number because
15 what I heard is a lot of people confused because the
16 day after Christmas like for the [inaudible 1:42:55],
17 especially I can talk about the Latino. That is the
18 day after where people -that parking is suspended but
19 if you could look at the number it would be very good.

20 JOSHUA BENSON: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I just got to say
22 that no doubt that all those days that you mentioned
23 are important days for our city and I'm happy that we
24 honor those days in different ways. One thing is that
25 suspending alternate side parking regulation, but I

1
2 hope that you guys, as you go back and report to your
3 boss, and to the Mayor's office who you know will be
4 communicating with this in DOT. The message here is
5 loud and clear. We are the Council, you heard from
6 different Council Members. Not only the Asian and the
7 Latino. My other brother [inaudible 1:43:48], we
8 should also suspend alternate side parking regulation
9 on the Lunar New Years and on the Three King Day. So,
10 again, I hope that we will continue working on
11 conversations with you guys, DOT and Sanitation and
12 see how we can make progress because those two days
13 are very important for both communities. The Latino's
14 who make the 29 percent of the city and the Asian
15 community who make, I believe its around 17 percent of
16 the city.

17 So, I wanted to touch base on the pedestrians
18 count down signal. As you know, we've been working,
19 and I can say that we've been making a lot of
20 improvements on installing the numbers of them in our
21 street, but the question was always why are we asking
22 for more and why now? And the answer is because we
23 want to make our street safe for all and as much work,
24 we do to increase the number of the countdown signals,
25 the more safer our pedestrians will be. So, the

1
2 question is how many intersections in the city have
3 pedestrian countdown signals, and how many are in each
4 borough?

5 REBECCA ZACK: Can you give us a sec?

6 JOSHUA BENSON: So, we do have the numbers
7 Council Member and thank you for your interest in
8 pedestrian countdown signals, we definitely agree I
9 think with the spirit of this bill, that it is a
10 safety feature for pedestrians. It does help. We've
11 studied the effect pedestrian countdown signals have
12 and we found both have been particularly with older
13 pedestrians and young children that we see them
14 actually waiting to step off when they see that the
15 countdown is low whereas in the past, they would have
16 just had the flashing hand signal. So, there are
17 about 7500 intersections that currently have
18 pedestrian countdown signals and by borough, it's
19 about 2,000 each in Manhattan and Queens. About 1000
20 in the Bronx, 2200 in Brooklyn and 324 in Staten
21 Island. So, its you know, again something we want to
22 continue to expand this program. Streets that are on
23 the wider side, are the ones where it tends to deliver
24 the best benefit and so, we look forward to working

25

1
2 with you to keep expanding. More than half of
3 intersections have this already.

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And what are our
5 projections on how many should we have, do we need?
6 And of course, it's not as many as possible, a real
7 number. What is the projection that we have based on
8 how many do we need and how many are we looking to
9 install every year in the next few years?

10 JOSHUA BENSON: Right, so we're continually
11 expanding this program as we go. We don't have the
12 final number calculated just yet. We are also, we're
13 adjusting the criteria slightly to account for slower
14 moving pedestrians. The width of the street that we
15 use to do the threshold was based on - originally
16 based on a faster walking speed and more recently
17 we've switched to a slower walking speed to account
18 for older pedestrians or pedestrians with mobility
19 impairments. We think it's important to provide the
20 greatest benefit to those folks who are having trouble
21 moving quickly because their the ones who actually
22 benefit the most from seeing how much time they have
23 remaining, but I would imagine we'll be close to two-
24 thirds to three quarters of the intersections would
25 have these when we get complete.

1
2 REBECCAS ZACK: And specific to the bill that
3 Council Member Matteo introduced and I know that I
4 believe, Council Member Yeger is on of the red light
5 cameras, where those are now, almost a hundred of them
6 have pedestrian countdowns at them now and we are in
7 the process of reviewing the ones that don't to see
8 which ones meet our guidelines, our engineering
9 guidelines to install them there. So, I did want to
10 highlight that we're not opposing that bill. We want
11 to work with you guys on that.

12 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay, how much
13 does it cost to replace a regular signal with a
14 pedestrian countdown signal?

15 JOSHUA BENSON: We don't have the cost figures
16 with us Council Member. What we replace is just the
17 display, the pedestrian walk, don't walk display. So,
18 its not you know, the controller that controls the
19 signals are already capable of powering the countdown
20 and its not one of the most expensive treatments that
21 we're able to do. It's a lower cost item because it's
22 really just unplugging the display and plugging a new
23 one in. So, it's a pretty good value proposition.

24 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And what is the
25 DOT process for adding a pedestrian countdown signals

1
2 or to an intersection and why are so many choosing
3 over other. Those DOT can only pay a pedestrian
4 countdown signal with red light cameras?

5 JOSHUA BENSON: So, it's a width-based criterion,
6 how wide the crossing is for pedestrians and if its 40
7 feet, the street is 40 feet or wider, with no parking
8 or 48 feet or wider with parking, that's the
9 threshold.

10 We've been working in large groups of
11 intersection that are near by and contracting out the
12 work for efficiency purposes, so that's why you see
13 kind of one corridor at a time receives the countdowns
14 and then we move onto the next and so, you know, we're
15 constantly looking for additional locations and its
16 something that a lot of the locations we've gotten to
17 already have been community driven and it's a program
18 we're happy to work that way but we also have our own
19 inspectors who go out and assess and look for
20 locations.

21 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Do you have the
22 number, the data on what percent that crashes happen
23 in intersections?

24 JOSHUA BENSON: I'm sorry, can I just clarify the
25 question. You mean, as all crashes.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: What percent is
3 happening in intersections?

4 JOSHUA BENSON: I don't think I have the number
5 at my fingertips but it's a very high percentage.

6 REBECCA ZACK: I'm thinking of a Vision Zero add
7 that was in bus stops last year and I want to say it
8 said 75 percent but that's the number that jumped out
9 at me. It was high, but don't quote - I mean, I know
10 I'm testifying. I'm just saying like, that's the
11 number - I'm thinking of the add in my head and I
12 remember it being quite that high.

13 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I just feel that
14 looking at you know, expediting the process to bring
15 additional countdowns you know, it is necessary in the
16 intersections. It is so critical and I'm not thinking
17 about it as a Council Member. I'm thinking about it
18 as a father with two daughters 5, and 11, and a mother
19 who is 87 and you know, I can tell you that most of
20 the bills that I have introduced, have not been the
21 result of doing a lot of research from the beginning.
22 That has come from just walking in the street and
23 seeing what we need and when I walk, it doesn't matter
24 the intersection. It can be York Avenue for third,
25 first, or it can be in Broadway. I think that still

1
2 we have to continue and I committed to continue being
3 a partner with you guys to bring more tools to the
4 intersections to calm the way of how drivers turns
5 because again, without having the data, you have the
6 engineer but based on conversations that we have, we
7 know that still today based on this information, a lot
8 of crashes happen in intersections. We have made a
9 lot of progress. Like, in the last, and you have a
10 lot of credits in the last eight years. We have
11 continued what the previous administration had started
12 doing to, so it's not something new. Anyone can see
13 how being able to improve safety for pedestrians and
14 cyclist, but you know I think that it is important. I
15 know that you got to have your information but, in the
16 agency, to know what is the projection, how many are
17 needed today? How many more are we expecting to have
18 this year. So, as we are getting ready for our 2019
19 budget, so that we start a discussion about how, and
20 I'm committed to advocate to bring, spend increase
21 investments for those needs that we have to improve
22 safety of pedestrians.

23 REBECCA ZACK: We always appreciate your support.
24 We've had a wonderful partnership the past five years

1
2 and together, we've driven down pedestrians' deaths at
3 a record pace.

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 RECECCA ZACK: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you Mr. Chair.

7 Ms. Zack, I do appreciate that – and I read your
8 testimony. I saw that you mentioned that the two-
9 third were done, and I do appreciate that. My point
10 of course was I would just love it if you came in here
11 and said, that's a great idea and we're doing it
12 anyway and yes, enact the bill because we're going to
13 get there and there is only a third to go.

14 Thank you. Just with sanitation, I think you
15 said that there were and correct me if I'm wrong, I
16 think you said 34 holidays in which all through the
17 side streets parking is currently suspended.

18 JOSHUA BENSON: 34 clauses, I think its 41 days
19 in 2018 on the calendar because some of them are
20 multiple like, Passover first and second day.
21 Passover seventh and eight day, that kind of thing.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Section 19-163 of the
23 administrative code provides by my count 28 days which
24 are religious or cultural days and then there are

25

1
2 additional days which are legal holidays in which you
3 guys are not working frankly, right?

4 JOSHUA BENSON: Correct.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And so, you said there
6 were 41?

7 JOSHUA BENSON: I believe its 41 for 2018.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And then there are
9 times when some of the holidays that are in Section-
10 19-163 the administrative code actually falls out on
11 legal holidays on which all through the side of the
12 street parking is suspended. For example, Passover
13 might fall out on Good Friday and then you know, there
14 together or [INAUDIBLE 1:55:09] may fall out on
15 Columbus Day, so alternate is being suspended as well
16 on those days. In addition to - is alternate side of
17 the streets parking suspended on Saturdays in the
18 City?

19 JOSHUA BENSON: There is very limited parking
20 regulations. There are some, but its very limited.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, so with
22 alternate being suspended across the board on Sundays
23 and almost all across the board on Saturdays, there's
24 a statistical likelihood that any single day that we
25 add to the suspension calendar results in a 30 percent

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

chance that it falls out on a weekend over the course of a year on any given year, right?

JOSHUA BENSON: That's the math, yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Two out of seven. So, what we're talking about and that's why I'd like you to go back to the department and really give this great consideration. I signed on to both of these bills because frankly my community does have an enormous number of holidays. We have them by a calendar for the very specific reason that we can't - this orthodox community, we can't move our cars. We can't drive, we don't drive. So, if we have a two-day holiday back to back, we need to park our cars in alternate as every other day in some places, we need to have a place to put our cars. So, we monopolize the calendar and I recognize that in many respects, but I also recognize that its an incredible City. I'm looking at the names of these holidays and the Christian community, the orthodox Christian community, the Roman Catholic Community, the Muslim Community. Diwali is in there, of course, the Jewish holidays. You have Holy Thursday, Good Friday, and all of these holidays representing the cultures of our city and now, two new, not new but two groups are coming before

1
2 their legislature and saying, we're part of our city
3 to. Lunar New Year, Three Kings Day, they deserve it.
4 They earned it, they're a part of our city and so I
5 would like you very much to take that back to the
6 administration and come back to the Council and say,
7 you know, we can afford these two more days. The City
8 is not going to fall apart for two more days and I
9 would appreciate that. Thank you very much.

10 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. So,
11 with that I hope that you know we will continue
12 conversation and I know guys, you have to do your job
13 and we have to continue working with you with the
14 administration. Again, Latinos, we are not begging.
15 We are saying we are here, and I think it is important
16 not only for the Latino nation, it's very important
17 for everyone because we are a city made with the
18 diversity of all the good that we have come here and
19 make our city our home. So, with that thank you.

20 JOSHUA BENSON: Thank you Chairman.

21 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Now let's call our
22 panel. Kelly Hodges on behalf of Allie Taylor, Sandy
23 McCallion, Betsy Sargisson and Chelsey Brownridge. I
24 would also like to acknowledge Council Member Richards

25

1
2 is here and we have Zach Miller. Okay, let's start
3 with the panel. Thanks. You may begin.

4 CHELSEA BROWNRIDGE: Good afternoon Chair
5 Rodriguez and members of the Committee on
6 Transportation. My name is Chelsea Brownridge. I'm
7 the Founder of DogSpot, a company that manufactures
8 pet harbors here in New York City. Out of respect for
9 time, I submitted my entire testimony for public
10 record, but I'll just speak simply to the most to the
11 most essential points here today.

12 I'm here to call on the Council to pass
13 Introduction 886, my company DogSpot was born in a
14 garage in Bedford-Stuyvesant in Brooklyn in 2014 as a
15 solution for people who need a place for their pet
16 while they go to the store. A very simple concept but
17 the reality is, is that there's a law out there now
18 where stores can't allow dogs inside. About 60
19 percent of our stores are legally prohibited from
20 allowing pets inside and there's not solution out
21 there and our pets are now being tied up, left
22 outside, and businesses are losing business as a
23 result, because their turning away customers that have
24 pets.

25

1
2 For more than two years, DogSpot operated a
3 network of these safe, internet-connected, climate-
4 controlled dog houses on Brooklyn sidewalks without
5 incident. From the beginning we developed a
6 partnership with the city. We were awarded grant
7 money from the New York City Economic Development
8 Corporation and the Brooklyn Public Library. We were
9 given an invitation from City Hall to represent our
10 technology on the world stage at the Smart City Expo
11 in Barcelona. Then, unexpectedly, the Department of
12 Transportation ordered that our dog houses need to be
13 removed. Receiving this cease and desist order from
14 the Department of Transportation was a shocking and
15 enormously disappointing event for our small company.
16 We were being forced to chose between removing our
17 houses from the members that we were serving in the
18 business or fighting in court for the city that we
19 love and wanted to continue to grow our business in,
20 so we opted to remove our houses from public sidewalk,
21 not for lack of belief in our service and the benefit
22 that it brings to the city, but in favor of
23 collaboration with the city. So, in short order, we
24 were forced to stop serving our customers. Luckily,
25 we were fortunate enough to be quickly met with

1
2 enthusiastic invitations from many other
3 municipalities including Washing DC, Baltimore,
4 Orlando, Kansas City, Columbus and dozens of others.

5 I agree wholeheartedly with the presumed bias of
6 the DOT's concerns, that pedestrians need to move
7 freely but it's a lazy argument that our houses are an
8 impediment to sidewalk. There less than three feet
9 deep and they add order to the sidewalks because now,
10 dogs are being tied up on sidewalks and that's an
11 impediment to people being able to move freely.

12 This legislation will provide dogs and their
13 guardians a safe and humane alternative to leaving
14 dogs unattended and provides opportunities to support
15 retail business owners that currently can't allow dogs
16 inside. The bill will send a message to other
17 entrepreneurs that will echo for years to come. When
18 you take time to work with government, government can
19 work with you as well.

20 I strongly urge the Council to support
21 Introduction 886, support to New Yorkers and small
22 businesses. I'd like to thank Council Member Espinal
23 for his leadership and Chair Rodriguez and the entire
24 Committee again for allowing me to speak. I'm happy
25 to answer any questions.

1
2 BETSY SARGISSON: During the time that they had
3 DogSpot in Brooklyn, I was able to shop in the
4 neighborhood, in the greater neighborhood. At age 80,
5 I can't just go running around the neighborhood as
6 much as I used to, so I would take my dog and put her
7 in the little dog house and do my shopping in the
8 neighborhood. I don't think I've been shopping back
9 on Vanderbilt Avenue since the DogSpot has been
10 removed. So, instead of shopping in the neighborhood,
11 I'm using Fresh Director Amazon and it was much better
12 to be able to use the neighborhood stores and
13 restaurants, especially the restaurants, if you don't
14 plan to go in and have breakfast, but you're there
15 with the dog and you can go across the street and put
16 the dog safely somewhere while you do that. It works
17 out very nicely. So, I've very much missed having
18 DogSpot there.

19 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, would
20 you like to say your name Miss for the record?

21 BETSY SARGISSON: My name is Betsy Sargisson and
22 I live in Brooklyn.

23 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

24 SANDY MCCALLION: I'm Sandy McCallion. Thank
25 you, Chair Rodriguez and Council. I concur with what

1
2 Chelsea said and I was actually somewhat surprised to
3 hear the DOT object to this, to these dog spot houses
4 on safety grounds. As I walked to the subway, my ten-
5 minute walk to the subway this morning, I passed five
6 or six dogs that were tied up outside of businesses.
7 Its not safe for the dogs. We have had incidents
8 where dogs have been stolen in Brooklyn but also, as
9 pedestrians walk, there are some people who are
10 frightened of dogs and the children are running to the
11 dogs or running away from the dogs and that's not a
12 safe situation. These dog spot houses were
13 incredible. They don't infringe on the sidewalk at
14 all. There set back next to businesses. If you
15 decide to go out and suddenly realize that you need to
16 run an errand and you have your dog with you, you can
17 put it in there. Its actually kind of fun to watch
18 your dog inside, because you can see it in the app.
19 It's a wonderful, wonderful service. I was very
20 fortunate to have it in Brooklyn. I was fortunate to
21 be in the neighborhood that it was there. I asked for
22 more to be put there and suddenly they were gone.
23 Please bring them back.

24 KELLY HODGES: Good afternoon. My name is Kelly
25 Hodges and my dog Franklyn were actually the first

1
2 member of DogSpot but I'm going to be talking today
3 and reading a statement of Alli Taylor, who couldn't
4 be here with you.

5 Good afternoon Chairman Rodriguez. Thank you to
6 all the Committee Members for holding today's hearing
7 on INTRO 886.

8 My name is Allie Taylor and I'm the president and
9 founder of Voters for Animal Rights. I am speaking to
10 today in my capacity as a professional dog walker and
11 volunteer animal rescuer in Bedford-Stuyvesant and
12 Bushwick, Brooklyn.

13 I urge the Committee to support INTRO 886, which
14 would allow pet harbors to be placed on public
15 sidewalks of commercial establishments in New York
16 City. Having met with the founders of DogSpot and
17 thoroughly evaluated the pet harbor, I believe that
18 they have done an excellent job of addressing the
19 safety and behavioral needs of urban pets and their
20 caretakers. I also spoke at length with my dog
21 walking clients who are also in support of the pet
22 harbors.

23 Pet harbors are a win-win for New York City's
24 dogs, pet guardians, animal rescuers, and local
25 businesses. The availability of safe, convenient,

1
2 affordable care for dogs makes it easier for New
3 Yorkers considering adoption to make the decision to
4 welcome a pet into their family and keep them
5 permanently. Decreasing barriers to adoption is one
6 of the best ways to help more homeless animals find
7 their forever homes.

8 Additionally, every year numerous dogs are stolen
9 by well-intentioned pet parents who stop into a store
10 for just a minute. Pet harbors would provide a secure
11 alternative to tying up a dog and leaving them
12 unattended.

13 Over the years, our city has evolved to because
14 more accommodating to growing families with children,
15 and now, as dogs become a part of an increasing number
16 of New York City families, too, we are seeing our city
17 policies change, with more dog-friendly restaurants,
18 bars, and transportation options. I believe that pet
19 harbors would positively broaden our city's pet
20 services and urge the passing of INTRO 886. Thank you
21 for your time.

22 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I truly believe
23 that animal rights is an extension of human rights and
24 again, most of my understanding has happened from my
25 role working and interacting with so many groups that

1
2 they advocate for animal rights and now again that I
3 have my family who love animals and take me to many
4 places like, I've been going to the Safe Haven Animal
5 Center that a great professor, Professor Crane from
6 City College was the Dean of the school of
7 engineering. His wife was a doctor, creator and be
8 able to see you know, in our experience working here
9 with so many New Yorkers, I have come to the
10 conclusion that not only because I was born and raised
11 in a farm, but in the Caribbean, the Dominican
12 Republic, but here in New York City. Hundreds and
13 thousands and millions of people have their animals as
14 part of their life and they are important for our
15 children now, our young generation and for our senior
16 citizens. So, whatever I can do to be helpful on this
17 bill, I will do my part. What difference will we make
18 if we pass this bill on the Council?

19 CHELSEA BROWNRIDGE: There's a few stakeholders
20 that would benefit greatly from this. So, the obvious
21 one is of course our dogs. Our family and the people
22 that have dogs in their family, being able to more
23 conveniently walk and move about the city with their
24 dogs and in a safe way. Right now, what you'll see up
25 and down on any given commercial street is dogs tied

1
2 up and again, as I mentioned in my testimony, that's
3 not safe for sidewalks either, and so, what we're
4 trying to do is create a safe environment for those
5 dogs, so that pedestrians can move freely, so that
6 dogs can be safe and so, that's important on that
7 front.

8 The second benefit to the city would be to the
9 small business themselves. One of the things we
10 learned in our time operating here is that our
11 members, like Betsy just mentioned, were shopping more
12 often in stores. Its really difficult for small
13 businesses to stay in business in the city these days
14 and to give them another reason that they have to turn
15 away customers because people want to bring their dogs
16 with them and they can't. Its really difficult for
17 small business owners, so early on when we were
18 talking to them, the store owners themselves, they
19 were extremely excited and you'll have fine testimony
20 in the packets that we shared from those business
21 owners, unfortunately their all with their businesses
22 today, so they couldn't be here with us today in
23 person, but they were extremely enthusiastic to do
24 whatever it took to get their dog houses back. We
25 continue to get interest from store owners who want

1
2 these in New York City because on a daily basis, their
3 encountering people who want to come inside and shop
4 with them and they have to turn them away because they
5 have a dog with them and they are given no solution at
6 all. So, our technologies, first of its kind in
7 providing a solution for a problem that occurs every
8 single day for New Yorkers, their own dogs, and also
9 the store owners that are having to turn them away and
10 losing business.

11 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and we
12 will continue the conversation and we'll continue
13 working with my colleague Council Member Espinal and
14 the center staff here on the **[inaudible 2:10:01]**
15 invitation and also, we'll be more than happy to
16 continue conversation with you and my colleagues to
17 see how we can work on this bill. Thank you.

18 So, the next panel, Zach Miller, Clyde Vanel,
19 Bruce Kraft, and Jack Davis. If there is anyone who
20 needs to fill out their card and I didn't call you,
21 please let her know. If not, this is the last panel.

22 CLYDE VANEL: Good afternoon, first I'd like to
23 thank this Committee on Transportation. I'd like to
24 thank Chairman Rodriguez and I thank my Council Member
25 I. Deneek Miller.

1
2 My name is Clyde Vanel, I'm the New York State
3 Assembly Member for the 33rd Assembly District. I
4 represent the areas of Cambria Heights, Queens
5 Village, Saint Albans, Heights, boroughs and
6 Park. I am here in strong support of the commercial
7 truck abuse act, INTROS 1010 which increases fines for
8 trucks from \$400 to \$800 respectively for the first in
9 ticket violation at INTRO 1011, which decreases the
10 parking time for commercial vehicles on the streets.

11 I'm also here because we have a bill in the state that
12 I sponsored bill A8363 which also increases the fines.

13 This is simply about environmental justice,
14 wealth protection, the quiet enjoyment of property and
15 the interference of parking to get to work, school,
16 and hospital.

17 South East Queens and East End Queens sit at the
18 feet of one of the busiest airports in the country JFK
19 and we host a large import/export business that
20 distribute food, materials, supplies to our local
21 businesses and establishments from around the world.

22 Queens take pride in the fact that we are able to
23 have such a large impact on the economic growth of the
24 city. Unfortunately, hosting these businesses and the
25 airport has put a strain on our communities. While

1 commercial trucks have a place to pick up and drop off
2 supplies their delivering, there's no place to park.
3 So, between overnight stays, they park on residential
4 communities taking up spaces in front of our houses,
5 not just creating an eye sore, but also an
6 environmental hazard that is troublesome for many
7 families. Southeast Queens is designated as an
8 extreme transit desert from the federal government
9 where it takes residents an hour and a half to get to
10 Midtown Manhattan by public transportation. That's
11 why many families rely on cars and many families have
12 multiple cars. Many of them have no other way to get
13 around to drop off their children from school, to run
14 errands, and to get to and from work. Needless to
15 say, that this becomes more and more difficult when an
16 18-wheeler is parked in front of their homes and truck
17 drivers also leave their trucks on over night as they
18 sleep in their cars. This continues to be one of the
19 major issues to many of our local offices and to
20 community boards that receive complaints about these
21 trucks parked overnight.
22

23 These INTROS will reduce this hazard and it
24 becomes law, truck drivers will think twice before
25

1
2 parking on residential streets and the quality of life
3 of our residents will be enhanced. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 ZACH MILLER: Good afternoon. My name is Zach
6 Miller and I serve as Metro Region Vice Chair for the
7 Trucking Association of New York. I want to thank
8 Chairman Rodriguez and the members of the committee
9 for the opportunity to testify before you today.

10 For over 85 years, the Trucking Association of
11 New York, a non-profit trade group has represented the
12 industry in New York. Advocating for the industry at
13 local, state, and federal levels. We provide
14 educational program to our members which enhance their
15 safety and maintenance efforts and offer numerous
16 councils and committees to meet the diversities of our
17 membership. TANY Comprises over 600-member companies
18 from New York, Canada, and every boarder state.

19 There are several bills being heard today but I'd
20 like to focus on INTRO 1010,1011, and 1140.

21 While it is necessary and important for drivers
22 to take federally mandated rest periods, we do not
23 condone drivers parking their vehicles on residential
24 streets for multiple days. TANY has proposed some
25 language to INTRO 1011, which we've included in this

1 testimony clarifying that trucks show proof, such as a
2 bill of lading, that proves they are actively engaged
3 in business and to not be issued a fine.

4
5 Many of our members need to unload large amounts
6 of freight and other cargo from their trucks, which in
7 some cases could exceed the proposed 90-minute time
8 limit. It is also common that drivers may arrive at a
9 location earlier than expected and before the business
10 is open to receive deliveries and to not be fined for
11 this standard practice.

12 Furthermore, TANY believes that there may be
13 inadequate signage concerning commercial vehicle
14 parking in some area of the city and would require a
15 deeper review of current signage before TANY is
16 willing to consider increased fines stated in INTRO
17 1010.

18 With regard to INTRO 1140, TANY has been
19 supportive of the concept and practice of off-hour
20 deliveries to the extent that customers can accept
21 them.

22 Many businesses do not have dedicated staff to
23 accept deliveries at off hours. Recently DOT
24 Commissioner Pally Trottenberg pointed out that a
25 supermarket on the Upper West Side is actually

1 prohibited by their lease from receiving off-hour
2 deliveries. INTRO 1140 recognizes that the City of
3 New York is a large consumer and requiring them to
4 implement an off-hour delivery program in city-owned
5 buildings sets an important example for other
6 consumers.

7
8 TANY also supports INTRO 570 and tentatively
9 supports INTRO 867 which would review street widths
10 that we would like further clarificatory on the intent
11 of the bill and are happy to meet with Council Member
12 Adams to discuss further and are happy to meet with
13 any Council Members to discuss any of these issues
14 further. Thank you.

15 JACK DAVIES: Good afternoon. Thank you for
16 convening this hearing and for the chance to testify.
17 My name is Jack Davies. I'm the campaigns manager for
18 Transportation Alternatives. I will note that my
19 submitted testimony spells out our positions on the
20 individual measures noticed today but I will use my
21 limited time to discuss parking generally.

22 As we craft city policy governing on-street
23 parking, its critical that we both appreciate the
24 context the current rules were written in and be
25 mindful of the environment we're formulating new

1 policy in. The laws governing parking across the City
2 were largely devised by power broker Robert Moses
3 during an era of peak automobile production and use in
4 the United States. As New York radically suburbanized
5 in the 1950's Moses and his City Planning Commission
6 prioritized cars as the principal form of future
7 transportation. As a result, the City deeded enormous
8 amounts of public space to drivers for private care
9 storage to meet the perceived increase in automobility
10 and gave no consideration to the new demands that an
11 evolving New York would place on safety, equity, and
12 other transportation resources, like the existing
13 transit networks.
14

15 Of course, 21st century New York looks wildly
16 different than planners in the 1960's envisioned. New
17 York's residential population density is almost 20
18 percent higher today than in 1960. The majority of
19 New York city household don't own cars, and public
20 transit remains the primary way most New Yorkers
21 travel on a day to day basis. Yet car parking
22 requirements, set by Moses over 50 years and more in
23 line with a mid-size municipality than the most
24 transit-rich city in the country, still largely govern
25

1
2 New York. And these antiquated policies are costing
3 New Yorkers.

4 The majority of New York City's spaces is being
5 used inefficiently. Currently 80 percent of New
6 York's open space is filled by parked cars and
7 congested traffic, a widely unfair allocation of space
8 in the city where the majority of citizens do not own
9 a car and space is a precious commodity.

10 On-street parking consumes 16,000 acres of our
11 public space, it's equivalent of more than 16 Central
12 Parks. Most of New York City streets are lined with
13 cars, and as a matter of policy, we have accepted the
14 idea that these cars should be afforded the
15 opportunity, in one the priciest housing markets in
16 the nation, to live rent free, all the while rent
17 increases for actual people. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 BRUCE KRAFT: My name is Bruce Kraft. I live in
20 Queens. The area boarded by Horace Harding
21 Expressway. Grand Central Parkway Service Road, union
22 turnpike to the city line on a Sunday morning at 10:00
23 a.m. this year, I found 58 tractor trailers. They
24 were parked in front of people's homes, churches,
25 schools, parks. They are waste haulers, car carriers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

They park underneath highways at the Union Turnpike in Grand Central Parkway, which is dangerous. This continues all the time. Last year at this time, there were 30 parked. Now there's almost 60. They park overnight, they park by fire hydrants, they unhook their trailer, leave their trailer, take their truck.

Saturday, a tractor trailer was doing maintenance, had the whole front end of the truck off and was doing maintenance. Sunday, 73rd Avenue, tractor trailer had another truck block the street while for the next three hours, they repaired it. This is in front of a public park. You can go to the ball fields on 73rd avenue and you will see waste haulers parked. People do not have places to park their cars in certain areas. Flushing, you go by there, even if you google the church, the Queens Borough Community Church and google it, you will see - what do you see? You will see a car carrier. This has gone on long enough. They park where people can not get to park when they come home at night to park their car because we don't live in an area where transportation is like in Manhattan. If you don't have a car, you don't live, and you have to now drive

1
2 around while a tractor trailer is taking up three or
3 four spots. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Has
5 any members of the truck association or you as the
6 institution being able to work with any truck drivers
7 who is part of the truck association to address those
8 issues that you heard. IT is important for New
9 Yorkers, and for the residents of Queens.

10 With the specific drivers or the companies?

11 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: In those cases,
12 like, as you heard this testimony right now, what is
13 happening in Queens, in that park, like a truck driver
14 who parked his truck in that particular location and
15 do the maintenance, or leave it there for hours and
16 hours? Like, are you that institution that works with
17 other members who has drivers you know, with them, how
18 do you work with your own membership to be sure that
19 they are also responsible to resident?

20 Well, we have to get the word out to them. That
21 this is whats happening and its unacceptable.

22 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: What is it?

23 We have to get the word out to them, to
24 Membership that its happening and unacceptable. I
25 didn't know that any of the maintenance things and I

1
2 want to say maybe a month, maybe two months ago, we
3 met with Council Member Miller's office and he was the
4 one who brought it to our attention that a lot of the
5 problems in your district is with more truck drivers
6 who actually are more local residents. We were under
7 the impression that a lot of this was from out of
8 state. It turns out a lot is from local and what
9 they'll do is they'll come, I think the Council Member
10 said on Thursday or Friday, they'll come with the
11 truck and the they'll come with either their spouse or
12 friend in a car. They'll drop off the truck for the
13 weekend and take the car back to where they live,
14 which is all local. So, this was just brought to our
15 attention, I want to say a month, two months ago. So,
16 we're trying to get the word out that this is
17 unacceptable, and you can't be doing this.

18 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: The important
19 thing is that we need to continue working together and
20 address those concerns which is very important for the
21 quality of life issues of residents, or in this case
22 of Queens but it can be in any other particular area.
23 So, lets continue conversation to see how we can
24 address any specific issue and see how we can get in
25 touch with those who own those trucks. With that,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

thank you. I would like to end saying that this hearing on Parking was about updating a system that needs changes on meters, commercial parking, pedestrian safety, adding to more alternative parking, to two very important communities, the Chinese and the Asian community and the Latino community is about legible parking signs, animal rights, pedestrian safety and I'm committed to continue working with my colleagues and all the advocates through the five boroughs to be sure that we take the parking system to the level that we should be, which is to be more efficient to everyone. Thank you. With this, this hearing is adjourned. [GAVEL].

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 1, 2018